



University of Witwatersrand

School of Language, Literature and Media

Department of Media Studies

1272096

Simphiwe Masiza

Research Topic

Giving voice: An analysis of the media's reporting on the failed insurrection, looting and arson in July 2021 in South Africa.

Main research question: What did the dominant voices in the media coverage of the failed insurrection of July 2021 reveal about the ideologies at play?

Sub-question

What discourse and ideologies were revealed regarding the way the failed insurrection, looting, and arson that took place in July 2021 were covered?

Masters Dissertation

Word Count: 50939

Supervisor: Professor Glenda Daniels

Declaration

I (Student number 1272096) Simphiwe Masiza a student registered for a Master of Arts, Media Studies in the year 2022. I hereby declare the following:

- I am aware that plagiarism (the use of someone else's work without their permission and/or without acknowledging the original source) is wrong.
- I confirm that the work submitted for assessment for the above course is my own unaided work except where I have explicitly indicated otherwise.
- I have followed the required conventions in referencing the thoughts and ideas of others.
- I understand that the University of the Witwatersrand may take disciplinary action against me if there is a belief that this is not my own unaided work or that I have failed to acknowledge the source of the ideas or words in my writing.

Signature: S Masiza

Date: 03-09-2023

Table of Contents

Declaration2

Abstract7

Chapter One: Introduction8

Failed insurrection, looting and arson in July 2021 in South Africa Background.....9

Study Background.....10

The Media Landscape: State of the Newsroom and Digitisation11

Media closure and retrenchments13

Journalist Safety.....14

Misinformation15

Sector Regulation.....16

Conclusion (Background)17

Chapter Two: Literature Review.....18

Media Content and Representation18

Racialised18

Gendered19

Classed20

Voice/s.....21

Listening.....23

Media representation of protests24

Triple Crises: Inequality, Unemployment and Poverty26

Print Circulation29

Media closure and retrenchments.....29

Media Trust30

Literature Review Conclusion.....31

Chapter 3: Theoretical Framework.....33

Radical democratic Theory.....33

Symbolic Annihilation.....34

Political economy of the media theory36

Main research question.....38

Sub-question	38
Theoretical framework Conclusion	38
Chapter Four: Methodology.....	39
Sampling and data collection	41
Sample size and description.....	41
Worst violence in years spreads in South Africa as grievances boil over.	41
Worst violence in years spreads in KZN.	41
South Africa as grievances boil over	41
Death toll from violent riots climbs past 70, with more than 1,200 arrests.	42
Free Zuma protestors shoot at police, probe into man's death under way.	42
Stop the violence’: ANC’s instruction to leaders over KZN Zuma turmoil.	42
Millions of rand of KZN infrastructure damaged in violent ‘Free Jacob Zuma’ protests.	42
Looting continues in Alexandra over Zuma incarceration	44
Brazen looting as pro-Zuma protests tear Joburg apart	44
Conclusion (Methodology)	44
Ethical Considerations	45
Chapter Five: Data analysis and findings: The ideology is revealed in the Discourses.....	46
Findings: Ideologies, Discourses, and Revelations	46
Dominant Voices from the forty articles.....	47
President and government departments	47
Politicians and Political Parties	49
Unions and their leaders	50
Community movements and community members.....	50
Taxi Bodies	53
Academics, Researchers, and Political analysts.....	54
Discourse from the 40 articles.....	55
Looting targeting Businesses	55
Calling for calm and condemning the looting.....	59
Free Zuma	61
No to looting.....	62

Lack of law enforcement and Criminality.....	64
Job loss	66
Police overwhelmed	67
Ideologies at play	70
Colonialism ideology	71
Authoritarian Political ideology	71
Racism ideology	72
Neo-liberalism Ideology.....	73
Dominant Discourses and Revelations.....	74
Calling for calm and condemning the looting.....	75
Criminality	76
Protest for Zuma.....	77
The inefficiency of the police in dealing with the looters (Police Overwhelmed)	78
The ideologies and discourses at play revelations	81
Data analysis and findings Conclusion	83
Data analysis: Integrating findings with Theory	84
Looting targeting businesses	84
Political Parties.....	90
Civil Society Organisations.....	94
Lack of law enforcement and Criminality.....	95
President and government departments.....	98
Academics, Researchers, and Political Analysts.....	100
Community Members.....	102
Job Loss.....	102
Calling for call and condemning the looting.....	103
Chapter Six: Conclusion and Recommendations	105

Bibliography	113
Turnitin	122

Abstract

This dissertation explores what the dominant voices in the media coverage of the failed insurrection of July 2021 revealed about the ideologies at play? The research further probed what discourse and ideologies were revealed regarding the way the failed insurrection, looting, and arson that took place in July 2021 were covered. The dissertation provides a background discussion of the media landscape. It then discusses the relevant literature review focusing on issues of media voices, absence, representation, and underrepresentation of certain groups in the media. The research employed qualitative discourse analysis on forty (40) online articles. Furthermore, it tested the findings using a radical democratic, symbolic annihilation and a political economy of the media theoretical framework. The limitations of the research surfaced due to the reliance on daily publications such as the *Daily Sun*, *Sowetan* as well and the *Independent Online articles (IOL)* mainly because weekend publications such as the *Sunday Times* provided limited data as they reported on the events outside the focal dates. Dependence on mainstream data rather than a balance between community and national was a further limitation. The analysis pointed to media content that is classed and ideologically mediated, it also indicated that the plurality of voices encouraged by the main theoretical framework of radical democracy is highly compromised and some groups are more visible than others. As guided by the research questions the dissertation revealed various ideologies and discourses and concluded that those that were preferred by the media were mainly dominated by the elite or privileged members of society.

Key Concepts: Media Content and Representation - Racialised, Gendered Classed, Voices, Listening, Media representation of protests, Print Circulation, Media closure and retrenchments, Media Trust, Radical Democracy, Symbolic annihilation and The Political economic theory of the media.

Chapter One: Introduction

Rationale

Almost three decades into democracy, South Africa remains a country where the majority are marginalised, lack adequate narrative resources, and cannot fundamentally practice their citizenship. “The views of ordinary people captured in public hearings across the country are severely underrepresented, furthermore this underrepresentation aligns with the position that the print media has adopted concerning society’s poor and marginalised members” (Radebe and Chiumbu 2022:101). Investigating the media coverage of the July 2021 events is critical in that previous research of events such as the Marikana Massacre¹ indicated that the media coverage prioritised a limited number of voices. This led to dominance over, suppression and marginalisation of alternative voices. According to Duncan (2014:21), “In the early reporting on Marikana, many journalists assumed that a limited number of sources were needed for the story to be balanced and that the workers' voice was ‘covered’ through interviews with union officials, when clearly it was not”. Duncan further argued that “What is emerging in the public domain is a hierarchy of views about what actually happened on that day” (ibid.). The media coverage of the Marikana Massacre tended to prioritise voices of those in authority such as the government, the president, political parties, academic experts, companies and mine bosses, police, and leaders of workers unions such as AMCU (Association for Mineworkers and Construction Union) or NUM (National Union of Mineworkers). This accession is further supported by Wasserman (2015:69). This indicates that some of the affected parties such as the workers, the widows, families, and those that live among both the workers and their widows were excluded and denied a platform that could have added value to the discussion.

Significance of the study (Why should anyone care? Why does it matter?)

With the above rational in mind research on the July 2021 events is significant in that it provides an opportunity to academics, civil society, Media and government see if media is leaving up to its constitutional mandate, as explain by Makou (2021:1-2) “Media as a fourth estate arm of government performing the duty of society's watchdog and ensuring accountability to the people and also at the same time ensuring the participation of the governed in the process of governance”. The project will further bring forth data that will test Radebe et al (2022:101) accessions that “Media has the power to make certain groups of people in the country invisible through the definite lack of representation”. In addition, the topic at hand provides a noteworthy opportunity on how commercial interest of South African media represents the citizens in particular in a country that is grappling with the crises of poverty, inequality and poverty.

Objectives and Research focus

This dissertation aims to explore whether ideology affects news content in the South African Media, with a keen focus on key issues of the media, such as voice/s and belonging in South Africa. The research endeavors to peruse these aims by doing an analysis on the media's reporting on the failed insurrection, looting and arson in July 2021 in South Africa. The probe will be done by looking at the following question:

- What did the dominant voices in the media coverage of the failed insurrection of July 2021 reveal about the ideologies at play?
- What discourse and ideologies were revealed regarding the way the failed insurrection, looting, and arson that took place in July 2021 were covered?

Contribution

This study will contribute issues of voices, absence, representation, or underrepresentation of certain groups in the media are critical and this research will provide fresh insights into these issues. This study will provide fresh insight into important issues of voice and media representation. Issues of voice and media representation are important to research, and this study will provide fresh insights into these issues and provide value. The implications of the data will be analysed through the lenses of a radical democratic and symbolic annihilation theoretical framework.

Methodology

The project will analyse forty online news articles using a qualitative discourse analysis. The study will be underpinned by radical democratic, symbolic annihilation and political economic theory.

Study Limitations

The limitations of the research surfaced in the form of the primary data, focusing mostly on mainstream or national publications and not limit their coverage to the elite media. The research could have been deepened with data that balances both community and national media.

Failed insurrection, looting and arson in July 2021 in South Africa Background

On 29 June 2021, President Jacob Zuma was sentenced to 15 months in prison for being in contempt of court in the probe of the ongoing state capture case¹. Independent Online News (2021) an open supporter of Zuma in its coverage, informed:

¹ State capture of the South African government under the Zuma regime proceeded in large part through control of the contracting authorities for lucrative state-owned enterprises (soes). More recently, the power elite also consolidated state control by capturing the prosecuting authorities responsible for pursuing redress for criminal corruption within SOE'S. Former President Jacob Zuma was able to secure his first term in office despite previous charges of rape and 783 counts

“In a ruling handed down on Tuesday (29 June), the country's top court (Constitutional Court) gave Zuma a direct and unsuspended sentence of 15 months of imprisonment, following Zuma's contempt charges after defying a court order to testify before the Zondo commission of inquiry, where he has been implicated in corrupt activities by several witnesses”. Zuma's leading allies and family members called for his release and encouraged the masses to disturb and target the economy, forcing the authorities to release the former president. According to Ngwane (2021:321) “Zuma's leading supporters, including his daughter and other family members, called on the masses to engage in disruptive and violent protest; they are accused of having orchestrated specific actions of economic sabotage, arson and looting on at least the first day of the protest”. For a week, Durban and KwaZulu Natal witnessed theft, arson and looting of shops and other infrastructure.

Thousands of individuals engaged in acts of public violence and rampant theft in KZN and Gauteng primarily during the period 10-14 July 2020, criminal acts saw trucks, retail centers, warehouses, industrial centers, distribution hubs, animal and food markets, and critical infrastructure damaged or destroyed closure of Durban's port and the N2 and N3 highways resulted in millions of people being unable to access wheat to process into flour, and the movement of yeast from port to major bakeries was halted (Tatsvarei et al, 2021:3,4).

Chapter one provides and introduces the context of the research, the objectives and questions are identified, limitation of the study and a nuanced argument of the value of the research. Chapter two provides a detailed relevant literature review that is grounded in the political economy of the media in South Africa and its ideological make-up. In chapter three, a theoretical framework is outlined and adopts a qualitative inductive viewpoint along with the research design. Chapter four provides an analysis of the media's reporting on the failed insurrection, looting, and arson in July 2021 in South Africa. This chapter probes whether ideology affects the news content in South Africa despite the transformation of over nearly three decades. It aims to answer the question: Is content in South Africa equally representative of all citizens?

Study Background

The background begins by tracing the ideological polarisation of the print media in the apartheid era. It brought forth the issues that have contributed to the status core of the media room, and have dominated media landscape such as newsroom, digitisation, Media closure and retrenchments, Journalist Safety, Misinformation, Sector Regulation, Media trust.

In the apartheid era the political environment in South Africa was divided between the National Party (NP) (Afrikaans), the Progressive Party (English) and the African National Congress and the media space was ideological and reflective

of fraud, corruption, and racketeering After this inauspicious start, Zuma continued throughout his tenure (from 2009 to 2018) to accrue more corruption accusations while continuing to evade prosecution.

of the politics of the time. Tomaselli informs that “Prior 1994, the dominant political party was the NP, and the Progressive Party, which later transformed to become the present-day Democratic Alliance (DA) and the “then banned political and “liberation” movements the ANC, the media of the time mirrored these divides” (2008:172). The English press was supportive of the Progressive Party and showed sympathy to the ANC and the Afrikaans Press was pro the National Party. “The English-language press leaned towards and was supportive of the progressive Party, under the surface showed pity to the liberation movement and the Afrikaans language press was generally in favour of the National Party” (Tomaselli 2008 172). In the democratic South Africa, the political power moved to the liberation movement that ushered in a different conflict between the ruling party, the ANC, and the media. The conundrum between the ANC and the media dates back to the first democratic president (Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela), who was of the view that the then ownership being in the hands of the white minority provides an opportunity to undermine the newly elected government. Daniels (2012:127) Quoting Nelson Mandela “the truth is that the media is still in control of whites, conservative whites, who are unable to reflect the aspirations of the majority”. The friction continued when Thabo Mbeki took over the reigns as president. Daniels (2012:127) informs of Thabo Mbeki’s outlook on the view on Media “We are faced with the virtually unique situations that, among the democracies, the overwhelming dominant tendency in South African politics, represented by the ANC, has no representation whatsoever in the mass media”. The reigns were handed to the next captain Jacob Gezeyihlekisa Zuma, he was of the view that media is inclined to profits. According to research done by Daniels, (2012:140). “Zuma’s view is that the threat to press freedom is not from the political arena and the state but commercial imperatives”.

Post-apartheid it seems that the ruling party visualised media environment that resembled that supported political ideologies and, in this case, leaning towards the ANC. Daniels “The desire of the ruling party, the (ANC) would be met if there was a more supportive and loyal press (2012:1). Daniels who is supportive of the South African media and its watchdog role informs that “The press finds compliance with this desire out of kilter with its professional code of ethics, its role of holding power to account, loyalty to the citizenry, exposing abuses of power and being a ‘watchdog’ in the unfolding democracy” (2012:1). The media space in South Africa has been constantly changing and has an impacted on most if not all citizens be it indirectly or directly.

The Media Landscape: State of the Newsroom and Digitisation

The traditional South African media space has been disrupted and finds itself navigating crises and challenges that affected numerous aspects of the industry. She (2013:5) described the state of the newsroom thus: “The newsroom of South Africa as a ship sailing into extreme headwinds of change”. The world was in transition, with technology making significant breakthroughs and providing environments for audiences to link to and access a vast amount of news. The 2013 State of the Newsroom publication argues that “technological advances were making global connectivity an

essential in daily life, the flood of information continues apace” (2013:35:36). Among the many changes newsrooms witnessed was the digitisation of the media space. “One of the main digital-first indicators was a business decision made by many of South Africa's newspapers: that print editions would be just one in a suite of products offered to consumers, which may lead to the online offering taking precedence over the print product” (Daniels, 2013:35). For example, in 2012, BDlive was publishing stories online first, and they would then appear in the print edition later. Therefore, the normality of news dissemination was changing to accommodate the new technological way of doing things. According to Daniels (2015:57), “The new direction entailed moving towards digital offerings (such as online news) taking precedence over traditional news mediums (such as print newspapers), while ensuring that social media was given a prominent place”. With the change of journalism, journalists needed to alter the old way of doing things such as producing news only for print. Instead, they needed to embrace the availability of multiple platforms. Daniels informed that “social networks, Twitter and Facebook, on iPad, on Kindle and on mobi, websites, blogs, portals, and associated digital applications were used to reach audiences which involved actively engaging with readers as well as breaking news on the social networks” (2013:37). This meant that journalists were now required to be more tech-savvy and learn how to use multiple technological instruments. Based on the (2014:35) State of the Newsroom report, “Journalists were required to juggle more devices with which to disseminate news, in a long working day, to keep up with platform agnostic audiences”. This indicated that journalists were not only required to use computers, but also iPads, iPhones, laptops, and other necessary gadgets available at their disposal, this was key in keeping in touch with online audiences and becoming visible online. Social media platforms were at the centre of the new way of doing journalism in that it was used to keep up with the fast-paced consumption of news. “In 2013 Twitter was the most-used social network in the newsroom, and by 2014 this had accelerated to being regarded as an “indispensable professional tool” according to the State of the Newsroom 2014 report. With major changes such as audiences migrating from print consumption to online consumption, this meant print sales were declining drastically. Finlay (2017:1) informed that:

Newsprint circulation continued its downward trend over 2017, with overall losses in circulation experienced in daily, weekly, and weekend papers, as well as free papers, third quarter statistics from the Audit Bureau of Circulations of South Africa (ABC) showed a total decline of 6% in circulation, compared to the previous year, both weekend (down 12.1% from the previous year) and dailies (11.9%) experienced the steepest decline in circulation, with the circulation of weekly papers falling 6.5%.

With print circulation numbers dropping, this meant the newsrooms were forced to restructure, downscale, or sell. Finlay argues, “Downscaling in newsrooms persists as a troubling feature of the local media landscape, along with voluntary severance packages being offered to qualifying employees” (2017:1). For example, 70 journalists at Independent Media in 2016 accepted severance packages.

The South African media landscape dates to the 18th and 19th centuries and has a unique and diverse history. Print media has not only been a part of South Africa but most parts of Africa (Wigston, 2007:4)[1]. Print media in the age of digitisation has never been the same, it has struggled with poor circulation numbers, and this has deteriorated because of the Covid-19 lockdown regulations. Finlay (2020:9) posits that “The nationwide lockdown due to the covid-19 pandemic that began at midnight on March 26 eviscerated an already fragile print media industry, with the magazine trade and community newspapers suffering the most serious blow”. This sad situation forced struggling companies to either stop printing or close their businesses. “Magazine publishers closed their doors at the start of lockdown” (Skinner, 2020:25). For example, Associated Media and the Caxton & CTP's magazine division closed, and the smaller publications stopped printing under lockdown. The lockdown situation opened a need for a weekly national newspaper, however, because of the downward spiral of print news circulation and loss of revenue it would not be feasible. According to Skinner, “At the beginning of lockdown, there were also distress calls from the independent national weekly newspaper, the *Mail & Guardian* (M&G), the editor-in-chief at the time, Khadija Patel, stated that their income would not adequately cover the cost of producing the newspaper, including the payment of salaries” (2020:25). Growing the industry and diving into new opportunities would not be financially possible and this indicates the financial woes in the print industry.

Media closure and retrenchments

Dugmore (2018:35) is of the view that “It is becoming clear that globally and in South Africa many people are just ‘not that into’ news, or at least not particularly interested in ‘hard news’ – across many countries, about a third of people are ‘news averse’”. The challenges, such as a decrease in revenue and the shrinking print media industry, affected both employees and employers in that employees were compelled to make tough decisions such as retrenching workers. “The widespread decline in circulation has had several effects: audience revenue from cover price has dropped, and advertising revenue along with it, the reaction of media groups has been to cut back on staffing and products” (Dugmore, 2018:36). This led to several media houses reducing their staff and many employees losing their jobs. Finlay (2020:9) stated, “Media houses pushed through with retrenchment plans, despite the pandemic, an estimated 700 jobs were lost to the industry at the start of the lockdown”. For example, media houses that closed included Cosmopolitan, House and Leisure, Men’s Health, Caxton & CTP, and Media24 also shut down four community titles. Print media companies further explored the option of bringing together different newspapers as one establishment which meant fewer staff members. For example, “Noordkaap and Kalahari Bulletin were to be merged into a single newspaper” (Skinner, 2020:26). “Media24 also shut down four community titles and merged some into single papers leading to many retrenchments”, which exacerbated job losses” (Finlay, 2020:9). This was evident at Media24 which looked at retrenching 510 staff members. Journalist's loss of jobs included freelance workers because print companies could not afford their services

anymore. Finlay argued that “Job losses and income affected both the employed journalist and freelancers, it is estimated that while journalists lost about 45% freelancers lost up to 80% income” (2020:9). According to Skinner, “Freelancers Association (SAFREA) reported that its members had been particularly severely impacted and that 60% of the approximately 500 members had lost almost 70% of their income and some had lost as much as 80% or could find no work at all” (2020:26). The job losses in the print industry that were visible when digitisation kicked in intensified because of the Covid-19 pandemic. The situation was so severe that interventions from industry organisations were needed. “In July 2020, The South African National Editors’ Forum (SANEF) set up an industry relief fund for journalists who had lost their jobs or contracts as a direct result of the lockdown” (Skinner, 2020:27). The intervention by organisations such as SANEF indicates the severity of the job loss crises.

Journalist Safety

Journalist safety and the ability to report freely is always fundamental to the freedom of expression and this is promoted by the South African Constitution. Section 16(1) of South Africa's Constitution states that “Everyone has the right to freedom of expression, which includes freedom of the press and other media; freedom to receive or impart information or ideas; freedom of artistic creativity; and academic freedom and freedom of scientific research”. Journalists in the country have found it challenging to report freely as guided by the constitution because their safety has been a concerning issue for years. Daniels (2015:10) informed that “A freelance journalist by the name of Tshele was shot by a police officer because he had a camera and was taking photographs of broken water pipes”. The trend of journalist safety has been prevalent in recent years and journalists have endured serious and dangerous working environments. Skinner (2020:29) noted that, “Journalists were also caught in the crossfire, or potentially deliberately shot at”. For example, rubber bullets were fired at News24 reporter Azarrah Karrim. Journalists faced severe psychological effects because of experiences that came with being at the front and covering the Covid-19 pandemic. According to Skinner, “We cannot underestimate the trauma that journalists have suffered being at the coalface of reporting on the pandemic, the psychological toll is something that should not be underestimated” (2020:29). Psychological issues are paramount and should be prioritised, along with physical safety in journalism.

A News24 reporter was caught in the crossfire when police fired rubber bullets to disperse pockets of people loitering in the streets of Yeoville, Johannesburg on day one of the nationwide lockdown. News24 reporter Azarrah Karrim was on the scene filming the incident on a nearby street when pedestrians suddenly started running to safety after being fired on by the police. As an officer stood at the entrance of a house aiming his gun inside a property, he noticed Karrim recording and ran toward the journalist, calling over his colleagues (News24, 2020).

A journalist was hit by a rubber bullet fired by police while covering the taxi protests in KaNyamazane. Mweliso Masilela, a former SABC journalist and a news reporter for Newzroom Africa, was shot in his cheek by police who were dispersing the crowd (Mpumalanga News, 2020).

Misinformation

Misinformation and disinformation are understood as processes of distributing information that is not true without any harmful intent. According to Derakhshan et al. (2017:9), “Misinformation is when false information is shared, but no harm is meant”. This contrasts with disinformation in that it is shared knowingly and with ill intent. Derakhshan et al. argue that “Dis-information is when false information is knowingly shared to cause harm” (2017:9). The Covid-19 pandemic provided an environment for vast amounts of misinformation and disinformation because of the fear and unknown nature of the pandemic. Skinner (2020:30) notes, “Misinformation and disinformation increased significantly during the pandemic; this period became the perfect environment for the spread of false information”. Individuals and organisations took advantage of this period to advance their agendas such as profit-making and promoting political beliefs and ideas. Further, Skinner argued, “A big growth in general in disinformation but especially around such areas as Covid”, and that, “Some covid disinformation was directly for profit, via ad-driven fake news sites, some were to drive political and ideological agenda” (2020:30). The spread of misinformation and disinformation became a crisis not only for media houses but for citizens, governments, and fact-checking organisations. According to Skinner (2020:30) “To deal with the “infodemic”, several countries introduced laws that criminalised misinformation and disinformation”. For example, The Government Gazette, under the Disaster Management Act, of 2002, regulated that an offender guilty of misinformation and disinformation could face fines and or jail sentences of up to six months. The criminalisation of misinformation and disinformation had the potential to infringe on free speech and, therefore, became highly contested. Skinner wrote, “Several media NGOs, including Media Monitoring Africa (MMA), stated that although their default position was to treat any effort to criminalise speech with the greatest level of caution, after consultations with lawyers they believed that the regulations were constitutional” (2020:31). MMA believed that to conjure misinformation and disinformation, fact-checking platforms were paramount. The organisation developed the Real411 platform to check the validity of information, which was supported by the government and prominent organisations.

MMA encouraged citizens to use their online platforms such as Real411, to report “dodgy news” on two social media platforms, and for this to be quickly assessed by media freedom experts and lawyers, and removed if false, MMA developed partnerships with Facebook and Twitter to facilitate this along with Government officially endorsing the platform and organisations and SANEF promoted it as a keyway to counteract disinformation (Skinner, 2020:31).

Coming together of major organisations to fight misinformation and disinformation acknowledges the problem and the urgency to counter it.

Sector Regulation

The two sectors that are print and online that are a focal area for the current research fall into a presiding structure known as Press Council of South Africa, that is made up of various members of society. “Print and online media are governed by co-regulation with the Press Council of South Africa, which is so constituted that there are equal numbers of public and media representatives, six of each. It also has a retired judge and an ombudsman” (Daniels 2020:11). The governing structure for print media that provides guidance in matters such as news circulation, facts, hearsay, and handling disputes is known as the Press Council. According to The Independent Panel Report (2021:280) “The Press Council has developed the South African Press Code to guide journalists in their daily practice of gathering and distributing news and opinion, and to guide the Ombud and the Adjudication Panel in reaching decisions on complaint”. Media regulation has been an ongoing debate in South Africa and the presiding party and government with various legislation such as The Protection of State Information Bill (Secrecy Bill)² and Media Appeals Tribunal (MAT)³. According to Daniels (2020:12) “The Secrecy Bill and the resolution for a MAT have negative implications for the newsroom and for journalists. In different ways, these two pieces of proposed legislation would impede the free flow of information and allow for surveillance of citizens and journalists – by means of tapping phones for example”. South African journalists are of the view that there is a great insufficiency of regulatory bodies, and those that do exist are not intertwined with the masses. Van Oerle (2022:59) learned that “There was not sufficient interaction with these bodies and that they were not sufficiently strong, and there is a lack of satisfactory understanding of how the sector is regulated”. Unions in South Africa play a significant role in advocating on behalf of employees, but the print media lacks or does not benefit from strong organisations (unions), therefore, workers and journalists are not protected and may end up being exploited. Van Oerle argues that “The absence of strong unions in the media industry and stated that this had meant that retrenchment processes in the industry had been particularly brutal with little, or no support given to journalist” (2022:60). Journalists, especially those that enjoy seniority in the industry, recognise media unions, however, caution that unions can not only be concerned about issues of the employer and employee such as hiring, firing, salaries, and safety because that is detrimental to the print media industry and the unions themselves. “Unions have not matured with time nor kept abreast

² The South African Protection of State Information Bill, formerly named the Protection of Information Bill and commonly referred to as the Secrecy Bill, is a highly controversial piece of proposed legislation which aims to regulate the, protection and dissemination of state information, weighing state interests up against transparency and freedom of expression. It will replace the Protection of State Information Act, 1982, which currently regulates these issues.

³ The Media Appeals Tribunal was proposed in an African National Congress (ANC) 2010 discussion paper, which, in turn, builds on a resolution adopted at the party's 2007 National Conference in Polokwane.^[2] A basic premise of the resolution is the idea that freedom of the press is not an absolute right, but must be balanced against individuals' rights to privacy and human dignity.

of the core issues for their members, most unions remain locked into an employer/employee conflict spiral that, frankly, is detrimental to their cause” (Van Oerle, 2022:60).

Conclusion (Background)

The above section titled Background aimed to provide the context of media today, both political and commercial, the state of the newsroom and paints a picture of the current crisis in journalism. The contexts discussed are key in that they either directly or indirectly have some bearing on reportage on the July looting.

The chapter further provided a discussion of the media conflict and the ruling party’s different views on how to move forward into the new democratic dispensation. It traced the ANC’s view on media from the first democratic president (Mandela) followed by his successor (Mbeki) then to Zuma's perspectives and what the media envisioned itself as (watchdog).

The South African newsroom has been in constant change as indicated since the inception of democracy. The section provided the broad Media landscape and discussed various issues in the state of the newsroom, digitisation that challenged journalists to be more technologically inclined and social media savvy. Journalism has changed or progressed, and technology was at the centre of the change. The availability and usage of technology have further perpetuated misinformation, which has urged the organisations and government to look into regulating online spaces. Furthermore, media rooms witnessed closure and retrenchment, which also resulted in experienced journalists being lost to the newsroom. The closures and retrenchments were severe and brutal to journalists, but this was somewhat relieved by media industry organisations such as SANEF which intervened with relief funds. The levels of crime in the country have escalated and several incidences reported of journalists being attacked.

Sector regulation provided a discussion and a view on the current media legislation and the dynamics that surround media unions. The above overview of media in South Africa provides a relevant background to reportage on the 2021 July looting

Chapter Two: Literature Review

The literature review covers the political economy of the media in South Africa and its ideological make-up.

Media Content and Representation

Racialised

In a developing democracy like South Africa that is guided by a constitution, it is expected that media content is reflective of the country and its people. However, because of the known racial history, we learn that media content and representation are racialised, gendered, and classed. Rao and Wasserman (2015:651) are of the view that “South African media have given limited attention to the deep divisions—cantered around class, gender, race, and caste which mark day-to-day life in each society”. This accession is further supported by Chiumbu, who notes that “Despite the end of apartheid in South Africa in 1994, the country remains deeply divided across class, race, and gender” (2016:417). This segment looks to understand the racial issues concerning media content and representation in the country, it was hoped that the abolishment of racial laws and introduction of policies such as those geared at empowering the previously disadvantaged and transformation of content. Govenden (2022:1) writes that “The introduction of the Broad-Based Economic Empowerment (B-BBEE)[\[1\]](#) was premised at governing the transformation agenda, hence the media in South Africa have adopted a black ownership-focused approach to transformation, clearly based on the premise that black and diverse ownership will result in transformed content on these levels”. Racialised media content and representation has been a thorny issue that has been visible as early as the Mandela era in that black people were ill targeted by print media. Radebe informs that “From the onset of democracy, Nelson Mandela and other ANC leaders have accused the print media of “continuing racism”, arguing that “the press seemed to delight in stories of black incompetence with an eagerness that betrayed a continuing racism” (2017:59). Friedman, (2011:108) concurs with this view, arguing that: “While there has been racial change in the media since 1994, whites have retained significant decision making power in the press; whether it is used to perpetuate stereotypes which undermine democracy in a very direct way is an important question that deserves sustained debate”. Therefore, it is evident that media content and representation in South Africa are entangled with racial issues and procedures even though the media has supposedly transformed. It appears to continue to serve the white and black elites.

