

https://dspace.org/

The design of a risk assessment model to determine the impact of the herbal medicine trade on the Witwatersrand on resources of indigenous plant species

Williams, Vivienne Linda

2008-08-08T10:11:27Z
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/5313

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

THE DESIGN OF A RISK ASSESSMENT MODEL TO DETERMINE THE IMPACT OF THE HERBAL MEDICINE TRADE ON THE WITWATERSRAND ON RESOURCES OF INDIGENOUS PLANT SPECIES

VIVIENNE LINDA WILLIAMS, B.Sc. HONS (WITS)

Submitted in fulfilment of the academic requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

In the
School for Animal, Plant and Environmental Sciences
University of the Witwatersrand

Johannesburg
2007

ABSTRACT

Exploitation of botanical resources has resulted in significant decreases in the sizes of some plant populations, especially for species that have a high commercial value and are important to the lives and livelihoods of rural communities. Medicinal plant resources are used and traded commercially in both rural areas and urban centres, and over-exploitation has become a deterministic factor in the extinction risks to certain species. The main aim of the study was to design a risk assessment model to determine the impact of the medicinal plant trade on the Witwatersrand (centred around Johannesburg) on indigenous plant resources. The goal was to incorporate trade variables correlated with harvesting risks together with biological characteristics of the harvested species to predict which species are most threatened by the trade and are thus high on the list for conservation priority.

The study required semi-quantitative surveys of the medicinal plants sold by traders in the Witwatersrand to be conducted. In 1994 and 2001, the plants sold in 50 *muti* shops and by 100 vendors in the Faraday Street market respectively were inventoried. Quantitative trade data were also captured, including volume, pricing structures and plant size (e.g. bark thickness and bulb diameter). A scientific sampling strategy was adhered to throughout the study to add statistical validity to the results. In a novel approach to analysing ethnobotanical data, the frequency of plant occurrences in the markets was analysed using measures (analysed by EstimateS) of species diversity traditionally used in ecology. The measures allowed for sampling strategies and sizes to be compared between data sets and for the number of species likely to be sold in the region to be estimated. Furthermore, data sets could be compared in terms of species richness, diversity, evenness and complimentarity.

Another novel approach taken in the thesis was to estimate the number of individual plants harvested annually by gatherers, specifically the number of trees that are debarked and the number of whole bulbs that are removed. In order to estimate the number of trees debarked, a study was conducted to determine the relationship between bark thickness and stem diameter for six species. The results made it possible to estimate the condition of the resource in the wild from market records (i.e. bark thicknesses) and to see how the availability of larger trees has declined for species such as *Warburgia salutaris* between 1994 and 2001. Results for bulbs showed that there has been a significant decrease in the diameter of *Eucomis autumnalis* bulbs present in the markets in the same period, suggesting significant levels of resource depletion.

The thesis explored the use of a multivariate methodology for assessing the extinction risks of species and assigning species harvested for the medicinal plant trade to various hierarchies of risk and conservation priority. Hierarchical and non-hierarchical cluster analysis (Ward's and K-means respectively) methods were found to be effective in assigning species to clusters of similar risk and conservation priority. From a combined list of 392 ethnospecies recorded in the *muti* shops and Faraday market, a short-list of 119 higher risk species was identified using four to five trade variables. This list was further reduced to 87 species to ascertain conservation priorities based on the additional inclusion of seven biological variables in the assessment. From this list, approximately 31 species were identified as having higher conservation priority and would be candidates for further research, management and protection within the ambit of conservation and sustainable utilisation programmes. These species would further benefit from Orange Listing or having their IUCN Red List status re-evaluated.

The methods developed in this study are recommended for other ethnobotanical studies. Furthermore, the risk assessment method could be applied to the assessment of species similarly traded in other medicinal plant markets or applied to the assessment of species under threat from other stressors at a regional, provincial and/or national level using the appropriate variables.

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own, unaided work. It is being submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the University of the Witwatersrand. It has not been submitted for any degree or examination to any other university

_____

Date: 9 March 2007

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

When I joined the Botany Department after doing Honours in Geography at Wits and Botany 1 at UNISA, I was the department's very first ethnobotany student. More excellent students have since followed *and* graduated before me. At my very first meeting with the people on my research committee to present my MSc proposal in 1994, I will never forget Prof Richard Pienaar (HOD at the time) asking me "So, how is this science?" It was a challenge I rose to, and to some extent it fuelled my desire to reverse the prevalent opinion at the time that ethnobotany was a 'soft science' with very little in the way of quantitative analysis. It was a subconscious goal that was fed by my fascination with my subject matter as well as the aspiration to not be uninformed. To some extent, I'm like my late father on this. Dad disliked not knowing things that he felt he should know. I know he gently pushed me most of my life to always look deeper than surface and to question and explore. I wasn't just to look for the faeries in the forest if he asked, but the *green* ones. His tactics were supported by my mother, who believes I can do anything I put my mind to and encourages me to do what makes me happy. One of her philosophies is that it isn't always satisfying working for "the highest bidder". I'm glad my parents knew me well enough to encourage my potential. I thank them both so very much for their love and caring, as well as their emotional and financial support. I hope I was worth every penny.

