

https://dspace.org/

The impact of a subtractive bilingual context on the language attitudes, use and skills of primary school children from the Kathorus area : a comparative study.

Thombeni, Dunyisiwe Ntombenhle

1998

https://hdl.handle.net/10539/26843

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

THE IMPACT OF A SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUAL CONTEXT ON THE LANGUAGE ATTITUDES, USE AND SKILLS OF PRIMARY SCHOOL CHILDREN FROM THE KATHORUS AREA: A COMPARATIVE STUDY

BY DUNYISIWE NTOMBENHLE THOMBENI

A RESEARCH REPORT SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF ARTS, UNIVERSITY OF THE WITWATERSRAND, IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS.

APRIL 1998

SUPERVISOR: DR. SARAH SLABBERT

CO-SUPERVISOR: PROF. NHLANHLA MAAKE

ABSTRACT

Dissatisfaction with the quality of education under the former Department of Education Training (DET), lack of facilities, and disruptions during the political transitional period have been the reasons why more and more black parents, who could afford it financially, tend to send their children to so-called 'white' or ex-Model C schools. In ex-Model C schools these children in many instances do not receive any teaching in their home languages nor can they take their home languages as a first language subject. Where African languages are taught at ex-Model C schools, they are taught as non-exam subjects. starting only in Grade 5 and on a third language level. Even then, only one African language is offered per school, irrespective of the range of African languages that learners of that particular school speak at home, with the result that many children do not have their home language as a subject at all.

This study is based on the hypothesis that there is a lack of identification with the home language and the home language culture in the case of black children who are attending ex-Model C schools. As a result most children from these ex-Model C schools are lost to the African culture and traditions Hence they develop attitudes which are negative towards their own languages. They identify themselves more with their Second Language, which is English in this case, yet they also experience some form of alienation towards the English language and its associated cultural aspects.

In some of these ex-Model C schools, children are required to attend English pre-primary preparatory schools. Since this is the critical stage of home language acquisition, a second hypothesis has been posed, namely, that this adversely affects children from being proficient in the African language of the home. The skill in the African language would be reduced to "basic interpersonal communication skills"(BICS) (Cummins 1984), with impaired "cognitive academic language proficiency" (CALP) (Cummins 1984).

This study has compared the attitudes of black children from the Kathorus area, in three ex-Model C primary schools, towards their home language, Southern Sotho, and towards English, with children from three Kathorus township schools. The first language skills and usage of the first language in comparison with children from Kathorus township schools have also been studied, as well as their scholastic performance in comparison with children whose first language is the language of learning.

As this was a preliminary study with only six primary schools in the sample, the study has made use of qualitative methods.

The results have shown that learners seem to be ashamed to be associated with the Southern Sotho, whereas all of them want to be associated with English. This has also been evident from their behaviour and expressed attitudes. There was no difference regarding this attitude between learners in the townships and that of learners in the ex-Model C schools.

Children from highly educated parents and living in the previously 'white' suburbs have greater attitude problems, leading to poorer command of their home language and a lack of interest in it, conceivably on account of their social environment, for example, those from Dinwiddie Primary School. These children could not speak a full sentence in their home language without substantial mixing with English, and they have claimed that only English is spoken with their parents.

School results were investigated to see if it would be immediately clear whether the hypothesis that subtractive bilingualism would negatively affect African learners' scholastic achievement if supported. This proved not to be the case. It was concluded that factors such as the socio-economic status of parents as well as the linguistic diversity of the school obscure the influence of a subtractive bilingual situation and that a much larger sample and statistical analysis would be needed for a conclusive result.

Declaration

I declare that this research report is my own unaided work. It is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Master of Arts in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other university.



Dunyisiwe Ntombenhle Thombeni

8 April 1998

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere thanks and appreciation to :

- Dr. Sarah Slabbert, my supervisor, for the guidance and encouragement during this undertaking. I am grateful for the extra mile she walked to see me complete this work.

- Prof. Nhlanhla Maake, my co-supervisor, for his openness and being my mentor during my studies in the Department.

- My husband, Joseph, and the boys for the support they gave me.

- The financial assistance of the Centre for Science Development (HSRC, South Africa) towards this research is hereby acknowledged. Opinions expressed and conclusions arrived at are those of the author and not necessarily to be attributed to the Centre for Science Development.

- The Gauteng Department of Education, for granting permission to visit schools and to conduct this research.

CONTENTS

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Rationale

1.2 Aim of research

1.3 Hypotheses

Chapter 2: Theoretical background

2.1 Theoretical concepts

Chapter 3: Literature overview

3.1 The relationship between language and culture

3.2 Status and language attitudes

3.3 Language attitudes in colonial and post colonial Africa

3.4 Models of bilingual education

3.5 Speech behaviour in a subtractive bilingual context: the influence on L1 skills

3.6 Evaluations of the outcome of different models of bilingualism

3.7 The cognitive effects of bilingualism

3.8 Models of bilingual education and ideology

Chapter 4: Research methodology

4.1 Research design

4.2 Research realities

4.2.1 Schools and areas visited

4.2.2 A time factor

4.2.3 The actual research procedure

Chapter 5: Research results

5.1 Outline

5.2 Schools

5.2.1 Bopangkhotso Primary

5.2.2 Morojaneng Primary

5.2.3 Mohaung Primary

5.2.4 Dinwiddie Primary

5.2.5 Germiston South Primary

5.2.6 Leondale Primary

Chapter 6: Conclusions and recommendations

6.1 Conclusions

6.2 Recommendations

References

Appendix

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Rationale

Dissatisfaction with the quality of education under the former Department of Education and Training (DET), lack of facilities, and disruptions during the political transitional period have been the reasons why more and more black parents who can afford it financially, tend to send their children to so-called 'white' or ex-Model C schools. In ex-Model C schools these children do not receive any teaching in their home languages nor can they take their home languages as a first language subject. Where African languages are taught at ex-Model C schools, it is taught as a non-exam subject, only starting in Grade 5 and on a L3[1]-level. Even then, only one African language is offered per school, irrespective of the range of African languages that learners of that particular school speak at home, with the result that many children do not have their home language as a subject at all.

In contact that I have had with these children it has become clear that they have unfavourable attitudes about their own languages in comparison to English. Although the general high status of English in South Africa and among the black population is common knowledge, it is suspected that in these cases it is accompanied by very negative perceptions of the L1(first or primary language). A further possible consequence of this process and one which has been confirmed by my informal contact with learners, is the undermining of the function of language as the carrier of culture and the gross disruption of the cultural essence that is deeply rooted and entrenched in the language. Consequently not only cultural alienation is enhanced but also societal norms, values and systems are lost.

In some of these ex-Model C schools, children are required to attend English pre primary, preparatory schools. Since this is the critical stage of *L1* acquisition, it can be expected that this adversely affects children from being proficient in the African language of the home and that the skill in the African language would be reduced to "basic interpersonal communication skills" (BICS) (Cummins 1984), with impaired "cognitive academic language proficiency " (CALP) (Cummins 1984). It is not known for these children if and how L1 skills would be affected by

variables such as the comparative demographic profile of the children in a school, the language background of teachers, the attitude of teachers towards black children, contact with the L1, and parental support for the L1.

It is further not known whether in this particular subtractive bilingual environment, which in other respects such as facilities, teacher training, etc. can be regarded as advantaged, the CALP skills in the L2 of the children have developed sufficiently to enable them to do as well in school as children whose L1 is the language of learning of the school. A comparative analysis of school achievement should give an indication of this, because a lack of language skills would impact negatively on learning. Children operating at the context embedded level (BICS) in the language of the classroom will fail to understand the content of the curriculum and they will also fail to engage in the higher order cognitive processes of the classroom, such as synthesis, discussion, analyses, evaluation and interpretation.

However, one would expect a complexity of factors such as the comparative demographic profile of the children in a school, the language background of teachers, the attitudes of teachers towards black children, contact with the L1, and parental support for the L1 and the L2 to determine the way that these aspects of language in the learning process are manifested.

All of the above issues are extremely important in a country where equality and the readdressing of the imbalances of the past are very explicit goals of the education system. I hope that this study will make a contribution towards a better understanding of the effects of subtractive bilingualism in this specific context so that compensatory measures can be taken where necessary.

1.2 Aim of the study

This study has researched the following aspects of black children from the Kathorus area in primary ex-Model C schools with regard to the rationale above:

a. The attitudes of these children towards the African language that they have given up as their first language (L1) and towards English, in comparison with children from Kathorus

township schools;

b. The first language skills and usage of the first language in comparison with children from Kathorus township schools;

c. Their scholastic performance in comparison with children whose first language is the language of learning;

d. The variables that impact on the language attitudes, language skills, language use and scholastic performance mentioned in a., b. and c.

This study must be considered a preliminary study. Six primary schools were included in the sample and the study has made use of qualitative methods. It has mainly aimed at giving the parameters with regard to the above. Further research will have to be undertaken to quantify results.

1.3 Hypotheses

a. There is a lack of identification with the L1 and the L1 culture in the case of black children who are attending ex-Model C schools. As a result most children from these ex-Model C schools are lost to the African culture and traditions, and hence develop attitudes which are negative towards their own languages. They tend to look down upon their languages as 'inferior'. They identify themselves more with their L2, which is English in this case; yet they do also experience some form of alienation towards the English language and its associated cultural aspects.

b. Subtractive bilingualism affects L1 skills negatively, in particular when the functional domains of the L1 are restricted; therefore their L1 skills compare unfavourably with children in township schools.

c. As a result of subtractive bilingualism the children experience language problems in their learning process. This is reflected in school results.

d. The above are influenced by such variables as the demographic profile of the child, the

language background of teachers, contact with the L1, and parental support for the L1 and L2.

It should be noted that hypotheses a. and b. will be tested with children in the townships schools as control group, whereas children in the ex-Model C schools with English as L1 will act as the control group for hypothesis c. The hypothesized alienation towards the English language and associated cultural aspects, which is based on the researcher's personal experience, have not been researched in this study.

CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

2.1 Theoretical concepts

First language/ L1/primary language

:

For the purposes of this study, these terms will refer to the language that the child has first acquired, in this specific case Southern Sotho. The terms refer here also to what the child regards as the home language, although various degrees of language shift might be taking place.