Despite changes at the boardroom and content level, the South African print media still show signs of continuity with the past. Print media still operate according to the same functionalistic structural logic and advertising that has as their target the lucrative – and arguably still largely white, or at least affluent black elite market, although ownership transfers meant a deracialisation of the industry at the boardroom level, the market segmentation displays continuities with the societal polarisations of apartheid (Chiumbu 2016:423).

“The ethos of this media remains rooted in apartheid-like economic and ideological rationalities” (Radebe and Chiumbu 2022:89). Govenden and Chiumbu (2020:91) argue that transformation is mostly an illusion, despite the racial diversification of the media. This section argues that media representation in South Africa is often racialised. Chiumbu and Radebe, (2022:90) argue that: “The issues of global capitalism, epistemic dominance, racism, and other related matters as manifested in the political economy of media operations”. Although there are visible changes within the media realm, what is key is legislation that confronts racism not only within a particular period but also discrimination fostered through institutions and laws in the new age. “Policies supporting media transformation must become ‘race-conscious’ in a way that openly confronts racism and engages with systematic racism and exclusion” (Govenden & Chiumbu, 2020:1). Failure to provide and adhere to suitable legislation that addresses both historic and contemporary forms of apartheid is as good as accepting the past ills as legitimate. “One key policy intervention in addressing the economic disparities of the past was the introduction of Black Economic Empowerment (BEE)^[2] instituted to broaden participation in the economy, especially by those perceived to have been previously excluded or denied access” (Chiumbu and Radebe, 2020:3).

With, policies such as BEE and B-BBEE) have successfully opened up the media spectrum to a few and continue to facilitate the racial inequalities that are embedded in media cooperations. Govenden and Chiumbu, (2020:4) are of the view that “all B-BBEE has achieved is the cosmetic and minimal co-optation of a new black elite into business, without fundamentally changing the racialised accumulation regime, in which the media is entangled and without introducing genuine media diversity”.

Media in South Africa needs not only to make progress in tackling racial forms in terms of ownership and the current law (B-BBEE) but also to include content diversity that is reflective of the previously disadvantaged. “Notions of transformation must be defined more broadly than broad-based black economic empowerment (B-BBEE) indicators only, as this could all too easily lead to an elite form of transformation, involving racial substitution, but not necessarily a more substantive transformation of print media content” (Duncan, 2014:484). The above failures will result in the previously marginalised continuing to be excluded or depicted in a manner that continues to perpetuate racism. “Corruption stories are often racialised and blackness continues to be associated with negativity in the media – crime, rape, and general failure” (Steyn, 2015:128). Examples of racialised content include naming such as “disorderly”, “criminals”, “lawless”, and “incompetent”. Therefore, the above argument points to media content that is racialised.

Gendered

All countries have their own challenges that are usually embedded in the past. In the case of South Africa, this includes inequalities such as gender disparities. Rao and Wasserman (2015:651) observe that “South Africa contends with major

inequalities across so many sociocultural dimensions, including large economic inequalities as well as major disparities such as religion, class, and gender”. It is important to note that South African media content has made a lot of progress since the formal abolishment of apartheid, for the purpose of the argument in this section, the focus is on gender inequalities or what many would understand as politics of belonging in the complex media space. Gendered media content unfolds in various segments such as gender stereotyping and this is seen in content that is not reflective of equality. “Gender stereotyping is understood as making assumptions about a person only on the basis of gender” (Jacobson 2005:6) Generally stereotyping in the media context follows patterns of power by diminishing those with little power and influence in society” Luyt, (2011:14) agrees with the above “Overwhelmingly confirm that male and female gender roles are portrayed through the use of traditional stereotypes in media”. Example: content that incorrectly depicts women as species that are designed to exist in the kitchen (cooking and cleaning), men as providers (professionals) and in positions of control (Jacobson 2015:8). The sexualisation or objectification is another form of gendered content that is concerning in media spaces and this mostly prevalent with woman, this content obsesses on the appearance of the woman. Ward, (2016:560) observes that “High level of sexual content it is also the case that the media feature a particular characterization of women and of female sexuality that focuses heavily on sexual appearance, physical beauty, and sexual appeal to others”. A case in point of the sexualisation is the content of a woman undressed. The South African media content has also revealed traces of content that is discriminatory towards certain genders especially those outside of the mainstream. Strand, (2018:1325) concurs with minority groups experiencing marginalisation in media. Therefore, it can be argued that the content in the South African media is by and large not representative of the constitutional mandate that ascribes and promotes equality of all citizens. This is especially true of what media analysts have found in relation to class.

Classed

Media content and representation in South Africa are classed; meaning that coverage favours certain groups over others. According to Govenden, (2002:106-107) “The power and privilege of the elite class is significantly visible in the sample of articles, coverage significantly favoured elite-driven topics, prominent voices, while the working and lower classes were neglected in the overall coverage”. Those who are viewed as the elite in South African have an advantage and the upper hand in terms of news coverage, and their voices supersede the voices of ordinary citizens. Govenden states that: “There is clear dominance in South Africa’s newspapers of the elite class as a prominent voice eroding other important voices” (2002:108). For example, the voices of the Marikana Massacre widows were muted, with preference being given to government officials, police, mine bosses and academics experts. This indicates that the majority of voices are muted and underrepresented. They are not contributing to the national discourse and money has been seen as a contributor to preferred content. Humprecht and Esser (2018: 4) posit that “news diversity is hampered by profit motives, reporting that relies on personalisation, simplification, and polarisation seem to attract larger audiences and thus more advertisers

than in depth and perspective-rich reporting does”. Therefore, the same elite voice appears in news over and over, clearly this translates to a lack of representation. Carpenter argues that: “The South African media reproduce the same content that focus on the elite, and this deprives the nation of a diverse national discourse” (2010:1065). This view is further supported by Friedman, (2011:107), who writes “Mainstream press which also exerts crucial pressure on how other news outlets report news is neither the eyes and ears of society nor the watchdog, it performs both functions not for all society but for the but for the suburban class”. The interest of the poor or those outside the mainstream are marginalised, relegated, and ignored by the press. Friedman further notes that “In most cases the question of the poor is to enforce a public interest defence is ignored, confirming that whether poor citizens a right to information is of no interest to the press” (2011:114).

Wasserman and De Beer posit that “Media content favours the elite, and the second part of the section explores why this occurrence is a dominant feature. The mode of production of news in South Africa is highly informed by capitalism or market-oriented objectives, the mainstream print media still operate according to the same functionalistic structural logic of circulation, distribution networks, price structure and advertising that has as their target the lucrative – and arguably still largely white, or at least affluent black – elite market” (2005: 39–40). Modes of production that are underpinned by the vehemence of the market perpetuate capitalistic environment that thrives on elitism and oppression of the other. Chiumbu (2016:423) “Media functioning under market forces reinforce material interests of the capitalist state by marginalising alternative and counter-hegemonic voices and views”. Example: Media reporting perpetuating a narrative that the Marikana striker needs to end because it is threatening the economy, therefore delegitimising the issues faced by the miners and legitimizing a capitalist outlook.

Voice/s

This dissertation aims to investigate or scrutinize the voices or lack of voices during the events of disruption that took place in July 2021 to make findings on whose voices dominated. The first step of the literature review is to provide a nuanced clarity of the concept of voices. Kimbrough (2002:5) provides an understanding of voices in their physical capacity, “Anatomically speaking when the vocal cords (also called folds) of the human larynx contract and impede the flow of air expelled by the lungs, they begin to vibrate, producing an audible sound known as phonation, from the Greek phone meaning voice or sound”. Santha *et al* (2016:3) added to the definition of the concept of voices as follows: “Voices are important things for humans, they are the medium through which we do a lot of communicating with the outside world our ideas, of course, and also our emotions and our personality”. From a media lens, voices are different levels of societies, unique ideologies, and contestation of ideas “To what extent the voice can be thought to communicate meaning and present the human speaking subject, regardless of both the opposition” (Santha *et al*, 2016:4).

This literature review aims to understand which voices are prioritised or dominant in the media. South Africa is a democratic country, and it promotes values such as equality through constitutional statutes that create an environment welcoming free speech and the right to be heard. “All the citizens of the country are equal before the law and have the right to freedom of expression, which includes freedom of the press and media, freedom to receive or impart information or ideas” (Constitution of South Africa, 1996).

Understanding the role of the media in a democratic society is pivotal, as the media has the ability and responsibility to deepen democracy. Tumber, (2001:100) posits that “Media as a fourth estate arm of government performing the duty of society's watchdog and ensuring accountability to the people and also at the same time ensuring the participation of the governed in the process of governance”. Media can level the playing field and bring together government, civil society, business, and media. However, this role, expectation, and responsibility to provide a platform to all spheres in society by the media is often questionable. Radebe and Chiumbu (2022:101) argue that the “Media has the power to make certain groups of people in the country invisible through the definite lack of representation”. Duncan, (2014:21) supports this thought process, noting: “What is immersing in the public domain is a hierarchy of views”. This indicates that not everyone has a voice or is given an opportunity to be heard. Radebe and Chiumbu, (2022:100) agree with the argument that some voices are marginalised when they state: “The views of ordinary people captured in public hearings across the country are severely underrepresented”. For example, the Marikana Massacre media coverage was dominated by mainstream voices or those people in authority such as the police, workers' organisations such as The Association for Mineworkers and Construction Union (AMCU)[[1](#)] and The National Union of Mineworkers (NUMSA)[[2](#)]. When diverse voices deliberate on various issues it provides an opportunity to challenge and re-evaluate the environment and unsuitable status quo. Robinson and Friedman, (2007:644) posit that “Allowing for a wide range of groups and interests to coalesce into networks and associations, and to provide a balance between contending power centers, interests, and opinions”. The implications of limiting or suppressing voice create tension and frustration amongst civil society because they are willing and have the capacity to add value to public discourse. Friedman, (2019:3) is of the view that “citizens of South Africa can think independently and intensely becoming less tolerant of authoritative/elites views”. Drawing on the above arguments, this dissertation aims to investigate or scrutinise the voices or lack of voices evident in the media during the failed insurrection, looting and arson that took place in July 2021.

[1] The Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union (AMCU) is a trade union that represents mine and construction workers. AMCU was formed in 1998 and formerly registered in 2001 with the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM). AMCU was formed by disgruntled NUM members and its growth has been the result of mineworkers resigning from NUM to join AMCU. The union is led by Mr. Joseph Mathunjwa.

[2] National Union of Metal Workers (NUMSA) was formed in 1987 and is the biggest single trade union in South Africa, the country's largest trade union federation. It merged four different unions. These unions were: Metal and Allied Workers Union (MAWU), Motor Industry Combined Workers Union (MICWU), National Automobile and Allied Workers Union (NAAWU), and the United Metal, Mining and Allied Workers of South Africa (UMMAWOSA). NUMSA played a significant role in forcing the South African apartheid state to recognise trade unions, eradicate apartheid and agree to elections for the first democratic government in 1994. The current president of the organisation is Andrew Nditshe Chirwa.

Listening

The idea of listening is often understood to be linked or collated to hearing, however, the academic understanding of these concepts is worlds apart in that one is based on physical factors and the latter is purely mental. According to Purdy, (1997:5), “the contrast between hearing and listening is understood as that hearing is a physical act and listening as a mental act”. It is paramount to acknowledge that hearing could have a bearing on listening. Purdy further notes, “Hearing as the physical capacity to receive and process sound, therefore, the ability to hear could hinder listening” (1997:6). Listening in the media realm is of great interest. In fact, scholars have highlighted that media can promote or deny listening. Dreher, (2012:159) understands listening “not as mere aurality, but rather as a powerful metaphor for analysing ‘the other side’ of voice that is, the importance of attention and response, openness, and recognition to complete the circuits of democratic communication”. Listening is key in democratic societies such as South Africa where citizens are constitutionally of equal importance in that it (listening) challenges and diverts the focus from disempowered voices to what is consumed in the media. “The attention to listening shifts some of the focus and responsibility for change from marginalized voices and on to the conventions, institutions, and privileges which shape who and what can be heard in the media” (Husband 1996; 2000). Dreher concurs with the above and points out that “The interest in listening is situated and strategic, aiming to develop thinking on media change beyond increasingly predictable critiques of representation and a politics of speaking up which leaves the primary responsibility for change with those who are subjected to media racialization” (2009:447). The significance of listening is paramount in that it has a bearing on how one speaks, is heard, and is represented in the political spaces. According to Bickford, (1996:60), “we must be aware and realize that how we listen shapes the ways in which others can speak and be heard, furthermore this could possible influence representation in the political realm”. Listening varies and can manifest in many forms such as content that is available in multiple languages and genres. For example, Metro FM allows radio show participants to debate issues using their own languages and plays diverse music that has a wider appeal. Thus, “diversity of languages, accents, and musical styles rather than accommodating cosmopolitan taste cultures rather than minority language communities can be seen as institutional learning”. (Podkalicka, 2007:217). It is evident, therefore, that the above challenges institutional listening and the issues of marginalised voices above all the hierarchies which are at the centre of the listening phenomenon.

As the discussion alluded earlier to the varying nature of listening, the focus moves to a key element of listening coined by Susan Bickford which is political listening. This confronts marginalisation that is shaped through the deprivation of certain utterances and pronouncements from preferred people. Cole, (2023:701) posits that “political listening’ outlines crucial criteria for the ‘particular kind of listening’ that might undo ‘oppression that happens partly through not hearing certain kinds of expressions from certain kinds of people’”. This idea or notion speaks to radical democratic principles that promote diversity of voices and welcomes their different views with the idea of reaching a decision as equals. For Dreher, “Political listening is characterised by the agonistic version of democracy which aims for engagement and possibilities for shared action across difference rather than the consensus” (2009:449). Therefore, political listening is key in that it not only addresses the challenge of voices but acknowledges the disagreements and inequalities inherent in different voices. In addition, listening insists on sharing action despite the said and visible differences.

Listening has further been deliberated along the lines of privilege and positionality in that although our societies are multi-cultural, certain groups seem to have a hierarchy of views and knowledge, hence listening seeks to highlight and insist that these dominant groups should move away from their comfort. Thompson, (2003:91) expands on listening and privilege, writing: “The dominant groups must learn to listen not only to unfamiliar languages but also too painful and confronting stories, histories, and criticisms, learning to listen means ‘learning to stay with the hard questions’”. In fact, dominant groups have a responsibility to challenge their privilege. An example of this phenomenon could be seen through language, where white people learn and listen to languages they are not accustomed to, which could promote and provide a unique view of the other. Dreher argues in line with this, “Listening across difference suggests a subtle shift, from seeking a better understanding of the ‘other’ to listening for better understanding of relationships and complicities, issues, and the workings of privilege” (2009:451). Listening as a concept is significant in that it advances the voice concept by not challenging a hierarchy of voices but addressing various issues as discussed above.

Media representation of protests

The idea or term ‘protest’ in South Africa is somewhat of a buzzword or popular term. In fact, it is an exercise that occurs daily. As such, let us begin by understanding and defining the term protest and will later deal with the notion of a protest being a frequent reality in South Africa. According to Frey and Pirscher, (2019:449), “A protest has been defined as including all of the following elements: “the action expresses a grievance, a conviction of wrong or injustice; the protestors are unable to correct the condition directly”. An example of a protest in South Africa would be the #Zumamustfall demonstration, and a service delivery protest in Soweto where community members barricade the roads because they need services such as water, streetlights, healthcare, or crime prevention services. Mawokomayi and Dube, (2018:38) have a similar understanding or definition of protest: “In democratic societies such as South Africa, protests

play a crucial role in amplifying the voices of citizens as they seek to recover and protect their rights”. Following the above understanding of protest, what seems to be at the center of these demonstrations or protests is the need to speak and raise collective concerns (exercise democratic rights) because of the feeling of being neglected or ignored. Alexander concurs by arguing, “The fact that communities take to the streets in an attempt to make their voices heard, raises questions about their ability to speak out in other forums, or the failure of other mechanisms” (2010: 30). Media often heed the calls and report these events, and by so doing the issues are believed to receive a viable vehicle to gain the attention of the authority, or the media could possibly denigrate the events. Wasserman et al. informs that “The media coverage of these actions becomes of great importance, as it has the potential to amplify the voices of those citizens who have been left on the margins of the public sphere or further silence them by portraying their protests as illegitimate or undemocratic” (2018:146). Media has various ways of covering and representing protest events. “How effective is the mass media in representing the aims and concerns of the protesters?” (Dube 2018:39). This question is of paramount importance because various issues such as organisational ideologies, profit margins, and political affiliations have an impact on how news is structured. In media terms, this is known as framing. Entman, (1993:52) is of the view that framing is the selection “of some aspects of a perceived reality, making them more salient in a text in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition and casual interpretation of the item described”. A preference for a particular frame by a media organisation more often than not dictates and influences how the public views the event. According to Dube and Mawokomayi, (2018:40) “Through framing, media effectively decide what knowledge or information will be deemed appropriate for publication and what knowledge will be suppressed in order to drive a certain idea”. In South Africa, protests are usually covered as violent and an inconvenience to those who are not directly affected. By doing so, those who are trying to speak through the exercise are painted as problematic and those in authority are privileged. Wasserman et al, (2018:149) noted that “the covering of protest in South Africa seems to have a pattern that focuses on the violent and disruptive aspects of the protest actions and describes protests using the script of crime news”. The grievances, complaints, and dis-satisfactions of the communities take a back seat, while the dominant discourse becomes the violence and the police engagement with the protestors has been noted to be extremely aggressive. Alexander, (2010:31) argues that “protests are mostly peaceful; they have on occasion turned violent and have increasingly been met with a heavy-handed state response”. Therefore, media coverage of protests in South Africa is not driven by the need to articulate the needs or grievances of those who have taken to the streets in an effort to be heard. Hence, it does not focus on all the issues that permeate such as investigating the status quo that possibly drove the masses to the streets, what options were available and why was the decision to protest favoured over others' means of engagement. Radu et al, (2012:38) take a critical view on this by saying that “Media fails to tell the audience much about why the people were protesting, what led to the violence, what alternatives people had tried, if any, and what alternatives existed for the protesters”. Galtung, (2000:15) supports this view, noting: “Media has a responsibility to include all the phases of the

protest before, during and after violence as well as offering context as well as noting potential alternatives to resolve the conflict”.

Triple Crises: Inequality, Unemployment and Poverty

The notion of lack of resources and means seem to be of importance in the discussions of the looting aftermath. It is from this basis that there is a need to delve into literature to understand the crises of poverty, unemployment, and inequality in South Africa. The above concepts are interlinked, and several scholars are of the view that these challenges are a result of the apartheid history of the country. According to Terreblanche, (2002:158), “In an effort to understand issues of inequality, poverty, and unemployment it is imperative to look at with and understanding the history how power has been wielded”. Therefore, this line of thinking dictates that we move towards an understanding and discussion of inequality with a view on the history of South Africa. Govender *et al.* (2007:10) define inequality as “variations in the standards of living across a whole population or region, in its broadest sense, inequality refers to any aspect of deprivation, these may be, for example, deprivation in terms of income, assets, health and nutrition, education, social inclusion, power, and security”. The powers that governed at the time introduced laws that perpetuated inequality in the country with the hope of advantaging the minority and disadvantaging the majority.

“White English capitalist together with the Smuts government and Afrikaans workers pushed through laws that ensured the mine industry which was a lucrative source employment at the time was regulated in favour of the Afrikaans people at the expense of the Africans, these laws came in a form of The Mines and Works Amendment Act of 1923, The Wage Act of 1925, pass laws and The Group Areas Act (2003:6)” (Louw 2004:17).

As argued above, the inequalities that were manufactured by the government of the time through policies are still visible today. This is also evident through the levels of unemployment. A fair departure point on this discussion would be an understanding of the concept of unemployment. Kingdom and Knight (2004:199) view “unemployment as a situation where those who are currently not employed but who looked for work in the week or four weeks”. They further expand on this idea and inform that “unemployed also means those who say they want work but did not look for work in the past week/past four weeks” (2004:199). Brynard (2011:68) defines unemployment along similar lines, noting that, “The South African approach is twofold, the strict (narrow) and the expanded (broad) definition, the narrow definition applies a job-search test whereas the broad definition includes those who do not search for work in a four-week reference period, but who report being available to work after they accept an offer of a suitable job”. Unemployment is a thorny issue in South Africa and, in particular, black people have faced challenges in this regard dating back to the apartheid days. “Low levels of education of Africans have made them ineligible for employment in the tertiary sector” (Terreblanche, 2014:13). However, according to de Beer *et al.* (2017:4), “unemployment in SA can be traced back to the 70’s, global crises, the shrinking economy, inflation challenges, the polarising ideologies between the ANC and companies leaving the country,

this also include the exploitative nature of the industries and the labour market regulated to in favour of the minority”. For example, labour mines reducing workers as a result of mechanisation. Unemployment issues have persisted in the democratic SA, as revealed by Statistics South Africa (Stats SA) in their focus on 2020 and 2021 which are the years before the looting and the looting year. South Africa had a population of around 59 million in 2021 (Statistics SA, 2021). According to Statistics SA (2020), its quarterly labour force Survey (QLFS) 3 revealed that, “employed were 14,7%, unemployed 6,5 %, Discouraged work seekers 2,7 % and those who are not economically active (NEA) 17,1% and (QLFS) 4 revealed that employed 15,0%, unemployed 7,2%, discouraged work-seekers 2,9%, not economically active 14,1%”. The labour force indicates a positive increase from 55% in Q3:2020 to 56, 6% in Q4:2020. The unemployment rate affected mostly the youth. Statistics SA (2020) informs that “Youth aged 15-24 years and 25-34 years recorded the highest unemployment rates of 63, 2% and 41, 2% respectively”. Amongst the various population groups in the country, black people are most affected. In fact, research shows higher unemployment rates amongst this population in comparison to White, Indian/Asian and Coloured. “The unemployment rate among the black African (36,5%) population group remains higher than the national average and other population groups White 8.8%, Indian/Asian 11.8%, Coloured 25.7%” (Statistics SA, 2020). The gender dynamic further reveals that unemployment rates or challenges for females are extremely high when compared to their male counterparts. According to Statistics SA (2020), “Black African women are the most vulnerable with an unemployment rate of 38, 5%”.

According to Statistics SA (2021) in its first Quarterly (Q2) Labour Force Survey (QLFS) of 2021, which is the year of the failed insurrection, looting and arson, “Employed 14,9M, unemployed 7,8M, discouraged work-seekers 3,3M, and not economically active (NEA) 13,5M”. Quarter 3 shows a decrease in unemployment, with the following features: “Employed 14,3M, unemployed 7,6M, discouraged work-seekers 3,9M, not economically active (NEA) 14,0M”. Looking at Quarter 2 in comparison to Quarter 3, it is evident that the country saw major changes in unemployment. “660 000 Fewer Employed, 183 000 Fewer Unemployed, 545 000 More Discouraged, 443 000 More Other Not Economically Active between Q2 and Q3 202” (Statistics SA, 2021).

Unemployment in 2021 affected parts of South Africa differently. “The number of employed have decreased in the 3 largest provinces between Q2 & Q3:2021, KZN and GP account for about half of the 660 thousand decreases observed in employment in Q3: 2021 compared to Q2: 202” (Statistics SA, 2021). These numbers clearly show that the number of unemployed decreased in different provinces. “Eastern Cape, Limpopo, and the Northwest recorded expanded unemployment rates above 50, 0% in Q3:202” (Statistics SA, 2021). The South African unemployment phenomena is further stratified along formal, informal, private household, and agriculture. “Formal sector employment decreased by 5, 6 % between Q2:2021 and Q3:2021” (Statistics SA, 2021). In terms of age groups, the youth were most affected by unemployment in 2021. Statistics SA (2021) notes, “Youth aged 15-24 years and 25-34 years recorded the highest

unemployment rates of 66,5% and 43,8% respectively, in addition approximately 3,4 million (33,5%) out of 10,2 million young people aged 15-24 years were not in employment, education or training (NEET)” (Statistics SA, 2021). Population groups were also hit differently by unemployment and what statistics reveal is that blacks are substantially affected. “The unemployment rate among the Black African (38,6%) population group remains higher than the national average and other population groups, whites 9.2%, Indian/ Asian 22.0%, Coloured 30.3%, Black Africans 38.6%” (Statistics SA, 2021). Unemployment through a gender lens also indicates disproportionate impact among females, especially black woman. Based on Statistics SA (2021), “Black African women are the most vulnerable with an unemployment rate of 41, 5% in Q3:202”. Black people and Coloured people were mostly affected by unemployment; that includes both male and female members of those populations. “Irrespective of gender, the Black African and Coloured population groups remain vulnerable in the labour market” (Statistics SA, 2021). It is evident that unemployment numbers increased, with Covid-19 further exacerbating things and more people lost their jobs. Poverty continues to ravage the majority in South Africa because the apartheid policies that contain or locked black people in a state of excruciating poverty. This situation has been on-going and worsening since a few decades now as noted by:

Terreblanche (2002:31) who argued that “Poverty persist in post democratic South Africa particularly because of the traps set by the previous system and the are in the form and shape of high rising unemployment and the slow growing economy, inequalities around distribution of power, property opportunities and the environment that reinforces criminality, ill health and processes that continue to make the majority poor”.

Poverty is perpetuated by the increase in unemployment caused in the formal sector of the economy. “In 1995 the agriculture formal sector alone lost about 600 000 jobs and between 1995 and 2001, 250 000 new job seekers were added to the labour force every year” (Terreblanche, 2018:10). The political transition that was necessary in South Africa to rescue black people from poverty has taken place, but it has not delivered the majority from poverty. Mashaba (2015:1) informed that “when Nelson Mandela took became the president of South Africa many of us believed that struggle for personal and economical freedom was over instead or people still leave in abject poverty”. South Africa’s history is extremely violent and brutal; hence, the current culture has even resulted in brutal and very criminal prone mindset. That should be understood as a condition of poverty. Zizzamia (2020:1) agrees with this view, noting that “the dynamics of crime and violence in South Africa should be understood as deviant behaviour patterns that have been instilled among the poor during the years of oppression, and therefore rooted in repression, discrimination, the political struggle and chronic community poverty”. Terreblanche adds to the reasons for poverty in South Africa, writing: “the lack of employment is a major cause for the poverty of about 60% of the black population (2014:15).

Print Circulation

The South African media landscape dates to the 18th & 19th centuries; and has a unique and diverse history. Print media has not only been a part of South Africans but most parts of Africa (Wigston, 2007:4).⁴ Print media in the age of digitisation has never been the same, it has struggled with poor circulation numbers, and this has deteriorated because of the Covid-19 lockdown regulations. Finlay (2020:9) posits that “The nationwide lockdown due to the covid-19 pandemic that began at midnight on March 26 eviscerated an already fragile print media industry, with the magazine trade and community newspapers suffering the most serious blow”. This sad situation forced struggling companies to either stop printing paper copies or move online or close their businesses. “Magazine publishers closed their doors at the start of lockdown” (Skinner, 2020:25). For example, Associated Media and the Caxton & CTP's magazine division closed down and the smaller publications stopped printing under lockdown. The lockdown situation created the need for a weekly national newspaper, however, because of the downward spiral of print news circulation and loss of revenue it was not feasible. According to Skinner, “At the beginning of lockdown, there were also distress calls from the independent national weekly newspaper, the *Mail & Guardian* (M&G), the editor-in-chief at the time, Khadija Patel, stated that their income would not adequately cover the cost of producing the newspaper, including the payment of salaries” (2020:25). Growing the industry and diving into new opportunities would not be financially possible and this indicates the financial woes in the print industry.

Media closure and retrenchments

Dugmore, (2018:35) is of the view that “It is becoming clear that globally and in South Africa many people are just ‘not that into’ news, or at least not particularly interested in ‘hard news’ – across many countries about a third of people are ‘news averse’”. The challenges, such as a decrease in revenue and the shrinking print media industry, affected both employees and employers. Employees were compelled to make tough decisions such as retrenching workers. “The widespread decline in circulation has had several effects: audience revenue from cover price has dropped, and advertising revenue along with it, the reaction of media groups has been to cut back on staffing and products” (Dugmore, 2018:36). This led to several media houses reducing their staff and many employees losing their jobs. Finlay (2020:9) stated,

⁴ David Wigston is a senior lecturer in communication science in the Department of Communication, University of South Africa. He is an expert and poses great knowledge and skills in Communication, Media Studies, Communication Theory, Journalism Communication Science, Content Analysis, Communication Management, Academic Writing, Newspapers, and Media Management. He has written and contributed extensively to the above fields. He is widely known for the following publications: International News Flows, South African news in international radio broadcasting: A comparative analysis, Empirical or critical Communication research? Reporting reconstruction in the SA Police Service: an analysis of a media statement, A comparative analysis of South African election coverage by international radio news, The challenge of international radio broadcasting What's in it for Africa?, Radio Highveld and Radio 702: A comparative analysis of their news services.

“Media houses pushed through with retrenchment plans, despite the pandemic, an estimated 700 jobs were lost to the industry at the start of the lockdown”. For example, media houses that closed down included *Cosmopolitan*, *House and Leisure*, *Men’s Health*, Caxton & CTP publications, and *Media24* also shut down four community titles. Print media companies further explored the option of bringing together different newspapers as one establishment, which meant fewer staff members. For example, “Noordkaap and Kalahari Bulletin were to be merged into a single newspaper” (Skinner, 2020:26). “*Media24* also shut down four community titles and merging some into single papers leading to many retrenchments, which exacerbated job losses” (Finlay, 2020:9). This was evident at *Media24* which looked at retrenching 510 staff members. The loss of jobs in journalism included freelance workers because print companies could not afford their services anymore. Finlay argued that “Job losses and income affected both employed journalist and freelancers, it is estimated that while journalist lost about 45% freelancers lost up to 80% income” (2020:9). According to Skinner, “Freelancers Association (SAFREA) reported that its members had been particularly severely impacted and that 60% of the approximately 500 members had lost almost 70% of their income and some had lost as much as 80% or could find no work at all” (2020:26). The job losses in the print industry that were visible when digitisation kicked in intensified because of the Covid-19 pandemic. The situation was so severe that interventions from industry organisations were needed. “In July 2020, The South African National Editors Forum (SANEF) set up an industry relief fund for journalists who had lost their jobs or contracts as a direct result of the lockdown” (Skinner, 2020:27). The intervention by organisations such as SANEF indicate the severity of the job loss crises.

