

https://dspace.org/

An investigation of student teachers' attitudes toward varieties of spoken English

Biesman-Simons, Claire

2010-08-16
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/8457

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1 QUESTIONNAIRE

APPENDIX 1A

Questionnaire, Part A

Dear Respondent

The purpose of this questionnaire is to investigate attitudes toward varieties of English in South Africa.

No answers are considered right or wrong. Honest answers will be of much benefit to the research.

Your identity will remain confidential.

Please tick the appropriate response(s).

Questionnaire: Section A

1. What year of studying are you in?

3rd 4th

2. What is/are your field(s) of study?

English Mathematics Science

3. What is your home language (you may indicate more than one)?

Afrikaans	English	isiNdebele	Sepedi
SeSotho	SiSwati	XiTsonga	Setswana
ThsiVenda	isiXhosa	isiZulu	

Other (please specify):

4. What other language(s) can you speak?

Afrikaans	English	isiNdebele	Sepedi
SeSotho	SiSwati	XiTsonga	Setswana
ThsiVenda	isiXhosa	isiZulu	

Other (please specify):

5. How many years of student teaching experience have you had?

1 2 3 4

6. In your student teaching experience have you taught in (you may indicate more than one response):

• Schools in which English is the language of the majority of the learners and the language of learning and teaching (LOLT)?

Yes No

• Multilingual schools where English is the LOLT?

Yes No

• Schools where an African language is the home language of all or the majority of the learners and English the LOLT?

Yes No

• Multilingual schools where the LOLT is an African language?

Yes No

Thank you for your responses to Section A of the questionnaire. I shall now lead you on to Part B. In this section you are required to rate the speakers on certain characteristics. These ratings are based on the opinions that you form of the speakers based on their speech.

APPENDIX 1B

Questionnaire 1, Part B

	SPEAKER 1					SPEAKER 2				
Using a scale of 1 to 5 with 1 being the least and 5 the most, rate each speaker on the following characteristics.										
	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
Ambitious										
Friendly										
Intelligent										
Kind										
Popular										
Self-confident										
Sense of humour										

	SPEAKER 3					SPEAKER 4				
Using a scale of 1 to 5 with 1 being the least and 5 the most, rate each speaker on the following characteristics.										
	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
Ambitious										
Friendly										
Intelligent										
Kind										
Popular										
Self-confident										
Sense of humour										

APPENDIX 2 RADIO RECORDINGS

The four recordings below are excerpts from a talk show *A Word on Cars*, hosted by Leigh Bennie on Talk Radio 702. She is joined by two car experts. Listeners are invited to call in with car related queries. The four excerpts are snippets from four callers' questions.

APPENDIX 2A
Radio Speaker 1, WSAE speaker

Both the alternators went literally within the same week. They, I also then, both batteries went within a month of each other. And ok, I went and I asked the guys why that would happen. They said, "No, as winter comes on, batteries seem to go for some reason".

APPENDIX 2B
Radio Speaker 2, ISAE speaker

RS2: Oh, it is. You can't believe it. Only one, one driver. Actually my son drove it's his from the inception.
Talk show host: So your son's selling you his car. He should just give it you.
RS 2: Ah, you're right.

APPENDIX 2C
Radio Speaker 3, ASAE speaker

The thing is, I have had a look at it. The problem is, that I have with it, is those two seats in front, that's the problem. Not in the driver and passenger, you know where…

APPENDIX 2D
Radio Speaker 4, BSAE speaker

RS 4: And now it's consuming quite a bit. I used to get 650, 700
Talk show host: Per tank?
RS4: But now I'm doing only 500 I think

APPENDIX 3 INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTS

APPENDIX 3A
Focus Group 1
20 August 2009

R1: So, this is the first one. It's just about 15 seconds.
[Appendix 2A played]
R1: OK. Um, that is Speaker 1. And if you can just, just based on his voice, take a guess and think what you, what you, as to what you feel, whether he's ambitious, attractive etc. and all of those [pause] please.
(…)
[Appendix 2B played]
(…)
[Appendix 2C played]
(…)
R1: Ok. This is the last one.
[Appendix 2D played]
[Quiet while participants complete the questionnaire]
R1:Um, I'm just interested in those four speakers. How educated do you think that they are? We'll start with the first one, with, um Shaun. He's having the problems with the battery. I mean, do you think he's finished school? Got a university degree? Is he a doctor? Is he a, you know, what sort of, it's some strange questions and it's a lot of just….
R2: It's gut feeling. There's no
R1: Ja.
R2: Ja.
P2: I think Shaun finished school and got a diploma.
(…)
P3: Ja I'd say he does have some level of higher or further education but that it's not so stringent or so like um, one might say scientific or in-depth, you know. It's just some course that he did to get into some workplace and be employed.
(…)
R1: And, what would, why do you think that he's got a diploma?
P2: I heard his questionings. He was questioning this guy. He wanted, he wanted to make sense of things. When he ask, he doesn't just ask, he want to understand, it's quite obvious he went to school.
R1: And, did you think he sounded educated at all?
P2: Ja. He ask a question like "Why?". He want to know why, he wants reason so he's educated.
(…)
R1: And then, um, would you. Oh sorry, moving on to the Indian chap who was asking about selling or buying that car.
R2: From his son.
R1: Ja. Did he sound, you know
R2: The same?

