

https://dspace.org/

'Tales of the Women of Warwick' : the narrated lives of informal street traders.

Coats, Tamryn

2012-06-21
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/11561

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

Acknowledgements

I would like to extend a sincere thank you to all the people who made the completion of this study possible. To the NPO Asiye eTafuleni, thank you for allowing me to conduct this research and assisting me throughout the process. The support of my colleagues, both tangible and emotional, has been so appreciated. Without Asiye eTafuleni's good relationship and reputation in the Warwick community, none of this research would have been feasible.

Thank you to my participants, 10 extraordinary women, whose life stories have influenced my worldview significantly. Thank you for telling me your 'tales' sharing your experiences and allowing me to in some way understand the lives you have so courageously led. I wish you every success in the years to come in fulfilling the dreams you so passionately spoke of.

Professor Jill Bradbury, thank you for agreeing to supervise me despite the distance, and for supporting my work from the onset. Your patience with my many emails and apostrophe "disability" has been genuinely appreciated. I could not ask for a more engaging, supportive supervisor. I have the greatest respect and admiration for you, both academically and personally. Thank you.

Geoff, thank you for always reminding me that all things are achievable when relying on God's strength, your patience, prayers and support meant more than you know.

Thank you to my parents for instilling a desire within me, to continuously question the world through a lifelong pursuit to learn more. Thank you for your unyielding support, financial generosity, and constant encouragement. I love you both.

This research is dedicated to my participants, and all women working informally, in the hope that your voices will continue to be heard.

Declaration

Under the supervision of Professor Jill Bradbury,

I, Tamryn Coats hereby declare that this research is my own original work and all external sources have been accurately reported and acknowledged. This work has not previously, in its entirety, or in part been submitted to any other university in the interest of an academic qualification.

_____

Tamryn Coats

_____

Date

Abstract

This research project focused on the narrated lives of woman informal street traders. Ten women from Warwick Junction in Durban, South Africa, of varying ages, were interviewed. The women selected participated in two interviews, one narrative interview and a follow up in-depth open-ended interview based on their life narrative. Thematic analysis was conducted thereafter; through this process recurring themes relevant to all participants were identified and discussed. Five dominant themes resulted from the thematic analysis: 'Economic challenges'; 'Politics, police and permits'; 'Work'; 'Being a woman' and 'Support'. The findings of this research showed that economical challenges were a substantial issue for several of the women, many of who grew up in poverty and remain trapped in the poverty cycle. Disturbingly, several women highlighted how local authorities and corrupt police showed little regard towards trader's opinions and several women nostalgically recollected trading conditions before 1994. Many of the women were the sole breadwinners for their families, supporting children and grandchildren and great emphasis was placed on the importance of their work as a means of economic survival and financing their children's education, as schooling was understood to be leverage out of the poverty cycle. The supportive role of the women's communities was a significant feature in their lives. Several overarching social networks became resources in times of crises. The need to utilize the community as a supportive network was largely due to the lack of formal support women informal street traders received from local authorities. This research raises concerns over the City's perceptions of, and approach towards, informal street traders, specifically in the last decade. Furthermore, this study highlights the need to broaden understandings of the means of coping used by women in contexts of poverty, constant vulnerability, and exposure to frequent psychologically disturbing trauma.

Table of Contents:

	Page Ref.
Acknowledgments	i
Declaration	iii
Abstract	iv
Chapter 1 - Introduction	1
1.1 Warwick Junction in context	3
1.1 Structural layout of the markets in Warwick Junction	5
1.3 Aims of the study	7
Chapter 2 – Literature review	
2.1 Context	10
2. 1.1 The informal economy	10
2.1.2 Warwick Junction, Durban	14
2.2 Gender	23
2.2.1 The problem of patriarchy	23
2. 2.2 Woman and work	28
2.2.3 Women as vulnerable	30
2.2.4 Informal traders and vulnerability	34
2. 3. The notion of community	36
2.3.1 Conceptualizing community: Warwick Junction	39
Chapter 3- Methodology	
3.1 The Narrative Approach	41
3.1.1 The human capacity for storytelling	41
3.1.2 The temporal nature of stories	42
3.1.3 The experience centered framework	44
3.2 Profile of participants	45
3.2.1 Participant timelines	46
3.3 Data collection	48
3.4 Data analysis	49
3.5 Ethical considerations	50
3.6 Limitations of the study	51
Chapter 4 - Thematic analysis	
4.1 Introduction	53
4.2 Economic challenges	54
4.2.1 The context of poverty	54
4.2.2 The roots of poverty	55
4.2.3 The politics of poverty	61
4.2.4 Crime and the contradiction of communal protection	65
4.2.5 Having a home- the symbol of success	70

4.3. Politics, Police and Permits 73
4.3.1 1994 the year of change…or not? 74
4.3.2 The changing landscape 77
4.3.3 Recalling a time past 81
4.3.4 Municipal melancholy and "protective" police 82
4.3.5 Police interaction: past and present 83
4.3.6 Bribery corruption and confiscation 86

4.4. Work 94
4.4.1 A family heritage 94
4.4.2 Behind the scenes of informal trading 96
4.4.3 Innovation and adaptability 98

4.5. Being a woman 101
4.5.1 Social status and heterosexism 102
4.5.2 Challenging patriarchy: women as breadwinners 105
4.5.3 Being a mother 107
4.5.4 Sacrificing for a better future 112
4.5.5 Mothering in the context of illness and death 117
4.5.6 Women as caregivers in the homes and community 121

4.6. Support 124
4.6.1 Macro and Exo systemic support network 124
4.6.2 Meso and micro systemic support network 126
4.6.3 Lack of cohesion 133

Chapter 5 - Conclusions 137

Tables
Table 1: Profile of participants 46
Table 2: Timelines of participants 47

References 142

Appendices:
Interview outline 154
Letters of consent
Letter of consent in English 158
Letter of consent in isiZulu 160

Chapter 1: Introduction

Located on the periphery of the Durban CBD, and on the fringe of society, the women informal street traders of Warwick Junction constantly struggle to survive in the harsh reality of work in the informal sector. Warwick Junction is a historically significant geographical location that is occupied by informal street traders in a market-like setting, comprised of several individual but interconnected market spaces. The discriminatory legacy of Apartheid forced African and Indian[1] women to the periphery of society, into informal trading, trapping them in contexts of poverty and working extensive hours in tough conditions to make a living. All black people were affected by legislation that impacted on where people could live, the provisions of services such as health and education and access to employment. However, the effects on those classified Indian or African were variable. The Indian community in Durban was recognized as an urban group, typically traders or independent small farmers. On the other hand, Black Africans were relegated to the domains of labour and more distant rural homelands. It is within this context of poverty, historical oppression, and patriarchal society that Ife's (2002) claim is best understood, "*The three forms of oppression obviously interact and reinforce each other; thus to be an indigenous woman in poverty is to be terribly disadvantaged*" (Ife, 2002. p. 59). Despite political emancipation in 1994, several informal street traders remain marginalized through class and gender discrimination, which infiltrates every aspect of their lives and distorts their social positioning and bargaining power in society. By giving these women's narratives a listening audience, they no longer remain on the periphery, but rather, insight can be established into the daily struggles of their lives, challenges of this sector, and adversities associated with gender. This is increasingly

[1] These Apartheid 'race' categories are employed because of the continuing impact of this system of historical oppression in the present.

important as, despite the informal economy compromising an escalating proportion of employment for South African women, the lives of women in this sector in South Africa are relatively under-researched which validates it as a field of further inquiry (Skinner, 2009; Lund 1998).

In Warwick Junction, Durban, the informal economy is represented by an age-diverse population. The location in which they trade is historically important in relation to architecture and prominence within the Durban inner city; for example, the Nomkhubulwana Mural painted in 1994 to celebrate South Africa's first democratic election (Dobson and Skinner, 2009), as well as the Early Morning Market, which is over 100 years old (Broughton, 2009). The practice of trade in this particular location is a symbolic story of South Africa's history, rooted in the racial discrimination of Apartheid (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). Due to South Africa's discriminatory past, Warwick became known to many as a dangerous slum area in the late 1980s and early 1990s, overpopulated with the urban poor, to be avoided at all costs, effectively muting the voices of the traders within this vicinity and preventing them from participating fully in the economic and political life of the city. Its gradual transformation has been integral in challenging and changing those mindsets to the point that it is now promoted as a tourist destination in Durban. However, promotion of the area has coincided paradoxically with a conflicting and fractious legal dispute between the traders and the City authorities regarding redevelopment across certain sectors of the Warwick Junction vicinity (Skinner, 2009). Research into this controversial area thus far has centred on architecture, and the economic aspects of informal trade giving little attention to the individual psychological histories and trajectories of the informal women traders that work in the area.

1.1 Warwick Junction in context

To appreciate the diversity and success of the markets today, the historical significance of the Warwick area is well worth knowing. Today the market is connected to City Council resources, NGOs and community intervention projects. However, this was not always the case as is evident in the historical narrative of the area described by Dobson and Skinner (2009) and others.

Warwick Junction became known as a trading node as early as the 1870s. Freed Indian indentured labourers and their families were of the first to establish small businesses in the area. Market gardening was one of the earliest forms of trade, and both men and women sold fruit and vegetables. However, the structures imposed by the Apartheid government severely restricted trading for all Black traders in defined "white areas" such as the inner city, and "*street trading was prohibited in Durban*" (Dobson &Skinner, 2009, p.45). Any trader who attempted to trade informally in the Durban city centre had their goods confiscated and they received a fine (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). The 1950 Group Area Act severely limited black people's access to the inner City and designated specific areas in which they could live. In 1958 African people living in shacks in Cato Manor in Durban, were forcibly removed to KwaMashu. Despite retaliating through protests, by 1966 nearly all those living in this location, approximately 82 000, had been relocated (Maylam, 1983). In addition to the financial costs of being moved far from work opportunities in the city, there was also significant emotional turmoil experienced by the individuals and families who were required to leave locations, which held spiritual significance.

In 1973 the Licensing of Business Hours Ordinance severely regulated the time informal traders spent in one location, stipulating that they could not occupy a space for longer than 15

minutes (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). Trading conditions were still harsh, and police presence and inequality was still rife well into the 1980's as this trader expressed:

> When I first started trading in Warwick in 1982 it was a terrible place. It was the time of the blackjacks. Blackjacks, that's what we called the City Police…they were harassing us. On the street it was very bad. You couldn't sit where you wanted to sit. The blackjacks were everywhere. We were running with our bags. All the traders were running like hell. The blackjacks would come and take all our goods. (Dobson & Skinner, 2009. p 45).

The 1990s saw the gradual demise of the Apartheid regime, with the release of Nelson Mandela from prison, and as the restrictive laws on Black trading and movement loosened, a large influx of black traders arrived in search of work in the City (Grest, 2002). As Grest (2002) highlights "*more and more people previously denied access to the City, began to stake a claim in the CBD*" (p. 42) setting up informal living quarters from which they traded as well. The population in the area thus increased to approximately 4000 people and the overcrowding resulted in worsening of living conditions, high competition between traders, which effectively reduced individuals' income, widespread crime and deeper "*slum like conditions*" (Dobson & Skinner, 2009, p.45). However, in 1991, the Department of informal trade and small business opportunities was established with the intent of managing the influx of traders and overcrowding of city markets. Furthermore the Durban City Council passed trading bylaws that, for the first time, allowed traders to operate in most of the inner City. This was significant because "*in most other provinces in South Africa, informal street trading was still largely prohibited*" (Dobson & Skinner, 2009, p. 45). The Business Act of 1993 stipulated that in order to be considered as a legal trader, traders needed to obtain a license or

permit, thereby acknowledging for the first time, the importance and the presence of informal trading as a viable economic sector within Durban and South Africa (Karumbidza, 2011). The shift towards democracy in 1994 set the platform for new priorities within City management. However, Warwick Junction remained largely overcrowded, and severely under resourced, lacked basic public health facilities and was riddled with crime. In an attempt to overcome these challenges, the urban renewal project of Warwick Junction began in the early 1990s, with a focus on collaborative and inclusive urban renewal that could address the needs of the Warwick community and incorporate the area into part of the City, acknowledging the traders' presence (Grest, 2002). Despite several infrastructural developments in Warwick as a result of the urban renewal project, progress post 1994 has been wrought with its own difficulties. Warwick Junction has again become the focal point of controversial press and media in the debate over a Mall Development with the city in 2009, which would effectively demolish part of the market. Collaborative trader organization, along side NPO's in the vicinity were contributing factors to the successful resistance of the Mall Development.

1.2. Structural layout of the markets in Warwick Junction

Located on the periphery of the Durban city centre, Warwick Junction is made up of different markets that are interwoven into a complex system of interdependence. The markets are varied size, with the largest and most prominent markets being the Early Morning Market and the Traditional Herb Market. The traditional herb market extends to the lime and imphepo market which sells traditional incense used in religious ceremonies, as well as a white or red clay like substance called lime, which is used among other reasons, to differentiate between qualified and trainee traditional healers. The Early Morning Market, which sells a variety of fresh fruit and vegetables, is also one of the oldest markets in Warwick Junction and directly within this market lies the Poultry market which sells chickens and other forms of live

poultry. The Bovine head market is located alongside the Early Morning market and sells cooked cow head meat, which is traditionally served with dumpling (steamed bread), and operates much like a restaurant. The Brooke Street Market is also one of the oldest markets, and was largely impacted by the urban renewal project it sells a variety of home ware and home usage products and is located alongside Berea station market (Markets of Warwick, 2010). Berea station is arrival and departure point for train commuters from the Warwick Junction vicinity. Traders began accumulating around this specific transport node and gradually utilized the space for informal trading. The music bridge is one of the smaller markets in the vicinity, as traders selling various cd's and music cassettes are based along a bridge, which has limited space. Whilst the bead market is an important part of the markets in Warwick Junction, traders only operate on a Friday, and thus their market space remains largely empty for the duration of the week. The bead market is located in close proximity to the Victorian Street Market, which is a formal market unlike those previous mentioned, but remains within the Warwick Junction precinct due to its location and history (Markets of Warwick, 2010). Each market operates individually in a specific type of informal trade. Each market has established a micro community of traders who make a living trading in set spaces each day; and each market has a unique feel or atmosphere differentiating it from other markets in the Warwick Junction vicinity. However, the market can be thought about as a holistic system, as each individual market is connected with the others through close geographical proximity and through overarching committees. The exception is the meilie market which is located primarily on the periphery of Warwick Junction but mobile traders distribute mielies throughout the Warwick Junction vicinity. In this way, Warwick Junction is like an ecosystem of several independently acting markets incorporated into one large informal market community. The economic significance of Warwick Junction is expansive, as it is estimated that the income of the approximately 6000 informal traders in this vicinity

support approximately 70, 000 – 100, 000 people who depend on their income (Dobson & Skinner, 2009).

1.3 Aims of the research

The aims of this research were to:

1. Document core themes from the lives of the women in Warwick Junction from a psychological perspective, which was a novel research stance in this context.
2. Grasp a more comprehensive understanding of the scope of challenges that these women encountered on a daily basis; and the means of coping employed to surpass such challenges.
3. Create an opportunity for the women to reflect on their experiences and in doing so provide a platform for their voices to be heard.

After being reduced to the backdrop of the Cityscape for so long, retrieving the life stories of the women of Warwick involved primarily bringing them to the foreground so their voices can be heard. Hearing their stories allowed for an understanding of their position in society as women, as informal traders, and specifically as a Warwick Junction trader. Research has shown that female traders were specifically more vulnerable to crime and sexual violence (Lund, 1998). By giving these women a platform to speak about their lives, one can understand the daily and continual challenges they face and, importantly, the psychological and social means they use to overcome such adversity. Their identities are constituted in their social worlds, through the daily role of being traders and belonging to this specific community (Billington, Hockey & Strawbridge, 1998). Work is embedded in culture; it shapes the individual and is shaped by the individual through daily interaction. "*Our*

activities as individuals or groups are shaped by the society in which we live, but we are also powerful social actors who may change this society" (Billington et al, 1998, p 14).

Through adopting a narrative framework for the interviews the women are able to tell their life stories and include events or experiences that hold meaning for them. The women were asked to reflect on the 'lived life' and recall their experiences, highlighting how narratives are lived and then told (Sarbin, 1986). Sarbin (1986) suggests narratives are "*an organizing principle for human action*" (p. 9), and implicit in the daily events of individual lives. This is because "*human beings think, perceive, imagine and make moral choices according to narrative structure*" (Sarbin, 1986, p. 8). In this way, the stories people tell, reflect the ways in which their lives have been structured, and in doing so reflect the ways in which their identities have been moulded around these events. This approach is particularly useful given our history of racist oppression, and the need for sensitivity when discussing the women's experiences in their past. However, not all experiences encountered during the Aparthied era were shown to be negative. Dlamini's book *Native Nostalgia* (2009) recollects his own memories of growing up in Apartheid South Africa, and asserts this quality of 'nostalgia' as paradoxically possible. It was shown by Dlamini (2009) that although experiences and recollections of Apartheid South Africa were largely shaped by individual people's subscription to class, ethnicity and gender, these may, or may not reflect the "master *narrative*" of suffering during this notorious era (Dlamini, 2009, p. 18). Rejecting the racist system of the past need not entail negative emotions about all personal experiences. In discussing nostalgia he comments:

> It does not have to be a hankering after the past and a rejection of the present and the future. There is a way to be nostalgic about the past without forgetting that the

> struggle against Apartheid was just. In fact, to be nostalgic is to remember the social orders and networks of solidarity that made the struggle possible in the first place. (Dlamini, 2009, p. 17).

The active process of reflecting on one's life enables individuals to recall specific events that they feel hold significance. In this way, people are able to retrospectively construct their life experiences as they may choose to select certain events over others (Crites, 1986). Narrative is therefore a relevant and constructive framework for understanding these women's lives, how they conceptualize their identity amidst the wider community of which they are part.

By giving these women informal street traders a listening audience, one can break the repressive silence of the past and begin to unpack new perspectives on adversity and communal support, that their life stories may offer; adding not only to the field of Psychology, but to the knowledge base about the continually increasing informal economy.

Chapter 2: Literature review

This literature review provides insight into the three domains explored in the project: 1) the context of informal trading and the specific history of Warwick Junction post 1994; 2) the challenges associated with gender, in particular the vulnerability of women, and women street traders; and 3) the notion of communities and the role they play in individual lives especially in relation to facilitating social support.

2.1 Context

2.1.1 The informal economy.

The concept of 'work' according to Billington et al (1998) implies activity centred on order, structure and routine, within but not confined to, an organization or institution. Work is an activity that is purposeful in maintaining both the individual and the wider society through production or reproduction (Billington, et al 1998). The concept of work can be segregated into informal work and formal work. Formal work is understood to be an activity for which the individual is paid, and a percentage of that income is contributed to the country's gross domestic product or GDP (Round, 2009). Informal work includes both paid and unpaid work, for example community care or household work for which no income is generated; and paid informal work such as street trading in which income is generated but not taxed (Round, 2009).

The term 'informal economy' was first coined by Professor Keith Hart, and has since become a commonplace term in developing countries such as South Africa (Skinner, 2009). The informal economy is defined as the "*sum total of economic activity that happens outside state*

regulation which is neither taxed, nor represented in the countries GDP" (Osalor, 2011, p. 1). The informal economy thus extends to home based workers, waste pickers, and specifically relevant for this research, street vendors. In accordance with the World Bank's recent estimates, the informal economy supplies up to 40 percent of general income in Asian and African countries. In Nigeria, up to 90 percent of employment is in the informal sector (Osalor 2011).

The history of the informal economy in South Africa is rooted in the racial discrimination of the Apartheid government, who, through a series of laws, stringently controlled the movement, occupation and land ownership of black people. The 1913 Land Act designated specific areas for black people to live, the Native Act in 1923 restricted access of black people into urban areas unless for specific work, as did the 1952 Pass Laws. The combination of these legal restrictions prevented black people from becoming involved in formal employment while simultaneously having restricted access to arable rural land; thus for many the emergent informal economy provided the only means to economic survival (Lund, 1998). "*The legacies of the inequalities created by the previous regime are well known, and will take years to overcome: poverty rates and shares are highest for black people and for black women in particular*" (Lund, 1998. p. 11). The inequalities remain evident today as research conducted on informal traders working in the Johannesburg Central Business District highlighted that 80% of the traders entered the informal sector due to a lack of skills and capacity to be employed elsewhere (Lund, 1998).

Despite political changes that allow for the inclusion of all South Africans in the formal economy, the informal economy still seems to be expanding, especially after the recent global economic crises. Individuals who faced formal job-loss and migrants returning permanently

from closed mines have contributed to the informal economy's expansion (Global jobs pact policy brief, 2010). The lack of employment in the formal sector, especially for youths is particularly impactful on the informal sector. "*Without access to income, young people are home-bound, hang out on street corners, hustle to make a living through informal trading, and become easy recruits for criminals*" (Panday & Arends, 2008). A South African street vendor expressed his concern at the influx of people seeking trading opportunities in the informal sector when he stated: "*Factories have closed…some of these people come to us and ask if they could trade here as well so they can at least earn some income*" (Horn, 2009 p. 12).

Labour within the informal sector does not benefit from the social protection of labour legislation, which results in vulnerable and harsh working environments where the trader has limited social resources. Furthermore, the increase in competition in the informal sector by previously formally employed individuals, has forced informal traders to work harder to meet their economic demands. These conditions often force them further into poverty, "*they have no cushion to fall back on and therefore have no option but to keep operating or working under increasingly difficult circumstances*" (Global jobs pact policy brief. No 3., 2010. p. 3).

Informal trade is often the work of women, especially in developing countries. In statistics released by the United Nations 2003-2004, 65 percent of women and 51 percent of men participate in the informal non-agricultural sector in South Africa. (The world's women, 2010). WIEGO (Women in Informal Employment Globalizing and Organizing) researchers has shown that there are definite linkages between the informal sector and poverty, as the average income of people working in informal spaces is way below that of individuals employed in the formal sector (Chen, Jhabvala, and Lund, 2001). Assumingly poverty and

the informal sector go hand-in-hand. Conditions are even worse for women working in informal spaces as they earn a much lower income in comparison to men working informally (Chen et al, 2001). The reason for this, 'wage gap' is because of the type of informal trading or industry in which men and women are working, as Chen et al, (2001) highlights, "*In many countries, for example, men traders tend to have larger scale operations and to deal in non-perishable items while women traders tend to have smaller scale operations and to deal in food items*" (p. 16).

The long working hours of women in informal trade often result in added psychological stress as they balance family and economic duties simultaneously (Horn, 2009). Poverty stricken homes not only push women into informal trade, but also push them out of their own individual educational journeys, as the need for an income supersedes the need to continue with school. Research by Panday and Arends (2008) highlighted that community and home-based conditions largely associated with poverty were significant 'pull' factors that draw children out of the schooling system. Lund's (1998) report of women working in informal spaces showed the low level of education and completed education among informal traders, with many street traders having no education at all. Younger women are shown to have more education than older women yet the report also suggests that, from a gendered perspective, women are less likely to have completed their schooling in comparison to men (Lund, 1988). Children are also often employed in the informal economy in an attempt to assist in supporting the family income. According to the United Nations, child labour constitutes of "*all persons aged 15-17 who, during a specified time period are involved in informal labour*" (The world's women, 2010, p.106). Child labour also includes hazardous working conditions, late hours, and unpaid household services.

The increase in the informal economy due to the global recession provides a specific motivator for research to be conducted within this economic sphere. The expansions of the informal sector combined with the harsh daily routine these traders endure warrant increased focus on the mental health of these traders. As Horn's (2009) research highlights, "*Increased uncertainty and household strain are already taking a toll on the mental health of informal workers...a significant portion of study respondents described feeling increased emotional anguish over the previous six months*" (p. 20).

2.1.2 Warwick Junction, Durban.

In the heart of Durban, South Africa, Warwick Junction is the largest and most diverse informal trading market sector in the country. Located on the periphery of Durban's inner city, Warwick Junction is a primary public transport node of the city. On an average day the area accommodates 460 000 commuters (Grest, 2002). Given the confluence of rail, taxi, and bus transport, this area has always been a natural market for street vendors. There are between 5000 and 8000 people who trade formally or informally within this area, in various forms of trade (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). The "foot traffic" provided by the transport terminals, and the routes from one market to another force commuters to walk through specific markets. The underlying system of connectivity provided by "barrow operators" who transport resources between traders sharing market products and transporting products that need to move from one market to another in the form of a production line further highlight the interconnectivity of this geographical space (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). In this way, Warwick Junction can be conceptualised as a complex and diverse ecosystem, in which several market varieties operate both independently while simultaneously interconnected with one another in a complex relationship for economic survival.

In 1860, 152 641 Indian indentured labourers arrived in KwaZulu Natal (formerly the Natal Colony) in South Africa. By 1872, these immigrants established small trading stores along Grey (now Yusuf Dadoo) Street and, with the majority of the immigrants being Muslim, they built the Grey Street Mosque, which still remains (Vahed, 1999). Grey Street vendors were comprised of men and women, farmers and non-farmers who sold a variety of fresh produce, vegetables, and food items. Many traders sat cross-legged on the floor and sold their goods, thus the term 'squatters' market' became synonymous with this trading vicinity (Vahed, 1999).