Media Trust

The issue of whether media is trustworthy or ethical in its reporting has been a prevalent issue of discussion in media debates. The importance of media ethics has taken precedence among academics and civil society and has been afforded an extra lens of scrutiny. The Interim Independent Panel Report, (2021:1)⁵ posits that, “In the age when humanity is crying for facts, truth-telling, fair reporting, and accountability, sometimes ethical journalism seems to be on the rope”. With the ethics of journalism being questioned, we must understand what is meant by ethical journalism. According to Kruger (2005:127) “Seek truth and report it as fully as possible which seems to me to have two major legs: the need for accuracy, and the need for fairness, act independently; minimise harm and accountability”. Among the various problems that have surfaced is that journalism is dictated by the need to secure profits. In addition, there are growing relations with politics, political preference, and political affiliation. Van Oerle informs that, “Significant problems with ethics in the South African media industry are the result of the owners of our media outlets have commercial agendas and those can

often influence the universe of stories that are reported, the fact that journalists are also openly aligned to political parties can give them preferential access to newsmakers” (2020:59). Lack of consequences for the perpetrators of unethical journalism exacerbates the problem and it continues unchecked. Thus, the entire sector is viewed as operating with questionable, unethical journalism. Van Oerle, (2020:59) is of the view that “When one newspaper runs false stories or stories that are factually incorrect, the industry as a whole is tainted by these ethical lapses”. For example, the writer of the story of the Tembisa 10 babies, which turned out to not exist, is yet to face consequences nor has he apologised to readers. This incident amongst others have made readers question what is published by newspapers. Corruption and bribes (also known as brown envelope journalism) have also been a challenge and are viewed to be amongst the many issues that have led to or encouraged a lack of ethical journalism. “The issue of journalism that is motivated or coerced by "brown envelope" is a challenge that requires serious attention” (Van Oerle 2020:59). Digitisation, particularly through social media platforms, has provided a platform where anyone that has access can practice journalism without any form of training or journalism guidelines. Van Oerle notes, “Ethical problems also emanate from the fact that anyone can claim to be a journalist these days due to the online digital platforms that are just accessible to anyone and anybody, and because such 'journalists' are not trained ethics are foreign to them” (2020:59). For example, The Mpumalanga MEC was accused of raping his eight-year-old daughters, and his name was published in the media and on social media by a journalist, which is ethically questionable in that by identifying the MEC, they also revealed the name of the eight-year-old. The above discussion indicates that questionable, unethical journalism is at the center of the South African newsroom, and it requires extensive attention.

Literature Review Conclusion

The above section provides a literature review that explores whether ideology affects the news content of the South African media. An argument has been provided through selected themes indicating that despite media transformation in South Africa media content and representation have remained racialised, gendered, and classed. The literature review intentionally focused on key South African scholars such as Govenden & Chiumbu, (2020:1) unanimously in agreement and acknowledging the changes that have taken place when democracy was born and the key legislation such as BEE and B-BBEE. The literature further discussed key concepts mainly voices that began by reminding us that all citizens are equal before the law and therefore, they should be allowed to be heard. It seemed as if despite the constitutional mandate of equality citizens are often denied a right to contribute to the discourse. Case in point the Marikana massacre, the literature review reminded us that journalists assumed that a limited number of sources were adequate and ignored many such as the widows of the dead miners. The listening theme was significant in that it advances the voice concept by not challenging a hierarchy of voices but addressing various issues as dominant groups must learn to listen not only to foreign languages but also to advance and challenge histories and critique those that have the privilege to be heard.

Scholars mainly Mawokomayi and Dube, (2018:38) are of the view that media protest and representation revealed that protest in SA is mostly an act of citizens amplifying their voices and hoping that authority listens and, in most cases, media silences them by portraying the actions as violent and unlawful. South Africa has become the epicenter of crime, and it is mostly argued that the issues coined by (Terreblanche, 2014:13) the triple crises (poverty, unemployment, and inequality) indicated that these challenges stem from the apartheid system and they are directly linked.

Chapter 3: Theoretical Framework

To theoretically frame this study, the research scrutinises the data through the monocle of a theoretical framework that is based on the fact that the South African media is elitist but the analysis of the data on the reportage itself will show whether this hypothesis holds sway. Collet, (2004:1) views the “Theoretical framework as the foundation from which all knowledge is constructed (metaphorically and literally) for a research study”. The theoretical framework will provide coherence and serve as a guide and a lens that provides an overview of the researcher's endeavors. Osanloo and Grant, (2016:25) posit that the “absence of a theoretical framework, the structure, and vision for a study is unclear, much like a house that cannot be constructed without a blueprint and therefore a research plan that contains a theoretical framework allows the dissertation study to be strong and structured with an organized flow from one chapter to the next”.

Radical democratic Theory

A radical democratic theory is proposed as one of the schools of thought that will feature in the study. The theory (Radical democratic theory) emanates from two scholars (Ernesto Laclau and Chantal Mouffe), and it is a movement that seeks to unsettle the normative democratic functions in politics and social spheres. According to Mouffe and Holdengräber, (1989:12), “Radical democracy is formulated to envision a deepening and more expansive democracy which links diverse democratic struggles, such a task that requires the creation of new subject-positions that would allow the common articulation, for example, of antiracism, antisexism, and anticapitalism”. Mouffe adds and infers that the logic behind referring to this idea as radical is because it aims to extend to several areas. “This project is called radical because it encompasses the extension of democracy into more and more areas of the social” (Mouffe 2007:3).

Radical democratic theory is a school of thought that seeks to challenge the normality that limits views and prioritises the exclusion of views. “The idea of radical democracy argues that multiple voices and opposing views are significant in driving the principles of radical democracy which are equality and liberty” (Laclau and Mouffe 2014:17). Different views, ideologies and disagreements, and constant engagement with an aim to arrive at suitable and progressive decisions are key features of radical democracy. “Radical democracy calls our attention to the manner in which the polity might be institutionally transformed so that it allows for greater democratic participation and, in turn, for more informed and empowered citizenship on the part of the participants” (Vick, 2015:205). An example would be a series of hearings actively engaging the citizens of South Africa in the merits of The Protection of State Information/Secrecy Bill before taking it to parliament. This dissertation aims to scrutinise the voices or lack of voices in the media during the failed insurrection, looting, and arson that took place in July 2021 and will endeavor to understand the research through the school of radical democracy. Radical democratic framework is centered on two main concepts/tenets namely, agonistic pluralism and agonism. Agonistic pluralism is a view that brings together enemies as opponents to deliberate, put ideas forward engage, agree, and disagree and this challenges the domination aspect. Carpentier (2003:6) “agonistic

democratic model that focused on the transformation of political enemies into adversaries within a necessarily conflictual democratic framework”. Agonism welcomes and acknowledges certain forms of conflict and sees it as good in that it is an element of democracy. Carpentier adds and describes “Agonism as a political and social theory that emphasizes the potentially positive aspects of certain forms of conflict”. Following the logic of the right to freedom of speech to all citizens that highlights the right to share and receive information, this indicates that issues of public interest will attract different debates that can be deliberated. Mouffe It accepts a permanent place for such conflict in the political sphere but seeks to show how individuals might accept and channel this conflict positively” (2003:9). The literature review makes a compelling argument that news production favours the elite in production processes, therefore, leaning towards radical theoretical understanding is imperative in that the school of thoughts provides an alternative of this occurrence. The research has taken on a mandate to investigate what discourses and ideologies were revealed regarding the way the failed insurrection, looting, and arson took place in July 2021? in the context of media’s ability to reinforce power structures through ideologies and discourses. The ability of radical democratic theory to address and challenge the production of news that favors the elite through a more diverse public sphere that embraces conflictual concepts and schools of thought underpins the logic behind selecting the theory. Based on Mouffe & Holdengräber (1989:42). “In order to establish democratic equivalences, a new “commonsense” is necessary, which would transform the identity of different groups so that the demands of each group could be articulated with those of others according to the principle of democratic views”. The literature informs of the responsibility of media to diversify and equalise the public sphere to ensure citizenship is realised, hence the importance of engaging the data through the current theory. “Radical democracy fosters the continual proliferation of new voices, new communities, and new identities as part of an ongoing process of democratisation and third, participation is central to active citizenship” (Lummis 1996:16). In addition to the key citizenship tenets of the theory media has a responsibility to provide platforms that dismantle hegemony and facilitated continuous and inclusive dialogue. According to Rodriguez, (2001: 158) As defined by the theory of radical democracy, “the concept of citizenship implies that social subjects claim a space for their public voices, that these social subjects tenaciously intervene and shape their identities, altering circulating social discourses and cultural codes, and that, as a result of the above, these negotiations and renegotiations empower the communities involved”.

Symbolic Annihilation

The data will also be investigated or understood through the lenses of symbolic annihilation theory that originates from the early 70’s. The concept of “symbolic annihilation” was introduced by Gerbner (1972:44) as “Representation in the fictional world signifies social existence; absence means symbolic annihilation”. The idea (symbolic annihilation) is understood as the absence or underrepresentation of certain groups in the media based on race, sex, sexual orientation, religion, and socioeconomic status.

Symbolic annihilation is also viewed as “a process by which the mass media omit, trivialize, or condemn certain groups that are not socially valued, ostensibly, the contention is that, by rarely or never showing certain types of persons, the mass media, as cultural mechanisms, systematically dispense with imagery and messages associated with these types of persons and, in the process, send a symbolic message to viewers readers about the societal value of the persons comprising that group” (Tuchman (2000:154).

Examples of symbolic annihilation in contemporary society include representation, underrepresentation, and trivialization of youth, women, ethnic groups, black people, Coloured and Indian.

The repercussions of symbolic annihilation in terms of race pose a danger in that certain groups often experience representation that is questionable, even dehumanising. Coleman and Yochim, (2008:3) reiterate that “symbolic annihilation means that those racial groups who are not presented as fully developed in media, be it through absence, trivialization, or condemnation, may see their social status diminished”. Symbolic annihilation of race extends further than good or bad representation, in fact, it is when blackness is expected to mimic or assimilate whiteness to be viewed in a progressive light. “Such imagery becomes “racist” and “enlightened” when for blackness to be viewed as positive it must demonstrate unencumbered upward mobility and integration vis a vis assimilation” (Graber 2019:320). Symbolic annihilation is not limited to a certain group or gender it is extensively outstretched it can advance to understanding of issues of Women in Media. According to Gurrieri, (2021:3), “Symbolic annihilation is not confined to any particular group; the concept is now deployed widely including (Woman in Media) the treatment of women in a range of media and expanded the concept from Gerbner’s simple definition of “absence” to include imagistic “condemnation” and “trivialization”. Scholars have made use of the theory to understand critical issues such as race. “Symbolic annihilation considers subtle messages focusses on race and gender/sexuality and these are considered discursively in the far less obvious but not less important” (Graber 2019:387).

The school of thought is significant in understanding matters of valued groups versus undervalued groups. Klein and Shiffman reveal that “Symbolic annihilation in the media is of concern because it presents people with implied messages about what it means to be a member of a culturally valued group versus a member of a socially disenfranchised group (or “out group”) (2009:57). Media has been found guilty of not only excluding certain groups but messages to coerce thinking and symbolic annihilation understands these challenges. Entman, (1993: 53)” points out “The idea that ‘the omissions of potential problem definitions, explanations, evaluations, and recommendations be as critical as the inclusions in guiding the audience [to meaning]’.

The reasoning behind the selection of Symbolic annihilation is grounded on the need to understand the collected data in terms of voice/s and belonging, to bring it closer to home, whom the data represent, underrepresent, omit, and trivialize. Tuchman, Merskin (1998:335) more recently defined symbolic annihilation “as the way cultural production and media

representations ignore, exclude, marginalize, or trivialize a particular group”. The symbolic messages that emanate from representation or not representing certain groups being preferred over others. According to Klein & Shiffman (2009:57).

“The basic idea is that groups that are valued in a particular culture tend to be shown frequently in the media, and viewers readers come to learn about these groups’ purported characteristics and their implied value to the culture-at-large by virtue of their media exposure, but when certain groups are not valued in that same culture, the media tend not to include them in their storylines and, in the process, cast them aside and disenfranchise them by not showing them”.

The final expectation of symbolic annihilation is the social impact of media representation/underrepresentation of certain groups in terms of setting a national discourse. Mazon (1984:68) is of the view that “The study of media content pertaining to “in group” and “out group” representations, cultivation theory would posit that media messages serve as agents of socialization regarding what to think about socially valued versus socially devalued groups”. The logic that rubber stamps the logic is the argument presented in the literature review that media has tendencies to represent and underrepresent certain citizens. Therefore, representation, underrepresentation, and trivialization are noteworthy elements of the theory that directly connects to how media content represents citizens.

Political economy of the media theory

The dissertation also has an interest in understanding the data of the media coverage of the July 2021 unrest through the political economy of the media (PEM) theoretical perspective. The theory originates from the perspective of 18th-century perspectives of Adam Smith and David Ricardo's interest in economic functions, in fact, Smith (1776) defined political economic theory “as the study of “wealth” (material goods) or the allocation of resources and was concerned with “how mankind arranges to allocate scarce resources with a view toward satisfying certain needs and not others.” Various scholars have expanded the theory to media, Gurevitch *et al* (2005:13) understand “Political economic theory of the media as the perspective which searches for the answers to the question of the power of the media in the analysis of their structures of ownership and control”. Chibita (2006, 249–250) leans towards a similar understanding of the theory “The literature of critical political economy of the media addresses the close relationship between those who wield political (and economic) power”. Wasko argued that “Political theory of the media is understood as a lens in understanding issues around how news is produced, the power dynamics that might have an influence” (2005: 44).

The discussed theory provides a significant opportunity to understand various issues discussed in the literature such as how news is produced impacts the consumers in terms of representation, and underrepresentation. Therefore, the connection or logic behind the usage of the current theory is in its nature to address the effects of media mode producing news/content Salawu “Observes that the consequences of the South African media mode of production may be contribute to; the reduction in independent media sources, neglect of smaller and poorer sectors of the potential audience, a focus on the largest markets and their tastes, and avoidance of risks” (2015:303).

The political economic theory provides a perspective on how South African media is positioned ideologically in the new South Africa. According to Wasserman “Post 1994 media had to rid themselves of this historical load and reposition themselves ideologically and politically in a new democratic society” (2009:62). The literature review makes a key argument of representation, underrepresentation, and trivialization through the preference of certain news that favours certain classes, with the idea to increase profits, therefore, the thoughts of political theory guided by Hadland’s (2007:60) views will underpin the argument that “Media in South Africa seems to be intentionally performing what is popularly known as bracketing out of progressive views as a function of the need by media organisations to maximise audiences and revenues by focusing on the most widely legitimated views”. The main objective of the research is to analyse the voices that dominated the coverage of the July 2021 looting and what was revealed, therefore, the current theory is significant in understanding the production of news through the lenses of political and economic/capitalist pressures. An example of politics within media: media supporting the apartheid project or reporting in favour of the National Party government rather than supporting the liberation movement. The economic/capitalistic impact on the media manifests in financial pressure that often leads media organisations and journalists to centre the production of news on the objectives of attracting advertisers and profits. An example of economic manifestation in media is favourable coverage to secure or increase advertising. Beattie (2020:4) informs that “For advertising to affect newspaper coverage, there must be a credible offer to increase advertising in response to favourable coverage or a credible threat to decrease advertising in response to unfavourable coverage”.

In essence, the political economy of the media has been selected because it offers a nuanced understanding of inconsistency and balances in news production that is seemingly imposed by economic and political power. According to Christian and Sandoval (2015:167) “Political economic theory of the media and communication is an approach that allows us to study the production, circulation, and consumption of information in the context of capitalism, power structures, domination, and inequality”. South Africa is one the most unequal countries in the world therefore, the theory will be key in deepening our understanding of the impact of inequality in the media space. Mansell questions “if resources are scarce, and if power is unequally distributed in society, then the key issue is how these scarce resources are allocated and controlled, and with what consequences for human action” (2004:98). These are significant probes particularly because media in South Africa is owned by those that have resources and capital or classed as argued in the literature. Wasko (2014: 261) “Political economy of the media (PEM) is fundamentally interested in studying communication and media as commodities produced by capitalist industries”. In closing the theory allows us to scrutinise the media ideologies and discourses that might possibly reinforce or challenge social relations such as class, gender, and race. PEM is fundamental in understanding the relations of production and class issues foundations for this that are essential for assessing media power” (Wasko 2014: 261).

Main research question

Main/Core research question: What did the dominant voices in the media coverage of the failed insurrection of July 2021 reveal about the ideologies at play?

Sub-question

What discourse and ideology was revealed regarding the way the failed insurrection, looting and arson that took place in July 2021 were covered by the media?

Theoretical framework Conclusion

The theoretical framework section is divided into three sections and the first one provides the radical democracy theoretical school of thought by Ernesto Laclau and Chantal Mouffe. The theory is grounded in the following: the plurality of voice/s and opposing views, encouraging greater citizens' political participation.

The second part furnishes an even more significant school of thought, namely symbolic annihilation which is linked to Gerbner (1972). The theory teases out issues such as the process by which the mass media omit, trivialize, or condemn certain groups that are not socially valued. The third section provides paramount information which are the main research question and the sub-question.

The chapter further advances a third school of thought in the form of the Political economy of the media theory that teases out the power structures that influence media production through the lenses of scholars such as Christian and Sandoval (2015). The discussion of the theory delves into the two critical issues such as economic and political that have a significant impact on the production of the news.

Chapter Four: Methodology

In order to investigate the voices or lack of voices in the media during disruptive events that took place in July 2021, the research proposes a methodology that is qualitative in nature. According to Snyder, (2019:20), “Research methodology may be understood as all those methods/techniques that are used for conduction of research”. A good research project requires a methodology, and this gives insight into the thought process and the reasons for adopting preferred methods over others. “Research methodology does not only consider research methods but further outlines the logic behind the methods we use in the context of our research study and explains why we are using a particular method or technique and why we are not using others so that research results are capable of being evaluated either by the researcher himself or by others” (Goddard & Melville, 2004:6). Methodologies come in different forms and serve different purposes. For the purpose of this dissertation, we focus on qualitative methods. According to Berrios and Lucca (2006:176), “Qualitative study is one in which the descriptive textual narrative analysis is present”. Ohman (2005:37) concurs and expands on this definition, noting: “Qualitative methodology is an inquiry process of understanding based on distinct methodological traditions of inquiry that explore social human problems, the researcher builds a complex, holistic picture, analyses words, reports detailed views of informants and conducts the study in a natural setting”.

A key element of the research will be an analysis of the data through the discourse analyses method. Based on Hignett and McDermott, (2015:6) “Discourse analyses is an analysis of the process of communication as everyday language by exploring structure, function and patterns, discourses ‘prescribe’ appropriate behaviors and attributes across a range of social domains”. Discourse analyses provides an opportunity to read the text and understand people and their views within society. “Discourse analyses are significant in questioning what possible subject-positions are made possible within the data or text” (Hook, 2007:5). Discourse analyses will provide an opportunity to look at the words and language used and attach meaning to them. Mogashoa, (2014:105) argues that “discourse analysis challenges us to move from seeing language as abstract to seeing our words as having meaning in a particular historical, social and political condition”. Discourse analysis will be key in understanding who is speaking, what status they hold and whom they represent. Foucault, (1977:138) argues that “An author generates discourse to ask how discourse instead give(s) rise to subjects (like authors) with privileged positions (and a series of related possible subject-positions)”. The advantage of using discourse analysis is that it provides the tools that go beyond the visible and search for what is not visible. Foucault further notes that “Discourse analysis should hence busy itself not merely with the search for a plenitude of meaning, but rather with a search for the scarcity of meaning, with what cannot be said, with what is impossible or unreasonable within a certain discursive location” (1981:61). The chosen method (Discourse analysis) allows for a multiplicity of views and in-depth questioning of issues that we might not be happy with. Gee, (2011:8) recommends that “At times discourse analysis will even allow you to see aspects taken-for-granted and assumptions that we want to question because we conclude they are doing harm to ourselves or others in terms of things like equity, fairness, and humane treatment of

people”. Therefore, discourse analyses will provide tools that assist in bringing words and language alive and allow the researcher to critique social beliefs and political decisions.

The research examines forty (40) online articles from the following publications Times Media Group, Media24 Independent media over the period of July 2021. The logic behind the time frame is that it represents the looting events period. The keywords or phrases that were used to search and select articles were as follows: July unrest, violent riots, looting in Kwazulu Natal/Gauteng/South Africa, arson, and fire. The total number of articles found was 102, and several articles directly quoted sources such as organisations and people. The selection of the articles included the following methods: selecting publications that had between 8 and 10 articles, headlines that included the following words: looting/looters, free Zuma/Pro-Zuma protest, KZN and Gauteng unrest, and July unrest, and that landed us on 40 online articles, the articles were read to ensure that they are relevant to the topic. The analysis included grouping the findings into the following categories: Voices, discourses, ideologies, and revelations. The sample size was not subjected to the number of articles but what was of interest and seemed reliable to obtain articles that seemed rich in information.

As indicated above, the data will be analysed using discourse analysis. The words used will be analysed based on the context of the environment, while the researcher may also make assumptions using my own knowledge. Brown (1995:21) posits that “Discourse analysis can be performed by asking how deictics are being used to tie what is said to context and to make assumptions about what listeners already know or can figure out”. The process of data analysis will include looking at what, how, where, and who said it; to whom it was said; as well as looking at the reasoning. From these, conclusions will be drawn that will make visible what the speaker was saying. Through the discourse analysis, the research will find patterns and themes which emerge, that allow this research to reach conclusions.

McRoy (1995:3), encourages that when performing discourse analysis: “Think about the information you need to have, the assumptions you need to make, and the inferences you need to draw to make sense of the communication, where you do not fully know the context, you have to make guesses about what the context was, based on what was said and your own personal knowledge”. The researcher will allow himself to view the data as a stranger and exercise the opportunity to gather a unique perspective while asking questions that might seem out of place. Gee (2011:12) informs that the research should “try to act as if you are an ‘outsider’ ask: What would someone find strange here (unclear, confusing, worth questioning”. The above are key in analysis, in that speakers are aware that audiences might differ, hence, they do more than just deliver words. There are intentions in words spoken or delivered. “Speakers do various sorts of things such as attempting to create, transform, and negotiate social relationships among the people in the group” (Gee, 2011:18). The researcher will take note of the chosen grammar used by the speaker and writer because they are carefully chosen to deliver a particular message. Finegan (2014:9) is of the view that “Speakers choose subjects strategically to set up

how listeners should organize information in their heads and how listeners should view whatever the speaker is talking about”. The process will also keep in mind the dissertation questions and try to provide substantial answers.

Sampling and data collection

Sample size and description

Publication	Industry	Date	Headlines	Article Number.
Sowetan	Online	10,11,12 &13, 14 July 2021	Parliament calls for end to violent protests in KZN. Brazen looting as pro-Zuma protest Retailers, banks close as looting escalates. Cyril condemns ‘ethic’ call to arms in protest violence.	
Sunday times	Online	11-July 2021	Looters take over, looters must face the law. Worst violence in years spreads in South Africa as grievances boil over.	
Daily Sun	Online	10;11,12,13, 14 July 2021	Looting Cops Bust, Looters Continual. SANDF nowhere to be seen KZN under siege. Looters take over, looters must face the law.	
City Press	Online	10;11,12,13 &14 July 2021	Havoc grips KZN as Zuma jail rage erupts. Worst violence in years spreads in KZN. South Africa as grievances boil over	

			Death toll from violent riots climbs past 70, with more than 1,200 arrests.	
Independent Online	Online	10;11,12,13, 14 July 2021	July 2021 carnage: Bungling state fails to nger ‘shadowy hidden hands. ’This is not who we are as a nation’: President Cyril Ramaphosa’s full speech on looting, violence in Gauteng and KZN. Looting continues in Alexandra over Zuma incarceration. Free Zuma protestors shoot at police, probe into man's death under way. Stop the violence’: ANC’s instruction to leaders over KZN Zuma turmoil. Millions of rand of KZN infrastructure damaged in violent ‘Free Jacob Zuma’ protests.	

Daily Sun	Online	11,12-Jul-2021	M2 highway closed off as unrest sweeps through Joburg CBD Investors not giving up on South Africa July 2021 carnage: Bungling state fails to finger 'shadowy hidden hands.	
Sowetan	Online	12-Jul-2021	LIVE UPDATES: #SayNoToLooting – violence, looting continues despite SANDF deployment. Civil society calls for political leadership to help quell protests.	
City Press	Online	13-Jul-2021	Safety plan in place should unrest and looting spill over into the Western Cape. Safety plan in place should unrest and looting spill over into the Western Cape. Violence and looting in the financial hubs of the country was the last thing the government needed after it spent the past two years courting foreign investment in the country in order to spur economic growth and create jobs.	

			Government relaxes Covid-19 lockdown regulations in a bid to deal with unrest, looting.	
			EXPLAINED: What will it take for SA to declare a state of emergency.	
Daily Sun	Online	14-Jul-21	Investors not giving up on South Africa.	
			KZN unrest: I woke up to explosions today. We are under siege and need more troops, EThekweni mayor Mxolisi Kaunda latest to ask for peace in KZN.	
			AU calls for 'urgent restoration of peace and order' as looting and Violence continues in KZN, Gauteng communities.	
			Looting continues in Alexandra over Zuma incarceration	
			Brazen looting as pro-Zuma protests tear Joburg apart	
City Press	Online	14-Jul-21		
Total	Online			40 articles

Conclusion (Methodology)

The above section titled Methodology provides a discussion of what and which data the dissertation is interested in as the focal area. It further discusses how the data will be investigated using a discourse analyses method. The chapter

provides a clear methodological approach that indicates the following: Focus period, justification of the time frame, words and phrases used to search for relevant articles, the total number found, and method used to select articles. The sample size and description are provided using a table that reveals the publication, industry, date, number of articles, and total number of articles reviewed. The following chapter outlines clear scientific approaches and clear research techniques for the study.

Ethical Considerations

The chosen methodology for the research is qualitative discourse analyses and, therefore, does not involve human subjects. I have familiarised myself and adhered with the university's ethical procedures by applying for the relevant ethical approval and have taken into cognisance all ethical guidelines. I have further taken into consideration all the Covid-19 protocols to promote safety all the time.

Chapter Five: Data analysis and findings: The ideology is revealed in the Discourses

Findings: Ideologies, Discourses, and Revelations

This chapter provides an analysis of the media's reporting on the failed insurrection, looting, and arson in July 2021 in South Africa. The research focuses on essential themes of media, voice, and belonging in South Africa. The discourse analysis has focused on the dominant voices in the media coverage of the failed insurrection of July 2021 and what they revealed about the ideologies at play. The research focused on 40 online news articles. This chapter seeks to probe whether ideology affects the news content in the print media in South Africa despite the transformation over nearly three decades. It aims to answer the question: is content in South Africa equally representative of all citizens?

A symbolic theoretical framework becomes imperative to address the groups of people that are muted through representation, underrepresented, omission, trivialisation, and condemnation. The analyses have been broken down into the dominant voices, the discourses and ideologies at play, and the revelations. The point of departure guided by the above question is the voices in the media. Data analysis is delineated as follows; 40 news articles (online articles) were selected with the guideline of the July 2021 period. The focus was on articles that had headlines such as looting, protests, and arson. The articles were each read to ensure they were related to the July looting events and that qualitative analysis could be performed. Berg (2001:38) highlights the importance of "Checking articles and journals ensure the corpus is concerned with mostly qualitative nature". The news articles were read for understanding and to ensure they were related to the study. "Prior to attempting to analyse the texts, first, articles were read to obtain a general idea about them" (Dobakhti, 2016:1384). The analysis of each article was done independently to ensure the validity of the research.

The Zuma saga of state capture and court proceedings have been a polarising issue in South Africa, following the ruling of the High Court that Mr. J Zuma will be imprisoned for being in contempt of court. In fact, there was a growing discourse that the ruling of the Court was unfair, and that Zuma was wrongly imprisoned. Mr. Zuma was accused of many crimes, in particular, state capture and he has been out of court for many years. The enforcement of the high court decision or Zuma's arrest was followed by chaotic events that have been popularly known as looting and arson fuelled and demanded Zuma's release. The events quickly permeated different parts of the country. However, they also started to take on a different shape from the initial free Zuma mission to a more criminal impulse that looked to not only destroy property and infrastructure but steal what they could find and deemed was of value. On the contrary, there was a different discourse that seemed to celebrate the Court's decision in that it was believed to be an indicator that democracy in South Africa was alive and well and that no one was above the law.

Media locally and internationally covered these events and became the central vehicle for disseminating information, including how the polarity was interpreted. Looking at the media's responsibility to cover such events from a radical democratic theory, it had a massive responsibility to ensure that South Africans in all corners were kept informed and further to facilitate a public sphere that is inclusive to all, especially those that are ideologically polarised.

The discourse analysis begins by looking at 40 samples of online articles from various publishers such as Times Media Group, Media24, and Independent. The Independent Media news articles ranged from (*The Star, Saturday Star, The Independent on Saturday, the Independent on Sunday, Weekend Argus, and Business Report*), and the Times Media Group articles came from *Sowetan, Sunday Times*. Media24's articles came from the Daily Sun and City Press. The above aims to understand what the dominant voices in the media coverage of the failed insurrection of July 2021 reveal about the ideologies at play?

The data has further been analysed through the lenses of the following sub-question: What discourse and ideology were revealed regarding the way the failed insurrection, looting, and arson that took place in July 2021 were covered by the media?

An analysis of the online news revealed that the publications quoted various sources and these sources were grouped into various categories. These included Business communities/organisations that were made up of the Franchise Association and Business Unity.

Dominant Voices from the forty articles

President and government departments

The voices from government and departments were as follows: Cyril Ramaphosa; Price Water House Coopers (PWC); The Deputy National Director of Public Prosecutions; Head of the National Prosecutions Service; Public Prosecutions; Cooperate Governance; Traditional Affairs; Mineral Resources Energy Minister Gwede Mantashe; Justice and Correctional Service Minister Ronald Lamola; and Transport Minister Fikile Mbalula. The president, along with the departments, spoke in unison, condemning the actions, acknowledging the right to protest peacefully, but noting that those who break the law should/will be prosecuted.

