

https://dspace.org/

Beneficial friends: a case study of the social networks of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg

Muvenge, Chido Fecility

2017

https://hdl.handle.net/10539/24606

Muvenge, Chido Fecility (2017) Beneficial friends: a case study of the social networks of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, <https://hdl.handle.net/10539/24606>

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

Research Report



‘MA Coursework & Research Report’

ACMS

Name: **Chido. F**

Surname: **Muvenge**

Student No: **675479**

Supervisor: **Zaheera Jinnah**

Title: **Beneficial friends: A case study of the social networks of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg.**

Re-Submission date: **21 July 2017**

Aknowledgements

Isaiah 40:31

But they that wait upon the LORD shall renew their strength; they shall mount up with wings as eagles; they shall run, and not be weary; and they shall walk, and not faint.

This Masters would not have been possible had it not been for the Lord who was always on my side.

I would like to thank all those that helped me throughout the course of the year. My parents, for their unconditional love and support and my supervisor who was always there to guide and support me. I would also like to acknowledge those who took the time to participate in my study, your insights were invaluable.

Declaration

I declare that this dissertation is my own unaided work. It is being submitted for the degree of Master of Arts at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination by any other University.

_____

Chido Felicity Muvenge

Signed on the 15th of March 2017

Table of Contents

Aknowledgements 2

Isaiah 40:31 2

ABSTRACT 6

CHAPTER ONE 8

OVERVIEW OF STUDY 8

INTRODUCTION 8

CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY 9

LEGISLATION 9

RECENT HISTORY OF ZIMBABWEAN MIGRATION INTO SOUTH AFRICA 10

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM AND RATIONALE 12

MAIN RESEARCH QUESTION 15

Objectives 15

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK 16

STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS 16

DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS 17

Domestic work 17

Resilience 17

Social networks 17

CHAPTER TWO 18

LITERATURE REVIEW 18

INTRODUCTION 18

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK 18

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE STATE & THE UNDOCUMENTED MIGRANT 20

DOMESTIC WORK 22

MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORK 24

THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP 25

THE SOCIAL NETWORKS OF UNDOCUMENTED MIGRANTS 26

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DOMESTIC WORKERS AND THEIR SOCIAL NETWORKS 28

SOCIAL CAPITAL 29

CONCLUSION 31

CHAPTER THREE 32
METHODOLOGY 32
INTRODUCTION 32
RESEARCH APPROACH 32
RESEARCH DESIGN 33
RESEARCH SAMPLING 34
RESEARCH INSTRUMENT 37
PRE-TESTING OF INSTRUMENT 37
DATA COLLECTION 38
DATA ANALYSIS 40
ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS 43
LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY 45
CHAPTER FOUR 47
PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION OF RESULTS 47
INTRODUCTION 47
Objectives of the study 47
DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION OF PARTICIPANTS 48
CAPABILITY APPROACH 48
MAIN THEMES ARISING FROM DATA COLLECTED 49
DISCUSSION OF MAIN THEMES 51
MOTIVATING FACTORS FOR LEAVING ZIMBABWE 51
AVAILABLE SOCIAL NETWORKS 55
ACCOMPLISHMENTS 74
CONCLUSION 76
CHAPTER FIVE 77
MAIN FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS 77
INTRODUCTION 77
SUMMARY OF FINDINGS 77
CONCLUSION 80
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE STUDY 80
Reference list 82
APPENDICES 88
Appendix A 88
Appendix B 90

CONSENT FORM FOR PARTICIPATION IN THE STUDY 90
Appendix C 91

ABSTRACT

This research report gives an account of the social networks, links, connections and relationships of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in

Johannesburg, Gauteng. The primary aim was to understand the role of these ties in providing social, political, emotional and economic support in addressing the challenges that undocumented domestic workers face. The study also explored how social networks enhanced the capabilities and resources of non-national women, particularly focusing on how they defined wellbeing and development.

Based on 12 semi-structured interviews with undocumented women living and working in Johannesburg, the findings that emerged from this study, show that unlike what the majority of literature in South Africa points to, undocumented domestic workers do not live in isolation from others, but rather have a diverse range of social networks that allow them to be active agents and participants in their lives. The results highlight that the majority of social networks that undocumented domestic workers use are in actual fact useful to them and how they navigate their contexts. Migrants in this instance are largely dependent on their families for support both in the originating country and in the host community.

Key words: Capabilities, Domestic work, Social networks, Zimbabweans

CHAPTER ONE

OVERVIEW OF STUDY

TITLE OF THE RESEARCH: Beneficial friends: a case study of the social networks of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg.

INTRODUCTION

The study details the social networks of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in South Africa. The study sought to understand the role that social networks play in shaping the livelihood and survival strategies of migrant women. By so doing, the study intends to contribute to literature by focussing on social networks as a mobilisation strategy and how they influence the capacities and resources of non-national migrant women. Additionally, the research aimed to understand social networks as a survival strategy employed by undocumented women in mitigating their illegality and the potentially exploitative nature of their employment. This was done through the application of the capabilities approach in order to assess the wellbeing of non-national domestic workers in relation to poverty and inequality (Robeyns, 2006).

The social networks of migrants continue to contribute to transnational flows of migration (Mei- Liu, 2013). These flows are based on the information and resources available to potential migrants via members of their networks in their potential host country (Kadushin, 2004). This results in the decreased migration costs and increases the number of people migrating and leading to broader migration networks (Mei- Liu, 2013). Tied to social network theory is the concept of social capital which is defined as those resources (social, economic and cultural) that can be called upon in times of crises (Silvey & Elmhirst, 2004, Bordieu, 1986). Social capital is differentiated by the connections among individuals that allow access to available resources.

The following section briefly highlights the contextual background of the study as well as the recent history of Zimbabwean migration into South Africa statement of the problem and the rationale for the study along with the aims and objectives as well as the definition of the key terms. This chapter will also provide a basic description of the research design and methodology as well as a general overview of the research report.

CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

LEGISLATION

This part of the literature review seeks to discuss the Basic Conditions of Employment Act (BCEA), Sectoral Determination 7 (Domestic workers) and the Immigration Act of 2002. These three pieces of government legislation are the ones that govern and dictate the movements of undocumented domestic workers in South Africa.

BASIC CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT ACT

The Basic Conditions of Employment Act (BCEA) is the overarching legislation that regulates wages and working conditions for all workers in South Africa excluding National Defence Force, National Intelligence Agency, South African Secret Service and unpaid volunteers working for an organisation with a charitable purpose. It regulates matters pertaining to working time, leave, record keeping, forced labour, basic conditions of employment and the monitoring and enforcement of legal proceedings.

SECTORAL DETERMINATION 7- DOMESTIC WORKERS

According to the Department of Labour (2012), sectoral determinants play an active role in addressing the plight of vulnerable workers in South Africa. There are currently 11 sectoral determinations spanning across different sectors of the economy including forestry and agriculture. Of particular interest to this research is Sectoral determination 7, which stipulates the working conditions of domestic workers such as hours of work, leave and termination of employment. According to the sectoral determination amendment (2016) domestic workers are supposed to be paid a basic minimum wage raging from ZAR1562-2422.47 per month depending on the area that the domestic worker is employed as well as the number of hours they work.

IMMIGRATION ACT 13 OF 2002

The Immigration Act 13 of 2002 provides regulations on the admission, residence, departure of foreigners in the Republic and matters concerned therewith. In relation to the BCEA, the Immigration Act's preamble aims to ensure that "the contribution of foreigners in the South African labour market does not adversely impact on existing labour standards and the rights and expectations of South African workers". Of particular importance to the research are sections 32 and 38 which speak to matters on the enforcement and monitoring of illegal foreigners as well as the employment of illegal foreigners.

These three pieces of legislation, especially the BCEA and sectoral determination 7 were put in place in order to address the socially constructed inequalities and hierarchies that were ingrained in South African society as a result of apartheid and patriarchy. In 1993 the BCEA was extended in order to cover domestic workers who had been previously excluded from the legislation (Budlender, 2013), whereas sectoral determinations are an extension of the BCEA, in that the BCEA sets the basic conditions of employment however it does not take into prescribe minimum wages. As previously mentioned the determinations are meant to cover sectors that are that are deemed by government to be vulnerable, particularly where employers or workers are unable to organize and bargain effectively (Budlender, 2013)

Although the South African government has put in place mechanisms such as legislation to protect employees and migrants (documented). Evidence still points to the fact that firstly that the boarders are still porous and that due to lack of documentation undocumented domestic workers paid lower than required in Sectoral determination 7 and are exploited despite having protections under the BCEA.

RECENT HISTORY OF ZIMBABWEAN MIGRATION INTO SOUTH AFRICA

Several studies have been done on the migration of women especially domestic workers, however these studies have been limited within the context of Zimbabwe and South Africa (Hondagneu- Sotelo, 1994; Huang & Yeoh, 1996; Silvey & Elmhirst, 2004). Embedded within the causes of migration is the relationship between structure and agency. Bakewell (2010) argues that in order to understand any form of migration there is a need to understand firstly the structural forces promoting both emigration and immigration; secondly motivations for migration and lastly an analysis of the social and economic structures that are formed to connect areas of outward and inward migration.

Migration from Zimbabwe to South Africa for work purposes has been happening for many decades. Crush & Tevera (2010)in "*Migrant remittances and household survivial in Zimbabwe",* interviewed 723 households, they were able to establish that 29% of those households had either parents or grandparents who had worked outside of Zimbabwe mainly in neighbouring countries especially South Africa. However, what makes the migration to South Africa, unique in this instance is the complexity of the nature of migration. From the

1990's migration to South Africa was oscillatory in nature, with migrants returning home and having no intention of settling in South Africa (Crush & Tawodzera, 2016). Whereas over the last decade there is growing evidence that Zimbabwean migrants are settling permanently in South Africa (Crush & Tawodzera, 2016). The authors *(ibid)* highlight that the causes for this permanency are, the political crisis of 2005; differences in the standard of living in the two countries, a country characterized by food shortages and hunger and lack of formal employment. Similarly, Ranger (2005) and McGregor (2007) in their separate studies based in the UK discuss the reasons for Zimbabweans migrating to join the care industry. Both authors highlight that mass emigration from Zimbabwe started in 2000 when the economy plunged drastically and the political crisis worsened, this motivated by personal goals is what encouraged their migration. Furthermore the presence of social networks in the facilitation of migration and employment was a motivating factor in the migration of Zimbabweans (Crush & Tawodzera, 2016).

One of the consequences of the mass migration from Zimbabwe to South Africa is that the migration is more feminized than it is from other countries in the region (Crush & Tawodzera, 2016). Muzvidziwa (2001) looks at the migration patterns of Zimbabwean cross-border traders from 1994-95 in Masvingo, Zimbabwe. Muzvidzwa (*ibid*) highlights that Zimbabwean women started crossing the border to engage in informal trade in order to improve their livelihoods. This is in line with Crush & Tawodzera's (2016) findings that individuals cross borders in order to improve the survival techniques of their household members. Muzvidzwa (2001) discusses negative discourses about these women by the media and their respective communities because of their lack of docility and looking for employment outside of their households. In the same source, the author discusses the social networks that the traders use to establish themselves. Muzvidziwa's (2001) study highlights that female migrants are viewed as immoral due to the sexual risks that they take in order to enhance their livelihood strategy. However, it is plausible to argue that it is through the use of their own agency that female migrants attempt to address their vulnerability.

It is within such a historical and legislative framework that the study was immersed in. The key concepts of the capability approach are a person's functioning's which consist of their beings and doings and their capabilities which consists of their genuine opportunities to realize their freedoms (Clark, 2005). Literature points to the fact that the political situation in Zimbabwe resulted in process failure and this is what ultimately encouraged individuals to

move. Taking this macro motivation for migrating into consideration, my intention as the researcher was to establish the functionings and lack thereof that caused the participants to migrate to Johannesburg and the capabilities that they have been able to realise through the use of their social networks, once settling within the South Africa.

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM AND RATIONALE

The term social networks is described as the assertion of social relationships as delineated or achieved, among individuals, families, households, villages, communities such as tribes and religions and as well as regions (Scott & Carrington, 2011). It consists of nodes (social actors) along with a specific set of ties that link them together (Borgatti & Halgin, 2011). These connections are better known as strong and weak ties and function both within the host country and country of origin. Strong ties are based on nuclear family links and close friendships whereas weak ties are based on a communal identity such religious, national or cultural identity. In addition these links are based on the common social attribute of proximity and articulate themselves through the availability of resources that can be called upon in times of crises (Kadushin, 2004).

Many approaches are used to explain the diversity and complexity of the ways in which people make a living in line with their capacities, resilience and resources such as the livelihoods approach, the transnational migration, and transnational social spaces approach (Thieme, 2008). The research mainly focused on social networks and migration and how they are tied to the capacities, resilience and resources of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in South Africa. Massey & Aysa (2005, p. 29) defines social networks as ‘‘sets of interpersonal ties that connect migrants, former migrants, and non-migrants at places of origin and destination through reciprocal ties of kinship, friendship, and shared community of origin”. According to Curran & Rivero-Fuentes (2003, p. 289) the role of social networks for ‘‘explaining migration has strong theoretical and empirical evidence”, with literature on social networks and migration lending its voices to discourses on how social networks help undocumented migrants in the acquisition of employment in the host country and in the survival of households through remittances to the originating country (Crush & Tevera, 2010; Thieme, 2008;& Muahanamoha, Maharaj & Preston-Whyte, 2010).

Both regional and international literature on social networks focuses mainly on how undocumented migrants use their social networks to navigate their countries of employment.

Kathiravelu (2012) avers that informal social networks play an important role in an undocumented migrant's life in a highly controlled state. These ties allow them to navigate their environment with a reduced risk of deportation. Muahanamoha et al (2010) argue that the social networks of undocumented Mozambican migrants in South Africa defy spatial boundaries and are conveyors of social capital which operate at transnational levels. Silvey & Elmhirst (2004) highlight that in times of economic hardship, family and community cohesion can facilitate in the establishing of successful development alternatives when the state has failed. Silvey & Elmhirst (2004)'s argument, however, is not based on the aforementioned conceptualisation but cautions against it because it does not take into consideration the gendered nature and power dynamics of social capital and networks.

Adding to from Silvey & Elmhirst (2004) the aim of the research was to probe into the social networks of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in South Africa. The International Labour Organisation (2010) defines domestic work as any "work performed in or for a household or households". A domestic worker is "any person engaged in domestic work within an employment relationship". The duties of a domestic worker are inclusive and not restricted to cleaning, cooking, doing laundry, looking after children and the aged. The ILO estimates that there are 65million domestic workers operating worldwide with 3 853 000 working within the Africa, according to the Stats SA and the Quarterly Labour Report (Quarter 1, 2016) there are circa 1 251 000 women working as domestic workers in private households in South Africa. Despite the figures offered by both these reports it is difficult to ascertain the number of domestic workers operating both internationally and regionally due to the context within which this type of employment takes place.

Existing literature shows that migrant domestic workers meet with difficult working conditions such as long hours and low wages (Nyamjoh, 2007& Griffin, 2011). Apart from the aforementioned difficulties, domestic workers can also suffer human rights abuses such as social isolation and exploitation based on race, class, nationality and gender (Huang & Yeoh, 1996 & Cheng, 2004). Consequently, those working in the sector face a greater threat from the "host" state, not only through denial of services but also through threats of deportation (Griffin, 2011; Kok et al, 2006). In order to subvert these threats, women working in the domestic industry have come up with safety measures in the form of social networks that help them to cope, strengthen their livelihood strategies and safeguard their stay within South Africa (Deacon, Olivier& Beremauro, 2015).

International literature on domestic work and mobility mainly focuses on women and their provision of domestic labour in countries beyond their borders as well as the challenges that they face (Huang & Yeoh, 1996; Silvey, 2004). Silvey & Elmherst(2003) address social capital and social networks and how they help migrants to overcome their challenges. The authors *(ibid)* also take into consideration the gendered nature of the aforementioned social networks and social capital and how it may potentially have negative effects on the female migrant. Socio-spatial networks facilitate access to employment and cash by rural households, and access by city-based migrants to agricultural produce (Silvey & Elmhirst, 2003). Huang & Yeoh's (1996), findings stress that the challenges that international domestic workers face are a symptom of globalisation and state policies implemented by Singapore which perpetuate society's patriarchal understanding of women. In his study of the narratives of Zimbabweans working in the care industry in the United Kingdom, McGregor (2007) argues that the combination of acute labour shortages and restrictionist migration policy has produced a situation where informal recruitment practices in the care industry have flourished. This has led to an increase in the exploitation of care/domestic workers. However, despite the exploitation, many Zimbabwean migrants see it as a stepping stone into the employment sector in the UK (McGregor, 2007).

There is a wealth of knowledge on domestic work in Africa, especially in the South African context (Ally, 2011; Griffin, 2011; Kiwanuka et al, 2015). Ally (2011) looks into the historical background of domestic work and posits that apart from exploitation, domestic work takes place in a vacuum that is also characterised by care and concern for the employer by the employee. The body of the domestic worker in this regard becomes contested because not only is it the physical symbol of nurture and love but also a symbol of social and structural inequality. Griffin (2011) postulates the argument that the experiences and labour positions of domestic workers are best understood through the analytical lens of illegality. The illegality contradicts their legal inclusion in basic labour protections. Illegality according to Griffin (2011) is subject to ongoing social and discursive construction through a range of sites and relations.