Language shift versus language maintenance

The term "language shift" is used here according to the definition of Thomason and Kaufman (1988:35), as quoted in(Brenzinger 1992: 287, that refers to extended use of a language "which results in the replacement of a former primary language with a new primary language. The use of the old primary language shrinks as it is used in fewer and fewer domains. Language loyalty changes at this stage, in most cases, from the old to the new language".

Allowing for various hybrid manifestations, language shift and language maintenance may be regarded as two possible outcomes of a language contact situation (Sommer 1996). In this study the maintenance of an African language as L1 versus the possible language shift towards English as manifested in language attitudes and speech behaviour is investigated in a particular contact situation, namely the subtractive bilingual setting in ex-Model C schools.

Subtractive bilingualism

This term will be · according to the definition of Heugh (1995:334):

> Subtrac... bilingualism is regarded as a process whereby the first language is removed from the educational environment of the student. This may accompany a language shift in a community from the primary language to another, more prestigious language.

However, in the educational context, subtractive bilingualism operates when the first language is seen to have little educational value and is consequently removed from use in the school, although speakers of this language continue to use this language in informal community contexts.

BICS and CALP

BICS refer to "basic interpersonal communication skills " and CALP refers to "cognitive academic language proficiency. These terms will be used according to the definitions of Cummins (1984).

Language attitudes

Sarnoff (1970:279 in Ryan and Giles 1979:20) views attitudes as a disposition to react favourably or unfavourably to a class of objects. This disposition is often taken to comprise three components: feelings(affects element), through (cognitive element) and predispositions to act (behavioural element). To research attitude one would require further enquiry into the respondent's feelings about his/her expressed belief. According to Sarnoff it is in the educational setting where attitudes may have the greatest importance. Schools represent the single most important point of contact between speakers of different language varieties.

CHAPTER 3: LITERATURE OVERVIEW

3.1 The relationship between language and culture

Bruner (1975), when defining culture, says that language is a component of culture along with other entities like, for example, values, beliefs and norms. According to Bruner our cultural representations are shaped by language.

The Cultural Interdependence Hypothesis of Clément (Clément 1984 in Hamers and Blanc 1989:127-129) suggests that, at the sociocultural level of analysis, a lack of identification with L1 culture would be correlated with a lack of identification with the L2 culture. In other words, in order to identify with the cultural group speaking the other language as L1, a person must first identify with his/her L1 group in a strong enough way. According to Clément 1984 evidence supporting the sociocultural interdependence hypothesis is still scarce. Berry, Kalin and Taylor (1977) reported a positive correlation between attitudes of Canadians towards their own cultural group and attitudes towards other cultural groups in general: the more one perceives one's own group in a favourable light, the more attitudes towards other groups tend to be favourable. Clément, Gardner and Smythe (1977) also observed that Francophone Canadian adolescents who expressed positive attitudes towards French Canadians tended to display positive attitudes towards Anglophones.

In the case of African children of the ex-Model C Schools, the above observation is contradicted. These children lack identification with the L1; yet they strongly identify with the cultural group speaking the L2. Webb (1992a) sees this situation as a threat to the country's rich heritage of cultural and linguistic diversity which stems from the dominance of Afrikaans and English in the country.

3.2 Status and language attitudes

Because the respondents of this study are primary school children, the complex relationship between language and identity and ethnicity has not been investigated. Instead, attitudes towards

the L1 and L2 as well as an investigation into the environments where the L1 and L2 are being used, will be investigated. In this we will be following Thomason and Kaufman (1988), who have shown the importance of status relationships between contact languages and contact groups for the process of linguistic transfer. The relative sizes of the speaker groups of two languages in contact may contribute in part to a negative prediction about the likelihood of bilingualism; a politically super-ordinate group is unlikely to become bilingual in a nonprestigious subordinate group's language unless the superordinate group is much the smaller of the two. This is the case in South Africa between Afrikaans and English. Because Afrikaans is less prestigious than English, English speakers are generally less bilingual than Afrikaans speakers, despite an educational policy of bilingualism for the two language groups over a period of more than 80 years. It is also the case for both speakers of English and Afrikaans with regard to the African languages, which can be regarded as nonprestigious subordinate group languages. According to the Critical Mass Study of the SABC (Van Vuuren en Maree 1994) less than 1% of white South Africans are able to speak an African language.

Thomason and Kaufman (1988) identify a number of factors that promote greater intensity of contact between unequal status languages, and put greater cultural pressure on the borrowing-language speakers:

- length of time, i.e. enough time for bilingualism to develop and for interference features to make their way into the borrowing language;
- sociopolitical dominance of source-language speakers over borrowing-language speakers;
- intimate contact in mixed households or other social settings.

The latter situation has been observed in the primary schools visited. In the ex-Model C schools, primary school children are exposed to a variety of African languages as well as to English and Afrikaans. In many cases, the learners come from a mixed home language background, where the father, for example, speaks Zulu and the mother Southern Sotho. In both environments there would be no or little support for a single primary language with the result that these children have a problem to have L1 skills in any particular language.

Hamers and Blanc (1989) explain, with reference to language attitudes, that social psychological

research has already shown that a prestige standard form of a language has no inherent aesthetic or linguistic advantage over non standard varieties of this or other languages. Rather, the prestige ascribed to the standard form of a language is usually the product of culture-bound stereotypes passed on from one generation of speakers to the other. Linguistically speaking there is nothing intrinsic to a language or variety that makes it 'superior' or 'inferior', it is merely a matter of social evaluation conferred upon a language by social groups.

3.3 Language attitudes in colonial and post colonial Africa

Similar prestige differences are found in attitudes towards the indigenous languages versus the former colonial languages elsewhere in Africa. For example, for Myers-Scotton (1993:86), speaking English fluently in Nairobi "may be indexical of any of a set of attributes, including most prominently 'plus high educational level/ socio-economic status', 'plus authority', plus 'formality', and 'plus official'".

Chiwome and Thondhlana (1992:248) refer to the marginalisation of Shona in similar terms. The negative effects of the colonial education policy in Zimbabwe marginalised Shona and Ndebele by making English the official language, as well as the language of learning and teaching (LOLT) for all non-language subjects in all educational institutions. In the minds of students, Shona was associated with the negative aspects of social change, such as unemployment and poverty, whereas proficiency in English is mistakenly equated with intellectual competence. Many concepts made familiar through the LOLT tend to be expressed in English rather in Shona, which prevent the development of linguistic and analytical abilities in, what Chiwome and Thondhlana call "the mother tongue".

Many of these colonial dichotomies are also reflected in language attitudes in South Africa. Webb (1992a) gives a useful overview of trends in language attitudes in what he calls "a post-apartheid South Africa". "Afrikaans and English are the only really empowered languages, with all the other indigenous languages marginalised politically, economically, socially and even culturally. At the same time languages have been used for manipulative purposes and as a basis for discrimination." Esterhuyse (1986) refers in this regard to the use of (standard) Afrikaans by the Nationalist Party

to gain political support, and its use in government schools to promote the norms and values of Afrikaner-Nationalism.

Webb (1992b) further refers to the restrictive role of language in the economic domain as it relates to the dominance of Afrikaans and English in south Africa. As the dominant languages, Afrikaans and especially English are also the major languages of educational development. According to him, due to various features of the South African educational system such as the politicization of the principle of mother tongue instruction, the low status of the Bantu languages, the relative scarcity of written and spoken English in many rural areas, and serious shortcomings relating to language teaching as such, the majority of (mainly Black) primary school children tend to have a totally ineffective knowledge of English. This state of affairs leads, initially, to poor scholastic results, and, ultimately, to a workforce which is generally undeveloped in terms of the needs of a technologically modernizing society.

These trends are largely confirmed by the study of language attitudes in the Eastern Cape by De Klerk and Bosch (1994).The complexity of the attitudes towards English and the African languages on the one hand, and towards the various African languages and their urban and rural variety on the other hand is reflected in the results of the study of Slabbert and Van den Berg (1994).

Phillipson and Skutnabb-Kangas (1995) review language attitudes and language policies in post colonial Africa in terms of linguistic human rights. According to them, one of the most durable legacies of colonialism has been language policies. The new leaders have retained the languages of the former colonial powers and even strengthened their position, whereas African languages have seldom been declared official language of contemporary African states and are often not even acknowledged as 'national' languages. The majority of Africans are governed in languages that they do not understand. A clear example of declaration without implementation in the continent is the failure of African governments to act on the Cultural Charter for Africa, which the OAU (Organization for African Unity) Heads of State and governments adopted in 1976. Article 6 (2) of this states that member states should "promote teaching in national languages in order to accelerate their economic, political and cultural development".

According to Phillipson and Skutnabb-Kangas (1995:338) "the structural and ideological entrenchment of the dominant language in colonial empires had predictable results. 'English was the official vehicle and the magic formula to colonial elitedom.' (Ngugi 1985:115). 'Education to many people came to mean simply the ability to speak and write English' (From a history of Ghana (1963) as quoted by Mazrui 1968:186). A consequence of this linguistic favouring of the dominant languages is that 'Africans have been psychologically conditioned to believe that only European languages are structured to aid development' (Kashoki, quoted in UNIN 1981:41)".

Weinstein(1980:62) has identified a number of factors which may have influenced language attitudes in Africa in the late ' :

> A loosening of economic and military ties, disappointments with development programmes, the advent of new leaders on both sides of the Mediterranean ... have coincided with an evolution in attitudes. More leaders and intellectuals speak about the value of African languages. In almost all countries, African languages are no longer dismissed as dialects, patois, or vernaculars. Political and cultural leaders as well as the masses refer to them as languages ... Everywhere they are increasingly perceived as part of a cultural heritage of which Africans are justly proud.

It would seem that a movement in favour of indigenous languages and cultures is having an impact on educational policies in the sense that that bilingual education is considered more seriously in numerous African nations (Ryan and Giles 1979 and Bathibo 1996). The obvious failure of unilingual French schooling in much of Africa has spurred the creation of experimental programmes where African languages are used as LOLT in primary schools. Such programmes exist in the Central African Republic, Senegal, Niger, Togo, Madagascar, Mauritania and Mali, the aim of which is to use the African languages in the first year of school and then to switch gradually to French. (Ryan and Giles 1982:49-50)

Phillipson and Skutnabb-Kangas (1995:344) also refer to language policy documents that indicate a need for change in attitude: The policy paper by the OAU Inter-African Bureau of Languages (1995:10) declares that emphasis on learning foreign languages is "delaying the popularisation,

among the majority of the population, of basic scientific and technical knowledge, a prerequisite to the general overall development''.

