

https://dspace.org/

The transformation of South African administrative law since 1994 with particular reference to the Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 3 of 2000

Hoexter, Cora

2010-03-26T08:42:27Z
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/7831

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	i
ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	8
CHAPTER 1 Introduction: The transformation of South African administrative law	10
CHAPTER 2 Development of the grounds of review	44
CHAPTER 3 Access to judicial remedies	113
CHAPTER 4 Towards a substantive style of judicial reasoning	150
CHAPTER 5 The completion of administrative law	188
CHAPTER 6 Conclusion: An assessment of the transformation of South African administrative law since 1994	231
BIBLIOGRAPHY	240
TABLE OF CASES	258
APPENDIX 1 Constitutional rights to administrative justice	280
APPENDIX 2 The Promotion of Administrative Justice Act	282
APPENDIX 3 The Breakwater Declaration	293

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION i

ABSTRACT ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii

TABLE OF CONTENTS 1

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 8

CHAPTER 1
Introduction: The transformation of South African administrative law 10

1.1 Background to the thesis 10

1.2 Nature and scope of the thesis 15

(a) Title and aim of the thesis 15

(b) Research question to be explored 15

(c) Methodology 16

1.3 Terminology 16

(a) Transformation rather than reform 16

(b) Administrative law 18

1.4 The transformative Constitution: Towards a culture of justification 20

(a) A transformative Constitution 20

(b) A culture of justification 23

(c) The promise for administrative law 26

1.5 Achieving a culture of justification: Four aspirations for South African administrative law 30

(a) Well-developed grounds of review 31

(b) Improved access to judicial remedies 33

(c) A more substantive style of judicial reasoning 34

(d) The completion of administrative law 39

1.6 Outline of the study 42

(a) Chapter 1 42

(b) Chapter 2 42

(c) Chapter 3 43

(d) Chapter 4 43

(e) Chapter 5 43
(f) Chapter 6 43

CHAPTER 2
Development of the grounds of review 44
2.1 Introduction 44
2.2 Lawfulness 47
(a) Introduction and overview 47
(b) Dishonesty and the relevance of motive 49
(c) Review for error of law 51
(d) Review for mistake of fact 55
(i) Jurisdictional facts 55
(ii) Non-jurisdictional facts 57
(e) Conclusion 60
2.3 Reasonableness 61
(a) Introduction and overview 61
(b) The pre-democratic law 62
(c) The constitutional era 64
(i) The elements of 'reasonable' administrative action 65
(ii) The interpretation of section 6(2)*(h)* of the PAJA 69
(iii) The distinction between review and appeal 72
(d) Reasonableness and the principle of legality 74
(e) Conclusion 76
2.4 Procedural fairness 76
(a) Introduction and overview 77
(b) The application of fairness at common law 80
(i) The classification of functions 80
(ii) Rejection of the classification of functions 82
(iii) The rise of the legitimate expectation doctrine 82
(c) The constitutional era 84
(i) Section 3(1) of the PAJA 84
(ii) Determination or deprivation? 85
(iii) The application of fairness in multi-staged decision-making 89
(iv) The development of the legitimate expectation doctrine 92

(v) Section 4 of the PAJA 95
(d) Conclusion 98
2.5 Reasons 99
(a) Introduction and overview 99
(b) The treatment of reasons at common law 100
(c) Section 24*(c)* of the interim Constitution 101
(d) The 1996 Constitution and the PAJA 103
(i) Section 5 of the PAJA 105
(ii) The development of the concept of 'adequate' reasons 107
(e) Conclusion 111

CHAPTER 3
Access to Judicial Remedies 113
3.1 Introduction 113
3.2 Standing 114
(a) Introduction and overview 114
(b) Standing at common law 116
(c) Standing under the Bill of Rights 117
(d) The courts' treatment of standing 120
(i) Anyone acting in their own interest 120
(ii) Acting on behalf of another person who cannot act in their own name 122
(iii) Acting as a member of, or in the interest of, a group or class of persons 124
(iv) Acting in the public interest 127
(v) An association acting in the interest of its members 129
(e) Conclusion 131
3.2 Legislative obstacles to judicial redress 131
(a) Introduction and overview 131
(b) The main legislative obstacles 133
(i) Ouster clauses 133
(ii) Limitation clauses 137
(iii) Finality clauses 138
(iv) Indemnity and amnesty clauses 139
(v) Subjective language 140

(c) Section 7 of the PAJA 140
(i) The 180-day time limit 141
(ii) The duty to exhaust internal remedies 143
(d) Conclusion 149

