

# **Exploring connections between mathematics and Arts and Culture:**

## **A case study involving two Grade 9 Arts and Culture teachers.**

**Jabulane Dhlamini**

**Student Number: 9401961W**

**Supervisor: Prof. Willy Mwakapenda**

**A research report submitted to the School of Science Education in the Faculty of Science, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science.**

**Johannesburg, 2009**

## **Declaration**

**I declare that this research report is my own unaided work. It is being submitted for the degree of Master of Science in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other university.**

---

**Jabulane Dhlamini**

\_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2009

## **Epigraph**

“Transferability of skills from one context to the next depends on factors such as the number of symbolic components that are shared,…”

**Anderson, J., Reder, L., and Simon, H. (1996)**

## **Abstract**

This report presents results of an empirical study which investigated how two grade 9 Arts and Culture teachers incorporated mathematics in their Arts and Culture lessons in their classrooms in South Africa. The study was implemented through concept mapping activities undertaken by these Arts and Culture teachers. Data was collected from these concept mapping activities and follow-up interviews with teachers. The analysis of the collected data revealed that teachers grapple with the notion of integration, particularly, when it comes to the transfer knowledge and skills across different learning contexts. Lack of proper training, insufficient teacher knowledge and inadequate support from curriculum designers seem to be the most inhibiting factors for teachers to navigate successfully through the notion of integrated teaching and learning. However, in a bid to deal with these new pedagogical challenges, it was observed that teachers resort to other forms of integration, such as relying on students in order to forge links between subjects of learning. The analysis of data from this study raised important pedagogical issues about the link between integrated teaching and teacher content knowledge, and the apparent need for teachers to transform their identities.

Drawing from the theory of situated learning, this study has argued that, although integration between fields of learning is desirable in teaching and learning, it is highly problematic in actual practice. For instance, through this study, it was observed that Arts and Culture teachers struggle to use their knowledge of Arts and Culture and mathematics in order to forge connections between the two fields of learning. The study has also drawn from Bernstein's theoretical constructs in order to argue that teachers, particularly those in different learning fields like Arts and Culture and mathematics, intuitively possess different 'pedagogical codes' which account for their inability to negotiate meaning across different learning contexts.

Finally, the study has explored and exploited the argument presented through the van Hiele's theoretical framework that students turn to progress quicker in geometry (mathematics) when learning takes place in different styles. I have subsequently used this theoretical framework to argue that connections between Arts and Culture and mathematics should be encouraged at school level, as Arts and Culture could provide an exciting pedagogical environment for the teaching and learning of mathematics, which is often construed to be abstract.

# **Keywords**

**Integration**

**Connections**

**Links**

**Mathematics**

**Arts and Culture**

**Context**

# **Dedication**

**To  
my wife Lillian  
and our three sons  
Musa, Andile and Banele**

## Acknowledgements

I feel deeply indebted to the following people:

Special thanks to my wife, Lillian. I cannot thank you enough for what you have done to me. You are really a partner in love. You are such an incredible woman and God could not have chosen a better wife for me; thank you my love.

To my three sons, Musa, Andile and Banele. Musa, you have always been a studying partner to me. I will always remember those nights during which we both burnt the midnight oil. I thank you guys, and I dedicate this project to you with all my heart.

To my parents, Jeremiah and Elizabeth. Once again, thank you for teaching me to believe in myself. I strongly believe that you are the reason for my success. I will always love you.

To my only sister, Florence and her family. Thanks “Sis” for your advice and encouragement, especially when it seemed I was ‘walking a tight rope’. You have always made me believe that nothing is impossible.

To my three brothers, Sphiwe, Mbuso, Sibusiso and their families. Guys, you have made me realized that brotherhood could be the strongest foundation on which one can build love and security. You have all given me the strength to do what I can do.

To my lecturer and project supervisor, Prof. Willy Mwakapenda. Truly, words will always not be enough to express my sincere gratitude to you, Willy. I really thank you for your steadfast support and continued guidance; and also for steering this ship through even the choppiest waters, you are such an enviable mentor. Indeed, working with you was such a rewarding experience. Your immense knowledge and amazing wisdom has never ceased to perplex me, you cut a picture of a great philosopher! Honestly, I will never forget you.

To all the teachers who participated in this project. Guys, I have learnt so many things from you. I will always feel so much indebted to all of you. You have played a critical and decisive role towards the success of this project. Thank you so much guys.

To my principal, Mr Gibson Z. Somakahle. “Bra Gibs”, thank you for your support and understanding of what appeared to be an awkward and crazy situation. My studies interfered with my professional duties, many a times, however, you willingly continued to give me the benefit of the doubt, thank you sir.