By the time I graduate it will more than two years since my father passed away. I'm sad he wasn't able to physically see the day when it came – especially since he spent a few years before he died wondering and worrying about whether or not I'd ever finish. I know he wasn't the only one who worried about that, and at times even I felt that the mountain was too steep to climb. However, it is now done. And, the 24 year old girl who started this journey in 1994 is now 37 in 2006 and a universe away from the person she was at the start. My love and thanks goes out to all those who have been part of my journey and my learning.

Of course, after 12 years, many people come in and out of your life and so there are many to thank. Besides my late father, there are 2 other people who have since passed on that deserve a mention. Firstly, my Rastafarian friend Fanny Makgaba who assisted me for several years with the *muti* shop surveys and the early surveys of the Faraday market. He unfortunately passed away on the 3rd April 2003 before I really had a chance to repay in kind his help and his friendship. Second, is Musa Maswangangi who passed in September 2002 of non-Hodgkin's lymphoma. Musa was one of the students who assisted with the Faraday survey. Their sudden and unexpected crossings are a loss not only to me, but to a society they had a potential role in adding value to (and had added value to in many ways). Fanny's passing was especially personal for me because he made a significant contribution to my work.

On a personal note, thanks obviously also go to my supervisors Profs Kevin Balkwill and Ed Witkowski for many years of support and encouragement, especially from the time dad became ill. To Janet Sharp, Samantha Vorster, Shelley Olivier and my other good friends, thanks for your friendship, emotional support and understanding of my strange and hermit-like lifestyle. I'm sure they'll enjoy having me back as a friend again – but they don't know what they're in for because they don't know me as anything but a seriously studying student. Drs Neil Crouch and Tony Cunningham also deserve mentioning – sometimes it is the words and work of other outstanding researchers in your field that give you encouragement and inspire achievement. There are also people who I will thank anonymously for providing motivation of an unusual sort. They reinforced my awareness that life needs to go on and that old doors have to be closed before new ones can be opened.

There are many other people whose paths I have crossed and who have either supported, assisted or participated in this process of completing a PhD. They are:

- 50 *muti* shop owners, including: Chen Dorasamy, Daphne, Mr Chetty, Pops Singh, Daphne, Mama Maponya, Martha Tshabalala, Mavis;
- From the School of Animal, Plant & Environmental Sciences, Wits University: Donald MacCallum and Renee Reddy from the C.E. Moss Herbarium for assisting with plant identifications; Herman du Preez for software technical support;
- Steve McKean: KZN Wildlife for answering queries;
- Janine Victor: SANBI for various information on plants;
- From the 1996 field work: Lyndon Estes, Jo Onderstall; John and Sandy Burrows; Babe J. Ngwenya, Martin Kunhardt, Geoff Nichols;
- From the 1998 field work: Megan Diamond (née Wheelan); Coert Geldenhuys; Rosmarin and Straughan family (Lesheba); Sarah Venter (formerly from DWAF); Norbert Hahn; Ricki Pott (formerly Mondi); Patrick Bogham-Wettham (Wilderness Safaris); Johnson (Ndumo reserve); Shaun Kristensen and Vuzi Nxumalo (Bonamanzi); Prof Callie Franz (farm owner near Soutpansberg); Jonothan Cromhout (Mtunzini)
- From the 2001 Faraday survey: 100 traders in the Faraday market, especially Mr Mvubu, Scelo and the members of the Faraday traders committee; and, students from Wits who assisted with the survey, namely Themba Mayaba, Dimakatso Nong, Emmarentia Ratau, Eddie Mabena, Lebone Makhatula, Pamela Maseko, Evelyn Mojapelo, Elizabeth Sabela, Nonhlanhla Sikane and the late Musa Maswangangi;

- Nicola Ferrar, a former student from Rhodes University;
- Michele Pfab: a friend and ecologist from the Gauteng Department of Agriculture, Conservation & Environment (GDACE);
- Kerry Fine and Maureen Arnold for helping with fieldwork in Nylsvley
- Prof Richard Whitlow, formerly of the Geography Department in 1992, for seeing the potential. I wish I knew where he is today to thank him.
- Wendy Job: creating the maps.
- Jenny Botha: for the loan of some of her data
- Jack Harrington: for reading some of my manuscripts.
- Financial support: the Indigenous Plant Use Programme of the FRD (now NRF), Wits University, Endangered Wildlife Trust's 'Eddie Young Memorial Bursary' (Dr John Ledger); TRAFFIC East/Southern Africa (David Newton); GDACE.
- Thanks also to those whose contributions I have forgotten.

