

https://dspace.org/

Towards post-managerialism in higher education: The case study of management change at the University of The Witwatersrand 1999-2004

Johnson, Bernadette Judith

2006-11-16T11:37:25Z
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/1806

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

CONTENTS

	Heading	Page
	Abstract …….	ii
	Key Words ……	iii
	Declaration …….....	iv
	Acknowledgements ……...	v
	Contents ……	vii
	List of Tables ……..…….	xiii
	List of Figures ……..……	xiv
	Abbreviations, Acronyms and Glossary …….....	xv
	Chapter 1: Introduction ……	**1 – 14**
1.1	Background to the Study ……...……...	1
1.2	Focus of the Study ……..……	2
1.3	The Research Questions ……...	2
1.4	The Theoretical Stance Adopted in the Study …….	3
1.5	Aims of the Thesis ……	4
1.6	Defining ‘Collegiality’, ‘Managerialism’, ‘Contrived Collegial Managerialism’ and Restructuring ……...	5
1.6.1	Collegiality ……...	5
1.6.2	Managerialism ……..	5
1.6.3	Contrived Collegial Managerialism ……	5
1.6.4	Restructuring ……	6
1.7	The problem Statement ……..……	6
1.8	The Significance of the Study ……...	7
1.9	Thesis Statement ……...	8
1.10	Structure of the Thesis and Chapter Outlines ……...	9
	**Chapter 2: Literature Review …….....	**15-58**
2.1	Introduction ……..…….	15
2.2	Management and its Evolution in Higher Education ……	15
2.3	‘Managerialism’, Discourse, Techniques and Organizational Form ..	23
2.3.1	The Discourse of Change …….	25
2.3.2	Implications of Organisational Change for Managerial Change ….	31
2.4	The rationale for Changing management Practices in Higher Education …….	34
2.5	Modes of Management in Higher Education Institutions …….	38
2.6	Studies on Higher Education Management: Conceptual Limitations.	46
2.7	Conceptions of Collegiality ……...	47
2.7.1	A Critique of Collegiality …….	53
2.8	The Collegial – Managerial Nexus …….……..……	56
2.9	The Conceptual Framework of this Study ...……	57

	Heading	Page
	Chapter 3: Research Methodology	**60-86**
3.1	Introduction ……....	60
3.2	The Epistemological Orientation of the Research …….	60
3.3	The Qualitative Methodological Paradigm of the Research ……..	62
3.4	The Research Design …….	64
3.5	Data Collection Strategies …….	68
3.5.1	*Semi Structured Interviews* ……	69
3.5.2	*Focus Group Discussions* …….....	71
3.5.3	*Documentary Analysis* …….....	72
3.6	Reflections on Data Collection ……...	74
3.7	Empirical Challenges ……..	75
3.7.1	*Challenges Related to Interviewing 'Elites'* …….	75
3.7.2	*Challenges related to memory* …….....	76
3.7.3	*Challenges related to accessing information* …….....	76
3.7.4	The challenge of confidentiality …….....	77
3.8	The reliability and validity of the study …….	77
3.9	Data Analysis …….	79
3.9.1	*The Audit Trial* …….....	81
3.9.2	*Working with interview transcripts* ……	82
3.9.3	*Interview data of management* …….....	82
3.9.4	*Interview data from strategic informants* …….....	82
3.9.5	*Analysing Documents* ……	83
3.10	Data Management ……...	84
3.11	Limits of the Study …….	85
3.12	Conclusion ……..	86
	Chapter 4: The institutional context of restructuring external and internal determinants ……..	**87-121**
4.1	Introduction ……...	87
4.2	Resisting apartheid state interference, 1984 to 1994 …….	88
4.3	Intensification of contestation and crisis management, 1990 – 1997 …….	98
4.4	The emergence of visionary approach in university management, 1997 to 1999 ……..	112
4.5	Conclusion …….	120
	Chapter 5: State, Policy and Institutional Response	**122-134**
5.1	Introduction ……...	122
5.2	State-institutional models: from state control to state supervision..	122
5.3	The State's hands off approach: 1994 – 2001 ……	123
5.4	Implications of the State's hands off approach for institutional relations …….	125
5.5	From hands off approach to State interference ……..	126
5.6	Wits responds to the State ..……..	132