The study aimed to probe into the social networks of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in South Africa. This was done in order to understand the role that social networks play in shaping the functionings, capabilities and livelihood strategies available to migrant women. Consequently, the objective of the study was to understand

social networks as a coping strategy employed by undocumented women in mitigating the exploitative nature of their employment. Additionally, the study intended to contribute empirically to existing literature on social networks. Justification as to why the researcher is mainly focused on undocumented Zimbabwean female domestic workers, this is because literature on domestic work mainly focuses on the exploitative nature of the employment and domestic workers are seen as being passive recipients of exploitation and abuse. The study, therefore, aimed to provide a counter- narrative that sees domestic workers as agents that actively work to construct their realities within the context of abuse and exploitation through informal engagement with their social networks.

MAIN RESEARCH QUESTION

What is the role of social networks in shaping the capabilities and resources of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg?

Objectives

1. To identify the ties, connections and relationships that undocumented Zimbabwean women create and use.
2. To understand the role of social networks in providing social, political, emotional and economic support.
3. To investigate how social networks enhance the capabilities and resources of non – national domestic workers.

Sub-questions

1. What social networks are available or created by Zimbabwean women?

2. What is the role of social networks in providing social, political emotional and economic support?

    a. How do migrant domestic workers define poverty?

    b. Do social networks lead to social, political, emotional and economic freedom? (empowerment)

3. How do social networks enhance the capabilities and resources of non-national domestic workers?

    a. How do migrant domestic workers view their wellbeing?

    b. What do migrant domestic workers define as development?

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

A capabilities approach was employed as the theoretical framework for the study. This is because the approach allows for the assertion that despite the challenges that undocumented migrant domestic workers face, they are still capable of having what they themselves articulate as a good life. The main claim of the approach is that in order to evaluate the quality of life, the researcher should focus on the effective opportunities that the individual has in order to live a life that they deem valuable to themselves (Robeyns, 2006). Capabilities consist of functionings and opportunities of freedom which give individuals the freedom to achieve their value goals (Gasper & Truong, 2010). The reason why a capabilities approach was employed is because the researcher aimed to assess whether social networks helped domestic workers achieve their value goals. The approach is symbiotic with both utility such as happiness & pleasure and resource based concepts of wellbeing livelihood strategies such as (Clark, 2005), which ties to the research question with the intention of understanding the role that social networks play in shaping the capacities and resources of undocumented Zimbabwean women.

STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS

The second chapter of the thesis serves as the literature review for the research report. It is concerned with discussing both regional and international literature on domestic work in order to identify the gaps so as to situate the study. This is done through the use of the capabilities approach as the theoretical background.

The third chapter discusses the methodological approached that were used to undertake data collection. In this chapter I sought to discuss not only the theory associated with methodology, but also recount the steps I took to data gathering as well as the challenges that I faced.

Chapter four presents and discusses the main findings of the research study. it discusses the motivations for moving to South Africa in line with the social networks of the participants. In addition it delves into the networks available to them within the host country.

Lastly chapter five presents a summary of the key findings, concluding remarks as well as a list of recommendations for future study.

DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS

Domestic work

Domestic work will be operationalised as work that is done by women within the private sphere for remunerative purposes and it is characterised by and not restricted to activities such as looking after the household and its members, cooking, cleaning, laundry and ironing etc (ILO, 2010).

Resilience

The ability of a person, household, community, or system to react over time to shocks and to proactively reduce the risk of future stressors; these actions contribute to growth and development rather than merely maintain stability, (Bernier & Menzin- Dick, 2014).

Social networks

The assertion of social relationships as delineated or achieved, among individuals, families, households, villages, communities and regions. These relations are based on strong and weak ties and can be called upon and relied upon in times of distress. (Kadushin, 2004)

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

INTRODUCTION

This chapter discusses literature that is relevant to the study. It begins by discussing the capabilities approach which is the theoretical framework of the study so as to provide the context through which the research questions were answered. Secondly, this select review discusses the relationship between the state and the undocumented migrant in order to understand the macro institutions that define their mobility and how the migrant domestic workers are impacted by them. Additionally the review discusses literature pertaining to the circumstances of both documented and undocumented domestic workers. It concludes by reviewing literature on social networks.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

A capabilities approach was used as the theoretical framework for the study. The main claim of the approach is that in order to assess the quality of life, the researcher should focus on the effective opportunities that the individual has in order to live a life that they deem valuable to themselves (Robeyns, 2006). Capabilities consist of functionings and opportunities of freedom which give individuals the freedom to achieve their value goals (Gasper & Truong, 2010). The reason why a capabilities approach was employed is because it allowed me to assess whether social networks help domestic workers achieve their value goals. As compared to other approaches, the capabilities approach provides a more holistic framework for considering wellbeing and development (Clark, 2005).

Literature on the capabilities approach is rather expansive, therefore for the purposes of this study, it mainly focused on the works of Sen (2005), Clark (2005) and Robeyns (2006). In addition these three works give a holistic view of the capabilities approach when combined. The capability approach is an approach that is concerned with the assessment of well-being, quality of life and judgements about equality, or the level of development of a community or a country (Robeyns, 2006). The approach asserts that development should not be primarily focussed on available resources or on individual psychological state, but rather on the effective opportunities that people have to lead lives that they deem valuable to themselves (Robeyns, 2006). The approach consists of core concepts such as functionings which are their beings and doings or alternatively achievements such as being well fed or literate and

capabilities which are real opportunities of freedom that allow individuals to realize their functionings or achievements. Robeyns (2006) in his paper discusses how both Sen and Nausbaum as pioneers of the capabilities approach assert that by focussing on capabilities instead of functionings, individuals do not impose certain notions of what a good life should be but rather aims at providing a range of possible alternative ways of living. The research does not intend on dismissing this idea, but rather aims to understand what the research participants have been able to achieve in line with their capabilities.

Clark (2005) in his study discusses the benefits of using the capabilities approach as a framework, emphasizing that it avoids pitfalls from analyzing wellbeing from a strictly economic perspective because it is based on the ability to live well across all spheres of life. Additionally the approach is more accommodative of both material and mental aspects to wellbeing such as physical health, security, literacy etc. Clark (2005) distinguishes the differences between capabilities with functionings being a reflection and collection of the actual beings and doings that an individual is able to achieve. Capabilities on the other hand, represent the alternative mixtures of functionings that are of use to the individual. What is useful from this study is that it provides an overview of the capability approach and how it is centred on the ability to command resources. This easily ties into the notion of social networks and social capital which is the availability of resources that can be called upon and used in times of need (Kathiravelu, 2012). Additionally, Clark (2005) notes that Sen always uses having a bicycle and having bread as his examples; in relation to the bicycle it emphasizes having the means to move around. When applied to the context of the study having a bicycle is based on the utility aspect and can be compared to migrant domestic workers that have documentation. In this instance having documentation means having the ability to move around, whereas lack of documentation means moving around in a limited space. At the same time having bread is concerned with livelihood strategies. What is important in this instance is that having bread and a bicycle are representative of capabilities and what an individual is able to do with them (increased/decreased functionings). For example, using once again the idea of mobility, a migrant domestic worker may have a passport, which allows for easier movements; however lack of a proper work permit hinders their movement into formal employment in the host country.

Sen (2005) in his article *"Human rights and capabilities",* identifies that human rights and capabilities are dependent on one another, whilst one concept is more abstract (human

rights), capabilities can be seen as the process through which human rights are made concrete. Consequently, Sen (2005) highlights that human rights can be seen as basic entitlements to certain basic capabilities, however in this case one needs to take into consideration the concepts of opportunity and process. An example of this is how undocumented domestic workers are protected under the BCEA and can report labour disputes to the Department of Labour (opportunity), the process however is not as clear cut because undocumented migrant domestic workers risk deportation by reporting to the Department of Labour which results in what the author (Sen, 2005), refers to as "process failure". Furthermore in this instance the idea of capability threatens their basic functioning.

A major limitation of the approach is that the capability approach is underspecified. Firstly it does not provide a list of specific functioning and capabilities. The lack of specifity means that the approach has to be supplemented with other theory. I attempted to resolve this to by using a combination of social network theory and literature on resilience. Secondly, it can be argued that by providing a list of specific functionings and capabilities, the researcher inadvertently imposes their own perception of what a good life is (Robeyns, 2006). Therefore, the lack of a specific list gives individuals the agency to define their own set of functionings and capabilities. In addition, the approach overlaps with both utility (happiness & pleasure) and resource based concepts of wellbeing (livelihood strategies) (Clark, 2005), which ties to the research question with the intention of understanding the role that social networks play in shaping the capacities and resources of undocumented Zimbabwean women.

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE STATE & THE UNDOCUMENTED MIGRANT

International literature on domestic work emphasizes the role that states play in shaping the migration and the working conditions of domestic workers (Huang & Yeoh, 1996; Silvey, 2004; & Cheng, 2004). Huang & Yeoh (1996) use empirical evidence drawn from different sources of secondary data to reveal how state policies play an integral role in shaping the uneven relationship between migrant domestic workers and their employers. Huang & Yeoh, (1996) assert that the availability or lack of policies and legislation of both labour sending and receiving countries leads to the creation of the context through which female domestic workers are seen as submissive and easy to abuse. Similarly, Silvey (2004) discusses the role of the state and how both the Indonesian and Saudi states have contributed to the

feminization of migrant labour. Silvey, 2001 argues that in order to understand state politics from the Indonesian – Saudi context there is a need to use a feminist perspective so as to comprehend the gender interconnections "between the production of gendered subjects, domestic labour, the nation and transnational migration".

Regional literature discusses the state and the role it plays in shaping the migration and working conditions of domestic workers. Various pieces of legislation speak to the protection of rights of both domestic and foreign domestic workers. The Basic Conditions of Employment Act (BCEA) established the Employment Conditions Commission (ECC) in order to assist with the drafting of minimum wages for the 11 'vulnerable' sectors in South Africa which are known as sectoral determinants (Kiwanuka et al 2015). Griffin (2011) submits that in 2008 the Commission for Conciliation Mediation and Arbitration (CCMA) broadened basic labour protections and rights to illegal foreigners employed within the South African context. However, both sets of authors argue that even if theoretically protected by basic rights, the implementation of such policies and documents is hindered by the lack of resources and training on behalf of the state and state officials as well as the invisibility of foreign domestic workers.

Ally (2008) in *Domestic Worker Unionisation in Post-Apartheid South Africa: Demobilisation & Depoliticisation by the Democratic State* discusses the role that government has played towards the demobilisation and depoliticisation of domestic worker unions. The article emphasizes that the construction of the term vulnerable in the case of domestic workers has led to the disbandment of trade unions as the articulator of employee rights and has positioned the state as the medium through which these rights are conceived and mediated (Ally, 2008). In addition trade unions have ceased to be mechanisms of social change but have become extensions of government focussing mainly on paperwork, beaurocracy and referrals of domestic workers to the Department of Labour. Another argument posited by Ally (2008) is that the introduction of Sectoral determination 7 and the inclusion of Domestic workers under the basic conditions of employment act has meant that the mandate for domestic worker unions has been achieved therefore there is no longer a need for domestic workers to join trade unions. Nevertheless, as literature shows undocumented domestic workers still face many challenges in the work place, therefore there is still a need for the trade union establishment (Ally, 2008, Ally, 2010). In understanding the social networks available to the migrant women one of the sub-goals of the research was to

understand whether trade unions can be understood as an available network to the study group.

Both international and regional literature acknowledge that strict migration policies create the vacuum through which exploitation of domestic workers takes place, (McGregor, 2007; Huang & Yeoh 1999; Griffin, 2011). Taking into consideration the theoretical framework of the study, the notion of functionings acknowledges that individuals may be unable to achieve many of their goals due to restrictions (Robeyns, 2006). In relation to this study, although the non-national domestic workers are operating in the country, they are undocumented and this means that their functionings and capabilities are inhibited due to their invisibility. One of the aims of the research was to explore the informal institutions that undocumented Zimbabwean women have established in order to increase their functionings from bare achievement to opportunities of freedom that allow them to live a life that they consider suitable to themselves. What separates this study from the above literature is that unlike Huang & Yeoh (1999), the data that was used was primary data this is. In addition as compared to Griffin (2011) & Kiwanuka et al (2015) the study primarily focussed on undocumented Zimbabwean women, this is because although domestic workers on the surface are faced with similar problems because of nuances such as nationality and documentation there are differences within the challenges that they face.

DOMESTIC WORK

Domestic work is considered atypical work because it takes place in the home of the employer, and regulating their working conditions is difficult, this is despite the fact that this type of employment is regulated by the BCEA and Sectoral determination 7 (Dinat & Peeberdy, 2007). The International Labour Organisation (ILO) defines domestic work as being any type of work that is done within a household/households. A domestic worker in South Africa is defined as being a " gardener, driver, or a person who looks after children, the aged, sick, frail or disabled in a private household, but not a farm", (Unemployment Insurance Contributions Act of 2002). The activities of a domestic worker are also inclusive of but not restricted to house cleaning, cooking, doing the laundry, ironing etc.

Cock (2011) & Mantouvalou (2006) highlight that despite the progress that has been made in legislation in order to protect domestic workers in the form of Sectoral determinant 7, the

majority of domestic workers still suffer unparalleled abuse by their employers; are still considered invisible and ignored by society at large. It is interesting to note that Cock (2011) compares invisibility to racism and sexism and this is similar to Cheng (2004)'s argument that employers play an active role in the construction and naturalisation of domestic workers in order to demonstrate their power as compared to the lack thereof of employee power. Within the South African context power is characterised by structural and societal inequalities, and is evidenced through patriarchy, differing classes as well as lack of documentation. The lack of power and invisibility is heightened by the fact that domestic work takes place in the private sphere as some domestic workers live in with their employers instead of the public economic sphere (Dinat & Peeberdy, 2007). The atypical nature of domestic work as well as the location of where it takes place, makes it difficult for domestic workers to mobilize and organise which further compounds their invisibility (Ally, 2008).

This then poses the question, "Why do women choose to be domestic workers despite the widespread abuse?", Locally, one of the contributing factors is that many black South African women choose to be domestic workers because lack of education propels them into the 'informal sector' (Bonner, 2010; Kiwanuka et al, 2015 & Ally, 2008). This is further compounded by the need to further provide for their families, which is exacerbated by father absence in the context where there may be children involved (Phillips, 2011). Furthermore, participants in Phillips' (2011), highlighted that they chose to be domestic workers because that is the job they were trained to do by their mothers, additionally in some cases domestic work comes with free accommodation for them therefore they do not have to worry about paying rent (Phillips,2011). The findings of my study (which will be further discussed in Chapter 4), differed from this because the majority of participants attested to having some sort of qualifications despite being domestic workers in addition they chose to be domestic workers due to their inability to find formal employment, in addition formal employment did not pay them well.

In *Restless worlds of work, health and migration: domestic workers in Johannesburg,* Dinat &Peeberdy (2007), explore the lives of migrant domestic workers focussing on their working conditions and use of healthcare services and knowledge and possible vulnerability to HIV & AIDS. The findings in the study point out that 64% of domestic workers interviewed lived with their employers and this often resulted in feelings of loneliness and sadness due to the

fact they are away from their husbands, friends and family. The aim of the research was not to refute these findings but rather aims to firstly understand the decisions taken by migrant domestic workers when it comes to residing with their employers and whether or not these decisions enhance or diminish their capabilities and functionings. The theoretical framework of the study allowed the researcher to reanalyse notions around loneliness and vulnerability and what exactly this means o the participants.

MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORK

There is a wealth of knowledge on the impact of globalisation on domestic work, of particular importance being the movements of women from poorer nations moving from their countries of origins to work in the global care industry (Huang & Yeoh, 1999; Silvey & Elmhirst, 2004; Cock, 2011,). In Southern Africa there is a growing demand for live-in domestic workers as carers and cleaners, this is mainly due to the fact that more women are opting to employ other women to raise their children as they (employers) work on their careers (Anderson, 2001). In addition, employers are more likely to employ migrant women as domestic workers because they are deemed more to be more docile and submissive than their local counterparts (Griffin, 2011). A striking characteristic of these migrants is that a significant number of them are undocumented, even in countries where it is legally possible to obtain documentation (Anderson, 2001), such as the case of South Africa which has put in place legal mechanisms such as the Zimbabwe Dispensation Permit in order to document low skilled and unskilled Zimbabwean migrants (Anderson, 2001 & Crush & Tevera, 2010). Findings in the study highlight that participants could not afford the cost associated with being documented because they had other financial commitments. This further inhibited their ability to move into formal employment because formal employment requires documentation. For the purposes of this study, the research focused specifically on migrant domestic workers that are undocumented, these ranged from women that do not have passports at all to women who do have passports but do not have work permits.

Anderson (2007) explores the demand for migrant domestic work in the United Kingdom, particularly focussing on how immigration status makes it easier to not only recruit foreign domestic workers but also to maintain their foreignness. The article highlights that within the European context, migration has been a solution to the labour and skills deficit caused by aging populations and vacancies in care work. This has been further exacerbated by the need to enable women to work outside of their homes. Interestingly the author *(ibid)* highlights

that employers of domestic workers are exempt from the Race Relations Act- meaning that they have the legal right to refuse employment on the basis of nationality, race or religion. This further compounds the arguments on otherness highlighted by Cheng (2004) and Cock (2011).

Literature in both the domestic and migrant domestic work, stresses women choose to be domestic workers due lack of education. Additionally, these women are faced with challenges such as exploitation and poor protection. My study did not aim to refute these claims however it builds onto them by highlighting that firstly although there are macro structures such as the family unit and legislation that govern the choices individuals make, individuals still have agency this agency is characterised by how migrant domestic workers attempt to use their social networks to mitigate their challenges.

THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP

International literature on the role of the employer provides a focus on the relationship between the employer and the domestic worker. Anderson (2001) postulates that domestic workers are expected to ascribe to higher cleaning standards than their employers would be able to ascribe to. Lack of documentation puts non-national domestic workers at the risk of being abused by their employers and taking on degrading tasks that they themselves (employers) would not do if they had a choice (Cheng, 2004). Cheng (2004) argues that employers play an active role in the construction and naturalisation of otherness on foreign domestic workers in order to demonstrate the extent of employer power as juxtaposed against the lack of employee power.

African literature widely discusses the role of the employer in exploiting domestic workers. Ally (2011) takes a historical approach to discussing the exploitative relationship between the employer and domestic helper. The author (*ibid),* highlights that alongside being an exploited body, the domestic helper takes on a psychic aura in which she is also the physical body of love and care. This points to the blurred boundaries of employee and family member and facilitates the exploitation because it is hidden as ‘care” work. Griffin (2011) studies the relationship from the point of illegality and puts forth the argument that in relation to both black employer and employee the dynamics of difference are based on citizenship or lack thereof. In this study foreign (Basotho) migrants are preferred because of their perceived passiveness and submissiveness as compared to their South African counterparts (Griffin, 2011).

Nyamnjoh (2007) as juxtaposed to Ally (2011) and Griffin (2011) discusses the employment relationship from the position of contestation. The author *(ibid)*, initially highlights that a significant amount of literature categorises domestic workers as being passive and hyper-exploited due to their lack of choices brought on by lack of documentation and education. The aim of the paper is to however highlight that even in the face of abuse and exploitation, domestic workers have mechanisms put in place to keep hope alive. In his literature review Nyamjoh (2007) emphasizes that historically grumblings and non-responsiveness were used by domestic workers as a form of resistance, this coupled by their informal networks gives them the ability to mitigate the harsh conditions within which they are employed. From the article one gets the impression that there is mistrust between both employers and employees, hence why they behave in particular ways towards one another. An interesting example given by the author *(ibid)* is that female employers fear being usurped by their domestic workers hence their harsh behaviour and othering nature towards them.

Literature chosen in this subsection reviews the relationship between the employer and employee from different angles. I sought to analyze the role that the employer-employee relationship plays in creating, and sustaining the social networks of domestic workers. This was done in order to recognize and understand the power and agency structures that produce and contribute to inequality, vulnerability and inadvertently resilience (Bernier & Menzin-Dick, 2014). In addition like Nyamjoh (2007), I wanted to investigate the contested nature of the employment relationship and how participants use their networks to challenge this relationship, this was done by taking into consideration that participants lack documentation, therefore they had to have alternative means of addressing their difficulties.

THE SOCIAL NETWORKS OF UNDOCUMENTED MIGRANTS

Social networks can be defined as groups of interpersonal ties that link migrants, previous migrants and non-migrants at their originating community and host community through symbiotic ties of kinship, friendship and shared community of origin (Massey et al, 2005). One of the aims of the study is to understand the social networks available to undocumented domestic workers in order to understand how these informal networks influence their capabilities and resources.

Mei-Liu (2013)'s article analyses how the social networks of migrant Senegalese individuals influence the migration patterns of potential migrants. The author *(ibid)* identifies that migrant networks lead to cheaper migration costs and increases in the number of people

migrating through the provision of information and resources. The article establishes that empirical research has largely ignored friendship ties as well as extended family ties. The results from the study identify that weak ties in the form of friendships are just as integral as strong ties to the migration process. In addition, network ties influences are gendered, this is because both male and female migrants experience migration differently (Mei-Liu, 2013). Females are more likely to migrate if there is a presence of strong network ties in the form of close family and households; whereas weak ties play an influential role in the migration of males (Mei-Liu, 2013). Although these findings in relation to female migration are important, they however do not paint the full picture in regards to whether these strong ties accommodate them upon arrival. In order to complete the context we can use Muzvidzwa's (2001) study which identifies that although strong familial ties are helpful in the migration process, upon the arrival of the female migrant, the relationship between the migrant and her accommodative network becomes strained, therefore they resort to using their weaker ties in order to establish themselves.

Muanamoha et al (2010)'s paper study, analyses the social networks which facilitate and maintain undocumented migration from Mozambique to South Africa. The paper postulates that social networks are not spatially bounded but rather transcend space and geography and can be seen as an articulator of social capital. Social networks according to Muanamoha et al (2010) operate in the sending communities, at the borders and in the host nation, as migrants get support in these three location through interpersonal relationships based on kinship and family. In regards to the sending community, social networks play a pivotal role through the provision of moral and financial support of potential and returned migrants. Additionally the findings from the study highlight that strong ties in the form of nuclear family are the ones that look after and grow the estate of the migrant whilst away. The results of the study, highlight how undocumented migrants are able to use their friendships with border officials in order to make their way into South Africa. In the study, Muanamoha et al (2010) highlight that one of the limitations of social network theory is that, the networks have little or no influence in macro institutions and policies.

In relation to the study, my intention to establish and explore the supportive role that the social networks of undocumented domestic workers play. Within the host country the research aims to understand whether the participants are more reliant on strong ties or weak ties for support. Additionally, whilst Muanahoma et al (2010) view social networks as being unable to influence macro institutions and policies, this current study on migrant domestic

work does not view this as a limitation but rather as an advantage for the undocumented domestic workers. This is because they have no intention of influencing macros structures due to fear of deportation. This is because the study aimed to explore and understand how social networks help undocumented domestic workers to navigate their environments within the context of their work and lack of documentation.

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DOMESTIC WORKERS AND THEIR SOCIAL NETWORKS

The social networks of undocumented domestic workers are multiple and fulfil differing roles. This part of the literature review aims to discuss some of the social networks that domestic workers have ranging from their strong familial ties to weak friendship ties.

Phillips (2011) analyses the oral testimonies of 13 retired domestic workers, in order to articulate the complex nature of their life experiences. This is done by combining discussions between their work life and their family life, which allowed the author *(ibid)* to construct personalised networks which framed the participants' lives at their various life stages. The study (Phillips, 2011), highlights that the need to work as domestic workers is often spurred on a desire to provide a better future for their children, in the event of father absence. One of the main findings in the study is that the majority of participants interviewed, viewed either their own fathers or the fathers of their children as being irresponsible therefore they had to take up the mandate of being sole breadwinners (Phillips, 2011). The study identifies that this then results in the domestic workers relying heavily on female dominated networks mainly consisting of their mothers and aunts to look after their children as they look after the children of their employers (Phillips, 2011). Because of the era that the women grew up in, the majority of the participants were socialized to become domestic workers, whose teachings are intimately tied to notions about femininity and the role of women in the household which is further coupled with lack of education (Phillips, 2011).

Hondagneu-Sotelo (1994) builds onto the narrative that domestic work is an isolated profession. The study identifies that one of the ways through which migrant women are able to address this isolation is through collectivizing in their networks. The article examines the responses of migrant Mexican women to the organisation of paid domestic work as 'job labour', which within the South African context would be known as working several jobs throughout the week part-time. Doing job work allows the domestic workers to maintain their

autonomy as well as surpass the isolated nature of domestic work. However, job work can also be straining due to constantly negotiating the employer-employee relationship, and the need to secure and maintain multiple employers in the context of job scarcity and volatility (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 1994). The study postulates that in order to deal with challenges faced on the job; migrant domestic workers collectivize and share information through their social networks. Social networks enable the migrant domestic workers to share information that ranges from cleaning tips to negotiating pay. However they can also be constraining in that due to the competitive nature of job work, migrant domestic workers are not willing to share information with each other about potential jobs.

In relation to the study, the literature shared in this part of the review shows the context within which social networks operate. Strong ties are important when it comes to providing care and support to the migrant domestic worker and her offspring. Weak ties are of more importance in the host country because they allow for the exchange of helpful information and tips. This part of the literature review aims to highlight where and how the social networks of migrant domestic workers operate in order to create the context for the research.

SOCIAL CAPITAL

Social capital according to Muanahoma et al (p.887) can be defined as "features of social organisation, such as networks, norms and trust, that facilitate action and co-operation for mutual benefits". There are two types of social capital which are important to the migration process; these are bounded solidarity and enforceable trust (Muanahoma et al, 2010). Bounded solidarity is limited to members of a certain group who are faced with similar events at a specific time and place, in the case of undocumented domestic workers solidarity arises out of confrontation with exploitation and lack of documentation. On the other hand enforceable trust can be defined as social capital that establishes itself from similarities in experiences of departure from their home country and conditions at arrival in the receiving country resulting in ties among migrants and a multiplicity of social networks resulting in a tightly knit community (Muanahoma et al 2010,). For the purposes of this study, social capital is conceptualised as those resources that can be called upon in times of crises (Silvey & Elmhirst, 2004). Kathiravelu (2012) highlights that the use of friendships and connections allow low-wage employees to secure employment and promotions as well as secure either financial or emotional help (Kathiravelu, 2012). In times of economic hardship family and community cohesion can facilitate in the establishing of successful development alternatives when the state has failed (Silvey & Elmhirst, 2004).

SOCIAL CAPITAL & RESILIENCE

The concept of resilience provides a lens through which the impact of social capital can be analysed. This is because resilience is made up of symbiotic structures such as livelihood strategies, access to resources and social institutions that allow individuals to cope and adapt to shock and stressors (Adger et al 2002 & Bernier & Menzin-2014)). For the purpose of this study, resilience is conceptualised as, " the capacity of an individual, household, community, or system to respond over time to shocks and to proactively reduce the risk of future stressors; these actions contribute to growth and development rather than merely maintain stability, (Bernier & Menzin- Dick, 2014 p.22)". Resilience as understood through the capabilities framework allows the researcher to better understand and analyse the wellbeing and development of non-national domestic workers. This is because as evidenced through the literature review, lack of documentation makes non-national domestic workers vulnerable to deportation and exploitation. Vulnerability in this instance is a stressor and the aim of the research is to understand the role of social networks in creating resilience among undocumented non-national domestic workers. This then provides scope of the research as it allows the researcher to explore how undocumented female migrants mitigate the unequal power relations between themselves, their families and their informal networks.

SOCIAL CAPITAL AND REMITTANCES

Social networks and social capital operate at different levels within the life of the documented migrant. One of the contexts within which social networks are prevalent is that of remittances of money and sending goods home. There are two channels through which migrants send cash and goods through; these are formal channels and informal channels. For the purposes of this study, attention was only be paid to informal channels because lack of documentation hinders undocumented migrants from using formalized networks. In South Africa Section 21 of the Financial Intelligence Center Act, FICA (38/2001), inter alia, states that a person is required to produce a valid passport with a valid work permit, proof of residence as well as proof of regular income before one can be allowed to send remittances through formal bank channels. Additionally migrants prefer informal networks because they are made up of personalised networks that are able to remit money to remote places such as rural areas (Crush & Tawodzera, 2016). Informal channels in this regard includes and is not limited to the use of friends to deliver the remittances as well as the use of money delivery services offered by cross-border transport companies, popularly known as "*omalayisha"*, who operate taxis and buses (Braching & Sachikonye,2009). The reason why these channels are important

is because, these may perhaps be the same channels that undocumented domestic workers firstly use to get into the country and secondly use to either have their passports stamped into or out of South Africa in order to comply with immigration requirements albeit illegally .

CONCLUSION

This chapter reviews both international and regional literature on domestic work. It identifies that domestic workers faced with many challenges which included exploitation and low wages. In addition the relationship with macro systems such as their employer and the government are highly contested in that although firstly government has put in mechanisms to restrict the movements of undocumented migrants into South Africa, they have found alternative means to circumvent the mechanisms put in place. In addition literature also shows that to their employers domestic workers are perceived as passive and submissive however in such a relationship domestic workers find alternative means to air their grievances such as use of friends and being unresponsive. Within this context the research sought to understand what how participants defined and described their wellbeing and how they used their social networks to articulate this definition.

CHAPTER THREE

METHODOLOGY

INTRODUCTION

This chapter aims to discuss the research methodology applied in the implementation of the study. It discusses in depth the processes associated with the methodology. These said processes are discussed in the following order, research approach, research design, sampling, and research instrument, pre-testing of instrument, data collection, data analysis, ethical considerations and the limitations of the study.

RESEARCH APPROACH

An interpretive research approach formed the basis of this study. This was based on my need to understand the overall meanings that participants attached to their social networks and actions in their social worlds (Neuman, 2000). This meaning according to Neuman (2000) only comes to life when people with similar experiences come together and decipher the action as being relevant to them socially. This was achieved with the intention of identifying firstly the links, ties and connections that are available to undocumented Zimbabwean women and how they were developed. Once this was identified, I found it imperative to understand the role of these ties in providing social, political, emotional and economic support in addressing the challenges that undocumented domestic workers face. This was done with the intention of understanding how migrant domestic workers define poverty and whether or not social networks lead to empowerment. Lastly it was important explore how social networks enhance the capabilities and resources of non-national women, particularly focussing on how they define wellbeing and development.

Qualitative research has three aspects according to Denzin and Lincoln (2011). Firstly qualitative research aims to capture an individual's point of view. Researchers in this instance attempt to get an insider's perspective from the respondents by interviewing them in great detail. What this does is that it allows the researcher to understand the respondent's actions in terms of their beliefs, history and context (Babbie & Mouton, 1998). One of the aims of the research was to explore how the social networks of undocumented domestic workers shape their resources and capabilities and whether they led to the attainment of dignity and an overall improvement in their wellbeing. I did this by probing participants on how both weak

and strong ties links and connections such as marriage, family, and friendship and church communities had played a part in their migrating and establishing themselves in South Africa.

The second intention of qualitative research is to examine the constraints of life. Researchers in this instance are more likely to try and confront the problems and the challenges that respondents face on a daily basis. The overall objective of this study was to give a voice to this specific group of women (Ragin, 2014). However unlike Denzin & Lincoln (2011), the study aimed to explore how migrant domestic workers use their social networks to address their problems and challenges within the contexts of no documentation and their working environment. With that said, an interesting finding in the case of the research was that despite the fact that literature highlights that domestic workers live exploited and lonely lives; domestic workers were able to come together to discusses their challenges and constraints through the use of social media which allows them to transcend their bounded working and living context in addition in instances where domestic workers go and search for employment they are able to discuss their challenges whilst they wait for potential employers.

The third aim of qualitative research was to provide thick rich descriptions, with researchers believing that rich descriptions are of great importance to the world in which we live in. The research aimed to provide thick descriptions of how undocumented Zimbabwean domestic workers use their social networks in their country of origin, in transition and in their host country.

RESEARCH DESIGN

Research design according to Babbie & Mouton (1998) is the plan or blue print through which the researcher is going to undertake the research. A case study design was used as the research design for the study. This is because as a method of enquiry, case studies allow for the intensive analysis of an individual unit emphasising developmental factors in relation to the environment, (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011). A multiple case study design was employed for the study because it allowed for the collection of numerous sources of evidence through replication for triangulation purposes (Creswell,2013; Zainal,2007). The basic premise of a case study is that it tries to understand decisions, why they were made and how they were implemented and with what results (Yin, 2009). Using findings from the Whatsapp group an example of this would be that, some live-in domestic workers on the Whatsapp group admitted to stealing from their employers. The participants justified their actions by highlighting that the food they were given by their employers was not enough to survive on

taking into consideration the size of the house they clean as well as the number of people they look after. Additionally group members highlight that if employers took into consideration their needs (domestic workers) there would be no need to for them (domestic workers) to rob them (employers). This then tied into the sub-questions of the study in relation to the role of social networks and how they may enhance capabilities and resources as well as the supportive role that social networks may play. The social network in this regard acts as a supportive platform where the migrant domestic workers share their grievances and challenges and how to address them. Following on from the theft example while some domestic workers encouraged others to steal from their employers as a form of survival others encouraged them to pray and fast for their employers, this was based on the fact that prayer for them yielded stronger results unlike theft which could possibly result in job loss.

The design was chosen because idiographic studies focus on understanding the individual group as a unique and complex entity (Pontoretto, 2005). The design allows for the intensive analysis of the social networks of domestic workers and how they allow them to navigate their working environments as well as Johannesburg without any form of documentation, for example how participants came to know of the market and that it was a relatively safe place for undocumented migrants to go and look for employment. Additionally the research design allows for the analysis of how these networks allow the participants to achieve their value goals within the context of exploitation and invisibility. One of the ways that domestic workers achieve this is through word of mouth as undocumented domestic workers rely on each other to find employment, and the use of technology means that possible employment opportunities spread fast online because of Whatsapp groups. If a domestic worker hears of a possible job, they post it on the group with the contact details of the potential employer.

In regards to the research Denzin and Lincoln (2011, p.215) point to the fact that "collective stories can form the basis of a social movement". Every domestic worker interviewed was referred the House of Hope Ithemba and the Domestic Worker Association group, this social movement allows domestic workers to discuss their challenges and how they can address them as well as mobilise and organize themselves.

