

BLACK AFRICAN WOMEN APPRENTICES' VIEWS ON TRADITIONAL MALE-
DOMINATED TECHNICAL VOCATIONAL TRAINING PROGRAMMES: A CASE
STUDY OF AN APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAMME.

A report on a research study presented to

,

The Department of Social Work

School of Human and Community Development

Faculty of Humanities

University of the Witwatersrand

In partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree Master of Arts in Social Work in
the field of Occupational Social Work

By

Tania Louise Sani

July 2020

DECLARATION

I, Tania Louise Sani, declare hereby that this study is a true reflection of my own research, and that this work or part thereof, has not been submitted for any degree in any other institution of higher education.

I, Tania Louise Sani, grant the University of the Witwatersrand the right to reproduce this research report in whole or in part, in any manner or format, which the University of the Witwatersrand may deem fit, for any person or institution requiring it for study and research, providing that the University of the Witwatersrand shall waive this right if the whole research report has been or is being published in a manner satisfactory to the University.

Tania Sani Hani Signature Date 07/07/2020

Tania Sani

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express my gratitude to my Supervisor, Ms. Laetitia Petersen, for her professional guidance and patience.

I wish to thank the Tshwane Leadership and Management Academy, specifically Ms. Janet Davies (Director of Competency Training and Development) whose insight and knowledge into the subject matter provided me with the inspiration and assistance to pursue this study.

I am indebted to Kate, my partner, for her encouragement, patient listening, copious cups of late night tea and never-ending editing services.

I wish to acknowledge my parents, Sheilah and Luigi Sani, both of whom inculcated and modelled the values of education and life-long learning in me.

To all my friends and family, for their continuous support and encouragement, and in particular Dr. Ruth Morgan, for her invaluable and tireless feedback and professional guidance.

I would also like to recognize the invaluable encouragement and support of classmates from the OSW Master's class of 2018/19, in particular colleagues on the CTC WhatsApp support group. You girls got me through this!

ABSTRACT

Women are being encouraged to pursue non-traditional male-dominated careers in technical fields and are registering as apprentices on technical vocational training programmes. This qualitative study makes use of an exploratory case study design to explore the lived reality of black African cisgender women on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships, and the gender equality barriers they experience during their apprenticeships. The study was situated at the Tshwane Leadership and Management Academy (TLMA), a municipal technical training facility in the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (hereafter referred to as the CTMM). Data was obtained from a focus group (apprentices) and in-depth interviews (instructors), with the aid of a semi-structured topic guide for focus groups, and a structured interview guide for instructors. Twelve participants and four key informants were recruited using purposive sampling methods. Data was transcribed and analysed using thematic analysis. This study aimed to contribute knowledge to the Occupational Social Work field by providing new insights into the experiences of black African women apprentices in traditional male-dominated workplaces by identifying workplace practices and attitudes that impact on the full participation of women on these training programmes.

Keywords

Apprentice, apprenticeship programme, black African women apprentices, gender equality, technical vocational training programme, traditional male-dominated occupations, Tshwane, South Africa

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES.....	vii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	viii
CHAPTER ONE.....	1
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Statement of the problem.....	1
1.2 Significance of the study	3
1.3 Key Concepts	3
1.4 Research Question	6
1.5 Aims and Objectives.....	6
1.6 Research Design and Methodology	6
1.7 Limitations of the Research Strategy, Design and Methodology	7
1.8 Chapter Outline for the Research Report.....	8
CHAPTER TWO	9
2. LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK.....	9
2.1 Literature Review	9
2.2 Theoretical Framework	13
CHAPTER THREE.....	15
3. RESEARCH APPROACH, DESIGN & METHODOLOGY	15

3.2 Research Question	15
3.2.1 Primary Aims.....	15
3.2.2 Secondary Objectives	15
3.3 Research Strategy and Design.....	15
3.4 Population, Sample & Sampling	17
3.4.1 Inclusion Criteria.....	17
3.4.2 Exclusion Criteria.....	17
3.5 Research Instrumentation	18
3.6 Methods of Data Collection	19
3.7 Methods of Data Analysis	20
3.8 Trustworthiness	21
3.9 Ethical Considerations	22
3.10 Limitations of the Research Strategy, Design & Methodology	24
CHAPTER FOUR	26
4. DISCUSSION AND SUMMARY OF FINDINGS.....	26
4.1 Introduction	26
4.2 Demographic Information	27
4.2.1 Demographic Information of Women Apprentices.....	27
4.2.2 Demographic Information of Instructors.....	29
4.3 Findings	31
4.3.1 Findings of Apprentices	31
4.3.2 Findings of Instructors (Key Informants).....	46
4.4 Summary of Findings	53
4.4.1 Linking Findings and Objectives	55
4.4.2 Linking Findings and Theoretical Framework	56

CHAPTER FIVE	58
5. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS	58
5.1 Introduction/Overview of Study	58
5.2 Summary of Findings	58
5.3 Conclusions	63
5.4 Recommendations.....	66
REFERENCES	68
APPENDIX A. Ethics Clearance Form	80
APPENDIX B. Agency Consent Form.....	81
APPENDIX C. Participant Information Sheet – Lecturers/Instructors	82
APPENDIX D. Participant Information Sheet - Apprentices	84
APPENDIX E. Topic Guide – Focus Group.....	86
APPENDIX F. Interview Guide.....	88
APPENDIX G. Consent form for participation in Focus Group	90
APPENDIX H. Consent form for audio recording of Focus Group	92
APPENDIX I. Consent form for participation in Interviews	93
APPENDIX J. Consent form for audio recording of Interviews	95
APPENDIX K Turnitin report.....	96

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Racial group of participants (apprentices)	27
Table 2: Age distributions of participants (apprentices)	28
Table 3: Year of study distributions of apprentices	28
Table 4: Distributions of types of apprenticeships of participants	29
Table 5: Gender distributions of Instructors	29
Table 6: Racial group distributions of Instructors.....	29
Table 7: Age distributions of Instructors	30
Table 8: Distributions of qualifications of Instructors.....	30
Table 9: Themes and sub-themes for women apprentices.....	31
Table 10: Themes and sub-themes for Instructors.....	46
Table 11: Summary of findings	53

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BUSA	Business Unity South Africa
CBD	Central Business District (Inner City)
CTMM	City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality
EAP	Employee Assistance Programme
GBV	Gender-Based Violence
N2	National Accredited Technical Education Diploma – Level 2
NAMB	National Artisan Moderation Body
NDP	National Development Plan
NEET	Not in Employment, Education or Training
QCTO	Quality Council for Trades and Occupations
SAQA	South African Qualification Authority
STEM	Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics
TLMA	Tshwane Leadership and Management Academy
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and training
UCT	University of Cape Town
USA	United States of America

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

The 2018 World Bank report on inequality levels in South Africa confirms South Africans having the highest levels of inequality in the world. This is consistently highest among black South Africans, female-headed households, children, the unemployed and the less educated (Sulla & Zikhali, 2018). Education and skills development are a means to increasing productivity, social participation and inclusive growth for societies like South Africa, where there is entrenched poverty, inequality and high unemployment (BUSA & Duncan, 2017). The National Development Plan: 2030 (NDP) indicates that one of the nine challenges facing South Africa is that “too few people work” (South Africa, 2018), and identifies the training of more artisans as one way that will assist South Africans, and black African women in particular, to access mid-level skilled work opportunities as well as drive growth in the economy. The problem however is that once women enter traditional male-dominated workplaces and training institutions, they encounter discriminatory behaviour and practices (English & Le Jeune, 2012; Martin & Barnard, 2013). From a social-economic perspective, a more equitable distribution of men and women in sectors that are traditionally male-dominated is important because these sectors pay higher salaries than women dominated ones, and they tend to be sectors where skills shortages exist (Fuller, Beck & Unwin, 2005). Increasing the pool of artisans in technical fields would increase the pool of talent from which industry can draw.

As a result of progressive equality legislation in South Africa and a focused investment by government in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET), more women are accessing traditional male-dominated vocational training programmes (apprenticeships), and being enrolled as apprentices on such programmes, with the aim of becoming qualified artisans. A finding from a South African study on women in technical workplaces indicates that they experience “pervasive gender issues” (Phaahla, 2000 cited in Madikizela & Haupt, 2009) such as gender stereotyping, sexist behaviour and the inadequate accommodation of women’s unique physical / health needs (Martin & Barnard, 2013). The demand on physical

strength is cited in the literature as a factor that is problematic and often used to discriminate against women (English & Le Jeune, 2012; Fielden, Davidson, Gale & Davey, 2000). A study by Whittock (2002) however, indicates how trades requiring heavy lifting, such as boiler making and mechanics, often requires two people to undertake these tasks, proving that it is not only women who have to be accommodated in such workplaces.

While the South African government has played an important role in addressing gender diversity and creating conditions for equal opportunities through the Bill of Rights of the South African Constitution (Kornegay, 2001, cited in Madikizela & Haupt, 2009), creating access for women to technical workplaces and apprenticeships alone does not guarantee gender equality and fair treatment. An increase in women's participation at all levels of organisations increases gender-diversity and equality (Devillard, de Zelicourt, Kossoff & Sancier-Sultan, 2017). Messing, Lippe, Demers and Mergler (2000, p.28) contend that challenging discrimination between men and women in the workplace needs to address not only access by women to traditional male-dominated works places, like technical trades, but it needs to challenge the discourses of dominance, which enables society to be "well designed for some and not for others". Furthermore, it needs to address the notion that traditional male-dominated institutions that are constructed in the image of men are normal because they (men) continue to benefit from the imbalance of power, and that women who reject this paradigm are accommodated in these institutions. Accommodation is no longer sufficient.

International research (Acker, 2006, Agapiou, 2002, Dennisen, 2010, Fuller & Unwin, 2003) and South African research (English & Le Jeune, 2012, Madikizela & Haupt, 2009, Martin & Barnard, 2013, Phaahla, 2000, Wildschut, Kruss, Roodt, Visser, Ngazimbi, Twalo & Meyer, 2013) in this field has focused mainly on the experiences of professional women in traditional male-dominated technical workplaces. However, there has been little research conducted on the experiences of women apprentices during their apprenticeships, and in particular on black African women.

The institution where this study is situated has made significant strides in addressing gender equality by implementing policies that target the recruitment of equal numbers of women and men apprentices. Within this context however, the pre-1994 legacy of apprentices being taught by a staff of all male instructors, many of whom are nearing retirement age, persists.

This further highlights the need to conduct research on the experiences of women apprentices at the institution that will better inform the institution of the experiences and needs of its women apprentices, and equip the institution with information to realign its gender equity policies with the needs of women apprentices.

The World Health Organisation has linked workplace stress to among other things, the lack of support from colleagues and supervisors, sexual harassment and bullying (Maulik, 2017). Depression, anxiety and physical disorders such as hypertension and diabetes are closely linked to stress (Maulik, 2017). As an Occupational Social Worker it is important to explore the experiences of black African women apprentices during their apprenticeships in order to identify factors, practices and policies that hamper effective participation of women on apprenticeships. Highlighting these issues will enable management at the institution to become better informed about its ramifications, and to improve the situation on the ground for the institution to become a more inclusive and supportive space for all.

1.2 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

South Africa has introduced extensive legislation to eradicate discrimination and inequality of women in society, including the workplace. The nature and extent of how these policies have advanced the position of black African women on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships, and the extent to which their experiences correlate with the intended outcomes of these policies, were explored. Furthermore, the findings provide new insights for management and instructors at traditional male-dominated technical training institutions on the extent to which their practices and approach to instructing black women apprentices are ensuring equitable and inclusive technical training environments. In addition, the study sheds light on the extent to which the research site is succeeding in developing black women artisans with strong “artisan-identities”, and who are able to overcome negative external influences in their chosen careers due to the intersection of race and gender (Charleston et al., 2014).

1.3 KEY CONCEPTS

1.3.1 APPRENTICESHIP

The South African Qualification Authority, SAQA (2014) describes an apprenticeship as a three to four year programme that combines theory, practical work and workplace practice in a chosen trade field. A listed trade ends in a trade test and an artisan certificate of competence. In South Africa, apprenticeships are monitored by the Quality Council for Trades and Occupations (QCTO), and the National Artisan Moderation Body (NAMB) oversees the quality assurance of apprenticeships on behalf of the QCTO. Apprenticeships are aimed at developing trade-specific skills particularly for industries that desperately need skilled artisans. By establishing a formal skills development structure, such shortages of skills can be addressed by training people in the necessary fields. An apprenticeship is a formalised contract that is signed between the apprentice and a pre-approved employer for the duration of the apprenticeship. The apprentice becomes an employee of the company and works for the company for the duration of the apprenticeship in order to gain the skills and experience necessary to work in the industry. An apprentice's work-based experience is restricted to a single employer which is the contracted employer of the apprentice. The apprenticeship programme consolidates the apprentice's ability in the trade through practical skills and experience.

1.3.2 APPRENTICE

According to Chron (2020) "an apprentice is someone who trains for a career by working under the supervision of more experienced workers. Modern apprenticeships follow an established plan of instruction, which includes on-the-job training combined with an educational curriculum. Typically, an apprentice begins earning money as soon as he or she starts work".

1.3.3 MALE DOMINATED OCCUPATIONS

The US Department of Labour (2017) defines Male-Dominated Occupations as those occupations and industries that employ 25% or fewer women than men in their sectors and workplaces.

Historically, many of these occupations and sectors prohibited access to women employees, for example underground mining in South Africa. Within the context of this study, male-dominated occupations refer to technical trades such as boiler making, welding and mechanics, where there is a large under-representation of women, and a prevalence of male-dominated workplace cultures, for example, “hierarchical, sexist, gender-segregated, resistant to change, gendered power structures” (Itzin, 1984, cited in Agapiou, 2002, p. 699). Male dominated sectors still provide relatively higher levels of pay for women than women-dominated occupations do, and function in ways that do not always support women’s career patterns and their need to balance their work and family responsibilities. There are often stereotypical gender roles and expectations that relate to women, as well as a resistance to real transformation of the workplace due to male resistance and prejudices. Covert discrimination such as a reluctance to accommodate and support women employees is a common trait of occupations, as is the lack of written gender policies and gender-based education material (Madikizela & Haupt, 2009).

1.3.4 GENDER EQUALITY

Gender equality legislation can be traced back to the Charter of the United Nations in 1945 and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), which in turn influenced the adoption of gender equality legislation at the level of national states.

There are various definitions of gender equality. Dorius and Firebaugh (2010, cited in Sinden, 2017) describe gender equality as the even distribution ratios of females and males in characteristics such as life expectancy, education, labour force, political and economic wealth. They further contend that the participation of women in economic activities outside their homes can assist them to achieve political and social liberation. They link women who work outside of their homes to attributes such as greater self-confidence, independence, influence over families, awareness about health and enhanced social activities (Dorius & Firebaugh, 2010, cited in Sinden, 2017).

In order to eradicate the discrimination that South African women were subjected to for decades, the South African government introduced various legislation including Act 108 of 1996 of the South African Constitution, the Employment Equity Act of 1998, the Commission

on Gender Equality Act of 1996 as well as the National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality (2000).

1.4 RESEARCH QUESTION

The main question of the study was: What are the experiences of black African women apprentices on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes?

1.5 AIM AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

Primary aims

To explore the experiences of black African women apprentices on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes

Secondary objectives

- To explore the experiences of black African women at the TLMA of the instructors.
- To explore the experiences of instructors with women apprentices in their classes and workshops.

1.6 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The research study was a qualitative study that used an explorative case study design. The sampling method used was purposive sampling that consisted of twelve cisgender women participants between the ages of twenty to thirty five years old, all of which were registered as apprentices at the TLMA in the City of Tshwane. A focus group using a focus group topic guide was employed to collect data from the twelve participants. In addition, face to face interviews were conducted with four cisgender male key informants who were employed as Instructors at the TLMA and were between thirty to sixty years of age. The interviews were guided by an interview schedule. The data was analysed using a thematic analysis method following which the data was clustered into themes and sub-themes.

1.7 LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH STRATEGY, DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The strengths of the research design lay in the use of a mixed methods approach which allowed for the experiences of women apprentices and the views of instructors to be explored. The weaknesses of the research centred on the data not demonstrating the intersectionality between race and gender. Because white women were not part of this study, the intersectionality with race was not fully explored. A further explanation for this limitation may be that black African women apprentices felt uncomfortable talking about race with a white researcher. In order to obviate this limitation, the researcher developed a good rapport with many apprentices on campus during the course of the year that the study was conducted, by including them in social work education groups she implemented at the institution. Nevertheless, the findings provide a good indication of the experiences of black African women apprentices.

