

https://dspace.org/

Questioning gender : the representation of race and gender in global and local print media responses of the Caster Semenya saga.

Bhula, Vidhya

2011-11-10
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/10742

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

Name: Vidhya Bhula

Student Number: 0613624E

Questioning Gender: The Representation of Race and Gender in Global and Local Print Media Responses of the Caster Semenya Saga.

Dissertation

Department of Media Studies

University of Witwatersrand

Acknowledgements

Thank you to my parents, without whom I would be nowhere; and my family, for the constant support, love and smiles. Thank you, Nitesh, the love of my life, and my everything, for just always being there. Dr. Pumla Gqola, thank you for believing that I can do anything I put my mind to.

Key Words

Caster Semenya

Gender

Humour

Race

Representation

Sarah Baartmann

Sexuality

Sport

Women

Abstract

Examining the print media representations of South African runner, Caster Semenya, is the focal point of this study. Both local and international print media are considered. The dissertation sets out to draw parallels between the representation of Semenya and early 19th century representations of Sarah Baartman. Links between the race of these two women and their "othering" on the basis of their gender are drawn. The study explores the medical and scientific justifications for "othering" these two women, the lack of agency that is attributed to both Semenya and Baartmann, and also discusses the use of humour as a tool of negotiating their "otherness".

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Background to Study

Caster Semenya is a South African middle distance runner who catapulted to fame in August 2009 when she won a gold medal in the women's 800m race at the World Championships in Athletics 2009 in Berlin. However, it was not her speedy running time of 1:55:45 (International Association of Athletics Federation, 2009) that was the cause of this fame, but rather the controversial questions that were raised by competing athletes and journalists alike, which all referred to Semenya's sex. It was argued by these sceptics that it was not possible for Semenya to run so fast and that she might not be a female as she did not look and present herself as a female. Her short, corn rowed hair, her muscular build and her deep voice all seemingly pointed out to the fact that she might be a man posing as a woman athlete. Her speed and power in the race further sparked this outrage and led to calls for a gender test to be conducted. The reports that emerge around this time mostly seem to reflect the gender controversy and overshadow her tremendous success. In South Africa, however, a growing number of people began to question the IAAF and the media for particularly singling out Semenya for gender testing and not other athletes.

After winning gold at the Berlin championships, Semenya was subjected to what is commonly referred to as a "gender test", which is, in actual fact, a sex test. Butler (1999: 9) offers a distinction between the terms "gender" and "sex" and suggests that "whatever biological intractability sex appears to have, gender is culturally constructed". The "gender test" results, a highly personal and private issue, were leaked by Australian newspaper, the *Sydney Daily Telegraph*, in September 2009. This serious breach of ethics raised questions as to why Semenya's case was being so highly publicized when many Western sportswomen had undergone such tests and had their privacy respected. The leak of the test results was a clear indication that the Australian newspaper had no respect for Semenya's privacy. Also, during this time, a wealth of cartoons, advertisements, articles and the like, emerged using the Semenya saga

as a topic of humour and lampooning. Semenya was cleared by the IAAF in July 2010 to compete in athletics as a female competitor. The abovementioned issues that are raised all form the background to this study.

Aim

Popular South African sportswoman, Caster Semenya, has received a great deal of attention in the South African and International mass media. A large percentage of the print media responses that emerged focused their attention on the enquiry into her 'gender' by other athletes and international sports bodies. This project aims to analyze a sample of various forms of print media responses in order to explore the manner in which the Caster Semenya Saga was represented in the local and international media. The project seeks to explore the commonalities that can be traced between the representation of Semenya and the early nineteenth century figure of the "Hottentot Venus", Sarah Baartmann. Furthermore, in this time, print media formats, both locally and internationally, used the publicness of the saga as an opportunity to use Semenya as a subject of humour and lampooning, just as Sarah Baartmann was in her display at Picadilly Circus.

Hypothesis

Colonial discourses of femininity serve to 'other' those who don't possess one or more of the qualities deemed "feminine" and often, race is a contributing factor to this 'othering'. The representations of Caster Semenya seem to be problematic in that they inscribe to a colonialist discourse of femininity. Humour is also used to advance the 'othering' process and is evident in both Semenya's and Baartmann's situations.

Research Problem

Caster Semenya was represented by print media formats as opposing hetero-normative rules of femininity. Hetero-normative rules of femininity are usually those conventions that inscribe what is considered feminine behaviour in society. As these rules of femininity are usually informed by a heterosexual, white colonialist discourse, it is natural that Semenya would be 'othered' for not

conforming to qualities deemed "normal" in this sphere, as she is a black woman who does not display white-feminine qualities. The research seeks to investigate how print media formats assisted in, or subverted, the creation of representations of Semenya as relating to these dominant discourses.

Rationale

The Caster Semenya Saga serves as a catalyst for a discussion around representation, race and gender. These fields of study have been widely explored and debated. This study aims to contribute to the field of media and gender research in its study of how colonial discourses of the nineteenth century still inform representations of black women in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. The project seeks to demonstrate that white, hetero-normative norms of femininity still exist in terms of colonial discourse and 'other' those that do not conform to it. It is this 'othering', and the print media representations that enforce it, which will be analysed.

Through an analysis of print media formats that represent Caster Semenya, the project serves to build on existing work conducted on Cultural Studies, Ideology and Queer Theory. From a cultural studies perspective, the project will make use of theories of representation to explore how representations of race and gender today still continue to be informed by colonialist discourse. The idea of ideologies as a result of meaning-making processes is closely linked to representations. The project serves to explore how current representations are informed by colonialist representations of black women. This reinforcing of the systems put in place by colonialists, those in power, still exist today. Finally, the idea that gender is a cultural construction, which informs the basis of theories of performativity and queer theory, is explored in terms of the Caster Semenya Saga.

The study will particularly explore the representations of Caster Semenya through a print media format. This allows for adequate interaction between representations of Semenya and of Sarah Baartmann, as much of the representations of both these figures were in the print media.

Although Sarah Baarmann was physically displayed at Picadilly Circus, there are also many write-ups about the act as well as pictures of Sarah Baartmann depicting her in these shows. Thus, pictures and articles about Sarah Baartmann and Caster Semenya can be compared to explore the complexities of the representation of these two women. The study aims to examine both local (South African) and international print media reports. The reasoning behind this selection lies in the fact that some international countries, The United States of America and the United Kingdom for example, were very vocal about the Saga and these countries are also informed by colonial thought. Newspapers from these countries are agenda-setting and popularly read. Also, in other print media formats, such as cartoons and billboards, the gender testing debacle was lampooned and these representations will be explored. The project has chosen the time period, August 2009-December 2009 from the point the Caster Semenya story broke and continued to make headlines for about four months. This is an ideal timeframe as there is a rich resource of material for this timeframe.

Research questions

1) In what ways, through an analysis of global and local newspaper reports, can Caster Semenya be seen as represented as a modern-day Sarah Baartmann? The research will focus on two aspects:
    a. The representation and construction of femininity in both Baartmann and Semenya's stories.
    b. The use of lampooning humour to construct representations of Caster Semenya and Sarah Baartmann.

CHAPTER TWO

Literature Review

Introduction to Literature Review

The media's role in either advancing or undermining racial and gender-based issues is widely considered in scholarly works. This literature review attempts to find a literary grounding that will anchor the remainder of the study in the field of media and gender. The review of literature in the field will explore relevant studies that address the research question it terms of all aspects pertaining to Baartmann and Semenya. The work on media representations of race and ethnicity will first be analyzed, with specific emphasis on studies of the representation of black women in the media. The review then discusses works that have been conducted by academics, as well as opinion pieces by individuals in the field of gender and media, on the Caster Semenya Saga. This will be followed by an introduction to Sarah Baartmann and the research conducted on her life in Europe will be considered for its relevance to the study of race and gender in a postcolonial age as well as its relation to the Semenya saga.

Media and Representations of Black Women

The introduction of feminist studies in the 1960's - 1970's began a wave of clashes where women called for the inclusion of women in the media and fair representation in the media. The suffragist movement was "nearly unanimous in calling for the establishment of their own periodicals" (Carter and Steiner, 2004: 1). In the 1990's, the 'second wave' of feminism, feminists began to undertake "systematic research into media images of women" (Carter et al, 2004: 2). Most of this work focused on the manner in which media forms naturalized "dichotomized and hierarchical sex-role stereotypes" (Carter et al, 2004: 2). These works considered how "media discourses contribute to, or conversely, challenge the structural (re)production of gender inequalities" (Carter et al, 2004: 14).

The essayist has found that work on women in the media particularly addresses three major issues. The first of these is representation of women in the media, much of which draws on feminist work on the study of representation. Most of this research focused on the 'different roles and stereotypes portrayed by men and women in media content" (Baehr & Gray, 1996: 1). The links between genre and representations of women "in and through different media forms" (Baehr & Gray, 1966: 59) also form part of work in this area. Second, the audience and reception of media text is also an important study in feminist works on the media. Baehr et al (1996: 101) suggest:

> This has often polarized into versions of the 'ideal' or 'implied' reader in the text compared with the 'real' readers, who may or may not inhabit or take up the subject positions offered.

The arguments of studies in this vein discuss the chasm between the codes which address and "imagined" viewer and the actual viewer.

The third overarching theme that feminist media practitioners explore is that of the roles that women play in the actual production of media products. As women started leaving the domestic sphere and entering the workforce, studies on inequalities in the workplace become fore-fronted. In the media sphere, studies on women involved in media production began to question "whether women have a distinctive and different contribution to make to media content, and why is it so difficult for women to create change" (Baehr et al, 1996: 165). Thus, work in this field looks at the production of media content and the involvement of women in practices of this production. The abovementioned works are all relevant to a study of the Caster Semenya Saga as this work will contribute to and build on current works on representation, on genre and the different manners of representation within different genres.

The mass media may be seen as a key agent in either advancing or undermining racial stereotypes. The media are institutions which provide "an organizational framework within which individuals interact in the context of set roles and established power hierarchies" (Downing & Husband, 2005: 9). Most research in the field of media studies focus specifically on the texts or content of the media product itself. Downing and Husband (2005: 26) suggest that

reasons for this phenomenon lie in the fact that the "communication process is symbolic" and thus ensures its "pride of place" in analysis and that:

> … researchers can access media content much more simply than either (a) the production process and the corporate nexus behind most of it, or (b) how users interpret and act upon the text.

The third reason why text analysis is so important in studies of racial representation is that many see meaning-making as a "straightforward" process and therefore, "extrapolating from the text backwards to its producers, and/or forward to its users, is pretty well hazard-free" (Downing et al, 2005: 26).

Much of the work that has been done on the media and women of non-Western ethnicity (Black, Asian, Indian, etc) also focuses on the representation of these women in media products. Murphy (1998: 169) suggests that the four most common attributes portrayed by women in the media are "'weak', 'unintelligent', 'over-emotional' and 'self-centered'/'shrew-like'". West (1994: 211) further suggests that there is an "internalized association of Blackness with inferiority". Through this form of stereotyping, it has become clear that representations of Black women are further sub-standardized than their male counterparts and are therefore even further misrepresented. Non-Western women are "othered" and often ignored by a media which conforms to a "woman-equals-white-female" myth (Onwurah, 1987: 39). Onwurah (1987: 40) suggests that an "ideal" woman is created by the media and she is "white, hetero, confident and partnered". This is a stereotype that has remained constant through many media formats. Other, non-white women, on the other hand, are seen as either "victims" or as "exotic sex objects" (Davies, Dickey and Stratford, 1987: 39). As "sex objects" women of colour are portrayed stereotypically as "the subservient Asian woman, the hot-blooded Latina and the sexually promiscuous Black woman" (Jensen, 2004: 257).

Gqola (2010: 69) suggests that representations of black women are often challenging to feminist writers. Furthermore, she writes about black women who have been catapulted to fame (Gqola, 2010: 69):

> The difficulties of representation are aggravated when the colonized women is a famous one, Sarah Baartmann, who has so extensively been mythologized.

The parallels between Semenya and Baartmann have been established earlier. However, just as Sarah Baartmann is mythologized, so has Semenya. Semenya, it may be argued, is also a "mythological" subject as she is, more often than not, silent about enquiries into her gender. Thus, her fame becomes a voiceless fame, like Sarah Baartmann. In Caster Semenya's case, it is her 'breaking out' of the subservient and powerless stereotype that resulted in a media-hunt for reasons to "other" her that would bring her back to a level of inferiority. This essay therefore, serves to argue that when a non-Western woman does not conform to the stereotypes put in place by "Western ideals", reasons will be found to further other her and ostracize her from "femininity".

Another integral theme that may relate to the media and black women is the appropriation and normalization of white, hetero-normative ideals of femininity. bell hooks (1995: 110) suggests that this dates back to colonial run education system, which was "meant to socialize us to believe in our inherent inferiority". According to hooks (1995: 110):

> Aping whites, assimilating their values (i.e., white supremist attitudes and assumptions) was clearly the way to achieve material success.

The idea of reinforcing white values of femininity is reiterated here and is very relevant to the study of Semenya's case. If the media product is created and controlled by a person schooled in this system, then it is likely that these values will be revealed in the products created around Semenya.

In South Africa, the news media is saturated with "the existence of blatant as well as subtle gender stereotypes" (Buiten, 2007:115). The South African media particularly advance a "discourse or ideology that legitimises and maintains women's subordination" (Buiten, 2007: 116). Buiten's findings are particularly interesting in the Semenya saga as Semenya demonstrated a power that was far beyond what is deemed 'normal' for a female. The question then is, if we remain a society that is based on the subordination of women, then how would a woman of Semenya's power be represented? South Africa is a country where women's

empowerment is a much talked-about issue. Gqola (2007: 115) suggests that issues of women's empowerment "as currently employed and aired in South Africa" is based on assumptions that "*some* women have access to wealth, positions in government and corporate office is enough gender-progressive work for our society". These few 'privileged' women are often just placed into powerful positions to provide the image of an equal society and are meant to adapt to their workplaces rather than work in spaces "that [are] more receptive to women's contributions, needs and wants" (Gqola, 2007: 116). As such, women who demonstrate power that is not *given* to them by men are seen as threats in a South African context. Semenya's case is unique in that she demonstrates women's empowerment through hard work, shedding her own sweat and pulling herself out of rural poverty to become a force to be reckoned with.

The South African media, with its "very public and relentless circulation of misogynist imagery, metaphors and language" (Gqola, 2007: 115) needed to find a way of representing Semenya in a light that would serve to maintain the current status-quo without ruining the image if women's empowerment. This has been done before, with women in the "official 'public space'" of the workplace (Gqola, 2007: 116). Their lives are questioned, not for the work they do in the public realm, but more to find out how they negotiate the 'private' spaces of home, family and relationships. This is a common occurrence amongst representations of all women, where the media chooses to question women's private lives more than their public work. Gqola (2007: 116) calls this the "recycling of the 'cult of femininity'" and suggests that it occurs in all sectors and has infiltrated all branches of culture. Furthermore, Gqola (2007: 116) argues:

> In interview after media interview, the question is posed to economically powerful women, 'who are you really?' Thus, pressure is applied to prove that they exhibit traditionally feminine traits, in other words, that as powerful as such women are at work, they submit to the patriarchal 'cult of femininity' elsewhere, illustrating that South African media are of a global late-capitalist patriarchal order.

Media therefore, negotiate this disjuncture between power and patriarchy by emphasising powerful women as agents in a private realm and downplaying the 'power factor' in their lives, be it economical power, physical power or mental power. They emphasise women's roles as mother, daughter, sister and wife above their roles as CEO, banker, and even star athlete.

Caster Semenya in the Spotlight

It is natural, with the extreme publicity that Caster Semenya was receiving in the gender debacle that many academics would respond to the blatant disregard which was shown to Semenya. Gqola (2009) so aptly described Semenya's story as that of a South African woman "rendered spectacle in a European city for the world to see". Her agility, speed and power in her running set her aside from her peers and, while her record-breaking ability was admirable to many, there were those who "assumed that she must be a fraud of some kind, perhaps a deceptive boy masquerading as a female" (Lewis, 2010: 113). Her 'otherness' was questioned by her fellow athletes, media people and the public as well. The fact that she "broke" the mold (Lewis, 2010: 113) of heteronormative rules of femininity was a catalyst for the very public demands that she undergo a "gender test".

Semenya was questioned mainly for displaying masculine attributes and power that is not normally attributed to women's athletics. Nyong'o (2010, 98) suggests:

> As in Semenya's case, female masculinity is often associated with forms of disguise and deceit (the stigma of ''doping'' and of South African Athletics perhaps trying to ''pass off'' a male runner as a woman is clearly relevant here). But it is also associated, and for related reasons, with the extraordinary. Runners like Semenya are as much virtuoso performers as are musicians of extraordinary skill. And the virtuoso always risks being scapegoated as a freak of nature, even as they exemplify a potential that is immanent to the human.

The demonstration of extraordinary, masculine power is often seen as a deceit in sports circles, as women who demonstrate this would be questioned for being overly masculine. There are certain accepted discourses about the limits of women's power. Achieving extraordinary feats, like Semenya did, only serves to further the labelling of such behaviour as 'freaky' and because of her virtuosic performance, even though it was in the realm of possibility for a woman to achieve, she was deemed 'abnormal'.

Her 'difference' and her apparent 'unnatural' power was the cause for fears of Semenya, an 'other', and there were calls for the extermination of Semenya from partaking in athletics events. The calls for her biological make-up to be tested for discrepancies failed to acknowledge that her

'masculinity' might have been a "virtuosic" performance of her gender and could not possibly be reducted "to chromosomes or chemistry" (Nyong'o, 2010: 98). That Semenya was not the first to be subjected to such humiliation was ignored just as the fact that her time didn't even make the list of the of the fastest women in athletics history. Gqola (2009) along with many others, pointed out the questioning of Indian athlete Santhi Sounderajan's sex in the Asian Games of 2006 for displaying masculine traits that seemed 'unnatural'. Joseph (2009) suggested that Souderajan experienced a very similar trauma when she won the silver medal, "coincidentally in the same event".

Many of the papers and articles that responded to the saga made specific emphasis on the questioning of Semenya's "sex (her biological female identity – what is mostly mistakenly being referred to as her gender (the way she manifests her femaleness)" (Byerly, 2010: 118). Joseph (2009) has proposed that "both the IAAF and many journalists would benefit from going back to women's/gender studies 101 to understand the difference between sex and gender". This distinction has been accentuated by scholars, specifically to emphasize the disjuncture between the globally accepted views of femininity (white, hetero-normative) and the way Semenya acted. While her sex may have been female, it was argued that she did not look and 'act' female and therefore needed to undertake a 'gender' verification test, which is in actual fact a sex verification test.

Many papers also focused, particularly, on a South African magazine, *YOU* magazine, which controversially published a story, and accompanying pictures, on a makeover done on Semenya. This publication drew a lot of attention with scholars arguing that Semenya was made up to depict "a thoroughly Westernized young woman – from power girl to glamour girl" Hoad (2010: 402). Nyong'o (2010: 96) proposed that the makeover was "a transparent bid to render [Semenya] a more suitable standard bearer for national femininity". Nyong'o (2010: 96) suggests:

> The headline ''Look at Caster Now'' can only mean: refer back from this image, which we present to you as the true, real Caster, to the prior, excessive and disturbing image one, and you will somehow have your perception of her gender stabilized.

Here, the media negotiated the disturbing terrain of a woman with extraordinary power by making her seem more 'feminine', and the accompanying interview portrayed Semenya as explaining details of her life as a woman in the private realm, away from athletics. The arguments against Semenya's makeover all pointed to the fact that, in order to confirm Semenya's femininity, the YOU magazine found it essential to make her look like a Western woman, thus emphasizing that the only manner in which a woman can be considered female is through adopting and portraying Western ideals of femininity.

Byerly (2010: 119) identified the representation of Semenya in reports about her sex as a form of "inferential homophobia" which she defines as "the adoption of a set of unquestioned assumptions about which characteristics in appearance and behavior should constitute a real 'woman'". She derives this term from Stuart Hall's definition of "inferential racism" which he defines as "apparently naturalized representations of events and situations relating to race, whether 'factual' or 'fictional', which have racist premises and propositions inscribed in them as a set of unquestioned assumptions" (Hall, 1995: 20). One of the main arguments of this study are that representations of Semenya contain instances of both inferential homophobia as well as inferential racism.

Sarah Baartmann

Sarah Baartmann was a Khoi-San woman born sometime in the 1770's and was taken from South Africa to England and France (Crais & Scully, 2009: 1). While "no record of her original name exists" (Qureshi, 2004: 233) she is often referred to as 'Sarah Baartmann' or 'Sartjie Baartmann'. It was in the European countries of England and France that Sarah Baartmann was placed on display as the "Hottentot Venus". Sarah Baartmann's journey began when she was transported to Europe by Hendrik Cezar and placed on display in London's Piccadilly Circus (Gqola, 2010: 61). She was then sold to an anonymous Englishman and died mysteriously soon after. Her body, which was given to scientist George Cuvier, was subsequently persevered and Cuvier "had her genitalia and brain pickled in formaldehyde" (Gqola, 2010: 62). She was displayed in a Parisian museum until her remains were put away in storage at the museum. Post-1994, the South African government began a campaign to have her remains returned to her

homeland, yet her body "could not be returned for burial until May 2002 because an official from the Musée de l'Homme alleged that her remains had been lost" (Gqola, 2010: 63). Baartman was buried in the Eastern Cape that year.