RESEARCH SAMPLING

The sampling approach that was applied was a non-probability sampling. The sampling method employed in the research was snowball sampling. This is the process of gradually accumulating a reasonably large sample through contacts and referrals (Terreblanche,

Durrheim & Painter, 2006). 12 participants were interviewed; initially it was thought that there was not accessible sampling frame of Zimbabwean domestic workers in Johannesburg. However this was proven wrong as it was discovered that in certain areas where potential domestic workers gather in the streets with the hopes that they would get employed for the day (markets), 8 participants from one of these markets took part in the study. Additionally the research was limited to 12 participants due to time and budget constraints. In addition, a Whatsapp group with 256members was observed for triangulation purposes. Of these 256 members the majority were domestic workers working in Johannesburg, those that were not domestic workers were mainly activists of the Trade Union that lobbied for migrants particularly domestic workers in the group. In addition although the group consisted of 256 members, not all of them were active members. Upon further enquiry about this from the key informant it was established that; firstly due to their demanding work some members did not have time to be online and in addition, concerns over data and airtime also limited total member involvement. The selection criteria applied was: participants were supposed to be over the age of 18; they were supposed to be female Zimbabwean migrants; they were supposed to be undocumented; they were supposed to be working as domestic workers either full time or part-time and they supposed to be employed in Johannesburg. In regards to the research the purposive sample was based on the knowledge of the population, in this case undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg. The key informant referred some of the participants to me. Additionally I was also referred to a particular area where domestic workers were known to go every morning in pursuit of employment. Upon arrival, I began to establish rapport with, at that time potential participants by asking them general questions, once that was done, I broached the idea of them participating in the study, participants agreed as long as it did not interfere with their objective of getting a job for the day. Upon completion of interviews the participants would then refer me to other potential participants that they personally knew.

Neuman (2000) points out that purposive sampling is useful in the following scenario. Firstly, it is used to select respondents with a unique set of traits. Secondly it is useful when researching on people that are difficult to have access to. And lastly it is useful when trying to identify particular types of cases for in depth investigations. In regards to the research, all three scenarios are applicable to it; this is because firstly the research focuses only on undocumented Zimbabwean domestic workers employed in Johannesburg. Secondly due to their demanding timetables and the fact that some participants prefer to work as live-in

domestic workers, they were assumed to be a hard to access group. Adding on to the previous point their preferred invisibility due to their fear of deportation further exacerbated their invisibility.

Babbie and Mouton (1998) provide a set of criterion that should be used in the selection of participants in order to collect the most relevant of information. The said criteria is as follows:

The first criterion mentioned by Babbie and Mouton (1998) is enculturation. It is important to interview people that are in constant contact with the social context of the topic. This is because they have knowledge pertaining to the said topic. The key informant played an important role in this regard because of his position at House of Hope- Ithemba where he is in constant contact with undocumented domestic workers. In addition after interviewing the key, he is the one that suggested that I get on the Whatsapp group, in order to understand not only the challenges of undocumented domestic workers but also, how they used social media to reach their intended target group and communicate with them.

The second criterion is current involvement. There is no use in working with people that are no longer involved in the topic as their circumstances change. Just to get a feel of the domestic worker context, at the beginning of data gathering I had met with a few documented domestic workers, as the research began to grow I realised that there was a stark contrast between documented and undocumented domestic workers in regards to pay and living arrangements, with documented domestic workers being somewhat in a better position than their undocumented counterparts. For the sake of the study however the findings were solely restricted to those that were undocumented.

The last criterion is adequate time. Some respondents were too busy to be interviewed. This is especially so with women who work all day as domestic workers. The way in which the researcher addressed this issue was booking appointments with the respondents beforehand. Additionally where I was unable to meet with the participants in person, I conducted interviews telephonically in some cases even whilst the domestic worker was busy cleaning. At the market, participants had time, but one of the challenges I had to work around was despite this time factor participants did not want to move too far from the area because this would compromise their chances of potential employment. In order to deal with this challenge, the participants and I would stay in the area so as not to jeopardise their chances of

getting employment, however we would move far away from the crowds in order to have privacy.

The use of several different research methods which is known as triangulation was applied to test the findings and ensure the trustworthiness of the study (Babbie & Mouton, 1998). One of the ways that I tried to triangulate the study was through the interviewing of a key informant from House of Hope Ithemba, the key informant was recommended to me by a colleague who was aware of the work that he did with undocumented domestic workers. My hope with the key informant was that he would provide background information on undocumented domestic workers and their challenges and how his organisation went about assisting the undocumented migrants. In addition data was also gathered through the discourse analysis of the Domestic worker association Whatsapp group with the intention of getting a better understanding of this pseudo formalised platform and how it shaped the capabilities and resources of its participants.

RESEARCH INSTRUMENT

The research instrument that was used to gather data is that of a semi structured interview schedule. This is the use of a set of pre-determined open ended questions with a mostly fixed order but leaving room for the asking of more questions in order to clarify and elaborate answers (Neuman, 2000), in order to establish a detailed view of the participants beliefs, thoughts and experiences. To add to this semi structured interviews allowed the researcher to observe participants as well as to interview them (Babbie & Mouton, 1998). In regards to the key informant a different semi structured interview schedule was used.

PRE-TESTING OF INSTRUMENT

A pilot study is one of the essential stages in a research project. In its most basic form a pilot study can be said to be a miniature version of a bigger study. It is done with the intention of testing a research instrument so as to identify problem areas within the research (Hassan, Schattner & Mazza, 2004) and to ensure that the method of data collection accurately addresses the research question. Pilot studies help to enhance the transferability of a study because they show if the research can be applied to a larger population (Neuman, 2000).

Hassan et al (2004) give seven reasons as to why pre-testing is invaluable. Two of those reasons are as follows. Firstly it often provides the researcher with ideas, approaches, and clues that they may not have foreseen before conducting the pilot study. Such ideas and clues increase the chances of getting clearer findings in the main study. Secondly pre-testing is

important because it can greatly reduce the number of unanticipated problems because the researcher has a chance to redesign parts of the study to overcome difficulties that the pilot study reveals.

I pre-tested the instrument in order to establish how long the interviews would take as well as to check the appropriateness of the interview schedule with the intention of addressing any problems that may have not been foreseen during the conceptualization of the research. The pre-testing was on one undocumented domestic work that fitted the criterion previously mentioned and the results from this test were not included in the data that was analyzed.

DATA COLLECTION

Qualitative research relies heavily on interviews and thus interviews were used during data collection. In its simplest form an interview can be said to be a purposeful conversation (Marshall, 2000). The purpose of the research interview was to explore the views, experiences, beliefs and/or motivations of individuals on specific matters (Gill, Stewart, Treasure & Chadwick, 2008). In qualitative interviews the researcher tries to explore a few topics all with the intention of helping to uncover the respondents perceptions but at the same time tries to maintain the participants' autonomy(Gill et al, 2008). This is based on an important aspect of qualitative research that the respondent's point of view on the topic or question asked should be their own view and not of the researcher (Gill et al, 2008). Hence, instead of asking leading questions, I asked questions that allowed for exploration. The establishment of rapport during the data gathering phase was important because it then set the tone that allowed me to further probe the participants. I made the participants feel valued for their opinions and as a result they were forthcoming to divulge information in response to the probing.

The type of interview used to gather data was a semi structured interview. Gill et al (2008) point out that semi structured interviews consist of several general questions on the topic that help to define the areas to be explored but also give room to the respondents to give detailed answers to the questions asked. Compared to structured interviews, semi structured interviews are more flexible in order to allow for the further explanation of that the participants opinions and perceptions (Gill et al, 2008). Some of the questions that I asked whilst in the field asked included:

1) What encouraged you to leave Zimbabwe?
2) How did you manage to cross the border without any form of documentation/passport?
3) Can you tell me what you think of employment agents?

I asked questions in order to ascertain the role of social networks in the life of the undocumented woman. They took into consideration the role of social networks in their country of origin when the migrant women are in transition and upon arrival into the host country /community. For example in answering the first question participants highlighted that it was the tough political climate in Zimbabwe and the fact that their husbands were already establishing themselves in South Africa that made migrating easier for them. The questions also considered the choices that the migrant women make in order to assert their independence and agency within the context of their networks as well as their invisibility. The use of the Whatsapp group illustrated this on several occasions, when group members complained of poor wages or what they felt as bad working conditions, others would often encourage them to speak their employers or to secretly seek employment elsewhere.

In the Whatsapp group, data was gathered through the discourse analysis of the group chat from September 2016-January 2017. Before I entered the group, the key informant had to seek permission from other group administrators on my behalf. Once in the group I observed participants and when they discussed themes that were of interest I would note the date and time of the conversation. I would email the entire whatsapp chats to myself for data analysis, from there I would read and code the chats.

I also managed to have 2 telephonic interviews as well, this was based on the fact that these participants were difficult to meet due to their busy work schedules. Upon them agreeing to be part of the study, I would call them from there I would seek informed consent, agree upon a pseudonym and sign the consent form on their behalf. Both participants agreed to have their telephonic interviews recorded. I managed to do so by going into a quiet closed room, putting the phone on speaker phone and using a tape recorder. Both interviews lasted 45-50mins. One of the challenges face during these two processes was the cost associated with the phone calls; although Whatsapp calling was a cheaper option, network challenges proved it inefficient

I carried out in-depth one-on-one individual interviews with 12 participants. Of those 12 interviews, 10 were face to face. Each interview lasted 45-60 minutes. I obtained the informed consent of the participants to record the discussions. In addition to this I also took notes during data collection. Data collection commenced when ethics clearance was received from the university. Interviews took place at times and venues that was convenient for the participants. After each interview session I wrote a summary of the interview in order to aid in data analysis. In retrospect, I noted that my gender seemed to help facilitate the data collection process, participants were more at ease with me unlike if a male had done the data collection. Additionally the use of Shona where possible, made participants feel more at ease because if they were unable to explain something in English, they were able to revert to shona, therefore this allowed me to gather data that was full of thick description.

DATA ANALYSIS

Data analysis is an important part of research. It is the process of managing data, describing and explaining patterns or trends, evaluating the value of the findings and answering the research question. It involves making sense of the words the respondents used so as to make meaningful interpretations. It is a systematic and rigorous process through which coding and recoding of the data happens so as to establish meaning (Neuman, 2000). The data emanating from the study was analysed using both thematic analysis and discourse analysis. Thematic analysis is the process of coding and identifying themes in order to come up with clusters that are seen as being relevant to the research question (Marshall, 2006). The data associated with each theme was analysed and compared to existing potential themes identified in the literature review. The process applied to data analysis was in line with the steps provided by Marshall (2006) which are as follows; firstly organizing the data, secondly immersion in the data, then generating categories and themes, followed by coding the data, then offering interpretations through analytic memos, followed by searching for alternative understandings, and finally writing the report.

On the other hand, discourse analysis is the analysis of data mainly text in order to ascertain issues concerning power and justice. Discourse theory argues that human beings use text to understand the world and to create social actions and interactions during the course of their everyday life (Mogashoa, 2014). I found this to be true, for example in relation to the many participants particularly those who were a part of the Whatsapp group admitted to being exploited by their employers by either being paid what they termed as ‘sick money’, sometimes not getting paid at all, to being refused food. Participants in these instances felt

powerless and in order to regain their autonomy they resorted to ways of action which included secretly leaving their jobs without their employers' knowledge, theft or reporting their employers to the television show *"Speak Out"*.

The first step to data analysis is that of organising the data. It was important for me to dedicate time to organizing data considering that I had amassed plenty of data from the Whatsapp group that needed to be coded. This involved the making of lists, editing and correcting notes made in the field, and tying up loose ends so as to make the process more manageable (Marshall, 2006). It was also important to tag the data according to type, dates, time, location as well as participant information (Babbie and Mouton, 1998). Schutt (2011) highlights the importance of organization by pointing out that it is important for keeping track of a huge volume of notes, tapes and documents. I found organization from the beginning to be important because it provides the first stepping stone to data analysis and encourages the researcher to continuously conceptualize concepts identified. This acquired data was organized according to the date, time and location of the interviews as well as basic information about the respondent. However to protect the privacy and confidentiality of the respondent in place of the name a pseudonym was used to identify them.

Immersion is another critical step to data analysis. This is the concept of reading and rereading through the data so that the researcher becomes intimately familiar with the data gathered (Marshall, 2006). What this does is that it provides connections in regards to people, events and quotations that are related to the research study. One of the ways I immersed into the research was by writing a summary of each interview after it had been conducted in order to identify potential themes as well as to pick the best quotes for the discussion of key findings in chapter four. The summaries allowed me to build onto the interview schedule as interesting themes began to emerge from the data gathering process.

Coding is an important step in regards to data analysis. It can be said to be "the formal representation of analytical thinking", (Neuman, 2000, p.346). I familiarised myself with the data gathered in order to come up with a coding scheme that I would use to categorises the data according to the emerging and existing themes (Marshall, 2006). This then led to is the formation of categories and themes which were used to draw conclusions in the writing of the final report.

Schutt (2011) highlights the point that pinpointing and perfecting the key concepts is an integral part of the continuous process of qualitative research. This is done in order to provide

a precise account of what was observed as well as why it is important. In many instances these codes and concepts are tested against the occurrence of new data, problem statements and other concepts and they may need to be refined. One of the advantages of coding is in the fact that it increases the trustworthiness of the study through dependability (Denzin and Lincoln, 2011) this is because coding ensures that each form of data gathered is analysed.

To help guide the coding process Marshall (2006), notes that it is important to write analytical notes. This involved the writing down of my perceptions on how the data that was gathered developed into clusters or themes. These were useful for coming up with unusual insights that moved the study from being boring to something unique and creative. This was especially true for the information that was gathered on employment agents, who were viewed by participants with much animosity.

In regards to the research, several concepts were identified in the literature review that were used as potential themes in the coding process of data analysis. These were concepts poverty, father absenteeism, marriage, sexual networks as well as and exploitation. The research also looked at concepts that were of relevance to the South African context because this is the context with which the research was undertaken.

Another important aspect of data analysis is generating themes and categories. This part of the process according to Marshall (2006) requires the researcher to be very aware and focused on the data, be able to pick up on subtle and implied undertones of social life. Identifying obvious themes, reappearing notions or language, ways in which beliefs that bring people and their environments together is the most difficult part of data analysis. Open coding is often times the first step to this process (Marshall, 2006); this is when the researcher uses themes and codes identified in the literature review as well as the theoretical framework and conceptualisation process. Clustering is the process by which the researcher uses diagrams in order to form relationships within certain themes and categories (Marshall, 2006). This is done through the process of immersion and prolonged contact with the data gathered.

Offering interpretations is also an important part of the data analysis process. This happens as categories and themes are developed as the researcher begins to give analytical comprehensions of what she has learnt. These analytical interpretations help to bring meaning and tie themes, patterns and categories into a ‘story’ that is interesting to read. This can also be understood in context to what Patton (2002) says as cited by Marshall (2006) in

his definition of interpretation, which is "Interpretation means attaching significance to what was found, making sense of the findings, offering explanations, drawing conclusions, extrapolating lessons, making inferences, considering meanings, and otherwise imposing order" (p. 480). This then points to the fact that there is a need to evaluate data on the basis of its usefulness to the study as well as its centrality. A key example of this is the theme of marriage and sexual networks; having a husband in the host country for participants was important, not only did it provide the close tie that allowed them to migrate, but it also meant that they would have somewhere to stay and food to eat as they looked for employment. Those that did not have husbands came on their own but in order to ease their financial burden found "husbands" who they could move in with.

The last part of the data analysis process is that of writing a research report. This is central to the process because "in choosing words to summarize and reflect the complexity of the data, the researcher is engaging in the interpretive act, lending shape and form meaning to mountains of raw data" (Marshall, 2006, p. 107)

ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Ethical considerations were made throughout research processes even more so when a researcher is conducting field work due to the fact that they come into contact with potential respondents. The ethical considerations adhered to during data collection included do no harm, informed consent, no deception, privacy and confidentiality as well anonymity.

The first ethical consideration to be discussed is, do no harm. This could be said to be the cornerstone of ethical considerations (Denzin and Lincoln, 2011). Participants expect that by partaking in a research study no harm will befall upon them. One of the fears that participants expressed was that being recorded could potentially put them at risk especially back home in Zimbabwe. In order to understand where their fears were stemming from I had to probe the then potential participants and many highlighted they had heard of stories of people getting assaulted by potential undercover Zimbabwean State agents. Although justified, I assured them that the recordings would only be used by myself and would be kept safe. In addition I also assured them that I would not use their real names during the data gathering process and the final write up of the research report. One of the ways I have tried to protect the participants is by not discussing when and where interviews took place even in the research report. Lastly I also signed the consent forms on their behalf because some feared that they could be identified through their handwriting.

Informed consent is important in conducting research because without it one cannot get the needed information from the respondents. Informed consent, according to the ASA Code of Ethics (1999) as cited by Baily (2007), "is a basic ethical tenet of scientific research on human populations". Sociologists (researchers) do not involve human participants as subjects in research without the informed consent of the subject or the subject's legally authorized representative, unless if . Informed consent is needed if data collected from respondents involves any form of verbal communication. Bailey (2007) points out that to obtain informed consent the researcher should inform the 11 pieces of information. Therefore as the researcher I had to firstly, ask if they were willing to participate in the research; secondly, to inform them the purpose of the research; thirdly, to explain the procedures used during research; fourthly, to highlight the risks and benefits of the research; followed by highlighting the voluntary nature of the research; leading to their right to stop at any time; the procedures used to protect their confidentiality; which would lead to their right to have their questions answered at any time; followed by the explanation of other information relevant to the participants; then what is required of them if they consent to participate and finally that refusal of participation or withdrawal at any time will lead to no foreseeable consequences.

It was important that I used clear and understandable language when discussing informed consent with potential respondents. To put participants at ease getting informed consent was done in Shona, so that they would be better able to understand what was required of them as well as me.

