



**UNIVERSITY OF THE WITWATERSRAND
JOHANNESBURG**

**The nutrient status of grasslands and adjacent
Pinus patula and *Eucalyptus grandis* plantations
on the eastern escarpment of South Africa.**

Deshika Kathawaroo

**A dissertation submitted to the Faculty of Science,
University of the Witwatersrand,
in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of**

MASTER OF SCIENCE

Johannesburg, 2005

DECLARATION

I declare that this dissertation is my own, unaided work. It is being submitted for the Degree of Master of Science in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before any degree or examination in any other University.

(Signature of candidate)

_____day of June 2005

ABSTRACT

The replacement of indigenous grasslands by commercial forestry plantations on the mountainous eastern escarpment of South Africa, has inevitably led to alteration of nutrient cycling. The overall objective of this study was to determine the nutrient status (soil, litter and foliar nutrient concentrations) of *Pinus patula* and *Eucalyptus grandis* plantations and adjacent grasslands. The 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and adjacent Driekop grassland were located relatively high up on the escarpment (altitudes ranging between 950–1610 m) and were underlain by dolomite while the 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations and adjacent Brooklands grassland were located lower down (altitudes ranging between 900–1100 m) and were underlain by granite. It was assumed that the nutrient status of the soil under the plantations and the adjacent grasslands were similar prior to afforestation. Samples were collected once in winter (August 2002) and once in summer (January 2003). Soil samples were collected to a depth of 20 cm and litter material, to a maximum depth of 20 cm. Lower canopy foliar samples were collected within the lowermost metre of the canopies and upper canopy foliar samples were collected within the uppermost metre of the canopies. The data were analysed in the laboratory for various elements and soil physical parameters.

The soil pH was lower under the *P. patula* (pH 4.8-5.2) and *E. grandis* plantations (pH 4.6-5.3) when compared with the soil under the adjacent grasslands (pH 5.3-5.6). The soil under the *P. patula* plantations had lower exchangeable base cation concentrations (204-300 mg kg⁻¹) compared with the adjacent Driekop grassland (452-645 mg kg⁻¹), while there were no clear trends when comparing the exchangeable basic cation concentrations in the *E. grandis* plantations and the adjacent Brooklands grassland. The soil aluminium saturation was similar between the plantations, ranging between 39.7 and 63.3% in the *P. patula* plantations and 27.4 and 75.6% in the *E. grandis* plantations. The grasslands had lower soil aluminium saturations, ranging between 17.7 and 35.7% in the Driekop grassland and 17.5 and 39.1% in the Brooklands grassland. Exudates from mycorrhizal associations chelate

acidic cations, rendering plantations more tolerant of acidic soils. Soil total nitrogen, phosphorus and carbon in the plantations were similar to the adjacent grasslands. Higher nitrogen mineralisation rates in the *P. patula* plantations corresponded with higher litter and foliar total N concentrations relative to the adjacent Driekop grassland, while there were no clear trends when comparing rates of N mineralisation in the *E. grandis* plantations and the Brooklands grassland. The concentrations of foliar amino acids and protein were significantly higher ($p < 0.01$) in the plantation foliage, when compared the grassland foliage. The amino acid arginine, occurred in higher proportions relative to other amino acids in plantation foliage, when compared with the relative proportions found in the grasslands. Relative to nitrogen, foliar ratios indicated that phosphorus and potassium were the most limiting nutrients for the plantations, which possibly resulted in N storage in the form of protein and amino acids.

The soil and foliage were the more sensitive indicators of the nutrients status than litter. Differences in nutrients concentrations between the lower and upper canopies in both plantations were minor and no major trends were found. Therefore the sub division of lower and upper canopies is not recommended for further foliar nutrient analyses. Age related trends were unclear as a result of higher soil clay contents found in the 13 year old *P. patula* plantation and the 8 year old *E. grandis* plantation as well as the various silvicultural practices implemented. In terms of the relative impacts of *P. patula* and *E. grandis* plantations, the results of this study imply that the upper 20 cm of soil was more impacted under the *P. patula* plantations than under the *E. grandis* plantations, in terms of reduced base cation and increased acid cation concentrations. The *P. patula* plantations are shallow rooters and thus the base cation status of the upper soil horizons may affect the sustainability of the *P. patula* plantations.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people and events have contributed to the completion of this thesis. My supervisor, Professor M C Scholes, is thanked for all her continual guidance and support. The members of my research committee: Professor Dave Mycock, Luanne Otter, Lorraine McNamara, Professor W D Stock and special thanks to Professor Harald Grip, for his unwavering belief and encouragement. The Mellon Foundation and the National Research Foundation are gratefully acknowledged for the financial support. WSP Walmsley and Synergistics Environmental Services are thanked for their financial support and encouragement.