The story of Sarah Baartmann has been widely used as the basis for studies of representations of black females. According to Qureshi (2004: 233):

> The nature of Baartmann's story, and the power of the racial and gender politics invested in its re-telling, has led – not surprisingly, and perhaps inevitably – to modern writers and artists appropriating her as a focal point for discourses upon race, gender, empire, and specifically Western representations of black female sexuality.

It can be deduced that Sarah Baartmann is a key figure in studies of gender and race discourses and has been adopted as the foundation for many studies that explore how black women are represented in public spheres. This study has chosen to explore Semenya as a modern-day Sarah Baartmann for various reasons which will be discussed in the forthcoming paragraphs of the review.

The colonial project relied heavily on justifications mailed back to Europe, by those who were sent out to set up colonies, to validate why colonialism was a viable project. These 'reports' were sent back by travelwriters and scientists of the 18th century. The colonial project needed to be justified, as Europeans "had first to be taught to believe that the women [and men] they were killing and enslaving were less than human" (Abrahams, 1997: 36). This was first done through 'travelogues' which were "creating and perpetuating the myth of brutish and 'uncivilized' people believed to be without, or worse still, incapable of religion" (Qureshi, 2004: 284). It can be argued that "one also finds an implicitly racist and sexist development of European language employed contemporaneously upon the bodies of Black women" (Gordon-Chipembere, 2009: 297). The idea is that there still exist racist and sexist connotations in representations of Black women in contemporary times. The 18th century travelogues have been replaced with media and the Khoi-San people who were represented as "the most ignoble group in the progression of mankind" (Gordon-Chipembere, 2009: 298) and throughout time "it spread…to eventually encompass all African women" (Abrahams, 1997: 47).

Magubane (2007: 816) argues in her essay on Sarah Baartmann, that it is social relations that inform how we see and perceive bodies. She discusses various representations of Sarah Baartmann and talks of works that show how "medical, literary, and scientific discourses work to construct images of racial and sexual difference" (2007: 816-817). It is suggested that the key underpinning beneath the scientific and medical 'othering' of black-skinned people by the scientists that examined Sarah Baartmann, and the subsequent representations of blacks as sexual deviants, were a direct "expression of fears about their corporeal differences" (Magubane, 2007: 819). Sarah Baartmann was born in the time that the French Revolution had begun (1789) and the Revolution was meant to eliminate racism and sexism. The Revolution catalysed ideas of democracy and equality to come forth throughout 18th century European society. However, in an attempt to keep the colonialist project alive, the discourses around 'othered' beings became more popular and the idea of the degeneration of society as "associated with unique and observable physical differences" was slowly proliferating (Magubane, 2007: 820). In Semenya's case, it may be argued, it is the fear of her superior running ability and her physical prowess that enables the discourses that 'other' her to the boundaries of society. The expression of these fears is also manifested in representations of Semenya as a scientific or medical subject.

Sarah Baartmann was taken from her birthplace to a strange European city to satisfy a demand for circus freaks and outcasts. The culture of the 18th century relied on exotic acts and displays for entertainment. According to Qureshi (2004: 235) Sarah Baartmann's "value lay in her perceived uniqueness as a rare live specimen of the exotic". This relates back to the representation of Black people as uncivilized, and therefore different. Gordon-Chipembere (2009: 298) suggests:

> The deliberate construction of a barbaric, savage people was a method through which the English could displace their own fears and anxieties as a nation in the midst of transforming into an imperial power.

The construction still remains somewhat in practice in various representations of Black women as they are still perceived as exotic other's and the urge to justify actions and "desire to establish order and preserve power by making spectacles of difference" still exists today. Semenya's

power in her running ability and her difference in acting out her served as a catalyst that justified the treatment, from fellow contestants as well as media, of the gender debacle that surrounded her just as Baartmann's treatment was justified as she was an exotic other.

Just as Cuvier and his team of scientists examined and raised questions about Sarah Baartmann's hyper-sexuality and the links thereof with her race, so was Caster Semenya being subjected to gender verification tests for her lack of femininity. Nyong'o (2010: 98) suggests that comparing Semenya to Sarah Baartmann may not be conducive to arguing that Semenya was wronged as Sarah Baartmann was "violated for what the imperialist eye took to be her aberrant femininity" while Semenya was being violated for her overt masculinity. However it is the aim of the project to suggest that both Sarah Baartmann and Semenya can be compared as their 'difference' from hetero-normativity were viewed from a scientific perspective and both were rendered no more than just "scientific object(s)" (Fitschen, 1989: 1). Black (2009: 41) furthermore, suggests that "there exists a long history of subjecting colonized bodies to prodding, study, and sterilization in processes of dehumanization and subjugation, whether it's in the name of science, 'civilization' or even sports". This is an important revelation that points out the existence of colonial thought in Western-run organizations and bodies and the actions of these bodies as racist. Semenya's story, then, is a reflection of the existence of modern-day racism and the objectification of a Black body to satisfy white ideals of femininity.

Sarah Baartmann was famously involved in a court case in 1810 that the "African Association for Promoting the Discovery of the Interior of Africa" brought to court under "pretences of moral outrage" (Gordon-Chipembere, 2009: 305). Furthermore:

> The real issue for the court was not the immorality of exhibiting an African woman in a cage like an animal, but the indecent exposure of her body before a civilized, moral English public.

In the same vein, Semenya's case was met with outrage in Berlin as fellow athletes and others were outraged that she defied records and dared to run so fast. Her victory was not celebrated but questioned and she was leered at and examined from all angles to see if she was a woman. Furthermore, in all recounts of Baartmann's story she "remained virtually mute" (Gordan-

Chipembere, 2009: 305). The only records of her life are "accounts of her, rather than diaries or letters from her" (Qureshi, 2004: 249). This lack of agency is also explored in accounts of Semenya's story, where all accounts of her are examined to question whether she is given agency or not. This will be explored further in the study.

Pictorial representations of Sarah Baartman at her shows and during examination in Europe all seem to be slanted towards one angle. Abrahams (1997: 45) claims that illustrations of Sarah Baartmann had the "strongest claims to visual literalism and yet it is not true to life". Her lack of clothes, over-emphasized buttocks and "views framed similarly to the mammalian specimens in the volume and which are analogous to the anterior and lateral profiles used in zoological illustration" (Qureshi, 2004: 241) were all markers that aimed to emphasize Sarah Baartmann's difference from the European norm. Pictures of Sarah Baartmann "set what was going to become an enduring image of the African woman before the world: reduced to a bodily part, she existed only to be known, named, categorized and taken" (Abrahams, 1997: 42). Images of Caster Semenya "seemed geared to raise questions" (Muzenda, 2010: 123) about her sexuality, and this will also be explored in relation to the manner in which Sarah Baartmann was represented.

The return of Sarah Baartmann's remains to South African soil was celebrated with great attention. Her return was spoken of by president's Nelson Mandela and Thabo Mbeki and was a "spectacle of nation building, which received widespread coverage in the national media" (Samuelson, 2007: 88). In the same vein, Semenya's return from Berlin was celebrated with much pomp and glamour, with many political figures making their way to the airport or attending parties that were held to welcome her home. According to Samuelson (2007: 89):

> This emphasis on bringing Baartmann back home speaks to three central concerns. The first is the naturalization of the nation as a domestic, familial unit. The rhetoric of the nation as family legitimates gendered hierarchical structures and casts women as Mothers, who reflect national unity.

This is an important idea that can relate to Semenya's return home. Semenya, was often referred to as "our golden girl" or "daughter" of South Africa by politicians and media alike. This naturalised the idea of Semenya as a part of the big South African family. The problem with

likening the nation to a family is that it reinforces patriarchal hierarchies that exist in common, "nuclear" families. In these families, the man is the head of the household and operates in the public sphere to provide for and take care of his female counterpart, who is relegated to the private sphere. Thus, it can be argued that the notion of Semenya as a "girl" or "child" has relegated her to a role that is limited to the private sphere and downplays her power just as, in the same way; Sarah Baartmann was relegated to the role of "mother".

Furthermore, a key narrative during the time of the shift from "apartheid to post-apartheid" was that of "exile and the return home" (Samuelson, 2007: 90). This is an important trope that was carried out in many post-apartheid narratives, and still continues till today. Exiled South Africans who returned home to a post-apartheid South Africa, were meant to be returning to a South Africa that was free of racial discrimination. The return home is significant in that for Baartmann and Semenya, with their South African roots, home is also the post-apartheid South Africa, where they are meant to be welcomed to spaces that are free of racial prejudice and discrimination. However, it can be argued that the racial prejudices that they received overseas was replaced with other prejudices on their return home.

The third concern that Samuelson (2007: 90) notes is that of "a return to cultural traditions from which those with Khoisan origins have been exiled under successive regimes of colonialism and apartheid". The notion of a "loss" of culture due to apartheid and colonialism has catalysed those who have celebrated the returns home of Baartmann and Semenya to further emphasise the cultural aspects of their respective tribes. Semenya's return was celebrated in her hometown with a big party where there were guests singing traditional songs in her praise. This emphasis on tradition is a mark of a rejection of the oppression of colonialist cultures. All these concerns that Samuelson raises point to the fact that Semenya and Baartmann were both 'claimed' as belonging to the nation of South Africa. Caster Semenya's return to South Africa was also celebrated and received with great nationalistic fervour, just as Baartmann, and representations of Semenya's return will be explored in their similarities and differences to Baartmann's story.

Conclusions of Literature Review

The review has attempted to explore key readings around the field of media and gender. It is clear that this is a vast field of study. The representations of women in the media, sportswomen in the media as well as black women in the media are very relevant in a study of representations of Semenya. These are key readings that will assist in answering the research question that is posed in this study. The review has also explored the different angles that have been adopted in the study and exploration of the Caster Semenya. The review also offered a discussion of key readings that relate Sarah Baartmann's story in an attempt to reveal the linkages between Semenya and Sarah Baartmann. The review has revealed various commonalities between the experiences of these two South African women. First, the medical and scientific justifications that renders both Sarah Baartmann and Semenya images of public spectacle. Second, the discourses that inform this medical and scientific justification as arising from a fear of the 'other' is discussed. Both women's lack of agency in the retelling of their stories is explored and insights into how pictures are used to advance questions of either hyper sexuality or lack thereof are also reviewed. Finally, the review of literature around Baartmann's return to South Africa is also explored. Debates that have been discussed in this section of the review offer vital insight that will assist in answering the research question.

CHAPTER THREE

Theoretical Framework

Introduction to Theoretical Framework

In an attempt to flesh out the most viable and relevant justifications for the investigation of the representation of Caster Semenya, the theoretical framework will consider three vital academic theories. The first of these is the theory of cultural studies and its work on representation. Second, the framework considers the concept of ideology and how it is created and shapes racism and gender bias. Third, Judith Butler's concepts of gender performativity in the broader field of queer theory is also considered for lending key ideas in the study of gender issues in the Semenya saga.

Cultural Studies and Representation

Culture may be defined as a "'way of life' of a people, community, nation or social group" (Hall, 1997b: 2). It is a concept which covers "the arts and artistic activity", "the learned, primarily symbolic features of a particular way of life" and "a process of development" (Baldwin, Longhurst, McCracken, Ogborn & Smith, 2004: 4). Culture can therefore be seen as broadly encompassing anything about "shared meanings" (Hall, 1997b: 1). Culture is a "learned" (Baldwin et al, 2004: 7) phenomenon. People come to absorb aspects of culture through processes of socialisation and our interactions with meaning-making systems. The media is a key meaning-making system and this is where many of the key ideas about culture are circulated and perpetuated.

Cultural studies is centrally concerned with "culture as a key concepts for understanding features of our contemporary historical situation" (Dahlgren, 1997: 53). Garnham (1995: 69) defines cultural studies:

> Cultural studies believes that culture matters and that it cannot be simply treated (or dismissed) as the transparent, at least to the critic, public face of dominative and manipulative capitalists. Cultural studies emphasises the complexity and contradictions, not only within culture, but in the relations between people, culture and power.

Cultural studies therefore sees the that the media are powerful tools of meaning-making and examines the media for their relations with people and with structures of power. The cultural studies approach allows for the study of "how discourse and imagery are organized in complex and shifting patterns of meaning" and also looks at how media create meanings and "how these meanings are reproduced, negotiated, and struggled over in the flow and flux of everyday life" (Murdock, 1995: 94). A cultural studies approach is key in understanding the power structures that inform discourses around race and gender.

A key concept in cultural studies is that of representation. Representation is a *re-presentation* of reality. In this vein, as mentioned in the justification of study, it can be said that the media is a tool though which reality is *re-presented*. Chandler (2008:1) defines representation:

> *Representation* refers to the construction in any medium (especially the *mass media*) of aspects of 'reality' such as people, places, objects, events, cultural identities and other abstract concepts. Such representations may be in speech or writing as well as still or moving pictures.

The newspaper that is made available for the final consumer generally goes through a process of gate keeping and editing before it actually reaches the consumer. This means that every gatekeeper has had his or her hand in changing the way the article is organized and represented. The ideas that circulated around the Semenya saga are thus the result of a process whereby the cultural ideas, prejudices and ideals of the writers and other gatekeepers are impressed into the article.

Hall (1997a, 17) describes representation as "the production of meaning of the concepts in our minds through language". His definition of language is broadly defined as "any system which deploys signs or any signifying system" (1997a, 19). He assumes that objects and people do not have established, exact denotations, but to a certain extent the meanings are shaped by human

being, who are members of a culture, who have the authority to make things signify something (1997a, .19-20). Clearly, for Hall, representation involves perceiving how language and systems of knowledge production work together to produce and circulate meanings. Representation becomes the process, channel or medium through which these meanings are both created and reified. Hall particularly talks of theories that explain representation, particularly that of Saussure's semiotics and also that of discursive discourse analysis.

Semiotics and discourse, some vital ideas that have an important influence on the study of representation, offers key characteristics in the study of representations. Through the use of signs, visual, and aural codes, representations are given life. Once representations are repeated for long enough, through the use of the abovementioned codes representations become 'normalized' and feel "unmediated" (Chandler, 2008: 1). These are manifested as discourses. Chandler (2008:1) also suggests that representations are "selective, foregrounding some things and back grounding others". The most common of media representations are gender, age, class, race or ethnicity and physical disability (Chandler, 2008: 1).

Ideologies

Ideology is a key concept which assists us in understanding the manner in which the stereotypes that surround gender are established. The media may be seen as a driving force that may reinforce or undermine dominant ideologies. Thompson (1990: 5) suggests that the first of two most basic understandings of ideology is a "neutral conception" and defined as follows:

> According to this conception, ideologies can be regarded as 'systems of thought', 'systems of beliefs' or 'symbolic systems' which pertain to social action or political practice

Thus, ideology is a "way of thinking" about specific people, events or policies that shape one's ideas and understanding of the world around us. A second standpoint that Thompson (1990: 6) points out to outright rejects the concept of ideology as "simply too ambiguous, too controversial and contested".

Thompson (1990) does not prescribe to either of these responses to the word 'ideology' and he seeks to rather form a definition of this concept that considers the rationalization behind both responses. He argues (Thompson, 1990: 7):

> I shall argue that the concept of ideology can be used to refer to the ways in which meaning serves, in particular circumstances, to establish and sustain relations of power which are systematically asymmetrical – what I shall call 'relations of domination'. Ideology, broadly speaking, is *meaning in the service of power*.

Thompson's definition of ideology particularly emphasizes the use of meaning-making to enforce and advance the interests of those in power. Similarly, colonial powers used systems of meaning-making to enforce colonial ideologies. These "western" systems of meaning-making still seem to dominate many cultural products and Western ideologies seem to inform all other ideologies. In the Caster Semenya case, the western ideal of femininity, or what it means to "be a woman" is the dominant ideology that frames the news stories that emerge.

Gender Performativity and Queer Theory

Simone De Beauvoir famously noted that "one is not born a woman, but rather becomes one". Performativity, "a term arising within linguistic theory but so powerfully introduced into feminist theory through the work of Judith Butler" (Bell, 1999: 1). Judith Butlers work specifically turns "attention to the production of selves as effects" (Bell, 1999: 1). As "gender is culturally constructed" (Butler, 1999: 9), Butler's argument is that "gender intersects with racial, class, ethnic, sexual, and regional modalities of discursively constituted identities" and that gender cannot be separated from "the political and cultural intersections in which it is invariably produced and maintained" (Butler, 1999: 5). Therefore, gender is the performance of cultural meanings one adopts and "that the sexed body assumes" (1999: 10). Gender is therefore a "performance" of what one assumes to be the characteristics of one's sex, which is prescribed by one's "political and cultural intersections" (Butler, 1999: 5).

The term queer is defined by Raymond (2003: 98) as "a marker for some gay, lesbian, bisexual, transgender (glbt), and other marginalized sexual identities". Thus, any person with a 'different' sexual identity that is not 'hetero-normative' falls under the broad definition of queer. David Gauntlett (2002: 135) discusses the main characteristics of queer theory, beginning with the assumption that "nothing within your identity is fixed". This suggests that and single marker such as gender, sex, sexuality, race, ethnicity or class cannot be "broken from its context and singled out as a person's primary identity" (2002:136). Identity is a fluid phenomenon. Second, Gauntlett suggests that one's identity "is little more than a pile of (social and cultural) things which [one has] previously expressed, or which have been said about [one]" (2002:135). The third assumption of queer theory is that "there is not really an 'inner-self'" and that people "come to believe we have one through the repetition of discourses about it" (Gauntlett, 2002: 135).

The fourth observation that Gauntlett makes suggests that gender is just like other aspects of identity and "is a performance (though not necessarily a consciously chosen one)" and is also "reinforced through repetition" (2002:135). Thus, if one had to change the way one 'performs'

his/her gender role, and repeat this action, then the individual can change. This change is Gauntlett's fifth assumption. Queer theory further suggests:

> The binary divide between masculinity and femininity is a social construction built on the binary divide between men and women which is also a social construction. We should challenge traditional views of masculinity and femininity and sexuality, by causing 'gender trouble'.

Thus, the gist of queer theory is all about challenging normative views of gender through changing one's performance of their gender or sexual role and constructing a unique and fluid identity free from the traditional roles assigned by the dominant culture. Furthermore, queer theory is a "tool for thinking about identity which is relevant to everybody and is all about celebrating difference" (Gauntlett, 2002: 136).

Diane Raymond (2003: 98) also offers a brief introduction into queer theory. She suggests that to be queer is to "be politically radical" (2003:98) and to "reject binary categories". Queer theories embrace fluid categories and sees queerness "not simply as a fixed, clear demarcated category" (2003: 98). Queer theory also "tends to be universalizing rather than minoritizing" (Raymond, 2003: 98). This is a result of queer theory emerging alongside theories such as "postcolonial, feminist and multicultural theory" (2003: 98-99) which all borrowed from a variety of views and "sought to move the 'margins' to the 'center'". There are many examples of events or media products that celebrate "queerness". One can consider events such as 'gay pride' marches, which celebrate LGBTI experience and occur in cities and towns worldwide.

Conclusions of Theoretical Framework

The theories that have been discussed all offer relevant arguments that will help shape the study of the representation of race and gender in the Semenya saga. Representation is a key concept in any study of media depictions of people or events. The idea is that media selects and depicts representations of people or events that shape how media consumers will view or receive the story. Through an understanding of how systems of signs (semiotics) are placed together to create discourses around a topic, the study of race and gender can be further clarified. Representation of Semenya in print media stories will be explored through discourse analysis which is a key concept of representation. Ideologies, as meanings that have been created *through* constant representation, are also key in understanding what over-arching systems of thought inform, and are maintained by, the reporting of Caster Semenya. The project questions what ideologies of race and gender continue to exist through an exploration of the Semenya saga. Bulter's gender performativity allows for the project to more clearly grasp and explore issues around sex and gender and the performances of masculinity and femininity.

CHAPTER FOUR

Methodology

Introduction to Methodology

As an introduction to the research methodology of this project, the essayist would first like to reiterate the main research question of this paper. The question addresses the representation of Caster Semenya in both local and International newspaper formats and the likeliness of the representation of femininity in Semenya's case, to that of Sarah Baartmann. The project also seeks to explore the use of humour in print media that seek to lampoon Semenya and, again, compares this to Sarah Baartmann. These issues are the driving force behind the methodology and findings of the dissertation. It can be deduced, from the research question, that both local and international newspapers and other print media formats will be analysed. These have been accessed from various online databases such as EBSCO Host, SABINET and the online site www.NewspaperArchive.com.