3.4 *Models of* bilingual education

The language situation in primary education in South Africa can be described in terms of the different models of bilingual education. The description and Figure 1 below have been taken from *A Guide to language Policy Management in schools* (Constable et.al.16)

> These models can be categorized according to the aim that they serve. Subtractive models have as their aim, not multilingualism and multiliteracy, but rather monolingualism or limited bilingualism. They are typically applied to primary language learners of minority languages or of languages with relative low status. Additive models, on the other hand, promote multilingualism and multiliteracy to varying degrees. They are typically applied to primary language learners of majority languages or languages of relative high status.
>
> Subtractive and Additive models, as described below, can be regarded as the extreme ends of a continuum with the various examples fitting in somewhere in between. "
>
> Lambert and Taylor (1981) base their distinction between additive and subtractive bilingualism on the outcomes of different kinds of school programs. Additive bilingualism characterizes the student who has been able to maintain the mother tongue/home language while adding technical proficiency as well as communicative competence and an appreciation for the value system inherent in a second language. Subtractive bilingualism, on the other hand, characterizes a student who, as a result of a school program, has lost proficiency in the mother tongue and has replaced it with a second language.

Figure 1

SUBTRACTIVE MODELS	ADDITIVE MODELS
Definition: These models are found in education systems that do not value the learner's primary language as LOLT, and/or where the primary language has relative low status. At some point in the learner's education the primary language is replaced, partially or completely, by another language as LOLT. The aim of these models is monolingualism or limited bilingualism. Examples: * Submersion: No teaching and learning takes place in the primary language. An additional language, usually the majority or high status language, is the LOLT. Sometimes the primary language can be taken as a subject. * Transition: The primary language is used initially as LOLT, with some form of introduction to an additional language, which is normally the majority or high status language. At some point the primary language is replaced by the additional language as LOLT. Sometimes the primary language can be taken as a subject.	Definition: The learner's primary language(s) is/are maintained and a second language is added . The primary language has equal status with the additional language(s) as a language of learning. The aim of these models is multilingualism in education. Examples: * Two-way Dual Language: Two languages, of which one is the primary language, are used as LOLT, on a strict 50-50 basis. * Immersion: As in the Canadian example. Two languages are used as LOLT, e.g. primary education in the additional language and secondary education in the primary language. The additional language does not replace the primary language as LOLT. Both languages have status and strong support for the primary language is presupposed. * Maintenance: Initially the primary language is the LOLT, gradually an additional language is introduced as LOLT, but the primary language is maintained as LOLT throughout the school.
* Mainstream monolingual with additional language(s) as subjects. Though this is often considered to be an additive model, in the South African context it could be problematic, as it puts no obligation on speakers of previously high status languages, i.e. English and Afrikaans, to be fully bilingual or biliterate to the point where they can use the additional languages as a LOLT for some learning purposes.	

3.5 Speech behaviour in a subtractive bilingual context: the influence on L1 skills

In this regard, Cummins' theory of threshold has been adopted in this research report. Cummins(1976) argues that there is a threshold level of linguistic competence which a bilingual child must attain, both in order to avoid cognitive deficits and to allow the potentially beneficial aspects of becoming bilingual to influence his/her cognitive functioning. This would suggest, among other things, that linguistic minority groups need assurance that the home language will be given a strong reading and writing base before or along with the introduction of the national language. Knowing Afrikaans and English in South Africa, Hebrew and English in New York and Israel, would in each case be adding a second, socially relevant language to one's repertory of skills (Lambert 1977: 18).

According to Lambert (1977:19) "we might refer to the above as examples of an 'additive' form of bilingualism and contrast it with a more 'subtractive' form experienced by many ethnic minorities who, because of national educational policies and social pressures of various sorts, are forced to put aside their ethnic language for a national language. Their degree of bilinguality at any time would be likely to reflect some stage in the subtraction of the ethnic language and the associated culture, and their replacement with another".

At the level of cognitive development, Cummins (1979) suggested that an adequate knowledge of the L1 would facilitate acquisition of a L2 and that a deficit in the development of L2 might be attributed to adverse social conditions for L1 development. This is the condition that was observed at Morojaneng Primary School, where children are starving and most of them live with their grandmothers as their mothers are not living with them. Most of them are illegitimate, the mother has remarried elsewhere, therefore the child must remain with the grandmother to live on her pension.

3.6 Evaluations of the outcome of different models of bilingualism

A discussion of subtractive versus additive bilingualism as well as evaluations of the outcome of different models of bilingualism are exemplified by Paulston (1988), the Bullock report (1975),

Lambert's (1977) work on French Canadians, the work of Dube & Herbert 1975a, 1975b and Lambert, Giles and Picard 1975 on the French Americans in Northern New England. Ruiz (in Paulston 1988:539-557) comments on the common principle that underlies his work. He says it can be stated as follows: " a language is more readily acquired when it is used as a medium for the communication of meaningful messages than when it is used as a target for learning. this means that emphasis is placed on the function of language rather than on its form." For the bilingual classroom, this suggests a justification for the use of both languages as, what he calls, "media of instruction", rather than primarily as subjects.

Both Lambert's (1977) work on French Canadians, and the work on French Americans in Northern New England (Dube & Herbert 1975a, 1975b and Lambert, Giles and Picard 1975) refer to the effect an additive bilingual situation has on attitudes, both towards the L1 and the L2. Lambert concluded that by the fifth grade important affective changes have occurred during the course of the project. The English-Canadian children stated that their feelings toward French people have become decidedly more favourable; and they now think of themselves as being both French Canadian and English Canadian in personal makeup. The children had come to feel that they can be at ease in both French- and English-Canadian social settings, and that they were becoming both French and English in certain ways; but not becoming less English as a consequence. "Some parents may see this as a worrisome sign of identity loss, and although we are not optimistic we believe parents would, if patient, come to view their children's enjoyment in having both English and French Canadian friends and both types of outlooks as a valuable addition, not a subtraction or cancellation of identities." (Lambert 1977:23)

In the case of the English Canadian children, learners of a high status language were immersed in the majority, lower status language. In South Africa such a situation would apply when English-speaking learners would be immersed in, say, Zulu. The situation of French Americans in Northern New England is more similar to that of African learners in ex-Model C schools.

In the northern regions of Mains, some 85% of families have kept French alive as the home language or one of the two home languages, even though traditionally all schooling has been conducted in English. In an experiment, a random selection of schools in the area were permitted

to offer about a third of the elementary curriculum intrench and a second sample of schools with children of comparable intelligence scores and socioeconomic background served as a control or comparison in that all their instruction was in English. After a five-year run, the children in the 'partial French' schools clearly outperformed those in the control schools on tests involving various aspects of English language skills and academic content. An important element in this transformation appears to be a change in the self-views of the French trained learners who, as research has shown, begin to reflect a powerful pride in being French, and a realisation that their language is as important a medium for education as English.(Dube & Herbert 1975a, 1975b and Lambert, Giles and Picard 1975).

3.7 The cognitive effects of bilingualism

In the early literature during the first half of this century, we find a generally pessimistic outlook on the cognitive effects of bilingualism. Researchers studying the effect of bilingualism on cognitive development vary in their results. The largest proportion of these investigations concluded that bilingualism has a detrimental effect on intellectual functioning. A smaller number found little or no relation between bilingualism and intelligence and only a few suggested that bilingualism might have favourable effects on cognition (Lambert 1977).

Since the 1960's a much more optimistic picture has been emerging. Peal and Lambert (1962) started an investigation on the topic of the bilingual versus the monolingual in 1962 in the Canadian setting. The patterns of test results suggested that the bilinguals had a more diversified structure of intelligence, as measured, and more flexibility in thought. A study by Sheridan Scott (1973) was interested, among other things, in whether bilingualism promotes divergent thinking. Her results, based on a multivariate analysis, show that the groups of youngsters who had become functionally bilingual through 'immersion' schooling were substantially higher scorers than the monolingual groups with whom they had been equated for IQ and social class background at the first grade level.

Many studies supporting the detrimental effects of bilingualism on intelligence (Gardner in Gardner and Lambert 1972:247) seems to support the contention that there is no significant

difference between monolinguals and bilinguals on nonverbal intelligence, but the bilinguals are likely to be handicapped on verbal intelligence measures. An alternative explanation of these results is that bilingualism may in some way influence non-verbal intelligence.

Cummins and Mulcahy (1978) outlined the Developmental Interdependence Hypothesis which suggested that a child's second language competence is partly dependent on the level of competence already achieved in the first language. The more developed the first language, the easier it will be to develop the second language. Cummins (1984:136-137) made a distinction between basic interpersonal communication skills (BICS) and cognitive academic language proficiency (CALP). The former was defined in terms of "the manifestation of language proficiency in everyday communicative contexts" whereas CALP was conceptualized in terms of the manipulation of language in the decontextualized academic situation. The major points embodied in the BICS/CALP distinction are that some previously neglected aspects of language proficiency are considerably more relevant for students' cognitive and academic progress than are the surface manifestations of proficiency frequently focussed on by educators, and that educators' failure to appreciate these differences can have particularly unfortunate consequences for minority students. This distinction between BICS and CALP helps to explain the relative failure within the educational system of many minority language children.

What Cummins (1984) regards as essential in the bilingual education of children is that the "common underlying proficiency" is well developed. That is, a child's cognitive language abilities need to be sufficiently well developed to cope with the curriculum processes of the classroom. This is based on the assumpuon that children can learn best through a language they understand. Researchers found the use of the child's first language an essential part of effective programs: "in the most powerful educational environments for producing bilingualism, both languages are used as the medium of instruction" (Cazden 1984:15-16). Tikunoff and Vazquez-Faria (1982:234-271) states that "when instruction is delivered in a language a child only minimally can understand, the result frequently is frustration, boredom, hostility, or withdrawal. Thus, access to learning is impeded at the very least, resulting in failure or failing behind in school work."

Romaine (1989) hypothesizes that there is a link between language death and bilingualism. She

notes that the classic pattern is that a community which was once monolingual becomes transitionally bilingual as a stage on the way to eventual extinction of its original language.

> Migration to urban areas has also led to the decline of many languages in Papua-Guinea. (Romaine 1989:40)

The extension of the L1 to as late a stage as possible in education is regarded by her as a counter measure. This link that is made between a model of bilingual education and language shift is particularly relevant to this study.

