The Historical Contribution of Black Musicians to Orchestral Classical Music around Johannesburg and the Implications for Cultural Policy

---

Thesis Presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Cultural Policy and Management

University of the Witwatersrand

Johannesburg

Shadrack Bokaba

Supervisor: Professor Brett Pyper

31 July 2023

Declaration

I, Shadrack Bokaba, declare this thesis is my own unaided work. It is being submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Cultural Policy and Management at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other university.

_____

Shadrack Bokaba

31 July 2023

Acknowledgements

Everyone who has expressed interest in the topic and given practical assistance to me, including agreeing to participate in the interviews, especially the people who have lived part of the history I am describing in the following chapters. Please do know that you have made an important contribution, and for that, I will forever be grateful!

To my supervisor, Professor Brett Pyper, thank you so much for your patience, sometimes during very difficult times, and for your invaluable insights and incisive comments that have helped determine the direction of the research throughout this long process.

To my wife and friend Buhle, it is time we take that long holiday I promised! Thank you for your encouragement, support and reading the many versions, especially in the final stages of the project.

To my daughters, Aziza Botlhale and Marang Imara, thank you for the pictures and your interest and encouragement.

Abbreviations

ACTAG Arts and Culture Task Group

ACOSA African Cultural Organisation of South Africa

ANC African National Congress

APLA Azanian People's Liberation Army

AU African Union

AYE African Youth Ensemble

BB Broederbond

BMSC Bantu Men's Social Centre

CAPAB Cape Performing Arts Board

CPO Cape Philharmonic Orchestra

DAC Department of Arts and Culture

DACST Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology

DOCC Donaldson Orlando Community Centre

DSAC Department of Sport, Arts and Culture

JBMF Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival

JPO Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra

JSO Johannesburg Symphony Orchestra

KZNPO KwaZulu-Natal Philharmonic Orchestra

MNPO Mzansi National Philharmonic Orchestra

NAC National Arts Council

NAPAC Natal Performing Arts Council

NCO National Chamber Orchestra

NFVF National Film and Video Foundation

NHC National Heritage Council

NPO National Philharmonic Orchestra of South Africa

NSO National Symphony Orchestra

OAU Organisation of African Unity

PAC Pan-Africanist Congress

PACs Performing Arts Councils

PACOFS Performing Arts Council of the Orange Free State

PACT Performing Arts Council of Transvaal

RDP Reconstruction and Development Programme

RWP Revised White Paper on Arts, Culture and heritage adopted by South Africa's Parliament in 2019

SABC South African Broadcasting Corporation

SAMAP South African Music Archive Project (at the University of KwaZulu-Natal)

SAMET South African Music Education Trust

SANNC South African Native National Congress

TATA Transvaal African Teachers' Association

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

WITS University of the Witwatersrand

WP White Paper on Arts, Culture and heritage (1996)

WRAB West Rand Administration Board

Table of Contents

Annexures

Tables

Figures

Figure 5.2: The JPO Academy Orchestra performing at the Linder Auditorium, Johannesburg.

Abstract

This study documents the historical contribution of black musicians to classical music in Johannesburg. It places the spotlight on South Africa's cultural policy (explicitly or implicitly) over the last century and provides ongoing reflections on this period. The thesis analyses the conditions, within and beyond the prevailing policy that enabled black orchestral musicians to practice this art form. By exploring the complex origins of these practices, the study suggests that the dichotomous thinking about culture as either Eurocentric or Afro-centric may be misplaced due to the possibility that Western classical music may have become part of black South African cultural life as a result of having been translated, transferred, hybridised or acculturated. In addition, the study places the government's arm's length funding model under scrutiny and finds this approach continues to be applied inconsistently since it was first presented in the White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage (1996).

As both a classical musician and orchestral administrator, the author has lived part of the history described in the thesis and, through analysis, attempts to establish a dialogue between professional experience and what scholarly reflection can do to that practice. He presents narratives through insider lenses, with carefully selected interviewees, and interrogates situations and sites over a century-long period of the history of black orchestral music practice in South Africa.

Chapter 1

Introduction and Literature Review

South Africa's imported art forms include European classical music, which has formed part of the tools used to suppress black cultures during the colonial and apartheid eras in South Africa and the African continent. As Riva (2016) points out, the arrival of the European settlers on the African continent came with an image of Africa that supported their political and economic interests. Quoting Said (1979), Riva states that Europeans constructed a collective image of the whole African continent as a counterpart to Europe, meaning 'uncivilised', 'heathen', 'wild' and 'animalistic' (Riva, 2016: 130). The term 'Africa' was deployed and used to not differentiate between the many cultures in sub-Saharan Africa and its regions of West, East and Southern Africa, or the so-called 'Black Africa'. According to Riva (2016), this was part of a colonial strategy that could be used to name all the music from 'Black Africa' as African music and to project the cultures of these regions collectively as the whole continent (Riva, 2016: 130). Quoting Radano and Olaniyan (2016), Riva pointed to how pre-colonial musical practices in occupied African territories, including in sub-Saharan Africa, were marginalised, forbidden or destroyed, supported by the anthropological and ethnographic sciences at the time, that constructed the idea of binary divisions of 'uncivilised' and 'ahistorical' in terms of African music. European music was introduced as 'civilised' within the missions and colonial armies. According to Riva (2016), Western classical music remained 'white music' in all settlers' colonies, including South Africa (Riva, 2016: 131).

The advent of democracy in South Africa in 1994 was thus seen as a unique opportunity that, for the first time in the history of the country, all arts and culture practitioners would have the right to participate in creating public policy and structures directly affecting their lives and livelihoods, and the quality of life in the community at large (White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage, 1996). This led to the establishment of the Arts and Culture Task Group (ACTAG), which comprised practitioners, educators and administrators, embarking on consultative and writing

processes, which produced the draft report that formed the basis for the White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage (1996). This consultative process was not without its problems. One of the challenges was the persistent tensions around the Eurocentric versus the Afro-centric debate, which at some point, led to the Director-General in the Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology (DACST), Roger Jardine, to comment in an interview in The Argus (Tonight) on 12 June 1995, that this debate was counter-productive because South Africa's cultural identity included both Eurocentric and Afro-centric art forms (Williams, 1996). All forms of culture were equally important for Jardine, including access, as everyone had the right to freedom of expression.

The final draft of the White Paper (1996) defined the arts as all forms and traditions of dance, drama, music, music theatre, visual arts, crafts, design, and written and oral literature, as it declared that all these arts serve as a means for individual and collective expression through performance, execution, presentation, exhibition, transmission and study (White Paper, 1996, Chapter1). This definition of arts included Western European music, as the White Paper (1996) defined South African heritage as the total of works of art, literature and music, oral traditions, among other art forms, and their documentation, which provides the basis for shared culture and creativity in the arts.

Indeed, the values on which the White Paper (1996) is based are derived from the country's Bill of Rights, including paragraph 16, which states that 'everyone has the right to freedom of expression, which includes freedom of artistic creativity', and similarly, paragraph 30 states that everyone has the right to use the language and to participate in the cultural life of their choice (WP, 1996, Chapter 1).

Throughout the White Paper (1996), there is great emphasis on African traditions. However, these should be understood in the Southern African context, as African traditions cover all regions on the continent, and African culture, in particular, is not homogenous. The term 'African music' should be understood to mean music from Southern Africa.
The White Paper attempted to address some issues related to imported Western arts which, it stated, were absorbing 46% of South Africa's total budget for the arts. The apartheid

government was committed to advancing Afrikaner nationalism and securing and maintaining control over cultural institutions. The government funded the four Provincial Arts Councils (PACs) to achieve this. These were the Cape Performing Arts Board (CAPAB), now known as Artscape, the Performing Arts Council of the Orange Free State (PACOFS), the Performing Arts Council of the Transvaal (PACT), now renamed as the South African State Theatre and the Natal Performing Arts Council (NAPAC) currently named the Playhouse. Additionally, there was the Performing Arts Council of Bophuthatswana[1], to which government funds were also allocated. Each of these PACs had its resident orchestra, with the founding of the Natal Philharmonic Orchestra in 1983 attached to NAPAC; PACT Orchestra founded in 1963 and attached to PACT two years later in 1965; the Free State Symphony Orchestra founded in 1974 as a collaborative effort between PACOFS, the University of the Orange Free State and the Free State Education Department; the Cape Town orchestras, including the Cape Town Municipal Orchestra, founded in 1914 and CAPAB Orchestra attached to CAPAB, which together merged in 1997 to form the Cape Philharmonic Orchestra. The SABC has had its own studio orchestra in Johannesburg since 1923. When the Municipal Orchestra of the City of Johannesburg was disbanded in 1954, its musicians were incorporated into the newly formed National Symphony Orchestra (NSO) under the auspices of the South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC). Until the early 1990s, these orchestras had to contribute to advancing the cultural agenda of the apartheid government. They were expected to present special performances on festive occasions in celebration of the White supremacist regime, undertake tours to perform for racially circumscribed and segregated audiences, including schools and town halls, invite great international soloists and conductors, and generally focus on providing European high culture, including supporting ballet and opera.

Realising that just under 50% of the available funding was still being absorbed by Western arts after 1996 triggered a significant restructuring of the funding environment, negatively impacting these orchestras and other imported art forms dependent on government funding. The new funding model proposed by the White Paper (1996) was to be an 'arm's length' approach which was seen as fundamental to freedom of expression, and funding

[1] Bophuthatswana was designated as a 'homeland' for Setswana speaking South Africans, but was incorporated into South Africa in 1994.

was to be allocated to the sectors fairly and equitably through the National Arts Council (NAC). According to Chartrand and McCaughey (1989), this public policy is applied in law, politics and economics in most Western societies, and the principle is implicit in the constitutional separation of powers between the judiciary, executive and legislative branches of government. It is a crucial finding of the thesis that, since 1997, the South African government has not applied this principle consistently, and the status of the arm's length funding model is, at this stage, questionable.

The development of human resources has been one of the critical objectives of the White Paper (1996), which set out to train practitioners, administrators, and educators, as it said that this kind of training was generally not available in the education system designed for Black people before 1994. According to the WP (1996), this kind of training could create more performing arts work and exhibition opportunities for Black artists. This formed part of the NAC's mandate, which funds bursaries and training programmes.

Lastly, the WP (1996) aimed to provide and maintain arts infrastructure in Black communities, as existing infrastructure heavily favoured the cities of the previous four provinces, where the PACs are located, rather than the 'homelands'. By 'homelands', the White Paper referred to areas where the majority of the Black population was moved by the apartheid government, preventing them from living in the urban areas. Bophuthatswana was the only homeland with an arts council and Mmabana community arts and sports facilities.

These initial policy shifts of 1996 appear to have affected selected orchestras of Bophuthatswana, Free State, Pretoria and Johannesburg. The National Symphony Orchestra (NSO) in Johannesburg was funded through the SABC[2], and this funding was discontinued in April 1997. In defence of their decision to close the NSO, the government, through the then Minister of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology (DACST) Baldwin Sipho 'Ben' Ngubane, announced in the 1998 budget speech that the country's many other cultures and forms of artistic expression would benefit from these budget cuts and would at last be given equal

[2] Article published by the Guardian Newspaper titled 'Orchestra's demise strikes sour note in new South Africa' by Chris McGreal can be accessed online at https://www.theguardian.com/world/2000/jan/29/chrismcgreal

opportunity[3]. In an article published in the *Mail & Guardian* weeks after the announcement to cut the NSO's budget, Brett Pyper (1997) made interesting arguments for and against maintaining funding for the NSO. On the positive side, Pyper noted the orchestra engaged with African choral music through the various choral concert initiatives where the NSO provided orchestral accompaniment. These initiatives were a precursor to renowned composer Mzilikazi Khumalo's epic work, *Ushaka*, which the NSO recorded in 1996. On the other hand, Pyper reminded his readers about the NSO's lack of transformation in terms of mainstream concerts, which were still targeted at a minority of the population[4]. According to the government, the restructuring in orchestral spending aimed to encourage greater participation in the arts, specifically within historically marginalised communities, by providing new funding arrangements and institutional frameworks. However, what was not considered was the possibility that some of these imported art forms, including orchestral music, may have become part of Black South African cultural life due to having been translated, transformed, hybridised or acculturated.

Prof Khabi Vivian Mngoma (1922 – 1999), who studied and taught Western classical music for decades, offered some insight into why classical music was being translated, transformed or indigenised. In 'The Teaching of Music South Africa' (Mngoma, 1987: 199), he suggested that various black groups in South Africa already possessed a rich musical culture as they had learnt Western classical, folk and popular music and had tendencies to indigenise 'Western musical traits'. He suggested that the indigenisation of Western culture was bound to happen. On its own, Western culture did not meet, serve or satisfy the cultural needs and criteria of an African student, and it tended to inhibit musical expression, growth and experience, eventually alienating the student from society. Mngoma argued it was critical that, before one can structure effective music education programmes, the culture and nature of a people must be understood. When this article was published, Mngoma was teaching at the University of Zululand in the Department of Music. In the article, he stressed the significance of adopting an 'androgenic', pedagogic approach to

[3] Article titled 'Arts abroad: an orchestra falls silent as South Africa struggles on', published on 1 February 2000 in the *New York Times* and written by Henri E. Cauvin, can be accessed online at https://www.nytimes.com/2000/02/01/arts-abroad-an-orchestra-falls-silent-as-south-africa-struggles-on.html

[4] Article by Brett Pyper was published by *Mail & Guardian* on 17 June 1997 and titled 'Will the Band Play On?' Article can be accessed online at https://mg.co.za/article/1997-01-17-will-the-band-play-on/

teaching music in South Africa. By 'androgenic', Mngoma was referring to the importance of learning both Western and African genres, not one or the other.

The fourth and final draft of South Africa's revised White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage,[5] approved by Parliament in 2019,[6] provides the clearest articulation of South Africa's post-apartheid cultural policy. The thinking behind the revision of the White Paper (1996)[7] was to consolidate the democratic dispensation established for the sector in 1996, reposition it to address its shortcomings effectively and integrate it into national policies and strategies for artistic, cultural, social, and economic development[8]. According to the Department of Arts and Culture's presentation to Parliament on 4th December 2018, these shortcomings included that the WP did not go far enough to address the transformation of arts and culture institutions and structures. As a result, redress, redistribution and access were still problems in the new dispensation. In the presentation, the funding and finance models were blamed as they were said to be not flexible enough. As a result, a new proposal was made to reconfigure the arts, culture and heritage dispensation and policies underpinning it for optimal performance. New proposals included the merger of the NAC and another agency of the Department of Arts and Culture, the National Film and Video Foundation (NFVF), to establish the South African National Arts and Audiovisual Council. The RWP acknowledges the country's musical heritage, which it says includes imported Western, Asian and African or indigenous music practices. However, it states that it intends to be African-centred, following earlier similar Afrocentric policies and these 'can be traced back to African anti-colonial struggles in which the role of African culture was a source of pride, innovation and resistance to colonialism and the imposition of Western art' (RWP, 2019:15).

Following the original WP (1996), the RWP recognises the diversity of South Africa's people and, as a result, has developed tools to foster inclusiveness. This strategy was proposed in

[5] Hereafter referred to as the RWP, which can be accessed online at the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture (DSAC) at www.dac.gov.za/content/revised-white-paper-arts-culture-and-heritage-fourth-draft-0

[6] The approval was announced by the DSAC at their meeting with the portfolio committee on Sport, Arts and Culture which can be accessed online through the parliament monitoring group at https://pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/34013

[7] Hereafter referred to as the WP and which can be accessed online at the DSAC at www.dac.gov.za/content/white-paper-arts-culture-and-heritage.

[8] Presentation by the DSAC to the Portfolio Committee on Arts and Culture and Heritage took place on 4 December 2018, and can be viewed online at static.pmg.org.za/181204revised_paper.pptx.

line with the UNESCO Declaration on Cultural Diversity (2001) and the Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005), and is concerned with the inherent need for the recognition of equal dignity of, and respect for, all cultures of persons belonging to minorities and of indigenous peoples (RWP, 2019:9). This policy position, therefore, agrees with Pyykkonen (2012)[9], who proposes that cultural diversity is innate, as it is part of human nature, basic rights and equal opportunities for socioeconomic development, and should be aimed at promoting and striving for developing equality and democracy.

Critical to this study, the RWP proposed establishing new national theatre, dance and orchestral companies in cities and rural communities to be cross-subsidised by national, provincial, metro and local funding. The implementation and results of these objectives are discussed in later chapters.

A poly-epistemic approach recognising cultural diversity allows the country to place African cultural systems at the centre while keeping other art-forms alive. Matarasso and Landry (1999) proposed a policy-making process best described by using the analogy of 'a tightrope walker who is always conscious of the two ends of his balancing pole, continually making slight adjustments to preserve that elusive point of balance' (Matarasso & Landry, 1999:7). The dichotomous way of thinking about culture is thus problematic against the backdrop of South Africa, given that it is not a straightforward case of Euro- or Afrocentric, monoculture or cultural diversity. The justified pursuit of decolonialism should avoid reproducing essentialised, dichotomised understanding of culture that was, ironically, at the heart of colonial thinking and administration. In other words, one should recognise that Western classical music has provided a platform for interrogating and reclaiming colonial legacies from African epistemological perspectives in certain places at particular moments. These particular moments in history include the launch of the South African Native National Congress (SANNC) in 1912, which was later renamed the African National Congress (ANC),

[9] Pyykkonen's article titled UNESCO and cultural diversity: democratisation, commodification or governmentalisationof culture? is published in the International Jourrnal of Culture, Vol.18, 2012-Issue 5: Cultural Policy and Democracy and can be accessed at https://doi.org/10.1080/10286632.2012.718914.

where the works of African composers John Knox Bokwe and Enoch Sontonga were used for the opening and closing ceremonies (Meli, 1988:25).

In terms of professional orchestras, this research came at a time when the government was implementing aspects of the RWP, which placed the orchestral sector in the spotlight. In his 2019 budget speech, former Minister of Finance, Tito Titus Mboweni, announced a new national orchestra and emphasised that South Africa's public finance choices should signal an intention to preserve, enhance and grow the diversity of cultural offerings. He announced that his department was considering proposals for developing a new national theatre and museum. Also, he would consider financial support for the National Archives, a national orchestra and a ballet troupe.[10]

The Minister of Arts and Culture may, in terms of the Culture and Promotions Act (1983, amended 1998), acquire, develop and maintain movable and immovable property, award bursaries and make grants to undertake study tours to foreign countries, establish, launch or finance any organisation or project likely to have an impact throughout the country or assist non-formal community-based arts education projects, among other objectives to develop, promote and achieve the aspirations outlined in terms of arts and culture in the Republic.

Another Act that may be relevant in the situation is the Cultural Institutions Act of 1998, in terms of which the Minister of Arts and Culture, in consultation with the Minister of Finance, may authorise payment of subsidies to declared cultural institutions, provide for the establishment of certain institutions under the control of councils, establish a national museum division and provide for matters connected and related to the mandate. The former finance minister, therefore, seemed to act beyond his mandate when he announced a new orchestra, as the Minister of Sport, Arts and Culture (DSAC) had not yet done so. In addition, if the DSAC intended to establish an orchestra, it would need to do it in terms of the legal prescripts above, including declaring the proposed orchestra as a cultural institution in terms of the Cultural Institutions Act (1998) or applying the Cultural

[10] Former Minister Tito Mboweni's 2019 budget speech can be accessed online at https://www.gov.za/af/node/786807.

Promotions Act to facilitate the flow of funds to the orchestra. This did not seem to be the case, as the minister did not cite any of the above Acts in his announcement. Instead, he appeared to rely on the objectives of the RWP, which are not sufficient as the White Paper is not an Act of Parliament but rather a broad statement of government policy.

In addition, there are usually extensive public consultations that precede decisions, such as establishing new national orchestras. However, former Minister of Sport, Arts and Culture (DSAC) Emmanuel Nkosinathi 'Nathi' Mthethwa questionably went ahead by appointing Bongani Tembe to head the new organisation. This was concerning, as Tembe was already in charge of two regional orchestras in Kwa-Zulu Natal and Johannesburg. This move by the government effectively placed three major orchestras under the control of one person. Despite the public outcry, the Mzansi National Philharmonic Orchestra was launched on 14 July 2021 with a promise to contribute to a socially cohesive society with a common national identity, create and preserve music that reflects the country's heritage, find and train young musicians, and promote the development of orchestral music, among other reported objectives.[11]

Furthermore, the new national orchestra promised to undertake pioneering work by finding and training black artists and placing them in critical positions. The RWP found that the transformation of arts and culture institutions and structures had been lacking in the new dispensation, including in professional orchestras, which continued to be dominated by white musicians, so finding black players was thus an important statement to make.

The government made an initial investment of over R54 million in the first year to support this project without explaining how the orchestra would be sustained in the future or indicating how the high standards of performance were to be achieved. The model appears to be of players randomly invited without auditions, and this has raised questions about how the highest standards of orchestral playing are to be achieved if the same musicians will not be playing together all the time. As the Cape Philharmonic Orchestra pointed out in

[11] Article titled 'Mzansi National Philharmonic Orchestra will Champion SA's Vibrant and Diverse Communities' authored by L Engelbrecht published by News24 and available online at https://www.news24.com/arts/mzansi-national-philharmonic-orchestra-will-champion-sas-vibrant--and-diverse-communities.

their rebuttal[12] of the new ensemble, 'pick-up' orchestras notoriously lack these standards, which may lead to international soloists and conductors being reluctant to perform in South Africa, something that may impact the ability of the regional orchestras to attract top international talent. Lastly, the CPO states that they spend a third of their budget on teaching and mentoring young musicians through their grassroots teaching project, Masidlale, which includes an academy for young musicians, two youth orchestras and several smaller ensembles. Hundreds of learners will be affected if this system is consistently interrupted by mentors and teachers being on national orchestra tours.

1.2 A Brief History of Orchestral Performances in Black Townships

It is necessary to go through the less well-known history of orchestral music in black communities, which remains understudied and largely undocumented, to understand South Africa's cultural policy regarding orchestras, including the accompanying persistent Euro- and Afrocentric debates. Thankfully, some of the significant cultural developments that occurred from the 1930s to the 1950s were captured by Walter Nhlapo. Nhlapo was one of the prominent writers working for the *Bantu World*, a South African weekly newspaper published from 1932–1955 targeting the black middle-class elite[13]. The paper was founded by white liberals, including Bertram Paver, JD Rheinallt-Jones and James Howard Pim – who was a councillor in the city of Johannesburg and had the settlement of Pimville, which became part of Soweto, named after him. Nhlapo had a regular column titled *Spotlight on Social Events*. From this column, for example, the first reported classical concert featuring black and white artists together on stage was documented (more on this event in the second chapter).

Another example of emblematic testimony that points to a black orchestral legacy in Johannesburg is captured in the book *Trevor Huddleston: A Life* by Robin Denniston (1999).

[12] Cape Philharmonic's press release (in the author's possession) accompanied by media interviews were widley quoted in various publications including an article by Gill Gifford 'Akin to Orchestra Capture – Mthethwa Plan gets a Public Panning' published by Timeslive on 16 July 2022 accessible at timeslive.co.za and an article by Victoria O'Regan titled 'Orchestral Manoeuvres in the Dark', published on 10 July 2022 in the Daily Maverick, accessible at dailymaverick.co.za.

[13] Wits Research Archives available online at www.historicalpapers-atom.wits.ac.za.

In the book, Archbishop Desmond Tutu recalled his first experience with classical music in Sophiatown, a diverse township outside Johannesburg where black people were allowed to buy land before 1913. This first concert featured internationally acclaimed virtuoso violinist Yehudi Menuhin. According to Tutu, several eminent artists came to Sophiatown from time to time at the invitation of Father Huddleston, whose office was at 74 Meyer Street, where he was based for his pastoral work (Denniston, 1999: 270). A hitherto largely invisible black orchestral legacy still needs to be uncovered. The project has also benefitted from earlier research by Pamela Tancsik (2009). She conducted post-doctoral research on Joseph Trauneck (1898–1975) as part of the South African Music Archive Project (SAMAP). Tancsik's research (2009)[14] indicates that the South African cultural scene partly benefitted from the ascension of Adolf Hitler to power in 1933, which led many persecuted Jewish musicians to emigrate from Europe to South Africa, especially to Johannesburg. As Tancsik (2009) found out, this movement of musicians to Africa ultimately served to increase the cultural activities in the country. Based on their experiences of persecution in Nazi Europe, these Jewish immigrant musicians understood the potential human rights abuses that could emerge from colonialism and apartheid and their impact. Therefore, many chose to ignore the colonial and apartheid laws from the 1940s and took risks to give music lessons to African learners. SAMAP research indicates one of the prominent teachers and pioneers was the Jewish conductor Joseph Trauneck, who was in South Africa for 21 years from 1934–1955. Trauneck's own lived experience in Nazi Germany, where he lost his job as a musical director under Nazi policies, propelled his involvement and participation in the musical life of the townships. According to Tancsik, this resulted in him having to oppose the racially exclusive policies of the South African Nationalist government by sheer participation. Trauneck not only gave symphonic concerts in Sophiatown with his Johannesburg Symphony Orchestra (JSO), but as it will be shown, he was passionate about music education. One of the beneficiaries of his teachings was Khabi Mngoma, who took conducting and keyboard lessons with Trauneck, among other music subjects. Mngoma's interest in the orchestra may have been due to his involvement with choirs, which often required accompaniment. In Inge Mari Burger's doctoral thesis titled The Life and Work of Khabi Mngoma (1992), she

[14] Tancsik's research is titled Tracing Joseph Trauneck: The Wanderings of a Persecuted Man, it is published in the journal, Fontes Artis Musicae, 56 (2),2 115-137 and accessible online at https://www.jstor.org/stable/23512559. It is part of the South African Music Archive Project at the University of KwaZulu-Natal.

writes about Mngoma's numerous initiatives and experiments with orchestral ensembles. Some of Mngoma's work continues today through his son, the cellist Lindumuzi 'Linda' Mngoma and his grandchildren, Tshepo Mngoma (violinist) and Sibongile Mngoma (opera singer).

Against the historical background described above, this research explores the relationship between policy and practice, specifically concerning black musicians' practice of classical music. The study addresses the following questions:

- What is the place, in policy and practice, of classical music in the democratic dispensation of South Africa?
- What are the implications of this for cultural policy?

I analysed the conditions, within and beyond prevailing policy that enabled black orchestral musicians to practice this art form to answer these questions. I reviewed archival sources and interviewed several practising professionals, including policymakers, arts administrators, orchestral musicians, writers, and academics.
Veronica Franke (2012) observed that critical literature on developing orchestral music in South Africa is limited and relatively sparse. As was discovered, so too is the history of black orchestral musicians.

It is rather timely that this research began when South Africa's national government was reviewing its White Paper on Arts and Culture and is concluding amid controversy about establishing a new 'national' orchestra. The issues that this research project addressed were not only relevant but emphasised areas where current policy appears lacking. None of the studies referred to, including studies in the histories of orchestral and broader South African music documented before this work, considered the policy dimensions of the histories they recount. Examples include the work by Veit Erlmann titled African Stars (1991). Erlmann's work does, however, serve to contribute to a better understanding of the history of *isicathamiya*, the evolution of Zulu music and dance, and the life of Reuben T Caluza, who is credited as being the first black ragtime composer. One of Erlmann's most important contributions is his reconstruction of the 1890s concert tours of the Afro-American vocal

group Orpheus M McAdoo and the Virginia Jubilee Singers. Erlmann (1991) was, to an extent, able to link the evolution of black performance to the surge in economic and racial segregation of South African society. However, no orchestral music was covered in this contribution, but attempts were made in his subsequent books on these topics.