R1: Do you think he has a similar level of education?
P2: Not exactly, I don't think he went to school… He passed matric with an 'S' I think.
[General laughter]
P6: Or maybe less.
[More laughter]
(…)
R1: And, do you think that he sounds like a trustworthy guy? Would you, would you trust him? Just his voice
P7: No I wouldn't. [virtually inaudible]
R1: No, you wouldn't. And, and why is that?
R1: I'll ask you, because you've given me a bit of feedback already.
P7: The way he was, sounded like someone not intelligent, first of all.
P6: Ja.
(…)
P2: Self-confidence was not there and the sense of humour also
(…)
R1: And then, um, I'm going to move to, to Martin, the third, the third guy. He's the one who spoke about, he didn't like how the seats were arranged in the car.
R2: Your impressions of him?
R1: What did you first think when he started speaking?
(…)
P3: Um, honestly, I'd say, he seems like the one who's not learned, you know. Because he didn't really try to be concise or clear in what he was saying. It seems as if he was complaining in some degree and you know, you can't go to a radio station and, and you're complaining. What's the radio station supposed to do about that? That shows lack of critical thinking. So to me it doesn't seem like a person who's really like cognitively well developed.
R1: Do you think that might have something to do in, he sounds like English might not be his first language?
P5: He sounded Afrikaans.
R1: Ja, he sounded as if he was Afrikaans. Do you think he might have come across better if he'd phoned in and he was speaking in Afrikaans?
P3: Ja, I think so.
R1: Do you think that the way he was speaking and the type of English that he was speaking might make you think {Yes}, "Oh, he's not so clever" ?
P2: Maybe in his own language he could've expressed himself better. {Ja.} Than trying to speak other language.
P2: Other words you want to put Afrikaans word but you can't, you substitute the wrong word.
R1: So do you/
P2: Make the whole thing sounds wrong.
R1: Mmm [in agreement].
R1: So, do you think that he should rather be phoning in and listening to an Afrikaans radio station?
P2: Maybe they don't have those type of topics on Afrikaans radio, so the only way he can express himself in that radio station, is, like, try to speak English.

R1: And do you think, do you think that it's a bad thing that in this country so often you do need to speak English, you can't speak your home language if you want to be heard {P5: But} and to communicate?
P5: But, to be honest, like, English is a linguistic saviour, it's not like... OK, someone, somewhere, somehow, people can see it as a terrorist but somehow it is a saviour because in a country like South Africa, it's diverse so we don't have an option, English is the saviour, we have to speak English in order for us to hear one another. If you take, for example here, we speak different home languages: Swati, Tswana or what. So in order for us to communicate, we need English.
P3: On that point, it becomes a bad thing, when, you know, for sure it's a good thing when you use English to communicate and whatever and break the barriers of diversity and everything, but then once we start using that English as a measure of intelligence like someone would do with this Martin dude, you know, because his English isn't so proper and isn't so clear…[unclear]… aah, this guy is not really schooled, this guy's really not learned. Then it becomes a problem, because English is just a tool, a language, a medium of speaking, you know. So once we mix that with a person's measure of intelligence then it becomes a problem.
(…)
R1: And they might not speak English quite like you speak English. As we said, we might look at an Afrikaans man and think, he's not that intelligent.
P2: Ja.
(…)
R1: And, when, when you're in the class and, so we, most, most people teaching do teach in English, it is the LoLT of, you know, most schools across the country, is there a certain way that you want them to speak English? Must they speak English, must they all sound the same? Or does it matter if one of them sounds like Martin sounds? Or one of them sounds like the second speaker sounds or whatever? Do you want them all, must they sound the uniform, "correct way"? Is there a correct way, or can they sound, just as long as they can communicate?
P6: I think, I don't have a problem with someone who's fluent with English, [unclear] but I've got a problem with someone who is trying to change their voice, and trying to, to, to make some other words like very long, like roll them. I, I, I don't understand why they have to do that.
(…)
R1: And, and, I mean but they don't need to be all the same accent?
P6: Yes.
R1: Or they can/
P6: One can have their own accent. Eh, in the case whereby, one can have, they can use their own accent, their own voices, and still be able to write, I don't have a problem with that. But then, immediately, when they try to change the voices, the accent, I don't [pause] like.
(…)
P2: To explain it, in your own words, the way you understood it, in your own accent, your own English, but it should mean what I taught you.
R1: So you need to be able to see that they got the concept?
[Participants indicate agreement]

(…)
P5: In terms of Science, grammar is not that important so the only thing I want I'd want to know is just the [pause] the [pause] to show that the child does understand. But, when it comes to English, if you are teaching English, obviously grammar, grammar will be important. When you speak, the way you write, obviously as an English teacher I'll be looking at the grammatical structure, all that. But in science we don't really look at grammar.
R1: So, is that the role then of the English teacher?
P5: No, it's not exactly the role of the English teacher, but most we don't concentrate much on the grammar, just to show that this child do understand. But, also, you see, any subject you do teach English. So you cannot say, run away from English, say ok, grammar is for the English teachers. But, at that point you don't necessarily concentrate on grammar but when it comes to English and the way I speak or write, must be of correct order.
P3: Ja, me basically, like, in the classroom context, I won't penalise learners, you know, for things such as grammatical errors or things like that, but then I will address them, you know, because, as English is a tool that we're learning and teaching in, it's a tool, you know and the more we use it, the more we have to get more efficient in it, you know (…) you will get better eventually. Just promote the usage of it, irrespective of whatever imbalances you might have.
(…)
[P1 and P7 leave]
R1: We just, we got off sidetracked a little bit, and the last, the last chap, um, Tshepo who we listened to, who spoke about the petrol consumption of his car. What do you think he sounded like, was he, was he edu, was he someone that you're going to respect and did he?
(…)
P3: Well, besides that he was well-spoken and the manner in which he was addressing himself, basically, like you could feel the confidence in what he was saying. There is also the point of his, the way he thinks, you know, the point he's making there. Or he used to, I don't know, get R500 and R600 and this and this and that, you can see that this person is, to some degree, like really educated, you know what I'm saying.
P3: One could say that maybe he was an undergraduate here at Wits University that we might know, you know what I'm saying, ja.
(…)
R1: So he sounds more intelligent, and more?
P4: He knows what he is saying.
P2: He went to school.
(…)
R1: OK, before we wrap up, I have a couple more questions I would like to ask. Do you know what Standard English is?
R1: Do you know what Standard English is [directed at English student teachers in particular]?
(…)
R1: Now, do you think in South Africa we have something like that?