1.8 CHAPTER OUTLINE FOR THE RESEARCH REPORT

Chapter 1: Introduction – this chapter provides an overview of the study. It includes the background and introduction to the study as well as an explanation of the research problem.

Chapter 2: Literature Review and Theoretical Framework – this chapter consists of an overview of the rationale for technical training in the context of South Africa, with a focus on women entering these training programmes. Furthermore, it provides a background to traditional male-dominated occupations and the challenges that women accessing these sectors encounter. It also includes a discussion on intersectionality as a framework for analysing this study.

Chapter 3: Research Approach, Design and Methodology – this chapter describes the research methodology that was adopted for this study, as well as the ethical considerations made. It explains how the data was analysed as well as the benefits of the pre-tests that were conducted.

Chapter 4: Findings and Discussion – the chapter provides a detailed analysis of the data using themes and sub-themes. It further links the findings to theory and the aims/objectives of this study.

Chapter 5: Conclusions and Recommendations – this chapter presents conclusions of the study and provides recommendations to the institution where the study took place.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW & THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 LITERATURE REVIEW

International research on the enrolment of women apprentices on male-dominated vocational training programmes indicates that enrolment rates have traditionally been very low. Roghuram (2008, cited in Martin & Barnard, 2013) contends that a focus on women in male-dominated occupations is critically important because of the negative social and personal consequences women face in these institutions. Within the South African context, the unemployment rate for black female youth (NEETs – Not in employment, education or training) is 33.2%, making them the most vulnerable group of unemployed persons (Statsa, 2018). The National Planning Commission (2012) through the National Development Plan: Vision 2030 (NDP), has identified workplace training and work-integrated learning (apprenticeships) as central to its plan to create 11 million jobs and reduce unemployment to 6% by 2020 (National Planning Commission, 2012). With a target of 30 000 qualified artisans to be trained by 2030 (NDP, p. 277), the NDP recognises that apprenticeships and learnerships are key levers for school leavers to break out of poverty and narrow the socioeconomic inequality gaps that exist in the country (Badenhorst & Radile, 2018).

The term “artisan” is defined as a person who is skilled at practicing a particular trade or handicraft, which has become regulated and formalised by a guild or formal association. Furthermore, the training of artisans includes an apprenticeship consisting of 3 years of vocational training covering theoretical instruction and practicals, as well as extensive structured workplace learning. An artisan-in-training is referred to as an apprentice, and within the South African context, is associated with skilled manual workers involved in manufacturing and other technical sectors (Wildschut & Mbatha, 2016). Traditionally, apprenticeships were only available in male-dominated craft and engineering trades and occupations, and within the South African context, open only to white men up until the 1970s. Black African men were allowed to become apprentices following the promulgation of the Manpower Training Act of 1981, which was coupled with the development of vocational schools and training centres for black African men.

The historical characteristics of the apprentice system in South African prior to 1994, “ relate to its exploitative history and links to slavery, its use as a social engineering tool, its association with a limited set of trades and technical occupations, and its low status in comparison to professional work and qualifications” (Wedekind 2013, cited in Wildschut & Meyer, 2018, p.4).

Several international and South African studies in the past two decades (Agapiou, 2002; Dainty, Bagilhole & Neale, 2000; Fielden, Davidson, Gale & Davey, 2000; Martin & Barnard, 2013) have explored the under-representation of women in traditional male-dominated occupations and training programmes wherein they highlight several mitigating factors against more women participating in these occupations. A popular and generally accepted stereotype of trades is the physical strength, the ability to perform dirty work and a tolerance for locker room culture (Denissen, A, 2010; Fielden et al., 2000; Haupt & Madikizela, 2009).

The issue of biological differences between men and women often plays out in the context of women’s struggles to achieve equality in the workplace. Women’s physical size and strength differences are often considered to make them unsuitable for trade work which has traditionally been performed by men (Messing, Lippel, Demers & Mergler, 2000). Furthermore, women’s reproductive systems that enable only women to menstruate, become pregnant, breastfeed babies and experience menopause, pose specific issues in male-dominated work environments.

The use of “bad language” or swearing is cited by Faulkner (2009) as being part of “men’s space” where some men feel pressurised to conform to certain macho masculinities, and in the process marginalise and offend women colleagues. However, from an African cultural perspective, the use of profanity is a taboo and is often considered to be uncivilized, disrespectful and inappropriate (Madadzhe, 2000).

The culture of organisations is important to understanding how people interact and act in these spaces (Greenwood, 1997) with gender being a critical aspect of organisational culture (Ledwith & Colgan, 1996). In a UK study, Itzin (1984, cited in Agapiou, 2002, p. 699) describes traditional organisational cultures as “hierarchical; patriarchal; sex-segregated; sexually divided; sexist; misogynistic; resistant to change; and to contain gendered power

structures”. In a South African study by Barnard and Martin (2013) on the challenges women experience in accessing and persevering in historically male-dominated environments, gender hierarchies present in the family and society are identified as being key obstacles.

Burawoy (1979) describes “blue collar” (skilled tradespeople) workers as giving consent to the practice of norms and values that are synonymous with production line culture. This process is part of an organisational assimilation process which Burawoy (1979) highlights as the reason why artisans / blue collar workers work under very monotonous and unpleasant work conditions. Jablin and Krone (1987, p. 712, cited in Gibson & Papa, 2000) define organisational assimilation as “those ongoing behavioural and cognitive process by which individuals join, become integrated into, and exit organisations”. Within the TLMA, the instructors all come out of traditional blue collar backgrounds and have “a set of expectations and beliefs concerning how people communicate in particular occupations and work settings” (Jablin, 1982, p. 680, cited in Gibson and Papa, 2000). The use of bad language by some instructors is an example of this.

Kronsell (2005) notes that knowledge gained from women accessing traditionally male-dominated institutions provides valuable insight into the field of hegemonic masculinity where norms, values and practices exclusive to men, have historically been produced and recreated within these institutions (Connell, 1998). Whilst not always overtly expressed, hegemonic masculinity has become the norm in many of these institutions. Hicks (2012, cited in Martin & Barnard, 2013) highlights the “invisible” or covert aspects of male-dominated institutional culture that sometimes pay lip service to women’s empowerment but in reality continue to marginalise women. A South African study (Alves & English, 2018) on graduate women engineers at UCT explores the authenticity of their inclusion in traditional male-dominated workplaces and raises questions about tokenism versus authentic inclusion.

To cope in these occupations women respond in various ways, viz.: 1) they behave like men in order to fit in; 2) they reject the culture of the workplace and have to leave; or 3) they choose not to behave like men and become marginalised (Bennet, Davidson & Gale, 1999; Madikizela & Haupt, 2009). While women in male-dominated and blue-collar occupations experience more prevalent and aggressive forms of sexual misconduct (Denissen 2010; Gutek & Morasch, 1982; Ragins & Scandura, 1995), research indicates that women in these fields

are not necessarily more likely to label these experiences as ‘sexual harassment’, and in fact interpret and respond to crossing the line in different ways (Dennissen, 2010) e.g. they would use informal relief and remedial responses instead of formal and legalistic routes. Dellinger and Williams highlight how the meaning of behaviours, such as sexual harassment, are “shaped by organizational culture” (2002, p. 244, cited in Denissen, 2010), reinforcing the notion that workplaces and work cultures are not gender neutral. Alves and English (2018) found that sexism in South African construction workplaces is rife, with women engineering students often dealing with this by not “feeding the fire” – the onus in navigating sexism therefore often falls onto the woman student when in reality corrective action should be systematic and supported by male colleagues.

It is unsurprising that technical apprenticeship programmes are associated with gendered patterns of participation, as “social attitudes, values, educational contents and methods, as well as social and occupational conditions influence gendered preferences and choices of occupations” (Genderqual, 2003, cited in Fuller, Beck & Unwin, 2005, p. 299). Moreover, in countries like Germany, Austria and Switzerland where the apprentice system is embedded in a broad range of sectors, there is little evidence to indicate that females and males are crossing occupational gender barriers (Smith & Keating, 1997, cited in Fuller et al., 2005).

Fuller et al. (2005) highlight further that male-dominated apprenticeships continue to attract greater interest from men than from women, because of the obstacles women face when they make non-traditional career choices. These include feeling isolated, workplace conditions and being teased. Because of the strong demand from men for technical apprenticeship places at training centres and in industry, there is little incentive for employers to reform their recruitment practices to attract more women onto technical apprenticeships (Fuller et al., 2005).

Young people’s occupational choices and influences are invariably located in their informal circle of family and friends (Fuller et al., 2005). As a result, in communities, schools and environments where there is limited crossing or questioning of traditional occupational boundaries, young people’s career aspirations remain highly gendered and traditional.

In South Africa, TVET colleges and municipalities are the feeder institutions for technical apprenticeships. Evidence of attempts by these institutions to challenge occupational stereotyping is limited. The gendered dimensions of technical apprenticeships are not fully being addressed through guidance, careers advice and the curriculum. In addition, there is little indication, both in South Africa and globally, of occupational segregation and gender stereotyping being addressed fully at an institutional or policy level (Fuller et al., 2005).

In exploring the experiences of women apprentices on traditional apprenticeships, the researcher situated the study within the TLMA, a municipal vocational training centre in the City of Tshwane (Pretoria), where there are equal numbers of women and men apprentices, most of whom are black African. Apprentices at the TLMA are employed by the CTMM for a period of eighteen months and are provided with a salary of two thousand three hundred Rands per month, demonstrating the employer's commitment to the apprentices. During this time, apprentices spend time in classrooms (theory), workshops (practicals) and on-site work depots within the various technical departments of the CTMM. This study aimed to explore the experiences of black African women apprentices within this setting.

2.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This research used an Intersectionality framework which is a theory developed by black feminist theorist Kimberle Crenshaw (1989), to describe the overlapping and intersecting effects that different forms of discrimination, such as racism and sexism, have on the lives of black women's employment experiences in the USA. More broadly applied, Intersectionality explains how different systemic conditions change over time, place and circumstance to work together to reproduce conditions of inequality (AWID, 2009; Morris & Bunyun, 2007; Siltanent, J, 2005). In applying this theory to the context of this study, intersectionality provided a lens to better understand the experiences of black African women apprentices, and how their dual identities as women and black African people, influences their experiences. An intersectional framework situated the participants' in the social, cultural and historical norms of the institution, and shed light on their dual identities that either enabled or hampered them from participating fully in all aspects of their apprenticeships.

The vast majority of apprentices (women and men) at the institution live in townships situated within the CTMM, with most being part of households that are registered with the CTMM as “Indigent”. The National Framework for Municipal Indigent Policy Framework of 2005 defines the term “indigent” as lacking the necessities of life (Leburu, 2017) i.e.: a person or family unable to pay for municipal services. The CTMM’s Indigent policy provides Indigent households with a basket of free basic municipal services including water, sanitation, electricity, refuse removal and burials (Leburu, 2017). Furthermore, the CTMM’s Indigent Exist Strategy extends capacity building and employment opportunities to indigent beneficiaries to become self-sustaining. Part of this exit strategy is admission to indigent beneficiaries who qualify academically, to this municipal training centre.

CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH APPROACH, DESIGN & METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter describes the research approach and design of this study. It elaborates on the criteria that were used to select the participants for the study, as well as the methods of sampling that were used. This chapter describes how the data was collected and the instruments that were used in collecting the data. It describes the pre-tests (focus group and interviews) that were conducted before the data was collected from the participants and key informants, as well as the methods used to collect and analyse the data.

3.2 RESEARCH QUESTION

What are the experiences of black African women apprentices on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes?

3.2.1 PRIMARY AIM

To explore the experiences of black African women apprentices on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes.

3.2.2 SECONDARY OBJECTIVES

- To explore the experiences of black African women at the TLMA of instructors with regards to them being women on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships.
- To explore the experiences of instructors with women apprentices in their classes and workshops.

3.3 RESEARCH STRATEGY AND DESIGN

Research design is the link between the research question and the data that was collected, the method of this collection, the subject from whom the data was collected and interpreted to yield answers (Punch, 2004).

This study made use of qualitative research as it allowed the researcher to gain insight into the experiences of black African women apprentices in their training environment. Yin (2011) describes a qualitative approach as one in which the researcher seeks to engage with participants in their real worlds with the aim of gaining a deeper understanding of their everyday lives and roles. Burton (2000, cited in Vermeulen, 2009) notes further that utilising a qualitative design enables the researcher to explore the social processes within human relationships, and not just view a “snapshot” of the participant’s life. A qualitative approach to the study therefore highlighted the experiences of women apprentices in their physical and social (attitudes, participation and integration) environments at the institution. It also enabled the researcher to explore the attitudes and practices of instructors towards this cohort of apprentices.

The researcher adopted an exploratory case study approach to the research. The aim of case study research is to “conduct an in-depth analysis of an issue, within its context, with a view to understanding the issue from the perspective of the participants” (Merriam, 2009; Simons, 2009, Stake, 2006, Yin, 2014 cited in Harrison, Birks, Franklin & Mills, 2017, p. 12). Exploratory studies, like case studies, enable researchers to address a wide range of issues that ask why, what and how (Harrison et al., 2017), and provide a rich understanding of behaviours, processes, practices and relationships in context. Case studies also provide the flexibility of accommodating researchers’ diverse philosophical positions (Harrison et al., 2017). Methods used in case studies include observations, interviews, focus groups and document analysis (Merriam, cited in Harrison et al., 2017).

Exploratory studies are often conducted when there is limited research available on the topic being studied. In South Africa, where limited research has been conducted on women apprentices, an exploratory case study was the most suitable methodology to use. It provided valuable insights into the experiences of woman apprentices and better informed traditional male-dominated vocational training institutions on best practices regarding women apprentices.

3.4 POPULATION, SAMPLE AND SAMPLING

Sampling is defined as the process of selecting a portion of a population for a specific study (Mark, 1996, cited in Vermeulen, 2009). This study used purposive sampling, which according to De Vos, Strydom, Fouche & Delpont (2005), is a way of sampling that is determined by the researcher according to the characteristics required from a specific group for the study. The researcher selected black African women apprentices at the institution as a sample group for this study.

3.4.1 INCLUSION CRITERIA

- Black African, cisgender women apprentices who were enrolled on 3 year apprenticeships at the institution (1st, 2nd or 3rd year). Cisgender women are women whose gender identity matches the sex that they were assigned at birth. Participants were provided with a blank box on the form they filled their demographic details on, allowing them to use a non-binary category to describe their gender.

3.4.2 EXCLUSION CRITERIA

- Cisgender male apprentices. Cisgender males are men whose gender identity is the same as the sex they were assigned at birth
- Management at the institution

The sample population consisted of twelve black African cisgender women apprentices who were enrolled on various apprenticeships at the institution. The inclusion criteria was that they were all black African cisgender women who lived within the City of Tshwane, and were currently employed as apprentices on one of several technical apprenticeship programmes offered at the research site. They all lived in either one of the City of Tshwane's townships or in the Central Business District (CBD) of the City of Tshwane, and in order to qualify for admission onto the TLMA apprenticeship programme, would have completed an N2 qualification in their chosen trade field. The vast majority of apprentices (women and men) at the institution live in households that are registered with the CTMM as "Indigent". The National Framework for Municipal Indigent Policy Framework of 2005 defines the term "indigent" as lacking the necessities of life (Leburu, 2017) i.e.: unable to pay for municipal

services. The CTMM's Indigent policy provides these households a basket of free basic municipal services including water, sanitation, electricity, refuse removal and burials (Leburu, 2017). The advantage of this sample was that it was a homogenous sample in terms of race (black African), gender (cis female), class (working class) and education level. It is important to note that the institution was open to applicants from all race and gender groups, but in the case of women, only black African women apply to the institution (J. Davies, personal communication, 9 October, 2018). A disadvantage in this case was that only the experiences of black African cisgender women apprentices were explored. Should there have been women apprentices from coloured, Indian or white communities or the transgender community enrolled at the institution, their experiences may have been different to those of black African cisgender women

Instructors at the TMLA requested the names of 10 women apprentices to volunteer for to be part of the focus group. The names of 10 Black African women apprentices who had indicated an interest in participating in the focus group, were forwarded to the researcher. The instructors arranged for the ten participants to be present at the focus group on the day scheduled to run the group. On the day of the focus group, 2 additional apprentices requested to be part of the group, and were included in the focus group discussions.

