SCHOOLS AS LEARNING ORGANIZATIONS?
TWO SOUTH AFRICAN CASES

Njabuliso H. Nsibande

A thesis submitted to the School of Education, University of the Witwatersrand in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

JOHANNESBURG

June 2005

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. It is submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other university, nor has it been prepared with the assistance of any other body or institution, group, or person outside the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Njabuliso Happy Nsibande

_____day of _____, 2005

Dedication to

Khulu, my late granny-friend,

who raised me up so that I can stand on mountains;

My father, for teaching me to fight for the things I believe in; and

Mashalaika, my daughter who taught me about the beauty of angels.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am indebted to several individuals, groups, and organizations for making this study a success.

I would like to first express my appreciation to my supervisor and mentor, Professor Shirley Pendlebury. She tirelessly and generously gave constructive comments. I thank her for her encouragement and for constantly questioning my assumptions and making me outperform myself. I also thank her, as my mentor, for exposing me to the academic community while I was an associate lecturer in the School of Education and for providing me with financial support to participate in and present at local and international conferences. My sincere appreciation also goes to Professor Magagula, the Acting Vice-Chancellor of the University of Swaziland, for being my 'expert supervisor' during my three months GOOT Scholarship in Swaziland. I thank him for the valuable insights he willingly shared despite his very busy schedule. I am also grateful to the funders of the Grow Our Own Timber (GOOT) Programme for making it possible for me to enjoy being an associate lecturer for the three years of my study and the opportunity of learning so much in such a short space of time.

I am extremely grateful to all the participants in my study for contributing so generously to make my study a success. Spending time in those schools, and hearing the professionals, learners, and school leaders talking about their lives and how these relate to organizational learning in schools has been the PhD I have always wanted. I thank each one of them for even helping others learn from their work and achievements.

Thanks go to my dear friend Juliet with whom I struggled and celebrated in many special ways. Thanks also go to all the friends who supported me from the margins and my colleagues at the Management of Schools Training Programme.

Last but not least, special thanks go to my family, especially my father, who always supported me and believed so much in me; my mother who never stopped praying for me; Mlashiya, my uncle and his wife, for the lessons they taught us about caring for family; 'Sister Mine' - Dolly - for helping me establish a home for my children while studying; my brother Babane for always celebrating my little successes; and Ndumie who thinks I am a role model to 'Khulu's' generation.

Most of all, I devote my deepest appreciation to Mashalaika (Shali), my PhD 'bonus' and angel who kept reminding me that life was not all about studies; Musa, my dear son who supported me and his baby sister in many special ways and who never lost his cool; Regina, my nanny who loved my daughter as her own; and Niimo, who saved me from insanity during the most difficult time in my life and encouraged me when I was at my lowest.

ABSTRACT

Since the 1990s, the corporate concept of learning organizations has been promoted as a solution to problems caused by ever-changing educational reforms and as a model for schools in the twenty-first century. Through an in-depth analysis of two South African secondary schools in Gauteng, this study examines how organizational learning is nurtured and sustained, and considers whether and how the concept of learning organizations is applicable in schools. Three perspectives on learning organizations are considered: the normative, developmental and capability perspectives. The investigative framework links theories on organizational memory, organizational learning, organizational change and complexity theory to provide insights into why some organizations are 'smarter' than others and why educational reforms and innovations often fail.

The study used a multi-method approach, within a nested case design, at two contrasting schools, each facing the challenges of a changing society and education system, but under very different conditions: a state school in a poor informal settlement and a wealthy faith-based, independent school. Research participants included two principals, four heads of departments, ten teachers and fourteen learners. Although learners were included, the study focuses primarily on teachers and school leaders. At each school, key informants were selected from among those acknowledged to have contributed significantly to the school, either individually or as team members. In-depth interviews, as well as teachers' narrative accounts of their own learning and unlearning, and a variety of school-generated documents provided the data set. Two approaches were used for the stories of learning and unlearning – personal writing and elicitation through narrative interviews.

Findings pertain to participating schools, but also provide a basis for more general claims. In ethos, practices and leadership, both schools reflect a deep commitment to improving learners' lives. However, schools cannot operate as learning organizations unless they can harness individual staff members' aspirations as well. Internal and external circumstances impeded organizational learning and reciprocal professional commitment among staff. These included: personal problems; an individualistic school learning system with limited social interaction; concomitant anxiety about collaborative professional learning; a value system that favours competition; routine rather than reflective contexts for professional learning and communication; and unacknowledged gender issues. Another feature of a learning organization is a reflective openness to change. Yet both schools strive for stability and conformity to rules, and neither has developed tools for recognizing turning points, disjunctures and triggers for change. Learning organizations emphasize collective learning; yet teachers and department heads are 'starving' for personal recognition, especially in cases where they have become multi-skilled in the course of career advancement. The study also analyses complexities of school leadership and resulting trade-offs that have to be made between satisfying the diverse needs of school members and responding to external demands, especially at the level of policy. Overall, the

study demonstrates that while the related concepts of learning organizations and organizational learning are generative for understanding, structuring and leading schools, the definitive purposes of schools and the external pressures one them preclude a simple transfer from the corporate world.

