# CAN OLD HISTORY TEXTBOOKS BE USED TO PROMOTE THE NEW DEMOCRATIC IDEALS IN THE CURRICULUM 2005?

L.N. MASHIYI

Supervisor

Professor Shirley Pendlebury

A research report submitted to the Faculty of Education in partial fulfilment of the requirements for Master of Education

Johannesburg 2000

## ABSTRACT

Can old history text books (written in the Apartheid Era) be used to promote the new democratic ideals in Curriculum 2005? This investigation addresses this question through an analysis of selected chapters of two history text books presently used in Katlehong schools. The analysis deploys an instrument developed at the University of Belgrade by members of the Democracy Education Project, in conjunction with the project team from the University of the Witwatersrand. Through the instrument, the democratic content of the textbooks was analysed and assessed. The analysis focus on declarative, elaborated and implied democratic content.

The conceptual framework for the investigation draws from recent philosophical and sociological work on democracy. Amy Gutmann's principles of non-repression and non-discrimination, for example, provide the main argument for the necessity of equal and critical education in South Africa. The analysis and discussion show both text as deeply floored regarding the availability and nature of the democratic concepts. However, if used by critical teachers both texts are suitable for promoting democracy in South Africa.

## KEY WORDS

Curriculum and democracy, history textbooks, textual analysis, education for democracy in South Africa, post-apartheid education, texts and teaching.

## DECLARATION

I declare that this research report is my own, unaided work. It is being submitted for the degree of Master of Education at the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other University.

Signature

22/2/2000

Date

## TABLE OF CONTENTS


| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| Chapter 1: | INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND | | 1 |
| | 1. | Historical background | 1 |
| | 2. | Rational | 4 |
| Chapter 2: | LITERATURE REVIEW | | 6 |
| | 2.1 | The principle of non-repression and non-discrimination | 10 |
| | 2.2 | Democratic dispositions | 13 |
| Chapter 3: | METHODOLOGY | | 23 |
| | 3.1 | Introduction | 23 |
| | 3.2 | Selection of textbooks and chapters | 25 |
| | 3.3 | The analytical instrument | 28 |
| | 3.4 | Doing the analysis | 31 |
| | 3.5 | Appendix to chapter 3 | 34 |
| Chapter 4: | FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION | | 43 |
| | 4.1 | Conceptual framework and procedure of interpretation | 44 |
| | 4.2 | Democracy conceptualisation | 51 |
| | 4.3 | Democratic values and personality traits | 66 |
| | 4.4 | Dilemmas of democracy | 75 |
| | 4.5 | Bearers of democracy | 82 |
| Chapter 5: | CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS | | 87 |
| | 5.1 | Recommendations | 89 |
| References | | | 93 |

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my gratitude to the following people who have given me the courage and support to finish this work on democracy.

First, I will not forget the patience and support my supervisor Professor Shirley Pendlebury has shown to me. Indeed she has been a symbol of success.

I will always feel guilty if I do not thank the efforts and dedication of my friends and dearest sisters Kedi Motsau and Nini Monyane. They have always been available and rescued me with their wonderful skills of typing.

To my parents, Nomabali, and Mpond'alithethi Mashiyi, their hardships and related stories of their childhood have been a source of inspiration to me, hence my determination to rise up and be an achiever in life.

To my wife Nombulelo Stella Mashiyi and her good words "Only educated people in co-operation with others can improve this country and save it from any possible catastrophe" The knowledge I have acquired about democracy will be ploughed back to the society where it belongs.

I thank you all.

## CHAPTER ONE

## INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

South Africa recently has undergone a democratic change as shown by the establishment of a government of National Unity, headed by the African National Congress (ANC) in 1994 and by the second democratic election in 1999. The new government is faced with the task of redressing the political, social and educational imbalances. In the field of education a new curriculum, Curriculum 2005, is intended to redress educational imbalances and to provide an education for democratic citizenship. Despite these very welcome changes, the majority of schools are still using textbooks published in the apartheid era. The aim of this research report is to assess the feasibility of using old history textbooks to promote new democratic ideals.

### Historical background

The history of South Africa has been characterised by racial intolerance, political instability, violence and educational inequalities. Racially, the government of the day, influenced by its Apartheid constitution, applied the discriminating laws which separated people in different residential areas. The Group Areas Act ensured that whites lived separately in better areas, whilst Coloureds, Indians and Africans, had their own legally prescribed residential areas. Racial separation of people resulted in racial intolerance among South Africans. Legally entrenched

segregation, and a range of discriminatory practices, made unity and equality between blacks and whites impossible. White people had better opportunities than others since they had a right to vote, as well as other entrenched privileges. Black people were denied the right to vote for decades.

Politically, the South African constitution did not guarantee the freedom of speech. Black people and all other political activists were silenced by the government and were regarded as being dangerous to the state. Silencing was accomplished in different ways. Some political activists were put into jail. The examples one can give here includes such prominent figures as ex- President Mandela, Walter Sisulu and Wilton Mkwayi. Silencing in some instances meant brutally killing the political activists and thereby violating their right to life. De Kock and many others are examples of South African security forces who were involved in massive killings and human torture. Furthermore, blacks were in some instances deprived of their right to movement. The introduction of the state of emergency by the P.W. Botha government determined when and where people should be at home.

Educationally, Carrim (in press) argues that the system of apartheid has affected seriously the nature of educational provisions and order in South Africa. It ensured that South Africans were schooled in segregated environments. This meant that every level of the education system was cast in a racial mould, from budgetary provision, the structure of educational bureaucracies, the composition

of the staff and pupils to the kind of curriculum used and the supply and prescription of textbooks. Segregation of schooling meant that different races in South Africa had their own departments. African education was under the Department of Education and Training, Indian education under the House of Delegates, Coloured education under the House of Representatives and white education under the House of Assembly.

My experience concerning the difference between black and white schools reveal a lot of imbalances. Most of the black schools were overcrowded with a shortage of learning and teaching materials. As a student doing practicals in a school situated in Transkei right in a rural area, it was quite disturbing for me to sometimes run for about a week without a chalk. Some of the blackboards were too old for writing on. There were classes without windows and running water. However, it was a different case when I was sent to a multiracial school at Umtata which was a school dominated by whites. There were advanced teaching aids like projectors and many more others. There was absolutely no overcrowding.

Some teachers in black schools were underqualified. Also, the curriculum at schools was controlled by the government because it determined what to be learnt and who should do it. For example, black teachers taught black children, that is, every school was cast in racial moulds from the point of school management, school governance to the students. Black teachers were warned not to teach students politics or do anything that would project the state as being

bad. The teachers and students had to be loyal to the government otherwise one would face expulsion. In his book, Down Second Avenue Mphahlele (1959) states that as a teacher then in one of the schools in Soweto had to face expulsion for opposing Bantu education.

The racist education laws faced a wide range of challenges. The 1976 uprising was one of several attempts to fight the racist educational policies. Many people lost their lives in the attempts to resist racist laws. Others were banned or detained without trial, and others went into hiding to escape the iron fist of the government. It was during the late 90's that negotiations took place in South Africa to pave way for new democratic elections in the history of the country.

## Rationale

Against the above background, it was imperative that the new government epitomised in the name of Mandela should strive to redress the past injustices and promote democracy. Curriculum 2005 is one of several policy instruments intended to redress educational imbalances and to develop the skills, knowledge and attitudes necessary for a democratic citizenry. However, although South Africa is presently believed to be democratic, the vast majority of schools continue to use textbooks written during the apartheid era. A critical question therefore arises: Can old history textbooks be used to promote the new democratic ideals in Curriculum 2005? The aim of this research is to examine the relationship

between the critical and specific outcomes of Curriculum 2005 and a selection of history textbooks currently used in Katlehong schools.

The texts I have analysed are: History in Action (Grobler, Rautenbach and Engelbrecht,1987) for grade 12 and History to the Point (Malan, Applegryn and Theron,1986) for grade 11. It is important at this stage to mention that as these textbooks are for different grade levels they are also written by different authors. At the school where I teach, the grade eleven students who use History to the Point (1986) go on to use History in Action (1987) in grade 12. Although Curriculum 2005 is intended to apply to the first nine years of schooling, critical outcomes (as I have mentioned) apply to all levels of education The specific outcomes provide a useful set of criteria for thinking about History teaching in grades 11 to 12 as well.

I have decided to focus on history textbooks because history deals with the great struggles of human kind to change their societies. In my view, school history can also play a part in shaping citizen identity. This piece of research is not about the memorisation of the past events but is an investigation of whether and how history textbooks could promote democracy.

## CHAPTER TWO

## LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter reviews some aspects of recent philosophical and sociological work on democracy. This will provide a yardstick to measure the democratic content of history text books, with Curriculum 2005 and South Africa's new educational principles in mind.

I begin with a brief overview of some key concepts before elaborating authors' views and arguments. For the purpose of my investigation, perhaps the most important concepts are Amy Gutmann's principles of non-repression and non-discrimination which she specifies as criteria for democratic education (Gutmann, 1987). Non-repression, as will be discussed, encourages inclusion of students in academic as well as political and moral discussions. Non-discrimination is a principle for equal access to education, that is, all educable children must be educated and there should be no discrimination based on race, sex, religion, language and so on. According to Gutmann (1987), one of the aims of democratic education is to develop democratic citizens. Presumably, this also involves developing good democratic character.

Carol Gould (1998) presents an account of the constituents of the democratic character. She argues that to be democratic, among other things people need a disposition to reciprocity:

> This is a relational character trait, expressible only in a situation of social interaction, which involves an ability to understand the perspective of the other as equivalent to one's own, and a readiness to act with respect to the other in ways that are equivalent to the other's actions with respect to oneself, as well as to have an expectation that the other will understand and act similarly.(Gould, 1988, p290).

Both Gould and Gutmann regard deliberations as central to democracy. John Rawls (1993) proposes a critical approach to deliberative democracy, an approach that necessitates a democratic education. Rawls acknowledges that democratic deliberations may lead to disagreement. Reasonable disagreements, as Rawls (1993) suggests, help to ease tensions and bring progress in democratic deliberations.

While Rawls stresses rational argument, Iris Young (1996) argues that there are also other aspects of communication which may positively contribute to democratic discussions or deliberations. She proposes storytelling, as one of an important elements of communication that helps discussion to progress. She argues that deliberation as a way of communication in democracy is important since it provides people with the opportunity to talk and understand one another with an attempt to solve problems among people.

Gerald Graff (1992) helps us to see that critical thinking and deliberative discussion are important in a democratic education, both for students and educators. He argues that some educators have stereotyped assumptions about

other races. He uses his own examples to show how deliberations and critical thinking can be used to counter-act such assumptions.

Nazir Carrim's work examines democratic change in relation to education in South Africa. He argues that education that envisages a democratic change should acknowledge a notion of difference and good multi-culturalism as opposed to bad. Since 1994 the new democratic government has passed fairly wide ranging policies to enable democratic change in education. The South African Schools Act (1996), for example, is one of the policy documents intended to bring democratic change in education. This Act protects the right of children against torture since it has abolished corporal punishment of students by educators. Furthermore it also prevents discrimination based on religion and language and allows each and every learner the right of admission to each and every school. Also, it protects equal access to schooling for all children regardless of race, language, religion and sex.

Curriculum 2005 (1997) is also one of the policy documents intended to promote skills, values and attitudes necessary for democratic citizenry. It consists of critical as well as specific outcomes. Critical outcomes are cross-curricular aims which every learner should acquire from grade one through to higher degree level. The critical outcomes are as follows :

1. They require that learners will identify and solve problems and make decisions using critical and creative thinking.
2. Work effectively with others as members of a team, group, organisation and community.
3. Organise and manage themselves and their activities responsibly and effectively.
4. Collect, analyse, organise and critically evaluate information
5. Communicate effectively using visual, symbolic and/or language skills in various modes.
6. Use science and technology effectively and critically showing responsibility towards environment.
7. Demonstrate an understanding of the world as a set of related systems by recognising that problem solving contexts do not exist in isolation.

Specific outcomes focus on skills and understanding in different learning areas. The specific outcomes for Human and Social Science (which incorporates History) are as follows :

1. Demonstrate a critical understanding of how South African society has changed and developed.
2. Demonstrate a critical understanding of patterns of social development.
3. Participate actively in promoting a just, democratic and equitable society.
4. Make sound judgements about the developments, utilisation and management of resources.

5. Critically understand the role of technology in social development.
6. Demonstrate an understanding of an interrelationship between society and the rural environment.
7. Address social and environmental issues in order to promote development and social justice.
8. Analyse forms and processes of organisations.
9. Use a range of skills and techniques in Human and Social Sciences context.

