



Social work in health care: A social development approach

A thesis submitted to the

Department of Social Work

School of Human and Community Development

Faculty of Humanities

University of Witwatersrand

In fulfilment for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

By

Laetitia Petersen

May 2021

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE NUMBER
Declaration	ii
Dedication	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Abstract	v
Table of Contents	vii
List of Tables	xx
List of Graphs	xxi
List of Figures	xxii
List of Acronyms	xxiii
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Problem statement and rationale for the study	1
1.3 Definition of concepts	5
1.3.1 Health care	5
1.3.2 Social development approach	6
1.3.3 Social work	7
1.3.4 Social work in health care	8
1.4 Research questions, goal, objectives and hypothesis	9
1.4.1 Research questions	9
1.4.2 Goal	10
1.4.3 Research objectives	10
1.4.4 Hypothesis	11
1.5 Theoretical framework	11
1.6 Methodology	11
1.7 Limitations and delimitations of the study	12
1.7.1 Issues relating to transferability and generalisability	12
1.7.2 Issues of social desirability	13

1.7.3 Ethics processes and permissions	13
1.7.4 Gatekeeping	14
1.7.5 Non-responsiveness of social workers	14
1.7.6 Key informants	15
1.7.7 Researcher bias	15
1.7.8 Research practices and procedures	16
1.7.9 Issues regarding paradigms	16
1.7.10 Issues regarding mixed methodology	16
1.7.11 Issues regarding the quantitative strategy	17
1.8 Chapter outline	17
1.9 Summary	19

Chapter 2: Theoretical Framework	20
2.1 Introduction	20
2.2 Paradigms	20
2.2.1 Pragmatic paradigm	23
2.2.2 Social constructivist paradigm	24
2.3 Theories applicable for this study	26
2.3.1 Habermas' theory of social reproduction	27
2.3.1.1 Application to the study	28
2.3.2 Ecological perspective	29
2.3.2.1 Application to the study	30
2.4 Synergies amongst the paradigms and theories	31
2.5 Summary	32

Chapter 3: Social work in health care	34
3.1 Introduction	34
3.2 History of social work	34
3.2.1 Global history of social work	35
3.2.2 History of social work on the African continent	36
3.2.2.1 Social work in four SADC countries: Botswana, Lesotho, Namibia and Zimbabwe	36

3.2.2.2 Social work in South Africa	39
3.3 History of social work in health care	40
3.3.1 Global context	40
3.3.2 Social work in health care in the African context	42
3.3.2.1 Social work in health care in four SADC countries: Botswana, Lesotho, Namibia and Zimbabwe	42
3.3.2.2 History and development of social work in health care in South Africa	43
3.4 Relevance and role of social work in health care	44
3.4.1 Global context	44
3.4.2 South African context	47
3.5 South African health care reform and the impact on social work in health care	49
3.5.1 South African health reform	50
3.5.2 Impact of the South African health reform on social work in health care	52
3.6 Summary	54

Chapter 4: The Social Development Approach	55
4.1 Introduction	55
4.2 History of the social development approach	55
4.3 Delineating the social development approach and developmental social work	57
4.3.1 The social development approach	57
4.3.2 Developmental social work	61
4.4 Nexus of transformation, policy and social development approach implementation	63
4.4 Summary	67

Chapter 5: The Social determinants of health	68
5.1 Introduction	68
5.2 History of social determinants of health	68
5.3 The delineation of the social determinants of health	70
5.4 Implementation of the social determinants of health	71
5.4.1 Global implementation of the social determinants of health	72

5.4.2 South African implementation of the social determinants of health	74
5.4.3 The social determinants of health and social work	76
5.5 The nexus between social determinants of health and the social development approach	78
5.6 Summary	80

Chapter 6: Research methodology **81**

6.1 Introduction	81
------------------	----

Section A: Research questions, goal, objectives and hypothesis **82**

6.2 Research questions, goal, objectives and hypothesis	82
6.2.1 Research questions	82
6.2.2 Research goal	82
6.2.3 Research objectives	82
6.2.4 Hypothesis	83

Section B: Methodology Paradigm and Design **84**

6.3 The pragmatic paradigm	84
6.4 Research nature and design	86
6.4.1 Research nature	86
6.4.2 Research design	88
6.5 Research plan	90

