

https://dspace.org/

Social capital, civil society, and good governance: civic traditions in Johannesburg's shack settlements and Greater Pietermaritzburg's villages under chiefly rule

Hlela, Kenneth Siphelelo

2013-05-15
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/12725

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

SOCIAL CAPITAL, CIVIL SOCIETY, AND GOOD GOVERNANCE: CIVIC TRADITIONS IN JOHANNESBURG'S SHACK SETTLEMENTS AND GREATER PIETERMARITZBURG'S VILLAGES UNDER CHIEFLY RULE

Kenneth Siphelelo Hlela

SOCIAL CAPITAL, CIVIL SOCIETY, AND GOOD GOVERNANCE: CIVIC TRADITIONS IN JOHANNESBURG'S SHACK SETTLEMENTS AND GREATER PIETERMARITZBURG'S VILLAGES UNDER CHIEFLY RULE

Kenneth Siphelelo Hlela

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy to the School of Social Sciences in the Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg

Johannesburg, 2012

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. It is submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy to the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any other degree or examination in any University.

Kenneth Siphelelo Hlela

Johannesburg, 2012

DEDICATION

I dedicate this work to my family.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank all those who made it possible for me to successfully undertake this journey. Firstly, Tom Lodge whose guidance, encouragement, and support during the course of writing this thesis enabled me to develop an understanding of the subject matter. I would also like to thank him for introducing me to the concept of social capital and the seminal work of Robert Putnam. Secondly, Peter Hudson, who took over from Tom Lodge as my supervisor – I am very much indebted to him for having taken me through the final but critical phase, without his sharp intellect and tenacity I would not have been where I am today. In fact, I have been fortunate to have worked with two outstanding mentors, who complement each other so well, i.e. an empiricist and a theoretician. I am also indebted to the Department of Political Studies, which has been my academic home since my undergraduate years.

I would also like to thank, Steven Friedman, Thabo Rapoo, and Raymond Suttner who contributed significantly to my intellectual development while at the Centre for Policy Studies (CPS). Special thanks goes to Steven for affording me the opportunity to participate in the Institute for Development Studies (IDS) based Democratic Research Centre for the Future State (DRC) at the University of Sussex, Brighton in the United Kingdom, where some of the ideas for this work were developed while on a visiting fellowship during the months of September and October 2003 as well as the Director of the DRC, Mick Moore and his team. Appreciation is also due to Patrick Heller (Brown University, US) for introducing me to the Freedom Park case study, where I tested the applicability of the concept of social capital. I would also like to extend my gratitude to the outstanding librarians at the University of the Witwatersrand's Inter-Library Loans who always ensured that I got all the literature on social capital as well as Gerry Fraser at The Natal Witness newspaper, who was always willing to make photocopies of newspaper clippings at the newspaper's library. The assistance I received from the Umgeni Water and Indlovu Council staff is highly appreciated. Not forgetting S'bu Khuzwayo and his team at the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Traditional and Local Government Affairs (DTLGA) who were always helpful. Fazel Hoosen, Head of GIS/IT at the Municipal Demarcation Board for diligently customising the maps for my case studies after I had struggled for years to get maps of this quality.

This thesis would not have been possible without financial support from a number of sources. First, the University of Witwatersrand, which provided financial support for three years through the Post-Graduate Merit Award. Second, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida), which generously funded this thesis. Sida also provided funding for my fieldwork in KwaZulu-Natal and also supported me during a year-long unpaid

leave from CPS. This thesis would not have been completed without their generous financial support. I also worked closely during the inception of this thesis with Per Strand from Uppsala University in Sweden who was working on a Sida funded project on social capital. Lastly, I was able to undertake the Kliptown and Freedom Park case studies through work I did on the relationship between informality and citizenship under the banner of the DRC at IDS, which was funded by the British Department for International Development (DFID), while at CPS.

My family (i.e. both extended and nuclear) has always offered valuable support throughout my academic career. My wife, Selaelo Ramohlale, continued support and encouragement during the cause of writing up this thesis, is humbling to say the least and my daughter, Nandi Naledi and my son, Tumisho Wandile who have revived my fighting spirit. Deliberations I had with friends, Robert Obiyo and Juma Okuku about developmental challenges facing Sub-Saharan Africa provided a positive distraction. Last but not least, the communities of Freedom Park, Kliptown, Sweetwaters, Manyavu, and KwaXimba for sharing their life experiences with me, in spite, of their chaotic schedules caused by the de-industrialising economy; which has led to uncertainty as to where the next meal would come from.

ABSTRACT

This thesis explores the relationship between social capital/civil society and good governance/economic development both conceptually and empirically through case studies in the urban, rural, and peri-urban South Africa. As a starting point, this thesis attempts to answer the following six questions: How is social capital identifiable? Is its production exclusively confined to horizontally structured forms of associational life? Can peasant societies generate social capital? Do social capital networks accentuate divisions within communities between those who have access to authority and those without? Can political institutions play a role in producing social capital or does the enlargement of state authority take place at the expense of the associational networks which do produce social capital? And what kind of organisations in rural settings can best bridge sectional concerns and promote wider communities of trust? Can traditional existing political institutions be adapted to modern democratic requirements? I believe that in answering these questions I have gone some way in resolving some of the conceptual dilemmas identified by critics of the concept of social capital.