Similarly, the pioneering work done by David B Coplan titled In Township Tonight (1985; 2007) is another example which explores more than three centuries of diverse histories of South Africa's black popular culture. However, the 'first orchestra' that Coplan presents in his research is fundamentally different to that being explored in this work. The orchestra Coplan refers to is the slave orchestra owned by the Dutch Governor in the Cape from 1676. It drew its players from enslaved Africans and enslaved people from the Indian subcontinent and South-East Asia (Coplan, 1985; 2007). This orchestra used indigenous and locally made instruments fashioned on European models to perform folk music. The term 'orchestra' in this research, however, refers to a standard Western classical orchestra consisting of four families, namely strings (violins, violas, cellos, and basses), winds (flutes, clarinet, bassoon and oboe), brass and percussion instruments. The history recounted in the thesis seldom engages directly with indigenous musical practices. Michael Moerane, Khabi Mngoma, Michael Masote, and others were musically conservative, with composer and choral conductor Mzilikazi Khumalo arguably one of the most 'indigenous' in his approach. Even then, he worked almost exclusively with Western orchestral instruments and principles.

However, it is interesting to note how enslaved musicians in the Cape Governor's orchestra were open to adapting or adopting newly discovered instruments. According to Coplan (1985; 2007), this can be seen as an indirect extension of the principles of vocal music in the African community. The last example of pioneering studies relevant to this project is Cockburn's (2008), who attempted to document the history of the performance of *Handel's Messiah* in South Africa. This included performances in some of Johannesburg's black townships, including Sophiatown's first classical concert, presented in October 1944 and featuring the JSO led by Trauneck (Cockburn, 2008: 182-190). This is significant because such performances, as will be shown, inspired some in the audience to pursue careers in orchestral music. These included music educator and violinist Michael Matlhaela Masote,

who has helped spread the popularity of orchestral music by, among others, founding the Soweto Youth Orchestra in 1965 and translating Handel's Messiah into nine South African languages, known as the 'Black Messiah' in 1983. Masote established the Mmabatho Youth Orchestra in Bophuthatswana in the 1980s.

It was possible to understand how and why formal music education initiatives focused on orchestral music were introduced by following the work of Zephania Mothopeng, Khabi Mngoma and Lucas Makhema, who was also Trauneck's township contact. The study provided an opportunity to document the long legacy of black orchestral practice in and around Johannesburg that seems invisible to policymakers. However, these practices in Johannesburg were fundamentally different to those of the Cape Governor's orchestra described above, as the Johannesburg one consisted of traditional Western orchestral instruments. However, the instruments were used not only to play European repertoire but, at times, to perform arrangements of pre-existing traditional folk and African choral music and original African compositions for orchestra, thus continuing the indigenisation process which formed part of African classical music.

According to Cockburn, black performances of classical music represented cultures concerning which the emerging African elite defined themselves, to which they aspired, mattered and within which they sought recognition. In political terms, Cockburn argues that these performances could, to reaffirm the performer, be used to support or to subvert an established political order and to reinforce or challenge patterns of domination.

The arguments put forward by Cockburn, Coplan, Erlmann and others are not new but instead form part of a long historiography white researchers have dominated until recently. Perhaps it is time that history is explored, told, and understood from new perspectives, experiences, topics and works with distinctive features (Thompson, 2000: vi- xvi). It is important to note that, as it will be presented, Cockburn, Coplan, and Erlmann's positioning of black thought and history varies with the interviewee's thinking. It should also be noted that white researchers, including Cockburn, Coplan and Erlmann, always had access to resources around knowledge production. Few black people were afforded legitimacy in

documenting their histories due to the historical political power dynamics of access to resources around knowledge production.

It was against this background that it became necessary to find out from those who considered themselves cultural activists what they thought about the place of African adoptions or appropriations of Western classical culture (whether music, theatre or anything else) by black South African artists and audiences, within the context of the policy advances during the struggle and since 1994. It was essential to establish if these practices were deliberately overlooked or de-prioritised.

Figure 1: From left to right: Shadrack Bokaba (violin), Patrick Motsa (violin), Arthur Matlhatsi (violin), Tshepo Komane (viola) and Lebogang Nkwane (cello), performing African music on Western orchestral instruments for villagers in the North West Province.
(S. Bokaba, circa 1990, private collection).

1.3 The popularity of brass instruments in townships

Instrumental playing traditions are built over time, and brass playing (trumpet, trombone, tuba, French horn, and euphonium) traditions are among the earliest Western musical instruments to be adopted and the most popular in black communities. There are many reasons for this. Brass playing has been integral to South Africa's church music since the middle of the 17th century, popularised by churches such as the Moravian church, established in 1838[15]. In 1883, the Salvation Army launched its first branch in Cape Town, followed by the launch of the Johannesburg branch in 1886[16].

In addition, during the 1940s, the non-European Affairs Department (NEAD) in Johannesburg introduced several brass bands across its black townships, which played on special occasions. Brass instruments were among the first to be introduced and were preferred ahead of their wind and string counterparts for practical and economic reasons. Some reasons are partly explained by Herbert (1997: 188, quoted by Kierman, 2009), who suggested that brass instruments were preferred for their sonic impact and practical utility. Given their tolerance to humidity or extreme temperature changes, these instruments are easier to maintain. The player's lips form the vibrating membrane, and as a result, the challenge of constantly renewing parts, as in the string (strings) or woodwind (reeds) families, is diminished (Kierman, 2009: 17).

Among education institutions, Ohlange Institute, a private college outside Durban founded by the educator and founding member president of the SANNC, John L Dube, in 1901 as a South African counterpart to Booker T Washington's Tuskegee Institute in the United States, was well-known for its brass ensembles (Erlmann, 1991: 61). Centres such as Ohlange, Adams College, and their African American points of reference, had music performance as an integral part of their educational programme. With this background information, it is understandable why the City Council of Johannesburg initially invested in brass instruments and only introduced other instruments later or why more musicians play brass than any other instrument in townships.

[15] Moravian Brass Band Union of South Africa can be accessed online at https://www.moravianbrass.co.za/.
[16] The Salvation Army remains active in South Africa accessible online at https://www.salvationarmy.org.za.

1.4. Research Methodology

Based on the work done by Scullion and Garcia (2005), Gray (2010), and Paquette and Redaelli (2015), it is clear that cultural policy exists in diverse contexts, interrogates by questioning and uses a wide range of research methodologies. Furthermore, in Arts Management and Cultural Policy Research (2015), Paquette and Redaelli state there is no consensus on the agreed definition of 'culture' or its existence in the humanities and social sciences, nor is there consistent articulation of what cultural policy is. Their argument rests on the reality that 'culture' is defined and determined by each discipline that claims it as a core and befitting area of study, and based on that, cultural policy research should be explored using a multidisciplinary approach. Paquette and Redaelli (2015: 77) argue that acknowledging and thinking of cultural policy research in a multidisciplinary way is one of the critical steps to understanding and appreciating cultural policies. By simply ignoring the different disciplines, some researchers may be entertaining different understandings and definitions, which could result in quarrels (Gray, 2010). Paquette and Redaelli (2015: 78) emphasise that knowledge of the multidisciplinary context of cultural policy research should inform and strengthen interdisciplinary understanding and academic openness. It is for this reason that Gray (2010) stated that some research must be situated in the context of its respective discipline, which is an act of sound academic judgement and awareness but does not mean that other work can be safely ignored because they are thought to be wrong. A multidisciplinary approach allows both the historical research and the policy implications of that history to be considered. The study draws on sociology, cultural studies and political science and uses identified perspectives, including community cultural development, diversity, sustainability, heritage, and the creative industries.

South African cultural policy has embraced the definition of culture as a holistic way of life, as explained by the Marxist literary scholar and social historian Raymond Williams (1983). Williams (1983: 91) analysed prior definitions of culture and concluded that it develops across the facets of the intellectual, spiritual and aesthetic process that points to a specific way of life, whether of a people, period, group, or humanity in general. His definition also includes practices of intellectual and, specifically, artistic activity, music, literature, painting,

and sculpture. The African Union's *Charter for African Cultural Renaissance* (2006: 5), which appears to align with the ideas put forward by Williams (1983:91), states that:

> *[A]ny human community is necessarily governed by rules and principles based on culture; and that culture should be regarded as the set of distinctive linguistic, spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features of the society or social group, and that it encompasses, in addition to art and literature, lifestyles, ways of living together, value systems, traditions and beliefs.*

Gray (2010) discusses the significance of how knowledge is acquired as it pertains to the subject being researched and can be a distinguishing factor between positivist, interpretivist, and realist methodologies. Gray (2010) also states that, in general, much of the cultural studies literature is interpretivist. This view applies to this study as it involves interpreting the various elements integrating human interest and considering the policy implications. Therefore, the study uses qualitative analysis as the most suitable method for this research. As stated by Scullion and Garcia (2005), the audience of cultural policy is diverse and distinctive to the extent that it may be considered a defining aspect. The intended audience for this study includes, among others, academics, civil society, interested establishments and specialist agencies involved in culture and the arts, consultancies and think tanks, policymakers, and politicians at every level, from local to international.

In terms of analysis, as Gray (2010:216) points out, new findings and areas of knowledge that can be generated with a greater awareness of underlying ontological, epistemological, and methodological bases offer different approaches to analysis. There is, therefore, more significant potential not only to recognise the strength, weaknesses and possibilities of current research but also to develop new pathways for future research. The multidisciplinary, qualitative research design framework approach for this study aligns with Hofstee's work, which is based on the credibility of the approach and process to the research, and hence the argument that a result can only be accepted, rejected, checked, replicated, or even understood in the context of how the researcher got there (Hofstee,

2009: 107). Furthermore, it made it possible not only to understand how social networks helped keep cultural traditions, and more specifically, classical music alive but assisted with evaluating current arts policies concerning orchestral music practice in black townships.

All steps were followed to ensure that this study could expand the body of knowledge in the field of cultural policy and that the results were accepted and understood. The study benefitted from existing historical papers currently in the custody of the University of the Witwatersrand (Wits), which include minutes and reports of the City of Johannesburg, lease agreements entered into by the city, newspaper clippings, contracts and other relevant information. In addition, ongoing research at the South African Music Archive Project at the University of Kwa-Zulu Natal, especially the work undertaken by Pamela Tancsik on Joseph Trauneck, was useful in giving context to the developments from the 1930s to the 1950s. Cecil Skotnes' family archives shed further light on the reasons for developing township music education projects during his tenure with the City of Johannesburg.

The sampling of the interviewees was carefully planned, focusing on specific people who understood the issues from their personal experiences or situations. These included retired and current orchestral musicians (both black and white), music educators, policy experts, arts administrators and academics, cultural activists, and choral conductors (see Appendix B). The interviews were semi-structured, but I had to return several times to some interviewees for further clarity or more information. The range of skills and backgrounds of the interviewees assisted with understanding the reasons behind the thriving orchestral music practices in the townships covered in the thesis, their place in policy and a better understanding of the policy environment in general and other socio-political conditions.

The semi-structured interviews allowed for focused conversations while also providing the freedom to explore the participants' responses further. It has to be noted at this point that two of the interviewees who participated in the launch concerts of South Africa's newly formed national orchestra requested anonymity and that they should not be identifiable. They were required to clarify the booking process to determine if merit is considered when selecting musicians, whether there are auditions or if the selection of musicians is based on something else. They shared evidence that they received an invitation and that it was

difficult to understand the selection criteria. The two musicians were, therefore, the only interviewees given anonymity and confidentiality.

This study used critical textual and discourse analysis, which helped uncover the ideologies underpinning policies, and employed thematic data analysis to analyse the interview responses.

At this point, it is essential to declare that I am a classical musician and have lived part of the history I describe in the following chapters. I also have a professional interest in an executive role, especially in my role as a former Managing Director of the Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra and former Chief Executive of the South African Music Education Trust. This thesis establishes a dialogue between my professional experience and what scholarly reflection can bring to that practice. Although it is impossible to separate the one from the other, I have found it enriching to step back from just doing, or defending what I do as a practitioner to enquire, maybe ask difficult questions of myself and my colleagues or ancestors even – and try and find a way forward that can simultaneously be informed by theory and practice. The researcher and supervisor carefully considered the benefits and challenges of insider positionality.

We concluded that the value of the knowledge generated from the researcher's lived experience benefitted the research and did not compromise ethical standards. None of the people interviewed requested confidentiality, and their names were disclosed with their consent.

The following two chapters look at the tone set by mission-educated African intellectuals from the 1870s up to the 1960s. They not only set out to explore tensions between tradition and modernity but, by the period following the Second World War, the pioneering generation of Zephania Mothopeng, Ezekiel Mphahlele and Khabi Mngoma from Orlando High School, and their colleague Lucas Makhema, at the Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival, had begun to realise some of the cultural vision. These developments take place with some support from liberal and philanthropic Europeans and the city of Johannesburg. The white

liberals were motivated by the need to organise leisure time for Africans and to try and ‘promote an understanding and goodwill between races’.

Chapter 2

2.1. The roots of orchestral music black townships

In the period between the world wars, a new generation of leaders emerged in South Africa, inspired by the historical construct of *the regeneration of Africa,* developed by African American leaders such as Bishop Henry Turner of the African Methodist Episcopal Church and Martin Delany, from the middle of the nineteenth century (Masilela, 2003:1). The South African leaders included intellectuals such as Pixley ka Isaka Seme, Solomon Plaatje and others, leading to the founding of what became known as the New African Movement. They identified culture, as will be discussed, as one of the ways through which the movement could advance their objectives. Through their interventions, orchestral music performance was gradually introduced and, by the 1960s, youth orchestras were part of the cultural landscape in Soweto. But how did it all start?

The South African policy landscape from the nineteenth century to the first two decades of the twentieth century was rooted in two British policies, in different colonies, that were aimed at Africans, which appeared to be characterised by two seemingly contradictory orientations (Erlmann, 1986). The Cape Colony policy was intent on the erosion and disintegration of the African way of life, its practices and promoted cultural assimilation among Africans. Cape officials, he says, were to offer autonomous African communities equality in order to foster their assimilation and to curtail the potential threat — in the words of the then Cape Governor, this was to pursue their continued exploitation (for economic gain) under the veil of equality and their understanding of the new way of life, 'to treat Africans as useful servants, consumers of our goods, contributors to our revenue' (Erlmann, 1986: 114).

In the Natal colony, the Africans outnumbered Natal colonists and, in a quest for self-preservation, they accorded the mass recognition of African customary law and traditional chiefs in the hope of protecting what was deemed white civilisation from the native and similarly protecting the native from white civilisation. These two approaches found their way into the mission stations and became an important source of change and innovation among Africans. Erlmann (1986) estimated that, by

1865, about 3000 African pupils were enrolled in the mission schools in the two provinces, which offered this countering but powerful combination of educational practices to this minority of purportedly uprooted Africans. On the one hand, missionaries followed British practice, which emphasised modernising agriculture as a skill to be acquired while discouraging writing and arithmetic; on the other hand, criminalising and penalising African traditional dancing and musical instruments, dismissing them as heathen. Both ideologies became state policy in 1948 and continued among the different groupings of the white minority (Erlmann, 1986: 114).

By discouraging traditional African cultures, African students were gradually introduced to and adopted Western instruments and genres. This began with voice and eventually moved to stringed instruments, a process that would take over a century before a full black orchestra would be seen on stage.

Although part of the objectives of missionary education was to help spread the influence of the British in South Africa, some of the mission graduates used this education to resist the takeover. By the turn of the twentieth century, a generation of African nationalists emerged, who were products of the missionary education system and sought to intensify the struggle against the colonial government. This generation did not see itself as 'tribal' Africans, for they were exposed to Western education — they were a new generation, they were 'New Africans'. As pre-eminent essayist, playwright, and political activist Herbert Isaac Ernest Dhlomo (1903–1956) explained, there were 'Tribal Africans', the 'Neither-Nor-Africans' and the 'New Africans'. Dhlomo was one of the New Africans, who he described as follows:

> *The new African knows where he belongs and what belongs to him; where he is going and how; what he wants and the methods to obtain it. Such incidents as workers' strikes; organised boycotts; mass defiance of injustice — these and many more are but straws in the wind heralding the awaking of the New African masses.*

> *What is the New African's attitude? Put briefly and bluntly, he wants a social order where every South African will be free to express himself and his personality fully, live and breathe freely, and have a part in shaping the destiny of his country; a social order in which race, colour and creed will be a badge neither of privilege nor of discrimination…He is opposed to such well-entrenched traditional institutions as the Ministry of Native Affairs Department with their spawn of petty ignorant chiefs, Native Representative Council, separate systems of education, of revenue and taxation etc, etc. He knows that Councils chosen undemocratically by Government puppets cannot represent African thought, attitudes, progress; he knows how they prevent progressive Africans from leading their own people. He is determined to expose and battle against these contradictions and dangers* (Couzens, 1985: 34–35).

Among their many objectives, New Africans were preoccupied with constructing the concept of African modernity. A call to modernity, according to African National Congress (ANC) leader Chief Albert Luthuli, was an intensive wish to preserve what was valuable in their heritage as Africans while discarding the inappropriate and outmoded (from Luthuli's memoir quoted in Gevisser, 2007).

In 1906, Pixley ka Seme (1881–1951), a lawyer and one of the founders of the SANNC, spoke about the regeneration of Africa in his lifetime, a period he described as new and powerful.

In his speech delivered to the Royal African Society in London in 1906, he understood the term regeneration to mean entering a new life, embracing the diverse phases of a higher and more complex existence. In his speech, he asserts that their generation resides in an awakened race consciousness and must therefore use this awareness to achieve and attain a higher and more advanced standard of life. Ka Seme also argues this realisation should go beyond the elementary needs, strive towards this complex, multifaceted existence and aspire for greater power.

In his book titled *A History of the ANC: South Africa Belongs to Us*, Francis Meli (1988) noted how ka Seme's speech managed to articulate the continental approach which has characterised the thinking of all progressive-minded African leaders and which found its full expression in the formation of the Organisation of African Unity (OAU), an intergovernmental organisation that is now known as the African Union, established in May 1963. The speech, according to Meli (1988), expressed anti-racism, which was anti-colonial. Ka Seme asserted his national pride and identity and also expressed the mood and thinking of a new generation of African intellectuals at the beginning of this century (Meli, 1988: 25). As Meli explained, this was a time of social awareness and political consciousness that eventually led to the formation of a political movement, the SANNC. The launch of the SANNC, as discussed earlier, not only reflected the nationalists' aspirations but had a strong continental character, with the congress opening with Enoch Sontoga's hymn Nkosi Sikelel' iAfrika (which was later adopted as South Africa's national anthem) and closing with John Knox Bokwe's Give a Thought to Africa (Meli, 1988: 39). The elected membership at the conference included people discussed above, who had gone to mission schools, those who had studied abroad, and people who were in churches. Chiefs were included in the initial structures of the organisation to establish a link with the rural masses (Meli, 1988: 39).

The Native Land Act was introduced in the year following the launch, forcing many Africans to the towns, beginning the urbanisation and continuing the proletarianisation of Africans (Meli, 1988: 39). These developments forced this group of primarily young intellectuals to organise themselves politically and culturally, leading to many of the developments that unfolded.

2.2. New Africans at Work

Some people who worked closely with Dhlomo (1903–1956) to advance the idea of new Africanism included academic and political activist Zacharia Keodirileng Matthews (1901–1968) and music educator, festival organiser and recording scout Mark Radebe. One of Radebe's most famous students is Dhlomo's cousin — the composer Reuben Tholakele Caluza (1895–1969). Radebe came from an eminent family in

Pietermaritzburg, and his father was one of the founding members of the African Independent Newspaper *Ipepa lo Hlanga*, the National Weekly Newspaper from 1894–1904. Radebe married Pearl Bokwe, and Matthews married Frieda Bokwe, the daughters of celebrated hymn composer John Knox Bokwe. In her memoir[17], Frieda Bokwe-Matthews (1995) describes her brother-in-law, Radebe, not only as a brilliant pianist but as a significant contributor to the New African Movement, which included writing a weekly column in *Umteteli wa Bantu* under the pseudonym of Musicus. According to Bokwe-Matthews, this column provided the first serious music critique by an African, theorising how African folk music could be integrated into modernity by drawing lessons from Western classical music (Bokwe-Matthews, 1995). Radebe and his intellectual friends, states Bokwe-Matthews, opposed the introduction of jazz, which they thought represented unappealing aspects of modernity; however, they embraced Negro spirituals. Radebe used his network in the movement to organise the first African music festival in 1931, which became known as the Transvaal Eisteddfod. According to Bokwe-Matthews, this platform enabled Radebe to disseminate musical culture into wider geographical areas of South Africa, furthering the objectives of the New African Movement. Finally, being a choral music expert, Radebe organised and composed music for the African male voice choir, which sang *isicathamiya*, a style hugely influenced by Caluza.

Bokwe-Matthews's account is supported by Couzens (1985), who described the origins of the Transvaal Eisteddfod in detail and names Ben Tyamzashe, Ben Hamilton Masiza and Radebe as the people who came up with the idea for an African music festival. There is no indication why an avowedly African music festival adopted the name of a Welsh cultural gathering. Couzens (1985) talks about this festival being a significant development that brought black music enthusiasts together in a conference. Tyamzashe and Masiza then entrusted Radebe with the implementation of this idea. The reason for establishing this festival, argued Caluza, was to try to foster and preserve 'The African Spirit' (Couzens, 1985: 70). Dhlomo became the acting Chairperson of the Eisteddfod in 1934, and he used this opportunity to showcase his plays, supported by the music written by his cousin, Caluza.

[17] Frieda Bokwe-Matthews autobiography is titled 'Remembrances' and was published in 1995, accessible online at https://www.pzacad.pitzer.edu.

They also saw this as an opportunity to build a cultural life in Johannesburg, maintain school connections and advance Dhlomo's agenda for national identity in art, literature, music, and invention (Couzens, 1985: 71). Interestingly, it was some of these local 'home' social networks that manifested in collaboration in Johannesburg, as shall be demonstrated in later chapters.

The Bantu Men's Social Centre (BMSC) (discussed in more detail in Section 2.5 below) annual report from 1931 confirms that its hall was made available each year to the organisers of the Transvaal Eisteddfod and acknowledges Radebe's excellent work as the organising committee's secretary. Radebe features prominently in the annual reports and is credited with the annual successes of the festival. From the reports, Radebe grew the local festival steadily to make it a Southern African event, attracting participants from across the Transvaal, Natal, Orange Free State, the Cape, Bechuanaland and Basutoland. Regarding talent, the 1931 report acknowledges the 'natural gifts' possessed by Africans and noted that a third of the capacity audience comprised Europeans who applauded each item enthusiastically. Radebe helped prepare choirs for the annual competition, and it was these preparations that first exposed Khabi Mngoma to classical music during his time at the Salvation Army primary school in Johannesburg's Eastern Native Township. Mngoma would sit and listen to choirs preparing, accompanied on the piano by Radebe, the headmaster at his school (Cockburn, 2008: 191).

It may not be accurate to suggest that Trauneck introduced Mngoma to classical and orchestral music, with Radebe perhaps laying the groundwork.

Mark Radebe was not only active at the BMSC and as a music teacher, but he played multiple roles within the music industry. As Bokwe-Matthews (1995) points out, Radebe was a very influential figure who also worked as a scout for Colombia Records, while his friend Griffiths Motsieloa held the same position at Gallo Records. These companies were head-quartered in London at the time, and both Radebe and Motsieloa were among the first African recruits in these roles when the swing bands took off to become a commercial business. These bands primarily performed at private venues and night clubs hosted by Johannesburg's wealthy Jewish families,

including the Oppenheimers, Schlesingers, Barlows, and night clubs such as The Stardust, The New Paradise, and others (Couzens, 1985). In *The Test of Bantu Leadership* by RV Selope Thema, who was a member of the SANNC, shared views on the assimilation of Western cultures:

> *The new life must come, and with it we have to swim or sink in its problems. We cannot survive the disintegrating and demoralising forces of this new life unless we adapt ourselves to its conditions. And if we must survive, we shall have to do what the American Negroes have done — adapt ourselves to our new environment. That is to say, we should assimilate as far possible the good things of Western civilisation and discard those that are bad* (Quoted in Masilela, 2003).

Thema's statement should be read as the internalisation of colonising ideology and as the reappropriation of these Western cultures as a site on which blacks should assert a presence, culturally and even politically.

2.3. The Eastern Cape's children's orchestra

New Africans were demonstrating that it was possible to compete at the highest level, and the spirit of New Africanism was sweeping through the country. Among those inspired was the composer Michael Mosoeu Moerane (1904–1980), who made history in the orchestral world with his work *Fase la Heso* (1942), which means My Country in Sesotho. Moerane was a full-time teacher and pursued music part-time. He became South Africa's first black Bachelor of Music graduate when he completed his studies at the University of South Africa (UNISA) in 1942 (he had registered for this degree in 1931 while working as a teacher). *Fase la Heso* is a symphonic poem derived from Sesotho songs[18]. Even though organisations such as Trauneck's JSO were willing to perform in black communities, no evidence suggests that he was interested in African music, and there were certainly no black orchestral musicians to use. This work was subsequently performed by the BBC Orchestra in 1944 and other orchestras in France and the United States. The unavailability of local orchestras to perform his work may have motivated him to establish his own orchestra. This orchestra was eventually established by a donation of orchestral instruments, which he received in the late 1940s. While it is not clear who made the donation, Lucia (2020) suggested it must have been in the aftermath of these performances that someone donated a small consignment of orchestral instruments, including violins, cellos, flute, clarinet, trumpet and trombone, which he used to form the African Springtime Orchestra in the late 1940s. This ensemble was essentially a children's orchestra, including his own children and his nephew, South Africa's yet-to-be President Thabo Mbeki, who chose the flute, and other local children. Rehearsals occurred at his home on Scanlan Street in Queenstown, in the Eastern Cape. Mbeki's mother, Epainette, is Moerane's sister (Gevisser, 2007). According to Gevisser (2007), the ensemble's favourite performance piece was Mozart's Symphony No 39, which Moerane led on the piano.

[18] University of South Africa website at https://unisa.ac.za/sites/corporate/default/colleges/human-sciences/schools-departments-centres-institutes- &- units/school-of-art...

Moerane was largely self-taught using his parents' Hammond Organ during his childhood days in Mangoloaneng, Basutoland (present-day Lesotho).
In Queenstown, Moerane and his family lived next door to the Matshikizas, another famous musical family known for jazz. Like their classical counterparts next door, Todd Matshikiza and his jazz peers preoccupied themselves with how their respective art forms could contribute and help advance New Africanism. Moerane, for example, exploited African songs and rhythms in his works in what (Ballantine, 1993, quoted in Steward, 2000) termed an 'Africanist impulse', which he says was an urge to Africanise music.

2.4. Up North in the Transvaal

The formation of the Union government in 1910 came with additional legislative consequences, including the passing of the Natives Land Act of 1913.
In practical terms, access to land would, from the time of the passing of the Act, depend on racial classification, with 87% of the land being placed in white hands. As Gevisser (2007) explains, this particular Act slowly began to ring-fence the aspirations of blacks, particularly black farmers, and their ethos of self-reliance and initiative; all these eroded, along with other oppressive colonial legislation that continued to disenfranchise Africans across the land. Many black people across the country, people such as Moerane, who had already been forced to leave Mangoloaneng to study and teach in urban areas, and many others, stood to lose their ancestral lands and to provide cheap labour in big cities to support their families. Sensing the rising tensions between Africans and Europeans, white liberals began setting up projects around improving race relations. From the time following the First World War, liberal structures started focusing their efforts on building bridges with black communities. As Motsumi Makhene[19] explains – "the City of Johannesburg was an English city, and so the city created policies that were mediating enough to make sure that there was racial separation but that there was also cooperation to an extent, but not collaboration". It is important to note how municipal policy at the city level was introduced to mitigate some of the effects of national policy. Johannesburg's

[19] Makhene was interviewed on the 11 November 2020 at the Funda Centre, Diepkloof, Soweto.

problems were complicated by the migrant labour system, which needed cheap black labour, so liberalism was often tied to racial capitalism.