The project aims to conduct a qualitative research method in the analysis of the newspaper articles and other found forms of print media as well. The essayist, as many others in the field of media, gender and cultural studies finds that - in order to enable an all-inclusive study - the qualitative approach is a far more effective method of analysis. This approach "aims to produce rounded understandings on the basis of rich, contextual, and detailed data" (Mason, 1996: 4). The study will, therefore also takes a more 'holistic' approach in the analysis of the newspaper and magazine articles, cartoons and other forms of print media. As a quantitative analysis has some drawbacks, for it allows for the "reduction of complexity that follows from the decontextualization of meaningful elements" (Schrøder, 2002: 102) it will not form part of the analysis. Quantitative analysis fails to explore 'the bigger picture' of discourses.

The methodology is divided into three sections. First, the research design, where a discussion of the chosen method of analysis and interpretation, a critical discourse analysis approach, will be undertaken for its relevance to the research questions and the study as a whole. An illustration of the manner in which the research will be arranged in the further chapters will also be undertaken. The research design is a preamble to the methods of data collection, which will describe the sample collection process for the project as well as justify the chosen print media forms. The final sub-section of the methodology section will explore the specific methods of interpretation that will be used to analyze each media text.

Research Design

The research design will begin with a discussion of the approach that will be used in analyzing the print media reports. The research of the representation of race and gender is best conducted using a Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) approach. This will, as mentioned earlier, enable the essayist to arrive at a range of all-inclusive findings. Second, the research design will explicate the manner in which the forthcoming research will be divided and analyzed. This will be explained to ensure that the research follows a logical, analytical procedure that will enable the findings of the study to be fleshed out in the most efficient and effectual manner.

Discourse, according to Fairclough (1995: 54) refers to "spoken or written language use" as well as other types of "semiotic activity", this refers to visual and non-verbal signs. The idea of discourse was first introduced by theorist Michael Foucault. Bertrand & Hughes (2005: 167) suggest the following distinction between the semiotics of de Saussure and Foucault's 'discourse':

> Unlike semioticians, who are concerned with language as an abstract system of rules (what de Saussure called *langue*), Foucault is concerned with language in action (what de Saussure called *parole*), which he called 'discourse'.

Therefore, discourses, according to Foucault's rubric are 'ways of representing aspects of the world' (Fairclough, 2003: 9) through language.

If discourses can then be seen as 'ways of representing' (Fairclough, 2003: 9) then it can be deduced that the different ways in which we see the world are shaped by our different discourses on the world. Fairclough (2003: 124) suggests:

> Particular aspects of the world may be represented differently, so we are generally in the position of having to consider the relationship between different discourses. Different discourses are different perspectives on the world, their social and personal identities, and the social relationships in which they stand to other people.

The relationships between people, whether complementary or contentious, may be seen to be relational to the discourses they share or disagree upon respectively. In some cases, one discourse can dominate another.

Discourses as representative ways of defining the world, therefore have the power to 'define an event or phenomenon as significant' (Bertrand & Hughes, 2005: 167). The media, as a key institution of representing the world, are often the driving force behind many discourses that become "naturalized". The media is an institution and discourse can be seen as an 'institutionalized way of talking that regulates and reinforces action and thereby exerts power' (Link in Jäger & Maier, 2009: 35). Therefore, discourse is not 'only mere expressions of social practice, but also serve particular ends, namely the exercise of power' (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 35). The media may be seen as the vehicle through which exercises of power are written, vocalized and even picturized.

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is a school of thought developed in the early 1990's by a group of theorists who attended a symposium in Amsterdam (Wodak & Meyer, 2009: 3). The theories and methodologies of CDA were introduced by 'Teun van Dijk, Norman Fairclough, Gunther Kress, Theo van Leeuwen and Ruth Wodak' (Wodak & Meyer, 2009: 3). CDA is a 'research programme' (Wodak & Meyer, 2009: 4) which is further defined by Jäger & Maier (2009: 36):

> CDA aims to disentangle the giant milling mass of discourse, to chart what is said and can be said in a given society at a given time with regard to its qualitative spectrum (What is said? How is it said?) and to uncover the techniques through which discursive limits are extended or narrowed down. Last but not least, and to live up to its name, CDA aims to question and criticize discourses.

CDA's agenda is therefore mainly interested in the techniques that are used to create discourses, in 'revealing the contradictions within and between discourses' and the understanding (on the part of the analyst) that the 'critique is not situated outside discourse'(Jäger and Maier, 2009: 36).

As this study is closely concerned with issues of power and ideology, a CDA approach is most viable. CDA critique is aimed at 'revealing structures of power and unmasking ideologies' (Wodak & Meyer, 2009: 8). According to Jäger and Maier (2009: 39):

> Discourses exert power because they transport knowledge on which collective and individual consciousness feeds. This knowledge is the basis for individual and collective, discursive and non-discursive action, which in turn shapes reality.

This idea is key in the study of race and gender and has been justified by Van Dijk (2000: 35) in his argument that, traditionally, racism in the media was studied in a largely analytical manner, but, discourse analysis 'systematically describe[s] the various structures and strategies of text or talk, and relate these to the social or political context'.

The research that will be conducted on the representation of race and gender in the Caster Semenya saga will be designed to conform to the ideas of CDA. The research intends to consider both local and international representations of Caster Semenya in the print media. The discourse strands that will be focused on are race and gender and these will allow the essayist to make inferences on the commonalities between Caster Semenya and Sarah Baartman. The analysis of the print media forms will take place in three distinct phases. First, the media in Semenya's home country, South Africa, will be analyzed. Second the essayist will consider a variety of global responses to the saga, with a specific focus on Western media. Finally, the project will consider print media forms that use humour to refer to the saga, both locally and internationally. This division will enable the essayist to follow an analytical procedure in pinpointing the major discourse strands, race and gender, and identifying the commonalities between Semenya and Baartman that arise from the study.

Methods of Data Collection

The methods of data collection will now be explicated beginning with a discussion of the timeframe that was selected. Second, the selection criteria for international, local and humourous print media formats will be divulged. This will then be followed by a discussion of how the sampling of the print media formats was undertaken. The section will provide an in-depth description of the sampling process and how the print media forms came to make up the sample to be analyzed. Divulging these methods will enable the reader to understand and acknowledge the impartiality of the sampling process.

In an attempt to flesh out the most content-rich texts that had covered the reporting of the Semenya saga, the data that has been collected is limited to the period from the date that the story broke, in August 2009 through to the end of September 2009. A variety of print media formats have been selected from various daily and weekly newspapers and magazines and other formats across South Africa and internationally. The local and international newspapers that reported the saga will be analyzed and thereafter, a variety of other print media formats will be analyzed for their use of humour to lampoon Semenya. The print media formats include billboards, cartoons, magazine articles and newspaper articles.

Local South African newspapers that will be considered include *The Star, Saturday Star, Sunday Times, City Press* and the *Citizen.* These are the major newspapers in South Africa. A key drawback of this study is that it fails to include the *Daily Sun* newspaper, which is the largest selling newspaper in South Africa, due to an inability to access archival material from this newspaper. Another key drawback is the lack of accompanying pictures of Semenya that will prevent the essayist from conducting a pictorial analysis of the representation of Semenya through this medium.

Some key articles from international newspapers will also be included in the study. The *Daily Mail* from the United Kingdom is the first international newspaper that has been chosen. It is important as it is published in the European city of London where Sarah Baartman was on

display in Picadilly Circus. Finally, Australia's *Sydney Morning Herald* will be critiqued for its representations of Semenya. Australia's reporting on this matter is interesting in that an Australian newspaper, the *Sydney Daily Telegraph*, controversially leaked the results of Semenya's gender verification tests. As the newspaper is unable to be accessed through archival material, the *Sydney Morning Herald* will be used to get a glimpse of the Australian perspective. These newspapers will offer a glimpse into the reporting of Caster Semenya from a western perspective.

Other print media formats that will be included in the study are billboards and cartoons and articles that depict the Semenya saga. These are sourced both locally and internationally. A South African strip-club establishment, Teasers, placed a controversial billboard that hinted at the Semenya saga. This is one of the local depictions of the Semenya Saga that will be studied, along with a series of cartoons that appeared in various newspapers. Furthermore, articles from international newspapers which use humour to discuss the saga will also be looked at. A drawback of this section is that much of the humour around the saga was mainly circulated vocally and via the internet and there is very little material in the print media realm. However, the essayist found that the few humour-slanted depictions that were found are sufficient to arrive at conclusions that will be able to respond to the research questions clearly.

The study will conduct a random sampling method through, firstly, defining the population. In this case, the population is the entire set of newspaper articles that have been collected for the local and international newspaper analysis sections as well as the other print media formats that will be collected will fall under the humour and lampooning section. Second a random sample will be selected. According to Mugo (2009: 1):

> This may be the most important type of sample. A random sample allows a known probability that each elementary unit will be chosen. For this reason, it is sometimes referred to as a probability sample.

A stratified sample is "obtained by independently selecting a separate simple random sample from each population stratum" (Mugo, 2009: 1). The population will then be divided into thematic subgroups that have been identified to contain the following themes:

- “Local print media responses to the Caster Semenya saga”
- “International print media responses to the Caster Semenya saga”
- “The Butt of the Joke: The Semenya Saga as a Site for Lampooning Humour.”

Once the selected articles are divided across these themes, a sample of half of the articles in each theme will be collected. This will enable the essayist to explore which newspapers are more prominent in their reporting of Caster Semenya as well as which themes are more prominent over the others.

Methods of Data Interpretation

In order to follow an analytical and logical approach to the study of the representation of race and gender, an appropriate method for the analysis of the print media formats has been sourced from the work of Jäger and Maier (2009: 52-56). They suggest a "toolbox" for conducting a discourse analysis of almost any format. Discourse analysis, according to Jäger and Maier (2009: 52) should begin with the initial step of "choosing a subject matter". Thereafter, the subject matter will be further dissected by "choosing a discourse plane and sector and characterizing them" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 52). The third step of "accessing and preparing the materials" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 53) is the section where the results of the sampling process will be provided and discussed in detail. These first three steps will be undertaken in the chapter entitled "Findings of the Sampling Process".

The analysis of the found samples will be undertaken in three chapters entitled "Local print media responses to the Caster Semenya saga", "International print media responses to the Caster Semenya saga" and "The Butt of the Joke: The Semenya Saga as a Site for Lampooning Humour". In each chapter, the analysis of articles will begin with a "structural analysis of the discourse strand" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 53). The steps outlined by Jäger and Maier (2009: 53-54) are summarized in the table below.

Step One	Articles to be analyzed in the chapter are to be listed with "biographical information, notes about the topics covered in the article", the genre of the article and the "section in which the article appears" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 53).
Step Two	Specific aspects of the article such as the manner in which the article is illustrated (if any), the layout of the article, the vocabulary that is used in the article, the manner of argumentation and finally, an identification of "which forms are typical for the newspaper" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 53).

Step Three	The sub-topics of the dominant discourse strands that have been identified will be listed for their appearance in each chapter.
Step Four	A summary of the frequency of each sub-topic is then provided and a discussion on the more dominant sub-topics will be conducted. A mention of the neglected topics will also be undertaken.
Step Five	The manner in which sub-topics are divided across time will also be explored. This step will explore how certain sub-topics are "particularly frequent at particular times" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 54).
Step Six	Possible discursive entanglements between discourse strands will be identified in this step.

Table 1: A structural analysis of the discourse strand

This type of analysis will allow for a "characterization of the newspaper's discourse position" to be found. It will allow the essayist to determine which newspapers reported the Semenya saga in a negative light and which newspapers were portraying Semenya in a positive light. This type of analysis "should already yield ideas for the ensuing detailed analysis of typical discourse fragments" and will also enable "the final synoptic analysis" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 54).

The detailed analysis of some of the articles in each chapter will then be undertaken. These articles that have been chosen will have been chosen for having "typical" characteristics of the discourse fragments. According to Jäger & Maier (2009: 54):

> Criteria for typicality are, for example, typical illustrations, typical use of collective symbols, typical argumentation, typical vocabulary and so on. The typical forms of these aspects have been identified in the preceding structural analysis.

The articles that have been analyzed in the structural analysis will be rated according to the defining characteristics of typicality and those "that score highest on typicality are then subjected to detailed analysis" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 54). If there are several forms of typical articles then

these can all be analyzed in detail. A tabulated format for the detailed analysis as provided by Jäger and Maier (2009: 55) follows below.

1) Context
- Why was this article selected? - Why is this article typical? - Who is the author? - What is her position and status within the newspaper? - What are her special areas of coverage, and so on? - What was the occasion for the article? - In which section of the newspaper does the article appear?
2) Surface of the text
- What is the layout like? - What kinds of pictures or graphs accompany the text? - What are the headings and sub-headings? - How is the article structured into units of meaning? - What topics are touched upon in the article? (In other words, what discourse strands is the article a fragment of?) - How do these topics relate to each other and overlap (entanglements of discourse strands)
3) Rhetorical Means
- What kind and form of argumentation does the article follow? - What argumentation strategy is used?

- What logic underlies the composition of the article? - What implications and allusions does the article contain? - What collective symbolism is used (linguistic and graphic, involving, for example, statistics, photographs, pictures, caricatures, etc.)? - What idioms, sayings and clichés are used? - What are the vocabulary and style? - What actors are mentioned, and how are they portrayed (persons, pronouns used)? - What references are made (e.g. references to science, information about the sources of knowledge used)?
4) Content and ideological statements
- What concepts of humankind does the article presuppose and convey? - What concept of society does the article presuppose and convey? - What concept of (for example) technology does the article presuppose and convey? - What perspective regarding the future does the article give?
5) Other peculiarities of the article
- What else is notable about the article?
6) Discourse position and overall message of the article
- What is the most prominent discourse from this article and what message does it wish to convey?

Table2: Detailed analysis of typical discourse fragments

Through conducting an analysis of the abovementioned six steps, and interpreting them together, the "single aspects fit together like the pieces of a jigsaw puzzle and form a unitary picture"

(Jäger & Maier, 2009: 56). The detailed analysis, along with the structural analysis, forms "the basis for synoptic analysis" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 56).

The synoptic analysis is the final step in the analysis of discourses. In this section, "the findings from structural analysis and detailed analysis are interpreted in relation and comparison to each other" (Jäger & Maier, 2009: 56). A synoptic analysis therefore asks the following questions:

- What did the structural analysis find?
- What did the detailed analysis find?
- What are the common strands that both analyses found?
- What are the varying strands that both analyses found?

The synoptic analysis is the final analysis in the discourse analysis. After this has been conducted in each of the chapters, a conclusions chapter will be drawn up to explore and combine the conclusions from each chapter.

CHAPTER FIVE

Findings of the Sampling Process

Introduction to Findings of the Sampling Process

The findings of the sampling process will be divided into three sections. The first of the sections will discuss the findings of the process of sampling of local newspaper reports of the Caster Semenya saga. These reports were sourced from the *Sabinet* online database and were searched for using "Caster Semenya" as a keyword. The search was limited to the period August 1st, 2009 to September 30th, 2009 as this is the period under research. The second section will discuss the international newspapers that will be under consideration for study. These were also sourced from an online database, Ebscohost, and were limited to the same keywords and period of study as the local newspapers. Finally, the search for material containing humour that may be analyzed, from both local and international print media, has been searched for in a different manner. The essayist has collected the humour-slanted pieces found during the sampling process of the abovementioned two processes and also searched through search engines online and found a few other print media formats that were humorous takes on the Semenya saga in the time period under consideration. All the print media reports found will be listed and a random sample of half of these will be taken.

Findings of the Sampling Process: Local Newspaper Reports

The findings of the sampling process of the local newspapers can be tabulated and will be presented below. The table depicts the newspapers that will be used for analysis. The newspapers are placed in order in descending order from the one with most articles that depict Semenya down to the one that has the least articles. Five major local newspapers were selected for analysis. There were a total of 119 newspaper articles that were found, of which, 60 will be taken as a random sample to be studied.

Name of Newspaper	**Total Population Found**	**Sample for Analysis**
City Press	46	23
Citizen	22	11
Saturday Star	18	9
Star	18	9
Sunday Times	12	6
TOTAL	**116**	**58**

Table 3: Findings of the Sampling Process; Local Newspaper Reports

Findings of the Sampling Process: International Newspaper Reports

The findings of the sampling process of the international newspapers can also be tabulated and will be presented below. The table depicts the newspapers that will be used for analysis. Again, the newspapers are placed in order in descending order from the one with most articles that depict Semenya down to the one that has the least articles. Three international newspapers, from major cities outside of South Africa, were selected for analysis. There were a total of 49 newspaper articles that were found, of which, 25 will be taken as a random sample to be studied.

Name of Newspaper	**Total Population Found**	**Sample for Analysis**
Daily Mail	30	15
Sydney Morning Herald	19	10
TOTAL	**49**	**25**

Table 4: Findings of the Sampling Process; International Newspaper Reports

Findings of the Sampling Process: Humour

The sampling of humorous articles has, as mentioned earlier, been undertaken in a different manner. The number of humorous print-media formats found will be counted according the format that it falls under. Therefore, the essayist will count the amount of articles, cartoons and other print media formats found and half of each format will be taken as the sample. This contains a mixture of both local and international formats. The results of the sampling process for this section are tabulated below.

Format	Total Population Found	Sample for Analysis
Newspaper Articles	4	2
Cartoons	8	4
Billboards	1	1
TOTAL	**13**	**7**

Table 4: Findings of the Sampling Process; Humour

Conclusion to findings of the Sampling Process

The sampling process has revealed the wealth of material that emerged in the two months that have been chosen for analysis. These two months have the most material that pertains to the saga as this is the time period that the story broke and was being followed closely by the media. The amount of reports that were chosen for analysis was as close to half of the population found as possible. The *City Press* seemed most prominent in the reporting of the saga, with as many as 46 articles found in their archives. An unexpected phenomenon is that the amount of articles found, in individual newspapers, was far more in an international newspaper, with the exception of the *City Press*, in *Daily Mail*, than in the local newspapers, *Citizen, Star* and *Saturday Star*. This

may be attributed to database infrequencies. However, as the variation between the amounts is not a large amount, this will not affect the outcomes of the project.

CHAPTER SIX

Local Print Media Responses to the Caster Semenya Saga

Introduction to Local Print Media Responses to the Caster Semenya Saga

This section will undertake the analysis of the local newspaper reports of the Caster Semenya saga. The analysis will be conducted for each newspaper. The analysis begins with the structural analysis of articles found in each newspaper. A selection of one report, in each newspaper, which demonstrates typical characteristics of the discourses identified are then be subjected to detailed analysis. A synoptic analysis combines the findings of the structural and detailed analyses for all the newspapers combined. Finally, conclusions are made about the total local print media responses through a discussion of the commonalities and differences between the individual newspapers. The newspaper reports are listed chronologically in order to get a sense of the context of the articles. To access the articles see *Appendix A.*

a) Structural Analysis of Local Newspapers

City Press

City Press is a *Media 24* owned weekly newspaper, published on Sundays. The paper has a circulation figure of 197 112 papers sold per week and a readership figure of 2 530 000 people who read their papers (South Africa. Info, 2010). It is an English language newspaper and provides current affairs news.

Article one

i. Biographical Details

Date: 2nd August 2009

Headline: "Semenya on Track for Gold"

Author: City Press Correspondent

Appears in: Back Page

Genre: Sports Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses Semenya's sterling performance in the African Junior Championships in Mauritius on the 31 July 2009. She had a timing of 1:56:72 and beat South African runner, Zelda Pretorius' record of 1:58:85 as well as almost meeting the African record of 1:54:01. The article discusses how Semenya has raised hopes of bringing a gold medal to South Africa after the IAAF World Championships in Germany. Key sub-topics that appear in this article are sport and competition and gender and sport.

Article two

i. Biographical Details

Date: 9th August 2009

Headline: "Semenya Guns for a Medal in Berlin"

Author: Daniel Mothowagae

Appears in: Sports Section- Page Unknown

Genre: Sports Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses Semenya's performance in Mauritius and talks about her beating records in her events. The article also offers a glimpse into what Semenya does to prepare for her races and her coach's opinion on how Semenya will fare in Berlin. Semenya is quoted in this article. The article also presents a list of the final athletics team that has been selected to go to Berlin. Key sub-topics in this article are sport and competition.

Article three

i. Biographical Details

Date: 23rd August 2009

Headline: “The Man who Discovered Moletji Express Tells All”

Author: Timothy Molobi

Appears in: Unknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The coach of the Moletji Athletics Club, Phineas Sako, is interviewed in this article for his role in the success of Caster Semenya. He discusses how he discovered Semenya during a school athletics competition. He describes her running ability and then goes on to say:

> “When you see her from a distance you will ask yourself whether she is indeed a woman, but there is no doubt that she is a woman.”

Furthermore, the article presents a brief description of her previous athletics achievements and her receipt of a sports scholarship at the University of Pretoria. Sako is asked about his opinion on the IAAF calls for gender testing and is said to be saddened by the insinuation. Key sub-topics that appear in the article, pertain to gender and sport and sport and competition.

