

https://dspace.org/

Challenges in the implementation of the upgrading of informal settlements programme (UISP): an evaluation of two Gauteng Metropolitan Municipalities

Bafo, Pumla Sithandiwe

2016-09-13
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/21027

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

DECLARATION

I declare that this Research Report is my own unaided work. It is being submitted to the Degree of Master of the Built Environment in Housing to the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or Examination to any other University.

_____

Signature

_____ day of _____, _____

ABSTRACT

One of the most critical housing issues of concern today is the continued proliferation of informal settlements and the failure of government to meet the housing demand. Party to the United Nations Millennium Development Goals, which includes the goal to improve the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers by 2020 introduced the Upgrading of Informal Settlements Programme (UISP). Despite the introduction of this new paradigm shift, its implementation has been minimal. This report investigates: if metropolitan municipalities are implementing the programme and the underlying challenges faced by municipalities in implementation. The study points to the importance of the 5 crucial variables: Policy content, context, commitment, capacity and coalitions and clients in implementation.

The research made use of qualitative methods, which included literature review of books, academic and media articles. The people interviewed comprised of political leaders, both senior and junior officials of the Municipalities and former employees of the City of Johannesburg, all tasked with informal settlement intervention implementation. The data collected was analysed using cross comparison between the various municipal officials' responses, evaluating officials' interpretation against policy interpretation, analysing the complexities of the policy, teasing out the comparisons, summarising data in order to make sense of what has been collected, identifying and classifying key concepts that emerge from the interviews, sorting data obtained through semi-structured interviews into smaller units in order to interpret how the two municipalities interpret and implement the programme (Gray, 2004:210),

categorising data in order to understand the funding mechanisms used by the various municipalities and using the key concepts for descriptive analysis.

Based on the findings of the study it was concluded that the Municipality has not been implementing UISP as per the housing code, however it has been utilising formalisation as an intervention in its informal settlement. The findings of the current study provide answers to the guiding research questions on whether municipalities are implementing UISP and interventions within the two municipalities. The conclusion is that both municipalities are not implementing UISP. However they have their own interventions which are biased toward the realities of project managers rather than the organized informal settlement communities thus disconnecting from the premise of UISP.

The envisaged limitation was getting hold of municipal officials as this research was conducted in the first quarter of the new financial year and municipal officials were engaged in strategic meetings. This is an unfortunate limitation that could not be avoided therefore interviews especially in EMM were not carried out as planned but as and when the contact persons were available. This resulted in only 5 officials being interviewed as compared to the anticipated number. Secondly, one of the municipalities that the research was conducted on was reluctant to give out information.

This report is dedicated to my beautiful kids Yandisa, Petunia and Siyabonga “the adorable ones”...I LOVE YOU DEARLY.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

There are no words to match my gratitude, I am thankful to a number of people for their continued support and in making this research possible.

First and foremost, all praises and Honour to My Heavenly Father, without Him this would not have been possible.

I would like to thank my supervisor, Neil Klug, for always finding time in his demanding schedule to offers positive comments and advise. I am grateful for his input which enabled me to conclude this report.

I am really indebted to the Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality officials who offered me the opportunity to conduct interviews. Your assistance was really appreciated.

A special thanks to all my colleagues from the City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality, who participated in my interviews. Thank you so much.

A special thank you goes out to all my friends who supported me. Thank you for your support and jokes when I needed them most. Indeed one mission has been accomplished. May the almighty bless you all “Nginithandanonke”

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENT	Page
DECLARATION	i
ABSTRACT	ii
DEDICATION	iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	v
TABLE OF CONTENT	vi
LIST OF FIGURES	ix
LIST OF TABLES	x
LIST OF ACRONYMS	xi
1. INTRODUCTION	
1.1 BACKGROUND	1
1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT	5
1.3 OBJECTIVE OF THE STUDY	6
1.4 RESEARCH QUESTION	8
1.5 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	9
1.5.1 DATA COLLECTION	12
1.5.2 DATA ANALYSIS	13
1.5.3 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	15
1.5.4 LIMITATIONS	15
1.6 STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT	15
2. PERSPECTIVES ON POLICY IMPLEMENTATION	
2.1 INTRODUCTION	17
2.2 EVOLUTION OF PUBLIC POLICY IMPLEMENTATION RESEARCH	18
2.2.1 TOP-DOWN APPROACH	19
2.2.2 BOTTOM-UP APPROACH	20
2.3 THE 5C PROTOCOL	22
2.3.1 CONTENT	24
2.3.2 CONTEXT	25
2.3.3 COMMITMENT.....	25
2.3.4 CAPACITY	26
2.3.5 CLIENTS AND COALITIONS	26
2.4 CONCLUSION	27
3. THEORIES UNDERPINNING INFORMAL SETTLEMENT INTERVENTIONS	
3.1 INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE	28
3.2 LAISSEZ-FAIRE.....	28