This resulted in policy tensions within settler colonialism, especially its two competing forms: what Makhene described above as English versus (implicitly) Afrikaans governance, with language standing as a not-so-precise proxy for ideological positions. This was the environment that cultural entrepreneurs and practitioners had to navigate from the colonial era until the end of apartheid. According to Couzens (1982), the Johannesburg city policies were, designed to help determine and settle the social atmosphere in the townships. In smoothing relations between Europeans and natives, culture was used as an auxiliary force to defuse native 'passions' through some cultural institutions built for Africans (Couzens, 1982: 318).

It must be noted and made clear here that Legassick was not describing the actions of the South African state. However, the structures referred to above were, in effect, opposing oppression, even while potentially posing alternative forms of cultural colonisation. In *Moralizing Leisure Time*, Couzens (1982) not only gives insights into the rise of liberalism during this time but also explains one of the projects intended to moralise leisure time. This project was initiated with the express aim of fostering "greater understanding" between racial groups. Couzens (1982) quotes one of the prominent participants in the project, who explained the purpose in one of their meetings as follows:

> *The relation between the Europeans and the natives are today (this is the time following the First World War) more strained than they have been for more than a generation, and unless the temper of both races is altered, we are heading for disaster. The greatest need is for an increase in the number of Europeans and natives who have confidence in each other, and who cooperate to avoid conflict. The best means of securing this is to be found in the joint councils of Europeans and natives in which Europeans and natives work together to remove causes of irritation, and to improve racial relations' (Couzens, 1982: 317).*

These joint councils were established and were the ones that sponsored the establishment of liberal institutions specifically designed to cater for, and encourage, the 'moderate blacks', one of which is discussed below.

2.5. Bantu Men's Social Centre

The Bantu Men's Social Centre (BMSC) was established in 1924, and, according to its founding documents, it was established to form a common place, a nucleus for social intercourse for natives employed on the Witwatersrand. To this end, it offered recreational, educational and leisure-time activities for black men in Johannesburg and the Reef. It also served as a meeting place for non-white societies and organisations.[20] The BMSC was not a facility of Johannesburg but was situated in the Johannesburg city centre on 223 Eloff Street (same street as Doraky House). It organised its own activities and made its hall available for cultural activities organised by external organisations such as the Transvaal Bantu Eisteddfod and the Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival (JBMF). The BMSC also hosted concerts, with one of its most famous being a symphonic concert held on the 20th of June 1940 led by conductor and city organist John Connell (BMSC Annual Reports). In addition to the instrumental programme, Connell's orchestra accompanied leading African vocal

[20] BMSC Annual Reports and Archival material available online at https://www.researcgarchives.wits.ac.za/annual-report-71.

soloists. This must have been the Johannesburg City Orchestra under local government and based at the city hall, as Connell was the city organist. However, the orchestra that performed more regularly at the BMSC was the Johannesburg Symphony Orchestra (JSO), whose performances included the Annual Founder's Day concert held on the 28th of October 1949 under conductor Joseph Trauneck. This event was attended by the Minister of Social Welfare, Dr AJ Stals, among other dignitaries. Important to note here is that Dr Stals was representing the national apartheid government at an event hosted by the city under the white liberal government (the United Party). These concerts served as music appreciation initiatives as black players were not represented in the orchestral ensembles (they only featured in the brass in the city's brass bands at this point). However, some singers, such as Ezekiel Mogale, were fortunate enough to be accompanied by a professional ensemble. Additionally, the BMSC offered music education classes by organising piano lessons for black learners. The 1940 annual report stated, "Budding pianists have had their first lessons out of Smallwoods Book for Beginners. In steady persistent monotony, they thumped at the keyboard, with uncertain fingers and yearning hearts".

These lessons were first offered by Mr W Sihlali from 1940–1948, with Todd Matshikiza taking over from 1949 onwards. Lessons were so popular with young people that the BMSC had to find two more pianos to meet the demand.

2.6. Jubilee Social Centre

Jan Smuts served as Prime Minister of South Africa between the World Wars. After the Second World War, he made one of his most significant political moves when he invited the British Royal Family to commemorate King George VI's Jubilee. According to Kathy Munro[21], the Royals' trip was organised as a leisurely three-month journey from February–April 1947 to allow King George VI and his family to explore South Africa and other neighbouring British colonies, including Bechuanaland, Basutoland and Rhodesia. According to Munro, Smuts wanted to consolidate ties between South Africa and Britain and possibly consolidate a South African identity. This move by Smuts backfired and, according to Munro, it highlighted

[21] Kathy Munro authored the article 'Rediscovering 1947 Royal Visit to South Africa', accessible online at the Heritage Portal https://www.theheritageportal.co.za/article/rediscovering-1947-royal-visit-South-Africa.

the closeness of Smuts to the British establishment during and after the Second World War and impacted the following year's elections held in May 1948, when the Afrikaner nationalists under Malan rose to power – marking what Munro called the end of colonialism and the ushering in of apartheid. The formulation by Munro that refers to the end of colonialism is contestable, as evidenced by the longstanding argument, held within circles including the ANC, that apartheid was 'colonialism of a special type'. In any case, by the end of the Royal visit, progress on establishing the Jubilee Social Centre had been made (to commemorate the Royal visit), and construction was completed in 1948. Located at 1 Eloff Street, Johannesburg, the building had an assembly hall and classrooms for teaching, concerts, and meetings for night schools outside working hours.[22] This centre became the home for black classical music practitioners, providing space for the Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival (JBMF), the Jubilee Singers, and the Ionian Music Society, including the Jubilee String Players. Satellite programmes were launched across what is now known as Soweto from this centre. This was the centre primarily responsible for training black classical musicians. The centre was the responsibility of the City of Johannesburg's non-European Affairs Department (NEAD), under the city's Cultural Officer David Rycroft, who had a musical background. Rycroft left in 1952 (five years after he had taken the role) and was replaced by Cecil Skotnes. Under Skotnes, the Centre greatly influenced orchestral music by providing facilities, tuition, acquiring musical instruments and funding musical programmes. Skotnes achieved this by partnering with people who had expertise in the field of music and were based in the communities being assisted. Skotnes was not a musician; his background was in visual arts. Skotnes hired Khabi Mngoma in 1956 to advise on musical programmes. Mngoma used his tenure at NEAD and based at the Jubilee Social Centre, to establish the Ionian Music Society, including the Jubilee String Players (Ionian Orchestra), which the Jubilee Centre made possible when Skotnes acquired orchestral instruments and built a music library. This enabled Mngoma to initiate music projects, including establishing satellite projects across Soweto (this will be explored further in the next chapter).

[22] Annual City Manager's Report for the year ended 30 June 1948, non-European Affairs Department. Historical Papers Research Archive at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johanesburg

2.7. Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival

The Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival (JBMF) was first launched in 1947 with Zephania 'Zeph' Mothopeng as its inaugural chairperson; the Mayor was announced as the Patron-in-Chief and Lucas Makhema as the first secretary. The festival operated from the Jubilee Social Centre. Makhema resigned from the JBMF Committee in 1954, claiming that whites were replacing blacks. Makhema was superseded as secretary of the JBMF by Mngoma. This period was especially difficult as mission-educated blacks were being singled out by Hendrik Verwoerd, then leader of the National Party when he instructed that the black teachers' ambition for better must remain restrained, that a 'Bantu teacher must learn not to feel above his community, with a consequent desire to become integrated into the life of the European' (Lodge, 1983, cited in Cockburn, 2008: 204), basically ensuring a life of servitude. Skotnes took over in 1952 as the chairperson from Mothopeng when he (Skotnes) became the city's Senior Cultural Officer.

According to its constitution[23], the JBMF aimed to encourage the love of music, promote and grow talent among African people, improve the standard of performance and sense of appreciation and introduce this to Johannesburg audiences, the best African and European music. Importantly for orchestral music, the city acquired musical instruments for the festival, which were used to start a teaching project at the Jubilee Social Centre and in parts of what is now known as Soweto. Additional instruments were donated by white liberals in the city, with the city paying the tuition of the young learners. The JBMF offered tuition in voice and recruited high-level tutors, including former Dresden Opera House singer Nina Zubiky and Desmond Wright from the Jeppe Boys' Choir. Initially, ballet classes were also offered until they were stopped by the apartheid government in the 1960s.

[23] Copy of the JBMF Constitution in the archival files at the South African Music Education Trust (SAMET). The author will consider depositing relevant copy with the Wits Historical Papers at the conclusion of the study to assist future researchers.

2.8. The influence of the Johannesburg Symphony Orchestra and Joseph Trauneck

From the 1940s, the Johannesburg Symphony Orchestra (JSO) and its leader at the time, Joseph Trauneck, played an important role in presenting orchestral concerts in black townships around Johannesburg. The JSO's focus on youth and music appreciation programmes led to invitations to perform at schools. This led to an invitation from Father Trevor Huddleston, who had become friends with Trauneck, to perform at St Cyprian's Primary School in Sophiatown in October 1944. Father Huddleston not only invited the JSO but had also invited many classical musicians to this vibrant community for years.

It was through these concerts that Archbishop Desmond Tutu had his first orchestral experience, as discussed in the introduction. Tutu was referring to Yehudi Menuhin's second visit to the country in 1950, when he challenged the apartheid government by performing to a mixed audience at a time when apartheid laws did not permit such interactions[24]. Menuhin's records confirm that his first South African performance was in 1935. However, it was his second visit that caught the attention of the authorities when he accepted an invitation from Father Huddleston to perform in Sophiatown. According to Pamela Tanscik's SAMAP Research, Menuhin was inspired by Alan Paton's book, *Cry the Beloved Country* (1948), which he had just read, and did not hesitate to accept Huddleston's invitation to perform at his church. In 1950, as Pamela Tancsik (nd) explains, concerts before mixed audiences were not allowed. Therefore, by agreeing to give a free concert in the morning in Sophiatown and proceeding in the evening to perform in the city hall, where he was contracted to perform to a white audience (nine-year-old Michael Masote was in the audience). Menuhin's defiance of apartheid laws attracted the government's attention, and his agent accused him of breaking his contract. He would return to South Africa one more time in 1956, his last visit during the apartheid era; from this point onward, he boycotted visiting South Africa and vowed only to return after the country was liberated.

[24] Yehudi Menuhin, accessible online at http://www.menuhin.org/the-man.

Father Huddleston recalled inviting Trauneck to bring his orchestra to Sophiatown because Trauneck had a passion for music education. And so, Trauneck began with his Saturday afternoon open-air concerts. According to Huddleston, Trauneck performed classical music, which was 'quite marvellous.' (Cockburn, 2008). Another venue that the JSO frequented was St Peter's School in Rosettenville, a school attended by Mngoma, famous South African musicians Hugh Masekela, Jonas Gwangwa, and others. The most significant of Trauneck's concerts was perhaps when his orchestra accompanied Lucas Makhema's Jubilee Singers in 1953. This concert was held at the St Mary's Anglican Cathedral in the centre of Johannesburg and brought together Trauneck, Huddleston and Makhema, the choir conductor and the facilitator of the JSO's concerts in Sophiatown. According to currently available evidence, this event marked the first time, locally or nationally, that a white orchestra accompanied a black choir. This happened after Makhema and his choir won all the trophies offered at the JBMF the previous year. The programme started with Huddleston opening the concert with an address, and then Trauneck conducted the orchestra and chorus (Cockburn, 2008). According to the estimates by the *Rand Daily Mail*, there were roughly equal numbers of black and white performers on stage that day, with 50 in the choir and 40 in the orchestra (Cockburn, 2008: 185).

Due to the significance of the event, as noted by Cockburn (2008), *The World* newspaper ran several articles that included the following quote: "This was notably the very first concert of its kind in this country, the first time that the Jubilee Singers appeared under a European conductor… the first time that Mr Trauneck had conducted an orchestra with a non-European choir" (Cockburn, 2008: 184).

A moving tribute for the concert was written by Walter Nhlapo, who, as mentioned in the first chapter, had a column in the *Bantu World* which defined some of the complex cultural contours of the New Africa Movement[25]. Like his fellow New Africans, he focused on theatre, jazz, and general entertainment under the by-line Critic at Large. He was particularly critical of the popularity of jazz and vaudeville, seeing greater beauty in the

[25] Article on Walter Nhlapo can be found online at https://pzacad.pitzer.edu/NAM/newafrre/writers/wnhlapo/wnhlapo.htm.

European arts[26]. Nhlapo's opinion piece and excitement about this historic concert are not unexpected, for it aligned with beliefs about the nobility of classical music. In his article published in *Bantu World* in 1953, he stated there was a keen interest in classical music among Africans. He observed that, since classical music had become more accessible through recordings, many Africans had converted to a love of Western musical classics, and this music to Africans is to Africans nature and sacred. This point was interpreted by Cockburn (2008) to mean that Africans had assimilated classical music, and it was now natural and not something foreign or artificial to them. Nhlapo argued that Africans fully realised that the arts were the architects and builders of civilisation and people: "If the standard of civilisation attained by any race is justly estimated by its care and adoration of art, then the African should be treated as a civilized being, irrespective of his colour or creed" (Cockburn, 2008: 185–186).

In addition to symphony concerts, Trauneck also gave a series of music lectures in the township of Orlando. This initiative was supported by funding received from the Institute of Race Relations (Tancsik, n.d.). Cockburn (2008) reported on two of these lectures: the 1944 event, which marked the inauguration of the Sophiatown Music Society and a similar event in Soweto, which launched the Orlando Music Society. Interestingly, while Trauneck's passion for teaching appeared to transcend racial lines, he showed very little interest in learning anything about the culture of the people who hosted him in these black townships, a point noted by Stanley Glasser (quoted in Tancsik, n.d.). As Glasser puts it:

> *…and although he (Trauneck) wanted to help African South Africans, he never showed any particular enthusiasm, nor was he vested in understanding the rich culture of African music. However, Trauneck remains an important figure in the history of South Africa's musical process* (Tancsik, n.d).

[26] This view on Nhlapo is on Stellenbosch University website and can be accessed at https://esat.sun.ac.za/index.php/walter_nhlapo.

Trauneck's contribution to the development of orchestral music in Johannesburg's townships cannot be overemphasised.

It is clear that, despite the prevailing explicit and implicit colonial policies, which did not recognise blacks as citizens, formal music education, festivals, choirs, and orchestral playing emerged across the country. This development should not only be read as the internalisation of colonising ideology but as the reappropriation of these Western cultures and as a site on which individual practitioners or communities were asserting a presence and a kind of aesthetic and political equality.

Chapter 3

The Influence of Educators from Orlando High School in Soweto on Orchestral Music

3.1. The Origins of Orlando High School

It would be beneficial to go back to the early days of Orlando High School to understand how it came to be one of the main drivers of cultural development, not only in Soweto but also nationwide. In his dissertation titled *The Rock: The History of Orlando High School 1939–1984*, Michael Marake Morapeli (1984), who was one of the students at Orlando High School in its early days, recounted how in 1932, the city of Johannesburg purchased 1 300 morgan[27], where Orlando East is currently located in Soweto. His idea was to develop a 'model' location to provide all shopping and community services for a population of 80 000. By 1935, over 3 000 houses had been built for an estimated population of 18 000 (Morapeli, 1984). This development was a direct result of the Native (Urban Areas) Act passed in 1923, which gave legal force to the findings of the Stallard Commission and the process of residential segregation of white and black.[28]

As Pohlandt-McCormick explains, the Act gave power to municipalities to provide housing for African workers and, at the same time, legislated that Natives not qualified by birth or length of residence could not stay in urban areas for more than 72 hours without a permit. This was to prevent further urbanisation of Africans and marked the beginning of "influx control" (Pohlandt-McCormick, n.d). Soweto was thus intended to keep the black urban population out of the white areas except when they were needed, temporarily, to work (Pohlandt-McComick, n.d). Orlando was the first of 30 townships to be built in Soweto. There was initial reluctance and even resistance on the part of Africans to leave the places where they lived in and around Johannesburg and to move to new locations being

[27] Morgan is a unit of measurement of land, which was used in Germany, Netherlands, Poland and South Africa and the size varies from 0.5 to 2.5 acres per Morgan.

[28] The essay titled I saw a nightmare: Soweto: History, Geography, Society" by Helena Pohlandt-McCormick, published by Columbia University can be accessed online at www.Gutenberg-e.org/pohlandt-mccormick/print/pmh02w.html

established (Morapeli, 1984). In 1933, the whole of Johannesburg was proclaimed white under the Native Act (1923), except for Sophiatown, Martindale and Newclare. Sophiatown was affected by the Group Areas Act (1950) as the newly elected National Party wanted to abolish multiracial neighbourhoods and replace them with racially segregated settlements (South African Institute of Race Relations, 1950: 26). This meant that an estimated 43 000 Africans were now residing illegally in their homes, and were forced to relocate. Morapeli described how, despite the Native Act (1923) to restrict and control the influx of Africans from rural areas during the colonial and apartheid eras, the Orlando population continued to grow steadily (Morapeli, 1984).

The origins of Orlando High School can be traced back to David William Mooki, who founded the New Church of Africa in 1911. According to Morapeli (1984), Mooki was at first not aware of the existence of the New Church organisation. The New Church was established by Swedish religious reformer Emanuel Swedenborg in 1770 and was active in Europe, America and New Zealand. Swedenborg was a prolific writer, and a copy of his book on the Christian religion was found and purchased by Mooki in 1909 in a second-hand bookshop in Krugersdorp. It was this book that inspired Mooki to start a church. Upon discovering the European church, Mooki contacted the British Conference and led plans to establish a mission station in Africa, to support his efforts. This led to the British office sending one of their superintendents, Rev PH Johnson, to South Africa in 1929 to establish a theological college of the church to train African ministers. This college was to be named Mooki College in honour of Rev David William Mooki, who had since passed away. After arriving in the country, Johnson learned about the city of Johannesburg's plans to establish African townships. He applied to the city council for a site to establish the college in the new residential area of Orlando. This application was approved on stand number 6504, just a few metres from Orlando Communal Hall, along with the permission to erect buildings. The stand was doubled to allow the college more space to build residences for school boarders (Morapeli, 1984: 7–9).

Primary school classes started in 1934, and by 1938, Mooki College had enrolled 17 learners. It offered tuition to Standard VI learners, along with first- and second-year Teachers' and Junior Certificates. It has to be pointed out that the Transvaal Education Department did not accredit these classes. As Morapeli (1984) explains, it was common in those days for churches to start classes and then apply to the provincial department for accreditation and subsidy after classes had commenced (Morapeli, 1984: 10). One of the reasons the department declined the application was that government had its own plans to establish a high school in Orlando. It did not make sense to have two high schools next to each other. The Chief Inspector of Native Education in Johannesburg, Dr WWM Eiselen, held several meetings with the church, highlighting funding issues as the government did not yet have the budget to commence with the building, and encouraged Mooki College to cooperate with them and the community on the proposed plans (Morapeli, 1984). Eiselen failed to convince the church, which argued that it already had the building, learners and teachers, so the government could use existing infrastructure rather than start a new project. Plans to establish a new school proceeded, and Orlando High School was launched in 1939, initially based at the Orlando Communal Hall. A temporary arrangement was made to accommodate learners at Mooki College while construction continued at the current location. The arrangement was mutually beneficial as Mooki College could transfer their Standard VI students to the newly established school to continue with Standard VII. All learners were moved to the new premises after construction was completed.

At the time, it was unusual to have Africans run a high school, as is evident from the excerpt below from a report by the Transvaal Department of Education[29]:

[29] This excerpt is taken from the Transvaal Education Department Report, 1940, p. 75, which is quoted in Morapeli (1984).

> *It would be a rush to express a definite opinion concerning the efficiency of Natives as secondary school teachers at this early stage. The Native community naturally welcomes the employment of Africans in posts of responsibility, and one can only hope that they will prove to be as efficient and conscientious in the performance of their duties as to vindicate the policy of the department and justify fully the great expectations of their people.* (Transvaal Education Department Report, 1940: 75, quoted in Morapeli, 1984).

As it turned out, the school managed to attract some top talent from the beginning, including Godfrey Nakene, who was appointed the first principal and was one of the first two Africans to obtain a BA degree from Wits in 1940. The other was Harry Madibane, a school principal at the Johannesburg Bantu High School in the Western Native Township.

In the following years, more appointments were made, including that of Zephania 'Zeph' Mothopeng, who joined the school in the first quarter of 1941, followed by those of Ezekiel Mphahlele, Khabi Mngoma, Isaac Matlhare, Peter Raboroko and others.

3.2. Influence beyond the classroom

The period 1947–1965 proved to be one of the most defining in terms of the development of orchestral music in Johannesburg generally and in the township of Soweto specifically. Educators such as Mothopeng, Mphahlele, and Mngoma were not only providing leadership within the education sector but had also established themselves as nation-builders and community and cultural leaders. They were able to identify and seize opportunities at a time when the non-European Affairs Department (NEAD) in the City of Johannesburg was seeking to invest more effort in organising leisure time for Africans living in the city. The establishment of the Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival (JBMF), Polly Street Art Centre and the Jubilee Social Centre became some drivers for the developments that unfolded, led by joint committees comprising these African leaders and white liberals working for the city. As Coplan (1985) explains, during the time between the two World Wars, culture and entertainment were used as an illusion, a principal means by which liberals co-opted the

African middle class, softening the harshness of segregation and convincing them that advancement could come through Westernisation (Coplan, 1984: 113). This influence (by liberals) continued after the war well into the mid-1970s, when the West Rand Board took over, replacing the NEAD in Johannesburg.

In 1947 Zephania 'Zeph' Mothopeng (1913–1990), a respected choirmaster, and a member of the Transvaal African Teachers Association (TATA), along with his colleagues from the Orlando High school, including Ezekiel Mphahlele, were among a delegation that approached the NEAD, in the hope of establishing an organisation that would cater for the cultural development of African people; an organisation that could provide 'post-war emotional therapy' for Africans[30]. This period coincided with the opening of the Jubilee Social Centre on Eloff Street and the Polly Street Art Centre. Given these developments, the ultimate goal was that the city would provide a home for the envisaged organisation from where the programmes would be run. Secondly, the city would provide financial support to ensure the success of the programmes. As Sheila Masote points out[31], white people had the resources and venues, while Soweto did not have adequate facilities but did have a vibrant and established choral music tradition. The engagements with the city led to establishing the Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival (JBMF) that year, with the bandmaster and one of the officials in the NEAD, Marcus Roe, taking a leading role in the project. Mothopeng was appointed as the founding chairman of the organising committee, and Lucas Makhema was appointed organiser responsible for preparing choirs for competitions. The city agreed to offer the Jubilee Social Centre as the festival's home and stipends to those working on the ground. In addition, the city agreed to an annual sponsorship for prize winners in the different categories of the music competition, with the mayor appointed as the patron[32]. Coplan (1985) has attributed the initial success of the festival to the goodwill and good relationships between white civic officials and leading blacks, as well as the ongoing concern of liberal whites for urban African social welfare.

[30] Historical document of the African Cultural Organisation of Southern Africa (ACOSA), formerly Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival (JBMF) in the archives of the South African Music Education Trust (SAMET).
[31] The interview with Sheila Masote took place on 20 January 2023 in Roodepoort, Johannesburg. Sheila Masote is the daughter of Zephania 'Zeph' Mothopeng and is currently responsible for the administration of JMBF, now known as ACOSA.
[32] Sheila Masote interview, 2023, ACOSA documents and the City Manager's report of 1949.

According to the constitution of the JBMF, the aims of the JBMF were as follows:

- To encourage a love of music and promote talent among the African people.
- To raise the standard of performance and sense of appreciation.
- To introduce to Johannesburg audiences the best African and European music.

The objects of the JBMF were listed as:

- To encourage and promote interest and active participation in music and allied arts among non-European people.
- To raise the standard of performance and appreciation.
- To bring to the public notice the work of talented non-European performers, composers, writers and artists.
- To hold annual festival competitions in music and allied arts.

In the first two years, Lucas Makhema trained and conducted the Orlando and Western Choristers to what the City Manager's report of 1949 describes as a very high standard. Both choirs went on to win competitions at the JBMF in 1949 and the National Eisteddfod the following year. The 1949 festival was opened by the Mayor of Johannesburg, Councillor Jack Mincer, at the local Wembley Stadium and featured a massed choir and African and Indian dancers. Overall, the festival registered a record number of participants, which stood at 2198 and drew an audience of 4500, according to the city manager, LL Venables[33]. From these modest beginnings, the JBMF became quite popular with choirs, attracting participants from other provinces and Lesotho. Commenting on the expansion of the festival, Coplan (1985) noted that the initial six choirs competing under the supervision of Lucas Makhema gradually grew to 84 separate sections, with the artistic programme expanding beyond "serious choral music to include miners' dancing, ingom' ebusuku, jazz, brass bands, ballroom dancing and drama." In 1949, another Orlando High School teacher, Khabi Mngoma, was added to the organising committee of the JBMF through his association with the city's Cultural Officer, David Rycroft (Burger, 1992).

[33] City Manager's report is available in box 79A Collection Number A2628, Wits historical papers, but can also be accessed online from historical papers research archive at http://researcharchives.wits.ac.za

Mrs Mothopeng managed the children's programme of the JBMF, assisted by acclaimed pianist and former member of the 1930s band the Merry Blackbirds, Mrs Emily Motsieloa (Griffiths Motsieloa's wife). Activities at the children's festival included solo and choral singing, ballet demonstrations, violin, and keyboard, among others.

Despite these seemingly successful early years, there was criticism from within the JBMF. For example, in 1955, Mngoma's attention fixated on what he said were serious intonation problems by African choirs who partook in the festival's Western classical music sections (Burger, 1992: 87). Mngoma and Mphahlele were identified as among those few Africans that were involved in the festival but who began to see it as an affair for the "whites' good boys", as autonomy was dwindling. It was becoming a place where "the whites tell us how to perform our music" (Coplan, 1985: 169). The two leaders were apparently among those who complained that programmes and artistic decisions were being made by whites, and in frustration, they formed a parallel structure, an African community-based performing arts group which they named the Syndicate of African Artists which sponsored Western classical music and literary drama (Coplan, 1985: 169). Mngoma did not leave the JBMF but continued working with choirs within the festival while, at the same time, working in the syndicate.

During all this time at the JBMF, Mngoma had been working hard and investing in his own musical training. He studied conducting and harmony with Trauneck from 1948–1954 and was still with Jose Rodriguez-Lopez studying piano (1949–1957). He added general musicianship with Prof DJ Roode from UNISA (Burger, 1992: 58). The Orlando Music Society, which he established with Mphahlele and Trauneck in 1948, continued with some work, hosting music lectures and visiting musicians. This clearly indicated that Mngoma was preparing for a more ambitious role, including starting his own orchestra.

3.3. The Syndicate for African Artists Joins Campaigns for Universal Education

The Syndicate for African Artists, whose initial aim was to present cultural programmes, was forced to respond to education crises when they arose. The syndicate became responsible for publishing *The Voice of Africa*, distributed widely in Orlando. Morapeli (1984) explains how the publication was effectively used to campaign against Native education and the Bantu education systems and how it was used to expose the wrongs and injustices in all spheres of life. Morapeli's teachers, including Mothopeng, Isaac Matlhare and Ezekiel Mphahlele, had been elected to top executive positions at the Transvaal African Teachers' Association (TATA) in 1949 and held the positions while also being part of the JBMF. Mothopeng was appointed TATA's president, Matlhare assumed the office of editor, and Mphahlele became general secretary (Morapeli, 1984). As Morapeli explains, the three, including their colleague Mngoma, were to become an effective agency in Native Education because, from the moment they were appointed, they used *The Voice* as one of the platforms to criticise the syllabuses and the textbooks used which they saw as glorifying the white man. Below is an extract taken from Morapeli (1984) that serves as one of the examples of the campaigns and shows how these leaders were committed to fighting against injustice, whether at the JBMF or within the broader education system. Their role in fighting for universal education is relevant as the music education programmes they were involved with at the NEAD, for example, were about access, equality, quality and a holistic approach to education in line with universal education principles. These kinds of programmes were not generally available at African public schools, and the situation was about to deteriorate:

> *The principles of education are universal. There is no such animal as NATIVE EDUCATION. The modern African teacher must realize that the textbooks on teaching methods he was made to read during his training are not sacred articles of a bible which he must follow slavishly, even in changing African society. In fact, most, if not all, of the books have been written in order to make the African teacher, and thereby the pupil, feel that his education does not and shall not be part of the wider pattern of universal education, but shall make him just a curio to be seen by foreign tourists and local anthropologists, or shall warp his mind according to the will of White slave-drivers. The teacher is made to feel that his duty is to foster and nurse the abilities and interests of the child along a road leading back to his primitive past under the pretext of guarding and preserving his culture* (Morapeli, 1984: 62).