Article four

i. Biographical Details

Date: 23rd August 2009

Headline: “All Black, All Gold – Caster’s Our Girl”

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses a “light-hearted moment in a heavy week” and starts with a quip about the answer to Semenya’s gender debacle lying in her shoes, as they have a pink ‘swoosh’ symbol on it. The article then goes on to describe how Caster performed in her race in Berlin and then spoke

of the rumours and questions around Semenya's gender. The confirmation that Semenya was ordered to undertake gender tests was leaked just before her race and the article speaks of how Semenya remained composed through it all. The article also points out the reasons for sex-tests and the importance of confidentiality in these cases. Furthermore, Semenya is likened to Saartjie Baartman and further emphasizes the immorality of questioning Semenya's sex so publicly. The article ends with a call to celebrate the strength and courage of this South African and her achievements. Sub-topics that appear in this article are: Sarah Baartman and Caster Semenya, Gender Testing and Sport, Science and Gender and Bias in Sport.

Article five

i. Biographical Details

Date: 23rd August 2009

Headline: "A 21st Century Baartman?"

Byline: "Outstanding Athlete Reduced to a Freak For Not Fitting a Category."

Author: Pumla Dineo-Gqola

Appears in: Unknown

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

This article mainly speaks of the many ways in which Caster Semenya can be compared to Sarah Baartman and how she may be seen as a 21st Century version of the 18th Century Baartman. The article discusses how Semenya was made to seem like a freak for demonstrating skill and winning a gold medal. The article compares people looking for Semenya's 'Adams Apple' to that of the spectacle of Baartman's "Hottentot apron". It discusses how Semenya is not allowed the privacy that other athletes are extending during tests for gender-verification. The article also discusses scientific racism and the legitimating of its ideas to a point that it still exists in modern culture. The author also discusses how the tests might prove to raise more questions instead of clarification, and that the IAAF does not test every athlete for gender-verification, nor does it

release the details of tests being undertaken. Finally, the article discusses Semenya in relation to Britain's Jenny Meadows, and speaks of how Meadows represents idealized views of femininity and Semenya conforms to a different form of femininity that is not the norm, but is well recognized in South Africa. Key sub-topics that appear in this article are Race and Gender, Gender and Cheating in Sport and Race and Bias.

Article six

i. Biographical Details

Date: 23rd August 2009

Headline: "I Shut Out Everything"

Byline: "Golden Girl Learned Self Belief the Hard Way"

Author: S'busiso Mseleku

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses the speculation around Semenya's gender verification tests and the manner in which Semenya has dealt with all the rumours. In an interview with Semenya, the author reveals her penchant for listening to gospel music. Semenya names her favourite song and talks of how it helps her prepare. She also speaks of her tactics during the races and explains how she mentally blocks all the other athletes from her mind. Her excitement and happiness for winning the gold medal are evident in the quotes from the article. The article also discusses a bit of her training regime, her diet and her life growing up with her all-male cousins. She also describes how she had to toughen up because she was teased often. Finally, the article rounds up with a description of her performance so far and predictions of future winning. The predominant sub-topics pertaining to discourses of race and gender are, sport and competition and gender and bias.

Article seven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 23rd August 2009

Headline: “Proud Villagers Share Their Winners Triumph”

Author: Piet Rampedi Mokgadi

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses how people in Semenya’s village, Moletji, celebrated Semenya’s win at the Berlin Games. Her family is interviewed and each member discusses their pride and happiness at Semenya’s win. A description of the atmosphere in her village, at her former school, in her neighborhood and outside her home, where people were all talking about Semenya’s stellar performance. Key sub-topics in the article are Sports and Competition.

Article eight

i. Biographical Details

Date: 23rd August 2009

Headline: “The Rural Girl Who Preferred to Play with Boys”

Author: Piet Rampedi

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses Semenya’s life as a rural girl growing up in Limpopo and her journey from rural girl to international athletics star. The article talks of Semenya’s love for wrestling, soccer, athletics and softball. It also discusses her past achievements in sports and academics and

interviews her former school teacher. Other friends, sports mates and coaches are also quoted on tidbits of her personal and athletic life. Key sub topics in this article are Sport and Competition.

Article nine

i. Biographical Details

Date: 23rd August 2009

Headline: "These Tests Decide and Athlete's Sex"

Author: Erna Van Wyk

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article begins with a statement on the rules of the IAAF that state that an athlete must be fully female to participate in athletics. The article then goes on to interview some science and sport experts about what constitutes a sex-verification test and the validity of the results. Key sub topics in this article are Gender and Cheating in Sport and Science and Gender.

Article ten

i. Biographical Details

Date: 23rd August 2009

Headline: "She's Tested Without the ASA's Consent"

Author: Japhet Ncube

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses how the IAAF has tested Semenya without obtaining consent from ASA. The chairperson of ASA, Leonard Chuene is said to have made these claims and is quoted. The article describes a timeline of the many tests Semenya had undergone to verify her gender and then goes on to explore the various occasions individually. The author, at the end of the article, discusses how the ASA members plan to approach this situation. The key sub-topics that appear in the article are Gender and Cheating in Sport, and Science and Gender.

Article eleven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30th August 2009

Headline: "Heroes Welcome was Open to All"

Author: Soloman Bokaba

Appears in: Letters to Editor

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The letter explores criticisms that only the ANC and black South Africans were at the airport to welcome home athletes from Berlin. Julius Malema's comments, questioning white South African's for not arriving at the airport to welcome athletes, are validated and the author expresses concerns that only Semenya was given attention for her achievements and the rest of the athletes were sidelined. Key sub-topics in this article are The Return Home and Race.

Article twelve

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30th August 2009

Headline: "She's in Her Stride"

Author: The Nation

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

This opinion piece discusses the media's handling of the Semenya saga in terms of gender stereotypes. The author questions media practitioners' choice of wording when referring to Semenya's gender-testing debacle. The article then goes on to discuss Semenya's homecoming and the pride and joy with which she was received in South Africa. Furthermore, the article compares the constitution of South Africa to that of the United States and argues that South Africa is far more inclusive of LGBTI people. Finally, the author discusses how stereotypes have affected and began to infiltrate how athletes should and should not behave. Key subtopics in this article are Gender and Cheating in Sport and Media and Gender.

Article thirteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30th August 2009

Headline: "ANC Outshines Star Athletes"

Author: Puleng Mmila

Appears in: Letters to the Editor

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The letter discusses how the ANC overpowered the welcome home of athletes from Berlin by using the opportunity to promote their party. The letter also points out that only Julius Malema and Winnie Midikizela Mandela were given the podium and highlights that Khotso Mokoena and Mbulaeni Mulaudzi were largely ignored while the focus remained on Caster Semenya. The key sub-topics of this article are The Return Home and Politics.

Article fourteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30 August 2009

Headline: "A Welcome Fit for Our Golden Queen of Spirit"

Author: Piet Rampedi

Appears in: Section Uknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article describes how Semenya's town celebrated her return home to her village. The article describes the preparations for her welcome home function, where two marquees were erected outside her home and a local DJ was called to perform. School children from nearby villages arrived to welcome Semenya home and the DJ quoted as being "honoured" to perform in front of the various dignitaries that were going to attend the party. The article then describes Semenya's speech and what she wore and reports on the local mayor's promise to renovate stadiums in the area in honour of Semenya. Key sub-topics are The Return Home.

Article fifteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30th August 2009

Headline: "IAAF, Malema are Their Own Worst Enemies"

Author: Tinyuku Ngoveni

Appears in: Letters to the Editor

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The letter speaks to the IAAF and youth league president Julius Malema for their lack of tact in timing. The IAAF is reprimanded in this letter for allowing news of the tests to be leaked and Malema is accused of lack of timing when he commented that white people did not go to the airport to welcome home the athletes. The article also discusses Malema's portrayal of all whites as racists and further warns Malema to change. Key sub-topics in this article are Gender and Cheating in Sport, Race and Gender and The Return Home.

Article sixteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30th August 2009

Headline: "More Comfort for Caster"

Author: SAPA

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article reports the decision by the Limpopo government to build a house for Caster Semenya and her family in recognition of her performance in Berlin. The article discusses the issues around Semenya's gender controversy and further discusses reasons for building a house for her in her hometown.

Article seventeen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30th August 2009

Headline: "Too Busy to Have a Boyfriend"

Byline: "At the Heart of it Caster's Just Another Girl… With a Special Talent"

Author: Lumka Oliphant

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses an interview with Caster Semenya and her interests outside of sport. The report discusses things that Semenya can do in the domestic sphere, like cook, clean and fetch water. Furthermore, the interviewer asks Semenya if she has a boyfriend, to which Semenya replies no as she is too busy and her grandmother taught her that a man needs respect and time. She discusses how often she does her hair and she also talks of the times she met former statesmen and their messages of encouragement. At the end of the article the reporter talks of how Semenya speaks to the cameraman and offers to be a lady and give her best pose. Key sub-topics in this article are Gender and Sport.

Article eighteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 06th September 2009

Headline: "Help Semenya's Family and Also Millions of Poor"

Author: Matankana Mothapo

Appears in: Letters to the Editor

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The letter discusses the authors pride at Semenya's achievement but also the disappointment that Semenya is receiving a house for her achievement. The author questions why others in Semenya's village aren't given houses as well as other South African sports stars who are also heroes. Key sub-topics in the article are Sport and Recognition.

Article nineteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 06th September 2009

Headline: "Non Racialism is Dead. Long Live Racial Solidarity"

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses issues of non-racialism and the ideas of a multi-racial country. The author makes arguments to suggest that people still hold views about other races while trying to adjust to the idea of non-racialism. The author argues that non-racialism is not possible and that racial solidarity has become more prominent. The author cites Caster Semenya's return home and Julius Malema's consequent comments as an affirmation that racial solidarity has overtaken non-racialism. The article focuses mainly on issues of race and cites examples. Key sub-topics are The Return Home and Race.

Article twenty

i. Biographical Details

Date: 13th September 2009

Headline: "DJ Takes Caster Comments Too Far. Period."

Author: Sinethemba Makhasi and Lumka Oliphant.

Appears in: Page 3 – Main Section

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses how a radio station DJ, Phat Joe (real name Majota Khambule), made comments about Caster Semenya and the reports in the Australian media that Semenya had underdeveloped internal testes. The article suggests that the DJ continued to report that Semenya has testicles even after being corrected. The report also suggests that he made comments about Semenya's period and asked if she has ever had a period. The article further discusses previous incidents where the DJ had violated station rules. Key sub-topics in this article are Gender and Bias.

Article twenty-one

i. Biographical Details

Date: 13 September 2009

Headline: "ANC Must Come Clean on Race"

Author: Sefu Sekgala

Appears in: Letters to the Editor

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The letter talks about the ANC's race policy and cites the Semenya Saga as an example. The letter discusses how, very often, everything has become a race issue in the country. The writer also comments that the ANC should strive for a non-racial society as Madiba would've liked it to be.

Article twenty-two

i. Biographical Details

Date: 13th September 2009

Headline: "No Happy Ending Here"

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Letters to the Editor

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The letter calls for something to be done about the manner in which the IAAF handled the Semenya saga. The writer condemns the IAAF for allowing news of the testing and the test results to be leaked. Furthermore, the writer calls on the government to take action against the IAAF and take action on Semenya's behalf.

Article twenty-three

i. Biographical Details

Date: 20th September 2009

Headline: "Golden Girl's 'Weirdness' is Perfectly Normal"

Author: Dave Zirin and Sherry Wolf

Appears in: Section Unknown

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses media responses to the Caster Semenya saga. The article first discusses the responses by international media to the leaks of Semenya's gender test results. The article discusses the implications if the gender test is true and suggests that Semenya may be one of millions that are "intersex" or she may have Androgen Insensitivity Syndrome, which also affects as many as two to five of every one hundred thousand people. Furthermore, the authors argue that the press had been insensitive in reporting on Semenya's results as the IAAF hadn't officially released them. The article quotes an expert in the field of pediatrics and further questions other athletes' "abnormal" attributes that have not been questioned. The article also argues that all great athletes have, in some way or the other, advantages over their competitors. The article ends with a comment on the fears that Semenya's family have that reports may affect

her mental health and the article calls for readers to stand in solidarity against those who are profiting from Semenya's downfall.

The Citizen

The Citizen is a popular South African newspaper which is sold and distributed in the Gauteng Area. It is a co-owned newspaper and managed by both CTP/Caxton and AVUSA. The newspaper has a circulation of 67 600 and a readership of 496 000 (South Africa. Info, 2010).

Article one

i. Biographical Details

Date: 25th August 2009

Headline: "Race not the Issue in Semenya Case"

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Page 12 (Letters to the Editor)

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

This letter explores the responses to Semeya's gender tests in terms of race. The writer suggests that the saga has nothing to do with race at all and that South Africans should not blame race for the insinuations around Semenya's gender. The letter further states that the saga was poorly handled by athletics boards. At the end of the letter, the writer warmly welcomes Semenya back to South Africa. The common sub topics which emerge in this article are that of Race and Gender and Race and The Return Home.

Article two

i. Biographical Details

Date: 26th August 2009

Headline: "Parading That Borders on Abuse"

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Page 12 (Letters to the Editor)

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

This letter talks of the media conference that followed Semenya's return home, which the author believes was poorly handled by Julius Malema, Leonard Chuene and Winnie Madikizela Mandela. The writer reprimands comments made by Malema and Chuene and rounds off by saying, "God help this innocent child in the hands of ignorant rabble rousers". Key sub-topics in this article are The Return Home, Race and Bias.

Article three

i. Biographical Details

Date: 26th August 2009

Headline: "Zuma Salutes 'Our Golden Girl'"

Byline: Criticism: "President Says Gender Rumours Were Mischievous"

Author: Tshifhiwa Shonisani, Cedric Mboyisa and Sapa

Appears in: Page 3

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article reports on a visit by the three medalists Semenya, Mokoena and Mulaudzi to the presidential guesthouse, where president Jacob Zuma congratulated their achievements. The article states that Zuma particularly singled out Semenya's achievements and her determination. He also criticized the IAAF's handling of the situation and revealed that the minister of sport and recreation had written a letter of complaint to the IAAF. The key sub-topics in this article are: The Return Home, Gender and Bias.

Article four

i. Biographical Details

Date: 26 August 2009

Headline: "What a Sex Test Involves"

Author: Aleisha Tissen and Lauren Peterson

Appears in: Page 3

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article offers a scientific explanation of what constitutes a sex test as the one Caster Semenya had undergone. The article discusses expert explanations of the various types of testing involved, chromosomes and categories of intersexuality. Furthermore, the expert in the article suggests that there are many other conditions that may contribute to masculisation. This article addresses sub-topics of Science and Gender.

Article five

i. Biographical Details

Date: 27th August 2009

Headline: "Race Card Pentatholon"

Author: Michael Coetzee

Appears in: Page 12

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses the calls for non-racialism by president Jacob Zuma and then suggests that public figures, such as Leonard Chuene and Julius Malema made comments about race affecting the Semenya saga. The author further suggests that gender testing originated in Europe to test

European athletes. Furthermore, the author reports, there have not been other African gold medalists who were tested for their gender. The article suggests that the sole reason for Semenya's gender testing is that she looks like a man. Key sub-topics of this article are Race and Bias, Gender and Cheating in Sport.

Article six

i. Biographical Details

Date: 27th August 2009

Headline: "Law Society Slams Sex Tests"

Author: Aleisha Tissen and Lauren Peterson

Appears in: Page 4

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses the reaction of the Transformation Committee Women's Desk of the Law Society to reports of sex tests by the IAAF. The article explains how the committee has suggested that the sex tests proves gender inequality still exists and that it is discrimination against women to test Semenya. The chairman of the committee, Kathlene Matolo, suggested that sex tests proved that "discrimination against women who don't conform to 'idealist views of the female form' is still rife". She also suggests that, as Semenya is so young, that intensifies the trauma she will experience. The article further explores what goes into a gender test and discusses previous incidents where athletes have been harmed as a result of gender tests. This article refers to sub-topics of Gender and Bias and Cheating in Sport.

Article seven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 28 August 2009

Headline: “Semenya: The Tale of Testosterone”

Author: Aleisha Tissen and Lauren Peterson

Appears in: Page 4

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article reports on preliminary medical test results of Caster Semenya that reveal that she has three times the normal level of testosterone that a normal woman. The article goes on to explain the science behind testosterone levels and further reports on a past event where athlete, Mary Decker Slaney, was also tested and revealed higher than normal testosterone levels. The sub topics of this article pertain to Gender and Cheating in Sport and Science.

Article eight

i. Biographical Details

Date: 11 September 2009

Headline: “Caster Has ‘No Womb or Ovaries’”

Byline: “Results: Source Says IAAF Can Disqualify Her in Future; Warns Her on Grave Health Risk”

Author: Citizen Reporter and AFP

Appears in: Page 3

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article reports about an Australian newspaper, the Daily Telegraph, that revealed that Semenya has no womb or ovaries. The report discusses that the Australian newspaper broke the story after a source from the IAAF provided the results to the newspaper. This article further suggests that the IAAF has advised Semenya to have an operation as her condition poses a serious risk to her health. The article also discusses the official report of the IAAF which

revealed that the test results would only be made available in November 2009. The article finally discusses the outrage that has been sparked in South Africa, with political and youth groups calling the questions of her gender racist and sexist. Key sub-topics in the article discuss Science and Gender, and Gender and Cheating in Sport.

Article nine

i. Biographical Details

Date: 15th September 2009

Headline: "Another View: An Apology is Due"

Author: The Sunday Telegraph Australia

Appears in: Page 12

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discussed the Semenya saga in terms of race and the manner in which South Africans have blamed the entire saga on race. The article reveals that the IAAF president is black and that South African leaders should have stopped Semenya from competing as she rose up the ranks in athletics. The article suggests that Semenya has always been stronger and more masculine than other athletes and should not have been allowed to compete as she was different from other athletes. The article further argues that Semenya is not to blame for her naiveté and that she suffers a traumatic, confusing condition that is not normal. The article ends by saying that officials should have treated Semenya with more "compassion and understanding". This article discusses key sub-topics of Racism and Gender and Science.

Article ten

i. Biographical Details

Date: 15th September 2009

Headline: “MP Blasts Aussies on Caster”

Byline: “Mentor: ‘Semenya is not a cheat and never will be”

Author: Cedric Mboyisa

Appears in: Page 4

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses comments made by Vytjie Mentor against Australian press for reporting that Semenya was intersex. The MP also suggested that the Australian press was nestling “people with criminal deeds”. The article further explores comments made by Mentor and the ANC discusses comments made by Vytjie Mentor against Australian press for reporting that Semenya was intersex. The MP also suggested that the Australian press was nestling “people with criminal deeds”. The article further explores comments made by Mentor and the ANC Youth League that lambasted the Australian media for attacking Semenya. The key sub topics of this article are Race and Bias and Cheating in Sport.

Article eleven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 16th September 2009

Headline: “Semenya Needs Zuma to Intervene”

Author: Cedric Mboyisa and Boitomelo Mohale

Appears in: Page 4

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article reports that President Jacob Zuma has been asked by the Afrikaanerbond to intervene in the Semenya saga. The article reports on the letter which was sent to Zuma, revealing that they believed that the matter was not properly handled by the ASA. The article ends by saying that the

chairman of the Afrikaanerbond, Pierre Theron, suggested that sport could be above politics and Zuma's welcoming home for the Springboks proved that. The key sub-topics in this article are Race and Bias in sport.

Saturday Star

The Saturday Star is the Saturday version of *The Star* newspaper, which is an Independent Newspapers subsidiary and is published and printed in Johannesburg. While it is Johannesburg-based, it is distributed country-wide and, while it was at one stage "aimed exclusively at the white market, today over 50% of the *Star*'s readers are black" (South Africa. Info, 2010). Readership is 542 000, while circulation figures show that 120 200 newspapers are sold every Saturday (South Africa. Info, 2010).

Article one

i. Biographical Details

Date: 22nd August 2009

Headline: "The Gender Benders"

Byline: "South Africans Have Clamoured in Support of the Androgynous Caster Semenya, Our Golden Girl".

Author: Janet Smith

Appears in: Page 13

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article begins with a description of Jamaican runner, Veronica Campbell-Brown, applying lipstick. The article describes the 200m gold medalist as vastly different from another runner, Caster Semenya, who won the 800m gold. Semenya, the article states, is not remotely interested in wearing lipstick. The article then goes on to describe the questions around Semenya's sex and the consequent media hype around the subject. The report suggests that while many were appalled at calls for a gender tests, British bookies were betting on whether she is a man, woman

or a hermaphrodite. The saga is likened to a "circus" by *The Times* in London and reports that she didn't attend the press conference due to the allegations. The article then describes what constitutes a gender verification test and considers that Semenya has been questioned to verify her gender since she was a child. The article then discusses other female athletes that have been questioned for being men disguised as women and describes the mandatory sex verification tests that became compulsory at a time in the Olympics. The prominence of blog posts on the subject is then discussed and the allegations of racism on the part of the IAAF are explored. Finally, the article discusses the patriotism shown by South Africans who supported Semenya in this time. Key sub-topics that pertain to the discourses are Gender and Bias, Racism, Cheating in Sport and Science.

