

https://dspace.org/

Editorial Policies and the development of isiXhosa :how is isiXhosa being developed in post-Apartheid South Africa by Private Print Media Institutions

Njeje, Mbuyekezo

2018

https://hdl.handle.net/10539/29150

Njeje, Mbuyekezo (2018) Editorial policies and the development of isiXhosa :how is isiXhosa being developed in post-Apartheid South Africa by private print media institutions, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, <http://hdl.handle.net/10539/29150>

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

Contents

Introduction 3

Chapter 1 6

1.1 Background 6

1.2 Rationale 7

1.3 Aim and Research Questions 17

Chapter 2 19

Theoretical Framework 19

2.1 Access 21

2.2 Eurocentricity and Coloniality 26

2.3 Diglossia 28

2.4 Policy Planning 31

2.5 Critical Political Economy 38

Chapter 3 41

Methodology 41

3.1 Triangulation Method 41

3.2 Interviews 42

3.3 Institutional Analysis 44

3.4 Content analysis 45

3.4.1 Qualitative Content Analysis 46

Chapter 3 49

Institutional analysis 49

Chapter 4 64

Overview of BONA and Isolezwe les'Xhosa 64

Chapter 5 73

5.1 Editorial Copy Analysis: A Closer Look 73

5.2 Interview Analysis....84
Conclusion....97
Reference List....101
Appendix 1....109
Interview 1....109
Siviwe Kulu....109
Interview 2....113
Nkosinathi Mafuta....113
Interview 3....117
Johannes Letsohla....117
Appendix 2....122
Press Code....122

Introduction

IsiXhosa print media has in the past played a very important role in raising political awareness among the native in the Cape colony, it succeeded at many times but before they could move on to the politics of the day they began with challenging the Christianity doctrine. All of this was done using and expressing themselves in isiXhosa as a result the isiXhosa retained and exercised its philosophical and intellectual aspects in expression of ideas. In this paper it will be demonstrated that isiXhosa print media is a far cry from its historical predecessors and that its demise is that it was never owned and controlled by the Africans who contributed to the content of the newspaper. For instance *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* was owned by Lovedale press missionary press, its breakaway predecessor *Imvo Zabantsundu* was funded by a white liberal who was a good friend of John Tengo Jabavu. Up until the demise of isiXhosa print media in 1973 with the last publication of *Imvo Zabantsundu*, there only remained one print medium in isiXhosa in the name of *BONA* magazine. A magazine that went to challenge *DRUM* magazine as it catered for the African audience in isiZulu initially and later on isiXhosa. As Khuzwayo (2010) analysed the two magazine the only difference was that one was written in indigenous languages the other was written in English. Otherwise they were all about music, sex and drugs they did not differ in that respect. In 1964 a major change that would prove to be detrimental to the independence of African languages thought in the production direction of content happened.

The magazine was sold to Republic Press and it was now translated from English to isiZulu, isiXhosa and Sesotho a new edition. It is here where the change in policy is demonstrated as the indigenous languages were stripped of their thought in production of the magazine therefore the urgency was stripped. It is evident that the change in policy by this conglomerate media company was not to develop the languages but to exploit them. It shall be demonstrated and it will be clear in in this paper as to how through the policies of Independent News Media and Caxton they stifle isiXhosa and other two indigenous languages. Their policies reduced indigenous languages to artificial minorities within the institutions and yet the print texts serve a larger audience than the European languages namely English and Afrikaans. This is one indication that there is no development aspect in this approach as there is only one conceptualisation process happening in one language. The publication of isiXhosa was not made to aid the revival of isiXhosa print media but to exploit the language (Quijano: 2007). These policies are under pinned by colonial practices that have

been perpetuated by these institutions in the treatment of African languages this is because they are owned by white or Europeans therefore the outlook will be Eurocentric.

It will also be discussed as to how isiXhosa print media has been abandoned by the so called black elites who have been created through the BEE scheme in an attempt to rewrite the economic injustices of the past. It is through this policy accompanied by the GEAR programme which are very neo-liberal that these black elites did not even investigate into investing in. from the history of the isiXhosa print media it has proved to be a lucrative business if one is to look at it that way. The recent production of *Isolezwe les'Xhosa* is proof that they need as business men to invest in indigenous print media sector and it has proved to be profitably sustainable if one is to look at the case of Ilanga it has been continuously been in print since its inception in 1901. It has gone through various ownership but it managed to be relevant and influential throughout the changes. However, the black elites will be shown as to how they are blinded by the gleam of BEE and other policies that enable them to accumulate personal wealth quickly. These policies will be shown as to how seductive they are so as to make people move away from creating a self-sustaining business that is free of European influence.

The editorial policy implements or enforces the conduct of the institution and its workers in this case the journalists and the translators of the two institutions in question Independent News Media and Caxton they will be analysed using the institutional analyses approach. This will show which policy do these two institutions are guided by in their manner of working. And whether do their policies address the presence of isiXhosa print publications as they are one of the major publications that they have. The progress of these publications within the institutions is that they are burdened by the Eurocentric culture and they find themselves forced to assimilate into a culture that does not necessarily respect them as independent languages. Capable of expressing thought independently of guidance from the matrix language of the institution, if there are editorial policies in these institutions they must express this idea for if they do not it simply means that they are being burdened by the matrix language in this case. This level of autonomy is important for isiXhosa to exercise as a language in expressing thought and ideas around all subjects. Translation is the transferring of knowledge from one language to the other, this can arguably not be said to be classified as knowledge production for the knowledge that is being transferred has been in existence for a certain period of time. By this I mean to point out that *BONA* magazine is not necessarily in

the production of knowledge in isiXhosa, the language is just a vehicle that carries information and knowledge from English to isiXhosa.

What is unfortunate is that the content *BONA* is not necessarily new information or revolutionary information that cannot and has not been conceived and expressed in isiXhosa. What this magazine is involved in is language preservation not development per se for when we look at *Isolezwe Les'Xhosa* a newspaper it is in the business of knowledge production through its content this is demonstrated in the chapter of content analysis. The two publications are using two drastically different approaches to isiXhosa print language media they might be seen as fulfilling the same purpose but they are not. The audience is deluded into thinking that *BONA* magazine is not a translated these views are reflected in the interviews that I did with the translators at Caxton Media. To say that isiXhosa print media is a former shadow of itself is an understatement as these attempts as valuable as they are it has to be pointed out that in the first era of isiXhosa print media. There were a lot of sympathisers who did not exercise tight control through policies and they were lenient. This is understandable as back then the masses were not literate in isiXhosa they could not read and write the language they could only speak the language. It was mostly the intellectuals and few literate natives who could read isiXhosa, this means that they did not have access to the masses of isiXhosa speakers like in the current era for in this era basic education is mandatory and widely available. Hence the audience is bigger than in the first era the media companies will look to translate this audience base into a profit hence they emphasize that they are a business.

Chapter 1

1.1 Background

African language print media in South Africa began with isiXhosa newspaper media that was started by missionaries to aid the conversion of natives to Christianity. This means that one cannot discuss the African language media without talking about isiXhosa press media (Salawu: 2015). As stated above its was mainly religious newspapers that were dominant in the 1830's-1870's, *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* was the first Xhosa newspaper to radically shift from a religiously driven content to a politically conscious and active newspaper as the editorial control was now in the hands of the Xhosa intellectuals. The radical political outlook was in reaction to the blatant racist bigotry of the time and many intellectuals contributed to the content and rise of the newspaper (Kaschula:2006) and (Salawu: 2015). It should be noted that the missionary phase is the first phase; the second phase is the political phase the one that has been alluded to above and this is the most crucial phase of isiXhosa media (Salawu: 2015). The political phase can also be seen as the rebellion phase as the Xhosa intellectuals moved away from the conversion mission to the politicising mission (Kaschula: 2006).

The political Phase saw the collaboration of the Xhosa intellectuals with the white liberals who helped to fund new newspapers that broke away from *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* and started *Imvo Zabantsundu.* It is here where we begin to see and realise that Xhosa newspapers most of them were never 100% black owned, just like the missionary newspapers which were owned and control by the different mission stations the pattern and trend never ceased in the first phase it continued to the second phase (Salawu: 20132). The same cannot be said with other indigenous language newspapers like the isiZulu and Setswana with *Ilanga* and *Koranta ea Becuana*, respectively. The pattern seem to be more prevalent in isiXhosa newspaper media of the time for John Tengo Jabavu broke away from *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* to start with a white lawyer who was the son of a priest at the Lovedale mission (Salawu: 2013). Even though *Imvo Zabantsundu* was owned and controlled by blacks therefore independent it had the desired effects and was successful in influencing the political participation of the black elite and the literate average man who were the organic intellectuals (Switzer: 1997). The second phase of isiXhosa literature represented the beginning of a permanent shift in consciousness among the Xhosa Bourgeoisie, intellectual class from

religious to political and to some degree economic (Switzer: 1997). Even in the education of the Africans it was moved away from the missionary, religiously centred education to ind

ependent and black controlled schools and higher education (Switzer: 1997).

It is clear from above that the Xhosa audience that read and supported *Imvo Zabantsundu* was a politically and economically sophisticated audience that had aspirations of an independent Africa something that was very rare at the beginning of the 20th century (Switzer: 1997).

1.2 Rationale

The way post-Apartheid media is structured it has not changed from the previous dispensation as the new democratic government has adopted the same structure and system of distributing news content and entertainment. This is especially true with broadcast media and the above statement is more appropriate and applicable to broadcast media. Print media however is not structured the same way as broadcast media as print media is mostly independent and privately owned. It is in this space where isiXhosa print media has lost its once powerful voice and footing in South African politics since then it has ceased to exist and therefore it has been the English language that has been dominating the discourse of the politics in South Africa. In the print media in South Africa there is an aggressive push for raising profits by all means and this means that they are constantly looking to different avenues that will be potentially profitable for their businesses.

African language print media has provided and has been that option of being a profit rising alternative for the media conglomerates and they have ventured into this territory that has been left to stagnate as far as growth is concerned. The stagnating of Xhosa media borderlines abandonment by those who were once the custodians of the isiXhosa newspaper sector that has played a big role in shaping modern South Africa. The target audience for a Xhosa newspaper suggests that it will be able to survive but then it is not solely the audience that determines a potential success of a newspaper those decisions are in the boardrooms of the media conglomerate in question. This control of media by economics means that the framework that governs the functioning and the way of life or rather the culture of the institution is adhered to. The framework that I am referring to is the editorial policy of the private media institutions that publish in isiXhosa which is Caxton Media and Independent News Media, who publish *BONA* magazine and *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* newspaper. The editorial policy is a mandate that governs a media company it also outlines the values of the company

abides by and these are political, economic, cultural and technological. The policy mandates how the people working in the organization should conduct themselves in their work for the organisation.

IsiXhosa publications within European owned institutions and therefore European policies cannot be discussed and analysed in isolation and independently of colonialism and Eurocentrism their ideas, influence and legacies as they are what informs the governing rules and the relationship between isiXhosa and English and Afrikaans (Quijano: 2000). The editorial policies of Caxton Media and Independent News Media should be understood and seen within the Eurocentric and colonial relations and framework as mentioned above, since the focus of the paper is isiXhosa a language that has an interesting relationship with colonial institutions and the manner in which it has been used by colonialists and within the colonial institutions like the missionary stations. This is where the relationship of isiXhosa and European and colonial institutions begin therefore it is the foundation in which the relationship was born that is between the superiority and the inferiority of the isiXhosa and English. The attitudes that informed this relationship has not disappeared or discarded off by these institutions they are still at play even in the contemporary society where Africans have and are still contributing to the demise and further demise of isiXhosa media they are unwitting collaborators.

Print media is independently and privately owned and it is not mandated by any superstructure to heed the call of developing the previously marginalised languages isiXhosa is amongst those languages. It is the state broadcaster that is mandated by the constitution to develop indigenous languages and therefore that is clearly articulated in their language policy in the editorial policy. The same cannot be said about the privately owned print media institutions as they do not articulate on the diversity of their publication and they do not articulate for language development particularly those who publish in isiXhosa they only boast about the number of copies they sell daily, weekly and monthly. Meaning they are about the bottom line of making profit and that is not a bad thing per se but they should at least contribute to the development of isiXhosa within the culture of the institution. So when the editorial policy is drafted it is drafted in the economic interests of the company and they seem to be the focal point of print media since they are a business after all. So the editorial policy is drafted with an economic outlook which is also Eurocentric, and a big clue that language equity and development is not on their agenda (Quijano: 2000). Therefore the

framework of an editorial policy Eurocentric, colonial and economic these are important factors and aspects to consider when discussing editorial policies. The usage and presence of isiXhosa in Caxton and Independent Media institutions is to serve capitalist interests of white power structures therefore they serve the capitalist purposes of the institutions (Quijano: 2000).

This economic outlook and Eurocentric outlook and practices does not appreciate isiXhosa as part of the institution and the institutional culture it is not incorporated hence it is stifled and suffocated within the Eurocentric culture and the capitalist outlook of the companies and its development is not accounted for nor is it articulated (Quijano: 2000). As things are nobody in these institutions is seemingly advocating for the growth of isiXhosa and the growth of isiXhosa is not eminent in their publications. All of this is happening because print media is not subject to strict regulations that inhibit the state broadcaster they are able to manoeuvre (Barnett: 2005). The private print media has not considered developing isiXhosa in the same framework as the SABC with its indigenous language in radio for they are well structured and the content that generated is not always in relation to the superstructure the content created is in African languages.

The position that isiXhosa print media is in the private space is the fault of the black elites who rather saw it being better to be accepted in white owned business structures than to start afresh and create their own business institutions. What is currently happening to isiXhosa publications in Caxton Media and Independent News Media as they left it to white power structures by the newly created black elites to make money out of these publications. The major problem that has been impeding black elites from resuscitating and creating an alternative isiXhosa print media is the creation of the Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) scheme that is supposedly meant to address the racial economic injustices against black people (Southall: 2004). The creation of the BEE has been a distraction as it only focused only on a few blacks who were going to be given all the benefits of whites who control the economy. Moeletsi Mbeki in Southall (p, 313: 2004) states that “the BEE scheme is a sham dreamed up by white capital to seduce the ANC away from nationalising the economy and hence produce a predatory black elite”. This has also carried on to the media business as it is also a lucrative avenue but the isiXhosa language of this avenue has seemingly been ignored as everyone is caught on the gleam of having part ownership in white owned companies and in some cases controlling the whole company (Southall: 2004). Economic policies like the

BEE provide a very limited de-racialisation of the economy and this has with all business sectors including media, the media especially does not need to be necessarily de-racialized within the context of isiXhosa print media it needs to be decolonised as in history there was a time were isiXhosa was all about the independence of Africans within a racist white society.

The above arguments are further strengthened by Quijano (2007) as he states that European culture has been made seductive, it gives access to power, that power has always been yearned by black people "it is a way of participating and later to reach the material benefits and power as the Europeans" (Quijano: 169, 2007). This seduction of European power structures represents the dominated imaginations of the Africans who see it better to be part of European power structures so to impede the cultural production of the dominated (Quijano: 2007). Black capitalism has been created in South Africa did not make any attempts to venture into the isiXhosa print media sector, as most of them went into the financial services, mining, and forestry as they are the most lucrative industries. All of this keeps going back to the prolonged legacy of colonialism by the white power structures as far as black businesses are concerned. Black capitalists have been and are still scrambling for minority ownership in white owned companies therefore losing focus on redeveloping a Xhosa print media sector. The reason for this might be because minority ownership in media companies to black people was not aggressively advocated for like these other industries it was just a secondary and mostly insignificant option for black capitalists.

The BEE scheme is not meant to challenge white economic domination but rather to protect it by creating a black elite bourgeoisie class who deliberately maintain white economic domination (Southall: 2004). This has in a way made sure that any attempts to bring back isiXhosa media are tightly shut before they could even be reconceived or reconceptualised by the black capitalists (Quijano: 2007). It therefore seems that isiXhosa print media cannot reproduce itself outside of European institutions and culture as it seems to always go back to the same institutions that do not serve its interests as far as language development is concerned the reason for this is economic (Quijano: 2007). The institutional culture of Eurocentric institutions is that the manner in which they 'assimilate' or integrate foreign languages like isiXhosa is just for appearances, it is nothing but a commodity that is disposable if it is not making the company profit. The colonial power dynamics are at play especially in the way that isiXhosa is viewed and used in the institutions they are not exactly part of the cultural structures and there is no need to develop an asset that is bringing in

money into the company the attitude is that of "if it is not broken do not fix it". In white owned media institutions the colonial practices of power relations cannot and are not easily discarded off as they are Eurocentric, under these styles of rule isiXhosa has no chance what so ever to be developed (Quijano: 2000). Compared to English and Afrikaans isiXhosa is inferior it is therefore an object of domination, exploitation and discrimination (Quijano: 2000).

The Black elites that were created through the BEE scheme have had the opportunity to own white own conglomerate media companies through the same scheme. And no single one of them has ever thought maybe introducing a newspaper in isiXhosa or any other indigenous language as that was not their priority. This is because they are caught up on the façade of being one of the black elites amongst the white elite counterparts as they are now on the same level of material possession ownership as their white counterparts. Case in point Cyril Ramaphosa was once the chairman of Johnnic Communications which owned most publications that are now under the Times Media Group (now Tiso Black Star) as the name of the company was later changed to Avusa. ([1] *www.pd**media**.org.za/pdf/**history**.doc.).* The Black elites are so caught up in their new acquisitions that they do not care about the development of indigenous language print media this is the demonstration of how powerful is the seduction of European culture that people want to be immersed in it than to challenge it. Another case is the case of Tokyo Sexwale's Mvelaphanda Group Limited was a major shareholder in the Avusa in 2010 and was also in a bid to take over the company in 2012 but that was halted as his motives were questioned as he was in running for the ANC presidency ([1] *www.pd**media**.org.za/pdf/**history**.doc).*

This was another opportunity by another black elite to develop indigenous language media but that was never conceived by any of them Tokyo Sexwale was blinded by the glamour of owning a white owned company with its many newspapers thus was seduced by European culture and they did get to see how powerful it is and the benefits that come with being part of the white power structures.

The editorial policies of Caxton Media and Independent News Media are more likely to be operating within the realm colonial power relations and Eurocentrism, as isiXhosa is most likely not appreciated as one of the marginalised languages. These are the factors in which an editorial policy and they cannot be divorced from the institutions themselves in the same

manner as the SABC editorial policy cannot be divorced from the constitution as it the that informs and guides the manner in which it is drafted. Questions arise as to what might be the status of isiXhosa, as policy making is political and economic in nature and if there is to be a less appreciated language that will be reflected in the policy (Jernudd and Neustupny: 1987). If the nature of language planning is political and has economic end goals there are likely to be casualties as isiXhosa is nothing but a financial asset that they cannot afford to discard of it because of exclusionary practices. The institutions that publish in isiXhosa need to reflect in their editorial policies that they are the places that are or can be conducive for the growth of isiXhosa. There it needs to be determined that do editorial policies pre-determine status planning and corpus planning and what is the role of editorial policies in assisting status planning and corpus planning.

The editorial policy of private print media companies that publish in Xhosa should structure and draft their policies in the same way as the editorial policy of the SABC, for it is inclusive and appreciating of the formerly marginalised languages it therefore tries to elevate the status of the marginalised languages. This is how the editorial policy of the public broadcaster is structured even though it is bound by the constitution, private media institution should at least show how they accommodate and appreciate isiXhosa in their editorial policies as the SABC does. The core of the editorial policy is made up of the principles of equality and diversity and these should be articulated in the editorial policies of Caxton and Independent media as they publish in isiXhosa and it should be clear in their policies. When it comes to these two companies one gets a sense isiXhosa is appreciated for different reasons than being a marginalised language which they should be contributing to its development and its growth. It is not appreciated for cultural reasons as it should be as this is what the SABC editorial policy articulates the appreciation of isiXhosa, it seems they appreciate for different reasons other than cultural reasons for this is an important aspect as it speaks to also developing its audiences it shows that the speakers are also considered and they are important in the developing of the language. By cultural appreciation it also means that the status of the language is considered worthy of being uplifted thus is restoring the dignity of isiXhosa as to these companies the outlook they have is that of exploiting isiXhosa.

If isiXhosa is looked at as an entity that does not deserve to equated to English and Afrikaans and it can never be equal to these languages therefore it is a language that represents a domination of a people, and dominated people from a colonial power perspective they have

nothing to offer that is of significance to the European as they are valued for their labour which they have commercialised (Quijano: 2000). Hence the people who been colonially dominated they are a site of exploitation and their culture will not be spared of exploitation and discrimination. This means that a dominated people are loved for what they have come to represent labour vessels and consumption vessels and this is done through isiXhosa and it should not be equated to the same level as English and Afrikaans it is thus discriminated against when it comes to development aspect (Quijano: 2000). Currently the façade in Caxton Media and Independent News Media is that since they have isiXhosa publication it is at same level with these two languages which is not the case for if it were the case that would be made known in the editorial policies like that of the SABC. The SABC editorial policy underlines and articulates in its policy the language policy and this is addressed separately within the editorial policy.

This is in a way a sign of urgency by the SABC whether they follow up on that is a different matter altogether, the mere presence of a language policy is a sign and step of and towards commitment. This also pushes the question of the status of the language even though it is not openly announced where it is placed in the packing order of the institution the question is inherently answered by the treatment that it receives compared to English and Afrikaans. The treatment that isiXhosa gets compared to the above mentioned languages also shows the value and type of value they have placed in each language therefore the status of the language is determined by the value that an institution has placed in the language. The values that have been placed reflects what each language is really useful for as already mentioned that isiXhosa is a dominated language that is now exploited for its worth to the institutions. When these three languages are juxtaposed with each other it will be apparent that isiXhosa is an object of domination, Afrikaans and English are tools of discrimination and exclusion as things stand. The use of these languages by Caxton and Independent Media is a display of diversity in the institutions but this diversity should not be mistaken for cultural diversity as isiXhosa is put in a position to ‘fit in’ within the Eurocentric culture of the institution and it is not given the ‘freedom’ to flourish on its own thus it is policed. Language planning comes from a desire to change language the way it is seen thus they impose their norms and values to it to make it prestigious thus giving a noteworthy status (Jernudd and Nuestupny: 1987). A media is a ‘modernizing’ institute or rather it plays a huge role in the globalistic modernising world, and a media institution has to ‘modernise’ its audience as that will indicate progress and therefore language is the yard stick used to measure progress (Hornberger: 2006). When

one looks at *BONA* magazine and *Isolezwe* newspaper from Caxton and Independent Media respectively does not see a modernising language as far as content is concerned. This is because it does not display its independence of creativity from English within the institution the publications seem to be informed by the 'Mother language' of the institution that is English that is in a way it is asking for permission from the language for its creativity output.

Language planning is the process of managing a language towards the phase of modernizing that is the language will be standardised and unified under one orthography therefore the status of the that language will be granted and lifted (Jernudd and Nuestupny: 1987). That is the primary objective of language planning is to give the language a status hence status planning, corpus planning and standardization, the latter in this case is associated with the modernising aspect of not only language but society as a whole. These are the steps into uplifting a language and Caxton Media and Independent Media seem to have stopped in one phase and that is the phase of adapting isiXhosa but not for the purpose of changing the perception and the status the language. So the editorial policy of Caxton and Independent Media are not empowering and their language planning for isiXhosa is not existent as it continues with the attitudes and ideals of the colonial and apartheid eras and this is reflected in the institutions themselves and the manner in which isiXhosa is referencing English when it has to be expressing itself. Language planning or in this case language management is practiced within the spectrum of media policy and occurs amidst political and economic conflicts, most of these conflicts were dismissed and relegated as political conflicts and to political conflicts and the economic conflicts were ignored and homogenised with the political conflicts (Jernudd and Nuestpny: 1987).

Media is a modernising tool that promotes a language and elevates it to national recognition in the case of African languages it is an unofficial tool of modernising the languages and it is in a way 'informal' and unofficial again as far as corpus planning is concerned (Khuzwayo: 2010). With this in mind it should serve as a reminder that media policy and planning is market oriented rather than content oriented, with language planning being informed by this policy through the top-down effects raises more questions about how is isiXhosa developed by the private media institution (Entaman and Wilderman: 1992). Language planning has always been assumed that it is the political processes that have been a stumbling block to its development which is not always case, there are cases where the economic goals subsume the political goals for economic gains that has been the other side of language planning meaning

these economic objectives masquerade themselves as political objectives this alludes to the manner in which politics and economics are intertwined or inseparable (Jernudd and Nuestupny: 1987).

What should be at the core of the editorial policies of these two institutions should be language planning for isiXhosa, but their publications do not reflect this priority or rather one does not sense a commitment to developing isiXhosa as there are more 'pressing matters' to be considered than focusing on a language that is not of significance to the culture of the institutions. Another aspect of language planning that is suffering and it is also not articulated for in the editorial policies including that of the SABC is corpus planning and in fact it is the first casualty of language planning within an editorial policy. Language planning in this case does not provide a solution to a language problem as far as development is concerned they only add to the language problem as they serve a heterogeneous audience one language as a solution. So then what happens with the corpus development and planning aspect of language planning that is put aside in this media policy laden with economic goals than political development they are temporarily side-lined in pursuit of the profits that is the economic gains of the institution. This economic aspect has come to stifle corpus planning and standardisation of the isiXhosa as it is not used to the benefit of the audience. There is no agreed upon orthography and set of rules as to how are some words and terms are written they are not updated so far the language is not planned to develop and its development is stagnant (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010). There are too many inconsistencies that have become prevalent in the style of writing in regard to isiXhosa and there is no 'correct' way of writing therefore no set orthography (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010). The development or rather the evolution of the Xhosa orthography is not displayed or rather demonstrated for there are many developments that have happened that have not been noticed by the audience of Xhosa readers (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010).

There have been many recommendations that have been made to the change of the style of orthography but those changes have not been reflected in the isiXhosa media writings as they have only perpetuated the debate around 'modernising' orthography (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010). The first step to language development is corpus planning which is about the internal writings of language or the stylistics of writings; this is to make the language or rather the orthography standard therefore standardising the language and this has come at the cost of developing isiXhosa (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010). The second step of language planning is

the status planning this aspect is specifically designed to demonstrate the power and the authority of the language that is being granted a status of prestige (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010). The problem with isiXhosa is that it finds itself in a situation where competence and the situation are not as important when compared to English which is a language that is associated with authority and has demonstrated the authority (Bourdieu: 1977). IsiXhosa has been 'developed' in relation to the market demand and competence is not regarded as an obstacle as isiXhosa does not have authority or rather it does not have the authority in the process and context of the reproduction of meaning and texts (Bourdieu:1977). IsiXhosa in the media has not been fully able to cement its importance and prestige in the media as the pride of the Xhosa speaking community as it has been stifled by the above mentioned context as a result of the orthography inconsistencies (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010). Corpus planning is one aspect that has been neglected as far developing isiXhosa and it is arguably the first step or phase of developing a language and when it gets to the planning phase the orthography aspect is taken care of and agreed upon so as to move the development of the language forward.