When the apartheid government took over the education of Africans from the Union government, and authorities were preparing to introduce Bantu Education in black schools, the government appointed anthropologist WWM Eiselen to head a commission tasked with studying and making recommendations for the education of "Native" South Africans.

The Eiselen Report, released in 1951, recommended that government should take charge of the education of black South Africans and make it part of a general socioeconomic plan tailored to the needs and values of the cultures of the communities in which the schools were located. As Bauer (2022) explains, proposals were aimed at training the children for manual labour and the menial jobs that the government deemed suitable for those of their race, and it was explicitly intended to inculcate the idea that black people were to accept being subservient to white South Africans. As members of TATA and realising that the report was utterly malicious in intent and spirit, and its recommendations, if accepted, would lead to something more sinister than the previous Native education system (Morapeli, 1984: 63), Mothopeng and his colleagues again turned to *The Voice* to launch and to sustain their campaigns. The Eiselen recommendations were eventually accepted and formed the basis for the Bantu Education Act (1953).

Printing the publication was the responsibility of the Syndicate, which operated and owned the printer. However, this was an 'illegal' operation as it violated censorship laws under apartheid, as Mngoma's son, cellist Lindumuzi 'Linda' Mngoma, confirmed[34].

The machine was operated from Mngoma's old house at number 816, Orlando East, and stored in a shack at the back. Linda remembers seeing the printer at home when he was about six or seven years old. Due to the illegality of the operation, all contributors never used their names in the publication.

The continued publications and other political work led to confrontations with the state and eventually forced some of these educators out of their teaching careers, as described below, and out of the JBMF. However, Mngoma would continue his relationship with the NEAD in different capacities until 1965. At the beginning of 1951, Mothopeng, Matlhare and Mphahlele were given letters by their employer, the Transvaal Department of Education, informing them that the department had learnt of their involvement with *The Voice*, which the government regarded as subversive, and the department needed them to confirm these claims. The three denied the allegations (Morapeli, 1984: 69). Mngoma was not included in the letters, and his son, Linda, speculated that it may have been due to his age, as he was the youngest of the three and relatively new to the school, and authorities may have been looking at the older educators. As Sheila Masote said, these educators may have deliberately protected the younger educator so that not all were in trouble simultaneously.

It was not clear how the authorities established the link. However, by the end of that year, as Morapeli (1984) confirms, they had been charged and accused of publishing a paper without registering it or stating their names or the address where it was published. Their lawyer, Anton Mostert, won the case on a technicality as he discovered that the conditions to register newspapers only applied to publications that appeared regularly, and the publication of *The Voice* was very irregular.

[34] Interview with Linda Mngoma at the Funda Centre, Diepkloof, Soweto, 5 October 2020.

The continued harassment of the three educators by the apartheid police, and the adoption of the Eiselen Report, led to much instability and divided the school. A visit by the Chief Inspector of Education in July 1952 was ultimately the reason for the dismissal of the Orlando Trio. Students became very hostile to their guest and heckled him throughout the prize-giving ceremony. These disruptions were blamed on the three educators for orchestrating the protest. They were fired on 31 July 1952 (Morapeli, 1984: 71).

Parents at Orlando High School established the Parents' Protest Committee, which aimed to fight for the reinstatement of the dismissed teachers. Mngoma, who was still employed by the school, was appointed as the secretary. One of the decisions from this parents' meeting was to withdraw their children from the school until the three educators were reinstated. The committee was mandated by the parents to organise alternative classes (Morapeli, 1984: 74). Linda Mngoma[35] confirms that it was indeed his father who negotiated space at the Donaldson Orlando Community Centre (DOCC) to host learners for the alternative school. Morapeli estimates that about a third of the learners joined the protest and became part of the new Ma-Africa School**,** or The People's High School, based at the DOCC. The three educators were again arrested for inciting violence but were acquitted (Morapeli, 1984: 75). According to Morapeli (1984), the People's School did not last for long and about two months into the protest, learners returned to their old school or dropped out. Some went to Hammanskraal, where a former educator from Orlando High School, Mr ABC Motsepe, was the principal of Modise Sekitla Secondary School and accommodated those that came to him. Mngoma eventually lost his position at Orlando High School for his involvement with Ma-Africa School and needed a job.

3.4. Khabi Mngoma Joins the non-European Affairs Department (NEAD)

The Polly Street Centre was officially opened on 1 July 1949 by the chairman of the non-European Affairs Committee, Mr IEB Attwell, accompanied by Mr Theron from the Union Education Department. The centre's focus was to provide informal training for black students, and according to the city manager's Annual Report for 1950, instruction was given in various subjects, including oil painting, weaving, leather work, embroidery, house crafts

[35] Discussion with Linda Mngoma 27 January 2023.

and choir singing. David Rycroft was the appointed administrator of the centre, a newly created position.

David Rycroft appointed Mngoma and visual artist Cecil Skotnes to join the Johannesburg local committee for non-European Adult Education to support his initiatives and assist in the music and art education programmes (Burger, 1992: 64). There were regular art exhibitions and some of the most notable customers in 1950 included Yehudi Menuhin, who was reported to have expressed great interest in the works of the students and purchased several paintings (City Manager's Annual Report, 1950).

Given that Rycroft was a musicologist with a particular interest in unaccompanied African traditional singing, his appointment of Mngoma to the committee may have been a strategic one, influenced by his need to have someone who understood the genre and African languages, specifically isiZulu and traditional Zulu songs. Therefore, it is unsurprising that much of their time was spent organising the Saturday night Zulu male traditional singing competitions at the centre at 3 Polly Street. The building of Polly Centre, according to Rycroft, lay next to an open plot of ground where illicit liquor brewers plied their trade and gangsters lurked in the Polly Street shadows to waylay consumers on their unsteady route home. Here, police raids were frequent, and Africans referred to the place as *Kwa magaba ngejubane* — the place where one sipped and then fled! (Rycroft, 1957: 34). It is not clear what led to the early departure of Rycroft. However, by mid-1952, Cecil Skotnes had been appointed to head the cultural centres as the city's new Cultural Recreational Officer. In this role, he also became the new chairman of the JBMF, replacing Mothopeng. These changes must have contributed to the ongoing racial tensions at the JBMF, leading to Lucas Makhema's resignation following his claims that whites were replacing blacks.

Polly Street Centre was a fascinating institution of cultural significance, and as Rycroft described above, it was located in the heart of gangster activity. Skotnes had his own encounters on Polly Street. One of his experiences is recounted below[36]:

[36] Interview between Skotnes and James Brown, from Skotnes Family Archives at http://cecilskotnes.com.

> *The back wall of the centre was a great place for Mafia activities. There was a field which was pitted with holes like a rabbit warren, holes big enough to take a four-gallon can in which the skokiaan queens made the brew. On Friday nights, the brew was sold. They used to make a great fire there. One saw incredible sights silhouetted against the firelight… five or six hundred people…and of course, it got riotous, the only place where anyone trying to run could find any haven was on the steps of the centre…many times on a Sunday or Monday morning, we washed the blood on the steps*.

Skotnes recalls one morning when he had to call the police to come to take the body of a woman away. It was the body of the girlfriend of a bouncer who worked on Polly Street. The boyfriend was the boxer, Ezekiel Dlamini, known as King Kong. The famous jazz musical King Kong was actually based on Dlamini's story.

Regarding his official responsibilities, Skotnes learnt that he had inherited a going concern[37], predominantly in music, which had been the speciality of his predecessor. He did, however, decide to develop this section even further. For this, he was able to arrange the appointment of Mngoma as the city's Cultural Activities Officer in 1956, who appeared to have been able to negotiate his own terms. According to Skotnes, Mngoma came up with ideas for the music department while he found ways and means to implement them. He gives an example where Mngoma wanted to initiate a string orchestra, and he managed to get sufficient musical instruments for this purpose. Included in the Jubilee Centre developments was a music library, which ultimately housed over 25 000 scores, and according to Skotnes, many scores had to be translated into tonic sol-fa for those who could not read music. Mngoma's formal role included the following (Burger, 1992: 89):

- The stimulation of interest in Western classical instrumental music in the townships of the Johannesburg area and the establishment of an orchestra.
- The stimulation of interest in the academic study of Western classical music (vocal and instrumental) among the people of the townships.

[37] Please see Skotnes Family Archives which can be accessed online at http://cecilskotnes.com.

- The improvement of the general quality of choral singing as regards the performance of Western choral repertoire by African choirs, with specific reference to intonation, which meant providing skilled guidance in the vocal techniques employed in Western tempered singing.
- In accordance with point (3), more specifically, the development of a choral tradition of equal temperament singing among African choirs in the townships so that performances of Western classical repertoire could be rendered successfully.
- The establishment of music educational programmes in the townships to synthesise the study of African and Western musical cultures in one curriculum.
- To instil a love of good music and promote the joint appreciation of Western and African music among the people of the townships.

According to Mngoma's discussion with Burger (1992: 90), the purpose of his programme was to combat the climate of 'general ignorance' that prevailed among what he called "the largely uninitiated public," as far as Western classical music culture was concerned, and instil a classical music culture in the townships — the staple music of which consisted of pop music and African jazz, such as that featured in African Jazz and variety shows organised by white impresarios like Ike Brooks.

With all the equipment in place, teaching at the Jubilee Social Centre began in 1957, with some of the classes extended to Chiawelo Community Centre in 1958. Additional classes were organised at Uncle Tom's Hall in Orlando West and the Orlando East Community Hall. Tuition was initially offered in singing, recorder, piano, and violin (Burger, 1992: 91). Learners studying music at the Jubilee Social Centre under Mngoma's supervision seemed to be making much progress with some of the individual students obtaining qualifications through the Royal College of Music. The centre also found a way to deal with the shortage of qualified specialised teachers. As Skotnes explained, each student sponsored to go to a specialist music teacher would be required to teach four or five others[38]. In addition, realising that he would struggle to find suitable teachers for learners in Soweto, especially for violin, Mngoma began taking lessons in violin in 1957 at the age of 35 with David Joseph Spiro, who was with the Johannesburg Civic Orchestra. The idea was that he would return to class after the lesson with Spiro and pass on that day's lesson to a student. There were days

[38] Skotnes family archives.

he would use the telephone at Jubilee to call Spiro to seek clarity when he got stuck on a technical issue. He did the same with his cello students at the beginning of 1958, when he commenced with cello lessons with Mrs Dancer. The JBMF paid for his music lessons in lieu of his teaching in Soweto (Burger, 1992: 93–96).

In 1959, Mngoma made a breakthrough when senior violin students of Joseph Spiro, including Geoffrey Diedericks and Enock Mlambo, joined the Jubilee Centre music programme and formed the backbone of the senior ensemble, which became known as the Jubilee String Players, or at times referred to as the Jubilee Chamber Orchestra (Burger, 1992: 97). Recorders, clarinets, a euphonium, and a piano were added to the ensemble, establishing the Transvaal's first black orchestral ensemble. Despite the many missing musical instruments in the ensemble, Mngoma's dream of starting a symphony orchestra began taking shape.

Diedericks, who acted as the ensemble leader, was also involved in some teaching, with Michael Matlhaela Masote being one of his most famous students. Masote joined Diedericks' class at the Jubilee Centre in 1960, ten years after he had witnessed the great Menuhin perform in Sophiatown. Before this, Masote had been in Mngoma's Ionian Male Voice Choir. Some of the most important dates in the ensemble's calendar included the regular soirees held at the Jubilee Centre. In these sessions, students were given an opportunity to play for one another. For Mngoma, giving the young musicians performance experience was also important. With growing performance fitness, the ensemble began giving external concerts. One of the people who supported Mngoma in organising some of the performances outside of the Jubilee Centre was the Johannesburg-based impresario Eva Harvey, who also assisted with sourcing additional musical instruments (Burger, 1992: 97). According to Huskisson (quoted in Malan, 1979: 108) the Jubilee String Players or the Jubilee Chamber Orchestra was the first black classical ensemble to be established in South Africa, a point shared by Motsumi Makhene[39], who played the violin in the junior orchestra of the Ionian Music Society. Mngoma can thus be regarded as the father of the orchestra in black townships.

[39] Makhene was interviewed 11 November 2020 at the Funda Centre in Diepkloof, Soweto.

Figure 2: Part of the concert programme featuring the Jubilee Players (sometimes referred to as the Ionian Orchestra) accompanying Mngoma's Ionian Choir in August 1964. On the right is orchestra leader Geoffrey Diedericks, taking a bow next to conductor Khabi Mngoma. It is interesting to note reference in the programme to 'enlightened policy' in this historical document. (Pictures used with permission from Lindumuzi Mngoma).

Handel's Oratorio Judas Maccabaeus (1746) narrates what Mngoma calls the "indomitable spirit of the Israelites". As Linda Mngoma explains, the oratorios, which formed a large part of their repertoire, highlighted the struggles of the Israelites in the bible and were inspiring. Their suffering was seen as comparable to the struggle of Africans against apartheid. Whether it was Israel, Egypt or Samson, the text in the recitatives and even choruses was poetic, and the stories carried a message of hope that adversities can be overcome.

3.5. Rapid Expansion into the Township

There was a rapid expansion of orchestral music into townships now known as Soweto from the early 1960s, partly due to apartheid forcing the closure of many important institutions seen to be supporting Africans. As Skotnes explains, the authorities' increasingly rigorous enforcement of the apartheid policy would not tolerate a thriving black project such as the

Jubilee Centre in what was considered a white area. From the early 1960s, Skotnes began transferring equipment, such as the extensive collection of musical instruments that he says were painstakingly assembled and maintained, to township centres to prevent it being reclaimed by bureaucracy when the centre was closed. Skotnes resigned in 1965.

Michael Masote, who had left Diedericks for Alan Solomon to further his studies on the violin, was now ready to take the levels of orchestral playing to new heights. He joined the JBMF in 1965 as Cultural Officer and became a colleague of Mngoma's at the NEAD. One of Masote's responsibilities was to teach music at Uncle Tom's Hall in Orlando West. Due to Mngoma's continued involvement in the political sphere, the city asked him to leave. As Linda Mngoma confirmed, his father was fired for his ongoing political involvement. Masote continued teaching and established the Soweto Youth Strings Orchestra, based at Uncle Tom's Hall. According to Sheila Masote, Uncle Tom's made it more convenient for children as they no longer needed to go to the Jubilee Centre in town. Violinist Sandile Khemese explains[40] that, when he first arrived at Uncle Tom's in 1965, a small group of municipal workers' children were taking lessons in stringed instruments. Sandile's elder brother, Reuben, started on the violin and later switched to the cello four years later, as too many learners were on the violin and very few on other instruments. He later took lessons with Marian Lewin. Michael Masote was the uncle of the Khemese brothers. This initial group of learners included David Baqwa, Dannyboy Sebitlo, Maleke Ramotshekgwa, Joshua Thelele, Kolwane Mantu (whose father was a musician in the city's brass band), Mike Masetlhe, Benny Motsa, and others. According to Sandile, the JSO (which used to be led by Trauneck) would occasionally conduct workshops with the string ensemble in Soweto, with some of the learners being given an opportunity to be accompanied by the JSO at these workshops. Sandile Khemese fondly remembers some of the performances in the early days — playing at the circus or picnic concerts.

[40] Communication with Sandile Khemese took place on the 26 January 2023.

According to Sandile, Mrs Motsieloa sometimes joined the ensemble and played the piano. The Khemese brothers, Kolwane Mantu (violin) and Joshua Thelele (viola), went on to establish the Soweto String Quartet in 1978.

From the above, it is clear that one of the primary objectives of apartheid was to deny people equal rights by introducing various pieces of legislation, including the Bantu Education Act. Dr HF Verwoerd, who was then minister of Native Affairs, emphasised this point, declaring that "…if the native in South Africa today in any kind of school in existence is being taught to expect that he will live his adult life under a policy of equal rights, he is making a big mistake" (Robertson, 1971: 131).

Further clarity on the objectives of the Act was provided by the Minister of Bantu Education when the position was created in 1958, WA Maree, when he said:

> *…there are in South Africa today actually two courses open…there are only two possible trends of policy which can be followed in regard to the natives in general. One is the trend of liberalism, which means uniform development. On the other hand, there is a trend adopted by the Nationalists, which means development in their own spheres. On the one hand, one has liberalism which means nothing but intermingling; on the other hand, one has nationalism which means segregation. Native education is, at present, nothing less than an instrument in the hands of liberalism. Such liberalism was at variance with government policy; in particular, it fostered an ambition for political rights which would remain unfulfilled* (Robertson, 1971).

Apartheid's plans were not only limited to schools but extended to universities, with their segregation first announced in 1955 and followed by the Separate Universities Bill tabled in 1957. In terms of this Bill, separate colleges would be provided for Africans, and these colleges would be tribal. In this way, the apartheid government planned to discourage Africans from developing ambitions to be part of an integrated society. Africans' training at the university level was strictly vocational with a view to their future role among those of the same race (Robertson, 1971: 133-134).

Previously, South African universities had been free to choose who they accepted as students.

> *…it must be remembered that the degree of autonomy which the universities have today was accorded them by the state and can therefore be amended by the State…The State has now decided on a certain policy of great national importance with regard to the relationship between white and non-white, and that policy does not stop at the borders of the universities…there can be no imperium in imperio (*JH Viljoen, who was Minister of Education, Arts and Science, in response to 'English universities' protests) (Robertson, 1971: 134).

This is one of the reasons the Freedom Charter, 1955 (which was the statement of principles developed by the ANC-led alliance including the Indian Congress of Democrats, South African Congress of Trade Unions, and the Coloured People's Congress) included an education clause, which was linked to cultural demands. Part of it read, "The doors of learning and culture shall be opened…". As Suttner and Cronin (2006) explained, this was a fundamental premise on which a new democratic people's education would be based. This meant that education and access to cultural goods could not be the privilege of a section of the population, whether white or wealthy. According to Suttner and Cronin (2006), racist rule has damaged the minds of both black and white and courses in race studies, including even the more innocuous sounding subjects such as history, have filled minds with unscientific, racist accounts of the place and contribution of blacks in this world (Suttner & Cronin, 2006: 137). Suttner and Cronin (2006) noted that culture had been depicted as superior yet inaccessible to most blacks, especially Africans, who the authors said were encouraged to develop along their own lines with a frozen form of traditional culture (Suttner and Cronin, 2006: 183). Much was, therefore, explicitly removed from the curriculum. So teachers had to exceed the needs of the curriculum in whatever educational system existed in an attempt to close the gaps. They used the spaces provided by the white liberals to work with choirs and organise festivals; despite the patronising overtones, they still needed the resources. Sutter and Cronin (2006) believe that, by declaring black cultures to be worthless or reviving them artificially and statically, apartheid aimed to breed self-contempt in blacks, to immobilise them in the face of an apparently superior white culture.

The result, as will be discussed, was that the education and culture clauses were incorporated into the post-apartheid government policies to develop a democratic African culture which was not exclusivist.

Another significant point is that, during the period discussed in this chapter (the 1950s), there were political shifts, including the fact that the Freedom Charter sought to clarify the question of race when it declared that "South Africa belongs to all who live in it". As Suttner and Cronin (2006) point out, this decision was criticised by black consciousness and the Africanist trends for its racial inclusiveness. The Africanists within the movement included Mothopeng, who played a critical role in establishing the JBMF, as discussed. As Meli (1988) explained, from the 1950s, discontent grew among a small minority within the ANC, especially after adopting the Freedom Charter. They accused the Congress Alliance of being a union of exploiters and the exploited and that the ANC had betrayed the material interests of African people. As Meli (1988) explained, African nationalism had always been a contradictory phenomenon with different and, at times, antagonistic and divergent trends and tendencies (Meli, 1988: 137). By 1959, the anti-collaborationists within the ANC eventually broke away to form the Pan Africanist Congress (Robertson, 1971: 70). Their first congress was held in Orlando, Soweto, and some decisions with cultural implications included that there would be non-collaboration with government institutions or white political parties (Harsh, 1980). The newly elected president of the Pan Africanist Congress (PAC), Robert Sobukwe, explained that the PAC believed cooperation was possible only between equals. There could not be cooperation between the oppressor and oppressed, between dominating and dominated. That was collaboration, not cooperation (Harsh, 1980: 239). Sobukwe viewed African nationalism as the only instrument capable of successfully mobilising the black masses to overthrow white domination. Sobukwe's problem with the ANC was thus multiracialism in this case.

The 1950s and '60s thus placed the Africanists working for the city of Johannesburg in a difficult situation, including Mothopeng and Lucas Makhema, having to resign from their roles.

Chapter 4

Playing Orchestral Duels with Apartheid

4.1. Black South Africa

Despite colonial and apartheid policies firmly entrenched from the late 19th century and 1948, respectively, there was an emergence of community music education projects from the 1950s onwards, including the project that was discussed in the second chapter, Michael Moerane's African Springtime Orchestra, followed closely by initiatives in and around the city of Johannesburg, led by Khabi Mngoma from the 1950s and Michael Masote from the 1960s. These initiatives were not limited to classical music, as Moerane's neighbour in Queenstown, Todd Matshikiza, had been teaching both jazz and classical music. Matshikiza continued teaching when he arrived in Johannesburg at the Bantu Men's Social Centre (BMSC) where he was based. The BMSC was one of the few places in Johannesburg where black musicians could come and study music literacy and instrumental music. As discussed earlier, some white liberals had realised that culture was an asset that could be used as an auxiliary force to defuse black resistance through liberal institutions such as the BMSC– but as pointed out, these structures were, in effect, partially opposing oppression even while potentially posing alternative forms of cultural colonisation.

These institutions were not only aimed at smoothing relations between black and white, but they went a long way in their attempt to close the education gap created by colonialism and apartheid. Indeed, the Jubilee Social Centre, the BMSC, and Dorkay House pre-dated apartheid. However, from 1953, the Bantu Education Act was even further to ensure that blacks were restricted to basic forms of physical labour, with no or very limited opportunities to aspire to anything beyond this (Oliphant, 2020:7). It is therefore not surprising that these cultural institutions became critical during the pioneering years in the 1950s and '60s. But it was acts of liberalism that had established these institutions, and liberalism had its own problems. For example, it had been criticised for its tendency for paternalism. This was precisely the point ZK Matthews was making when he described it as a constant source of irritation and that liberals should be asked whether they had enough

strength and enough ability to overcome the reluctance of the average liberal white South African to work *with* instead of *for* the African' (Robertson, 1971: 118).

The community music projects that were directed from the Jubilee Social Centre (with satellites in Soweto) became even more important after the adoption of the Bantu Education Act (1953), which ensured that there was not going to be arts education for Africans in public schools and at black tertiary institutions as discussed in the earlier chapters. The segregation was extended to universities in a move first announced in 1955, with the separate universities Bill tabled in 1957. In terms of this Bill, separate colleges would be provided for Africans. In this way, the apartheid government planned to discourage Africans from developing ambitions to be part of an integrated society. Africans' training at university level was to be strictly vocational with a view to their future role among those of the same 'race' (Robertson, 1971: 133-134).

Previously, South African universities had been free to choose who they accepted as students. JH Viljoen, who was Minister of Education, Arts and Science, issued a strong response to some of the English-speaking universities which tried to resist these proposed changes (Robertson, 1971: 134):

Minister of Bantu Education, WA Maree, provided further clarity in 1958 when the Bantu Education Ministry was created:

> *…there are in South Africa today actually two courses open…there are only two possible trends of policy which can be followed in regard to the natives in general. One is the trend of liberalism, which means uniform development. On the other hand, there is a trend adopted by the Nationalists, which means development in their own spheres. On the one hand, one has liberalism which means nothing but intermingling; on the other hand, one has nationalism which means segregation. Native education is, at present, nothing less than an instrument in the hands of liberalism. Such liberalism was at variance with government policy; in particular, it fostered an ambition for political rights which would remain unfulfilled…*

Dr HF Verwoerd, who was Minister of Native Affairs at the time, also added his voice, declaring, "…if the native in South Africa today in any kind of school in existence is being taught to expect that he will live his adult life under a policy of equal rights, he is making a big mistake…" (Robertson, 1971: 131).

Apartheid diverted the attention of liberals to the white racial issue and the question of white rights within the white electorate. Before 1953, apartheid legislation had mostly affected the lives of black South Africans rather than whites. From 1953, when the Afrikaner National Party was returned to power, the focus shifted to include targeting liberal institutions such as the Jubilee Social Centre, whose success had begun to threaten the apartheid.

These developments gave the ANC fresh impetus to undergo a process of radical change that had already begun before 1948. It resulted in several strategies the ANC had to adopt, including its Programme of Action, which was first endorsed in December 1949. This programme entailed boycotts, strike action and civil disobedience. The ANC was also at this time officially collaborating with the Communist Party, a strategy rejected by Africanists within the party, who eventually broke away to form the Pan Africanist Congress (PAC) in 1959 (Robertson, 1971: 64 - 70). These political developments widened the gap between liberals and blacks in the city and intensified the struggle against apartheid.

The controversial departure of Khabi Mngoma from the employment of the City of Johannesburg in 1965, therefore, takes place against this background. However, it may also be understood in terms of his personal financial situation, which he disclosed in an interview with Burger (1992). The personnel manager of the British pharmaceutical company Reckitt and Colman, Gordon Strachan, who was based in Isando in Johannesburg, saw Mngoma as a suitable person for their growth strategy in black townships and thus approached him.
The company required someone well-known with a respectable public profile in the black South African population. The required person was to remain in their current employment and do additional work for the pharmaceutical company (holding two positions). Mngoma fitted the profile, and responded positively, telling Burger in an interview that a double salary was better than a single salary (Burger, 1992: 140). At this point, Dorkay House had

also offered him a position to head the African Music and Drama Association (AMDA). When Strachan approached Mngoma's employer, the city of Johannesburg, he was turned down, but Dorkay House was prepared to share Mngoma with Strachan's company. According to Mngoma, when the members of the Ionian Music Society received the news of his departure, they approached him privately and requested to move with him to Dorkay House (Burger, 1992: 141). By the end of 1965, the entire company of the Ionian Music Society had been incorporated with the educational activities of AMDA. As Burger (1992) explained, the change of address also meant that the company would, from then on, function under the patronage of the Union of Southern African Artists (Burger, 1992: 141).

According to Coplan, The Union Artists were led by Ian Bernhardt (the group's founding chairperson), with other founding members including Guy Routh, actor Dan Poho, musician Gwigwi Mrebi, Bob Leshoi, Sidney Sepamla, Meshack Mosia and others (Coplan, 1985). Bernhardt explained that the Union's objectives aimed not only to protect performers' rights and provide non-commercial, artistically free outlets for their talent but also to facilitate creative exchange between artists and communities of all races and develop a broadly South African urban performance culture. As Coplan explained, Union Artists were very influential, with one of their highlights including the time when they successfully lobbied British Equity to boycott all segregated performances in South Africa in the late 1950s (Coplan, 1985: 205–206). The other example of the Union's success was the production of King Kong, produced with the assistance of Union Artists.

The departure of Mngoma happened in the same year as that of Cecil Skotnes, who had also resigned from the NEAD in 1965 to go and pursue a career as a freelance artist.

