

https://dspace.org/

Racialised and cultural experiences of Muslim Somali Refugee women within an inner-city Johannesburg Islam Community

Letshufi, Bonolo Lerato

2020
https://hdl.handle.net/10539/30774

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/



Racialised and Cultural Experiences of Muslim Somali Refugee Women Within an Inner-City Johannesburg Islam Community

Bonolo Letshufi

Supervised by: Ruby Patel

This report is submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Masters in Counselling and Community Psychology in the faculty of Humanities in the University of Witwatersrand.

680731

Johannesburg, February 2020

Declaration of Originality

I, the undersigned, hereby declare that this is my own original work and that all fieldwork was undertaken by me. Any part of this study that does not reflect my own ideas has been fully acknowledged in the form of citations. No part of this thesis has been submitted in the past, or is being submitted, or is to be submitted for a degree at any other university.

Bonolo Letshufi

University of the Witwatersrand

Johannesburg



20/08/21

BONOLO LETSHUFI DATE

Acknowledgements

My sincerest thanks to all of those who contributed to this research paper; in particular, special mention must be made of the following people:

Firstly, I would like to extend my sincere gratitude to the women who agreed to take part in this research. Thank you for sharing your homes, lives and stories with me. Thank you for your graciousness and hospitality. You have displayed such courage and bravery in allowing yourselves to be vunerable and honest about some of the most painful experiences that you have had to endure. Your faith in God has strengthened my faith in Him too. You inspired me to see this research through. Ilaah ha u ahaato.

To my supervisor, Ruby Patel, I am so grateful for our long, deep and meaningful conversations during supervision. You made me fall in love with research and with what I was pursuing. You offered a rich depth of knowledge and insight that I could have not attained elsewhere. Thank you for your patience, understanding and the gentle manner in which you approached me; I needed that. I appreciate how you pushed me and even though I could not see the end in sight, you encouraged me to keep trying and never give up on myself.

To my colleagues and friends, thank you for being so generous with your knowledge and always being willing to help when I was uncertain and unmotivated. I appreciate how we kept one another accountable and how committed we were to ensuring that we finish what we started. I could not have asked for better colleagues and friends.

To my mother, who has supported my dream of becoming a counselling psychologist long before I even knew this was what I was called to do, thank you. I appreciate your words of encouragement and allowing me the space to complete my research without putting unncessary pressure on me. Thank you for believing in my potential.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION OF ORGINALITY **i**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS **ii**

ABSTRACT **iii**

OPERATIONAL DEFINITIONS **iv**

TABLE OF CONTENTS **v**

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND RATIONALE **12**

1.1 Introduction 12
1.2 Background of Study 13
1.3 Rationale 15
1.4 Aims of the Study 18
1.5 Format of the Report 18

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW **20**

2.1 Introduction 20
2.2 The journey of migration 20
2.2.1 Contextualizing Somalia 22
2.2.2 Locating Mayfair/Fordsburg 24
2.2.3 The face of trauma 26
2.3 Race and racialisation 29
2.3.1 Pigment matters 31
2.3.2 Contesting Muslim universalism 33
2.4 Class differences 33
2.5 Culture, Identity and Belonging 33
2.5.1 Contested belonging 36
2.5.2 A complex construction of identity 37
2.5.3 Language and power 40
2.5.4 Tribalism as pervasive 41
2.5.5 Power, gender and culture 46
2.5.6 Whose body is it anyway? 48
2.7 Conclusion 48

CHAPTER THREE: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK 49

3.1 Introduction 49
3.2 The birth of intersectionality 49
3.3 Approaches to intersectionality 51
3.3.1 Matrix of domination 53
3.3 Limitations of intersectionality 54
3.4.1 Inclusivity 55
3.4.2 The scale of intersectionality 56
3.4.3 Methodology 57
3.4.4 Identity formation 58
3.5 Where to from here? 58
3.6 Conclusion 59

CHAPTER FOUR: METHODS AND METHODOLOGY 60

4.1 Introduction 60
4.2 Research Questions 60
4.3 Research Design 60
4.4 Participants 63
4.4.1 Table of participants 65
4.5 Data Procedure 65
4.6 Data Analysis 68
4.6.1 Phemenological Interpretative Analysis 68
4.6.2 Trustworthiness of Analysis 70
4. 7 Reflexivity 71
4.8 Ethical Considerations 72
4.9 Conclusion 73

CHAPTER FIVE: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 75

5.1 Introduction 75
5.2 Pain and Suffering 75
5.2.1 Perpetual Trauma… 75
5.2.2 Normalised suffering 79
5.2.3 Dealing with Intergenerational Trauma 85
5.3 Ethnic divisions 88
5.3.1 Tribal conflicts and intermarriages as taboo 89
5.3.2 Internal class divides 91
5.4 Pervading Patriarchy 94

5.4.1 Religion as tool of patriarchy 94
5.4.2 The impact of patriarchy 96
5.5 Race Matters 98
5.5.1 Dehumanisation in public spaces 98
5.5.2 Segregation in personal spaces 101
5.5.3 Loss of community 106
5.5.4 Disillusionment 108
5.6 Conclusion 110

CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION 111

6.1 Introduction 111
6.1.1 Concluding Thoughts 111
6.1.2 Limitations of study 116
6.1.3 Recommendations 118
6.1.3.1 Mental health 116
6.1.3.2 Cyber groups 119
6.1.3.3 Support groups 119
6.1.3.4 Community integration 119
6.1.3.5 Tribalism 120
6.1.3.6 Training 120
6.2 Reflexivity 120
Reference List 128

APPENDIX A: Information Sheet for CSVR 141

APPENDIX B: Information Sheet for Participants 143

APPENDIX C: Interview Consent Form 145

APPENDIX D: Audio-recording Consent Form 146

APPENDIX E: Semi-structured Interview Schedule 147

APPENDIX F: Ethical Clearance Form 149

List of Abbreviations

CSVR	Centre for the Study for Violence and Reconciliation
IPA	Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis
PTSD	Post Traumatic Stress Disorder
UNHCR	United Nations Higher Commission for Refugees

Operational Definitions

Asylum seeker

According to Amnesty International Report (2018), an asylum seeker is a person who has left their home country as a political refugee seeking asylum and protection in another country. Not every asylum seeker will ultimately be recognised as a refugee in the respective country where they have sought refugee, but every refugee was initially an asylum seeker. Each country has its own specific criteria for determining who qualifies as a refugee. In South Africa, an asylum seeker is initially issued a Section 22 permit that classifies the individual as an asylum seeker until their claim for refugee status has been vetted by Home Affairs to determine whether he/she is regarded as a refugee. If the individual is granted refugee status, he/she is issued with a section 24 permit.

Refugee

It is imperative to distinguish what qualifies one to be referred to as a refugee and what criteria exclude one from this term. The simplified definition of a refugee is considered to be an individual who is forced to flee his/her country of nationality due to war conflict, generalised violence, gross human rights violations or natural disasters (Siegel, Schilperoord & Dahab, 2014). A refugee may also be regarded as one who flees life-threatening conditions that may be rooted in political or social unrest within his/her country of origin (Shacknove, 1985). Landau (2003) asserts that refugees are internally displaced individuals who may also be fleeing from endemic

poverty.

Conceptualising the term “refugee” has been met with some international contention and debate. Shacknove (1985) explains that although there is some consensus that a refugee is one who flees his/her homeland due to fear of persecution on the grounds of race, nationality, political affiliation or religion, this definition varies across nations and jurisdictions. Shacknove (1985) asserts that the nature of refugeehood involves a moral and empirical claim. The former implies that there has been a violation of human rights and that a bond of trust between individual and his/her country of origin has been severed. The latter suggests that the reasons for fleeing and seeking asylum are primarily due to persecution and alienage.

In 1996, South Africa’s post-apartheid constitution declared a new global standard concerned with human rights and dignity obtained through state action. This unprecedented move by South Africa distinguishes it from other African nations by promoting refugee resettlement and facilitating this process through providing legal documentation for those previously displaced, allowing access to the labour and housing market and granting access to health care and other social assistance (Landau, 2006). However, while Section 24 of the refugee permit and Section 22 of the asylum seeker permit stipulates that refugees are entitled to equal rights to those of South African citizens, this is not the reality for most migrants (Hlatshwayo & Vally, 2014). Landau (2006) argues that the state has failed to uphold its own constitutional obligations by failing to issue legal documentation for refugees as well as provide the necessary social services entitled to all refugee citizens by law. Therefore, how the state conceptualises a refugee is crucial as these perceptions shape and influence the (perceived) capacities and interests of the host country towards migrants (Landau, 2003). This merely serves to highlight some of the challenges refugees face within the South African context in their quest to be recognised as citizens but is in no way extensive in terms of the obstacles faced by these individuals. With regards to this specific research, all the participants are refugee citizens.

Migrant

According to the United Nations Migration Report (2017), a migrant is defined as an individual who immigrates or moves across international borders or within a state (or province) from his/her habitual place of residence and this term is offered regardless of legal status, voluntarily or involuntary movement, length of stay or reasons for migrating. An immigrant leaves his/her native country with the intention of resettling elsewhere outside of his/her country of origin.

South Africa has been home to migrants from various countries within the African continent and abroad (Vadwa, 2017). Migration can take place for several reasons, which includes but is not limited to, improvement of socio-economic conditions as well as cultural or environmental factors however, this move is usually voluntary and is not one imposed by war or political instability in one's country of origin. A migrant is therefore someone who chooses, out of his/her own conviction, to leave his/her native land and resettle elsewhere. Not all migrants are necessarily refugees but all refugees are classified under the umbrella term of migrant. For purposes of this research, these terms will be used interchangeably.

African Muslim and South African Indian/Asian Muslim

In referring to African Muslims, this constitutes of Africans from predominantly Muslim countries in other parts of the continent particularly Somalia, Kenya, Cameroon, Sudan, Tanzania and Malawi (Vadwa, 2017). Asian Muslims hail from different parts of Asian such as Bangladesh, India, Pakistan and other Middle Eastern countries. In this paper, African Muslims refer to individuals from other parts of the African continent as a distinction is made between South African Indian/Asians and African Muslims. This does not imply that Indian/Asian people living in South Africa are not in fact 'African' or do not identify as such; this is merely used to indicate the country of origin of these people and their geographical location. The terms Asian or Indian Muslim will be used interchangeably in this paper.

Blackness/ black people

The concept of race is socially constructed and the term 'black people' is a skin-based classification used to describe people of mid to dark brown complexion. It also usually refers to people of Sub Saharan African descent. It is important to note that not all black people are dark skinned and that these racial classifications are rooted in racist ideology. The ways in which race categories have been determined is arbitrary and contradictory in many respects however, this has real political and social consequences for those classified as 'black' (Posel, 2001). Under Biko's (1978) Black consciousness movement, blackness took on a new concept in which 'Black' was constructed as a positive and expansive concept that included those designated as 'Coloured', 'Indian' or 'African'. Thus, Black (capital letter 'B') was all encompassing of all groups of people who were oppressed under the laws of apartheid. However, black (small letter 'b') is used as a race category to define whom Biko (1978) referred to as Bantu-speaking people or those referred to as Africans. For purposes of this research, a distinction is made between black and Indian people using the state's current racial categories that designate people as either black, Indian, coloured or white. It is noted that the issue of race classifications remains highly contested, highlighting the salience of race and racial classifications post apartheid (Posel, 2001).

Abstract

This study draws on in-depth interviews conducted with seven Somali Muslim refugee women currently residing in an Islamic community in Johannesburg. A qualitative approach was employed to explore how racism, racialisation and culture impacts their everyday lived experiences. This thesis intends to unpack the ways in which Somali Muslim women negotiate and renegotiate their identities within the spaces they occupy. The exploration and analysis of their stories was accomplished by adopting intersectionality as a theoretical framework. Refugees are often faced with discrimination and oppression on multiple levels and their historical contingencies are fraught with insurmountable difficulties that are further exacerbated and complicated by the intersection of race, class, gender, nationality, religion and culture. This thesis intends to challenge and contest the idea of a Muslim identity and solidarity that transcends race, class, gender and culture and instead, illuminates the racial tensions and segregation that exists between African Muslims and South African Indian Muslims who reside in the same community. Furthermore, this study intends to reveal the internal fractures and divisions within the Somali community that further complicate and add layers of complexity to how Somali women experience their community along the axis of gender, tribe affiliation and social class status. These very distinct yet overlapping categories of identity shape and inform the everyday lived experiences of Somali women. Being a Somali Muslim women is often accompanied with feelings of trepidation, alienation, exclusion and disillusionment. Their stories reveal themes of perpetual pain and suffering, ethnic divides, patriarchal ideology and racism experienced within their Muslim community. Despite adversities and marginalisation, these women continue to find creative ways of surviving and display resilience and hopefulness for their futures. Their experiences suggest that religion is used as a means of coping and making sense of their lived experiences as well as their sense of self.

Key words: Intersectionality, Race, Culture, Refugees, Religion

Chapter One

Introduction and Rationale

1.1 Introduction

"*All animals are equal, but some animals are more equal than others*." (Orwell, 1945 p. 86)

This well-known quote from the fictional book 'Animal Farm' sets the tone for some of the central themes of this research that is concerned with the racialised and cultural experiences of Muslim Somali refugee women. Although this quote seems nonsensical and contradictory, it is compelling in that it addresses pertinent social issues that prevail in society. This cleverly worded statement reveals the hypocrisy and elusion of equality. It highlights hierarchies in society that categorise people in terms of their social status. In principle, all people should be equal but in reality, their race, gender, age, class, nationality, religion and culture serve as critical sources of disadvantage, discrimination and oppression (Lazarus, 2019).

By stating that some animals are more equal than others, Orwell (1945) suggests that there is an adjudicator who has the power to decide who belongs and who does not as well as who and what is considered acceptable (Matsuda, 1991). It could be argued that the animal analogy accurately reveals the inequalities and dehumanisation that many migrants are subjected to; where they too are relegated to the status of animals and denied their dignity and humanity (Smith, 2014). On the pyramid of social hierarchy, asylum seekers and refugees are typically unfavourably treated, ostracized and marginalised.

This study is interested in exploring the experiences of Muslim Somali refugee women whose experiences are shaped not only by one dimension of their identity, such as their nationality, but is constituted by multiple identities such as race, class, gender, religion and culture (Crenshaw, 1991). These various identities are often entangled and intertwined with one another and can therefore not be viewed in

isolation or conceptualised as mutually exclusive (Shields, 2008). The ways in which these refugee women navigate and occupy space within and beyond their communities is influenced by these various categories of identity that they occupy. Therefore even though this study makes reference to specifically racialised and cultural experiences, it also recognises that these experiences are influenced by various other identities such as being female, Muslim and Somali.

A qualitative study has been selected over a quantitative analysis to allow individuals to tell stories of their own experiences that would help to bridge the gap between the 'researcher' and the 'researched'. This research attempts to explore and understand the racialised and culture experiences of Somali Muslim women by using intersectionality as a theoretical framework. It also seeks to unpack the complex ways that Somali Muslim women make meaning of their experiences and how they manage to construct and reconstruct their identities. Furthermore, this research is interested in the ways in which Somali women establish and negotiate belonging in their community.

1.2 Background of Study

South Africa accommodates a large percentage of individuals and families who have been forcibly displaced from their countries of origin due to persecution and political instability (Smith, 2014). South Africa is regarded as the most industrialised country on the African continent which attracts a number of migrants who are escaping poverty, seeking refuge from war and government persecution (Masenya, 2017). Moodley & Adam (2000) argue that even post apartheid; South Africa remains deeply divided among racial and ethnic lines. The romanticized notion of a "rainbow nation" is contradicted and debunked by the heightened racial tensions that abound in the country. It is against this backdrop of underlying racial hostility and ambiguity about race relations and the political state of the country that migrants are embroiled in upon resettlement. Integration and assimilation into South Africa is a complex process as the nation struggles with issues of development post apartheid as well as citizenship and xenophobia (Vawda, 2017). The political instability and war in some parts of the African continent has resulted in a new stream of African Muslims

migrating to South Africa (Vawda, 2017).

Under the apartheid government, Islam was considered as an Indian religion and therefore, "un-African" or "not for black people" (Vawda, 2017). Mandivenga (2000) explains that Islam arrived in South Africa by a wave of migration by Malays and Indians who are from two distinct ethnic backgrounds. The highest numbers of practicing Muslims in South Africa are the Cape Malays followed by the Indian community and a minute percentage is constituted of black and white Muslims. Mandivenga (2000) explains that both Cape Malays and Indians are relatively separate and prefer to keep to themselves as they differ in terms of linguistics, culture and ethnicities. Although this may not necessarily be attributed to prejudice or racism, it does highlight the separation and a lack of integration between these two groups even though they share the same religious beliefs, and are fundamentally similar in their religious ideology. Furthermore, South Africa's legacy of apartheid and forced racial segregation, may contribute to the lack of integration between Cape Malays and Indian people.

Sadouni (2009) argues that African Muslims contend with having to prove their authenticity as "real" Muslims primarily because Islam has been traditionally perceived as an Indian religion. This suggests that their presence in predominantly Islamic communities within South Africa continues to be questioned, contested and in some instances, rejected. Vawda (2017) contests the idea of a concrete and unified Muslim identity that eclipses race, class, ethnicity and nationality. Muslims are differentiated along the lines of race, class, nationality and gender. Vawda (2017) argues that these are important factors to be cognisant of as they structure and inform the kinds of interactions African Muslims have with South African Muslims of Indian descent. Sadouni (2009) explains that racialisation and ethnicisation among South African Muslims is still prevalent today and Somali Muslims have also become ensnared in these divisions. What this illustrates is that "ethno-national cleavages indeed continue to prevail over Muslim universalism" (Sadouni, 2009 p. 242). While African Muslims have succeeded at claiming their presence in these spaces and have formed networks of solidarity among one another (Sadouni, 2013), they are still considered as the 'other' within the South African social landscape (Murray, 2003)

and perhaps more so in their own communities. Dobson (2012) explains that the *everyday* lives of migrants are characterised by exclusion, discrimination and immense fear. What is relatively unknown is the ways in which African Muslims have integrated with South African Indian Muslims amidst a climate of systemic and historical racism that is embedded within the fabric of South Africa. It is precisely these reasons that warrant further exploration of how Somali Muslim women are integrating in their Islamic community within Mayfair that is located in Johannesburg.

1.3 Rationale

The question is, why study the experiences of Somali Muslim women within their Islamic community? Firstly, this kind of research would afford a space for Somali women to communicate the ways in which *they* have made meaning of their experiences and are constructing and reconstructing their identities along the way. Fraser (2004) asserts, knowing about the narratives of ordinary women whose voices are usually excluded or silenced from research, has the potential to legitimise the knowledge of the marginalised. Zavos (2010) contends that women migrants have remained politically underrepresented and references or accounts of their isolation, family or oppression has been contrasted against the experiences of men in their own right. This strengthens the need for research of women migrants as their experiences of migration, xenophobia, racism, discrimination and marginalisation has remained largely underreported or constructed around discourses of their male counterparts.

Crush & Tawadzera (2017) purport that there is a significant increase in the number of women migrants in the country and refer to this as the feminisation of migration. The nature of women's experiences along the axis of race, gender and class dimensions are different to that of men. Isike (2017) cautions against adopting a gender neutral stance when exploring the experiences of marginalisation of women migrants as this would not only serve to perpetuate inequalities and discrimination, but also obscure and distort the realities and complexities of migration particularly from the lens of gender. Therefore, gender is placed at the centre of understanding migration as well as unpacking the ways that space is occupied by migrant women particularly Somali Muslim women.

This study is in line with the values of community psychology which encourages and advocates for political representation of marginalised groups. This calls for the inclusion of black people, women and theoretical as well as methodological multiplicity that critically engages with both the dominant and the dominated (Seedat, MacKenzie, & Stevens, 2004). Theoretical pluralism is really about the inclusivity of marginalised theories, perspectives and stories. This study is not necessarily *giving* a voice to this group of women, because that would imply that they have no voice, but instead it is allowing for their voices to be heard.

Research has predominantly focused on issues of trauma and xenophobia experienced by migrants but there is an insufficient amount of literature about the racial dynamics of the *everyday* lived experiences of migrant women. Furthermore, there is a lack of literature about intersection of race, class, gender, nationality, religion and other identities which might combine to form different modes of discrimination and inequality. Intersectionality is interested in how one's social and political identities interlock with systems of power to identify the ways in which this contributes to injustice, discrimination and marginalisation of black women in society (Crenshaw, 1991).

Fuentes, Miranda & Abdulrahim (2012) argue that there is no universal measure or understanding of gendered experiences as these are influenced by race and class indicating the nuanced complex experiences of 'women of colour'[1] compared to, for instance, the experiences of white women. Intersectionality also emphasizes the systems of oppression within society that disadvantage some groups of people based on skin colour, class, religion, age, nationality or gender. More importantly, intersectionality is interested in how these different identities serve to create different *expressions* or levels of discrimination and prejudice for particular groups of people or individuals in comparison to others.

What has been thoroughly investigated are the social, political and economic explanations for xenophobia and experiences of foreigners residing in townships[2] but

[1] A term typically used in the United States which refers to black people who are classified as 'coloured' in the USA

[2] Formally known as the 'location'; this is typically an area where black South Africans were forced to live in under the apartheid law. These areas are usually located on the outskirts of a town or city

little attention has been afforded into exploring the racism and racialisation among African Muslim migrants living in suburban areas in predominantly Indian Muslim communities. Moreover, literature provides extensive knowledge about issues related to mental health and emphasizes the trauma that most migrants, particularly refugees, have endured however, there is insufficient knowledge about how the overlapping categories of identity namely race, class, gender, age, nationality, religion and culture impact migrant women's experiences of injustice. An inability to recognise the various types of oppression that occur at different points of these intersections, limits our efforts to promote social and political change and equality for migrant women. Crenshaw (1991) argues that when antiracist and feminist practices only consider either race or gender as an either/or proposition, they minimise the experiences of oppression by reducing a black women's identity to a singular category as opposed to viewing the multiple identities as mutually constitutive. Somali Muslim women's identities need to be viewed holistically because the systems of power within which these women exist, oppress, discriminate and marginalise at *all* points of intersection. This emphasizes the need for research that is cognisant of these intersections and recognises the multiple levels at which migrant women are marginalised. This deepens our understanding of the lived experiences of migrant women that has consequences for the kinds of interventions and policies that are pursued in attempting to empower this group of people.

Feminist critiques of traditional psychotherapy argue that it fails to accurately represent the experiences of women and tends to neglect the social and political contexts that shape these experiences (Jordan, 2010). This is crucial when working with migrant women because how we understand and make sense of their everyday experiences within their communities informs the way in which treatment is approached in the therapeutic setting. Ali, Lui & Humedian (2004) stress that it is important for psychologists working with Muslim clients to offer culturally congruent mental health services to Muslim communities, which can only be achieved by understanding their religion, customs and practices. What this highlights is the need for critical consciousness, contextual awareness and recognition of the intersection of multiple identities when considering community or individual interventions.

In order to address some of the oppressive, discriminatory and racist structures that exist in society, it is paramount to have a comprehensive understanding of the challenges that migrant women face on a regular basis. Furthermore, without this knowledge and critical engagement with these intersecting identities, community psychologists and other professions run the risk of reproducing inequality and reinforcing the very oppressive structures they wish to dismantle (Prilleltensky, 2008)

Even though Somali Muslim women are subjected to marginalisation on multiple levels, this is not to assume Muslim refugee women have no agency or that their narratives will be solely constructed around negative experiences. Lenette, Brough & Cox (2013) caution against discourses of victimisation when conceptualising the refugee experience and suggest a holistic view of the entirety of their experiences. This study is focused on the racial and cultural experiences of Muslim Somali refugee women, and does not presuppose that *all* lived experiences are negative. However, this research does not deny or minimise the real impact of xenophobia, afrophobia (to be discussed in further detail later) racism, violence of different kinds and discrimination that exists against this particular group within South Africa. It is therefore the aim of this research to gain a better understanding of Muslim Somali women's everyday experiences by allowing them to be the narrators of their own stories.

1.4 Research Aims and Objectives

The primary objective of this research is to explore the racialised and cultural experiences of Somali Muslim women living in a Muslim community.

The secondary objective is to unpack the everyday experiences of Somali Muslim women in their Muslim community.

1.5 Chapter Outline

Having introduced the research and provided a rationale for its usefulness in chapter one, Chapter two engages with literature that offers insight on issues of race, afrophobia, culture and religion. Furthermore, this chapter also engages with context about migration and offers some literature on Somalia.

Chapter three outlines intersectionality as a theoretical framework and explores its origins, application, shortcomings and its usefulness for this research.

Chapter four discuses the findings which are presented in a thematised manner. This chapter identifies major themes that emerged from the stories and experiences of the participants.

Chapter five presents the methodological framework used to analyse and interpret the accounts of the participants' experiences. This study is qualitative in nature and therefore adopts the principles of a qualitative research design. The analytical approaches used in this study are interpretative phemenological analysis (IPA) that have proven useful in processing the data.

The final section of this thesis, chapter six, provides a conclusion regarding the major concepts and themes in this thesis, as well as a section on reflexivity in which reflection is made about the entire research process. Limitations and recommendations are also discussed in this chapter.

Chapter Two

Literature review

2.1 Introduction

This chapter explores literature pertaining to multiple issues that may contribute to the cultural and racialised experiences of Somali women. The Chapter offers some insight on contentious issues related to race politics, class divisions, the concept of home and belonging, as well as unpacking the role of culture and religion in how Somali women make meaning of their lives and identity.

2.2 The journey of migration

2.2.1 Contextualizing Somalia

A brief political history about Somalia is necessary, as it will provide some context about Somalia and the conditions that led to Somalis fleeing their native country. The history provided of Somalia is far too simplistic and perhaps oversimplified as the current political state of the country is imbued in a complicated set of issues and affairs that exceeds the scope of this research.

Somalia's history is riddled with unprecedented armed insurgency, tribal disputes, civil war and insurmountable displacement (Pineteh, 2017). Somalia, officially known as the Somali Republic, is located on the east coast of Africa and is bordered by Ethiopia, the Gulf of Aden and Kenya. Together with its surrounding countries, Somalia is commonly referred to as The Horn of Africa due to its striking resemblance to the horn of a rhinoceros on the map (Terdiman, 2008). Since the 1970s, Somalia has been involved in perpetual war with countries in other areas of The Horn of Africa. In 1977, the then president declared war to reclaim parts of Somalia however, Somalia was defeated which led to a disintegration within the government as well as economic and political difficulties. As a result, there was a loss of confidence in the state by Somalis which subsequently incited clan-based

violence towards the state as retaliation (McMichael, 2002).

According to Menchaus (2002), Somalia is almost an entirely Muslim country compared to other countries in The Horn of Africa and experienced a significant increase in Islamic political activity. Islam is a crucial part of Somali ethnic identity and in some cases has been used, and misused, as a means of temporary mass mobilization within state politics. Menchaus (2002) argues that Somalia resembles Afghanistan in a number of ways specifically due to its lack of regional political authorities after the state collapse, devastating poverty and extreme underdevelopment.

The political instability and prevailing civil war in Somalia has been the result of ongoing conflict and contention between Somali clans and sub clans for more than a decade. Tribalism has been a dominant contributing factor to the collapse of the state in 1991 as clan membership plays a pivotal part in Somali culture and politics. The issue of tribalism will be discussed in further detail later. According to Pineteh (2017 p. 2), Somalia's humanitarian crisis is considered "the most dangerous in the world" and serves as an exemplar of the devastations caused by contestation of absolute power, tribal grievances, mistrust and division among countrymen.

According to Holzer (2008) part of the contentious issues faced by Somalia lies in its Islamic activism and a disagreement about religious ideology between clans and sub clans. The radical shift to Islamic law from customary law has caused upheaval among Somalis where before the introduction of Islamic law (Sharia law), it was not uncommon for women to go out unveiled. Holzer (2009) notes that most Somalis consider the stricter codes of religious conduct as an unwarranted imposition from the nations and is considered as "un-Somali" which has led to some resentment, as Somalis are proud of their own culture, traditions and customs.

The unsuccessful quest for peace deliberations, broken promises, senseless violence and colossal killings and counter-killings after the state collapse in 1991, has left an ugly mark of irreversible pain in the conscious minds of Somali people (Mohamed, 2017). The collapse of the state due to political and economic instability

has resulted in massive forced migration of Somalis who were threatened with torture, loss, pain and inevitable death if they remained in their country of origin. Somalia remains plagued by unceasing war, conflict, armed incursions and piracy making it an unsafe country for many of its inhabitants. These uncontrollable and dire conditions have led many Somalis to seek asylum and peace in other parts of the African continent especially in South Africa, which is considered a beacon of hope, life and security for many who have been displaced (Pineteh, 2017). For many Somalis, Mayfair has been the choice of resettlement in the hopes of rebuilding what has been lost and creating new memories.

2.2.2 Locating Mayfair/Fordsburg

Under the apartheid regime Mayfair was declared a white area however, since the 1980s, South African Indians have inhabited this space and thus Mayfair has a significant population of Indian people (Sadouni, 2009). Under the new dispensation and democracy, many Somali's migrated to the Mayfair/Fordsburg area on 8th avenue which was an already established Indian Muslim population (Thompson, 2016). It is a vibrant suburb and multicultural in that a large number of Indian Muslims as well as Muslim migrants from other parts of the African continent such as Ethiopia, Congo and Somalia reside and work in and around the Mayfair/Fordsburg region. Thompson (2016) states that Gauteng's Somalis are almost exclusively located in the Mayfair region located in an inner suburb west of the Johannesburg central business district (CBD) and which is adjacent to Fordsburg.

