

https://dspace.org/

Dr S. Modiri Molema (1891-1965) : The making of an historian

Starfield, Jane

2008-12-05T11:33:27Z
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/5872

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

CHAPTER THREE: "'SIDE BY SIDE ON THE BENCHES': MODIRI MOLEMA'S SCHOOL DAYS"[1]

> Finally, I may say that I am a member of the race whose life I have described in the following pages, kith and kin of the people whose story I am unfolding to the world.[2]

Dr Molema spent much of his writing life defining what being "a member of the race" meant to him. His assertive introduction to *The Bantu Past and Present* was written some ten years after his latter phase of schooling in the Eastern Cape. What he learned there, from teachers and classmates, helped to shape his intellectual outlook. In history lessons and student societies, he and his friends increasingly realised the importance of casting an historical gaze on the African past. Interestingly, many of his generation of African writers took upon themselves the difficult task of representing (or rather translating) African culture for English-speakers.[3]

Lovedale College, his second Eastern Cape school particularly encouraged scholars to subsume their ethnic differences in an all-embracing Africanness. According to Wells, biographer of James Stewart, Lovedale's second principal: "[t]he fact that the pupils at Lovedale belonged to various tribes, stimulated emulation among them, and purified and guided their racial jealousies".[4] Stewart also promoted notions of racial equality at Lovedale, educating white and black students side-by-side. However, the inequality of opportunity in every sphere of activity *outside* the college meant that white Lovedale scholars attained the highest echelons, whereas blacks saw the ceiling on their employment opportunities descend, over the years. Wells found, during his 1905 visit to Lovedale that "[m]any white pupils have been educated at Lovedale, and not a few of them now occupy very important posts in South Africa. The natives and the whites have the same education within their reach".[5]

To understand *The Bantu* and its reception, it is necessary to explore and, indeed, (re)construct, elements of his "biography", as Foucault suggests:

> [t]he author explains the presence of certain events within a text, as well as their transformations, distortions, and their various modifications (and this through an author's biography or by reference to his particular point of view, in the analysis of his social preferences and his position within a class or by delineating his fundamental objectives).[6]

This exploration aims to provide an amplified understanding of Molema's aims and, in later chapters, explain the blunted, racially-loaded readings Molema's historical work has received. The underlying epistemology of his texts has puzzled historians so, that many exclude him from their professional fraternity, rendering his somewhat dissenting voice inaudible.[7] Indeed, it is only in the forthcoming

---

[1] Molema, 1920: 302.

[2] Molema, 1920: viii.

[3] Molema's generation inherited this task from the relatively small number of writers of the preceding generation, Tiyo Soga and JT Jabavu. Molema's contemporaries as writers (though some were his seniors in years) included AK Soga, Magema Fuze and JT Jabavu. (See Bibliography, *infra*.)

[4] James Wells, 1919. *Stewart of Lovedale: The Life of Dr James Stewart*. (London: Hodder & Stoughton), p.362.

[5] Wells, 1919: 189.

[6] In "What is an Author?" (In Boucher, 1977: 128), Michel Foucault used "author function" to disaggregate the text from its narrative persona.

[7] Dubow (1995: 72-73) mentioned Molema's dual purpose in narrating his own life and that of "'his people". In *Civilising Barbarians*. (JHB: WUP, 1996), p.113, Leon de Kock termed Molema's attitude to the British Empire ambiguous. Alan Cobley, 1990. *Class and Consciousness: The Black Petty Bourgeoisie in South Africa, 1924 to 1950*. (New York: Greenwood Press), pp. 59-60, did not engage with Molema's style or ideological affiliation.

Cambridge History of Africa (vol.1), that the editors include the contribution of Black intellectuals to the production of early twentieth-century history.[8]

Molema, his mentor Plaatje, and other ex-Lovedalians, DDT Jabavu and RV Selope Thema, were among the first African commentators to analyse colonial transformations in South Africa.[9] With some traditional oral historical genres and many South African and European secondary readings, Molema attacked authors who portrayed Africans prejudicially, as he saw it.[10] These readings spread negative intellectual and popular views about Africa, ideologies that helped to consolidate public policy. In *The Bantu*, Molema entered the discourses that mediated the domination of Africans. ZK Matthews grasped that process when he stated that the colour of South African history was decidedly white.[11] Even liberal Lovedale's syllabi favoured English history over South African: Ransome's *History of England* featured prominently beside Whiteside's *South Africa*, in years for which details survive.[12]

Questioning colonial historians' authoritative writings did not mean rejecting all they wrote, as Molema's academic reliance on Theal showed. When assessing Christian civilisation's benefits, Molema, Plaatje, the Jabavus and Thema usually agreed with their missionary tutors. Molema often used missionary sources as moral authorities in challenging negative versions of African history. To understand some of the missionary influence on Molema, this chapter returns, as far as documents allow, to his school days at two of the Cape's most prestigious missionary institutions.

Molema travelled widely in his formative years. The imposed distance between himself and Mafikeng during World War I was the chief impetus for his first work.[13] That journey gave him metaphorical and critical distance from South African society, its problems, and its place in the larger system of colonial domination. He traversed the world's polar opposites: from colonial margin to imperial metropolis, from parochial Mafikeng to the Empire's second city, Glasgow; from modernity's outskirts to one of its industrial hubs, where he assembled his analytical history of home. Chapters Three and Four explore the ways in which he accommodated these vastly differing experiences into his own worldview. His life up to embarkation at the Cape Town docks in April 1914 prepared him for the journey so far from home, yet brought him to a major reconsideration of what civilisation and Africa meant.

"Children in the Family": Reconstructing an Ethnographer's Childhood:[14]

Seetsele Modiri Molema, firstborn son of Silas Thelesho and his wife Molalanyane Choele, was born in February 1891, almost nine years after his grandfather, Chief Molema's death. His parents' choice of first name made reference to the silent man of Molema history: Chief Tawana's own eldest son,

8 Carolyn Hamilton, Bernard Mbenga, Robert Ross (eds), 2005. *Cambridge History of South Africa*, v.1, (to c.1886), "Editors' Prefatory Essay" (preliminary version), p.37. This essay is still in draft form.

9 Thema's eminently readable book-length unpublished autobiography is: "From Cattleherd to Editor's Chair" (1935), (Archived with the Molema Papers, Institute of Commonwealth Studies, London University).

10 For a facsimile of *The Bantu*'s bibliography, see Appendix C, *infra*. On his use of traditional songs, see Molema, 1920: 42, 47, 159-60 (all poetry), and 39, 48, 57, 388-89 (genealogies).

11 Matthews (1958 & 1981: 58): "*[o]ur* history as *we* had absorbed it bore no resemblance to South African history as it had been written by European scholars, or as it is taught in South African schools, and as it was taught to us at Fort Hare. The European insisted that we accept his version of the past and what is more, if we wanted to get ahead educationally, even to pass examinations in the subject as he presents it".

12 RU, Lovedale Papers [LP], Lovedale Missionary Institution Academic Records [LMIAR], Lovedale Roll of Classes [ROC]: 1900, p.8, 1901, p.8, 1902, pp.38-39, 52, 1904, pp.16-17: during these years, Modiri's sister, Seleje, and their "cousin" (brother, in Setswana) Sebopiwa, attended Lovedale. According to the sketchy bibliographical details in the Lovedale Records, the textbooks may have been Cyril Ransome & H Dyke Acland, 1882 & 1901. *A Handbook in outline of the political history of England to 1881/1901*. (London: Rivingtons) and Joseph Whiteside, 1915. *A New School History of South Africa with brief biographies and examination questions*. (Cape Town: Juta). He also authored a history of the Wesleyan Methodists in South Africa.

13 Molema (1920: vii) wrote in paragraph two of the Preface: "The Great War is quoted to explain everything".

14 This is the title of one of Dr Molema's essays, UNISA, M842, Dr SM Molema Papers, [microfilm) 2:XM118: 77/8: 1/42: SM Molema, "Children in the Family", [cited as Molema, "Children in the Family"].

Seetsela, slain in battle against the Hurutshe.[15] Seetsela represented the claims of Tawana's children in his own name — the elder brothers displaced from the succession by Montshiwa and other children whom Tawana fathered in his late brother Tau's name.[16] It seems that Molema's heirs remained mindful of the likelihood that, had Tawana not raised "his brother's" family, or had he counted them his own children, Seetsela or his descendants might have inherited the chieftaincy.

Two of Tawana's sons "attempted to keep their brother's fire burning".[17] Tlala had wed Seetsela's first wife, Nkhabele, whose son by Seetsela, Tshipinare, would have been counted Tlala's son, had Seleka Chief Moroka II not adopted him as his heir. Molema was the second Tawana brother to perform *seantlho* for Seetsela. He married Baetlhoi Lekoma, Seetsela's second widow. As Chapter One showed, *seantlho* could be a kingmaker, as in Montshiwa's case, or relegate one to *tónā* (headman) status, as in Molema's case. *His* offspring based claims to seniority in Tawana's second house on this marriage.[18]

The naming of a newborn child marks its entry into the social world. An infant's first experience of social being is within the family context — in the 1890s, a larger unit in Setswana communities than in *makgoa* or European families. Naming a child in a world caught between the competing pulls of Christian and Serolong cultural traditions was a complex social act. In chiefly families, like the Molemas, naming may have had political significance. The firstborn son in a chiefly family, particularly a monogamous one, is endowed not just with a significant name, but with the family's and the community's hopes: he ensures "the continuity of the father's lineage". Modiri was born in Mafikeng. Molalanyane Molema may have returned to her parents' at Setlagole for the birth of her first child, Seleje, as was the Setswana custom, but remained in Mafikeng for her first son's arrival.[19]

Did Silas hope to make a political point by naming his child after Seetsela, or were he and his wife showing respect to *rrémogólo*, his father's elder brother? They added to this name by which his eldest son was known in the family: "Modiri". In giving the baby two Setswana names, the Molemas departed from the naming practice that Chief Molema had established: adding a Christian or school name to the given Setswana name. Later in life, perhaps at school, Seetsela became "Silas", although it is also a mark of respect, in Tswana societies, to call a son by his father's name. Naming conventions among the Tswana had changed significantly since the start of "the linguistic colonialism of mission". According to "the Pauline model of conversion", the convert was born anew in Christ, acquiring a new name, which redefined the identities of colonised peoples, just as places were renamed.[20]

Perhaps Chief Molema had been ahead of other "Nonconformists" (the Methodists among the Southern Tswana). Whereas other newly-missionised communities in southern Africa might baptise their children with both an indigenous and a Christian name, the Southern Tswana "were not as immediately assertive in this respect as were some of their brethren elsewhere".[21] The Comaroffs observed,

---

[15] Molema, 1951: 149. See *supra*, p.52.

[16] On Tau, son of Tlhutlwa, see *supra*, p.49 and Table 2, p.44; also Appendix A — Genealogy, p.I, *infra*.

[17] For the meaning of this phrase, see Molema, 1966: 9, or *supra*, p.50.

[18] Molema, 1951: 30. Snyman et al. (1990: 189): "*tónā*" means bigness or importance. A minor chief may also be called "*kgosana*". Today, *tónā* (plur: *ditónā*) means cabinet ministers; the prime minister is *tónakgolo* See Appendix A — Genealogy, p.I, illustrating Tawana's four houses. Cf. *supra*, p.106 fn.34, for the slight variation "*ntona*".

[19] Virginia van der Vliet, "Growing up in Traditional Society". In WD Hammond-Tooke (ed), 1974. *The Bantu-speaking Peoples of Southern Afr*ica. (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul), p.212. This is a later edition of I Schapera (ed), 1937 & 1966. *The Bantu-Speaking Tribes of Southern Africa*. (Cape Town: Maskew Miller). *Molema, Johns Interview, 1964*, cited *supra*, p.42. Silas was called "Raseleye", after the birth of his first child, Seleje or Seleye. Cf. *supra*, p.138 fn.238.

[20] Appendix — Genealogy, pp.II & III: Silas' third son was named Sefetoge Silas. Comaroff & Comaroff, 1991: 219.

[21] Comaroff & Comaroff (1991: 219) cited Thomas O Beidelman, 1982. *Colonial Evangelism: A Socio-Historical Study of an East African Mission at the Grassroots*. (Bloomington: Indiana UP), p.139. Early Tswana converts bestowed Christian names on servants and "non-Tswana assistants".

> [t]he first generation of Tswana converts continued to be called by their Setswana designations…, these being single words, often comprised of verbs with pronominal prefixed and suffixed, describing the distinctive circumstances of birth of early childhood.[22]

Future ethnographer, Modiri and other relatives were known by names that inscribed the circumstances of birth, infancy or parental hopes for their children into their future identities. Sometimes names might seem oddly prophetic: in the 1910s' heated chiefly struggles, the contentious plans Chief Lekoko had for Lotlamoreng were perhaps embodied in his name's meaning: "'What will you [pl.] do with him?'" Modiri's name derived from the verb "*go dira*" meaning "to do, make, perform or cause to happen". Its root is the noun *tirō*" (work). "Mo-*diri*" is one of the nouns created from "*go dira*", and means "a doer or a worker"; it is closely related to "*lediri*" (meaning a verb) and "*sediri*" (an expert worker). A name has the power to communicate meaning, an "illocutionary force"[23] that may, for its bearer have a predictive quality. In Modiri Molema's case, he came to embody the idea of "work" or of the making of a self, both in a traditional Setswana sense and in terms of Methodist values. Work (*tirō*) in Setswana is neither an abstract notion nor an exchangeable commodity. The Comaroffs reported in the 1990s:

> [i]n the 1970's [*sic*] we were told that, *bogologolo* ("long ago") even the toil of a serf was only available to his master as part of a total bond of interdependence. It could not be given over to another person unless the relationship itself was transferred. In short, "work" was, and is, the creative process inherent in all human activity; it is expressed in the "building up" of self and others in the course of daily life….work has always involved the construction of a person in relation to others.[24]

Go dira (to work), an indicative verb, thus implicitly involves a reciprocal action: building up oneself and others. A worker, "*modiri*" is one who does this. In contrast, the verb that expresses working for oneself only or at the expense of others is *go itira*: "to make oneself" or "to pose as". Again, the Comaroffs observe that "*go itira motho*" connotes 'to be proud' or 'haughty'".[25]

In "Children in the Family", an essay written in later life, Dr Molema wrote sweepingly: "[i]t is generally agreed that in family life in all societies, brothers and sisters are social equivalents"; society sees them "as nearly identical as it is possible for human beings to be". In the traditional Rolong view, the increasing individuality of children in modern societies had no place. His remarks helped to explain the *seantlho* practice. He may have had his own family and Rolong society in mind when he wrote that siblings could "represent or replace one another with the least possible disturbance of the social equilibrium. The levirate and sororate customs are based upon this social equivalence of siblings".[26]

He explained the familial respect accorded the eldest male and female children. Yet, the eldest son was the "most important". To apply these dicta to the Molema family: despite the respect that Silas, Molalanyane and the younger children showed Seleje, the firstborn, Modiri's importance as the eldest son and his father's heir, would have "eclipsed" hers. He would also have had "the privilege of responsibility for the care of some of his father's stock". A father did not distinguish his property from his eldest son's. Where disputes arose between father and son, the *lekgotla* could intercede. Thus the Serolong model of family life differed from the "western" nuclear one. An errant father might be publicly reminded by the Serolong maxim: "*Kgabela ngwana; o tlo bone ngana a go kgabela*" ("Act with decorum towards your child and your child will respect you").[27]

---

[22] Comaroff & Comaroff (1991: 219) cited missionary James Read, 1850. "Report on the Bechuana Mission". In *Evangelical Magazine and Missionary Chronicle*, 28: 445-47.

[23] Comaroff & Comaroff, 1991: 219-20. Snyman et al (1990: 18) give *tirō* as "deed, work, occupation, act, and duty".

[24] Comaroff & Comaroff, 1991: 141.

[25] Comaroff & Comaroff (1991: 141): the phrase means, "'to make oneself a distinct person'", whereas the reflexive verb *go itirela* (from reciprocal verb, *go direla* to work for) means "to make (work, do) for oneself" has positive connotations.

[26] Molema, "Children in the Family", p.1.

[27] Molema, "Children in the Family", p.2.

Family discipline was strictly hierarchical. Younger children, like Tshadinyana, Morara, Sefetoge and Motshidi would have minded their language and behaviour around Modiri and Seleje, whose commands they had to obey and whose errands they had to run.[28] Reflecting on the relationships between his father and his two uncles, Solomon Molema confirmed the younger brothers respect for Modiri:

> You wanted to know, how did Modiri and my father get on? One of the things that I realised when I was a young boy, in fact…Morara and Sefetoge they lived in awe of their brother, and he would sometimes gives an instruction and they would….And they would rush — they were really very much obedient, but the way I saw it, it was that obedience bordering on — at the time I didn't know whether it was on fear or respect, but he had a powerful grip on them, that I can tell you.[29]

"*Aubuti*" (older brother, from Afrikaans), or "*Nkgonne*" (ungendered term for an older sibling) had to treat the little ones fairly, displaying "the utmost decorum in his conduct". Any improper language that younger children used would be blamed on their older siblings' bad example. Fairness was the principle stressed in childrearing. Modiri would have shared the food he was given with the younger ones. As the Serolong proverb says: "'*bana ba motho ba thakanela tlhogo ea ntshi*'" ("the children of the same man will share even the head of a fly"). Both Prof. Leloba Molema and Ms Warada Molema confirmed Dr Molema's strict sense of family duty.[30] How far might an older child go?

> [T]he eldest in the family…is expected to act like a father or a mother towards the younger children — to protect them, to discipline and train them, both by precept and example, in the traditional modes of behaviour. Hence upon the death of a father, his sons and daughters quite readily accept the authority of the eldest when he succeeds his deceased's position as head of the family.[31]

This analysis of the general patterns of childhood so accurately reflected Dr Molema's own beliefs about his responsibilities towards his father and his siblings, that one discerns a strongly autobiographical input in the essay. On the one known occasion that he and Silas disagreed, Modiri conceded defeat before any need for the *lekgotla*'s intervention arose.[32]

Modiri was two and his sister Seleje four when their father undertook the great task of building a large family home. The venture was complex. The contractor Mr F Robertson quoted Silas £57-15-0 including "all brick stones sand water and boys"; Robertson would "find all other material & labor & compleate work in a workmanlike [sic] manor", but would lower the price to £38-1-0 if Silas found the material himself. The house's dimensions would have made it conspicuous amid Mafikeng's smaller square homes and Setswana round houses.

> …all walls to be built in brick on a stoen [*sic*] foundation 22x14; out side overall 9 feet high with pi[t]ch roof & lean to at the back of a room of 12x14 over all with flat roof….to be covered with iron froont….[O]ne room with chimney & fire place, [p.2] two windows & one door to be built in front of building & two doors inside of rooms[;] one door & window in back room….[33]

This house (later called Maratiwa) formed the core of the Molema home that withstood the Boers' Siege shells; Modiri later made his home there with his first wife, Anna.[34]

---

[28] Their full names were Harriet Tshadinyana (later MmaSemela), Morara Rex (or Tolo), Sefetoge Silas, and Motshidi Stella. After Silas' second marriage, Modiri was also responsible for Robert Ratlou and Keleo. Cf. *supra*, p.121 & fn.128.