The 1940s to 1960 period was marked in South African history by introduction of the racially discriminating Apartheid, with race being the overarching marker of political and socio-economic positioning. In 1950 Population Registration Act was passed which divided people according to "race" (Karumbidza, 2011). Racial classification was stratified and hierarchical with the "Indians" and "coloureds" situated between "white" and "African". "*Apartheid's principal imagery was a society in which every "race" knew and observed it's proper place-economically, politically and socially*" (Posel, 2001, p 52). Racial classification thus influenced every aspect of the individual's life as access to resources, job opportunities, housing and education were all determined according to racial hierarchy (Posel, 2001). It is important to note that, whilst Indians were also discriminated against, Indian people did receive more benefits from the Apartheid government in comparison to African people and Durban's history includes acrimony and racialised tension between these groups, for example, the Cato Manor riots of 1959. This inequality shaped conceptions and experiences of Apartheid differently specifically around access to economic sustainability and job employment. Remnants of the divide between these two groups remain today with research showing that Indian people continue to be less economically vulnerable and less subject to

racial discrimination in comparison to African people (Williams, Gonzalez, Williams, Mohammed, Moomal and Stein, 2008; Naidoo, 2005).

Significant laws passed in the 1950s greatly impacted on the lives of Black people. The Natives Act, in 1952, further reduced black people's mobility, and economic opportunity (Grest, 2002). Both of these effects greatly reduced their economic freedom. Furthermore, the Bantu Education system was implemented. This schooling system focused on equipping black students with the basic skills required to enter the semi-skilled labour workforce, severely limiting their job opportunities (Hyslop, 1989; Dlamini, 2009). Significant events in the 1950s were the forced removals of African and Indian people around South Africa. In Johannesburg approximately 65 000 people from Sophiatown were forcibly removed from their homes in locations which held spiritual symbolism (Sindane, 2005; Gready, 1990). The forced removals were significant psychological events in the lives of those affected. The geographical space of a home is symbolic to an individual and community as it is the location in which the dead are buried and thus the home of the ancestors. The role of ancestors is especially symbolic in African culture and community life, as ancestors are believed to be an integral part of individual identity through genealogy (Faith, 1995). Forced removals and the impact of migrancy as a result of laws passed in the 1950's, ruptured the very fabric of community life, separating young working males from their families and homes as they sought jobs in the city and tore whole families away from geographical areas in which they grew up and which held immense spiritual importance (Collinson, Tollman, Khan & Clark, 2003). Protests against the discriminatory Apartheid legislation continued in the 1960s, with the most significant protest being the Sharpville 1960. This protest was against the enforcement of pass laws on women, which required women to carry permits in urban areas.

A protest that began as a peaceful demonstration soon turned violent in a clash with police, resulting in "*67 deaths*" (Francisco, 2001, p. 3).

The 1970's were marked by the events of the 1976 Soweto Uprising, in which a protest by school children resulted in a violent clash with police. The event marked a significant turn toward what has been labelled 'the beginning of the end of Apartheid' (Hunter-Gault, 2001). However, conditions remained difficult in the 1980s. As regulations began to allow for traders to work in the vicinity, new challenges arose, in particular, overcrowding. As the Apartheid laws began to collapse in the late 1980s, and early 1990s, people flocked towards the cities in an attempt to make an income. This led to several overcrowding issues, and without the necessary infrastructural support to manage the influx, Warwick Junction was approaching slum like conditions (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). It was in this context that the Warwick Junction Urban Renewal Project began (Dobson and Skinner, 2009). The urban renewal project of Warwick Junction focused on co-operation with government and stakeholders starkly contrasting with the previous Apartheid mode of operation based on control, exclusivity, and regulation (Grest, 2002). The basic needs of infrastructure development and organization were addressed as primary concerns (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). In 1995, ITMB (The Informal Traders Management Board) was set up and R4.72 million was allocated for achieving the Urban Renewal Project aims of infrastructural development in the area (Dobson & Skinner, 2009).

However, crime and violence, worsened by the political schism between the Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) and the African National Congress (ANC), resulted in "*further divided communities and defensive allegiances*" (Dobson & Skinner, 2009, p. 47). This combined with the general lack of trust among traders and towards the local government authorities by

Warwick Junction leaders based on past discriminatory actions, made progress slow and difficult (Grest, 2002). Furthermore, street traders were blamed for crime, litter, and the decrease in turnover that the surrounding formal stores were experiencing (Grest, 2002).

Despite these challenges, between 1995 and 2000, several advances were made in redeveloping the Warwick area including officially branding the area through marketing and signage as "*Warwick Junction"* (Grest, 2002, p. 48). The Early Morning Market was refurbished, "*5 taxi ranks were created to better control the flow of commuters and foot traffic, Brook Street was transformed from a slum to a viable trading zone, and the Herb market was designed and constructed thus legitimising their presence*" (Dobson & Skinner, 2009, p.61). In 2001 the eThekwini Council (formally the Durban City Council) adopted the Informal Economic Policy, which specifically focuses on catering on the needs of the traders; a significant milestone for an area of traders so blatantly neglected in the past (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). The Traders against Crime (TAC) a voluntary based organization made up of traders in the Warwick community, received training and resources that bolstered the organization. Their presence has resulted in a reduction of petty crime and increased holistic organization across all markets in the vicinity (Dobson & Skinner, 2009).

In 2008, the NPO Asiye eTafuleni (bring it to the table, lets negotiate)- was established with offices in the Warwick Junction vicinity. The NPO founders have been extensively involved in Warwick Junction since the start of the Urban Renewal Project. The NPO promotes inclusive urban planning and design of informal trading into formal city settings (Quasi, 2010). In response to hosting the 2010 FIFA Soccer World Cup and the tourist influx into the country, the NPO in conjunction with the traders and the TAC established a safe, interactive

tourist route through Warwick Junction to showcase the vicinity as a popular tourist destination in Durban (Markets of Warwick, 2010).

However, this promotion of the area happened paradoxically in the context of severe political conflict between the Warwick traders and the City. Recent controversy around Warwick Junction centres on the City's intention to destroy part of the market and replace it with a mall development (Skinner, 2009). The manner in which the City handled the process of campaigning for the mall development has been argued by some as a return to Apartheid tactics, through arousing racial aggravation particularly between Indians and Africans (Ngwane, 2009). Scheduled to be built in August 2009, the mall development received consistent resistance from traders and the wider community from its onset as for several traders, the market was their only source of income and an occupation passed down from one generation to the next (Skinner, 2009).

> The ETHEKWINI Municipality's intention to demolish Durban's Early Morning Market to make way for a multi-million rand shopping mall is unlikely to go ahead at the beginning of next month as planned. This is because KwaZulu-Natal heritage watchdog, Amafa's Built Environment Committee received the city's notice of appeal late on Monday, after the Market traders had lodged objections against the demolition of the market- a national heritage sight. (Ndlovu, July 29th 2009; p5).

The media have been extensive in coverage of the traders' opinions of the development, and the City's aggressive rebuttal. Traders' attempts to resist the City's plans through protest have been met with tear gas and rubber bullets (Skinner, 2009). On July 30th the *Mercury*, a prominent local newspaper, featured four articles on the issue, of which, one was titled '*City,*

market traders face of in court' (Ndlovu, July 30, 2009; pg 3; 12). Between June and December 2009, media articles concerning Warwick Junction were almost weekly features. In November, the press captured images of hundreds of informal traders marching through the streets of Durban in protest of the mall development (Mbewa, November, 19 2009). The debate subdued slightly with the media's coverage of the FIFA World Cup in 2010. However, the Early Morning Market traders celebrated the 100th centenary in 2010, which renewed media coverage of the Warwick Junction vicinity (Tshiqi, 2010). In early 2011 the mall development was "*shelved*" by the City due to the widespread resistance it has received (Gumede, February 25, 2011). In April 2011, almost 2 years after the development was supposed to have started. The Deputy Mayor stated, "the project to develop the Mall had been stopped and plans for future upgrade-shelved" (R350m Mall development haltered, 2011).

It is important to note the repercussions the Mall Development conflict has had on the trading community. In an attempt to validate the destruction of the market, the City painted a very negative and distorted image of the Early Morning Market. This, combined with protests, was believed to have discouraged many customers to the market and traders noted a significant decrease in customers, sales, and tourists through the area. Traders have not as yet received any remuneration in cash or kind for the costs they incurred in the Early Morning Market conflict. Furthermore, the poor degree to which traders were included in the development of the Warwick Mall highlights the regressive manner in which the City is currently interacting with informal street traders. The process was not one of inclusive consultation with the traders regarding their needs and requirements to work in a different space. Exclusion of the traders' opinions around the development that would be seen to severely compromise their livelihoods' highlighted the City as an "*inflexible and controlling regime*" (Karumbidza,

2011, p. 20). Furthermore, the survival of each market depends to a large extent on the activity and functioning of the Warwick Junction area as a whole, and the negative press associated with the Early Morning Market impacted the whole of the Warwick area.

Added to the difficulties posed by the mall development conflict, traders in Warwick Junction face a continual battle with local authorities. Karumbidza's (2011) paper "Criminalizing the livelihoods of the poor" tracks the legalization process and the consequences on street trade in Durban through the decades. Karumbidza highlights the regressive and contradictory impact of the 'formalization' process, which Warwick currently finds itself, by stating:

> Officially, the reasons given for formalization include the need to support the street traders and to ensure mutual co-habitation between the informal and formal sectors. However, the general lack of information on registration; haphazard site allocation policy; high rentals levied; and pervasive police harassment lead to the marginalization and criminalization of street traders. The additional burden imposed by the need for registration and exclusionary allocation policies makes the life of foreign and female traders even harder. (Karumbidza, 2011, p. 6).

Karumbidza (2011) highlights how experiences with police and municipal officials are riddled with abuse, confusion and exploitation that began during the Apartheid regime and continue, in a different form, to be a burden today. The formalization of the informal sector has increased the traders' hardships is through the difficulty in obtaining trade permits. Trading permits legitimize the traders within their occupational space, registration is an annually renewed process and permit holders secure their site for trading as well receiving services provided though the municipality, such as waste removal, shelter, lighting access to

water and toilets and storage facilities (Karumbidza, 2011, p. 17). The costs of permits are considered to be exorbitant for the traders who are already restricted financially. Furthermore, research has shown that traders feel overly policed through the regulation process that is cumbersome and frustrating from the onset (Karumbidza, 2011). "*Permits are paid for by the trader in accordance to size and position of their stall within Warwick and terminated upon the death of a trader or lack of activity for the duration of two weeks"* (Karumbidza, 2011, p. 17-18). However, the legal processes behind permit obtainment is an ongoing source of struggle for traders and traders highlight they are not receiving the services they are promised, despite paying for permits.

Conditions in Warwick are therefore still challenging. Despite more than a decade having passed since the Apartheid era, the traders are still subject to discrimination and fight daily to have their voices heard. In the absence of supportive local authorities, NPO's have filled the void as a supportive resource for informal street traders. In 2011, Asiye eTafuleni was awarded *the Mail and Guardian, Southern Trust Investors in the Future and Drivers of Change: Civil Society* award for their influence, collaboration, and sustainable approach to this sector (de Klerk, 2011). The NPO was described during the ceremony by the following:

> By taking a "bottom up" approach to compliment local government efforts, Asiye eTafuleni collaborates with informal traders, local government officials, and town planners to creatively include the voices and interests of informal traders in urban planning and development. As a social facilitation agency, AeT has been pioneering in research, multi-stakeholder dialogue and negotiation, policy development, and service delivery aimed at filling the pro-poor development vacuum that exists in urban design and planning. (Quasi, 2011).

However the effect of the Apartheid legacy of segregated living spaces still poses challenges for the traders today. Informal street traders often travel from far distances to get to work and work incredibly long hours as days can begin at four am and end at nine pm (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). With the majority of these traders being women, they consistently face challenging circumstances attempting to balance family and work life simultaneously in harsh conditions, which often include gender-based violence.

2.2. Gender

The historical overview of the context of Warwick Junction makes evident the ways in which the racist regime of Apartheid has marginalized both this space and the individuals who work in it. However, one must also explore the marginalization of these research participants because of their gender. "*The status of black women places us at the intersection of all forms of subjugation in society-racial oppression, sexual oppression and economic exploitation*" (Mama, 1995, p.3). In this way, the women trading in Warwick Junction face multiple modes of discrimination based on race, gender and socio-economic status. Furthermore, women's vulnerability to HIV Aids and the social impact of HIV Aids, contributes significantly to the hardship of their lives.

2.2.1 The problem of patriarchy.

Fox (1998) defines patriarchy in two ways. First, as male dominance in society; second, as an autonomous system, similar to capitalism, and one that self-perpetuates. Both include men's control of women's sexuality, fertility and labour power (Fox, 1998). In reviewing literature on constructions of patriarchy, Fox (1988) quotes Eisenstein (1981) who suggested that patriarchy is a "*system that acts with intent*" (Fox, 1988, p. 175):

> Patriarchy as a political structure seeks to control and subjugate women so that their possibilities for making choices about their sexuality, childrearing, mothering, loving, and labouring are curtailed…Patriarchy protects the appropriation of women's sexuality, their reproductive capacities and their labour by individual men and society as a whole. (Fox, 1988, p. 175).

In practice, classical patriarchy, as referred to by Kandiyoti (1988) is the complete subordination of girls and women to men within their societies often through marriage practices. "*The young bride enters her husband's household as an effectively dispossessed individual who can establish her place in the [patrimony] only by producing male offspring*" (Kandiyoti, 1988, p. 279). These women do not have any claim on the bride-wealth nor inheritance from their own father. They have little say in the running of the household, and only reach a proposed position of power when they eventually become the 'mother-in-law' themselves and in doing so adopt a new young bride into their home who is subordinate to both men, and herself as the mother in law. "*The patrilineage totally appropriates both women's labour and progeny and renders their work and contribution to production invisible*" (Kandiyoti, 1988, p. 279). However, patriarchy is not confined to 'traditional societies' in which young women are married off, rather it is multifaceted and remains evident across all societies, in concealed and distorted measures.

In contemporary South Africa, constitutional rights are equally afforded to both men and women. This has led to the belief that the exertion of male dominance over females no longer exists in this 'raw' classical patriarchal form. However the acceptance of women having equal rights is narrowly defined and as Harris (2003) explains, women's rights are often only

affirmed in cases of sexual misconduct when they have been violated by men, "*women's rights are solely situated in the realm of sexual violation and rape-the rest is, evidently, fair game*" (Harris, 2003, p. 13). However, feminists suggest patriarchy has merely adapted, still playing itself out more broadly in society through veiled language. Politically correct jargon conceals patriarchy in more subtle ways that have become internalized and thus normalized (Harris, 2003). An example of this normalization is the defined social script of the woman as a mother primarily, reducing all other options available to her, and thus perpetuating her subjugation. The expectation of women becoming mothers, and the anticipation of the mother-child relation within the family can be interpreted as a form of continued patriarchy (Fox, 1988).

In the Euro/Western family unit, patriarchy is evident through the composition of the gendered roles. "*As a single-family household it is centred on a subordinate wife, a patriarchal husband, and children*" (Oyewumi, 2002, p. 3). The nuclear family, conceptualized as free of "race" and class variations, has gendered power imbalances that divide and identify one member from another. The male is defined as the breadwinner, and the female is associated with the home, nurture and mothering. By raising children within this pattern, mothers impose upon their children, behaviour and expectations that although are patriarchal, become normalized (Oyewumi, 2002). The focus of the woman's identity is in relation to her role as a wife to her husband, and then her work of reproduction. In this way, societal division of labour is based around marital coupling. Also significant in this image of the nuclear family is the dependency of the child on the parents. This stereotypical family unit is so engrained in the western consciousness that projecting a family in which the dependency ratio is reversed has shown to evoke significant responses. Burman (1994), highlights how advertisements and charity campaigns use the imagery of the more vulnerable

poverty-stricken child whose parents have seemingly failed to provide for them as a tool to elicit active response from audiences. "*So childhood is celebrated as a universal stage or period of life which is characterized by protection and freedom from responsibilities*" (Burman, 1994, p. 6). Burman (1994) suggests the motive behind this imagery lies in the financially stable adults' mindset that it is the paternal responsibility to provide for children. Therefore, if children embedded in poverty are hungry, they as adults must step in where the child's parents are unable. Burman (1994) thus highlights how the dependency role of an adult supporting, protecting and providing for a child is the normalized and accepted pattern in society, and the position of women remains stereotypically as the nurturer and carer fixed within the home, subordinate to her working husband.

However, the conceptual understanding of men and women and the roles they play in society is not as static in some parts of the world as it is in others. In the case of the Shona people, a woman may be considered to have male status and patriarchal privileges, which extend to reduced and divided labour, despite being female, similarly, in the Yoruba tribe, work differentiation and roles are determined not by gender, but by kinship and seniority (Oyewumi, 2002). With this example in mind, one must understand that the concepts of femininity and masculinity are not fixed. Rather they are changing and contextual, "*fluid, being constantly rehearsed, moulded and enacted*" (Morrell, 2009, p. 20). The notions of masculine, feminine, man, woman and the division of labour thereafter, displays a far higher degree of complexity from the known western concept, and thus the term patriarchy cannot be used as a blanket term to explain the role of men and women in society globally.

However, it's not simply patriarchy that is problematic. In South Africa, the "*concept of feminism has always been uncomfortable*", as the label ascribes to western undertones that do

not fully incorporate African gender nuances (Gouws, 2010, p. 14). Feminist movements in the late 1980's and early 1990's were led to believe that in joining the national movement for liberation they would be emancipated from the clutches of a patriarchal society. However, while 1994 brought political freedom, women remained marginalized through gender, continuing to have their needs sidelined (Hassim, 1991). In response to this critique, "*South African feminist scholarship has engaged the shift to African feminisms with a greater focus on motherhood, the body and sexuality with the aim of understanding women's sexuality through custom and culture*" (Gouws, 2010, p. 14). In recent years strong criticism has been relayed towards feminists holding positions in government but not utilizing these positions to implement policies and strategies that further women's issues. Furthermore, it seems that women's rallies and campaigns are still strongly dominated by male presence, performers and speakers (Hassim, 1991). Since democracy in South Africa, "*the spaces for feminist activism… have shrunk dramatically since 1994 when institutional politics replaced activism*" (Gouws, 2010, p. 16). Hassim (1991) adds another level of concern to the problems raised by Gouws (2010) as she comments, "*at a political level there is a prioritisation of African women's racial oppression" (p. 68)*. In this critique, Hassim (1991) highlights how, through the liberation movement, gender issues have been turned into a hierarchy in which racial gender issues are the priority; only thereafter do class and political gender-based issues emerge.

The level of dissatisfaction by feminist organizations was abundant and most evident when President Jacob Zuma collectivised "women, youth and disabled" in one portfolio. By ascribing women to this cohort Zuma labelled women as "vulnerable", which was perceived by feminists to be reductionist and "*not very empowering*" (Gouws, 2010, p. 17). Furthermore, feminist issues seem to have shifted away from their activist approach in the

1990's and leant towards a rhetoric of limited inclusion as highlighted by the exorbitant registration fees in the 2008 AWID 'Women in Movement' conference held in Cape Town. "*The high registration fee excluded several women and women's organizations from participating in this event, effectively silencing their voices through class based discrimination and establishing a platform on which selected voices could be heard*" (Gouws, 2010, p. 20).

2.2.2 Women and work.

Billington et al (1988) highlight the 'gendered work script' that governs the division of employment and types of employment in which men and women engage. For men, employment outside the home is synonymous with masculinity, wealth, autonomy, adulthood, and self-identification. The emphasis for men is on what they are "*doing*", the types of work in which they are engaged (Billington et al 1998, p.157). Work outside the family home is important for a woman's sense of identity, but for women the gendered work script focuses more on their 'being' (Billington et al, 1998). Society perpetuates the essence of femininity and associates a woman's identity in her 'being', her appearance, character, her ability to nurture, care and support (Billington et al, 1998). "*Women experience the imperative to be attractive more than men do in a sexist society which circumscribes the possibilities for self affirmation*" (Mama, 1995, p.108). This perception, which is often endorsed through media, creates the idea that women are naturally more suited for work within the domestic sphere rather than work outside of the home. However, as economic and political changes lead to women becoming more active in the public work environment, women carry the burden of maintaining work in their homes as well as in the public space. The role of work for women is often a balancing act between occupational obligations and family life. The gendered script of work for women became something that often mirrors

their domestic activities. More often than men, work for women is an extension of their domestic labour for example, larger percentages of women's work resides in the catering, nursing, caring roles within society (Billington et al, 1998).

An aspect of women's work that is often unrecognized is what Billington et al (1998) call 'emotional labour'. Society's perception of women is that they are more sensitive, and better at listening, supporting, and comforting and this often results in women having to fulfil these roles in public workspaces. However, their effort is unrecognized because their actions are perceived to be part of their gendered identity, part of their 'being' and not their 'doing' and hence are taken for granted; further perpetuating the discriminatory gendered script of work (Billington et al, 1998).

As economic situations change and the need for women to become more involved in the workforce and active decision making of the household increases, so the face of patriarchy changes. This is especially the case among the poor, for whom the move into work outside of the home is not so much a matter of feminist emancipation as a matter of necessity and survival. In these family units, the economic and social protection traditionally provided by the patriarchal male becomes somewhat diluted and gender co-operation is the only alternative (Kandiyoti, 1988). "*The impact of contemporary socioeconomic transformations upon marriage and divorce, on household formation, and on the gendered division of labour inevitably lead to a questioning of the fundamental, implicit assumptions behind arrangements between men and women*" (Kandiyoti, 1988, p. 286). However, when women are engaged in work outside the home, few women enter the formal economy over their husbands. Instead, many more women than men are relegated to working in the informal sector of the economy where there are very few legal protections and little security (Lund,

1998). In The South African Quarterly Labour Force survey of April-June 2009 showed that "*60 percent of those who worked in informal retail were women*" (Skinner, 2009, p. 102). Having already discussed the financial challenges of working in the informal sector, its important to note the value that Government funded child grants and social support plays in the lives of these women. In 1993 social grants became equally available to all South African citizens seeking financial support if they meet specific criteria in the varying categories of grants offered. Child support grants are issued to primary caregivers provided they are over the age of 16, raising a child born after 1994, and have an annual income less than R31 200, 00 per annum. The recipient of the grant receives R270 per month. If the caregiver and child continue to meet the necessary requirements, the child grant continues until the child turns 18 years old (The Republic of South Africa, 2011).

2.2.3 Women as vulnerable.

Feminists argue that gender based violence can be linked to the complexities of patriarchy and the multiple ways in which male domination is expressed and perpetuated. Morrell (2007) has researched the various ways in which the construction of masculinity has endorsed private and public displays of violence. His research focused particularly on the South African context as he explored ways in which South Africa's history of Apartheid and colonization were linked to gender based violence by men. Violence he argues, is not determined by "race", but rather the culmination of various historical, social, and psychological factors, which have constructed the radicalized and gendered face of violence (Morrell, 2007). "*Explanations of the link between violence and masculinity are varied but in a variety of contexts where men perceive their positions to be under threat, levels particularly of domestic violence, are much higher*" (Morrell, 2007, p. 18). Morrell further suggests that gender based violence by men is an attempt to secure a position of status, that which is

entrenched in the perceived social expectation of what it means to be a man. The expectation of status, which is achieved through economic stability and providing for one's family, can be linked back to Billington et al's, (1998) explanation of the male 'work script' which was discussed earlier.

The oppression of women through a patriarchal system binds them to men, socially, politically, and economically. In South Africa, the ambiguity around cultural norms and human rights is further obscured through actions and opinions of the president who "*is a traditionalist who has proclaimed his own cultural constructions in the public sphere as a polygamist*" (Gouws, 2010, p. 22). While women have equal constitutional rights with men in South Africa today, the socialized and scripted perceptions of women still in some cases remain entrenched, rendering them dependent on men (Mama, 1995). Furthermore, through the rhetoric of the ruling political party, the cultural discourses of polygamy has been normalized to "*perpetuate patriarchal practices and women's subordination, and delegitimisation of the universality of human rights embodied in the South African constitution*" (Gouws, 2010, p. 22). This conflict between constitutional protections and the effects of power in everyday experience makes acknowledging the hostile and unequal relationship that exists between men and women in patriarchal society especially in contexts of poverty, difficult. Herman (1992) highlights how the social role and positioning of women, endorsed through media, as fragile and dependent places them at particular risk for discrimination and gender based violence, trapped in constant vulnerability through their dependence on men, especially financial dependence. Patriarchy and gender based discrimination in the current capitalist structuring of society remains oppressive for many women in one form or another (Bealle, 2009).

The prevalence of gender-based crimes against women in South Africa is difficult to determine as many crimes go unreported by the victim for several reasons, such as "economic dependency on the abuser, fear of further punishment by the abuser, lack of confidence in the police and fear of being further victimized by the criminal justice system" (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010; 16). Furthermore, Lee (2004) highlights how women's economic and social dependence on men and limited bargaining power reduces their protection levels, increasing their vulnerability to "*high-risk relationships*" (Lee, 2004, p 4). The impact of HIV Aids infections in women has resulted "*in a significant decline in particular feminised professions, such as teachers*" (Piot, Bartos, Ghys, Walker & Schwartlandet; 2001, p. 971). Beyond fracturing the fabric of society, the impact of HIV Aids on the family structure can be devastating, as HIV significantly reduces life expectancy, and increases the number of orphaned children (Piot et al, 2001). Government distribution of free antiretroviral drugs has been a valuable factor in significantly increasing the life expectancy of HIV positive patients (Whiteside & Regondi, 2011). Despite this, South Africa currently has the largest number of HIV/AIDS infected citizens, a staggering "*5.6 million people*" (Whiteside & Regondi, 2011, p. 6). As HIV Aids infection rates increase amongst young adults, the rate of orphaned children rises, further pushing families and individuals into poverty, as research shows:

> In addition to affecting income, with lower earning capacity and productivity, AIDS generates greater medical, funeral and legal costs, and has long-term impact on the capacity of households to stay together. This is manifest in the cumulative number of children orphaned by AIDS, which now totals 13.2 million. (Piot, 2001, p. 971).