And finally:

> *"A PhD is a stepping stone into a research career. All you need to do is demonstrate your capacity for independent, critical thinking. That's all you need to do. A PhD is three years of solid work, not a Nobel Prize"* (Mullins and Kiley 2002)[1].

I know some heads are nodding after reading this, and I would reluctantly admit to having made career out of a PhD until I came to my senses. After this book is closed, I look forward to the next chapter…..



[1] Mullins, G. and Kiley, M. (2002) 'It's a PhD not a Nobel Prize': how experienced examiners assess research theses. *Studies in Higher Education* 27(4): 368-386

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
ABSTRACT		*iii*
DECLARATION		*iv*
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS		*v*
TABLE OF CONTENTS		*vii*
CHAPTER 1	**INTRODUCTION**	**Chapter 1 Pg. 1 – 20**
	Introduction	2
	Aims and Objectives	3
	The Witwatersrand Medicinal Plant Trade	4
	The Faraday Street Market	5
	Mai Mai Bazaar	6
	Study Site	7
	Risk Assessment, Rapid Vulnerability Assessment, Threat Assessment and Conservation Priority Setting	8
	Risk Assessment (RA)	8
	Rapid Vulnerability Assessment (RVA)	10
	Threat Assessment	10
	Setting Conservation Priorities (CP)	11
	A Hybrid Risk Assessment Method	12
	Thesis Structure	12
	Outline of Survey Methodology, Data Collected and Related Outputs	14
	References	17
CHAPTER 2	***MUTHI* TRADERS ON THE WITWATERSRAND – AN URBAN MOSAIC.**	**Chapter 2 Pg. 1 – 5**
South African Journal of Botany 63(6)	**Abstract**	2
	Introduction	2
	Study Area	3
	Procedure	3
	Results and Discussion	4
	Number and distribution of traders	4
	Ethnicity and gender of herb-traders	5
	References	5
CHAPTER 3	**THE COMMERCIAL MARKET FOR MEDICINAL PLANTS AND PLANT PARTS.**	**Chapter 3 Pg. 1 – 19**
Economic Botany 54(3)	**Abstract**	2
	Introduction	2
	Regional Setting	3
	Methods	3
	Selecting research participants	3
	Semi-quantitative survey	4
	Synthesis	4
	Results	6
	Adequacy of sample size	6
	Species present in the market	6
	Trade in plant parts	7
	Suppliers	7
	Sources of supply	7
	Species richness, heterogeneity and evenness	9
	Utilization of species	9
	Discussion	12
	Adequacy of sampling	12
	Species present in the market	13
	Trade in plant parts	14
	Suppliers and sources	14
	Species diversity	15
	Probability of species utilization	15
	Conclusion	16

	Literature Cited	17
	Appendix	18
CHAPTER 4	**THE SPECIES TRADED**	**Chapter 4 Pg. 1 – 27**
Bothalia 31(1)	**A Lexicon of Plants Traded in the Witwatersrand *Umuthi* Shops, South Africa**	
	Abstract	2
	Introduction	2
	Methods	2
	Results and Discussion	3
	Conclusion	5
	References	5
	Appendix 1: Taxa traded on the Witwatersrand	6
	Appendix 2: Lexicon of vernacular names	15
CHAPTER 5	**HAWKERS OF HEALTH: THE FARADAY STREET MARKET FOR TRADITIONAL MEDICINE**	**Chapter 5 Pg. 1 – 16**
Chapter 14 in *'Indigenous Forests and Woodlands in South Africa'*	**Trade and Socio-Economic Value of Forest and Woodland Resources within the Medicinal Plant Market in Johannesburg**	2
	Introduction	2
	Characteristics of the Faraday Traditional Medicine Market	2
	Methods	3
	Survey overview	3
	Data synthesis and analysis	3
	Determining the quantity recorded during the survey	4
	Evaluating Sample Size	4
	Socio-Economic Profiles of the Faraday Traders	5
	Diversity of Woodland and Forest Resources Traded	6
	Taxa	6
	Patterns of diversity and species use	7
	Probability of use and affinity with southern African biomes	8
	Plant parts	9
	Source of Supply	11
	Volume and Value of Woodland and Forest Resources Traded in Faraday	11
	Socio-Economic Value of Traded Woodland and Forest Medicinal Resources	13
	References	15
CHAPTER 6	**THE USE OF SPECIES DIVERSITY INDICES AND ACCUMULATION CURVES TO ANALYSE ETHNOBOTANICAL DATA**	**Chapter 6 Pg. 1 – 51**
Part 1	**Application of Diversity Indices to Appraise Plant Availability in the Traditional Medicinal Markets of Johannesburg, South Africa**	**Pg. 2 – 32**
Biodiversity and Conservation 14	**Abstract**	2
	Introduction	2
	Species Diversity	3
	Study Area	4
	Methods	5
	Market surveys	5
	Synthesis of plant inventories	5
	Calculating indices	6
	Results and Discussion	7
	Species richness	7
	Species diversity or heterogeneity	12
	Information theory indices	13
	Dominance indices	16
	Hill's diversity numbers	19
	Fisher's alpha	20
	Evenness	21
	Assessment of rare, intermediate and common ethnospecies	24
	An example of intra-sample diversity	26
	Conclusions	27
	References	31