A sample of four key informants, namely instructors, was randomly selected by management, and interviewed regarding their experiences of instructing black African woman apprentices on their apprenticeships. Management chose the instructors from different trades who were also available to on the day that the researcher had scheduled the interviews. The researcher as mindful of the fact that most senior instructors at the institution were white, and that apprentices from race groups other than white may have different experiences at the institution than their white counterparts have. All instructors were provided with an information sheet regarding the purpose of the research before their interviews.

3.5 RESEARCH INSTRUMENTATION

In-depth interviews using a semi structured interview guide, and a focus group using a topic guide were used in this study to allow for complex questions to be explored and for opinions to be shared that are not always possible with questionnaires. Sensitive issues around sexism

are better explored through interview schedules. Denzin and Petch (1999, cited in Vermeulen, 2009) recognizes that interviews allow for transactions and conversations to take place between the researcher and participant.

A focus group topic guide was used in the focus group to assist the researcher explore the experiences of women apprentices. Focus groups allow for a more nuanced and textured interpretation of data, particularly with a homogenous group of participants (Vasileiou, Barnett, Thorpe & Young, 2018).

Research Tool 1: Focus group schedule for twelve black African women apprentices:

The focus group topic guide (see attached Appendix C) acted as a guide for the researcher in the focus group, and focused on the experiences of these apprentices as Black African women on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships.

Research Tool 2: In-depth interview schedule for instructors:

The in-depth interview schedule focused on the experiences of a sample of four instructors of black African women apprentices, (see attached Appendix D). It explored gender-specific obstacles women encountered during their apprenticeships, and measures taken by instructors to encourage the full participation of women. An interview schedule was used in individual face-to-face interviews.

Pre-testing of the research tool:

The in-depth interview schedule was pre-tested with an instructor who was not part of the research sample to ensure that the questions were clear and easily understood, and fitted into the allocated time period of 30 minutes (De Vos, 1998, cited in Vermeulen, 2009).

The focus group topic guide was pre-tested with a black African women apprentice to ensure that the questions and topics were clear and easily understood.

3.6 METHODS OF DATA COLLECTION

This study made use of a focus group in conjunction with face-to-face semi-structured interviews with the aim of obtaining both in-depth (interviews) and broad (focus groups)

research results (Irwin, 1970, cited in Morgan, 1997). This enabled the researcher to gather richer perceptions, information, experiences and an understanding of this topic (Webster, 1992), as well as establish a convergence of evidence where information from different sources pointed to the same conclusion (Johnson, 2006; Yip, 1994).

Schurink and Schurink (1998, cited in Zengele, 2007, p. 2) define focus groups as a “purposive discussion of a topic or related topics taking place between nine to twelve people with similar backgrounds and common interests”. It is a method that includes both verbal and non-verbal communication, as well as the interaction of perceptions and opinions of participants. It is an important method for obtaining insights and perceptions of people in an atmosphere of dynamic group interaction (De Vos, 2002), and as such, has the advantage of giving a “voice to marginalised groups” (Morgan, 1997, p. 133) and empowering clients (Magill, 1993, cited in Morgan, 1997). Furthermore, focus groups provide the space for participants to question and explain themselves to each other (Morgan, 1996).

De Vos, Strydom, Fourche & Delport (2005) contend that interviewing is the predominant mode of data collection in qualitative research. Face-to-face interviews were conducted with a sample of four instructors using semi-structured interview guides. Open-ended questions were used in these interviews to obtain data about participant meanings and how they made sense of events at the institution (McMillan & Schumacker, 1993). Babbie and Mouton (2002) explain that open-ended questions provide the researcher a greater level of flexibility to obtain information that requires deeper probing. The interview schedule was framed to establish the narrative from the position of the participant. Instructors were asked similar questions pertaining to instructing (teaching) women apprentices in their classes and workshops, and at the institution. Semi-structured interviews provided a measure to produce valid and reliable data. As the researcher was not employed with the institution, she spent time informally with instructors and management in the workplace in order to familiarise herself with them and to develop trust and rapport. This enhanced the interview process.

3.7 METHODS OF DATA ANALYSIS

Data analysis is the search for patterns in data (Neuman, 1997). Collected data must be organised and interpreted correctly to identify key findings in the research. The data analysis

was conducted by using thematic analysis. Cresswell's four stage data analysis spiral was used in this study (Cresswell, 1998), namely:

Stage one: The researcher organised data in several forms e.g. databases, sentences or individual words; "lifting gearboxes", "heavy things".

Stage two: The researcher scanned sets of data numerous times to develop a comprehensive picture and overview of the whole. During this process, the researcher made notes and summaries of the key points that were possible categories or interpretations e.g.: "physical work", "toilets" and "periods".

Stage three: The researcher identified general categories or themes and classified them accordingly. This assisted in identify patterns and meanings for the data e.g.: physiological barriers, structural barriers, occupational barriers.

Stage four: The researcher focused on integrating and summarising the data, and developing hypotheses that identified relationships amongst the categories identified by the researcher. The data summary was represented in a table, figure or matrix diagram.

3.8 TRUSTWORTHINESS

In order to ensure trustworthiness of a qualitative study, it is important for researchers to establish that their studies' findings are credible, transferable, confirmable and dependable (Shenton, 2004).

Credibility (internal validity) indicates how true the research findings are and establishes that the research measures that it claims to measure are valid (Shenton, 2004). The use of more than one kind of research tool (triangulation) also assists in ensuring that the research is credible (Shenton, 2004). Credibility in this study was demonstrated by the researcher exploring the experiences of black African women apprentices through the use of both interviews and a focus group (triangulation).

Transferability (external validity) refers to how research findings in one setting are applicable to other findings in similar contexts (Shenton, 2004). The rate of transferability is increased by using purposeful sampling where rich data is obtained from participants (Shenton, 2004). Rich

data is obtained from participants who share most of the characteristics of the population being studied. By focusing on black African women apprentices who come out of the same socio-economic and educational backgrounds, the researcher expected similar results if the study was repeated in a different technical training institution.

Confirmability is the degree to which the researcher is able to remain neutral and objective in interpreting responses of participants. The researcher kept an audit trail highlighting every step of the data analysis process that provided a rationale for decisions made in the interpretation of data. In addition, by using triangulated data, confirmability was enhanced.

Dependability refers to the extent to which another researcher will produce similar findings to the research should the study be repeated (Shenton, 2004). The researcher used an outside person to do an inquiry audit review and examine the research processes and methodology, which increased the rate of dependability of this study.

3.9 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

De Vos et al. (2005, p.57) defines ethics for research as “a set of moral principles which is suggested by an individual or, a group, is subsequently widely accepted, and which offers rules and behavioural expectations about the most correct conduct towards experimental subjects and respondents, employers, sponsors, other researchers, assistants and students.”

The five principles of ethics used in this study were (De Vos et al., 2005):

3.9.1. Non-maleficence

This ethical principal recognizes that no harm should come to participants as a result of their participation in a research project (Gelling, 2015). Some women apprentices at the institution may have experienced sexual harassment in the workplace, and sharing emotional information with the researcher may have left them feeling vulnerable. The researcher gave respondents who felt vulnerable the option of being referred to the EAP Department at the City of Tshwane for counselling. This department usually extends services to employees only, but arrangements were made for this service to be extended to apprentices during the course of this research project. The EAP department is situated in a different part of Tshwane, so confidentiality was ensured.

3.9.2. *Voluntary participation*

Voluntary participation is an ethical consideration that refers to a person exercising free will when approached to participate in a research study, and deciding whether or not to participate in the research activity (De Vos et al., 2005). Participants in this study were made aware that their participation was voluntary and they were free to withdraw from the study at any point in the process.

3.9.3. *Informed consent*

Informed consent infers that participants must “knowingly, voluntarily and intelligently, and in a clear and manifest way, give (her/his) consent” (Armiger, 1997, cited in Fouka & Mantzorou, 2011, p.4). Prospective voluntary participants have the right to know that they are being researched, and must be fully informed about procedures / purposes of the study as well as the potential risks and benefits thereof. Butler (2002) contends that informed consent must be secured through the use of language that is readily comprehensible to the research subject and which accurately and adequately explains the purpose of the research and the procedures to be followed. This study was conducted in English, and participants were assisted to better understand the consent form if they did not understand the content fully. English is the medium of instruction at the institution, and was the language of choice during the study.

3.9.4. *Confidentiality*

Confidentiality refers to the processes whereby information collected from individual participants during a research study can only be identified by the researcher or research team and not traced back to individual respondents (De Vos et al. , 2005). The researcher ensured that no one outside of the study connected individual subjects to their responses, and used pseudonyms to reduce this risk.

Focus group participants were briefed on the importance of confidentiality and not discussing information discussed in the group discussions outside of the group. A confidentiality clause in the consent form was included for all focus group participants to sign. Interviews took place in offices at the institution and the focus group was held in a neutral meeting room.

3.9.5. Anonymity

Anonymity was upheld by not using any identifying information from individual participants e.g.: names, addresses, phone numbers or email addresses (De Vos et al., 2005). Good research practice requires that a researcher should not collect identifying information of research participants unless it is essential to the study. Pseudonyms were used in this research project to ensure anonymity, and the names of places and any other identifying information were changed.

3.10 LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH STRATEGY, DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

This study focused specifically on black African woman apprentices, and only reflected the views of this cohort of women. Other municipal training facilities may have women apprentices from other race groups whose experiences of being part of a traditionally male-dominated technical training institution may be different to this cohort. Furthermore, this study only looked at the experiences of cisgender women, and did not include transgender women. As a result, their experiences of transgender women were not reflected in this study.

While the researcher does not come from a technical training background, extensive discussions with TVET and technical training professionals, as well as familiarisation with South African and international literature reviews, have assisted the researcher in gaining a solid understanding of this topic.

The researcher audio recorded all focus group discussions and face-to-face interviews. One participant was reluctant to have the interview processes audio recorded, so the researcher took notes. Confidentiality and the use of pseudonyms mitigated these issues.

As a white English-speaking researcher conducting research with a cohort of black African apprentices, the ability to communicate in-depth and effectively with participants may be considered to be a limitation. Mitigating factors however included apprentices being taught in English during their apprenticeships and at TVET colleges, as well as the researcher's strong facilitation skills. The choice of a focus group allowed the researcher to build on the group dynamics to explore issues in context, with depth and detail, freely without imposing any

conceptual framework compared with a structured individual interview (Nyumba, Wilson, Derrick & Makherjee, 2018).

Participants in focus groups are sometimes reluctant to discuss sensitive issues in a group. By being aware of this, the researcher was able to plan and frame the group discussion questions in a more sensitive way (Nyumba et al., 2018).

The nature of focus groups cannot guarantee confidentiality. The researcher briefed participants about the importance of confidentiality and requested them not to repeat what was said in the focus group discussions to others. Focus group participants all signed a confidentiality clause on their consent forms.

Interviews took place in an office at the institution's campus. In order to increase anonymity for focus group participants, the focus group was held in a neutral meeting room. In order to ensure confidentiality and anonymity, participants remained anonymous and pseudonyms were used to protect their identities.

As some women apprentices at the institution may previously have experienced sexual harassment, sharing emotional information with the group may have left them feeling vulnerable. The researcher explained to participants that if they felt vulnerable during the focus group discussion, she could have referred them to the EAP department at Head Office for debriefing. In the event of this happening, the researcher had made arrangements to refer participants to the EAP department.

CHAPTER 4

DISCUSSION AND SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

4.1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents findings of the data collected in this research study, and offers a discussion of these findings. The findings are presented in two sections viz: the first section provides demographic information on participants (apprentices and instructors), and the second section focuses on the data collected from these participants. Each of these sections is divided into findings for apprentices and findings for instructors. The researcher chose to list findings for both groups in order to triangulate or “map out, and explain more fully the richness and complexities” (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2000, p. 254) of the apprentice’s experiences.

The data is presented and discussed according to specific themes that were identified as the researcher transcribed the interviews and focus group discussions. Themes that emerged from the data were colour-coded and highlighted according to how they answered the research questions and the underlying theoretical framework. During the final stages of coding, sub-themes emerged. Both the themes and sub-themes were discussed in relation to the women’s experiences, and where relevant, views of instructors are described in relation to these experiences.

Throughout the study, the researcher was mindful of drawing conclusions from the experiences of the research participants instead of her own personal experiences or biases.

4.2 DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION

4.2.1. DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION OF WOMEN APPRENTICES

Table 1: Racial group of apprentices (N=12)

Racial Group	Number
Black African	12
Total	12

All participants were black African, Cisgender women.

Table 2: Age distributions of participants (N=12)

Age Group	Number
20-24 yrs.	4
25 – 30 yrs.	6
31-35 yrs.	2
Total	12

Half (6) of the participants are between 25-30 yrs. of age, followed by 4 who are 20 - 24 years of age, and 2 that are between 31 – 35 years of age.

Global research indicates that women apprentices are usually older than men apprentices due to women changing careers and then entering trade apprenticeships. At the TLMA however, the age distribution among women and men apprentices is similar. The reason for the concentration of women apprentices in the 25-30 year age range is as a result of apprentices

needing to complete N2 qualifications in their chosen trades after completing matric, before being accepted onto an apprenticeship at the research site.

Table 3: Year of study distributions of apprentices (N=12)

Year of Apprenticeship	Number
1 st	3
2 nd	8
3 rd	1
Total	12

Table 3 indicates the breakdown of the year of study that participants are in. The majority of participants (8) are in the 2nd year of their apprenticeships, followed by 3 who are in 1st year and 1 who is in her 3rd year.

Table 4: Distributions of type of apprenticeships of participants (N=12)

Type of Apprenticeship	Number
Welding	1
Motor mechanics (petrol / diesel)	7
Boiler making	4
Total	12

The apprenticeships in which the participants were enrolled were traditional technical apprenticeships that are 3 years in duration. 7 participants were on motor mechanics (petrol or diesel) apprenticeships, 4 are on boiler making apprenticeships, and 1 was on a welding apprenticeship.

4.2.2 DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION OF INSTRUCTORS

Table 5: Gender distributions of instructors (N=4)

Gender	Number
Male	4
Female	0
Other	0
Total	4

All instructors sampled identify as Cisgender male.

Table 6: Racial group distributions of instructors (N=4)

Racial Group	Number
Black African	1
White	3
Total	4

1 instructor was Black African and 3 were white.

Table 7: Age distributions of instructors (N=4)

Age Group	Number
30 – 35 yrs.	1
55 – 60 yrs.	3
Total	4

3 of the instructors were between 55 – 60 years of age, and 1 was between 30 – 35 years of age.

The white instructors (3) are between the 51-60 years of age, and the black African instructor (1) was between 30 – 40 years of age.

Table 8: Distribution of highest qualifications of instructors (N=4)

Qualifications of instructors	Number
National Diploma (N6) and qualified Competency Training Officers	4
Total	4

All four instructors had the same qualifications, viz: National Diplomas (N6) in their respective trades and were qualified Competency Training Officers.

4.3 FINDINGS

4.3.1. FINDINGS OF APPRENTICES

After formulating different codes from the data, several themes and sub-themes were identified. These themes and sub-themes are indicated in tables 9 and 10, and are divided into “apprentices” and “instructor” themes and sub-themes.

Table 9: Themes and sub-themes for women apprentices

Themes – Apprentices	Sub-themes
Physiological barriers	Physical strength of women apprentices
	Marginalisation
	Menstruation
Structural barriers	Ablution facilities
Occupational barriers	Use of strong language / Swearing
Institutional Recruitment Practices	No women instructors and role models

Technical trades that artisans and apprentices are part of are typically male-dominated and therefore present challenges for women apprentices to access equal opportunities (Amaratunga, Haigh, Lee, Shanmugan & Elvitigalage, 2006). This chapter highlights the key themes that women apprentices identified as challenges for them at the TLMA.

4.3.1.1 Physiological barriers

Physiological barriers are identified as barriers that women face as a result of the gender stereotypes that women don’t have the “brute strength” (Amaratunga et al., 2006, p.562) and physical capabilities required to do physical work.

4.3.1.1.1 Physical strength of women

A dominant theme highlighted by all participants was the view that women apprentices are as capable as their male counterparts in performing “physically demanding” manual work. All participants viewed themselves as being equal to men in their abilities to perform in their chosen trades, and disagreed with the stereotype that women are physically incapable of performing in manual trade work`.