[29] *Solomon and Elisabeth Molema Interviews, 1991 & 1992*.

[30] Molema, "Children in the Family", p.6, for previous quotation. *Leloba Molema Interview, 1992*, and *Warada Molema Interview, 1992*.

[31] Molema, "Children in the Family", pp.6-7.

[32] Cf. *infra*, pp.207-209.

[33] MPP A979 Aa3, 20 Nov 1893, F Robertson, Maf, to Mr C Malemma. Robertson's grammar and spelling were erratic.

[34] It is now home to his younger brother, Morara's son, Solomon, and his family. See picture of Maratiwa, *infra*, pp.172-73. Cf. *supra*, p.83, Emile Holub's comments on the Molema brothers' houses and *supra*, p.106 fn.38.

The decade into which Modiri was born "…dawned upon restless and hurrying humanity, and was destined to close in bloody warfare".[35] Some of his later essays relied on his own childhood experience. However, he may have recalled little of the early 1890s other than a blur of action around which his young life took shape: Montshiwa sent his father on border missions, then to be headman at Bodibe and Lotlhakana (c.1891-94), and to negotiate with Dr Jameson (1895). On 19 October 1896, Montshiwa's death shook the community. Modiri drew on early memories to convey the communal grief: "[t]he wailing that arose in the stad, and continued for days was something weird, something awful, something terrible. The Barolong seemed to be submerged."[36] Montshiwa's personality and reign so fascinated young Modiri that, in his seventies, he wrote a biography of the last great nineteenth century Tshidi chief. He stressed that Montshiwa remained a traditional believer all his life, despite associating with the missionaries he relied on as diplomats. Yet, Rev Alfred Sharp, Mafikeng's "resident missionary" in 1896 insisted that Montshiwa was baptised before he died and "buried according to Christian rites".[37]

The Tshidi had had much cause to weep that year: "that terrible scourge — rinderpest…destroyed thousands of the cattle population…". Farmers abandoned their ox-wagons beside the roads as the beasts perished. Those stranded vehicles were a reminder of the cattle-plague into the 1940s; but immediately in 1896, the price of other transport animals rose: "donkeys were at a premium, being from £5 to £7 each, and mules £25 to £38 each".[38] As the son of a farmer, Modiri would have heard much discussion of these hardships in their new Mafikeng house, and at their farm, Mabete.

The evidence of Modiri's first decade, from babyhood (*boséa*) to childhood (*bonyánā*), two Tswana development milestones, is patchy. Just as he emerged into *bosimané* (boyhood), the world's eyes focused on Mafikeng, as the South African War was declared on 12 October. In retrospect, he argued that two "major" events occurred in 1899: the founding of the *Mafeking Mail* (to which Silas had a subscription) and the "outbreak of the Anglo-Boer War…". With hindsight, he equated the two events' importance, realising that this "journalist adventure and …educational institution", had helped to place "Mafeking upon the map". Where would his father, Plaatje, Lekoko and others have been without the *Mafeking Mail Siege Slips'* war coverage?[39] They provided daily reports and the small boy (9 years and 8 months old in October 1899) would have seen, if not read, these slim editions.

The War impressed him so, that he later wrote at least four commentaries on it: *The Bantu*'s Chapter XXIII, "Bantu in the South African War", the unpublished monograph "The Scapegoat of the Boer War" (General Piet Cronjé) and the two 1949 commemorative essays. [40] Of these, "Mafeking — A Retrospect" is in draft version, whereas "Fifty Years Ago" is more polished, containing detailed, statistically-based accounts of the siege. The young Modiri surfaced in the article's descriptions of the Tshidi's notorious enemy, Cronjé. His presence in the front line gave him a vantage point that eluded his older relatives: Sebopiwa and Officer were away at Lovedale.[41]

---

[35] Molema, "Mafeking", p.2.

[36] Molema, "Mafeking": 3. Cf. *supra*, pp.127-28 for Silas' dealings with Dr Jameson.

[37] Molema, 1966: 206. Potter, [Nd]: 69. MPP A979 Ad3, 8 Oct 1918, SMM, Glasgow, to HTM, Maf: Modiri reported seeing Rev Sharp (and wife) in Manchester — "They were very nice to me".

[38] Molema, "Mafeking": 3. William Beinart, 1994. *Twentieth-Century South Africa*. (Oxford: OUP), pp.32-33: the rinderpest (1896/7) and East Coast Fever (1904-13) killed up to 80% of the country's cattle herds in some areas. Beinart attributed the diseases' spread to "a broader spread of new plagues consequent on more rapid mobility and international exchanges of people, plants, and animals".

[39] Molema ("Mafeking", 3-4) used the older term "Boer War" for the South African War. Schapera (1953 & 1979: 38): "[c]hildren are grouped roughly, according to physical development, into *maséa* (sucklings), *banyánā* (infants, from about three years old to eight), and, finally *basimané* (boys or *basétsāna* (girls)". Plaatje, 1973 & 1999: 103, 154-56. For Silas' *Mafeking Mail* subscription, see MPP A979 Aa3. Plaatje (1973 & 1999: 78): Silas read any paper available: "Mr Molema last night brought me a copy of the Bulawayo Chronicle, from Captain Marsh", and "every paper fortunate enough to find its way into Mafeking passes through so many hands that it is quite worn out and requires…the greatest care."

[40] See Bibliography, The Works of SM Molema, Unpublished Manuscripts & Essays, *infra*, p.375-76, for details.

[41] Plaatje (1973 & 1999: 439-40 & 176 fn.59) called him by his Setswana tag, *Rantho'akgale*, while Dr Molema did not. Cf. *supra*, p.136 fn.229. RU, LP, LMIAR, ROC, 1900, pp.8, 9, 20: Sebopiwa and Chief Bathoeng's son, Seepapitso, were in Std

After the War's first shots were fired near Modiri's mother's ancestral home, Kraaipan (Setlagole), Gen. de la Rey's forces cut Mafikeng's contact with the outside world, and Cronjé rolled into town.[42] Visual images, often comic, contributed to Modiri's memoir: "[t]he formidable Cronjé, wearing his bowler hat and his morning coat, and carrying his horse whip now came with Mrs Cronjé to Mafeking in his spider drawn by four horses".[43]

Dr Molema's picture of the African contribution to the town's defences combined his early memories with the historian's careful research. Almost instantly, white Mafeking, the black Stadt, plus Fingoes' and Strangers' Locations, united to form a common defence. He made no mention of Baden-Powell's later denials of black participation. His article's tone was complex: beneath the historian's urbane discourse, lay the remembered fear and excitement into which the child's world had suddenly descended. Between the frightened Stadt-dwellers and their traditional enemies, the Boers, were the Protectorate Regiment soldiers, Police, local volunteers and the town Guard, "made up of business men, trades men and shop keepers".[44] United as the small town's white hierarchy was, they could not absorb their neighbours, the Rolong. A separate contingent of able black fighters was hastily enlisted:

> …there were 600 Barolong under their chiefs, notably Lekoko Montshiwa and Silas Molema, and directed by Major Godley and Capt. Marsh to defend their frontiers on the west. There were Fingoes under Sgt Webster, Coloured under Capt Goodyear and Corporal Currie, and a "Black Watch" — a mixed lot of foreign naives under Lt Mackenzie. Altogether about 1,700 men.[45]

The black troops were separated along ethnic lines, a trend not new in Mafikeng: Rolong, "Fingoes" and "foreigners" (or "Strangers") occupied different locations to the town's west and southwest. Being responsible for Mafikeng's western defences meant that the black troops were shielding their own homes, *and* the white town, behind them. On 24 October, the arrival of "a veritable monster…a Creusot, throwing 94-lb shells" to the "hilarious excitement of the besiegers, and pallid terror of the besieged" rendered the three locations more vulnerable. From Jackal Tree (Cronjé's laager), it "roared and belched, throwing…40 shells, now into the European, and now into the African town…" throughout the Siege's seven months.[46] By mid-December, Mafikeng was fierily hot. Plaatje, living in the Molema homestead, observed the family's desperation:

> …the 20th was the hottest day we have had since the siege, but yesterday was worse. The heat was intense. Mrs Molema had to clear to the hut for the night with the children, as the house was becoming an oven. I tried to stay and fight it out but was compelled to leave the house to sleep outside at about 11p.m.[47]

Heat was not the only extreme aspect of their lives. Early next morning, news of more deaths arrived. Illness and Boer guns spared neither young nor old: the young daughter of Matshane Meko, part of the defence, and Modiri's grandmother's brother, Setuki Lekoma, had passed away. Each day brought losses, and tensions around basic survival, which must have left their mark on the young boy. Modiri's combined delight and terror at the gunfire made him record onomatopoeically the sounds exploding around him: shrieks, whirrs and growls. The Boers' "12 different kinds of artillery" hurled bullets and

---

V; Officer, who had arrived at Lovedale on 1 Feb 1899, was in Mr FT Morrison's Technical Workshop. The one female Mafikeng scholar was Maud Sidzumo. Willan (1984: 65): the Sidzumos' father, a well-known Mfengu minister, had settled in Mafikeng for his health. Patrick was a firm friend of Plaatje's. His brother, Petrus later worked at *Koranta*.

[42] Cf. *supra*, p.121. Mrs Molema was the daughter of Chief Choele Motlhabane [pron.Tshwele] and his second wife, Mohumi, of Mahukubung, near Old Kraaipan, Setlagole Reserve. See Appendix A, p.VI.

[43] SMM, 1949: 2.

[44] SMM (1949: 2): Molema perhaps meant the British South African Police. His figures [in square brackets below] for the garrison differ from those of the editors of Plaatje's Diary (1973 & 1999: 20): "Protectorate Regiment (21 officers and 448 men) [340 men], the Bechuanaland Rifles (5 officers and 77 men) [—], the British South African Police (10 officers and 81 men) and the Cape Police (4 officers and 99 men) [170 perhaps for both police forces]. Molema added 200 volunteers.

[45] SMM, 1949: 2. See Map of besieged Mafikeng, after p.130

[46] SMM (1949: 3): the Creusot was dubbed "Big Ben or Long Tom or Creaky" or "Au Sanna". (Plaatje, 1973 & 1999: 35).

[47] Plaatje, 1973 & 1999: 73.

cannonballs at town and Stadt, where huts buckled under the missiles. The impact dislodged rocks, "and fragments of ricocheting steel…all this was terrific, and was calculated to make the stoutest heart quail, while Mafeking shook upon its foundations and seemed to be on the verge of collapse".[48]

Plaatje, 23 when war erupted, better conveyed Mafikeng's sudden transformation into a war zone.

> Sunday 29th [October]…Divine Services. No thunder. Haikonna terror;…I have discovered nearly everything about war and find that artillery in war is of no use….I can say: no music is as thrilling and as immensely captivating as to listen to the firing of the guns on your own side.[49]

He developed the ironic music and gunfire comparison before giving insight into Modiri's education during the Siege. Modiri attended the Stadt's Wesleyan Mission School "until Standard 4", where well-known Mafikengite, Mr Barnabas "Teacher" Samson, was headmaster.[50] It is not known how frequently classes were held during the Siege, but Samson came under Boer fire on 27 October, when "creeping" along the Molopo close to the Boers. Another teacher, Miss SJ Ngono "*Titshalakazi*", tragically lost her fiancé, a Black Watch member, who perished from his wounds. The Stadt was small, its people knew each other so well, and the effects of famine and enemy fire were very evident.[51]

As stated, until Standard 4, Modiri attended Mafikeng Stadt's mission school. When the family stayed at Silas' Motsosa Estate, school was six mile's trudge away:

> [o]h it was terrible in winter [he reminded his older sister, Seleje]. Early rising, little or no washing, a hurried breakfast about 7am homelessons undone, and six miles to walk barefooted to school with Tshabadira first, Modiri last and dear Seleje in the middle. *Abo rekile ra choara bothata ruri*. [Once upon a time, we truly used to have a hard time].[52] [*my italics*.]

Whether the Molema children knew how much danger their father courted in order to provision the besieged town, is unclear. Under cover of night, the plains around Mafikeng came to life. On the night of 10 February 1900, Silas courted danger under Boer fire in aiding Mathakgong steer 12 cattle into town.[53] At the worst of the famine, Modiri recalled the Stadt's reliance on horseflesh and the white town's reliance on black cattle-raiders for survival. Molema's "Fifty Years Ago" was not a daily diary. For reasons unknown, he downplayed his father's heroic part in staving off Eloff's final attack.

After the siege, some "normality" was restored. Accounts for the children's education rained down from Lovedale. Seleje and the elder Molemas, Sebopiwa and Officer, were away at Lovedale, while Modiri studied in Mafikeng. Despite the War, Seleje (only 12), her classmates and the older Molema

---

[48] Plaatje (1973 & 1999: 183 fn.61): Setuki Legalatladi Lekoma was Baetlhoi Molema's elder brother. SMM (1949: 3) provided Modiri's memories of gunfire, cited *supra*, p.136.

[49] Plaatje, 1973 & 1999: 27.

[50] *Molema, Johns Interview, 1964*, p.2. MPP A979 Bd1, 18 August 1913, George Rolland, Wesleyan Methodist Mission, Box 14 Maf, to…Chief Lekoko Montsioa, Maf, noted that Mr Samson was still headmaster. *Victor Mapanya Interview, 1992*: Mr Mapanya, Dr Molema's clerk and Mr Samson's grandson, outlined Samson's long friendship with Molema, who visited Samson regularly in the 1920s. Cf. *infra*, p.294 fn.11.

[51] Plaatje, 1973 & 1999: 29, 99. The Molopo bisects the Stadt (See Map of Early Mafikeng, *supra*, pp.52-53). The School, founded by Israel Molema, is near the Stadt's centre. Samson's guard duties in January exposed him to rheumatic fever, which immobilised him severely. On 7 January 1900, Plaatje (1973 & 1999: 93, 139, 200 fn.39) at first mistook her broken-heartedness for starvation, so common was this condition. "*Titshalakazi*" is Isixhosa for female teacher.

[52] MPP A979 Ad3, 15 Sep 1914, SMM to Seleje Taoana [Tawana]. "*A bo*" introduces a repeated annoyance. *Spencer Minchin Interview, 1991*: Dr Molema's attorney did not release his Deceased Estate, but kindly summarised it. On Silas' death (1927), Dr Molema inherited the family estate, Motsosa, and still owned it when he passed away (13 Aug 1965). He left his surgery near the Molopo River to Dr Silas Sefetoge Molema, with their surgery & offices in The Stadt. Dr Sefetoge also inherited his brother's instruments, safe, medical library, and medicines and drugs (at Motsosa). Modiri Molema's Estate contained the dwelling house with adjacent shop and the Elite Hall, since demolished, the double-storey residence at Motsosa, offices in The Stadt, rented to the Bantu School Hall, motorcars, and a small restaurant, Kraaipan. Comaroff & Comaroff (1997: 308) mention the Elite Hall, "a Christian communal facility, since destroyed by fire".

[53] Plaatje (1973 & 1999: 110): quoted *supra*, p.138 & fn.236.

children had a chance to visit Cape Town, revealing the mobility of the clan's younger members, through their missionary connections.[54]

Modiri's musical talent showed itself early. On 13 September 1901, the London Tonic Sol-Fa College issued a Junior Certificate to "Moliri" Molema, aged 10. A year later, he earned the College's Elementary Certificate in musical memory, time, tune and sight singing, and took the Intermediate in 1904.[55] These musical skills served him well, as his attention to musical entertainment at the African Races of Glasgow's 1919 "At Home" demonstrated. More seriously, his many copies of hymns in careful tonic sol-fa notation document the links between his musical and religious interests.[56]

Around sixteen, most Tswana boys and girls would have undergone the rites of passage marking their transition to man- and womanhood: *bogwêra* and *bojale*. As a young Wesleyan, Modiri seemingly abstained from these rites. His later research respected the secrecy surrounding them. He had gleaned his information about *bogwêra* "during a conversation with an old man who is well over ninety years of age" and learned about *bojale* "from a woman of about the age of sixty". They had discussed "the public and instructional aspects of initiation", relating to the transmission of "tribal lore and tradition" and proper physical conduct as adult men and women. Both interviews indicated Dr Molema's ongoing anthropological interest: he wanted to educate others about Setswana customs and to preserve them.[57]

"No government grant" — The Wisdom Modiri Learnt at Healdtown:[58]

"Standard 4" in the early 1900s, was the final year of schooling for most Africans. Only larger institutions like Healdtown offered further tuition. So Modiri followed his father and Sebopiwa there in 1908.[59] In the 1880s and 1890s, when Sebopiwa, future solicitor, Richard Msimang[60], and before them, Isaiah Bud-M'belle, attended Healdtown, Cape Government Inspectors judged it stuffy, recommending better accommodation and ventilation for boy boarders.[61] By 1911, two years after Modiri's departure,

---

[54] MPP A979 Aa3, 23 Nov 1900, AW Roberts, Acting Principal, Lovedale, to STM, Maf, gave the fares to Cape Town [CT]: return fares East London to CT, £9-9-0; wagon fares to King William's Town 10s; Railway fares from KWT to East London, 14 s. Food and other expenses, about £5-7-0, totally £16. For other Lovedale accounts for Officer, Sebopiwa and "Seleye" Molema, see A979 Aa3, 4 Oct 1900, AW Roberts, Acting Principal, Lovedale, to STM, Maf.

[55] MPP A979 Ad5.2, 13 Sep 1901, "Junior Certificate" and 20 Oct 1902, "Elementary Certificate"; Ad5.3, 19 March 1904, "Intermediate Certificate". The letter "l" is often pronounced "d" in Sotho-Tswana languages. "Curwen, John", Britannica Online, http://www.eb.com:180/cgi-bin/g?DocF=micro/154/78.html: Tonic Sol-Fa is the solmisation system (using musical syllables to name notes) popularised by Yorkshireman Curwen (1816-1880) in c.1850. Missionaries used this way of relating the scale's 7 tones to the tonic and each other, as it helped amateurs render songs without knowing musical notation.

[56] MPP A979 Ad3, "The African Races of Glasgow Souvenir Programme", 12 Apr 1918, see *infra*, p.204 fn.40. UNISA, ACC 142, Molema Varia contains the Hymnsheets. *Warada Molema Interview, 1992*: Warada, Dr Molema's daughter, illustrated her father's love of music. Although a staunch Methodist, he chose the Sacred Convent, Aliwal North for his and his brother's children because it boasted the "best music teacher 'or Coloured music teacher' in southern Africa. Sister Mary Magdalene, she was fantastic and that was the main reason why I was sent there. He was giving us the best, you know".

[57] M842, Dr SM Molema Papers, [microfilm) 2:XM118: 77/3: 1/41: "Initiation", later extended *The Bantu*'s study of initiation. He had conducted interviews for the article, hinting that had not undergone *bogwêra* himself. Cf. *infra*, pp.300ff.

[58] Molema, 1920: 227. Cf. *supra*, p.107ff, for his father, Silas's years at Healdtown.