P2: Ja, we do, on talk shows, 3 *talk* or something, on *Asikhulume*. You can't just talk go there and like, what what, you have to, you know, proper English or Standard English as you call it.
(…)
R1: And, do you think that's the English that is most widely spoken, if you listen to politicians, is that an acceptable English that they are speaking?
P2: Politicians?
P2: Those ones, they confuse us.
[General laughter]
P4: Big times.
P2: On their English. They don't want to make it clear what they are saying. But in *Asikhulume* they want to make a point, so that everyone understands. Politicians, in one sentence, there are three terms which are hard, so people just do his own, but don't get what he is saying.
[General laughter]
(…)
P3: And they using some other words that yoh, you like, what's going on and that's not, I don't think the that's conducive of any positive or progressive dialogue, you know what I'm saying, but then the Standard English that's used around the media and everything, the Standard English that, like, educated people from this country can understand, and people who went to school, attained a higher level of education, that's the English they were schooled in and they were graded in, and hence they will be able to understand.
R1: So do you think that the general Wits student, as an undergraduate or a postgraduate, whatever level, would aim to speak that Standard English?
P2: Ja, of course {P6: Ja}.
[Much agreement indicated]
R1: And do you think that will help them when they get out into the workplace?
Participants say 'Ja'
R2: Would you call it the English of education?
Unclear: Ja, exactly.
[Agreement indicated]
R1: So let's say you think about a very successful businessman, a banker or something, what, what do you, how do you expect he is going to speak?
P2: Um, he must know what he is talking about. The content, and how to present it. In proper English. So that he doesn't mislead people, into what he's saying. He must be sure of what he is saying. So he must be good in English, and in what he is doing.
(…)
R2: So it's not the content, but how it's put together. Would you say there is a Soweto English?
[Definite general agreement on there being a Soweto English]
P2: Yes there is. The English I speak here in campus is different to the English I speak with my friends, [met with general agreement] because when I'm speaking with my friends, we sometimes use terms from other languages, Afrikaans, or Zulu words we mixed it with English. So there is definitely. [pause] There is this formal English, and this informal English, that we use.
(…)

R1: And do you, I'm trying to think how to say this as nicely, do you think that your different backgrounds and your different, even your cultures, or maybe even your races, will affect how you speak English?
P3: Largely.
P2: It does.
(…)
P4: Like Vendas, the accent.
P3: You can distinguish between.
R2: (…)
P3: Indian people from Joburg and Durban.
[General agreement and laughter]
R1: Oh that, that's definite. And if you hear an Indian person, and you think they're from Lenasia, or you hear an Indian person and you think, they're from Durban, do you look at them differently? Do you, do you think, do you judge them, "ooh, that voice means that they are not as educated"?
R2: Does it change your perception of them?
P2: It depends on the person. [pause] Ja, I mean, you can tell if this person is from Durban. Your perspective, how do you take Durban people, or from those people. So you can't judge them, if you like Durban people you will be like, "Hey!" compared to the other ["Hey" said in a friendly tone].
[P3 nods and agrees]
R1: So what you hear will make you have a first thought on them?
[General agreement]
P6: Ja, I think it does cos um, if, if I'm talking to a Venda person in English, I can hear that this person is Venda, and already cos I know how Vendas are, my mind, my perspective will change, OK this person has to be like that, just because of the language and the tone that they use.
R2: How would that happen, how would that affect you, in the classroom?
P6: Ja, OK, if, it does affect me but I'm not that bad.
R1: Do you make an effort not for it to affect you?
P6: Ja, I do a lot, cos especially if you are doing, if you are teaching a multilingual class and you have to teach English it becomes like, it's not a bad thing or a good thing, but then you have to deal with it. Cos you have a mind that that ok, a Zulu person is like this, and immediately when you hear that, ok, this person is talking this way, and when you hear a sentence from a Zulu person, your mind just automatically tells you, you just start thinking this person is behaving this way and this way and this way.
(…)
R2: And that's where it becomes a bad thing that how you speak English can be a reflection of someone stereotyping you. Have you ever been on the receiving end of that, personally?
[General laughter]
P3: You know what I'm saying, and the when he's like, your cousins meet up, it's a family gathering, everyone is there. This cousin stays there, this cousin stays here, now they all wanna communicate in English, you know, so that they compare who's smarter than you, who's smarter than who. And then you find there's that one maybe, maybe he or she is going to a township school, whereas other ones are going to former Model C

schools, and then he's just trying to speak in Sotho or Zulu, or whatever, and then now all these other are like, "no, hey, whatever [in suggested White South African English] and he's on some, lost, you know, and now he's not as clever as they are.

(…)

R1: We, we probably do, do need to wrap up. It's five past eleven and I know you need to go. If anyone wants to stay behind and has a comment or two that they want to say to R2 and me, they are welcome to. Otherwise, we're really grateful that you joined us today. You've helped me a lot, um, and I'd just like to say thank you, especially to you for organising everything at the last minute and for getting hold of my, me.

