

https://dspace.org/

A plan of all government?: IDP and intergovernmental development planning in post-apartheid South Africa

Hlongwane, Thabiso

2010-06-29T10:27:40Z
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/8239

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

A PLAN OF ALL GOVERNMENT?

IDP and Intergovernmental Development Planning In Post- Apartheid South Africa

Thabiso Hlongwane

A research report submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science in Development Planning, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg

April 2010

DECLARATION

I declare that this research report is my own, unaided work and that all assistance received has been acknowledged. I further declare that all the sources utilized during this research have been referenced and that the fieldwork was done by myself. This research is being submitted to the School of Architecture and Planning, Faculty of Engineering and Built Environment, at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, towards the fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Science in Development Planning. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other University.

_____

(Signature of candidate)

_____ Day of _____ 2010.

ABSTRACT

A PLAN OF ALL GOVERNMENT?

IDP and Intergovernmental Development Planning In Post- Apartheid South Africa

After 15 years of democracy and following a number of initiatives, intergovernmental alignment among the three spheres of government in post-apartheid South Africa remains one of the biggest challenges confronting government in the quest for effective service delivery. This research examines post-apartheid South Africa's intergovernmental development planning system. In particular, the research sets out to examine the extent to which the shift in the conceptualisation of the IDP, from a municipal-specific plan to an instrument of intergovernmental alignment, has contributed in tackling the challenges associated with intergovernmental alignment.

Employing qualitative methods, this research drew on Gauteng as a case study, and utilizes the provincial Departments for Education, Health and Housing. At a municipal level, Ekurhuleni Metro, Metsweding District and Emfuleni Local Municipalities are utilised to examine the state of intergovernmental alignment both vertically and horizontally.

It is argued that the South African system of intergovernmental development planning is highly dependent on individual goodwill and centred around forums. This is identified as a fundamental flaw that has contributed to challenges of intergovernmental alignment South Africa faces. As a solution it is proposed that an institutionalised system of intergovernmental alignment be introduced, and, drawing from international practices, the various models in this regard are presented. In particular, a case is made for consideration of the New Jersey's model of cross acceptance.

DEDICATION

TO MY FAMILY

I AM THANKFUL FOR ALL OF YOU!

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A research project, especially one as challenging as this, is an exceptionally enriching endeavour. With each step of the project come new discoveries and lifetime lessons and its completions brings fulfillment unequalled.

I'm grateful to the Gauteng Department of Local Government and Housing, for granting me the opportunity to finish my studies through financial support. To My manager Ms Rashika Padarath, thank you for your encouragement and the generosity you demonstrated both by allowing me adequate time to complete the research as well as your valuable inputs.

I'm also grateful to my supervisor Ms. Amanda Williamson for the intellectually stimulating commitment, guidance and support she has provided me throughout the research.

My gratitude is extended to public servants, from national, provincial and local government who gave their time to ensure that my fieldwork produces the best possible outcomes. In particular, Mr. S'busiso Xaba, the Head of The Gauteng Planning Commission and Mr. Yusuf Patel, the Deputy Director General in the Department of cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs were instrumental in building a much needed historical context for the research.

I'm equally grateful to Professor Mark Oranje and Professor Phillip Harrison for the valuable insights which aided a lot in shaping the research. Mr Mike Muller and Dr. Martin Carstens provided much needed information for which I'm extremely grateful.