“Several members of the Ramaphosa's executive visited worst hit by violence and looting Gauteng including ANC National chairperson and Mineral Resources Minister Gwede Mantashe, his cabinet counterparts Ronald Lamola, Bheki Cele, Fikile Mbalula, Stelle Ndabeni – Abrahams, Khumbudzo Ntshahaveni, as well as Deputy state security Minister Zizi Kodwa” (City Press, 14 July 2021, See Appendix A). Indications of sympathy from the government to those who were affected and elements of support from the government are evident in the above.

“Defence and Military Veterans Minister Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula said on Tuesday that the president will only declare a state of emergency when the need arises, speaking during the Justice, Crime Prevention and Security (JCPS) cluster meeting, she said she strongly condemns the current looting and damage to infrastructure, however, it does not warrant a state of emergency” (IOL, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). This abstract indicate/s voice/s from the Minister of Justice Crime Prevention and Security which is a government department.

Despite the loss of lives and damage to property, the above seems to indicate that the government or president and his cabinet felt that the situation was under control. *“The president will only declare a state of emergency when the need arises” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).*

“The National Prosecuting Authority is coordinating closely with relevant government departments to ensure full and transparent accountability for anyone accused of committing or inciting crimes linked to these violent protests and looting, it said in a statement last night” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The extract above speaks to the elements or narrative that, while damage was taking place on the ground, some people were contributing to these events by different means such as promoting them. This is indicated by the words *“accused, inciting crimes and linked to these violent protests”*. The need to collaborate is reflected by the following words *“in ensuring those who were perpetrating the violence were held accountable. The voice came from The National Prosecuting Authority.*

The below extract indicates heads of state or a government department making decisions or legislating the environment. This indicates a view of authority and responsibility over the citizens. *“The Deputy National Director of Public Prosecutions: Head of the National Prosecutions Service has advised Directors of Public Prosecutions in affected Divisions to prioritise these matters and to refer the cases to prosecutors with the requisite experience, who must work with and guide police in their investigations. Should any special arrangements need to be made with regard to courts, this will be discussed with the relevant stakeholders” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).* The cut-out shows an understating and the possible need to be flexible in dealing with the situation. Words such as *“special arrangements, guide”* are an indication that the government is proactive and planning according to the reality that was witness on the street. The abstract indicates voice/s from the *“The Deputy National Director of Public Prosecutions* government department adding a voice on issues of investigation and prosecution of perpetrators.

“This is not who we are as a nation”: President Cyril Ramaphosa's full speech on looting, violence in Gauteng and KZN, our Constitution is the foundation of the rule of law in our country” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The chosen abstract represents a voice from the state president’s view on the looting. An indication of shock and disappointment that South African citizens could be involved in such heinous actions, is shown in words like *“This is not who we are as a nation”* These highlighted words also indicate that this looting behaviour does not reflect who or what South Africans are about and that these acts were out of character. A reminder from the president that South Africans are not looters, and we can do better than what we were witnessing in the streets.

Politicians and Political Parties

Politicians and Political Parties included Sihle Zikalala, the African National Congress (ANC); Democratic Alliance (DA) Gauteng leader Solly Msimanga; Gauteng leader of the pro-Zuma Radical Economic Transformation (RET) faction of the ANC; Nkosentsha Shezi, leader of a group calling itself Radical Economic Champions; and Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) president Velenkosini. The political party's commentary ranged from support of the protest which came from the Radical Economic Transformation (RET). *"A Gauteng leader of the pro-Zuma radical economic transformation faction of the ANC, Sibusiso Hadebe, indicated that the group was behind the protest but refused to give details of the key people responsible for its planning 'for security purposes' (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). The extract entails components of the events being coordinated and having leadership rather than groups of disgruntled Zuma supporters. 'Indicated, planning, behind' are words that confirm that the events were not coincident but planned.*

The IFP encourages law enforcement to play their part to stop the looting. It further supported the allocation of resources to stop the looting. The extract is an indicator that the Inkatha Freedom Party was against the looting, and it viewed it as breaking the law. *"IFP President Velenkosini Hlabisa welcomed the deployment of the army saying police had been overpowered and overs stretched"* (Sowetan 13 July 2021, See Appendix). This points to an agreement with the decision taken by the president that police need assistance, and they are overburdened. Based on the following words *"welcomed, deployment, army, police, overpowered"* It is seen that IFP was in line and supportive of the idea to support the police with the SANDF.

The below cutout is from an African National Congress politician namely Mr. Sihle Zikalala. The quote with words such as *Contribution, revolution* words by "Zikalala acknowledges Zuma's contribution to the struggle of South Africa and brings forth the importance of respecting the citizens' rights, this is indicated by the following words *"Equally, respect, right"*.

"The imprisonment of the former president has inflicted pain on many of us who value his contribution to the revolution, Zikalala said. 'Equally, we respect and acknowledge the right of all people to protest, but we cannot condone destructive and violent protests'" (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, Appendix).

This is central to encouraging the rule of law when people are aggrieved by democratic processes rather than choosing illegal means by using the following words *"Cannot, condone, destructive, violent, protests"*.

The below is a clear indication from the Democratic Alliance John Steenhuisen and Gauteng leader Solly Msimanga sharing views that the looting was centred on criminality and the law should take its cause. Words such as *"block roads, prevent businesses, operating"* all indicate elements of criminality. The below represents a political voice from the DA and views on the looting.

"DA Gauteng leader Solly Msimanga has called on the police to take action against anyone attempting to block roads and prevent businesses from operating" (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The below theme traces the discourse of violence, and it is indicated by the following words “*unnecessary, violence, extreme, circumstances, chaos, unfolded*”.

As we work to restore law and order in communities, we need to remain calm and measured in our efforts. We dare not legitimise unnecessary violence, even in the most extreme circumstances. We dare not lose our humanity. Today I’ve decided to visit KZN and be with communities. Today, DA Leader @jsteenhuisen is in KwaZulu-Natal to visit the communities affected by the violence and chaos that has unfolded over the last few days. Law-abiding citizens deserve strong leadership that will take action and help restore law and order in communities (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The quote also has elements of disappointment in the current leadership and the following terms show precisely that “*Law-abiding, citizens, deserve, help, restore law*”. This indicates the DA can do better than the current leadership.

Unions and their leaders

Unions and their leaders were highly visible during the analysis and the voices were as follows The Labour Union; The Democratised Transport Logistics and Allied Workers Union’s Vusi Ntshangase; SA Transport and Allied Workers Union; and Deputy General Secretary Anele Kiet. The general concern from the union voices was about the effects of the looting on the struggling economy and they viewed them as anarchy.

The chosen abstract is the most dominant voices from the Unions and their leaders’ outlining concerns about the impact of the looting and how it will negatively affect the economy. “*The destruction of property is worth millions and crippling an economy already struggling from the pandemic. This is the view of labour unions*” (Sowetan, 11 July 2021, See Appendix). This piece indicates a loss in profit margins for the business sector and the economy. These concerns are evident in words such as “*destruction, worth millions, crippling, economy, struggling*”. These words describe a situation that was unfolding concerning the economy.

Furthermore, the perspective was that the destruction would not only have an immediate effect, but we should brace ourselves for the long-term effects of the looting. “*SA Transport and Allied Workers Union deputy general secretary Anele Kiet said: “That’s anarchy; the long and short of it. That’s anarchy and authorities must make it a point that those behind those protests have to be brought to book because we can’t have a lawless country (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). This is a call for the wheels of justice to grind so that peace can be restored. “What we were seeing in the streets was unacceptable and words such as “anarchy, brought to book, lawless”. These indicated pure elements of breaking the law and the law needed to take its course.*

Community movements and community members

The following section investigates community movements/organisations and community members, these were as follows: #NotInMyCommunityMovement; Community Leaders (Vinesh Moodley and Riaz Alli); #NoToLootingMovement, and unemployed youth. The idea behind coming together of community movements and community members was to unite against looting and form a shield against the destruction of property and theft caused by the looting.

The following selected quotes indicate voices from the community movements and community members on issues of how to curb and stop the looting.

“Several communities across SA are putting their lives at risk to protect property and their livelihoods against those looking to jump onto the bandwagon of looting and rioting, “From taxi drivers not sleeping at home to unemployed youth armed with whistles and sjamboks” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

This highlights the efforts by community movements and members to stop the looting in their various communities. This is reflected by the following words *“communities, putting, risk, protect property”*. This shows sheer zeal and patriotism in standing up when the country needs its people.

There below reveals evidence of community movements and communities taking the lead and playing their part in saying the looting is wrong and it should stop. These communities clearly viewed the looting and arson as wrong, and they could see that waiting for the official law enforcement was not going to help them.

“Community patrollers have been holding the line for the past 40 hours. Reports from the ground indicate that two shopping complexes and a garage at the entrance to Reservoir Hills have been burnt” (Daily Sun 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

Words such as *“patrollers, holding, line, and 40 hours”* indicate the sheer commitment to protect properties and businesses.

“Engen garage on the M19 also looted. Local security and armed civilians using rubber bullets and bangs to keep protesters at bay” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

A discourse from the community organisations and community members of working together to provide much-needed security. These words *“Local, security, armed, civilians, keep protesters at bay”*. No sign of police therefore, communities’ partner with security to protect the businesses.

“NotInMyName calls on South Africans to defend businesses, stop looting and violence” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above came from an organisation (known as NotInMyName taking a stand to say no to the looting. *“Defend, businesses, stop, looting, and violence”*. This also indicates voices from the community organisation coming together to defend business establishment from looting.

“#NotInMyCommunity movement is gaining momentum as widespread looting hit KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng, Nhlanhla Mkhabela said they spent the whole night on guard after some of the stores had been attacked”. “Unemployed youth in Soshanguve, armed with whistles and sjamboks, have started a night and early morning patrol club” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Our Association in Tshwane has taken over the protection of 3 malls in Soshanguve and the momentum is gaining ground” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, See Appendix 2021).

The chosen cutouts above indicate law enforcement through community members instead of the police. Words such as *taking over, protection, guard, whistles and sjamboks, patrol club*. “This indeed indicates organised efforts in taking a stand instead of individualistic effort.

This section discussed how the following community members were affected and those that were given a voice in the print media article: Mmameloko Mokone of Pimville, Soweto; Thami Vali, a resident in Klipspruit; Smangele Gumbi from Lawley, south of Johannesburg; and Nivashni Nair from Durban. The sentiments of the community members that were indirectly or directly affected by the looting were not in support of the looting they were against the looting and felt that these actions would have a lasting and negative effect on everyone.

Communities in the below were concerned about their future income and access to facilities that sell food, the issue of adequate places to buy and the available quantities was a concern from community members.

“It’s impossible to get a loaf of bread people are panic buying” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Bread becomes a scarce commodity” (Sowetan, 11 July 2021, See Appendix).

Below are further voices from the community members raising concerns about the looting effects such as citizens losing their jobs.

“What happened here was very terrible. People are going to lose jobs and we don’t have anywhere else to do our shopping. This is the closest mall to us, your family and friends are going to need medication and jobs, say no to Looting” (Daily Sun, 10 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Durbanites woke up this morning to limited access to the supply of bread and other essential item. Almost all shops and it’s impossible to get a loaf of bread, The few Shops that opened have extremely long lines and people buying like we are in a war situation” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

Communities are faced with the challenge of acquiring basic food items. This showed a great concern that these will contribute to the high levels of unemployment and severe shortages of food and places to buy from. The following terms

indicate the unemployment discourse that was prevalent in the discussion of the events. *“Family, need, jobs, impossible, loaf of bread, panic, long lines”*.

The below indicates that some of the community members viewed the looting as ignorance and failure to see the importance of what is of value to them. These are the words that attest to the ignorance *“fun, today, tomorrow, sad”*.

“Communities formed snaking often ques, at shops that have not experienced the brunt of the looters in Durban to buy whatever essentials they could get their hands on, it’s fun for them today, but tomorrow it will be sad. We don’t have bread in the house as it is and there is nowhere, we can buy anything – the tuck shops are closed. The malls are closed” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, Appendix).

“Residents struggle over food and fuel” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above has elements of community members not understanding the gravity of their actions, almost as if they are shooting themselves in the foot. In fact, these vents were used to amuse and entertain them without fully understanding the gravity of their actions.

Taxi Bodies

This section discussed taxi voices such as National organisations; KZN South African National Taxi Council (Santaco) chairman Boy Zondi; Polokwane and Seshego Taxi Association Solly Ledwaba. The taxi bodies were in solidarity with those who were against the looting and joined the government and citizens to form a shield to protect infrastructure. *“In Limpopo, residents, business owners, and taxi associations forged an alliance to fight against any possible looting and vandalising of shopping centres. Residents of Seshego, Polokwane, in collaboration with local taxi associations and the Polokwane CBD Business Forum, launched patrol teams yesterday to prevent any prospect of unrest”* (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). The above extract indicates unity by the taxi bodies along with the communities against the looting and vandalism of infrastructure.

The following extract indicates a view that the taxi leadership was against the looting, and they were prepared to act to protect their business incomes. They were not going to rely on law enforcement such as the police. *“Chairperson of the Polokwane and Seshego Taxi Association Solly Ledwaba said: “We are not going to allow anyone to hold us at ransom by making our route and commuters ungovernable because our business will collapse. We have been patrolling all along, but now we have intensified our efforts”* (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). This speaks to community participation in issues that affect communities. The above speaks to the discourse of protecting business and property and the following words are indicative of that *“allow, hold, ransom, ungovernable, business, collapse, patrolling”*. These words show that communities were willing to protect the properties and businesses themselves.

Academics, Researchers, and Political analysts

There are many academics who commented such as University of Cape Town Constitutional law expert Professor Pierre de Vos; Political Analyst Ongama Mtimka; Political analyst Daniel Silke; Researchers; and Political analysts such as De Haas, who is an Honorary research fellow at the University of KZN's School of Law. The above section represents voices from the 'educated' they all enjoy hierarchy in South Africa and they all command authority in knowledge production; their views have major authority in South Africa. While searching for answers, the noise seemed to be coming from all directions, but these extracts prioritise Academics, Researchers, and Political analysts.

Pierre de Vos shares his knowledge below on the discussion of whether a State of Emergency was required or not. The below indicates a view against it and that there are other solutions that could be implemented that could help the situation.

“Constitutional law expert Professor Pierre de Vos says for a country to declare a state of emergency, there is an ‘exceptionally high threshold to meet, an armed insurrection, an attempted coup d’état, or some other catastrophic event that endangers the continued functioning of the democratic state might in some circumstances warrant such a declaration, but only if there are no other ways to deal effectively with the threat’ (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The discourse above declaring a state of emergency or not and the following words *“exceptionally high threshold to meet”* show that declaring would require the president to satisfy by following a lengthy and complicated process. The words such as *“catastrophic event that endangers”* indicate and recognises the gravity of the situation.

The cut-out below points to a political analyst's (Daniel Silke) voice of authority within knowledge production in that the publication quotes a voice out of the millions that contributed to the dialogue because of the authority/title it holds in our society. *“On Twitter, another political analyst Daniel Silke said that whatever was contained in Ramaphosa's speech, ‘it's the inability of his depleted and disengaged security cluster to uphold their constitutional responsibilities and formulate a strategic response plan’ (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).* The extract voices huge dissatisfaction towards the leadership and felt that the actions or solutions were not going to produce the desired results. The theme indicates a failure to deliver what was required from the president that would have seen a change in the streets.

Political analyst Daniel Silke contributed by critiquing the president and his strategies toward the looting.

“Political analyst Ongama Mtimka said Ramaphosa was leading in uncertain times that demanded swift action” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

Another voice within the academia realm Ongama Mtika is visible below indicating that what South Africa was experiencing was not a norm “*uncertain times*” therefore, actions that needed to be taken should speak to the current situation.

The below extract exhibits disagreement with the statements put out by the government indicating a shortage of intelligence and information.

“*There is no shortage of information to expose those responsibly, especially given this government's snooping powers, including on telephone and social media networks. Since there is no political will, what can civil society do? Pressure must be exerted on all elected officials to act urgently against the lack of proper parliamentary oversight. Public participation in community policing forums, political, non-racial neighborhoods, and community networks – is a priority that can also build bridges, and promote healing, in areas such as Phoenix. There is no time to lose said De Haas is an Honorary research fellow at the University of KZN's School of Law, and a member of the Navi Pillay Research Group focusing on justice and human rights*” (Sowetan, 10 July 2021, See Appendix). The extract from Mr. De Hass indicates that politicians have a great role to play, sadly it seems as if they are inclined to do anything “*Since there is no political will*”.

However, working together using a multi-pronged approach “*Public participation in community policing forums, political, non-racial neighborhoods, and community networks*” that involves all sectors of the public is key to restoring peace and stability.

Discourse from the 40 articles

This section investigates the discourse and ideologies were revealed regarding the way the failed insurrection, looting, and arson that took place in July 2021 were covered? The discourses will be presented in various themes.

Looting targeting Businesses

The following speaks *looting of businesses* theme indicates a selection of quotes indicating the vast looting of businesses.

“*The Black Business Federation (BBF) has reported that over 30 businesses alienated with it have been looted amid the unrest in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal, the federation has appealed to all communities to stand against the looting*” (City Press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). The current abstract indicates a discourse that businesses “*over 30 businesses alienated*” were targeted and looted.

The below cutouts indicate the severity of the looting and destruction of businesses and calling for peace and order.

“*To all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).* This further indicates that the looting was having a negative impact on the business community. Words such as “*unite and reinstate*

peace and order, indicate a discourse that pandemonium was being witnessed in the streets, and businesses were not spared.

The following quote adds to the looting of businesses *“which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities”* The quote acknowledges the need for multiple sections of society to contribute to the restoration of normality so that businesses could reopen. The looting of businesses in the above abstract indicates the need to bring back come in that the looting of businesses was affecting the economy (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See appendix).

“We also call on law enforcement agencies to urgently protect lives, property, and businesses which have become the main target of the ongoing violence. Whilst our Constitution guarantees the right of every South African to protest, we end the violence visited on ordinary people, property, trucks, and business premises completely indefensible” (Sunday Times, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The business community acknowledges the prescribed rights of the citizens and their importance. They reminded us that these rights should be respected but equally that looting, arson, and destruction are against the law. It further indicated that law enforcement should do what is necessary to quell the situation. The threat to lives that came with the danger of the looting was a concern to the business community. These actions were exposing and impacting lives that had nothing to do with the grievances.

“Marc Anthony, the manager of the Avonmore Superspar in Berea, thanks customers for helping to protect the store from looters” (IOL, 13 July 202, See Appendix).

The above indicates that not everyone was partaking in the looting and arson. In fact, citizens against the activities were not only vocal about their opposition but were actively showing their discontent by safeguarding property and shops.

The Business Institute viewed the actions as activities that would hurt the economy and severe condemnation of the looting was significant. *“The Small Business Institute (SBI) today strongly condemned the wanton looting of businesses, destruction of vital economic infrastructure, burning of trucks and blockading of roads primarily in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng”* (Sunday Times, 12 July 2021 See Appendix). The above indicates that the sections of the business community that were given a voice, dammed an end to the economic disruptions. The SBI holds a hierarchy in society in that it is known and seen as the representative or voice of small businesses. Therefore, a statement or comment from this institution represents and speaks for a massive constituency. The SBI also viewed the looting of businesses as actions that would indirectly impact all the citizens of the country. It further indicated that the disruptions were not only impacting physical businesses but online shops as well.

“Online delivery service, OneCart announced that it was closing early today for the safety of our Shoppers and Drivers. In a statement, it said: “All orders not delivered today, will be rescheduled as soon as our staff are back at work, they said the business had also been affected by the events taking place” (IOL, 12 July 2021, Appendix).

The above quote indicate that staff member's safety is a concern, for consumer and staff members, it further indicates that the running of the online business activities has been disrupted. The challenge of safety is a concern, and the business community was not able to communicate to the clients that were affected by the activities but could only promise to resume when the looting, and arson had dissipated. Words like *"All orders not delivered today, will be rescheduled"* indicate the looting of business discourse in the discussion of issues on the disruption of business activities.

"Franchise Association joins calls for government to protect economy The association said it wanted to add its voice to calls by Business Unity South Africa and other business associations for the government to take action" (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The extract above suggested that the business community contributes to the current discourse by stressing the impact of looting on the economy and felt that the government has the responsibility to curb the situation along with other business entities. The association felt that working together was key to finding a viable solution. The discourse is visible from the following words *"the government to take action"*. The discourse also indicates that the business community expects the government to deal with and stop the looting.

The below voices in the business community came from the Franchise community expressing the sentiments on the looting of businesses theme in that law enforcement should be doing better, and protections were greatly needed from the law enforcement to protect people and property. It was indicated that it seemed that the focal point for the looters was businesses. The discourse below takes shape in the disappointment of law enforcement in dealing or lack of dealing with the looting crowds. These are the words that make up the disappointment *"fragmented woefully inadequate"*.

"We are shocked and concerned that law enforcement agencies, especially intelligence services, have allowed the situation to develop for weeks ahead of the Constitutional Court Judgement on June 29, 2012, the response has been slow, fragmented woefully inadequate, we also call on law enforcement agencies to urgently protect lives, property and businesses which have become the main target of the ongoing violence. Whilst our Constitution guarantees the right of every South African to protest, we end the violence visited on ordinary people, property, trucks, and business premises completely indefensible" (Daily Sun, 11 July 2021, Appendix).

Quoted above are sentiments of disappointment, this is indicated in the following words *"have allowed the situation to develop for weeks ahead of the Constitutional Court Judgement on June 29, 2012"* towards law enforcement, especially intelligence services. The looting of businesses in particular from the business community contributed to the discourse and argued that law enforcement could anticipated the events and prevented them. It further acknowledges the prescribed rights of individuals and groups. *"Right of every South African to protest"*.

“Another impact is the modern factory uses the complex global supply chain as a car is built from about 1800 parts made all around the world. The “just in time” methods to reduce costs for the factory crumble when the whole truck and sea” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The below cutout indicates a continuation of the discourse in the following *“Freight system do not work. Even Transnet freight rail has instituted force majeure”*. This indicates disruptions in the looting of businesses affecting freight systems as well. Words such as *“severely impacted”* indicate the great impact of the looting of businesses.

“Freight system does not work. Even Transnet freight rail has instituted force majeure. With no trains or trucks working and the harbour at less than a quarter capacity in Durban, manufacturing around the PWV and Durban- Pinetown hubs will be severely impacted” (City Press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The quote provided above is an indication of the disruptions and the following words *“The complex global supply chain as a car is built from about 1800 parts made all round the world and severely impacted”*. The words indicate that businesses that assemble parts that come from multiple places cannot function with the disruptions.

“About 6000 trucks pass through Tugela toll plaza in the middle of the N3 every day. A 50,000-liter fuel tanker carries R800 000 of fuel. A container truck with televisions in it can be loaded with close to R2 million in ½at screen TV’s” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“So, with 8,7% of all shopping malls (200 out of 2300) destroyed or damaged the replacement value of those damaged or destroyed would be about R14bn” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above extract indicate that business cannot function in that they rely on parts coming from several institutions *“600 trucks pass through Tugela”* This indicate that the supply chain was majorly disrupted. The statistics illustrated by the quoted and selected words indicate the severity of the disruptions.

“Final goods Inventory for the non-financial private sector was valued at R634bn at the end of the first quarter of this year. Using the same 8, 7% the value of goods destroyed and or looted would be about R56bn. So, the value of goods looted is far higher than the buildings that were housed there” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The discourse above speaks to the vast amount of goods destroyed *“goods destroyed and or looted would be about R56bn”* The provided words speak to the vast number of losses attributed to the looting.

The business section is made up of voices from the business community ranging from prominent business individuals, spokespersons for businesses, and organisations all, providing their take on the looting, and arson situation. The above theme indicated that these events needed to end because it was clear that businesses were becoming the primary target. The business community further indicated the disruption to the supply chain and the negative impact on their business.

Calling for calm and condemning the looting

Calling for calm and condemning the looting discourse emerged as a theme. The various politicians and political voices that emerged in the discourse were the following John Steenhuisen; Pule Mabe; Mxolisi Kaunda and Andre Kriel; Sihle Zikalala and Jessie Duarte; and the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF). Therefore, the discussion will be broken down based on the political parties represented by the above, which are the Democratic Alliance; The African National Congress; and The Economic Freedom Fighters.

“ANC spokesperson Pule Mabe told a news broadcaster that the affected provinces - Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal would see greater visibility of authorities on the ground after the president's speech but the government cannot create stability in communities without the assistance of those very communities, we have seen the looting of shops, destruction of properties” (City Press, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The ANC Spokesperson further indicated the need for restoration of calm fearing consequences such as *“If left unattended, it would be very dire, especially for those who work in those shops and won't be able to provide for their families” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).*

The ANC voice came from the spokesperson, Pule Mabe, who intensely lambasted the looting and failure to stop it, he acknowledged the need for assistance of police through the following words *“see greater visibility of authorities”*. He thought these would have a negative impact on the communities and that people should expect law enforcement to ensure the situation is being dealt with. *“It would be very dire, won't be able to provide for their families” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix)*

The three provinces that were reported as hot spots will be prioritised with the most manpower for law enforcement. The following is testimony to the above. *“The affected provinces - Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal would see greater visibility of authorities”*. The spokesperson's comments have elements of conceding that even though the government will do what it can, it does not have the capacity to restore peace on its own and that societies will be vital in this regard if they do not do anything they are the ones that will suffer the most. *“The government cannot create stability in communities without the assistance of those very communities”*. These highlighted words indicate government cannot deal with the situation on its own, inviting and acknowledging that communities should play a part in it as well.

In continuation with the theme of politicians and political parties calling for calm. The above shows concern for those who would possibly become unemployed because of the looting and that this will not only affect them directly but also their families. Therefore, restoring calm was of great importance.

Below the calling for calm by the politicians and political parties discourse continued with the movement instructing fellow cadres to do everything in their power to call for calm.

“Stop the violence’: ANC’s instruction to leaders over KZN Zuma turmoil” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix)

“The ANC has called on party leaders in KwaZulu-Natal and national executive committee deployees to stem violence during protests in the province” (City Press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The following quotes are from an ANC member/politician acknowledging the gravity and unique situation the country finds in and understanding why people are possibly angry *“We understand the extreme anger of the people who are protesting. As a country and province, we find ourselves in a very unusual and unique situation wherein we are dealing with the arrest of a former president of the ANC and the country. We are therefore dealing with very challenging times”.* (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

Zikalala further emphasised the constitutional right of all citizens to protest which is enshrined in the constitution and reminded citizens of the limitations of their rights and calling for calm. *“However, we call on those who are protesting to do so through peaceful means and to avoid violence and destruction at all costs.”* (City Press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

Calling for calm also meant addressing those who were not looting but worrying and affected by the actions and those who might be in possible danger. The following from the ANC speak to the calling for calm and addressing. *“We have been thoroughly briefed about the security situation on the ground and we can assure the people of the province that all law enforcement authorities are on high alert and are addressing the incidents as they evolve”* (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The calling for calm discourse continued and the following extracts come from the EFF questioning the mechanisms deployed by the president in ensuring calm is restored. *“The @EFFSouthAfrica had decided to challenge the @CyrilRamaphosa's decision of deploying @SANDF_ZA through its legal team. They want the president to clarify, on what basis did he decide to deploy troops. They say soldiers cannot be deployed at home while there is no war”* (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The following fall into the politicians and political parties calling for calm and sharing disagreement on how the president was addressing the issue and arguing that the situation was unstable and bringing in the SANDF would intensify the situation rather than bring calm. *“EFF demands Cyril Ramaphosa justify SANDF deployment to volatile problem”* (IOL, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) questioned the strategies of the president such as the deployment of the South African Defence Force. Words such as “*clarify, what bases*” are an indication of wanting calm restored. However, clarity and disagreement were apparent on how to achieve calm.

Another politician who added to the calling for calm discourse was the Democratic Alliance leader who cautioned that we should not make the situation worse, strategies to restore calm should be well thought off. “*As we work to restore law and order in communities, we need to remain calm and measured in our efforts* (Sunday Times, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The Democratic leader further indicated that calling for calm is paramount but in doing so we should be wary of making violence seem legal. “*We dare not legitimise unnecessary violence, even in the most extreme circumstances*” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

John Steenhuisen further contributed to the discourse by adding that calm has not been restored entirely because of how the president has responded to the unrest. “*DA LEADER John Steenhuisen has criticised President Cyril Ramaphosa’s response to the violent looting and unrest in South Africa, saying his address to the nation “fell short”* (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The restoring calm discourse further permeated through the DA leader visiting Kwazulu Natal communities especially those that were affected. *We dare not lose our humanity. Today I’ve decided to visit KZN and be with communities. Today, DA Leader @jsteenhuisen is in KwaZulu-Natal to visit the communities affected by the violence and chaos that has unfolded over the last few days* (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The DA politician was of the view that South Africa should have restored calm if the country had strong leadership. *Law-abiding citizens deserve strong leadership that will take action and help restore law and order in communities* (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

Lack of belief in the strategies preferred by the president in that they were not going to help, and something greater than what the president provided was needed. “*Criticised response, fell short* “. The DA acknowledges that the situation is dire through the usage of words such as “*violent, extreme, chaos unfolded*”. Very disappointed with the current leadership “*Law-abiding citizens deserve strong leadership that will take action and help restore law and order in communities*” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). Implying that the DA could do better than the current president.

Free Zuma

The following free Zuma discourse was a point of deliberation and in the below extract quotes the Jacob Zuma Foundation, which was of the view that the protest and looting were the direct result of Zuma’s arrest, and his release will see peace and stability restored. “*A tweet from the Jacob Zuma Foundation on Tuesday afternoon says: “Peace and*

stability in South Africa are directly linked to the release of President Zuma with immediate effect” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above extract identifies the former president as wrongly incarcerated, and his release as a remedy to the looting. In fact, the quote identifies the arrest as the cause and the looting as the effect. *Peace and stability in South Africa are directly linked to the release of President Zuma*”.

The following extract speaks to the free Zuma discourse and further links the chaotic events to Zuma’s release.

“JG Zuma Foundation (Official) @JGZ_Foundation-Follow Peace and stability in South Africa is directly linked to the release of President Zuma with immediate effect (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

In continuing with the free Zuma discourse the following quotes are of the view that the former president should not have been incarcerated in the first place. *It was just pure malice to incarcerate President Zuma whilst litigation on his Detention without Trial case*” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). The above adds to the discourse that the Courts that deliberated on Zuma’s case reached an incorrect verdict which led to the looting. However, the view above is that this can be remedied by his immediate release. The above further indicates major discontent with the Court’s decision.