To all my colleagues at my school, particular Mr Zendra Khanyile, who willingly offered his expert views on this project; Ms Nyane Msiza (Makza), for always inspiring me to study further. To my friend, Mr Billy Mashiyane, who is always there for me; a man with an amazingly big heart; my friend, I feel hugely indebted to you.

Lastly, but not least. My heartfelt gratitude goes to my three sisters at work. Ntsibiseng, Joyce and Esther. Guys, you encouraged me and always said “*kuzophela my brother*”, and indeed, now it’s over. Truly, these words inspired me not to give in. Thank you sisters, and I will always hold you dearest in my memory.

## List of figures

Figure	Page
<b>Figure 1:</b> Quilts by Gerda de Vries: paper spiral by Bradford Hansen Smith.	14
<b>Figure 2:</b> Two hyperbolic tessellations: Irene Rousseau and Mary Williams.	14
<b>Figure 3:</b> Situated theory within a school and subject context.	21
<b>Figure 4:</b> One of teachers' concept maps during the pilot study.	57
<b>Figure 5:</b> The analysis and interpretation of the data in chapter 5.	71

## List of Tables

Table	Page
<b>Table 3.1:</b> The relationship between research questions (objectives), interview questions and typologies.	37
<b>Table 3.2:</b> Analytical tool used to analyse the grade 9 arts and Culture curriculum document.	38
<b>Table 3.3:</b> Evaluative tool for mathematical demands in the grade 9 Arts and Culture curriculum.	40
<b>Table 4.1:</b> Data collected for the first aspect of focus.	47
<b>Table 4.1.1:</b> Types of connections depicted on the grade 9 Arts and Culture curriculum document and the ratio of their occurrences.	48
<b>Table 4.1.2:</b> AC-MAT connections.	49
<b>Table 4.2:</b> Documents' guidelines to Arts and Culture teachers on integration.	50
<b>Table 4.3:</b> Document's teacher-support on integration.	50
<b>Table 4.4:</b> Document's intentions to encourage teachers on integrated teaching.	52
<b>Table 4.5:</b> Participating teachers' background.	55
<b>Table 4.6:</b> The summary of research questions and objectives and how they were addressed.	59
<b>Table 5.1:</b> Types of integration in the grade 9 Arts and Culture document.	74
<b>Table 5.2:</b> The nature of AC-MAT connections in the grade 9 Arts and Culture document.	75
<b>Table 5.3:</b> Nature of integration in the Arts and Culture curriculum document.	78
<b>Table 5.4:</b> Information on teacher-support on integration.	80
<b>Table 5.5:</b> Document's support on Arts and Culture teachers regarding integration.	81
<b>Table 5.6:</b> Concept map from teacher one (pilot).	85
<b>Table 5.7:</b> Concept map from teacher two (pilot).	86
<b>Table 5.8:</b> Concept map results for teacher one (main).	88
<b>Table 5.9:</b> Concept map results for teacher two (main).	89
<b>Table 5.10:</b> Interview questions and their subsequent typologies.	96
<b>Table 5.11:</b> A justification for questions asked in the interviews.	97
<b>Table 5.12:</b> Colour coding system used for typological analysis.	99
<b>Table 5.13:</b> Teachers' responses for each category.	100
<b>Table 5.14:</b> Categories and teachers' actual responses.	100

## List of Appendices

Appendix	Page
<b>Appendix I</b> : Concept mapping activity: grade 9 Arts and Culture teachers.	134
<b>Appendix II</b> : Grade 9 Arts and Culture activity for a grade 9 mathematics teacher.	135
<b>Appendix III</b> : Interview key (structured) questions: Main study.	136
<b>Appendix IV</b> : Concept map: Teacher one (piloted study).	137
<b>Appendix V</b> : Concept map: Teacher two (Ms Sibanyoni): Piloted study.	138
<b>Appendix VI</b> : Concept map: Teacher three (Mr Nkosi): Main study.	139
<b>Appendix VII</b> : Concept map: Teacher four (Mr Mokoena): Main study.	140
<b>Appendix VIII</b> : Teacher's comments: Teacher one (piloted study).	141
<b>Appendix IX</b> : Teacher's comments: Teacher two (main study).	142
<b>Appendix X</b> : Grade 9 mathematics teacher's mindmap: Teacher two (main study).	143
<b>Appendix XI</b> : Teacher's interview transcript: Teacher two (piloted study).	144
<b>Appendix XII</b> : Teacher's interview transcript: Teacher one (main study).	149
<b>Appendix XIII</b> : Teacher's interview transcript: Teacher two (main study).	157
<b>Appendix XIV</b> : Pictures from Arts and Culture textbooks that Arts and Culture teachers referred to during the interviews.	165
<b>Appendix XV</b> : Samples of the colour coded analysis of the grade 9 mathematics and Arts and Culture teachers.	168
<b>Appendix XVI</b> : Consent letters: To the principal, and to the grade 9 mathematics and Arts and Culture teachers.	177
<b>Appendix XVII</b> : Consent forms: To the principal and to all the participating teachers.	180
<b>Appendix XVIII</b> : Letter of approval: University of the Witwatersrand - Ethical Committee.	181
<b>Appendix XIX</b> : Letter of approval: The Gauteng Department of Education (GDE).	182

