

Copyright Notice

The copyright of this thesis vests in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa, in accordance with the University's Intellectual Property Policy.

No portion of the text may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, including analogue and digital media, without prior written permission from the University. Extracts of or quotations from this thesis may, however, be made in terms of Section 12 and 13 of the South African Copyright Act No. 98 of 1978 (as amended), for non-commercial or educational purposes. Full acknowledgement must be made to the author and the University.

An electronic version of this thesis is available on the library webpage (www.wits.ac.za/library) under "Research Resources".

For permission requests, please contact the University Legal Office or the University Research Office (www.wits.ac.za).

Transitional Literacy in Gauteng Primary Schools: Two Collective Case Studies of Reading and Writing Experiences of Grades 3 and 4 Learners.

Juniel Shoko Tanga Matavire

A thesis submitted to the Wits School of Education, Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Johannesburg

2016

Abstract

This study examines literacy experiences of grade 3 learners as they transition into grade 4 in two primary schools in Gauteng. In the first school IsiZulu and Sepedi are the languages of teaching and learning in the foundation phase and learners transitioned to English in grade 4, while English is the language of learning and teaching in the second school. The study poses four questions. The first explores whether reading and writing in the foundation phase adequately prepare learners for the academic and cognitive demands of the intermediate phase. The second and third questions investigate the strategies used by learners and teachers to negotiate the transition and how those strategies could be understood and explained in relation to the increasing academic and cognitive demands of the literacy curriculum. The fourth question examines the role of language as children transition into grade 4.

The study draws on the ecological systems theory by Bronfenbrenner (2005) and adopts a socio-cultural orientation to literacy, drawing on scholarship in New Literacy Studies (Street, 2007). The research design was a collective case study in the qualitative paradigm. Classroom observation, interviews and document analyses gathered over 9 months comprise the data. Two grade 3 classes were observed for three months in each school before ten focus learners were identified and these children were followed into grade 4. One grade 4 class was studied in each school for six months.

What emerges from the data is that, at a macrosystemic level, curriculum change is a major factor in what happens to learners as they move across grades. The time of this study coincides with a curriculum transition from the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) of 2011 and 2012. When curriculum transition was not clear to teachers, and they did not buy into it, the effect on the mesosystem was confusion, anxiety and frustration on both teachers and learners that resulted in negative attitudes and poor delivery.

The choices of language of learning and teaching schools make for the literacy instruction of their learners an important factor in transition. Language alone is a huge demand and resource factor (Bronfenbrenner, 2005) in learner literacy learning. In both schools the majority of learners accessed literacy through languages that were different from their home languages. This compromised learners' access to and conception of academic texts.

There are complex physical, structural, psychological and academic transitions a learner must deal with at the mesosystemic level on reaching grade 4. Inadequate literacy skills impact negatively on learners' academic and social transition from one phase to another in multiple ways. Psychologically, learners had a sense of fear of the next grade and when their fears were confirmed it made transition challenging when dealing with grade 4 work. Structurally, the organisation of teaching changed from one teacher to many teachers, and hence many subjects with different expectations on learners. Some teachers had inadequate pedagogical knowledge, did not communicate within and across grades, and had generally autonomous conceptions of literacy, resulting in learners' literacy development being compromised.

At the microsystemic (classroom) level learners were confronted by grade 4 academic and literacy demands that the foundation phase did not equip them for. Reading and writing practices changed in grade 4. Vocabulary, fluency and comprehension skills learners brought from grade 3 became inadequate for the demands of grade 4 work. Also absent in grade 4 was the environmental print and other supports learners had in grade 3.

When learners' complex, challenging situations were compounded by poor teaching, inconsistent literacy practices, lack of resources, large classes and timetabling issues some learners lost interest, accepted their fate and developed negative attitudes to schooling. Carelessness surfaced, written work was not prioritised and often not completed, while other learners sought support from the exosystem in the form of parents and siblings to hedge the challenges of transition.

Consequent to this study there was a realisation among teachers in the two schools that they could do something about transition and literacy. An appetite for knowledge and revisiting of pedagogical practices was rekindled among some teachers. Transition and literacy became topical issues in both formal and informal teacher conversations. This raises questions about the coordination and smooth cooperation between systems which further research may tap into.

Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own work unaided work. It is being submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other University.

.....

