

https://dspace.org/

Universal access to primary education: the integration of black pupils into former Indian public primary schools.

Moodley, Devandhran

2009-09-07T09:20:27Z
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/7198

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/



University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg

Faculty of Humanities
School of Social Sciences

Universal Access to Primary Education: The Integration of Black Pupils into Former Indian Public Primary Schools

Devandhran Moodley

Supervisor: Dr Michelle Williams
Department of Sociology

A Research Report submitted to the Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts (Development Studies)

June 2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
	Abstract	v
	Declaration	vii
	Dedication	viii
	Acknowledgements	ix
1.	**Chapter One: Introduction**	1
2.	**Chapter Two: Literature Review**	7
2.1	Education and Development	7
2.2	Historical Context of the South African Educational System	11
2.3	Legislative Mandate on Education in a post-apartheid South Africa	15
2.4	International Initiatives aimed at Universal Access to Primary Education	22
3.	**Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology**	27
3.1	Research Question and Aims	27
3.2	Choosing the Sample Schools	28
3.3	Organisation of the Research during 2008/9	29
3.4	Choosing the Data Collection Methods	31
3.5	Developing the Research Methods and Instruments	33
	3.5.1 Document Analysis	33
	3.5.2 Qualitative Interviews	35
	3.5.3 Statistical Questionnaire: School Demographics	41
	3.5.4 Survey on School Quality Perceptions	43
3.6	Potential Limitations of the Study	46
3.7	Ethical Considerations	47

4. Chapter Four: The Educational Landscape in Post-Apartheid Primary Schooling 49

4.1 Increased Enrolment Numbers in Primary Schooling 49

4.2 Migratory Patters of Black Pupils in the Quest for Quality Education 53

4.3 Qualitative versus Quantitative Education 62

4.4 Infrastructural Capacity and Enrolment Numbers 69

5. Chapter Five: The Impact of Universal Access to Primary Education 77

5.1 Increased Enrolment Numbers 77

5.2 Migration of Black Pupils 90

6. Chapter Six: The Unintended Consequences of Universal Access to Primary Education 105

6.1 The Quest for Quality Education 105

6.2 The Impact of High Enrolment Numbers on Infrastructural Capacity 128

7. Chapter Seven: Conclusion 141

8. Reference List 150

9. Appendices 159

9.1 **Appendix I:** Interview Schedule – School Principals (2nd Round) 159

9.2 **Appendix II:** Interview Schedule – School Teachers / Education Official 161

9.3 **Appendix III**: Interview Schedule – School Principals (1st Round) / NGO's 162

9.4 **Appendix IV**: Interview Schedule – Foreign Affairs Government Officials 166

9.5 **Appendix V:** Statistical Questionnaire: School Demographics 169

9.6 **Appendix VI**: Survey on School Quality Perceptions 173

9.7 **Appendix VII**: Letter from Researcher requesting an Interview 174

9.8 **Appendix VIII**: Consent Form for Interviewees 176

9.9 **Appendix IX:** Recording Consent Form for Interviewees 178

LIST OF TABLES

		Page
Table One:	National attendance of 7 to 13 year olds at educational institutions in South Africa, 2002 to 2006- results expressed in percentages	51
Table Two:	Percentage of under and un-qualified teachers between 1975-2000	58
Table Three:	Total Pupil Enrolments of ten Sample Schools for 2004 and 2008	78
Table Four:	Total Pupil Enrolments of four Sample Schools for 2000, 2004 and 2008	81
Table Five:	Total Pupil Enrolments of Grade One for 2004 and 2008	82
Table Six:	Total Pupil Enrolments of Grade One in four Sample Schools for 2000, 2004 and 2008	84
Table Seven:	Total Pupils Enrolments as per racial breakdown for 2008 – results expressed in percentages	92
Table Eight:	Total Pupil places of residence in proximity to school for 2008 – results expressed in percentages	94
Table Nine:	Findings of Survey on school quality perceptions conducted on 50 black parents – results expressed in percentages	122
Table Ten:	Maximum Physical Infrastructural Carrying Capacity (enrolment numbers) of Schools and Total Pupil Enrolments for 2008	130

ABSTRACT

This research report examines the impact that universal access to primary education has on the integration of black pupils into former Indian public primary schools. In the post-apartheid state, a fundamental challenge has been the reformation of the educational landscape in South Africa, aimed at ensuring that its discriminatory educational history is never repeated.

This study focuses on contextualising universal access to primary education in a specific environment i.e. tracing and understanding specific trends and social phenomena in public primary schools in the former Indian township of Lenasia, neighboured by former black townships (greater Soweto), thirty kilometres south of Johannesburg. There are four pillars to this investigation. It sets out to firstly examine whether universal access to primary education has led to an increase in enrolment numbers in a specific sample of ten historically classified Indian public primary schools in Lenasia. Secondly, the study explores whether increased enrolment numbers are due to a migration of black pupils into the former Indian public primary sample schools. The third focus is to understand the reasons, through the views and perceptions of school principals, teachers, black parents and a government official as to why this migratory trend, as an unintended consequence of universal access to primary education, may be occurring. Lastly, the emphasis is on investigating whether universal access to primary education has, as an unintended consequence, led to infrastructural capacity difficulties experienced in the sample schools.

Four data collection methods / instruments are employed to undertake this study. These are document analysis; qualitative interviews; statistical questionnaires on the sample school demographics and; a survey on school quality perceptions conducted on fifty black parents. From the data collected, analysed and interpreted, this research report confirms that the national legislative framework aimed at universal access to primary education has resulted in increased enrolment numbers at the sample schools. The results also indicate that there is a large proportion of the pupil population that travels from the neighbouring former black townships to attend the sample schools, thereby confirming the migratory trend of black pupils into the former Indian schools. In addition, interactions with the school principals, teachers, government officials and the results of the survey reveal that black parents send their children to these former Indian schools due to the perception that these schools offer a better quality education in comparison to the former black township primary schools. Lastly, the data collected clearly indicates that the infrastructural carrying capacity of the schools is stretched to the point where it jeopardises the practise of universal access to primary education and the provision of a good quality education.

The study concludes that even though the quantitative aspects of universal access to primary education are being met, the qualitative aspects of education are being compromised. The investigation also suggests that further detailed multi-level research in former black townships is necessary in order to fully understand why the migratory trend is highly prevalent. This would also provide better insight into transforming the defunct culture of teaching and learning in former black townships into a culture of accountability, transparency and openness. Directions for future research are also proposed.

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this Research Report is my own, original, authentic and unaided work. It is being submitted for the Degree of Master of Arts (Development Studies) at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa. It has not been submitted before for any other degree or examination at any other university.

_____

Mr Devandhran Moodley

_____

Date

DEDICATION

I dedicate this study to my wife, Kirti and my four-year old son, Jasveer. Without your unconditional love, patience, support and encouragement, I would not have reached my goal. You have both made my dream a reality. I love you both very much and thank you from the bottom of my heart.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to the following people for their contribution to this study:

Dr Michelle Williams, my research supervisor, for her commitment, dedication and invaluable guidance provided through every stage of this process;

Ms Susila Moodley, my mother and a retired school principal, for spending numerous hours providing me with research advice and for always playing an instrumental role in my academic career throughout my life;

Mr Harvey Short, my supervisor at work, for his understanding and compassion during the undertaking of this study;

Ms Claudia Furriel, my close friend, for her unqualified support and friendship aimed at ensuring that I reach my end goal;

The school principals, teachers, parents, government officials and NGO's, who were willing to participate in this study, for their time, rich inputs and opinions that contributed towards the crafting of this research report and;

My immediate family, in-laws and friends, for their patience, support and encouragement.

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Universal access to primary education forms the bedrock to alleviating poverty, increasing income and ensuring overall wellbeing of societies (Colclough, 2004; Lockheed and Verspoor, 1994; Ayres, 1987). Thus, human development in the form of educational services is vital for economic growth (Sen, 1999). When placing this into the South African context, the fragmented historical system of education has made the attainment of these goals highly complex and multifaceted.

The Education White Paper One: School Ownership, Governance and Finance (1996) acknowledged that inequality had been deeply ingrained into the educational history of South Africa. There was a need to emphasise the importance of improving and increasing access and the retention of black[1] pupils in the education system, taking necessary precautions to prevent the practise of discrimination, ensuring that there was an equitable spread of state resources in all schools across the country, and setting in motion effective governance and management systems aimed at improving the quality of education. Another key challenge during the amalgamation period was to strive for and maintain a disciplined and purposeful schooling environment.

To bring this goal into effect, the *1996 South African Constitution* and *South African Schools Act 84 of 1996* ushered in the immediate transformation of education. Education became a basic human right, compulsory for young children, equitable and most

[1] The use of the term "black" has a long and contested history in South Africa. The ANC-led liberation movement specifically challenged the apartheid separation of races by using the term "black" to refer to persons of Coloured, Indian and African decent. It therefore had a political orientation. In the post-apartheid era, however, the term "black" is most often used to refer specifically to persons of African origin.

importantly, non-discriminatory. Focus was on the principle of equity whereby all citizens would have the same quality of learning opportunities and rehabilitating schools (Motala and Pampallis, 2001, 24-25; Johnson, 1995, 134). Furthermore, building a high quality education and training system would be the long-term goal (Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003; Education White Paper 6, 2001; Naicker, 1999).

The democratic government, in the post 1994 period, embarked upon an aggressive policy of universal access to primary education. By 2006, over 98% of 7-13 year old children were attending educational institutions in South Africa (SA Millennium Development Goals – Mid-Term Country Report, September 2007). South Africa was well on its way to meeting international initiatives like Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education) and the goals of the Education for All Initiative. However, it was also evident that deliverance of a standardised quality education was lacking. Therefore, the historical legacy of a racially divided educational system still plagued and cast a shadow on South African successes.

African education in the former black townships was still haunted by a breakdown of the culture of teaching and learning (Christie, 1998, in Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003, 352). "Anarchic tendencies" had filtered into the educational system (Soudien, 1992, 285). Twenty years following the Soweto riots, a study undertaken on Gauteng schools revealed that these types of problems continued to exist (Chrisholm and Vally, 1996, in Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003, 352). Teachers continued to be under or unqualified coupled with poor governance and administration in schools located in former black townships. As a result, since democratisation, there has been a noticeable migratory trend of black pupils from these schools to the former Model C (white) schools in the more

affluent suburbs in a quest for a better quality education (Jansen, 2008; Soudien 2007b; Berger, 2003; Gallie et al, 1997).

To contextualise this trend, the migration of black pupils into former white schools should be viewed entirely in accordance with the *Education White Paper Two: The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools (1996)* which strongly endorsed parental rights in taking decisions regarding the education of their child. This is further supported by the *1996 South African Constitution* and the *South African Schools Act 84 of 1996*. With this legal framework well in place, the reformation of the South African educational system experienced a noted exodus of black pupils from the schools geographically located in the former black townships to former Model C (white) schools in nearby affluent residential areas since the mid 1990s.

Furthermore, this migratory trend should be understood in the following light. Achieving universal access to primary education should not be simply equated with increasing the number of school places. Instead, school engagements should be viewed as an interaction of supply, demand and engaging the learning process. This implies that the many benefits that accrued from access to primary education should also be receptive to the quality of the learning experience (Millennium Development Goals Report, 2008; Fataar, 1997; White Paper on Education and Training, 1995; Lockheed and Verspoor, 1994; Colclough, 1993). In addition, access and quality were the "…opposite sides of the same coin." (Soudien, 2007b, 46). Thus, the qualitative aspects of universal access to primary education were just as important as the quantitative aspects.

Furthermore, a good quality education could only be effectively delivered (with an outcome of academic excellence) in a decent learning environment where the physical facilities were of an acceptable level. An operational learning environment would include basic furniture, adequate classrooms, a school library, proper water and sanitation facilities, workable laboratories and facilities for recreational activities to be maximised in the school curriculum (Lemon, 2004; Hallak, 1990; Mwamwenda and Mwanwenda, 1987; Cooper, 1985). However striving for universal access to primary education ran the risk, as an unintended consequence, of negatively impacting upon the infrastructural capacity of South African schools.

This study focuses on the impact of universal access to primary education on the integration of black pupils into former Indian public primary schools. The research project firstly examines whether universal access to primary education has in fact led to increased enrolment numbers in a sample of ten former Indian public primary schools in the Lenasia (a former Indian township) region - thirty kilometres south of Johannesburg, Gauteng. Secondly, the study explores whether the social phenomenon of a migratory trend of black pupils from former black townships into specifically former Indian public primary schools is occurring, taking into account the numerous former black townships (the greater Soweto region) neighbouring Lenasia. Thirdly, this research project investigates the perceptions of black parents regarding their children receiving a better quality education (in comparison to schools in the previously disadvantaged black townships) in a former "privileged" schooling environment – in this case, a Lenasia-based former Indian public primary school. Lastly, the study attempts to uncover whether universal access to primary education has, as an unintended consequence, led to infrastructural capacity difficulties in the sampled schools.

Chapter Two examines the current literature on universal access to primary education in the South African context. The emphasis is on exploring the theoretical linkages between education and development; historically contextualising the South African educational system; examining the legislative mandate on education in a post-apartheid South Africa and; understanding the international initiatives aimed at universal access to primary education and South African compliance in this regard. Chapter Three carefully details the research design and methodology employed in attempting to undertake this project including the experiences of the researcher.

Chapter Four presents the empirical data derived from engagement with the literature. The empirical data is engaged at four levels. These are: the impact that universal access to primary education has on enrolment numbers in schools; migratory patterns of pupils in a quest for quality education in the South African context; the debate regarding qualitative and quantitative aspects of primary education and; the impact that high enrolment numbers have on infrastructural capacity in terms of delivering a good quality education.

Chapter Five addresses two specific themes that focus on increased enrolment numbers and the migratory pattern of black pupils into the sampled schools. A three-fold approach is adopted in dealing with these themes. Firstly, the results of the findings that were collated, following the field work undertaken, are presented. Secondly an in depth discussion on interpretations of the findings are presented and thirdly, the literature to substantiate and support the empirical evidence and data collected is further engaged.

Chapter Six also addresses two themes. These are (as a result of universal access to primary education) a quest for quality education and the impact on infrastructural capacity in the sampled schools. The same approach as in the preceding Chapter is adopted - where the findings are presented, interpretations are undertaken and the empirical literature is further engaged.

Lastly, Chapter Seven focuses on a summary of the study, including conclusions regarding recommendations and suggested areas of further research and study.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

The purpose of this chapter is to engage the key literature aimed at providing background to the research project. The focus is on contextualising the study that follows by introducing the importance of theoretical debates regarding education and development. Emphasis is placed on linking human development to economic growth and presenting arguments on the importance of education for economic growth and development. The Literature Review then moves on to focus on understanding the historical context of the South African education system. It is against this backdrop that this research project should be viewed. The next area of attention is on the legislative mandate of the South African government that is aimed at promoting constitutional rights of children and striving for universal access to primary education in a post-apartheid state. The final focus of this chapter examines the importance of the Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education) within the African context. South Africa is also striving to meet this target by 2015, thereby impacting upon the initiatives being undertaken to ensure that all children have access to good quality education. The chapter concludes with a reference to the Education for All initiative.

2.1 EDUCATION AND DEVELOPMENT

The quest for universal access to primary education should be viewed within the paradigm of development. Much literature over that past decades has confirmed the importance of education for economic growth and development. Human development has gained momentum since the 1990s and education, as a basic human right, has become firmly entrenched within this discourse. This section analyses some of the key theoretical frameworks regarding education for development. This analysis should be viewed within

the context of highlighting, understanding and setting the context for this research project.

2.1.1 The Importance of Human Development for Economic Growth

Universal coverage of basic social services (providing education and health facilities) of a good quality is viewed as instrumental for enduring equitable growth. Without this, the virtuous circle of social and economic development will remain elusive (Vandemoortele, 2003).

A leading and internationally renowned development economist, Amartya Sen, has argued that "It is important to give simultaneous recognition to the centrality of individual freedom and to the force of social influences on the extent and reach of individual freedom. To counter the problems that we face, we have to see individual freedom as a social commitment." (Sen, 1999, pg. xii). At the very heart of this statement lies the importance of human development for emancipation and growth. Human development is seen as the capacity of individuals to pursue their well-being. In light of this, economic opportunities, democracy, education, health and self-esteem are all developmental in nature.

If freedom was to be seen as instrumental for development, then crucial for policy formulation was creating freedom as the guiding principle that contributed towards the process of development (Sen, 1999, xii). Thus, for Sen (1999), "Freedoms are not only the primary ends of development, they are also among its principal means." (10-11). Social opportunities (especially education and health services) facilitated economic participation.

In line with this thinking, Ranis (2004) notes that a way forward with development theory was to pursue a two-way relationship between growth and human development (21). As early as the 1970s, while the GNP-orientated development strategy was being de-throned, there was a movement from single to multiple development objectives with a focus on growth and poverty alleviation. The interdependence between economic and demographic variables like education, nutrition, health, fertility and mortality rates etc. came into play. By the end of the 1990s, poverty reduction measured in terms of outcomes (health, education, employment, access to public goods and services and social capital) rather than inputs was the primary goal to strive for (Thorbecke, 2006, 24). There was a recognition that the challenges of development and the appropriate responses were multiple and interconnected. Encouraging education resulted in more opportunities for new information and ideas (World Bank, 2004, 152-3).

This World Bank approach converged with the views of Sen regarding development. Sen (1997, 7-9) highlighted that the "harder approach" to development, where rapid capital accumulation (physical capital) was at the core of development, suffered from a severe handicap. This quest was undertaken at the expense, development and improvement of human resource skills, sufficient educational and health services, a good quality of life and well-being for the future. A change in mindset occurred in the 1990s regarding the study and analysis of economic growth and development in affording human capital more prominence (Sen, 1997; Thorbecke, 2006).

As a result of these developments, in the current decade we see issues of human development being the nucleus of development frameworks. In addition, we also see an expansion of the development agenda to incorporate a varied number of other issues that impact upon ones' well-being. These were positive trends since they moved beyond the

1950's and 1960's traditional and conservative approaches to development and focussed on being more humanistic. What had become extremely clear was that, by expanding human capabilities, there is a positive effect on productivity levels of society, thereby impacting upon economic growth. This approach also facilitated for the expanding of development priorities that aimed to cater for the needs of human freedom and a better quality of life. Of paramount importance in this equation was the delivery of a good quality education to society. The next focus of the Literature Review will analyse why the very aspect of education had become so instrumental for economic growth and development.

2.1.2 The Importance of Education for Economic Growth and Development

The question needs to be asked as to why societies should take on the role of educating. There are numerous answers to this question. One of the most compelling answers is the role that education plays in effectively contributing towards development. Education is viewed as the cornerstone for socio-economic development. It is a productive element that provides the necessary ingredients for economic growth. Primary education, as the foundation, alleviates poverty with literacy and numeracy leading to self-employment and increased incomes. It also helps to reduce poverty by mitigating its effects on population, health and nutrition (Colclough, 2004; Motala, 1995; Lockheed and Verspoor, 1994; Ayres, 1987). This human capacity, once developed, can not be taken away.

Primary education brought about gendered benefits where educated women were more likely to have smaller families, thereby controlling their own fertility. The higher the education of females, the lower the rate of infant and child mortality. Thus, poverty alleviation, infant and child mortality, fertility and sustainable development were to a

great degree impacted upon by education levels (Colclough, 2004, 167; Sen, 1997, 10). Vandemoortele (2006) states that basic education opens up other avenues for development, thereby ending the inter-generational transmission of poverty (127-8). Ayres (1987) stresses that the key factor in economic life of societies was the level of education. He views literacy as a basic skill required for the "take-off" towards industrialisation as illustrated in the Meiji and Bolshevik Revolutions (51-2).

To sum up, human development, with a specific focus on access to primary education, is vital for economic growth. From engaging the literature, it is evident that it is via effectively developing and educating human capital that economic growth and development can be sustained. Taking into account the importance of education, the focus of the Literature Review will now explore the historical context of the South African education system. This investigation will further enhance and contextualise the purpose of the research to follow.

2.2 HISTORICAL CONTEXT OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN EDUCATION SYSTEM

South Africa, as a developing country has a highly evolved economic infrastructure. Despite this advantage, there are challenging socio-economic inequalities that have been inherited due to the legislated practise of racial discrimination and injustice. An area most affected was education with the education sector being the bedrock of segregation during the years of apartheid.

In order to contextualise the South African complexities in education, it is important to understand the organisational structure of the education system inherited following the democratic elections in 1994. From 1983 until 1995, education was organised through

the three separate "own affairs" services of the Tri-cameral Parliament. The three pillars were the House of Delegates (Indian representation); House of Representatives (coloured representation); and House of Assembly (white representation). People of African origin were not accommodated in the tri-cameral parliamentary system. With regard to the organisation of white education, four semi-autonomous provincial departments were created. The education system for the African population was divided between six self-governing territory departments, a central government department administering education for Africans living in "white South Africa", and four nominally independent state departments. The policy and budgetary allocations on behalf of the central government were controlled by the "Department of National Education". The various education systems, based on racial classifications, co-existed, were kept separate and functioned in complete isolation of each other, except at the top management level. The education and training systems for the four race groups also remained separate. By 1995, the new non-racial national and provincial educational departments were in place. The pre-democratic ethnic departments with their separate institutional cultures, personal networks and community relations were dissolved into one management structure which would be administered by the National Department of Education (White Paper on Education and Training, March 1995).

The above explanation clearly illustrates the fragmented historical system of education and the daunting task that the Government faced in amalgamating the different structures under one framework. To make matters more difficult, the education disruptions during the apartheid years had a detrimental effect on the infrastructure of the education and training system. The relationship between schools and many of the communities they were expected to serve had been disrupted and distorted by the crisis of legitimacy. It was

at this point that the South African government faced and continues to face one the most difficult challenges in reforming the South African landscape.

In light of the above, Soudien and Baxen (1997) recall that during the years of apartheid, the South African education system was built on presumptions of European superiority and African inferiority. These presumptions were established as modern truths about human progress and development (449). This was the legacy that the new South African government had to confront. By the 1990s, the education system had been fragmented, inequitable and racially and culturally oppressive. The task was to convert this education system into one that would be equitable, aiming to redress social and cultural inequalities.

The Education White Paper One: School Ownership, Governance and Finance (1996) took this point further when it stated that inequality had been deeply ingrained into the educational history of South Africa. A new direction was needed to emphasise the importance of improving and increasing access and the retention of black pupils in the education system, taking necessary precautions to prevent the practise of discrimination, ensuring that there was an even and equitable spread of state resources in all schools across the country, and setting in motion effective governance and management systems aimed at improving the quality of education. Another key challenge during the amalgamation period was to strive for and maintain a disciplined and purposeful schooling environment. These actions illustrated the important elements required for children of all races to have equitable access to schooling across the country.

To further guide this process, the *Education White Paper Two: The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools (1996)*, took cognisance of the fact that, taking into account that most South African families lived in poverty, a key objective of the new

education strategy for schools was to achieve an equitable distribution of the education provision nationally. The aim was to ensure that there was a greater focus and financial allocation on under-resourced areas and that better resourced schools from the previous education system would experience a responsible reduction in state funding. The goal was to ensure that "…… the school system should therefore be unified through a managed process of change, based on respect for constitutional rights and freedoms, redress, equity and an improvement in the quality of learning."(7)

It has to be remarked that the transformation of the education system coincided with the adoption of a new South African Constitution in 1996. The overall objective of this Constitution, following years of oppression of the majority of the citizens in South Africa, was to ensure that there would be a better life for all. As a result, in practicing the Constitution, the quest for a new school organisational structure and governance system focussing on universal access to primary education became entrenched within the constitutional and legal obligations of the national and provincial government.

Thus, following the turbulent and disruptive characteristics of black education during the apartheid era, the Government was committed to making a fundamental reformation of the South African education system. The overriding objective in this process was to create the most conducive conditions for universal access to primary education. It is at this juncture that the Literature Review will examine both the South African legislative mandate and the South African international obligations that have come to guide the transformation of the education system, aimed at universal access to primary education in the post-apartheid era. .

2.3 LEGISLATIVE MANDATE ON EDUCATION IN A POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA

A fundamental role for governments is to ensure that every child in society, boys and girls, has the opportunity to complete quality primary basic schooling and move onto secondary or post primary forms of education. Other tools that should be employed by government are the abolition of school fees and special incentives to get marginalised groups into school. An investigation will be undertaken in this section of the Literature Review on what the key South African policies are that have been put in place to facilitate universal access to primary education.

Nationally, the two principal legislative frameworks that entrench the practice of universal access to primary education in South Africa are the *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996)* and the *South African Schools Act No.84 (1996)*. These two pieces of legislation will be dealt with below.

2.3.1 The Constitutional Mandate

The *South African Constitution (1996)* sets the framework for the State to undertake the reformation of the South African education system. Motala and Pampallis (2001) indicate that:

"The South African Constitution, like any other, cannot be understood without an historical analysis which contextualises its evolution. The Constitution is an expression of the struggle against apartheid, the need to establish a human rights culture in the country, the struggle for social and economic rights, and moves to universalise the principles of fairness and justice." (16)

It is within the confines of the above that gave rise to the South African Constitution forming the basis for state policy towards universal access to primary education since this is directly linked to democracy, equal citizenship and the protection of fundamental human rights and freedoms. In light of the above, it is appropriate to introduce the extract (Article 29 (1) and (2) – Chapter 2: Bill of Rights) from the *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996)* that gives all children the constitutional right to an education:

29. (1) Everyone has the right -

(a) to a basic education and
(b) to further education

(2) Everyone has the right to receive education in the official language or languages of their choice in public educational institutions where that education is reasonably practicable. In order to ensure the effective access to, and implementation of, this right, the state must consider all reasonable educational alternatives, including single medium institutions, taking into account –

(a) equity;
(b) practicability; and
(c) the need to redress the results of past racially discriminatory laws and practices

Article 29 of the *South African Constitution (1996)* is clear about the obligations of the State to provide and progressively make available and accessible the right to a basic education (Malherbe, 2005; Motala and Pampallis, 2001). It is evident that these rights cannot remain unfulfilled or ignored. If this does occur, the State would be failing in its duty to its citizens. The constitutional right to an education has to be upheld and should also be viewed as a quest for equality within a diverse society with a fragmented past. Furthermore, the Constitution goes further in Article 29 (2) by stating that all citizens have the right to choose the language of instruction of the education to be received. These rights can be understood as aiming to create equal educational opportunities for all, regardless of their backgrounds.

Berger (2003) remarks that while the *South African Constitution (1996)* establishes the right to basic and further education, a shortcoming is noted. The Constitution in Article 29 does not specifically refer to a particular minimum standard of education that would be required. He states that the standard should be "adequate" in order to satisfy the democratic and civic ideals articulated in Article 39 of the South African Constitution. This observation merits further analysis, taking into account Bergers' observation that the quality of education in the predominantly black areas of South Africa has been poor. By not specifically strengthening the quantitative aspect of universal access to primary education with a qualitative element, the practice of equitable access to primary education is simultaneously constitutionally sacrosanct while remaining weak since it is not coupled with a quest for a good quality education.

In practise this means that while there is a *de jure* constitutional right and access to education, there is a *de facto* lack of a constitutional provision for a good quality education in South Africa:

"South Africa's Constitution explicitly recognises the right to education, and yet many South African schools fall far short of the constitutional requirement. The worst schools – mostly in predominantly black areas – lack the resources to provide students with the education they need to participate effectively in a democratic, capitalist society. Consequently, despite the past decade's remarkable political changes, many South Africans have little more chance to better their lot in life than they had under apartheid." (Berger, 2003, 661)

Therefore, while the *1996 Constitution of the Republic of South Africa* fully supports universal access to primary education, no provision is made for ensuring that this is

coupled with a good quality education. This has important ramifications for the overall transformation of the education sector in South Africa. The education system runs the risk of ensuring high enrolment levels at primary schools with little (or no) emphasis on the manner in which the education is being relayed.

The next focus will be on an analysis of the *South African Schools Act No. 84 of 1996* and how it contributes to the goal of universal access to primary education.

2.3.2 South African Schools Act No. 84 of 1996

The *South African Schools Act (1996)* is a vital piece of legislation that has been geared towards transforming the educational landscape. The preamble of the Act clearly states that one of the aims is to: "… redress part injustices in educational provision, provide an education of progressively high quality for all learners ..... uphold the rights of all learners, parents and educators…" (*South African Schools Act No. 84 of 1996*, Preamble, 1996). The major contribution that the *South African Schools Act* has made in terms of facilitating universal access to primary education can be traced to the relevant extract from Chapter Two on learners:

South African Schools Act 84 of 1996: Chapter Two

Compulsory Attendance:

3. (1) Every parent must cause every learner for who he or she is responsible to attend a school from the age of 7 to 15.