According to his family archival records[41], he transferred all equipment and instruments to township projects. He destroyed records, and in his view, this was done to help protect those involved against the apartheid authorities. It is possible that some of the musical instruments were in the custodianship of Mngoma, who had worked closely with Skotnes. Sheila Masote explained how difficult it was to secure musical instruments for the Soweto

[41] Cecil Skotnes family records can be accessed at Cecil Skotnes, https://cecilskotnes.com

Youth Ensemble, which started in the same year at Uncle Tom's Hall. The Soweto Youth Orchestra was initiated with the support of NEAD under the auspices of the City of Johannesburg.

It may have been during this time (1965) that the Ionians purchased a Hammond organ. As Burger explains, before 1964, the organ must have been a borrowed instrument. During performances, the Hammond was used on its own or together with the piano, sometimes, two pianos were used, and at times, the Hammond and the orchestra were combined. The main reason for this approach was that some of the musicians in the orchestra did not yet have the necessary technical skills to cope with some of the difficult passages in the orchestral score. In such instances, missing parts would be played on the keyboard (Burger, 1992: 133). There were incentives to keep orchestral members motivated; for example, the junior orchestra members could be promoted to the senior orchestra if they improved their playing. Another motivating factor was the music society's annual concert, which featured the combined orchestra accompanying the choirs. Usually, a large-scale work would be selected for the occasion, including the *St Matthew Passion* (Bach) and *Israel in Egypt* (Handel). All these events kept the young musicians practising and looking forward to the next big one. Furthermore, Mngoma gave young pianists opportunities to play with his orchestra as soloists, but they first had to pass an audition.

During our interview on the developments from 1948, Makhene realised that these were linked to an experience of close to 50 years (referring to the first half of the twentieth century) of a type of cultural aspect of sameness (equality), humanness and right to talent in black communities, something that was encouraged in the sphere of churches, worship and missionary education. Makhene was reflecting on the pioneering work by the cultural leaders, despite the hardships under apartheid[42]. In his reflection, Makhene explains how African cultural leaders discussed in previous chapters persevered through the harsh circumstances; they pursued the path of not just choral discipline, they learnt from other disciplines, including the orchestral, and established a society that would bring forth technical disciplines found in symphonic performance. Mngoma used the orchestra to build

[42] Interview conducted with Motsumi Makhene, 11 November 2020, at the Funda Centre in Diepkloof, Soweto.

confidence, instil pride, deal with posture, teach how to sit and walk on stage and all the discipline that goes with being an orchestral musician. Makhene recalled how Mngoma was one of the few remaining activists in the cultural space in the 1960s, as many had left the country. For Mngoma, the arts became an instrument of resistance and social cohesion. He still had a network of friends, explained Makhene, going back to the days of the Syndicate of African Artists, and they assisted each other when required. Makhene remembered a particular instance where Matlhare (a former educator from Orlando High School), who had now moved to Botswana, provided accommodation for some of the players from the youth ensemble during their visit to Gaborone. These leaders worked around colonialism and apartheid, inspired by New Africanism. There was a need to reconnect with the old concept of African modernity. The challenge for his generation, suggested Makhene, was how to reconstruct that world and its theories, including the use of indigenous instruments authentic to the nature of African classical music (a style that had been adopted by many African composers such as Moerane and Mzilikazi Khumalo, to compose on African musical aesthetics).

Makhene argues that:

> *South Africa has not really looked at the value of its heritage. The activists from 1890 to 1948 had heritage in their blood, and they lived Africa. In the 1960s, there was a disruption of missionary movement from the native to the Bantu, which was further diluted*.

Here Makhene was referring to the mission-educated New African movement, which was weakened by apartheid and eventually died in the 1960s.

> *We should ask ourselves, what is our gift to the activists of the future? We need to go back to understand what that leadership was all about, then we can begin to weave the policies' strand to enable the development of an applied policy in the township, city, and province.*

Mngoma, according to Makhene, had an appreciation for egalitarian relations because he worked with children and parents from different walks of life and had no tolerance for those who were better off or looked down on those less fortunate. This led to adopting a black-and-white uniform, which helped ensure everyone treated one another with respect. In terms of policy, Mngoma used whatever was available to do what was necessary to advance the black community, given the apartheid regime's limitations. Makhene described the workings at the Ionian Music Society, which included the Ionian male, female and mixed choirs and the senior and youth orchestras. He described it as a structured institution with volunteers who held various positions administratively and otherwise, and thus this was not a one-man show. Perhaps something that worked well for Mngoma was his willingness to learn. As Makhene explains, Mngoma researched what was happening in other parts of the world and how to achieve performance excellence. While this is an interesting point, the researcher could not find any indication whether, for example, Mngoma was familiar with the *El Sistema* approach in Central and South America. In terms of policy, Makhene suggested that policy should perhaps be developed in a way that reflects practice and history. Perhaps practitioners should develop a policy aligning with what they do and for themselves to create space for orchestral music that speaks to a future identity. This, Makhene added, would only be possible if the DSAC is radically restructured for this new purpose. There would be no adequate support with the current structure, and instead, the relationship would be about artists making demands and the DSAC struggling to respond. The reason Makhene suggested that Johannesburg was an 'English City' is because he could not imagine an 'Afrikaner City' that would have a policy that included the Europeanisation of Africans because the Afrikaners wanted to develop a backward and more brutal system built around the Bantustan model, discussed in more detail later. However, it has to be noted that the historical account of the liberal agenda recounted in the research thus far may appear to underplay the levels of racial paternalism often entailed. However, this is clearly not the case, as shall be demonstrated later.

In alignment with apartheid segregation policies, people of colour were moved to the periphery of white areas without resources. The government provided some youth centres based on the model Mngoma developed at the Jubilee Centre. Mngoma handed the model to Masote when he left to start a music department at the University of Zululand in 1975.

However, the Ionian Musical Society continued under the leadership of various people and continues to this day under Mngoma's son, Linda.

Masote used this model to build an orchestral presence under the auspices of the city. However, the 1960s was a transitional period from former cultural policies and offices of the city to the West Rand Administration Board (WRAB) that took over from 1975. The WRAB hardly provided any cultural amenities or services, negatively affecting progress made in the 1950s and 1960s.

In 1966, Mngoma went on a nationwide tour with the Ionian Music Society, with some performances at the University of Zululand. The university was so impressed with him and the choir that he was invited back for three straight years from 1969 to 1971. The university rector at the time, Professor Mare, was so impressed, particularly with the participation of both adults and children in the musical performances, that he thought this was the ideal type of activity that the university could use as part of a community outreach programme (Burger, 1992: 244). As a result, the university established a committee to investigate the feasibility of introducing formal music studies. This committee came back with a recommendation that changed the previous opinion held by the university, that music was not a subject basic to one's education, an opinion which emphasized physical sciences, mathematics, history, and languages. The committee, therefore, decided to establish a music department at the university.

Before Mngoma's visits, the university had Reuben Caluza, who lived nearby, as a part-time lecturer responsible for choral music. Caluza's successor, Professor Thembela, was one of the people at the university tasked with searching for a suitable candidate to help establish the proposed music department. According to Burger (1992), the university not only wanted to offer Western music but include ethnomusicology and a study of Zulu music traditions. Critical to this decision, therefore, was to find a candidate who would be familiar with Zulu music traditions and someone who would be patient, sympathetic and have an understanding of students with a poor academic musical background. In the university's view, the correct candidate for this position would not be a highly qualified academic, as

there was a danger that a person of that calibre could be impatient with the expected students (Burger,1992: 245).

Professors Mare and Thembela agreed that this person might be Mngoma, and as a result, Thembela was tasked to persuade Mngoma to relocate to Zululand. Mngoma was approached in 1974, and while he was at first reluctant to leave the Ionian Music Society and Dorkay House, he accepted the offer the following year as a Senior Lecturer. Burger (1992) explains that Mngoma's post was initially not a full professorship. So the university appointed the following advisors to assist him: Yvonne Huskisson, Professor Malan from the University of Port Elizabeth, and Professor Christopher Ballantine from the University of Natal.

4.2. Maintaining Apartheid

The apartheid authorities intensified their efforts to maintain the status quo regarding segregation based on race to consolidate their gains. Several decades earlier, they established the Broederbond (BB), an organisation committed to advancing Afrikaner nationalism and securing and maintaining Afrikaner control over critical areas of government (Bokaba, 2023). In *Politics and the Arts: Orchestras in Post-Apartheid South Africa 1994–2022* (2023), I recounted how one of the most influential music administrators and conductors in apartheid South Africa, Anton Hartman (1918 – 1982), joined the BB at the age of 33 in 1952 and became a key person in government to influence the Afrikaner cultural agenda. Hartman had a close relationship with Piet Meyer, who was an official at the South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC), Deputy Secretary of the Broederbond, and a former member of the Ossewabrandwag — a pro-Nazi paramilitary organisation (Bokaba, 2023).

Hartman's appointment to the SABC as conductor followed his meeting with Meyer (Walton, 2004: 69, quoted in Bokaba, 2023). In 1959, Meyer was appointed Chairman of the Board of Control at the SABC, and the position of Head of Music was created, with Hartman as the first incumbent. As Walton (2004) points out, Hartman was not an ordinary member of the Broederbond. He was, by all accounts, one of its leaders, entrusted with the cultural

agenda of the Afrikaner at the SABC. As Head of Music and conductor, Hartman organised orchestral performances on festive occasions to celebrate the white supremacist regime that appointed him. He took the SABC orchestra on tours to perform for racially segregated audiences in schools and town halls.

He also organised regular symphony concerts at the Johannesburg City Hall, at times inviting great international names such as Stravinsky, who visited South Africa in 1962, and Stockhausen, who visited in 1972, to perform and speak publicly (Walton, 2004: 70, quoted in Bokaba, 2023).

Hartman ensured that the works of Afrikaners were part of regular programming, including composers such as Stefan Grove, Arnold van Wyk, Hubert du Plessis, John Joubert, and others (Walton, 2004: 63). Having spent 38 years at the SABC, and with only five years to retirement, Hartman was appointed to head the University of the Witwatersrand's (Wits) Music Department in 1978, thus extending his influence into academia as well. As I have (2023:3) pointed out, it is unclear what Wits aimed to achieve by making this appointment, given the university's liberal traditions. The apartheid government, however, had been known to find it necessary to infringe on the autonomy of these English-speaking, 'white' institutions, including social centres, schools, universities, and churches which had traditionally upheld liberal values (Robertson, 1971: 129). It is, therefore, unsurprising that Hartman went to work at Wits. In this role, according to Walton, Hartman attracted Afrikaner students to a Music Department that had long been regarded as a preserve of English-speaking students only (Walton, 2004: 71).

Some of the notable Afrikaans students from this period included pianist Anton Nel. There were black students enrolled at Wits during this period, including Makhene, who described some of the most questionable instances, including a time when young African composers were discouraged from incorporating African elements into their work. In our interview, Makhene recalls how he personally approached a composition professor and asked him to critique his work. He was told that his work was melodically and harmonically boring, suggesting he should adopt a Western style of composition. Makhene compared his experience with a young South African trumpeter, Peter Sekgole, who studied in Paris. His lecturers told Makgole to remove the African influences in his playing. As Makhene points

out in the interview, Mngoma had encouraged them to do the opposite and to fuse both African and Western aspects in their work. At the time, Makhene studied violin with Professor Walter Mony and took composition as an additional subject.

The South African National Youth Orchestra (SANYO), which Anton Hartman conducted in the early 1070s, was another area of interest for him. SANYO was initiated by the South African Society for Music Teachers (SASMT) to support developing and training South Africa's young orchestral musicians by organising annual camps. SASMT was formed in 1919 by a small group of white music educators, and in 1962, a nationwide plan for regular orchestral camps was adopted, with the first camp held at Hartbeestpoort Dam in April 1964. By 1978, SASMT could not cope with the required needs and administration work, and an independent foundation was registered. Despite SASMT claiming to represent all teaching members of university departments and the whole music teaching profession, the organisation had largely remained untransformed.

In the National Youth Orchestra, the most advanced were placed in the A Orchestra. The level below was known as the Concert Orchestra (or the Reserve or B Orchestra). There were additional ensembles, including the wind and string ensembles. During our discussion, cellist, Susan Mouton, remembered playing under Anton Hartman in the B Orchestra at the orchestral course held in Durban in 1973. That year, the A Orchestra was conducted by Alberto Bolet, a Cuban-born American chief conductor of the Long Beach Symphony Orchestra in California. He was preferred over Hartman as he was said to have a track record of working with young people, could inspire them to greater achievements and win their affection (Figure 4.1). The National Youth Orchestra organised annual national tours and occasional international tours. These included Aberdeen (1975) and the controversial tours to Paris (1975) and Barcelona (1978), which were undertaken despite the cultural boycotts imposed on South Africa. This resulted in some concert houses being reluctant to host the orchestra, which explains why the concerts were held in alternative venues such as the one shown in Figure 4.2.

Hartman's conducting was not particularly impressive. Walton (2004: 71, quoted in Bokaba, 2023) explains that Hartman was, in his opinion, no more than an averagely gifted conductor who had a straightforward stick technique but was unable to convey any real depth of music, forcing him to specialise in contemporary music as he was incapable of interpreting the classical and romantic repertoires.

This is an interesting argument, given the complexities of contemporary music. However, organisers may have required someone with the capabilities of Bolet, who could engage with classical and romantic repertoires in a way that could be inspirational to young musicians. Nonetheless, Hartman had a holistic view of orchestral activities throughout the country because of working with professionals at the SABC, university students and emerging talent at the youth orchestras. Below is an excerpt from the 1973 concert programme that featured Hartman as one of the conductors in Durban.

FINAL CONCERT FINALE KONSERT
ORCHESTRAL COURSE 1973 ORKESKURSUS
STUDENTS UNION HALL/SAAL
S·A·S·M·T
14-7-73
S·A·V·M·O
Conducted by/
Dirigente
ALBERTO BOLET
ANTON HARTMAN
PIERRE DE GROOTE

A ORCHESTRA/ORKES

1st Violin/1e Viool
Peter Rohner
Susan Kirsten
Anthony Feinstein
Brigitte Bremer
Hans Vonk
Richard Thomas
Marjan Vonk
Denise Schelhase
Bruno Millet
Denise Sutton

2nd Violin/2e Viool
Piet Koornhof
Adri Dekker
Mariette Liebenberg
Titia Stalling
Louise Croft
Karen Ochse
Staedtler van Zyl

Viola/Altviool
Pienaar Fourie
Johan Grobbelaar
Joey Rautenbach
Judy Richardson
Mia Hartman
Michael Slatter

Cello/Tjello
Eric Martens
Silvia Rohner
Peta Ann Richardson
Therese Ahlers
Fiona MacKellar
Eduard Hovy
Valerie Henning
Peter Strahlendorf
John Emery

Double Bass/Kontrabas
Christiaan Odendaal
Max Runge
Alirio Lorenzo

Flute/Fluit
Susan Payne
Ada Potgieter
Elsabé van Wyk
Grant McLachlan

Piccolo
John Hinch

Oboe/Hobo
Peter Jaspan
Kobus Malan

Clarinet/Klarinet
David Kohn
Marietjie Visser
Martin Nicholson
Etienne Malan

Bassoon/Fagot
Robert Juritz
Cornelia Anderson

Trumpet/Trompet
Johan Pretorius
Alistair McDonald
Howard Davey

Horn/Horing
Johann Zietsman
Eric Albertyn
Francois Malherbe
Tony Ezendam

Trombone/Skuiftrompet
Pieter Schutte
Francis Smit
Winfried Lüdemann

Tuba
Tobie van Heerden

Timpani/Pouke
Ian Roos

Cymbals/Simbale
Nico Marais

Tambourine, Snare Drum
David Kosviner

Cymbals, Triangle
Riana van Niekerk

Bass Drum, Xylophone
Deborah Krige

Bass Drum, Side Drum
Sareen Smit

Figure 4.1. Concert Programme of the National Youth Orchestra from 1973, (Courtesy of Sophia Welz, Managing Director of the South African National Youth Orchestra Foundation)

Figure 4.1. National Youth Orchestra in Barcelona in 1978 in what appears to be an alternative concert venue due to the cultural boycott at the time. (Picture courtesy of Sophia Welz, Managing Director of the South African National Youth Orchestra Foundation)

In 1971, the apartheid government introduced the Bantu Affairs Administration Act, which they claimed would help government make better provision for the administration of Bantu Affairs outside the Bantu homelands.

The Bantu Affairs Administration Boards[43] were established on this basis. Some of the responsibilities of these boards included implementing influx control regulations and other laws which affected black people living outside the homelands. As a result, the West Rand Administration Board (WRAB) took over the control of Soweto from the non-European Affairs Department (NEAD) in 1973, with devastating outcomes. Not only did the living conditions of Sowetans deteriorate due to a lack of services, but WRAB showed very little interest in the cultural affairs of Africans. In addition to the student issues at the time, the uprisings that followed in 1976 can be partly attributed to the worsening situation. As Philip Frankel (1979) explains:

> *The politics of the all-white Johannesburg City Council and those of its successor since 1971, the West Rand Bantu Administration Board, are no more than pale reflections of a political atmosphere creating enormous constraints on the reflective workings of administrative arrangements. Most of the actual residents of Soweto describe the relationship between the municipality and the WRAB as one between the devil and the deep, and few endorse the view that the period of WRAB control has resulted in significant improvements in township life … the Soweto situation has seriously deteriorated, and WRAB has been an important element in the process of decay.*

By 1975, the situation had become untenable at the JBMF, with Zeph Mothopeng, who was out of jail during this time, calling a meeting at Uncle Tom's Hall[44]. One of the outcomes of the meeting was that the name of the JBMF would change to the African Cultural Organisation of Southern Africa (ACOSA) under the chairmanship of Mr D Mabalane. The

[43] In a historical context, this was a regional structure responsible for implementing influx control regulations and other laws which affected black people living outside the homelands - Dictionary of South African English which can be accessed at https://dsae/entry/administration-board/e00072.

[44] Interview with Sheila Masote.

last black chairman was Mothopeng, who held this position from 1947–1952. Since then, it has been the responsibility of NEAD and the city's cultural officers (all white) to provide a chairman for the festival. ACOSA remained under the auspices of the City of Johannesburg, with Michael Masote still in the employment of the city, extending the association between the family and the city, which was started by Masote's father-in-law, Zephania Mothopeng. This is despite the family's Africanist associations, which are more radical politically yet more collaborationist in practice.

Masote continued his efforts to build a larger orchestra, a proper symphony orchestra. In 1975, he introduced wind and brass instruments, and the name of the ensemble changed from the Soweto Youth Orchestra to Soweto Symphony Orchestra (SSO), with new students such as renowned conductor of the Imilonji Kantu Choral Society, George Mxadana, playing the flute. As Mxadana recalled, intonation remained a challenge for the ensemble, as many of the players could not properly tune their instruments or play in tune with each other. The orchestra needed additional support and expertise from the city and the sector. In an interview with Mxadana, he remembered that it was around this time that the city sent conductor Michael Hankinson to work with them. However, Hankinson was eventually asked to leave as learners feared that he was there to take over the orchestra. One of the very young musicians at the time, violinist Arthur Matlhatsi, fondly remembers some of the repertoire played by the advanced players, including Ronald Binge's *Elizabethan Serenade*, with Mxadana on the flute.

4.3. Lucas Mangope in Bophuthatswana: Dog of the Boers or Orchestral Messiah?

The apartheid government was determined to deprive Africans of any rights, including their South African citizenship. To this end, the Bantu Authorities Act, passed in 1951, was slowly being phased in. In his work titled *To Come Together for Progress: Modernisation and Nation-building in South Africa's Bantustan Periphery — the Case of Bophuthatswana*, Peris Jones (1999) reminds his readers that the success of the Bantu Authorities Act involved massive social engineering with the forced relocation of millions to the margins of white South Africa. This discourse was thus tied to a particular framework where the initial step to

the practical realisation of separate development of the European and the Bantu (apartheid) lay in the full-scale segregation of the Bantu areas.

By 1977, the homeland of Bophuthatswana had been declared 'independent', along with the other TBVC States, i.e. the homelands of Transkei (1976), Venda (1979) and Ciskei (1981). These 'independent' homelands were allocated according to the designated ethnic groups. For example, Bophuthatswana was designated for the Setswana-speaking group of people. As Jones (1999) explains, Bophuthatswana was eventually allocated seven scattered parcels of land. It is essential to understand why a homeland would even consider establishing youth orchestral programmes, a professional ballet company, and building theatres. Jones (1999) points to the influential report (1955) prepared by the apartheid government, which made it clear that the policy of separate development was, first and foremost, premised on maintaining the "foundations on which European civilisation rest", which would vanish before the European himself disappeared in the absence of discrimination (Jones, 1999: 583). According to Jones, the fundamental basis of apartheid was maintaining this European identity or 'civilisation' with warnings of dire results if it was not ensured. A deeply ironic situation given that the rationale for ethnic African 'homelands' was ultimately the maintenance of whiteness.

The leader of the Bophuthatswana Bantustan, Lucas Mangope, mentioned in previous chapters where Christian discourse had played a critical role for good and bad, too, turned to the Bible to rally support to achieve his goals for the Bantustan. Using Christian discourse, Mangope told the people he would take them (the Batswana) to Canaan[45]. As Jones explains (1999), Mangope attempted to capture the sense of dispossession and upheaval associated with the Batswana Diaspora during pre- and colonial eras. Mangope was manipulating the history of instability, vulnerability, and unease to persuade the people that he (the messiah of the Batswana) would create stability and lead his people (the lost children of Israel) from the darkness of colonialism and apartheid (Jones, 1999: 585). This discourse resonated with many in the Bantustan, especially the uneducated and impoverished.

[45] This information is taken from personal communication between M Gcinumkhonto, of the South African Communist Party in the North West Province with Peris Jones (quoted in Jones, 1999).

From 1981 to 1987, Lucas Mangope began to personally drive implementing the Bophuthatswana development policy. As Jones (1999) explains, policy-making in Bophuthatswana revolved around a small clique at the pinnacle of the state and the development strategies were directed from these lofty heights in a top-down manner in weekly meetings (Jones, 1999: 599). Importantly, these plans were to place Bophuthatswana on the world stage as a public relations exercise. The projects that followed included an international airport, two soccer stadiums, a game reserve, an international school, a string of hotels including Sun City, Bophuthatswana Recording Studios, television and radio stations, Mmabana Cultural Centres (Mmabatho, Thaba Nchu, Taung, Lehurutshe) run by Mangope's daughter-in-law, Rosemary Mangope and a Performing Arts Council that included an orchestra, ballet, dance, choir and drama studios.

In 1984 Michael Masote was invited to establish the Mmabatho Youth Orchestra in Bophuthatswana[46]. In the previous year, Masote had conducted his historic version of Handel's *Messiah* (the Black Messiah), which he translated into ten South African languages. This performance occurred at the Holy Cross Anglican Church in Soweto, accompanied by the Soweto Symphony Orchestra. The move to Bophuthatswana was motivated by several factors. First, the relationship with the Bantu Administration Board that replaced the NEAD in the City of Johannesburg in 1975 was no longer solid. Second, after the 1976 riots, the situation for musicians under the State of Emergency of the 1980s was not conducive for gatherings and concerts (the inaugural Black Messiah concert took place under these difficult conditions). The ties with the City of Johannesburg were no longer solid, and, according to Sheila Masote, there was a real threat that Michael Masote could lose his job. So when Bophuthatswana came with the offer, the family accepted. The Masote family remained in Bophuthatswana until 1988 when they returned to Soweto, and the Mmabatho Youth orchestra collapsed with their departure.

A second Bophuthatswana string ensemble was established in the same year as the Mmabatho ensemble in 1984, in the township of Ga-Rankuwa, North West of Pretoria[47]. The Odi Youth String Orchestra was established in partnership with the Performing Arts

[46] Personal communication with Sheila Masote 20 January 2023.
[47] The author was one of the first players to join the youth programme.

Council of the Transvaal (PACT), which offered their principal players to give tuition in violin, viola, cello and double bass. The teachers included Denise Sutton, who was the author's teacher on the violin; Glenda Piek taught the cello; and Lodovico Gabanella taught the double bass. Despite being located in apartheid's capital, Pretoria, PACT appeared willing to work across racial lines and, in 1983, employed Andrew Moorosi permanently to play cor anglais and oboe. Moorosi was the only black African player in the 1980s in a professional orchestra in South Africa. The relationship between PACT and this ensemble was initiated by Steven Nkwane, a music inspector of schools in and around Ga-Rankuwa and the conductor of the Ga-Rankuwa Adult Choir. Mangope had entrusted Nkwane with the youth ensemble, which Nkwane occasionally used to accompany his choir. Importantly, Nkwane identified opportunities for young musicians to meet their peers in Soweto and participate in the national orchestral courses. The ensemble began working closely with Kolwane Mantu's African Youth Ensemble in Diepkloof and Dorothy van de Geest, who organised the national youth orchestral courses.

By 1988, some learners were part of the South African National Youth Orchestral course held at Wits, and the following year, even more players were participating in the orchestral course held in Bloemfontein. These collaborations were undertaken with the full knowledge and support of Mangope, whose government in 1989 authorised the Bantustan's airline, Bop Air, to transport the young musicians to Bloemfontein. Partnerships were also formed with the Pretoria Youth Orchestra under Hester Wohlitz, where learners were exposed to more orchestral repertoire[48].

There were several attempts to remove Mangope from power, with the first attempt carried out on 10 February 1988, led by his army general, Rocky Malebana-Metsing, however, because it was a military attempt as opposed to a popular uprising, the South African Defence Force intervened (Lawrence & Manson, 1994).

[48] The author used to be a regular musician in the ensembles mentioned above.

Figure 4.2: Young musicians from Bophuthatswana, seen here with their peers at the national youth orchestral course in Bloemfontein in 1989. From left to right, Jan Henkins, Leonie Viljoen, Segopotso Nkwane, Pfani Emmanuel Netshinzereni, name unknown, Shadrack Bokaba, Lebogang Nkwane, Bernard Madumo, name unknown, Jacqui Viljoen. Photo: Gill Udal

Figure 4.4: The author, Shadrack Bokaba on the violin (left), together with Bernard Madumo (right) in rehearsal. Picture: Gill Udal

Figure 4.5: Part of the Ga-Rankuwa Youth Orchestra, at times referred to as the Odi Youth String Orchestra, in rehearsal with players from the Pretoria Youth Orchestra in the late 1980s. Picture taken by Gill Udal.

By 1990, Bophuthatswana had established its own performing arts company, known as the Bophuthatswana Arts Council. It had professional ballet, dance, drama and opera/chorus companies, and an orchestra, the National Chamber Orchestra (NCO). These entities were supported by Mmabana centres, which focused on arts education programmes that supported the professional companies. In the 1990s, the NCO had the highest proportion of black musicians in the country. These included violist Tshepo Komane, violinists Bernard Madumo, Melale Mantu, Arthur Matlhatsi, Patrick Motsa and myself, and cellist Lebogang Nkwane, who were all part of this 30-member ensemble. Mantu had studied violin at Wits and in England, while Madumo and I had studied music at Wits University. In 1994, a significant shift in political developments occurred, fuelled by widespread uprisings which entailed looting shops and businesses. The situation escalated when a group of white right-

wingers belonging to the Afrikaner Weerstands Beweging (AWB) entered Bophuthatswana to assist Mangope in stopping the uprising. They were shot in cold blood by a soldier of the Bophuthatswana Defence Force (Lawrence & Manson, 1994). As Lawrence and Manson (1994) explained, the National Party intervened, but this time, not to prop up Mangope but to oversee his departure from the political arena. Bophuthatswana was reincorporated into South Africa after the 1994 elections, and many cultural institutions were closed down, including the NCO, in March 2000[49].

