

https://dspace.org/

Albert Camus' Les justes: a descriptive approach to the analysis of a drama text in translation.

Hudson, Joanna L

2015-02-06
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/16904

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

the text. There is, however, another possible conclusion. Although Henry Jones is acknowledged as being the translator of the play on the title page of the volume *The Collected Plays of Albert Camus*, the final page of this book (1965: 316) lists the translation as having been done by Simon Taylor and Charles Chapple. A letter was sent to the publishers of this collection requesting information about this discrepancy, but no reply was received. The list of books in print was consulted, and this showed *The Just* to be the only work translated by Henry Jones, but it also revealed that Simon Taylor has translated more than ten books into English, the majority of which were originally French non-fiction. No reference to Charles Chapple was found. From this information, it therefore seems likely that 'Henry Jones' is a pseudonym, and that the translation was in fact done by two people. The fact that Simon Taylor has translated other works but that no reference was found to Charles Chapple, could furthermore indicate that the text was translated in the manner described by Bassnett-McGuire in her fifth strategy; that is, the translation was done by someone with a knowledge of both the source and the target languages, in collaboration with someone with a knowledge of the theatre. Owing to the lack of any further information, however, no final conclusion can be reached concerning this matter.

As previously stated, drama texts are often approached as literary works when translated; the main reason that *Les Justes* was selected for analysis in this project is that Jones' translation of the play was staged by PACT in Johannesburg in 1987, and was thus seen to be suitable for performance. It was therefore thought that consultation with the director of this production would be interesting in order to discover whether he felt further changes to the translation were necessary for its performance. When approached, Dieter Reible, the director of the PACT performance,

remarked that whereas he found the translation to be a satisfactory basis for performance, he felt the language used in the dialogue to be very stiff. He stressed the stylized nature of Camus' dramatic works in French, however, and thought that this feature tended to become even more noticeable in languages of a Germanic origin. *The Just* was chosen for performance as Mr Reible felt it was particularly relevant to the South African situation, and his aim was therefore to create a realistic setting, with sympathetic and credible characters For this reason, many of the lines of dialogue were made less 'literary' in style, so that they flowed more naturally[3]. The only major change that was made in the production was the omission of Act IV. Mr Reible considered the notion of the victim's wife coming to visit her husband's assassin in prison to be too romantic for his purpose of creating a realistic situation, and it was therefore omitted.

Mr Reible's remarks could imply that whereas theoretical analysis showed the translation to be suitable for performance, this was not found to be the case when the translation was actually performed, thus indicating a shortcoming in the model. It must be remembered, however, that Mr Reible wished to create a realistic setting of the play, and this was previously shown to be contrary to Camus' style of theatre, which is essentially one of 'debate', requiring 'carefully stylized' production (Freeman, 1971, 163-164).

---

[3] No specific examples of these changes can be given, as the scripts used in the production were returned to the publishers immediately after the performances ended.

The scheme used in this study was found to be a satisfactory guide for a detailed analysis of the source and target texts. Information concerning aspects peculiar to drama texts was successfully obtained using an increased semiotic component incorporated into Lambert and Van Gorp's original model. This model was felt to be inadequate regarding certain aspects of drama translation, such as the treatment of stage directions, deictic, cultural and ideological shifts. Because of the important role played by stage directions in the total meaning of a drama text, it was considered essential for shifts in these directions to be identified and categorized; the detailed semiotic component enabled this to be done. The semiotic denotative-connotative distinction was instrumental in the discovery of the decreased number of communist references, and the analysis of the deictic shifts revealed the increased personal elements in the TT. Although Lambert and Van Gorp's model was found to be a sound basis for descriptive translation analysis, the added semiotic component was essential in view of the different function of drama texts as texts to be performed. Stage directions are an integral part of the the total meaning of a drama text, and therefore should be examined in the same detail as the lines of dialogue.

The analysis of *Les Justes* and its translation was carried out as objectively as possible, as it is difficult to avoid being prescriptive and making value-judgements when confining descriptive translation research to the study of one particular text or author. It is nevertheless felt that this type of research is both valid and essential, as it forms part of a much broader area of research covering the full scope of systemic relations envisaged by Lambert and Van Gorp in their scheme for descriptive translation analysis.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

A Synthetic Scheme for Translation Description as formulated by José Lambert and Hendrik Van Gorp (1985, 52-53).