[59] Modiri and Sebopiwa [literally "created being"], Joshua Molema's son, considered each other brothers. After attending Healdtown and Lovedale, Sebopiwa studied law at Wilberforce Institute, Ohio, but did not qualify as a lawyer. He was Lotlamoreng's tribal secretary for many years. From Ohio, he debated (*Koranta*, 19 Oct 1904) which profession to choose: "*...[Dr (ngaka), kgotsa Lawyer (agente), kgotsa go nna Moruti (minister)*". African Americans greatly esteemed the professions. *MM*, 30 Aug 1912, "Wedding": he married Emang, Lekoko's daughter. *TsalaBC*, 01 June 1912, "Deputation to Government", Sebopiwa, Plaatje and Paul Montshiwa led a deputation to Native Affairs Minister, Henry Burton, (Cape Town) against the 5s. tax on native reserve dogs. *MM*, 22 July 1913, Reader, "Nota Bene", alleged that Lekoko had taxed all Stadt residents £1 to fund the deputation. KAB 1/MFK 15, N1/1/5 (18): "Chiefs & Headmen: SJ Molema": Sebopiwa was Acting-Headman for the Molema wards, Maf (1941-1956). Cf. Appendix A, pp.II & III.

[60] *TsalaBT*, 05 July 1913, "The New Solicitor: RW Msimang": "RW", Selby Msimang's elder brother, was the first African member of both the South African Supreme Court (Transvaal Division, 1913) and the Supreme Court of Judicature of England. He studied at John Dube's Ohlange and Healdtown. The "only boy of colour" at a Wesleyan School, Somerset, England (1904) he was yet more isolated than Modiri in 1914. See KAB, GSE 2/119, 17-28 Aug &14-22 Sep 1903.

[61] Willan (1984: 35): born in Burghersdorp, Eastern Cape (1869/1870) to an Mfengu family, M'belle studied at Healdtown After passing the Cape Civil Service Examinations in 1893, he was appointed Interpreter in Native Languages, Griqualand West High Court, Kimberley. Cobley (1990: 71): RW Msimang married his daughter, Grace.

Healdtown's teaching diploma results placed it among the Cape's top three missionary institutions. Receiving the Cape Education Department [CED]'s supervision but limited government funding, Healdtown's results outdid many white schools'. Rev Hornabrook and Thomas Peart, English university graduates, matched their counterparts at white schools.[62] Modiri's experience of underfunding at Healdtown and Lovedale made him devote Chapter XIX of *The Bantu* to this serious issue. The CED's yearly inspection reports, outlining the tremendous difficulties Richard Hornabrook faced in paying staff salaries supported Modiri's arguments.[63] In *The Bantu*, having recently graduated as a medical doctor, Molema wrote,

> [t]he government grants to the missionary schools for Bantu education are...extremely niggardly, and almost nominal when two factors are taken into consideration, namely-first, the fat taxes which are paid by the Bantu into the Public Treasury; and second, when a comparison is made between the Government grants for European education on the one hand and for Bantu education on the other.[64]

His opinions affirmed those of the "important early ideologue of segregation", Maurice Evans, who noted that no state-run schools were devoted to training Africans and that government funding of missionary schools was a "...niggardly [Evans's term] percentage of the direct taxes paid by the natives".[65] Reflecting on his Eastern Cape education, he united schoolboy impressions to the national picture to censure the educational adversity African scholars faced. He revealed the diametric contrasts between black and white schooling with "the facts in figures based on the report of the Superintendent-General of Education for 1915". For British readers, he stressed that these figures represented the Cape, "the most liberal of the South African colonies in this as in other matters affecting the Bantu".[66] Table 4 suggests the stark numerical and proportional differences between government funding for white and black schoolchildren:

	European Education	**Native Education**
Estimated European Population	592,000	Native, 2,000,000
Population at school	17.8%	6.8%
Enrolment in 1915	105,742 Increase, 3077	137,238 Decrease, 1233
Increase in enrolment in 10 years	54%	36%
Total state expenditure in 1915 estimated at	£863,000	£140,000
This amount[s] per head of population to about	£1, 9s. 2d.	1s.8d
Eight years ago the rate was	16s.2d.	1s.4d.
Increase	80%	Increase, 25%
The ratio then was . . .	194d.	To 16d.
To-day it is	350d.	To 20d. The ratio is about 50% worse
Average State expenditure per pupil	£1, 3d.10d	£1

Table 4: Molema's Table of Comparative Expenditure on White and Black Scholars

[62] SGE 2/156, 4-28 Sep 1905, "School Inspection Form for Healdtown".

[63] Paltry church endowments and state subventions aroused Modiri's anger, as Chapter Six illustrates. See the following Superintendent-General of Education Reports: SGE 2/119, 17-28 Aug & 14-22 Sep 1903, and 2/248, 16 Aug to 04 Sep 1909, "Inspection Reports for Healdtown Training School"; SGE 2/8, 23, 25, 26, 30 & 31 Oct 1894, "School Inspection Form for Healdtown", and GSE 2/119, 17-28 Aug & 14-22 Sep 1903, "School Inspection Form for Healdtown".

[64] Molema, 1920: 226.

[65] Molema (1920: 226-27) cited Evans, 1911: 97. The *OED* (1, 1924) states that niggardly is a word of obscure etymology, meaning miserly. Dubow (1995: 169) described Evans as a keen observer, "concerned by the 'demoralisation' and 'deterioration' of both black and white in the urban context. Evans was a member of the Natal Legislative Assembly.

[66] Molema (1920: 227) cited *Christian Express*, Sep 1917.

Molema's explanatory note expressed his doubts over the clarity of some government figures. The table's final line neither indicates the date of measurement nor shows how the figure of £1 per African scholar was obtained. Nevertheless, as a general trend, government under-funding of African schools marked the difference between black and white education, especially in the built environments of schools. Molema described these distinctions firsthand:

> [a] visitor to South Africa could not fail to be struck by the contrast there is between the school buildings for European children and those for Bantu children, especially where they happen to stand side by side. On the one hand the buildings display all the skill of architecture, they conform scrupulously to requirements of public health and science, comfort and art. The outfit is irreproachable. Those are for whites. On the other hand, as often as not, the tin church building, with its forms and seats is used during the week days as a school-room, the seats serving for desks, or if there is a school building it is invariably a "poor show" comparatively and absolutely — corrugated iron, broken floors, old-fashioned creaky desks, bad ventilation, bad light, shameful overcrowding, and altogether a "point by point" contravention of hygienic laws....It spells, in short, no Government grant for Bantu school buildings.[67]

CED Reports confirmed his assertions of overcrowding and poor ventilation.[68] These circumstantial details formed part of the discriminatory discourse of segregation. Late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century racial discourse had manifold aspects. Two at least flowed into "liberal" Cape's missionary institutions, diluting each other. First came the argument of "equality before the law". By overtly supporting a qualified franchise (property-based participation in the democratic process), the state encouraged the idea that achievement was based on ability, its tangible equivalent in property. Yet, formal equality is severely compromised without the official practice of redistributive justice.[69] Many areas of perceived injustice aroused Africans' ire over educational segregation. The CED's failure to open fully-funded white institutions to Africans, while consigning their education to underfunded missionary schools, contradicted the apparently humanist philosophy of the Cape Colony's constitution. Under missionary "protection", African scholars were absorbed into a discourse that foregrounded race. African otherness was constructed as an alarming condition characterised by "savagery" or "barbarity", which only religion and education could remedy. Second, under the Cape's contradictory freedoms, education for Africans meant being prepared for labour, either as a "better class" of servant (artisan) or a low-level teacher, civil servant, or minister. From 1910, the Union Government, often with respected missionaries' knowing complicity, curtailed educated black people's opportunities yet further.[70]

At Healdtown and Lovedale, Molema encountered the forceful missionary rejection of African religious systems and daily lifestyle. Missionaries disregarded much of scholars' African upbringing and treated them as blank slates upon which to inscribe, western civilisation slowly, as necessitated by Africans' supposed "biological inferiority". Treating all Africans as children became a norm which Africans themselves internalised for many generations.[71]

---

[67] Molema, 1920: 227.

[68] SGE 2/8, 23, 25, 26, 30 & 31 Oct 1894, "School Inspection Form for Healdtown" covered Sebopiwa's schooldays. GSE 2/119, 17-28 Aug & 14-22 Sep 1903, "School Inspection Form for Healdtown": Inspector WE Clarke recommended a fitted blackboard and ceiling for the pupil-teachers' classroom. Resources were so meagre that even the new cupboard for "books and apparatus" won his praise. SGE 2/248, 16 Aug-04 Sep 1909, "School Inspection Form for Healdtown" (Modiri's last year): the report rejoiced that the main buildings were now lit with acetylene gas. Yet, the girls lacked even chalkboards.

[69] On Cape Liberalism, see Phyllis Lewsen, 1982. "The South African Constitution: Euphoria and Rejection", Raymond Dart Lecture No. 19. (JHB: WUP), p.3. Stanley Trapido, 1980. "'The friends of the natives': merchants, peasants and the political and ideological structure of liberalism in the Cape, 1854-1910". In Shula Marks & Anthony Atmore (eds), 1980. *Economy and Society in Pre-Industrial South Africa*. (London: Longman), pp.249, 254-55 & 268. Rodney Davenport, 1987. "The Cape Liberal Tradition in South African History". In J Butler, R Elphick & D Welsh (eds), 1987. *Democratic Liberalism in South Africa*. (Cape Town: David Philip), p.22.

[70] Paul Rich, 1987: 279.

[71] Molema, 1920: 240. Couzens (1985: 30) cited SVK Mdhluli, 1933. *The Development of the African*. (Marianhill), p.50. Also De Kock (1996: 89) for further discussion of the "infant metaphor".

Such issues probably made a subliminal impact on Modiri when he wrote the only letter that survives from his Healdtown days. The letter greeted and thanked Silas with due Edwardian formality, and expressed appreciation of his host during his recent holiday: Dr Rubusana: "I am spending a very nice time in East London. The Rubusanas are kind people, and they treat me very well. Oh father, I owe them as many thanks as you do".[72] This last remark tactfully reminded Silas of his duty to thank his old friends. Eminent preacher, Rubusana, joined Silas, three years later in founding the SANNC.[73] He was one of several Healdtown alumni linked to Scotland, having been sent there to help translate the Bible into Xhosa.[74] Modiri added that school had opened on 16 July, a hint that fees were due. As the full weight of later financial difficulties fell on Silas, Modiri's begging letters to him became very direct.[75]

This letter yields conveyed Modiri's growing maturity, as he experimented with an "adult" mode of address ("I am in receipt of your letter, which I was exceedingly glad to receive") and anticipated the individual flourishes of his adult Lovedale and Glasgow letters. He was just seventeen.

At Healdtown, Modiri was in the academic rather than the training stream, and studying towards a teaching diploma. This was the common programme most students at missionary institutions completed before some went on, as he did, to matriculate. He knew that African teachers often worked alone, and underpaid, in the vanguard of education, as his father had been on returning to Mafikeng from Healdtown in 1877. The Native Affairs Commission statistics for the period in which Modiri studied abroad show that, had he remained a teacher and qualified as a doctor, his annual wage would have begun at £24 (1915's average).[76] What angered him and many Africans was the disparity between the taxation they paid and the poor education (and other services) they received in return. Just over half the taxation for the Cape's total £51,000 education budget (for white *and* black scholars), came from local rates that Africans in the Transkeian Territories paid: £25,442-7-0. Table 4 from *The Bantu* shows that African scholars saw little of this revenue ploughed back into their schools.[77]

Modiri was not the only outraged African intellectual. His contemporary, "energetic, fiery" Thema, SANNC delegate to the Treaty of Versailles in 1919, expressed fury over the education of Africans after the South African War.[78] Colonial Governments excluded African education from the reconstruction programme, having "no time to pay attention to Native education. They were apparently absorbed with the problems created by the war". Government imposed "a heavy tax of £2 on every adult male African" to force Africans to work on the mines and contribute to the country's rehabilitation. Thema praised missionaries who "shouldered the burden of Native education", whereas "[g]overnment pocketed the Africans' money and built beautiful schools for the education of White children".[79]

---

[72] MPP A979 Ad1, 21 Aug 1908, SMM, East London, to STM, ("Dearest Father"). East London is ±150km (±93 miles) from Fort Beaufort, on the Eastern Cape coast.

[73] Pallo Jordan, *Zemk' Inkomo Magwalandini: The Life and Times of WB Rubusana* (1858-1936). In *Sechaba*, 1984, http://www.anc.org.za/ancdocs/history/people/rubusana.html: Lovedale scholar, Rubusana (1858-1936), son of Ngqika Chief, Sandile's councillor, Rubusana kaMbonjana, and a co-founder of the South African Native Congress, a constitutive body of the SANNC. He was a Congregational Minister and the only African, pre-1994, elected to the Cape Provincial Council (21 Sep 1910). He opposed Jabavu's alliance with Cape Liberals. While in London for Edward VII's coronation, he wrote *Zemk' Inkomo Magwalandini* (*Defend Your Heritage*), "an anthology of traditional epic poetry, didactic Christian essays and Church history". His large "'History of South Africa from the Native Standpoint'", for which McKinley University awarded him an honorary doctorate, was unpublished. Cf. *infra*, pp.235, 367 fn.69.

[74] SOAS, H Selby Msimang, [Nd]. "Autobiography", (Unpublished Ms), p.64.

[75] MPP A979 Aa1, 03 March 1924, Sefetoge Molema, Healdtown, to STM, showed that "begging letters" became a family genre: Sefetoge's plea for new boots began "I am going almost barefoot".

[76] It is not clear whether Silas received payment as a teacher; in the 1870s, the Molopo fell outside the ambit of any of the southern African states; as his Principal stated, he came from "beyond the Free State". UG 15 (1922), Report of the Native Affairs Commission, 1910-1921, p.20.

[77] See Table 4, *supra*, p.173.

[78] H Selby Msimang, SOAS Archive, London University, MS380077, "Notes from Autobiography", p.8.

[79] Thema (1935: 23) also wrote, with journalistic bravado, "[a]t one time, the total of grants to African schools in the

Both men derived from the African petty-bourgeois (being also Victorian and missionised) belief in "the virtues of free labor, secure property rights linked to a free market in land and individual tenure, equality before the law, and some notion of 'no taxation without [out of which] nineteenth-century African Christians constructed their world".[80] The missionaries stepped into the breach created by government inattention to African education. For this reason, both Molema and Thema remained firm supporters of missionary enterprise, and did not dismiss them as agents of imperialism. In Thema's view, "[i]t is [the missionaries], who have called the race out of the darkness of Africa's ancient life, who have lifted the veil of ignorance from its eyes, and have show it the way salvation".[81] The "veil" metaphor travelled across continents; WEB Du Bois, perhaps the early twentieth century's most influential African American political thinker frequently used "lifting the veil" to symbolise black people's acquisition of political consciousness. His writings inspired Modiri and Plaatje among many other black South Africans, as Chapters Five and Six show.[82]

Modiri's experiences at Healdtown and Lovedale substantially generated and politicised his arguments in *The Bantu* over black education.

"The Light Of Heaven": Molema's Healdtown Days

The number of South African alumni who pen lengthy odes to their *alma maters* cannot be many. In 1955, Dr SM Molema, eminent medical doctor, historian and ANC member penned a memorial article on the occasion of Healdtown's centenary. Read in the context of those celebrations, it told the tale of missionary endeavour in the Institution's creation. In relation to his life and works, these two stanzas from "Oh Healdtown" elucidate Molema's strong beliefs about faith and morality:[83]

> Oh: Healdtown, looking on thee full flashes the light of years,
> When thy present peace was pain, panic and pandemonium
> Of frenzied men athirst for vengeance, blood and spoil;
> When vainly strove the assegai against both shot and shell;
> When ruled chaotic darkness, and men though might was right,
> And selfish pride and prejudice obscured the light of heaven.
>
> Thou: cradled in dire distress and nurtured in convulsion —
> A hundred years have rolled into time's bottomless ocean;
> Years heralded by rapine and war and blood and tears
> But years also of blessed love and devotion and sacrifice,
> A century of patient, silent work and steadfast prayer —
>
> **From SM Molema, "Healdtown", Verses 2 & 3.**

The first verse has, as with most of his work, an autobiographical inflection, alluding to frontier wars, the last of which prevented his father from completing his studies. In Molema's discourse, darkness and chaos were always metaphors for the human condition without Christianity, in which baser passions (greed, lust for power, "pride and prejudice") ruled. Light, in his image vocabulary usually depicted "faith"; thus, the "light of heaven", ending stanza one is a volta, or turning point, heralding Healdtown's creation as a timeless witness to the transformation of its natural and human surroundings, from violent

Transvaal was less than the grant given to the Pretoria Zoo". He attended Lovedale until 1910 and became the editor of *Bantu World*. He grew increasingly conservative, criticising the 1950s' ANC under Moroka, with its Youth League backing.

[80] Marks, 1986: 47-48.

[81] Thema (1935: 23): "[w]hen sometimes I hear educated men of my race accusing the missionaries of having enabled the White man to 'to rob Africans of their land', I cannot help thinking that as a people we are very ungrateful. It is an undeniable fact that without the self-sacrificing endeavours of the missionaries and without their assistance and guidance our race could not have attained to its present state of development."

[82] See Du Bois, 1905 &1913: vii-viii. Cf. *infra*, p.260, 264-66, 312-313, 316, 331, 340-45. For Plaatje and Du Bois, see Willan, 1984: 231, 262-65, 269, 271-78, 364-65.

[83] ACC142, MV, SM Molema, 1955. "Healdtown 1855-1955": Verses 2 and 3. I thank Prof. TJ Couzens for this reference.

chaos to "faith and vision".[84] He personified the school, beloved for its unswerving values, as "Thou", suggesting that it represented the Holy Spirit made bricks, mortar and "love", "devotion" and "sacrifice".

Under apartheid in the 1950s, Bantu Education made Molema esteem the missionaries' contribution to information sources. Nevertheless, Cape government and Church funding was not generous. The 1909 Reports, though less eloquent about Modiri's years, mentioned some staffing improvements that he and other students may have felt. Hornabrook featured in Reports as pivotal to Healdtown's transformation from tiny training school to its substantial community of 1955. Scholars' conditions improved under Hornabrook, but were still unconducive to study. He set the school's strong moral tone, though pupils' minor disorderliness failed Inspector Clarke's exacting standards.[85]

Importantly, Hornabrook and staff (many new) achieved a creditable standard in "practical" work. Modiri was probably among those whose reading and writing Clarke conceded "on the whole fairly good". He assessed Healdtown under four heads: reading and recitation, class teaching, blackboard maps and writing, and physical exercise. Nearly his entire review tackled scholars' English enunciation. Voice, he stressed, was the teacher's chief instrument of instruction, especially in a system lacking most other educational resources. Later, Modiri's written expression would do his school oratorical credit.

