

https://dspace.org/

Influence of the world bank on ANC teacher policies from 1990 to 1997

Siluma, Ephraim

2014-04-03
http://hdl.handle.net10539/14481

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

RESEARCH

REPORT

NAME OF STUDENT	**: EPHRAIM SILUMA**
SUPERVISOR	**: Dr. L. CHISHOLM**
DEGREE	**: M. Ed. (Policy)**
Year	**: 1998/1999**

TOPIC:

Influence of the World Bank on ANC Teacher Policies from 1990 to 1997

This dissertation has been submitted in partial fulfillment of the degree of Master of Education at the University of the Witwatersrand

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Pages
1.	**Declaration**	**iv**
2.	**Acknowledgements**	**v**
3.	**Abbreviations**	**vi**
4.	**Abstract**	**vii - viii**

Chapter One: Introduction and Literature Review

1.	**Introduction**	1-2
1.1	**Aims and Rationale**	2-3
1.2	**Scope, Assumptions and Limitations**	4
1.3	**Literature Review**	**4-21**
1.3.1	Influence of World Bank on Policies in Developing Countries.	5-13
1.3.2	Globalisation and its impact on policies.	14-18
1.3.3	ANC Policy shift and activities of the World Bank in South Africa.	18-21
1.4	**Research Design and Methodology**	**21-30**
1.4.1	Literature Review	22-25
1.4.2	Interviews	25-30

Chapter Two: Teacher Policy Perspectives: Analysis of Policy Documents

2.1 World Bank Perspectives	31-38
2.2 EDUPOL Perspectives	38-44
2.3 ANC Perspectives	44-54

Chapter Three: Perceptions on Influence: Analysis of Interviews 55-72

Chapter Four: Conclusion 73-76

5. References 77-81

6. Appendices 82-90

DECLARATION

I, **EPHRAIM MOTLOKWA SILUMA,** declare that this dissertation is my own work submitted in partial fulfillment of the degree of Master of Education at the University of the Witwatersrand. I further declare that this dissertation has never been submitted at any other university or institution for any purpose, academic or otherwise

Ephraim Motlokwa Siluma



04/05/2000

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My special thanks to Dr. Linda Chisholm, for her patience and willingness to guide me through this long and tiring journey that required enormous mental and physical stamina. I thank Mphela Motimele and Carol Clark, who are librarians at Wits Education Policy Unit and Centre for Education Policy Development (CEPD) respectively. I thank my mother Sarah Siluma, my brother Andries Siluma and my colleague and friend, Lindiwe Dlamini for their unequalled support to see me through this mammoth task.

ABBREVIATIONS

ANC	- African National Congress
CEPD	- Centre for Education Policy Development
COSATU	- Congress of South African Trade Unions
EDUPOL	- Education Policy Unit of the National Business Initiative (formerly, Urban Foundation)
EPUs	- Education Policy Units based in universities
FAL	- Final Acts of Lagos
IMF	- International Monitory Fund
INSET	- In -service Education and Training
IPET	- Implementation Plan for Education and Training
LPA	- Lagos Plan of Action
MDM	- Mass Democratic Movement
NBI	- National Business Initiative
NEPI	- National Education Policy Initiative
NECC	- National Education Coordinating Committee
NGOs	- Non-Governmental Organisations
NUMSA	- National Union of Metalworkers of South Africa
PRESET	- Pre-service Education and Training
SAP	- Structural Adjustment Programme
PTR	- Pupil Teacher Ratio
VSP	- Voluntary Severance Packages

Abstract

This study had intended to track process of teacher policy development within the ANC with the purpose of identifying influences of the World Bank and EDUPOL and to understand strategies used by these two organisations in influencing ANC's teacher policies. The study was based on two assumptions. Firstly, that the World Bank and EDUPOL were more influential on ANC teacher policies than other organisations. Secondly, that EDUPOL consciously mediated World Bank policies through to the ANC.

Data for this study was collected mainly through a detailed analysis of education policy documents of the three organisations with the purpose of identifying similarities and differences. Interviews were also conducted with key informants from these organisations. The study managed to show that the processes of ANC teacher policy development were very complex and that they involved more policy actors than just the World Bank and EDUPOL. The study further showed that the similarities between teacher policies of the three organisations do not imply influence. Attempts to understand and explain these similarities need to take cogniscance of broader issues of globalisation rather than to see them as influences of one particular organisation, especially because the key informants denied that there had been any external influence, particularly from the World Bank, on ANC teacher policies.

The study is divided into four chapters. The first chapter gives a detailed background to the study, a comprehensive literature review and also outlines the research methodology. Chapter Two draws largely from teacher policy documents of the World Bank, EDUPOL and the ANC. It presents policy perspectives of each of these organisations. In this chapter, a number of similarities and differences between teacher policies of these three organisations have been identified and discussed. Chapter Three draws from interviews with key informants from EDUPOL and ANC. It presents and discusses their perceptions on whether there has been influence from the World Bank and EDUPOL on ANC teacher policies. Chapter Four draws a conclusion. It shows that a number of factors need to be taken into consideration before conclusions are drawn about influence of the World Bank on ANC policy. It also points briefly to the role played by other local policy agents in borrowing policies from other countries and ensuring that those policies became some of the underlying principles of the ANC's education policies.

CHAPTER ONE

Background and Literature Review

Introduction

Prior to 1994, the ANC had a warm relationship with progressive teacher organisations such as the South African Democratic Teachers Union (SADTU) in their common struggle against the apartheid government. The ANC was vociferously in support of teacher strikes as they demanded better working conditions. As a result, when the ANC- led government of National Unity (GNU) took office in 1994, it was expected that tranquility would prevail in various sectors including education and that the culture of teaching and learning would be reinstated in schools. This has, however, not been forthcoming. Since 1996, the teaching profession and teachers, in particular, have been surrounded by uncertainties and problems of job security resulting from the government move to redistribute teachers and retrench some in the process.

The 1995 National Teachers Education Audit, which is elaborated upon in Chapter Two of this report, revealed that South Africa had about 341 000 teachers in public primary and secondary schools. The audit found that the overall pupil: teacher ratio was 43:1, which is considered acceptable by international standards. However, the audit also revealed that there was a maldistribution of teachers across racial groups and urban and rural areas. While provinces like Gauteng and Western Cape had a surplus of teachers provinces such as Kwa-Zulu Natal and Eastern Cape had a deficit

(Department of Education, March 1997). In order to ensure a more equitable distribution of teachers, the government embarked on the process of redeploying teachers to areas where there was shortage. This process resulted in numerous teacher strikes and confrontations between government officials and teacher unions.

While it could be argued that policies of the GNU are not necessarily policies of the ANC, the fact remains that the ANC enjoys majority seats in parliament. It is for this reason that many policies, for example the right of women to abort unwanted pregnancy, that were not supported by other parties, have been passed into law. A number of questions may be asked against this background. What has been the ANC's policy position on teachers? Who else has been involved in teacher policy development and to what extent have their policies influenced the ANC's policy?

1.1 Aims and Rationale of the study

The aim of this study was to investigate and analyse processes by which social actors and interest groups, both internal and external, may have influenced and sought to shape the ANC's teacher policy. The study focused on the role of the World Bank and the strategies that it adopted between 1990 and 1994 and between 1994 and 1997 in its endeavor to influence and shape ANC teacher policy. It further investigated the role of internal actors, active in developing teacher policy, and influential in ANC policy circles. In particular, the study examined the role and influence of EDUPOL, in

mediating World Bank policies thus influencing ANC policy. Specifically the study aimed to:

- Track the process of ANC teacher policy development, including their shift from initial policies.
- track the relationship between ANC, World Bank and EDUPOL.
- examine the role that both the World Bank and EDUPOL may have played in shaping ANC teacher policies perhaps causing the shifts.

The rationale for this study derives from an understanding that the World Bank has been influential in policy development and implementation in many developing and so-called third world countries. However most studies on the World Bank's involvement in Africa and particularly South Africa, do not focus on the processes of such influence and the different strategies adopted by the World Bank to influence policies. The study also intended to help those interested in policy making and policy studies to understand the dynamics of the relationship between the World Bank and the ANC and other local policy actors such as EDUPOL in South Africa. It will further help them to understand how local actors mediated external policies to influence ANC teacher policy. Furthermore, it will remind policy makers to always reflect critically on their policies.

1.2 Scope, Assumptions and Limitation

Many local and international organisations, including Education Policy Units (EPUs) based at local universities may have played different yet extremely important roles in shaping the ANC's education policies in general and teacher policies in particular. This study only focused on the role played by the World Bank and EDUPOL in the processes. The choice of these two organisations was based on an assumption that the two organisations were more influential than others and that they embarked on conscious processes and strategies to influence ANC teacher policies. Focusing on these two organisations may be considered the major limitation of this study.

1.3 Literature Review

This study was supposed to have been informed by literature drawn from research on the influence of the World Bank on ANC teacher policies. However, there is no literature dealing specifically with this issue. As a result, the study drew from two issues in the literature: firstly, the influence of World Bank and IMF on policies in developing countries in Africa. Secondly, it drew from literature focusing on the activities of the World Bank in South Africa, their influence on educational policies in South Africa and the ANC policy shift between 1990 and 1997. The first section highlights approaches which analyse the importance of understanding the relationship between international and local forces in explaining social change. The second looks at the South African literature in this context.

It is also necessary to develop in the process a theoretical understanding of how international agencies can influence local policies. It seems that one of three main approaches can be adopted: (i) a conspiracy theory (ii) dependency theory (iii) political economy. Whereas the first two will conceptualise the impact and influence in terms of one side (in this case World Bank) being completely active, and the latter (in this case local policy think tanks) passive, the last will insist on examining the interaction between international and local social forces.

The work by Stephen J. Ball (1990) and others has alerted us to how policies can be reshaped or mediated at local level by different influences. This study has been informed by the latter approach, and argues that the influence of World Bank has been indirect and through the internal agencies such as EDUPOL and the ANC accepting this policy. In order to avoid seeing this as a conspiracy, it will be necessary to explore and understand why it was acceptable to them. This will make the concept of globalisation important.

1.4.1 Influence of World Bank on Policies in Developing Countries.

There is a general agreement among analysts and critics of World Bank policies and activities in Africa that due to its powerful financial position, the World Bank has, since its first education lending in 1963, developed into the largest supplier of finance to education in most developing countries (Jones, 1992; Breslin, 1992; Lauglo, 1996). However, some studies, particularly work by Adedeji, show that policy development

has not been a one way process in which African countries have been passive recipients (Adedeji, 1995).

Financial assistance has been one of the ways that the World Bank and IMF have used to impose their polices on developing countries. Many countries seeking financial assistance from the two institutions have had to implement the recommended Structural Adjustment Programmes in the 1980s, which among other conditionalities have forced the governments in the borrowing countries to cut public expenditure. Cuts on public expenditure means reducing even money allocated for education.

This has impacted negatively on the quality of education because in order to reduce expenditure on teacher salaries, some teachers have to be retrenched while others have been expected to teach more grades and bigger classes. Cuts on expenditure have also resulted in a lack of basic teaching aids and resources to develop teachers. As a result, teaching has in many developing countries deteriorated into an undesirable profession, in part, because teachers are demoralized (Graham-Brown, 1991).

It should be noted that it is not only countries seeking financial assistance from the World Bank which have had to introduce Structural Adjustment Programmes. It seems to be a growing global trend to reduce governmental expenditure. According to Jones (1992), the IMF and the World Bank are responsible for encouraging

governments to cut expenditure. Such encouragement and influence has been facilitated by research undertaken by the World Bank. Developing countries have had to rely on the World Bank's findings and recommendations because they do not have enough money to conduct their own research (Lauglo, 1992; Jones, 1992; UNESCO Working Group on Education, 1996). The World Bank has thus been able to produce research based policy documents and scatter them around with the purpose of influencing policy decisions even in countries which are not borrowers (Jones, 1992).

In his article titled, 'Intellectual/ Financial Complex of Foreign Aid', Samoff (1992) expresses serious reservations on the conjunction of funding and research as it is done by external donors. While he acknowledges the fact that research does inform policy, he sounds concerned that it has come to dominate policy making to an extent that policy proposals which are not informed by research lose credibility.

Such reliance on research has given agencies with financial resources and professional staff, such as the World Bank, power over poor African governments. Samoff (1992) is particularly very critical of funding agencies. He argues that these agencies sometimes commission, undertake and manage research on education and development while excluding local people and this does not help in the development of local capacity (Samoff, 1992).