The presence of shared religious practices and heritage are fundamental for Somali refugees who have been displaced and it is this desire for a collective identity and common belief systems that inform where Somalis decide to resettle (Sigamoney, 2018). The presence of Indian Muslims in the Mayfair/Fordsburg area has attracted many Somali's to this specific location, as it is one of the most Muslim dominated areas within the Johannesburg area allowing for Somalis to practice their faith. Sadouni (2009) explains that unlike other African Muslims from Senegal who have chosen to reside in Hillbrow and Yeoville, Somali Muslims prefer to settle among South African Muslims due to their shared beliefs and easy access to mosques within

the area. Vadwa (2017) suggests that another reason for the presence of Somali enclaves in certain parts of Johannesburg may also be attributed to a need for protection against hostile locals. Usually Somalis also choose their area of residence in close proximity to where they trade during the day.

From the beginning, Somalis sought to establish their own places of worships such as mosques and other amenities and services that would accommodate Somali culture including the kinds of cuisine that Somalis are accustomed to (Thompson, 2016). Initially, Somalis rented spaces for commercial use but as the number of migrants grew and became more established on 8th avenue, they begun to purchase property for business ventures that would help to sustain members of the Somali community. On the peripheries of most South African suburbs and cities lay impoverished townships which outline the racialised spatial divisions that were imposed during apartheid that continue to be prevalent more than 25 years into democracy. This is often where some Somali migrants choose to open small businesses and establishments to provide for their families despite the risk of being targeted by locals in the community (Thompson, 2016). Mayfair and Fordsburg offer crucial business networks with Asian and Indian wholesalers whom have enabled the establishment of Somali business enterprise (Sadouni, 2009).

Mayfair exists within a broader Johannesburg context with historical trajectories along racial lines. Landau (2009) explains that Johannesburg has experienced transitions post-apartheid allowing for black people to live in or occupy spaces that were restricted from them due to laws that existed under the apartheid regime. Johannesburg represents a space of inclusive and exclusion, and its landscape raises questions of identity, belonging and representation. Since the abolishment of apartheid, Johannesburg has experienced a significant increase in the amount of migrants moving into the city. According to Landau (2009), Johannesburg's many migrants who reside in the city do so due to the economic opportunities and resources available to them in what is referred to as 'the city of gold' where jobs can be secured and wealth can be attained.

According to Sadouni (2009), the Amal shopping centre in Mayfair was built specifically for Somali traders as a means of protecting the interests of Somalis and as a form of protection against external harassment such as theft or police harassment. This establishment represents a united Somali identity that transcends clan membership and is based on a system of trust. This commercial space is open seven days a week and mainly occupied by Somalis who work in the various restaurants and stores. The Amal centre symbolises a kind of ethnic solidarity and identity and indicates the various ways in which businessmen and women in Somali are shaping entrepreneurship in this region.

2.2.3 The face of trauma

While South Africa is perceived as a haven and a fortress for those who have been displaced, the realities of many migrants does not always reflect this. Somali refugees are often welcomed with great hostility, rejection, violence and discrimination. Sigsworth (2010) states that women are often solicited for sex and are expected to perform sexual acts or favours with officials at the border in order to gain access into the country. During the 2008 xenophobic attacks, many cases of rape among women migrants came to the surface however, it was discovered that these cases remained largely unreported due to fear of the police corruption, anti-foreigner sentiments and fear of further victimization by those in positions of authority. Pineteh (2017) states that police officials have often failed to protect foreign nationals and in many cases, have been spectators of crimes committed against them. What this illustrates is a double jeopardy faced by women migrants. Their nationality compounded by the gender, open these women to further exploitation and abuse (Sigsworth, 2010). Although theoretically South Africa's immigration legislature and laws claim to embrace and welcome diversity and is viewed as progressive; it appears the state has failed with regards to effective implementation of legislature (Landau, Ramjathan-Keogh & Singh, 2005) and in the process, left many vulnerable migrants disillusioned and perhaps retraumatised during the journey of migration and post resettlement. Studies show an increase in the risk of mental health illness among refugees is significantly higher than non-refugees (Thela, Tomita, Maharaj, Mhlongo & Burns, 2017). This risk is amplified due to pre-migration, migration and post-

migration phases that they are required to endure. Exposure to life threatening encounters, abuse, death, loss and being subjected to violence, predisposes these women to psychological and emotional distress which is likely to result in mental health illness such as depression, anxiety and post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) among other disorders.

The lives of refugees are often characterised by an immeasurable amount of significant losses such as physical loss which is described as the death of a loved one, and symbolic loss in the form of loss of identity, homelands and social status. This kind of trauma and loss predisposes migrants to a number of mental disorders including the development of somatoform disorders (Coffey, Kaplan, Sampson & Tuccia, 2010). Migrants also tend to exhibit signs of what is known as 'migratory grief' in which they experience symptoms such as numbness, yearning and searching, disorganization and despair and, if successfully integrated into their new host country, this is followed by reorganization (Haumei, 2017). Thela et al (2017) argue that much is unknown about the mental well being of refugees post migration. The authors contend that literature is saturated with information about refugees' psychological distress due to the impact of war and violence in their native countries but little exists about their adjustment to their new environments after resettlement.

When discussing mental illness of women in particular, a critical lens is crucial as our understanding of pathology is rooted in a deeply patriarchal system that often reproduces gender inequalities while choosing to overlook and minimise the systems that oppress women (Shefer, 2013). Atta, Cooper, Akpalu, Osei, Doku, Lund & Flisher (2010) argue that women's mental illness is viewed as intrinsic and natural to women. Women are perceived as inherently weak and incapable of managing stress and coping with hardships. Women are characterised in essentialist ways which serves to perpetuate gender inequality and, in some ways, they blamed for their own pain and suffering. Smit & Rugunam (2015) note that mental health and overall wellbeing are not to be considered as separate to the social and political context but are informed by these external dynamics. This is imperative because these kinds of discourses that naturalise and normalise depression, anxiety or the emotional distress experienced by women is likely to inform their subjectivities and whether they choose to seek

professional help to address the trauma they have encountered. Furthermore, this serves to highlight the complexities that women face as a result of their gender and also their nationality.

2.3 Race and racialisation

2.3.1 Pigment matters

When discussing racism, particularly within the South African context, the discourse associated with this topic has a strong propensity towards binary and rigid ways of conceptualizing racism. While there are many definitions for race and racism, Miles (2004) explains the process of categorising and classifying not only human beings according to race, but also categorising certain features of human beings and assigning meaning to these aspects as a form of racism. This refers to race being understood as undergoing a process of signification and representation embedded within history and ideology. Malik (1996) stresses that it is imperative to analyse humanity and racism through a lens that recognizes that race is socially and historically constructed.

Our conceptualisation of racism foregrounds the discussion regarding xenophobia and allows for exploration around this term so commonly used. It appears most scholars are in agreement that xenophobia is an irrational fear of foreigners however, this definition seems incomplete, reductionist and simplistic. Adjai & Lazaridis (2013) state that xenophobia is a new form of racism as it is entirely based on the discriminatory treatment of the 'other'. Tafira (2011) asserts that xenophobia involves racial discriminatory practices intended to 'other' foreigners and the discourse involved in discussing foreign nationals is one that consists of racial categories of difference. Harris (2002) describes xenophobia as the new pathology of democracy. Xenophobia is essentially the belief that one nationality is superior to another and this takes on the form of racial ideology typified by racism. The definition that xenophobia is an intense fear of foreigners has been problematized due to its prevalence being predominantly orchestrated towards African migrants (Landau, Ramjathan-Keogh & Singh, 2004) and rarely towards Europeans who are typically

viewed as tourists or foreign investors. Xenophobic attitudes and sentiments are embedded within a historical landscape of racism and a long culture of violence within South Africa.

State discourses particularly around xenophobia are implicit in perpetuating the stereotypes and conceptualisations of African migrants. The government, police officials and politicians frame migrants as criminals and paint an image of danger and invasion associated with migrants (Neocosmos, 2008). Furthermore, discourses of exceptionalism are used to position South Africa as a unique country that exists outside of Africa; an exception to the rule within the African continent. Finally, Neocosmos (2008) explains the concept of indigeneity which follows the premise that South Africa is not entirely a part of Africa and therefore the wealth, jobs and resources of the country are reserved for natives only. Interestingly, this notion appears to only apply to black African migrants and neglects to include Europeans who work and reside in South Africa and whom are also not natives of the land.

This leads to the conversation of intersectionality between class and race and who is considered alien and unwanted. Matsinhe (2011) explains that although poverty accounts for powerlessness and frustration about the socio-political climate among the majority of black South Africans, it does not explain why black foreigners are *specifically* targeted and not white foreigners. According to Handmaker & Parsley (2012), migration policy and implementation is premised on racist ideology. In several instances, European tourists have stayed in the country beyond the conditions of their visas and yet very rarely are they detained. Tshabalala (2015) puts forward that many white Americans and Europeans are referred to as expatriates and their presence is largely welcomed and their legal documentation goes mostly unquestioned by authorities. The majority of those who are detained are people who have darker skin complexions, brighter clothes, are not proficient in African languages, have a different accent (Uptin, Wright & Harwood, 2012) and who are perceived to have different phenotypical features to South African citizens. In the case of black African migrants, those who are considered as the 'other' are not necessarily criminalised because of unlawful acts committed, but are criminalised because of the degree of their foreignness (Aranda & Vaquera, 2015).

An emerging body of work attempts to make some distinction between afrophobia and xenophobia. Xenophobia is generally defined as the fear of the other however, afrophobia is conceptualised as the fear of the *specific* other namely the black other from other African countries (Tshaka, 2016). However, in some cases authors use these terms interchangably illustrating the tenuous and complex overlaps in both these concepts. Lamola (2018) describes afrophobia as an illness of the mind where the darker pigmented persons from the rest of the African continent is feared and hated. This term begun to gain traction after the 2008 xenophobia attacks that occurred in South Africa which raised necessary attention to the treatment of black foreign nationals by (some) South African citizens. Tshaka (2016) argues that white foreigners such as Europeans, Greeks or Bulgarians are perceived as contributing to the economy by virtue of their white skin and are therefore exempt from the kind of violence and discrimination black foreigners are subjected to. Borrowing from the work of Fanon, Tshaka (2016) posits that the ongoing hostility between black South Africans and black African foreigners can be attributed to what Fanon (1967) described as the "nervous condition". This notion is described as a complex situation in which the oppressed become willing participants and agents of their own oppression. This has been an effective strategy employed during slavery and colonization as it was used by slave masters to exacerbate differences between black people leading to devastating effects such as distrust, fear, envy and discord among the oppressed (Tshaka, 2016).

According to Thakur (2011) despite South Africa being located on the African continent, during apartheid the ruling government consciously and deliberately situated South Africa both ideologically and dispositionally in the western white world. This perpetuates discourses of exceptionalism but more importantly, shapes the ways in which black South Africans in particular have defined an African self as different and superior to the African 'other' who is perceived as poverty stricken, diseased, unintelligent and barbaric. Thakur (2011) argues that South Africans favour the position of viewing self and the country as un-African, as this implies a separation from the negative connotations associated with Africa as being underdeveloped and uncivilised. Lamola (2018) posits that the apartheid education system inculcated into the minds of South Africans that they are superior, better skilled and in a way "better

off" than people originating from other African countries.

Therefore there seems to be a sense of pride that is derived from being South African but an intentional distancing from not being associated with the rest of Africa. This is in alignment with Neocosmos (2008) who states that the reimagined South African identity resists being equated with poverty and lack progression which is how most South Africans perceive other African countries. The irony of afrophobia is that many black South Africans were too considered as 'foreigners' in their own country and were described as what Neocosmos (2005) explained as 'native foreigners'. Being a black South African citizen but being segregated through policies that existed in the apartheid regime legitimised and legalised primitivising of black people and accentuated differences between black and white people and in essence, positioned black people as foreign (Thakur, 2011).

2.3.2 Contesting Muslim universalism

What is poignant is the idea that xenophobia and afrophobia are directly linked to race, class, language, nationality, ethnicity, education, culture etc. These intersections cannot be viewed in isolation but each contributes to our understanding of discrimination against foreign nationals. Breytenbach (2006) argues that African migrants residing and working in the township areas are most vulnerable to xenophobic attacks. What then of African Muslim migrants residing within the suburban areas of Fordsburg and Mayfair? Does this statement imply that those outside of the peripheries of the townships are exempt from racial discrimination or xenophobia or does it occur in more subtle ways that are often overlooked? Vahed & Jeppie (2005) put forward that in South Africa, Indian people have remained largely isolated from black people and Islam has been historically viewed as an Indian religion. Furthermore, Vahed & Jeppie's (2005) research highlights tensions between Indian and black South African Muslims and states that black Muslims feel unwelcomed by Indians and are treated unfairly by Indian employers. This is at the crux of this research, as the research attempts to unpack and gain a richer understanding of these kinds of stories from Somali women who have migrated to the Mayfair/Fordsburg area.

The research indicates that Somali refugees have accused Indian Muslims of being racist and showing preferential treatment and bias towards Algerians and Tunisians seeking aid and assistance (Vahed & Jeppie's, 2005). It is crucial to note that both Algerians and Tunisians are light in complexion and their roots can be traced back to some Arabic and French colonial heritage and ancestry (Marshall & Stokes, 1981) and this is the main contention of black foreign Muslims. Vahed & Jeppie's (2005) findings challenge the idea of xenophobia being the motive for exclusion of African Muslims because if that were entirely accurate, there would be some resistance towards Muslims from other countries but in this specific instance, the discrimination is directed towards black Muslims in particular. This is made complicated by South Africa's racial segregation, inequality and historical landscape. Recognizing that xenophobia and afrophobia are firmly immersed in issues of race, racialisation and racism is crucial to unpacking and understanding the climate in which black foreign nationals exist. There is a strong sense of exclusion and marginalisation experienced by black South African Muslims and African Muslims by Indian Muslims (Vahed & Jeppie, 2005).

Vawda (2017) indicates that apart from linguistic differences and rituals, other indices of differentiation within Islam may include the varying levels of activity within the community such as mission work or adaption of moral codes such as that of piety and devotion to Islamic practices. Therefore an African Muslim from Somalia might disagree with South African Muslims based on doctrinal differences and perhaps emphasize some aspects of Islam to the exclusion of others. Mandivenga (2000) supports this by stating that both Malay and Indian Muslim communities are Sunni but each belongs to different schools of thought which means that they each follow different cultural traditions. There are several variations within Islam which inform the worldviews, practices and expression of Islam among different groups along racial and cultural lines (Vadwa, 2017). How do these differences impact the kinds of interactions and integration between African Muslims and South African Indian Muslims? In what ways does this contribute to feelings of exclusion or discrimination?

2.4 Class differences

In order to understand the intersection between race and class particularly within the South African context, it is imperative to locate this within a historical perspective. Mabandla (2013) argues that apartheid policies determined the way in which land was appropriated and how land ownership was paramount in the formation of the black middle class. The land areas act delineated specific areas of residence for black people and during apartheid; both the working and the middle class black were confined to the same areas (Khonou, 2010). Post-apartheid, some black middle class have chosen to relocate to suburban areas which were previously privileged for white people.

According to Krige (2012), the black middle class have access to opportunities such as better quality education and employment prospects which were not at their disposal during apartheid. Mabandla (2013) asserts that there is a distinction between the lifestyles, occupations and material possessions between the working and middle class black. Furthermore, Mabandla (2013) states that due to some economic access afforded to the middle class, the level of education of those considered black middle class has increased. What this indicates are the fractures *within* the black community where people are divided according to their class positions.

Thompson (2016) explains that lack of employment opportunities accessible to migrants encourage self-employment among Somalis who reside within the Johannesburg, Mayfair region. Through a process of differentiation and exclusion, Somalis within Mayfair established their own shopping centers where they can engage in trading and catering for other Somalis. Over time, Somalis began purchasing property and other structures for the purpose of expanding their businesses, which enabled the legitimisation of Somali enterprise within Mayfair and other surrounding townships (Thompson, 2016). Furthermore, Somalis' ability to remain connected with the Somalia diaspora is indeed a strength which has allowed for successful integration in Johannesburg. Their ability to improvise and adapt has proven to be a useful asset (Sadouni, 2009).

Thompson (2016) states that there is diversity exhibited by the Somalis in terms of their wealth, background and immigration status and cautions against

conceptualizing Somalis as a homogenous group. In contrast, Thompson (2016) illustrates the nuances in the experiences of Somalis along class dimensions. There is a subtle distinction made between wealthy Somalis who are business owners, employees and the unemployed compatriots living in abject poverty or who are impoverished. Wealthy Somalis have access to documentation and visas that allow for them to engage in business exploits as well as allow for economic engagement across South Africa and Somalia. The functioning of "spaza"[3] businesses in the townships is run on capitalist ideology and principles. Thompson (2016) explains that men working in Mayfair reported earning a higher income than those working in the township. The men in the former group comprise mainly of business owners, entrepreneurs and shareholders.

This division indicates the class distinctions *within* the Somali community itself with some people having greater access to resources due to financial stability and fruitful investments in property and businesses. This creates a divide within the Somali community where resources and access to privileged spaces within the Mayfair area, but more broadly in South Africa, are accessible to those who hold a middle class position. Therefore, Somalis who are categorised as working class (or poor) are prone to further victimization and discrimination. Sadouni (2009) contests the idea of an established middle class in the Somali community but acknowledges that the businesses run by Somalis may aid in alleviating poverty within the community. However, it is imperative to note that the economic landscape in and around Mayfair has developed and changed over the years suggesting the possibility of a middle class structure among Somalis.

Thompson (2016) states that securing employment within the Somali community is largely dependent on connections associated with clan membership. If an individual does not belong to the dominant clans, this may limit the kinds of employment opportunities available to him/her. The issue of gender is paramount in this discussion as most of the positions held in "spaza" shops are almost exclusively by males. This poses questions around attainability of a middle class position as a Somali refugee woman when their male counterparts predominantly occupy positions

[3] A term typically used in South Africa to refer to a small, unofficial shop located in either a township or informal settlement which is often based in a private house/property

of authority and power in business and other enterprises.

According to Vahed & Jeppie (2005), there is a significant discrepancy in income among the Muslim community with Indian people earning the most and black people earning the least. Black foreign nationals working for Indian people generally earn a lower salary than Indian people who occupy similar positions. Research also indicates that black South African people living amongst Indian Muslims strongly dislike them due to the ill treatment and discriminatory practices they are often subjected to (Vahed & Jeppie, 2005).

2.5 Culture, Identity and Belonging

2.5.1 Contested belonging

The politics of belonging as outlined by Yuval-Davis (2006) speaks to the socially constructed boundaries that operate to make a distinction between "us and "them" and essentially between who is accepted and who must stand outside of the peripheries of these invisible boundaries. Anderson (1983) refers to these boundaries as imagined as there is no legitimate or concrete way of determining who is included and excluded from these boundaried spaces. At the crux of Yuval-Davis's (2006) argument is that the politics of belonging function to maintain boundaries that are used to decide which individual or group of people belong inside or outside of an imagined boundary. Discourse is often used as a tool to determine belonging. In the case of African migrants, derogatory names such as *makwerekwere* imply a strange or different language which likens Somalis (and other African migrants) to a sub-human category. Mocking of their cultural food or choice of clothing is another form of dehumanisation. The politics of belonging is mobilized to reject the belonging of African migrants and the outbursts of xenophobic attacks as well as the more subtle forms of exclusion and marginalization serve as constant reminders that they do not belong in particular spaces.

McMichael (2002) argues that the concept of 'home' is not merely based on a structure or a fixed location but speaks about this concept as being a mobile anchor that provides stability and assurance amidst an unstable, changing environment forced

onto migrants and refugees. Furthermore, 'home' is to be understood as plurilocal and moving along with the individual. Pineteh (2017) contests essentialist conceptualisations of 'home' and argues that home is not necessarily located to a particular place as this notion would assume that human beings have natural and predetermined places of origin. Some studies convey the concept of home as an imagined physical location, imagined space or an emotional feeling of belonging. According to Pineteh (2017), the meaning of home and homelessness is continuously being unpacked and at times, presents contradictory and multiple understandings of this concept.

Christensen (2009) argues that there are three levels at which belonging can be understood namely: macro, meso and micro level. For purposes of this research, emphasis will be placed on macro and micro level analysis. At a macro-level, the notion of a nation state is considered an 'imagined community' because members within a particular country or state will never encounter, speak to or know all people within that land yet we hold onto the image of oneness with one another in our imaginations. It is also at this macro-level that issues of power, citizenship and inclusivity are contested. As previously discussed, propaganda by the South African government against foreign nationals and migrants delineate who is "authentically" a South African citizen and who is not. Pineteh (2017) adds that these kinds of discourses only serve to perpetuate an essentialist manner of conceiving belonging among South Africans thus creating a narrative of those who belong and do not belong. This is similar to tactics used by the apartheid government who cemented the concept of "spatialised understandings of rights and belonging" (Pineteh, 2017 p. 134).

At a micro-level, the concept of local belonging is analysed which interested in how comfortable people feel in the space in which they inhabit and how they feel about the inhabitants surrounding them. Christensen (2009) argues that 'belonging' is not a confined structure known as home but is instead socially constructed, subjective and embedded within context. The length of time spent residing in Johannesburg does not necessarily translate into emotional feelings of 'belonging'. Sadouni (2009) supports this view and states that most refugees living in Mayfair do not feel nor recognise the area as a place where they 'fit in' or belong despite some residing there for several years.

Feelings of belonging occur in a complex reflexive process where people assess and make meaning of how they came to live exactly where they have chosen. Elective belonging refers to the spatial attachments formed, a sense of connectivity to others within that space and social positions that one occupies within those spaces. Christensen (2009) argues that a sense of belonging is largely dependent on whether people, in this case Somali women, feel they can attach their biographies to the space in which they have chosen as their residential location in order to make meaning of who they are and how they have become who they are. Pineteh (2017) adds that the concept of 'home' and 'belonging' is embedded in attachment and an emotional connectedness to one's sense of identity and lived experiences. Shared migratory experiences and xenophobic violence endured by Somalis has also fostered a strong sense of unity among the Somali community and reinforced feelings of belonging based on their collective identities and shared histories (Sadouni, 2009). Somalis are a part of the 'transnational imagined community' which is still in the process of unfolding and evolving.

When thinking about representations of the 'other', there are many questions related to who belongs and who does not? Who is allowed access into particular spaces and who is denied access? This speaks directly to space, belonging and identity. In thinking about the way space is experienced, it is paramount that we remain cognizant of how race shapes and to some extent determines how that space will be occupied (Ahmed, 2007). According to Fanon (1967) discourses about black people are mostly degrading and dehumanizing and typically framed as problematic. Ahmed (2007) explains that the stereotypes about blackness place a sense of uncertainty and restriction on black bodies. How one moves within a particular space is generally influenced by whether there is a sense of belonging experienced in that environment.

In a world where whiteness has become normative, those who are 'non-white' are simply constructed as the 'other' (Fanon, 1967). Even the term 'non-white' assumes whiteness to be the normative standard by which blackness is compared (Steyn, 2001). This is further complicated by the inclusion of culture. The question then becomes what kind of cultures or cultural practices are considered as 'civilised' or 'uncivilised' which in itself is a form of separating who 'belongs' and who does not. Also, what 'kind' of African is the acceptable African in South Africa and by whose

standards is this determined? These are some of the complexities that Somali Muslim women are plagued with on a regular basis as they negotiate their way within these transitional spaces.

2.5.2 A complex construction of identity

When conceptualising about the culture of Somali people, it is a complex terrain making a distinction between culture and religion. Wangila (2010) argues that Islam is such an integral aspect of the lives of Muslims and that much of their daily lives are organized and legitimised by religion. This makes it incredibly difficult to determine how much is culture and how much is religion; both are so intricately intertwined. How Somali women make sense of their lives and their gender roles is predominately through the lens of religion. Tilikainen (2003) states that in many instances, a Muslim identity is regarded as more important than a Somali identity, highlighting the complexity of detangling religion from culture and identity. The Somali identity seems to be associated with experiences of continuous war, loss, trauma and tragedy whereas Islam may represent dignity, peace, integrity and hope (Tilikainen, 2003). The construction of a religious identity has allowed Somalis to oppose stereotypical portrayals of Somalia (and by association Somalis) as poor and uneducated by choosing to privilege a Muslim religious identity in the hopes of dignifying the Somali image (Sadouni, 2009). In referring to the culture of Somali women, complicit with this is their religious affiliation and practices, as these concepts are interconnected and inform their daily practices and belief systems.

Religion as an identity also emphasizes the collective shared histories, culture and practices of people as opposed to the view that it denotes only a shared theological belief among people (Gunn, 2003). This is further supported by Sigamoney (2018) who argues that religion cannot be viewed in isolation or to the exclusion of Muslim women's political or social life as it informs their every action and their way of being in the world. Therefore, when discussing the cultural experiences of Somali Muslim women in this research, this includes the role of religion which is embedded into culture. However, Holzer (2008) argues that although religion is a central aspect of Somali identity, Somalis take pride in their own customs, traditions and culture. Vawad (2017) posits that the ways in which Muslim people

from different geographical regions embody and express their faith is varied and is influenced by culture. Sadouni (2009) extends this view by adding that Somalis have acculturated to some aspects of urban culture but retained their culture and language while being firmed positioned within Islam. Culture encompasses language, food, clothes, music, behaviour, belief systems and ways of viewing the world. Sonn & Crux (2010) define culture as common shared beliefs, values, practices and norms among a group of people. Therefore culture can be defined as a shared pattern of behaviours and interactions, cognitive constructs and ways of understanding the world which occurs through the process of socialization.

Colic-Piesker (2005) states that the effects of forced migration have a profound impact on the construction and reconstruction of identity. The author argues that one is stripped of his/her identity and is temporarily reduced to nothing but a term such as "refugee" and simply diminished to physical appearance as well as phenotypical features. There is an ongoing series of negotiations, renegotiations and adjustments that Somali women are engaging with regularly in the host country (Palmer, 2009). These women reposition themselves accordingly as they contend with an ever evolving Muslim identity in a foreign country. The way in which Somali women present themselves is constituted of not one but several domains that intersect and influence the identities that these women adopt or disavow at any given time. Pineteh (2008) states that the cultural identity of many Somali women is one that is contended post-settlement and wrought with political ideologies and cultural divergences both between Somalis and among other ethnic groups within South Africa. An ever-present tension exists between retaining one's culture and customs and adapting to life in a new country.

Spitzer (2007) argues that with forced migration, migrants are forced to reorganize themselves and make new meaning of their social environment as well as form a new identity in a new space. This disruption in spatial organisation and the move to a new country creates spaces and opportunities for the formation of different gender relations as a result of acculturation and adaptation. (Lefebvre, 1991) argues that space and identity are intertwined and the political context in which bodies move between spaces allows for either constraints or possibilities. Somali refugee women do not passively exist within the spaces they find themselves but are also agents of

production and are integral to the social fabric of the city of Johannesburg. These women have some agency and there are spaces that they feel most comfortable and free to occupy while other spaces may feel restrictive and threatening in some ways.

The spaces Somali refugee women occupy in Johannesburg will also be dependent on their level of income that would determine where they reside as well as their dependents such as their children (all the women in this study reported having children) and spaces that would be safe for them to occupy. The intersections of race, marital status, gender, class, linguistic abilities and nationality would be imperative to consider as each of these dimensions in some way restrict or allow for movement within the inner city Johannesburg. Therefore, space is considered as integral to identity because of the ways in which space is occupied (Lefebvre, 1991).

Although socially and discursively defined by their displacement, some Somali migrants are able to form social networks and adopt practices that allow them to participant in the economy of South Africa (Thompson, 2016). However, McMichael (2002) argues that despite efforts to form new social networks in their host countries, some Somali women's narratives of their new environments portray a sense of loss of trusted social networks, identity, family and culture. Tilikainen (2003) mentions the disintegration of the family unit and echoes the sentiment of a loss of culture. The author also elaborates on the challenges experienced by some Somali women in preserving their cultural practices in their host countries, especially with regards to the upbringing of their children who are exposed to different cultures and traditions in their host countries. Palmer (2009) argues that for many refugees, they are not only geographically displaced but in many ways, they tend to feel culturally "out of place" in terms of preserving their Islamic traditions in westernised countries. This may impact Somali women's construction and preservation of a Muslim identity. Not only do these women contend with the challenges of acquiring an identity of one who is displaced, they are also tasked with having to find ways of positioning themselves within difference and sameness of the spaces they occupy.

Tilikainen (2002) explains that Somali women engage in daily practices such as house keeping, attending to the nutritional needs of the family by cooking and child caring activities that includes frequent visitations to the maternity clinics. These routine activities help to provide structure and stability post resettlement and can be

perceived as coping mechanisms which help Somali women regain control over their lives but more importantly, this is a way of retaining their religious identity. Daily prayers and religious practices provide order to deal with the overwhelming demands placed on Somali women which suggests a temporal continuity of 'home' provided by Islam (Tilikainen, 2002). Religion is articulated as an anchor of stability, consistency and collective unification despite displacement. It is also an identity to which many Somali migrants hold onto.

What is paramount to the issue of identity is to contextualise it within a sociopolitical and historical landscape. Hall (2000) posits that identities are not fluid, but are ever evolving and are informed by intersecting discourses, practices and positions. Identities are not formed in a vacuum but are influenced by the political, social and cultural conditions that underscore this complex formation, negotiation and construction of identity as a social being (Palmer, 2009). Identity is constantly in the process of change and transformation and should not be considered as singular, binary or static (Hall, 1996). Furthermore, the question of identities is in itself productive in that it has to do with "using the resources of history, culture and language in the process of becoming rather than being; not 'who we are' or 'where we come from', so much as what we might become, how we have been represented and what that bears on how we might represent ourselves" Hall (1996, p4).