An editorial policy of a private print media company as in the case of this paper cannot be discussed and analysed separately from the economic objectives that drive the company and they have underlying colonial and Eurocentric attitudes that shape the framework of the editorial policy and the culture of the institution. So the development of isiXhosa or lack thereof should be understood within these concepts as they inform how should the editorial policy be drafted in Caxton Media and Independent News Media. These companies should not be expected to appreciate and articulate for the development of isiXhosa under the above mentioned conditions in these institutions. They were clearly not made for isiXhosa and to expect isiXhosa to flourish under the Eurocentric guidance in unrealistic so this should not be expected for the purpose of this paper. Even the newly created black elites through the BEE scheme they have not paid any attention to the developing of isiXhosa print media or indigenous languages print media. The editorial policies of Caxton and Independent Media should appreciate isiXhosa by this I do not mean that they should be fond of the language but rather a commitment towards developing isiXhosa should be made as currently their publication are bot reflecting of that. They should consider doing this because they publish in isiXhosa and the diversity should be expressed through their publications of *BONA* magazine and *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* as currently it is not the case they are informed by the 'mother

language' that is English. And these texts are produced in reference to English hence they have stagnated in their development.

Translation in isiXhosa media not knowledge production but rather knowledge transferring which is important but at the same time it does not involve conceptualisation of knowledge. One can point out that there are Eurocentric concepts that do not exist in African languages that is where the author then translates the concept around the idea of what that particular concept is trying to articulate. Other than this level of conceptualisation which is an insignificant sub-category of knowledge production, this is because it does not impact the grander processes of knowledge conceptualisation. It is because of the reasons stated above that I argue that translation is essentially the transferring of knowledge from one language to another. In the case of mass media texts like newspapers and magazine the information that in contained in these texts is usually not the type of information that would change the world, for the information on these texts is about gossip at best both political and social. This is because news media is subject to political and economic interests that use news media to advance their agendas. Therefore translation of mass media texts hardly comes up with difficult concepts to translate or interpret as these texts inform about the happenings of the world.

1.3 Aim and Research Questions

The aim of this research is to investigate whether Independent News Media and Caxton Media have Editorial copies/codes, which speaks to the presence and use of isiXhosa as one of the publishing languages. Also how and whether do they (if they have them) articulate the development of the language that is at the periphery of the linguistic landscape in South Africa for English is at the centre? If these companies do not address these issues what might be the cause that might be making them not to address the development of isiXhosa.

The key research question is, to what extent and in what ways the Independent News Media and Caxton Media commit themselves towards the development of IsiXhosa language through their publications and/or editorial policies and institutional language policy should it exist.

a) Do they have editorial policies articulating the development of isiXhosa, and the previously marginalised languages? If they exist, which aspects of language development are articulated and how do they manifest in the publications? If they

don’t exist, why? Therefore, what guides the publication of these media texts (guiding principles) including quality assurance?

b) Publishing in isiXhosa which side does it benefits the most? Or is it a mutually beneficial relationship where the language gets to grow and move towards it glorious years systemically? Whether do Caxton and Independent Media get to set what is the agenda of the company in process deciding the fate of isiXhosa concerning its use and development within the institutions?

c) Which linguistic cultural cognitive aspects inform the conceptualisation of the publications (*BONA* and *Isolezwe les’Xhosa* newspapers) and/or editorial polices? Do the languages get to exercise urgency in the production of the two print texts?

Chapter 2

Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework for this paper is based on a multitude of theories relevant to media organisations or institutions, media policy and language development and how a language like isiXhosa is appreciated or unappreciated as part of the institutional culture. The theories that will be discussed below will essentially show why isiXhosa is not thriving in media institutions that were not created for it and that were not created with isiXhosa in mind. When isiXhosa is not appreciated as part of the institutions and institutional culture people cannot expect fair treatment of the language compared to English and Afrikaans. Institutional development of isiXhosa in private media organisation is not an obligation of theirs to develop the language in their organisations for they are also not mandated by any constitution that regulates print media to. The theories will provide explanations for the ill-treatment of isiXhosa in English dominated media institutions, this is an indication that isiXhosa serves an entirely different role to that of English and Afrikaans in media institutions.

The theories deal with the reasons why isiXhosa might not be developed as it ideally should be, this will provide the background as to why media institutions might not have progressive policies and editorial policies around language development. The theories will be in a way a yard stick used to measure the commitment and progressiveness of the media institutions as far as the development of marginalised language. These marginalised languages in the context of South Africa are not minority languages as they are widely spoken by the majority of the population. However, they are minority languages in the contexts of the institutions and media institutions as most of them are owned and controlled by white monopoly capital. Hence, the marginalised languages like isiXhosa are treated like minority languages of which they are artificial minority languages. In South Africa an approach that greatly disadvantaged isiXhosa was adopted and that is the homogenous approach that did less for the development and upliftment of isiXhosa to equal status with English and Afrikaans. By this I am referring to the three eras of language planning and policy development framework that was proposed by Ricento in 2006 (Pietikainen and Kelly-Holmes: 2011). In South Africa in general it seems that language policy and planning in most institutions are stuck between the first two eras of postcolonial and modernizing (Pietikainen and Kelly-Holmes: 2011). Language policy and planning in South Africa is generally not progressive and it does not look to uplift isiXhosa and other African languages as what they seem to do is to decimate and undermine

the confidence of the speakers and the language itself at times the speakers unwittingly aid the process.

The theories that will be discussed in this paper will expose the lack of commitment and follow ups that have come to characterise the all institutions in South Africa. With the private sector institutions that should not surprise as a surprise as they are about the bottom line that profit. Therefore the way they structure their policies and the culture of the institution will adhere favourably towards the bottom line of making more profit. IsiXhosa cannot expect to be given a status of equality with English and Afrikaans for it does not have the same level of access to media institutions as the afomentioned languages. Access is and has proven to be the biggest obstacle in the development of isiXhosa media as it does not enter at the same level and footing with the colonial languages. It does not have the same value as the European languages that are privileged by the institutions that is at least according to them. The first thing that needs to be acknowledged and understand is that the system in which African language print media exists was not created for them to flourish but rather to be exploited (Quijano: 2000).

There is the issue of coloniality and Eurocentrism that is a culture of the all media institutions in which African languages are operating and existing and they are used by these institutions and often not to develop them. The Eurocentrism and coloniality complex are the biggest hurdles and obstacles that people within these structures are not addressing appropriately and at times can be rightfully accused of avoiding the issue deliberately, and they would rather manoeuvre and negotiate their way through the web of Eurocentrism. This is the state that African language media finds itself and some of the people involved can be delusional at times about the progress in the development of African languages in the media in general. The theories that will be discussed below are interwoven and related at a fundamental level of development or lack thereof of African languages, where their fate is in the hands of ‘others’ by this I mean the ones who are not the speakers of the languages as they only recognise them for their ‘market’ value. That is the only value that seems to make sense to the ‘others’ as they do not have the sentimental connection that most people have with African languages, they only have sentimental values for their Eurocentric culture and its principles of coloniality.

2.1 Access

Theorizing access or the theory of access is something that has not been really been thought or rather theorized in any other field than the field of property, even in the property sector it has it has not been theorized adequately because it is only confined in the space of property only (Ribot: 2003). It was never shown to be versatile and adoptive to other fields of studies or disciplines in a way they are right that it is confined to property for access is not tangible but the entity that is accessed tangible and semi-tangible. In the case of institutions they are both tangible as one can physically access it as they can go in and out it is a property and the semi-tangible element is the culture of the institution the cultural practice that the institution stands for and propagates. Property in theorizing access has been often divorced from social relationships as it has been said that only those with the 'right' meaning the owners of the property can access the property. The relationship to property is defined along the lines of ownership that is the most significant relationship that a person or people have, this gives an impression that the owner(s) give permission and access to whoever they like and the ones who they would like to work with, they therefore restrict and control access and clearly right of admission is reserved.

Access to an institution is at times dictated by the societal culture and culture of the institution itself and it rotates around that notion and at times it is often subtle. It depends on the institution some of their practices are discriminatory in the sense that not everyone that enters the institution stands to benefit from that access and access is or can also be a privilege. Having said this, the definition of access has always and only been about access and not about the advantages and disadvantages of access. Access can be defined as "the ability to benefit from things including material object, persons, institutions and symbols" (Ribot: 2003, 154). Property has been always been connected to society and by property as alluded above I mean institutions to which people derive benefits from (Ribot: 2003). If we are to take Ribot's definition to account the definition of access is that we have been accustomed to is arguably trivial or superficial. This definition "aims to facilitate grounded analyses of who actually benefits from things and through which processes are they able to do so" (Ribot: 2003). Access in other words does not only mean that people can go in and out of an institution and be comfortable with that movement, what is often not mentioned about institutions is that there are resources that are of benefit to those who can access it. It is therefore not surprising when there are discriminatory practices that tend to restrict and control access of people and culture.

The benefits of institutional access are at times downplayed as most institutions especially government's institution come to mind when it comes to benefits, as they are meant to be of service to the public and the public easily claim a stake of government institutions as they are meant to serve them. As far as the public institutions are concerned this is how things should work and this attitude and confidence by the public is important as it is a surety of some sort that they will benefit from mostly the services that they have the right to. With private institution though the same cannot be said with conviction at least as they are not created with everyone in mind but a few select group and they are not and do not have to be elite. As a result there will be an imbalance in the representation of the demography that can access the private institution. This notion is explained very nicely by Ribot (2003) when he states that "some people and institutions control access to resources and others must maintain their access through those who have control". This succinct statement defines how private institutions operate most of the time as there is a selective process that takes place, it further shows the importance of relationships when it comes access and relationships should not be analysed in isolation as they go hand in hand. Access is always defined in relation to property thus they cannot be discussed and explained independently of each other (Ribot: 2003). This emphasises the point of relationships that people should have in their access to various institutions if they are to benefit.

Above I have mentioned that public institutions are more engaging of the public because they have to by law, this is the very sentiment rights to access public property and the law protects those rights and it ensures that those rights are exercised (Ribot: 2003). There are types of ways in which people can benefit from access; "Access is concerned with understanding multiplicity of ways people derive benefits from resources including but not limited to, property relations" (Ribot: 2003). Access in this paper should not only be understood at the fundamental level with its relationship with property as mostly take that it is where it ends when it is only the first step to a bigger picture even though that is a significant aspect to understanding the theory of access. Access should be understood as "bundles and webs that enable actors to gain, control, and maintain access" (Ribot: 2003, 154). When peoples and cultures access institutions it is not access to services it is access to power, power that enables them to make or direct decisions about people's destiny's and their fate access is about reaching this level of influence. Fundamentally access is about creating and making meaningful change that will have impact that is desired by those in the institutions to the

society, the relationship that society has with an institution reveals or reflects the sentiments whether good or bad about the benefits that they reap from an institution.

Access is the ability to benefit from things this is the simple definition of theorizing access when a group of people or a person has access they should benefit in a way that will gratify them (Ribot: 2003). And their access should not be a form of tokenism as that would easily qualify as an insult, this type of a situation will only show that the relationship is parasitic in nature where one party benefits from the access while the other is being robbed therefore exploiting the other (Quijano: 2000). Once access is granted it has to empower a person or a group of people who have once or are being side-lined from the gains and benefits to which they have rights to. Access to institutions is not meaningful if there are no benefits to be reaped for the sake of self-development and self-improvement this is or should be the yard stick that is used to measure the effectiveness of the access. Institutions should not be allowed to get away with unfair gains that they might have found with the access of new people or group. The word institution evokes images of property or building structures in the mind in even though property is arbitrary but the imagery of buildings is almost impossible to dissociate from the word.

This is because fundamentally access has to do with entering a building structure or property as already mentioned and individual's rights of access to property and the property itself is protected by the law and it is also the law that will allow or deny ones access to property (Ribot: 2003). The law also defines how and who has access the property they regulate the movement therefore the people who have been accepted to be part of the institution. When one is 'part' of the institution means that they have been accepted for what they bring and offer to the institution this means they add value and enhance what is already there which in this case are the benefits (Ribot: 2003). Ribot (p.155) further states that "property and access are concerned with relations among people in regards to people or values their appropriation, accumulation, transfer, distribution and so forth. Benefits are important because people, institutions, and society live on and for them and clash and cooperate over them." There are more clashes than cooperation when it comes to an exploitative relationship between the institutions and the people who might at times feel that they are not fairly reaping the benefits of access. Freedom is one of the benefits of access freedom of expression that is conducive for growth, stability and sustainability over a long period of time. This growth should be on the terms of those who have access and they ideally should not be dictated as how they

should grow even if the culture of the institution is overwhelming those who are in a minority. It should not be those who own and control the institution dictating to everyone else to assimilate to their rules and regulations that is their culture for them to be accepted.

Unfortunately this is a very idealistic and wishful thinking at best as most of these institutions have to be economically sustainable if they are to survive therefore most of the decisions that are made are made with the bottom line of making profit (Quijano: 2000). The notion of access in this paper is very much linked to the property element of the institutions as they have opened their doors to foreign entities that they also benefit from them financially most of these institutions are colonial institutions and heavily Eurocentric (Qiujano: 2000). Reaping the benefits of access from Eurocentric institutions is a very big challenge as there will have to be compromises that will have to be made especially by those who are 'outsiders' to the Eurocentric culture. In a situation like this it is usually the Euro centrists who can determine and define what are the benefits and the materials that one can access and how much of those resources can they have and enjoy. These are the limitations of desiring access to the institutions with a European culture, thus this culture has become the universal culture model that everyone aspires to and this is why when they afford access to the 'outsiders' they immediately define the benefits (Quijano: 2007).

Access to property is often explained within the realm of the law and it always had to do with the right to access property, there has been a change that has took place as far as property in that it is more about ownership of property and this means that access to the benefits is now controlled and property is defined in resource ownership terms (Ribot: 2003). The right holders to property are afforded certain degree of power that is sanctioned by the society and the law reinforces the sense of right to property (Ribot: 2003). The consciousness of the people who seek access has been seemingly stuck on the right of access state and there has been little progress this state of entitlement and it is no longer as efficient as it was in the past. The most crucial factor about institutions in the context of South Africa is that most of them they have become microcosms of Europe and Eurocentrism in that way they do not have identities that are distinctly African or South Africa (Quijano: 2007).

This Eurocentric narrative is not as straight forward as it might seem it does not refuse access simply and merely because it does not fit in the European culture that would be reckless and sloppy on their part. Therefore they have to be subtle and systematic this is because they recognise that the powers that prevent access to resources are embodied by

various mechanism, process and social relations it is because of these that people do not benefit the materials and resources of access (Ribot: 2003). The right to access is denied through processes for if it was not done in this manner the reputation and to some extent legitimacy of the institution will be highly questioned in the moral sense and that would further risk the down fall of the organization. They know very well that "power is emergent from, though not always attached to people" (Ribot: 2003, 155). They cannot risk of losing their popularity with the people whom they depend on their support if they are to be highly successful. Different political and economic conditions changes patterns of access and thus change the individuals and groups that would benefit from the resources (Ribot: 2003). The political and economic circumstances give us a clear indication as which people will surely reap benefits and which ones will be left out, this criteria clearly indicates or rather helps us to locate which individuals and groups benefit under which reasons (Ribot: 2003). In a way it shows that those that have contributed the most to the institution will benefit as they shall have invested mostly financially.

The control of access will become more stringent and only those in the inner group are to benefit and they will determine who gets to have a place at the table (Ribot: 2003). In other words they mediate other's access Rangan (1997: 72) in Ribot (2003) calls access control they "control the direction action and the power of direction and regulating free action". There is also maintenance of access which "requires the expending of resources or powers to keep a particular sort of resource open" (Ribot: 2003, 159). This is in another way is the protection of the core resources and they discard the resources that they can afford to lose meaning there is and should always be disposable resources this is meticulous planning. Meticulous because if there is a group that is not really appreciated or unwanted by those who control and maintain access they have a credible reason(s) to push them out and keep them away from the resources that they enjoy. Meaning there is always a way of keeping away prying unwanted and unwelcomed hands, and it is not only through economics that they can keep out unwelcomed seekers to the resources.

Culture is another effective way especially with private institution it is easy to isolate those who seek access as this will make them to give in and be left with no choice but to assimilate therefore compromising some if not most of their values for the sake of just having access and also the culture of the institution (Quijano: 2007). Most of the time the culture is foreign and seductive as it was deliberately created that way this was also a way of stagnating the

cultural production of those who are dominated so they can have cultural control over their culture also meaning there is always a Eurocentric and colonial dynamic (Quijano :2000). Coloniality and Eurocentricity is the foundation in which most of the exclusionary practices of access are formed and build upon and as long as they are part of the culture of those institutions therefore making it conducive for the perpetuating of these practices. The point of reference in gaining access to the resources is always through the European culture as it has been mystified so it can be only a few people who are able to access it that is the inner group as the culture is seductive and desirable (Quijano: 2007).

2.2 Eurocentricity and Coloniality

Euroentricity and coloniality are among the greatest obstacles that prevent progress of a group of people whether it is economic, political and social. They come with disenfranchising a people that they do not like and want to only exploit and keep them in the state of servitude for as long as possible. The dominated people are also playing a crucial role in the maintenance sustaining of Euroentricity and coloniality by perpetuating the ideals and ideas of Euroentricity and coloniality they therefore comply with these ideologies this is done consciously and unconsciously by the dominated people (Quijano: 2000). The dominated people have been seeking access to institutions of eurocentrism as long as the Europeans began their colonising ways. This began with seeking access to the religious institution like the church and the educational institutions like the missionary schools, and also economic institutions like the mines where they were hired or the place where their labour was exploited these institutions are the ones that played a crucial role in indoctrinating and inculcating new identities among the dominated people (Quijano: 2000).

Above all the message of servitude to Europeans was subtly propagated into the consciousness of the dominated people. This process of stripping and formation of new identity was at the same time stagnating the culture of the dominated people as they were blinded by the bright lights of Euroentricity and colonialism. Thus giving it away to be exploited by the Europeans as they please and see fit they were and are successful in abusing it for they have the means of production and own the distribution avenue where they deliver cultural products. New relations were formed with these new identities and these were not only along the lines of the conquerors and the conquered or the oppressors and the oppressed but those who were allowed to access and those who were denied access especially amongst the dominated people (Quijano: 2000). Those with access only serve to reinforce

Euroentricity and coloniality therefore keeping those who are exploited in their 'place' either way the Europeans are the principal beneficiaries of all the benefits as the system was designed to fail the dominated people (Quijano: 2007). This system is inherent and has been passed on to generations and generations and thus has become a cycle and it has taken a life of its own.

Euroentricity and coloniality controls all forms of production and it is the one that gets to decide what and how it is going to define culture to the dominated and also development; development is the site of struggle in a Eurocentric colonial society ideas and ideals of development are owned by those with power and they can dictate ideals of development (Quijano: 2000). The dominated people will forever seek validation from Eurocentric figures and power structures even from the mediocre ones that do not contribute to significantly to the Eurocentric ideals. The development narrative seems to be synonymous with servitude which in some cases is a sanitised version of slavery, as long as there are mean of productions there will always be those who will be victims of this system (Quijano: 2000). Development means that the dominated people are labour and consumption vessels that is very important to the success of Eurocentric values as it only views the dominated as labourers. The places in which the labourers migrated from to come and seek work in the urban centres are the labour reserves (Quijano: 2000). They control the economic input and output of the dominated people this looks like a hopeless situation where it does not seem like changing anytime soon as they have control over the culture of the dominated. What I have been articulating above is western imperialism which is the successor to European centred colonialism which is the direct political control of African countries by European countries, while the former is "an association of social interests between dominant groups of different countries with unequally articulated power" (Quijano: 2007).

The resources that are excavated in from the dominated countries is distributed amongst these different interest groups from western countries. Then again it does not have to be western countries but the institutions that embody their cultural values and are a macrocosm of western countries in the manner in which they control the work of their institutions and how subtle they are in discriminating other cultures usually indigenous cultures (Quijano: 2007). All of the institutions in most African countries are of European descent as all of them operate along the same lines and they have similar if not the same structures this is including the public run institutions. Private institutions are mostly European owned and they ring

fenced their institutions with their culture in other words they protect their institutions by using their culture. Every foreign cultural entity that enters it will conform to the cultural to its culture and if it means being diluted and misinterpreted to the Eurocentric culture it will not have much of a say. When it came into the space of Eurocentric culture it is has unwittingly co-signed be exploited by this culture and it does not have control the narrative or the direction it will only do as directed. This is a dangerous situation to have for the Eurocentric culture have colonized the knowledge of the dominated people in all the areas that are deemed crucial to the Eurocentric empire, they have therefore also stagnated the way of producing knowledge in indigenous cultures (Quijano: 2007). Knowledge production has been critically lacking in the culture of the dominated this is because they are still drooling over the cultural production and the language of Europeans, the perspective of knowledge is also reproduced hence it became easier to impose "new images, symbols and modes of signification" (Quijano: 2007).

2.3 Diglossia

One of the effects of colonial domination of the third world countries has been the creation of a high language and low language, thus creating prestige and status of one language and demeaning and ridiculing the other language and often associating it with uncivility or illiteracy (Ferguson: 1964). With such unequal treatment of the languages is accompanied development of the higher language and the neglect and under development of the low languages. It is within the institution to which the use of high languages is favoured and the low languages are excluded for they are not fit enough for the running of the institution. It is clear from the begin that diglossia is not some inexplicable phenomenon that just happen to occur in a society it would not be correct to think like that as it is a socially engineered situation (Ferguson: 1964) and (Ferguson: 1964). Diglossia is when two different varieties of the same language and two different languages are in co-existence but is used under different functional role and conditions (Ferguson: 1964). It is within these functional roles and conditions that the distinction is made between different varieties of one language and different languages and it is simply attachment of status and prestige in these languages (Ferguson: 1964). This is where the languages are deemed as high or low this is the case in the world in the developed nations it is more about recognising the different dialects of one language that might be spoken in a countries different regions. In the third world nations it is a completely different case as the colonial exoglossic languages are imposed as high languages that everyone should know. This is usually to the detriment of the endoglossic

languages and they are stripped all of their legitimacy and are shunned as low languages, this is more devastating for it is likely to result in language death where the local population starts adopting the exoglossic language as theirs.

To further add on the definition and intricacies of diglossia as a result of and through a legacy of colonialism and apartheid and this has been devastating to indigenous languages as they have been condemned to periphery of the South African linguistic landscape. This is not only the doing of the legacy of colonialism and apartheid as the speakers have developed negative attitudes towards their own language therefore further decimating the confidence and function of the languages (Philipson: 1996). Diglossia is a phenomenon as defined by Ferguson in Fasold as (1972, p245):

> "relatively stable language situation in which, in addition to the primary dialects of the (which may include a standard or regional standards), there is a very divergent, highly codified (often grammatically more complex) supposed variety, the vehicle of a large and respected body of written literature, either of an earlier period or in another speech community, which is learned largely by formal education and is used for most written and formal spoken purposes but it is not used by the sector of the community for ordinary conversation."

This definition was extended by Fishman to show that it does not only happen between variations of one language and stated that:

> A notion coined by Ferguson. Its classical definition is as follows: Two varieties of the same language co-exist but used under different conditions (functional roles) [Ferguson - 1959]. Fishman (1967) introduced the notion that diglossia could be extended to situations found in many societies where forms of two *genetically unrelated* (or at least historically distant) languages occupy the H and L niches, such that one of the languages [for example, a colonial language]* is used for religious, educational, literacy and other such prestigious domains, while another language [e.g. an African indigenous language]* is rarely used for such purposes, being only employed for more informal, primarily spoken domains. http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/~haroldfs/messeas/diglossia/node4.html (accessed on the 21/06/2012).

Diglossia in this instance happens between two distinct languages unlike the original definition by Ferguson, this research is anchored and based on the latter definition above by Fishman and it should be taken in that context. From above it is clear that isiXhosa never stood a chance of prospering under these circumstances in post-apartheid media and as the conditions were not favourable and conducive for them to develop and flourish. Another factor that has not allowed isiXhosa to develop is Linguistic Imperialism as it favours English, in the name of development and modernisation (Philipson: 1996).

Diglossia mostly points out the functions of a language in public social institutions where it is determined which languages to speak and which languages not to speak as most of these institutions are formal there a formal language has to be used or spoken (Ferguson: 1964). It is this functional aspect of language that most of the time determines the access to the resources for a better future for oneself. This is where the disparities are again revealed between the high language and low language, the high language is well developed and maintained in the institutions as they are standardised and are taught formally in school thus strengthening the doctrine. On the other hand the low languages they are not standardised nor are they well taught in school this means that they are left in a static state of under development they are spoken in local setting like in the home situation (Ferguson: 1964).

The media is a social institution where these linguistic ideologies of the superiority and prestige of the exoglossic language also exist and media being a powerful media that it is the one that often perpetuate the ideology. Media is a formal social institution that requires the use of the high languages as it is the language of conceptualisation and production, this is the case in the post-colonial states like mostly Africa where the indigenous languages are not granted the same prestige. It is imperative for anyone that works in the media organisations to know the exoglossic language to succeed. There also is a co-existence of the colonial language and the indigenous language in media institutions and other social institutions, there is unequal treatment of the languages based on the ideals of diglossia it produces linguicism within the institution. Linguicism is the unequal distribution of resources based on language groups the resources are both material and non-material, it has its base on diglossia it is the extension of diglossia within the confines of an institution. This unequal distribution of resources stems from the fact that the exoglossic language has become the language of commerce and has manifested itself as the language of culture (Phillipson: 1996).

This linguistic dominance however, does not manifest itself boldly as it might sound or come across this has become more subtle the perpetuation of this ideology has been rationalized along these subtleties. Therefore the linguicism has become structural and one with the institution for the high language is the one that dominates the low language in the media institution. This is not to say that the suppression of low languages means the speakers are forbidden to speak or use the language within the institutional setting as it is one of the languages that they use in their work therefore making it covert linguicism. The ideological

linguicism in most institutions is more unconscious because the exoglossic language is assumed to be ideal for a particular purpose.

2.4 Policy Planning

A policy is a set of principles that are put in place to guide the formation of rules to achieve set goals by an organisation (Ricento: 2006). Policy making is therefore a deliberate attempt to change the way an organisation operates it is therefore a political process where the decisions that are taken will not please everyone involved and will not favour every. Policy making processes are grounded in the institutions political processes these are sensitive to the goals or objectives that the institutions might have set, these goals are usually economic in nature (Spiller, Stein and Tommasi: 4) and (Cuilenberg and McQuail: 2001). The goals of a policy are objective and subjective this means that they show the intent of the organisation and how they are planning to go about to achieve the goals, therefore policy is intended to affect the 'real' world (Spiller, Stein and Tommasi: 4). Thus establishing the protocol in which the organisation should abide by to ensure the 'smooth' operation of the organisation, and it promotes and improves accountability of the institution and the individuals would take more responsibility for the non-effectiveness of the organisation (Spiller, Stein and Tommasi:7). Policy is preceded by the planning stage a this is the stage where all of the ideas are conceptualised for policy is the implementing stage or phase, the planning phase it is the motivation for the change lies and as alluded above it is political in nature regardless of the field of study (Cuilenberg and McQuail: 2001).