3. (3) Every Member of the Executive Council must ensure that there are enough school places so that every child who lives in his province can attend a school.

3. (6). (a) Any parent who fails to comply with sending the child to school is guilty of an offence and liable on conviction to a fine or imprisonment for a period not exceeding six months.

5. (1) A public school must admit learners and serve their educational requirements without unfairly discriminating in any way.

The *South African Schools Act No. 84 of 1996* is therefore a milestone in terms of effectively ensuring that there is compliance with universal access to primary education since primary schooling is made compulsory and non-compliance is considered a criminal offence in South Africa. Thus, legislating compulsory education further encourages and contributes to higher levels of primary school attendance in South Africa. In addition, the Act is vitally important since it stipulates that the State has the responsibility of funding public schools from public revenue on an equitable basis so as to facilitate the proper exercise of the rights of learners to education and to redress past inequalities. This stipulation is extremely important in order to ensure that democratic and equitable transformation of the education sector takes place. Furthermore, it is noted that while the *South African Constitution (1996)* does not make compulsory education a part of constitutional rights, the *South African Schools Act (1996)* addresses this matter (Malherbe, 2005).

In addition to the two key above-mentioned legislative frameworks, other legislative contributions to facilitating universal access to primary education have also included the *National Education Policy Act (NEPA) No.27 of 1996* that focuses on facilitating the democratic transition of the national education system into one that would provide for the needs and interests of all South Africans and uphold their basic rights. The aim is to contribute to the personal development of every learner. With regard to the *White Paper on Education and Training (1995)*, education and training are viewed as fundamental basic rights. Here, the State is obliged to advance and protect citizens of a country with people having the opportunity to develop their capacity in order to make a valuable contribution towards their communities. This White Paper also commits, amongst others,

to redressing educational inequalities, enhancing the implementation of the principle of equity whereby all citizens would have the same quality of learning opportunities and rehabilitating schools (Motala and Pampallis, 2001, 24-25; Johnson, 1995, 134). The long-term goal is the development of an inclusive education and training system that will deal with obstacles to learning and recognise and cater for the diverse range of learning needs and to build a high-quality education and training system (Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003; Education White Paper 6, 2001; Naicker, 1999). Thus, to some extent, while the constitutional right to basic education does not address the right to a high quality education, other legislative documents view a quality education as a key priority in the quest for universal access to primary education.

To sum up, it becomes very clear that the State has the responsibility to undertake educational programmes in the interest of the majority of South Africans and to materialise the *South African Constitution (1996)* and related education laws. The State has to be proactive in order to carry out the mandated education tasks. In addition, the right to basic education creates a positive duty upon the State to provide this education in order for the right to be met and enjoyed (Malherbe, 2005; Motala and Pampallis, 2001). This would include the State providing adequate schools, teachers and other related support services aimed at ensuring reasonable access of basic education for all and access to primary education.

Taking into account the historical educational inequalities in the South African context, the main purpose of the State would be to provide an accessible and equitable education of good quality to better the lives of South African from previously disadvantaged backgrounds so that they could effectively participate in the economy, enjoy their civil liberties, rights and freedoms and contribute to nation-building.

To some extent, the National Department of Education has taken the legislative mandate on board by adopting educational policies and strategies. This is evident in the marked increase of access that children have had to primary schooling in South Africa, taking into account the fragmented education system that existed prior to democratic reform in 1994. Problems presented by high levels of poverty meant that there was a greater effort required to ensure that children from poor and rural communities, especially vulnerable or disabled learners participated in and completed basic education. The South African approach to education for all has been to strengthen existing educational development and reform.

This has become evident in the education sector budgetary allocations since democratisation. Since 1994, South Africa saw massive shifts in resources in the education sector with the budget allocation at R81 995 billion in 2005 and rising to R89 537 billion and R96 732 billion respectively for 2006 and 2007. It is noted that this made education the single largest budget item (about 6% of GDP). As a proportion, this was amongst the highest in the world (South Africa: Millennium Development Goals Country Report, 2005, 4). For the 2008 financial year, the education budget, as the largest category of government spending was R 105 500 billion (Pampallis, 2008).

However, fourteen years after the first democratic elections in April 1994, disparities are still highly evident across the education sector and major disparities in daily living conditions, based on racial division, continue to plague South African society. Some of these inequalities can be illustrated by a continuing legacy of weak school infrastructural support, inadequate school facilities for children in rural areas, a lack of proper amenities and inadequate training for teachers resulting in a poor quality of education being

delivered. Despite large-scale education sector investments and the constitutional and legal structures and institutions well in place to achieve greater equity and equal opportunities for all school-going children, there is still a long way ahead to ensure that the lingering vestiges of an apartheid education are completely destroyed so as to ensure that the legislative mandate created by the current Government is effectively implemented.

During the final stages of this research project, it was brought to the attention of the researcher that "rational-choice" theory plays an important role in the choices that parents make about the education of their children. This theory was not interrogated - within the South African educational context - during this research project. In light of this, "rational-choice" theory should be considered for further analysis and within the domain of engaging the issue of universal access to primary education in future studies[2].

In addition to the national legislative framework aimed at ensuring universal access to primary education, the South African Government participates in two international initiatives aimed at ensuring universal access to primary education. A discussion on these issues will now follow.

2.4 INTERNATIONAL INITIATIVES AIMED AT UNIVERSAL ACCESS TO PRIMARY EDUCATION

The international initiatives warrant investigation since they also have the potential to positively impact upon the transformation of the educational sector in South Africa. They are Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education) and the Education for All Initiative. The next focus is on explaining what these initiatives are and

[2] The relevance of "rational-choice theory" was brought to the attention of the researcher by the anonymous external reviewer of this dissertation.

how they contribute towards universal access to primary education at an international level.

2.4.1 Millennium Development Goal Two: Universal Access to Primary Education

The United Nations (UN) Millennium Summit of 2000 was a turning point in global awareness and a determination by world leaders to combat some of the most challenging problems that spilled into the twenty-first century, resulting in the adoption of the Millennium Declaration (Sachs, 2005, 210-211). The Millennium Development Goals (MDG's) were subsequently extracted from this Declaration. The MDG's are viewed as the successor of the International Development Targets and are seen as a major force in the current practise of development, defining the goal of development cooperation activities (White and Black, 2004, 1). There are eight MDG's:

- Goal One: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger
- **Goal Two: Achieve universal primary education**
- Goal Three: Promote gender equality and empower women
- Goal Four: Reduce child mortality
- Goal Five: Improve maternal health
- Goal Six: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases
- Goal Seven: Ensure environmental sustainability
- Goal Eight: Develop a global partnership for development

The MDG's, during 2000/2001, reiterated a multifaceted approach to development and economic growth. The MDG's aimed at putting UN member-states on a trajectory that set out specific time-frames with related indicators of how to successfully gauge whether each goal would be achieved by the year 2015. Furthermore, the MDG's focus on the development aspirations of the world. The MDG's go beyond the objective of

development and touch on issues relating to human values and rights regarding the freedom from hunger, the right to basic education, and the right to health.

Taking MDG Two (universal access to primary education) into account, it is clearly stated in paragraph 19 of General Assembly Resolution 55/2 (2000): United Nations Millennium Development Goals, that UN member states (of which South Africa is a member) resolve further: "To ensure that, by the same date [2015], children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling and that girls and boys will have equal access to all levels of education."

In meeting Goal Two, the number of children attending primary school in Africa increased rapidly during the past decade - from 50 percent in 1990 to 61.2 percent in 2000. However, increased enrolment has not translated into completion rates (Economic Commission for Africa, 2005, 7). According to the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA), access to primary education was seen as the first step towards providing citizens with the necessary tools to develop as individuals and make a positive impact on society. In light of this, there has been progress made towards universal access to primary education.

The Millennium Development Goals Report (2008, 12) stated that the total net enrolment ratio in primary education for 1991, 2000 and 2006 rose from 54 percent to 58 percent to71 percent respectively. It is clearly evident that world enrolment rates have been on a steady incline.

During the opening of the 62nd Session of the United National General Assembly, in New York, April 2008, the President of the Session in his address entitled " "Recognising the

Achievements, Addressing the Challenges and Getting Back on Track to Achieve the MDG's by 2015", stated that: "On education, we have made progress since 2000. There are now 41 more million children in school; net enrolment worldwide has risen to around 87 percent; and, gender parity has already been achieved at primary level in 118 countries."

In almost all regions, the net enrolment ratio in 2006 exceeded 90 percent and many countries were close to achieving universal primary enrolment. The number of children of primary school age who were out of school fell from 103 million in 1999 to 73 million in 2006. The MDG Report for 2008 notes that this success clearly indicated that with the political will of governments and with adequate support from development partners, universal access to primary education was a reality.

Therefore, while international trends regarding enrolment ratios were positive and there had been a concerted effort especially by the developing world to ensure universal access to primary education, it should be noted that although Sub-Saharan Africa had made significant progress over the past few years, it still lagged behind other regions. A gap of 30 percent still remained (Africa and the Millennium Development Goals, 2007 Update, 1). The next focus is on the Education for All initiative.

2.4.2 The Education for All (EFA) Initiative

The World Conference on Education for All, held in Dakar, Senegal, in 2000, stressed the importance of Education for All (EFA) and by implication, prominence was given to the related universal access to primary education. Six EFA Dakar goals were adopted at the close of the Conference. These were (i) expanding and improving of early childhood care and education; **(ii) ensuring by 2015 that there was free and compulsory primary**

education of good quality; (iii) ensuring that the learning needs of young people was met via appropriate learning and life skills programmes; (iv) achieving a 50% improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015; (v) achieving gender equality in education by 2015 with a focus on ensuring girls' equal access to basic education of good quality ; and (vi) improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence (EFA Global Monitoring Report, 2005). South Africa subscribes to the Education for All initiative.

It is evident that these goals were closely related to Millennium Development Goal Two- universal access to primary education – and compliance with the one international initiative was in direct compliance with the other. Therefore, South African compliance with the two above-mentioned international initiatives complements and supports the national legislative framework already in place. These initiatives further solidify activities already underway in transforming the educational system in South Africa. The following chapter will present the research design and methodology in order to provide detailed information on the manner in which the research was undertaken.

CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The purpose of this chapter is to present, in detail, the methodology employed to undertake the research project. It focuses on the method of research, the data collection techniques and the processing of information undertaken in order to further interrogate, understand and make conclusions regarding the impact of universal access to primary education in a particular context. This chapter furthermore draws upon the experiences of the researcher during the undertaking of this investigation.

3.1 RESEARCH QUESTION AND AIMS

The research topic is "Universal Access to Primary Education: The Integration of Black Pupils into Former Indian Public Primary Schools."

The research question guiding the research project is as follows:
"What impact has universal access to primary education had on the integration of black pupils into former Indian public primary schools ?"

The specific aims of this research project are as follows:

- To examine whether universal access to primary education has led to an increase in enrolment numbers in former Indian Quintile Four Public Primary Schools in the former Indian residential suburb of Lenasia, south of Johannesburg;
- To explore whether universal access to primary education has led to pupils, currently resident in the former black townships, enrolling at former Indian Quintile Four Public Primary Schools in the former Indian residential suburb of Lenasia, south of Johannesburg;

- To understand the reasons and unintended consequences, through the views and perceptions of school principals, school teachers and black parents, as to why this migratory trend may be occurring at former Indian Quintile Four Public Primary Schools in the former Indian residential suburb of Lenasia, south of Johannesburg and;
- To investigate whether universal access to primary education has, as an unintended consequence, led to infrastructural capacity difficulties in the former Indian Quintile Four Public Primary Schools in the former Indian residential suburb of Lenasia, south of Johannesburg;

3.2 CHOOSING THE SAMPLE SCHOOLS

The sample comprised of ten public primary schools. In order to ensure consistency and accuracy in the findings, all ten schools identified by the researcher had to meet the following seven criteria:

- All the schools had to be classified as public primary schools (Grade One to Grade Seven) with state-owned properties;
- All the schools had to be classified as Quintile Four category schools i.e. financed through a combination of the Gauteng provincial education department budget and the charging of school fees;
- All the schools had to adhere to the Schools Admissions Policy in compliance with national and provincial frameworks that aimed at upholding constitutionally guaranteed rights and freedoms of children and their parents;
- All the schools had to be geographically located in the former Indian suburb of Lenasia / Lenasia South which neighbours numerous previously disadvantaged black townships including greater Soweto, Vlakfontein, Lehai, Orange Farm;

- All the schools had to be historically classified as Indian public primary schools pre-1994 and had, as a result, therefore been administered and managed by the former House of Delegates (HOD) prior to the educational transformation;
- All the schools had to have a pupil population that comprised of pupils who resided within and outside the geographic location of the suburb of Lenasia /Lenasia South and;
- All the schools, due to being former Indian-run public primary schools, had to have similar or the identical infrastructural capacity set-up.

Once the researcher identified schools in the Lenasia / Lenasia South region that met the above-mentioned seven criteria, in total, twelve school principals were telephonically contacted to consider being a sample school for the study. Ten school principals agreed to the proposal. The principal of the eleventh school indicated that he was too busy and would not be available for an interview. The twelfth school, while eager to be part of the study, had to be disqualified due to the fact that it was subsequently brought to the attention of the researcher that this was a Quintile Five (and not Quintile Four as per the set criteria above) school. Participation of this specific school ran the risk of distorting the findings of the research and the school was therefore excluded from the study.

3.3 ORGANISATION OF THE RESEARCH DURING 2008/9

It is crucial to plan an effective research design in order to lessen the chance of incorrect interpretation and causal inferences derived from the collected data. The design should facilitate the answering of questions and the testing of theories in a clear and precise manner (de Vaus, 2001). The research design should also strive for quality and excellence. The research should therefore be justified scientifically and should make a contribution to the social sciences (Smit, 1995). In light of these guiding principles, the

researcher, during early 2008, identified universal access to primary education as the area of investigation. The focus was on South Africa's implementation of and the impact of universal access to primary education. During the first quarter of 2008, the researcher concentrated on preparing the Research Proposal for submission to the University of the Witwatersrand Faculty of Humanities and the University Ethics Committee. Feedback from the university internal reviewer and the Ethics Committee regarding the Research Proposal was provided by mid-2008.

During the second and third quarters of 2008, the researcher undertook intensive document analysis focussing specifically on government activities, policies and strategies aimed at achieving universal access to primary education. During this period and as time progressed, the document analysis became more focussed on the impact that universal access to primary education was having on the schooling environment. The document analysis also began to focus primarily on key themes relating to the impact of universal access to primary education in the schooling environment. The key themes identified were: enrolment numbers and trends at a national level; migratory patterns of black pupils from former black townships into former privileged schools; the quest (by black parents) for a quality education for their children and; the impact of universal access to primary education on school infrastructural capacity. In addition two preliminary qualitative interviews were conducted with foreign affairs government officials regarding South Africa's implementation of Millennium Development Goals Two (universal access to primary education). This assisted in further refining the research topic.

During the last quarter of 2008, the researcher began writing up draft chapters of the research report that were submitted to the supervisor, intensively prepared the Interview Schedules and began a first round of interviews with school principals. During this

period, the data from the first round of interviews were analysed, interpreted and the research topic was further narrowed down. A second and more comprehensive round of interviews was undertaken with school principals and two education NGO's further into this period. A Statistical Questionnaire was also distributed to the sample schools during this period and collected before closure of the sample schools for the year-end 2008.

The first draft of the research report was submitted at the end of 2008. During early 2009, further fieldwork was undertaken which included the undertaking of qualitative interviews with school teachers and an education government official. In addition a survey on school quality perceptions was prepared and conducted on fifty black parents at a sample school on 13-14 January, the first day of the Gauteng 2009 academic school year. By mid-January 2009, the second draft of the research report was prepared taking into account the recommendations received from the first draft and the incorporation of the additional fieldwork. The second draft was reviewed and final amendments were incorporated into a third draft by early February 2009. The research report was approved by the supervisor in early February 2009, for transmission to the external examiner. This approach and timetable facilitated for the researcher to undertake the study in an orderly and systematic fashion aimed at meeting the university deadline (of 15 February 2009) for submission of the dissertation.

3.4 CHOOSING THE DATA COLLECTION METHODS

The principle aim was to effectively collect and systematically analyse the most appropriate data and empirical evidence so as to unambiguously, accurately and efficiently answer the research questions via a written report. Taking into consideration the research topic, question and aims identified above, it was decided that a qualitative paradigm would be the most suitable approach to undertake the study since "qualitative

methods can be used to uncover and understand what lies behind any phenomenon about which little is yet known." (Strauss and Corbin, 1990, 19). What this meant to the researcher, when translating this theoretical approach into a practical reality, was that experiences, knowledge, perceptions and on hand day-to-day events needed to be contextualised and put into a coherent story about universal access to primary education. The data collection methods undertaken in the various libraries at the university and fieldwork undertaken with school principals, school teachers, black parents, the education government official, the foreign affairs government officials and the CEO's of the education NGO's would all bring to life an understanding of the impact that universal access to primary education had in the social context of former Indian primary schools situated in a former Indian residential area and neighboured by former black townships. Employing a qualitative method of data collection unpacked and explained a specific social phenomenon not previously investigated in detail on this specific former Indian suburb.

The usage of a qualitative method of data collection meant that research would be undertaken via the medium of analysing documents (document analysis), engaging appropriate stakeholders (qualitative interviewing), extracting and interpreting descriptive statistics (statistical questionnaire) and understanding perceptions of a specific target audience (conducting of a survey). The objective was to ensure that an in-depth understanding of the dynamics surrounding the implementation of universal access to primary education, within the chosen context, would unfold. The key focus of the researcher was to constantly question as to whether the choice of data collection methods would firstly, answer the research question and secondly, meet the aims of the research project.

3.5 DEVELOPING THE RESEARCH METHODS AND INSTRUMENTS

Developing the research method referred to "… the manner in which the elements of the research design can be executed or implemented." (Greenstein, 2004, 2). Therefore, in order to undertake the research, the researcher chose four sources of information gathering techniques for usage in this study – namely document analysis, qualitative interviews, a statistical questionnaire and the conducting of a survey. The following sections detail the four research methods/instruments employed by the researcher. It furthermore highlights the importance of the research methods, how the research methods/instruments were developed, the experiences of the researcher in utilising the various research methods/instruments and the researchers' impressions on its success at meeting the research objectives.

3.5.1 Document Analysis

The analysis of relevant documents was the point of entry into the investigation. Document analysis expanded the researchers' knowledge on the research topic, allowed for an identification of which issues required more detailed lines of enquiry; and more importantly, guided interactions with the interview respondents to solicit the most appropriate information in order to accurately undertake the research and answer the research question. The approach was to therefore actively interrogate and scrutinize documentation related to the specific research questions/issues. During the various stages of the research conducted, the focus of the document analysis was on studying South African Government and international policies and strategies aimed at providing universal access to primary education and understanding South African experiences and challenges in reforming the primary schooling education system in a post-apartheid South Africa.

Some of the key documents used in this regard were the National Department of Education Annual Reports for the period 2000 until 2008 which provided an insight into activities undertaken by the Government aimed at universal access to primary education; the *South African Constitution of 1996* which highlighted the constitutional rights of children; the *South African Schools Act of 1996* which set out the legal framework on educating children; a host of Government Education White Papers from the 1990's that appropriately contextualised and provided greater understanding of the transformation of the South African educational landscape; the Millennium Development Goals (MDG) Reports from 2005 to 2008 that clearly elaborated on the meeting of Goal Two (universal access to primary education) in an African context; the South African MDG Country Reports for 2005 and 2007 that provided an update on South Africa's current status regarding national enrolment statistics and; the Education for All Global Monitoring Report of 2005 that contextualised and updated the importance of this initiative aimed at universal access to primary education.

Regarding more specific literature aimed at understanding the South African context and universal access to primary education, key literature (amongst others) guiding the research included books, journal articles and academic papers by Thorbecke (2006) Ranis (2004) and Sen (1999), regarding a theoretical understanding of the importance of education and development; Jansen (2008), Soudien (2007a; 2007b), Chisholm (2004), Berger (2003), Smith and Ngoma-Maema (2003), Jansen (1998), Fataar (1997), Gallie et al (1997), Motala (1995) and Soudien (1992) regarding an understanding of migratory patterns of black pupils; Bergmann (1996), Motala (1995) andLockheed and Verspoor (1994) regarding the quest for qualitative education and; Lemon (2004), Masango (1993), Hallak (1990) and Cooper (1985) regarding the importance of infrastructural capacity in the schooling environment.

The researcher found that the documents analysed during 2008 were highly relevant to the research undertaken since it contextualised and guided the investigation. With universal access to primary education being a very topical developmental issue, there was an abundance of literature available. The challenge experienced by the researcher was to ensure that the abundance of documents analysed addressed the research question. Despite the availability of numerous documents, the researcher was only able to locate limited literature on the impact of universal access to primary education on specifically former Indian public primary schools (there was more literature on the impact on former Model C (white) schools) and came to the conclusion that this research project is innovative in that it investigates a social phenomenon in a particular context that may not have previously been extensively studied. With a vast amount of knowledge gained over many months of document analysis, the researcher was well equipped to begin preparations for the qualitative interviews.

3.5.2 Qualitative Interviews

Qualitative interviews were undertaken since it was an appropriate mechanism aimed at investigating how organisations worked towards meeting their objectives (Weiss, 1995,10), how institutions and frameworks operated, how they went about achieving their goals, set targets and the challenges they were likely to encounter in this quest. This guiding principle was highly relevant regarding the investigation that was to be undertaken by the researcher. The aim of this research project was to examine how the sample schools were operating / functioning and what actions had been undertaken in order to meet the objective of complying with South African national legislation aimed at universal access to primary education. The actions undertaken by the schools to meet the targets was also explored including the challenges (as unintended consequences of

implementing universal access to primary education) experienced by the schools was traced. The researcher acknowledged that this collection of data could only be achieved via the application of qualitative interviewing - in order to gain first hand experiences and knowledge from the respondents.

Qualitative interviews were undertaken with ten school principals, five school teachers, one education government official, two foreign affairs government officials and CEO's of two education NGO's. A total of twenty-four qualitative interviews were conducted with the above-mentioned respondents. Two rounds of interviews were conducted with four principals in order to solicit more detailed and appropriate data. Nine of the ten school principals and all five of the teachers were in the teaching profession for twenty years or more. In addition, both the CEO's of the education NGO's and the education government official were previously teachers with at least 10-15 years of experience in the profession. Therefore, the majority of the respondents in this research project had a vast array of knowledge and first hand experience regarding the transformation of the South African educational system, both at a managerial and classroom level.

The aim of the interviews was to solicit a "thick description" of school principals' and school teachers' experiences, understanding and perceptions of trends regarding universal access to primary education in their schooling environment and the integration of black pupils. The purpose of a "thick description" is to extend the parameters and move beyond mere fact and surface appearance. It is rather focussed on issues regarding context, feelings, meaning, and understanding of "lived experience" (Henning, 2004, 9). This approach is further reiterated by Sherman and Webb (1988) where it is stated that qualitative research design aims at understanding experience as it is "lived" or "felt". This was clearly evident during the conducting of the interviews since the responses to

the questions were rich, detailed and highly informative, drawing on past and present professional and personal experiences in a schooling environment. Both the school principals and teachers recounted numerous anecdotes to illustrate their points. This approach allowed the researcher to also "live" the experiences and be part of the educational transformation process. As a result, the qualitative interview approach facilitated obtaining as much information and the fullest report possible on the relevant information asked. Therefore, this approach allowed for the gathering of detailed material and data for further interpretation, interrogation and analysis.

Regarding the procedure followed for the qualitative interviews, school principals (respondents) heading the sample schools were telephonically contacted to determine whether they were willing to participate as a sample school in the study. The study was briefly explained to them. Upon agreeing, an appropriate interviewing time was set up with the respondents. In some instances, follow-up interviews were undertaken with four school principals. With regard to school teacher participation in the study, the relevant school principals were contacted and requested to give their (verbal) permission allowing the researcher to undertake qualitative interviews on the school teachers. Once permission was granted, five school teachers (three at junior primary level and two at senior primary level) were identified and telephonically contacted. All five teachers contacted, agreed to be interviewed. With regard to the three government officials and the CEO's of the two education NGO's interviewed, they were telephonically contacted and asked whether they would be willing to participate in the study. Upon agreeing, appointments to interview these respondents were set up. All respondents agreed to the conditions under which the interviews were conducted (see ethical considerations below). More importantly, it was stressed to every respondent participating in this study that their identity, the identity of their schools and their specific portfolios in their organisations

would not be revealed. Confidentiality was guaranteed and it was stressed that pseudonyms would be used throughout the final report to protect their identities.

Semi-structured standardised interviews were conducted by the researcher, following the drafting of Interview Schedules for the various targeted respondents. The Interview Schedules comprised of a set of questions asked in a set order to all the respondents. The questions were posed in an opened manner, giving the respondents the leeway to answer the questions as comprehensively and extensively as they so wished. Each interview lasted on average a total of 40-45 minutes.

The Interview Schedules drafted for the school principals, school teachers and the education government official was similar **(see Appendix I and Appendix II)**. The Interview Schedules were structured in such a manner so as to obtain data on four key themes. These were:

- The first part focussed on general enrolment trends in the sample schools; investigating the linkage between the South African legislative mandate and universal access to primary education and; the monitoring mechanisms in place to track enrolment numbers at the sample schools;
- The second part focussed on understanding the reasons for increased or decreased enrolment numbers; trends regarding the movement of school-going aged children in the vicinity of the sample school; trends regarding the movement of school-going aged children attending the school from areas away from the sample school; school principal, teacher and education government official perceptions regarding these pupil migratory patterns;

- The third part focussed on perceptions regarding quality education at the sample school and; perceived challenges faced in Quintile 1,2 and 3 schools based in the former black townships;
- The fourth part focussed on the impact of enrolment numbers on the schooling environment in the sample schools; some of the main infrastructural challenges experience in the sample schools; a role for Government authorities in coping with the challenges and; whether infrastructural challenges had negatively impacted upon universal access to primary schooling.

The Interview Schedule for the CEO's of the education NGO's (and for the first interview round of four school principals) was broader and focussed on various challenges experienced in schools regarding universal access to primary education **(see Appendix III).** The Interview Schedule for the foreign affairs government officials focussed primarily on implementation of Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education) **(see Appendix IV)**.

While the researcher did not intentionally direct the participants in their answers, at times it was necessary to prompt the respondents in a non-directive, non-leading manner. This strategy was employed in order to encourage a richer, more comprehensive and thicker response to the question asked (Richardson, 1996). Henning (2004) has viewed this strategy as "guidance without interference or conversation from the interviewer" (53). It is however vital to note that this type of interaction is void from being completely neutral since it is inevitable that the researcher would introduce a bias that he/she cannot control in an attempt to obtain good qualitative information (Breakwell, Hammond and Fife-Schaw, 1998). The researcher experienced this during some of the interviews. At times when a question was posed to a respondent, the respondent did not answer the question,

began providing information that was not very relevant or misunderstood what was being asked. The researcher had to then, in a "non-directive" and "non-leading" manner ensure that the respondent became re-focussed on what was asked. The researcher employed one of the following tactics: he reiterated the question, re-phrased the question or further expanded on what was being asked. However, in doing so, the intervention by the researcher subjected the interview process to personal perceptions of the researcher regarding the issue being discussed. The researcher was very aware not to bring his personal views into the interview process or to influence the thinking of the respondent in any way. In light of this, the researcher did his best to limit his interventions following the posing of a question. While this process was not full proof, the researcher hoped that he obtained the best qualitative information he could receive. This information was further substantiated by other resourced materials and theories regarding the area of research i.e. intensive document analysis.

The experience of undertaking the qualitative interviews was at times nerve-wrecking and mentally exhausting, yet highly invigorating. Pressure was felt when the researcher had to ensure that each respondent remained interested in the interview, provided the most appropriate data, felt at ease with the researcher and was willing to construct a trustworthy working relationship. At the same time, the exposure to a schooling environment with on hand experience being shared by school principals and teachers made the interview process an enjoyable one. Gaining practical exposure to universal access to primary education and historic educational transformation in a schooling context was an unforgettable and privileged experience. The next focus of this chapter is on the research instrument that provided this study with the descriptive statistics needed to trace enrolment numbers, migratory trends and school infrastructural capacity i.e. the statistical questionnaire.

3.5.3 Statistical Questionnaire on School Demographics

At the end of the interview with specifically school principals, the respondents were presented with a school demographics questionnaire which was closed-ended, requesting specific figures and data **(see Appendix V)**. It was explained that the purpose of this document was to retrieve statistical data regarding mainly enrolments at the school; Grade One enrolments; the racial breakdown of the pupil population; where the pupils were travelling from to attend the sample school and; the infrastructural carrying capacity of the school.