Privacy and confidentiality are also important in terms of ethical considerations. Researchers need to protect respondents' identities as well as to ensure their confidentiality. Personal data must be only be revealed under a veil of anonymity. What this does is that it protects the autonomy of the respondent (Babbie and Mouton, 1998). When it came to the domestic labour market one of the challenges was that the interviews had to be done in an open space that I would not jeopardize the participants getting employment. How I managed to address this issue was by moving slightly away from the crowd but still remaining in the vicinity. I made sure that I also signed the consent forms of participants on their behalf using pseudonyms. Also I do not mention where the interviews took place in the final research report. At the same time I also explained to the participants that the only people that would see the raw data gathered would my supervisor of which even in such instances their personal information will not be shared.

Anonymity builds onto the concepts of privacy and confidentiality. In regards to anonymity the research participants' identities are kept anonymous. The way in which I addressed the issue of anonymity was by using by using pseudonyms to identify the participants.

Ethically, the whatsapp group proved to be the most difficult. Although my presence on the group was approved by the administrators and by some active group members, the number of group members present and active in the group was always with members constantly entering and exiting the group.

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

Bias has the ability to negatively impact the results attained in the study. It appears in many forms during the data collection phase such as the wording of questions asked by the researcher as well as through the identification of the power relationship between the researcher and the respondent (Babbie & Mouton, 1998). Additionally bias can also occur during the translation process due to the fact that some phrases and sentences cannot be automatically translated from Shona to English easily. I tried to address the issue of bias by going into the study with the intention of portraying neutrality and objectivity based on the need to understand the participants' perceptions (Neuman, 2000). At the same time the researcher worded the questions in a manner that was not leading and did not encourage respondents to answer questions in a particular way (Babbie & Mouton, 1998). The use of a semi-structured schedule also helped to avoid bias because it allowed me to probe and explore participant's answers.

A major challenge of the study was protecting the invisibility of the participants due to their lack of documentation. This is exacerbated by the fact that some of the participants used in the study were identified by the fact that they were standing in a street in Johannesburg in order for them to look for work. One of the ways in which I tried to protect the identities of the participants was by signing the consent forms on their behalf. In addition the research does not make reference to the street where some of the participants were identified. At the same time when it comes to protecting the identities of Whatsapp group members, I do not include their names or phone numbers.

One of the limitations of using a case study is that some theorists argue that case studies contain a bias towards the verification and confirmation of the researchers preconceived notions (Denzin & Lincoln, 2008). However, arguing from a constructivist perspective, it can

be said that the researcher's values and lived experiences cannot be separated from the research process, therefore there is a need to acknowledge them (Guba & Lincoln, 2005).

Time and money limited the study, in that they both prevented the researcher from visiting different domestic worker markets within Johannesburg. In addition it was realised that there is a marked difference between a domestic worker that works part time (stay out) and a domestic worker that works full time (stay-in).

Ethically, the whatsapp group proved to be the most difficult. Although my presence on the group was approved by the administrators and by some active group members, the number of group members present and active in the group was always with members constantly entering and exiting the group. For future reference in order to deal with such a situation, a good idea would be to get a sample from the group population and form a separate group, however this too could lead to observer bias.

CHAPTER FOUR

PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION OF RESULTS

INTRODUCTION

This chapter intends to discuss the findings of the study which were established through both thematic and discourse analysis. The discussion will be centred on themes that address the objectives and the sub-questions of the study. This will involve a recap of the objectives and sub-questions of the study as well as the demographic information of the participants. In addition a table of capabilities and functions will be listed. Findings presented in this chapter will be presented in the form of quotes from participants and where possible supported by quotes from literature.

Objectives of the study

The results of this study have been considered in relation to the broader aim of the study as well as its objectives and sub-questions. The main aim of the study was to understand how social networks influence the capacities of undocumented migrant domestic workers working in Johannesburg. This was done in line with the capabilities approach which was the theoretical framework for the study. The objectives and sub-questions have been listed below:

1. To identify the social networks that undocumented Zimbabwean women use.
2. To understand what the social networks are used for.
3. To analyse the individual perceptions of the social networks.

Sub-questions

1. What social networks are available to Zimbabwean women?
2. What is the role of social networks in providing social, political emotional and economic support?
    c. How do migrant domestic workers define poverty?
    d. Do social networks lead to social, political, emotional and economic freedom? (empowerment)
3. How do social networks enhance the capabilities and resources of non-national domestic workers?
    c. How do migrant domestic workers view their wellbeing?
    d. What do migrant domestic workers define as development?

DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION OF PARTICIPANTS

The participants were selected from different areas in Johannesburg; 4 were referrals from colleagues and the other eight were selected from a domestic work market with the help of another colleague. All participants were female. These said demographics were identified by the participants' readiness and inclination to participate in the study. 12 participants were interviewed, all of them were Zimbabwean. Their ages ranged from 27-42. Each participant was given a pseudonym. Interviews were undertaken in both Shona and English depending on what the participants were comfortable with. Findings in this section highlight that it is easier to recruit participants especially if they are all from one place or community.

CAPABILITY APPROACH

A capabilities approach was used as the theoretical framework for the study. The main claim of the approach is that in order to assess the quality of life, the researcher should focus on the effective opportunities that the individual has in order to live a life that they deem valuable to themselves (Robeyns, 2006). Capabilities consist of functionings and opportunities of freedom which give individuals the freedom to achieve their value goals (Gasper & Truong, 2010). The researcher did not go into the field with a set list of capabilities and functions but rather used the information gathered through data collection to establish a working list as to what participants deemed important to themselves and what their opportunities allowed them to achieve. Table 4.2 presents the working list of capabilities and functionings.

Table 4.2 functionings and capabilities

FUNCTIONINGS	CAPABILITIES
-moving to South Africa for greener pastures -stand at the market to market oneself -choice between prostitution and domestic work -marriage and 'formalised' informal relationships -mobilisation -part of a church community -can be represented by SADSAWU -being part of a domestic work Whatsapp group -having a husband in South Africa	-gain employment -able to buy stands and build houses -able to send children to school -able to provide and feed families -able to sustain themselves -if they get married or have a long term live in boyfriend that means the cost of living is reduced Church acts as an informal stokvel or burial society that can be called upon in times of need. -they can be mobilised on behalf of SADSAWU - through representation from SADSAWU their risk of deportation is lessened -share ideas and tips in regards to dealing with employers -get potential employment opportunities

MAIN THEMES ARISING FROM DATA COLLECTED

Table 4.3 presents the primary themes and sub-themes which emerged from the information gathered during data collection. The themes discussed emerged in line with the broader aim and objectives of the study. In addition some themes which were not taken into consideration also emerged during the data analysis phase.

Table 4.3 themes and sub-themes

Themes	**Sub-themes**
Motivations for leaving Zimbabwe	Social issues- marriage - Easier to go to South Africa because it is a place that they had heard about
	Political issues- violence and intimidation
	Economic- lack of jobs
Available networks	Marriage & sexual networks
	Family and neighbours
	Church
	Market
	Agents
	Social media networks
Accomplishments	Able to look after their children
	Able to buy stands and build houses
	Able to get jobs

DISCUSSION OF MAIN THEMES

The data analysis as described in chapter three resulted in the findings as they emerged under the above illustrated themes. Each theme was carefully explored in order to efficiently present the experiences and opinions of the research participants in line with the aim and objectives of the study. In addition, each theme will be discussed and analysed through the lens of the capabilities approach which is the theoretical framework of the study.

MOTIVATING FACTORS FOR LEAVING ZIMBABWE

One of the objectives of the study was to understand the networks that are available to Zimbabwean women; this was done in order to link them to their motivations for leaving Zimbabwe with the intentions of seeking greener pastures in South Africa. Although many studies have been done on the migration of Zimbabweans out of their country, it is still important to establish the motivations for leaving as it sets the context of the study. Taking into consideration the financial crisis that has been hitting the country since early 2000, the assumption in this case is that individuals left purely for economic reasons which albeit true does not highlight the use and impact of social networks in these movements. This is because social networks play a pivotal role in the flow of migration. The availability of information as well as individuals in a designated area means that others are likely to follow especially if jobs are available (Mei-Liu, 2013).

"Vanogona kutirova": Perceived threat of political violence and exclusion

When asked about what motivated participants to leave Zimbabwe, many participants answered that the political climate of the country made it difficult for them to stay in the country. This was a significant finding especially amongst those that went to wait at the market. This can be attributed to the fact that most of those that went to wait for employment at the market belonged to a particular church sect (Johannes Masowe) who throughout the years had been a drawing ground for political support for the ruling party. However this changed when male members of the church clashed with the police and resulted in violent fights between the police and the church members.

> *Yes they do beat there in Zimbabwe, because the other reason we ran away was because of politics, those MDC stories, they wouldn't even sell us maize from GMB(Grain Marketing Board).*

(Gogo)

Another reason we ran away was because of the political violence. In everything that we did we were disadvantaged because if people found out that you supported the opposition then things would be harder for you. You would have problems.

(Mildred)

Evidence from the above quotes show that there was a fear of both structural and physical political violence. Participants in this instance seemed to fear genuinely fear political reproach on the basis of political affiliation. The GMB especially during times of economic hardships was one of the few places that people could source maize in order to survive. Taking into consideration Sen's examples of having a bicycle and having bread, the GMB represents a capability (Clark, 2005). The functioning of political association in this instance impeded on this capability and therefore individuals had to come up with another capability for especially moving to South Africa in order to meet the basic functioning of having food in order to survive. In addition having food in itself is a right and human rights are a basic entitlement to a capability. However the process through which a capability (access to food) finds itself translated into the actual purchase and consumption of food is disrupted due to political association. Exposure of one's political affiliations to the Movement for Democratic Change (MDC) would result in not only violence towards that person but social exclusion as well. The participants however did not admit to having been at the receiving end of violence but however highlighted that they had heard of the events and that to them was a good enough reason for them to consider leaving.

The threat of political violence does not always result in individuals migrating from their country of origin to another country. This is evidenced by the fact that there are still 13million Zimbabweans living in the country (Zimstats, 2012) despite the volatile political situation. Other motivations have to come to play. The decision to move has to be considered as mixed with both self-interest and altruistic motives for example the inability to find employment as well as the inability to feed one's dependents whilst in Zimbabwe.

"Kwanga kusina mabasa": Lack of properly paying jobs and employment

When probed about what else motivated participants to leave Zimbabwe all the participants highlighted that a lack of properly paying jobs as well as a lack of employment was one of the strongest motivators for seeking employment in South Africa. The political climate in

Zimbabwe had a ripple effect on the economy which in turn resulted in soaring inflation and a high unemployment rate.

> *At home? Well I had been working but the money at the time of my coming was not enough. That's when it used to change every day.*
>
> (Martha)
>
> *You know, I came here because of the jobs back home, there weren't any and the money it was not enough. My husband and me were unable to look after the children back home.*
>
> (Happy)

Alexander (2008) reflects on the notion responsibility in relation to the capabilities approach and social justice. The author *(ibid)* highlights how responsibility is the reciprocal relationship between an individual and their environment. The environment in this case should provide circumstances and opportunities that do not hinder the individual's agency (Alexander, 2008). In this instance the political climate in Zimbabwe created the conditions through which individuals though employed were unable to take full responsibility and control for themselves and their dependents, the environment hampered individuals' ability to find and secure properly paying employment which inevitably hindered their opportunities of freedom. However it can also be argued that the political and economic crisis in Zimbabwe created the context within which individuals took full responsibility for themselves and migrated to South Africa with the prospects of finding employment where participants actually were remunerated. In this instance the South African environment was seen as an environment that provided individuals with opportunities of freedom. The findings of this question highlight Crush & Tawodzera (2016)'s findings that individuals were encouraged to move to South Africa because of the differences in the living standard of those two countries, with Zimbabwe being characterised by food shortages, hunger and lack of employment; this as well as motivations of personal goals and agency encouraged people to move.

Lack of properly paying formal employment on its own, does not necessarily result in individuals moving immediately to South Africa. Some participants highlighted that when they were unable to find formal employment they then decided to join the informal labour market but even then it would produce negative results. Only then did participants decide to emigrate to South Africa.

1992, 1993 and 1994 that's when things went bad and people started breaking phone and electricity lines for copper, digging through refuse for bones and doing whatsoever and if you were seen to be owning a business in town they would burn it down and nothing would come out of it.
(Gogo,)

Back home, at first I worked in a crèche, but then the money became not enough and here my husband he used to drink a lot, he was a drunk. So whenever he would get money he would drink it all away and leave nothing for us. So, in 2008, I left my job at the crèche and I started going to Mozambique and buying rice there and coming back to sell it but the money was still difficult to get a hold of. Then this one day I came home and my husband had turned the house upside down and stolen all my money. That is when I decided that enough was enough. I ran away to come to South Africa and find a job here.
(Muchaneta)

What one sees from the above quotes is that the political and economic climate in Zimbabwe impeded on participants advantages and opportunities. Taking into consideration that though institutions such as the GMB were supposed to service the entire country, one's political affiliation had the ability to influence one's capabilities and functionings. In addition being formally employed although an advantage as compared to those who were unemployed, was in itself seen as a disadvantage due to the fact that inflation meant that employees were not paid proper wages. Participants in this instance found that although they were not formally employed in South Africa they made better money than those that were either formally or informally employed in Zimbabwe. These findings are in line with Phillips (2011), who highlights that before one ventures into domestic work they often initially attempt to start their own informal businesses. However, when these proved not to be viable, participants decided to become domestic workers because the employment was comparably more stable than what they were used to.

My husband my provider: Marriage as a motivating factor for migration

For some participants who looked for employment at the market, marriage was a key motivating factor for them leaving Zimbabwe. Participants highlighted that migrating for them was easier because their husbands were already working in South Africa.

Yes, 1992 there was a massive drought, the whole of Hippo Valley, the Chiredzi Estate, the sugar cane dried so much to the extent that it was unusable, quality of life started dropping, you would want to buy something but yaaaah at least our husbands used to work as welders that's when they started coming here and that is how we followed.

(Chenai)

Thinking to come here was easy for me because my husband was already working here as a security guard, so I already had a place to stay, all I had to do was find someone to look after my two boys.

(Linda)

These findings are in line with Mei-Liu (2013)'s finding that show that females are more likely to migrate if there is a presence of strong network ties in the form of close family and households. This is because strong network ties provide the female migrant with dependable resources such as having a roof over their heads, food to eat and reduced financial costs because their husbands are able to take on the financial burden of looking after their wives as they look for employment. The capability approach allows the research to further interrogate the nature of this freedom that allowed participants to migrate to South Africa. Taking into consideration that responsibility is a symbiotic and reciprocal relationship between society and an individual; the Zimbabwean economy using the previous mentioned theme, failed to create the conditions through which individuals in this case the husbands of participants could take full responsibility of themselves and their families so they chose to migrate in order to increase their functionings. This migration network in turn produced a capability for spouses (participants) which allows them to migrate and further increases their capabilities and functionings. In addition, capabilities consist of a combination of multiple functionings in order for human wellbeing to be enhanced. The above theme highlights that the political crisis in Zimbabwe resulted in what Sen (2005) terms as process failure as lack of employment, political affiliation and lack of food led to individuals choosing to migrate. These functionings combined with having another functioning of having a spouse already based in South Africa made participants realise the capability of moving to South Africa

AVAILABLE SOCIAL NETWORKS

One of the main aims of the research was to understand the social networks available to the participants as well as to establish their usefulness according to the responses provided by

participants. This part of the study aims to discuss the networks of domestic workers in line with the theoretical framework of the study. This includes a discussion of both strong network ties such as familial ties to weak interpersonal ties such as friendships, agencies and social network groups.

Marriages of convenience & sexual networks

As previously discussed for participants, marriage played a critical role in motivating them to move. This is because spousal networks provide dependable resources such as provision of food and roof over participants' heads. When asked about who they stayed with, participants who worked as stay out domestic workers admitted that they lived with their 'husbands' or boyfriends.

> *When I came I did not have a husband but at the moment I am now married and I have two more children. I came and then I got married, after I got married I lived with my husband and he paid lobola for me like it is supposed to be done... My husband does not help me out with anything, for example I had to look for a job for myself, it's just that I now have a place to sleep and food to eat.*
>
> (Agatha)
>
> *After I ran away from my husband and came to South Africa, I met a man, and after we got to know each other, he became my husband. But because of where I work and I only see him on weekends. I go and stay with him from Friday to Sunday and then Monday I come back to work.*
>
> (Rose)

The above evidence shows that marriage and sexual networks in this regard can be viewed as social capital that can be called upon in times of distress. Being in a form of sexual relationship meant that participants had a place to go and stay either during their off days or at the end of the day. However it left them vulnerable because some participants admitted that they were unable to be live in domestic workers because they were afraid of losing their partners because they would be away from them. These findings are in line with Muzvidziwa's (2001) study which highlights females tend to establish sexual partners in order to enhance their livelihood strategies and reduce their vulnerability. Although social networks can be viewed as positive, in this instance sexual networks can be seen as negative to the positive advancement of participants. This is because there is an unequal power

relationship between the domestic workers and their partners in which participants sacrifice being live in domestic workers because that desire is not in line with their partners desires for them.

Family and neighbours as an available network

Intergenerational mothering

Family and neighbours plays a particularly important role in the migration process especially for participants in the host country. When asked about who cared for their children whilst they were away, all the participants indicated that a mother figure from back home looked after them.