Article two

i. Biographical Details

Date: 22nd August 2009

Headline: "The New Saartjie?"

Byline: "Angry SA Goes to War For Traumatized Teen"

Author: Candice Bailey, Sameer Naik, Kashiefa Ajam, Carien Du Plessis and Lebogang Seale

Appears in: Page 1

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article explains how the allegations of cheating prompted Leonard Chuene to quit the IAAF and prominent MP's to accuse the IAAF of portraying Semenya as a 21st Century Sarah Baartmann. The article reports that the sports committee of parliament would lodge a complaint with the IAAF. Furthermore, the article discusses other athletes who have undergone these tests without having their privacy compromised. The article then traces the argument by the IAAF that the gender tests are necessary and that they do not intend to harm Semenya. The article also discloses that the IAAF advised the team doctor to withdraw Semenya from the race but the

coach, Chuene refused. The article ends with a quote of Semenya's mother expressing her concern for Semenya. The dominant sub-topics in the article are Race and Bias, Gender and Cheating in Sport and Science.

Article three

i. Biographical Details

Date: 29th August 2009

Headline: "Masehlong Heaps Love and Praise on its Golden Daughter"

Author: Lebogang Seale

Appears in: Page 4

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article describes Semenya's return to her hometown and the celebrations that followed. The article describes the scene as Semenya returned to her hometown and the goes on to describe the various speeches that were made by dignitaries in her honour. The article also describes her speech to those who attended the function and talks about the different gifts she received for her victory. The article ends with a description of all the fans who live in her area mobbing to catch a glimpse of the star. This article discusses the sub topic of Semenya's return home.

Article four

i. Biographical Details

Date: 29th August 2009

Headline: "Gender Testing's Racist"

Author: Oupa S. Monene

Appears in: Page 14 (Letters to the Editor)

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

This letter accuses the IAAF of being racist, sexist, bigots and of humiliating Caster Semenya. The article questions why black people cannot achieve without being dehumanized and debased by white supremacy. The letter suggests that the IAAF have a look at her history and also questions why other white athletes, such as Zola Budd, were not tested. Furthermore, the article expresses concerns that Semenya should not be allowed to be dehumanized, treated with cruelty and evil racism just like Sarah Baartmann was. This letter explores key sub topics of Race and Gender and Science.

Article five

i. Biographical Details

Date: 29th August 2009

Headline: "A Giant Leap Backwards"

Author: Siyanda Mhlongo

Appears in: Page 14 (Letters to the Editor)

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

This letter discusses the Semenya saga as an opportunity for women to combat racism and gender discrimination. The letter suggests that men don't ever need to be subjected to gender verification tests and that women need to unite with Semenya to bring down gender discrimination and applaud those who gave Semenya a standing ovation at the Berlin games. The letter also suggests that at a time when the United States just elected its first black president, we are taking a step back with Semenya's case. The letter ends stating "We are proud of Semenya".

Article six

i. Biographical Details

Date: 12th September 2009

Headline: "Indian Athlete Shares Sex Test Shame"

Author: Staff Reporter

Appears in: Page 4

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This report discusses another athlete, Indian runner Santhi Soundarajan, who had to undergo the same humiliating gender tests as Semenya and was stripped of her medal. The runner describes how humiliating the ordeal was and she expressed her wish that Semenya gets to keep her gold medal and continue to run as a woman in athletics. The runner was stripped of her medal as she was found to have an XY chromosome and internal testes. Soudarajan also described how she was ostracized by her community and how she was banned from ever competing again. She expressed her concern that chromosomal testing is biased and unethical. This article refers to sub topics of Gender and Cheating and Science.

Article seven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 12th September 2009

Headline: "World Must Ease Her Pain"

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Page 14 (Letters to the Editor)

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The letter describes Semenya's life after she returned home to many gifts, a magazine makeover and a newfound fame. The letter then describes the reality that in that time the IAAF was still undertaking its tests and that someone had leaked news of Semenya being intersex to the media. The letter expresses concerns that Semenya will be devastated and has not been prepared for this and that what needs to be done is for the world to "somehow undo the damage we have wrought on this young woman". Key sub topics in this article refer to Gender and Bias and Science.

Article eight

i. Biographical Details

Date: 19th September 2009

Headline: "Intersexuality Quite Common"

Byline: "South Africa Has More Cases Than Anywhere Else, Experts Say"

Author: Candice Bailey

Appears in: Page 8

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article explores notions of intersexuality and quotes experts that say that intersexuality is more rife in South Africa than anywhere in the world. The article then describes the Semenya saga and then discusses the opinions of a pediatric endocrinologist on what true hermaphrodism is. The article discusses the science behind hermaphrodism and Androgen Insensitive Syndrome and offers statistics on the amount of people that are intersex in North America and South Africa. The article then discusses cases of hermaphrodism and the science behind that. The key sub topics of discourse in this article are Gender and Science.

Article nine

i. Biographical Details

Date: 19th September 2009

Headline: “Humiliating an Innocent is Not a Media Right”

Author: Dario Milo and Greg Palmer

Appears in: Page 1

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses the outcry over the Australian newspaper report of Semenya being a hermaphrodite. It describes the report as sensationalist and that a Zapiro article depicting the Australian newspaper editor as having no heart. The article then goes on to question the ethics of the media in leaking the results and questions if South African law would’ve allowed for that to happen if a South African newspaper had broken the story. The article then goes on to cite various cases in the past in which an infringement of privacy was not allowed in the media and finally ends with the conclusion that “a person’s dignity and privacy should not be trampled upon without a significant amount of public interest overriding such a disclosure”. Therefore, Semenya’s case was certainly not applicable. The key sub topics in this article are Gender and Bias.

STAR

The Star is an Independent Newspapers subsidiary and is published and printed in Johannesburg. While it is Johannesburg-based, it is distributed country-wide and, while it was at one stage “aimed exclusively at the white market, today over 50% of the *Star*'s readers are black” (South Africa. Info, 2010). This English medium newspaper has a circulation of 156 900 and a readership of 1 081 000 (South Africa. Info, 2010).

Article one

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21 August, 2009

Headline: “Caster may suffer rare condition, says expert”

Author: Sourced from the Daily Mail (London)

Appears in: Main Section, Page 5.

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article is a short report, which begins with an introduction to the history of gender testing. It briefly discusses the science behind gender testing and then goes on to talk about previous athletes who have failed the gender tests. The article ends with a few brief comments about the public responses from South Africans and some quotes of people expressing their anger at the gender testing. Key sub-topics that pertain to the dominant discourses of race and gender, and that appear in the article are gender and science, gender and cheating in sport and race and bias.

Article two

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21 August, 2009

Headline: "Making our nation proud"

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Main Section, Page 16.

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article is a also short report, which follows a trajectory starting with a description of the responses of fellow athletes after Semenya won the 800 meter race. The comments that are made by these athletes are labeled "bitchy" and are quoted in the article. The article then goes on to describe Semenya's reaction to the controversy is discussed and the article ends with various reasons for Semenya's victory, none of which discuss her gender row. Key sub-topics that pertain to the dominant discourses of race and gender, and that appear in the article are gender and cheating in sport and race and bias.

Article three

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21 August, 2009

Headline: "Semenya's lifelong battle"

Byline: "Champ's gender 'inspected' regularly at school events"

Author: Lebogang Seale, Louise Flanagan and Agencies

Appears in: Main Section, Page 1.

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This is a front page article is a report which describes the Semenya saga with an introduction to the emergence of reports that Semenya has been inspected to verify her gender many times in her athletic career. It discusses Semenya's performance in previous races and then relates that the IAAF asked for gender tests to be conducted and the ASA has denied that they have been asked to test the gender. Quotes from Leonard Chuene, the president of the ASA, followed by quotes of medical experts on the implications of gender testing, are given. Her former school principal is also interviewed and quoted. This reveals that speculation around Semenya's gender has existed since she partook in school athletic events. Her mother is quoted at the end of the article. Key sub-topics that pertain to the dominant discourses of race and gender, and that appear in the article are gender and science, gender and cheating in sport, gender testing and psychological effects and race and bias.

Article four

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21 August, 2009

Headline: "Athletics body slated for 'racism of highest order"

Author: Sourced from Sapa.

Appears in: Main Section, Page 5.

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This is article appears on page five and discusses how South African organizations are responding to the gender debacle. It discusses how major unions and political groups are accusing the IAAF of racism. Key spokespeople from the various unions are quoted in the article. Sub-topics that pertain to the dominant discourses of race and gender, and that appear in the article are mostly gender, race and bias.

Article five

i. Biographical Details

Date: 31 August, 2009

Headline: "Politicians Steal Mentor's Limelight"

Byline: "Coach was not even invited to Semenya's welcome home party"

Author: Lebogang Seale

Appears in: Main Section, Page 6.

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses Semenya's homecoming celebrations in South Africa. It discusses her progress under the wing of her coach, Ezekial Ramaotswa , and speaks of how Key sub-topics that pertain to the dominant discourses of race and gender, and that appear in the article are gender and science, gender and cheating in sport, gender testing and psychological effects and race and bias.

Article six

i. Biographical Details

Date: 11 September 2009

Headline: "Outrage at Caster Tests"

Byline: 'It is Clear She is a Woman, But Maybe not 100%'

Author: Shaun Smillie, Karyn Maughn and Lebogang Seale

Appears in: Page 1

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This is a Page one spread of three different articles that refer to the Semenya saga. The first article, is under observation and reveals the Australian newspaper leak of the gender test results. The article begins with a description of the ASA's response and is then followed by a description of Semenya's mother's reaction to the news. The IAAF, according to the article, affirmed that it would only reveal official results a month later and that the results might not become public because of privacy laws. The article then discusses Leonard Chuene's responses to the results and he revealed that Semenya was receiving help from a psychologist to deal with the publicness of the saga. Semenya former coach is quoted as saying he was "even sadder than the day when [he]… had to withdraw from the sport". The article ends with an expert denying that Semenya could lose her medal. The article refers to sub topics that include Gender and Bias, Science and Gender and Race.

Article seven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 14 September 2009

Headline: "We Support Caster"

Author: Various letters

Appears in: Page 7

Genre: Messages of Support

ii. Specific Aspects

This spread is made up of various messages sent by the public in support of Caster Semenya. The messages all refer to the pride she has instilled in the nation and the key sub topics are Race and Gender and Bias.

Article eight

i. Biographical Details

Date: 15th September 2009

Headline: “SA Athletics Bosses to Tackle IAAF on Caster”

Byline: “World Body Accused of Breaching its Own Rules on Confidentiality”

Author: Karyn Maughan

Appears in: Page 3

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses the ASA’s decision to launch a complaint against the IAAF for the poor handling of the Semenya saga. The reasoning behind the complaint is that the IAAF breached their own rules when they asked for Semenya to be tested without a formal complaint being lodged. The ASA further reiterated its concerns that Semenya and her family’s privacy be respected while she is writing her exams and that the media refrain from contacting her. Key sub topics in this article are Gender and Bias and Cheating in Sport.

Article nine

i. Biographical Details

Date: 25th September 2009

Headline: “Where Were Our Women in the Caster Saga?”

Author: Cheryl Roberts

Appears in: Page 15 (Letters to the Editor)

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

This letter questions the lack of a body that speaks for women in sport. The writer expresses her disappointment that there is a lack of a “women in sport” or “gender equity in sport” body that would’ve been able to assist in the Semenya saga. The writer expresses her surprise that there

have been gender verification tests undertaken in South African sports often and that the lack of an official body to advance women's issues in sports is a large reason for the lack of advancement in gender issues. The writer further reiterates that women in sport have largely been so competitive and interested in their own advancement that they have failed to consider giving back to the system that they received from. The writer blames this on opportunistic behavior and lack of interest in advancing women's issues. The letter then urges women to challenge those in power so that "never again is another girl or woman athlete subjected to such an injustice". The key sub topics of this article are Gender and Bias in Sport.

Sunday Times

The *Sunday Times* can be noted as the largest selling Sunday newspaper in South Africa. It is "distributed all over South Africa and in neighbouring countries such as Lesotho, Botswana and Swaziland" (South Africa. Info, 2010). It has a circulation of 504 400 and has 3 896 000 readers (South Africa. Info, 2009).

Article one

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30th August 2009

Headline: "Castigated and Celebrated"

Byline: 'Had the Acceptance by South Africans of Athlete Caster Semenya's Difference Been Extended to Murdered Footballer Eudy Simelane She May Still Have Been Alive Today.'

Author: Mark Gevisser

Appears in: Page 13

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses two separate incidents; the first is that of the late soccer player Eudy Simelane and the second refers to Caster Semenya. The writer explores their similarities in that they both have masculine builds, they both have challenged stereotypes of gender and they both

dedicated themselves to their respective sports. However, Eudy Simelane was killed for demonstrating these traits while Semenya is applauded and celebrated for the same reason. The writer demonstrates how Simelane was murdered for being a lesbian woman and that she is one of many others who have suffered the same fate. Furthermore she questions why and how the South African public can be so patriotically supportive of Semenya. She suggests that perhaps the answer lies in our "Bartman Complex" where we are anxious that we "will gain notoriety for our alleged abnormality rather than celebrity for our excellence". She suggests that an upside to our anger about the Semenya saga is that the move towards a more gender- aware society that is moving away from African patriarchy and gender roles. The article also considers comments made by Leonard Chuene and Jacob Zuma and questions how in a macho culture like ours, do we negotiate issues of gender, dignity and choice. the key sub topics of the article are Race and Gender Bias.

Article two

i. Biographical Details

Date: 30th August 2009

Headline: "Hero Caster's Road to Gold"

Byline: 'But Aunt Tells of Humiliation on Eve of Big Race'

Author: Chandre Prince

Appears in: Page 5

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article describes Semenya's return to her hometown and then describes the hurt and anger she felt the night before her run that there were questions around her gender. The article interviews Semenya's aunt who relates a story of how a white person told her she was not a woman and she should pull down her pants to prove she is a woman. She has lived with her aunt since Grade 3 and her aunt mentions her obsession with running and the article then mentions the

various accolades she received. The author also interviews various local community members and teammates. Finally, the article discusses how she was never questioned in South Africa and that she always wore pants except for Sundays when she wears the Zionist church suit. Key sub topics in this article are Gender and Bias and Race and Bias.

Article three

i. Biographical Details

Date: 13th September 2009

Headline: "Leave the Poor Woman Alone"

Byline: 'Public Must Respect Semenya's Expression of Gender'

Author: Karen Van Rooyen and Buyekezwa Makwabe

Appears in: Page 3

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses the prevalence of intersex individuals in South Africa and interviews experts on attributes of intersex individuals and the effects of intersexuality. The furthermore, the article discusses the case of Sally Gross, head of Intersex South Africa and how she discovered her intersexuality and how she was treated after the discovery. The article ends with an opinion of Juan Nel, a professor specializing in sex and gender issues, that Semenya seems as if she would "embrace her condition".

Article four

i. Biographical Details

Date: 13th September 2009

Headline: "They've Made Caster a Freak"

Author: Werner Swart and Judy Lelliott

Appears in: Page 1

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article begins with quotes of Semenya's mother regaling how Semenya has been humiliated and then speaks of how she has been made into a "freak and a circus sideshow". The article then goes on to explore the reaction to the leaks of gender verification test results as well as information on the law firm that will undertake an investigation into the matter. The article also describes information about an alleged sex verification test undertaken in South Africa before Semenya left for Berlin. The article also informs that Semenya is being cared for at the Pretoria University, where psychologists are available to her. The key sub topics in this article refer to Gender and Cheating In Sport and Science.

Article five

i. Biographical Details

Date: 20th September 2009

Headline: "Too Late Not to Do Harm"

Byline: 'The Leaking to the Press of Caster Semenya's Tests Raises a Plethora of Ethical Concerns"

Author: Pat Sidely

Appears in: Page 13

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

The article begins with a discussion on medical ethics and the obligations of the Hippocratic Oath. The author also discusses how the doctors in the Semenya saga could be investigated for unethical behavior and even sued. The article then infers that the full story may never come out

as there may be fraud and deception involved. The author suggests that suing those involved would enable Semenya to restore her dignity. The author then goes on to describe issues of consent and age and considers that if Semenya was not properly informed of the tests then it would be a breach of ethics on the part of the doctor. The article then describes the legal issues around the situation and the ethical concerns of the press leaking information about Semenya as well. The article ends with a declaration that if Semenya was not given enough information of the tests then a breach of ethics has occurred and action needs to be taken. Key Sub topics on the discourse that arise are Gender and Science.

Article six

i. Biographical Details

Date: 20th September 2009

Headline: "Indian Athlete Experienced Hell Too"

Author: SAPA

Appears in: Page 5

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article describes the experience of Santhi Soudarajan, who also had to undertake gender tests and was consequently stripped of her medal because the tests found that she was an intersex individual. She attempted suicide after that and has now come out in support of Semenya and has expressed her hope that Semenya does not go through what she went through. The article ends with a discussion on how Soudarajan has barely survived after losing her titled and struggled to find a job and make money. The key sub topics of this article are Gender and Cheating in Sport.

b) Detailed Analysis of Newspapers

City Press

Article Title: "Golden Girl's 'Weirdness' is Perfectly Normal"

This article was selected as it includes aspects most of the major sub-topics that have been identified as pertaining to representations of gender and race in the case of Caster Semenya. It is typical because it directly addresses issues of gender and race and also speaks of the scientific complexities of sex-verification tests. It is a co-authored opinion piece, written by Dave Zerin and Sherry Wolf. Zerin is a well-known sports editor for *The Nation* magazine and Wolf is an author and academic in the field of sexuality and is also an independent journalist. They are both respected figures in the fraternity. The article was published soon after gender test results pertaining to Semenya were leaked to the media, nine days after the story was leaked. It comes at a time when the saga is at its most climatic point and when there is much talk about Semenya and her gender. The article appears to be an opinion piece and is a fairly long article, which suggests that it was given prominence in the newspaper.

The article is structured by first discussing the event of the leaks of the gender test results, followed by a discussion of the science behind hermaphrodism. The complexities of the outcomes of such testing is also discussed and explored. Then, the article looks at the practices of the press in reporting the incident as well as the ignorance of the press in understanding the fluidity of gender and for transcribing to Western ideals of femininity. The article also mentions other athletes that have defining features that may give them an unfair advantage in the games but are not required to undergo any forms of testing. Furthermore, the article suggests that her gender is what has rendered her a 'freak' as male athletes with exceptional power are not treated in the same manner as Semenya was. The article doesn't include and sub-headings or graphs to demonstrate the argument. The article therefore touches upon topics of race, gender, and science. The race and gender topics are often overlapped and the scientific evidence of the article serves to enhance the argument.

The article follows the trajectory of the story of the leaks of Semenya's gender results and then points out the various implications of the leaks on Semenya, and other women athletes too. The article makes use of an adversarial argumentation approach to appeal to the logic and sentiments of readers to prove the point of the writers and uses a lot of emotive language and questions to appeal to the readers' conscience. The authors also use the logic of science and past occurrences of gender testing to compose their argument and to prove that arguments for gender testing are inconsistent and illogical. The article warns of serious implications of cases of gender testing, which could result in women being further relegated to the "Dark Ages" of sport and also alludes to the serious implications it could have for Semenya herself, in terms of her mental health and social relations.

The article uses words such as "cruel" and "pitiless" to describe the treatment of Semenya. The use of the word "we" calls for a collective action by the authors and readers and the article tells the reader that "we should be enraged" and "we should stand in solidarity with Caster Semenya". This vocabulary and style of the article attempts to mobilize the reader into action against the injustices carried out by the media. The style of writing is deeply emotive and uses phrases such as "We can't let them" to create an "us" versus "them" dichotomy. Sayings such as "Elephant Man of Sports" and "sideshow freaks" suggest that Semenya is being represented like a freak and that there must be a stop to the injustice meted upon her. Semenya is the main actor in this article but she never quoted and is sometimes referred to as a "young woman" suggesting she may need to be looked after as she is still young. Others in the article that are quoted are journalists, doctors and other professionals. References are made to agenda-setting newspapers and how they represented Semenya and also to science and scientific proof about possible conditions Semenya may have.

The article largely assumes that people who read the article are immediately aware of who Semenya is and the context surrounding the article. The authors also appeal to the emotions of readers to help this "young woman" in need. Furthermore, issues of gender binaries and what lies in between are discussed in the article to inform readers on the phenomenon of hermaphrodism and challenges gender stereotypes that portray women as weak and embodying certain attributes

of femininity that are based on Western ideals. The most prominent message of the article is that gender is not a fixed, biological category and that the testing of Semenya raises many issues about gender and race, cheating in sport and what is considered "normal" in sport. The attempt is to challenge the decision of the media to portray Semenya's plight in the manner they did.

The Citizen

Article Title: "Caster 'has no womb or ovaries'"

This article appears on the 11th September 2009, the day the results of Semenya's gender tests were leaked to the Australian newspaper. The article is typical as it reports on the gender debacle surrounding Semenya and refers to her test results and the response thereafter. The author is unknown and it is a report sourced from AFP. This is the Associated Free Press, which is a global news agency and covers African stories from its head office in Paris. It is a well-known news service and covers major news stories all over the world. The article was released on the day of the test result leak and was therefore published immediately. The article appears in the main section of the newspaper, on page 3.

