

https://dspace.org/

# Building values: a collaborative, participatory and empowerment evaluation of civics and religion curricula in three Tanzanian schools

**Sulayman, Hamdun Ibrahim**

**2009-02-19T11:30:26Z**
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/6227

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

# BUILDING VALUES: A Collaborative, Participatory and Empowerment Evaluation of Civics and Religion Curricula in Three Tanzanian Schools

Hamdun Ibrahim Sulayman

A Thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
University of the Witwatersrand
Johannesburg

July, 2008

Supervisor: Professor Ray Basson

DECLARATION

I declare that this doctoral thesis is my own unaided work. It is being submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the School of Education at the University of Witwatersrand.

SIGNED: ……

HAMDUN IBRAHIM SULAYMAN

Johannesburg, July 2008

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Ray Basson, for his invaluable and unlimited guidance and untiring support here in South Africa and on site in Tanzania that inspired me throughout the study.

I would like also to extend my thanks and appreciation to Dr. Khalid E. Abdallah, the residence director of Munadhamat Al-Da'wa Al-Islamia -Tanzania and representative of Iqraa for Humanity, for his moral and financial support specifically in the preliminary and final stages of my study. Special appreciation is extended to two brothers in faith Dr. Msemo Diwani and Mr. Ramadan Breima for their moral and brotherly support in a foreign country. I also extend my deepest appreciation to Elfarouq Foundation for their financial assistance for about two years. I say to them all: 'JAZAKUMULLAHU KHAIRAN'.

Special appreciation is extended to my lovely wife Mwanaisha A. M. Buberwa and my children, Abdulmuniem, Osama, Fatwimatul-Zahrau, Sumaiya, Abdallah, Jannaat, Khadija and Asmaa, for their patience and their continuous prayers and encouragement over the past six years.

Finally, I extend my thanks to all 16 teachers in my sample without whom I could not have done this study. Their participation, reflections and comments have enriched the study.

## DEDICATION

I dedicate this work to all advocates of the view that positive values must flourish and prevail in society. It doesn't matter who they are, or to which religion they belong, what counts is the absolute feeling of humanity and 'ubuntu'.

## ABSTRACT

In this study the question of how to address corruption in Tanzanian society is considered from the view point of learning positive values to contribute to reducing corruption now and in the future. It is argued that by strengthening the teaching of positive values to provide a foundation in values as alternatives for students to consider, may impact their decisions while still at school and later in life as adults and leaders for them to resist corruption when encountered. The study arises from Transparency International surveys consistently ranking Tanzania early in the new millennium amongst the 10 most corrupt countries internationally. Given the failure of national commissions in Tanzania, legal institutions such as the Prevention of Corruption Bureau, initiatives emanating from the office of the Presidency, amongst others, to stem corruption, here it is argued for the use of education as state institution to strengthen values teaching in 3 programmes in the state curriculum through evaluation to address the problem. Adopting an approach to evaluation which draws teachers into the process for them to drive it in part, developed by Fetterman and Wandersman, capacity can be built within schools to do so, an approach which is somewhat different to the norm where this capacity more frequently may be driven from outside, coercive, and be disempowering of agents of change within schools. Using the stepped procedure as well as the 'facets' of this participatory approach to evaluating the 3 positive values curricula, and with coaching by the evaluator, a measure of self-determination seemed experienced by teachers to teach values like honesty and self-respect, self-reliance and personal integrity, amongst others, to assist students resist corrupt practices when encountered. Multiple self-administered instruments developed with teachers helped gauge teachers progress towards goals they set themselves to achieve in one academic year and assisted to build confidence in addressing this issues through schooling, the sample of schools in the study being purposefully selected as they educate between them more than half the professional and political leaders in the nation. The study aimed to find what positive values are taught in 3 curricula [Civics, Islamic Knowledge, Bible Knowledge], and how these are taught, as well as to find out if this teaching was strengthened through using the tools of empowerment evaluation. The data indicates firstly, shared values across these curricula and values specific to each are taught, to provide alternatives for learners to consider prior to action. This foundational guide for students seemed strengthened if secular values are allied to religious values to provide value-informed choices for students, and that this foundation may be further strengthened with self-directed changes to the curriculum being made by teachers. Secondly, traditional pedagogical methods seem to be less effective where values teaching is not linked to exemplarily teacher behaviour, parables and storytelling, and moral actions of role models emulating how to act morally. Thirdly, teaching positive values was found to be strengthened through self-evaluation, as teachers seemed to experience a measure of empowerment or self-determination in the evaluation, and to aim at self-improving effective teaching of values. Finally, data indicates that where teachers are drawn into the evaluation process, trained in these techniques facilitated by an evaluator, that refinements to values teaching may be sustained in the short to medium term,

