

https://dspace.org/

Social protection as an enabler for economic development in the City of Johannesburg

Sidogi, Tshililo

2017

https://hdl.handle.net/10539/26251

Sidogi, Tshililo, (2017) Social protection as an enabler of economic development in the City of Johannesburg, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, https://hdl.handle.net/10539/26251

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

SOCIAL PROTECTION AS AN ENABLER FOR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IN THE CITY OF JOHANNESBURG

STUDENT NAME: TSHILILO SIDOGI

SUPERVISOR: MR DIKGANG MOTSEPE

A research report submitted to the Faculty of Management, University of Witwatersrand, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Management (in the field of Public and Development Sector Monitoring and Evaluation)

October 2017

DEDICATION

To my daughter Vhulenda, you are a perfect gift from God, thank you for your understanding. To my mother, you made it possible. *A vha ntshileli, ndi a livhuwa*. To my father, thank you for teaching me the value of education. To my siblings Tshilidzi, Muthuhadini, Mulalo, Tendani and Tshifhiwa, thank you for your support and encouragement, you all made it bearable.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my supervisor Mr Dikgang Motsepe, thank you for your patience throughout the research. Your support, guidance and encouragement is humbling, God bless you.

Contents

PLAGIARISM DECLARATION 7
ABSTRACT 8
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 9
Chapter 1: Introduction 10
1.1 Background 11
1.2 Problem Statement 12
1.3 Purpose Statement 13
1.4 Research Questions 14
1.5. Thesis outline 14
1.6 Conclusion 14
Chapter 2: Literature Review 15
2.1. Introduction 15
2.2. Historical background of Social Policy 16
2.2.1. Representational theory 17
2.2.2. Explanatory or Analytical theory 17
2.2.3. Normative theory 18
2.3. Emergence of Social Protection Paradigm 19
2.4. Interventions of social protection or poverty-focused policy. 22
2.4.1 Access to productive assets 22
2.4.2 Raising the return on such assets 23
2.4.3 Improving their employment opportunities 24
2.4.4 Basic education and health services 25
2.4.5 Supplementary Transfers 26
2.5. Social Policy Gaps in the Context of Development 28
2.6. Social protection as an instrument of Economic development 29
2.7 The role of institutional arrangements in an organisation 30
2.8 Conclusion 32
Chapter 3: Methodology 33
3.1 Research Approach 33
3.2 Purpose of the study – Exploratory 34
3.3 Research Design 34
3.4. Data Collection Strategy 35
3.4.1 Interviews 35
3.4.2. Sampling strategy and criteria 37
3.4.3 Document Analysis 38

3.5 Data Analysis 38
3.6. Validity and Reliability 40
3.7. Limitations 40
3.8. Ethics 41
3.9. Conclusion 41
Chapter 4: Data Presentation 42
4.1 Introduction 42
4.2 Key Findings 42
4.2.1 Theme 1: Social and Economic development policy integration 42
4.2.2 Theme 2: Key interventions that will lead to economic development of the poor and vulnerable questions 44
4.2.3 Theme 3: Institutional arrangement to drive the programmes / intervention questions and challenges 47
4.4 Conclusion 49
Chapter 5: Analysis and Interpretation of data 50
5.1 Introduction 50
5.2 Theme1: Social and Economic policy integration to enhance the role of Social protection 50
5.2.1 Informal traders' policy 50
5.2.2 Industrialisation policy 51
5.3 Theme 2: Key social protection interventions that will lead to economic development of the poor and the vulnerable 52
5.3.1 Employment guarantee schemes 52
5.3.2 Value chain development 54
5.3.3 Access to micro credit 55
5.3.4 Transport subsidy 56
5.3.5 Income support for retrenched workers 57
5.4 Theme 3: Institutional arrangement to drive the interventions / programmes 57
5.4.1 Proper policy design 57
5.4.2 Allocation of resources and budget 58
5.4.3 Partnership with other government agencies / institutions 58
5.4.4 Research to establish social and economic development link 59
5.5 Conclusion 59
Chapter 6: Conclusion and Recommendations 61
6.1 Introduction 61
6.2 Conclusion 61
6.3 Limitation of the study 62

6.4 Recommendations 62
References 64
Annexure 1 – Interviews Guide 70

PLAGIARISM DECLARATION

I declare that this report is my own, unaided work. It is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Master of Management (in the field of Public and Development sector Monitoring and Evaluation) in the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other university.

Signature: _____ Date: October 2017

(Assumed to be signed if submitted electronically).

ABSTRACT

The study explores the role of social protection in economic development, using the case of the Johannesburg. It argues that despite the city being the largest local economy in the continent; levels of poverty, unemployment and inequality remain high in part because the City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Council's social and economic policies are not synergized accordingly. This is contrary to experiments in East Asian late industrialisation experiences, where social policy was designed as an enabler to economic development, and not as a residual policy aimed solely at creating safety nets.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CoGTA	Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs Department
CoJ	City of Johannesburg
CWP	Community Workers programme
DPW	Department of Public Works
GDSD	Gauteng Department of Social Department
EDD	City of Johannesburg Economic Development Department
EPWP	Expanded Public Works Programme
ESP	Expanded Social Programme
HSRC	Human Sciences Research Council
MGNRGS	Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme
OECD	Organisation of Economic Co-Operation Development
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
SDD	City of Johannesburg Social Development Department
SDBIP	Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan
UNDESA	United Nations Department of Economic & Social Affairs

Chapter 1: Introduction

The 2008/2009 global economic crisis exacerbated the socio-economic challenges of unemployment, poverty and inequality throughout the world, particularly in developing countries such as South Africa, Brazil, India and China. The slow economic growth rates, weak rand dollar exchange and trade deficit makes South Africa extremely vulnerable to economic contraction and recession, affecting mostly the marginalized, vulnerable and poor communities. An integrated approach to social policies and economic development is needed to address these challenges. As Mather's and Slater (2014) pointed out, poverty reduction in countries such as China and India in the last 20 to 30 years was due to economic growth combined with active social policies.

The country is faced with a major challenge of high levels of poverty, unemployment and inequality, all of which collectively threaten the stability of the country. Currently, half of the population lives below the poverty line of $2 per day; the unemployment rate is at 26% (35% using extended definition) and inequality at .60 (one of the worst in the world) (Stats SA 2016). Given South Africa's history of racial discrimination, one third of the country's households (mostly black) are not participating in and benefiting from mainstream economic activities and opportunities (CoJ 2006). Notwithstanding the social gains made by the current government; increasing levels of poverty, unemployment and inequality highlight the need to understand the causes of relative inequality and poverty. This understanding will be critical in the construction of suitable policies aimed at reducing relative poverty, improving labour market activities and narrowing the income gap.

South Africa's social policy adopted by the current government in 1998 has been progressive to an extent, especially in the past five years, leading to a drop in the number of people living in extreme poverty from 12, 6 million people in 2006 to 10.2 million people in 2011 (Statistics SA, 2014). More responsive pro-poor programmes designed to enhance social policy by focusing on economic measures and interventions must be generated. As Mkandawire (2007) argues, a developmental social policy will seek to reconcile economic policies with larger social goals which include nation building, equality; thus ensuring the reproduction of society through family and care policies, and enhancing the productive capacity of citizens with social programmes that are productivist and investment-oriented.

The establishment of investment-oriented benefits of social programmes i.e. social protection, is necessary to overcome the perception that social programmes are unproductive and their expenditures impede economic growth through negative effects on investment incentives and labour market flexibility (Mkandawire, 2007). This perception leads to heavy criticism of the economic role of social programmes while also raising questions of affordability (Midgley and Piachaud, 2013).

In the early 1980s, there was consensus that a social protection system impedes economic development and progress. Market oriented reforms were introduced as well as reduction in social protection spending with devastating consequences of high unemployment and rising inequality in the 1990's. However, research has subsequently proven that social protection programmes have positive effects on economic development. There is a vast body of literature

available on the positive effects of social protection on economic development (see Blank 1994; Midgley, 1999; Rawling, 2005; Kwon, 2009; Midgley and Piachaud, 2013; Piachaud, 2013; Liebbrandt et al 2011; Chibba and Luiz 2011; Slatter and Mathers, 2014; Bhorat et al, 2014. Piachaud, 2013). The primary purpose of social protection, according to this literature, is to reduce poverty, create a more equal society and address high rates of unemployment. However, social protection has also been seen to have positive effects on economic growth through human capital, social investment, local economy and macroeconomic activity (Mkandawire 2007; Piachaud 2013; Mathers and Slater 2014).

Moreover, social protection can be used as an economic stabilizer during economic recession and contraction. As Midgley (2013) pointed out, in post-world war II, social protection was used as an economic stabilizer, minimising exposure to risk and stimulating demand with positive results. This should be done through receptive social protection programmes aimed at creating employment and advancing economic progress to the poor. For developing countries, social protection also plays an important role during shocks such as inflation and natural disasters by limiting policy shifts and strategies that can have negative effects on economic development (Mathers and Slater, 2014).

As Mkandawire (2001) argues, for developing countries at least, "social policy should be transformative, in that, it is intertwined to economic policy that contribute to economic development". Therefore, social protection is a key attribute in advancing economic development in the City of Johannesburg (CoJ) and its programmes should be packaged such that they address unemployment challenges, maintain sustainability during economic contraction and provide long-term economic stability. In the CoJ, social development policies and local economic development policies should be aligned in such a way that they directly reduce poverty and inequality by providing an enabling environment for local entrepreneurs, improve conditions in the informal economy and promote investment and entrepreneurship and improve the participation of the poor in labour markets and aim to make growth more pro-poor (OECD, 2008).

1.1 Background

The City of Johannesburg (CoJ) Metropolitan Municipality is situated in the Gauteng province, the economic hub of southern Africa. Johannesburg has a population of over four (4) million people (Stats SA, 2011). It has an unemployment rate of 25% (Stats SA, 2016), 20% of the residents living in abject poverty and another 40% living in inadequate housing with insufficient municipal services (CoJ, 2011). Income inequality is at 0.67 Gini coefficient Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC, 2013), making it the highest in the country. Even against this backdrop, the city is the biggest contributor to the provincial and national economies, at 45% and 16% respectively (HSRC, 2013).

As the economic hub of the country, the city has the capacity to set a new economic development discourse aimed at advancing economic participation of the poor. It is in this context that this research will map a way for the City of Johannesburg to enhance its social

development policy through social protection that will enhance economic development for the poor and vulnerable.

The Social Development Department in the City of Johannesburg has been mandated to render social assistance programmes which consist of livelihoods and skills development programme, social protection, re-integration of socially excluded, provision of grant and non-financial assistance, advocacy and community mobilisation and regulatory action (CoJ 2015). The social protection programme of the City is guided by the social policy and strategy which focuses on providing discounts for rates and taxes to poor households.

However, CoJ social policy is limited and narrow in that it views social policy as a way of providing safety nets to the community and sidesteps its developmental potential. In addition, its social protection offers benefits flowing from expanded social package enrolment, meaning it provides rebates on City services, food support and social burial (CoJ, 2015). Social policy in the CoJ has to take cognisance of the economic developmental role social protection plays in developing countries through including interventions at local level that will prevent loss of productive capital, accumulate productive assets and increase access to labour market, increase innovation and risk taking and increase investment in human capital (Mathers and Slater, 2015). If social policy is well designed, it can be much more than a safety net and significantly contribute to productive development (Chang, 2002).

The successful economic development of East Asian economies is as a result of strong social policy and institutions which aim to address socio-economic challenges such as poverty, income inequality and job creation. Chang (2002) asserts that social welfare institutions reduce social tensions and enhance the legitimacy of the political system, thus providing a more stable environment for investments. It is therefore the aim of this research to review the role of social policy in economic development and explore the current social policy programmes in the City of Johannesburg can enhance economic development as articulated in the literature (Mkandawire, 2002; Chang, 2002; Piachaud, 2013; Mathers an d Slater, 2014).

1.2 Problem Statement

The dominant sectors of the economy in the city are finance, manufacturing, trade and services (HRSC, 2013). It is estimated that after the economic crisis of 2008/2009, almost 5% of the population lost their jobs and currently 45% of the population are not participating in any economic activities in the city (CoJ, 2015). Household poverty rate is currently at 25% of the 4.4 million people, and unemployment stands at 25% (StatsSA, 2016). Following the recent economic crisis, a preliminary overview of 150 metropolitan economies contained in the Global Metro Monitor report concludes, that: “the Johannesburg metropolitan region holds the unfortunate distinction of being among the few metros outside Europe and the United States that were hit hardest by the recession” (Global Metro Monitor: 2010: 44).

This state of affairs paints a bleak future for the city of Johannesburg. Comprehensive social protection that enables economic progress is needed to mitigate the effects of poor economic

performance and its implications on the poor and marginalised. The Department of Social Development in the City of Johannesburg is responsible for social welfare and development of communities. According to the City of Johannesburg 2015 Social Department Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan (SDBIP), the functions of the Department are (a) livelihood and skills development (b) social protection (c) re-integration of socially excluded (d) provision of grants and non-financial assistance to NGO's and (e) advocacy and community mobilization and regulatory action.