In pursuit of understanding identity, be it cultural, religious or racial identity, Mkhize (2013) cautions against a westernised conceptualisation of the self which is viewed as a bounded and autonomous entity independent of social and contextual factors, but insists on adopting an encompassing lens which locates the self, and therefore one's identity, in terms of relationships with others such as family, the community and one's position within these groups. As Palmer (2009) states, Somali women's representations of self in the world is constituted relationally and socially. Identities are therefore constructed within and not outside or independent of discourse; identity occurs through a complex process of recognition that we construct self in relation to the 'other' (Hall, 1996).

2.5.3 Language and power

According to Wa thiong'o (1986) language is not primarily for communication but fundamentally serves as a carrier of culture. Bagwasi (2003) adds that language embodies one's identity, culture and socio economic status. What this illustrates is a complex and interwoven relationship between language, culture and subjectivity. This also highlights the difficulty of detangling language from culture, race and identity. Bourdieu (1997) argues that language holds a significant ability to control and subdue people indicating that language is not neutral but fuelled with power. Kamwangamalu (2003) explains that language is a salient symbol of ethnicity and carries with it both the past and the future.

In the context of Somali female migrants, the inability to comprehend and communicate in the dominant language of the land predisposes them to discrimination and alienation but perhaps, more importantly, it becomes as a marker of difference and serves to 'other' people. The inability to articulate oneself in any of the official South African languages (including English) is not only problematic on the basis of making communication more efficient but also because, one's language provides clues about one's culture, heritage and traditions. Wa thiong'o (1986) explains that the history of a people, their collective identity and their values are intertwined aspects that are carried by language. What this suggests is that Somali migrants are not only rejected on the basis of their lack of proficiency in English and/or other African languages, but also shunned due to the meanings attributed to their culture that further accentuates their foreignness. Language is a marker of identity and difference. What might appear as a simple greeting is in fact a loaded interaction where the listener engages in a process of locating and identifying the speaker. This dialogue is not merely about communication but it is about determining where the speaker comes from, deciding whether he/she belongs and if he/she is one of "us" or one of "them"-it is a complex process of othering.

Ragunanan & Smit (2011) explain that refugee women experience language barriers when attempting to access healthcare services and job opportunities, as many are not proficient in English (or other African languages). Karibu (2012) states that difficulties in language acquisition can have consequences for assimilation into a new environment and impedes communication with locals with may result in migrants feeling alienated or isolated. The lack of proficiency in the dominant language(s)

hinders the kinds of opportunities available to refugee women and also impacts on their sense of agency as some rely on interpreters to communicate their needs on their behalf. Crush (2007) argues that women migrants are most vulnerable to name-calling, abuse and discrimination from people in positions of authority such as police officials and medical practioners. The common threats migrant women are most confronted with include solicitation of bribes and sex, extortion, intentional destruction of legal documentation and generally apathetic treatment when seeking legal assistance or basic services.

The adaptation of a new language is typically easier for the younger members of the family that usually results in children becoming language brokers for their parents. Morales & Hanson (2005) state that migrant children proficient in English meditate for their families in multiple spaces on a daily basis. Children are often required to translate and interpret for their relatives and family members in different contexts and according to Orellana (2001), this also includes assisting in resolving conflicts between their parents and the police. This role as mediator and interpreter holds a significant amount of power where children not only adopt a parentified role in some cases but is also an assertion of dominance by these children through their fluency in English. Martin (1991) explains that young girls proficient in the dominant language assume economic roles that may not be accessible to their parents due to their parent's lack of proficiency in the dominant language. This has implications for family dynamics due to the imbalance of power and the subversion of roles within the family system.

The issue of language coincides with accent. According to Creese (2010), accent provides some indication about the speaker's racialised body without having evidence to support such an assertion. In other words, one's accent gives us some clue about his/her race without visual confirmation. Matsuda (1991) argues that we each have an accent by default but positions of power determine what is regarded as 'accented' and unaccented English. This is referred to as linguistic ideology (Lippi-Green, 1997).

Accent discrimination has economic and social consequences. Creese (2010) indicates that individuals with strong African accents seeking employment

opportunities are usually undermined and ridiculed due to their accents. Furthermore, British and Australian accents are perceived as unaccented however, an African accent is deemed undesirable and distasteful primarily due to being embodied in black skin. Bourdieu (1997) explains that accent is linked to authority and power. Within the South African context, language is used to single out black foreign migrants who speak with a different or "strange" accent and who are deemed as not speaking with the "right" accent. Lippi-Green (1997) argues that a foreign accent does not interfere with communication but that the negative stereotypes and perceptions held about foreigners is mainly responsible for miscommunications that do occur during dialogue. Therefore, black migrants are discarded or rejected not only because they cannot articulate themselves in the dominant language but also because they have the 'wrong' accent. Therefore, accent serves as a marker of difference and racialization. Language and accent are a form of embodied cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1997) and language can be used as a tool of exclusion and a way to 'other' those who do not comprehend the language (Hungwe & Gelderblom, 2014) or who do not speak in a desirable manner.

For many migrants, language is used as a form of policing and surveillance. Karibu (2009) explains that policemen often raid migrants and insist on evidence of documentation and proof of legal citizenship. During these altercations, language serves an imperative function to identify citizens and foreign nationals. Individuals who cannot understand or speak isiZulu (or another South African language), are usually labeled as foreigners and are typically arrested and detained. In most cases, the insistence of proof of legal documentation is less about legality but has more to do with exposing the individual, in this case suspected foreign nationals, as being the 'other' and as not belonging. It is a way of ousting the foreigner and finding him or her guilty on the basis of being foreign irrespective of their actual legal status.

This occurs behind the backdrop of the growing tensions of language politics within the South African context where English continues to hold economic power but where there is resistance against the language, as its significance remains contentious and in some cases, is viewed as a threat to other African languages (Rudwick, 2008). According to Malan & Walker (1991), the fear of language genocide by South African citizens may be a contributing factor to the rejection of black migrants, due to the introduction of other African languages into a pre-existing

hostile context where language politics remains problematic post apartheid. This illuminates the complex intersection between an individual's nationality, culture, language and accent within a foreign land and highlights the multilayered experiences of Somali refugee women living in South Africa.

2.5.4 Tribalism as pervasive

The term 'tribalism' is one that has been heavily contested within academic spaces and there has been a preference for referring to it as ethnicity or sub-nationalism. Despite the lack of consensus among scholars regarding terminology, there seems to be a general understanding that tribalism is conceptualised as both a political and cultural unit that holds great significance in the way countries like Somalia are governed. In this study, this will be referred to as tribalism as the participants referred to several issues as embedded within different tribes and did not refer to these as having much significance to ethnicity.

It is imperative to locate tribalism within the historical landscape of Somalia in order to gain some perspective of the significance of tribal affiliations and loyalty and how this continues to play out in the everyday lives of Somalis even post settlement in South Africa. Tribal conflict and divisions in Somalia have a direct impact on politics within the land and contribute to the instability of the state. The Somali nation consists of six major tribes namely Darood, Digil, Dir, Hawiye, Isaaq and Rahanwayn. According to Terdiman (2008), Somalis are divided into clans and sub-clans with the average number of people in each clan amounting to approximately 100 000 people. Within each sub-clan there are lineages and groups that can be differentiated into categories such as clan, clan-family, sub-clan and other groups that may vary in size (Gundel, 2009). The clan system is considered the social fabric of Somali culture and social life. Clan membership is crucial as it determines the amount of prestige and political capital afforded to an individual based on their clan membership and association. Furthermore, the struggle for territory and power among the clans is pervasive in Somali politics as it provides a framework for one's social, political and economic rights and freedom afforded to people based on one's clan.

Terdiman (2008) explains that there are four noble clans in Somalia and

minority clans. Those referred to as noble are believed to share a common Somali ancestry whereas the minority clans are said to have mixed ancestry (and are therefore inferior). There are some Somalis who originate from Arab countries and others from African countries such as Tanzania. There are physical features that are different depending on one's lineage and bloodline. Although the dominant religion in Somalia is Islam, there are variations in terms of culture among the Somalis due to the amount of tribes that exist.

The movement of people, particularly migrants, across national geographic borders has also created a space for cultural exchanges. In migrating to South Africa, Somalis have also carried with them their culture and cultural practices which continue to prevail in the communities in which they settle in. Such an example is that of tribalism and differentiating one another based on lineage and descent. The politics of tribalism experienced in their homeland Somalia, continue to play out in nuanced ways within the spaces they occupy in South Africa particularly in Mayfair. The kinship system proves to be beneficial in many ways post settlement. Sadouni (2009) argues that the clan society provides cohesion and guiding principles by which Somalis govern themselves however, the practical expressions of these evolve over time and are dependent on the current conditions Somalis find themselves in. Thompson (2016) explains that securing employment post settlement can be challenging without the support of one's tribe or if a tribe is not well represented in the business sector. Therefore, the success of integration into the new host country is also dependent on the existing established networks particularly within the tribal system.

Tribalism is not unique or exclusive to other African countries and is in fact prevalent within the South African context. This can be likened to the intragroup hostilities found within certain ethnic groups such as Zulu speaking people (although not exclusive to this specific ethnic group). Masenya (2017) argues that people in South Africa who do not belonging to the dominant ethnic groups are also at times, victims of violence and discriminatory behaviour from people in dominant ethnic groups. Moodley & Adam, (2000) add that the intra-group tensions characterised by the number of deaths and violence among ethnic groups at times exceeds the enmity

between black and white people specifically in the Kwa-Zulu Natal region. This rivalry continues to prevail post-apartheid and highlights the ethnic divides that threaten racial unity and harmony not only between black and white people but also within the separate racial groups. Tshishonga (2015) inserts that the legacy of apartheid is responsible for the current divides that are not only manifested along racial lines but also on the basis of ethnicity.

2.5.5 Power, gender and culture

The Somali clans are classified according to a hierarchical patrilineal system that originates from a single male ancestor (Terdiman, 2008). The manner in which the clan system is organized is rooted in a patriarchal system with a sense of belonging and worthiness being attributed to one's male ancestor. Members within the Somali society are valued not only based on personal attributes and characteristics but primarily based on the success or virtue of their forefathers. In other words, preeminence is placed on male ancestry, to the exclusion of females, while overlooking the role of females in one's lineage. Terdiman (2008) explains that over time, there was a shift towards replacing the matrilineal organisation of Somalis with a patrilineal system and ethos.

There is a great emphasis on the role of men within all the various tribes and in the government however, there is a lack of female engagement in the political arena. Women are faced with various challenges in the political sphere and their interests are rarely represented, as politics remains to be a male dominated space. Another key component in lack of female representation within politics is the lack of education afforded to women in African countries including Somalia (Mohamed, 2017). The underpinning assumption is that women are inferior to men and should therefore not engage in issues that are reserved solely for men. Lack of access to education among women is located within the broader scope of patriarchy.

Sultana (2010) describes patriarchy as male domination within public and private spaces and refers to this interconnected relationship of men and women as one comprised of power. Patriarchy is understood as a tool to understand systems that

allow and perpetuate the subordination of women and to gain some perspective on the realities of women's lives. Patriarchy refers to the institutionalisation of male dominance in society which limits the rights and access to power that women have within these institutions. However, this is not to assume that women have no power or agency but it is important to recognise that this power is limited and restricted.

Migration and the change in the economy has allowed avenues for women to participate in trading and business which has resulted in a change in gender roles where men were traditionally the breadwinners in the household (Sigamoney, 2018). Women entering spaces that have been predominately dominated by men is challenging the status quo and opening new opportunities and ways of being in the world for women. Somali women migrants are also presented with these changes post resettlement which may be difficult to adapt to because this may contradict or challenge their religious or cultural belief systems. However, this has not deterred migrant women from trading and providing for their families (Sigamoney, 2018).

2.5.6 Whose body is it anyway?

Part of the contention in Somalia was around the issue of regulating how women dress and debating whether they should be fully or partially veiled (Holzer, 2009). This raises issues around the policing of women's bodies. Sheffer (2013) argues that through the social objectification of women, a great emphasis has been placed on how a woman presents herself that includes the way she moves, her body shape, weight and facial characteristics. These are the inscriptions placed on women's bodies which have been culturally as well as historically constructed. Therefore, men and women are located within a discursive power relation where women are positioned differently and in an unequal way to men (Sheffer, 2013). In Foucauldian terms, when a girl is disciplined by an elder or authority figure for behaviour that is deemed as 'unlady like' what is really being disciplined is not the behaviour itself, but rather her *non-conformity*. This is what Foucault describes as disciplinary power which seeks to correct, control and keep people in line (Smart, 2002).

Foucault (1991) explains that disciplinary power can operate both by means of punishment, but also rewards for conforming to normative behaviour. The unveiled

woman is likely to feel an immense amount of societal pressure to behave in ways deemed appropriate, and may begin to consciously monitor and correct her own impulses and behaviour because she is aware that she is under the gaze and scrutiny of others and must adjust if she wishes to be accepted and embraced. This is the effectiveness of disciplinary power, which Foucault (1991) describes as a source of normalization because restrictions and oppression are normalised and appear to be natural, and a way of life. This extends beyond how women look but also to the ways in which sexuality is expressed.

According to Ussher, Perz, Metusela, Hawkey, Marrow, Narchal & Estoesta (2017), discursive construction of normalcy around sex and sexual expression are mediated by race, religion, class and culture, and determine the sexual scripts women are allowed to adopt as well as determine the extent to which women can resist these expectations or scripts. The way in which women experience their bodies and sexualities is rooted in a broader historical and social context as well as cemented within patriarchy.

Foucault's work also focuses on the way sex and sexuality has become a public governmental issue that requires administration and management (Smart, 2002). The act of sex is confined to particular private spaces and to couples who are legally bound together through marriage. The politics of sex means that sex is enmeshed in issues such as those of health, economics, morality, religion and population control undertaken by the state. Discourses about sex determined by those in positions of power inform what is considered as desirable and acceptable ways of expressing sex and with whom. The ways in which Somali women experience their bodies and sexualities is deeply entrenched in issues of culture, religion and identity. These dynamics will also inform how they choose to represent themselves in their communities and influence their subjectivities and how they experience their bodies within certain spaces.

2.7 Conclusion

The Experiences of Somali women migrants is multilayered and complex and it is along these contours and struggles that they navigate their place in their new host country and forge a life for themselves and their families despite the discrimination, violence and racism they encounter and endure on a macro and micro level. The experiences and identities of Somali refugee women at the intersection of race, class, nationality, culture and gender need to be recognized in a holistic manner and understood as mutually constitutive. This chapter intended to problematise, challenge and contest the limiting ways of viewing the experiences of refugee women by adopting an intersectional lens interested in offering a multilayered and diverse perspective.

Chapter Three

Theoretical Framework

3.4 Introduction

The theory of intersectionality has been spearheaded by Crenshaw (1991), McCall (2005) and Hancock (2007) whom have contributed significantly to our present understanding of the intersection of multiple inequalities in gender theory by rejecting the notion that gender is a single understanding of identities; providing a rich depth of understanding of the insights and experiences of women. Walby, Armstrong & Strid (2012) explain that these theorists oppose the idea of generalising the experiences of women without recognition that social life is complex and therefore, fixed categories of understanding identity and difference limits what we come to comprehend about inequality in our society. This theory has been selected intentionally because it aligns with the values and principles of community psychology which is interested in empowerment and giving voice to those who have been historically marginalised in society.

3.5 The birth of intersectionality

As a logical point of departure, a brief contextual background of the genesis of intersectionality theory is necessary. Kimberle Crenshaw, an African American woman who, while working in the legal system, coined the term 'intersectionality' (Nash, 2008) in response to the colour-blind neutrality and lack of objectivity in the legal system. The concept of intersectionality was introduced in the 1980s by black women belonging to feminist movements in the United States of America (USA) to address the lack of representation of black women in academic literature, knowledge production and the exclusion of black women's voices in a large body of work pertaining to the experiences of women (McCall, 2008). The work of Crenshaw (1991) critiqued and interrogated the invisibility of black women specifically at the intersection of gender and race/ethnicity and highlighted the limited and singular understandings of women's identities and experiences by failing to recognise the significance of gender *and* race in their subjective experiences. Furthermore, Crenshaw (1991) states that the intersectionalities or interactions between gender,

race and class serve to restrict the access of black women in the American labour market and circumscribe the understanding of the black women's experiences in society.

Crenshaw (1991) expands on this theory by stating that previous literature treated one social identity, such as gender, as *the* dominant identity category to the exclusion of class, race, ethnicity, nationality and sexual orientation and this narrow approach operated to exclude and marginalise black women from social discourse, analysis and politics (Walby, Armstrong & Strid, 2012). At its core, intersectionality theory is interested in dissecting the complex differences and sameness of gender politics in a context of anti-racism and other social and political movements (Cho, Crenshaw & McCall, 2013). Intersectionality examines categories such as race, class, gender, nationality, immigrant status, age, religion and ethnicity in order to understand the complexity of how these categories intersect in social life.

Crenshaw (1991) describes three categories of intersectionality namely structural intersectionality, political intersectionality and representational intersectionality. Structural intersectionality refers to the differences between the ways that white and black women experience domestic violence, rape, abuse and remedial reform. Political intersectionality critiques the ways in which antiracist and feminist agendas have actually contributed to the marginalisation of black women despite claiming to do the opposite. For instance, a white women from Europe is less likely to be discriminated against because she is a foreign national however, a black Somali woman is more likely to be ill-treated, discriminated against and victimized. Representational intersectionality refers to the portrayals and representations of black women in the media, popular culture and cultural imagery that are often stereotypical in nature. For instance, Somali Muslim women are likely to be portrayed as poor and uneducated whereas a white European women may be portrayed as intelligent, wealthy or prestigious. These categories highlight the different levels at which oppression and discrimination occurs differently for black and white women.

3.3 Approaches to intersectionality

McCall's (2005) work introduces three approaches to intersectionality and posits that there are different approaches that can be used to analyse intersectionality namely: intra-categorical, anti-categorical and inter-categorical (Walby, Armstrong & Strid, 2012). An intra-categorical approach focuses on certain social groups and where inequality intersects at different points. Intra-categorical complexity refers to people whose identity does not conform to traditionally constructed types of identities but rather, reveals layers of complexity of lived-experiences. Anti-categorical intersectionality refers to the deconstruction of existing analytical categories thus acknowledging that by allowing these categories to be maintained in essentialist ways is problematic and reinforces the very same structures the analyst wishes to change (Walby, Armstrong & Strid, 2012). Lastly, inter-categorical approach is described as exploring relationships of inequality *among* social groups and how this inequality exists across multiple and conflicting dimensions. This approach focuses attention on inequalities *within* categories and does not solely make reference to inequalities or differences between them.

With regards to the Somali community, there are not only differences in terms of gender or ethnicity (which would be analysing inequalities between categories) but when one examines differences or inequalities *within* the category of gender, there are a few considerations which impact on their lived experiences. Women who are born into the most dominant or "prestigious" tribe may have access to more employment opportunities or may have more cultural capital than women born into what is considered the lowest tribe. This is an example of inequalities within categories that add further complexities to understanding one's identity and how different factors impact on how these women experience and navigate the world.

McCall (2005) elaborates by stating that this approach reveals that there is no singular or master category of identity but that this complex matrix of categories influences people's experiences on multiple layers. This has opened a plethora of possibilities about identities and allowed for the exploration of "relationships among multiple dimensions and modalities of social relations and subject formations" (McCall, 2005 p. 1771).

Hancock (2007) introduces three approaches that are used to analyse categories of difference such as race, gender, class and other categories namely unitary, multiple and intersectional. Unitary approach assumes one category is examined at a time and remains stable and is the primary factor, for example gender being analysed unilaterally. In the 'multiple' approach, many categories are examined and regarded as having equal importance to one another and to have stable relationships with one another. The intersectional approach is the analysis of more than one category considered to have relationship with one another as categories that are fluid and not considered static. These categories are thought to be equally important and are mutually constituted (Walby, Armstrong & Strid, 2012). The emphasis is on an intersectional approach in which one category is not considered dominant but all are considered as interlocking.

According to Kwon and Adams (2018), although minority women are exposed to inequalities on multiple levels specifically within the workplace, the authors cautions against the temptation to generalise all women's experiences without exploring the complex intersections of different identities. However, intersectionality is not to be reduced to a theory that highlights differences between identities but as a lens to explore complexity in the human existence by considering social and political factors that shape these unique experiences. An intersectional lens acknowledges the social and political changes that occur in society and how these transitions impact on the intersectionality of identities. It further acknowledges where race appears more salient than gender in certain contexts or where nationality appears more important than race depending on the socio-political climate (Moolman, 2013).

The xenophobic attacks that have occurred in South Africa over the past decade highlight the issue of intersectionality between race and nationality. It is imperative to note that such xenophobic attacks have been directed at black foreign nationals and not white foreign nationals. This illustrates the complex intersectionality between nationality and race and how it operates and performs in society.

When thinking about social inequalities, intersectionality acknowledges that the organisation of power structures within society are best understood as existing not

only on a single axis such as race or class but as being intertwined in a complex matrix of axes which influence the lives of individuals and groups in society (Gray & Cooke, 2018). In this sense, intersectionality is political in nature and seeks to redress injustices and inequalities by rooting out normative understandings of women's experiences in the hopes of bringing out positive social change (McCall, 2005).

Moolman (2013) explains that social identities are formed and shaped by social institutions and that one cannot ignore or overlook the ways in which history and 'place' are key elements that help define our identities. The view of intersectionality posits that one identity such as that of race is not independent and does not exist outside of other dimensions such as class, gender, nationality, sexual orientation, age, immigration status, religion and other inequalities. In other words, identity and experiences are not shaped by one identity alone but rather through a series of complex intersections with other identities. Being a Muslim, female and foreign national shapes the ways in which these women navigate certain spaces and how each would describe their everyday experiences.

3.3.1 Matrix of domination

The 'matrix of domination' refers to the varying social inequalities and aims to describe how people are socially positioned based on differences that exist from one another (Collins, 1990). This emphasizes how the differences among people, which consist of categories such as race, class, gender, nationality and age, serve as additional oppressive processes. An example of this would be that both Asian and African refugees face similar challenges and obstacles in their shared experiences as displaced people however, the challenges that African refugees face on the basis of their race (and issues of afrophobia) are likely to be greater and more complex struggles than Asian refugees.

The idea of the matrix of intersectionality has two main focuses or designs. Collins (1990) explains that first design is premised on the idea that social structures have a particular association or relationship with intersecting systems of oppression. The second design asserts that these systems of oppression are embedded through

four specific interrelated domains of power namely structural, disciplinary, hegemonic and interpersonal. Collins (1998) argues that identities that people embody such as race, class, gender, nationality, sexuality and ethnicity form mutually constructing aspects of social organisation. It is these very features or aspects that shape, mold and inform women's experiences and in turn, are also shaped by women. Collins (1998) strongly advocates for intersectionality and argues that it provides a new framework about social phenomena that makes inequalities and power dynamics visible.

Collins (1998) argues the importance of developing an appropriate analysis of groups of people bearing in mind the hierarchies of intersectionality are not the same and therefore oppression cannot be viewed to be equivalent or equal for different groups of people whose identities appear on different axis based on race, gender, class or nationality. In the author's most recent work, Collins (2015) brings attention to power relations and social inequalities and notes three interdependent elements that are crucial in defining intersectionality using conceptual tools to provide context.

These elements suggest that intersectionality can be viewed as a critical process that contributes and influences social justice projects. Collins (2015) argues that academic literature and research work significantly focus on identities with very little attention offered to issues of social inequalities and social injustices. Furthermore, Collins (2015) critiques the failure of feminist scholarship to acknowledge multiple social contexts that people operate within and instead view these as universal. Taking this into account, this research study is particularly interested and cognisant of the place within which Somali women exist and operate on a regular basis.

3.4 Limitations of intersectionality

Intersectionality has provided a framework for exploring oppression and discrimination and is a useful tool, however there remain some paradoxes and tensions with the widely used theory that warrants discussion. These issues are mainly centered on lack of defined methodology and inclusivity, the quintessential use of black women as intersectional subjects, its individualistic approach to structural issues,

a vague explanation of salient identity categories and its application.

3.4.1 Inclusivity

Nash (2008) argues that there is a disconnect between what feminist theories are proposing in the quest for equality for *all* women, whereas intersectionality is primarily focused on the experiences and injustices against specifically *black* women. Carathathis (2014) argues that intersectionality purports to be inclusive in its quest to transform feminist theory and contribute to centering the experiences of marginalised and oppressed groups yet positions itself within the politics of predominantly women of colour. The argument is that intersectionality seems to be solely interested in the experiences of black women which suggests that this framework is not inclusive of women of other races (Nash, 2008). The issue of representing the voices of black women who have been historically marginalised, oppressed and discriminated against is not the primary issue perse but rather, the illusion that intersectionality is premised on the idea of inclusivity and a broad representation of women's subordination and oppression in a prejudiced and patriarchal system.

Furthermore, the fundamental problem with a theoretical reliance on using black women's experiences lends itself to the possibility of representing a monolithic and unitary entity of black women. At times, in attempting to present a category of 'the black woman' can result in the differences between black women's experiences being overshadowed or obscured. In other words, there are tensions and contradictions in pursuing to highlight the multiplicity of identities within a black woman's experiences along the lines of race, gender, sexuality etc. yet simultaneously seeking to cement a unified category of 'black women' against the categories of 'black men' or 'white men' (Nash, 2008).

3.4.2 The scale of intersectionality

From a decolonial theory standpoint; intersectionality is based on individual

oppression as opposed to how communities experience oppression. Marxism focused on the oppression of classes, not individual subjects within class. Therefore this theory is individualizing to some degree and fails to be extended to groups of people as it is predominantly focused on individual experiences along multiple intersections. Racism occurs at a systemic and institutional level and not an individual level therefore, individual experiences are only a small component of a greater more powerful system.

The argument here is to move beyond individual experiences and look more closely at how institutions function to shape experiences. Nash (2008) argues that another shortfall of this theory is that it neglects to provide ways of understanding how privilege and oppression intersect informing black women's subjectivities. There is a focus on the marginalisation (race, gender and nationality) and multiple privileges (such as being a middle class white woman) however, it is uncertain how these converge.

The other pertinent question is "who is intersectional?". Is it only those who are marginalised who have intersectional identities or does this encompass other groups of people (Bastia, 2018)? If intersectionality is rooted in representing those who are disadvantaged or subordinated, does that imply that those who are privileged do not have intersectional identities (Nash, 2008)? This further emphasizes the need for understanding how oppression and privilege intersect to form people's identities and experiences.

3.4.3 Methodology

Nash (2008) argues that there are methodological issues with this framework and its application. The question posed is how many intersections are there and what measures are used to analyse or assess these intersections? For instance, Crenshaw provides a vague comprehension of how race and gender function as social processes in distinct ways for different black women at varying historical moments. This implies that the experiences of black women are considered as trans-historical and in so doing, shape these experiences in an essentialist manner as it presupposes that all

black women constantly experience the intersection of race and gender in similar ways across history. Bastia (2014 p. 8) argues that the theory of intersectionality "is limiting in terms of its generalizability and what it can tell us about the ways in which individuals with different identities and positions of power in society negotiate power."

For Bastia (2014), there is an over reliance on binary ideas to explain the multiple burdens and multiple discriminations faced by black women, suggesting that there is no concrete or sound methodological approach for intersectionality. Gray and Cooke (2018) contend that it is unclear whether intersectionality should be conceptualised as a theory of individual experiences, a theory of identity or a framework for unpacking social and cultural discourses. While McCall (2008) provides three main approaches to 'doing' intersectional research, scholars argue that these do not provide a comprehensive methodological tool that can be widely applied in research (Gary & Cooke, 2018). Another matter debated among scholars is whether or not intersectionality is focused on micro, meso or marco levels. Bastia (2014) argues that it tends to adopt an individualizing approach while other authors argue that it focuses on macro level processes which include structural inequalities (Gray & Cooke, 2018). The point is that there is little consensus among scholars about the levels at which intersectionality challenges oppression and discrimination which has methodological implications for research.

3.4.4 Identity formation

The premise of intersectionality is based on the notion that there is no unitary or singular identity but that there are multiple identities that overlap in various ways however, what is unclear is at what point is one identity foregrounded in a particular moment to the exclusion of other identities? For instance, is a Somali refugee women being treated differently from a South African male citizen at the hospital based on her nationality or her gender and how would one know how this woman is being interpellated in that moment? If the answer to this question is that she is rejected on the basis of her nationality and gender, does this process always occur simultaneously? Intersectionality offers a nebulous understanding of how individuals deploy or mobilise certain aspects of their identities at different points in time (Nash, 2008).

This is further supported by Carathathis (2014) who argues that it is often not possible to determine which category is salient in a particular moment and on what grounds a woman is being discriminated against at a given time and who gets to decide which identity is more important in that moment?

Lastly the issue of power is contested and it is questioned whether intersectionality has offered a new theory of power (Bastia, 2014). The limited theorization and centralization of power and its role in the formation of identities is another weakness of applying an intersectional lens. Intersectionality is useful in that it demonstrates the interconnectedness of various identities such as race, class and gender in relation to one another but neglects the "historically grounded and context-s pecific analysis of social relations of differences in order to avoid depoliticising and simplifying complex realities" (Bastia, 2014 p. 11).

3.5 Where to from here?

The value of intersectionality cannot be understated or denied as it has provided a tool for analyzing oppression at multiple levels. However there is the necessity to move from intersectional analysis to intersectional politics; a politics that acknowledges differences and making alliances across them. As Chang and Culp (2000, p. 400) note, "it's one thing to say that race, gender, sexuality, class, and nation operate symbiotically, cosynthetically, multidimensionally, or interconnectedly. The next step is to be able to prescribe or imagine points of intervention". While there has been much theorizing and unpacking of what intersectionality is, the question is, now what? Merely identifying levels of oppression and speaking to the injustices of black women is a significant initial aspect however, what may now be required is to determine how this fits into a larger theoretical and political project (Nash, 2008).