"Literacy", stated Leon De Kock "was at the core of colonisation in South Africa", and no more so than in pronunciation.[86] Clarke's strictures to all junior students on articulation would have gladdened a colonial "Professor Higgins": he wished them to sound less "African" and more "English". To Modiri's year, he advised, practically, a greater variety of lessons, as many students were beginning teaching careers. Inspectors' tepidity yielded to warm singing assessments. September 1909's reports declared their work "very satisfactory". Healdtown's reverence for singing can only have reinforced Modiri's early training in Mafikeng. The curriculum included technically exigent pieces. In his second year (1908), he tackled such songs as Mendelssohn's "The first day of Spring" and joined other classes to render two Mendelssohn lieder, "The Skylark's Song" and "Thanks to God". Like Lovedale choirs' fame, Healdtown's stretched to Cape Town and Kimberley, where they often sang. In 1909, all 151 Healdtown scholars perfected the intricate part-songs of Handel's "Hallelujah Chorus". A mixed voice selection soared in the oratorios "Worthy is the lamb" (Handel) and *The Messiah*'s "Amen" Chorus.[87]

1909 reports again narrated the régime of enforced thrift governing African education. Through ecclesiastical, if not divine, intervention, Hornabrook balanced his salary budget of £1,515.10s: £939.10s from local contributions and £576 from government. Healdtown's dire budget explained Hornabrook's desperate chase after Silas unpaid fees! Happily for Modiri's future, its recovery incidentally launched his medical career.[88]

Government funding cuts for Healdtown showed that Molema experienced institutionalised racial discrimination in the Cape education system. Government increasingly spurned mission schools,

---

[84] Cf. *infra*, pp.323 fn.201, analyses Dr Molema's use of "light" and "dark" imagery in *The Bantu*.

[85] Hewson (1959: II, 279-82) noted that during Hornabrook's two administrations, great "economies" were managed, helping augment school numbers and income. SGE 2/248, "Singing Instructor's Report for Healdtown".

[86] De Kock, 1996: 64.

[87] SGE 2/248, "Singing Instructor's Report for Healdtown". Clarke specified "more systematic tabulation and study of difficulty sounds" to avoid shortening and mispronouncing vowels or eliding final consonants. To alleviate the scholars' monotonous reading, he advocated voice modulation and variation of speed. SGE 2/223, 22-23 Oct 1908, "Singing Instructor's Report". Over several years, Inspector F Farrington assessed the consistency of the school's singing.

[88] SGE 2/119, 17-28 Aug & 14-22 Sep 1903; SGE 2/248, 16 Aug-04 Sep 1909, Xhosa [called Kafir] and Sesotho [spelled "Sesuto"] teachers' salaries went unnoted. An hour a week was spent per language in 1903 and 1909. In 1903, 12 students studied Xhosa with Mr Nyaluza, and 13 with Mr Siwisa in 1909. Sesotho classes grew more rapidly: Mr Liphuleo had one scholar (1903), but Mr Motshimi 8 in 1909. Hewson (1959: II, 278-81): even on these tightened purse-strings, Hornabrook built a larger Church, training and infant schools, and teachers' accommodation. He increased dormitory capacity and extended the kitchens, all signs of Healdtown's relative privilege.

although these offered a superior education, admittedly enabling the African elite to escape menial labour and live perhaps more affluent lifestyles within the South African economic and social system.

In 1917, Molema largely defended that class privilege, which segregation and declining economic circumstances placed under grave downward pressure.[89] He identified with all Africans whom the deteriorating system disadvantaged, declaring that *The Bantu* spoke for them. All that retrospect lay ten years ahead. In December 1909, Modiri left Healdtown, but not Hornabrook, as events will show. In January 1910, he entered the Cape's most celebrated missionary school, Lovedale, and began a more detailed narrative of his life.

"Modiri's Scottish Forebears": The Lovedale Despatches

> "While we are entirely Presbyterian, we are also entirely and openly undenominational. We are both colour blind and denominationally blind" — *Dr Stewart*.[90]

> "My uncles began to reminisce about principals and masters of other days — Stewart, Henderson, Hunter….They spoke with affection about these good Scots names…." — *Noni Jabavu*.[91]

Modiri's years at Lovedale introduced him to a metaphorical Scotland and to Scots Presbyterianism four years before he arrived in Glasgow. *The Bantu* displayed a strong attachment to Scotland that was based on his intellectual, religious and emotional ties with the country. Indeed, he dedicated *The Bantu* to "*…Scotland — the Country and its People — the parent of the most illustrious heroes of Africa*".[92] Who were the heroes who became, in a real sense, some of his intellectual forebears?

In his presidential address to the Fort Beaufort Native Teachers' Association in Modiri's matriculation year (1912), senior Lovedale Practising School teacher, Cornelius Moikangoa, extolled Lovedale and its long-serving principal, Dr Stewart, a name still synonymous with African education:

> ...Lovedale is world renowned. The Institution was formally opened in 1841 with 17 pupils on the roll. The late Rev [William] Govan guided the college in its days of infancy, and his admirable work fell into the hands of his worthy successor, the late Dr Stewart...whose name ought to remain a household word in the homes of our people because of what he was and of what he did for the Bantu races in the Dark Continent…his was a glorious vision of winning Africa for God. For about 40 years he had practically no home, as his name Somxada bears witness. He was here, there, and everywhere. He died in 1905 with great schemes in his mind for the promotion of native education in our sunny south. The Institution last year was giving training to a little over 740 pupils of both sexes, representing all the Bantu races from the Cape to the Zambesi.[93]

Modiri and classmates were fortunate to have Moikangoa as a role model. He left Lovedale a year after Sebopiwa to head the Lovedale Practising School; he also edited the *South African Health Magazine*. His peers' respect was justified: "represented Lovedale at the first SANNC conference, as interpreter and committees' secretary. *Tsala ea Becoana* asserted, perhaps hyperbolically, that he was "conversant with all the native languages spoken within the Union".[94]

---

[89] Bonner, 1982: 298-99.

[90] Wells, 1919: 101.

[91] Noni Jabavu, 1963 & 1982. *The Ochre People*. (JHB: Ravan), p.28: the Jabavu family, as she showed, were "knotted" to Lovedale had intermarried with fellow ex-Lovedalians: the Makiwanes and the Bokwes. Cf. Appendix D, *infra*.

[92] Molema, 1920: unnumbered page preceding Preface.

[93] *TsalaBT*, 13 Apr 1912, "Fort Beaufort Native Teachers' Association". "Personalia", in *TsalaBT* (02 March 1912) paid tribute to Moikangoa (Lovedale teacher, 1907-1926).

[94] RU, LMIAR, Annual Report, 1902, "Second Year Class List". See Mweli Skota (1930: 77) on Moikangoa.

Lovedale's repute attracted eminent visitors. British novelist, Anthony Trollope visited in 1876, declaring it "a place which has had and is having very great success".[95] Its role in African education was robust, and its southern African reputation strong.[96] Moikangoa skirted the famed Govan-Stewart pedagogical rivalry: Somxada promoted practical and industrial education for Africans, sidelining Govan's preferred classical education.[97] Stewart had prevailed, to the Glasgow Missionary Society and CED's relief, and Govan retired. Moikangoa's *quasi*-hagiography did not much embellish Stewart's influence on his students. Under Stewart, Lovedale reached the forefront of Cape education. By the early 1900s, his students steadily topped the ranks of qualifying teachers. Even the young Morolong student who joined Lovedale five years after his death revered Somxada's omnipresent heritage.

Lovedale historian, Shepherd, praised Stewart's "nonracialism" despite his students' ethnic tensions, and white society's racial opposition. Later analyses have elucidated his Social Darwinist thinking and devotion to the Calvinist notion of the "elect". They argued that Lovedale's professed "liberalism" must be set against Stewart and successor, Henderson's abiding belief in African "backwardness". Stewart posed a rhetorical question to an important scholars' forum, the Lovedale Literary Society:

> [s]tarting as but yesterday in the race of nations, do you soberly believe that in the two generations of the very imperfect civilization you have enjoyed and partially accepted, you can have overtaken those other nations who began that race two thousand years ago...?[98]

This caution about black scholars' prospects was the Victorian missionary contribution to Cape liberalism. The minority (educated, property-owning, Christian Africans) had the vote, but the majority ("red" or blanketed landless "natives") did not. In 1908, Henderson urged agricultural progress on a "predominantly Bantu audience", implying that pastoralism was backward: "[i]f their people were poor then, they were doomed, he feared, to become still poorer in time to come". Nor should they blame Whites for causing "Native impoverishment". Modiri's headmaster believed that education

> …was doing a great deal to make the Europeans, their civilization, their ideas and their methods, intelligible to the Natives. It was throwing a bridge across the gulf of time that separated the two races.[99]

However compelling were the images of the "bridge" and "gulf of time", they expressed Henderson's belief that Africans were naïve, ignorant, and uncivilised by comparison with their colonisers. He saw "progressive" thinking as the only approach to living in a modern world; tradition had no place in it as "South Africa was being absorbed into the outside world". Although he introduced some "vernacular" education to Lovedale, this was to not to increase students' knowledge of African cultures. Rather, it was to enhance their understanding of colonial culture (civilisation) and modern technologies.[100] Such was the ethos of Modiri, Selope, Sebopiwa and Seleje's school. The fact that *The Bantu* debated so extensively the relative importance of European and African concepts of civilisation and culture suggests that he may have been tackling the views of his own headmaster — among others!

---

[95] Anthony Trollope, 1877. *South Africa*, v.1. (London: Chapman & Hall), p.159. His visit coincided with Silas' third year at Healdtown, which Trollope did not, apparently, visit.

[96] Walshe, 1970 & 1987: 8. Willan, 1984: 25. Couzens, 1985: 6 & 10.

[97] On this debate, Shepherd (1942: 157-58) cited Alexander Duff, 1867. "Report of Foreign Mission to Free Church…", p.162. WEG Solomon, 1948. *Saul Solomon: "The Member for Cape Town"*. (Oxford: OUP), p.318: Solomon, who sent his sons to Lovedale, sparked a furore, objecting that it taught Latin and Mathematics, but Healdtown did not. The *Commercial Advertiser*'s editor bit back: "[a]lthough we have never heard a whisper to the detriment of Lovedale, we know from sad experience that the coloured disciples of Virgil and Homer at the Kat River [Healdtown] were wanting in every needful requirement of the moral and social state. Greek verse and sheep-stealing were alike prevalent". Hewson (1959: II, 183-85): Ft Beaufort MP, RJ Painter, said of Healdtown: "the higher branches of education are quite unnecessary to such pupils".

[98] See De Kock, 1996, & Rich, 1987, *passim*. The Stewart quotation is from De Kock (1996: 89) cited RU, LMIAR, James Stewart, 1884. "Address to Lovedale Literary Society", p.27.

[99] Shepherd (1942: 273) summarised Henderson's words, hence the use of the third person.

[100] Shepherd, 1942: 273, 294-99.

Lovedale (like Zonnebloem) attempted to be a "total institution", standing out against a non-Christian local culture and "controlling every aspect of student life".[101] Besides bringing religion, education and "civilisation" to the Eastern Cape, Lovedale aimed to train African teachers and catechists, who might fare better than Scots in converting and educating "natives". Indigenous ministers' fluency in Xhosa would, the GMS hoped, convert the "heathen".[102]

Lovedale's spirit and history were largely embodied in its first three principals: Reverends Govan (1841-70), Stewart (1870-1905), and Henderson (1906-32). The ambiguous ideological matrix they constructed impacted directly on Modiri. Staunch Presbyterians, all passed through Scottish universities to lives of colonial evangelism on the Cape's eastern margins. So monumental was their influence on students like Modiri that the courses *they* followed *at their* universities may have shaped his own university choices. Another Scots missionary doctor, Neil Macvicar of Lovedale's Victoria Hospital, channelled Modiri's medical interest, leading him to six years' sojourn in his mentors' homeland.[103]

When Modiri came to Lovedale, it had succumbed to Cape government pressure. Like Stewart, Henderson battled the CED's constantly changing policies and the teaching curriculum and racial composition of scholars was greatly changed. In Shepherd's view, Dr Thomas Muir who replaced longterm incumbent, Dr Dale as SGE in 1892, effected these changes. But, as Catherine Hicks showed, school segregation began under Dale in 1891, with the separation of white and Coloured children. Muir proceeded to separate African and white children.[104] Lovedale, he objected, frittered away state funds on teaching Latin to "idle natives". Lovedale's protestations that its curriculum wasted no money, but included much practical and industrial work, did not mollify him. Actually, Lovedale had always practised some degree of internal segregation, despite having educated several eminent white Cape citizens — who would have slept, eaten and played in separate quarters from black scholars.[105]

Lovedale alumni peopled the ranks of political and religious leaders, educationists, and journalists.[106] But Healdtown and Lovedale's aims did not satisfy some alumni. Enoch Mamba, Healdtown graduate, complained to SANAC that the lack of government-funded education, which put missionaries in effective control, channelled Africans into a limited range of professions:

---

[101] Norman Etherington, "Education and Medicine". In N Etherington (ed), 2005. *Missions and Empire*. (Oxford: OUP), p.264: commented that both Lovedale and Zonnebloem were "total institutions".

[102] Shepherd, 1942: 87-89. Wells (1919: 103): "Lovedale lies near the eastern boundary of Cape Colony, 700 miles NE of Cape Town and 80 miles N of East London....on the banks for the beautiful river Tyumie".

[103] Shepherd (1942: 93, 169-70): Govan (b.1804, Paisley) left for the Cape, having read Classics at Glasgow University. Stewart (b.1831, Edinburgh) read divinity at New College, Edinburgh University, and qualified as a medical doctor (1866). He aided Livingstone in exploratory and mission work before reaching Lovedale. Henderson (b.1867, Caithness, north Scotland), also read Divinity at New College, and almost completed a medical degree serving 10 years at Livingstonia, Nyasaland (1895). Shepherd, 1942: 256. Adrian Hastings, 1996. *The Church in Africa, 1450-1950*. (Oxford: Clarendon), p.247, observed that Scots dominated the LMS's early missions and, of course, the Glasgow Missionary Society [GMS].

[104] On Dr Robert Dale, see *supra*, pp.111-12. Higgs (1997: 16) cited *Eastern Province Herald*, 12 Oct 1932, "Dale College King William's Town", and JD Shingler, 1973 "Education and Political Order in South Africa, 1902-1961", (Yale University, PhD Thesis), pp.55-56. Cf. *infra*, p.321ff, on Molema's discussion of missionaries, education and labour.

[105] Shepherd (1942: 98, 485): the Solomons were Lovedale alumni and lawyers: Saul Solomon's son, Saul, became a judge, and was knighted, like cousin Richard, South Africa's first High Commissioner to London (1910-13). Cousin William became South Africa's Chief Justice (1927-30). Solomon, 1948: 61n, 318-19. Plaatje's obituary of Richard Solomon (*TsalaBT*, 15 Nov 1913) called him a "worthy member of a Sterling Family", particularly noting his Lovedale schooling. Trollope (1877: I, 160) commented (1876): "[a]t Lovedale there are altogether nearly 400 scholars of whom about 70 are European". These included 50 "boy" borders. White day scholars paid 60s per annum, while Africans paid 30s.

[106] Lovedale produced high achievers, many (like Molema) with multiple careers. Prominent journalists were: Rev WW Gqoba, editor of *Isigidimi Sama Xhosa*, (Xhosa version of the *Christian Express*); *Imvo Zabantsundu*'s first owner-editor, JT Jabavu, and leading politician. Thema, editor of Rand-centred *Bantu World*, was SANNC Treasurer during its 1919 deputation to Versailles. Educationists: DDT Jabavu studied classics at Lovedale, later lecturing Classics at the South African Native College (Fort Hare). ZK Matthews (MA, Harvard), Molema's friend and a 1950s ANC office-bearer, became Professor of Customary Law and Anthropology at Fort Hare. Ministers of Religion: John Knox Bokwe, also an eminent classical composer. Of the few who chose scientific education, Tiyo Soga's children and grandchildren (several of whom took medical degrees abroad, and later became politicians and journalists) stand out. See Starfield, 1988: 2.

> [w]hat we want is Public schools. I want to send my boys where they will not go in for these Teachers' examinations at all. Training them all to be teachers is like training them all to be drunkards. A man cannot get a school, or if he does, it is such a small school in an out of the way place — perhaps he has to teach fifty children...on a very small salary, and when he gets to a town he gets drunk.[107]

Few students went on to study sciences. Modiri Molema was one of those few. When Modiri left Healdtown, going on to Lovedale was quite a family tradition, largely through Silas Molema's backing. Before departing for higher education in the United States in 1904, Sebopiwa (recently at Zonnebloem College, Cape Town) encouraged his *rángwané*, Silas, to send Modiri to Lovedale:

> [w]hen my brother Moliri is grown up and fit to be sent to colleges please father do not send him to Zonnebloem. Why?
> 1. Zonnebloem as you know is too close to the town and one is liable to get bad companies with this place.
> 2. Many boys of the College are Coloured boys and as a rule they indulge in liquors.
> 3. English-speaking is not enforced as it should be.
> 4. The general health of the place is bad to upcountry people.
>
> ...Lovedale is by far more the best Native School I know. Through it I am able to plunge through the sea.[108]

When Modiri enrolled in 1910, Lovedale and Healdtown were much further from Mafikeng than they are today, though train-travel had eased matters since his father's time. Eighteen-year-old Modiri, undertook a veritable rail epic to reach his new school. He rapidly translated this enterprise into anecdote for the Mafikeng Molemas of his safe arrival:

> My Dearest Father
> I am sure you will be glad to hear of my safe arrival in Lovedale. I am well. I hope all are still well at home.
>
> I just arrived here yesterday — Thursday afternoon at about four. My journey from Mafeking was very safe too. I arrived at Vryburg at 3 PM, and instantly got another train for Kimberley; I did not reach Kimberley until 2 oclock in the night.
>
> On Tuesday, I was joined by some Lovedale students, and we left Kimberley at 11.40 AM. I came up together with them as far as Cook House where I broke off my journey on Wednesday for a day and then on Thursday morning I took a train in the morning and was here in the afternoon.[109]
>
> I am glad to state that I did not have the unnecessary waitings which we anticipated. I have had to wait only in Kimberley, but even then I did not feel uneasy as I had a chance of knowing more about the place. I met Messrs Mbelle and Mshoko also Mrs Mbelle...[110]

Less formal than in his Healdtown letter, Modiri apologised for some suspicious smudges: "Please Papa pardon the blots". Formality did not lessen his wish to assure Silas of his safety. By then, Modiri must have been well-acquainted with the Mafikeng-Fort Beaufort/Alice route. Still, neither he nor Silas, who had travelled there well before rail-transport, took the co-ordination of the journey's four distinct "legs" lightly: unforeseen delays and mishaps, especially at Kimberley, a major railway junction might arise.

Train travel in 1910 was a racial undertaking. Anything might befall a black schoolboy at the hands of white guards. An odyssey in the Central South African Railway's new third class trains, the "Kafir Mail", was usually humiliatingly squalid. To Plaatje, it South Africa's "Jim Crow" service: unpunctual,

---

[107] *SANAC*, 1905: I, 1043-44, 21 March 1904, Mamba's Evidence.

[108] MPP A979 Ac1, 06 July 1904, SJM, Zonnebloem College to STM, Maf. I Schapera, 1979. *The Tswana.* (London: International Africa Institute), p. 44: western nuclear families give "aunts" and "uncles" less purchase on children than their biological parents, but Tswana society enjoins a child to call adult males and females in the family "*rra*" (father) and "*mme*" (mother). English would describe Sebopiwa as Modiri's "cousin"; Modiri would have called him older brother: *nkgonne*.