1. Preliminary data:
   - title and title page (e.g. presence or absence of genre indication, author's name, translator's name,...)
   - metatexts (on title page; in preface; in footnotes - in the text or separate?)
   - general strategy (partial or complete translation?)

   These preliminary data should lead to hypotheses for further analysis on both the macro-structural and the micro-structural level.

2. Macro-level:
   - division of the text (in chapters, acts and scenes, stanzas...)
   - titles of chapters, presentation of acts and scenes,...
   - relation between types of narrative, dialogue, description, between dialogue and monologue, solo voice and chorus,...
   - internal narrative structure (episodic plot?, open ending?,...); dramatic intrigue (prologue, exposition, climax, conclusion, epilogue); poetic structure (e.g. contrast between quatrains and tercets in a sonnet)
   - authorial comment; stage directions;...

   These macro-structural data should lead to hypotheses about micro-structural strategies.

3. Micro-level (i.e. shifts on phonic, graphic, micro-syntactic, lexico-semantic, stylistic, elocutionary and modal levels):
   - selection of words
   - dominant grammatical patterns and formal literary structures (metre, rhyme,...)
   - forms of speech reproduction (direct, indirect, free indirect speech)
   - narrative, perspective and point of view
   - modality (passive or active, expression of uncertainty, ambiguity,...)
   - language levels (sociolect; archaic/popular/dialect; jargon...)

   These data on micro-structural strategies should lead to a renewed confrontation with macro-structural strategies, and hence to their consideration in terms of the broader systemic context.

4. Systemic context:
   - oppositions between micro- and macro-levels and between text and theory (norms, models,...)
   - intertextual relations (other translations and 'creative' works)
   - intersystemic relations (e.g. genre structures, stylistic codes...)

APPENDIX B

Passage taken from ACT I of the ST, pages 13 - 15.

Le rideau se lève dans le silence. Dora et Annenkov sont sur la scène, immobiles. On entend le timbre de l'entrée, une fois. Annenkov fait un geste pour arrêter Dora qui semble vouloir parler. Le timbre retentit deux fois, coup sur coup.

ANNENKOV

C'est lui.

Il sort. Dora attend, toujours immobile. Annenkov revient avec Stepan qu'il tient par les épaules.

ANNENKOV

C'est lui! Voilà Stepan.

DORA, *elle va vers Stepan et lui prend la main.*

Quel bonheur, Stepan!

STEPAN

Bonjour, Dora.

DORA, *elle le regarde.*

Trois ans, déjà.

STEPAN

Oui, trois ans. Le jour où ils m'ont arrêté, j'allais vous rejoindre.

DORA

Nous t'attendions. Le temps passait et mon cœur se serrait de plus en plus. Nous n'osions plus nous regarder.

ANNENKOV

Il a fallu changer d'appartement, une fois de plus.

STEPAN

Je sais.

DORA

Et là-bas, Stepan?

STEPAN

Là-bas?

DORA

Le bagne?

STEPAN

On s'en évade.

ANNENKOV

Oui. Nous étions contents quand nous avons appris que tu avais pu gagner la Suisse.

STEPAN

La Suisse est un autre bagne, Boria.

ANNENKOV

Que dis-tu? Ils sont libres, au moins.

STEPAN

La liberté est un bagne aussi longtemps qu'un seul homme est asservi sur la terre. J'étais libre et je ne cessais de penser à la Russie et à ses esclaves.

Silence.

Passage taken from ACT I of the TT, pages 123 - 124.

ACT I

Scene: The terrorists' flat: The morning sun is shining through a window. When the curtain rises, DORA DOULEBOV *and* BORIS ANNENKOV *are standing in the middle of the room. Silence. Then the front-door bell rings once.* DORA *seems about to say something, but* ANNENKOV *signals to her to keep quiet. Two more rings in quick succession. . . .*

ANNENKOV: It's him! (*Exits . . .* DORA *waits motionless; . . .* ANNENKOV *returns with* STEPAN FEDOROV, *whom he clasps affectionately by the shoulders.*) Here he is! It's Stepan, he's back!