A 2nd year participant was emphatic that:

“We (women) were raised or told that this (task), a woman can do this (task), a woman cannot do this. I don’t believe this is true.” (C)

This finding corresponds with research on women artisans who do not experience difficulties with the physical aspects of their manual jobs (Eisenburg, 1998; Lewis, 2004; Martin, 1998; Scripps, 2004; Shewring, 2009), despite the commonly held discriminatory attitude that women do not have the physical strength to do physical jobs in male-dominated employment areas. While the average woman has smaller muscle mass than the average man, and can lift lighter weights than a man does, this does not preclude her from performing physical trade work, which requires a variety of skills.

Several participants explained how the use of hoists (lifting aids) and the increasing use of machinery in manual occupations made it easier for women to perform tasks that traditionally were perceived to be too heavy for women to do. The participants further emphasised that women approach heavy tasks in a different way to men in order to complete the task. Winning (1996) makes reference to how women artisans in the construction industry find different ways to deal with heavy tasks in order to produce the same end result without the need for brute strength e.g.: working in teams. Messing et al (2000, p. 27) expounds on this view to dispel the myth that absolute strength is the only “bona fide occupational requirement” required in physical jobs; skills such as judgement, planning and endurance are important components, as well as team work, interpersonal skills and co-ordination.

Messing et al. (2000, p. 26) point out that current strength tests are often convenient instruments for “gatekeeping” traditional male-dominated jobs, and that the safe integration of women into these jobs will necessitate a change in tools, equipment, workplace design as well as work practices.

A 2nd year participant added that:

“No one should be lifting gearboxes out of vehicles only using their backs.” (L)

All participants agreed that men often work in teams when required to lift or manoeuvre very heavy materials, and emphasised that women follow the same process when a task requires physical strength.

A 2nd year participant clarified that:

“It’s not true that men can pick up these heavy things and women can’t.....if they (men) have to pick up a gearbox, it’s not him on his own, it’s the team (of men). If he can do this with his team, why can’t I do this with my team (of women)? (C)

A cooperative and collaborative work style by women is evident from these responses. English and Le Jeune (2012, p. 151) in a South African study note that this style of work by women is a “win-win situation for all stakeholders” as it enhances decision-making and creative solution processes.

Messing et al. (2020) highlight the fact that traditional male-dominated workspaces were designed with the physical characteristics of men in mind. As a result, workbenches are built to a certain height and bags of cement weigh a particular weight “because a judgement has been explicitly or implicitly made about the range of physical characteristics of the working (male) population” (Messing et al., 2000, p. 26). The TLMA workshops, like most others in technical fields, make little adaption to women’s characteristics.

4.3.1.1.2 Marginalisation

Alakhunova, Diallo, del Campo & Tallarica (2015, p. 11) describe marginalisation as “both a process and a condition that prevents individuals and groups from full participation in social, economic and political life”. A multitude of factors such as gender, sexual orientation,

ethnicity, religion or disability can prevent individuals from actively participating in social, economic or political life (UKAiddirect, 2017). Discrimination often leads to certain groups being marginalised (UKAiddirect, 2017). For the purposes of this study, the researcher looked at classroom and workshop experiences of women apprentices at the TLMA.

Five participants from one particular trade reported that women apprentices are not always given the same opportunity as men to perform certain tasks in the workshops.

Participant A stated that:

“With some jobs.....only the guys are included.”

Another participant explained:

“... The guys are busy doing a job, and I will be sent to do photocopies or some paperwork down by the office block.” (D, 1st year)

A participant in this cohort related how women apprentices in this trade “sat around” when the men are busy on a job that the women apprentices are sometimes excluded from, leading them to feel marginalised. One participant commented that women apprentices are sometimes not even allowed to watch their male colleagues working on jobs that they are not included in.

Participant C added that:

“You aren’t even allowed to watch them. If you can be seen to be where they are, you will have some explaining to do.”

Two participants in this trade raised their concerns about not spending as much time working on the machines in the workshop as men do, resulting in this limiting their technical skills development and work experience. They attributed this to their instructor not allowing women apprentices in his class to work on certain machines.

These responses highlight the perceptions and experiences that some women apprentices have of not enjoying the same training opportunities as their male counterparts. Based on interviews with instructors, this is related to the perception that some instructors have of women apprentices not being physically strong enough to do the physical work required of

their trade. This perception correlates with Madikela and Haupt (2010) and English and Le Jeune's (2012) studies where women on construction sites do not feel respected to the same extent as men. It was also noted that the older white instructors are more patriarchal in their approach to women apprentices in their classes which remain structurally and culturally male (English & Hay, 2015).

The experiences of these five women mirror research conducted on African-American women in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) tertiary education, where there is a tendency to "disengage, under-educate, and underutilize women of color at all levels of the academic pipeline" (Charleston, Adserias, Lang & Jackson, 2014, p.276). While this research on African-American women in STEM highlights the intersection of race and gender in the marginalisation of African-American women, the experiences of these five apprentices reflects the role that gender plays in this particular classroom. It also demonstrates the different gender experiences among black African men and women in this classroom.

Participant E commented that:

"After 3 years, you get a trade and experience, but you can't actually use this machine."

In support of this view, two participants expressed their frustration at being dependent on their male colleagues to assist them work with certain machinery, due to the lack of equal opportunities for women apprentices in their particular trade, or because women are perceived to be too slow at completing certain jobs.

L, a 2nd year apprentice stated that:

Normally as ladies we learn to depend on the guys because they spend more time working on the machines, so they know how to work the machines. They know how to adjust them – they know everything about these machines. They know all the tricks. We don't know the tricks.

Another respondent highlighted the importance of allowing women apprentices to complete allocated tasks themselves.

She expressed that:

“Time is scheduled.....sometimes one of the boys decides to help you so that you can finish your work on time, so you don’t really learn anything this way because they (men) do it for you.” (A, 2nd year)

Participant B explained that in order for her to acquire as many skills as possible in her trade, she asserts her right to equality of opportunity by physically moving herself into a group of men apprentices to participate in tasks they have been allocated.

She added that:

“Normally I am the stubborn one...when they give them (men) jobs, I force myself to go and do it with them...I take whatever they are using and I do it with them.”

Seven participants from the other trades represented in this study had different experiences with regards to being given equal opportunities to training in class. They all confirmed that their instructor assigned the same jobs to both women and men, and highlighted that he has even made a special mechanical device to assist women to manoeuvre heavy objects, which the men apprentices also use as it enhances their safety. This approach by the instructor demonstrates his attempt to make some concessions to women that other instructors view as “different”, by him abandoning the idea of what is “normal” in traditional male-dominated trades, to genuinely include women apprentices on his apprenticeship.

The experience of these seven apprentices emphasises the important role that support and inclusion of women by instructors plays in traditionally male-dominated training institutions, and how these interventions enable women to feel more integrated and supported during their apprenticeships.

The five participants, who experienced their instructors as being supportive and inclusive of them in class, did not experience feelings of marginalisation and a limitation on their learning opportunities on their apprenticeships.

In exploring how Black African women’s intersectional identities of race and gender play out here, it was evident from these participants’ experiences that their gender is more of a barrier than their race is because their male counterparts who are all Black African men, don’t experience this level of exclusion.

All participants agreed that the equal allocation of work to women and men apprentices is dependent on their instructor, and not because women can't perform certain tasks.

4.3.1.1.3 Menstruation

Menstruation for some women apprentices, particularly those who suffer from dysmenorrhea (cramps, heavy bleeding, pelvic pain and mood swings), was raised as an important issue for them. According to the American Congress of Obstetricians and Gynecologists (Goldberg, 2016), more than half of women who menstruate experience some pain for up to two days a month.

Negotiating time off with instructors during menstruation was an issue raised by half of the participants (6) as being difficult for them. Apprentices who suffer from dysmenorrhea have to approach instructors to request time off, which they experience as embarrassing and shameful, and in some cases, culturally taboo.

South African research on Black African women indicate that the way in which adolescent girls are prepared for their first menstruation may influence their reaction to it later on in life, as well as the way they view themselves as young women (Ramathuba, 2015). With preparation of young women for menstruation in many African communities lacking due to social and cultural issues, as well as limited information provided to young Black women on the physiological issues pertaining to menstruation, many young Black and Coloured women reported more debilitating and anticipatory attitudes towards menstruation compared with white women (Padmanabhanunni & Fennie, 2017). An intersectional lens assisted the researcher to identify how participant's personal identities as Black African women sometimes informed their attitudes towards menstruation during their apprenticeships

Participant G mentioned that:

"We can't take time off. We have to bring a doctor's note first."

Another participant recalled that:

"Our instructor says this is a workplace. We must work." (E, 2nd year)

Participant E explained that:

“I feel like I should take two days off (a month) or site. I also have low blood so when I have periods, it’s terrible.”

Wadrell and Czerwinski (2001, cited in Van Breda, 2016) describe this process as an “othering” of women: “when men’s needs are defined as the norm, women’s needs – and women themselves – become unessential....abnormal, or.....negative” (p. 188). In Van Breda’s study (2016) on women in the South African military, the othering of women’s needs is highlighted and is compounded in the case of menstruation because it is not always openly discussed between men and women.

It is important to note however, that those apprentices who experience negative aspects of menstruation and had instructors who were approachable and open about discussing menstruation, had an easier time than those who felt their instructors were unapproachable around this issue. This indicates that certain instructors and depot managers are sensitive to the needs of women apprentices and are flexible around giving time off to them during menstruation.

Participant I expressed the view that:

“Our instructor is fine. If you have period pains, he will let you go home.”

She added further that:

“Even at the depots, they tell you that if you have period pains and you don’t feel well, you don’t have to come to work”

Participant G explained that:

“A foreman at the depot told us that we are women and that if we are experiencing any difficulties, we can come to him”

Two participants felt that because menstruation is a monthly occurrence, women apprentices can’t take time off every month. There were strong underpinnings of a desire to carry on with their training, despite menstrual issues (Van Breda, 2016). This view correlates with a view that many feminists grapple with: should women call attention to women’s differences in the workplace where they may serve to strengthen arguments against equality (Messing, 2000).

“The idea that women and men may require different accommodation is regarded as dangerous in the context where women’s right to work is not fully established” (Messing, 2000, p. 38). The ideal situation would be one where working conditions are healthy for women and men apprentices, all of the time.

Participant B noted that:

“It’s not realistic (to take time off) because we have projects to complete.” (B, 2nd year)

Participant K added that:

“In my case, I get heavy pains and stuff and I become miserable and short-tempered. That’s how it is. Life has to go on and I have to be here and continue.”

When asked how best the institution can support women apprentices during menstruation, all participants felt that a SHE box be made available in the women’s toilets for women apprentices. This box should contain sanitary pads, soap and condoms.

Participant F emphasised that:

“Sometimes women feel embarrassed if they don’t bath (wash)”

This comment was made with reference to some women apprentices during their menstruation, where having to manage menstruation in hot and dirty work settings, is uncomfortable and unpleasant.

4.3.1.2 Structural barriers

A structural barrier within the context of this study refers to the physical infrastructure of the buildings and facilities on the TLMA campus that hinder or detract from women apprentices’ full participation on their apprenticeships.

Due to the TLMA previously excluding women from admission, facilities on campus and in the depots were built to accommodate men only. With the admission of women into the academy in 2013, TLMA management upgraded and improved the ablution facilities to accommodate women. While some progress has been made by TLMA management in

upgrading changing and ablution facilities, certain limitations and deficiencies were highlighted in this study.

4.3.1.2.1 Ablution Facilities

The issue of women's toilets was raised by five participants from one of the trades. They all concurred that because the women's toilets are situated outside of their workshop, women are required to walk further than men to use these facilities. One participant expressed the view that this cut into her tea break, while another expressed feeling unsafe using the outside women's toilets because it has a large hole in the ceiling. This appears to be as a result of a recent burglary at the workshop.

Participant H anxiously stated that:

“Sometimes I feel like there is someone up there if I am alone (in the toilet).”

While one participant did not feel safe with the exposed ceiling board in the outside women's toilets, all twelve participants confirmed that they feel safe on the TLMA campus and the depots. This is an important finding within the South African context where many women and black African women in particular, are more likely to experience GBV than other groups. It is noteworthy to emphasise the important role that TMLA management and security have played in this regard to provide a safe-space for women apprentices.

The discussion on toilets and change-rooms led to women joking about having to stand guard for each other outside the men's toilets, which are situated inside the workshops. This measure is to prevent men from walking in on women who sometimes use these toilets instead of walking outside to use the women's toilets. This example demonstrates that black African women apprentices' gender identities become more salient than their racial identities in certain settings (Settles, 2006, cited in Charleston et al., 2014).

The remaining six participants did not feel that it was a problem for them to walk outside to use the women's toilets. This view was a result of these six participants having toilets that are situated nearer to their workshops than the other cohort of participants, who have to walk further to use the ablution facilities.

Five of the participants in one of the trades complained about the outside women's toilets remaining locked until after 08H00 on many mornings, resulting in women apprentices having to change into their boiler suits in the classroom which they share with male apprentices. This becomes difficult as men apprentices often need to enter these classrooms while women are changing. They recommended that the TLMA issue two boiler suits per apprentice instead of one, so that they can change at home instead of in the classrooms.

Participant I requested that:

“We need more overalls (boiler suits). We get home late and you can't wash them (boiler suits) when it's late. We need at least 2 pairs but we only have one pair.”

Seven participants from two trades reported being able to change into their boiler suits at home because their trades aren't as dirty, enabling them to wear their boiler suits on public transport until they wash them over the weekend.

4.3.1.3 Occupational Culture (“Blue Collar culture”)

Occupational culture refers to “a set of expectations and beliefs (about) how people communicate in particular occupations and work settings” (Jabline, 1982, p. 680, cited in Gibson & Pappa, 2000). This study looked at the occupational culture of instructors who are part of manual trades, rather than the culture of the TLMA as an organisation.

4.3.1.3.1 Swearing or the use of “Strong language”

This discussion started off with lots of laughter from all the woman participants.

In reflecting on their instructor's use of language in class/workshops, seven participants remarked that their instructor does not swear in class. The remaining five participants, all from the same trade were visibly surprised to hear this.

Participant D claimed that:

“Swearing is our middle name of our class!”

Participants, who experienced their instructor swearing on a regular basis, indicated that they do not take this behaviour “personally” because it is not directed at individual apprentices, but

at everyone (men and women). One participant however, recalled an incident where a male apprentice took the swearing personally, and *“almost fought with the instructor.”*

When probed further about the use of swearing in the workshops, these seven participants expressed more concern about their instructor shouting (tone) than the use of “bad language.” All of them expressed fear when he shouts, and commented on male apprentices also feeling unsettled by this.

Participant C noted that:

“We know you can’t approach him when he starts swearing and shouting.”

Participant J stated that:

“Everyone wants to know what they have done wrong when he starts shouting.”

Participant G clarified that:

“The problem is not the swearing, it’s his tone”

These findings are in line with findings in the literature that highlight that women in technical trades respond to swearing (“bad language”) in the workplace in different ways. Furthermore they confirmed that women apprentices are not threatened by swearing and have “adjusted” to this aspect of the “culture of the trade”. However, they did report feeling unsettled and threatened by instructors’ shouting during the class and at them, and therefore found the tone of instructors more difficult to deal with rather than the actual swearing. Women apprentices reported that their male colleagues feel as uneasy as they do by instructors who shout in class.

4.3.1.4 Employment Practices

Employment practices in this study refer to the TLMA’s recruitment practice of employing only male instructors. This was an historical practice of the institution prior to 1994, resulting in the current administration being staffed by several instructors who have been employed at the institution for up to twenty years, and are nearing retirement age.

4.3.1.5 Women role models

In introducing the topic of whether or not enrolling more women apprentices at the institution would make it easier for women apprentices to feel included, participants re-phrased the topic by suggesting that having women instructors/mentors would be a more effective way for them to feel included. The process of participants giving voice to their own identities and experiences was facilitated by the open-ended approach of a focus group and the qualitative methods used in this study (Chism & Banta, 2007, cited in Charleston et al., 2014).

There was a strong sense from all participants that women instructors would understand the challenges faced by women apprentices more so than men instructors do:

Participant J stated that:

I for one want a women instructor because I feel she will be able to explain things better in class. We all come from different backgrounds and some of us understand nothing (technical matters). She will start from the bottom. She won't just say this is what we do, do it....deal with it.

She continued by adding that:

She will start from the bottom and not say "do you remember when"... because women don't know anything about those things....she will be patient. She will make sure women understand these things...women just say we understand these things when we don't because we don't want to be seen to be stupid.