> *My mother looks after them. But when I am back home I look after them, I will be with them. At the moment when I came here I gave them to my mother, but mother is now old, as you can see how old I look you can only imagine how old she is. So those are the ones who when I get groceries, or I work for a bit I send to those children so that they get soap and food. So I fight for those children, even if I get piece work and I move around houses, even if someone says I have clothes I do not choose I work and send knowing that I have my orphans and if I find something nice I wash and iron and send back home and we survive and things go on. That is what pushes me to keep going because it hurts me.*
> (Nyembesi)

> *My kids live with my mother, before I left I had to ask her to look after them because I would not be able to look after them. She told me that she would help me look after them but I would have to send her money because she was not working. So with the little money that we get we send a bit of money and a bit of food back home.*
> (Rose)

These findings highlight that family members help to look after participants' children by housing them in exchange for financial assistance. Participants highlighted that although family had the means such as a place to live they lacked other means such as finances to properly look after their children. Therefore participants had to support their families by remitting money and food.

I know a man: the use of community members to remit money and goods

When asked about how they remitted money taking into consideration their documentation status, participants highlighted that their family and neighbours both in the originating country and the host country played a key role in this process.

> *Sometimes, well at the moment most of the times there is a man who is here, who comes from the same place that I come from, he has a Standard Bank account. Most of the time when money is needed back home I put it into his account and then he tells his wife to take the money to my house. If that is not possible I send via Ecocash. Its one short fall is that getting the money is difficult because money is difficult to get at our growth point, so they (family) have to go to Rutenga and they can spend the whole day there because there isn't any money and here they would have paid transport money, and they cannot withdraw the money sent because the place will not have any cash. Especially now with bond notes it is now worse. I sent money last of last week for school fees, they spent three days in Rutenga because Ecocash did not have money and here you would have sent the money.*
>
> (Chenai)

> *There is a man he is my neighbour from back home in Plumtree, he is a malaisha. So he goes home many times. We use him to send money to my mother for the children. We like him more than sending with bus drivers because the bus drivers are expensive.*
>
> (Happy)

The family unit and neighbours provide the resources that can be called upon in times of need. These findings highlighted that family and friendships can be used to secure housing for their children in exchange for other resources such as money and food. In addition they highlight that in times of economic crises family and community cohesion can result in the establishing of successful development alternative when the state has failed (Silvey & Elmhirst, 2004). In this case the political and economic crisis in Zimbabwe led to the rearrangement of the family unit in order to increase the functionings of the family as a unit and improve on their wellbeing. The study findings show how family in the originating country step in and help to look after the assets of the migrant on their behalf which are also similar to Muanamoha et al's (2010) findings. In addition they highlight how social networks

have no influence over macro institutions therefore have to find alternative ways of functioning, for example although some participants use Ecocash to send money back home to Zimbabwe and inform their networks to collect the money at an Ecocash trader, however due to a second economic crisis that is currently taking place participants are unable to collect their money despite them having cash in their Ecocash accounts. In order to address this issue some participants use "Omalaysha" to transport cash back home to their loved ones.

My friends are at church

When asked about religion, all participants whether they were live in or stay out highlighted that church played an important part in their lives especially as in their host country. This is the place where they established friendships as well as went to when they were in need of help. Outside of this network participants found it difficult to make friends due to the nature of their documentation status.

> *I would be lying to you my dear, here I do not have friends, my friends are at Masowe (Church), the people who I pray with those are the ones who I can call my friends, that you can come to my house and visit me and you find me with friends wouldn't happen. To be honest I do not have friends. It's just a matter of that people just like me and like to see me for example if I say I want to go back home as Mapostori, and others that I know and have lived with they can give me stuff to go with back home to go and give my mother.*
> (Gogo)

> *I do not have friends; my friends are at church in Randburg. People at church have been very cheerful to me and so it was easy to make friends there.*
> (Agatha)

The church for participants is a long established institution that steps in for its members when all other institutions have failed. It acts as a free employment agent with the intentions of securing participants with employment, it also steps in as a burial society when one of their members has either passed on or lost a family member.

> *At church, what we do at Masowe is that, when tragedy strikes or when you lose a loved one, as Mapostori we support each other, we don't have a Mupostori who is cast out, we help each other. If for example we know that a Madzimai (a female church member) has lost someone maybe her mother, even if I don't have money as*

long as, especially if they know that vanayo Madzimai (the female members have money) they ask now that mama is now going back home what can we give her, they will run around and gather amongst themselves and you will find them coming to you with ZAR2000 and tell you here take it mama and go to the funeral back home.
(Gogo)

What happens is that at Masowe, if someone dies we help each other out, as the church we come together and raise money for the family to help towards the funeral and what is needed.
(Nyembesi)

Sen (1993) defines capabilities as a considerable range of capacities and opportunities that are needed for complete human wellbeing and functions as the amount of beings and doings that have been accumulated by an individual over time. The church acts as a society which acts and reacts with the individual in a symbiotic manner, both parties are responsible to one another, the individual goes to the church, adapts and practices the church doctrine and in turn the church is the environment within which an individual establishes friendships, is supported in times of need and is able to find employment when needed.

The religious institution can be described as being one of bounded solidarity especially for those members that look for work at the market. This is because these members are faced with similar events at a specific time and place. All of the participants from the market admitted that they all resided in one particular area and that they struggled with similar challenges. In this respect the church and the social capital available within the institution has established itself as a coping mechanism that allows individual members to cope and adapt to stressors. These stressors are further exacerbated by lack of documentation, participants highlighted that they were unable to join burial societies because of the precariousness of their employment, which means that they were unable to join burial societies and stokvels which require regular monthly subscriptions. The church in this instance stepped in by providing assistance in times of loss and food for participants when necessary.

Domestic worker market

The market where some of the participants for the study were gathered was an interesting place to study; this is because although literature points out that migrant domestic workers prefer to be invisible (Griffin 2011, Hondagneu- Sotelo, 1994), in the case of the market all

sorts of undocumented migrant domestic workers gather together in this particular area without fear of the police and deportation all with the intention of gaining employment on a temporary basis. When asked about how participants found out about this particular market, they highlighted that it was their relationship with someone else that they inadvertently stumbled across it.

> *I heard from others, I am not sure who started with this place but I heard from those who used to come here, they then showed us this place.*
> (Mildred)

> *Here? Well I heard from one of my aunts who lives by CTM, she worked for another white employer, their child... do you see that corner over there? Their helper went back to Lesotho because she was sick, she went for an entire year, so they used to give me ZAR250 per day and I used to work for three days per week. So as I would come and work that is when I saw this market, coming to those employers there..... So I think between the two of you one of you is jealous of the other, so that's when I saw that working a job where you are constantly asked, I can't find a spoon, I cant find my piece of clothing, I can't find my bra, I saw that there was no happiness and so I left the job. That is when I started properly knowing this place. After this place I found out of another place called (Name withheld) and also there in (Name withheld) where we also go and market ourselves.*
> (Rose)

The above quotes highlight that, although the market is a place of possible employment, it is also a very competitive place. Participants use different methods such as standing far apart in order to address the competiveness such as standing at their own designated place or relying on age because older domestic workers are seen as being more trustworthy.

> *It's a very competitive place, if a car stops there some will jump onto the car, others open the doors and some get in through the windows and sit in the car hoping to leave and negotiate pay once they get to where they are going. So us with our age we cannot compete with those of your age with the running for cars, we just manage to get by the fact that others will stop and say I want that older looking one that is the one that we are going to be working with, so you will be standing far from them.... Because everyone says that an elderly person is trustable, especially when it comes to*

children or cleaning I wouldn't find it difficult to do, I would do my job eagerly. So thats the job that i have been doing.

(Gogo)

I prefer to sit and market myself far away from the others because it improves my chances of getting a job. If I go and sit with them a potential employer may not see me because they are so many.

(Moreblessing)

Evidence from these quotes show that the market acts as a society that provides participants with opportunities of freedom to realise their opportunity to work. However in order for this to happen participants have to locate themselves strategically within this opportunity if they want to find employment. Each participant in this case had a particular place that they would sit that was close but separate from one another if they wanted to be viewed by potential employers, failure to set oneself apart would mean that they would potentially not get chosen. This was especially important for participants, during the times of January, where the number of potential employers would be significantly lower because of lack of finances due to overspending during the month of December. In addition the market not only provides opportunities for female domestic workers but also male ones who would work as gardeners and some females who would also ply their trade as sex workers.

Employment agents are thieves!!!

Perceptions on the role of employment agents are contested, and filled with animosity. When probed about the role of employment agents the majority of participants felt that agents were opportunistic thieves that other domestic workers had to watch out for.

Ahhh agents for me haaa... agents are thieves... Most of them I don't yet know of anyone who has been helped by agents, because the majority of them just want money, you pay a lot of money. It's better to look for a job on your own.

(Loveness)

Agents are thieves. Agents are useless, all they want is money, they promise that if you register with us you will get a job and a certificate, they tell you bring ZAR200, bring ZAR150, just registering and finishing your money, they are thieves, they never call

you back with prospective jobs. It's better for you to market yourself, standing here for yourself and pocketing the bit of money that you make instead of taking it to an agent. How does it work that someone would want to get paid before they even get me a job how is that supposed to help, they should only be allowed to touch my money after they get me a job, that may work, but now they want to first get paid and yet I have no job. They just want money and you pay for nothing.

(Chenai)

As one can see from these quotes, agents for participants act as informal labour brokers, who could potentially find employment for them for a fee. However as evidence shows, there is ill feeling towards agents because of the issue of payment before the acquisition of a job. In this respect, participants feel that agents run a scam. In relation to the Whatsapp group, if a number of a particular agent who scams individuals was sent to the group, those who had been scammed by the particular agent would alert others not to use that particular agent because of their bad experiences.

2016/12/24, 13:59 - : Dear jobseekers,

*Thank you for contacting us to ask about our job opportunities and trainings. Please come through Monday-Friday 11am sharp. Please dont be late or too early.. Our Fourways branch is inside Montecasino in Fourways. Palazzo West Towers, Regus-Urban Recruita.... 011510 0166 or 011 575 6007 .11am sharp please. No negotiations. Thats the RULE. *Domestic stay in* Domestic stay out* Domestic partime * Childminders *Cleaners*Tea lady * Au pairs * Gardeners *Drivers * Shop assistant * Merchandisers * Restaurant staff Call 011 510 0166 or 011 057 3006 Please bring your copy of I.d or assylum or passport. Passports without permits are also allowed. Administration fee is R150 and you will fill in forms to register you. How long it will take to get a job depends on the response from employers and many do respond. We also offer practrical housekeeping, childminder, customer service, office cleaners training. Ask for more information on (Phone number withheld) or (Phone number withheld).Your certificate is your reference for life. Thank you (Name of agent withheld)(Management).*

(Group member and possible employment agent)

2016/12/24, 18:08 - : Cde, please forgive me for coming to your inbox like this, when I came to Joz, I was robbed money to the sum of 400 rand by agents saying that they would find me a job, I was made to pay admin fee and then I also paid what they called road test fees, so today when I saw a post on the domestic workers group, I don't know if you saw the post or not, I am not sure if it is an agent or what who posted saying that job seekers including drivers who have or do not have permits admin fee is 150 rand, so being a person who was once scammed I am not sure whether it's true or they are lies because what happens is that, I am looking for a job, I am desperate Cde, then I am told to pay 400 rand then you get a job, here I am not working so I have to borrow money to pay them so that I get the job, then they scam me of the money, how am I supposed to pay back the money when I am not working, so you see Cde, can you help me because I am also looking for a job see.

(Group member)

2017/01/31, 15:12 - : Uyu ndakamboyendako ndikabhadhara R300 muna February 2015 Haana kundiwanira basa ayingesenda ma msg achiti handisati ndanzwa kune basa (this person, I once went there and I paid 300 rand in February 2015, he/she did not find me a job they just used to send me messages saying they have not found me a job)

(Group Member)

Additionally, these findings point to the fact that many employment agencies especially those that recruit undocumented members are often scams. However due to technology people are becoming more aware of potential scams and use social media to warn others. Although participants admit that the majority of agents pose as scams, they also do admit that there are some agents who actually do help in either securing employment or in other ways.

Some of them are useful, those that tell you that they do not offer you a job but teach you how to look after a house, how to clean it and how to look after a child are 100%. They tell you up front that they cannot promise you a job, but we can help you on improving your job skills.

(Martha)

They have other things that they will be teaching like for example when a child is sick with what they call colics, how do you look after a child with colics, what are the normal temperatures of a child, how do I look after a child of a particular age, how do I massage a child with colics, so a lot of those things many people do not know and it helps... Yeah when it comes to jobs they do not help at all. Because when it comes to jobs I can go and register in Pretoria or in Fourways in Joburg. Then I tell them that I live in (Name withheld), that is where I am and then they call me for a job in Cape Town and here I have a husband.

(Agatha)

These findings highlight how there is a hierarchy of agents, at the bottom are those agents who take advantage of the desperation of the unemployed domestic workers and trick them into paying money and then disappearing, above those are the ones that do not provide employment but rather aim at developing the skills of the domestic worker in order to improve their likelihood of getting a job and at the top of this hierarchy are the dependable agents who only work with domestic workers who have permits and passports. Considering that all the participants in this study are undocumented they are unable to use the agents at the top of the hierarchy and in order to circumvent being scammed by the other agents they have come up with alternative means of seeking employment.

We have got people who are helping us as employment agents, but, especially taking especially looking the type of our worker most of them are paid most of them are paid minimum in fact below minimum the salary which they are paid, so it would be difficult for us to refer them to someone make them pay for them to get employment, so we are trying by all means to assist even amongst ourselves, working as agents although we won't be paid, even if yourself you know someone who is looking for a domestic worker, you can give us a ring or post on the group and then that person can get assistance. Unlike if they go to other agencies, we have got agents who are making them pay ZAR500 or ZAR300 they say for training and then after training they promise to give them employment, but those people are never will never get that employment.

(Key Informant)

2016/12/26, 13:21 : Kana ari kuPetoria , kuEast lyne kukudiwa domestic worker, part time (Is there anyone who lives in Pretoria, at East Lyne a domestic worker is wanted

(Group member)

2017/01/08, 15:44: Kune vaye vanotsvaga mabasa, mukaenda kumaShops mogona kutarisa maNotice board, dzimwe nguva vanenge vane maNotice of vanhu varikutsvaga maDomestic (to those looking for jobs, you can try going to the local supermarket and looking at the notice board, sometimes potential employers advertise themselves there)

(Group member).

Ideally employment agents present themselves as an opportunity of freedom which allows participants to seek and acquire employment through them. However realistically speaking the findings of the study highlight that the use of employment agents often results in process and opportunity failure. In order to avoid this, the majority of participants avoid using agents and warn others of their particular shortcomings. The findings, in terms of agents, reflect how social networks can actually have a negative impact on undocumented migrants. However to circumvent this negative impact undocumented migrants have come up with alternative mechanisms for finding employment such as going to the market, checking the notice boards of supermarkets and sharing messages of potential employment opportunities over Whatsapp.

Whatsapp a network that transcends spatial boundries

Considering the nature of the environment within which domestic work takes place in, mobilisation of domestic workers is difficult as compared to the mobilisation of shop floor workers within the factory setting, (Buhlungu 2010, Ally 2008). Additionally the difficulty of the mobilisation of undocumented non-national domestic workers is exacerbated by their documentation status, putting them at risk of deportation if discovered. Therefore undocumented migrant women choose to remain invisible in order to evade the authorities (Griffin,2011). Findings highlight that firstly, the domestic Workers Association group, was formed under the leadership of the Zimbabwe Workers union in South Africa (ZWUSA), in order to assist undocumented migrants. Members of the group (ZWUSA) realised that by working as a union they would be unable to serve a significant portion of their members due to their lack of documentation.

> *Because we wanted to look at ways in which we could assist illegal workers but it was so difficult to do so in the Zimbabwe workers union because some of the labour laws discriminate against those who are undocumented because no employer is allowed to employ an undocumented migrant worker, so we saw that by working as a trade union it doesn't serve the needs of some of our people that's why we had to venture into having an Ngo, which doesn't have limits* (Key Informant).

What these quotes suggest is that there was already a group of undocumented organised domestic workers who were available to form part of the Domestic Workers Association group. One of the ways in which the group was able to address the challenge of mobilisation was through the use of social media in particular the creation of a Whatsapp group. The Whatsapp group connects and share information with 256 undocumented domestic workers. An important finding in relation to this is the role that the Domestic Workers' Association plays in organising Zimbabwean domestic workers on behalf of SADSAWU.

> *"it's role is to mainly organise on behalf of established workers unions in South Africa like for domestic workers we organise on behalf of SADSAWU……. The response from them (SADSAWU) has been good but sometimes we have got challenges whereby undocumented migrant domestic workers feel discriminated because most of like migrant domestic workers doesn't want to be known and they fear being victimised.* (Key Informant).

> *Admins can you organise when SADSAWU can visit members so that we can speed up UIF registration and all other Labour disputes settlements. (Group member- DWA)*

The above discussions confirms Von Holdt & Webster's (2008) argument that there have been instances whereby creative forms of labour organisation and mobilisation have been established, however these new forms of mobilisation have their challenges as well. In the case of the evidence provided by the key informant, organisation is challenged by individual domestic workers desire to remain invisible. Being part of the domestic workers Whatsapp group in itself is a functioning, and utilizing the availability is also a functioning. As previously conceptualised, capabilities are the use of different functionings in order to address or improve their wellbeing (Alexander, 2008). In this instance for example, the combination of the functionings of being exploited by an employer, being a part of the Whatsapp group and being willing to approach SADSAWU as an undocumented migrant leads to the possible capability of an improved working relationship between the employer

and the employee and the undocumented migrant does not run the risk of deportation because they are being assisted through the representation of not only the Whatsapp group but also the NGO, house of Hope- Ithemba.