I attempted to explain why the post-apartheid government closed this particular orchestra down (Bokaba, 2023). In his response to this question, the head of Social Services, Arts, Culture and Sports, Gulam Mayet, told the *Mail & Guardian*[50] that the challenge had to do with the bad integration process of homelands back into South Africa. This fundamental problem, he explained, left the North West Arts and Mmabana Cultural Centres as provincial structures outside the aegis of the national government, and the National Chamber Orchestra was under the control of the North West Arts. The second problem, claimed Mayet, was that the North West was excluded from national funding as it was a black-run entity. While it is difficult to verify some of Mayet's allegations, the events leading to the closures seem to suggest an economic challenge where the provincial budget could not sustain cultural institutions on the scale of orchestras. A point confirmed by Mayet, who said that the orchestra became the target as it consumed too many resources for a provincial government that was determined to spread funding as widely as possible among different cultural forms (Beresford, 2000).

As I have outlined (ibid), the NCO was an orchestra that consciously made a decision long before it became popular to do so, to reflect local Tswana cultures. The work resulted in a collection of music arrangements that used to be known as Songs of the Leopard[51]. In addition, the NCO featured some of South Africa's leading black artists. These included Lucky Dube, Jabu Khanyile, and musicians from the Diaspora through NCO's participation at events such as the annual Kora Awards, Rumba in the Jungle and others. As the former Acting CEO of North West Arts, Walter Mosetlhi, put to the *Mail & Guardian*, "The NCO is

[49] The author was one of the retrenched musicians of the NCO.
[50] Interview was published on 3 March 2000, titled 'Finale for another orchestra', authored by Belinda Beresford and can be accessed at https://mg.co.za/article/2000-03-03-finale-for-another-orchestra/.
[51] The author was a member of the orchestra and recalls playing music from the collection.

not elitist. It is not Eurocentric. It is not Afrocentric. The NCO is an orchestra that plays the music for the people!" (Beresford, 2000). It can be argued that the statement 'the people' is an appropriation of populist rhetoric to justify what has been labelled a class-based and, arguably, ethnically framed practice deeply invested in the apartheid-homeland complex. What was defensible, though, was that the orchestra had become accessible, both in terms of instrumental music studies for aspiring young musicians and for entertainment for the local communities.

It has to be recognised that the Bantustan system was an extension of apartheid. However, Mangope achieved something relatively unique that could have laid a foundation for post-apartheid cultural policy. It was an explicit policy of Mangope to create art centres, sites of access, especially in rural areas – and, looking back, it is hard to find more successful examples of these kinds of community projects.

Chapter 5

Arts and Culture Policies in Post-Apartheid South Africa

No one has ever developed a chronic illness from eating vegetables. Similarly, post-apartheid South Africa has developed healthy cultural policies based on extensive research, public participation, best practice, and the European 'arm's-length' funding model (discussed in detail in the next chapter). These are all healthy principles necessary for policy formulation and development. The acid question is: Must the country follow these Western examples, such as an arm's length principle in policymaking, or are there other unique factors to consider as the country grapples with post-colonial legacies in pursuit of equality and justice in this diverse society? South Africa's arts and culture policies have been claimed by some to draw their inspiration from the culture and ethics of African humanism – Ubuntu. This is a distinctive African humanist worldview based on the inherent, reciprocal, and mutual values and respect that all people are irreducibly equal (RWP, Chapter 2:9). Suffice it to say that Ubuntu inspired African leaders through the struggles against colonialism and apartheid. However, what do post-apartheid cultural policies do for current generations of black orchestral musicians who have inherited these practices from the pioneers of the 1950s and 1960s, including their personal legacies and the second generation from the 1970s and 1980s? Do policies acknowledge that contemporary experiences may result from an accumulated and extensive heritage from these periods? Do they acknowledge this rich history?

Andries Oliphant is a respected cultural activist and policymaker who has been closely involved in the country's policymaking processes from the transitional period in the early 1990s to the revision of the White Paper adopted by parliament in 2019. In his work titled *Acts of Culture: Searching for a National South African Identity in the Context of Arts, Culture and Heritage Diversity* (2020)[52], Oliphant goes back to the historical moment when artists, cultural and heritage practitioners aligned to the struggle took the initiative and came together to develop democratic art, culture and heritage policies and practices for a democratic South Africa. This milestone, part of a much longer and broader process of

[52] Andries Oliphant's article can be accessed online at https:mistral.org.za/mistral-media/acts-of-culture-searching-for-a-national-south-african-identity-in-the-context-of…

cultural policy discussions, took place in the Wits Great Hall in Johannesburg in 1992, following the unbanning of liberation movements and the return of exiles.

The initiative was led by the National Arts Coalition (NAC), initiated by the Congress of South African Writers. One of the outcomes of the Wits meeting was that an executive committee was elected to research international policy developments in the sector. The objective was to identify best practice and present policy proposals to abolish the state-funded colonial and apartheid arts, culture and heritage dispensation. This was to be replaced with an inclusive, democratic and participatory system, premised on the education and culture clause in the Freedom Charter, which read: "The doors of learning and culture shall be opened" (Oliphant, 2020: 10).

Oliphant was concerned about the social and cultural barriers, which he said were institutionalised by colonialism and apartheid, and he believed these barriers must be removed. Oliphant noted that the barriers were designed to maintain a hierarchical system that elevated the minority colonial culture as the official culture of the racist state. This characterisation by Oliphant does not appear to consider the account of the musical dispensation in Johannesburg discussed in the previous chapters. In terms of indigenous African cultures, Oliphant's view was that these cultures were enlisted to engineer separate ethnic identities, with the latter designed to divide the African majority in a system of segregation calculated to secure white minority rule. According to Oliphant (2020), the National Arts Coalition's proposals were incorporated into South Africa's Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) in 1994, along with a proposed framework of new cultural institutions for an integrated democratic dispensation in which diverse cultures were harnessed as resources for creativity, renewal, and inclusivity. According to Oliphant, this was to facilitate the generation of shared values and the emergence of a multi-faceted African national identity comprising complementary and interrelated cultures (Oliphant, 2020: 10).

The National Arts Coalition convened an international conference on cultural policy in 1994 to advance these ideas and ensure they became part of government policy. This conference paved the way for the appointment of the Arts and Culture Task Group (ACTAG) by the new

minister of the Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology (DACST), Dr Baldwin (Ben) Ngubane. After extensive consultations and research, the ACTAG presented a report to the minister, which formed the basis for the White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage (1996). As Oliphant explained, the driver was to end the race-based, institutional exclusions imposed by apartheid. The report aimed to transform society into an inclusive and unified formation and systematically address the exclusions, inequalities, and injustices of the past (Oliphant, 2020: 11).

However, as Williams (1996) observed, there was a glaring lack of conceptual consistency in the definition of 'culture' in the ACTAG report. Culture appeared to have been frozen in time, space and social processes when it was argued that "culture is our common heritage and the avenues of expressing it through the arts, humanities, anthropology, architecture and any other means of expression people use to communicate their fundamental character and aspiration" (Chapter 5, p. 178 of the ACTAG Report). Williams (1996) argued that this definition suggested that culture is primarily concerned with what is deposited through past practices and, therefore, inherited by subsequent generations as opposed to simultaneously accenting and allowing for the modification and alternating effects that contemporary experiences might have on the accumulated heritage of former generations. While there was a lack of consistency in how ACTAG defined culture, it did recognise both traditional and contemporary understanding of culture.

Molefe Phineas Pheto noted specifically that these cultural policies, including current policies, actually ignored the understanding of history (including the history of his own experiences in orchestral playing), and policy considerations seem to be informed by political and other considerations instead[53]. It is unclear which political considerations Pheto was referring to. However, it must be noted that Pheto was a Guildhall-qualified trumpeter in Mngoma's Ionian orchestra, a filmmaker, and a photographer. Like his teachers from his township of Orlando, Pheto was closely aligned to the Azanian People's Organisation (AZAPO), where he was a military combatant of the Azanian National Liberation Army (AZANLA) and a member of the Pan Africanist Congress where he fought for the Azanian

[53] Mr Pheto was interviewed on Wednesday 11 November 2020 at the Funda Centre, Diepkloof, Soweto.

People's Liberation Army (APLA). Pheto followed in the footsteps of Mothopeng and other leaders before him, who were part of the Pan-Africanist movement that broke away from the ANC in 1959.

One of the critical priorities of the White Paper (1996) was to abolish the segregated arts, culture and heritage dispensation designed and maintained for centuries. The latter only catered for a white minority's colonial heritage, which Oliphant called nostalgic European aesthetic practices. These were to be replaced by an inclusive democratic policy framework of transparency and accountability, freedom of expression and creativity – which were all legally enacted (Oliphant, 2020: 11). However, Oliphant's reference to nostalgic European aesthetic practices does not seem to take into account the history of the work of Mngoma and Masote, who were in the employ of the city of Johannesburg, leading these initiatives.

5.1. Anticipating a Rainbow Nation: Establishing the South African Music Education Trust

In 1994, a group of influential people representing diverse sectors of the musical world, politics, business, and education, came together to form the South African Music Education Trust (SAMET).

At this point, the country was discussing cultural policies, and the group was anticipating major restructuring within the orchestral sector involving black participation. To this end, one of their primary goals was to create music education projects in all provinces to provide a pool of trained classical musicians in the new South Africa. The South African education system was not providing this kind of education in the schooling system at this time. In her doctoral thesis titled *Towards a Justification for a Philosophy of Music Education: A Quodlibet for South Africa* (2008), one of the SAMET Trustees, Marguerite Barker-Reinecke, described the education policies during this transitional period and made the point that they were created without a conceptual base. Her issue was that music was on the outskirts of the educational master plan favouring mathematics, science and literacy. Barker-Reinecke pertinently raised the issue of teacher shortages at that time and the fact that emphasis was being placed on 'basic' subjects. Furthermore, the Department of Education did not make

posts available for specialist music teachers in primary schools. Barker-Reinecke criticised the approach at the time, pointing out that the intention was to appoint generalists as arts and culture teachers tasked to teach drama, music and visual arts. Barker-Reinecke said this was an attempt by policy to blur the outlines of individual art forms in which the teachers had very little or no training. To this end, Barker-Reinecke and other Trustees at SAMET decided to assist the government by providing specialist teachers in townships to teach learners in primary school who would otherwise not have access to this kind of education.

Yehudi Menuhin was appointed as the international patron of SAMET, with activist, poet and writer Mongane Wally Serote, as one of the trustees. Serote was the chairperson of the Parliamentary Portfolio Committee on Arts, Culture, Science and Technology at the time. Other trustees included President Nelson Mandela's private secretary Mary Mxadana, the leader of the Soweto String Quartet, Sandile Khemese, opera singer Mimi Coertse, chief executive of Mercedes Benz, Christopher Kopke, and conductor Michael Hankinson, who was the chairman of the Trust. Wally Serote described the launch of SAMET as .a momentous step, comparable to the historic agreement between the ANC and the Nationalist Government at the World Trade Centre.

SAMET's projects were rolled out nationally in its first five years and reached over 5000 learners through its music centres. It employed more than 150 teachers, with funding from the private sector. By 1999, SAMET was voted Arts and Culture Education Project of the Year by the Arts and Culture Trust of the President. In 2004, SAMET's CEO, Shadrack Bokaba (the author), was voted Arts Administrator of the Year by the Arts and Culture Trust**.** One of SAMET's initial projects was the Alexandra Music Education Project in one of Johannesburg's poorest townships, Alexandra. In 1997, Standard Bank initiated a staff matching donation scheme where staff members were encouraged to make donations between R100 and R5000 and incentivised that the bank's Foundation would match every donation. The bank eventually took full responsibility and supported this project for several years before the bank's strategy shifted to funding projects at a national level, such as the National Arts Festival. Another major project was the Western Cape Music Education Project (now named after Ronnie Samaai, who was SAMET's project leader for over ten years). In 1996, SAMET's international patron, Yehudi Menuhin, launched his Violins for Africa project.

Several musical instruments were collected; some were donated to the Western Cape Project, and others to other SAMET projects and Mozambique. Other projects managed by SAMET included Dorkay House, Mmabana in the North West, Phokwane in Limpopo and the Ray Phiri Arts Institute in Mpumalanga. Such was the interest in the work of SAMET that it became part of regular academic focus with Le Roux's (2009) research titled *Music in the Community: A Study of Community Music Projects in the Western Cape*, *with specific reference to the Redefine Music Education Project in Kuilsriver,* and Van den Berg's work *Exploring Opportunities for the Generation of Social and Musical Capital in a Community Music Therapy Project in the Western Cape*, both focusing on the SAMET Western Cape project, while Alexandra and Mmabana regularly hosted researchers from abroad.

The appointment of Pallo Jordan as Minister of Arts and Culture from 2004–2009 was a significant period for SAMET. In his last three years in office, Minister Jordan used the opportunity to fund the activities of SAMET. He did this through his discretionary fund, available to ministers then but since discontinued. Through this funding, SAMET organised an annual concert bringing all its students together, and SAMET's mass orchestra accompanied some of the advanced learners. Concerts were held at the Linder Auditorium in Johannesburg. Funding was discontinued when Minister Jordan left office in 2009.

Figure 5.1. Above from left to right: SAMET Chairperson Michael Hankinson, Minister Pallo Jordan, and SAMET CEO Shadrack Bokaba, at the annual SAMET Night of Excellence concert held at the Linder Auditorium 2007–2009. Credit: Picture by Alf Kumalo and supplied by the author.

5.2. Disbanding Bophuthatswana Arts

The White Paper (1996) could not adequately address all critical issues which confronted policymakers at that time. The one glaring and unresolved issue was the question of the inheritance of cultural institutions in Bophuthatswana. The White Paper (1996) noted:

> *The provision and maintenance of arts infrastructure heavily favoured the urban cities of the previous four provinces of the Cape, Natal, Transvaal and Orange Free State, rather than the homelands, except in the former Bophuthatswana where there was an arts council and four Mmabana Community Art Centres with arts and sports facilities*. (Chapter 2, point 12).

The White Paper found that this situation resulted in constant tension regarding provincial equity.

Instead of proposing a way forward for Bophuthatswana, the White Paper deferred the matter and stated ‘’the future of these facilities will be considered when addressing the differential development of arts and culture in the country”. The result was the North West Province (formerly Bophuthatswana) was left with the financial burden of keeping its institutions alive. This led to retrenching of professional companies as the province could no longer afford to keep them (as discussed in the previous chapter). Provincial authorities then decided to keep only community art centres, a decision which must have been easier to make as it spoke to the imperatives of the White Paper (1996), including redress and access to arts education. Unfortunately, this decision also marked the beginning of the de-professionalisation of the arts sector for the North West province, and as it will be shown later, on the broader sector too. The implications were that, once the learners reached professional levels, they had to leave the province to look for work outside their province in the absence of performing companies at home.

5.3. The Restructuring of Performing Arts Councils

It was discussed in the introduction how the Performing Arts Councils (PACs) were absorbing 46% of annual government funding, which was one of the reasons that led to the need for restructuring. It must be noted, however, that before the establishment of the PACs in the 1960s, there was a long history of professional orchestras in South Africa. The very first professional orchestra was the Cape Town Symphony Orchestra, formed in 1914 and supported by the City of Cape Town (Gollom, 2001). In Johannesburg, John Connell negotiated with the City Council of Johannesburg about the necessity for a permanent professional orchestra. It paid off and was established in 1933 under the auspices of the African Broadcasting Corporation. It was originally known as the ABC Symphony Orchestra and eventually became the SABC Orchestra. As discussed in the introductory chapter, the PACs financed and managed their own four orchestras. These resident orchestras included the Natal Philharmonic Orchestra, which was linked to NAPAC, presently known as the Playhouse Company. PACT had its orchestra, which was called the PACT Orchestra. Today PACT is known as the South African State Theatre. The Free State Symphony Orchestra

linked to PACOFS also existed at the time. And finally, CAPAB, today known as Artscape, had its own CAPAB Orchestra, which merged with the Cape Town Symphony Orchestra (CTSO) in 1997 to form the Cape Philharmonic Orchestra.

From 1997, the PACs' allocated budgets declined for three years in a row, starting with 22% cuts in 1997. The government offered only to subsidise the core infrastructure and staff and essential activities of the PACs (White Paper, 1996: Chapter 4). In other words, the business model of the PACs was no longer about artistic production but about the rental of space. This meant that productions had no funding with immediate effect, with funds to be gained from the soon-to-be-established National Arts Council (NAC) at the time. As explained by the White Paper, the NAC was to be established as a statutory body following the principles of access, redress and participation (White Paper, 1996: Chapter 4). Although the NAC was established in 1997, the White Paper gave the deadline for restructuring the PACs as the year 2000 and instructed that all the proposals related to the PACs must be implemented by then. The reasons for restructuring the PACs were understandable. As Pyper (2008) argued, the PACs had commitments that aimed to bring primarily high European opera, ballet, orchestral and drama repertoires to white audiences, including the middle, working and rural classes (Pyper, 2008). In personal communication with Andries Oliphant[54], he observed that these PACs were not only racially exclusive, but they also housed segregated permanent, over-paid, and sometimes mediocre companies (Oliphant, 2017).

One of the Johannesburg-based newspapers, the Mail and Guardian, published an article titled New Era for the Arts authored by Katy Bauer (1996), which commented on the new funding model. Bauer (1996) described the model as

> …a *Lamborghini of democracy compared to the old banger of inefficient, elitist, non-diverse, Eurocentric funding of the past*...*No more will the four performing Arts Councils hog all the cash to stage countless productions of Swan Lake. In fact, the Bill intends to lay*

[54] Prof Andries Oliphant was interviewed in Rosebank in 2017.

down such parameters to ensure nobody hogs anything at all. Hail equity! Perhaps![55]

The article indicated that the PAC's budgets were to be cut by R10, R20 and R30 million, respectively, over the next three years (1997–2000) and quoted the deputy minister of DACST at the time, Bridget Mabandla. She assured the sector that her department did desire to starve the PACs to death and that they would not be dismantled, but their productions would have to be competitive, like the rest. The deputy minister was quoting the objectives of the White Paper (1996), reiterating that the national government would only be responsible for the administration costs of the PACs. Some of the concerns raised in the Mail and Guardian article were that funds allocated to the NAC appeared very limited and suggested that this could lead to a myriad of shabby productions or works because substantial projects would be unaffordable. Mabandla's response to this concern was that artists would gain credibility through the NAC, which would stand them in good stead to be more effective in seeking further funding from the private sector.

5.4. The Demise of the National Symphony Orchestra at the SABC

Beyond the PACs, restructuring was also felt at the SABC, where the broadcaster's relationship with what was by then called the National Symphony Orchestra (NSO) was terminated in December 1997 (McGreal, 2000). In his work titled *Politics and the Arts: Orchestras in Post-Apartheid South Africa 1994 -2022*, Bokaba (2023) explained that the NSO management tried to keep it going for three more years with the support of subscribers, ticket sales and donations. However, by 2000, it required R10 million to keep going, and the required funding could not be raised (Beresford, 2000). When Minister Ben Ngubane was approached to consider funds for the NSO in his budget, he responded that government "cannot just pull R10 million out of the hat"[56]. The NSO eventually closed in 2000, leaving Africa's economic hub without a permanent orchestra for the first time in over

[55] Article by Katy Bauer titled New Era Dawns for the Arts was published on 1 November 1996, and can be accessed online at https://mg.co.za/article/1996-11-01-new-era-dawns-for-the-arts/.
[56] The Guardian 28 January 2000, titled Orchestra's Demise Strikes Sour Note in New South Africa, accessed online at https://amp.theguardian.com/world/2000/jan/29/chrismcgreal

70 years. According to an article published in the New York Times at the time,[57] the 76-year-old NSO was still searching for money and its place in the national landscape when funds ran out. The orchestra had two black musicians at the time of its closure - trombonist Alex Hitzeroth and cellist Kutlwano Masote. Musicians in the NSO appeared to accept their situation. They admitted to the British daily newspaper, *The Guardian* (*The Guardian*, 29 January 2000), that the NSO failed to adapt rapidly enough to the changing political realities of South Africa by not recruiting more black players and developing a higher profile in townships. These developments were, of course, taking place when a whole cohort of black musicians associated with the National Chamber Orchestra were losing their jobs in former Bophuthatswana.

5.5. The Rise of KwaZulu-Natal

Oliphant (2017) attempted to articulate some of the transitional challenges at the PACs. Only two PACs responded positively, as they did not see the new policy as punishing, and those were Artscape in Cape Town and the Playhouse in Durban. In Oliphant's view, the leadership of the other two PACs in Pretoria and Bloemfontein let them down, as they lacked the requisite skills for a successful transition. In 2003, Linda Bukhosini was appointed artistic director of the Playhouse in Durban, the first black woman to occupy such a position.

By 2005 she held both chief executive officer and artistic director positions. While there was nothing untoward with the appointment itself, Bukhosini had been in this position (at the time of writing) for over 20 years. This is an anomaly in government as chief executives of entities are only supposed to serve for five years, which can be renewed for another five years. The minister appoints councils of the PACs (playhouses), and the councils appoint the CEOs in consultation with the minister. The minister at that time was Ben Ngubane. Ngubane made several questionable decisions, including establishing a controversial trend where he began to 'ring-fence' funding for certain orchestras during his tenure. The latter became government policy, which led to an approach that shifted every time a new

[57] Article by Henri E. Cauvin, published February 1, 2000 An Orchestra Falls Silent as South Africa Struggles on https://www.nytimes.com/2000/02/01/arts/arts-abroad-an-orchestra-falls-silent-as-south-africa-struggles-on.html.

arrangement was made – driven by patronage (Bokaba, 2023). This funding approach contradicted the explicit aim of the so-called arm's length principle, determining that political decision-makers were not supposed to allocate arts funding – that was the rationale on which the National Arts Council (NAC) was founded. Minister Ngubane worked around the NAC.

How exactly did Ngubane become Minister of Arts and Culture when the ANC was the governing party? Minister Ngubane belonged to the Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP). Between 1985 and 1994, there were regular conflicts between IFP and ANC supporters. From July to September 1990, the bloodiest clashes in modern South African history occurred when the IFP launched raids in the Transvaal townships, where an estimated 800 people were reported slain. The tensions continued until 1994[58]. In its efforts to ease the political tensions between itself and the IFP, the ANC made some political compromises. Among these, the ANC allocated three cabinet positions during the first and the second democratic administrations to the IFP (with the first administration being a government of national unity to try to bring together historically warring parties to govern together). These included the cabinet post for the Arts, Culture, Science and Technology Ministry, initially held by Ben Ngubane and then filled by Minister Lionel Mtshali before Ngubane returned[59]. The two political parties also governed the KwaZulu-Natal (KZN) province together. This arrangement seems to have benefitted the KZN province as a whole and specifically helped to facilitate funding the KZN Philharmonic under the leadership of Bongani Tembe, who is married to Bukhosini. The KZN Philharmonic was not only among the first orchestras to be supported by the DACST but the most consistently funded in the post-apartheid era to the present day – under the leadership of Bongani Tembe. Minister Ngubane had a clear message for other provinces - orchestras had to undergo far-reaching transformation, which he said they had not done by and large (Cauvin, 2000, quoted in Bokaba, 2023).

It was unclear what kind of transformation the minister referred to but in terms of South African orchestras, transformation related to the number of permanent black players in the orchestras, artistic programming, and the composition of management. As I have written

[58] Article titled ANC – Inkatha Violence in South Africa 1990 – 1994, available at Armed Conflict Events Data accessible online at https://www.onwar.com/aced/nation/sat/southafrica1990.htm.
[59] *Mail & Guardian* article published on 2 February 2004: ANC IFP Tension did not affect Ngubane Move.

(2023), the KZN Philharmonic orchestra was arguably in a far worse situation regarding transformation than the other ensembles that fell silent[60]. This was because both the NCO and the NSO had permanent black musicians in their ranks, while KZN did not have a single permanent black musician at that time. There was thus an evident lack of consistency in the application of policy, and the minister appeared to be improvising. The tenure of both ministers, Lionel Mtshali and Ben Ngubane, as it will be shown, had a significant impact on the funding landscape and entrenched some practices that ignored the arm's length funding principles outlined in the White Paper of 1996. The concept of an arm's length approach is an explicit policy that UNESCO described as a principle applied to ensure freedom of expression in arts and culture and grants artists opportunities with no political strings attached[61]. This European principle of arm's-length funding is what cultural activists in South Africa, including Andries Oliphant, learnt from the experiences of many other postcolonial African regimes which appropriated culture as a tool for propaganda rather than enabling vibrant, independent arts sectors. This is what led to establishing independent funding agencies to support the work of the department, including the National Arts Council (NAC), the National Film and Video Foundation (NFVF) and the National Heritage Council (NHC). Minister Ngubane was introducing 'discretionary' funding approaches, which seemed to include or exclude at the whim of the political principals in office (Bokaba, 2023).

Sydney Selepe[62], who joined the DACST in 2001 and worked his way up to the Deputy Director-General position by the time he left government, explained that the government's strategy in terms of orchestras was to select regional orchestras based in a metropolitan city and that local and provincial governments could be lobbied for additional support. This appears to be a fair principle. Around the world, orchestras have often been municipally funded, which is the level at which the most participation and impact are focused. The history discussed in previous chapters suggests that, even under late colonialism and early apartheid, the Johannesburg City Council employed several black pioneers of the 1950s and 1960s. The missing link in terms of policy post-1994 seems to be how inconsistently cities, including the large metros, have budgeted for culture in general and orchestras specifically.

[60] The author played as an extra at some of the concerts at the KZNPO after the demise of the NCO.
[61] Accessed online at http://en.unesco.or/creativity/policy-monitoring-platform/independence-arms-length (quoted in Bokaba, 2023).
[62] Sydney Selepe is quoted in Politics and the Arts: Orchestras in Post-Apartheid 1994 -2022 South Africa by Bokaba (2023).

According to Selepe, the national government's involvement was a temporary arrangement where national authorities would eventually leave the responsibility of funding orchestras to the province and the city in the long term. In his view, the KZN and Cape Philharmonic were preferred for national funding, as they already had political backing from their provinces and cities (Bokaba, 2023). The ANC led both these provinces and the City of Johannesburg at the time, but they were seemingly not aligned with the national government on this issue. According to Selepe, the challenge with the province of Gauteng was that there were several orchestras, including the Chamber Orchestra of South Africa, the Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra, and the Johannesburg Festival Orchestra. These were all newly established orchestras formed by musicians from the demise of the Pretoria, Johannesburg and North West orchestras. None of these orchestras had the necessary backing of their cities or provinces, nor were they prepared to merge (Bokaba, 2023). So, it appears as if there is some responsibility to be laid at the door of a fragmented local orchestral sector, together with the vested interests of orchestral entrepreneurs who could not work together.

As I have recounted (2023), the appointment of Ben Ngubane as Ambassador to Japan in 2004 triggered a few changes in the department. In 2006, the DACST, now known as the Department of Arts and Culture (DAC), decided to transfer the administration orchestra funding from the department to the NAC**.** This was motivated by many factors. First, the White Paper (1996) required the DAC to establish funding agencies and build capacity and competency in those agencies to distribute funds to arts organisations, including orchestras. Second, the DAC could no longer cope with the amount of funding requests they were receiving from various arts organisations. Another challenge for the DAC was that these orchestras were not declared cultural institutions according to the Cultural Institutions Act (No. 119 of 1998). This made it difficult for departmental officials to continue directly with discretionary funding approaches for orchestras. The Cultural Institutions Act provides subsidies to certain officially declared cultural institutions and for establishing certain cultural institutions under the control of councils. The orchestras were allocated funding annually in the form of memoranda of agreements in which they submitted their business plans to the NAC. These documents were followed up with reports in the form of annual reports and audited financial statements. The KZNPO and the CPO were exempted from

following funding processes, as Minister Ngubane had introduced the ring-fencing approach that continues to the present day. Also, no particular funding conditions were attached to the allocations, except that the orchestras had to do report-backs based on their business plans. The NAC became a conduit by which funds could be transferred to the orchestras, and there was no official policy stance for funding these two orchestras.