Participant G explained that:

I think that women instructors are needed because not everyone is comfortable to talk to men. What happens if we are talking about menstruation? Not everyone will feel comfortable to say 'I am facing this, can I do this and that'. What happens is he (male instructor) takes it in another way...I think a lady instructor will understand more as she has experienced this herself.

Kombo (2004, cited in Madara & Cherotich, 2016) explained that teachers in engineering classes often treat male students with higher considerations and expectations, while female

students in engineering courses are treated with lower expectations and feel intimidated. Women engineering students as a consequence are viewed and treated as incapable.

Charleston et al. (2014, p. 277) noted that African-American women in STEM classes “are apt to experience feelings of alienation ... and underlined the need for institutions to be more mindful of minority student integration and support at all levels of the undergraduate experience, including in the classroom culturally...”.

Two participants mentioned a Women’s Day event at the TLMA where a women technologist spoke to apprentices, and how this was a significant motivator for other women.

Participant L recalled that:

“Every woman was amazed. Imagine seeing someone where you want to be! (Having a women instructor) will give us the drive to push where she is.”

Dennehy and Dasgupta (2017) concluded in their research on women in STEM studies that first year women students who received mentoring from women mentors have more positive outcomes than those women who don’t. Shared identities matter for student retention, as well as women students’ subjective experiences of engineering e.g.: feelings of belonging and self-efficacy. Women mentors also protect women’s feelings of belonging and connection to other peers in engineering, result in women students feeling that their aspirations are supported and promoted.

The overwhelming need for women instructors and role models expressed by all participants is well reflected in the literature. English & Le Jeune (2012), Whittock (2002), and Gale and Cartwright (1995) highlighted the need for more women role models on construction sites in South Africa and the UK, in order for women to have positive role models to aspire to. While the TLMA has a management team that is committed to driving initiatives to enroll and train more women apprentices at the institution, the need exists for more women instructors and gender sensitive male instructors to be employed at the institution. An opportunity for this exists due to the current group of instructors, predominately white males, being close to retirement age.

One participant expressed the view that she sometimes feels that the TLMA enrolls women because they need to fill their BBBEE statistics.

Participant C noted that:

“Sometimes I think that the only reason they hire women apprentices is for stats only. When we are at sites, we hardly see any women (artisans).”

She added further that:

“I feel like stats”

The view expressed by these two participants about only being admitted as apprentices at TLMA in order to meet legislative requirements and not because of their abilities and potential, was linked to them not feeling recognized or taken seriously in their class and workshops (Botha, 2017). This reflects the feelings of marginalisation by some participants due to not fully being included in all activities in the workshops. This view also resonates with the findings of Alves and English’s (2018) South African study on graduate women engineers at UCT which explored the authenticity of their inclusion in traditional male-dominated workplaces, and raised questions about tokenism vs authentic inclusion.

Participant I recalled that:

“In mechanics, there are more women in the depots”

While women artisans are in the minority in many technical work environments in South African industry, the CTMM has made noticeable strides in employing women apprentices when they qualify from the TLMA. As a result, the seven participants from this study who have noticed women artisans working in their municipal depots, disagreed that women apprentices are tokens.

4.3.2 FINDINGS OF INSTRUCTORS (KEY INFORMANTS)

Table 10: Themes and sub-themes for Instructors

Themes	Sub-themes
Physiological barriers	Physical strength of women apprentices Menstruation
Structural barriers	Ablutions
Occupational barriers	Use of strong language / swearing

4.3.2.1 Physiological barriers

Physiological barriers are identified as barriers that women face as a result of the gender stereotypes that women don't have the "brute strength" (Amaratunga et al., 2006, p.562) and physical capabilities required to do physical work.

4.3.2.1.1 Physical demands of trade work on women

Strong views about women's physical strength were raised by instructors when asked about women apprentices and how they perform during their apprenticeships.

Three out of four instructors expressed the view that women struggled with the physical strength requirements of trades, and as a result, were not 100% suited to trade work.

An instructor explained that:

"I try and make them (women apprentices) feel comfortable in my class, however anything that requires physical strength in my trade is difficult for women to do." (Z)

Instructor W stated that:

With theory woman are good, but with practicals, women are disasters...If I could refuse to take women in as apprentices, I would. It's not a job for women...The X trade is not a team sport. You work on your own. You do have what we call "tool boys" to help you, but really two people can't work together in this trade.

The static view of women's lack of physical strength required for trade work concerned instructors more than it did women apprentices, with three out of four instructors being negative about women's ability to perform physical aspects of the job and their ability to handle certain tools and materials. Furthermore, this attitude explains the feeling of marginalisation that some women apprentices experience as a result of instructors not adapting the workplace to their needs. English and Le Jeune's (2012) South African study concurs with these findings.

Within this group of three, two instructors conceded that while women apprentices are not suited to working as artisans in the municipality due to the heavy nature of the work, they are better suited to sectors of their trades that require less physical strength, such as automated manufacturing facilities and domestic settings.

Instructor Z explained that:

"Women can work on your car but not on a bulldozer. It's too heavy for them."

Another instructor noted that:

"Women struggle with the heavy work and 85% of municipal work is heavy work (pylons, poles, big transformers). They are better suited to an automated production facility where you don't have to use physical strength." (X)

One instructor out of the four felt that while some women struggle with some of the physical aspects of his trade, it did not prevent them from being artisans. Women apprentices' attitude towards work was more important than their physical strength. He emphasised the lack of confidence that some women apprentices demonstrate as limiting their abilities to complete a task more than their lack of physical strength. Women's lower levels of confidence and

perceived self-efficacy in manual trade work can be attributed to their lack of exposure and opportunities to tinker with tools and technical work as children as a result of patriarchal family and educational practices.

Instructor Y explained that:

What I do is call them into my classroom, and explain the purpose of doing an apprenticeship. It's to learn. They need to be willing to learn and work hard, and they respond well to this approach most of the time.

Instructor Y added further that:

Most of the tasks they (women) do, they (women) don't have self-confidence to do them (tasks). The men will just do it and ask me to correct them if they are wrong. The girls do it, but they have the fear that they have done something incorrect.

In their analysis of African-American women (and minority women) in STEM courses, Ong, Wright, Espinosa and Orfield (2011, cited in Charleston et al., 2014) note the intersectional identities of these women and highlight the importance of them developing strong science identities to ensure they develop future career successes. Having self-efficacy and feeling confident is crucial to black women apprentices developing strong apprentice identities, and succeeding as artisans once they qualify.

When asked how women apprentices performed in comparison to their male counterparts in the national trade tests at the end of their three year apprenticeships, instructors had different opinions. Three instructors, who felt that women were not 100% suited to their trades, confirmed that all their women apprentices passed their national trade tests in the past year.

An instructor stated that:

"This year all of my appies passed.I don't know why (all women passed). I push all my appies to do well during their training." (W)

Instructor X acknowledged that:

“Women often do better than men in their trade tests, practicals and workshops, but in real life they don’t perform well. The standards have dropped at the trade testing centres so it’s not difficult to pass these days.”

Instructor X noted further that:

When the TLMA did our own trade testing, women appies definitely did not do better than men appies. What happens at Oliefantsfontein (INDLELA) now, they don’t get percentage marks, so it’s difficult to tell if women appies do better than men appies. What happens is they (apprentices) get three attempts on the trade test so they (women) will figure out how to make things work. They may pay the guy (assessor) to pass or figure out how things are done.

The fourth instructor felt that women and men do equally well in the national trade test, stating that:

“It depends on the individual.” (Y)

The responses of three of the four instructors with regards to women apprentices passing their national trade tests highlight the notion that in spite of the negative stereotypes these instructors have towards their women apprentices’ physical abilities, women apprentices do as well as male apprentices on their qualifying tests

4.3.2.1.1 Menstruation

Three out of the four instructors raised the issue of menstruation in relation to the negative effects it has on women’s performance in the trade.

Instructor W stated that:

Women appies refuse to sit at the back of trucks like all the other appies. They say ‘it’s that time of month’. I tell them in class that if you decide to do this trade, you have to sit at the back of the truck like everyone else. I will not give them time off (during periods/menstruation).

Instructor X expressed the view that:

Contractors, white and black, will tell you 'don't bring me a lady'. They become mothers, they have their monthly cycle, there is always something wrong because they have their monthly cycle. Then they become pregnant and then they become mothers. Now they've got children problems.

Another instructor commented that:

"Women also have to worry about menstruation, so they have to take time off which the men don't have to do." (Z)

Van Breda's study (2016) on women in the South African Military concurs with this finding. The othering of women and the persistence of hegemonic masculine opinions on menstruation were expressed by older, white instructors in this study. Furthermore, instructors equating of "equality" with "sameness" further highlighted the misconception that by recognising that women have unique needs (menstruation) from men, women will be afforded special privileges.

The strong hierarchical culture and protocol of manual trades is challenged in this instance by some women apprentices during menstruation. The example of the women apprentice, who sits in the front of the work truck despite this "privilege" being the preserve of qualified artisans, is a prime example. An apprenticeship is a period of training where apprentices are taught the culture of the trade as well as the technical skills necessary to perform a job function. This challenging of the occupational cultural boundaries by women apprentices, challenges the culture of the trade and some instructors.

4.3.2.2 Structural barriers

Structural barriers within the context of this study refers to the physical infrastructure of buildings and facilities on the TLMA campus that hinder or detract from women apprentices' full participation on their apprenticeships

4.3.2.2.1 Ablution facilities

Three instructors agreed with the view raised by some women apprentices about the women's toilets and change rooms at TLMA. One instructor felt that women apprentices needed toilets with change rooms to be built inside the workshops like the men have.

He commented that:

“They should build new change rooms. The plumbing workshops don't have their own change rooms for women. They have to change in a different part of the campus.” (Y)

Two instructors commented on women having to stand guard outside the men's toilets in the workshops if women wanted to use them because the women's outside toilets are sometimes out of order.

Instructor Z emphasised that:

“TLMA should build proper working toilets and change rooms for women. It's not right that they have to use the men's and have someone guard the door.”

Contrary to the researcher's expectations, the study found that more instructors viewed the provision of ablution facilities for women at the TLMA as not being up to the standard of meeting the needs of women apprentices, than did the number of women apprentices themselves. This reflects the view that instructors feel that maintenance standards have dropped at the TLMA, and that management should be more responsive to improving infrastructure on campus.

4.3.2.3 Occupational Culture (“Blue Collar” culture)

Occupational culture refers to “a set of expectations and beliefs (about) how people communicate in particular occupations and work settings” (Jabline, 1982, p. 680, cited in Gibson & Pappa, 2000). This study looked at the occupational culture of instructors who are part of manual trades, rather than the culture of the TLMA as an organisation.

4.3.2.3.1 Swearing

All instructors acknowledged that swearing is common practice in the trade and is part of the culture. Two of the four instructors (both white) commented on how they would swear in class only when they taught men, but with the admission of women apprentices, they tried not to swear because it was “disrespectful to women.”

Instructor W mentioned that:

“I try not to swear in front of them (women). It’s disrespectful.”

Instructor Z claimed that:

“Men tend to swear more, but with the ladies, I try not to swear.”

Two instructors (white and black) confirmed that they swear and shout in class and in the workshops.

Instructor Y noted that:

It’s not personal. We just say it (swear) so we can work as a team. In my class, I tell them that if I swear or shout or do something wrong, it doesn’t mean that I mean it. It’s to wake them up.

Another instructor expressed that:

When I start with my first years on day one, I tell them that I swear a lot, and I will do it with them. I tell them there are no spare parts for fingers or ears, and that is why I shout and swear at them. (W)

The use of swearing in male-dominated blue-collar trades signifies bonding and a sense of solidarity between workers (Daly et al., 2004, cited in Baruch, Prouska, Ollier-Malaterre & Bunk, 2017) Baruch et al. (2017) note that men are more likely to swear less at work when women are around in order to attempt not to be offensive. In the case of the two instructors who do swear in their classes where women apprentices are present, this could be to release stress (“there are no spare parts for fingers or ears”) as well as an expression of the culture of

their trade. Baruch et al., (2017) refer to this type of swearing as “annoyance swearing” where swearing is a mechanism to relieve stress and tension.

4.4 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

Table 11: Summary of Findings

Themes	Women Apprentices	Instructors
1. Physiological barriers		
1.1. Physical strength of women apprentices	• Women are capable of performing manual trade work • Women work in teams to complete heavy tasks • Women work differently to men in completing heavy tasks	• Women are not suited to manual trade work • Women apprentices often lack the confidence to complete technical tasks
1.2. Marginalisation	• Some women feel excluded from participating in certain tasks in the workshop • Some women feel included in class and workshops by their instructors	• Women aren't able to complete certain tasks in the workshops because they don't have the physical strength • Women apprentices often lack the confidence to complete technical tasks
1.3. Menstruation	• Some women have supportive	• Some instructors

Themes	Women Apprentices	Instructors
	instructors who allow them to take time off class if they experience period pains during menstruation Some women don't feel comfortable approaching certain instructors to request time off class during menstruation	encourage women to approach them if they don't feel well enough to work during their menstruation Some instructors feel that women are asking for "special privileges" if they request time off work during menstruation
2. Structural barriers	Women's outside ablution facilities are inadequate for those women who have to walk further to access them than women who don't need to walk far	Women's outside ablutions facilities are inadequate, and should be provided inside the workshops
3. Occupational barriers	Women are offended by instructors shouting in class and not by instructors swearing	- Some instructors try not to swear in front of women apprentices - Some instructors swear to warn apprentices around safety issues in the workshops
4. Institutional Recruitment practices	Women instructors need to be employed, not just men in	N/A

Themes	Women Apprentices	Instructors
	order provide role models and mentors to women apprentices	

This chapter presented a summary of the demographic information of the participants and confirmed that the sampling criterion was adhered to. The research further accomplished its objectives. The themes presented were linked to the different objectives of the study. The main objective of the study was to explore the experiences of Black African women apprentices, which was highlighted by participants identifying four themes viz: physiological barriers, structural barriers, occupational barriers and institutional recruitment practices. These themes were enriched by an exploration of instructors' views of these themes. The accumulation of these themes provided an overall view of the experiences of Black women apprentices at the TLMA.

The first theme gave us insight into how women apprentices perceived and experienced their own physiology at the TMLA, juxtaposed with how their instructors perceived and responded to it. The second theme focused on the structural barriers for women apprentices, and their experiences of navigating around these barriers. It also explored how instructors' views concurred with those of women apprentices. The third theme explored the "blue collar" culture that instructors embrace and transmit through their apprenticeships, and highlighted how Black women apprentices view and experience these practices. The forth theme highlighted how the institution's practice of employing only male instructors is perceived and experienced by women apprentices, and how this contributes to their experiences at the TLMA.

4.4.1. LINKING FINDINGS AND OBJECTIVES

The findings of this study demonstrate that the objectives of this study were met, viz: the experiences of black African women apprentices at the TLMA were explored with regards to

them being part of traditionally male-dominated technical training programmes. Furthermore, these experiences and narratives were enriched by exploring the experiences of instructors in instructing them as apprentices.

The findings of this study were expanded upon by the use of methodological triangulation in the collection of data. By using both a focus group with women apprentices and interviews with instructors, the data collected enriched the research findings. It also helped to explore and explain complex experiences and behaviour of both black African women apprentices and their instructors (Noble & Heale, 2019).

The differences of opinion between the women apprentices and the instructors were clearly evident when discussing the themes of women's physical strength, menstruation and the use of bad language / swearing. The views of the women apprentices and instructors were congruent around the issue of the research site's management needing to improve on the women's ablution facilities. An unexpected finding was the issue raised unanimously by the women apprentices about their need for women instructors and role models. This need was validated for the researcher as a result of the data that was collected from both women apprentices and instructors, and from analysing the themes arising out of experiences of both the participants and key informants.

4.4.2. LINKING FINDINGS AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The findings of this study demonstrate that the gender identities of black African women apprentices are an important factor when pursuing traditional male-dominated technical apprenticeships. Intersectionality as both a theoretical lens and a methodological framework assisted in exploring and describing the interrelated and intersectional experiences of black African women apprentices pursuing apprenticeships, as well as some of the strategies these apprentices use in pursuing their qualifications as artisans. There was less evidence of race being a factor at the TLMA by black African women apprentices.