Policy of the media or communications industry has been around for at least one hundred years now and this policy regulates the media in the name of public interest and this is a norm in all of the democratic nations (Cuilenberg and McQuail: 2001). Public interest guides how a policy is drawn so that it can be as objective as possible so that it does not favour the executives of the company (Spiller, Stein and Tommasi: 9). It has always been a controversial issue to regulate the media industry by the government as it has always been seen as infringing on the rights of freedom of expression (Cuilenberg and McQuail: 2008). Freedman's 2008 :1 asserts that media policy "is a systematic attempt to foster certain types of media structure and behaviour and to supress alternative models of structure and behaviour is a deeply political phenomenon". This is because media is ever changing and there has been an introduction of new technologies that have changed the way in which media organisations operate and behave (Cuilenberg and McQuail: 2001). A media system is purposefully created

and their character shaped by competing political interests that seek to impart their own values and objectives "on the possibilities facilitated by a complex combination of technological, economic and social factors" (Freedman: 2008). Media policy is founded and formulated on political grounds hence there is so much resistance and constant reform because of the changing ownership and technological development that is happening in the media. (Freedman: 2008) Also asserts that a media policy like any other policies is a disinterested process where problems are solved in the interest of the public through impartial application of specific mechanism to changing situations. This means that policies and policy making processes are detached from the public to which they cater for or rather claim to represent as they are not inscribe in the interest of the public.

Media policy has elements that have come to define media policy specifically and they are the goals that are to be achieved and pursued and the values and the criteria by which the goals are defined and recognized (Cuilenberg and McQual: 2001). Media is an economic sector that unsurprisingly has been regulated for its influence to the public and the strategies of media policy has come to embody the business strategies of corporations so whatever the model of the policy is it has to represent the business strategy (Freedman: 2008) and (Cuilenberg and McQuail: 2001). 'Public interest' is always at the centre of policy making it is usually abandoned or put aside during the drafting of the policy. Media policies are tailor made for the specific media that for instance a media policy for the internet differs from that of print and broadcast media and the manner in which they are regulated will also vary (Freedman: 2001). Mass media policy that is focused on the press and broadcast intervention on it has been justified on the basis that this media is obliged to "carry certain social responsibilities and fulfil certain public obligations" (Freedman: 2008, p 16). This alludes to the fact that the press is the number one source of information for most of the public and the broadcast media is secondary for the press has been associated with a certain level or degree of credibility. Media policy is based on a "wide ranging informed and open debates and are aimed at maximising the democratic, cultural and economic value of the media" (Freedman: 2008, p 1). There are parties that have vested interest in media policies hence there is no genuine attachment to the policies to the public as they stipulate and that is the point of conflict.

This is how the inequalities of the power relations of the policies are identified and the lopsided policy goals that favour business and the political elites, these are the trademarks of

a neo-liberal political-economic order that has emerged and come to define policy making processes (Freedman: 2008). Policy planning and implementation is done in context and considerations of the economic and political elements, they have come to be the ones that initiate a conversation and change of media policy and this is done on behalf of the public (Freedman: 2008). Media policy has come to also be formulated with the outlook of the market and which has been made the yard stick to measure the usefulness of the policy and it has to be useful to the elites.

So far the discussion has been on the macro policy of the media which are the ones that determine the way forward not only for the organisations but also for the public. The editorial policy is informed by the macro policy that is designed to persuade political and economic goals of the elites so there is likely to be a top-down effect on the policy. An editorial policy is there to ensure that the objectives of the policy are met and well executed within the above mentioned contexts of the political, economic and social. Media institutions are obliged to cater for the public in their editorial policies if an institutions is serving a diverse society not only economically also linguistically it has to stipulate how they are going to serve their diverse audiences. The issue of language comes out clearly and the language policy that is drawn up has to reflect on this linguistic diversity that it is faced with.

Language planning is the answer in this case that will answer or rather should be answering the question of social change that the larger part of the media policy has committed itself to (Hornberger: 2006). In this case macro policy planning subsumes micro policy planning including language policy and planning. In South Africa there is no media platform that exclusively caters for African languages, so these languages are adapted by established media organisation that already have conflicting economic and political interests and they are controlled by individuals and groups who want to shape the political and economic destinies. In this case African languages become minority languages within these institutions as they are absorbed into a Eurocentric culture through the language of English. The actual reality is that African language the languages spoken by the majority of the people in the country and in these institutions they become artificial minority languages that are diluted into another culture therefore further stagnating their development. African language media is dependent on language policy and planning processes whether in private sector media or government regulated media either way it is subject to language and planning procedures as they decide their fate (Pietikainen and Kelly-Holmes: 2011).

The fate and destiny of African language media is not in the hands of the speakers and the practitioners as they do not own the means of production they depend on third parties to carry the agenda of African language media which is at the bottom of the list in their priorities. If African languages are part of the conversation as far as their development is concerned they are always spoken of in the context of language policy and planning this is because the conversation is always about preserving them so that they will not be lost to the country and its people (Stroud: 2001). The conversation and debate is never about how are African language going to be adopted in the economy and technology development so that it can be able to develop as these sectors further develop (Stroud: 2001). African language media will only develop if the indigenous languages developed and it is dependent mostly on government's commitment to the development of African Languages. Language policy and planning practices are aimed at privileging economically viable languages that will benefit the elite, this is usually to the detriment of the language ecology as those who make the rules are not about embracing linguistic diversity because it is not commercially viable (Mahlhasler: 2005). Language policy and planning activities are lacking in as they are not designed to with multiple languages in mind as they only focus on one language (Mahlhasler: 2005). African languages and the media must develop in parallel to each other as they are two sides of the same coin this will also keep track of how these languages are developing as far as the addition and coinage of new terms which is what we not currently seeing. The language policies that were adopted by governments in African countries in post-colonial independence movement were and are insufficient for the African context (Pietikainen and Kelly-Holmes: 2011), (Stroud: 2001) and (Phillipson: 2001).

All the language policy and planning processes were aimed at homogenising linguistically diverse nations where one indigenous language was/is promoted over the other languages this was an attempt to create monolingual nations at the expense of other popular indigenous languages (Pietikainen and Kelly-Holmes: 2011). Language policy and planning in Africa has been plagued by "avoidance, vagueness, arbitrariness, fluctuations and declaration without implementation" (Phillipson: 1996, p 161). This speaks to the chronic lack of commitment towards developing indigenous languages as already articulated above the policies are there but there is no follow on to what has been drafted therefore it is nothing but tokenism commitment. The three stages of language policy and planning by Ricento in (Pietikainen and Kelly-Holmes: 2011) the first era is already mentioned above the post-colonial and modernizing the second era is the crisis of modernism in this era the nations come to the

realisation that there is internal diversity and the homogenous does not work (Pietikainen and Kelly-Holmes: 2011). The third era is postmodernist as there is an acknowledgement of linguistic rights and the bombardment of English through new technology and media in linguistic ecologies (Piatikainen and Kelly-Homes: 2011). Part of modernising a language is through the media by making newspapers and television and radio content that develops and grows the language, indigenous language media is shackled by these none development in language policies. It is through media and technology where English is aggressively promoted and endorsed and this brings about shifts in the language ecologies of many postcolonial countries. Africa seems to be stagnated in the second era as all the information and the facts are known but the oomph to take or create projects of indigenous language media as those are undertaken by the imperialistic media organisations (Phillipson: 1996).

African language media is not thriving because it is against the negative attitude from the speakers first and this attitude is always displayed in relation to English as it is the language that everyone is aspiring to and it is well promoted and endorsed by the government (Phillipson: 1996). "Language planning has tended to assume the modification of one language only and has largely ignored the interaction of multiple languages in a community and multiple non-linguistic factors that is the total ecology of the linguistic environment" (Mahlhasler: 2005). This reinforces the stigma that indigenous are backward and outdated languages as they do not fit into the categories the same as English the favoured language of modernisation as they aspire to be modernised. By aspiring to and yearning linguistic modernisation it further diminishes knowledge production in indigenous languages and thus endangering knowledge production indigenous languages and this speaks volumes about the lack of language pride (Dondolo: 2016). This means that knowledge is now produced on the terms of eurocentrism and Eurocentric conceptualisation and not on the terms of African concepts and conceptualisation (Sharifian: 2005). If a culture depends on another culture for produced knowledge that culture is approaching the last stages of linguistic suicide and genocide this is self-distractive behaviour. This culture of dependency was created by colonialism and it is perpetuated by imperialism and it has now penetrated the culture and it is disturbing or diluting the image of African people (Phillipson: 1996). This means that Africans are no longer negotiating, constructing and accepting 'modernisation' on their own terms by using an African language as a tool to achieve this (Dondolo: 2016).

Linguistic imperialism is the domination of one language over other languages however, the dominant language does not have to be a European language it can also be amongst the indigenous languages and the language that is promoted the most should be viewed with suspicion (Phillipson: 1996). In these situations these languages are being imposed on people who do not necessarily speak them this is because they desire to create a monolingual nation. By doing this they disregard the human rights of the people that they are dominating the notion of a language being a human right is fairly effective in steering away linguistic abuse by others (Stroud: 2001). The linguistic rights discourse has helped to address the injustices of linguistic imperialism and how they negatively affect African languages and this is to also bring to the centre the plight and need to promote African languages among the speakers (Stroud: 2001). The linguistic rights are channelled through the language policies that also ensure that English trumps all before it that is problematic as it is contradictory and that diminishes its credibility (Stroud: 2001). Education is supposed to be the mainstay of promoting African language African languages but the debates over the methodologies as how to carry out the tasks of promoting and developing African languages within an education system (Stroud: 2001).

The linguistic rights discourse only got indigenous language to be acknowledged that they are not being treated fairly and they were registered in language policies that and the same policies are not being implemented to ensure fairness in terms of treatment (Stroud: 2001). Linguistic rights movement has managed to articulate for other languages as they exist in a linguistic ecology and attempts should be made to try and balance that ecology (Stroud: 2001). The linguistic rights argument in a way takes away or rather minimises the use and power of a language therefore taming the power. The Linguistic rights movement does not do much to challenge the spread of Metropolitan languages as they are still aggressively being endorsed thus continues to marginalise indigenous language (Stroud: 2001). This is because multinational conglomerates are spearheading the spread of Metropolitan languages; these metropolitan languages are usually European languages (Stroud: 2001). This is because they essentially represent foreign economic interests of these multinational conglomerates (Stroud: 2001). The linguistic rights narrative means that the speakers of the language have given away their power or they have been stripped of their power through economic and political policies (Perret: 2000). Language policies that are developed and attained through linguistic rights do not support African languages as they are not equipped to equally function in a pseudo-Eurocentric society and they are not sustainable (Stroud: 2001). There should be a

shift from linguistic rights to a more pro-active movement like the linguistic citizenship for it speaks directly to communities to fight for their languages as citizens of a country (Stroud: 2001). This is a political stance that is being encouraged by linguistic citizenship, it encourages people to be active in the processes restoring African languages (Stroud: 2001). Greater participation in the production materials of a language at community level increases and maintains relevance therefore restoring the ownership of the language by the community (Stroud: 2001). This will give the community a sense of authority over their language and might even dictate to those in power to address them in their language when they have come to visit them. Linguistic citizenship taps into the political power which lies dormant within a group or communities that are marginalised, linguistic exploits and expands from this potential power (Stroud: 2001). Through linguistic citizenship communities are consciountised about language as a political and to some extent economic construct.

Widely spoken languages are prominent because they wield a certain amount of political and the endangered languages are in this state because they do not wield any political power (Trudell: 2008). The political power can also be interpreted in economic dialectics as they are closely related especially when it comes to the influence. African languages have become artificial minority languages not because the dominance of English and other European languages, but because of the economic structure and superstructures that have been built in and around European languages (Trudell: 2008). Linguistic citizenship makes the speaker realise the economic possibilities of their languages as a resource which is not currently thought as a resource (Trudell: 2008). Linguistic citizenship is linguistic nationalism for it enriches the language, it speaks to a nationalistic aspect of language restoration which much more effective in addressing the language issue (Stroud: 2001) and (Trudell: 2008). With the voice of linguistic citizenship it will be easy articulate for more effective policies that might urge officials to make follow on and petty and fallacious ideas about the development of African languages might stop. Indigenous languages deserve and belong to a category of their own as they are the oldest in the country compared to English, this category should not be aimed at preserving them (Perret: 2000). Another major problem is that different indigenous languages are treated as drastically different cultures of which is not the case, speakers of different African languages in South Africa are culturally more similar (Perret: 2000).

2.5 Critical Political Economy

Critical Political Economy (CPE) is the one theory whose theme runs through all of the above discussed theories, theirs as it is one of its characteristic of a holistic theory and the historical characteristic was also shown (Golding and Murdock: 1991). Critical Political Economy is the one theory that is concerned on how political power is exercised in in media institutions and how those political exercises yields economic gains for a media institution (Golding and Murdock: 1991). Critical Political Economy operates within a capitalist system so as media organisation that have been in the hands of conglomerates who are seeking to control a narrative and public discourse meaning the audience is at their mercy (Golding and Murdock: 1991). In the case of media politics of ownership that is often accompanied by inequities that mostly arise from the different and mostly preferential treatment of media departments (Golding and Murdock: 1991). This demonstrates the impact of macro political economics on the micro political economics that have been compromised that is the values that a media institution stands for will be at times systematically eroded in the name of increasing profits therefore keeping the bosses or owners of the companies' happy (Golding and Murdock: 1991). Linguistically language is an indicator of dominance and control over a media organisation and the language that is used to determine the culture in which the organisation abides by (Bourdieu: 1977).

The outlook of CPE on the media and its relationship with the audience is that of a product and the market this is what the media and audiences have been reduced to this is because of the total takeover of the media by conglomerates who are in the consent manufacturing business (Golding and Murdock: 1997). But all of this is a structured mechanism that does not let anyone to do as they please for they are part of the system that has been designed to ensure the primary goal of the organisation and that is making profit (Golding and Murdock: 1991). As mentioned above that the media is language controlled medium and it dictates the medium of production even if the departments in the organisation are heterogeneous and it is only one language that serves as a yard stick to measure quality and authority (Bourdieu: 1977). Language is central in CPE as far as cultural production is concerned as it is where the meaning created or manufactured and cultural production is language oriented meaning the market that one is aiming for is potentially lucrative as this seems to the case with isiXhosa language markets (Golding and Murdock: 1991).

Everybody has to be competent in the authority language even though they do not speak it as a first language, this is because the language in authority has to be imitated and to a certain degree replicated in the reproduction stages (Bourdieu: 1977). This is disadvantaging the secondary languages in the organisations that are not valued as the language in authority as the people who produce texts in the secondary languages has to know the authority language regardless of the fact that he reproduces meaning and text in a different language (Bourdieu: 1977). This is an example of the commodification of the less authoritative language as it is clearly used for a different reasons other than production of meaning therefore it has been included for reasons that are financial thus good for the business (Golding and Murdock: 1991). Commodification can also be seen as the decaying phase of news information and knowledge as at this phase media products are controlled and shaped by the demands of the market and the audience has been commodified by the media companies as they them to the advertisers for a profit (Golding and Murdock: 1991). Clearly the biggest losers in this whole situation is the consumers and the language with less authority in this case isiXhosa which is a trait of a global media as language is no longer the centre of meaning and knowledge reproduction it is not for enhancing diversity but rather to increase efficiency (Salawu: 2013) and (Golding and Murdock: 1991) and (Bourdieu: 1977).

Critical Political Economy is Marxist in its approach and it has shown that since the cooperate takeover of the media has resulted in the reduction of media sources and resources; focus on the largest markets and their tastes; the avoidance of risk; reduced investment in less profitable media tasks; and a neglect of smaller and poorer potential audience (Salawu, 2013). Quoted McQuail (in Fourie 2007, 137). The development of isiXhosa is neglected as it is serving only one purpose according to the CPE it is serving in increasing efficiency and it selects the media goods or products that should be consumed by the audience or in this case by the market (Salawu: 2013). The diversity of the media has become an illusion as it is more of the conglomerates that own different media texts therefore the meaning has been diluted with the political economic outlook of the interests of the owners of the media as this is another way to raise profits while taking care of their political interests (Salawu: 2013). This closely knit relationship of media ownership addressed by CPE has proved to be devastating to the linguistic diversity therefore the development of isiXhosa in this environment the media product that has been created is homogenous and it is served to a heterogeneous audience and it has also been culturally misrepresented and conceptualised (Salawu: 2013). The media products are replicated into a different language and not many resources are

equally distributed as the products that are produced in isiXhosa have been grouped with the non-profitable tasks of a media organisation. They have been reduced to a role of usefulness when convenient to the media organisation, therefore they are disposable thus there is no need to invest in them as much as they invest in English texts media.

Chapter 3

Methodology

3.1 Triangulation Method

The research centres on the editorial policy documents of Independent News Media and Caxton Media whether they are address development of isiXhosa. The approach of the research will be in a form of a triangulation method it is a multiple methods in the research as this will ensure a holistic outlook on the project (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). This approach also will help uncover some "unexpected dimension of the area of inquiry and to "assist in constructing a more encompassing perspective" (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). There are types of triangulation and this research will use the triangulation of data and the theory as the theory will be informed by the theory of language planning and language development, and the politics of policy making that has a bearing on the institutional development of isiXhosa (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). The analysis will be accompanied by some quantitative research method as at least ten articles each from and *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* newspaper will be analysed in the interest of corpus planning development therefore language development. This means that content analysis will be employed as far as the articles are concerned this articles are centred on the language and cultural issues of isiXhosa

The research requires me to have access to the editorial policies of Caxton Media and Independent News Media as they will be the source of my information as far as their contents are concerned. For it is important to know how they articulate the development of isiXhosa since they publish in the language in the form of *BONA* magazine and *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* newspaper. The editorial policies should fairly and clearly state that the use of Nguni languages is in their interest as far as language development is concerned or are they just another way of venturing in the Xhosa language speaking market. The approach is laden with the theoretical perspective of language policy and planning hence it will be about how are these languages developed since they are not equal to English and Afrikaans, are they at least being developed to be widely read by the Xhosa speakers and promote the reading or rather the acquisition of information in isiXhosa. Furthermore the texts will be useful for the analysis of these articles and the articles from these texts will not be randomly picked but rather will be chosen thematically since this research is done in the interest of developing isiXhosa. The articles that will be mostly relevant from these texts will be the socio-economic

content with a hint of political content as *BONA* is not known as a text that offers social political commentaries (Khuzwayo: 2010). Therefore it is only online articles from *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* that will be analysed one reason is that it is not a translated text and they seem to show a level of linguistic flexibility and freedom that the *BONA* people do not have in translating the magazine. Also because content of the newspaper is conceptualised and produced in isiXhosa. While the translators at *BONA* are confined and constrained by the limitations of the translation practice

3.2 Interviews

The research is a qualitative study therefore the interview will be inspired by the qualitative interview methods. The purpose of the interviews will be to learn about issues that are not easily identifiable in the form of the magazines and the newspapers which form a crucial part of this research (Lindlof: 1995). This also refers to the contents of the editorial policies of both Caxton Media and Independent News Media, which at this stage are unknown and they will clarify what exactly is their purpose and story for publishing in isiXhosa (Lindlof: 1995).

Thus the interviews have given me the insider perspective about the attitudes and the purpose of what is articulated by the 'editorial policy' of BONA and whether do the interviewees share and embrace the attitude of the contents of the 'editorial policy' (Lindlof: 1995). Definitely as the researcher in this I had my own assumptions and suspicions about the commitment of the institutions towards the development of isiXhosa these interviews have validated and verified these assumptions as fact or not (Lindlof: 1995). These suspicions and assumptions arise from the data that has already been obtained from the magazine itself as it in a way reflects the purpose of its existence and is it for the good of the institution? Or is it for the good of the Xhosa speaking audiences? Or is it for the good of the language itself? (Lindlof: 1995). This will eliminate any vagueness that surrounds the purposes and the reasons for publishing in isiXhosa as in this interview they will be clearly defined and outlined. These suspicions and assumptions that I have about the language development question borderline that of a hypothesis that needs to be tested and proven, but the interviews will not be conducted with an outlook and attitude of proving a hypothesis (Lindlof: 1995).

I interviewed the two isiXhosa translators Siviwe Kulu and Nkosinathi Mafuta, I also interviewed the production manager Johannes Letsohla this is to get the sense and insight of

how is it like working on a magazine like *BONA*. Their insight cannot be understated in this research paper as it is them who can better express as to how isiXhosa is positioned in the institution and also in the production process of the magazine. It is very important to know the role of isiXhosa and other indigenous languages in the conceptualisation and production as they are the languages that have been integral to the identity and brand of *BONA*. A significant number of people who read *BONA* still thinks that the magazine is not translated from a source language which in this case is English. This is because people identify *BONA* as an indigenous language print media text, this is the sense I got from doing the interviews with the three gentlemen. People see *BONA* not as an English medium text this is understandable because for nearly fifty years people have been reading this magazine in isiZulu, isiXhosa and Sesotho. The interview questions are centred on language development at Caxton Media as they do not have an editorial policy that addresses the language development mandate or agenda. You will notice that with the isiXhosa translators of the magazine the question are about isiXhosa and with Joahnnes Letsohla I switched it to African languages as he is the one that facilitates the magazine in all three indigenous languages at *BONA* (Apendix 1). Also because he is a Sesotho speaker if I kept on saying isiXhosa to him during the interview that would create unnecessary confusion.

It will be established in this paper that Caxton do not have an editorial code or editorial policy as they abide by the South African Press Code, which they in turn abide by the section 16 of the constitution. Section 16 protects the freedom of the press and Caxton media use the guideline from this section in the running of all their publication. It is interesting that a Publisher like Caxton does not have an editorial policy that states how they operate within the doctrine of section 16, and how they interpret and implement this segment of the constitution in their institution. Hence the interview questions are centred on the nurturing and the development of isiXhosa. The interviews were conducted at Caxton House in Craighall Park, Randburg. The three interviewees were interviewed separately on one on one basis by the author and the questions are not interrogative they are engaging or rather they allow the interviewee to engage with the interviewer. The initial interview questions that the author scheduled to ask the three gentlemen were thirty, after the first interview with Siviwe Kulu some of the questions proved to be unnecessarily redundant. They were not worth pursuing and in some cases the interviewees all of them showed the knack of answering two to three questions with one answer. So from about thirty questions that were prepared only twenty one, eighteen and seventeen questions respectively were answered by each participants.

3.3 Institutional Analysis

The analysis of Caxton Media and Independent News Media has been done through the closer analysis of the editorial policies of the institutions. It was done this way because an observational approach is not effective and it will not do much capturing the essence on what the institution is really about (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). It through the policies of the institution and their implementation that we get to know the character of the institution and their intentions as a business (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). Also we get a sense of which agendas does an institution prioritise for continuous pursuit and development. It is because of these reasons that the institutional analysis in this paper was done through document analysis or rather the analysis of editorial policies. The essential aim of this paper is to investigate and analyse how isiXhosa being developed through first policy and secondly through the publication. So it would be a futile exercise to analyse an institution in isolation of its policy because the policy is informed and grounded on certain culture. Therefore the cultures of Caxton Media and Independent News Media are looked at closely, the factors that came out clearly from the analysis is that it is through Eurocentric culture that is embedded within a colonial consciousness results in the lack of development and progress of indigenous languages.

The foundations of the policies of these institutions have not been re-adjusted to accommodate isiXhosa, so the language essentially operates within a Eurocentric colonial whirlwind where it does not fit anywhere. It tries to morph itself into the whirlwind and that the beginning of it destruction this comes through the orthography that will stagnate as a result. This destruction is best demonstrated by *BONA* magazine as it is a translated text and the conceptual foundations for its translation are within the boundaries of the English language. Through the analysis of the institutions it emerged that all print publication companies compose their editorial codes through the section 16 of the constitution. It would also be appropriate to conclude that they essentially copied and pasted this particular segment of the constitution. The only challenge that I encountered is that Caxton media does not have an editorial policy however, they use the South African Press Code which derives its code from the section 16 of the constitution. What this means is that it is a misnomer to say that Caxton Media and Independent News Media and other print companies have editorial policies/codes for they are using the same source to transcribe their editorial policies. What

this means is that this segment of the constitution is morphed into cultural fibre of the institution then its character changes.

3.4 Content analysis

As already stated in this paper above that the analysis in this project will be qualitative content and thematic analysis of and *Isolezwe lesiXhosa*. Content analysis only in this text will be too broad as and will have made too much work unnecessarily hence the thematic analysis will narrow the analysis therefore bringing in more focus to the work (Joffe and Yardely: 2004). It has been also stated above that this research is conducted in the interest of the development of isiXhosa in these media institutions specifically corpus planning development thematic analysis speaks more to this aspect. Content analysis is dedicated to revealing the ideology behind the practices of the institutions as far as language is concerned (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). This will not only reveal the commitment of the institutions language development but also reveal as to whose interest the development is articulated. Then it is clear that thematic analysis pays much more attention to the analysed texts than content analysis and that is how ideological bearings are revealed as far as the editorial policies are concerned (Joffe and Yardley: 2004). Content analysis on its own is more quantity based thus insufficient to revealing irrefutable facts about the subject matter as on its own it will show the short comings of the project (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). Content and thematic analysis will also reflect the dominant cultural cognition that is used and relied upon as far as the conceptualisation of *BONA* magazine and *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* newspapers. Thematically also there will be a reveal in the dominant theme as far as the culture of the institution is concerned this will be reflected by the employees that work for these publications (Aronson: 2007). This pattern is to show what scenarios exactly determines the cultural cognition that is used in the two institutions.

BONA Magazine is not popular as a text that offers social, political and economic commentaries like *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* newspaper. This is because a newspaper it is sort of mandated by the public that they serve to write social commentaries, this will not be a comparison study but the quality of the articles will be analysed in respect to corpus planning. This is because *BONA* is a translated text from English to Nguni languages and *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* is not a translated text now the quality of the language should be at least consistent in both texts if not similar. The content thematic analysis will be critically interpretive of the

study as to show the ideology behind the conceptualisation of the editorial policies of the media institutions in question (Montgomery and Duck: 1993). This way content analysis will not only rely on the quantity of data that will be available but also the themes that have been motioned as they will indicate the quality that is or should be stressed in the policies of the institutions that are being studied (Yardely and Joffe: 2007).

3.4.1 Qualitative Content Analysis

I have chosen to analyse the twenty one article that have been published in *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* between 2015- 2017. These article are centred on language and culture they praise the efforts that are made to eradicate the inferiority of isiXhosa language and culture. They also critique the English language and all the cultural fallacies that have come with it like the Christian religion. In the content that I have chosen I have also chosen a few articles that are not in line with the theme of addressing language and cultural issues, but are in line of their consistent coverage of the some issues and events that are happening in the Eastern Cape. What this content reflects is that even though newspaper is not acknowledged by the editorial policy of Independent News Media, they are taking an initiative to develop the language through this newspaper. The following is a division of these articles are based on their topic and they speak to language and cultural development and protection; they are mostly opinion pieces and they are very informative with history and current critique. These categories I divide the as promotion of the language and culture, spirituality, history and general news.