KEYWORDS: Learning organizations; schools; educational change; organizational learning; complex theory; school leadership.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	**PAGE**
Declaration	ii
Dedication	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Abstract	v
CHAPTER ONE	
INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY: The 21st century is here. Where are schools as learning organizations?	1
Introduction	1
Statement of the problem	2
Research aims, questions, and objectives	5
The aim of the study	5
Specific research questions	6
Research objectives	6
Focus and scope of the study	7
Research assumptions	8
The study context	9
The rationale for the study	12
Organization of the thesis	15
CHAPTER TWO	19
THERORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND LITERATURE REVIEW: What are learning organizations? What do the definitions mean for schools?	
Theoretical framework	20
Organizational memory	21
Organizational learning	22
Organizational learning and developmental pathways	24
Types of learning	27

Organizational change 28
Educational change and the complexity/chaos theory 31
Perspectives on learning organizations 35
The normative perspective 36
The developmental perspective 41
The capability perspective 43
Tensions in the models of practice 46
Dysfunctional learning experiences 47
Learning organizations as a leadership challenge 51

CHAPTER THREE 58
METHODOLOGY AND RESEARCH DESIGN: Towards understanding South African schools as learning organizations
Research methodology and approach 59
Qualitative methodology 59
Qualitative case studies 59
Sampling 61
The research phases 63
Data collecting techniques 63
Interviews 65
Biographies 69
Observations 70
Self-administered questions 71
Documentary sources 72
Data presentation, analysis and interpretation 73
Trustworthiness 75
Limitations of the study 75
Ethical considerations 77

CHAPTER FOUR 79

DATA ANALYSIS (A): School A context and learning practices

Background to school A and its context 79

School leadership and the school culture 84

Maximization and recognition of learner achievement 92

External Partnerships 98

Strategic planning 99

School realities: through the learners' 'eyes' 102

School achievements as perceived by the learners 105

The story of learning: a sad ending 107

CHAPTER FIVE 115

DATA ANALYSIS (B): School B - context and learning practices

Background to school B and its context 115

School culture and leadership in the school 119

Managing innovations for learners' achievements 122

Participation in the Olympiads 123

Cultural activities 124

Public speaking 124

The Media Centre 125

Community service 127

School development and strategic planning 133

School Climate Survey 136

Learner support and guidance: Head Prefects' views 138

School learning experiences and lasting memories 140

School challenges 143

Staff turnover 145

Support staff 146

Data management 147

CHAPTER SIX 149

STORIES OF LEARNING AND UNLEARNING: Life histories and the development of learning in schools as organizations

Stories and their place in learning organizations 149

School A participants: humble beginnings 151

Triggers for (isolated) learning 156

School A: learning for survival 153

Shattered dreams 158

Schooling and dysfunctional learning experiences 160

Dysfunctional learning experiences and happy endings 162

Challenging times 165

Determination and 'bleak futures' 167

'Unfortunate' circumstances 167

Analysis of the stories' content 173

Lessons learnt from experiences 174

Personal experiences and organizational learning 177

Learners' gains from teachers' experiences 178

School, Family and Education 180

Persistent problems 181

Cutting edge individual learning 184

The executive principal: Mr. Peedy 184

The Curriculum Director 195

Concluding remarks 201

CHAPTER SEVEN 202

INTERPRETIVE ANALYSIS: School images and contradictions in the efficacy of the learning organization model

Resilient frameworks in a changing environment: reflections on the case studies 202

The schools' maintenance of order in a context of chaos 203

The idea of a 'school as community' 212

The struggle for personal and professional recognition in "I" versus the "we" contexts 217
Innovation versus the quest for academic excellence 221
Vulnerable teams in resilient hierarchies 224
The leader-democracy paradox 226

CHAPTER EIGHT 230
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS: Schools as learning organizations: The journey
Conclusions 230
Implications for theory, practice and policy 246

CHAPTER NINE 251
ADDRESSING QUALITY CONCERNS INQUALITATIVE RESEARCH: Surviving the crossroads
Adopting an emancipatory discourse: easier said than done 252
Drawings and Images: The taken-for-granted assumptions 254
Competing perspectives: challenging encounters 254
My cultural position: an analysis trap 255
Selection dilemmas: to choose or not to choose? 256
The micropolitics of schools: dilemmas of my 'outsider' position 257
Anecdotal sessions 258
Description or interpretation 259
Keeping pace with the rapidly changing target 260
Back to schools with data 260
Stories of learning 262

REFERENCES 264

APPENDICES 280
APPENDIX 1 Professional learning questionnaire - School A and B 280
APPENDIX 1A Strategic planning meeting – School A 286
APPENDIX 1B Professional development questionnaire - School B 292
APPENDIX 2 Interview questionnaire with staff – School B 298
APENDIX 2A Interview questions with the director of curriculum development 301
APPENDIX 3A Interview with School A principal 304
APPENDIX 3B Interview with the executive principal - School B 312
APPENDIX 4 Learners' focus group interviews – School A 324
APPENDIX 5 Narratives of learning in specific contexts 327
APPENDIX 6 Follow-up questionnaire (School A) 335

FIGURES AND TABLES

FIGURE 1: Theoretical framework 20
TABLE 1: Selected authors of the three perspectives of learning organizations 36
TABLE 2: Selected data-collection techniques, participants and related issues 64
TABLE 3: The development of themes and categories 74
TABLE 4: Grade 12 performance between 1993 and 2000 – School A 83
TABLE 5: Grade 12 performance between 1996 and 1999 – School B 116