

https://dspace.org/

Challenges in the implementation of retention policy in the Department of Home Affairs

Machethe, Maemo Peter

2011-11-24
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/10852

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

CHALLENGES IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF RETENTION POLICY IN THE DEPARTMENT OF HOME AFFAIRS

By

MAEMO PETER MACHETHE

A research report submitted to the Faculty of Law, Commerce and Management, University of Witwatersrand, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Management in Public Policy.

JUNE 2011

ABSTRACT

Retention of personnel should form and remain part of the core business of all government institutions which intend to remain competitive in the world where swords of war on talent continue to erode the public sector. The aim of the research was to unmask and understand the challenges on implementation of retention policy within the department of Home Affairs. A qualitative study was undertaken and literature review on retention, staff turnover, labour turnover, talent and manpower was conducted. Relevant secondary data were searched and interviews undertaken with senior and middle managers of the Department responsible for policy development and implementation, constituting the main source of primary data.

The research revealed that most senior and middle managers in the Department are not aware of the existence of the Department‘s retention policy and thus contribute to its non-implementation.

Challenges on implementation of the policy were also found to be associated with poor leadership, emotions and lack of defined skills needs, lack of communication and a poorly co-ordinated approach towards the implementation process. Retention is a critical factor to success and each organisation has to develop a systematic approach to address turnover challenges based on its unique needs.

DECLARATION

I, Maemo Peter Machethe, declare that this research report is my work. It is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Management in Public Policy in the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in this or any other University.

MAEMO PETER MACHETHE

June 2011

DEDICATION

Special thanks goes to my mother, Linah Machete, a former domestic servant who sacrificed her life for the foundation of my education, and to my wife, Maggie Forbes, for her understanding and unwavering support during my academic journey.

To my three boys, Katlego, Tokelo and Bonolo, the challenge is on and I pray that you follow in my footsteps and explore the academic arena with zest and determination. Mr Mbobo Mhlahlandlela Mabena, thank you for being an inspiration as we undertook our academic journey together.

To my younger brother Charles, your editing contribution did not go unnoticed. To all scholars at Mahadikana High school in Ga – Kibi village, your rural background should not deter you from achieving your dreams. May the grace of the Sovereign Artist (our Lord), continue to bless your life and future academic endeavours.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My devoted vote of appreciation goes to my supervisor and mentor through the research report journey, Dr Horácio Zandamela. Thank you for the vote of confidence in me and your unselfish devotion of time after normal working hours. You are indeed a unique Mentor.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ASD	Assistant Director
ASGISA	Accelerated Growth Initiative for Southern Africa
DD	Deputy Director
DHA	Department of Home Affairs
DPSA	Department of Public Services
HRD	Human Resources Development
HRM	Human Resources Management
IDP	Individual Development Plan
IMS	Immigration Services
JIPSA	Joint Initiative Programme for Skills Acquisition
MIS	Management Information Systems
MM	Middle Managers
SM	Senior Managers

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ..... **I**

DECLARATION ..... **II**

DEDICATION ..... **III**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ..... **IV**

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ..... **V**

TABLE OF CONTENTS ..... **VI**

CHAPTER ONE **1**

INTRODUCING THE STUDY **1**

1.1. Introduction 1
1.2. Study background 1
1.3. Legislative framework 3
1.3.1. Purpose of the White Paper on Human Resource Management of 1997 4
1.3.2. Vision and mission 4
1.3.3. Changing the human resource management culture 5
1.3.4. Policies suggested by the White Paper on Human Resource Management 5
1.4. DHA overview 7
1.5. Department structures 8
1.5.1. IMMIGRATION SERVICE 8
1.5.2. CIVIC SERVICES 9
1.5.3. ASYLUM SEEKERS MANAGEMENT BRANCH 9
1.5.4. SUPPORT SERVICES, WHICH INCLUDE HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT 10
1.5.5. COUNTER CORRUPTION, SECURITY AND VETTING 11
1.5.6. LEGAL SERVICES 11
1.6. Problem statement 12
1.7. Purpose statement 13
1.8. Research questions 14
1.9. Significance of the study 14
1.10. Delimitations and limitations 15
1.11. Assumptions 16
1.12. Structure of the report 16

CHAPTER TWO 18

LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORITICAL FRAME WORK 18

2.1. Introduction 18
2.2. Leadership and management in the policy implementation process 18
2.3. Retention and related concepts 19
2.4. Retention within a South African context 20
2.5. Retention within a global context 21
2.6. Labour turnover drivers 22
2.7. Labour turnover costs 24
2.7.1. High financial costs 24
2.7.2. Service quality 25
2.7.3. Loss of expertise 25
2.7.4. Loss of business opportunities 25
2.8. Retention management 27
2.9. Obstacles to retention 28
2.10. Turnover factors 29
2.11. Management style 30
2.12. Staffing 32
2.12.1. Factors which can assist organisations in staff retention 32
2.12.1.1. Employee's needs 32
2.12.1.2. Policy changes 35
2.12.1.3. Modification of human resource systems 36
2.12.1.4. Micro organisational strategies 38
2.12.1.5. Employees as assets 39
2.12.1.6. Corporate strategy priority 41
2.12.1.7. Personnel research 42
2.12.1.8. Human capital theory 44
2.12.1.9. The practice of exit interviews 45
2.12.1.10. Human resource strategy 45
2.12.1.11. Talent-ship 47
2.12.1.12. Talent management model 50
2.12.1.13. Talent retention as a risk 50
2.12.1.13.1. The talent challenges 50
2.12.1.14. A decision framework 52
2.12.1.15. Job satisfaction 52
2.12.1.16. Turnover research 53
2.12.1.17. Turnover data 54
2.12.1.18. Retention framework 56
2.13. Capacity building and public administration 59
2.14. Conceptual frame work 60

CHAPTER THREE 67

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 67

3.1. INTRODUCTION 67
3.2. RESEARCH APPROACH 67
3.3. DISADVANTAGES OF QUALITATIVE APPROACH 70
3.4. POPULATION AND SAMPLE 71
3.5. DATA COLLECTION AND SAMPLE 71
3.6. CASE STUDY METHODOLOGY 71
3.6.1. DISADVANTAGES OF CASE STUDY 74
3.6.2. PRIMARY AND SECONDARY DATA OVERVIEW 75
3.6.3. PRIMARY DATA 76
3.6.4. ADVANTAGES OF INTERVIEWS 78
3.6.5. SECONDARY DATA 80
3.6.6. SAMPLING 80
3.6.7. DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION 81
3.6.8. VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY 83
3.6.9. EXTERNAL VALIDITY 84
3.6.10. INTERNAL VALIDITY 85
3.6.11. CONSTRUCT VALIDITY 86
3.6.12. CONFIDENTIALITY 86
3.6.13. OBJECTIVITY 86
3.6.14. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS 87
3.6.15. CONCLUSION 88

CHAPTER FOUR 89

DATA PRESENTATION 89

4.1. Introduction 89
4.2. Themes of discussion 89
4.3. Responses recorded in respect of themes discussed with senior managers (SM) 90
4.3.1. RETENTION POLICY MANAGEMENT AND CO-ORDINATION 90
4.3.2. RESOURCES ALLOCATION 91
4.3.3. EXISTING TALENT/SKILLS 91
4.3.4. RETENTION POLICY SUCCESSES AND CHALLENGES 92
4.3.5. CAUSES OF RETENTION POLICY CHALLENGES 92
4.3.6. RECOMMENDATIONS 92
4.4. Interviews conducted with middle managers (MM) at the level of Deputy Directors (DD) 93
4.4.1. RETENTION POLICY MANAGEMENT AND CO-ORDINATION 93
4.4.2. RESOURCE ALLOCATION 94
4.4.3. EXISTING TALENT/SKILLS 94
4.4.4. RETENTION POLICY SUCCESSES AND CHALLENGES 94
4.4.5. CAUSES OF RETENTION POLICY CHALLENGES 95
4.4.6. RECOMMENDATIONS 95
4.5. Responses elicited from middle managers at the level of Assistant Directors (ASD) 95
4.6. Interviews with recently resigned managers (RM) 96
4.7. Conclusion 98

CHAPTER FIVE 99

DATA ANALYSIS 99

5.1. Introduction 99
5.1.1. Talent management 99
5.1.2. Retention policy implementation 100
5.1.3. Policy co-ordination and communication 101
5.1.4. Leadership 103
5.1.5. Resource allocation 104
5.1.6. Policy monitoring and evaluation 104
5.1.7. Policy stakeholder management 105
5.1.8. Organisational structure 106
5.1.9. Policy objectives 107
5.1.10. Accountability 108
5.2. Conclusion 109

CHAPTER SIX 110

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS 110

6.1. Introduction 110
6.2. Conclusion 110
6.2.1. Leadership 110
6.2.2. Retention policy management 111
6.2.3. Talent management 112
6.3. Recommendations 113
6.3.1. Leadership 113
6.3.2. Talent management 113
6.3.3. Retention policy management 113
6.3.4. Future research 114

REFERENCES 115

APPENDICES 123

APPENDIX A: LIST OF INTERVIEWEES 123

APPENDIX B: INTERVIEW REQUEST LETTER 124

APPENDIX C: RESEARCH THEMES 125

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCING THE STUDY

1.1. Introduction

The success of reducing employee turnover in this modern age is centred within proper design and efficient implementation of human resources policies such as retention. Phillips and Connelle (2003) explain that during the last decade employee retention has become a serious and perplexing problem for all types of organisations. The authors further argue that managing retention and keeping the employee turnover rate below target and industry norms is one of the most challenging issues facing business. The perplexing high employee turnover in the Department of Home Affairs influenced the researcher to investigate challenges on implementation of retention policy in the Department.

1.2. Study background

The Department of Home Affairs (DHA) is an organ of state established in terms of the South African Constitution Act No. 108 of 1996. Section 195 of the Constitution prescribes the basic values and principles governing public administration which are a high standard of professional ethics that must be promoted and maintained, a public administration which must be accountable with good human resource management and career development practices to maximise human potential.

Within its mandate as outlined in terms of its strategic document, the DHA must contribute towards a safe and secure South Africa where

citizens are proud of their identity and immigration is managed in a way that contributes towards economic development. In order to ensure that all government departments achieve national objectives and their mandates, the Department of Public Service (DPSA) was established to oversee all other government departments and be a custodian of all Government policies. In 2004, the DPSA sanctioned a study to investigate the reasons for terminations in the public service and the review of, among others, the practice of exit interviews.

The DPSA drew up a policy guide (Levin, 2006) to assist Government Departments to manage retention. The guide requires all Government institutions to develop their own comprehensive retention strategies in the light of their own unique needs and circumstances. In response to the DPSA policy guide, the Department of Home Affairs drafted its retention policy in 2007 which finally became effective in 2008. Regardless of the existence of the policy, employee turnover continues to trouble the Department. The research was as such a preliminary evaluation to establish the challenges on implementation of the retention policy.

Although government departments are by nature not profit-driven, employee retention still plays a critical role in service delivery. Employee retention forms part of modern business and will compound into the future, a point correctly alluded to by Phillips and Connelle (2003). Employee turnover continues to be one of the most unappreciated and undervalued issues facing business leaders.

Herman (1999) argues that workforce stability is an important component of attraction, development and retention of highly skilled professionals and that the investment in productive employees becomes obsolete if retention of key employees is neglected. Employee turnover has serious consequences for any organisation if

not correctly managed, and it is on this basis that the researcher studied the challenges surrounding the implementation of retention policy in the Department of Home Affairs. When an employee of a large complex organisation such as the Department of Home Affairs departs from the organisation, not only does he/she leave with experience, but a wealth of knowledge and organisational or institutional memory is lost and this will have negative long term effects until an appropriate replacement is recruited, trained and developed.

The study is explanatory where the researcher seeks to understand the challenges on implementation of retention policy within the Department of Home Affairs. Neuman (2006) explains explanatory research as ‘‘research in which the primary purpose is to explain why events occur and to build, elaborate, extend or test theory”. He maintains that explanatory research builds on exploratory and descriptive research and goes on to identify the reasons something happens. He adds that the researcher in explanatory research goes beyond focusing on the topic or providing a picture of it, but looks for causes and reasons. When painting the difference between explanatory, exploratory and descriptive, the author advises that, explanatory research assists in theory or principle testing, elaborates and enriches a theory explanation, extends a theory to new issues, supports or refutes an explanation of prediction, links topic or issues with a general principle and determines which of the difference explanations is best.

1.3. Legislative framework

Human resources in government are managed in terms of prescribed legislation to enable efficiency and effectiveness. As part of the transformation of the public service, the White Paper on Human Resource Management (No. 18594 of 1997) was developed and

enacted to streamline and set future goals for human resource management.

1.3.1. Purpose of the White Paper on Human Resource Management of 1997

The purpose of the White Paper on Human Resource Management No. 18594 of 1997 is to provide a policy framework that will facilitate the development of human resource management practices which support an effective and efficient public service geared for economic and social transformation. Human resource management is therefore regarded as one of the strategic instruments of the transformation agenda for the public service. The White Paper was also aimed at ensuring that all public servants are treated as valuable assets focused on service delivery.

1.3.2. Vision and mission

The vision of the White Paper is that human resource management in the public service will result in a diverse, competent and well-managed workforce capable of, and committed to, delivering high quality services to the people of South Africa. The White Paper further outlines its mission as being to ensure that human resource management in the public service becomes a model of excellence in which service to society stems from individual commitment instead of compulsion. The management of people should be regarded as a significant task for those who have been charged with the responsibility and should be conducted in a professional manner. Human resources as assets should, according to the White Paper, be managed in terms of values derived from the Constitution and they

include fairness, equity, accessibility, transparency, accountability, participation and professionalism.

1.3.3. Changing the human resource management culture

The White Paper prescribes that human resource management within the public service will need to undergo a fundamental change in order to actualise management principles such as the delegation of day-to-day management decisions to line managers; the development of a service delivery-oriented multi-skilled and multi-cultural workforce; the continuing drive for efficiency and effectiveness; and creation of a flexible environment that takes into account both the operational needs of the organisation and the needs of the employees.

1.3.4. Policies suggested by the White Paper on Human Resource Management

Various policies identified in the white paper include:

1.3.4.1. Human resource planning

According to the White Paper, national and provincial administrators should develop human resource strategies which are integrated within their strategic and operational plans. Human resource planning is essential in order to ensure that an organisation's human resources are capable of meeting its operational objectives. Human resource planning ensures that an organisation obtains the quality and quantity of staff it requires, makes the optimum use of its human resources, is able to anticipate and manage surpluses and shortages of staff, and develops a multi-skilled, representative and flexible workforce, which enables the organisation to adapt rapidly to a changing operational environment. Human resource planning requires an assessment of the

human resources which will be required to deliver the operational objectives in the organisation's strategic plan, and an assessment of the organisation's existing human resource capacity.

1.3.4.2. A career in public service

The public service should, according to the White Paper, be a career service offering opportunities for development and advancement through improved performance and career management and the removal of unnecessary barriers.

1.3.4.3. Increased competition

Most suitable persons should be identified from the widest pool of talent.

1.3.5. Recommendations in the White Paper on Human Resource Management

Among recommendations advanced in the White Paper are policy stakeholder management, capacity in national and provincial governments in human resource development, policy communication, institutional mechanisms, capacity building and the creation of a baseline on skills as key in ensuring successful implementation of the White Paper objectives. The White Paper further recommended that all line managers and human resource practitioners should be fully informed of their respective human resource management responsibilities, and of how their performance will be assessed in relation to these. Employees at every level should be informed about how the new approach to human resource management will affect them and the roles they are expected to play in establishing the baseline. A comprehensive human resources audit should be

undertaken to identify the gaps in the current human resource management policies and practices.

The audit should cover human resource planning and information systems; human resource management organisation and structures; human resource management skills; and the development of a human resource management strategy that will begin to close the gap between existing policies, practices and capacity with regard to the future needs of national departments and provincial administrations.

The strategy should include clearly articulated objectives, aligned to the organisation's strategic and operational goals; time-bound targets for the transformation of individual human resource management practices; and assignment of responsibilities and resources for implementation. Monitoring and evaluation is essential, and the implementation of the strategy should be continuously monitored and evaluated in order to ensure that targets are met and that policies and practices are improved in the light of past experience.

1.4. DHA overview

For a researcher to proceed with ease when conducting research within any organisation, it is necessary that the researcher knows and understands the role, culture, long-term, medium-term and short-term goals and the values of the organisation that is being studied.

The Department of Home Affairs is a government organisation established under Section 197 of the South African Constitution No. 108 of 1996. The Department is mandated to establish and maintain a population register of citizens in the country and keep and maintain a movement control system detailing records of people departing and entering South Africa. The Department also has a responsibility to

legalise foreign nationals who intend residing in the country, whether on a temporary or permanent basis for tourism and employment purposes. Clients receiving services from the Department of Home Affairs includes established entrepreneurs, potential investors, tourists, economic migrants, foreign government representatives and other travellers. The data kept and managed by the Department assists government in planning for service delivery and resource allocation.

1.5. Department structures

In order to achieve its mandate of servicing both citizens and foreign nationals, the Department of Home Affairs is structured as follows:

1.5.1. Immigration service

The Immigration branch of the Department derives its mandate from the Immigration Act No. 13 of 2002. It is responsible for ensuring that people leaving and entering the Republic of South Africa through the country's ports of entry are properly documented and have appropriate valid travel documents issued by their respective countries of nationality. The Immigration services represents the Department at the Security and Justice cluster because of the critical role of ensuring that fugitives from justice, known terrorists and listed prohibited and undesirable people, as defined in terms of the Immigration Act are not allowed to depart or enter South Africa and compromise national, or international, security.

The branch is also responsible for ensuring that foreign nationals intending to invest and open businesses, conduct employment, visit, tour and study in the country are issued with appropriates permits. It is this branch that is also responsible to assist the private sector and government to bring scarce skills to build capacity for the country by

consulting and co-ordinating stakeholder relations with the business community, non-governmental organisations and other government departments which includes Trade and Industry, Labour, and Higher Education.

1.5.2. Civic services

The Civic Branch has a responsibility to record, keep and maintain the national population register which clearly identifies the total number of citizens in the country. All births, marriages and mortality records are kept and maintained by the branch. The branch is also responsible for issuing of birth certificates, identity documents, death certificates, marriage certificates and travel documents to South African citizens. This branch operates in terms of the South African Citizenship Act No. 88 of 1995; the South African Passports and Travellers Documents Act No. 4 of 1994; the Birth and Death Registration Act No. 51 of 1992; the Marriages Act No. 25 of 1961; the Customary Union Act No. 120 of 1998; the Identification Act No. 68 of 1997; and the Civil Union Act No. 17 of 2006.

1.5.3. Asylum seekers management branch

This branch operates in terms of the Refugee Act No. 130 of 1998 and is responsible for accepting applications from asylum seekers and determining whether the applicants do indeed have a valid fear of persecution in order to qualify as refugees, or whether their cases are unfounded.