Language promotion and culture:

- "'Usacinezelekile' umntu ontsundu oqaqambisa isiNgesi"
- "Majodina: Malifundwe I'solezwe lesiXhosa"
- "Ngxatsho ke Milonji nani Milonjikazi yakowethu!"
- "Kushicilelwa i-soapie yesiXhosa yephondo"
- "Masifunde ezinye iilwimi zesiNtu"
- "Amakrwala aphila nenkubazeko abuyile"

Spirituality and Religion

- "NgabaPostile iiKumkani zeMpuma Koloni"
- "'Asinaye uSathana kwinkolo yesiNtu'"

- “Ngumlahlekisi uS.E.K. Mqhayi?”
- “UNtsikana Wayengeloxoki!”
- “UMndende Lixoki Nje Elidinga Into Yokwenza”
- “Izakukhupha ingxelo yayo ikomishini kaXaluva”

History

- “Ngamani amaNywabe?”
- “Iziduko zamaNqukhwe”
- “Aaa!!!! Daliwonga”

General News

- “Bondla iintsapho zabo ngeshishini lezesondo”
- “Wabhidwa zizinto zedolphu nolali!”
- “Axoxelwa etyotyombeni amatyala eCumakala”
- “Uchacha kuhle ekhayeni lakhe unkosikazi kaSobukhwe”
- “Akukho themba lomanyano kwisizwe samaMpondo”

These categories are very closely related and in the chapter they have been discussed in a manner that demonstrates the link that holds them together so they are not discussed in isolation. As they are interdependent and to discuss them separately would be to suggest that they are separate cases. Hence in the chapter the discussion of these stories and headlines has been synthesised to show this common thread that binds them. All of the articles they display the urgency that is exercised by isiXhosa in conceptualisation process and the production process.

Chapter 4

Institutional analysis

At most times an institution is better understood through its policies relating to the conduct of work life in the institution and it can also be seen through the practical side as to whether do they practice what is written on paper. This is to see whether there is a commitment towards the goals that the institution might have set itself, this is also a reflection of the attitudes that the people working for the institution might have towards the rules of the organisation (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). The implementation of policy is a very different matter from writing it on paper and most institutions fail to get beyond this hurdle of implementation this is mostly because there is a clash in ideas and ideals as this can be a sentimental subject. Lofland (1971) in Andersen and Ragnhild (1997, 58) states that "To observe, is a mundane, day to day operations in the field, is to orient one's consciousness and ones actions explicitly to look, listen and to ask 'what's happening. It is ok to ask oneself: 'What is the order in', or 'meaning of' what's happening". Observation of the institution as far as the working environment is concerned gives another interesting perspective that might either prove that there is policy implementation. Or that the claims of the organisation's commitment to change towards new policy measures that might have been proposed (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997).

The newsroom settings can also reveal banal ways in which a policy is not being actively been embraced by the members of the institution as it states or dictates in its policy. Analysing an institution is and can be approached from different angles through even the products that they produce they also reflects the attitudes of that particular institution and its world view. The content of a newspaper or magazine reflects and shows the values that an institution stands for and the value that they promote and propagate. The institution has to be consistent with these ideals for a researcher to be sure of the values that they stand by inconsistency might cause confusion on the stance of an institution. This can be dangerous at times as it can make one to make unjustified assumptions about the principles and values that an institution promotes in their content.

There first has to be a level of consistency before one can declare what a publication of an institution stands for. At times the consistency of the content of a magazine or newspaper does not always go along with what is declared by the policy of the organisation (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). At times claims of independence from external pressures like political

and financial fraternities who have interests in controlling and maintaining public opinion are proven to be a false and fallacious (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). This results in accusations of sunshine journalism directed towards institutions who are not objective in their coverage of certain afo-mentioned fraternities (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997). This is clear and safe to declare that media institutions are not consistent in standing by their values and principles political and economic interests override these principles. In most occasions the institutions give in to the pressure that is inserted by those with vested interests in the content of the magazine. News print media depend on these 'sponsors' to pay their staff very well thus keep their best journalist and this is to the detriment of their principles. This is a legitimate cover up for the real reason as to why they really have to sacrifice their journalistic values is that they are forced to as they are not as independent as they usually claim to be.

Caxton media is not immune to these tentacles of political and economic control of outsiders as a media company or entity, the company does not necessarily have to be influenced by big businesses but also individuals from these big companies for their selfish reasons and goals (Andersen and Ragnhild: 1997) and (Southall: 2004). As a media company it has been around as a printing company since 1902 and it quickly developed a reputation of being one of the best printing companies in South Africa (www.caxton.co.za). Not long after it ventured into publishing newspapers and it publishes over 50 community newspapers and the company went through two acquisitions (www.caxton.co.za). The first time it was by Eagle Press the second merger was by Felstar Publications, in 1985 Caxton acquired CPT (Cape Transvaal Printers) printers (www.caxton.co.za). In 1998 Caxton merged with Perskor Publishers in the process they acquired the Citizen newspaper as part of the deal (www.caxton.co.za). In addition to several community newspapers amongst them are *Tembisan*, *Randburg Sun*, *Southern Courier*, *Mayfair-Brixton*, *Newlands-Melville Telegraph*, *Rosebank Killarney Gazette* and *Roodepoort Record*. Caxton publishes 12 magazine titles they are in three African languages namely isiXhosa, isiZulu and Sesotho the other language are Afrikaans and English. The titles are *Bona, Essentials, Farmers Weekly, Garden and Home, Food and Home Entertainment, Country Life, Living and Loving, People, Rooi Rose, Vrouekeur Woman and Home and Your Family* (www.caxton.co.za). *Bona* is produced in English and then translated into isiXhosa, isiZulu and Sesotho these other titles are produced independently in English and Afrikaans.

Bona magazine is a unique case in all the magazines that are published by Caxton, as it is a magazine that caters for the African demography of South Africa. An obvious clue that *Bona* magazine is aimed at an African demography is that they also publish the magazine in three African languages *isiXhosa, isiZulu* and *Sesotho*. The magazine is produced in English from the conceptualisation process to the compilation of the magazine all those processes are done in English (Khuzwayo: 2010). After it has been finished then it is translated into the afomentioned languages the production of *Bona* magazine in African languages is simple and straight forward process they transfer the information from English to *isiXhosa. isiZulu and Sesotho* (Khuzwayo: 2010). I will give a brief background of *Bona* magazine to hopefully show that it is a unique magazine and its uniqueness is special because it is the first magazine to truly cater for the African population by publishing in indigenous languages (Khuzwayo: 2010). *BONA* is not the only and the first magazine that aims and caters for the African demography it has direct rivals in *Drum* magazine and *Move* magazine but they publish in English even though *Drum* did publish in *isiZulu* at some time and they discontinued it (Khuzwayo:2010). *BONA* magazine was first published in 1956 and it was in *isiZulu* only and in 1958-1959 *isiXhosa* was added to the publication of the magazine *Sesotho* was added later in 1962 two years before it was taken under new ownership (Khuzwayo: 2010). Republican Press acquired *BONA* in 1964 and the magazine for the first time appeared in English this means that the three indigenous languages were stripped of their power of creativity as English was now the source language (Khuzwayo: 2010). In 1996 Perskor Publishers acquired Republican Press and the trend of translating from English to Afrikaans. One might ask why is it that Republican Press decided to keep publishing in indigenous language after they acquire the magazine in 1964 and the same question applies to Perskor and Caxton.

The reason might be because they want to keep the heritage of the magazine as an African language magazine the preservation of this heritage is important, but what is sad is that the same legacy and heritage has become nothing but a token as far as the development of indigenous languages. The practice of translating the magazine from English as the source language to the indigenous languages as the target languages this has boxed and confined these languages within a specific boundary\ies thus not leaving any space for creative expression. One is also tempted to propose that they do what *Drum* magazine did and discontinue the African language publications of *BONA* magazine, as they arguably do not add value to the making of the magazine as far as the content is concerned they serve in a one

dimensional capacity. Clearly the policy or mandate that Caxton abides by does not include a language policy or language development of some sort so as to assist in the upgrading of the three indigenous languages that are utilised at Caxton. These languages are not part of the process of creating and producing knowledge they are mere vessels that used to satisfy a certain function and need (Khuzwayo: 2010). This is reflected in the interviews with the translators as they assert that:

Caxton as I have been told by the production manager of *BONA* magazine said they do not follow the mandates of an editorial policy as they do not have one as a magazine. Whether the institution itself also does not have an editorial policy that was answered with a simple "yes" all the print titles of Caxton are guided by the South African Press Code (SAPC). The SAPC is very broad and at best vague especially in the context of *BONA* magazine as this is a linguistically diverse publication and from the content of the SAPC it was not written with *BONA* magazine in mind and any other publications in African languages. The SAPC has been constructed around the section 16 of the constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the theme of this act is centred around freedom of expression which extends to freedom of the media (www.journalism.co.za/press-code-of-professional-practice-sa.html). Section 16 articulates freedom of expression as follows:

> (1) Everyone has the right to freedom of expression, which includes: (a) Freedom of the press and other media; (b) Freedom to receive or impart information or ideas; (c) Freedom of artistic creativity; and (d) Academic freedom and freedom of scientific research.
> (2) The right in subsection (1) does not extend to (a) Propaganda for war; (b) Incitement of imminent violence; or (c) Advocacy of hatred that is based on race, ethnicity, gender or religion, and that constitutes incitement to cause harm.

From the section above we see that freedom of expression does not divorce freedom of the media as it is "subject to the same rights and duties as that of the individual" (www.journalism.co.za/press-code-of-professional-practice-sa.html: 1). Freedom of expression in this section of the constitution does not however, extend to the freedom of linguistic expression and it does not articulate that and it is not mentioned. Point (b) and (c) of sub-section 1 "freedom to receive or impart information or ideas" and "freedom of artistic creativity" they seem to borderline or rather tip-toe around the issues of linguistic expression or linguistic expression is vaguely hinted at. If one speaks about imparting knowledge and ideas does not necessarily do that in English, but this is context dependent if it is at an

organisation that like media organisations where English is the media of instruction knowledge is imparted in English. In rural and township schools of South Africa knowledge is not imparted in English but in African languages this point extends to the second point in "freedom of artistic creativity" artistic creativity does not entirely recognise language boundaries as it is artistic it is not meant to be disturbed but appreciated as it is. But one could argue that print media has a fairly huge element of artistic creativity but it is policed as journalists should express themselves within set boundaries for sensitivity reasons.

The SAPC is the same as a policy it's not all the time that the people and the organisations involved follow the prescribed and mandated 'rules'. In the editorial policy of the South African Broadcast Corporation (SABC) states that "editorial policies are intended to help staff negotiate difficult editorial issues and decisions" (2004: 2). The SAPC as it is used by Caxton and its publications does not clearly take all editorial issues to heart especially with the ones pertaining to the issues of the translated versions of *BONA.* The translated text form a big part of the editorial content of *BONA* and yet this aspect in the SAPC it is not catered for because when it come to the language issues the SACP is more Discourse oriented than linguistic oriented. One of the reasons that might make the SAPC not to treat the language question in it constitution might because African languages in the print sector of the media is not prominent like in the broadcast sector and also because they are not directly mandated by the constitution of the Republic of South Africa. The SAPC is an independent body within this sector that is also protected by the constitution of the South Africa. Clearly Caxton Media only took from the constitution what serves their interests as a company and that does not have holistic developmental outlook which would cater for the language development aspect like the SABC editorial policy.

The SAPC has omitted the linguistic diversity that some of the media print companies might have and on might go further and accuse them of ignoring African language publications that are prominent and have been around for some time. It does not really protect the rights of media freedom language practices this constitution does not have some obsolete regulations that would make sure that those who publish in African languages do make some effort towards developing them. By selecting section 16 of the constitution to be the theme almost exclusively looks at freedom of expression and its definition of expression in this act is narrow as it only looks at it pertaining to the media (www.journalism.co.za/press-code-of-professional-practice-sa.html). The act should have been extended further to include language or rather linguistic expression to fully cover freedom of expression. The SAPC is only

concerned with the discourse of print media and this is elaborated further in the three sections of the constitution namely News Reporting, Discrimination and Hate Speech, and Advocacy (www.journalism.co.za/press-code-of-professional-practice-sa.html).These sections of the SAPC are only concerned with the discourse that would be put in printed by the various print media outlets. Freedom of expression should have been extended to include the language aspect that is enshrined in the constitution of the Republic. This shows the disregard of African language publications like *BONA, Ilanga* and *Isolezwe* newspapers just like the SABC is obliged to show the diverse linguistic scape of South Africa the SAPC should also reflects its own language diversity in its constitution.

As I have been stating above that freedom of expression is not extended further in the SAPC as it should have been. The SABC editorial policy proves that as it states that freedom of expression can be fully recognised when all the people in South Africa are informed in a language of their choice (2004: 26). The SAPC does not thrive to attain equality as one of the democratic principle that progresses the country media plays an important role in nation building and the SAPC seems like it's only concerned with only protecting its members. It is easy to even throw accusations of the print media sector having their own agenda as they do not fully fall into the nation building subject. The SAPC has many loop holes that print publications exploit as they are not fully committed to all the ethics that are articulated in the SAPC. This has become common practice in the media industry for companies to disregard constitutions and policies as they are for the bottom line of making a profit this is the only principle that they have committed themselves to. The SAPC has failed to acknowledge the existence of indigenous language publication and institutions that publish in indigenous languages should not be blamed for not making an effort towards developing them.

This means that *BONA* does not exist and it is not protected by the SAPC at least the English version of the magazine is safe as it is the original version of all the versions that are in indigenous languages. It is easy to say that due to the lack of visibility of indigenous languages press the SAPC cannot be able to advocate for the fair and equal treatment of African languages that would be a fallacious excuse. A constitution should be familiar with all the parties that it represents and their rights but that does not seem to be the case with the SAPC as there is no section in the constitution that deals with language policy. The SAPC is a flawed constitution as it not in touch with the diversity of the print media sector it might be possible that the language question has been deliberately omitted from the constitutions as it

does not form part of the vision for the print media industry. The editorial policy of SABC deals with the question of language under the section of language, this is because it recognises that freedom of expression is not complete without language choice. Hence the language topic is separately discussed within the policy itself even the most isolated and marginalised of languages are recognised and acknowledged like the Khoi, San and Nama languages and even South African sign language (SABC editorial policy: 2004). But the SAPC seems to further marginalised the indigenous language publications that it claims to represent and keep in the periphery of the print sector.

The SABC editorial policy provides a blue print as to how the SAPC should have went about addressing the language issue in its draft and this raises more questions than it gives answers. The editorial policy of the SABC speaks about the efforts that it will put in making sure that it sticks to its commitment even if it might not fully abide by its commitments but it makes gestures of working towards them. If an organisation like Caxton abides by the guidelines of SAPC the development of indigenous language by the institution should not be expected anytime soon even commitment towards their development should not be expected. The editorial policy of Avusa which is now Times Media, also abides by the SAPC and its draft form part of the policy and it is one of the most important sections of the editorial policy. Since it does not have any publications in indigenous languages they do not articulate for them and this makes sense. When one examines the policy of Avusa there is pattern that suggests the whole editorial policy is written around the SAPC as there is some repetition and recycling of themes. The Avusa editorial policy has six sections they are:

a) The Avusa Media pledge

b) Policies

c) Code of Conduct for reporting on issues of race, religion and cultural
difference

d) SA press code

e) Avusa blogging policy

f) Undertaking to be signed by all staff

"The Avusa pledge" reinforces the ethics code that the institution abides by and it declares it commitment to upholding these principles. This pledge is also a reminder of their rights and privileges as a media institution they are entitled to as enshrined in section 16 of the constitution of South Africa. The second section "policies" that is where the editorial policy essentially expands from the SAPC's section "Reporting of News" it threads on the ethical

journalistic practices. The policies section forbids false news by their journalists as the information has to be verified by the journalist working on a story and exaggeration is not allowed (SAPC: 1996). The use of verifiable sources is one practice that the Avusa editorial policy upholds in high standards in the documents, sources should be verified as this area in journalism has always been notorious for creating non-stories and fake stories then hide behind the "anonymous sources". Then they in turn hide behind their right to withhold their sources from anyone who might wish to know them. This is encompassed well in the SAPC in point number 1.3 and reads as follows:

> "Only what may reasonably be true, having regard to the sources of the news, may be presented as fact, and such facts shall be published fairly with due regard to context and importance. Where a report is not based on facts or is founded on opinions, allegation, rumour or supposition, it shall be presented in such manner as to indicate this clearly" (p.2)

This links very well with the Avusa policy statement that that under sources sub-section as it warns against false soureces and it states that:

> "All stories require at least two independent on-the-record sources with personal knowledge of the facts, or three off-the-record sources with personal knowledge of the facts.
> Wherever possible, we try to persuade anonymous sources to go on the record. We use anonymous sources only when there is no other way to publish the story. Where it is unavoidable to use anonymous sources, we adhere to the following:
> Anonymous sources must have direct knowledge of the facts. Wherever possible they should provide evidence" (p.3)

Then again the invoke their right to not reveal a source only when the editor deems it necessary and it is also the editor who also declares whether the source is authentic and credible this is stated in the following :

> "The editor should know the identity of any anonymous source and must expressly approve the use of the source for the story. If the editor is not available, the deputy editor must approve the use of the source.
> When we report that we are in possession of documents, we should, wherever possible, say how we came into possession of documents
> We are ethically bound to protect the identity of our sources and to honour undertakings we make to our sources. Agreements reached by a journalist (subjects to the policies in this document) are binding on the newspaper as a whole. When making undertakings, it should be made clear that we regard dishonest or malicious information as a breach of the agreement and will not be bound by any agreements made in the acquisition of it. Only the editor may decide that an agreement is in breach."(p.3-4)

The two sections from the Avusa editorial policy correlate very well with SAPC sub-section of Reporting of News 1.3 there are other points in the SAPC that have similar semantic themes but 1.3 resonates strongly with the above sections from the Avusa policies section. The protection of the victims identities is a point that resonates very strongly both documents in the former it is point number 1.7; 1.7.1; 1.7.2 and 1.8 (p.2) the respectively articulate that:

> 1.7 Reports, photographs or sketches relative to matters involving indecency or obscenity shall be presented with due sensitivity towards the prevailing moral climate.
> 1.7.1 A visual presentation of sexual conduct may not be published, unless a legitimate public interest dictates otherwise.
> 1.7.2 Child pornography shall not be published.
> 1.8 The identity of rape victims and victims of sexual violence shall not be published without the consent of the victim.

In the Avusa policy the above statements are encompassed in the Children sub-section which emphasizes the protection of children in the news reporting where children are involved in all the situations ranging from discrimination and child abuse. In the above citation it is concerned with peoples dignities and the news reportage should be very sensitive to their circumstances. The Avusa policy presents it as a protection of children as they are likely to be devastated by bad ordeals all of this is articulated as:

> "We recognise that children's rights to privacy and dignity deserve the highest degree of protection, and we undertake to respect these rights in every situation. We will maintain the highest possible ethical standards in reporting on children.
> We undertake to consider the consequences of our reporting to children, and to take steps, where appropriate, to minimise the harm. We undertake not to stigmatise children, to stereotype them, or to sensationalise stories about them. We undertake not to expose children to abuse, discrimination, retribution, rejection or harm by their communities or by society at large.
> We will always protect the identities of children who have been victims or perpetrators of sexual abuse or exploitation; and those who have been charged or convicted of a crime or been a witness to a crime.
> We will not disclose a child's HIV status unless it is in the interests of the child, and the child wants it known, gives informed consent and is aware of the consequences. Where appropriate, the guardian can make these decisions. In the absence of such consent, we will not identify HIV-positive children directly or indirectly.
> We will not identify child soldiers, asylum seekers, refugees or displaced people if this will expose them to a risk or harm or retribution.
> We undertake to avoid using sexualised images of children." (p.5)

The above rights apply to every person that will be subjected to news reportage but the Avusa policy narrowed and specified it to children and this they have their reasons as why they decided to do it that way. But these apply to everyone in the news as they are also prone to abuses of different kind. Other sections that resonate very well with each other on these documents of SAPC and Avusa are the "Discrimination and Hate Speech" from the SAPC and the "Code of Conduct for reporting on issues of race, religion and cultural difference" from Avusa. Again Avusa in this aspect expanded from the brief declaration of the SAPC the expanded explanations are evident where they are taken from. The SAPC articulates that:

> 2.1 The press should avoid discriminatory or denigratory references to people's race, colour, ethnicity, religion, gender, sexual orientation or preference, physical or mental disability or illness, or age.

> 2.2 The press should not refer to a person's race, colour, ethnicity, religion, gender, sexual orientation or preference, physical or mental illness in a prejudicial or pejorative context except where it is strictly relevant to the matter reported or adds significantly to readers' understanding of that matter.
> 2.3 The press has the right and indeed the duty to report and comment on all matters of legitimate public interest. This right and duty must, however, be balanced against the obligation not to publish material which amounts to hate speech. (p.3)

From Above one can see the precise and fairly generic discussion around and about hate speech and discrimination and as it has been the theme between these two documents Avusa expanded this in this manner:

> "We have to acknowledge, too, that South Africa is a multiracial and multicultural society, and we have to portray different practices and beliefs in a fair and honest manner in our reporting, gathering, editing and presentation of information.
>
> Staff will:
> • Act independently when reporting issues of race but will take note of sensitivities regarding race, or other issues, in their work;
>
> • Report on these issues where there is a demonstrable public interest and when race is the central issue of the story. Racial identifications should be used only when they are important to readers' understanding of what has happened and why it has happened;
> • Not unjustifiably offend others in reporting or commenting on sensitive issues relating to race, religion or cultural differences;
> • Not use language or pictures that are offensive, reinforce stereotypes or fuel prejudice or xenophobia;
> • Actively seek diversity in sources, which should represent the entire community;
> • Be sensitive to cultural differences and values and will actively seek to ensure that reporting takes these considerations into account
> • Not, in crime reporting, make mention of the race or religion of the victim or the alleged perpetrator unless that information is meaningful and in the public interest;
> • Uphold the newspaper's principles of fairness, especially when dealing with issues of race; and
> • In dealing with the public, be sensitive to cultural differences and not conduct themselves in any way that may unnecessarily offend" (p.21-22)

This section emphasizes the racial and cultural sensitivity in reporting of the news in relation to any activity it may be legal or illegal racial identification is applicable if it is relevant to the story and the context of the story. This reinforces that it should be done with fairness and objectivity it should not entice violence amongst different races and cultures. It advocates for cultural tolerance and acceptance between and amongst different races as this is crucial to the nation building aspect for South Africa it is the responsibility of the media to tread carefully on this delicate subject. It is also the media that plays a big role on the aspirations of nation building and it is the media that can also destroy these aspirations.

The examples of the Avusa editorial policy relayed and juxtaposed above with the SAPC drives the point that an editorial policy is important but then again if it is entirely informed by the SAPC, then how useful and significant is it for an institution like Caxton. Since they do

not have an editorial policy but they do abide by the guidelines of the SAPC and if they are to have an editorial policy the chances that it would be similar with that of Avusa are fairly high. As demonstrated above that the Avusa editorial policy is heavily informed by the SAPC and that expands all of the critical sections and points of the SAPC. If this is a template of an editorial policy then maybe Caxton is justified in not having an editorial policy and choose to take from the source where all print institutions title derive their editorial policies. The SAPC in some shape a representative of the constitution of South Africa as the preamble is an extract of section 16 of the constitution. The print media sector is fundamentally and essentially directly protected by the constitution of the Republic of South Africa and their policies are aligned with section 16 of the constitution and these policies are informed by section 16. The *Mail and Guardian* editorial code of ethics has the same pattern as the Avusa editorial policy there is a recycling and expansion of section 16, they are more or less identical with the section such as accuracy, sources, fairness, correction and accountability.

The SAPC which Caxton media abides by does not however, express the language question and Caxton publishes *BONA* magazine in three African languages and English. Could one be making an appropriate statement by saying that the SAPC does not protect African language press publication? For here are companies like Caxton and Independent News Media they do not articulate the protection and development of these publications. It appears as if that indigenous language publications are at best footnotes of a big narrative as they are homogenized into the English language canon. They are not included into the cultural landscape of the institution and they are not included in the editorial codes this should not be a surprise since section 16 of the constitution ignores and omits indigenous languages media from its protection. Independent News Media's editorial code is guilty of the same offence as Caxton Media but a big difference is that Independent News Media has an editorial code and it is available on their website (www.iol.co.za). It is very similar with the other editorial codes that are discussed above it has taken cue from section 16 it recycled and contextualised it to the institution. Independent News Media has the bestselling newspaper in its stable *Isolezwe* and somehow it is not part of the editorial code as it should mention the language development and issue since their bestselling title is an isiZulu newspaper. The existence of this publication is not acknowledged by the editorial code as it should have a section of how they go about in adding value to isiZulu and isiXhosa as languages and the publications of these respective languages.

The editorial code should be specific about the Nguni language publications and it should add more as to how they will go about to improve the languages from the corpus point of view. They are special cases as they are the only publications in the institution that caters for the African demography, and it should be inclusive in how they go about when gathering news for the Nguni language publications. While some of the points in the editorial code apply to these publications however, they somehow tend to generalize and homogenize it with English and Afrikaans. When one reads the editorial codes one gets a sense that it is talking about the English and Afrikaans publications as it was created with them in mind or rather it was conceptualised with the European languages only. It should be structured more like the SABC editorial policy it should state the reasons as to why they saw it of paramount importance to have Nguni language publications. It is quite peculiar that the constitution of South Africa obligates only the national broadcaster with duties of upholding and treating the official languages with equity and respect. Yet independent private print media institutions like Caxton Media and Independent News media who publish in Indigenous languages do not show the respect and equity in treating the indigenous languages in their institutions. They also abide by and are protected by the constitution and it does not mandate these institutions to treat African languages equally with English and Afrikaans but it is only the SABC that is directly mandated by the constitution. The constitutions seems to be contradicting itself when it comes to the issue of language and the media the private media press are allowed not to develop African languages through their publications who happen to be one of the bestselling newspaper titles.

It is very tempting to come to the conclusion that the constitution is not keen on the issue of indigenous language development in the media. As alluded to above the constitution seem to be grasping at straws on this issue it is contradicting itself and therefore stating that some media institutions are more equal than others. By this I mean that there are some media institutions should not carry the burden of responsibility when it comes developing languages but they can profit from using African languages without appreciating them. The constitution is not committed to or rather do not oblige print media significantly contribute to the enhancement of African languages. This can be seen in the section 16 which all print media institutions swear by where freedom of expression is only confined to media and artistry and the basic tool of expression is not mentioned nor alluded to and that is language and in this case African languages. They are not a priority as the constitution claims they are or rather they are not the priority of the constitution as that task is left to two organisations that is the

SABC and the Pansalb. The latter is in a sorry state as it was never able to fully promote multilingualism and the price that board paid was dissolution of the board in 2016 (www.news24.com). The SABC seems to be fighting a steep uphill battle on the language issue and promotion and development as they are the only body or organisation that is mandated by the constitution. The SABC seems to be carrying the burden and other media organisation like the ones that have been afo-mentioned in this paper are not tasked by the constitution to partake in language development in the media.

The constitution seems to be burdening public institutions with language development as if it is only in the public spaces and institutions where there is use of indigenous languages is confined to. The formal use of indigenous languages is also used in media institutions that are the subject of this paper and the print media products of these institutions are distributed nationally. The is a chronic lack of urgency in indigenous language development in at Caxton Media and Independent News Media and that is because the constitution allows the situation to be the way it is. There should at least be a rule that mandates all the media organisations that publish in indigenous languages to carry out significant development policies that would ensure the development and growth of African languages in the media sector and in literature in general. If the constitution was truly protecting indigenous language print media it would have implemented a rule to this degree so that it is not only the national broadcaster that carries the burden or mandate of developing indigenous languages. There no sense of urgency in print media institutions that publish in African languages, even though they have been given a standard status these publications do not reflect that in the orthography rules of isiXhosa. There are inconsistencies in the manner in which they apply orthography rules in isiXhosa; there is a use of old orthography and the updated orthography in the same text especially with *BONA* magazine there seem to be some element of uncertainty over the orthography of some words (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010).

