

External Examiners Report of MSc Med (Bioethics and Health Law): Human Papillomavirus (HPV) Vaccine Immunisation as an Intervention programme for the prevention of cervical cancer and other similar HPV genotype-related diseases in South Africa: Some ethical and legal matters for consideration” by L Motopi

1. The Research Report component represents only 16% of the MScMed programme. While empirical research has not been done to satisfy the requirement of scientific research, the legal & ethical research and analysis is original.

2. Corrections made according to suggestions on the report as well as those identified when reviewing the report.

Page 3: Table 1.1.1. How was data obtained? The words – Calculated using estimated general population of women 15 years and older added on table.

Page 7: moved footnote 1 to first paragraph first line

corrected sentence to read “data from women treated in Johannesburg SA in 2000, 776.....

Page 9: footnote 2 deleted

footnote 3 moved to Figure 1.4.1

Page 11: footnote 4 deleted. We agreed that there is enough information on scientific background of the report

Page 12: footnote 5 moved to second paragraph line 4

Footnotes 6 and 7 moved to end of second paragraph

Page 13: part of footnote 8 “The vaccines have been found to protect against...” moved to 1.7.3 on page 15: cross protection last paragraph line 2

Page 15: corrected second last line of last paragraph to 52 instead of duplicated 58.

Page 27: footnote 9 moved to first paragraph line 3

Page 31: added a sub-chapter 2.1.5 on dominance of HPV vaccination programme by pharmaceutical companies

Page 36: added the reference (Bell 2013), also added the reference on page 65 - Bell D. 2013: Communitarianism, The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. EN. Zalta (Ed.).

Available at: <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2013/entries/communitarianism/>

Page 39: line 8 of last paragraph – changed the word ‘afford’ to ‘allow’

Page 41: footnote moved to line 2 of the second paragraph

Page 42: footnote deleted

Page 43: footnote deleted

Page 44: footnote deleted

Page 46: footnotes moved into text as part of the references

Page 52: footnote deleted

Page 56: changed the heading to include monitoring and evaluations

Page 57: sub-paragraph 4) last line inserted, after behaviours

sub-paragraph 5) added spaces between screening; programmes; and added the word and before should; deleted the last part of this sentence in brackets

Page 58: sub-paragraph 6) changed capital I in Insufficient to small i

Page 59: added the word a on the second line of the last paragraph.

added a paragraph on monitoring and evaluations

Page 60: deleted the word with on the fourth line of the last paragraph

Page 69: added a reference - Harper DM 2009. Current prophylactic HPV vaccines and gynaecologic premalignancies. Current opinion in obstetrics and gynaecology 21(6):457-64.

Page 72: added the reference - Lomalisa P, Smith T, Guidozi F. Human immunodeficiency virus infection and invasive cervical cancer in South Africa. Gynecol Oncol 2000 Jun;77(3):460-3.

Page 74: added reference - Mello MM, Abiola S and Colgrove J. 2012. Pharmaceutical companies’ role in state vaccination policymaking. The case of human Papillomavirus vaccination. Am J Public Health, 102(5): 893-898. [Retrieved February 2014]. Available at: <http://www.medscape.com/viewarticle/763324>

Page 80: added the reference - WHO 2005a WHO global HPV Laboratory Network (LabNet). [Retrieved February 2014] Available at:

<http://www.who.int/biologicals/vaccines/hpv/en/>

3. Added a page on possible dominance pm HPV vaccination programme by pharmaceutical companies page 31.