## The principles of non-repression and non-discrimination

Among several reasons why Gutmann (1987) proposes the principles of non-discrimination and non-repression is her serious concern about decision-making in education. According to her, who decides what children should learn is an important question. She argues that education should not be made the sole responsibility of the state or families alone, but that all the stakeholders should decide. Education that is solely determined by the state poses a risk of indoctrination. The state, she argues, may not allow children to learn everything which might jeopardise its interest. She argues that if parents have sole responsibility, they may transmit their stereotypes, beliefs and attitudes to their children and thereby undermine the right of children to think for themselves.

The principles of non-discrimination and non-repression inform not only her

arguments about decision-making in education, but every aspect of education from a democratic point of view. For instance, non-discrimination according to Gutmann (1987) encourages educational opportunities. This means that students should get equal and better education and access to any school without racial prejudice. The actions and policy of the past South African government provide stark illustration of the necessity for Gutmann's two principles. In all situations the South African government prescribed and supplied textbooks to various schools. This effective control of the state to education gave it absolute opportunity to instill racial superiority of whites and hatred. In his notorious 1953 speech which acted as the basis of discrimination in education, Verwoerd said,

> There is not place for him (Bantu) in the European community above the level of certain form of labour. Within his (sic) own community however, all doors are open. For that reason it is no avail to receive a training which has at its aim absorption in the European community where he has been subjected to a school system which drew him away from his own community and misled him in showing him the green pastures of European society in which he was not allowed to graze. This attitude is not only uneconomic because money is spent for an education which has a specific aim but it is also dishonest to continue it. It is abundantly clear that unplanned education creates problems, disrupting the community life of the Bantu endangering the community life of the European .(cited in Rose & Tumner, p 266).

It was on the basis of such premises that black pupils were to be taught by teachers of their races and at their own schools. Verwoerd's utterances are, of course, a direct contradiction of the principle of non-discrimination. In addition to the discriminatary practices by white schools, the government stipulated what had to be taught at schools. Black teachers were expected to stick entirely to their given syllabuses and curriculum. In most cases black teachers were warned not

to be subversive to the state or teach students in a way that would question the legitimacy of the state and white supremacy.

This complete interference by the state in what should be learnt is what Gutmann (1987) calls repression. She therefore advocates non-repression where students' views about good life should not be silenced or repressed as the South African government was trying to instill a feeling of loyalty from the teachers and the children and for them to accept the status quo. As evidence of governments fear of subversiveness, in his book Down Second Avenue, Mphahlele (1959) argues that as a teacher then in one of the schools in Soweto he was xpelled for opposing Bantu Education.

According to Gutmann (1987), the principle of non-repression helps children to deliberate on matters of good life and to choose from the variety of alternatives, the one that is best for them. Democratic education in her view must aid children to develop the capacity to understand and to evaluate competing conceptions of good life and good society. This view has its support from the critical as well as the specific outcomes of Curriculum 2005. One of the critical outcomes states that students need to identify and solve the problems and make decisions using critical and creative thinking. One of the specific outcomes states that students should participate actively in promoting a just, democratic and equitable society.

South Africa's new educational policy recognises the principle of non-

discrimination in its specification that equal education is a right for all. However, there have still been recent attempts by some of the white schools to refuse admission to black pupils. In the case of Potgietersrus, Carrim (in press) argues that blacks seeking admission to this school were refused because its stakeholders claimed it was an Afrikaner only school as they argued, they were entitled constitutionally to maintain the Afrikaner culture, language and religion in their school. Enrolling black students who were not part of this cultural tradition therefore, was unacceptable. Though the court ruled that this school had no right to discriminate on the basis of race, culture and language and more so acting against the right to applying students to an education. This example portrays clearly the racial intolerance of some parents to students of other races.

The admission of black students to white schools meant that they were also entitled to equal education and opportunities regarding the resources of the schools which were previously enjoyed and utilised by the whites. Also, the benefit the school had from the court ruling is that, it had the opportunity to have different racial groups who were able to discuss and be exposed to different lifestyles and culture.

## Democratic dispositions

The active participation of citizens in a democracy requires a wide range of knowledge, skills and dispositions. For example, as Gould (1988) argues,

political agents need to be aware of the functions of democratic organisations and community structures. Also, as already mentioned, they need the capacity to think critically and develop such dispositions as flexibility, open - mindedness, tolerance and mutual respect (Gould 1988).

On her view about participation in decision making, Gould (1988) argues that it is imperative that agents involved in the process must not in anyway be limited on grounds of race, age, gender, language etc. People in a democratic setting must be equal, that is, sharing equal status and opportunities. However, she argues that deliberations ought to be critical in order to challenge negative assumptions and stereotypes. Although critical deliberations are necessary. It is through them that people may tend not to agree on particular issues, but this does not mean they can compromise on matters of public interest. As citizens they have to learn to interact on larger extent in order to understand each other (Gould 1988).

They must reciprocate and consider each others individual needs and actively attempt to enhance the others understandings and self development, more over where each of the agents takes such mutual enhancement as a contagious aim. She argues that people should be open minded and flexible and take the views and opinion of others seriously. There must be commitment and responsibility in that no democratic association can survive unless the commitment to continue within its frame-work and according to the rules is maintained.

To enrich Gould's views, I turn now to a brief account of critical discussion in the classroom. Graff (1992) shows that critical thinking and discussion also have positive impact on educators themselves. Although he was an English lecturer and not a history teacher, Graff's experience has some pertinet lessons for history teachers.

Graff argues that, as an English lecturer teaching the politics of Heart of Darkness, he was compelled to teach this book somewhat differently. What precipitated this change was a critical essay by Achebe entitled An Image of Africa. In this case Achebe was criticising Conrad, the writer of Heart of Darkness, as a racist who portrayed Africans as an undifferentiated mass of eye-rolling, tom-tom beating black savages, with incomprehensible freenzy representing a primitive and prehistoric stage of humanity. In short, according to Achebe, what Conrad does to black Africa at the level of representation is something like what European imperialism was doing to it in reality. Achebe's article convinced Graff that Conrad's assumption about race was not as Graff had imagined.

According to Graff, he was forced to rethink not just his interpretation of Heart of Darkness but his theoretical assumptions about literature. First he was forced to recognise that he had theoretical assumptions, as he had previously thought he was simply teaching the truth about Heart of Darkness, that is, 'the text itself'. However, he argues that he had to recognise that he had been teaching an interpretation of the text, one that was shaped by certain theory that told him what

what was not worth noticing and emphasising in his classroom. He had been unable to see his theory because he was living so comfortably inside it.

Now when he teaches Heart of Darkness, as he has done in several undergraduate courses for the last few years, he assigns Achebe's essay. He does not simply teach Achebe's interpretations. To make sure the students enter a debate rather than watch passively from the sidelines, he assigns a paper on it or asks them to prepare class presentations in which they give their views. Teaching Heart of Darkness now seems to him to have made his course considerably more challenging than it was previously. For his students now have to be more reflective about assumptions than they had to be before, and they are now asked to take part in a set of complex debates that he previously did not expect them to. Graff's account reveals that critical deliberation challenged his own assumptions and resulted in his new approach to teaching. History teachers themselves should be able to appraise, evaluate and, over time, change the attitudes and practices in relation to different cultural and racial groups.

A question is worth noting here: How can we let people negotiate and participate freely in democratic struggles when they are presently not economically and socially equal? The answer Gould (1988) proposes is a disposition to reciprocity. This is the disposition for one to understand the perspective of others as equivalent to one's own and be ready to act with respect to others in ways that

are equivalent to their actions with respect to oneself. Reciprocity also requires the expectation that others will understand and act similarly.

Reciprocity also generates reciprocity of perspective which goes beyond the limits of one's own views and makes possible the establishment of a shared point of view. Gould (1988) argues that decision making ought to take the form of critical discussion, even though this includes the possibility of difference of opinion and what Rawls (1993) calls radical disagreement.

Rawls (1993) concurs with Gould (1988) that differences should not lead to frustration. He argues that even when agreements should be possible in discussions, disagreements can occur. Therefore, though people may disagree, he argues that this should be reasonable disagreement. Reasonable disagreement among reasonable people is between persons who have realised their moral powers to a degree sufficient to be free and equal citizens in a democratic country and who have realised the desire to be fully co-operating members of society over a complete life-time. The political situation in South Africa during the 1990s supports Rawls' views. In the 1990s many political groups and church leaders, across racial lines, participated in talks about talks which attempted to pave the way for real negotiations that would bring about a political conception of justice applicable to all.

The National Party, epitomised in the name of De Klerk, still had the attitude of supremacy as it had been an apartheid government for decades. On the other hand, the Indians, Coloureds and Blacks were eager to get fruits from the negotiations which would free them from apartheid and its racist laws. They hoped to get political rights to guarantee their full citizenship. No doubt the differences and imbalances at the negotiating forum had negative results at some points. In its initial stages there were some complaints, mostly by the ANC, that a section of white people was not co-operative in the process of negotiation. The then general Secretary of the ANC, Mr Cyril Ramaphosa, appeared on television blaming some whites for some insults and other acts of racism. However, though there were some problems, there were also some positive gains. For the first time in the history of South Africa, South Africans across racial and cultural and gender lines came together and discussed a political situation and were also afforded the opportunity to know what the problems of other people were, and how important it would be to understand them. It is on the basis of such talks that South Africa today is a democratic country where each and every citizen has a right to vote. Though there were at times stalemates in the discussions, it was necessary that disagreements should not undermine progress. In this way, at last consensus was reached.

It was in this setting that women managed to represent their interests as equals to men. They had an opportunity to challenge the history of the dominant culture and to validate their own experiences and truths

so that they could be looked at as useful members of the society. It is important that history textbooks should include these historical events because they contain vital information on how South Africa became the country it is today and on the form and purpose of its Bill of Right. This will provide students with a critical understanding of how South African Society has changed and developed. This, it is hoped, will make them see the importance of communication in democracy as one of the specific outcomes under Human and Social Science, as well as meeting the critical outcome that states that learners should communicate effectively using visual, symbolic and/or language skills in various modes.

Often children are introduced to violence and intolerance through television and history textbooks. This has produced both positive and negative results. On one hand, the killings of people in Angola, Bosnia and countries like Sudan have made children fear and hate violence. It is likely that in any civil war people are brutally killed and tortured. The recent television documentary about violence in Sierra Leone bears testimony to this. On the other hand, violence on television may have bad influence on children. In cases when a treaty or agreement is made between parties who were fighting, children may believe that war brings peace. This is, however, not what democracy hopes to achieve. In democracy people should strive for peaceful conflict resolution, as Gould (1988) suggests in her principles of reciprocity and mutual tolerance.

Rational deliberation (with reasonable disagreement) is proposed by Rawls (1993) as a recipe for peaceful settlement of differences. There are also other mechanisms that can prevent hostilities among people and thereby promote peaceful solutions to political problems. For example, Young (1996) proposes storytelling as one useful form of communication. She argues that storytelling helps to develop deliberative democracy because it reveals the particular experiences of those situated differently from oneself and so enhance the kind of understanding needed in order to do justice to others. She gives an example of people in wheelchairs at a university who make claims upon the university resources to remove what they see as impediments to their full participation and of how their claims will equalise their ability to compete with able-bodied students. A similar example would be albinos who were marginalised in the apartheid era. The primary way to make their case would be through telling stories about their physical and social situation in order to challenge commonly-held assumptions about them.

Though forms of communication are important in deliberative democracy to facilitate peaceful resolution to deliberations, Carrim (1995) argues that education which acknowledges difference is necessary in order to promote the interests and desires of people where people are not coerced to live in the expectations of others but live-self fulfilling lives. He argues that the aim of democracy education should be to encourage differences but not as bad multiculturalists have done.

According to him, bad multiculturalists have tended to stereotype blackness. Equally, they have tended to stereotype whiteness to mean the same. Whites are not homogeneous, any more than Blacks or women are. White South Africans have decended from English, Dutch, Portuguese, Italian and many other roots. In any case, none of these cultural groups is homogeneous. Blacks are also divided into Zulu, Xhosa, Venda and others who therefore constitute different cultures and religions and there are differences within each of these groups. Against this background, bad multiculturalists in their struggle against racism are guilty of perpetuating caricatures.