Several people took to the streets in particular KZN and Gauteng and these actions took a violent nature, with supporters demanding for Zuma’s release. *“Looting continues in Alexandra over Zuma incarceration, Protests have been going on since the arrest of former president Jacob Zuma last week. Those who support Zuma are of the view that Zuma should not be in Prison. Protesters have been calling for Zuma to be released. Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal have been the main provinces experiencing violent protest*” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

No to looting

The below extract indicates how civil society organisations such as The SA National Taxi Association in Tshwane and the South African National Taxi Council took the lead in ensuring that the infrastructure and businesses are protected against looting. The extract shows that civil society organisations are the voice for civilians in deciding what are the right steps to take in these challenging times.

It is clear that the taxi association was saying no to the looting, and they were willing to play their part and protect infrastructure (malls). *“The SA National Taxi Association in Tshwane says they are on hand to protect three malls in the area against looting. SANTACO @SA_Taxis-Follow Our Association in Tshwane has taken over the protection of 3 malls in Soshanguve and the momentum is gaining ground. IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).*

The below shows unity in the discourse of no looting *“go out in full force*” in that the call invites all the members to ensure that the looting destruction is avoided.

Earlier, the South African National Taxi Council (Santaco) in Tshwane directed all taxi associations in the region to “go out in full force” to protect all shopping malls in the city against the widespread looting and vandalism that has left a trail of destruction” (Sunday Times, 13 July 2021 See Appendix).

The need for the above bodies to take matters into their own hands is an indication that the situation has boiled over to a stage where mainstream law enforcement needs to be assisted. The unity element of communities is required. This is a realisation that law enforcement was needed if the police could not be around society would enforce the law on its own.

“Tshwane Santaco chairperson Abner Tsebe said the taxi industry should move “immediately” to support the work being done by the South African Police Service (SAPS) and some communities that are now protecting businesses against large-scale looting” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

What is worth noting with the above extracts as indicated by the word “support” indicates that communities were playing a crucial role in ensuring that the looting stops. The above indicates that the resources that were coming to the front to assist came in the form of members of society. “Some communities that are now protecting businesses”. The above quote has elements of elite voices giving instructions to the ordinary on how to address the current situation. *“Tshwane Santaco chairperson Abner Tsebe” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).*

In the following extracts, the no to looting continues with communities and securities saying no to looting by forming a shield to protect infrastructure. *“Communities spontaneously formed community patrols protecting shopping centres and private security companies assisting the police with operational equipment” (City Press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).*

The discussion around the discourse included communities that were preventing access in certain areas in the name of saying no to looting by setting barricades, Authorities also acknowledged the efforts but cautioned communities to take the law into their own hands. *“Communities who had set up patrols and prevented access to their roads and suburbs must not take matters into their own hands” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).*

In an effort of community members to say no to looting, authorities acknowledged the element of protest in the constitution and the limitations therefore of the right. *“In response to reports of armed community members retaliating against protesters, the Natjoints has emphasised and reminded the public that though people are entitled to protect their property and lives, the Right to life is protected in the constitution, and can only be infringed in extremely limited circumstances to protect the life or bodily integrity of the defender,” said Muridil” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).* However, what is noted from the extracts was those who wish to protest should do so but no to looting.

“Several communities across SA are putting their lives at risk to protect property and their livelihoods against those looking to jump onto the bandwagon of looting and rioting, “From taxi drivers not sleeping at home to unemployed youth armed with whistles and sjamboks” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above extract speaks to the theme of no looting. These are efforts by “Several communities across SA” to stop the looting, in fact, they defy the dangers that came with these actions to ensure that looting does not continue. “Putting their

lives at risk to protect property and their livelihoods against those looking to jump onto the bandwagon of looting and rioting". The discourse is expanded by a concern towards lives and property.

Lack of law enforcement and Criminality

The above discourse is indicated in the following abstract in particular in words such as "*a building had also been set on fire in Jeppestown*". These add to the lack of law enforcement and criminality theme.

The below indicates voices that provided surveillance on the ground by the Metro police, what is clear and visible is the criminal elements. "*The Joburg metro police confirmed that parts of the M2 highway had to be closed early on Sunday as gunshots were being red at passing vehicles, JMPD spokesperson Xolani Fihla said the gunshots were being red from the Denver and George Goch hostels, a building had also been set on fire in Jeppestown*" (IOL, 11 July 2021, See Appendix). The above indicates the seriously dangerous elements that were permeating in different locations around South Africa. These also speak to criminality and possible actions that might lead to the loss of lives. Contributors of this theme "*gunshots were being red from the Denver and George Goch hostels*".

The below is a key indicator that a legitimate solution to quell the looting should come from the police, that it is their responsibility to protect the people, and this comes from their authority in the form of a Provincial police Commissioner Lieutenant-General. "*Provincial police Commissioner Lieutenant-General Thembisile Patekile says the province has outlined a safety plan to protect residents from any unrest that might arise. Picture: Leon Lestrade/African News Agency (ANA)*" (IOL, 13 July 2021 See Appendix). This further indicates efforts to quell the violent scenes by those who are tasked to provide peace and stability in the country.

The lack of law enforcement discourse is indicated by many lives being lost "*We're beginning to lose lives on a scale that we'd love (to have) avoided*" said Police Minister Bheki Cele told reporters in Alexandra on Tuesday afternoon".

The amount of people that were reported as dead due to the looting suggested that there was a lack of law enforcement "*A total of 45 people have died due to the unrest in both Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal*" " *The numbers keep rising, more than 70 Killed in unrest*". The lack of law enforcement was evident, and it is confirmed by the police in fact some of the deaths that were reported the police had no information. "*Cele said that while some of the deceased had been shot, others were "dying in circumstances that we have not determined"* (IOL, 13 July 2021 See Appendix A). The quote has elements of admitting a lack of control of the situation or lack of law enforcement, the police authorities could not even provide adequate information on the number of deaths that occurred because of the looting.

The deployment of the SANDF confirms that law enforcement was an issue and the realisation was that more resources were needed. "*Welcoming the deployment of the SANDF, in support of the operations of the SAPS NatJOINTS*said a total of 166 people have been arrested in KwaZulu-Natal and 323 in Gauteng" (City Press, 12 July 202, See Appendix).

The deployment of troops into certain areas discourse outlines that some of the areas were seen as more volatile than others and the defense force was sent to re-enforce those. *“Troops move into flashpoints”* The following cut out *“to help outnumbered police”* (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix), adds to the lack of enforcement suggest that police resources/being outnumbered was a possible reason for the lack of law enforcement. This acknowledges that extra resources are required and that the currently available law enforcement is doing everything possible as guided by the law but a lot more is needed. The high number of arrests in a short space of time indicated that police resources were overwhelmed.

The Lack of law enforcement discourse is further acknowledged by the following quote *“condemns violence”* However, indicates that police were doing all they could and applauded them *“praises police”* (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). A further acknowledgment that what we were witnessing in the streets was wrong and needed to stop or be stopped and showing support to the police for doing what they could despite the circumstances.

The chosen terms, such as “volatile”, speak to the severe danger with which the business community viewed the situation. *“Where the situation is volatile, the environment is not safe for our employees to come to work we have temporarily closed operations. As a provider of essential food to South Africans we will continue to distribute bread where it is safe to do so”* (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). This further indicates a commitment to provide essential foods, however, acknowledging that violence was greater in some areas and better in others, distribution will not take place in all the normal areas because of safety reasons, this is indicated by the following *“continue to distribute bread where it is safe to do so”*.

Protecting lives and infrastructure for the business community was very important and a consideration that seemed sensible. *“Nedbank, in a statement to Sowetan yesterday, said it has decided to “temporarily close” 196 branches and 52 outlets at Boxer Supermarkets due to the escalation in violent protests”* (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). This indicates a need to protect infrastructure and people who work in the targeted establishments were not safe, words such as *“temporarily close, escalation in violent protests”* indicate the safety phenomenon. This further indicates that the criminal elements and lack of law enforcement were affecting business activities.

As to the results of the volatile situation, the extract below indicates that the business community foresees great impact not only on the business side but that consumers will be majorly impacted as well. *“The people who will feel the most impact are the township”*.

“National African Federated Chamber of Commerce and Industry president Sabelo Macingwane said: “The people who will feel the most impact are township, semi-urban and rural areas residents who will now have to travel far to buy basic goods, to collect grants and to access other services because of the disruptions” (City Press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). The repercussions of the July unrest will further add to the inequality of the country and the ‘have nots will

feel the effects more than others, these events will provide major inconvenience, and the following words “*most impact are township, semi-urban and rural areas residents who will now have to travel far to buy basic goods*”.

The below indicates the criminal nature of the protests and looting resulted in great losses (infrastructure and cash) for the business community. The following terms indicate losses “*lost, taken, including a safe with cash in it*”.

“*Mkhabela said he lost stock worth R200, 000 which was meant to last until next week. Machinery worth R1m was also taken, including a safe with cash in it*” (City Press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“*Some shopping centers around the city continue with business while others close shop*” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above elements provide a discourse that speaks to the gravity of the looting and how to address it and move forward, words such as “*hit by sporadic looting, dire impact, and solutions*” represent the current discourse.

Job loss

One of the discourses that permeated from the analyses was the job loss phenomenal as the results of the looting events in July. The discourse is indicated by terms such as “*lose jobs, call from her boss dismiss her from work, robbed us of jobs and sources of income*”. The chosen words suggest that one of the most devastating impacts of the looting was that people were in danger of losing their jobs and some were already being dismissed by employers.

“*What happened here was very terrible. People are going to lose jobs and we don’t have anywhere else to do our shopping. This is the closest mall to us*” (Daily Sun, 10 July 2021, See Appendix).

The below cut out is part of the current discourse of job losses “*a worker at a local bakery in Vosloorus, said she received a call from her boss dismiss her from work*” The bakery where Thabiso worked was looted and was forced to close down and lost his job.

“*Back to the drawing table to find ways to recoup the business,*” said Thabiso Nana Sello (32), a worker at a local bakery in Vosloorus, said she received a call from her boss dismiss her from work. “*Everything in the bakery was looted. I solely relied on this job to put food on the table. My mum is not working, and I have a toddler. “I don’t blame my boss. She has been very good to us. She is also stressed as the bakery was established not long ago and is unable to recover. Our very own black communities have robbed us of jobs and sources of income,” said Nana*” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). The discourse is further expanded in the extract by the discussion from those who lost their jobs and feeling robbed by their own communities.

The below raises concerns in that job losses will affect citizens ability to buy groceries and basic needs. *“Its fun for them today, but tomorrow it will be sad. We don't have bread in the house – the tuck shops are closed. The malls are closed”* (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, Appendix).

Monique Marungwane lost her job as a domestic worker due to business destroyed by the looters” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

But he said many households would go hungry because of the job losses caused by the riots and anarchy” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, See appendix).

Outlets and shopping centres that were destroyed might lose their jobs, and the question is, will they be able to afford to buy food?” (City Press, 14 July 2021, See appendix).

The above cut out outs indicate elements of the job loss discourse, it seems as if, the driving force was mainly because of great losses by businesses because of the looting. Therefore, business losses directly had an impact on the jobs losses. What is also evident from the above extracts is that job losses will affect people’s ability to buy basic needs such as food.

Police overwhelmed

The below cutouts revealed that the South African police were overwhelmed, and they lacked the manpower, and resources to quell the looting and needed assistance.

“As the commander-in-chief of the South African [National] Defence Force, I have today authorised the deployment of defence force personnel in support of the operations of the South African Police Service. The National Joint Operational and Intelligence Structure – known as NatJOINTS – has intensified deployments in all the affected areas in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng,” Ramaphosa said (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above indicates deployment of resources such as the SANDF *“today authorised the deployment of defence force”* indicating police being overwhelmed and the government dispensing resources in the form of the SANDF.

“The SANDF started deploying to hot spots late on Monday night in an attempt to quell the unrest” (Sunday Times, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Members of the South African Defense Force (SANDF) were deployed to quell the looting and destruction of property in Alexandra Township in Gauteng on Tuesday” (City Press, 14, July 2021, See Appendix).

The discourse indicated above is continued by deployment *“The SANDF started deploying to hot spots”* of manpower because police were overwhelmed.

“South Africans are hoping for an end to the violence, Looting, and intimidation that has rocked the country after President Cyril Ramaphosa said last night, he would mobilise all available resources and capabilities to restore order in the country” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above discourse confirms the volatile situation in the streets and the idea that the police department was overwhelmed, and the much-needed assistance the following words are testimony to that situation, *“the deployment of defence force, in support of the operations of the South African Police Service, quell, volatile, mobilise and available resources”*. The president, as the Number One citizen of the country, felt that the looting had escalated to a point where the South African police needed assistance, and that had to come in the form of the South African National Defense Force and the highlighted words above indicative of the president's position.

Parliament viewed the looting as very disturbing and violent to the citizens.

“Parliament has called for calm as violent protests over the incarceration of former president Jacob Zuma flared up in parts of KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (Sunday Times 11 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above indicates and confirms that there were those who were aggrieved about the arrest of Zuma and the following words indicate they chose to protest in a violent manner *“called for calm and flared up”*. This indicates this protest escalated too violently.

The following quote points to a government department believing in a multi-faceted approach in dealing with the violence in that police alone were not going to stop the looting. Therefore, politicians and citizens needed to play a critical part in stopping the violent looting.

“Mpumalanga MEC for agriculture, rural development, and land affairs, Mandla Msibi, led community members in standing guard and spending the night at the Emoyeni Mall at his Pienaar township outside White River, to protect it” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The quote is indicative of two issues one being different departments working together *“Mpumalanga MEC for agriculture, rural development, and land affairs”*. Businesses and properties needed to be protected and civil society was taking action to ensure protection. This is shown by words such as *“community members and standing guard”*.

The following voices represented law enforcement of the country in the print analysis: First, Johannesburg Metro Police Department (JMPD) spokesperson Xolani Fihla. The below is a view from the JMPD and this paints a picture of how the protest was unfolding with criminal elements.

“Johannesburg Metro Police Department spokesperson Xolani Fihla said several roads and streets in Jeppe, Benrose, Denver, Berea, Hillbrow, and the CBD were barricaded with tyres, rocks and debris” (Sowetan 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

This above indicates a lack of law enforcement or not having adequate power to prevent lawlessness from taking place. Lawlessness taking place unabated. The following words “*were barricaded, tyres, rocks and debris*” all indicate a lack of law enforcement.

This above indicates that those who were breaking the law were not only on the ground, but some were using media platforms. “The words such as “*warning, social media and fan violence*” indicate unlawful activities using social media. “*Naicker said police had issued a warning against using social media to fan violence. KwaZulu-Natal Road Traffic Inspectorate spokesperson Zinhle Mngomezulu yesterday urged motorists using the N3 to be alert*” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The discourse in the quote speaks to the danger or concerns on some of the roads in the country. The following words express the danger discourse above “*urged motorists, N3 and be alert*”.

The National Joint Operational and Intelligence Structure, Col Brenda Muridili, Gareth Newham, and spokesperson Lirandzu Themba.

“*The SAPS in Gauteng and KZN, working closely with their respective local metro police departments, have heightened visibility and remain on high alert in response to incidents of opportunistic criminality and violent protests in the two provinces over the weekend, said the police in a statement*” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

This speaks to the coordination of different departments and the increase of manpower to deal with the arising situation, indicated by the following words “*working closely, wit with their respective local metro police departments and their respective local metro police departments*”.

The quote below shows the intensity of the criminality “*were blocked with burning tyres*” and the possible danger that was faced by law enforcement, who were required to ensure they did not let their guard down because the danger extended beyond citizens to the police as well.

“*Police indicated that they need to be vigilant because we don't know how far this is going to go. “Mooi River central business district, about 1km from the Estcourt prison where Zuma is incarcerated, was blocked with burning tyres and debris yesterday*” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“*Cops had to fire rubber bullets and tear gas to disperse the crowds looting right before their eyes, but in some areas, police were outnumbered by looters, who threw stones at them, people could be seen fleeing with all sorts of stolen goods, including food, booze, and clothes as well as furniture*” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, Appendix).

The extract points to law enforcement being overwhelmed, this is shown by the next words “*blocked, burning tyres, debris yesterday, fire rubber bullets, disperse the crowds, threw stones*”.

The words “*Police were outnumbered*” speak to clear inefficiency and lack of resources to deal with the looting and arson that was witnessed in the streets.

Ideologies at play

The third part of the analysis guided by the research question looks at ideologies at play by examining the 40 Online samples. The analysis revealed several ideologies at play.

Ideology is one of the most controversially defined terms in academia, therefore the attempt to provide an understanding will be cognizant of the challenge. A general understanding of the term to many as certain beliefs and principles that are representative of a particular group in society. Van Dijk (1995:248), “Ideologies are basic frameworks of social cognition, shared by members of social groups, constituted by relevant selections of sociocultural values, and organized by an ideological schema that represents the self-definition of a group”. Pearson (1951:24), supports this understanding and informs that “ideologies are the shared framework of mental models that groups of individuals possess that provide both an interpretation of the environment and a prescription as to how that environment should be structured”. In both the above meanings shared beliefs, opinions, and values of an identifiable group, class, constituency, or society are emphasised, hence for the purpose of the research we lean toward this understanding.

The first ideology that stands out from the selected articles is colonial ideology. Torres who defines colonialism as:

Long-standing patterns of power emerged because of colonialism, but that define culture, labour, intersubjectivity relations, and knowledge production well beyond the strict limits of colonial administrations. Thus, colonality survives colonialism. It is maintained alive in books, in the criteria for academic performance, in cultural patterns, in common sense, in the self-image of people, in aspirations of self, and so many other aspects of our modern experience. In a way, as modern subjects we breathe colonialism all the time and every day. (2007: 243).

Quijano (2007: coined the term colonality of power, which is made up of four interlocking forces of power: (1) labour (structural practices of global capital); (2) sex and sexuality (structural practices of heteronormativity); (3) subjectivity (structural practices of Eurocentric white racism); and (4) authority (structural practices of violence). In the context of this section focuses on the colonality of knowledge where Western knowledge has a hegemony over the alternative. “States ‘African modes of knowing of producing knowledge, and of producing perspectives became subordinated to Euro-American epistemology that assumed universal proportions and universal truth” (Quijano 2007: 169). Looking at the abstracts below we observe elements of media coverage of the July unrest in that the same colonial norms that advantages views over others are clearly visible. Chiumbu “It is argued that South African media, presents a facade of objectivity under libertarian press that gives neoliberalism its hegemony by appearing to give equal space to different views, while in reality obscuring ‘the more subtle, opinion-making discourses that generate neo-liberal biases’ (2016:420-421).

Colonialism ideology

The following selected quotes are from different publications that emphasise the above ideology. The above extracts speak to a view that people are looting, for political reasons such as the release of Zuma, which will restore law and order.

“A tweet from the Jacob Zuma Foundation on Tuesday afternoon says: “Peace and stability in South Africa are directly linked to the release of President Zuma with immediate effect” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The following cutouts are from a Gauteng leader taking credit for the coordination of the protest, the below citation indicates that the protest was not random *“the group was behind the protest”* but planned.

“A Gauteng leader of the pro-Zuma radical economic transformation faction of the ANC, Sbusiso Hadebe, indicated that the group was behind the protest but refused to give details of the key people responsible for its planning “for security purposes” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The following pullouts further indicate the faction will continue to protest and demonstrate to voice their grievances.

“Hadebe confirmed that there was a plan for a national shutdown today, “All we want is for Zuma to be released from jail because it is wrong to arrest an old man like that,” she said. Manyi Zuma’s foundation (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

On an ideological colonial doctrine, the privileging of a well-known and elitist organisation by various publications rather than providing an opportunity to the least known to provide their take on the Zuma issue speaks to colonial practices. Quoting the elite organisations over and over denies an opportunity to the ‘other’. The people who were looting and causing damage to property are spoken for, which then suppresses their views. Colonial media supported their preferred ideological preference and contemporary media has the same features of colonialism that limits equality of views.

Authoritarian Political ideology

The Authoritarian Political ideology was also revealed in the analysis. For the purpose of the current research, we understand the authoritarianism ideology “as the absence of democratic institutions” (Motyl, 2016:27). The ideology surfaced through the EFF political party critiquing the government's approach in dealing with the protest and looting. The EFF was of the view that the deployment of the military did not resemble pluralistic principles that are significant to a democracy. They argued that the deployment of the military was centred on authoritarian ideologies and that the EFF would use the Courts to challenge this. *“The EFF has written to President Cyril Ramaphosa seeking clarity on the deployment of the SA National Defence Force”. Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) has decided to challenge Cyril Maphosa’s decision to deploy the South African National Défense force through its legal team” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See*

Appendix). The EFF believed that the president was choosing unwarranted force on citizens that could not be accepted in a democratic country and that the action or decision fell outside of the democratic norms.

Racism ideology

Racism or racial ideology and divisions became a concerning debate, especially when communities felt threatened and needed to protect themselves or leaders felt the need to quell division. Racism in contemporary South Africa is understood as “Discrimination of one group of people upon the other for the purposes of subjugation or maintaining that subjugation” and adds that “Racism is going very strong in our country South Africa” (Ansell, 2004:10&13). The news articles reported that Indians in Phoenix were allegedly racially profiling people, particularly black people. The number of black people allegedly killed and burned by Indians from Phoenix was reported to be over 20 at the time. It was further argued that the killings took place to protect the obliteration and looting of private businesses and property rather than the latter. *“During the engagement, Kaunda said the leaders rejected the acts of violence and racism and pledged their commitment to work with all sectors to restore peace and stability in communities”* (IOL, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). Acts of racism were not supported but what seemed significant was the need for coming together, and the need for law and order.

There was an acknowledgement of the diversity of South Africans and the need to do away with any divisions that are perpetuated by race, tribe or any other differences which should not be supported. *“This must be condemned by all South Africans at all costs as we are a nation committed to non-racialism and non-tribalism that is underpinned by the diversity and unity of all the people of South Africa, whatever their language, culture, religious beliefs and race”*. (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). The following words *“condemned, all costs, non-racialism, non-tribalism, diversity”* indicate that South Africa is a country of great diversity, and it has done away with racism and any features of taking us back should be discouraged.

“Twitter up in arms following more dead bodies linked to the Phoenix massacre found”. (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“It seems as if its business as usual while Indians are mass murdering black people in Phoenix” (Sunday Times, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above quotes add to the racism discussion that became prevalent known as the Phoenix massacre. The above points to the idea that the killings in Phoenix were motivated by racism rather than communities protecting their communities. South Africa has a history of racial divisions that was perpetuated by apartheid and the above indicate that amongst the

ideologies at play was a possibility of racism. The ideology was informed by the allegations that Indians were targeting black people rather than criminals.

Neo-liberalism Ideology

Neo-liberalism emerged as a dominant ideology. Grzanka (2016:297) defines Neo-liberalism ideology “as a constellation of economic and social policies and ideologies designed to introduce or increase capitalist, market-based competition in areas of social life previously considered beyond the reach of the economic”. The said ideological perspective became at play in that a great focus was given to how the events will impact the Gross Domestic Product, the value of the Rand, and the struggling economic growth, especially because it was dealt a severe blow by the Covid-19 pandemic. The impact on small and big businesses further became a bone of contention. Questions were asked about what should be prioritised, and how the government should structure and find viable ways to compensate affected businesses to sustain already struggling businesses.

The below extract highlights capitalist ideas that are key elements of the current ideology, such as losses and gains, and how profit margins will be affected.

“The losses will be well over R70bn to the economy by my estimate”. (City Press, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The unrest and looting in South Africa have resulted in 200 shopping malls being destroyed or damaged. South Africa has 2300 shopping malls with a replacement value of about R160 billion to R165bn in 2016 prices” (IOL, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

This is a view of what South Africa was experiencing through a lens of Neo-liberalism (financial losses and gains). This is indicated by terms such as *“losses, economy, estimate, replacement value”*. The language coming out of the selected words only speaks to the business world, not the ordinary person.

Neo-liberalism thrives on the expansion of new market opportunities, therefore, the below raises concerns about South Africa being a conducive environment in the future for a thriving market. *“Confidence and business survival will cost SA much more” (IOL, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).* It also includes predictions of how the South African markets will be negatively affected. The words such as *“Confidence, business, cost, more”* addresses the idea that the current situation might be seen by investors as a negative in terms of future investments.

“Then business confidence is needed for business to invest in both new and "browneld" projects. A business needs the confidence to employ or hire people. The losses here should impact even current hires as many a business will struggle to get back on its feet” (Sowetan, 12 July, See Appendix). The term *“confidence”* is loaded in that when companies are stable, they know how the business will perform and whether they can afford to hire more staff.

According to Peet (2002:6871) Neo-liberalism “is a cautious endorsement of neoliberalism: financial and monetary discipline, with an environment conducive to economic growth. Thus, the below indicates concerns about the economy. *“Ramaphosa's office said the actions seen in the past few days could harm the economy” (City Press, 12 July*

2021, See Appendix). The words “harm and economy” are related to issues of jobs, food security, money circulation, meaning when an economy is harmed then the mentioned will be an issue to deal with.

Dominant Discourses and Revelations

This section explores the dominant discourses and what was revealed as guided by the last section of the question. The analysis revealed class discourses struggle related to unemployment, inequality, and poverty were attributed to the looting and protest. Political analysts and academics argued that it has been coming for years due to the lack of transformation and economic inclusivity in South Africa. It was further brought to bear that SA is one of the countries that have the highest unemployment rate and inequality in the world. With that being said, the unrest might have begun as a protest for Zuma but quickly took a turn into a looting spree, highlighting the high rates of unemployment, inequality, and poverty.

The targeting of the businesses discourse theme revealed that unemployment may have contributed to the looting and the following extracts accentuate the unemployment discourse through the usage of the terms such as *"our people", "hungry" and "do not have jobs"*. *“Our people are hungry, our people don’t have jobs”* (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). The job issue and unemployment issue in South Africa is a reality for millions.

The targeting of businesses indicates through the following quote that the country is faced with a severity of unemployment, inequality, and poverty. *“We respect our citizens' constitutional right to peacefully protest, we also agree that there is a crisis of unemployment, inequality, and poverty that must be solved”* (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). Unemployment and inequality were placed at the centre of the crises as possible cause.

The words below such as *“ticking, bomb, explode, face, policymakers”* paint the seriousness of the unemployment, inequality, and poverty crises and warn if something is not done something terrible will happen. There is an element that points to those who are elected to run the country and legislate for the betterment of poverty, unemployment, and inequality, in that something could have been done and that these are results of not doing anything or enough.

“This is also a reminder that the problem of unemployment and poverty is real in South Africa, Cosatu has been arguing for a long time that unemployment is a ticking time bomb that will explode in the face of policymakers and decision-makers, spokesperson Sizwe amla said’ (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). The following further acknowledges the discourse at hand (of unemployment, inequality, and poverty) and indicates that the country has faced these challenges for some time and these eruptions are consequences of unemployment, inequality, and poverty.

The following words *“rebuild, more, job, created”* indicate and acknowledge that poverty, unemployment, and inequality are known facts in the country and there might be efforts to address these issues.

“We are working to rebuild our economy together so that more jobs can be created” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). The above indicates an awareness of the need to do something about the lack of jobs. The unemployment and poverty issue seemed to be a contributing factor to the looting activities as a possible reason why most South Africans looted because there were no jobs, and they were in abject poverty.

Calling for calm and condemning the looting

A discussion that formed part of the dominant discourses was the condemnation of the looting, as it was not serving the nation well, it was wrong, and perpetrators and those who were involved should stop. Citizens should assist law enforcement in ensuring that the looting should stop.

“President Cyril Ramaphosa last night said sporadic violent protests over the jailing of former president Jacob Zuma must be condemned” (Sowetan, 12 July 2023, See Appendix).

“The SA National Blood Service has condemned the vandalism and looting at one of its centers” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above quotes indicate that looting was seen as wrong and unacceptable and therefore the highest office among the departments took the lead to indicate disapproval of the activities and that it needed to stop.

The following serves as a reminder of who and what values South Africans stand for and, therefore, people of higher caliber should denounce these actions. *“This must be condemned by all South Africans at all costs as we are a nation committed to non-racialism and non-tribalism that is underpinned by the diversity and unity of all the people of South Africa”* (Sowetan, 12 July 2023, See Appendix). Terms such as *“non-racialism and non-tribalism”* speak and promote unity among citizens. This urges and reminds South Africans that the activities do not reflect what the nation is committed to, including values that do not divide the nation. What is also revealed in the above is that South Africa values principles of unity.

“We call on all our members, other workers, and all South Africans, in general, to condemn these criminals' conduct and to distance themselves from it” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). This highlights the unity of all South Africans to come together on the looting because it is wrong. This indicates that the communities and workers are central in quelling the looting.

“The BBF (Black Business Forum) has condemned vandalism and looting and urged communities to embrace peace, law, and order” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The calling for “peace and order” is an indication of the volatile situation in the streets. The BFF viewed the looting activities as actions centred on criminality and they pointed or saw the culprits as members of communities.

“The federation has appealed to all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities” (City Press, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). Peace, order, and condemning the actions were echoed, which is indicated in the above. A preference for harmony over the violent scenes in the streets.

The ANC Spokesperson further indicated the need for restoration of calm fearing consequences such as *“If left unattended, it would be very dire, especially for those who work in those shops and won't be able to provide for their families”* (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). This also indicates that the need for calm is crucial not only for those who were looting but also for those who might be affected and possibly lose their jobs.

Criminality

The consensus among several stakeholders was that what we were seeing had nothing to do with #FreeZuma protests but pure criminality.

“Meanwhile Cosatu while the current events erupted following the arrest of former president Zuma, it was clear criminal, opportunistically hijacked the protests and were using it to loot” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). Words like *“erupted, clear criminal, hijacked”* indicate and paint criminality in its pic. The above quote points to the masses who saw an opening and used it for their own criminal activities.

The criminality discourse revealed the belief that the looters were not Zuma supporters they cared less about why and how Zuma was imprisoned. *“These are pure criminal acts and have nothing to do with Jacob Zuma”, and “This is not a Zuma protest”* (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). The terms pure and criminality indicate that this was not for Zuma but criminal elements. What South Africa was witnessing was criminality, not a protest to rescind a Court judgment to free Zuma.

Actions such as burning, looting, and damaging property have elements of crime, and the law of the country does not allow such. These are very dominant in the below extract.