As previously conceptualised, social capital and networks are those resources that can be called upon in times of crises (Silvey & Elmhirst, 2004). Kathiravelu (2012) highlights that the use of friendships and connections allow low-wage employees to secure employment and promotions as well as secure either financial or emotional help (Kathiravelu, 2012). One of the main findings in this regard, is that the Domestic Worker Association group helped in finding employment for those that are currently unemployed with a large number of members either requesting the phone numbers reliable of Employment Agents within their area or them sending messages of possible employment opportunities.

> *13/10/2016, 11:29: All those who gets employment through her should update the group so that we know if she is worth our recommendation. If she can deliver then we can work with her and she should make sure that those employers register the workers giving them a better working environment* (Group Administrator).
>
> *18/10/2016, 11:58: I am looking for someone to help take care of an elderly lady who is blind. This is a full time position in Fourways Area in Johannesburg. Person will need to prepare meals and snacks, help the blind lady when necessary, physical activity, make sure apartment is kept tidy* (Group member).

Upon getting into the group, participants would introduce themselves by name, their age and where they were seeking employment. What this highlights is not only the dependence of participants to find employment, but that participants felt safer looking for employment online rather than advertising themselves due to their undocumented status. Findings in this regard go along with Griffin (2011)'s that employers prefer finding domestic workers amongst other domestic workers, hence why participants where possible would advertise possible employment opportunities.

The issue of payment, especially the paying of agents, seems to be a big motivator for the preference of social networks instead of formalised or 'pseudo-formalised' institutions. Participants of the Whatsapp group highlighted that they found it difficult to find employment through the use of agents because they did not have the financial means to do so and employment is not guaranteed after payment of the upfront fee.

18/10/2016, 11:09: Ini handitorina kana rand rekuzvichengeta ndozobadhara mari kuna agent ini ndisingashande (I don't even have a single rand to look after myself, then I have to pay an agent whilst I do not work)

(Group member)

18/10/2016, 11:11: U need to help someone and she keeps insisting kuti vanobhadharisa mmm lve washed my hands (You need to help someone but she keeps insisting that you have to pay them mmmmm I've washed my hands)

(Group member).

Evidence from these quotes show that agents, in this instance seem to lead to process failure, in that participants are searching for jobs, and in this regard agents act as the gatekeepers to employment and one can only get through the gate if one can afford to pay for entrance. Due to lack of employment and poverty, many participants are unable to secure employment and therefore seek alternative means such as looking for potential employment opportunities on the Whatsapp group.

Comradery to a lesser extent is one of the motivating factors for the use of social networks. This is evidenced by not only the continuous requests by members to add their acquaintances but also that group members greet each other each morning. Comradery in this instance is based on a shared identity; that of a migrant domestic worker. A particular example of this is where group members felt offended by another group member who seemed to undermine the domestic work profession.

18/10/2016, 14:33 : Your idea might be good but your presentation is bad you can't say people are lazy to think some of them are our mothers who are sending us to university from domestic wages lets not offend others not all are privileged.

(Group member)

18/10/2016, 16:20 : I truly get what you are saying but I do agree with the other comrades, the way you said it was not good at all. Do you know why some of the ladies here prefer working as domestic/childminders (1)free accommodation (2)no daily expenses eg food all depends with the employer (3)no transport expense. And if you are lucky some they even buy you bus/plane tickets to go home every year.

(Group member).

Comraderie in the Whatsapp group also presented itself in the sharing of cleaning tips in order not to exhaust oneself whilst working for a particular employer, as well as ideas on how to deal with particular employers, that are difficult and do not pay their employees much.

> *2017/01/02, 20:24 : Manje ini murungu vangu haabhadhare vana 4 APA andipa chikafu chishoma. Manje ini ndinomubira zvakaipa (here my employer does not pay much and she has four children and she gives me very little food and so I steal from her a lot.*
>
> (Group Member)
>
> *2016/12/24, 18:58: Unotorinani mwana wamai unotori pabasa,isu vamwe tave ne3years tigere,shinga wamai (You are better off my mother's child you actually have a job, some of us have been unemployed for three years we are just sitting, just persevere) and plz don't liv that job before you get another one,plz kunzima la ngaphandle (it is hard out there)*
>
> (Group member)
>
> *2017/01/31, 20:42 : Cdes we must look outside the box R1200 it's too little but half a loaf is better than nothing, if we start small business may be with R200 buy small things that we think people may need, like now we are approaching winter socks, bean hat, scarfs ,if you stock for R200 you can make profit, when you are off try to walk around where you find people and try to make business, tisangoshandiswa veduwee let's try to be creative, tinotangira pakamari kashoma ikako totosimukira, hapana munhu akatangira pamsoro tese tinotangira pasi (we will continue to get used... we start with that little money and we begin to rise up, there is no one who starts at the top, we all start at the bottom)*
>
> (Group member)

These findings are in line with Nyamnjoh (2007)'s study which highlight the employment relationship between the domestic worker and the madam is contested relationship. The study emphasizes how most literature view domestic workers as being submissive and passive due to their lack of documentation and education. However the study also postulates that domestic workers are active shapers of their environment which often shows itself in the form

of grumblings and non-responsiveness in line with their social networks on the part of the domestic worker. The Whatsapp group provides a safe space in which undocumented domestic workers can discuss their unhappiness with their employers and find potentially viable solutions to their troubles, whether it is in the form of theft or running away from their place of employment.

This part of the discussion of findings aims to discuss some of the benefits of being a part of the Domestic Workers Association Group of particular interest notions around labour law practices and documentation. Sections 32 & 38 of the Immigration Act speak to matters on the enforcement, monitoring and employment of undocumented migrants within South Africa. Anyone one caught employing an undocumented migrant is in contempt of the law and liable to the paying of a fine. Additionally although the BCEA stipulates that undocumented workers should be treated fairly, there is a general fear of deportation if migrants domestic workers visit labour offices in order to sort out domestic disputes due to exposure of their undocumented status.

One of the benefits of joining the Domestic Workers Association Group is that undocumented migrants get legal assistance as well in cases of employment disputes through the assistance of trade unions.

> *Their benefits are that the union (SADSAWU) will even give them representation, in the areas where they won't be accepted as undocumented workers. Like if they go to the labour offices, they won't be given any services as long as they are undocumented workers. And we have even got a problem where engaging lawyers taking into consideration that the money they receive is so little for them to save enough money to get legal rep so that is when the union comes in to assist them.*
>
> (key informant)
>
> *14/10/2016, 06:43: Admins can you organise when SADSAWU can visit members so that we can speed up UIF registration and all other Labour disputes settlements.* (Group Administrator).

These findings go in line with Ally (2008)'s findings which suggest that domestic worker unions have taken on a more bureaucratic role in relation to the mobilisation and organisation of domestic workers. What makes the findings different from Ally (2008) is that the beaurocratic role is not because of the depoliticisation and demobilisation of domestic worker

unions but rather is caused by the preferred invisibility of undocumented migrant women and the working context. Thus leading to migrant organisations to mobilise and organise domestic workers on behalf of established trade unions.

Additionally undocumented migrants are assisted by the Domestic Worker Association through the acquisition of documentation.

> *We assist them in getting documentation. Like some of them are coming here without even passports, so we take them to the Zimbabwean consulate to get I. D's, some to get birth certificates for their children we take them to Home Affairs. We are also working with department of Social development to assist those who have need documentation for their children born in South Africa.*
>
> (Key informant)

Many participants who sought employment at the market highlighted that either they themselves, their children or someone that they knew were in need of documentation. This proved particularly difficult especially for participants with children that needed to go to school because there was a general fear that their children would be turned away because they did not have the necessary papers to be in the country.

Use of fake documentation to navigate employment

Lack of documentation affects migrants because not only are they at risk of deportation if discovered but they do not qualify for certain jobs because one of the job requirements is for them to have a permit that allows them to navigate the employment sector. Participants in the Whatsapp group highlighted that one of the ways they got around this was through the use of fake documents. Although these fake documents can get participants jobs, they can prove to be rather problematic if discovered.

> *2017/02/01, 07:15: Vakaendesa mafake papers kana muine mukana wekuabvisa muma files evarungu bvisai murungu akati ane permit munovaudza keeuti arikunyepa iye ndiye akati achanditoresa permit kana akuburitsai basa tine malawyers anokumirirai mahara (those that have fake permits, if you get the chance to remove them from your employers files please remove them, so that when inspectors come and your employers say that you have a permit you can stop yourself from getting into trouble by saying that your employer is lying and that he promised to get one done on*

your behalf and if he terminates your employment, we have lawyers who can help you with that issue).

(Group member).

2017/01/31, 10:40: Asi panodiwa aslam or passpoort ine permit kana .Musina aslam kana permit tokuitirai rekuti muwane basa. Vanhu vakawandisa vanoshanda mumabasa avana mapepa asi vanoitisa ekuti vawane mabasa chete gadzirisai rekuti muwane basa. (but a passport with asylum or a permit is needed. If you do not have a permit or asylumwe will make you one so that you can get a job. Many people work in these jobs do not have papers but they get fake ones so that they can get jobs only, get a fake one made so that you can get a job).

(Group member)

These quotes show that lack of documentation means that the beings and doings of participants are limited, hence why they choose to use fake permits. From evidence demonstrated above, the permits in themselves may prove problematic due to their counterfeit nature. Clark (2005) highlights that that social network theory does not have the ability to influence macro institutions. The above evidence illustrates that they do, this is because the use of fake permits has led to the Department of Home Affairs to deciding that they want to inspect the work premises especially those of the restaurant sector and mining sector due to them employing too many foreigners.

The basic premise of the capabilities approach is that in order to assess the quality of life of a participant the researcher should focus on the opportunities of freedom afforded to the participant in order for them to live a life that they deem is of quality (Robeyns, 2006). From the discussion of the key findings being a part of the Domestic Workers Association Group (House of Hope Ithemba) can be considered to be a capability in which it provides undocumented domestic workers with the different functionings and opportunities for them to improve their life chances. Findings show that upon joining the group members not only have access to micro assistance such as help with employment agents but also access to macro institutions such as SADSAWU to help with labour disputes on behalf of the undocumented migrant domestic worker.

ACCOMPLISHMENTS

One of the objectives of the study is to understand participants' perceptions of their networks. This is done in order to understand what the participants viewed as wellbeing and development. This part of the research report intends to discuss the accomplishments of participants. The key assumption behind this discussion is that moving to South Africa places participants at an advantage as they are better able to express their freedoms as compared to those that are still working in Zimbabwe despite them being undocumented.

I can now look after my children

When questioned about what they have been able to achieve since coming to South Africa. All participants highlighted that they are now better equipped to look after their children. All participants highlighted that this was one of the many reasons they left. Provision in this case refers to the provision of food and school fees.

> *What I have achieved since moving here? Well I was able to send all my children to school and have them finish and now they are here working.*
>
> (Loveness)
>
> *Back home I have my younger sisters children that I was left with, that I look after, that I pay school fees for. My husband said that he would only be able to help in terms of food pap so clothes and school fees he is incapable. That's why you find me often times going up and down, I sell this, I have done this, I have tried that. I would just be trying for the sake of these orphans so that they are dressed, they go to school and they learn. Because she just died and I was told to take care of the children so I have them all three of them, two girls and one boy.*
> (Moreblessing)

This evidence suggests that participants are in a better of position to look after their children as compared to when they were in Zimbabwe. Findings highlight that although some of the participants may be married, their husbands and partners do not contribute much or at all to the upkeep of their children, thus the women are forced to become domestic workers. These findings are in line with Phillips (2011) findings which highlight that one of the main motivating factors for working as domestic workers was due to father absence and the broken down relationship between the 'husband' and his children. Having a father in itself is an advantage because ideally fathers are supposed to provide financial resources for their

children. However as Sen (1999), notes it's possible to have an advantage/capbility and have it not work. In order to address this participants step in and fulfil the role as father to their children as well. Due to the fact that they have to work out of the country participants enlist the help of their mothers who then take over the mothering role in exchange for financial assistance.

I built my family home

Upon being probed about their achievements, participants highlighted that one of their biggest achievements was being able to build a family home, something that they were unable to do whilst they were back in Zimbabwe.

> *What I was unable to do when I was back home when I worked? I was able to buy a stand and build for them, and I am now able to provide them with food here and there when I am working.*
>
> (Linda)
>
> *Ahh I see as if it is better in here because when I was in Zimbabwe, I was unable to maintain a stand, but as I started living in here and piecing together money I have been able to nicely build my own house which is better, get my own furniture, build another stand and put lodgers, although I am living here in the fields and plastics, I have somewhere to look and see that here I built and put lodgers in so I am guaranteed cash at the end of the month. I have my own place back home where people can point and say this is Mai (name withheld) place.*
> (Mucha)

One of the premises of the capability approach is that it does not only analyse well-being from a strictly economic perspective (Clark, 2005). This is because the approach aims to understand wellbeing from all spectrums of life. For example taking into consideration that most participants are paid less than the minimum amount stipulated in Sectoral determination 7, from a strictly economic perspective, assumptions would be made that participants are living in poverty. Albeit true, there is a need to take into consideration what participants are able to do with their earnings, in this case, not only are they able to provide for their children, but they have been able to build houses back home. Participants highlighted that although they lived in informal settlements here, they had an even better places to go when they decide to leave South Africa.

CONCLUSION

The aim of this chapter was to discuss the findings of the research study. The findings highlighted that participants have expansive and fulfilling social networks that allow them to meet their daily needs in the context of being undocumented migrants. Where possible the results were discussed in connection with the theoretical frame work of the study (capabilities approach), this allowed the researcher to analyse the capabilities and functionings afforded to participants by their choice to immigrate to South Africa.

CHAPTER FIVE

MAIN FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

INTRODUCTION

The aim of this chapter is to summarize the main findings of the research in alignment with the three objectives of the study as well as the sub-questions. Based on these findings recommendations for future research will be made in this chapter before conclusions are drawn.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

The findings of this study have been summarised in accordance with the objectives as listed below.

To identify the ties, connections and relationships that undocumented Zimbabwean women create and use.

The majority of literature that discusses domestic work and migrant domestic work emphasizes that domestic workers live solitary lives because of the nature of their employment (Huang & Yeoh, 2013; Dinat & Peeberdy, 2007 & Cheng, 2004). The results of this study do not correlate with those stipulated in the literature that was examined. Instead the findings point to the fact that undocumented migrant domestic workers live active lives and have many social networks that are available to them. These social networks range from strong familial ties such as the nuclear family to weak network ties that establish themselves in the form of friendships.

When it comes to migrating, the findings were in line with Mei- Liu (2013) study , which highlights that females are more likely to migrate if there is a presence of strong familial ties, this is because these ties not only provide the undocumented Zimbabwean women with information on the migration process but also with resources such as a place to live in. Marriage as a social network plays a key role in the migration process both in the country of origin as well as in the host country. Participants highlighted that one of the main reasons they left Zimbabwe was because their husbands were already in South Africa. For those that came without husbands, they ended up finding husbands that they could live with.

The study points that undocumented migrants have networks in the originating country as well as in the host country. And these networks perform different tasks for the migrant. In the originating country, migrants are particularly dependent on their mothers and mothers in law,

these are the individuals that they entrust the care of their children to in exchange for financial assistance. The networks in the host country are complex in that they consist not only of strong familial ties but also weak ties in the form of employment agencies. Undocumented migrants however are more dependent on weak ties in the host country because strong familial ties are unable to meet most of their needs.

To understand the role of social networks in providing social, political, emotional and economic support.

One of the aims of the study was to understand how undocumented female migrants define poverty in order to understand what they used their social networks for. Poverty for participants was the fact that not only were they unable to find properly paying employment in Zimbabwe but it also meant that they were unable to provide for their children. Lack of provision for the participants meant being unable to feed their children and to send them to school. Participants hence decided to migrate to South Africa. However due to lack of funds participants not only use other channels to illegally enter into South Africa but also had to find other channels in order for them to navigate in the country. Social networks play an important role because they are the ones that help them to adapt and navigate to their environment. Both strong and weak network ties are helpful to migrants in the both the originating country as well as in the host country. This part of the report aims to discuss not only the networks of the undocumented migrant but also what they are used for.

Marriage and sexual networks:

Marriage plays a key motivator in encouraging women to migrate and follow their husbands to South Africa. Findings suggest that wives are more likely to move and follow their husbands because their husbands will be established in South Africa, indicating that having a place to stay and food to eat are one of the motivators for migrating. This is also one of the reasons why some single women decide upon arriving in South Africa to find a boyfriend or 'husband'. Being in a relationship has advantages for some of the women because it allows for some economic freedom because it not only shifts the responsibility of buying food onto the male partner but also it means a reduction in rent costs.

Family, neighbours and community members

Nuclear family plays an important role in encouraging women to move, as women are particularly reliant on their mothers and mother's in law to look after their children, which is done in exchange for financial assistance. In order to send money back home, migrants are

dependent on their neighbours and community members from back home, who they give the money to give to their family members. This emphasizes the point that migrant networks are transcendent with participants relying on their neighbours from back home to help them.

The church

Churches play a key part in providing support for migrants in the host country. Due to their lack of documentation movements of migrants are limited. As a result of this the church is the context in which they establish friendships, due to not only their similarity in backgrounds but also their similarity in religious faith. These friendships result in the establishment of coping mechanisms that often lead to support in times of trouble and bereavement because the church in this in case acts as an informal burial society. In addition the church in some instances when 'formal institutions' such as employment agents have failed the church steps in as an employment agent helping members to get employment free of charge.