Good multiculturalists would look, for example, at intra black conflicts and try to redress them by developing understanding. Since it encourages the understanding of different identities of people, good multiculturalism therefore seeks to protect them. It allows that people should live the way they want to as long as this does not violate the rights of others. Bad multiculturalists, according to Carrim (1995), tend to look on bipolar relations, that is relations between white and black. This ignores the fact that there are white people who are not sensitive to colour in a way to attach superiority but instead recognises the importance of honouring and respecting difference. Charging every white for racism is racism in itself. For example, in a South African setting during apartheid, white people were

engaged in various struggles against racism. Some were detained and some lost their lives. Also, a vote for ANC by many white people showed the preparedness of whites to end apartheid peacefully and to introduce democracy.

Using the example of bad multiculturalist, it is important that teachers who are dealing with different racial and religious groups should not see and divide the students into their specific cultural groups. Instead there should be respectful acknowledgement of differences, as well as appropriate recognition of identities. Being an African man in a school predominantly for Indians or Coloureds is decidedly different from being an African in a predominantly White school.

As mentioned earlier, legislation like the South African Schools Act (1996) has contributed to democratic change in South African schools. Basically the South African Schools Act (1996) protects the right of children to education and thus enacts what Gutmann (1987) calls the principle of non-discrimination. Also, though the Governing Bodies of the schools have the right to determine the school language policy, the South African Schools Act (1996) forbids discrimination based on language. The Act also protects free religious affiliation by any student. In short, although the Governing Bodies of schools have powers to determine the Mission Statement of the school, they are not allowed to promote religious intolerance or any other form of discrimination. Several of the themes in this chapter will be picked up in chapter four as the basis of my analysis.

# CHAPTER THREE

# METHODOLOGY

## Introduction

As mentioned in chapter one, the aim of this research is to examine the relationship between the stated critical and specific outcomes of Curriculum 2005 and a selection of history textbooks currently in use in Katlehong schools. This is propelled by the fact that Curriculum 2005 is intended to redress past educational imbalances by teaching students skills and values necessary for a democratic citizenry. However, old history textbooks (published in the apartheid era) are still used in Katlehong and probably in township schools nationwide. Is it possible to use old history textbooks to promote the new democratic ideals in Curriculum 2005?

In the initial stages of this research I had planned to conduct an in-depth textbook analysis and to do comparative observations of two history teachers using these textbooks. The reason for the proposed classroom observation was that I wanted to see how the teachers use the books and whether they are critical about them or simply reproduce the content without reflecting on it. Also, it was on the basis of observation that I would have been able to see how students react in the history lessons. Are they passive agents who do not reflect on the lesson but accept everything that is said by the teacher and the text, or are they active

critical discussants? Democracy requires that there should be a critical approach to learning and teaching in a way that challenges assumptions about the past. One of the critical outcomes of Curriculum 2005 requires the students to identify and solve problems and make decisions using critical and creative thinking.

In its final form the research project did not include observations but focussed only on an in-depth textbook analysis. My plan to conduct classroom observations was not feasible for several reasons. By the time I was free to visit schools it was during the examination period and there was no more teaching since teachers and students were preparing for and writing examinations. Also, what exacerbated matters was that I could not have conducted any observations without first asking for permission from the authorities concerned. This proved more difficult and time-consuming than anticipated. In any case, the advice of the external examiner of my proposal was that it would be better to limit the scope of the research by undertaking either observation or a text book analysis. To do both would be a "daunting task". Indeed, as I have found, the analysis alone was a challenge.

New educational policy in South Africa rests on the vision of a productive and democratic society with self-fulfilled and critical citizens. Curriculum 2005 is one of the central policy documents aimed at achieving this vision. Because textbooks are an important means for accomplishing curricular ends, teachers are expected to use them in a way that will promote democracy. One of the ways to do this, of

course, is to look at them critically. Is it possible for teachers to use texts critically and in a way that promotes democracy when most teachers have not been trained in the skills of critical thinking? Furthermore, Curriculum 2005 requires teachers to prepare and write materials suitable for use in democracy education, but they lack the required skills. The remaining possibility is for teachers to use available textbooks. Textbook analysis is thus necessary to find out whether the available textbooks have sufficient democratic content for history teachers to use them for promoting an understanding of democracy and related skills.

Before describing the analytical instrument used for this research, I introduce the two textbooks and discuss my procedure for selecting chapters for analysis.

## Selection of textbooks and chapters

The textbooks which I analysed are History in Action (Grobler, Rautenbach and Engelbrecht,1987) for Std 10 (now called grade 12) and New History to the Point (Malan, Appelgryn and Theron, 1986) for Std 9 (now called grade 11). The std 10 history textbook has fifteen chapters divided into two main sections on General History and a section on South African History. From the Std 10 text book I have selected chapters three, five, seven and twelve. The Std 9 history text has eleven chapters also divided into two main sections, a section on General History and a section on South African History. Here I have selected chapters three, four eight and eleven. Although there are similarities in the structure of the two books,

there are some notable differences in style and approach. The content of the Std 9 textbook has been written mostly in point form whereas the Std 10 text contains more elaboration. Also, the Std 9 text does not provide much information about the struggles of the previously oppressed groups in any part of Africa, whereas the Std 10 text devotes a full chapter to these struggle. It is important I believe that learners should know and understand the processes that were involved in the struggle for liberation and what difference did this make to both the oppressed and the oppressor.

My selection of chapters depended either on the thematic similarity or contrast. I have twinned chapters three of the Std 9 book with chapter three of the Std 10 book because while one deals with rights and peace the other deals with violation of political rights and violence. Here I have applied the principle of opposites. Chapter three of the Std 9 book - "Peace Conference in Paris and the League of Nations" - deals with the attempts to redress the failures of the European system which led to first World War. Also, the League tries to promote World peace and to avoid the other possible war. On the other hand, chapter three of the Std 10 book - "The Decline of Democracy and The Rise of Totalitarian States" - deals with the actions of Hilter and his desire to create a one-party state in Germany. This no doubt undermined the rights of people to choose for any party they wanted to join.

Chapter 5 of the Std 10 book has been twinned with chapter four of the Std 9 book because while one deals with the violation of human rights, the other deals with protection of human rights. Here I have also applied the principle of opposites. For example, chapter 5 of Std 10 - "United Nations Organisation"- focusses on human rights and attempts by the UNO to avoid the problems of the League of Nations. On the other hand, chapter 4 of Std 9 - "United States of America in the Nineteenth Century"- deals with slavery. Although slavery in the USA was practised long before the formation of the UNO, it is useful to look at this in order to compare the aims of the UNO concerning the protection of human rights with an institution (slavery) founded upon a gross violation of human rights.

Chapter 12 of the Std 10 book and chapter 1 of the Std 9 book have been twinned because they both deal with the theme of reconstruction and development. For example, chapter 12 of Std 10 - "Political, Economic and Social development of South Africa, 1924 - 1948" - looks at the political players the period of South African history leading to the rule of the Nationalist Party. For the purpose of this research project, this is useful because it will address the question of who played the dominant part in South African politics. Chapter 8 of Std 9 - "The Reconstruction and Unification of South Africa 1902 to 1910"- addresses the same concern with historical role players in the reconstruction of South Africa. Also, when we talk of unification, in the period 1902 to 1910 what does this mean, who was united with whom and what significance did this have on democracy.

Lastly, chapter seven of Std 10 has been twinned with chapter 11 of Std 9 because they have the same theme, namely political rights. For instance, chapter 7 of Std 10 - "African Nationalism and Independence Movements"- looks at how Africans demanded political rights and representation as opposed to oppressive colonial rulers. Similarly, chapter 9 of Std9 - "Activities and problems of the National Convention" - deals with Smut's attempts to remove all points of racial friction in order to create the Union of South Africa.

## The analytic instrument

The analytic instrument for assessing the democratic content of the texts was developed at the University of Belgrade by members of the democracy education project, in conjunction with the project team from the University of the Witwatersrand (hereinafter WITS) Education Department. The democracy education project is a cross cultural study which includes South Africa, Mozambique, former Yugoslavia and Sweden. Wits is deeply involved in democracy education as evidenced by writings on democracy by Enslin (1994), Carrim (in press), Cross and Leroke (1995 ) and others. It is on the basis of the Wits commitment to democratic change in South Africa and its education system, that we as the students were part of the community of researchers.

The analytical instrument is divided into six main categories (see the appendix at the end of this chapter). The first main category is Democracy Conceptualisation

which comprises two sub-categories, namely, Distribution and Control of Power and Basic Human Rights. The second main category is the Pre-requisites and the Models of Developments of Democracy, the third is Bearers of Democracy, the fourth is Democratic Values and Personality Traits, the fifth is the Models of Practising Democracy and the last is the Dilemmas of Democracy.

I begin with an elaboration of the two sub-categories of Democracy Conceptualisation: Distribution and Control of Power and Basic Human Rights. Under the Distribution and Control of Power, the focus is on documents; constitutions; laws; declarations; democratic institutions like parliaments, assemblies, courts and others; multi-party systems and elections. In the case of parliaments, assembly and courts, the nature of their constitution is looked at. For example, how is the parliament structured and how is power distributed, it is male or female dominated?

The category Basic Human Rights deals with the equality of nations and states; equality of groups and the right to personal dignity and freedom. The other set of rights listed in this category are legal security and equality before the law; socio-economic rights like the right to strike; cultural rights like the right to education; freedom of association; political rights and freedoms; freedom of press and media; freedom of political association and assembly and access to information. Equality of nations and states refers, among other things, to the liberation movements and their fight for independence and sovereignty from

colonialism, invasions and various forms of repression. Equality of groups concerns equal treatment regardless of race; sex; gender; sexuality; language and others. The right to personal dignity includes the right to life; the right against torture and the right to privacy.

The main category History and the Prerequisites and of Democracy Development and Models of Democracy, includes events, occasions (occurrences, phenomena, democracy, both on international and domestic level. For example: specific models in particular cultural context, liberal capitalism, free market and others.) The category Bearers of Democracy, includes all persons, organisation, events and movements explicitly given in the textbooks as those who proclaimed the principles of democracy.

The category Democratic Values and Personality Traits, includes all values and personality traits shown as democratic in the textbooks, e.g. freedom, tolerance or respect for diversity, awareness of diversity, freedom from discrimination, co-operation, peace, non-violent conflict resolution, equality before the law, equality of opportunities and openness towards others. Many of the values concur with those proposed by Carol Gould (1988). In the case of respect for diversity, Carrim's (1985) argument is worth mentioning. He argues that education which is aimed at promoting democracy should acknowledge difference. The diversities that people have should be respected and should be no attempts to force people to live their cultures in a way to join others.

The category Models of Practising Democracy refers to modes of democracy whether representative or participatory and in which kind of contexts such as in the community, groups or public.

Dilemmas of Democracy looks at dilemmas such as whether poverty influences the extent of the realisation of democracy, whether extremist non-democratic groups should exist within democracy and the tensions between acknowledging difference while attempting to establish commonality. The other interesting dilemma worth mentioning stems from Rawls proposal of reasonable disagreement. According to Rawls (1993), people can and are likely to disagree but they need to do so reasonably. The dilemma, then, is how far people can reasonably disagree. Does it not pose a threat to a right of people to differ and express their views?

## Doing the analysis

I have analysed the selected chapters by counting the frequency of instances of the categories listed in the analytical instrument. In a textual analysis, questions arise about the appropriate unit of analysis. Should this be the single word, the sentence, the paragraph or some larger unit such as the book as a whole. Following the procedure used by other researchers in the democracy project, I have chosen to focus on units of meaning. These were sometimes sentences and sometimes whole paragraphs, sometimes with accompanying illustration and

sometimes not.

I also looked the way the democratic concepts were mentioned. For example, are they mentioned in declarative, elaborated or implied way? A declarative statement is one in which authors simply mention a concept or state a claim without further discussion or substantiating evidence. History in Action (chapter 5 page 77), states that the aim of the United Nations Organisation was to maintain an international peace and security. This is declarative because it is not stated how. Later in the chapter the authors provided an elaboration.

By elaboration what is meant is a substantiation of the concept or claim. History in Action chapter 5 page 77 states that fifty nations met to discuss the draft of the UNO. However, smaller nations opposed the veto right of the great powers. The charter is a democratic concept which falls under 1.13 (other documents, declarations, conventions, etc). The authors continue to state that though smaller nations opposed the veto right of the great powers, after two months of deliberations they agreed to and signed the final charter. All fifty governments ratified the charter and became foundation members.

'Implicit' refers to any hidden meaning and to views implied or hinted at but not directly stated. For instance, in a case when authors say, all people attended the conference, it is implied perhaps that people of different nationalities, sex and of differences races were allowed to attend the conference.