# Acronyms

AC	Arts and Culture
AC-AC	Integration within Arts and Culture as a subject
AC-life	Integration of Arts and Culture with an out-of-school world
AC-MAT	Integration of Arts and Culture with mathematics
AC-real	Integration of Arts and Culture with an out-of-school world
AC-subject	Integration of with any other subject except mathematics
AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
AS	Assessment Standard
BA	Bachelor of Arts
BEd	Bachelor of Education
DoE	Department of Education and Training
et. al.	And other authors whose names are not mentioned
GDE	Gauteng Department of Education
GET	General Education and Training
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
Ibid.	Referring to the same previously quoted source
LO	Learning Outcome
MAT	Mathematics
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
OBE	Outcome Based Education
p.	Page
PTC	Primary Teachers' Course
RNCS	Revised National Curriculum Statement
RO	Research Objective
RQ	Research Question
SAARMSTE	Southern African Association for Research in Mathematics, Science and Technology Education
STD	Secondary Teacher's Diploma
2-D	Two-dimensional
3-D	Three-dimensional

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Content</b>	<b>Page</b>
<b>Title page</b>	(i)
<b>Declaration</b>	(ii)
<b>Epigraph</b>	(iii)
<b>Abstract</b>	(iv)
<b>Dedication</b>	(vi)
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	(vii)
<b>List of figures</b>	(viii)
<b>List of tables</b>	(ix)
<b>List of appendices</b>	(x)
<b>Acronyms</b>	(xi)
<b>Table of contents</b>	(xiii)

<b>CHAPTER ONE</b>	<b>: Contextual background of the study</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	General Introduction	1
1.2	Purpose and objectives of the study	2
1.2.1	Why this study	4
1.2.2	Why Arts and Culture	4
1.2.3	Why teachers	5
1.3	Significance of the study	6
1.4	Research question	7
1.5	My understanding of integration	7
1.6	Concerns and weaknesses of the study	8
1.7	Data Collection	9
1.7.1	Concept map	10
1.7.2	Interviews	10
1.7.3	Document analysis	10
1.8	Organisation of the study	10
<b>CHAPTER TWO</b>	<b>: Literature review and theoretical framework</b>	<b>12</b>
2.1	Introduction	12
2.2	Connection between mathematics and Arts and Culture	12
2.3	Identifying the gap	15
2.4	Positioning my study theoretically and methodologically	16
2.5	Theoretical framework	19
2.5.1	Theory of situated learning	19
2.5.2	Van Hiele's framework	22
2.5.3	Bernstein's theoretical constructs	24
2.5.3.1	Recognition rule	25
2.5.3.2	Realization rule	26
<b>CHAPTER THREE</b>	<b>: Research design and methodology</b>	<b>27</b>
3.1	Introduction	27

3.2 Why a qualitative study	28
3.3 Why a case study	29
3.4 The concept map	31
3.5 Reliability and validity	33
3.6 Interviews	34
3.7 Analytical tool	37
3.8 Piloting	38

<b>CHAPTER FOUR : Data collection</b>	43
4.1 Introduction	43
4.2 Ethical consideration	43
4.3 Document analysis	44
4.4 Two faces of the research	54
4.5 Concept maps	54
4.6 Interviews	58
4.6.1 Nature of interview questions	59
4.6.2 Information to participants	61
4.6.3 Piloting	62
4.6.4 Main study	63
4.6.5 Duration of the interviews	63
4.6.6 Teachers' responses	63
4.6.7 Research question one	64
4.7 Mathematics teachers' comments	66
4.8 Conclusion	68

<b>CHAPTER FIVE : Data Analysis and Interpretations</b>	69
5.1 Introduction	69
5.2 What is data analysis	70
5.2.1 When did the researcher start analysing the data	70
5.2.2 Data analysis process	70



5.7.2.5 Transferability of knowledge	116
5.7.2.6 Implications of these findings to the second research question (RQ2)	119
5.8 Overall impressions	120
5.9 Conclusion	122
<b>CHAPTER SIX : Discussions, conclusions and recommendations</b>	123
6.1 Introduction	123
6.2 First research question	124
6.3 Second research question	125
6.4 Research objectives	125
6.5 Benefits of integrated teaching	126
6.6 Recommendations	127
6.7 Conclusions	130
<b>References</b>	131
<b>Appendices</b>	134