	Heading	Page
	Chapter 6: Restructuring Wits, 1998 to 1999: The search for a new institutional identity …..……	**135-195**
6.1	Introduction ……	135
6.2	The restructuring strategy: underpinning discourses …….	136
6.3	The restructuring strategy ……..	143
6.3.1	*Managing restructuring: The role of SET* ……..……..	143
6.3.2	*Setting a performativity agenda* ……..….	145
6.3.3	*'Stakeholders' power and influence in the restructuring process*	147
6.3.4	*Legitimising restructuring: the pitfalls of university advocacy*	149
6.3.5	*Dealing with the Non-Core* ……..	150
6.3.6	*Reliance on a top-down approach* ……..	152
6.4	Oposition to restructuring: the tide from below ……	153
6.5	The new organisational design ……..	158
6.5.1	*Mergers of faculties and departments* ……..	160
6.5.2	*Creating a managerial layer* ……..	168
6.5.3	*Streamlining faculty structures and speeding up decision making* ……	170
6.5.4	*New mechanisms of central control and new operational functions* ……..	
6.5.5	*From academic units to business entities* ……..	175
6.5.6	*Enlarging the university's student share* ……..	182
6.5.7	*Developing market relevant courses: commodification trends* ……..	186
6.5.8	*Integrating entrepreneurialism into university business: indices of commodification* ……..	188
6.5.8.1	Wits Enterprise ……..	188
6.5.8.2	Centre of material and process synthesis ……..	189
6.5.8.3	Wits health consortium ……..	190
6.5.8.4	Wits language school ……	191
6.5.8.5	Accessing a new 'student market': Gaining access to part time students through Wits PLUS ……	192
6.6	Restructuring begets restructuring	193
6.7	Conclusion	194
	Chapter 7: The Case of the Senior Executive Team	**196 – 214**
7.1	Introduction	196
7.2	The Establishment, Rationale, Composition and Functions of Set	197
7.3	The Implications of SET for University Statutory Bodies: Council, University Forum and Senate	201
7.4	Deans in SET: Challenges, Possibilities And Limits	203
7.5	Deans in The Senior Management Team: Implications for Faculty Management	205
7.6	SET, performativity and nature of academic work	209
7.7	Conclusion	213

	Heading	Page
	Chapter 8: The Advent Of Executivism In Academic Deanship: Possibilities And Constraints ……..	**215-237**
8.1	Introduction ……...	215
8.2	The Changed Roles and Responsibilities of Deans …..……	215
8.2.1	*Academic Leadership and Management Vis-À-Vis Managerialism..*	218
8.2.2	*Corporatisation of University Management ……*	219
8.3	Creation of Responsibility Centres With Devolved Operational Functions ……...	220
8.4	Creation of Semi-Autonomous Business Units ……	223
8.4.1	*Competition and Constraints on Faculty Cross-Subsidisation ……*	*226*
8.5	Meeting The Challenges Of Executive Deanship: Capacity Development Issue ……	228
8.6	Executive Deanship: Emerging Features ……..	230
8.7	Executive Deans Vis-À-Vis the Vice-Chancellor and Deputy Vice-Chancellors ……	231
8.8	Relations between Heads of Schools and Faculty ……	232
8.9	Emerging Executive Deanship Trends: Implications for University Management ……	235
8.10	Conclusion ……	236
	Chapter 9: Filtering Down The Managerial Agenda Through Heads Of Schools ……	**238- 259**
9.1	Introduction ……..	238
9.2	The Roles and Responsibilities of Heads of School ……..	239
9.2.1	*Managerial Responsibilities And Academic Leadership ……*	*241*
9.2.2	*The Tension Between Managerial Responsibilities And Authority..*	*244*
9.3	Heads of School and the New Accountability Culture ……..	245
9.4	Managerial Concerns at the Coalface: Where Are The Resources For The Core? ……	248
9.5	Corporatisation of School Headship ……..	251
9.6	The New Position of School Headship: What Value Does it Add to Wits? …….	254
9.7	Executivism And School Headship: Implications For University Management …….	257
9.8	Conclusion ……	259

	Heading	Page
	Chapter 10: Managerial Practices And Academic Practice	**260-287**
10.1	Introduction ……...	260
10.2	Saving time: Fewer academics involved in decision making ……	260
10.3	New Meanings, Old Concepts ……	262
10.4	Declining social interaction and shrinking intellectual space …….	263
10.5	Establishing Social Distance: Professionalising Management ……	267
10.6	Commodification of knowledge and the intensification of academic work …….	268
10.7	The increasing focus in managers' work upon managerial responsibilities …….	271
10.8	'Executivism' and the culture of upward accountability ……	272
10.9	Devolution and managerial accountability ……	273
10.10	Centralisation and increasing secrecy in management information systems ……	275
10.11	Dominance of Economic Rationality in the Intellectual Project ….	278
10.12	Encouraging competition and individualism among academics ….	279
10.13	Controlling academics' behaviour through technological surveillance …….	281
10.14	Presenting the inevitability of change …….	283
10.15	Creating incentives to gain influence over academics ……	284
10.16	Academia in Crisis ……	285
10.17	Conclusion ……	287
	Chapter 11: Towards Post-Managerialism: The Rise of 'Contrived Collegial Managerialism' at Wits ……	**288- 305**
11.1	Possibilities and Limits of 'Contrived Collegial Managerialism'	294
11.2	Observations ……	303
	Bibliography ……	**306-346**