1.5.4. Support services, which include human resource management and development

This branch is the custodian of policies in the Department as it is responsible for ensuring adherence to Government policies regarding resources management. This branch is the backbone of any organisation because it must manage, co-ordinate and ensure the development of policies such as:

a) Recruitment and Selection Policy
b) Employee Retention Policy
c) Employees Remuneration Policy
d) Employee Performance Management Policy
e) Employee Development Policy
f) Bursaries Policy
g) Leave Policy
h) Overtime Policy
i) Performance Appraisal Policy
j) Employee Code of Conduct Policy and other relevant policies.

The development of the above policies will contribute towards personnel retention as the recruitment and selection policy will assist Human Resource practitioners in ensuring that the recruitment and selection process targets the right employees for the benefit of the organisation. Policies which govern remuneration, performance appraisals, overtime remuneration, employee development, leave, bursaries, and codes of conduct will also assist in enhancing possible retention efforts.

1.5.5. Counter corruption, security and vetting

This branch is responsible for corruption prevention, awareness and investigations, and the physical and documents security of the Department's resources. It derives its mandate from legislation which includes the Prevention and Combating of Corrupt Activities Act and Minimum Information Security Standards (MISS).

The branch is also responsible to ensure that all personnel in the Department have security clearances and or are issued with appropriate security clearances in order to access sensitive information about personal identity, marital status, addresses, parents and children's records, foreign investors, tourists and visitors entering and departing from the country.

It is also responsible for co-ordinating and managing stakeholder relations with other security departments such as the Security Intelligence, the South African Police Services, the Justice Department and other relevant stakeholders.

1.5.6. Legal services

The Legal services branch is mandated to draft or initiate the drafting of, amend, or initiate the amendment of legislation on behalf of the Department. It is further responsible for litigating or initiating litigation, defending or co-ordinating the defence of the Department against litigation by any party who feels aggrieved or adversely affected by an administrative decision, action or inaction by the Department. Although the Department has other branches, it is sufficient to mention but a few as above that play a critical role in ensuring the functionality of the Department.

1.6. Problem statement

Retention policy implementation in the Department is co-ordinated and monitored at head office. Head office as the custodian of the retention policy should promote the successful implementation thereof in order to ensure that the Department functions at the required skills capacity for the purpose of high quality efficient service delivery. According to the DHA termination of service database (2010), the Department of Home Affairs has in the past financial years (2005/2006, 2006/2007, 2007/2008, 2008/2009 and 2010) lost its experienced personnel to both the private and other government sectors. Some of the more seriously affected branches in the department are the Legal Service Section which lost more than ten legal experts, Counter Corruption, Vetting Services and Investigations branches which lost Vetting Officers and Corruption Investigators respectively. The Immigration Service of the Department responsible for investigation of identity fraud in the country and Immigration law enforcement also continues to lose key personnel. All the above mentioned branches complement each other in managing immigration in South Africa. With a view to understanding the challenges on retention policy implementation, the research is conducted at the national level of the Department and covers the period 2005 until 2010.

The DHA financial reports (2005-2010) indicate that millions of rand in taxpayers' money was used in financing employee development through various institutions of higher learning and in-house programmes as part of employee career development. Some of these developments included in-house programmes presented by different institutions in partnership with the Department or the Department's educational practitioners, while bursaries are also awarded as financial assistance towards both undergraduate and postgraduate studies.

Legally qualified individuals have also, from time to time, been seconded to the state attorneys to serve articles for a period of two years in order to become eligible to be admitted as qualified attorneys. In contrast to personnel development, the Department had up to the 2009/2010 financial year, more than fifty vacant positions at both senior and middle management level, while on other levels, the Department had more than 200 vacant positions as a result of labour turnover and the inability to fill the vacant positions. In 2009 alone, the Department's turnover reached an overwhelming 250 departures: 55 of those who left were permanent employees while 200 were on contract as interns and had worked in the Department for periods ranging from six months to a year and longer.

Turnover in the Department has negatively affected service delivery and resulted in senior management appointing many employees to act in the vacant positions for periods varying from one year to five years since 2005. Although a lot of research work has been done and written on human resources management and policies such as retention, recruitment and performance management, there is, however, no strong emphasis on retention of general employees other than in the case of specialised fields such as Medicine, Mathematics, Science Teachers and Engineering. At the time of data collection for the study, the Department had just lost more than five permanent employees from the Legal Services and Immigration Services due to turnover. A significant number of 50 contract workers from the Information Technology branch, Immigration branch, Human Resources and Civic Services were also lost as their contracts came to an end.

1.7. Purpose statement

The purpose of the research is to investigate and understand the challenges surrounding the implementation of the retention policy in the Department of Home Affairs from 2005 until 2010. Investigation of

these challenges will be conducted at the national level of the Department of Home Affairs as a custodian of policies. The understanding will be sought through intensive interrogation of literature and the conducting of comprehensive interviews with managers playing a critical role in both the development and implementation of policies within the Department. Empirical data was gathered to enable meaningful analysis, interpretation, findings and recommendations in respect of the studied phenomenon. The study is also intended to contribute towards addressing the knowledge gap, encompassing retention of employees, and contributing towards a better understanding of issues pertaining to retention of employees. Finally, the study makes policy recommendations.

1.8. Research questions

Research questions that will guide the study are as follows:

a) Primary research question

What are the challenges regarding the implementation of retention policy in Home Affairs?

b) Secondary research questions

Are managers aware of the existence of the retention policy and do they understand their role in the policy implementation process? How is the policy process managed in the department?

1.9. Significance of the study

A lot of material from both a theory base and case studies on retention has been written and developed over the years. Although a lot of research work has been conducted on human resources policies such as retention, recruitment, and performance management, there is no

strong emphasis on retention of other general employees other than in the case of specialised fields such as Medicine, Mathematics and Science Teachers and other fields such as Engineering.

The Department of Home Affairs plays a central and critical role in South Africa and the international economy. Other than being responsible for citizenship records management, recording all births and mortality in the country, the Department plays a critical role in economic growth in the Republic as it is mandated by Parliament to issue relevant temporary and permanent residents permits to foreign nationals who are generally skilled and those with scarce skills required for employment by both private and public sector employers in the country. The Department's critical economic role is supported by government initiatives such as the Joint initiatives Programme for Skills acquisition (JIPSA) and the Accelerated Growth Initiative for Southern Africa (ASGISA). The significance of the study is that it will contribute to the current dialogue on retention of key personnel within the public service and further assist Home Affairs as a Government department to interrogate the awareness of its managers about the existing policies, their commitment to implementation, and whether they are indeed accountable. The study will also encourage the Department to review its policy management process, and will guide future policy development and the implementation process. It will also renew interest in research in personnel retention within Government institutions.

1.10. Delimitations and limitations

The research is specifically an investigation of challenges on implementation of retention policy in the Department of Home Affairs. Being a case study, the focus was on the implementation stage of the policy and does not include the investigation of the causes associated

with high turnover within the Department. There was also no attempt made to investigate reasons for non-implementation of retention policy in other government departments.

1.11. Assumptions

The terms “retention management”, “talent management” and “talent-ship” are used interchangeably in the research report and have the same meaning.

1.12. Structure of the report

The research report is structured as follows:

- **Chapter One: Introduction:** Introduces the study and background details, the study context and an overview of the Department of Home Affairs. The chapter further highlights the challenges and constraints the DHA faces regarding high labour turnover, and this provides the problem statement and purpose of the research. It also includes questions driving the research.

- **Chapter Two: Literature Review:** This chapter outlines detailed existing literature reviewed consisting of books, journals and research reports on labour turnover, talent management, manpower planning, personnel management and public policy management. The chapter further presents the interrelation of stakeholders during policy development and implementation.

- **Chapter Three: Research Methodology:** This chapter discusses the research paradigm on which the research is based, the approach and techniques employed to sample, collect and present data, and how it should be analysed in the completion of the research report.

- **Chapter Four: Data Presentation:** The chapter takes a close concise look at the managers within the Department of Home Affairs responsible for retention policy implementation. It also examines their understanding of their roles, policy existence awareness, implementation challenges, challenges, causes and recommendations.

- **Chapter Five: Data Analysis:** This chapter analyses data collected during the study and provides an interface with the existing body of knowledge on retention globally.

- **Chapter Six: Conclusion and Recommendations:** Only conclusion is drawn from the data collected, presented and analysed in conjunction with the existing body of knowledge. The researcher makes recommendations based on emerging issues and the findings of the research. The recommendations are advanced to assist policy developers and implementers during the policy management process.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORITICAL FRAME WORK

2.1. Introduction

The assets of every organisation are divided into two parts and these are its people and everything else. Retention of key personnel is widely written about as best performing organisations are believed to have the best retention policies and development strategies. This point is correctly alluded to in Armstrong and Stephens (2005) who argue that policies exist to provide guidance for action and set limits to decision-making, outlining what should be done in certain circumstances and how particular requirements or issues should be dealt with. It notes that all managers have a responsibility to find out which policies impact on their work.

2.2. Leadership and management in the policy implementation process

Every organisation must have leaders and managers who will steer the organisation or corporate strategy through policies designed in consideration of the organisation's unique short-, medium- or long-term goals. Kroon (1994) defines a manager as anyone who holds a leadership position and who takes the lead in the performance of a specific function or group of functions in the enterprise. In order for policy objectives of any organisation to be realised, an organisation requires leaders and managers who will pursue the vision of the organisation with vigour. Armstrong and Stephens (2005) view leadership as focusing on people as the most important resource and that leadership is a process of developing and communicating a vision for the future, motivating people, and gaining their commitment and engagement. This view of leadership is shared by Lusthaus, Andriene,

Anderson, Carden and Montalvan (2002) who define leadership as the process through which leaders influence the attitudes, behaviours and values of others towards organisational goals. The authors also define management as concerned with achieving results by effectively obtaining, deploying, utilising, and controlling all the resources required, namely people, money, facilities, plant and equipment, information and knowledge.

2.3. Retention and related concepts

Phillips and Connelle (2003, p. 2) define retention as ‘‘the percentage of employees remaining in the organisation” and that high levels of retention are desired in most job groups. Turnover is defined as ‘‘the percentage of employees leaving the organisation for whatever reasons, it is the length of time an individual or employee is employed by the organisation and is usually related to the concept of employee loyalty’’.

Sandler (2005) identifies employee turnover as a serious problem and that the question on how to retain highly talented and valued people is very important. The author indicates that previous research focused on individuals rather than the organisation or business. Employee turnover is viewed as the common voluntary cessation of membership in an organisation by an individual who receives monetary compensation for participating in that organisation.

Turnover consists of movement into and out of the boundaries of an organisation (Van Der Merwe and Mille, 1976, p. 38). Rowland, London, Ferris and Sherman (1980, p.15) explains Manpower Forecasting as the process of collecting and analysing information to determine the future supply of, and demand for, any given skill or job category. The authors proceed to define Manpower Planning as the

process of developing policies and programme to achieve a desired balance between the supply of, and demand for, human resources.

2.4. Retention within a South African context

In his report on executive mobility within the manufacturing industry, Van As (2001) states that the South African economy has moved quickly towards greater openness and competitiveness and that with democratic elections in 2004, South African companies are faced with having to compete not only in a local environment but also on a global scale. This resulted in increased mobility of highly talented employees and consequently, there is both a shortage and a greater demand for professional and specialist staff at all levels.

The assertion above not only applies to private organisations but has also influenced how government conducts its business in an effort to deliver efficient services to South African citizens and non-citizens. Van As (2001) further argues that employee turnover has rapidly become one of the key organisational focus areas and that many world class organisations have learnt that retention of high calibre employees cannot be underestimated; they have therefore developed innovative ways and means in order to retain talent. Citing the Corporate Leadership Council (1998), Van As (2001) adds that the retention of high value knowledge workers is becoming an increasingly important problem faced by organisations globally and that the financial impact of knowledge worker turnover is vastly under-appreciated by most organisations, since the hidden nature of turnover costs, such as lost productivity, conceals their true magnitude.

Cappelli (2000, p. 104) in Van As (2001) argues that ‘‘fast moving markets require organisations that are continually refreshed’’. He goes further to indicate that ‘‘the old goal of HR management to minimise

overall employee turnover needs to be replaced by a new goal which is: to influence who leaves and when. If managing employee retention in the past was akin to tending a dam that keeps a reservoir in place, today it is more like managing a river. The object is not to prevent water from flowing out but to control its direction and speed''.

Rothwell and Fellow (1980) agree that labour turnover proves dangerous if one chooses to live with it, and it is damaging when it involves losing good people, and that high turnover means skills shortage and instability. The authors add that labour turnover should be a special concern for personnel managers who should be responsible for the operation of agreed action plans, and that attracting, developing and retaining highly skilled professionals has become a critical concern for organisations around the world regardless of the type and size of the organisation or industry. This is supported by Cappelli (2000) who argues that employers of choice will win the battle to attract and retain highly skilled professionals, and this will be done by adopting a far more strategic approach to work force management and creating a win-win employment situation where the employee and the employer each get what they want.

2.5. Retention within a global context

Talent management is a worldwide challenge for all global industries and governments; many developed and developing countries are putting measures in place to lure skilled people to their respective countries. This is most seen through the relaxation of immigration laws aimed at attracting and retaining skilled individuals. Silzer and Dowell (2010) advise that talent is becoming recognised as a core competitive asset in business organisation and as the currency of business. Organisations are beginning to understand the strategic value of talent and the impact that strong talent can have on financial outcomes. The

authors argue that there is a major shift in how business executives view the value of Human Resources and that the sustaining element in organisations through the business cycles is the critical talent an organisation has. According to the authors, a paradigm shift in human resource planning should be defined by a driven strategy integrated with other processes, managed as a core business practice and engrained as a talent mind - set.

Silzer and Dowell (2010) proceed to argue that effective talent acquisition starts with a sound talent strategy with a conscious decision regarding what methods and approaches to use to identify, source and secure the best talent in the market. Accordingly, the talent strategy starts with an organisation strategy which clearly identifies the business competitive position. An organisation needs to identify the talent strategy that best supports its business strategy; create a compelling employment value proposition that clearly articulates how the organisation differs from others; capture the employment value proposition in a memorable employment brand; detail the employment brand into a talent brand and a leadership brand that articulate the calibre of talent and leadership for the organisation; determine the most productive channels to the talent and what the organisation wants; and continuously measure success. This view is supported by Dorrian (2005) who argues that in attempting to attract the right calibre of human capital, countries will develop the kind of infrastructure that will appeal to the people they want to attract. The author further argues that in the fight for human capital, differentiation means not only being seen to be different, but also being believed to be better.

2.6. Labour turnover drivers

In order to retain key personnel, human resource management must top the agenda of any organisation in order to minimise labour

turnover. Lusthaus, *et al.* (2002) argue that human resource management involves the planning, implementation and monitoring of the organisation's labour force and that the human resources of each organisation are the most valuable assets and should be linked to the organisation' s strategic objectives and mission. An organisation will not be able to successfully understand and manage employee turnover if turnover push and pull factors are not identified and understood. Push factors are those factors which act to repel the individuals from a location, they often mirror pull factors and might include loss of employment opportunity, low wages, and poor living conditions. According to most researchers, both push and pull factors impact on the individual who makes a decision about moving to, leaving or staying in a job.

The following have been identified as internal drivers for employee turnover (Phillip, 2002, p. 11)

- Career growth in all directions – in addition to obtaining new skills, employees want the opportunities to advance within an organisation as they grow and develop these skills.
- Desire to be on the leading edge – employees are interested in an organisation with a strong reputation, considers being on the leading edge of technology or product development, or the best at what they do.
- The need to learn new skills, desire for all types of benefits, desire for competitive compensation, need for caring, supportive environment, the need for performance-based rewards and the need for recognition for participation, accomplishment and contribution.

Travaglione and Marshall (2000) also identified employee personal characteristics which includes kingship responsibilities such as number

of children, job related factors which includes lack of best HR policies in reducing turnover, job content which includes overall job stress and alternative employment available to an employee as push factors for labour turnover. Herman (1999) identified five principal reasons why people leave one organisation for the other as being inadequate opportunities for growth; incompatible corporate culture and insufficient support relationship with co-workers; insufficient support to get tasks accomplished; and dissatisfaction with compensation offered. Hesselbein, Goldsmith and Beckhard (1997) contributes by identifying some of the causes of employees walking out of the organisation as workplace tensions, lack of commitment and recognition as people are not prepared to invest their talents without recognition; and lack of adequate returns.

2.7. Labour turnover costs

Turnover is costly to every organisation and the costs can be either of monetary value or non-monetary value. Travaglione and Marshall (2000) identified labour turnover costs as the following: replacement costs which includes advertisement costs, review résumé and interview costs, selection costs, orientation costs, low productivity costs, training costs which includes technical training costs and separation costs which includes exit interviews, administration and lost productivity. These costs are also advanced by Phillips and Connell (2003) who identify some of the negative impacts of turnover on the organisation.

2.7.1. High financial costs

These have a significant economic impact on the organisation, in both direct and indirect costs. Sometimes the costs alone become a critical strategic issue. In a tight labour market where the success of the

company depends on employees with critical skills, recruiting and retaining the appropriate talent can determine the success or failure of the organisation.

2.7.2. Service quality

With so much emphasis on excellent service to external and internal customers, high turnover has a significant negative impact on the quality of customer service. High turnover of front line employees is often regarded as the most serious threat to providing external customer service.

2.7.3. Loss of expertise

Particularly in knowledge industries, a departing employee may have the critical skills needed for working with specific software, completing a step in an important process, or carrying out a task for a project.

2.7.4. Loss of business opportunities

Turnover may result in a shortage of staff for a project or leave the remaining staff unprepared to take advantage of a new business opportunity. Phillips and Connell (2003) are supported by Wanous (1982) when he indicates that an individual work group is cohesive and that turnover can have negative effects on those remaining that go beyond additional workload and possible performance declines. The author maintains that turnover has an effect on the organisation leading to a decline in morale as the attitude of those remaining is affected. He further points out the impact of undifferentiated control of strategies and strategic opportunity costs as the organisation may be forced to cancel or postpone potential profitable ventures due to labour turnover. Although turnover has negative consequences, the author

argues that labour turnover may also have positive effects on an organisation as it affords an organisation the opportunity of replacing the departing employees with high performers. When discussing why retention is a serious problem, Phillips and Connelle (2003) and Slamet (1999) present three difference costs that result from employee turnover, namely the direct expenses incurred for recruiting, interviewing and training; indirect costs which includes the impact on customers, office moral and other employees who may consider leaving as an option; and lastly opportunity costs, which is the loss of opportunities as a result of managers and other employees having to fill the void until a replacement is hired.

The high costs associated with employee turnover are further supported by Gaylard (2004) in his research titled the factors influencing the retention of information technology workers. The researcher argues that a fundamental issue with high staff turnover is cost, as most organisations do not measure the cost of turnover and therefore the financial impact of such turnover is vastly under-estimated. The researcher presents turnover costs by citing the Corporate Leadership Council (1998) that the cost of employees leaving includes more than the replacement of the worker and includes the cost of loss of talent, productivity, quality shortfall, poor morale and customer dissatisfaction. The loss of an employee is also a major negative contributor to organisational or institutional knowledge.