DORA (*going up to* STEPAN *and clasping his hand*): Welcome home, Stepan!

STEPAN: Hello, Dora.

DORA: Three years—just think. (*She is gazing at him.*)

STEPAN: Yes . . . three long years. The day they arrested me I was coming to join you.

DORA: Yes, we were expecting you all the time. I shall never forget how my heart sank as the minutes ticked away. We didn't dare look at each other.

ANNENKOV: Of course we had to move to another flat immediately.

STEPAN: I know.

DORA: How was it inside, Stepan?

STEPAN: Inside?

DORA: I mean in prison.

STEPAN: You can sometimes escape.

ANNENKOV: You know how we felt when we heard you'd got through to Switzerland.

STEPAN: Switzerland's a prison too.

ANNENKOV: Well, at least they're free there.

STEPAN: 'Freedom' will remain a prison until every man on earth is free! I was free of course, but all I could think about were Russia and . . . her slaves. (*Short pause.*)

APPENDIX C

Passage taken from ACT I of the ST, pages 32 - 34.

STEPAN, *parlant au fond.*

Pour se suicider, il faut beaucoup s'aimer. Un vrai révolutionnaire ne peut pas s'aimer.

KALIAYEV, *se retournant vivement.*

Un vrai révolutionnaire? Pourquoi me traites-tu ainsi? Que t'ai-je fait?

STEPAN

Je n'aime pas ceux qui entrent dans la révolution parce qu'ils s'ennuient.

ANNENKOV

Stepan!

STEPAN, *se levant et descendant vers eux.*

Oui, je suis brutal. Mais pour moi, la haine n'est pas un jeu. Nous ne sommes pas là pour nous admirer. Nous sommes là pour réussir.

KALIAYEV, *doucement.*

Pourquoi m'offenses-tu? Qui t'a dit que je m'ennuyais?

STEPAN

Je ne sais pas. Tu changes les signaux, tu aimes à jouer le rôle de colporteur, tu dis des vers, tu veux te lancer sous les pieds des chevaux, et maintenant, le suicide... (*Il le regarde.*) Je n'ai pas confiance en toi.

KALIAYEV, *se dominant.*

Tu ne me connais pas, frère. J'aime la vie. Je ne m'ennuie pas. Je suis entré dans la révolution parce que j'aime la vie.

STEPAN

Je n'aime pas la vie, mais la justice qui est au-dessus de la vie.

KALIAYEV, *avec un effort visible.*

Chacun sert la justice comme il peut. Il faut accepter que nous soyons différents. Il faut nous aimer, si nous le pouvons.

STEPAN

Nous ne le pouvons pas.

KALIAYEV, *éclatant.*

Que fais-tu donc parmi nous?

STEPAN

Je suis venu pour tuer un homme, non pour l'aimer ni pour saluer sa différence.

KALIAYEV, *violemment.*

Tu ne le tueras pas seul ni au nom de rien. Tu le tueras avec nous et au nom du peuple russe. Voilà ta justification.

STEPAN, *même jeu.*

Je n'en ai pas besoin. J'ai été justifié en une nuit, et pour toujours, il y a trois ans, au bagne. Et je ne supporterai pas...

ANNENKOV

Assez! Êtes-vous donc fous? Vous souvenez-vous de qui nous sommes? Des frères, confondus les uns aux autres, tournés vers l'exécution des tyrans, pour la libération du pays! Nous tuons ensemble, et rien ne peut nous séparer. (*Silence. Il les regarde.*) Viens, Stepan, nous devons convenir des signaux...

Stepan sort.

Passage taken from ACT I of the TT, pages 129 - 130.

STEPAN (*still facing the back of the room*): To commit suicide, a man must have a great love for himself. A true revolutionary cannot love himself.

KALIAYEV (*turning on* STEPAN . . . *sharply*): A true revolutionary? Why are you treating me like this . . . what have you got against me?

STEPAN: I don't like people who dabble with revolution because they're bored.

ANNENKOV: Stepan!

STEPAN (*gets up and walks down towards them*): Yes, I'm brutal . . . but for me hatred is not just a game. We aren't here to admire each other . . . we are here to succeed.