However, all these functions lack the potential for productive economic development. The focus is on the "empowerment of poor as crucial requirement for sustainable solution to poverty and hunger" (CoJ, 2015:2) rather than social and economic development. The functions of the Department are limited in that they exclude programmes that take out people from poverty permanently and enable them to participate in the economy. As Piachaud (2013) notes, social protection interventions depend on the social and economic context in which they operate. Furthermore, the focus is problematic in that it reduces and narrow the role of social policy to that of merely providing safety nets to the poor. Social policy should be regarded as a key mechanism that works in convergence with economic policy to ensure equitable and sustainable development for all communities (Mkandawire, 2001).

The role of economic development does not only rest with the Social Development Department but also with that of Economic Development in the City. The 2015 Economic Development Strategy and policy for the City of Johannesburg lacks the economic development path for the poor and most vulnerable. This, however opened a gap that both social development and economic development policies negate the greater economic development role that can be played by both policies in addressing socio-economic challenges faced by the City. As Mkandawire (2001) asserts, social and economic policy must be intertwined in that they both contribute to economic development of communities. There is a need for integration of both policies, allowing for a holistic approach to establish the role social protection can play as an enabler to economic development the city of Johannesburg.

1.3 Purpose Statement

The purpose of the research study is to examine the integration of social and economic policies with the aim of developing a holistic approach to social protection. In so doing, the study will look into the integration of the social and economic policies and related programmes to enhance economic development of the poor and vulnerable, and the required institutional arrangements required to drive such integration.

The outcome of the research will be a clear understanding of (a) the role of social policy in economic development; (b) the key social policy programmes that must be introduced to enhance economic development in the City of Johannesburg; (c) the institutional arrangements; (d) budget mechanisms that will best support such programmes; and (e) development of key indicators that will indicate a clear link of social policy programmes to economic development.

1.4 Research Questions

Social protection is an enabler for economic development, especially in developing countries. Given the poor economic outlook that exclude the poor and the marginalised from participating in the mainstream economic activities in the City of Johannesburg, the main question is ***how can social protection enable economic development for the poor and vulnerable in the City of Johannesburg?***

The following sub-questions will assist to address the main question, namely:

a) How can social and economic policy be integrated to enhance the role of social protection in economic development?
b) What are the institutional arrangements to drive the integration of the two policies and programme?
c) What are the programmes that will enable economic development for the poor and vulnerable in the City of Johannesburg?

1.5. Thesis outline

The thesis consists of six chapters. *Chapter 1* is an introduction which outlines the research question, aim, objectives, approach, method, and research report structure. *Chapter 2* provides the literature review and theoretical basis for the study, it tracks the key themes, debates and discourse within the Social Protection paradigm. *Chapter 3* is made up of research approach and design for conducting the research. *Chapter 4* presents the data from interviews and document analysis and *chapter 5* provides more in–depth analysis against the findings. *Chapter 6* concludes with recommendations for social policy programmes/interventions that will enable economic development and provide a base for further research.

1.6 Conclusion

This introductory chapter outlined the research background and context. The City of Johannesburg has huge development opportunities that are not being exploited by the government. It is the economic hub of Africa and has the potential for inclusive economic development. Through social protection, the City has potential to cater for everyone's needs including those most marginalised. The City must focus on economic development for communities and citizens thereby opening huge opportunities for the City with big businesses investing in infrastructure and creating jobs that economically benefit everyone and reduce social ills that communities are currently experiencing including high unemployment, inequality and poverty.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

2.1. Introduction

Unemployment, rising levels of poverty and inequality are the triple challenges facing the South African government and society. The causes of these persistent challenges need to be unravelled, if responsive policies are to be generated. Comprehensive economic policy as well as a social policy is fundamental in addressing these challenges. In developing countries, social policy should be transformative, in that it is linked at all times to economic policy that contributes to economic development (Mkandawire, 2004). Like many developing countries, policy makers in South Africa should focus on issues of social and economic development, poverty eradication and equity.

The Bill of Rights in the South African Constitution (1996) guarantees rights to health care services, food and water, adequate housing and social security. Thus, the government must provide basic services to all citizens and introduce proper legislation that will give social and economic assistance to the poor and vulnerable. This is called social protection, understood as "all public and private initiatives that provide income or consumption transfers to the poor, protect the vulnerable against livelihood risks and enhance the social status and rights of the marginalised; with the overall objective of reducing the economic and social vulnerability of poor, vulnerable and marginalised groups". (Devereux and Sabates-Wheeler, 2004: 3)

In 2008, the City of Johannesburg introduced an Expanded Social Package Policy (ESPP) aimed at providing relief to the poor through a basket of social benefits based on the level of poverty. The policy is an eligibility mechanism and operational structure for poverty-targeting subsidies and services delivered by and in collaboration with the City of Johannesburg. It is against this background that the following literature review will give a historical background of social policy, followed by a brief explanation of social protection paradigm from the mainstream social policy. Section B will give a theoretical framework of interventions of social policy or poverty-focused policy. Section C will identify social policy gaps in the context of development and conclude by emphasising the importance of social protection as an instrument of social policy and economic development in developing countries.

2.2. Historical background of Social Policy

Market instability and price changes can have different effects on the poor, making it government's responsibility to protect the poor and the vulnerable against economic decline and market shocks. Responses to the great depression from 1929 – 1939 emphasised the role of the government in governing the markets. Part of these responses came in the form of a great expansion of social services (welfare) in a number of Western countries during the middle 20th century through social policy. The most notable example of social policy models were the Nordic (emphases economic development and social policy); the Bismarckian (which focuses on industrialisation and nation building); the Beveridgean (advocates social insurance and full employment); and the Nationalist (economic development post colonisation) (Adesina, 2012). The scope and relevance of these social policy models were widely debated in developing countries. As Midgley (2012) puts it, "the debate intensified as programmes expanded to developing countries and issues affecting funding, goals, administration and coverage were raised". As a result, the Washington consensus introduced the so-called "structural adjustment programmes" in the late 1970 and early 80's in developing countries as arguably a way of protecting the poor against poverty.

The structural adjustment programmes introduced by the World Bank for alleviating poverty in early 80's are deemed a failure, especially in underdeveloped countries such as Mozambique and Madagascar. They failed because they left economic development in the hands of international aid partners, and delinked it from social policy, which was seen to be the sole purview of the state. As Kwon et al (2009) note, public programmes for education and social programmes were reduced to minimal levels in many sub-Saharan African countries. This was followed by social dimensions of adjustment launched in 1987 which involved the use of 'safety nets' to address the 'social costs' of adjustment (Adesina, 2012). Furthermore, strategies targeting poverty such as the poverty reduction strategy papers were introduced by the World Bank and showed little evidence of turning the tide of severe impoverishment. "Between 1981 and 2005, in sub-Saharan Africa, an additional 176 million people fell into destitution, bringing the total to 388 million people" (UNDESA, 2009:16). This brought into light the need for a social policy that will address socio-economic development.

Kennet (2013) placed globalisation at the forefront of issues influencing social policy today. Three types of social policy theories that influence decision making on social policy identified by Hall and Midgley (2004) are briefly explained below.

2.2.1. Representational theory

This theory classifies and reduces complex social policy phenomenon to manageable categories that allow for different social policy approaches. It consists of the residual model which places individual explanations on social problems and responsibility on the individual, and the institutional model which refers to providing universal services for the whole population (Hall and Midgley, 2004). Representational theory supplements family, voluntary sector and markets when institutions fail to meet social needs. It also advocates the frontline role that promotes universal coverage and extensive social service. This was further echoed by the Bretton Woods institutions that reduced social policy to a measure of poverty reduction (Kwon et al, 2009).

In contrast to this view, Mkandawire (2001) argues that social policy in developing countries or late industrializers should not be conceptualised as residual 'safety nets' designed to counter policy failures. This means social policy must aim to protect citizens from social contingencies, poverty and illness and to enhance social justice through redistribution. Social policy, in cases of successful late industrialisation such as the Asian Tigers and the Nordic region, has been intrinsic to economic development (Kwon at el, 2009).

2.2.2. Explanatory or Analytical theory

Explanatory theory deals with the nature, social function and reasons for the evolution of social policies. It emphasised the role of industrialisation in the extension of social welfare by governments and the critical role played by interest groups in fostering such expansion (Hall and Midgley, 2004). This was echoed by the Bismarckian model anchored on the objectives of industrialisation, nation-building and the weakening of the working class (Adesina, 2012). Thus, social policy is a response to industrialisation, with the latter accounting for new social risks. However, critics of this model note that it lacks proper institutions to drive the industrialisation. However, as Kwon, at el (2009) explained, the key for this model is not the timing itself but rather the strategic policy choice. This means strategic policy that aims to utilise social policy potential for economic development must be introduced.

Industrialisation is an important component of economic development. As Kwon et al (2009) asked, can social policy be conducive to economic development in the developing countries? The research done by the United Nations Institute for Social Development (UNIRSD) in late industrialising regions found that "in Nordic countries, social policy was used as a policy instrument for overall strategy of economic development which resulted in the developmental welfare state" (Kwon et al, 2009: S9). While in contrast, "East Asian and Latin American countries maintained the selective nature of the developmental state during industrialization period" (Kwon et al, 2009: S9)). This means developing countries should use social policy as an instrument for economic development thereby ensuring social cohesion and broad-based economic development.

2.2.3. Normative theory

Normative theory provides for social policy a value framework (Hall and Midgley, 2004), where social policies' desirability is linked to specific political imperatives, ideological biases and resulting value propositions. The post-world war II consensus between political parties was that governments should take charge of various social programmes including education, housing, health care, and social security. Thus, governments should increase their social expenditure and investment. In contrast, those on the political right argued that social expenditure was the cause for economic stagnation (*ibid*). As Okun (1975, cited in Mkandawire, 2004) points out, social protection is seen as compromising economic efficiency. Thus, economic strategies of social policy should be designed to increase social spending and efficiency. Mkandawire (2004) summed the debate by saying governments need to adopt developmental (economically) and inclusive (socially) development strategies.

Over the years, normative policy has been characterised by three policy traditions as identified by Hall and Midgley (2004). The first one is a statist (top-down) approach which involves central state as the main actor and target households through welfare services. The social policy implications for this approach are that it leads to an increase in beneficiaries on the South and welfare state on the North (*ibid*).

The second is the enterprise approach which involves markets targeting individual citizens. Social policy implications are that it leads to residualism, safety nets, and means testing for targeting beneficiaries and privatisation due to monopoly of the markets (*ibid*).

The third one is the populist (bottom-up) approach which involves the people where the main actors are the community members. The implications for social policy are that it leads to community development, communitarism, and the passing of indigenous knowledge from one generation to the other (*ibid*). However, there is a holistic approach to social policy which includes the state, international development institutions, private business sector and civil society. This approach involves individuals, households, community enhancement, human capital and building social cohesion and combating poverty. Social policy implications are that it provides basic social services (e.g. education, health), social security such as cash transfers and grants, and offers sustainable livelihoods support through employment opportunities (*ibid*).

Combining insights from the three theories can improve our historical understanding of the development of social policy and inform policy makers, particularly in the global south, on how to construct social policies that will address issues of economic growth, group mobilisation, institutional processes and cultural and ideational factors (Kpesaa and Beland, 2013). This is also echoed by Mkandawire (2004) who defines social policy as an ensemble of interventions directly that invariably transform social welfare (livelihoods and income), institutions (rules of the game) and relations (intra-household relations – class, gender, race, etc.). Social welfare encompasses access to adequate and secure livelihoods and income. It is now widely recognised that these are important determinants of economic development, which, in turn, facilitates achievement in these areas (Mkandawire, 2001).

2.3. Emergence of Social Protection Paradigm

Definition of social protection is widely debated in academia and among development partners and is often used interchangeably with social security (Midgley, 2013; Barrientos, 2013; Piachaud, 2013). The United Nations Research Institute for Social Development defines social protection as an important element of social policy, and allows for prevention, management, and mitigation against situations that affect negatively the well-being of people. These situations include, but are not limited to illness, old age, unemployment, and natural disasters (UNRISD, 2010). In addition, Cook and Kwon (2007) refer to social protection as a combination of collective actions, programmes and activities that aim to protect people against risks, these interventions could include state's social policies, firm level welfare programmes, community welfare efforts and intra-family assistance.

Social protection (as opposed to social security) applies widely, including interventions as varied as training (enhancing access to work opportunities), capabilities building (access to

decision making structures), and food (Taylor, 2012). However, Adesini (2011) argues that social protection paradigm narrows the vision of social policy and is a more regressive version of liberal social policy regime within a methodological framework that isolates the problem of vulnerability from the broader systematic 'cumulative causative' process creating it. Thus, the focus should rather be on how to improve and better social policy than narrowing it to social protection interventions.

Midgley (2012) explained that social protection, particularly in the global South, is used as a poverty alleviation strategy and an important thrust of development policy. Furthermore, social protection includes social insurance schemes covering life courses and employment risk, social assistance programmes addressing poverty and vulnerability and labour market and employment policies (Barrientos at el, 2013). Therefore, there is no single variant of social protection but a variety of interventions which include housing provision, enhanced access to education and health care services, public works programmes, and subsidies and allowances (Omilola and Kaniki, 2014). All these programmes and interventions, if properly managed and implemented, can highly reduce socio-economic challenges in developing countries.