From the organisational perspective, employee turnover can represent a significant cost in terms of recruiting, training, socialisation and disruption, as well as a variety of indirect costs. Frank, Finnegan and Taylor (2004) agree that labour turnover is costly to organisations and this includes hidden costs such as loss of client relations, reduced morale of remaining staff members, increased strain on remaining resources, and loss of potential innovations and tacit knowledge which

goes with the employee. Reddy (2004) also warns that labour turnover has become very costly to organisations when it comes to the cost of recruiting and training and the fact that finding talented people is tough, the real challenge is retaining them and that it must be clear to an organisation that in the knowledge economy, a company‘s most important assets are its personnel. Lehman, Dieleman and Martineau (2008) agree and indicate that literature on health workforce mobility relating to both international and internal migration states that factors affecting retention have commonly been categorised into pull and push factors. Pull factors are identified as those which attract an individual to a new destination. These might include improved employment opportunities and/or career prospects, higher income, better living conditions, or a more stimulating environment.

This view is shared by Mashatola (2003) who conducted research on factors that influence turnover and retention of Call Centre Agents. In his findings, he argues that the loss of skilled employees through turnover has negative implications for organisational effectiveness because individuals depart with intangible knowledge about products, markets and customers. He goes further to suggest that the loss can be either monetary or non-monetary

2.8. Retention management

Phillips and Connell (2003) and Mobley (1982) argue that, given the significance of turnover, it is important for the manager and prospective manager to be able to analyse, understand and effectively manage employee turnover. Furthermore, employee turnover is not a new issue, being as relevant today, and its importance will be even greater in the future. Managing retention is thus a constant challenge for any organisation. “The awareness of the issue has heightened in the last decade and from all indications, the problem will be more

serious in future decades. Even in slow economic times, most human resources (HR) executives find attracting and retaining talent to be a big problem'' (Phillips and Connell, 2003, p. 2).

Rowland, London, Ferris and Sherman (1980) argue that although sophisticated forecasting techniques are available, they are rarely used because of inflexibility and lack of responsiveness to rapidly changing conditions, while on the other hand much more attention is given to developing manpower planning policies and programmes. Phillips and Conelle (2003) support the notion and report that some organisations do a superb job of managing retention, whereas others fail miserably. The issues are not always externally driven but often lie within the organisation, sometimes in the approach to the problem. Wanous (1982) on the other hand, argues that from a management perspective, every organisation needs a mechanism for evaluating the utility to the organisation of turnover, referring to the means of integrating the positive and negative costs and consequences of turnover for individuals at differing levels of position, performance and potential. Wanous (1982) adds that the process is crucial for collecting valid management information on turnover costs and consequences, in order to effect changes on causes of turnover such as behavioural intentions, job satisfaction, and organisational commitment. Fletcher (2002), on the other hand, maintains that bureaucratic delays and a failure to co-ordinate the process of implementing a retention strategy contribute to high labour turnover rates.

2.9. Obstacles to retention

Managers in all organisations have an inherent responsibility to identify and address obstacles to retention. Sandler (2005) identifies obstacles to retention of personnel as non-flexible policies, and advances the need for flexibility to be built into policies in order to retain workers.

Flowers and Hughes (1975) state the reasons why employees stay in the company as equally important like the reasons why employees leave the organisation. In order to reinforce the right reasons for employees to stay, the company can do this by providing conditions compatible with employee values for working and living. Managers must according to the researchers stop the rituals of finding out why people leave and start investing resources in the positive management of retention.

2.10. Turnover factors

Boshoff, Van Wyk, Hoole and Owen (2002) highlight that employee turnover processes in an organisation is still poorly understood in spite of the many models that have been built over the years. The researchers indicate that excessive turnover can have significant direct and indirect costs for corporations. These costs are related to the recruiting, selecting, inducting, training, and development of staff to replace those who have left the organisation. The researchers further argue that it is therefore of practical and significant importance to identify the variables that are related to employees' intention to leave or to remain with an organisation. The researchers proceed to make reference to Steers and Mowday (1981), who also advance that it has long been realised that the decision of the intention to quit is probably influenced by various factors. According to Brown (1996) intention to quit is the strength of an individual's view that he or she does not want to stay with his or he current employer. Mobley (1977) and Steers and Mowday (1981) indicate that intention to quit or to stay with an employer starts with the evaluation by the individual of his or her current situation and then moves through different stages until a firm intention to quit is reached and a final outcome is the decision to leave the organisation.

2.11. Management style

Managers who are contained within themselves can also contribute to high labour turnover and a change in attitude and people centred management style may be required. In Lehman, Dieleman and Martineau (2008) the research discovered that management style and organisational policy were significant factors in staff retention. Staff valued open and transparent communication that included an explanation of the larger organisational picture. It was further seen as beneficial when communication flowed freely both up and down the organisational structure. Staff seemed to remain more positive about their job and the organisation if they felt that their ideas were being listened to and not simply dismissed. Staff consultation was also raised as an issue, and as with communication, staff wanted this to be open and transparent. Staff felt that accountability from management was important and acknowledgement of staff contributions was raised as an organisational and management issue. Staff further identified that feeling valued and rewarded for doing a good job was more important than singling out an individual staff member, especially as most staff work as part of a team.

Staff also needed recognition of their work when performing under difficult circumstances and identified a management style that promoted staff morale and team cohesion as important for retention. The ‘‘ideal’’ manager was described as supporting staff and being aware of the individual needs of his/her staff. The manager allowed staff, especially experienced staff, to assume some responsibility and autonomy. According to participants, this type of manager dealt with staff fairly and this increased respect and trust in them. Staff wanted to ensure that organisational policies and procedures were developed through staff consultation, and allowed for some flexibility in their

implementation. They further identified family-friendly work policies which allow part-time work and flexible working hours as significant for retaining staff.

Van Der Merwe and Miller (1976) identified the following as variables affecting absence and turnover:

a) The worker - the educational level of the worker, whether related to his/her economic background, standards and norms of the community he/she comes from;
b) The job - how secure is an employee within his or her job;
c) Department - how is communication, planning, organizing and human relations;
d) The company climate - factors such as management style, organisational structure, wages and salary administration are considered;
e) Locality of the employer - whether other employment opportunities are readily available, and also transport facilities;
f) The economic climate.

The worker's educational level, job security, working environment and climate are factors that mostly need to be kept in mind as they are normally turnover contributory factors.

Turnover measures may be useful in locating problem areas within an organisation and in order to diagnose possible causes. Van Der Merwe and Miller (1976) warn that in labour turnover, withdrawal is a final event. The authors proceed to add that a certain amount of labour turnover is inevitable and in fact desirable for a number of reasons. It contributes to industrial efficiency by introducing new blood and also provides employees with opportunities for advancement. It enables new or expanding industries to obtain labour and without the

employment of new workers, an organisation's labour force would become static with the age structure heavily skewed on the side of the older workers.

2.12. Staffing

Hilgert, Schoen and Towle (1978) identify staffing as one of the critical function of management, as it involves recruiting new workers and determining that they are qualified employees to fill all positions in the organisation. Staffing includes selecting and training employees, appraising their performance and providing for their development and advancement within the organisation. For every employee, the following needs are vital: security, good compensation, justice and mutual trust, good working conditions, a feeling of importance, the opportunity for self-expression, sense of belonging to a group, opportunity to participate in decision-making, and recognition and praise.

2.12.1. Factors which can assist organisations in staff retention

2.12.1.1. Employee's needs

An organisation which makes an effort to retain key personnel regularly identifies factors that can assist in employee's retention. Capelli (2000) suggests that the following will enable success in attracting, developing and retaining skilled professionals:

a) Compensation where salary packages are valuable;
b) A culture where social ties with the colleagues are encouraged and employees are made to feel as part of the team;

c) Location and flexible arrangements where the individual's needs are met in respect of flexible hours; and
d) Job design where special tasks and assignments are included in job requiring specialist skills.

All of the above points, as correctly pointed out by Capelli (2000), are indeed critical in an effort to manage employee turnover as they address the question of employee job satisfaction.

Capelli (2000) further argues that retention of employees can be a source of competitive advantage with companies seeking to retain those employees who have a positive effect. The researcher adds that employees leave the organisation as they feel unappreciated and de-motivated. In the analysis of knowledge in an organisation, the researcher explains knowledge in an organisation with reference to the definition of Despress and Hiltrop (1995), and explains it as the engine that transforms economics and the stuff of organisational success. The researcher argues that staff retention is critical because of the employee's tactical and business knowledge.

Despress and Hiltrop (1995) concurs with Capelli (2000) that employers must indeed ensure that competitive compensation is offered; be flexible regarding where and when work can be conducted; consider adding lifestyle benefits cost effectively to the organisation; offer employees health care benefits; be flexible about how the work should be done; take genuine interest in employee's career aspirations and personal lives; permit employees time off for personal and family matters if their work can be completed later at home; recognize positive contributions; provide feedback or communicate company progress and developments; have regular meetings to discuss employees' involvement in company plans; and administer exit interviews.

Johnson (1998) also supports Despress and Hilltrop (1995) and Capelli (2000) as he asserts that turnover reduction strategies that include improved selection, good employee orientation, realistic job previews, appropriate training, effective communications, job design, supervisory leadership, equitable pay systems, data analysis in respect of employee turnover, and opportunities for career advancement, can arguably have an impact in minimising high employee turnover.

Herman (1999) also suggests that staff development, building emotional bonds and working relationship can also positively contribute towards employee retention. Herman and Gioia (2000) on the other hand, warn that management style can enhance or be detrimental to an organisation, because when an employee leaves, he or she does not really leave an organisation but the manager.

Gillham and Ristevski (2007) in their research in the health sector found that career opportunities were identified as a central factor in attracting and retaining allied health professionals to rural practice. They argue that in order to retain staff, there is a need to provide opportunities for professional development, and also for the recognition of advanced skills and performing of extra duties. An effective strategy used by some managers was to regularly discuss with staff their career aspirations and plan ways to achieve them.

Davidson (2001) indicates that retaining talent is more important than acquiring new blood. When citing Long (1951) and Maclachlan (1985) he argues that there is no doubt that some mobility of labour is inevitable and that turnover cannot be wholly eliminated. The researcher proceeds to point out that a certain degree of mobility of labour is in fact healthy to an organisation, in that unsuitable persons are weeded out. However, the researcher warns that the overall effect

of turnover is harmful and it is critical that turnover be properly managed in order to reduce its negative effects.

Lehmann, Dielman and Martineau (2008) advise that, for the purposes of analysis and strategy development, it is helpful for policy-makers and managers to have some way of organising the different factors. The report found that the work environment encompasses the push and pull factors, such as local labour relations, management styles, existence or lack of leadership, opportunities for continuing education, availability of infrastructure, equipment and support.

It is further argued in the report that there are a number of individual factors which may impact on decisions, such as origin, age, gender and marital status and those employers will not have much influence beyond the work environment, though in the public sector the government can have more influence on both the local and national environment. It is further argued in the paper that it is critical to look into the location of structures involved in decision-making relating to employment and wider issues of attraction and retention.

2.12.1.2. Policy changes

Hesselbein, Goldsmith and Beckhard (1997) advise that an organisation of the future requires a focus on new human resource policies and that such an organisation must help people gain skills and self-reliance to master the new environment, and to find security and support. The authors suggest that companies or organisations need to realize that valuing human capital and team collaboration are the best ways to create workplaces capable of addressing the challenges of the global economy. They argue that in order to compete effectively, businesses must attract, retain, motivate and utilize effectively the most talented people they can find. According to the authors, the most

critically important resource of every organisation walks out the door every day.

Hesselbein, *et al.* (1997) further hold that assumptions and policies that derive from the corporatist model of the twentieth century are an inadequate basis for the social contract. Organisations for today will be wise to critically evaluate their current systems and practices for attracting, developing and retaining human capital. The authors emphasize the importance of an organisation having a human strategy department and advise that organisations need to periodically survey their talent base to determine the appropriate course of action necessary for maintaining and building credibility. Human capital is built through organisational credibility, the authors maintain.

Demonstrating impeccable character in adhering to core values, exercising competence by continuous improvement and innovation in products and services, and always demonstrating care for the people who make it all happen will be the mark of the organisation of the future, the authors reiterate. The new work contract where employees take responsibility for their own career enhancement is critical and can be as burdensome for organisations to manage as it is for individuals concerned. This is supported by Hesselbein, *et al.* (1997) who indicates that some of the burdensome factors leading to high labour turnover are the decline in opportunities for promotion, increase in workload and decline in support staff, the increasing influence of the knowledge worker, and the frequent lack of connection and contribution.

2.12.1.3. Modification of human resource systems

Hesselbein, *et al.* (1997) recommend the following factors to enable efficiency of retention strategy and argues that measures aimed at

retaining employees must be clearly identified, employees must be made aware that the employer wants to keep them, provide recognition, provide opportunities for development and involvement, challenge the compensation plan, relax the culture by reducing bureaucracy, and provide for entrepreneurial opportunities. The authors further warn that organisations that are unable to modify their human resources systems to match tomorrow's realities will lose their competitive edge, while those that are willing and able to create a dynamic new human resource model will retain the high knowledge talent needed to succeed in tomorrow's competitive global economy.

Beach (1980) adds that a discipline of human resource planning has developed and it is now being widely used to guide managers in the planning and development of human resources management; allocation of the required financial resources is also a necessity. The author proceeds to argue that tools being used to manage retention do not appear to be adequate to meet the needs of management for proper evaluation and planning, and additional tools have to be developed to ensure effectiveness. It is only through effective human resource planning that management will be prepared to have the right people at the right places, at the right time to fulfil both organisational and individual objectives.

With proper planning and evaluation, Beach (1980) argues that management is able to attract, retain, develop and utilize talent to meet organisational challenges of the future. At the same time, the organisation is able to provide employees with realistic and satisfying career opportunities. The author advises that human resources planning must include forecasting which anticipates talent requirements, programming which involves plans to meet the needs, and lastly evaluation which assesses the effectiveness of the forecasting. During evaluation, the author advises that tools and

procedures for evaluation must include in-depth review of specific policies, systems, programmes and activities.

2.12.1.4. Micro organisational strategies

Thulare (2003) conducted research regarding retention of medical doctors in the public service. In her findings, she identified micro-organisational strategies as some of the strategies that can contribute positively to successful employee retention. The micro-organisational strategies include services of a retention manager, regular evaluation of employees' feelings and wants, managers with accountability, employee recognition programmes, market approach to retention, matrix organisations with more flexibility, continuous monitoring, and the practice of exit interviews.

Lehmann, Marjolein and Martineau (2008) in their research on staffing remote rural areas in middle and low income countries, argue that factors regarding attraction and retention are multi-faceted and complex but that there are no set answers to the problem. They further advance that answers are found through learning about what works in terms of fit between problem, strategy and effective navigation through the politics of implementation.

Morrell, Clarke and Wilkinson (2001) in their research on the use of models in the management of employee turnover, argue that a business needs a source of labour to function since labour is one of the factors of production. This is supported by Dibble (1999) who suggests that, as the psychological contract between employer and employee changes from job security and loyalty to employability where individual employees take charge of their own careers, employees who find that they are no longer getting what they want from their current job will look for alternatives. She proceeds to argue that employees

with confidence in their own abilities and competence will leave and these are often those employees an organisation would not like to lose.

Horak (2007) while researching the perceptions of factors influencing labour turnover of information technology workers in South Africa, indicates that exit interviews are unlikely to yield appropriate results as employees leaving an organisation may choose not to burn their bridges and decide not to tell the truth about their reasons for leaving. While making reference to Harvard Business Essentials (2002) the researcher proceeds to emphasize that the success or failure of many companies presently depends more on their human capital than on their financial or business assets. This view is supported by Slamet (1999) who indicates that job satisfaction comes from knowing that one is valued or considered an asset and the best demonstration of whether one is regarded as an asset is if the company is willing to invest in the person.

2.12.1.5. Employees as assets

Capowski (1997) in an *HR Focus* journal special report on strategies for managing retention, found that in 1990 companies were preoccupied with downsizing and very few looked ahead to a predictable shortage of talented employees. Presently, most organisations agree that employees are their competitive advantage and the question that remains is how to hold on to that competitive advantage. The researcher proceeds to add that 24 per cent of participating companies had a coherent personal and career strategy for employees and 38 per cent had a formal succession planning/career development programme in place. However, the researcher expressed a concern that lack of career development is a frequent reason employees choose to discontinue employment.

These findings are supported by Sandler (2005) where respondents advanced the following as tools to retention of employees: innovative compensation and benefits package; effective rewards and recognition; performance management aligning employee goals with business goals; strategies for increasing employee satisfaction; career planning and work life strategy; mentoring programme; merger and acquisition retention strategy; use of coaching for career development; and competency-based strategies. In support of employee retention, the researcher emphasised that if employees do not resign it is not necessary to hire new employees; and employers should make the work place a fun, clean, profitable, ethical and adventurous environment. The researcher further indicates that if one says this does not sound like business then one has missed the point of how the future is going to be.

Capowski (1997) warns of the loss to the employer once a higher performing employee leaves, and advises on the conduct of exit interviews as these may assist the organisation in alignment of its policies to suit the workforce. Sandler (2005) based on the HR Focus journal, states that once an organisation is hiring diverse numbers of employees, the challenge shifts to retaining them. Employee turnover is expensive, as replacing each worker, no matter how diverse, is expensive. The researcher advises that it benefits an organisation to consider every possible way to retain workers. The researcher highlights that it will be damaging for the organisation when high turnover of diverse employees is experienced.

Employees remain an organisation's competitive edge. Gaylard (2004) argues, citing Drucker (1994) that although most organisations say that people are their greatest assets, few practice what they preach, let alone truly believe it. Employee loyalty, as correctly pointed out in

Manchester Consulting (2000) no longer exists. Employees no longer expect to remain at a corporation until retirement and thus change jobs when presented with a compelling offer or when they are not receiving what they want from the company. An employer should therefore brand the organisation in a way that it remains an employer of choice.

2.12.1.6. Corporate strategy priority

Gruber (2008) highlights that the inability to retain knowledge workers with specialized skills as well as tacit knowledge and expertise that is difficult to transfer, has brought about a loss of knowledge and productivity for the organisation. The researcher argues that the war for talent can be won by first elevating talent management to a corporate priority and subsequently perpetually refining the employee value proposition. He further indicates that companies need to continuously communicate with their employees as this will result in sought-after employees being attracted and retained within the organisation. In order for companies to gain a competitive advantage, they will need to develop a firm understanding of knowledge workers, their development and their motivations so that appropriate retention policies can be implemented.

