

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	i
ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	8
CHAPTER 1 Introduction: The transformation of South African administrative law	10
CHAPTER 2 Development of the grounds of review	44
CHAPTER 3 Access to judicial remedies	113
CHAPTER 4 Towards a substantive style of judicial reasoning	150
CHAPTER 5 The completion of administrative law	188
CHAPTER 6 Conclusion: An assessment of the transformation of South African administrative law since 1994	231
BIBLIOGRAPHY	240
TABLE OF CASES	258
APPENDIX 1 Constitutional rights to administrative justice	280
APPENDIX 2 The Promotion of Administrative Justice Act	282
APPENDIX 3 The Breakwater Declaration	293

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	i
ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	1
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	8
CHAPTER 1	
Introduction: The transformation of South African administrative law	10
1.1 Background to the thesis	10
1.2 Nature and scope of the thesis	15
(a) Title and aim of the thesis	15
(b) Research question to be explored	15
(c) Methodology	16
1.3 Terminology	16
(a) Transformation rather than reform	16
(b) Administrative law	18
1.4 The transformative Constitution: Towards a culture of justification	20
(a) A transformative Constitution	20
(b) A culture of justification	23
(c) The promise for administrative law	26
1.5 Achieving a culture of justification: Four aspirations for South African administrative law	30
(a) Well-developed grounds of review	31
(b) Improved access to judicial remedies	33
(c) A more substantive style of judicial reasoning	34
(d) The completion of administrative law	39
1.6 Outline of the study	42
(a) Chapter 1	42
(b) Chapter 2	42
(c) Chapter 3	43
(d) Chapter 4	43

(e) Chapter 5	43
(f) Chapter 6	43
CHAPTER 2	
Development of the grounds of review	44
2.1 Introduction	44
2.2 Lawfulness	47
(a) Introduction and overview	47
(b) Dishonesty and the relevance of motive	49
(c) Review for error of law	51
(d) Review for mistake of fact	55
(i) Jurisdictional facts	55
(ii) Non-jurisdictional facts	57
(e) Conclusion	60
2.3 Reasonableness	61
(a) Introduction and overview	61
(b) The pre-democratic law	62
(c) The constitutional era	64
(i) The elements of ‘reasonable’ administrative action	65
(ii) The interpretation of section 6(2)(h) of the PAJA	69
(iii) The distinction between review and appeal	72
(d) Reasonableness and the principle of legality	74
(e) Conclusion	76
2.4 Procedural fairness	76
(a) Introduction and overview	77
(b) The application of fairness at common law	80
(i) The classification of functions	80
(ii) Rejection of the classification of functions	82
(iii) The rise of the legitimate expectation doctrine	82
(c) The constitutional era	84
(i) Section 3(1) of the PAJA	84
(ii) Determination or deprivation?	85
(iii) The application of fairness in multi-staged decision-making	89
(iv) The development of the legitimate expectation doctrine	92

(v) Section 4 of the PAJA	95
(d) Conclusion	98
2.5 Reasons	99
(a) Introduction and overview	99
(b) The treatment of reasons at common law	100
(c) Section 24(c) of the interim Constitution	101
(d) The 1996 Constitution and the PAJA	103
(i) Section 5 of the PAJA	105
(ii) The development of the concept of ‘adequate’ reasons	107
(e) Conclusion	111
CHAPTER 3	
Access to Judicial Remedies	113
3.1 Introduction	113
3.2 Standing	114
(a) Introduction and overview	114
(b) Standing at common law	116
(c) Standing under the Bill of Rights	117
(d) The courts’ treatment of standing	120
(i) Anyone acting in their own interest	120
(ii) Acting on behalf of another person who cannot act in their own name	122
(iii) Acting as a member of, or in the interest of, a group or class of persons	124
(iv) Acting in the public interest	127
(v) An association acting in the interest of its members	129
(e) Conclusion	131
3.2 Legislative obstacles to judicial redress	131
(a) Introduction and overview	131
(b) The main legislative obstacles	133
(i) Ouster clauses	133
(ii) Limitation clauses	137
(iii) Finality clauses	138
(iv) Indemnity and amnesty clauses	139
(v) Subjective language	140