As Norton at el (2001) notes, social protection has however been largely neglected, or addressed only with inappropriate tools, in the majority of poor countries, where emphasis has been placed instead upon the primacy of economic growth. Thus, there has been a trade – off of social and economic development of the most vulnerable societies and economic growth which lead to huge inequalities in these poor countries.

The following are some of the functions of Social Protection noted by Taylor (2012):

Protective function – it is widely accepted that social policy's main role is to protect the society, in particular the poor from shocks and imbalances of the market. The government must therefore, introduce measures that will protect the poor from hunger and poverty by providing basic goods and services such as cash transfers and food packages. Thus, social protection save lives and reduce the levels of deprivation. Examples of such measures are the social grant system in South Africa and the National Food Security Programme (NFSP) in Ethiopia. Both these programmes have fundamentally contributed to poverty reduction.

Preventative function – "the most obvious effect of social protection is that it redistributes income between members of society" (Piachaud, 2013:24). Thus, measures must be taken to help people avoid sinking deeper into poverty, and mitigate against increased vulnerability. This includes disability grants and social insurance. Disability grants are offered to people with

disability who cannot work for themselves. Social insurance however, is for contingencies such as retirement, unemployment or sickness and in some countries, crop failure. An example is the Previdencia Social Rural introduced in Brazil in 1993. It provided social assistance to workers in informal sectors and those employed in agriculture, fishing and mining. As Barrientos, at el (2013) puts it, the design of Previdencia Social Rural reflected efforts to include informal workers in the social insurance system however, researchers describe this scheme as 'partially contributory' because on paper there are contribution requirements that apply to the benefits but were never applied practically.

Promotive function – most countries in the global South are battling with high unemployment, in particular among the youth. It is therefore the government's role in enhancing individual, community, and institutional capabilities to participate in economic development and employment opportunities. These include measures to ensure employment through public works programmes, rural development agriculture development. The South African Public Works Expanded Programme and India's National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme are some of the examples.

Transformative function – critics of adjustment programmes by the World Bank such as Mkandawire (2001; 2007) and Adesina (2009) argue that the programmes lacked transformation aspects that would ensure the reduction of inequalities and vulnerabilities through shifts in policy, legislation, resource allocation and redistributive interventions. As Mkandawire (2007) notes, much emphasis of social protection is on redistribution, overlooking its transformative role. Thus, while social assistance programmes are instrumental in reducing poverty and inequality, the government must ensure their development outcomes include economic, social and political measures.

In contrast, Adesina (2011) argues that there is a tendency to reduce social policy into social protection, and further notes that social protection presents a set of problematic assumptions, norms and policy practices. These include the fact that policy transfer and learning is in its nature very problematic; the disconnect between economic and social policy; the preference for tests and targeting; and the neoliberal underpinnings of social protection. All these result in a reduced version of social policy (Adesina, 2011:455).

Therefore, government must construct a social policy with a variety of social programmes that will focus on production, protection, reproduction, redistribution, economic development and social cohesion. As Mkandawire (2007, 1) puts it:

> "In the context of development, one must add a vital issue of production, thus social policy can be innovation-enhancing, through its effects on human capital and skill formation; its capacity to alleviate risk and uncertainty by underpinning the social pacts necessary for managing the contractual nature of labour markets; its incorporation of labour into the saving-investment regime and induce long-term perspectives in the financial sector and its contribution to political stability".

The key is a developmental social policy which consists of social programmes as an instrument that will work together with economic policy to ensure equitable and sustainable development.

2.4. Interventions of social protection or poverty-focused policy.

A social policy should address all concerns of social development and shift away from the concept of just providing safety nets and social insurance. While social protection is seen as a social policy intervention; it must protect, prevent, promote, transform and develop social and economic conditions of the poor by providing income, food, health and education relief, protect the vulnerable against livelihoods risks and enhances their social status and rights. Weiss (1995) identified the following five approaches to protecting the poor and vulnerable, namely:

2.4.1 Access to productive assets

As a factor of production, land in South Africa remains a contentious issue. Poverty in South Africa is structural, thus majority of the poor are black Africans as a consequence of colonialism and apartheid. Furthermore, the rich (minority whites) are the ones who own almost 80% of the land and the poor remain landless 21 years into democracy. Thus, land redistribution is critical in addressing poverty. De Soto (2000) recently called for land tenure and property rights for the poor as global measure to reduce poverty and underdevelopment. He argues that poor people are sitting with dead capital (assets, land and informal business) that must be formalised and used to produce capital and investment and access to credit. This, he further argues, will remove the poor from the informal economy and place them into the formal economy where they will trade and invest in the property markets, thus contributing to reducing poverty and inequality in developing countries.

As Weiss (1995:) notes the poor are generally characterised by lack of productive assets, other than their own labour power, so improved access to land and credit is an obvious strategy to improve their position. This means the poor must be given land to utilise as a means of

production in agriculture, forestry, manufacturing and mineral resources. In rural areas, land redistribution can make a significant impact on poverty alleviation. They are, however, land reform regulations currently considered by the government that will see most of the land return to its indigenous people.

Kingwill et al (2005) echoes Weiss (1995) and De Soto (2000), noting that inherited property ownership patterns are constraining to poverty alleviation. They suggest that poverty reduction policies must therefore centre on large-scale redistribution programmes. Taylor (2012) also indicated that asset poverty should be addressed through proper and adequate housing, land reform, own production (micro initiatives for sustained livelihoods) training and re-training of semi-skilled and unskilled workers in line with shortages of skills in the labour market and access to credit facilities to start their own enterprises.

2.4.2 Raising the return on such assets

Investment in the assets of the poor will not automatically raise the return to the assets, therefore, government must introduce appropriate measures. Investment and provision of infrastructure to the poor, as producers, allows them to expand production (Weiss, 1995). Thus, the poor in rural and informal areas are located in areas with poor roads infrastructure, and inadequate water and power services. As Weiss (1995) pointed, infrastructure expenditure that serves the needs of the poor should become a priority item for any government. Taylor (2012) states that government should assist the poor to build economic and social assets through programmes like broad based economic empowerment (BBBEE).

In rural areas, investment in agriculture is one of the measures that enable rural poor to earn income through agricultural products. For example, in Malawi, the government has successfully used funding grants to smaller farmers to ensure broader rural development and food security. Number of measures has been introduced since 1998 which include Starter Pack Scheme (SPS) Targeted Input Programme and Agriculture Input Subsidy Programme (AISP) (Jacobs at el, 2010). Reports indicate that the programme has contributed significantly to macroeconomic growth of the country (GDP average of 8%) and a good performance of the agricultural sector in the 2005/2006 and 2006/2007 (Jacobs et al, 2010). This means that investment in agriculture development in rural areas has positive effects on small agriculture farmer's productivity, improvement on food productivity and reduction on food insecurity and hunger.

2.4.3 Improving their employment opportunities

Over the course of the history, better livelihoods have been secured through employment and today, majority of people are participants in labour market and recipients of wage employment. However, developing countries are characterised by high unemployment and poverty. Thus, majority of poor people are excluded from participating in the labour market. Levels of participation in the labour market are determined by levels of potential and/or capacity resulting from deliberate investment in human capital and related institutions (Mkandawire, 2004). Thus, the government must aggressively invest in programmes that benefit the vulnerable and position its institutions in such a way that employment is created for the poor.

Furthermore, the government must introduce employment creation programmes where productive assets or marketable goods are produced and employment opportunities are given to the poor. A good example of this programme is the Department of Public Works' (DPW) Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP) which provides poverty and income relief through temporary work for the unemployed to carry out socially useful activities. The programme creates employment through expenditure on goods and services in four sectors, namely infrastructure, environment, non-state and cultural and social sectors.

Through this programme, the unemployed and poor are given working opportunities through projects in and around their communities. Thus, if the government is building a road in a rural area, community members are employed and trained for the duration of the projects. This is another way of transferring the skills and experience to the unemployed and increasing their chances of finding a job or starting their own businesses. At the end of the programme, participants must be given a certificate of completion indicating the training received.

The impact of employment creation programmes appears mixed (Weiss, 2005). Through EPWP, the Department of Public Works indicated that one million jobs were created between 2004 and 2008, however, not much effect on unemployment was made, rather unemployment increased throughout this period. However, the programme did have positive effects in reduction of poverty and transferring income to the poor communities (DPW, 2008). The report notes that EPWP has enabled households to move above the poverty line.

The level of wages that should be offered on such schemes is a matter of controversy. Thus if the poor are to seek employment on such programmes, then the argument is that the wage

should be below private opportunity cost, however, if the programme is intended to be income-generating, then the wage should be sector related for unskilled or semi-skilled labour.

In India, the government introduced the National Rural Government Guarantee (NREG) in 2006. The primary goal of the scheme is to guarantee unskilled employment (of a hundred days at least) for at a minimum of one adult member of a poor households from the unemployment register. As Jacobs at el (2010) noted, the programme is said to have created more jobs in a small number of that country's poorest districts compared to such previous public works programmes (e.g. MegsMaharashrta Employment Guarantee Scheme (Megs)).

Another illustration of successful employment schemes as a form of social protection was in form of social insurance introduced in Brazil in 1993, which provided social insurance benefits to workers in informal employment in agriculture, fishing and mining. This ensured that the poor who are employed in the informal sector will continue to receive income even after they are unemployed. Thus, the design of the Previdencia Social Rural reflected efforts to include informal workers in the social insurance system (Barrientos et al, 2013), thereby extending their social security net.

2.4.4 Basic education and health services

An overlooked role of social policy is the development aspect it plays in reproduction. Its effects on child mortality and child spacing resulting from education interventions for women and access to health services including child planning have been widely documented (Mkandawire, 2011). As Mkandawire (2011) puts it, social policy can affect levels of labour participation by removing impediments to their involvement in labour markets. Thus, the emphasis on human development capabilities must be prioritised by government through provision of free education and health services. However, Weiss (1994) notes if the poor are given free or close to free education and health facilities, the non-poor should meet some or all of the costs of the services they receive.

Recently, there has been a shift by governments in the Global South to increase their social expenditure, particularly in education and health. In South Africa, approximately 50% of the social budget goes to education and health services. As results, education and health lower the cost of labour and encourage participation in the labour market. As such, education and health expenditure is a social wage to the poor (Mkandawire, 2007). Thus, people can be fully

employed in the job market and raising the efficiencies required for economic growth (Jabobs et al, 2010).

African countries made significant progress in the provision of education and health. In Rwanda, according to the law, all Rwandans, those in formal and informal sectors, must be covered by health insurance. Those in the formal sector are covered by the medical insurance and those in informal sector are covered by the community based health scheme (CBHC). As of 2010, CBHI schemes covered 91% of the population (Omilola and Kaniki, 2014).

Free basic education is provided for the first nine years of school and poor and vulnerable students study for free at secondary school. Genocide survivor assistance fund also provides free education to genocide survivors and dependents. However, school feeding scheme is provided in partnership with foreign aid (Omilola and Kaniki, 2014). South Africa, Kenya, and Ethiopia are some of the countries that provide feeding schemes to schools.

2.4.5 Supplementary Transfers

Social protection must among other things protect the poor against loss of income or unemployment. As indicated in earlier sections, this places a huge burden on the government who must now ensure the distribution of income through supplementary transfers such as cash transfers, food security programmes, conditional cash transfers, subsidies on basic services such as water and electricity (Devereux, 2013).

Many developing countries have a supplementary cash transfer depending on the social and political conditions. However, the number of such programmes to be implemented are constrained. When designing supplementary programmes, the issues of coverage, universalism or targeting must be considered. As Pauw and Mncube (2007) put it, the political economy decisions on instruments for resource redistribution, and affordable levels of social expenditure become critical against the backdrop of budget constraints. Universal transfers are given everyone, all members of society are eligible. The universalism approach is regarded financially unsustainable. Weiss (1994) notes that experience has shown that universalism approach has been expensive in terms of government revenue and relatively inefficient because of leakages that often go to well off consumers. The advantage, however, is that universal transfers stigmatise no one and lower administrative costs.

In contrast, the targeting approach has an appeal at a time of financial stringency. However, it involves various administrative complexities (Pauw and Mncube, 2007). One method of

targeting is means testing done based on the poverty or income level to assess who qualifies for transfers. Means testing can be administratively complex, but advisable in instances of high administrative capacity and where the benefits outweigh the costs (*ibid*). As Mkandawire (2007) explains, targeting is constrained by administrative challenges in poor countries where informal sector is dominant and state capacity for monitoring is low. Another challenge of targeting is that there is a risk of not adequately reaching the poor, thus the rich can gain unfairly if the targets are not representative. Targeting channels resources to the poorest members of society, with greater impact. Different targeting strategies do produce different outcomes. Thus, failure to cover the poor has consequences far greater than covering the rich. As Weiss (1994) argues, this implies that targeting must be sufficiently broad-based to minimise the errors of undercover.

A well-documented example of targeted cash transfers is the South African social assistance programme with approximately 16,780,448 million beneficiaries. As the World Bank (2014) notes, social spending in South Africa is able to lift the income of the poorest decile more than 10 fold because of programmes such as old age pension, free basic services, child support grant, and disability grants. For example, 54% of health and education spending goes to the bottom 50% of the poor (World Bank, 2014). However, it has been well documented that social grants have been instrumental in lifting millions out of poverty but the programme is unable to reverse inequality trends and reduce unemployment through the provisioning of equal opportunities to all South Africans (Mabugu et al 2006, Van der Berg, 2006).