Part 2	**The use of incidence-based species richness estimators, species accumulation curves and similarity measures to appraise ethnobotanical inventories from South Africa**	**Pg 33 – 51**
Biodiversity and Conservation (in press)	**Abstract**	33
	Introduction	33
	Species Accumulation Curves	34
	Estimating Species Richness	35
	Parametric methods	35
	Non-parametric methods	35
	Extrapolating species accumulation curves	36
	Complimentarity and similarity	36
	Study Area	37
	Methods	38
	Results and Discussion	39
	Species accumulation and rarefaction curves	39
	Species richness estimates	41
	Complimentarity and similarity	47
	Conclusion	48
	References	50
CHAPTER 7	**THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN BARK THICKNESS AND TREE SIZE**	**Chapter 7 Pg. 1 – 62**
Part 1	**Relationship between bark thickness and diameter at breast height for six tree species used medicinally in South Africa**	**Pg. 2 – 27**
South African Journal of Botany (in press)	**Abstract**	2
	Introduction	3
	Bark Anatomy, Morphology and Regrowth	5
	Study Sites and Species	6
	Field Methods and Data Analysis	7
	Results	9
	Bark thickness, tapering and height up the stem	9
	Regression of bark thickness and dbh at Week 0	9
	Changes in bark thickness over 12 weeks relative to dbh	9
	Predicting dbh and bark thickness	14
	Discussion	16
	References	19
	Appendix 1	22
	Appendix 2	23
Part 2	**Bark mass estimates for six tree species used medicinally in South Africa**	**Pg. 28 – 45**
Advances in Economic Botany (in press)	**Abstract**	28
	Introduction	29
	Field Methods and Data Analysis	30
	Study sites and species	30
	Sampling	30
	Calculating total bark quantity	31
	Statistical analysis	31
	Comparing bark mass predicted by Schönau's equations	33
	Results	33
	Mean bark area, volume and mass	33
	Differences between wet- and oven-dried bark mass	37
	Regression of bark mass with stem diameter	37
	Comparing bark mass predicted by Schönau's equations	41
	Discussion	41
	References	44
Part 3	**Height, branch-free bole length and bark thickness for six tree species used medicinally in South Africa**	**Pg. 46 – 54**
Koedoe 38(1)	**Abstract**	46
	Introduction	46
	Study Sites and Species	47
	Field Methods and Data Analysis	49
	Results and Discussion	49
	References	53