following the withdrawal of the evaluator from the field. Findings were corroborated in part through triangulating the data, here with data from naturalistic observations and questionnaires particularly. Amongst recommendations made in the light of the study, one is the importance of the state employing religious teachers, as opposed to these being functionaries of the mosque and church as at present, a second being that positive values be made part of the compulsory core curriculum in all schools in the system.

**Key words:** Positive values; Civics; Islamic Knowledge [IK]; Bible Knowledge [BK]; Curriculum; Collaborative participatory and empowerment evaluation; Evaluator; Coach; Evaluees; Corruption; Takrima; Moral choices; Decision.

## TABLE OF CONTENT


**CONTENTS** **PAGE**

**CHAPTER ONE**

**INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXT OF THE STUDY AND ORGANIZATION OF THE THESIS** **1**

1.1 Introduction 1

1.1.1 Chapters in the study 8

1.2 Context of the study 9

1.2.1 Positive values in the national curriculum of colonial and post-colonial rule 10

1.2.2 Learning positive values in Civics 21

1.2.3 Learning positive values in the curriculum of Islamic Knowledge 21

1.2.4 Learning positive values in the Bible Knowledge curriculum 22

1.2.5 Level of corruption in Tanzania 23

1.3 Conclusion of the chapter 27

**CHAPTER TWO**

**REVIEW OF LITERATURE- PROFILE OF CORRUPTION INTERNATIONALLY AND IN TANZANIA** **29**

2.1 Introduction 29

2.2 A profile of corruption in countries internationally 30

2.2.1 Range of corrupt countries internationally 32

2.2.2 Tanzania in the profile of 'least-to-most' corrupt countries – generic forms of corruption found in these countries 36

2.2.3 Variation in the ranking of Tanzania 1998-2003 and specific forms of corruption found 43

2.3 Review of literature – commentaries and reports on corruption 52

2.3.1 Causes of corruption in Tanzania 52

2.3.2 Attempts by Tanzanian Government to curb corruption 54

2.3.3 Corruption in Tanzania in relation to other countries similar to it 56
2.4 Conclusion of the chapter 61

**CHAPTER THREE**
**REVIEW OF POSITIVE VALUES CURRICULA IN TANZANIA 62**
3.1 Introduction 62
3.2 Positive values in this study 63
3.2.1 Values cutting across all three curricula 65
3.2.2 Values in Civics curriculum 67
3.2.3 Values in Islamic Knowledge curriculum 70
3.2.4 Values in the Bible Knowledge curriculum 74
3.3 Conclusion of the chapter 78

**CHAPTER FOUR**
**LITERATURE REVIEW – CURRICULUM EVALUATION AND APPROACHES TO EVALUATION 79**
4.1 Introduction 79
4.2 Definition of curriculum evaluation 79
4.3 Approaches to evaluation in the context of its growth 84
4.3.1 Experimental evaluation 88
4.3.2 Illuminative evaluation 91
4.3.3 Ethnographic evaluation 95
4.3.4 Connoisseurship evaluation 96
4.3.5 Utilization-focused evaluation 97
4.3.6 Empowerment evaluation 98
4.4 Empowerment evaluation – stepped procedure, facets, role of the evaluator 100
4.4.1 The stepped procedure of empowerment evaluation 102
4.4.2 Facets of empowerment evaluation 103
4.4.3 Role of empowerment evaluator 110
4.5 Conclusion of the literature review –the logic of the study 113