Prior to formulating the school demographics questionnaire and the undertaking of the qualitative interviews, the researcher visited a school (which was not included in the study) in October 2008 to ascertain, with permission from the school principal, what type of government documentation would assist in tracing enrolment numbers, racial demographics of the pupil population, migratory patterns of pupils etc. This exercise proved very useful. It was uncovered by the researcher that the information required to undertake the research would be available at the ten sample schools. In light of this, the statistical questionnaire was accordingly formulated by the researcher.

The information requested on the statistical questionnaire was available in two official government surveys that all public schools were required, in accordance with government regulations, to complete on a yearly basis. These documents were:

- The Annual Survey which was considered as the most important source of information gathering regarding the situation at schools. The Annual Survey focused on general information on school enrolment numbers; the number of

Grade One enrolments; the racial breakdown of the pupil population; the number of educators at the school; information on the physical infrastructure at the school; home languages of the pupils etc.

- The Tenth School Day Headcount Survey which provided accurate information on school pupil population for the purposes of determining the resource allocation to the school. The Tenth School Day Headcount Survey focused on the total pupil population at the school; the number of pupils who resided in close proximity to the school they attended and; those pupils who travelled from out-lying areas to attend that specific school. The Headcount Survey also covered pupils who came from other provinces.

An attempt to trace the trends of the sample schools for the years 2008, 2004 and 2000 proved to be futile since it was explained to the researcher that school governmental regulations required schools to only keep records of the past three years i.e. until 2005. While some schools were able to trace back their records and provide statistics for 2004 and 2000, it was not consistent with all the sample schools. In order to provide the schools with ample time to search their databases and files, the statistical questionnaire was left with the respondents (school principals) for a week to ten days in order for the questionnaire to be filled out as comprehensively as possible. After this period of time had passed, the researcher returned to the sample schools to collect the statistical questionnaires.

The statistical questionnaire on school demographics proved to be a crucial research instrument required to successfully undertake the investigation on the impact of universal access to primary education in the former Indian primary schools and more specifically, on the integration of black pupils into the sample schools. From the questionnaire,

enrolment numbers since 2000 (only available in four schools) could be traced; the racial breakdown of the pupil population could be calculated; trends in the migration of black pupils from the former black townships into the former Indian public primary schools could be uncovered and; the pressures of high enrolment numbers on infrastructural carrying capacity were revealed. It was evident that this research instrument provided the descriptive statistics that formed the core and factually substantiated the arguments and conclusions drawn throughout this study. The final research instrument used to undertake this research project was equally vital since it provided the researcher with first hand data on understanding black parents' perceptions on school quality. In light of this, the survey conducted is the next area of focus.

3.5.4 Survey on School Quality Perceptions

Following the undertaking of the qualitative interviews with school principals, the school teachers and the education government official, the researcher felt that their common perceptions as to why black parents were enrolling their children in the former Indian public primary schools needed to be verified (or not) directly by the black parents themselves. In light of this, the researcher decided to undertake a survey on school quality perceptions conducted on a sample of fifty black parents. The survey was conducted over a two-day period that appropriately coincided with the re-opening of public primary schools in Gauteng on 13-14 January 2009. The first fifty black parents approached by the researcher willingly participated in the survey. The researcher realised that this was the most appropriate opportunity to meet parents enrolling their children at a sample school for the 2009 school year. One of the ten sample schools was targeted following permission granted from the school principal allowing the researcher to be present at the school on the day prior to and on the opening day in order to identify, meet and survey the targeted group of parents.

In line with the nature of the investigation being conducted, the researcher decided that the targeted sample of fifty parents had to fit the following four criteria:

- each parent surveyed had to be of African (black) origin;
- each parent had to live in a former black township neighbouring Lenasia;
- the place of residence (in the black township) had to be in close proximity to a former black public primary school and;
- each parent had to have a child enrolling in 2009 at the chosen former Indian public primary school (one of the ten sample schools) where the survey was being conducted.

The researcher had, in the interim, created a survey on school quality perceptions **(see Appendix VI)**. The survey comprised of ten statements covering five specific themes relating to the following issues:

- a general view on quality education in accessible former black and Indian public primary schools (Statements 1 and 6);
- quality education and the importance of English as a medium of instruction (Statements 3 and 8);
- quality education and the importance of school facilities and a conducive learning environment (Statements 5 and 10);
- quality education and learner achievement (Statements 2 and 7) and;
- quality education and the link to teacher qualifications (Statements 4 and 9).

Each respondent had to either agree, disagree or indicate that he/she was unsure of his/her viewpoint regarding each of the ten statements. In order to ensure that the most accurate data and findings would be gathered, the researcher decided to personally identify each

participant for the sample. He firstly introduced himself, then ascertained whether the parent fitted the above-mentioned criteria and if so, moved on to briefly explain the nature and purpose of the survey and finally, requested permission or willingness from the parent to participate in the anonymous survey. Due to the fact that the targeted sample were parents from previously disadvantageous backgrounds with English not necessarily being their mother tongue, the researcher personally completed each survey form with each respondent before moving onto the next participant. Each statement was slowly and audibly read out by the researcher to each participant who was asked to either agree, disagree or indicate if he/she was unsure of his/her viewpoint. Where further clarity or explanation was required by the participant regarding the ten statements, this was provided as comprehensively as possible by the researcher in order to ensure that each participant provided his/her most accurate perception regarding the ten statements. This action ensured that there would be no room for a parent misunderstanding any of the ten statements posed, thereby potentially opening the survey to inaccurate data collection.

Regarding perceptions on quality education offered in the former Indian primary schools, and for the purposes of answering the research question and meeting the aims of this study, the researcher was of the opinion that the survey conducted on fifty black parents was a necessary and instrumental pillar of the data collection. The conducting of the survey was an enjoyable experience. It gave the researcher further insight and understanding into the determination of black parents to find a quality education for their children. It was also a culmination of numerous months of a combination of detailed document analysis, intensive qualitative interviewing and complex descriptive statistics all coming together to make perfect sense via the findings of the survey on school quality perceptions. The survey therefore proved to be “the final piece of the puzzle” in this investigation.

Therefore, the research methods and instruments employed by the researcher where well chosen and highly appropriate in answering the research question and in meeting the aims of the study. There were, however, certain limitations noted during the undertaking of the fieldwork. This is the next focus of the chapter.

3.6 POTENTIAL LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

Discussions regarding the migratory pattern of black and Indian pupils regarding the implementation of universal access to primary education can become highly sensitive since it has the potential to uncover and confirm that black-run schools in the former black townships are not functional and are falling apart. This posed a potential problem when the researcher was conducting the survey with black parents. The researcher sensed a slight hesitancy in black parents being completely open in expressing their views on the state of education in the former black township school. While the results of the survey confirmed the findings of other data collection techniques employed in this study, there were a few black parents who refused (by means of body language, facial expressions and verbal responses) to acknowledge that there was a problem with the quality of education in the former black township schools in fear of "letting down" their heritage. A further complication of black parents not being completely forthcoming with their views may have also been due to the fact that the researcher was of Indian (and not black) origin. Further research on this topic may experience similar obstacles.

In addition, this investigation could also uncover and confirm racist tendencies, practises and perceptions of Indian parents regarding transformation in the South African schooling system. While Indian parents were not surveyed on their perceptions (this was not the purpose of this study), the school principals and school teachers interviewed were

all of Indian origin. While most of these respondents where extremely open and critical of the Indian migratory patterns noticed in their schools over the years, there were a few respondents who gave the researcher the impression that they would also be "letting down" their heritage by being too forthcoming with their views on why Indian parents placed their children in private schools. In this instance, the fact that the researcher was also of Indian origin further complicated the situation. A few of the respondents may not have wanted to be viewed in a negative light by criticising their own racial grouping taking into account the same racial profile of the researcher. Further research into Indian perceptions on school transformations may have to overcome some of these complexities.

In order to undertake this study, certain ethical procedures, in relation to the relevant stakeholders, had to be strictly abided by. The final section of this chapter presents this important issue.

3.7 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Punch (2000) highlights that the process of data collection has to not only ensure good quality data but to simultaneously deal with the issues of access and ethics (59). The aim of this investigation was to ensure that the data collection was undertaken in the most professional, transparent and objective manner. In light of this, the researcher took the utmost care in protecting the rights of the respondents – as an ethical guarantee of participation in the study. During the initial stages of this research project (June 2008), the researcher obtained ethics clearance (Clearance Certificate: Protocol Number – H080606) from the University of the Witwatersrand Human Research Ethics Committee (Non-Medical). This gave the researcher the right to conduct the research on all the relevant stakeholders, provided that all ethical procedures were stringently followed.

From the onset of the qualitative interviews, all respondents were informed that, in accordance with the University of the Witwatersrand Ethics Committee regulations, a certain amount of paper work needed to be undertaken prior to the proceeding of the interview. Firstly, a letter (from the researcher) was presented to each respondent detailing the aims of the research (**see Appendix VII**). Secondly, a Consent Form was presented for signature by both the respondent and the researcher (**see Appendix VIII**). This document set out the terms of reference for the requested engagement between both parties. It highlighted the rights of the respondent and the responsibilities of the researcher as the interviewer. Emphasis was placed upon the fact that the right to anonymity and confidentiality would be strictly upheld regarding the discussions and content of the interviews. It was explained that each school would be coded as a letter of the alphabet in the final report so as to ensure that the school (or the respondents') identity would not be revealed. Pseudonyms would be used to identify respondents throughout the final report. Thirdly, a Recording Consent Form was presented to each respondent for signature prior to the interview being tape-recorded (**see Appendix IX**). All respondents (for the twenty-four qualitative interviews conducted) complied with the ethical issues presented for their consideration.

The researcher placed a great emphasis on creating a trustworthy working relationship with each respondent in order to ensure that the information received was of a high quality, that the discussions would be frank and open and that the content and information relayed would be detailed and fully explanatory. The next chapter engages the empirical data of this study.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE EDUCATIONAL LANDSCAPE IN POST-APARTHEID PRIMARY SCHOOLING

Chapter Four contextualises and sets the scene for the research undertaken in Chapters Five and Six. The focus of this chapter is four-fold. The empirical data is engaged in detail on four specific themes relating to the dynamics of universal access to primary education. The first issue addressed is the impact that universal access to primary education has on enrolment numbers in schools. Emphasis is placed on what the current situation is in South Africa regarding primary school enrolments. The second issue examines migratory patterns of pupils in a quest for quality education in the South African context. The third focus explores the debate regarding qualitative and quantitative aspects of primary education. The final focus is on the impact that high enrolment numbers can have on infrastructural capacity in terms of delivering a good quality education.

4.1 INCREASED ENROLMENT NUMBERS IN PRIMARY SCHOOLING

This section explores South Africa's implementation of Millennium Development Goal Two and the Education for All initiative. Both these activities are geared towards South Africa meeting the targets of universal access to primary education. Statistical inferences are also made to what the current status of primary school enrolments are in South Africa.

4.1.1 South African Implementation of Millennium Development Goal Two:

Since 2000, South Africa as a member-state of the United Nations, participated in the Millennium Assembly, adopted the Millennium Declaration and pledged to implement the MDG's with the aim of achieving the targets by 2015.

Currently, the South African "score-card", according to the UN MDG Monitor Mechanism, is as follows:

Goal No.	Objective	Current Status
1	Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger	Very likely to be achieved – on track
2	**Achieve universal primary education**	**Very likely to be achieved – on track**
3	Promote gender equality and empower women	Very likely to be achieved – on track
4	Reduce child mortality	Possible to achieve if some changes are made
5	Improve maternal health	Possible to achieve if some changes are made
6	Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases	Possible to achieve if some changes are made
7	Ensure environmental sustainability	Very likely to be achieved – on track
8	Develop a global partnership for development	Very likely to be achieved – on track

Source: *United Nations MDG Monitor Mechanism – United Nations website*

This research project focuses on an investigation into meeting Goal Two (universal access to primary education) at a specific group of schools. As illustrated by the above "score-card", the United Nations evaluation indicates that South Africa is on track and likely to meet Goal Two by 2015. The 2007 MDG Mid-Term Country Report for South Africa (compiled by the South African Government) concurs with the UN evaluation for Goal Two. This position is further supported by the UN Economic Commission for Africa where South Africa is listed as one of fourteen African countries that will meet this Goal. The other African countries that are likely to achieve the target on universal

access to primary education include: Algeria, Botswana, Cape Verde, Egypt, Gabon, Mauritius, Namibia, Rwanda, Sao Tome and Principe, Seychelles, Togo, Tunisia and Zimbabwe (Economic Commission for Africa, 2005, 12). However, with the current political instability being experienced in a country like Zimbabwe, specific projections for this country may be outdated or no longer relevant. It was not possible to trace an update on Zimbabwe via the UN MDG Monitor Mechanism.

According to the General Household Survey (GHS), conducted by Statistics South Africa (StatsSA), over 98 percent of 7 to 13 year old children were attending educational institutions in South Africa in 2006. This figure reflected an increase of approximately 1 percent since 2002 (see Table One). From these statistics, the enrolment ratios for South Africa were extremely promising. Since 2002, the enrolment numbers have remained fairly constant and have ensured that the access of girl pupils to schooling remained as high as access of boy pupils to schooling.

Table One: National attendance of 7 to 13 years olds at educational institutions in South Africa, 2002 to 2006 – results expressed in percentages

	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006
Male	96.41	96.92	97.93	98.06	97.92
Female	97.05	97.87	98.53	98.37	98.42
Total	96.72	97.36	98.21	98.21	98.16

Source: *General Household Survey, Statistics SA, in SA Millennium Development Goals – Mid-Term Country Report, September 2007*

In addition to complying with Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education), South Africa is also a signatory to the Education for All initiative, the next area of focus in this chapter.

4.1.2 The Education for All (EFA) Initiative

The Education for All initiative has been viewed as a crucial and urgent issue facing developing countries like South Africa. The initiative focuses on dealing with matters regarding social justice, equity and participatory democracy. Equitable access should be viewed as equal opportunity to enter school, including having equal access to learning (Barton, 2003; Lockheed and Verspoor, 1994, 145). Education for All should therefore be viewed as a human rights approach when dealing with educational needs. Striving for equal educational opportunities was also a challenge to balance and harmonise the values of dignity, equality and freedom, to respect and accept differences in people and, in the case of South Africa, to build on its diversity (Malherbe, 2005; Barton, 2003, 57).

Inclusive educational goals like the above initiative have made a contribution to educational reform in South Africa. By subscribing to the Education for All initiative, South Africa firmly coupled its national legislative framework aimed at gearing towards universal access to primary education with international instruments like the Education for All Initiative and Millennium Development Goal Two. The combined national and international package have become an excellent term of reference in ensuing that all South African children have equitable access to good quality primary education in South Africa. The perfect scenario emerges when the overall objective is to meet this combination of national and international goals that South Africa aims to adhere to. The educational outcome is geared towards equitable access to primary schooling, the prioritisation and distribution of educational resources, increases in enrolment rates, effective and efficient school organisation and management, stronger motivation and dedication of teachers and improving on educational quality by focussing on the ways of teaching and curriculum development. This chapter will move onto the second area of

emphasis i.e. understanding the migratory patterns of black pupils in a quest for a quality education.

4.2 MIGRATORY PATTERNS OF BLACK PUPILS IN A QUEST FOR QUALITY EDUCATION

The dynamics around the quest for a quality education in South Africa can only be understood within the context of what had transpired in the former black schools in the townships during the apartheid years and the impact that this would have on the movement of children in search of a good quality education in later years. The following empirical data will also analyse some of the trends that have been noticed and researched since the 1990s. Issues to be covered will concentrate on teacher training and the impact on quality education and understanding the migratory pattern of black pupils into former privileged schools.

4.2.1 Black Education during the Apartheid Years

As part of the resistance campaign against the policies of apartheid, black schools specifically, and to a lesser extent Indian and coloured schools, had become a symbol of resistance to oppression. In the former province of Transvaal (now Gauteng), the 1976 Soweto uprisings saw its birth in the resistance movement against the education system that the minority white-led government had crafted for the majority black population.

The findings of a study was published by Motala (1995) where a random sampling method was used to select and analyse retention rates in ten primary schools with lower primary classes in Soweto for the years 1987-1990. While the focus of the study was on rates, the findings also concluded that the 1987-90 period was rife with volatile student resistance, heightened repression of student organisations and leadership, and long

periods of student boycotts from classes. At the forefront of the resistance activity was Soweto schools.

A crucial finding in the study was the strong impression that education existed within a socio-economic, political and cultural reality and that these forces continually and inevitably impacted upon the school environment. This was especially true of the education of younger children (169). Furthermore, while primary level schooling was being undertaken, the quality, efficiency and effectiveness of schooling was greatly compromised by the under-resourced and poorly funded nature of black education managed administratively by a white government. To make the schooling environment more complicated, the administration and management of the schools were in a weak state with minimal practicable rules and regulations in place, coupled with the lack of accountable teachers. The aura of a continued resistance and defiance campaign was highly prevalent.

In accordance with the general line of thinking regarding the literature to be reviewed in the next section, Motala (1995) concluded that credibility in primary schools in Soweto would only improve through systematic quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of the education system. A chief requirement at the time for this to materialise was the redistribution of education spending.

In addition, the study revealed that some of the internal challenges experienced at these schools had a direct bearing on the quality and efficiency at the schools. These factors included the low motivation and morale of teachers and the deprivation of learning environment at the level of both material resources and pedagogy. It was noted that in at

least seven of the schools researched, there was clear evidence of deprived learning and teaching environments with the absence of vital material inputs (170).

The 1976 Soweto uprising which become a watershed event in South African politics, "amongst other things, led to what became known as the breakdown of the culture of teaching and learning." (Christie, 1998, in Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003, 352).

In 1992, it was noted that "The outbreak of student revolt in the streets of Soweto, Johannesburg in 1976 heralded a crisis in the education system which has continued almost uninterrupted for fifteen years." (Soudien, 1992, 280). Soudien (1992) further remarked that vital elements that characterised the crisis in education, resulting in the lack of a legitimate educational system, included student boycotts, prioritising political freedom over education and a lack of a culture of teaching and learning. These elements were the catalysts for "anarchic tendencies" in the educational system (280-285). Twenty years following the Soweto riots, a study undertaken on Gauteng schools revealed that these types of problems continued to exist (Chrisholm and Vally, 1996, in Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003, 352).

As recently as 2003, and almost a decade after the 1994 democratic elections , it was remarked that "The challenge for the new State therefore has been to restore conditions for teaching and learning in black schools and to improve student results, especially, as measured by matric exam results." (Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003, 352). This trend had also been noted by Berger (2003) when it was stated that the effects of the South African race-based education system was very much visible, with poor schooling environments for students of all ages. It was openly stated that nowhere else were the inadequacies more evident than in the predominantly black areas (617).

Thus, the vestiges of apartheid have continued to fuel huge disparities across educational institutions and sectors. This has been highly evident in teacher education and training, administrative and governance methods, professional staff appointments, curriculum development and the effective and optimal usage of schooling facilities like libraries and laboratories. While few educational institutions have maintained a reputation of excellence, little focus and attention has been accorded to the important issues of quality, efficiency and effectiveness. New partnerships are being built in order to reform the educational system and to make the system more even (Pendlebury, 1998, 335).

Once South Africa democratised, the ANC-led government took numerous steps to improve access, equity, quality and democracy in education. Efforts to achieve equity and greater access to schooling had been linked to striving for improvements in the quality of the education. A major focus was on improving the quality of education in the black townships so as to improve the culture of learning and teaching. A key area that required addressing was the issue of teacher training to ensure a good quality education. It is at this point that the issue of teacher training requires an in-depth analysis.

4.2.2 Teacher Training and the Impact on Quality Education

The National Policy Framework for Teacher Education and Development in South Africa (2007) stated that currently, most teachers in the teaching profession received their professional education and entered teaching when the education system was an integral part of apartheid - where the approach to education was organised along racial and ethnic lines. This resulted in a highly fragmented and skewed outcome regarding the ability of teachers to effectively be equipped with undertaking the tasks of their professions. Better training and financial allocation for Colleges of Education were reserved for the former white system of education. As a result, the qualifications received by the other race

groups were not of an equally high calibre. This had a spill-over effect regarding the quality of education that could be provided in black, Indian and coloured schools in comparison to the white schools. Especially hard-hit were the former black schools across the country.

Following the democratic elections in 1994, the rationalisation of the teaching community into a single national system had become the ultimate goal. The complete transformation of the teacher training system was undertaken whereby new curricula had been introduced that required teachers to display greater professional autonomy, embrace new knowledge and skills and learn how to apply the newly acquired skills. This was an ambitious goal taking into account the previously fragmented system of training that teachers had received and the vastly different types of education systems that needed to be amalgamated.

The racial dynamics of South African society shaped the manner in which teacher rationalisation and redeployment policy actually took effect. Teachers in the better resourced parts of the education system did not move to the poorer-resourced parts of the education system. In addition, the pattern that developed suggested that good teachers tended to prefer staying in better schools and even those who may have been inclined to help a poorer school faced daunting administrative and bureaucratic procedures in order to move schools (Chisholm, 2004; Berger, 2003).

As a result, poorer provinces employed new teachers. Many of these teachers had been under or un-qualified as there is evidence that the number of unqualified teachers in the system had risen over time, rather than decreased. In a study undertaken by Chisholm

(2004), she indicated that in 2000, the percentage of under or unqualified teachers in the South African education system were higher than that recorded in 1975.

While a substantial decrease in under and un-qualified teachers was recorded by 2000 (when compared to 1994), an education system with almost a quarter of its teachers not being properly trained should be considered as inevitably having a detrimental effect on the quality of education. This was a significant observation since teacher qualifications are strongly correlated with learning outcomes. Table Two traces this trend.

Table Two: Percentage of under and un-qualified teachers between 1975-2000

Year	1975	1985	1994	2000
Under and Un-qualified teachers	11%	17%	36%	22%

Source: *Chisholm, 2004, 7 – information processed, by the researcher, into a table format for the purposes of this research project.*

A proactive government approach was to implement an active teacher redeployment policy in the immediate post-1994 period. However, this had the unintended consequences of increasing the number of unqualified teachers in the system while simultaneously facilitating for the former elite and privileged schools to maintain their quality of education via the employment of extra teachers.

Attempting to provide the underprivileged schools with better qualified teaching staff presented other challenges in the education system. By offering teachers the voluntary severance packages in the post-1994 period, the shortage of teachers was increased. The most experienced and most qualified teachers exited the teaching fraternity. At the same time, the training of teachers in the higher education system experienced financial

cutbacks which resulted in a lesser number of teachers entering the system in comparison to those taking an early retirement (Berger, 2003, 618). By 2004, there was clear evidence for attention to be focussed on teacher quality, including effective teacher education (Chisholm 2004). This was essential if the Outcomes Based Education system was to have any success (Jansen, 1998, 329).

On 23 November 2008, the Sunday Times newspaper reported that South Africa was facing a shortage of up to 94 000 by 2015. This was primarily due to a lack of proper government planning and impending AIDS related deaths that had negatively impacted upon the profession. The article also stated that at least 20 000 qualified teachers were required every year (for the past few years) in order to fill the gap of qualified teachers in the profession. It was stated that only 6 000 teachers had qualified over the past few years. This article contextualised the gravity of the problem. The next area of focus will be on understanding the migration of black pupils to the former privileged schools following the dismantling of apartheid.

4.2.3 The Migration of Black Pupils into Former Privileged Schools

It is evident that the ramification of under or un-qualified teachers in the education system, coupled with poor governance and administration and the host of other challenges facing schools, is cause for great concern. The outcome of such an occurrence has direct and negative implications for the quality of education that is being provided in some public schools in South Africa. What has been noted is that there is a substantial migration of pupils from the urban black townships moving away from the schools in their areas to schools in other areas that were previously considered as privileged schools. There is a perception that the culture of teaching and learning in these schools is very

different and is geared more towards providing a better quality education for pupils from the black townships.

Despite educational equity becoming a basic principle of the financial reformation of the education system after the ANC came into power, former black education and its schooling environment has remained inferior to white education. In addition, the poorer schools lacked the infrastructural facilities that were still enjoyed by the wealthier schools. Berger (2003) noted that by 2000, over 35 percent of all school buildings needing the most repairs were concentrated in poor, predominantly black areas.

Following the democratic elections in 1994, the governance of schools experienced a fundamental shift from a top-down management to a school-based management. The main aim was to ensure equitable access to education while at the same time improving the quality of education. The governmental management processes, policies and strategies in place have been extremely difficult to implement at school level. An attributing factor has been that this approach has not been able to effectively deal with, take into consideration and act upon the historical basis of educational management in South Africa. This is summed up well in the following statement:

"Educational planning for the creation of a singe education system based on equality and equity has to contend with a fundamentally distorted legacy." (Fataar, 1997, 341).

In the absence of progressive reformation, black schools across South Africa have continued to remain in a disadvantaged state while the schools in the predominantly white areas have thrived (Gallie et al, 1997).

A resultant migration of black student from the township schools had emerged in the post-1994 period. This argument was put forward by Gallie et al (1997) when they

concluded that "This diversity of management practises has led to the perception that white schools are better organised than black schools and to increasing numbers of black learners seeking enrolment in white schools." (462)

The trend was further confirmed by Berger (2003) who stated that "Urban black township schools, which continue to fail as wealthy blacks move out of townships or arrange for their children to commute to predominantly white schools, fared no better." (620). This pattern was re-confirmed by Soudien (2007b) when it was stated that "This situation is now replayed in every major city and town in the country. Parents have made it clear that they will stop at nothing to give their children the best education available. While good schools in the townships ….. and former coloured and Indian schools outside townships continue to attract children, the trend is for parents (whether they can afford it or not) to place their children in traditionally white schools." (77). Jansen (2008) also commented on the fact that school integration required special care due to the migration of black working class pupils from "dysfunctional township schools" into former middle class white schools.

Thus, while this trend has been noted over the past ten years, it is also important to contextualise it. The decision to send children to schools that have been set up in areas where communities have previously enjoyed a privileged background is squarely rooted in the decisions taken by their parents in a quest for a quality education for their children. This is entirely in accordance with the *Education White Paper Two: The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools (1996)* which strongly endorsed parental rights in taking decisions regarding the education of their children.

When these rights are unpacked, they place the primary responsibility for the education of the child in the hands of the parent or the guardian. Failure to comply with such a responsibility results in criminal prosecution since education, between the ages of 7 to 13, is compulsory in South Africa. In addition, parents have the right to be consulted by the state authorities regarding the form of education and to actively be part of school governance structures aimed at ensuring effective management and quality of the education to be provided. Parents have the inalienable right to choose the form of education, including the choice of language of instruction and the cultural and religious basis of the education to be provided.

Therefore, while this migratory trend has emerged, it has also taken place within the context of having equitable (and legalised) access to primary education within the framework of the legislative mandate as explained earlier in the Literature Review (Chapter Two). In order to further understand this trend, the next section of this chapter will examine the debate regarding quantitative and qualitative education i.e. the relationship between enrolment numbers and the need to provide a high quality education.

4.3 QUALITATIVE VERSUS QUANTITATIVE EDUCATION

Qualitative versus quantitative education has been a key challenge for countries striving to meet the targets of universal access to primary education. The quest for a quality education should be viewed as an unintended consequence of striving for universal access to primary education. South Africa is no exception in this regard. This section of the chapter undertakes an investigation into what is meant by good quality education. It then examines the linkage between universal access to primary education and the provision of a good quality education.

4.3.1 What is good quality education?

Any acceptable definition of universal primary education should not only consider the proportion of eligible children that can attend school, but should also focus on the nature and quality of the schooling being offered.

Achieving universal access to primary education should not simply be equated with increasing the number of school places. Instead, school engagements should be viewed as an interaction of supply, demand and engaging the learning process. In addition, the many benefits that accrued from access to primary education should also be receptive to the quality of the learning experience (Millennium Development Goals Report, 2008; Fataar, 1997; White Paper on Education and Training, 1995; Lockheed and Verspoor, 1994; Colclough, 1993).

In light of the above, crucial to the new education policies in South Africa have not only been the provision of free compulsory schooling, but also to improve the quality of schooling for all children. Quality refers to the cognitive development of the child. It also focuses on the role of education aimed at encouraging the creative and emotional development of learners, in supporting objectives of peace, citizenship and security. The aim is to promote equality and to more importantly, ensure that global and local cultural values are passed down to future generations. However, the EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005 states that the extent to which these other issues are achieved is harder to determine in comparison to cognitive development (29).

