

**Politics, professionalism and performance
management: a history of teacher evaluation in
South Africa**

Devi Pillay

A dissertation submitted to the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in fulfilment of the degree
Master of Arts in History by dissertation.

Abstract

Why has South Africa failed to institute a teacher evaluation system that produces meaningful results? I aim to contribute to an understanding of why and how various South African post-1994 teacher evaluation policies have failed to become institutionalised and have failed to ensure either robust teacher accountability or professional development. In this dissertation, I examine the history of teacher evaluation in South Africa, in order to understand the evolution of these policies and systems over time. After discussing the legacy of apartheid-era evaluation, I assess three post-1994 policy phases: the 1998 Developmental Appraisal System (DAS), the 2001 Whole School Evaluation (WSE) policies and the 2003 Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS).

This historical approach allows me to analyse the successes and failures of these policies in depth and context. Each of these policies has been shaped by, has tried to respond to, and has ultimately failed to confront the challenges of the past. They must also be understood to be a part of a continuous policymaking process, each one building upon and responding to the last. This dissertation contributes to an understanding of why these evaluation policies, despite massive investments of time, energy and resources, and complex and tough negotiations, have repeatedly failed. I argue that a flawed policy process consistently reiterates the same tensions and false assumptions in each new policy, and does not address these fundamental weaknesses.

These appraisal policies reflect negotiations and contestations between teacher unions and the state, while the policies themselves and their outcomes further complicate those union-state relationships. The tensions and contradictions within these policies are the product of a policymaking process that tries to cater to mutually exclusive interests. The history of these institutions – teacher unions, the state, collective bargaining bodies – and the relationships between them must be understood in order to grapple with the policymaking environment fully. Further, even as these policies have been renegotiated and redeveloped, they have all failed to engage with the actual realities of teachers and classrooms in the majority of schools in South Africa. The legacy of apartheid education is still manifest in the abilities, attitudes and politics of teachers, and policymakers on all sides of the process have consistently failed to confront that history and propose real strategies for change.

Table of Contents

Declaration	3
Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Table of Contents	iii
Acronyms	vii
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1: Background: teachers and teaching in contemporary South Africa.....	1
1.2: Aims and research focus	6
1.2.1: Why evaluation policies?.....	7
1.2.2: Why SADTU?.....	8
1.3: The argument	10
1.4: Appraisal, history and the literature.....	11
1.5: Understanding education policy	16
1.6: Sources	19
1.7: Overview.....	21
Chapter 2: Apartheid Education	23
2.1: An Overview of Apartheid Education.....	23
2.2: The Education Crisis and People’s Education.....	28
2.3: Teachers under apartheid	32
2.3.1: Teacher education.....	36
2.3.2: School boards.....	40
2.3.3: Teacher appraisal and evaluation	42
2.3.4: Conclusion	45
2.4: Teachers’ responses to apartheid education	46
2.4.1: Conservative professional associations	46
2.4.2: Early teacher resistance and conservatism.....	48
2.4.3: Teacher resistance and mobilisation	50
2.4.4: Towards teacher unity.....	53

2.4.5: Teachers and appraisal	58
2.4.6: Conclusion	62
Chapter 3: Education in Transition.....	65
3.1: Education negotiations during the transition.....	66
3.1.1: The Mandela Delegation and the Joint Working Group	66
3.1.2: Apartheid reforms	69
3.1.3: The National Education Conference	70
3.1.4: NEPI.....	72
3.1.5: The NETF	73
3.2: Post-apartheid policy work	75
3.3: SADTU	79
3.3.1: SADTU and Recognition.....	81
3.3.2: SADTU before and after transition	83
3.3.3: Unionism and professionalism	85
3.4: New developments in education	87
3.4.1: ELRC.....	87
3.4.2: SACE.....	88
3.4.3: NQF	89
3.4.4: Curriculum development.....	90
3.4.5: Teacher education.....	97
3.5: Conclusion.....	99
Chapter 4: The Developmental Appraisal System.....	102
4.1: Towards DAS: Policy Formation and Negotiation.....	103
4.2: The DAS Instrument	110
4.3: Implementation of DAS	112
4.4: Analysing DAS	115
4.5: Conclusion.....	119
Chapter 5: WSE and performance management.....	121
5.1: A shifting policy context.....	121
5.2: Towards WSE.....	125
5.3: Whole-School Evaluation	129

5.4: Developments in Performance Management.....	132
5.5: Policy Analysis.....	136
5.5.1: Language.....	136
5.5.2: Quality and indicators.....	137
5.5.3: Memories of apartheid.....	139
5.5.4: Control and democratisation.....	141
5.6: Conclusion.....	142
Chapter 6: IQMS.....	144
6.1: Towards IQMS.....	144
6.2: The IQMS instrument.....	147
6.2.1: The WSE component.....	147
6.2.2: The educator component.....	148
6.3: Implementation of IQMS.....	150
6.4: Analysis of IQMS.....	155
6.4.1: Conflation of summative and formative evaluation.....	156
6.4.2: Internal professional evaluation in the South African classroom.....	157
6.4.3: Ideological tension.....	159
6.4.4: Compliance and engagement.....	160
6.4.5: Unclear and inappropriate performance measures.....	161
6.4.6: Complexity and confusion.....	163
6.4.7: Teacher and resistance.....	163
6.5: Conclusion.....	164
Chapter 7: Conclusions.....	167
7.1: Key observations.....	167
7.1.1: Conflicts and negotiations.....	167
7.1.2: Confronting history in policymaking.....	168
7.2: Reckoning with failure.....	170
7.3: Further questions.....	174
Sources.....	176
7.4: Primary sources.....	176
7.4.1: ELRC Agreements.....	176

7.4.2: National legislation	176
7.4.3: Department of Education and government	177
7.4.4: SADTU Documents (selection).....	179
7.4.5: Newspaper articles	181
7.5: Secondary sources.....	183
7.5.1: Books.....	183
7.5.2: Book sections	185
7.5.3: Journal articles	189
7.5.4: Unpublished sources	195
7.5.5: Research reports	196