The print media should playing a crucial role in resolving this issues of orthography it does not only apply to applications but also interpretations of orthography a standard language that does not have a sense of what is ‘correct’ is a problem (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010). This creates confusion and perpetuates a silly and useless debate as to which is the correct way to write isiXhosa. Language grows and when a language grows it changes its form from the orthography point view as it ‘improves’. The print media publications that publish in isiXhosa seem to not know the linguistic problems that are faced by the language and those

problems are not acknowledged and embraced by Caxton and Independent News Media (Ndimande-Hlongwa: 2010). It seems they do not know about the problems that are being faced by isiXhosa, and frankly they seem to not care about these problems as long as is isiXhosa is appropriate and adequate enough to be read and understood by the readers. Aspiration is a huge area that is problematic especially with *BONA* magazine, they do not aspirate their speech sounds like [k], [t] and [p] in words like *inkukhu,* 'chicken', *thatha* 'take' and *phezulu* 'up'. They tend not to aspirate the speech sounds when they occur in similar environment in some instances they are ignorant as they stick to the old orthography of isiXhosa.

The standard language seems not to be adhered to by the writers and journalists that work for *BONA* and *Isolezwe* as the standard orthography of isiXhosa is yet to be updated in decades (Ndimande-Hlongwa:2010). This raises suspicions about the purposes that isiXhosa publications serve in these institutions as the orthography is not updated and yet they continue to flourish to among the target audiences. They should also cover the plight of the isiXhosa language as it is clearly not in the list of priorities for the government and this is problematic. This is because if the government does not prioritise the language development question hence the private sector companies like Caxton and Independent News Media to exploit them and do as they please as it is convenient for them. This convenience is unwittingly created and caused by the government because of its non-committal attitude when it comes to indigenous language development.

The constitution of South Africa does not celebrate nor protect indigenous language print media judging from the section 16 of the constitution. Indigenous language print media is not recognised and when the constitution was drafted in 1996 there were two isiZulu newspapers *Ilanga* and *Um-Afrika* and their existence was never acknowledged in this section of the constitution. Perhaps it might be because of the notorious role that these newspapers played during the inter-ethnic wars in the late 1980's and early 1990's which was led by the *Inkatha Freedom Party* which owned *Ilanga.* As it was against the democratic progress that was being ushered in in the early 1990's by the ANC led representatives. The same argument applies to the white owned media which for centuries justified the deprivation of the native population in South Africa. All the narratives in the white media during these times ridiculed and persecuted Africans and categorised them to sub-human status. Also under apartheid the newspapers that were owned by Naspers, a company that is known to be one of the architects

of apartheid and it supported and maintained the system. All the newspaper titles under this company were protected and acknowledged by the constitution. The constitution however, protects and acknowledges the latter two as worthy of driving the development of South Africa with their tainted racist history. While the former to some degree did the same as it condoned the ethnic killings by the Zulu people affiliated with Inkatha Freedom Party was not excerpted by the constitution.

One justification for not including indigenous language media in the constitution is because of the globalisation mandate era that was being ushered in at the time and including African language print media was not a priority for the new establishment as it would have held them back (McCarty: 2003). This was the beginning of homoginsation of the country which is culturally diverse into a one foreign identity which everyone was aspiring to. The white owned capital media that publishes in isiXhosa has therefore neutralised the language and it does not fully serve that function that it should as far as developing isiXhosa in these spaces. IsiXhosa media should aim at providing alternative narratives that are aimed at empowering the audience with the language and identities and culture (Pietikainen: 2008).

Chapter 5

Overview of *BONA* and *Isolezwe les'Xhosa*

The two print texts from Caxton and Independent News Media namely *BONA* and *Isolezwe* respectively they do not necessarily target the same audience type but their audience can relate to the contents of both texts. These texts have the same target audience as far as the language is concerned but the demography of the same audience differs slightly for *BONA* magazine is a translated text whose source language is English and isiXhosa is one of the target languages. *Isolezwe* is an isiXhosa text that is produced and written in isiXhosa it is not a translated media text like the former. Therefore *Isolezwe* is not dependent on another language text for its material content the production of this newspaper from the conceptualisation process to the gathering of news content is in isiXhosa. If I were to be cynical I would say that the isiXhosa version of *BONA* would not exist without the English version therefore its existence is entirely dependent on the English version. If Caxton were to decide to discontinue the isiXhosa *BONA* that would be a huge problem for the isiXhosa target audience to no longer have an iconic magazine like *BONA* published in their language.

Isolezwe is a product of the same process as it is *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* or *laseMpumakoloni* it is the isiXhosa version of *Isolezwe* an isiZulu newspaper that was launched in 2002 by independent News Media to challenge *Ilanga LaseNatal* and since then it has been one of the most prominent isiZulu newspaper in South Africa. The *Isolezwe* title brand was used for the isiXhosa speaking audience therefore the newspaper was redirected towards the isiXhosa audience under the prominent *Isolezwe* brand title as the meaning of the word is the same in isiXhosa '*eye of the nation'*. It might be safe to conclude that the existence of *Isolezwe laseMpumakoloni* it was launched in 2015 owes it to the success of the isiZulu *Isolezwe* and the chance was taken to cater for the isiXhosa audience. The isiXhosa version of *Isolezwe* is however not a translated text from isiZulu like in the case of *BONA* magazine.

It seems like the isiXhosa media texts are to some degree dependent on the original source language texts there is no genuine isiXhosa mainstream media text that was conceived by the producers who speak the language. Therefore isiXhosa in the print media has been reactionary since the permanent discontinuation of one of the most prominent and flagship of isiXhosa print media *Imvo Zabantsundu* newspaper in the early 1970's. It has been titles that have been produced in English and isiZulu that have been making and keeping isiXhosa relevant in the print media space and isiXhosa print has managed to be stable to say the least.

There has not been an isiXhosa newspaper that has managed to come to the forefront of mainstream media like the isiZulu newspapers *Ilanga, Isolezwe* and the now defunct *UmAfrika*. If there might have been attempts to resuscitate isiXhosa print media they ended up in the periphery of the media industry thus those attempts proved to be futile. *Isolezwe* is successful because it is owned by one of the big conglomerate media companies in South Africa that is Independent News Media, and it is fairly easy to aid marketing campaigns that promote the paper nationwide. They were also able to fund and market *Isolezwe ngesiXhosa* thus slowly restoring isiXhosa print media. Currently the state of isiXhosa media is dependent on other languages for its print media existence.

IsiXhosa print media being revived at the time of globalisation and it is at peak and it is being intensified by the integration of economics (McCarty: 2003). Globalisation works against the interest of isiXhosa as it homogenises and standardises indigenous languages into the English culture which European culture which undermines indigenous culture and languages (McCarty: 2003). Globalisation segregates and marginalises as people take on and assimilate into the Eurocentric culture because of its seductive materials that come with and accompany globalisation (McCarty: 2003) and (Quijano: 2007). IsiXhosa print media has not been able to independently restore itself to the verge of its former glory years and this makes one to question the claims that there have been attempts revive isiXhosa print media where did they end up. The author suspects that they fell victims to the powerful seductions of globalisation and they abandoned the cause and gave in to the materials of globalisation and an example of this is the Black Economic Empowerment scheme (BEE). Black business people are gathering and basking around the benefits, materials and glories of BEE and have abandoned the indigenous language print media and media in general. They have completely moved away from organising around the economics of indigenous language media.

The attempts to revive one of the prominent newspapers in isiXhosa *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* from 2012 until 2014 gave birth to or rather ended up being *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* which was launched in 2015. The attempts to revive *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* by Unathi Kondile were not structured towards attracting an isiXhosa speaking audience but to attract a big media company like Independent News Media, to show them of the potential of a Xhosa audiences (www.iol.com). These attempts were rather not sincere as they were a way to advertise to Independent News Media and other potential suitors, *IsiGidimi* should have taken the community newspaper root if one were to say these attempts are sincere. For it is what a

newspaper like *UmAfrika* is doing it has become a traditional regional community newspaper and it has a modest circulation that is good enough to sustain itself (Tolsi: 2007). Clearly it was not possible to start up and sustain a project like *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* resuscitation as it required one to have fairly deep pockets. As in the case of *UmAfrika* it leased it publishing rights to Media24 until 2013 and it went back to the control of the Congregation of Missionaries of Mariannhill (CMM) (themediaonline.co.za). It was therefore sustained by its dealings with a big press company like media24 along the way and that meant it was never forgotten and it also has a rich history and a company like media24 did not hesitate to work with known historical isiZulu newspaper brand. *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* on the other hand it was not as fortunate as there was no suitors who showed interest in collaborating with Unathi Kondile, like in the case of *UmAfrika* as already above or it might be that he never approached big business to lease out the news.

By appealing to the big media company desire for exploring new avenues and audiences *IsiGidimi* was the right project that Independent News Media could invest in. Clearly they had faith in an isiXhosa newspaper but were not sure about the title of *IsiGidimi* as it has been a long time that anyone has heard of this newspaper. An already successful and established brand like *Isolezwe* was ideal if a Xhosa newspaper was to be successfully revived it had on the back of an already successful Nguni newspaper like *Isolezwe* which already had a mass audience and it was known and sold in some parts of the Eastern Cape. So coming up with an isiXhosa newspaper the safer option was to use *Isolezwe* as this is a project where money has been put in and failure was being minimised as much as possible with the use of the *Isolezwe* title. As already expressed above that isiXhosa print media has never been lucky to find collaborators who would stick by the newspapers like the isiZulu newspaper who have been continually published for decades and one for a century.

IsiXhosa print media has been in oblivion for a number of decades before the coming of *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* and it because of the efforts to resuscitate *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* that led to the creation of the former. In this situation *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* and *Isolezwe* itself fall under the subsidiary model (Salawu: 2013). This is because they are owned and controlled Independent News Media who ventured into the Nguni language market to after being in the English and Afrikaans language print media space as they are a conglomerate media company. They are subsidiaries as they under the ownership of a foreign and dominant language media organisation (Salawu: 2013). This therefore means that they are at the mercy

of this conglomerate media company. So far *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* is only available to the Eastern Cape Province and the Western Cape Province Xhosa speaking audiences as they aim to firmly secure and establish a loyal following amongst the isiXhosa speaking people of these two provinces (www.iol.com). It has not yet been launched in Gauteng as they are in the process of solidifying the foundation in the Cape provinces (www.iol.com). This is a logical strategy as most speakers of isiXhosa are in these provinces and the isiXhosa speaker who have migrated to Gauteng can only access the online version of the newspaper this also raises the issues of access to the internet and most people do not know about the existence of an isiXhosa newspaper on this part of the country.

The newspaper is mostly focused on Eastern Cape news and some Western Cape news that are mostly relevant to the people of these two provinces all the news revolve around what happens in these regions and also the big news that happen nationally they also report on it like most newspapers regardless of language. The news content of the newspaper has an organic approach in its coverage of news it is very similar to that of a community newspaper where all the issues that mainstream media would deem not news worthy are being pursued. This is the best approach if they are to permanently establish *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* as the corner stone of isiXhosa print media and also establish the newspaper as the most credible news source as most of their stories are organic as already mentioned above. The coverage of trending news in the mainstream media does also contribute to the growth of *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* and the manner in which the news is covered and interpreted is good for the audience of the of the newspaper.

Bona magazine has arguably been the only representative of the isiXhosa language in the print media space for the last six decades since *Bona* was first published in isiXhosa. It has been like this for all these decades however, it has been dependent on first isiZulu and there after English it was never a standalone independent publication as the content has been translated to isiXhosa from English. The same practice still persists in the current era of the magazine isiXhosa is only one of the target languages that the publication publishes in and the source language is English. So the magazine cannot be said to be an isiXhosa magazine but a translation of an English magazine that is aimed at an African urban demography. This is what *BONA* magazine set out to be exactly when it was first published in 1956 in isiZulu. It was set out to rival *Drum* magazine as one of the magazines that contributed to the culture of urban African migrants from all over the country (Khuzwayo: 2010). Unlike *Drum, BONA*

was inclusive of the rural area audience that *Drum* had neglected *BONA* was included the rural audience as they also contributed significantly in shaping the content of the magazine hence it was in published in isiZulu and a year later in isiXhosa (Khuzwayo: 2010). Bona has always had a reputation of cowardly publication for not challenging the apartheid regime in times of turmoil in the country (Khuzwayo: 2010). *Bona* has always kept and prioritised entertainment outlook as far as the political messages or rather dissent about apartheid there is no publication that stands out about the magazine being anti-apartheid.

This is however an unfair comparison and unfair to *Bona* single out *Bona* as a magazine that was not politically conscious and progressive as that is what it is thought of about *Drum* even in this current era (Khuzwayo: 2010). This is not only unfair but also bias it has to be acknowledged that *Drum* was the most bold of the two publications in the apartheid era *Drum* was not entirely a political magazine therefore *BONA* and *Drum* were and still can be summed up as "soccer, sex and sin" that is what they have always been (Khuzwayo: 2010). Bona like Isolezwe is run or rather falls into the subsidiary model as the isiXhosa translated version is dependent on one single dominant language that runs the institution itself and that language is English. It can be argued that Bona is not a necessarily exciting magazine as those who are responsible for translating the magazine into isiXhosa are responsible for sourcing content for the magazine. The title of Bona which means '*see/look*' in all Sotho and Nguni languages has been kept maybe to stick and remind people of the heritage of the magazine and its isiZulu origins. It can also be argued that it was also to keep the African market after it was acquired by Republican press and English was made the main language and the point of departure as far as the production of the magazine is concerned.

The translators of the Xhosa version of the magazine are confined into a singular and repetitive job that does concern being part and parcel of the production conceptualisation process they only deal with the outcome of those two processes. One can only assume that the excitement of the translating the magazine in the long term wanes. One can also be cynical about the translated version of *BONA* and argue it does not aid the language of isiXhosa in its development as the language has to be adapt to the its language stylistics to that of the English culture and the content dictates that trend. Meaning the words and sentences of the translation are not necessarily produced within the conceptual framework of isiXhosa but that of English and its culture and this only benefits the institution with the earnings from selling the magazines. The translated version of *BONA* does not work in the

interest of the development of isiXhosa but only its popularity and that was what the magazine has been doing for the past sixty one years it has only been maintaining the popularity and therefore relevance of isiXhosa in print media. The disappointing thing about *BONA* or rather isiXhosa print media in relation to the magazine, is that the popularity of isiXhosa in print media that has been sustained by *Bona* and it is only now that a newspaper in isiXhosa has been initiated in the form of *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* and nobody has acted on the popularity of the translated *BONA*. The orthography of isiXhosa lags behind as it is plagued by inconsistencies as alluded to in the above chapter about the issues of aspiration as the still adhere to the rules of old orthography. They again use the updated versions they do not know where they stand with the orthography these problems a synonymous with *BONA* magazine.

BONA magazine in the contemporary era has not diverged that much from the original ideals that has come to define *BONA*, as it is still aimed at the African market and it is the corner stone of the success of the magazine. It has however, taken on the traits and aesthetics international fashion and lifestyle magazines from around the world. If one takes *BONA* for a foreign magazine from Europe or America for it has taken most of its aesthetics and stylistics from foreign magazines. This is because they have become the standard bearers of magazine stylistics and everyone has come to follow their 'pioneering' ways and *BONA* is no different and immune to these influences. These standards are dictated by European ideals that and *BONA* is run and produced within these ideals the content of the magazine reflects most of these ideals they have mostly famous people or celebrities on the cover of their magazine. This is one way of attracting consumers to by the magazine for there is a feature article on the celebrity about anything interesting happening about their careers and their personal lives which at times borderlines gossip. This magazine is mostly targeting the female consumers as it is a female oriented magazine and most of the content is helping the female audience/consumer. The magazine has a women empowerment theme that runs through it has not taken the gossip route like it old arch rival *Drum* and its new rival in *Move* magazine (Khuzwayo: 2010).

The adoption of the European stylistics and aesthetics led to the sacrificing of the features that made *Bona*, unique from its competitors and it made it a unique African magazine as *Bona* has become an African version of an English or European magazine. *Bona* magazine changed much of its features that resonated very much with its African audience like the

Bafanas cartoon strip which was its trademark and the short stories that were famous with their audiences. It has been argued that *Bona* had to come to the 21st century as it was left behind or stuck in the 20th century they therefore had to do away with the old practices if they are to be on par with another competitor by the name of *True Love* magazine. *Bona* got rid of the features that made it stand out from other magazine and these features had a sentimental value with their audience. These features in a way made *BONA* an almost authentic isiXhosa magazine and the magazine did not have a feel of a translated magazine specifically with the aforementioned features. From some of my experiences there were readers of the magazine who believed that *BONA* is an isiXhosa magazine and it is not translated from English. This means that the magazine did not have a European feel and it resonated with their audience more it is not that it is not resonating with their audience right now it does.

But that is mostly because they have taken the same direction as *True Love* magazine and it is about featuring classy and empowering narratives. The price of the magazine also reflects what *BONA* magazine has always aimed to achieve the price has been raised three times in four years from R12 in 2014 R16 in 2017. By the look of things they are aiming at reaching the R20 mark and that would put *BONA* in an elite category of magazines that are of high quality and they seem to be looking at the black middle class to buy the magazine more and they might reconnect with their mother tongue. But that is unlikely the case especially with the middle class reconnecting with their mother tongue even when the choice is offered the reasoning is along the lines of why should they bother reading a magazine in isiXhosa when it was originally written in English and it is available. Therefore lack of originality overall in the isiXhosa version of *BONA* is a demotivation factor as far as the middle class is concerned. The writing spaces in which the translators of *BONA* is another limiting factor as those page spaces are meant to fit English words.

BONA is now a heavily sanitized version of its former self it has been brought into the 21st century where it is more about the glamour than what sets *BONA* apart from other magazines. Bona is supposed to be different from other magazines as it is serving the African audience and it is also serving them in isiXhosa one of the African languages. However, that is apparently not the case as it has been homogenised to fit into the European standards of aesthetics and stylistics. The sanitising process meant that the magazine had to get rid of the feature articles that make the magazine unique as discussed above those are features of the 20th century and do not form part of the future of *BONA*. This has a direct bearing on the

corpus development aspect of the language as it resulted in as there has been a number of errors that happen. This aspect is revealed in the interviews that I did with the isiXhosa translators and the production manager of *BONA* and they were bluntly truthful to say they are not hire to develop the language but rather to sell a magazine:

SK: *It is compromised because the people are not really running away from learning isiXhosa they do not want to think too much when reading a magazine they do not want find themselves doing research asking what certain terms mean.*

JL: *Let go back to the issues of knowing your reader the culture and background a translator is the secondary author of the text if the translator does not under the text the first time it will be difficult for the reader. We do come across some difficult articles that will require you to simplify the language so the reader will clear understand what you have wrote. When an English text plays with words you cannot do the same as it will lose the essence of the meaning. And remember we are in business we are competing with many magazines we cannot be using these bombastic words when translating.*

BONA should be learning from *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* as stated above that it was the attempts to resuscitate *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* that led to the direct formation of *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* for they are setting the newspaper apart from its namesake isiZulu newspaper. *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* has taken features from the old *IsiGidimi* newspaper like writing articles on history of certain tribes and they became part of the Xhosa nation and these are usually stories of the *amaHlub*i nation. *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* has brought this unique trademark that made *IsiGidimi* unique in the 19th century apart from the political dissident of the newspaper and the history lessons were central to the success of the paper and they are still a rich source of information about events of pre-colonial South Africa. This is a fascinating look history meaning the newspaper was also educating its readers it was not only about informing the readers. *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* has adopted those very same practices on the historical lessons that it writes for the newspaper and that is a very unique. Unlike its namesake that has adopted the tabloid style and manner of writing and it not much different from other tabloid English daily newspapers excerpt for *Daily Sun,* which only focuses on sensationalising stereotypes of everyday black life and compared to the two Nguni language newspapers they are doing a better job at representing their respective audience.

At this stage it is not known whether these adopted trademarks from the 19th century will last for how long and whether they will suffer the same fate as those of *Bona,* who were discarded

for they were not part of the 21st century remains to be seen. It is clear to see that *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* is trying to or rather has been replicating *IsiGidimi* with its history lessons and this has been even lauded by the MEC for Recreation, Arts and Culture Pemmy Majodina for the story about *amaNywabe* people (01 June 2016). This is clearly a positive move by the newspaper to reintroduce people to history in most instances their family history that they do not know and are not aware of. They are not looking at making *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* the 21st century version of *IsiGidimi* but they have taken the right direction in making the newspaper to be different from its namesake. The newspaper is well on par with the current affairs of the country and those of its region relevance is not an issue, a newspaper or a print media text that serves an African demography like Isolezwe and Bona are supposed to have trademark features that define their audiences irrespective of class. The only text that seems to be achieving this goal is *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* and they are not entrenching the newspaper into the European stylistics and aesthetics like *Bona*. This is because the former is conceived, conceptualised and produce in isiXhosa, and the content of the newspaper reflects that they do not imagine their audience they know their audience. While the latter is a translated text and to be frank there is nothing special about it and they seem to imagine their audience and they homogenise their audience in a discourse that is fairly foreign and its point of departure.

Chapter 6

5.1 Editorial Copy Analysis: A Closer Look

The issue of language development should be at the centre of African language media publications for they publish in that particular African language. This is not to say that African language print publications should exclusively spear head the topic and the debate of developing African languages. What some people might not realise is that an act of publishing in an African language like isiXhosa is a significant step in developing the language in the print media space. So, therefore the issues and the challenges of developing isiXhosa should be addressed more often. This should be considered for isiXhosa is a codified language that is read by the speakers of the language and it can be fully and further developed only when there is a will to do so. IsiXhosa does not have a significant political patronage from the democratic government that claims to protect it. That is not the case as it is and has been exploited by the private sector media that does not look out for its protection only to economically gain from it by exploiting the language. The relationship between isiXhosa and private media that publish in isiXhosa is one way it is not mutually beneficial to both parties. One party continues to reap the economic benefits while the other is becoming linguistically stagnant as it is policed not to be "too deep" as they might run the risk of losing readers and they do not want to "confuse" them. Developing isiXhosa means exactly that the readers learning new terms, words and concepts and also the idioms this is a significant part of developing a language. Most black people who can speak English as a second language learnt English in this way where most terms, words and phrases and idioms by the way of research even in magazines this is revealing of the attitudes towards English and isiXhosa by the speakers of isiXhosa.

A newspaper that is written in isiXhosa does not and should not mean that it is a fashion statement or a badge of honour that does not carry any significant meaning behind it. Because of the situation in which the language finds itself in this era of post-apartheid and democracy where the country is being homogenised under the English language (McCarty: 2003). More has to be done by print media texts that publish in isiXhosa as the language is under attack from the global dominance of English through the guise of globalisation (McCarty: 2003). A language like isiXhosa is undermined and utterly disregarded from both sides as there are negative attitudes from the speakers who only reminisce about the language when they pronounce how proud they are to be Xhosa and African. The other side only looks to exploit isiXhosa in its own way thus making it a one dimensional language that does not contribute

to the discourse of promoting and developing isiXhosa. IsiXhosa has been confined in performing and fulfilling the same functions that is translating and interpreting Eurocentric knowledge and instructions that are continuing to be imposed upon African people.

IsiXhosa is at the mercy of English and the economic assault on isiXhosa suggests that it will not be slowing down any time soon as this means that it will be slowing the economic progress of the country (McCarty: 2003). IsiXhosa does not come with any recognised economic power which leads many of the speakers to neglect it and focus on English as it has economic benefits. This therefore means that isiXhosa is not recognised as a resource for it is not a resource but with isiXhosa print media this outlook of isiXhosa not being a resource will change but the change is not as drastic as it needs to be. The greater public is not fully conscious about a language being a resource and they are not aware that a language is a resource this is because they do not have a socio-linguistic knowledge and education about language that imparts this aspect. The first language speakers of African language do not recognise English as a resource but they are aware that it is very important if they are to find employment. This is because they are not conscious or rather have not been educated about it they were rather indoctrinated about the superiority of English (McCarty: 2003).

IsiXhosa print publications should and must address language and culture related news and issues in their editions as that is part of developing isiXhosa from all perspective and aspects. Writing or targeting isiXhosa speaking communities and regions as that is the most logical approach as it is done by *Isolezwe lesiXhosa*. Since *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* was launched in March 2015 they have so far been doing well in pointing out and covering issues that affect people in the various regions of the Eastern Cape Province. It is very important to point out that is through a print media publication that cultural issues can be addressed adequately unlike in television and radio where there is only a limited time to do that. This often does not do justice to the cultural topic at hand for it is hardly ever revisited. Every year around June the news headlines will be dominated by the headlines of botched circumcises in illegal initiation schools. While the dying boys in these schools is an indisputable fact we are yet to see another side of the initiation tradition as it has only been one narrative that has been reported for many years now. It is only *Isolezwe* that can adequately cover and hopefully change the narrative by not only focusing on the negative which is the deaths of the boys in initiation schools. In these two years of existence *Isolezwe* has not sufficiently dealt with the narrative of reporting about illegal initiation schools and botched circumcisions. The newspaper has so far dealt with the issues of language attitudes and cultural/religious beliefs

as far as problematizing some of these beliefs. Since the paper is still only available in the Eastern Cape Province and it is the hard copy version that is only distributed in the province it is not available on other provinces of the country.

The stories and coverage of issues relating to language and culture have not been a prominent coverage on the newspaper even in the opinion page issues of language and culture are not covered more often. What I have noticed is that *Isolezwe* has adopted the structure and stylistics of its ancestral predecessor *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* in particular the editorial and opinion pages. The newspaper has continued or picked up one of the most important aspects from the ancestral publication and that is writing and telling the history of the various clans of the Xhosa nation. This history touches on culture and language precisely as it tells the story of their origin and emigrations and one of those articles on the history of amaNywabe as one of the prominent clans in the Eastern Cape. The Articles states that they are originally from Lesotho meaning they are Sotho but now in the modern times they have been adopted by the Xhosa nation and therefore have become amaXhosa. The most prominent person to come from amaNywabe people is Charlotte Maxeke a very well-known anti-colonialist and apartheid activist and member of the African National Congress (ANC) who is now one of the struggle icons of South African history. This newspaper is clearly playing a very important role in writing about history concerning the people of the Eastern Cape and their various tribes. In another article (1 June 2016) Pemmy Majodina MEC for sports and recreation and culture she reiterated and endorsed the newspaper and its importance of people to buy and read the newspaper as it plays a very crucial role in restoring and reviving interest in the language and the literature of isiXhosa. IsiXhosa literature does not have any patronage from the speakers as a result people do not have knowledge of history and significant stories that tells the history. She also praised the newspaper about writing about history as she referenced the above mentioned story of amaNywabe, by doing this the newspaper is instilling and reviving interest in isiXhosa literature.

When there is a publication like *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* they are clearly doing a good job of addressing issues of and challenges facing isiXhosa holistically because the struggle of isiXhosa is not that the speakers do not speak the language. The struggle is also that people do not engage with Xhosa literary texts outside of school people do not engage with literature for they treat it as a school subject rather than an essential resource to their daily routine. The long-time struggle is that of people praising and worshiping English as the alfa and omega of all languages English is being put on pedestal by speakers of African languages. People's

attitude of abandoning isiXhosa is a reflection of an "exercise of power by the dominant over the disenfranchised" (McCarty: 2003). This is a clear indication that it goes back to the economics those who have strong businesses determine the order of things. The economic aspects of language developing isiXhosa does not aid the process of revitalising isiXhosa. The economic aspect is just one of many issues but the negative attitudes have to do with psycho-social issues.

