Abstract

The purpose of the study is to investigate what evidence there is to determine the impact of minimum wage hike on employment in the textile industry in Swaziland from the qualitative perspective.

The research set to establish that minimum wage increases on employment has far reaching influence than what most findings from quantitative studies have suggested. These studies have tended to undermine the impact of statutory wage increases as perceived by the target employee categories and other stakeholders themselves in the textile industry.

The research involved an extensive review of related literature on the subject. Although the existing literature is predominantly of a quantitative nature, it however, did provide a theoretical framework for this study. Qualitative research was then carried out at two textile firms in the Matsapha Industrial Area viz.: Tuntex (Pty) Ltd. and Tex Ray (Pty) Ltd. which predominantly took the form of interviews, although other methods such as the questionnaire and other data collecting methods were also used.

The research revealed that, while most findings of the quantitative research were valid, others had some flaws or weaknesses which called for further research of a qualitative nature in order to take into account even those factors that were often ignored in those studies such as the perceptions of target employee categories and other stakeholders of the minimum wage legislation, their feelings and interpretations of the operation of this policy tool.

The results of the study indeed answered the initial research question, "What impact does minimum wage hike have on employment in the textile industry?"

The study revealed that labour market forces do not operate in a vacuum, but in a context where other factors also operate, and that in order to get results that are nearer the truth, these factors should be taken into consideration in carrying out future research on the topic of this study.

Declaration

I declare that this report is my own, unaided work. It is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Management (in the field of Public and Development Management) of the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other University.

……..
Sipho Ndzimandze Ndzimandze
30 April, 2007

Acknowledgements

I wish to express my appreciation of the cooperation and assistance I received from a number of people while carrying out this research whom I cannot afford to mention individually by name here.

However, my particular gratitude goes to the General Managers of Tuntex (Pty) Ltd and Tex Ray (Pty) Ltd respectively for granting me permission to interview their staff within their busy work schedules. I must acknowledge in particular the role played by the Human Resources Managers, Messrs Zwide Mkhatswa and Leonard Dlamini of Tuntex and Tex Ray respectively for all the arrangements each one of them made, and the support each afforded me before and during the interviews.

I cannot leave out recording my sincere thanks to all those I interviewed - employers' and employees' representatives of the two firms and the Secretary General of the Swaziland Manufacturing and Allied Workers' Union (SMAWU), Mr. Sipho Mamba for all the cooperation and help I received from them during the interviews.

My thanks also go to the South African High Commission in Mbabane particularly the Counselor, Mr. Lucas Mokwena for sorting out a study permit problem I had encountered which negatively impacted on the progress of the research.

I would also like to thank most sincerely my Supervisor, Professor Jahed Mohammed for agreeing to supervise my work, and also to record that had it not been with his guidance, this report would not be what it is.

Table of Contents

List of Tables..... vi
List of Figures..... vii

Chapter 1. Introduction..... 1

1.1 Background to the Research..... 1
1.2 Problem Statement..... 4
1.3 Purpose of the Study..... 6
1.4 Significance of the Study..... 7
1.5 Organisation of the Report..... 8
1.6 Definition of Terms..... 10
1.7 Delimitation of Scope of the Research..... 13
1.8 Chapter Summary..... 14

Chapter 2. Literature Review..... 15

2.1 Introduction..... 15
2.2 Brief History of the Minimum Wage Legislation..... 16
2.3 Review Overview..... 18
2.4 Rationale for Minimum Wage Legislation in the Labour Market 20
2.5 Wage Differentiation Criteria.....24
2.5.1 By National/Countrywide Coverage..... 25
2.5.2 By Sectoral (Industrial) Coverage..... 26
2.5.3 By Age..... 27
2.5.4 By Gender..... 29
2.5.5 By Location of Industry or Individual Firm..... 30
2.6 Minimum Wage Fixing Machineries and Minimum Wage Determination..... 31
2.7 Enforcement of Minimum Wage Legislation..... 32
2.8 Dominant Labour Market Models (Theories) on the Linkage of Minimum Wages and Employment..... 33
2.8.1 The Competitive Labour Market (The Neoclassical) Model 33
2.8.1.1 The Substitution Effect..... 36
2.8.1.2 The Scale Effect..... 37
2.8.1.3 Who Bears the Costs (Spill-over Effects) of Minimum Wage Increases as a Result of Factor Substitution?..... 37
2.8.1.4 New Versions of the Competitive Model..... 40
(i) Two- Sector Model..... 40
(ii) Two-Sector Model with Queuing for Covered-Sector Jobs. 41
2.8.1.5 Determinants of the Elasticity of Labour Demand 42
(a) The substitutability of the labour force..... 42
(b) Countrywide minimum wage legislation..... 42
(c) Compliance with the minimum wage legislation by all employers in the country..... 43