[109] Mafikeng to Vryburg by rail is 157 km (±98 miles); thence to Kimberley 170 km (±106 miles); to Cookhouse, 588km (368 miles) and, finally to Fort Beaufort, 91km (57 miles): ±1006 km (±629 miles).

[110] MPP A979 Ad1, SMM, Lovedale to STM, p.1. RU, HL, Cory Library, LP, LMIAR, 1911, p.83: Horatio M'belle was Modiri's contemporary. Willan (1984: 50) cited SM Molema, *Biography of Sol Plaatje*, p.27: Isaiah Budlwana M'belle was Plaatje's brother-in-law. (Cf. *infra*, p.199). CCP 11/1/3: "Electoral Division of Kimberley, 1897": M'belle was registered in Kimberley as a voter in 1894, his profession "interpreter", and was a householder on Central Road. Aged 24, he joined the Kimberley Attorney-General's offices (June 1894); by 1901, he was probably the Cape's highest paid interpreter, earning above £220 annually. *Koranta*, 01 June 1904, "A Grand Tea Meeting", recognising his eminence, St Paul's Mission School, Beaconsfield, Kimberley asked M'belle to present prizes at on 09 May.

overcrowded, and terribly slow. "[i]t took over 30 hours to reach Bloemfontein from Johannesburg — a distance covered by the express [for whites] in 11 hours".[111] Africans fared worse in stations than on trains. In 1902, Vryburg station's refreshment bar supervisor and her "native servant" assaulted Plaatje.[112] Going to school by train, Modiri would have repeatedly faced the government's assumption that "anything is good enough for a Kafir...".[113] Happily, his *sangfroid* in foreign parts sustained him, later saving him in Britain. His first Lovedale letter recorded how his abiding historical interest made him explore Kimberley, the forty-year-old city that had southern Africa's modernisation had created.

Safely at Lovedale, he began preparing for the Cape matriculation certificate with its vital university entrance. All was not plain sailing.[114] First he had to sit the school's stiff bursary examinations. Many scribbling frantically from 9am to 5pm for a place, had travelled from the country's towns and villages for this privilege.[115] Most African schools offered basic tuition to Standard III or IV; training colleges might proceed to Standard VI. Only Lovedale offered a university entrance examination to the most promising African scholars.[116] Fearing he might not be accepted at his new school, Molema focussed intently on the bursary examinations he and 39 others sat. Results were delayed and while waiting, he inspected his new environment. Lovedale's topography animated him as much as Healdtown's. It was:

> ...beautifully and even poetically situated, as it stands in the valley of the Tyumie, embossed in a profusion of trees and encircled by a ring of hills. To the uninitiated this is a serious temptation to misconstrue the name – Lovedale. It lies seven hundred miles east-north-east of Cape Town and eighty miles north of East London.[117]

A thousand miles from flat, dry Mafikeng, this landscape ringed by the Amatola Mountains, seemed quite exotic. The "dale's" lushness owed something to its natural endowment: rain. In most years it enjoyed almost as much as rain as Mafikeng in a "wet year". Shepherd showed how his evangelistic forbears had toiled to impose an ordered beauty reminiscent of Britain's countryside (orchard and village) on "wild" Africa.[118] Likewise, the missionaries were re-creating the local peasantry as quasi-British farmers: market-oriented crop- and cattle-farmers who, in turn, re-fashioned colonial space according to a Christian, colonial vision. With the realist novelist's eye, Trollope reported the students labour each afternoon to preserve that vision:

> [t]he native lads are called upon to work two hours each afternoon. They cut dams and make ready and take care of the garden. Added to the school are workshops in which young Kafirs are apprenticed. The carpenter's department is by far the most popular, and certainly the most useful. Here, they make much of the furniture used upon the place, and repair the breakages. The waggon makers come next to the carpenters in number: and then, the blacksmiths. Two other trades are also represented – printing...and bookbinding. There in all 27

---

[111] Willan (1996: 144-45) cited Sol T Plaatje, *Pretoria News*, 03 March 1911, "The 'Kaffir Mail': Discriminating fares".

[112] *Willan Papers*, 30 Dec 1902, Magistrate, Vryburg to Magistrate, Maf, "Complaint of Sol Plaatje".

[113] Willan, 1996: 145. *Koranta*, 30 March 1904, "Natives on CSAR: Deputation to Traffic Manager": Thomas Mapikela and Plaatje led a deputation against parlous railway conditions to OFS rail traffic manager, WH Barrett, demanding basic improvements: shelters for third class "native passengers" at major stations, decent latrines, and "steps...to have all slovenly and ramshackle closets cleaned...to ensure decency, privacy and the separation of the sexes".

[114] MPP A979 Ad1, late 1910?, SMM, Lovedale, to STM, outlined Molema's plans.

[115] Couzens' analysis (1985: 10) of *The African Yearly Register*'s biographies of the "living" stated that over half these 114 eminent persons had attended Lovedale. 65 (57%) were Lovedale alumni; 17 (14.9%) attended Healdtown, 8 (7%) Blythswood, 7 (6.1%) Kilnerton (near Pretoria), 6 (5.2%) St John's, 4 (3.5%) Clarkebury, 2 (1.7%) each, Fort Hare University and Zonnebloem College, and 1 (0.8%) Ohlange (Natal), Tiger Kloof (Vryburg) and Adams College (Natal).

[116] Thema (1935: 24 & 29): in his chapter on coming to Lovedale, "The Veil is Lifted", he used the image of African "darkness" yielding to mission education's "light". LP, LMIAR, 1910, p.99: Thema, (b.1886) entered Lovedale in 1906, studying *inter alia* Shorthand and Typing. He took second prize, in Modiri's first year, 1910.

[117] Molema, 1920: 234. See Map, *supra*, pp.178-79. Shepherd (1942: 94): "Immediately under these mountains [the Amatolas], and near the middle of the semi-circle, stood Chumie Mission Station, these oldest of all the stations, with the mission village almost buried among fruit trees, which had all been planted either by the missionaries or their converts."

[118] LP, LIAMR, Annual Report, 1910: in 1910, Lovedale had 25·18 inches of rain. Its annual average for 30 years was 24·27 inches. Cf. p.50 fn.87, showing Mafikeng's declining rainfall. Shepherd (1942: 90) cited *GMS Reports 1840*, pp.17-18 and 1841, p.17: larger than Healdtown, Lovedale was also better funded. The original edifice, later augmented by larger facilities, survived to remind generations of scholars of the school's history of book-learning and manual work.

> carpenters and four furniture makers, 16 waggon makers, 8 blacksmiths, 5 printers, and 2 bookbinders – all of whom seemed to be making efficient way in their trades.[119]

Trollope captured a somewhat ignored aspect of colonial settlement: that given poor transport, large distances between settlements and restricted access to products of all kinds, a mission station had to reproduce the kind of skilled artisan class that would have enabled a British village to sustain itself.

Hankering after his "old Institution — Healdtown", Modiri rejected this new setting when he next wrote home. Guessing too that money matters were uppermost in Silas' mind, he detailed the Bursary Exams. Examiners grilled the boys in "Arithmetic, English — (including, Analysis, paraphrasing and Dictation als[o] Translation) — and general knowledge". Silas stood warned that through no fault of his own, Modiri might have bungled the "Sesuto"-English translation. His mother tongue was, after all, Serolong, a Setswana variant sharing some Sesotho grammatical structures, but differing in vocabulary and orthography. Setswana joined the Cape matriculation curriculum the next year, but was not much taught in the mainly Xhosa-speaking Eastern Cape, where would-be teachers settled for Sesotho.[120] Modiri's attack of nerves proved unwarranted. Three days later he wrote to Mafikeng that,

> [t]he results have been published, and Papa you will, I am sure be glad to know that I obtained the top. The order of the names given below is the order of merit of those who got the bursary
>
> 1.Molema
> 2.Mlwandle
> 3.Jabavu
> 4.Niekerk
>
> Yes, papa I did get the top, and I am accordingly granted the bursary. My knowledge of English, I am told, is what helped me mostly. In Arithmetic I got 98 marks out of 100, and I missed the total only by 2 marks. I had [top obscured by water stain] mark in English. Papa Dear, I think I have made [it] clear and all I ask you to do is to write to Rev J Henderson, as to what you have to do as I have passed my Bursary.[121]

That day, his teacher, Mr Moikangoa (from Mafeteng, Basutoland) confirmed this news to Silas. He seemed to know Silas well, having just visited the Molemas in Mafikeng. He judged that Modiri (in the "Normal" class) had "done very well in the Examination", coming top out of the 28 boys who sat the examination. Modiri had been modest, not revealing all his marks, which. Moikangoa confirmed:[122]

Subject	Arithmetic	English	Essay	Reading	Sesuto	General Knowledge	Total
Maximum Marks	100	50	50	25	50	25	300
Modiri Molema	98	25	35	13	42	2	218
Alex Jabavu	—	—	—	—	—	—	208
Alfred Mlwandle	—	—	—	—	—	—	212
David Niekerk	—	—	—	—	—	—	198

Table 5: The Results of Modiri Molema's Bursary Examination

[119] Trollope, 1877: I, 160-61.

[120] MPP A979 Ad1, 25 Feb 1910, SMM, Lovedale to STM, pp.2-3. *TsalaBC*, 23 Dec 1911, "Secoana": only Tiger Kloof (nr Vryburg) and Pniel (near Kimberley) taught Setswana before 1911. Lovedale scholars and their parents thought the Sesotho examinations unfairly long, overtaxing examinees. *Secoana*/*Sechuana* were older spellings of Setswana. *Tsala* reprinted the first Sechuana Matriculation Paper, 30 Dec 1911.

[121] MPP A979 Ad1, 28 Feb 1910, SMM, Lovedale to STM, pp.1-3; in late 1908, Thema (1935: 29-30), awaiting bursary results, worked in the Johannesburg Pass Office's Finger Impression Department, which awakened him to the oppression of "his people", before Hobart-Houghton, the High School headmaster, wired that he had won the Hutton Scholarship.

[122] LP, LMIAR, Lovedale ROC, 1911, listed Moikangoa among the trainee teachers. He had entered Lovedale in 1906. Shepherd (1942: 518) stated that he was a "teacher in the Practising School, 1907-26" and, thereafter, "Itinerant Instructor in Orange Free State school". MPP A979 Aa2, 28 Feb 1910, C[ornelius] Rakhosi Moikangoa, Lovedale, to Chief Silas Molema, Mafikeng: Moikangoa addressed Silas as "Dear Father" and thanked him for behaving like "a real father" to "a stranger among you". He apologised for giving only the total marks for the other boys.

Only the four whom Modiri and Moikangoa named would receive bursaries. Eleven others won Andrew Smith Bursaries that year, including Horatio M'belle, Alexander Jabavu, and Elijah Makiwane (junior). Lovedale offered over seven different bursaries and scholarships annually.[123]

He had reason to spell things out for Silas, not just to ensure that family and Mafikeng friends like Theophilus Gaboutloeloe knew his triumph. He also wished Silas to be responsible for costs over and above the three-year grant.[124] It embarrassed him that fees were still owed to Hornabrook, and he clearly thought complete clarity might wrest that debt from Silas:

> Father my dear, I would like that everything, in the way of money, owed to Rev Hornabrook should be settled soon. I shall also send you the account for my books.[125]

Admittedly, Silas' accounts involved much borrowing and lending among his associates; Mafikeng's traders, some clan members and especially his lawyers had reason to demand "final" settlement of their accounts. He ignored Hornabrook's bills, despite Modiri's frequent entreaties. For the next year, Modiri wrangled with Silas over those offending £9, while Hornabrook, with Henderson's cooperation, held him a moral hostage to that debt. Mortified, Modiri explained the position definitively to Silas, pleading, "I hope you will try and settle that amount as soon as...possible".[126]

Embarrassment regardless, Modiri adjusted to Lovedale, befriending a relative from home, Taoana [Tawana] or Robert, he told Silas in late 1910.[127] Lovedale required students to surrender indigenous notions of time to the school's daunting labour régime. Every boy must work "two hours in the afternoons [at]…road-making, digging and hoeing; apart from the actual training they get thereby it is necessary for their bodily development and health".[128] With Presbyterian exactitude, each hour, each day had its ordained work. Thus Lovedale remoulded students' subjectivity: new duty, new time and new ambitions. Work intensified in September, he wrote, when the heavy season of examinations demanded glory of all students.[129] Lovedale's Presbyterian virtues mingled with Healdtown's Methodism to become cornerstones of his character. Leloba Molema recalled the older Modiri as "very moralistic, very strict. In terms of work ethic….More than Methodist but also Presbyterian…when it came to work, work hard". So highly did he prize hard work that on driving by his sister-in-law, Ella Moshoela (later Mrs Tshekedi Khama) walking to school, he refused her a lift, believing the walk good for her.[130] He was then married to Anna Moshoela, his father's sister, Ngwanakabo's granddaughter.[131]

---

[123] LP, LMIAR, 1910, p.101 and MS 16 292, ROC, 1911, show that Horatio entered Lovedale in 1902 and specialised in Handcraft in 1911, as did Niekerk (of Fordsburg, Johannesburg), who had also arrived in 1910. From Lower Tyumie came Elijah Makiwane (entered 1910) and brother, Tennyson (1908), who specialised in Business. Shepherd (1942: 487): Alexander Macaulay "Mac" Jabavu (1889-1946) later edited *Imvo Zabantsundu*. Elijah Cecil Makiwane was Rev. Elijah Makiwane's son, and autobiographer, Noni Jabavu's *malume* (maternal uncle) (1982: 14-23): at Lovedale, Cecil was nicknamed "Fish", as he loathed the compulsory swims in the Tyumie River that one missionary teacher insisted they take.

[124] MPP A979 Ad1, Late [19 Dec?] 1910, SMM to STM, p.II. *MM*, 22 July 1913, "Letter from Nota Bene to Editor": Gaboutloeloe devoted at least part of his time to journalism.

[125] MPP A979 Ad1, 28 Feb 1910, SMM, Lovedale to STM, pp.1-3.

[126] See MPP A979 Aa2-Aa4 and especially Aa5, STM's notebooks contained list of special taxpayers and livestock-sellers, all attesting to his capable record keeping. For demands from people who had loaned him money, cf. *supra*, p.161 & fns.388 & 389. MPP A979 Ad1, 09 July 1911, SMM, Lovedale to STM. MPP A979 Ad1, Da15, [Nd] Apr 1911, Plaatje, Lovedale to STM: Modiri was also stressed by suffering eyestrain, he wrote to Sol Plaatje (Apr 1911), who told Silas.

[127] See Appendix A, p.III. MPP A979 Ad1, 09 July 1911, SMM, Lovedale to STM: Robert was perhaps the future Dr Robert Setlogelo of Thaba 'Nchu (LP, MS 16 292, ROC, 1911, p.2), who became Harriet's second husband.

[128] *SANAC*, 1905: I, 680, 12 Nov 1903, Evidence of David Hunter, Lay Missionary, Free Church of Scotland, Lovedale.

[129] MPP A979 Ad1, 27 Sep 1910, SMM, Lovedale, to STM, p.1: "*Nako eno ea nyaga etletse tiro etona ea lithuto ka rebo rebakanyetsa li examinations*". ["This time of the year has a lot of work and learning as we are preparing for examinations".] In Sesotho orthography ("*li*" is pronounced "*di*"), Modiri signed himself "Moliri". De Kock (1996: 76: 32) cited Lovedale Collection, MS 10, 369: 24-28: years earlier, Lovedale master, James Aitken diarised Lovedale's gruelling daily routine: "everything is managed with a regularity and a clock-work precision which would not suffer by comparison with the daily duties appertaining to the best regulated military barracks".

[130] *Leloba Molema Interview, 1992*: Prof Molema stated that her uncle used cattle to pay for his young sisters-in-laws' schooling at Kilnerton. They were first wife, Anna's sisters, daughters of Rev Molema Moshoela, Ngwanakabo's son. *Rre*

Letters home enabled Modiri to keep imagining the Mafikeng world while living his full Lovedale life. But letters did not bridge the vastness between these worlds. He realised how rarefied school was. In *The Bantu*, picturing school from abroad, he described his school's distance and difference from most South Africans' lives. Despite its spiritual and community service ethos, Lovedale's religious and pedagogical discourses placed it in a different temporal and spatial dimension from most of the country.

"[B]eautifully and even poetically situated...in the valley of the Tyumie": Molema situated the school in a mythopoeic vale of peace, like his 1955 Healdtown description. In this valley, Africans could, as nowhere else, learn trades and professions and thereby often escape the menial roles segregationist government and supporters assigned them. Molema credited both GMS missionaries and Cape government for shaping Lovedale's early development: Dr Love, a GMS founder gave the school its name, Govan its substance, and Sir George Grey its future direction.[132] "Love", in happy coincidence, the fundamental Christian precept, he noted. Allegory aside, the "dale" (like Chumie Station) was "manmade", a collaboration between missionaries and Africans, both sheltering from Xhosa overlords, trying to garner a living and educate their children. Missions accrued temporal and spiritual power and, like frontier military fortifications, embodied "force — guns, water, the plow, the written word, and the underlying power that animated them" for all who "believed".[133]

Molema's Lovedale narrative in *The Bantu* exuded religious imagery. Like Healdtown, it was for him a "beacon", showering enlightenment on Africans:

> Dr Stewart became its principal in 1870. From humble beginnings, Lovedale, under his principalship, grew to be the most brilliant source of light for the Bantu peoples of South Africa. It has been, is, supported financially by the Free Church of Scotland, who govern it from Edinburgh. It is, however, entirely unsectarian, and within its walls all denominations all nationalities, and all colours are to be found. At one time as many as fifteen nationalities were represented in it….[134]

Lovedale's egalitarianism and "nonracialism" impressed him deeply. Like Moikangoa, he venerated Stewart, their school's embodiment. Neither they nor the many students who thanked Stewart gratefully, censured his condescension — at least not in their writings.[135] The *Christian Express*, Lovedale's official mouthpiece, proudly commended the school's fifty nonracial years, "[i]n boarding establishments there is no such thing anywhere in Africa or America".[136] Lovedale encouraged students to believe that fidelity to Empire and western education merited the reward of equal citizenship. This was one of a series of exchanges, (citizenship for loyalty, representation for taxation) which indicated their recognition of the Cape colonial state, disapprove of some government policies though they might.

For Molema education was the missionaries' most powerful weapon, and wrought structural socio-economic division among the African population. In contemporary ethnographic typology, he classified Africans as "civilised", "semi-barbarous" or "barbarous". While readers ninety years later might oppose

---

Piriepa Thwane Interview, 1992: Mr Thwane, over 90 at the time, and Dr Molema's steward at Motsosa Estate also emphasised Modiri's devotion to hard work, and exhortations to others to do likewise.

131 MPP A979 Ad3, 19 May 1919, SMM (to HM) conveyed his feelings for Anna after her engagement to Mmadichukudu.

132 For Molema (1920: 234): Lovedale's heritage embodied Grey's supposedly peaceable intentions to incorporate rather than slaughter Xhosa frontier farmers. On Grey, Saul Dubow, "Race, civilisation and culture: the elaboration of segregationist discourse in the inter-war years", Marks & Trapido (1987: 74) cited R Parry, 1983. "'In a sense citizens, but not altogether citizens...': Rhodes, race and the ideology of segregation at the Cape in the late nineteenth century", *Canadian Journal of African Studies*, 17 (3): 384-88.