The significant issue regarding transferring funds to the orchestras from the NAC was that these funds had been ring-fenced[63] and could, therefore, not be used for purposes other than as prescribed by the DAC. In this regard, as a conduit for transferring the funds to the orchestras, the NAC's responsibility was only to monitor compliance in line with the submission of business plans, compliance documents and reports.

The consequence of this approach was that many arts companies representing various art genres also argued for the same kind of arrangement since the NAC was not allocating enough funding to companies to enable them to present sustainable programmes[64]. However, this did not stop the DAC from supporting a newly established orchestra, the Cape Town Jazz Orchestra, under the leadership of Abdullah Ibrahim. The new orchestra was added to the list of the two existing state-funded orchestras and allocated similar amounts to those of the KZN and Cape Town orchestras[65]. The pattern that seemed to emerge here is a series of *ad hoc* arrangements that circumvented, if not contradicted, the mandates of the institutions that post-apartheid policy had set up. On 28 February 2023, the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture (DSAC) and the NAC made presentations to the Portfolio Committee on Sport, Arts and Culture in Parliament to justify the ring-fenced funding approaches. The DSAC explained that funding for orchestras was documented in the 2003 Estimates of National Expenditure (ENE) published by the National Treasury and approved by Parliament, with three orchestras being funded. The DSAC explained that, during the time of Minister Pallo Jordan in the 2006/07 ENE, responsibility for funding the three orchestras was shifted to the NAC. This funding, the DSAC continued, was ring-fenced and stipulated as such

[63] NAC Annual Reports 2007 – 2020 which can be accessed at https://nac.org.za (quoted in Bokaba, 2023).
[64] The author represented one of the organisations, the JPO, that initiated a campaign to receive the same levels of funding.
[65] The Cape Town Jazz Orchestra received R3 771 000 per annum over ten years (please refer elsewhere in the text to tables supplied for amounts, sourced from the National Arts Council Website).

annually in the grant allocation letter[66]. The discussion at the presentation demonstrated that the ring-fencing remains in place. However, the committee has recommended that the grant allocated to the MNPO be referred to the relevant authorities for investigation.

5.6. Efforts to establish a permanent orchestra for Gauteng

At the time, the author had learnt that the amounts allocated to the Cape Town Jazz Orchestra were the identical amounts budgeted for Gauteng.

It must be noted that Johannesburg and the broader province of Gauteng were at this stage without a permanent orchestra for the first time in over 70 years, as already stated. In the author's capacity as Founder and Chairperson of the Association of Professional Orchestras of South Africa, a request was made in 2006 to address the Portfolio Committee on Sport, Arts and Culture in Parliament to make a case for Gauteng, and specifically for the Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra (JPO). The author was allowed to make this presentation on 30 May 2006. By then, he had joined the JPO in 2000 as a violinist. The JPO was a player-owned ensemble and needed the funding to keep its musicians employed. The musicians were freelance, and the author's mission was to fight for a permanent orchestra for the City of Johannesburg and Gauteng. The request to address the Portfolio Committee on the possible funding for a Gauteng-based orchestra was granted. Part of his appeal read as follows:

[66] DSAC presentation to the Portfolio Committee can be accessed online at https://pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/36416/

> *Your department currently funds two orchestras, the KZN Philharmonic and the Cape Philharmonic, to the extent of R3 77 million each. Our understanding is that in the last budget allocation, a similar amount was allocated to Gauteng but later diverted to Abdullah Ibrahim's jazz project. Let me say at once that I, like many South Africans, am a great admirer of Abdullah and his work, and I am grateful that the department is supporting his project, but I would prefer it if it were not at our expense*[67].

The funding request for the JPO was supported by all political parties on the Portfolio Committee and the Minister of Arts and Culture, Pallo Jordan, whom the author met in the same week in his Cape Town office. As it was too late to be considered for funding in the 2006/07 financial year, the funds only started flowing in the following financial year - 2007/08. Funding for the Cape Town Jazz Orchestra remained, and thus the department became responsible for supporting four orchestras for the next few years. However, the JPO funding was not done through the usual NAC channel as was the case with the other three orchestras; it was processed directly by the DAC for reasons not disclosed. This funding arrangement was followed despite the post-1994 policies requiring disbursement by the organisations set up for this purpose. This posed a considerable risk given that, with each incoming minister, there was often an accompanying new Director-General and funding arrangements were subject to change.

On its establishment, the Cape Town Jazz Orchestra chose to work on a project-based approach, not a permanent basis, as was the case with the other three orchestras. This undermined the argument for funding to create sustainable employment for the orchestral community. The Cape Town Jazz Orchestra also relied on foreign musicians who usually travelled for specific concerts. However, the jazz orchestra had committed to establishing a development band called the Nu-Notes and conducted regular workshops in various townships in Cape Town.

---

[67] Full speech can be accessed at Parliamentary Monitoring Group at https://pmg.org.za/docs/2006/060530aposa.pdf.

By this time, the author was the Managing Director of the JPO, a position he held from September 2006 until 2013. In addition to the funds secured from the DAC, there was support for the JPO from the lottery and several private sector companies. The JPO became a permanent orchestra in 2007, which can be attributed to funding from the national department and the lottery. It was then able to offer its musicians annual contracts. Funding from the city and province could not be unlocked. The commitment of permanent musicians allowed the JPO to start to work on its sound, which was difficult when the orchestra relied on freelance musicians who were not obligated to play in every concert. These efforts did not go unnoticed, as a Johannesburg-based newspaper, The Star, published regular critical reviews of the concerts. Some of the headlines included A Swelling Vision, A Swelling Sound (1 Feb 2011), JPO Offers Something New for the Ears (4 Nov 2011) and A Rare Kind of Perfect Mix and Excellent Choices at all Levels (19 July 2011). Each concert was recorded live for broadcasting on Classic FM, a private, commercial, regional radio station broadcasting in Gauteng until 2021 when it closed down.

Outside the symphony seasons, the orchestra featured in global events, including providing recorded music for the opening and closing ceremonies of the FIFA Confederations Cup in 2009 and playing the same role the following year - this time for the FIFA World Cup.

One of the successes during this time was the establishment of the JPO Academy, which focused on training talented black African musicians, funded by the DAC. This four-year intensive training orchestral programme was offered in partnership with the then Division of Music at Wits University, with instrumental training provided by the musicians. There were 32 learners in the first year of the programme, some of whom are pictured in Figure 5.2. The JPO thought by being directly involved in the education of these young musicians, they would be better prepared for auditions for any professional orchestra and thus have an advantage over other students who came straight from university without the opportunity to have played alongside professional musicians.

Figure 5.2. The JPO Academy Orchestra performing at the Linder Auditorium, Johannesburg. Credit: Picture supplied by S Bokaba.

Despite all its efforts in a short time, the JPO's funding was discontinued in 2011 when the new minister, Paul Mashatile, was appointed. The department reneged on its promise, despite a written assurance by the Director-General (DG), Mr Sibusiso Xaba, promising funding for the orchestra for the 2012 financial year. The promise never materialised, and the orchestra was encouraged to source financing elsewhere. According to the DG, the government was planning to stop supporting orchestras at a national level. This decision did not seem to apply to other DAC-supported orchestras. The JPO's increased dependency on public funding plunged it into a financial crisis, and it was placed in business rescue late in 2012. The business rescue process was finally completed in March 2013 on the condition that the orchestra returned to its original freelance approach and status. The author tendered his resignation on completion of the process. The position of CEO of the JPO eventually went to Bongani Tembe. A collaborative management arrangement between the JPO and the KZNPO was introduced as Tembe held a similar position in the KZNPO. Tembe managed to again attract funding from the national government for the JPO from funding ring-fenced by the department without following any funding policies.

5.7. Orchestral manoeuvres in the national government policy

At their presentation to the Portfolio Committee meeting on 28 February 2017[68], the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture (DSAC), formerly DAC, suggested that the arm's length approach was not working and called for revising the 1996 White Paper for guidance. In DSACs view, the current funding model was a stumbling block to creating transparent, consistent, and accountable processes. DSAC stated that it derived its mandate from the Cultural Promotions Act of 1998. However, the DSAC was concerned that this ACT was wide-ranging and lacked a clear framework aligned to policy, leaving room for different interpretations and some discretion, as demonstrated by funding orchestras. The department called for a review of the White Paper (1996) to provide a framework for going forward to help to instil proper systems and processes for better articulation and sustainability between all spheres of government. The revised White Paper (2020), no doubt, provides some clarity because it called for establishing national theatre, dance and

[68] Source: Parliamentary Monitoring Group https://pmg.org.za/committee-meetings.

orchestral companies and that each company should be cross-subsidised by national, provincial and metro funding while upholding the arm's length principle (RWP Chapter 4: 18).

Table 1 shows transfers made to South Africa's orchestras from 2007. This funding appears under headings such as 'DAC ring-fenced funding for orchestras', 'minister's ring-fenced funding' or simply 'Orchestral funding'. The table shows how the allocation to the KZN orchestra increased drastically, compared to other orchestras funded by the department, with the appointment of the then-new minister, Nathi Mthethwa (from the same province), in 2014. Another important point is the allocation of R3 million taken away from the Cape Town Jazz Orchestra and redirected to the Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra in the 2019/20 financial year.

Table 1[69]. NAC Orchestral Funding 2007–2020

FINANCIAL YEAR	NAME OF ORCHESTRA	AMOUNT FUNDED (Rand)
2007/08	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	3 977 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	3 371 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	3 371 000.00
2008/09	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	4 472 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	4 472 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	4 472 000.00
2009/10	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	4 740 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	4 740 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	4 740 000.00
2010/11	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	5 025 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	5 025 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	5 025 000.00
2011/12	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	5 025 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	5 025 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	5 025 000.00
2012/13	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	5 326 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	5 326 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	5 326 000.00
	Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	0.00
2013/14	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	8 788 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	5 984 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	3 354 000.00
	Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	0.00
2014/15	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	9 271 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	6 313 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	3 354 000.00
	Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	0.00
2015/16	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	9 772 000.00

[69] The NAC's annual reports and other financial information can be accessed at http://nac.org.za/publications/annual-reports/. Before 2007, the department of Arts and Culture used to make direct transfers to orchestras and thus there is no comparable data in the period leading to this time. Secondly, the JPO's funding between 2007 -2011 was made directly by the department and it therefore does not appear in NAC's reports.

	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	6 660 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	3 535 000.00
	Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	0.00
2016/2017	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	10 300 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	7 020 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	3 726 000.00
	Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	0.00
2017/2018	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	10 815 000.00
	Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	7 371 000.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	3 912 00.00
	Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	0.00
2018/2019	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	6 180 000.00
	Cape Town Philharmonic Orchestra	4 422 600.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	2 347 200.00
	Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	3 000 000.00
2019/2020	KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	4 120 000.00
	Cape Town Philharmonic Orchestra	2 948 400.00
	Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	0.00
	Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	3 000 000.00

5.8. Mzansi National Philharmonic Orchestra

I have written about the period following the appointment of Minister Emmanuel Nkosinathi (Nathi) Mthethwa in 2014 and how the allocation seemed to favour the KZN Philharmonic Orchestra. Significantly, it fell to Minister Mthethwa to implement the revised White Paper (RWP) objectives. The RWP recommended that the national government establish a national orchestra and that regional orchestras should be the responsibility of provincial and local governments. To this end, the DAC, now known as the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture (DSAC), issued an instruction to the NAC, informing them about the amendments to the allocations for the 2018/2019 and 2019/2020 financial years. The instruction stipulated new funding arrangements that reduced allocations on a sliding scale over time. In 2018/2019, allocations were reduced to 60% of the expected funding and 40% in 2019/2020, except for the Cape Town Jazz Orchestra, which was reduced to 60% in 2018 and 2019. Funding of the Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra was based on the requests

made by its new CEO, Mr Bongani Tembe, also the CEO of the KZNPO. The table below shows the specific reductions**.**

Table 2[70] shows the amounts each orchestra received; it is also testimony that the KZN Philharmonic received higher amounts than the other orchestras and that Johannesburg was not receiving state funding until Tembe became its CEO.

Name of Orchestra	2017/2018	2018/2019 (60%)	2019/2020 (40%)
KZN Philharmonic Orchestra	R10 300.000	R6 180 000	R4 120 000
Cape Philharmonic Orchestra	R7 371 000	R4 422 600.00	R2 948 400
Cape Town Jazz Orchestra	R3 912 000	R2 347 200	R0
Johannesburg Philharmonic Orchestra	No funding received	R3 000 000	R3 000 000
TOTAL	**R21 583 000**	**R15 949 800**	**R10 068 400**

As the orchestral sector was preparing for the cuts shown in Table 2, a new announcement was made. As mentioned in the introduction, in his budget speech delivered on 20 February 2019, the then Minister of Finance, Tito Titus Mboweni, made the following statement:

> *Finally, the global renown of South Africa's art and culture is an expression of our soft power and heritage. Our public finance choices should reflect an intention to preserve and add to our cultural canon. Officials from the National Treasury and the Department of Arts and Culture will consider proposals for the development of a new national theatre, a new museum and also consider financial support for the national archives, a national orchestra and a ballet troupe.*

This announcement seems to have come out of nowhere and took the arts sector by surprise. The announcement was greeted with mixed reactions, with one of the headlines screaming, One Settler, One Ballet? published by cultural activist Mike van Graan (2019) on

[70] Accessed at http://nac.org.za/publications/annual -reports.

his personal website soon after the announcement[71]. In this article, van Graan argued there was no need for a new national theatre, which he predicted would be yet another vanity project. According to van Graan, the project would be built at tremendous expense to serve the elite when the real need for cultural infrastructure was for dysfunctional arts centres spread across the country to deliver on the ANC's Freedom Charter. The Freedom Charter promised that "The doors of learning and culture shall be open", a promise carried into the White Paper (1996) and the Revised White Paper (2020) and premised in Article 27 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which states that "everyone shall have the right to freely participate in the cultural life of the community and to enjoy the arts".

When the (now former) Minister of Finance made the public pronouncements on a new orchestra in 2019, it was on the back of the work that I began in September 2018, when I was approached by the DSAC and informed that the State intended to establish a national orchestra. Incidentally, I registered the name National Philharmonic Orchestra of South Africa in 2012. However, I was prepared to give the name away to assist the DSAC in creating a national orchestra. My role was to help with the research and propose a budget required for such a project. The recommended budget was then sent to the National Treasury for consideration. The department furthermore requested name proposals for the task team to be put together to work on the business plan for the proposed orchestra. A four-member task team was duly established soon after the Finance Minister's speech, and initial meetings were convened. At the insistence of the department, Bongani Tembe was added as the fifth member of the team, and soon after, Minister Nathi Mthethwa appointed him as its convener. It soon became clear that the project was planned around Tembe[72], and when the members of the task team raised their objections, the DSAC dissolved it, and funds were allocated and transferred to the new entity in 2021. The new entity then became known as the Mzansi National Philharmonic Orchestra.

These funds were transferred through the usual orchestral conduit, namely the NAC. In their presentation to the Portfolio Committee on Sports Arts and Culture on 28 February 2023, the NAC explained that the process of orchestra funding was not the same as required for

[71] The article One Settler One Ballet is published at https://mikevangraan.co.za/articles/by-mike-van-graan/one-settler-one-ballet.

[72] The author was part of the task team that met regularly until it was dissolved by Minister Nathi Mthethwa.

'normal' funding calls, as these were classified under ring-fenced funds. It is important to underscore, the NAC continued, that it has implemented ring-fenced orchestral funding for more than 15 years. The only difference in the previous two years (2021 and 2022), according to the NAC, was that, besides the DSAC instructing the NAC to fund the three regional orchestras of Johannesburg, Durban and Cape Town, the DSAC further ordered that these funds should be transferred to the Mzansi National Philharmonic Orchestra. A point was also made that the NAC does not adjudicate this funding; it simply plays an administration and monitoring role[73]. The allocation for the national orchestra was R54 681 600.00, five times the total national allocation to orchestras for the 2019/2020 financial year. Bongani Tembe was made responsible for the new project, launched on 27 and 28 July 2022 at the Linder Auditorium in Johannesburg.

[73] NAC presentation on the 28 Feb 2023 to parliament can be accessed online at https://pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/36416

Chapter 6

6.1. Conclusion and recommendations

Although South Africa has only had an official cultural policy since 1994, there was explicit and implicit policy for around a century and a half before that designed to obstruct black advancement of any kind. During the 19th and early 20th centuries, British policies aimed at Africans explicitly and implicitly intended to change and erode African traditions and promote cultural assimilation among Africans in the Cape Colony. In Natal, the colonists knew they were vastly outnumbered by Africans, and this forced them to recognise African customary law and chiefs in the hope of protecting white civilisation from the Native and to protect the Native from white civilisation. In many ways, these policies did not recognise Africans as citizens. Despite this, music educators, choirs, festivals and music societies emerged across the country. As discussed, before the 1900s, mission-educated African intellectuals thought it was imperative to embrace modernity to overcome oppression. However, this view changed with Pixley ka Seme and others when these New Africans began to explore the possibility of creating a distinctly African modernity. Politically, this was given expression in the formation of the South African Native National Congress. Culturally, this intent was given expression by public performances (Transvaal Eisteddfod) and the creation of uniquely African works, such as Michael Moerane's Fatse la Heso (My Country). This was the same approach adopted by Mngoma a few decades later, who explained to Burger (1992) that the Ionians aimed to exert an influence on African choral singing in general, not only in terms of performing Western music so that it sounds Western but also in terms of performing African music in such a way to sound recognisably African. As discussed in earlier chapters, Mngoma always insisted on the study and performance of Western classical repertoires alongside African repertoires (by this, he did not only mean performing original African compositions, but he personally made instrumental arrangements from existing African repertoires as discussed).

In 1910, the Union government set out to intensify segregation through various pieces of legislation, including the Land Act (1913) and the Natives Urban Act (1923). However, these developments led to unrest and strikes. The growing tensions were seen as bad for the economy, which led white liberals to borrow an American idea and form interracial joint

councils in the 1920s. These joint councils aimed to promote and understand goodwill between races[74] amid growing resistance from blacks. The joint councils included liberals, philanthropic Europeans and Native Welfare Societies. Some of the opportunities created by these liberal institutions included establishing the BMSC (which hosted the Transvaal Eisteddfod before the Second World War), Dorkay House (later home to the Union of South African Artists), schools and churches (with examples including the historic St Mary's Anglican Church concert presented by Lucas Makhema's Jubilee Singers, accompanied by Trauneck's Johannesburg Symphony Orchestra in February 1953). This performance was significant because it was the first time a white orchestra accompanied a black choir in South Africa, despite the country being under apartheid.

The City of Johannesburg, through the non-European Affairs Department (NEAD), designed and supported cultural programmes and provided additional facilities (Polly Street Art Centre and the Jubilee Social Centre, among others). The NEAD was, therefore, a consequential policy for Johannesburg as it was not only instrumental to creating the JBMF, the Ionian Music Society and the Soweto Youth Orchestra, but it created brass bands across Johannesburg's black townships. The pioneers of the 1940s exploited these opportunities and took culture (in the form of public expression) to the spaces provided. In terms of education, they exceeded the official curriculum in whatever education system. For example, the educators from Orlando High School spearheaded the city's cultural programmes, including choral competitions, music literacy and tuition in instrumental music. These developments should not only be read as the internalisation of colonising ideology but as the reappropriation of these Western cultures as a site on which individual practitioners and communities were asserting a presence and perhaps even a kind of aesthetic and political equality. These practitioners used the city's resources as sites to push back, question, redefine and develop their own projects.

Mngoma's vision was to establish a township-based symphony orchestra, something he achieved by developing a model (of community-based music education projects that would culminate in orchestral ensembles) that could be adapted to suit the needs of other black townships, something that Masote did very well when he established the Soweto Youth

[74] Information contained as part of the records of the South African Institute of Race Relations (Part 1), Historical Papers Archive at Wits University (Box AD 843B),

Orchestra in 1965 and again in Bophuthatswana with the Mmabatho Youth Orchestra in 1984. Like Soweto, Bophuthatswana became a territory where community arts centres were a model where the arts were made accessible and brought to the doorstep of the community.

This funding by the City of Johannesburg and white philanthropists provides a strong indication that Johannesburg did have a cultural policy from 1921 to 2975, which enabled such practices. This policy continued until the West Rand Board replaced the NEAD in 1975. However, even then, some of the budget was still made available for orchestral music, enabling music educators such as Kolwane Mantu to form the African Youth Ensemble. Mantu became one of the most influential string teachers in Soweto, producing some of classical music's finest musicians, including violinists Melale Mantu, Patrick Motsa, Olga Maraba and cellist Daliwonga Tshangela, who are today playing in professional orchestras. Mantu was using the same model used by Mngoma and Masote. Bothuthatswana, on the other hand, used a combination of community arts centres and developing a professional arm for advanced musicians through cadet programmes. Some cadets came from Soweto, as the township had no opportunities to join a professional orchestra. The National Symphony Orchestra at the nearby SABC had still not made efforts to transform in preparation for a new South Africa and still had only white players in its ranks at that time.

It was acknowledged in the fourth chapter that, although the Bantustan system needs to be recognised as an extension of apartheid, Bophuthatswana did achieve something relatively unique that could have laid a foundation for post-apartheid policy. Bophuthatswana had an explicit policy to create community art centres, which served as access sites, especially for rural communities. The Bantustan did this through the Mmabana community arts and sports centres, which had satellites in Mahikeng, Thaba Nchu, Taung and Lehurutshe. This is where learners could learn to play a musical instrument, dance, do drama and gymnastics. Today, South Africa's national gymnastics team draws many international competitors from the North West province because of this legacy; however, a musical comparison cannot be made. Notably, the North West introduced a cadet programme for young orchestral musicians. By the mid-1990s, the programme had produced black professional orchestral musicians who became part of the National Chamber Orchestra.

There were continuous efforts by the National Chamber Orchestra to reflect local Tswana cultures – resulting in a collection of musical arrangements titled Songs of the Leopard. From the discussion, it is clear that these practices were overlooked in the implementation process of the 1996 White Paper.

The post-apartheid government has recognised the value of the arts and arts education in general. Thus the White Paper (1996) made provision for arts, culture and heritage education for learners as part of basic education and affirmed arts education as the responsibility of the Minister for Basic Education in partnership with the Ministry of Arts, Culture and Heritage. It noted that apartheid education was designed to deprive the majority of black learners of quality basic, secondary and tertiary education, including arts education. Thus, this policy sought to introduce arts education at all levels of education from when it was adopted in 1996. However, community-based music education programmes could not be integrated into the formal education system in post-apartheid South Africa. As a result, there were parallel initiatives, with many skilled educators preferring to work in independent schools and community projects. In contrast, public schools in the townships worked with generalists who taught a combination of art, music and choral practice.

Barker-Reinecke (2008) found that the offerings in the first decade of democracy in arts and culture were unacceptable for music education to flourish (she was referring to the public schooling environment). She found that there was a mismatch between the training of arts teachers and that government schools were not equipped to staff and run their arts departments. As Barker-Reinecke explained, this was not the case in independent schools, where a balance between 'hard subjects' like science and mathematics and 'soft subjects' like music, art and dance was known to exist, presupposing that independent schools recognised the cognitive merits of the arts (Barker Reinecke, 2008: 231).

Barker-Reinecke (2008) observed a general lack of engagement between music educators and education authorities. She quoted Parikratza (1989), who stated:

> *Arts education as a field has yet to develop a capacity for policy research, and that such research can make educators more aware of policies related to curriculum and evaluation, as well as additional*

> *factors such as leadership, funding, alternative delivery systems and change strategies* (Barker-Reinecke, 2008: 240).

Critically, teacher shortages were one of the critical issues, a problem that persists to this day. As a result, non-governmental institutions, such as the South African Music Education Trust (SAMET), have remained important in providing music education in the post-apartheid era as skilled music educators continue to work outside government schools. The RWP noted the lack of skilled teachers in the public schooling system. It stated that, if the RWP's objectives were to be effectively implemented, it would require appropriately trained teachers and adequately equipped and fully resourced facilities staffed with qualified educators in all forms of the creative and performing arts, culture and heritage, to be progressively extended to all basic educational institutions, entities and programmes in every community (RWP, Chapter 3: 11- 12).

In an attempt to address these challenges, the RWP proposed establishing a dedicated satellite system of national arts, culture and heritage schools in each of the nine provinces, designed to support provincial development and for the specific needs of the provincial population (RWP Chapter 3: 59-60). Some provinces have begun with this system of magnet schools where investment is made at a particular school, and learners from surrounding schools can attend at specified times. By adopting a satellite system, the RWP aims to grow future audiences and consumers, and the government will be contributing to addressing areas of scarce and critical skills lacking in the industry (RWP Chapter 7: 60).

At a professional level, the KZN Philharmonic Orchestra adopted its cadetship programme in the late 1990s. This programme was built on the back of some of the retrenched black professional players who could not be absorbed by orchestras in Gauteng in the early 2000s. In their latest annual report (included in the Mzansi National Philharmonic Report for 2022), the KZN Philharmonic describes progress on this programme and specifically names one of the double bass players as a case of success. According to the report (2022), this bass player was said to have been part of the KZN Cadet Programme in 2011; in 2022, she was part of the Advanced Cadet Programme. This indicates problems within a system that can keep a learner for over ten years without graduating to professional status. The programme is currently funded by the MNPO. Following what has just been described, it seems that an

alternative approach needs to be considered, where there is a clear orchestral playing syllabus geared to producing a professional musician within a given timeframe. This syllabus can be developed in consultation with universities and be accredited. Therefore, orchestral development programmes must be designed to target talented and advanced learners from the schooling system.

6.2. The Arm's Length funding principle and orchestral funding

In *Orchestral Manoeuvres in the New Cultural Dispensation* (2023), I explained that the express focus of the original White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage (1996) was on the transition to a post-apartheid cultural dispensation. This premised the arts on freedom of expression and emphasised that transformation was crucial and integral to the success of the democratic project. These values were derived from the Bill of Rights of the Constitution (1996), which gave everyone the right to freedom of expression, including freedom of artistic creativity (paragraph 16), and stated that everyone has the right to use the language and to participate in the cultural life of their choice (paragraph 30). The Bill of Rights aligned with the United Nation's Article 19 of the Universal Declaration on Human Rights, where Freedom of Expression is enshrined. Furthermore, UNESCO followed with the Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity (2001), which declared that all persons have the right to express themselves and create and disseminate their work in the language of their choice, particularly their mother tongue. The state's role was to establish the optimum conditions that value diversity, promote economic activity and ensure equitable development and preservation of the country's heritage and symbols.

A close connection was made to arts, culture and heritage resources and services and freedom and justice in the Bill of Rights (1996). Freedom of expression was thus emphasised as one of the key pillars for the arts in the new and democratic South Africa. The African National Congress's draft national cultural policy (1994)[75] provides some context to the above values. In their cultural policy (1994), the ANC explained that colonialism and apartheid had neglected, distorted, and suppressed the culture of most South Africans and

[75] ANC's Cultural Policy document can be accessed at https:///www.africa.upenn.edu/govern_political/ANC_cult.htm.

that freedom of expression was destroyed through systemic efforts to stifle creativity. Communities were denied resources and facilities to develop their own cultural expressions unless they coincided with the aims of the colonial masters. This led to the culture of the majority of South Africans becoming one of resistance to colonialism and apartheid, turning culture into a significant instrument in achieving political democracy.

In post-apartheid South Africa, the ANC was to make nation-building and development priorities and to re-channel the culture of resistance (preamble to the ANC draft national cultural policy, 1994) to promote and sustain a culture of democracy, development and human rights, based on the fulfilment of the entire range of socio-economic aspirations of South Africans. It has to be pointed out here that 'resistance culture' should not be understood to be aligned with the ANC only. There were a variety of cultures of resistance, contesting for recognition during the struggle. While the ANC document does not explicitly recognise the potential variety of cultures of resistance, it does acknowledge that it became the majority's culture. In terms of music, the ANC proposed a state that sought to promote the rich traditions and diversity of the country's music for it to be a national resource (ANC national cultural policy, 1994).

