

**Guiding dilemmas and principles informing
psychotherapeutic work
with African refugees in South Africa**

Geertje-Kieke Grootenhuis

A Research Report submitted to the School of Humanities and Community Development, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the Degree of Master of Arts (Clinical Psychology).

July 2007

Abstract

Therapists seeing refugee populations often struggle with the traditional boundaries of psychotherapy and conventional wisdom's about therapeutic goals and practice. The social, political and cultural context of the therapeutic work throws up dilemmas and constraints that need to be better understood in working with these marginalized clients, particularly those in unconfined environments such as South Africa. Although many refugees experience serious mental health problems and adjustment difficulties, the context in which treatment is offered impacts on the type of psychotherapeutic intervention and therapist stance that is optimal or possible. This study discusses presenting strengths, dilemmas and possible guiding therapeutic principles that arose from in-depth semi-structured interviews with 8 interviewees (4 psychotherapists and 4 refugee clients) concerning their experiences of conducting and being in medium term psychotherapy, looking at similarities and differences in observations. In accordance with the literature, this study found that the main descriptions of psychological distress discussed by the refugee clients included those caused by past trauma and those that were a response to current experiences. The prevalence of these symptoms stresses the importance of psychological intervention. The strengths of psychotherapy noted by refugee clients included: the preparation for psychotherapy through psycho-social workshops, attaining of both emotional and general support, the psych-social approach used by many of the therapists and the importance of foundational elements of psychotherapy, such as the relationship. This research project found that experiencing a containing therapeutic space was possible due to what refugees coined 'the professionalism of the therapists'. Therapists raised such issues such as having to step out of the conventional therapist role, having to deal with the impact of the horror stories described by refugees, struggles to identify appropriate therapeutic approaches, difficulties in assisting refugees to establish sustainable support networks and not meeting refugees' expectations that they will be 'fully healed' through therapy. Possible guiding therapeutic principles, such as working within the supportive framework of a two phased integrative framework, are also discussed. The study found that ideally speaking, therapists and refugee clients are more supported if therapy is offered as part of a multi-dimensional and multidisciplinary approach.

Declaration

I declare that this research report is my own unaided work, and that I have given full acknowledgement to the sources that I have used. It is being submitted for the Degree of Masters of Arts (Clinical psychology) at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other University.

Geertje-Kieke Grootenhuis

August 2007

Acknowledgements

This research project would not have been possible without the support of several people. I would like to thank the following people for their direct and indirect contributions towards this research project:

- ❖ Professor Gill Eagle, my supervisor. Your generosity in sharing your insight on many levels, your wisdom, knowledge and teaching has been invaluable. Your strength, openness, passion for psychology in her greater sense, dedication to your work as supervisor, despite unforeseen challenges have left me touched and inspired. I am grateful for the experience.
- ❖ The refugee clients and therapists who volunteered for this study. Without their input, experiences and stories this research project would not have been possible. Thank you for sharing with me. My hope is that this project can contribute to, and enhance other refugee clients and therapists experiences in this context in the future.
- ❖ The Centre for Violence and Reconciliation (CSVr) for supporting me by allowing me to put up posters to recruit both therapists and refugees. More specifically: Marevik for your guidance in helping me put together a practically viable methodology, Francis for your support and patience in my continuous phone calls; and Megan for helping me put up posters and your encouragement throughout my journey.
- ❖ Ingrid for your inspiring and thought provoking thoughts and editing.
- ❖ Jan-Geu, Frederique and Floor for your emotional and material support and your belief in me despite my long and bumpy academic journey. You have made my journey possible. I have now finally arrived and a new chapter is unfolding.
- ❖ My friends, for your steady cheering and encouragement from the sidelines.
- ❖ Eric for your support and level headedness, your love and perseverance in the last two life changing years. You are my rock.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Title Page	i
Abstract	ii
Declaration	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Table of Contents	v- viii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Research Rational and Aim	1
1.2 Outline of this Report	2
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1 Introduction	5
2.2 Refugee and psychological distress	6
2.3 Refugee in the South African context	12
2.4 Counselling approaches used to assist refugees	19
2.4.1. <i>The Therapeutic ‘Frame’</i>	19
2.4.2. <i>Multicultural Sensitivity</i>	21
2.4.3. <i>Cognitive Behaviour Therapy</i>	23
2.4.4. <i>Psychodynamic Therapy</i>	24
2.4.5. <i>Testimony Therapy</i>	24
2.4.6. <i>Narrative Therapy</i>	25
2.4.7. <i>Integrative Therapeutic Approaches</i>	25
2.4.8. <i>Psycho-Social Approach</i>	26
2.5 Usefulness of therapeutic approaches for refugees in unsafe contexts	28
2.6 Difficulties confronting therapists working with refugees	31
2.7 Conclusion	34