Orphaned children are more often than not, adopted by grandparents who, in their old age, become responsible for raising them and meeting their financial demands. Financial demands

include school fees, uniforms, food, and medicine in the event of illness. Elderly women responsible for the upbringing of children due to the death or abandonment of parents, is shown to be "*severely stressful and exhausting*", given their own frailty with old age (Situation and voices, 2002, p. 10). Furthermore, demographic shifts as a result of HIV AIDS mean that, "*in the worst affected countries, in 20 years time, the standard population pyramid will have turned upside down, with more adults in their 60s and 70s than those in their 40s and 50s*" (Piot et al, 2001, p. 971).

Further highlighting the vulnerability of women, Research conducted by Stats SA (1996), showed the Human Development Index (HDI), for South Africans. The HDI explores the life expectancy, adult literacy, and income levels of South Africans across the race, gender, and provincial lines. This research tracked the changes in HDI between 1980 and 1991 (The Republic of South Africa, 1996). Human Development Index has shown that the life expectancy rate for South Africa at 58 years of age, and in KwaZulu Natal the life expectancy rate is 59 years of age. Black people had the lowest GPP per capita, as well as the lowest life expectancy, which was 55 years of age (The Republic of South Africa, 1996). Significantly, higher life expectancy for those living in urban areas, comparable to those living in rural areas was evident. While there was no written account for the figures projected, hardship in life may be a contributing factor to lower life expectancy, as indicated by the rural- urban statistics, as people living in rural areas have less access to medical facilities and are thus more susceptible to dying from illness. Research into the leading causes of death among women in 1996 showed the most significant cause of death to be "*non-communicable diseases*" (Bradshaw, Schneider, Dorrington, Borne & Laubscher, 2001, p. 619).

2.2.4 Informal traders and vulnerability.

In line with the perceived gender scripts of women's employment, based on a 1997 survey, of the traders in Warwick Junction, 59, 3 % are women, with one in every two trading food items (Skinner, 2009). The average weekly profit of their trade is estimated to be less than R60 and yet 80 percent of the women reported being the sole breadwinners in their families (Skinner, 2009). This position places them not only under financial pressure, but renders them vulnerable to hostile gendered relationships, as they become the 'providers' for their families over the men. In 1998 a research report highlighted that the biggest obstacles for women trading in Durban were theft, criminal violence, police extortion and women's vulnerability to sexual assault (Lund, 1998). The vulnerability of women to sexual assault in South Africa is extremely high, with South Africa having one of the "*highest ratios of reported rape cases per 100, 000 in the population*" (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010, p. 18).

Women street traders have been shown to remain more often than not on a 'survivalist level' (Lee, 2004). This means these women are often working in harsh environments with reduced access to resources, and poor health and safety standards further exposing them to vulnerable and traumatic conditions. The culmination of these factors results in a higher percentage of ill health and susceptibility to diseases (Lee, 2004). Furthermore, women are physiologically more susceptible to HIV/AIDS than men, and research by Lee (2004) among Warwick Junction street traders identifies women street traders as a particularly vulnerable sector. His research highlighted that in Uganda, there is a 30% risk of women street traders working in urban sectors being infected compared to the national average of 5% (Lee, 2004). The economic impact of illness for traders in the informal economy is considerable. When traders are ill they are unable to attend to their stalls and thereby lose income. Illness is a direct

determinant of economic fragility and traders expose themselves to several customers during the day through interactions and thus place themselves at higher risk for contracting contagious diseases. Due to the stringent municipal laws governing trading permits, traders are unable to have a temporary assistant to manage their stalls during times of illness.

Within this continuously stressful context, Kaminer & Eagle (2010) notes that women exposed to trauma are more likely to develop post-traumatic stress disorder, an unstable and distressing psychological condition which results from exposure, directly or indirectly, to a traumatic event. Working in a capitalist and patriarchal society, the women of Warwick Junction face gender based challenges on a daily basis contributing to their already stressful environment and placing them at particular psychological risk (Killigan, 2004). The economic, political and social challenges regularly faced by women working in the informal sector, poses them more vulnerable to continuous experiences of trauma, either directly or indirectly, without adequate resources or time to psychologically recover from one trauma, before being confronted with the next, as Kaminer & Eagle (2010) explains:

> For many South Africans, the stress of living in conditions of continuous traumatisation is compounded by the chronic uncertainty and anxiety wrought by severe economic stress. It could therefore be argued that many South Africans do not have a 'post' trauma period, in which to process, or attempt to adapt to, their recent trauma experience, before their next traumatic experience (whether it is direct or indirect) occurs. (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010, p. 48).

The complex nature of continuously being exposed to traumatic events, without external stability between one trauma and another to allow for the re-establishment of internal

psychological stability, raises the question "*just because trauma is common, does this normalise it?*" (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010, p. 27) This questioning of the impact of being exposed to repeated trauma through contexts such as ongoing violence and poverty begins to provide interesting exploration into the notions of coping and resilience, and is particularly relevant when researching this vulnerable sector.

2.3 The Notion of Community

The term 'community' initially included people working or living in close relation to each other (Smith, 2001). However, over time the term extended to include various definitions of people within a specific geographical area, people living with a particular common interest or characteristic for example, occupation (Smith, 2001). These markers of community often overlap as individuals group themselves to more than one of the categories that define a community in this way, individuals may ascribe to several different communities simultaneously. This may be especially applicable to women in Warwick Junction, as their community comprises of not just their geographical location, but the similarity they share through their unique occupation as well.

Ife (2002) identifies how individuals in communities become responsible for their community. Community life fosters duties, roles, and obligations which different individuals in the community maintain. Communities are considered to foster a number of positive characteristics of bringing people together in a sense of solidarity, commitment to one another, mutuality or reciprocity and trust, (Smith, 2001; Ife, 2002). Communities are also important because they provide a social network from which support and resources, both material and social can be acquired. Social support is understood to include close

relationships with others such as family and friends, which provides a "*buffer or cushion*" for stress as well as decreasing stressful events (Coon & Mitterer, 2007, p. 522). A relevant example of organized social support is that of the 'stokvel'. Several women will group together and decide on a specific amount of money that they will each contribute to the 'stokvel' on a regular basis. In this way, women ensure they will receive a lump sum of money from these collective savings at one point during the year. 'Stokvels' are also created by family members or friends to accumulate money and then distribute the money to a 'stokvel' member during a time of crisis, for example, to cover the costs of a funeral. 'Stokvels' are common community based initiatives among South African communities.

Conventionally, women are seen to be more apt at creating, enhancing, and utilizing social support in stressful situations. Individuals with a strong sense of positive social support are understood to be more resilient and optimistic (Coon et al, 2007). The role of social support is especially valuable in the aftermath of a traumatic experience. Engaging with a positive and secure support system is the first step towards rebuilding a traumatized individual's sense of self and reforming trust with society after interpersonal relationships have been damaged through the traumatic experience (Herman, 1992). As Herman (1992) explains the role of communities in relation to trauma, "*The response of the community has a powerful influence on the ultimate resolution of the trauma*" (Herman, 1922, p. 70).

A significant positive feature of communities, is the link between an individual's affiliation with a community, their sense of belonging, and how this often becomes part of their individual identity or self concept (Smith, 2001; Brentro, Brokenleg & Van Bockern, 1990; Ife, 2002). Communities therefore, are constructed on the paradoxical paradigm of similarity and difference. Members of a community affiliate themselves with a community based on

similarity of geography or common interest or occupation, while distinguishing how they are different from others due to the same factors of geography, common interest and so on. This makes the definition of community difficult to contain as there are varying boundaries on how each individual may decide to include or exclude their affiliation with a particular community (Smith, 2001). However, communities can also have negative features, such as the overly protective community who 'take the laws into their on hands' in attempts to protect others. The divide between community inclusion and exclusion is another point of potential conflict, as exclusion or inclusion can result in prejudices.

Furthermore, Branaman (2001) highlights how a social psychological stance focuses on the interaction and interrelationship between the individual and the social world, in which we engage and how both the individual and society mould one other. Exploring agency from this perspective, provides a more dynamic interwoven relationship between self and society, allowing one to think about the ways in which social positioning through class, gender and occupation may influence individuals' everyday experiences. Interaction with others in the wider society shapes individuals' own sense of self and enables them to construct a contextual sense of reality through their own experiences (Branaman, 2001). This is relevant for this research, as the women of Warwick are located within a position of poverty and marginalization within the wider Durban society; yet within the Warwick Junction itself, they may hold very different social positions, which may or may not give them greater sense of agency in their immediate environment.

2.3.1 Conceptualizing community: Warwick Junction.

Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory (1979) offers one way of conceptualizing different communities and their role in the individual's life through highlighting how each

person exists within wider frameworks of interaction, some of which are of close proximity and others less so (Killgan, 2004). The framework established by the micro system, mesosystem, exosystem, and microsystem provide a platform to conceptualizing the influence of communities on individual lives, as well as the impact of individual lives on communities (Urie Bronfenbrenner, 2008). When considering the women in Warwick Junction and their contextual space and personal development one can conceptualize resilience according to this framework. Linked by common trade and geographical location, among other factors, each individual trader exists within a micro context of her individual market, but also forms part of a macro community as an informal trader in Warwick Junction. Just as one can differentiate between the individual markets and Warwick as a structural whole, one can differentiate between individual traders and their participation in micro and macro spaces. These levels are constantly interlinked, molding and influencing one another. It is this interconnectivity of the structural and human 'ecosystem' that makes Warwick Junction significant and unique, and warrants an inquiry into the lives of the traders to explore the ways in which their identity and agency is moulded by the social and occupational physical space in which they live and interact.

The microsystem constitutes the daily interactions the women have with one another and their customers in their specific environment. The mesosytem includes their interactions in the wider Warwick Junction community and other informal traders. The exosystem constitutes the role of the NPOs and trader committees in the area, as well as the traders' accessibility and levels of interaction with these 'external' factors. The macrosystem would include National supportive structures such as the social grant scheme and the eThekwini Municipality's approach towards the Warwick Junction traders and their environment as well as the City's attitude towards the informal economy in general.

While the theory is helpful in providing insight into the intrinsic links between the individual and their environment, and allows for a framework of understanding how the individual utilizes their environment, it does not provide clarity on how the wider layers of influence could directly affect the individual. The theory suggests that macro systemic influences "*filter through" the meso and micro systems thereby affecting the individual's life*" (Trudge, Hogan & Gray, 1997, p. 89). However, given the South African context of Apartheid legislation, it is evident that macro influences such as legislation governing individual liberty and mobility had a direct impact on the individual. Furthermore, the very systematic and segmented nature of this approach constrains certain interactions to only occurring within specific layers, and does not account for how, the various layers may be intertwined and held together at the individual of experience and identity. However, because of its very definitive nature as to what constitutes each layer of interaction the theory does provide a useful framework for understanding and dissecting, the social supports and constraints experienced by the women who participated in this study experience within their environments.

CHAPTER 3 - Methodology

3.1 The Narrative Approach

The project adopted a narrative approach. Narratives can be understood to be individualized accounts of human experience; however while the focus is on understanding life events and experiences through a personalized lens, this is linked to the symbolism and undercurrents of cultural influence and social positioning. "*Narratives are the means of human sense making*" (Squire, Andrews & Tamboukou 2008 p 43). Narratives have also been suggested as ways "*of expressing and building personal identity and agency"* (Squire et al, 2008, p 8). Using this approach, the research was dependent on what the participant was willing to share and how she chose to narrate her life story. As with all recollections, the individual is able to reflectively select specific events or experiences over others. Participants had the potential to construe intentionally, or through faulty memory, the events of their lives, and project themselves in whichever role or manner they chose. However, this is not necessarily a limitation of this approach. As Squire (2008, p. 50) highlights, "*there are multiple valid interpretations, multiple narrative truths*". The focus of this research was to gain a deeper understanding of these women's stories, what they considered to be important, the way that they found and made meaning in their lives within the context in which they find themselves.

3.1.1 The human capacity for storytelling.

If psychology is the study of human lives, then it has been suggested that narrative is the "root metaphor" (Sarbin, 1986) for psychology. Human life is seen to be inherently narrative in structure and people spontaneously seek out narrative principles as ways of conceptualizing themselves and the world around them (Sarbin, 1986). Sarbin (1986) draws on experiments conducted by Michotte (1946 /1963) to highlight how humans are narrative

seeking. When participants in the research were shown two geometrical shapes that moved, the participants immediately began to 'tell the story' of the shapes making sense of the imagery through narrative principles, in attempts to impose meaning on the "*meaningless*" (Sarbin, 1986, p. 13). "*When there are no firm connections between empirical events, the individual organizes them into an imaginative formulation…of coherence*" (Sarbin, 1986, p. 12).

Narratives are also inherently social as they require a both a narrator and an audience. Individuals are constantly engaging in social interactions in which they simultaneously play the role of storyteller and the audience. Fay (1996) highlights the important role of "others" in authenticating ourselves by stating, "*you need others to recognize you as a person to insure yourself that you are a person*" (p. 43). In telling stories the narrator uses culturally symbolic tools to add meaning to their own story, and allow their story to be understood coherently by the audience.

3.1.2 The temporal nature of stories.

The narrative approach lends itself to not only understanding the ways in which individuals are inherently social, but also to the ways in which people construct their life stories around events in relation to time; past events, current events and future events. Understanding the relationship between time and narratives is essential because as humans we are "*radically temporal*" (Polkinghorne, 1988, p. 129). Time exists in 3 dimensions, the past, the present and the future. This conceptualisation allows one to think of time in a linear and progressive way. However, this is not always the case, for example when an individual reflects with regret or nostalgia on an event, that event is drawn from the past into the present (Polkinghorne, 1988). In attempting to understand the connectedness between human

narrative and time, Polkinghorne (1988) draws on Heidegger's explanation of time. He suggests time can be understood through three levels of understanding. First, a surface level of understanding in which time can be reckoned with on a daily basis as a linear organizing tool for activities. Second, time remains linear but expands beyond a mere organizing tool, to an awareness of the self existing within time on a wider platform in the sense that there is a definite past, present and future in which we as individuals are placed, with the capacity to recall and recollect past experiences. Third, Heidegger suggests time is a finite understanding of our positions as individuals in the universal constructs of time recognising that time will continue after we have passed on, and in this way, our past present and future, is collectively represented as one existence (Polkinghorne, 1988).

In both accounts, the temporal projection of time is evident, as an individual's story of experiences and perceptions of time oscillate between past present and future. As individuals, we construct stories with this framework, as stories usually incorporate a beginning, middle and end. The advantage of recollection is that the end of the story is already known. In this way, the event or experience recollected is able to be drawn out of the past and into the present, and in this way, can be relived by the narrator (Polkinghorne, 1988). The disadvantage is that some people remain trapped in time. Dwelling continuously on a negative past experience that results in unhappiness in the present. This is usually strongly associated with emotions of regret or despair over a past incident, while the incident can be drawn into the present, the outcome of that incident cannot, and so the individual remains unhappy, remaining steadfast in past experiences and unable to conceive the progression of time, or the hope of a future (Crites, 1986). This is particularly relevant for this research as the women tell their life stories of past and present experiences, and draw on their hopes for their future and in doing so enhance their individual resilience. As Crites (1986) highlights

"*psychic strength includes both a strong sense of self identity, rooted in the past, and an equally strong power of self-transcendence, directed towards the future*" (p.171).

3.1.3 The experience centred framework.

Within the narrative approach, there are several frameworks for exploring and researching narratives. This study used an "*experience centred narrative framework*" (Squire, 2008). This approach aims at gaining a full understanding of the story told, interpreted flexibly through analysis of recurrent themes as opposed to a structural understanding of a single event within the narrative. It assumes that narratives are sequential, meaningful, reconstituting past experience as well as expressing past experience and had the potential to display transformation or illustrate change (Squire, 2008).

The benefit of adopting the experience based narrative approach is that it lends itself to exploring topics that are difficult to define and allows the opportunity to capture the 'personalized' story of a particular individual in a specific context. Hence, it offers an understanding of both the physical space historically, and the individual lives of politically marginalized, poor women. Due to the potentially sensitive nature of this research topic, this study used the experience centred approach because of its qualitative participatory stance. "*If you place the story within the person, you may simply ask for 'their story', intervening as little as possible*" (Squire, 2008, p.48).

Furthermore, this framework allowed the interviewing process to be controlled predominantly by the participant. This is especially useful in researching places and people who in various ways are marginalized. A framework that allows for the participant to be 'in control' of the channel of inquiry created a less intrusive, ethical atmosphere.

3.2 Profile of participants

Ten woman traders were selected based on accessibility and location within the Warwick Junction vicinity. The 10 participants were selected from different markets located within the Warwick Junction vicinity. The sample selected varied in age in order to get a sense of how participation in Warwick Junction as a trader may have shifted over time with changes in the City and wider society. All participants were African and Indian South African women. Table 1 provides an indication of the 10 women's ages, "race" and the duration they have worked in this market space. It also gives an indication of the marital status of the participants and the areas in which they live.

Table 1 /…

Table 1: Profile of the participants[2]

Name	Age	"Race"	Market	Years in the market	Marital status	Home residence	Class indicator
Shireen	66	Indian	Victoria Street Market	38	Widowed	Umhlanga	Suburb
Gugu	64	African	Bead	43	Widowed	Verulam	Peri/urban/rural
Thabisile	62	African	EMM- Poultry	29	Widowed	uMlazi	Township
Maria	59	African	Traditional Herb / Muthi	30	Unknown	Jozini	Rural
Frances	53	African	Bovine Head	35	Widowed	Emagusheni (EC)	Rural
Hlengiwe	49	African	Mielies	29	Widowed	iNanda	Township
Pravina	48	Indian	Early Morning Market	21	Yes	Phoenix	Township
Busisiwe	35	African	Herb	11	Engaged	Pietermaritzburg	Township
Jabu	35	African	Lime	12	No	eNdwedwe	Peri/urban/rural
Zama	30	African	Imphepo	10	Unknown	uMlazi	Township

The use of geographical residential markers as class indicators whilst problematic, are a means of highlighting a general understanding of the social status of each sector. However, individuals within each subsection may hold seemingly contradictory social class status despite residing within these indicated locations.

3.2.1 Participant timelines

The individual participant timelines highlight the life span of each of the 10 participants. The women ranged between the ages of 30 and 66 years old. Their life spans have been composed alongside a timeline of major events that have occurred in Warwick Junction to allow an indication of what they may or may not have been exposed to during their time as traders in this space. The events listed in the timeline give a good indication of the challenges African

[2] The names of the participants presented in the table are pseudonyms.

and Indian South Africans faced in relation to the segregated and racist apartheid legislation. Furthermore, it provides an indication of the development that has occurred in Warwick Junction over the past few decades that was directly related to their workspace. The timelines allow for a contextual understanding of all the participants collectively, as their relative ages expose them to very different life experiences.

Table 2 Participant timeline

South Africa / Warwick Junction	Zama	Jabu	Busi	Pravina	Hlengiwe	Frances	Maria	Thembi	Gugu	Shireen
1860 Indentured Labouers										
1890										
1945										
1950 Group Areas Act										
1952 Pass laws										
1960										
1965										
1973 Buisness Hours Ordinance										
1976 Soweto Uprising										
1990 Nelson Mandela released										
ANC vs. IFP conflict										
1991 Buisness Act 71										
1994 First Democratic election										
Nokumbuwana mural										
1995 ITMB formed										
Urban Renewal Project										
1996 TAC formed										
1997 Warwick community										
centre built										
EMM renovated										
Brook St Market designed										
1998 Herb market designed										
1999 Melie Market										
2001 Informal Economic Policy										
adopted by eThekwini										
2003 Bovine Market designed										
2007 City changes permit laws										
2008 NPO AeT established										
Global Economic Recession										
2009 Warwick Junction Mall										
2010 Fifa World Cup										
2011 Warwick Mall Devp aborted										

3.3 Data collection

The data collection followed a narrative approach using the experience centred framework (Squire, 2008), which allowed for the process of data collection to be largely controlled by the participant. Using free association narrative interviews based on a self-interpretive question allowed the participants to speak freely on topics they felt were significant to their life story. It also prevented the interviewer from posing intrusive questions, which may have breeched ethical boundaries. This approach gave the participant control to direct the discussion around topics they felt comfortable with discussing. Access to the participants was gained through the assistance of an NPO familiar to Warwick Junction and the informal traders. The good level of rapport between the researcher and the NPO, as well as the NPO and the network of informal traders ensured participant accessibility.

The participants were asked to sign a consent form (see appendix 2) before participating in the study. The consent form gave permission for their self-narratives to be recorded and potentially published. Anonymity was ensured to all participants with the use of pseudonyms in the final report. The consent form was in English and isiZulu. Willing participants then scheduled an interview at a venue close to the Asiye eTafuleni offices, in a quiet secure room. The NPO is based in Warwick Junction, Durban. This site was chosen for its familiarity, security, and practical convenience for the participants who were taking time away from trading to participate in the research. In some cases, participants were unable to leave their stalls. In these cases, interviews were conducted in the market where they were trading.

The advantage of this was that the interviews went ahead as schedualed. However the disadvantage is that the sound quality of the interview was poor, given the noise in the market space. Furthermore, the interviews were often temporarily disrupted to allow for the trader to

attend to customers who approached her stall. There were two interviews held with each participant. The initial interview was centred on a single free association narrative question. The researcher and translator interacted with the participant through active listening, in which non-verbal responses were given at appropriate times (Squire et al, 2008). The follow up interview, which followed relatively soon after the initial interview, was semi-structured and based around specific topics raised by the participant in the initial interview (see appendix 1). Refreshments were provided for the participants during the interviews.

When the primary language of the participant was English, I facilitated the interviews. However, when isiZulu needed to be spoken, adequately trained translators, Lindiwe Mdadane and Phelo Muyanga conducted the interviews. All interviews were audio-recorded and short notes were taken throughout the interviewing process. The interviews were then transcribed and where necessary translated into English. Sie Thobela conducted the translation of the transcripts. Five of the interviews were back translated from isiZulu to English by a third party, to ensure the translation process was carried out accurately. Any discrepancies between the transcripts were then discussed with the translator to ensure the most accurate portrayal of the women's narratives was used.

3.4 Data analysis

Although a narrative framework was used to collect the data, the data were analysed using Thematic Analysis. This approach was selected because in the analysis there was a specific attempt to gather social and cultural collective experiences that were frequently raised by all the women through their narratives, in an attempt to grasp a fuller understanding of the collective aspects of their lives (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). Analysing the data in this way allowed for a conceptual understanding on the issues that affected the women as a group, and

therefore gave insight into common features, experiences and challenges in all the women's lives in this particular context. Thematic analysis is a widely used form of qualitative analysis as it allows for flexibility and a deep understanding of the content of the data through identification, analysis and reporting of different themes. The analysis followed a systematic process in which themes in each transcript were identified and labelled (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). Both sets of interviews from each woman were used in the thematic analysis, as the women's narrative experiences were explained throughout both their interviews. Recurring themes across all the transcripts, from both interviews, were identified for each participant. This process was carried out for each participant. A list of all the themes that emerged from the 20 interviews was then comprised. The most recurring themes within this list were then highlighted. Where possible smaller subthemes were merged with larger overarching themes. The five most frequently discussed themes were selected as the dominant themes for analysis in the report (Braun & Clarke, 2006). In this way, the data were collected through a narrative process so that the women were able to discuss their life stories and individual experiences, while the analysis was thematic as specific common experiences discussed by several of the women were identified and analysed.

3.5 Ethical considerations

Through working with the well-respected NPO in the area, the research could be constantly regulated through advised cultural norms. Being familiar with the customs and cultural practices of the informal traders in Warwick Junction, as well as the background from which many of the participants have emerged, the NPO was trusted to act as an ethical yardstick to ensure the research did not breech ethical boundaries. However, the nature of this topic is personal and reflexive and given the socio-economic and political marginalization of the participants, the retelling of their stories included recalling of traumatic experiences during

the course of the interviews. The lives of the participants were intricate and entrenched in a harsh environment, which increased the potential of emotionally disruptive recollection. When this occurred, the women were encouraged by the researcher to seek psychological support from a free clinic located at a University, which was in close proximity to the market.

The traders all gave voluntary consent through written permission before engaging in this research. Confidentiality was explained in the letter of consent. While the traders independently chose to participate in the research process, they were required to spend time away from their stalls to partake in the interview. This removal of the participant from their trading stalls risked of the participant incurring temporary economic loss should they have been unable to have somebody operating their stall in their absence and therefore remained an ethical consideration. In cases where the trader was unable to leave her stall, the interview was conducted in the market space at her stall.

3.6 Limitations of this study

The primary limitation of this study was the researcher's inability to speak isiZulu. This was the predominant language of the sample of participants and the inability to communicate efficiently in it rendered the researcher ineffectual during specific interviews. While a translator was used, the research was still compromised because direct access to the content of the interview was very limited as every break used to update the researcher resulted in a halting of the flow of the interview. This meant that the researcher only understood at a later point the meaning and content of the interviews. This limitation was particularly hindering in the follow up interviews in which the interviewer played a more prominent role in probing specific topics aligned to the research. Furthermore, language may have lost its meaning

through the translation process in which the unconscious subjectivity of the translator may lead to discrepancies between what was said and what was understood to be said.