The report is a small article, with a "snip" of a quote from the IAAF on the consequences of the results of Semenya's test. The snip is used to draw attention to the reader to read the rest ot the article. The sub-heading reads: "RESULTS: Source says IAAF can disqualify her in future; warns her on 'grave health risk'". The article begins with a description of the Australian news media report which leaked the news, followed by a discussion of the IAAF's response to allegations. The article is mainly concerned with the facts of the report and offers factual information on the leaking of the test results. The article mentions the relation of the saga to race and gender, but briefly.

The article follows a logical, sequential format of reporting and is comprised of facts backed with quotes from sources. The article uses words that portray the Australian newspaper's leaked story as a fact and fails to question the validity of the leaked story. The article uses quotes from

IAAF officials that support the allegations. Thus, the article alludes to the fact that the news story is definitely true. The use of the "snip" that has a quote from the IAAF further emphasizes the validity of the story. The vocabulary of the article is largely factual and doesn't offer many emotive statements. Semenya is mentioned in the article but not quoted. The Australian newspaper, *The Telegraph*, is quoted often, as is IAAF official, Pierre Weiss. The article references only official sources as it is a factual article.

The article presupposes that the reader knows who Semenya is and that the reader is familiar with the gender debacle. Furthermore, the choice of the authors to include *The Telegraph* as a reliable source emphasizes that the authors place value on this international source over others. The article discusses the implications of the leaked test results, specifically emphasising that Semenya may be banned from competing in international athletics and that he condition may prove a risk to Semenya's health. At the end of the article, the authors mention that the Semenya saga had sparked outraged amongst major political and social groups in South Africa and that these groups labelled the accusations as "sexist and racist". The most prominent discourses that have been represented in this article are that of scientific justifications that serve to further advance questions about her gender. The article attempts to be a factual piece, merely reporting on a news event, but seems to contribute to exisiting discourses around Semenya.

Saturday Star

Article Title: "The New Saartjie: Angry SA Goes to War For Traumatised Teen"

This article was selected specifically because it draws parallels between Semenya and Sarah Baartman, which is a key trope of this research. The article is typical as it discusses issues around gender and race. The article is penned by a plethora of reporters, namely, Candice Bailey, Sameer Naik, Kashiefa Ajam, Carien Du Plessis and Lebogang Seale. These authors are recognised journalists in the investigative and sports sections. The article was published on August 22nd; soon after the IAAF requested gender tests be performed on Semenya. It was the leading story of the day and appeared on the front page of the newspaper.

Surface characteristics of the newspaper article are limited to the text only, as archival material does not provide accompanying pictures. The article does include a quoted piece of text that is highlighted for emphasis. It states:

"I want to see the scientists that can prove she is not a girl"

The heading, "The new Saartjie?" questions if Semenya has become a 21st century version of Sarah Baartmann and the sub-heading, "Angry SA goes to war over traumatised teen", suggests outrage on the part of South Africans for the manner in which Semenya was being treated. The article begins with a description of the responses from well-known Athletics chairperson, Leonard Chuene and parlimentarians such as Butana Komphela and Patricia De Lille. Then the article discusses the saga in a bit more detail and the authors then speak further of comments made by Cheuene and Semenya's mother, Dorcus. The topics of race, gender and science are touched upon in the article and these dominant discourse strands also emphasis the main idea of the article, that is, whether Semenya can be seen as a 21st century Baatmann.

The article takes on an adversarial argumentation approach, using many quotes from "angry" spokespeople and appealing on the emotions of the reader. Using words and phrases such as "truamatised teen", "child" and "insult to our country" appeals to the reader for an emotional response based on empathy and patriotism. The article, like many others, assumes the reader's familiarity with the story and logically assumes that all of South Africa has responded in the same way as the spokespeople they quote. The article discusses emotive implications of the saga on Semenya's studies, and expresses this through a quote from her mother voicing her fear that Semenya is "still a child". Key spokespeople are mentioned in the article and all are quoted for their opinions on the saga and their positions are mentioned in the article to emphasize their importance. References to science are limited to a discussion of what a gender test consists of in the current age and this information is relayed by an IAAF spokesperson.

The article assumes that all those who read the report will feel an empathetic reaction to Semenya's situation, as they portray her as a "young girl" and it also assumes that all South

Africans are outraged at the requests for a gender test. The article, therefore, generalizes the comments of the few South African leaders to connote the entire South African population. The article speaks of a "war of words" that is undergoing and then questions the impact of this war on Semenya herself. The article does not discuss the implications of the outcomes of the gender test. The article fails to address the science behind gender and intersexuality and gives the impression that only two, binary sexes are possible, male and female. The most prominent discourses that can be seen in this article are references to Sarah Baartmann, race and gender. The article mainly wishes to explore the reactions of South African's to calls for a gender test to be conducted on Semenya and also attempts to emphasize that the outrage was only because of her gender and race.

Star

Article Title: "Semenya's Lifelong Battle: Champs Gender 'Inspected' Regularly at School Events"

This article was selected specifically for its reference to gender and is published soon after the news of a possible gender test was released. The article is typical because it discusses gender in the Semenya saga in detail. The authors, Lebogang Seale and Louise Flanagan, are reporters at the newspaper and the story is also assisted by news from agencies. This is a notable point, as agencies are very likely to be internationally owned and not local. This could have implications on how the story is portrayed. This article appears on the front page of the newspaper and is the main story. No picture is available on the archival source.

The heading of the article, "Semenya's lifelong battle" suggests that Semenya has been battling with something for her entire life. The by-line, "Champ's Gender Inspected Regularly at School Events" clarifies that her gender is in question. The article begins with by describing what would have been Semenya's finest moment, being overshadowed by questions around her gender. The article then looks at Semenya's past athletics events, at school and also reveals that she was taken to the bathrooms for inspection to see if she really is a girl. Furthermore, the intricacies of

gender testing and the physical and psychological implications are also discussed. The article emphasizes questions around her gender. Gender is the most prominent discourse topic that the article discusses.

The article seems to be a report that discusses Semenya's struggle with proving her gender and also uses emotive quotes. The argumentation begins and ends with stories of incidences where Semenya's gender was questioned. Sandwiched in between these narratives are discussions of the ASA's role in the debacle and the science and psychological implications of the story on Sermenya. There are no references to race but the reference to incidences at athletics meets further emphasizes that Semenya does not embody what is seen as feminine characteristics at all. The article, without realizing it, creates further doubts in the minds of the readers of Semenya's gender. Intersexuality is not considered or discussed in the article either. No idioms, sayings and clichés are used. The vocabulary is more of a report style and does not offer any opinions of the authors. The main people mentioned in the article are Leonard Chuene, who is quoted emphasizing that the ASA was not made aware of questions around Semenya's gender, Professor Malcolm Collins, a sports scientist, who is quoted for discussing implications of gender tests, the principle from one of Semenya's former schools and Semenya's mother. The positions of authority of all these figures are emphasized, with the exception of Semenya's mother. The article touches on references of scientific details of the tests but mainly focuses on the stories of questions around her gender.

The article presupposes that the reason for Semenya's gender tests was solely because of her power, her muscular build and her gruff voice. It reflects a society where gender norms are attributed to males and females and assumes that a deviance from expressing these norms shows that 'something is wrong'. The article does describe implications in the future on Semenya's mental health and suggests that gender tests could have a bad effect on athletes that are subject to testing. It can be noted that the article fails to quote Semenya and that race is not mentioned at all in the article. The most prominent discourses around the article are that of gender and implications of gender testing.

Sunday Times

Article Title: "They've Made Caster a Freak"

This article was selected as it comes at a time when there was a lot of media speculation around the leaks of the results of Semenya's gender tests. It is typical for its discussion of race and gender and was also selected for the mention of the word "freak", which is closely linked to comparisons of Semenya to Baartman. The article is penned by Werner Swart and Judy Lelliott, staff reporters at the Sunday Times. It appears on page one and is a feature story.

The story begins with a quote from Semenya's mother and offers a brief discussion of the Semenya scandal. The heading "They've Made Caster a Freak" is a quote from one of the spokespeople interviewed in the story. The article starts by discussing the saga and then goes on to report that a law firm will be lodging a case against the IAAF for allowing gender test results to be leaked to the press. Then, issues around the IAAF and ASA's role in the debacle and the responses from the ASA are discussed followed, at the end, by a mention of the rainbow nation, which has "rallied behind" Semenya. Topics that are touched upon in the article pertain to gender and race and ethical questions around gender testing.

The article makes use of emotive language from the very beginning by quoting Semenya's mother, Dorcus, for her emotional response to the gender test results. The article also quotes an 'outraged' Lisa Vetten, who is an activist and researcher. The role of the ASA in the gender debacle is mentioned and reported on and the implications of the results of the gender test are also explored. The article does not contain any pictorial depictions that may be analysed and no idioms, sayings or clichés are used. The writing style is largely of a report and uses emotive quotes sometimes. The people quoted, apart from Semenya's mother and Vetten, are Leonard Chuene, Greg Nott, a managing partner at a law firm, Pierre Weiss, IAAF secretary-general and Michael Seme, Semenya's former coach. The article does not quote Semenya at all. References are made to law firms and sports bodies and there is no mention of the science behind gender testing.

The article does not clearly mention race as a defining factor in the Semenya saga but mentions another incident of accusations of racism in the ASA. This hints to the fact that the article supposes that the reader will draw their own parallels from other incidences of racism and apply these to issues of race in the Semenya saga. The future of Semenya's case is discussed in the article. The other aspects that may be noted about the article is a lack of quotes from Semenya herself and the article also mentions psychological effects of the gender tests and reveals that Semenya's university has provided psychological assistance for her. The most prominent discourse in this article is that of gender. The article wishes to convey the outrage that has been sparked by the Semenya saga and further discusses the facts around the situation.

c) Synoptic Analysis of the Newspapers

The synoptic analysis will consist of a discussion of all the newspapers together, as opposed to what has been done previously. The analysis will firstly, begin by a general discussion of information gathered from the biographical analysis. The information gathered from the detailed analysis of typical newspapers will then be analysed. Only one typical article per newspaper was selected. Finally, general conclusions about the total local print media responses will be drawn from a combination of the biographical and synoptic analyses.

The biographical analysis found that City Press was the most prominent in its reporting of the Semenya saga. The newspaper stories were most prominent in their reporting from the date 20 August 2009 to 20 September 2009, with very few articles falling on either side of that bracket. This indicates that the Semenya story was at the height of its notoriety at that time. The articles were mostly feature articles, appearing in the main sections of the newspapers, and many were page one articles. Some articles were letters to the editor and opinion pieces. In the local print media sources, few of these articles appeared in the "Sport" section of the newspaper. All the newspapers had articles that covered dominant discourses of race and gender, with other discourses such as cheating in sport and bias also covered. These discourses were covered in many different ways although, some of the articles found, that covered these discourses, were letters and opinion pieces. Also, it is important to note, of all the newspapers, *City Press* was the only newspaper that had interviews with Semenya.

Of the articles that undertook a detailed analysis, four of the articles analysed took an emotive approach to the reporting of the saga, with only one article offering only factual information. This indicates that many of the local reports were appealing to the emotions of the readers. A key drawback in the analysis of these articles is that the archival sources fail to include accompanying graphs and pictures in the articles. Many of the articles also presupposed that the reading public would be familiar with Caster Semenya and the gender debacle that surrounded her. Of the articles selected, only one article did not mention race, with four of the five articles

mentioning race in some way or the other. The articles also prominently quoted Leonard Chuene and Peirre Weiss, chairman and secretary-general of the ASA and IAAF, respectively. These key figures seem to be the prominent voices in the saga, along with a range of other professionals, ranging from activists to sports scientists and psychologists.

The biographical and detailed analyses both found the dominant discourses in the reporting of the Caster Semenya saga to be limited to gender and race. These discourses were carried throughout all the articles in one way or another. Each newspaper had Semenya stories printed on their headlines and in other prominent places. The prominence of the articles in the time frame selected and the amount of coverage that Semenya received indicates that the saga was well-known. The lack of agency attributed to Semenya in most of these articles is also notable and this indicates that other voices were favored over Semenya's. Specific favor was given to those in dominant positions at the ASA and IAAF and also to professionals in the fields of science and medicine. Discourse strands that varied in their coverage were not found.

CHAPTER SEVEN

International Print Media Responses to the Caster Semenya Saga

Introduction to International Print Media Responses to the Caster Semenya Saga

This section will undertake the analysis of the international newspaper reports of the Caster Semenya saga. The analysis will be conducted for each newspaper. The analysis begins with the structural analysis of articles found in each newspaper. A selection of one report, in each newspaper, which demonstrates typical characteristics of the discourses identified will then be subject to detailed analysis. A synoptic analysis will then combine the findings of the structural and detailed analyses for each newspaper. Finally, conclusions will be made about the total International print media responses through a discussion of the commonalities and differences between the individual newspapers. The newspaper reports are listed chronologically in order to get a sense of the context of the articles. To access the articles see *Appendix B.*

a) Structural Analysis of International Newspapers

Daily Mail

The Daily Mail is a London newspaper and is also the "second largest newspaper in Great Britain" (MondoTimes, 2010a). It has a circulation figure of 2 311 000 people and is classified as one of the largest newspapers in the world (MondoTimes, 2010). It can be deduced then, that the Daily Mail is a very influential newspaper in setting the agenda for the circulation of cultural ideas and representations. The representation of Caster Semenya in this newspaper will now be explored.

Article one

iii. Biographical Details

Date: 20th August 2009

Headline: "Boy, That's Some Win"

Byline: ‘Golden Girl to Face Sex Test’

Author: Neil, W.

Appears in: Sport Section

Genre: Report

iv. Specific Aspects

The article describes how Semenya will stand alongside Britain’s Jenny Meadows as the gold medallist in the Berlin Games. It then goes on to explicate an incident at a petrol station in Johannesburg and how Semenya was refused access to a ladies toilet as petrol attendants thought that she was a man. The article then goes on to describe how Semenya has been asked to undergo a gender verification test and what various aspects that entails. This article mentions that Semenya has had to go through this “tragic situation” as a result of the failure of the ASA to investigate rumours that Semenya may be a man. The article speaks to an exercise psychologist on the intricacies of gender testing. The article then goes on to describe her timing and compares it to that of other athletes. Furthermore, the article ends with a discussion of the implications on Semenya’s medal if she is found to not be a biological woman. Major discourse sub-topics in this article are that of gender and cheating in sport.

Article two

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21st August 2009

Headline: “Semenya Mother Sure”

Author: Alan, M.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses an interview with Semenya's mother. It mentions that Semenya's mother is sure that she is a female and she is not concerned over an official investigation that was launched to test Semenya's gender. The article reviews Semenya's performance in the races and then continues with the interview with Semenya's mother. Dorcus Semenya is quoted as saying; "Mokgadi is a girl" and that all those in Semenya's village will attest to teh fact that she is a female. The article ends with a description of Semenya being escorted off the field by IAAF officials. Major discourse sub-topics in this article are that of gender.

Article three

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21st August 2009

Headline: "We've Been Here Before With Stella The High Speed Fella"

Author: Guy, W.

Appears in: News

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article begins with a description of Semenya's win and then goes on to describe an occurrence at the 1936 Olympic Games. The article discusses various incidences where males were posing as female athletes and got caught out. Semenya is only mentioned once in the article. The article discusses German athletes who had competed in athletics events and who were eventually found to be men. Gender and cheating in sport are the major discourse sub-topics of this article.

Article four

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21st August 2009

Headline: “Woman, Man... Or a Little Bit of Both?”

Author: Michael, H.

Appears in: News

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article begins with a discussion of Semenya’s family’s and friends’ reaction to the gender debacle, with all of them confirming that Semenya is a female. The article then explains that the IAAF governing body has requested that Semenya undergo a gender verification test to confirm her sex. The article discusses South African ruling party responses to the allegations and then moves on to quote Semenya’s best friend on the allegations. The author then takes a look at the complexities of a gender verification test, confirming that it is more than just examining the person’s genitals. The article discusses the science behind chromosomes and how some men come to be hyper-feminine and some women tend to be masculine. He thus, goes on to describe the concept of intersexuality. The implications of gender testing are presented, followed by an example of Santhi Soundarajan, another female athlete who had to undergo sex tests as well. The article ends with the authors expressed hope that the IAAF will recognise that “something in between” male and female should also be considered. The key sub-topic that appears in this article is based on gender.

Article five

i. Biographical Details

Date: 22nd August 2009

Headline: “Is There More to This Than Sex?”

Author: Des, K.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article begins by asking the question: "How do you establish the dividing line between a man and a woman?" and then suggested that this is a common debate since Caster Semenya won the gold medal in Berlin. The author then presents a multiple choice question where he offers three choices. He suggests that if Semenya were to choose the last choice then it would be clear that she is not female. After this little piece of humour, the essayist goes on to describe ideas around perceptions of femininity and how many women in sport have been accused of cheating for displaying hyper-masculine attributes. The author then compared Britain's Jenny Meadows to Semenya and described Meadows as busy adjusting her pink sunglasses while Semenya "rubbed her beard, and looked as if she was trying to resist the temptation to adjust the boys in their barracks in her long, lycra shorts". The article then discusses the decision by the IAAF to undertake gender verification tests on Semenya and further discusses an interview with Semenya where she reveals that she takes a three month break from athletics every year. The author questions why she would require such a long break. Furthermore, the article explicates an incident that occurred on air after the race, where a commentator mistakenly commented: "He deserved it!" instead of she deserved it. The article ends questioning whether Semenya is deserving of the medal or not. Key sub-topics in this article are gender and cheating in sport.

Article six

i. Biographical Details

Date: 24th August 2009

Headline: "Faster by 16.5 Secs? Knickers to That!"

Author: Martin, S.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article begins by explaining the reaction to Semenya's win as a two-sided issue with "one side quick to condemn in the most spiteful terms with no evidence, the other cheerfully naive and protective when clearly questions need to be answered". The author then suggests that what is questionable is Semenya's rapid improvement in time. According to the article, Semenya performed 'dismally' in 2008, ranking 36th out of 44 competitors and then, 11 months later, her time improved drastically. The article then suggests that the IAAF investigates her time improvement more than her "knickers". The key sub-topics discussed in this article pertain to gender and cheating in sport.

Article seven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 24th August 2009

Headline: "Officials are Jumping the Gun in Probe on Semenya"

Author: Sheila Farrell

Appears in: Letters

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The letter expresses the author's "disgrace" at the manner in which the IAAF had been handling the Semenya saga. The letter addresses the gender debacle and suggests that, had there been any question about her gender, it would've been proven years ago. The author comments on the lack of discretion on the part of the IAAF and then she comments on the discriminatory manner in which the media treated Semenya by suggesting that they implied much more by using phrases like Semenya used to "wrestle her dolls" and has a "very close female friend". The final paragraph reveals that Semenya has a pink bedroom and that this will "come as a relief to the athletic bigots". The article refers to key sub-topics of gender.

Article eight

i. Biographical Details

Date: 26th August 2009

Headline: "We Have Every Right to Bang on About Sex"

Author: Martin, S.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

This article is an opinion piece which begins with a description of Semenya and her performance in the games. The author then goes on to reveal that the South African team has employed a Dr. Ekkart Arbeit, who was previously known for being involved in major drug scandals that gave female athletes male characteristics. The article expresses that there is no logic in Semenya's improvement of her timing and that this should mean that the media have the right to question what the truth is. Furthermore, the article compares Semenya with runner Usain Bolt and suggests that Bolt has shown consistency in his performance whereas Semenya was not consistent in her performance. The article further suggests that allegations by Butana Khompela, a member of South African parliament, of racism and sexism were unfounded and questions:

> "It is the one field where black folk just can't catch a break, isn't it, athletics? That and dance music"

The response to allegations of sexism went as follows:

> "As for sexism, why would an investigation designed to ensure female athletes are not being forced into competition against an abnormally masculine rival be misogynistic?"

The article ends with a comment that the IAAF was not the only body harbouring suspicions but that fellow competitors and observers all could see her vast improvement in time. The author suggests that the athletics fraternity "cannot afford to dismiss the questions over Semenya or hide the process". This article refers to sub-topics of gender and race.

Article nine

i. Biographical Details

Date: 28th August 2009

Headline: "Pulling a Fast One?"

Author: Arran Dowling Hurrey

Appears in: Letters

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

This letter is in response to a letter by Sheila Farrell (see article seven). The author discusses Semenya's time and then goes on to suggest that previous winning times this good have been set by women who have been known to come from countries where there were "widely believed to have run drug programmes for their athletes". The article ends with a comment that suggests that Semenya's time would be good for a man of her age but is highly unlikely for a woman. The key sub-topic in this article is that of gender.