APPENDIX 3B
Focus Group 2
27 August 2009

(…)
R1: What they are, they're phone-ins to a radio talk show. So, these people don't know that we are discussing them now.
[Appendix 2A played]
R1: Speaker 2
[Appendix 2B played]
(…)
[Appendix 2A repeated]
(…)
R1: Ok. The second one.
[Appendix 2B repeated twice]
(…)
R1: This is the third one.
[Appendix 2C played]
(…)
[Appendix 2C repeated]
R1: And then this is the [pause] final one
[Appendix 2D played]
(…)
[Appendix 2A, B, C and D repeated].
(…)
R1: Just from listening to them. As I said, not what they say, but how they sound, which of them do you think is very well educated, and which of them really maybe got Std 8? Or, I mean, I don't know their level of education myself so it's just a guess.
P3: I think the last one.
P4: The last one…from somewhere down there, grade 8.
P1: Ja, probably a school leaver.
P3: The last one. The way like he talks, you can like predict that this English thing is poor.
R1: The one talking about the petrol consumption?
P1: Speaker 4.
R1: Speaker 4, ja.
[General agreement]
P1: Speaker 3 probably got a Matric.
P4: Ja, ja, that's what I'm thinking also.
P1: Because he sounds quite old.
(…)
P1: Speaker 1 seems like he knows what's potting.
P3: Ja.
P1: But it doesn't mean he's necessarily got a good education. It could just be his interest is cars.
(…)

P2: But at least he [RS1] can apply the English thing.
P4: Hmmm?
P2: At least he can like do the application of the English.
P4: Ja, that one.
P1: He's good in language.
P4: Ja, he's good in the language.
P1: Speaker 2 sounded like a thrill a minute.
[Laughter]
(…)
P1: OK, I looked at him, I put him as very confident.
R1: Very confident?
[Group hesitates]
(…)
R1: What does he sound, just from his voice, I mean?
P4: Sounds like? [wondering]
P1: Like a manager in a store [referring to RS2].
R1: OK.
P1: An area manager [referring to RS2].
P2: Sounds like a plumber to me [referring to RS3].
[Loud laughter]
P2: Ja, sounding more like a plumber to me.
[Unclear muttering]
R1: But, do you think that English is his [RS3] first language?
P4: There's a problem.
(…)
P4: You educated my friend, and you also have a problem [referring to RS3].
R1: If you, if you had these 4 people in the classroom, when they were 20 years younger, or whatever, which would be speaking in the most acceptable way? Would one, would you like them to all speak like Martin, or could they all speak like?
P1: They don't have to all speak like him.
R1: But, do you, do you think that, when you are teaching, the learners must all speak English in a similar way?
[Unanimous no's]
P1: You can't have that.
P2: I think it's because, I think the most important part, it's, it's how they put it, {P4: Ja.} as long as you understand, doesn't matter how they form it. [More agreement from P3 and P4] For me, it doesn't matter how they {P1: it comes across} {P4: it's from the thinking} as long as I get the concept. Cos someone can have, can speak English quite perfectly, of which you don't understand what he or she is saying. {P1: Just fancy words.} {P4: Ja, ja.}
P1: You can see we're all Maths people.
[General laughter]
R1: And then, because you've said that, in an English classroom, should they all be speaking in a similar manner?
P4: No.

P1: They shouldn't speak. Your accent's gonna be different. {P4: Exactly.} but in terms of fluency, and in terms of reading properly, and when I say properly I don't mean speaking, reading things with the right accent, {P4: speed} ja, your speed, your fluency, your understanding, conceptually, and being able to infer from the story.
(…)
R1: So, you're not concerned with <u>how</u> they sound, you concerned with <u>what</u> they're saying.
[General agreement]
P2: Cos, maybe the <u>thinking</u>, someone might think [pause] have the right idea, but putting it on word, or saying it to you, might come differently, then you have to pick up some points then.
(…)
R1: And do you, do you think in the class, you look at, you look at people? [Aside, 2 students arrive] When you look at them, say now somebody's speaking Venda English, {yes} are you going to look at them differently, from how you look at somebody who's speaking Zulu English. Does it make you have an impression of them?
P2, P3, P4 [simultaneously]: No, no, no, no it doesn't.
P4: It's enough for me that he knows 1 plus 1 is 2, doesn't matter whether he's using wrong English or whatever.
(…)
R1: Do you agree with that?
P3: Ah, for me it makes sense. It's something that we could maybe just discuss it for a day, oh, you speak in different accents. That's not like something that will have an effect me or my relationship with the other people.
P4: Ah, no, no, no [in agreement with previous speaker]. No, it doesn't.
P4: But some people, you know it really affects them.
P1: I know it affects them.
R1: You [to new girls] can join in, if you want to.
P4: Ja, some people, you know, I think they take it seriously. When you speaking in a different accent, they'll be like, you know, looking for the word to identify you, you know, maybe label you, those things.
P1: Like I had that experience.
P4: I also had it.
R1: Of someone labelling you?
P1: and P4: Ja.
(…)
The students stayed like I was some sort of taboo because I didn't speak the way they did {Ja.}. And they automatically assumed, um, intelligence, they assumed, um background, they assumed a <u>whole range</u> of things which I was quite shocked.
R1: Now, if I say the word coconut, what sort of person do you picture?
P4: Person who likes talking English, but it's....
R1: So, they Blacks but they're English. Are they?
P3: [With a nasal voice] Speaking English as if they.
P5: Like, with the nose.
P4: Speaking with the nose. [Participants imitate "coconuts".]
R1: Do they speak the English I speak?