Juniel Shoko Tanga Matavire

..... Day of In the year 2016

Dedication

To Petronella Chido, Junniel Mtumwa and Journal Mufudzi

Acknowledgements

A research journey can be quite exhausting without appropriate and gentle guidance, mentorship and tutoring. I always felt in good hands during the countless supervision meetings I had with Dr Kerry Dixon. Her incisive reading and penchant for appropriateness became a resource with which I learnt to trust for an unfettered academic opinion.

The principals, deputy principals, staff and students of my two research sites were interesting to work with. Thank you for enduring the intrusion that comes with research work in schools and classrooms. Through you the list of my friends has grown longer. Shylet has an interesting way of propelling me to keep working on my academic work even when the body and mind start dithering. Her motivation kept me all the way.

In funding my studies I received immeasurable support from the University of the Witwatersrand through the post-graduate merit award, the research completion grant and the Tothill scholarship. Without this support I couldn't have travelled this far. And many others whose contributions I cannot single out, I say thank you for your support and kindness, in their various forms.

Table of Contents

Abstract	iii
Declaration	v
Dedication	vi
Acknowledgements	vii
Chapter 1: The Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Literacy and My Reflections	2
1.3 Aims of the Study.....	4
1.4 The Research Questions	5
1.5 Rational	5
1.6 Significance of the study	8
1.7 Background to the study	9
1.7.1 The Educational Context before 1994	11
1.7.2 Towards Educational Reform – post 1994	14
1.7.3 Curriculum 2005	16
1.8 Definition of terms	20
1.9 Overview	21
Chapter 2: Review of Literature	23
2.1 Introduction	23
2.2 Transition Defined	23
2.3 Transition and Bronfenbrenner’s Ecological Theory	25
2.3.1 Process	28
2.3.2 Person	29
2.3.3 Context	30
2.3.4 Time	31
2.4 Contextualizing the Ecological Systems Model	33

2.5 Facilitating Phase Transition	37
2.6 Literacy and Transition.....	42
2.6.1 Literacy as Social Practice	44
2.6.2 Multiliteracies theory.....	46
2.6.3 Critical Literacy	48
2.7 Sociocultural Contributions to Understanding of the Second Language Classroom	48
2.8 Criticism of Sociocultural Theory	50
2.9 Interim Literacies and Transition in the South African Context	51
2.10 A Performance Plateau in Grade 4	54
2.11 Reading and Writing Pedagogies and Research	56
2.12 Curriculum Policy Documents.....	59
2.13 Language Issues and Pedagogy	59
2.14 Conclusion	63
Chapter 3: Context	65
3.1 Introduction	65
3.2 The Design	66
3.3 Macro-transitional Literacy Factors	69
3.4 Macro-literacy Realities in South Africa	74
3.5 Language Policies, Literacy and Learning	78
3.6 Conclusion	82
Chapter 4: Methodology	83
4.1 Introduction	83
4.2 Research Design: the Collective Case Study	83
4.3 Two Research Sites	88
4.3.1 Nellus Primary School	88
4.3.2 Kolo Primary School	90
4.4 The Participants	91

4.4.1 Selection of Participants	93
4.4.1.1 Thuli	96
4.4.1.2 Kate	97
4.4.1.3 Amukelani	98
4.4.1.4 Boikantso	98
4.4.1.5 Kamogelo	98
4.4.1.6 Tshireletso	99
4.4.1.7 Thabo	99
4.4.1.8 Thulani	100
4.4.1.9 Rutendo	100
4.4.1.10 Noxolo	101
4.5 Data Collection	101
4.5.1 Observation/Field Notes	102
4.5.2 Interviews	104
4.5.5 Documents Analysis	106
4.6 Interpretation and Analysis of Data	107
4.7 Limitations, Challenges and Constraints	109
4.8 Ethical Issues	112
Chapter 5: Curriculum change and Transition	115
5.1 Introduction	115
5.2 Curriculum Policy Shift	116
5.3 Curriculum Transition: from NCS to CAPS	117
5.3.1 NCS Home and First Additional Languages in Grade 3	123
5.3.2 The Grade 3- 4 Shift	129
5.3.3 Curriculum Transition	136
5.4 Psychological Transition	138
5.5 Teachers' Conceptualisations of Literacy	150