KALIAYEV (*in a soft voice*): Why are you taking it out on me? Who told you that I was bored?

STEPAN: There was no need to tell me. You change the signals. You like dressing up as a peddlar. You recite poems and now you want to throw yourself under the horses' feet. (*A pause* . . . STEPAN *looks at* KALIAYEV.) No, I can't say you inspire me with confidence.

KALIAYEV (*louder*): You don't know me, brother. I love life and I'm never bored. I joined the revolution *because* I love life!

STEPAN: I don't love life . . . I love something higher than mere life . . . I love justice.

KALIAYEV (*with visible restraint*): Each of us serves justice in his own way—you in yours and I in mine. Why not agree to be different? Let's love one another if we can.

STEPAN: We cannot.

KALIAYEV (*shouting*): What are you doing with us then?

STEPAN: I have come to kill a man, not to love him or agree to differ from him.

KALIAYEV (*passionately*): You will not kill him by yourself . . . for no cause! You will kill him with us . . . on behalf of the Russian people! That is your only justification.

STEPAN (*furiously*): I don't need any justification! I got all the justification I'll ever want three years ago, one night in prison . . . and I won't put up with . . .

ANNENKOV: That's enough! Are you both out of your minds? Have you forgotten who we are? We are all brothers working hand in hand to put an end to tyranny and set our people free! *Together*, we will kill, and nothing can divide us! (*Silence* . . . *he looks at them.*) Come along, Stepan . . . we must settle the signals. (*Exit* STEPAN.)

APPENDIX D

Passage taken from ACT II of the ST, pages 61 - 63.

ANNENKOV

Stepan, tout le monde ici t'aime et te respecte. Mais quelles que soient tes raisons, je ne puis te laisser dire que tout est permis. Des centaines de nos frères sont morts pour qu'on sache que tout n'est pas permis.

STEPAN

Rien n'est défendu de ce qui peut servir notre cause.

ANNENKOV, *avec colère.*

Est-il permis de rentrer dans la police et de jouer sur deux tableaux, comme le proposait Evno? Le ferais-tu?

STEPAN

Oui, s'il le fallait.

ANNENKOV, *se levant.*

Stepan, nous oublierons ce que tu viens de dire, en considération de ce que tu as fait pour nous et avec nous. Souviens-toi seulement de ceci. Il s'agit de savoir si, tout à l'heure, nous lancerons des bombes contre ces deux enfants.

STEPAN

Des enfants! Vous n'avez que ce mot à la bouche. Ne comprenez-vous donc rien? Parce que Yanek n'a pas tué ces deux-là, des milliers d'enfants russes mourront de faim pendant des années encore. Avez-vous vu des enfants mourir de faim? Moi, oui. Et la mort par la bombe est un enchantement à côté de cette mort-là. Mais Yanek ne les a pas vus. Il n'a vu que les deux chiens savants du grand-duc. N'êtes-vous donc pas des hommes? Vivez-vous dans le seul instant? Alors choisissez la charité et guérissez seulement le mal de chaque jour, non la révolution qui veut guérir tous les maux, présents et à venir.

DORA

Yanek accepte de tuer le grand-duc puisque sa mort peut avancer le temps où les enfants russes ne mourront plus de faim. Cela déjà n'est pas facile. Mais la mort des neveux du grand-duc n'empêchera aucun enfant de mourir de faim. Même dans la destruction, il y a un ordre, il y a des limites.

STEPAN, *violemment.*

Il n'y a pas de limites. La vérité est que vous ne croyez pas à la révolution. (*Tous se lèvent, sauf Yanek.*) Vous n'y croyez pas. Si vous y croyiez totalement, complètement, si vous étiez sûrs que par nos sacrifices et nos victoires, nous arriverons à bâtir une Russie libérée du despotisme, une terre de liberté qui finira par recouvrir le monde entier, si vous ne doutiez pas qu'alors, l'homme, libéré de ses maîtres et de ses préjugés, lèvera vers le ciel la face des vrais dieux, que pèserait la mort de deux enfants? Vous vous reconnaîtriez tous les droits, tous, vous m'entendez. Et si cette mort vous arrête, c'est que vous n'êtes pas sûrs d'être dans votre droit. Vous ne croyez pas à la révolution.