In an attempt to overcome the limitation of the language barrier, the translator was well briefed on the background, aims and context of the study as well as her role in the interview to ensure she had a full understanding of the proposed outcomes of the interviews and research as a whole. The back translation provided a level of accountability with regard to translators inferring their own degree of subjective interpretation on the research material.

Chapter 4 – Thematic Analysis

4.1 Introduction

There were two strands constantly woven through these women's self-narratives: poverty and coping with poverty. The women who participated in this study highlighted the constant challenges of poverty, being perceived as a 'poor' woman by society and struggling to make a daily living. This theme was however accompanied by their individual and communal coping mechanisms employed to overcome the struggle of poverty. The constant struggle between poverty and coping is echoed in the thematic analysis, as these two factors, are the foundation of the women's lives. The thematic analysis revealed five dominant themes that occurred frequently and in depth across all 10 participants' interviews. The themes reflected the *Economic challenges* that the women in Warwick contend with on a daily basis, as well as those that have shaped the communal history of the market and their individual lives. *Politics, police and permits* highlighted the women's interaction with and vulnerability in relation to the local authorities. The theme of *Work* looks specifically at the nuances associated with selected traders' occupations for a better understanding into their activities on a daily basis. The theme of *Being a woman* focuses on experiences closely related to gender and what these mean for these individuals in this context and the many roles that these women play in society as traders, mothers, wives, and leaders are explored. The final theme highlights the *Support* systems that the participants draw upon as coping mechanisms during adversity, as communities of cohesion in a wider context of marginalization.

4.2. Economic challenges

4.2.1 The context of poverty.

All the women, with one exception, who participated in this study, raised the issue of poverty. Poverty was the dominant common thread woven into each participant's narrative and a theme that linked all the participants together as a whole. Research highlights the definite linkages between the informal sector and poverty, as the average income of people working in informal spaces is way below that of individuals employed in the formal sector, furthermore women in the informal sector earning significantly less income than men (Chen et al, 2001).

It was established that participants only made enough income to cover their basic needs, and on regular occasions, fell short of 'making ends meet'. Research from Lund's (1998) study showed that women were estimated to have significantly lower income in comparison to men in the informal sector. A question posed to many participants was "what did they spend their income on if they have any "left over". Women commented that there was very seldom any income remaining after paying rent, debts and meeting the family and dependants' needs, as these three extracts show:

> *Honestly, I bank it then buy food and pay accounts. (Busisiwe, I2, L122).*

> *I feed my children, go to church and buy food. (Thabisile, I2, L181).*

> *I would say there is no money that is surplus, there is none. (Jabu, I2, L158).*

However, not all participants felt economically disadvantaged or poverty stricken. When asked what they spend their income on, two participants commented in complete contrast to the above by stating:

> *Well, I love my garden, I spend a lot on my garden, I love my home, I love entertaining as well. I mean I get my family or my friends or my neighbour, whenever they come they always enjoy to sit with me and have some snacks and have something to chat about. (Shireen, I2, L340-343).*

> *Well I love shopping, and I (ehh) shop quite a lot…yes clothes and shoes and jewellery. (Pravina, I2, L229-230).*

Both of these participants were Indian stall owners within the market. Being a stall owner is a contributing factor to greater economic freedom. In both cases, the participants had their stalls passed down to them through generations, thus they were well established when the participants took over. This intergenerational component to trading in Warwick in the context of the hierarchical nature of the Apartheid structure delivers very different financial and social histories that impact on the status of women today, with considerable business advantages being experienced by Indian women (Vahed, 1999).

4.2.2. The roots of poverty.

All of the participants grew up in homes where the predominant breadwinners were economically disadvantaged against due to the discriminatory Apartheid system. Thus despite employment, financial and economic growth was seldom achieved due to the inability of "*upward job mobility*", thus families remained in conditions of poverty (Chen et al, 2001, p.

15; Lund, 1998). All the women, except one, discussed growing up in homes where they were always left wanting, in conditions that were "*harsh*" even in the home. Research has shown that 95% of child labour occurs within the home (Andvig, 2001, p. 3).

> *I am not sure but we had nothing to eat and we were still very (poor) we didn't see anything. Sometimes if we are coming from school and there was no food, my grandmother used to take the pot on the fire we would then go and play outside hoping that if we come back we are going to eat but she will give us boiling water, we were very poor. (Hlengiwe, I2, L479-482).*

Hlengiwe highlights how poverty was closely associated with her childhood. Her extract explained how her childhood days, like many others, was spent assisting her parents with chores around the home or taking part in activities that could generate income. The notion of a free afternoon to 'play' after school was seldom a reality growing up in poverty-stricken conditions, as Thabisile recalls:

> *It was nice but the struggles where we would walk to school starving and when you come back parents tell you there are the fields they needed to be ploughed…We were really struggling when we were younger. We grew up under hard conditions. (Thabisile, I2, L74- 75).*

Most members of the family felt this personal sacrifice, as within households, children and parents worked together to generate enough income to survive. In this way, the family as a unit can be seen as a tool of support and a financial coping mechanism, as they combined efforts to make ends meet as Jabu highlights:

My brother left school in grade 9, because he saw that we were suffering and my father had left us to work. He was helping my mother with what she was trying to feed us. (Jabu, I2, L106- 108).

The family as a unit for combined economic survival highlights a reversal of the parent child pattern known as the 'normalized' parent child relationship, in which the parent provides for the child's needs (Burman, 1994). However, in poverty-stricken homes, the reversal of that pattern seems more frequent, resulting in the child supporting the parents earlier in the child's development, as Gugu reflects:

I then started taking temporal jobs from people, we raise... we were able to provide for our parent, like our mother. Our father would sometimes not bring the money home. So, I then realized that these temporal jobs that I'm taking and get 20 cents from are not really helping much. I then learnt how to sell meat, I started selling, took temporal jobs from people, selling and got that little money. I then decided to leave this and do the work with my hands of beading; I was able to do the bead work and provided for my family. I ended up getting my other sister into this bead work and we were able to look after our parent just by using our hands only. (Gugu, I1, L10-13).

For many women, it was a poverty stricken home and lack of alternative employment or skills, which governed their paths towards where they trade today. As research conducted by Fadane (1998) in Lund's (1998) report showed the systematic links between poverty and informal trading, "*The women in Warwick Avenue come to Durban from rural areas because*

of rural poverty and unemployment. South Africa's high rate of landlessness among rural people is a very strong push factor towards seeking employment in urban area" (p. 29).

For many respondents, informal trading is a means to an end, with the end being economic survival. As Zama explained, it was not through choice that she began trading in her market, but rather through desperation as the need to support her family financially arose:

> *My mother then thought of coming to Durban to sell imphepo so that she can be able to feed and educate us; she did that in 1998. In 1999 when I was doing standard nine at school, I realised that things were getting worse financially at home. I thought that I needed to do something because my mother could no longer afford to educate and feed all six of us at home with the money she earns from selling imphepo. I then decided to come and join my mother here in selling imphepo so that both of us can work to look after my younger siblings. I came and started to sell imphepo even though it was very hard for me since I was very young and not supposed to be doing that type of a job then…. I have encountered a number of difficulties because out here things are very tough. It was never my wish to work in an environment like this but I came to work on the streets like this because I problems that were beyond my power. (Zama, I1, L21- 32).*

Lund (1998) highlighted that traders entered the informal sector due to a lack of skills and capacity to be employed elsewhere, and many participants echoed this in their own narratives, as expressed below:

After I finished school I tried looking for a job but nothing was available, only this job was an option. Eeh (pause) that means there were problems because this job requires a lot of strength so I was working and then I stayed at home for some time to rest. When I ran out of money I came back to work, then go back home again. (Jabu, I1, L19- 24).

Before I got married I started to sell on the trains due to the poverty at home. (Thabisile, I1 L5- 6).

I ended up arriving here at the market because I realised that the situation in the family was not right, and in the family; this was how I came to be selling the Zulu medicines. (Busisiwe, I1, L9-10).

The unemployment of the main breadwinner in their childhood homes was a common element that featured throughout the women's narratives. It was more often this family dynamic, which triggered the individual's abandonment of their own pursuits, such as schooling, to alleviate the economic burden at home (Saadhna & Arends, 2008). Furthermore, the inability to provide the basic requirements of the individual's educational needs regretfully resulted in a demise of their education. Jabu explains this in her own words:

*Mmm, I would say, I remember when we were very struggling at home, I was doing standard 7. I didn't have school shoes and I made a decision that I was dropping out the school. Because I didn't have shoes, my father was staying here in Durban. When we went to him asking for the money he said he did not have money because he paid out his debts. (*Jabu, I2, L12- 15).

In this study several women had received some education, however, only two women received High School education. The low degree to which these women were educated is a reflection of the gendered prejudice often associated with poverty as well as an illustration of the lack of educated women in the informal economy at large (Lund, 1998). The extracts below highlight the difficulties with continuing schooling in the context of poverty:

> *No, I mean when I'm coming from school we ate phuthu, the greens, then go out to play. The way we were struggling, my mother was trying to educate us in hard conditions, my father was working but he was earning a little. (Thabisile, I2, L60-62).*

> *My parents were poor so I couldn't continue with school but I can write my name you can't argue with me about my school name (laughter). (Gugu, I2, L42- 43).*

> *I grew up there, went to school there from the lower classes until I reached Standard 10. Due to the financial difficulties with my parents, I wasn't able to study further*. (Busisiwe, I1 L6- 8).

> *I stayed there until I completed my matric. I did not pass matric there because of other problems and the distance to school was long. I couldn't go back to school.* (Jabu, I1, L15- 18).

Although not all the women received school education, three women referred to informal education associated with their trade. In particular, Gugu reflects on her ability to work with her hands to earn an income. A skill she both taught herself and others:

> *We were struggling and that means I did not get to be educated well but God gave me the gift to work with my hands.* (Gugu, I1, L6- 7).

Despite their limited educational background, several women spoke of the value and importance of education, especially in the context of raising their children, which will be discussed in depth at a later point.

4.2.3 The politics of poverty.

> *We have been izinkehli* (girl who is married they wore traditional attire with a cap). *We used wear traditional attire for young girls. Those were the good days but looking at us now, in the poverty environment we are in, one wouldn't know all that. (Maria, I1, L43- 47).*

A sense of nostalgia was frequently conveyed, as the women spoke of better days in the past. What was interesting is the manner in which the women conceptualized Apartheid and-post Apartheid in relation to poverty. Many of the participants felt that they had been tricked into believing in the demise of Apartheid economic freedom that would extend beyond political emancipation to economic freedom. The contrasting reality has left a sour taste in the mouths of poverty bound traders. There exists a deep level of resentment towards politicians, whose promises seem enticing but then fail to deliver to the people. Furthermore, many participants

were not blind to the levels of corruption that exist within government spheres, and claim that the politicians who were once poor as they were are now wealthy and in the process have forgotten the plight of the poor. Using a powerful metaphor, Frances explains the degree to which politicians have deceived the poor after extracting from them the votes that keep politicians in affluence:

> *Have you ever heard that if you are in other person's house. They say you can now go because they are eating now. They are doing that to us as poor people. As we are still poor we do give them the vote then they move to another step of life. But if they are about to eat they say you can stay right there. These politicians are doing that to us. If they are still struggling for their positions, even those who want to be counsellors they would come day and night looking for votes, if we have given him votes then he would say you can go out now because I am now eating. (Frances, I1 L443- 448).*

This is a powerful insight into the plight of the informal sector in relation to political rhetoric and promises to which they have been subjected. Frances's sentiment was echoed by Karumbidza's (2011) research, "*Traders feel that City officials employ sympathy with the plight of the poor as political rhetoric, but do not help the poor to improve their livelihoods*" (p. 15). As African and Indian women, participants expressed frustration with continuous dismissal by overarching socio-political structures. Participants conveyed a new level of disappointment, as even with Democracy, they remain ignored, not because of 'race', but because of their socio-economic status.

As the women told the stories of their lives, so the element of poverty clung to their narrative like a shadow, which despite time and democracy, could not and will not be shaken. The

recurring theme of poverty is one that will be reiterated through this report as it was like an infection that infiltrates every organ in the body. Poverty has struck into every aspect of their lives, from childhood to old age. This extract, although long, captures that sense of overwhelming loss in the face of poverty, and shows how with the start of the next generation, the harsh cycle begins anew:

> *I have suffered so much, even now...hey, I've come to realize that this is all there is to it; because when there isn't even a cent that you expect to receive and when you run out of salt you can't even say that at least so and so is coming on Saturday or at such and such date at the end of the month so and so is coming. Right now if this salt is finished and this rice is finished, what are you supposed to do? If you don't wake up early, what are you supposed to do? ...So you see life is just so difficult and there is nothing that is good, shame! It is just too difficult, (sniffles) it is difficult. The police here, on the other hand, are finishing up with me, it is difficult, shame. It really is difficult; I could talk about it until the sun goes down. The children, on the other hand keep on saying, "Gogo we're hungry, Gogo we want bread." You try to think about where can you get this bread from and then you realise that there is nothing else to do but to come back and try something with these mielies. Even these mielies now very expensive; it cost you R42 per dozen and then the police take it away and that's it.* (Hlengiwe, I1, L147-161).

Hlengiwe's extract emphasizes her daily struggle for survival in the informal sector and the constant demand placed on her to provide for herself and her grandchildren. Her extract highlights the psychological trauma associated with a woman situated in an overwhelming context of poverty. She continued to express her financial hardship by saying,

> *Now I don't know what I'm working for, I come here in Durban because I don't have anybody else to provide for me, there isn't even a cent that I get without having to take a transport from home to came and try here with these mielies.. (Hlengiwe, I1, L31-34).*

> *Success means I have money reserved for other things so that I can be able to do other things but now I don't see that. I'm not going forward because I work for food. (Gugu, I2, L72-73).*

As Hlengiwe and Gugu explained, the ways in which the women discussed poverty seemed to extend beyond that of just financial deprivation. It was part of a life history of constant difficulty where surviving on a daily basis was the norm. It was usually within the first few sentences that the participants stated their economic status, as if it was a defining aspect of their identity as highlighted by Gugu's introduction in her first interview:

> *So, I am Mam'Gugu and I grew up in the area of Maphephethweni, in a school...near Myeka School. So, I was born by my parents who had their own problems of being poor and struggling in life. (Gugu, I1, L4-6).*

Poverty was more often than not, the lens through which these women viewed the world and their position in it. When asked what the most important thing to her was, one participant simply answered "*money*" (Busisiwe, I2, L338). Money feeds children, builds homes, educates a household, and even validates relationships. Traditional rites and ceremonies that confirm marriages and welcome new family members are all an important part of one's

culture and identity. To be too financially incapacitated to host these occasions impacts on the individual's sense of self in a very personal and significant way, as Gugu explains:

> *In the household that I got married to Kwanda, I did get married even though I have not yet done the traditional rites of passage of ukwaba (wedding ceremony is regarded as a complete only after the bride has done this rite of passage of ukwaba which is gift giving to the groom's direct family lineage). Yes, therefore in this household that I got married to there are still a lot of things which I must still fulfil. It is difficult because when the job is not going well you cannot fulfil things according to your wishes. (Gugu, I1, L50-53).*

4.2.4 Crime and the contradiction of communal protection.

The women working in Warwick Junction reported that they generally felt safe within their working environments. The two markets that have visible and active security guards are the Victoria Street Market and the Early Morning Market. In both these markets, traders reported feeling significantly safer than in Warwick as a whole. In other markets, traders felt safe during working hours, but closing down hours and at night, they felt insecure in this vicinity, as these two extracts highlight:

> *During the day it is safe but at night I can't say the same. (Thabisile, I2, L143).*

> *I have my stall close to the gate and I don't know which day I'm gonna get somebody just coming with a gun and pointing it at me cause its so dark I cant even see anything, [pause] so those are some of my fears. Also being robbed you know, we've*

got a lot of thugs that's roaming the area at the moment, pause so those are some of my fears. (Pravina, I2; L146- 150).

Most participants referred with a resigned attitude to the threat of occasional petty theft, which was more often because of people not paying accurate prices for goods before fleeing the market space. Crime in the workspace was not a major social challenge for the respondents. It was apparent that the greater risk was walking through the markets and being a victim of 'pick-pocketing', however, traders reported that community protection was a significant factor in their feeling secure during working hours. The community serves one another through constant policing within their own market as each trader looks after the needs of her neighbour. Women do not rely on the protection of formal policing, but rather on the sense of unity, cohesion and common interest to preserve safety within the workspace, thereby relying on their own market structures to act collectively if the need arises. The community-based protection is a feature contributing towards resilience of the trading community as a whole, as individual street traders seek to protect those who 'belong' to their trading community (Smith, 2001) as these two participants highlight:

We just thought that they would pickpocket us because they would not rape us as there are plenty of people here and there are things that we can use to beat them. There are planks that we can use. (Jabu, I2, L114- 116).

Ehh I do feel secure I guess because I know the people around me, I've been interactive with them for quite some time, so in terms of safeness I don't have a problem in regards to that. And ehh, I guess I'm saying this because I, I know the people around me [pause] and that makes me feel safer. (Pravina, I2, L135- 138).

The reduced levels of anxiety mentioned by the women while discussing challenges associated with crime in their workspace can be seen to be a positive shift in perceptions of working in the informal sector, in particular, within the trading community of Warwick which was notorious as a crime hot-spot. The women in this study viewed the communal protection offered by those of the trading community to one another, positively. The protective role of the working community will be further discussed at a later point, under 'support'.

Several researchers have highlighted rape and sexual violence as a significant challenge for women working in informal or impoverished spaces (Herman, 1992; Lund 1998; Lee, 2004). In this research, no participant mentioned any form of current sexual abuse or harassment in her existing workspace. However, some women did discuss past experiences of sexual violence, which occurred in Warwick Junction several years ago, as well as sexual violence, which occurred in contexts other than Warwick Junction, for example, their home communities. Sexual violence was reported in two cases. One incident was associated with reflections of the trader's previous workspace within Warwick, while the other violent event took place in the trader's community at home and involved her daughter. In the former, the participant recalled memories of trading in a former location within the Warwick precinct, before being relocation to her current market, "*I remember by the time we were working at the top side of the road we were not working inside here. Criminals were abusing us a lot we didn't have a place to sleep"* (Jabu, I2, L218). In this particular incident, the participant refers to the lack of housing or accommodation for traders who work in the inner city. Several women's narratives repeated the lack of urban housing as a common concern. Several

of the participants have homes far removed from the inner city; forcing them to find alternative temporary accommodation during the week while they trade as Busisiwe explains:

> *I stay at Mayville, I am renting the premises I pay R500 per month but maybe I go home every 2 months or if I see that I have some money I then go home. Yes. (Busisiwe, I2, L46-47).*

However, given the low income generated by traders, paying for temporary accommodation in the inner city is often not a viable financial option. The only alternative remaining then is for women to sleep on the streets at night. The women sleeping on the street have no protection in this open and volatile space. With a high risk of becoming victims themselves, many traders were unable to assist one another when incidents of crime did occur, as this participant recalls:

> *Because you could not get out of here, if it happens that you get out we would hear you crying the rapists taking you and rape you, after raping you they kill you. Sometimes if we wake up early in the morning, maybe at 4 o'clock, those males who go to work by that time they would pickpocket them then shoot them, he will die there. That thing was abusing us a lot, because you just think about the father of your kid or if it is your father he was going to work and died on the roadside. (Jabu, I2, l226-231).*

Due to financial constraints and the lack of inner city storage for their goods, traders sleep along the sidewalks at night to protect their products. Sleeping on the street results in several social challenges, most noticeably the trader's vulnerability to sexual crimes by gangs in the

area at night. Migration between home and work is something familiar to the black South African population as the Apartheid regime introduced the restrictive legislation governing their movement and residence (Grest, 2002). While today people are not legally restricted from living in the inner city, their economic situation prevents them from doing so, and thus again, many traders are subject to police harassment as they attempt to sleep along pavements and in sheltered areas of the Market after trading. Many traders noted the lack of appropriate and affordable inner city temporary accommodation, as a severe social challenge for a few of the women. Due to lack of an alternative, many traders illegally sleep in their market space, as Jabu and Maria explain:

> *…We just slept there on the road. Covering ourselves with our blankets then cover with big plastics on top, if you didn't cover your blanket with plastic and maybe you took a beautiful blanket at home you would wake up without blanket. (Laughter) We couldn't wake up in the middle of the night going to pee*. (Jabu, I2, L219- 223).

> *Our problem as I have said before is a place to sleep, the police are chasing us, but there is a machine house. We asked the Municipality to use it so that we can sleep there, but he doesn't want. We told him that we are going to rent, but he doesn't want.* (Maria, I1, L77- 79).

Although these stories of Warwick reflect vulnerability, home communities are in many instances described as even more dangerous. The lack of appropriate and effective responses by police and the authorities in rural communities has led to many communities taking 'the law into their own hands'. Just as Warwick has developed their own volunteer system, the TAC- "Traders against Crime", where the community has adopted responsibility for safety in

the market, so in rural communities, or townships local residents tend to respond to acts of injustice.

> *This is what happened...you see, this one, this boy raped this child (referring to her daughter); she came back and told her brothers. I went to the Police Station to report this and they asked me what if this boy denies this, I then went out of there and walked away from there. After I walked away from there, I met this boy on the way, this boy had always been friends with my sons. When he came to our home they beat him up so much that he ended up dead.* (Hlengiwe, I1, L113-118).

Hlengiwe's recollection of her daughter's rape was traumatic, not only because of the act of sexual violence itself, but also because of the negligent and dismissive approach of the police. The consequences of her son's actions against the alleged perpetrator then resulted in the perpetrator's death and her son being imprisoned. This incident highlights the dangerous position of communities who rely on informal protection, as those seeking to protect the community risk acting out in a violent and unjust manner. The lack of official policing and protection is thus seen to be an immense concern, as community protective factors which 'take the law into their own hands' are paradoxically seen as protective and dangerous.

4.2.5 Having a home- The symbol of success.

Noteworthy, was the number of times the participants in this study referred to their home, or lack of home as a defining marker of their independence, or measure against which they evaluated the success of their lives. For the older traders, the lack of having a furnished home of which they could be proud was perceived as a significant marker of failure or despair: "*If I could have means I would have built two rooms but it couldn't"* (Hlengiwe, I1, L43- 44).

The "home" denotes significance and importance, it was the measure of wealth or stability in a context of poverty, and something to call their own. Furthermore, given South Africa's history of forced removals, the home is understood to be more that just a dwelling space, but rather a significant part of ones family and community it's the location in which ancestors' remain and are connected to (Faith, 1995; Collinson et al, 2003). The lack of a home then, was associated with the opposite of these economic and symbolic factors as Hlengiwe explains:

> *Those problems, you see, it is different with them [her father's other family] because my father built a home for them. They have everything, my father educated them; I, on the other hand, am not educated and have nothing. That's where the problem lies, that's where the problem is. Right now my life is a long story; it is something we can talk about until the sun goes down.* (Hlengiwe, I1, L103-106).

The complications of building a home, aside from the financial constraints, was that several of the traders were living lives of constant commuting. As explained previously, several traders had homes in rural communities but because of their work in the City, they established small temporary housing or shacks close by. Having understood the importance and status of an actual home within one's original community, especially with regard to spiritual symbolism and ancestry the complexities of 'temporary' homes are perceived to be significant. "*The place I stay in, I can't take it as a home, the home is very important. It's okay to stay temporarily. But it will never be like home" (Zama, I2, L61- 62).* As Zama explains, the migration aspect of work obligated a temporary home, which constituted a life of constant flux and instability constantly waiting for the day she can settle in one space

permanently. Thabisile captures the dissatisfaction of a life of migration through her statement:

> *We would love to build proper homes because as one gets older it would be ideal to go back to the rural areas. Here in Durban they say when you get buried you will be buried on top of another older grave or you will have to be cremated. We don't like that because we didn't leave our homes in the rural areas by choice but we had to run away from the conflicts and the battles of that time and come settle temporarily in these shacks. Right now we would really like to head back where we came from but money is not good building so we will just have to build affordable dwellings for now back at home. (Thabisile, I1, L42- 48).*

The role that a home has as a marker of success is even more evident through the narratives of those who had built their own homes, or for those who intended to do so. In describing, who they are and the status they hold the example of a home became illustrators of stability and independence, as these two extracts show:

> *I was living like that at all the times because I didn't have anyone to support me. I was independent and I have even built my house. And you won't even tell that it is a woman's house because it is now the same as the ones for the other families. (Frances, I1, L357- 360).*

> *In my life, I think if I can have my own house even though I don't have husband or something. But if I could have my own house built with my own power that would make me to be happy. (Jabu, I2, L245- 247).*

These two extracts strongly portray the symbolic value of a "home" as a marker of success, especially for women who were perceived to be "alone". The home was not just a marker of economic accomplishment, but also a symbol of gender based power relations, as Frances highlights by saying "*you won't even tell that this is a woman's house because it is now the same as the ones for other families*" (I1, L358). This implies that it is within the constraints of patriarchy that women are able to access good housing and that men are more often homeowners. As a woman, having a home without having 'a man' is therefore a breech from the patriarchal norm, as Jabu conveys in her words "*if I could have a house built with my own power*" (I2, L246). The challenges of patriarchy, and the women's other expressions of independence will be discussed in further detail in the forth theme "being a woman" below.

4.3. Politics, Police, and Permits.

As marginalised and poor women, the traders in Warwick have a long history of political conflict and activist opposition. As Mama (1995) highlights "The status of black women places us at the intersection of all forms of subjugation in society, racial oppression, sexual oppression and economic exploitation" (Mama, 1995, p. 3). During the Apartheid years, all the traders, by virtue of 'race', were discriminated against and the informal sector was largely ignored concerning infrastructure and development. The varying ages of the participants created an interesting lens through which one can interpret the socio-political history of Warwick in the events of individual lives. South Africans of all classes, 'races', and creeds were given the franchise in April 1994; in a politically significant shift, the country officially became democratic.