This is reflected by an article in *Isolezwe* (16 February 2017) where MEC Pemmy Majodina states that those who promote English are still mentally oppressed as there are black people who mock other black for not speaking English 'properly'. This negative attitude has unfortunately been passed down from one generation to the other amongst black people. The MEC was speaking on this idea that people are quick to promote a foreign language that is English, the importance of an indigenous language is not as important as the European language. Indigenous languages are devalued by the speakers as they do not recognise the value of holding on to them as English 'connects' you with the world (McCarty: 2003). The MEC continues to explain how people have become slaves to the language that does not cater for their needs and it does not empower them to be self-employed and self-sustaining.

Isolezwe lesiXhosa is doing a good job of holistically addressing issues and challenges that language and culture are constantly faced with especially with the assault of the globalisation propaganda machine. The newspaper celebrates artists and musician who are from the Eastern Cape and who sing in isiXhosa as it is through their music that they also promote isiXhosa. This is in an article (24 June 2016) that applauds these musicians for singing and expressing themselves in isiXhosa as it has become rare as most artist sing in English and they conduct their interviews in English. It pays tribute first to Mariam Makeba who was one of the first artist from South Africa to sing in isiXhosa, and to sing traditional isiXhosa songs to an international audience in Europe and America. Another singer is Margaret Mcingana who is from Komani around the same as Miriam Makeba she was also performing in prominent stages of in Europe. Her famous song *"Hamba Bhekile, sukuhlala ndawonye!"* is known all over the world and therefore one of the famous isiXhosa songs. Musicians from other genres who sing in isiXhosa legendary jazz musician Zim Ngqawana is another who has graced the genre with language with beloved songs such as *"Qhula kwedini" "Amagoduka", "Kumnandi eBhofolo kulo mama"* and *"Unamaqhinga na?"*. Ringo Madlingozi is known to be the one that serenades women with his romantic songs is one of

the great artists to have contributed significantly in singing in the language as most of his songs are popular.

Other artists who are doing as good of a job and have been so for years are Thandiswa Mazwai, Zahara, Dumza Moswane, Camagwini, Siphokazi, Dumza Maswane and Zonke. There is a special mention for Nathi Mankayi amongst all these artists as he does not compromise even in interviews as he speaks isiXhosa it does not matter which platform he always speaks isiXhosa even when the interviewer is speaking English. The other prominent international musicians who always spoke their languages when interviewed mentioned in the article, are Salif Keita from Mali; Baaba Maal and Yossou both from Senegal; Cesaria Evora from Cape Verde and the band Irmaos Verdades. The music of the artists mentioned above have played a significant role in the development of isiXhosa and in also sustain and restore interest in isiXhosa. As it has been the music of these artists that people get to learn new words, idioms and phrases both the speakers and the non-speakers of isiXhosa. People do not mind paying and a reasonably hefty price for a music album of an artist for it is at most times the messages that is being relayed that is most important to the audience who love these artists.

IsiXhosa stories on television have become few for if people were to be asked which stories that were written in isiXhosa and are based in the Eastern Cape Province, chances are that people will tell you about the old classics like *Ingqumbo yeminyanya* (Wrath of the Ancestors) and *Ityala lamawele* (Case of the Twins) which were made in the 1990's and were adopted from Novels. There have been a few Xhosa drama's over the years and they have been few and far between. In the newspaper an article from 01 June 2016 about attempts that are being made to create an isiXhosa soapie that will be based in the Eastern Cape Province. This soapie aims to teach and promote isiXhosa cultural traditions like *ulwaluko* and *utsiki* it will also be centred on other important traditions in the Xhosa culture. Some of the traditions including the ones mentioned above are misunderstood and people tend to criticize them out of ignorance and misunderstanding and this is due to the negative media coverage. Apart from this it is also a response of what the former SABC COO Hlaudi Motsoeneng advocated for that is the production of local TV content as he was also advocating that these stories should not only be produced in the Gauteng Province. This soapie if it will get done will also be impacting on the development of isiXhosa and it will be positive similar to the musicians that sing in isiXhosa it might or rather has a potential of being in the same category as the classics that preceded it. It should be pointed out that just because a song or film or television

story is being sung in Xhosa does not mean that it has impact on the audience it is mostly the content of the songs or story that make people love and revere them as there has been a number of stories and numerous songs that were made and written in the language but are irrelevant.

The issue of illegal circumcision schools has been alluded to above in this chapter but it has only been looked on the negative side by the media especially. The good work that is being done every year on June and December is usually under reported *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* has so far fulfilled the function. There are few articles about the positive outcomes and initiatives that have always been in place to make sure that the practice becomes a success hopefully these few of many to come. Some of these articles that have highlighted the positives of this tradition, an article from 27 July 2017 about the safe return of disabled boys'from *ulwaluko* and all seven of them returned with no complaints. These particular initiates are from eNgqushwa in the Eastern Cape, it should be pointed out that a story about disabled initiates is not a new in this tradition they have always been accepted and taken care of within this old tradition in some parts of the province.

This goes back to the under reporting of such significant cases as they are not 'newsworthy' and this has been the trend about this tradition. It is clear that these significant cases for the tradition are not important as far as the mainstream media is concerned, *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* is playing an important role in balancing the narrative as it should. The same area iNgqushwa does not have a history of initiates dying in but it has embraced an initiative that has been spearheaded by the Eastern Cape government to prevent such tragedies. This is in an article from 21 July 2017 this is to also sweep and rid of all the illegal initiation camps that are not approved by the Chiefs and their counsels, the police are involved in this initiative to prevent these camps from being erected. This is to prevent any possible deaths of initiates as the area has not experienced the death while doing this traditional practice the proof of this is in the preceding articles about disabled initiates. These stories should be dominating *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* as it is the only newspaper can relate to the people in this region and a fair and balanced views can be adequately addressed by this newspaper.

The issue of religion and African spirituality has been one of the most contested and controversial issues that has affected African people for all these three hundred plus years since the arrival of Christianity in Africa. Among the Xhosa Kings and Chiefs some of them challenged this new religion and resisted it, some of them accepted the religion and converted

and became Christians amid great resistance from their subjects. The second wave of resistance came from the Xhosa intellectuals from the 1870's who challenged and pointed out the fallacies that Christianity has since indoctrinated the population of Africans. The prominent intellectuals who were the opponents of Christianity are S.E.K Mqhayi, Tiyo Soga, John Tengo Jabavu, William Gqoba and Phambani Mzimba and Elijah Makhiwane. It should be pointed out that all these great intellectuals were converts they were Christian by training but all of them they were well aware of the fallacies that the religion claimed to be as truth (Dondolo: 2016). Hence they were always at odds with the missionary teachers as they held dear the traditional ways of the Xhosa people as they would always visit them against the will of the missionaries (Opland in Dondolo: 2016). Christianity has always been debunked by the above mentioned as a sham that it is however, the most hated among these intellectuals was Mqhayi and he was not liked by the church people as he was the one that was telling them of how wrong they are About their new religion (Opeland: 2009).

The debate of Christianity Looking down on African spirituality and beliefs dismissing them as pagans, savage and barbaric and this is still a thorny issue in the contemporary South African society. A platform to discuss these issues has not been available as the discussion of this specific issue as it quickly becomes an emotive issues hence debate and discussion about and around this subject is not encouraged. Ntsikana is said to be the first Xhosa king to accept and converts to Christianity and this act is seen by some as betrayal and some look at it as the first significant step to 'civilisation'. This is in an article from 27 July titled "*Untsikana Wayengeloxoki!"* Nstikana was not a liar. This is a response to an article that claimed and stated Ntsikana is a traitor and he betrayed the Xhosa nation by accepting Christianity. The author of the article is clearly arguing from a Christian stand point as he defends Ntsikana that he was a prophet who was 'entered' by the Holy Spirit and then he prophesised about the coming of white people and they had with the a book. Clearly he is arguing that Ntsikana did foresee the coming of white people and that is the base of his argument. The article that he is responding to states that Ntsikana is a traitor for he sold his nation to the Christian Faith that resulted in many conflicts that divided the Rharhabe nation. He continues to state further that Ntsikana did not act in the best interest of the Rharhabe nation as his conversion aided the agenda of the missionaries. He having been entered by the Holy Spirit was validating the beliefs of the missionaries as they claim that Ntsikana was Christian. The author that defends Ntsikana claims that the stories that people reference about the way of life of African people was written by Europeans on first account witness and they take them as evidence. This is

quite ironic as he uses stories from the bible as evidence of African people contact with Christianity. This is ironic because he uses a book that came with Europeans as evidence that the stories of Christianity among Africans are true. This is definitely not an objective look at the history of Christianity in relation to Ntsikana's conversion to Christianity.

S.E.K Mqhayi is not safe from harsh and misguided criticism as an article about him being a misleading person and encouraging people to let go of their traditional ways and embrace Christianity. Like in the article above the author of this article from 27 July 2017 Claims that Mqhayi did the same thing as Ntsikana and misled a nation and led it to Christianity the author takes case with two of Mqhayi's book one of which is *Inzuzo* and the already mentioned classic *Ityala lamawele.* The author claims that the latter is a story that was inspired or rather translated from the story of Jacob and Esau from the bible and Mqhayi made it look like it is from the Xhosa culture. What is clear about the author is that he does not have the historical knowledge and the context about isiXhosa authors and the conditions they were working under in those colonial periods. By this I mean that there was an intense gatekeeping of sort that was making sure that isiXhosa writers like Mqhayi and his peers write books that were furthering the agenda of converting people to Christianity. In the article an author of isiXhosa books Sonwabile Mfecane defends Mqhayi and also points out that the manuscripts of these authors went through several governmental and police boards before they could publish a book. They were working under intense close scrutiny so they had to be creative in their writing by using the Christian themes of the bible so to bypass the several gatekeepers. The critic is a Xhosa poet Mzuvukile Manxiwa, he is clearly not informed about the history of publishing books written in isiXhosa and other indigenous languages for he would not make ill-informed statements like he has said about Mqhayi.

Continuing with the theme of Christianity against African spiritual beliefs and the latter continuing to debunk all the fallacies that came with it, Isolezwe in conjunction with the Steve Biko Centre held a cultural panel discussion and debate at Ginsberg, in King Williams Town from an article from 01 June 2017. The title of the article is *"Asinaye uSathana kwinkolo yesiNtu"* 'We do not have Satan in African belief' the discussions at this event were about the African spiritual belief system. One of the panellists Phuthumile Fuyani stated that there is no Satan in African beliefs if there is he came with those that brought Christianity to Africa. This is because the creator does not curse a person and he continues to say that a person in African does not have sin, and there is no heaven for if there was Africans would

have it here on earth. African spirituality is a way of life people are not converted to it but rather are born into it and we believe that there is a creator for we have ancestors.

This great information about African spiritual system as being backward and civilised is being tackled and challenged in this discussion. The discussion came to also speak to alcohol or rather the importance of 'umqombothi' when rituals are done Europeans often dismissed as an excuse for Africans to get drunk. Fuyani states that there is no ritual that gets people drunk for the fun of it that is not African culture that came with Europeans when they would hold Chiefs and kings hostage and forcefully make them drink alcohol so to coerce them. The only culture that had rituals of asking for rain during the times of drought its African no other culture in the world has that ritual, as a result it is now pastors of the church who pray for the rain in the times of drought that is part of African Culture not western culture. Dreams are important in African culture for they communicate a message this message might be a warning that one should be careful or there is something of a ritual of sort that you should perform or do. Therefore dreams of this nature should not be disregarded and dismissed as an ordinary dream for these are ancestors communicating with a person.

Ever since the missionaries came in South Africa they have made it their mission to convert the indigenous people into Christianity as already mentioned above. This mission was made easy when they targeted the kings and chiefs for they were ruling their tribes and once the kings and the chiefs the whole nation and tribe would be obliged to convert. This way was less tedious than going to individuals and forcing them to convert to Christianity. The practice of making a King to accept the 'holy spirit' is still practiced in the 21st century. This is in an article dated 09 March 2017 the king of amaMpondo Zanozuko Sigcawu accepted the 'holy spirit' this was done by the Twelve Apostle in Christ Church (TACC) when they visited the king at his place to do the ceremony. This means that the king is now the member of the church as he has accepted the 'holy spirit' this practice is common among the kings of the various nations as it said the king of Xhosa nation Zwelonke Sigcawu, had also accepted the 'holy spirit' the previous month which February. The ceremony was done by the same apostle church TACC and their lead apostle carried out the proceedings this also means that Zwelonke Sigcawu is a member of the church and the king was there to support Zanozuko Sigcawu. A spokesperson of the king Zanozuko Sigcawu, Chief Mzwandile Maraqana says that the Mpondo kingdom are familiar with this practice as it was first done by ancestor king Faku in 1828. It is said that the king Faku went to Grahamstown to accept the Holy Spirit by the church so the practice is not new amongst. It is clear that Faku followed the lead from

Ntsikana who first converted to Christianity in 1822. One of the leading authorities in isiXhosa cultural practices and history Nokuzola Mndende says that it is not a problem that the king was visited by the church (TACC). However they take issue with the statement that the king is accepting the 'holy spirit' for the concept of the 'holy spirit' is not a Christian concept and this therefore means it is not for Christians only, in the African spiritual beliefs the 'holy spirit' does manifest itself. One does not know whether to say it is unfortunate that the practice of this nature is still happening in the various kingdoms of the Xhosa nations for they were meant to isolate Africans from their traditions and way of life.

Politics in the Eastern Cape played a prominent role in shaping the province to be what it is no however, the focus was only on those who fought the apartheid as a result went to exile or were jailed in Robben Islam. The creation of the Bantustans by the Apartheid government in the 1960's as controversial as it was it did however led to the emergence of great politicians. One of those astute politicians was Daliwonga Mathanzima who led the Transkei as the Eastern Cape was divided into two the afomentioned region and Ciskei, Mathanzima took leadership role in 1979 from Bhota Sigcawu who passed away. This is from an article dated 08 June 2017 Mathanzima was born in Qamatha in 1915 he is from the Thembu royal household in Rhode he was the chief of the Thembu nation in Rhode. His reign ended in 1986 and it was his younger brother George Mzimvubu Mathanzima that succeeded. Mathanzima encouraged Agricultural education for the province is a rural province agriculture has to be at the centre of the economy.

It was Mathanzima who fought white owned business from entering the Transkei market with their supermarkets like Shoprite and Pick and Pay for black owned supermarkets had to grow in that market therefore their growth was protected. It is sad and unfortunate that the current leadership did not restore this very important initiative as the afomentioned retailer are now a dominant force in all the places were black people reside. He fought for the creation of the University of Transkei (Unitra) which was under the University Of Fort Hare. Current politicians one of them prominent Bantu Holomisa had nothing but good to say about Mathanzima as he also alluded to the fact that the economic programmes that supported a black economic structure and that is perhaps his greatest legacy the creation of a black economy in the Transkei. Which the current dispensation not carried out similar programmes to make sure that black entrepreneurs thrive independently of white economic institutions. Hence he was celebrated for his impact he has had on politics at his home in Qamatha this great politician is at least celebrated fittingly as he was revered by his peers also with his

improvement of tertiary institutions in the region a number of colleges were built under his leadership.

An article from 23 June encourages the Xhosa speaker to learn other languages especially if they live in the Gauteng province which is a multilingual space and people encounter all the official indigenous of South Africa. It is important for South Africans to know at least one language outside of the Nguni group languages as they are mutually intelligible we should learn a language from the Sotho language group this is to sort of strike a balance as far as the competency of the individuals of Sotho languages. People often dwell on fallacies when it comes to learning languages like that people should be proud of who they are and speak their mother tongue. A statement like this needs to be contextualised for if a person feels pressurized to speak a language maybe like English, when there is no need to do so the person must speak their mother tongue. However for the sake of balancing the knowledge of other indigenous languages it is important that Nguni language provinces like the KwaZulu-Natal and the Eastern Cape adapt a Sotho language this is in the spirit of learning. People should not be narrow minded about languages this is part of educating people about indigenous languages especially for we interact with all other speakers of African languages that those of the English and Afrikaans speaking communities.

The above examples from *Isolezwe lesiXhosa* demonstrate that this newspaper even though it is in the grips of a conglomerate media company they have managed to cover issues that revolve around culture and language. Language and Culture are two sides of a coin and the articles show this strong link and theme for we cannot speak adequately about language while isolating culture they are not independent of each other. Issues that affect culture and language are so far being adequately addressed this is because they took the formula from the ancestral newspaper *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* when it was addressing political and cultural issues that was affecting the native people of South Africa. The critique of western culture through Christianity is an old and still relevant critique this is because now there are so called pastors who make their congregants eat grass, drink Dettol and are sprayed with DOOM, the critique and criticism of Christianity will never way as long as such activities are still happening. People are humiliated in the name of Christianity and yet the hypocrisy of Christianity is not being addressed as it should like in some of the articles above by cultural scholars. Misreporting of culture practices is one of the problems that people of the Xhosa speaking nations always face for the mainstream media focuses on the spectacular like the deaths of initiates. While forgetting that the righteous passage to manhood in this culture is

the most important to a young man even those who are disabled do under go this practice. It is just sad that BONA magazine is not part of this movement as far as addressing language and cultural issues they only translate what has been written in English to isiXhosa. The down fall of Isolezwe though is that these issues that have been discussed above are mostly features of the opinion pages they are not part of the headline news as those pages are reserved for the Everyday life happenings. Which the newspaper is doing very well in addressing the issues that affect people of the Eastern Cape Province from crime to pension schemes to male prostitutes who are in this line of work to feed their families.

5.2 Interview Analysis

The analysis of the interviews is to demonstrate the neglect of corpus develop, the exploitation of isiXhosa and the other two indigenous languages at Caxton Media and BONA magazine. In saying this the struggles that are faced by the isiXhosa version of the magazine are somehow tired to the lack of use of rich language. The questions revolve around the nurturing, development of isiXhosa in the institution most of the questions extend from the lack of presence of an editorial policies. The full interviews are provided in Appendix 1.

The first question asks the participants responsibilities at *BONA*, Siviwe Khulu and Nkosinathi Mafutha are isiXhosa translators and Johannes Letsohla, what is somewhat interestingly odd is that the latter translator's title is isiXhosa editor. It is odd in that he does not do an editor's job he is a translator like his colleague Siviwe Kulu (SK henceforth). The only person here who is not a translator is Johannes Letsohla (JL henceforth) as he is the production manager of BONA, though he started as a translator from 2003 until 2011 when he was promoted to the position that he is in right now. The isiXhosa editor of *BONA* does exactly the duties as his co-translator and he is given an editor title. The translators have been working for *BONA* magazine for ten years that is the "editor" and five years. The only person who has worked in the print industry of isiXhosa is Nkosinathi Mafutha (NF henceforth) he worked for Maskew-Miller book Publisher, he is the only one that has worked in another different environment and dimension of isiXhosa print industry. As he was editing learner and teacher guides and curriculums, after working for ten as a teacher teaching isiXhosa. SK it's his first time venturing into the isiXhosa language print sector. From the fourth question until the last question, the questions probe about their experiences and asks for their opinions about the state of isiXhosa and other African languages at Caxton.

The analysis chapters that precede this chapter are the institutional analysis, the overview chapter and the content analysis. These three chapters are layered with the themes of lack of development of isiXhosa through policies that do not acknowledge and support its presence within the institution of Caxton and Independent News Media. The lack of support of development from these institutions and from the government has led to the sustaining and perpetuation of the myth that English is superior and indigenous languages are inferior. As a result of these attitudes the isiXhosa version of *BONA* is lagging behind when compared to their isiZulu and Sesotho counterparts. This is confirmed by the interviewees when they were asked about their impressions about the state of isiXhosa print media they said:

SK: "*Unfortunately, I wish I could say nice things about isiXhosa but it is not growing, unfortunately here in South Africa, there are only two languages that when you do something everybody something everybody will run after it, that is Afrikaans and isiZulu. This also because of the stereotype that Xhosa people like to speak English which is unfortunately true, as a result isiXhosa is the least selling publication the bestselling is English followed by isiZulu then Sesotho and isiXhosa is last. We are not losing the audience but they are not growing because we have a loyal audience that always buys the magazine."*

Mr Khulu is conceding some unfortunate truths about the isiXhosa speaking people that they somewhat have a negative attitudes and perception about isiXhosa. Mr Mafuta shares and reflects the same views and information as he answered and said

NM*: "If there are Xhosa speaking people a magazine like BONA should have an impact. The only thing I can say is that what I have discovered is that the people who supposed to buy isiXhosa and read isiXhosa generally do not buy the magazine they only buy the English magazine. I do not know whether it has to do with being educated or what. Other ethnic groups like the Zulus and the Sotho's are buying their magazines and Xhosa people, do not buy the magazine they do not read isiXhosa an example is the sales you will see that English is number 1, isiZulu is number 2 Sesotho is number 3 and isiXhosa is last. IsiXhosa is not the option that they opt for it is just another language".*

Interestingly the two translators they spoke about the sales of the isiXhosa *BONA* to prove and justify their case by revealing that isiXhosa is the least selling magazine as the readers choose English. Mr Khulu emphasised that they are not necessarily losing the audience they just have a very loyal audience base that is sustaining the magazine. What this means is that the isiXhosa version of *BONA* has spectacularly stagnated as there is no telling how bad the

sales of this version are, he also states that if the sale grow it is usually not more than two percent. Mr Letsohla is the only one who has positive outlook about the growth of African languages but he was very realistic about at the same time.

JL*: "It is growing a little bit but people still have that perception that a person must know a foreign language like English, which is wrong for in South Africa we are a diverse country. I disagree with the fact that when you are 100% fluent in English you are the best. People should speak their languages for if they do not they will lose their culture."*

By stating the negative perceptions that people have about African languages which is a problem that South Africa is faced which and perhaps it is also showing in the sales of the magazine. From the three answers from the interviewees it is quite clear that they share the same sentiments about the state of African language print media in their case through *BONA* magazine. The follow up question is that the future and stability of isiXhosa in the media space the translators again they reflect a similar view about isiXhosa in the media and in media institutions:

SK: "*In media the 'main' career that you immediately think of is journalism and the language practitioners are supporting careers, but in media and Caxton the main objective is to sell the magazine not to develop a language that is what they are about."*

NM: : "*There are two answers to your question one is positive and the other in negative, I think by now everybody who is not a first language speaker of English, knows that English will swallow their languages so they come up with ways to take a stand we must come up with ways to reclaim and keep the language alive… in the media sector is the answer is I do not know because the media sector is propelled and driven by sales if the magazine does not sell it has to closed so it is about the bottom line is profit if it does sell close it."*

The two answers are in agreement with their analysis of the media and the position that African languages have or occupy in the media not being as significant as one would assume. The answers are also in agreement that the media is about selling the magazine and making money not to develop African languages. Even though publishing in African languages or the presence of isiXhosa in the form of *BONA* magazine is in a way preserving the language only it is not developing it. The is no career in as far as being a journalist at *BONA* using isiXhosa that is reserved and only for the English language speakers the language practitioners at

BONA they are just translators whose skill is required to translate the magazine. Meaning that being a translator or language practitioner at Caxton, is only a supporting career and not the main or the most desired as it is secondary even in the production of the magazine the English version must first be completed before it can be translated. This means that there is no urgency of rather isiXhosa has been stripped of its urgency in the production process of the magazine and it is only confined and defined in a one dimensional role. The positive that one can take from this is that the magazine is at least playing an active role in preserving African languages as far as print media is concerned.

This is because as much as the impact of *BONA* is not at desirable levels it however, impacts in other areas of language development like in the education sector both in the basic and tertiary education sector. That is one area where the impact is mostly felt and appreciated and the question of the impact of *BONA* all the participants were well aware of this from their answers it is clear

SK: "*Yes, I am aware of the impact that Bona has specifically in the education sector where teachers use our articles for material".*

NM: "*Yes, and I am proud of that like there are a lot of teachers who have commended us for the great articles that we have written and they have used our articles to as comprehensions for tests and some for grade 12 papers. Most of them they do not realise that these articles are translated versions of the English source text."*

JL: "*For instance our April issue take that and turn to between page 4-7 there is a student who says she is using BONA magazine as her guideline for her translation studies. She is using the isiZulu language version BONA and the English language version BONA to study the translation techniques. Teachers also write to us to say and ask for permission to extract some of our articles for teaching purposes. So we do have an impact on the education of people and we are aware of it."*

In all fairness it is not surprising that the impact of *BONA* has a big impact on education for that is predictable this is the one place that all other mainstream print texts make their way to. So *BONA* was always going to be appreciated in this sector for it is only in education where isiXhosa and other indigenous languages are valued and taught the other spaces they do not have a role to play. The answers above palpably demonstrate that the magazine is a source material for education material that teachers use for teaching isiXhosa. They are also

commended for the great articles that they write, in the tertiary education sector that is also evident that it is helpful for students who are doing translation studies. The magazine provides some guidelines and a few techniques of translation as already alluded to above that this is one arena where *BONA* was going to thrive. Having said that and also on the topic of translation the translators do concede that there have been some complaints that the language that they use is not 'proper' isiXhosa from the readers.

The response from them is along the lines of people do not know how things work here at *BONA*, one of the major complaints is that they do not write the name of the months in isiXhosa. Instead they write them in English with an isiXhosa spelling for instance February will be written like Februwari and January will be Januwari and March will be Matshi etc. which in this case they readers have a point. The point of reading any form and piece of literature should add on the vocabulary of the reader in this case it appears as if in isiXhosa the name of the months do not exists and they have never been there which is not true. This perpetuates the idea that African never had a sense of time this is what this practice is perpetuating. When they defend themselves they say that the magazine must reflect the way people speak even when we refer to months of the year this is true part with this case specifically they must change it. Referring to the way things work at *BONA* there are restrictions that at time impede on the translation of the text to isiXhosa like the sticking to the same number of pages as the English edition. The translators have taken this challenge well as it is frustrating at times because isiXhosa morphologically conjunctive and it would mean that at most times take more pages than the English version.

They are clearly doing a great job in their translations if their readers are convinced that the magazine is not translated from English. The translators say these space restrictions has pushed them into a creativity corner where they are forced to come with creative solutions in overcoming these impediments. At times this comes at the expense of the language as there would be an omission of isiXhosa terms that the readers would familiarise themselves with, this they express in the question the translation approach that they use in translating the magazine. It also asked whether is down to individual preference or is there some type of prescription that happens internally:

SK: "*We translate the meaning of the text so that people can simply understand the language because a magazine is something that you read to relax."*

SK: "*No, it is not because when I first came here the use of difficult Xhosa words was high as a result; there were some people that I know who were not buying the magazine because of that. This affected the sales of the edition some people who are friends of mine buy our edition because of they were supporting me"*

NM: "*I can say I use them both but most of the time we take the meaning to capture the essence of the texts, this is because of being limited into writing on the same page as English we are forced to be creative. This happens with flowing articles where you see that in this article I must just convey the meaning of this article the message is more important and it allows us to be ourselves. There are articles where you are forced to be descriptive like the recipe pages you cannot take meaning there but you can translate each ingredient and come up with its Xhosa equivalent. There are other article that are technical in that the meaning when you translate it might not come out clearly however, when you read it makes sense you just leave it as it is because of the deadline. The approach is not prescribed by the management of the magazine."*

JL: *"We do not use literal translation but we translate the thought behind the text, we do use idioms to convey the thought essentially the meaning is the most important thing. We do not use a slang type of a language we use formal language".*

Essentially they use the semantic approach in their translations of *BONA* magazine that seems the most common sense approach. In that whole process the use if difficult isiXhosa words is not encouraged too much as it will or might result in negatively affecting the sales. Mr Kulu confirms this in his follow up answer as he states that the use of unfamiliar isiXhosa words was high and that dented the sales of the magazine. What this is emphasizing further is that educating the readers through the use of such terms is not top priority selling the magazine is of top priority. The production manager Mr Letsohla when answering the question of how they reconcile the linguistic creativity by toning down the language he said

JL: *"We do not frustrate our people because we have to write the way people speak meaning we have to write the everyday language because that is how people speak. We cannot write a language that they will not understand and recognise*."