According to Samoff (1992) and Mistry (1989) the World Bank in particular has not only been relying on its ability to finance projects and its research to articulate its

views in its endeavor to influence and shape policies. Rather, it also relies on its ability to offer technical advice (Samoff, 1992; Mistry, 1989). The World Bank's research capacity and its ability to provide advice has in many instances given the World Bank an edge over governments in developing countries.

While some of the researchers, analysts and critics of the World Bank 's activities and policies in Africa seem to be seeing the interaction between the World Bank and African countries as a one way process in which African countries are passive recipients of cut and dried policies, Adedeji (1995) brings in another dimension which argues that African countries have been actively involved in developing policies which they perceived as good for them. Adedeji also starts by acknowledging that African countries are experiencing serious problems of debt and debt servicing burdens, crumbling infrastructure, deteriorating basic social services such as education, health and housing, declining living standards etc. He emphasises the fact that both external and internal factors are to blame for these problems.

Adedeji maintains that Africans have not been passive recipients of Structural Adjustment Polices imposed by organisations such as the World Bank. According to Adedeji (1995), in 1980 African countries came up with the Lagos Plan of Action (LPA) and the Final Act of Lagos (FAL). These proposed restructuring and transformation of African economies and the realisation of long term objectives of self- reliance and self sustained development. These proposals were however not put into practice because external donors refused to support these initiatives. Instead, the

donors introduced their own Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) which they wanted African countries to adopt if they were to get financial assistance.

Adedeji (1995) further points out that in 1989, the African ministers of finance adopted the African Alternative Framework to Structural Adjustment Programmes for Socio-Economic Recovery (AAF SAP) (Adedeji, 1995). The AFF SAP, unlike SAPs, were not imposed on governments. They allowed individual national governments to design their own national adjustments. Such African initiatives needed external support to succeed. This confirms that there has been interaction between the World Bank /IMF and African countries. There has been contestation in terms of whose policies were to be implemented.

The World Bank has not only been influential in economic policies in developing countries but also in helping to shape educational policies. It has supported education by providing financial resources, technical assistance and policy advice to developing countries. This was mainly because the World Bank and other external agencies have recognised the improvement of quality education as an important objective of investment in education and that quality education can lead to economic development (Haddad, 1985; Verspoor and Leno, 1986 and Verspoor, 1991).

In his review of the World Bank's experience in teacher training, Haddad (1985) asserts that the World Bank's Education Policy papers of 1971, 1974 and 1980 aroused its view of teacher training as a significant strategy towards improving the

quality of education. These papers indicated that as a result of rapid enrolments, particularly in Africa, there was a shortage of trained teachers, a need for quality education and cost effective shorter PRESET supported by intensive INSET. On the basis of such policy research, the World Bank adopted a policy to finance teacher training programmes with the objective of training more teachers to reduce the number of unqualified teachers and to localise teacher training and raise the proportion of female teacher training output.

Verspoor and Leno (1986) also confirm Haddad's (1985) argument that the World Bank has for a very long time perceived teachers as a crucial factor for the provision of quality education. To this effect, teacher training became the second major element of quality improvement strategies in World Bank educational projects. In their review of the World Bank's involvement in teacher training, Verspoor and Leno (1996) found that In-service teacher training was seen as a significant element of educational change. In the 21 World Bank supported educational change project case studies, In-services teacher training accounted for 21 percent of project costs allocated for teacher training. In particular the World Bank supported projects for training teachers in Ethopia, Bangladesh, Egypt, Senegal and Thailand. The study helped Verspoor and Leno to come up with four elements that stood out as features of a successful teacher training component. They recommended that these components are so important that governments and international donor agencies should take heed of them in their endeavor to improve teaching in their countries or in developing countries. (Verspoor and Leno, 1986).

Firstly, there is need to provide permanent and locally available In-service teacher training. This may be based in schools or in local learning centers. Such INSET is convenient for teachers because it is easy to access. School and locally based INSET programmes are highly recommended by the World Bank because they are cost effective in comparison to PRESET. Such programmes may be particularly considered where lower secondary graduates have been recruited as assistant teachers and there is need to training them so that they become fully qualified teachers.

Secondly, there is a need to establish an effective system of supervision and support. In the World Bank supported projects reviewed by Verspoor and Leno (1986), it was evident that in the areas where teachers received regular and frequent visits from inspectors, supervisors etc, the greater the opportunity for successful implementation of projects. Thirdly, the content of INSET must be adjusted to the teachers' level of knowledge and experience. For example, if technology that can be used successfully in teaching science is more advanced than teachers' knowledge it is necessary that teachers should be trained gradually until they are able to use the equipment properly. Lastly, teacher motivation and commitment must be endorsed. The recommendation is that this should not only be sought through providing incentives such as salary increase or housing for teachers but through offering programmes that will also support the professional teacher training.

Verspoor and Leno's (1996) review of World Bank supported teacher training and development projects presents international agencies and governments with four

crucial teacher policy issues. Whether all these policy issues would be applicable in every country, particularly in South Africa, is debatable but this will be looked at later when a comparative analysis of World Bank policies and policies of the ANC in particular, is done.

It is clear that the World Bank has been actively involved in education in general and in teacher supply and development in particular. Nevertheless, it seems that some of the World Bank's most influential work came in the form of policy papers on; Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment, Revatilisation and Expansion (1988); Primary Education (1990) and Skills for Productivity: Policies for Vocational and Technical Education in Developing Countries (1990).

In its review of the impact of these policy papers on projects in developing countries, the Education and Employment Division of the World Bank found that there were many similarities between contents of the educational projects in most developing countries and the recommendations made in each of the above-mentioned World Bank policy papers. For example, the division picked up that there was a shift towards mobilisation of teaching resources, increased cost sharing, restoring academic standards, enhancing labour force training, encouraging pre-school programmes, providing more In-service training, reducing costs, balancing education and training, mobilising private training etc. All these are recommendations drawn from each of the said policy documents. According to the Division, the existence of several regional policy papers drawing largely from the three documents is evidence for their

impact and influence (Education and Employment Division, 1991: 42-43). The influence of these papers is probably enhanced by the fact that World Bank policy researchers made wide consultation, invited comments and feedback before each of the papers could be produced. Among those invited were African Ministers of Education. (Education and Employment Division, 1991: 23). Without undermining the findings of the Division, it is important that its findings are treated with suspicion because the fact that it is a division of the World Bank may have obscured its objectivity.

To this point a lot has been said about World Bank education policy recommendations and follow up projects in countries such as Burkino Faso, Senegal, Bangladesh, Pakistan and Egypt. Nevertheless, nothing is being said about South Africa. Whether the policy recommendations discussed above were of any influence in South Africa remains to be seen, as it is the subject of this article. In particular, as indicated above, the focus will be on examining whether World Bank policies have influenced ANC teacher policies and how such influence might have happened. The next section focuses on globalisation and the extent to which it has influence on policies. The section will help us understand whether influences on ANC policies may be defined narrowly as influences of certain individual organisations such as the World Bank, or as consequences of globalisation.

1.4.2 Globalisation and Policies.

It is clear that while the World Bank has played a significant role in shaping education policies in many developing countries in Africa, Africans have not been passive recipients. The influence of the World Bank and other international agencies on policies in developing countries and the move by such countries to accept those policies is complex. One way of looking at such interaction and how policies are formed and shaped, is through the process of globalisation.

The concept of globalisation involves growing interconnectedness among different nations. Such interconnectedness is facilitated by globalization of communications technology such as multimedia which bring prospects of the global information closer to people (Axford, 1997). In the process of globalisation, the autonomy of the modern state is seriously challenged as new forms of non-territorial politics and government are increasingly visible. As nation states are battling to retain some of their formal territorial autonomy and sovereignty, they have, as a result of globalisation, lost some of their capacity to make national policies independent (Dale, 1999).

These changes and the new and distinct forms of relationship between nation states and the world economy have also affected policy making in that it is given new dimensions by the appearance of global actors like transnational corporations and interest groups such as World Bank and IMF. These could involve stabilisation policies as advocated by IMF and the Structural Adjustment Programmes advocated

by the World Bank which have either been introduced as conditionalities for borrowing countries or have been adopted voluntarily either directly or indirectly by other countries.

It is interesting to note that the same features of SAPs (such as fiscal discipline, public expenditure priorities, tax reform, financial liberalisation, exchange rates, trade liberalisation, foreign direct investment, privatisation, deregulation etc.) are referred to by Dale as "common ideology" to respond to problems posed to rich countries by globalisation. At the same time these features inform the directions in which national policy decision-making are to be shaped. In South Africa for example, the ANC-led GNU has adopted GEAR, which advocates the above features as a national economic policy.

This suggests that the new dimensions that have been introduced by global actors such as the World Bank, particularly after the collapse of the Soviet bloc in the late 1980s, have to a greater extent influenced the economic policies of the ANC and those of the Government of National Unity. One could easily criticise issues addressed in this paper, as focussing much on economic rather than education policy which is the subject of this paper. It has to be understood that the external effects on national policies do not announce themselves as concerned with national education policy (Dale, 1999: 8). This means that it should not be assumed that for an external factor to have an effect on an education system it has to be directed towards the education sector or even to an educational organisation. Economic policies have a

serious influence on educational issues. As Dale indicates, the clearest effect of globalisation on education policy come from the consequences of states' reorganisation of their priorities to make them more competitive to attract transnational corporations. Such reorganisation of priorities led to the adoption of some of the features of "common ideology" (Dale, 1999: 4) such as fiscal discipline and cutting government public expenditure. These have had serious effects on education.

Dale further identifies and draws a comprehensive comparison between policy transfer through globalisation and policy transfer through traditional or orthodox mechanisms. The orthodox policy transfer mechanisms are characterised by borrowing and policy learning. Borrowing, in particular, involves certain policies that a country seeks to imitate, emulate or copy bilaterally from another. Policy learning also involves processes through which policy developers from a particular country would visit other countries, consciously use material or consult policy developers in another country to learn about various policies in that country for purposes of using those policies in their own countries. Both borrowing and policy learning mechanisms are carried out voluntarily and explicitly and their locus of viability is national. Both borrowing and policy learning are the result of conscious decision and mainly initiated by the recipient. Hence, the nature of their influence on policy is direct.

On the contrary globalisation which is facilitated mainly by supranational organisations involves more complex mechanisms of policy transfer. These include

(1) harmonisation- in which the national policy making capacity of member states converge at a regional organisation such as the European Union, which operates through mechanisms of collective agreement (2) Dissemination – which relates to supranational organisations such as UNESCO, OECD, World Bank etc. Most of the policy documents produced by such supranational organisations try to indicate to member states future policy direction as we will see later when we will be analysing policy documents of the World Bank on education which focus on teachers. (3) The idea of Standardisation- an example given here is that of curricula showing signs of being common across the world. Such common features are brought about by the international organisations such as UN or World Bank, which assume adherence to particular broad policy principles. (4) Instilling Interdependence- which is driven by issues of common interests which extend beyond nation states such as human rights and peace. (5) Imposition- which requires recipient countries to take particular policies and does not rely on some form of learning, persuasion or cooperation to bring about its desired change.

In the section on, 'the influence of World Bank and IMF on policies in developing countries' we have seen that developing countries have not been passive recipients of policies imposed on them by the World Bank and other supranational organisations. With regard to globalisation, Dale also argues that external policies are likely to be differently interpreted and differently acted upon in different countries. Its effects are mediated in a complex way by existing national patterns and structures. (Dale, 1999:5)

Whether the ANC has been influenced directly or through local agencies, is the major question. It will be interesting to find out what the reasons are for this influence from the ANC's point of view. The next section examines ANC policy shift and activities of the World Bank in South Africa. The sections seeks to understand whether could the shift be attributed to activities and influence of the World Bank or to local policy agents.

1.4.3 The ANC's Policy shift and the activities of the World Bank in South Africa.

Literature reviewed in this section seems to be supporting Adedeji's position that internal policy developers have played a role in translating the World Bank's policies into the local context. Articles by Chisholm (1996 and 1997) and Samoff (1995) emphasize the significance of internal interest groups in policy making. However, their focus is not so much on processes by which the ANC teacher policy has been influenced. This will accordingly be the focus of this study.