4.3.1 1994 the year of change…or not?

There were three general reactions to questions associated with April 1994 from the traders. Firstly, some reflected positively on the changes democracy brought and with fondness on the events of 1994; secondly, some were not able to recall the historic event at all; and thirdly, people expressed resentment at the changes or lack thereof that had resulted.

Below two traders recalled the democratic election, the political, social, and economic symbolism it represented, and their expectations of change in living conditions.

> *What I remember about the year 1994, what I remember is that before, we Africans we were under oppression, what I remember is on the 27th of April we were able to vote, we had freedom and freedom of speech as Africans to the government. (Zama, I2, L21- 24).*

> *We saw Juba, he has done so much for our area, we did have water, we have tap water, some people have tap in their homes, but at the time I already had a home, but water is nearby me. Our councillor worked hard, we saw changes in our area at KwaMashu, Ward 10. We saw him making that difference but we don't know what is going to happen next. They promised to give us electricity so we are hoping because he has already done some changes. (Maria, I1, L63- 67).*

One trader reflected on the impact 1994 had specifically on her workspace and in relation to gender and increasing prospects of women's role in society within a new democratically equal South Africa:

> *What I remember is that Tat' Mandela was release out of jail in 1994 or the year before that. So, in 1994 we started voting if I am not mistaken it was the 10th of April. We started to have freedom as we have rights in everything we do. Women were employed because it was only men who were working. Even though there were some women who were working at that time but the number of working women was very low, they were not allowed to work. So, after voting the number of working women increases. (Jabu, I2, L24- 29).*

Furthermore, democracy brought about specific tangible changes in the Warwick Junction vicinity as now African and Indian people were considered South African citizens, thereby having access to all parts of the city as both customers in the market and traders (Karumbidza, 2011; Dobson & Skinner, 2009). When discussing the influx of African traders into a predominantly Indian market, one participant reflected on the manner in which this change took place: "*It was not so* [contested]*, it was a very very good transition and it was one for the better*" (Pravina, I2, L123- 124). Within the working environment, the shift to democracy created a more tolerant working space as this trader recalls:

> *I do remember it means there is freedom because we were oppressed it is not the same as before. There is a difference because before we were being chased by the police and we couldn't do business as normal but today we can. We found people to help us and we are in contact with them. (Gugu, I2, L26-29).*

However, despite being old enough to comprehend and participate in the first free election, some traders did not recall the event at all:

Mmh (Hesitant) I don't remember. (Thabisile, I2, L31).

No I don't remember anything. (Busisiwe, I2, L13).

I don't remember anything; I don't remember that voting came with any changes. (Hlengiwe, I2, L187).

The inability to recall the elections may be because some traders felt democracy was no more than political rhetoric, as they had not experienced any significant changes in their work or home space. As Shireen explains:

Not really, we were all anxious thinking that we were going to have a better life and things were going to get much better but we not, eh, we not so sure about that. (I: mmm) Because you can see it yourself, even their own people, the blacks, have realized that the democracy didn't bring much to the, especially the poor (I: mmm). You know it is ok for all the upper people eh, the councillors and all the politicians, its different for them, they feel there's nothing done for them, they not so impressed really (I: mmm) they not really impressed. (Shireen, I2, L127- 134).

It was interesting to note that more than one trader openly argued that not only did things not improve, but actually seemed to have deteriorated under the new government:

I remember that we voted and there were arguments about political situations and the political parties. We were oppressed but now when you look at today's situation you can see that it was better before voting taking place. (Thabisile, I2, L38- 40).

> *During 1994 elections it was where we started to struggle. We became more poor than ever. Before we were struggling but not like this because you knew that your child will go and work in the construction or in the mining in Johannesburg and get money. (Frances, I1, L313- 315).*

It is important to highlight the context in which Frances's statement takes place. Within this discussion, she explains the psychological collapse of her uncle at the hands of the Apartheid authorities. He was exposed to barbaric cruelty both through witnessing torture and having being tortured himself, as a result he became a '*a mad person*' (Frances, I1, L540). Frances highlights the intense discrimination and abuse that she and her family suffered from before 1994, and yet continues to say that those years were still '*better than democracy. The situation is very difficult now*' (Frances, I1, L545), commenting that the elections only benefit the wealthy, while the poor continue to struggle. In a similar way, Shireen comments '*I don't think there is much at all, there is more corruption than anything else now*' (Shireen, I2, L152- 153).

4.3.2 The changing landscape.

Attempting to gain a historical perspective on Warwick that includes political changes can also then extend to incorporate infrastructural changes within the inner city, such as the Urban Renewal Project (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). Traders commented on the infrastructural and socio-political transitions in particular, as these traders reflect:

It has changed a lot there were no trees before and this place and Cambridge [a large retail commercial food store] *were not here it was just Indian shops. It has changed a lot* . (Hlengiwe, I1, L174-175).

What I have noticed is that infrastructure has changed quite a bit in terms of the roads and things. That has changed, but in terms of the City as a whole um, I can't really see much changes that have been done apart from the World Cup that has taken place and due to that we've had changes taken place like the roads. But on a whole I haven't really saw much changes taken place otherwise in terms of upgrading and getting the City to look better and ehh trying to attract people to the City. (Pravina, I2, L43- 49).

The current hybrid of "race" and nationality within Warwick Junction was an acknowledged shift that occurred over the past 10 years.

We had no vendors at all, it was just the shop keepers. No foreign, foreigners like the Chinese, or the Somalians, there's people from Nigeria. Then it was just the typical you know, the Zulus, the Indians was not the majority, the Zulus were the majority, then we had the whites, but you rarely see the whites coming into the Market area because those times it was different, like West Street and the beachfront all was more for whites. And then the Indian market especially the Victoria Street it was like history you now in those years. But it was fully being taken care of by the Durban Corporation. (Shireen, I2, L11- 19).

Focusing more closely on the traders' immediate market space and the impact democracy brought to their working environment, traders commented on how, in the past, they had more freedom with trading in public spaces in comparison to current stringent public trading legislation, as Hlengiwe explains:

> *The only thing I know is that the first time I came to sell here at Market we just put our things wherever we want to sell. There was nobody who was instructing us to where we can sell. (Hlengiwe, I2, L191-193).*

One significant noted change was the customer demographic shift:

> *We once used to have a lot of Indian customers as well, a lot of whites and coloureds. But we no longer see that customer base now, we ehh basically what we are seeing now is more black customers only. (Pravina, I2, L29- 31).*

Pravina also commented on a shift back to more simple means of trading in the sense that previously scales were used to weigh food items sold, but now-a-days, traders simply calculate weight by plastic bowls and no longer use scales at all. Pravina's reflection on the racial shift in terms of her customer base is a reflection of the wider changes that were occurring in the Cityscape as a whole during the early 1990s, also highlighted by Dobson & Skinner (2009) increased population pressure on the inner city and overcrowding led to "*a very real threat of slum conditions developing*" (p.45). A further change that traders felt was affecting their workspace in the recent years was a noted decrease in customers. For the Early Morning Market, the customer decrease may be attributed to the recent conflict with the

Municipality and the negative press produced concerning the Early Morning Market as this trader expresses:

> *… Our sales have now dropped. Compared to when I first started in the market. Ehhh this I'm not sure whether it was attributed to the negative ehh press that we've been getting due to the court case or ehh is it the rate of unemployment, that could be one of the factors as well, ehh but I'm not sure really. But those are some of the changes that have taken place. Sales have reduced quite drastically in terms of ehh sales, and ehh as I'm saying this it could be due to any amount of factors due to that there. Those are some of the changes I've experienced as a trader in my past 21 years. (Pravina, I2, L15- 22).*

For other markets, even if customers have not decreased, profits have:

> *The market buildings have not changed. Secondly the only thing that changed is the money, it is not the same as before. The inflation has increased compared to that time. It is not like before. (Busisiwe, I2, L8-10).*

Commenting on changes within her market over the years, Zama states, "*Since I came to the market there is no change it's still the same; there is great oppression in our municipality. There are no changes*" (Zama, I2, L12- 13). This response was a common one, as traders expressed dissatisfaction with current political conditions within their working space, which will be discussed at a later point.

4.3.3 Recalling a time past.

It was interesting to note a general feeling of nostalgia associated with trading in the past. The women interviewed in this study echoed this conflicting position between the individual and the nationally accepted narrative of Apartheid as highlighted by Dlamini (2009). Working as a trader during the Apartheid regime, despite the discrimination endured, often seemed to be recalled positively, particularly for one trader who exclaimed with a sense of longing:

> *Just because we had water during the apartheid times we got them for free. During the apartheid times you didn't have to walk a long distance to the market without finding a tap … We had toilets and water, we had it all during apartheid times. We even had places to sit if you where waiting on something you did not have to wait until you have swollen ankles. Now we are struggling, it was better at that time…Yes, the Boers were hard on us but it was better, if I were to voice for the people we would bring them back. It is better to be harmed by someone you don't know than to be harmed by someone you know. (Frances, I1, L629- 640).*

In her strong statement Frances refers to being 'harmed'. It can be suggested, through the context, that she is talking about the overarching structures from legal policy makers to municipal police who governed aspects of her life by virtue of their authoritative position. The impact of authorities such as municipal departments and police, as a theme that was constantly raised with an air of frustration and in some cases despair, as traders lamented the constant challenge that these 'protective' forces played in their everyday trading lives.

4.3.4. Municipal melancholy and "protective" police.

The experiences of police being an additional burden was highlighted by Karumbidza (2011) and was a common and recurring theme throughout the discussions with the women who participated in this study. Of particular difficulty were the rising costs of permits, as Thabisile and Zama explain:

> *Yes, they said per day we must pay R30 and we said we can't afford it, when I first came here I was paying R3.50 and then R6 but now they have increased it so much! They say we must pay R30 otherwise close the business. After that what are you going to do because this is how we make a living? (Thabisile, I2, L216- 219).*

> *Sometimes the police demand permits from the traders and you have to pay from the little money you have made from selling imphepo* [a traditional herb used as incense]. *There is not much money we make out of this; we do this just so that we can live but the municipality is demanding that we pay that already scarce money. (*Zama, *I2, L44-47).*

The challenges associated with securing a permit have resulted in bitter resentment towards the municipality, as the traders in this study failed to identify anything positive that the municipality is doing to further their livelihoods or maintain / improve their working environments. Further complaints were levied against the perceived alliance of municipal laws and police confiscation that leads to traders feeling 'robbed' by the very institutions put in place to protect them.

4.3.5 Police interaction: past and present .

Trading in the inner city has three easily identifiable legal periods of prohibition, allowance and official formalization (Karumbidza, 2011). Without being certain exactly which period Frances refers to, her statement below carries the sentiment of nostalgic reminiscence with regard to police interaction in times past:

> *So, that is why we are saying life was better before not now because during the ancient times if the police officer was going to arrest you, he would greet us even though we were selling by the road side. (Frances, I1, L323- 325).*

In continuing with her explanation, Frances explains how, after arrest, the police would often allow the traders to continue selling their fruits and vegetables in the reception area of the police station, and only thereafter lock the trader in jail or serve a fine. This was interpreted by the research participant as goodwill on behalf of the police who understood that trading was the source of livelihood for the women they arrested, and therefore did not want traders to lose out on an income for that day. As Frances continues to recall her experiences of police interaction:

> *The police officers would come again and arrest you (laughter). It was a beautiful thing it was like an advert if you look through to it and they were not beating or did wrong things to us. As females we were arrested but they would not wrong us. When the police officer came to arrest you he will tell you his name and he will tell you that I have arrested you at this so and so time and you were on the street. (Frances, I1, L350-355).*

The repeated emphasis on the policeman's etiquette through introducing himself to the trader and greeting her in both of Frances's extracts, highlights the degree to which police interaction was almost communal and civil in manner. Police were respectful of the traders and their occupation while mindful of their own obligations to adhere to the laws governing street trading and arresting traders who failed to comply. This may have been a result of 'race' solidarity, as black policemen handling these incidents were fully aware of the need for black trader economic survival, and were thus more sympathetic. There was also no perceived threat of gender-based violence by the police, as Frances highlights *"As females we were arrested but they would not wrong us*". However, this recollection is in direct contrast to other traders' experiences with police as indicated by Dobson and Skinner's (2009) research:

> When I first started trading in Warwick in 1982 it was a terrible place. It was the time of the blackjacks. Blackjacks, that's what we called the City Police…they were harassing us. On the street it was very bad. You couldn't sit where you wanted to sit. The blackjacks were everywhere. We were running with our bags. All the traders were running like hell. The blackjacks would come and take all our goods. (Dobson &Skinner, 2009. p 45).

In agreement with the research of Dobson and Skinner (2009), negative recollections of police harassment in the past by other traders participating in this study were expressed:

> *So, I was selling traditional medicine here and the Whites and the police were chasing us, so we were always running from them until they build for us here at the market. Until today we don't have a place to sleep, we are sleeping on the street and the police are beating us even at night they do chase us away. (Maria, I1, L12- 15).*

Maria continued to highlight how police harassment was then often accompanied by dog attacks, a traumatic and abusive approach which was a constant reminder of her pariah state and peripheral position within her own democratic society. Referring to a more recent recollection of police interaction, Frances' perceptions of the police have changed from positive memories of sympathetic and well-mannered police in the past, to current unsympathetic and abrupt encounters:

> *The police officers come to arrest me because I was still selling, it was 6 o' clock in the evening. I said to them my permit says I must not be found at 20:30 still selling by the road. But they didn't even listen to what I was saying and I don't even know their names. (Frances, I1, L373- 375).*

The stark contrast between past and present police interaction is highlighted by Frances's simple but loaded sentence, "*and I don't even know their names"*, highlighting again the loss of civil respect and even a sense of community, which she felt were present in the past.

Several traders have frequently encountered brash and abusive police interactions in the present. Hlengiwe recalls a similar story of police harassment that has led to her currently being unable to continue with her trade:

> *The police just come, park their vehicle and ask for the permit; the lots of stories you will tell them to one police officer while the others are busy packing everything else on your stand into a plastic bag, that's it. I go to the mielies and the mielies it's the same story; just this past Friday two trolleys- two bags were taken away while the*

kids were in town with the mielies (long pause) so now life is very difficult. (Hlengiwe, I1, L64-68).

The confiscation of Hlengiwe's goods was in relation to her not having a permit to sell the goods. Obtaining a permit constitutes its own realm of challenges, almost facilitating police harassment.

4.3.6 Bribery, corruption and confiscation.

Hlengiwe, a mielie trader, cooks mielies in an area demarcated and permitted by the municipality. However, this location is removed from the main transport hub of Warwick and therefore traders hire people to walk through the busier parts of Warwick selling the mielies. However, this adaptability and job creation was short lived as Hlengiwe explains police confiscation of the mielies from those selling them in public spaces:

It became quite clear that the mielies is constantly confiscated by the police because even today the mielies is always confiscated; it is an object of confiscation. So now you wake up early in the morning to come and sell the mielies, you cook, do everything else and then the police come and take it all away; then you are finished. (Hlengiwe, I1, L15-18).

Frances commented on how police confiscations now are far worse than they were previously. Here she explains the difficulty associated with trying to retrieve her goods as a trader after they were confiscated and the fine had been settled:

They just took my things to the van then they went, if I went to the police station looking for my goods they said there is nothing like. We looked everywhere but we didn't have any luck. But we did find that the police officers who took our goods are from iNanda. They took our goods to their home; police officers from iNanda are very difficult. (Frances, I1, L376- 379).

From this extract one does get a sense of the traders 'being robbed' by the police enforcement, as goods, which are supposed to be stored until the trader can again redeem them, seem to disappear without any accountability or forum in which the traders can lodge a complaint. An added complication is that very often traders reported only receiving the fine the same day it was due to be paid, if not afterwards. This made the possibility of paying the fine and avoiding confiscation impossible. Furthermore, a high level of corruption plagues the confiscation process. Apart from traders having their goods 'stolen' by police, traders were forced to pay bribes should they wish to have their goods returned, thus furthering the notion of 'robbing the poor' as Frances continued to explain:

Even if you are going to other departments they want you to bribe them. Where are you going to get the money to bribe because you don't even have money to buy food and your kids are hungry? We are struggling since the first elections; we even said it was better before the elections. (Frances, I1, L385- 387).

The economic impact of police confiscation in this manner is devastating. A loss of one day's trading can financially cripple a trader's entire family and push them further into the harsh reality of poverty. Traders recalled how police would confiscate goods on a Friday afternoon and only release them on a Monday, thereby costing the trader an entire weekend of income

generation. This level of corruption is crippling on the livelihoods of the urban poor as Hlengiwe tearfully expressed:

> *Now they have said they will take away my stand because the permit continues not to be paid for. I now don't know what to do when something that is my livelihood is being taken away. I live in a two-roomed house and can't even extend it, there is no money and I don't get any social grant. (Hlengiwe, I1, L34-37).*

Frances highlighted a further socio-economic impact of confiscations, as she re-told a story of young boys currently pick-pocketing in the Durban area because police had previously confiscated their fruits:

> *The boys who were selling apples on the other side of the road, told me that you see Ma please don't disturb us if we are pick pocketing people, we were in jail while we were selling those apples because the police did not want us to sell, what do they think we are going to eat ? We also have families, they are also waiting for something at home but we come back with nothing on hand. We do pickpocket people especially on Fridays. (Frances, I1, L483- 487).*

In relation to this story, Frances continued to comment that the police are now to blame for the increase in crime, as they take away innocent people's livelihoods and leave them with few alternatives in desperate times. Several other traders echoed this negative perception of the police and municipal departments, which they viewed as institutions, which held little regard of the traders' appeals, and contextual circumstances, as these four traders lament:

They are not taking care of us. (Thabisile, I2, L35).

I don't see anything much be done about those areas as far as I'm concerned as um even in terms of upgrade for even the market as such, you know ehh, in terms of Council trying to hold campaigns you know nothing like those things are taking place. Probably those are some of the things that need to be looked at because we are losing customers. Probably 'cause it's not being given no, ehh, publicity. (Pravina, I2, L49-54).

Municipality doesn't want to do things like this for us. (Maria, I1, L33-34).

The municipality in not able to help us; when we complain our complaints are not attended to promptly. That is really disturbing for us, especially for the younger traders here because we realise that things are not going as we had dreamed when we were at school. (Zama, I1, L38- 41).

Perceptions of the municipality and local authority were worsened recently in light of a nationwide municipal strike that became violent and lasted almost two weeks (Sanpath, 2011). The strike action occurred at approximately the same time several interviews for this research were conducted. Approximately 460 000 people pass through Warwick on a daily basis (Dobson & Skinner, 2009). The foot traffic brings with it an immense amount of waste, which is usually removed twice a day by municipal workers. The strikes prevented any waste removal and refuse began to build up across Warwick in volumes too large for the traders to manage in their personal capacities. This resulted in extremely unhygienic and foul smelling

conditions that reduced the number of customers in the vicinity and thus the traders' income, as these three traders expressed:

> *We were distracted because there was dirt everywhere. Smelly things that you don't even know what they are and the business was very slow it has changed. (Gugu, I2, L9-10).*

> *It affected us very badly, because we could not carry on with work, at work some things were not going well, it affected us very badly in the work that we do. There were very bad consequences. (Zama, I2, L4- 6).*

> *I would say we were affected because we didn't have customers, they say they were also affected which means there is a way that makes them to be affected by municipality strikes. It was dirty and we had to stay with rubbish with us because we couldn't take it outside, we had to stay with rubbish and it was stinky where we stay. (Jabu, I2, L4- 7).*

Although the municipal strike was resolved in two weeks and trading resumed as per usual, political conflict between the municipality and the Early Morning Market traders over the plans to build a mall (Skinner, 2009) lasted two years, and the consequences have yet to be fully determined. While traders are not opposed to development of the area, the process the City adopted in consulting with the traders who would be affected, was both dismissive and confusing, as Frances refers:

Hhayi, we didn't see that thing very well, they went on doing some adverts that they are taking us to another place and they are going to build for us. Everyone in the market was confused, we were also confused. (Frances, I1, L246- 248).

Below is a lengthy, but insightful recollection of a meeting in which the City feebly attempted to consult with traders who would be affected by the Mall development:

I asked them if they would be able to cut the head on the tile floor inside the mall because they are saying they are going to put tiles and everything. They said they won't be able to do that I asked them what do they think about this. For instant if there could be a person who can show us how we were going to do it. But they showed a small red thing that was moving around, the problem is that we are not educated and we don't understand things very fast. When we come back from the hall, we asked them if they did see a person who was selling the head, they said no we didn't see anyone, I asked them if they saw a person who is selling food, they said no. I said do you think you are going to sell in the air? (Frances, I1, L263- 273).

The power point presentation with a laser ("*the small red thing moving around*") was not comprehensible by the traders and therefore does not constitute collaborative consultation. Several traders from the Early Morning Market suffering financial turmoil and uncertainty regarding the future of their livelihoods, resulting in anxiety and psychological stress amongst those employed within this vicinity as Pravina explains:

Where we as traders can be certain that we don't have this noose hanging over our necks that you know what, today or tomorrow this livelihood of ours is gone, is no

longer going to be there. And I think that is a thought that is running through every body's heads that's involved in the market, not only me but the workers and the porters as well. Because as I say even our porters, we have porters who are uneducated, their fathers have been doing this and now they are doing this and they come from large families, where this money is going back to the farm where they are taking care of their extended families and these are the things that we've got to think about. It's not only us as traders [whose] *livelihoods will be affected, there are thousands of workers also, we got to think about them, what is going to happen to their future as well as the traders?* (Pravina, I1, L173- 183).

Aside from the negative psychological consequences Pravina notes, several traders lost income through the conflict. One trader reflected on an incident in which the City closed and locked the doors of the Early Morning Market preventing her and several other traders from retrieving their live poultry from the market. Despite SPCA's intervention to retrieve the chickens, traders lost their livestock, livestock for which they had already paid.

T*habisile*: *The fact that it was closed and we couldn't come inside*

Interviewer: SPCA

Thabisile: Yes, they took them but others died

Interviewer: What did they do with them?

Thabisile: They brought them back eventually

Interviewer: And you could recognize that this one was mine?

T*habisile*: *But most of them were dead*

Interviewer: Yes

Thabisile: We were really abused. (I2, L155- 174).

The failure of the City to continue with their intentions to build a mall was received by the traders as a resounding victory in their ability to overcome the "giant" as the City was once referred to. The success was a combined effort of a unified Warwick community and collaboration with wider network of Non Profit Organisations, and legal resources as Frances explains:

> *We started at that time to hold each other's hands and most people were helping us fighting us for the place because they saw us crying. We were also calling people to come and help us. People did help us fighting for the place there and we did win because we are still selling and they did not built the mall. We did see this coming but we didn't have power to fight for ourselves but most people did help us and we are very thankful that people fought for us. (Frances, I1, L301- 305).*

Frances's extract highlights the strong degree to which community support and utilizing social structures was a considerable factor in the traders approach to challenging the City. It's this form of reciprocal collective action, made possible through solidified and unified communities that Ife (2002) and Smith (2001) refers to as protective features which enable it to withstand adversity. Although the immediate anxiety of the mall development has subsided, the cost of the victory remains. Psychological, emotional, financial and legal impacts of this two-year debacle have left many traders further despondent with the City, who, through a lack of inclusive and consultative process, posed themselves as the untrustworthy enemy of the urban poor.

4.4. Work

Several women who participated in this study devoted a substantial amount of time to talking about the intricacies and unique aspects of their trade. The narrative of their occupations varied in several ways depending on the specific market they work in, however, there were a few common themes that connected one participant's narrative to another. In particular, the women's capacity to adapt to their unpredictable context and survive within harsh working conditions was very evident.

4.4.1 A family heritage.

While poverty was the leading motivation for the women taking up employment in the informal sector, several women reported having done so because they took over an already established family business. This was particularly the case for the Indian traders who participated in this study. As they explain below:

> *Since then 38 years I'm at the Market, but the business was started by my late father in law he arrived here from Indian in 1910, It's been 100 years. (Shireen, I1, L8- 10).*

> *This has been a family business; I am the 3rd generation trader. It has been passed to my dad by my granddad and now passed onto me. My dad is now late and I've taken over the business and here for the past 21 years. (Pravina, I1, L19-21).*

Both women recalled inheriting the family business, which passed down through two generations. While both women had male siblings in their families, neither participant recalled any degree of antagonism or conflict with the businesses passed on to them instead

of to their brothers. This can be interpreted in two ways. It may be a noteworthy shift away from the stringent binds of patriarchy and associated inheritance of family wealth. However, it may be that their male siblings had greater access to profitable occupations in the formal economy and thus had no desire to take over the market stall.

In other instances, women took over their mother's stall in the market, as they saw that working as an informal trader, was a viable means of income. As this participant explains:

> *I came here because my mother was selling here and I learnt things through her and I saw that I could make money out of this. Secondly, there is nobody that keeps following me like being the domestic worker. (Busisiwe, I2, L125-127).*

The point highlighted by Busisiwe that '*there is nobody that keeps following me like a domestic worker*' highlights the degree to which she feels independent within her workspace, and accountable to herself only. She is her own boss, and in being so finds a realm of freedom. Busisiwe continued by commenting that if she is ill, she need not ask anybody for permission to stay home, but can simply decide that she will not go to the market that day. This degree of flexibility and independence was a significant part of her job satisfaction as an informal trader. However, women who participated in this study did not unanimously feel this high level of job satisfaction, especially in trades like lime mining where the process of collection is rigorous and dangerous.