Crenshaw (1991) urges that political strategies should engage with intersectionality beyond a superficial level and begin to take the necessarily steps to address inequalities. "…it is time for intersectionality to begin to sort out the paradoxes upon which its theory rests in the service of strengthening its explanatory power." (Nash, 2008, p. 13-14)

3.6 Conclusion

Despite its limitations, the transformative nature of employing an intersectional lens for understanding human experiences and complexities remains a valuable analytic tool. It is a tool most suitable in exploring the racialised and cultural experiences of Somali females in a foreign land where intersections of class, race, religion, gender and nationality as well as other social identities shape their experience of belonging and alienation outside the borders of their home country. Intersectionality as a tool of analysis takes into account complex power structures, social context and is interested in social inequalities. It is from this multilayered and rich perspective that the reader will gain a rich understanding of the lived experiences of the participants in this research study.

Chapter Four

Methods and Methodology

4.1 Introduction

This chapter outlines the research design, data procedure, and data analysis and offers detailed information of the participants and their backgrounds. It provides information on issues related to the trustworthiness of the study, ethical considerations and discusses some issues related to the use of an interpreter. Reflexivity is mentioned in this chapter but discussed at length in a separate chapter.

4.2 Research Questions

1. What are the racialised and cultural experiences of Somali Muslim women living in a Muslim Community?

2. What are the everyday lived experiences of Somali Muslim women within their Muslim community?

4.3 Research Design

The researcher conducted a qualitative study and employed Interpretative phenomenological analysis (IPA) in the research study. Qualitative research is especially significant in this kind of study because, unlike quantitative research, it offers richer quality of data into the experiences of the participants that cannot be quantified using numbers. Qualitative research is concerned with understanding and uncovering meaning from people's experiences and their perceptions. According to Atieno (2009), this kind of research is important because it takes into account the whole situation and analyses the complexities of the experiences of people.

Atieno (2009) explains that qualitative researchers are concerned with process more than what they are about outcomes. The researcher plays a pivotal role in

collecting the data and the quality of information retrieved from the respondent is largely dependent on the rapport established between researcher and the researched (Silverman, 2006). Qualitative research acknowledges the researcher's biases and invites the researcher to evaluate their own position in relation to the context of the research (Willig, 2013). Using qualitative research allows data collection through semi-structured interviews that allows further probing on comments made by the participant in the process.

It is important to locate IPA within the phenomenological paradigm as it has its theoretical origins in phenomenology and hermeneutics. Husserl first theorized phenomenology in 1931 as a way of understanding and unearthing the lived experiences of participants as well as their meaning (Alase, 2017). Phenomenology is not only descriptive in nature but is also interpretative as it is primarily concerned with unpacking lived experiences and meaning making. This kind of approach is centered on researching groups of people who have encountered the same phenomena to explore the commonalities and divergences in these experiences.

The 'meaning making unit' in phenomenology is concerned with transforming the experiences of research participants into psychological expressions that give insight into what it is like "to be in someone else's shoes" (Alase, 2017). Furthermore, what is particularly useful about phenomenology is that it provides in depth data collection and analysis unlike general inductive approaches. It seeks to convey feelings into words and text. Alase (2017) argues that the combination of adopting a critical and interpretative approach to help interpret the lived experiences of research participants is necessary when conducting phemenological research. "Interpretive paradigm can explicitly and interpretively narrate how the phenomenon has impacted the 'lived experiences' of the research participants." (Alase, 2017 p. 12).

According to Smith, Flowers and Larkin (2009), IPA is a qualitative research approach that is committed to examining major life experiences of people. They also view people as sense-making creatures who are continuously processing their experiences. IPA is particularly concerned with phenomena as one engages with the world and began as a psychological-orientated approach (Alase, 2017). The way phenomena are experienced is dependent on a number of factors that are subject to the

perceiver (Willig, 2013). These factors include-but are not limited to- the context and location of the perceiver, their emotions, mental orientation, judgments and wishes. This method explores, in great detail, the way participants make sense of their world, perceptions and experiences (Smith and Osborn, 2007). Alase (2017) adds that IPA allows for participants to tell stories about their lived experiences without distortion or persecution.

This is essential because it highlights that people can experience the same phenomena in a particular environment in diverse and unique ways (Willig, 2013). Interpretative phenomenological analysis (IPA) is a method that derives from phenomenology and is well suited to meet the objectives and aims of my study. IPA is also useful because it allows for critical questions to be asked about the stories and experiences being shared by the participants (Smith & Osborn, 2007). It also offers room for the researcher to understand the "innermost deliberations" of the lived experiences of participants (Alase, 2017).

IPA recognises and is aware that in order to capture the experiences of participants, the researcher is implicated in this process and therefore acknowledges his/her viewpoints and subjectivity towards the research (Willig, 2013). What this means is that the researcher can only *interpret* the data as expressed by participants and can never truly claim to *fully* access the experience of the participants. According Smith & Osborn (2007), IPA involves a double hermeneutics. The first stage consists of the participant making sense of their own world and their position within it and the second stage is the researcher simultaneously trying to make sense of the participant's world and their experiences.

IPA is dedicated to understanding the lived-experiences of participants (Smith & Osborn, 2003) and focuses on the "here-and-now-moments" which further justifies its purpose in the research. The individual cases of participants are explored in great detail before general claims are deduced from the narrative accounts of the participants (Smith & Osborn, 2003). IPA acknowledges that one's thoughts and emotions are interconnected and that part of interpreting data is being cognisant of this chain of connection (Smith & Osborn, 2007).

Dynamic topics that are interested in areas of identity, the self and subjectivity are best investigated using Interpretative phenomenological analysis (Smith & Osborn, 2003). This method of analysis speaks to the heart of the study which is interested in understanding the ways in which Somali Muslim women make sense of their identities and experience the world around them. Smith & Osborn (2007) note that there is no singular or definitive way of doing IPA.

With regards to qualitative research, IPA has made some significant contributions to mainstream psychology in terms of epistemology, methodology and a corpus of studies (Smith, 2004). IPA employs qualitative analysis in order to analyse its findings and make interpretations thereof. One of the characteristics of IPA is that it is interrogative in nature that means that it shares constructs and concepts with mainstream psychology and attempts to shed light on existing research.

4.4 Participants

The Cohort of participants consisted of seven females from Somalia who migrated to South Africa for the sole purpose of seeking asylum due to the political unrest in their country of origin. Three of the participants reported that they had lived in different provinces such as the Eastern and Western Cape before relocating to Mayfair, Gauteng. The sample included participants from diverse tribes within the Somali community. All seven of the women in this study identify as black and each practice Islam. The different contexts and social environments that these participants are exposed to in their individual lives offered interesting insights to their lived experiences. The small pool of participants is consistent with IPA, which seeks to unpack the richness and depth of people's experiences, and is less interested in quantity but more concerned with quality of data (Alase, 2017).

All seven of the participants had a Section 24 permit. A section permit 24 states that a refugee is someone whose application for asylum has been considered successful. The acts clearly stipulate that an asylum seeker and/or refugee is entitled to reside and work in South Africa without fear of deportation however; the reality for most asylum seekers contrasts this.

The participants were aged between 18-65 and each had more than one child. Three of the participants indicated that their children currently reside in Somalia and due to lack of resources, they are unable to transport them to South Africa therefore; family members are caring for their children. One participant reported that some of her children are deceased and the whereabouts of her other children is unknown. Four of the participants are widows whose husbands either died during the war in their native countries or in South Africa during the xenophobic attacks. Two of the participants are currently legally married but the whereabouts of their husbands is unknown. One of the participants remarried upon arrival in South Africa and currently resides with her husband.

At the time of the research being conducted, none of the participants were formally employed but each was part of the informal business sector. Additionally, they also received social grants from the government to supplement their income. The home language of the participants is Somali. Majority of the participants are not proficient in English and five out of the seven required the continuous use of an interpreter. Two possess a basic command of the language however; they were unable to converse fluently with the researcher at some points of the interviewing process and requested the interpreter to explain more complex ideas and thoughts.

4.4.1 Table of participants

Pseudonym	Age	Nationality	Sex	Language	Marital Status
Participant 1	32	Somali	Female	Somali and Fluent English	Married
Participant 2	27	Somali	Female	Somali and basic English	Married
Participant 3	53	Somali	Female	Somali	Widow
Participant 4	49	Somali	Female	Somali	Widow
Participant 5	29	Somali	Female	Somali	Widow
Participant 6	51	Somali	Female	Somali	Married
Participant 7	48	Somali	Female	Somali and basic English	Widow

4.5 Data Generation Procedure

Initially, a purposive sampling method was used as the Centre for Study of Violence and Reconciliation (CSVR) was approached to recruit participants. The researcher was directed to one of the male interpreters employed by CSVR who introduced the researcher to a female residing in Mayfair. The first recruit assisted the researcher in identifying other female participants as well as offered to act as an interpreter. The female interpreter is affiliated with CSVR and at the time of the data collection process, was in the process of being trained as a lay counselor. Due to her prior schooling and education in Somalia, she is fluent in both English and Somali. Furthermore, she was also an active member in Mayfair and was able to contact some potential participants as she resides in the area and was familiar with a number of women in her community who might be interested in sharing their experiences. A distinction is made between an interpreter and a translator. Both are closely related in terms of linguistics however, the main difference is that an interpreter is someone who repeats what is said out loud in a different language (as in the case of this research),

enabling cross-linguistic communication. A translator is an individual who renders text from a source language into a target language that is done in written form, which the interpreter was not involved in (Suryasa, 2016).

The initial male interpreter did not participate in any of the interviews due to awareness of cultural dynamics and his presence as a male affecting the quality of data retrieved from the participants. Thereafter, the snowballing method was used to recruit participants within the Mayfair area. The seven participants whose narratives are used in this study consist of individuals who were available and willing to engage in the interview process. Retrieving participants was challenging in that a number of women seemed dubious and weary of the researcher's intentions and reluctant to engage with issues of race and cultural practices which are issues that may be considered private or may be associated with some shame, especially when discussing traumatic experiences which might include sexual abuse or physical assault. Their reluctance around sharing their experiences may also be rooted in fears of being ousted or reported to the police or authorities which would threaten their safety and that of their families. The intention was to recruit at least ten participants however, this proved to be difficult as most women who seemed willing were either working during the day and could not meet outside of working hours or there were few neutral spaces that we could meet in where participants would feel comfortable discussing such personal content.

With the use of the interpreter, each potential participant was informed that the study is one that has to do with race, culture and identity and the researcher expressed her own personal vested interest in this topic by explaining her prior work experience with refugees. These individuals were given an opportunity to ask questions and only willing participants formed part of the cohort. The use of an interpreter was integral in this process not only to bridge the language barrier but also to provide the participants with a comprehensive understanding of the nature of the study to ensure that their consent was well informed and their participant voluntary. Prior to conducting any interviews, the interpreter was briefed on issues of confidentiality and the importance of informed consent. She was also informed to rely the questions in a non-biased way

and as accurately as the original question posed in English. A more detailed account of how the interpreter engaged with the participants is discussed later in the chapter.
The method of collecting data was done through in-depth semi-structured interviews with each of the participants. This sample size is normative for IPA because great detail is dedicated to each case (Brocki & Wearden, 2006). The researcher met the first two participants in their home (they live together and are relatives) with her supervisor. The supervisor accompanied the researcher due to potential concerns about safety as most of the participants preferred to meet in their residences and requested against meeting in public areas within Mayfair.

One of the participants who was interviewed first did not require the use of an interpreter, as she had a basic understanding and command of the English language however, the researcher was accompanied by the interpreter to each interview as she assisted with retrieving and connecting the researcher with the participants as she had established some rapport with participants prior to the date scheduled for each interview. The setting of each interview was not ideal as all of the participants were interviewed in their respective homes and due to the limited amount of space within the homes; often family members, particularly children, were present when the interviews were being conducted. While this did not interfere with the interview itself, the researcher was aware that some content may be retraumatising to their children or may have been inappropriate to share in their presence. When the researcher and the interpreter sensed this, children were encouraged to wait outside of the residence or we moved to the bedroom where we conducted the interviews while seated on the floor.

Interviews were approximately sixty to ninety minutes per session per participant. The one-on-one interviews provided rich information about the participants' ideas, feelings and thoughts which may have been restricted if the individuals were in the company of others such as focus groups (Smith, 2004). The decision to use semi-structured interviews stems from the premise that this will allow room for free expression and follow-up questions about ambiguous or unclear comments or statements made during the interview by the participant (Willig, 2013),

especially because of language barriers and a lack of in depth understanding of the contextual issues some of the participants were referring to about Somalia.

In this study an audio recording device was used when conducting the interviews. After each interview, each recording was transferred to the researcher's personal laptop in a discrete folder. The laptop is password protected and only the researcher has access to it. The recordings were transferred to ensure that there would be an additional copy of the recordings in the unlikely event that the original recording device would get lost or damaged. Once all the interviews had been conducted, transcription took place. In order to aid the time-consuming and laborious process of transcription once all the data had been collected, it was crucial that recording devices be of excellent quality because behaviours such as pausing, correction of speech, change in tone of voice, emphasis on certain words or points and any interruptions must be indicated on the transcript. The manner in which data are transcribed has implications not only for the meaning of the text but also the manner in which the findings are interpreted affecting credibility and transferability of results (Willig, 2013).

4.6 Data Analysis

The researcher analysed the data using IPA and the four-stage process by Smith & Osborn (2007) was followed in order to interpret the data as accurately as possible. There are several authors who provide steps on analysing data using IPA however, the above-mentioned authors were considered as the most appropriate. IPA recognises that there are different levels of interpretation that can be employed. This, according to Smith (2004), is what makes qualitative distinct from quantitative research because it creates room for complexities of psychological processes. Smith (2004) does not give prescribed outlines for analysis but gives suggestions about how to go about analysing the data.

4.6.1 Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis

In the initial stage, audio-recording devices were listened to repeatedly and the researcher transcribed the data. The interpreter was not used for any research related tasks such as transcription as she volunteered her services and was not enlisted as a research assistant apart from translating questions *during* the interviewing process. The reading and re-reading of individual cases was done at this stage. Smith & Osborn (2007) suggest that during this process notes should be made by the research based on language use, context of participant and any descriptive comments based on the researcher's initial thoughts and observations during interview process. These notes are recorded in the left or right margin of the text. Each individual case was analysed and significant themes extracted from what these participants experienced and how they self-identified. This is what Smith (2004) refers to as an idiographic commitment to each individual case.

The second stage of analysis entailed identifying and labeling emergent themes from each section of the text. These themes were recorded in another margin next to the initial margin where comments were noted. The themes need to primarily capture the experiential quality of the participants' accounts and Osborn & Smith (2007) suggest that psychological terminology be used to differentiate each theme. This also entailed exploration of relevant information that is linked to or answers the research questions at hand. In coding the data, the researcher employed a theoretical driven analysis in which data was coded due to the specificity of the research questions that focuses on issues related to race and culture. The researcher worked around an intersectional theoretical framework that guided how data was coded.

The third stage involved looking for connections between themes identified in stage two and constructing meaningful clusters from these themes. This process involved active reading and engagement with the data. It is imperative to immerse oneself within the data. It is in this process that the researcher begins to make meaning of the transcripts and where both verbal and non-verbal cues are noted and later used as part of interpreting the data.

In the final stage of analysis, a summary table was produced in which super-ordinate themes were tabulated and subordinate themes were listed beneath these. Quotations from the interview transcript were included as these helped to capture the quality of experiences of the participants. In this final stage, producing the report entailed the analysis of the themes, selecting what is important, compelling and relating this information to literature and to the research questions at hand.

The role of the interpreter was also crucial when analysing the results. Wong & Poon (2010) argue that the interpreter is not objective or neutral (in the same way the researcher is not) and the interpreter's way of knowing and understanding will have some impact on how he/she understands and narrates the stories of participants. Therefore open dialogue and critical reflection is encouraged between the researcher and the interpreter. Wong & Poon (2010) emphasize the importance of including the interpreter in the research process. Therefore, at the end of each interview, the interpreter was provided with an opportunity to share her thoughts and feelings on the process and was also allowed space to reflect on her role. After each interview, the researcher and the interpreter had a short debrief regarding the interview.

4.6.2 Trustworthiness of Analysis

Within qualitative research, the idea of reliability is irrelevant and does not serve the same purpose as in quantitative research (Bashir, Afzal & Azeem, 2008). According to Stenbacka (2001), the concept of reliability is misleading in qualitative research and that the inclusion of reliability should not be a criterion as this affects the intention of qualitative research. Therefore instead of using the term reliability, scholars have substituted this concept with credibility.

Credibility refers to the manner in which research was conducted in light of integrity, validity and the accuracy of which the data was interpreted or conveyed. Aspects such as the experience brought forward by the researcher to the study are important when deciding on credibility of the content of the study. The credibility of the interpreter was also crucial in this research as it had to be ascertained whether she was fluent in both Somali and English as she would be required to explain complex

concepts of racism and discrimination to the participants as well as be able to convey this information back to the researcher. As previously mentioned, the interpreter was affiliated with CSVR and indicated that she had been used as a interpreter in other capacities and it was based on this experience and recommendation that she was selected to assist with the research study.

Dependability is the equivalent to reliability used in quantitative research and states that the dependability of a qualitative study is based on whether there is a level of consistency in data examination; collection and the way notes are processed for evaluation or interpretation. (Bashir, Afzal & Azeem, 2008). Ensuring that the supervisor of this research was involved in all the crucial steps of data collection and checking of transcripts increased this.

The issue of trustworthiness is crucial to reliability and is at the core of qualitative research. It is achieved by ensuring that the research is of high quality as this also increases the likelihood that the results can be generalised. There are various strategies and techniques that were used to increase trustworthiness. Lopez, Figueroa, Connor & Maliski (2008 p.1728) argue that all research conducted with the use of a interpreter should "reproduce as accurately as possible the source text, use the natural form of the target language, and express all aspects of the meaning in a manner that is understandable". Before interviews took place, this was stressed to the interpreter who was also given an opportunity to read through the interview schedule and familiarize herself with the questions, as she would need to translate the questions to Somali.

Secondly, once transcription had taken place, the researcher's supervisor checked the accuracy of the transcripts against the recordings to which the supervisor had access. Themes that were identified from the transcripts were thoroughly examined against the original transcripts provided to the supervisor and upon approval and verification of its contents, the findings were reported. The researcher employed the use of continuous reflection and a personal reflection diary was used throughout the process as the nature of the research evoked certain emotions in the researcher. This reflection diary was used to assess and reflect upon the researcher's own opinions and any personal biases he/she may possess about the subject matters in

the research (Shenton, 2004). These reflections were also discussed during supervision, as it was imperative to determine in what ways the researcher's experiences and feelings were shaping the way the data was analysed. So as to maintain the integrity of the findings, the translations are written verbatim and in the exact way that these ideas were expressed; no corrections were made so as to not distort meaning.

The issue of transferability in qualitative research is deemed to be subjective and impossible because situations or phenomena that occur and are studied are specific and unique to the participants directly involved in the study. This makes it difficult to conclude that the findings are applicable or relevant to other contexts and people.

4. 7 Reflexivity

Alase (2017) makes a strong argument for a thorough and in depth, step-by-step exploration of the researcher's self-reflection that led to the finality of the research study. Reflexivity should not be a simple or superficial exercise and should be considered an integral aspect of the research process as "one must have a sense of 'one-self' and the true understanding that one is truly intruding into another human beings' private space (life)" (Alase, 2017 p. 18). With this in mind, the researcher has provided a comprehensive and critical exploration of self in relation to both the participants and the community members of the Mayfair community. Reflexivity is therefore located in the concluding chapter of this research study (chapter six).

4.8 Ethical Considerations

After ethical clearance was received from the University of the Witwatersrand's Ethics Committee (MACC/18/008 IH), the researcher proceeded to recruit participants. Despite initial hesitation to participate in the research, participants were constantly made to feel comfortable and at ease and this was accomplished through verbal and non-verbal gestures. A practical example of ensuring participants were comfortable was to allow for them to take charge of the direction of the interview. While participants shared painful memories, the researcher was mindful to

be empathetic and allow space for raw emotions. Participants were informed (by the interpreter) that they could decline from answering a particular question or discontinue with the interview at any time should they feel uncomfortable or experience difficulties sharing some parts of their experiences.

In order to establish rapport, the researcher introduced herself from the onset to the female interpreter and explained her affiliation with the university and provided context about her own personal interest in this research study. Prior to any interviews being scheduled, the informed consent document (appendix attached) was discussed at length with the interpreter who was provided an opportunity to ask questions about the contents stipulated on the document. At the beginning of each interview, the interpreter explained informed consent to each of the participants and their rights were foregrounded from the beginning. Each participant was asked to sign the document before proceeding with the interview. Issues of confidentiality and anonymity were also discussed and participants were informed that no identifying information would be revealed in the process of transcription or in the final research paper. Consent was obtained from the participants before audio-recordings took place. The researcher observed the interpreter before each interview to ensure that she went through the entire contents of the consent forms. The interpreter was also informed to repeat the questions to participants as closely as possible to its original meaning in English and in the same order as the researcher had relayed it. Finally, after each interview had been conducted, the participant was informed of organisations such as CSVR and UNHCR hotline where they could obtain free counselling services should they wish to do so. These contact details were also provided to the participants.

Refugees are considered a marginalised group as opposed to a vulnerable group (Thela, 2017), thus there were no ethical dilemmas regarding the population group. This is a subjective stance but in line with the theory of intersectionality, the participants are viewed as marginalised due to the multiple levels of oppression they have had endure but more importantly, are perceived as agents of change and not victims; but rather, subjects who have a voice. However, being conscious of the trauma that they have endured and the potential of evoking emotions and unveiling past hurts, therapy was discussed to the participants and was in fact encouraged. Towards the end of the interviews, the researcher provided some information about

the services offered where they can seek psychological assistance and learn more about symptoms they have been noticing, as some eluded to symptoms which may resemble a mood disorder, anxiety or PTSD to name a few. This was considered as imperative as most of the participants were unaware of the services offered at the CSVR or had a misconception about seeking help. The interpreter was also able to provide more information as she explained that before being a interpreter, she had utilized the services at CSVR to assist with her personal challenges with mental illness.

4.9 Conclusion

This chapter provided information about interpretative phenomenological analysis and the reasons behind employing a qualitative research study. It also explored the implications of using an interpreter in this study and how issues of reliability and credibility were mitigated. It also explored ethical considerations that were central when conducting this research. Furthermore, this chapter outlined key aspects of the sample of participants.

Chapter Five

Findings and discussion

5.1 Introduction

This chapter explores the main themes and subthemes that emerged from the research. The primary themes are pain and suffering, ethnic divisions, patriarchy and ideology as well as race. The first theme highlights the perpetual trauma endured by the participants, how their suffering is normalised and how trauma is transmitted intergenerationally. The next theme discusses tribal conflicts and internal class divisions that exist within the Somali Muslim community. The third theme explores issues of religion and the impact of patriarchy in the everyday experiences of the participants. The last theme consists of subthemes related to dehumanisation in public spaces, isolation in personal spaces, loss of community and feelings of disillusionment expressed by the participants.

5.2 Pain and Suffering

This theme chronicles the journey of the participants from their country of origin and explores the perpetual trauma they endure; how their suffering and pain has been overlooked and how traumatic experiences are impacting on the wellbeing of their children.

5.2.1 Perpetual Trauma

The journey to South Africa by African migrants in search of protection, asylum and a promising future is not one that is experienced without challenges, uncertainty and anxiety. The dangers that migrants are faced with include crossing a crocodile-infested river, walking through a game reserve inhabited by wild animals and facing the possibility of becoming victims of robbery and vicious abuse at the hand of opportunists who prey on migrants (Hlatshwayo & Vally, 2014). Should migrants survive this initial phase of danger upon escaping their native lands, they are then subjected to further violence upon arrival at the South African border. Criminals

take advantage of undocumented migrants and force them to partake in criminal activities (Hlatshwayo & Vally, 2014) by threatening to expose them to the relevant authorities. Pre-resettlement and post resettlement, migrants are exposed to extreme violence and trauma (MacDonald, Kluck-Gillis, Strunin & Cabral, 2010).

A number of testimonies foreground the civil unrest and political instability in Somalia and outlines the context and uncontrollable circumstances which led to their inevitable escape from Somalia. The participants paint a graphic image of Somalia and convey stories characterised by victimization, a sense of powerlessness and bearing witness to horrendous crimes occurring against a background of lawlessness and insecurity in Somalia (Pineteh, 2017).

I was a maid in Saudi and after uhm 29 years, I was saving some gold, the Muslims wear a lot of gold and I was putting in tin and I counted as my treasure. When I come back to Somalia even though there is a war, I cannot give up on country then I experience a looting because they know I had the treasure. They come in the middle of the night, we don't have electricity and when I wake up, there were guys with a mask on the face and they ask for the treasure. They hit me on the back of the head, when I turned around, the stab me with a machete and they take everything they want to take. If you are Muslim in Arab country, it is more miserable than African country, those people they mistreat people like animals. That is how I got bruises and trauma and I decided to come to South Africa… There was a lot of hunger and weeping when I was in Somalia. I helped women who were raped… (Participant 6)

Participant 6's experience is centered on immense personal loss. She makes specific mention of the significant amount of years and time she sacrificed to ensure that she would return home (Somalia) with what she refers to as her 'treasure'. She views her savings as valuable, precious and it seems she derives pride from having acquired this possession. She portrays a strong sense of patriotism for her home country by returning after years of absence yet this is met with devastation, powerlessness and further victimization by her own countrymen. There is a juxtaposition of life in an Arab nation and life in Africa, with the former being depicted as an abyss of hardship and anguish. For this particular participant, 'home' is not fixed and is uncertain. She has spent a significant portion of her life as a foreigner and continues to experience this. The term animal emphasizes the dehumanization she experienced for nearly three decades and ironically, upon her return to her home country, she was subjected to a similar experience where she was stabbed with a

machete; much like an animal being slaughtered.

Actually we are from a good family, even in Somalia, we studied and went to madrassa but then my dad was killed in the war…Then in 2008/9/10, there was an Al Shabaab that was ruling the country. Around the end of 2008, they start giving rules that you have to wear the big hijabs and scarves and the black hijab and go out like that. You had to wear red socks on your period and whoever disobeys they will end up being killed. We were 8 children at that time and I was the eldest. My mom told me to obey and I said I cant because the heat in Somalia is too much and she said then id have to go to Kenya or another country to do what I want. (Participant 1)

In this extract, the participant refers to self in the past tense and contrasts the kind of lifestyle and upbringing she was accustomed to prior to the war with the unexpected changes that occurred as a result of the political unrest. She describes herself and her family as having had a good social standing in society which was characterised by privileges such as having access to education and being well learned. The inheritance of the war in her home country brought real social consequences for this individual who initially lost her father and then later lost her other family members upon fleeing. As she travelled for freedom, safety and in fear of her life, she also travailed along this journey. Her right to life and freedom came at a great price, as she was involuntarily separated from her friends, family, home and a life filled with meaning. There is a fracturing of her identity as one who "came from a good family" to one whose family is now torn apart, broken and perhaps, no longer good.

She also illustrates the ways in which women's bodies were monitored and surveiled and how their freedom to decide how they adorn their bodies was restricted. There is also the assumption that women ought to be controlled as they might behave impulsively, or in this case immorally through infidelity, and therefore these restrictions and laws are justifiable. There are also limitations placed on women's sexualities and how they choose to express their sexuality. It is worth noting that these restrictions were primarily placed on women and not men highlighting how gender and religion intersect to create oppression. She expresses feeling suffocated physically, emotionally and psychologically. She mentions the climate in Somalia as being "too hot" describing a physical discomfort that came with the constraints forcibly placed on women. Her decision to flee her country suggests an emotional and psychological burden where she may have felt powerless and leaving meant she would gain back

control over her body and begin feeling empowered again. The participant was hopeful that life could be better elsewhere.

The experiences of some participants highlight the precariousness of moving from one space to another in search of a kind of utopia in South Africa. However, their testimonies are often charged with stories of gross human rights violations, forced displacement from Somalia and a well of traumatic experiences and images (Pineteh, 2017). Upon arrival, refugees are often tasked with having to find means of survival in a foreign land and are not exempt from continuous acts of violence and trauma by locals in South Africa. Several accounts detail participants witnessing indiscriminate killings of family members.

(Cries) I arrived in 2010 and the biggest difficulty that I faced was when I was pregnant and my husband was killed by gang members in the townships. The unborn child didn't get to see her father before he passed away. My husband was delivering goods to the location, if they see you with a car you know, they think you have money and there is a lot of looting there. So they shot my husband and they tried to keep it from me for 20 minutes after he was killed so I don't go into shock because I was pregnant at the time. I was new in the country; I knew nobody and I had no relatives. When I heard the news, I fell down on my stomach, while pregnant, and I was taken to the hospital and had a C-section to safe the child. (Participant 4)

When I come to SA, I had three kids and I was pregnant the time I come in 2010 and I come. So 2000 I come and I start work, I was suffering and had three kids with me. I marry a man and he got big shop, he helped with rent and family you know. Three guys from Mpumalanga, they shot him and he wasn't dead, he was sick, he go to Helen joseph and then he passed away and he left me with four kids. The one was 4 months. I start work, I got to Gauteng in the locations. I use taxi and when we pass taxi Middleburg, they pulled me on a gun and they pull me and beat me and beating me badly [laughs] (Participant 3)

I do not have any money to resettle in other place expect Mayfair. The way they beat and torture my husband, until now he is in the house and he can't do anything (Participant 6)

We were in Cape Town and I have two girls and I had all kids in South Africa. Then he moved to PE in the town and the time the husband was killed in front of me, he shot him in front of me. At the time my husband was killed, the children were 2 years and 4 years and I went through a lot of trauma… (Participant 7)

The accounts of these women speak of suffering and pain as existing on a continuum and shaping the realities of their daily lives and existence. For most of the participants, their lives post resettlement is embedded in unspeakable and unexpected loss. They are left to pick up the pieces of their lives without the support of their husbands while adopting a new identity as a widow in a foreign country. The women explain leaving their initial provinces where they resettled and found their way to Gauteng. This seems like a search for a new beginning, a fresh start and an attempt to recollect and make meaning of their tragedy. There are feelings of loneliness and being alone which further exacerbates the loss and feeling lost in an unfamiliar and unsafe space. Participant 3 describes some heart wrenching experiences but uses humor and laughter as a defense to conceal the pain she has had to endure and survive for the sake of her children.