The following persons and organisations are also thanked for their contributions:

- Hasmukh Jeram for your belief
- Lorraine McNamara and Pete Reynecke for providing information on plantations and grasslands, assistance with site identification and the provision of relevant information
- Hazel Khanyile, Mr V Schneiderman, Herman Du Preez, Sipho Mnguni and Shena Kennedy for general and technical assistance
- Neville Pillay and Shirley Hanrahan
- TK for field assistance
- Tree climbers: Tonny Malope, Tshepo Malele, Impi Mogane, Lydos Mashigo, Enias Lebyane, Henry Sibanyoni, Jabulani Nubese & Christoph Usiba for collecting the lower and upper canopy foliar samples
- The SIDA/Wits link for sponsorship to Sweden
- Sibongiseni Qabisisa & Sachin Bhala for laboratory assistance
- My colleagues Janine Campion & Gregor Feig
- My colleague Guy Lowman for informative discussions
- Professor E. Cukrowska and Ruphat
- Beulah Pretorius from Irene, ARC
- Adam Looke, Mike Philpott and Ernst Jacobs from the ARC
- Mari Els and Kerry Fairley for your encouragement and support
- The South African Weather Bureau for the weather data
- Allan Savage, Shun Pillay, Byron Jacobs and Aveer Ramnath

- Malla mosie, Usha, Hugo, Darian and Ribbon
- Professor W J Bond for inspiration and encouragement
- My mom, Kanan Devi
- Master Yang Li Hua and everyone at Wushu
- Conrad and Kitsia Lunderstedt for your patience, continual support and infinite blessings
- Lilo & Stich

LIST OF FIGURES

- Figure 1. Diagrammatic representation of the N cycle showing soil nitrogen changes, additions and losses. Losses are represented by dashed lines; amounts of change are indicated by relative line widths.
- Figure 2. The location of the study area (circled in red) in South Africa.
- Figure 3. The relative locations of the Driekop grassland and adjacent *P. patula* plantations and the Brooklands grassland and adjacent *E. grandis* plantations on the eastern escarpment of South Africa.
- Figure 4. The natural montane grassland, referred to as the Driekop grassland and commercial *Pinus* plantations.
- Figure 5. The 2 year old *P. patula* plantation, after the foliage was sampled.
- Figure 6. The 13 year old *P. patula* plantation.
- Figure 7. The tree climbers heading towards the canopy to collect the lower and upper canopy foliar samples from the 30 year old *P. patula* plantation.
- Figure 8. The Brooklands grassland in the fore-front, the 2 year old *E. grandis* plantation in the distance on the left and the 13 year old *E. grandis* plantation on the right hand side.
- Figure 9. The 2 year old *E. grandis* plantation.
- Figure 10. The 8 year old *E. grandis* plantation.
- Figure 11. The 13 year old *E. grandis* plantation.
- Figure 12. The cumulative rainfall (mm), on a daily basis, from February 2002 to January 2003, measured at the Graskop weather monitoring station.
- Figure 13. The average temperature (degrees celcius), shown on a monthly basis, from February 2002 to January 2003, measured at the Graskop weather monitoring station.
- Figure 14. The cumulative rainfall (mm), shown on a daily basis, from February 2002 to January 2003, measured at the Brooklands weather monitoring station.
- Figure 15. The monthly average temperature (degrees celcius) for February 2002 to January 2003, measured at the Brooklands weather monitoring station.
- Figure 16. A diagrammatic representation of the sampling strategy showing the Driekop grassland and adjacent *P. patula* plantations, the Brooklands grassland and adjacent *E. grandis* plantations and the various ages

within each of the plantations. The 30 year old *P. patula* plantation was used as an example to illustrate the ‘pseudoreplication’ sampling technique.

- Figure 17. Soil a) exchangeable and b) total Mg^{2+} (mg kg^{-1}) concentrations in the Driekop grassland and adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations.
- Figure 18. Soil a) exchangeable and b) total Mg^{2+} (mg kg^{-1}) concentrations in the Brooklands grassland and adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.
- Figure 19. Sum of soil exchangeable Mg^{2+} , K^+ , Ca^{2+} (mg kg^{-1}) in a) the Driekop grassland and adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and b) the Brooklands grassland and adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.
- Figure 20. Soil exchangeable acidity ($\text{cmol}(+)\text{kg}^{-1}$) in a) the Driekop grassland and adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and b) the Brooklands grassland and adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.
- Figure 21. Soil aluminium saturation (%) in a) the Driekop grassland and adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and b) the Brooklands grassland and adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.
- Figure 22. Soil total N (%) concentration in a) the Driekop grassland and adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and b) the Brooklands grassland and adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.
- Figure 23. Litter total Ca^{2+} (mg kg^{-1}) concentrations in a) the Driekop grassland and the adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and b) the Brooklands grassland and the adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.
- Figure 24. Litter total Fe^{3+} (mg kg^{-1}) concentrations in a) the Driekop grassland and adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and b) the Brooklands grassland and adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.
- Figure 25. Litter total N (%) concentration in a) the Driekop grassland and adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and b) the Brooklands grassland and adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.
- Figure 26. Foliar total Mg^{2+} (mg kg^{-1}) concentrations in a) the Driekop grassland and the upper canopies of adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations and b) the Brooklands grassland and the upper canopies of adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.