P5: Ja.
P4: Now, that's even better. They speak that English you can hear them, Ha! Ha! Ha!
[Laughter and further imitation of Ha ha ha]
(…)
R1: And, are there people who try and, try and put on that accent?
[Background noise, a participant spills juice]
P4: Ja, I just talk.
(…)
R1: When you speak English, OK. Say, you're speaking to me. Or, you speaking to learners. Or, you speaking to friends, is that, do you speak the same sort of English, all the time?
P4: It changes some time.
R1: Is there a Soweto English and is there a, say a Lenasia English for the Indians? And a northern suburbs English for the "nose in the air" private school people?
P1: There is, but I don't change the way I talk.
(…)
P5: And most of the time you are being judged Black learners {P3: Ja} {P4: They laughing at you} more than the White learners. They laughing at you, the way you pronounce it. {P4: Ja, you see} I don't know.
(…)
P4: You know, the English ones, they don't mind, but Black ones, are the ones who…. /
P3: Who will tend to.
R1: So, you think that say, well, the Indian, and the Whitey here, do you think we're not, we don't notice your differences in speaking as much?
P4: No, even if you do, but you accommodate us, I think.
(…)
R1: And would it be a compliment if someone said you sound exactly like an English person?
P5: No, no, no. [General "no's" from everyone]
R1: That's identity, hey?
P5: Ja.
P6: I want to sound like a Black person.
[Loud laughter]
R1: Well, we know who isn't a coconut.
[Even louder laughter]
(…)
[P1 leaves]
(…)
P4: Your question was?
R1: Oh, do you, do you, do you want to, you know, do you want to be, do you want to sound like you are Black when you speak English? Do you want people to know that you are Black, as part of retaining your identity. Or if you sound like you are Indian or White, or something, is that OK?
P5: Like, it's not a matter of "you want to",
P4: You have to.
P5: No, it's not that, it's [pause] it's the way you are. You can't, I don't know.

P6: Like, I can't, I can't sound, you know, [P6: giggles] I can't sound coconut. I've never been there, I don't know how. So I sound like this. [Participants agree.]
P4: You can change and become a coconut. {P6: how, when?} You can start talking that English, you know. Try by all means, you know, saying, eish, *nyama* (eat) peri peri, you know all those things, and then you end up being coconut.
(…)
R1: So, does your accent change? [All agree] And that's OK that it changes?
P4: No, it's not OK. Ja, it's OK because…. [confusion and laughter]
P3: It's OK but you are not forcing it. It's something that happens naturally I think. [Laughter] It's not that you are {P5: You can't control it} ja.
[Giggling]
(…)
R1: You said something earlier and I think you said it slightly jokingly, you said, um, you have to speak English like that, to sound, you know, as your accent changes. Do you think though, cos for us, we've obviously established that you're happy with your accent and you don't, you don't want to sound like anybody else? But if you go and apply for a job, do you think it matters how you sound?
P4: It doesn't matter. What matters is, you know, how you present yourself, but the accent, and the way you speak English, you can speak English fluently or not fluently, but as long as that job … [unclear] I don't think it matters.
P5: But, it doesn't mean that accent is your intelligence.
P4: No, it's not.
R1: But do you think some people?
P6: Ja, some people, the person who is listening to you in an interview, they are thinking, well, when you have this, not that accent, they thinking, you know, more knowledgeable, you know, cos the English is.
P3: Cos like, cos like, cos, what we have been talking about. If someone comes here, like maybe, we can have maybe three different types of girls come here. The other one, maybe, speaks English like a White person, the first thing you will think in your head is OK, he has more White friends, he's been to university, he went to a Model C school, so he's good for the job.
(…)
P4: The problem is, we think like that, but *mina* (me), I think English people don't care. [P3 agrees] because as, right now, my friend breaks English, I'm gonna say damn, you broke the English, but you [indicating R1] wouldn't even mind if he broke the English.
R1: But some people might.
P4: Ja, but some people might.
P5: Especially Blacks.
P4: Ja, Blacks do.
R1: So what, Blacks judge other Blacks for the way they speak English?
P6: Big time!
[Everyone agrees]
R1: So how do they want you to sound?
P4: The way they learnt it.
?: The way they sound.
P4: But especially more English.

R1: So they must sound White, does that mean that they are {P4: coconuts} that they're coconuts but does that make them think that they are superior?
R1: So they speak English like a White person it makes them better.
P3: And the thing is./
P5: Even, even, even like, generally, when you, you, you meet a person, you listen to the way he or she speaks. And then he comes with this English, "ey yoy yoy", you see this scattered English. ay, you not gonna have interest.
P3: I think we are competing.
[Laughter]
(…)
R1: And, you know, Afrikaans before had such a strong identity, so it's, it's losing that identity, {P4: Ja, I see.} and you know they fighting it. (…) What do you think of people who speak English when they're Afrikaans, do you look at them and think, aggh, you're one of those like Nat-type people, or do you give them the same chance?
P3: Don't even know what it is.
P2: I don't even see.
P3: I don't even notice.
P4: It's, it's, it's, I think, doing that, in order to accommodate other people, because like now, take for example Miss Greeff, if she starts speaking Afrikaans, whoah, whoah, 90 percent of the class will be lost. Let me say 98 percent of the class will be lost, so, you can't say maybe she's there and that. It's just that you are trying to accommodate other people.
(…)
[Male participants signal that they need to leave]
(…)
R1: Were you here when I was asking everyone if a, I don't think you were, if a learner must, if they must all sound the same? In your classroom?
P6: They must all sound the same?
R1: Ja, must they speak the same sort of English?
P5 and P6: No.
P5: We can't control the, ok, we can control the accent, but, it's not fair to, to make them sound the same.
P6: Cos they not the same people.
P5: Cos they not the same people.
R1: That's one of the most interesting points. No one has said something about "it's not fair". [Women giggle] No, but, that's the same as we were saying with, is it fair that people, Afrikaners feel they must try and hide that they're Afrikaans?
P6: But they shouldn't.
R1: And they speak English in a different way? But is it fair that they feel that?
P6: It's not fair.
P5: But, we, we not making them feel that.
(…)
P5: But it's, we must not do that. They are <u>different</u>. They are from <u>different</u> backgrounds, so we can't expect them to speak the <u>same</u>, do things the <u>same</u>. We can't do that to the learners, poor learners [said with much sympathy].