Section C: Phase One – Quantitative approach **92**

6.6 Quantitative approach	92
6.7 Survey research design	92
6.7.1 The questionnaire	93
6.7.2 Pretesting of the questionnaire	96
6.8 Population and sampling procedures	97
6.9 Data collection	98
6.10 Data analysis and presentation	99
6.11 Reliability and validity	101
6.12 Research errors	102

Section D: Phase Two to Four – Qualitative approach	103
6.13 Qualitative approach	103
6.14 Interpretative phenomenological research design	103
6.15 Population and sampling procedures	105
6.15.1 Phase two and phase three: Semi-structured interviews and focus group discussion	106
6.15.2 Phase four: Semi-structured interviews with key informants	107
6.16 Data Collection	107
6.16.1 Phase two and phase four	107
6.16.1.1 Pretesting of the research instruments	108
6.16.2 Phase three	108
6.17 Data analysis and presentation	111
6.18 Trustworthiness and rigour	114
6.18.1 Credibility	114
6.18.2 Transferability	116
6.18.3 Dependability	116
6.18.4 Confirmability	117
6.19 Reflexivity journal	117
 Section E: Ethical considerations	 118
6.20 Ethics	118
6.20.1 Informed consent	119
6.20.2 Voluntary participation	119
6.20.3 Confidentiality and anonymity	119
6.20.4 Avoidance of harm	121
6.20.5 Permissions	122
6.20.6 Conflict of interest	122
6.20.7 Publications	122
6.21 Summary	123
Chapter 7: Quantitative approach: Data presentation - Survey research design	124
7.1 Introduction	124
7.2 Demographics of the study population	125

7.3 Employment specifications	126
7.3.1 Job descriptions	129
7.4 Findings on the social development approach	132
7.4.1 Delineation of the SDA	132
7.4.2 Strategies of the SDA	133
7.4.3 Social justice	134
7.4.4 Rotation	134
7.4.5 Cultural competence	137
7.5 Findings of the social determinants of health	137
7.5.1 Delineation of the SDH	137
7.5.2 Relevance of the SDH to social work in health care	138
7.5.3 Strategies of the SDH	138
7.6 Findings on policy or SOP implementation	139
7.6.1 Policy or SOP changes on social work role	139
7.7 Relationship between constructs	141
7.8 SDA framework	142
7.9 Inferential analysis of constructs	143
7.10 Summary	147

Chapter 8: Qualitative approach: Data presentation – Interviews	149
8.1 Introduction	149
8.2 Demographics of the study population	149
8.3 Categories, themes and subthemes	152
8.3.1 Category 1: Nature of current social work practice in health care	153
8.3.1.1 Theme 1 – Services offered	153
8.3.1.1.1 Uniqueness of social work	154
8.3.1.1.2 Diversity of settings, services and patients	157
8.3.1.1.3 Involvement in the MDT	158
8.3.1.1.4 Challenges of social work	159
8.3.1.2 Theme 2 – Social work role	162
8.3.1.2.1 Relevance of the social work role	162
8.3.1.2.2 Central or pivotal role of social work in the MDT	163

8.3.1.2.3 Dilemmas of a profession occupying a secondary role in health care	164
8.3.1.2.4 Advocacy for patients	165
8.3.1.3 Theme 3 - Macro strategies	167
8.3.1.3.1 Nature of community work strategies in health care	168
8.3.1.3.2 Importance of access to resources as community work	171
8.3.1.3.3 Importance of stakeholder involvement for community work	171
8.3.2 Category 2: SDA	172
8.3.2.1 Theme 1 – Delineating the SDA	172
8.3.2.1.1 Acknowledging the worth and potential of others	173
8.3.2.1.2 Changes and improved quality of life	173
8.3.2.1.3 Empowerment	174
8.3.2.1.4 Acknowledgement of welfare	176
8.3.2.1.5 Challenges of the SDA	176
8.3.2.1.6 SDA requires broader strategies	178
8.3.2.2 Theme 2 – Rotation	179
8.3.2.2.1 Importance of rotation	179
8.3.2.2.2 Diversity in the application of rotation	180
8.3.2.2.3 Specialist versus generalist practice debate	181
8.3.2.2.4 Rotation associated with development, growth and protection	182
8.3.2.2.5 Challenges with rotation	182
8.3.2.3 Theme 3 – Cultural competence	183
8.3.2.3.1 Necessity for models and guidelines	184
8.3.2.3.2 Cultural competence is broader than language	185
8.3.2.3.3 The competence versus cultural competence debate	186
8.3.2.3.4 Diversity of the SA health care context	186
8.3.2.3.5 MDT as a resource to enable cultural competence	186
8.3.2.3.6 Drawing on own skills, experiences and undergraduate training	187
8.3.2.3.7 Impact of globalisation necessitates cultural competence	187
8.3.2.4 Theme 4 – Evidence of application of the SDA	188
8.3.2.4.1 Application via the SDA principles, social justice and advocacy	189
8.3.2.4.2 Application via liaison with external stakeholders and referral	190