You cant go to taxi rank without guard assigning you to a a taxi and uhm last month two Somali women were raped… sometimes you are in taxi and they kidnap you and say they want the money, bring to Shoprite. Sometimes they rape and beat these women. (Participant 5)

Holms, Begat & Severinsson (2009) describe emotional pain as a brokenness of the self, detachment and disconnect from a loved one and the sense of being internally wounded. This definition encapsulates the traumatic experiences narrated by most participants; a sense of deep loss followed by inevitable suffering, loneliness and the heavy burden of survival despite sorrow and fear. Participant 5 highlights how daily errands; chores and activities are problematic and in fact, are experienced with trepidation, anxiety and worry. There is an undertone of distress for what could happen to her and seems the underlying fear is whether she would be the next victim of such an ordeal.

5.2.2 Normalised suffering

Casseli (1998) explains that the biomedical model makes little distinction between pain and suffering and highlights that these two concepts are often used interchangeably and the distinction between them is usually vague and unclear. Pain is typically understood as having a physical origin or source and an individual's suffering is determined by the intensity and seriousness of their physical pain.

Therefore, notions surrounding the idea of suffering are mostly accompanied by evidence of physical pain and the absence of the latter negates or dismisses the presence of the former. It is therefore crucial to differentiate pain from suffering. Casselli (1998) describes suffering as existing beyond the physical and asserts that suffering involves experiencing severe distress associated with events that threaten the intactness of an individual's personhood. It also presents an impending destruction that has some temporality that is unknown to the individual; suffering is therefore understood as enduring whereas pain is perceived as measurable and having an end point.

The women's accounts chronicle experiences of escaping a place of horror and fear in search of a utopia and upon their arrival, there is a shattering of this expectation. Their overall experiences speak to being disenchanted and to a fragmentation of what they had envisioned a 'new life' to mean. Their experiences mostly entail descriptions of sexual trauma or abuse that each women has witnessed or been exposed to indirectly. Interestingly, none of the women reported being direct victims of sexual violence either in their native country or along the path of pursuing a perceived safe haven in South Africa. Sigsworth (2010) explains the nature of gendered xenophobic violence and posits that sexual violence against women migrants is a common occurrence as many women have been sexually violated in their countries of origin or along their journey to (and in) South Africa. Some participants describe living in constant fear of their safety in the different spaces that they occupy.

…one of the Somali guys that she was dating, his tribe attempted to rape me. It didn't happen but they attempted. I don't feel safe with any person and these people come wherever they are. I don't have permanent residence and I move from place to place, to find me, you must call me. I was in 9th avenue and they try come to attack me but I call the police and they go away. You cant go to taxi rank without guard assigning you to a a taxi and uhm last month two Somali women were raped … sometimes you are in taxi and they kidnap you and say they want the money, bring to Shoprite. Sometimes they rape and beat these women. (Participant 5)

Yes and everyone who knows me, knows I am married to that guy. They shot him in the leg. They (the men in her tribe) threatened me and my kids and said something would happen if pass by. I had bruises everyday; I was mistreated (Participant 1)

You who has nothing, you are nothing. Doctors wont help you, nobody will. Me, I sit there with bruises and they have nothing but they wont help you. What can you do? I come here I cry, every night I cry and no one can help me. Even now, they spit down and they say we can beat you *(Participant 2)*

I was beaten up a few days ago, I have a lot of experiences. Uhm there is a Somalian Canadian guy…he just come and hit her and she collapse there. He grabbed me and hit me and I was unconscious for two hours while people took pictures and put on Facebook… I explain to the prosecutor that I am a single mother with a child and my husband was killed and showed them proof and I asked if he could help me because I have been assaulted by a man who wants to show me that he has power because he has money and only God can provide so the prosecutor said I am not shot, stabbed or murdered and so this man cannot be arrested. My assault does not matter to them. I was crying from there because there is no justice and nobody did anything for me (Participant 4)

These women speak about violence that they have encountered by people within their community and describe feelings of helplessness and powerlessness. What is also being conveyed through these experiences is the silencing and minimization of these women's pain. Their voices are being ignored and others undermine their suffering. Participant 4 expresses this by stating that "my assault does not matter to them". In other words, what she has endured, the pain she has encountered-both physical and psychological-are not important and her pain is therefore insignificant. This is magnified by participant 2 who details a horrendous scene in which she was left wounded and in pain and betrayed by even professionals whom she expected would attend to her.

It seems the overarching meaning and common thread between the women's experiences is that they are prisoners to a system that does not seem to care for them. Being female, a foreigner and Muslim seems to mean living a life of restriction and in perpetual fear of one's safety because there is "no justice" for people like them. Participant 5 describes her experiences as being constantly in hiding in fear of what might befall her if she is caught off guard and unaware. For her, contacting the police in the face of potential danger acted as a buffer for her and in this particular instance, left her unharmed but the latter part of her account suggests that she has to navigate these unsafe spaces regularly. These women's future wishes, hopes and desires are uncertain and unstable. In all the accounts, the women seem to conclude, though without always explicitly stating it, that their pain is invisible despite desperately

pleading to be heard. This highlights not only the lack of support for women but unearths the deep disregard for the suffering of migrant women (and women in general) in society.

Sometimes you see a woman with 6 or 7 kids and the house is so dirty, the kids are so dirty and ah the mothers cant buy pampers for them. You feel you want to cry but what can you do for them? For example a lady died in the house for three days, she was dead and nobody knew about it or noticed. The neighbours said there is a chicken smell in the house. We found her and it was ugly, a very bad scene to look at. Within the house they are suffering, we are woman and we are suffering in this country (Participant 1)

What is being conveyed in this story is the idea of not only being invisible and unseen but also an unacknowledged life followed by an unacknowledged death. The participant is speaking about others and community members as not caring about the experiences and suffering of women. In her account it is unclear whom within the community she is referring to however, it can be assumed that this applies to fellow Somalis, other African nationals and the Indian community. There is also overwhelming sadness and maybe guilt that she too was complicit in this because she rhetorically asks, "what can you do for them?" She also refers to children and households that are neglected in the process and feeling disempowered because she too, may not feel there is much she can do to change the realities of other migrant women and may feel a lack of power to change her own reality and her own pain despite longing for change.

…you cannot talk, you must be silent. You do not have freedom, you are a refugee, you are a foreigner (Participant 5)

In the above extract, the participant is being silenced not only because she is a foreigner but also because she is considered as an outsider who does not belong and because of this, her opinions, experiences and suffering is unwarranted and illegitimate. In a way, by "choosing" to be in this country, she has wavered her right to speak. This statement highlights how women, in general, are silenced and how they are blamed for their own suffering. Suffering is characterised as personal and private and in so doing, it is silenced and made to appear natural (Cadwallader, 2007).

The normalization of her suffering because she is female, black and foreign perpetuates anti-foreigner sentiments, gender bias and inequalities as well as racial discrimination. It further places the attention on the sufferer who "does not have freedom" because essentially she chose her own suffering and is therefore responsible for her current position. Public discourses and politics around refugees and migrants place emphasis on their supposed 'foreignness' and conveniently minimizes the political and socio-economic context which migrants are fleeing from in their native countries. Furthermore, by focusing on the foreigner, the antagonist does not have to question the current conditions within the South African context that have contributed to the suffering of migrant women and minimises the traumatic experiences she has had to endure in a relatively xenophobic country.

By comparing and contrasting one individual's pain from another, serves to legitimise some suffering and deem it as true and authentic and to delegitimize other forms of suffering that are perceived as occurring due to one's own doing and one's own responsibility (Cadwallader, 2007). The argument is that suffering is a political experience; it is viewed as existing *within* the subject as opposed to being as a result or consequence of the social, historical or political context that an individual is embedded within. Casselli (1998) adds that suffering is viewed as subjective and is perceived as a personal matter and is therefore not of political significance. Cadwallader (2007) argues that suffering is presented as retaining a neutral stance and in so doing, insinuating that suffering is an individual experience and is therefore an individual's responsibility hereby negating the structural inequalities that give rise to suffering in the first place.

Like my sister went there to report two ladies who were bullying here and ganged on her and this and this and she is early pregnant, she is nauseous and nobody feel sorry for her. Nobody does something. When I had the bruises, I have called the police station and when I tell them I am in Mayfair, they hang up the phone. This is the street where you can be dying and the ambulance will come 8 hours later, they will never come. You will rather take them to the hospital yourself (Participant 1)

I had a fracture in the leg and I tell them and I tell them I am not well but they didn't help me, just with rent. (Participant 7)

I go to SASSA, I tell them I am suffering and I ask for stationery or school fees and when I come to my

community, they don't do nothing…Nobody help us, only the God and we are waiting for the help. At least, look after the children [cries] (Participant 3)

Nordgren, Bonos & Macdonald (2011) argue that social pain is usually underestimated unless accompanied by either physical pain or injury or experience of the emotional pain which would allow for understanding for the aggrieved party. This is somewhat support by Participant 7's account as she describes receiving *partial* assistance perhaps because she could "prove" that she was injured and this was visible to the naked eye whereas emotional pain is hidden and cannot be measured. Participant 3 seems desperate for her children to have a better outcome and privileges the suffering of her children over her own by pleading for her children's needs to be catered to instead. Unconsciously one could argue that she sees her children as an extension of self and by caring for them, she would be meeting her own needs as well or at the very least, assist in easing some of the suffering that she is enduring as she may be feeling helpless.

The authors state that without a deep appreciation of the cost of social pain and its implications, there appear to be gaps in the levels of empathy afforded to people who experience suffering in their daily lives. The experiences above emphasize this argument and illustrate the lack of concern and care for these women. In the first instance, their physical pain is belittled and both their suffering is met with hostility and dismissal.

The life I am living is the most difficult life. Since 2am this morning I have been awake and I cannot sleep. Even the men in Somalia they will not help you, they will not help you or provide for you. I do not wish this on my worst enemy (Participant 4)

I live in anxiety and depression and I am traumatised not knowing how they (my children) are doing. I feel bad when I eat and I do not know if they are eating (Participant 6)

When I was depressed and lack of sleep, I still had to provide for my kids. I was experiencing no sleep and I didn't know the meaning of depression… (Participant 7)

Some of the experiences suggest these women are expected to continue their lives and meet the demands and expectations placed on them despite suffering from

mental health illness. The participants present with some symptoms associated with depression such as insomnia, anhedonia and low mood (American Psychiatric Association, 2013). Participant 7 also expresses some confusion about what she has been experiencing and suggests that she did not comprehend why she was not feeling like herself. Participant 6 expresses a great amount of guilt about the benefits that she enjoys that her children may be without in Somalia.

It is worth noting the religious significance of suffering in Islam. Suffering is perceived as a test of one's faith and that the ability to endure suffering without wavering in faith will result in eternal rewards. More specifically, Somali Muslim women believe that suffering is an indication of God's omnipotence and the submission to the divine will result in resolution of suffering (McMicheal, 2002). Therefore the meanings attributed to suffering impact on how suffering is experienced and how sense is made of one's perceived misfortune and hardship (Casselli, 1998). Suffering is therefore entangled in not only politics but is also entrenched in systems and institutions of power that includes religion. There is a sense of ambivalence and indifference in the accounts of some of the participants as suffering is viewed as natural and normal. One could argue that suffering has become an internalised way of life and therefore, not worth contesting and as Cadwallader (2007) argues, it may be viewed as theirs to deal with. Religious beliefs can also have implications for how women make sense of their suffering in their everyday lived experiences.

5.2.3 Dealing with Intergenerational Trauma

In some instances, participants reported trauma and psychological pain as intergenerational and being inherited by their children. DISTINGUISH There is the sense of living with uncertainty as well as constant anxiety, fear and terror. The participant's images of war and violence are not only entrenched in their own memories but also embedded in the psyche of their offspring. This is consistent with Karenian et al (2010) who explain that trauma is often transmitted either at a personal or collective level or in many instances, is transmitted cross generationally. Brokenleg (2012) argues that trauma is cumulative when one generation has not healed from traumatic experiences; this is passed on to the next generation.

In 2005, I start experiencing a lack of sleep, I become very depressed and my children have inherited it… In 2012, my older daughter also start getting depression. They say my son was also diagnosed with depression… My biggest problem is that I cannot work and I am battling with the depression. The kids they have a special diet, I am tired, I can't do anything and sometimes I am too tired to get to the doctor for medication. (Participant 7)

Even now they say my son has mental health issues, when you talk to him you can see, maybe he needs someone. I don't know but he starts crying and he says the soldiers are coming, even when you talk to him you can see. He is still traumatised. (Participant 4)

Participant 7 speaks about her struggle with depression and the consequences that have ensued because of her challenges with her mental health. She cannot seem to provide for her children or attend to her work and as a result, her quality of life has been negatively impacted and thus diminished. In essence she is communicating a loss of control over her life because of her depression which seems to weigh her down. She acknowledges feeling helpless (maybe useless) because she cannot help her children and parent them in the way she hoped she could. This is emphasized by Participant 2's experience of feeling powerless to help her child cope with the traumatic events and images that are ingrained in his memory from the war they fled from. She also indicates that her children are also struggling with depression but due to her own lack of energy, she is unable to accommodate her children who seem to require a change in lifestyle in terms of their diet. In some ways, she describes her depression as a form of a prison as it has greatly affected her daily functioning and ability to attend to her children as well as her own wellbeing as she is, at times, not able to collect her medication.

However, in other instances, participants expressed gratitude and relief that their children have been spared from the gruesome violence, war and horror that they were likely to experience in Somalia. For some of the participants, the ability to have shielded their children from this trauma provides them with a sense of peace, joy and accomplishment. In the extracts below, the participants share that their children have been exposed to a healthier environment where they do not necessarily live in the same dire conditions that their parents were exposed to. Participant 1 highlights the contrasts between Somalia and South Africa and emphasizes the solace she

experiences as a parent due to the absence of eminent threat to the lives of her children which would not be the case if she was still in her native country.

In Somalia, there is war and people are killed and like a few months ago, there was a war that killed people and in South Africa, they have peace and there is a huge difference. The kids go to madrassa and they come back in one piece. Well there is free doctors and school…to deliver children is free and you can get it (Participant 1)

Most of my children are born here and they don't know anything about the war. They are South Africans, they are South Africans (Participant 3)

In other cases, participants have had to unwillingly separate from their children which is illustrated by the experiences below. In the first part of Participant 5's narration, she explains that she continues to care for her children from a distance and in the latter part of her statement, there appears to be disappointment and slight anger that her current reality is not one which she had expected; that her idea of what her life in South Africa would be like has been disheartening and regrettable.

I have two kids who are in Somalia and I send them money every now and then. My life is not safe so how can I bring my children here. I am not safe in this country so how can I bring them here. They will take R3000 to bring each child (Participant 5)

Participant 4 illuminates the psychological and emotional battle of living with the unknown status about her child's well being. This is at the crux of her affliction; wondering about her children and having to live with not entirely knowing their whereabouts or whether they are indeed alive. She emphasizes the pain of forced separation and having to contend with feelings of guilt and helplessness. She also provides a chilling story of her daughter being disfigured as a result of the conflict in Somalia.

I have all the documents to show what I went through and I was new in SA and I couldn't leave to go back to Somalia where I left another children even and most of my children because of the war they are separated from each other…I know my daughter was hit by the bomb and her stomach, not her womb but her intestines were damaged. The last time I heard from her she was in hospital and she is being cared for by another family (Participant 4)

What the participant describes may be understood as a type of ambiguous loss which is described as the kind of loss that prevents closure and confuses relationships (Boss and Dahl, 2014). It is regarded as ambiguous because it leaves people with many unanswered questions, demonstrated in this account. The disappearance of a loved one or uncertainty about their current condition can lead to a process of delayed or unresolved grief. Holmes & Rahe, (1967) explain that part of the process of grieving and loss is often associated with feelings of numbness, disorganization and a deep longing for a person's loved ones. For this participant, her children continue to exist in a hostile, violent war stricken country that they were not able to escape from and which she could not shield them from. This is yet another illustration of how trauma has affected her offspring and is likely to be passed over to the next generation. These accounts emphasize the enduring pain and suffering refugees and their children are subjected to post displacement from their native countries.

However, Cicchetti (2006, p. 165) assert that resilience is closely interrelated with trauma. It is defined as "the capacity for adapting successfully and functioning competently, despite experiencing chronic stress or adversity following exposure to prolonged or severe trauma". Brokenleg (2012) argues that trauma and pain can be transformed into resilience that helps us cope with the adversities that we are faced with in society. To assume that only trauma and not resilience is passed through between generations would be misleading and assume that people are not capable of adjusting and thriving despite the challenges that they have to overcome.

However these participants, in some ways, embody and therefore carry their trauma, pain and suffering with them into the different spaces that they occupy; this part of their past is an ever-present companion despite their resilience, coping mechanisms and need for survival. It is imperative to be cognisant of the intersections at play. Being black, female and of a foreign nationality is intricately intertwined with trauma which has become a part of their identity.

5.3 Ethnic divisions

This theme highlights tribal conflicts and explores the internal class divides within the Somali community. This section focuses on the intragroup fractures that

Somalis have to contend with.

5.3.1 Tribal conflicts and intermarriages as taboo

Tribalism can be understood as a state of group consciousness that generates a sense of belonging and fosters loyalty between group members. Loyalty to one's tribe is paramount within the Somali culture (Terdiman, 2008). The typical ideas about tribalism as an ongoing practice is that it is backward, archaic or outdated however, tribalism serves important functions such as offering individuals basic human needs such as support, love, affection and identity. Furthermore, the existence of tribes can aid in social welfare of its people in the absence of a centralized government or national state.

The experiences of the participants all emphasize the great significance of one's tribe even post re-settlement. This speaks to the transfer of culture across borders and denotes the many ways in which Somali migrants' current realities in South Africa seems to be an extension of the lives they led in Somalia. The participants stress the importance of tribal association and denote that lack of representation of their tribe in their community has serious consequences on not only how they maneuver certain spaces within the community but also their livelihood and protection.

I couldn't work because my job is to carry the weight of my flasks. I didn't have anyone to help me, I was lying for four days alone. There is no tribe or any people who come and stand up by me. The guy (who assaulted me) is part of a tribe in Somalia who are causing havoc so nobody stood up for me. (Participant 4)

I was sleeping on the streets by Mayfair garden, the park, I was checking food from the dustbin and that's how I was surviving. I never looked for my tribe members and sleeping from the street was the worst…I don't want to look for them because I left them in Somalia and only God will help me, no tribe. (Participant 6)

From the extracts above, both participants express a sense of hopelessness and allude to there being social consequences to the absence of tribe members. Participant 4 describes feeling alone and helpless without the assistance of those who are like her;

in other words, those who belong to her tribe and who would be responsible for defending her because of their shared lineage and clan membership (Terdiman, 2008). The latter narrative alludes to the idea that without the presence of tribe members, she has had difficulties accessing resources and has been deprived of basic needs and as a result, has had to endure agony and suffering.

Terdiman (2008) argues that tribal conflicts arise due to different political interests as well as a competition of land within Somalia. This conflict has transcended into the Mayfair area where there continues to be rivalry between the various tribes. Moodley & Adam (2000) argue that the distinction of certain qualities by one ethnic group to another creates a window of opportunity to exclude and despise others who do not share these characteristics or qualities. This has affected most of the participants as they are forced to either interact with their own tribe members or discouraged from marrying into tribes that are regarded as second class or those classified as lower class tribes. Gender, class and ethnicity prove to be important intersections in the case of marriage and also interaction with other Somalis. In this case it is evident that their nationality as Somali is undermined whereas gender, class and ethnicity are foregrounded.

I am a mom of two kids because I was married to a tribe that my family never wanted and no Somalis get married to them but I got married to him and we got married, fell in love, came to Johannesburg. I wonder when my kids grow up, how are they going to feel because I am disgusting because nobody gets married to that tribe in Somalia; it's the lowest tribe. I don't know if you have that in SA. I was even scared to take my kids to Madrassa. (Participant 1)

Intermarrying into certain tribes is heavily contested and disloyalty to one's tribe leads to not only shame to the perpetrator but also to his/her immediate family and other tribe members. According to (Terdiman, 2008), a crime committed by one member of a family, is not only attributed, to the accused but also to members of his kin. Therefore, the aggrieved party can seek revenge or retaliate against all members of the perpetrator's lineage as they are regarded as guilty of the same crime due to their blood connection to the perpetrator.

Taking this into account, it can be presumed that Participant 1 is not only concerned about how her children will perceive her or how they will rationalize her choices but more importantly, her concern may be centered upon whether her children will be punished for her own decision to marry outside of her tribe and to in fact, marry into a tribe considered as sub-standard. Furthermore, she expresses fear about how others may mistreat her children and how they might be viewed for her decision to marry outside of her tribe. In a way, she is being judged and alienated from her tribe for having chosen the "wrong" person to love and share a life with.

They have Somali community everywhere and there are tribes in PE and the newcomer arrives and goes to where the tribe is. I went to PE and I had a relationship with a man and planned to get married to a man but the family refused because he is the lowest tribe in Somalia so we couldn't marry…they told me that if they see me with him, they would get rid of me and I have been afraid since then (Participant 5)

The feelings conveyed by Participant 5 are ones of intense fear of punishment by members of her tribe. The participant may be feeling threatened and left feeling that she cannot defend her family. There is a sense of stuckness where the participant is caught between wanting to be accepted and feel a sense of belonging within her tribe versus choosing autonomy and independence from her tribe. This presents a complex web of confusion interwoven in the politics of belonging, collectivistic and individualistic practices; this seems to be an internal struggle about whether to choose self over the collective or visa versa. Her experiences portray ways in which not only tribalism but patriarchy is organized which constrain the choice women have regarding not only their life partners but also implicitly placing value on people based on their tribe affiliation. This is consistent with Terdiman (2008) who explains that certain tribes are discriminated against and considered as ritually unclean and outcasts and as a result, other tribes avoid interactions and intermarrying with these tribes.

5.3.2 Internal class divides

A further layer of complexity is revealed when social class is considered as another factor that differentiates the 'haves' from the 'have-nots'. Thompson (2016) argues against viewing Somali migrants in a uniform manner particularly around the

issue of wealth and access to resources within the communities that these unique groups of people have managed to establish themselves and their businesses within. There is a distinction made between Somali's who own businesses and those who engage in informal trade and between Somali's who own businesses in the township and not in urban areas such as Mayfair. In this sense, the Somali community represents the wider national landscape within South Africa; where there are lines of distinction between working class, middle class or upper class citizens not only among the different race groups but also among black South Africans.

Thompson (2016) states that social upward mobility is also largely dependent on one's clan association and the established networks within clans are likely to determine how well one integrates the informal business sector in Mayfair and in local townships. This suggests that social class is also, to some degree, reliant on one's ethnicity. Put differently, one's financial stability and success (or lack thereof) is influenced by tribe membership and the territory each tribe has been able to secure within the informal (and formal) marketplace. Some participants who have expressed this in earlier passages support this, by stating that without the support of their tribe they have experienced financial difficulties and challenges sustaining themselves on a regular basis.

Most of the participants speak directly to the issue of class and its implications for their everyday survival and experiences within the Mayfair community. There is a strong insistence that one's class position affords you certain privileges and power, not only among other Somalis, but also among South Africans particularly those in law enforcement or in positions of authority. One's class positioning is therefore used as a marker of difference between in-group members (Rudwick, 2008). The following participant makes a distinction between the middle class and working class within the Somali community and compares this with the surrounding, external (non-Somali) community members.

There are Somalis in this country that are poor and some that have wealth more than the Indians… (Participant 1)

Some of the participants indicated that they had been denied basic services in hospitals and other public spaces. The participants suggest that money is an important currency for navigating South African politics and in most cases, can be used to mask or conceal cultural differences between non South African citizens and South African citizens. Being able to offer a bribe or give additional funds to law officials or those in authority can purchase a foreigner some social capital and afford them better services. Moodley and Adam (2000 p. 149) quote Enzensberger who eloquently states, "where bank accounts are healthy, xenophobia disappears as if by magic. But strangers are all the stranger if they are poor".

You know what is happening in home affairs, the people from West Africa are getting papers and not the real refugees. Those of us who are really in need, we do not get help. They are helping rich people. The UN, I swear on the name of God, they help the rich people and they do not help the poor people. When these people have R20 000 and they give to UN, then they get resettlement but what about us who don't have that money (Participant 4)

…when you have money, you have power… I don't have money… you are nothing…I asked them about the birth certificate and they said no, I am not South African and I am a refugee. I had to pay money, me I had to pay money. When I take out money, they are nice and massaging me (Participant 2)

When you do not have money, you are nothing, sometimes you wake up 5am in the morning and you are number one at the clinic and you will be given a different number because you don't have bribe money (Participant 5)

The participants highlight a crucial relationship between their identity and hierarchy within class. They are disrespected and their needs disregarded because they are working class citizens. There is also a loss of power experienced by the participants because without money, they are "nothing". To have money is to have power and without it, one is rendered useless and powerless. This seems to have impacted their self-worth as they articulate this as intricately entangled with how they are treated and the amount of respect they are afforded in different spaces. The participants seem frustrated by this injustice, undervalued and choked in desolation.

However, despite the social barriers and financial challenges that these women encounter on a daily basis within their own communities and beyond these peripheries, they remain resilient and determined to provide for their families in innovative ways.

In this way, besides having to compete with their male counterparts who hold a vast amount of power and who predominantly own established businesses, Somali women are able to exercise their agency by finding and filling gaps within the market in order to make a living and provide for their families through the provision of social grants and informal trade such as street vending, selling jewellery and other products as well as working in restaurants (Sigamoney, 2018). The involvement of men in business, to the exclusion of women, can be attributed to the embedded notions of patriarchy cemented within African culture. However, the shifts in the economy and the need to survive have resulted in gender role changes with women participating in (and owing) businesses (Sigamoney, 2018).

5.4 Pervading Patriarchy

This theme unpacks patriarchy and the ways religion has been used as a powerful tool used for the purpose of the oppression of women in society. This section also outlines the impacts of patriarchy on the everyday experiences of Somali women.

5.4.1 Religion as tool of patriarchy

Miller (2013) describes patriarchy as a system that privileges men and perpetuates inequalities among men and women. Furthermore, Miller (2013) posits that religion and religious laws have been used as a means of legitimizing the control men have over women thus creating a society where the subjugation of women is not only acceptable but also required. This sentiment is echoed by Chowdhury (2009) who makes a distinction between religion as a conviction and religion as a tool of control. Under patriarchy, religion is used as a means of controlling women and as a weapon of disciplining and curtailing women's behaviour. Therefore, religion itself is not oppressive to women but rather the interpretation of scriptures particularly those in the Quran, is considered as oppressive. Religion is not the cause of patriarchy but has helped to cement patriarchal ideology and perpetuate male dominance (Miller, 2013).

No, they [men] are not protective at all. Maybe men who have wealth will take his family to a better community. Some of the men are violent and mistreat and get married to 4 women but he doesn't care and they don't provide. They still have the culture in Somalia and religion say you can marry if you can provide in equal way for family. Even if you can go and ask for help from them, they might say even you I will marry you. You want help in the community and maybe one of the men in the community might start doing weird things with you. (Participant 1)

Even if we are all Muslim, they [Indian Muslims] do not see us as human. How will someone else treat you when your own religion treats you like this (Participant 6)

…Al Shabaab uses religion to do things, but slaughtering people is not religion (Participant 4)

The latter statement made by one of the participants evokes a vivid image of how religion has been used to justify gross human violations and used as a tool in a greater political agenda. While the above extract refers specifically to mass killings among the citizens of Somalia, it also highlights how violence in general, and particularly against women, is acceptable and rationalized using religion. Participant 1's account speaks directly to a system of patriarchy which privileges the needs of men at the expense of women. In this instance, the participant highlights the contradiction between what her religious texts claim and the behaviour of men in reality. She indicates that men do not always uphold their religious teachings and perhaps subvert these for their own gain. Men are also described as violent and unreliable leaving women feeling helpless and perhaps, trapped.

Sultana (2010) argues that violence against women by men is legitimised in many ways by the state and is used to instill fear in women to exploit them. However for most of the participants, religion is a means of strength and a constant from which they draw meaning and hope despite the sinister underpinnings that existent within a patriarchal system.

The Indian or Portuguese man tells me to leave the house because I cant pay rent but always God helps me and sometimes my sister she and I just wait for God because I don't believe every month that I can provide for the rent. (Participant 7)

My husband brought me here and because this is where the Somali people are and it is an Islamic community. I don't have anything, only God can provide for me. (Participant 4)

Nobody helps. When I go to SASSA, they say go to your community so we are worse. Nobody help us, only the God and we are waiting for the help. (Participant 3)

In the above extracts, the participants discuss how their faith and personal convictions have provided solace and reassurance in times of uncertainty. They speak of their divine Creator as dependable and reliable. They express feeling helpless but not without hope. Hamzeh & Oliver (2010) explain that the word 'Inshallah' in Arabic means Allah or God willing implying a sense of hope for what is to come in the future. This is a strong belief that the will of God or Allah will supersede that of man. This reiterates the role of religion among the Somali women who remain hopeful; their faith offers them some respite through their adversities. Participant 3 states that she is "waiting for the help" implying that she may not have received the provision or assistance she desires. The lack of certainty about the future may be experienced as terrifying and perhaps frustrating due to the inability to control the outcome of their own and their families' well being.