Passage taken from ACT II of the TT, pages 141 - 142.

ANNENKOV: All of us love and respect you, Stepan; but whatever your reasons are for feeling this way, you must not say that anything is justifiable . . . thousands of us have died to prove that everything is *not* justifiable.

STEPAN: Nothing that can serve our cause should be ruled out.

ANNENKOV (*angrily*): Is it justifiable to go over to the police and play a double game, as Evno suggested?

STEPAN: Yes, if it was necessary.

ANNENKOV (*getting up*): We will forget what you've said, Stepan, because of all that you have done for us and with us. The point is this: are we or are we not going to throw the bombs at these children?

STEPAN: Children! There you go again, always talking about children! Don't you see what this means? Because Yanek didn't kill those *two*, *thousands* of Russian children will go on dying of starvation for years to come! Have you ever seen children dying of starvation . . . I have, and to be killed by a bomb is pleasant compared to that . . . but Yanek! . . . Yanek has never seen children starving to death. He only saw the Grand-duke's little pair of lapdogs! Can't you see what will happen, or do you just live for the present? In that case, go on! . . . indulge in charity . . . and cure each petty little suffering that comes along, but don't meddle with the revolution, which exists to cure all suffering . . . now and in the future.

DORA: Yanek will kill the Grand-duke because his death may help to bring nearer the day when Russian children no longer die of starvation. That by itself is no easy task for him, but killing the Grand-duke's niece and nephew won't prevent a single child from starving. Even destruction has a right and a wrong way, and there *are* limits . . .

STEPAN (*violently*): There are *no* limits! What it really means is that you don't believe in the revolution! (*They all get up except* KALIAYEV.) No, you don't believe in it—any of you! If you had your whole heart in it, if you were sure that our sacrifices and our triumphs will be the foundation of a new Russia, freed from tyranny . . . a land of freedom that will gradually spread over the entire world and if you were convinced that then and only then will man, freed from tyrants and superstitions, at last look up to the sky—a god in his own right, how could the death of two children be weighed in the balance against such a faith? Surely you'd feel justified in doing anything and everything that might bring that day nearer . . . so, if you won't kill those two children, it simply means that you're not sure you are justified . . . so you don't believe in the revolution!

APPENDIX E

Passage taken from ACT III of the ST, pages 71 - 73.

STEPAN

Que fait Voinov? Il devrait être là.

ANNENKOV

Il a besoin de dormir. Et nous avons encore une demi-heure devant nous.

STEPAN

Je puis aller aux nouvelles.

ANNENKOV

Non. Il faut limiter les risques.

Silence.

ANNENKOV

Yanek, pourquoi ne dis-tu rien?

KALIAYEV

Je n'ai rien à dire. Ne t'inquiète pas.

On sonne.

KALIAYEV

Le voilà.

Entre Voinov.

ANNENKOV

As-tu dormi?

VOINOV

Un peu, oui.

ANNENKOV

As-tu dormi la nuit entière?

VOINOV

Non.

ANNENKOV

Il le fallait. Il y a des moyens.

VOINOV

J'ai essayé. J'étais trop fatigué.

ANNENKOV

Tes mains tremblent.

VOINOV

Non.

Tous le regardent.

Qu'avez-vous à me regarder? Ne peut-on être fatigué?

ANNENKOV

On peut être fatigué. Nous pensons à toi.

VOINOV, *avec une violence soudaine.*

Il fallait y penser avant-hier. Si la bombe avait été lancée, il y a deux jours, nous ne serions plus fatigués.

KALIAYE

Pardonne-moi, Alexis. J'ai rendu les choses plus difficiles.

VOINOV, *plus bas.*

Qui dit cela? Pourquoi plus difficiles? Je suis fatigué, voilà tout.

DORA

Tout ira vite, maintenant. Dans une heure, ce sera fini.

VOINOV

Oui, ce sera fini. Dans une heure...

Passage taken from ACT III of the TT, pages 145 - 146.