Appendices	Title	Page
Appendix A	Interview Schedules	347
Appendix B	Letter of Conditions for Access	369
Appendix C	Gender/Race of University Administrators	370
Appendix D	Changes in the VC and DVC Positions	373
Appendix E	1994 Mission Statement	374
Appendix F	Task Groups	375
Appendix G	A comparison of council pre and post restructuring	376
Appendix H	1998 Mission Statement	378
Appendix I	Academic Staff Reductions in the Faculty of Arts	379
Appendix J	Steps followed in support service and academic restructuring process	380
Appendix K	The composition of the academic planning and review committees	383
Appendix L	Description of Faculties and creation of Schools after 1999 restructuring	384

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Title	Page
Table 1	The Discourse of Change	25
Table 2	How Managerialism is Legitimised	28
Table 3	Hybridisation of Bureaucratic and Post-bureaucratic Organisation	29
Table 4	Differences between qualitative and quantitative methodologies	64
Table 5	Changing Student Demography at Wits	101
Table 6	Key Features of Wits Before 1999	112
Table 7	The shape and size of academic entities	140
Table 8	Initial two models presented for discussion	142
Table 9	The New Academic Units	160
Table 10	Cost Guesstimates of New managerial Posts	169
Table 11	Deficit and Surplus by Faculty	177
Table 12	'Deficit Schools' and 'Surplus Schools' within Faculties	178 -180
Table 13	Key features of the nature of management post 1999	285
Table 14	A comparision of the nature of management at Wits pre and post 1999	291
Table 15	A comparison between Collegiality and Contrived Collegiality	294

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Title	Page
Figure 1	Frequency breakdown of issues brought before SET	209

ABBREVIATIONS, ACRONYMS AND GLOSSARY

AIEM	Attributable Income and Expenditure Model
ANC	African National Congress
ANCYL	African National Congress Youth League
APRC(s)	Academic Planning and Review Committee(s)
ARRC	Academic Restructuring Review Committee
ASAWU	Academic Staff Association of Wits University
BARAT	Basic Accounting and Revenue Attribution
BTF	Broad Transformation Forum
BUWA	Black University Workers' Association
CAMEG	Centre for Applied Mining Exploration Geology
CHE	Council of Higher Education
CHEMS	Commonwealth Higher Education Management Service
CLTD	Centre for Teaching and Learning Development
CODESA	Convention for a Democratic South Africa
COMPS	Centre of Material and Process Synthesis
Con Com	Consultative Committee
COSATU	Congress of South Africa Trade Union
DVC	Deputy Vice-Chancellor
EPU	Education Policy Unit
ESS	Effective Subsidy Student
FFACT	Forum for Further Accelerated Comprehensive Transformation
FTE(s)	Full-Time Equivalent(s)
GAWU	General Workers Unions

GEAR	Growth Employment and Redistribution
HEQC	Higher Education Quality Committee
JODAC	Johannesburg Democratic Action Committee
LRA	Labour Relations Act
MESHAWU	Municipal, Education, State Health & Allied Workers Union
MIS	Management Information System
MIU	Management Information Unit
MSI	Molecular Sciences Institute
NCHE	National Commission of Higher Education
NECC	National Education Coordinating Committee
NEHAWU	National Education and Health Workers Union
NEPI	National Education Policy Initiative
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NQF	National Qualifications Framework
NSFAS	National Student Financial Aid Scheme
NUSAS	National Union of South African Students
POW	Perspectives of Wits
PWV	Pretoria Witwatersrand Vereeniging
RAU	Rand Afrikaans Universiteit
PPBS	Programming, Planning and Budgeting Systems
SACP	South African Communist Party
SAMS	South African Mathematical Society
SANSCO	South African National Students Congress
SAUVCA	South African Universities Vice-Chancellors' Association
SANUM	South African Numerical Mathematical Society
SAQA	South African Qualifications' Authority

SASCO	South African Students' Congress
SET	Senior Executive Team
SIAM	Society for Industrial and Applied Mathematics
SLE(s)	Senior Lecturer Equivalent(s)
SRC	Student Representative Council
TEFSA	Tertiary Education Fund of South Africa
TG	Task Group
TSPH	Thusano School of Public Health
UCT	University of Cape Town
UDF	United Democratic Front
UDUSA	Union of Democratic University Staff Association
UMA	University Management Associates
USA	United States of America
UWC	University of the Western Cape
VC	Vice-Chancellor
WBSF	Wits Black Staff Forum
WISE	Wits School for the Environment
WITP	Wits Information Technology Programme
Wits	University of the Witwatersrand