5.4.2 The impact of patriarchy

The intersection of race, gender, class, ethnicity, nationality and religion provides a complex and multilevel understanding of how women experience the effects or impact of patriarchy. The experiences of women can therefore not be conceptualised as homogenous (McCall, 2013). A white middle class female who is a South African citizen is likely to possess more cultural capital and some degree of power than a black Somali female migrant. The intersection of women's various identities determine to what extent they are able to subvert and navigate the systems of inequality entrenched within patriarchy.

Yesterday we went to a shop just to check things and like they didn't even get up and help us but a white lady comes in and they ask what they would like. I just wanted to leave and my sister said we should just look and I said no, I don't want to be here. Then, immediately, it's painful. How do they know I don't have money? When the ladies come in, they stand up really quickly. I am getting angry. I don't want to be in a shop where they are racist and where they treat us like we are nobodies. (Participant 2)

While the above extract speaks more directly to issues of racial discrimination

and bias, it does demonstrate how race, class and nationality contribute to how the above participant was interpellated by others and how her experience in the store was significantly different from that of the white woman who was assisted by the store attendants. This portrays a snapshot of how women across cultures and races experience the impacts of patriarchy.

Moghadam (2004) explains that the way in which patriarchy takes form has transitioned over the centuries especially in terms of the amount of power women have held in both public and private spheres. This is supported by Sigamoney (2018) who argues that due to migration and economic factors, Somali women in particular have had to assume the role of financial provider in the household and in so doing, there has been a transfer of patriarchal power within the home environment.

When I arrive here, I went to PE and worked in a restaurant, I saved some money and had a shop in location and I was looted three times. One time I was thrown out a taxi and looted me and I still have a scar to show it. I had to struggle to make a living and everyday I try sell men's outfits and sometimes I get looted. (Participant 5)

I never ask this mans anything and uhm I don't ask them anything. I am 55 and I never ask about them or anything. I am too proud and I see the life of the South Africa, everyone wants their own. I am sitting there and selling whatever God give. (Participant 6)

When my husband passed away, there is a community that gives parcels and they can provide three months rent. Her tribe is few in this country so she didn't get a lot of support. They gave me a donation with flask with tea so she can start business with that. I carry this [indicates big bag with tea flasks] and I put the takeaway here and this is how I provide for madrassa, rent where we live in a one bedroom and this is to provide for my sister's child. This is how I make a living. (Participant 4)

So like with sweets, there is a type of sweet that we eat and I am selling that but most of the time I don't sell unless there is a wedding. (Participant 7)

This illustrates that many of the participants are not passive subjects who lack agency and it is important to position Somali female migrants as active agents who have control over some aspects of their lives. These narrations portray women who are breadwinners for their families despite the challenges and adversities they are faced with on a daily basis. A number of the participants are widows and live with

family members. This can be viewed as a type of resistance and agency employed by these women as some have chosen not to remarry. It can also be viewed as a subversion of societal norms or expectations regarding marriage. These women feel empowered and can be viewed as agential beings. Their experiences indicate a sense of resilience and for most; South Africa represents a place of hope and independence. Waijonga (2018) describes the resilience of Somali refugees as a form of 'power geometrics' which strengthens them and enables them to navigate their complex living conditions. The author therefore emphasizes viewing Somali women as active agents and not as helpless beings.

5.5 Race Matters

The last theme provides insight into ways that race and racialisation affects the lives of the participants in both public and private spaces. It explores racism within the Mayfair community among Somalis, Indian people and other foreign nationals. It also unpacks feelings of loss and disillusionment.

5.5.1 Dehumanisation in public spaces

With the abolishment of apartheid came a discourse of national unity and the collapse of legislated identities in preference of racial equality and peaceful coexistence across race and ethnicity (Moodley & Adam, 2000). The dominant narrative was that of a rainbow nation and one nation, with diverse people and cultures. However, decades into democracy, this dream has not entirely actualized and is widely accepted as a myth or an unrealistic kind of utopia. The remnants of the legacy of apartheid are all too apparent especially with the deepening levels of inequality and disparity between the wealthy and the poor. Moodley & Adam (2000) argue that the discourse of uniformity and equality has not served its intended purpose but instead camouflaged and discarded diversity instead of acknowledging it. This has not resulted in a unified South African identity but rather, magnified the fractured state of racial identities and the contestation of power between and within the different race and ethnic groups. A compelling argument about xenophobic attacks and violence is that it offers a rare opportunity for the poor and working class black

South Africans, to exercise power to denigrate others whom they consider as beneath them or inferior to them (Moodley & Adams, 2000).

Participants give horrific accounts of discrimination and ill treatment they experience when accessing basic services particularly in public hospitals where they are either blatantly disregarded by the medical staff or humiliated due to their foreign national status. In the context of these narratives, these women are made to feel not only foreign, but a sense of invasion and non-belonging in these spaces prevail. Some of the participants explained that navigating these spaces is further complicated without access to funds which are used to bribe the staff.

If you do not have anything in this country in the hospitals and you don't have any bribe to give them, you are nothing else and you will die there and you are not important to them, they don't care. They say it is free and they say you should not pay a bribe but the nurses but but they don't give vaccinations for your child and unless you have R50, you must hit the road. They will not help you, you will just sit there (Participant 4)

When I had the accident, I was bruised and it was infected. When I got to the hospital, I didn't get helped, I was given a painkiller and she did not help the wound or anything. I had to take money from my savings to get help from a private clinic…When you do not have money, you are nothing, sometimes you wake up 5am in the morning and you are number one at the clinic and you will be given a different number because you don't have bribe money (Participant 5)

You know the last born of my children, I was in an operation and I don't know where this one comes from and she is swearing and she will ask why are not giving the baby breast, Osama Bin Laden! You Somalian puss! She is swearing at us this woman [the nurse]. You are swearing the people. Its better that I know where I come from, you where do you come from? You coloured! [laughs]
(Participant 3)

It seems these participants feel belittled and humiliated for being foreign and as a result, they are not afforded the rights that they are entitled to when seeking treatment or services in public spaces. Participant 3 describes being treated in an inhumane and derogatory manner however, she defends herself by hurling an insult back at the nurse which can be understood as a way of coping and protecting her dignity in the midst of her public humiliation.

These accounts are consistent with literature that indicates that women

migrants are subjected to gross treatment particularly in public hospitals and are often denied these services despite the existing laws that permit them to accessing these services (Crush, 2007). The inability to speak an African language or speaking with an 'African accent' aides in the exclusion of migrant women. In this instance, accent is used as a racialised marker of difference and is used to determine the social value of the speaker to his/her audience (Creese, 2010). Wearing certain attire (predominantly a hijab who indicates religious affiliation as a Muslim African women), speaking with a 'foreign' accent or not being proficient in English and "looking like a foreigner" perpetuates the discrimination experienced by women migrant in public spaces.

Yes even when you go to the hospitals and you are in labour, as Somalis, they will even pinch you. Even like me, I can speak English, I was raised and I know English but some their families are in war, they are not educated and you don't want to know how they treat them. They treat them very poorly. Even in the clinic, they say, you give me R100 or I am not going to help. They treat the other Somalian women so miserably. Some are in labour and they tell them to sit on the floor. Like me, I speak English and I can defend myself but some cant...They still didn't show sympathy and they said, ah you Somalis, I am tired. (Participant 1)

The above experience seems to allude to feelings of shame around one's identity as a working class Muslim foreign national. It also appears as though Somali women in particular are made to feel like a nuisance and burden to the medical staff and the system as a whole. These women are infantalised and told to "sit on the floor" like naughty misbehaved children causing unnecessary commotion. There is a deep sadness in the tone of the participant as she describes the nurses as unempathetic towards them.

The accounts of these women referred to black and Coloured people who treat them poorly however, all the participants shed light on the racism they experience in the Mayfair community by the Indian people that they reside among. There was a resounding consensus that there is not only segregation between African and Indian Muslims but also overt racism and discrimination experienced on a daily. There seems to be a hypervigilance and awareness of the invisible boundaries that exist between black and Indian people. Ahmed (2007) argues that race influences and to a large degree dictates how black people utilize space in their everyday lives.

This one time I went to KFC with my baby and these Indians, when I greet them and I say Salam, they didn't say anything. Then, I sit next to them because that was the only place I could sit and they said "sies, couldn't you find another place to sit" and I look at them and I said, because they are old people, I felt like crying. Then the old people at reception look at me and they start laughing, I feel so bad but what can you do? Even if you went to a shop by the Indians, they will close their nose when they see you. It's paining (Participant 2)

This participant chronicles a painful story of being denigrated and undermined within her own community and provides some understanding about the divide between black foreign nationals and Indian people in the Mayfair area despite a shared religious identity. This participant is shunned by the Indian people in her community and was publicly humiliated because of the way she looks; because of the race that she embodies and consequently, she is made to feel unwanted and unwelcome in public spaces.

5.5.2 Segregation in personal spaces

Vahed & Jeppie (2005) argue that the race relations between black foreign nations and Indian South African people in Johannesburg is contentious, with black African Muslims feeling alienated, rejected and hated by Indian people. The politics of race remains an ongoing struggle within the broader South African context as it persists not only among black people but also between black people and other race groups.

I am living behind an Indian and Indians have never provided for anyone. If I want a hot or cold water and I ask her, she said don't ever come to my house. They will treat you like you are not human, I did not pay rent and this morning we had an argument and I will go ask for charity. Even if we are all Muslim, they do not see us as human. (Participant 6)

There used to be an Indian in this building and I live here for 6 years and there was a Malawian that worked for me and he would come at 3am so the food was ready at 6am and they (the Indian residents) didn't want that Malawian here and they say he will steal from them and they took the case to the landlord who is Portuguese, so the guy he say that this lady is a single mother and has kids and she has to do this to provide so try to understand each other because you are all Muslims…Now they move out, complaining and they start to move because of the racism (Participant 7)

Participants were asked to reflect on the interactions within their community

between black and Indian people. They explained that interactions between Indian and black people is rare or forced, such as during the exchange of donations or goods, and that casual socializing between the races is an uncommon practice. Participant 6 emphasizes dehumanisation suggesting that those around her view her as primitive and inferior overlooking their shared religious affiliation which should symbolize belonging. In Participant 7's account of her experience, it is clear that there is an assumption made by the Portuguese landlord that a shared religious identity among the residences will result in the matter being resolved, however this is not the case. Furthermore, there is the sense that those with whom she resided in the same building with did not trust her as her intentions and decisions were not only questioned by the Indian people but also scrutinised. This also illustrates the intrusion of her space that she was being subjected to. There is a further racial divide that occurs as she states that some of the Indians in her building begun to move out as a way of distancing self from "her kind" of people.

The participants below describe some Indians as unaccommodating and harsh. Some indicated that their children are also discouraged from playing with Indian children and in so doing are socialized into the culture of racism and maintaining boundaries of separateness. The participants describe overt and covert racism in their everyday experiences with Participant 1 using the metaphor of a disease to illustrate how she feels like some kind of abnormality, plague or contagious growth within her community. Distance and isolation are emphasized in each of the extracts with one participant stating that she feels hated and unwanted by the some of the Indian people. Participant 2 has resorted to avoidance as a way of coping with intolerance. There is also a deep concern and sorrow about how their children are being discriminated against and how they are unable to shield them from racism and racial prejudice which exacerbates any existing feelings of helplessness.

Uhm, they are not friendly and they are distant and they only mingle with themselves. Like if you are walking down an aisle and an Indian passes by you, they wont ask you are you ok or where are you going. Like they distance themselves from us like we are some kind of a disease. They are not very community based…That is the how we are to each other, we never mingle, come have coffee or come to the house-it never happens. It is very rare, even if the owner of the house comes, and you offer him water, he will just look at it and put it there. That is the biggest battle in Mayfair is that the Indians are distant from us… I don't know if it is racist or what because they Somalian kids have their own

madrassa, the Indian kids have their own and if you take your kids there, they will look at you weird. (Participant 1)

The Indians in this country, we have a lot of problems, they do not show us any humanity or any Islamic in any way even forget about being friendly or asking how you are or even to greet us is too much for them. They have a lot of hatred for us. If they don't arrest you, you are very lucky…. they wont even allow any Indian child to play with a Somali child and they look us weird. There is a lot of racism and they are even showing the children (Participant 4)

It comes from the kids and its something they hear from home. When you teach a kid that this is wrong or this is your brother then they will know. You know one day, my little one was playing outside with an Indian girl, I think she was three and the mother of the child came out and said, who told you to play with this baby and I was standing there and I felt like crying but what can you do? I took my baby and left and now even me I avoid them (Participant 2)

Vaheed & Jeppie's (2005) research indicates that Somali refugees experience Indians as racist and prejudiced towards them, and this ongoing tension is propagated by the lack of financial and social assistance from the Indian Muslims to black Muslims in townships and other areas alike. Some participants, who claim that they occasionally receive assistance from the Indian community, also assert that this is usually inconsistent and in this sense, echo this sentiment. There is also the sense that foreign nationals are perceived as needy, poor and burdensome by some of the Indian community members. Perhaps any donations made to them are due to it being a religious obligation as opposed to an earnest attempt at empowering the less fortunate. The inconsistency in providing these goods may also be indicative of privilege and class, with a distinction between those who are able to give and those who are the receipts of the giving. It is also categorised in racial terms with Indian people being in a position of power to *decide* when, where and how much they choose to distribute of their funds or possessions.

Before they help us the Indian people and the Muslim people like stationery and rent but they stop everything…It's not much like before. They don't think of you as community. No, they just come for Ramadaan… The Indian man next door won't greet you when you greet him. He won't say anything (Participant 3)

Sometimes the Indians will make donations and sometimes he will give you small amounts and sometimes they never do. Sometimes he can tell you that they cannot help you (Participant 7)

I went to this place and showed them my pictures and at least they rent them a house in Lenasia. I asked please, I can cover my face so I went there and the lady said, you are not South African so how can I help you? I thought maybe she will help because she is Muslim but…(Participant 1)

These accounts challenge Sigamoney's (2018) research findings which suggests that Somali migrants are supported and protected by the Indian people in Mayfair. The research states that "The Fordsburg/Mayfair Indian Muslim community took it upon themselves to be the guardians of the Somali community and welcomed them into the local mosque" (Sigamoney, 2018 p. 94). There are mixed reviews with one participant indicating that even places of worship are segregated and another participant describing a sense of safety and relief from racial prejudice within the mosques.

You can see when someone likes you and when they don't. Maybe 12% of Indians have humanity, respect you but there is a lot of discrimination. Even in the mosque, imagine; the house of God there is discrimination. There is a Ugandan mosque, a Somalian mosque, Kenyan mosque. Imagine within our religion (Participant 1)

You see, the Somalis and Malawians are one. They think they are like refugees, they don't have power but they mingle with us. I am sure if they had power, they wouldn't mingle with us. Inside the mosque, you go there and you pray and nobody is looking at you (Participant 2)

The accounts from the majority of participants in this study contest this portrayal of the Indian community as the custodians for Somalis and convey significant differences in their racialised everyday experiences. While the participants admitted that there are *some* incidences of kindness and support from the Indian community, all were in unison about the underlying racial undertones and microagressions experienced regularly. Vahed & Jeppie (2005) explain that due to the lack of financial support and charity provided by Indian Muslims to black Muslims, particularly in the township areas, black Muslims submitted a memorandum to the then president, Thabo Mbeki, citing racism and exploitation as some of their main grievances and boycotted a number of Indian mosques in protest to this discrimination. These racial tensions continue to be experienced by the participants in the Mayfair area. Participant 2, who gives an account of the discrimination she has encountered while shopping in her community, provides a richer depth of understanding into such

experiences.

Yesterday we went to a shop just to check things and like they didn't even get up and help us but a white lady comes in and they ask what they would like. I just wanted to leave and my sister said we should just look and I said no, I don't want to be here. Then, immediately, it is painful. How do they know I don't have money. When the ladies come in, they stand up really quickly. I am getting angry. I don't want to be in a shop where they are racist and where they treat us like we are nobodies (Participant 2)

Lee's (2000) research expands on this by stating that African Americans are routinely checked and surveiled when entering shopping complexes due to the colour of their skin and the inescapable collective identity associated with blackness. Furthermore, this study indicates that they are discriminated against to a higher degree than their white counterparts. Therefore, there is a way in which they are implicitly informed about the kinds of spaces they may or may not freely occupy. Participant 2 describes feeling angered and hurt by the injustice and disregard that she encountered at the store and in her experience speaks to how black people are ignored and treated as though they are invisible, and as she states, "they treat us like we are nobodies".

They {Indian people} seem disgusted about you. There are Somalis in this country that are poor and some that have wealth more than the Indians but even if you go to an Indian shop, they are disgusted (Participant 1)

Participant 1's account is consistent with Lee's (2000)'s findings who argue that race remains salient in the lives of black people regardless of class. While wearing one's class aids in mitigating some of the discriminatory practices experienced by black people, it is by no means a guarantor that one will escape the historical labels attributed to the black body. In most cases, racism is overt and experienced through verbal and non-verbal cues that result in black people feeling unwelcome in predominantly white spaces (Lee, 2000). Interestingly, one of the participants indicated that she receives better treatment and respect from white people when accessing public services compared to Indian people in her own community.

The white people have more sympathy than the Indians. Even you conceive a baby, we start praying that we get a white woman to deliver the baby because they way they treat you (Participant 1)

From the above extract it can be deduced that the primary reason may be that white people in the medical industry are experienced as caring and gentle by Somali women because in many ways they are removed from the Mayfair area, are of a different race and are not directly implicated in the Somali-Indian race politics. However, this may be a far too simplistic explanation and this may provide prospects for further research exploration.

5.5.3 Loss of community

The common thread among the participants is a sense of loss of community not only between Indian people and black migrants but also among one another as black migrants from different parts of the Africa. A few participants acknowledge the strained relationship between black and Indian people but insist that the most significant challenge is the ongoing racism, discrimination and segregation within the Somali community and other migrants from countries such as Malawi, Congo and Ethiopia. These participants are alluding to the black on black hate and lack of support and consideration within these communities. Furthermore, some participants make reference to the external racial tensions that they experience within the South African context but acknowledge the internal fractures that exist within the Somali community. Participants allude to internal racism not only between tribes but also within certain tribes.

When I left Somalia because of the tribe issue, most of us are still a community and so whatever happens with us, you don't go to another tribe. We are eating each other even in another country. Even if they see two tribes, they will intimidate you. There is a racism within us. The only thing that I experience in the country there is racism in the country but within us, there is racism within us. The main focus is in the Somalian community, our tribes, our men and they will never help you. (Participant 5)

Even us Somalis fight, even among us there is racism among us (Participant 2)

Most of the Indians here are not friendly with us and the Ethiopians and Somalis do not mingle with one another (Participant 1)

There is a Somalian community…I don't know the language (English) and they don't help, they say I must go to the court and how can I when I go there when I don't know the language well. There is no community here and the women, we know that. Even the hospitals do not help us (Participant 4)

Most of the participants highlight tribalism and internal racism as having an impact on their social interactions and restricting their movement in some spaces. Participant 4 highlights the issue of language as being integral to how she navigates certain spaces specifically in the justice system. Her statement accentuates feelings of frustration and despondency. There are feelings of isolation that permeates through the experiences above as some mention not having the support of their tribe or being without any protection. They also express divisions not only among other Somalis but also with other foreign nationals.

Upon enquiring about support structures in the community specifically for migrant women, all the participants recognised that this is a fundamental necessity but indicated that such social as well as financial support system for women is lacking in their communities. While there are established and official organisations for Somali migrants, it appears as though these organisations are unable to assist the greater Somali population in terms of finances and resources as outlined by the testimonies of the women in this research. Furthermore, although some receive donations and charity when in dire need, there is the general sense that these women receive insufficient emotional, financial and psychological care in their communities which only perpetuates and strengthens the existing suffering and pain endured by many in what seems to be, their own private spaces.

Wiajonga (2018) states that there are several organisations established to assist Somali women cope with traumatic experiences they have encountered however, there is stigma and shame associated with speaking about sexual abuse such as previous instances of rape or molestation which not only impedes the potential for refugees to reconstruct and recover meaning in their lives, but also prevents these women from seeking assistance from counselors and other services offered in and around their communities. Furthermore, some of the participants were aware of some of the services offered but seemed to lack the vocabulary and understanding for issues related to mental health. This in itself may be a barrier to accessing services.

5.5.4 Disillusionment

Yuval-Davis (2006) argues that one cannot discuss issues of citizenship and belonging without assuming an intersectional perspective because the very basis and crux of belonging lays firmly in the multilayered identities that one assumes. One cannot discuss race without referring to a classed or ethnocized being. The argument is that belonging is a dynamic process which is subjective; involving emotional attachments and individual identifications as well as social and political (Yuval-Davis, 2006). There is a constant interplay between these different aspects which informs who is considered to be 'in' and who is considered to be 'out' (Christensen, 2009).

For Somali migrant women, the issue of citizenship is a constant hardship. Christensen (2009) argues that the issue of citizenship goes beyond equal rights and obligations but also entails social and political relationships and different identities which create a sense of belonging or exclusion. While Section 24 of refugee permit stipulates that refugees are entitled to rights afforded to South African citizens, this is not a reality for most refugees and their children who are denied an education due to lack of documentation (Hlatshwayo & Vally, 2014). In essence, acquiring legal documentation does not equate to feeling a sense of belonging or even being treated as one who is a part of the greater community. Christensen (2009) stresses the duality between belonging and non-belonging and states that these are inextricably linked as experiences of belonging also simultaneously construct non-belonging and the exclusion of some and the inclusion of others.

There is the strong sense that all the participants held a firm belief that South Africa would provide safety and a second chance at life however, the realities of being and existing in this space suggest otherwise. There is a sense of disillusionment experienced by most migrants seeking asylum as their expectations or hopes are not always met. Participant 4 seems disappointed at the shattering of her imagined utopia of what South Africa and freedom would look like. She expresses despair over the discord that continues even in a country that she hoped would be a safe space. Her final statement "the children are waiting for their mothers" provides some insight into the uncertainty of survival and the constant threat to the lives of Somalis working in the township. She seems to express living in perpetual fear of what may happen to not only herself but to her children should she someday not return home.

Since we left, we do not have any peace and since we are Somalia, we have to sweat for it and nobody will help. They kill only Somalian in the locations; the children are waiting for their mothers… (Participant 4)

Some participants stated that they would leave South Africa given the opportunity. When asked whether they would resettle elsewhere, one participant responded by stating that her and her children would have a better life overseas. Participant 3 seems to be waiting (and hoping) for an alternative location or place to resettle. There is desperation to go elsewhere and have a "better life" because the life she had envisioned is not what she expected for herself and her family. Participant 5, states that she is only in South Africa due to the unrest in her country but suggests that if she could go back to Somalia, she would. She dreams about peace and alludes to the idea that peace in her country of origin would perhaps mean a restoration of some feelings of belonging.

I took my papers to the UN and they all say they will call you, they will call you but nobody calls you. They say I don't have a strong case…there is better life because a lot of people go to America and Canada (Participant 3)

There is no peace in my country, if there was peace then I would go back (Participant 5)

However, despite the challenges, racism and discrimination experienced by the participants, many have expressed that being in South Africa is a better existence than being in a country experiencing war accompanied by extreme poverty and deprivation.

I would never decide to stay in Somalia because we don't want our kids to be in war or face trauma. We don't care if there is racism or they bully us but I don't want my kids to go through what I went through unless there is peace in the country (Participant 1)

The biggest culture [change] has been, there is a lot of things but there is peace and I am grateful that there is peace…(Participant 6)

For Participant 1, the trauma and pain she endured in Somalia far outweighs the struggles she is faced with in South Africa. She acknowledges the discrimination

and injustices that she and her children encounter however; her response suggests that her children are shielded from experiencing greater pain by being in this host country as opposed to being in Somalia. Peace seems to be the main priority for most of the participants suggesting that this is of great significance and is meaningful to how they experience people, life and the world around them.

For each of the participants, it seems the search for peace-be that peace from war, freedom from exploitation, strife, conflict or be it peace of mind has been not only a driving force behind them fleeing Somalia but has also propelled them to constantly search for it. For most of the Somali women in this research, peace seems to signify the absence of violence. The scope of this research does not encompass a comprehensive perspective around the concept of peace however, it seems to be complex, subjective and hold different meanings for different people especially refugees. This is therefore an area of further exploration particularly centered on the lives and experiences of refugees in search of safety and essentially, peace.

5.6 Conclusion

The testimonies of most of the participants suggest that not all their experiences have been negative and despite the adversities they face on a daily basis, they display resilience in navigating various spaces in and around their community. These women find solace in their faith of a better life and a world filled with possibilities for their children. Although racism, discrimination and prejudice is rife in their communities and in other public and private spaces that they occupy, they seem to find meaning in being able to provide a better quality of life for their children as well as enjoy certain freedoms that they could not have attained in Somalia.

Chapter Six

Conclusion

6.1 Introduction

This chapter offers a concise overview of the research and highlights the main themes that emerged from the findings. It offers a succinct summary of the primary issues that have been grappled with in this research. It highlights the value of using an intersectional framework to unpack the racialised and cultural experiences of Somali women, as well as discusses the limitations of this research. This chapter also provides insights for consideration for future research on the refugee population in South Africa. This section concludes with the researcher's reflexivity section which provides an overview of the research process using a critical lens from the perspective of the researcher.

6.1.1 Concluding Thoughts

The experiences of Somali migrant women are informed not only by their culture but by various political and social factors within the South African context. How they navigate between spaces, construct and reconstruct their identities, is dependent on the multiple and multi-layered intersections of race, class, religion, nationality and gender. It is through an intersectional lens that these experiences can be understood in a holistic manner, taking into account the various nuances that exist. This study has primarily been interested in exploring the racialised and cultural experiences of Somali women residing in a predominantly Muslim community. South Africa's historical legacy of racial segregation and inequality extends to religion where there are fractures along the lines of race and ethnicity. The idea of a universal Muslim identity characterised by a strong brotherhood (and sisterhood) has been challenged and contested in this study. Race and culture are at the epicenter of the discriminatory treatment Somali women are subjected to in their communities and beyond. The experiences of the participants speak to feelings of exclusion, alienation and imaginary racial boundaries in their community that delineate between 'them' and 'us'.

The four main themes that emerged from this study are centered on issues of pain and suffering, ethnic divides, pervading patriarchy and race matters. The participants constructed narratives of persistent pain and suffering, disillusionment but most importantly undying hope and resilience. A major theme that emerged was that of racism experienced by the participants from the Indian community in Mayfair/Fordsburg. There appears to be an invisible divide between Somalis and the South African Indian people with limited integration between the two groups. Furthermore, this has impacted on the interaction among Somali children and Indian children.

Although intersectionality is interested in unearthing the experiences of women's oppression and marginalisation, these women are not constructed as helpless but rather agentic beings. Despite the trauma they have endured, the participants communicated new possibilities of reimagining and making meaning of their lives. The framework employed in this study offers a unique and layered perspective of the lives of Somali refugee women. By considering more than one category of identities where oppression or marginalisation occurs, provides a complex and enriched understanding of experiences that would be limited if only one category of identities was explored (Crenshaw, 1991). Intersectionality calls for the recognition and acknowledgement of the multiple identities of black women and cautions against considering only one element or aspect of identity as this offers a partial and incomplete story of women's experiences. Constructs of race, class, gender, nationality and ethnicity have been a crucial component of this research as Somali refugee women are plagued with a multitude of challenges, discrimination, racism and prejudice which is embedded within these multiple identities.

Intersectionality theory recognises that gender, race, class, sexual orientation and other categories are not mutually exclusive but rather that these distinct identity categories reproduce inequality and reinforce systems of oppression. For instance, an educated Somali Muslim refugee woman may experience some privilege due to her proficiency in English and educational background, which may help her navigate certain spaces within her community with some ease, but may be discriminated and marginalised because of her nationality, race or gender (Erez, Adelman & Gregory,

2009). This illustrates the multiple identities that people possess. On the one hand, one identifies as a raced subject and on the other hand as a subject with a specific educational level. Overlapping systems of oppression and the intersection of multiple identity categories shape an individual's experiences and determine the extent to which women have certain opportunities accessible to them within society. Therefore, intersectionality argues that we cannot ignore or minimise the multiple ways in which these categories merge, overlap and intersect.

Somali refugee women face an array of discrimination on multiple levels. African migrants are constructed as the 'undesirable other'. Historically, particularly under the apartheid regime, South Africa has positioned itself as superior and separate to other African countries. These discourses of exceptionalism continue to prevail and shape the way foreigners are viewed specifically black foreigners from varies parts of the African continent. African migrants with darker skin pigmentation are painted as barbaric, backward, uncivilised against a canvas embedded in racist ideology. The participants in this study do not only have to contend with issues of afrophobia where there is a strong and prominent disdain for their presence among black South Africans, but in many ways, they remain widely unwelcomed and unwanted within the Mayfair/Fordsburg area (Sadouni, 2007).

One of many atrocities of colonisation is cultural pluralism that Essed (1991) describes as a system that preserves, maintains and reinforces racial differences between groups so as to make it appear as though these differences are inherent and therefore warrant for segregation and division between groups. Cultural pluralism exaggerates and magnifies these differences in order to ensure particular groups become identified and remembered by these differences. In South Africa, what we have observed unfolding is black people becoming agents and conductors of their own oppression which is described as the nervous condition (Fanon, 1967). Black South Africans are party to the oppression of black African migrants as there is a focus on arbitrary differences such as phenotypical features which are exaggerated and serve to perpetuate racist ideology. This is in line with Morrison's (1975) thoughts on racism. Morison (1975) explains that the function of racism is merely to serve as a distraction, to keep people so preoccupied and absorbed in minor differences so that

we miss the urgency of the moment while attempting to prove that you matter, that you are equal and that you are capable. The same logic applies for racialising practices and intragroup discrimination amongst the black community.