(d) Employers having no power or influence on wages..... 43
2.8.2 The Alternative Models (Theories)..... 43
2.8.2.1 The Monopsonistic Models..... 45
2.8.2.2 The Efficiency Wage Theories..... 47
2.8.2.3 Factors Favourably Influencing the Predictions of the Alternative Labour Market Models..... 49
2.8.3 The Most Vulnerable Employee Groups to the Spill-over Effects of Minimum Wage Legislation..... 50
2.8.3.1 The Unskilled and Semi-Skilled Employees..... 50
2.8.3.2 Teenagers..... 51
2.8.3.3 Women..... 52
2.8.3.4 Disabled..... 53
2.8.4 Critique (Evaluation) of the Literature..... 53
2.8.4.1 Research Methods Used..... 53
2.8.4.2 Quality of Findings and Conclusions..... 54
2.8.4.3 Strengths of both the Competitive and Alternative Labour Market Models..... 55
2.8.4.4 Strengths of the Competitive Labour Market Model..... 55
2.8.4.5 Weaknesses of the Competitive Labour Market Model..... 55
2.8.4.6 Strengths of the Alternative Labour Market Models..... 56
2.8.4.7 Weaknesses of the Alternative Labour Market Models (As portrayed by the Card and Krueger Studies)..... 57
2.8.5 Gaps in the Minimum Wage Literature..... 61
2.8.6 Best Practices from the Literature..... 64
2.8.7 What the Literature has Meant for the Research..... 66
2.8.8 Chapter Summary..... 69

Chapter 3. Methodology..... 72

3.1 Introduction..... 72
3.2 Justification of the Qualitative Research Method..... 72
3.3 Reasons for Choosing the Purposive Sampling Method..... 73
3.4 Criteria for Selection of Subjects..... 74
3.5 Mode and Means of Data Collection (Instrumentation)..... 75
3.5.1 Personal Interviews..... 75
3.5.2 Questionnaire..... 76
3.5.3 Review of Related Literature..... 77
3.5.4 Non-Participant Observation..... 77
3.5.5 Triangulation..... 78
3.6 Research Strategy..... 78
3.6.1 The Nature of the Research Problem and Question..... 78
3.6.2 Skills of the Researcher..... 79
3.6.3 Resources..... 80
3.6.3.1 Costs Involved in Carrying out the Research..... 80
3.6.3.2 Time Spent in Carrying out and Finishing the Research..... 81
3.7 Limitations of the Research..... 83
3.8 Validity of the Research..... 84

3.9 Ethical Issues..... 84
3.10 Chapter Summary..... 85

Chapter 4. Presentation of Research Results and Analysis.....87

4.1 Introduction..... 87

4.2 Tools, Form of Data Analysis and Presentation of Results.....87
4.3 Discussion of the Findings and how they fit in the Body of Knowledge.....109

Chapter 5. Conclusions and Recommendations..... 113

References..... 118

Appendixes..... 131

Appendix I Minimum Wage Increases Trend in Textile Firms in the Manufacturing and Processing Industry in Swaziland (2000-2004)
Appendix II Questionnaire (Minimum Wages and Employment in the Textile Industry

List of Tables

Table I	Summary of the Obtaining Models (Theories) and Their Predictions on the Minimum Wage-Employment/ Unemployment Correlation……	52
Table II	Illustration of the Card and Krueger versus the Neumark and Wascher Findings……	61
Table III	Gantt chart Showing the Research Progress Time Distribution……	82
Table IV	Identification of Statements, Phrases, Sentences that each Reflects a Single Specific Thought Relevant to the Research Question with Numerical Codes……	86
Table V	Coding of Interviewees' Categories……	94

List of Figures

Figure I	Model of the Chapters of the Report	10
Figure II	The Competitive Labour Market Model	34
Figure III	Some Employer Options in Response to a Minimum Wage Rise and Costs Incurred (Directly or Indirectly) in the Process and their Bearers	39
Figure IV	The Monopsonistic Labour Market Models	46

ABREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

EFILWC	European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions
ILMPE	Institute of Labour Market Policy Evaluation
ILO	International Labour Organisation
MRP	Marginal revenue product
NCPA	National Centre for Policy Analysis
NEC	National Economic Council
NPM	New public management
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
SMAWU	Swaziland Manufacturing and Allied Workers Union
STEA	Swaziland Textile Exporters Association
WTO	World Trade Organisation