CHAPTER 4
Towards a substantive style of judicial reasoning 150
4.1 Introduction 150
4.2 Formalism in South Africa's legal culture 151
(a) The autonomous legal order and the separation of law and politics 152
(b) Judicial formalism under apartheid 154
(c) Formalism and the demands of a culture of justification 155
4.3 Formalism in administrative law before and after 1994 158
(a) The distinction between review and appeal and its ramifications 158
(i) The pre-democratic era 159
(ii) Developments since 1994 161
(b) The classification of functions 164
(i) The pre-democratic era 164
(ii) Developments since 1994 165
(c) The rules of standing 168
(i) The pre-democratic era 168
(ii) Developments since 1994 169
(d) The public/private distinction and the treatment of contracts in administrative law 170
(i) The pre-democratic era 170
(ii) Developments since 1994 172
4.4 The PAJA: A return to conceptualism? 175
(a) The statutory definition of administrative action 177
(b) Sections 3, 4 and 5 of the PAJA 181
4.5 Judicial steps away from formalism 182
(a) The principle of legality 182
(b) The development of a doctrine of deference 183
4.6 Conclusion 187

CHAPTER 5
The completion of administrative law 188
5.1 Introduction 188
5.2 Judicial review 190
(a) The prominence of judicial review 191
(b) The basis and nature of review 193
(c) The possibility of non-judicial review 196
5.3 Administrative appeals 198
(a) The need for reform before 1994 199
(b) Developments since 1994 201
5.4 Legislative oversight 203
(a) The enactment of legislation 204
(b) The responsibility of Ministers to Parliament 205
(c) Parliamentary scrutiny of delegated legislation 206
(d) Reports to Parliament 207
5.5 Public participation 208
(a) Public participation under the democratic Constitution 209
(b) Public participation and the PAJA 210
5.6 Ombudsman institutions 212
(a) The Public Protector 213
(b) The Auditor-General 217
5.7 Access to information 219
(a) The constitutional right of access to information 220
(b) The Promotion of Access to Information Act 221
(i) Access to state-held information 222
(ii) Access to information in private hands 224
5.8 Missed opportunities and the need for further reform 226
5.9 Conclusion 229

CHAPTER 6
Conclusion: An assessment of the transformation of South African administrative law since 1994 231

6.1 The aspirations of a transformed administrative law 231
6.2 The transformation of the law since 1994 234

(a) The development of the grounds of review 234
(b) Improved access to judicial remedies 236
(c) A more substantive style of judicial reasoning 237
(d) The completion of administrative law 237
6.3 Conclusion 238

BIBLIOGRAPHY 240

TABLE OF CASES 258

APPENDIX 1
Constitutional rights to administrative justice 280

APPENDIX 2
The Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 282

APPENDIX 3
The Breakwater Declaration 293

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AAT	Administrative Appeals Tribunal
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
ADJP	Acting Deputy Judge President
AJ	Acting Judge / Justice
AJA	Acting Judge of Appeal
AJP	Acting Judge President
ANC	African National Congress
ARC	Administrative Review Council
AS	Annual Survey of South African Law
AZAPO	Azanian People's Organisation
CCMA	Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration
cf	compare
CJ	Chief Justice
Constitution	Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996
DCJ	Deputy Chief Justice
DJP	Deputy Judge President
DP	Deputy President
ed(s)	editor(s), edition
et al	and others
et seq	and the following
ff	and following pages
GG	Government Gazette
GN	Government Notice
ICASA	Independent Communications Authority of South Africa
ICD	Independent Complaints Directorate
IDASA	Institute for Democracy in South Africa
ILJ	Industrial Law Journal
Interim Constitution	Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 200 of 1993
J	Judge, Justice
JA	Judge of Appeal
JP	Judge President

MEC	Member of the Executive Council
P	President
PAIA	Promotion of Access to Information Act 2 of 2000
PAJA	Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 3 of 2000
para(s)	paragraph(s)
Proc	Proclamation
reg(s)	regulation(s)
RSA	Republic of South Africa
SA	South Africa
s(s)	section(s)
SAJHR	South African Journal on Human Rights
SALC	South African Law Commission
SALJ	South African Law Journal
SARFU	South African Rugby Football Union
Stell LR	Stellenbosch Law Review
subsec(s)	subsection(s)
THRHR	Tydskrif vir Hedendaagse Romeins-Hollandse Reg
TSAR	Tydskrif vir Suid-Afrikaanse Reg
VwVfG	Verwaltungsverfahrensgestez