In their paper titled 'Remember People's Education? Shifting Alliances, State Building on South Africa's Narrowing Policy Agenda', Chisholm and Fuller (1996) give a critical and comprehensive account of the extent to which the ANC led government has dropped some of the basic principles of People's Education as were advocated by the National Education Co-ordinating Committee (NECC) in the 1980s.

They argue that the earlier calls for people's education characterized by democratic participation in educational governance, equity, redress and the restoration of the culture of teaching and learning are gradually giving way to technocratic discourses characterized by centrally defined 'outcomes based education', equalizing pupils and balancing teacher pupil ratios. However, they do not directly link the new changes and narrowing of policy to the influence of the World Bank. Instead, they show how the narrowing of policies and the shift from policies that were central to the NECC and the democratic movements can be understood in terms of complex processes of negotiations between democratic movements and apartheid government.

Chisholm takes this argument further in the article 'Restructuring of South African Education and Training in Comparative Context' (1996). She argues that education reform must not only be placed in historical context but should also be placed in the broader international context. While she does not dwell on the processes by which policies get influenced, she has successfully identified aspects of international influence on the ANC and the government's education policies. These include moves to integrate formal and non formal education, perceptions of education as linked to economic growth (human capital theory), cost sharing in education financing, moves to cut government expenditure on education including redistributing and retrenching teachers to balance pupil: teacher ratios. Such moves are following the international trend that are mostly informed by the World Bank/IMF structural adjustment polices as imposed in other countries, UNESCO and international moves towards neo-liberal market oriented strategies for economic growth. Chisholm emphasizes however that

South African education developments do not mimic these developments but rather, both meaning and implementation is reshaped in terms of the South African context. This further confirms that local context cannot be overlooked. This study aimed to focus the debate on the relative influences and the relationship between international and local social actors by examining how the process occurred through a particular issue which is, Teacher Policy.

While Chisholm is broad in terms of focusing on the external and internal influence on the new education system in South Africa, Samoff (1995) focuses on the impact of Education Policy Units (EPUs). His paper is an evaluation of South African EPUs supported by Sweden. His paper shows that even without international organisation or donors such as World Bank, after the unbanning of the ANC in 1990, the period up to 1994 was characterized by internal contestations over education policy frameworks and concepts. These were contestations between democratic movements through the work of EPUs, the NECC's National Education Policy Initiative and the ANC initiated Centre for Education Policy Development (CEPD) on one hand and apartheid government initiated work on the other.

The contestations were informed and fueled by documents such as the 'Policy Framework for Education and Training' (1994) and the 'Implementation Plan for Education and Training' (IPET) (1994) produced by the ANC- led democratic movement and the 'Education Renewal Strategies and the Curriculum Model for Education in South Africa' (1992) produced by the apartheid government. Both

Chisholm and Samoff thus draw attention to the role of local players, and contestations between local players on policy. Again the contribution of this study will be to focus not on the EPU's, created by the NECC, but EDUPOL, created by business immediately after the unbanning of the political organisations in 1990.

In terms of South African literature reviewed, it is clear at this point that policy influence and formulation has not been a one way process in which South African policy developers have been passive as the World Bank influenced policies. However, this literature does not dwell on the process of such influence. According to Soobrayan (1993) the World Bank approved the sum of R1 billion for education lending in South Africa and engaged in studies to formulate strategies to address various educational problems of South Africa. Lending, research and technical assistance have been identified by people like Samoff (1992); Mistry (1989) and Soobrayan (1993), as some of the ways through which the World Bank gets its policies approved in Africa. This study has tried to explore how the World Bank tried to engage the ANC and development of its teacher policy in addition to the role and influence of EDUPOL. The next section outlines the method and data gathering techniques that were adopted for the study.

1.5 Research Design and Methodology.

The study used forms of historical and analytical research. Historical research is understood as being a past oriented form of research that seeks to illuminate a

question of current interest (Anderson, 1990; Borg, 1963; Fox, 1969). Anderson goes further to say that interest in historical research arises from personal interest which is often kindled by exposure to a particular event or issue. All these features of a historical study are evident in this study in that it is past oriented. I thought of researching the issues out of personal interest and after exposure to issues of how the World Bank has been influential in policies in developing countries.

As historical research, the study intended to find out the following: What had been the policy position of the ANC on teachers between 1990 and 1994? What informed that position? Who else was involved in teacher policy development? What was their position on the ANC teacher policy? How did they perceive their roles and how did they relate to the ANC? The study further intended to examine changes that occurred within ANC teacher policy from 1994 to 1997, why there were such changes and what was the role of the World Bank and the internal social forces, mainly EDUPOL in influencing and shaping that policy. The study relied on two data gathering techniques. These are literature analysis and interviews.

1.5.1 Literature Analysis.

As Anderson (1990) and Borg (1963) and other advocates of historical research would argue, quality historical research relies on primary data sources. Analysis of such primary sources should be accompanied by historical criticism in the form of (i) external criticism that seeks to establish the authenticity of the sources and (ii)

internal criticism that seeks to evaluate factors such as accuracy. In this study, such espoused historical criticism was not a priority but this does not mean that it was completely ignored. During interviews, with key informants from ANC and EDUPOL, the authenticity of the documents that were identified and their factual accuracy were checked and confirmed.

Since this study intended to explore the influence of the World Bank on ANC teacher policies with specific reference to teacher supply, utilization and development, there was need for a comprehensive analysis of teacher policies of World Bank, EDUPOL and ANC.

These three organisations were chosen for a number of reasons. Firstly, the ANC teacher policy and the process through which it was influenced, is the focus of this study. Secondly, the World Bank has been chosen because, as the literature review indicated, the World Bank played a major role in influencing economic and educational policies in developing countries. The aim of this study is to investigate if the World Bank did influence the ANC teacher policy. Thirdly, the EDUPOL has been chosen because of the role it played in developing teacher policies. The study will focus on how the three organisations interacted and the process by which the EDUPOL and the World Bank might have influenced ANC teacher policy.

The ANC policy could be identified through its major policy statements available in the Education Policy Unit and the Center for Education Policy Development libraries.

In particular important policy documents such as ANC' Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994) and Implementation Plan for Education and Training (1994) were identified. Some of the recent Department of Education annual reports and publications such as An Agenda of Possibilities: National Policy on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development (1997) were also obtained and analysed with the purpose of tracking ANC teacher policy shifts.

The World Bank's education policy documents were obtained from the World Bank's Resources Center in Pretoria. The Education Policy Unit at the University of the Witwatersrand (Wits EPU) and the Centre for Education Policy Development (CEPD) libraries also had some of the World Bank documents that I needed. In particular World Bank Reports on Education in Sub-Saharan Africa Priorities and Strategies for Education (1988), Primary Education: A World Bank Policy Paper (1990), South Africa: Education Sector Strategies and Policy Issues (1995), were identified.

EDUPOL teacher policy documents were obtained from the National Business Initiative (NBI) offices in Auckland Park, Johannesburg and other local libraries. In particular, the following documents were identified; 'Teacher Salaries in South Africa: A policy perspective (1993)'; 'EDUPOL Submission to the Implementation Plan for Education and Training' (1994).

In analyzing these documents, the intention was to compare and contrast policies and policy proposals as outlined in each. Obviously, an analysis of documents alone

would not be enough to tell who has influenced whom. In order to complement the analysis and to gather information regarding processes of influence, interviews were conducted.

1.5.1 Interviews

As indicated above, the focus of this study was not only to see if the World Bank has influenced the ANC teacher policies but also to examine the processes through which such influence might have happened. In my opinion, data relating to such processes could only be gathered through interviews. Subsequently, some people who were in the ANC's Department of Education in the early and mid- 1990s, were traced and interviewed. In particular the focus was on getting hold of those who participated and were instrumental in the formation of the ANC Education and Training Policies.

Attempts were made to extend interviews to the officials of the World Bank and to those who participated in teacher policy formulation in EDUPOL. It was hoped that through interviews, some information would be shared on the processes through which the World Bank either influenced or attempted to influence, as well as how their policies came to constitute ANC teacher policy.

Interviews were used within an understanding that when used with care and skill they are said to be an incomparable technique of data collection (Anderson, 1990; Borg, 1963; Knale, 1996; Cohen and Manion, 1980). The advantage of interviews is

attributed to the fact that they involve direct conversation between the interviewer and the respondent. They give the interviewer ample opportunity to clarify questions, to probe further and thus to collect more information than is possible if other techniques are used. The interviewer is also able to pick up non-verbal gestures such as facial expression and tone of voice.

Although interviews seem advantageous, they also have disadvantages which I fully acknowledge. Such disadvantages relate to the fact that fewer people can be reached than those who can be reached through for example, questionnaires. Interviews also have limited reliability. Some of the disadvantages of interviews include what Borg and Gall (1983: 438) call "Response Effect". This refers to the tendency of respondents to give inaccurate or incorrect responses. However, 'response effect' its not a disadvantage that exclusively occurs in interviews. It can happen in a questionnaire as well.

Weiss cited in Borg and Gall (1983) also discusses several potential sources of error in an interview. These relate firstly to the predispositions of the respondent in which the respondent is:

- Suspicious of or hostile to the research.
- Indifferent or not motivated to cooperate.
- Lacks information the interviewer is seeking.
- Wants to please the interviewer or be accepted by him.
- He wants to present himself in favourable terms.

In the predisposition of the interviewer (p.439), the interviewer is:

- Uncomfortable with the people she is interviewing.
- Is ill at ease with the environment in which she is working.
- Allows her own opinions to influence what she hears and/or records.
- Cannot establish rapport with respondents
- Has stereotyped expectations of what people are like and what they will say.

Being aware of such disadvantages and errors possible in interviews, I tried by all means to avoid such errors.

All the interviews conducted for this study were what Cohen and Manion (1980) call "less formal". Much as basic questions that guided the interviews had been drawn, the researcher was free to modify the questions and to probe further where there was need. Note taking and a tape recorder were used for recording the interview immediately. This was done mainly to avoid forgetting and misrepresenting the interviews.

The interviews conducted may also be viewed in terms of what Anderson (1990) calls "elite interviews". In these interviews, I was not interested in statistical analysis of large numbers of people who either agreed or disagreed. To particularly understand the processes through which influence might have happed, I decided to interview only those individuals who were instrumental in research and development of Education

and Training policies particularly for teachers in the three organisations that are being studied.

The study was based on the following questions.

(a) Did the ANC have any teacher policy prior to 1990?

(b) What was its position in that policy and what had informed that position?

(c) Did the ANC shift from its initial position in the period between 1994 and 1997? If yes why?

(d) Who persuaded it to shift and what were the strategies used?

(e) What role did the EDUPOL play in teacher policy development and how did it relate to the ANC?

(f) What role did the World Bank play in influencing the ANC policy? How did such influence occur?

Based on the above questions, specific questions were designed for officials of each of the organisations under study.

Interviews schedule

The following people were interviewed.

1. **John Samuel** – he was head of the ANC education desk in the early 1990s. Mr. Samuel is now working for the Kellogg Foundation and is based in Harare, Zimbabwe. He was interviewed telephonically on the 15 November 1998. As head of the education desk of the ANC in the early years of the period under study, Samuel was of particular significance for this study.

2. **John Pampallis** – he is the current director of the Centre for Education Policy Development, which is the education policy wing of the ANC. Pampallis was not particularly involved in development of teacher policies. However having been working within CEPD, his view on the interactions between World Bank, Edupol and ANC was going to be of significance. He was interviewed on the 23rd February 1999 at the CEPD, Braamfontein, Johannesburg.

3. **Trevor Coombe** – He succeeded John Samuel as director of the CEPD and is currently Deputy Director-General in the National Department of Education. Coombe was also very much involved in ANC policy development processes before the 1994 elections and even thereafter when he was appointed deputy director general. For this reason, he was also important for this study. He was interviewed in Pretoria on the 03rd March 1999.

4. **Jane Hofmeyr** – She was a senior researcher in the National Business Initiative (NBI)'s education policy wing (EDUPOL). Working within EDUPOL, Hofmeyr was working a lot in teacher policy development processes and was also invited by CEPD to participate in developing the Implementation Plan for Education and Training. Hofmeyr has since left EDUPOL and is presently the National Executive Director of the Independent Schools Association of Southern Africa. Due to her various

commitments we could not set up an interview. Rather, I faxed a set of questions to which she responded and faxed back.

5. **Peter Buckland** – he was also a senior researcher in the NBI's education policy wing (EDUPOL). He was also involved in EDUPOL's teacher policy development processes and was important for this study in terms of giving us the EDUPOL perspective on their role in the ANC teacher development processes. Buckland is now with United Nations (International) Children's Emergency Fund. He was interviewed telephonically from New York on 04 February 1999.

Attempts to find someone from the World Bank particularly Dr. Dzingai Mutumbuka, who apparently was working closely with the ANC in the early 1990s, proved fruitless. The next chapter provides a detailed analysis of education policy documents of the World Bank, EDUPOL and the ANC with the purpose of tracking similarities and differences in the policy positions of these organisations.

CHAPTER TWO

Teacher Policy Perspectives: An Analysis of Policy Documents

Teachers are generally considered as a crucial factor that must be strengthened in an endeavor to improve the quality of education. Many teacher policy issues and recommendations have been raised by different local and international policy think tanks. This chapter examines the teacher policy perspectives of the World Bank, Edupol and ANC with regard to Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development. The purpose is to find out if there are any similarities. We start by examining the teacher policy perspectives of the World Bank.

4.1 World Bank's Teacher Policy Perspectives

Work by Haddad (1985), Verspoor and Leno (1986), Education and Employment Division (1990) and Verspoor (1991) as elaborated upon in the literature review section, expounded extensively on the unquestionable devotion of the World Bank towards teacher training and development in developing countries such as Bangladesh, Senegal, Burkino Faso etc. However it has to be said that their papers are not necessarily policy positions of the World Bank. Rather, they were reviews of World Bank-supported projects focussing on teacher training and development.

For the purpose of this paper, the following World Bank Education Policy Papers were reviewed in order to examine their impact on teacher policies in South Africa but in particular on ANC teacher policies: Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies

for Revitalization and Expansion (1988) and Primary Education (1990). These two papers were chosen mainly because it appears that they are among the World Bank's most influential education policy papers. Other World Bank Policy documents such as Priorities and Strategies for Education: A World Bank Review (1995); South Africa: Education Sector Strategic Issues and Policy Options (1995) were also used in this study. It has to be stated that all these papers are not specifically Teacher Policies of the World Bank but they deal extensively with teacher issues and provide useful policy recommendations that were influential on teacher policies in various countries. This section explores World Bank policy recommendations with specific reference to teacher supply, utilisation and development. It starts of being looking at teacher supply.

Teacher Supply

In both policy papers: Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Revitalization and Expansion (1988) and Primary Education (1990), the World Bank does not dwell much on the issue of teacher recruitment and supply. Nevertheless, in Primary Education there is recommendation to increase the recruitment, training and supply of female teachers in schools because it has been found to be an effective way of increasing girls' school attendance (p.35). Initiatives in World Bank financed projects to overcome shortages of female teachers in Bangladesh, China, India, Nepal Pakistan and Yemen went as far as removing age restriction, recruiting and posting female teachers near their homes and building childcare centers near schools. (World Bank's

on paper on Priorities and Strategies for Education (1995, pp116-117). The recommendation for the recruitment of female teachers is linked to the one on need to recruit and supply teachers for rural areas where there is a general shortage. These two recommendations are based on observations that there are many girls of school going age who are not in schools, particularly in rural areas. The World Bank further suggest that incentives which may include provision of boarding facilities, increased training or even additional pay should be offered to encourage teachers to work in rural areas. Following policy recommendations on teacher supply, the World Bank goes on to make recommendations on how teachers should be utilised.

Teacher Utilisation

With regard to teacher utilisation the World Bank recommends that policy analysts and policy makers should think of ways in which teachers would be utilised such that costs will be reduced (Priorities and Strategies for Education, pp58-61; Primary Education, pp19). The World Bank's position is motivated by observation that teacher salaries consume up to 95 percent of budgetary allocation to education in most developing countries. Since it would not be possible for governments to literally reduce teacher salaries, the World Bank recommends that there should be ways to utilise teachers intensively so as to reduce salary costs per pupil. The suggested ways of increasing teachers work load include: Firstly, increasing the number of classes each taught per week or increase the number of weeks in the school year. Such an increase of time must be for teachers only. This can be done by way of introducing

double shift for teachers, meaning that schools will accommodate more pupils with one group attending in the morning and the other group coming in the afternoon. Secondly, increasing teacher-pupil ratio from the accepted 35:1. Lastly, introducing multi-grade teaching, which will mean that each teacher should teach in different levels. All these policy recommendations would be good strategies in terms of increasing teachers' work load and containing unit costs per pupil on teacher salaries because it means more pupils would be sharing on a teacher's salary Priorities and Strategies for Education, (1995, pp58-61).

Much as these would seem viable strategies and policy options, it is questionable whether they can be implemented in that they assume that teachers are very understanding. The World Bank seems to be assuming that when their workload is increased, teachers will not resist such initiatives or demand more money which will then defeat the intended goals. In particular in areas where there are large numbers of graduates and unemployed qualified teachers, these options do not offer any solution on how such people could be utilised. Silent as it is about the unemployed qualified teachers, the World Bank goes on to recommend that in countries that are bordered by unemployment, young graduates who have the love for teaching and would welcome reasonable downward adjustment in salaries should be considered for teaching purposes. This recommendation is itself based on an assumption that by virtue of having no advanced pedagogical knowledge such recruited young graduates will not demand more money.

The issue of teacher utilisation is not only linked to salaries but to teacher morale and motivation as well. From the World Bank perspective, today the teaching profession is characterised by low levels of commitment and morale (Comparative African Experiences in Implementing Educational Policies, 1990: pp52). They work in poor conditions, do not have opportunities for career advancement and lack supervision and school based support. In the policy paper on Primary Education a number of factors that need to be improved so as to boost teacher morale and motivation are outlined.

First, there is need to offer teachers competitive salaries because low salaries result in teachers engaging in other pursuits in order to supplement their income and this leads to absenteeism (pp24 – 25). This sounds contradictory in that in its paper: Education in Sub-Saharan Africa (p.46) the World Bank suggests that young graduates who would welcome reduced salaries should be recruited for teaching purposes. The second factor suggests that morale and motivation could be boosted if opportunity for career advancement for teachers could be established. This would allow older teachers to take responsibilities of guiding the new ones. The third factor is that of regular supervision and support for teachers, which is a controversial issue particularly in South Africa, as we will see later.

It is clear therefore that salaries are recognised by the World Bank as one of the factors that can boost teachers' morale and motivation. The World Bank also assumes that when given higher salaries, it may be easier for teachers to be utilised more

intensively. According to the World Bank's recommendation however, teacher salary structure should be rationalised such that it rewards characters of a teacher that are in short supply instead of rigid linking of salary progression to age, seniority and entry qualifications. In addition to recommendations made for teacher supply and utilisation discussed above, the Word Bank also makes a number of policy recommendations on how teachers should be developed. This is the area to which we turn our attention.

Teacher Development

Work by Haddad (1985), Verpoor (1986) and Verspoor and Leno (1991) clearly show that the World Bank has for a long time been involved in teacher development. It was actively supporting INSET programmes in countries like Egypt, Bangladesh, Senegal etc. From the work of the analysts quoted above and the World Bank's own policy papers, it is convincing that INSET is highly valued by the World Bank. In both policy papers: Education in Sub-Saharan Africa and Primary Education there are clear recommendations on the need to establish school or locally based INSET centres to assist teachers in their every day work.

INSET is particularly recommended by the World Bank because it is seen to be cost effective way of training teachers as compared to long residential PRESET courses that are regarded as expensive and unnecessary. Recommendations for shorter causes is made on the basis of World Bank experience in Burkino Faso, Nigeria, Tanzania and Zimbabwe where PRESET programmes have been shortened and emphasis is

more on correspondence education supported by radio and tutorials. One of the World Bank's recommended cost-effective ways of raising professional quality is by selective admission to the profession. This recommendation suggests that people who show interest in the profession and perform well in subject-related tests should be recruited for teaching purposes and be provided with intensive INSET with emphasis placed on subject competence.

In its paper: South Africa: Education Sector Strategic Issues and Policy Options (1995) the World Bank has adapted its policy recommendations on teachers in relation to the South African situation. This paper, which was produced in the light of major policy contestations in South Africa and was produced with the hope that it would contribute to the policy discussions, also emphasises the significance of teacher training as one of the basic factors that can help improve instructional quality. The paper recommends that firstly, pre-service teacher education in South Africa has to be strengthened particularly in areas of staff development, curriculum reform, pedagogical approaches and practical student teaching. These should be done in collaboration with university departments of education, NGOs and other interested policy analysts.

Some of the recommendations in the paper include the need for coordination in South African INSET institutions, the need for provinces to mobilise resources, to initiate, expand and improve school- or college- based INSET programmes, and the need for such INSET programmes to prioritise unqualified teachers teaching subjects such as

Maths, Science and English. The World Bank further states its support for South African policy analysts who suggest that pre-service and in-service teacher training should be planned as a continuum (p.22) (point drawn from ANCs', 1994, Implementation Plan for Education and Training. The World Bank further recommends that scarce resources must only support in-service training which is related to school based subjects or to the teachers' area of classroom responsibilities.

Having discussed the teacher policy recommendations of the World Bank, the next section will look at teacher policies of EDUPOL to examine their similarities or differences with those of the World Bank.

4.2 The EDUPOL Education Policy Perspectives

EDUPOL was established in 1991 by the then Urban Foundation now known as National Business Initiative (NBI). In their effort to develop education policies in areas in which they would make greater impact EDUPOL started off focussing on Early Childhood Education but they later focussed on Teacher Education because not a great deal of work had been done in this area (Buckland, 1999/02/04, Interview). EDUPOL produced a number of policy documents on teachers and according to Buckland, the unit's main target was the Education Department of the ANC and in particular the ANC's Implementation Plan for Education and Training (IPET).

In fact EDUPOL made a submission to the IPET. For purposes of this paper, EDUPOL's submission to IPET together with some of their documents such as: 'Restructuring Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development' (1992) and 'Teacher Salaries in South Africa: A Policy Perspective' (1993), were identified for analysis. The purpose was to examine if their policy perspectives bore any similarities with World Bank policy recommendations on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development. We start by examining EDUPOL's policy recommendations on teacher supply.

Teacher Supply

In their papers, EDUPOL start off by examining the situation with regard to teacher supply, utilisation and development prior to 1994 in South Africa. According to EDUPOL, much as the overall teacher: pupil ratio suggested that there were sufficient teachers for all learners, teachers were not evenly distributed among provinces, among urban and rural areas and among black and white schools. Generally there was under-supply of black teachers particularly in subjects such as Mathematics, Science and English. The rural areas were also oversupplied with un/under-qualified teachers. These problems of shortage of teachers in crucial subjects and in rural areas, as identified by EDUPOL, are similar to those that the World Bank has identified as we have seen earlier. However unlike the World Bank, EDUPOL does not make recommendations on how the problem of shortage of teachers in rural areas should be dealt with.

Much as EDUPOL advocates leaving learner enrolments and agreed-upon pupil: teacher ratio to determine the desired size of the teaching stock, it does not in anyway challenge studies which claim that effective teaching does not suffer much between pupil: teacher ratio of 21:1 and 50:1. This suggests that EDUPOL, like the World Bank, accepts that the teacher: pupil ratio may be increased as a way of minimising costs.

Teacher Utilisation

As we have seen earlier, the issue of teacher utilisation is very much linked to teachers' salaries. EDUPOL seems to be operating from the same perspective as the World Bank, particularly on the need to contain teacher costs. In its paper on 'Teacher Salaries in South Africa' (1993), EDUPOL argues that South African teachers are relatively well paid in comparison to their counterparts in other developing countries (p.19). EDUPOL further argues that the salary gap between the qualified and unqualified teachers must be narrowed. Its paper, 'Teacher Salaries in South Africa' (1993), proposes restructuring salaries in three ways. Firstly by basing payment on the level of responsibility of the position. Secondly, by redefining teacher competence so that the main emphasis is on effective teaching and learning in the classroom rather than obtaining of further qualifications. Lastly, by designing an alternative career path for excellent teachers who want to continue to teach instead of becoming administrators (p.28).

These proposals on reconceptualising teacher salaries are similar to some of the World Bank's recommendations with regard to teacher salaries. The World Bank also recommended that salaries should be based on responsibility more than age, seniority and qualifications. It also recommended that in order to boost teachers' morale and to motivate them, opportunity for career advancement should be established so that experience teachers may, among other things, guide and offer support to new teachers.