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHOD

3.1 Introduction	36
3.2 Research Aims	37
3.3 Research Questions	37
3.4 Methodological Approach/Framework	37
3.4.1 <i>Interpretive Inquiry/ Hermeneutics</i>	38
3.5 Participants	40
3.5.1 <i>Refugee clients brief biography</i>	42
3.5.2 <i>Summary of Therapists brief biography</i>	43
3.6 Data Collection	44
3.6.1 <i>Interviews</i>	45
3.7 Data Analysis	46
3.7.1 <i>Validation</i>	49
3.8 Reflexive considerations	49
3.9 Ethical Considerations	50

CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION: Part 1

The lived South African refugee context

4.1 Introduction	52
4.2 The generic refugee experience	52
4.2.1 <i>Political refugees versus economic migrants</i>	52
4.2.2 <i>Multiple losses</i>	54
4.2.3 <i>Trauma</i>	56
4.2.4 <i>Social uprooting: The experience of alienation</i>	56
4.3 The South African urban refugee experience	58
4.3.1 <i>Basic needs and support</i>	58
4.3.2 <i>Living with discrimination</i>	60
4.3.3 <i>Retraumatization</i>	62
4.3.4 <i>Refugee resilience</i>	62
4.4 Mental health of refugees	63
4.5 Refugee counselling experience	66

CHAPTER 5: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION: Part 2.

Psychotherapeutic work with refugees in South Africa

5.1 Introduction	69
5.2 Strengths and contributions of therapy with refugees in South Africa	69
5.2.1 <i>Psychotherapy for refugees</i>	69
5.3 Dilemmas arising from therapeutic work with refugees	77
5.3.1 <i>Therapist role conflict</i>	78
5.3.1.1 Multiple roles	79
5.3.1.2 Therapeutic boundaries	83
5.3.2 <i>Dealing with emotional stress of refugee trauma work</i>	86
5.3.3 <i>Therapeutic style and goals</i>	88
5.3.4 <i>Dilemmas of dealing with client fabrication</i>	89
5.4 Some guiding principles proposed for engaging with therapeutic dilemmas and difficulties	91
5.4.1 <i>Guidelines for therapeutic work with refugees in the Johannesburg context</i>	91
5.4.1.1 The therapeutic frame and therapeutic alliance	92
5.4.1.2 Content and context understandings	93
5.4.1.3 Usefulness of conventional therapeutic models	93
5.4.2 <i>Two phased approach to therapy</i>	95
5.4.3 <i>The Importance of the Therapeutic relationship</i>	97
5.4.4 <i>An extended therapy process</i>	101
5.4.5 <i>Therapist reflexivity</i>	102
5.5 Interpretive reflections	104

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION

7.1 Central Findings	108
7.2 Limitations of the Study	111
7.3 Implications for Future Research	112

REFERENCE LIST	114
APPENDIX 1a: Interview schedule for therapists	122
1b: Interview schedule for refugees	124
1c: Informed consent forms	125
APPENDIX 2a: Posters advertising for therapists and refugees	127
2b: Information letter for therapists	128
2c: Information letter for refugees	129
APPENDIX 3: Mind map of emerging themes in analytic process	130