R1: But what about in an, in an, in an English classroom. Do they need to speak an English that the teacher might think is superior, or?
P5: You see, that depends on the teacher, cos the teacher is the one who controls everything. So maybe the teacher, if he assumes *ukuthi* (I want to say) {P6: certain English} certain English is superior, then he'll say that "No, you must say this, or that, or whaddawhadda".
P6: But again, it depends which school you talking about, cos some schools, as long as you speak English, that's fine {P5: they understand you} they understand what you saying, that's fine. How you say it, whether your English sounds Venda English, Xhosa English, it really doesn't matter.
R1: And what sort of schools are those, generally?
P5: The, the village ones. Those ones.
R1: And what about {P6: township schools} township schools?
(…)
P5: It's a need. English is a need to know. If you don't know it you are {P6: screwed} screwed.
[Laughter]
(…)
P5: Cos most people want to learn it. If you don't know English you are nothing.
(…)
R1: I'm gonna ask you a question now, I think I asked a similar question when the boys were here but they all jumped onto it. Do you think it matters what, how you speak English at a job interview?
P6: [With a thoughtful expression] Job interview, how you speak English.
P5: Ja, I think it matters, most of the time, because they gonna judge you. If you speak this nice English, obviously they gonna make some assumption, that you are from.
R1: Tell me, what is nice English?
[Laughter]
P5: This English English.
R1: English English?
P5: Ja, this, ja English English.
R1: So based on what they speak, my, well not my because I'm, but White settlers, so the language that comes from them? [Participants agree] From when they came from English, and they, that's English English [Participants agree]. Is that a proper English?
P5: <u>We don't know what's proper</u>! Don't know what's proper English, cos everybody's coming with their own definition of proper, what's proper English. So, you only acquire the English that you think will fit with the society, {P6: where you at} where you at.
R1: So, it is, it's English, you not just learning. I mean, are you learning English just to communicate, or are you making sure that you learn English in such a way that people are gonna respect you. Because you can….
P6: Ay, no.
P5: See, there's two: if you speak English like, I don't know, maybe Zulu English, people aren't gonna listen to you, but if you speak that eh like, "Ja,, haa, heee" [in suggested WSAE] people are gonna say, "Oh, ja, let's listen. She's more knowledgeable" or something. Like it, the accent, most of the time, it depends.
(…)

P5: Ja, the higher the success [said with resignation]. You might put it that. But it depends on, maybe if you consider a job, it depends on how they want you to respond. You know, do they look at the accent part, or the content – the understanding part. So, if they looking at the accent, if you are from the Model Cs then {R1: you've got the job} ja. But if you mean….
P6: But, but, OK fine, you might be speaking English but then at that time they'll be having the CV, your qualifications, obviously while you're speaking they're looking at that. And whether you speak
(…)
R1: Now, when you say that you do look at people in terms of their success, with the type of English they speak, and whether it's English English, or something. If you go into a classroom to teach, a multiracial classroom, and you've got some students who speak English as their first language, but say it's an Indian influenced and then you have some Black students, and you have some White students, and you have some Afrikaans students, and obviously their, you know, so all their Englishes are different, even if it is subconsciously, and sometimes you might be able to tell that that's someone speaking English, it's Sotho English, it's not just that it's Black English. Do you start, do you think that you start making, sort of, gaining a perception of who's the brighter one and who isn't, when you just hear a little bit of their language from here and there? You know, the first day or two before you've seen their work properly. Or, do you think you'd just view them all as the same, until you start seeing their work? And hearing the questions they have to ask?
P6: No, you know, it's fine. Listening to them, it's fine, whatever English they speak, it really doesn't matter to me. When I talk to them, and they respond, and I ask questions and they ask, they answer or they ask questions then I can get, "OK, this one is bright, this one is not, OK I need to work a little bit harder on that one. The accent, how they speak, it really doesn't matter.
P5: Cos, I think also, we have this 1 fellow student here, and when he, she answers, when she answers in our studies lectures, cos, like when she's behind, she's speaking, you can't tell, well, this person is Black. Unless you look at her and you'll see, she's Black. Because of the way, like she tries to speak in one breath, you know.
(…)
R1: One of the things I've picked up from all of you, and from the one I did last week, is really not liking people who are making an effort to be someone they aren't. To try and get {P6: to a point} ah, I must speak that English, I must be ladida.
P5: Mmm, we don't like them, *mina* (me) I don't like them.
P6: I understand when, when you like, you can't help it, it's, but how can you not help it if you Black, you have Black family, but I understand it happens, you know, unconsciously you do it and, but when you try too hard, to be something you're not, that's where…./
P5: That's the problem, cos I remember, when she speaks, we would laugh, like make fun, funny remarks about her.
R1: What if she tried to sound like an Indian?
P6: She wouldn't.
P5: Like, Indian?
R1: What do you think of how Indians sound when they speak English?

363 P5: Um, I don’t know how they sound. I can’t say.
364 (…)
365 R1: Guys, can I just ask you to fill in a form quickly.

APPENDIX 3C
Focus Group 3
15 October 2009

R1: Um, I'm going to play four reco, radio recordings now, the quality isn't great, um I'll play them each 2 or 3 times.
[Pause]
Ok, this is the first one.
(…)
[Appendix 2A played]
(…)
[Appendix 2A repeated]
(…)
[Appendix 2B played]
(…)
[Appendix 2B repeated]
(…)
[Appendix 2C played]
(…)
[Appendix 2C played repeated]
(…)
R1: All right, can I go for the last one?
A participant: Mmhmm.
[Appendix 2D played]
(…)
[Appendix 2D repeated]
R1: I'm going to ask you questions about it now but.…
[Everyone laughs.]
R1: Um [Pause] What's Standard English?
[Pause]
P5: What is Standard English?
R1. Ja, how do you define Standard English?
(…)
So, of these four, who would, who do you think would be a speaker of Standard English?
?: The first one.
[Agreement from a few other participants]
R1: So that's to everyone … Ok, um why?
P3: Because the terms he used were professional {R1: Mmm.} and um understand, you know, understandable and he was speaking to somebody, I'm assuming on a radio show, and um…
R1: Ja, on 702.
P3: Ok, and um it was ja, like you said it's used in the media and I think it was, it could have been used by somebody in the media as well as somebody of every day, so.
R1: So someone who speaks like that could they sort of deliver the news?
P3: Um, I don't think so but I think if he was speaking on the topic that he's a professional in the news, {R1: Ja} he could speak in the media about it.