Figure 27. Foliar total N (%) concentrations in the Driekop grassland and the a) upper canopies and b) lower canopies of adjacent 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations.

Figure 28. Foliar total N (%) concentrations in the Brooklands grassland and the a) upper canopies b) lower canopies of adjacent 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations.

LIST OF TABLES

- Table 1. Site characteristics for a) Driekop grassland and adjacent *P. patula* plantations and b) Brooklands grassland and adjacent *E. grandis* plantations.
- Table 2. The silvicultural practises of the selected *P. patula* plantations (pers. comm. McNamara 2004).
- Table 3. The silvicultural practises of the selected *E. grandis* plantations (pers. comm. Reynecke 2003).
- Table 4. The number of samples collected from the canopy, litter and soil from the tree to the compartment level of *P. patula*, *E. grandis* and the adjacent grasslands.
- Table 5. The variable, method, season, reference of the laboratory analyses and the institution at which it occurred.
- Table 6. The mean and standard deviations of selected physical properties, total basic and acidic cations, total N, P, C and C:N ratios and the anaerobic N mineralisation index for the soil of the Driekop grassland and the 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations, during winter and summer.
- Table 7. The mean and standard deviations of selected physical properties, total basic and acidic cations, total N, P, C and C:N ratios and the anaerobic N mineralisation index for the soil of the Brooklands grassland and the 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations, during winter and summer.
- Table 8. The mean and standard deviations of total basic and acidic cations, total N, P, C and C:N ratios for the litter of the Driekop grassland and the 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations, during winter and summer.
- Table 9. The mean and standard deviations of total basic and acidic cations, total N, P, C and C:N ratios for the litter of the Brooklands grassland and the 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations, during winter and summer.
- Table 10. The mean and standard deviations of total basic and acidic cations, total N, P, C and C:N ratios for the foliage of the Driekop grassland and the lower (Lc) and upper (Uc) canopies of the 2, 13 and 30 year old *P. patula* plantations, during winter and summer.
- Table 11. The mean and standard deviations of total basic and acidic cations, total N, P, C and C:N ratios for the foliage of the Brooklands grassland and the lower (Lc) and upper (Uc) canopies of the 2, 8 and 13 year old *E. grandis* plantations, during winter and summer.
- Table 12. Winter, foliar amino acid (%) means and distribution between the i) Driekop and Brooklands grassland ii) age class averaged within the *P. patula* and *E. grandis* plantations.

APPENDICES

- Table A1. Statistical Post Hoc Tukey p values for the measured soil parameters. The p values represent the results of comparisons made between the Driekop grassland and adjacent *P. patula* plantations and within the different age-classes of *P. patula* plantations. The p values shown were for comparisons made within seasons.
- Table A2. Statistical Post Hoc Tukey p values for the measured soil parameters. The p values represent the results of comparisons made between the Brooklands grassland and adjacent *E. grandis* plantations and within the different age-classes of *E. grandis* plantations. The p values shown were for comparisons made within seasons.
- Table A3. Statistical Post Hoc Tukey p values for the measured litter parameters. The p values represent the results of comparisons made between the Driekop grassland and adjacent *P. patula* plantations and within the different age-classes of *P. patula* plantations. The p values shown were for comparisons made within seasons.
- Table A4. Statistical Post Hoc Tukey p values for the measured litter parameters. The p values represent the results of comparisons made between the Brooklands grassland and adjacent *E. grandis* plantations and within the different age-classes of *E. grandis* plantations. The p values shown were for comparisons made within seasons.
- Table A5. Statistical Post Hoc Tukey p values for the measured foliar, lower (Lc) and upper (Uc) canopy parameters. The p values represent the results of comparisons made between the Driekop grassland and adjacent *P. patula* plantations and within the different age-classes of *P. patula* plantations. The p values shown were for comparisons made within seasons.
- Table A6. Statistical Post Hoc Tukey p values for the measured foliar, lower (Lc) and upper (Uc) canopy parameters. The p values represent the results of comparisons made between the Brooklands grassland and adjacent *E. grandis* plantations and within the different age-classes of *E. grandis* plantations. The p values shown were for comparisons made within seasons.