8.3.3 Category 3: SDH	190
8.3.3.1 Theme 1 – Delineating the SDH	191
8.3.3.1.1 Uncertainty of the meaning of the SDH	191
8.3.3.1.2 SDH as factors important in psychosocial assessment	192
8.3.3.1.3 SDH as environmental and living conditions	192
8.3.3.1.4 SDH as the acknowledgement of social ills of society	193
8.3.3.1.5 SDH as access to resources	194
8.3.3.1.6 SDH as equal access to health care	194
8.3.3.1.7 SDH as physical and mental wellbeing	194
8.3.3.1.8 SDH as instrumental	195
8.3.3.1.9 SDH links with the SDA	195
8.3.3.2 Theme 2 – Application of the SDH in social work	196
8.3.3.2.1 Difficulty in connecting the SDH with social work interventions	196
8.3.3.2.2 Relevance of the SDH for social work in health care	196
8.3.4 Category 4: Policy implementation	197
8.3.4.1 Theme 1 - Governmental strategies for the SDA and the SDH	197
8.3.4.1.1 The challenge of associating Governmental strategies with the the SDA and the SDH	197
8.3.4.1.2 DSD the custodian of the SDA	198
8.3.4.1.3 Grants and poverty alleviation for addressing needs	199
8.3.4.1.4 Lack of unity amongst all departments and sectors	199
8.3.4.2 Theme 2 – Policy and SOP implementation	200
8.3.4.2.1 Versality of SOP and policies	200
8.3.4.2.2 SOP or policy as a guide	200
8.3.4.2.3 Consequences of applying SOP or policies to context	201
8.3.4.2.4 Policy as a factor of frustration	202
8.3.4.2.5 SOP and policies may affect social workers’ emotional wellbeing	203
8.3.4.2.6 Relevance and practicality of policies and SOP	204
8.3.4.2.7 Dichotomy of the consultation process	204
8.3.4.2.8 Contradiction amongst policies	205
8.3.4.2.9 Social work is not heard	206
8.3.4.2.10 Competing professions in health care	206
8.3.4.2.11 Political nature of policies	206

8.3.5 Category 5: Vision	207
8.3.5.1 Theme 1 - Future of social work in health care	207
8.3.5.1.1 Hopeful social work future	208
8.3.5.1.2 Threats to the role of social work	209
8.3.5.1.3 Social work is unique and essential in health care	210
8.4 Summary	211

Chapter 9: Qualitative approach: Data Presentation – Focus group discussion	212
9.1 Introduction	212
9.2 Demographics	212
9.3 Group dynamics and interaction	214
9.4 Categories, themes and subthemes	216
9.4.1 Category 1: Nature of the current social work practice in health care	217
9.4.1.1 Theme 1 - Social work in health care	217
9.4.1.1.1 Embodiment of social work role	217
9.4.1.1.2 Neglected counselling role	218
9.4.1.1.3 Competence of the social work profession	219
9.4.1.1.4 Challenges of social work in health care settings	220
9.4.1.1.5 Feelings of unappreciation and lack of recognition	222
9.4.1.1.6 Impact of welfare roots of social work	223
9.4.1.2 Theme 2 - Macro strategies	224
9.4.1.2.1 Community practice in health care settings	224
9.4.1.2.2 The value of community awareness strategies	225
9.4.1.2.3 Community work's empowerment agenda in line with the SDA	226
9.4.2 Category 2: SDA	226
9.4.2.1 Theme 1 – Delineating the current SDA	227
9.4.2.1.1 Indication of the SDA in social work in health care	227
9.4.2.1.2 DSD owner of the SDA	229
9.4.2.1.3 Social work as the catalyst of the SDA in health care settings	230
9.4.2.1.4 Importance of multisectoral collaborations	230
9.4.2.1.5 Challenges with the SDA	231