International commonality regarding quality education has been around the need for more relevance, for greater equity of access and outcome and for proper observance of individual rights. These key principles have come to guide and inform educational

content and processes. It also provides an overarching framework for the more general social goals to which education itself should contribute (EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005).

Bergmann (1996, 586) suggests that a way of understanding quality education is by viewing it as an interplay between outputs (student achievement); process (teaching/learning interactions in the classroom, curriculum); and inputs (human resources, material resources, time). A similar line of reasoning and approach to good quality education is projected by Lockheed and Verspoor (1990) (in Motala, 1995, 170-171), when they identify five key areas for action. These include (i) improving curriculum; (ii) increasing learning materials; (iii) increasing instructional time; (iv) improving teaching; and (v) increasing the learning capacity of students.

A combination of the elements used by Bergmann (1996) and Lockheed and Verspoor (1990) (in Motala, 1995, 170-171) are relevant to understanding what preconditions need to exist in order for a quality education to be achieved. There is considerable overlap between the two views making it clear that the investments put into achieving good quality education (inputs and (iv) above) need to be guided by an efficient and effective approach (process and (i); (ii) and (iii) above) aimed at ensuring that the desired outcome is achieved (output and (v) above).

The Convention on the Rights of the Child (Article 29 (1)) (1990) also addresses the issue of a quality education. The Convention focuses on the crucial impact for both the content and the process of education. The implication is that the learning experience should not simply be a means but also an end in itself, with an attached intrinsic worth. There is an emphasis on the child-centred education where the teaching processes also

promote the rights of the child. The next area of focus is on the relationship between universal access to primary education and the quest for quality education.

4.3.2 Universal Access to Primary Education and Quality Education

The debate on qualitative versus quantitative education is well summed up by the EFA Global Monitoring Report (2005, 28). The Report stated that there was a direct correlation between the achievement of universal access to primary education and the quality of education i.e. depending on how well learners were taught and how much they learnt directly impacted upon how long they remained in school and how often they attended school. In addition, parents' judgements on the quality of teaching and learning could also be a deciding factor regarding whether it was worth the time of their children and the costs for themselves. Schooling was expected to develop creativity and allow children to acquire skills, knowledge, values and attitudes required to be productive citizens. How well education achieved these outcomes was crucial to those who used the service. Thus, the issue of quality in education was difficult to ignore if the ultimate goal was to ensure that all children had access and remained in school. Soudien (2007b) notes that, in South Africa, high numbers of school drop-outs have been uncovered in the poorer rural areas. This trend is linked to the fact that while pupils may have access to schooling, the type of education being received is of a sub-standard quality (46).

The issue of good quality education and the link to universal access to primary education is not a new one. As far back as 1990, the World Declaration on Education for All, Jomtien, Thailand, noted that poor quality education needed to be improved. Quality was seen as a prerequisite for achieving the goal of equity. While the idea of quality had not fully evolved, there was general agreement that the expansion of access to education

would be insufficient for education to fully contribute towards the development of a country if the issue of quality was not addressed.

A decade later, the Dakar World Conference of Education declared that access to quality education was the right of every child. This step reaffirmed that quality was at the heart of education (EFA Global Monitoring Report, 2005, 31). Both the Jomtien Declaration and the Dakar Framework of Action in 2000 acknowledged the quality of education as the overriding element of whether education for all could be achieved.

If a detailed analysis of the Dakar Education for All goals is undertaken, it is noted that the second of the six goals commits countries to the provision of primary education "of good quality". The sixth goal strengthens this point even further by including the explicit commitment to improving all aspects of education quality aimed at achieving better learning outcomes. The key focus of a quality education is determined by a strong focus in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills (Millennium Development Goals Report, 2008; EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005, Bergmann, 1996; The UNICEF Sourcebook on Children Development in the 1990s, 1990).

A major challenge for the National Department of Education has been reducing repetition and drop-outs amongst primary school-goers. This has not been a phenomenon that has been uniquely South African. However, high repetition and drop-out rates have been recognised as a major symptom of school inefficiency and the lack of a good quality education. Thus, it was concluded that increasing efficiency and good quality education would reduce repetition and high dropout rates (Motala, 1995). While quantity versus quality was a fundamental choice for most developing countries (with South Africa being

no exception), expanding quantity or raising quality could occur at a faster rate via improvements in efficiency.

Motala (1995, 163) notes that there had been a greater emphasis on the improvement of quality aimed at ensuring greater effectiveness and efficiency. Quality, effectiveness and efficiency in schools would therefore have to be seen as interrelated concepts. In addition, retention and minimised drop-out could only be dealt with via a quantitative expansion of and qualitative improvements to primary schooling.

It is therefore concluded that primary school survival will increase through quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement in the education system. Allocation of the government education budget is crucial for this to happen. One of the fundamental challenges for primary education, especially in the developing world, is to achieve budgetary savings while simultaneously maintaining school quality and increasing efficiency (King, 1991, in Motala, 1995, 162). The *White Paper on Education and Training (1995)* clearly states that the implementation of the compulsory phase of schooling should not imply only the securing of formal attendance at school. Coupled with this, there should be a continued focus on ensuring that the material and human resources made available to schools from state funds capacitate the school to a point where an acceptable quality of learning takes place.

In addition, the socio-economic circumstances and experiences of pupils' impacts upon how quickly they learn. Important determining characteristics can include socio-economic background, health, place of residence, cultural and religious background and the amount and nature of learning (EFA Global Monitoring Report, 2005).

Within the South African historical and educational context, this becomes highly relevant. Inequalities exist among pupils, as a result of gender, disability, race and ethnicity, and HIV/AIDS status. These differences in learner characteristics require special responses i.e. more teacher attention, psychological counselling, flexibility regarding the learning needs of the pupil etc. for the specific pupils if quality is to be improved.

Education is more about an efficient process that has to be followed in order to reach effective outcomes for the benefit of society as a whole. Quality, as the heart of education, is a fundamental determinant of enrolment, retention and achievement. In light of this, service delivery of education should focus to a large degree on the qualitative aspects of education. However, while the quantitative aspects of schooling cannot and should not be ignored since quantitative expansion is highly dependant on access and compulsory education, the mere filling of primary school spaces with children would not address even quantitative objectives if no real quality education was being delivered. Thus, universal access to primary education has to go hand in hand with a good quality education (EFA Global Monitoring Report, 2005; Motala, 1995; The White Paper on Education and Training, 1995; The UNICEF Sourcebook on Children Development in the 1990s, 1990).

If the above framework is workable, then the quality of education will inevitably increase the demand for primary schooling. Therefore, quality education (or even the perception of a quality education) plays a vital role in increasing enrolment numbers and ensuring that children attend school. However, with mounted pressure on developing countries to provide education as a basic right, the quantitative aspects of education (at the expense of the qualitative aspects) have become the main focus of attention in recent years.

A good quality education operates within a framework of healthy and motivated pupils being instructed by well-trained and qualified teachers who proactively engage teaching methodologies and maximise on curriculum development within a well managed administrative system that has an adequate financial base to provide the service delivery, ensuring that there is sufficient text books and instructional materials. In addition, the framework needs to also be characteristic of a decent environment for learning where the physical facilities are of an acceptable level. An acceptable level would operationalise the learning environment with basic furniture, adequate classrooms, a school library, proper water and sanitation facilities, workable laboratories and facilities for recreational activities to be maximised in the school curriculum. The next and final focus of this chapter will be on the linkages between universal access to primary education, enrolment trends and the physical infrastructural capacity at schools.

4.4 INFRASTRUCTURAL CAPACITY AND ENROLMENT NUMBERS

Higher enrolment numbers in schools results from compliance with targets aimed at universal access to primary education. As an unintended consequence of striving for universal access to primary education, the infrastructural capacity of schools bear the brunt of this transformation in the education sector in South Africa. The final section of this chapter will examine the link between infrastructural development and universal access to primary education including the identification of priority areas in infrastructural development in the schooling environment. This will be followed by a focus on the relationship between school facilities, learner attendance and academic achievement. The final focus of this section is on contextualising infrastructural development within the South African schooling system.

4.4.1 Infrastructural Development and Universal Access to Primary Education

Educational policies are virtually unanimous in their goal of achieving universal primary education. With regard to the linkage with infrastructural development, it is therefore crucial that buildings be constructed if the right to education as stipulated in the *South African Constitution (1996)*, the *South African Schools Act (1996)*, the Education for All initiative and the targets of MDG Two (universal access to primary education) is to be achieved by 2015.

However, schools, for which capital investment is generally reserved, notoriously suffer from a lack of government funding. Financing should be set aside for: (i) the expansion of existing schools to meet enrolment increases and in particular for increased access of girls to education – a key element in realising MDG Two; (ii) rehabilitation of existing school facilities; and (iii) the replacement of old and unusable school furniture and equipment (Hallak, 1990, 204-205). The role of the state becomes crucial in this process. The next focus is on the identification of priority areas in infrastructural development within the schooling environment.

4.4.2 Priority Areas in Infrastructural Development

The implementation of an effective education system in South Africa and elsewhere in the world is highly dependant on the effective provision of the necessary physical resources, specifically, the availability of laboratories, audio-visual equipment of different types, a library and reference books. These are preconditions and necessary for the proper implementation of new programmes (Masango, 1993).

Within the South African schooling system, some of the key infrastructural development issues that need to take priority are the need for extra classrooms and ensuring that there

are sufficient toilet and sanitation facilities in schools. With regard to the former issue, a correlation exists between the provision of additional classrooms and the employment of more teachers despite most provincial budgets not being able to accommodate the resulting additional human resource costs. As a result of this, during the 1990's in South Africa, it was advised that provincial education departments proceed with caution and re-calculate the need for additional classrooms once regulations and compensatory measures were introduced to reduce under-and over enrolment in schools (Masango, 1993, 28). More importantly, a greater number of classrooms in schools would facilitate for more effective implementation of the Outcomes Based Education system and ease teacher-pupil ratios.

In the South African context, it is noted that schools in rural areas and in informal settlements should be prioritised in terms of the provision of basic facilities such as toilets (Masango, 1993, 29). While prioritisation on rural schools is justified, it should be noted that due to rapid urbanisation, there are high enrolment numbers in urban schools. Some of these schools were not built for such high carrying capacity numbers. As a result, the need for more toilet and sanitation facilities becomes urgent in these schools as well.

Taking the South Africa educational landscape into consideration, it should be noted that decentralisation plays an important role in managing an effective school infrastructural development programme. The focus would be on those schools with the capacity to do more for themselves, such as procurement of classroom material and supplies, maintenance of buildings, supervision of in-service teacher education and performance incentives to actually take the initiative. The more that these become school-level management responsibilities, the more the resources can be concentrated on disadvantaged schools to ensure their overall infrastructural development (Lemon, 2004,

289). The importance of school facilities linked to learner attendance and academic achievement is vital when engaging the issue of universal access to primary education. This issue is further discussed in the next section of this chapter.

4.4.3 School Facilities, Learner Attendance and Academic Achievement

While there is debate on inputs that affect the teaching and learning process, it cannot be denied that the availability of physical resources in a school provides an environment that enhances the effectiveness of the teaching and learning process. It is therefore crucial that governments provide adequate physical infrastructure to all schools. This is of paramount importance when taking into consideration the historical legacy and importance of educational transformation for the future development of South Africa.

This point can be further illustrated by Cooper (1985, 253-4) who acknowledged that what made a school good was not the building of the school, but the work that went into it. While a good building did not necessarily mean a good school, it was difficult for teachers or children to give their best unless educational administrators made it possible for them to do their work in reasonably comfortable surroundings. Thus, adequate school buildings provided a conducive environment and appropriate physical settings in which teaching and learning took place. Physical settings dictated how the teaching and learning actually took place while the design of the building focused on the environment.

In the review of educational literature (Lemon, 2004; Mwamwenda and Mwanwenda, 1987; Cooper, 1985), it is frequently argued that the quality of education is dependant on a variety of factors – some of which are availability of classrooms, furniture, equipment and textbooks. Studies (Heyneman, 1980 in Mwamwenda and Mwamwenda, 1987, 226) in both developed and developing countries have shown that such infrastructural factors

contributed towards the achievement of students. Studies in developed and developing countries indicated that students in developing countries performed well below those of developed countries because of poor and inadequate school facilities. This research was undertaken within the context of Malawi and Botswana. In terms of quality education, it was concluded that the gap between high income and low income countries was growing wider and wider so that the more children went to school in the developing countries, the less they were able to benefit from the educational system - given the fact that the little that was available had to be shared by so many pupils – be it books, teachers, or whatever facilities were available (Mwamwenda and Mwamwenda, 1987, 226).

Heyneman (1980, in Mwamwenda and Mwamwenda, 1987) has indicated that the importance of school facilities such as books, furniture and classrooms for the quality of education and for academic achievement was crucial. It was agreed that one of the reasons why pupils' performance in science, mathematics and languages in developing countries was inferior to the performance of pupils in the West was due to the lack of adequate school facilities. However, it has been contested that such provision has very little impact on academic achievement. It was this difference in views that resulted in Mwamwenda and Mwanwenda, (1987, 233-234), investigating the relationship between academic achievement and the availability of books, furniture, classrooms in the context of Botswana.

Their findings revealed that, regarding the availability of classrooms, statistical analysis showed that pupils who belonged to schools with adequate classrooms performed slightly better than pupils who did not have enough classrooms. This held true in their overall performance, relating to mathematics and social studies. It was also concluded that the availability of desks and seats produced a statistically positive performance in the overall

academic results of the pupils (Mwamwenda and Mwamwenda, 1987, 234). It can therefore be argued that the evidence was in favour of a positive relationship between academic achievement and the availability of classrooms, furniture and other infrastructural requirements. Physical facilities were a good predictor of academic achievement. Thus the quality of education and academic excellence was directly related to the availability of classrooms so that the intellectual ability of the pupil could develop.

Finally, another angle of the importance of infrastructural development for good quality education needed to be considered. Cooper (1985) contended that teachers may judge a particular environment or specific features of it as inadequate. Due to the fact that teachers may make some connection between the environment and education, they may consider such inadequacies to be disabling. The belief of teachers that physical environments had the ability of disabling education could prove to be self-fulfilling. It could act to lower their morale and motivation so as to erode their commitment to teaching. This line of thinking was also expressed by Kaul (2001) who stated that an important area of concern in primary education was its poor quality reflected in a lack of infrastructure and indifferent teaching which had also resulted in low achievement levels amongst children. Multi-grade teaching in classrooms and inadequate facilities in schools were, to a large extent, responsible for such a situation. In order to fully understand the challenges of infrastructural development in the South African context, the final part of this chapter will focus on contextualising this key educational challenge.

4.4.4 Contextualisation of South African School Infrastructural Development

The supply of physical resources to schools in South Africa is linked to the historical development of the country, which allocated social services to blacks and whites on a differential basis in line with apartheid policies. It was noted that unequal spending on

black and white societies remained at the source of previous educational inequalities in South Africa. In the past, the provisioning of resources to schools favoured the schools that were initially earmarked for whites (Masango, 1993, p. 9).

This trend had resulted in the lack of a coherent infrastructure development programme and inadequate financial, physical and human resources in the South African education system. The outcome had stifled teaching and learning and made it unduly ineffective.

A critical element that had contributed to dealing with infrastructural development in the South African education system post-1994 has been the setting up of the School Register of Needs (SRN). The SRN Survey was conducted in 1996 and was the first of its kind in the history of education in South Africa. It marked a decisive departure from the apartheid education planning, which aimed at hiding the wide inequalities and disparities of education in South Africa (School Register of Needs Survey 2002, i).

It was the first database that included every school in the country, including geographic location, condition of buildings and the facilities available. The Register proved to be an invaluable tool in the democratic government's drive to accelerate the delivery of electrification, water, sanitation and telecommunications provision in the schooling sector. However, with the huge backlog in dealing with historical inequalities in schools, numerous schools in need of infrastructural development were not prioritised and as a result have had to compromise the quality of education delivery in order to cope with the high enrolment numbers in schools. As a solution to the lack of classrooms, upgrading existing school facilities aimed at creating additional space could be a viable option. Building more schools has been viewed as an obvious and necessary means to increase the numbers of school places. Yet the persistent disparity in school attendance among

groups of children means that the location of new schools should be carefully mapped out before any construction could begin (Lockheed and Verspoor, 1994**,** 154).

Therefore, effective infrastructural development in schools was vitally important to ensure universal access to primary education. However, while the *South African Constitution (1996)* entrenches the right of education for every child and corresponding South African laws facilitate the exercise of this right, infrastructural challenges continue to plague schools. As a result of high enrolment numbers, there are not enough classrooms, toilets and specialist laboratories to cater for the number of children entering the schooling system. Equally important is the impact that a lack of infrastructural capacity can have on the delivery of a good quality education and the Outcomes Based Education system.

Chapter Four has contextualised the rest of this research project. Chapters Five and Six will apply the empirical data presented in this chapter to the research/fieldwork undertaken in this study. The issues raised in this chapter will be engaged with the fieldwork undertaken and presented in logical arguments. Interpretations on the impact of universal access to primary education (Chapter Five) and its unintended consequences (Chapter Six) will be drawn from this process.

CHAPTER FIVE

THE IMPACT OF UNIVERSAL ACCESS TO PRIMARY EDUCATION

Chapter Five focuses on the impact that universal access to primary education has in the South African educational context. This research project specifically explores this relationship in the context of former Indian public primary schools in a specific former Indian residential area (Lenasia / Lenasia South) neighboured by a specific former black township (greater Soweto). Two issues are addressed in this chapter. These are: firstly, investigating the impact that universal access to primary education has had on enrolment numbers and; secondly, understanding to what extent the migration of black pupils from the former black townships into Lenasia-based primary schools has occurred.

5.1 INCREASED ENROLMENT NUMBERS

The emphasis is on examining the impact that universal access to primary education, as supported by the South African legislative framework, has had on overall enrolment numbers in the ten sample schools. Trends regarding enrolment numbers specifically related to Grade One enrolments are also traced since this is the inception stage into formal mainstream schooling and is an important determinant regarding the success rate of universal access to primary education. In addition, the linkage between the South African national and international legislative framework and enrolment numbers is explored, including report-back and monitoring mechanisms in place to track enrolment numbers. Interpretations and conclusions are drawn from the descriptive statistics (statistical questionnaire) provided, the data extracted from the qualitative interviews undertaken and the presentation of the empirical data in the preceding chapter (Chapter Four).

5.1.1 Overall Trends in Enrolment Numbers:

The point of entry into the study was to uncover the overall trends in enrolment numbers in the ten sampled schools. The schools were able to provide total enrolment numbers for both 2004 and 2008. The ten sampled schools jointly had an enrolment number of 9 249 pupils for 2008. It is clear that there has been an increase in the number of enrolments at the sample schools since 2004. While School J may have had a decrease in the number of enrolments in the two years chosen for analysis (i.e. a lesser number of pupils in 2008 as compared to 2004), the nine other schools had clear increases in enrolment rates. As a result, the overall average increase in total enrolments was 4.3 percent between 2004 and 2008. This increase accounted for an additional 398 children spread over the ten schools. Table Three (below) provides an overview of the total number of pupils enrolled at the ten sample schools during the years 2004 and 2008, including the percentage increase or decrease per school.

Table Three: Total Pupil Enrolments of ten Sample Schools for 2004 and 2008

School	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	Total
2008	857	921	1193	937	910	939	792	901	966	833	9249
2004	843	880	1189	897	889	926	708	863	812	844	8851
% increase or decrease	1.6	4.4	0.3	4.2	2.3	1.3	10.6	4.2	15.9	-1.3	4.3

The above calculation concurs with the information provided during the qualitative interviews where nine of the school principals (respondents) indicated that there had been a definite increase in the number of enrolments at their schools. While the 2000's may not have seen a dramatic increase in comparison to the immediate post-1994 period, a regular increase in the number of children was noted at the schools. All the school

teachers interviewed also confirmed that there had been a definite increase in the number of enrolments in the Lenasia schools over the past decade or more. *"Schools have changed dramatically aimed at dealing with the Constitution and free access to schooling for all children."* (School Principal A). Teacher One also stated that: *"The education system is based on the Constitution at the moment, so the constitutional principles are being related to the schools."* While some of the increases were substantial, the principals of Schools G and J mentioned that the increases were slight at their schools in the recent years. Over the years, the number of pupils had increased and as a result, school facilities had to be compromised in order to prioritise on exposing children to the school environment. *"The schools had therefore compromised in terms of facilities to get pupils into a classroom environment."* (School Principal B). Prioritisation was accorded to complying with the radically transformed South African legislative framework, regardless of the existing challenges inherited from the historically skewed educational system.

The Principal of School D indicated that in his school there was a decrease in the enrolment numbers by the end of the 1990s/early 2000s. This was largely due to school infrastructural capacity problems that resulted in a decrease in numbers. However, the numbers had remained consistent ever since. School Principal H stated that: *"Parents are aware of the compulsory age. As a result of this and media exposure, the right to education is a must. As a result, you definitely see an increase in enrolment numbers."* In addition, "*Media coverage is such that every parent is aware of what is happening regarding the rights of the child and the importance of schooling whether the child can afford the school fees or not. It's our baby then, no matter where the children are coming from, we have to accommodate them."* (Teacher Two). Therefore, it is evident that

increased enrolment numbers can also be linked to greater awareness of parents regarding the legal rights of their children and subsequently acting upon them.

In order to confirm a pattern of increased enrolments in the ten sample schools, statistics were requested for enrolment numbers in the year 2000. Only four of the ten sample schools were able to trace their enrolment numbers for the year 2000 – as explained in Chapter Three, due to departmental regulations, the schools were not obliged to keep records beyond the previous three years (i.e. 2005). Therefore, increases/decreases in pupil enrolment numbers in Schools A, E, F and I (i.e. the schools that provided enrolment numbers for the year 2000) for the years 2000, 2004 and 2008 was traced.

This was done in order to have some insight into enrolment numbers since the adoption of Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education) in 2000 and to verify that enrolment numbers had actually increased over a longer period than just from 2004. Here again, it was clear that enrolment numbers were on the increase. For the four sample schools analysed, it was evident that between 2000 and 2004 there was a 3.1 percent increase in enrolments. The overall increase in enrolment numbers between 2000 and 2008 stood at 8.5 percent (see Table Four).

Therefore an increase in overall primary school enrolment numbers in four of the sample schools since 2000 could be confirmed. More importantly, it could be assumed that the same trend occurred in the six other sample schools.

Table Four: Total Pupil Enrolments of four Sample Schools for 2000, 2004 and 2008

School	2000	2004	2008	Total
A	813	843	857	2513
E	889	889	910	2688
F	886	926	939	2751
I	772	812	966	2550
Total	3360	3470	3672	10502
% increase from 2000	-	3.1	8.5	-

Thus, to sum up, Tables Three and Four clearly illustrate that effective implementation of the South African legislative framework, geared towards the transformation of the South African educational system, have resulted in an increase in the number of pupil enrolments in the sampled schools. It could be deduced that adherence to the South African national legislative framework has played a role in ensuring universal access to primary education was being implemented in the ten sample schools. The trends in the ten schools regarding increased enrolment numbers was in keeping with the national increases in enrolment numbers across the country. The South African Millennium Development Goals – Mid-Term Country Report of September 2007 indicated that 98.16 percent of primary school-going age were attending primary school. The Report clearly illustrated a steady increase in the numbers of primary school enrolments since 2002. From the above data collected, it was evident that this trend had also filtered down to the ten sample schools. The next focus is on tracing the enrolment numbers for Grade One pupils.

5.1.2 Trends in Grade One Enrolment Numbers

A major emphasis and success factor of universal access to primary education is facilitating access to education for six-year old children beginning their primary school career. The access of six-year children to schooling is crucial for promoting universal access to primary education since it facilitates the access of children into a mainstream educational system. Therefore, to further verify the findings of increased enrolment numbers in the ten sample schools, the research further traced enrolment numbers for Grade One pupils in the ten schools that fall within this age group. While only two schools noted a slight decrease (one or two pupils less) and one school noted neither an increase nor decrease in Grade One enrolment numbers, the remaining seven schools noted definite increases in Grade One enrolments between 2004 and 2008. The overall increase was 9.8 percent. Notable increases were recorded in Schools G, I and J (see Table Five).

Table Five: Total Pupil Enrolments of Grade One for 2004 and 2008

School	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	Total
2008	119	128	162	133	130	116	120	115	162	123	1308
2004	120	120	164	120	130	122	95	104	122	82	1179
% increase or decrease	-0.8	6.2	-1.2	9.7	0.0	3.4	20.8	9.5	24.6	33.3	9.8

With the overall increase in enrolment numbers between 2004 and 2008 pegged at 4.3 percent (see Table Three) in the ten sample schools, it was evident that Grade One level enrolments account for a substantial number of overall new enrolments since the increase in enrolment numbers specifically for Grade One was pegged at 9.8 percent for the same

period. This illustrated an extremely positive trend since the sample schools had prioritised on access of six year-olds to schooling.

In order to confirm a pattern of increased Grade One enrolments in the ten sample schools, statistics were requested for Grade One enrolment numbers in the year 2000. Again, only four of the ten sample schools were able to trace their Grade One enrolment numbers for the year 2000 for reasons explained earlier. Therefore, increases/decreases in Grade One enrolment numbers in Schools A, E, F and I (i.e. the schools that provided Grade One enrolment numbers for the year 2000) for the years 2000, 2004 and 2008 was traced.

This was done in order to verify that Grade One enrolment numbers had actually increased over a longer period than just from 2004 and to ascertain whether there was effective implementation of the education policies that facilitated access of six-year old children into formal schooling. Here again, it was clear that Grade One enrolment numbers were on the increase. There was an increase of 16.5 percent in enrolments for Grade One in the four sample schools between 2000 and 2004. The overall increase in Grade One enrolment numbers between 2000 and 2008 stood at an impressive 21.8 percent (see Table Six).

It was therefore confirmed that there definitely was an increase in overall Grade One primary school enrolment numbers in the four sample schools since 2000. More importantly, it could be assumed that the same trend occurred in the six other sample schools.

Table Six: Total Pupil Enrolments of Grade One in four Sample Schools for 2000, 2004 and 2008

School	2000	2004	2008	Total
A	81	120	119	320
E	128	130	130	388
F	123	122	116	361
I	80	122	162	364
Total	412	494	527	1433
% increase from 2000	-	16.5	21.8	-

With the overall increase in enrolment numbers between 2000 and 2008 pegged at 8.5 percent (Table Four) in the four sample schools, it was evident that Grade One level enrolments accounted for a much higher number of overall new enrolments since the increase in enrolment numbers specifically for Grade One was pegged at 21.8 percent for the same period. This illustrated an extremely positive trend since the four sample schools had prioritised on access of six-year olds to schooling.

Thus, Tables Five and Six illustrate a positive trend with increases in six-year old children having access to primary schooling. It is evident that over the years, the sampled schools have gradually accommodated more Grade One pupils, thereby making a valuable contribution towards universal access to primary education. This trend also demonstrates that increased enrolment numbers in Grade One is a valuable mechanism to increase and facilitate the access of children to formal mainstream schooling.

The qualitative interviews also confirmed that there had been an increase in overall enrolment numbers and specifically Grade One enrolment numbers at the sample schools. From discussions with all the principals and three of the five teachers who teach in the

Foundation Phase (which includes Grade One), it was evident that the trend that emerged was that primary school enrolments experienced a dramatic increase in the immediate post-1994 period with the adoption of the new *South African Constitution (1996)* where the rights of the child to education became paramount.

In addition, the *South African Schools Act No. 84 of 1996* has played an effective role in terms of ensuring that there was compliance with universal access to primary education. The Act stipulated that primary schooling would be compulsory and non compliance was viewed as a criminal offence in South Africa. Thus, legislating compulsory education further encouraged and contributed to higher levels of attendance at the sample schools. *The White Paper on Education and Training (1995)* also had a role to play in increasing enrolment numbers. While there were increases in enrolment numbers recorded during the past eight years, the increases were less, in comparison to the second half of the 1990s. The next section examines the relationship between enrolment numbers and South African national legislation and international initiatives.

5.1.3 South African National Legislation / International Initiatives and Enrolment Numbers

The research undertaken also ascertained the impact that the South African national legislative framework and South African compliance with MDG Two (universal access to primary education) and the Education for All initiative had on enrolment numbers in sampled schools. There were divergent responses received from the respondents regarding this issue.