4.4.2 Behind the scenes of informal trading.

Two market traders explained the process behind the collection of the product that they sold. Jabu, below explains, how the lime, a white clay like substance, is transformed from rock in a cliff face to round balls which are sold in the market:

> *The way we get umcako (lime)…We don't wear makalabha, (protecting metal hats) bhuzi(boots) you just enter there with your bare foot. The things that we use is igeja, (hoe) to dig up the hole if it is not opened yet we use ipiki, (hole digger) ispedi, (spade) igeja (hoe) to take out sand and stones. Because there are also big stone like a rocks that you need to separate. So, there are males who are there to help…They have their own measurements. If he would dig up the hole for me, like if he has opened up the hole he would say, I have opened up the hole it is mine...If he is going to dig up for you after he has opened the hole you would also have to pay him so much money for his service. Then you have to pay for the person who would carry it from the hole to the road because it is a distance… then you would have to pay for the transport that would take you there to your home. (Jabu, i2, 124- 138).*

After this costly and time-consuming process, Jabu still has to grind the mineral until it is a powder-like substance. Using water, she then moulds the lime into individual round balls, which is how they sold in the Market. A separate cost is involved in transporting the lime balls into the city. The balls are extremely heavy and packed into hessian sacks, which are then transported from the bus or taxi rank by a porter, who also requires payment.

In a trade similarly difficult, is Zama, who collects imphepo, a traditional herb used as incense, and burnt when communicating with one's ancestors. Imphepo is collected from

open fields, as it grows uncultivated. Her concern is less about the financial challenges associated with her trade, but rather the safety concerns, as she elaborates below:

> *Things that we cannot prevent is the rapists. We make sure that we do not go in hidden place just in case there is someone hiding there and where other people cannot see you. We make sure that we do not go to the bushes far away from the houses. The other things that we cannot prevent are the lions and the snakes. (Zama, I2, L130- 134).*

As explained, Zama is engaged in a life threatening occupation the dangers of facing the possibility of sexual violence in addition to natural wildlife. Despite this, Zama recalled the dangers associated with her trade without seeming fearful, this may be explained through the interpretation of what Kaminer & Eagle (2010) noted as "*commonplace*" traumatic events (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010, p. 26). In exploring whether being exposed or experiencing trauma on a more frequent basis normalizes the experience, they questioned "*Do people living in conditions of chronic violence and traumatisation eventually become desensitized to trauma and find functional ways to cope and adapt, or are they in fact more at risk for psychiatric disorders*?" (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010, p. 27). The answer to this question requires more extensive research, but in Zama's case, it seems she has found functional ways to adapt and cope in her hostile environment. This does not, in any way, reduce the trauma associated with sexual violence. Rather, it suggests that the case of multiple traumas simultaneously existing, such as poverty and economic survival, one particular trauma may not stand out as much as it would in the life of an individual who is not living in such harsh conditions (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010).

4.4.3 Innovation and adaptability.

A participant in this study began trading in the Herb Market with her mother as a preferred choice of occupation. She explains the unique challenge of being a women and a traditional medicine trader in contemporary times:

Busisiwe: *When you are handling the medicine like when you are a woman, a woman sometimes has to go on periods, in that condition you have to respect it so that means there are ways in which we operate during that time because we have to protect the medicine.*

Interviewer: *Ok, wait a minute, can you still continue to trade at that time or you have to wait for some time, what happens?*

Busisiwe: *According to customs you have to stop, Yes, customs but because you are hungry.*

Interviewer: *Life?*

Busisiwe: *Yes, It has to go on and then we have to do things. There are things that we do.*

Interviewer: *Okay.*

Busisiwe: *Yes, when we are in that condition there are things that we do so that we protect the medicine so it can be still effective and strong because if we do not do those things the medication will not be as strong and it is seen as filth. (Busisiwe, I2, L153- 164).*

Although she would not explain the procedures involved in 'cleansing' the medicine, it was evident the degree to which traditional gendered norms have had to mould themselves around the context of poverty and contemporary commercialized life. Busisiwe does not however

reject the sexist view of menstruation as 'filth' but finds ways to work around this, concealing the discriminatory nature of contemporary patriarchy that exists in her workspace. Busisiwe considered keeping the secrets of the cleansing process extremely important, and refused to retell any part of the process. She compared them to the secrets used in recipes of major company brands such as 'KFC', and the secrets of their trades.

The degree to which innovation around cultural traditions was demanded by shifting context, can be compared to the high level of innovation and adaptability another two traders exemplified in their entrepreneurship. After selling fruit and vegetables in Warwick for a period of time, Frances, a trader, realized the need for meat items to be sold in the market space.

> *I bought cow's -head there, I learnt how to cut it and I cooked it because the men were asking why don't we cook beef meat. I cut that beef-head and cooked the pieces of meat. It was R2,50. It was very much cheaper to buy beef-head at that time and there was no one who had thought it could be a good business. I continued doing other things and my family was become better with the standard of living. (Frances, I1, L125- 129).*

> *It is also the ability to sit down and think about what else can I do, I also re-invent the beadwork patterns and do other things like beaded glass tumblers, bead-covered animal shapes and a lot of other things that God has given me the intellect to learn and master. (Gugu, I1, L45-48).*

This display of entrepreneurship by both Frances and Gugu highlights their strong capacity for adaptability amidst poverty. Despite several traders not having long-term access to formal education during their childhood, traders commented on ongoing leanings they experienced through their years in the market; through either observation or formal courses as these two traders explain:

> *No, there is no where I'm learning this like I explained to you my mother taught me to tie here and this is this and I grew up knowing it, therefore there is no school I went to. (Busisiwe, I2, L145-146).*

> *But we succeed and we were able to make fire. We went and study short courses and everything at the Engine fire then we were able to make fire. (Frances, I1, L108-109).*

The ongoing educational aspects of trade, combined with the flexibility and independence of working in the market and the potential to earn a basic sustainable income validates the importance of their trade for some of the women:

> *Because it provides for me (L114)… It has history and it doesn't have problems and it even produced teachers and nurses. (Thabisile, I2, L120).*

> *We are working here because it is does make a difference; you do get to eat before going to bed, you also get to educate the children. But then again sometimes it goes, goes and then it doesn't go well, this is a business after all; one day you get*

something and then the next day you don't get anything. That's just the type of life we live. (Busisiwe, I1, L14-17).

Thus despite the difficulties of the informal sector, traders felt their occupations were both viable and valuable. However, being an informal trader obligated the women to spend copious amounts of time in the Market, especially around the major transport times being early in the morning and late in the afternoon as people commute to and from work. The high demand on the women being present in the market comes at the cost of their personal lives, especially for women who had mothering responsibilities at home.

4.5. Being a woman

Exploring the notion, challenges and nuances of 'being a woman' was an essential aspect of this research. Already thus far, different themes have highlighted the economic, social, and political challenges the women face on a daily basis. The thematic content focus on 'Work' exposed some unique challenges that women in particular are vulnerable to in their occupations in the informal sector. This theme highlights the many roles women play in their lives:

When we work as women we come across lots of problems. We have children that need nurturing. Other children are neglected by their parents. Most of them see me as an example because I have been there for a long time. We were able to feed our children. It is nice as a woman to be able to do things for yourself because there is a day where your husband will leave you, you will then have to figure out how you will bring up your children but if you were already working that is good. When he dies

you grieve because you loved him but know that you know a lot of things and you are a courageous woman. (Gugu, I2, L125-131).

Gugu highlights the several roles she plays in her life; mother, caregiver, role model and wife. Most significantly, she highlights the need for women to be independent and able to care of themselves as well as others. This is strongly portrayed in her sentence "*because there is a day where your husband will leave you, you will then have to figure out how you will bring up your children".* She does not make this claim lightly as she goes on to recognize the difficulty associated with independence when she state*s " but know that you know a lot of things and you are a courageous woman"* Her extract, articulates the essence of a woman working in Warwick, in conveying the challenges of her context and an inner strength to overcome adversity and keep moving forward.

4.5.1 Social status and heterosexism.

Several women spoke about the fathers of their children, but did not refer to them as long-term or romantic partners. A married but widowed participant in this study discussed her marriage extensively. Gugu highlighted her pride in being married to only one man; a man whom she met when she was 15 and who also fathered her 10 children. However, she resented her marriage and regretted getting married as it restricted her freedom and independence as a woman as she explains below:

I don't like getting married I miss home. Marriage has got problems and you can't do something whenever you like, you have a husband that controls you, the family as well. Even when there is something you wish to do. (Gugu, I2, L305-307).

Gugu was particularly resentful of her constrained role as a wife when her son died in unusual circumstances, which she wanted to pursue with local authorities. Her opinions, and desire for further action were sidelined and discouraged by her husband's family as she expressed with grief:

> *I[t] was painful because when you are married you don't take decisions yourself you tell the family when you see them not helping you can't even do anything. You must hear what they tell you. We could even go and see the traditional healers or sangomas but we didn't not even when my parents gave us money to do so. But my husband's family couldn't let me. (Gugu, I2, L238-241).*

This story highlights the mechanisms of male dominance associated with patriarchy (Fox, 1998). Several women explained that their husbands or significant partners had passed away, leaving them to raise children alone. In one case, a woman expressed the lingering burden of patriarchy when after her husband died; her father-in-law began demanding the inheritance money.

> *I then received that money for the first month after my husband has been laid to rest, then second month during the third month my father in-law, the father of my husband said I was not the one who was suppose to get the money because I was not my husband's parent, it is his son's money. (Frances, I1, L59- 61).*

The demands made by Frances's father-in-law became so severe that it resulted in Frances giving up not only the money, but her ID book as well, to prove that she would never attempt to take money that he believed belonged to him. Frances thus left the post office, where the money was collected, without any financial compensation or family support from her

deceased husband and without the critical ID book, which is essential to accessing all official forms of support and social participation. She left with nothing but the conscience of knowing her father-in-law would no longer bother her and she would now have to find a means through which she could support her fatherless children.

While women and men are equal in the eyes of the South African constitution, the reality of rural and impoverished women is remarkably different. Harris (2003) suggests that patriarchy has become less overt but normalized through political jargon and veiled language and constantly undermines women and their roles in society. In the extract below, Pravina echoes the opinion of contemporary feminist organizations as she expresses her frustration with the seemingly limited progress women have made in the past years despite political rhetoric:

> *And hearing from their difficulties sometimes I think it's just when I had this lady come to me and say to me that she was beaten by her husband who, he was not living with her for 2 years and now that she's found work within the market-she just started work about 2 weeks ago- and was badly beaten by her husband and then he comes over while she was at work and takes away all of the goods. So as much as, and then she went and laid this report to the police station, and she comes back with no joy and the police now are questioning her, and we went back to the police station and reported where you know what she's abusing him. So you know where is the, where are we, where are women now? What progress have we made...You know these are the things that eh, I wish that we as a community could do more in regards to these things as well, uplift women. You know it's no more where we should be looked as just women, you know give us an opportunity as well, and these are important facts*

and I'd like to see a future where women are given more priority and things you know, this will be good. (Pravina, I1, L134- 152).

It seems that patriarchy contorts and extends itself in different ways still making women vulnerable. The above example is a clear lens through which one can interpret patriarchy that Harris (2003) explains. When the husband, seemingly disempowered, beats his wife and confiscates her goods, is an example of what Kandiyoti (1988) refers to as 'classical patriarchy'. However, a more concealed form of male dominance has emerged within the South African context through law enforcement. The dismissive attitude of the police and the furthering of woman's trauma through questioning and then accusing her, completely undermine her position as a victim and further oppress her status within her personal relationship and society (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010). When victimizing an abused woman, instead of protecting her, patriarchy extends itself more broadly into society, further perpetuating the vulnerability of women (Harris, 2003; Kaminer & Eagle, 2010).

4.5.2 Challenging patriarchy: women as breadwinners.

Similar to many other women interviewed through this study, Pravina is the breadwinner of her home. Having inherited the business from her late father, Pravina has successfully extended her stall ownership from one stall to five in the past 21 years. She supports her three children, their educational pursuits and carries the economic burden of an unemployed husband. As a trader in the market, she is an advocate for women to challenge the perceived status quo of gendered inequality. In questioning who controls the women's income, many women highlighted their independence, as Thabisile expresses "*No, no body helps me with my money I take care of it*" (I2, L183). Through the loss of their husbands or lack of economic support from the father of their children, several women who participated in this

study indicated that they were the sole breadwinners for their families, successfully raising children without male support. Gugu's husband died, leaving her to raise her 10 children alone:

> *Even now some of them are married and one of them is now working as a nurse at Botha's Hill but she came out of this beadwork, which I have always done even though it was very hard because raising and educating children alone is not easy. (Gugu, I1, L31-34).*

Another trader highlighted how even when the males in her family were alive, she was still the sole breadwinner: "*Because even when my brother was alive he didn't have luck with find jobs, I was the one who was providing for him and do everything for the family*" (Hlengiwe, I2, L27- 28). While this role as the breadwinner might be seen as a significant step forward for women, it should not be misinterpreted as when men are still in the home, it is usually they who control the women's income, as Gugu highlights " *Yes because my husband died*" (I2, L205). In fact, when women are the breadwinners, it may more accurately be interpreted as simply added family responsibilities, in which the woman is responsible for income generation and then has to hand it over to her husband for his disposal. Within the context of poverty, men can often feel disempowered and less masculine by their inability to secure a job and income, and their increased reliance on women (Morell, 2009). It is within this unstable and ego threatening psychological state, that the risk of men reacting in a violent manner increases. It is because of these social nuances that it can be suggested women who are breadwinners in their homes, may be more vulnerable to hostile, disempowered men. Within this context, with 80 percent of women responsible for generating an income to

support their families, women working in Warwick are increasingly vulnerable (Skinner, 2009).

From a completely contrary viewpoint, one trader reported taking ownership over, not only her own income, but that of her fiancé's as well. In this contrasting but refreshing explanation, it is evident that not all women feel disempowered by their male counterparts:

> *No, how can my husband manage my earnings while we are still not married? Even when we are married, he will not manage my finances…I am the one that is supposed to look after his cash, yes, during pay day the money must be in my hands. (Busisiwe, I2, L109-115).*

4.5.3 Being a mother.

A significant portion of each participant's interview was devoted to discussing the role of mothering and the complexities of motherhood within the context of poverty. A particular challenge was the 'balancing act' between work and home as several traders needed to be in the market during commuter times early in the morning and late afternoon/evening. An added complication was the travelling distance to and from work, due to the legacy of Apartheid laws that initially governed where black women were permitted to live. With the demise of Apartheid laws, the development of semi urban communities established themselves and several participants mentioned living in small, temporary accommodation closer to their workspace. However, this meant they often had to leave their children behind in their permanent homes, cared for by others.

In discussing where or whom Pravina considers her 'community', she highlighted the many hours she devotes to her occupation. She commented, "*I spend ehh I think half of my day is spent here in the area of my work and so I'm spending just merely few hours at home*" (Pravina, I2, L194- 196). This is what one could call a conflict of 'scripts' (Billington et al, 1998). While often the context of poverty demands the women spend this many hours in the workspace, it is noteworthy that some women expressed having an occupation in the informal economy as a preference, "*The thing is people have their own talents maybe my talent lies here. God gave me a talent to sell medicine*" (Busisiwe. I2, L131- 132). Similarly, Shireen a stall owner highlighted her reluctance to retire and leave Warwick*; I always told my son at the age of 65 (laughter) but I've exceeded it now, one year late* (I2, L403- 404). In alignment with these traders' opinions, research has shown that some women working in the informal sector do so because of the perceived autonomy and opportunity for financial growth through profits, as traders do not pay tax (Chen et al, 2001). However, these responses were the exception, and within the context of poverty and raising children alone, several women have no choice but to adopt both 'scripts' to meet the requirements of daily living. This results in an intensive and complex daily routine, as Pravina continues to explain:

> *Eh, I've always been a working mum taking care of my children, as well as, I'd say, taking on 3 shifts at a time, that's working during the day, working when you get home and working eh after supper as well. Also, I'm very involved in my children's life, always it's been very important to be very involved in their life in terms of their education and in terms of their well being. (Pravina, I1, L12- 17)*

While not all traders who participated in this study were mothers, most of them were. They had several children and in many cases, grandchildren, which remained in their care. This

increased the economic burden of providing for so many dependents as Gugu highlights: "*I struggled a lot, so my children are nine that are living altogether, there are ten souls though of which one was taken away by God. I have nine living souls right now" (I1, L19-21).*

A significant challenge to those who did have children was balancing child minding with working hours. For many of the traders, their children's childhood reflected that of their own; as they too were forced to temporarily leave their children in the care of their older siblings. In the absence of appropriate child minders, traders were often forced to bring their children with them to work, "*Yes, but if she is not there I have no choice but to bring him to work*" (Busisiwe, I2, L83).

Hlengiwe: My mother was staying far away and she was working there, maybe she was selling.

Interviewer: so you didn't stay with your mother?

Hlengiwe: No, we stayed with her when we were grown up but we were staying with my grandmother. We were very poor. (Hlengiwe, I2, L472-475)

However, in worst-case scenarios, mothers had to leave their children for extended periods durations while they worked in the City, sending financial support to their children who remained at home, as Maria reflects:

As we are staying here we just send money to our home. If we are going back home, your children would start starving, they would take your table here. The table that would give money to pay rent here, and the money to buy food for your children. We have that problem and we don't stop thinking about it. (Maria, I1, L42- 45)

The challenges of parenting when geographically removed from the location of their children were plentiful. One trader lamented on not realizing how sick her son was until it was too late because he was being cared for by a grandmother and she had not seen him for a long time. Another trader explains the difficulty of disciplining her 'troublesome' son, and ultimately blames herself for her son's misbehaviour, which forced her to hand him over to police:

> *I then came to an acceptance that if it was my fault I will answer before my God about it. I then thought it was now the time for the law to its course maybe he will change and be disciplined. I thought that it was maybe I was too lenient on him as he had lost his father and I was busy working so I thought I would hand him over to the law and then he was soon arrested after that. (Thabisile, I1, L65- 69)*

The women talked a lot about the problems of the younger generations, particularly substance abuse and teenage pregnancy. Aside from the personal costs of substance abuse, the impact that a child in the home has when he or she is on drugs can be devastating for the family within the home and in the wider community. As Thabisile explains:

> *Our family gained a bad name in the neighbourhood because we have a child that is troublesome. We were at the risk of being attacked in the community because we have a hooligan [yawuhluho] in the house. (Thabisile, I2, L62- 64)*

In a context where community networks are crucial and often the only support available to the poor, being ostracised has devastating effects, furthering the sense of a broken generation is the role of unemployment amongst the youth. The consequences for unemployment,

especially amongst youth and young adults can be potentially devastating as shown through research by Panday & Arends, (2008). Frances reiterates the concerns for unemployed youth by saying:

> *The kids that we are trying to protect here would go and do something wrong and sell their bodies, that is something bad. Because people who are selling their bodies there, are people who have thought about everything and took their final decision because they see that there is no other way. (Frances, I1, L740- 743)*

Lee (2004), highlights how prostitution is an increasing social concern as it renders the human body as a commodity and increases the risks of physical and sexual abuse. Furthermore reducing bargaining power increases the chance of pregnancy and risk of life threatening sexually transmitted diseases such as HIV/AIDS (Panday, Makiwane, Ranchod & Letsoala, 2009; Lee, 2004).

While many women considered the government's implementation of social grants as positive and supportive factor, Frances interpreted the financial support gained by having a child as a motivator for teenage pregnancy, as she explains below:

> *Now if my child is well behave and thought carefully that her friends at school have mobile phones, she has a new set of pants, she bought this with the grant money, so why don't I have a baby so that my mom babysits while I go and get the support grant. There are lots of girls who are drinkers it's because of the grant money. Women are strangled because of this grant money. But as for me in my house I don't want the support grant. (*Frances, I1, L655- 659).

Contrastingly, research into teenage pregnancy does not show receiving a support grant as a strong motivator for teenage pregnancy. Research conducted in 2009 highlighted the strongest factor, at 66%, for teenage pregnancy was not using contraceptives (Panday et al, 2009). It is the social and economic consequences that very often impact on the elderly mothers lives as they often take up responsibility and care of their teenage daughters' children.

Despite the complexities around childcare arrangements, distanced parenting, and troublesome youth, several mothers highlighted the importance of continuing within their current field of work in order to continue providing for their children's needs, the greatest of which, was education.

4.5.4 Sacrificing for a better future.

> *So my child, I grew up at home we were struggling. So, I said to myself my children would never experience what I have experience. I must go and work hard just for them. (Maria, I1, L27- 29).*

This statement by Maria was the sentiment that underlay each of the trader's narratives when discussing work and mothering. Raising her eight children alone, Maria emphasized the motivation to continue working in harsh conditions was to support her children and allow them to pursue their education as far as possible, an opportunity many of the participants in this study were not afforded. The psychological stress of women, who are often alone, raising children within a context of poverty was significant:

> *I was even thinking of killing myself because the kids are depending on me, what am I going to give them. I am very much thankful to those who helped us to continue working here. Because my brother's kids who are working, are now able to come here and give me some money and food. They would say take this Ma even though we are not working well but it is now much better. (Frances, I1 L772- 776).*

Women forced to raise children without the support of a partner experience "*significantly higher levels of psychological stress*", in comparison to women in 'two headed households' (McLanahan, 1983, p. 347). Grandparents responsible for the upbringing of children are shown to be more vulnerable as they "*contend with their own frailty*" (Situation and voices, 2002, p. 10).

The capacity to send your children to school was a noteworthy accomplishment as each participant proudly proclaimed their child's education level. However, it was at great effort as Gugu highlights the sacrifice that came with single motherhood:

> *I was working very hard even there and there was no enjoyment of working there. I would work there and then go home after some time to check on my children (pause)...this was because I also wanted my children to get that little education which was equal to what I could afford at the time, so they learnt. (Gugu,I1, L26-29).*

For many traders the difficulty in juggling work and home life was worth it when their children were able to become educated. Significantly, two traders mentioned the high level of

tertiary study that their children had achieved; an accomplishment they hoped would break the cycle of poverty in their families:

> *I have raised and educated my children and those that wanted to study further were able to due to my work at the market. One of my children is married to the Gumede family and has two university degrees, which she achieved due to my work at the market. (Thabisile, I19- 21).*

> *Because one of my, my priorities were my kids you know in terms of their education and having a better life for them, and I think now that ehhh I have my 2 kids my daughter is on her third year of bachelor of education and I have my big fellow that's now a civil engineer and I have my last born that's in grade 9, I like to see him through you know. And make sure that he has a proper education, and if I can achieve those things for me then as a parent I know I've done my duty. (Pravina, I2, L204-210).*

Pravina's final sentence "*I know I've done my duty*", reiterates the gendered script that Billington (et al, 1998) emphasize, the perceived role and 'duty' of women to take responsibility in nurturing and caring for their children. This perception, enhanced through media, constructs women's identities through 'being' and not through 'doing' as it does for men (Billington et al, 1998). There is a significant irony in the passive conceptualization of a woman's identity as 'being' in light of the effort and action associated with being a mother. In the case where mothers singlehandedly raised their own children, the passive nurturing caring ideals of motherhood gave way to the more tangible 'doing' aspects, such as full time trading, that allowed them to provide and thus care for their children.

However, the women who participated in this study firmly established themselves as mothers, focusing on this as not just something to 'do' but critical to their identities, their 'being'. Thabisile describes herself:

> *I would say she is a mother that is in contact with God. She is very active and very quiet. The neighbours' know her because they get along with her. She brought up her children in a good way to make them what they are now. She has built a home for her children not her husband because he died early. He died in 1987. She brought up her children and educated them until they became what they wanted to be. (Thabisile, I2, L496- 500).*

Furthermore, when discussing their hopes and dreams, almost all the women within this study referred to their children. Their desires were centred on seeing their children accomplish success in their life. Success was measured through various aspects of marriage, a good family, finish schooling, or securing employment as these two mothers explain:

> *I have two children, girls only; the first one was born in the year 2000 and the second one was born in 2005. The one who was born in 2000 is in Grade 1, no I mean Grade 3 and the 5-year-old one is still in Grade R. It is my wish that things will be different for my children and they won't have to go through the same things I did. I wish to educate them as much as possible and I wish for them to go as far as they want in education, become whatever they want to be. I want them to be in professions where they can be helpful to the society like nursing, teaching but it is up to them really what*

they eventually become and which level of education do they want to reach. (Zama, I1, L63- 69).

No, I don't want them to stay single. I want them to have their own families. (Thabisile, I2, L427).

Participants emphasized the hope that their children would not be caught in the 'poverty cycle' and would rather grow up to live lives quite different from their own. Education was perceived to be the escape route from poverty, as Busisiwe reiterates:

My hopes and dreams for my children is for them to go to school study because I am here today because of them I want to earn a living for them. I do not want them to turn out like me I want them to go to Varsity and become what they want to be and what I wish for them to become. I wish to stay comfortable through their hard work…I don't want them to live the life I'm living (I: laughter) That is why I am here. (Busisiwe, I2, L93-104).

This is not to say that the women do not consider their work as valuable. Most traders did feel that their trade is a means of provision and sustained livelihood for them and their children, as already highlighted in the previous discussion of the theme 'Work' Several of the traders explained how their children worked with them in the market, and were often exposed to the dynamic occupational and relational aspects of informal trade.

I brought them because I want them to see the fact of how hard people are working within the market and ehh I'd like them and I always teach them that is good to be

independent, but I've always always stressed to them that they need to be well educated. Because I'm sure in their day and age that they will not want to come and do the type of work that I do at the moment. (Pravina, I2, L383- 388).