R1: Ok. [Pause] And do you think that makes him the most educated?
[All indicate no]
R1: Ok. Do you think that English within South Africa, is it of equal value as the other 10 languages?
P2, P3, P4, P5: No.
R1: What do you think?
P3: I think it's sort of the higher [met with group agreement] it's seen as more valuable than.
P4: Ja, more valuable.
P1: Ja, I would say it is.
R1: So, we, so we all think English is viewed, what would you say as more valuable?
P5: Definitely more valuable.
P2: More valuable.
R1: Um any other adjectives?
P4: Superior.
R1: Superior.
P3: I think more commonly used.
P4: More useful.
P3: Ja.
(…)
P1: It is associated with um having more benefits.
R1: And what, and what sort of English is that? Is it, I mean, we heard four people now all speaking English um but sounding very different. Is there, is there one of those that's going to sound better in business?
[2 participants indicate yes]
R1: And which one was that?
Unclear: The first one.
[Other participants agree]
R1: And why do you think that is?
P4: Because people make judgments of how you articulate your words and how um and what words you use during a speech, so with those judgments, people will make decisions about your, your character, whether you trustworthy, whether you're somebody they want to be involved with or not. I mean, you don't necessarily do it purposefully but it does happen. {Mmm} You make judgments on people the way they're talking.
R1 So, if you were to go into a job interview, would you try and talk in a specific way?
3 participants say yes.
R1: And how would that be? I mean, would you modify your speech as it is now?
P3: Definitely, I don't think you'd use as much um slang or as many South Africanisms. I think you'd refer to the Standard English uh British English, Standard British English. And do you think that [Pause], what about in the classroom? {Mmm}
R1: As a teacher, must you speak in a specific variety?
(…)
P5: Yes.
P4: Yes.
P3: I think it depends on the situation.
P2: It depends on your phase as well.

R1: On your?
P2: On your phase cause like P4 and I are foundation phase {P4: Ja} so we speak like in much simpler terms to the, the younger kids then say someone who's teaching high school would.
P1: But I think, in the classroom we do want to model what type of English, sounds wrong even as I'm saying it. You do want, you do want them to be exposed to a type of English that indicates intelligence or a knowledge of the field and so getting them to use certain terms and speak in a certain way.
(…)
P4: And I know that I have for kids um that don't say, pronounce words properly and I will correct them even though {Mmm} that I do understand what they're saying I do, as a foundation phase teacher, I do correct them because I don't want them to go and speak to somebody else and then think that, that that teacher has obviously not figured out that, that, this child is pronouncing a word incorrectly or not speaking properly.
R1 And do you think that benefits the child in the long run?
P4: Yes.
[Others say yes and offer expressions of confirmation.]
[Pause]
R1: In what way?
P4: Um in people's judgments about them in business and in social situations and in family situations, they speak, if you speak well, people immediately assume that you are well educated, you come from a good home.
(…)
R1: And that comes with when you're doing TEFL or something, it's an additional language for them. So, you're saying that perhaps, you know, the meaning what's important. But we know that in this country, what is the LoLT in most classrooms?
P2-P5: English.
R1: English. What is the language of most people in the classroom, of the learners?
[A few people say Zulu.]
P1: Or well African …
R1: Zulu, Sotho, Pedi, everything, so they then are not speaking their mother tongue. {Yeah} Are they going to, do you know the term 'mother tongue interference'? There's a lot of/
(…)
RS1: (…) but there's a lot of um work on how what language you speak, how your first language interferes with your second language in terms of accent, in terms of words, um so I might say 'come with I' if I'm Afrikaans, and could you tell what the third speaker was, what his first language was?
?: [Virtually inaudible] No.
P3: Hang on now, he sounded Afrikaans.
P4: Oh yeah, yes, he was Afrikaans.
R1: Ja.
P4: Yes.
R1: So now, it's quite difficult for him then to sound like we think is the best way (…) and when you go to a school in Soweto, wh, how's there, why, how's the teacher

speaking? Any teacher, not just the English teacher, the Grade 2 teacher or the geography teacher or anything.
P4: With an accent.
(…)
R1: So, wh, who on this campus, as the students, speaks the English that's going to get them the furtherest? What sort of English is that?
P3: In, well the people who have been exposed to English as a home {Ja} {Definitely} lan, at home language level.
R1: And if you are, you speaking an Indian variety or you speaking a, should we say a variety spoken by White people, those are both mother tongue, are they going to take you equally?
P3: No.
(…)
R1: But if you and, if you go into an interview and you've got everything on your C.V. exactly the same as he's got on his C.V., um taking away affirmative action, {P3: Ok} who's more likely to come out with the job?
P4: I think it also depends on your interviewers because um you, you could, I could speak like I'm speaking now and if my interviewers were second language English speakers, they might think that I'm quite um, hoity toity and I think I'm better than them because of the way that I'm speaking. So, that could also in, influence it if they maybe are second language English speakers and you're a second language English speaker maybe they could identify more with the way you talking and the way that they talk.
R1: So basically, everybody in South Africa is judging everybody else on how they speak?
[All say yes.]
R1: And is there anything that you can do in your classroom, when you in class, are you looking at this, you know, the learners based on how they sound? I mean, at a foundation phase level, it might be slightly different because, you know, their language is much more simplistic but, you think it affects you?
P4: Yes.
P1: Yes, well I would say that at an FET phase you constantly trying to get them to convey their ideas in a better way and that would, I think, mean giving them more words and giving them more of a traditional Standard English structure in order to convey those ideas.
(…)
R1: And do you, do you make an effort for it not to affect you?
P3: What not to get like [unclear]?
R1: Cause you go in and think, oh she's speaking English just the way I like but he, he doesn't sound so great. Obviously she's cleverer.
P3: Mmm, I don't think so, I think {Mmm} we're not supposed to make those judgments so I don't think we do as teachers, I just think we try and help and, you know.
R1: Um [Pause] do you think that people look at you based on how you speak?
[3 female participants say yes.]
P1: Definitely.
(…)