Conflicts and integrations of gender identities arose repeatedly as participants described their experiences as black African women apprentices at the research site. The themes of women's physical strength, their feelings of marginalisation, inadequate ablution facilities, instructors shouting in class and the lack of women instructors/role models all spoke to their gender

identities as women. Some of the participants' experiences of being an apprentice during menstruation highlighted the intersection of their dual identities as black African women. While participants described their experiences as black African women at the TLMA in a variety of ways, this study demonstrated that at different times and spaces during their apprenticeships at the research site, black African women's different identities came to the fore (Charleston et al., 2014). Furthermore, the use of intersectionality as a framework also highlighted the notion that institutional culture is a significant element in the study of black African women apprentices.

An interesting finding that arose during this study was that some Black African women apprentices view their gender identities as more salient than their racial identities at the research site. This view was evident when some participants described their experiences of having to deal with the gender stereotypes that are practiced by some instructors. Settles (2006, cited in Charleston et al., 2014, p. 284) noted that a "Black women's racial identity may take precedence when in a room of white women, while in contrast, in a room of white men, her identity as a women may become more salient." This finding may be as a result of Black African apprentices being the majority racial group represented among apprentices at the research site. In contrast to the American study by Charleston et al. (2014) that looked at African-American women as both a racial minority group as well as gender minorities, this study did not find racial prejudice issues in the data collected.

CHAPTER FIVE

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION / OVERVIEW OF STUDY

This chapter provides an overview of the study conducted, including the findings, conclusions and recommendations.

This research provides insights into the lived experiences of Black African women apprentices who are apprentices on traditional male-dominated technical apprenticeships. It also highlights the views of male instructors who instruct women apprentices.

The objectives of this study were:

- To explore the experiences of black African women on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships.
- To explore the experiences of instructors with women apprentices in their classes and workshops.

5.2 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

The 2018 World Bank report (Sulla & Zikhali, 2018) indicates that South Africa has the highest levels of inequality in the world. In order to address this issue, the National Development Plan: 2030 highlighted the need for more South Africans to access work opportunities, and identified the training of more artisans as an important way for Black South Africans in particular, to access mid-level work opportunities.

The South African government has made a significant investment in this sector. National Treasury (2017) increased its TVET college bursary allocation from R2.437 billion in 2017 to R5.164 billion in 2018, resulting in more Black African women accessing traditional male-dominated vocational training programmes (apprenticeships), with the aim of becoming qualified artisans. With access to technical training opportunities becoming more accessible to

Black African women, this study aimed to explore the experiences of Black African women on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships.

This study used a qualitative and exploratory case study approach, with purposive sampling being the sampling method selected. The sample consisted of twelve Black African women participants between the ages of 20 and 35 years old, all of whom resided in townships and the CBD of the City of Tshwane. A focus group was conducted with all twelve participants with the assistance of a focus group topic guide. The key informants consisted of four instructors, all male, between the ages of 30 and 60 years old, who were interviewed face to face with the assistance of an interview schedule. The data was analysed using thematic analysis, and was grouped into four themes with sub-themes.

This section of the study discusses the findings of the study in relation to the objectives of the study. The objectives will be discussed in relation to the various themes and sub-themes that emerged.

5.2.1. TO EXPLORE THE EXPERIENCES OF BLACK AFRICAN WOMEN ON TRADITIONAL MALE-DOMINATED APPRENTICESHIPS.

5.2.1.1 Physiological barriers

This objective looked at barriers including women apprentices' physical strength, menstruation and experiences of marginalisation / inclusion during their apprenticeships. The sub-theme of marginalisation was included in this section because it was linked to some instructor's perceptions of women not having the physical strength to complete certain technical tasks.

All participants sampled unanimously felt that women apprentices are as capable as their male counterparts in performing tasks that required physical strength. They all questioned the belief that male apprentices work on their own when physical strength is required to complete a task, having experienced their male counterparts working in teams to complete these tasks. They were of the opinion that women apprentices are also able to work in teams, and achieve the same results.

They raised an important issue about women apprentices being more safety conscious than men, and not being prepared to use “brute strength” such as “lifting a gear box out of a car using their backs”.

Participants from one specific trade mentioned how their instructor had built a special hoist that enables them to lift heaving machine parts, and that both women and men apprentices now use it. This indicates how this instructor supports women apprentices while at the same time ensuring that all apprentices work safer.

The women apprentices who did not experience the same level of support from their instructors around performing heavy duty work, reported feeling marginalised during their practicals and excluded from certain tasks. English and Jeune (2012) explain that the issue of women’s perceived lack of physical strength is often used to discriminate against women in technical trades. Women apprentices also reported that this practice has a negative effect on their skills acquisition which limits their work experience during their apprenticeships. Research on African American women in STEM higher education concurs with this finding.

An additional factor of Black African women not being raised to perform “men’s work” at home e.g.: fixing cars, riding bicycles and helping out male relatives with DIY chores, was a factor in some women feeling “alienated” at particular times during their apprenticeships. One participant spoke about not knowing the correct term for certain tools, while another mentioned male apprentices knowing “how to work the machines.” This sub-theme related well to the need expressed for the employment of women instructors and role models at the TLMA, whereby women apprentices will feel better supported and included during training.

A third sub-theme to emerge for participants was the issue of menstruation. A dominant view raised during this discussion was that women who feel that they are able to approach their instructors and depot managers about issues around menstruation, have a more positive experiences at the TLMA during their menses, than those who felt that they could not approach their instructors. One instructor in this sample openly discusses menstruation with all his apprentices during their orientation class, and encourages women apprentices to approach him if they need time off during menstruation. In addition, some participants have experienced Depot Managers, who manage work sites for apprentices, openly encouraging

women apprentices to approach them if they are not feeling well enough to work during their periods to excuse them from work. Two apprentices highlighted the view that because women menstruate every month, they needed to “deal with this” and should not expect to take time off.

Conversely, feelings of shame and discomfort about approaching some male instructors to request time off when they don’t feel well during menstruation, were also reported. This may be due to cultural taboos that some Black African women have around menstruation, as well as some instructors’ negative attitudes towards women apprentices “skiving off work when they request time off class.” One instructor mentioned that women use the excuse of sitting in the front seat of the bakkie (utility vehicle or pick-up truck) during menstruation when all apprentices are supposed to sit at the back of the bakkie. This for him was a flagrant disregard of the “protocol of the trade” as only qualified artisans are supposed to sit in the front seat of work vehicles.

5.2.1.2. Structural barriers

Five out of twelve participants raised the issue of inadequate ablution facilities for women apprentices. Due to the TLMA admitting women as apprentices in 2013, the women’s toilets were built outside of the pre-existing workshops, whereas men have toilets and change-rooms inside the workshops.

The issue for some women apprentices using the outside toilets is two-fold. Firstly, some feel that it takes more time for them to walk out of the workshop to the women’s toilets cutting into their tea breaks. As a result, they sometimes make use of the men’s toilets, but have to have another women apprentice standing guard at the door to prevent men from entering while they use these toilets. Secondly, women from two specific trades change into their boiler suits when they arrive at campus, but due to the outside women’s toilets often remaining locked after 08H00, they use the classrooms to change, preventing the men from entering these classrooms. There was a view expressed by several women that if all apprentices were given a 2nd pair of boiler suits by the TLMA, they would be able to change into their boiler suits at home, as they would be clean and presentable to travel on public transport.

All participants agreed that a SHE box containing sanitary pads, condoms and soap be made available in the women's toilets.

All apprentices stated that they felt physically safe at the TLMA. With very high levels of GBV being widespread in South African society including educational institutions, women apprentices at this institution reported not struggling with personal safety issues. It appears that the management of the TLMA has implemented systematic measures to ensure that personal safety of apprentices and staff is maintained e.g.: security guards and extensive security installations.

5.2.1.3 Occupational barriers

One of the “trademarks” of traditional male-dominated trades is the use of “bad language” or swearing.

Five of the participants, all from one trade, expressed the view that their instructor swears extensively, but they are not offended by this because he “swears at everyone”. They indicated that both men and women apprentices are sworn at, but it is not the swearing that upsets them, but rather his tone. The fact that he shouts often is more of an issue for them than the actual swearing, and this was reported to be the case for men apprentices too. The intersection of women and male apprentices being offended and afraid by their instructor's tone in class, because of their Black African identities, was evident in this case. This is due to African languages in South Africa being tonal languages, where the tone of a word transmits meaning and therefore being shouted at by someone would lead to causing offense or fear.

While some aspects of male-dominated institutional culture exists in classes and workshops at TLMA e.g.: swearing and shouting, black African women apprentices all reported feeling safe on campus. The frequently reported issue of women in traditional male-dominated trades experiencing sexual harassment and men “crossing the line” (Dennissen, 2010), was not reported by women apprentices in this study. This may be due to the organisational culture of the TLMA being different to the “trade culture”, where this type of behaviour is not tolerated.

5.2.1.4. Institutional Recruitment Practices

The TLMA's historical practice of only employing male instructors was raised by all women apprentices as an issue for them. This topic arose following a discussion on women's suggestions on how to make the TLMA more inclusive of their needs as women apprentices. They brought up the issue of the institution needing to employ women instructors who would be role models for them. Most felt that as they have shared experiences with women instructors, they (women instructors) would be better able to support them in an environment that is still culturally male dominated. They mentioned examples of women instructors potentially helping them to "close the gap" on their lack of technical knowledge when they first enter the TLMA by not assuming that all apprentices are on the same level, as well as being approachable around menstruation issues. Women instructors can be viewed as "social vaccines" (Dasgupta, 2017, cited in Yong, 2017, p.2) where they act as mentors to "inoculate the mind against the stultifying effects of negative stereotypes".

Access by black African women to traditional male-dominated apprenticeships alone does not guarantee gender equality and fair treatment, but rather an increase in women's participation at all levels of the organisation increases this practice (Devillard et al., 2017).

5.2.2 TO EXPLORE THE EXPERIENCES OF INSTRUCTORS TOWARDS WOMEN APPRENTICES IN THEIR CLASSES AND WORKSHOPS.

5.2.2.1 Physiological barriers

The pervasive gender issues referred to by Phaahla (2000, cited in Madikizela and Haupt, 2009) in their South African study on women in technical workplaces, correlates with the views expressed by three out of four instructors at TLMA. Issues such as gender stereotyping and the inadequate accommodation of women's unique physical / health needs (Martin & Barnard, 2013) were evident in this study.

Three of four instructors indicated strong views about women apprentices not being suited to traditional male-dominated trade work due to their lack of physical strength. Of these three instructors, two qualified this view by stating that women's lack of physical strength made

them unsuitable for technical trade work within municipalities, and were better suited to working on “lighter” automated production facilities and domestic installation work.

These three instructors explained women apprentices’ ability to achieve equally good results on the national trade test at the end of their three year apprenticeships as either due to a decline in the standards of the trade tests or women “paying” the examiners to pass them.

The one instructor who did not agree that women’s physical abilities precluded them from becoming artisans, expressed the view that women apprentices were as capable as their male counterparts, but often lacked the self-confidence to complete tasks. Men apprentices are more confident to complete tasks whether they are correct in their execution of these tasks or not, while women doubt their abilities which can slow them down.

5.2.2.2 Menstruation

Three out of four instructors stated that menstruation can be a problem due to their women apprentices expecting “special treatment” e.g.: sitting in the front seat of the bakkie (utility vehicle or pick-up truck) instead of at the back and needing to take time off work. One instructor reported instructing women apprentices to work regardless of whether they are experiencing period pains or not as they decided to register as apprentices and know what the demands are. These attitudinal barriers reflect the view of the traditional “blue collar” worker as described by Burawoy (1979) who practices norms and values associated with life on the production line, and assimilates into a male only culture (Amaratunga et al., 2006).

The forth instructor took a more accommodating and supportive stance by briefing his apprentices at the beginning of the year about them feeling free to approach him when they need time off work due to menstruation, and granting them this time off.

5.2.2.3 Structural barriers

All instructors expressed the view that the TLMA needs to build adequate ablution facilities for women apprentices inside the workshops, and that the current situation of women’s toilets being located outside of the workshops is not adequate.

5.2.2.4 Occupational culture (“Blue Collar” culture”)

All instructors sampled reported swearing in class, however two of them stated that they try not to swear “in front of women apprentices” because it is “disrespectful”.

The two instructors who swore regardless of whether they had men or women apprentices present in their classes, did so as a warning to their apprentices of the potentially dangerous and hazardous equipment they use.

This example of hegemonic masculine norms, values and practices exclusive to men (Connell, 1995) highlights the covert aspects of male-dominated institutional culture in some classes at the TLMA.

5.3 CONCLUSIONS

The aim of this study was to gain insight into the lived experiences of black African women apprentices at the TLMA, who are currently enrolled on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships. Based on this aim, two research objectives were identified, namely:

5.3.1. TO EXPLORE THE EXPERIENCES OF BLACK AFRICAN WOMEN ON TRADITIONAL MALE-DOMINATED APPRENTICESHIPS:

A conclusion was made that black women apprentices’ experiences on their apprenticeships was largely determined by the attitudes and behaviours of their instructors towards them as women apprentices. Furthermore, their gender identity as women is more salient than their racial identity as black African women in this context.

Women apprentices, who experienced their instructors as being supportive and inclusive of them in class, did not experience feelings of marginalisation or a limitation on their learning opportunities on their apprenticeships. Furthermore, when they experienced their instructors as open and approachable, they felt comfortable approaching them regarding time off work due to menstruation pains.

On the other hand, women apprentices whose experiences on their apprenticeships included different and unequal treatment to their male counterparts, due to the negative perceptions of their instructors towards women in male-dominated technical trades, reported feelings of marginalisation and a limiting of their technical skills acquisition. Furthermore, they felt that they could not approach their instructors around issues like menstruation.

5.3.2. TO EXPLORE THE EXPERIENCES OF INSTRUCTORS TOWARDS WOMEN APPRENTICES IN THEIR CLASSES AND WORKSHOPS.

Three out of the four lecturers sampled expressed negative attitudes towards women apprentices being included on apprenticeships at the TLMA, mainly due to the stereotype that women don't have the physical strength to perform all aspects of their respective trades. Two of these instructors were of the opinion that where women apprentices are trained, they are not suited to technical work in municipalities which is considered "heavy", and are consequently better suited to "lighter" technical work on production facilities and in domestic technical functions e.g.: house wiring and motor car mechanics. It is significant to note that these instructors were older white men who were close to retirement age.

A lone or minority view was that women apprentices are not limited by their physical strength but instead because they lacked the self-confidence and self-efficacy that their male counterpart have, and that this limited their performance

5.4. RECOMMENDATIONS

Positive, affirming and inclusive experiences by black African women apprentices are critical in ensuring their full participation on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships at the TLMA.

The following recommendations are proposed based on the research findings:

1. Women instructors should be included and can serve as role models on apprenticeships of women. As part of the TLMA workforce planning process, the opportunity exists for management to assess the talent gaps in light of a cohort of instructors due for retirement, and to engage in proactive talent management interventions where women

instructors and gender-sensitive male lectures can be recruited in order for the TLMA to fulfil its mandate and strategic objectives.

2. Ablution facilities for women apprentices are inadequate and should be upgraded in the workshops.
3. There should be gender-sensitisation programmes for all male instructors. It is an important function for the TLMA management to address the issues raised by some women apprentices in this study regarding their experiences of marginalisation and disempowerment. Practical examples of how some instructors have introduced supportive and affirming methods of practice in training women apprentices in their classes should also be highlighted.
4. The introduction of induction sessions at the beginning of every year that includes the TLMA management, instructors, women and men apprentices and their guardians, will assist in reinforcing the ethos of equality of access and opportunity of all apprentices at the institution. It will also provide an opportunity for TLMA staff to explain the importance of parents and families needing to support and encourage their women relatives who are enrolled as apprentices at the TLMA on traditional male-dominated apprenticeships. This could assist to increase self-efficacy and confidence in women apprentices. Including the EAP service at the CTMM or an external EAP service provider in these sessions would be beneficial as the issue of apprentice wellness will be highlighted and reinforced.