3.8 Models of bilingual education and ideology

The ideological content of models of bilingual education and the implications this has for research is discussed by several authors. Skutnabb-Kangas and Cummins' book *Minority education: from shame to struggle* (1988) shows how the minority status of communities is maintained in terms of particular models of bilingual education and how that has been resisted in a number of test cases. One of these cases is the situation of the Canadian Natives, of whom Jordan (1988:193), as quoted by Skutnabb-Kangas and Cummins, says the following:

> Indigenous people see two great problems connected with schooling - the loss of identity of their youth, and the massive drop-out from schools and educational institutions caused by the alienation of students from their ethnic identity. In every case, they see the faults lying in a white system unadapted to the needs of indigenous people.

Cummin's (1995) article "The discourse of disinformation: the debate on bilingual education and language rights in the United States "reveals the ideological content of the various arguments for and against bilingual education cited above.

Bilingual models of education and the social history of South Africa are intricately linked. This relationship between bilingual models of education and the social history of South Africa is briefly described by Brown (1992). He maintains that this is research that still needs to be undertaken.

CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

4.1 Research design

This study makes use of qualitative research methods. Sommer (1996) points out that several ethnographic studies of language shift have relied on qualitative research strategies instead of the mere quantification of linguistic and sociolinguistic data (Appel and Muysken 1987, Romaine 1989). "...language shift is never triggered off by objectively measurable socioeconomic facts and factors alone. On the contrary, it is the subjective, personal evaluation of individual bilingual speakers that has to be taken into account. This in turn is best achieved with the help of qualitative research strategies" (Sommer 1996:65). As it will be the aim of this study to describe the type of language attitudes and language skill patterns found in the sample schools as well as the range of determining factors, qualitative methods are particularly relevant.

A matched guise test and individual interviews has been the two main research instruments. The matched guise technique has been developed by Lambert and his associates (Lambert 1977). A single speaker is employed, but in two or more 'guises'. This speaker produces the same utterances, but in different languages or language varieties. Because speaker and content are constant, the response can be regarded as exclusively to the code. In this study the purpose will be to explore attitudes and not test a given set of attitudes, although the results of the attitude studies mentioned above will be taken into consideration. The fact that the respondents will be young children will also have to be considered. For these reasons a picture association technique, which is commonly used in market research, was chosen instead of a formal attitude questionnaire.

Kathorus, a township area on the East Rand of Gauteng, is taken as the sample geographical area. (The GDE did not want to allow the researcher to work within a smaller geographical area.) A sample of three ex-Model C primary schools that parents from the Kathorus area send their children to as well as two township primary schools in the same area have been taken.

a Research goal: Demographic profiles of the children in the sample schools

- Number of children;
- Language profile of all the children in the sample schools;
- Language spread in the school;
- Demographics of the teachers (how many languages can they speak, home language);
- Demographics of the parents: socio-economic class, educational background, languages parents use at home.

Research instrument: School records; interviews with Grade 5 classes as a subsample

b Research goal: Attitudes of children toward their mother tongue and English

Research instrument: Matched guise, tested with a two groups of 8 South Sotho home language learners from Grade 5 as a subsample. Each group was exposed audio examples of South Sotho and English respectively, in the following structure:

	Week 1	Week 2
Group A	South Sotho example	English example
Group B	English example	South Sotho example

The children were be asked to select pictures that they associate with the voice on the tape recording from a group of pictures, and to explain their choice. The ensuing discussion has been taped and transcribed and analysed according the methodology of qualitative research.

c. Research goal: Comparison of home language skills

Research instrument: The same sample of Grade 5 learners from both ex-Model C schools and township schools were given a comprehension test in Southern Sotho, based on the Geography curriculum of Grade 5. The material has been selected from work that the children have not yet done. The results were marked and analysed. The exercise and their

experience of it were also discussed with the respondents.

d. Research goal: Analysis of academic achievement of black children in ex-Model C schools and the relationship between language and other determining factors.

Research instrument: School records and in-depth interviews regarding home language situation, parental support and motivation with 16 respondents from Grade 5 as sample. In-depth interviews with the headmaster of the sample schools as well as with teachers that have the respondents in their classes.

4.2 Research challenges

4.2.1 Schools and areas visited

Kathorus, the name representing three townships on the East Rand of Gauteng, was taken as a sample geographical area. These townships are Katlehong, Thokoza and Vosloorus. They are all very big townships and this projects needed only three schools to be visited for the research purposes. The core-supervisor advised that only one township out of the three must be taken as a sample and the three primary schools be chosen from it, as each township has more than twenty primary schools. The Head of the Research Unit in Gauteng Department of Education disagree with that idea, expressing her need for a wider scope of areas to be visited by researchers and the importance of people from those outskirts neglected areas to be visited by academics. As a result only one primary school per township in Kathorus area was visited. That is one primary school in Vosloorus namely Bopangkhotso, one in Katlehong, namely Morojaneng, and one in Thokoza, namely Mohaung.

A sample of three ex-Model C primary schools that parents from the Kathorus area send their children to, was taken from the Germiston area: Dinwiddie primary school, Leondale Primary School and Germiston South Primary School.

4.2.2 Time factor

An appointment with each principal was made to request time for visiting her/his school as well as to request permission for the research. A delay was caused by the Leondale Primary school principal who could not allow me in the school before getting permission from the District Manager. After a week he came back with the answer that permission has to be granted by the Gauteng Department of Education Research Unit. To get permission from the Research Unit in the Gauteng Regional Office took about two full months. When actual visit in schools had to be conducted it was already the last term of the year 1997. The very unit for research emphasized that this time is not for visitors in the schools as it is near examinations. The intended two visits in each school for two weeks in succession was no longer possible. The matched guise had to be done during the same visit, one session each for the South Sotho and the English voice.

3.2.4 .The actual research procedure

a) Research goal : Demographic profile of the children in the school.
Instrument: The principals were been requested for school records regarding the number of children and language profile of all children in these schools. The demographics of the teachers were also given by principals as there was no time to discuss personally with teachers.

b) Research goal : Attitude of children towards their home language and English
Instrument: The Matched guise test was conducted with two groups of 8 South Sotho home language children from Grade 6 as a subsample.

The voice taped in both South Sotho and English was of a teenage girl who is a first year student of R.S.A. Technikon. She told her experience of being taken by the gangsters and nearly killed. Two tape recorders were carried along to the class, i.e. one electric operated and one battery operated, and some empty cassettes for recording discussions with learners. A pack of pictures with people from various spheres of life was well prepared to be studied and associated with the voice.

The following Discussion Guide was used:

1. INTRODUCTION

The introduction and procedure were explained to them before the two groups are divided. Each group was given a chance to introduce themselves while they were taped and each individual gave a little background about herself/himself, e.g. where they stay, whether the parents are working or not, where they work, their educational backgrounds if known by the child, how many they are at home, and which language is used for communication at home.

2. SOUTH SOTHO VOICE

Each group of eight was given a chance to listen to the South Sotho voice first. The tape was played twice and thereafter an instruction given to pick up the pictures. They were expected to pick up the person they associate with the voice from the give pictures spread on the table. Reasons for the picture chosen by each learner were taped in order to be written down later. Their choices were discussed with them. After this group, another group of eight came closer around the table for the same exercise, i.e. firstly discussion about oneself and thereafter the choosing of pictures.

3. COMPREHENSION TEST

A comprehension test in Southern Sotho, based on the Geography curriculum of Grade 6 was given to both groups in each school both township and ex-Model C schools. The material of the comprehension was selected from work that the children had not done by then. They were given about five questions to answer in their home language, South Sotho, based on the given comprehension. The results of that work was marked and analysed.

4. ENGLISH VOICE

Each group of eight was given another chance but now to listen to the English voice. The tape was played twice again and thereafter an instruction to pick up the pictures they associate with the voice was given. Pictures were already spread on the table and learners were seated around the table. Their choices were discussed with them. After the first group, another group of eight came closer to the table and the same procedure was repeated.

After these three exercises, learners were addressed, thanked and then they could go home.

School records were collected from the principal for analysis and some informal discussion conducted with the principal. The school records proved to be problematic in various respects. No simple conclusion could be made about the academic achievement of African children in ex-Model C schools. This will have to be investigated in much larger depth and by making use of statistical analysis. More variables are contributing to academic achievement than only language so that it was impossible to isolate in a small-scale study such as this one the impact of language on academic achievement. In both Leondale and Dinwiddie, for example, African children were found at all achievement levels. The non-African children in this particular school come from a much lower socioeconomic background than the African children. Most of the African children come from a professional background. This factor might have overridden the language factor.

CHAPTER 5: RESEARCH RESULTS

5.1 Outline

For each school the research result will be given following the structure below :

SCHOOL:

AREA :

Demographic profiles of the children in the school

. Number of children

. Language profile of all the children in the school

Demographics of the teachers

. Total number of teachers

. Teachers home language

Demographics of the parents

. Socio-economic class

. Languages parents use at home

Matched guise

. Response to a South Sotho voice

. Response to an English voice

Comprehension Test results

Informal discussion with the principal

The reader should note that the learners' responses are reported verbatim in the results of the research that follows.

5.2 Schools

5.2.1 School : Bopangkhotso Primary School

Area : Vosloorus Township

Demographic profile of the children in the school

Number of Children: 799

Language profile of all the children in the school:

Sotho:	369
Nguni:	430

Only South Sotho and Zulu are offered as a first language in this school. All children who are Nguni's, i.e. Xhosa and Zulu study Zulu as a L1, and all those who are Sotho's, i.e. S.Sotho and N.Sotho study South Sotho as their L1.

Demographics of the teachers

Total number of teachers : 20

Teachers home language:

Tswana	01
N.Sotho	02
S.Sotho	08
Zulu	08
Xhosa	01

All teachers can communicate in Zulu and South Sotho.

Demographics of the parents

Socio-economic class:

Most parents are not professional. They work as saleswomen, drivers, etc. Only three out of

sixteen children had professional parents, i.e. teacher, nurse and laboratory researcher. Most of the parents had matric or equivalent. Only one parent was a university graduate. He is working at Lever Brothers as a laboratory researcher.

Languages parents use at home

The greater majority uses South Sotho at home, though Zulu or Xhosa is sometimes mixed with South Sotho where the first language of the mother is Nguni.

