

A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF PRE- AND POST- 1994
LARGE-SCALE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMMES
IN SOUTH AFRICA WITH PARTICULAR
FOCUS ON EMPLOYMENT CREATION

Wellington Didibhuku Thwala

A Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment,
University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Engineering.

Johannesburg, 2009

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. It is being submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Engineering in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other University.

.....
Wellington Didibhuku Thwala

.....day of 2009

ABSTRACT

In South Africa, the levels of unemployment and poverty are extremely high and these are two of South Africa's most pressing problems. Over the past 28 years several major programmes have been initiated in South Africa to counter unemployment and poverty. Between 1980 and 1994, the former government spent billions of Rands on large-scale development programmes with the stated objective of using labour-intensive methods during the provision of physical infrastructure, to create employment and alleviate poverty. However, this did not solve the unemployment problem. Since 1994 the African National Congress (ANC) government has implemented large-scale programmes with similar objectives to those before 1994. After an analysis of the theoretical premises and implementation of labour-intensive public works programmes in Africa, the thesis critically evaluated several pre - and post - 1994 large-scale development programmes in South Africa. Major conclusions are that very little sustainable employment was created and there was no long-term programme approach to address poverty alleviation. Furthermore, lessons that could have been learnt from pre – 1994 have not been applied in the post 1994 period. Shortcomings in programme planning and implementation of large-scale development programmes in South Africa still exist. Another major conclusion is that the pre-1994 lessons were not taken into considerations in the post-1994 programme planning and implementation. Based on the research, the author has derived a six phase Programme Management Framework for Development Programmes. This framework embodies a long-term programme management approach to the planning and implementation of large-scale, labour-intensive development programmes.

KEYWORDS: Labour-intensive, public works, employment creation, large-scale development programmes projects, poverty, and infrastructure.

To my Father and Mother
Samuel Mpini Thwala and Nester Phahlakati Thwala

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the following people for their support in the preparation of this document.

- First, I would like to gratefully acknowledge the guidance, encouragement, insights and opportunities given to me by Professor R.T. McCutcheon, who supervised this thesis.
- Various people from the Department of Public Works, Independent Development Trust, University of Witwatersrand Project Management in Developing Areas students, Gauteng Department of Transport, Roads and Works, International Labour Organisation staff members, their support in providing me with information is acknowledged.
- The financial support from Mellon Foundation and the National Department of Public Works is acknowledged.
- To all my friends, particularly David Olebogeng, their support is acknowledged.
- My brother, Mbuso Simanga Dlamini, who passed away 1st January 2000 your support throughout my academic life, is acknowledged. I would also like to express my sincere gratitude to my sister, Simisile Nkosingiphile Thwala, who passed away in April 2008, may her soul rest in peace.
- The support from my daughter, Langelihle Lindelwa Thwala, is acknowledged.
- My brothers and sister, Mzwandile, Bongani, Shinkela, and Bongiwe Thwala, for their supportive role through difficult times

- Lastly I would like to thank my Father and Mother, Mr Samuel Mpini Thwala and Mrs Nester Phahlakati Thwala who cared and sacrificed so much for my early education.

CONTENTS

DECLARATION	i
ABSTRACT	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
CONTENTS	vi
LIST OF FIGURES	xv
LIST OF TABLES	xvi
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	xviii
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 BACKGROUND	1
1.2 Problem Statement	3
1.3 Significance of the Study	6
1.4 Monitoring and Evaluation	7
1.5 Infrastructure and Development	9
1.6 Multiplier Effect	9
1.7 The Need for Large-Scale Public Works Programmes in South Africa	10
1.8 The Research Methodology	13
1.8.1 Descriptive Research	14
1.8.2 Historical Research	14
1.8.3 Comparative Research	15

1.8.4	Evaluation Research	16
1.9	Structure of the Thesis	19
1.9.1	Chapter 1	19
1.9.2	Chapter 2	19
1.9.3	Chapter 3	20
1.9.4	Chapter 4	20
1.9.5	Chapter 5	20
1.9.6	Chapter 6	20
1.9.7	Chapter 7	21
1.9.8	Chapter 8	21
1.9.9	Chapter 9	22
1.9.10	Chapter 10	22
1.10	Conclusions	22

**CHAPTER 2 COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT APPROACH FOR
DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS IN SOUTH AFRICA 23**

2.1	Introduction	23
2.2	The Principle of Human Orientation	24
2.3	The Principle of Participation – Participation Defined	26
2.4	The Principle of Empowerment	27
2.4.1	What is empowerment?	27
2.5	The Principle of Ownership	29
2.6	The Principle of Release	29
2.7	The Principle of Learning	30
2.8	Obstacles to Community Development	31
2.9	Summary	32