Gaylard (2004) notes that employee turnover is a serious problem and the question of how to retain highly talented and valued people is very important. Previous research focused on individuals rather than the organisation or business. Employee turnover is defined as the common voluntary cessation of membership in an organisation by an individual who receives monetary compensation for participating in that organisation. Employee turnover contributes to the potential benefits and disadvantages for organisations. Some of the negative effects of turnover are identified as economic costs, productivity losses, impaired service quality, loss of business opportunities, increased administrative

burden, and loss of morale among the remaining staff. The author further points out positive ramifications such as displacement of poor performance, infusion of new knowledge and technology, reducing labour costs when facing stiffer competition, maintaining ties with existing employees, and providing new business ventures.

Gillham and Ristevski (2007) in their research on recruitment and retention of allied health workers found that factors such as management style and organisational policy were significant factors in staff retention. Staff valued open and transparent communication that included an explanation of the larger organisational picture. Staff appreciated a two-way communication and their ideas being valued and not simply dismissed. The researchers further established that staff identified a management style that promoted staff morale and team cohesion as important for retention, and identified an ideal manager as one supporting staff and being aware of the individual needs of his/her staff. The manager is, according to the research findings, allowing staff especially experienced staff to assume some responsibility and autonomy. This kind of manager deals with staff fairly, which increased respect and trust in them.

2.12.1.7. Personnel research

Mobley (1982) indicates that, with the shortage of skilled manpower in South Africa and the emphasis which is nowadays placed on Human Resources, their development and better utilisation, one would expect personnel research to feature prominently in South African personnel departments. All fields of management could benefit from systematic and purposeful research on personnel management. The author further highlights a critical key activity that must always be kept in mind by all managers in order to sustain organisational growth. This critical activity is the regular review of the entire personnel management

function, its effectiveness and efficiency in fulfilling its role of assisting managers with their staffing challenges. An emphasis should be put on the determination of the need for results of costs involved in, and justification for, the usage of personnel management policies, procedures, practices, techniques, labour problems like absenteeism, labour turnover, productivity, and morale. It is argued in the journal that these factors should be continuously investigated in an effort to improve labour utilisation.

Ekman (1990) on the other hand, argues that, because management has been perceived as a set of tools and techniques, this inflexible mind - set has rendered people unable to change and leads to lack of vision. Where there is a lack of vision, it is hard to accept that the techniques and practices currently being applied are failing hopelessly. Most South African companies are faced with declining productivity, diminishing returns on investment, and poor quality of products and services. Yet the same tools are being applied in a continuously changing environment. Society in general is changing bringing about major shifts in values, yet the old methodology is used, hoping that things will come right. It is because of this inflexible mind - set that gaps in the market are not identified, key personnel are lost, and labour unrest becomes more common.

When citing Cappelli (2000) Reddy (2004) maintains that the flow of talent is inevitable and is influenced by labour market forces but that it is imperative for organisations to employ a system of talent management. The researcher proceed to state the effects of labour turnover as, loss of knowledge, negative impact on productivity, lowered morale of remaining staff, loss of momentum in the organisation, loss of organisational memory, and customer dissatisfaction. Most critically he indicates that the most important asset for every institution is the energy and loyalty of its people.

2.12.1.8. Human capital theory

Sandler (2005) identifies human capital theory which suggests that because the knowledge, skills and abilities that people bring to organisations have enormous economic value to the organisation; they need to be managed in the same strategic manner that other economic assets are managed. Barney (1991) emphasises a resource-based theory which also suggests that those resources which are rare, inimitable and non-substitutable provide sources of competitive advantage to the organisation. The author adds that since knowledge resides in people, a critical issue for companies operating in the new economy is retaining their valued employees. By making reference to the Institute of Singapore Labour Studies (2001) the author views employee turnover as having critical negative impacts on the development of the employee's technical competence, skills levels, morale of the remaining employees, and the image of the organisation.

The author differentiates between voluntary and involuntary turnover. With reference from Maetz and Campion (1998) employee voluntary turnover is defined as when management agrees that the employee has the physical opportunity to continue employment with the company at the time of termination, whereas turnover is defined as movement of the employee out of the organisation. The primary cost for employee turnover is the cost flow of intellectual capital which resides in people and that leaves the organisation.

The author identifies employee packages as important, taking into consideration the current economic climate in order to reduce employee turnover, since employee benefits constitute an indirect form of compensation intended to improve the quality of the work and personal lives of the employees. He maintains that benefits are no

longer peripheral, but are seen as part of the integral package that employers offer them voluntarily. They have become a significant cost and an employment advantage to employers, while providing the needed psychological and physical assistance to employees.

2.12.1.9. The practice of exit interviews

Lee and Whitford (2007) argue with reference to Cotton and Tuttle (1986), Selden and Moynihan (2000), and Tett and Meyer (1993) that relatively few studies examine the intent to leave in the public sector. The researchers argue that turnover is a conscious and deliberate intention to leave the organisation. In the research, it is argued that a large number of workers already move regularly between jobs in the public organisations and turnover affects organisational performance in the long term. The researchers further argue in the paper that his article fills the gap in the literature on public sector turnover by reaching back to the argument about exit, voice and loyalty. In the article, the researchers discuss a theory from Hirschman (1970) where it is argued that, a person exits when they leave an organisation and can express a voice of dissatisfaction with the organisation directly to management. People are less likely to state an intention to leave when satisfaction with the organisation is high.

2.12.1.10. Human resource strategy

Boudreau and Ramstad (2007) highlight the importance of Human Resources Strategy and Human Resources Framework. According to the authors, if one goes through his/her company or organisation's HR strategy, it will contain the same information as that which is contained in the company's competitors and this may include building the leadership pipeline, dealing with the brain drain of an aging workforce, reducing health care costs, or similar. On a topic titled: Uncharted

Talent Opportunities, the authors argue that in order to find the uncharted talent, this cannot only be a question of HR strategy but rather how well the entire organisation connects decisions about talent and how it is organised in the organisation's vital strategic interests. It is, according to the authors, important to know the following:

a) Where the organisation strategy requires that talent in an organisation be better that that of competitors.
b) Where the organisation talent and systems need to be different from those of the competitors.
c) Where payment of the fifteenth percentile of the salary should be paid.
d) Where more should be spent on pivotal talent programmes and practices than competitors and why.
e) If the organisation's strategic goal/s was to change or shift, which of the organisation's employees or structures would have to change?

The authors put talent-ship at the centre of attention by calling for an evolution beyond human resources to talent-ship. A leader can continue to navigate his/her strategic territory with inadequate talent and organisational tools or embrace and build a new decision science that illuminates the hidden opportunities that lie in great decisions about talent and how it is organised, where those decisions matter most and whether they are made. This, according to Boudreau and Ramstad (2007), is an essential evolution.

Whether it is called people, labour, intellectual capital, human capital, human resources, talent or some other term, the resource that lies within employees and how it is organised is increasingly recognized as critical to strategic success and competitive advantage. The authors indicate that evidence shows that it is still frustratingly difficult for most

business leaders to know precisely where and how investments in employee talent in an organisation actually drive strategic success, what academics call the “black box” (Boudreau and Ramstad, 2007).

The authors argue that the Human Resources profession should be among the most influential and strategically important, and it is expected that there will be significant advancements in the sophistication with which HR leaders drive organisational effectiveness and create sustainable strategic success. The authors emphasise conditions that mark the emergence of a decision science and identifies, among others, the following:

a) The resource is important for business success.
b) The resource is constrained.
c) There is well-developed professional practice supporting the resource, and providing the ability to implement decisions and monitor their effects.

2.12.1.11. Talent-ship

Silzer and Dowell (2010, pp. 13-14) also recommend that retention can better be managed through a migration from the traditional human resource management to a talent-ship approach. The authors describe talent as “referring to a pool of employees who are exceptional in their skills and abilities, either in a specific technical skill (such as software graphics skills) or a competency (such as consumer marketing talent), or a more general area (such as general managers or a high potential talent)”. Talent Management, on the other hand, is defined by the authors as “an integrated set of processes, programs and cultural norms in an organisation designed and implemented to attract, develop, deploy and retain talent to achieve strategic objectives and meet future business needs” (Silzer and Dowell, 2010, p.18).

The advocacy of talent-ship is supported in the New Decision Science by Boudreau and Ramstad (2007) who argue that the goal of a talent decision science is to increase the organisation's success by improving decisions that impact or depend on talent resources. According to the authors, the talent resource includes not just the talents that organisation knows about and manages, but all those talents that are potentially available and valuable, if only an organisation knew about them. It includes not just people an organisation has and how they are organised, but also the people an organisation can potentially get and what organisational decisions should be made. It is argued by the authors that talent-ship is to HR what finance is to accounting, and what marketing is to sales. It is articulated by the authors that Human Resources (HR) is a less mature profession since there is often less consistency in the decision models used within the profession when compared to finance. According to the authors, if one takes discussion questions for business leaders and ask ten controllers to address specific financial challenges and ask ten HR professionals to address a specific organisational or talent challenge, one is more likely to find non-alignment and inconsistency in HR than in Finance.

The cause of the inconsistency and misalignment is, according to the authors, normally evident in misalignment between HR professionals at headquarters and those that are in Business Units. There is a different approach in goal-setting in performance management and compensation, different assumptions and models for individual development from professionals who drive the design of succession planning and development systems. The talent-ship view is supported by Goldsmith and Carter (2010) who introduce the six phase system to talent management as follows:

a) Business Diagnosis

The organisation should continuously focus on its talent needs even if it is doing well. There must be internal realignment where innovation is promoted, people are not managed like commodities and the organisation does not become lethargic. Organisational capacity must match organisational growth with the intent to build talent resources for the future. The organisation should create consistent internal systems to evaluate performance and maintain an efficient hiring system.

b) Assessment

The organisation should regularly assess its performance and processes to enable investment in required skills.

c) Programme Design

Programmes should be designed to respond to the individual and organisational needs.

d) Implementation

Implementation of any programme or policies must always reflect the organisational goals.

e) On-the-job Support

Organisations support their talents on the job in order to enable transformation and successful implement reforms.

f) Evaluation

Evaluation of programmes such as talent development strategy must be regularly conducted against set standards that will serve as benchmarks or thresholds. Performance models can be used to evaluate individual managers to gauge their commitments and progress in attaining organisational goals.

The six phase system of talent management outlined above draws on the core phases in talent management; these are inseparable if an organisation is to successfully manage talent to its benefit.

2.12.1.12. Talent management model

Silzer and Dowell (2010) present five talent processes which should be applied by organisations which adopt a talent-ship model. The organisation should attract and select talent to the organisation, assess competencies and skills in talent, review talent and plan talent actions, develop and deploy talent, and engage and retain talent. The authors advise that the talent management model should, however, be driven by business strategy, integrated with other processes, managed as a core business practice, and engrained as a talent mindset.

2.12.1.13. Talent retention as a risk

Retention of talent should be managed as a serious risk factor for any organisation. Silzer and Dowell (2010) advises that effective retention efforts require examining each strategic talent pool to identify who is at risk and why, so that individualized retention plans can be created. This, according to the authors, may mean accelerating a career move.

2.12.1.13.1. The talent challenges

Goldsmith and Carter (2010) identified six challenges of talent management:

a) Opaque

This is a fundamental challenge when managers do not know how their current talent management works.

b) Egalitarian

There must be clear treatment of high performers and low performers and the recognition of talent.

c) Complex

The performance management process must not be complex but simplified.

d) Episodic

Discipline must be maintained where talent reviews, surveys, development planning and succession planning must be regularly conducted and not at the frequency determined by individual managers.

e) Emotional

Decisions on talent movement, promotions and key talent activities must not be influenced by individual knowledge and emotions but must be based on facts.

f) Meaningless

Talent practice must have teeth where human resources must be able to guide and respond to basic questions about talent practices. Talent practice must be consequential and managers must be held accountable where monetary reward can be given to deserving managers who are able to nurture and retain talent.

The factors identified by Goldsmith and Carter (2010) seem to factor in the Department's retention policy co-ordination and management. From the interviews it is apparent that emotions play some role on the decision whether to retain or not to retain, managers are expected to implement a policy which they are not always aware of, while human resource as the policy custodian lacks influence. The factors are

aggravated by lack of discipline in policy implementation where there are no policy reviews and a lack of reporting.

2.12.1.14. A decision framework

Boudreau and Ramstad (2007) advise that without a consistent decision framework connecting the various elements of the talent management systems and decisions, there is lack of consistent message to integrate core systems. Because of lack of common understanding of the key principles, talent and organisation management systems lack context and are seen as administrative or bureaucratic. The authors advocate a change in the traditional manner of Human Resources conducting its business, and the adoption of progressive missions, such as the mission of HR function being to increase the success of the organisation by improving decisions that depend on or impact people

2.12.1.15. Job satisfaction

Employee retention is, according to Frank, *et al.* (2004, p.13) “the effort by an employer to keep desirable workers to meet business objectives”. Employee engagement and retention represent two interlinked challenges facing organisation s in the 21st century. As the economic environment has changed, so have the behavioural scientist theories of employee motivation and satisfaction. The author observes that companies are more likely to be successful in keeping top employees if they actively train and develop talent, treat staff fairly, build trust, and focus on retention of high performers at all organisational levels. This notion of job satisfaction is supported by Robbins (1998: 21) as he defines job satisfaction as “the difference between the amount of rewards workers receive and the amount they believe they should receive”. Herman (1997) holds the view that

people stay in an organisation because they are valued, respected, earn legitimate recognition and are appreciated by being allowed to make a difference through their work contributions which allows them to gain meaning. Dobbs (2001) believes that staff retention often results from an emotional bond formed between management and employee and those factors such as compensation and career development are important to employees. The overriding factor for employees to leave an organisation is bad managers.

Gunsualey (2000) found that improving core benefits, training and development opportunities could appreciably improve work place loyalty. These findings are correctly supported by Hanay and Northam (2000) who also found that employee retention depends on the ability of management to carefully listen to employees and deploy resources strategically in areas where the greatest benefit was afforded to the organisation, and that turnover could be reduced by providing employees with realistic job previews, in which they were informed of both the positive and negative aspects of the job. The employees also needed to be educated about the culture, policies and working conditions of the organisation.

2.12.1.16. Turnover research

MorrelI, Loan-Clarke and Wilkinson (2001) argue that research in turnover remains critical as every business needs a source of labour, since labour is and remains one of the four factors of production. According to Mobley (1982) when an employee leaves an organisation, his/her leaving can have a variety of effects that not only impact on the organisation, but also the individual employee and wider society. The author suggests that a greater understanding of labour turnover is required as it can increase the degree to which organisation s and employees within organisation s can influence these effects.

Turnover is widely taken to mean voluntary cessation of membership of an organisation by an employee of that organisation. Morrell, Loan-Clarke and Wilkinson (2001) state that involuntary turnover may occur for reasons which are independent of the affected employee(s), such as the (real or perceived) need to cut costs, restructuring or downsizing. The researchers suggest that it is important to emphasize that the degree to which it is actually possible for organisation s or managers to influence turnover should be assessed alongside any measures of turnover such as functionality. If, according to the researchers, in all instances turnover appears to be unavoidable, that can redirect the focus of resources spending so that managers can look to minimize the disruption and inconvenience of an inevitable phenomenon.

It is argued by the researchers that, if turnover appears to be avoidable, this offers the potential for directed intervention. Turnover is often not measured in a sophisticated enough manner to enable differentiation between cases where employees have chosen to leave, and cases where they have had to leave for reasons outside of their control. Below is a crude measurement which is often used by organisation s. Even if organisation s of the future has 'virtual' employees, they will need to manage them as a resource. "When an employee leaves, this can have a variety of effects that not only impact on an organisation but also the individual employee and wider society". (Mobley, 1982, 15-31). These can be either positive or negative (Mobley, 1982; Hom and Griffeth, 1995: 13-33).

2.12.1.17. Turnover data

According to Forbes and McGill (1985) organisations do not properly manage labour turnover data to assist in future strategic or policy

decisions. An approach such as the formula below, does not distinguish between cases where people left because of dissatisfaction and cases of ill health, retirement and redundancy. A more sophisticated measurement needs to be adopted, it is argued by the researchers.

The formula below illustrates how some organisations measure turnover;

$$\frac{\text{Leavers in a year}}{\text{Average number of staff in post during year}} \times 100$$

Adopted from Forbes and McGill (1985)

Hilgert, Schoen, and Towle (1978) argue that, organisations must direct their will and resources towards decisions that will develop and enhance personnel management. They proceed to indicate that most enterprises direct their efforts towards specific objectives and that management is responsible for developing policies and plans of action to achieve objectives and for organizing tasks, people, and facilities to execute plans efficiently.

Organisations, it is argued, are the mechanisms through which management direct, coordinate and controls activities and resources. The mechanism is likened to a vehicle steering, which once faulty or improperly operated, the vehicle is apt to go off. Hilgert, *et al.,* (1978).

The authors describe an organisation, as the term used to describe a group of people working together to achieve common objective and that an organisation is most effective in pursuing its goals if the individual efforts of the people within the enterprise are coordinated and directed properly.

2.12.1.18. Retention framework

Van As (2001) argues that organisations have people as their primary assets and the attraction, development and retention of highly skilled employees should be seen as a priority in any business. According to the literature, new models have to be adopted by each organisation based on its unique situation and needs. As Capelli (2000) argues, successful organisations realise that they ought to rethink retention strategies and appreciate that they may not be able to minimise labour turnover but that they can influence the decision of highly skilled professionals to remain with the organisation. The literature further indicates that in developing retention models, organisations need to strive to become employers of choice in order to attract, develop and retain the best. Policies, frameworks or models need to be properly developed, coordinated and implemented. This view is supported Lehman, *et al*., (2000) who advises that, for the purposes of analysis and strategy development, it is helpful for policy-makers and managers to have some way of organising the different factors.

This notion is supported by Wood (1999) who argues that people in an organisation will determine how that organisation performs and that the key to retaining the best to ensure performance of the organisation lies in the identification of employees measures of success and communicating the results of their efforts. This view is shared by Dibble (1999) who also argues that retention actually begins prior to employment and starts with the job description, continues during the interview and lastly when the offer of employment is made. Dibble (1999) proceeds to indicate that recruitment consists of the following aspects:

a) Searching for potential employees
b) Finding methods of communicating with those identified

c) Informing those identified about the positions available
d) Determining whether they have the necessary skills
e) Describing how their career aspirations can be met within the organisation.

The principles of recruitment as outlined by Dibble (1999) explain the process that employers undertake in order to identify, recruit, develop and retain an employee to the benefit of the organisation. Employees normally ask themselves questions about an organisation pertaining to self-description of the organisation, staffing, mission/strategy, flexibility, employee developments, job expectations, rewards, supervision and team work and respect.

Boninelli and Meyer (2004) advocate for employer branding and proceed to define employee branding as a process of placing an image of being a great place to work in the minds of a targeted candidate pool. The authors further warn that the shortage of skilled labour has made it much harder for organisations to attract and retain employees and with so little available quality labour on the open market, organisations are forced to compete ever more fiercely for any available talent. According to the authors, employers should live their brand so that employees can be recruited for the brand, be immersed in the brand, and believe in the brand so that they can be prepared to fully deliver their best.