Some of these learners confessed that they only speak South Sotho at home with their parents and at school during the Sotho class period. Most of the time they communicate in Zulu with their friends at school as well as at home when they are playing.

Interaction in the groups

Some of the girls did not want to speak in their home language, South Sotho. They said they preferred to have the discussion in English. There was chaos in class as the boys voiced their dissatisfaction. The boys felt that these girls were thinking high of themselves as they were looking down upon their home language. I ruled out that they must speak the language they feel comfortable with. These mentioned girls spoke English during the discussion.

I interpreted their behaviour as wanting to prove a point to the researcher, namely that, although they stay in the township, they can speak English like town children. This interpretation was confirmed by the principal.

Matched guise

Response to a South Sotho voice

Most of these learners, after listening to the South Sotho voice, chose pictures of women who were middle aged, wearing traditional African attires, i.e. dresses designed from a material known as "isishweshwe". This material is most used to design Basotho women clothes. I think they chose women wearing this attire because they associated the South Sotho speaker to a

traditional language of Basotho's. When I asked them the reasons for their choice, they said it was because these women looked depressed and downhearted because of what happened to them according to the story in the tape.

In actual fact those women to me did not look depressed. The only thing was that they were photographed ready for the photo in an attractive manner. This was the response of about half of the group.

About a quarter of the group chose pictures of middle aged women, explaining that the voice sounded very serious about life. They even interpreted those pictures as if the middle aged women/woman was relating her experience to her children or friends where the background shows us a woman with some people around her.

Two of the learners chose a young girl photographed next to the police vehicle, the yellow one. They suspected that the woman was relating her bad luck to the police, or that the police was there to help her The photo was then taken on the spot.

Two of the learners chose a picture of a young woman who was more or less 18,19 years old (which is the same age as the speaker). The reason for them to choose that picture was the way she was dressed, which learners said, indicated that she does not care what others say or think about the way she dresses. The reason given for this choice was that she was associated with the TV presenter because of the attire she was wearing - stunning and stylish, and the fact that she was not ashamed to tell her story to the "whole world". By the "whole world" the respondent meant that everyone would be listening to the tape.

Response to the English voice

Two of the same people chosen for the South Sotho voice were chosen again, namely those young women who had plaited hair and were wearing jewellery, i.e. necklace and earings. The reason for the choice of these bright and modern women was given as "you can see that they are able to English".

The other women chosen for English were also young, wearing jeans, with modern styled hair. These women were chosen on grounds that they look modern, they are dressed like city girls who are expected to be fluent in English anyway.

Comprehension Test Results

Some of these learners had difficulty in understanding the passage given. Although they have South Sotho as home language, they proved to lack comprehension of the vocabulary of standard South Sotho. This was indicated by the questions some of them kept asking while they were given time to read the passage given before answering the questions based on it. For each sentence the meaning of at least one word was asked, for example the word fapafapana in Mmala wa tlalo la bona o fapafapana. ("The colours of their appearance was different.")

The same problem was experienced with the actual answering of questions. Although the question were easy and set in their home language, the children kept on asking what it was that was expected from them. It would seem as if these children were totally unfamiliar with the skill of doing a comprehension exercise. This was confirmed by the fact that, after the task was explained in detail to them, most of them could answer satisfactorily, although most of their answers were short, one word answers and not the expected full sentence.

Informal discussion with the Principal

The principal was happy to learn that her learners co-operated so well with me. I asked her about the communication around the school, as to whether they are emphasizing English more than home language. This question was based on the background I had while discussing with the learners in groups. I told the principal my experience with the Grade 5 group I met. The principal expressed his opinion that, generally, the girls are trying hard to communicate in English because they are trying to compete with their friends who are in ex-model C schools. Though at school they do encourage all their learners to practise speaking English.

5.2.2 School: Morojaneng Primary School

Area : Katlehong Township

Demographic profile of the children

Number of children: 863

Language profile of all the learners in the school

This is a South Sotho speaking school. Basically the school admit only those children whose home language is South Sotho, because the medium of instruction from Grade 1 is South Sotho. Children who do not have South Sotho speaking parents by virtue of birth, but has it as her/his first language (L1), or home language, are also admitted.

Demographics of the teachers

Total number of teachers: 23

Teachers home language

South Sotho	14
North Sotho	03
Tswana	02
Zulu	02
Xhosa	02

Althouth the larger majority of the teachers have a Sotho language as their home language, I was impressed during informal discussions by their multilingual skills and the way that they accommodated me as a Zulu speaker. This implied that they were able to accommodate children from a variety of language backgrounds in the classroom.

Demographics of the parents

Socio-economic class

Almost all of the parents in this group are not professional. The majority of the children stay with their grandmothers. Their parents are staying somewhere else. Even those that are staying with their parents have parents who are not working, or one of the parents is working and the other one is not working. There was one boy from a family of ten children, staying with the mother at her parents' home. The mother is not working. I asked the boy how they managed to live and he said his mom's younger sister is staying with them and she is the only person working. She helps them.

Only four out of the sixteen parents have matric. Among those that have matric, one works at the SABC, and the other one work at Wine Distillers in Wadeville, one parent works at the Phillips Company for electrical appliances.

Language parents use at home

All of them use South Sotho at home. There were two of them who are not Sotho's but their mothers are Sotho's because they are staying and growing up at their mothers' homes with their grandmothers, as a result they have South Sotho as their home language.

Interaction in the group

One of the girls insisted on speaking Zulu instead of South Sotho. The other learners questioned her about it, but she claimed that she liked Zulu. I interpreted it as an act of accommodation: she picked up that the moderator was a Zulu-speaking person and wanted to show that she can also speak the language.

Matched guise

Response to a South Sotho voice

Young girls wearing school uniform were chosen because the story was about a young school girl. One learner even said these school girls are crying, saying "thank you God", because they survived

The other main choice was based on the way the woman in the picture was dressed. For example, a woman wearing a mini dress was chosen, the reason given that she was advertising herself to males, hence the gangsters nearly raped her. A stout woman was chosen by one girl and the reason she gave for choosing her was her weight. She associated this voice with a stout, traditional Sotho woman, i.e. in accordance with the African culture.

Response to an English voice

Basically, people chosen for the English voice were looking happy. Smiling faces were chosen on the grounds that they were rejoicing after being released, i.e. according to the story told in the tape.

One boy in the group did not participate, claiming that he could not associate any face with the voice. It might have been difficult for him to rationalise his choice.

Comprehension Test Results

The results of this exercise shows that the majority of these learners have a problem with reading and expressing themselves clearly in writing their home language. Some of them did not even understand the relationship between the questions and the given passage. This was evident in their answers. For example, one of the questions given, asked about the habitat of the Pygmies. Half of this group answered that the Pygmies live in Gauteng. In the given paragraph there was no mention of Gauteng. This was very touching to me. I suspected they didn't even bother to read the passage through. They saw the word 'stay' in the question and they thought of themselves staying in Gauteng. Most of them only attempted this one question. The other question they did not even attempt. Not one of them answered all the give questions in full.

Informal discussion with the Principal

The principal expressed her concern about the age of children from Lesotho. Most of the children are from very poor families. They are hungry and starve. They live on pension

money from their grand parents. It was very pathetic and difficult situation for teachers. The principal explained their problem of children who are over .ge. Most of these learners come from Lesotho. The parents claim that they were out of school for some years and delayed because of they were looking after cattle. What is worse, is that they don't stay with their parents even here in S.A., they are living with their grandmothers on their pension. The principal told me that they are looking forward to the Government's Back to Fast Track programme which will be introduced late this year in Gauteng Department of Education.

In this primary school, I was told they have boys and girls of up to eighteen years of age. Some fourteen years old are still in Grade 4. This situation make the teacher work very difficult, because most of these older ones are struggling. They could not even write nor read. Even those that are in the correct grades according to their age struggled because of their home background. They stay with their grandmothers and they are starving. As a result they lack concentration in class. The situation as the principal put it, is "pathetic".

5.2.3 School : Mohaung Primary School

Area : Thokoza Township

Demographic profile of the children

Number of children : 760

Language profile of all the learners in this school:

This is a South Sotho school. All learners should be taking South Sotho as their L1, as it is assumed that South Sotho is their home language. South Sotho is a dominant language used by all learners and all teachers, as it is sometimes used as a language of instruction especially in Grade 1 to Grade 3. English is used as a medium of instruction from Senior Primary which is Grade 4 to Grade 7. Afrikaans is taught only as a subject.

Demographics of the teachers

Total number of teachers: 21

Teachers home language

Southern Sotho	11
Tswana	06
Zulu	04

Demographics of the parents

Socio-economic c'a:s

Out of the two groups, only one parent is a teacher, and one is a nurse. Half of them, their mothers do not work, only the fathers do, whereas one mother sell goods at school. Most of the fathers work as drivers, not one is professional. Almost a quarter of them had both parents unemployed. Very few of them have both parents working, as a result most of them are

staying in those squatter camps mushrooming around Thokoza.

Languages parents use at home

All of these parents use South Sotho at home with their families. In spite of that, one girl preferred to communicate to me in Zulu. I asked [illegible]son, and she said she love Zulu so much, but at home she uses South Sotho with her grandparents.

Matched guise

South Sotho Response

Pictures of women were mostly chosen on the grounds of environmental background, i.e. where the young women were, for example, a picture of an isolated place, or pictures where people were in a group like at a party. The respondents interpreted the environment of the voice on the tape as a "chaotic place", "so one can expect anything bad in such a place". Most of these learners blamed the girl whose voice they were listening to for being in such isolated places, or for living a frivolous life style. Some pictures of women were chosen on the grounds that they looked worried, "their hearts are troubled".

English Response

Most of the respondents changed the pictures for the English voice. The respondents chose smiling faces, saying that the women are now relaxed and thankful that they have survived.

Some chose the very same picture because they suspected the voice as being the same person.

Comprehension Test Results

The results of the comprehension test in South Sotho, based on the Geography curriculum of Grade 5, showed that they have a good command of their home language, but could not answer the given questions due to lack of comprehension test skills. They kept on asking questions needing some explanation while they were writing. Their results showed that only one out of the whole group could answer the given question correctly and clearly. The whole

group failed. In this case it was therefore not a matter of not understanding the Southern Sotho, but a lack of reading and comprehending test skills in their home language which impaired them.

Informal discussion with the deputy principal

The deputy principal expressed his view to me that they are motivating their learners about educating themselves in the location and not feeling inferior. He said those in the cities in ex-model C schools have lost their culture. They are nowhere as they no longer fit in the township, black life style as well.