133 Jean Comaroff, 1985: 150ff.

134 Molema, 1920: 234.

135 De Kock (1996: 96-100) cited students' praises of Stewart.

136 Shepherd (1942: 98-99) cited *Christian Express*, Sep 1891, p.139. On the missionaries' role in Cape liberalism, see Trapido, in Marks & Atmore, 1980: 259, 267. On the Cape franchise, see Davenport (1991: 91, 106-08, 281-86): though the Cape included Africans in the franchise (1853), successive governments' ambivalence towards their inclusion, and the liberal opposition's inability to insist upon it, resulted in their increasing exclusion.

such terminology, Molema used the racial and class discourse of his age, partly because he was steeped in it, and because his readers were too. To an extent, this portrait of Lovedale was his own intellectual history. By implication, his text placed him in the ranks of that small "civilised", socially-ambiguous professional class. The black intelligentsia might feel distant from less-educated Africans, but identified politically and culturally with them because their white professional counterparts scorned them utterly: "[t]he colour sentiment against these civilised blacks, then, is greater than it is against the uncivilised; they are more open to it, and apt to feel it more than their simpler brethren".[137]

Strong social and familial stimuli made him and many classmates prize academic achievement above rubies. This may explain his echo of Stewart's master narrative of "civilisation" and its elevation of Lovedale's previously downcast communities:[138]

> [t]here is slowly growing up a small, but steadily increasingly class among the Native population of this country who are possessed of acquirements educationally of which their forefathers did not dream, and did not even know the name.[139]

Molema accepted his place in the emergent social stratum he scrutinised, but did not preface *The Bantu* with the phrase "a member of the class".[140] In 1917, popular culture, the sciences and humanities used race as the dominant system of explaining unequal access to political, social and economic power. Racial discourse normalised white ascendancy over all black classes. In Dubow's words, "[t]he lived relations of paternalism which bound black and white together in South Africa presented white supremacy as part of the natural order of things in its (im)moral universe".[141] This racially-embattled country's citizens often underplayed class concerns, as did Molema — until *The Bantu*'s latter sections. In these later chapters, the traditional African culture often fell foul of his emergent class perspective:

> [m]issionary work at Lovedale is carried on among the Bantu on three main lines — religious, educational, and industrial. Medical work is also done in the Lovedale Hospital, and is an effective means of dealing death-blows at superstition.[142]

This statement revealed his Modernism. In disparaging traditional knowledge as "superstition" to be eradicated, he supported 1920s Christian and scientific notions of "natural" order.

Here, *The Bantu* clearly denounced older conceptions of African curative medicine and other beliefs missionaries deplored. He proclaimed the contribution of Lovedale and, more personally, three generations of Rolong Methodists, against centuries of traditionalist belief. Following missionary and scientific teaching, he spurned the vast hinterland of social and customary healing in Tswana societies, thus overlooking western medicine's colonising role. Healing, possibly more than any other area of Tswana life, was highly-prized and became a flash-point of conflict in the early nineteenth century. Successive missionary medics (like Livingstone and Mackenzie) tried to superimpose on the psychosocial process of Tswana healing an amalgam of "pure science" and Christianity. Often they used their curative methods artfully, as "miracles" and "revelations" to convert the "heathen". Scientifically-sanctioned potions and regimens were so often instruments of religious conversion that

---

[137] Molema, 1920: 276. Enoch Mamba told *SANAC* (1905: I, 1033) that educated Africans often felt angry at wielding no power in their communities, while the state deliberately appointed Headmen "who [are] averse to all civilisation".

[138] For De Kock (1996: 123), this "grand narrative" contained a "teleology of ultimate fairness and equal justice in a British constitutional system...". Peregrino (*SANAC*, 1905: I, 320) agreed that natives should advance "by slow stages of evolution".. The "grand narrative" was a work of many hands. Hewson's (1959: I, 43: 111) cited C.O.3904, no.269, 02 Aug 1816, Shaw, Memorial to Somerset. See Barnabas Shaw's statement on Industrial Education to Cape Governor Somerset, cited *supra*, p.110-11 fn.65.

[139] Shepherd (1942: 216) cited James Stewart, 1886. *Lovedale Past and Present.* (Lovedale), pp.xvii & xviii.

[140] Cf. Molema, 1920: viii.

[141] Dubow, 1987: 75.

[142] Molema, 1920: 232.

"medical missions...often acted as a key to unlock the hearts of many [people] the world over" the London Missionary Society's Founders' Week Convention (1895) records noted.[143] Molema's preference for western over Tswana medicine was as ambiguous as his socio-political philosophy.

The passage of time did not change his mind. In *Chief Moroka* (1951), he enunciated that in Setswana conceptions of healing:

> [e]very misfortune, every calamity and every fatality was ascribed to...perverse and malignant forces, manifested through and directed by human agencies...the whole business of life became one long sustained effort to overmaster, defeat or frustrate, avert, escape, humour or propitiate these sinister forces.[144]

This statement explained the "superstition" to which his 1920 comment alluded. He still construed "superstition" as the opposite of religion, rationalism and science his Christian upbringing and medical training gave him. Against traditional medical practice, he articulated both missionary orthodoxy and modernist "faith" in the rationalism of science. In so doing, he replicated the Lovedale worldview, as mediated through Dr Neil Macvicar, another Scottish University graduate. More of him later.

Determined othering of "superstitions" and "heathens" was integral to his upbringing and education — a missionary contribution to the African elite's creation. Molema anathematised that *other* system's beliefs; ironically, these "heathen" customs were strong enough to require his rhetorically violent "Death-blows"! *The Bantu*'s language and narrative veiled and unveiled his ambivalence towards Setswana culture and history. Phrased assertively, his verbal combat against the Other manifested initially as personal. But he was the bearer of two colonial discourses, Christianity and Modernism, which aimed jointly to assimilate Africans into global cultures of thought and consumption.

Othering involved a deliberate lived and narrative strategy of "making strange", of inhabiting ancestral communities yet distancing one's self from their beliefs and practices. Although Molema and contemporaries were technically not strangers in a strange land, western religion and education made them believe undereducated, non-Christian Africans significantly different from themselves. Education also gave him the power to narrativise the experience of people like and unlike himself.

Structural ambiguity underlay the representation process. For while he depicted "semi-civilised" communities as Other, he constructed "Africanness" as a national, potentially unifying force, in opposition to government iniquity. *The Bantu* portrayed a country united geographically, but estranged on ethnic, racial and class lines. This estrangement made people living beyond each other's perceived boundaries seem alien to one another and contemporary nationalist orators and writers accentuated the need for supra-tribal unity amongst Africans.[145] For those who, like Molema, travelled far for their education, those perimeters would have been familiar and strange in distinctive ways. When proposing the formation of a non-tribal body to represent all Africans, Pixley ka I Seme had rejected:

> [t]he demon of racialism, the aberration of the Xhosa-Fingo feud, the animosity…between the Zulus and the Tongas, between the Basuto and every other Native...We are one people. These jealousies, these divisions are the cause of all our woes and of all our backwardness and ignorance today.[146]

---

[143] Cf. Comaroff & Comaroff (1991: 157-58) cited *supra*, p.12 fn.67. Molema devoted *The Bantu*'s Chapter XVI to individual Scottish medical missionaries. See *supra*, pp.178-80, 185-86. Comaroff & Comaroff (1997: 333) cited LMS, Sep 1895. *Proceedings of the Founders Week Convention.* (London)

[144] Comaroff & Comaroff (1997: 343) cited Molema, 1951: 185-86.

[145] Cf. *infra*, p.348, for Seme's comments on the need to found the SANNC.

[146] SOAS Archive, London University, Mary Benson Papers, "The African Patriots", p.29, 24 Oct 1911, Seme to *Imvo*. *Drum*, July 1953. In Walshe, 1987: 34. Seme also stated in *Imvo*, 24 Oct 1911 (in Walshe, 1987: 33): "[w]e are one people. These divisions, these jealousies are the cause of all our woes and of all our backwardness and ignorance today".

Political life, in which Modiri's father and his many friends were increasingly involved, provided him with outside interests. While at school, his thinking appears to have matured under the strong influence of his Principal, Henderson, and the much-quoted, though late, Stewart. Eastern Cape students saw Lovedale's Principal take the national stage when invited to advise the National Convention to which representatives of many African political organisations flocked. Coming near the end of Modiri's Healdtown career, this immense gathering of African politicians (12 October 1908), can only have swept him up in the nationalising movement that would reject the all-white unification plans.[147]

Modiri had good reason to observe the Convention: his father was the delegate for Bechuanaland. One pungent Silas contribution exemplified values his children encountered at home. Seconding AK Soga's censure of the Colour Bar, Silas declared "the colour bar offended his dignity and religious values: '[t]he natives are human, created by God, and their rights should not be taken from them'".[148] Silas' humanism, like Soga's, characterised the elite's endorsement of equal rights, British justice and Cape liberalism. As David Chanaiwa argued, "[t]o the African elites, the theory, and to some extent the practice of Cape liberalism represented nonracialism, justice, democracy and common citizenship".[149]

Silas was the most authoritative figure in Modiri's life, with Henderson, a close second. "Education was a 'pearl of great price', he told the upturned faces before him, adding that their parents and communities laboured on farms and in mines for years to fund their schooling.[150] Recognising that most students' came from agricultural communities, Henderson urged them to remember the importance of agricultural skills no matter how much book-learning they imbibed. Deflating some students' dreams of the medical, legal, and ministerial careers, he reminded them that their "future as a race was bound up with their use of the soil". In the current political ferment, he added, Lovedale's duty was to produce future leaders, and cultivate responsibility to the character-building virtues of discipline, obedience and self-restraint.[151] Around 1912, Henderson's insistence on Africans' ties with "the soil" became increasingly conservative as, often joining government initiatives, he opposed the trend towards urbanisation.[152]

School was not all about principals and national awareness. Modiri's peers also provided political education. On 15 August 1910, a food riot erupted. The samp, a standard menu item ordered regularly from Kingwilliamstown, was stored in a tank, and had gone "off". Girls and boys alike balked at eating it. Henderson descended from his secluded dining quarters to the pupils' and ordered the "rotten" mealies laid in the sun to dry pending the fresh maize's arrival on Monday 29 August. Restlessness mounted throughout Sunday 21 August at the thought of another samp-less week. Next afternoon, students downed pens and tools in revolt against Lovedale's strict régime. After thunderous protests

---

147 Odendaal (1984: 118): other Cape advisors included Thembuland MLA, Theo Schreiner (1844-1920) and Joseph Orpen. African newspapers supporting the Convention included Eastern Cape media rivals, *Imvo* (Jabavu) and *Izwi Labantu* (Soga brothers and Rubusana). (Cf. Wilson & Perrot, 1973: 708.) "Nationalis*ing*" is used to describe the lengthy negotiations between delegates of many political positions from which a countrywide African nationalist alliance emerged by early 1912.

148 Odendaal (1984: 179) cited *The Friend*, 27 March 1909 and Soga's opinion that most Africans "still had a long way to go before they could participate on an equal footing with Europeans...". This statement and Molema's opinion (1920: 240) that "the Bantu are in their teens", revealed the ambiguity of African liberalism.

149 De Kock (1996: 112-13) cited David Chanaiwa, 1980. "African Humanism in South Africa: The Utopian Traditionalist, and Colonialist Worlds of Mission-Educated Elites". In AT Mugomba & M Nyaggah (eds), 1980. *Independence Without Freedom: The Political Economy of Colonial Education in Southern Africa*. (Santa Barbara; Oxford: ABC-Clio), p.16.

150 Adult Modiri also used the proceeds of farming to fund his children and relatives' education. Leloba Molema (*Interview, 1992*) recounted that her father, Sefetoge had studied in Edinburgh for "...ten years, without ever once coming back. And he didn't have a scholarship; he was educated with cattle left to my uncle by his father, charged with taking care of his younger brothers and sisters, and I guess he did a good job, took it very seriously". The Royal College of Physicians [RCOP] Queen Street, Edinburgh, (20 Apr 1939: No.7859) recorded that Dr SS Molema took the Triple Qualification in 1939, licensing him to practise medicine, as the licentiate of three Royal Colleges: Physicians, Edinburgh, Surgeons, Edinburgh, and Physicians and Surgeons, Glasgow. His address was c/o McPherson, 2 Royal Crescent, Edinburgh.

151 Shepherd, 1942: 269-70, 279. Cobley (1997: 72): Makiwane (1850-1928), was the second African ordained as an United Free Church of Scotland Minister.

152 Dubow (1995: 200): creditably, Hornabrook and Henderson's evidence to the Government Select Committee on Native Education (1912) contested the theory that adult Africans suffered from "arrested development".

during supper, "uproar" ensued, with boys "shouting and rolling stones on the iron roof of the lavatory and some of the dormitories". Briefly glorious, they occupied the space their schoolmasters controlled so rigorously. The protest's vehemence suggested underlying issues, but reports omitted these.[153]

Henderson was not unsympathetic, but a fortnight elapsed between discovering the rotten maize and the arrival of fresh stock. He berated the suppliers, the Kaffrarian Steam Mill Company, but the delivery date could not be brought forward, in that era of mostly horse-drawn transport.[154]

Knowing his limited communication powers, he hastily summoned Elijah Makiwane (senior), to "reason" with the boys in the Large Hall at 7.30 pm. Makiwane's authority derived from his being one of Lovedale's first two ministerial graduates and the founder of the Native Education Association.[155] His sons, Elijah and Tennyson, were Modiri's contemporaries. He did not calm the scholars for long.[156] Despite Henderson's rejection of the rotten food, the "trouble" made his position untenable: a "riot" could worsen Lovedale's image, confirming white prejudice. Striving to placate the irascible Muir, still negatively disposed to African education, Henderson deliberately downplayed events: only six, doubtless hungry boys went "out of bounds...to steal oranges" from one of the school's orchards. He estimated that another fifth of the scholars marched into Alice next morning to telegraph Muir their protests. But, Henderson soothed the SGE, these boys were "troublesome" "Fingo" first years (Modiri's class), in the Normal Department. These "weak unstable characters" did not represent the whole school.

Ultimately, eight dissidents were expelled and rusticated; eighty more chose to follow. Their parents, backing Henderson, returned them to school![157] Modiri's name was absent from the list sent to Muir, showing that he had not rioted. Perhaps fearing paternal reaction, he omitted these events from letters. Probably, he did not enjoy damp samp either but, as in later life, avoided violence in making his point.

Such tumult was rare. Students usually followed the school's daily routines. Lovedale life was humdrum, Modiri told his sister Harriet in September 1911: "[l]ife is running on pretty smoothly out here — Niether [*sic*] very dull nor yet very bright except on special occassions [*sic*]. But every one is busy preparing for examinations you know, this is a busy session".[158] He did not say that, at the monthly debate in June, he had opposed his friend Horatio M'belle's motion, "Was the Acquittal of Warren Hastings justifiable?" Several debates topics that year later resurfaced in *The Bantu*. Modiri and Horatio also sat together on the Lovedale Training Society Committee, which aimed to encourage the scholars' love of learning and literature. At weekly meetings Debates, essays, readings and recitations were presented on such heated issues as "Should Kafir Beer be dispensed with?" (22 April) and "Would Woman Suffrage be beneficial to South Africa?" (6 May).[159]

---

[153] SGE 1/924, 31 Aug 1910, James Henderson to Dr Muir, "Report regarding the Insubordination of certain pupils at Lovedale, 21-24 Aug, [19]10.

[154] SGE 1/924, 31 Aug 1910, Memorandum of Inspector TW Rein to SGE, Cape Town; 23 Aug 1910, SS Wilson, Grain Department, The Kaffrarian Steam Mill Co. Ltd, King William's Town to James Henderson Esq.

[155] Jordan (1984): Makiwane founded the Native Education Association in 1884, at a time when political organisation was crystallising in the Eastern Cape. *Imbumba Yama Nyama*, the South African Aborigines' Association, had been founded in 1882. In 1884, JT Jabavu also founded the Native Electoral Association.

[156] Higgs (1997: 55) and Odendaal (1984: 6-8): in 1876, Makiwane was *Isigidimi Sama Xhosa*'s first editor. Noni Jabavu (1963 & 1982: 18): Makiwane's daughters Florence and Freda married DDT Jabavu and ZK Matthews. LMIAR, 1910, Florence was a first year student when Modiri was in second year. Cf. *supra*, fn.123 & *infra*, fn.196 on the Makiwanes.

[157] SGE 1/924, 31 Aug 1910, James Henderson to Dr Muir, "Report regarding the Insubordination of certain pupils at Lovedale, 21-24 Aug, [19]10; *Alice Times*, 28 Aug 1910, "Revolt at Lovedale: Students Dissatisfied".

[158] MPP A979 Ad3, 03 Sep 1911, SMM to HM. RU LP, MS 16 292, ROC, 1911, p.2: listed Modiri's name in the Second Year Class for Matriculation.

[159] LP, LMIAR, 1911, p.81-82. Proposers were JP Kobe "The Future of South Africa" (24 March), EG Kumalo "The Dignity of Labour"; N Bouverie "Duties of Civilised and Uncivilised Nations", bursary student, Mlwandle "The Present State of Civilisation amongst the Natives" (7 Apr) and Tennyson Makiwane, "Which exercises the greatest influence for good — the pulpit or the Press?" (22 Sept). The Victoria Day Concert, arranged by Mr FS Zibi, took place on 26 May. Jeremiah Kobe and Ewart Kumalo were second year Normal Department students. Bouverie was in the First Year B group. LP, LMIAR, 1911, p.83, Cf. *MM*, 06 Oct 1911, "Kaffer Beer". Tennyson Makiwane was the Secretary.

Letters kept him close to his family, but could not replace them. Though devoted to his sisters, his bond with Harriet was especially close. He commiserated over her ordeals in finding work, playfully offering to coax Silas to send her to Lovedale. Eldest sister, Seleje, ("Mrs Taoana", he teased her) stood rebuked for writing briefly and being too devoted to her children. He hid his hurt behind masterful simile that revealed how politics preyed on his mind: "[d]on't treat me as the Union Government is treating the Natives please — cruelly and mercilessly Oh don't my sweet sister Seleje — don't". That September, Sebopiwa, fresh from America, revisited Lovedale to find Modiri frantically preparing for exams.[160]

Ordinary examinations he could manage, but was unprepared to take matriculation a year earlier than anticipated. He learnt too late that his name somehow featured on the 1911 examinees list. Worse, Modiri protested, Mr KA Hobart-Houghton had no time to inform the Education Department of the error. More terrifyingly, he had to explain the confusion to Silas, "... a day before the examinations in November, he [Houghton] got a wire...that my name had been enrolled for Matriculation, so I just sat for the examination". He concluded forlornly, "I have hope Rra".[161]

Clearly there was confusion, as Houghton had told Silas in September that he had entered Modiri for the University Senior School Leaving Certificate, the equivalent of the "matriculation", adding that Latin was not compulsory for the former. He believed Modiri was ready for this examination: "Your son has been doing good work and has made considerable progress in his studies….in the work he does in connection with the hospital".[162] With hindsight, application in September for such an important examination may seem late and may explain why the department did not confirm until November, which would explain why Modiri had not, apparently, begun preparation.