Thulare (2003) in his research on factors affecting retention of medical doctors in the public sector identified commitment where the employee is committed to the organisation, participatory management style where employees are involved and contribute to decision-making, teamwork and social ties where the friendships at work are fostered and a feeling of connectedness, focused reward and compensation which includes competitive salary packages, partnership with

employees where employees know what is happening in the organisation, work-life balance where employees are communicated to regarding the organisation's work life, culture, atmosphere, community, recreational opportunities, and school systems.

The diagram below highlights an organisational policy overview and indicates that there must first be a need within an organisation which must inform the organisation's strategic direction from which a policy can emanate and be developed for implementation.

Figure 1: Organisational Policy Overview



Adopted from an Expatriate Policy presented at the Mobility Conference, Ernst and Young, May 2010, Parys, Free State

Organisations must continuously assess and evaluate their retention needs, a point correctly alluded by Kaye, *et al.* (1999) and Capelli (2000), who argue that successful organisations realise that they ought to rethink retention strategies and appreciate that they may not be able

to minimize labour turnover but that they can influence the decision of highly skilled professionals to remain with the organisation.

2.13. Capacity building and public administration

Employee retention is an element of the notion of capacity building for the state, as explained by Adei and Badu (2007) who explain the emergence of New Public Management as a major shift in the field of human resources management. The authors indicate that public administration is said to be the action side of government, the means by which the purpose and goals of government are realised. It encompasses actions involved in effecting the intent or desire of government. The authors indicate that there is a belief that management is management and private sector practices are superior to the public sector. According to Awortwi and Sitoe (2006) in recent years public administration concepts and practices have been undergoing a complete overhaul with the aim of making them work better for both government and society. This in practice requires devolving new ways of organising, managing and improving the performance of public organisations. It also means development of new capacities and deployment and utilisation of human, material, information, technological and financial resources.

The authors emphasise public organisation reform; they do so by citing Pollitt and Bouckaert (2008:8) who argue that there is a need for public sector reform which consists of deliberate changes to the structure and process of public organisations with the objective of getting them to run better. The reform frequently also embraces changes to systems by which public servants are recruited, trained, appraised, promoted, disciplined or declared redundant.

On the other hand, the African Peer Review Mechanism (2007) found that lack of capacity is a major constraint to ongoing efforts to improve the quality of governance in all spheres and service delivery at optimal levels in the light of the socio-economic challenges. One of the recommendations from the South African Review Report No. 5 was that there is a need to design a comprehensive strategy for skills development and retention in the public sector to ensure effectiveness. The efforts can include regulatory frameworks, remuneration systems, education and training.

2.14. Conceptual frame work

2.14.1. Introduction

The conceptual framework on which this research is based recognises the complexity of policy implementation and outlines how the networks of bureaucracy in the Department of Home Affairs should relate in order to enable successful implementation of the retention policy. Bryand and Hanekom (2006) define Conceptual Framework as the mental conceptualization of an abstract idea or plan. The authors further define theory to mean expositions of the principles of science or a system of ideas explaining or predicting something.

Mouton (2009) explains conceptualization as the clarification and the analysis of the key concepts in a study and also the way in which a particular research product is integrated into the body of existing theory and research. The study will be approached with a combination of theories. The study will be founded on a combination of two theories, namely system theory and classical Management theory.

2.14.2. Applicable theories

2.14.2.1. System theory

White, Clayton, Myrtle, Siegel and Rose (1985) indicate that most of the time, relationships among events are so complex that no parochial explanation or set of explanations suffices and systems theory imposes a common conceptual order on a fairly wide range of events. The authors argue that it encourages the recognition of analogies and structural similarities between phenomena previously thought to share little in common.

The authors define a system as a set of units with relationship among them. It is further argued by the authors that, while the units are important, it is the linkages or relationships among the units that make it possible to speak of a system.

According to the authors, a system is characterized by the following:

a) Scope

This implies that the organisation's different units must be seen together to form the system; this is best explained by the authors by providing an example of traffic in the city by considering vehicles, traffic lights and pedestrians as part of a commuter flow in and out of the city or as part of the economy of the area.

b) The notion of purpose

The units forming the system are joined together for a purpose.

c) The notion of Holism

This characteristic implies that the system must be grasped as a whole and cannot be understood by studying only certain or few parts.

The authors indicate that a system has four features and they include input, output, processor and flow. The authors proceed to outline the network analysis technique for managers and explain the networks model as the interrelated flows of work that must be accomplished to complete a project. It is argued by the researchers that they visually portray the events and activities that are planned for the project and show their sequential relationships and interdependencies. The authors justify the systems theory by arguing that systems theory and approaches are used today by government managers, planners, analysts and theorists to understand complex phenomena, to solve problems of organisation and co-ordination and to plan and design for the future.

White, Clayton, Myrtle, Siegel and Rose (1985) comment that network analysis has four principal stages. Network Generation begins with specifications of the project's goal and objective. It moves from the conceptualization of what must be done to the precise specification of events and activities that are to be carried out in achieving the goal or objective. Secondly is network evaluation which means that once the project network plan is completed, it must be assessed by a manager to determine its soundness from the standpoint of its underlying logic. Thirdly, network monitoring which becomes a valuable managerial tool for the life of the project. It determines the extent to which the project proceeds as planned and whether managerial interventions are required. Fourthly, network modification occurs when for example monitoring indicates that the network plan has to be altered to maintain the required necessary managerial control.

Systems theory is also supported by Budd, Charlesworth and Paton (2006) who argue that the network approach assumes that policy outcomes are the result of interaction of strategies of various actors

and that the involvement of these actors is a consequence of the fact that they possess resources that require their involvement in the handling and solution of a particular problem. The authors add that actors in policy development and implementation fail to realise concerted policy outcomes because of the fact that they are unaware of their external dependencies and believe that they can solve problems on their own and impose their solution on other actors. Cloete and Wissink (2000) explain system theory as focusing on the contributions of interrelated forces to policy-making. John (1998) adds that the network approach stresses the importance of interactions between participants in the policy process.

2.14.2.2. Classical management theory

White, Clayton, Myrtle, Siegel and Rose (1985) explain classical management theory as the intellectual predecessor to systems theory in management. The authors argue that the theory is not a complete or adequate description of management in public or private life, but its concepts and principles, judiciously applied, can help bring order to what otherwise would be a confusion. According to the authors, the theory begins with the notion that management is a scientific discipline, and this implies that management can be systematically studied, resulting in cumulative knowledge and continual improvement. Classical management theory identifies five principles:

a) Division of labour which involves the allocation of tasks and specialization;
b) Matching authority and responsibility which entails the right to make decisions and to exact obedient;
c) Unity of command which dictates that an employee should receive orders from one supervisor only;

d) Centralization and hierarchy which is considered to belong to the natural order of things in the social world and deals with problems of complexity, distance, communication and overall work load;
e) Span of control which deals with the regularization of subordinates allocations.

The principles as outlined above ensure a systematic operational process where authority regarding decisions to be made is clear to all employees and a clear span of control is observed.

The classical organisation theory is further supported Miller, Roome and Staude (1978) who argue that classical organisation theory is mainly concerned with the structural framework of a formal organisation and is based on a set of principles which includes the principle of specialization where activities of an organised group are restricted as far as possible to the performance of a single function; the principle of co-ordination where the purpose of an organisation is to facilitate co-ordination and unity of efforts; the principle of authority where there is a supreme decision-making body; the principle of responsibility where the superior is at all times responsible for delegation of responsibilities; the principle of definition where the job description and interrelations are defined; the principle of correspondence where the responsibility and authority should correspond; the principle of span of controls which entails limitation on a number of subordinates to be supervised; and the principle of unity and command which channels the reporting line to one superior. Cloete and Wissink (2000) on the other hand, see the classical theory (institutional) as putting more emphasis on the fact that the different concerns and interests of government should be given preference. Cole (1990) however, indicates that the system in an organisation includes people, materials, information and finance. He proceeds to

argue that these inputs are organised, and activated so as to convert human skills and raw materials into products, services and other outputs which are discharged into the environment.

Cole (1990) defines an organ as a complex social system, responsive to a number of interdependent and important variables such as people, technology, organisational structure and the environment. Hult and Walcott (1990) are in support of a system approach and they argue that when two or more people wish to accomplish a common task, they often divide up the work, each taking care of a different part of the task. This strategy requires some co-ordination, and it may even be necessary to appoint somebody to do the job, it is argued. The approach allows people to specialize, doing a similar task repeatedly rather than moving from one kind of activity to another. In this way, people may become more efficient, producing more work for less effort. According to the authors, governance structures, especially those deep inside an organisation, seldom stand-alone but are linked in networks through which ideas and potential decisions pass before final acceptance or rejection. The authors further argue that networks link the individuals, groups and organisations at different levels of government whether in private or public sectors, that act together in the formation and implementation of policy.

2.14.2.3. Conclusion

It is evident from literature review that retention of knowledge or skilled workers is in general a daunting task for all organisations, including the public sector. It requires well planned, organised, controlled, co-ordinated and communicated strategy and policy. The literature acknowledges that employee turnover cannot be eradicated, but that retention can and must be managed. Labour/employee turnover is very complex and there is no single generic solution to address challenges

that organisations face today. There is really no set of answers to the problem of high staff turnover but through learning about what works in terms of fit between the problem analysis and adopted strategy navigation through the politics of retention policy implementation is possible. It is further evident from literature that staff turnover and retention are a deeply rooted area of specialisation which should occupy the heart of discussion for any organisation to succeed in efforts to effectively manage, attract and retain skilled personnel. Staff turnover can also be well managed within an organisational system such as the systems and classical management theory. Although there are critics of the systems and classical management theories, there is a strong argument that the theories remain relevant and applicable to today's organisations and if well implemented, can be a worthwhile investment in ensuring any organisation's success in policy management.

CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1. Introduction

The paper set out the evaluatory journey to examine challenges on implementation of retention policy within the Department of Home Affairs by engaging the Department's senior and middle management. The study is qualitative in nature, using data collected through interviews and literature review to understand the retention policy's implementation challenges. In this chapter the research methodology assumed towards completion of the study is outlined. It contains the explanation and justification of the applied research method, the research design, population and sample and data collection techniques.

3.2. Research approach

The study focused on the implementation phase of the policy and investigated challenges for implementation of retention policy within the Department of Home Affairs. In order to fully comprehend the retention problem confronting the Department and to harmonise the theory identified and the literature reviewed, a qualitative method approach was adopted to investigate the phenomenon.

Neuman (2006) highlights that the difference between the qualitative and quantitative paradigms is that in quantitative research, researchers are far more concerned about measurement issues than qualitative researchers. Quantitative researchers treat measurement as a distinct step in the research process that occurs prior to data collection. Researchers adopt a deductive approach, it is said, and they develop special terminology and techniques as compared to qualitative

researchers. Quantitative researchers think about variables and convert them into specific actions during a planning stage that occurs before and is separate from gathering or analyzing data. Creswell (2003) adds that qualitative research occurs in natural settings where human behaviour and events occur and the focus is on participant perceptions and experiences and the way they make sense of their lives.

Ulin, Robinson, Tolley and McNeill (2002) also indicate that quantitative researchers develop techniques that produce data in the form of numbers. The researcher moves deductively from abstract ideas to specific data collection techniques, to precise numerical information produced by the technique. For the purpose of the study a qualitative paradigm method was preferred because theory more often builds, moving from observations and open questions to more general conclusions through an inductive process. Creswell (2007) on the other hand, defines qualitative research as a situated activity that locates the observer in the world. The qualitative approach consists of a set of interpretation material practices that make the world visible. These practices transform the world. They turn the world into a series of representations including field notes, interviews, conversations, photographs, recordings and memos to the self. At this level, the author proceeds to argue, qualitative research involves an interpretative, naturalistic approach to the world. This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of or interpret phenomena in terms of the meaning people bring to them.

Creswell (2007) presents the following characteristics in respect of qualitative research: natural setting, collection of data in the field, researcher as a key instrument to data collection, participants meaning, inductive data analysis, and multiple source of data,

emergent design, theoretical lenses, holistic account, and interpretative inquiry. Brynard and Hanekom (2006), on the other hand, justify the usage of qualitative research and describe it as research that produces descriptive data as generally the participant's own written or spoken words pertaining to their experience or perception is captured. The authors outline the advantage of qualitative research as allowing the researcher to know people personally, to see them as they are and learn about their daily experiences.

According to Neuman (2006), qualitative research is characterized by the following: constructing social reality, cultural meaning, focus on interactive processes, events, authenticity is key, values are present and explicit, theory and data are focused, it is situational constrained, few cases, subjects, thematic analysis and the researcher is involved. The author proceeds to indicate that in qualitative research, as with quantitative, data is the empirical representation of concepts, and measurements link data to concepts. Neuman (2006) goes further to indicate that data for qualitative researchers sometimes is in the form of numbers and more often it includes written or spoken words, actions, sounds, symbols, physical objects, or visual images. Badenhorst (2008) also qualifies this method and sees qualitative research as relying on data in the form of words. When citing Schwandt (2001) she argues that qualitative researchers seek meaning in human action and that researchers depend on description to express their data.

The assertion by both Neuman (2006) and Badenhorst (2008) above justifies the approach the researcher adopted because the researcher had to concentrate on human action, written and spoken words during data collection. Leedy and Ormrod (2005) highlight that qualitative research is generally used to answer questions about the complex nature of a phenomenon with the purpose of describing and

understanding the phenomenon from the participant's point of view. According to the authors, the phenomenon is studied in its complexity and the research is context-bound.

Merriam (1998) justifies the usage of the qualitative method and suggests that qualitative researchers are interested in understanding the meaning people have constructed, how they make sense of their world, and the experience they have. She proceeds to advise that qualitative research is an effort to understand situations in their uniqueness as part of a particular context and the interactions there, and that this approach is linked to a direct concern with experience as it is lived, felt or undergone. She goes on to assert that "the key to understanding qualitative research lies with the idea that meaning is socially constructed by individuals in their interaction with the world. The world of reality is not the fixed, single, agreed upon or measurable phenomenon that it is assumed to be in positivist, quantitative research" (Merriam, 2002, p. 1).

3.3. Disadvantages of qualitative approach

Different authors highlight that qualitative research is characterized by field work, inductive strategy, and the product is richly descriptive. Bell (2006), for example, criticizes qualitative research and argues that it does not allow for statistical analysis to be conducted, but rather focuses on an individual's interpretation of the world. This sentiment is shared by Yin (1984) who argues that the qualitative approach lacks precision, objectivity, rigour, and that it is less robust than the quantitative approach.

3.4. Population and sample

The population for the research as a whole consisted of the Department's business units responsible for policy development and implementation. Participants were drawn from a mixture of senior and middle managers from various business units of the Department. A total of fifteen managers were interviewed including five recently resigned managers in order to clarify issues that emerged during literature review.

3.5. Data collection and sample

Yin (2009) defines research design as the logic that links the data collected and the conclusion drawn to the initial questions of the study. The research was conducted in two phases: in the first phase interviewees were contacted by telephone followed by an official letter in order to secure the interview appointments. Semi-structured questions were used. This approach was adopted in order to elicit more information from the interviewees and collect tangible data.

3.6. Case study methodology

The study is located within the qualitative paradigm and a case study methodology was applied in order to comprehensively examine and understand the phenomenon. This approach enabled the researcher to interrogate, unravel and fully understand the reasons for non-implementation of retention policy in Home Affairs. Bennet (1983) validates the use of the case study approach by indicating that case study is an intensive examination of a single unit such as a person, a small group of people, or indeed a single company. Case studies are said to be studies that involve measuring and studying what is there and how it got there. In this way, it is historical and can enable the

researcher to explore, unravel and understand problems. A case study approach was adopted for the purpose of the research as it was found to be most suitable, because it is most appropriate for the qualitative method and it enhances the researcher's ability to fully examine the phenomena.

British Association for Commercial and Industrial Education (1979, p. 7) in Bacie case studies defines case study as "the description of a situation which is used as a basis for study and discussion'' This approach is also supported by authors such as Leedy and Ormrod (2001) who indicate that, in a case study, a particular individual, programme, or event is studied in depth for a defined period of time. A medical researcher might study the nature, cause and treatment of a rare illness for a particular patient, while an educator might study and analyze the instructional strategies that a master teacher uses to teach high school history. The authors proceed to argue that the researcher can through a case study focus on a single case because it is unique or has exceptional qualities and can promote understanding or inform practice for similar situations. In other instances, researchers study two or more cases – often cases that are different in certain key ways – to make comparisons, build theory, or propose generalizations; such an approach is called a multiple or collective case study.

A case study may be suitable for learning more about a little known or poorly understood situation. It may be useful for investigating how an individual or programme changes over time, perhaps as the result of certain circumstances or interventions. According to Bell (2007) case studies may be carried out to follow up and expand on or populate more fully a survey. They can also precede the survey and be used as a means of identifying key issues which merit further investigation. Researchers identify an instance which could be the introduction of a

new way of working, the way an organisation adapts to a new role or any innovation or stage of development in an institution.

Case study was thus found to be the appropriate design as it will enable the researcher to systematically collect the evidence. Case studies are more relevant for the study since, although observation and interviews are most frequently used, no method is excluded. As all organisation and individuals have their common and unique features, Bell (2007) points out that in case studies researchers aim to identify such features and attempts to identify the various interactive processes at work showing how they affect the implementation of systems and influence organisational functions.

Yin (1994) maintains that case study is the most appropriate tool when a researcher is researching a complex organisational phenomenon. This assertion by the author is found to be more relevant to the researcher when a complex phenomenon, such as reasons for non-implementation of retention policy in a big and complex organisation such as the Department of Home Affairs, is to be studied. He proceeds to define case study as an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real life context, especially when the boundaries between the phenomenon and context are not clearly evident.

Yin (2009) argues that a case study is preferred for examining contemporary events, but when the relevant behaviours cannot be manipulated, the case study relies on many other techniques such as history and adds two sources of evidence not usually included in the historian repertoire, namely direct observation of the events being studied, and interviews of the persons involved in the events. The author proceeds to justify the case study approach and adds that a case study, although it can overlap with history, is unique because of

its ability to deal with a full variety of evidence such as documents, artefacts, interviews and observations.

The unit of analysis which is the Department of Home Affairs Head Office is the focus of the study and will be studied from 2004 after the Department of Public Service (DPSA) sanctioned a study on reasons for voluntary termination of service in government, and provides a guide for government departments to develop and adopt strategies and measures to address labour turnover within their specific environments.

3.6.1. Disadvantages of case study

The case study approach does not enable generalization since the results, findings and theory developed may not apply to the other similar case studies as the case looked at may be unique and therefore not representative of other instances. This view is supported by Leedy and Ormrod (2001), who emphasize that either way, it is useful for generating or providing preliminary support from hypothesis. Its major weaknesses are that, especially when only a single case is studied, one cannot be sure that the results can be generalised to other situations because the researcher collects extensive data on the individual(s), programme(s), or event(s) on which the investigation is focused.