9.4.2.2 Theme 2 – Rotation	233
9.4.2.2.1 Necessity of rotation	234
9.4.2.2.2 Dilemmas with rotation	235
9.4.2.2.3 Need for different models of rotation	236
9.4.2.3 Theme 3 – Competence	236
9.4.2.3.1 Acknowledging the competence of social work	237
9.4.2.3.2 Pitfalls of comparisons with psychologists	237
9.4.2.3.3 Need to enhance language use	238
9.4.2.3.4 Need for cultural understanding and models	238
9.4.2.3.5 Challenges with unifying cultural perspectives with health care settings	239
9.4.3 Category 3: SDH	240
9.4.3.1 Theme 1 – SDH indicated in social work in health care	240
9.4.3.1.1 Delineating the SDH	240
9.4.3.1.2 SDH in relation to psychosocial factors	241
9.4.3.1.3 Hospitalisation accentuates the SDH	241
9.4.3.1.4 Link between the SDA, the SDH and social work	242
9.4.3.2 Theme 2 – NHI and determinants	243
9.4.4 Category 4: Policy implementation	243
9.4.4.1 Theme 1 – Policies and SOP implementation	243
9.4.4.1.1 Reactive policies	243
9.4.4.1.2 Roles changes due to policies or SOP	244
9.4.4.1.3 Lack of social work consultation	244
9.4.4.1.4 Absence of an SDA and a SDH framework	245
9.4.5 Category 5: Vision	245
9.4.5.1. Theme 1 – Future of social work in health care	245
9.4.5.1.1 Necessity of social work	245
9.4.5.1.2 Reframing the position of social work	246
9.4.5.1.3 Resource constraints	247
9.4.5.1.4 Social work under threat	248
9.4.5.1.5 Social work in health care as a speciality	249
9.4.6 Category 6: Framework for social work in health care	249
9.4.6.1 Theme 1 - Framework of the SDA for social work in health care	250

9.4.6.1.1 Essentials of the framework	250
9.4.6.1.2 Role of academia	251
9.4.6.1.3 Challenges that the framework should address	251
9.5 Summary	253
Chapter 10: Discussion of findings	254
10.1 Introduction	254
10.2 Profile of participants	254
10.3 Discussion of findings	255
10.3.1 Summary of Phase One	256
10.3.1.1 Hypothesis development	259
10.3.2 Summary of Phase Two and Four	260
10.3.3 Summary of Phase Three	262
10.4 Triangulation of data from Phase One to Four	265
10.4.1 Category 1 – Nature of current social work practice	266
10.4.2 Category 2 - SDA	269
10.4.3 Category 3 – SDH	272
10.4.4 Category 4 – Policies	273
10.4.5 Category 5 – Vision	275
10.4.6 Category 6 – Framework	275
10.4.6.1 Suggested guideline	276
10.5 Validation of relevance of study’s mixed methodology	293
10.6 Summary	294
Chapter 11: Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations	295
11.1 Introduction	295
11.2 Summary of the study	295
11.2.1 Research questions	295

11.2.2 Goal, objectives and hypothesis	296
11.2.2.1 Goal	296
11.2.2.2 Research objectives	296
11.2.2.3 Hypothesis	296
11.2.3 Paradigms and theoretical framework	297
11.2.4 Methodology	297
11.3 Summary of findings according to the objectives	298
11.4 Key findings and conclusions	303
11.5 Recommendations	311
11.5.1 Recommendations for a guideline	311
11.5.2 Recommendations for the GDH and policy implementation	313
11.5.3 Recommendations for academia	316
11.5.4 Recommendations for the SACSSP	316
11.5.5 Recommendations for social workers in health care	316
11.5.6 Recommendations for future research	318

Reference list	320
-----------------------	------------

Appendices	363
Appendix A Human Research Committee Ethical Clearance	364
Appendix B Permission from Gauteng Department of health	366
Appendix C Participant Information Sheet – Survey	374
Appendix D Informed Consent – Survey	377
Appendix E Participant Information Sheet – Semi-structured interviews	379
Appendix F Informed consent for semi-structured interviews	382
Appendix G Informed consent to audiotaping of semi-structured interviews	384
Appendix H Participant Information Sheet – Semi-structured interviews	
Key informants	386
Appendix I Informed consent for semi-structured interviews - Key informants	389