After this character-building experience, he made arrangements to pay Healdtown the debt that Silas steadfastly resisted settling. Silas was financially overextended, with lawyers' fees, and Sefetogi and Morara's Mafikeng school fees straining his income.[163] Being married, Seleje was no longer his care, but Harriet, though qualified, was still jobless.[164] This did not fully explain why he had not paid the two-year-old account for which Hornabrook and Henderson were pressuring Modiri. Into the breach stepped farsighted Neil Macvicar.

Macvicar was one of the remarkable medical men of his time, hard taskmaster and an inspiration, who "almost completely fulfilled the ideals of the movement for medical missionaries".[165]As a medical missionary, both Livingstone and HM Stanley had kindled his desire to serve Africa. Like Livingstone, Mackenzie, Stewart and Henderson, his origins lay in small-town Scotland's Presbyterian piety: he was

---

[160] MPP A979 Ad3, 03 Sep 1911, SMM to HM and 15 Sep 1914, SMM to Madam S[eleje] J Taoana. *TsalaBC*, 23 Sep 1911, "Baeti" ["Visitors"]. On Sebopiwa, see MPP A979 Ad1, 27 Apr 1920, MSM to STM. Cf. *supra*, p.131 & fn.198.

[161] MPP Ad1, p.2, first page missing, others dated 1911. Wilson & Perot (1973: 701): Stewart convinced Hobart-Houghton (1880-1960), MA Trinity College, Dublin, (1902) to work at Lovedale. He became Inspector of Schools in 1914. Thema (1935: 30): "Mr Houghton was the headmaster of the High School....an able master, competent teacher and a great builder of character. His sole ambition was to popularize the academic course [standard VI]….Some [to-day hold] important positions among the African people…Others have fought and are still fighting battles in the cause of African freedom".

[162] MPP A979 Aa2.31, 12 Sep 1911, KA Hobart Houghton, Lovedale, to Chief STM, Maf: the letter is slightly torn.

[163] MPP A979 Aa3.6.1, 15 July 1904: Silas had many financial obligations. He and Plaatje loaned £650 from Charles Wenham to fund *Koranta*, mid-1904, at 12% interest. During 1911, Plaatje begged Silas for funds — unsuccessfully. Though he leased land to white farmers, their rents were often late. His cattle-and land-based finances yielded little "ready" money. Family letters show that he continually sent them small sums but still owed more, eg. A979 Aa104 May 1908, Harriet Molema, Emgwali to STM, Maf, thanked him for £6.2.1, saying she still owed ±12/6 for books.

[164] MPP A979 Ad1, 08 March 1911, SMM to STM: despite good qualifications, Harriet found no work, eventually taking a post at underfunded Lyndhurst Road School. Also *TsalaBC*, 23 Dec 1911, "Personalia", "Miss Harriet Molema, of the Lyndhurst Road Public School, left on Saturday, [for] the jubilee of her Alma Mater [at]…Emgwali this week. Emgwali Girls School is under the auspices of the ladies of Glasgow". MPP A979 Ae3, 7 Oct 1911, [Miss] Janet MacGregor invited Emgwali Alumni to the Reunion. Several third-generation Molemas (Modiri, Morara, Sefetoge, and Sebopiwa) attended Healdtown and Lovedale before tertiary education. Seleje and Ketlareng just attended Lovedale. (Cf. MPP A979 Aa1, 04 May 1908, HTM, Girls' Dept, Emgwali, to STM indicated her "money troubles"; LP MS 16 292, ROC, 1904, pp.16-17.)

[165] AC Ross, "The Scottish Missionary Doctor". In Derek Dow (ed), 1988. *The Influence of Scottish Medicine: A Historical Assessment of its International Impact.* (Carnforth, Lancashire: Parthenon).

born in 1871 at his father's Manor manse. His long five-year legal apprenticeship to Blackwood & Smith, Peebles, indicated his famed thoroughness; but then he turned to medicine. He distinguished himself at Edinburgh University's Medical School, earning several eminent professors' praise and partaking fervently in the Medical Students' Christian Association.[166]

After four years at the Church of Scotland's Blantyre mission, Nyasaland, Macvicar migrated south to their pre-eminent southern African mission, Lovedale, which was taking health care increasingly seriously. He was tasked with improving the image of the station's Victoria Hospital, one of many like-named memorials to the late queen's diamond jubilee.[167] Having opened inauspiciously just before the South African War, the hospital closed for its duration. Many Lovedale inhabitants distrusted its medicine.[168] Shepherd, Macvicar's biographer and Lovedale's future principal, wrote, "conservative Africans thought of a hospital as a place of death rather than of life".[169] Macvicar —"'an ideal medical missionary'" — reached Lovedale in 1902, as the War ended and the hospital re-opened. In missionary style, he soon allegorised the hospital as a beacon of light in a dark world, words that unintentionally prefigured Molema's 1917 contrast between science and superstition.[170]

Prejudice cut several ways: while Africans feared the hospital, white prejudice against hospital care for and by Africans ran high. Furthermore, African curative practitioners struggled increasingly to meet their communities' needs. Shula Marks analysed the rise of industrial diseases and declining health of South African black people, noting the contemporary adage that "'infectious disease knows no colour bar'". Medical and government circles concluded that white nurses could not tend black patients, and thus, in the early 1900s, decided that "[a]ny expansion of hospital services for blacks was thus seen to necessitate the training of more black nurses".[171]

Modiri was part of this process of training black medical personnel, fostered by Macvicar at Lovedale. Yet, the treatment he received from those hallowed white nurses, two decades after the training programme began, sadly showed that prejudice was outpacing medical training. In 1927, now *Dr* Molema, he felt white nurses' indignation at "taking orders" from a black doctor. Whereas Lovedale's Victoria Hospital had ushered him into medical practice, the white nurses at Mafikeng's Victoria Hospital struck to protest against taking orders from a black doctor.[172]

Macvicar's chief contribution to South African medical practice was to train several generations of African nurses to staff the country's hospitals. He held that the spread of contagious diseases among black people, and white nurses' aversion to caring for them confirmed the need for black nurses.[173] Edinburgh University had made him a modern scientist, but Lovedale made him forward-looking. He further objected that black nurses' training was tolerated as essential to South Africa's social survival,

---

[166] RHW Shepherd, 1952. *A South African Pioneer: The Life of Neil Macvicar.* (Lovedale: Lovedale Press), p.16: in 1893, Macvicar interviewed Stanley in Edinburgh. His professors praised him for surviving smallpox and scarlet fever to take first class honours as his year's best student. Prof John Chiene extolled his distinction in Surgery, Medicine, Midwifery and Medical Jurisprudence. He specialised for 6 months under physician, Argyle Robertson, and eye-surgeon Prof Greenland. Specialist eye-care was, he believed, essential for any doctor going to Africa.

[167] Shula Marks, 1994. *Divided Sisterhood: Race, Class and Gender in the South African Nursing Profession*. (JHB: WUP), p.81. See Appendix D for Noni Jabavu's 1960s' description of the hospital.

[168] Wells (1919: 227-30): in 1895, DA Hunter organised the collection of a "large sum", which the Colonial Government matched pound for pound, for the Hospital's construction.

[169] Shepherd's (1952: 83) opinion of African conservatism suggests that Molema's disdain for African medicine had strong marks of Lovedale ideology.

[170] Wells, 1919: 228. LP, LMIAR, 1910, Dr N Macvicar, "The Victoria Hospital", p.100. Also Shepherd, 1952: 8 & Shepherd, 1942: 356.

[171] Marks, 1994: 82.

[172] Marks, 1994: 59-60. *Victor Mapanya Interview, 1992*: in sad irony, when Dr Molema fell ill suddenly (Sep 1965), his son, Lesedi, rushed him to the Victoria Hospital, which had ejected him in 1927. He died in the foyer. See *infra*, p.341.

[173] Shepherd, 1952, endpaper Map of Macvicar Nurses throughout South Africa. Marks (1994: 84) cited RU, Unaccessioned Macvicar Papers, 20 May 1904, Macvicar to Stewart.

but that training black doctors (in university and hospital facilities) was not. He fought the authorities, but they only allowed him to train blacks as medical orderlies. Even in 1929, fifteen years after Modiri went to Glasgow, future ANC President, Dr AB Xuma wrote, "the doors of opportunity and training are barred and bolted against" black would-be doctors; South Africa had only seven black doctors in all! [174] In 1936, the South African population was 9.5 million, of which Africans numbered 6.5 million (69 per cent), whites numbered 2 million (21 per cent).[175]

On arriving at Lovedale, Macvicar doubted that black students could master the full medical curriculum but, as Xuma loved quoting in later years, he soon learned that "[a]fter a high school education Bantu students can go through the European medical course as successfully as any other students".[176] Macvicar's pioneering encouragement of African nurse and doctor training epitomised Lovedale's mildly assimilationist beliefs about African education. For years, he and professional nursing bodies fought government proposals to foist second-grade education on African and "Coloured" nurses.[177] The South African Medical Council and successive governments prevaricated even longer over unbolting "the doors of opportunity" to black doctors. Future African, "Coloured" and Indian doctors had to train abroad. Only in 1928 would CT Loram's investigation into the medical training of Africans be tabled in parliament and the gradual reform of medical education begin.[178]

In 1911, Macvicar could train the passionate young Mafikeng man only as an orderly. Sensing Modiri's talent and sympathetic to his financial troubles, Macvicar tutored him.[179] Black orderlies could work only with their "own people", as doctors' aids and in understaffed Transkeian dispensaries.

At Lovedale, then, Modiri began to identify with the faith, ideology and personality of these "good Scots": Govan, Stewart, Henderson and, above all, Macvicar, through whose compassion and discipline, he came closer to his goal of becoming a doctor.

"O Tsetse Fella Yaka Peba" ("Like Father, Like Son") — Modiri versus Silas: [180]

Modiri first mentioned this exceptional doctor that year, when Macvicar cured him of an eye infection — Macvicar's specialisation.[181] Once recovered, Modiri performed duties at the Hospital for the rest of the year, getting to know the doctor. Macvicar wanted to win him uninterrupted time at the hospital, and proposed a special arrangement to repay Healdtown's debt:

> [y]ou know Rra there was a bill of £9 owing to Mr Hornabrook in Healdtown that is part of my school fees which was not payed [*sic*] when I was there. This bill [illegible] is now to be paid and settled by Dr Macvicar on conditions that this coming year I help as a hospital orderley [*sic*] in the Victoria Hospital at

[174] UW, Xuma Papers, ABX230723, 23 July 1923, "Marquette University School of Medicine, Second Year Class Report.... June 13, 1923", Xuma graduated at Marquette, Milwaukee, WI. ABX290731, 31 July 1929, Xuma, "Medical training for Native S[outh] Africans", (for British Association for the Advancement of Science), p.1: he argued that "the African" contributed directly and indirectly to the country's revenue, so that "...ample provision [should] be made for the training of his youth as far as his European neighbour[s]". "White" universities with medical training facilities excluded black students.

[175] Walshe (1970 & 1987: 135) cited E Hellman & AJ Friedgut (eds), 1949. *Handbook on Race Relation in South Africa*. (Cape Town), pp.306-13. Xuma, 1929: 2.

[176] Xuma, 1929: 2.

[177] Marks, 1994: 59, 92-93.

[178] Shapiro (1987: 236) cited UG 35 (1928), "Report of the Committee appointed to inquire into the Training of Natives in Medicine and Public Health" (Loram Committee Report). Marks (1994: 141, 255, fn.11) noted that black doctors continued to experience difficulties in obtaining training and then employment even after World War II.

[179] *SANAC*, 1905: 1, 682, 12 Nov 1903, Hunter's evidence. Lovedale began training orderlies after the South African War. *Christian Express* editor, Hunter, explained: "[o]ur idea is to train these young men for three years, in dispensing, in dressing, and in sick nursing in the male ward. Then...if their characters warrant…and they show sufficient ability, we propose…a further 18 months' training in elementary medicine and surgery".

[180] Plaatje (1916b: 57, Proverb 546) compared the Latin adage, "*qualis pater, talis Filius*", like father, like son.

[181] MPP A979 Ad1, 08 March 1911, SMM to STM.

> Lovedale, and then at the end of the year, I shall receive a certificate as a fully qualified hospital assistant and dispenser. This is of course if I am successful in my examination. My bursary is also still available for one year more so it just suits my purpose.
>
> Besides Dr Macvicar has also promised to give me additional lessons in medicine.
>
> On the other hand father, if I am not successful this year with my matriculation then I shall have to prepare again for it, and attend the hospital in the afternoons as I have been doing up to now.[182]

In Cape Town on a holiday job when writing, Modiri warned that should he not matriculate, he could not work in the Hospital, and Silas must repay Macvicar's £9. Modiri's "blackmail" insinuated that Macvicar might also appropriate Silas' fatherly role in making his career decisions. His tense words suggested he was near breaking point, facing financial and academic shame. He had 10/6 in his pocket, he told Silas, and desperately needed "[£]1.10" to get to Lovedale before 6 January to report for duty. He also needed a new suit of clothes but told Silas not to bother if it was beyond the family means.[183] Preparing for the SANNC's founding conference in Bloemfontein (8 January 1912), Silas tersely sent exactly £1.10.[184] Admittedly, Silas was preoccupied with the immense responsibility of helping to found the body that he and colleagues hoped would represent all Africans in the post-Union era. Silas played a vital role on the national political landscape, being one of seven permanent Vice Presidents elected to represent the provinces and protectorates.[185] Yet, he did not let momentous events in the political world obscure his role as a stern father. Retaliating to Modiri's "advantage" in their war of nerves over Macvicar's £9, he accused his son of being unready for examinations because of wasting Saturday afternoons with fun-loving Mmadichukudu "Dick", Lekoko's son, newly at Healdtown. Stung into indignation, Modiri's reaction to Silas betrayed the pitch at which he worked, and scorn for playboy Dick, his future rival for Anna Moshoela's affections[186]:

> [a]s for going to see Mmalichukudu in Healdtown on Saturdays, every Lovedale boy knows and can affirm that I am busy from Monday to Sunday every week. Saturday is one of my busiest days in the Hospital, I am only free after dinner to supper on Sundays. Any body who knows me and stays in Lovedale can affirm this Rra. Malichukudu may not know it: he is only a new boy at Healdtown.[187]

In this self-vindication a new tone emerged, usually veiled to maintain paternal respect. Modiri was already copying the Scots doctor's round-the clock work habits, pausing only for the Sabbath, and taking hospital duties as grounding for his future career. Leisure hours were now work time, in keeping with professional requirements and his adult persona: "Saturday is one of my busiest days". Besides, he knew he had a reputation for work. Fellow scholars (in truth, there were 410!) could testify to his diligence.[188] Mmadichukudu's 1914 misconduct at Lovedale further vindicated Modiri's passionate self-defence. Lekoko apologised personally to Rev Henderson.[189] The incident and accusations indicated the strict standards of behaviour that Lovedale (Lovedale parents!) demanded.

---

[182] MPP A979 Ad1, Late [19 Dec] 1911, SMM to STM, pp.III-IV: Modiri stayed with JM Molebaloa, (Ndabeni Location, Maitland, Cape Town). Cf. *TsalaBC*, 16 Dec 1911, "Cape Town"; *TsalaBT*, 03 May 1913.

[183] MPP A979 Ad1, [19 Dec?] 1911, SMM to STM, pp.V-VI: Harriet joined him in Cape Town.

[184] MPP A979 Ad1, 09 Jan 1912, SMM to STM. *MM*, 15 Aug 1911: Lekoko and councillors met with Peregrino about forming a "South African Native Congress"; Plaatje (*TsalaBC*, 30 March 1912) called it "nothing less than a Native Parliament [and] the real voice of the people". Cf. *MM*, 30 Nov 1911, "Montsioa's Stadt"; *TsalaBC*, 23 Dec 1911.

[185] *TsalaBC*, 13 Jan 1912, "Kopano ea Bancho" ["The People's Gathering"]: the other Vice Presidents were SM Makg[h]ato, Transvaal, Philip Modisa, Basutoland; John Mocher, Bloemfontein, Thomas Zini, Cape Town, William Letseleba, Johannesburg, and M Kambula.

[186] Modiri's *ntsáláo* (father's sister's son), Dick, acted sociably in Mafikeng (02 July 1915), when Healdtown and Lovedale's choirs visited; he raised a choir to join them in a concert. *TsalaBT*, 17 July 1915, "Mafikeng: Grand Concert" [Setswana]: singled out Anna's solo. See KAB 1/MFK 57 N2/4/2, "Rural Trading and Business Sites". 22 Aug 1938, "Schedule of Sites on which Natives are conducting trading operations on Trust Land — Mafeking District": as one of six African traders in the Molopo Native Reserve, Dick ran at least one general dealership in the Stadt in the 1930s.

[187] MPP A979 Ad1, 09 Jan 1912, SMM to STM.

[188] SGE 2/312, 9-10 May 1911, "School Inspection Form for Lovedale Native Training School": in 1911, the Boys' School numbered 86; the Girls' School, 53; the Elementary School (mixed), 111; the Industrial Schools had 56 girls and 114 boys.

[189] MPP A979 Bd1, 28 Apr 1914, Chief Lekoko to James Henderson, Lovedale, "Desertion of Dichukudu Marumoloa": apologised for his son's misbehaviour, wishing him "to be submissive to his teachers". A979 Bd1, 28 Apr 1914, Lekoko to

Apparently Silas bore these rebukes humbly; by month-end Modiri was thanking him for "your sweet letter...the sort of letters I would always like to have from Papa". Mercurial Papa lost patience by return of mail when Modiri admitted to failing the exams. Hornabrook, Henderson and middleman Macvicar stuck to their ultimatum: pay the money or be barred from lessons. Now desperate, Modiri saw his dream to become a doctor in tatters. He must now placate two formidable forces: his educational mentors, *and* his father. Silas stonewalled; but his son had his own ambitions and, for perhaps the first, but not the last time, acted independently. He audaciously promised Henderson that the amount would be forthcoming. Predictably, Silas raged in annoyance, but finally coughed up. Modiri's determination was worthy of Silas himself.

This "victory" immediately secured his schooling and career plans. He had also won a sneaking advantage over his father. Controlling the damage *post facto*, he despatched a propitiating letter to Mafikeng sensing that Silas needed mollifying. As an irrepressible parting shot, he requested that his book account be settled:

> I am very glad it is paid off. The next account to be settled here is that of the Bookstore here, for…1910 and 1911. This year I bought all the books I required at Capetown with the money I earned when I was helping in an office there. The amount owing to the Manager of the Bookstore for those [1910/11] books is £2.15.[190]

Harriet also kept him going, sending him £4 in June. Above that, he earned money in Cape Town during school holidays. While there, he sang with Lovedale's Choir at the City Hall and reported "[w]e got [q]uite a hearty cheer for our music". He was appalled at the Robben Island patients' plight:

> [o]h Rra — I visited that place when I was at Cape Town and the patients there simply move one's pity. When you come to think that they just stay there for the rest of their lives; and then they are always very glad to see someone from outside who has come to see them because Rra though they have everything there they are so lonely being far from home for life. There are some Bechuana boys and men there — there is one Liphuko and two men from Ga Maebu. They were so glad to see me — all I could do was to remind them that "God careth for them".[191]

Modiri seldom showed Silas this spiritual side, reserving it for letters to his mother. But the news that their relative, Onthakile, would have to live under such conditions created a moment of empathy between father and son. The brief encounter with the lepers moved him beyond habitual schoolboy banter. The Island's patients inhabited a world beyond his infallible science's curative potential, in which he had come to believe ardently during afternoons with Macvicar. With both his usual discursive modes, schoolboy and medical, momentarily exhausted, he opted for the earlier language of his parents and the Mafikeng missionaries' religious faith.[192]

In 1912, he applied himself indefatigably to school and hospital work. However big a splash the SANNC's January launch made, the rest of 1912 held but one interest for Modiri: matriculation. By late October, he was very anxious. Equally anxious to see his son, Silas hoped he would come home for his holidays, but Modiri had other plans. He needed extra income and his Cape Town host, James Molebaloa of the Wesleyan Parsonage, Ndabeni, had told him of a month's post with a Cape Town company, Graham Remedies.[193] Molebaloa, from near Mafikeng, had recently lost his wife, a former

---

KH Houghton, Lovedale, apologised and begged him to re-admit Dichukudu. Finally, Dick wrote from Lovedale (A979 Bd1, 6 May 1914 to [Lekoko]), that he promised to "endeavour to promote the interests of their Institution…".

[190] MPP A979 Ad1, 26 March & 08 Apr 1912, SMM to STM.

[191] MPP A979 Ad1, 26 March 1912, SMM to STM, for this and previous quotation. CA, 1/MFK, M1801/1902, 25 Nov 1902, "Paper *Koranta ea Becoana*": Forwarding to Robben Island, EG Greene, RM, Maf, had received a request from Robben Island to supply *TsalaBT*, presumably for the patients there.

[192] MPP A979 Ad1, 26 March 1912, SMM to STM.

[193] MPP A979 Ad1, 22 Oct 1912, SMM to STM: examinations would last from 25 Nov to 02 Dec, he told Silas. Also MPP A979 Ad1, 24 Nov 1912, SMM to STM & 30 Apr 1914, SMM to STM.

Island patient.[194] The company offered Modiri some prospects for his first year post-school year: "…moreover Rra, I think this is my last year in Lovedale, and I have been wondering what I shall be doing next year and all the time till you send me across. I would not like to stay, doing nothing during that time".[195]

"Till you send me across" alluded to Silas' undertaking to finance his medical course abroad. Perhaps these words unwittingly expressed Modiri's feelings about his relationship with his father: Silas, the subject, was the active "sender", while Modiri was the object his father acted upon. He puts one in mind of a parcel to be sent, which may, partly, have been how he felt. For, though eager to commence medical studies, he was now past twenty-one, and ready to enter the world of work, but would still be beholden to his father for six more years while studying.

Silas' purse earned brief respite when a certificate reading "Moliri Silas Molema passed the Matriculation Examination at the end of 1912...in the Third Class" reached Mafikeng. Modiri's letters bore no comment on this success. Given his ambitions, his second-class pass and prize in 1910, he would doubtless have preferred a higher grade.[196] But passing in itself was judged a triumph in Mafikeng. Few Africans and fewer Batswana had matriculated by 1912.[197] Although only small numbers of black and white students passed the University of the Cape of Good Hope Matriculation then, whites outnumbered blacks. In March 1912, 1911's achievers (Lovedale and Healdtown candidates prominent) fitted onto one *Tsala* broadsheet.[198]

Rejoice as his family and community might, South Africa was decreasingly friendly to well-qualified Africans. While working in Cape Town and even before he had matriculated, he had applied to Tiger Kloof Institution near Vryburg. Tiger Kloof, a newish LMS industrial and training school aiming to produce teachers and ministers, turned him down.[199] He was undeterred:[200]

> [y]ou see papa, I have made up my mind to get some employment this next year — God willing. It may not be possible to get a good post form the very start but great things have small beginnings and so I am trying to get a permanent post in one of the local large business firms. I shall let you know when I have it.[201]

Evidently Modiri longed to fulfill Silas' prescience in naming him *modiri*, the worker, and to start his career as he meant to continue, in constant employment. But rejection by Tiger Kloof, which had none

---

[194] See MPP A979 Aa2.36, 1 Feb 1913, Aa2.37, 9 Feb 1913, and Aa2.38, 10 Feb 1913, James Molebaloa, Wesleyan Parsonage, Ndabeni, Maitland, to STM, Maf: Molebaloa, in Cape Town since 1903, explained his strong Morolong connections to Silas. His late father, Isaac Madito Molebaloa, had had land and a business near Mafikeng in 1894. JM had married a lady from Dithakwaneng [near Vryburg] in 1899, but she had died in 1905 on Robben Island (tuberculosis was hinted at), as the Island was then dedicated to TB sufferers. Both Modiri and Silas stayed with him when in Cape Town.

[195] MPP A979 Ad1, 27 Oct 1912, SMM to STM.

[196] LP, LMIAR 1910: 65 & 99: Modiri was the only student to pass the University Junior School Leaving Examination in the Second Class; he won first prize in the First Year. Elijah Makiwane gained the top third class pass. MPP A979 Ad1, 16 May 1920, MSM, Glasgow to STM, showed Modiri's ambition to succeed: he thanked Silas for "[t]he excellent and rare education you have given me — education which makes me today one of the foremost men of my race and one of the best educated amongst black and white in South Africa".

[197] Hunter told *SANAC* (I, 675, 11 Nov 1903), "[i]n ten years eighteen Native students passed the Matriculation Examination [which] is extremely difficult for [them]…because their previous education does not lead up to it in the same way as that of a European lad.…[T]he Native goes through the standards where he is not, as a European boy is, grounded in Latin, so that it is very difficult for him to pass...because he has to get up a large mount of work in a short time…". See *TsalaBC*, 10 Feb 1912, "Cape Education Department" and "SA Native National Congress": Molema's friend Horatio M'belle also took a third-class Matriculation. In 1911, *Tsala* had saluted Nehemiah Motshumi as the first Motswana to pass the Cape Matriculation, the more remarkable for having studied privately in Kimberley.

[198] *TsalaBC*, 02 March 1912, "Pupil Teachers' Examination" [1911 results].

[199] MPP A979 Ad1, 14 Dec 1912, SMM to STM. MPP A979 Ab1, John Leteane, Tiger Kloof, to Joshua Molema, Maf: on 22 July 1912, Leteane had written to ask Joshua for pictures of Chiefs "Montshioa", "Wessels and Badirile" to hang "as a general show in the dining room" with portraits of other "chiefs of various tribes".

[200] *TsalaBC*, 19 Aug 1911, "Native Questions Discussed".

[201] MPP A979 Ad1, 30 Dec 1912, SMM to STM, was also happy to see "Mr Plaatje", then in Cape Town.

of Lovedale's status, dented his self-esteem. Despite this setback, on leaving Lovedale in December 1912, Modiri was knotted into the networks of missionary education and loyalty to the Empire.[202]

Another strong influence on his thinking was Plaatje who, at sixteen years Modiri's senior, became his mentor. Plaatje's Mafikeng years, especially during the Siege, and afterwards editing *Koranta* until 1907, had brought him and Modiri closer.[203] Thereafter, Plaatje moved to Kimberley, on Modiri's route Lovedale-wards. Though records do not survive of their meetings, they certainly had the opportunity to meet. Plaatje clearly kept an eye out for the rising Molema generation, and found Harriet a job at Lyndhurst Road School when other employers had closed their doors to her.[204]

For Modiri, leaving Lovedale meant moving back into the "real world" of South African segregation. His mentor and his father were engaged in the two bitter struggles. "The War of Degradation" characterised the extension of passes to women and the "War of Extermination" was *Tsala*'s terms for the Botha-Smuts' government's proposed land legislation, a struggle that Chapter Six examines in more depth.[205] The legal scaffolding of racial separation bestowed legitimacy on the country's general climate of segregation under the South African Party (1910-24) and Hertzog's National Party (1924-29).[206] After Union, Lovedale's nominally nonracial values became yet more dislocated from the rest of the country. Segregationist thinking pervaded every aspect of life and on leaving the "dale", students and principal alike met it face-to-face.

In this world, to be a Lovedale scholar, an "educated African", earned one the scorn of almost every official one met, especially on the railways. Modiri's former schoolmate, Thema matriculated in 1910, to be thrown off the Pietersburg (now Polokwane) train platform by a stationmaster who ordered him to the "Kafir room". His "offence" was being black (and educated) in what this quite lowly official felt empowered to insist was "whites-only" space.[207]

Modiri's mentor, Plaatje, took up the struggle against railway segregation in July 1913. He complained to De Beers' General Manager about "tramway tyranny", after being denied an empty seat reserved for white passengers, all the seats for "natives" were occupied. "Third-class", he objected, was the classification automatically given black travellers even when one purchased a first-class ticket. "Unless you are prepared to offer physical resistance and fight like a bandit for your money's worth, you will

---

[202] Sol T Plaatje, *Koranta*, 02 Nov 1904, "Rev Willoughby of Tiger Kloof": opening Tiger Kloof (née the Mackenzie Industrial Institute), Willoughby declared that it aimed to "provide for the Bechuana a second Lovedale". Tiger Kloof, for boys, and the Moroka Girls Industrial School (Thaba 'Nchu) were then the only missionary industrial schools among the Tswana. Dr Muir declared that though he aimed to reduce the number of African missionary schools, he favoured Tiger Kloof as it "...intended to provide for a people which were amongst the most backward in South Africa". In these disparaging terms did the CED and other Union Government members regard the Tswana, of whom Modiri and his father were but two. MPP A979 Ad1, 16 March 1913, SMM to STM: when Modiri left Lovedale, Silas would not settle Henderson's account.

[203] Willan, 1984: 125-28: fewer issues of *Koranta* came out after 1905, owing to financial problems.

[204] MPP A979 Ae1, Harriet Molema Montsioa Papers, Dec 1912-1922: 2 draft applications (undated but c.1912, written on the back of the Union Gazette Extraordinary, 20 Feb 1911, p.clix) for teaching posts in Green Point, Cape Town survive.

[205] *TsalaBT*, 23 August 1913, "The War of Degradation" and "The War of Extermination"; cf. *infra*, pp.275 fn.286, 296 fn.22, 338 fn.299, 345 fn.338, 348 fn.354. Bonner (1982: 279, DNL enc. pamphlets Apr 1919): Pass Laws and Masters and Servants legislation operated *in tandem*, and cited a Transvaal Native Congress [TNC] pamphlet's comment: "passes prevented money". Bonner (1982: 273) cited the Bureau of Census and Statistics, *Union Statistics for Fifty Years, Jubilee Issue 1910-1960*, H24: the Retail Price Index for the Witwatersrand, chief destination of southern African migrant workers, revealed difficulties facing workers and their often dispersed families. In 1913, the RPI for food was 97.7, and on all items, 84.5. By World War I's end, these indices had risen, respectively, to 115.7 (8 points) and 105.6 (11.1 points).

[206] MPP A979 Da22, 12 Dec 1912, Plaatje (to STM) stated that he had just returned from a deputation with the Seleka to Hertzog: "[h]e is a very stubborn man and he has no intention of doing anything worthwhile for Blacks...he refused to pay heed except to pursue the implementation of his Segregation law...".

[207] Thema, 1935: 33. (Cf. *infra*, p.242 fns.77 & 78.) LP, LMIAR, Annual Report, 1919, showed that "Richard Thema" gained a Third Class of Elementary Certificate in Pitman's Shorthand.

travel third-class with that first-class ticket", wrote Plaatje, that December.[208] For Plaatje and Molema, both slight men, fighting like bandits would hardly have been a reassuring option.

Railway segregation ended in tragedy for Plaatje's frail daughter Olive (23, and named for Schreiner), in 1921. Her health weakened by influenza, Olive died while awaiting the Bloemfontein-Kimberley train. The desperately ill girl was prevented from seeking relief in the "whites only" waiting-room or even resting on a platform seat. She died on the platform, before the train's arrival. Her devastated father was away in America at the time, at the invitation of a scholar who offered Modiri's intellectual inspiration while he wrote *The Bantu*: WEB Du Bois.[209]

In this book, Molema produced a caustic general historical analysis of train segregation, based on his own and his friends' experiences:

> [t]he segregation extends on to lavatories and similar places. On that lavatory you see written "Gentlemen," and there only white men may go. On that other lavatory you see written "Amadoda" (men), and this is meant for black men. The same, of course, holds true for the retiring rooms for females. Separate places are provided for the two colours. On that for white women is written "Ladies" Retiring Room," and on that for black women is written "Abafazi" (Women). In all cases without a single exception, the places for the blacks are, in every respect, far inferior to those of the whites. The same division is seen in railway-station waiting-rooms, general waiting-rooms, ladies' waiting-rooms, gentlemen's waiting-rooms, all for white men and white women; then, at a respectable distance, and in some obscure corner, a tin *shanty*, meant as a waiting room for blacks, men and women, civilised and uncivilised alike. In the Transvaal, special railway trucks are provided to serve as compartments for native passengers. These are indistinguishable from the cattle trucks externally. Inside bare wooden forms are the only distinguishing factor.[210] [*my italics*]

An early SANNC's campaign gave political expression to the class base of their outrage: to remove railway segregation for educated and exempted "natives".[211] The shanty was a familiar sight for African travellers, Plaatje's and Thema's texts show. Like inferior school buildings, it was a visual metonymy of the status to which government officials and most whites consigned blacks. Moreover, the shanty collapsed the race and class classification of citizens in ways particularly offensive to the educated Molema and Thema. All whites were automatically "gentlemen" or "ladies", no matter their levels of education or coarseness, and so entitled to superior facilities. However, all blacks were equally automatically "*amadoda*" or "kafirs", baptism and education aside, and condemned to the cattle truck and the shanty. Molema did not include the derogatory terms some Africans called white people. Plaatje stated that *Koranta ea Bechuana* would not stoop to display the bigotry of either blacks or whites and listed such names in 1904 in order to dismiss them.[212]

Generations of scholars left Lovedale to enter this white-governed world of segregation. What chance s did they have of realising their own ambitions, not to mention those of the families and communities who had paid their fees in the hope of bringing progress to their far-flung districts? Job reservation and urbanisation along with his own prejudices compelled Henderson to reposition Lovedale educationally

---

[208] Willan (1996: 154) cited De Beers Archives, Kimberley, 17 July 1913, Plaatje, "Letter to the General Manager". Willan (1996: 163-64) & Willan (1984: 272): Plaatje, "Along the colour line", reproduced in Kimberley *Evening Star*, 23 Dec 1913.

[209] See Willan (1984: 133) on Olive's birth and Willan, 1984: Chapter 11.

[210] Molema, 1920: 265.

[211] Bonner (1982: 282-83) cited DNL 320 301/19/72, Evidence to Inter-departmental Pass Laws Committee, *passim*: "exemption" from bearing a pass was intended to benefit the "aspirant petty bourgeoisie", including "store boys, bank messengers of long service, 'the respectable educated and partly educated', the skilled artisans, mechanics, tradesmen, clerks and skilled hospital attendants". The exempt, like the Molemas, bore exemption certificates, not passes, paid no fees, and could demand higher wages. Pass-bearers had their wages stamped, and thus pegged, on their passes. The exempt were freed "from the night curfew and 'native' taxation". This strategy had the potential to alienate pass-bearing and the exempt.

[212] Plaatje noted (*Koranta*, 20 Apr 1904) prejudicial language in the Mafikeng court: "[d]uring the hearing of a civil case at the recent Circuit Court Sessions, the small Hebrew Barrister repeatedly referred to the plaintiff as *the boy*. And the Court fully permitted him to use a term which is objected to by many Magistrates in their Courts". Ignoring this abuse meant the Magistrates' Court would go "one grade lower and admit the word nigger". *Koranta*, 20 Apr 1904, "Slang in Court": Plaatje mentioned the Isixhosa insult "*Igxaxa*", Sesotho "*Khuatle*" and Setswana "*mamphokoro*".

between 1910 and 1930. On the one hand, it retained an "elite" support-base of wealthier Africans, and continued to produce students for the professions. On the other, Henderson devoted more attention to industrial education, hoping to supply students with skills to aid the rural economy. This strategy aimed to shore up the African peasantry on the limited land left to them, but faltered in the face of declining rural capacity and the migrant labour system. In 1922, the Phelps-Stokes Commission's survey of 3,300 ex-Lovedalians, showed that only 11.6% had become farm-labourers. A large proportion (30.3%) had entered manual or industrial labour (1,000). The petty bourgeois professions of missionary work and teaching took up 26.6%, while 10.6% were skilled artisans. Growing unemployment during the post-World War I depression made it difficult for all Africans to resist incorporation into the migratory labour system Henderson so reviled.[213]

Henderson's talented pupil, Molema continued to imbibe Hendersonian ideas long after matriculating. While in Scotland, he still received the *Christian Express* featuring Henderson's letters and speeches recorded under the pseudonym "X".[214] Was it mere coincidence that some very similar notions of class and segregation permeated the final chapters of *The Bantu*?

Henderson was not the sole influence on Molema's writing; and Molema was very doubtful that segregation would succeed. Forms of segregationism were much in the air during these years. These conceptions enchanted eminent politicians like JT Jabavu and Thema. Even Plaatje could undercut statements like "I do not seek social equality with whites, but equal civil...rights and equal opportunities to earn a living". He added that had segregation been on just lines, Africans might have objected to it less: "I think the Government could very well have segregated the people without subjecting them to this hardship".[215] As Bonner and Bundy showed, younger, more militant African voices, often the products of harsher urban and rural conditions, articulated more radical thoughts.[216]

In December 1912, Molema left Lovedale to face this partitioned world as an adult. Distinguished missionaries like Hornabrook and Henderson had made his education possible from an institutional point of view. His father, Silas' success as a cattle-farmer, entrepreneur, newspaper editor and politician had created the family context and the financial backing for his education. To that by no means rare conjunction of institutional and parental encouragement, that son — the aptly-named "worker" — added exceptional aptitude and enthusiasm for his studies that would make him apply himself to South Africa's vast problems diversely: practically, as a doctor; analytically, as an historian, and with both pragmatism and principle, as a politician. In December 1912, he was just setting out.



[213] Rich (1987: 283, 291): in the 1920s, Henderson worked with the interracial Joint Councils, bodies of well-meaning, cautiously liberal men and women. Via the JCs and his Lovedale position, he influenced "Native" education policy.

[214] Rich (1987: 280) cited *Christian Express*, 01 Sep 1916 and 01 Nov 1917.

[215] Beaumont, 1914: II, 93. MPP A979 Db1, Plaatje's "Journal of his Travels in Canada and America", pp.14-15.

[216] Bonner, 1982: *passim*, and Colin Bundy, 1987. "Land and liberation: popular rural protest and the national liberation movements in South Africa, 1920-1969". In Marks & Trapido, 1987: 254-57.