The above sentiment is shared by Yin (2009) who also presents the disadvantage of case study as being the limited basis for scientific generalization. Yin proceeds to argue that scientific facts are rarely proven based on a single experiment but rather a multiple set of experiments and that a similar approach in respect of a case study should be adopted.

Yin (2009) further observes that many researchers find the case study to be a less desirable form of inquiry because it lacks rigour and investigators may fail to follow a systematic procedure, and may have allowed equivocal evidence or biased views to influence the direction of the findings and conclusion. In a qualitative paradigm, the researcher can use case study as a design, and within a case study, techniques like interviews or a combination of tools can be employed in order to collect data.

Because of the characteristics and the uniqueness of the challenges facing the Department of Home Affairs, the Department will be used as a case study.

3.6.2. Primary and secondary data overview

Two sources of data were collected and used in the study: interviews which were conducted with fifteen participants, and appropriate relevant documentation which included books on retention, journals and research reports. Leedy (2001; 94-95) explains data as "the manifestations of the reality". He goes further to say that no one has ever looked upon the truth itself. We are like those who live in a dungeon, across the floor of which a beam of sunlight passes. That light gives us an idea of what the sun must be like, but we can never behold the sun, we shall never know the difference between it and the shaft of light on the dungeon floor. The researcher is in a factual dungeon and through the data he seeks to discover underlying truth.

Data can be presented in two categories, namely primary data and secondary data. Yin (1994) cited in Fani (2006) observes that, ''in any case study, it is important to use several collection methods''. In the study the researcher concentrated on both primary data (interviews

with participants) and secondary data (existing policy and literature reviews).

3.6.3. Primary data

Primary data is defined in Bell (2007) as sources which came into existence in the period under research (e.g. minutes of a school governors' meeting). Primary sources are divided into deliberate sources which are those produced for the attention of future researchers such as diaries, and the inadvertent sources which are used by the researcher.

Interviews were conducted in order to collect data. Silverman (1993) is cited in Leedy (2001:159) asserting that "interviews can yield a great deal of useful information. The researcher can ask questions related to any of the following: facts, people's beliefs about the facts, feelings, motives, present and past behaviour, standards of behaviour (what people think should be done in certain situations), conscious reasons for actions or feelings such as why people think that engaging in a particular behaviour is desirable or undesirable''.

In a qualitative study, the interviews are not structured. They are either open-ended or semi-structured, and this is the approach which the researcher followed in order to elicit information. Leedy (2001) adds that unstructured interviews are of course more flexible and more likely to yield information that the researcher had not planned to ask for. Their primary disadvantage is that the researcher gets different information from different people and may not be able to make comparisons among the interviewees.

Schimmit (1991:138-139) indicates that,

Interviews have been characterized as conversations with a purpose. As a technique for qualitative research, they are used to gain insights regarding how individuals attend to, perceive or otherwise deal with some phenomenon of interest. Interviews are dynamic.

Interviewees were consulted and appointments secured in order to ensure a smooth process and avoidance of unnecessary inconvenience.

Brynard and Hanekom (2006) explain the advantage of interviews as being to allow the researcher to explain his or her questions if the respondent is not clear on what is being asked. When citing De Wet (1981: 161-163), the above authors indicate that interviews allow the researcher to probe more deeply following the answers of the respondents. In order to prevent bias in an interview, the researcher must avoid leading questions, must have properly selected samples of interviews and must pose specific detailed questions and check and recheck the conflicting data.

Bell (2007) supports the use of interviews as a technique by indicating that interviews have the advantage that they are adaptable and a skilful interviewer can follow up ideas, probe responses and investigate motives and feelings which questionnaires cannot do. The way in which a response is made (the tone of the voice, facial expressions, and hesitations) can provide information that a written response would conceal.

Yin (2009) justifies the use of interviews by adding that one of the most important sources of case study information is the interview and he advises that throughout the interview the researcher or investigator must follow up her/his line of inquiry as reflected by the case study protocol, and ask questions in an unbiased manner. In order to ensure

success with the interviews, interviewees will be contacted prior to the interview in order to secure appointments. Before the interviews, the interview proceedings will be explained to the interviewee, taking into consideration the ethical principles which include confidentiality.

Leedy and Ormord (2005: 146) assert that interviews can provide a researcher with a great deal of very useful information covering a range of aspects which may be factual. Merriam (2002) agrees that interviews are a technique used to gather information in a qualitative study and range from highly structured, pre-determined questions that are posed in a specific order to unstructured, open-ended questions. The researcher's approach in the study was a semi-structured interview approach which, according to Merriam (2002), contains a mixture of more and less structured questions as this adds an advantage in gathering more information.

3.6.4. Advantages of interviews

According to Neuman (2006), interviews can take the following form:

1. Telephone interviews

This is a popular survey method because 95% of the population can be reached by telephone. An interviewer calls the respondent, asks questions and records the response. However, this method can be costly and restrict the researcher to a limited time for the interview.

2. Face to face interviews

This method has the highest response rates and permits the longest questionnaires. Interviewers can also observe the surroundings and can use non-verbal communication and visual aids. This method is associated with high costs resulting from travel, supervision and biasness.

The participants were contacted by telephone to ask for their permission to participate in the study, and were informed about the process and objective of the study. Once permission was granted, an interview schedule was planned where respondents were interviewed and advised of their right to remain anonymous and not have their identities revealed.

Interviews were conducted with fifteen (15) managers in different business units of the Department, including Human Resources Management, Inspectorate, Immigration Services, Provincial Managers, Counter Corruption and Security, Legal Services, Audits, and Information Technology. The researcher was prepared to expand the sample population should the need arise during data collection. Interviews were conducted with key informants because of their knowledge of the phenomenon. The information obtained during interviews helped the researcher in his endeavour to collect useful data in order to understand the phenomenon. This technique is supported by Bouchard (1976) as cited in Schmidt (1991) that ‘‘key informants may be selected for their presumed specific knowledge’’.

Questionnaires were drafted based on research themes and the researcher made use of semi-structured questions in order to collect primary data as per annexure c. The reason for using semi-structured interviews was to allow flexibility of questions during interviews.

Merriam (1998) justifies the use of interviews and argues that interviewing is a common means of collecting qualitative data, where the researcher or investigator through interviews is involved in a conversation with a purpose.

3.6.5. Secondary data

According to Bell (2007) secondary sources are interpretations of events of that period based on primary sources (e.g. history of that school). Bell further clarifies that some documents are primary from one point of view and secondary from another.

In addition to primary data, the research drew extensively on secondary data from existing literature such as Phillips and Connelle (2003); Rowland, *et al.* (1980); Lusthaus, *et al.* (2002) and other available sources. Some of the documents consulted for data collection include:

a) DPSA: Research on reasons for turnover in the public service
b) The South African Constitution
c) The Public Service Act
d) DHA retention policy
e) DHA management policy
f) DHA retention records
g) University of Witwatersrand libraries: books, research reports, published and unpublished theses and journals.

3.6.6. Sampling

The researcher adopted a purposeful sampling method in order to collect data through interviews. The reason for the application of this method was that it is most suitable as the sample population is known to the researcher. Creswell (2007) explains that purposeful sampling is used in qualitative research as the inquirer selects individuals and sites for study because they can purposefully inform an understanding of the research problem and central phenomenon of the study. He goes further to indicate that decisions have to be made about who and what

should be sampled, what form sampling should take, and how many people or sites will need to be sampled.

Brynard and Hanekom (2006) explain sampling as a technique employed to select a small group with the view to determining the characteristics of a large group (population). What is worth mentioning is the importance of sampling as related by the authors, namely to simplify the research, save time and save on costs. Creswell (2007) and Brynard and Hanekom (2006) are supported by Denscombe (2007) who observes that with purposive sampling, the sample is hand-picked for the research as the researcher already knows something about the specific people or events; the researcher deliberately selects particular ones because they are seen as likely to produce the most valuable data. The researcher further asserts that the selected people are chosen with a specific purpose in mind and that purpose reflects the particular qualities of the people or event chosen and their relevance to the topic of investigation. During data collection, the respondent's real identities were not used and they were identified by abbreviations, for example, SM 1.

3.6.7. Data analysis and interpretation

According to Denscombe (2007), the analysis of qualitative data is based on four guiding principles: the first is that the analysis of data and the conclusions drawn from the research should be rooted in the data. The analyses should, according to the author, be grounded in the evidence that has been collected. The second principle is that the researcher's explanation of the data should emerge from a careful and meticulous reading of the data. Accordingly, the meaning of qualitative data always involves a process of interpretation in which the researcher produces the meaning of the raw data. The third principle is that the researcher should avoid introducing unwarranted preconceptions such as personal prejudices and biasness arising from

previous theories and research in the particular area of investigation into the analysis of data .Lastly, the analysis of data should involve an interactive process where the development of theory or concepts is based on a process that constantly moves back and forth comparing empirical data with themes or concepts used. The authors advise that qualitative data analysis is the range of processes and procedures whereby the researcher moves from the qualitative data that has been collected into some form of explanation, understanding or interpretation of the people and situations that are being investigated. The authors add that a qualitative data analysis process usually involves the writing and identification of themes. The author further indicates that data analysis should follow a process which involves five stages, including preparation of the data, familiarity with the data, interpreting the data, verifying the data, and representing the data.

Data collected was analysed and interpretation was done while the data collected was still fresh in the researcher's mind, beginning immediately after each interview had taken place. As Denscombe (2007) advises, analysis involves the separation of things into their component parts and it also involves the study of complex things in order to identify their basic elements. After each interview the researcher assessed data to gather thoughts and impressions for proper data interpretation while information was still readily available as alluded to by Creswell (2003) who, with reference from Merriam (1998), contends that data collection and data analysis must be a simultaneous process in qualitative research. Follow-up interviews were immediately arranged in cases where the researcher wanted clarity on outstanding issues. The content of the transcribed interviews was analysed and interpreted with reference to the research problem. The results obtained were then used to answer the research questions and later incorporated in the research report in accordance with Denscombe's (2007) recommendations that the researcher is called

during data analysis and interpretation to discover the key components or general principles underlying a particular phenomenon so that these can be used to provide a clearer understanding of the researched phenomenon. Creswell (2003) agrees that the process of data analysis involves making sense out of text and image data and is an ongoing process involving continual reflection about the data, asking analytical questions, and writing memos throughout the study.

3.6.8. Validity and reliability

The validity of the research refers to the accuracy, meaningfulness and credibility of a study as a whole (Leedy and Ormrod, 2001). The authors further explain reliability as referring to how consistent the results are within a study. Creswell (2003) asserts that reliability and validity address issues about the quality of the data and appropriateness of the methods used in carrying out a research project where the methods are particularly important because of the different philosophical and methodological approaches to the study of human activity. The author proceeds to highlight that research is not a precise science and that social science as a body of knowledge is enriched by many different disciplines. Although primary data as a source was obtained through interviews, an extensive literature review was conducted in order to augment the sourced interview data.

Bell (2007) defines reliability as the extent to which a test or procedure produces similar results under constant conditions on all occasions. The author further indicates that there is a number of devices for checking reliability in scales and tests such as ‘test–re-test (administering the same test sometime after the first); the alternate forms method (where equivalent versions of the same items are given and results correlated); or the split half method (where items in the test are split into two matched halves and scores then correlated).

Holloway and Jefferson (2000) indicate that “reliability refers to the consistency, stability and repeatability of the results.’’ The researcher will endeavour to be reliable by ensuring consistency.

The researcher captured notes during the interviews as agreed with the interviewees. The responses from interviewees were honestly interpreted and this was checked against both primary and secondary data. The researcher re-checked and verified the responses with participants in order to avoid any alternative explanations or interpretation of the data. This point is emphasised by Mouton (2009), who highlights that reliability is a demand of consistency over time.

3.6.9. External validity

Leedy (2000) explains validity as “the extent to which the instrument measures what it is supposed to measure. Validity takes different forms namely face validity, content validity, criterion validity and constructive validity’’. Sasford and Jupp (1996) are cited by Bell (2007:1) and define validity as the design of the research to provide credible conclusions, whether the evidence which the research offers can bear the weight of the interpretation that is put on it. They go further to indicate that what is to be established is whether data measures what the authors claim and that the interpretation follows from there.

Bell (2007) states that “validity tells us whether an item or instrument measures or describes what it is supposed to measure or describe, but this is rather vague and leaves many questions unanswered’’. Mouton (2009) explains validity as quality of the elements of data. Brynard and Hanekom (2006) explain validity as the potential of a design or an instrument to achieve or measure what it is supposed to achieve or measure. According to Neuman (2006) there are two types of validity, namely internal validity, which concerns the ability of experimenters to

strengthen the logical rigour of a casual explanation by eliminating potential alternative explanations; and external validity, which is about the ability to generalize the findings beyond a specific study. The author further presents different forms of measuring validity as follows: face validity - in the judgment of others; content validity - captures the entire meaning; criterion validity - agrees with external source; and construct validity - multiple indicators are consistent.

Leedy and Ormrod (2001) define external validity as the extent to which its results apply to situations beyond the study itself, how the findings can be replicated, or apply to situations. It has never been the researcher's intention to generalize the findings of the research considering the sample of analysis. Managers within the Department of Home Affairs were interviewed due to the Department's unique situation to clearly understand the reasons for non-implementation of retention policy within the Department.

3.6.10. Internal validity

Leedy and Ormrod (2001) explain internal validity as the extent to which its design and the data that it yields allows the researcher to draw accurate conclusions about cause and effect and other relationships within the data. Leedy (1997) also explains internal validity as the freedom from bias in forming conclusions in view of the data.

Although the researcher is currently employed as a Manager with the Department under study, the researcher ensured openness and objectivity during the study to ensure avoidance of biasness. Preconceived ideas were not discussed with participants during the interview. Participants were asked to re-check their responses during the interview in order to eliminate any element of data distortion.

3.6.11. Construct validity

Yin (1994) defines construct validity as the evaluation of whether a scale measures unobservable social constructs or characteristics. It also refers to the degree to which inferences can be made from the operationalisation of a study. Construct validity is also concerned with exposing and reducing subjectivity.

3.6.12. Confidentiality

‘‘Rendering case material anonymous is, as we know, a fundamental guiding ethical principle’’ (Hollway, 2000:95-96). The researcher respected the right of the interviewees to remain anonymous at all times during data collection and the final data presentation. This ethical principle was fully explained to participants before they could take part in the study in order to ensure their understanding. Denscombe (2007) advises that there should be a mutual trust and the researcher is duty-bound to treat the data as confidential.

3.6.13. Objectivity

Although the researcher is an employee of the organisation where samples were drawn and the study carried out, the researcher was guided by principles in order to avoid biasness and promote consistent objectivity through the research process. Hollway and Jefferson (2000) define objectivity as “a contentious principle in contemporary social science’’. Objectivity and reliability are the fundamental principles under which this study will be pursued. It is also through the art of interpretation characterized by intuition that this study will be pursued.

3.6.14. Ethical considerations

Creswell (2003) warns researchers to adhere to ethical considerations during data collection and analysis, and further advises that the researcher needs to respect participants and the sites for research as many ethical issues arise. He adds that participants must not be put at risk and respect must be given to the vulnerable population and their needs. Participants must be informed about their right to participate voluntarily and their right to withdraw at any time, the purpose of the study for their understanding, the procedure of the study, the right to ask questions, obtaining a copy of the results, having their privacy respected and the benefits of the study. Neuman (2006) adds that ethical issues are the concern, dilemmas and conflicts that arise over the proper way of conducting research as ethics define what is or what is not legitimate to do. “Many ethical issues involve a balance between two values: the pursuit of scientific knowledge and the rights of those being studied or of others in society”. Denscombe (2007) concurs with Creswell (2003) that there should be a mutual trust and the researcher is duty-bound to treat the participants’ identities as confidential.

Respondents were informed that their identity will not be revealed if they so desired. As this was indeed their request, their names were not used in the research report and reference is only made to unique codes allocated to each respondent.

Creswell (2003) and Neuman (2006) further assert that ethical issues proceed even during data analysis and interpretation where the researcher should take into consideration how the study will protect the anonymity of individuals, data storage and the accurate account of information. In complying with all ethical principles, the research will be conducted with openness, be unbiased, and data collected from participants will be treated with respect and confidentiality, and be

recorded, analysed and interpreted as accurately as possible. Identity of respondents will not be disclosed and reference will only be made to abbreviations such as SM 1.

3.6.15. Conclusion

The research paradigm and its techniques applied here ensured that the researcher does not deviate from the research process flow but remains rooted within the qualitative paradigm parameters. It is evident from literature on research methodology that an incorrect methodological approach is disastrous to the researcher and will defeat the research objectives. The research methodology gives the rationale of the research paradigm and techniques applied during the study and require care and attention to details before any study can be undertaken.

CHAPTER FOUR

DATA PRESENTATION

4.1. Introduction

As discussed in chapter one, the research was aimed at understanding the challenges in the implementation of retention policy within the Department of Home Affairs. In order to finalise and compile the research report, data was collected and is presented in this chapter as it emerged. The data collected was based on the following research questions:

a) What are the challenges to the implementation of retention policy in the Department of Home Affairs?
b) Are managers in the Department aware of the existence of the retention policy and understand their roles in the implementation of the retention policy?
c) How is the policy implementation process managed in the Department?

4.2. Themes of discussion

Data collected during the study has been categorized under themes as described below.

a) Retention Policy Management and co-ordination
b) Resources allocation
c) Talent/skill existence
d) Policy successes and challenges
e) Causes and recommendations.

Emerging from data was two groups of respondents namely those that were not aware of the existence of the retention policy in the Department, and those that were aware of the retention policy's existence. Collected data also shows that the Department's commitment towards talent/skills retention is lethargic.

4.3. Responses recorded in respect of themes discussed with senior managers (SM)

4.3.1. Retention policy management and co-ordination

Under this theme, five senior managers at the level of Chief Directors and Directors were asked to describe how the Department of Home Affairs manages retention of personnel/employees and the following responses were obtained:

- Most Senior Managers reported that the Department has no retention policy or strategy and that if such policy or strategy existed, they were not aware of its existence as they were not consulted before and after the policy had been developed. (SM 1, interview 5 September 2010), SM2, interview, 7 September 2010, and SM5 interview, 15 September 2010).

- According to the respondents SM 1, SM 2, and 5, "the department does not manage retention of personnel but continuously loses skilled employees in the fields such as Legal Services and Immigration Services''. The response given by SM 1 in particular highlighted that there is no retention policy co-ordination at all. The respondent proceeded to say in order for the Department to enable successful implementation of the retention policy, "it must start by developing a

strategy, communicate it to managers and get their buy in". (SM 1, interview, 5 September 2010).

- Two of the senior managers responded that the Department has a retention policy. SM 3 in his response proceeded to say "All managers in the Department are aware of the existence of the retention policy and how it should be implemented". (SM 3, interview, 9 September 2010).