R1: Um so within sort of White in like English speaking Whites, we've got differences. How about the Indians?
[Everyone laughs.]
P1: Um well, I think it translates in very similar way and especially from, from my experience is that I, I, I, I feel uncomfortable going to pla, to very Indian areas like Durban, Fordsburg, Lenasia because um because I don, I don't have the same accent.
R1: Where did you grow up?
P1: In Johannesburg.
R1: So not in an Indian area?
P1: No.
P1: And you didn't go to an Indian school? [P1 shakes his head.]
R1: And then do you think that when someone speaks, so if someone speaks and they from Lenasia, can you def, generally hear?
P1: Generally we can.
R1: Ok. And then if someone speaks and they from Durban um do you look at them the same way or do you make assumptions?
P1: Uh, <u>definitely</u> [said with much certainty].
[Everyone laughs]
R1: Well, we know you honest.
P1: Um, yeah um it's, it's, for instance like um with, with my family in Durban, (…) um we've had such different experiences especially with things like language.
(…)
R1: So we've sort of covered it but when learners are speaking different varieties in the classroom, can that sort of inhibit the teaching process as well as the learning process? I think, I mean, can it make it harder {Yes} for you when you're teaching?
P4: Especially in the foundation phase because we do phonics and when, when we teach phonics, if they have, are speaking English in an a, with a different accent um that affects their phonics learning a lot.
(…)
R1: And at a sort of an FET level?
P1: Um well, I think that it still has its difficulties but you can get away with letting learners speak in a, in a more natural, their own way of speaking because in FET, I would say, that we focus more on content, so even if they're not necessarily pronouncing the words correctly, can they still present a good argument.
(…)
R1: Guys, we're running out of time, but can I ask you one question please? So, everyone here is obviously got a lot of knowledge about English, teaching English and all. When the kids are like the learners are in a different class, say Science or whatever, Geography, is it as important, must those teachers also correct the whole time?
[3 participants say yes.]
(…)
P1: Um no I, I think, [Pause] I think that in terms of uh English being the medium of instruction, then they must not ignore that um any English blunders that happen within a, within their classroom. But, in the, in the same breath, the lang, the English used within a geography context is somewhat different and I think Geography teachers or teachers of

other learner, teachers of other learning areas need to re uh remember that the lang, that they are language teachers within their own contexts.
(…)
P1: Uh teachers in other learning areas can use their understanding of English and how English is taught to develop the languages or the type of English being used in their own classrooms.
R1: So, (…) if you're teaching Geography and you get a bunch of presentations and then the next day you go and get a bunch of presentations for English, are you going to mark them down more in English for their language?
P5: Yes, because Geography is more on the, the concepts. Obviously if I told them that the assignment I would be looking at language and there's like 10 marks or whatever allocated to it but I would make a point of still correcting, in their Geography assignments, incorrect spelling or grammar because that would help in their English because if they gonna make that kind of mistake in Geography, they gonna do the same in English.
R1: So your concepts you're going to, you going to look more at those concepts {Mmm} and things in Geography or Science or whatever? You not the [unclear].
[Some people laugh.]
P4: I think, no, I, I do think so, I think that uh as a teacher, you've got to make sure that you specifically know what your outcomes for that lesson are. (…) As a teacher if they standing in front of all the learners, correct their English the whole time {Mmm} because that would make them um shy and less likely to at, at a future, in the future actually say anything in front of the class. So, I think you, as a teacher, you've got to be sensitive to what situations are appropriate and well what situations are not.
(…)
R1: So in an oral, will you um still, well language is till important though and if you um I don't know I'm not a teacher, will you also sort of assign 5 marks out of the 40 in oral to the language?
Everyone says yes.
R1: Ja, but now do you think [Pause] that actually it's not gonna affect you in all ways in all ways {P4: I see what you're saying.} if you don't know how …
P4: I see what you're saying that, that if that five per cent is all you allocating to that, do you mean that there is no ways that language would affect any other assessment that you're {Ja.} giving. I think that it still does.
R1: It does affect?
P4: It still does.
P2: Ja, it does.
(…)
R1: I don't know if anyone has anything else that they want to say or whatever. Please help yourself before you go. Thank you very much.

APPENDIX 4 LETTERS OF CONSENT
APPENDIX 4A
Consent form: participation

I agree to participate in an interview with Claire Biesman-Simons on a voluntary basis. In this interview, varieties of English in South Africa will be discussed. Pseudonyms will be used in the writing up of the interview so that my confidentiality will be protected. If at any stage I wish to withdraw, no pressure will be placed on me to remain part of the research.

Date:

Signed :

APPENDIX 4B
Consent form: audio-recording

I acknowledge that Claire Biesman-Simons will be audio-recording the interview I will be participating in, in which varieties of English will be discussed. I grant her permission to do so.

Date:

Signed: