

https://dspace.org/

The role of ethnicity in Kenya's transition from single party rule to political pluralism (1992-2007)

Godwin, Shilaho Westen Kwatemba

2012-10-03
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/12019

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

THE ROLE OF ETHNICITY IN KENYA'S TRANSITION FROM SINGLE PARTY RULE TO POLITICAL PLURALISM (1992-2007)

Shilaho Westen Kwatemba Godwin

A Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Johannesburg 2012.

ABSTRACT

The thesis attempts to explain the salience of ethnicity in political party formation and the cyclic ethnic violence during elections in Kenya's multiparty democracy. It accords special focus on how ethnicity was deployed in the management and even disorganisation of politics in Kenya's multiparty era. The thesis examines two significant questions. Why and how ethnicity was salient in Kenya's transition from one-party rule to political pluralism? What was the relationship between ethnic conflict and political liberalization in Kenya? The thesis contributes to our understanding of Kenya's attempt at transition from authoritarianism to more democratic forms of politics and its impact on multiparty politics in Kenya's multiethnic society. It also illuminates the trajectories that Kenya's politics has taken since the advent of multiparty politics in the early 1990s. The thesis considers the significance of the concept of democratic transition in the context of Kenya, a country emerging from single party rule characterised by authoritarianism and patron-client politics. It locates the protracted transition process in the immediate post-independence exclusionary politics along ethnic lines and the resultant fall out among the political elite. The thesis presents ethnicity as a lived experience that had politicised Kenya's multiethnic society. The centrality of ethnicity in Kenyans' lives is testified to by the views by respondents from a mosaic of ethnic, social economic and political strata.

DECLARATION

I declare that this research report is my own unaided work. I submit it for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any other degree or examination in any other university.

_____ (Signature of Candidate)

_____ Day of, _____ 2012

DEDICATION

To my mother, Sophia Ayuma.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I wish to thank the University of the Witwatersrand for financial support through the post graduate merit award and the Andrew Mellon Mentoring Scholarship. I am also thankful for a Doctoral Research Award jointly administered by the University for Peace (UPEACE), Addis Ababa and International Development Research Centre (IDRC).

I would like to register my gratitude with my entire family foremost my mother, Sophia Ayuma, my father, Charles Kwatemba, my siblings, Boniface, the departed ones, Timothy and Consolata (may their souls rest in peace), James, Hillary, Sr Wilkister, Violet and my nieces and nephews. I thank you all for your guidance, invaluable support, according me a sense of belonging and for believing in me! I am indebted to my departed beneficiary, spiritual and moral guide, Fr Peter. Fr, I was touched by your priesthood! 'Be a good boy so that Father I can be proud of you,' you would exhort. I thank His Lordship Bishop Maurice Muhatia and the St Thomas Aquinas Seminary fraternity for the hospitality during my field research. Bishop, you are a great servant of the Lord. I cherish you as my teacher, brother and 'colleague'. I extend thanks to Julius Odemba, JM Kariuki, Patrick Machanja, Sheila Bosire, and Kennedy Onzere for helping me locate the respondents. I thank the staff at the Kenya National Archives for their assistance. I am greatly grateful to all my interviewees for their cooperation. I am sincerely thankful to my friend, Tshegofatso Dire for her moral and intellectual support. She kept asking, 'How is your book coming?'

I am grateful to the entire staff of Political Studies Department. I wish to mention Gillian Renshaw, the Administrator and her predecessor, Magda Gale, for their invaluable assistance. I thank my former colleagues at the Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation (CSVR) in Johannesburg for their encouragement as I juggled my research and internship. I am particularly indebted to Bra (brother) Richard Smith for both professional and moral support. I am immensely grateful to Prof Sekiba Lekgoathi for his insightful comments on my proposal. I am highly indebted to Prof Gilbert Khadiagala for guiding me through the corpus of literature on Kenya's politics. Prof, I cannot afford to quantify the epistemological insights and support I received from you! It would be remiss of me not to mention Prof Sheila Meintjes, my supervisor and mentor. Her invaluable and holistic assistance, guidance, mentorship, patience and incisive critique were indispensable to my completing this thesis. Prof, you are a quintessential teacher. I could not thank you well enough!

ABBREVIATIONS

AU	African Union
BBC	British Broadcasting Corporation
CCC	Coalition for Commonsense Constitution
CDF	Constituency Development Fund
CIC	Constitution Implementation Committee
CIPEV	Commission of Inquiry into Post-Election Violence
CKRC	Constitution of Kenya Review Commission
CNC	Coalition for National Convention
CoE	Committee of Experts
COTU	Central Organisation of Trade Unions
CPDSG	Central Province Development Support Group
DP	Democratic Party of Kenya
ECK	Electoral Commission of Kenya
EISA	Electoral Institute for Sustainable Democracy in Africa
EU EOM	European Union Election Observer Mission
FORD	Forum for the Restoration of Democracy
FORD-A	Forum for the Restoration of Democracy -Asili
FORD-K	Forum for the Restoration of Democracy- Kenya
FORD-P	Forum for the Restoration of Democracy - People
FPTP	first-past-the-post
GEMA	Gikuyu, Meru and Embu
GNU	Government of National Unity
HRW	Human Rights Watch
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICG	International Crisis Group
IEBC	Independent Electoral Boundaries Commission
IIBRC	Interim Independent Boundaries Review Commission
IIEC	Interim Independent Electoral Commission
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IPPG	Inter-Parties Parliamentary Group
IREC	Independent Review Commission
JKIA	Jomo Kenyatta International Airport
JSC	Judicial Service Commission

KADU	Kenya African Democratic Union
KAMATUSA	Kalenjin, Maasai, Turkana and Samburu
KANU	Kenya African National Union
KBC	Kenya Broadcasting Corporation
KENDA	Kenya National Democratic Alliance
KHRC	Kenya Human Rights Commission
KICC	Kenyatta International Conference Centre
KLA	Kenya Land Alliance
KNCHR	Kenya National Commission on Human Rights
KPLC	Kenya Power & Lighting Company
KPU	Kenya People's Union
Legco	Legislative Council
LDP	Liberal Democratic Party
NAC	National Alliance for Change
NCA	National Convention Assembly
NCC	National Constitutional Conference
NCEC	National Convention Executive Council
NCIC	National Cohesion and Integration Commission
NAK	National Alliance Party of Kenya
NARC	National Rainbow Coalition
NDP	National Development Party of Kenya
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MP	Member of Parliament
ODM-K	Orange Democratic Movement- Kenya
ODM	Orange Democratic Movement
OMCT	World Organisation against Torture
PCK	People's Commission of Kenya
PNU	Party of National Unity
PSC	Public Service Commission
RPP	Release Political Prisoners
SID	Society for International Development
SDP	Social Democratic Party
SMD	single-member districts
TJRC	Truth, Justice and Reconciliation Commission

US	United States
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
YK '92	Youth for KANU '92

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ii
Declaration iii
Dedication iv
Acknowledgements v
Abbreviations vi
Table of Contents ix
List of Tables xiii

Chapter One: Introduction 1
1.1. Ethnicity in Politics in Kenya 2
1.2. Political Party Formation: The Background 7
1.3. Political Parties in the 2007 Elections 11
1.4. Big Man Politics and Political Parties 14
1.5. Explaining the Salience of Ethnicity in Kenya's Multiparty Politics 18
1.6. Why the absence of Class-based Politics? 21
1.7. Thesis Aims and Objectives 22
1.8. Rationale 23
1.9. Methodology 24
1.10. Data Collection 24
1.10.1 Primary Sources 24
1.10.1.1 Presidential Speeches 25
1.10.1.2 The Constitution 25
1.10.1.3 Interviews 25
1.10.1.3.1 Politicians/Hansard 26
1.10.1.3.2 Teachers 27
1.10.1.3.3 Youth 27
1.10.1.3.4 Religious Leaders 27
1.11. Sample size 27
1.12. Secondary Sources 28
1.12.1. Internet Sources 28
1.12.2. Reports 28
1.12.3. Newspapers, *The Weekly Review* and Video 29
1.13. Ethical Questions 30
1.14 Chapter Synopses 31
1.14.1 Chapters One: Introduction 31
1.14.2 Chapter Two: Literature review, Ethnicity, Tribalism and Electoral Politics 31
1.14.3 Chapter Three: *Nyayoism*: The Epitome of Big Man Politics 32
1.14.4 Chapter Four: Kenya's Transition without Transformation 32
1.12.5 Chapter Five: The *Jogoo-Tinga* Duel and Moi Succession 33
1.14.6 Chapter Six: 'Everything is Possible without Moi' 33
1.14.7 Chapter Seven: The 2007 Elections: A Moment of Democratic Reversal 34
1.14.8 Chapter Eight: Reform and Kenya's Post 2007 Political Stability 35
1.14.9 Chapter Nine: Conclusion 35

Chapter Two: Literature Review, Ethnicity, Tribalism & Electoral Politics 36
2.1 Introduction 36
2.2 Definition of Concepts 37
2.2.1 Ethnic Group 37
2.2.2 Tribalism 38

2.2.3 Ethnicity....39
2.3 Electoral Politics: The Electoral System....46
2.4 Influence of Ethnicity, Tribe & Party Politics....50
2.5 The Politics of Patronage....58
2.6 Conclusion....60

Chapter Three: *Nyayoism*: The Epitome of Big Man Politics....62
3.1 Introduction....62
3.2 Manifestation of Ethnicity....63
3.3 Personal Rule....64
3.4 The *Nyayo* Era....67
3.5 Deft Manipulation of Ethnicity....73
3.6 Personality Cult....74
3.7 Moi and the Education System....77
3.8 Land Politics in the Rift Valley....79
3.9 The Making of the Big Man....82
3.10 The Abortive 1982 Coup....84
3.11 The *De Jure* one Party State....86
3.12 A Travesty of Democracy....88
3.13 Fractious Opposition Politics....91
3.14 *Nyayoism* & Multiparty Politics....92
3.15 Repeal of Section 2A of the Constitution....93
3.16 A Conclusion....94

Chapter Four: Kenya's Transition without Transformation....96
4.1 Introduction....96
4.2 The Forum for the Restoration of Democracy (FORD)....98
4.3 The Logic of Tribal politics....104
4.4 Analysis of the 1992 Results....106
4.5 State Sponsored Tribal Violence....109
4.6 Odds stacked against the opposition parties....113
4.7 Politics of Cooperation for Development....117
4.8 Moi-Oginga Odinga entente....118
4.9 GEMA/KAMATUSA alliance....121
4.10 The National Development Party of Kenya (NDP)....123
4.11 The FORD-Asili Woes....126
4.12 Beyond Tribal politics?....127
4.13 No Reforms, No Elections....129
4.14 The Opposition as 'Replicas of KANU'....130
4.15 Conclusion....131

Chapter Five: The *Jogoo-Tinga* Duel and Moi Succession....133
5.1. Introduction....133
5.2. Overview of the 1997 Elections....134
5.3 The Norfolk Hotel and (Dis) unity in Defeat....136
5.4 Who betrayed whom?....138
5.5 Raila Odinga's New Found Bipartisanship....139
5.6 KANU-NDP Co-operation....140
5.7 The Merger....146
5.8 Succession Manoeuvres....148

5.9 KANU's Waterloo 149
5.10 A Rainbow of Tribes 152
5.11 Elusive Opposition Unity: Third Time Lucky 153
5.12 Raila Odinga, the King-maker 155
5.13 Conclusion 156

Chapter Six: 'Everything is Possible without Moi' 158
6.1 Introduction 158
6.2 Mt Kenya Mafia 159
6.3 NARC: Was it a Replica of KANU? 161
6.4 Kenya: The Bastion of Stability? 168
6.5 Yet another False Start 170
6.6 NARC's Internal Contradictions 172
6.7 Demagogic Pledges & Recrudescence of Corruption 176
6.8 Tribal Big Men & NARC Win 178
6.9 The 2005 Constitutional Referendum 180
6.10 NARC Fallout & the 2007 Elections 183
6.11 Conclusion 184

Chapter Seven: The 2007 Elections: A Moment of Democratic Reversal 186
7.1 Introduction 186
7.2 The Big Two Political Parties 187
7.3 The Fusion between Politics and the Economy 191
7.4 The Media & the 2007 Elections 192
7.5 Watershed Elections 194
7.6 The Narrative of the 2007 Elections 196
7.7 The Controversial Declaration 198
7.8 The Eruption of Violence 199
7.9 Shoot-to-Kill Order 200
7.10 Weak Institutions, Polarisation & AU Intervention 202
7.11 (Mis) Trust and Coalition Politics in Kenya 205
7.12 Views from the ground – Ethnicity, Poverty, Corruption, Big Men, Gender, Land, Origins, Witchcraft and Impunity 206
7.12.1 Instrumentalisation of Ethnicity 206
7.12.2 Poverty and the Tribal link 207
7.12.3 Corruption and Political Instability 211
7.12.4 Living Large 214
7.12.5 Land and Tribal Violence 217
7.12.6 Where do you originally come from? The Significance of belonging 219
7.12.7 'The Kikuyu Problem' 221
7.12.8 Witchcraft, Livestock & Clashes in Sondu 225
7.12.9 Impunity and the 2007 Elections 228
7.12.10 Resources and Politics of Eating in Kenya 233
7.12.11 The Constitution and Political Renewal 237
7.12.12 Cynicism about the Coalition Government 239
7.12.13 Dynastic Leadership Successions 240
7.12.14 Opportunism in Kenya's Politics 245
7.12.15 Women as Honorary Men 246
7.13 Conclusion 247

Chapter Eight: Reform and Kenya's Political Stability 249
8.1 Introduction.....249
8.2 Background to the Constitutional Review Process.....250
8.3 Civil Society and the Model Constitution 255
8.4. Inter-Parties Parliamentary Group (IPPG) Minimum Reforms 257
8.5 Tribalism and Self Interest beneath the Idiom of Reforms.....258
8.6 The Constitution of Kenya Review Commission (CKRC).....260
8.7 The National Constitutional Conference (NCC) 261
8.8 NARC and the Constitution Review: A Sense of Déjà vu 262
8.9 The National Accord.....264
8.10 The Constitutional Interpretation of the National Accord 266
8.11 The New Constitutional Dispensation 270
8.12 Institutional, Legal and Constitutional Reforms 272
8.13 Challenges to the Coalition Government 279
8.14 Conclusion 286

Chapter Nine: Conclusion.....288

Appendix One.....302
Appendix Two 303

Bibliography.....304
Books & Book Chapters 304
Journals 311
Reports.....318
Newspapers.....322
Presidential Speeches.....333
Videos 334
Interviews 335

List of Tables

1. Kikuyu Constituency Elections in 1992 105
2. The 1992 Parliamentary Election Results.....106
3. Presidential Results in 1992 General Elections by Province 108
4. Summary of the Parliamentary and Presidential Voting in 1992 109
5. Results of Kenya's General Elections, 1997 116
6. Presidential Vote Distribution in Kenya's 1992 and 1997 Elections 117
7. 2002 Presidential Votes by Province 179