As I stated earlier in this chapter that though I have used instruments to measure the democratic content of the books, my perception and expectation about history must have unconsciously or consciously influenced my text analysis. This is what Carrim (in press) quotes as the "politics of reading". He goes on to say, this means that every text is interpreted on the basis of who reads it, and who reads it is influenced by who they are and the multiple factors that influence who one is and how one interprets what (s)he reads. For these reasons, as a group of M.Ed. students, it became necessary for us to establish inter-subjective agreement in the ways in which we read the texts so that we do not read the same statement in a text and classify it in different categories. In order to establish this inter-subjective agreement all the Wits M.Ed students, and in the presents of our supervisors read sample from the South African history textbooks and we checked to see whether we classified the chosen texts in the same ways. The few differences among us where insignificant.

Therefore, despite the possibility of continual research and possible challenges to the findings of my research, I affirm the findings of this research as authentic and accurate within the restricted scope.

## Appendix to chapter 3

# I DEMOCRACY CONCEPTUALISATION

## 1. Distribution and Control of Power

### 1.1 Documents

Documents are important since they present the record of organisation and distribution of power, rights and liabilities in a society. The existence of any such record is, in our opinion, an important step for gaining democracy, particularly the idea of distribution and the control of power. Since some of these documents are not basically democratic by their content we have introduced the category seemingly democratic. Our analysis included the laws and documents pertaining to the socio-economic system, parties' declarations and citizens' rights and liabilities. The peace treaties, agreement alliances and state agreements are not included.

1.1.1 Constitution(democratic and seemingly democratic)

1.1.2 Laws

1.1.3 Other documents (declarations.....)

1.2 Democratic Institutions (parliament, Assembly, Court, Delegation Principle, Self-management, Government...) Forums

1.3 Multi-party System

1.4 Elections

## 2. Basic Human Rights

We have taken the basic human rights as subcategory conceptualisations, sine they are raison d'etre for the existence of democratic institutions. It is absolutely impossible about democracy if the human rights are not emphasised and respected. On another hand, in democratic societies the human rights can most easily protected and guaranteed.

2.1 Right to personal Dignity and Freedom

- 2.1.1 Right to life
- 2.1.2 Against torture
- 2.1.3 Right to Privacy
- 2.1.4 Freedom of Movement
- 2.1.5 The Right to opinion and scruples

2.2 Equality of Groups in Respect

- 2.2.1 Race
- 2.2.2 Sex, Gender Sexuality, Pregnancy
- 2.2.3 Language, Writing, Nationality
- 2.2.4 Religion (Religious rights
- 2.2.5 Social background and Property
- 2.2.6 National identity, Ethnic identity

2.3 Equality of Nations and States

This category will include all cases in which one nation or state jeopardises another one; for example: racism, colonialism, nationalism, invasion, various forms of pressures and repression sanctions etc.

2.3.1 Liberation Movement and Fight for Independence and Sovereignty. This subcategory is considered separately because the liberation movement are the form of fight for some very important democratic right to life, right to associate, freedom of choice, freedom of opinion, freedom of religion etc. Therefore, these movements are the fights for independence and sovereignty of the state, which is itself an important democratic gain.

2.3.2 Associating into State and Alliances

This sub-category is considered separately because it includes several democratic principles: Sovereignty of nations and states, election rights, association rights, The examples of such associations are: Kingdom of Serbs, Croats and Slovenians, Balkan Alliance etc.

2.4 Legal Security and Equality before the Law

2.5 Socio-economic Rights (better life and work condition, right to strike, right to join into unions...)

2.6 Cultural Rights: right to education, training, to participation in the cultural life

2.7 Freedom of Association and Assembly(various non-political and non-union associations)

2.8 Political Rights and Freedoms

2.8.1 Freedom of Opinion and Expression

2.8.2 Freedom of Press and Media

2.8.3 Freedom of Political Association and Assembly

2.8.4 Access to Information

## II HISTORY AND THE PREREQUISITES OF DEMOCRACY

## DEVELOPMENT AND MODELS OF DEMOCRACY

This category includes the list of events, occasions (occurrences, phenomena, democracy, both on international and domestic level. For example:

1 Specific models in particular cultural contexts

2. The onset of liberal capitalism

3. Free market

4. Middle class

5. Parliamentarism

6. French Declaration and human rights

7. UN Declaration on human rights

8. American Constitution

To make a definite list of key points in development of democracy in the world and in our country, we shall consult the relevant experts (politicians, sociologist lawyers.)

## III THE BEARERS OF DEMOCRACY

This category include all persons, organisation, and movement explicitly given in text-books as those who proclaimed the principles of democracy.

## IV DEMOCRATIC VALUES AND PERSONALITY TRAITS

This category includes all values and personality traits shown as democratic in the textbooks, either in negative or positive sense. The traits and values that the text-book point out as national are marked (circle around).

1. Freedom
2. Tolerance; Respect for Diversity; awareness of diversity; freedom from discrimination' will to accept differences
3. Co-operation
4. Peace; non-violent conflict resolution
5. Solidarity
6. Equality before the law
7. Equality of opportunities
8. Freedom of Association and assembly
9. Active participation in public life, public affairs, public issues
10. Respecting peoples of other cultures, religion and languages
11. Helping young people to become informed, active and responsible citizens of culturally plural Europe and "global village"
12. Mutuality, interdependence of different states, religions and ideas
13. Mutual understanding
14. Confidence
15. Respect of human rights
16. Equality for the worth and dignity of each individual

17. Self-discipline
18. Respect for the worth and dignity of each individual
19. Civility
20. Compassion
21. Concern and act for the good of the community
22. Healthy scepticism - critical institutions
23. Respect of rules, laws institutions
24. Responsibility
25. Openness towards others
26. Civic knowledge: basic concepts and values fundamental for democratic politic community and constitutional system
27. Reconciliation
28. Intellectual skills, critical thinking; ability to...
29. Participatory skills; skills in making decision about public issues; participating in public affairs.
30. Relational and contextual thinking
31. Awareness of affects on the environment
32. (Active) opposition to exploitation and oppression

## V MODELS OF PRACTISING DEMOCRACY

This category includes a part of that which is called civic education, a part related to the level of action, practising of civic, democratic knowledge. (Civic knowledge,

civic skills, civic values, civic virtues are included into other categories under the present classification).

i) Making decision about public issues (critical thinking, responsibility and being informed are assumed)

ii) Participation in public and community affairs

## VI DILEMMAS OF DEMOCRACY

This category includes all existing dilemmas and problems related to the concept and the practical application of democracy that are mentioned in the text-book. For example (taken from the literature):

1. Poverty and democracy (is democracy possible in poor societies, is there a connection between economic status and democratic system, should the social problems be solved more efficiently in the democratic system; could poor countries support an expensive democratic system)
2. The educational level of citizens and democracy (educational level, informational level, cognitive capabilities and the ability to recognise the general and specific interest and to organise civil actions)
3. The possibility of internationalising democratic principles(could one country interfere in internal affairs of another country n the name of democracy)
4. The existence of double standards in respecting the democratic principle

(a state with democratic system having non-democratic treatment o the others, democratic rules valid only there for specific group. etc)

5. Multi-ethnic communities and democracy (is democracy the best system for such a community and for the protection of ethnic minorities)
6. Limits to which democratic principles are valid (existence of extremist groups and actions, the country in peril, jeopardising rights of the others, civic disobedience in the case when system's institutions are not functioning.)
7. Misbeliefs that democratic system is a self-sustaining and sel-renewing mechanism (incomprehension that, in reality, this system requires the engagement of well informed, capable and interested citizens)
8. The collision between the political equality of citizens and their factual inequality.
9. The collision between two democratic principles(the applications of one principle jeopardise the application of another, for example the principle of non-democratic civic association.
10. Relation between liberal capitalism and democracy(are the liberal capitalism and the free market necessary conditions for the development of democratic systems)
11. Is democracy possible in socialistic, on-party systems (did these systems master certain democratic principles in some areas o the social life)
12. Problems concerning voting rights: who should've the right to vote(are there some categories to which this right should be denied, the equality of

individuals or organisations, which election procedure is the best should the voting be compulsory, securing correct and honest election

13. Compatibility of democratic principles and various cultural-historic developing models.

## CHAPTER FOUR

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter presents and discusses the findings of the comparative analysis of the two history textbooks in order to provide a basis for examining (in chapter 5) the possibility of using either or both textbooks to promote the new democratic ideals as expressed in Curriculum 2005 and other policy documents. Roughly following the categories from the analytical instrument, I have organised this chapter under the following topics : Democracy Conceptualisation, Democratic Values and Personality Traits, Dilemmas of Democracy and Bearers of Democracy. The sequence I have followed does not parallel the sequence of categories in the frequency table (see table 1). I have discussed the Bearers of Democracy last because in some ways it serves to challenge, or at least to complicate, the clear-cut picture that emerges from the frequencies for the other categories. Also, in both textbooks most references to the Bearers of Democracy take the form of photographs rather than text.

I have omitted two of the categories from the analytical instrument, first, History and the Prerequisites of Democracy Development and Models of Democracy, second, the Models of Practising Democracy. Regarding the Models of Practising Democracy, I have omitted it because there are no instances of this category in the selected chapters. Central to History and the Pre-requisites of Democracy Development and Models of Democracy is the UN Declaration of Human Rights, to avoid repetition I have not discussed this sub-category here but elsewhere under Basic Human Rights. Equally worth mentioning is that, although the sub-category the free market and perhaps others are elaborated in the texts, I have

not discussed them because they are not part of the Bill of Rights enshrined in the Constitution of South Africa. On the whole I have discussed democratic categories and sub-categories enshrined in the Constitution because the Bill of Rights is a cornerstone of democracy in South Africa.

## Conceptual framework and procedure of interpretation

Several of the authors discussed in chapter 2 have been useful in validating the claims I have made about the two books. For example, Gutmann (1987) proposes two principles for democratic education: non-repression and non-discrimination. Gould (1988) views a democratic character as one who is tolerant of other peoples= views, is open-minded and has a disposition to reciprocity. Rawls (1993) proposes deliberation as an important element of democracy since it allows for peaceful resolution to problems. Similarly, Young (1996) proposes storytelling as one means of democratic communication. Graff (1992) proposes critical thinking and discussion. He argues that deliberation ought to be critical in order to challenge stereotypes and negative assumptions. Carrim (in press) proposes the acknowledgement of difference and good multiculturalism.

My interpretation of findings proceeds through an analysis of patterns in the following frequency table, supported by selected quotations from the two textbooks. My discussion follows a set pattern. In each case, I begin with the frequency count, then I refer to an illustrative example from the relevant chapter. Thereafter I discuss the implications for democracy education.