Lastly, I'm thankful to the colleagues and friends who provided perspectives and comments that helped shape the research.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION……II
ABSTRACT……III
DEDICATION……IV
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS……V
TABLE OF CONTENTS ……VI

CHAPTER 1- INTRODUCTION

1.1. OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH ……1
1.2. PROBLEM STATEMENT AND FOCUS OF RESEARCH…… 3
HYPOTHESIS……5
RESEARCH QUESTION AND SUB-QUESTIONS……5
1.3. RESEARCH RATIONALE AND OBJECTIVES ……6
1.4. RESEARCH ASSUMPTIONS……6
1.5. RESEARCH APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY……7
1.5.1. RESEARCH STRATEGY……8
FIG 1: GAUTENG PROVINCIAL MAP……10
1.5.2. SAMPLING AND DATA COLLECTION……10
1.5.3. PARTICIPATORY OBSERVATION……12
1.5.4. LIMITATIONS OF RESEARCH……13
1.5.5. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS……14
1.6. STRUCTURE OF REPORT……14
1.7. SUMMARY……16

CHAPTER 2 - CONTEXT OF INTERGOVERNMENTAL DEVELOPMENT PLANNING IN POST APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA: A CONTEXTUAL FRAMEWORK

2.1. INTRODUCTION……17
2.2. THE VOLUNTARISTIC NATURE OF INTERGOVERNMENTAL ALIGNMENT....17
2.2.1. INTERGOVERNMENTAL FORUMS……18
2.2.2. SYSTEMS AND PROCESSES OF INTERGOVERNMENTAL ALIGNMENT……20
2.3. INTEGRATED DEVELOPMENT PLAN (IDP)……24

CHAPTER 3: PERSPECTIVES ON INTERGOVERNMENTAL ALIGNMENT: A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

3.1. INTRODUCTION……..29
3.2. POST APARTHEID STATE RESTRUCTURING AND DECENTRALISATION: SHARING DECISION-MAKING AUTHORITY ……29
3.3. JOINED UP GOVERNMENT (JUG): IN PURSUIT OF INTERGOVERNMENTAL ALIGNMENT…..……..……33
3.3.1. MODELS OF JOINED UP GOVERNMENT……37
3.3.1.1 MALAYSIA.…..……38
3.3.1.2 BRAZIL……...39
3.3.1.3 INDIA.……..……40
3.3.1.4 THE AMERICAN STATE OF NEW JERSEY…….……...41
TABLE 1: SUMMARY OF INTERNATIONAL MODELS……...……..43
3.4. SUMMARY……46

CHAPTER 4: INTERGOVERNMENTAL ALIGNMENT IN GAUTENG: PRESENTATION OF FINDINGS

4.1. INTRODUCTION……..……47
4.2. THE APPROACH TO PREPARING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONNAIRES…....47
4.3. CODING AND FINDINGS…..…….……...……..47
4.3.1 GROUP 1: PROVINCIAL, REGIONAL AND MUNICIPAL OFFICIALS……. 48
4.3.2 GROUP 2: IDP MANAGERS/COORDINATORS ….....58
4.3.3 GROUP 3: PERSPECTIVES FROM EXPERTS AND PRACTITIONERS....62
4.4. SUMMARY……..……66

CHAPTER 5: REFLECTIONS AND ANALYSIS

5.1. INTRODUCTION..……..……67
5.2. OVERVIEW AND INSIGHTS…..……..……67
5.2.1 LEGISLATIVE GAPS……...……68
5.2.2 INSTITUTIONAL WEAKNESSE……....……69
5.2.3 ADMINISTRATIVE FAILURES……...……...……70
5.3. RECOMMENDATIONS FROM FIELDWORK……..……71
5.3.1 IMPROVED PARTICIPATION……..……71
5.3.2 DISSOLVING PROVINCES……72
5.3.3 DEVELOPMENT OF VALUES AND WORK ETHIC……....72
5.3.4 LEGISLATIVE AMENDMENT ……..……73
5.4. TOWARDS A SYSTEM OF INTERGOVERNMENTAL ALIGNMENT: KEY LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS……...73

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUDING REMARKS

6.1. INTRODUCTION……..……76
6.2. FOCUS AND APPROACH…..……..……76

6.3. OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS……77

BIBLIOGRAPHY.....79

APPENDIX A: LIST OF INTERVIEW RESPONDENTS……..……..…83