Employment agencies

There is a general apathy towards use of employment agents. In the eyes of migrants, these labour brokers are viewed in suspicion as being scammers and *"useless thieves"*. This is because not only do they promise jobs for a fee but also in most cases those employment opportunities do not materialise. In addition, there is a hierarchy of employment agencies. At the bottom are those that are seen as scams (this is where the majority of them fit into) who promise employment to undocumented migrants upon paying a fee; above them there are the ones that do not promise employment but however provide training qualifications for the migrant and at the top are the ones who do provide employment and these are the agents that are often employed by documented migrants.

The market

The market is a place where migrants go and market themselves to potential employers. Participants either sit or stand and point their fingers in the air in directions depending on the kind of job they are looking for those that are looking to be maids for the day point in one direction, those that are gardeners point in another and those that are sex workers point in a totally different way from the others. Due to the amount of people at the market in order to find employment, migrants prefer to distance themselves from each other and in addition the older the migrant the more likely they are to be picked for a job. Being at the market does not necessarily guarantee a job every day, as there are days where migrants can work for a full week just by standing there and there are others where they struggle to get employment.

The Whatsapp group

The use of social media means that those that were in previously isolating employment can actually establish friendships through the use of their phones. The Whatsapp group is a forum that allows for migrants to not only establish friendships but to discuss and to come up with solutions to their issues. The Whatsapp group also acts as a mobilising tool of migrants on behalf of formalized institutions such a trade unions.

To investigate how social networks enhance the capabilities and resources of non – national domestic workers.

One of the study's intentions was to understand how migrant domestic workers view their wellbeing. As previously discussed migrants viewed poverty as being unable to get a properly paying job and being unable to provide for their children and these are some of the factors that encouraged their migration. Migrants experience difficulties upon arrival and establishing themselves in their host communities and in many instances for undocumented domestic workers they are paid below the minimum stipulated in Sectoral Determination 7. However, in comparison migrants believe that the poverty experienced in South Africa is better than the poverty experienced in Zimbabwe. Being in South Africa gives migrants a sense of purpose as they are able to work and receive a salary; sending money back home to look after the children and their families for them is an accomplishment. Migrants attest to the fact that they would rather live in South Africa in shacks and plastic homes, knowing that they have built homes and furnished them back home, which they never would have been able to do if they were still back home.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the findings that emerged from this study, show that unlike what the majority of literature in South Africa points to, undocumented domestic workers do not live in isolation from others, but rather have a diverse range of social networks that allow them to be active agents and participants in their lives. The findings highlight that the majority of social networks that undocumented domestic workers use are in actual fact useful to them and how they navigate their contexts. Migrants in this instance are largely dependent on their families for support both in the originating country and in the host community.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE STUDY

In response to this study, the following recommendations have been made:

One of the things that impacted the study is the fact that the majority of participants interviewed were stay out and part-time domestic workers. What I found is that due to this issue, the isolation that reverberated throughout the literature review was not established in the data collection and analysis phase of the research study. In order to further understand whether there has been a shift in domestic work or not, it is strongly recommended that a comparative study of stay in domestic workers and stay out domestic workers.

Participants had very strong feelings towards employment agents, with the majority of them highlighting that employment agents are scams. Further study upon this finding would prove interesting especially if researchers are able to interview those possible scammers as well.

Reference list

Adger, N. W., Kelly,M. P., Winkels,A., Huy,L. Q.,& Locke, C. (2002) Migration, Remittances, Livelihood Trajectories, and Social Resilience. *A Journal of the Human Environment, 31(4),* 358-366. :http://dx.doi.org/10.1579/0044-7447-31.4.358

Alexander, J. M. (2008). *Capabilities and Social Justice: The Political Philosophy of Amartya Sen and Martha Nussbaum.* Aldershot: Ashgate.

Ally, S. (2008). Domestic worker Unionization in post-Apartheid South Africa: Demobilization and depoliticization by the democratic state. *Politicon*, *35*: 1, 1-21.

Ally, S. (2011) Domestics, 'Dirty Work' and the Affects' of Domination. *South African Review of Sociology, 42:2*, 1-7.

Anderson, B. (2001) Just another job? Paying for domestic work, *Gender & Development, 9:1*, 25-33.

Anderson, B. (2007). A very private business: exploring the demands for migrant domestic work. *European Journal of Women's Studies, 14:3,* 247-264.

Babbie, E., & Mouton, J. (1998). *The practice of social research.* Cape Town: Oxfrod University Press.

Bakewell, O. (2010) Some Reflections on Structure and Agency in Migration Theory. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 36(10),* 1689-1708. DOI: 10.1080/1369183X.2010.489382.

Baily, C. A. (2007). *A Guide to Qualitative Field Research.* California: Sage Publications.

Basic Conditions of Employment Act, no 75 of 1997. http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/downloads/legislation/acts/basic-conditions-of employment/Act%20-%20Basic%20Conditions%20of%20Employment.pdf

Bonner, C. (2010). Women in Informal Employment Globalising & Organising (WIEGO).

Borgatti, S,P., & Halgin, D, S. (2011). On Network Theory. *Organization Science 22(5)*.1168-1181. http:// dx.doi.org/10.1287/orsc.1100.0641.

Braching, S., & Sachikonye, L. (2009). Migrant remittances and household wellbeing in Zimbabwe. *International Migration, 48:5*, 203-227.

Buhlungu, S.2010. *Paradox of Victory: COSATU and the Democratic Transformation of South Africa*. Kwazulu Natal: UKZN Press.

Buhlungu, S., Brookes, M.,& Wood, G. (2008). Trade unions and democracy in South Africa: Union organisational challenges and solidarities in a time of transformation. *British Journal of Industrial Relations., 46:3*, 439-468.

Budlender, D. (2010). *Decent Work for Domestic Workers*. (Services Sector Education and Training Authority). South Africa: CASE.

Cheng, S. A. (2004). Contextual Politics of Difference in Transnational Care: The Rhetoric of Filipina Domestics'Employers in Taiwan. *Feminist Review. 77,* 46-64.

Clark, D.A., (2005). Sen's capabilities approach and the many spaces of human wellbeing. *The Journal of Developmental Studies, 41;8*, 1339-1368.

Cock, J (2011) Challenging the Invisibility of Domestic Workers, *South African Review of Sociology, 42(2)*, 132-133, DOI: 10.1080/21528586.2011.582743.

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative Enquiry & Research Design: choosing among five approaches.* London: Sage Publications.

Crush, J.,& Tawodzera, G. (2016). *The food insecurities of Zimbabwean migrants in urban South Africa.* (URBAN FOOD SECURITY SERIES NO. 23). Cape Town.

Crush, J., Tevera, D. (2010). *Zimbabwe's Exodus: Crisis, Migration, Survival.* Cape Town: Southern African Migration Programme.

Curran, S. R.,& Rivero Fuentes, E. (2003). Engendering migrant networks: the case study of Mexican migration. *Demography, 40(2),* 289-307.

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2011). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research.* California: Sage Publications.

Deacon, B., Olivier, M.,& Beremauro, R. (2015). *Social Security and social protection of migrants in South Africa and SADC .(*Migrating for Work Research Consortium, No. 8). South Africa: African Centre for Migration & Society, University of the Witwatersrand.

Deshingkar, P., Zeitlyn, B.,& Holtom, B. (2014). *Does migration for domestic work reduce poverty? A review of literature and an agenda for research.*(Migrating out of poverty, No.15). Sussex: Research Programme Consortium.

Dinat, N.,& Peeberdy, S. (2007). Restless worlds of work, health & migration: domestic workers in Johannesburg. *Development South Africa*, *24:1,* 186-203. *Social Law Conference.*

Gasper, D., &Truong, T. D. (2010) Movements of the 'We': International and Transnational Migration and the Capabilities Approach, *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities, 11:2*, 339-357.

Gill, P., Stewart, K., Treasure, E., & Chadwick, B. (2008). Methods of data collection in qualitative research: interviews and focus groups. *British Dental Journal,204,* 291-295.

Griffin, L (2011) Unravelling Rights: 'Illegal' Migrant Domestic Workers in South Africa, *South African Review of Sociology, 42:2*, 83-101.

Hondagneu- Sotelo, P. (1994). Regulating the unregulated? Domestic workers' social networks. *Social Problems, 41:1,* 50-64.

Huang, S.,& Yeoh, S. (1996). Ties that bind: state policy and migrant female domestic workers in Singapore.

International Labour Office. (2013). *Decent work for domestic workers (* International labour Conference, No 4). Geneva: International Labour Organisation.

Kadushin, C. (2004). *Understanding Social Networks: Theories, Concepts & Findings.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Kathiravelu, L. (2012). Social Networks in Dubai: Informal Solidarities in an Uncaring State. *Journal of Intercultural Studies, 33(1),* 103-119. DOI: 10.1080/07256868.2012.633319

Kiwanuka, M., Jinnah, Z.,& Hartman-Pickerill, B. (2015). *Doing the dirty work: foreign migrants in the domestic sector in South Africa*.(MiWorc, No. 10). South Africa: African Centre for Migration & Society, University of the Witwatersrand.

Kofman, E. (1999). 'Birds of passage' a decade later: Gender and immigration in the European Union. *The International Migration Review,33:2*, 269-299.

Kok, P., Gelderblom, D., Oucho, J. O.,& Van Zyl, J. (2006). *Migration in South and Southern Africa.* Cape Town: Human Sciences Research Council.

Mantouvalou, V. (2006). Servitude and forced labour in the 21st century: the human rights of domestic workers. *Industrial Law Journal, 35:5,* 395-414.

Marshall, C. (2006). *Designing Qualitative Research.* California: SAGE Publications.

Massey, D. S.,& Aysa, M. (2005). *Social capital and international migration from Latin America.* Mexico City: United Nations Secretariat.

McGregor, J. (2007) 'Joining the BBC (British Bottom Cleaners)': Zimbabwean Migrants and the UK Care Industry, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 33(5),* 801-824, DOI: 10.1080/13691830701359249

Mei-Liu, M. (2013). Migrant networks and international migration: testing weak ties. *Demography, 50:1,* 1243-1277.

Mogashoa, T. (2014). Understanding critical discourse analysis in Qualitative Research. *Internationl Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 1(7)*, 104-113.

Muanamoha, R. C., Maharaj, B.,& Preston-Whyte, E. (2010).Social networks and undocumented Mozambican migration to South Africa, *Geoforum, 41*, 885-896.

Muzvidziwa, V. (2001). Zimbabwe's Cross-Border Women Traders: Multiple Identities and Responses to New Challenges, *Journal of Contemporary African Studies, 19(1)*, 67-80, DOI: 10.1080/02589000124044

Neuman, L. W. (2000). *Social Research Methods.* Edinburgh: ALLYN AND BACON.

Nyamnjoh, F, B. (2007). Madams & maids in Southern Africa: Coping with uncertainities and the art of mutual zombification. *Africa Spectrum, 40:30,* 181-196.

Phillips, L. H. (2011). I am alone. I am a woman. What are my children going to eat? Domestic workers and family networks. *South African Review of Sociology, 4:22*, 29-44.

Ponterotto, J. G. (2005). Qualitative research in counselling psychology: a primer on research paradigms and philosophy of science. *Journal of Counselling Psychology, 52(2),* 126-136.

Ragin, C, C. (2014). *The Comparative Method: Moving beyond qualitative and quantitative strategies.* California: University of California Press.

Ranger, T. (2005) The Narratives and Counter-narratives of Zimbabwean Asylum: female voices, *Third World Quarterly, 26:3*, 405-421.

Robeyns, I. (2006). The capability approach in practice. *The Journal of Political Philosophy, 14:3*,351-376.

Sen, A. (2005). Human rights and capabilities. *Journal of Human Development,6:2*, 151-166.

Sen, A. (1999). *Commodities and capabilities*. New Dehli: Oxford University Press.

Schutt, R. K. (2011). *Investigating the social world: the process and practise of research.* California: Sage Publications.

Scott, J.,& Carrington, P. J. (2011). *The Sage Handbook of Social Network Ananlysis.* London: SAGE Publications.

Silvey, R. (2004). Transnational domestication: State power and Indonesian migrant women in Saudi Arabia. *Political Geography, 22I*, 245-264.

Silvey, R.,& Elmhirst, R. (2004). Engendering Social Capital: Women workers and rural urban networks in Indonesia's crisis. *World Development, 31:5,* 865-879.

Statistics South Africa Quarterly Labour Report (January- March 2016).

Terreblanche, M., Durrheim, K.,& Painter, D. (2006). *Research in practice: Applied methods for social sciences.* Cape Town: UCT Press.

Thieme, S. (2008) Sustaining Livelihoods in Multi-local Settings: Possible Theoretical Linkages Between Transnational Migration and Livelihood Studies, *Mobilities, 3:1,* 51-71, DOI: 10.1080/17450100701797315.

Unemployment Insurance Act, No. 63 of 2001: http://www.labour.gov.za/DOL/legislation/acts/unemployment-insurance-fund/unemployment-insurance-act-no-63-of-2001

Von Holdt, K & Webster, E. 2008. Organising on the Periphery: New Sources of Power in South African Workplace. *Employee Relations, 4*, 333-354.

Zainal , Z. (2007). Case study as a research method. *Journal Kemanusiaan, 9,* 1-6.

Zimbabwe National Statistics Agency. (2012) Census National report.

APPENDICES

Appendix A

WITS UNIVERSITY

Tel: +27 (0)11 717 1000

1 Jan Smuts Avenue

Braamfontein 2000

Johannesburg, South Africa

TITLE OF THE RESEARCH: Beneficial friends: a case study of social networks as a mitigating factor in the context of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg.

Research protocol number:

PARTICIPANT INFORMATION SHEET

Good day

My name is Chido Muvenge and I am a Masters student registered for a degree in Migration and Displacement at the University of the Witwatersrand. As part of the requirements for the degree, I am conducting research into the social networks of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg. This study hopes to understand the role that social networks play in shaping the livelihood strategies available to migrant women. It is hoped that this information may enhance social understandings of the role that informal institutions play as coping mechanisms for undocumented women.

I therefore wish to invite you to participate in my study. Your participation is entirely voluntary and refusal to participate will not be held against you in any way. If you agree to take part, I shall arrange to interview you at a time and place that is suitable for you. The interview will last approximately one hour. You may withdraw from the study at any time and you may also refuse to answer any questions that you feel uncomfortable with answering.

With your permission, the interview will be tape-recorded. No one other than my supervisor will have access to the tapes. The tapes and interview schedules will be kept for two years following any publications or for six years if no publications emanate from the study. Please be assured that your name and personal details will be kept confidential and no identifying information will be included in the final research report.

Due to the nature of the study, participants risk having their undocumented status exposed as well as their employers finding out of their participation within the study. Additionally the study may include the discussion of sensitive issues which may lead to experiencing feelings of emotional distress. In order to address issues pertaining to exposure, the researcher will ask you to choose a pseudonym(fake name) for yourself, you will be asked to verbally confirm your participation in the study and the researcher will sign the participation form on your behalf. If you are in need of legal advice due to any experienced risks you may contact the Wits Law Clinic on +27 (0) 11 717 8562 or Lawyers for Human Rights on +27 (0)11 339 1960 Should you feel the need for supportive counselling following the interview you will be referred to a social worker (Alebakwe Ramekwa who can be contacted on +27 78 300 1472).

Please feel free to ask any questions regarding my study. I shall answer them to the best of my ability. I may be contacted on tel no. 0720769983, email address cfmuvenge@gmail.com , or my supervisor, Z. Jinnah on tel no011 717.4699, email address zaheera.jinnah@wits.ac.za . Should you wish to receive a summary of the results of the study; an abstract will be made available on request.

Thank you for taking the time to consider participating in the study

Yours Sincerely

Chido Muvenge (Research student)

Appendix B

CONSENT FORM FOR PARTICIPATION IN THE STUDY

I hereby confirm that:

I have been briefed on the research that *Chido Muvenge,* is conducting on *"***role of social networks in shaping the capabilities and resources of undocumented Zimbabwean women working as domestic workers in Johannesburg?***".* The purpose and procedures of the study have been explained to me, therefore:

- I understand what participation in this research project means,
- I understand that my participation is voluntary,
- I understand that I have the right not to answer any questions that I do not feel comfortable with,
- I understand that I have the right to withdraw my participation in the research, at any time, I so choose, and
- I understand that any information I share will be held in the strictest confidence by the researchers.
- I hereby consent to participate in the research project.

Optional clauses:

I hereby request that I be guaranteed anonymity

I hereby request a copy of the research report

Pseudonym of Participant:……

Date:…….

Person who sought consent (research assistant)

- **I (*Chido Muvenge),* herewith confirm that the above participant has been fully informed about the study and has given verbal consent to participate as indicated above.**

Appendix C

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

1. How old are you?
2. How long have you been in South Africa?
3. What were your reasons for leaving Zimbabwe?
4. Why did you choose to come to South Africa?
5. Do you have a permit? If no, why?
6. How does not having a permit affect you?
7. What channels did you use to get into South Africa without a permit?
8. How did you find out about these channels?
9. When you came to South Africa who did you stay with?
10. How is your relationship with the ones you stayed with like?
11. How did you go about finding a job?
12. How has the working experience been for you?
13. How is your relationship with your employer?
14. What channels do you use to ease the negative effects of not having a passport/permit?
15. Could you tell me about the support systems that you have managed to set up in South Africa?
16. Are you part of a stokvel, church or a burial society?
17. How did you find out about these organisations?
18. What do you use these organisations for?

Is there any other information related to the study which I have not asked that you would like to share with me

Thank you for your participation in this research study!!!!