It clearly does not matter whether this is to the detriment of the language they stick to the mandate of writing the way people speak. What all of this is demonstrating is that Caxton and *BONA* magazine do not tie themselves to language development and they do not

acknowledge how intrinsically connected they are to the nurturing and development of isiXhosa. This nonchalant attitude that they seem to embrace is reflected in the idea of what a magazine is, they say a magazine is a text that one reads for pleasure and leisure it is not a text that a reader engages with at the same level as an isiXhosa novel. The specifics of their answers are:

SK: "*It is compromised because the people are not really running away from learning isiXhosa they do not want to think too much when reading a magazine they do not want find themselves doing research asking what certain terms mean*."

JL: *"Let go back to the issues of knowing your reader the culture and background a translator is the secondary author of the text if the translator does not under the text the first time it will be difficult for the reader. We do come across some difficult articles that will require you to simplify the language so the reader will clear understand what you have wrote. When an English text plays with words you cannot do the same as it will lose the essence of the meaning. And remember we are in business we are competing with many magazines we cannot be using these bombastic words when translating."*

The attitudes that they are reflecting on the development of language development are what is expected of them and there is no diverging from the purpose of job of selling the magazine and outperforming competitors. People learning new words and terms is part of language development and people who not see that are at best being disengenuine. Because as people who are accustomed to being second language speakers of English, whenever we read any English language text we get to learn new terms and idioms in the English language. The letter we have learnt we later use in our speech when we speak the language, by this we have added and expanded on our vocabulary of English. The same process applies with African languages when people read the language not only are they educating themselves about the content of the text but also how the content is relayed and framed using words. In this case they are trying their best to balance between the selling a magazine and at the same time trying to be expressive in the language. This is also seen in all four versions of *BONA* where it is said to be four 'editors' and yet it is only one editor who has the power and control of what will be in the magazine eventually Mr Mafutha speaks on the

NM: *"I have always wondered why the titles like the Xhosa editor are, Zulu editor and Sotho editor yet these editors follow the direction of the English editor. It is this editor who decides what must be in this magazine and we have no say. Meaning we are basically translators we*

do not have the benefits and the freedom to write the way we like because my magazine would have more pages that the English text because isiXhosa words are longer than that of the English."

The answer from Mr Mafutha palpably displays the hegemony that English has in the running of the magazine. What they have on the other hand are titles but they do not have the benefits that come with being and editor. Their role is only confined in looking at the language strictly even though I did ask whether are the translator's part of the conceptualisation process of the magazine all them answered with conviction

SK: "*We are very much involved in the conceptualisation of the magazine because we are part of the content meeting that we have twice a month. All the people are encouraged to participate and come up with ideas for the content every month. But then this is done for the magazine not necessarily for the isiXhosa version, but for all the magazine*."

NM: "*Yes, we are for instance tomorrow we have a content meeting where everyone will be there and we will be discussing the May issue and the June so to answer your question we are part of the content meeting*."

JL: "*From the word go everyone is part of the conceptualising process which we call planning meeting. We are a team of 19 people so all of us contribute to the conceptualisation of the magazine so everyone contributes to the content*."

It is interesting that they are part of the content production of the magazine and that is the only space in which they get to have some sense of power and contribution of the magazine. However, they contribute to the English version of the magazine as it this language that has the urgency to run and dictate the way and direction of the content. Even in this process isiXhosa lacks the urgency and the impact that it should maybe at least have in that process. This is the power that Mr Mafutha was referring to this is where it is demonstrated to them that they are not editors they are just translators. Anything else beyond this is that they only contribute their ideas for the magazine, this clearly declares that *BONA* is an English magazine. This is quite a contradiction if you are to juxtapose the English *BONA* and isiXhosa version and discuss them in line with language development as in this situation only one language is being pro-actively being developed. The other indigenous languages are just reactive and their development is reactionary for the discipline of translation is a reactionary

discipline. As it always reacts to new information and knowledge the only conceptualisation process that happen in the translation discipline is the conceptualisation of terms and phrases that communicate ideas better. This is the sense that one gets when interviewing the participants that the only time they get to conceptualise this process only happens in the peripheries of the magazine. Meaning it does not impact the centre as it should therefore it does not add significant value to the grand text and narrative of *BONA.*

The above analysis might come across as harsh but it is the reality that the translators at *BONA* magazine are working around and threading carefully on. The two translators in their interviews they have pointed out the sales of the isiXhosa version are fluctuating they are unstable and already this version is the least selling. The only way is to keep this readership is to further simplify isiXhosa and not add the already existing terms and words that are there in the language as it might affect the sales. The only time when there is a text that does not involve the language source language in the magazine is in the letters written by the readers to the editor. Here we find that this is the only time isiXhosa and the other indigenous languages become the source language in which they have to translate from to English this is pointed out by Mr Khulu and Mr Letsohla.

SK: "*Yes, the readers do write to us in isiXhosa and we will have to translate it to English, because BONA comes out in four different languages which are English, isiXhosa, Sesotho and isiZulu. Our readers do not really know that BONA is translated that is why some of them just write in isiXhosa."*

JL*: "Before I directly answer your question we do find that the source language becomes an African languages we do find the readers writing to us in for instance Sesotho to English."*

This was a pleasant surprise to find out that the readers who read the indigenous language versions of *BONA* they also engage in their respective languages. This is the only time where there is an impetus to serve in African languages and English does not play a primary role. One of the translators came to the defence of *BONA* as the author continued to put the magazine at the centre of language development, and he came out in answering the questions of educating the audience in as far the terms are concerned as they would at times borrow from English unnecessarily. He pointed out that this should be a collaborative effort with the broadcasting partners in television and radio to promote isiXhosa print text like *BONA* in these platforms.

NM: "*Let us not narrow the platforms to BONA as the only one that has to teach and develop the language. The platforms should be broadened to television stories and radios and magazines we must not talk about one magazine BONA other ways to get the language across."*

He is right in as far as saying that language development is and should be a collaborative between different mediums, he did however he misinterpret or misunderstood my line of question about language development. He felt that I am holding *BONA* solely responsible for the mandate improving and developing the language of which I was not doing as I contextualised the discussion to the magazine and Caxton. *BONA* because it is one of very few African language print media text that has been for the past six decades printing and writing in isiXhosa, the growth we have seen, but that change is tangible within the realm of globalisation and the conversation is around globalisation. If you are to look at BONA at first glance you will think that it is an English language magazine by one of many competitors of the magazine for they have embraced the aesthetics and stylistics from American and European magazines.

BONA has for a little over sixty years has been known as an indigenous language magazine this brings me to the second point the attitude of the Xhosa speaking readers. They are clearly to some extent have negative attitude towards isiXhosa version of BONA. To say that they shy away from buying isiXhosa is an understatement as this is supported by the evidence that isiXhosa is the least selling version. The claims by the readers that isiXhosa is hard cannot be easily dismissed as fallacious as there is some credibility to this statement. This is because the audience is well acquainted with isiXhosa through the broadcast mediums like television and radio therefore they hardly read the language they most of the time they listen to the when it spoken. The only time they engage with an isiXhosa literary text is only when they are within the school premises for those that are still at school. Those who are no longer at school or within the schooling system they do not read isiXhosa outside of BONA magazine, it easy to overwhelm the masses with audio visual texts than to with media literature as reading also takes some effort.

As a result the interviewer and the interviewees reached common ground and agreement that BONA, is a magazine that will provide a good foundation for those who are taking upon themselves that they want reconnect with their mother tongue.

NM*: "It depends on the person whether they want to learn their language because if you want to know the language you must pick up a book and read. You must not wait for a magazine to teach you how to read but if a person wants to take it with a slow pace they must start with BONA. Because we write simple isiXhosa then go on to read isiXhosa books where they will find the quality of the language."*

JL: *"Definitely it is the right place for people to start for people to reconnect with their language as BONA as we said that it caters for three languages, and we have a diverse content which is available in all three languages. That makes BONA the perfect place for people to start to reconnect with languages."*

Bona magazine is a good place to start if a person wants to acquaint themselves with the language and move on gradually to the novels of the language but it is down to the individuals to see this through. The question of developing the language the views are not in agreement as the translators the do acknowledge those contributions by Caxton by sending them to translation workshops and connecting them with the scholar experts of the language. However according to the translators this was done a while back they have not been to any translation workshop and seminars.

NM: "*Point one in this institution there is no body like that and there is no body that ensures of the quality use of the languages and that advances African languages in this company. They have in the past sent us to work shop of translators one was in Cape Town that is the only thing that they have done and it is rare that they do that."*

SK: *"It is not as accommodating as it should be but it can be better, But I do not want to lie BONA is doing well. At times they send us to language translation and interpretation workshops that take place in Cape Town."*

Caxton needs to be commended for this practice and efforts in terms of upskilling their translators as it shows a commitment towards the indigenous languages and their workers. From the above abstracts it is easy for the reader to decipher that they have not attended a work shop in a while whether they have stopped going to these seminars it is not clear and also as to when was the last workshop. On the other hand the production manager spoke with conviction that isiXhosa is in a good place at Caxton.

JL: "*Definitely, they are because we make sure that we are up to date with the development of language and we upskill our people to make sure that they are up to par with the language and they are not left behind. In that way we nurture their growth."*

JL: "*Yes, it is because we do have like any other employment sector for skill Improvement we do have the mandate of up skilling our workers everyone in here from the journalist to the language practitioners. For example Pansalb does invite us to conferences and workshops about the development in languages like the news terms and words. So Caxton does grow in these language and Caxton is the only company that publishes in three different languages."*

These two answers are from two different questions and the conviction is evident to an extent that it sounds like they are still attending the workshops, but from the translators above it is clearly not the case they contradict themselves. There seems to be some contradictions between the translators and the production manager not only with the above answers with especially questions concerning the accommodating and nurturing of African languages at Caxton. The theme that comes up when wanting to discuss this issue further is the economic aspect that is a direct reminder that they are not working to change the world using indigenous languages but they are here to make money. I am reminded that it is first a business all the business priorities must be taken care of first the language issue is a secondary and tertiary matter. The translator who spoke frankly about the situations regarding African languages is Mr Mafutha his three responses that paints a fairly vivid picture about the situation regarding language development and position of African languages at Caxton.

NM*: "... in the media sector is the answer is I do not know because the media sector is propelled and driven by sales if the magazine does not sell it has to be closed so it is about the bottom line is profit if it does not sell close it".*

NM: "*Like February we do not say uMdumba because that is the isiXhosa name for the month of February we must reflect the way people speak so they can buy the magazine because we are selling a magazine here, the answer is always that we have to write the way people speak because people do not use the Xhosa month names when they speak. So to answer your question do I see isiXhosa being developed here? No, this institution is not developing the African languages"*.

NM: *"No, they only make money with the languages as to where the languages might be in the next ten years they do not give a… a (whatever) Ha! Ha! Ha! These languages make*

money for the company the company does invest in them for they beat all the other languages hands whether it is English or Afrikaans. It is difficult to say whether Caxton will keep African languages longer."

These responses brings forth and lay bare the agenda which is the theme that has been standing out in this paper and in this methodology chapter. It has been established in these interviews that isiXhosa version of *BONA* is the least selling and running a magazine has so far been described as a 'cut throat' type of business. Yet isiXhosa version is still being produced as much as it has stagnated and is the least selling why has isiXhosa not being closed? Why is isiXhosa still published by Caxton? Because if we are to go with the 'rules' of the business isiXhosa is supposed to be closed. With this one just to give Caxton the benefit of doubt and look at the history of *BONA*, these languages are the heritage of *BONA* and closing down one of the original languages of the magazine might be too harsh of a move. They would be destroying heritage it might be because they are preserving it as it has been there since 1957 and it is one of the trademark languages. In the beginning a significant number of the population was consuming print media in indigenous languages and they were produced in indigenous languages. Hence it was later on it was acquired by a white print conglomerate. *BONA* is synonymous with indigenous languages they are the legacy of the magazine, it might be because of these reasons why isiXhosa version is still published despite it not performing well compared to Sesotho and isiZulu. It is important take note of or consider another reason to makes Caxton to hold on to the African languages is that they make money out these languages as Mr Mafutha. It is not interested about the future of their development progress they are only concerned about their preservation. They are only concerned with one aspect of indigenous languages in as far as their development are concerned with the translation aspect of language. They have been in the business of preserving the African languages and not allowing them to grow for they serve a different purpose to Caxton and its predecessors as a business.

Conclusion

IsiXhosa language print media is a pioneer in indigenous language print media in Africa it is pioneering in all aspects of print media but one, and that is the ownership aspect of print media. It is through a newspaper like *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* where colonialism and it politics of unfairness were challenged head on including the doctrine of Christianity that was avidly supported by its proprietors in the form of missionaries. This newspaper and its successor *Imvo Zabantsundu* were politically and socially responsible for the consciontising the natives of South Africa through the contribution of prominent intellectuals like John Tengo Jabavu, Elijah Makiwane, Samuel Krune Mqhayi, William Gqoba and Phambani Mzimba to mention a few. These are the intellectuals who are responsible for the various political ideologies that South Africa has come to embrace in the democratic dispensation (Dondolo: 2015). These ideologies were articulated through the vessels of *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa* and *Imvo Zabantsundu* in the late 19th century and early 20th century. Later on another newspaper came along and contributed into the same vein of thoughts like its predecessors and counterparts the newspaper was *Izwi Labantu*. These newspapers did not last like their isiZulu newspaper counterpart by the name of *Ilanga* which was started in 1901-02 Langalibalele John Dube.

All the ideas about isiXhosa not being an intellectual language are proven to be a fallacies when one thinks about the above mentioned intellectuals, for all of their politically radical ideas that went against their colonial and missionary mentors were expressed using isiXhosa. They were the philosophers and were philosophic with the language as it is part of who they are it was their identity. All of these ideas are palpable in the newspapers in which they wrote for and they were also historians they were very knowledgeable about the various tribes in the Xhosa nation. This has been demonstrated by this paper that the current generation of isiXhosa print media is a far cry from its predecessors holistically from the conceptualisation processes to the output of ideas and the challenging some political and economic ideas of progress and independence in the democratic South Africa. *BONA* magazine was another revolutionary addition to isiXhosa print media when it came around in 1956 when it was first published in isiZulu and a year later was published in isiXhosa. The magazine was responding to the popularity of *DRUM* magazine an English language magazine which was catering for the African audience. The people who created *BONA* magazine recognised that the *DRUM* lacked the linguistic authenticity to fully cater for the African market they came in to fill in that void. Things Changed for the worse for isiXhosa print media when *BONA* magazine was sold to Republic press white owned company.

It was at this time the magazine began to be translated from English to isiZulu, isiXhosa and Sesotho which was the new addition to the *BONA* family. It is also at this stage where the intellectual and philosophical aspects of isiXhosa were slowly being killed off as the experiences of the world and are conceptualised in the English language. Part of the reason for isiXhosa print media to collapse was that they were not owned and controlled by the black people they were often funded by missionaries, white liberals and sympathisers this is the case *IsiGidimi SamaXhosa*, *Imvo Zabantsundu* and *Izwi Labantu.* As to how they continued to survive as long as they did that remains a mystery considering how the political-economy of the media work. The ideas of euro centricity have been perpetuated in the ownership of African languages print media by conglomerate media companies who are not invested in developing isiXhosa and other African languages. This assertion is not entirely true with Ilanga newspaper which is now owned by Konigkramer who is said to invested in the proper use of the isiZulu by consulting the national isiZulu language body (Tolsi: 2007)

This is what Caxton claims to be doing with isiXhosa and other indigenous languages with *BONA* when the upskill them by the sending them to translation seminars and workshops. This information comes out to be contradictory to the interviews that the author did with the translators and production manager of *BONA* magazine. The translators suggest that it has been since they were sent to one of these seminars by Caxton. While the latter claims that they regularly send the translators to seminars and workshops, they also contradict themselves on the question of the Caxton developing African Languages. The translators are of the view that the institution can do better while the latter again states with conviction that Caxton is a good place for African languages to develop. It is evident that the production manager took a stance of a spokesperson for Caxton and *BONA* magazine. It has been demonstrated in the paper that translated texts lack urgency as they are just vessels that only transfer knowledge and information. They negotiate the experiences of the world through a European language. It is palpable in the text that as much as isiXhosa has access to print media institutions it however, does not enter at the same level as its European language counterparts in the production and conceptualising processes as it is continuously policed thorough the policies of Independent News Media and Caxton that do not look to develop and protect isiXhosa language. They only look to exploit the language in adding to the bottom line of their companies that to make more money out of the language they are not in the business of developing a language but in the business of making money this sentiment is reflected by the interviewees from *BONA* magazine.

This brings us the question that is central to this paper and that has been investigated by this paper that does Independent News Media and Caxton Media have Editorial policies that address the existence and development of isiXhosa? The outcome is Caxton does not have an editorial policy they are guided by the South African Press Code who are in turn take cue from section 16 of the constitution. And it is here where all things regarding the protection of print media are mentioned except for the protection of indigenous language print media which is clearly omitted by this section. Independent News Media does have an editorial code that all its publications abide by however, the editorial code does not address the existence of *Isolezwe* and *Isolezwe lesiXhosa*. Nor does it state that it also publishes in two indigenous languages and it does not address their development meaning that they are the invisible publications. Who this editorial code was not created with them in mind just like section 16 of the constitution was not created with indigenous language print media in mind. These only cater for English and Afrikaans. Thus it means that it is a misnomer to say that print media companies have editorial policies because the only enforce the section 16 segment of the constitution.

It is only the SABC that is mandated by the constitution to develop African languages by the constitution and the print media companies are not mandated by the constitution they are allowed to do as they please. Language development in the media is a collaborative effort it has been showed in the past and the present that the two mediums print and broadcast media (radio and television) work well together. But only the SABC is held responsible for the development of African languages. On the part of content production and conceptualisation *Isolezwe les'Xhosa* is very well than its print counterpart *BONA*, as the content is not a translated version of any other language it has its own identity as demonstrated in the content analyses chapter. It shows that the newspaper does not rely only on the linguistic identity alone cultural, traditional and spiritual identity are just as important. *Isolezwe les'Xhosa* has through their content revived knowledge production and information dispersion in isiXhosa and they are re-challenging all the fallacies of Christian and colonial civilisations of Africans. This is where it drastically differs with *BONA* as it only depends and is about the language it does not have a holistic approach in its content for it is a translated texts. It is mostly black people who produce and consume in a foreign language other than their own even in the sector as critical as the media. This is what has been demonstrated in this paper all of this is happening essentially because the responsibility of developing indigenous language print media has been deserted Africans and now it is being exploited by white conglomerate. It has

therefore been left for European centred institutions to develop and revive African languages and Media.

Reference List

Andersen, W.E. and Ragnhild K.O. (1997) Press Freedom and Democracy in Zimbabwe. University of Oslo.

Aronson, E., Wilson, T. D., & Brewer, M. B. (1998). Experimentation in social psychology. In D. T. Gilbert, S. T. Fiske, & G. Lindzey (Eds.), *The handbook of social psychology* (pp. 99-142). New York, NY, US: McGraw-Hill.

Bourdieu, P. (1977) THE Economics of Linguistic Exchanges. Social Science Information. 16:645.

H.T. Cousins *(1899). From Kaffir Kraal to Pulpit: The Story of Tiyo Soga. S.W. Partridge*

Cormack, M. (2003) Developing Minority Language Media Studies. Stirling Media Research Institute. Stirling University, Scotland.

Cuilnberg, J. and McQuail, D. (2001) Media Policy Paradigms Shift: Towards a New Communication Policy Paradigm. EJC.

Dondolo, L.M. (2016) Voices of the Pioneers: Lives and Times of Revs. William, W. Gqoba, Phambani Mzimba and Elijah Makiwane.

Entaman, R.M. and Wildaman, S.S. (1992) Reconciling Economic and Non-Economic Perspective On Media Policy: Transcending "The Market place of Ideas". Journal of Communications. Symposium.

Fasold, R. (1984) The Sociolinguistics of Society. Basil Blackwell Publisher.

Ferguson, C.A. (1964) Background to second Language Problems (1-8). In The Study of the Role of Second Languages in Asia, Africa and Latin America. American Centre for Applied Linguistics of the Modern Language Association of America.

Ferguson, C.A. (1964) The Language Factor in National Development (8-15). In The Study of the Role of Second Languages in Asia, Africa and Latin America. American Centre for Applied Linguistics of the Modern Language Association of America.

Fishman, J.A. (2006) Language Policy and Language Shift. In An Introduction to Language Policy Theory and Method. Blackwell Publishing.

Fishman, J.A (ed) (1974) Advances in Language Planning. Mouton & Co, Publishers The Hague.

Freedman, D. (2008) The Politics of Media Policy. Polity Press.

Gal, S. (1989) Language and the Political Economy. Annual Review of Anthropology, Vol,18, pp. 345-367

Garnham, N. (2005) An analysis of the implications of the"creative industries"
approach to arts and Media policy making in the United Kingdom From cultural to creative industries, International Journal of Cultural Policy, 11:1, 15-29,
Golding, P. and Murdock, G. (1991) Culture, Communication and Political Economy. From Mass Media and Society. Edward Arnold.
Grin, F. (2003) Language Planning and Economics, Current Issues in Language Planning, 4:1, 1-66,
Hawkins, P. (1983) Diglossia Revisited. Language Sciences, Vol 5, 1.
Hesmondhalgh, D. (2005) Media and cultural policy as public policy,
International Journal of Cultural Policy, 11:1, 95-109,
Hornberger ,N.H. (2006). Frameworks and Models in Language Planning. In An Introduction to Language Policy Theory and Method. Blackwell Publishing.

Hudson, R.A. (1980) Sociolinguistics. Cambridge University Press.
Jernudd, B. H., & Neustupný, J. V. (1987). Language planning: for whom. In *Proceedings of the international colloquium on language planning* (pp. 69-84). Québec: Les Presses de l'Université Laval.

Jensen, K.B. and Jankowski, N.W. (1991) A Handbook of Qualitative Methodologies for Mass Communication Research. Routledge

Joffe, H. and Yardley, H. (2004) Content and Thematic Analysis (Research Methods for Clinical and Psychology) SAGE. Publications London.

Kaschula, R. (2006) Indigenous Languages and the Media in South Africa. Acta Academica Supplementum: 141-159

Karam, F.X. (1974) Toward a Definition of Language Planning. In Advances in Language Planning. Mouton & Co, Publishers The Hague.

Khuzwayo, T. (2010) Bona, barometer of the decades, Current Writing: Text and Reception in Southern Africa, 22:1, 146-154,
Lindlof, T.R. (1995) Qualitative Communication Research Methods. SAGE Publications.

Louw, E.L (2004) Political Power, national identity and language: case of Afrikaans. University of Queensland.

Maake, N. (2000). Publishing and Perishing Books, People and Reading in African Languages in South Africa. *The Politics of Publishing in South Africa*, 127-159.

Mail & Guardian Editorial Code of Ethics October 2010

McCARTY, T.L. (2003) Revitalising Indigenous Languages in Homogenising Times, Comparative Education, 39:2, 147-163

Milroy, J. and Milroy, C. (1985) Authority in Language: Investigating Language Standardisation and Prescription. Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Mongomery, B.M and Duck, S. (editors) (1991) Studying Interpersonal Interaction. The Guildford Press. New York.

Ndimande-Hlongwa, N. (2010). Corpus planning, with specific reference to the use of standard isiZulu in media. *Alternation*, *17*(1), pp.207-224.

Nooteboom, B. (2009). *A cognitive theory of the firm: Learning, governance and dynamic capabilities*. Edward Elgar Publishing.

Perrett, W.R. (2000): Indigenous language rights and political theory: The case of Te Reo Māori, Australasian Journal of Philosophy,
78:3, 405-417

Phillipson, R. (1988). Linguicism: Structures and ideologies in linguistic imperialism. *Minority education: From shame to struggle*, 339-358.

Phillipson, R. (1996). Linguistic imperialism: African perspectives. *ELT Journal*, *50*(2), 160-167.

Pietikainen, S. and Kelly-Holmes, H. (2011) Gifting, Service and Performance: Three eras in Minority Language Media Policy and Practice. International Journal of Applied Linguistics Vol. 21. No1. 2011

Quijano, A. (2000) Coloniality of Power and Eurocentrism in Latin America. International Sociology Vol. 15(2): 215-232.

Rice, F.A. (ed) (1962) The Study of the Role of Second Languages in Asia, Africa and Latin America. American Centre for Applied Linguistics of the Modern Language Association of America.

Ribot, J.C. and Peluso, N.L. (2003) A Theory of Access. Rural Sociology Vol. 68, No 2, June 2003

Ricento, T. (ed) (2006) An Introduction to Language Policy Theory and Method. Blackwell Publishing.

Salawu, S. (2015) A political economy of sub-Saharan African language press: the case of Nigeria and South Africa, Review of African Political Economy,42:144, 299-313,

Salawu, A. (2013) Stunted growth: An exploration into the failures of African-language newspapers, Imvo Zabantsundu in focus, Ecquid Novi: African Journalism Studies, 34:2, 73-92

Sharifian, F. (2005): Cultural Conceptualisations in English Words: A Study of Aboriginal Children in Perth, Language and Education, 19:1, 74-88

Southall, R. (2004) The ANC and Black Capitalism in South Africa. Review of African Political Economy, Vol. 31, No. 100, Two Cheers? South African Democracy's First Decade (Jun., 2004), pp. 313-328

SABC Editorial Policy (2003)

Statutes of the Republic of South Africa-Constitutional Law Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. [Date of Promulgation: 18 December, 1996] [Date of Commencement: 4 February 1997]

Stroud, C. (2001): African Mother-tongue Programmes and the Politics of Language:
Linguistic Citizenship Versus Linguistic Human Rights, Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development, 22:4, 339-355

The Star Codes of Ethics and Conducts revised January 1999

The Independent News Media Press Code

Trudell, B. (2008): Practice in Search of a Paradigm: Language Rights, Linguistic Citizenship and Minority Language Communities in Senegal, Current Issues in Language Planning, 9:4, 395-412

Wasserman, H. (2009) Learning a New Language: Culture Ideology and Economics in Afrikaans Media after Apartheid. International Journal of Cultural Studies. Vol 12(1): 61-80.