The deputy principal was of the opinion that black children need to be taught their roots, i.e. they must be taught African languages in order to preserve their culture. They are not experiencing problems with their learners as far as discipline is concerned because their learners behave in an acceptable African cultural way, that is, they are not influenced by any another culture.

5.2.4 School : Dinwiddie Primary School

Area : Dinwiddie - Germiston

Demographic profile of the children

Number of children : 740

Black children = 36% = 273 learners

White = 64% = 467

Language profile

The principal was not able to give information on the language profile of the children in the school. To him the distinction between black and white was sufficient. The language which is used as a medium of instruction is English, from Grade 1 to Grade 7. Other languages are only taught as subjects, i.e. Afrikaans and Zulu.

Demographic of the teachers

Total number of teachers : 24

Teachers home language

Afrikaans 11

English 13

Demographics of the parents

Socio-economic class

Only three out of ten parents are graduates. Out of these graduates, one is a medical doctor, one is an engineer, and the other one is a psychologist. Two of the parents were teachers but one has changed the profession and is currently studying Social Science. One parent owns businesses, i.e. taxis and a shop. The other three parents work in different companies with

certain skills, e.g. management. Only one parent is unemployed, the grandmother is taking care of the learner's education. Only two parents still lived in the Katlehong township. The majority are already in "ex-white" suburbs and at Spruitview.

Languages parents use at home

Most of these learners use English at home with their parents. They told me that their parents communicate in English with them most of the time. South Sotho is used on a very limited scale at home, hence learners could not communicate in South Sotho, claiming they do not know it. They lack South Sotho vocabulary. For example, when a learner was asked about her parents' professions, she answered: "Ntate wa ka ke doctor, a medical practitioner. He practises at Natalspruit Hospital, but he also has his own surgery in Vosloorus."

Matched guise

Response to a South Sotho voice

A woman next to an ice cream van, was chosen on grounds that she sounded as if she was in the background of an industry or a working place. So the women chosen were in a group, probably in a working place.

The others chose a woman all by herself because there was no background sound as she was telling this story which could mean that she was just by herself in a room. The respondent said the appearance to them was not important, but the background of the place where she was. She chose a woman talking to somebody. She concluded that there was a sound in the background which told her that this woman in the picture was not alone.

Another woman was chosen because of her big mouth. They said this mouth indicated that she talked too much. People with big mouths talk too much. Another woman was chosen because she was seen to be in the bush or park. There were background noises which were associated with the cars moving around in the town.

They also chose a very young girl saying the voice in the tape sounded like her, because she

looked young and the voice sounded very young.

One boy didn't chose any one. His reason being that hardly all of these pictures suit this voice and the background in the tape had no people. Now all these pictures have a wrong background.

Response to an English voice

Most of them chose women in parties, or shebeens or some socializing places and they explained that these women were now enjoying themselves after being saved from a crocodile's mouth. Those who chose women in a quiet background chose the smiling faces most of them this time, which signified happened after the painful experience.

Comprehension Test Results

Only those learners who started their schooling in Katlehong at a South Sotho medium school participated in this part of the project. The other group claimed that they can't read and write South Sotho. Even this group that I did the comprehension with, was reluctant to participate, claiming not to know South Sotho because they did only Grade 1 to Grade 3 in South Sotho and some of them did only the first year.

The results of their comprehension were not as bad as they had already predicted. They comprehended South Sotho very well and they answered the given questions properly in South Sotho.

Informal discussion with the principal

The principal expressed his view regarding the black children in his school. He said that they are negative about their home language. When the principal try to motivate these learners about the importance of their own home languages, some of them express their thoughts to him: "I don't care for that stupid language".

Even their appearance is giving the school management a problem. They refuse to have short hairstyles because they want to imitate their white peers with long hair.

5.2.5 School : Germiston South Primary School

Area : Germiston

Demographic profile of the children in the school

Number of children: 571

Language profile the all the learners in the school

Afrikaans	08
English	303
Portuguese	17
Polish	02
Bulgarian	08
South Sotho	47
Tswana	04
North Sotho	02
Chinese	02
Xhosa	14
Zulu	73
Yugoslavian	08
Taiwanese	03
Italian	01
Tsonga	04
French	01
Ndebele	01
Hervesken(?)	01
Other	72

Demographics of the teachers

Total number of teachers: not available

Teachers home languages:

The principal was very sensitive about the research and would not give information about the home languages of the teachers. She suggested that teachers should give me this information or any other information, out of their own free will. It was however not possible to interview the teachers, because I visited the school during teaching time and they were all in their different classes.

Demographics of the parents

Socio-economic class

Three parents are teachers by profession, and one is a student teacher. One parent is a teacher but has left teaching and is presently studying BA in Social Science. The others have full time jobs, e.g. two of them work at the laboratories of companies, but they did not study at tertiary institutions. One is a businessman with two shops. He is supplying hair products in KwaThema and Vosloorus.

Most of these parents live in the locations of Vosloorus and Katlehong. Only two live in Spruitview which was a "rich" or "elite" Black suburb during the last years of apartheid. Only 2 parents live in the white suburbs, i.e. Benoni suburb, called Crystal Park the other one is Germiston.

Languages parents use at home

Almost all of them have South Sotho as their home language, though some said they mix it with Zulu, or any other African language, in cases where the mother is not a South Sotho speaker. If the mother is a Zulu speaker, she would influence the children, hence the children would try to speak Zulu with her most of the time. English is used very seldom, if ever, at home.

Matched guise

Response to a South Sotho voice

Two learners chose the same picture because of the attire the woman is wearing (isishweshwe) which is a Basotho women attire. They associated the voice with the attire.

Two learners chose another person with the traditional North · African attire with its tied "doek" around the head and a baby on her back. One of the two even said that it's because of her mouth as well that she chose her.

One learner chose a girl with a beret as if she was wearing a school uniform and he said is choosing this girl because of that school uniform. The speaking voice sounded like a teen schoolgirl that was his reason.

One learner chose woman wearing a mini dress next to ice cream kombi. He said the way she was dressed probably is the reason why those gangsters had kidnapped her. In the township community a woman exposing her body is interpreted as attracting males. Similarly, a woman wearing navy tights were chosen by another group and suspected to be the one speaking because of those tights. She could be targeted as an outgoing girl, they said. A story that she had been in a struggle, probably even raped, suited her, because of the way she was dressed.

One learner chose a girl wearing earrings with big, not very clean, hair in a picture of three women, because her age matched the person on the tape recording. Another learner chose a girl wearing an edge-cut top and said she looked sad and worried.

Response to an English voice

The same group chose totally different people for the Englisn voice. Two of them chose a nurse, wearing her uniform. They said, although she was bright because of her uniform, there was sadness within her, which could be read from her face. She was not totally happy, that was why they thought she might be the person speaking on the tape.

Two chose the girl in purple jeans and said the voice sounded like a teenager of the age of the girl in the picture.

The others chose a lady laughing widely with visible make-up and they said she looked relaxed after the dark cloud she was saved from had been cleared. She was now grateful.

Comprehension Test Result

This group proved to be highly skilled in answering the written work on comprehension. Their answers were all in full sentences, which showed that they understood the passage well. It was surprising to see that they could still write South Sotho so well and indeed far better than the township learners who are doing South Sotho as a subject. These pupils do not have their primary language as a subject, and take Zulu as a third language and non-exam subject.

We would attribute the above result mainly to two factors: With the exception of one or two, these children live in the townships which would mean that they have daily contact with South Sotho speakers. Most of them also speak South Sotho to their parents, which can be interpreted possibly as a function of the parents' competency in English. Secondly, the demographical profile of the school indicates an extraordinary linguistic and cultural variety. The school takes pride in respecting the cultural diversity of its learners. For example, every year, a cultural day is organised where every culture is represented by traditional attire, dances, music, food, etc.

Informal discussion with the principal

The principal's attitude regarding information about the teachers was mentioned above.

5.2.6 School: Leondale Primary School

Area : Leondale - Germiston

Demographic profile of the learners

Number of children: 784

Language profile of all the learners in the school

Afrikaans	0.6%
English	8.5%
South Sotho	16.4%
Tswana	6.3%
Venda	1.0%
Xhosa	4.4%
Zulu	26.4%
Unknown	36.5%

English is the language used as a medium of instruction. Afrikaans is taught as a L2 and Zulu is the only African language offered as a L3.

Demographics of the teachers

Total number of teachers: 26

Teachers home languages

English	05
Afrikaans	19
South Sotho	01
Zulu	01

Demographics of the parents

Socio economic class

Only four parents are University graduates. One is a teacher in Soweto, the other one is a credit assessor at Nedbank, and others are managers. One manages an insurance company branch, i.e. Southern Life company. The other parent is a manager of Castle Wine. There is one parent working at Eskom in an electronics department. Two mothers are saleswomen at clothing shops, e.g. Edgars. Only three mothers are not working. They sit at home as housewives. One parent is a retired nurse who has taken her severance package.

Languages parents use at home

Parents use South Sotho at home, mixed with English in some instances.

Interaction in the group

When it was announced that the South Sotho children in Grade 6 should go a certain classroom, some white and coloured children also turned up. They claimed that they know South Sotho and wanted to take part. We interpreted this as indicative of the way that children in this school do not see them themselves as racially different.

Matched Guise

Response to a South Sotho voice

They chose young girls wearing a school uniform saying they look too 'cleva', especially the right hand one. It was said that she looks quite 'cleva', that is why the boys kidnapped her. ('Cleva' is a township word which means 'modern', 'urban' and 'knowledgeable of the ways of the township'.)

The girl with a cut-edged short were chosen on the grounds that she looked sad and "sorry". One boy even mentioned that she could come from the squatters behind the shops that were visible in the picture. The "mkhukhu" was not visible behind the shops - he was just guessing.

He associated being kidnapped with the person staying in the shacks.

A girl wearing tights was chosen on the grounds that she was exposed to be "that kind". A girl wearing maroon jeans was chosen on the grounds that she looked "sorry" and "surprised". Her age as well made them to associate her with the voice.

Response to an English voice

A girl with Abashante hairstyle was chosen because she looked "cleva", plus she was exposing her body with a little top, the whole stomach was visible. Abashante is a music group singing Kwaito music, which is favoured by most of our youth today. Young girls in school uniform were again chosen, as the voice gave away that this was a school girl. The girl with a cut-edged T shirt was chosen again because she was regarded to be a school going girl, the same age as the voice on the tape.

