

ABSTRACT

This research analyses the *Mail & Guardian's* coverage of the ‘historic’ negotiations between Zimbabwe’s ruling ZANU-PF party and the two MDC formations from 2007 to 2009. The talks were ‘historic’ in that they intended to negotiate an end to the partisan violence, human rights violations and create a framework for a ‘power-sharing’ government between the parties, thereby marking a possible shift in the Zimbabwean body politic. Drawing on cultural studies, critical political economy of the media and theories of news production, this study shows the form of the coverage and makes more visible the opaque aspects of the assumptions behind the *Mail & Guardian's* coverage of the negotiations. Contrary to expectations that the coverage of the talks would mainly be issue-driven given that the *Mail & Guardian* is a newspaper of ‘opinion and analysis’, this study reveals that the coverage is largely personality-driven. In other words, the coverage primarily focuses on political figures and their power squabbles. This focus on personalities is detrimental to the needs, hopes and expectations of the Zimbabwean people whose future is placed in the hands of politicians. The study also reveals that throughout the entire coverage, there are only five articles that are issue-driven.

PLAGIARISM DECLARATION

I, Wellington Samuel Radu, declare the following:

- I am aware that plagiarism (the use of someone else's work without their permission and/or without acknowledging the original source) is wrong;
- I am aware that any work that I submit for assessment must be my own unaided work except where I have explicitly indicated otherwise;
- I am aware that I must follow the required conventions in referencing the thoughts and ideas of others; and
- I understand that the University of the Witwatersrand may take disciplinary action against me if I do not submit my own unaided work or if I fail to acknowledge the ideas or words of someone else in my writing.



SIGNATURE

484219

STUDENT NUMBER

10 May 2011

DATE

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I explicitly express my gratitude to all the people who in different ways provided assistance on this research. Without them, this study would perhaps, not have been completed.

I am particularly grateful to my supervisor, Dr Lisa Brown, whose unfailing patience, critical suggestions, directional leads and continual prods eventually brought closure to this research.

I am also grateful to my fiancée, Yolanda Tarisayi Chekera for sharing her interest and time on the production of this research. She provided an almost electric energy source.

I also thank my family and friends, especially, Tsitsi Julia Mawire, Susan Nhema, Courage Samuel Radu, Herbert Nyathi and Progress Madzvamuse for their support.

I also extend my gratitude to Professor Tawana Kupe, Professor David Moore, Dr Michelle Williams and to all my Advanced Research Methods classmates for their insightful comments which helped me clarify my research topic and translate it into something researchable.

My heartfelt gratitude also goes to the staff at Media Monitoring Africa for their encouragement.

I am also especially grateful to the staff at the *Mail & Guardian* who agreed to talk about the newspaper's coverage of the negotiations. Without their perspectives, I could not have accumulated the fresh information and insights on which this report's analysis and interpretation draws from.

I am most indebted to the Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung for funding my studies and in particular to Ingrid Rohde, Dr Werner Böhler, Julia Weber, Nancy Msibi and Jennifer Schuster for believing in my potential.

The bibliography at the end of this report reveals my intellectual indebtedness to many works and scholars. In the bibliography I present books that I have indeed engaged. Needless to say, the analysis and interpretation put forth in this report is completely my responsibility.

ABBREVIATIONS

ANC	African National Congress
ARVs	Antiretrovirals
AU	African Union
EU	European Union
GNU	Government of National Unity
GPA	Global Political Agreement
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IPA	Interparty Political Agreement
MDC	Movement for Democratic Change
MDC-M	Movement for Democratic Change faction led by Arthur Mutambara
MDC-T	Movement for Democratic Change faction led by Morgan Tsvangirai
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NCA	National Constitutional Assembly
NGOs	Non Governmental Organisations
SADC	Southern African Development Community
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USA	United States of America
ZANU	Zimbabwe African National Union
ZANU-PF	Zimbabwe African National Union-Patriotic Front
ZAPU	Zimbabwe African People's Union
ZEC	Zimbabwe Electoral Commission