| I. Democracy Conceptualisation | | History in Action Std 10 | | | | New History to the Point Std 9 | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| NUMBER | DESCRIPTION | D | E | I | TOTAL | D | E | I | TOTAL |
| 1. | Distribution & Control | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 1.1 | Documents | 1 | 2 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 1.1.1 | Constitution | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 4 |
| 1.1.2 | Laws | 3 | 6 | 0 | 9 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| 1.1.3 | Other documents (declarations...) | 3 | 4 | 0 | 7 | 4 | 3 | 0 | 7 |
| 1.2 | Democratic institution<br>eg Parlia, courts, assembly | 4 | 2 | 0 | 6 | 8 | 0 | 0 | 8 |
| 1.3 | Multi-party System | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| 1.4 | Elections | 2 | 4 | 0 | 6 | 5 | 2 | 1 | 8 |
| 2. | Basic Human Rights | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.1 | Right to personal dignity and freedom | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.1.1 | Right to life | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.1.2 | Against torture | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.1.3 | Right to Privacy | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.1.4 | Freedom of movement | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 3 |
| 2.1.5 | The right to opinion and scruples | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.2 | Equality of groups in respect to : | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.2.1 | Race | 1 | 3 | 1 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.2.2 | Sex, gender, sexuality, pregnancy | 2 | 1 | 0 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 3 |
| 2.2.3 | Language, writing nationality | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 |
| 2.2.4 | Religion(religious rights) | 3 | 3 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 2.2.5 | Social background and property | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 2.2.6 | National identity, Ethnic identity | 1 | 2 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| 2.3 | Equality of Nations & States: Racism, colonialism, nationalism | 10 | 14 | 1 | 25 | 11 | 12 | 3 | 26 |
| 2.3.1 | Liberation movement and fight for independence and sovereinghty | 5 | 5 | 0 | 10 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 |
| 2.3.2 | Associating into States & Alliances | 2 | 3 | 0 | 5 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 4 |
| 2.4 | Legal security and Equality before the law | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.5 | Socio economic rights(better life and work conditions, right to strike & join union | 3 | 1 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 2.6 | Cultural rights: right to education tec. | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 2.7 | Freedom of association and assembly | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| 2.8 | Political Rights and freedoms | 3 | 1 | 1 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 0 | 9 |
| 2.8.1 | Freedom of opinion & expression | 4 | 3 | 0 | 7 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2.8.2 | Freedom of press and media | 2 | 1 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 |
| 2.8.3 | Freedom of political association and assembly | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 2.8.4 | Access to information | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| II | **History and the prerequisite of democracy/dev and models of democracy** | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Specific models in particular cultural context | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 2. | The onset of liberal capitalism | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 3. | Free market | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 4. | Middle class | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 5. | Parliamentarism | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 6. | French declaration on human rights | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 7. | U.N. Declaration on human rights | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8. | American Constitution | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| III | **The bearers of democracy eg. all persons, organisation, events & movements** | | | | | | | | |
| IV | **Democratic Values & Personality traits** | | | | | | | | |
| 1. | Freedom | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2. | Tolerance, Respect for diversity,freedom from discrimination will to accept difference | 4 | 4 | 0 | 8 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 5 |
| 3. | Co-operation | 1 | 4 | 0 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 4. | Peace; non violent conflict resolution | 4 | 4 | 1 | 9 | 7 | 6 | 1 | 14 |
| 5. | Solidarity | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 6. | Equality before the law | 4 | 4 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 7. | Equality of opportunities | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8. | Freedom of association | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9. | Active participation in public life | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 10. | Respecting people of other cultures, religions and languages | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 11. | Helping young people to become informed active and responsible citizens ....) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12. | Mutuality, interdependence of different states religions and ideas | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 13. | Mutual understanding | 1 | 3 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 14. | Confidence | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 15. | Respect of human rights | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 16. | Equality of all people | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 17. | Self-discipline | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 18. | Respect for the worth and dignity of each individual | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 19. | Civility | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 20. | Compassion | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 21. | Concern and act for the good of community | 1 | 2 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 22. | Health scepticism-critical thinking | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 23 | Respect of Rules, laws, institutions | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 24 | Responsibility | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 25. | Openness towards others | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 26. | Civic knowledge: basic concepts and values fundamental for dem. politic community and constitutional system | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 27 | Reconciliation | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 28 | Intellectual skills, critical thinking | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 29. | Participatory skills, skills in making decision about public issues; participating in public affairs | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 30. | Relational and contextual thinking | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 31. | Awareness of affects on the environment | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 32. | (Active) opposition to exploitation & oppression | 2 | 5 | 0 | 7 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 6 |
| V. | **Models of practising democracy (civic knowledge, civic skills, civic values etc.** | | | | | | | | |
| i) | Making decisions about public issues(critical thinking, responsibility & being informed | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| ii) | Participation in public & community affairs | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| VI. | **Dilemmas of Democracy** | | | | | | | | |
| 1. | Poverty & Democracy (is democracy possible in poor society) | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2. | The educational level of citizens & democracy | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 3 | Could one country interfere in the internal affairs of another country in the name of democracy | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 4. | The existence of double standards in respecting the principles of democracy | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 5. | Multi ethnic communities | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 6. | Existence of extremist groups and actions jeopardising rights of others | 1 | 3 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 3 |
| 7. | Misbelief that democratic system is a self-sustaining and self-renewing mechanism | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8. | The collision between the political equality of citizens and their factual inequality | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9. | The collision between two democratic principles one jeopardise the other | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 10. | Relation between liberal capitalism and democracy | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 11. | Is democracy possible in socialistic, mono-party systems | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12. | Problems concerning voting rights(who should have the rights to vote) | | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 4 |
| 13. | Compatibility of democratic principles and various cultural-historic developing models | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

**Democracy Conceptualisation**

Under the main category Distribution and Control of Power, documents other than constitutions for example declarations are given fairly full treatment in both books. Laws and constitutions are not mentioned at all in the selected chapters of the Std 9 text, but do appear in the Std 10 text. As mentioned earlier, I will not discuss these sub-concepts since they are broad concepts and do not reflect the values of South Africa's Bill of Rights.

As can be seen from the frequency table, under Basic Human Rights both books elaborate equality of groups in sex, gender; language writing; religious rights; political rights and freedoms; and freedom of press and media. The right to personal dignity and freedom; equality of race; socio-economic rights and cultural rights are elaborated in the Std 10 history text. Freedom of movement is only in the Std 9 text.

In chapter 3 of the Std 10 history text - "The decline of democracy and the rise of totalitarian states"- the right to personal dignity and freedom is declared in one place and elaborated in one place. In the Std 9 history text there is no mention whatsoever of this sub-category. For example, in discussing the characteristics of a totalitarian state, the authors of the Std 10 history text state that

> discipline over party members and citizens is strictly applied and individual or group freedom is considered less important than the stability and security of the

state (Grobler, Rautenbach &Engelbrecht, 1987, p.41)

Considering the above quotation, I present the following discussion. It is clear that the authors foreground the policy and ideology of the totalitarian governments which undermined personal dignity and freedom. Though it might have been the true ideology and policy of these governments, the authors have discussed in length about totalitarianism that is, what it is and what it stands for. They have done this without any illustration to democracy, for instance, in page 40. The rejection of democracy they have failed to outline or describe what democracy is and what it stands for. This will deprive the students the opportunity to contrast the two forms of government and be able to make informed choices. Students need to critically discuss and assess information as one of the critical outcomes of Curriculum 2005 states that, students should collect, analyse, organise and critically evaluate information. The importance of critical discussion is, as Graff (1992) points out, that it helps to challenge negative assumptions about people and events as he experienced when teaching the Heart of Darkness to university undergraduates. It was his reading of Achebe's Image of Africa that somewhat changed his approach to teaching Heart of Darkness.

In chapter three of the Std 9 history text - "The Peace Conference in Paris and the League of Nations" - freedom of movement is declared in two places and elaborated in one place. In the chapters analysed from the Std 10 history text,

there is no mention whatsoever of this sub-category. Consider an extract from the Std 9 text :

> After the first World War, many thousands of people were homeless and displaced when the Bolsheviks took control of Russia, more than 1½million Russians left their country. They were followed in 1920 by over 200 000 Greeks who left Turkey. In 1920 the League of Nations appointed the Fridtjof Nansen, a Norwegian as High Commissioner for the resettlements of refugees. He introduced the Nansen passport which was an international passport. Allowing refugees freedom of movements between any two of the 28 countries which accepted the passport. Antipathy towards refugees and lack of funds made this task nearly impossible. Nevertheless, he succeeded in selling about one third of the refugees permanently in about twenty countries. In 1922 Dr Nansen was awarded the Nobel Prize for the part he played in resettling stateless people of Europe (Malan, Appelgryn & Theron , 1986, p. 92).

The authors foreground the role Nansen played in resettling the homeless refugees. They stress Nansen's noble actions, as he spearheaded the movement of people from one place to the other. However, the authors do not tell us about the conditions of these people who left their country, whether they were happy to leave their country or did they have choice or it is simply that they left under duress. In a democratic state people must deliberate or engage themselves in public reason in a way to solve matters peacefully. Rawls (1993) shares this view point as he values deliberation in democracy.

In chapter 10 of the Std 10 history text -"Co-operation between the National Party

and the Labour Party 1924" - equality of groups in race is declared in one place and elaborated in three places. In the Std 9 history text there is no mention whatsoever of this sub-category. Looking at the 1929 election which resulted among other things to a joint Nationalist - Labour government, the Std 10 history authors state

> As we have seen the 1924 elections resulted in a joint Nationalist - Labour government, the Pact government, which immediately began to pay attention to constitutional matters, industrial development, agriculture, the economy, racial problems, South Africa's international image, national symbols and even the scrapping of British honorary titles in 1925. Almost from the beginning, however, discussion over the question of trade unions split the Labour Party. This affected the unity of the Pact government as a whole. Labour Cabinet minister Walter Madeley had close ties with Black Labour leader Clement Kadalie, and in 1928 Modeley granted an interview to a Black trade union against Hertzog's wishes. In a cabinet reshuffle which followed shortly after wards, Madeley was dropped from the cabinet. (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987, p. 208)

This passage illustrates how many white people were racially intolerant, especially to blacks even although some of them worked closely with blacks. The authors foreground the movement and organisations of white people and background those of blacks, Indians and coloureds, since by the time 1924 black organisations like the African Native National congress (ANNC) were long in existence as they played a major role in opposing segregation in South Africa.

In chapter 3 of the Std 10 History text - "The decline of democracy and the rise of totalitarian states" - equality of groups in sex, gender, is declared in two places and elaborated in one place. In chapter 3 of the Std 9 text - "The Peace Conference in Paris and the League of Nations" - the sub-category is declared in two places and elaborated in one place. According to the Std 10 text for example (1987,p. 48) it is stated that "Girls were not expected to pursue higher education but to prepare to become mothers of the Aryan race". The Std 9 text (1986, pp 105) states "Girls were not expected to obtain higher education since they were regarded as the Mothers of the future and as such expected to stay at home".

The above quotations reveal that both authors have mentioned the historical truth about the women in Germany. However, it is also a historical fact that colonised people resisted and opposed all forms of colonisation, but the Std 10 history authors make a positive motivation about colonisation. On page 97 they argue that colonisation was not completely bad but there were other positive aspects about it. For instance they state that, "the effects of colonisation were not all negative, however, medical services higher education, improved standards of living, a better transport network and agricultural advances were some of the advantages that came about through contact with a Western way of life". (Grobler,Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987 p. 97). The point I want to make is that, in the case of Germany, it might be historical true that women were oppressed and denied education, the authors in any case should have made motivation as they did with colonisation and other aspects. They should

have commented about the dangers of depriving women education as ti deprives the country of its wisdom. I make this claim on the basis that women were oppressed all over the world it is important therefore that such oppression should get wide spread criticism and challenge.

In chapter 12 of the Std 10 history text - "Co-operation between the National Party and the Labour Party" - equality of groups in language writing is declared in one place and elaborated in one place. In chapter 1 of the Std 9 history text - "The Reconstruction and Unification of South Africa, 1902 to 1910" - the sub-category is elaborated in one place and declared in one place. In the Std 10 text it is stated that, "Dr Malan insisted on bilingualism on government offices, but tolerated the many senior members who could not comply" (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987, p 202).

On the other hand, the Std 9 text states that, "Central to Milners reconstruction programme was to make English the language of all higher education" (Malan, Appelgryn & Theron, 1986, p 237).

Looking at the quotations, I have this to say, the Std 10 authors foreground English and Afrikaans whilst the Std 9 authors foreground mainly English and by so doing both authors ignore other languages. For instance it might be true that Malan insisted on bilingualism but the authors say nothing about the existence of other languages like the language of the majority of the people. The Std 9 text

mentions only English and disregards the rest. In the light of the fact that in the past language was used as a tool for segregation, it is important that all languages in both books should be mentioned as it is done in the constitution of South Africa. This I hope will avoid language based discrimination at schools as was common in most of the South African Schools during Apartheid and continues even now. Carrim (in press) has an example of a white school in Potgietersrus where black students were refused admission on ground that the school was for Afrikaans speaking pupils. However, in the light of democracy and democratic education in South Africa, black students were admitted to these schools. This is what Gutmann(1987) calls the principles of non discrimination where all students irrespective of race must be given access to education.

In chapter 3 of the Std 10 history text - "The Decline of Democracy and the Rise of Totalitarian states" - religious rights are declared in three places and elaborated in three places. In chapters 3 of the Std 9 history text" - The Peace Conference in Paris and the League of Nations -" the sub-category is declared in one place and elaborated in one place. The Std 10 text states that

> The Nazi regime took control of German religious life as well. In 1933 Hitler made an agreement with the Catholic church whereby the Catholics of the Centre Party agreed to withdraw from politics on condition that the church retain its rights over the possession of property and appointment of church officials. Soon a clash occurred between church doctrine and Nazi ideology, which led to the dismissal of Catholic teachers and the ridiculing of the church. In 1937 the agreements was consequently cancelled. Protestant churches were protected

> even less. Pastor Ludwig Muller was appointed by the Nazi government to force German Protestant churches to support Nazi Teachings. Resistance from the churches continued, although several brave clergymen like Pastor Martin Nie Moller were sent to concentration camps until the end of the war (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987, p. 49).