**CHAPTER FIVE**

**RESEARCH QUESTIONS, DESIGN AND INSTRUMENTS** **118**

5.1 Introduction 118

5.2 Research problem and questions 119

5.3 Conceptual framework of the evaluation 120

5.4 Research design and tasks 122

5.5 Research instruments 126

5.6 Sample selection 132

5.7 Conclusion of the chapter 139

**CHAPTER SIX**

**FINDINGS – SUBSTANTIVE CONTENT AND TEACHING METHODS OF POSITIVE VALUES IN THREE CURRICULA** **140**

6.1 Introduction 140

6.2 Discussion of the findings 141

6.3 Civics curricula Forms 1-4: Objectives and specific values 145

6.3.1 Objectives of Civics curriculum 146

6.3.2 Specific values taught in Civics 146

6.4 Islamic Knowledge curricula Forms 1-4: Objectives, specific values 156

6.4.1 Objectives in the Islamic Knowledge curriculum 157

6.4.2 Specific values in Islamic Knowledge 158

6.5 Bible Knowledge curricula, Forms 1-4: Objectives and specific values 168

6.5.1 Objectives in the Bible Knowledge curriculum 169

6.5.2 Specific values in the Bible Knowledge curriculum 169

6.6 Teaching methods in the three curricula 177

6.7 Conclusion of the chapter 179

**CHAPTER SEVEN**

**FINDINGS - STRENGTHENING VALUES TEACHING IN THREE CURRICULA** **181**

7.1 Introduction 181

7.2 Strengthening values teaching - self-rating data in each curriculum 182

7.2.1 Self-rating data in Civics curriculum – average rating data 182

7.2.2 Self-rating data in Islamic Knowledge curriculum – average rating data 184

7.2.3 Self-rating data in Bible Knowledge curriculum – average rating data 186

7.2.4 Strengthening values teaching – Individual self-rating data across the three curricula 188

7.2.5 Trends in Individual self-rating data – even improvement, slight and more substantial 189

7.3 Triangulating self-rating findings – observation data 193

7.3.1 Naturalistic classroom observation data across three curricula 193

7.3.2 Observation data – improvement in general 194

7.3.3 Observation data – improvement through training strategies to use 199

7.3.4 Observation data – improvement in values taught [content] 203

7.3.5 Limitations of observation data – tells only what has been captured 216

7.4 Conclusion of the chapter 217

**CHAPTER EIGHT**

**TRIANGULATION OF SELF-RATING FINDINGS IN STRENGTHENING VALUES TEACHING IN THREE CURRICULA THROUGH SELF-ADMINISTERED INSTRUMENTS** **218**

8.1 Introduction 218

8.2 Self–administered instruments – data from four instruments 218

8.2.1 Self-Administered instruments – checklist data on teacher role modelling values 219
8.2.2 Self-administered instruments – checklist data on guidance and counselling by teachers 227
8.2.3 Self-administered instruments – checklist data on selected values taught 233
8.2.4 Self-administered instruments – checklist data on students' commitments to values across the three curricula 245
8.3 Teacher's journal data on moral dilemmas across the three curricula 248
8.4 Teachers' questionnaire across the three curricula 254
8.4.1 Questionnaire data – teachers' responses on self-assessment in the three curricula 254
8.4.2 Teachers' responses on sustaining the improvement in three curricula 257
8.5 Conclusion of the chapter 260

**CHAPTER NINE**

**DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS 261**

9.1 Introduction 261
9.2 A concept of values strengthening values teaching 262
9.2.1 Secular curriculum – choices provided students 264
9.2.2 Islamic Knowledge – choices provided students 267
9.2.3 Bible Knowledge – choices provided students 270
9.3 A conception of values formation to further strengthening values teaching 274
9.4 Role modelling and values formation in Civics Curriculum- Mwalimu Nyerere as role model 276
9.4.1 Mwalimu Nyerere as role model 277
9.5 Role modelling and values formation in Islamic Knowledge curriculum 281

9.5.1 Prophet Mohammed as role model 282
9.6 Resisting change in the design principle of values curricula 287
9.7 Building self-determination to strengthen values teaching 291
9.8 Limitations of the study 295
9.9 Recommendations 297
9,9,1 General recommendations 297
9.9.2 Further studies 299
9.10 Conclusion 299