Article ten

i. Biographical Details

Date: 09th September 2009

Headline: "Looking all Woman, Caster the Cover Girl"

Author: Ian, E

Appears in: News

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses the YOU Magazine makeover that Semenya had undergone in September. The article begins with a description of the cover of the magazine and then picks out various quotes from the magazine of Semenya expressing her wish to wear dresses more often and her

declaration that she accepts herself for who she is. The article ends with a statement that Semenya was offered an invitation to be a star guest on Oprah Winfrey. A key sub-topic in this article is that of gender.

Article eleven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 09th September 2009

Headline: "Semenya to Keep Medal Whatever Sex Test Reveals"

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This is a small sports report which reports that Semenya will be allowed to keep her medal no matter what the gender tests results reveal. This article then offers a brief description of her win against rivals in Berlin and Mauritius. The key sub-topic expressed in this article is that of gender.

Article twelve

i. Biographical Details

Date: 09th September 2009

Headline: "Semenya Set to Keep Her Medal"

Author: Tom, O.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This is also a small report about Semenya being allowed to keep her gold medal. The report suggests that it would be legally difficult for the IAAF to ask for the medal to be returned. The article then discusses a brief history of Semenya's running and then moves on to other sports news. The key discourse sub-topic in this article is that of gender.

Article thirteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 12th September 2009

Headline: "'Third World War' Threat Over Gender Row Runner"

Author: Unknown

Appears in: News

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article was published a day after leaks that Semenya has no womb and has both male and female sexual organs. The article discusses South African politicians' response to the allegations. The author reports that politicians argued that the IAAF was "disgusting" in their treatment of Semenya and that South African officials were considering assisting Semenya in suing the IAAF for allowing the test results to be leaked. The key discourse sub-topic in this article is gender.

Article fourteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 12th September 2009

Headline: "South Africa: 'It's War on Athlete"

Author: Stewart, M.

Appears in: News

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article is a report on South African politicians' response to the IAAF leaked gender test results. The article quotes responses from the sports minister of South Africa, declaring that, should Semenya be banned from competing, the country would wage a third world war on the IAAF. She further emphasized that science has not proven competitive advantage in hermaphrodites. Another prominent political figure, Winnie Madikizela Mandela, is also quoted in this article for her response to the allegations. The key sub-topic referred to in this article is gender.

Article fifteen

i. Biographical Details

Date: 14th September 2009

Headline: "And While We're At It"

Author: Martin, S.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

This article begins with a report of the latest developments in the Semenya saga, with media reports showing that Semenya is an intersex individual. The article reports on the South African sports minister's response to allegations of Semenya being a hermaphrodite and then goes on to describe that their forty-six different types of intersex. The article then suggests that Semenya needs to be supported in this time as she may need professional help. The article then goes on to describe the South African governments' response to the saga as "craven" and calls on the IAAF to provide the best medical treatment for Semenya. This article refers to the sub-topic of gender.

Sydney Morning Herald

The Sydney Morning Herald is a subsidiary of the Fairfax Media Limited and is a daily newspaper (MondoTimes, 2010b). The newspaper has a readership of 738 000 and is a market leader in the Sydney newspaper industry (Fairfax Media, 2010). The representation of Caster Semenya in this newspaper will now be explored.

Article one

i. Biographical Details

Date: 19th August 2009

Headline: "Gender Bender on the Outer"

Author: Dan Silkstone

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article looks at the possibility that Semenya could be ruled out of the Berlin games. This article comes a day before the final race at Berlin's Olympic stadium. The article then goes on to explain that allegations have been launched that question whether she is a female or a male. The article then considers previous instances of gender testing and offers a brief introduction to the rules of the IAAF. The article reveals that some tests have been conducted on Semenya prior to the last race. The article then speaks of Stella Walsh, another athlete who was found to have male and female organs at the time of her death. The key sub-topic that the article refers to is gender.

Article two

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21st August 2009

Headline: “It’s Complicated: Gender Issue Treated With Care by IAAF”

Author: Jessica Halloran

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article begins with a description of the incident at the petrol station where Semenya was refused access to the ladies bathroom because attendants thought she was a man. The article then goes on to reveal that now many more people are questioning her gender. Furthermore, the editorial goes on describe a little bit about her history and her favourite television show, favourite music and what she is studying. The article discusses the various tests that need to be conducted to obtain clarification on her gender. The sensitivity of the gender issue is emphasized with a discussion of the case of another athlete, Santhi Sounderajan. She attempted suicide after it was revealed that she had failed a gender verification test. The tests that Semenya has had to undergo will be remain private, according to this report. The key discourse sub-topic in this article refers to gender.

Article three

i. Biographical Details

Date: 22nd August 2009

Headline: ‘Man, She Seems Like a Woman”

Author: Richard, H.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

The author begins by explaining that the athletics championships are an interesting occurrence for him that year as it was eventful, on and off the track. The article then discusses the “gender

bender" story of Semenya and discusses the spectator value that Semenya may present for people who are interested to see if Semenya "has Mike Tyson's biceps and Merv Hughes's moustache". The article then moves on to other stories from the Berlin games. The key sub-topic in this article is that of gender.

Article four

i. Biographical Details

Date: 27th August 2009

Headline: "Storms of Protest in Rainbow Nation"

Author: Jaqueline Magnay and Jessica Halloran

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article begins by reporting that South Africans have responded to calls for gender testing in the Semenya saga through allegations of "racism and treachery" as well as some "Aussie bashing". The article discusses how South Africans have accused Australian press of racism for first reporting that Semenya was to undergo a gender test. The authors discuss the reports that Leonard Chuene has said that the issues of Semenya's gender were not raised by Australian media but rather by the South African media. The article also looks at the reception Semenya received on her return home and the comments that were made by president Jacob Zuma and Winnie Madikizela Mandela. Furthermore, a spoof that was created by a South African radio station is discussed along with post on a Facebook page that was created in support of Semenya. The article then discusses the response by the South African Football Players Union, who responded that the gender debacle by saying that imperialist countries would not accept the advancement of African talent. The article then speaks a little about the village in which Semenya was raised and talks of how she ended up in athletics. The article then quotes a women's health specialist that suggests that Semenya might be a female with biological

variations that would not stop her from competing. The article ends by mentioning the Santhi Sounderajan case, where the Indian athlete was stripped off of her title. Key discourses in this article are race and gender.

Article five

i. Biographical Details

Date: 11th September 2009

Headline: "Secret of Semenya's Sex Stripped Bare."

Author: Jacquelin, M.

Appears in: News and Features

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The newspaper report discloses that Semenya's test results have revealed that she has both male and female sexual organs and that she has internal male testes which result in a large amount of testosterone being produced in Semenya's body. This article then discusses that the IAAF had tried to contact Semenya to inform her that the news had been leaked to the media. The report also discusses that Semenya may still be able to keep her gold medal as she was not found cheating, but merely a victim of a medical issue. The article then discusses the possibility of this medical issue allowing her an unfair advantage over others. The article then discusses South Africa's response to the saga and ends with a statement that the ASA president wasn't aware that the tests had been completed.

Article six

i. Biographical Details

Date: 12th September 2009

Headline: "Sensitivity Stripped Bare"

Author: Diana Leoroyd Artarmon

Appears in: News and Features

Genre: Letter

ii. Specific Aspects

The article is a letters that discusses the opinion of this reader. The writer of the letter expresses her concern that Semenya was not informed of the test results before it was leaked to the media and further emphasises the psychological implications of this leak on Semenya. Furthermore, the article questions, in the last section, whether Semenya would be treated the same way had she not come from an African country. The article specifically relates to sub-topics of gender and racism.

Article seven

i. Biographical Details

Date: 15th September 2009

Headline: "South Africa Fights For 'Humiliated' Semenya"

Author: Agencies

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article is a report which discusses that a top track official, Leonard Chuene, has accused the IAAF of allowing the humiliation of Caster Semenya. The article further discusses that the IAAF did not confirm or deny reports that were leaked to the media and had announced that they would reveal the results in November. The article also looks at responses in South Africa to the saga as well as discusses Chuene's role in ASA.

Article eight

i. Biographical Details

Date: 15th September 2009

Headline: "Don't Judge Women by Their Covers"

Author: Katrina Fox

Appears in: News and Features

Genre: Opinion Piece

ii. Specific Aspects

The article begins with a description of the freak shows of the nineteenth and twentieth century's, which had featured women such as the "bearded lady" and other women who exhibited masculine traits. The article then discusses Semenya as a "modern day curiosity" and the leaks of the results of her gender tests to the media. The article argues that Semenya is a woman suffering from indignity meted upon her for having an intersex condition. Semenya's makeover in YOU magazine is also questioned for reinforcing gender stereotypes and for lampooning her. The article then discusses various aspects of homophobia which had been manifested in other sports. The main argument is centralised around stereotypical gender roles that we are forced to act out in fear of not being stigmatised. The article ends questioning if Semenya needed a makeover to prove she is a woman. The key discourse sub-topic in this article is gender.

Article nine

i. Biographical Details

Date: 18th September 2009

Headline: "Semenya Forced Into Examination"

Author: Jacquelin M.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

This article discusses the examinations that Semenya had to endure during her gender tests in South Africa. It describes how Semenya's legs were put up in stirrups and pictures of her genetalia were taken. It also discusses how Semenya was unaware of the tests examining her gender and was told it was for doping purposes. The article ends with a statement that Semenya had stopped reading papers and listening to radio stations because of the gender debacle. The article refers to the sub-topic of gender.

Article ten

i. Biographical Details

Date: 21st September 2009

Headline: "Lying for Semenya: Athletics Boss Clambers for Moral High Ground"

Author: Jacquelin M.

Appears in: Sport

Genre: Report

ii. Specific Aspects

The article discusses the admission by ASA head, Leonard Chuene, that he had authorised that gender tests on Semenya be undertaken in South Africa two weeks before she went to Berlin. Yet he denied that the ASA allowed Semenya to run jus so that a medal could be won for the country. He is quoted as saying he denied involvement in the interests of Semenya and thought that his denials would protect her from allegations. The article further discusses Semenya's homecoming and Chuene's and Jacob Zuma's comments on her homecoming, and ends with calls from the deputy Sports Minister of South Africa for the expulsion of Chuene from the board of the ASA.

b) Detailed Analysis of Newspapers

Daily Mail

Article Selected: "We have every right to bang on about sex"

This article was selected as it reflects the typical characteristics of gender and race in the discussion of Semenya soon after tests for her gender were requested. The author, Martin Samuel, is a sports reporter for the daily news. He specializes in sports reporting. The article was printed a few days after Semenya's win at the Berlin athletics, at a time when there is great debate as to whether Semenya should've been allowed to run or not as well as whether she should undergo gender tests. The piece appears in the Sport section of the newspaper. It seems to be more of an opinion piece than a report.

The layout of the article begins with a brief discussion of Semenya's early test results, and follows by stating that the high testosterone levels, found in Semenya's results, catalysed calls for gender tests to be undertaken. There are no pictures or graphs that accompany this article, due to lack of archival access. The heading states "We have every right to bang on about sex", which can be translated to "We have every right to question Semenya's sex". The article is structured by first addressing what initial results found about Semenya's testosterone levels. The article then goes on to reveal that the South African athletics contingency had been working a Dr. Ekkart Arbeit, who was famously involved in a doping programme. The article then reveals the various effects of the drug that Arbeit was giving to the athletes and then states that there is enough evidence to show that Semenya had an impossible improvement of time and was working with Arbeit. The article then moves on to talk about Heidi Krieger, who was one of the athletes that had to change her sex after taking the doping medication and becoming too masculine, and discusses her campaign against doping. The author then says that athletes such as Usain Bolt have a rational explanation for their feats and then explains why Usain Bolt is so successful in his running. He then points out that Semenya's time is inconsistent compared to Bolt's. The article then moves on to discuss Semenya's return home and then goes on to discuss that racism and sexism do not come into play in this case. Furthermore, the article looks at the

need for transparency in athletics, just like in other sport. The article looks at race, gender and cheating in sport.

The article tries to offer a factual account of why Semenya should be tested but use of emotive words suggests the author's anger at the situation. The argumentation is based on tying together some facts, some of which are unconfirmed (like Arbeit's involvement with the South African team) and making conclusions from these facts that point towards cheating in athletics. The basic idea of the article is that Semenya is somehow involved in a doping scandal and that Arbeit is involved. The article then uses the technique of providing past occurrences which serve to emphasise the argument. The use of these examples, coupled with questions that refer to Semenya, implies that Semenya is in some way involved in doping. The article then uses common prejudices that black people do well in athletics and also adds to that, dance music. The author does this by using questions that seem condescending and refer to black people as "black folk".

The only actors that are mentioned in the article are Arbeit, Krieger, bolt and South African's Leonard Chuene and parliamentarian, Butana Komphela. The article quotes Krieger, Chuene and Komphela and almost always disagrees with their quotes and offers a rebuttal argument. References are made to past doping scandals and then an inference is made that Arbeit is involved with the South African team without any substantiating proof. The titles of all those the author has used as sources are provided and their involvement in or relationship to the saga is explicated.

The article assumes that if Semenya seems masculine and is working with Arbeit then she must be cheating. It does not consider that maybe Semenya has a genetic condition and that she vastly improved her time through practice. The article suggests that there should be more demands for transparency in this case and that the future of athletics depends on this. It can be noted that all aspects of this article serve to portray Semenya as somehow involved in a doping scandal. The article also downplays and criticizes the reaction of South African's in the saga and tries to

undermine comments made about racism and sexism being involved in the treatment of Semenya. The overall discourse of the article refers to cheating in athletics but the article also touches upon issues of gender and race.

Sydney Morning Herald

Article Selected: Storms of Protest in Rainbow Nation

This article was selected as it appears at a time when there is great debate around the gender testing of Semenya. It is typical because it refers to gender and race issues and also mentions the involvement of the Australian media in the breaking of news on the saga. The article is written by Australian journalists, Jacquelin Magnay and Jessica Halloran. It comes just short of ten days after Semenya won a gold medal in Berlin and appears in the Sport section.

The article begins with a discussion of the reaction of South Africans to the gender scandal and discusses how Semenya's treatment was reacted to with allegations of racism and sexism. The article then goes on to explicate that, according to ASA chairperson, Leonard Chuene, it was more the South African media that created questions around her gender. There are pictures that accompany the text, but these are not available in the archival material. The heading "Storms of protest in Rainbow Nation" plays on the ideas of storms being related to rainbows. After explicating Chuene's response, the article quotes many South African leaders and their responses to the saga. Consequently, the article explored media responses to the saga. The media reports have also revealed commonalities between Semenya and Sarah Baartmann, and the article addresses this before moving on to an explanation of Semenya's childhood and then discusses the implications of the gender tests. The key discourses that are covered in this article are race and gender.

The article is more factual than emotive and reports on the various responses to the saga in the media. The article assumes that the reader is aware of the gender debacle and attempts to explore how Australian and South African media have responded. It implies that the South African media covered the issue in various different ways and discussed race and gender issues in the media. The style is mainly factual, with little emotive responses by the authors. The actors that are mentioned are South African politicians, DJ's and members of Facebook and the South

African Football Players Union. A Professor of women's health is also quoted for her expertise. Semenya is not quoted.

The article presupposes that the readers are aware of tensions between South Africa and Australia in the sports arena and that it is a commonly held belief that there is a constant rivalry between the two countries. The article also mentions possibilities of the outcomes of the gender tests that may not be as serious as the media is making it out to be. Prominent discourses around the article are that of race and gender and media involvement in the Semenya saga.

c) ***Synoptic Analysis of the Newspapers***

The synoptic analysis will consist of a discussion of all the newspapers together, as opposed to what has been done previously. The analysis will firstly, begin by a general discussion of information gathered from the biographical analysis. The information gathered from the detailed analysis of typical newspapers will then be analysed. Only one typical article per newspaper was selected. Finally, general conclusions about the total international print media responses will be drawn from a combination of the biographical and synoptic analyses.

The biographical analysis found that Daily News was more prominent in its reporting of the Semenya saga that the Australian Sydney Morning Herald. The newspaper stories were most prominent in their reporting from the date 20 August 2009 to 20 September 2009, with one or two articles falling on either side of that bracket. This indicates that the Semenya story was at the height of its notoriety in the International media at that time. The articles were mostly sports feature articles, appearing in the sports sections of the newspapers, and many were small articles. Some articles were letters to the editor and opinion pieces. In the International print media sources, few of these articles appeared in the main section of the newspaper, with none taking the front page. Of all the articles only three the covered dominant discourses of race and gender, with other discourses such as cheating in sport and bias also covered. The rest of the articles focused mainly on the gender aspect of the saga and did not mention race much. These discourses were covered in many different ways although, some of the articles found, that covered the discourses of race and gender were all opinion pieces. Notable in the International coverage is that none of the articles quote Semenya.

Of the articles that undertook a detailed analysis, one of the articles analysed took an emotive approach to the reporting of the saga, and the other one offered only factual information. This indicates that many of the International reports were a mixture of emotive and factual reports. A key drawback in the analysis of these articles is that the archival sources fail to include accompanying graphs and pictures in the articles. The articles in this section mostly used the

angle of cheating in sport and dismissed any allegations of racism and sexism. Many of the articles also presupposed that the reading public would be familiar with Caster Semenya and the gender debacle that surrounded her. Of the articles selected, only three articles did mention race, with all the rest of the articles mentioning gender in some way or the other. The articles also prominently quoted Leonard Chuene, chairman of the ASA and other key South African politicians and leaders. These key figures seem to be the prominent voices in the saga, although their comments are often disproved. Along with these, a range of other professionals, ranging from activists to sports scientists and psychologists are also given turns to talk in the articles.

The biographical and detailed analyses both found the dominant discourses in the international reporting of the Caster Semenya saga to be limited to gender. This discourse was carried throughout all the articles in one way or another. Each newspaper had Semenya stories printed in their sports sections and did not have many news features in their main sections. The prominence of the articles in the time frame selected and the amount of coverage that Semenya received indicates that the saga was well-known internationally as well as locally. The lack of agency attributed to Semenya in most of these articles is also notable and this indicates that other voices were favoured over Semenya's. Specific favour was given to those in dominant positions at the ASA and IAAF and also to professionals in the fields of science and medicine. Discourse strands that varied in their coverage were not found. Cheating in sport was a dominant discourse, along with gender, found in the international newspaper section of this study.

CHAPTER SEVEN

The Butt of the Joke: The Semenya Saga as a Site for Lampooning Humour

Introduction to Humour in the Caster Semenya Saga

This section will undertake the analysis of the local and international print media humour that referred to the Caster Semenya saga. The analysis will be conducted for each different type of humour identified. The first is that of newspaper articles. Second is cartoons and the third is that of billboards. The analysis will be structured much the same as the newspaper reports and begins with the structural analysis of each print media format found. A selection of one example, from each format, which demonstrates typical characteristics of the discourses identified will then be subject to detailed analysis. A synoptic analysis will then combine the findings of the structural and detailed analyses for all the formats. Finally, conclusions will be made about the total humorous print media responses through a discussion of the commonalities and differences between the individual formats. Each of the print media formats are divided into their group and then listed chronologically in order to get a sense of the context of the articles. To access the cartoons, articles and a picture of the billboard, see *Appendix C*.

a) Structural Analysis of Humorous Print Media

Newspaper Reports

Article one

v. Biographical Details

Newspaper Name: *Daily Mail*

Date: 29 August 2009

Headline: Power's People

Author: Unknown

Appears in: Features

Genre: Joke

vi. Specific Aspects

This is a small joke that was published in the Daily Mail that states that the anagram for the name, Caster Semenya, is "Yes A Secret Man". The joke comes at a time when there is much speculation about the runner's gender. The key sub-topic that this article refers to is gender.

Article two

iii. Biographical Details

Newspaper Name: *Southland Sports*

Date: 23 August 2009

Headline: "Sex Probe Launched"

Author: Phil Ariva

Appears in: "Sunday Rules" Section

Genre: Comic Opinion Piece

iv. Specific Aspects

This article begins with a statement that Caster Semenya looks like a man. There is an accompanying photograph in the article. The article then says that the gender verification tests that she is meant to undergo will take 3 weeks to be released. The author then mentions that three weeks is a long time to wait and suggests some tests of his own. He suggests some activities such as parallel parking, sharing of feelings and checking of the seat position after she went to the toilet. Gender is the key sub-topic that is referred to in this article.

Cartoons

Cartoon one

i. Biographical Details

Newspaper Name: *Saturday Argus*

Date: 22 August 2009

Headline: "Castergate"

Cartoonist: Brandon

Appears in: Page 22

Genre: Cartoon

ii. Specific Aspects

This cartoon depicts a caricature of Semenya, standing on a podium with four men huddled below the podium and looking up at her. The men are wearing coats that say "IAAF" and the one man is holding a clipboard in his hand. Semenya's muscular build is emphasized in the cartoon, and she has a frown on her face. The depiction of her stance also makes her look more masculine. A key discourse that this cartoon addresses is that of gender testing. The word "castergate" is printed on the top left corner, which is a play on the words "Watergate" and "castigate".