“However, the current looting, arson and other forms of damage is nothing but criminality and counter-productive to the solving of our problems” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“However, widespread looting is still continuing in Gauteng and KZN and the death toll in both provinces is climbing, whilst monitoring conducting patrols at Bara Mall in Soweto, officers found 1x suspect in the ceiling of one of the stores. The suspect couldn't account why he was in the ceiling, suspect detained” (IOL, 12 July 2022, See Appendix).

“In Durban the Shoprite Store was looted as tons throw from the police station Pietermaritzburg mall was set on fire” (City Press, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Ten people killed in Soweto mall stampede, taking Gauteng riots death toll to 19 Premier admits Gauteng looting is out of control” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Lawlessness will not be tolerated, Game Warehouse in Durban looted” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, Appendix).

“The rise in violence throughout the nation has made more malls apprehensive, with rumours of rioting and looting circulating, prompting the closure of Vangate Mall, and other shops across the province, Montclair Mall looted today. Violence and looting continued in parts of Gauteng and KZN, despite President Ramaphosa warning that those behind the violent protests and anarchy would be arrested and prosecuted” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Banks broken into by looters, leaving behind a trail of destruction at the Sam Ntuli Mall” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The Makro in Pietermaritzburg is being ransacked. Hundreds of bakkies around to aid thuggery. Some of the vehicles have even removed their license (IOL, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above several quotes are dominated by the following terms *“thuggery, destruction, violent and fire”*. The above reveals elements of criminality in different parts of the country and industries and also indicates that these actions are moving the country’s gains backward. Different stakeholders continue to discourage criminality. Overall, the revelations from the theme are that South Africa has high levels of crime.

Protest for Zuma

The analysis found reporting that in the beginning the protest was for or a call for or in support of Zuma. It was visible in the chosen discourse that some considered that the Courts were wrong for sentencing Zuma and what we were witnessing in the streets was a call to coerce the Courts to deviate from the ruling that saw Zuma imprisoned. *“The unrest would continue if the courts did not reverse Zuma’s conviction of contempt of court, which saw him sentenced to 15 months behind bars by the Constitutional Court” (Sowetan 12 July 2021, See Appendix).*

The term *“reverse”* indicate that Courts made a mistake, and they should fix it by reversing their decision. What is evident from the above is clear support of the discourse that what we were witnessing was a protest in support of Zuma. This indicate that Zuma had done nothing wrong.

The below draws us to the fact that despite Zuma being jailed, his fight and battle with the law and release immediately highlight that Zuma has support on the ground. *“This application is being heard as #FreeJacobZuma protests have flared*

up across the country. Pro-Zuma supporters went on the rampage in KZN, and the protests have turned into more widespread looting and torching of shops and establishments, the protests have spread to other provinces” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). In contrast to the discourse that conceded that the July unrest was pure criminality instead of a protest, the analysis uncovered sources that linked and viewed the looting as a protest and support for the ongoing trial for Zuma. This is further illustrated by the following quotes.

The phrase #WenzenuZuma” directly means what has Zuma done wrong? The phrase has implication of Zuma being wrongly incarceration and being innocent. Therefore, terms or phrases such as “*pure malice to incarcerate*” indicate that those that support Zuma feels that he is innocent and he has done nothing wrong.

“It was just pure malice to incarcerate President Zuma whilst litigation on his Detention Without Trial case (for a civil contempt) was on-going #WenzenuZuma” (Sowetan, 13, July 2021, See Appendix).

The above quote uses words such as “*pure and malice, detention trial, ongoing*” these terms speak to an unfair or wrongly convicted person.

“While we support President Zuma and his family as our relative during this time of both bereavement and incarceration. We have made it a point not to blur the lines” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, see Appendix).

The above extract leans towards Zuma and this is indicated by the term “*support*” It further indicate understanding and shows sympathy towards Zuma.

“In the name of Jacob Zuma, they are willing to reduce the country to ashes” (City Press, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The usage of the term “*willing, reduce and ashes*” indicate unwavering support and the will to do whatever it takes to support Zuma”. The above extract is in line with the discourse that is in support of Jacob Zuma and see the events as the fight for the release of the former president.

“All we want is for Zuma to be released from jail because it is wrong to arrest an old man like that,” she said. Manyi Zuma’s foundation (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). Words such as “*All, we, want, released, wrong arrest*”. The protest in the name of Zuma indicated an element of sympathy towards Zuma because of his age.

The inefficiency of the police in dealing with the looters (Police Overwhelmed)

One of the dominant themes that appeared from the articles was the business sector raising concern and giving an account of how the infrastructure and businesses were being damaged. This included severe losses, disruptions to the business and ultimately economic activities. Therefore, the amount of losses and criminal incidences indicated lack of authority where law enforcement is concerned. The following cut out indicate losses that could have been avoided with adequate law enforcement.

“The criminality nature of the protests and looting resulted in great losses (infrastructure and cash) for the business community. “Mkhabela said he lost stock worth R200, 000 which was meant to last until next week. Machinery worth R1m was also taken, including a safe with cash in it” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The looting and losses *“lost stock worth R200, 000, machinery worth R1m was also taken”* this indicated that losses were and an indication of inefficiency of the police in dealing with the unrest.

“Six trucks were burned in Mfekayi on the N2 on Friday, and the incident overlapped to the early hours of today” (City Press, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above quote uses terms such as *“great, losses, stock, machinery and cash”* These are items that were lost to businesses by looters, this clearly indicates that the police were not efficient.

“The destruction of property is worth millions and crippling an economy already struggling from the pandemic. This is the view of labour unions” (Sowetan, 11 July 2021, See Appendix).

The criminality discourses are reflective in the terms such as *“destruction, crippling, struggling*. These also indicate destroying an already challenged economy.

Community Members was an additional theme:

“What happened here was very terrible. People are going to lose jobs and we don’t have anywhere else to do our shopping. This is the closest mall to us” (Daily Sun, 10 July 2021, See Appendix).

The discourse in the above theme revealed the fear of losing employment and that the looting might cause food shortage. Key terms for the discourse *“lose jobs, our shopping”*.

As were taxi bodies, however, in the context of the taxi industry the loss would be customers *“In Limpopo, residents, business owners, and taxi associations forged an alliance to fight against any possible looting and vandalising of shopping centers” (City Press, 11 July 2021, See Appendix).*

Residents of Seshego, Polokwane, in collaboration with local taxi associations and the Polokwane CBD Business Forum, launched patrol teams yesterday to prevent any prospect of unrest” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). Working together of communities to protect businesses and properties. This is shown by words such as *“prevent, prospect of unrest and collaboration”*. Unity amongst the community.

Several discourses arose and those included unemployment, inequality and poverty, and criminality. Words that framed this discourse were *“created, rebuild and jobs”*. This was indicating efforts to rebuild the economy and create the much-needed jobs.

“We are working to rebuild our economy together so that more jobs can be created” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above cut out discourse that pointed towards criminality dismiss the idea that this was a protest for Zuma. This was indicated by the usage of the following words *“pure, criminal and acts”*.

“These are pure criminal acts and have nothing to do with Jacob Zuma”, “This is not a Zuma protest” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). Various other themes such as unions and their leaders were also evident. These appeared uttering strong words of condemnation of the looting and referring to eat as criminality.

It became clear that the national police that are responsible for law and order were found wanting. Communities called for assistance and visibility of law enforcement, but efforts proved to be futile. The protest/looting and arson quickly became very volatile and law enforcement was a key feature, and their skills and strength were needed and tested. *“Cele is nowhere to be seen when the country needs him the most. The police were supposed to clamp down on violence as soon as it started in KZN”* (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

Law enforcement agencies are expected to be the first authority in unlawful circumstances and, in the below, it is clear that they were not around. It is important to note that police were attending to other similar violent acts.

“28 trucks, including the chemical tanker, were set on fire at the N3 toll gate near Mooi River on Friday night. “A truck was torched on the N2, near Mgababa, during the early hours of Friday. On the R603, a truck laden with logs was set alight in Ilovu North, Half of the load was burnt. It has since been removed. “Six trucks were burned in Mfekayi on the N2 on Friday, and the incident overlapped to the early hours of today [Saturday].” Mngomezulu said the N2 in Dokodweni, south of Richards Bay, was blocked with burning tyres and debris yesterday. “Roads in the Mooi River CBD were also blocked with burning tyres and debris, so was the R74 in Kranskop ... as well as the R33 in Mattison [Pietermaritzburg]” (Sowetan 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

In robust terms, the police were simply not able to attend to every location that needed law enforcement, therefore, it is fair to draw conclusions that the law enforcement was inefficient in dealing with the protest, arson, and looting.

The statistics of criminal events with no law enforcement visible in places such as “*Six trucks were burned, truck laden with logs was set alight, Roads in the Mooi River CBD were also blocked with burning tyres and debris*. Criminality can only thrive if there is no enforcement of the law.

The ideologies and discourses at play revelations

The ideologies revealed that online news in particular, perused or covered the looting events through a criminality discourse. Criminality is a broad concept, for the purpose of the argument we follow the logic and understanding of Jareborg (2000:4), who argues “Criminality is centered on elements such as disturbing someone's peace, law's peace, the behavior is antisocial in that it exhibits or does not care about the values of the society”. The coverage viewed the events as criminality and dangerous not only to fellow human beings but a threat to the economy and the law/state. “*In Alexandra, cops said they arrested 18 suspects, 16 of them for public violence*” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). Those that participated in these acts were breaking the law and law enforcement had a responsibility to act within the confines of the law.

“*Kganki Matabane, CEO of the Black Business Council, said the protests could not have come at a worse time for the weak SA economy*” (Sowetan 12 July 2021, See Appendix). The criminality discourse revealed that the struggling economy was badly affected by Covid-19 and that it was further dealt a hard blow by the looting and protest. Economic activities were severely disrupted as a result of the looting actions, which may have long term effects on the economy and many worry how the international community viewed South Africa as a potential investment destination.

Criminality also revealed that the police department lacks the capacity to deliver on the constitutional mandate that is to protect citizens of the country. The severe criminal elements around the country revealed that the department is inadequate, and the state needed to strategise means of assisting the department.

“*The army which is already in some parts of the affected areas has been deployed to "protect" police and form a shield while law enforcement agencies attempt to restore the rule of law in hotspots riddled by violent protests, looting, and lawlessness*” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The words such as “*shield, attempt, restore and lawless*” indicate criminality. The indication of the above is the need for law enforcement or actions to enforce the law.

The South African Defense Force was called upon to assist the police in an effort to restore peace and stability. For the citizens of South Africa, this is a revelation of the lack of capacity within the police department because by design the

defense force is responsible for external military aggression. *“As the police there is nothing, we can do in this kind of situation. Looting is sporadic and we cannot be everywhere”* (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). The revelations were evident within the responses of the law enforcement seniors and law enforcement strategies that were tried but due to the lack of recourses there was not much they could do. “Nothing we can do” indicate criminality going on unabated and police giving up.

The Neo-liberalism ideology revealed the impact of capitalist machinery/processes have a direct link to the class struggle in that the quoting and intensifying of businesses the colonial perspectives that continues to overpower the alternative voice/ the subaltern. *“Tiger Brands, which owns Albany bakeries, told Sowetan yesterday that its bakery operations and distribution have been interrupted in KwaZulu-Natal mainly due to the disruption of supply and closure of customer businesses”* (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). The above indicate a preference of prominent brands instead of the local shops. Therefore, this is an indication of amplifying those that are beneficiaries of the above ideology. The ideology further revealed that despite South African media operating in a democratic period, covering of the news perpetuate inequality and promote classism.

South African politicians were deeply polarised ideologically. In fact, the President was heavily criticised by the opposition and different parties. It was also revealed that the glorious movement that carries hope for a better life for many in South Africa is ideologically divided between capitalist and radical economic transformation lines. The political ideology indicated that democracy is in full swing in South Africa, the constitution provides processes to challenge authority, and political parties have embraced it. They are willing to challenge each other or another authority through democratic structures or means. *“The @EFFSouthAfrica had decided to challenge the @CyrilRamaphosa's decision of deploying @SANDF_ZA through its legal team. They want the president to clarify, on what basis did he decide on deploying troops. They say soldiers cannot be deployed at home while there is no war”* (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix A). This also indicated that despite the polarisation, political parties believe and embrace democratic and constitutional processes and are willing to follow them.

The possible racism discourse draws attention to the rainbow nation idea that was promoted at the end of the apartheid era in South Africans. Is racism still a factor in a democratic country such as South Africa, have we progressed to the desired place of seeing each other beyond racial lines? Are we perhaps experiencing different forms of racism as many layers go beyond black and white? *“This must be condemned by all South Africans at all costs as we are a nation committed to non-racialism and non-tribalism that is underpinned by the diversity and unity of all the people of South Africa, whatever their language, culture, religious beliefs and race”* (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix). The

constant usage of terms such as “*non-racialism and non-tribalism*” informed the idea of totally discrediting the possibility of racism.

“During the engagement, Kaunda said the leaders rejected the acts of violence and racism and pledged their commitment to work with all sectors to restore peace and stability in communities” (IOL, 14 July 2021, See Appendix). The selected abstract indicate that despite the democratic dispensation and the rainbow nation idea, the country still shows elements of racism and some appearing in different forms.

The racism discourses revealed that the majority of those who were previously disadvantaged of opportunities and resources are still without access, with the exception of those who are politically connected. Therefore, inequality that was perpetuated by apartheid and racism has not dissipated. Inequality contributed to the looting of businesses in that many participated in the theft because they had no choice but to use the looting opportunity to steal the most basic items. *“I took a two-plate stove because mine is broken. I heard most people were from Solezwe nearby, they took things, went to their homes, and came back for more”* (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

Following the lack of inequality not changing in South Africa, the discourses and ideologies reveal that media fails challenge the colonial systems that continue privilege those that have power and marginalising those that offer an alternative voice.

The Neo- Liberalism ideology revelations were worth noting considering the questions set out to uncover in the project. The ideology indicated practices within the media space that thrives on colonial practices such as suppressing alternative voices and the preference of elite driven content.

Data analysis and findings Conclusion

From the 40 chosen articles, the analysis found that the *Daily Sun* has a section called The People's Section and this segment gives a voice to how the public feel/felt about various issues such as looting and what possible solutions should be taken forward. This is done through a section where ordinary people write letters to the editor. These voices are further encouraged by choosing two voices daily and weekly that speak to the issues and compensating them with an amount of R200 each. The *Sowetan* provided a perspective from the ordinary people through interviews with three people and these perspectives were published in the midst of the looting. These efforts by the *Daily Sun* and *Sowetan* indicate that these two publications are lenient and show some interest to the alternative voices. The South African Constitution (1996:25) regulates that “Everyone is equal before the law and has the rights to equal protection and benefit of the law”. However, it is significant to note that the bulk of voices came from organisations and people that are considered important or the elite in the society and these included politicians mainly the African National Congress outlining plans to curb and condemn the violence. Various studies have found that SA media prefers the voices of the elite and suppresses the voices

of the subaltern. Example: In the coverage of the Marikana massacre journalist excluded the voices of the widows of the miners and focused on the elite or mainstream voices (Duncan 2016). This is a clear indication of a continuation elitist of media coverage. The above provided example attest to validity and reliability of the research.

The Democratic Alliance critiquing the president approach towards the looting and protest and calling for better law enforcement. The Economic Freedom Fighters challenging the president's decision to bring in the army. The Inkatha Freedom Party applauding the move to get the SANDF involved. The Business community voices provided statistics of losses and further called for peace and calm. Civil Society Groups added their views ranging to causes and what solutions are needed, law enforcement from national office, provincial in an effort to paint a picture of how the situation was shaping. Academics deliberated, analysed, and challenging the discourses and decisions, statements made by authority. The president and his departments calling for the end and putting measures in place to stop the looting and protest.

The findings chapter provides a discussion of the dominant ideologies such as Colonialism, authoritarian, racism and neo-liberalism ideology, the dominant discourses are as follows: Looting of businesses, calling for calm and condemning the looting, protest for Zuma, lack of law enforcement and criminality, job Loss and police overwhelmed. Following the objectives of the study, the most notable revelations from the ideologies are: visible colonial media practices, practices such ignoring the alternative voice/s and failure to challenge the colonial media practices in the space. The discourses reveled elements of targeting businesses for self-gain of the looters, attempts to call for calm and condemn the looting, support or protest for Zuma, inability or lack law enforcement and criminality, job losses and police overwhelmed or lack of resources.

Data analysis: Integrating findings with Theory

This chapter aims to integrate the research analysis and findings with the chosen theories and literature, interpret and explain the meaning of the analysis results. It will further discuss the significance and the implications of the findings. The chapter will be broken down to themes to ensure a cohesive flow.

Looting targeting businesses

In the above theme, what comes out is the idea that business and infrastructure are being destroyed and that businesses are losing a lot of money due to the looting. There is also a need and plea that the current situation should be stop and condemned. There is a realisation that this looting situation needs not only the police but various sectors of the community. The speakers in the theme is high ranking organisation representative that is speaking on behalf of the business federation that represent black business. Therefore, it is key to note that the federation holds an elite position within business and society. According to Govenden, (2002:106-107), "The power and privilege of the elite class is significantly visible in the sample of articles, coverage significantly favoured elite-driven topics, prominent voices, while the working and lower classes were neglected in the overall coverage". Business owners are represented and spoken for.

The article has prioritised those that hold power in our society, seemingly business that have been affected are those that are regarded as big establishments in society such as “*Nedbank and Boxer*”. It is key to note the type of businesses that are visible in the quote “*Nedbank*” very prominent, no sign of the regular business from those that are considered the “other”.

“Nedbank, in a statement to Sowetan yesterday, said it has decided to “temporarily close” 196 branches and 52 outlets at Boxer Supermarkets due to the escalation in violent protests” (City press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The hierarchy of views is visible in the following abstract in that businesses are represented by a body or an organisation “*The Black Business Federation (BBF)*” rather than speaking for themselves.

“The Black Business Federation (BBF) has reported that over 30 businesses alienated with it have been looted amid the unrest in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal, the federation has appealed to all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix). Therefore, this is a perspective of the organisation, rather than a view from the actual businesses.

The below are examples of the ordinary being spoken for by the business federation and clearly neglected, the quotes chooses terms such as “*We, Franchise Association*”.” indicate that is the voice or speaking for the business community that might possibly have no platform to raise their concerns. The article through the below cut out places the federation as the voice of authority of the business community.

“We also call on law enforcement agencies to urgently protect lives, property, and businesses which have become the main target of the ongoing violence. Whilst our Constitution guarantees the right of every South African to protest, we end the violence visited on ordinary people, property, trucks, and business premises completely indefensible” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Franchise Association joins calls for government to protect economy The association said it wanted to add its voice to calls by Business Unity South Africa and other business associations for the government to take action” (Sunday Times, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Another impact is the modern factory uses the complex global supply chain as a car is built from about 1800 parts made all round the world. The “just in time” methods to reduce costs for the factory crumble when the whole truck and sea” (City Press, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Freight system do not work. Even Transnet freight rail has instituted force majeure. With no trains or trucks working and the harbour at less than a quarter capacity in Durban, manufacturing around the PWV and Durban-Pinetown hubs will be severely impacted” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“About 6000 trucks pass through Tugela toll plaza in the middle of the N3 every day. A 50 000 liters fuel tanker carries R800 000 of fuel. A container truck with televisions in it can be loaded with close to R2 million in ½at screen TV’s” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“So with 8,7% of all shopping malls (200 out of 2300) destroyed or damaged the replacement value of those damaged or destroyed would be about R14bn” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Final goods Inventory for the non- financial private sector was valued as R634bn at the end of the first quarter of this year. Using the same 8, 7% the value of goods destroyed and or looted would be about R56bn. So, the value of goods looted is far higher than the buildings that housed them” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Confidence for business to invest in both new and “brown eld” projects. A business needs confidence to employ or hire people, the losses here should impact even current hires as many as business try to get back on their feet” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The losses will be well over R70bn to the economy by my estimate. Confidence and business survival will cost SA much more ” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The Small Business Institute (SBI) today strongly condemned the wanton looting of businesses, destruction of vital economic infrastructure, burning of trucks and blockading of roads primarily in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (IOL, 12 July 2021 See Appendix).

“Online delivery service, OneCart announced that it was closing early today for the safety of our Shoppers and Drivers. In a statement it said: “All orders not delivered today, will be rescheduled as soon as our staff are back at work, they said the business had also been affected by the events taking place” (Sunday Times, 12 July 2021, Appendix).

Moreover, the theme revealed through the following quotes that what is becoming in our society is the preference of voices that have authority. The following cut out is a statement from the Small business Institute (SBI) indicating views from that enjoy status and speak with authority within the business community. According to Duncan (2014:21) has noted the hierarchy of views”.

“We also call on law enforcement agencies to urgently protect lives, property, and businesses which have become the main target of the ongoing violence. Whilst our Constitution guarantees the right of every South African to protest, we end the violence visited on ordinary people, property, trucks, and business premises completely indefensible” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The business theme further speaks to the listening theme discussed in the literature review. The statement from the (SBI) is in English, a language usually associated to those that have education. The statement from (SBI) that reflects in the quote might not mean anything to the business owner that does not have the understanding and command of the “elite language”, therefore, an effort to represent business might fall short. This is precisely what Podkalicka, (2007:217) advocates for “diversity of languages, accents and musical styles rather than accommodating cosmopolitan taste cultures rather than minority language communities can be seen as institutional learning”. The availability of content in different languages is another way that marginalises voices.

“The Small Business Institute (SBI) today strongly condemned the wanton looting of businesses, destruction of vital economic infrastructure, burning of trucks and blockading of roads primarily in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The below quote paints the looting exercises or preferred a narrative that delegitimises or reduces the actions by using terms such “*destruction*”. This takes away from the legitimacy of once need to voice out their grievances. Alexander argues that “The fact that communities take to the streets in an attempt to make their voices heard, raises questions about their ability to speak out in other forums, or the failure of other mechanisms” (2010:30). However, the framing of the quote as destructions downplays the events by not revealing the true intentions of those that have taken the streets. Wasserman et al. informs that, “The media coverage of these actions becomes of great importance, as it has the potential to amplify the voices of those citizens who have been left on the margins of the public sphere or further silence them by portraying their protests as illegitimate or undemocratic” (2018:146).

“The Small Business Institute (SBI) today strongly condemned the wanton looting of businesses, destruction of vital economic infrastructure, burning of trucks and blockading of roads primarily in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021 See Appendix).

“Marc Anthony, the manager of the Avonmore Superspar in Berea, thanks customers for helping to protect the store from looters” (City Press, 13 July 202, See Appendix).

The above business theme is promoting the view that the July events were violent, destructing, and criminal and ignore various issues linked to the events. Based on Dube and Mawokomayi (2018:40) “Through framing, media effectively

decide what knowledge or information will be deemed appropriate for publication and what knowledge will be suppressed in order to drive a certain idea”.

The below extract recognises and calls upon different sections of society “to come together “all sections of society to unite”. The cut out recognises the importance of plurality of voices and that it strengthens democracy. “The idea radical democracy and argues that multiple voices and opposing views are significant in driving the principles of radical democracy which are equality and liberty” (Laclau and Mouffe 2014:17).

“The Black Business Federation (BBF) has reported that over 30 businesses alienated with it have been looted amid the unrest in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal, the federation has appealed to all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above extract challenges the norm that solutions or views that hold wait and of importance are those that hold higher positions.

“The Black Business Federation (BBF) has reported that over 30 businesses alienated with it have been looted amid the unrest in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal, the federation has appealed to all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The Small Business Institute (SBI) today strongly condemned the wanton looting of businesses, destruction of vital economic infrastructure, burning of trucks and blockading of roads primarily in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021 See Appendix).

“The Black Business Federation (BBF) has reported that over 30 businesses alienated with it have been looted amid the unrest in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal, the federation has appealed to all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

Involving all sectors of society is mighty important especially because media has been found wanting in representing or underrepresenting certain groups in society. Tuchman (2000:154) the above statement as symbolic annihilation “a process by which the mass media omit, trivialize, or condemn certain groups that are not socially valued, ostensibly, the contention is that, by rarely or never showing certain types of persons, the mass media, as cultural mechanisms, systematically dispense with imagery and messages associated with these types of persons and, in the process, send a symbolic message to viewers readers about the societal value of the persons comprising that group”. In a radically

democratically transformed society, the statement “*to all sections of society*” include various groups such as the elites the have and have not.

Looking at the below cut outs from the Political economy of the media theoretical perspective, we observe that the reporting has a connotation of classism in that the content purely focuses on big and registered businesses and there is no mention of the ordinary businesses in particular in the location. Christian and Sandoval (2015:167) informs us that “Political economic theory of the media and communication is an approach that allows us to study the production, circulation, and consumption of information in the context of capitalism, power structures, domination, and inequality”. The inequality element in the content visibility is staggering, and this could possible production driven by the need to sell and increase sales.

The Black Business Federation (BBF) has reported that over 30 businesses alienated with it have been looted amid the unrest in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal, the federation has appealed to all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The Small Business Institute (SBI) today strongly condemned the wanton looting of businesses, destruction of vital economic infrastructure, burning of trucks and blockading of roads primarily in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021 See Appendix).

“The Black Business Federation (BBF) has reported that over 30 businesses alienated with it have been looted amid the unrest in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal, the federation has appealed to all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The chapter presents a summary of the above and provide a literature and theoretical analysis of the findings, the segment probes the above themes using both the literature and theoretical perspectives. The analysis looks at issues such as who were the speakers, hierarchy of voices that were and the implications of such. The literature of (2002:106-107) that greatly informed “The power and privilege of the elite class is significantly visible in the sample of articles, coverage significantly favoured elite-driven topics, prominent voices, while the working and lower classes were neglected in the overall coverage”. The chapter further uses scholars such as Duncan (2014:21) and Wasserman et al (2018:146).

The issue of all sectors of society participating in democratic affairs stipulated by the constitution and representation and underrepresentation featured in the section. Tuchman’s (2000) and symbolic teachings were central in understanding the mentioned dynamics.

The above leans on the understanding of Christian and Sandoval (2015:167) and looks at several cut outs from the perspective of the political economic theory of the media and understands media production inequality perpetuated by elements of capitalism.

Political Parties

The above voice is a “*Political Party*” from the African National Congress Spokesperson informing the public on government’s plans to deploy the South African Defense Force in hot spots. The article quotes a voice of a person that holds a high position in a political party. Govenden, (2002:106-107) observes that “The power and privilege of the elite class is significantly visible in the sample of articles, coverage significantly favoured elite-driven topics, prominent voices, while the working and lower classes were neglected in the overall coverage”. Govenden, (2002:106-107) observes that “The power and privilege of the elite class is significantly visible in the sample of articles, coverage significantly favoured elite-driven topics, prominent voices, while the working and lower classes were neglected in the overall coverage”.

“ANC spokesperson Pule Mabe told a news broadcaster that the affected provinces - Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal would see greater visibility of authorities on the ground after the president's speech but the government cannot create stability in communities without the assistance of those very communities, we have seen the looting of shops, destruction of properties. If left unattended, it would be very dire, especially for those who work in those shops and won't be able to provide for their families” (Sunday Times, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

. "The imprisonment of the former president has inflicted pain on many of us who value his contribution to the revolution, “Zikalala said.” Equally, we respect and acknowledge the right of all people to protest, but we cannot condone destructive and violent protests” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The ANC has vowed to act against some of its own members who are fueling violent protests that led to the major destruction of property in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

In a statement shared by Transport Minister Fikile Mbalula, the brothers said although they were in support of former president Jacob Zuma as a family relative, they did not wish to blur the lines” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“EFF demands Cyril Ramaphosa justify SANDF deployment to volatile problem” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The @EFFSouthAfrica had decided to challenge the @CyrilRamaphosa's decision of deploying @SANDF_ZA through its legal team. They want the president to clarify, on what basis did he decide to deploy troops. They say soldiers cannot be deployed at home while there is no war, (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“DA LEADER John Steenhuisen has criticised President Cyril Ramaphosa’s response to the violent looting and unrest in South Africa, saying his address to the nation “fell short” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Today, DA Leader @jsteenhuisen is in KwaZulu-Natal to visit the communities affected by the violence and chaos that has unfolded over the last few days. Law-abiding citizens deserve strong leadership that will take action and help restore law and order in communities. As we work to restore law and order in communities, we need to remain calm and measured in our efforts. We dare not legitimise unnecessary violence, even in the most extreme circumstances. We dare not lose our humanity. Today I’ve decided to visit KZN and be with communities” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above extract chooses a term such as “leader” and places in capital letters to indicate that this is a voice of someone with high status in the community. Such media content is detrimental to the democracy and strengthens the power the elite has in the society. “Allowing for a wide range of groups and interests to coalesce into networks and associations, and to provide a balance between contending power centers, interests, and opinions” Robinson and Friedman, (2007:644).

“DA Gauteng leader Solly Msimanga has called on the police to take action against anyone attempting to block roads and prevent businesses from operating” (Sowetan. 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The imprisonment of the former president has inflicted pain on many of us who value his contribution to the revolution, ”Zikalala said. “Equally, we respect and acknowledge the right of all people to protest, but we cannot condone destructive and violent protests” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, see Appendix).

“IFP President Velenkosini Hlabisa welcomed the deployment of the army saying police had been overpowered and over stretched” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, see Appendix).

“A Gauteng leader of the pro-Zuma radical economic transformation faction of the ANC, Sibusiso Hadebe, indicated that the group was behind the protest but refused to give details of the key people responsible for its planning “for security purposes” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

What is evident from the above quotes is that these are voices of the elite and the privileges in the society. These are leaders that have been given power and the extract above preferred them rather than the ordinary. Govenden infers that “There is clear dominance in South Africa’s newspapers of the elite class as a prominent voice eroding other important

voices”. The below clearly neglect what is usually referred to as alternative voices. Radebe and Chiumbu, (2022:100) agree with the argument that some voices are marginalised “The views of ordinary people captured in public hearings across the country are severely underrepresented”.

“The @EFFSouthAfrica had decided to challenge the @CyrilRamaphosa's decision of deploying @SANDF_ZA through its legal team. They want the president to clarify, on what basis did he decide to deploy troops. They say soldiers cannot be deployed at home while there is no war” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“DA LEADER John Steenhuisen has criticised President Cyril Ramaphosa’s response to the violent looting and unrest in South Africa, saying his address to the nation “fell short” (City Press, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above article cut outs are an example of the listening dynamics discussed in the dissertation literature review by organisations and those in high positions configuring what content makes it out there. According to Husband (1996; 2000) “The attention to listening shifts some of the focus and responsibility for change from marginalized voices and on to the conventions, institutions and privileges which shape who and what can be heard in the media”.