In EDUPOL's Submissions to the 'Implementation Plan for Education and Training' (28 July 1994) two other options that can help reduce money spent on teachers are made. Firstly they suggest the use of Inter ship for teachers. The option looks at the situation where primary education school teachers will receive two years of PRESET followed by one year internship during which they will be earning half a teaching load and receive INSET while being mentored by experienced teachers. This is a cost-effective strategy for teacher training and utilisation especially because the interns will be receiving half salary yet at the same time they will be doing work in the same way as other teachers. The second option proposed by EDUPOL is that of training Teacher Aides. These Aides will be offered M+ intensive 2 months course and be used in the primary phase for a couple of years after which they will be offered M+3 training at colleges with a state bursary/loan. The use of Aides is a cost -effective strategy because they cost less than qualified teachers. However, whether this strategy would have educational benefits is an important issues which is not addressed.

These options, as suggested by the EDUPOL look more like extensions of the World Bank's recommendations on cutting PRESET and intensifying INSET. The use of Teacher Aides as proposed by EDUPOL is similar to the World Bank's recommendation that young graduates who are not necessarily qualified teachers should be used as teachers.

EDUPOL goes on to propose the following dual career tracks to offer career advancement.

Posts	*Management Track*	*Educator Track*
Level 6 (M+6)	*Inspector*	*PRESET/INSET Coordinator*
Level 5 (M+5)	*Principal*	*College Lecturer*
Level 4 (M+5)	*Deputy principals*	*INSET Advisor*
Level 3 (M+4)	*Head of Department*	*Mentor teacher*
Level 2 (M+3)	*Classroom teacher*	*Classroom teacher*
Level 1 (below M+3)	*Underqualified teachers*	*Underqualified teachers*
	Interns, aides, etc.	

(Source: Restructuring Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development: p.31)

These two career tracks opportunities, which are necessary for purposes of boosting teacher morale and motivation, are ideas with which the World Bank would not disagree because in Primary Education (1990:pp25) lack of teacher career advancement has been identified as an area that needs to be improved However the World Bank does not elaborate on how such advancement should look like. The tracks proposed by Edupol give opportunities for both teachers who want to take up educational management and those excellent and experienced teachers who would like to remain in the classroom.

Teacher Development

A number of concepts upon which teacher development should be based have been proposed. These include firstly linking pre-service and in-service teacher education in a continuum of professional development. This is a point which the World Bank openly supports in its paper on South Africa Education Sector: Strategic Issues and Policy Options (1995:pp22). Secondly, teacher competence should mean effective teaching and learning. Thirdly teacher development should be underpinned by democratic philosophy of education which encourages teacher involvement. Lastly, it should also be underpinned by methodologies that are learner centred and multi-cultural.

Like the World Bank, EDUPOL also suggests that both pre-service and in-service teacher programmes must reduce offering too much education theory and focus on subject knowledge, teaching skills and teaching practice. EDUPOL also suggests a number of modes for PRESET but they also think that in order to improve instructional quality, PRESET needs to be improved. They also echo the World Bank' sentiments by emphasising the significance of school-based/focussed INSET (Edupol Submission to the IPET, 1994:17). Edupol also makes the following recommendations: Firstly there is a need for management training for principals for effective management and supportive culture for INSET. Secondly, it is important to upgrade priority groups of unqualified and under-qualified teachers. Thirdly, it is important to encourage language development for serving teachers. For example, in

addition to English or Afrikaans, teachers would have to know at least one African language. Lastly, there is need to retrain teachers in new or scarce subjects such as design and technology or mathematics and science.

Most of Edupol's recommendations as outlined above are also elaborated upon by the World Bank in its different education policy papers. For example, recommendations for training and strengthening management are found in Primary Education (1990:pp32) and Education in Sub-Saharan Africa (1995:pp87-89). The recommendation on need for language development is in Education in Sub-Saharan Africa, (1995:pp43-45). Need to re-train teachers in scarce subjects and need to increasing school based/focussed in-service programme are also elaborated upon in the World Bank's paper on South Africa: Education Sector Strategic Issues and Policy Options (1995:pp23).

The next section examines teacher policies of the ANC. Its' aim is to find out if there are any similarities between the ANC's policies and policy recommendations made by the World Bank and by EDUPOL.

4.3 ANC Teacher Policy Perspectives

The ANC was identified for this study precisely because prior to 1994 it was probably the largest political organisation in South Africa and it was anticipated that it would be the next government. As indicated earlier, the study is based on an assumption that

many local and international policy researchers aspired to influence the ANC's policies either directly or indirectly. This section will attempt to trace the process of ANC teacher policy development between 1990 and 1997, with special focus on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development. In the process, we will compare and contrast the ANC's perspectives in these areas with those of the two organisations discussed above.

For purposes of this study, education policy documents of the ANC before it got to lead the Government of National Unity (GNU) and during its lead of the GNU up to 1997 were identified for scrutiny. These included: ANC Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994), Implementation Plan for Education and Training (1994). Annual reports of the ANC-led Department of Education (1996), the Department of Education's Agenda of Possibilities: National Policy Supply, Utilisation and Development: A Stakeholder Response (1997) were also looked at with the purpose of tracking policy shifts between 1994 and 1997. In this section we will focus on ANC's policies on teacher supply, utilisation and development. We start by looking at teacher supply.

Teacher Supply

Most of the policy documents published by the ANC prior to 1994 deal with the issue of teachers in a broad way. In the document Ready to Govern published by the ANC Policy Unit in 1992, this is what is said about teachers:

> "We are committed not only to increasing the quantity (i.e. number of years) of education that individuals have access to, but also improving the quality of the education that they receive. This will require, amongst others, the adequate provision of basic resources such as equipment and textbooks, improving teacher training and development, improving teacher-pupil ratios." (pp:49)

On the other hand this is what the "Discussion Paper for the ANC on Education Policy" which was published in 1992 says about teachers:

> "We could demand for the immediate opening up of training colleges and provide bursaries for teacher training which could be linked to a period of service as a teacher. We know that thousands of students can be absorbed even now into teacher training institutions." (pp.32)

These two statements articulate the fact that the ANC perceived teachers as an important factor that needed attention if education was to be improved. They also suggest that the ANC envisaged opening teacher training colleges, offering bursaries to training more teachers and supplying them adequately so that the pupil: teacher ratio is improved.

Interestingly, in the document A Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994), the ANC no longer speaks of opening colleges and offering bursaries to train teachers. Amongst the principles for teacher preparation and development articulated in this document is that there is need to "prepare a sufficient number of teachers and trainers to meet our commitment to life long learning." The phrase "sufficient number" shows scepticism on the part of the ANC. This seems to be in line with Samuel's (1998/11/15, Interview) assertion that when the ANC assumed leadership of the GNU, it did not know what exactly was the pupil: teacher ratio in the country. Secondly, the integration of departments had not been finalised. According to Samuel because there were no proper statistics the ANC was not completely sure of the

number of serving teachers and how many would be required. Hence, retrenchment of teachers was anticipated. Samuel 's argument holds water especially when taking into consideration the fact that immediately after assuming leadership of the GNU, the ANC immediately commissioned a National Teacher Education Audit which was to establish teachers supply and demand.

The issue of shortage of teachers is also raised in the Implementation Plan for Education and Training (1994) which is based on the Policy Framework for Education and Training (IPET)(1994). The IPET document projected teacher needs in the country as 135 700 primary and 93 600 secondary teachers with severe shortages experienced in the Eastern Cape (16 308), KwaZulu-Natal (12 089), Northern Province and Mpumalanga (shortages of 3 877 and 2 277) respectively. These shortages were projected based on the following assumption:

- that all children who were not in school around 1991 go to school;
- that the pupil: teacher ratio is 35:1 primary and 32:1 for secondary schools and
- that there is teacher attrition rate of 5% per annum.

The next section discusses the ANC's policy position on teacher development and utilisation.

Teacher Development and Utilisation

With regard to teacher development and utilisation, the ANC comes up with policy proposals which are similar to those raised by the World Bank and by EDUPOL. This is not particularly surprising because EDUPOL was a key player in the development of Implementation Plan for Education and Training (IPET) (1994). Firstly, in both the

Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994) and IPET the ANC emphasises the significance of INSET as a cost-effective mechanism for teacher training.

Secondly, while the ANC accepts and supports criticism which teachers and teacher organisations articulate against the system of inspection and supervision as it was done during the apartheid era, in the Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994:pp54), the ANC clearly acknowledges the need for such a system. The ANC emphasises that:

> "the new system of 'inspection' and supervision must aim at providing a more liberating, professionally challenging and invigorating experience for teachers, school principals and members of the supervisory services."
>
> (ANC, 1994, Framework for Education and Training: pp54)

The ANC further maintains that supervisory roles should be linked to teacher preparation and development allowing supervisors to perform developmental and mentoring roles. As we have seen earlier, the issue of supervision is regarded by the World Bank as one of the factors which need to be put in place in order to support teachers and boost their morale. Supervision also links to creating career paths for teachers, which is also one of the factors identified by the World Bank and Edupol as boosting teachers' morale. This means that teachers who do not want to become managers, can become supervisors or mentors of the newly appointed teachers.

In both the Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994) and the IPET (1994), the ANC is very critical of the linking of teacher salaries to qualifications. The major concern raised in the IPET's Report on Teachers is that 'if the qualifications of all teachers who were classified as un-or under-qualified are

upgraded, then the additional costs will place unbearable strains on the budget' (Summary Report of the IPET Task Teams, 1994: 7). Both documents propose a move towards a new system where salary scales are linked to level of appointment. Under such a system, teachers may be 'overqualified' for the positions they occupy and thus, in order to provide incentives for teachers to continue learning. the document proposes that "the new system rewards the acquisition of additional qualifications by means of one-off cash grants" (Summary Report of IPET task Teams, 1994:pp 7).

Another concern common to the ANC, Edupol and World Bank with regard to linking of salaries to qualifications is that such a system encourages 'a paper chase' or blind acquisition of qualifications, regardless of the content and relevance to the work done by their holders. This means that those qualifications do not improve teachers' professional competence.

In the documents that the ANC produced prior to and in 1994, it was consistent about need for more teachers. In the Ready to Govern (1992) the ANC spoke of need to improve pupil: teacher ratio. In the Discussion Document (1991), It spoke of opening colleges to train more teachers. In the Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994) it spoke of training a "sufficient number of teachers". In the IPET they projected teacher shortage to be 135 700 for primary and 93 600 for secondary schools using the ration of 35:1 primary and 32:1 secondary schools. However, in documents such as An Agenda of Possibilities: National Teacher Policy on Teacher

Supply, Utilisation and Development (1997) and Annual Reports (1996), the ANC led-Department of Education, speaks of redistributing and retrenching teachers through voluntary severance packages. The next section explores the ANC's new position on teacher supply, utilisation and development

3.4 Policy Perspectives of the ANC led Government of National Unity

According to Samuel (1999, Interview) when the ANC assumed leadership of the GNU in 1994, it did not know exactly how many teachers were in the system. Consequently, the Department of Education commissioned a National Teacher Education Audit, which would provide a comprehensive overview and analysis of the state of teacher education in South Africa. The Audit, commissioned by the National Ministry of Education in 1996 and coordinated by the Centre for Education Policy Development (CEPD), was the first major post-election document on teacher education. The National Teacher Education Audit is of particular significance in the process of teacher policy development. This is because, firstly the Audit confirms that processes of policy development have in many ways been very consultative, involving various stakeholders. In the case of the Audit, a consortium of non-governmental organisations was established to do research in various aspects of the Audit. Edupol was one of the NGOs involved in the Audit.

Secondly, the Teacher Audit was an extremely important step in the process of shaping teacher policies of the ANC-led Government of National Unity. As a follow-

up to the Audit, the national Department of Education initiated the Teacher Policy Support Project (TPSP) to provide technical assistance to the national and provincial education department in order to develop policy for Teacher Supply Utilisation and Development (TSUD). In accordance with Phase 1 of the TPSP, the Department of Education went on to produce a draft policy document, An Agenda of Possibilities: National Teacher Policy on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development (1997). This document was workshoped in an International Conference in October 1996, after which stakeholders submissions and conference inputs were incorporated. The document, An Agenda of Possibilities: National Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development, (1997) was expected to form the basis for a White Paper on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development (Jaff, 1998).