There was a group of school principals (four respondents - Principals from Schools A, H, I and J) and school teachers (Teachers One, Two and Five) who strongly felt that the

South African and international legal framework had played a fundamental role in increasing school enrolment numbers. It was felt that since 1995, the schooling environment had changed dramatically in favour of implementing the Constitution and the objectives of free and equitable access to schooling. There was a feeling that parents were fully aware of the South African legislation relating to education and the rights of children via exposure to the media. The National and Provincial Departments of Education awareness campaigns on school admissions had also made it possible for learners from the rural areas and other provinces to gain access to schooling in Gauteng.

Another group of school principals (five respondents – Principals from Schools C, D, E, F and G) and school teachers (Teachers Three and Four) were not entirely convinced that the South African legislative framework and especially the international initiatives such as Millennium Development Goal Two and Education for All were the primary drivers of increased enrolment numbers. It was felt that schools were "*going on with their business as usual*." (School Principal G). It was noted that rapid urbanisation and related societal dynamics in a post-apartheid South Africa had played a crucial role in increased enrolment numbers rather than implementation of policies and strategies. Teacher Three indicated that: *"……. what is often put down on paper is not met at a practical level……Prior to 1994, lots of black children stayed in the farm and rural areas. After 1994, lots of them have moved with their parents. This is why the schools are so full."* In addition, increased enrolment numbers was more about "*parents wanting a quality education for their children*." (School Principal F).

In addition, it was felt that enrolments had been on the increase long before the adoption of the international initiatives. These international initiatives were seen as merely adding more vigour to a trend that had already been ongoing. *"The main aim has been to ensure*

that a child is entitled to a good education. So they have not been influenced so much by the MDG's. It is additional to what is an ongoing trend." (School Principal C). School Principal E summed the situation up by stating that increases in enrolment numbers had *"...more to do with service delivery rather than aspiring to certain international goals and objectives."*

The remaining respondent (School Principal B) was of the opinion that while schools may have wanted to adhere to the education legislation of South Africa and the international initiatives of the Millennium Development Goals and Education for All, the reality of the situation was that there were severe restrictions placed on schools in terms of not being able to accommodate all children who sought to exercise their right to education. Some of the restrictions were the lack of infrastructure, skewed staff establishments and inadequate funding for schools (School Principal B). *"So, even though they may wish to implement these initiatives, laws and the Constitution, there are severe restrictions in these schools. By and large they call this the refugee camp because we just take kids from everywhere."* (School Principal B).

Thus, the national legislative framework upholding education as the basic right of the child, rapid urbanisation and the related consequences on societal change in the Lenasia region were all considered as the main contributing factors that played a role in increasing enrolment numbers. Interestingly, Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education) and the "Education for All" initiatives were not given much prominence or importance as to why enrolment levels had increased in the sample schools. These international initiatives were merely seen, by school principals, as adding more strength to a process that had long been ongoing. There was a definite sense that, regardless of the international targets, the South African educational climate in a

post-1994 era and rapid urbanisation following the dismantling of apartheid was and would continue to be the overriding reason for increased enrolment numbers. Even if the sample schools intended to further comply with national regulations and international targets aimed at universal access to primary education, financially and infrastructurally, schools were ill equipped to increase enrolment numbers any further.

Thus, while the South African government authorities may have coupled its national legislative framework aimed at gearing towards universal access to primary education with international instruments like the Education for All Initiative and Millennium Development Goal Two, meeting the targets of the international objectives were not the primary concern in the sampled schools. These activities were only met by way of meeting the politically charged requirements of the national legislation aimed at educational reform in South Africa and coping with the impact that newly found freedom of movement had on societal transformations. The last focus in this section investigates the report back and monitoring mechanisms in place to track enrolment numbers.

5.1.4 Report-back and Monitoring Mechanisms on Enrolment Numbers

This process was guided by the School Admissions Policy and the admissions register and admission forms. During the qualitative interviews with the school principals, all respondents made reference to two important documents aimed at monitoring the enrolment numbers. These were the Tenth Day Headcount Survey and the Annual Survey conducted at every public school. School Principals B and H highlighted that the South African Schools Administration and Management System (SA SAMS) was currently being piloted in schools and was linked to a national learner base. This meant that every learner in every school country-wide would soon be in the data-base.

There was a sense by five of the Respondents (School Principals) that feedback regarding enrolment numbers and trends for the Lenasia area was lacking by the provincial Department of Education i.e. the above-mentioned surveys were completed and processed to the relevant authorities but the schools were not informed as to how the information was processed and used. There was no evidence as to what the information was being used for. On the other hand, the other respondents (School Principals) felt that they did receive some feedback on enrolment trends etc. These five respondents stated that the Department used the statistics provided to track how full the schools actually were so as to ensure that all children had a place at a school, including determining the financial allocation and the staff (educator) numbers i.e. the post establishment for the year.

It should be noted that effective report-back and monitoring of the trends regarding enrolment numbers is vitally important to guide the process of universal access to primary education. It facilitates vigilance in ensuring that the basic rights of children to education is respected and upheld within society and serves as a "watch-dog" to ensure that national legislative frameworks are being adhered to.

In light of the above data collection, analysis and interpretation of the findings, it can be confirmed that that since there was a national increase in enrolment numbers over the past years and since South Africa was on track to meet Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education), overall and Grade One enrolment numbers specifically in the Lenasia sample schools had also increased. However, while trends in enrolment numbers had increased nationally, there was still the concern raised that while emphasis had been placed on the right and access to education, the quality of education

still required some attention (Berger 2003). The issue of quality education will be discussed in the following chapter.

This study has investigated and confirmed that enrolment numbers in the sample public primary schools in the former Indian township of Lenasia have dramatically increased since 2000. This chapter will now move on to address the issue of whether successfully implementing universal access to primary education, with higher enrolment numbers, has resulted in the migration of black pupils from neighbouring black townships (greater Soweto) into the Lenasia-based sample schools.

5.2 MIGRATION OF BLACK PUPILS

The focus is on examining the racial breakdown of pupil enrolments in the ten sample schools as a means to understanding the degree to which the migration of black pupils from the black townships neighbouring the predominantly Indian township of Lenasia has taken place. The investigation further explores the distinction between the numbers of pupils living in close proximity to the sampled schools as opposed to the numbers of pupils who travel from the black townships to attend the sampled schools in Lenasia. This section then explores and explains black and Indian pupil migratory patterns. Interpretations and conclusions are drawn from the descriptive statistics (statistical questionnaire) provided, the data extracted from the qualitative interviews undertaken and the literature presenting the empirical data in the preceding chapter (Chapter Four).

5.2.1 Racial Breakdown of Pupil Enrolments

In order to understand the dynamics around the increased numbers of enrolments in the sample schools and more specifically where the pupils were coming from, it was essential to understand the racial breakdown of the pupil population in the ten sample schools.

Since Lenasia is a predominantly Indian residential area, the assumption is that the majority of the pupils attending the sampled schools would be of Indian origin since they live in close proximity to the schools. A corresponding assumption would be that the black pupils would attend schools closer to their homes in the neighbouring black townships. In order to verify this assumption, the racial breakdown of the pupil population in the ten sample schools was traced. The results negated the above assumption by illustrating that an overwhelming majority of black pupils - 82.25 percent (of a total of 9249 pupils) - made up the total school population in the ten sampled schools for 2008. The range of approximately 80 percent and above of black pupils was consistent in nine of the ten sample schools. In one sample school, there was a 97.16 percent intake of black pupils (see Table Seven). The black pupil population in the ten sample schools was a relatively high number taking into account that all the sample schools were geographically located in a historically declared Indian township with a predominantly Indian-based community.

Indian pupils comprised 15.67 percent of the total population with coloured and white pupils jointly only comprising 2.05 percent (see Table Seven). While on the one hand, black enrolment numbers had been extremely high, on the other hand, the number of Indian enrolments tended to be relatively low for public schools that were situated in a former Indian township. Therefore, through attempting to establish the number of black pupil enrolments at the sample schools, it was also revealed that over the past few years, there had been an exodus of Indian pupils from the formerly Indian only schools to private schools recently set-up in Lenasia – hence, the low number of Indian pupils enrolling in the sampled schools. *"With the influx of children from Soweto etc, you find that certain schools in the Lenasia region have become predominantly African with the result that the Indian ratio has dropped."* (School Principal A). In addition, Mr X, an

education government official, stated that: *"Something very, very interesting happened. When we started administering the [Lenasia] schools in 1995, those were Indian schools. We were expecting most of the children there to be Indian. But what was surprising, immediately when black parents now had access and now applied for space for their children in the Indian community, at the same time we saw another movement. The Indian parents were now moving their children out of Lenasia either to Model C schools or to private schools. But, that also is part and parcel of the system."* The details, reasons and explanations regarding this social dynamic are dealt with towards the end of this chapter.

Table Seven: Total Pupils Enrolments as per racial breakdown for 2008 – results expressed in percentages

School	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	Total
Black	93.3	82.0	50.8	88.8	83.4	97.6	81.1	78.1	88.0	79.4	82.25
Indian	6.3	15.2	45.2	8.0	13.2	1.5	18.8	20.7	10.8	17.0	15.67
Coloured	0.4	2.7	4.0	3.2	3.1	0.9	0.1	1.2	1.2	3.6	2.04
White	-	0.1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.01
Other	-	-	-	-	0.3	-	-	-	-	-	0.03
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

The next focus of this chapter is on investigating the residential proximity of pupils to the schools that they attend.

5.2.2 Residential Proximity of Pupils to Schools

In order to obtain a clearer picture as to what proportion of black pupils were travelling from the neighbouring black townships to attend the sampled former Indian schools, the

proximity of the pupils' residences to the geographic location of the school they attended was traced. While the black pupil population may have been high in the sampled schools (82.25 percent), it could not be taken for granted that all the black pupils were from neighbouring black townships and not Lenasia-based. The result indicated that 59.01 percent of the pupils attending the sampled schools travelled from outside of Lenasia to attend school. The remainder (40.99 percent) of the pupils were Lenasia-based and therefore lived in close proximity to the school that they attended (see Table Eight).

School Principals indicated that the pupil population at the sampled schools was made up of pupils residing in the following areas that neighboured the historically Indian township of Lenasia - Soweto, Protea Glen, Protea North, Protea South, Zuurbekom, Lawley, Lehai, Vlakfontein, Orange Farm, Primrose, Showelo, Dobsonville and Waterworks. *"I one day drove my car to the entrance of Lenasia. I counted 38 busses and 8 double-deckers. I do not know how many cars, how many taxis are taking children."* (Mr X, education government official).

The 59.01 percent of pupils coming from outside of Lenasia was substantially lower than the overall number of black pupil enrolments (82.25 percent) in the ten schools (see Table Seven). Two specific reasons can be identified for this observation. These were (i) Sample Schools C and J was geographically located in poorer socio-economic areas in Lenasia. As a result, Indian enrolments were higher in these schools since the Indian parents living in close proximity to these schools could not afford to send their children to private schools; (ii) Sample Schools D, E and I neighboured a black informal settlement (Thembelihle) located within and surrounded by the historically Indian township of Lenasia. As a result, while schools D, E and I had a majority black pupil population, these pupils were classified as being from within Lenasia and not as travellers

from outside of Lenasia. Of the five remaining sample schools (Schools A, B, F, G, H), if calculated separately, the number of pupils travelling from outside of Lenasia stood at 83 percent.

Thus, a substantial portion (59.01 percent) of the pupil population at the sample schools travelled from outside of Lenasia. If the socio-economic circumstances of some of the Lenasia areas (and where these specific schools were situated) were taken into consideration, the number of travellers from outside of Lenasia was even higher in some sample schools in comparison to others.

Table Eight: Total Pupil places of residence in proximity to school for 2008 – results expressed in percentages

School	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	Total
Pupils from outside Lenasia	93.4	72.1	51.3	33.6	11.0	95.6	81.2	72.7	30.5	48.7	59.01
Lenasia-based pupils	6.6	27.9	48.7	66.4	89.0	4.4	18.8	27.3	69.5	51.3	40.99
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

To sum up, Tables Seven and Eight illustrate that a high percentage of pupils in the sampled schools are of African origin despite the schools being situated in a predominantly Indian-based residential township comprising of an Indian community. Furthermore, a definite migratory trend can be traced regarding black pupils moving from black townships neighbouring Lenasia into Lenasia-based public schools. Interestingly, an unintended consequence of investigating black pupil migratory trends has resulted in uncovering a similar migratory trend of Indian pupils leaving Lenasia-based public schools and enrolling at the numerous Lenasia-based private schools, set up to cater for

the Indian community. This chapter moves on to exploring and understanding the migratory patterns of black pupils followed by an understanding of the migratory patterns of Indian pupils.

5.2.3 Black Pupil Migratory Patterns

The movement of black pupils from townships into other residential areas in search of education is not a new phenomenon and it has been noted by Soudien (2007b) and Berger (2003) that the wealthier black parents either moved out of the townships or arranged for their children to be transported on a daily basis to schools that had historically been classified as white. An absence of progressive reformation has been noted in the post-1994 era. There was a sense that black schools across South Africa had continued to remain in a disadvantaged state while the schools in the predominantly white areas had thrived. As a result of this trend, there were increasing numbers of black pupils seeking enrolment in white schools (Gallie et al, 1997).

In a more recent review, Jansen (2008) acknowledged that white working class schools were attracting working class black pupils from "severely dysfunctional township schools." (1). He further stated that "We should not blame poor children if they insist on escaping their lot in the townships." (2).

While the literature reviewed (Jansen, 2008; Soudien, 2007b; Berger 2003; Gallie et al, 1997) indicates that there has been a movement of black pupils into historically white schools, the literature is limited regarding whether the same trend of the movement of black pupils out of the townships was occurring in the former Indian public schools. Soudien (2007) acknowledges that the trend is also occurring (to a lesser extent in comparison to the former Model C (white) schools) in former coloured and Indian

schools. This research project therefore gives further insight into this trend and suggests that Indian public schools are also experiencing the same movement of black pupils, in exercising their constitutional right to education, as the former white schools. Mr X, an education government official stated that: *"Prior to 1994, it was those children who lived in the area attended schools in that area. But when the movement of other learners from other areas started, this affected every area. The movement started around in all communities."*

In addition, to support this claim, *"... there was an exodus of the local children in the vicinity of the school. In this vacuum, the school has had to take on parents who brought their children to the school and it has just filled to capacity with learners coming from outside of Lenasia."* (School Principal F)

The decision to send children to schools that have been set up in areas where communities have previously enjoyed a better educational system is the basis of the decisions taken by their parents in a quest for a quality education for their child. *"When they [black parents] hear that some government schools still produce good results, they obviously want to be part of it, which they have the right to do. So that is what is happening now."* (School Teacher Four). Furthermore, the rights of a parent to ensure a sound education for his or her child is entirely in accordance with the *Education White Paper Two: The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools (1996)* which strongly endorsed parental rights in taking decisions regarding the education of the child. In addition, this migratory trend is a right that is accorded all children in the *1996 Constitution of South Africa*. The above rights are well exercised in this instance. The final focus of this section will examine the corresponding migratory patterns of Indian pupils in an attempt to understand their movements.

5.2.4 Indian Pupil Migratory Patterns

As indicated earlier, an unusually small proportion of Indian pupils (15.67 percent) were attending the ten sample schools despite the schools being located in a predominantly Indian-based township. Upon further investigation, it was uncovered that there was a general sentiment amongst the school principals, school teachers and the education government official interviewed that many children of Indian origin who lived in the vicinity of the sample schools were not attending these schools.

All principals of the schools and four of the five school teachers indicated that many Indian parents had decided to send their children to the five or six private schools based in the Lenasia region. It was stated that with the influx of pupils from the neighbouring black townships, the ratio of Indian pupils had dropped at the schools. In some cases, some of the Indian parents were prepared to travel a distance in order to ensure that their children were attending a school with higher Indian ratios. However, all the Lenasia-based sample schools still had a ratio of over 50% of black pupils. Many children in Lenasia came from affluent homes (in specific areas of Lenasia) so their parents could afford to send their children to private schools charging exorbitant school fees. Principal D reiterated this trend by stating that in 1993, his school was comprised of 100% Indian pupils. By 2008, the Indian population comprised of approximately 10%.

School Principals B and C and School Teachers Three and Four noted that some of the younger families, with school-going aged children, had also moved out of Lenasia to the northern suburbs of Johannesburg. In addition, Lenasia-based families had over the years become more family-planning conscious. This view was confirmed by Principal A when

he indicated that one of the main reasons why children from the area where his school was geographically located were not attending the school was because this area was considered as a slow population growth area.

School Principals B, C, E and J and School Teachers Three and Four stated that race, ethnicity, basic prejudices and bias attitudes also played a big part as to why Indian parents withdrew their children from public schooling. School Principal B stated that *"There was a window of opportunity to build these schools, but people choose to run.*". Private schools had primarily emerged for two reasons. The first reason was because of race issues and secondly, experienced teachers who took their severance packages from the Department of Education needed jobs. However, these private schools had a space and served a need in the community – whether this was right or wrong, was irrelevant. "*The establishment of private schooling was the nail in the coffin for this community and public schooling*." (School Principal B). Teacher Two indicated that many pupils attending Lenasia public schools were from India. In most cases they could not read, write or speak in English when they entered formal schooling. Once they completed a year or two of public schooling, they obtained the basics in the English language and left for private schools. *"We do our best to give of ourselves and the parents just take their children away. This is a sore point."* (School Teacher Two).

Principal E and School Teachers Two and Four noted that while some parents' decision to send their children to the private schools was for religious and moralistic reasons which may have been genuine, other parents used religious beliefs merely as an excuse to not let their children mix with black children from informal settlements and black townships and "*pick up their bad habits or be influenced by these children*." (School Principal E). Teacher Two stated that: "*There is a decline of the Indian children in the*

former Indian public primary schools. Most of these children are attending the private schools. It is possible that their parents can afford it, but it may be linked more to ethnic divisions since certain groups want their children to go to certain private schools." Teacher Four further added that: *"Others [Indian parents] are sending their children to private schools or moving them for religious reasons. For others [Indian parents] it may have been that they did not like the integration of black children into the school, so they took their children out."*

Principal G also stated that while the Indian parents used smaller teacher-pupil ratios as the reason for admitting their children into private schools, this was not the real reason. Principal G summed up the situation by stating that "*When the Indian parents see only three Indian heads in the class, then they do not want to come here, they go elsewhere…. Actually, there is still lots of racism, not from the children but from the parents.*" School Principal I stated that in the wealthier homes in the vicinity of his school, the children were "*shipped out*" to private schools

Eight of the School Principals and School Teacher Three noted that Indian parents opted to send their children to private schools because the facilities were better and that there was a perception that the quality of education was of a higher standard in comparison to the public schools. *"There is an Indian perception that the children from the informal settlements bring the level of education down in the school due to the fact that the black children have never been to pre-school and come from the rural areas."* (School Principal E). In addition: *"Some [Indian parents] see it as a lowering of standards of education where teachers have to reach out to all children by lowering the standards."* (School Principal J). Smaller teacher-pupil ratios and more experienced teachers, in the private schools, also played a role in the decision.

The guise of religious belief also justified parents moving children into private schooling. Principal H stated that these perceptions "*become evident by the actions of the parents.*". School Principal B indicated that in the public schools "*We have compromised quality for numbers. We have filled our rooms. We have overworked our teachers*."

School Principals C and F and School Teacher One were still of the opinion that public schools still offered the same level of education like the private schools, with the only difference being smaller teacher-pupil ratios in the private schools. They noted that pupils from the public schools were achieving the same academic excellence as those attending private schools. School Principal J stressed that: *"…… the word "private" schools meant images of wonderful sprawling grounds, impressive buildings and excellent teachers, but this was not really the case."*

Principal D was of the opinion that it was not so much existing racial divisions in society that resulted in Indian children moving out of the public schools in Lenasia. It had more to do with searching for a better quality education. School Principal H reiterated this view when he indicated that Indian parents were also striving for normative, moral values for their children hence the decision to move them to the private schools. Teacher Three summed up the situation by stating that: "*Sometimes there is the racist element, but this is from the older [Indian parents] generation. All parents want the best for their children. The South African Constitution allows this i.e. looking for quality education."*

Both School Principals A and F alluded that many Indian parents refused to admit their children into former Indian public primary schools due to the fact that most of the black children were still communicating in their vernacular home languages in the school

environment. As a result, language development of the Indian children (on average about 2 Indian children in a class with 38 other black children in some of the sampled schools) was compromised. This communication aspect also became a problem for Indian parents. So, besides there being a religious aspect to moving Indian children to private schools, language usage had also become a consideration.

It had, however, been noted by School Principal B that there had been a slight resurgence in Indian children returning to public primary schools in Lenasia, based on economics because people could not afford the high costs of private schooling and based also on the rationality that children were not getting a much better education in the private schools. It was considered a wise decision to get the pupils back into public schools. School Principals were working hard to provide for a better education with the help of the School Governing Bodies. It was felt that in time, the trend would reverse. School Principals H and I confirmed that the trend had already begun reversing in their schools, whereby, the Indian ratios were on a slight increase in comparison to previous years. In addition, both School Principals C and I noted that in the area where their schools were geographically located, many parents had still admitted their children into these schools primarily because they could not afford to send their children to private schools.

Therefore, when interpreting the above data, an interesting dynamic was uncovered regarding the movement of Indian primary school pupils in the Lenasia region. The majority of the Indian children who lived in close proximity to the sample schools did not attend these schools. The increase of black pupils into public schools in Lenasia saw a corresponding decrease in Indian pupil enrolment over the past years. According to all the school principals interviewed, the more affluent the Indian home, the greater the chances were of Indian children being enrolled at one of the five or six private schools in

Lenasia. Some factors that may have contributed towards low Indian enrolment numbers at the schools were due to the movement of younger families to other areas or a reduction in primary school-going aged children residing in the Lenasia region. However, the overwhelming view put forward by the school principals was that the Indian parents simply refused to enrol their children at the public primary schools in Lenasia.

Thus to sum up, two key arguments, based on the perceptions of the school principals and school teachers, were put forward regarding why this trend may have emerged over the years. The first reason was based on Indian racial stereotyping, prejudices and biases. Indian parents did not want their children to be in the same learning environment as black children since they did not want their children to be negatively influenced by associating with black children from the former black townships. The second reason is based on a quest for a quality education. Indian parents in Lenasia, over the years, had come to perceive education in the public primary schools as of a lower standard in comparison to the private schools. Indian parental views were that due to the high number of black children whose first language was not English and who were pupils at the sample schools, this resulted in the lowering of the standard and quality of education in the former Indian schools. This was, in addition, coupled with high teacher pupil ratios, under or un- qualified teachers and inadequate school infrastructural capacity. As a result, Indian parents decided to move their children into private schooling. The justification of a religious ethos being offered as part of the private school education also became the norm.

An explanation by Soudien (2007b, 91-92) is worth taking note of in this instance. He suggests that for many South Africans of all races, there is an inbred intention to keep the racial identities that were given to them during the apartheid era. While South Africans

have been viewing themselves as part of a larger African community, they still adhere to and view themselves in the racial identity that was carved out by the apartheid regime. These arguments could be employed when attempting to understand the Indian migratory patterns aimed at setting up and filling Indian-run private schools with Indian pupils under the guise of religion.

It is not the purposes of this research project to further interrogate the two above explanations. The intention is to merely state the two different viewpoints that emerged in understanding why the Indian enrolment numbers were so low despite the sample schools being geographically located in a predominantly Indian township.

In the research undertaken by Jansen (2008), he stated that "Schools do not simply admit learners. They also admit cultures, by which I mean attitudes towards learning and authority ingrained in dysfunctional schools." (2). Further detailed research into understanding the intricacies of this social dynamic and related migration of Indian pupils would have to be undertaken.

In light of the above data collection, analysis and interpretation of the findings, this study has investigated and confirmed that a high number of enrolments in the Lenasia sample schools were from pupils who travelled/migrated on a daily basis from neighbouring previously disadvantaged black townships. In addition, it was also discovered that Indian pupil migratory trends out of the Lenasia-based sample schools had risen - resulting in a drastic drop in Indian enrolment numbers in these sample school and an increase in enrolments at private schools.

As a result of effectively implementing South African government policies and strategies aimed at reaching the universal access to primary education, MDG Two and the Education for All initiatives, the sample schools experienced increased enrolment numbers and have witnessed a noticeable migratory trend of black pupils leaving the black townships and enrolling in the Lenasia-based sample schools. Thus the goal of universal access to primary education is well on its way to being met in the South African context. However, a resulting unintended consequence of these social dynamics in a post apartheid South African educational context has witnessed black pupils focussing on a quest for quality education and increasing enrolment numbers having impacted upon infrastructural capacity in the sampled schools. The next chapter of this research project will therefore address these two themes

CHAPTER SIX

THE UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES OF UNIVERSAL ACCESS TO PRIMARY EDUCATION

The focus of Chapter Six is on examining the unintended consequences of striving for universal access to primary education in the South African context. From the preceding chapter, it is evident that there is a noticeable increase in enrolment numbers in the Lenasia-based sample schools and that a sizable proportion of those enrolments is due to the migration of black pupils from the former black township primary schools into public schools in the former Indian township. This chapter further explores the impact of this social phenomenon and the consequences experienced in two specific areas. These are: firstly, the quest for a quality education by black parents and; secondly, the impact that universal access to primary education has had on the infrastructural carrying capacity of the Lenasia-based sample schools.

6.1 THE QUEST FOR QUALITY EDUCATION

A key reason in understanding the movement of black pupils from black township schools to schools in other residential areas, in a quest for a quality education, should be viewed against the backdrop of the breakdown of apartheid, corresponding social movements and the transformation of the educational system in South Africa. In order to address why the perception existed regarding Lenasia schools providing a better quality education in comparison to schools situated in the neighbouring previously disadvantaged black townships, it was important to understand the reasons why a huge number of enrolments were black pupils coming from these areas. From an interpretation of the fieldwork undertaken, it was strongly felt that there was a direct correlation between the

provision of a good quality education and increased enrolment numbers at schools. This was the key explanation as to why a large numbers of black pupils were travelling to Lenasia to attend school. This theme focuses on general perceptions of black parents regarding quality education. The role of English in quality education is then examined, followed by the views expressed on Indian school organisational structures, learning environment and learner achievement. Lastly, perceptions regarding the culture of teaching and learning in the black township schools are interrogated. Interpretations and conclusions are drawn from the results of the school quality perceptions survey conducted on fifty black parents, the data extracted from the qualitative interviews undertaken and the literature presenting the empirical data in Chapter Four.

6.1.1 Overall Black Parental Perceptions on Quality Education

The survey on school quality perceptions conducted on fifty black parents gave a clear indication that the quest for a quality education played a vital role in understanding the migratory pattern of black pupils from the former black townships (greater Soweto) into the former Indian public primary schools in Lenasia.

The first of five themes in the survey – focussing on general perceptions on quality education - concluded that 90 percent of the parents were prepared to have their children travel on a daily basis to the Indian township of Lenasia to attend school since they felt that their children would receive a better quality education in Lenasia rather than in a black township school nearest to their homes. Furthermore, 88 percent of the parents were either in agreement or unsure as to whether a black township school could provide their children with an overall good quality education (see Table Nine - pg.129) The high percentage of parents expressing the viewpoint that the quality of education in the former Indian township schools versus the former black township schools was better and that

there was no parental confidence that a former back township school could offer a good quality education was startling.

"They [black parents] say it themselves when they come here. They feel that we are doing what is supposed to be done here. We ask them why do you bring your child here since your transport costs will be less to keep the child nearer to home and you can make a saving. They indicate that they want the best for their child's education. So, as long as there is good education at this school, this is where they want to be. Parents know that when their child leaves this school, they are wholly satisfied." (School Teacher Four).

Another key area that has created an overall perception that Indian public primary schools were delivering an overall better quality education in comparison to the public schools in the back townships was due to the infrastructural set up in these schools. Mr X, an education government official, highlighted that schools in Soweto had been built in the 1950s during the apartheid era. The condition of these schools was still the same i.e. dilapidated and old. There was a total difference in the infrastructural set up in the former Indian schools. *"So, infrastructure gives us the perception to say what type of school we are faced with. So, [black] parents are also saying that we want to take our children to better schools. To them "better" means to see your child in a new school that is well painted, the roof is new etc. All these things have an impact on the education of the child."* (Mr X, education government official). This viewpoint was also expressed by School Teacher One.

School Teacher Two also felt that black parents wanted their children to be exposed to other children with diverse backgrounds, hence resulting in a better quality education: *"……the black children come to the former Indian schools and are further exposed to*

other cultures. The child is developed socially and culturally. It is therefore an advantage for these children to come to these schools."

Therefore, these perceptions confirmed the notion that the quest for a quality education played a fundamental role in understanding the reasons for the migratory patterns of the black pupils. The next focus is on the impact that English, as the medium of instruction, plays in determining whether the education being received is a qualitative one.