Comprehension Test results

Their written exercise reflected that they have a good background of South Sotho. They could read and comprehend what they are reading. The majority of them could answer the given questions. Two boys had a problem with reading a South Sotho text, so they were excused.

The above result was in total contrast to the learners' claimed competencies. All the boys who took part in the test claimed that they could not longer read and write South Sotho. They would just be trying, they said. Amongst the girls, only one girl admitted that she could read and write South Sotho. All the other girls claimed that they couldn't read South Sotho. One of them changed facially saying, "Hoo! Kekeni one year fela ko seSothong". She was responding to her class mates who were forcing her to participate in the reading and writing of the comprehension.

Informal discussion with the Principal

The principal got very interested in this language projects this experience with African children

for some years in other areas, e.g. Malvern. He told me about the different behaviour of these young ones according to their different cultural values. I was very much impressed by his experience. It showed the interest he has in our children. He even told me about the progress of learners of different races. For example, he told me about the fact that black children progress so well they even perform well above the white children even in English as a subject. His only problem he said is the fighting of black children among themselves.

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 Conclusions

The results of the Matched Guise clearly indicated significant differences in attitude between English and the African languages. Generally, the South Sotho voice was associated with older, and, in some cases, rural women, even though the voice said that she was coming from school when the incident happened. This was because the African languages are thought of as for uneducated elderly people, and not for the young and educated. Surprisingly, for the English voice, the respondent would remember that the speaker was young and at school and consistently chose a picture of a young woman. In the case of the South Sotho voice, the woman was blamed for her circumstances. for example, because she was scantily dressed and exposing her body to men. The English voice, on the other hand, was associated with a smiling, relieved. woman who was glad that everything turned out well. Learners seemed to be ashamed to be associated with the South Sotho, whereas all of them wanted to be associated with English. This was also evident from their behaviour and expressed attitudes. There was **no** difference regarding this attitude between learners in the townships and learners in the ex-Model C schools. It does seem, though, as if the school's policy towards linguistic and cultural diversity has an influence on learners' perceptions of their home language, as the case of Germiston South exemplifies..

Children from highly educated parents and living in the previous 'white' suburbs had greater attitude problems, leading to poorer command of their home language and a lack of interest in it, conceivably on account of their social environment. For example, those from Dinwiddie Primary School. These children could not speak their home language in one full sentence and they claimed that at their homes only English is spoken with their parents. These children even said that they do not know the language and they cannot write it because they have never learnt it at school. Those that started their Grade 1 in the township and joined the ex-model C school later also felt that admitting to know how South Sotho is written is an embarrassment, e.g. Leondale Primary School. They also pretended that they cannot write it, though after being pressurized they wrote quite fairly.

The comprehension test results were more complex than anticipated. It was hypothesized that the ex-Model C learners would do significantly worse than the township learners because of their lack of language skills. First of all, the African language skills of the ex-Model C learners proved to be a function of their home language situation. Learners from lower socioeconomic backgrounds who live in the townships and who are daily exposed to South Sotho had little problem in understanding the text. Learners from higher socioeconomic backgrounds who live in the suburbs, however, struggled. The results also proved to be not only a function of language skills, but also a function of the particular skill to answer a comprehension test. Although the learners of the township schools could understand the South Sotho text, they lacked the skills to do the comprehension test.

A statistical analysis of school results was beyond the scope of this research. The researcher investigated school results to see if it would be immediately clear whether the hypothesis that subtractive bilingualism would negatively affect African learners' scholastic achievement, is supported. This proved not to be the case. We would conclude that other factors such as the socioeconomic status of parents as well as the linguistic diversity of the school obscure the influence of a subtractive bilingual situation. In both Dinwiddie and Leondale the African learners come from a higher socioeconomic background than the white learners, which could explain why African learners are found at all levels of school achievement. In Germiston South, on the other hand, the majority of white learners find themselves in the same subtractive bilingual situation than the African learners, which explains why there is no difference in results. The research is therefore in this respect inconclusive. A much larger sample and statistical analysis would be needed for a conclusive result.

6.2 Recommendations

6.2.1 Attitudes

- Learners must be encouraged by their teachers to be proud of their home languages and to use it in their everyday communication.

- Teachers and learners should be made aware of the dangers of neglecting the home language.
- Learners should be helped to identify with their home language background in order to avoid an inferiority complex or shame about your home language. This is even more so the case with Tsonga and Venda speakers than with speakers of the other African languages.
- African learners in ex-Model C schools should be made aware of the destructive alienating impact of negative attitudes towards people in the townships and their languages. Their common heritage should be emphasized.
- A situation where learners see themselves as better than their parents because they can speak English better, seriously undermine the basic African value of respect for adults and should be parents addressed by schools.
- Teachers of both Nguni and Sotho home languages must be employed in ex-Model C schools so that above attitudes and values can be taught to African learners. This will furthermore help the learners to close the gap between home and school so that they do not see the school as totally foreign from the home environment.
- A challenge is posed to the primary schools who still have white teachers for African languages who cannot even speak the languages they teach. These teachers have nothing to offer to African learners.
- We would further recommend that all schools with African learners should offer the majority African language as a first language subject.
- English as LOLT should be accompanied with the maintenance and continuous development of the home language in an additive context. This recommendation is based on the theoretical principle that L1 and L2 cognitive academic skills are interdependent, or manifestations of a common underlying proficiency. L1 literacy skills can facilitate the overall academic development of those learners who are academically at risk.
- Every effort should be made to promote learners' primary language skills where feasible, because the research discussed in Chapter 2 has shown that "developed conceptual skills in the first language provide a strong foundation for the development of English academic skills" (Cummins 1984:268).
- Parents of learners in the ex-Model C schools should be advised by the schools not to

switch to English in the home. The children should get the opportunity to practice their home language and develop positive attitudes towards their cultural background.

References

Appel, R. and P. Muysken 1987. *Language contact and Bilingualism.* London: Edward Arnold.

Berry, J.W., R. Kalin and D. M. Taylor 1977. *Multiculturalism and Ethnic Attitudes in Canada.* Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada.

Brown, D. 1992. Language and Social History in South Africa: a task still to be undertaken. In R. K. Herbert (ed.) *Language and Society in Africa.* Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Brenzinger, M. 1992. Patterns of language shift in East Africa. In R. K. Herbert (ed.) *Language and Society in Africa.* Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Bathibo, H. M. 1996. Double allegiance between nationalism and Western modernization in language choice: The case of Botswana and Tanzania. In M. Pütz (ed) *Language choices: conditions, constraints, and consequences.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Bruner, J.S. 1975. "Language as an instrument of thought". In A. Davies (ed.) *Problems of language and learning.* London: Heineman.

Bullock Report 1975. *Language for life.* London: HMSO.

Cazden, Courtney 1984. *Effective instructional practices in bilingual education.* Washington D.C.: National Institute of Education.

Chiwome, E. & J. Thondhlana 1992. Sociolinguistics and Education: A survey concerning attitudes on the teaching of Shona through the media of Shona and English. In R.K. Herbert (ed.) *Language and Society in Africa.* Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Clément, R. 1984. "Aspects socio-psychologiques de la communication inter-ethnique et de l'identite' culturelle. *Recherches sociologiques 15:* 293-312.

Clément, R. R.C. Gardner and PIC Smythe 1977. Motivational variables in second language acquisition: a study of francophones learning English. *Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science* 9, 123-133.

Cummins, J. 1995. The discourse of disinformation: the debate on bilingual education and language rights in the United States. In T. Skutnabb-Kangas & R. Phillipson (eds.) *Linguistic Human Rights.* Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.

Cummins, J. 1984. *Bilingualism and special Education: Issues in Assessment and Pedagogy.* Clevedon, Avon: Multilingual Matters.

Cummins, J. 1979. Linguistic interdependence and the educational development of bilingual children. *Review of Educational Research* 49, 222-251.

Cummins, J. and R. Mulcahy 1978. Orientation to language in Ukrainian - English bilingual children. *Child Development* 49: 1239-1242.

Cummins, J. 1976. The influence of bilingualism on cognitive growth: A synthesis of research findings and explanatory hypothesis, *Working papers on Bilingualism* 9: 1-43.

Davies, A. (ed.) 1975. *Problems of Language and Learning.* Londen: Heineman.

De Klerk, V. and B. Bosch 1994. Language attitudes in the Eastern Cape: a tri-lingual survey. *South African Journal of Linguistics*, 12 (2): 50-59.

Dube, N.C. & G. Herbert. 1975a. St. John Valley Bilingual Education Project, prepared for the US Department of Health, education and Welfare under contract. No OEC-0-74-9331, Mimeo (a).

Dube, N.C. and G. Herbert. 1975b. Evaluation of the St. John Valley Title VII Bilingual Education Program, 1970-1975. Madawaska, Maine. Mimeo (b).

Esterhuyse, J. 1986. *Taalapartheid en Skoolafrikaans.* Johannesburg: Taurus.

Fradd, S.H. & Tikunoff, W.J. 1987. *Bilingual Education and Bilingual Special Educaion.* Boston (Mass.): Little, Brown and Company.

Gardner, R.C. and Lambert, W.E. (eds) 1972. *Attitudes and Motivation in Second Language Learning.* Massachusetts: Newbury House.

Hamers, J.F. and M.H.A. Blanc. 1989. *Bilinguality and bilingualism.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Heugh, K. 1995. Language planning and language policy in South Africa. In R Meshtrie (ed) *Language and social history.* Cape Town and Johannesburg: David Phillip.

Herbert, R.K. (ed.) 1992. *Language and Society in Africa.* Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Hodgkin, R.A. 1957. *Education and change.* London: Oxford University Press

Hornby, P.A. (ed.) 1977. *Bilingualism: Psychological, Social and educational Implications.* New York: Academic Press Inc.

Lambert, W.E. 1977. The effects of bilingualism on the individual: cognitive and sociocultural consequences. In Hornby, P.A. (ed), *Bilingualism.* New York: Academic Press Inc.

Mazrui, A.A. 1968. Some sociopolitical functions of English literature in Africa. In Fishman, J.A., C. Ferguson and J. Das Gupta (eds.), *Language problems of developing nations.* New York: Wiley, 183-198.

Mesthrie, R. (ed.) 1995. *Language and social history.* Cape Town and Johannesburg: David Phillip.