To minimise the errors of undercover, there are often conditions attached to transfers. In recent years, conditional cash transfers have become popular, and offered to households targeted with conditionalities (Pauw and Mncube, 2007). However, conditional cash transfers have added the administrative task of monitoring recipients to make sure they comply with the conditions. A well-known example is of conditional cash transfer is the Brazilian Bolsa Escola which was introduced in 2001 and provided cash transfers to mothers that should ensure their children continue to attend school. In 2003 it was combined with another transfers programme to form Bolsa Familia and extended coverage to over twelve million poor families (Hoefer and Midgley, 2012).

Research done on the programme suggests that the programme has reduced poverty and helped promote human capital (*ibid*). Furthermore, the effects of Bolsa Familia found that the programme targeted 80% of families under the poverty line and accounted for 21 percent of

decrease in inequality. Another example that can be cited is the Mexican Progresa and Oportunidades which provides cash transfers linked to school attendance and regular clinic check-ups.

2.5. Social Policy Gaps in the Context of Development

Social policy in developing countries has been characterised by structural adjustment programmes and poverty strategies by the World Bank and international aid by development partners in a bid to reduce poverty. However, instead of bringing relief to the poor, this approach deepened poverty. As Kwon et al (2012) puts it, the adjustments programmes and poverty strategies anchored on the argument that state intervention in social policy is bad for economic development. Thus, the role of social policy in economic development however, has been overlooked in the past by development institutions and their development partners. As a result, public institutions were left undeveloped and in the process, state capability declined (*ibid*). Thus, there is a need to rethink the relation between social policy and economic policy as they are interdependent and interrogate the role of social policy in development context or in a developmental state.

Social policy literature in the global south is poorly conceptualised, lacking in theoretical rigour and depth, where social policy is seen as the welfare state. However, as Adesina (2012) puts it, social policy extends beyond state intervention. Mkandawire (2001) notes a few impediments of social policy in developing countries.

The first impediment is the prioritisation of economic policy at the expense of social development. In developing countries, there is a tendency of making economic policies based on a leader/follower model. Thus, "macroeconomic policy (stability and growth) is determined first and social policy is left to address the social consequences" (Atkinson, 1999) cited in Mkandawire (2001). This results in social policy regressing instead of being progressive therefore, the balance between welfare measures and economic growth policy must be achieved through social development policies. The recent interest in growth economics recognises that social development has positive effects on economic development. Thus, a holistic approach that harnesses the relationship between social and economic development must be a core and main goal of any social policy.

The ambiguous role of social policy in imperfect markets is the second impediment (Mkandawire, 2001). This means that there is a need to understand the relationship between

micro-level benefits of social policy and macro economy implications. However, a study done by Piachaud (2013) found that human capital formation and investment and innovation on local economy have positive effects on both local economy and macro-economy. This means that what happens at a micro level has implications for macro-economic policies. Therefore, social policy must not be designed as a residual measure to cater for social needs but rather, as a key component of policies that ensures own sustainability (Mkandawire, 2001).

2.6. Social protection as an instrument of Economic development

It is critical for developing countries to establish a good relationship between economic development and social protection by using social policy as a vehicle for economic development. Social policy has previously been relegated and blamed for negative consequences of free market and growing inequalities because social policy lagged behind economic transformation (De hann, 2013). Developing countries need pro-active social policy that builds on the notion productivity or developmentalist social protection that will not only offer economic development but also protect poor people who are often left outside state social policy. This can be achieved through long term development of active social policy meaning a congruent development of markets, public policy and institutions (*ibid*).

One critical complication of social policy is social expenditure and being part of global markets, which can mean a push of neo-liberalism that limit space for proactive social policy which requires huge public spending. As De haan (2008) pointed out, without stronger effective institutions, public spending tends to be regressive in developing countries despite targeted social programmes. Social protection programmes require huge budgets and it is imperative for developing countries to ensure that such programmes do not impose fiscal constraints.

The economic development of the East Asian countries in the past half century cannot be ignored. Their development was able to grow the economy, offer employment opportunities and increase the human development index according to the UNDP. This development is mainly credited to strong and effective social policy and institutions. As Cook and Kwon (2007) pointed out, social policy did prove to be one of the most effective policy instruments during the period of high economic growth in countries such as South Korea, Taiwan and Singapore. For it to be successful, social policy needs to sustainable in that it is formulated as part of transformative economic policy so that it can be beneficial to communities and markets (De hann, 2013). During recession, these countries were able to protect their most vulnerable populations by intervention that include state social policies, firm level welfare programmes,

community welfare efforts and intra-families assistance (Cook and Kwon, 2007). The success of these interventions was based on the fact that they were constructed with the aim of economic development of communities rather than poverty alleviation.

Emerging markets are experiencing rapid influx into urban areas and large scale immigration that increases the urban population, with the United Nations (2011) estimating that more than half of world population lives in urban areas. The Chinese economic miracle is credited mainly to its urban share population which grew from 17 % to 40% between 1975 and 2005 (De hann, 2011). Most successful development cases of social protection have been associated with urbanisation and industrialisation overriding social net and poverty alleviation policies (*ibid*). By contrast, migration and urbanisation also lead to high rates of labour movements and inequalities (Cook and Kwon, 2007). As more and more people flock into the cities, they form part of informal labour force which is not stable. They need to be included in labour schemes that will offer sustainable employment to limit their movement. This raises questions about choices of promoting economic development while providing social protection programmes and containing labour movement in urban areas. As Cook and Kwon (2007) mentioned, employment should be viewed as a complement and core dimension to social protection and types of employment should be created considering economic conditions facing developing countries.

2.7 The role of institutional arrangements in an organisation

Intuitional arrangements play a major role to ensure that the institutional and environment structures are organised to implement successful programmes and interventions. Thus, institutional theory maintains that organisational structures can be fully developed through legitimised processes that not only improve service delivery but helps ensure organisation survival and increased performance (Meyer and Rowan, 1977). However, institutional arrangements must be done with caution as it sometimes render the role of its organisation ineffective and impede performance. To continuously improve the performance of an organisation, proper systems and processes that enhance performance must be adopted.

According to Peters (2000), there are three basic approaches to institutional arrangement, namely (a) normative approach; (b) rational choice intuitionalism; and (c) historical institutionalism. All these approaches apply to different institutions and disciplines meaning that each organisation must choose an approach that is applicable to its own unique structure.

Adoption of a suitable approach does not only improve performance but was also found to improve high level of consensus and cooperation which results in innovative and stable institutions (Tolbert and Zucker, 1983).

2.7.1 Normative Approach

This approach argues that the best way to understand an institution's behaviour is through the logic of appropriateness that individuals acquire through their membership in organisations (Peters, 2000). This means that institutions can be considered as embedding rules and routines that define what constitutes appropriate action and norms and formal rules of institutions will shape the actions of those acting within them (Ahmed, 2015). However, this type of approach can make members feel excluded due its embedded rules and values.

2.7.2 Rational Choice Institutionalism

This approach advocates that institutions are arrangements of rules and incentives and that members behave in response to those basic components of institutional structure (Peters, 2000). This approach argues that individuals must be encouraged to reach their full potential, thus "if correct payoff matrix is selected, then the desired outcome can be engineered" (Ahmed, 2015:23). He further explained that this particular model is derived from economic model of cooperation, meaning when one party is better off but no one is made worse off. This approach can be used to negotiate the integration of social protection and economic development in the city of Johannesburg. Thus, there must not be a trade-off between social development and economic development as both departments are critical in dealing with the scourge of poverty, unemployment and inequality.

2.7.3 Historical Institutionalism

The argument of this approach is that policy and structural choices made at the inception of the institution will have persistent influence over its behaviour for the remainder of its existence (Peters, 2000:3). Thus, it gives us a clear picture of both the origin of an institution and the path by which it has undertaken over the years. As Ahmed (2015) notes, for an institution to succeed using this approach, there must be common shared values and meaning among members of the institution.

There is no right or wrong approach to institutional arrangement in any organisation and all the three basic approaches give us useful tools for organisational analysis. As Ahmed (2015) indicated, the institutional setting in which policies are formulated are of crucial significance.

However, for an institution to have a strong and capable institutional arrangement that will drive implementation of social protection and economic development programmes, a combination of the above approaches can be adopted.

2.8 Conclusion

From the literature above, positive impacts of social policy in developing countries are quite evident, however debates around what constitutes social protection needs more clarity to enable policy makers in developing countries to construct appropriate policies and programmes to implement. The models or theories of social policies form the basis of the roles of social policy. The holistic normative theory is of key preferences. It aims to provide social services and protect the citizens from poverty and illness. However, it lacks the productive and economic development of society. As Kwon et al (2009) puts it "It is fair to say that taking advantage of the instrumental nature of social policy in economic development, while enhancing social solidarity by providing social protection and making economic development more broad-based is certainly one of the most important factors to incorporate in the development strategy".

Social protection, this paper argues, is an instrumental part of normative social policy. Its interventions, however, must take into account each country's history and developmental context. The effects of social protection on economic development cannot be ignored. There is a need to bring the role of social policy into economic development by integrating social and economic policy and developing programmes and interventions for considering the most effective way to enable the poor and vulnerable access to economic activities and opportunities. Social protection intervention in the global South must contain more functions than the intrinsic goal of protection and social justice (Mkandawire, 2004). Therefore, its function must be extended to include economic development interventions in production, industrialization, enterprise development and participation in the labour market.

Chapter 3: Methodology

Methodology refers to ways in which one conducts an inquiry or a study. It is concerned more with "how we know" than specific techniques for gathering and examining data (Neuman, 2013). It consists of three philosophical schools of thought, namely positivist social science, interpretive social science and critical social science (*ibid*). The research adopted interpretive social research which emphasizes meaningful social action, socially constructed meaning and value relativism. The research approach, design, purpose and data collection methods are leaning towards interpretative social research because it seeks explore social protection interventions intended to take the poor and vulnerable from poverty to economic development.

The methodology chapter will outline how the research project was conducted, where data was sourced and who the participants were. It will also outline how the sourced data will be presented and analysed into verified information. The research methodology section consists of research approach, design and purpose, sampling strategy and criteria, validity, reliability, limitations to research, ethics to be considered when conducting social research, data collection method that the research will take/adopt and analysis of the results.

3.1 Research Approach

Research approaches are plans and procedures that set out the steps from broad assumptions to detailed methods of data collection, analysis and interpretation. Creswell (2003) notes that the three research approaches are qualitative, quantitative and mixed research methods. The research will be qualitative in nature, meaning it will collect information in the form of words by exploring a social phenomenon (Wagner, 2012). This will entail "a detailed and systematic examination of the contents of a particular body of material for the purpose of identifying patterns, themes, or biases" (Leedy and Ormrod, 2010: 144). The particular body of material to be explored will consist of a number of policies, strategies, funding models, programmes and reports that have been introduced to mitigate the effects of unemployment, poverty and inequality in the City of Johannesburg.

Qualitative study involves sampling, collection of open-ended data, analysis and representation of text, pictures, tables and figures and finally interpretation of the findings by the researcher

(Creswell, 2013). For the present study, qualitative research was found to be most appropriate as it involves in-depth understanding of a phenomenon, analysis of data collected through open-ended interviews and documents. The researcher, interpreted and analysed the findings. Quantitative approach was not adopted as it focuses more on numerical data and is thus not suitable for this study as it is more appropriate for examining the relationship between variables and testing theories (Creswell, 2013).

3.2 Purpose of the study – Exploratory

Research either explores a new topic, describe a social phenomenon or asks why something occurs (Neuman, 2011). For this specific research study, the research aims to explore ways or interventions that will take the poor and vulnerable from poverty to economic development. Exploratory research's main purpose is to examine a little understood issue or phenomenon to develop preliminary ideas and move toward refined research questions by focusing on the "what" question (Neuman, 2011). The decision to choose exploratory study was informed by the researcher's interest to understand the role of social protection programmes and interventions in economic development.

3.3 Research Design

Research design is a form of blueprint that is allowed in the conduct of a research (Wagner, 2012). The research design will be basic interpretive research that is usually used when researchers want to understand a phenomenon and how individuals make sense of the world around them (Bryman, 2016). It is also used to get more in-depth information to understand processes, systems and perspectives of people involved. The design to be adopted because as a researcher, I want to get an in-depth understanding of social protection in the City of Johannesburg, how to integrate social and economic policy to enhance the role of social protection and what programmes will best lead to economic development for the poor and vulnerable. As Miles and Gilbert (2005) argue, interpretive design can also be used when researchers want to understand why a certain phenomenon came about, how it unfolds over time and what changes led to what other changes.

3.4. Data Collection Strategy

Data collection refers to gathering of information to assist the researcher to answer research questions, in a form of interviews, surveys, focus groups and observation (Wagner, 2012). Data collected through first-hand experience is called primary data. For this specific study, the method of data collection will be interviews and document analysis.