CHRONOLOGY OF MAJOR EVENTS

- 29 March 2007** SADC mandates South Africa President Thabo Mbeki to ‘officially’ mediate between ZANU-PF and the MDC formations (MDC-T and MDC-M) after Morgan Tsvangirai and other civic leaders were severely beaten in police custody after defying the ZANU-PF government directive banning a large intended gathering of opposition groups and civil society organisations.
- November 2007** ZANU-PF and the MDC formations agree on a series of legislative reforms, including Constitutional Amendment No. 18, which significantly increases the number of seats in the Parliament and the Senate and provides that Parliament sits as an electoral college in the event that the President is no longer able to carry out his/her duties.
- 29 March 2008** ‘Harmonized’ elections (local government, parliamentary, senatorial and presidential) are held simultaneously. MDC-T wins two seats more than ZANU-PF in the 210-seat Parliament. MDC-M holds the balance of power with ten seats.
- 02 May 2008** Results of the presidential election withheld under the guise of a recount, are finally released, with Morgan Tsvangirai shown as garnering 47.9 percent of the vote, Robert Mugabe 43.2 percent, Simba Makoni 8.3 percent and Langton Towungana 0.6 percent. As no candidate has an absolute majority, a run-off election is called to be held on 27 June 2008 between Morgan Tsvangirai and Robert Mugabe.
- 22 June 2008** Following a campaign of violence, which commences shortly after the March 2008 election, Morgan Tsvangirai withdraws from the presidential run-off poll. The withdrawal is not accepted by the ZEC.

- 27 June 2008** Presidential run-off goes ahead with Robert Mugabe as the only actively participating candidate although Morgan Tsvangirai's name remains on the ballot.
- 29 June 2008** Results are announced, giving Robert Mugabe 85 per cent of the vote. He is sworn into office immediately. The poll is almost universally discredited.
- 22 July 2008** ZANU-PF and the MDC formations sign a MoU to kick start the negotiating talks that are expected to last two weeks.
- 15 September 2008** ZANU-PF, MDC-T and MDC-M officially sign a 'power sharing agreement' that is officially called an IPA but comes to be known as the GPA.
- January 2009** Constitutional Amendment No.19, introducing the changes to the constitution necessary to give effect to the GPA, is passed in parliament.
- 11 February 2009** What is termed an 'inclusive' government, but comes to be called a 'unity' government or GNU, is formed, with the MDC-T, MDC-M and ZANU-PF sharing the ministries of government. Robert Mugabe is to 'continue' as President and Morgan Tsvangirai is appointed Prime Minister.

Adapted from Matyszak (2010: xviii-xix)

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT	i
PLAGIARISM DECLARATION	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
ABBREVIATIONS.....	iv
CHRONOLOGY OF MAJOR EVENTS	v
LIST OF TABLES	ix
LIST OF CHARTS.....	x
LIST OF GRAPHS.....	xi
Chapter One.....	1
Introduction	1
Chapter Two	4
Theoretical Framework	4
2.1 Introduction	4
2.2 Representation and framing.....	5
2.3 Cultural studies.....	8
2.4 Critical political economy of the media	10
2.5 Theories of news production	13
2.5.1 Political pressures.....	14
2.5.2 Professional culture	14
2.5.3 Source tactics and strategies.....	15
2.6 Approaches used in other studies on representation.....	16
2.7 Africa's media image	17
2.8 Conclusion.....	19
Chapter Three	20
Research Methods	20
3.1 Introduction	20
3.2 Quantitative and qualitative research combined.....	20
3.3 Specific methods of data collection.....	21
3.4 Specific techniques of data analysis	22
3.4.1 Content analysis	22
3.4.2 'Critical' discourse analysis	24
3.5 Conclusion.....	25
Chapter Four.....	26
Research Findings	26
4.1 Introduction	26
4.2 Importance of the coverage	26
4.2.1 Page numbers	27
4.2.2 Type of stories	28
4.2.3 Authorship of stories	29
4.2.3.1 Sex of authors	30
4.3 Theme coverage	31
4.3.1 Breakdown of political issues.....	32
4.3.2 Breakdown of economic issues	34
4.3.3 Breakdown of humanitarian issues.....	35
4.4 Assumptions	36
4.4.1 Assumptions about the talks	36
4.4.2 Assumptions about the mediator	37
4.4.3 Assumptions about the principals.....	37
4.4.4 Assumptions about political parties.....	38