While Pravina makes evident the fact that it is unlikely her children will take over her trade, she emphasizes the value of exposing them to her market space. Contrastingly, for other traders, pride in their occupation was a significant feature, and they keenly expressed a desire for at least one child to continue in their line of work as these three traders express:

Even the smallest child does beads, even boys. I am glad if my grand children followed on my footsteps. Some of my son in-laws are also busy with beads. (Gugu, I2, L279-280).

Well the store will still carry on, it will be a legacy (I: ok) ya that can go to my grandchildren…it has to stay because it's been a legacy, you know something that we can never replace, my father in law from 1860, he bought and opened the shop in 1920 (I: shjoe) ya so for us it's a legacy. (Shireen, I2, L266- 271).

If they like they can continue but I would like at least one or two of them to continue with it. (Thabisile, I2, L48).

4.5.5 Mothering in the context of illnesses and death.

Traders commonly referred to the grief associated with the death of family members and loved ones during their lives. Particular traumas were associated with the loss of a child. Two traders share their stories below:

Yes, Thabisile died when she was 3 months old. My soul was broken. I didn't know the first child had so much value! (Thabisile, I2, L563- 654).

The death of my son was really painful because he didn't get sick. It really hurt me and there is a wound that would never heal. It sometimes comes back because he was born in 1968 October 28. It really comes back to …He didn't get sick my child, he was playing during the day but at sunset he passed away. He asked for something to drink as if there was something in his chest but at sunset he died. He also get sick at sunset. (Gugu, I2, L220-233).

Gugu's son was eight years old when he passed away through circumstances she has never fully understood. Recollection of this event, more than 34 years later still causes her grief. The year of her son's death was 1976, a year of violent protests by the youth of South Africa in light of the Soweto Uprising (Eidelberg, 1999). It is significant to note that while this year is etched in the memories of many South Africans as the Soweto uprising was seen as a catalyst for change, for Gugu, the Soweto uprising was not a feature within her narrative, as that year solely marks the grief associated with the loss of her child.

While most participants had suffered the loss of a spouse, child, or sibling, few of the participants spoke about HIV /AIDS and whether this was a cause in the death of those they mourned. However, one participant clearly stated: "*They all* [my children] *die because of HIV Aids, the three of them*" (Hlengiwe, I2, L398).

HIV/ AIDS was referred to by Frances as, '*a disease that finishes the whole family'* (Frances, I1, L678). The most significant concern regarding HIV / AIDS is its disproportionate impact on the population, and the impact on the dependency ratio of children left orphaned (Whiteside & Regondi, 2011). In discussing her son's positive HIV status, Hlengiwe referred to the manner in which he dealt with the reality of his diagnosis:

> *No, he was sick I told him to go to clinic then he went he told me about his results. They all didn't hide they just make it a joke. (Hlengiwe, I2, L419-420).*

Apart from HIV/ AIDS several other illnesses and infections plague the lives of women who are working and living in informal spaces, highlighted by Lee (2004).

> *I am very sick, I have diabetes, arthritis and I am sleeping outside.* (Maria, I1, L46).

Shorty after her interview, Maria who was a traditional healer in the herb market, and a long-standing diabetes patient, unfortunately passed away. At the time of the interview Maria was suffering from severe flu, made worse by her diabetes and the harsh living conditions of sleeping on the streets. Her death however, was apparently because of an infection in her toe and occurred just a few weeks after her interview and before her follow up interview.

When traders are ill they are unable to attend to their stalls and thereby lose income. Because trading is the primary and often only form of income, remaining home during illness is simply not a feasible option as Hlengiwe expresses: "*It's diabetes, blood pressure; they say there is no pension for those illnesses. If I'm just sitting at home we will end up hungry*" (Hlengiwe, I1, L61-62).

Several participants expressed the difficulty of losing loved ones and the added economic burden of an increased dependency through caring for orphaned children. While the economic consequence of having children in the home whose parents had passed away was difficult, no participants showed any signs of regretting their decision or resenting their circumstances of their added parental care. What may be initially interpreted as a cruel and harsh response to the potential death of her troublesome son, one participant highlights the degree to which individuals often exposed to adversity, psychologically and emotionally prepare themselves to cope, as highlighted by Thabisile:

> *He realized that I had given up on him and told myself that if he died I would mourn for him and move on. I had mourned for his father and moved on and I would have done the same with him.* (Thabisile, I1, L86- 88).

This ability to 'move on' despite incredible hardship highlights these women's strong capacity to cope amidst adversity. Killigan (2004) suggests, those living in unpredictable environments become somewhat unscathed by adversity, preparing and protected themselves through anticipation of imminent and certain adversity (Killigan, 2004). However, an alternative suggestion if offered by Kaminer & Eagle (2010):

> In a context of continuous traumatisation, it is possible that specific traumatic events may not stand out for a person as being particularly stressful or significant, but may rather be viewed as yet another challenge in the ongoing struggle for survival. (Kaminer & Eagle, 2010, p. 152).

4.5.6 Women as caregivers in homes and communities.

> *They come to me on a daily basis. And I'm inundated with problems where I've got to sort out with the traders the porters, even their problems; and this is what makes my life and my day more exciting…if I help 10 people if I have 2 people today, that you know what, I managed to help these 2 people. (Pravina, I1 L76- 81).*

As Pravina highlights, the combination of the perceptions of women and the role of mothering has resulted in several women taking on responsibility for their wider communities at home and work. This is what Billington et al, (1998) refers to as 'emotional labour' and it extends the role of mothering far beyond the borders of the immediate family. Gugu captures the essence of ' emotional labour' through her simple statement, "*I'm a mother full of love for everybody I don't hate anyone on earth"* (Gugu, I2, L409). It's by virtue of her motherhood, that she claims a universal love for others and with that, the perception of a caring nature, which would extend to all whom she meets. This ideology of the communal mother was reiterated in examples women gave during their self-narratives. One such example is that of Thabisile, whose matter of fact claim that 'all mothers' are members of the women's league and thereby have a social responsibility to for their wider community:

> *I'm a member of the women's league like all mothers. I'm a Catholic under Saint Anna. I go to people's houses where there are sick or deceased people. That is what we do. (Thabisile, I2, L84- 86).*

The final sentence in Thabisile's extract '*that is what we do'* reemphasizes the notion of the 'duty' of being a woman and fulfilling the expected social norm of caring and nurturing that

is so closely woven into the work 'script' for women (Billington et al, 1998). This imagery of the 'extended mother' is illustrated through women who immediately and unquestioningly adopted children who were either orphaned or in need, despite the personal cost entailed through increasing their number of dependents. The two extracts below are examples of traders who have taken on the mothering responsibility of caring for children who are not biologically theirs:

> *So, he was staying next door alone with nothing, he had no stove, iron so he had to come here and ask everything. So, if we are preparing food he would be here asking for food and ironing so, he ended up sleeping at home. So, we ended up staying with us then my two grandchildren and my son. (Hlengiwe, I2, L346-351).*

> *If they don't have money they do come to and ask money to buy electricity then I would give them, I said give them that food because they really need it. (Frances, I1, L431- 433).*

Provision for these children extended beyond tangible items of clothes food and electricity, as Frances continued to point out: "*You don't have to constantly remind a child that he or she is an orphan. Educate them about life that you go from here to there so you can be like others*" (I1, L685- 686). Women working in the market frequently expressed their responsibility for the livelihoods of their younger siblings as well as their own children. Zama is an example of a trader who has an extended dependency exceeding that of her own children as she financially supports four siblings, two at school, and two at university. She commented: "*Even though it was hard I was able to sell and make a difference in the lives of my younger*

siblings back at home; they were able to continue to go to school with the money I brought home" (Zama, I1, L28- 30).

More often than not, traders, especially elderly traders, were involved in the care and upbringing of their extended families children, and grandchildren. Grandparents and siblings played a vital role in the raising of children whose parents had left them through illness, perhaps HIV, although not in all cases. Gugu affectionately refers to the grandchildren for which she is now solely responsible as '*Gogo's Kids'* (Gugu, I2, L 384) as she explained how her morning routine of getting her grandchildren ready for school represents the responsibility she now has of raising them in their parent's absence:

> *They are my children even when there is a meeting at school they call me. Their mother doesn't bother to check on them even when she is still alive. They tell me their mother died and that makes my heart sore. (Gugu, I2, L377-379).*

While no participant mentioned any degree of resentment towards the added responsibility, the psychological and financial stress of a greater dependency ratio was evident. The women highlighted that they were the single source of survival for many of their dependents; "*I have a huge family to support; my brother passed away and then I had to provide for his children so that they won't die due to hunger*" (Hlengiwe, I1, L19-20. The pressure of ensuring survival for so many people results in mounting psychological stress and resentment towards a society that fails to recognize the vital role these women are playing and assist them accordingly, a social failing which Frances identifies as abuse:

We are being abused and nobody is taking our side, nobody cares what is happening to us. We don't have especially females, because we are the ones who are the heads in our families, but we are behind oppressed. It is even worse now because there are children who look after each other because they don't have parents anymore. (Frances, I1, L415- 418).

So, that is what saddens me, there is number of grandchildren, boys and girls. They have grown but I see that it is not going well for their mothers; it is a burden that is constantly in my heart. (Gugu, I1, L62-64).

As both Frances and Gugu highlight, the increasing number of dependents and parentless homes, further perpetuates the poverty cycle and in doing so, continuously traps women within vulnerable contexts.

4.6. Support

Bronfonbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory (1979) provides a framework to explore the micro, meso, exo and macro levels of interaction in a holistic understanding of the layers of social support employed by the women to cope in their challenging environment. However, these levels of interaction can also represent the different realms of individual and communal power or constraints.

4.6.1 Macro and Exo systemic support network.

Beginning from the outer periphery of the women's 'layers of interaction', the macro layer of Bronfonbrener's (1979) ecological framework highlights the role of wider social and national

structures, culture and social class (Trudge et al, 1997, p. 89). It is evident from the analysis thus far, that the traders felt they had little support from these broader social structures and further, that authorities such as the municipality and the police were in fact posed against their interests. However, macro level support structure that was mentioned as positive was the role of social grants. But again, several women expressed frustration at not being able to access social grants despite finding themselves in desperate and dire circumstances of poverty, as these two women explain:

> *We thought that the Municipality would help us but he doesn't. If we leave this place we don't know how are we going to take care of our children, even if I try to get the pension they said it is not for my age. (Maria, I1, L48- 50).*

> *I do everything in a painful manner because I don't have anybody to provide for me. If only I could get even the pension (pause), it could be much better (sniffles). (Hlengiwe, I1, L70-72).*

The 'pension' mentioned in the extracts, refers to the social grant financed by the government. Maria, who passed away during the duration of this study, was only 59 years old, and thus not yet eligible for the old age social grant, which is only accessible to women over 60, even though the life expectancy average is 55 years of age. Interestingly, despite three women being eligible by age to receive the grant, only one trader mentioned she was receiving financial assistance through the pension system while working: "*So now, now it is only pension for now*" (Gugu, I1, L38).

4.6.2 Meso and micro systemic support network.

The meso and micro layers of social interaction proved to be the most influential levels of interaction with regard to seeking and receiving support. The meso layer consists of the interactions between two or more settings (Bronfonbrenner, 1994).

Several participants in this study recognized external organizations and Non-profit organisations (NPO) as a supporting resource in times of adversity. In particular, the Non Profit Organization, Asiye eTafuleni was seen as a reliable and utilized supportive resource.

I would say the arrival of these people, I will call it a company, these people from Asiye eTafuleni there are so many changes happened or to happen just because of Asiye eTafuleni company, they are the eye opener for us, I'm happy they came. Because now I can see the future. (Zama, I2, L196- 201).

The NPO's, facilitative approach appears to be successfully influencing the lives of the women in Warwick,

> *Asiye eTafuleni has done a lot of good work…They have also taken the other one called Bheki and they go with her like when they take tourists around on the streets; so I'm grateful to God and do believe that I'm still going to see bigger things in the future, than what I have already seen. (Gugu, I1, L73-89).*

It is important to note that my position, as a part time employee of the NPO Asiye eTafuleni may have influenced the women's appraisal of the role the NPO has played and continues to play in the Warwick Community. However, recently the NPO was awarded *the Mail and Guardian, Southern Trust Investors in the Future and Drivers of Change: Civil Society* award

which highlights the NPO's active involvement in the lives of these women and the wider Warwick community.

A further form of mesosystemic support within the context of the traders' lives, is the interconnectedness of their individual market space within the realm of Warwick Junction as a whole. While each market has its own microstructure, all the markets can be represented in a larger overarching system that interconnects both the individual markets and the traders within each market into a wider Warwick community. The participants of this study interpreted the cohesion that exists amidst the wider Warwick community as a form of social support:

> *Because the other day we met at SEDA (centre for small enterprise and entrepreneurship development). We were together with other traders there and the ones from the morning market. (Busisiwe, I2, L293-294).*

> *In these ten markets, there is one leader in each market. But we communicate as leaders of these markets. (Frances, I2, L18-19).*

Another level of meso support the traders mentioned frequently was the committee and management structures that existed within their market. These structures were seen as a valuable resource to which traders could express complaints, frustrations, and a platform on which individual market issues could be handled. The most organized of these meso systemic structures appeared to be the Herb Market as Busisiwe highlights: "*The management team here is very good there are committee members and they are the people chosen by us. If you*

have a problem you contact them and they solve it" (Busisiwe, I2, L241-242). One of the traders who participated in this study was a leader within her market:

> *Honestly I have overcome a lot because whatever I do or did, I do it for the community there. We are selling as women and I think that is why they keep re electing me. They say I'm not lazy.* (Gugu, I2, L196-198).

It was interesting to note that within one market, despite all the traders being women, the head of the Market was a man: "*We do have a committee; our leader for now is Mr Sithole who is in charge here at the market"* (Zama, I2, 91- 92). The allocation of individuals into positions of leadership within the individual markets is a key feature in community development (Ife, 2002). With the understanding that each individual market can therefore compromise a community within the wider Warwick community, one can explore the extent to which the traders see the micro layer interactions as a supportive resource. Because the women interact with other women trading in their market on a daily basis, the workspace community can be incorporated into the micro layer of influence. Ife (2002) considers communities to be strong protective and supportive factors because they unite people through solidarity of similarity, foster trusting relationships, and generate reciprocity. The women who participated in this study echoed these positive features in relation to the supportive aspects of their individual market traders. Busisiwe highlights how the common theme of poverty is a uniting factor for the women she interacts with in her market community:

> *That means what makes us get along is that everybody that comes here had one thing which was poverty…We love one another because even if somebody is going home and has nothing we are able to take out from the little that we have and help out. You*

cannot stay here on the streets if you are rich at home so that is what brings us together. (Busisiwe, I2, L190-194).

The combination of long working hours alongside one another and facing common social, political and economic challenges, resulted in a strong sense of belonging and family like relations within individual markets: "*Yes, very much they even gave me a nickname they called me Makhulu (granny). We take each other as sisters"* (Hlengiwe, I2, L223-224). This sense of community thus often served as a means through which individuals could access support, both tangible and psychological an important feature in response to trauma (Herman, 1992). This shared support was particularly helpful for traders whose collection of their products was in dangerous and life threatening environments such as that encountered by Zama, "*You cannot go by yourself; we prefer that two or more people can go, so that someone can see if the other has a problem*" (Zama, I1, L136- 137). The strong sense of community and social support serves as a significant protective and resourceful aspect in these women's lives which then further contributes to the establishment and maintenance of resilient communities highlighted by Coon & Mitterier (2007). The extracts below illustrate this:

I see that working together brings better results even if there is something that you didn't understand you end up growing in that aspect. (Gugu, I2, L171-172).

We help the person in need in those kinds of situations. We call the relatives and maybe the person has nothing so we contribute some money. Maybe if a mother or father has passes on we call for the child and give the contribution. We then attend the funeral if we are able to, if the place is too far we take money from our pockets to attend that funeral…Another thing is if a person is sick let's say my neighbour gets

sick I open his/her stand and work on her behalf even if the person is not sick when the person is absent from work, yes, maybe if I've gone somewhere I leave my stand open maybe if I go home the whole week my neighbour will open my stand and work until I come back. (Busisiwe, I2, L224- 232).

Even in instances of conflict, several traders reported that the solidarity amongst the traders regularly overrode the issue at hand:

There are those instances because we are not the same. Yes, but a person would come clean and apologise. (Thabisile, I2, L203- 204).

We do rent here; but as a community here we are united and there is no problem even when you get upset with someone you just let it pass then everything is all right. In that way there is not much more that I can say except that here in the market we are women that are supportive of each other, there is no problem, you see. (Busisiwe, I2, L23-27).

Another form of support the women raised was the financial system of the 'stokvel'. Several women who participated in this study were members of a 'stokvel' within their working communities as these three extracts highlight:

We are close with the people that are across us because we understand each other we even play stokvel together. We contribute R100 weekly. (Thabisile, I2, L242- 243).

The things we support each other on are the stokvels. We put in some money and then separate it evenly during December. (Busisiwe, I2, L210- 211).

There is something like stokvel that we are playing around my area if one of our neighbour has lost the member of the family each person would go with 10kg of something until the full groceries is enough for that function. (Hlengiwe, I2, L639-641).

Utilizing these forms of social support furthered a sense of belonging with the community and, in turn, strengthened the social support aspect of community life. This is because, as the community structure strengthened, it became more of a resource that the women could draw upon in times of need (Smith, 2001). The strength and supportive role of the Warwick community as a whole, is thereby largely dependent on the extent to which social support is reliable and utilized, by the traders in individual markets.

Rarely did women mention their home areas as significant supportive contexts, perhaps because they spend little time 'at home' in these communities. A hindering factor in eliciting support from neighbours in home areas was because the women knew that the neighbours themselves were struggling to make ends meet, and thus felt guilty in asking for help. However, one trader specifically highlighted the supportive role her home based community played after the traumatic incident of her son's death:

It's me, by the time my last son died; my neighbours supported me a lot. The boy who lives around in our neighbour he gave us R30 airtime we made calls to inform our

relatives, I even called my husband's sister, people and our neighbours supported us a lot. (Hlengiwe, I2, L333-335).

A further aspect of the micro layer of interaction that the traders highlighted as a supportive measure was the role of family and friends during difficult times. Support of friends and family are significant in processing and coping in the aftermath of a trauma (Herman, 1992). Each of the following three extracts highlights the supportive realm of close friends and family as a means to regain psychological stability and emotional support:

My mother said I must come and stay with her because she saw that my mind was pre occupied. (Thabisile, I2, L502- 503).

I had a few friends who used to visit, and they spent some time with us, you know, go out, and that's how I passed my days through. (Shireen, I2, L208- 210).

I called Sie that night and told her what happened. She said she is coming, she said what am I thinking, by the time she is saying sister I could feel that she is saying it from deep down. (Hlengiwe, I2, L26-28).

However, not all participants felt this level of support through friends, family, and working colleagues. In the absence of relational support, women turned inward, as Jabu explains in the following extract:

I would say there is nobody who is specific that you would tell your problems to solve it for you. Or if maybe there is somebody who notices that there is something that eats

you inside then she would come to you and ask if there is anything wrong, you then tell her what is wrong you then become free of that. But if there is nobody who has noticed that there is something wrong with you, you just keep quiet until you become calm. (Jabu, I2, L182- 186).

4.6.3 Lack of cohesion.

While all the traders highlighted the supportive aspects of their individual markets and wider systems of interaction, there were specific factors that hindered further communal cohesion and social support within these layers of interaction. Of these factors, the most significant issue was the presence of multiple communities to which one could belong, and through subscribing to one group, you excluded yourself from another. This is an aspect of community, which Smith (2001) highlights as a challenge, especially when it becomes difficult to distinguish where these boundaries begin and end. For example, Zama illustrates the conflicting position traders in her market incurred as they worked in the same geographical space, yet derived from different ethnic groups and home locations, causing conflict:

Most people who are selling incense are the people who are from Eastern Cape, there are few from Manguze. [Kwazulu Natal] so when they speaking about people who are selling incense they will say we are talking about the Mpondo's. And all who are selling particular white clay (umcako) they are from the same area called Ndwedwe. Ndwedwe falls under Kwa Zulu Natal. So there was that separation. (Zama, I2, L168-173).

Zama continued to highlight the racial ethnicity conflicts by saying, *I think it's because we are not the same ethnic group, there are Xhosa's, Mpondo's, Zulu's different kinds of ethnicity . There is racism happening* (Zama, I2, L145-146). Her reflections on racism are noteworthy as they reflect the fragmented nature of the Apartheid structure and highlight how racial friction continues to be a social barrier.

Another level of friction, located within the micro-systemic layer of interaction, was age related. As the younger women entered the work force, the older and more established traders took leadership positions and authority within the working environment. This often upset the younger, more democratically minded, traders who did not agree with the mindset and autocratic decisions made by the elder traders, as Jabu and Zama explain:

> *I don't know, but I think we don't take care about each other's opinions seriously we don't have the same mind. I think we look down on each other and if you are being dismissed from that place they don't care while they cannot buy food for your family if you are being dismissed. (Jabu, I2, L55- 58).*

> *Working in here is not right, especially to us the young traders because there are some of those people who are very oppressive towards us; it is as if we have no say whatsoever in some of the important issues affecting us.* (Zama, I1, L57- 59).

Zama continued to highlight the specific reasons why she felt the older traders made the decisions they did:

> *Old people can sell incense because their minds are not active any more to think about things that are happening in life. Their focus is [on] the money only. We face a lot of problems as young people. We see wrong things that the old people don't see, as long as they get the money because that is what they want. As young people we do not focus in the money only we also look at other good things in the community and ourselves*. (Zama, I2, L117- 122).

Zama's grievances highlight that despite the women in her community being unified through common trade and experiences; there is still internal lack of cohesion on the basis of age. The division between the older and younger women highlights how even within communities, smaller subgroups can exist in which members form bonds along separate lines of inclusion, beyond that of the wider group collectively.

Within the wider Warwick community, the difficulty of several trader based organizations and overlapping structures causes confusion amongst the traders. Furthermore, poor communication, administration, and organizational skills within these multilayer organizations were understood to be a factor hindering wider community cohesion. Pravina explains her difficulty in establishing her role in the exo-systemic support structures of Warwick Junction:

> *I think ehh the problem stems from where there maybe too many committees on the outside where the various selling sectors belong to various selling sector committees and I think that is where the problem seems to come in.* (Pravina, I2, L91- 94).

Ultimately, social support was a significant feature in the lives of the women who participated in this study. However, traders rarely approached City officials for any form of support highlighting. This is a noteworthy shift considering the active and supportive role local municipality have played in the past in the Warwick Junction community as highlighted through *Working in Warwick* (Dobson & Skinner, 2009).

Chapter 5- Conclusions

The primary aim of this study was to gain insight into the lives of women working in informal spaces and understand the challenges they face on a daily basis. The issues raised in the thematic analysis articulated the many facets of these women's lives and highlighted the most common and recurring themes in each woman's narrative. Most prominent, was the overwhelming sense of poverty and deprivation, which seemed to frame the women's narratives and define their sense of self, posing significant challenges both in their home and work areas. Poverty was more often than not, deep rooted within their childhoods, as they grew up under the discriminatory shadow of the Apartheid regime. Poverty underscored the ways in which political, "race" and gender implications impacted on the lens through which the women interpreted their roles in society.

It is within this context of poverty that several women took up the primary role in generating family income, often at the cost of their own dreams, and became involved in informal trading. However, the difficulties posed by poverty were constantly interwoven with stories of success, as the women recollected the ways in which they have coped through the most adverse situations. The role of community and social networks, specifically in the workspace, were key factors in the women's triumph over adversity as shown through the theme 'Support'. Workspaces were therefore portrayed as more than geographical locations, but rather supportive networks for many of the women, who identified with one another, allowing for a work community to be established not only within individual markets, but transcending across Warwick as a whole at a more macro level. The thematic analysis also highlighted the many nuances associated with informal street trade, and led to an

understanding of the way this sector operates. A significant portion of the women's narrative was dedicated to their 'Work', which was shown to be a meaningful component of their lives, but one that held many challenges. The most commonly discussed adversity associated with the workspace was the negative role of police and municipal interaction, which the women described as inconsistent and unjust through the way permit related issues were handled and regulated in 'Politics, police and permits'. The shared experience of 'being a woman' within this context, highlighted the challenges of motherhood, and the constant struggle against a patriarchal system which were significant aspects of all these participants' lives. It was evident how being a mother, and a grandmother is abundant with its own adversities yet simultaneously, the role of motherhood is highly cherished by the women, who live sacrificial lives to provide better futures for their children. The role of motherhood was shown to be an especially meaningful component of these women's lives, and was expressed with pride and optimism. Poverty, gender and motherhood along with their experiences of politics and policing were shown to be significant factors that united women in their individual markets and across Warwick as a whole.

Discrimination through socio-economic class and "race" were shown to be two dominant historical components that influenced each woman's experiences differently, and impacted significantly on the life trajectories, opportunities and experiences of the women who participated in this study. However, interestingly, their personal histories did not always incorporate the contextual history of Warwick or South Africa, as in many cases individual experiences over shadowed the broader socio-political events. This serves as a deliberate reminder that there is no single way in which people make sense of history regardless of how 'collective' an event may seem, and therefore the process of meaning making around

particular events or periods of history cannot be combined into one overarching meta-narrative (Dlamini, 2009).