REFERENCES

- Acker, J. (2006). Inequality Regimes: Gender, Class, and Race in Organizations. *Gender & Society*, 20(4), 441–464. Retrieved from <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/0891243206289499>
- Agapiou, A. (2002). Perceptions of gender roles and attitudes toward work among male and female operatives in the Scottish construction industry. *Construction Management & Economics*, 20(8), 697-705. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/0144619021000024989>
- Alakhunova, N, Diallo, O, del Campo, I M, & Tallarica, W. (2015). *Defining Marginalization: An Assessment Tool*. Washington. DC: The Elliot School of International Affairs. Retrieved from <https://elliott.gwu.edu/sites/g/files/zaxdzs2141/f/World%20Fair%20Trade%20Organization.pdf>
- Alves, S., & English, J. (2017). *Female Construction Students' Perceptions of Gender and Sexism and Preparation by the university environment*. Proceedings of Association of Researchers in Construction Management (ARCOM), 33rd International Conference, Cambridge, England. Retrieved from <http://www.arcom.ac.uk/-docs/proceedings/98e749c50ef5f45042c8e26bce7ecaad.pdf>
- Amaratunga, R., Haigh, R.P., Shanmugam, M., Lee, A., & Elvitigalage. (2006, April 3-4). *Construction industry and women: A review of the barriers*. Proceedings of the 3rd International SCRI Research Symposium, Delft University, Netherlands. Retrieved from https://www.academia.edu/3031961/Construction_industry_and_women_a_review_of_the_barriers

- AWID. (2009, March 5). *Intersectionality: A Tool for Gender and Economic Justice*. Retrieved from <https://www.awid.org/publications/intersectionality-tool-gender-and-economic-justice>
- Babbie, E & Mouton, J. (2002). *The Practice of social research*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Badenhorst, J & Radile, R. (2018). Poor performance at TVET Colleges: Conceptualising a distributed instructional leadership approach as a solution. *Africa Education Review*, 15(3), 91–112. Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/18146627.2017.1352452>
- Baruch, Y., Prouska, R., Ollier-Malaterre, A., & Bunk, J. (2017). Swearing at work: The mixed outcomes of profanity. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, 32(2), 149–162. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1108/JMP-04-2016-0102>
- Bennett, J. F., Davidson, M. J., & Gale, A. W. (1999). Women in construction: a comparative investigation into the expectations and experiences of female and male construction undergraduates and employees. *Women in Management Review*, 14(7), 273–292. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1108/09649429910291122>
- Botha, D. (2017). Barriers to Career Advancement of Women in Mining: A Qualitative Analysis. *South African Journal of Labour Relations*, 41, 15-18. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.25159/2520-3223/3766>
- Burawoy, M. (1979). *Manufacturing Consent: Changes in the Labor Process under Monopoly Capitalism*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

- BUSA., & Duncan, K. (2017). *Ensuring Success for South Africa's Post-School Training and Education System by 2030*. Institute for Futures Research. Johannesburg, South Africa. Retrieved from <http://busa.org.za/8-education-and-skills-development-for-current-and-future-work/>
- Butler, I. (2002). A Code of Ethics for Social Work and Social Care Research. *The British Journal of Social Work*, 32(2), 239–248. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23716761>
- Charleston, L., Jackson, J.F., Adserias, R., & Lang, N. (2014). Intersectionality and STEM: The Role of Race and Gender in the Academic Pursuits of African American Women in STEM. *Journal of Management Policy and Practice*, 2(3), 17–37. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/280157009_Intersectionality_and_STEM_The_Role_of_Race_and_Gender_in_the_Academic_Pursuits_of_African_American_Women_in_STEM
- Cohen, L., Manion, L. & Morrison, K. (Eds.). (2000). *Research Methods in Education*. (5th ed.). London: Routledge Falmer
- Connell, R. W. (1998). Masculinities and globalization. *Men and Masculinities*. 1, 3-23. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/249697289_Masculinities_and_Globalization
- Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics. *The University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 140, 139–167. Retrieved from <https://philpapers.org/rec/CREDTI>
- Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: choosing among five approaches*. Thousand Oaks, California.: SAGE.
- Dainty, A. R. J., Bagilhole, B. M., & Neale, R. H. (2000a). A grounded theory of women's career under-achievement in large UK construction companies. *Construction Management & Economics*, 18(2), 239–250. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/014461900370861>

- Department of National Treasury. (2017). The Estimates of National Expenditure 2017 (09/2017). Retrieved from <http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/national%20budget/2017/enebooklets/Vote%2015%20Higher%20Education%20and%20Training.pdf>
- Denissen, A. M. (2010). Crossing the Line: How Women in the Building Trades Interpret and Respond to Sexual Conduct at Work. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*, 39(3), 297–327. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1177/0891241609341827>
- De Vos, A.S. (Ed). (2002). *Research at grass roots for the social sciences and human service professions*. (2nd ed.). Pretoria, South Africa: JL Van Schaik Publishers.
- De Vos A.S., Strydom, H., Fouché C.B., & Delpont C.S.L. (Eds.). (2005). *Research at the grass roots for the social sciences and human service professions*. (3rd ed.). Pretoria, South Africa: JL Van Schaik Publishers
- Devillard, S., de Zelicourt, A., Kossoff, A., & Sancier-Sultan, S. (2017). *Reinventing the workplace for greater gender diversity*. Retrieved from <https://www.mckinsey.com/featured-insights/gender-equality/reinventing-the-workplace-for-greater-gender-diversity>
- DHET (Department of Higher Education & Training). (2016). *National artisan strategy roadshows for South Africa*. Retrieved from <http://www.dhet.gov.za/SiteAssets/Latest%20News/August%202016/The%20National%20Artisan%20Development%20Strategy%20Consultative%20Roadshows-pdf>
- Eisenberg, S. (1998). *We'll call you if we need you*. New York: Cornell University Press
- English, J. & Hay, P. (2015). Black South African women in construction: cues for success. *Journal of Engineering, Design and Technology*. 13. 144-164. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/276568745_Black_South_African_women_in_construction_cues_for_success/citation/download
- English, J., & Le Jeune, K. (2012). Do Professional Women and Tradeswomen in the South African Construction Industry Share Common Employment Barriers despite

- Progressive Government Legislation? *Journal of Professional Issues in Engineering Education & Practice*, 138(2), 145–152. [https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)EI.1943-5541.00000095](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)EI.1943-5541.00000095)
- Fielden, S. L., Davidson, M. J., Gale, A. W., & Davey, C. L. (2000). Women in construction: the untapped resource. *Construction Management & Economics*, 18(1), 113–121. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/014461900371004>
- Fouka, G., & Mantzourou, M. (2011). What are the major ethical issues in conducting research? Is there a conflict between the research ethics and the nature of nursing? *Health Science Journal*, 5(1), 3-14. Retrieved from <http://www.hsj.gr/abstract/what-are-the-major-ethical-issues-in-conducting-research-is-there-a-conflict-between-the-research-ethics-and-the-nature-of-nursing-3485.html>
- Fuller, A., Beck, V., & Unwin, L. (2005). The gendered nature of apprenticeship: Employers' and young people's perspectives. *Education + Training*, 47, 298–311. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1108/00400910510601887>
- Fuller, A., & Unwin, L. (2003). Fostering Workplace Learning: Looking through the Lens of Apprenticeship. *European Educational Research Journal*, 2(1), 41–55. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.2304/eej.2003.2.1.9>
- Gale, A., & Cartwright, S. (1995). Project management: different gender, different culture? A discussion on gender and organizational culture Part 2. *Leadership and Organization Development Journal* 16(4), 12-16. Retrieved from <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/01437739510082262/full/html>
- Gelling, L. (2015). *Non-maleficence: the second ethical principle*. Retrieved from <https://clinfield.com/non-maleficence-the-second-ethical-principle/>
- Gibson, M. K., & Papa, M. J. (2000). The mud, the blood, and the beer guys: Organizational osmosis in blue-collar work groups. *Journal of Applied Communication Research*, 28(1), 68-88. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/00909880009365554>

- Goldberg, H. (2016, March 10). *Paid Menstrual Leave Is Spreading, But Women Are Divided*. Retrieved from <https://www.self.com/story/paid-menstrual-leave-is-spreading-but-women-are-divided>
- Greenwood, M. (1997, September 15-17). *Discovering an individual's 'risk behaviour profile'*. Paper presented at the 13th Annual ARCOM Conference, Kings College, Cambridge, UK. Retrieved from http://www.arcom.ac.uk/-docs/proceedings/ar1997-112-122_Greenwood.pdf
- Gutek, B. A., & Morasch, B. (1982). Sex-Ratios, Sex-Role Spill over, and Sexual Harassment of Women at Work. *Journal of Social Issues*, 38(4), 55–74. Retrieved from <http://0-search.ebscohost.com.innopac.wits.ac.za/login.aspx?direct=true&db=sih&AN=16408663&site=eds-live&scope=site>
- Harrison, H., Birks, M., Franklin, R., & Mills, J. (2017). Case Study Research: Foundations and Methodological Orientations. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 18(1). Retrieved from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/2655>
- Johnson, R. B. (Ed.). (2006). New directions in mixed methods research. *Research in the Schools*, 13(1). Retrieved from <http://www.msra.org/docs/rits-v13n1-complete.pdf>
- Kornegay, E. (2001). *South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality*. Retrieved from <http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/cpsi/unpan035001.pdf>
- Leburu, M. C. (2017). *An analysis of the implementation of the Indigent Policy by the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality*. (M.Phil. thesis). University of Pretoria, Tshwane, South Africa. Retrieved from <https://repository.up.ac.za/handle/2263/65492>
- Ledwith, S., & Colgan, F. (1996). *Women in Organisations*. Basingstoke, UK: Macmillan.
- Lewis, S. (2004b). *Gender and Firefighting Training*. (Research Paper Two). Swinburne: Swinburne University of Technology. Retrieved from <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.5153/sro.3832>

- Madara, D, & Cherotich, S. (2016). Challenges Faced by Female-Students in Engineering-Education. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(25), 8-22. Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1115817.pdf>
- Madadzhe, R.N. (2007). Linguistic taboos in Tshivenda: Communicating across epochs. *South African Journal of African Language*, 30(2). Retrieved from <http://ulspace.ul.ac.za/handle/10386/1519?show=full>
- Madikizela, K., & Haupt, T. (2009). View of Why do South African women choose careers in construction? *Acta Structillia*, 16(2), 46-68. Retrieved from <http://journals.ufs.ac.za/index.php/as/article/view/176/168>
- Madikizela, K., & Haupt, T. (2010). Influences on Women's Choices of Careers in Construction: A South African Study. *Construction Economics and Building*, 10(1-2), 1-15. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.5130/AJCEB.v10i1-2.1582>
- Martin, M. (1998). *Hard hatted women: Stories of struggle and success in the trades*. Washington DC: Seal Press
- Martin, P., & Barnard, A. (2013). The experience of women in male-dominated occupations: A constructivist grounded theory inquiry. *SA Journal of Industrial Psychology*, 39(2), 1-12. Retrieved from http://www.scielo.org.za/scielo.php?script=sci_abstract&pid=S2071-07632013000200002&lng=en&nrm=iso&tlng=en
- Maulik, P. K. (2017). Workplace stress: A neglected aspect of mental health wellbeing. *The Indian Journal of Medical Research*, 146(4), 441-444. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.4103/ijmr.IJMR_1298_17
- McMillan, J., & Schumacher, S. (1993). *Research in education a conceptual introduction*. (3rd ed.). New York, USA: HarperCollins College Publishers
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

- Messing, K., Lippel, K., Demers, D., & Mergler, D. (2000). Equality and Difference in the Workplace: Physical Job Demands, Occupational Illnesses, and Sex Differences. *NWSA Journal*, 12(3), 21–49. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4316761>
- Morgan, D. L. (1997). *Focus groups as qualitative research*. (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, Calif: Sage Publications.
- Morris, M., & Bunjun, B. (2007). *Using intersectional feminist frameworks in research: a resource for embracing the complexities of women's lives in the stages of research*. Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women. Retrieved from https://www.academia.edu/2100066/Using_Intersectional_Feminist_Frameworks_in_Research_A_resource_for_embracing_the_complexities_of_womens_lives
- National Planning Commission. (2012). *Our future: make it work: National Development Plan, 2030*. Pretoria: National Planning Commission. Retrieved from <http://www.dhet.gov.za/SiteAssets/Latest%20News/August%202016/The%20National%20Artisan%20Development%20Strategy%20Consultative%20Roadshows-1.pdf>
- Neuman, W.L. (1997) *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. (3rd ed.). Boston: Allyn and Bacon
- Noble, H., & Heale, R. (2019). Triangulation in research, with examples. *Evidence-Based Nursing*, 22, 67-68. Retrieved from <https://ebn.bmj.com/content/22/3/67.citation-tools>
- Nyumba, T., Wilson, K., Derrick, C. J., & Mukherjee, N. (2018). The use of focus group discussion methodology: Insights from two decades of application in conservation. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution*, 9(1), 20–32. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1111/2041-210X.12860>
- Ong, M., Wright, C., Espinosa, L., & Orfield, G. (2011). Inside the double bind: A synthesis of empirical research on undergraduate and graduate women of color in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics. *Harvard Educational Review*, 81(2), 172–208. Retrieved from <http://doi.org/10.17763/haer.81.2.t022245n7x4752v2>

- Padmanabhanunni, A. & Fennie, T. (2017). The menstruation experience: Attitude dimensions among South African students. *Journal of Psychology in Africa*, 27(1), 54–60. Retrieved from https://repository.uwc.ac.za/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10566/3960/Padmanabhanunni_The-menstruation_2017.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y
- Phaahla, P. (2000, January 8-10). *Bridging the gender divide in South African higher education management and leadership*. Paper presented at the 13th Annual International Conference on Women in Higher Education, New Orleans, Louisiana.
- Punch, K. (2004). *Survey Research: The Basics*. London: Sage Publications:
- Ragins, B., & Scandura, T. (1995). Antecedents and Work-Related Correlates of Reported Sexual Harassment: An Empirical Investigation of Competing Hypotheses. *Sex Roles*, 32(7–8), 430–455. Retrieved from http://0-web.a.ebscohost.com.innopac.wits.ac.za/_ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=7&sid=93863d89-0719-4138-97f8-a461f6b5c85d%40sdc-v-sessmgr06
- Ramathuba, D. (2015). Menstrual knowledge and practices of female adolescents in Vhembe district, Limpopo Province, South Africa. *Curationis*, 38(1), 1–6. Retrieved from http://www.scielo.org.za/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S2223-62792015000100040
- SAQA. (2014). *What is an Apprenticeship*. Retrieved from <https://www.saqa.org.za>
- Scripps, J. (2006). *Why don't more women go into the vocational trades?* Women's Trade Academy Project Report, Northland Polytechnic, Whangarei, North Island, New Zealand. Retrieved from https://www.ncver.edu.au/_data/assets/file/0028/7957/the-female-tradie-2100.pdf
- Shenton, A.K. (2004). Strategies for Ensuring Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research Projects. *Education for Information*. 22(2), 63-75. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/228708239_Strategies_for_Ensuring_Trustworthiness_in_Qualitative_Research_Projects

- Shewring, F. (2009). *The female 'tradie': Challenging employment perceptions in nontraditional trades for women*. Tafe NSW: Ilawarra Institute. Retrieved from <https://www.ncver.edu.au/data/assets/file/0028/7957/the-female-tradie-2100.pdf>
- Siltanen, J. (2005, June 10). *Equality, diversity and the politics of scale: The Canadian public policy experience*. Paper presented at the ESRC funded seminar on Public Policy, Equality and Diversity in the Context of Devolution. University of Edinburgh, Scotland. Retrieved from http://www.docs.hss.ed.ac.uk/education/creid/Projects/07xi_ESRC_Seminar2_Present.ppt
- Simons, H. (2009). *Case study research in practice*. London: SAGE Publications
- Smith, E. and Keating, J. (1997). *Making Sense of Training Reform and Competency-Based Training*. Wentworth Falls, NSW: Social Science Press
- Stake, R.E. (2006) *Multiple case study analysis*. New York: The Guilford Press
- Statistics South Africa. (2018). *Youth unemployment still high in Q1: 2018*. Pretoria: Statistics South Africa. Retrieved from <http://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=11129>
- Sulla, V., & Zikhali, P. (2018). *Overcoming Poverty and Inequality in South Africa: An Assessment of Drivers, Constraints and Opportunities*. (No. 124521). The World Bank. Retrieved from <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/530481521735906534/Overcoming-Poverty-and-Inequality-in-South-Africa-An-Assessment-of-Drivers-Constraints-and-Opportunities>
- US Department of Labour. (2017). *US Census Bureau (American Community Survey)*. Retrieved from <https://www.catalyst.org/research/women-in-male-dominated-industries-and-occupations/>
- UK Aid Direct. (2017). *Defining marginalised; DFID's Leave no one behind agenda*. Retrieved from <https://www.ukaidirect.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Defining-marginalised.pdf>