Part 4	**Stem diameter and bark surface area of the fluted trunk of *Balanites maughamii***	**Pg. 55 – 62**
Bothalia (in press)	**Abstract**	55
	Introduction	56
	Methods	57
	Results and Discussion	58
	References	62
Chapter 8	**THE CONCEPT OF 'INDIVIDUAL EQUIVALENTS'**	**Chapter 8 Pg. 1 – 35**
Part 1	**Assessing harvesting impacts for species used medicinally in South Africa: estimates of the number of individual trees debarked annually**	**Pg. 2 – 23**
Advances in Economic Botany (in press)	**Abstract**	2
	Introduction	3
	Methods	4
	Preliminary investigation	4
	The primary investigation	4
	Determining the relationship between bark thickness and stem diameter	5
	Market surveys and quantitative resource inventories	5
	Estimating the annual quantity of bark mass traded	6
	Determining temporal changes in stem size-class availability	6
	Calculating the number of individual equivalents	6
	Results	6
	The relationship between bark thickness and stem diameter	6
	The mean harvestable mass per stem size-class	9
	The change in availability of bark size-classes related to stem classes	9
	The quantity sold per annum	11
	The number of individual equivalents	11
	Discussion	12
	References	14
	Appendix 1: a-e	16
	Appendix 2: a-e	21
Part 2	**Size-class prevalence of bulbous and perennial herbs sold in the Johannesburg medicinal plant markets between 1995 and 2001**	**Pg. 24 – 35**
South African Journal of Botany 73(1)	**Summary**	24
	Introduction	24
	Methods	25
	Species investigated	25
	Market surveys and quantitative resource inventories	26
	Estimating the annual quantity of bulbs and rootstocks traded	27
	Calculating the number of 'Individual Equivalents'	27
	Statistical analysis	28
	Results	28
	The relationship between bulb mass and diameter	28
	Mean size and mass of the species sold by traders	29
	Estimated quantities purchased annually	31
	The number of Individual Equivalents	31
	Discussion	33
	References	35
Chapter 9	**VOLUME AND VALUE OF THE HERBAL MEDICINE TRADE**	**Chapter 9 Pg. 1 – 25**
Accepted by the *International Journal for Sustainable Development and World Ecology*	**Volume and financial value of species traded in the medicinal plant markets of Gauteng, South Africa**	2
	Summary	2
	Introduction	3
	Methods	4
	Study area, market surveys and quantitative resource inventories	4
	Species investigated	4
	Estimating the annual quantity of plant products traded	5
	Statistical analysis	5
	Results	5
	The quantities traded	5
	Pricing structures relative to mass	9

	Mean market statistics	14
	Unit prices of retail sales	17
	The wholesale value of 50 kg-size bags	17
	Discussion	19
	References	24
Chapter 10	**RISK ASSESSMENT FOR THE HERBAL MEDICINE TRADE**	**Chapter 10 Pg. 1 – 100**
	Chapter Summary	
	Chapter Outline	
	Introduction	3
	Statistical, Multivariate Approaches for Evaluating Risk	4
	Cluster Analysis	4
	Ordination	5
	Selection of Suitable Variables and the Source of Data used in the Risk Evaluation Process	6
	Criteria Selected for Priority Evaluation in Previous Studies	7
	Description of the Criteria Selected for this Study	10
	Methods of Analysis	12
	Market Surveys and Quantitative Resource Inventories	12
	Biological Variable Scores	12
	Standardizing the Data Sets	13
	Regression	13
	Multivariate Analysis	13
	Other Statistical Analyses	15
	Summary of the Risk Evaluation Method	15
	Results and Discussion	18
	The Value of a Citation	18
	The Validity of Local Knowledge/Perception as a Model Variable	21
	Bivariate Risk Characterisation Model	23
	Plant Risk Analysis: 333 Ethnospecies Sold in 50 *Muti* Shops	24
	Plant Risk Analysis: 315 Ethnospecies Sold by 100 Faraday Traders	29
	Plant Risk Analysis: 392 Ethnospecies Sold by 150 Traders Combined	35
	Plant Risk Analysis: 87 Short-listed Species	43
	Plant Risk Analysis: Principle Components Analysis (PCA) of the Variables	50
	Plant Risk Analysis: 22 Test Species	56
	Cluster Analysis versus Numerical Importance Value Indices	64
	General Discussion and Conclusions	66
	References	69
	Appendices: 1-8	73
	Appendix 1: Dendrogram for 50 *muti* shops (n=333 ethnospecies)	73
	Appendix 2: Dendrogram for 100 Faraday traders (n=315 ethnospecies)	78
	Appendix 3: Dendrogram for All 150 traders (n=392 ethnospecies)	82
	Appendix 4: ESP (ethnospecies) codes	87
	Appendix 5: Species attribute matrix for 87 short-listed species	89
	Appendix 6: Species numbers for 392 ethnospecies in the PCA	93
	Appendix 7: Species attribute matrices for 22 test species	97
	Appendix 8: Euclidean distances for K-means clusters	99
Chapter 11	**GENERAL DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**	**Chapter 11 Pg. 1 – 9**
	References	8
APPENDICES		**Pg. A1 – A27**
A	**Species to common names**	**A2 – A10**
B	**Common names to species**	**A11 – A18**
C	**Survey questionnaires**	**A19 – A23**
I	Market survey 1	A19
II	Market survey 2a	A20
III	Market survey 2b	A21
IV	Market survey 2c	A22
V	Market survey 3	A23