4.3.2. Resources allocation

When asked to explain which part of the Department requires more resources allocation to manage retention of skilled personnel, all interviewed Senior Managers pointed out that Financial Services of the Department, Immigration Services, Legal Services and Security Vetting required more resource allocation. This response was common in respect of SM 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5.

4.3.3. Existing talent/skills

Managers were asked to explain whether the Department has talented /skilled personnel to retain. The response provided was that the Department has abundant talent or skilled employees who did not receive recognition, hence most of them are lost to other employers in both the private and public sectors. SM 3 in particular explained that "Immigration Service of the Department is a specialised field within the Department and across government sectors and Information Technology is also a skill talent specialization area". (SM 3, interview, 9 September 2010).

4.3.4. Retention policy successes and challenges

Managers were asked to describe their department's retention policy successes and challenges and none of the respondents was able to relate any retention policy successes but proceeded to argue that the Department has no strong leadership in respect of human resources management, policy development and implementation. Managers warned that the Department is being suicidal by not having a retention policy and human resource strategy.

"The Department has a high number of disgruntled employees which include managers, why retain them when they want to leave?" argued one of the senior managers who reported that the Department has a retention policy. "It is good that they leave, the department will replace them" he further argued. (SM 5, interview, 18 September 2010).

4.3.5. Causes of retention policy challenges

The retention policy challenges were mostly associated with lack of strong leadership in respect of organisational human resource management, strategy, policy development and implementation. SM 3 responded that causes of challenges which lead to retention policy non-implementation were: "subjectivity, jealousy and short-sightedness". (SM 3, interview, 9 September 2010).

4.3.6. Recommendations

Respondents recommended that the Department must first develop a clear human resource strategy, followed by retention policy with clear implementation guidelines. They further advised that the department

through the Human Resource Branch needs to first set clear goals and engage business units in order to source inputs regarding the development of a formidable and sustainable human resource strategy which will inform the policy development, alignment, co-ordination and implementation. SM 3 in particular suggested that the following needs to improve to enable successful implementation of the retention policy: “professional approach to HRM and interest of the organisation should supercede individual considerations”. (SM 3, interview, 9 September 2010). SM 2 (interview, 7 September 2010) also recommended that there should be co-operation and understanding as well as the willingness of managers, especially senior managers.

4.4. Interviews conducted with middle managers (MM) at the level of Deputy Directors (DD)

4.4.1. Retention policy management and co-ordination

Under this theme, participants were asked to describe how the Department of Home Affairs manages retention of staff and the following responses were obtained:

Most middle managers reported that the Department has no retention policy and that if such policy existed, they were not aware of its existence as they never heard of its existence and have not witnessed or observed its implementation. Only one of the managers, DD 1, advised that the Department does indeed have a retention policy. According to most middle managers, the Department does not manage retention as staff leaves for other employers regularly. Practical examples were provided regarding more than five Legal experts who left the Department in the 2009/2010 financial year. Other examples quoted were more than ten employees who left the department from

Counter Corruption, Security and Vetting. According to the respondents the Immigration Services, Human Resources, Legal Services and Counter Corruption and Security were among the business units mostly affected by turnover.

4.4.2. Resource allocation

When asked to explain which part of the Department requires more resources allocation to manage retention, most interviewed Middle Managers argued that the Department renders essential services and it must try to retain experienced employees within Security and Vetting, Finance and Audits, Immigration Services and Legal services.

4.4.3. Existing talent/skills

Respondents were asked to explain whether the Department has talented/skilled personnel to retain. The response provided was that the Department does have abundant talent which was not recognized and this could be seen by numbers of employees leaving the Department.

4.4.4. Retention policy successes and challenges

Middle Managers were asked to describe their department's retention policy successes and challenges and none of the participant was able to relate any policy successes. One of the respondents argued that Senior Management of the department had no vision. Some of the respondents argued that the department had no best interests of its employees at heart and this might be a contributory factor to employees leaving the department.

4.4.5. Causes of retention policy challenges

The causes were mostly associated with lack of leadership from senior managers, lack of proper human resource planning, lack of policy guide lines, co-ordination and consultation. One of the managers identified causes of non-employees retention as “failure to initiate, poor leadership, nepotism, corruption and jobs for friends”. (MM 5, interview, 6 July 2010). MM5’s views were supported by MM 4 (interview, 9 July 2010). MM 2 (interview, 19 July 2010) also alleged that the causes of non-employee retention were “incompetence, lack of training and awareness, and nepotism”.

4.4.6. Recommendations

Middle managers advised that the department through HR needs to first set clear goals and engage business units for inputs regarding human resource policy development, co-ordination and implementation and that no policy will ever be successfully developed and implemented without co-operation and active participation of business units in the department. MM 4 (interview, 9 July 2010) recommended that “leadership must live to the values of the organisation and ensure efficient leadership”. MM 3 (interview, 11 July 2010) on the other hand recommended that “a proper skills audit and career path for experienced officials” was needed.

4.5. Responses elicited from middle managers at the level of Assistant Directors (ASD)

Response from Assistant Directors did not differ much from those of their Deputy Directors. Two of the Assistant Directors were indeed

aware of the existence of the retention policy in the Department, but all spoke with one voice that although there is a policy on personnel retention, the policy was like a dead horse and gives no tail. One of the Assistant Directors added that “there is abundant talent in specific areas such as Legal Services, Immigration, Vetting and Security Services and Counter Corruption Unit. (MM (ASD) 2, interview, 10 June 2010).

All of the interviewed Assistant Directors did not know their role in retention policy implementation and indicated that they would not know who to approach to enable retention process if their key skilled subordinates were to resign. Skills to be retained as identified in the Department were within the Immigration Services, Information and Technology Branch, Legal Services, Finance and Audit, and Personnel Vetting Branch. Respondents reported they were also unaware of any retention successes within the Department and alleged that lack of strong competent leadership in the Department was a cause for concern.

4.6. Interviews with recently resigned managers (RM)

Although it was not the purpose of the research, data collected during interviews influenced the contact being made with five most recently resigned managers in order to elicit information regarding their departure experience from the Department.

During telephonic interviews, three of the participants indicated that they left the Department for similar or equivalent positions offered by other organisations because they felt under-valued, un-appreciated and over-worked. All five participants reported that, upon handing in resignation letters, no exit interviews were conducted with them.

Four of the participants indicated that they were not aware of the existence of a retention policy in the Department. One of the participants argued “Anything is possible in Home Affairs, there might be a retention policy that exists in vacuum” He proceeded to add that “the department suffers from poor leadership hence there is no direction”. (RM 2, interview, 9 September 2010). However one of the respondents was aware of the retention policy’s existence but argued, “Although retention policy is available in the department, it is a dead document which serves no purpose and will not contribute towards organisational capacity due to its non-implementation”. ‘‘If all managers understood what the retention policy entails and what its objectives are, many skilled employees would have been retained”. (RM 1, interview, 9 September 2010).

One of the managers had observed through his experience and interaction with other managers and subordinates that most employees wanted to leave the Department, but could not leave because the poor image of the Department has shadowed their experience, knowledge and worthiness. The respondent proceeded to argue that “most of the department’s personnel are de-motivated and hopeless”. (RM 4, interview, 14 September 2010).

One of the respondents, RM 3, (interview, 10 September 2010) reported that when she served her manager with a resignation letter, she was treated as if she had committed a crime as she was not spoken to for the duration of her one month notice. RM 4 (interview, 10 September 2010) reported that when he informed his manager about his new appointment in another government department, he was advised by his manager to write a one page letter outlining the reasons why he should be retained. In his own words he proceeded to say, ‘‘I felt insulted as I did not ask to be retained. If my manager valued my expertise, why would I be asked to motivate for my retention”? The

manager should have drafted the motivation if he wanted the department to retain me''. (RM 4, interview, 10 September 2010).

4.7. Conclusion

It is clear from the presented data that there is a need for a definite implementation of retention policy within the Department of Home Affairs and indeed there are skilled personnel to be retained. The data presented reveals a gloomy picture of the Department's policy management processes and factors contributing to reasons leading to the non-implementation of the retention policy. It is further evident from the presented data that there are challenges impacting on the Department's policy implementation and this are associated with poor leadership, poor retention policy implementation and lack of clear strategic guide lines that should steer the policy implementation process. This lack of strategic guide line to reinforce the retention policy implementation will if not corrected aggravate high staff turnover which has already eroded the Department.

CHAPTER FIVE

DATA ANALYSIS

5.1. Introduction

The chapter analyses the data that was examined in conjunction with the existing body of knowledge consulted during the literature review. As explained in the research methodology, the respondents' real identities will not be revealed and reference will only be made to abbreviations such as SM 1, MM (DD) 2.

5.1.1. Talent management

Managers strongly feel that the DHA does not manage talent, and this view was highlighted by most managers, in particular MM (DD) 3 when asked to explain how DHA manages retention of personnel, the responded argued that "DHA has no retention policy or strategy at all. Highly skilled and experienced people therefore leave the department". (MM, (DD) 3, interview, 11 July 2010). In relation to talent management, Christensen, Andrews and Bower (1978) argue that individuals and groups of individuals must be recruited and assigned to essential tasks in accordance with specialised or supervisory skills which they possess or can develop.

Silzer and Dowell (2010: 18) on the other hand describe talent management as "an integrated set of processes, programs and cultural norms in an organisation designed and implemented to attract, develop, deploy and retain talent to achieve strategic objectives and meet future business needs." The authors further recommend that retention can be better managed through a migration from the

traditional human resource management to a talent-ship approach. They describe talent as “referring to a pool of employees who are exceptional in their skills and abilities either in a specific technical area (such as software graphics skills) or a competency (such as consumer marketing talent), or a more general area (such as general managers or a high potential talent)”. Silzer and Dowell (2010: 3-14) and Goldsmith and Carter (2010) concur that an organisation should continuously focus on its talent needs even if it is doing well. There must be internal realignment where innovation is promoted, people are not managed like commodities, and the organisation does not become lethargic.

In the view of the researcher, what will a modern organisation be without its talented employees? This fact cannot be over-emphasised as an organisation which wants to remain competitive in terms of performance should indeed introduce and maintain talent management practices.

5.1.2. Retention policy implementation

Managers are not aware of the DHA’s retention policy existence, and this was confirmed by most of the respondents. For example, SM 4 said “I have no idea that the Department of Home Affairs has any retention strategy or policy”. (SM 4, interview, 15 September 2010). In relation to implementation, Kuye, Thornhill, Fourie, Brynard, Crous, Mafunisa, Roux, Van Dijk and Van Rooyen (2002: 90) define implementation with reference from Quade (1989: 338) as “the directed change that follows a policy mandate, the process of rearranging patterns of conduct so as to honor the prescriptions set forth in the decision.” Drucker (1968) adds that although managers are individuals, they have to work together in a team and such an organised group always has a distinct character as they share in a

vision, practice, attitudes and behaviour which will continue after they are gone and will continue to set the tone for newcomers.

Boninelli and Meyer (2004) put an emphasis on retention policy implementation and they warn that the shortage of skilled labour has made it much harder for organisations to attract and retain employees. With so little available quality labour on the open market, organisations are forced to compete ever more fiercely for any available talent. Cloete and Wissink (2000) concur that policies become programmes by authoritative action which through implementation have the ability to forge subsequent links in the causal chain so as to obtain the desired result.

Policies are not crafted to keep policy-makers busy, and they only achieve their meaning during implementation. This is a principle the researcher argues the DHA should bear in mind when approaching policy implementation.

5.1.3. Policy co-ordination and communication

There seems to be poor, if not a lack of, communication and co-ordination of the retention policy to ensure its successful implementation. This is the view of MM (DD) 3 who indicated that "DHA support structures do not realise the importance of skilled officials in the core business of DHA". (MM (DD) 3, interview, 11 July 2010). McKevitt and Lawton (1994: 174) describe co-ordination as concerned with "a pursuit of coherence, consistency, comprehensiveness and of harmonious or compatible outcomes". The authors proceed to advise that co-ordination is the rationalist technique for embracing the complexity and interrelatedness of social issues and problems. Christensen, *et al.* (1978) point out that co-ordination and division of responsibility is critical for every organisation and cannot be

left to chance. Barney (2002) on the other hand advises that if an organisation has retention manager, its retention policy is more likely to be co-ordinated as the retention manager will ensure that the right people are hired and that the candidates' values fit well with the values of the organisation.

This view is supported by Hanekom (1987) when he maintains that public policies are aimed at promoting some aspect of the public welfare and their making and implementation are shaped by agreements, ideas and prescribed guidelines for administrative conduct. He also advises that although policy-making and policy implementation are two distinct and distinguishable functions, they are closely interrelated and separating them is difficult if not impossible or impracticable. He advises that the success of policy implementation can be enhanced through lucid communication to the implementers to avoid misunderstanding.

Kroon (1994) also views co-ordination as the manager's purposeful endeavour to get the work done by different individuals and departments so that there is harmony and total co-operation in the achievement of the goals. The author further advises that a manager should pay attention to the co-ordination function at all stages during planning, organising, activating and control, to ensure that the enterprise or a section of the enterprise functions as well as possible as a unit. Kroon (1994:9) defines communication as "the transfer of message by whatever means and is related to the activities of the enterprise and/or the relationship between two or more persons involved".

The researcher maintains that co-ordination and communication remains part of the core elements of policy implementation or

management and cannot be wished away by those entrusted with the responsibility.

5.1.4. Leadership

MM (DD) 5 raised “poor leadership” as one of the causes of challenges on retention policy implementation. MM (DD) 5 (interview, 6 July 2010). This view was supported by MM (DD) 4 who said “there is no leadership to drive the policy”. (MM (DD) 4, interview, 9 July 2010). Leadership is defined by Nel, Werner, Haasbroek, Poisat, Sono and Schultz (2008: 356) as the process whereby one individual influences others to willingly and enthusiastically direct their efforts and abilities towards attaining defined group or organisational goals. The decision not to retain or to retain an employee within a specialised field must be based on informed and existing organisational needs and future direction and should not be based on emotions, or irrelevant and immaterial considerations. Such irrelevant consideration is a causal link of lack of decisive leadership. According to Mileham and Spacie (1996), leadership is about the successful resolution of problems, the persuasion of people to do what they should have done in the first place, reason and calm judgment, and getting extraordinary performance out of ordinary people.

The researcher asserts that an organisation without good leadership is unlikely to meet its strategic vision and every organisation should ensure that leaders of high quality are recruited and retained in order to ensure successful organisational performance such as the implementation of retention policy.

5.1.5. Resource allocation

Most of the interviewed respondents argued that resources have to be carefully allocated in HR, Finance and at management level. MM (DD) 2 responded that “HRM and HRD” required more resources to ensure successful retention. (MM (DD) 2, interview, 19 July 2010). Schiemann (2009) advises that organisations need to ask themselves whether they have a process for strategically prioritising the most important talent gaps in alignment, capabilities and engagement so that resources are not diluted across too many initiatives.

In view of the analysis, the researcher argues that the aim of human resource management is to ensure effective and efficient allocation of human resources in order to meet an organisational strategic vision and this implies a clear resource needs analysis to inform the allocation thereof. Human Resource management requires soberness as it is a key factor in the success of every organisation and can either destroy or make a successful organisation.

5.1.6. Policy monitoring and evaluation

MM (DD) 5 highlighted that “DHA does not have retention strategy”. (MM (DD) 5, interview, 9 July 2010). SM 1, MM (DD) 2 and other respondents advised that they were not aware of any successful retention of employees in the DHA. This fact is what authors such as Hanekom (1987) advise against in their quest for policy implementation monitoring and evaluation. The authors advise that during policy implementation stage, policies can be modified or elaborated on or even be discarded. He argues that policies are not made merely to keep policy-makers busy or to pay lip-service to society and that they receive meaning only when implemented and because policies are aimed at the improvement of the well-being of

society, it is imperative that they be analysed to determine whether they are in effect contributing towards the common good and producing the desired results. Kuye, *et al*. (2002:91) define monitoring with reference from Dunn (1981:278) as "the policy analytical procedure we use to produce information about causes and consequences of public policies." On the other hand, the author defines evaluation with reference from Cloete and Wissink (2002:272) as "a process carried out to determine the worth or value of policy outcomes."

The researcher asserts that policies are living documents and their implementation and management thereof should be regularly monitored with an evaluatory objective of measuring their implementation success level or identifying areas requiring adjustment.

5.1.7. Policy stakeholder management

MM 4, when asked to explain how retention policy was co-ordinated in DHA, responded that "HR as the custodian of the policy is poorly co-ordinated and managers at lower level are not aware of the existence of the policy. No serious consideration is given to implementation" (MM 4, interview, 9 September 2010). Silzer and Dowell (2010) add that effective management of talent pools requires a true partnership between line management and human resources. The authors warn that if the management of talent pools is not an accepted practice in an organisation, talent reviews will rarely be worth the investment of time and resources. Without strong leadership from line management, the alignment of talent reviews with the critical strategic issues and the follow-up actions required to translate plans into reality will rarely happen, and neither will there be the discipline required for the review process and follow-up actions without HR. Rooney, Hearn, Mandeville and Joseph (2003) advise that the cultural climate of the policy

process must enable a process where people are given adequate opportunity to have their say and feel that they are able to influence decision-making and that participants in decision-making must understand the logic behind shared objectives and why they are useful.

It is the researcher's argument that policies can be best implemented if stakeholders with a role to play during its development and implementation are clearly identified and their relationship is properly managed. It is the management thereof that enhances relative communication and co-ordination during the implementation process. However, in the view of the sampled managers, stakeholder management is found to be lacking in the policy management process.

5.1.8. Organisational structure

MM 4, when asked to explain how retention policy was co-ordinated in the DHA, responded that "No serious consideration is given to implementation". (MM 4, interview, 9 September 2010). Drucker (1968) urges that an organised group needs a structure and in arriving at a sound structural principle of management, organisation is the final necessity in managing managers. He argues that organised structures are things that are done in every enterprise whether managers realise it or not, and that in every organisation managers are either guided in the right direction or misdirected, developed or mis-developed, and either have a spirit that kills or one that gives life. Oosthuizen (1996) and Mutahaba (1993) advise that policy management can be adversely affected by any dysfunctional organisation or structures which include administrative and technical capacity. Silzer and Dowell (2010) warn that although it is tempting to delegate talent management to the human resources, this does not work. Although HR is critical to the effective talent management processes and should be a strong

partner, this function should be the responsibility of line management who will have a sense of ownership.

In the researcher's view, organisational structures assist in providing direction regarding roles and responsibilities and further assist in ensuring accountability. The structural organisation should be clear in policy management so that the interrelation thereof in policy implementation is enhanced.

5.1.9. Policy objectives

SM 3 argued that "although the department sponsors staff with bursaries, the recipients are not retained". (SM 3, interview, 9 September 2010). MM (ASD) concurs with SM 3's view that "the department must first have a clear policy". (MM (ASD) 2, interview, 10 June 2010. Drucker (1968) echoes that an objective, goal or target serves to determine what action to take today to obtain results tomorrow. It is based on anticipation of the future and requires action to mould the future. Management has no choice but to anticipate the future, to attempt to mould it and balance short range and long range goals, and this responsibility cannot be overlooked or neglected. Schiemann (2009) reminds us that in every organisation, supervisors and managers should have clear expectations regarding their role in employee development and the organisation should take leader development seriously. This view is supported by Hanekom (1987) who adds that successful implementation of policy depends on the insight of the official and whether she or he identifies himself with the policy aims; the implementer must in fact make the aims of the policy her or his own aims and work towards achieving them.