“DA Gauteng leader Solly Msimanga has called on the police to take action against anyone attempting to block roads and prevent businesses from operating” (Sowetan. 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above cut out points to the literature reviewed of how media representation of protest and the above cut out is a case in point of such. The needs of the collective are silent and not represented and the focal point becomes about police enforcing the law against the protestors. Mawokomayi and Dube (2018:38) have a similar understanding or definition of protest: “In democratic societies such as South Africa, protests play a crucial role in amplifying the voices of citizens as they seek to recover and protect their rights”. It is evident that the South African media has a tendency of ignoring the issues of those that have mobilised and rather shape the events as violent. In fact, what the above extract calls for is what has been characterised as police brutality Alexander (2010:31) discovers that “protests are mostly peaceful; they have on occasion turned violent and have increasingly been met with a heavy-handed state response”.

“ANC spokesperson Pule Mabe told a news broadcaster that the affected provinces - Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal would see greater visibility of authorities on the ground after the president's speech but the government cannot create stability in communities without the assistance of those very communities, we have seen the looting of shops, destruction of properties. If left unattended, it would be very dire, especially for those who work in those shops and won't be able to provide for their families” (IOL, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above cut through the usage of terms such as “dire” indicate the extreme high level of unemployment in the country and that if those that are employed lose their jobs the unemployment situation would lead to extreme poverty.

Terreblanche “high rising unemployment and the slow growing economy, inequalities around distribution of power, property opportunities and the environment that reinforces criminality, ill health and processes that continue to make the majority poor” (2002:31).

“The @EFFSouthAfrica had decided to challenge the @CyrilRamaphosa's decision of deploying @SANDF_ZA through its legal team. They want the president to clarify, on what basis did he decide to deploy troops. They say soldiers cannot be deployed at home while there is no war” (City Press, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“DA LEADER John Steenhuisen has criticised President Cyril Ramaphosa’s response to the violent looting and unrest in South Africa, saying his address to the nation “fell short” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above selection of quotes is at the essence of the radical democracy framework in those ideas and believes are challenged, decisions taken by the highest office in the land, or the president are probed by those that disagree. This is what (Laclau and Mouffe 2014:17). Are championing for “Welcomes the idea radical democracy and argues that multiple voices and opposing views are significant in driving the principles of radical democracy which are equality and liberty”. This is the contestation of ideas from different people in an effort to find solutions.

The @EFFSouthAfrica had decided to challenge the @CyrilRamaphosa's decision of deploying @SANDF_ZA through its legal team. They want the president to clarify, on what basis did he decide to deploy troops. They say soldiers cannot be deployed at home while there is no war” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“DA LEADER John Steenhuisen has criticised President Cyril Ramaphosa’s response to the violent looting and unrest in South Africa, saying his address to the nation “fell short” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The provided abstract provides an understanding of the symbolic annihilation school thoughts in that the content is representative of male politicians and no representation of different groups such as woman and other marginalised. According to Coleman and Yochim, (2008:3) “symbolic annihilation means that those racial groups who are not presented as fully developed in media, be it through absence, trivialization, or condemnation, may see their social status diminished”. The lack representation or content by the mentioned groups is accurately what the school of thoughts coactions about.

The chosen above quotes are all from national and prominent political parties and a clear neglect of the smaller politicians and parties. “Media in South Africa seems to be intentionally performing what is popularly known as bracketing out of progressive views as a function of the need by media organisations to maximise audiences and revenues by focusing on the most widely legitimated views” (Hadland’s 2007:60). Therefore, above is a clear focus on mainstream voices and based on Hallads perspective this could be a ploy by the media organization to increase profits.

The political section above delved into affairs of voices that have an advantage and those that form part of the alternative in media spaces. The views of scholars such Radebe and Chiumbu, (2022) as discussed in the literature review unpacked the above and provided much needed light. The radical democratic theory by Laclau and Mouffe, (2014:8) assisted in matters of deliberation for those that agree and disagree.

Civil Society Organisations

This section looks at the civil Society Organisations theme, this is made up of prominent groups are all adding their piece on the causes and how best to mitigate of the July 2021 events.

“A tweet from the Jacob Zuma Foundation on Tuesday afternoon says: “Peace and stability in South Africa are directly linked to the release of President Zuma with immediate effect” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above is a quote from the Jacob Zuma foundation indicating the direct coloration between the calm on the streets and the release. What is greatly evident from the provided is the highly known organisation that command an elite space in society preferred views from the many that had opinions on the July 2021 events. Radebe and Chiumbu (2022:101) argue that the “Media has the power to make certain groups of people in the country invisible through the definite lack of representation”. Following the above scholars thought process, one wonders what the civil organisations that do not command high status in society and their take on the direct coloration on the peace and the release of Zuma.

“Tshwane Santaco chairperson Abner Tsebe said the taxi industry should move “immediately” to support the work being done by the South African Police Service (SAPS) and some communities that are now protecting businesses against large-scale looting” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Chairperson of the Polokwane and Seshego Taxi Association Solly Ledwaba said: “We are not going to allow anyone to hold us at ransom by making our route and commuters ungovernable because our business will collapse. We have been patrolling all along, but now we have intensified our efforts” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The SA National Taxi Association in Tshwane says they are on hand to protect three malls in the area against looting. SANTACO @SA_Taxis·Follow Our Association in Tshwane has taken over the protection of 3 malls in Soshanguve and the momentum is gaining ground, Earlier, the South African National Taxi Council (Santaco) in Tshwane directed all taxi associations in the region to “go out in full force” to protect all shopping malls in the city against the widespread looting and vandalism that has left a trail of destruction” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021 See Appendix).

Provided above are the views from articles that speak to the civil society organisation theme outlining the sentiments from the bodies that lead the taxi industries in South Africa. The news article provided a national platform to corporations to indicate to all those linked to these bodies that this is the right way of acting towards the looting. Friedman, (2019:3) is of the view that “citizens of South Africa are able to think independently and intensely becoming less tolerant of authoritative/elites views”. The organisations extracted assumes that association to the national bodies suspends individual thinking. Based on Cole, (2023:701) inference “political listening’ outlines crucial criteria for the ‘particular kind of listening’ that might undo ‘oppression’ that happens partly through not hearing certain kinds of expressions from certain kinds of people”. The quote permeates elements of a view from the suburbs which could possibly be oxymoronic from the “minors”.

The section will look at the following quotes from a radical democratic and symbolic annihilation theory.

“In Limpopo, residents, business owners, and taxi associations forged an alliance to fight against any possible looting and vandalising of shopping centres. Residents of Seshego, Polokwane, in collaboration with local taxi associations and the Polokwane CBD Business Forum, launched patrol teams yesterday to prevent any prospect of unrest” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The radical democratic school of thoughts are premised on plurality rather than individualism, which is correctly what shines from the above cut out. Laclau and Mouffe point out emphatically the importance of many in an effort to find solutions. “Radical democracy is centered on multiple voices and opposing views are significant in driving the principles of radical democracy which are equality and liberty” (2014:17). The quote is expending the notion of several rather than exclusion of others and sincerely valued by the current school of thoughts.

The current theme grappled with hierarchy of voices however in a form of not only high-ranking individuals but prominent and organisations that enjoy high status in the community. These stated themes are excessively researched by Radebe and Chiumbu, (2022) hence the analysis lean towards their work for deeper incites. The above issues heavily related to the work of Mouffe (2002) radical democracy and greatly provided nuanced comprehension.

Lack of law enforcement and Criminality

This segment looks at a set of articles that are about law enforcement or lack of. The quotes are made up of various high ranking police speakers providing statistics and how they aim to bring law and order. The analysis looks at three key areas who is speaking, framing of the quotes and violent law enforcement towards protesters.

“We’re beginning to lose lives on a scale that we’d love (to have) avoided,” said Police Minister Bheki Cele told reporters in Alexandra on Tuesday afternoon. A total of 45 people have died due to the unrest in both Gauteng

and KwaZulu-Natal. Cele said that while some of the deceased had been shot, others were “dying in circumstances that we have not determined” (Sunday Times, 13 July 2021 See Appendix).

“Naicker said police had issued a warning against using social media to fan violence. KwaZulu-Natal Road Traffic Inspectorate spokesperson Zinhle Mngomezulu yesterday urged motorists using the N3 to be alert” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Provincial police Commissioner Lieutenant-General Thembisile Patekile says the province has outlined a safety plan to protect residents from any unrest that might arise. Picture: Leon Lestrade/African News Agency (ANA)” (IOL, 13 July 2021 See Appendix).

The quotes are dominated by seniority from the countries law enforcement voices such as “Provincial police Commissioner Lieutenant-General Thembisile Patekile, Minister Bheki Cele, KwaZulu-Natal Road Traffic Inspectorate spokesperson Zinhle Mngomezulu”. Carpenter discovers that “The South African media reproduce the same content that focus on the elite, and this deprives the nation of a diverse national discourse” (2010:1065). The above quotes do not provide a voice of law enforcement that are hands on in the streets.

“We’re beginning to lose lives on a scale that we’d love (to have) avoided,” said Police Minister Bheki Cele told reporters in Alexandra on Tuesday afternoon. A total of 45 people have died due to the unrest in both Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal. Cele said that while some of the deceased had been shot, others were “dying in circumstances that we have not determined” (Sowetan, 13 July 2021 See Appendix).

“Independent Police Investigative Directory (IPID) condemns violence, praises police” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The destruction of property is worth millions and crippling an economy already struggling from the pandemic. This is the view of labour unions” (Daily Sun, 11 July 2021, See Appendix).

“SA Transport and Allied Workers Union deputy general secretary Anele Kiet said: “That’s anarchy; the long and short of it. That’s anarchy and authorities must make it a point that those behind those protests have to be brought to book because we can’t have a lawless country (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Naicker said police had issued a warning against using social media to fan violence. KwaZulu-Natal Road Traffic Inspectorate spokesperson Zinhle Mngomezulu yesterday urged motorists using the N3 to be alert” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The SAPS in Gauteng and KZN, working closely with their respective local metro police departments, have heightened visibility and remain on high alert in response to incidents of opportunistic criminality and violent

protests in the two provinces over the weekend, said the police in a statement” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Johannesburg Metro Police Department spokesperson Xolani Fihla said several roads and streets in Jeppe, Benrose, Denver, Berea, Hillbrow, and the CBD were barricaded with tyres, rocks and debris” (Sowetan 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Welcoming the deployment of the SANDF, in support of the operations of the SAPS, NatJOINTS said a total of 166 people have been arrested in KwaZulu-Natal and 323 in Gauteng” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Police indicated that they need to be vigilant because we don't know how far this is going to go. “Mooi River central business district, about 1km from the Estcourt prison where Zuma is incarcerated, were blocked with burning tyres and debris yesterday” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, Appendix).

“The unlawful actions must be condemned and said some of the acts were “ethnic mobilisation” (City Press, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Ordinary citizens who have watched how ineffective our police have been to quell the looting have been forced to set up barricades in their neighborhoods to defend their properties and businesses from looters, many of whom are armed and driving around in bakkies and taxis scouting for new spots to attack” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“As I write this, a relative who lives in a suburb south of Durban has been on his Zello channel all morning listening to how citizens are setting up barricades to prevent mobs from invading the shopping centres on the Blue Hills and in the south that had not been looted” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Parliament has called for calm as violent protests over the incarceration of former president Jacob Zuma flared up in parts of KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (Sunday Times, 11 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Marc Anthony, the manager of the Avonmore Superspar in Berea, thanks customers for helping to protect the store from looters” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“SA Transport and Allied Workers Union deputy general secretary Anele Kiet said: “That’s anarchy; the long and short of it. That’s anarchy and authorities must make it a point that those behind those protests have to be brought to book because we can’t have a lawless country (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The analysis of the above, picks up on the framing of the quotes, these are examples of how media represents protest in South Africa. The extracts paint a picture of criminality. This is done through the carefully selected terms such “*heightened visibility and remain on high alert in response to incidents of opportunistic criminality*” to perpetuate a narrative that the events are nothing more than criminality. This silences the cause and the ideas of the collective that have mobilised and taken to the streets to make their voices heard. Wasserman *et al*, (2018:149) acknowledges that “the covering of protest in South Africa seems to have a pattern that focuses on the violent and disruptive aspects of the protest actions and describes protests using the script of crime news”. Therefore, the argument attest to the argument that the South African media has an obsession of framing protest violently.

The below quotes do not outline and provide context and detail the reasons why the protestors have taken to the streets. It completely delegitimises the actions by framing the actions as illegitimate. The reasons for the strikers have completely disappeared and over shadowed by the criminal and violent narrative. “Media fails to tell the audience much about why the people were protesting, what led to the violence, what alternatives people had tried, if any, and what alternatives existed for the protesters” (Radu et al, 2012:38).

“Welcoming the deployment of the SANDF, in support of the operations of the SAPS, NatJOINTS said a total of 166 people have been arrested in KwaZulu-Natal and 323 in Gauteng” (IOL, 12 July 202, See Appendix).

The above is an example of the preference of the state to deal with protest using brutal force. The force has been documented in South Africa in events such as Marikana massacre and the killing of Mthokozisi Ntumba⁶. According to Alexander, (2010:31) “Protests are mostly peaceful; they have on occasion turned violent and have increasingly been met with a heavy-handed state response”. The deployment of the SANDF and the high number of arrest attest to the violent desire to deal with protesters.

Lack of law enforcement provided an opportunity to chew over the vast data that pointed to the events as nothing but criminality and violent. The literature of Mawokomayi and Dube, (2018:38) presented key intuition in this regard.

President and government departments

The selection of extracts formed the president and government discourse, these quotes express the thought process coming out of government and communicated by different departments. These provide a great opportunity to analyse the voices and how they are framed.

⁶ Mthokozisi Ntumba was a 35-year-old innocent man who was shot while leaving the clinic by police during student fees protest in Braamfontein.

“Several members of the Ramaphosa's executive visited worst hit by violence and looting Gauteng including ANC National chairperson and Mineral Resources Minister Gwede Mantashe, his cabinet counterparts Ronald Lamola, Bheki Cele, Fikile Mbalula, Stelle Ndabeni – Abrahams, Khumbudzo Ntshahaveni, as well as Deputy state security Minister Zizi Kodwa” (Daily Sun, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

These voices represent the same government and therefore, using one or two would have been sufficient and make space for different views. Govenden, (2002:106-107) maintains that “The power and privilege of the elite class is significantly visible in the sample of articles, coverage significantly favoured elite-driven topics, prominent voices, while the working and lower classes were neglected in the overall coverage”. The above is an example of a preference of elite voices over ‘others.

“Defence and Military Veterans Minister Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula said on Tuesday that the president will only declare a state of emergency when the need arises, speaking during the Justice, Crime Prevention and Security (JCPS) cluster meeting, she said she strongly condemns the current looting and damage to infrastructure, however, it does not warrant a state of emergency” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The Deputy National Director of Public Prosecutions: Head of the National Prosecutions Service has advised Directors of Public Prosecutions in affected Divisions to prioritise these matters, and to refer the cases to prosecutors with the requisite experience, who must work with and guide police in their investigations. Should any special arrangements need to be made with regard to courts, this will be discussed with the relevant stakeholders” (Daily Sun, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“This is not who we are as a nation”: President Cyril Ramaphosa's full speech on looting, violence in Gauteng and KZN, our Constitution is the foundation of the rule of law in our country” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The unlawful actions must be condemned and said some of the acts were “ethnic mobilisation”. He said they were “endangering lives and damaging our efforts to rebuild the economy” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“As the commander-in-chief of the South African [National] Defence Force, I have today authorised the deployment of defence force personnel in support of the operations of the South African Police Service. The National Joint Operational and Intelligence Structure – known as NatJOINTS – has intensified deployments in all the affected areas in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng,” Ramaphosa said (Sowetan, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Parliament has called for calm as violent protests over the incarceration of former president Jacob Zuma flared up in parts of KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (Sunday times 11. July 2021, See Appendix).

“Mpumalanga MEC for agriculture, rural development, and land affairs, Mandla Msibi, led community members in standing guard and spending the night at the Emoyeni Mall at his Pienaar township outside White River, to protect it” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above is an example of news that are framed to stain a protest, this is done by using words such as “unlawful, violent, damage to infrastructure. South Africa is faced with various challenges and at times communities resort mobilizing and exercise their democratic right to protest, with the hope that the presents of media will provide a platform to be heard. Dube (2018:39) wonders “How effective is the mass media in representing the aims and concerns of the protesters?” and Alexander identifies that “Communities take to the streets in an attempt to make their voices heard, raises questions about their ability to speak out in other forums, or the failure of other mechanisms” (2010: 30). Such content that is framed as violent actions excludes those that do not have access to the public sphere.

The current theme enjoyed massive coverage from the selected articles and the implication of such is the repetition of the same elite driven content over and over. An understanding of this phenomenal drew from several scholars but mainly from the school of thoughts of Govenden, (2002) and Dube (2018).

Academics, Researchers, and Political Analysts

The theme extricated academics, researchers, and political analysts that added their voices on the looting activities.

“Constitutional law expert Professor Pierre de Vos says for a country to declare a state of emergency, there is an “exceptionally high threshold to meet, an armed insurrection, an attempted coup d’état, or some other catastrophic event that endangers the continued functioning of the democratic state might in some circumstances warrant such a declaration, but only if there are no other ways to deal effectively with the threat” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“On Twitter, another political analyst Daniel Silke said that whatever was contained in Ramaphosa's speech, “it's the inability of his depleted and disengaged security cluster to uphold their constitutional responsibilities and formulate a strategic response plan ” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Political analyst Ongama Mtimka said Ramaphosa was leading in uncertain times that demanded swift action” (City Press, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“There is no shortage of information to expose those responsibly, especially given government’s snooping powers, including on telephone and social media networks. Since there is no political will, what can civil society do? Pressure must be exerted on all elected officials to act urgently against the lack of proper parliamentary oversight. Public participation in community policing forums, political, non-racial neighborhoods and community networks – is a priority that can also build bridges, and promote healing, in areas such as Phoenix. There is no time to lose said De Haas is an Honorary research fellow at the University of KZN’s School of Law, and a member of the Navi Pillay Research Group focusing on justice and human rights” (IOL, 10 July 2021, See Appendix).

South Africa is stratified along many segments; however, the constitution regulate that everyone is equal before the law and that includes freedom of speech. According to the Constitution of South Africa, (1996) “All the citizens of the country are equal before the law and have the right to freedom of expression, which includes freedom of the press and media, freedom to receive or impart information or ideas”. However, the above silences alternative voices and intensify provide a platform for the known and well educated. Coleman and Yochim, (2008:3) reiterate that “symbolic annihilation means that those racial groups who are not presented as fully developed in media, be it through absence, trivialization, or condemnation, may see their social status diminished”. Symbolic annihilation of race extends further than good or bad representation, in fact, it is when blackness is expected to mimic or assimilate whiteness in order to be viewed in a progressive light”.

South Africa has over 52 million citizens and the looting events were deliberated on various platforms and corners of the country and beyond, however, the above quotes show a preference ideas of those who are of the upper class in terms of education. This reporting perpetuate in equality in society. According to Christian and Sandoval (2015:167) “Political economic theory of the media and communication is an approach that allows us to study the production, circulation, and consumption of information in the context of capitalism, power structures, domination, and inequality”. The selection of views of those that hold elite position and the neglect of the alternative from the political economic theory of the media school of thoughts has similar elements of colonial systems that thrived on suppressing the alternative. The key issue that permeated from the coverage was the economic impact. “Class inequality has grown in South Africa, especially economic distributional systems (Duncan, 216:6).

The Academics, Researchers, and Political Analysts led us to a discussion to the dominance of the content provided by the elite and questioned the view that everyone is equal before the law. The section, therefore, made usage of the symbolic annihilation ideas championed by Coleman and Yochim, (2008).

The political economic theory of the media teased out issues of dominance of elite views that are at a results of capitalist practices and used the ideas of Christian and Sandoval (2015:167).

Community Members

The analysis of the community team revealed ordinary citizens through interviews condemning the July events and how their lives will affect their lives.

“What happened here was very terrible. People are going to lose jobs and we don’t have anywhere else to do our shopping. This is the closest mall to us” (Daily Sun, 10 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Its fun for them today, but tomorrow it will be sad. We don't have bread in the house as it is and there is nowhere we can buy anything – the tuck shops are closed. The malls are closed” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, Appendix).

The above reveals voices and an opportunity provided to those that are usually ignored and placed on the margins to add take on issues affecting their communities. This is refreshing from the articles that usually prefer the same rhetoric of the elite. This is what Laclau and Mouffe (2014:17) are calling for “multiple voices and opposing views are significant in driving the principles of radical democracy which are equality and liberty”. Allowing for plurality is key in democracy in that the discussion is afforded different views not only those from the suburb.

Above is a discussion of the unrepresented, underrepresented or omitted members afforded an opportunity to contribute to the national discourse? The above issues are also captured in the symbolic annihilation (Gerbner (1972).

Job Loss

One of the themes discussed in the literature review is the crises aced by South Africans is the issue of unemployment. The below speaks to community members that fully understand the reality of unemployment in the country, losing a job would be detrimental to one because that would mean the beginning of poverty. Terreblanche (2002:31) acknowledges the poverty crises facing the country and feels that:

“Poverty persist in post democratic South Africa particularly because of the traps set by the previous system and they are in the form and shape of high rising unemployment and the slow growing economy, inequalities around distribution of power, property opportunities and the environment that reinforces criminality, ill health and processes that continue to make the majority poor”.

“What happened here was very terrible. People are going to lose jobs and we don’t have anywhere else to do our shopping. This is the closest mall to us” (Daily Sun, 10 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Back to the drawing table to find ways to recoup the business,” said Thabiso Nana Sello (32), a worker at a local bakery in Vosloorus, said she received a call from her boss dismiss her from work. “Everything in the bakery was looted. I solely relied on this job to put food on the table. My mum is not working, and I have a toddler. “I don’t blame my boss. She has been very good to us. She is also stressed as the bakery was established not long ago and is unable to recover. Our very own black communities have robbed us of jobs and sources of income,” said Nana” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Its fun for them today, but tomorrow it will be sad. We don't have bread in the house as it is and there is nowhere, we can buy anything – the tuck shops are closed. The malls are closed” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, Appendix).

“Back to the drawing table to find ways to recoup the business,” said Thabiso Nana Sello (32), a worker at a local bakery in Vosloorus, said she received a call from her boss dismissing her from work, “Everything in the bakery was looted. I solely relied on this job to put food on the table. My mum is not working, and I have a toddler. I don’t blame my boss. She has been very good to us. She is also stressed as the bakery was established not long ago and is unable to recover. Our very own black communities have robbed us of jobs and sources of income,” said Nana” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

The scrutiny in this above portion addressed the thorny job loss that is linked to unemployment and poverty. Terreblanche (2014:13) triple crises (Unemployment, poverty, and Inequality) contributed immensely on this discussion.

Calling for call and condemning the looting

The theme looks into the following pull outs, and these spoke to the condemning of the looting. The theme looks into the voices that were afforded coverage to speak and condemn the events. Secondly the implications of the voices that came from the articles.

“The federation has appealed to all sections of society to unite and reinstate peace and order, which will restore economic activity and social stability in communities” (IOL, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

“The Small Business Institute (SBI) today strongly condemned the wanton looting of businesses, destruction of vital economic infrastructure, burning of trucks and blockading of roads primarily in KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng” (Daily Sun, 12 July 2021 See Appendix).

“Independent Police Investigative Directory (IPID) condemns violence, praises police” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

“Defence and Military Veterans Minister Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula said on Tuesday that the president will only declare a state of emergency when the need arises, speaking during the Justice, Crime Prevention and Security (JCPS) cluster meeting, she said she strongly condemns the current looting and damage to infrastructure, however, it does not warrant a state of emergency” (Sowetan, 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“This must be condemned by all South Africans at all costs as we are a nation committed to non-racialism and non-tribalism that is underpinned by the diversity and unity of all the people of South Africa, whatever their language, culture, religious beliefs and race” (Sowetan, 12 July 2021, See Appendix).

The South African Chamber of Commerce and Industry (SACCI) condemned the looting of businesses, damage to property and intimidation and victimisation of people” (Sowetan 14 July 2021, See Appendix).

“We call on all our members, other workers, and all South Africans, in general, to condemn these criminals’ conduct and to distance themselves from it” (IOL, 13 July 2021, See Appendix).

The above quotes reveal elements of discontent towards the looting and protest and vehemently express their dissatisfaction and that it should not continue. What is even more interesting is the common denominator in terms of who has been given a voice to speak. This is a clear selection of speakers that hold a higher position in society. The following are some of the examples: *Defence and Military Veterans Minister Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula*, “Independent Police Investigative Directory (IPID). The literature review indicated that media content in South Africa is classed, and the above quotes attest to that idea. The content in this case prioritises elite individuals and prominent organisation over the ordinary. Friedman observes that “In most cases the question of the poor is to enforce a public interest defence is ignored, confirming that whether poor citizens a right to information is of no interest to the press” (2011:114). Therefore, be it elite individuals and or organisations coverage prefers their view.

The condemning of the events was very dominant, and this allowed the dissertation to look deeper and probe the voices that were afforded a voice and the implication of the chosen voices. Friedman (2014) issues on elite voices were paramount in the interpretation.

Chapter Six: Conclusion and Recommendations

The intent behind this dissertation is to provide an analysis of the media's reporting on the failed insurrection, looting and arson in July 2021 in South Africa. It aimed to examine the above through two questions titled: What did the dominant voices in the media coverage of the failed insurrection of July 2021 reveal about the ideologies at play? And the following serves as a sub-question: What discourse and ideologies were revealed regarding the way the failed insurrection, looting, and arson that took place in July 2021 were covered?

The analysis and findings identified the following voices: President and government departments, academics, researchers and political analysts; unions and their leaders; community members; taxi bodies; community movements; and community members. The data suggested that the covering was centered on the following dominant discourses: looting targeting businesses, calling for calm and condemning the looting, no to looting lack of law enforcement, police overwhelmed and protest/support for Zuma and job losses. The data also revealed different ideologies at play, and these are as follows: Colonialism, authoritarian, racism and neo-liberalism ideology.

The voices found in the forty (40) articles revealed that majority were from high ranking people, organisations and businesses.

The discourses revealed elements of targeting businesses for self-gain of the looters, attempts to call for calm and condemn the looting, support or protest for Zuma, inability or lack law enforcement and criminality, job losses and even though police were doing their best but they were overwhelmed and lack the numbers and resources.

A closer look at the media content that emerged from the findings indicated that those that enjoy elite status in the community were amplified and dominated the ordinary. The dominance of voices that appeared in the themes was in the form of those that enjoy seniority and superiority within the society. Covering of news of this elite nature supported Govenden's literature (2002:106-107) "The power and privilege of the elite class is significantly visible in the sample of articles, coverage significantly favoured elite-driven topics, prominent voices, while the working and lower classes were neglected in the overall coverage". Therefore, the content from the articles that is made up the businesses, organisations and people, indicated components of news coverage that are driven by classism.

Matters of voice/s in the media are paramount, the politician's voices indicated and discussed issues that are heavily related to voice that have an advantage and those that are left in the margins. The protest, looting protest, and arson was affecting all South Africans in different ways and these actions provided an opportunity to deliberate on finding solutions,

but the media chose to cover those of politicians in the mainstream. The literature of Radebe and Chiumbu, (2022:101) confirmed that “Media has the power to make certain groups of people in the country invisible through the definite lack of representation”. The politicians that might be considered as “other” voices were missing or not visible in this regard. Following the school of thoughts of Duncan, (2014:21) the dynamics above are an indication that “What is immerging in the public domain is a hierarchy of views”. It was visible that a vast number of voices that dominated the content were of the mainstream politicians and the implication of such is that the ordinary viewers are relegated and not afforded a voice. Robinson and Friedman, (2007:644) hold the view that “Allowing for a wide range of groups and interests to coalesce into networks and associations, and to provide a balance between contending power centers, interests, and opinions”. The theme illustrated that the theme lacked the view of politicians closer to the ground and prioritised mainstream politicians and that meant that the voices that were heard lacked a balance.

Govenden confirms that “There is clear dominance in South Africa’s newspapers of the elite class as a prominent voice eroding other important voices” (2002:108). The civil society organisation’s theme lacked representation of the civil organisations that are not known, the organisations that were quoted and amplified through coverage are the same that are often given a platform. This partiality paints South African citizens as unable to think and contribute to national discourses. “Citizens of South Africa are able to think independently and intensely becoming less tolerant of authoritative/elites views” (Friedman 2019:3).

The democratic constitution of South Africa regulates equality of citizens as follows “Everyone is equal before the law and has the rights to equal protection and benefit of the law”, “Everyone has the right to freedom of expression, which includes: (a) freedom of the press and other media; (b) freedom to receive or impart information or ideas; (c) freedom of artistic creativity; and (d) academic freedom and freedom of scientific research” (The South African Constitution 1996:25). The scrutiny of the president and government voices uncovered multiple articles of repetitive content. This indicated the obsession media has with mainstream voices. Dube, (2018:39) wonders “How effective is the mass media in representing the aims and concerns of the protesters”? Carpenter outlines that “The South African media reproduce the same content that focuses on the elite, and this deprives the nation of a diverse national discourse” (2010:1065). This view is further supported by Friedman, (2011:107), who writes “Mainstream press which also exerts crucial pressure on how other news outlets report news is neither the eyes and ears of society nor the watchdog, it performs both functions not for all society but for the suburban class”. The vast amount of cover and content from politicians meant that South Africans were listening and consuming the same content over and over again. The content that is consumed over and over again was probed from the perspective of political economic theory and it was discovered media coverage that perpetuate dominance and inequality. Christian and Sandoval (2015:167) “Political economic theory of the media and communication is an approach that allows us to study the production, circulation, and consumption of information in the

context of capitalism, power structures, domination, and inequality”. The media production that favours the elitist views in society through the political economic theory of the media revealed economic elements such as the need to increase profit margins. Hadland’s (2007:60) views will underpin the argument that “media in South Africa seems to be intentionally performing what is popularly known as bracketing out of progressive views as a function of the need by media organisations to maximise audiences and revenues by focusing on the most widely legitimated views”. The findings indicated that the articles that reported on businesses favoured or preferred the most elite and popular businesses and neglected the local stores. Issues of advertising could possibly be a reason for such media covering as argued by Beattie (2020:4) “For advertising to affect newspaper coverage, there must be a credible offer to increase advertising in response to favourable coverage or a credible threat to decrease advertising in response to unfavourable coverage”.