Cartoon two

i. Biographical Details

Newspaper Name*: Cape Times*

Date: 26 August 2009

Cartoonist: Dov Fedler

Appears in: Page 10

Genre: Cartoon

ii. Specific Aspects

This cartoon depicts a figure arriving at the airport and being questioned by a journalist. The journalist asks, "Are you Caster Semenya?" and the figure replies, "No, I'm her Boyfriend". In the right bottom corner a figure holds up a board that says "More testosterone tests needed". The figure is dressed very neutrally and is wearing an earring, but it is hard to determine the gender of the figure. This is where the joke comes in. The key discourse that can be identified is gender.

Cartoon three

i. Biographical Details

Newspaper Name: *Witness*

Date: 12 September 2009

Byline: "Beware Caster Semenya Sex Minefield"

Cartoonist: Sticky

Appears in: Page 12

Genre: Cartoon

ii. Specific Aspects

This cartoon depicts Pierre Weiss, secretary general of the IAAF, walking on a "minefield" where little mines are named, "National pride and Honour", "Race", "Politics" and "Gender Rights". He has cartons of eggs strapped on his feet and seems to be wobbling. A speech bubble then reads: "I hope my insurance policy covers this". This cartoon covers race and gender as key sub-topics.

Cartoon four

i. Biographical Details

Newspaper Name: *Citizen*

Date: 21 September 2009

Cartoonist: Weyni Deysel

Appears in: Page 12

Genre: Cartoon

ii. Specific Aspects

This cartoon depicts a caricature of the ASA head, Leonard Chuene and depicts him juggling around symbols that connote "male" and "female". The cartoon addresses issues of gender as a key sub-topic.

Billboards

Billboard one

i. Biographical Details

Billboard Name: *Teasers*

Date: Unknown

Headline: "No Need for Gender Testing"

Appears: Rivonia Road, Sandton

Genre: Billboard

ii. Specific Aspects

This billboard depicts a woman, naked except for her shoes, lying in a suggestive position, with her intimate parts covered by her hands. The woman is a white female, with blonde, long hair and a big bust. The billboard states "No need for gender testing", which is a direct reference to the gender testing debacle around Semenya. This billboard refers to key sub-topics of race and gender.

b) Detailed Analysis of Humorous Print Media

Newspapers

Article Selected: "Sex Probe Launched"

This article was selected for its use of humour to describe and discuss the Semenya saga. The article is typical as it directly refers to the gender testing debacle. The author is Phil Ariva, who is known for his "Sunday Rules" column that takes a light-hearted view on sports. His speciality is humour. The article comes a few days after Semenya dramatically won the 800m final in Berlin. The article appears in the sports section, on page 63.

The article contains a series of small clips of comments about different sports. Semenya's story is one of these clips. This newspaper source is the only one with a picture of Semenya, depicting her holding up a South African flag, arms outstretched. The by-line of the picture states:

> "Nice abs Caster: South Africa's Caster Semenya celebrates after winning the gold medal in the final of the women's 800-meter race during the World Athletics Championships in Berlin on Wednesday. The big question now: is she a he?"

The heading of the article itself is inconspicuous and simply states "Sex probe launched". The article is structured by a brief introduction to the story followed by a punch-line of a series of humorous statements. The punch-lines all depend on stereotypical, well recognised codes of what is considered feminine characteristics and what are considered masculine. The topic of gender is specifically emphasized in this joke.

The article uses humour to satirize the audacity of the length of time the results of the gender tests will take to be revealed. The arguments require a shared understanding of the codes of humour the author is using and the author understands that the reader should have the logical understanding of gendered roles and stereotypes to be able to recognise the joke. The article makes allusions to gendered roles that seem accepted, for example, 'women cant parallel park' and 'men go to the toilet with the seat up'. The article uses these commonly held beliefs for humorous means. The accompanying picture, depicting Semenya in a "open" stance, seems to be directing the viewers eye to examine the questions that have been raised. Semenya is the only

one who is mentioned and she is not quoted. References to the gender tests have been made to emphasise the joke.

The joke presupposes that the readers understand a notion have two, binary sexes. It does not consider the notion of intersexuality. Furthermore, the article also presupposes that the people who read the article would understand societal norms of masculinity and femininity. The article suggests that the author's method of gender testing would be far quicker than the scientific gender testing. Other notable characteristics are that this is the only article that was able to be accessed with an attached photograph. The most prominent discourse from this article is that of gender and the article wishes to convey a light-hearted message.

Cartoons

Cartoon Selected: "Beware: Caster Semenya Sex Minefield"

This cartoon was selected because it covers the variety of discourses that have been revealed during the Semenya saga. The depiction is typical as it depicts the various issues that were raised by the saga by representing them as "mines" in a minefield. The cartoon appears on page nine of the newspaper.

The metaphor of the Semenya saga as a "minefield" with all the issues of contention as mines is cleverly used to express how the IAAF official have to "walk on eggshells" (another metaphor that is depicted in the cartoon) around this very sensitive issue. The cartoon relates to discourses on race, gender, national pride and politics. The article also uses allusions to the metaphors to explicate the sensitivity of the issues of contention in the saga. The cartoon contains references to common idioms and sayings that require the reader to have a shared understanding of the issues of the Semenya saga and how they relate to the cartoon. The actors that are mentioned in the article are the IAAF secretary-general Pierre Weiss and Caster Semenya. The cartoon shows that the IAAF official should tread carefully in the terrain of the Semenya saga because he may trample on the sensitivities of many with a vested interest in the Semenya saga.

Billboards

Billboard: "No Need for Gender Testing Here".

This billboard was selected as it created a lot of tension in the South African media for its representation of the Semenya saga. It is typical as it directly addresses the saga and specifically refers to gender. The creator of the billboard is unknown but it is known that the billboard advertises a strip-club in Johannesburg. The billboard was prominently placed on Rivonia Road in the Sandton area of Johannesburg and depicts a blond, white woman wearing nothing but make-up and shoes and blowing smoke out of her mouth. The depiction of the lady's silhouette emphasises the size of her breasts. The billboard directly refers to the Semenya saga by suggesting that at Teasers there are only female dancers and that a "real" woman looks like the white, blonde model, with heels replacing Semenya's running shoes and make-up replacing the sweat on Semenya's face after winning a race. The symbol of the "ideal" form of femininity is portrayed here. The prominence of gender and race issues are notable in this article.

c) ***Synoptic Analysis of the Newspapers***

The synoptic analysis will consist of a discussion of all the humour formats together, as opposed to what has been done previously. The analysis will firstly, begin by a general discussion of information gathered from the biographical analysis. The information gathered from the detailed analysis of typical humour formats will then be analysed. Only one typical sample per format was selected. Finally, general conclusions about the total humour-related responses will be drawn from a combination of the biographical and synoptic analyses.

The biographical analysis found that local newspapers were more prominent in the cartoons depictions of the Semenya saga than the international newspapers but the international newspapers were more prominent in articles that had humour that referred to the saga. The jokes were most prominent in their proliferation from the date 20 August 2009 to 20 September 2009. This indicates that the Semenya story was at the height of its notoriety in the local and international media at that time. The cartoons and articles all related to the saga were mostly related to the gender bias that was apparent in the saga. Of all the humour slanted forms, only three the covered the dominant discourses of race and gender, with other discourses such as politics and patriotism also covered. The rest of the articles focused mainly on the gender aspect of the saga and did not mention race much. These discourses were covered in many different ways although, some of the forms found, that covered the discourses of race and gender were all local cartoon pieces. Notable in the humorous coverage is that none of the forms quote Semenya.

Of the forms that undertook a detailed analysis they all covered humorous slanted takes on the Semenya saga. A key advantage in the analysis of these forms is that the all of the sources include accompanying pictures and cartoons in the forms. The forms in this section mostly used the angle of gender bias and gender testing and allegations of racism and sexism. The forms also presupposed that the reading public would be familiar with Caster Semenya and the gender debacle that surrounded her. Of the forms selected, only two mentioned race, with all the rest of the forms mentioning gender in some way or the other. The formats also prominently represented Leonard Chuene, chairman of the ASA and Caster Semenya herself. These key figures seem to

be the prominent depictions of Caster Semenya and Chuene. Along with these, a range of other professionals, like Pierre Weiss and Julius Malema are also represented in the humour articles.

The biographical and detailed analyses both found the dominant discourses in the international reporting of the Caster Semenya saga to be limited to gender. This discourse was carried throughout all the articles in one way or another. Each newspaper had Semenya stories printed in their sports sections and did not have many news features in their main sections. The prominence of the articles in the time frame selected and the amount of coverage that Semenya received indicates that the saga was well-known internationally as well as locally. The lack of agency attributed to Semenya in most of these articles is also notable and this indicates that other voices were favoured over Semenya's. Specific favour was given to those in dominant positions at the ASA and IAAF and also to professionals in the fields of science and medicine. Discourse strands that varied in their coverage were not found. Cheating in sport was a dominant discourse, along with gender, found in the international newspaper section of this study.

CHAPTER NINE

Conclusions

The Representation of Semenya as a modern-day Sarah Baartmann

The conclusions to the dissertations are divided into two sections to answer the research question, the first being representations of Semenya in the local and international media as compared with Sarah Baartmann, followed by a discussion of the humour used in both Baartmann and Semenya's cases. In the first section, the medical and scientific justifications that render both Sarah Baartmann and Semenya images of public spectacle will be explored. In the same vein, the discourses that inform this medical and scientific justification as arising from a fear of the 'other' are discussed. Both women's lack of agency in the retelling of their stories is explored and insights into how pictures are used to advance questions of either hyper sexuality or lack thereof are also reviewed. Finally, the conclusions between Baartmann and Semenya is also explored. The second part looks at the use of humour in both cases to render Semenya and Baartmann spectacle.

Semenya as Sarah Baartmann

Medical and Scientific Justifications for their 'othering'

The medical and scientific justifications of the racism meted upon Baartmann were aimed at advancing the racist project. Now, years later, Semenya has been subject to racism by those of the media that did not respect her privacy. The international news media, while attempting to "get the story" quickly found ways of leaking information to the public, without a care for her mental health. The media justified this by expressing concern for Semenya's health. However, the insensitive manner in which, first the gender tests and then the results, were leaked shows an inconcern on the part of the international news media.

While the local media dominated with emotive articles that discussed Semenya, the international media articles mostly pointed towards stories of cheating in sport and doping scandals. Almost

all of the articles included interviews with one or more medical and/or scientific professionals and these served to further the 'otherness' of Semenya, just as scientific justifications othered Baartmann. The media in the local sphere were very vocal about their views that the international media were reporting on this event as they were afraid of a woman from South Africa progressing. However, international media laughed off these concerns and suggested that the uproar was due to cheating scandals. The international media, however, was far more sexist in their reporting than the local media.

Semenya and Baartmann's lack of agency

There are no known records at all of any personal kind that pertain to Baartman, written or spoken by herself. Transcripts of her court case are available, but these are through a mediated scribe. However, the media's treatment of Semenya is also much the same, with her voice and her opinion silenced over others. The media never quoted Semenya. The only newspaper that did quote Semenya was the locally produced City Press, which appeared to have been the only newspaper with a well-rounded reporting of the saga. The international newspaper articles were mostly factual and did most reporting from news from agencies. Just as Baartmann, Semenya has had no agency in her situation.

The Use of Humour in the Caster Semenya Saga

The obsession with Baartmann's body in the 18th Century news is reflected in reports of Semenya in her gender saga. A cartoon by George Loftus (Holmes, 139) depicts Baartmann standing and being viewed by three gentlemen and a dog. This cartoon is reminiscent of a cartoon that has been analysed, titled "Castergate". Many of the cartoons and satire that arose around Baartmann were limited to her being on display and much of these related to her race. With Semenya however, cartoons specifically related to her gender. The depiction of the Teasers billboard, however, served to emphasise the ideals that white, busty and blonde are ideals of femininity and that these women are considered gender-appropriate. The humorous responses were mostly based on gender and not on race.

Conclusion

This dissertation has attempted to situate the Caster Semenya saga within discourses of race and gender. The introductory section has clearly outlined the goals, while Semenya's representation in local and international media is explored in terms of her representation pertaining to race and gender. It is clear that Semenya is, in many ways, parallel to Sarah Baartmann, and the media representations of both these women were a result of a systematic objective to "other" them for their differences, Baartmaan for her hyper-femininity and Semenya for displaying masculine features. However, it can be concluded that, while Semenya and Baartmann were very similarly represented, Semenya's othering was focused more on her gender than her race, in both local and international news sources. Yet, the disturbing fact remains, both these women, as Gqola (2010) states, were "rendered spectacle" world-wide.

Bibliography

Abrahams, Y. 1997. 'The Great Long National Insult: 'Science, Sexuality and the Khoisan in the 18th and Early 19th Century' in *Agenda: Race, Identity and Change*. 32: 34-48.

Baehr, H. & Gray, A. 1996. 'Representation: Image, Sign, Difference' In Baehr, H. & Gray, A. (eds.) *Turning it on: A Reader in Women and the Media*. London: Arnold, 1-4.

Baldwin, E. Longhurst, B. McCracken, S. Ogborn, M. & Smith, G. 2004. *Introducing Cultural Studies.* London: Pearson.

Bell, V. 1999. 'Performativity and Belonging: An Introduction' in Bell, V. (ed) *Performativity and Belonging*. London: Sage Publications. pp. 1-11.

Bertrand, I & Hughes, P. 2005. *Media Research Methods*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Black, S. 2009. 'The Not So Curious Case of Caster Semenya' in *Canadian Dimension, Vol. 43, No. 6.* Canada: Academic Research Library. pp. 41-42.

Buiten, D. 'Silences Stifling Transformation: Misogyny and Gender-Based Violence in the Media' In *Agenda*. 71: 115-121.

Butler, J. 1999. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge.

Byerly, C.M. 2010. 'Opinion: Inferential Homophobia and the News Discourse on Caster Semenya' In *Gender and Media Diversity Journal: Gender, Media and Sport*. 7: 118-121.

Carter, C. & Steiner, L. 2004. 'Introduction to Critical Readings: Media and Gender' In Carter, C. & Steiner, L. (eds.) *Critical Readings: Media and Gender*. Maidenhead: Open University Press, 1-10.

Chandler, D. 2002. *Semiotics: The Basics*. London: Routledge.

Crais, C. & Scully, P. 2009. *Sara Baartman and the Hottentot Venus: A Ghost Story and a Biography*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Dahlgren, P. 1997. 'Cultural Studies as a Research Perspective: Themes and Tensions" In Schlesinger, P. & Silverstone, R. (eds.) International Media Research: A Critical Survey. London: Routledge.

Davies, K. Dickey, J. & Stratford, T. 1987. 'Race: Introduction' In Davies, K. Dickey, J. & Stratford, T. (eds.) *Out of Focus: Writings on Women and the Media.* London: The Women's Press Limited, 38-39.

van Dijk, T. 2000. 'News Racism: A Discourse Analytical Approach' In Cottle, S. (ed.) *Ethnic Minorities and the Media: Changing Cultural Boundaries*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Downing, J. & Husband, C. 2005. ''Race' and 'Ethnicity': Definitions and Issues' In Downing, J. and Husband, C. (eds.) *Representing 'Race': Racisms, Ethnicities and Media*. London: Sage, 1-24.

Fairclough, N. 1995. 'Critical Analysis of Media Discourse' In Fairclough, N. (ed.) *Analysis of Communicative Texts*. New York : Oxford University Press, 53- 74.

Fairclough, N. 2003. *Analyzing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research*. London and New York: Routledge.

Fairfax Media. 2010. Sydney Morning Herald. Retrieved November 12, 2010 from the World Wide Web: http://adcentre.com.au/the-sydney-morning-herald.aspx

Garnham, N. 1995. 'Political Economy and Cultural Studies: Reconciliation or Divorce' In *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, 12: 62-71.

Gordon-Chipembere, N. 2009. 'Claiming Sarah Baartman: The Politics of Representing Black Women in the Twenty-First Century' In Baker, C. (ed.) *Expressions of the Body: Representations in African Text and Image.* Berlin: Peter Lang, 297-312.

Gqola, P.D. 1997. 'How the 'Cult of Femininity' and Violent Masculinities Support Endemic Gender Based Violence in Contemporary South Africa' In *African Identities*, 5: 111-124.

Gqola, P.D. 2009. Semenya as the 21st Century Sarah Baartmann?. Retrieved June, 21 2010 from the World Wide Web: http://pumlagqola.wordpress.com/category/sarah-bartmann/

Gqola, P. D. 2010. *What is Slavery to Me? : Postcolonial/Slave Memory in Post-Apartheid South Africa*. Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Hall, S. 1995. 'The Whites of Their Eyes: Racist Ideologies and the Media' In Dinez, G. & Humez, M. (eds.) *Race, Gender and Class in Media*. Thousand Oaks: Sage, 18-22.

Hall, S. 1997a. 'The Work of Representation' In Hall, S. (ed). *Representation: Cultural Representation and Signifying Practices.* London: Sage, 13-74.

Hall, S. 1997b. 'Introduction' In Hall, S. (ed). *Representation: Cultural Representation and Signifying Practices.* London: Sage, 1-12.

Hoad, N. 2010. '"Run, Caster Semenya, Run": Nativism and the Translations of Gender Variance' In *SAFundi*, 11/4: 397-405.

hooks, b. 'Teaching Resistance: The Racial Politics of Mass Media' In hooks, b (ed.) Killing Rage, Ending Racism. New York: Penguin, 108-118.

International Association of Athletics Federation. 2009. Biographies. Retrieved June 21, 2010 from the World Wide Web: http://www.iaaf.org/athletes/biographies/country=rsa/athcode=242560/index.html

Jäger, S & Maier, F. 2009. 'Theoretical and Methodological Aspects of Foucauldian Critical Discourse Analysis and Dispositive Analysis' In Wodak, R. & Meyer, M. (eds.) *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. 3rd ed. London: Sage, 34-61.

Jensen, R. 2004. 'Knowing Pornography' In Carter, C. & Steiner, L. (eds.) *Critical Readings: Media and Gender*. Maidenhead: Open University Press, 246-264.

Joseph, A. 2009. A Case of Sexual Policing?. Retrieved August 30, 2010 from the World Wide Web: www.womenonline.org/WIMNsVoicesBlog/2009/08/25/a-case-of-sexual-policing/

Lewis, J.E. 2009. 'Caster Semenya: A Girl of Two Parts' In *Gender and Media Diversity Journal: Gender, Media and Sport*. 7: 112-117.

Magubane, Z. 2001. 'Which Bodies Matter? Feminism, Poststructuralism, Race, and the Curious Theoretical Odyssey of the "Hottentot Venus"' In *Gender and Society*, 15.6: 816-834.

Mason, J. 1996. *Qualitative Researching*. London, Thousand Oaks and New Delhi: Sage Publications.

MondoTimes. 2010a. Daily Mail. Retrieved November 12, 2010 from the World Wide Web: http://www.mondotimes.com/1/world/uk/142/4217/10341

MondoTimes. 2010b. Sydney Morning Herald. Retrieved November 12, 2010 from the World Wide Web: http://www.mondotimes.com/1/world/au/180/4445/11119

Mugo, F.W. 2009. Sampling in Research: The Random Sample. Retrieved November 8, 2009 from the World Wide Web: http://www.socialresearchmethods.net/tutorial/Mugo/tutorial.htm

Murphy, S. T. 1998. 'The Impact of Factual Versus Fictional Media Portrayals on Cultural Stereotypes' in *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science.* 560: 165 – 178.

Nyong'o, T. 2010. 'The Unforgivable Transgression of Being Caster Semenya' In *Women and Performance: A Journal of Feminist Theory*. 20.1: 95-100.

Onwurah, C. 1987. 'Sexist, Racist and Above All Capitalist – How Women's Magazines Create Media Apartheid' In Davies, K. Dickey, J. & Stratford, T. (eds.) *Out of Focus: Writings on Women and the Media.* London: The Women's Press Limited, 39 – 42.

Qureshi, S. 2004. 'Displayin Sara Baartman, The 'Hottentot Venus'' in *History of Science*, 45.2: 233-257.

Ray, C. 2009. 'Caster Semenya: 21st Century Hottentot Venus?' in *New African*. 489: 18 – 19.

South Africa Info. 2010. The Press in South Africa. Retrieved November 12, 2010 from the World Wide Web: http://www.southafrica.info/pls/procs/iac.page?p_t1=690&p_t2=1823&p_t3=2657&p_t4=0&p_dynamic=YP&p_content_id=970427&p_site_id=38

Schrøder, K.C. 2002. 'Discourses of Fact' In Jensen, K.B. (ed.) *A Handbook of Media and Communication Research: Qualitative and Quantitative Methodologies*. London and New York: Routledge, 98-116.

West, C. 1994. "The New Cultural Politics of Difference" in During, S. (ed) *The Cultural Studies Reader*. London: Routledge. pp. 211.

Wodak, R. & Meyer, M. 2009. 'Critical Discourse Analysis: History, Agenda, Theory & Methdology' In Wodak, R. & Meyer, M. (eds.) *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. 3rd ed. London: Sage, 1-33.

Appendix A

Local Print Media

Appendix B

International

Print Media

Appendix C

Humour