Notice that in this quotation the Std 10 history authors show different religious groups and rights to the foreground and with no attempt to put others on the background, for example, the authors have mentioned that there were other churches despite the Protestants who fought for religious rights which shows an acknowledgement of their existence. However, the Std 9 history text shows a different picture. For example, it states that, "The Nazis also controlled church affairs and dissidents such as the Protestant leader Niemoller, were eliminated. Only pro Nazi church ministers were allowed." (Malan, Appelgryn & Theron, 1986 p 105). Here the authors do not mention the existence of other churches and it is not clear whether the phrase, "dissidents such as the protestant leader" refers to the leader and his followers or other church members. It is important that the authors should mention the existence of other churches or leaders but should not make us conclude for them as we might be wrong in our conclusions about them. In the light of different religious groups in South Africa it is important that religious tolerance should be promoted as it is the case with the South African Schools Act.

In chapter 12 of the Std 10 history text - "Co-operation between the National Party and Labour Party" - socio-economic rights that is, the right to a better life and work conditions, to strike and join unions, are declared in three places and elaborated in one place. In the Std 9 history text there is no mention whatsoever of this sub-category. The Std 10 text states,

> Colour Bar Act was promulgated. Its goal was to secure this interest of white and coloured skilled urban worker in skilled trades. Although the situation improved for whites, the position for Indians, Black and eventually coloureds became worse.

It is further said in the book that,

> the Colour Bar Act was fought tooth and nail by the opposition (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987, p. 201)

Here the authors of the text fore-ground the racism in work places which resulted in the labour laws guaranteeing better jobs for whites. Also, although such laws were met with opposition, it is not clear from which angle and what forms of resistance took place. This is important to know because in some cases resistance against racism in work places and in political scenario was on gender and racial lines. For example, many black trade unions were led by males and their struggle for economic rights was mostly aimed at benefiting males.

In chapter 7 of the Std 10 history text - "African Nationalism and the independence movements" - cultural rights, right to education is declared in one place and elaborated in one place. There is nowhere in the Std 9 history text

where the sub-category is elaborated. It is stated in Std 10 history text

> All mission schools taught African children the European language of the mother country, consequently English or French became a common language to most African countries and was used to write different ethnic groups.

It is further stated that,

> Africans became interested in history and they learned about national heroes of other countries and about struggles for independence (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987 p.99)

The authors notice the role of education in politicising Africans. However, Africans were deprived of their history and culture. For Africans to only learn only in a foreign language and to learn only history devalues their own sense of history and belonging. It is important that history about Africans should be written in order to share it with other people. In this way, people will earn to understand how others live and how they think. Furthermore, Young (1996) argues that communication which includes story telling reveals the particular experience of those situated differently but that they must understand in order to do justice to others. The primary way therefore for the previously oppressed or marginalised groups to make their case will be through telling stories which is what history should do since it reveals the past way of life.

In chapter 12 of the Std 10 history text - "Co-operation between the National Party and the Labour Party 1924", - political rights and freedoms is declared in three places and elaborated in one place. In the Std 9 history text chapter 9 - "Activities

and problems of the National Convention" - the sub-category is declared in five places and elaborated in four places. Std 10 text states,

> at the imperial Conference of 1926, Prime Minister Hertzog took the initiative regarding a declaration on the status of South Africa and other dominions in relation to Britain (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987 p. 204).

Std 9 history text states,

> "The Transvaal and the Orange Free State made no provision for black voters and restricted voting rights to white male adults (Malan, Applegryn and Theron, 1986, p.258).

With reference to the Std 10 quotation what the authors foreground is the role Hertzog played in fighting for political status of South Africa. However, most of the political leaders of South Africa and who played significant role in history are portrayed as playing no significant role whatsoever. Also the liberation of South Africa from Britain was only meaningful to white citizens as opposed to other races since they did not enjoy equal rights and opportunities with white people. This is also evident from the Std 9 quotation where black people did not get voting rights. In a case of South Africa presently all citizens have the right to vote and choose their own government and this is important as Gould (1988) argues that in a democratic country people should be equal agents and should engage in active decision making about matters affecting them as citizens in a country.

In chapter 5 of the Std 10 history text - "The United Nation Organisations" - freedom of opinion and expression is declared in four places and elaborated in three places. There is no where in Std 9 text where the sub-category is mentioned. The Std 10 text states

> General assembly of the UN was envisaged as a deliberative body where any matter of international concern could be discussed and where every member concern could speak its equal mind.

It is further said that,

> each member state was granted equal representation and voting rights in this body. A general debate usually open the session in which member states are free to proclaim their views on international issues (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987 p. 78)

In accordance to the above quotation the author fore ground freedom of opinion and expression without reservation. It is important that even students should understand the importance of equal rights in democracy.

In chapter 7 of the Std 10 history text - "African Nationalism and the Independence Movements" - freedom of press and media is declared in two places and elaborated in one place. In the Std 9 history text the category is declared in one place and elaborated in one place. Std 10 text states

> Kwame Nkurumah became a national hero in the Gold Coast with the support of three newspapers, the Evening News in Accra, the Morning Telegraph in

> Secondi and the Daily Mail in Cape Coast. At times the colonial authorities prevented the publication of newspapers of articles in them but the editors continued their efforts "(Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987 p. 99).

Notice that the authors fore-ground the courage of the editors to exercise their rights. It appears from the quotation that the colonial rulers attempted to restrict the editors from making publications but the editors continued to do so.

In accordance to Std 9 text it is stated that

> Joseph Goebbels was put in charge of Nazi propaganda. Freedom of the press was restricted and nothing which could harm Hitler or the Nazis was allowed to appear in print. Goebbels exploited the radio, press and fils to spread propaganda for the Nazis against Jews.(Malan, Appelgryn & Theron, 1986, p.105)

Here what is revealed is the power of the government in controlling media and abusing it to spread propaganda. Therefore, contrary to the Std 10 author, the Std 9 authors show no attempt by other editors to make their publications let alone their existence. They are simply put to the background.

In chapter 7 of the Std 10 history text -"African Nationalism and the independence movements" - Freedom of Political Association and Assembly is once declared and once elaborated. In the Std 9 history text there is no elaboration of this sub-category whatsoever. The Std 10 history text states,

> Although Africans were generally forbidden to form political parties in the urban areas, a large number of social organisation were established which enable the new elite to develop their administrative and organisational skills. They included student unions, sports clubs debating societies, youth movements and welfare organisations. These groups provided the opportunity for the exchange of ideas (including political ideas) across ethnic lines and became the forerunners of political parties.(Grobler,Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987, p. 98).

It appears from the quotation that the authors show the courage of the oppressed Africans to form political groups despite the opposition by the colonial rulers. Also, these political groups demonstrated a wide-spread influence since they exchange political ideas across ethnic lines. However, it is not clear if they included other racial groups in their struggle against their rulers or they simply organised themselves as only blacks. Carrim (in Press) argues that racism should not only be seen between white and black. The reasons for this is that it would be improper to charge every white person of racism since they are white people who were against racism. Also, Africans themselves oppressed each other there was division of labour in African communities whereby women were not allowed to perform certain duties. Fighting against racism and oppression means that people have to be open minded and avoid a situation where a person fighting against racism would do so with racist eyes.

The claims I would like to make about the two books under this main category are that, though both books have elaborated on some categories as discussed, there has been a considerable lack of discussion on democratic

governments as opposed to totalitarian ones, disregard of the importance of citizenship, multiculturalism, gender equality, political rights and others. Also, some of the important democratic concepts were not elaborated or mentioned at all like right to life; against torture; right to privacy and access to information. These sub-categories are important democratic virtues which are enshrined in the Bill of Rights of the Constitution of South Africa.

In Chapter 12 of the Std 10 history text - "Co-operation between the National Party and the Labour Party" - tolerance respect for diversity; awareness of diversity: freedom from discriminations is declared in four places and elaborated in four places. In chapter 10 of the Std 9 history text (Activities and Problems for the National Convention) the sub-category is declared in two places. In chapter 12 of the Std 10 text (1987, p. 200) it is stated "In spite of many differences, the National Party and Labour Party supported one another on the question of labour, particularly regarding the development of and opportunities for South African white workers: Bread and Butter dominated their thoughts".

As is evident in this quotation, the authors stress tolerance between two 'white' parties that is, National party and the Labour Party. The authors do not mention the existence of other racial groups and the state of conditions at the time of history. Differences that the authors speak about are concerning the two parties but other parties are not included simply put on the background.

In Std 9 text it is stated

> The leading politicians of the Cape Colony, Transvaal and the Orange Free State favoured a union. The view of Smuts, Meriman and Steyn dominated the proceeding at the national Convention. Smuts was of the opinion that a federation would bring further division between the Colonies. This happened in Canada, where difference in culture, race and religion between the French

> and English, were promoted under a federal system. In South Africa Union would allow the Afrikaner and English man to forget the past and build a new nation.(Malan, Appelgryn & Theron, 1986 p.256)

Here the authors focus on the question of a Union in South Africa which was aimed at uniting only the English and the Afrikaner people. It is also interesting the way the authors use the word 'nation' because the word according to them refers to two population groups whilst there were many people who lived in South Africa by this time. Under the new South African government all the citizens constitute different racial and cultural groups, we are united in our diversities.

In chapter 5 of the Std 10 history text - " The United Nation Organisation" - co-operation is declared in one place and elaborated in four places. In the Std 9 history text there in no mention of this category whatsoever. In chapter 7 it is stated,

> As more and more independent Asian and African countries joined the UN, they gave increasing support to the move for decolonisation of Africa. This led to increasing co-operation between the states of the two continents eventually to the formation of the Afro-Asian block in the UN (Grobler,Rautenbach& Engelbrecht, 1987 p.24)

The above quotations reveal that the UN was joined by different countries including the African countries who were previously decolonised and marginalised. This is important to mention because although they were once

oppressed politically in their countries, they received widespread recognition by joining an international organisation. African countries could as a result relate and interact with countries in the world. This is important for the children in South Africa to know since they need not see themselves as living in isolation but as part of an international community. One of the critical outcomes of Curriculum 2005 requires students to demonstrate an understanding of the world as a set of related systems by recognising that problem solving contexts do not exist in isolation.

In chapter 5 of the Std 10 history text, - "The United Nations Organisation" - Peace; non- violent conflict resolution is declared in four places and elaborated in four places. In chapter 3 of the Std 9 text - "The Peace Conference in Paris and the League of Nations" - this sub-category is declared in seven places and elaborated in six places.

Std 10 history text states

> The chief responsibility of the security Council of the U.N.O is the maintenance of international peace and security.

It is further stated that,

> the council may take any action necessary to maintain peace settle disputes or prevent acts of aggression. UN members are bound by the charter to carry out the decision of the Security Council, which may include calling on member states to break off diplomatic relations with an offending nation, or placing an embargo on the sale or purchase of certain goods from that nation. As a last resort, the council may also require members of state to provide military units and

equipment necessary for the restoration of peace (Grobler, Rautenbach, & Engelbrecht, 1987, p. 79)

The authors stress the commitment of the UN Security Council to peace which is important in democracy. The author has shown three ways in which the UN tried to bring about peace. However, they fail to acknowledge the role of negotiation or deliberations in peaceful problem solving. For example, it has appeared that the present minister of foreign affairs (Dr N Zuma) is one of the people involved in deliberations to bring peace in Congo. Deliberations therefore are better as compared to sanctions imposed on a country because their imposition does not only affect the ruling parties but ordinary citizens as well. Furthermore, military intervention on its own also has got some serious negative results. In the case of military intervention people are bound to lose their lives. Though I have argued for the betterment of deliberations in peaceful problem solving, this does not mean that deliberation do not have pitfalls because people may not reach agreements on certain issues. Rawls (1993) argues that even when there are possibilities for agreements to take place people can still disagree, but when they do so they need to reasonably disagree. Reasonable disagreement, he argues, can only occur between people who have realised their moral powers to a degree sufficient to be free and equal citizens in a democratic country and who have realised the desire to be fully co-operating members of society of a complete life.

In the Std 9 text it is stated that,

> any member of the UNO that resorted to war in disregard of its obligations under the covenant was to be immediately subjected to economic sanctions and the council was to recommend to governments what military actions had to be taken against, the culprit." In page109 it states. The main purpose of the league was to promote international co-operation and to achieve international peace and security. To achieve international peace it was essential to promote disarmament (Malan, Applegryn & Theron, 1986 p. 108).

The above quotations highlight the disarmament process which the League of Nations proposed as a way to bring peace. However, this also excludes any discussion of the role of deliberations. The Congress for Democratic South Africa is an especially telling example of the role that deliberations can play in peaceful change. People of different racial groups, sex and different ethnicity were mixed and discussed the future of South Africa. This does not mean that there were no disagreements in the process of negotiations but instead there were reasonable disagreements hence there was a new South Africa which came as the result of the fruits of negotiations rather than widespread bloodshed.