The results showed that the implication of platforming the same content and hearing the same rhetoric that is from and favours elite voices has dire effects in that this molds the subjects that are consumed and spoken about by those in the backgrounds. Bickford, (1996:60), cautions us that “we must be aware and realise that how we listen shapes how others can speak and be heard, furthermore this could influence representation in the political realm”. An important component in the probe of the president and government theme was that it went beyond the dynamics of representation and underrepresentation to a deeper understanding of organisations that are powered to control the content that is eventually delivered to the consumers. “The attention to listening shifts some of the focus and responsibility for change from marginalized voices and on to the conventions, institutions, and privileges which shape who and what can be heard in the media” (Husband 1996:2000). The above case indicates that issues in media go beyond marginalisation and that it could be entangled in organisational bureaucracy and financial muscle. This is supported by Chiumbu and Radebe, (2022:90), who advises that “The issues of global capitalism, epistemic dominance, racism and other related matters as manifested in the political economy of media operations”. The above view provides key insight into the fondness of the elite and repetition of the content that favours the elite in that the content could perhaps be economically dictated rather than a mere preference.

The evidence from the Academics, Researchers, and Political Analysts theme showed much more aristocracy and therefore supplied a crucial opportunity to unpack the articles that accommodate the elite even though South Africa has officially ended the apartheid era and its laws and vowed to promote equality through democratic principles. Radebe and Chiumbu, (2022:89) are convinced that “The ethos of this media remains rooted in apartheid-like economic and ideological rationalities”. As a consequence, to change the apartheid ethos that was tangled in the exclusion of the majority in the key spheres such as media spaces, the democratic government legislated in an effort to transform. Chiumbu and Radebe address the need for South Africa to legislate “Government introduced key policy intervention in addressing the economic disparities of the past was the introduction of Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) instituted

to broaden participation in the economy, especially by those perceived to have been previously excluded or denied access” (2020:3). Nonetheless the findings reveal that the content is still not for the people by the people and speaking to the constitutional fairness of democracy. According to Govenden and Chiumbu, (2020:4) “all B-BBEE has achieved is the cosmetic and minimal co-optation of a new black elite into business, without fundamentally changing the racialised accumulation regime, in which the media is entangled and without introducing genuine media diversity”. The available and analysed content indicated that despite the end of the apartheid era and the introduction of legislation aimed at the inclusion of all, many are still left in the margins.

The Academics, Researchers, and Political Analysts theme indicated the possibility of a lack of information to prosecute those that were responsible for perpetuating the protest, looting, and arson on the ground and on social media. Tumber, (2001:100) posits that “Media as a fourth estate arm of government performing the duty of society's watchdog and ensuring accountability to the people and also at the same time ensuring the participation of the governed in the process of governance”. For example, the media provided expeditious investigative journalism in the exposure of the Gupta Leaks saga. Following Tumber's logic media through investigative journalism has/had a constitutional responsibility to uncover and publish the needed information. Failure to uncover and publish the information points to the state on the news issues such as lack of knowledge and experience and even resources. Finlay, (2017:1) points to “the challenges in the newsroom that range from the loss of experience journalist, decline in the quality of work due to various changes such as the incorporation of technology”. Daniels, (2013:5) described "the newsroom of South Africa as a ship sailing into extreme headwinds of change".

Based on the evidence uncovered in the job loss category, the following were noted: there are deep inequalities in South Africa. Mashaba, (2015:1) informed that “when Nelson Mandela took became the president of South Africa many of us believed that struggle for personal and economical freedom was over instead or people still leave in abject poverty”. Therefore, the arson, looting, and issues such as not being able to work and provide an income mostly affected the black and poor people. Black communities that were affected by the looting in terms of temporally or permanently closing down their places of work feared losing their jobs because of the excessive number of people unemployed and most leaving in abject poverty. Terreblanche is of the view that poverty in South Africa is as follows “the lack of employment is a major cause for the poverty of about 60% of the black population” (2014:15). The numbers further support the unemployment and poverty challenge black communities are grappling with. “The unemployment rate among the black African (36,5%) population group remains higher than the national average and other population groups White 8.8%, Indian/Asian 11.8%, Coloured 25.7%” (Statistics SA, 2020). The data revealed that most black communities that looted were driven by the state of poverty that they seem not to be able to escape, and this would support:

Terreblanche, (2002:31) argues that “Poverty persists in post-democratic South Africa, particularly because of the traps set by the previous system and they are in the form and shape of high rising unemployment and the slow-growing economy, inequalities around the distribution of power, property opportunities and the environment that reinforces criminality, ill health, and processes that continue to make the majority poor”.

This section indicates that evidence uncovered through the job loss theme such as a major link or existence between inequality, unemployment, and poverty, especially in the black communities in support of Terreblanche's triple crises (inequality, unemployment, and poverty).

The evidence gathered in the Unions and their leader's segment indicated content that is supportive of those in authority. “The alignment of journalism with elite interests may be inherent in the routines that privilege authoritative sources in positions of power or come about as a result of connections between owners and managers of news organisations and other social, economic, or political elites” (Wasserman, 2013:69). The analysis further pointed to almost all the articles preferring mainstream voices and this point to the professional expectations of journalism. “The notion of 'professionalism' that underpins these routines, Individual journalists also work according to deeply ingrained professional routines that shape their coverage” (Wasserman 2013:70). The evidence found that providing a platform to the elite is more of a professional routine.

The results found evidence that the articles framed the events as violent protests. South Africa is faced with major challenges mostly facing those that are not in the mainstream and usually lack a platform. The nature of South African protest usually includes singing, carrying sticks and boards, and pamphlets with messages of grievance. Mawokomayi and Dube, (2018:38) are of the view that “In democratic societies such as South Africa, protests play a crucial role in amplifying the voices of citizens as they seek to recover and protect their rights”. The need for communities to resort to protest is attributed to the silencing of the ordinary by the preference of the elite. Alexander justifies that “The fact that communities take to the streets in an attempt to make their voices heard, raises questions about their ability to speak out in other forums, or the failure of other mechanisms” (2010:30). The preferred framing from the media revealed these events as violent and the grievances from those that took to the street took a back seat.

Mawokomayi assures that “The media coverage of these actions becomes of great importance, as it has the potential to amplify the voices of those citizens who have been left on the margins of the public sphere or further silence them by portraying their protests as illegitimate or undemocratic” (2018:146). This is why Dube (2018:39), “How effective is the mass media in representing the aims and concerns of the protesters?” The articles fail to provide adequate details of the events that led to what it deemed violent and how the violence occurred. Galtung (2000:15), restates that "Media has a

responsibility to include all the phases of the protest before, during and after violence as well as offering context as well as noting potential alternatives to resolve the conflict”.

The criminality frame was also found in the chosen articles in fact if one was not from South Africa with no knowledge of the merits of the events, they would be forgiven for thinking that this was nothing but criminality. For example, an article read as follows: “*This is not a protest for Zuma but pure criminality*”. Based on Dube and Mawokomayi, (2018:40), “Through framing, media effectively decide what knowledge or information will be deemed appropriate for publication and what knowledge will be suppressed in order to drive a certain idea”. The articles found highlighted the number of people that were arrested and the shortage of police, clearly indicating that view that what we were witnessing was criminality. Wasserman et al, (2018:149) support the above “the covering of protest in South Africa seems to have a pattern that focuses on the violent and disruptive aspects of the protest actions and describes protests using the script of crime news”. The model that painted the actions as nothing, but criminality was highly visible.

The revelations from the ideology indicated that the political environment of South Africa is highly and ideologically divided, with that being said it showed elements of a radically democratic society as thought by Mouffe. The various debates from political opponents even included the usage of democratic platforms to deliberate on matters of disagreement. Carpentier, (2003:6) borrows from Mouffe and states that an “agonistic democratic model that focused on the transformation of political enemies into adversaries within a necessarily conflictual democratic framework”. Even though politically divided the element of dialogue to find amicable solutions is still visible.

The evidence found in the dominant discourses provided an extremely polarising belief system, one camp was extremely adamant that the action on the street was a protest in support or a call for the release of Zuma, and the other argued that the unrest had nothing to do with Zuma but pure criminality. The above contradictory discourses provided an opportunity for an agonist space. “Pluralistic openness that must exist not because it allows for a possible consensus, but because the opponent is not considered an enemy to be destroyed but an adversary whose existence is perceived as legitimate” (Mouffe 1998:15).

A few or very limited number of publications showed that they cater for ordinary people and consider their voices by providing sections where they can add to the national discourse and secondly not only interview the known but ordinary people in the streets. In addition, the revelation indicated that these publications encourage participation by selecting the best participants according to publication-set criteria for the week and month. This type of journalism can be viewed from several views such as providing a platform for those in the margins. “The idea of radical democracy that promotes multiple voices and welcomes opposing views and sees them as significant in driving the principles of radical democracy which are equality and liberty” (Laclau and Mouffe 2014:17).

As indicated above that there was a small number of articles or content that was located that was representative of those people outside of the mainstream. This is evidence of critical issues of the ordinary being underrepresented and the groups being marginalised, this is better articulated as symbolic annihilation. Tuchman, (2000:154) states that: “a process by which the mass media omit, trivialize, or condemn certain groups that are not socially valued, ostensibly, the contention is that, by rarely or never showing certain types of persons, the mass media, as cultural mechanisms, systematically dispense with imagery and messages associated with these types of persons and, in the process, send a symbolic message to viewers readers about the societal value of the persons comprising that group”.

The current argument emphasises that the evidence found elements of the argument that the ordinary is being heavily unrepresented and underrepresented.

The research rest with the following remarks having used the findings in conjunction with the literature and theoretical underpinnings.

Several researchers have focused on and found excluded voices rather than the underrepresentation groups, which is captured by the symbolic annihilation ideology. The analysis observed that the issues of elite preference manifest in different spaces as indicated by the various themes, and media in South Africa has a routine that is to purposefully find the privileged over the “other”.

The dissertation makes a contribution to the argument that content in South Africa is somewhat ideological elitist. Significant matters that are possible factors that surfaced in the research are various dynamics in the country and media spaces such as the ability of the current legislation to address some of the challenges contained in the symbolic annihilation perspective and those highlighted by the above scholars. The government nor the media has failed to successfully implement broad based black economic empowerment.

The results affirm existing research by Duncan, Wasserman, Radebe, Govenden, Chiumbu and Freidman et al that addresses significant issues of media voice/s, belonging, and hierarchy in South Africa, that the voices of the poor and black are marginalised and those of the powerful are given dominance.

The research adds to existing literature and provides insight into the above issues and understanding of media representation. Media scholars are of the view that they engage with text knowing which voices are prioritised and, therefore, I recommend that future research focuses on data that balance between community and national media.

Black Economic Empowerment is a policy of the South African government which aims to facilitate broader participation in the economy by black people. A form of affirmative action, it is intended specially to redress the inequalities created by apartheid.

The Act provides a legislative framework for the promotion of BEE, empowering the Minister of Trade and Industry to issue Codes of Good Practice and publish Transformation Charters, and paving the way for the establishment of the B-BBEE Advisory Council. The fundamental objective of the BEE Act is to advance economic transformation and enhance the economic participation of black people in the South African economy.

This dissertation revealed that the discourses and ideologies in the media are dominated by the views of the elite and the ordinary are barely given a voice. The research has also discovered that content in the South African media is dominated by the elitist ideology.

Bibliography

- Alexander, P. (2010). Rebellion of the poor: South Africa's service delivery protests – a preliminary analyses. *Review of African Political Economy*, 37(123): 25–40.
- Ansell, A. E. (2004). Two nations of discourse: mapping racial ideologies in post-apartheid South Africa. *Politikon*, 31(1): 3-26.
- Atkinson, A. B., & Bourguignon, F., (2001). Poverty and inclusion from a world perspective. Paper presented at the Annual World Bank Conference on Development Economics, Paris, June.
- Barnes, B. D. (2012). Confronting the one-man wolf pack: Adapting law enforcement and prosecution responses to the threat of lone wolf terrorism. *BUL Rev.*, 92, 1613.
- Berg, B. L. (2001). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences* (4th ed.). Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Berrios, R. & Lucca, N., (2006). Qualitative methodology in counseling research: Recent contributions and challenges for a new century. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 84(2): 174-186.
- Bickford, S. (1996). *The dissonance of democracy: Listening, conflict, and citizenship*. Cornell University Press.
- Brown, G., (1995). *Speakers, listeners, and communication: Explorations in discourse analysis*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brynard, P. A., (2011). Implementation of unemployment policies in South Africa. *School of Public Administration and Management*, 4(2): 67-78.
- Carpenter. 2010. A study of content diversity in online citizen journalism and online newspaper articles. *New Media & Society*, 12(7): 1064-1084
- Carpentier, N., & Cammaerts, B. (2006). Hegemony, democracy, agonism and journalism: An interview with Chantal Mouffe. *Journalism studies*, 7(6), 964-975.
- Chiumbu, S. (2016). Media, race and capital: A decolonial analysis of representation of miners' strikes in South Africa. *African Studies*, 75(3), 417-435.

- Chiumbu, S. H., and M. Radebe. 2020. "Towards a Decolonial Critical Political Economy of the Media: Some Initial Thoughts." *Communication* 46 (1): 1–20.
- Christian F and Sandoval M. et al. 2015. The Political Economy of Capitalist and Alternative Social Media. In *The Routledge Companion to Alternative and Community Media*, Ed. P 165-175. London: Routledge.
- Christián, L. (2015). Law enforcement. In L. Csink, B. Schanda, A. zs. varga, & A. Patyi (Eds.). *The basic law of Hungary: A first commentary* (pp 277–287). Dublin: Clarus Press.
- Cole, A. (2023). Ask a Political Scientist: A Conversation with Katherine J. Cramer about Listening as a Way of Democratic and Scholarly Life. *Polity*, 55 (2), 000-000.
- Coleman, R. R., & Yochim, E. A. C. (2008). The symbolic annihilation of race: A review of the "blackness" literature.
- Collet, T., (2004). What's a term? An attempt to define the term within the theoretical framework of text linguistics. *Linguistica Antverpiensia, New Series–Themes in Translation Studies*, 3.
- Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. (1996) Available at: <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b5de4.html> [accessed 11 November 2022]
- Cooper, R. (2018). *What is Civil Society? How is the term used and what is seen to be its role and value (internationally) in 2018?* K4D Helpdesk Report. Brighton, UK: Institute of Development Studies.
- Daniels, G. (2012). *Fight for democracy: The ANC and the media in South Africa*. NYU Press.
- Daniels, G. (2020). *Power and loss in South African journalism: News in the age of social media*. Wits University Press.
- de Beer, J., Degendorfer, K., Ellis, M., & Gaffen, A. (2017). Integrating gender perspectives into African innovation research. *Open AIR Briefing Note*.
- Dobakhti, L. (2016). A genre analysis of discussion sections of qualitative research articles in applied linguistics. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 6(7), 1383.
- Dreher, T. (2009). Listening across difference: Media and multiculturalism beyond the politics of voice. *Continuum*, 23 (4), 445-458.
- Dreher, T. (2012). A partial promise of voice: Digital storytelling and the limits of listening. *Media International Australia*, 142 (1), 157-166.
- Dugmore, H., (2018). *Paying the piper: The sustainability of the news industry and journalism in South Africa in a time of digital transformation and political uncertainty*. University of the Sunshine Coast, Queensland.

- Duncan, J., (2014). South African journalism and the Marikana massacre: A case study of an editorial failure. *The Political Economy of Communication*, 1(2), 65-88.
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of communication*, 43 (4), 51-58.
- Finegan, E., (2014). *Language: Its structure and use*. Cengage Learning.
- Finlay, A., (2020). *State of the Newsroom 2020: Tipping Point*. Wits Journalism Project: Johannesburg.
- Foucault, M., (1977). History of systems of thought. *Philosophy and Social Criticism*, 8(3): 353-359.
- Frey, U. J., & Pirscher, F. (2019). Distinguishing protest responses in contingent valuation: A conceptualization of motivations and attitudes behind them. *PloS one*, 14(1), e0209872.
- Friedman, S. (2011). Whose freedom? South Africa's press, middle-class bias and the threat of control. *Ecquid Novi: African Journalism Studies*, 32(2): 106-121.
- Friedman, S., (2019). *Power in action: Democracy, citizenship and social justice*. Wits University Press: Johannesburg.
- Galtung, J., (2000). The task of peace journalism. *Ethical Perspectives*, 7 (2-3): 162-167.
- Gee J, P., (2011). *How to do Discourse Analysis. A Toolkit*. New York & London.
- Gerbner, G. (1972). Symbolic functions. *Television and social behavior: Media content and control*, 1, 28.
- Goddard, W., & Melville, S., (2004). *Research methodology: An introduction*. Juta and Company Ltd.
- Golding, P., & Murdock, G. (1997). *The political economy of the media*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Govenden, P. (2022). The Power of Neoliberalism: Transformation, Neo-Elitism and Class Continuities in the Post-Apartheid Media. *tripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique. Open Access Journal for a Global Sustainable Information Society*, 20 (1), 101-120.
- Govenden, P., & Chiumbu, S. (2020). Critiquing print media transformation and black empowerment in South Africa: A critical race theory approach. *Critical Arts*, 34(4): 32-46.
- Govender, P., Kambaran, N., Patchett, N., Ruddell, A., Torr, G., & Van Zyl, N. (2007). Poverty and inequality in South Africa and the world. *South African Actuarial Journal*, 7 (1): 117-160.
- Graber, S. M. (2019). A puzzling problem: Symbolic annihilation in The New York Times crossword puzzle. *Journalism Practice*, 13(3), 383-395.

- Hadland, A (2007) 'The South Africa Print Media, 1994-2004: an application and critique of comparative media systems theory.' Unpublished PhD thesis. Centre for Film and Media Studies. University of Cape Town.
- Hignett, S., & McDermott, H., (2015). Qualitative methodology. In: J.R. Wilson & S. Sharples (Eds.) *Evaluation of human work (4th Edition)*. CRC Press, Boca Raton, 119-138.
- Hook, D., (2007). Discourse, knowledge, materiality, history: Foucault and discourse analysis. *Foucault, psychology and the analytics of power*. Palgrave Macmillan, London, 100-137
- Humprecht, E., & Esser, F. (2018). Diversity in online news: On the importance of ownership types and media system types. *Journalism Studies*, 19(12): 1825-1847.
- Husband, C. (2000). *Media and the public sphere in multi-ethnic societies*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Husband, C. 1(996). The right to be understood: Conceiving the multi-ethnic public sphere. *Innovation: The European Journal of Social Sciences*, 9(2): 205–15.
- In South Africa. *World Development*, 130, 104938.
- Independent Online News. (2021). ConCort finds Jacob Zuma guilty of contempt of court, sentences him to 15 months in jail. Available at: <https://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/concourt-finds-jacob-zuma-guilty-of-contempt-of-court-sentences-him-to-15-months-in-jail-00d6d905-6f2e-46b7-b5ed-391ddee607fc>. [Accessed 18 May 2022]
- Jareborg, N. (2000). Crime Ideologies. *Scandinavian Studies in Law*, 40: 431-443.
- Kimbrough, A. M., (2002). *The sound of meaning: theories of voice in twentieth-century thought and performance*. LSU Doctoral Dissertations, 533. Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College.
- Kingdon, G., G., & Knight, J., (2004). Race and the incidence of unemployment in South Africa. *Review of development Economics*, 8(2): 198-222.
- Klein, H., & Shiffman, K. S. (2009). Underrepresentation and symbolic annihilation of socially disenfranchised groups ("out groups") in animated cartoons. *The Howard journal of communications*, 20(1), 55-72.
- Laclau, E. and Mouffe, C. (2001[1985]) *Hegemony and Socialist Strategy: Towards a Radical Democratic Politics*, 2nd edn. London: Verso
- Lipton, M. (1989). *Capitalism and apartheid: South Africa, 1910-1986*. New Africa Books.
- Louw, P. E. (2004). *The rise, fall, and legacy of apartheid*. Greenwood Publishing Group.

- Lummis, D.C. 1996. *Radical Democracy*. Ithaca & London: Cornell University Press.
- Mattoni, A, Berdnikovs, A, Ardizzoni, M & Cox, L (2010) *Voices of Dissent: Activists' Engagements in the Creation of Alternative, Autonomous, Radical and Independent Media*. *Interface: a journal for and about social movements*. Editorial Volume 2 (2): 1 – 22.
- Luyt, R. (2011). Representation of gender in South African television advertising: A content analysis. *Sex Roles*, 65, 356-370.
- Mansell, R. (2004). Political economy, power and new media. *New media & society*, 6(1), 96-105.
- Mawokomayi, B., & Dube, B. (2018). Muting the voices of the protesters: News24's framing of the 2015 Malamulele service delivery protest in South Africa. *Communicare: Journal for Communication Sciences in Southern Africa*, 37(1), 38-55.
- Mazón, M. (1984). *The zoot-suit riots: The psychology of symbolic annihilation*. University of Texas Press.
- McRoy, S., (1995). *Speakers, Listeners, and Communication: Explorations in Discourse Analysis*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge.
- Mogashoa, T., (2014). Understanding critical discourse analysis in qualitative research. *International Journal of Humanities Social Sciences and Education*, 1(7): 104-113.
- Motyl, A. J. (2016). Putin's Russia as a fascist political system. *Communist and Post-Communist Studies*, 49(1): 25-36.
- Mouffe, C. 1993. *The return of the political*. London: Verso.
- Mouffe, C. 1998. The radical centre: A politics without adversary. *Soundings*, 9, 11-23.
- Mouffe, C. 2000. Deliberative democracy or agonistic pluralism. *Reihe Politikwissenschaft /Institut für Höhere Studien*, Abt. Politikwissenschaft, 72, 1-17.
- Mouffe, C. 2005. *On the political*. New York: Routledge.
- Mouffe, C. 2007. Artistic activism and agonistic spaces. *Art & Research*, 1(2), 1-5.
- National Labour and Economic Development Institution. (1993). *About us*. Available at: <https://www.naledi.org.za/>. [Accessed 15 May 2022].
- News24, (2020). Police clash with Joburg residents, News24 reporter caught in crossfire. 27 March. Available at: <https://www.news24.com/news24/SouthAfrica/News/police-clash-with-joburg-residents-news24-reporter-caught-in-crossfire-20200327>. [Accessed 15 May 2022]

- Ngwane, T., (2021). Mall Attacks and the Everyday Crisis of the Working Class in South Africa. *Global Labour Journal*, 12(3): 312-324.
- Numsa. 2021. *History of Numsa*. Available at: <https://numsa.org.za/history/>. [Accessed 15 May 2022]
- Ohman, A., (2005). Qualitative methodology for rehabilitation research. *Journal of rehabilitation medicine*, 37(5): 273-280.
- Osanloo, A., & Grant, C., (2016). Understanding, selecting, and integrating a theoretical framework in dissertation research: Creating the blueprint for your “house”. *Administrative issues journal: connecting education, practice, and research*, 4(2): 12-26.
- Podkalicka, A. M. (2007). *Lost in translation? Language policy, media and community in the EU and Australia: some lessons from the SBS* (Doctoral dissertation, Queensland University of Technology).
- Purdy, M. (1997). What is listening? *Listening in everyday life: A personal and professional approach*, (2): 1-20.
- Radebe, M. J. (2017). *Corporate media and the nationalisation of the economy in South Africa: A critical Marxist political economy approach* (Doctoral dissertation, University of the Witwatersrand, Faculty of Humanities School of Social Sciences).
- Radebe, M. J., & Chiumbu, S. H. (2022). Frames and marginalisation of counter-hegemonic voices: Media representation of the land debate in South Africa. *African Journalism Studies*, 43(1), 89-106.
- Radu, W. S., Morwe, K. L., & Bird, W. R. (2012). Do the media in South Africa offer alternatives to violence in their coverage of protests? *Communicare: Journal for Communication Sciences in Southern Africa*, 31(sed-1): 37-56.
- Rao, S., & Wasserman, H. (2015). A media not for all: A comparative analysis of journalism, democracy and exclusion in Indian and South African media. *Journalism Studies*, 16(5), 651-662.
- Republic of South Africa. (1996). Bill of Rights Act No. 16 of 1997. *Government Gazette*. (No. 108).
- Robinson, M., & Friedman, S. (2007). Civil society, democratization, and foreign aid: Civic engagement and public policy in South Africa and Uganda. *Democratization*, 14(4): 643-668.
- Rodriguez, C. (2001). *Fissures in the Mediascape: An International Study of Citizens' Media*, Cresskill, New Jersey: Hampton Press.
- Santha, B., Saxena, V., Jain, M., Tiwari, V., Singh, A., & Tiwari, U. (2016). The critical incident technique in dental research: A review. *CHRISMED: Journal of Health and Research*, 3(1): 10.

- Satchwell, K., Bikitsha, N., & Mkhondo R., (2021). *The Independent Panel Report. Inquiry into Media Ethics and Credibility*. Commissioned by The South African National Editors' Forum (SANEF).
- Schlesinger, J. A. (1985). The new American political party. *American Political Science Review*, 79(4): 1152-1169.
- Sen, A. (2017). Democracy as a universal value. In *Applied ethics* (pp. 107-117). Routledge.
- Skinner, K., (2020). Taking Stock: how covid-19 shocked the media industry. In: A, Finlay. *State of the Newsroom*. Wits Journalism Project: Johannesburg, 23-36.
- Snyder, H., (2019). Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and guidelines. *Journal of business research*, 104: 333-339.
- Statistics South Africa, (2017). Poverty Trends in South Africa: An examination of Absolute poverty between 2006-2015. Available at: <https://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=10341>. Accessed 18 May 2022.
- Statistics South Africa, (2020). Jobs in the SA formal sector up in the 3rd quarter. Available at: <https://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=13890>. Accessed 17 May 2022.
- Statistics South Africa. (2017). Poverty Trends in South Africa: An examination of Absolute poverty between 2006-2015. Available at: <https://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=10341>. Accessed 18 May 2022.
- Statistics South Africa. (2021). Quarterly Labour Force Survey (QLFS)-Q3:2021. Available at: <https://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=14957>. Accessed 18 May 2022.
- Steyn, M. (2005). White talk": White South Africans and the management of diasporic whiteness. *Postcolonial whiteness: A critical reader on race and empire*, 119-135.
- Strand, C. (2018). Cross-media studies as a method to uncover patterns of silence and linguistic discrimination of sexual minorities in Ugandan print media. *Exploring Silence and Absence in Discourse: Empirical Approaches*, 125-157.
- Tatsvarei, S., Mwale-Manjoro, M., Mapiye, C., Marufu, M. C., Singh, J. A., Letty, B. A., & Aremu, A. (2021). Situational Analysis and Strategic Advisory on Farming and Food Security in South Africa in the Aftermath of Widespread Public Violence and Looting in Kwazulu-Natal and Gauteng Between 10-14 JULY 2021.
- Terreblanche, S. (2014). *Western Empires, Christianity and the Inequalities between the West and the Rest*. Penguin Random House South Africa.
- Terreblanche, S. (2018). A wealth tax for South Africa. *Wits University Southern Centre for Inequality Studies Working Paper*, 1.

- Terreblanche, S. J. (2002). *A History of Inequality in South Africa, 1652 to 2002*, University of Natal Press, Pietermaritzburg.
- The South African Reconciliation Barometer. (2016). *Briefing Paper 2: Perceptions of Economic Security and Well-Being*. The Institute for Justice and Reconciliation.
- Thompson, A. (2003). Listening and its asymmetries. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 33 (1), 79-100.
- Tomaselli, K. G., & Teer-Tomaselli, R. E. (2008). Exogenous and endogenous democracy: South African politics and media. *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, 13(2), 171-180.
- Tuchman, G. (2000). *The Symbolic Annihilation of Women by the Mass Media: Originally published as the introduction to Hearth and Home: Images of women in the mass media, 1978* (pp. 150-174). Palgrave Macmillan US.
- Tuchman, G. (2000). *The Symbolic Annihilation of Women by the Mass Media: Originally published as the introduction to Hearth and Home: Images of women in the mass media, 1978* (pp. 150-174). Palgrave Macmillan US.
- Tumber, H. (2001). Democracy in the information age: The role of the fourth estate in cyberspace. *Information, Communication & Society*, 4(1), 95-112.
- Van Dijk, T. A. (1995). Discourse semantics and ideology. *Discourse & society*, 6(2): 243-289.
- Van Oerle, B., (2020). Are we serious about ethics? In: A. Finlay. *State of the Newsroom*. Wits Journalism Project: Johannesburg, 54-61.
- Vick, J., (2015). Participatory versus radical democracy in the 21st century: Carole Pateman, Jacques Rancière, and Sheldon Wolin. *New political science*, 37(2): 204-223.
- Ward, L. M. (2016). Media and sexualization: State of empirical research, 1995–2015. *The Journal of Sex Research*, 53(4-5), 560-577.
- Wasko, J. (2014). The study of the political economy of the media in the twenty-first century. *International Journal of Media & Cultural Politics*, 10(3), 259-271.
- Wasserman, H. (2009). “Learning a New Language: Culture, Ideology and Economics in Afrikaans media after Apartheid.” *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 12 (1): 61–80.
- Wasserman, H. (2015). Marikana and the media: Acts of citizenship and a faith in democracy-to come. *Social Dynamics*, 41(2), 375-386.

Wasserman, H., Chuma, W., & Bosch, T. (2018) Print media coverage of service delivery protests in South Africa: A content analysis. *African Studies*, 77(1): 145-156, DOI: 10.1080/00020184.2018.1426312.

Wigston, D., (2007). A history of the South African media. *Media studies: Media history, media, and society*, 1: 3-58.

Zizzamia, R. (2020). Is employment a panacea for poverty? A mixed-methods investigation of employment decisions.

SIMPHIWE MASIZA

ORIGINALITY REPORT



SIMILARITY INDEX

PRIMARY SOURCES

- 1. [rdimages.iol.co.za](#)
Internet Source
- 2. [wiredspace.wits.ac.za](#)
Internet Source
- 3. [journalism.co.za](#)
Internet Source
- 4. [wap.iol.co.za](#)
Internet Source
- 5. [www.news24.com](#)
Internet Source
- 6. [www.tandfonline.com](#)
Internet Source