(c) Section 7 of the PAJA	140
(i) The 180-day time limit	141
(ii) The duty to exhaust internal remedies	143
(d) Conclusion	149
CHAPTER 4	
Towards a substantive style of judicial reasoning	150
4.1 Introduction	150
4.2 Formalism in South Africa's legal culture	151
(a) The autonomous legal order and the separation of law and politics	152
(b) Judicial formalism under apartheid	154
(c) Formalism and the demands of a culture of justification	155
4.3 Formalism in administrative law before and after 1994	158
(a) The distinction between review and appeal and its ramifications	158
(i) The pre-democratic era	159
(ii) Developments since 1994	161
(b) The classification of functions	164
(i) The pre-democratic era	164
(ii) Developments since 1994	165
(c) The rules of standing	168
(i) The pre-democratic era	168
(ii) Developments since 1994	169
(d) The public/private distinction and the treatment of contracts in administrative law	170
(i) The pre-democratic era	170
(ii) Developments since 1994	172
4.4 The PAJA: A return to conceptualism?	175
(a) The statutory definition of administrative action	177
(b) Sections 3, 4 and 5 of the PAJA	181
4.5 Judicial steps away from formalism	182
(a) The principle of legality	182
(b) The development of a doctrine of deference	183
4.6 Conclusion	187

CHAPTER 5	
The completion of administrative law	188
5.1 Introduction	188
5.2 Judicial review	190
(a) The prominence of judicial review	191
(b) The basis and nature of review	193
(c) The possibility of non-judicial review	196
5.3 Administrative appeals	198
(a) The need for reform before 1994	199
(b) Developments since 1994	201
5.4 Legislative oversight	203
(a) The enactment of legislation	204
(b) The responsibility of Ministers to Parliament	205
(c) Parliamentary scrutiny of delegated legislation	206
(d) Reports to Parliament	207
5.5 Public participation	208
(a) Public participation under the democratic Constitution	209
(b) Public participation and the PAJA	210
5.6 Ombudsman institutions	212
(a) The Public Protector	213
(b) The Auditor-General	217
5.7 Access to information	219
(a) The constitutional right of access to information	220
(b) The Promotion of Access to Information Act	221
(i) Access to state-held information	222
(ii) Access to information in private hands	224
5.8 Missed opportunities and the need for further reform	226
5.9 Conclusion	229
CHAPTER 6	
Conclusion: An assessment of the transformation of South African administrative law since 1994	231
6.1 The aspirations of a transformed administrative law	231
6.2 The transformation of the law since 1994	234

(a) The development of the grounds of review	234
(b) Improved access to judicial remedies	236
(c) A more substantive style of judicial reasoning	237
(d) The completion of administrative law	237
6.3 Conclusion	238
BIBLIOGRAPHY	240
TABLE OF CASES	258
APPENDIX 1	
Constitutional rights to administrative justice	280
APPENDIX 2	
The Promotion of Administrative Justice Act	282
APPENDIX 3	
The Breakwater Declaration	293

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AAT	Administrative Appeals Tribunal
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
ADJP	Acting Deputy Judge President
AJ	Acting Judge / Justice
AJA	Acting Judge of Appeal
AJP	Acting Judge President
ANC	African National Congress
ARC	Administrative Review Council
AS	Annual Survey of South African Law
AZAPO	Azanian People's Organisation
CCMA	Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration
cf	compare
CJ	Chief Justice
Constitution	Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996
DCJ	Deputy Chief Justice
DJP	Deputy Judge President
DP	Deputy President
ed(s)	editor(s), edition
et al	and others
et seq	and the following
ff	and following pages
GG	Government Gazette
GN	Government Notice
ICASA	Independent Communications Authority of South Africa
ICD	Independent Complaints Directorate
IDASA	Institute for Democracy in South Africa
ILJ	Industrial Law Journal
Interim Constitution	Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 200 of 1993
J	Judge, Justice
JA	Judge of Appeal
JP	Judge President

MEC	Member of the Executive Council
P	President
PAIA	Promotion of Access to Information Act 2 of 2000
PAJA	Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 3 of 2000
para(s)	paragraph(s)
Proc	Proclamation
reg(s)	regulation(s)
RSA	Republic of South Africa
SA	South Africa
s(s)	section(s)
SAJHR	South African Journal on Human Rights
SALC	South African Law Commission
SALJ	South African Law Journal
SARFU	South African Rugby Football Union
Stell LR	Stellenbosch Law Review
subsec(s)	subsection(s)
THRHR	Tydskrif vir Hedendaagse Romeins-Hollandse Reg
TSAR	Tydskrif vir Suid-Afrikaanse Reg
VwVfG	Verwaltungsverfahrensgesetz