Appendix J	Informed consent to audiotaping of semi-structured interviews – Key informants	391
Appendix K	Participant Information Sheet – Focus groups	393
Appendix L	Informed consent – Focus groups	396
Appendix M	Informed consent to audiotaping of the focus groups	398
Appendix N	Survey	400
Appendix O	Interview schedule – semi-structured interviews	410
Appendix P	Interview schedule – semi-structured interviews – key informants	413
Appendix Q	Focus group guide	416
Appendix R	Example of coding, categorising and theming	419
Appendix S	Example of different types of coding applied	421

LIST OF TABLES

Table 7.1: Age distribution	125
Table 7.2: Age distribution, gender and racial classification	125
Table 7.3: Overview of demographics and employment specifications	126
Table 7.4: Contentment and frustration with role, supervision and policies	132
Table 7.5: Relevance of the SDH to social work in health care	138
Table 7.6: Policy matters	140
Table 7.7: Associations	141
Table 7.8: Inferences 1	144
Table 7.9: Inferences 2	145
Table 7.10: Inferences 3	146
Table 7.11: Inferences 4	146
Table 7.12: Inferences 5	147
Table 8.1: Participants - demographic profile	149
Table 8.2: Key informants – demographic profile	150
Table 8.3: Interviews – Categories, themes and subthemes	152
Table 9.1: Focus groups – demographic profile	212
Table 9.2: Focus groups – Categories, themes and subthemes	216
Table 10.1: Service delivery dominance	280

LIST OF GRAPHS

Graph 7.1: Comparative view: Social work experience (Survey)	127
Graph 7.2: Grades	128
Graph 7.3: Types of health care settings	128
Graph 7.4: Rotation prevalence	135
Graph 7.5: Three categories of attitudes about rotation	135
Graph 7.6: Accumulative feelings about rotation	136
Graph 8.1: Comparative view: Social work experience (Interviews)	150
Graph 9.1: Comparative view: Social work experience (Focus groups)	213

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 6.1: The intended research plan (proposal stage)	91
Figure 6.2: The actual research plan	91
Figure 10.1: Payne's modified typology (2005, 2014)	279
Figure 10.2: Payne's modified typology (2005, 2014) -Services	279
Figure 10.3: Dominant reflexive – empowerment rotation	282
Figure 10.4: Dominant individualist – problem-solving rotation	283
Figure 10.5: Dominant socialist – social change rotation	284
Figure 10.6: A: Reflexive – empowerment and individualist – problem-solving services	285
Figure 10.7: B: Reflexive – empowerment and socialist – social change services	286
Figure 10.8: C: Individualist – problem-solving and social – social change services	287
Figure 10.9: Central position – combination of all service delivery	288
Figure 10.10: Diagrammatical representation of the SDA and the SDH framework	290
Figure 11.1: Diagrammatical representation of the SDA and the SDH framework	311
Figure 11.2: Reflexive-empowerment and individualist-problem-solving services	312

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AASW	Australian Association of Social Workers
CSDH	Commission of Social Determinants of Health
DSD	Department of Social Development
ECD	Early Childhood Development
FG	Focus Group
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GDH	Gauteng Department of Health
HiAP	Health in All Policies
HIV/ AIDS	Human Immune Deficiency Virus/ Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
IASSW	International Association of Schools of Social work
IFSW	International Federation of Social Workers
IPA	Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis
ISDM	Integrated Service Delivery Model
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
NASW	National Association of Social Workers
NFLASW	New Foundland and Labrador Association for Social Workers
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
NHI	National Health Insurance
OSD	Occupational Specific Dispensation
PIS	Participant Information Sheet
PMDS	Performance Management and Development System
PWD	Persons with Disability
SA	South Africa
SACSSP	South African Council of Social Service Professionals
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SAPS	South African Police Services
SASSA	South African Social Security Agency
SDA	Social Development Approach
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
SDH	Social Determinants of Health
SONA	State of the Nation Address
SOP	Standard Operation Procedures
SOPA	State of the Province Address

SPSS	Statistical Package for Social Science
TOP	Termination of Pregnancy
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
USA	United States of America
VEC	Victim Empowerment Centres
WHO	World Health Organization