4.5 Sources	38
4.5.1 Identity of sources accessed	39
4.5.2 Sources accessed	40
4.5.2.1 Sex of sources accessed.....	42
4.5.3 Voices of Zimbabwean politicians	42
4.5.3.1 Sex of Zimbabwean politicians accessed	44
4.5.4 Voices of foreign politicians	44
4.5.4.1 Sex of foreign politicians accessed.....	45
4.5.5 Voices of experts	46
4.5.5.1 Sex of experts accessed	46
4.5.6 Documents accessed.....	47
4.5.7 Voices of activists.....	48
4.5.7.1 Sex of activists accessed.....	48
4.5.8 Voices from regional and international bodies.....	49
4.5.8.1 Sex of sources accessed from regional and international bodies.....	50
4.5.9 Voices of civil servants	50
4.5.9.1 Sex of civil servants accessed.....	50
4.5.10 Voices of citizens	51
4.5.10.1 Sex of citizens accessed.....	51
4.5.11 Voices of news-workers	52
4.5.11.1 Sex of news-workers accessed	52
4.5.12 Voices of business people	52
4.5.13 The most accessed individuals	53
4.6 Conclusion.....	53
Chapter Five	55
Analysis and Interpretation.	55
5.1 Introduction	55
5.2 Zimbabwe in the spotlight	55
5.3 Hidden assumptions	58
5.3.1 The ‘unavoidable’ negotiations	60
5.3.2 The ‘damned’ negotiations	60
5.3.3 The ‘good for nothing’ negotiations.....	62
5.3.4 The ‘power-transfer’ versus ‘power-sharing’ debate	63
5.3.5 The protagonists	64
5.3.5.1 A veritable ‘Machiavelli’	64
5.3.5.2 The white man’s dumb poodle?	66
5.3.5.3 The ‘insignificant’ Arthur.....	67
5.3.5.4 The ‘fallen’ Mbeki.....	67
5.3.6 Personalities versus issues.....	69
5.4 What about the sources accessed?.....	70
5.4.1 ‘Politicians’ and ‘experts’ versus ‘activists’ and ‘citizens’	71
5.4.2 The ‘invisible’ women.....	72
5.5 Issue-driven coverage.....	73
5.6 Conclusion.....	76
Chapter Six	77
Conclusion.	77
Bibliography	79

LIST OF TABLES

1. Table 1: Type of stories	29
2. Table 2: Authorship of stories	29
3. Table 3: Theme coverage	31
4. Table 4: Breakdown of political sub-theme coverage	34
5. Table 5: Breakdown of economic sub-theme coverage	35
6. Table 6: Breakdown of humanitarian sub-theme coverage	35
7. Table 7: Assumptions about the talks	36
8. Table 8: Assumptions about the mediator	37
9. Table 9: Assumptions about the principals	37
10. Table 10: Assumptions about the political parties	38
11. Table 11: Breakdown of Zimbabwean politicians accessed	43
12. Table 12: Breakdown of foreign politicians accessed	45
13. Table 13: Breakdown of experts accessed	46
14. Table 14: Breakdown of documents accessed	47
15. Table 15: Breakdown of activists accessed	48
16. Table 16: Breakdown of sources accessed from regional and international bodies	49
17. Table 17: Breakdown of civil servants accessed	50
18. Table 18: Breakdown of citizens accessed	51
19. Table 19: Breakdown of news-workers accessed	52
20. Table 20: The most accessed individuals	53

LIST OF CHARTS

1. Chart 1: Sex of authors	30
2. Chart 2: Identity of sources accessed	39
3. Chart 3: Sources accessed	41
4. Chart 4: Sex of sources accessed	42
5. Chart 5: Breakdown of Zimbabwean politicians accessed from different political parties	43
6. Chart 6: Sex of Zimbabwean politicians accessed	44
7. Chart 7: Sex of foreign politicians accessed	45
8. Chart 8: Sex of experts accessed	47
9. Chart 9. Sex of activists accessed	49
10. Chart 10. Sex of citizens accessed	51

LIST OF GRAPHS

1. Graph 1: Page numbers on which the articles appear on 27