The Agenda of Possibilities of Possibilities: National Teacher Policies on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development (1997) draws heavily from the National Teacher Audit. It also emphasises some of the issues raised by Edupol which are also similar to those raised by the World Bank in relation to teacher supply, utilisation and development.

With regard to teacher supply, the document refers to the pupil: teacher ratio as agreed upon by the Education Labour Relations Council negotiations. The ratio has increased to 1:40 for ordinary primary schools and 1:35 for ordinary secondary schools. As the document states, teacher: pupil ratio has an impact on demand for teachers. It means that the system will need fewer teachers and the size of the salary

bill, which has been a major concern is going to decrease (p.19). The document also raises concern about the ready availability of bursaries which has encouraged students not intending to teach to enter teaching thus causing an oversupply of teachers. It further raises concerns regarding maldistribution and inadequate utilisation of teachers in South Africa where the majority of teachers are in urban areas while rural areas experience shortages. Recently, the buzz words have also been teacher "rationalisation" "redeployment" (p.25), "teacher redistribution" and "right sizing" (p.26). Retrenchment by way of offering Voluntary Severance Packages (VSP) to teachers who for some reasons do not choose to be redeployed was embarked upon. The increase of pupil: teacher ratio and retrenchment of teachers are trends in which governments in developing countries are trying to reduce their social expenditure. It is well documented that organisations such as World Bank have been very influential in persuading governments to cut their expenditure.

On teacher utilisation, the document, among other issues, also raises concerns about teachers' salaries being driven by qualifications, which ultimately leads "paper chase" referred above. It also emphasises that salaries should be de-linked from qualifications, with teachers who improve their qualifications getting a once-off cash bonus. Agenda of Possibilities of Possibilities: National Teacher Policies on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development (1997) mentions that the Joint Committee of the ELRC and the government are investigating how a system of performance-related pay can be implemented. As we have discussed earlier in this document these issues are similar to issues raised by both the World Bank and Edupol.

With regard to teacher development, the document does not only refer to the significance of offering quality PRESET but also to the importance of offering INSET for classroom competence. The significance of INSET for classroom competence has also been discussed above as some of the recommendations made by the World Bank and Edupol.

It is clear at this point that there are similarities in the teacher policy positions and recommendations of the three organisations under study. These similarities relate to:

- role of INSET in teacher training;
- career paths for teachers;
- de-linking teacher salaries and qualifications;
- linking of teacher salaries to performance; and
- the significance of supervision in the teaching profession;

While it is equally difficult at this point to explain the similarities between teacher policy recommendations of the World Bank and teacher policy position of the ANC, ways through which EDUPOL may have influenced ANC policies are becoming clearer. Firstly EDUPOL made submissions to the ANC's Implementation Plan for Education and Training,(1994). Secondly, not only was EDUPOL part of the consortium established to do the National Teacher Education Audit but it was further tasked by the national Department of Education to co-ordinate the Teacher Policy Support Project (TPSP) as well. These processes may have afforded EDUPOL opportunities to get its policy positions through to the ANC.

This section has shown that there are similarities in policy positions of the organisations under study. However, it is not clear how these similarities came about. Relying on information from key informants, the next section tries to understand how these similarities may have come about. The section tries to establish if there have been any interactions among the organisations under study and what was the nature of the interactions. If there have been interactions could it be assumed that there was influence.

CHAPTER THREE

Perceptions on Influence: An Analysis of Interviews

Introduction

The previous chapter has shown that although there are some difference, there are also some striking similarities in the teacher education policies of the organisations under study. To understand what might have been the cause of the said similarities and differences, high ranking officials who played prominent roles in the development of the ANC and EDUPOL teacher policies were interviewed. The interviews did not only focus on the similarities or differences but were also intended to provide an understanding of the nature of the relationship between these organisations. Attempts to find someone from the World Bank, particularly Dr. Mutumbuka whom, interviewees in both the ANC and EDUPOL described as an important player who worked hard to forge a close relationship between the World Bank and the ANC in the early 90s, proved fruitless.

Relying on information provided by interviewees, this chapter seeks to understand firstly if the ANC had any teacher policies prior to 1994. It then examines if there have been interactions between ANC, the World Bank and EDUPOL prior to and after 1994. Lastly, the chapter examines interviewees' perceptions on the role their organisations played in the development of teacher policies of the ANC.

3.1 Did the ANC have Teacher Policies prior to 1994?

According to John Samuel, Trevor Coombe and John Pampallis who were interviewed as key informants from the ANC, two documents were of particular significance in the process of developing ANC education policies. These are, A Policy Framework for Education and Training (1994), also referred to as the "yellow book" and The Implementation Plan for Education and Training (1994), which were both published by the ANC. As Samuel pointed out, these two documents covered broad education policy principles within which teacher education was also located (Samuel, 1998/10/15: Interview). According to Coombe, these documents were preceded by a number of policy processes that included the National Education Policy Initiative (NEPI) process and National Education Conference of 1992. The NEPI process led to the production of a number of reports, including the report on Teacher Education (1992). Coombe also pointed out that most of these processes included many people who were not from the ANC (Coombe, 1999/03/03: Interview).

According to Samuel who headed the ANC's education desk in the early 1990s, some of the principles underpinning teacher education as was covered in the broad education policies included:

- Eradicating inequalities and redressing the imbalances in the teaching profession;
- Addressing the problem of few skills and the many untrained teachers;
- A need to shift away from the system that focused on acquisition of qualifications to the one that focused on professional development which is in line with life long learning – to avoid paper chase; and

- Need to involve teachers in policy development.

3.2 Have the ANC teacher policies changed since 1994?

Notwithstanding the current issues of teacher redistribution and retrenchments through voluntary severance packages, Samuel was adamant that these were not happening because the ANC had shifted from its initial position. He maintained that the ANC policies on teachers had not changed rather, they had been given more content. He argued that the ANC never mentioned directly that there was not going to be retrenchments because it did not know exactly what the teacher: pupil ratio was and how the situation was going to be once the racially divided education department had been integrated.

John Pampallis, who was interviewed in Johannesburg and is the current head of the Centre for Education Policy Development (CEPD), agreed with Samuel that there were ideas within the ANC that there could be need to redistribute and retrench teachers. However, this could not be concretised because the ANC had no clear audit of how many teachers were there in the system (Pampallis, 1999/02/23: Interview). Contrary to Samuel's position, Pampallis thought that the ANC had shifted from its position. According to him, the shift came mainly because prior to 1994, the ANC did not fully appreciate the problems (i.e. how many teachers were in the system). After 1994 as the leading party in the Government of National Unity had to deal with problems and was faced with financial constraints.

3.3 Interactions between the ANC and the World Bank

As indicated in the methodology section of this document, attempts to find and interview Dr. Mutumbuka who is said to have been the link between the World Bank and many organisation in South Africa including the ANC, did not succeed. Nevertheless, the key informants from the ANC did not deny that there was interaction between the World Bank and the ANC.

According to Samuel, like many other multilateral organisations the World Bank was eager to work closely with the ANC. The World Bank's eagerness to work with the ANC was due to its anticipation to play a bigger role in the post apartheid South Africa to be led by the ANC. As a result the World Bank had sent a number of missions to South Africa to look at how the World Bank could provide technical support. In 1992/93 the World Bank missions were sent to South Africa to look at urban infrastructure development, housing, agriculture and education. The mission on education focused on financing, school building and improving the quality of teaching. Samuel also pointed out that throughout the period of missions, the World Bank worked with the ANC and that in 1993 an ANC delegation led by Mr. Thabo Mbeki and Mr. Trevor Manuels visited the World Bank's offices in Washington to understand how it worked (Samuel, 1998/11/15: Interview).

Trevor Coombe, succeeded John Samuel as head of the ANC education desk now functioning as the Centre for Education Policy Development. During the interview, he was Deputy Director-General in the Department of Education. Coombe supported

Samuel's assertion that the World Bank was eager to work with the ANC. He affirmed that due to its eagerness the World Bank had offered the ANC education desk offices from which to undertake studies in areas that would be of value to both the ANC and the World Bank. Subsequently, a number of studies relating to the quality of school education, the financing of education in South Africa and Early Childhood Development were commissioned by the two organisations (Coombe, 1999/03/03: Interview). There were also workshops held on the basis of the studies undertaken. According to Coombe, people, particularly those within ANC were uneasy about the ties between ANC Education Desk and the World Bank. He pointed out that in such workshops the World Bank was usually attacked on the basis of its activities in developing African countries.

Despite evidence of World Bank/ANC collaborations in missions and studies, Coombe maintained that ANC/World Bank relationship was not cordial. According to him, Mr. Samuel who headed the ANC Education Desk in the early 1990s, was particularly very reluctant to enter into any agreement or even establish a long term relationship that would have allowed the World Bank to get involved in policy development (Coombe, 1999/03/03: Interview).

According to Pampallis, the fact that the ANC collaborated with the World Bank in various missions and studies showed that the ANC was not hostile to the World Bank. He argued that the ANC collaborated with the World Bank from the point of view that, 'if the World Bank could help with its resources, why not work with it'

(Pampallis, 1999/02/23: Interview). However, he maintained that the ANC did not necessarily take what the World Bank was saying or recommending.

3.4 Was there interactions between the ANC and EDUPOL?

Interviewees from both the ANC and EDUPOL all agreed that there was interaction between the two organisations and that their relationship was cordial. According to Samuel, Coombe and Pampallis, the ANC regarded EDUPOL as a useful resource in the area of teacher policies. People such as Peter Buckland and Jane Hofmeyr who worked for EDUPOL had also been part of various committees that undertook studies for the ANC education desk. During the National Education Policy Investigation processes these people were involved in Teacher Education and Governance task teams and also assisted with the production of ANC reports such as the Implementation Plan for Education and Training (1994).

As indicated in the previous chapter the interactions between the ANC and Edupol continued even after 1994. Not only was EDUPOL one of the leading organisation that were commissioned to do the National Teacher Education Audit but they were tasked to by the Department of Education to coordinate the Teacher Policy Support Project (TPSP).

3.5 Was there interaction between EDUPOL and the World Bank?

While relationships between the World Bank and ANC education desk and between the latter and Edupol were clear, a relationship between Edupol and the World Bank seemed more difficult to establish. Both Buckland and Hofmeyr asserted that their organisation interacted with and was also visited by the World Bank during its missions in the early 1990s but according to Hofmeyr, after 1995, they had no contact with the World Bank. On the other hand, Buckland, maintained that interactions between EDUPOL and the World Bank in the early 1990s, were actually mediated by the ANC. He argued that EDUPOL did not want to engage with the World Bank without the ANC because they anticipated that the ANC was going to be the ruling party in South Africa.

It is clear at this point that the ANC education desk interacted with both the World Bank and Edupol in the early 90s but whether these organisations managed to influence ANC teacher policies is another issue. The interviewees had different opinions on whether the ANC teacher policies were influenced or not.

3.6 Perceptions on whether the World Bank or Edupol Influenced ANC Teacher Policies.

Interestingly, Trevor Coombe, refuted the very underlying assumption of this study, which is that the World Bank and EDUPOL were very influential in the process of ANC teacher policy development. According to him, they were not. He acknowledged, however, that EDUPOL had talented researchers who were willing to

work within NEPI and other policy processes initiated by the Mass Democratic Movement (Coombe, 1999/03/03: interviews).

John Samuel supported Coombe's argument about the non-existence of World Bank influence on ANC teacher policies. However, he acknowledged the significance of EDUPOL in the ANC education policy development in general. According to Samuel, the Centre for Education Policy Development (CEPD), established as an ANC education policy unit, found teacher policies of EDUPOL useful. Such policies were consequently utilised in shaping the ANC's broader education policy. This may therefore account for the similarities between ANC teacher policies and those of EDUPOL. A clear collaboration between EDUPOL and CEPD was on work they did around 'The Restructuring of Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development' (TSUD) prepared for Implementation Plan for Education and Training Task Teams on Teacher Development and Supply. This TSUD report makes it clear that the generation of policy variables and implementation strategies were mainly the task of EDUPOL. According to Pampallis, it is because of such contributions that the influence of EDUPOL on ANC teacher policies "cannot be underestimated." (Pampallis, 1999/02/23: Interviews)

Both Buckland and Hofmeyr, who were researchers at EDUPOL in the early 1990s, supported Pampallis and Samuel's argument that EDUPOL played and important and influential role in the ANC teacher policy development process. According to Buckland because of EDUPOL's association with the Urban Foundation and later the

National Business Initiative, they were at times perceived, as "policy think tanks for capital and therefore not ideologically pure enough" (Buckland, 1999/02/04: Interview). In other words, it was thought that they were advocating policies that favoured business. As a result, the ANC and its left wing supporters treated them with suspicion. Nevertheless, Buckland and Hofmeyr were adamant that their organisation played a significant role and that it was very influential on ANC teacher policies in particular and education policies in general.