The Parliamentary Portfolio Committee meeting on Sport, Arts and Culture held on 28 February 2023 revealed how some of the objectives of the White Paper (1996) and the RWP were being ignored.

Parliament attempted to resolve the issues around policy, governance and funding for the Mzansi National Philharmonic Orchestra (MNPO). In her submission to the committee, the chairperson of the National Arts Council of South Africa (NAC) HRH, Princess Celenhle Dlamini, did not seem to understand the NAC's mandate and that the deputy chairperson, Bongani Tembe, could not be involved in meetings where he is also a beneficiary. In the same meeting, Minister Nathi Mthethwa claimed there was no conflict of interest in this situation. Regarding the White Paper (1996), the RWP and the NAC Act (1997), the relationship between the government and recipients of grants must be at arm's length unless the recipient of funding is a state entity.

The MNPO is a private company established as a non-profit organisation. Chartrand and McCaughey (1989) described the arm's length approach as a critical part of the Patron Model, where the patron state supports the arts by arm's length arts councils, and the state determines how much aggregate support to provide, but not which organisations or artists should be supported. The Chair of the NAC argued in her submission[76] that the process that led to the funding of the MNPO was not the same as required for normal funding calls and that some regional orchestras were being supported by ring-fenced funding, which the NAC has been implementing for more than 15 years. Again, the NAC chairperson could not provide the legal basis for her position. Indeed, as discussed in the previous chapter, for the past 15 years, the government has been funding orchestras using ring-fenced budgets, which is against the policies and legislation. The Minister of Sport, Arts and Culture is empowered to declare the MNPO as a state institution through the Cultural Institutions Act (1998), which among others, will allow the MNPO to be declared a cultural institution of the state and allow for paying subsidies to it (Section 3.1 of the Act). The objectives of the White Paper or the RWP alone are insufficient legal grounds to justify the annual subsidies to private institutions.

The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) explains that the arm's length principle can only realistically succeed in a democratic society. It may well be considered one of the building blocks in the general system of separation of powers and checks and balances fundamental to a pluralistic democracy (citing Mucica, 2004 in Madden, 2009). UNESCO further states that "…arts councils should exist and operate with relative autonomy from central government and political influence" (UNESCO, 1998:88). Genevieve Brown (2016) adds that, under the arm's length principle, governments provide funding support to the arts but do not determine which arts organisations will receive support (1987 citing Madden, 2009). According to Brown (2016), the people involved with Arts Councils should usually be those involved professionally in the creative industries, which is intended to ensure freedom of artistic expression.

As I have explained (2023), the arm's length principle is not without its challenges. Chartrand and McCaughey (1989) cautioned that fostering artistic excellence is often seen

[76] Presentation of the National Arts Council can be accessed online at https://static.pmg.org.za/230228_NAC_letter_to_the_chair_of_portfolio_committee.pdf.

as promoting elitism, with both the type of art produced and the kind of audience served. This point is particularly relevant for South Africa, where culture was to play an integral part in development and contributing to nation-building efforts. There are three additional alternative funding models presented by Chartrand and McCaughey (1989). These alternative models include the Facilitator, where the state supports the arts by making donations to arts organisations tax deductible. This policy objective tends to promote diversity of activity in the non-profit sectors of the arts. The other approach is the Architect model, where state support is made through the ministry or the Department of Culture. In this model, all decisions concerning artists and arts organisations are generally made by bureaucrats. In this case, the policy objective is that the arts are supported as part of the government's social welfare programme. Finally, there is the Engineer model, where the state owns all the means of artistic production and only supports arts that meet political standards of excellence (Chartrand & McCaughey, 1989: 2-3). Minister Mthethwa and his predecessors appear to have moved closer to the Architect Model, as all decisions in the funding of the MNPO were made by the minister and his officials without following processes.

Another concerning matter presented to the Parliament Portfolio Committee was the MNPO's announcement that it had been responsible for grant funding of other orchestra organisations in 2022. To this end, it has distributed R20 million (please see Table 6.1). So in effect, the MNPO has become a parallel conduit to the NAC and a funder in its own right.

The objectives of the White Paper (1996) and the RWP were to establish a democratic and participatory dispensation for the sector in a policy framework that clearly delineated publicly transparent and accountable roles for the state, private sector, art practitioners, civil society, and the international community. Consequently, the following institutional framework was enacted for funding agencies (RWP Chapter 3: 11):

- A National Arts Council
- A National Film and Video Foundation
- A Heritage Council

The success of South Africa's transition was therefore seen as intertwined with the successful implementation of the arm's length principle, where artists could, if they so wished, be free to criticise the 'establishment' without risking future funding.

By making the MNPO (a private entity) a conduit and a parallel institution to the NAC, government not only threatens the objective of nation-building and social cohesion but there is a lack of transparency as the MNPO has been reluctant to release financial statements, claiming they are a private entity and only accountable to the NAC (the NAC had claimed that they were being used as a conduit). The selection of beneficiaries appears random, with organisations such as the Ionian Music Society placed in the lowest tier and allocated R100 000. In contrast, Bongani Tembe's other two organisations were given R3.2 million each – the highest amount allocated to any organisation.

Table 3: Breakdown of the grant funding programme by Mzansi National Philharmonic Orchestra

Tier 1	
Cape Philharmonic Orchestra (offer declined)	R3 200 000
Kwa-Zulu Natal Philharmonic	R3 200 000
Johannesburg Philharmonic	R3 200 000
Tier 2	
Free State Symphony	R500 000
Eastern Cape Philharmonic	R500 000
Tier 3	
Gauteng Philharmonic	R350 000
Community Philharmonic, WC	R350 000
Phoenix, Richard Cock Music Enterprises	R350 000
Tier 4	
Bloemfontein Music Initiative	R250 000
Cape Town Music Baroque	R250 000
Durban City Orchestra	R250 000
Morrison Isaacson Centre of Music	R250 000
Mpumalanga Chamber Orchestra	R250 000
Northern Cape Symphony	R250 000
Tier 5.1 (Youth Orchestra)	
KZN Youth Band	R200 000
North West Youth Orchestra	R200 000
Eastern Cape Youth Orchestra	R200 000
Windworx Symphony	R200 000
Tier 5.2 Community projects	
Twenty community projects, including the Ionian Music Society, were placed in tier 5 and allocated R150 000.	

6.3. What is the current status of the 'Arm's Length' Principle?

Many governments are beginning to question the efficiency of the arm's length principle, including the United Kingdom (UK), where the government has stated its intent to review this approach and assess whether arts councils should be abolished or retained.[77] The government is exploring new ways to deliver more efficiently on its objectives. At home, South Africa has repeatedly proven to have a problem with the arm's length principle. This may be an opportunity to review this principle. The emphasis in the UK appears to be on reducing the cost of administering these institutions rather than on changing the nature of the relationship in how government interacts with the sector. For example, the UK proposes to merge bodies with a similar mandate, reducing the cost of delivering that service. South Africa proposed a similar measure in the RWP, where the NAC could be merged with the National Film and Video Foundation (NFVF). However, in light of the experiences described above, South Africa's scope should go further and explore alternative funding models.

South Africa's adoption of the Architect model indicates that the country is battling with the separation of powers, with the role of the NAC being undermined by politicians. State funding agencies such as the NAC are necessary and fundamental to a pluralistic democracy but must be resourced adequately to meet the country's policy objectives.

[77] Article by Gareth Harris titled Public body Arts Council England at Risk under new UK Government Review, published in The Art Newspaper on 18 May 2022, www.theartnewspaper.com.

From the history recounted above, there is an extraordinary legacy in practice, pedagogy and activism that emerged in the country through initiatives discussed. It is recommended that with these legacies of the pioneers, which are in practice, pedagogy and activism – it would be beneficial not to import models from overseas, but to learn from the pioneers. South Africa is currently in an explicitly democratic era with an explicit cultural policy at national, provincial and municipal level. The Johannesburg Council funded and supported the work of the pioneers that has been described above. What can we learn from this, for contemporary and future policy? For one, it is to acknowledge that history and precedence set by municipal commitment to culture, which has enabled culture, art and music in particular to thrive. There should be a discussion about pedagogy and how it links to history and practice. Critically important, place the cultural practitioners in an enabling space, rather than to distribute funding through patronage structures. In conclusion, we have learned that the history discussed above is consequential and it could be used to inspire and to inform future policymaking.

Annexure A: Some of the Musical Milestones Covered in the Thesis

Date/Era	Milestones
1941	Michael Moerane became the first black South African to obtain a Bachelor of Music degree. He submitted an 11-minute tone poem, Fatse la Heso (My Country), based on thematic material derived from traditional Sotho songs. Sixty years after it was written, it remained the only symphonic composition written by a black South African and was still part of the BBC's classical repertoire (Gevisser, 2007: 79).
1947	Jubilee Social Centre in Johannesburg was established. The centre became home to many black cultural organisations.
1947	Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival was launched, based at the Jubilee Social Centre.
1950	Yehudi Menuhin performed in Sophiatown (nine-year-old Michael Masote was in the audience).
Early 1950s	Michael Moerane formed the African Springtime Orchestra.
1953	Trauneck and Lucas Makhema present South Africa's first classical concert featuring black and white participants, the Johannesburg Symphony Orchestra, which accompanied the Jubilee Singers. The performance occurred at St Mary's Cathedral in the centre of Johannesburg.
1959	Khabi Mngoma established Transvaal's first black orchestral ensemble (the Jubilee String Players, sometimes called the Ionian Orchestra). Ionian Male Choir is established.
1960	Ionian Ladies Choir is established.
1961	Ionian Mixed Choir is established.
	All Ionian Ensembles together become known as the Ionian Music Society.
	Ionian Junior Orchestra (Ionian Youth Orchestra) is established.
1965	Ionian Music Society moved out of Jubilee Social Centre to Dorkay House (No longer under the auspices of the city of Johannesburg).
1965	Michael Masote launched the Soweto Youth Orchestra (later renamed the Soweto Symphony Orchestra).
1975	Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival changed its name to the African

	Cultural Organisation of Southern Africa.
1978	Soweto String Quartet was formed.
1978	African Youth Ensemble under Kolwane Mantu (Soweto) was established.
1984	Mmabatho and Ga-Rankuwa Youth Orchestras were formed (Bophuthatswana).
Early 1990s	National Chamber Orchestra (under the auspices of Bophuthatswana Arts Council) was established.
1994	South African Music Education Trust was launched (with nationwide music education projects).

Bibliography

African National Congress. 1994. Draft National Cultural Policy. Accessible online at www.africa.upenn.edu/govern_political/ANC_cult.htm

African Union. (2015) *Agenda 2063: The African We Want*. [Online] Available from: https://au.int/en/agenda2063/overview.

African Union. (2006) *Charter for African Cultural Renaissance*. [Online] Available from: https://au.int/en/treaties/charter-african-cultural-renaissance. [Accessed 13 December 2016].

Akrofi, E. A. A.; Smit, M. and Thoresen, S. (eds). (2007) *Music and Identity: Transformation and Negotiation*, Stellenbosch: Sun Press.

Alverson, H. (1978) *Mind in the Heart of Darkness: Value and Self-Identity Among the Tswana of Southern Africa*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Appadurai, A. and Breckenridge, C. (1988) "Why Public Culture?" *Public Culture Bulletin*, 1(1). p. 5-9.

Barker Reinecke, M. L. 2008. Towards a Justification for a Philosophy of Music Education: A Quodlibet for South Africa. [Online] Available from: https://hdl.handle.net/10539/4908. .

Bantu Men's Social Centre (1923–1975). Collection of Official Documents and Records [A1058]. Historical Papers Research Archive, Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Bauer, K. 1996. *New Era for the Arts*. Article published on 1 November 1996 in South Africa's Mail & Guardian, accessible online at https://mg.co.za/artcle/1996-11-01-new-era-dawns-for-the-arts

Bauer, P. 2002. Bantu Education Act. Encyclopedia Britannica. [online] https://www.britannica.com/eventBantu-education-Act

Belfiore, E. 2009. *On the Bullshit in Cultural Policy Practice and Research: Notes from the British Case*. International Journal of Cultural Policy. 15(3), p. 343-359.

Beresford, B. 2000. Finale for Another Orchestra. Article published in the Guardian Newspaper on 3 March 2000 and can be accessed online at https://mg.co.za/article/2000-03-03-finale-for-another-orchestra

Bokaba, S. 2023. *Orchestral Manoeuvres in the New Cultural Dispensation*

Bokaba, S. 2006. *Presentation of Association of Professional Orchestras Of South Africa to the Portfolio Committee on Arts and Culture.* Presentation is accessible online at https://pmg.org.za/docs/2006/060530aposa.pdf

Bokaba, S. 2023. *Politics and the Arts: Orchestras in Post-Apartheid South Africa 1994* – 2022

Bokwe-Matthews, F. 1995. *Remembrances (An Autobiography).* [Online] https://pzacad.pitzer.edu/NAM/newaffre/writers/radebe.htm

Burger, I. M.1992. T*he Life and Work of Khabi Mngoma*. PhD Dissertation. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.

Callinicos, L. (2004) *Oliver Tambo: Beyond the Engeli Mountains*. Cape Town: David Philip Publishers.

Cockburn, C. 2008. *The Establishment of a Musical Tradition: Meaning, Values and Social Process in South African History of Handel's Messiah*. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Durban: University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Coplan, D. 1985. *In Township Tonight! Three Centuries of South African Black City Music and Theatre*. Jacana Media, Johannesburg.

Couzens, T. 1982 & 1985. *Moralizing Leisure Time: The Transatlantic Connection and Black Johannesburg 1918 -1936*. New York: Longman Group.

Cauvin, H.E. 2000. An Orchestra Falls Silent as South Africa Struggles on. Article published in the New York Times on 1 February 2000, accessible online at https://www.nytimes.com/2000/02/01/arts-abroad-an-orchestra-falls-silent-as-south-africa-struggles-on.html

Craik, J. 2007. *Re-Visioning Arts and Cultural Policy: Current Impasses and Future Directions*. Canberra: Australian National University Press.

Davenport, T.R.H. 1991. *South Africa: A Modern History*. McMillan Academic and Professional Ltd, London. Fourth Edition.

Denniston, R. 1999. *Trevor Huddleston: A life.* McMillan, London.

Department of Arts and Culture. 1996. *White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage: All Our Legacies, Our Common Future*. [Online] Available from: http://www.dac.gov.za/content/white-paper-arts-culture-and-heritage. [Accessed 11 May 2016].

Department of Arts and Culture. 2019. *Fourth Draft*: *Revised White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage*. [Online] Available from: http://www.dac.gov.za/content/fourth-draft-revised-white-paper-arts-culture-and-heritage.

Desai, A. 2010. *The Race to Transformation*. Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Erlmann, V. 1991. *African Stars: Studies in Black South African Performance*. Chicago: University of Chicago.

Erlmann, V. 1986. *Traditional African Music in Black Education*, published in the journal African Insight, Vol.16, No.2, 1986 ISSN0256-2804. Journals.co.za/doi/pdf/10.10520/AJA02562804_814

Fairburn, M. 1999. *Social History: Problems, Strategies and Methods*. New York: St. Martin's Press.

Franke, V.M. 2012. South African Orchestral Music: Five Exponents. Acta Musicologica 84. No.1 (2012): 87 -125. [Online] https://www.jstor.org/stable23343910

Galloway, S. 2008. *The evidence base for arts and culture policy: a brief review of selected recent literature*. *Centre for Cultural Research*. Edinburgh: Glasgow University for the Scottish Arts Council.

Gevisser, M. 2007. The Dream Deferred: Thabo Mbeki. Jonathan Ball Publishers, Johannesburg & Cape Town.

Global History Archives – Blackpast.org. 2009. (1905) *Isaka Seme: The Regeneration of Africa*. [Online] https://www.blackpast.org/global-African-African/1906/-iska-seme-regenration-Africa/

Gollom, I. 2000. The History of the Cape Town Orchestra: 1914 – 1997. Master's Dissertation., Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Gray, C. 2007. *Commodification and Instrumentality in Cultural Policy*. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*. 13(2). p. 203 – 215.

Gray, C. 2010. *Analysing Cultural Policy: Incorrigibly Plural or Ontologically Incompatible? International Journal of Cultural Policy*. 16(2), p. 215 – 230.

Haecker, A. 2012. *Post-Apartheid South African Choral Music: An Analysis of Integrated Musical Styles with Special Examples by Contemporary Composers*. DMA Thesis. Iowa: University of Iowa.

Hansen, D. 1968. *The Life and Work of Benjamin Tyamzashe: A Contemporary Xhosa Composer*. Grahamstown: Institute of Social and Economic Research, Rhodes University.

Harsh, E. 1980. *South Africa: White Rule Black Revolt*. Monad Press, New York.

Hofstee, E. 2009. *Constructing a Good Dissertation: A Practical Guide to Finishing a Master's, MBA or PhD on Schedule*. Johannesburg, EPE.

Idelson, J. (1933-1967), [Box A879] *The History of Symphonic Music in South Africa.* Johannesburg: Historical Papers Archive, University of the Witwatersrand.

Jaffer, Z. 2016. *Beauty of the Heart: The Life and Times of Charlotte Mannya Maxeke*. Bloemfontein: Sun Media.

Jansen, J. D. 1990. *Curriculum as a Political Phenomenon: Historical Reflections on Black* South African Education. *The Journal of Negro Education*. 59(2). p. 195-206.

Jones, P.S. 1999. *To Come Together for Progress': Modernization and Nation-Building in South Africa's Bantustan Periphery – The Case of Bophuthatswana*. Journal of Southern African Studies, 25 (4): 579 -605. Accessed online at www.doi.10.10.80/030570799/08489

Kierman, P.E. 2009. *Community Brass: Its Role in Music Education and the Development of Professional Musicians in the Western Cape*. A Master's Thesis at the University of Stellenbosch.

Lawrence, M., & Manson, A. 1984. *The 'Dog of the Boers'. The Rise and Fall of Mangope in Bophuthatswana*. Journal of Southern African Studies, 20 (3), 447 – 461. Accessed online at https://www.jstor.org/stable/2626938

Lucia, C. 2020. Short Biography for Michael Mosoeu Moerane. Critical Edition in Four Volumes. African Composers Edition, Cape Town.

Lucia, C. 2005. *The World of South African Music: A Reader*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Press.

Manganyi, N.C. 1983. *Exiles and Homecomings: A Biography of Es'kia Mphahlele*. Johannesburg: Ravan.

Masilela, N. 2003. *New Negro Modernity and New African Modernity.* The Paper presented to the Black Atlantic: Literature, Histories Cultures Forum in Zurich, January 2003. [Online] pzacad.pitzer.edu/NAM/general/modernity.pdf

Matarasso, F. and Landry, C. 1999. *Balancing Act: Twenty-One Strategic Dilemmas in Cultural Policy*. *Policy note*, 4. Belgium: Council of Europe Publishing.

Meli, F. 1988. *A History of the ANC: South Africa Belongs to us.* Zimbabwe Publishing House, Harare.

Menuhin, Y. (n.d). *Menuhin The Man.* [Online] https://menuhin.org/the-man

Miller, T. & Yúdice, G. 2002. *Cultural Policy*. California: Sage Publications.

Mngoma, K. 1987. *The teaching of music in South Africa*. *Africa Insight*. 17(3). p. 199-203. Sabinet African Journals. Available online at https://hdl.handle .net/10520/AJA02562804_585

Morapeli, M.M. 1984. The Rock: The History of Orlando High School 1939 – 1984, A Master's dissertation, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Morovian Brass Band Union of South Africa. (n.d.) *Morovian Brass Band Union of South Africa.* [Online] Available from: www.moravianbrass.co.za. [Accessed 19 May 2017].

Munro, K. (n.d). Rediscovering 1947 Royal Visit to South Africa [Online], published by the Heritage Portal at https://www.theheritageportal.co.za/article/rediscovering-1947-royal-visit-south-africa

National Arts Council. n.d. Annual Reports (Orchestral Funding). Annual Reports are available online at https://nac.org.za/publications/annual-reports

National Arts Council of South Africa. 2023. Presentation to the Portfolio Committee on Sport, Arts and Culture on the 28 February 2023. Accessible online at https://pmg.org.za/committee-meetings/36416

Ndlovu-Gatsheni, S.J. (2015) "Decoloniality in Africa: A Continuing Search for a New World Order". *The Australasian Review of African Studies*. 36(2). p. 22-50.

Nhapo, W. (n.d). *Biography* – ESAT. [Online] https://www.esat.sun.ac.za/index.php/walter

Nhlapo, W. (n.d). Untitled Article [online] hhttps://www.pzcad.pitzer.edu/NAM/newaffre/writers/wnhlapo/htm.

Oliphant, A.W. 2020. *Acts of Culture: Searching for a National South African Identity in the Context of Arts, Culture, and Heritage Diversity*. Mapungubwe Institute for Strategic Reflection, Johannesburg.

Paquette, J. and Redaelli, E. (2015) *Arts Management and Cultural Policy Research.* London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Parliament Monitoring Group. 2007. Arts and Culture Funding. Presentations can be found online at https://www.pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/24050
Patrick Lewis Papers (1949-1987), [A1132]. Johannesburg: Historical Papers Research Archive, University of the Witwatersrand.

Philips, R.E. 1938. *The Bantu in the City: A Study of Cultural Adjustment on the Witwatersrand*. Alice: Lovedale Press.

Plaatjie, S. 1992. *Native Life in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Ravan.

Pohlandt-McCormick (n.d). 'I saw a Nightmare': Soweto: History, Geography, Society', Columbia Univeristy Press [Online] www.gutenberg-e.org/pohlandt-mccormick/print/pmh02w.htm

Pyper, B. 2008. State of Contention: Re*composing Apartheid at Pretoria's State Theatre, 1990 – 1994. A Personal Recollection.* In L. Allen, G. Baines, I Byerly, C. Cockburn, D, Coplan, B. Jules –Rosette, et al. (Authors), Composing Apartheid: Music for and Against Apartheid (pp. 237 – 254). Witwatersrand University Press, Johannesburg.

Pyper, B. 1997. *Will the Band Play On?* Article published in the Mail & Guardian Newspaper on the 17th January 1997, Johannesburg. Accessible online at https://mg.co.za/article/1997-01-17-will-the-band-play-on/

Pyykkonen, M. 2012.. *UNESCO and Cultural Diversity: Democratisation, Commodification or Governmentalisation of Culture*? International Journal of Cultural Policy. 18(5). p. 545-562.

Riva, N. 2019. The Invention of African Art Music: Analyzing European –African Classical Cross-Over Projects. Article published in the book 'Music Practices Across Borders' (pp.127-150), accessible [online] doi.1014361/9783839446676-006

Roberson, J. 1971. *Liberalism in South Africa 1948 – 1963.* Clarendon Press, Oxford.

Roodt, H.C. 2006. *Cultural Policy and the Landscape of the Law in South Africa*. *Fundamina*. 12(1). p. 204 – 222.

Rycroft, D.K. 1957. *Zulu Male Traditional singing. Journal of African Music Society*, Vol. 1. No.4

Sachs, A. 1991. *Preparing Ourselves for Freedom: Culture and the ANC Constitutional Guidelines TDR*. 35(1). p. 187-193.

Scullion, A. & Garcia, B. 2005. *What is Cultural Policy?"* International Journal of Cultural Policy. 11(2). p. 113-127.

Skotnes, C. (n.d). Family Archive. [Online]. https://Cecilskotnes.com

Suttner, R. & Cronin, J. 2006. 50 Years of the Freedom Charter: Hidden Histories series, University of South Africa, Pretoria.

Tancsik, P. (n.d.) *Tracing Joseph Trauneck: The Wanderings of a Persecuted Man*. South African Music Archive Project. [Online] Available from: https://samap.ukzn.ac.za/Trauneck. [Accessed: 1 August 2017].

The Freedom Charter, (1955) adopted at the Congress of the People at Kliptown, Johannesburg, on June 25 and 26, 1955. Federation of South African Women 1954 – 1963, [AD 1137], Johannesburg: Historical Papers Research Archive, University of the Witwatersrand.

Thompson, L. 2000. *A History of South Africa*. Yale University Press (Third Edition)

Van Graan, M. n.d. One Settler One Ballet. Article available online at https://mikevangraan.co.za/articles/by-mike-van-graan/one-settle-one-ballet

Walton, C. 2004. *Bond of Broeders: Anton Hartman and Music in an Apartheid State*. The Musical times, 145 (1887), 63 -74 [Online] https://doi.org/10.2307/4149148

Williams, J.J. 1996. *Report of the Arts and Culture Task Group Presented to the Minister of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology,* June 1995. Critical Arts 10(1) pp. 107 – 122. South-North Cultural and Media Studies. Accessible online at https://dx.doi.org/10.1080.025600498653/0071

Williams, R. 1983. *Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Appendix A: Ethical Clearance

Research Office

HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE (NON-MEDICAL)
R14/49 Bokaba

CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE	PROTOCOL NUMBER: H17/11/04
PROJECT TITLE	The role of arts and cultural policy in relation to the current place of orchestras in the lived experience of black South African musicians
INVESTIGATOR(S)	Mr S Bokaba
SCHOOL/DEPARTMENT	Wits School of Arts/
DATE CONSIDERED	17 November 2017
DECISION OF THE COMMITTEE	Approved
EXPIRY DATE	13 December 2020

DATE 14 December 2017 CHAIRPERSON J Knight

(Professor J Knight)

cc: Supervisor : Professor B Pyper

DECLARATION OF INVESTIGATOR(S)

To be completed in duplicate and **ONE COPY** returned to the Secretary at Room 10004, 10th Floor, Senate House, University. Unreported changes to the application may invalidate the clearance given by the HREC (Non-Medical)

I/We fully understand the conditions under which I am/we are authorized to carry out the abovementioned research and I/we guarantee to ensure compliance with these conditions. Should any departure to be contemplated from the research procedure as approved I/we undertake to resubmit the protocol to the Committee. I agree to completion of a yearly progress report.

Signature Date

PLEASE QUOTE THE PROTOCOL NUMBER ON ALL ENQUIRIES

Appendix B: Interviewees

List of interviewees

Full Names	Role	Institutions
Mrs Sheila Masote	Administrator; daughter of Mr Zephania Mothopeng; wife to Michael Masote	African Cultural Organisation of Southern Africa (ACOSA)/ (formerly Johannesburg Bantu Music Festival); Soweto Symphony Orchestra/City of Johannesburg/Mmabatho String Orchestra in Bophuthatswana
Mr Lindumuzi Mngoma	Cellist/Conductor/Organiser	Ionian Music Society
Mr Motsumi Makhene	Former violinist/Music student at Wits in the late 1970s/Arts educator/Composer/Cultural policy/Activist	Ionian Youth Orchestra; Funda Community College, Soweto
Mr Molefe Phineas Pheto	Former trumpeter/Military veteran	Ionian Youth Orchestra; AZANLA & APLA
Mr Arthur Matlhatsi	Violinist/Music educator	Soweto Youth Orchestra; National Chamber Orchestra; South African Music Education Trust; Mmabana, Arts, Culture and Sport Foundation
Mr Ludumo Magangane	Choir conductor/Educator/Music	Former student at University of Zululand; Kwa-Thema

	director	Youth Choir; Bonisudumo Choristers; Sowetan Maased Choir Festival
Prof Andries Oliphant	Cultural policy advisor/Literary scholar	
Mr Sandile Khemese	Violinist	Soweto Youth Orchestra; Soweto String Quartet
Prof Muxe Nkondo	Social policy/National strategy development and discourse analysis scholar	
Mr Andrew Moorosi	Oboist	PACT Orchestra
Mr Ishmael Khambule	Trumpeter/Music educator	
Dr Lebogang Lance Nawa	Cultural practitioner/ Creative writer/Activist	National Writers Association of South Africa
Mr George Mxadana	Flautist/Choral conductor	Soweto Youth Orchestra; Imilonji KaNtu Choral Society