**CHAPTER 3 OVERVIEW OF EMPLOYMENT CREATION THROUGH
PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMMES IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA AND THE
SOUTH AFRICAN EXPERIENCE 34**

3.1	Introduction	34
-----	--------------	----

3.2	Poverty in South Africa	35
3.3	Youth Unemployment in South Africa	36
3.4	Unemployment and Skills Development in South Africa	38
3.5	Public works programmes and employment creation	40
3.6	Overview of African Experiences through the Use of the Labour-Intensive Approach in Public Works Programmes	42
3.7	Infrastructure and Development	45
3.8	The Need for Public Works Programmes in South Africa	45
3.9	Implementation of Public Works Projects through Labour-intensive methods in South Africa: Summary of Experiences, Problems and Prospects	46
3.10	Summary	50

CHAPTER 4 PRE– 1994 LARGE-SCALE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMMES AND PROJECTS 52

4.1	Introduction	52
4.2	The Greater Soweto Upgrading Project	53
4.3	Programme Achievement	54
4.4	Lessons Learnt	57
4.5	The Republic of South Africa KwaZulu-Natal Development Programme	57
4.5.1	Development programme achievement	58
4.5.2	Lessons learnt	60
4.6	Strategic Oil Reserves Fund Programmes	62
4.6.1	Achievement of project objectives	64
4.6.2	Achievement of plans and lessons learnt	65
4.7	The Special Employment Creation Programme	67
4.7.1	Achievements of objectives	69
4.7.2	Weaknesses	70
4.8	Projects and Programme Findings, Recommendations and Conclusion	73
4.9	Summary	74

CHAPTER 5 COMMUNITY BASED PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMME 76

5.1	Introduction	76
5.2	Policy and Institutional Failure	78
5.3	Overview of the 1999/2000 and 2000/2001 Community Based Public Works Programme	81
5.4	The nature of the Community Based Public Works Programme	82
5.5	Managing the Community Based Public Works Programme	83
5.5.1	Provincial Department of Public Works	83
5.6	The 1999/2000 Community Based Public Works Programme	86
5.7	The 2000/2001 Community Based Public Works Programme	87
5.8	Budget allocation	87
5.8.1	The results	88
5.9	What assets were delivered by the CBPWP?	90
5.10	The cost of delivery	93
5.11	Calculating the management cost of the CBPWP	94
5.12	Expenditure	98
5.13	The provision of training	99
5.14	Creating employment	100
5.14.1	Sustainable employment	100
5.14.2	Temporary employment	102
5.14.3	Meeting the CBPWP employment targets	103
5.15	Summary	105
CHAPTER 6 THE NATIONAL FOOD EMERGENCY PROGRAMME		109
6.1	Introduction	109
6.2	The National Food Emergency Programme	110
6.3	Programme Management Plan	112
6.3.1	Programme scope	112
6.2.2	Beneficiaries	112
6.4	Target Areas	114
6.5	Food Parcels	116
6.5.1	Programme timeframes	117

6.5.2	Programme budget	117
6.6	Institutional Arrangements	118
6.7	Communication management	119
6.8	Quality Management	120
6.9	Risk Management	120
6.10	Monitoring and Reporting	121
6.11	Beneficiary Identification	122
6.12	Appointment of Service Providers	123
6.13	Delivery of Food Parcels	125
6.14	Monitoring and Reporting	126
6.14.1	Beneficiary profile form	126
6.14.2	Distribution summary sheet	126
6.14.3	Household level form	127
6.15	Communication	127
6.16	Beneficiary Identification and Data Management	128
6.17	National	128
6.18	Provincial Experiences	130
6.19	Service Provider Management	132
6.19.1	National	132
6.19.2	Provincial experiences	134
6.19.2.1	Delivery of food parcels	136
6.19.2.2	National	136
6.19.3	Provincial Experiences	137
6.20	Provision of Supplementary Food	142
6.21	Drop-in-Centres	142
6.22	Financial Management	143
6.22.1	Expenditure	143
6.23	Challenges	145
6.23.1	Implementation Timeframes	145
6.23.2	Beneficiary Identification	45
6.23.3	Quality of Food	146

6.23.4	Appointment of Service Providers	146
6.23.5	Monitoring and Reporting	146
6.23.6	Participation by other role players	147
6.23.7	Stakeholder Participation	147
6.24	Lessons Learned	148
6.24.1	Capacity of Service Providers	148
6.24.2	Grade of Food Items	149
6.24.3	Cost of Food Parcel	149
6.24.4	Distribution points	149
6.25	Summary	150