According to both Buckland and Hofmeyr , among some of the strategies they used to get their policies through to the ANC were, doing research in time so that its findings could be used to inform policy frameworks that were being developed. Buckland further indicated that research findings were propagated through presentations and distributing reports to be read and commented upon. This suggests that in this way they were able to get their policy perspectives across to a key stakeholder such as the ANC.

While interviewees from the ANC acknowledged the role of EDUPOL and agree that its influence may not be underestimated, they maintained that the World Bank was not of any influence to policies of their organisation.

According to Samuel the similarities between ANC and World Bank teacher policies did not mean that the ANC borrowed its policies from the World Bank. He argued that when developing ANC policies, a range of countries were looked at, studying the

way they articulated policies. He acknowledged, however, that the education desk of the ANC did use World Bank experts to help them develop more information, but not to shape policy.

Contrary to Coombe and Samuel's arguments on the influence of organisations such as the World Bank on ANC teacher policies, Pampallis asserted that throughout the process of education policy development, the ANC had been open to influence. According to him, such influence did not only come from EDUPOL and World Bank, rather, through interactions with many other organisations. Pampallis' argument was based on his understanding that influence, direct and indirect, can come in many ways. He argued that such influences include reading and absorbing ideas promoted in literature available to you; engaging with other stakeholders such as UNESCO and other international organisations; and engaging with academics from within the country and from other countries, and negotiating with local teacher unions. In Pampallis words, "no matter how small the influence may be perceived, it is still influence" (Pampallis, 1999/02/23: Interviews). Pampallis further pointed out that the post-1994 government macro economic policy is a clear example of influence from the World Bank and other international financial institutions that make deficit reduction an important issue as compared to Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP). He argued that, this has led to cuts in social spending and in education which in turn, impacted on teacher policies leading to teacher redeployment and retrenchment. Pampallis' perception and the examples he gave about how GEAR had influenced the education policy in South Africa, clearly fits into Dale's (1999)

argument that external effects on national policies do not announce themselves as concerned with education policies. This confirms that economic policies may be very influential in education policies. Although Pampallis was talking more generally about influence on education policies rather than specifically about teacher policies, his account does give an idea on how ANC teacher policies may have been influenced.

In the same way as interviewees from the ANC denied influence from World Bank, so did those from EDUPOL. Although Buckland and Hofmyer acknowledged that their organisation did interact with the World Bank, they denied that the World Bank was of any influence on teacher policies of their organisation. As Hofmyer puts it,

> "The World Bank hasn't featured as an actor since 1994 and even before that, it was a marginal actor at best. I recall that we provided it with some SA data for its Education Sector Report in 1995". (Hofmyer, 1999/11/11: Questionnaire).

Despite the striking similarities between teacher policies of these three organisations and evident policy shifts of the ANC as shown in Chapter 2, some officials from both the ANC and EDUPOL, as we have seen earlier, have consistently denied external influence particularly from the World Bank. A closer examination of the responses of the informants shows that Buckland and Hofmyer (from EDUPOL) and Coombe (from the ANC) were more adamant that their organisations did not get any influence from the World Bank. On the other hand Samuel and Pampallis (both from the ANC) were more neutral in their account on similarities.

The differing perceptions of these key informants necessitated a closer scrutiny of the roles these informants played during ANC teacher policy development processes between 1990-1997 and the positions they are holding currently. This was done in order to ascertain the extent to which their previous roles and current positions may have influenced their responses. It was also necessary to check if the predispositions of the respondent as defined by Weiss (cited in Borg and Gall, 1983:pp438) did not surface in the interviews.

John Samuel was head of the ANC education desk in the early 1990s. He was amoung the people who played prominent roles in setting up the new Ministry of Education under the ANC-led Government of National Unity. He had since left to work for the Kellogg Foundation and was based in Harare, Zimbabwe. The fact that he was no longer in the country could mean that he was no longer closely involved in the ANC policy development processes and that he was no longer that passionate about it hence his more neutral perception on World Bank's influence.

Trevor Coombe succeeded John Samuel as head of the ANC's Education Desk, which is operating as Centre for Education Policy Development. Like Samuel, Coombe played a significant role in the process of setting up the new Ministry of Education and was during the interview, Deputy Director-General in the national Department of Education. The position meant that he was still actively involved in policy development process and therefore very passionate about it. This could be the reason why he dismissed possibilities of external influence.

During the interview, John Pampallis was the director of the Centre for Education Policy Development. Pampallis was not particularly involved in development of ANC teacher policies. This could explain why his account for similarities in World Bank, EDUPOL and ANC teacher policies sounded more neutral and objective.

Jane Hofmeyr and Peter Buckland were both senior researchers at (EDUPOL). During the interview Hofmyer had left EDUPOL to become the National Executive Director of the Independent Schools Association of Southern Africa. Peter Buckland had also left to work for UNICEF and was based in New York. Although Hofmyer and Buckland were no longer with EDUPOL and were no longer directly involved in teacher policy development processes in South Africa, they were obviously still very passionate about work they had done around teacher education and the impact it has had on teacher policies in South Africa. Therefore admitting external influence, particularly from the World Bank, would have been like devaluing their own work.

It is possible that the background of the informants influenced their responses, however, this remains a speculation. At the same time, it is difficult to say whether predispositions as defined by Weiss (cited in Borg and Gall, 1983:pp438), did or did not surface during the interviews. As a researcher I did not feel the following:

(1) that interviews were suspicious or hostile to the research,

(2) that interviewees were indifferent or not motivated to cooperate,

(3) that they lacked information about the ANC teacher development processes

(4) that they wanted to please me as the researcher

In fact they all the interviewees seemed willing to share information. Evidence to this is that some of these interviewees offered to phone me from their offices as far as Harare (John Samuel) and New York (Peter Buckland) and they all shared interesting and valuable information. It would seem however that the World Bank, contacted here through Dr Mutumbuka was either suspicious of the study or not motivated to cooperate. This is because despite numerous attempts to secure an interview with Mr. Mutumbuka, it was never successful.

The differing perceptions of the informants as discussed earlier, presented interesting contradictions between what the policy documents of the organisations under study as analysed in Chapter 2 presented in terms of similarities and policy shift and the statements of the informants. These contradictions needed explanation. Hence we looked into the previous roles and current positions of the informants. It is possible that the informants were speaking the truth, but this leaves the contradiction unexplained. It is equally possible that there is a complex process of personal rationalisation and denial in their statements especially when taking into account the roles of the informants during the processes of ANC teacher policy development and what they are doing now. Nevertheless, what has become clearer at this point is that interviews of this kind cannot provide the full explanation for the contradictions, especially given the sensitive and controversial nature of the issue researched. For this, we need to return to the theoretical insights of those who have studied processes of influence and borrowing in the context of globalisation.

According to Dale (1999) policies may be formed and shaped through the orthodox mechanisms and through a complex process of globalisation. Orthodox mechanisms involve a situation where those who are formulating policy, deliberately or consciously borrow or learn policies that they want to emulate from other countries. Although there isn't any information suggesting that the ANC directly borrowed teacher policies from other countries, this may not be completely dismissed. Samuel indicated that the development of ANC's policies involved visiting other countries to see how they articulated policy (Samuel, 1998/10/15). According to Pampallis, the concept of outcomes-based education is a clear example of policies that were borrowed from Australia and transferred to the ANC by the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) and the National Union of Mineworkers of South Africa (NUMSA) who worked with Australian unions in developing training policies (Pampallis, 1999/023/23: Interview).

The role played by COSATU and NUMSA in borrowing and ensuring that concepts such as "life long learning" become underlying principles of the ANC and eventually the government's education and training policies introduces another dimension. This relates to the role played by local organisations and policy agents other than EDUPOL in mediating policies from elsewhere and using such policies to shape policies of the ANC. It is not within the scope of this study to pursue this new dimension rigorously. Rather, the next section will highlight some of its impact. Work by the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI, 1992) on Teacher Education, and work by Nisaar Mahomed (1996) on The Integration of Education and Training

in South Africa with the Context of Labour Market Theories and Globalisation, throws some light on this.

The role played by the NEPI in investigating policy options is unquestionable. The NEPI process, which involved researchers from various backgrounds produced a number of reports. Among these was a report on Teacher Education (1992) which was, interestingly, written by Hofmeyr who worked for EDUPOL.

Although these reports were not necessarily policy recommendations, they are known to have been very influential on education policies of the ANC in particular and of the Mass Democratic Movement (MDM) in general. It is interesting to note that in Chapter 3 of Teacher Education Report (1992), NEPI presents a number of emerging policy alternatives on issues of planning and provision, location and control, curriculum, access to teacher education, certification and assessment and organisation, accountability and professional development of teachers. The report focuses on issues which are not the focus of this study. Nevertheless, the fact that it presents alternative policy options from the private sector, the democratic movement, teacher unions and World Bank suggest that there has always been willingness to draw from other local and international policy agents in the process of policy development.

Mohamed's (1996) work focuses on the integration of education and training. The book elaborates on the role played by local policy actors particularly, COSATU and

NUMSA. Not only did these two unions borrow from countries such as Australia, educational concepts such as 'life long learning' and the integration of 'education and training', but they also worked closely with the ANC in ensuring that these concepts became some of the underlying principles of ANC's policies on education and training. As Mohamed argues, South Africa's policies in life long learning and integration of education and training were affected greatly by external influence, notably, Australia and England (Mohammed, 1996: 42).

Mohamed's work confirms that there has been external influence and that local actors also played meaningful roles in mediating such influence. Mohamed's work also demonstrates clearly how orthodox policy transfer mechanisms work practically in shaping policies. As indicated earlier for example this happened through COSATU and NUMSA borrowing policies from Australia and ensuring that such policies become underlying principles of ANC education policy. According to Dale (1999) policy borrowing and learning are carried out voluntarily and explicitly and their locus of viability is national. Both borrowing and policy learning are the result of conscious decision-making and mainly initiated by the recipient.

It would seem at this point, that there has been voluntary and explicit borrowing and policy learning which needed not to be done directly by the ANC but by local agents working closer to and influential within the ANC. The danger of following such an argument is that it will lead to conclusions that there has been indirect external influence and this will nullify statements of the key informants that there was no

external influence. The next chapter takes into consideration all the arguments that have been presented and draws a conclusion of this study.

CHAPTER FOUR

Conclusion

A document analysis presented in Chapter Two of this article revealed some striking similarities and congruence in the policy perspectives of the World Bank, EDUPOL and ANC. Main similarities relate to their positions on the following:

- role of INSET in teacher training;
- career paths for teachers;
- de-linking teacher salaries and qualifications;
- linking of teacher salaries to performance; and
- the significance of supervision in the teaching profession;

In Chapter 3, informants agreed that there were interactions between organisation under study. There is evidence that the ANC's education desk has worked with both the World Bank and EDUPOL in a number of projects prior to 1994. Although there is evidence that the ANC-led government has also worked with EDUPOL in projects such as the National Teacher Education Audit conducted in 1996 and Agenda of Possibilities: National Policy on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development (1997), there is no evidence that the ANC worked together with the World Bank after 1994.

Despite the striking similarities between teacher policies of these three organisations and evident policy shift of the ANC, some officials from both the ANC and

EDUPOL, as we have seen in Chapter 3, consistently denied external influence particularly from the World Bank. These differing perceptions presented interesting contradictions between what the policy documents of these organisations presented in terms of similarities and policy shifts, and statements of the informants. In an attempt to explain the contradictions, we looked into the profiles of the informants taking into consideration the fact that their previous involvement in policy development process and their current roles may have influenced their responses. At the same time, it emerged that policy actors closer to the ANC may have borrowed external policies and used such policies to reshape the ANC's economic and education policies. However, the use of a model of policy borrowing or learning to explain the similarities identified in teacher policies of the ANC, EDUPOL and World Bank, does not provide completely satisfactory explanations.