The many challenges raised by the women reinforce Ife's claim that "*The three forms of oppression obviously interact and reinforce each other; thus to be an indigenous woman in poverty is to be terribly disadvantaged"* (Ife, 2002, p. 59). This research showed that, it is the collaborative and supportive aspects of community that has allowed Warwick traders to survive through the decades. Through the course of this research these women's life stories have been recorded as a meaningful part of Warwick Junction's history. The hope from here, is that their voices will be continue to be heard through the tales they have told, long after their time in Warwick has passed. Furthermore, their stories can become resources in encouraging collaborative and transformative change in Warwick Junction, and be drawn upon in government's approach towards creating a better supported and recognized informal sector.

The focus of future research should explore the ways in which the women's life stories have been specifically shaped or influenced by the geographical and historically significant space in which they work. Narrative analysis of the women's stories would reveal the ways in which the chronological events occurring in Warwick may or may not have impacted on the lives of those who work there and would provide insight on the ways in which individuals influence, and are influenced by the social spaces in which they interact. A chronological mapping of the women's narratives in relation to significant events that have occurred during there lifetime would provide interesting data on the ways in which these women individually and collectively as Warwick traders, have been impacted by the meta-narrative of Warwick and South Africa. Furthermore, the women's many hours within their working communities may have a significant impact on how they conceptualize their identity in relation to

'community', and further research can seek to understand the reciprocal nature of community and individual identity, especially in relation to the development of characteristics such as resilience. The ways in which the individual contributes to a resilient community, and the ways in which a cohesive community contributes towards increasing resilience in the individual are foci for further research. Rooted in contexts of poverty, the women in this study recalled several experiences of ongoing and recurring trauma. More research needs to be done to understand the impact this has on their psychological wellbeing, especially in relation to exposure to multiple traumatic incidents.

This research showed high levels of stress associated with the women's interaction with police and local authority. Future research should seek to understand the volatile relationship between traders and local authority and seek ways in which this relationship can be improved for the betterment of the traders. New research from this stance would be particularly relevant given the recent Warwick Mall incident and the ways in which regulation of the informal sector may have both negative and positive consequences.

This research attempted to gain a holistic understanding of the lives of women working in the informal sector. Through exploring their narratives insight was gained into the challenges and adversities that affect them on a daily basis both in the work space and their home spaces. Common and recurring themes highlighted the most prominent issues that impact on their lives, and exposed the difficulty of managing what Billington et al (1998) refers to as the dual "work script" of working women. Their occupation in informal trading draws the women out of their homes and home communities for extended periods of time, making the balance between motherhood and trader an ongoing struggle. This was especially expressed in relation to concern over the added responsibility of caring for grandchildren when parents

were absent or had passed away. The burden of responsibility endured by these women was met with very little macro support and the role of local authorities and government was discussed with frustration and ambivalence. Fractured relationships between local authority and informal street traders resulted in many women referring with nostalgia to interactions with local authorities of the past. However, despite the challenges the informal sector posed, several women spoke appreciatively of their occupations, as trading created opportunity for income generation that would enable the women to educate their own children beyond the realm they themselves had been educated. This was especially important, as education was seen as leverage out of the informal sector and a means to escape the binds of poverty and marginalization, which had trapped these women in this research so resolutely. The hope is that is this research has added to the limited field of inquiry surrounding the informal sector, which has largely centred on economical research. By adopting a psychological viewpoint, hearing the women's life stories contributes to further insight into the understanding of the challenges surrounding gender, class and 'race' within this continually increasing sector of South Africa, and creates a platform for further research to continue exploring the lives of these marginalized women.

References

Andrews, M., Squire, C., Tamboukou, M. (2008). *Doing Narrative Research*. London: Sage.

Andvig, J. (2001). Family-Controlled Child Labor in Sub-Saharan Africa A Survey of Research. Social Protection Discussion Paper Series: No. 0122. Retrieved October 29, 2011, from http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Child-Labor-DP/0122.pdf

Bealle, J. (2009). Decentralizing government and decentralizing gender in A.M. Goetz (Ed.), *Governing Women*, (pp. 188). New York: Routledge.

Billington, R., Hockey, J., & Strawbridge, S. (1998) *Exploring self and society*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Bradshaw, D., Schneider, M., Dorrington, R., Borne, D., & Laubscher, R (2001). South African cause of death profile in transition -1996 and future trends. *SAMJ*. 92, 8. pp. 618-623. Retrieved November, 21, 2011, from http://archive.samj.org.za/2002%20VOL%2092%20Jan-Dec/Articles/08%20August/1.15%20SOUTH%20AFRICAN%20CAUSE-OF-DEATH%20PROFILE%20IN%20TRANSITION%20-%201996%20AND%20FUTURE%20TRENDS.%20D.%20Bradshaw,%20M..pdf

Branaman, A. (2001). *Self and society*. Massachusetts: Blackwell Publishers.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006) Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology.* 3, pp. 77-101.

Brendtro, L., Brokenleg, M., & Bockern, S. (1990). *Reclaiming youth at risk: Our hope for the future.* Indiana: National Educational Service.

Bronfonbrenner, U. (1994). Ecological models of human development. In *International Encyclopaedia of Education*, 2nd Ed, 3, 37-49. Retrieved October, 29, 2011, from http://www.psy.cmu.edu/~siegler/35bronfebrenner94.pdf

Broughton, T. (July 30, 2009). Market stays open…for now. *Mercury*, p. 3.

Burman, E. (1994). Poor children: charity appeals and ideologies of childhood. Changes: *An International Journal of Psychology and Psychotherapy*, 12, 1, pp. 29-36. Retrieved October 16, 2011, from http://webcache.googleusercontent.com/search?q=cache:dJ8k1CS48JwJ:www.discourseunit.com/publications_pages/burman_papers/1994+EB+Changes+poor+children.doc+International+Journal+of+Psychology+and+Psychotherapy,+12,+1,+p+29-36.&hl=en

Chen, M., Jhabvala, R., & Lund, F. (2001). Supporting workers in the informal economy: A policy framework. *ILO Task Force on the Informal Economy for WIEGO*. [Electronic version].

Collinson, M., Tollman, S., Khan, K., & Clark, S. (2003). Highly prevalent circular migration: Households, mobility and economic status in rural South Africa. Paper prepared for Conference on *African Migration in Comparative Perspective*, *Johannesburg, South Africa, 4-7 June, 2003.* Johannesburg, South Africa: University of Witwatersrand.

Coon, D., & Mitterer, J. (2007) *Introduction to Psychology*. United States of America: Thomson Wadsworth.

Crites, S. (1986). Storytime: Recollecting the past and projecting the future, in Sarbin, T.R. (ed.) *Narrative Psychology: The storied nature of human conduct*.

Denzin, N and Lincoln, Y. (1994). *Handbook of qualitative research*. Michigan: Sage publications.

de Klerk, A. (2011, November, 04). Giving the sidelined a voice. *Mail and Guardian Online.* Retrieved November, 21, 2011, from http://mg.co.za/printformat/single/2011-11-04-giving-the-sidelined-a-voice/

de Klerk. F. (1991). *Business Act No.71 of 1991*. Retrieved November, 28, 2011 from http://www.ehrn.co.za/download/act_business.pdf

Dlamini, J. (2009). *Native Nostalgia*. Auckland Park, South Africa: Jacana Media.

Dobson, R., & Skinner, C, (2009). *Working in Warwick: including street traders in urban plans*. Durban: School of Development Studies, University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Eidelberg, P. (1999). Guerrilla Warfare and the Decline of Urban Apartheid: The Shaping of a New African Middle Class and the Transformation of the African National Congress (1975-1985). *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East, 19, 1, pp. 53-64. Retrieved November 12, 2011 from* *http://cssaame.com/issues/19_1/4eidelberg.pdf*

Faith, C. (1995). The challenge of ancestor worship in Africa. Unknown Thesis. Pretoria: University of Pretoria. Retrieved 05, January, 2012, from http://upetd.up.ac.za/thesis/available/etd-05272008-141650/unrestricted/02chapter3.pdf

Fay, B. (1996). Contemporary philosophy of social science. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

Fox, B. (1988). Conceptualizing 'patriachy'. *Society and Anthropology*, 25(2) pp. 163-182.

Francisco, R. (2001). What do we know and where do we go from here? In *Conference on repression and mobilization*, 21 – 24 June, 2001 (pp. 1- 22). Maryland, USA: University of Maryland. Retrieved November, 27, 2011 from http://www.cidcm.umd.edu/mobandrep/papers/francisco.pdf

Global jobs pact policy brief (brief No. 3). (2010). [pdf], Retrieved January 26, 2011, from www.ilo.org/jobspact

Gouws, A. (2010). Feminism in South Africa today: Have we lost the praxis? *AGENDA*, 83, pp. 13- 23.

Gready, P. (1990). The Sophia town writers of the fifties: The unreal reality of their world. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 16, pp. 139-164. Retrieved January, 05, 2012, from JSTOR database.

Grest, S. (2002). Urban citizenship and legitimate governance: The case of the greater Warwick Avenue and Grey Street urban renewal project, Durban. *Transformations*, pp. 38-48.

Guba, E and Lincoln, Y. (1994). Competing paradigms in qualitative research, in Lincoln, Y and Denxin, N (Eds.) *Handbook of qualitative research*. Michigan: Sage publications.

Gumede, M. (2011, February 25). Public resistance, legal action by traders lead to plans for a mall on market site being put aside. *The New Age*. Retrieved April 5, 2011, from http://www.thenewage.co.za/Detail.aspx?news_id=11375&cat_id=1010

Harris, A. (2003). From suffragist to apologist: The loss of feminist politics in a politically correct patriarchy. *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 4(2) pp. 1 -17.

Hassim, S. (1991). Gender, social location and feminist politics in South Africa. *Transformations*, vol. 15. [pdf].

Herman, J. (1992). *Trauma and recovery: From domestic abuse to political terror.* USA: Basic Books.

Horn, Z. (2009). *No cushion to fall back on.* Retrieved February 4, 2011, from http://www.wiego.org/gec_study/gec_1.php

Hunter-Gault, C. (2001). Inside Africa: Soweto uprising remembered. *CNN* Retrieved November 18, 2011, from http://articles.cnn.com/2001-06-15/world/inside.africa_1_hector-peterson-antoinette-sithole-afrikaans?_s=PM:WORLD

Ife, J. (2002). *Community Development*. Australia: Longman Pearson Education Australia.

Kaminer, D., & Eagle, G. (2010). *Traumatic Stress in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Kandiyoti, D. (1988). Bargaining with patriarchy. *Gender and Society*, 2(3) pp. 274-290.

Karumbidza, B. (2011). Criminalizing the livelihoods of the poor: the impact of formalizing informal trading on female and migrant trades in Durban. [Electronic version]. *SERI Research Report.* Retrieved November 15, 2011 from http://www.seri-sa.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=17&Itemid=29

Killigan, B. (2004). Risk and resilience. In R Pharoah (ed.), A generation at risk? HIV/AIDS, vulnerable children and security in Southern Africa (pp. 33-64). *ISS Monograph* No. 109. December 2004.

Lund, F. (1998, September). *Women Street Traders in Urban South Africa: A Synthesis of Selected Research Findings. CSDS Research Report No 15*. Retrieved January 28, 2011, from http://www.wiego.org/program_areas/urban_policies/.

Lee, S. (2004). *Assessing the vulnerability of women street traders to the HIV/AIDS: A comparative analysis of Uganda and South Africa*. [pdf]. Retrieved May 5 2011, from http://www.heard.org.za/heard-resources/assortment

Mama, A. (1995). *Beyond the masks*: Race, gender and subjectivity. London: Routledge.

Markets of Warwick. (2010). [www].Retrieved January 17, 2011 from www.marketsofwarwick.co.za

Maylam, P. (1983). The "Black Belt": African squatters in Durban 1935 – 1950. *Canadian Journal of African Studies*, 17, (3) pp. 413-428, Retrieved January 12 2012, from http://abahlali.org/files/Maylam%201983%20Black%20Squatters%20in%20Durban%201935-50.pdf

McLanahan, S. (1983). Family structure and stress: A longitudinal comparison of two-parent and female headed families. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 45, 2, pp. 347-357. Retrieved November, 21, 2011, from Jstor Database.

Mbewa, S. (2009, November 19) Upgrade, no mall. *Daily News*. p. 3.

Morrell, R. (2007). Men, masculinities and gender politics in South Africa: A reply to Macleod. *Pins,* (35) pp. 15-26.

Naidoo, K. (2005). The 'politics of poverty' in a post-apartheid South African metropolis. *African Sociological Review*, 9(2) pp. 55-78. Retrieved January 03 2012, from http://www.ajol.info/index.php/asr/article/viewFile/23261/19941

Ndlovu, S. (2009, July 30,). Plans to boycott stores signed for market mall. *The Mercury*, p. 3.

Ngwane, T. (July 22, 2009). ANC administration sows seeds of racial discord. *The Mercury*. Retrieved May 3, 2011 from http://www.themercury.co.za/index.php?fArticleID=5093475

Osalor, P. (2011) The Informal economy and entrepreneurial development. *Vanguard Online Edition*. Retrieved January 23, 2011, from http://www.vanguardngr.com/2011/01/the-informal-economy-and-entrepreneurial-development/

Oyewumi, O. (2002). Conceptualizing gender: The Eurocentric foundations of feminist concepts and the challenge of African Epistemologies. *Journal of culture and African women studies,* 2(1) pp. 1-9.

Panday, S., Makiwane, M., Ranchod, C., & Letsoalo, T. (2009). Teenage pregnancy in South Africa: With a specific focus on school going learners. *South Africans Department of Education*. Retrieved October 21, 2011, from

http://www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=uIqj%2BsyyccM%3D&tabid=422&mid=1300

Panday, S., & Arends, F. (2008). School dropouts. *HSRC Review*. 6, 1. Retrieved October, 28, 2011 from http://www.hsrc.ac.za/HSRC_Review_Article-82.phtml

Piot, P., Bartos, M., Ghys, P., Walker, N., & Schwartlander, B. (2001).The global impact of HIV/AIDS [Electronic version]. *Nature*, 410, pp. 968-973. Retrieved November 21, 2011, from http://www.lrz.de/~ces/natureHIV.pdf

Posel, D, (2001). What's in a name? Racial categorizations under Apartheid and their afterlife. *Transformation*, 47, pp. 50-74, Retrieved January 03 2012, from http://transformation.ukzn.ac.za/index.php/transformation/article/viewFile/841/656

Quasi, T. (2010). Investors in the Future, Drivers of Change Award 2011. *Asiye eTafuleni*. Retrieved November 12, 2011, from : http://www.aet.org.za/2011/11/investing-in-the-future-drivers-of-change-civil-society-award-2011/

R350m Mall in Durban halted. (2011, April, 13). *Property 24*. Retrieved October 18, 2011, from http://www.property24.com/articles/r350m-mall-in-durban-halted/13412

Round, J. (2009). *The boundaries between informal and formal work* [pdf]. Retrieved April 30, 2011 from http://www.beyondcurrenthorizons.org.uk/the-boundaries-between-informal-and-formal-work/

Sanpath, A. (2011, August 27). Unions may lower sights as strikes dwindle. *Independent Online.* Retrieved October 28, 2011, from http://www.iol.co.za/business/business-news/unions-may-lower-sights-as-strikes-dwindle-1.1126143

Sarbin, T.R (1986). Narrative as a root metaphor for Psychology, in Sarbin, T.R. (ed.) *Narrative Psychology: The storied nature of human conduct*.

Sathekge, B. (2011, October, 18). Big jump in informal jobs. *The New Age.* Retrieved October, 28, 2011, from http://www.thenewage.co.za/32228-1025-53-Big_jump_in_informal_jobs

Sindane, L. (2005). *Sophia town: recalling the loss*. Retrieved January 05, 2012, from http://www.southafrica.info/about/history/sophiatown50.htm

Situation and voices: The older poor and excluded in South Africa and India. (2002). *Population and Development Strategies Series*. Retrieved November, 21, 2011, from http://www.imsersomayores.csic.es/documentos/documentos/fnuap-situation-01.pdf

Skinner, C. (2009). Challenging city imageries: Street traders struggles in Warwick Junction. *AGENDA*, 81, pp. 101 – 109. Retrieved February 7, 2011 from http://www.streetnet.org.za/wpcontent/uploads/2010/06/Agenda82Carolineskinner.pdf.

Skinner, C., & Valodia, I. (2003). Local government support for women in the informal economy in Durban, South Africa. *International Journal of Politics, Culture and Society*, 16, (3), pp. 431-444.

Smith, M.K. (2001) *Local education. Community, conservation, action*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Squire, C. (2008). Experience-centred and culturally orientated approaches to narrative. In M. Andrews, C. Squire, &, M. Tamboukou (Eds.), *Doing Narrative Research* (pp. 41-61). London: Sage.

The Republic of South Africa. (2011). South African Government Service- Child support Grant. Retrieved October, 22, 2011, from http://www.services.gov.za/services/content/Home/ServicesForPeople/Socialbenefits/childsupportgrant/en_ZA

The Republic of South Africa. (1996). Human development index. *Statistics South Africa.* Retrieved November 21, 2011, from http://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/P0015/P00151980.pdf

The world's women 2010: Trends and statistics. (2010). *Department of economic and social affairs*. New York: United Nations. Retrieved January 25, 2011, from http://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/products/Worldswomen/WW_full%20report_color.pdf

Tshiqi, B. (2010, May 19). 11:01 News Broadcast. *East Coast Radio*. Retrieved April 03, 2011, from http://www.ecr.co.za/kagiso/content/en/east-coast-radio/east-coast-radio-search-results?search_keyword=Bongiwe%2C+T%2C+May+19th&pid=6028

Tudge, J., Gray, J., & Hogan, D. (1997). Ecological perspectives in human development: A comparison of Gibson and Bronfonbrenner. In J. Tudge, M. Shnahan, & J. Valsiner (Eds.). *Comparisons in human development: Understanding time and context* (pp. 72-105). New York: Cambridge University Press. Retrieved November, 21, 2011 from https://www.uncg.edu/hdf/facultystaff/Tudge/jt_eco.pdf

Vahed, G. (1999). A 'Public Health Nuisance': The Victoria Street Early Morning squatters market, 1910 – 1934. *South African Historical Journal*, 40(5), pp. 130- 153

Whiteside, A., and Regonde, I. (2011, October, 18) Where we stand on Aids. *The Mercury*, p. 6.

Williams, D., Gonzalez, H., Williams, S., Mohammed, S;.,Moomal, H., & Stein, D. (2008). Perceived discrimination, race ad health in South Africa. *Soc Sci Med* August; 67(3), pp. 441-452, Retrieved January 03 2012, from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2643465/pdf/nihms58873.pdf

Appendix 1

Interview question outline

Interview 1.

General introduction of myself and Lindiwe.

A broad narrative question will be posed:

Can you please tell me about your life, you may begin your story from any point you choose and include whatever you feel relevant?

Interview 2.

These questions are largely dependent on the issues, events and themes the participant chose to discuss in the first interview. General themes on Warwick Junction, informal trade as an occupation, and the role of gender may be probed deeper in his interview, for example:

<u>Historical questions:</u>

Has Warwick Junction changed over the years since you started working here?

Has the City of Durban changed since you started working here?

What do you think the future of Warwick Junction holds?

What do you think the significant of Warwick Junction is for Durban?

What interaction do you have with other informal traders in the greater Durban district?

What do you remember of the year 1994?

Tell me about the current debates in Warwick junction.

Occupational questions:

Where do you live?

How long does it take you to travel to work?

Do you travel to work everyday?

When did you begin trading in Warwick Junction?

Have you ever done any other type of work?

How did you begin trading in Warwick Junction?

Has your work in Warwick Junction changed through the years?

What makes you feel secure at work?

What makes you feel insecure at work?

What is your relationship with the other women in your market?

Have you and the women in your market ever worked collectively to challenge or change something in or about your working area?

What do you see your future holding?

Who controls your income?

What is your income spent on?

Experiences:

Tell me about your experience of school?

How has being a woman influenced your position in this community?

Have you ever been involved in decision making in your market?

What has been the most memorable experience for you as an informal trader?

Family life:

Do you have a partner or spouse?

What is his/her occupation?

Does he/she stay with you?

What roles does he/she have in the household?

Does anyone else live in your home?

Who looks after your children?

Do you bring your children to work with you?

What do your children do?

What are your dreams for your children?

What do you want your children to know about your work space?

What do you do when you are not in the market?

Appendix 2: Letters of consent

Letter of consent (English).

University of Witwatersrand

1 Jan Smuts Avenue

Braamfontein 2000

Johannesburg,

South Africa

01 April, 2011

Dear

My name is Tamryn Coats, and I am a student at Witwatersrand University in Johannesburg. I am 23 years old and spent last year working with the NGO Asiye eTafuleni on the Markets of Warwick Project. I was inspired by the personal stories of the women working in Warwick Junction, so this year I am doing research on resilience in women in informal sectors. Researching resilience is exploring the ways that people cope through difficult situations.

As a woman working in Warwick Junction I would like to ask you to consider being involved in my research. Your name was suggested by the NGO Asiye eTafuleni. Your involvement would entail two interviews with a translator and me. The translators name is Hlengiwe Mdadane and she will conduct interviews in isiZulu. Hlengiwe is a youth-care worker who has been extensively involved in community work for over 20 years through a local Durban organization, Youth for Christ. She has specifically worked with women through being the Project Manager and Director of Tennyson House: home for girls.

The first interview will be very open ended, and I will ask you to talk to me about your life. You can speak of whatever you are comfortable sharing. The second interview will revolve around the topics you brought up in the first interview. Both interviews will take place at the NGO Asiye eTafuleni offices on Saturdays. The interviews will be audio recorded, and later transcribed. A report will be written based on all the interviews conducted. Direct quotations from your interview may be used in the report write up. The content of your interview will be kept confidential through the use of pseudonyms (name changes). You can withdraw from the research process at any time. Please be aware there will be no monetary or any other compensation for taking part in the research process.

If you are willing to share your story with me, and take part in the research please complete the slip below. I look forward to hearing from you.

Thank you for your time.

Tamryn Coats

I _____ agree to take part in the research of Tamryn Coats in 2011. I give my permission to be interviewed, and have my interview recorded and used in a research report.

_____ _____

Name Date

Letter of consent (isiZulu).

University of Witwatersrand

1 Jan Smuts Avenue

Braamfontein 2000

Johannesburg,

01 April 2011

Ngiyakubingelela

Igama lami ngingu Tamryn Coats ngifunda eNyuvesi yase Witwatersrand eGoli. Ngineminyaka ewu 23, ngonyaka odlule bengisebenzela iNGO ekuthiwa iAsiye eTafuleni ngohlelo olumayelana nezimakethe ezikuWarwick. Ngiye ngakhuthazwa izindatshana zabezifazane abasenza khona la eMakethe, yikho kulonyaka ngenza lolucwaningo olobhekene nezindlela abesifazane abakumabhizinisi aloluhlo abakwazi ukudlula kwizimo ezinzima abake bahlangabezana nazo. Locwaningo ke olokubona izindlela ezahlukene abantu abakwazi ngazo ukumelana nezimo ezilukhuni ezimpilweni zabo.

Njengomuntu wesifazane osebenzela la eWarwick Juction (Market) bengingathanda ukukumema ukuba ube ingxenye yalolu cwaningo. Igama lakho libe kuluhla lwamagama engilinikezwe yiNGO ekuthiwa iAsiye Etafuleni. Ukuba yingxenye kwakho yalolucwaningo lokho kusho ukuthi uzobonana nami ubuso nobuso izikhathi ezimbili ezihlukene. Igama lozositolikela uHlengiwe Mdadane uyena ozokwenza lolucwaningo ngolwimi lwesiZulu. uHlengiwe usesebenze kakhulu ezinhlelweni zomphakathi ikakhulu ulusha, iminyaka eyevile ku 20 phansi kwe nhlangano i Youth for Christ. Usesenze kakhulu nabesifazane ezinhlelweni ezahlukena eyiMenenja e Tennyson House: Ikhaya lamabesifazane abasebancane

Ucwaningo lokuqala luyobe luvulelekile, ngizokucela ukuthi ungixoxele ngempilo yakho.

Ungakhuluma noma ingani ongathanda ukungitshela yona. Kolwesibili ucwaningo ngiyobe sengikubuza imibuzo mayelana nongitshele khona kucwaningo lokuqala. Lonke ucwaningo luzobe lusemahovisi eNGO iAsiye eTafuleni ngemiqgibelo. Lolu cwaningo ke luzoqoshwa bese lubhalwa phansi. Luzobe selubhalwa phansi ngokwezinto ezitholakele ngesikhathi ucwaningo luqhubeka. Ngesikhathi ke lubhalwa phansi angeke kuze kusetshenziswe amagama akho angempela. Uma uzwa ukuthi ngenxa yesizathu esithile awusathandi ukuba ingxenye yalolucwaningo ungayeka nanoma inini. Ngicela ke ukuthi uqaphele ukuthi akukho imali ozoyithola ngokuba ingxenye yalolucwaningo.

Uma ungathanda ukuba ungixoxele ngempilo yakho futhi ube yingxenye yalolucwaningo ngicela ungcwalise imininingwane yakho ngezansi.

Ngiyakulangazelela kakhulu ukuhlangana nawe sixoxisane.

Ngiyabonga ngesikhathi sakho

Yimina

Tamryn Coats

I _____ Ngiyavuma ukuba yingxenye yalolu cwaningo luka Tamryn Coats ngonyaka ka 2011. Ngiyamnikeza imvume yokuba axoxisane nami ngalolucwaningo, futhi aqophe esizobe sikhuluma ngakho bese ekusebenzisa kwi *report* yocwaningo lwakhe.

Igama ----------

Usuku ----------