3.4.1 Interviews

Semi-structured interview was adopted because it is more appropriate for qualitative research study. It refers to "an interview conducted according to an interview guide which contains some key questions to be put to the participant, but allows issues to be explored as they arise" (Wagner, 2012:274). Interviews were conducted with ten (10) selected officials within the City of Johannesburg Social and Economic Development departments, a former Director in the Gauteng Department of Social Development, a Professor who is an expert in the field of social protection at the Wits School of Governance, and a Community Development Worker (CDW) to get their informed perspectives on the convergence of social and economic policies, strategies, programmes that enable social protection and funding and monitoring and evaluation implications.

Table 1: List of officials interviewed.

Role	***Department / Institution***
Acting Director: SMME and Skills Development	CoJ Economic Development
Assistant Director: EPWP	CoJ Economic Development
Manager: Programme facilitation	CoJ Economic Development
Manager : Programme facilitation	CoJ Economic Development
Regional Manager: Social Development Region C	CoJ Social Development
Operational Manager: Social Assistance	CoJ Social Development
CWP coordinators (two respondents, one interview)	Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs Department

Deputy Director : Policy	CoJ Social Department
Professor of Social Security	Wits School of Governance
Former Director: Strategic Planning	Gauteng Department of Social Development

From the Economic Development I interviewed four (4) officials, one from Skills Development and SMME unit, one from EPWP unit and two from Programme Facilitation Unit. These officials were selected to get their informed views and experience regarding economic development programmes the Department is responsible for, policy direction and coordination between the Department of Social Development and Economic Development. Lastly, I wanted to know how these programmes are funded, who are the target beneficiaries, and how they are run.

I interviewed there (3) officials from Social Development, a Regional Manager for Region C, and Deputy Director: Policy and Manager: Social Benefits. All these officials were selected because I wanted to understand how the Department plans and implements its social policy that translate into social protection programmes, its challenges and effectiveness.

The professor was interviewed because I wanted to bring to voice of authority into research. He has experience, has researched and written extensively on social protection programmes.

The community development worker was interviewed because I wanted to add the voice of beneficiaries of some of the social protection programmes to bring a balanced view on the research.

Former Director Strategic Planning at the Gauteng Department of Social Development was interviewed because I wanted to find out about the direction of the Department, strategies and their future plans regarding economic development of the poor and vulnerable as they are the custodians of the policies in Gauteng.

The participants were given an interview guide that includes predefined questions developed by the researcher and approved by research supervisor to make sure that the questions are

relevant and that they will help answer the main research question. The interview guide questions were developed under two themes. Theme one focuses on the integration of social and economic policy and theme two focuses on interventions that will enable economic development for the poor and vulnerable. All interviews were in a form of discussion as I wanted the participants to relay their experiences, views and understanding of the topic and specific questions were asked later according to the interview guide.

3.4.2. Sampling strategy and criteria

The sampling technique will be non-probability sampling, meaning people are included in a sample because they are available and willing to participate in the study (Wagner, 2012). The sample size is small, with nine (9) respondents. Interviews were done through purposive sampling to identify nine (9) suitable candidates from the City of Johannesburg officials and specialist who have written extensively on the subject of social protection. As a researcher, I used my own experience and ingenuity to find participants who understand the topic deeply and brought depth to the research topic.

Initially fifteen (15) CoJ officials including Executive Directors and specialists were identified and requested to participate in the study. Eight (8) were from the Department of Economic Development and seven (7) were from the Social Development Department. The executive directors as heads of departments were not available for interviews however requested their Deputy Directors participate in the study. From the 15 invites, only 9 agreed to be interviewed. From Economic Development, I managed to interview a Deputy Director (Acting Director) responsible for SMME and skills development, Assistant Director: EPWP, 2 Managers: programme facilitation. Under Social Development Department I interviewed a Regional Manager, a Deputy Director: Policy Development as a specialist, and a Manager: Social Benefits and lastly a Community Development Worker from COGTA. Another specialist interviewed is Professor Alex van der Weer from the Wits School of Governance (WSG) who has written extensively on the topic of social protection and also lectures and heads the Social Security Unit at the WSG.

Despite the small sample, all the above participants were able to bring well balanced, relevant and critical views and experience relating to the research topic and questions.

3.4.3 Document Analysis

In qualitative research, document analysis involves interpretation and analysis of documents by the researcher to give meaning to the topic. It usually involves secondary data collection method which refers to data collected from other reliable sources (Wagner, 2012). This means that it is data that is already there and analysed for reference purposes. For the purpose of this study, document analysis was much easier compared to interviews. Some of the people whom I sent an email requesting an interview declined but offered me their Departmental policies and strategies.

Mostly documents sourced included policies, strategies, integrated development plan (IDP) and Service Delivery and Budget and Implementation Plan (SDBIP) from the City of Johannesburg. Other reliable statistics were sourced from Statistics South Africa (StatsSA), Human Rights Council of South Africa, the World Bank, International Monetary Fund (IMF), newspapers articles and reliable and published Journals.

3.5 Data Analysis

Data analysis involves making sense out the words, documents and pictures collected. It is by its nature an ongoing and iterative process. As Creswell (2013) notes, analysis in qualitative research proceeds hand-in-hand with other parts of developing the qualitative study, namely, the data collection and the write-up of findings. The questions contained in the interview guide were linked to the main research question. The research study adopted steps of data analysis and interpretation, namely (1) organize and prepare data for analysis; (2) read or go through data; (3) start coding data; (4) generate description of people; (5) present data; and (6) interpret data (Creswell, 2013).

Applying the above mentioned steps, I first organized and prepared my data collected from all the interview participants and documents. This included scanning to make sure I have all my notes, recording and typing of all the data collected from all officials and specialist. Some of the interviews, especially from the specialists were quite long and required enough time to go through.

The second step involves reading and going through the data I collected from interviews and documents. This refers to reflecting on the overall meaning of the data and how to focus the data analysis. I focused the data according to the main research question followed my questions on the interview guide. It includes what general ideas participants are sharing with regard to the main question. What are the impressions, and depth and credibility of the information? Despite some reservations, most of the respondents were free to answer the questions.

Coding is the third step in data analysis which involves organizing information to bring meaning to data by coding specific themes and patterns that are starting to emerge from data collected. I arranged my data according to two themes. These means going through the interviews to see which theme is coming through more than the other.

Step four which involves generating description of people and identifying multiple themes coming from data. At this stage, the data should display multiple perspectives from individuals supported by evidence. All the officials from the Economic Development Department had the same perspective and same key interventions were starting to emerge which reflect that in their meetings, they spent some time discussing economic development for the poor and the vulnerable. Social Development officials had different views on policy integration and interventions according to their experiences.

Presentation of data is step five and involves using narrative passage to convey the findings of the analysis. This might involve use of tables and mentions of arrangements of events. Here I identified patterns to form the two themes and categorised them into theme one (policy integration) and theme two (key interventions) to explain the findings.

The last stage involves interpretation step which involves "what are the lessons learned". This involves comparison of findings with information as articulated in literature review and social protection theory. From data collected, all respondents agree that with the key themes coming from the literature, even though practically in the City of Johannesburg, it is not happening that way. The data collected confirm the theory and did not diverge from it. It also raises new question emerging from the data for future research improvement.

3.6. Validity and Reliability

In qualitative research, external validity is often discussed in terms of population validity and ecological validity (Wagner, 2012). Population validity is the extent to which results from the sample can be generalized to the target population and ecological validity refers to the degree to which the results can be generalized from one context to the other (*ibid*). To ensure validity in the study, as a researcher I must make sure there is no selection bias such in terms of history, geographical areas, gender and age. The study also takes advantage of the regression discontinuity design where the population is already targeted because they are officials and specialists with the social and economic development space.

Reliability is the degree to which a test or whatever you use as a measurement tool, measures something consistently (Salkind, 2010:145). For this particular study, to ensure reliability and validity, triangular strategy was used. It refers to using different data sources of information by examining evidence from the sources and using it to build a coherent justification for theme. (Creswell, 2013). It means that as a researcher I must make sure that data collected from different sources (interviews and documents) is consistent with the theme from analysis stage to presentation stage.

3.7. Limitations

The sample study is relatively small due to officials not willing to participate in the study for different reasons. Some of the officials were worried about confidentiality of the study and did not want their views and experiences to be put on record. However as a qualitative study, the findings and conclusions can be viewed as not statistically representative of the entire population but rather as valuable basis for future research.

South African context presents many challenges to sampling that are not necessarily present in other countries such as unequal distribution and diversity of cultures (Wagner, 2012). Language and illiteracy barrier can be a limitation to a study especially if the participants and the researcher do not understand each other. This means that as a researcher, I must make sure that the means of communication is clear between me and the participants. For this particular

study, participants are CoJ officials and specialists in the field of social and economic development who are all literate.

3.8. Ethics

As a researcher one must take into account ethical standards of research when collecting data. For this particular research, consent was requested to voice record the interview. It was also agreed that for those who want to remain anonymous, their names and details will not be mentioned. It should also be noted however that five (5) out of nine (9) respondents had no issue with the publishing of their names and details.

Wagner (2012) outlined the following issues to consider when conducting a research. This include:

1) Ethical requirement of accuracy meaning that the researcher must report data as factually as it is and not manipulate it to suite your objectives.

2) Informed consent means that the researcher must first get permission to conduct the research from participants without pushing or forcing them to be part of the study. This means that the purpose, duration, methods of study and use of research must be explained to the participants.

3) Forbidding deception means the researcher must not trick or deceive participants in any way. It is always advisable to be honest from the onset with your participants.

4) Privacy and confidentiality refers to hiding and protecting the names of participants and their location to keep them from harm and lastly bias which refers to influencing participants to a certain outcome but either offering gifts or money. This can be tricky especially in a situation where you are dealing with vulnerable participants who always expect to be offered some sort encouragement to participate in research.

3.9. Conclusion

The research is informed by qualitative research method using basic interpretative design. The reason for using this particular method and design is the researcher's need to understand a certain phenomenon and interest to get more in-depth information on the subject of social protection. The next chapter will present data gathered from interviews and document analysis as data collection methods.

Chapter 4: Data Presentation

4.1 Introduction

This chapter is going to present research finding from data collected. Data presentation will be summarised and presented into three (3) themes namely (a) social and economic development policy integration; (b) interventions that will lead to economic development for the poor and vulnerable; and (c) institutional arrangement and challenges of linking social protection to economic development followed by sub-themes. The interviews were categorised into three (3) groups of respondents from economic development department officials, social development department officials and specialists.

4.2 Key Findings

4.2.1 Theme 1: Social and Economic development policy integration

4.2.1.1 What is the role of social policy in economic development?

All economic development officials interviewed expressed their understanding of the relationship between social protection and economic development. They indicated that their department has a strong role to play to socially protect the most poor and vulnerable by creating an enabling environment for the business sector to thrive so that more jobs can be created thereby reducing the number of poor and unemployed people.

The Manager: Programme Coordination from EDD indicated that economic development policy and social development policy cannot be isolated from each other because ultimately, both Departments aim to address unemployment, poverty and inequality. The Assistant Director responsible for Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) indicated that initiatives taken by the Economic Development Department (EDD) must not only focus on economic development but must also address social issues, especially those previously disadvantaged by the apartheid government. His view was supported by DD SMME and Manager Programme facilitation who both indicated by focusing on unemployment, poverty and inequality, EDD policy will uplift the society and reduce some of the socio-economic ills such as crime, teenage pregnancies and drug abuse.

I received mixed response from officials working in the City Social Development Department and Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs Department (CoGTA) when it comes to the relationship between the two policies. The Regional Manager explained that according to

her, there is a minimal relationship between the two policies and views social wage as an instrument of economic development on its own. She explained that Social Development's aim is poverty alleviation whereas economic development is about empowering the communities.

The Manager: Social Benefits said he believes there is a strong link between the two policies and they should be integrated because the City should be able to move families from poverty to sustainable livelihoods. He indicated that both Departments must look at common trends and develop an integrated policy targeted at the most poor and vulnerable. Respondent 7 indicated that there is a strong relationship and the two should integrate to create more jobs for the poor and vulnerable, especially targeting unemployed mothers who are receiving social grants on behalf of their children

The Deputy Director: Policy (SDD) indicated that more research needs to be find a holistic approach to social protection as an enabler for economic development. He said that more coordination between the two departments is important and a platform must be established to get the two departments to develop a policy that is pro-poor and pro-economic development.

The former Director at the Gauteng Department of Social Development (GDSD) argued that social and economic policies, programmes and interventions can be integrated as part of development agenda for a given country, region or city. It is possible to design social policies and interventions in a manner that assists economic development. So for example, a programme of distributing food parcels must include an analysis of the value chain of the foods that are being distributed. Intervene at various points, in the farming, the processing, the packaging, to ensure that those benefiting also participate at various stages.

4.2.1.2 What policy instrument can be explored to strengthen the integration between social and economic policy for the benefit of the poor and vulnerable?

The professor indicated that both Departments need to create an integrated policy framework with economic and human development. He gave an example of social housing which is labour inducing on its own. He further indicated that you need right platforms for integrated policy and delivery at operational level targeting the most vulnerable and poor people and invest in systematic interventions that move people from survival and handouts stage to self-sufficiency.

He further stated that policy must be designed as they currently do not exist. He gave an example of a business product design. The design must be institutionalised and get the right

project group that will combine economic and social strategy, concentrate resources and look for capital funding and prioritised key interventions to be ploughed back into communities.