Myers-Scotton, C. 1993. *Social motivations for codeswitching.* Oxford: Claredon Press.

Paulston, C. B. (ed.) 1988. *International Handbook of Bilingualism and Bilingual Education.* Connecticut, USA: Greenwood Press, Inc.

Peal, E. and W. E. Lambert 1962. The relation of bilingualism to intelligence. *Psychological Monographs* 76: 1-23.

Phillipson, R. and T. Skutnabb-Kangas 1995. Language rights in postcolonial Africa. In T. Skutnabb-Kangas and R. Phillipson (eds) *Linguistic Human Rights.* Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.

Pütz, M.(ed.) 1992. *Thirty years of linguistic evaluation: Studies in honour of René Dirven on the occasion of his sixtieth birthday.* Amsterdam: J. Benjamins.

Pütz, M. (ed.) 1996. *Language choices: conditions, constraints, and consequences.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Romaine, S. 1989. *Bilingualism.* Oxford: Blackwell.

Ryan, E.C. and H. Giles. (eds.) 1979. *Attitudes towards language variation.* London: Edward Arnold.

Scott, S. 1973. The relation of divergent thinking to bilingualism: Cause or effect. Unpublished research report. McGill University.

Skutnabb-Kangas, T. and R. Phillipson (eds.) 1995. *Linguistic Human Rights.* Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.

Skutnabb-Kangas, T. and J. Cummins (eds.) 1988. *Minority education: from shame to struggle.* Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Slabbert, S. and I. van den Berg 1994. *Language Study. Management Report.* Prepared for the Broadcasting Research Unit of the South African Broadcasting Corporation.

Sommer, G. 1996. Towards and ethnography of language shift: goals and methods. In M. Pütz (ed.) *Language choices: conditions, constraints, and consequences.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Thomason, S.G. and T. Kaufman 1991. *Language contact, Creolization, and Genetic Linguistics.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Tikunoff, W. & J. Vazquez-Faria 1982. SuccessfulInstruction for Bilingual Schooling. Peabody Journal of Education 59, 4: 234-71.

UNIN 1981 Chamberlain, R., A. Diallo, E.J. John: *Toward a language policy for Namibia. English as the official language: perspectives and strategies.* Lusaka: United Nations Institute for Namibia.

Van Vuuren, D. & A. Maree 1994. *Language and Broadcasting in South Africa - A research perspective.* Auckland park: SABC.

Webb, V. 1992a. Language attitudes in South Africa: implications for a post-apartheid democracy. In Pütz, M. (ed) *Thirty years of linguistic evolution.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Webb, V.N. 1992b. *Afrikaans na apartheid.* Pretoria: J.L. van Schaik.

1. The terms L1 and L2 refer to first language and second language. L3 refers to an additional language with little status in the primary school. It is a non-exam subject and learners receive only one or two in lessons per week. Hence the derogative 'third language status'.

APPENDIX

COMPREHENSION TEST

Ba-Pygmies

Ba-Pygmies ba Afrika ke batho ba kgahlang, haholo. Ba phela Afrika bohareng moo pula e leng ngata haholo, tje ka ha badimo ba ne ba etsa kgale-kgale. Ho ne ho bololwe jwalo kgale-kgale hore bo-Pharoah ba Egypt ba ne ba romele masole ho ya hapa ba-Pygmy ba tlo tjeka ditempeleng tsa bona. Ba-Pygmy ba na le talente e makatsang ya ho etsisa-ba bile ba nkuwa e le diswaswi tsa setjhaba-ba etsisa batho bao ba ba tsebang kapa bao ba kileng ba ba bona.

Seemo sa bona

Mo-Pygmy o wela tlasa batho ba Negroid. Ba ba kgutshwane haholo, ba ka ba 135cm ka ho phahama, ba na le maoto a makgutshwane le diphaka tse telele. Mmele ya bona e kwahetswe ke mohete o bobebe. Mmala wa tlalo la bona o fapafapana ho tloha ho brown, reddish, reddish-yellow le yellowish-brown ho isa ho very dark brown. Ba na le difahleho *se kgutshwane tse sephara. Mahlo a bona a bulehile ho lekaneng, ba na le dinko tse kgolo. Dinko tsa bona di bonahala di na le masoba a mararo. Dipounama tsa bona di sesane. Ke batho ba matlafetseng hobane ba kgothetse haholo.

Tulo

Ba Pygmy ba na le merabe e fetang bonngwe. Merabeng eo Ba-Binga le Ba-Mbuti ke bona ba tsebisahalang haholo. Ke tla bua ka ba-Mbuti kaha ba ntse ba phela jwalo ka bo-ntata bona moholo. Ba-Pygmy ba Afrika ba fumaneha merung ya Afrika bohareng moo pula e leng ngata, ho tloha Cameroon le Gabon ka bophirima, ho ya Uganda, Rwanda, Burundi ka botjhabela, ho kenyelletsa Zaire le Congo.

Tikoloho

Ba-Pygmy ba rata meru eo ba phelang ho yona. Ho bona ke tulo e monate, e matlafetseng, e mofuthu. Ba utlwana haholo le meru eo ba e nkang e le bo-mmabona kapa bo-ntatabona. Ho bona meru ke bophelo ba bona kaofela.

Bodulo

Basadi ba aha matlo. Ba sebedisa dithupa tse kobehang, ba di hloma fatshe di etse sedikadikwe se feruweng Ba kwaela dithupa tsena ka mahlaku a maholo. Matlo a kenela pula hape ha a qete nako e telele. Ntlo e ka ba 1,5m ho phahama, le 2m bo isa ho 4m ka bophara. Ntlo e kgolo hantle ho lekana batswadi le bana. Ka nako e nngwe ha lelapa le le leholo, ntlo e ba le dikamore tse pedi.

Ha ba-Pygmy ba batla ho tsamaya, ba siya fela matlo a kgale morao, (ha se hae. .ta ba dulang tulong e le nngwe nako e fetang beke tse pedi) ba ahe e ntjha moo ba ratang teng. Leha ba-Pygmy ba se na matona kapa baeta pele, monnamoholo kampong hangata ke yena a nkang diqeto ka nako ya ho tloha tulong le tulo moo ba tshwanelang ho ya teng.

	1.	2.	
Question: Possible correct answers:	***Hlalosa Ba-Pygmy, hoya ka bolelele, ditho tsa sefahleho, le mmala wa letlalo.*** **Ba bakgutswane haholo, ba ka ba 135cm ka ho phahama.** **Ba na le difahleho tse kgutshwane tse sephara, mahlo a bulehileng ho lekaneng, dinko tse kgolo tse bonahalang eka di na le masoba a mararo, le dipounama tse sesane.** **Mmala wa tlalo la bona o fapafapana ho tloha ho brown, reddish, reddish-yellow le yellowish-brown, le dark-brown.**	***Ba-Pygmy ba fumaneha hokae?*** **Ba fumaneha merung ya Afrika-Bohareng, ho tloha Cameroon le Gabon ka bophirima, hoya Uganda, Rwanda, Burundi ka botjhabela, ho kenyelletsa Zaire le Congo**	***Matlo a bona a ahilwe ka eng?*** **Matlo a bona a ahilwe ka dithupa tse kobehang, tse kwahetsweng ka mahlaku a maholo.**
1. Bopangkgotso	Hlalosa sem sahae hoya ka bolelele sadimeila ditho tsa sefahleho 135 on.	Morung wa Afrika bo hatong ba Zaire Congo	Ba aha ka dithupa tse kobehang ba di hloma fatshe di etse sedikadikwe.
2. Morajaneng	Ba nale sefahleho se setlemmala o mosehla.	Ba Pygamy ba fumaneha Kgauteng	Matlo a bona a ahilwe kadithupatsadifate.

3. Mohaung	Ba bakgutshwane haholo ba ka ba 135 cm, mahlo a bona a bulehile. Dinko tsa bona dikgolo, Dipounama tsa bona di sesane le brown clask, reddish, reddish-yellow, yellowish.	Ba Pygmy ba Afrika ba fumanwa naheng ya Afrika.	Ba Sebedisa dithupa tse kobehang ba di hloma fatshe.
4. Dinwiddie	Bana le difahleho tse kgutshwane tse sephara Mahlo a bona a bulehile ho lekaneng ba na le dinko ste kgolo. Dinko tsa bona di bonahala di na le masoba a mararo. Dipowmama tsa bona di sesane.	Murung wa Afrika, Zaire, Congo, Cameroon, Gabon, Rwanda, Ugunda, le Burundi.	A hilwe ka dithupa ste kobehang die etse sedidikwe se feniweng se tshwanang le dome kapa beelve.
5. Germiston South	Ba ba kgutshwane haholo, ba ka ba 135cm ka phahamo, ba na le mo to a makgutshwane le diphaka tse lelele. Ba-Pygmy ba na le difahleho tse kgutshwane tse sephara. Mahlo a bona a bulehile ho lekaneng, ba na le dinko tse kgolo. Dinko tsa bona di bonahala di na le masoba a mararo. Dipounama tsa bona di sesane. Mmala wa tlalo la bona o fapafapana ho tloha ho brown, reddish, reddish-yellow le yellowish-brown ho isa ho very dark brown.	Ba-Pygmy ba fumaneha merung ya Africa bohateng moo pula e leng ngata, ho tloha Cameroon le Gabon ka Bophirima, ho ya Uganda, Rwanda, Burundi ka Botjhabela, ho kenyelletsa Zaire le Congo.	Matlo a bona a ahilwe ka dithupa tse kobehang le mahlaku a maholo.

6. Leondale	Ba na le difahleho tse kgutshwane tse sephara. Mahlo a bona a bulehile ho lekaneng bana na le dinko ste kgolo. Dinko tsa bona di bonahala di na le masoba a mararo. Dipoumana tsa bona di sesane.	Bafumane ko Uganda, Rwande, Burundi ka bophirima.	Basebedisa dithupa tse di kobehang go aha matlo a bona.

Author:Thombeni, Dunyisiwe Ntombenhle.
Name of thesis:The impact of a subtractive bilingual context on the language attitudes, use and skills of primary school children from the Kathorus area : a

PUBLISHER:
University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg
©2015

LEGALNOTICES:

Copyright Notice: All materials on the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg Library website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be distributed, transmitted, displayed or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

Disclaimer and Terms of Use: Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page)for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the Library website.