CHAPTER 7 THE POVERTY RELIEF PROGRAMME: THE CLEAN AND GREEN PROGRAMME

		151
7.1	Background	151
7.2	Introduction to the Clean and Green Programme	151
7.3	Methodology	153
7.4	Programme aims	153
7.5	Strategic partnerships	154
7.6	Operational level partnerships	156
7.7	Challenges to the Partnership	158
7.7.1	Challenges to the Partnership at the Strategic Level	158
7.7.2	The challenges to the partnerships at the project level	159
7.8	Programme achievements	160
7.8.1	Programme Costs	160
7.8.2	Programme Outcomes	161
7.8.3	Cleaning up Campaigns	161
7.8.4	Greening Campaigns	161
7.8.5	Environmental Campaigns	162
7.9	Capacity Building	163
7.10	Lessons Learnt	167
7.10.1	Programme conceptualisation	167

7.9.3	Proposed Deliverables	168
7.9.4	Programme Sustainability	169
7.10	Recommendations	169
7.11.1	Strategic partnerships	174
7.11.2	Beneficiary testimonies	174
7.11.3	Challenges to implementation	176
7.11.4	IDT value adding	177
7.12	Summary	177
CHAPTER 8 ZIVUSENI POVERTY RELIEF PROGRAMME		179
8.1	Introduction	179
8.2	Programme purpose	180
8.3	Programme Scope	180
8.3.1	Programme Objectives	180
8.4	Planned beneficiaries and beneficiary communities	181
8.5	Budget and Cash-flow Cycles	182
8.5.1	Explanatory Notes to budget	184
8.6	Strategic partnerships	187
8.7	Programme outputs and achievements of social targets	187
Part A: Cash flow		188
PART B: Social Targets		189
PART C: Analysis		190
8.8	Challenges to implementation	191
8.8.1	Recruitment strategy	191
8.7.2	Geographic targeting	191
8.7.3	Training	191
8.7.4	Targeting the disabled	192
8.7.5	Beneficiary payment	192
8.8	Lessons learnt	192
8.8.1	Programme design	193
8.8.2	Community expectations	193

8.8.3	Communication and social facilitation	194
8.9	Summary	194

**CHAPTER 9 AN EVALUATION OF THE INTEGRATED SUSTAINABLE
RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME IN THE K GALAGADI DISTRICT**

MUNICIPALITY		196
9.1	Introduction	196
9.2	The Developmental Mandate	197
9.3	The Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy	198
9.4	The responsibilities of the Independent Development Trust	199
9.5	Vision of the ISRDS	199
9.6	Why the Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy	200
9.7	Nodal Approach	200
9.8	Delivery Framework	201
9.9	Methodology	202
9.10	Overview of the Kgalagadi District Municipality	202
9.11	Demographic profile	203
9.12	Social Profile	203
9.13	Economic Profile	204
9.14	Kgalagadi District Municipality Nodal Objectives	205
9.15	Specific Anchor Projects	207
9.15.1	Integrated Energy Centre	207
9.15.2	Roads, Clinics and Primary Health Care	212
9.15.3	Mothibistad Housing Project	215
9.15.4	Flagship Poultry and Abattoir Project	218
9.15.5	Livestock improvement and production	220
9.15.6	Kgalagadi Dipudi Enterprise	222
9.15.7	Moshaweng Municipal Offices	224
9.15.8	Kgalagadi Water Project	227
9.15.9	Electrification Project	230
9.15.10	Municipal Support Programme	231

9.16	Summary	232
------	---------	-----

CHAPTER 10 FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND GENERAL

RECOMMENDATIONS 235

10.1	Introduction	235
10.2	Findings	236
10.3	Recommendations	241
10.4	The Author's Proposed Programme Management Framework for Development Programmes in South Africa	246
10.5	When to use the framework	248
10.6	How the framework is applied	250
10.7	Programme Framework Check List	250
10.7.1	Stage 1: Identification of need	250
10.7.2	Stage 2: Training and empowerment of stakeholders	251
10.7.3	Stage 3: Alternatives and approval	252
10.7.4	Stage 4: Implementation and monitoring of the programme	252
10.7.5	Stage 5: Evaluation of the development programme and framework	253
10.7.6	Stage 6: Sustainability of the development programme	253
10.8	What is the role of the Programme Manager?	254
10.9	What is the role of a Programme Steering Committee?	254
10.10	Summary of the main Research Findings	255
10.11	Areas for Further Research	262
10.12	Conclusion	264

Bibliography 266

APPENDIX A PEOPLE INTERVIEWED 298

A.1	Professionals	298
A.2	Residents	298

**APPENDIX B ZIVUSENI POVERTY RELIEF PROGRAMME GAUTENG
DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC TRANSPORT, ROADS AND WORKS IDT
PROGRAMME DESIGN 2002-2005 300**