It would seem that the process of globalisation also played an important role in reshaping teacher policies of the ANC and also causing shifts that were identified in the ANC's thinking about teachers. As indicated in Chapter 1, globalisation, which is facilitated mainly by supranational organisations, involves more complex mechanisms of policy transfer. These include policy harmonisation, standardisation, instilling interdependence, imposition and dissemination (Dale, 1999: 12-15). In terms of information discussed in this paper, it seems very unlikely that similarities between ANC, Edupol and World Bank policies could be explained in terms of harmonisation, standardisation, Instilling Interdependence or imposition.

Dissemination seems to be the policy transfer mechanism that ushers some light into the similarities.

According to Dale, dissemination relates to a situation where various organisations such as UNESCO, OECD, World Bank etc, distribute their policy documents in an endeavor to indicate future policy direction. Clearly, World Bank documents referred to in this paper were produced mainly to indicate future policy directions. It is indisputable that these documents were very influential in developing countries. Policy dissemination may not be attributed to supranational organisations only. As both Hofmeyr and Buckland indicated, their organisation, Edupol, always conducted research, produced reports and disseminated such reports to key organisations such as the ANC with the purpose of influencing ANC's policy directions.

Finally, this dissertation has tried to track the development of ANC teacher policies between 1990 and 1997, to identify influences of World Bank and Edupol and unveil strategies employed by these two organisations in the process of trying to influence the ANC. The dissertation has successfully shown that there have been interactions between these three organisations, that there are some striking similarities in their teacher policies and that there have been shifts in ANC policy over time.

The dissertation has also shown that the process of trying to understand these similarities is very complex, complicated mainly by differing perceptions of key informants on whether there has been influence from the World Bank. Clearly, it is

not an issue of simply saying that the World Bank has influenced the ANC or that EDUPOL mediated between the World Bank and ANC or that the ANC consciously borrowed policies from the World Bank. From arguments and information presented in Chapter 3, the similarities between ANC, EDUPOL and World Bank policies do not necessarily imply influence from EDUPOL or World Bank, rather these similarities need to be understood within the broad issue of globalisation and not as influence from a particular organisation.

It could be concluded that development of ANC teacher policy is the result of interplay between various local and international policy think tanks in which local policy agents played an important role by producing policy documents which helped shape ANC policies. In the case of policies on teacher supply, utilisation and development, which had links with teacher redeployment, there are clear linkages between the three organisations studied. In particular linkages relate to the significance of INSET, career paths to motivate teachers, de-linking teacher salaries from qualifications, linking teacher salaries to performance and the significance of supervision in the teaching profession. The linkages identified in the organisations studied do not detract from the argument that other actors such as education policy units also influenced ANC teacher policies, but that is the subject of another thesis.

References

Primary Sources (*Documents*)

1. ANC Policy Unit, *Discussion Document,* (March 1991)

2. ANC Policy Unit, *Ready to Govern*, (1992)

3. ANC, Department of Education, *A Policy Framework for Education and Training* (January, 1994)

4. ANC Department of Education, *Implementation Plan for Education and Training*, (May 1994)

5. Department of Education, *Annual Report*: June 1994 – December 1995, (Pretoria: Department of education, May 1996)

6. Department of Education, Annual Report: 1996, (Pretoria Department of Education, 1996)

7. Department of Education, *An Agenda of Possibilities: National Policy on Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development: A Stakeholder Response,* (Pretoria: Department of Education, March 1997)

8. Edupol, *Teacher Salaries in South Africa,* Johannesburg (Edupol, October 1993)

9. The Urban Foundation, *EDUPOL Submission to the Implementation Plan for Education and Training*, (Johannesburg, 28 July 1994)

10. Restructuring Teacher Supply, Utilisation and Development (TSUD). Report For IPET Task Teams: Teacher Development and Support and Finance

11. Hofmeyer, J and Hall, G, The National Teacher Education Audit Synthesis Report (Johannesburg: Edupol, November 1995)

12. Education and Employment Division, *Annual Operational Review: Fiscal 1990 Education and Training*, (Washington: World Bank, 1991)

13. Craig, J, *Comparative African Experiences in Implementing Educational* Policies, Washington, DC (The World Bank, 1990)

14. World Bank, *Primary Education*: A World Bank Policy Paper. Washington (World Bank, 1990)

15. World Bank, *Priorities and Strategies for Education*: A World Bank Review.

Washington, DC, (World Bank, 1995)

16. World Bank, *Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Revitalization and Expansion,* (Washington, DC: World Bank, 1988)

17. World Bank, *South Africa: Education Sector Strategic Issues and Policy Options*. (Washington, DC: World Bank, 1995)

Interviews

1. Samuel J, Telephonic Interview, Harare, Zimbabwe (15 October 1998)
2. Pampallis J, Face to Face Interview, Centre for Education Policy Development, Evaluation and Management (CEPD) Johannesburg (23 February 1999)
3. Coombe, T, Face to Face Interview, Pretoria (03 March 1999)
4. Buckland, P, Telehponic Interview, New York (04 February 1999)

Questionnaires

1. Hofmeyr, J Questionnaire, Johannesburg (11 November 1998)

Secondary Sources

Adedeji, A, "Economic Progress: What Africa Needs", in K.Mengisteab and B. Ikubolanjen, Logan (eds), *Beyond Economic Liberalization in Africa: Structural Adjustments and Alternatives,* (London: Zed Books, 1995)

Anderson, G, *Fundamentals of Educational Research,* (London: The Falmer Press, 1990)

Axford, B, "The process of Globalisation", in B Axford, G.K Browning, R.

Borg, W.R. *Educational Research*: An Introduction, (London: Longman, 1963)

Borg, W.R and Gall, M.D, *Educational Research: An Introduction*, (New York: Longman, 1983)

Breslin, E ,"Structural Adjustments in Africa: Engaging with the World World Bank in the 1990s, (1992,), seminar paper, Wits EPU Resources Library.

Chisholm, L, "The Restructuring of South African Education and Training in Comparative Context", in P Kallaway et al (eds), *Education After Apartheid,* (Cape Town: Cape Town University Press, 1997)

Chisholm, L and Fuller, B, "Remember Peoples Education: Shifting Alliances, State Building and South Africa's Narrowing Policy Agenda'" in the *Journal of Education Policy* (1996)

Cohen, L and Manion, L. *Research Methods in Education: Third Edition,* (London: Routledge, 1989)

Dale, R Specifying Globalisation effects on National Policy: A focus on the Mechanism. in Ball. S and Goodson I, *Journal of Education Policy*. (1999). Vol. 14, No. 1, pp.

Graham-Brown, *Education in Developing World: Conflict and Crisis,* (New York and London: Longman, 1991)

Fox, D.J. *the Research Process in Education,* (New York: Holt, Richart and Winston, Inc, 1969)

Haddad, W.D. *Teacher Training: A Review of World Bank Experience. Education and Training* Series Report No. EDT21, (Washington: World Bank, 1985)

Jones, P W, *World Bank Financing of Education: Lending, Learning and Developing,* (London: Routledge, 1992)

King, K, *Aid and Education: A Review of Recent Developments with Particular Reference to South Africa*, Occasional Paper, (Cape Town: University of Western Cape, EPU 1993)

Lauglo, J "World Banking on Education and the Uses of Research: A critique: World World Bank Priorities and Strategies for Education" in *International Journal of Educational Development*, vol. 16 (3) 1996, 221 – 223

Mohamed, N. *the Integration of Education and Training in South Africa within the Context of Labour Market Theories and Globalisation*: EPU Working Paper No. 11, (Durban: University of Natal, Education Policy Unit, 1996).

Mistry, P "The Present Role of the World Bank in Africa", Edited Lecture Delivered at (IFAA , 16/ 10/1989)

NEPI, *Teacher Education,* (Cape Town: Oxford University Press, 1992)

Samoff, J "The Intellectual/ Financial Complex of Foreign Aid", in *Review of African Political Economy,* (No. 53) 1992, 60-87

Samoff, J "Agitators, Incubators, Advisors- What Role for EPUs? An Evaluation of South African Education Policy Units supported by Sweden", Paper prepared for Swedish Agency for Research Cooperation with Developing Countries (1995)

Soobrayan, B, "World Banking on Education: A critical assessment of the World World Bank's Involvement in education in the South", *Perspectives in Education*, vol.16, no.1, 1995, pp.5-32

UNESCO: Working Group on Education Sector Analysis, *Analysis,*

Agendas and Priorities for Education in Africa, (Paris: UNESCO, 1996)

Vespoor, A, Lending for Learning: Twenty years of World Bank Support for Basic Education, (Washington: World Bank, 1991).

Verspoor, A.M and Leno, J.L. Improving Teacher Education: A Key to Successful Educational Change, (Washington: World Bank, 1986)

Appendix 1

Questions used in the interviews

1. Questions for ANC Officials

1. Did the ANC have a teacher policy, prior to 1994?

Yes		No	

2. What was the ANC's position in that policy and what had informed it?

3. Have the ANC teacher policies changed since 1994. Tick Yes or No

Yes		No	

4.Why?

5. If there have been changes would you attribute such changes to influence of any local or international policy actors? If so, which policy actors were particularly influential?

6. How would you describe the ANC's relationship with the World Bank and IMF, prior to 1994?

7. Were they in any way involved in the ANC policy formulation processes? Yes or No

Yes		No	

8. How? eg. They presented papers at MDM conferences

9. What was their position on Teacher, Supply, Utilisation and Development

10. Did you find their position acceptable to be part of the ANC policy on teachers? Yes or No

Yes		No	

11. How did the ANC relate to the NBI?

12. Did the NBI policies differ from those of the ANC? If so how?

11. Did the ANC find policies of the NBI acceptable? Elaborate

Yes		No		

12. Is there any other agency that you think was influential on the ANC's teacher policies? Elaborate.

13. Is there any other information relating to the formulation of the ANC teacher polices on how it has been influenced by other agencies?

2. Questions for EDUPOL Officials

Name of Interviewee (Optional) :.....

1. For how long has Edupol been involved in teacher policy development?

2. As Edupol produces teacher policies, who are their targeted groups?

3. Have those targeted groups accepted Edupol's proposed policies positively? Elaborate.

Yes		No		

4. How did Edupol relate to with ANC between 1990 and 1994?

5. Did that relationship change between 1995 and 1997? (How)

Yes		No		

6. Was there any deliberate move by Edupol to influence the ANC teacher policy between 1990 and 1994? Elaborate.

Yes		No		

7. Do you think the Edupol succeeded in doing so? Why?

8. What strategies did the Edupol employ to get their teacher policy proposals through to the ANC?

9. Has Edupol been working independently or with other policy actors?

10 How would you describe Edupol's relationship with the World Bank between 1990 and 1997?

11. What do you think of the World Bank's polices on Teachers? Have they been different from Edupol's?

12. What did you perceive as Edupol's major role during the education policy contestations that were going on between 1990 and 1995?

13. What role has Edupol played between 1995 and 1997, with regard to the development of teachers policies in South Africa.

14. Is there nny other information that you might want to share with regard to Edupol's relationship with the ANC, World Bank and your involvement in the development of teacher policies.

3. Questions for World Bank Officials

Name of Interviewee (Optional) :.....

1. For how long have you been operating in South Africa?

2. Did you have any formal relationship with the ANC prior to 1990?

Yes		No		

3. Did that relationship change after the unbanning of the ANC in 1990? How?

Yes		No		

5. Did you try to influence the ANC teacher policy? If yes why?

Yes		No		

5. What strategies did you employ in trying to influence the ANC policies prior to 1994?

7. Were those strategies successful? What do you think were the reasons?

Yes		No		

8. How did those strategies change between 1995 and 1997?

9. Did you have any working relations with other policy think tanks in South Africa? Give names if possible.

10. Are there any documents indicating your interaction with the ANC or any policy researchers in South Africa.? Please provide, if possible?

Yes		No		

11. Is there any other information with regard to you involvement in the development of teacher policies in South Africa in the period between 1990 and 1997?

Author Siluma E
Name of thesis Influence Of The World Bank On Anc Teacher Policies From 1990 To 1997 Siluma E 1999

PUBLISHER:
University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg
©2013

LEGAL NOTICES:

Copyright Notice: All materials on the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg Library website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

Disclaimer and Terms of Use: Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the Library website.