When describing and theorizing the experiences of racism on the raced subject, the significance of affect and emotion cannot be understated or minimised. Aichhorn & Kronberger (2012) describe emotions as feelings that allow us to understand the experiences we have in relation to the world around us. Affect can be understood in a number of ways. Affect can be conceptualised as feelings or emotions that occur as a result of public or societal opinion of an individual (Fivush, 2009). This supports Lacan's view that people become subjects according to the thoughts others have about him/her (Frie, 1997).

The idea is that people do not exist in a vacuum or separate from the social world and therefore; their experiences, emotions and affect are influenced by this intertwined relationship with the social sphere (Frie, 1997). This relationship does not just interact with the social sphere but implicates those embedded within it. Bulhan (1985) impresses that one cannot be separated from their environment nor their political and historical narratives that make up the way we affectively experience the social world. Du bois (1998) describes the experience of the racialised black body as one that endures conflicted and a somewhat problematic existence in their black skin in a 'white world (Ahmed, 2007). Fanon (1967) continues by explaining that at the point when a black child meets with the white world, an abnormal child is born. This abnormality is an unchangeable consequence of his/her inescapable blackness. This is felt in a prominent way by African migrants who face a double bind in that their blackness is considered "too black" in the South African context by black citizens and also their blackness being problematic in a white, and in this case, an Indian world/community.

Amhed (2004) gives an intriguing explanation of the collective nature of emotions and affect. Emotions do not simply reside in the individual waiting for a moment of extension from the individual to others; but emotions function to collectively bind particular bodies together in what Ahmed (2004) describes as an

affective economic web. Emotions are performative and they do particular things. The attachments we have are circulated between the individual to the larger community; from one subject to the next and in so doing, aligns different bodies between space and time. The intense emotions experienced by subjects in the social world ‘stick' to particular bodies and are then enacted in various ways.

In exploring the lived-experiences of the black subject, affect and emotions cannot be removed from our understanding of how these bodies relate to others and themselves in the world. Participants express feelings of abandonment, fear, loss, joy, relief, desperation, despair and sadness in the accounts of their experiences. These feelings are integral to how they make sense of the world around them and give us insight into their internal processes. Interpretative phenomenological analysis is interested in these aspects of people’s lived experiences and emphasizes the need for understanding emotion, feelings and the affective states of people; these form part of their experiences (Willig, 2013).

Identity is understood as fluid, and a continuous process that is ever changing and evolving over time (Hall, 1991). Upon entering South Africa, Somali women have had to contend with multiple identities which include that of ‘foreigner’. The Mayfair/Fordsburg community may provide some sense of belonging and allow for preservation of both a cultural and religious identity for these displaced groups of people. The participants shed light on the internal ethnic fractures that exist among Somalis. Class differences as well as tribal conflicts have created parameters between Somalis which contribute to further divisions in the spaces they occupy. Language barriers and the inability to communicate in English have social consequences for some of the Somali women specifically when attempting to access services in public spaces. The feeling of being a foreigner is pervasive and prevalent within and beyond their immediate community.

Their lives are constructed against a background of continuous and significant loss. Prior to migration, during the journey of migration and post resettlement, they experience challenges and adversities that are usually traumatic in nature. In the quest of forging a new life and identity in their host countries, they continue to experience

perpetual trauma; their suffering appears to present itself on an unending continuum. A common characteristic among all the participants is their hopefulness about the future and a desire for an existential way of making meaning of their lives. They do not speak of an idealistic and unrealistic future, but they do allude to desiring a world where they will not be discriminated against based on their religion, gender or nationality. What these participants seem to long for is equality and fairness, which is the kind of world we should all be progressing towards.

6.1.2 Limitations of study

Lopez, Figueroa, Connor & Maliski (2008) argue that cross cultural qualitative research is difficult to conduct due to the issue of reliability and accuracy. The language barrier was one of the main challenges as it made it difficult to establish rapport with the participants as most communication was conveyed through the interpreter. Meaning may have been lost due to the linguistic differences between English and Somali and some of the subtleties and nuances that may be specific to the Somali language may have been obscured in the translation process. (Wong & Poon, 2010) argue that interpreters are not neutral beings because they also covey what is said from an "autobiographical" context which may affect the text and its meaning. This poses as a challenge in cross cultural qualitative research as Temple & Young (2004) argue that issues of linguistic power should not be undermined when conducting research but rather engaged with by researchers.

It can be argued that expecting for a marginalised group of people to be open and honest with a stranger (the researcher) is an unreasonable request. It is possible that due to the nature of this research and the sensitivity of some aspects that were discussed, the participants were likely apprehensive about sharing intimate stories of their experiences with an unfamiliar individual who they may have considered an outsider. This can be regarded as a limitation of the study. According to Murray (2003), in order to mitigate this, it is recommended that the researcher make contact with participants on several occasions. While this may be valuable to establish rapport and get buy-in of the participants, it is not necessarily feasible or practical in all research studies. Most of the participants in this study work during the day to provide

for their families and would have been unable to meet on several occasions. Furthermore, this would have required a long-term commitment to the research which may have not been realistic for these participants.

In seeking to explore experiences of people, Parker (2003) cautions against the researcher searching for an ultimate 'truth' of human experience or seeking to uncover underlying meaning where it is not being expressed or communicated. The aim or focus of research should not be rooted in a quest to find 'truth' but instead, to explore the varied ways that people construct their identities and make meaning of their stories and experiences in ways which become true for them (Parker, 2003). Therefore, the experiences of the participants are subjective and are shaped by several factors such as their social, political and historical context and cannot, and should not, be conceptualised as 'the truth' but merely a representation of their realities (Willig, 2013).

Qualitative research but in particular IPA typically retrieves data from a small pool of participants which means the findings cannot be generalised to the larger population. The experiences of the seven Somali women in this study provide some context and insight into their racialised and cultural experiences but this does not suggest that the general community members of Mayfair would express these experiences. However, despite the small pool of participants, the quality of the data was not compromised or lacking as they provided a rich understanding of their lived experiences. Furthermore, the seven women were allowed a voice on a topic that has been under researched as they shed light on issues of racism within their community.

Lastly, from a methodological perspective, the data may have been richer had a narrative approach been used for this research topic. This would have allowed for participants to 'track' their lives stories in a way that would provide a beginning, middle and end of their experiences. Squire (2005) argues that simple questions such as "tell me a story about…" allows for people to replay certain events of their lives as they happened which provides a cultural trace as well as an expression of their lives and identities. This would have also allowed for their stories to be foregrounded and told in a way that would allow the individual to make meaning of their own stories

(McAdams, 2001).

6.1.3 Recommendations

Taking into account some of the findings, a number of recommendations have been made which could be used for future research or provide suggestions for potential community interventions within the Mayfair/Fordsburg area.

6.1.3.1 Mental health

There appears to be an overall lack of knowledge about mental illness which may impact the ways that participants are able to help their children cope with trauma, depression or anxiety. This calls for more services aimed at caring and supporting children who may be presented with mental health challenges. There is also a need for targeted campaigns aimed at raising awareness about mental health specifically in the Mayfair/Fordsburg area, as this is a concentrated group of people who have a predisposition to PTSD (and other mental illnesses) due to prior exposure to traumatic events (Saddock, Saddock & Ruiz, 2015).

6.1.3.2 Cyber groups

Social media platforms and technology may be considered as a viable option to support Somali women who have been victims of sexual violence. Due to the stigma and shame associated with rape and sexual assault, particularly among a highly religious group of individuals, women may be less likely to seek individual, face-to-face counselling services. Introducing a group chat that allows anonymity among the women but also a safe space to speak about their experiences, may offer some solace as women are allowed to communicate with other Somalis who have encountered similar experiences in a less intrusive way.

6.1.3.3 Support groups

Grief and loss are characteristic of a number of the experiences shared by the participants. Support groups could be introduced in the community to help some

women who are facing loss and are grieving. Taking into account that the Somali culture is rooted in collectivism, it may be appropriate for these women to share in their grieving and find ways of supporting one another. This will not only forge a sense of solidarity but also empower the women in the community, as they will be tasked with finding ways of offering support to one another. This may also address the sense of loss of community expressed by the participants. Ali, Lui & Humedian (2004) state that Muslims are more likely to deal with depression by drawing from their Islamic faith and social support. This strengthens the idea of having more support groups in the community so that Somali women have a network of people to lean on and resources at their disposable within their community.

6.1.3.4 Community integration

A dominant theme in the findings is the lack of integration among community members and reports of racism and discrimination. One practical way to address these tensions could occur through community forums that encourage inclusivity between Somalis and other African nationals as well as the Indian South African community members. In order for this to be effective, community leaders representing the interests of all the members within the community would need to be at the forefront and lead these discussions. This would resemble an 'imbizo'[4] type of setting which would allow a safe space for community members to address cultural differences that may be contributing to segregation, racism and intolerance. These forums could be held on a monthly basis and have community members congregate at a community hall or a neutral environment that would be accessible for all. However, this would require the buy-in of community members and a collective commitment to change.

6.1.3.5 Tribalism

Issues of tribalism were established and participants reported that this impacts on their social interactions with members from other tribes, and has serious

[4] An 'Imbizo' is a South African Zulu term that refers to a forum for discussion of policy or a forum to settle disputes within the community. It is a forum traditionally called by the Zulu King or community leaders

implications on their ability to survive both financially and otherwise in their community. This is a complex issue that cannot easily be resolved however; it is imperative that future interventions keep these nuances in mind when engaging with the community.

6.1.3.6 Training

Due to language barriers and the lack of proficiency in English by a number of Somalis, it is essential that members of the Somali community (who are proficient in both languages) be trained as lay counselors and facilitators. This will also provide these women with a skill set which may empower them to help their communities in more effective ways and better their own lives. The women in this research have demonstrated that they are resilient and able to adapt and it is these qualities that could serve them in improving their community.

6.2 Reflexivity

There is a distinction made between reflection and reflexivity that are each rooted in different ontological and epistemological assumptions which have implications on how one responds to and approaches research as well as other spheres of practice. Cunliffe & Jun (2005 p. 226) state that "Reflection is traditionally defined as a mirror image—an objectivist ontology based on the idea that there is an original reality we can think about and separate ourselves from." It does not require one to question our own biases, prejudice or systems of power; it merely entails thinking about a situation in a removed manner. On the other hand, critical reflexivity requires a shifting and unsettling of basic assumptions, discourses, widely held beliefs or practices. Reflexivity also entails questioning our own thinking and critically examining our ways of interacting with others.

Critical approaches to reflexivity draw from critical theory, post structural and post modern thinking which is interested in questioning ideological assumptions underlying text, language and truth claims (Cuncliff & Jun, 2005). D'Cruz,

Gillingham, Melendez (2007) add that critical reflexivity allows room for interrogating power relations and knowledge between professionals and those whom they claim to serve in public spaces; it allows for opportunities for emancipation.

Cruz & Sonn, (2010) argue that critical reflexivity should go beyond a basic and superficial level of self-awareness and should also involve researchers, specifically community psychologists, to question their own contributions to oppression and to issues of power and liberation. In taking this seriously, I have chosen to engage with my own experiences in a critically reflexive manner. Remaining true to the importance of intersectionality used in this research, I position self in terms of my gender, class, race and nationality alongside my own privilege.

Having worked with refugees before, and having chosen to conduct a study on refugee women, I felt comfortable and excited to engage with them. Upon entering Mayfair for the first time, I felt like an alien, foreign in some ways. I was immediately struck by the vast differences in Mayfair compared to what I am used to. I noticed that although there were many vehicles, most drivers were predominately male. I also become very conscious of my vehicle that would be classified as a high-end or luxury vehicle. I begun to feel out of place because of my attire, not because I was indecently or inappropriately dressed, but because it was obvious that I was an 'outsider'. I felt embarrassed that I did not make an effort to wear what would be deemed as 'acceptable' in Muslim culture such as a loose-fitting dress and covering my hair. As I walked down the streets of Mayfair with the interpreter, I felt unsafe and it felt as though the gaze of all the men in the neighbourhood was upon me. It felt as though I had invaded their space.

I felt like a tourist taking a journey in a different world and I was interested in learning about their world especially as an individual who does not share in their religious beliefs, customs or culture. I use the word tourist deliberately because most of the time, I felt as though I was out of South Africa. The interpreter gave me a 'tour' of the community where I saw a number of places like shopping centers, mosques and coffee shops. I walked the streets and was guided in a way that resembles being a tourist with their tour guide. While I was in Mayfair I didn't come across many black South Africans that I could greet in vernacular just so I didn't feel so isolated and alone. Even though I am South African, as are the Indian people in the Mayfair

community, I didn't feel like they were 'my own' because where race and nationality intersect, I did not feel presented in terms of black South Africans, which only amplified my fear and discomfort.

This initial encounter in the Mayfair community evoked a number of emotional responses in me. After leaving Mayfair upon my first introduction to the area, I was left feeling rattled, bewildered and angry. With continuous critical reflexivity, I realized that my anger stemmed from an unconscious belief that 'they' (foreign nationals) are not 'allowed' to take over space in such a way that I, a rightful citizen, am made to feel foreign and displaced within *my* own country and in *my* city. I had not realized that I held such prejudices against foreign nationals and that I had unconsciously internalised these discourses of exceptionalism that are prevalent in the media and in everyday chatter. I was also infuriated by the way the men in that community made me feel; it wasn't so much what they did or didn't do or what they said, it was just their glaring eyes and a certain air of authority that they carried. I began to feel pity for the Muslim women. From my perspective, they were entrapped in a strict cultural system that offered little freedom and only further oppressed them. From my perspective, these women were products of a deeply patriarchal system that only serves to enslave them and while, in theory that may be true for most women, what was imperative was that they did not articulate these feelings to me; these were my *own* feelings and opinions.

I was mindful of this when introducing myself to the first two participants and I became aware that I had unintentionally framed these women as powerless, helpless people to be pitied. I was conscious of the ways that this would impact on how I interpret their stories and might have felt the urge to exaggerate their pain and suffering. Simply acknowledging this and being aware of my own emotional investment in these women's stories and lives as well as my own need to "fight on their behalf" was crucial in a number of ways. Firstly, I had to interrogate my own definition of feminism while consciously choosing to suspend my own biases about the way they chose to live, dress and behave. Secondly, I was forced to question whose voice I was representing, theirs or mine? Furthermore, who am I to decide what kind of woman my participants choose to be or what kind of attire they choose to wear? The operative word in this statement is 'choose'; these Somali women have

made choices and continue to do so on a daily basis.

This reminded me of Prilleltensky (2008) who argues that often community psychologists and researchers have the impression that they are liberating individuals and communities when they are in fact, reproducing oppressive norms. Researchers typically approach communities from a place of authority or expertise assuming that knowledge production is top-down as opposed to being co-created with community members (Prilleltensky, 2008). I took this seriously in how I engaged with participants as I went into their space with genuine curiosity about their culture wanted to learn as much as I could. Though I did admit to my own prejudice towards some aspects of their lives, I was interested in understanding and knowing more about these women's lives. It is in these practical experiences that one's application of theoretical knowledge is truly put to the test in a very real way.

My first encounter in Mayfair made me feel unsettled and on edge; at times I wanted to be invisible so much so that upon my return to the community the following week, I deliberately wore a loose-fitting dress and head scarf, even though I am not Muslim. I did this because I wanted to protect myself against the gaze of the men in the community and the uncomfortable stares I used to get. I also did this to protect myself because in my mind, I would not stand out and was therefore not a threat. Thinking back to that moment, I recall the female interpreter giving me a warm embrace when she saw my attire and commented on how beautiful my scarf was. It seemed she appreciated my efforts to 'blend in' not so much with the community but with the women I would be engaging with. This seemed to forge a deeper connection between the participants and myself because even though I was a researcher, I was also there as a female who, on some level, could relate to some their experiences.

At times, I experienced some resistance from the participants but the sense I got was that this had more to do with sharing intimate details of their experiences with a stranger than it had to do with me in particular. Instead of pushing harder to get richer data (for my own interests), I would reassure participants that they didn't have to share what they were not comfortable sharing. This was important, not only because each participant signed a form stating that this was their right, but because I recognised that for many of these women, this was their first time ever telling their stories and I respected that process beyond my own agenda.

I would like to reflect on an incident that occurred where one of the participants offered me a soft drink while we were conducting the interviews in her home. The participants were generally welcoming and would offer refreshments even though I insisted that I would do without. This was the first time I had been offered a beverage and was unsure of how to manage the situation, not because I did not necessarily want to drink what I was offered, but because my personal preference is not for 'fizzy' drinks but juice instead. I had a few sips of the cool drink but left most of it untouched. Upon leaving, I reflected on this more deeply and I felt not only embarrassed but also ashamed because it was in this moment that class become salient. These women have expressed their financial struggles with me throughout the interview process and yet would still offer me a beverage out of courtesy and respect for me, yet I let my privilege and preference for taste cloud that moment. Without knowing it, I had positioned myself as the superior outsider and researcher who had only come to gather information but without engaging and genuinely trying to connect with the community members.

What was useful throughout this process was having a supervisor who encouraged me to go deeper and who also seemed genuinely invested in my growth. My supervisor not only encouraged the reflexivity but would point out areas where I was oblivious to my class and how this tended to impact on how interacted with the participants, for a lack of an eloquent term; I was called out about being uppity which may have come across feeling superior to the participants. This entire experience broaden my mind and thinking in such profound ways and also enabled me to grow both professionally and personally. Instead of merely reflecting on the story I shared above, I decided to intentionally make changes when engaging with other participants in later interviews that were scheduled. I requested that the interpreter teach me a few words such as 'thank you' and 'hello' which I used throughout my time in Mayfair. I began to see the value in wearing different attire and at this point, it had very little to do with me, but was about the community itself and respecting their culture. The next time I was offered a soft drink, I drank it without hesitation recognizing that it is these small gestures that foster real connections that help to bridge the gap between 'us' and 'them'.

Admittedly, at first I felt I needed my supervisor to be there with me when

conducting the interviews and this was because I felt unsafe in the neighbourhood but as time passed, I felt more confident to make contact with the participants without being accompanied. Having my supervisor there was both reassuring but also problematic in that I felt that I was being observed for my skills (or lack therefore). So while this was beneficial because there was a sense of security (because my supervisor understands Muslim culture and could relate to the participants in a different way than I could), I was self-conscious and felt slightly insecure as I worried about doing the interviews in the "right" way. I realized that this was my *own* insecurities that stem from my own preoccupation with perfection. Being in my head in this manner was preventing me from truly being in the moment and fully engaging with the participants I was with at the time. I had to consciously shift the focus from self to what was being said in the room.

My training as a therapist served me while conducting the interviews in that I was able to sit with the discomfort in the room as they told their stories but also provide a holding environment where there were tears and an outpouring of emotions. I found that I was able to contain the participants in a way that didn't hinder the interview process but actually facilitated movement in the process. I think being confronted with some of the terrifying stories I heard may have been unsettling for some researchers who may have not been accustomed to dealing with people who have been through traumatic experiences, but I felt secure in my own ability to manage both their feelings and my own. Phenomenology is not only a description, but it is also an interpretive process in which the researcher makes an interpretation of the meaning of the lived experiences. My training assisted me in interpreting the meaning behind the experiences of the participants. The major challenge was trying to remain a researcher without slipping into my propensity to be a therapist. I was mindful of moments where I wanted to make interpretations and engage in a therapeutic space and instead, I would allow moments of silence and nod gently to indicate that I empathized with their pain. My background and training as a therapist allowed a certain sensitivity in my approach to the community that I don't think I may have had without it.

My role as a researcher was undeniably intertwined in power dynamics as I got the impression that the participants hoped that I could 'do something' to help or

assist them in some way. Perhaps I was viewed as someone with more power than they have because not only am I a South African citizen (who maybe has connections and access to resources that could assist them), I am also affiliated with a higher learning institution (who may also be interested in finding ways of improving their lives). This was the difficult part of the research process because I could sense the desperation in the voices of most of the participants as they conveyed their hardships. I got the impression that they wanted more than I could offer and while speaking about their experiences may have been therapeutic for some, it may have been retraumatising for others and perhaps being given something tangible (such as food, clothing etc) may have felt that the process was not in vain.

I have to admit that I had to grapple with a number of tensions and contradictions in the women's experiences and repeatedly asked myself why some of these women didn't move out of their surroundings and leave the ills that they are experiencing within their community. In this, I realize my own privilege. I am a South African citizen who can move (fairly) easily and navigate different spaces across not only the Gauteng province but also the country. My nationality provides me with access to employment opportunities and freedom of movement that is not necessarily accessible to this group of people. My taken for granted stance that one can simply 'pick up and go' is a luxury to some of these women and poses a serious risk to their safety and their lives. These are some of my own internal struggles with feelings of guilt for being privileged and for having the choice to enter and exit their realities. I could leave Mayfair when we were finished but they have to live with what they shared, they cannot simply disappear or escape.

Race is also an important aspect for me to reflect on. As a black woman who has been wounded in many ways by racism, prejudice and sexism, I am primarily interested in hearing about stories and experiences of other black women that I can personally relate to because they tend to reflect my daily experiences. Though I do not share the same culture as Somali women, there were many facets of their culture that resonated with my upbringing, socialization and understanding of how the world works. Being black, despite feeling like a foreigner in Mayfair, made me feel more at ease because amidst a myriad of difference, this seemed to be something I overtly had in common with the participants. I felt that in giving these women a voice, that my

own story was being heard in some ways because I too, am a woman living in fear for her safety when maneuvering certain public spaces. I too, have been silenced because I am a woman but more specifically because as a *black* women, it has at times felt that I am not allowed to speak or be heard and that being able to do so, is a favour or courtesy. Depending on the situation, I am either granted access in certain spaces or denied it. These are the intersections that minorities have to contend with daily.

It is my hope that through this research people in general but especially the everyday South African citizen, would empathize with refugees given our violent and traumatic history as a country, and that people would be able to relate to the pain and loss articulated in the stories of these women. I have been deeply moved and inspired by the participants and a part of me desperately hopes that people will be consumed by compassion; the kind of compassion that looks beyond nationality and trivial differences between 'us' and 'them', to a space where simply being human is enough to warrant mutual respect, tolerance and kindness. While refugees are marginalised and discriminated against, may they also be acknowledged for their remarkable resilience and undying search for a better tomorrow because it is this audacious spirit that ushered South Africa from oppression to freedom.

Reference List

Adjai, C., & Lazaridis, G. (2013). Migration, xenophobia and new racism in post-apartheid South Africa. *Int'l J. Soc. Sci. Stud.*, *1*, 192.*Admiration & Society*, *37*(2), 225–242.

Ahmed, S. (1999). Islam and development: Opportunities and constraints for Somali women. *Gender & Development*, *7*(1), 69–72.

Ahmed, S. (2004). Affective economies. *Social Text,* 22 (2), pp. 117-139

Ahmed, S. (2007). A phenomenology of Whiteness. *Feminist Theory, 8, (2)*, pp. 149-168.

Aichorn, B & Kronberger, B. (2010). The nature of emotions: A psychological perspective.
Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Yearbook, 1, 515-526

Alase, A. (2017). The interpretative phenomenological analysis (IPA): A guide to a good qualitative research approach. *International Journal of Education and Literacy Studies*, *5*(2), 9–19.

Ali, S. R., Liu, B. M., & Humedian, M. (2004). Islam 101: Understanding the religion and therapy implications. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, *35*(6), 635.

Anderson, B. (1983). Imagined Communities. London: Verso, 6.

Aranda, E., & Vaquera, E. (2015). Racism, the immigration enforcement regime, and the implications for racial inequality in the lives of undocumented young adults. *Sociology of Race and Ethnicity*, *1*(1), 88–104.

Atieno, O, P. (2009). An analysis of the strengths and limitation of qualitative and quantitative research paradigms. *Problems of Education in the 21st Century*, 13, 13-18

Bagwasi, M. (2003). The functional distribution of Setswana and English in Botswana. Culture and Curriculum, 16 (2), 212-217

Bashir, M., Afzal, T.M., Azeem, M. (2008). *Reliability and Validity of Qualitative and Operational Research Paradigm*. Pakistan: University of Education

Bastia, T. (2014). Intersectionality, migration and development. *Progress in Development Studies*, *14*(3), 237–248.

Biko, S. (1978). black consciousness and the quest for a true humanity. *Ufahamu: A Journal of African Studies*, *8*(3).

Boss, P., & Dahl, C. M. (2014). Family therapy for the unresolved grief of ambiguous loss. *Bereavement Care for Families*, 171–182.

Bourdieu, P. (1991). *Language and symbolic power*. Harvard University Press.

Breytenbach. K. 2006. Somalis are suffering the Brunt of Xenophobia. Capes Times
Brocki, J. M., Wearden. A.J. (2006). A critical evaluation of the use interpretative phenomenological analysis (IPA) in health psychology. *Psychology and Health, 21,* 1, 87-108

Brokenleg, M. (2012). Transforming cultural trauma into resilience. *Reclaiming Children and Youth*, *21*(3), 9.

Bulhan, B. A (1985). *Frantz Fanon and the psychology of oppression*. New York, NY:

Cadwallader, J. (2007). Suffering difference: Normalisation and power. *Social Semiotics*, *17*(3), 375–394.

Canada. *International Migration and Integration*, 11, 295-313

Carastathis, A. (2014). The concept of intersectionality in feminist theory. *Philosophy*

Cassell, E. J. (1998). The nature of suffering and the goals of medicine. *Loss, Grief & Care*, *8*(1–2), 129–142.

Chang, R. S., & Culp Jr, J. M. (2002). After intersectionality. *UMKC L. Rev.*, *71*, 485.

Cho, S., Crenshaw, K. B., & McCall, L. (2013). Toward a field of intersectionality studies: Theory, applications, and praxis. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, *38*(4), 785–810.

Chowdhury, F. D. (2009). Theorising patriarchy: The Bangladesh context. *Asian Journal of Social Science*, *37*(4), 599–622.

Christensen, A. (2009). Belonging and Unbelonging from an Intersectional Perspective,

Cicchetti,D.(2006).Anecological-transactional perspective on child maltreatment. In D. Cicchetti & D. Cohen (Eds.), Developmental psychopathology (2nd ed.), Vol. 3:

Coffey, G. J., Kaplan, I., Sampson, R. C., & Tucci, M. M. (2010). The meaning and mental health consequences of long-term immigration detention for people seeking asylum. *Social Science & Medicine*, *70*(12), 2070–2079.

Colic-Peisker, V. (2005). 'At least you're the right colour': Identity and social inclusion of Bosnian refugees in Australia. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, *31*(4), 615–638.

Collins, P. B. (1990). *black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of*

Collins, P. B. (1998). *Fighting words: black women and the search for justice.*

Minneapolis,

Collins, P. B. (2015). Intersectionality's definitional dilemmas. *Annual Review of Sociology, Compass*, *9*(5), 304–314.

Creese, G. (2010). Erasing English language competency: African migrants in Vancouver, Canada. *International Migration and Integration*, 11, 295-313

Crenshaw, K. (1991) Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color. Stanford Law Review, 43(6), 1241-1299.

Crush, J. (2007). Voices from The Margins: Migrant Women's Experiences in South Africa,

Crush, J. & Tawodzera, G. (2014). Medical Xenophobia and Zimbabwean Migrant Access to Public Health Services. Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 40(4), 655–670, http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2013.830504

Cruz, M., & Sonn, C. (2010). (De)colonizing Culture in Community Psychology: Reflections. *Culture and Curriculum*, 16 (2), 212-217

Cunliffe, A. L., & Jun, J. S. (2005). The need for reflexivity in public administration.

D'cruz, B., Gillingham, P., & Melendez, S. (2007). Reflexivity, its meanings and relevance for social work: A critical review of the literature. *The British Journal of Social Work*, *37*(1), 73–90.

Dobson, S. (2012). Reconciling local with global: New Zealand Muslim women articulating faith in their lives. *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, *13*(3), 228–244.

Ellis, B., MacDonald, B.Z., Klunk-Gillis, J., Lincoln, A., Strunin, L., & Cabral, B. J. (2010). Discrimination and mental health among Somali refugee adolescents: The role of acculturation and gender. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, *80*(4), 564. *empowerment*. Boston, MA: Unwin Hyman.

Erez, E., Adelman, M., & Gregory, C. (2009). Intersections of immigration and domestic violence: Voices of battered immigrant women. *Feminist Criminology*, *4*(1), 32–56.

Essed, P. (1991). *Understanding everyday racism*. Newbury Park: Sage

Fanon, F. (1967). Black skin, white masks. Trans. C. L Markmann: Pluto Press

Few, A. L. (2007). Integrating black consciousness and critical race feminism into family studies research. *Journal of Family Issues*, *28*(4), 452–473.

Fivush, R. (2010). Speaking silence: The social construction of silence in autobiographical

Foucault, M. (1991). *The Foucault effect: Studies in governmentality*. University of Chicago Press.

Fraser, B. (2004). Doing narrative research: Analysing personal stories line by line. *Qualitative Social Work*, *3*(2), 179–201.

Frie, R. (1997). *Subjectivity and intersubjectivity in modern philosophy and psychoanalysis: A study of Sartre, Binswanger, Lacan, and Habermas*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Gravetter, F., & Forzano, L. (2012). Research methods for behavioural sciences (4th Ed). Belmont: Wadsworth Cengage Learning

Gray, J., & Cooke, M. (2018). Intersectionality, language and queer lives. *Gender and Language*, *12*(4), 401–415.