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 10.1: Proposed project management framework for development programme in South Africa 249

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1:	Poverty indicators by province in South Africa	36
Table 3.2:	Employment status (official definition of employment)	37
Table 3.3:	Employment age cohorts that are 18 to 25 years and 26 to 35 years	38
Table 3.4:	Case study: non-residential building	40
Table 4.1:	Total infrastructure backlog roads, streets and stormwater drainage.....	55
Table 4.2:	Sewerage services.....	56
Table 4.3:	Water supply and reticulation.....	56
Table 4.4:	Project achievements	59
Table 4.5:	Pre-1994 projects and programmes planned and actual budget	73
Table 5.1:	Budget allocation 1999/2000 to 2000/2001.....	89
Table 5.2:	Distribution of projects across the project categories.....	91
Table 5.3:	Actual expenditure as per analysis of final payments to project implementing agency by year.....	95
Table 5.4:	Actual expenditure taking into account management/ support at project implementing agency level by year	95
Table 5.5:	CBPWP management cost (including/excluding social facilitation by year	97
Table 5.6:	Short and long-term job opportunities created by year and province	101
Table 5.7:	Performance in meeting in the employment targets by year and province	104
Table 6.1:	Statistics South Africa: categories of household food per capita monthly expenditure	113
Table 6.2:	Breakdown of Band A by province according to Statistics South Africa.....	114
Table 6.3:	Target areas per province and the estimated number of beneficiary households	115
Table 6.4:	Food parcel content.....	116

Table 6.5:	Allocation of funds per province	117
Table 6.6:	Risk categories.....	121
Table 6.7:	Number of beneficiaries captured by province.....	129
Table 6.8:	Service providers appointed per province	133
Table 6.9:	The number of food parcels delivered per province	136
Table 6.10:	List of Drop-in-Centres identified	143
Table 6.11:	Provincial expenditure as at 30 September 2003.....	144
Table 7.1:	Budget allocation per project site for financial year 2001/02.....	171
Table 7.2:	Clean Green project sites for the project duration	173
Table 7.3:	Breakdown of costs invested into CAGP by the partners.....	174
Table 8.1:	Budget for Zivuseni Poverty Alleviation Project Year 1 (2002/2003).....	183
Table 8.2:	Revised Budget for Zivuseni Poverty Alleviation Project Year 2 (2003/2004).....	186
Table 8.3:	Revised Budget for Zivuseni Poverty Alleviation Project Year 3 (2004/2005).....	186
Table 8.4:	Programme achievements.....	188
Table 9.1:	Population by race	203
Table 9.2:	Economic and basic infrastructure indicators.....	205
Table 9.3:	Monthly sales of fuel (in litres)	208
Table 9.4:	Monthly sales of LP gas by type of unit sold	209
Table 9.5:	September 2003 diesel order (in litres) for Sedibeng Water	209
Table 9.6:	Household status in the Kgalagadi District	215
Table 9.7:	Water status in Kgalagadi.....	227
Table 10.1:	Shortcomings of pre- and post-1994 projects and programmes	236

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CASE	Community Agency for Social Enquiry
CASP	Clean and Green Programme
CBPWP	Community-Based Public Works Programme
CETA	The Construction Education and Training Authority
CIM	Capital-Intensive Methods
DBSA	Development Bank of Southern Africa
DoA	Department of Agriculture
DoL	Department of Labour
DOT	Department of Transport
RSA/KNDP	Republic of South Africa/ KwaZulu-Natal Development Programme
DWAF	Department of Water Affairs and Forestry
CIM	Capital Intensive Methods
EIC	Employment Intensive Construction
EIEC	Employment Intensive Engineering Consultants
EIM	Employment Intensive Methods
EPWP	Expanded Public Works Programme
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IDT	Independent Development Trust
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ISRDP	Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Programme

LIM	Labour-Intensive Methods
LITE	Labour-Intensive Training and Engineering
KRAAP	Kenyan Rural Access Roads Programme
KSAB	Keep South Africa Beautiful
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MI	Machine-Intensive
MIP	Municipal Infrastructure Programme
NEF	National Economic Forum
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
NDPW	National Department of Public Works
NPWP	National Public Works Programme
RARP	Rural Access Roads Programme
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SAB	South African Breweries
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SAICE	South African Institution of Civil Engineers
SAACE	South African Association of Consulting Engineers
SASS	South African Statistical Service
SANCO	South African National Civic Organisation
SDIs	Spatial Development Initiatives
SECP	Special Employment Creation Programme
SORF	Strategic Oil Reserve Fund
SPWP	Special Public Works Programme
SOWETO	South Western Township
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme

UN	United Nations
UNPD	United Nations Development Programme
WB	World Bank
WEP	World Employment Programme