**BIBLIOGRAPHY** **303**

**APPENDICES** **320**

## LIST OF TABLES

**TABLES**


| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | TI Profile internationally – least to most corrupt countries in 2001 | 33 |
| 2 | Generic forms of corruption found in countries ranked 'least' and 'most' corrupt internationally in 2001 | 39 |
| 3 | Variation in the ranking of Tanzania internationally 1998-2003 | 44 |
| 4 | Specific forms of corruption found in Tanzania | 45 |
| 5 | Values in Civics curriculum | 69 |
| 6 | Values in the Islamic Knowledge curriculum | 72 |
| 7 | Values in the Bible Knowledge curriculum | 75 |
| 8 | Specific values in Forms 1-4 Civics curricula | 148 |
| 9 | Specific values to specific Forms 1-4 IK curricula | 161 |
| 10 | Specific values to specific Forms 1-4 BK curricula | 172 |
| 11 | Civics – self-rating data and goals | 183 |
| 12 | Islamic Knowledge – self-rating data and goals | 185 |
| 13 | Bible Knowledge - self-rating data and goals | 187 |
| 14 | Teacher-student interaction in the classroom | 195 |
| 15 | Observation data - strategies teachers were trained to use | 201 |
| 16 | Observation data – frequencies in strategies used | 203 |
| 17 | Values observed being taught in Civics curricula in Forms 1 – 4 | 205 |
| 18 | Frequencies of values observed in Civics curricula in Forms 1 – 4 | 207 |
| 19 | Values observed being taught in IK curricula in Forms 1-4 | 209 |
| 20 | Frequencies of values observed in IK curricula in Forms 1 – 4 | 211 |
| 21 | Values observed being taught in BK curricula in Forms 1 – 4 | 213 |
| 22 | Frequencies of values observed in BK curricula in Forms 1 – 4 | 215 |
| 23 | Checklist data on teacher as role model across three curricula | 221 |
| 24 | Checklist data - what a teacher does as role model | 225 |
| 25 | Self-administered data - counselling across the three curricula | 228 |
| 26 | Counselling data – teachers' resolutions | 231 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 27 | Self-administered data - checklist on selected values taught in Civics | 234 |
| 28 | Frequencies in selected values taught in Civics | 236 |
| 29 | Self-administered data - checklist on selected values taught in IK | 238 |
| 30 | Frequencies in selected values taught in IK | 240 |
| 31 | Self-administered data - checklist on selected values taught in BK | 242 |
| 32 | Frequencies in selected values taught in BK | 244 |
| 33 | Self-administered instruments – students' commitment data across the three curricula | 246 |
| 34 | Students' commitment data observed by teachers across the three curricula | 247 |
| 35 | Self-administered data – teacher's journal on moral dilemma across the three curricula | 250 |
| 36 | Teacher's journal on moral dilemma data - what teachers do to resolve students' dilemmas? | 253 |
| 37 | Percentages on teachers' responses to questionnaire | 256 |

## LIST OF FIGURES


| FIGURES | | PAGE |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Conceptual framework of the evaluation | 121 |
| 2 | Collaborative, participatory and empowerment evaluation design | 124 |
| 3 | Civics - teachers self-ratings March 2002 and March 2003 | 182 |
| 4 | Islamic Knowledge - teacher self-ratings March 2002 and March 2003 | 185 |
| 5 | Bible Knowledge - teacher self-ratings March 2002 and March 2003 | 186 |
| 6 | Teacher self-ratings - March to October 02, October 02 - March 03 | 190 |

## ACRONYMS

| | |
|---|---|
| BAKWATA | Supreme Muslim Council of Tanzania |
| BK | Bible Knowledge |
| CCT | Christian Council of Tanzania |
| CIE | Catholic Institute of Education - South Africa |
| CPEE | Collaborative, Participatory and Empowerment Evaluation |
| CPI | Corruption Perception Index |
| COMESA | Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa |
| EE | Empowerment Evaluation |
| ECOWAS | Economic Community of West African States |
| ESR | Education for Self-Reliance |
| ICT | Institute of Curriculum of Tanzania |
| IK | Islamic Knowledge |
| MDI | Munadhamat Al-Da'wa Al-Islamia – Tanzania |
| NECTA | National Examination Council of Tanzania |
| SAFAC | Southern African Forum Against Corruption |
| SMZ | Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar |
| TAMSA | Tanzania Muslim Students Association |
| TANU | Tanganyika African National Union |
| TCCIA | Tanzania Commission for Commercial, Industries and Agriculture |
| TEC | Tanzania Episcopal Council |
| TI | Transparent International |
| TRA | Tanzania Revenue Authority |
| TSCF | Tanzania Students Christian Fellowship |
| TYL | Tanganyika African National Union Youth League |
| UKWATA | Tanzania Christian-based Students Association |