In chapter 7 of the Std 10 history text – "African Nationalism and the independence movements" - Equality before the law is declared in four places and elaborated in four places. There is nowhere in the Std 9 text where the sub-category is elaborated. It is stated that,

> As blacks suffered racial inequality, little say in government and social and economic rejection, Blacks developed common bonds that overcame their ethnic differences, and the Africanisationalist movements were born. They demanded full and equal participation in the running of their countries' wealth. They based their requests on the UN's Universal Declaration of Human Rights"

It is further stated in page 103 that,

> similarly in Northern Rhodesia, the most serious uprising in the country was led by John Chilembwe in 1915. Chilembwe protested against the treatment his people received from whites, the disturbance in which Chilembwe was killed were quickly put down by the British authorities with the results that political protest was silenced for some considerable time.(Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987 p. 97)

Considering the above quotations, the authors show the demand by Africans to have equal rights and protection by the law. Black people were not protected by the law as the result in their struggle a leader died. What is interesting about black struggle for equal protection of the law is that they also demanded equal sharing of country's wealth and its belonging. Though, above all what remains a question, is to what extend where the rights of women fought for as there are no indications of any role played by them in the struggle for equality.

In chapter 5 of the Std 10 history text - "The United Nations Organisations" - mutual understanding is declared in one place and elaborated in three places.

There is nowhere in the Std 9 history text where the sub-category is elaborated.

It is stated that,

> "it is only natural concerning the United Nations that the ideological conflict(cold war) between the two of its most powerful members and the ensuing East-West split within the organisation itself has had a profound effect on the organisation's actions and capabilities." (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987, p. 87)

The authors focus on the lack of mutual understanding which could emanate to the split in the organisation. However, the authors put it as a natural thing for ideological difference to lead to a split, this is in a way lacking democratic approach. Difference of opinion should not naturally mean non-co-operation and non interaction of the parties instead they need to be critical of each other and use positive aspects of the critics or different opinion to develop one's perception of mind Graff (1992) has given his example where critical approach to democracy has helped him challenge his assumptions about other people in way to see that what he believed to be true about them was in fact false.

In chapter 5 of the Std 10 history text - "The United Nation Organisation" - concerns and act for the good of community is declared in one place and elaborated in two places. There is nowhere in Std 9 text where the sub category is elaborated. It is stated for example, "In 1965 the UN Development Programme (UNDP) was established to assist the poorer countries. Funds amounting 600 million dollars a year are contributed on a voluntary basis by the richer members of the UNO for this purpose. A similar programme, only

the richer members of the UNO for this purpose. A similar programme, only slightly smaller, is the World Food Programme, in which agricultural surpluses are sent to developing countries".

According to the quotation, the authors foreground the reaching out of the world organisation to the poor countries. This is a very important contribution and it also can play part in democracy because democracy is about well being, where citizens in a country should live well and have basic food and shelter, including the rights to own property.

In chapter 7 of the Std 10 history text - "African nationalism and the independence movements"- active opposition to exploitation and oppression is declared in two places and elaborated in five places. In Std 9 text -"The Peace Conference in Paris and the League of Nations" - the category is declared in three places, elaborated in two places. In Std 10 text it is stated that

> Africans were dissatisfied because of the alienation of certain parts of the country in favour of whites settlers, because the reserves in which they were settled were too small and because of the protection of the economic and political privileges of the whites. The Blacks established a number of organisations to protect their interest. Harry Thuku took the lead but was banned from the colony after the outbreak of violence. It is further stated that, "A large number of Indians also settled in Kenya and they too were dissatisfied with the privilege position of the whites (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht 1987. p. 101).

The authors note the right of the oppressed groups to demand political rights. Also, the authors focus on the existence of other oppressed groups like Indians and does not put them on the background. This is important to mention because the history of South Africa has been viewed by some people as only characterised by racial conflict that is black and white. There are other racial groups that suffered racism except Africans.

The Std 9 history text (1986, p. 100) states "The programme of the Nazi Party, as it was known, renounced the Treaty of Versailles and promised the Germans a new deal of rejection of the penal clauses".

The authors show the determination of the Germans to fight the repressive laws of the Treaty of Versailles. The failure of the United Nations Organisation to maintain peace and to make the balance of power resulted in Germany gaining too much power which was on its own a menace to world peace. If the organisation recognised and used the negotiations as an effective tool for peace probably the world could have been saved from the scourge of war.

The claims I would like to make about the two books under this main category are that, although both books have elaborated on some categories as discussed, there has been a considerable lack of discussion of freedom of association and assembly, respect of other cultures and religions, equality of all people, critical thinking, respect of rules and laws, reconciliation and others.

The lack of discussion in relation to these sub-categories has a serious negative implications for democracy education since they are very important democratic concepts.

## Dilemmas of Democracy

In this main category, both history books reflect a low frequency as evident in the frequency table. In the chapters analysed from the Std 10 book, I identified two dilemmas of democracy: one concerning poverty and democracy and the existence of extremist groups and actions jeopardising rights of others. The Std 9 text also deals with this dilemma. In addition, the analysed chapters from the Std 9 text revealed a dilemma concerning voting rights.

Before I discuss any dilemma cited above, I wish to first give a brief definition of the concept of a dilemma in the context of democracy. A dilemma in democracy occurs when a decision is made with an attempt to promote democracy, but at the same time creates an equally unwelcoming possibility or difficulty. For example, The Gauteng Department of Education has decided to close schools for the handicapped children. It argues that the separation of the handicapped children from other schools (normal children) is undemocratic because it makes them think they are different from other children and hence they prefer living in isolation from the entire schools. This deprives the

handicapped of the opportunity to share ideas with other children so that they may understand the feeling of each other and, as Carrim (in press) puts it, acknowledge each others' difference.

The government on the other hand is faced with a practical problem resulting to a dilemma. The dilemma is that, in a case when deaf children are mixed with normal children how is the teacher going to handle the classroom? Though there are many of the dilemmas faced by the government, I have decided to use the above as a fitting one to the discussion.

As a premise therefore to my discussion I have this to say. The dilemma concerning poverty and democracy is evident in the chapter on - "The Decline of Democracy and the Rise of Totalitarian States". Although the authors do not give attention to this dilemma, the dilemma is implied in the following passage :

> The great depression lasted until 1933. The idleness and poverty that resulted led to social problems. People became dissatisfied with the capitalist democratic systems and many considered violence and revolution as means to bring about improvement. Some even considered communism or fascism as an alternative systems for a better future. (Grobbler, Rautenbach & Englebrecht, 1987. P. 40).

This quotation comes from the end of the sub-section, "Economic problems and the effects of the Great Depression". It is immediately followed by the sub-heading "The rejection of Democracy". In the quoted passage authors show how the great depression in USA affected seriously some European countries. However, before the depression there was economic prosperity in

the USA as well as in her European democratic allies and people there were happy about their capitalist governments. Later on as the results of the depression people began to be dissatisfied about their governments.

This passage suggests that a capitalist democracy may thrive under conditions of economic prosperity, but will come under attack when, under conditions of economic depression, people lose their means of livelihood. The question that arises is: Does democracy mean that there should always be economic prosperity, or there be changes which are intended to improve the situation but for some reasons fail to work? Does it mean that because of a specific proposal which has failed the democratic nature of a country.

Also, looking at the quotation, it is surprising the way the authors have grouped capitalism and democracy on one end and communism on the other as if democracy and communism can not merge. Democracy as argued in this whole research implies a system of government where the rights of people are protected and where there is striving for the well-being of citizens. However, capitalism in democracy has in most cases resulted to class grouping and resultant discrepancies in wealth and other aspects of material of the majority citizens and a few are in upper or middle class. Communism on the other hand seeks to promote the equal distribution of wealth and equal sharing. In many cases communism has also been critisised as failing, but it is no doubt that its ideas of equal sharing, protection of the exploited working class and equal distribution of wealth becomes closer to the wishes of democracy as it aspires societal well-being. The dilemma then is to choose the best form of government because in reality there is no one without problems.

The dilemma concerning the existence of extremist group and actions jeopardising rights of others is on the Std 10 text, - "The Decline of Democracy and the Rise of Totalitarian State-". Here it is stated that,

> Although peace was welcomed by all the states of Europe after the first world war, a number of problems still existed: The Central powers were not allowed at Versailles where the post reconstruction of Europe was planned by the Allies, and where the map of Europe was virtually redrawn.....The defeated states tried to revise the terms of the peace settlement, which they regarded as unjust and humiliating, but France, in particular would not consider it. The United States was disillusioned by the selfish behaviour of the European politicians and decided to withdraw from the European affairs. (Grobbler, Rautenbach & Englelbrecht, 1987. P. 39)

The authors reveal that the aim of the treaty of Versailles as propagated by the European states was to promote peace and to avoid a further world war. It appears that the peace process was dominated by the victors and did not include the central powers. It is against this background that the United States of America withdrew from the European politics because though she was committed to peace she was faced with a dilemma of the allied powers on one end with their selfish desires to gain from the peace treaty at the expense of suppressing the central powers, and his genuine desire to achieve genuine peace without marginalising any country.

The authors of the Std 9 history text reveal this dilemma with more precision:

> Wilson 's aim was to eliminate the sources of friction which had been the cause of World War I. His ideas were based on the principle of democracy

and national self-determination. By applying those principles he hoped to create a better Europe for the future. To realise those ideals , however, it was necessary to have a general association of nations for the purpose guaranteeing the mutual acceptance of the independence of states - The League of Nations (Malan, Appelgry & Theron, 1986, p. 94)

The authors show clearly the commitment of Woodrow Wilson to promote peace and democracy in Europe which explains why he was frustrated when there was little he could do to promote it. Also, the following quotation shows the dilemma vividly:

> Lloyd George of Britain was responsible for public opinion. Though he did his best to moderate the harsh terms of the treaty, he was ruling at the time when Anti-"German sentiments were widespread and strong in Britain (Malan, Appelgryn & Theron, 1986. P 95 - 96)

It is interesting to note that even if Lloyd George was himself interested in achieving peace, it was very difficult to make any progressive choice that is, making peace on one hand and satisfying the desire of his people to punish Germany on the other hand.

In the Std 9 text - "Activities and Problems of the National Convention" - the dilemma concerning the problems of voting rights shows an interesting treatment". For instance it is stated that.

> The question of the franchise for the Blacks caused considerable friction and nearly wrecked the unification movement. After the Anglo-boer was the

> granting of political rights to all races was deferred. Article one of the Treaty of Vereeniging made clear that, the question of granting the franchise to natives will not be decided until after the introduction of self determination. Political rights in the Cape Colony developed upon the possession of certain educational and economic qualification, irrespective of race, colour or creed. Women are excluded from acquiring political rights' (Malan, Appelgryn and Theron, 1986. P. 258 - 259)

The authors show that it was not a common feeling among the different colonies to give blacks a voting right. The Cape Colony is the only example given where a black elite group could vote. However, this was problematic because many people by this time were poor therefore this means that voting was for the chosen few. Women on the other hand were not entitled to vote. In all, the question of franchise for the blacks caused a problem and a dilemma because there were those white people who were against it in the convention and probably those who were not.

The dilemma is also shown clearly in the following quotation

> There were four possible solution to the problem. Firstly the Cape system which provided for equal political rights could be extended to the whole of South Africa. Secondly, the policy of the Northern province i.e. total exclusion of Blacks could be introduced to all colonies. Thirdly, a civilization test or all adult males, regardless of race or colour could be made applicable to prospective voters. A fourth solution, which was advocated by Merriman and

> supported by Smuts, was to leave the existing franchise laws of the various colonies unaltered.... Thus we see that the National Convention could find no final solution to the question regarding the Black and Coloured franchise. (Malan, Applegryn & Theron 1986, p. 258 - 259)

It is revealed that despite attempts made to solve the problem of black franchise no solution could come up. One can argue that the possible reason why some white people feared black franchise was that they were the majority people as they still are today, therefore they feared majority rule.

The claims I would like to make about these books are that, though there is an elaboration on some few dilemmas in democracy as it appears from the frequency table and the entire discussion. There is a considerable non-elaboration on important dilemmas such as: the educational level of citizens; could one country interfere in the internal affairs of other country; multi ethnic community; and democracy; misbeliefs that democratic system is a self-sustaining and self receiving mechanism; the collision between the political equality of citizens and other factual inequality.

## Bearers of democracy

In this main category the focus is on factors which contributed to the achievement or promotion of democracy. While analysing the selected chapters of different history books, particular attention has been given to persons, organisation and movements and their effect on democracy. As a procedure of discussion, I have selected some quotations from the different texts which contain clear examples of the bearers of democracy.