The former Director (GDSD) indicated that the government must focus on selective industrial policy targeting specific sectors, industries and firms. He indicated that skilling (Train people), infrastructure (involve them in capital projects), employment (in the sectors identified) could be achieved across the value chain. Integrated within the poverty alleviation and sustainable livelihoods strategies that have to do with assisting cooperatives and NPOs.

4.2.2 Theme 2: Key interventions that will lead to economic development of the poor and vulnerable questions

4.2.2.1 What in your view are the key programmes, interventions that will enable economic development in the City of Johannesburg?

All four EDD officials indicated that government needs to do more to develop the local economy by investing in poor communities. They all agree that infrastructure development is an important part of economic development as it attracts business activities in the community. They also explained that the township economy needs to be revitalised and supported by the government because that is where the most poor, marginalised and vulnerable people are located.

Director SMME (EDD) indicated that the City needs to formalise the informal traders as this is the core economic support system of many poor communities. He explained that currently the City is busy with the development of an Informal Traders Policy which will register, regulate and train, and assist traders form their own forum. He also expressed his own vision of the City building a factory shells in poor communities that will be equipped with equipment and free services. He gave an example of a factory shell with juice and ice cream machines where community members can go use the machines for free to make juice and ice cream and go sell them to their communities and schools.

His views were echoed by Manager: Programme Facilitation (EDD) by saying that he would like the City to open a repairs and maintenance centres operated by the youth that does repairs and maintenance in townships and informal settlements. He further explained that it must have a call centre number where for example, if you have a plumbing problem in your house, you call the centre, get a reference number and young people will be despatched to do repairs within four (4) hours of logging a call, charging a minimum fee. This he said is another way of job

creation targeted at the youth. He said it must not only focus on plumbing but serve as a first stop of contact regarding repairs and maintenance including shoe repairs, dry clean and iron and gardening services. This facility or factory shell must be initiated and supported by the government for the first two years of operation and then must it be able to stand on its own.

Manager: Programme Facilitation (EDD) gave an example of the City Jozi@work programme that gives work packages to co-operatives formed by community members to help with service delivery. According to him, this is another way of ensuring that social protection leads to economic development. All Social Development Department (SDD) officials indicated that the main focus on the Department is to ensure that no one in the City of Johannesburg goes to bed hungry. They indicated that their main mandate is to eradicate poverty and to offer safety net to the most poor and vulnerable people including the homeless. They explained that there is Expanded Social Programme (ESP) accompanied by a framework offer which is a package of services the Department offers to poor and vulnerable people after being assessed by social workers. All households that earn less than R 5002 are automatically registered and put under the programme.

The Regional Manager (SDD) strongly expressed that before economic development of the poor, social development must happen first. She explained that the Department starts with social development of a poor child at an early age by providing social wage and once grown up, then they can be handed to EDD for skills development. She said if each and every child born in the City of Johannesburg enrols for all programmes the Department offers, from early childhood development centres, food resilient programme to ESP including programmes different units offers, then that child is socially protected until they are handed over to the EDD for skills development. She further indicated that the City is doing enough to protect the poor because other Departments such as Health and Housing are also providing their respective services to the poor and vulnerable, i.e free health services and housing.

However, the Regional Manager and Manager: Social Benefits (SDD) sharply differ with her because they believe that Social Workers should be working with Economic Development practitioners in developing communities. Manager: Social Benefits believes that offering a social wage is an important part of social development but all programmes should lead to economic emancipation of beneficiaries. He explained that the city needs to introduce interventions or programmes targeted at income poverty. He further gave an example of

unemployed youth who said they are tired of sitting at home and does not want handouts from government anymore but wants payslips.

CWP coordinators said that the government can do much better to help the poor and vulnerable by giving them access to agricultural land and equipment that can help them work for themselves such as sewing machines, gardening and public works tool. They also indicated that as CWP workers, they want government to support them start their own businesses and work for themselves. They gave an example of shortage of agriculture land, in that they want do mass farming of spinach to supply big business but do not have space. They explained that through SDD, social workers helped to form a co-operative that received a contract to supply to local Spar but could not keep up with the high volumes of order as they did not have enough space to farm. The contract was cancelled.

The professor indicated that the City have potential to lead economic development of the poor in large scales. He indicated that he will argue that the city collaborate with the Unemployment Insurance Fund (UIF) because they are currently sitting with R130 billion surplus that can be used for urban development pilot experiment and have an infrastructure requirement of improving employment opportunities at a large scale as is money that is already there on the system (key intervention). He further indicated that City must look at labour intervention strategies comprised in systematic interventions which are replicable and operational at scale. He gave an example of refurbishing accommodation in the Central Business District (CBD) that will substitute sleeping on the street and the creating a transport system for people who are searching for jobs and still be able to go back to their areas with a daily registry.

He also indicated that one of the interventions can be income support subsidy for retrenched people while they search jobs. He gave an example that the City can assess industries that have potential for high growth in an urban space and invest in those at a large scale while combining social protection interventions, skilling and communication. He explained that there must be a database that links job searches to employers. He further reiterated that such a pilot project can also be done under UIF as they have database of contributors (employers).

He explained that the Industrial Development Corporation (IDC) is another vehicle that can be used to drive social protection for the poor and vulnerable by offering loan capital and direct funding for urban infrastructure to Small medium Enterprise (SMME) for the poor and vulnerable.

Deputy Director: Policy (SDD) said that the City have good right social protection intervention, the challenge is that they do not have the right skills to drive economic development of the poor and vulnerable. He indicated that the City developed a Food policy for informal farmers however, they did not give them proper training on farming and the value chain process of farming products to selling products.

4.2.2.2 How will these interventions help economic development of the poor and vulnerable?

All respondents indicated that when communities are employed and thriving, there tends to be a reduction of social ills like teenage pregnancies, crime, HIV AIDS and drug abuse. THE Manager Social Assistance explained that when communities are participating in the economic activities of the City, they are able to take care of their families, feed their children and making sure that they go to school. Social protection interventions bridge the gap of inequality and alleviate poverty.

4.2.3 Theme 3: Institutional arrangement to drive the programmes / intervention questions and challenges

4.2.3.1 What institutional arrangements are in place to drive such programmes?

The City has the capacity to link and ensure that social policy link to economic development. Most respondents indicated that though the link is there, there is no arrangement in place to drive such programmes.

Respondent Deputy Director: SMME indicated that there is no policy or framework in place in the City of Johannesburg to drive the integration. He, however indicated that EDD is currently in the process of developing pro-poor SMME policy targeted at the previously disadvantaged groups. The Manager: Programme Facilitation explained that all City's Departments must make a systematic effort to target the poor and the vulnerable in their programmes. They indicated that wrong targeting is a major challenge in positioning social protection as an enabler of economic development. He gave an example of Business hubs established across the City but indicated that more needs to be done to include the poor. All respondents indicated that budget allocation is a major challenge in driving such programmes. The other challenge is that City officials themselves lack skills to drive some of the programmes. Some respondents

indicated the lack of political will and reluctance by their seniors in driving economic transformation in poor communities.

All respondents indicated that there is lack of resources and capacity in the City to drive some the programmes the Department is responsible for. They further reiterated their point that their first and important mandate is to make sure that families do not go to bed hungry.

Community development workers indicated they do not understand the question however they explained that they need more resources such as vegetable seeds, cleaning materials tools and first aid training from CoGTA so that they are able to start their own co-operatives and become self-sufficient. The Manager: Social Benefits explained that currently, there is only one social worker per ward and more social workers are needed to assist link the most poor and vulnerable to economic opportunities. He further elaborated that there must be coordination between Economic Development and Social Development to strengthen the link between social development and economic development.

This was supported by Regional Manager who indicated that the current ESP system must be improved by collaboration or cooperation between the two Departments. She further elaborated that the current system is not necessarily linked to the economic development of the poor and vulnerable but serves as a safety net to make sure they do not end up on the streets. She explained that it will be better if the two Departments can speak to each other to develop a proper mechanism that will provide a clear link of moving the poor from poverty to economic development

The Former Director (GSDD) indicated that the City needs Clusters, dedicated agencies, and private/public/people partnerships that are governed by a regime of incentives and disincentives.

The Professor explained that the City needs a clear policy that is a permanent structure and must get the right innovators as part of a project team and supply them with resources and support. He further indicated that the City must institutionalise innovation, do away with tenders, focus and invest on integrated delivery and circuit.

The Deputy Director: Policy indicated that the City is currently not capacitated to drive the interventions of social protection because most of the staff members are not qualified and lack proper skills to drive such an integration. He also indicated that more research needs to be done to link social protection to economic development as currently.

4.2.3.2 What are the challenges or difficulties in linking social protection to economic development?

Financial and human capital resources were raised as the main challenge on linking social protection to economic development by all respondents. The Regional Director indicated that as SDD, their main aim is making sure that no single person goes to bed on an empty stomach in the city of Johannesburg. She further indicated that what they call social protection is different to a text book definition. According to her, social protection does not link to economic development.

Economic development officials indicated that during their monthly meetings, pro-poor interventions are discussed with solution, however, when senior management engage with political leadership of the City, there seems to be resistance, thus they are not willing to invest on the poor and vulnerable.

4.4 Conclusion

This chapter presented a summary of the main findings from the interview. The data collected from the interview produced very useful information because the questions raised emanated from the research question. Most respondents agree that more needs to be done to strengthen the relationship between social and economic policy, they explained that Social and Economic Development Departments need to work together to enhance the role of social protection and introduce interventions with direct economic development link for the poor and vulnerable.

Chapter 5: Analysis and Interpretation of data

5.1 Introduction

This chapter presents an analysis and discussion of the research findings from interviews and document analysis of the key finding and themes to draw meaning and respond to the research questions. The first section presents the study findings based on the research questions and the last section is the conclusion.

The research study has found that there is no integration between social and economic policies in the City of Johannesburg. As such, social protection is not enabling economic development in the City. However, the findings suggested a couple of interventions that can be implemented enable social protection to enable economic development for the most poor and vulnerable in the city. Lastly the study found that there must be a complete overhaul of institutional arrangements and resources as currently the concerned Departments are not capacitated to enhance the role of social protection to enable economic development. Furthermore, the city must also consider entering into partnership with other government entities.

5.2 Theme1: Social and Economic policy integration to enhance the role of Social protection

There is no social and economic integration in the City of Johannesburg and a policy to enhance the role of social policy through social protection does not exist. However, the City has undertaken to be responsive pro-poor government by targeting the poor and vulnerable in their programmes. All respondents indicated that the City does have pro-poor policies though some of them are not directly linked with economic development. The following are policy considerations that can link social and economic development policies for the benefit of the poor and vulnerable.

5.2.1 Informal traders' policy

Officials from EDD indicated that the City is in a process of developing policies that will stimulate the economy. One such policy is the informal traders' policy which will register,

regulate and train and provide cleaning services at night for informal traders. The traders will also be able to form their own forum that represents their views at Mayoral meetings. By formalising informal traders, the City is hoping formal trade that will lead to more SMMEs, job creation and economic inclusion for the poor and vulnerable traders who make their living by standing on street corners selling anything from sweets to fast food. This finding is consistent with research study conducted by Van Rooyen et al (2008) found the City has approximately 4000 informal traders and support mechanisms to transform the informal sector and trade into a contributing channel of entrepreneurship and job creation.

Most informal traders are found in townships operating businesses such as tuck shops and hair salons. Some of these traders have little or no skills at all but with government support they can operate successful business that will employ more people. Township economy is one critical economic stimulator in the city of Johannesburg (CoJ ECD, 2015). As such, the City must invest in township infrastructure and business hubs to enable townships to strive. Similarly a study conducted by SLF (2015) found that there is a large micro enterprise activity in the township that plays an integral part in the community life therefore it must be accepted that informality and micro enterprise as a survival for the poor and vulnerable. It further recommends that the government must reduce red tape and simplify regulatory requirements, provide license and access to business support programmes and encourage policy support for the economy. This finding is also supported by literature review where (Taylor, 2012) noted that one of the functions of social protection is to assist the poor and help them avoid sinking deeper into poverty. Most of the informal traders are poor people who are surviving on little income. If the City can help formalised, support and train them, they will become self-sufficient and support their families. This will not only mitigate against increased vulnerability but this policy can also break the cycle of poverty in poor communities.

5.2.2 Industrialisation policy

Official from GDSD indicated that a policy which involves and utilise the poor and vulnerable as part of the interventions meant to assist them must be designed as part of industrialisation policy. He gave an example of involving the poor as part of a value chain of uniform manufacturing. This is supported by research done by Saarrelainen and Sievers (2011) that proves that government support of pro-poor development and job creation through strengthening of small enterprise, business relations, market structures and business environment can move the poor from poverty trap to economic progress. Such policy must be

clear and be driven by interventions such training, financial assistance and equipment supply. This research is also supported by literature, in that one of social protection function is to enhance and better the lives of poor and vulnerable groups by promoting them from unemployment and poverty traps to better and sustainable livelihoods.

However, responding to these opportunities also pose some challenges due to lack of investments to enable productive capacities, business skills and infrastructure of the poor as noted by (Donovan et al, 2006). This means that government or a City requires huge financial injection and proper monitoring and evaluation to be put in place. For a City as big as City of Johannesburg with 25% unemployment and almost half of the population economically inactive, the budget can be an impediment in implementing such a programme. A value chain development policy or framework must not be designed in isolation from institutional arrangement of the City and targeted beneficiaries or stakeholders.