Grillo, T. (1995). Anti-essentialism and intersectionality: Tools to dismantle the master's house. *Berkeley Women's LJ*, *10*, 16.

Gundel, J. (2009). Clans in Somalia. *Austrian Red Cross, Vienna. Available at: Http://black. Ecoi. Net/File_upload/90_1261130976_accord-Report-Clans-in-Somalia-Revised-Edition-20091215. Pdf [Accessed 18 October 2012].*

Gunn, T. J. (2003). Shaping an Islamic identity: Religion, Islamism, and the state in Central Asia. *Sociology of Religion*, *64*(3), 389–410.

Hall, S. (1996). Who needs identity. *Questions of Cultural Identity*, *16*(2), 1–17.

Hall, S. (2000). Old and new ethnicities. In L. B Solomos, *Theories of race and racism:* (pp. 144-153). New York & London: Routledge

Hamzeh, M. Z., & Oliver, K. (2010). Gaining research access into the lives of Muslim girls: Researchers negotiating muslimness, modesty, inshallah, and haram. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, *23*(2), 165–180.

Hancock, A.-M. (2007). Intersectionality as a normative and empirical paradigm. *Politics & Gender*, *3*(2), 248–254.

Handmaker, J. & Parsley, J. 2001. Migration, refugees and racism in South Africa. Refuge, 20(1): 40-51.

Harris, B. (2001, August). A Foreign Experience: Violence, Crime and Xenophobia during South Africa's Transition. Violence and transition Series, 5, 1-140.

Harris, B. (2002). Xenophobia: A new pathology for a new South Africa. *Psychopathology and Social Prejudice*, 169–184.

Hlatshwayo, M., & Vally, S. (2014). Violence, resilience and solidarity: The right to education for child migrants in South Africa. *School Psychology International*, *35*(3), 266–279.

Holm, A., Bégat, I., & Severinsson, E. (2009). Emotional pain: Surviving mental health problems related to childhood experiences. *Journal of Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing*, *16*(7), 636–645.

Holmes, T. B., & Rahe, R. (1967). The social readjustment rating scale. *Journal of Psychosomatic Research*.

Holzer, G.-S. (2008). Political Islam in Somalia. *Geopolitics of the Middle East*, *1*(1), 23–42.

Hungwe, C., & Gelderblom, D. (2014). Understanding the Social Exclusion of Zimbabwean Migrants in Johannesburg, South Africa. *Journal of Community Positive Practices*, *1*, 75–91.i.org/10.1080/1369183X.2013.830504

Isike, E. M. (2017). An Analysis of African Female Migration to South Africa: The Case of Mozambican Female Migrants in Mpumalanga, Gender and Behaviour, 8550-8565.

Jacobucci, N. (n.d.). *Grief and Losses in an Immigration Process: A constant resignification*.

Jordan, J. V. (2010). Relational-cultural therapy. *Handbook of Counseling Women*, 63–73.

Kamwangamalu, N. M. (2003). Globalization of English, and language maintenance and shift in South Africa. International Journal of the Sociology of Language, 164, 65-81.

Karenian, B., Livaditis, M., Karenian, S., Zafiriadis, K., Bochtsou, V., & Xenitidis, K. (2011). Collective trauma transmission and traumatic reactions among descendants of Armenian refugees. *International Journal of Social Psychiatry*, *57*(4), 327–337.

Karibu. (2009, May 2). Retrieved from Academia.eu: http://black.academia.edu/5626532/Xenophobia_Police_harassment_of_migrants

Kawachi, I., & Berkman, L. F. (2001). Social ties and mental health. *Journal of Urban Health*, *78*(3), 458–467.

Kelly and van der Reit (2001). Participatory research in community settings: processes, methods, and challenges. In M. Seedat, N. Duncan, & S. Lazarus (Eds.) Community Psychology: theory, method and practice (pp.159-184). Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Khunou, G. (2010). What middle class? The shifting and dynamic nature if class position. University of Witwatersrand

Krige, D. (2012). Histories and changing dynamics of housing, social class and social mobility in black Johannesburg. *Interdisciplinary Journal for the Study of the Arts and Humanities in South Africa*. 19 (1), 19-45

Kumari, S. (2012). Burmese refugee women in India: Victims and agents of empowerment. *South Asian Journal of Peacebuilding*, *4 (*1), Retrieved on December 05, 2013 from http://black.wiscomp.org/peaceprints.htm

Kwon, E., & Adams, T. L. (2018). Choosing a Specialty: Intersections of Gender and Race among Asian and white Women Medical Students in Ontario. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, *50*(3), 49–68.

Lamola, M. J. (2018). The de-Africanisation of the African National Congress, Afrophobia in South Africa and the Limpopo River Fever. *Filosofia Theoretica: Journal of African Philosophy, Culture and Religions*, *7*(3), 72–93.

Landau, L., Ramjathan-Keogh, K., & Singh, G. (2004). Background Briefing Document prepared for parliamentary hearings on 'Xenophobia and Problems Related to It.' *Written on Behalf of the South African Human Rights Commission for the South African Ministries of Foreign and Home Affairs*.

Missing is Landau 2009

Landau, Loren B. (2006). Protection and dignity in Johannesburg: Shortcomings of South Africa's urban refugee policy. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, *19*(3), 308–327.

Landau, Loren Brett, Ramjathan-Keogh, K., & Singh, G. (2005). *Xenophobia in South Africa and problems related to it*. Forced Migration Studies Programme, University of the Witwatersrand Johannesburg.

Larkin, P. J., Dierckx de Casterlé, B., & Schotsmans, P. (2007). Multilingual translation issues in qualitative research: Reflections on a metaphorical process. *Qualitative Health Research*, *17*(4), 468–476.

Lazarus, S. (2019). 'Some Animals Are More Equal Than Others': The Hierarchy of Citizenship in Austria. *Laws*, *8*(3), 14.

Lee, J. (2000). The salience of race in everyday life: black customers' shopping experiences in black and white neighborhoods. *Work and Occupations*, *27*(3), 353–376.

Lefebvre, B. (1991) The production of space (1974-French). Malden: Blackwell Publishing.

Lenette, C., Brough, M., & Cox, L. (2013). Everyday resilience: Narratives of single refugee women with children. *Qualitative Social Work*, *12*(5), 637–653.

Link, B. G., Yang, L. B, Phelan, J. C., & Collins, P. B. (2004). Measuring mental illness stigma. *Schizophrenia Bulletin*, *30*(3), 511–541.

Lippi-Green, R. (1997). *English with an accent: Language, ideology and*

discrimination in the United States. New York: Routledge Littlefield

Lopez, G. I., Figueroa, M., Connor, S. E., & Maliski, S. L. (2008). Translation barriers in conducting qualitative research with Spanish speakers. *Qualitative Health Research*, *18*(12), 1729–1737.

Mabandla, N. (2013). *Lahla Ngubo: The continuities and discontinuities of a South African black middle class*. African Studies Center: Lieden

Malan, C., & Walker, G. (1991). *The relationship between culture and language in SA*.

Malik, K. (1996). *The meaning of race: Race, history and culture in Western society*. Macmillan International Higher Education.

Mandivenga, E. C. (2000). The Cape Muslims and the Indian Muslims of South Africa: A Comparative Analysis. *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, *20*(2), 347–352.

Mario Matsinhe, D. (2011). Africa's Fear of Itself: The ideology of Makwerekwere in South Africa. *Third World Quarterly*, *32*(2), 295–313.

Marshall, S. E., & Stokes, R. G. (1981). Tradition and the veil: Female status in Tunisia and Algeria. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, *19*(4), 625–646.

Martin, P. L. (1991). *The unfinished story: Turkish labour migration to Western Europe: With special reference to the Federal Republic of Germany* (Vol. 84). International Labour Organization.

Masenya, M. J. (2017). Afrophobia in South Africa: A General Perspective of Xenophobia. Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology, 14 (1), 81 – 88.

Matsinhe, D. (2011). Africa's fear of itself: The ideology of Makwerekwere in South Africa. The World Quarterly, 32(2), 295-313. doi:10.1080/01436597.2011.560470

Matsinhe, D. (2011). Africa's Fear of Itself: The ideology of Makwerekwere in South Africa. *Third World Quarterly*, *32*(2), 295–313.

Matsuda, M. J (1991). Voices of America: Accent, antidiscrimination law, and jurisprudence for the last reconstruction. *The Yale law Journal*, 100 (5), 1329-1407

May, V. M. (2014). "Speaking into the void"? Intersectionality critiques and epistemic backlash. *Hypatia*, *29*(1), 94–112.

McAdams, D.P. (2001). The psychology of life stories. Review of General Psychology, 5, 100– 122.

McCall, L. (2005). The complexity of intersectionality. Signs, 30, 1771–1800.

McCall, L. (2008). The complexity of intersectionality. In *Intersectionality and beyond* (pp. 65–92). Routledge-Cavendish.

McMichael, C. (2002). 'Everywhere is Allah's place': Islam and the everyday life of Somali women in Melbourne, Australia. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, *15*(2), 171–188.

Menkhaus, K. (2002). Political Islam in Somalia. *Middle East Policy*, *9*(1), 109–123.

Menzies, P. (2010). *Intergenerational trauma from a mental health perspective*. MI: University of Minnesota.

Miles, R. (2004). *Racism*. Routledge.

Miller, A. F. (2013). The non-religious patriarchy: Why losing religion has not meant losing white male dominance. *CrossCurrents*, *63*(2), 211–226.

Mkhize, N., & Kiguwa, P. (2004). *Critical psychology*. Juta and Company Ltd.

Moghadam, V. M. (2004). Patriarchy in transition: Women and the changing family in the Middle East. *Journal of Comparative Family Studies*, *35*(2), 137–162.

Mohamed, S. B. (2017). *The Role of Tribalism in Somali Politics*

Moodley, K., & Adam, B. (2000). Race and nation in post-apartheid South Africa. *Current Sociology*, *48*(3), 51–69.

Moolman, B. (2013). Rethinking 'masculinities in transition'in South Africa considering the 'intersectionality'of race, class, and sexuality with gender. *African Identities*, *11*(1), 93–105.

Morales, A., & Hanson, B. E. (2005, November 4). Language Brokering: An integrative review of literature. Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 27(4), 471-503.

Morrison, T. (1975). Black studies Center public dialogue part 2. Portland State

Murray, M. J. (2003). Alien strangers in our midst: The dreaded foreign invasion and "Fortress South Africa." *Canadian Journal of African Studies/La Revue Canadienne Des Études Africaines*, *37*(2–3), 440–466.

Nash, J. C. (2008). Re-thinking intersectionality. *Feminist Review*, *89*(1), 1–15.

Neocosmos M (2008) The politics of fear and the fear of politics: Reflections on xenophobic violence in South Africa. Journal of Asian and African Studies 43(6): 586-594 (as cited in Chiweshe, 2016)

Nordgren, L. F., Banas, K., & MacDonald, G. (2011a). Empathy gaps for social pain: Why people underestimate the pain of social suffering. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *100*(1), 120.

Ofori-Atta, A., Cooper, S., Akpalu, B., Osei, A., Doku, V., Lund, C., Flisher, A., & Mhapp Research Programme Consortium. (2010a). Common understandings of

women's mental illness in Ghana: Results from a qualitative study. *International Review of Psychiatry*, *22*(6), 589–598.

Orwell, G. (1989). Animal farm: A fairy story. 1945. *London: Secker and Warburg*.

Osborn, M., & Smith, J. A (2003). Interpretative phenomenological analysis. In J.A Smith (Ed.), *Qualitative psychology: A practical guide to research methods*, 55-80. London: Sage

Osborn, M., & Smith, J. A. (2007). Pain as an assault on the self: An interpretative phenomenological analysis of the psychological impact of chronic benign low back pain. *Health & Psychology*, 22 (5), 517-534

Osborn, M., & Smith, J. A. (2008). The fearfulness of chronic pain and the centrality of the therapeutic relationship in containing it: An interpretative phenomenological analysis. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, *5*(4), 276–288.

Palmer, C. (2009). Soccer and the politics of identity for young Muslim refugee women in South Australia. *Soccer & Society*, *10*(1), 27–38.

Parker, I. (2005). *Qualitative psychology: Introducing radical research*. Buckingham: Open University Press. phenomenological analysis (IPA) in health psychology. *Psychology and Health, 21,* 1, 87

Pineteh, E. (2008). Cultural associations, clothing and food as markers of cultural identity in testimonies of Cameroonian forced migrants in Johannesburg. *African and black Diaspora: An International Journal*, *1*(1), 87–99.

Pineteh, E. A. (2017). Moments of suffering, pain and resilience: Somali refugees' memories of home and journeys to exile. *Cogent Social Sciences*, *3*(1), 1372848.

Pineteh, E. A. (2018). Spatial Contestation, Victimisation and Resistance during Xenophobic Violence: The Experiences of Somali Migrants in Post-Apartheid South Africa. *International Migration*, *56*(2), 133–145.

Posel, D. (2001). Race as common sense: Racial classification in twentieth-century South Africa. *African Studies Review*, *44*(2), 87–114.

Prilleltensky, I. (2008). The role of power in wellness, oppression, and liberation: the promise of psychopolitical validity. *Journal Of Community Psychology*, *36*(2), 116-136. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jcop.20225

Rudwick, S. (2008). "Coconuts" and "oreos": English speaking Zulu people in a South African township. World Englishes, 27(1), 101-116.

Rugunanan, P., & Smit, R. (2011). Seeking refuge in South Africa: Challenges facing a group of Congolese and Burundian refugees. *Development Southern Africa*, *28* (5), 705-718.

Rumbaut, R. G. (1991). Migration, adaptation, and mental health: The experience of Southeast Asian refugees in the United States. *Refugee Policy: Canada and the United States*, 383–427.

Sadock, B. J., Sadock, V. A., & Ruiz, P. (2015). *Kaplan & Sadock's synopsis of psychiatry: Behavioral sciences/clinical psychiatry* (Eleventh edition.). Philadelphia: Wolters Kluwer.

Sadouni, S. (2009). 'God is not unemployed': Journeys of Somali refugees in Johannesburg. *African Studies*, *68*(2), 235–249.

Sadouni, S. (2013). Somalis in Johannesburg: Muslim transformations of the city. In *Topographies of faith* (pp. 45–59). Brill.

Sangalang, C. C., & Vang, C. (2017). Intergenerational trauma in refugee families: A systematic review. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, *19*(3), 745–754.

Seedat, M., & Lazarus, S. (2011). Community psychology in South Africa: origins, developments, and manifestations. *Journal Of Community Psychology*, *39*(3), 241-257. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jcop.20429

Seedat, M., MacKenzie, S., & Stevens, G. (2004). Trends and Redress in Community Psychology during 10 Years of Democracy (1994–2003): A Journal-Based Perspective. *South African Journal Of Psychology*, *34*(4), 595-612. http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/008124630403400406

Shacknove, A. E. (1985). Who is a Refugee? *Ethics*, *95*(2), 274–284.

Shenton, A. (2004). *Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects*. Retrieved from http//black.crec.co.uk/docs/trustworthypaper.pdf

Sheffer (2013) in Mkhize, N., & Kiguwa, P. (2004). *Critical psychology*. Juta and Company Ltd.

Shetty, S. (2018). Amnesty International Report 2017/18: The State of the World's Human Rights. *London: Amnesty International Ltd*, *27*.

Shields, S. A. (2008a). Gender: An intersectionality perspective. *Sex Roles*, *59*(5–6), 301–311.

Sigamoney, J. R. (2018). Resilience of Somali Migrants: Religion and Spirituality among Migrants in Johannesburg. *Alternation Journal*, *22*, 81–102.

Sigsworth, R. (2010). Double Jeopardy: Foreign and Women. Heinrich Boll Stiftung, 5. 1-6.

Silverman, D. (2006). *Interpreting Qualitative Research Data: Methods for Analysing Talk, Text and Interaction*. London: Sage Publishers

Smart, B. (2002). Michel Foucault (revised ed.). *London & New York: Routledge*

Smith, D. L. (2014). Dehumanization, essentialism, and moral psychology. *Philosophy Compass*, *9*(11), 814–824.

Smith, J. A. (2004). Reflecting on the development of interpretative phenomenologica l analysis and its contribution to qualitative research in psychology. *Qualitative Resea rch in Psychology*, *1*(1), 39–54.

Smith, J. A., & Osborn, M. (2007). Pain as an assault on the self: An interpretative phenomenological analysis of the psychological impact of chronic benign low back pain. *Psychology and Health*, *22*(5), 517–534.

Smith, J., & Osborn, M. (2003). *Interpretative phenomenological analysis*. *Qualitative psychology: A practical guide to methods*. South Africa. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, *19*(3), 649–666.South African Migration Project, 46.

Spitzer, D. L. (2007). Immigrant and refugee women: Recreating meaning in transnational context. *Anthropology in Action*, *14*(1–2), 52–62.

Squire, C. (2008). Experience-centred and culturally-oriented approaches to narrative. *Doing Narrative Research*, *1*, 41–63.

Stenbacka, C. (2001). Qualitative research requires quality concepts of its own. *Management Decision*, *39* (7), 551-555

Steyn, M. (2001). Whiteness just isn't what it used to be: white identity in a changing South Africa. Albany, NY:State University of New York Press.

Sultana, A. (2010). Patriarchy and Women s Subordination: A Theoretical Analysis. *Arts Faculty Journal*, 1–18.

Suryasa, W. (2016). The Comparison between Interpreting and Translation Process. *International Research Journal of Engineering, IT and Scientific Research*, *2*(1), 22–29.

Tafira, K. (2011). Is xenophobia racism? Anthropology South Africa, 34(3&4), 114-123.

Telles, E., & Paschel, T. (2014). Who is black, white, or mixed race? How skin color, status, and nation shape racial classification in Latin America. *American Journal of Sociology*, *120*(3), 864–907.

Temple, B., & Young, A. (2004a). Qualitative research and translation dilemmas. *Qualitative Research*, *4*(2), 161–178.

Terdiman, M. (2008). *Somalia at war: Between radical Islam and tribal politics*. S. Daniel Abraham Center for International and Regional Studies

Tesch, F. E (1977). Debriefing research participants: Though this be method there be madness to it. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 35, 217-224

Thakur, V. (2011). Who is a South African? Interrogating Africanness and Afrophobia. *E-International Relations Students*.

Thela, L., Tomita, A., Maharaj, V., Mhlongo, M., & Burns, J. K. (2017). Counting the cost of Afrophobia: Post-migration adaptation and mental health challenges of African refugees in South Africa. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, *54*(5–6), 715–732.

Thela, L., Tomita, A., Maharaj, V., Mhlongo, M., & Burns, J. K. (2017). Counting the cost of Afrophobia: Post-migration adaptation and mental health challenges of African refugees in South Africa. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, *54*(5–6), 715–732.

Thompson, D. K. (2016). Risky business and geographies of refugee capitalism in the Somali migrant economy of Gauteng, South Africa. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, *42*(1), 120–135.

Tiilikainen, M. (2003). Somali women and daily Islam in the diaspora. *Social Compass*, *50*(1), 59–69.

Tshabalala, S. (2015, April 15). Why black South Africans are attacking foreign Africans but not foreign Whites. Bad Hosts. Retrieved February 2, 2016, from http://qz.com/384041/why- black-south-africans-are-only-attacking-foreign-africans-but-not-foreign-Whites/

Tshaka, R. S. (2010). Do our theological methodologies help us to deal with situations of violence in black communities, specifically Afrophobia? *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa*, *138*, 124.

Tshishonga, N. (2015). The impact of xenophobia-Afrophobia on the informal economy in Durban CBD, South Africa. *TD: The Journal for Transdisciplinary Research in Southern Africa*, *11*(4), 163–179.

United Nations. (2018). *International migration report 2017*. UN. University of California Press.

Uptin, J., Wright, J., & Harwood, V. (2013). 'It felt like i was a black dot on white paper': Examining young former refugees' experience of entering Australian high schools. *The Australian Educational Researcher*, *40*(1), 125–137.

Ussher, J. M., Perz, J., Metusela, C., Hawkey, A. J., Morrow, M., Narchal, R., & Estoesta, J. (2017). Negotiating discourses of shame, secrecy, and silence: Migrant and refugee women's experiences of sexual embodiment. *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, *46*(7), 1901–1921

Vahed, G., & Jeppie, S. (2005). Multiple communities: Muslims in post-apartheid South Africa. *State of the Nation: South Africa 2004-2005*, 256–286.

Vawda, S. (2017). Migration and Muslim Identities: Malawians and Senegalese Muslims in Durban, South Africa. *Journal for the Study of Religion*, *30*(2), 32–74.

Viruell-Fuentes, E. A., Miranda, P. B., & Abdulrahim, S. (2012). More than culture: Structural racism, intersectionality theory, and immigrant health. *Social Science & Medicine*, *75*(12), 2099–2106.

Wa Thiongo, N. (1986). *Decolonising the Mind*. London: James Curry.

Waiganjo, A. G. (2018). Coping mechanisms in navigating xenophobia-afrophobia-related challenges within the transnational space: Case of Somali refugee women in Gauteng, South Africa. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, *19*(3), 649–666.

Walby, S., Armstrong, J., & Strid, S. (2012). Intersectionality: Multiple inequalities in social theory. *Sociology*, *46*(2), 224–240.

Wangila, M. N. (2010). African Women in Traditional Religions: Illustrations from Kenya. *Women and New and Africana Religions*, 301.

Willig, C. (2013). *Introducing Qualitative Research in Psychology* (3rd ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill International

Wong, J. P., & Poon, M. K.-L. (2010). Bringing translation out of the shadows: Translation as an issue of methodological significance in cross-cultural qualitative research. *Journal of Transcultural Nursing*, *21*(2), 151–158.

Yuval-Davis, N. (2006). Belonging and the politics of belonging, Patterns of Prejudice, 40(3). 197-214.

Yuval-Davis, N. (2011). The Politics of Belonging: *Intersectional Contestations*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Zavos, A. (2010). Gender, migration and anti-racist politics in the continued project of the nation. In Palmary, I., Burman, E., Chantler, K., & Kiguwa, P. (Eds.), *Gender and Migration*: Feminist Interventions (pp. 15-30). New York: Zed Books. Zimbabwe to South Africa, Canadian Journal of African Studies, 49:2, 363-382, DOI: 10.10

United Nations (2017) International Migration Report. Retrieved from https://black.un.org/en/development/desa/population/migration/publications/migrationreport/docs/MigrationReport2017_Highlights.pdf (Accessed on August, 2019)

Amnesty International Report, (2018). The State of the World's Human Rights. Retrieved from https://black.amnesty.org/download/Documents/POL1067002018ENGLISH.PDF (Accessed on August 2019)

Appendix A: Information Sheet For CSVR

INFORMATION SHEET FOR CSVR

Greetings,

My name is Bonolo Letshufi and I am currently a Masters student enrolled at the University of Witwatersrand and I am conducting a study on the cultural and racialised experiences of Muslim Somali refugee women who reside in inner-city area of Mayfair, Johannesburg. This research is required for the completion of my degree in Psychology.

I would kindly like to request your assistance in retrieving potential participants for my research project. My cohort should consist of women between the ages of 18-75 who have a section 24 permit that states that they are recognised as refugees in South Africa. Participants are to be women with their own biological children or be responsible for children as their guardians/caregivers.

Participation in this study is voluntary and none of the participants will be forced to participate against their will. Participants can also withdraw from the research at any point. Participation in this study will involve one in-depth interview where I will be asking the participants questions about their personal life stories and experiences. I am hoping to understand the experiences of Muslim Somali refugee women in integrating into new communities and how they make sense of their identity within this community. In taking part in this research, they will assist in learning about what makes it easier or difficult for refugee Somali women to make the transition in South Africa.

Ethical clearance has been approved and granted for this research which means that my project does not pose any harm to participants in any way. Willing participants who accept to partake in this study will be contacted at the end of the study to be given a summary of all the findings and a full research report is available to participants upon request. I am available for questions and queries and I can be reached telephonically on 078 787 7401 or via email on Bletshufi@yahoo.com

Your assistance will be greatly appreciated. You are welcome to contact me directly or alternatively contact my supervisor using the details below.

Yours truly,

Bonolo Letshufi

Research supervisor: Ruby Patel

Ruby.Patel@wits.ac.za

Appendix B: Information Sheet for Participants

INFORMATION SHEET FOR PARTICIPANTS

Greetings,

My name is Bonolo Letshufi and I am currently a Masters student enrolled at the University of Witwatersrand and I am conducting a study on the experiences of Muslim Somali refugee women who reside in inner city Johannesburg. This research is required for the completion of my degree in Psychology and I would like to invite you to participate in this research study.

Participation in this study will involve one in-depth interview where I will be asking you questions about your personal life stories and experiences. I am hoping to understand your experiences in integrating into new communities and how you make sense of your identity within this community. In taking part in this research, you will assist us in learning what makes it easier or difficult for refugee Somali women to make the transition within certain regions in South Africa.

Because it is of utmost importance that what you say to me, the researcher is not misconstrued, I would like to request your permission to use a tape recorder during our interview to aid me when writing up my report. Using pseudonyms/fake names will protect your identity and only my supervisor and I will be permitted to listen to the audio-recordings. I may use direct speech in writing up my final report but even in those cases, fake names will be used. Confidentiality will be maintained at all times throughout the interview process and afterwards when data is being transcribed and reported on in the form of my research report. All recordings will be kept locked away in a save room on my computer which requires a password to gain access. After the recording has been transcribed verbatim, original recording will be destroyed. The transcripts will be kept until my degree has been completed and safely stored on my personal laptop that requires a password which means this will not be accessible to the public.

The interview will be approximately 60-90 minutes and some discomfort may arise when answering particular questions. You have the right to withdraw from the study at any time without offering any reasons and/or you may refuse to answer any question that you are not comfortable discussing. Your participation in this study is voluntary and warmly welcomed. This study offers free of charge

counselling services which can be obtained through CSVR or other organisations that may be more convenient for you.

Willing participants who accept to partake in this study will be contacted at the end of the study to be given a summary of all the findings and a full research report is available to participants upon request. I am available for questions and queries and I can be reached telephonically on 078 787 7401 or via email on Bletshufi@yahoo.com

Your participation will be greatly appreciated. You are welcome to contact me directly or alternatively contact my supervisor using the details below.
Yours truly,

Bonolo Letshufi

Research supervisor: Ruby Patel
Ruby.Patel@wits.ac.za

Appendix C: Interview Consent Form



PSYCHOLOGY
THE SCHOOL OF HUMAN AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT (SHCD)



I, _____, consent to being interviewed by Bonolo Letshufi, for their study exploring the narratives of grandparents within the context of social change. Please tick relevant boxes. I understand that:

- Participation in this study is voluntary. ☐
- I may refrain from answering any questions. ☐
- I may withdraw my participation and/or my responses from the study at any time before the research report is examined. ☐
- There are no risks or benefits associated with participation in this study. ☐
- All information provided will remain confidential, although I may be quoted in the research report. ☐
- If I am quoted, a pseudonym (Participant A, Respondent B etc.) will be used. ☐
- None of my identifiable information will be included in the research report. ☐
- I am aware that the results of the study will be communicated in the form of a research report or journal articles. ☐
- The research may also be presented at a local/international conference and published in a journal and/or book chapter. ☐

Signed: _____

Date: _____

Appendix D: Audio Recording Consent Form



PSYCHOLOGY

THE SCHOOL OF HUMAN AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT (SHCD)



I, _____ give my consent for my interview with Bonolo Letshufi, to be audio recorded for their study. Please tick the relevant boxes. I understand that:

- The audio-recordings and transcripts will not be seen or heard by anyone other than the researchers and/or their research assistants. ☐

- The audio-recordings and transcripts will be kept in a password protected computer. ☐

- No identifying information will be used in the transcripts or the research report. ☐

- Although direct quotes from my interview may be used in the research report, I will be referred to by a pseudonym. ☐

Signed: _____

Date: _____

APPENDIX E: Semi-structured interview Schedule

- The aim of interpretative phenomenological analysis (IPA) is to explore in detail how participants are making sense of their personal and social world
- Looking for meanings particular experiences, events, states hold for participants.
- Not an attempt to produce an objective statement of the object or event itself.
- In keeping with intersubjectivity biographical approach

THEMES OF NARRATIVES

1. **Building Rapport**

   - ❖ Introductions
   - ❖ Formalities
   - ❖ Putting the participant at ease
   - ❖ Tell me a little about yourself

2. **Open up narrative on being a refugee. Coming to South Africa**

- ❖ What were your experiences like when you first came to South Africa?
- ❖ What made the family resettle in Mayfair?
- ❖ What was the biggest culture change you experienced when coming to South Africa
- ❖ In what ways is South Africa different from Somalia (in terms of people, religion, beliefs etc)
- ❖ What are some of the challenges your family is experiencing
- ❖ If you had a choice, would you choose to be South African, why or why not

3. **Experience of the community**

- ❖ How would you describe the community you are living in (immediate community but also probe larger Mayfair/Fordsburg Community?)
- ❖ Tell me about some of your families experiences in the community
- ❖ Tell me a story of when you felt your children were being discriminated against
- ❖ Tell me a story about when you were discriminated against within your community?
- ❖ Do you get to visiting/making friendships/getting invited to events around religious and other events in this community?
- ❖ Would you say you 'fit in' in this community, why or why not?

4. More specific questions around race, gender, religion

- Are there any challenges you encounter when interacting with South African of Indian and Asian heritage
- What are the challenges you experience with other African migrants from other countries?
- Where do you feel the most safe in your community and why
- Where do you feel less safe in your community and why

5. Ending of Interview

What has been the most challenging experience you have faced as a family since immigrating to SA

- Can you recall a time when you wished you could return to your home country, what were the reasons for that
- If you had to imagine a perfect world, what would it look like and feel like