STEPAN: What's Voinov up to? He should be here by now.
ANNENKOV: He can do with some sleep, and we've got another half hour yet.
STEPAN: I could go down and see if there's any news.
ANNENKOV: No. We mustn't take unnecessary risks. (*Silence.*) Why are you so silent, Yanek?
KALIAYEV: I've got nothing to say, but don't worry about me . . . (*The bell rings once and then twice.*) Here he is! (*Enter* VOINOV.)
ANNENKOV: Get some sleep?
VOINOV: A bit.
ANNENKOV: Did you sleep all night?
VOINOV: No.
ANNENKOV: You ought to have done. There are ways of making yourself sleep.
VOINOV: I tried . . . but . . . I'm too tired.
ANNENKOV: Your hands are shaking.
VOINOV: No, they're not! (*They are all looking at him.*) Why are you all staring at me? What's wrong with being tired?
ANNENKOV: That's not the point . . . we're concerned about you.
VOINOV (*suddenly violent*): You should have thought about that two days ago! If the bomb had been thrown then, we wouldn't be tired now.
KALIAYEV: I'm sorry, Alexis. I've made things harder for everyone.
VOINOV (*more quietly*): What do you mean, harder? I'm tired, that's all.
DORA: Well, it won't be long now . . . in an hour it will all be over.
VOINOV: Yes . . . it will all be over, in an hour's time . . .

APPENDIX F

Passage taken from ACT III of the ST, pages 91 - 94.

DORA

Stepan, dis « la haine ».

STEPAN

Comment?

DORA

Ces deux mots, « la haine », prononce-les.

STEPAN

La haine.

DORA

C'est bien. Yanek les prononçait très mal.

STEPAN, *après un silence, et marchant vers elle.*

Je comprends : tu me méprises. Es-tu sûre d'avoir raison, pourtant? (*Un silence, et avec une violence croissante.*) Vous êtes tous là à marchander ce que vous faites, au nom de l'ignoble amour. Mais moi, je n'aime rien et je hais, oui, je hais mes semblables! Qu'ai-je à faire avec leur amour? Je l'ai connu au bagne, voici trois ans. Et depuis trois ans, je le porte sur moi. Tu voudrais que je m'attendrisse et que je traîne la bombe comme une croix? Non! Non! Je suis allé trop loin, je sais trop de choses... Regarde...

Il déchire sa chemise. Dora a un geste vers lui. Elle recule devant les marques du fouet.

Ce sont les marques! Les marques de leur amour! Me méprises-tu maintenant?

Elle va vers lui et l'embrasse brusquement.

DORA

Qui mépriserait la douleur? Je t'aime aussi.

STEPAN, *il la regarde et sourdement.*

Pardonne-moi, Dora. (*Un temps. Il se détourne.*) Peut-être est-ce la fatigue. Des années de lutte, l'angoisse, les mouchards, le bagne... et pour finir, ceci. (*Il montre les marques.*) Où trouverais-je la force d'aimer? Il me reste au moins celle de haïr. Cela vaut mieux que de ne rien sentir.

DORA

Oui, cela vaut mieux.

Il la regarde. Sept heures sonnent.

STEPAN, *se retournant brusquement.*

Le grand-duc va passer.

Dora va vers la fenêtre et se colle aux vitres. Long silence. Et puis, dans le lointain, la calèche. Elle se rapproche, elle passe.

STEPAN

S'il est seul...

La calèche s'éloigne. Une terrible explosion. Soubresaut de Dora qui cache sa tête dans ses mains. Long silence.

STEPAN

Boria n'a pas lancé sa bombe! Yanek a réussi. Réussi! O peuple! O joie!

DORA, *s'abattant en larmes sur lui.*

C'est nous qui l'avons tué! C'est nous qui l'avons tué! C'est moi.

STEPAN, *criant.*

Qui avons-nous tué? Yanek?

DORA

Le grand-duc.

RIDEAU

Author Hudson Joanna
Name of thesis Albert Camus' Les Justes: A Descriptive Approach To The Analysis Of A Drama Text In Translation. 1988

PUBLISHER:
University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg
©2013

LEGAL NOTICES:

Copyright Notice: All materials on the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg Library website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

Disclaimer and Terms of Use: Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the Library website.