The integration of the two policies is possible and can be done by designing targeted pro –poor and vulnerable policies that are linked to productivity and economic development. As indicated above, policies like formalisation of informal traders, value chain development (as part of industrialisation policy) must be pursued so that the most poor and vulnerable citizens of the City can be self-sufficient and benefit from economic opportunities offered to them.

5.3 Theme 2: Key social protection interventions that will lead to economic development of the poor and the vulnerable

The findings that emerged from this theme are almost unanimous, all respondents view is that for the City to address the socio- economic challenges it is currently facing, it must tackle unemployment with vigor. The views that emerge are that pro – poor interventions should include for large scale employment guarantee schemes, access to micro credit, value chain development, transport subsidy for the poor and income support retrenched workers.

5.3.1 Employment guarantee schemes

Job creation is one the most effective ways of addressing socio – economic challenges. Research has proven that employment is the door out of poverty for the poor and vulnerable and a critical cornerstone of economic and social development. This view was also held by all of the respondents on this research study. Officials from EDD indicated that the City, in particular their department, must invest on township infrastructure so that the most poor and vulnerable people within communities can be employed. They explained that this can be done through employment schemes targeting the poor and youth. Thus, the City must build factory shells in poor communities with all the necessary equipment, create public works jobs and SMME training and support.

This view is supported by research done by (Pankaj, 2015) on employment guarantee scheme in India. The research found out that government support schemes such as Mahtma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (MGNRGS) is effective in poverty alleviation through job creation and is a gateway out of poverty and unemployment. This scheme is implemented as a part of social protection in India and supported by the Federal government. The research found that are many benefits to participants such as 1. Reduction in indebtedness (due to lean season employment) 2. Reduction in distress migration 3. Dependence on and exploitation by landlords/moneylenders decreased 4. Bargaining power of the worker has increased 5. Financial inclusion (90.8) million (9.88 crore) bank and post office accounts have been opened; most of them are the first time 6. A large number of small, medium and poor households are direct beneficiaries of the development of their land and irrigation facilities on their land and lastly provided employment to women, destitute, old and even physically challenged (labour market is discriminatory to them) (Pankaj, 2015).

The above evidence is also supported by literature review in that (Cook and Kwon, 2007) mentioned, employment should be viewed as a complement and core dimension to social protection and types of employment should be created considering economic conditions facing developing countries. However, such employment schemes can sometimes be too expensive with little effects is they are not designed and implemented properly. As pointed out by (The Hindu, 2015) the critics of the programme claims that is wasteful, ineffective, leaky and hurt the poor by fuelling inflation. As with each and every programme, there will be challenges however they must be managed by constructing a holistic approach to problem areas with specific targets and putting proper monitoring and evaluation process in place to assess the impact of the programme after specific time.

The MGNREGS offers 100 days of employment to poor household in every financial year (Pankaj, 2015). Thus, even if employment is not permanent, there is guarantee that for 100 days in a financial year, one member of a household will be employed. This is similar to current Community Work Programme (CWP) run by DSD and GOGTA in that employment is 100 days per year, however with CWP, there is no guarantee that participants will be employed the following year. CWP coordinators interviewed indicated that most participants feel discouraged because there is no guarantee for future employment. is just one example of successful government schemes in India, other countries such as Mexico and Brazil has also established some of the most successful schemes (see Hoefer and Midgley, 2012). However, as the professor indicated, the City must design its own social protection interventions that will lead to economic progress and play a bigger role in leading sustainable development in South Africa.

5.3.2 Value chain development

Value chain development interventions should be designed as part of industrialisation. This was emphasised by an official from SDSD as already mentioned above. The findings are consistence with evidence from (Babaijanian et al, 2014) who indicated that the design of social protection and labour intensive programmes must start with social and institutional analysis that will take into context the factors affecting peoples resources, services, social and economic opportunities and local environment. This means that not all solutions can be exported and work in all poor communities. The City must design their own interventions, taking into account the history and socio-economic challenges it is currently facing.

The results of research done by (Babaijanian et al, 2014) in Sri-Lanka for four years show positive outcomes of value chain development. The project team was called in due to a conflict in an Ornamental fish sector that had the capacity to contribute to the district economy however it was underdeveloped. The project team introduce the value chain development after analysing the challenges. After the interventions, Ornamental fish saw increase in quality by grants given in forms of equipment, increase demand and training brought better knowledge and skills in growing fish. This evidence is also supported by literature review in that (Weiss, 1994) pointed that the poor and vulnerable must be given access to productive assets so they can participate in economic activities and improve their livelihoods. However, access to productive assets

alone is inadequate as most lack financial, infrastructure and training resources to access the market and establish successful enterprises which the government must provide as part of economic development.

5.3.3 Access to micro credit

Financial support is the most critical component of SMME development however, majority of poor people and communities lack access to credit to unlock their full potential. This is supported by Deputy director SMME indicated, SMME's lack finance and skills is one the area that will ensure transformation from being poor to economically independent. He indicated that SMME lack infrastructure and equipment to start their own business or for those who have started already, for their business to prosper. He further expained that offering micro finance to poor communities can be yield greater results. This was supported by manager programme facilitation and manager social benefits that poor communities must be offered financial support. Thus, both EDD and SDD assist poor communities to arrange themselves into cooperatives of maximum 7 members so that they can benefit from some of government programmes. Currently the City is running a Jozi @work programme that offers poor communities (must be in cooperative) work packages to clean the streets, building and maintenance work. However, programme is not reaching its intended objective of lifting poor and vulnerable communities from poverty. Most funds are benefiting the implementation support agency and do not trickle down to the poor communities, the intended targets. The City must redesign the programme, taking into account some of MGNREGS interventions and structure as reference.

Literature also indicates that access to micro finance is one of the impediment of moving the poor and vulnerable from poverty and unemployment to economic progress. As (Weiss, 1995:) noted, "The poor are generally characterised by lack of productive assets, other than their own labour power, so improved access to land and credit is an obvious strategy to improve their position". Thus, as part of pro-poor interventions, the city must come with innovative ways of issuing micro finance to the poor to help unlock their productive assets such as land and start their own businesses.

Weiss views are supported by (Torado el al, 2009) who wrote a case study: Making microfinance work for the poor: the Grameen bank of Bangladesh. The bank was developed

after the founder did a research on lack of access to credit of the poor was one of the key constraints on their economic progress. It offers credit to poor communities without requiring collateral to approximately 9 million borrowers. The bank is today owned by 94% and remainder 6% by the government by its borrowers. The borrowers have to go for training in bank procedure, group saving programmes, self- discipline and how to write their own signatures to qualify for loans, resulting into a 98% repayment rate, this led to most poor being able to access finance and escaping poverty. The success of Grameen bank can be summarised as follows "of the poorest people in the economic impact assessment revealed that Grameen Bank as well as BRAC, definitely succeeded in reducing their member's vulnerability and by consequence prevent them from falling even further into poverty" (Develtere and Huybrechts, 2002) and (Mainsah Et al, 2004) pointed that 41.6 million people have escaped poverty through microfinance programmes. Thus, the City is missing a great developmental opportunity by not finding ways to offer credit to the poor so they avoid falling deeper into poverty. Although it is not a local government competency to offer micro finance to the poor, the City of Johannesburg has the capacity to establish is own a pro poor developmental path that can be imitated by other metropolitan municipalities.

5.3.4 Transport subsidy

Transport subsidy intervention is often overlooked as an enabler to economic development for the poor and vulnerable. Professor indicated that it is one of the key economic development intervention that should be unlocked to enable the poor to be part of economic activities in the City. He further explained that transport help the poor in job searching and is a critical economic driver as it connects the poor with opportunities. However, in a most developing countries, South Africa in particular, transport it still an impediment to economic activities because high transport costs reduce income of the poor. Literature indicated that one of the functions of social protection is to promote the livelihoods of the poor by providing reliable transportation to opportunities. This is consistent with this research findings and evidence from (World Bank, 2016) which found that the transport sector brings opportunity to the poor and also enables economies to be more competitive thereby absorbing more people into the job market. Therefore City planners need to take cognisance of the role of transport in connecting the poor to economic opportunity and also as an intervention or strategy for poverty alleviation and employment opportunities.

5.3.5 Income support for retrenched workers

The research report also found that income support for retrenched workers is one of the key intervention the City can implement in partnership with UIF to enable retrenched workers back into economic activities. This research findings is consistent with research done in Mexico, where a social insurance retrenchment was offered as income support to retrenched workers while looking for employment. As the professor pointed out, the advantage of the city partnering with the UIF is that the budget is already available. Such an intervention will assist families whose bread winners are retrenched from falling into poverty traps. Re-skilling of workers is another option that the City can pursue as part of a holistic approach of providing skills to the unemployed.

From the discussion above, it is clear the city have several interventions option that can enhance the role of social protection in economic development. The challenge, however will be the design, coordination, allocation of resources and implementation of these intervention as it involves two independent departments. The City must start with one intervention as a pilot project, the informal traders policy could be one such as the policy is currently being developed with the aim of empowering informal traders and training hem into established and registered small business that can prosper and employ more people.

5.4 Theme 3: Institutional arrangement to drive the interventions / programmes

The research study found that there is no institutional arrangement to drive the integration of social and economic policies to enable economic development of the poor and vulnerable in the City of Johannesburg. However, all respondents indicated that the city have the capacity to drive economic development interventions of the poor under the social protection umbrella through proper policy design, allocation of resources and budget and lastly further research to establish a clear line

5.4.1 Proper policy design

Officials from EDD indicated that there is no policy and framework in place to drive the integration of pro poor interventions. However, there is a policy or framework that is currently being developed to drive the integration. The institutional arrangement that will drive the integration of pro - poor policies will have to start with political leadership of the City. EDD officials indicated that there is no political will to institutionalise the social and economic policies to drive the integration of the two polices to enhance the role of social protection. Officials indicated that such integration is a complex one as it involves two different department with different mandates. For a successful integration of the two polices to drive social protection, the must be coordination from the Mayor's office and clear roles for the two departments on how to drive the process.

5.4.2 Allocation of resources and budget

Officials from SDD indicated that such an integration will require lots of resources and currently, the city is under resources. They said they are under staffed and could barely do their work. They indicated that they have an ESP strategy and framework which needed to be improved to include social protection intervention which can lead economic development. Social protection intervention in developing countries are often followed by huge budget and administration challenges, this lead to SDD officials sceptical if the City will able to carry such responsibility. However CoJ is a big metropolitan that has big capacity to implement social protection interventions without the debate of trade-off between social protection expenditure and growth in the City. Social protection is not only enable of economic development but it is also a stimulant of economic growth. Two pro-poor programmes, ESP and Jozi@work are currently facing targeting and administration challenges and will be proper that the City first addresses these challenges before they can add more social protection interventions.

5.4.3 Partnership with other government agencies / institutions

This study also found out that City can enter into partnership with other government entities or private sector in order to address its institutional arrangement shortcomings. Entering into partnership with be beneficial to the city as evidence proves that it reduces risks and also saves

costs. All specialist agreed that the City need to set up a cluster comprising of both EDD and SDD to map a way for inclusive economic development. A consensus was reached by all specialist that the city must do away with tenders and institutionalise procurement and innovation. Outsourcing of key City responsibilities must be limited as it is characterised by maladministration and corruption and ultimately robs the poor and vulnerable of service delivery.

5.4.4 Research to establish social and economic development link

In contrast to EDD officials, SDD official responsible for policy development indicated that more research is needed to clarify the link of social protection to economic development. As literature indicates, there is a strong link between social protection and economic development and in Asian countries, social protection is one of the most effective tool of economic development. I referred him some literature to read further on the subject. However, in South Africa, the government is not perusing this link as currently there are challenges with the current social security programmes. Thus, is advisable for the local government (each municipality) to take over social protection programmes that will lead to economic development. The city of Johannesburg as that biggest, riches and most diverse can lead this process.

5.5 Conclusion

This chapter aim is to discuss and engage further with the research finding of the study, borrowing for theory and practice. The research study found that there is no policy integration in the City of Johannesburg to enhance the role of social protection, current pro -poor programmes do not lead to economic development and no institutional arrangement in place the drive the integration of social and economic policy. Key intervention such as employment guarantee schemes, access to micro credit, value chain development, transport subsidy for the poor and income support for retrenched workers must be designed. Institutional arrangement to drive such interventions should be policy, partnership, resources and further research to explore the topic.

Chapter 6: Conclusion and Recommendations

6.1 Introduction

The purpose of the study was to examine the integration of social and economic policies with the aim of developing a holistic approach to social protection by focusing on social and economic integration. The two preceding chapters presented the findings and analysis, this chapter presents conclusion and recommendations of the research study.

6.2 Conclusion

Drawing from the analysis into social protection as an enabler of economic development in the City of Johannesburg, the following conclusion can be made:

Social protection is not an enabler of economic development in the City of Johannesburg, it is used as a poverty alleviation strategy with limited interventions from Social and Economic Development Departments. Social and economic policies are not intertwined to enhance the role of social protection in economic development.