6.1.2 The Role of English in Quality Education

All school principals and school teachers, during their interviews, clearly stated that English was one of the prime reasons why parents from outside of Lenasia admitted their children into schools in Lenasia. As in the past, English continued to remain as the medium of instruction in the former Indian schools in the post-1994 era. School Principals B and D stated that the schools in the black townships had continued to offer their medium of instruction in the vernacular languages rather than in English. In Soweto and other areas, there were still Zulu, Sotho and Xhosa medium of instruction schools. In these circumstances, while English was only offered as a second or third language, it was still considered as the gateway language. School Principal B indicated that the views of the black parents were the following: "*My child must learn English and he must learn it quickly. It will get him a job and get him employed.*" School Principal D highlighted that the black parents wanted to make sure that their children were fully prepared to enter an English speaking university when the time arrived. School Principal G indicated that the parents themselves did not want their children to learn the vernacular languages. They want them to learn English. *"Learners speak their vernacular language in their school environment even if the medium of instruction may be English. When pupils attend [a former Indian school], the teaching will be done in English and the educators*

will be English. The environment is also in English so there is a greater usage of the English language in this learning environment than in the schools where these children originally come from. So, parents want their children to learn English and to be familiar with the language as well." (School Principal H). School Principal G noted that with English being the medium of instruction, parents saw the sample schools as providing a good quality education, hence impacting upon enrolment numbers. In one instance, School Principal I sent out a questionnaire requesting black parents to indicate which vernacular language they would like to have taught at the school. The black parents objected to this and indicated that they would prefer that their children learnt Afrikaans instead. *"The black parents are driving themselves away from their own culture."* (School Teacher One).

The importance of English was also measured as the second of five themes in the survey undertaken with black parents. A majority of the parents (96 percent) indicated that a principal reason why they had enrolled their children in a former Indian public primary school was because they wanted their children to be provided with an education in the English language. In addition, the survey also revealed that only 6 percent of the surveyed parents felt that their children could receive a good quality education (specifically in English) at a former black township school when this statement was posed to them (see Table Nine - pg.129).

Therefore, one of the driving forces behind black pupils moving into the Lenasia sample schools was due to the fact that English had traditionally been and continued to be the medium of instruction. The importance of English as the medium of instruction was overwhelmingly raised by all the school principals, school teachers and was evident from the findings of the survey on school quality perceptions conducted on the black parents.

It was evident that black parents, over time, came to view English in higher esteem over and above the importance of the vernacular languages. In accordance with *the Education White Paper Two: The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools (1996)*, parents had the right to choose the form of education, including the choice of language of instruction and the cultural and religious basis of the education to be provided. Thus, choosing an English medium school of instruction, regardless of its geographic location, was a legal and acceptable practise.

Another issue that is linked to the quest for a quality education is the characteristics of school organisational and managerial structures, a conducive learning environment and the academic achievements of the learner. The next section of this chapter examines the former Indian schooling system in this light.

6.1.3 Indian School Organisational Structures, Learning Environment and Learner Achievement

When examining the schooling environment of the former Indian schools, School Principal A felt that a key reason for black pupil attendance of a Lenasia-based school was due to the strong organisational and management structure of these schools. Black parents viewed these schools as better than the black township schools and there was a perception that the former Indian schools offered a better quality education. School Principal E stated that: *"Either the former Indian schools are doing something very good or the schools in these black townships are not working ……. If you give good quality education, then there is pressure to take in more children. There is a notion that these former Indian schools are functional and they work well."*

The black parents viewed the Indian community in Lenasia with admiration since the community had excelled in business, careers and life in general. School Principal E noted that: *"There is a mindset amongst the black parents that Indian people are hard-working and they give off their best."* These characteristics were attributed towards effective schooling in well organised and structured environments. According to school principals, black parents felt that they wanted to give their children the same opportunities. School Principal B indicated that many of the lives of the black children were changing. Many of them, from the poorest homes in Soweto and who had schooled in Lenasia, were obtaining degrees from universities around South Africa. When Principal C asked a parent why he was willing to make his child travel so far to attend school in Lenasia and not attend a school in the suburb of residence, the response was: "*Nothing is happening in that school*."

Regarding organisational and management structures of the schools: "*There are [former black township] schools available, but we need for them to be manned properly. There are lots of good managers. They just need to be found, put into these schools and things will sort themselves out. If you have a good manager, a school will run comfortably."* (School Teacher Three). In addition, Mr X, an education government official remarked that: *"There is low absenteeism in these [former Indian] schools, teachers are committed and parents when they go there everyday, and they see what is going on in the school. Parents have access to everything that is happening there. They are given information. This is another problem that we are faced with in our own township schools."*

School Principal D stated that "*They [black parents] want to go to a school where an Indian is the principal.*" This view was also noted by School Principal H who mentioned that *"An Indian Principal and an Indian Deputy Principal are key draw cards to bring*

the [black] children to these schools". The black parents feel that these principals are doing a good job and they have faith that their children will get a good education under these principals. School Principal G (and raised by School Principal I as well) stated that in some cases, *"... it goes so far, that if you appoint an African teacher, the [black] parents are upset, they want Indian teachers. Their argument is that if we wanted African teachers we would have sent our children to the schools next to our homes.*" School Principal H reiterated this point by indicating that the level of the qualifications of the educators tends to be a determining factor in parent's choice to place their children in Lenasia-based schools. School Principal J also noted this line of thinking that caused black parents to take their children to the former Indian schools. According to Principal I "*This is why Lenasia is bursting at the seams*."

Therefore, the racial breakdown of the staff component also played a critical role in that the black parents were keener to have their children in schools that were run by Indian principals with a staff complement of predominantly (if not only) Indian teachers rather than black teachers. In addition, it was also evident that the level of qualifications of the educators played a role in determining where parents were prepared to send their children for an education. Negative perceptions and the historical legacy of black township education ran very deeply if racial profiling to this extent was taking place in the transformed schooling environment.

It was noted by three school principals that many parents from Soweto were so desperate to send their children to a Lenasia school in search of a quality education, that they spent huge finances on transporting these children to these schools (R 250-R300 per month) and as a result, could no longer afford the school fees (average of R600 per annum for the ten sample schools). *"With this [low quality education] being the perception in the*

African schools, they [black parents] are hungry for schools where there is some kind of discipline. The parents pay to bring their children to these schools. The school fees are minimal in comparison to the money that these parents pay for the transportation of their children." (School Principal G).

Four school principals indicated that their schools were highly recommended by the parents of their pupils to other family members, friends, neighbours etc. due to the better quality education, service delivery and a conducive learning environment offered by these schools in comparison to the schools located in the black townships. This sentiment was expressed by School Principal G who stated that: *"Also, word spreads. The parents speak to each other. They know where work is taking place."* In addition, School Teacher Three recollected a conversation with a black parent who stated that: *"The schools where we come from are not working very well. We have heard so many good things about your school because I have family here."* As a result of these trends, enrolment numbers were consistently on the rise. "*Parents also appreciate the fact that the schools are very stable in terms of educator attendance, punctuality and work output."* (School Principal H). Principal H further stated that the parents were very confident regarding the type of education that the teachers were providing at the school. The parents also appreciated the close connection/relationship between themselves and the school administrative structures. *"Parents can identify with a school that shows transparency and a very consultative approach."* (School Principal F).

In addition, the third theme measured in the survey on school quality perceptions focussed on the importance of a conducive learning environment with well-maintained and good schooling facilities. The findings noted that 100 percent of the parents surveyed felt that their children would receive a good quality education in a former

Indian school due to the learning environment being well maintained with good schooling facilities. In addition, when the issue of whether a former black township school could provide a similar conducive learning environment, with well maintained and good schooling facilities aimed at a good quality education for black pupils, 92 percent of the parents either disagreed or were unsure as to whether this was possible (see Table Nine - pg.129). From these findings, it is evident that the choice in enrolling black pupils into the former Indian public schools was also influenced to a great degree by linking a good quality education to a conducive and effective learning environment where the child could thrive.

Furthermore, enabling school-level governance was seen as an important criterion for quality education as stated by the EFA Global Monitoring Report (2005, 37). Following interactions with the school principals, school teachers and the education government official, it was further evident that the outputs (student achievement); process (teaching/learning interactions in the classroom, curriculum development) and; inputs (human resources, material resources, time) were considered as the principal issues in the quest for a quality education (Bergmann, 1996; Lockheed and Verspoor, 1990 in Motala, 1995). Teacher Four indicated that a key reason why academic excellence in the formative (Grade One) years was lacking in the former black township schools was due to the fact that there were no structures in place for reading methods, skills, techniques and resources to be used at the Grade One level. On the other hand, structures were in place for the vernacular languages like Sotho, Zulu etc, but when it came to English, this was severely lacking. Teachers did not know which methods to use to teach in English. As a result, *"……we noticed that things were not going well and this is why [black] parents were taking children out of these schools."* (School Teacher Four).

The issue of learner achievement and school-level governance was the fourth of five themes addressed in the survey conducted on the black parents. The findings revealed that 100 percent of the parents surveyed were convinced that their children would receive good academic results and high learner achievement due to the perception that the former Indian schools were well-organised. On the other hand, only 14 percent of the participants felt that their children could achieve the same academic excellence in a former black township school that was well organised (see Table Nine - pg.129). These findings illustrate that effectively run and well-organised schools give the impression that the pupils have a higher success rate regarding their academic careers. Black parents inevitably use this as a criterion when deciding to move their children out of a former black township school into a former Indian public primary school. *"The [black] parents are ecstatic on Parents' Day when they have a look at their children's books. They just cannot believe that their children are leaving the school so well educated."* (School Teacher Two).

Thus, it can be concluded that the organisational and management structure, a conducive learning environment and learner achievement in the former Indian schools are considered as prime reasons why black pupils were being enrolled at the sample schools. It is evident that there is a perception that the Indian schools were better organised and managed than the schools in the black townships resulting in a better learning environment with higher levels of learner achievement linked to good quality education. As a result of this, the perception was that the quality of education was much higher in the sample schools.

Furthermore, in the quest for a quality education there was a strong interplay regarding a greater emphasis on the improvement of quality aimed at ensuring greater effectiveness

and efficiency. Quality, effectiveness and efficiency in schools would therefore have to be seen as interrelated concepts (Motala, 1995). The sample schools were viewed as providing a quality education because they were seen as effective and efficient. Perceptions on the culture of teaching and learning in the former black township schools was impacting upon the migratory patterns of black pupils to the former Indian public schools in the quest for a quality education. The next focus of this section is to delve deeper into the complexities of this issue.

6.1.4 Perceptions on the Culture of Teaching and Learning in Former Black Township Schools

The biggest challenge plaguing the former black township schools was a defunct culture of teaching and learning. School Principals B and C stated that the township schools continued to have a historical legacy of destruction and union disruptions. As a result, there was still a culture of challenging and resistance in some of the schools. There was also teacher apathy and in some cases, teacher disregard towards learning and teaching. *"Teacher training, teacher apathy and the history of education are related problems."* (School Principal C). In some extreme instances, the culture of learning and teaching had been totally destroyed. Mr X, an education government official, noted that there were serious challenges regarding the activities of the South African Democratic Teachers Union (SADTU) in Soweto. The Union defended teachers even though they were not doing their job. *"Because teachers were not controllable in schools, principals were having it tough to deal with teachers because even if principals wanted to charge a teacher, the Unions would come and block and say no, no, no, you cannot charge our teachers. How does a manager work with a teacher who is not willing to go and work in the classroom? Teachers are supposed to teach and managers are supposed to manage. Now we had a serious problem because our teachers could not work and they were being*

protected by the union and, to me, that was a stumbling block." (Mr X, education government official)

Both School Principal B and C noted that over time, this situation had changed with vast improvements in the education system of the township schools. "*However, the damage has already been done with the image of Soweto schooling being destroyed*." (School Principal B) There needed to be a depoliticising and professionalizing of the township schools.

School Principal C indicated that teacher training was a huge challenge. Teachers had historically been poorly trained and as a result, were ill-equipped to implement the new curriculum (i.e. Outcomes-Based Education (OBE)). He indicated that if the qualified teachers were struggling to implement the OBE system, it was even worse in some of the township schools where the teachers were under-qualified. In some instances, while the physical infrastructural capacity may have been in place, it was the content of the education that was lacking due to under-qualified teachers in the system. The situation is summed up as follows: "*If you have educators who are hard working, who are committed and enthusiastic to teach, this will impact upon the learners in a positive manner. However, it seems that this culture of learning is lacking in these [former black township] schools. Therefore, you find parents making the sacrifice to send their children to the Lenasia-based schools."* (School Principal J). This viewpoint was also reiterated by Teacher Five who stated that: "*I've worked with black teachers and I've worked with Indian teachers. The Indian teachers seem to go that extra mile. I am not racist here. I've worked 13 years with black teachers. It's not a blame thing because these [black] teachers themselves received a poor quality education……These teachers have not had quality exposure to quality training. "*

The problem was that the perceptions of historically black education were overwhelming where a former black school was just not capable of providing a quality education. School Principal A indicated that the collapse of these schools was more in the area of the discipline of the children, rather than the lack of skills of the teachers. To supplement this view, School Principal I strongly felt that the township schools were equipped with well trained educators. School Principal E stated that a perception that existed was that teacher attendance at schools was very low, thereby impacting upon service delivery. Principal G mentioned that it was the work ethics of a school that determined whether parents enrolled their children at a specific school.

Principal J added that generally, there was a perception that the culture of learning was non-existent or very low. Thus, if you had educators who were hard-working, committed and enthusiastic to teach, this would impact upon learners in a positive way. However, this culture of learning was still lacking in the black township schools. School Principal F summed up the situation by stating: *"The teachers at these [black township] schools need to market the schools by displaying a sense of professionalism, daily attendance, punctuality, work output, connection between the school and parents, respect for the school content and its infrastructure and the overall delivery."*

The fifth and final theme addressed in the survey and conducted on the black parents explored the issue of the role that qualified teachers had on influencing enrolments at schools. The findings of the survey revealed that 92 percent of the black parents were of the opinion that the principal and teachers at the former Indian public primary schools were well qualified and motivated which would, in the long-term, impact upon the

provision of a good quality education for their children. In addition, 60 percent of the participants either agreed or were unsure as to whether the teachers in the former black township schools had the appropriate qualifications to provide their children with a good quality education (see Table Nine - pg.129). This pattern indicated that black parents choose to send their children to the former Indian schools based on the perception that the teachers in these schools were better qualified, in comparison to teachers in the former black schools, to deliver a good quality education for their children.

It was evident that effective teacher qualifications and training was a major consideration in the quest for a quality education. The negative spill over is that there is a perception that black township teachers are highly unqualified for the job. As a result, as noted during the interviews, implementation of the Outcomes-Based Education system is compromised and, once again, the providing of a quality education suffers the consequences. Thus, quality education needs to operate within a framework that comprises well-trained and qualified teachers who proactively engage teaching methodologies and maximise on curriculum development within a well managed administrative system. If this service is guaranteed, then quality of education will inevitably increase the demand for primary schooling. *"The quality of education that you deliver to the learners is what is key. Have good teachers. You can have any type of learner. If teachers are good enough and they still put the best education forward, then they [learners] will make it."* (Mr X, education government official).

The quality of teacher training has come to play a fundamental role in determining the quality of education being offered. A contributing factor to creating a negative perception of the culture of teaching and learning in the former black townships has been the training received. Mr X, an education government official, stated that undertaking

workshops for a day or two was not sufficient. *"Workshops are there to try to update our teachers to be able to teach utilising the new methods but if there is no commitment on the part of the teacher, education will "go to the dogs". So, we need teachers to change their attitude towards education."* Regarding the implementation of the Outcomes Based Education (OBE) system, older teachers feared implementing a new system. *"In any institution, change unsettles anyone."* (Mr X, an education government official). The issue regarding teacher training in the former black townships was summed up as follows: "*The challenge comes with the younger teacher who has not changed his mind. In terms of the training, you know, you can take a horse to the river but you cannot make him drink. The horse must be prepared to drink the water, so this is our biggest challenge as far as the new curriculum is concerned."* (Mr X, an education government official).

School Teacher Four was of a different opinion and expressed a different reason as to why teacher training for black township schools had failed. It was felt that the training of black teachers in OBE implementation should have never been presented in English. *"……we also forgot that people did not speak English. There were a lot of teachers that did not speak English. They spoke in their mother-tongue and the implementation or the training given in OBE was in English, so there was a gap. If training was given in the vernacular, it would have made a greater impact. As a result, people deliver workshops, but there is no clarity in the workshops. Delivering a workshop in English is difficult to understand if you do not speak the language. If you could not get to grips with this, how could you implement. So there was a total breakdown there."* (School Teacher Four).

School Teacher Two also indicated that at workshops already attended, *"……some of the teachers from the black township schools just cannot grasp what is being said there. The black teachers want to learn how to implement the OBE system but they are finding it difficult. Some of the Indian teachers are fortunate since they have been able to further study and regularly attend these workshops."*

It has to therefore be assumed that had there been a better coordinated and more effective strategy implemented that was aimed at dealing with teacher training in the new curriculum, under-qualified teachers frequenting former black township schools may not have been rife. As a result, black parents may have continued to leave their children in the black township schools since teachers would have received a better quality training resulting in a better quality education being delivered.

Both School Principals B and J stressed that in some instances, there were some of the Soweto schools that were offering a good quality education with dedicated educators who were focussed and disciplined. These schools were partnered with multinational corporations and foreign funding. Furthermore, unions needed to also portray the correct messages in these schools where the education of the child was the priority rather than the rights of the teachers.

Table Nine: **Survey on School Quality Perceptions Conducted on 50 Black Parents – results expressed in percentages**

No.	Statement	Agree	Unsure	Disagree
1.	I want my child to travel everyday to this school because my child will receive a better quality education in this school rather than in the school nearest to my home.	90	4	6
2.	My child will not receive good results in the school nearest to my home because that school is not well organised.	52	34	14
3.	Education is provided in the English language at this school. This is the reason why I want my child to attend this school.	96	-	4
4.	The school nearest to my home does not have qualified teachers or the teachers are under-qualified. They cannot provide my child with a good quality education.	12	48	40
5.	This school is well-maintained and the facilities are good. My child will receive a good quality education in this school.	100	-	-
6.	I do not want to send my child to the school nearest to my home because I do not believe that my child will receive a good quality education there.	48	40	12
7.	My child will receive good results in this school because it is well-organised.	100	-	-
8.	The school nearest to my home does not offer a good quality education in English for my child.	58	36	6
9.	The principal and teachers at this school are well-qualified and motivated. They will provide my child with a good quality education.	92	8	-
10.	The school nearest to my home does not have good facilities and is not well maintained. My child cannot receive a good quality education there.	66	26	8

The school principals indicated that the perception that the former Indian schools provided a better education than the black township schools, due to a better culture of teaching and learning, spread within the social circles of the predominantly black communities neighbouring Lenasia. Thus, the impression that the former Indian schools provided a better quality education fed off itself in terms of rapidly spreading throughout the black township communities. Fataar (1997) notes that the general perception has been that the white and Indian education systems had been generally well-structured and well-run. As for the coloured education system, it had been in a more disorganised, badly managed and in a much weaker state. African education was by far the worst off with most of the children who were not attending school being of African origin.

To illustrate this point further, Fataar (1997) cited a study conducted by Hofmeyer and Buckland in 1992. The study entitled "Education System Change in South Africa" found that in 1989, the percentage of under-qualified teachers in white education was 0%; Indian education was 2%; coloured education was 45%; and black education (DET) was 52%. In addition, the Standard Ten (matric) pass rate for 1989 was 96%; 93.6%; 72.7%; and 40.7% respectively for the various race classifications. While this study was undertaken in 1989, the perceptions that black education was of a weaker quality to that of Indian and white education continued to plague the education sector well beyond the transformations began in the post-1994 era. In order to study current trends, this research project analysed the 2008 Grade 12 (matric) results for the Lenasia and the Soweto regions. The average Grade 12 pass rate for the five former Indian public secondary schools in Lenasia was 90.8 percent. A similar undertaking was done for five secondary schools situated in the greater Soweto area. The five Soweto schools identified were based on (i) the schools having a similar number of Grade 12 pupils enrolled as in the

Lenasia-based former Indian secondary schools and (ii) using a sample that comprised of one technical secondary school due to the fact that one of the five Lenasia secondary schools was technical in nature. The average Grade 12 pass rate for the five Soweto secondary schools was 55.8 percent. This is a clear indication that, firstly, the legacy of a poor black township education continues fourteen years after democratisation and, secondly, that the perceptions of black parents is not unfounded - thereby resulting in the migratory patterns of their children to former Indian schools in the Lenasia area. In the same light, the 2008 Grade 12 (matric) results was calculated for three private schools (catering for Grade 12) set up specifically for the Indian community in the Lenasia region. The average pass rate for these predominantly Indian pupil population private schools was 95.0 percent. While this may not be a fair comparison to make (due to the fact that these private schools have better schooling facilities and lower teacher pupil ratios) the point is that these results give some insight as to why Indian parents perceive private schooling (rather than public schooling) to be a better option for their children.

Even though there were vast improvements in black township education, the legacies of under qualified teachers and poor matric results continue to haunt the black township education system in present times, as evidenced above. As a result, these perceptions continue to result in the massive move of black pupils from neighbouring townships into Lenasia-based primary schools. Thus, in accordance with the general line of thinking regarding the literature already reviewed, Motala (1995) concluded that credibility in primary schools in Soweto would only improve through systematic quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of the education system. A chief requirement at the time for this to materialise was the redistribution of education spending.

Therefore, the negative aura regarding the culture of teaching and learning in the black townships was still very much alive. Research suggests that the perceptions of the culture of teaching and learning in Soweto and Gauteng schools in general continued to have negative connotations (Christie, 1998, in Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003, 352; Chrisholm and Vally, 1996, in Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003, 352 and; Gallie et al, 1997). Thus, perceptions of the challenges, constraints and conditions facing the schools located in the black townships neighbouring Lenasia further eroded any view that these schools were actually capable of providing a quality education. There continues to be a notion of destruction, union disruptions, disregard for teachers and the principal, discipline problems and resistance that plagues the schooling provided in the black townships.

It becomes unfortunate that even if there are some good quality schools in the black townships, the entire education system is viewed in a negative light. Parents then start resorting to other measures like sending their children to schools away from their homes. This is undertaken in order to ensure that their children receive a good quality education. All school principals interviewed, confirmed that there is a strong perception by the black parents that there had been a collapse of the schooling system in the Soweto area and neighbouring black townships. An interesting perspective is put forward by Soudien (2007a) when he notes that the comfort and security of an identity for the black youth in townships was lacking due to a breakdown of societal structures. Due to this fragmentation, the youth moved away from the values instilled in a school environment, resulting in "… their social and academic failure …" (29). It is evident that this societal characteristic, highly prevalent in the townships, had a detrimental impact and contributed to the dismal culture of learning in black townships.

In undertaking this investigation, this research project uncovered that there is a proposal to combine some of the Soweto schools due to the fact that numerous black children in Soweto were attending Lenasia-based schools - resulting in the Soweto schools being empty. Mr X, an education government official, confirmed this trend. *"The best way is to merge schools. You have to take two or three schools and merge them into one. Imagine a school that was meant to cater for 800 learners, presently the school only has 100-120 learners. There is not just one school like this. We have a number of these cases. The infrastructure is there, but old. The classes are there, but they are dilapidated."* However, merging schools in the black townships comes with other challenges. It is difficult to merge schools in close proximity to each other due to the fact that these schools have different predominant languages (Zulu, Venda, Xhosa, Sotho etc) as the medium of instruction. If merges do take place, it is not clear as to which language would become the medium of instruction.

At the same time, School Principals H, I and J highlighted that if it was not for the black pupils travelling to Lenasia to attend school, the Lenasia teachers would all be in excess and would have to be re-deployed elsewhere. In worst case scenarios, schools in Lenasia would have to close down if there were no pupils to teach. Therefore, it can be concluded that the movement of black pupils into the sample schools in a quest for a quality education was mutually beneficial for the teachers in these schools. According to government regulations, if schools could not prove that there was a teacher pupil ratio of 1:40, teachers would be considered in excess at a specific school and then re-deployed to other schools (in most cases to the rural areas) to fill the gaps in those schools. In order to avoid redeployment, the numbers are sometimes deliberately kept high in the schools in urban areas in order to avoid redeployments. Thus, while high enrolment numbers bring challenges to schools, the high enrolment numbers also keep teachers firmly in their

comfort zones and ensures that they keep their jobs. This position was summed up by Jensen (2008) when he indicated that: "For teachers to keep their jobs, they need more students. Sometimes the reasons are altruistic: to provide good education to the disadvantaged." (1). School Principal I also stated that: "…. *If it was not for these children coming to these schools in Lenasia, the Lenasia teachers would be in excess. So, in a way this movement of children into Lenasia is a blessing, otherwise teachers would be re-deployed elsewhere."*

In conclusion, it is interesting to note in this investigation that the more the Indian parents viewed the sample schools as providing a sub-standard education for their children and opted for the private schooling option, the more the black parents viewed the sample schools as providing a better quality education in comparison to the historically plagued ineffective schooling provided by the black township schools. This phenomenon is summed up as follows: *"The perception is that in Lenasia, they [black parents and pupils] get a quality education. This contrasts with the trend of the Indian parents. This is a strange set up. The Indian perception is the total opposite - that these public schools in Lenasia are not offering a good quality education and that the standards have been dropped."* (School Principal I).

Furthermore, the ramification of under or un-qualified teachers in the education system, coupled with poor governance and administration and the host of other challenges facing schools is cause for great concern. The outcome of such an occurrence has direct and negative implications for the quality of education that is being provided in some public schools in South Africa as illustrated by the survey on school quality perceptions conducted on fifty black parents in this investigation and as presented in the comparison between Lenasia and Soweto Grade 12 (matric) results for 2008.

It had been noted that the provincial Department of Education was placing pressure on many of the black township schools to improve their organisation and managerial structures including the quality of education in their schooling environments

A key contributing factor that saw an increase in enrolment numbers of black pupils into the Lenasia-based sample schools was due to the fact that the end of apartheid heralded a new educational dispensation that abolished access to education along racial lines. The Constitution, as the highest law in the land, allowed every child the right to education with no concrete limitations on where that education could be received. The consequences of practising the right aimed at universal access to primary education, has resulted in most parents striving for a quality education for their children.

In light of the above data collection, analysis and interpretation of the findings, this study has investigated and confirmed that there is a perception by the black parents, that their children are receiving a better quality education (in comparison to schools in the previously disadvantaged black townships) in the Lenasia sample schools. The next focus of this chapter examines the impact that universal access to primary education has had on the infrastructural carrying capacity of the Lenasia-based sample schools.

6.2 THE IMPACT OF HIGH ENROLMENT NUMBERS ON INFRASTRUCTURAL CAPACITY

The purpose of the final part of the research project is to study the impact of high enrolment numbers, as an unintended consequence, on the infrastructural capacity of the sampled schools. In order to understand this linkage, the issue is contextualised in order to understand the physical structures of the sample schools - as inherited from the

apartheid era. A calculation of what the excess carrying capacity (enrolment numbers) is also presented in order to gain a clearer picture of the pressure that universal access to primary education places on infrastructural carrying capacity in schools. This section then focuses on understanding some of the key challenges that increased enrolment numbers create on school infrastructural capacity. The next issue investigates the role of government in supporting the infrastructural needs of the schools and the final aspect addressees how universal access to primary education is compromised due to inadequate infrastructural capacity. Interpretations and conclusions are drawn from the descriptive statistics (statistical questionnaire) provided, the data extracted from the qualitative interviews undertaken and the empirical data presented in Chapter Four.

6.2.1 Historical Legacy Impacting Infrastructural Capacity

In order to understand the impact of universal access to primary education on infrastructural capacity at schools, it is important to contextualise the environment. All the sample schools were built by the former Indian educational system i.e. the House of Delegates in the pre-1994 era. The structures were built to accommodate an Indian educational system during the apartheid era.

Part of this research project was to therefore investigate as to whether the infrastructural carrying capacity of the existing school structures could cope with the practical application of the educational transformation in South Africa. Therefore, as an unintended consequence of universal access to primary education, the impact that high enrolment numbers was having on maximum infrastructural carrying capacity (in terms of pupil enrolment numbers) in the sampled schools was traced. The calculations were based on estimates by the schools regarding the maximum carrying capacity since there

was no official documentation on hand to specifically indicate what the exact carrying capacity of the schools were when they were built during the pre-1994 era.

The results indicated that the carrying capacity varied from 600 to 800 pupils for each of the ten sampled schools. The overall calculation illustrated that the schools were (on average) 29.18 percent over the ideal/maximum carrying capacity in terms of pupil enrolment numbers. This accounted for a total excess of 2 699 extra pupils in the ten sampled schools (see Table Ten).