- Van Breda, A. D. (2016). Women Claiming Space in the Military: The Experiences of Female South African Soldiers. *Journal of Human Ecology*, 53(1), 20–28. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/09709274.2016.11906952>
- Vasileiou, K., Barnett, J., Thorpe, S., & Young, T. (2018). Characterising and justifying sample size sufficiency in interview-based studies: systematic analysis of qualitative health research over a 15-year period. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 18(1), 148. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12874-018-0594-7>
- Vermeulen, A. (2009). *Understanding the work experiences, coping strategies and organisational retention of social workers in Gauteng in-patient substance abuse treatment centres*. (MA Thesis). University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. Retrieved from <http://wiredspace.wits.ac.za/handle/10539/5924>
- Webster, S. (1992). *Focus Groups: An Effective Marketing Research Tool for Social Service Agencies*. Retrieved from <http://muskie.usm.maine.edu/helpkids/pubstext/focus.htm#Anchor-Chapter-56259>
- Whittock, M. (2002). Women's experiences of non-traditional employment: Is gender equality in this area a possibility? *Construction Management & Economics*, 20(5), 449–456. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/01446190210140197>
- Wildschut, A., Kruss, G., Roodt, J., Visser, M., Ngazimbi, X., Twalo, T., & Meyer, T. (2013). *Studying Artisans in the Manufacturing, Engineering and related service sectors*. Client report prepared for the MERSETA/HSRC Artisan Identity and Status Project: The unfolding South African story. Pretoria, SA: HSRC. Retrieved from <http://www.hsrc.ac.za/en/research-outputs/ktree-doc/13819>
- Wildschut, A. & Mbatha, C. (2016) *History and the economy matters for artisanal skills planning*. HSRC. LMIP Policy Brief 17. Retrieved from <http://repository.hsrc.ac.za/handle/20.500.11910/10674>
- Wildschut, A, & Meyer, T. (2018). *Political History matters in Artisanal Skills Planning*. HSRC Policy Brief (12). HSRC. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.11910/11802>

- Winning, A. (1996). *Building the future: An investigation of ways to improve the recruitment and retention of women in the construction industry*. South East Queensland: Australian Institute for Women's Research and Policy, Griffith University. Retrieved from <https://www.voced.edu.au/content/ngv:56064>
- Yin, R. (2011). *Qualitative Research from Start to Finish* (1st ed.). New York, NY: The Guilford Press.
- Yip, R. (1994). *Case Study Research*. California, USA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Yin, R. (2014). *Case Study Research Design and Methods* (5th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Yong, E. (2017, May 22). *How Women Mentors Make a Difference in Engineering*. The Atlantic. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/science/archive/2017/05/women-mentors-engineering/527625/>
- Zengele, T. (2007). *Attitudes of engineering staff and students to academic development classes at Tshwane University of Technology* (Masters Thesis). University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. Retrieved from <http://wiredspace.wits.ac.za/handle/10539/2195?show=full>



SOCIAL WORK
THE SCHOOL OF HUMAN AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT (SHCD)



DEPARTMENTAL HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE (SOCIAL WORK) CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE

PROTOCOL NUMBER: SW/19/05/06

PROJECT TITLE: Black African women apprentices on traditional male dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme

RESEARCHER/S: T L Sani (8606908A)

SCHOOL/DEPARTMENT: SHCD Social Work

DATE CONSIDERED: 16 July 2019

DECISION OF THE DEPARTMENTAL COMMITTEE: Approved

RATIFIED BY THE WITS HREC (NON-MEDICAL): 19 July 2019

EXPIRY DATE: 16 July 2021

DATE: 26 July 2019

CHAIRPERSON: Dr F Masson

Cc: Supervisor: Ms Laetitia Petersen

DECLARATION OF RESEARCHER(S)

To be completed in **DUPLICATE** and **ONE COPY** returned to the Administrative Assistant, Room 8, Department of Social Work, Umthombo Building Basement.

I/We fully understand the conditions under which I am/we are authorised to carry out the abovementioned research and I/we guarantee to ensure compliance with these conditions. Should any departure to be contemplated from the research procedure as approved I/we undertake to resubmit the protocol to the committee. **For Masters and PhD an annual progress report is required.**

SIGNATURE

DATE

30/09/2019

PLEASE QUOTE THE PROTOCOL NUMBER ON ALL ENQUIRIES



Group Human Capital Management Department

Room 208 | Tshwane Academy | 11 Staatsartillerie Road | Pretoria West | Pretoria | 0002
PO Box 440 | Pretoria | 0001

Tel: 012 358 0062/ Fax: 012 358 0037

Email: janetd@tshwane.gov.za | www.tshwane.gov.za | www.facebook.com/CityOfTshwane

My ref:
Your ref: 4/6/1/1
Contact person: Janet M. Davies
Section/Unit: TLMA

Tel: 012 358 0062
Fax: 02 358 0037
Email: janetd@tshwane.gov.za

12 July 2019

To whom it may concern:

This is to confirm that the approved report from the City of Tshwane (generated 4/7/2018 and approved 9/7/2018) approving Ms Tania Sani's fieldwork and counselling at the Tshwane Leadership and Management Academy, includes in its scope her research activities and research report.

I trust this assists to clarify matters.

Kind regards

Ms J M Davies
DIRECTOR
TSHWANE LEADERSHIP AND MANAGEMENT ACADEMY



Participant Information Sheet – Lecturers/Instructors

Title: Black African women apprentices on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme

Dear Lecturer/Instructor,

My name is Tania Sani, and I am a post graduate student registered for the degree in MA in Occupational Social Work at the University of the Witwatersrand. As part of the requirements for the degree, I will be conducting research on women apprentices at the Tshwane Leadership and Management Academy. I hope that the information obtained will assist in gaining a better understanding of the needs of women apprentices on traditional male dominated apprenticeships.

As a lecturer / Instructor at this institution, you are in an ideal candidate to participate in this study. I therefore wish to invite you to participate in my study. If you accept the invitation, your participation would be entirely voluntary and you are free to withdraw at any time, without any penalty. There are no consequences or personal benefits of participating in this study.

If you agree to take part, I will arrange to interview you at a time and place that is suitable for you. The interview will last for approximately 45 minutes. If you choose to participate, you may withdraw from the study at any time, and you may also refuse to answer any questions that you feel uncomfortable with answering. If you decide to participate, I will ask your permission to tape-record the interview. No-one other than me and my supervisor at the university will have access to the recordings. The recording will be kept on a password protected computer for two years and following any publications, or for six years if no publications emanate from the study. A copy of your interview transcript

without any identifying information will be stored permanently in a password protected computer and may be used for further research.

Please be assured that your name and personal details will be kept confidential and no identifying information will be included in the final report. The results of the research may also be used for academic purposes (including books, journals and conference proceedings) and a summary of findings will be made available to participants on request.

Please contact me on 0611 546672 or sani@iafrica.com, or my supervisor, Ms. Laetitia Petersen: Laetitia.petersen@wits.ac.za if you have any questions regarding this discussion group.

If you have any concerns or complaints about the study, please contact the Human Research Ethics Committee (non-medical): Contact details – Chairperson: Jasper.Knight@wits.ac.za or the Administrator: Ms. Shaun Schoeman on 011 717-1408.

Thank you for taking the time to consider participating in the study.

Yours sincerely,

Tania Sani



Participant Information Sheet - Apprentices

Title: Black African women apprentices on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme

Good day Apprentices,

My name is Tania Sani, and I am a post graduate student registered for the degree in MA in Occupational Social Work at the University of the Witwatersrand. As part of the requirements for the degree, I will be conducting research on women apprentices at the Tshwane Leadership and Management Academy. I hope that the information obtained will assist in gaining a better understanding of the needs of women apprentices on traditional male dominated apprenticeships.

As a woman apprentice at this institution, you are in an ideal candidate to participate in this study. I therefore wish to invite you to participate in my study. If you accept the invitation, your participation would be entirely voluntary and you are free to withdraw at any time, without any penalty. There are no consequences or personal benefits of participating in this study.

If you agree to take part, you will be asked to attend a focus group discussion with no more than nine other apprentices of the same gender. The meeting will take place on the TMLA campus, at a time convenient to all the participants.

The focus group will last for approximately 1 ½ hours. I will ask your permission to tape-record the focus group discussion. No-one other than me and my supervisor at the university will have access to the recordings. The recording will be kept on a password protected computer for two years and following any publications, or for six years if no

publications emanate from the study. A copy of your interview transcript without any identifying information will be stored permanently in a password protected computer and may be used for further research.

Please be assured that your name and personal details will be kept confidential and no identifying information will be included in the final report. The results of the research may also be used for academic purposes (including books, journals and conference proceedings) and a summary of findings will be made available to participants on request.

Please contact me on 0611 546672 or sani@iafrica.com, or my supervisor, Ms. Laetitia Petersen: Laetitia.petersen@wits.ac.za if you have any questions regarding this discussion group.

If you have any concerns or complaints about the study, please contact the Human Research Ethics Committee (non-medical): Contact details – Chairperson: Jasper.Knight@wits.ac.za or the Administrator: Ms. Shaun Schoeman on 011 717-1408.

Yours sincerely,

Tania Sani

Topic Guide – Focus Group

Research study: Black African women apprentices' views on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme:

Focus group

Demographic details:

Age:_____

Gender:_____

Race:_____

Home language:_____

Residential area:_____

Highest Qualifications:_____

Year of apprenticeship:_____

Type of apprenticeship:_____

Research study: Black African women apprentices' views on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme:

Focus group

Discussion questions:

1. Technical apprenticeships are often viewed as being “men’s work”. Do you agree or disagree with this, stating your reasons?
2. This institution has an almost equal number of women and men apprentices. Do you feel that men and women apprentices are treated equally by instructors and section managers? Yes/No? Explain your reasons.
3. This institution used to only admit men. Do you feel that enough has been done to make women feel included and comfortable during their apprenticeship?
4. Artisans are known to use “bad language” in the workplace. Has this been your experience, and if so, how do you deal with this during your apprenticeship?
5. Have you experienced any form of sexism since you started your apprenticeship? If so, explain.
6. Have you experienced any form of racism since you started your apprenticeship? If so, explain.
7. Do you believe that having more women apprentices at this institution can improve the experience for other woman?
8. If you could make changes at this institution that will make your learning more enriching, what would those changes be?
9. Do you feel that having an induction programme about how to cope with the challenges as women on technical apprenticeships will be helpful? Yes/No? Explain?

Interview Guide - Instructors

Research study: Black African women apprentices' views on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme:

|Interviews

Demographic details for Key Participants:

Age:_____

Gender:_____

Race:_____

Home language:_____

Highest Qualifications:_____

Position at the institution:_____

Length of service at institution:_____

Research study: Black African women apprentices' views on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme:

Interview guide for key informants of the study:

1. Apprenticeships are often perceived to be “men’s work”. This institution now has an almost equal number of men and women apprentices. How have you adapted to this change?
2. Have you had to adapt the way you used to do things in class or the workshop, to accommodate women appies? Explain?
3. In your experience, how do women apprentices perform on their apprenticeships in comparison to their male counterparts?
4. Has the institution put in any special measures to meet the specific needs of women appies? Has this made a difference to their experience as apprentices? Please explain.
5. Do you feel that further measures should be implemented to make women apprentices feel more included on their apprenticeships? Please explain your answer.
6. In your experience, do you feel that certain tasks are better handled by your male apprentices and others by women appies? Please explain?
7. Artisans are known to use “strong language” in the workplace. Do you feel this has an impact on women apprentices? Please elaborate.
8. Women apprentices often out perform their male counterparts on their trade tests. What do you think the reasons are for this?



CONSENT FORM FOR PARTICIPATION IN FOCUS GROUP

“Black African women apprentices’ views on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme”

I hereby consent to participate in the above research study. The purpose and procedures of the study have been explained to me. I further consent to this interview/focus group being recorded.

I understand that:

- My participation in the study is voluntary and I may withdraw from the study without being disadvantaged in any way.
- I may choose not to answer any specific question asked if I do not wish to do so.
- There are no foreseeable benefits or particular risks associated with participation in this study.
- My identity will be kept strictly confidential, and any information that may identify me, will be removed from the interview transcript.
- A copy of my interview transcript without any identifying information will be stored permanently in a locked cupboard and may be used for future research.
- I understand that my responses will be used in the write up of a Masters Degree Project and may also be presented in conferences, book chapters, journals or books.

- I will not discuss any information discussed during the focus group with people outside of the group.

I further understand that:

- The recording will be stored in a password-protected computer) with access restricted to the researcher and research supervisor.
- The recording will be transcribed and any information that could identify me will be removed.
- When the data analysis and write-up of the research study is complete, the audio-recording of the interview/focus group will be kept for two years following any publication or for six years if not publications emanate from the study.
- The transcript with all identifying information directly linked to me, will be removed, stored permanently and may be used for future research.
- Direct quotes from my interview/focus group, without any information that could identify me may be cited in the research report or any other write-ups of the research.

Name: _____

Date: _____

Signature: _____



**CONSENT FORM FOR THE AUDIO RECORDING OF FOCUS GROUP
(APPRENTICES)**

Title: Black African women apprentices' views on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme.

I hereby consent to this interview being recorded.

I understand that:

- The recording will be stored in a secure location (a password-protected computer) with access restricted to the researcher and research supervisor.
- The recording will be transcribed and any information that could identify me will be removed.
- When the data analysis and write-up of the research study is complete, the audio-recording of the interview will be kept in a password protected computer for two years following any publication or for six years if not publications emanate from the study.
- The transcript with all identifying information directly linked to me, will be removed, stored permanently and may be used for future research.
- Direct quotes from the group discussion, without any information that could identify me, may be cited in the research report or any other write-ups of the research.

Name: _____

Date: _____

Signature: _____



CONSENT FORM FOR PARTICIPATION IN INTERVIEWS

“Black African women apprentices’ views on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme”

I hereby consent to participate in the above research study. The purpose and procedures of the study have been explained to me. I further consent to this interview/focus group being recorded.

I understand that:

- My participation in the study is voluntary and I may withdraw from the study without being disadvantaged in any way.
- I may choose not to answer any specific question asked if I do not wish to do so.
- There are no foreseeable benefits or particular risks associated with participation in this study.
- My identity will be kept strictly confidential, and any information that may identify me, will be removed from the interview transcript.
- A copy of my interview transcript without any identifying information will be stored permanently in a locked cupboard and may be used for future research.
- I understand that my responses will be used in the write up of a Masters Degree Project and may also be presented in conferences, book chapters, journals or books.

- I will not discuss any information discussed during the focus group with people outside of the group.

I further understand that:

- The recording will be stored in a password-protected computer) with access restricted to the researcher and research supervisor.
- The recording will be transcribed and any information that could identify me will be removed.
- When the data analysis and write-up of the research study is complete, the audio-recording of the interview/focus group will be kept for two years following any publication or for six years if not publications emanate from the study.
- The transcript with all identifying information directly linked to me, will be removed, stored permanently and may be used for future research.
- Direct quotes from my interview/focus group, without any information that could identify me may be cited in the research report or any other write-ups of the research.

Name: _____

Date: _____

Signature: _____

Appendix J

CONSENT FORM FOR THE AUDIO RECORDING OF INTERVIEWS
(INSTRUCTORS)

Title: Black African women apprentices' views on traditional male-dominated technical vocational training programmes: A case study of an apprenticeship programme.

I hereby consent to this interview being recorded.

I understand that:

- The recording will be stored in a secure location (a password-protected computer) with access restricted to the researcher and research supervisor.
- The recording will be transcribed and any information that could identify me will be removed.
- When the data analysis and write-up of the research study is complete, the audio-recording of the interview will be kept in a password protected computer for two years following any publication or for six years if not publications emanate from the study.
- The transcript with all identifying information directly linked to me, will be removed, stored permanently and may be used for future research.
- Direct quotes from the group discussion, without any information that could identify me, may be cited in the research report or any other write-ups of the research.

Name: _____

Date: _____

Signature: _____

8606908a:Sani_Final_Research_report._Final.10_03_2020.excl..

ORIGINALITY REPORT

13%

SIMILARITY INDEX

8%

INTERNET SOURCES

3%

PUBLICATIONS

11%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1

Submitted to University of the Western Cape

Student Paper

2%**2**

www.careerhelp.org.za

Internet Source

1%**3**

Submitted to University of Johannesburg

Student Paper

1%**4**

hdl.handle.net

Internet Source

<1%**5**

caarpweb.org

Internet Source

<1%**6**

wiredspace.wits.ac.za

Internet Source

<1%**7**

www.emeraldinsight.com

Internet Source

<1%**8**

www.sajip.co.za

Internet Source

<1%**9**

Submitted to De Montfort University

Student Paper

<1%