3.3 SELF HELP HOUSING …… 30
3.4 SITE AND SERVICE SCHEME …… 32
3.5 UPGRADING STRATEGIES IN THE 1980S …….. 33
3.6 SECURITY OF TENURE AND ENABLING APPROACH TO SLUMS …… 34
3.7 INTERVENTIONS POST CITIES WITHOUT SLUMS ACTION PLAN …… 34
3.8 CONCLUSION …… 36

4. INFORMAL SETTLEMENT PERSPECTIVE IN SOUTH AFRICA
4.1 INTRODUCTION …… 37
4.2 PERSPECTIVE ON SOUTH AFRICAN INTERVENTIONS …… 41
4.2.1 UPGRADING OF INFORMAL SETTLEMENT PROGRAMME …… 50
4.3 NATIONAL UPGRADING SUPPORT PROGRAMME …… 54
4.4 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK …… 59
4.5 CONCLUSION …… 62

5. IMPLEMENTATION IN THE CITY OF JOHANNESBURG METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY (COJMM)
5.1 INTRODUCTION…… 65
5.2 INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS IN COJMM …… 66
5.3 THE COJMM'S INFORMAL SETTLEMENT INTERVENTION …… 69
5.4 IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS …… 73
5.5 *IN-SITU* UPGRADING PRINCIPLES AND POLICIES …….. 76
5.6 BUILDING PARTNERSHIPS …… 77
5.7 SURVEYS, REGISTRATIONS AND SECURITY OF TENURE …….. 78
5.8 THE PLANNING PROCESS …….. 80
5.9 FINANCING UPGRADING ……. 82
5.10 DESIGN AND IMPLEMNTATION…… 83
5.11 MONITORINGAND EVALUATION …… 83
5.12 CONCLUSION…….. 83

6. IMPLEMENTATION IN EKURHULENI METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY (EMM)
6.1 INTRODUCTION…… 86
6.2 INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS IN EMM …… 87
6.3 THE COJMM'S INFORMAL SETTLEMENT INTERVENTION …….. 87
6.4 IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS …….. 89
6.5 *IN-SITU* UPGRADING PRINCIPLES AND POLICIES …….. 91
6.6 BUILDING PARTNERSHIPS …… 92
6.7 SURVEYS, REGISTRATIONS AND SECURITY OF TENURE …… 92
6.8 THE PLANNING PROCESS ……..…… 93
6.9 FINANCING UPGRADING ……..…… 94

6.10 DESIGN AND IMPLEMNTATION ……..… 94
6.11 MONITORING AND EVALUATION …….. 95
6.12 SUSTAINING IMPROVEMENT AND MONITORING AND EVALUATION … 95
6.13 CONCLUSION ……... 96

7. ANALYSIS OF IMPLEMENTATION INTERVENTIONS
7.1 INTRODUCTION …… 98
7.2 POLICY CONTENT …… 99
7.3 POLICY CONTEXT ……. 100
7.4 COMMITMENT …….. 101
7.5 CAPACITY ……..…….. 102
7.6 CLIENTS AND COALITIONS ……..……. 103
7.7 CONCLUSION ……..….. 105
8. CONCLUSION …… 109

REFERENCES ……..…….. 113

LIST OF FIGURES

	Page No.
Figure 1. Location of the study Areas	10
Figure 2: 5C protocol Source	*23*
Figure 3: NUSP Implementation Principles	61
Figure 4: Conceptualising the implementation process	62
Figure 5: Development Process	82
Figure 6: Southern portion of Vlakfontein Ext. 2	76

LIST OF TABLES

	Page No.
Table 1: Formalisation Categories	71

LIST OF ACRONYMS

BNG – Breaking New Ground

CBO – Community Based Organisations

COJMM – City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality

DoH – Department of Housing/Department of Human Settlements

EMM – Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality

FBO – Faith Based Organization

IDP – Integrated Development Plan

GDS – Growth and Development Strategy

NDoHS – National Department of Human Settlements

NGO – Non Governmental Organization

NUSP- National Upgrading Support Programme

RDP – Reconstruction and Development Programme

SDBIP – Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan

UISP – Upgrading of Informal Settlements Programme

RSA – Republic of South Africa