I was then in a position to test and explore two hypotheses. Firstly, I argue that there is a relationship between social capital (a product of civil society) and good governance as well as economic and democratic development. Secondly, I argue that positive social capital will be under-produced in societies in which there is a weak market economy, that is, where members of civil society do not have independent sources of income. I demonstrate that civil society, the state, and markets have a symbiotic relationship that they all have a role to play in the production of positive social capital.

This thesis employed various data collection methods in order to navigate around the case studies chosen for the purposes of this study, viz. individual and group interviews, focus groups, direct observations, research surveys, secondary literature, and local newspapers.

Evidence emanating from this thesis suggests that there is a vibrant civil society and, by implication, social capital in poorly resourced areas found in urban, peri-urban, and rural areas of South Africa, which has to some extent contributed to good governance as well as economic and democratic development. However, I conclude by arguing that the informalisation of the economy as well as high levels of unemployment in these areas certainly inhibit civil society from playing its important democratising and governance role since the production of positive social capital is constrained by this new reality.

KEY WORDS: social capital, civil society, civic engagement, democracy, leadership, good governance, networks, state, informal economy, civic associations, markets, and rural-urban divide.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration----------**iii**
Dedication----------**iv**
Acknowledgements----------**v**
Abstract----------**vii**
Table of Contents----------**viii**
List of Acronyms----------**ix**
Maps----------**xi**

SECTION I: INTRODUCTION AND LITERATURE REVIEW

Chapter One: Introduction: Setting the Scene----------1

Chapter Two: Social Capital, Civil Society, and Good Governance: A Conceptual Overview and Literature Review----------19

SECTION II: SOCIAL CAPITAL IN SHACK SETTLEMENTS

Chapter Three: Associational Life and Development in Freedom Park Shack Settlement, Johannesburg----------56

Chapter Four: Attitudes of Residents to Leadership and Association in Kliptown Shack Settlement, Johannesburg----------101

SECTION III: SOCIAL CAPITAL IN AREAS UNDER CHIEFLY RULE

Chapter Five: Declining Standards of Living and the State of Associational Life in Sweetwaters, Pietermaritzburg----------150

Chapter Six: Associational Life and Development in KwaXimba and Manyavu, Pietermaritzburg----------175

SECTION IV: GOOD GOVERNMENT, CIVIC ASSOCIATION AND CHALLENGES OF AN INFORMALISING ECONOMY AS WELL AS CONCLUDING REMARKS

Chapter Seven: Structural Constraints Facing Social Capital Producing Civil Society Associations and State's Attempts to Engender it----------203

Chapter Eight: Conclusions: Charting a Path into the Future----------247

Bibliography----------265

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AGM	–	Annual General Meeting
Aids	–	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ANC	–	African National Congress
ASDO	–	A building company based in Soweto
BEC	–	Branch Executive Committee
C	–	Comprehensive
CBD	–	Central Business District
CBO	–	Community Based Organisation
CLO	–	Community Liaison Officer
CoJ	–	City of Johannesburg
Contralesa	–	Congress of Traditional Leaders of South Africa
Cosatu	–	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CP	–	Combined Primary
CPF	–	Community Policing Forum
CS	–	Civil Society
CSO	–	Civil Society Organisation
DA	–	Democratic Alliance
DC	–	Development Committee
DLGTA	–	Department of Traditional and Local Government Affairs (DTLGA)
DPIR	–	Development Planning and Inland Region
EPWP	–	Expanded Public Works Programme
Fawu	–	Food and Allied Workers Union
FC	–	Football Club
Fosatu	–	Federation of South African Trade Unions
HPP	–	Homeless People's Party
HIV	–	Human Immune Virus
HPF	–	Homeless People's Federation
GDE	–	Gauteng Department of Education
GKDF	–	Greater Kliptown Development Forum
IBF	–	Informal Business Forum
IDP	–	Integrated Development Plan
JDA	–	Johannesburg Development Agency
IFP	–	Inkatha Freedom Party
JS	–	Junior Secondary
KLA	–	KwaZulu Legislative Authority
KZN	–	KwaZulu-Natal
LP	–	Lower Primary
LPM	–	Landless People's Movement
MEC	–	Member of Executive Committee
MKMVA	–	Umkhonto we Sizwe Military Veterans Association
MP	–	Member of Parliament
NB	–	National Body
NGO	–	Non-Governmental Organisation

NSM	–	National Social Movement
Numsa	–	National Union Metalworkers of South Africa
PCD	–	People Centred Development
PR	–	Proportional Representation
PSC	–	Project Steering Committee
PTA	–	Parent Teachers Association
PWP	–	Public Works Programme
RAWSP	–	Rural Areas Water and Sanitation Plan
RDP	–	Reconstruction and Development Programme
S	–	Secondary
SACC	–	South African Council of Churches
SACP	–	South African Community Party
Sactwu	–	Southern African Clothing and Textile Workers Union
Sanco	–	South African National Civic Organisation
SC	–	Steering Committee
SEWU	–	Self Employed Women's Union
SGB	–	School Governing Body
SMO	–	Social Movement Organisation
Sopa	–	Socialist Party of Azania
TA	–	Traditional (Tribal) Authority
TAC	–	Treatment Action Campaign
UDF	–	United Democratic Front
UDM	–	United Democratic Movement
UEC	–	Urban-Econ Consortium
WC	–	Water Committee
WSC	–	Water Services Committee
WSA	–	Water Services Authority

MAPS

1. Freedom Park
2. Kliptown
3. City of Johannesburg
4. Sweetwaters
5. Manyavu/Ximba
6. Local Municipalities in KwaZulu-Natal