5.5.1 Inter and Intra Phase Knowledge	151
5.5.2 Teacher Conceptions of Learners in Transition	155
5.5.3 Teacher Expectations of Learners' Literacy	160
5.5.4 Confronting Transition	162
5.5 Conclusion	164
Chapter 6: Foundation Phase Experiences, Pedagogy and Instructional Conversations	
6.1 Introduction	166
6.2 Multilingualism and the Classroom	168
6.2.1 The Home Language Factor	169
6.2.2 LOLT and Class Composition	172
6.3 LOLT and Literacy	178
6.3.1 Home Language Literacies	180
6.4 Transfer of Literacy Skills	182
6.4.1 Longitudinal Studies	183
6.4.2 Benefits of Multilingualism	188
6.4.3 Transition to English LOLT	189
6.5 Teachers' In-class Practices with Language	193
6.5.1 The Poor Lesson	194
6.5.2 Code Switching and Mixing	198
6.5.3 Learners' Attitude towards English	200
6.6 Conclusion	202
Chapter 7: Literacy Resources Strategy and Pedagogy	
7.1 Introduction	203
7.2 The Environment and Resources	205
7.2.1 Environmental Print	205
7.2.2 Other Literacy Resources	210
7.2.3 Approaches to Teaching Reading	213

7.2.4 Textbook Analysis	216
7.3 Grade 4 English Literacy Demands	222
7.3.1 Teaching English Literacy	224
7.3.2 The English Grammar Lesson	231
7.3.3 The Vocabulary Lesson	237
7.3.4 The Fluency Lesson	240
7.3.5 The Comprehension Lesson	244
7.4 Constraints in the Teaching of Reading	248
7.5 Confronting Literacy Challenges	253
7.6 Conclusion	256
Chapter 8: Learner Experiences in Transition	257
8.1 Introduction	257
8.2 Preparing for Transition	258
8.3 Confronting Transition Challenges: Micro Transitional Issues	262
8.4 Learner Coping Strategies	267
8.4.1 Untidiness	267
8.4.1 Ask your Mother	269
8.4.2 Ask your Neighbour, Anyone	272
8.4.3 Listen to Yourself	274
8.4.4 Be Independent	277
8.5 Children’s Experiences with Written Literacies	278
8.6 Conclusion	289
Chapter 9: Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations	291
9.1 Introduction	291
9.2 Summary of Findings	293
9.2.1 Macro Issues	293
9.2.2 Exo level findings	294

9.2.2 Meso Level Findings	295
9.2.3 Micro Level Issues	298
9.3 Recommendations	300
9.3.1 Macro Level	301
9.3.2 Exo Level	302
9.3.3 Meso Level	303
9.3.4 Micro Level	305
9.4 Contribution of the Research to the Case Schools	307
Appendices	310
References	352

List of Figures

Fig 2.1 Influential systems on learner transition	33
Fig 2.2 The ecological systems theory by Bronfenbrenner (1994)	33
Fig 2.3 An adapted summary of Bronfenbrenner’s ecological systems model	34
Fig 3.1 Multiple transitions	66
Fig 3.2 Transitional literacy issues impacting on education	68
Fig 7.1 Literacy rich classroom environments	206
Fig 7.2 Literacy famished classroom environments	207
Fig 7.3 English literacy teaching chart	234
Fig 8.1 Changing conditions in grade 4	265
Fig 8.2 Literacy strategies at work	277
Fig 8.3 Changing literacy practices	278

List of Tables

Table 3.1 Curriculum structure as recommended by the Chisholm Commission of 2000 ...	72
Table 3.2 Literacy by province 2001, 2007 and 2011	77
Table 4.1 Summary of teacher participants.....	94
Table 4.2 Teachers observed for the first data set	95
Table 4.3 Learners selected for close observation and interview in grade 4	96
Table 5.1 Time allocation compared	119
Table 5.2 Time distribution for intermediate phase subjects	120
Table 5.3 reading and writing skills time allocation per day	121
Table 5.4 NCS and CAPS literacy content compared	125
Table 5.5 NCS and CAPS literacy in grade 4 compared	126
Table 6.1 Teachers' home languages in the foundation phase	171
Table 6.2 Home language distribution by class	173
Table 6.3 Differences between English, isiZulu and Sepedi	185
Table 7.1 Overview of grade 4 CAPS content, skills and strategies	222
Table 7.2 Comparison of literacy teaching strategies between schools	230