Wasserman, H. and de Beer, S.A. (2005) A Fragile Affair: The Relationship Between the Mainstream Media and Government in Post-Apartheid South Africa. Journal of Mass Media Ethics, 20(2&3), 192-208.
Wexler, P. (1971). Diglossia, Language Standardisation and Purism: Parameters for Typology of Literary Languages. Lingua, 330-354.

Isolezwe lesiXhosa article references

‘Usacinezelekile’ umntu ontsundu oqaqambisa isiNgesi

Iindaba | 16 February 2017

Sithandiwe Velaphi

Ngxatsho ke Milonji nani Milonjikazi yakowethu!

Iindaba | 24 June 2016

Xolani Mavela

Majodina: Malifundwe I’solezwe lesiXhosa

Iindaba | 1 June 2016

Siyabulela Mqikela

Bondla iintsapho zabo ngeshishini lezesondo

Iindaba | 9 March 2017

SITHANDIWE VELAPHI

Wabhidwa zizinto zedolphu nolali!

Izimvo | 31 January 2017

Xolisa Tshongolo

Kushicilelwa i-soapie yesiXhosa yephondo

Iindaba | 1 June 2016

Sithandiwe Velaphi

NgabaPostile iiKumkani zeMpuma Koloni

Iindaba | 9 March 2017

Siyabulela Mqikela

Axoxelwa etyotyombeni amatyala eCumakala

Iindaba | 9 March 2017

Siyabulela Mqikela

Uchacha kuhle ekhayeni lakhe unkosikazi kaSobukhwe

Iindaba | 9 March 2017

Siyabulela Mqikela

‘Asinaye uSathana kwinkolo yesiNtu’

Iindaba | 1 June 2017, 02:00am

SITHANDIWE VELAPHI

Ngamani amaNywabe?

Izimvo | 3 June 2016, 2:30pm

Mpumelelo T.A. Makuliwe

Iziduko zamaNqukhwe

Iindaba | 6 October 2016, 02:00am

UMndende Lixoki Nje Elidinga Into Yokwenza

Iindaba | 1 June 2017, 02:00am

Mpumelelo T.A. Makuliwe

Izakukhupha ingxelo yayo ikomishini kaXaluva

Iindaba | 4 May 2017, 02:00am

Siyabulela Mqikela

Aaa!!!! Daliwonga

Iindaba | 8 June 2017, 02:00am

Siyabulela Mqikela

Ngumlahlekisi uS.E.K. Mqhayi?

IINDABA / 27 JULY 2017, 02:00AM / SIYABULELA MQIKELA

UBhodl’ ingqaka nguBhodl’ izithuko?

IINDABA / 20 JULY 2017, 02:00AM / SIYABULELA MQIKELA

UNtsikana Wayengeloxoki!

IINDABA / 27 JULY 2017, 02:00AM / KHUSELO MHAMBO

Amakrwala aphila nenkubazeko abuyile

IINDABA / 27 JULY 2017, 02:00AM / SIYABULELA MQIKELA

Akukho themba lomanyano kwisizwe samaMpondo

IINDABA / 4 MAY 2017, 02:00AM / SIYABULELA MQIKELA

Iinkosi zingciba unongekehli eSuthwini

IINDABA / 21 JULY 2017, 1:04PM / SIYABULELA MQIKELA

Masifunde ezinye iilwimi zesiNtu

IINDABA / 23 JUNE 2016, 02:00AM / NOMZAMO NKATSHU

Appendix 1

Interview 1

Siviwe Kulu

My Name is Mbuyekezo Njeje we are at Caxton House conducting an interview with Siviwe Kulu. On the development of isiXhosa here at Caxton House in *BONA* magazine, Mr Kulu I would like the thank you for taking your time to do this interview.

Question1: Could you please state your name and responsibilities what you do in terms of your responsibilities here at *BONA* magazine?

Answer: Ehh! My name is Sivuyile Kulu, I am a language practitioner by profession I work as a translator here at *BONA* magazine. I translate from English to isiXhosa, I translate some of the letters from the readers who write the in isiXhosa to English. I sometimes write articles for the main English publication.

Q2. Oh! There are readers who write in isiXhosa when writing to you…there are readers who write in isiXhosa?

A: Yes, the readers do write to us in isiXhosa and we will have to translate it to English, because *BONA* comes out in four different languages which are English, isiXhosa, Sesotho and isiZulu. Our readers do not really know that Bona is translated that is why some of them just write in isiXhosa.

Comment: That is a pleasant surprise to know that some of the letters are written in isiXhosa, because there is an assumption that you only translate from English.

Q3: How long have you been working for *BONA* at Caxton?

A: it is my fifth year now on the third of June here at *BONA*

Q4: Did you work in the print sector of isiXhosa?

A: No, I did not I was an interpreter since I am a language practitioner I was interpreting isiXhosa to the bargaining council. Even though I did my internship here in 2009 but I only started working here in 2013.

Q5: What would you say are you impressions about the state of isiXhosa print sector is it growing are there any improvements, how would analyse the growth in the print sector?

A: Unfortunately, I wish I could say nice things about isiXhosa it is not growing, unfortunately here in South Africa, there are only two languages that when you do something everybody something everybody will run after it is Afrikaans and isiZulu. This also because of the stereotype that Xhosa people like to speak English which unfortunately true, as a result isiXhosa is the least selling publication the bestselling is English followed by isiZulu then Sesotho and isiXhosa is last. We are not losing the audience but they are not growing because we have a loyal audience that always buys the magazine.

Q6: So, the sales of *BONA* are reflection on the attitudes of the audience?

A: We are not going down to be honest we are just at the same range because when the sale grow they usually grow by two percent but not more than that but then it does not go down.

Q7: Working in a company like Caxton and working for *BONA* a person would assume that Caxton is accommodating of African language and what would be your view?

A: In media the 'main' career that you immediately think of is journalism and the language practitioners are supporting careers, but in media and Caxton the main objective is to sell the magazine not to develop a language that is what they are about.

Q8: Having said that would you say that Caxton is accommodating of these three languages?

A: It is not as accommodating as it should be but it can be better, But I do not want to lie *BONA* is doing well. At times they send us to language translation and interpretation workshops that take place in Cape Town.

Q9: The environment is not conducive for the growth of African language?

A: it could be better but under the situation it is not enough.

Q10: What are the improvements that you would suggest?

A: Print is slowly going down because of the internet as result the magazines are not performing as well. But the way to improve would be to link print and radio… have them work to together to improve the and develop language

Q11: From experience is this a good place for isiXhosa to develop and flourish

A: It could be

Q12: Are you aware of the role that the magazine plays in the development of the language?

A: Yes, I am aware of the impact that Bona has specifically in the education sector where teachers use our articles for material.

Q13: What is you translation approach that you use is it the descriptive or meaning translation approach.

A: We translate the meaning of the text so that people can simply understand the language because a magazine is something that you read to relax.

Q14: Is you approach to translation Down to individual preference?

A: no it is not because when I first came here the use of difficult Xhosa words was high as a result; there were some people that I know who were not buying the magazine because of that. This affected the sales of the edition some people who are friends of mine buy our edition because of they were supporting me.

Q15: Is the popularity of the language being compromised because they do not want to learn a new Xhosa terms?

A: It is compromised because the people are not really running away from learning isiXhosa they do not want to think too much when reading a magazine they do not want find themselves doing research asking what certain terms mean.

Q16: You have established that the translation department is a supporting department, now are you part of the conceptualisation process here at *BONA*.

A: We are very much involved in the conceptualisation of the magazine because we are part of the content meeting that we have twice a month. All the people are encouraged to participate and come up with ideas for the content every month. But then this is done for the magazine not necessarily for the isiXhosa version, but for all the magazine.

Q17: Do you find your selves to be too simple in the in the language that you use in your magazine.

A: I would not be surprised if there are people would not buy the magazine because it is not proper isiXhosa. We are simple but people when they buy our magazine they should take

away that attitude and take it as them reading isiXhosa. If I was not a language practitioner would be critical of the manner in which they write isiXhosa.

Q18: Having said that would you say that you are depriving the readers an opportunity to expand their vocabularies, because when we read English language newspaper we learn new words and terms so the same should apply with *BONA*.

A: We live in an English world and English makes the world go round that is the reality. We are not depriving them that chance because there is also another way of us teaching them new terms, like sometimes when we write in some articles we would the actual Xhosa word in but put it in a bracket. Another example is when we were writing an article about bullying and there is no word in isiXhosa that is known to an equivalent. So, we used a different word but in context it means bullying which is '*ukuvuyelela'* there are other words which we came up with.

Q19: we have spoken and touched on the way you write which is simplistic some might like it and some might not like it. Also that the magazine is a glamourous magazine which is meant to be read for leisure and pleasure, have these factors restricted your linguistic creativity because now it is no longer about the terms and words?

A: When I first started working here that frustrated me and at times I found myself not knowing how to write some of these articles. This is because isiXhosa is very long, longer than English as a result space becomes an issue because we are not allowed to write more pages than the source language. We must write the same number of pages as English, and that was a challenge it then pushed to be creative in the manner which we write as we now freestyle in the way we write. This is how we deal with the space restrictions that we face in translating to isiXhosa.

Q20: would you say that the audience's minimal interaction with isiXhosa texts in general is the one that also reduces you in being eloquent in your writing of the magazine. For it is not as if isiXhosa in the media space is as popular as the.

A: that does have an effect in people buying the magazine as they would say that isiXhosa is difficult, but those who would want to get into the literature of isiXhosa *BONA* is a good starting point if someone wants to get into the eloquence of isiXhosa. *BONA* is not made for that because that is not the priority of the company.

Q21: from this interview I have gathered that the only people who are nurturing or trying to nurture isiXhosa in this institution is you the translators. Is this a correct statement or observation?

A21: Yes, that is true isiXhosa is neglected if you are to compare it with English, it is us the translators who are working on the language as simple as we write it. IsiXhosa is not accommodated because this is an English language company.

Interview 2

My Name is Mbuyekezo Njeje we are at Caxton House conducting a second interview with Nkosinathi Mafuta. On the development of isiXhosa here at Caxton House in *BONA* magazine, bhut' Nkosinathi I would like the thank you for taking your time to do this interview.

Nkosinathi Mafuta

Q1: Please state you responsibilities for BONA magazine?

A1: My name is Nkosinathi Mafutha I am the Xhosa editor of BONA magazine.

Q2: How long have you been working for Caxton and BONA magazine?

A2: I started here in 2010 so I have working here up until now for eight I started working in isiXhosa print in 2008.

Q3: Before you worked for the magazine were you working in the isiXhosa print sector?

A: I have worked in the isiXhosa print sector and I have taught isiXhosa for ten years at some point, this is what opens avenue so this is not the first time I am working in the sector.

Q4: Where did you work and what were your responsibilities?

A4: I was a Xhosa book editor since I was fresh from teaching I was editing teacher guides and curriculum book and assessments guides for learners. I was working Maskew Miller-Longman now Person's publications.

Q5: What are your impressions about isiXhosa print sector since you one of the contributors?

A5: If there are Xhosa speaking people a magazine like BONA should have an impact. The only thing I can say is that what I have discovered is that the people who supposed to buy isiXhosa and read isiXhosa generally do not buy the magazine they only buy the English magazine. I do not know whether it has to do with being educated or what. Other ethnic groups like the Zulus and the Sotho's are buying their magazines and Xhosa people, do not buy the magazine they do not read isiXhosa an example is the sales you will see that English is number 1, isiZulu is number 2 Sesotho is number 3 and isiXhosa is last. IsiXhosa is not the option that they opt for it is just another language.

Q6: Does isiXhosa have a good future in the media and is it conducive for isiXhosa to prosper?

A6: There are two answers to your question one is positive and the other in negative, I think by now everybody who is not a first language speaker of English, knows that English will swallow their languages so they come up with ways to take a stand we must come up with ways to reclaim and keep the language alive… in the media sector is the answer is I do not know because the media sector is propelled and driven by sales if the magazine does not sell it has to closed so it is about the bottom line is profit if it does sell close

Q7: What would you say about the measure that ensure that there is a quality use of language African control for the African languages

A7: Point one in this institution there is no body like that and there is no body that ensures of the quality use of the languages and that advances African languages in this company. They have in the past sent us to work shop of translators one was in Cape Town that is the only thing that they have done and it is rare that they do that. We are restricted in terms of working space because our translations should not exceed that of English, so we are forced to come up with cheap stuff in terms of the quality of the language because if I were to write an idiom is isiXhosa it would take up a lot of space. We are forced into a creative corner which results in borrowing a lot of words and we end up xhosalising some English words. A word like subject I will write it like sabjekhti in isiXhosa another word is director I will write it like idayirekhta hence I Xhosalising the such English words. Because these words are easy for a reader to misunderstand stand the words if I were to write them in their proper Xhosa equivalent

Q8: Is this place conducive for the development of isiXhosa?

A8: That is the biggest problem there have been complaints from Xhosa readers complaining about the manner in which we write the name of the months because we use English month names. Like February we do not say uMdumba because that is the isiXhosa name for the month of February we must reflect the way people speak so they can buy the magazine because we are selling a magazine here, the answer is always that we have to write the way people speak because people do not use the Xhosa month names when they speak. So to answer your question do I see isiXhosa being developed here? No, this institution is not developing the African languages.

Q9: There are positives as small as they are, are you aware of the role *BONA* has on the development of isiXhosa?

A9: I have always wondered why the titles like the Xhosa editor are, Zulu editor and Sotho editor yet these editors follow the direction of the English editor. It is this editor who decides what must be in this magazine and we have no say. Meaning we are basically translators we do not have the benefits and the freedom to write the way we like because my magazine would have more pages that the English text because isiXhosa words are longer than that of the English.

Q10: Are you aware of the contribution of *BONA* to the isiXhosa language?

A10: Yes, and I am proud of that like there are a lot of teachers who have commended us for the great articles that we have written and they have used our articles to as comprehensions for tests and some for grade 12 papers. Most of them they do not realise that these articles are translated versions of the English source text.

Q11: What type of translation approach do you use do you use the descriptive approach or the meaning approach?

A11: I can say I use them both but most of the time we take the meaning to capture the essence of the texts, this is because of being limited into writing on the same page as English we are forced to be creative. This happens with flowing articles where you see that in this article I must just convey the meaning of this article the message is more important and it allows us to be ourselves. There are articles where you are forced to be descriptive like the recipe pages you cannot take meaning there but you can translate each ingredient and come up with its Xhosa equivalent. There are other article that are technical in that the meaning when you translate it might not come out clearly however, when you read it makes sense you

just leave it as it is because of the deadline. The approach is not prescribed by the management of the magazine.

Q12: What is the conceptualisation process of the magazine are you part of the process with the English production team?

A12: Yes, we are for instance tomorrow we have a content meeting where everyone will be there and we will be discussing the May issue and the June so to answer your question we are part of the content meeting.

Q13: Is the magazine popular with the audience?

A13: There is hope the numbers are fluctuating some numbers are high at times, but people are going into stores to buy isiXhosa magazine it is doing well in expanding the language as small as it is.

Q14: We have establish that English is king in this institution would you say that English has a negative impact on the quality of isiXhosa that is written here on the magazine?

A14: That is a good question that I always ask myself as to how would we preserve the quality of the language. The people that we are writing for they want to relax when they read the magazine and they do not want to ask themselves questions like what is this article about. So we are not writing the quality Xhosa.

Q15: In saying would you say that you are denying the audience a chance to learn new terms?

A15: Let us not narrow the platforms to *BONA* as the only one that has to teach and develop the language. The platforms should be broadened to television stories and radios and magazines we must not talk about one magazine *BONA* other ways to get the language across.

Q16: Would you say that *BONA* is the right magazine for a person to reconnect with their language?

A16: It depends on the person whether they want to learn their language because if you want to know the language you must pick up a book and read. You must not wait for a magazine to teach you how to read but if a person wants to take it with a slow pace they must start with *BONA*. Because we write simple isiXhosa then go on to read isiXhosa books where they will find the quality of the language.

Q17: Does *BONA* restrict your linguistic eloquence magazine since it is a magazine that people read for leisure how frustrating is it to reconcile the eloquence with this type of content?

A17: The way we could deal with that is to always remember that you are writing for a Xhosa speaking reader so the way you translate would be to make more relatable and make the reader not question you writing or translation style. IsiXhosa's eloquence is not catered for in this institution and the restrictions that we have already spoke about like the page space limits.

Q18: Is the culture of the institution accommodating of isiXhosa since it is on the languages in they publish in, does the institution nurture?

A18: No, they only make money with the languages as to where the languages might be in the next ten years they do not give a… a (whatever) Ha! Ha! Ha! These languages make money for the company the company does invest in them for they beat all the other languages hands whether it is English or Afrikaans. It is difficult to say whether Caxton will keep African languages longer.

Interview 3

Johannes Letsohla

My Name is Mbuyekezo Njeje we are at Caxton House conducting a second interview with Johannes Letsohla. On the development of African languages here at Caxton House in *BONA* magazine, bhut' Johannes I would like the thank you for taking your time to do this interview.

Q1: Please state your responsibilities for *BONA* Magazine and any additional responsibilities.

A1: As you have stated my name is Johannes Letsohla my title is managing editor which equivalent to the production manager here at *BONA* which is part of the Caxton magazine family there are over ten magazine titles and *BONA* is one of them. My responsibility is to

make sure that the magazine production runs smoothly from planning until it goes to print that everything goes accordingly.

Q2: How long have been working for Caxton and *BONA* magazine?

A2: It is well over a decade since I have started working here on 31 March 2003, I started out as a junior translator for Sesotho and I did that for seven years. In the 2009 we moved from Durban to Johannesburg, then I was promoted to production manager I have been since 2011.

Q3: Before you began working for the Magazine were you working in the African language print sector? By this I mean have worked in the media space using African languages it does not necessarily have to be print?

A3: Well before I joined *BONA* I was running my own business that was offering secretarial skill, and offering typing services and I was typing in all languages. When I joined Caxton it was not a new thing. I also worked for the EDCON group in the accounting department.

Q4: What are your impressions about African language print media in general and its state in this era since you are one of the contributors to this sector of the media?

A4: It is growing a little bit but people still have that perception that a person must know a foreign language like English, which is wrong for in South Africa we are a diverse country. I disagree with the fact that when you are 100% fluent in English you are the best. People should speak their languages for if they do not they will lose their culture.

Q5: Do African Languages have a good future in the media and is the environment of Caxton conducive for isiXhosa to prosper?

A5: Yes, it is because we do have like any other employment sector for skill Improvement we do have the mandate of up skilling our workers everyone in here from the journalist to the language practitioners. For example Pansalb does invite us to conferences and workshops about the development in languages like the news terms and words. So Caxton does grow in these language and Caxton is the only company that publishes in three different languages.

Q6: What have been the improvement that have been implemented for quality control of the African languages in the institution?

A6: We are national publication our magazine is read throughout South Africa and neighbouring countries like Swaziland, Namibia, Botswana and Lesotho. The magazine should entertain the reader because the magazine is for entertainment and it should also

inform, so we make sure that what we put out there is done properly. And we live in the era of social media where people would complain about the usage of certain words and criticism of that kind we engage with them so to correct the mistake if necessary. We do use the services of outside people like proof readers which you are one of them who will come and make sure that the use of the language is correct.

Q7: Are you aware of the role that the magazine plays in the development of African languages? And how have you seen the contribution of this magazine had on the expansion of the language? Are you aware also that *BONA* has been one of the contributors to African language print media?

A7: For instance our April issue take that and turn to between page 4-7 there is a student who says she is using *BONA* magazine as her guideline for the translation studies. She is using the isiZulu language version *BONA* and the English language version *BONA* to study the translation techniques. Teachers also write to us to say and ask for permission to extract some of our articles for teaching purposes. So we do have an impact on the education of people and we are aware of it.

Q8: From your experience is this a good place for isiXhosa language to develop and flourish? And what improvement have you seen the magazine has had with developing the language?

A8: Yes. It is a good place because here at *BONA* you are like at the SABC where people of all language work here and they understand each other while speaking their languages. So here it important for a person to be themselves.

Q9: What is the type of translation approach do you use is it a descriptive translation or is it a meaning translation? And why is it important to use the approach that you have chosen?

A9: Before I directly answer your question we do find that the source language becomes an African languages we do find the readers writing to us in for instance Sesotho to English. We do not use literal translation but we translate the thought behind the text, we do use idioms to convey the thought essentially the meaning is the most important thing. We do not use a slang type of a language we use formal language

Q10: Is the approach you use to translate the magazine prescribed by the management in the magazine or the institution, or is it just a preference to each individual?

A10: The only management not encourage the use of inappropriate words and language, because our languages are a respecting language like for instance when you translate a text on vaginal infections. In an African language you cannot call a vagina as such as that will be rude and vulgar people know our languages and the culture they know what is acceptable and not acceptable.

Q11: What is the process of conceptualising the magazine are you part of that process with the English production team?

A11: From the word go everyone is part of the conceptualising process which we call planning meeting. We are a team of 19 people so all of us contribute to the conceptualisation of the magazine so everyone contributes to the content.

Q12: What are the effects that the English version of *BONA* has on the quality use of the language? Do you find yourselves in a situation where you have to downsize the use of some isiXhosa words that might add more meaning and context to the text? If yes would you say that it is a downgrade in any manner?

A12: Let go back to the issues of knowing your reader the culture and background a translator is the secondary author of the text if the translator does not under the text the first time it will be difficult for the reader. We do come across some difficult articles that will require you to simplify the language so the reader will clear understand what you have wrote. When an English text plays with words you cannot do the same as it will lose the essence of the meaning. And remember we are in business we are competing with many magazines we cannot be using these bombastic words when translating

Q13: In your view does that reduces the quality of the isiXhosa by denying the readers of isiXhosa version *BONA* a chance to learn new terms that might expand their vocabularies?

A13: As I have mentioned that our purpose is to teach people… my duty her is to convey the message of what is it that is being said in this text, if it is difficult it does not mean that I Should also make difficult were a reader would end up asking that "what is this person saying" a person must understand a language so it depends on the circumstances of the text.

Q14: Would you say that *BONA* is a good place to start when someone wants to relearn and reconnect with their languages?

A14: Definitely it is the right place for people to start for people to reconnect with their language as *BONA* as we said that it caters for three languages, and we have a diverse content which is available in all three languages. That makes *BONA* the perfect place for people to start to reconnect with languages.

Q15: How do you reconcile your linguistic creativity with a text that might require you to 'tone' down your linguistic prowess? And how frustrating is that?

A15: We do not frustrate our people because we have to write the way people speak meaning we have to write the everyday language because that is how people speak. We cannot write a language that they will not understand and recognise.

Q16: Would you say that it hinders language development, because the learning of new terms and phrases and idioms is part and parcel of language development?

A16: This is how we do it for instance at Pansalb there would be recommendations about certain new terms that might be new in the language. So as result I will just put in an English language word in brackets so the reader knows what I am saying or talking about.

Q17: The culture of the institution is it accommodating to African languages, does it nurture the languages since it is them in publishing *BONA* magazine?

A17: Definitely, they are because we make sure that we are up to date with the development of language and we upskill our people to make sure that they are up to par with the language and they are not left behind. In that way we nurture their growth.

Appendix 2

Press Code



THE INDEPENDENT MEDIA PRESS CODE

Preamble

Independent Media wants news to be reported accurately, the publication of opinions that are based on fact and honestly motivated and reportage that recognises the vulnerable of society and that upholds the laws of South Africa and the Constitution. Accordingly, Independent Media, its editors and journalists of print and digital media subscribe to the following code of conduct:

Code

1. Legality

1. Journalists and Independent Media shall at all times uphold the laws of South Africa.

2. Any act of publication that is unlawful and actionable in a court of law shall be a contravention of this code.

3. This code shall be interpreted in accordance with legal precedent.

2. Accuracy

1. Independent Media will not publish inaccurate, misleading or distorted information.

2. When publishing opinions, Independent Media shall require that the opinions are based on fact and are honestly held.

3. Articles must distinguish clearly between comment, conjecture and fact.

3. Right to Reply

Anyone who is the subject of critical reportage should be given an opportunity to reply, unless there is good cause not to.

4. Privacy

1. People's privacy shall not unreasonably be invaded.

2. Without limiting the general rule, Independent Media shall not:

2.1. Publish details of a person's health, family life, home or communications without that person's consent.

2.2 Enter into private homes or offices, unless the consent of the occupier is obtained.

3.3 Publish or take photographs of persons other than those taken in public, or with their consent.

3. Where there is personal grief or shock, journalists and editors shall handle subjects with the necessary consideration including in the publication relating thereto.

5. Children

In dealing with matters involving children:

1. A child is defined as any person under the age of 18

2. Whenever a picture of a child is to be published it shall be done taking the Constitutional rights of the child into account.

3. Whenever the identity of a child is disclosed, whether pictorially or in print –

3.1. The statutory restrictions on the naming or identification of children shall be observed and adhered to.

3.2 The interests of the privacy and the reputation of the child shall be considered and, where necessary, protected.

3.3 The permission of the parent or guardian of any child shall be sought in all cases where the identity of the child is to be disclosed.

3.4 Even if the parent or guardian consents to disclosure of identity of a child, Independent Media shall exercise a cautious discretion, if it may be harmful to the child to publish the identity of the child.

4. When it is editorially necessary to publish a picture of a child, which is potentially harmful to such child, the identity of the child shall be obscured in such a manner that the child cannot be recognised. In this regard the face of the child shall be blurred or "pixelated" completely.

5. When it is editorially necessary to publish pictures of children that are involved in sexual or simulated sexual activity, such as to draw the public's attention to the existence of abhorrent practices, such pictures shall be done in an informative manner and not in a manner that could be deemed as being intended to be erotic.

6. No picture of children depicting nudity (other than pictures anticipated in terms 5.5 above) shall be published.

6. Means of obtaining evidence

1. Where a person is interviewed or questioned for the purpose of publication, the interviewee shall be clearly informed that he or she is being interviewed with a view to publish the information disseminated and only with the interviewee's agreement.

2. If information is gathered from previously published material, the publication must be credited and it shall only be published if lawful.

3. Independent Media shall not obtain evidence or publish information that has been obtained:

3.1. by clandestine methods, or

3.2 by intercepting private communications, or

3.3 by the unauthorised removal of documents.

7. Victims of crimes

1. A victim of a sex crime shall not be named, unless he or she specifically consents.

2. If the victim of a sex crime is a minor, his or her identity shall never be disclosed, unless he or she specifically consents after reaching the age of majority.

3. No information that may lead to the identification of the victim of a sex crime may be published.

4. Where the victim of any other crime is a minor the principles when dealing with children generally shall apply.

5. Victims of crime shall be treated with compassion, both when interviewed and in the publication.

8. Sources and collecting information

1. Sources of information shall be clearly identified and named in articles, unless paragraph 8.2 below applies.

2. Where a source specifically asks for confidentiality, the source shall not be identified and Independent Media shall protect the confidentiality as far as possible.

9. Discrimination, racism and hate speech

1. No disparaging remarks referring to someone's race, colour, religion, gender, sexual orientation, physical or mental illness or disability shall be published.

2. Reference to someone's race, colour, religion, gender, sexual orientation, physical or mental illness or disability shall be avoided unless relevant.

10. Money

1. Journalists must not use information discovered for the purpose of publication for their own financial benefit.

2. Articles published on companies, investment products or shares in which the journalist or publisher has an interest should disclose the journalist's or publisher's financial interest.

11. Conflict of interest

Conflicts of interest must be avoided.