Table Ten: Maximum Physical Infrastructural Carrying Capacity (enrolment numbers) of Schools and Total Pupil Enrolments for 2008

School	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	Total
2008 Pupil population	857	921	1193	937	910	939	792	901	966	833	9249
Maximum Carrying Capacity	600	600	800	600	650	700	600	700	650	650	6550
No. of extra pupils	257	321	393	337	260	239	192	201	316	183	2699
% increase of pupils	29.9	34.8	32.9	35.9	28.5	25.4	24.2	22.3	32.7	21.9	29.18

It can be summed up that while there was clear evidence that all the sample schools were playing a fundamental role in ensuring universal access to primary education in accordance with South African legislation, this was coming at an expense to the physical infrastructural carrying capacity of the sampled schools. All the school principals and the school teachers confirmed that the high enrolment numbers had a direct bearing on the infrastructural challenges experienced at their schools. *"We do not have sufficient space*

otherwise we would have had much, much more [black pupils] than what we currently have." (School Teacher One). It is at this point that the next focus will examine the key infrastructural challenges at schools as a result of high enrolment numbers.

6.2.2 Infrastructural Challenges at Schools

School Principals A, C, D, H, I and J and all the school teachers highlighted that the teacher pupil ratios were considered as being too high. As a result there were inadequate classrooms in most of the sample schools. *"The school could take another unit of Grade One, but there is no space for this. There is a need to build classrooms, but there is no money for that."* (School Principal J). The lack of classrooms caused a greater problem in attempting to implement a good quality educational system since part of the focus was work conducted on a one-to-one basis. Thus, providing more classrooms would result in good quality teaching. School Principal E summed up the situation by stating that *"……. There are 44 learners in the class with a 30-minute period. You cannot even give 45 seconds per learner. How are you ensuring good quality education?*" In addition, it was *"impossible to do justice to all of them [pupils]."* (School Principal D). Both School Principals B and D indicated that due to infrastructural capacity problems, extra classes were held with pupils (after school hours) in order to give children individual attention.

All the interviewed school teachers, who had first hand experience of the current classroom situation, were more vocal about high enrolment numbers impacting upon infrastructural challenges that jeopardised the delivery of a good quality education. All school teachers felt that it was impossible to give individual attention to pupils when teacher pupil ratios were so high. Furthermore, *"It was virtually impossible for the teachers to even move in the classrooms ……The situation reaches such a point where*

the teacher cannot put a teachers' table in the class but has to rather use a pupils' desk in order to create the necessary space in the class ……Nobody foresaw that a situation like this was going to happen. Other schools are even worse off." (School Teacher One).

It is evident that high enrolment numbers had a direct bearing on the physical infrastructural capacity at the schools. Most importantly, this challenge, raised by numerous principals and all the school teachers of the sample schools, resulted in compromising the effective and efficient implementation of the Outcomes Based Education (OBE) system. There are too many children per class due to the lack of additional classrooms and high teacher pupil ratios. As a result, educators could not effectively assess each child in terms of an OBE environment. Teacher Three summed up this situation by stating that: *"OBE has all this glorified terminology that focuses on the child's individual needs. All this works well on paper. With 45 children in the class, you cannot cater for every child's individual needs."* In addition, group work in the OBE curriculum was problematic because the pupils needed to form groups in class and there was not sufficient space for movement in the class. *"You lose five to ten minutes just trying to shuffle the furniture around to do group work."* (School Teacher Three).

Teacher Five explained that OBE was unsuccessful due to inadequate classrooms which resulted in the high number of pupils in the Foundation Phase (Grade One) of the educational system. *"This is their [Grade One pupils] entry level into their academic career. You are teaching children here how to think about numbers, how to assimilate numbers, how to assimilate words, how to build words. How can you teach that to 40 [pupils]? You cannot do that! Even with the traditional teaching methods, we would*

have never coped if the numbers were the same." In summing up, School Principal H stated that: *"The OBE structure is not aligned to the classroom situation."*

However, *"The teachers try and do everything that OBE requires of them. It is absolutely difficult, but the teachers have no option ……You have to do what you have to do in your class, no matter how you do it, but being dedicated teachers, we do it."* (School Teacher Two). Thus, it can be concluded that the excess number of pupils is a key infrastructural challenge since the teachers cannot cope, the classrooms are small, and the space is not conducive to having so many learners in the class. Reducing the number of enrolments would make the situation ideal regarding the delivery of good quality teaching.

Another challenge was highlighted by Principal A. He indicated that science and computer laboratory regulations only allowed 30 pupils to use the facilities. However, teacher pupil ratios stood at 1:40, thereby compromising safety regulations. School Principals H and J also indicated that specialist rooms had to be converted into classrooms due to the lack of space. School Principal J highlighted that if their enrolment numbers were not so high, then the classrooms would have been used for their intended purposes leaving the specialist classrooms free for the practical training in the various relevant disciplines. As a result of this challenge, specialist rooms e.g. science and computer laboratories, libraries etc. were not being optimally used due to having being converted into normal classrooms. This severely impacted upon pupils being able to use these facilities for their intended purposes. Thus, it could be concluded that challenges to infrastructural capacity, due to high enrolment numbers, directly impacted upon the service delivery of a good quality education. Masango (1993) also highlighted the importance of the effective provision of the necessary physical resources, specifically, the

availability of laboratories, audio-visual equipment of different types, a library and reference books as preconditions for effective and good quality schooling.

School Principal A, C, D, H and I indicated that due to inadequate toilet facilities, hygiene issues became a challenge. Principal D had employed additional staff to ensure that the toilets were cleaned three times a day during school hours. Therefore, inadequate water and sanitation facilities negatively impacted upon the effective and hygienic running of the sample schools. There was a direct correlation between high enrolment numbers and the availability of toilets. The toilet facilities in most of the sample schools was only intended to cater for the maximum carrying capacity that the schools were originally built for in the pre-1994 era.

These findings support the conclusions that adequate school infrastructure was instrumental to creating a conducive environment and appropriate physical settings in which a culture of teaching and learning could flourish, resulting in academic excellence. Thus, the manner in which teaching and learning actually took place and the attainment of academic excellence was highly dependant on the schooling environment and its related infrastructural capacity (Lemon (2004); Kaul (2001); Jansen (1998); Mwamwenda and Mwanwenda (1987) and; Cooper (1985)). Making the challenges even more complex, Principal B indicated that his school was unable to maintain, upgrade or refurbish the furniture. As a result, the school was operating with old, dilapidated furniture. Principal B also stressed that there was a need to refurbish the classrooms. This section will now explore to what degree government support, for the sample schools, has been forthcoming.

6.2.3 Governmental Support regarding Infrastructural Capacity

Principal A indicated that it was important to decrease the teacher pupil ratios. The lack of trained personnel was a key problem. Older schools needed more funds for maintenance than the newer schools. School Principal B indicated that the Department of Public Works should be better engaged to take on more responsibilities regarding the maintenance of schools as state owned property. It was stated that government was always reluctant to assist with capital expenditure. One Principal indicated that: *"The Government needs to interact more with the schools and become a stakeholder. On paper, they are stakeholders but in reality, they are not……They need to visit more often to see where the challenges are. ……. They are paper educationalists."*

School Principals C and G felt that the Government should assist with funding for infrastructural capacity. The Government could play a greater role in providing mobile classrooms to alleviate the classroom shortage problems. Principal D indicated that the resource allocations had not been very effective. While the provincial department was experiencing a surplus of funds, the schools were desperately in need of further funding for various aspects of the operationalisation of the schools. Principals D and E felt that Government needed to play a more active role in the schools in terms of being an active stakeholder. The Department of Education needed to be "hands-on" and have better communication. Teacher Three critically mentioned that: "*For the past five years, in the school improvement plan, physical space and teacher pupil ratio needs to be looked at. Nobody has looked at it because it will not be done."*

Principal I and J responded in a more long-term manner. They indicated that Government could play a greater role by building more classrooms and schools in the greater Lenasia area. There was a definite need for more and bigger schools. Regarding

the building of additional classrooms, School Principal J highlighted that Government "*… see it as our [the schools'] function, but we do not have the money.*"

All principals indicated that, due to inadequate government funding, their schools had to resort to school fundraising events to raise money in order to deal with some of the infrastructural capacity problems. Principal I indicated that responses from the community were mixed in terms of supporting school fundraising events. In addition, the Lenasia business community had reached saturation point in that they were already helping many schools in the Lenasia region and were unable to make further contributions. Principal A summed up the situation by stating that: *"All infrastructural development has to be done via sponsorships and fundraising. The problem is that with a population that is from outside of Lenasia, it is very difficult to fundraise. The Indian community is not willing to assist since they indicate that they do not "feed" the school with pupils. They give some sponsorship, but it is difficult."* Principal F mentioned that his school could not afford to have more fundraising events at the expense of diverting from the schools' core function which was the teaching of the pupils. He further stated that: *"Raising money for the school is extremely difficult. This is due to the fact that parents are already financially constrained by paying for the transport of their children to the school."*

School Principal H stated that there was a need to have more concrete policy implementation. There were policies in place however, they were not implementable. He stated that "*The Constitution was great, but to carry it out was very difficult*."

From the above engagement on this issue, some of the key interventions that can be made by government include the building of more classrooms, more toilets, replacing old

furniture and reducing the teacher pupil ratio so as to ensure that a better quality of education can be delivered in terms of OBE implementation. Hallak (1990) noted that these were the priority areas that needed attention and also alluded to the fact that the State bore the primary responsibility to ensure that State-funding was effectively used in this regard. *The White Paper on Education and Training (1995)* also stated that material resources to effectively equip schools needed to be sourced from State funds. *"When you have something so long, you learn to manage it. So in terms of current capacity, the school can manage on condition that Government takes cognisance of the fact that when you fund schools, older schools need more money for maintenance than the newer schools. It is not a criterion in the funding norms. So this is what is needed."* (School Principal B). School Principal G, regarding infrastructural development, cautiously noted that: *"If you look at priorities, these [former Indian] schools do not qualify as priority schools."*

Therefore government intervention has thus far been bleak regarding greater support for the infrastructural needs of the sampled schools in order to cope with implementing universal access to primary education. Much more support will need to be provided if these schools are to effectively deliver a qualitative education aimed at effectively implementing the OBE system. The final focus of this chapter will investigate whether universal access to primary education has been compromised as a result of inadequate infrastructural capacity at the sampled schools.

6.2.4 Compromising Universal Access to Primary Education due to Inadequate Infrastructural Capacity

All School Principals indicated that due to an already expanded enrolment number way beyond the physical infrastructural carrying capacity of their schools, they had no choice

but to turn down children and refer them to the provincial Department of Education for placement at other schools in the area or schools in other areas. The onus, according to South African Law, was on the Provincial Departments of Education to find a place for every child in a school. "*The school reached a point where we had to turn pupils away due to infrastructural capacity. We could have gone way beyond the current intake due to parents wanting their children to be in the school."* (School Principal F)

Turning children away from the schools has been done every year and all School Principals indicated how difficult it had been to refer parents back to the Governmental authorities due to not being able to accommodate their children. School Principal B indicated that the only reason for turning children away had been based on a lack of infrastructural capacity. School Principal E stated that, in some instances, when children were turned away due to the lack of infrastructural capacity, it was viewed as a racist issue i.e. deliberately not accepting black pupils into former Indian public schools on the pretext of inadequate infrastructural capacity. School Principal G stressed that turning children away from schooling was very frequent in the Grade One level of admissions. *"As soon as a child takes a transfer card, there is another child waiting to enter the school as a pupil, regardless of when this happens in the year. So, there is always a need."* (School Principal E).

In addition, Teacher Four confirmed this trend by mentioning that: *"We feel very sad that we cannot accept many of the learners because we do not have schools that can cater for the children. The schools are built for a certain number of kids. We also feel bad that we have to tell them that we cannot accept everyone. Even during the year, we have parents coming to the school saying that their schools are not doing well and we need space in your school. This is very regular, it is not something that happens once off."*

One Principal stated that "*The ideal situation is for these children to go to the Soweto schools because these schools are empty. The Department should make sure that these schools are functional schools but the Department is not doing enough. They know that in these schools that work is not being done. The Department is too scared to do anything, so our schools bear the brunt.*"

Schools can be declared full by the Department of Education, but the Government authorities are always reluctant to declare schools full. One School Principal indicated that: *"……schools will never be declared full by the Department. The Department will force schools to take children in. So, it is not in their interest to declare the schools full."* Only one of the ten sample schools in this study indicated that at some point, his school had been declared full by the Government.

Of concern is that although the sample schools continue to do their utmost in accommodating children at these schools so as to ensure that the basic, constitutionally endorsed, human right of the child to an education is practised, infrastructural capacity problems continue to force the principals of all ten sample schools to take the regrettable decision of not enrolling all the children that come to these schools seeking a right to education. The decision by school principals to refuse a child access to their schools should be understood. The circumstances under which these school principals work needs to be contextualised. Their difficult decision is governed by the lack of infrastructural capacity and the need to balance this with providing a good quality education for the children that have already been accommodated at their schools. However, it has to be stated that even though black parents are under the impression that their children are receiving a good quality education in the former Indian public primary schools, this

perception becomes questionable due to the fact that the high enrolment numbers are creating infrastructural challenges which, in turn, makes it difficult to effectively implement the OBE system in a qualitative manner in any event.

Therefore, it can be confirmed, from the data collected, analysed and interpreted relating to this issue, that as an unintended consequence of high enrolment numbers aimed at achieving universal access to primary education, challenges in infrastructural capacity have been experienced by the Lenasia sample schools. The following chapter will draw this research project to a close by summarising and making appropriate conclusions on the study undertaken.

CHAPTER SEVEN

CONCLUSION

The transformation of the South African education sector was one of the most daunting tasks that faced the African National Congress (ANC)-led South African government in the post-1994 era. The inheritance of over ten different education systems based on racial discrimination and geographical segregation had left a lasting legacy of inequalities, inconsistencies in quality education and skewed funding allocations that impacted upon the very foundations of all levels of education in South Africa. The vestiges of this system continue to haunt a country that progressively moves forward in a quest to ensure that the right to universal access to primary education for every child prevents the repetition of a discriminatory educational history.

This research project set out to examine whether universal access to primary education had led to an increase in enrolment numbers in a specific sample (based on seven criteria) of former historically classified Indian public primary schools in the former Indian township of Lenasia, thirty kilometres south of Johannesburg. The study also explored whether universal access to primary education had led to pupils resident in the former black townships (greater Soweto) neighbouring Lenasia from migrating to the sampled schools. In addition, the objective was to understand the reasons, through the views and perceptions of school principals, school teachers, black parents and a government official as to why this trend may have been occurring. Lastly, the research project investigated whether universal access to primary education had, as an unintended consequence, led to infrastructural capacity difficulties experienced in the sampled schools.

The findings of this study illustrated that there had been an increase in the number of pupil enrolments in the ten sampled former Indian public primary schools in Lenasia. In addition, there was further evidence that Grade One enrolments had also been on the increase with higher overall increased levels of enrolment in at least four of the sample schools for the years 2000, 2004 and 2008. It was therefore deduced that the South African national legislative framework was well in place and effectively ensuring that universal access to primary education was being implemented in South Africa, taking national increases in enrolment levels into consideration. Views were mixed as to whether the international initiatives (Millennium Development Goal Two and the Education for All initiative) played an important role in increased enrolments. While some respondents felt that it did, others saw societal movements due to the dissolution of apartheid as being a more prominent reason for increased enrolment numbers. The findings of this study (i.e. that there had been an increase in the number of pupil enrolments in the ten sampled former Indian public primary schools in Lenasia) was compliant and further supported the general trend in the literature (SA Millennium Development Goals Mid-Term Country Report, 2007; Economic Commission for Africa 2005) that enrolment numbers in South Africa had dramatically increased in the post-1994 period. In addition, this finding further verified the active implementation of the *South African Constitution (1996)* and the *South African Schools Act 84 of 1996* where emphasis was placed on the rights of the child to accessible education.

This investigation also revealed that black pupils comprised over 80 percent of the pupil population in the ten sampled schools. Of this percentage, just fewer than 60 percent of them travelled from neighbouring black townships to attend schools in the Lenasia region. It was thus confirmed that numerous black pupils were travelling from outside of the Lenasia region to attend the sampled schools. These findings supported and added an

additional dimension to the vast literature (Jansen, 2008; Soudien 2007b; Berger, 2003; Gallie et al, 1997) illustrating the migratory trend of black pupils into the former Model C (white) primary schools. This study demonstrated that this movement was also occurring in the former Indian public primary schools specifically situated in the former Indian township of Lenasia that neighboured the greater Soweto region. This trend also confirmed compliance with the *Education White Paper Two: The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools (1996)* which strongly endorsed parental rights in taking decisions regarding the education of the child. In this instance, these rights were exercised with the aim/perception of providing the child with a better education, hence a noticeable migratory trend could be traced.

It was also uncovered, during this investigation, that there was a correspondingly low enrolment number of Indian pupils despite the sampled schools being located in a former Indian area with a high concentration of Indian families with school-going children. Two explanations (although not the focus of this study) were put forward as to why Indian enrolment numbers were low. The first was due to Indian racial stereotyping, prejudices and biases against black pupils integrating into former Indian schools. The second was due to Indian parents wanting a better quality of education for their children. They concluded that the black pupils (due to English not being their mother tongue) lowered the academic standards in the former Indian schools and therefore opted for private schooling. Further investigations to confirm or negate these claims would still need to be researched.

In addition, based on the perceptions of the school principals and school teachers via qualitative interviews and through a survey on school quality perceptions conducted on fifty black parents, it was evident that the primary purpose of black pupils travelling to

the Lenasia-based sample schools was in order to (as an unintended consequence of striving for universal access to primary education) access a better quality education in comparison to the education being delivered at the historically black townships where they had resided. 90 percent of the parents surveyed felt that their child would receive a better quality education in a former Indian public primary school rather than in the former black township public primary school nearest to his/her home. In the quest for a quality education, it was uncovered that education being delivered in the medium of instruction of English played a crucial determining factor. Black parents wanted their children to learn English over and above any vernacular language – 96 percent of the surveyed parents sent their child to a former Indian school because the child would receive a good quality education in English. In accordance with government legislation, all parents had the right to choose the language of instruction in their child's education. These findings confirm the general viewpoint that Soweto schools can only improve via systematic quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of the educational system (Motala, 1995). The findings of this investigation also supported the literature regarding the interplay between having universal access to primary education and simultaneously ensuring that education was of a high-quality ((Millennium Development Goals Report 2008; Soudien, 2007b; EFA Global Monitoring Report, 2005; Fataar, 1997; White Paper on Education and Training, 1995; Lockheed and Verspoor, 1994; Colclough, 1993; The UNICEF Sourcebook on Children Development in the 1990s, 1990).

Other equally important determinants in this migratory process was that the former Indian public primary schools were perceived to have a better organisational and management structure in comparison to the former black township schools. In addition, 100 percent of the surveyed parents felt that the former Indian schools were well maintained and that the facilities were good. The perception, according to the school principals and school

teachers, was that efficiency and effectiveness of the Indian schools led to better *outputs* in terms of student achievement, better managed *processes* in terms of the teaching/learning interactions and better *inputs* in terms of human resources, learning materials etc. The sample schools were therefore viewed as value for money that black parents invested in their children's education. This was further confirmed by the surveyed parents where 100 percent felt that learner achievement was guaranteed in a former Indian school. These results further verified the findings of Pendelbury (1998) and Motala (1995) who indicated that due to the vestiges of apartheid, internal challenges experienced at schools resulted in little focus being placed on quality, efficiency and effectiveness by educational institutions.

Negative perceptions of the continuing legacy of the black township schools being disruptive, undisciplined and offering a low quality of education due to a high number of unqualified teachers continued to remain deeply ingrained in the minds of the black parents living in the former black townships neighbouring Lenasia. 92 percent of the surveyed black parents felt that their child would receive a good quality education in an Indian school due to the school principal and teachers being well-qualified and motivated. The negative perceptions on the culture of teaching and learning were clearly evident from the survey findings. These findings tallied with the literature (Christie, 1998, in Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003; Chrisholm and Vally, 1996, in Smith and Ngoma-Maema, 2003; Soudien, 1992) regarding the negative legacy that South African politics of the 1970s and 1980s had left on black township schools. Furthermore, the findings of this study illustrated and supported the literature (Chisholm, 2004; Berger, 2003) regarding the negative impact that under or unqualified teachers had in black township schools.

Thus, it seems that while, on the one hand, some Indian parents viewed the sample schools as providing a sub-standard education, on the other hand, all the black parents viewed the sample schools as providing a better quality education in comparison to the education being provided in the former black township schools.

Lastly, the study uncovered that, as an unintended consequence of universal access to primary education and the resultant high enrolment numbers in the sampled schools, there were numerous infrastructural challenges that were experienced. The schools were built by the former House of Delegates that administered Indian education during the apartheid era. Therefore, the physical structure of the sampled schools only catered for a carrying capacity of enrolment numbers based on pre-1994 configurations for an Indian-only education system. The lack of a sufficient number of classrooms was the number one concern followed by a lack of sufficient toilets. While the former negatively impacted upon teacher pupil ratios and the effective implementation of the Outcomes Based Education system, the latter threatened the safety and health standards for young children. In addition, it was concluded that the attainment of academic excellence was highly dependant upon the existence of a conducive schooling environment and its related infrastructural capacity. These findings support the literature (Masango, 1993, Hallak, 1990) that effective education and ensuring access of children to primary education, including the offering of a good quality education, was highly dependant upon the expansion of existing school structures. In addition, the findings further revealed that a conducive schooling environment was vital for learner attendance and academic achievement as also illustrated by Lemon, 2004; Heyneman, 1980, in Mwamwenda and Mwamwenda, 1987 and; Cooper, 1985.

Thus, it can be argued from these findings that even though black parents are under the impression that they are getting a good quality education, this is questionable due to the fact that the high enrolment numbers in the former Indian public primary schools in Lenasia are creating infrastructural challenges that make it impossible to effectively implement the OBE system, thereby directly impacting upon the overall quality of education being delivered.

Given the findings of this study, it is evident that universal access to primary education comes with numerous socio-economic and political dynamics inherited from a history of racial oppression and segregation. Nowhere is this more noticeable than in the bold transformation of the education sector in South Africa. Universal access to primary education is being implemented at an astonishingly successful rate, taking into account the socio-economic realities of South African society. At this rate, South Africa will meet Millennium Development Goal Two by 2015. However, the qualitative aspect of universal access to primary education is being severely compromised. In a quest for the quality of education, this research project had uncovered many societal dynamics that need to be addressed in future governmental policy formulation and in the undertaking of future research on this field of study.

From the document analysis undertaken, the descriptive statistics used to display the findings, the information expressed by the respondents of the qualitative interviews and from the results of the survey on school quality perceptions conducted on black parents, it has become apparent that more multi-level research in former black township schools is necessary. This needs to be undertaken in order to understand why there is still a noticeable migratory trend of black pupils from black township schools to the former Model C (white) schools in the more affluent suburbs and to former Indian schools in the

former Indian township of Lenasia more than fourteen years after educational transformation was aggressively effected in South Africa. A great deal of the literature reviewed (Jansen, 2008, Berger, 2003; Gallie et al, 1997) indicated that this trend was prevalent in the former Model C (white) schools. Little research (Soudien, 2007b) could be traced to confirm that this had been occurring in the former Indian public primary schools. Therefore, while supporting the general thrust of the literature on this subject, this study further uncovers that former Indian public primary schools (specifically in the Lenasia region neighbouring greater Soweto) are also experiencing similar trends as former Model C (white) primary schools regarding increased black pupil enrolment numbers as a result of dysfunctional black township public primary schools. It would be appropriate to further strengthen and confirm these findings with the undertaking of similar research on black pupil migratory trends in other former Indian townships in Gauteng, such as Laudium, Azaadville, Actonville and Roshnee.

One of the school principals' summed up this situation by stating that: *"There is a lot of good will for Soweto. Whether people will go back is the same question as to whether this Indian community will come back to the former Indian schools. Perceptions are hard to break. It is perceptions built on a legacy of destruction."*

This study further recommends that a starting point would be to further investigate the culture of learning and teaching in South Africa aimed at restoring this culture to one of a culture of accountability, transparency and openness. Within this framework, an effective and efficient education system would thrive where all stakeholders in the school environment would understand and practise their rights and responsibilities in an efficient and effective manner.

Ensuring that teachers are well equipped to implement the curriculum will not matter if the broader challenges of overcoming and reconstructing a culture of learning and teaching in the former black townships across South Africa are not effectively addressed. The organisational, structural and managerial aspects of schooling are of paramount importance if quantitative coupled with qualitative education is to prosper in a post-apartheid South Africa.

8. REFERENCE LIST

Africa and the Millennium Development Goals: 2007 Update.

Ayers, C.E. 1987. "Economic Development: An Institutionalist Perspective." Pp 45-53 in, *Latin America's Economic Development*, edited by J.L. Dietz & J.H. Street, Lynn Rienner.

Barton, Len. 2003. "The Politics of Education for All." Pp 57-64 in *Inclusive Education: Diverse Perspectives*, edited by Melanie Nind, Jonathan Rix, Kieron Sheehy and Katy Simmons. London, UK: David Fulton Publishers Ltd.

Berger, Eric. 2003. "The Right to Education under the South African Constitution." Columbia Law Review 103: No. 3: 614-661.

Bergmann, Herbert. 1996. "Quality of Education and the Demand for Education: Evidence from Developing Countries." *International Review of Education* 42: No. 6: 581-604.

Breakwell, G.M., Hammond, S. and Fife-Shaw, C. (1998). Research Methods in Psychology, London: Sage.

Chisholm, Linda. 2004. "*The Quality of Primary Education in South Africa.*" Background Paper prepared for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2005: The Quality Imperative.

Colclough, Christopher. 1993. *Educating All the Children – Strategies for Primary Schooling in the South*, Oxford, UK: Clarendon Press.

Colclough, Christopher. 2004. "Towards universal primary education." Pp 166-183 in *Targeting Development: Critical Perspectives on the Millennium Development Goals*, edited by Richard Black and Howard White. New York, USA: Routledge.

Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996.

Convention on the Rights of the Child.(1990). United National General Assembly Resolution 44/25 of 20 November 1989, Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights.

Cooper, Ian. 1985. "Teachers' Assessment of Primary School Buildings: The Role of the Physical Environment in Education." *British Educational Research Journal* 11: No.3: 253-269.

De Vaus, David. 2001. *Research Design in Social Research*. California. Sage.

Economic Commission for Africa. 2005. "The Millennium Development Goals in Africa: Progress and Challenges." Pp 1-29.

Education White Paper One: 1996. *School Ownership, Governance and Finance*.

Education White Paper Two. 1996. *The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools*.

Education White Paper Six. 2001. *Special Needs Education – Building an Inclusive Education and Training System*.

EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005.

Fataar, Aslam. 1997. "Access to Schooling in a Post-Apartheid South Africa: Linking Concepts to Context." *International Review of Education*, 43: No. 4: 331-348.

Gallie, Muavia., Yusuf Sayed., and Herma Williams. 1997. "Transforming Educational Management in South Africa." *The Journal of Negro Education* 66: No.4: 460-467.

Govender, Prega. 2008. "Wanted Now: 94 000 Teachers" *The Sunday Times*, 23 November 2008.

Greenstein, Ran. 2003. Introduction to Quantitative Methods.

Hallak, Jacques. 1990. *Investing in the Future – Setting Educational Priorities in the Developing World.* UNESCO Institute for Educational Planning. Oxford, England: Pergamon Press.

Henning, E. (2004). Finding your way in Qualitative Research. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Jansen, Jonathan. D. 1998. “Curriculum Reform in South Africa: a critical analysis of outcomes-based education.” *Cambridge Journal of Education* 28: No. 3: 321-331.

Jansen, Jonathan. D. 2008. “Schools integration needs special care.” *The Times,* 13 November 2008.

Johnson, David. 1995. “Introduction: The Challenges of Educational Reconstruction and transformation in South Africa” *Comparative Education* 31: No.2: 131-140.

Kaul, Rekha. 2001. “Assessing Primary Education: Going beyond the Classroom.” *Economic and Political Weekly* 36: No. 2: 155-162.

Lemon, Anthony. 2004. “Redressing School Inequalities in the Eastern Cape, South Africa.” *Journal of Southern African Studies* 30: No.2: 269-290.

Lockheed, Marlaine E., and Adriaan M Verspoor. 1994. *Improving Primary Education in Developing Countries*. World Bank: Oxford University Press.