However, there is willingness from city officials to explore the integration of social and economic policies for the benefit of the most poor and vulnerable. There is strong evidence from this study and other similar research that pursuing this link provides social and economic benefits to the marginalised groups in our communities.

The current social protection intervention does not lead to economic development. However, the programmes do assist with poverty alleviation and hunger, which is an important element of social protection. More interventions can be designed to complement the existing one by improving targeting and administration to include those currently not benefiting from existing programmes.

It is the responsibility of the City to ensure that the interventions they design take cognisance of economic opportunity, transformation and dignity for the most vulnerable people in the communities. It appears as if there is no political willingness to initiate and implement social protection interventions that lead to economic development as they are deemed too costly.

There is no coordination between the City's Social and Economic Development in relation to interventions for the poor and vulnerable. If these two departments can work together, integrate budget and resources, the poor and vulnerable can receive more benefits offered by the City.

6.3 Limitation of the study

Though the researcher managed to interview ten (10) people, the initial target was 15 officials. The Department of Social Development officials were unavailable due to work pressure as they are under staffed. To mitigate this limitation, the researcher tried to get official documents from the Department to no avail. However, the researcher did manage to get documents from the website, unfortunately, they were outdated. Despite the limitation, the study was able to offer insight into social protection and economic development in the City of Johannesburg.

6.4 Recommendations

The high levels of unemployment, poverty and inequalities in the city of Johannesburg threaten to undermine progress the city is making towards achieving a world class African city. These challenges require bold and aggressive social protection interventions that will advance economic participation for the most vulnerable and marginalised persons. The recommendations of the study will be based on the research questions.

The City of Johannesburg must integrate social and economic policies, combining both policies into one policy with the objective of advancing economic participation of the poor, vulnerable and marginalised people in communities. This process must be led by the Social Development Department as it is the custodian of social protection in the city. The policy designed must take into account the complex characteristics of City of Johannesburg including high rates of in-migration.

The City of Johannesburg must implement key interventions, namely (a) large scale employment guarantee schemes; (b) access to micro credit; (c) value chain development; (d) transport subsidy for the poor, and lastly (e) income support retrenched workers. However, given the challenges that come with social protection interventions, the City must choose one programme to implement as pilot so as to identify teething problems thereafter implement the rest of interventions on an incremental basis. The City of Johannesburg must start with value chain development intervention.

To drive economic emancipation for the poor and vulnerable, the City must be resourced, with sufficient budget allocated to drive the integration of the two policies. Moreover, there must be coordination, clarification of roles and responsibilities.

Given the cost and resources required to drive the implementation of policies and programmes, it is recommended that City of Johannesburg consider partnering with other government institutions and/or private sector to mitigate the risks associated with social protection.

References

Adesina, J. (2011). Beyond the social protection paradigm: social policy in Africa's development. Canadian Journal of Development Studies / Revue canadienne detudes du developpement, 32:4, 454 – 470. DOI: 10.1080/02255189.2011.647441

Babajanian, B; Hagen – Zanker, J; Holmes, R. (2014). How do social protection and labour programmes contribute to social inclusion: evidence from Afghanistan, Bangladesh, India and Nepal. Oversees Development Institute.

Barrientos, A. Moller,V. Saboia,J. Lloyd-Sherlock, P. Mase, J. (2013). 'Growing' social protection in developing countries: Lessons from Brazil and South Africa. Development Southren Africa, 2013. Vol.30, No1, 54 – 68.

Black, P. Calitz,E. Steenekamp, T (2012). Public Economics. 5th Edition. Oxford University Press, Southern Africa.

Blank, M. (1994). Social protection versus economic flexibility: is there a trade-off? National Bureau of Economic Research, Comparative Labour Markets Series. University of Chicago Press.

Bryman, A. (2016). Social Research Methods. Fifth edition. Oxford University Press.

Budget Review (2013). National Treasury. South Africa.

Chang, H. (2002). The Role of Social Policy in Economic Development. Some Theoretical Reflections and Lessons from East Asia. United Nations Research Institute for Social Research.

Chow, G.C. (2004). Economic Reform and Growth in China. ANNALS OF ECONOMICS AND FINANCE 5, 127 – 152 (2004).

City of Johannesburg (2015). Social Development Department Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Programme.

Cook, S. Kwon, H. (2007). Economic Reform and Social Protection in East Asia. RC19 annual conference paper at Florence University, 6 – 8 September 2007.

Creswell, J.W. (2013). Research Design – Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches. Sage Publications.

De Soto, H. (2000). The mystery of capital: Why Capitalism Triumps in the West and Fails Everywhere Else. Black Swam

Devereux, S. (2013). Trajectories of social protection in Africa. Development Southern Africa, 30:1, 13 – 23. DOI: 10.1080/0376835X.2013.755871

Devereux, S. Sabates –Wheeler, R (2004). Transformative Social Protection. IDS working paper 232.

Donovan, J; Stoian, D; Lundy, M. (2006). Challenges and approaches for inclusive value-chain development: Introduction.

Economic Development Strategy for the City of Johannesburg (2015). Department of Economic Development, City of Johannesburg. 2015

Expanded Public works Programme (2008). Five-year Report 2004/05 – 2008/09. ISBN No. 978-1-920399-00-9

Fedderke, J.W. Perkins, P. Luiz, J.M. (2006). Infrastructural Investment in Long-run Economic Growth: South Africa 1875 – 2001. World Development Vol. 34, No.6,pp. 1037 – 1059, 2006.

Global Metro Monitor. (2010). The path to economic recovery. A preliminary overview of 150 global metropolitan economies in the wake of great recession. Metropolitan policy programme, The Brookings.

Hall,A. Midgley, J. (2004). Social Policy for Development. Sage publication

Harvard Family Research Project (2004). Detangling Data Collection: Methods for Gathering Data. Harvard Graduate School of Education. President and fellows of Harvard College

Hoefer, R. Midgley,J. (2012). Poverty, Incomes and Social Protection: International Policy Perspectives. Journal of Policy Practice, 11: 1-7, 2012.

IMF Policy Paper (2014). Fiscal Policy and Income Inequality. International Monetary Fund

Jacobs,P. Ngcobo,N. Hart,T. Baipheti, M. (2010). Developmental social policies for the poor in South Africa: Exploring options to enhance impacts?. Conference Paper

Kennet, P. (2013). A Handbook of Comparative Social Policy, second edition. Edward Elgar Publishing Limited

Kpessa,M,W. Beland,D. (2013). RESEARCH ARTICLE. Mapping social policy development in sub-Saharan Africa. Policy studies, Vol.34, No.3, 326 – 341.

Kwon, H. Mkandawire,T. Palme,J. (2009). Introduction: Social Policy and economic development in late industrializers. International Journal of Social Welfare. DOI: 10.1111/j.1468-2397.2009.00635.x

Leedy, P.D. Ormorod, J.E. (2010). Planning and Design. Merrill

Mabugu, M. Chitinga,M. Fofana,I. Abidoye,B. Mbanda, V (2015). Assessing the General Equilibrium Effects of Social Grants in South Africa. Chapter 2. Submission for Division of Revenue 2015/2016

Mathers, N and Slater, R (2014). Social Protection and Growth: Research Synthesis. Overseas Development Institute. Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade.

Meyer, J. W., & Rowan, B. (1977). Institutionalized organizations: Formal structure as myth and ceremony. American Journal of Sociology, 83, 340 –363.

Mkandawire, T. (2001). Social Development in a Development Context. Social Policy and Development Programme Paper Number 7. United Nations Research Institute.

Mkandawire,T. (2006). "Targeting the Universalism in Poverty Reduction," Poverty in Focus. International Poverty Centre, United Nations Development Programme. June 2006

Mkandawire,T. (2007). Transformative Social Policy and Innovation in Developing Countries. The European Journal of Development Research, Vol.19, No1, March 2007, pp.13-29

Mkandawire, T. (2011). Transformative Social Policy and Developmental State. United Nations Research Institute.

Midgley,J. (2013). Social Development and Social Protection: New opportunities and challenges. Development SouthernAfrica,30:1,2-12. DOI: 10.1080/0376835x.2012.755850

Midgley, J. (2012). Social Protection and social Policy: Key Issues and Debates. Journal of Policy Practice, 11: 8 – 24. DOI: 10.1080/15588742.2012.624061

Miles, J ; Gilbert, P (2005). A HANDBOOK OF RESEARCH METHODS FOR CLINICAL AND HEALTH PSYCHOLOGY. Oxford university press

Norton, A. Conway, T. Foster, M. (2001). SOCIAL PROTECTION CONCEPTS & APPROACHES: IMPLICATIONS FOR POLICY & PRACTICE IN INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT. Working paper 143. Centre for Aid and Public Expenditure.

Nueman, W.L (2011). Social Research Methods: qualitative and Quantitative Approaches, 7th edtition. Pearson

Ocampo, J.A; Jomo K.S and Khan S. (2007). Policy Matters: Economic and Social Policies to sustain equitable development

Omilola, B. Kaniki, S. (2014). Social Protection in Africa: A Review of Potential Contribution and Impact on Poverty Reduction. UNDP.

OECD journal on development 2008. Vol 9/4 – ISSN 1816-8124

Pankaj A. (2015). Employment guarantee scheme in India. Council for Social Development, New Delhi (India). Expert and Inter-Agency Meeting on Implementation of the Second United Nations Decade for the Eradication of Poverty (2008-2017) Addis Ababa (Ethiopia) 27-29 May 2015

Pauw,K and Mncube, .L (2007). Expanding the social security net in South Africa: Opportunities, challenges and constraints. International Poverty Centre, Country Study number 8, July 2007

Peters, B.G (2000). Institutional Theory: Problems and Prospects. Reihe Politikwissenschaft / Political Science Series 69. ISSN: 1605-8003. Department of Political Science, Institute of Advance Studies (HIS).

Piachaud, D. (2013). Social protection, redistribution and economic growth. Development Southern Africa, 2013. Vol.30, No 1, 24 – 38

Saarelainen E; Sievers, M (2011). Value Chain Development. ILO value chain development briefing paper 1. International Labour Organisation

Salkind, N, J (2010). Statistics for people who (Think They) hate statistics, 3rd edition. University of Kansas. Sage publications

South African Cities Network and Urban Landmark. (2009). Municipal rates policies and the urban poor – how can municipality rates policies promote access by the poor to urban land markets?

Surender, R and Walker,R. (2013). Social Policy in a Developing World. Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

Torado, M.P. Smith, S.C. (2009). Economic Development. Tenth Edition. Pearson Education Limited

Van der Berg, S. (2006). Fiscal incidence of social sending in South Africa. A report to National Treasury.

Van der Hoeven, R (2011). Employment, Inequality and globalization. A Continuous Concern. Journal of Human Development and Capabilities,vol 11, issue 1.

Van Rooyen, E.J. Antonite, A.J. (2007) FORMALISING THE INFORMAL SECTOR: A CASE STUDY ON THE CITY OF JOHANNESBURG. Journal of Public Administration. Vol 42 no.3. August 2007

Wagner,C. Kawulich, B. Garner,M. (2012). Doing Social Research. A global context. McGraw-Hill Higher Education

Weisbrot,M. Johnson,J. Lefebvre,S (2014). The Brazilian Economy in Transition: Macroeconomic Policy, Labour and Inequality. Center for Economic and Policy Research.

Weiss,J. (1995). Economic Policy In Developing Countries: The Reform Agenda. Prentice Hall.

World Bank. (2014). South Africa Economic Update, Fiscal Policy and Redistribution in an Unequal Society. World Bank Group; November 2014; Volume 6

www.thehindu.com. (2015). Is the MGNREGA being set up for failure? May 31 2015

Annexure 1 – Interviews Guide

Social Protection as an enabler of Economic development in the City of Johannesburg interview guide for officials.

1. How do you define economic / social development in your context?
2. What programmes are in place as pillars of economic / social development?
3. What are the aims and objectives underpinning these programmes?
4. What intended outcomes are envisaged in the medium to long term?
5. How are these interventions funded?
6. Who are the target beneficiaries (people, places, sectors, inter alia), and why?
7. What institutional arrangements are in place to drive the programmes?
8. What is the envisaged contribution of these interventions to economic development of the poor and vulnerable?
9. What are the constraints in linking social protection to economic development?
10. What do you think is the role of the local state (your Department) in poverty alleviation?
11. What do you think is the role of the local state (your Department) in job creation?
12. What do you think is the role of local state (your Department) in economic development?
13. What, in your view, is the relationship between social protection and economic development?
14. What in your view, is the role of social policy in economic development
15. What in your view, are the key programmes that will enable economic development for the poor and vulnerable in the City of Johannesburg
16. What policy instruments can be explored to strengthen the link / integration between social and economic policy for the benefit of the poor and vulnerable?
17. What are the microeconomic returns of social protection?
18. Why do you think current policy practice in South Africa ignores exploring this link?

Social Protection as an enabler of economic development – specialist interview guide

1. What do you think, in your view, social and economic policies can be integrated with the aim of developing a holistic approach to social protection?
2. What policy instrument can be explored to strengthen the integration of social and economic policies for the benefit of the poor and vulnerable?
3. How can the government move the poor and vulnerable from income poverty/ social wage to economic development?
4. In your view, what are the key interventions to be made to enhance economic development of the poor and vulnerable?
5. What are the institutional arrangement to drive such integration?