Based on the analysis of chapter 5 of the Std 10 text " - The United Nations Organisation - ", consider the following quotation

> The aims of the UNO can be summarised as follows: the maintainance of international peace and security; the promotion of equal rights and self determination of peoples..... the encouragement of respect for human rights and basic freedoms (Grobbler, Rautenach & Engelbrecht, 1987, p. 77 - 78)

The authors show that UNO as an international organisation was aimed at providing international peace and thereby protecting human rights. The United Nations Organisation was on simpler terms an organisation promoting democracy and that is why it has been influential in many countries like Indonesia, South Korea and many others in getting their independence. What is also interesting to note is that the UNO used some peaceful measures in facilitating independence, for instance it is stated that,

> During the Second World War, Japan occupied the Dutch colonies in the East Indies. On their return to this area after the war, the Dutch were confronted by a tide of nationalism and a demand for independence. Since Dutch had invested very heavily in their East Indian empire, they tried to regain an old on their colonies. This was strongly resented by the Indonesians and led to an outright war between the two nations. The security council intervened twice to stop the fighting and managed to secure a cease-fire agreement which called for the establishment of an independent Indonesia. An agreement on Indonesia independence was finally reached in 1949, after which the Indonesia Republic was admitted as a new member state of the United Nations. (Grobler, Rautenbach & Engelbrecht, 1987, p. 82 - 83)

The UN considered or believed in peaceful rather than violent resolution to problems. In the light of many atrocities which happened in Africa and South Africa during the colonisation period and apartheid, it is interesting to note that there were organisations which condemned violence. This suggests that countries in the world should strive for peaceful solution to problems as it has now lately happened even in South Africa through Codesa.

Though the United Nations Organisation has had more success in promoting independence and protecting human rights, the League of Nations as it appears in Std 9 history text has also made some positive democratic contributions. In chapter three that is, - "The Peace Conference in Paris and the League of Nations -" it is stated as follows,

> the league tried to eradicate the evil of trade in women and children at international level. Information was gathered and distributed about this problem and harbours were observed for this sort of trade. The league did much to limit the trade in women and children but did not stop it altogether" (Malan, Appelgryn & Theron , 1986.p. 93)

The authors view the trade of women as unfair and unjust and we see this by their use of the word evil. Women have been exploited and repressed all over the world where in some cases have been treated as objects rather than human beings and the above quotation bears testimony to this. The authors here portray the League of Nations positively as having protected women and children from being traded. I view this as a positive contribution to democracy as one of the specific outcomes of curriculum 2005 encourage learners to participate actively in promoting a just, democratic and equitable society.

In the Std 10 text, - "African Nationalism and the Independence Movements "- it is stated that,

> The elite included lawyers, doctors, teachers, clerks, mechanics, cartage contractors and foremen. From among them came the most important leaders, a new generation who led their countries to indecence. They were popular among their people, who hailed them as their saviours from colonial slavery Men like Dr Kwame Nkuruma of the Gold Coast (Ghana) Jomo Kenyatta of Kenya, Dr Nnandi Azikiwe of Nigeria, Dr Hastings Banda of Nyasaland (Malawi) and Dr Kenneth Kaunda of Northern Rhodesia (Zambia) had the ability to inspire their followers with the spirit of African nationalism with a view of gaining

independence for their countries. (Grobler, Rautenbach,& Engelbrecht, 1987. p118)

The authors show in the first instance that African leaders were elites. In some cases, the word 'elite' has carried with itself some negative connotations. The word 'elite' has been used to show a handful of selfish individuals who gained political, educational or economic advantage at the expense of other people. In the case of the Cape Colony that is, before South Africa became a union, a small group of the black elite could vote depending on their qualifications. This was not beneficial to the entire black people since the majority of them were poor. Therefore though this did not have a positive contribution to the entire black people the few elite continued to exercise this vote for their personal aggrandizement instead of pledging solidarity with their people. However, the word 'elite' in the above quotation has been used positively because it is said that they enjoyed popularity with the people which means they were not mere puppets but true leaders who fought for the real independence of their people.

The claims I would like to make about the two books are that, in that Std 10 text for instance, there is an attempt to show people and also organisations like Ugandas' People Congress, Zimbabwe African Peoples' Union (ZAPU) and many others however, much of this appears in one chapter from the selected chapters. The chapter also shows a considerable number of black leaders but no pictures of women. The Std 9 history text also makes

an attempt in those chapters analysed to show organisations which promoted human rights and world peace. It has also shown in particular the protection of women and children against repression. However, in most of the chapters analysed most pictures are those of whites. Other races women are not often depicted.

## CHAPTER 5

## CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Can old history textbooks (written in Apartheid era) be used to promote the new democratic ideals in Curriculum 2005? Given that one of the central aims of Curriculum 2005 is to redress the past imbalances and to promote democracy. Two history textbooks presently used in Katlehong schools have been analysed to find out if they are consistent with the democratic aims of Curriculum 2005. This chapter presents the main conclusions of the study and, on the basis of the research, makes some recommendations for history writers, teachers and learners.

On the basis of my analysis in chapter four I have drawn three main conclusions. The first conclusion is that there are some democratic concepts which are elaborated in the selected chapters of each book. They are elaborated in a way which promotes democracy. For example, it is often stated that colonisation brought suffering to blacks, hence it is hated, looking at it critically we find that there are positive aspects about it. In chapter four it is shown that medical services and higher learning was introduced in Africa through colonisation.

The second conclusion is that although some of the democratic concepts are elaborated, they are not elaborated in a way that promotes democracy. The

discussion in chapter four has shown that although Smuts attempted to promote bilingualism in government offices and tolerated those who could not comply, the authors of the book have failed to state the existence of other languages at the time.

The third and the last conclusion is that there are several concepts which both books have omitted. These are right to life; against torture; right to privacy; equality before the law; freedom of association; access to information; equality of information; freedom of association and assembly; equality of all people; critical thinking; skills contextual thinking about public issues; relational and contextual thinking and awareness of the effects of environment.

Though as it is mentioned above that some concepts have been elaborated in a way which promotes democracy whilst others do not, and although it is stated that there are serious omission, I have also identified the following when comparing the two texts.

The Std 10 text has more elaboration of democracy concepts which the Std 9 text does not have, and these are: Equality of groups in race; associating into states and alliances; freedom of opinion and expression; freedom of political association and assembly; UN declaration on human rights. Co-operation; equality before the law; inter dependence of different states; mutual understanding; poverty and

democracy and the existence of double standards in respecting the principles of democracy.

The only few democratic concepts which are contained in the Std 9 text and which are omitted in the Std 10 text are: freedom of movement; respect for worth and dignity of each individual and problems concerning voting rights that is who should have the right to vote.

The huge difference on these texts concerning the above democratic concepts reveal that the Std 10 text is stronger or is in better position to be used by critical teachers in education for democracy.

**Recommendations**

Based on the conclusions of my analysis and as I have already said, it is crucial that teachers use a critical approach when teaching from these books. For example, a critical teacher dealing with a topic on racism does not suppress the views of the students about the topic. Also, he/she does not impose his/her opinions. Should a teacher show what he/she thinks and take sides then this can make the students defensive and this may lead to class polarization and dialogue instead of a discussion. This is what Gutmann (1987) calls the principle of non-repression where the students should be given an opportunity to express their views about good life. One of the aims of critical outcomes require students to

identify and solve problems and make decisions using critical and creative thinking.

The other reason why teachers should use a critical approach v n teaching is that they themselves have their stereotypes and perceptions about events. Graff (1992) argues that the critical work on Achebe's Image of Africa has made him rethink not just his interpretation of Heart of Darkness but his theoretical assumptions about literature. First, he was forced, so he says, to recognise that he had theoretical assumptions. He had previously thought he was simply teaching the truth about Heart of Darkness, that is, 'the text itself'. However, he had now to recognise that he had been teaching an interpretation of the text, one that was shaped by a certain theory that told him what was and was not worth noticing and emphasising in his classroom. He had been unable to see his theory because he was living so comfortably inside it.

Learners themselves must challenge the stereotype of textbook writers as a source of unassailable knowledge and truth. Popper's notion of falsification is worth noting here (see Chalmers, 1987). He argues that in a critical discussion a topic under discussion must undergo a process of falsification but must not be falsified. This means that any topic which when discussed contains a conclusion which is potentially true, the conclusion itself must be looked at critically to find out if what is believed to be true about it may not be false when looked at from the other angle. However, as long as it withstands criticism then it should be

regarded as too good to be true until such time it can no longer withstand, criticisms then it should be replaced by another conclusion which will itself undergo criticism until proved wrong. The aim of this critical approach Popper argues is to come close to truth because nobody own it. If what is believed to be true today is proved false tomorrow and something new comes to replace it, then it means we are gradually getting closer to the truth.

The critical thinking by learners will make them challenge the authors' stereotypes. It was for instance on the basis of my critical approach to history that I came to my conclusion except those authors. Girls also in classrooms and in history lessons must question and challenge the stereotypes in history where leaders mostly in countries and wars are men. Girls, though I do not preclude boys, must question the role of women in history and this should lead to a research among learners as to why women and girls are not seen as playing a major role.

The new authors of history must include events like CODESA which once took place in South Africa. This congress for democratic South Africa contain a vital information on how South Africa became the country it is today and what forms of rights were looked at. This I believe will help provide the students with the understanding as the curriculum require the students to know how South African Society has changed and developed. The Std 10 history text as well as the Std 9 have proved in chapter four that in the history of South Africa there is no

important that new authors when writing should also write about the contribution of Africans in history. There should be history about black heroes like Nelson Mandela, Walter Sisulu and others who have contributed to the peaceful change in South Africa.

As I have argued, the two history books (particularly the Std 10 book) can still be used critically to promote democracy. I also encourage the writing of new ones so that they can be used as comparative study between them and old ones.

Women must be engaged in more research about history writing and should also be authors of history. However, this does not mean that they should only select events about them but must write a balanced history which does not marginalise them.

Education which promotes democracy "strives at perfecting human nature by deflecting it into socially useful purpose or improve it by repressing those inclinations which are socially destructive" (Gould, 1988).

## REFERENCES


Achebe, C. (1988) An Image of Africa: 'Racism in Conrad's Heart of Darkness' in Joseph Conrad, Hearts of Darkness, W. W Norton: New York

Benhabib, S. (1992) 'Models of public space' in Situating the Self. London. Routledge.

Carrim, N. (1995) 'Working with and through difference in anti-racist pedagogies' International Studies in Sociology Education, volume 1.(1)

Chalmers, A.F. (1978) What is this Thing Called Science London Open University Press

Conrad, J (1971) Heart of Darkness: 'an authoritative text, backgrounds and sources, criticism,'New York: Norton

Cross, M. and Leroke, W (1995) 'Mystification of democracy': Penny Enslins' critique of Nation building' in Perspective in Education, volume 16.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996

Department of Education (1997) Curriculum 2005: Government Gazette, Pretoria: Volume 384

Enslin, P (1994) 'Should nation building be an aim of education? Journal of Education volume 19

Gould. C (1988) Rethinking Democracy. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Graff, G (1992) Beyond the Culture Wars: New York: W H Norton & Company.

Grobler, J.C.H, Rautenbach, T.C, Engelbrecht, E (1987) History in Action, Johannesburg Juta & Co, Ltd.

Gutmann, A (1987) 'States and Education' in Democratic Education: Princeton University Press

Malan, S.F, Appelgryn, M.S, Theron, B.M (1986) New History to the Point, Johannesburg: Educum

Mphahlele, E (1959) Down Second Avenue: London: Faber and Faber

Rawls, J (1993) 'The idea of an overlapping consensus' Oxford Journal of Legal Studies

Rose, B and Tunmer, R (1975) Documents in South Africa Education. Johannesburg: A D Donker

Department of Education (1996) South African Schools Act: Government Gazette, volume 337

Strike, K (1994) 'On the construction of public speech: Pluralism and public reason' Educational Theory, Vol.44 (1)

Young, I (1996) Communication and the other. 'Beyond deliberation democracy in Seyla Benhabib (ed) Democracy and Difference: Contesting the Boundaries of the Political. Princeton University Press

**Author** Mashiyi L N
**Name of thesis** Can Old History Textbooks Be Used To Promote The New Democratic Ideals In The Curriculum 2005 Mashiyi L N 2000

***PUBLISHER:***
**University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg**
**©2013**

***LEGAL NOTICES:***

**Copyright Notice:** All materials on the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg Library website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

**Disclaimer and Terms of Use:** Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the Library website.