Malherbe, Rassie. 2005. “The Constitution and equal educational opportunities.” Pp. 89-109 in *Equal Educational Opportunities,* edited by Charles J Russo, Johan Beckmann and Jonathan D Jansen. Pretoria, SA: Van Schaik Publishers.

Masango, Luke Bob. 2001. *Managing Physical Resources Provisioning in the Mpumalanga Department of Education*. A Research Report for Master of Management. Graduate School of Public and Development Management; University of the Witwatersrand.

Motala, Enver., and John Pampallis. 2001. "Educational Law and Policy in Post-Apartheid South Africa." Pp. 14-31 in *Education and Equity – The Impact of State Policies on South African Education*, edited by Enver Motala and John Pampallis. Sandown, SA: Heinemann Publishers (Pty) Ltd.

Motala, Shireen. 1995. "Surviving the System – A Critical Appraisal of Some Conventional Wisdom in Primary Education in South Africa." *Comparative Education* 31: No. 2: 161-179.

Mwamwenda Tuntufye S., and Bernadette B. Mwamwenda. 1987. "School Facilities and Pupils Academic Achievement." *Comparative Education* 23: No. 2: 225-235.

Naicker, Sigamoney. 1999. "Inclusive Education in South Africa." Pp. 12-23 in *Inclusive Education in Action in South Africa*, edited by Petra Engelbrecht, Lena Green, Sigamoney Naicker and Levi Engelbrecht. Pretoria, SA: J.L.van Schaik Publishers.

National Education Policy Act No. 27 of 1996.

National Policy Framework for Teacher Education and Development. 2007.

Pampallis, John. 2008. *South Africa: National Report on the Development of Education*, 48th International Conference on Education, 25-28 November 2008.

Pendlebury, Shirley. 1998. “Transforming Teacher Education in South Africa: a space-time perspective.” Cambridge Journal of Education 28: No. 3: 333-349.

Punch, Keith. 2000. *Developing Effective Research Proposals*. California: Sage.

Ranis, Gustav. 2004. “The Evolution of Development Thinking: Theory and Policy” *Yale University - Economic Growth Centre*. Discussion Paper. No 886: 1-38.

Report on the School Register of Needs 2000 Survey. 2000. Department of Education.

Richardson. J.T. (1996). Handbook of Qualitative Research Methods: for Psychology and the Social Sciences. Leicester: BPS Books.

Sachs, Jeffrey. D. 2005. *UN Millennium Project Report: Investing in Development – A Practical Plan to Achieve the Millennium Development Goals*. Washington D.C., Communications Development Inc, USA.

Sen, Amartya. 1997. “Development Thinking at the beginning of the 21st Century.” *Suntory Centre Discussion Paper*: 1-34.

Sen, Amartya. 1999. *Development as Freedom.* New York, Random House Inc, USA.

Sherman, R. and Webb, R (1988). Qualitative Research in Education: Focus and methods. London: Macmillan).

Sixty-second Session of the United Nations General Assembly. "*Recognising The Achievements , Addressing The Challenges And Getting Back On Track To Achieve The MDGs By 2015."* Speech by the President of the UN General Assembly, United Nations Headquarters, New York, 1 April 2008.

Smit, G.J. 1995. *Research Guidelines for Planning and Documentation*. Southern Book Publishers (Pty) Ltd: Halfway House. South Africa.

Smith, William. J., and Wendy Yolisa Ngoma-Maema. 2003. "Education for All in South Africa: Developing a National System for Quality Assurance." *Comparative Education* 39: No. 3: 345-365.

Soudien, Crain. 1992. "Responses to the Education Crisis in South Africa" *International Review of Education* 38: No. 3: 280-285

Soudien, Crain. 2007a. *Neglected Subjects ? Parents in the Schools of the New Millennium*. Catholic Institute of Education: Southdale, South Africa

Soudien, Crain. 2007b. *Youth Identity in Contemporary South Africa: Race, Culture and Schooling*. New Africa Education: New Africa Books (Pty) Ltd. South Africa

Soudien, Crain., and Jean Baxen. 1997. "Transformation and Outcomes-Based Education in South Africa: Opportunities and Challenges." *The Journal of Negro Education* 66: No.4: 449-459.

South African Millennium Development Goals Country Report.2005.

South African Millennium Development Goals Mid-Term Country Report. 2007.

South African Schools Act No. 84 of 1996.

Strauss, Anselm., and Juliet Corbin. 1990. "Basic Considerations" in *Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory Procedures and Techniques*. California: Sage.

The Millennium Development Goals Report. 2008.

Thorbeck, Erik. 2006. "The evolution of the Development Doctrine, 1950-2005." *UNU-WIDER Research Paper* No. 2006/155: 1-37.

UNDP MDG Monitor Mechanism, 2007 (web-site: www.mdgmonitor.org).

UNICEF Sourcebook – Children and Development in the 1990s – on the Occasion of the World Summit for Children, United Nations, New York, 29-30 September 1990.

United Nations General Assembly Resolution 55/2. 2000. *United Nations Millennium Declaration.*

Vandemoortele, Jan. 2003. “The MDGs and pro-poor policies: can external partners make a difference?”. Draft Paper. Poverty Group, United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). United Nations: New York.

Weiss, Robert. 1995. *Learning from Strangers: the Art and Method of Qualitative Interview Studies.* New York: Free Press.

White, Howard, and Richard Black. 2004. “Millennium Development Goals: a drop in the Ocean.” Pp 1-24 in *Targeting Development: Critical Perspectives on the Millennium Development Goals*, edited by Richard Black and Howard White. New York, USA: Routledge.

White Paper on Education and Training (South Africa). 1995.

World Bank. 2004. Responsible *Growth for the New Millennium.* Washington: Office of the Publisher, World Bank.

9. APPENDICES

9.1 Appendix I: Interview Schedule for School Principals (Second Round)

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

UNIVERSAL ACCESS TO PRIMARY EDUCATION AND THE IMPACT ON ENROLMENT NUMBERS

1. Part One: General Trends in Enrolment Numbers

1.1 Has there been a general increase or decrease in the number of enrolments in this school over the past eight years?

1.2 What role has MDG Two - universal access to primary education, Education for All, South African Government Laws and the SA Constitution emphasising the basic right to education played in enrolment levels at your school

1.3 Are there monitoring mechanisms in place that assess adherence to these goals aimed at children having access to schooling?

1.4 What reporting mechanisms (back to the Departments) are in place at school to ensure that the trends in enrolment levels are closely monitored? Are you given feedback?

2. Part Two: The Reasons for Increased or Decreased in Enrolment Numbers

2.1 Would you say that all the children of primary school-going age who live in this vicinity are attending this school? If not, what in your view are the reasons for non-attendance?

2.2 Is there a perception, by the residents of this area that a Quintile Four school cannot offer a good quality education?

2.3 Are there children travelling to this school from outside of Lenasia / Lenasia South?

2.4 What areas do these pupils come from? (specifically list the areas and give description i.e. rural, township, informal settlement, Soweto etc.)?

2.5 What, in your view, is the reason why these pupils are travelling to your school?

2.6 What impact do you think the need for good quality education is having on enrolment numbers at your school?

2.7 What would you consider to be some of the main challenges that Quintile One, Two and Three schools are experiencing in delivering a good quality education?

3. <u>Part Three</u>: The Impact of Increased or Decreased Enrolment Numbers on the school environment

3.1 What, in your view or per Departmental guidelines, is the carrying capacity of the pupil population of this school taking your current school infrastructural capacities into account?

3.2 Would you consider an excess of pupils to be the main determining factor for the infrastructural challenges you face in your current school set up? In what way?

3.3 What, in you view, are the three most pressing infrastructural development challenges you are currently experiencing at your school?

3.4 If there is an increase in enrolments, what mechanisms could be put in place by Government that would assist in limiting your enrolment numbers so that you could have adequate infrastructural capacity in your schooling environment?

3.5 How can Government assist with funding arrangements (in a Quintile Four school) regarding infrastructural development to cater for high enrolment numbers?

3.6 Have you turned pupils away based on infrastructural capacity concerns at your school?

9.2 Appendix II: Interview Schedule for School Teachers / Education Government Official

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE - TEACHERS

Part One: Enrolment Numbers

1.1 Since the post-1994, have you noticed an increase in the number of children in your class?

1.2 On average, how many children are there in your class/es?

1.3 What role, in your view, has the South African Government laws and the MDG Two and the Education for All Initiative played in enrolment numbers in your class?

Part Two: Migratory Patterns of Black Pupils

2.1 Would you say that all the children of primary school going age who live in the vicinity of the public schools are attending these schools? If not what in your views are the reasons for non-attendance?

2.2 Is there a perception by residents (Indian parents) in Lenasia that public schools do not offer a good quality education?

2.3 Would you consider many children from the neighbouring black townships (i.e. Greater Soweto region) attend Lenasia schools?

Part Three: Quest for Quality Education

3.1 What, in your view, is the reason why these pupils are travelling to Lenasia schools?

3.2 What impact do you think the need for and the perception of a good quality education is having on enrolment numbers at your school?

3.3 What would you consider to be some of the main challenges in black township schools regarding the culture of teaching and learning?

Part Four: Infrastructural Capacity

4.1 Would you consider an excess of pupils in your classes to be the main determining factor regarding the infrastructural challenges you face in your current school set up?

4.2 How do you deal with high teacher: pupil ratios and implementing the OBE system of education? What infrastructural challenges does this pose in your teaching methods/experiences?

4.3 What would you say are the three most pressing infrastructural challenges that you face in your teaching environment?

9.3 Appendix III: Interview Schedule for School Principals (First Round) / CEO's of the Education NGO's

INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR SCHOOLS

PART I: GENERAL ISSUES ON ACCESS TO PRIMARY EDUCATION

1.1 *Theme: Obstacles to Primary Education*

What would you consider as the key factors that play against the success of universal access to primary education?

- Does this involve inadequate financing for primary education?
- Does this involve deteriorating infrastructure and physical resources?
- Does this involve a physical environment that was not conducive to learning?
- Does this involve insufficient number and quality of primary school textbooks?
- Does this involve lack of educational technology and instructional aids?
- Does this involve poor quality or lack of supply and training of motivated teachers?

Does your school experience these problems?

What measures are in place to rectify/solve these problems at school?

1.2 *Theme: Outcomes Based Education*

What is the Outcomes Based Education approach to education and has this facilitated universal access to primary education?

- What is OBE: : (i) a focus on all learners performing successfully, but not at the same pace; (ii) all learning experiences building on more successes; and (iii) schools being crucial for creating the conditions for success at schools

1.3 Theme: Inclusive Education

How has the policy of Inclusive Education being incorporated into your school structures i.e. the Education White Paper 6: Building on Inclusive Education and Training System?

- Is there a sense of the practise of inclusive education at school where no child of school going age (out of school vulnerable children) should be excluded from school no matter how disadvantageous their backgrounds are?
- How does your school deal with this type of pressure i.e. increased enrolment numbers coupled with possible lack of funding and infrastructural services?
- Is there an adequate transfer of resources, careful planning and continual monitoring of this integration process
- Is there a greater role for parents and the community – are they involved in the activities of their child's education and school activities (ownership issues) Recommendations of the Report of the National Commission on Special Needs in

Education and Training aimed to create no differentiation between "special" and "ordinary" schools.

- There were 30 full service schools created in 2005 regarding inclusive education, is your school one of these or are you in the process of becoming

1.4 Theme: Quality Education

What is your understanding of the process aimed at improving quality of education?

- Does this involve curriculum development?
- Does this involve increasing learning materials?
- Does this involve increasing instructional time?
- Does this involve improving teaching?
- Does this involve increasing learning capacity?
- Does this involve entrenched monitoring and evaluation processes?
- Does this involve developing the professional quality of the teaching force?

In your opinion do the South African education policies facilitate such a process aimed at improving quality of education in primary schools?

1.5 Theme: Qualitative vs Quantitative Education

Do the South African education policies adequately address qualitative (high quality education) and quantitative practises (high enrolment numbers) in education?

- Qualitative education vs quantitative education i.e. depending on how well learners are taught and how much they learn directly impacted upon how long they remained in school and how often they attended school. In addition, parents' judgements on the quality of teaching and learning could also be a deciding factor regarding whether it is worth the time of their children and the costs for themselves. Any acceptable definition of universal primary education should not only consider the proportion of eligible children that can attended school, but should also focus on the nature and quality of schooling being offered.

What challenges do you face in marrying these two objectives in your school environment?

PART II: POLICIES/ STRATEGIES - ACCESS TO PRIMARY EDUCATION

2.1 Theme: No Fee Schools

Is a no school fee policy instituted at your school?

- While South Africa has been relived of the burden of compulsory school fees, has there been a paralleled, increased level of state funding noticed in your school?
- How is the no school fee policy implemented – is it targeted at all pupils or just a few?
- Has this policy contributed towards universal access to primary education?

Is there adequate government funding available to fill the financial gap?

2.2 Theme: School Uniform Policies

Is there a policy at your school aimed at assisting parents/pupils from poor households with the cost of uniforms?

- If so, is the programme successful?
- Is there a demand for participation in the programme?
- How are the pupils selected into the programme?
- Has this policy contributed towards universal access to primary education?

2.3 Theme: School Nutrition Programme

Does your school have a school nutrition programme?

- If yes, how is it administered – by whom, how many children in the feeding scheme, does it impact school attendance, how is it funded, what is the level of parent/community involvement?
- What are the challenges and constraints you are facing regarding its implementation?
- If no, is there a specific reason for not having one?
- Are you considering starting one?
- Taking into account the socio-economic conditions of the surrounding community, is this a priority area to ensure children attend school?

2.4 Theme: School Infrastructure

Do you have adequate infrastructural services (necessary physical resources, availability of laboratories, audio-visual equipment, library etc.) at school to meet the requirements for universal access to primary education?

- Is there a financial contribution from the provincial government for this or do funds have to be raised by the school?
- In your opinion, is there a sufficient lack of infrastructural development at your school that curds universal access to primary education?

2.5 Theme: Access of Girls to School

What is the enrolment numbers of girls (in comparison to boys) at your school?

- Are you running specific programmes at school aimed at gender sensitivity and empowerment of girls in schools?
- Is there adequate infrastructural development (water and sanitation facilities) for girls at school?
- Is there a high drop-out rate of girl pupils at your school?

PART III: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE STRUCTURES

3.1 Theme: Linkages between National and Provincial Governments, District Office and schools (governance issues)

Is there an adequate relationship / linkage between National and Provincial Government regarding implementation of school policies?

How has this impacted upon your effective implementation of education policies in school?

- While National Department of Education focuses on setting norms, policies, frameworks, Provincial Department of Education focus on policy implementation, service delivery, monitoring education districts. The chief criticism is that there is a disjuncture between the two - central system controlled policy which was separated from implementation and delivery at school level. Is this still the case?
- Policies need to be reviewed to test its effectiveness = monitor whether key goals of government being implemented + identify weakness
- Would you consider that there is a cooperative governance framework in place?

Is there a strong working relationship between your school and the District Office?

- What challenges exist that prevent a solid working relationship between the two bodies?

9.4 Appendix IV: Interview Schedule for Foreign Affairs Government Officials

INTERVIEW GUIDE ON MDGS

1. We have reached the mid-point of MDG implementation –would you consider the **UN Millennium Declaration as an effective tool**, thus far, for development in Africa?

   Probes:
   - Ask the Respondent (R) if he considers the MDGs as part of a larger framework in meeting the objectives of the international development agenda?
   - Ask R if we should we continue in this fashion?
   - Ask R if he thinks there are other alternatives/solutions/tools (stronger than the MDGs) for development needs?

2. Are all the **MDG targets achievable** by 2015?

   Probes:
   - Ask R if in his view he thinks that this is working/implementable?
   - Ask R if the thinks the targets are over-ambitious?
   - Does R think that some of the targets will be met?

3. Is there strong enough **political will by African leaders** to make a commitment to meeting the targets of the MDGs?

   Probes:
   - Ask R if he notices an increase in African leaders' determination to focus on socio-economic development?
   - Ask R if democracy in working in Africa?

4. In your view, what **national reforms** should African countries undertake to ensure that they will be closer to meeting the MDG targets?

   Probes:
   - Does R think that countries have a primary responsibility for their own development?
   - Ask R what conditions are required for domestic reforms to be undertaken?

5. Do you think that the incorporation of **MDG targets in national development strategies** has been successful and is this the most effective manner for implementation in Africa?

   Probes:
   - Does R see other ways/options in which governments can implement the MDGs?

- Ask R whether he thinks countries will have the capacity to implement goal-orientated policy frameworks focussing on the MDGs and pro-poor economic growth?
- Does R think that adequate budget and human resource allocation play the most important role in making the MDG-related national development strategies successful?

6. **Education-related MDG implementation** has been more successful in South Africa and the continent. What could be the attributing factor/s to this trend?

Probes:

- Ask R if he thinks that the National Department of Education has effectively internalised the education-related MDG as a contributing factor towards success?
- Ask R if the thinks that it could be possible for South Africa to adopt the "MDGs-plus" strategy with more ambitious targets?
- Ask R if the thinks that implementation of the education-related MDG in South Africa could be considered as a best practise or benchmarking model for other Government Departments and the continent?

7. **Health-related MDG implementation** has been poor in South Africa and the continent. What would need to be done to address this problem?

Probes:

- Ask R if a strong health system, with greater investments, is the key solution to ensuring universal access to basic health services
- Does R consider internal, management and policy-making problems that could be plaguing the National Department of Health as a contributing factor?
- Does R think that greater investments in health services could improve the rate of implementation?

8. Does the presence of **United Nations Agencies in South Africa** facilitate effective implementation of the MDGs at a national level?

Probes:

- Ask R if he can expand on whether the UN agencies provide technical assistance to relevant government departments in implementing the MDGs?
- Ask R if the United Nations Development Assistance Framework is being implemented in South Africa?
- Ask R if there is a formalised structure between the relevant South African Government Departments and the Pretoria-based UN Offices regarding MDG implementation?

9. Can MDG targets in South Africa only be met if **Official Development Assistance (ODA)** levels were dramatically increased to reflect internationally agreed commitments/targets?

Probes:

- Ask R if he thinks that making adequate ODA resources available to South Africa in a predictable way will allow better and effective planning?

- Does R think that there are ways in which to make the key development partners accountable for meeting their longstanding commitments?

10. What role does statistics and the capacity of governments, donors and international organisations to **measure, monitor and report on progress** play in shaping policy-making on MDG implementation in Africa?

Probes:

- Ask R if he thinks that the United Nations MDG monitoring mechanism is a true reflection of what is happening in countries?
- Ask R if the report back on progress thus far has impacted upon how South Africa's improves policy-making regarding its implementation of the MDGs?
- Ask R if he thinks that StatsSA has played an effective role, thus far, in monitoring and reporting on progress in South Africa?

p9.5 Appendix V: School Demographics Statistical Questionnaire



SCHOOL DEMOGRAHICS

STATISTICAL QUESTIONNAIRE

NAME OF SCHOOL:

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J

NAME OF PRINCIPAL:

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J

Researcher: Mr Devan Moodley – cell no. 076 404 2039
University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg
November 2008

SCHOOL YEAR: 2008

1. **School Population:**

Total Number of Pupils for the 2008 School Year	

2. **Racial Breakdown of School Population:**

Race	Number of Pupils
Black	
Indian	
Coloured	
White	
Other (Specify)	

3. **Grade One Enrolments:**

Total Number of Grade One Pupils for 2008	

4. **Annual School Fees:**

Annual School Fee per Pupil (in Rands)	
Number of Full Exemptions	
Number of Partial Exemptions	

5. **Pupils from other Provinces:**

Total Number of Pupils from other Provinces	

6. **Proximity of Pupils' Homes to the School:**

Number of Pupils living in the Lenasia/Lenasia South Area	
Number of Pupils living away from the Lenasia/Lenasia South Area	

7. **Educator Component:**

Total Number of Educators employed at the school	
Number of Educators remunerated by the State	
Number of Educators remunerated by the SGB	

SCHOOL YEAR: 2004

1. **School Population:**

Total Number of Pupils for the 2004 School Year	

2. **Racial Breakdown of School Population:**

Race	Number of Pupils
Black	
Indian	
Coloured	
White	
Other (Specify)	

3. **Grade One Enrolments:**

Total Number of Grade One Pupils for 2004	

4. **Annual School Fees:**

Annual School Fee per Pupil (in Rands)	
Number of Full Exemptions	
Number of Partial Exemptions	

5. **Pupils from other Provinces:**

Total Number of Pupils from other Provinces	

6. **Proximity of Pupils' Homes to the School:**

Number of Pupils living in the Lenasia/Lenasia South Area	
Number of Pupils living away from the Lenasia/Lenasia South Area	

7. **Educator Component:**

Total Number of Educators employed at the school	
Number of Educators remunerated by the State	
Number of Educators remunerated by the SGB	

SCHOOL YEAR: 2000

1. **School Population:**

Total Number of Pupils for the 2000 School Year	

2. **Racial Breakdown of School Population:**

Race	Number of Pupils
Black	
Indian	
Coloured	
White	
Other (Specify)	

3. **Grade One Enrolments:**

Total Number of Grade One Pupils for 2000	

4. **Annual School Fees:**

Annual School Fee per Pupil (in Rands)	
Number of Full Exemptions	
Number of Partial Exemptions	

5. **Pupils from other Provinces:**

Total Number of Pupils from other Provinces	

6. **Proximity of Pupils' Homes to the School:**

Number of Pupils living in the Lenasia/Lenasia South Area	
Number of Pupils living away from the Lenasia/Lenasia South Area	

7. **Educator Component:**

Total Number of Educators employed at the school	
Number of Educators remunerated by the State	
Number of Educators remunerated by the SGB	

UNIVERSITY OF THE WITWATERSRAND, JOHANNESBURG

SURVEY ON SCHOOL QUALITY PERCEPTIONS

Instruction: **For each of the following ten statements, please mark one box (either "Agree", "Unsure" or "Disagree") with an X.**

No.	Statement	Agree	Unsure	Disagree
1.	I want my child to travel everyday to this school because my child will receive a better quality education in this school rather than in the school nearest to my home.			
2.	My child will not receive good results in the school nearest to my home because that school is not well organised.			
3.	Education is provided in the English language at this school. This is the reason why I want my child to attend this school.			
4.	The school nearest to my home does not have qualified teachers or the teachers are under-qualified. They cannot provide my child with a good quality education.			
5.	This school is well-maintained and the facilities are good. My child will receive a good quality education in this school.			
6.	I do not want to send my child to the school nearest to my home because I do not believe that my child will receive a good quality education there.			
7.	My child will receive good results in this school because it is well-organised.			
8.	The school nearest to my home does not offer a good quality education in English for my child.			
9.	The principal and teachers at this school are well-qualified and motivated. They will provide my child with a good quality education.			
10.	The school nearest to my home does not have good facilities and is not well maintained. My child cannot receive a good quality education there.			

Thank you for taking the time to participate in this survey.

9.7 Appendix VII: Letter from Researcher Requesting an Interview

UNIVERSITY OF THE WITWATERSRAND, JOHANNESBURG

School of Humanities
Private Bag 3, Wits 2050, Johannesburg, South Africa

LETTER REQUESTING AN INTERVIEW

Dear Sir,

My name is Devan Moodley and I am an employee at the Department of Foreign Affairs. I am currently undertaking research for the completion of a Masters of Arts Degree (MA) in Development Studies at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

The aim of the study is to undertake research on the impact that achieving Millennium Development Goal (MDG) Two (universal access to primary education) is having on enrolment numbers in Quintile Four public primary schools. The findings will be shared with the ten participating sample schools for further reflection.

I would like to take this opportunity to invite you to participate in this study. As a school principal heading a school that fits the above criteria, you have been identified as one of the stakeholders in the implementation of the MDG that relates to universal access to primary education.

Your participation in this study will require me to conduct a 40-60 minute interview with you during a time that will be convenient for you. Pending your approval, I would like to record the interview for follow-up data collection and analysis aimed at answering the research question. Your participation in this project is completely voluntary and you have the right to withdraw from this project at any given time and without prior notification.

I will be ethically bound, in accordance with University regulations, to uphold the confidentiality of our discussions with no specific reference made to you in the final research report unless otherwise stated. In addition, the tape-recorded material will only be for my usage and will be destroyed once the final report has been submitted. During

the interview, you may refuse to answer questions that make you feel uncomfortable in any way.

I will contact you following the transmission of this letter requesting a response from you. Should you wish to participate, we will set up a convenient time to conduct the interview. I will provide you with a Consent Form stating your rights and my responsibilities on the day of (and prior) to the holding of the interview. Should you wish to contact me, my details are as follows:

Mr Devan Moodley
Deputy Director: NEPAD
Branch: Africa Multilateral
South African Department of Foreign Affairs

Tel: (012) 351 0570 (work)
076 404 2039 (cell)

E-mail: moodleyd@foreign.gov.za

Thank you for your consideration of this matter. I look forward to a favourable response.

Yours sincerely

Mr Devan Moodley

9.8 Appendix VIII: Consent Form



CONSENT FORM

1. **What is the aim of the study? :** The aim of the study is to undertake research on South African implementation of policies aimed at achieving Millennium Development Goal (MDG) Two (universal access to primary education) and the impact that this has on pupil enrolment numbers in a sample of ten Quintile Four public primary schools in the Lenasia / Lenasia South geographic area. The study will also explore perceptions of principals regarding the reasons for the increasing or decreasing enrolment numbers in their schools, including the impact on infrastructural capacity. .

2. **How was I chosen? :** As a school principal heading a school that fits the above criteria, you have been identified as one of the stakeholders in the implementation of the MDG that relates to universal access to primary education.

3. **What will be involved in participating? :** I would require your participation in one or more 40-60 minute interviews as well as, if and when appropriate, telephonic guidance and accessibility to non-confidential documentation that you may deem appropriate for the purposes of the study to be undertaken. Pending you approval, I would like to tape the interview and make a transcription from the tape. Subsequent interviews may or may not be taped, depending on the nature, frankness and confidentiality of the discussion.

4. **Who will know what I say? :** The only person (other than myself) who will see the transcript of the taped interview will be the supervisor of the study - Dr Michelle Williams, Department of Sociology, University of the Witwatersrand.

5. **What risks and benefits are associated with participation? :** I do not foresee any risks involved in your participation of this study. The only risk would be a breach of confidentiality on my part. In order to avoid this, the information shared during the interview will only be accessible to me. In order to ensure that participants remain anonymous, pseudonyms will be used with no direct references to names of participants. Permission would be required from the participant before direct quotations can be used in the final report. The benefits of participation will include your involvement in a study that is highly necessary and relevant to your field of activity in heading a Quintile Four public primary school. Furthermore, the findings will be shared with your organisation.

6. **What are my rights as a Respondent? :** Should you require clarification on any aspect of the interview or overall research to be undertaken, you will be provided with a comprehensive response by myself. Should you feel that my questions

make you uncomfortable, question your integrity or are inappropriate, you are not obliged to provide me with a response. Your participation in this study is voluntary and you are entitled to withdraw from this study at any given time without prior notification.

7. **What will be published? :** Once the research is done, submitted and approved by the University of the Witwatersrand (by February / March 2009) – as my thesis requirements for the completion of my Master of Arts (MA): Development Studies - the findings will be stored in the university electronic archives/database as a reference document.

8. **If I want more information, whom can I contact about the study? :** For further information, my contact details are as follows:

Mr Devan Moodley
Deputy Director: NEPAD
Branch: Africa Multilateral
South African Department of Foreign Affairs

Tel: (012) 351 – 0570 (work) E-mail: moodleyd@foreign.gov.za
076 404 2039 (cell)

9. **If in agreement with the above conditions, please sign the Consent Form:**

Respondent: Name and Designation Signature: _____

Place: _____

Date: _____

Interviewer: Mr D Moodley Signature: _____
Research Coordinator
MA: Development Studies Place: _____
University of the Witwatersrand
Student No: 8907806D Date: _____

Format for the Consent Form obtained from the following source:
R. Weiss. 1995. Learning from Strangers: the Art and Method of Qualitative Interview Studies. New York: Free Press

9.9 Appendix V: Recording Consent Form



RECORDING CONSENT FORM

I, _____, consent to my interview with Mr Devan Moodley regarding his research on South Africa's implementation of the Millennium Development Goal Two (universal access to primary education) and its impact on enrolment numbers in Quintile Four public primary schools being tape-recorded.

I understand that:

- The tapes and transcripts will not be seen or heard by any unauthorised persons, and will only be processed by the researcher.
- All tape recordings will be kept in a safe place only accessible to the researcher.
- No identifying information will be used in the transcripts or the research report.

Signed _____