The researcher argues that policies are developed for a particular purpose and are aimed at remedying or improving a situation, whether

administrative, strategic or tactical and this was found to be lacking, contributing to the policy's implementation challenges. Policies arise because of a prevailing concern which can be addressed or regulated through a policy and this is what every organisation should put into practice.

5.1.10. Accountability

SM 3, when asked to relate DHA's retention policy success, responded that "the department looks at individuals rather than applying the policy". (SM 3, interview, 9 September 2010). An individual manager must, according to Drucker (1968), be able to make the needed efforts and produce the required results. His job must be set up so as to allow maximum performance. Management is not an end in itself, and has a function because of the objective requirements of the enterprise. The fact that most of the managers did not know about the existence of retention policy in the Department is an indication that managers were not making any effort to gather information that could assist them in managing retention. Drucker (2002) also asserts that retention is an operational function and this assertion implies that managers involved in the day-to-day operations of the Department ought to be involved in the development and implementation of the retention policy.

This view is supported by Bozemen and Straussman (1990) who observe that managers can enhance their autonomy and control over resources by expanding or contracting programmatic intent and it is the task of managers to operationalise and implement goals and intent of policy. Based on sampled participants' responses, it is unclear as to who is really accountable for retention management and the successful implementation of the Department's retention policy. Hanekom (1987) adds that successful implementation of policy

depends on the insight of the official and whether she or he identifies himself with the policy aims

The researcher maintains that managers are by nature the architects of organisational success or failure, and this is the case even in policy management. In order for the retention policy implementation to be successful, managers should take responsibility for the implementation process and should furthermore be held liable for non-implementation.

5.2. Conclusion

Policy objectives can only be achieved provided an integrated approach to development and implementation is adopted. Since policies are developed to remedy or guide certain programmes for an organisation, the non-implementation thereof has a negative impact on the organisation's ability to meet its set objectives, such as the retention of key talent.

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1. Introduction

The aim of the research was to investigate and understand the challenges facing the implementation of retention policy in the Department of Home Affairs. The research was undertaken because of the challenges presented by high employee turnover that has eroded the Department. The questions driving the research were: What are the challenges in implementation of the retention policy in Home Affairs? Do managers know and understand their roles in the policy implementation process? How is the retention policy being managed in the Department?

6.2. Conclusion

Emanating from data analysis the research report identified three critical areas on which recommendations will be based: leadership, retention policy management, and talent management.

6.2.1. Leadership

Data analysed indicates that leadership in policy implementation is lacking. Lack of leadership and incompetence are found to be the causes of challenges to implementation of retention policy in the DHA. Line leadership should be held accountable for the management of talent pools and the cultural climate of the policy process must enable a process where people are given adequate opportunity to voice their views and feel that they are able to influence decision-making where

participants in decision-making must understand the logic behind shared objectives and why they are useful.

Organisations such as the DHA should have clear retention targets for different roles and locations and meaningful measures of turnover or retention that are tracked and reported on regularly.

6.2.2. Retention policy management

Policy management in the DHA seems to be lacking as highlighted in the data analysed. The fact that most of the respondents argued that there is no retention strategy or policy in the Department is a clear indication that retention policy management is poor as its existence should have been communicated to management. Managers are supposed to work together in a team and such an organised group always has a distinct character inasmuch as they share in a vision, practice, attitudes and behaviour which should continue after they are gone and must set the tone for newcomers. Policy management can be adversely affected by any dysfunctional organisation or structures which include administrative and technical capacity. A precondition in policy implementation is that there must be perfect communication and co-ordination of the various elements involved and perfect implementation will be enabled by a completely unitary administrative system.

An organisation of the DHA's calibre and strategic importance cannot afford to neglect proper retention policy management as this can compromise service standards and lead to unnecessary expenditure resulting from new recruitments, selection, training, and other personnel development.

Policy evaluation has to do with the critical assessment of policy implementation and determines the impact of policy outcomes. The authors further present that evaluation is value focused, fact-value interdependent and represents the present and past orientation.

6.2.3. Talent management

There is a lack of talent management in the DHA, a fact that emerged during the data analysis. An organisation such as the DHA needs to assess its capacity to deliver on its own objectives so that required and necessary adjustments to policy can be made. Talent management is not the responsibility of human resource management. It is the responsibility of all competent managers and leaders in the organisation to manage retention. The people strategy in all organisations, whether private or public such as the DHA, should be tightly linked to the business strategy as it is indeed critical to recruit appropriately skilled employees and know the measures that must be put in place to manage their retention. Organisations should have a clear definition of what employee turnover or retention means and management information systems can assist in matching information flow to needs. In order for an organisation such as the DHA to succeed in high quality and efficient service delivery, talent management should remain a core part of its daily business.

The research concludes that retention of personnel remains critical for any developed or developing organisation and affects the private and the public sectors alike. Perceptions that skilled employees are a business of private institutions are outdated and reside in the past. Retention of personnel will continue to negatively impact the DHA of the present and the future if not properly managed.

6.3. Recommendations

In conclusion this report makes the following recommendations:

6.3.1. Leadership

Effective leadership is the strength of every organisation and remains a key factor in the successful implementation of organisational policies such as retention. The researcher recommends that the DHA reviews its leadership capacity to enable retention policy management and implementation. The review may consider leadership competency, awareness, and technical and administrative capacity to manage and implement the policy.

6.3.2. Talent management

The DHA as a public organisation should view talent management as a critical strategic factor for organisational growth and effectiveness which, if not properly managed, will have serious repercussions for service delivery. Talent management should thus be adopted as a core business.

6.3.3. Retention policy management

A policy is not developed in vacuum; rather, its development is informed by a prevailing need which should be managed or regulated. Retention policy should be viewed and treated as a living document which requires proper management and implementation in order to achieve the intended results. Policy management moves beyond development, but as part of management, a policy should be implemented, monitored and evaluated to measure the success,

impact or shortfalls as policies achieve their purpose upon implementation. Policy management should further consider aspects such as policy management capacity, whether technical, administrative, stakeholder relations, and other relevant considerations.

6.3.4. Future research

Future personnel research particularly, on the attitude of managers in retention policy implementation, is recommended. Future research can also be conducted on the practice of exit interviews, turnover information management systems, and causes of turnover.

REFERENCES

Armstrong, M. and Stephens, T. (2005) A Handbook of Management and Leadership. Great Britain and United States: Kogan Page Publications.

Badenhorst, C. (2007) *Research writing*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Badenhorst, C. (2008) *Dissertation writing* Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Beach, D. S. (1980) *Managing people at work*, 3rd edition. London: Macmillan Publishing.

Bennett, R. (1987) *Management Research: Guide for institutions and professionals*. Geneva: International Labour Office.

BMC Health Services. (2008) *Staffing remote rural areas in middle and low income countries: A literature review of attraction and retention*. Bio Medic Central Publishers.

Boudreau, J. W. and Ramstad, P. M. (2007) *Beyond HR.* Boston, Massachusetts: Harvard Business Press.

Bozeman, B. and Straussman, J. D. (1990) *Public Management Strategies*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Budd, L., Charlesworth, J. and Paton, R. (2006) *Making Policy Happen*. United States: Routledge Publications.

Brewer, J. and Hunter, A. (1989) *Multiple Method Research*. Newbury Park: Sage Publications.

British Association for Commercial and Industrial Education (1979), Bacie Case Studies. London: The Association Publishers.

Brown, A. M. (1968) *Company Management Development Plan.* Bombay: Somaiya Publications.

Cappelli, P. (2000) A market driven approach to retaining talent. *Harvard Business Review*, January-February 2000, p. 103-111.

Capowski, P. (1997) Anatomy of a leader: where are leaders of the future. *American Journal of Business*, 83 (3).

Cloete, F. and Wissink, H. (2000) *Improving Public Policy*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Creswell, J. W. (1998) *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*. London: Sage Publications.

Creswell, J. W. (2008) *Educational Research Planning, Conducting and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research*. Saddle River: Pearson Publications.

Creswell, J. W. (1997) *Research Design*. London: Sage Publications.

Cristensen, C. R., Andrews, K. R. and Bower, J. L. (1978) *Business Policy Text and Cases*. Illinois: Richard D. Irwin Incorporation.

Davidson, A. (2001) People issues to the fore, *People Dynamics*, October – November, 4-5.

Department of Home Affairs (2008). Talent Retention Policy, Pretoria.

Department of Home Affairs (2005-2010) Employee termination database, Pretoria.

Denscombe, M. (2007) *The good research guide*. Finland: McGraw Hill Company.

Denhardt, R. B. (1984) *Theories of Public Organisation: A Strategic Accountability Approach*: Pacific Books Publishers.

Dobbs, K. (2001) Knowing how to keep your best and brightest workforce, International *HR Journal* 80 (4), pp. 57-60.

Dorrain, P. (2005) The making of South Africa Inc. Cape Town: Zebra Press.

Drucker, P. F. (1968) The Practice of Management. United Kingdom: Richard Clay.

Drucker, P. F. (2002) They are not employees; they are people. *Harvard Business Review*, (February).

Ekman, B. (1990) *Coaching the leadership difference*. Cape Town: Juta and Co.

Fani, S. (2006) Strengthening Local Government: A Case Study of Botswana. Unpublished Thesis, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Fletcher, K. (2002) No vision and no urgency, in *Community Care*, 1407, 21.

Flowers, V. S. and Hughes, C. L. (1975) Business Review Personnel Management: Part III.

Frank, F. D., Finnegan, R. P. and Taylor, C. R. (2004) The race for talent: Retaining and engaging workers in the 21st century, *Human Resources Planning*, 27 (3), pp. 12-25.

Forbes, A. and McGill, D. (1985) Understanding Wastage, IMS, no. 101.

Gillham, S. and Ristevski, E. (2007) Where do I go from here: We have got enough seniors?: Monash University School of Rural, Health, Centre for Multidisciplinary Studies in Rural Health, Moe, Victoria, Australia.

Goldsmith, M. and Carter, L. (2010) Best Practices in Talent Management, San Francisco: Best Practice Institute (BPI).

Greystoke, A. L. (1951) Surveying Labour turnover in the Sheffield Region, *Yorkshire Bulletin of Economic and Social Research*.

Gruber, A. (2008) Factors that affect the retention of engineers in the contracting sector in South Africa. Unpublished thesis, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Hanekom, S. X. (1987) *Public Policy Framework and Instrument for Action*. Johannesburg: International Thomson Publishing.

Herman, R. E. (1997) Reducing costly employee turnover, *HR Focus*, 74 (76), pp.15-16.

Herman, R. E. (1999) Hold on to the people you need, *HR Focus*, June 1999, V. 7616, P. 11.

Herman, J. L., Morris, L. L. and Gibbon, C. T. F. (1987) *Evaluator's Hand Book*. Newbury Park: Sage Publications.

Hesselbein, F., Goldsmith, M. and Beckhard, R. (1997) *The organisation of the future*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Hilgert, R. A., Schoen, S. H. and Towle, J. W. (1978) *Cases and Policies in Human Resources Management.* Boston: Houghton Miffin Company.

Hill, M. (1997) *The Policy Process*. United Kingdom: Prentice Hall.

Hollway, W. and Jefferson, T. (2000) *Doing Qualitative Research Differently*. London: Sage Publications.

John, P. (1997) *Analysing Public Policy*. Great Britain: British Library Publishers.

Kerzner, H. (2003). *Project Management*. United States: John Wiley and Sons.

Klimoski, S. (1991) *Research Methods in Human Resources Management*. Cincinnati: South Western Publishing.

Kroon, J. (1994) *General Management*. Pretoria: Haum Tertiary.

Kuye, J. O., Thornhill, C., Fourie, D., Brynard, P. A., Crous, M., Mafunisa, M. J., Roux, N. L., Van Dijk, H. J. and Van Rooyen, E. J. (2002) *Public Administration*. Sandown: Heinemann Publishers.

Lee, S. Y. and Whitford, A. B. (2007) *Exit, loyalty and pay: Evidence from the public, workforce.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Leedy, P. D. and Ormrod J. E. (2001). *Practical Research, Planning and Design*. London: New York Publishers.

Leedy, P. D. (2009) *Practical Research, Planning and Design*. Saddle River: Pearson Education.

Long, A. (1951) *Labour turnover under full employment.* Birmingham: University of Birmingham.

Lusthaus, C., Andrien, M. H., Anderson, G., Carden, F. and Montalvan, G. P. (2002) Organisational Assessment, International Development Research Centre/ Inter-American Development Bank, Ottawa, Canada.

Mashatola, P. (2003) *Factors that influence turnover and retention of Call Centre Agents*. Johannesburg: University of Witwatersrand.

March, J. C. and Simon, H. A. (1958) *Organisations.* New York: John Wiley and Sons.

McKevitt, D. and Lawton, A. (1994) *Public Sector Management*. London: Sage Publications.

Merriam, S. B. (1998) *Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Wiley Imprint.

Merriam, S. B. (2002) *Qualitative Research in practice.* New York: John Wiley and Sons Inc.

Mobley, W. H. (1982) *Employee Turnover: Causes, Consequences and Control*. Reading: Addison Wesley.

Meyer, M., Opperman, C. and Dyrbye, C. (2003) *Measuring Return on Investment*. Randburg, South Africa: Knowles Publishing.

Mileham, P. and Spacie, K. (1996) *Transforming Corporate Leadership*. London: Pitman Publishing.

Miller, P. A., Roome, W. B. and Staude, G. E. (1978) *Management in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Juta and Co Limited.

Mobley, W. H. (1982) *Employee turnover: Causes, Consequences and Control*. Reading, Mass: Addison-Wesley Publishers.

Morrell, K., Loan-Clarke, J. and Wilkinson, A. (2001) Unweaving leaving: the use of models in the management of employee turnover, Business School Research Series, Loughborough University.

Mowday, R. T. (1982) Organisational linkages: the psychology of commitment. In *Absenteeism and Turnover*, New York: Academy Press.

Mutuhaba, G., Bugama, R. and Halfani, M. (1993) Vitalising Public African Administration for Recovery and Development: Kumarian Press, Connect Circuit.

Nel, P. S., Werner, A., Haasbroek, G. D., Poisat, P., Sono, T. and Schultz, H. B. (2008) *Human Resource Management*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Neuman, N. (2006) *Social Research Methods*. Boston: Pearson Education.

Oosthuizen, E. (1996) A reflection of African policy support type organizations. In *Africanus*, Vol. 26. No. 2.

Phillips, J. and Connell, A. D. (2003) *Managing employee retention*. Alexandria VA: Amsterdam Publishers.

Reid, M. A. and Barrington, H. (1997) *Training Interventions, Managing Employee Development*. London: Institute of Personnel Development.

Reddy, R. (2004) *Factors Affecting the Mobility and Retention of Black Knowledge Workers.* Unpublished report, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Richardson, E. D. (1996) *Hand* Book of Qualitative Research Methods for Psychology and Social Sciences. Leicester: Blackwell Publishers.

Robbins, S. P. (1998) *Organisational Behaviour*. Saddle River: Prentice Hall.

Rooney, D., Hearn, G., Mandeville, T. and Joseph, R. (2003) *Public Policy in a Knowledge Based Economy*. Northampton, USA: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Rothwell, S. (1980) *Labour turnover*. Westmead: Gower Publishing.

Sandler, S. F. (Ed.), (2005) Leading in turbulent time, *HR Focus Journal*, Vol.82, no. 16. 155-180.

Schiemann, W.A. (2009) *Reinventing Talent Management.* Canada: John Wiley and Sons.

Silzer, R. and Dowell, B. E. (2010) *Strategy driven Talent Management.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Thulare, A. M. (2003) *Retention Strategies for Medical Doctors in the Public Sector*. Unpublished Research Report, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Travalglione, A. and Marshall, V. (2000) *Human Resources strategies: An applied approach*. Australia: McGraw Hill Companies.

Ulin, P. R., Robinson, E. T., Tolley, E. E. and Mc Neill, E. T. (2002) *Qualitative Methods: a Field Guide for Applied Research in Sexual and Reproductive Health*, Family Health International.

Ulrich, D., Losey, M. R. and Lake, G. (1997) *Tomorrow's HR Managers*. Canada: John Wiley and Sons.

Van As, D. S. (2001) *Executive mobility within a manufacturing environment*. Unpublished thesis, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Van Der Merwe, R. and Miller, S. (1976) *Measuring Absence and Labour Turnover.* Johannesburg: McGraw-Hill Book Company.

Yin, R. K. (1984) *Case Study Research design and methods*. Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.

Yin, R. K. (1994) *Case Study Research design and methods*, 2nd Edition, Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Yin, R. K. (2009) *Case study research, design and methods*, 4th edition, India: Sage Inc.

APPENDICES

Appendix A: List of Interviewees

First Category

1. SM 1 – interviewed on 2010-09-05
2. SM 2 – interviewed on 2010-09-07
3. SM3 – interviewed on 2010-09-09
4. SM 4 – interviewed on 2010-09-09
5. SM 5 – interviewed on 2010-09-15

Second category

1. MM 1 – interviewed on 2010-07-02
2. MM 2 – interviewed on 2010-07-02
3. MM 3 – interviewed on 2010-07-11
4. MM 4 – interviewed on 2010-07-09
5. MM 5 – interviewed on 2010-07-06

Category 3

1. RM 1 – interviewed on 2010-09-09
2. RM 2 – interviewed on 2010-09-09
3. RM 3 – interviewed on 2010-09-10
4. RM 4 – interviewed on 2010-09-10
5. RM 5 – interviewed on 2010-09-14

Appendix B: Interview request letter

270 Maggs Street
Watloo
PRETORIA
0001
082 768 4665
2010 June 02

Request for interview

Dear Sir/ Madam

I am a Masters of Management student in the field of policy at the University of WITS conducting a research study about the implementation of retention policy in the department of Home Affairs.

A request is hereby made for an interview at your earliest convenience during the month of June to September 2010. Kindly confirm your availability at the above contact numbers.

Your assistance will be appreciated

Yours faithfully

Adv M P Machethe
Date:

Appendix C

Appendix C: Research Themes

1. **Retention management and Coordination**

1.1. Describe how your Department manages retention of personnel.

2. Resources allocation

2.1. Explain which part of your Department requires more resource attention to ensure successful retention of personnel.

2.2. Does your Department have talent to retain? Please qualify your response.

3. Existing retention policy successes and challenges

3.1. Briefly explain your Department's retention policy successes.

3.2. Briefly explain your Department's retention policy challenges.

3.3. What do you consider as causes of the challenges if any?

3.4. What do you think needs to be improved to enable successful implementation of the policy?

Thank you for taking time to participate in the study