

https://dspace.org/

# The role of spirituality in South African specialist psychiatric practice and training

**Janse van Rensburg, Albert Bernard-Repsold**

**2012-01-31**
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/11211

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

## APPENDIX 3.3 SUMMARY OF LITERATURE

## OVERVIEW OF TOPIC: SPIRITUALITY AND RELIGION

### 1. News media and popular books

A couple of selected articles from the news media and references to selected popular books helped to establish the context and time in which the study was positioned. These include: - *"O Father where art Thou?"* (Chu, 2003);[1] - "*Is God in our genes?"* (Kluger, 2004);[2] - *"The mystery of consciousness"* (Pinker, 2007);[3] - *"The many faces of Europe"* (Farouky, 2007);[4] *"God and Politics"* (Mail&Guardian, 2007);[5] - *"The new wars of religion" and "In God's Name"* (Economist, 2007);[6] and - *"The biology of belief"* (Kluger, 2009).[7] Popular publications included books such as: - *"The 'God' part of the brain"* (Alper, 2006);[8] *"The God delusion"* (Dawkins, 2006);[9] - *"The language of God: A scientist presents evidence for belief"* (Collins, 2007);[10] *"God is back: How the global rise or faith is changing the world"* (Micklethwait & Woolridge, 2009)[11] and *"The case for God"* (Armstrong, 2009).[12]

### 2. South African and other related books

Local and international books on spirituality, mental health and related subjects that contributed to the broader context of the study included:

- *Modern South Africa in search of a soul: Jungian perspectives on the wilderness within* (Saayman G, Ed. 1990);[13] in particular Bürhrman's chapter on "Psyche and soma".[14]
- *San spirituality: Roots, Expressions & Social Consequences* (Lewis-Williams D & Pearce D, 2004);[15] in particular chapter 1 on *"Mind, Stone and Spirit"* and chapter 2 on *"Roots in the Brain: A neurological interlude".*
- *Truth & Reconciliation in South Africa: 10 years on* (Villa-Vicencio C & Du Toit F, Eds. 2006);[16] in particular the chapter on *"The TRC's unfinished business: Healing"* (Gobodo-Madikizela, Foster & Mathibela).[17]
- *Religion and Anthropology* (Morris R, 2006);[18] in particular the extensive discussion in eight chapters of shamanism, Buddhism and spirit-cults, Islam and popular religion, Hinduism and new religious movements, Christianity and religion in Africa, African-American religions, religions in Melanesia and Neo-paganism and the New age Movement.
- *Religion, Violence, Memory and Place* (Stier OB, Landres JS, Eds. 2006);[19] in particular Chidester's chapter on *"Indigenous Traditions, Alien Abductions: Creolized and Globalized Memory in South Africa".*[20]
- *Mental Health and Religion* (Loewenthal KM, 1995);[21]
- *Modern man in search of a soul* (Jung CG, 1933 & 1985);[22] in particular chapters X on *"The spiritual problem of Modern Man"* (pp226-254) and XI on *"Psychotherapists of the clergy"* (pp255-282);
- *The varieties of religious experience* (James W, 1902 1962 & 2007);[23]
- *The Oxford Textbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry* (Fullford KWM, Thornton T & Graham G, 2005);[24] and
- *Spirituality: Forms, Foundations, Methods* (Waaijman K, 2002)[25]

### 3. Books in psychiatry

Authors in psychiatry that produced text books on spirituality, religion and psychiatry included: Bhugra,[26] Koenig,[27] Shorto,[28] Boehnlein,[29] Koenig, McCullough and Larson,[30] Bhui and Bhugra,[31] Josephsen and Peteet,[32] Galanter[33] and Vaillant.[34] In Keown's review of Bhugra's book, he pointed out that the book was the outgrowth of a series of meetings held at the Institute of Psychiatry, London since 1991.[35] The book in three parts explores: - the conceptual and historic reasons why psychiatry and religion have become estranged in contemporary

practice; - seven different religious movements (Christianity, Judaism, new African-American religious groups, Hinduism, Buddhism, "new religions" and Islam); and – issues such as the neurophysiology of religious experience, guilt and ritual and the role of Christian pastoral counselling. The author pointed out that the book is an attempt to represent the beginning of the dialogue between two neighbours (psychiatry and religion) *"who should be on very good terms, but, due to a long-forgotten episode over the niggle about the size of the fence, have fallen out. It is high time that commonalities are ascertained and shared and differences are put to one side".* In the review of Koenig's book, DuPont gave an overview of the author's career and found common ground for the view on the role of spirituality as demonstrated by a case study on alcohol abuse and the 12-step approach to rehabilitation of Alcoholics Anonymous (AA).[36] In the book Koenig pointed to the preventative effects that religion is regarded to have, such as: - providing a stronger social support network; - the avoiding by adherents of unhealthy habits (smoking, drinking); and – a perceived influence on the reduction of divorce rates, crime and suicide. Reviewing Boehnlein's book, Schultz-Ross summarized the contents, including: - the history of the conflicting relationship (between psychiatry and religion); - psychiatric aspects of cults and fanatical belief; - religious movements' influence on psychotherapy; - spiritual aspects of trauma and suffering; - the role of the clergy in mental health; and – bio-ethics as the "referee" between religion and mental health.[37] In contrast with DuPont's more favourable view of Koenig's earlier book, Genova's review of Koenig, McCullough and Larson's "Handbook" is more critical.[38] In his view the book can be regarded as (merely) a reference volume on the state of academic research on the correlations between religious practice and illness prevention or disease outcome, although the aggregate of the results is suggestive and more research is always needed. The reviewer expressed reservation about the notion that religion should be regarded as an instrument for preventing or curing illness, as illness – on the contrary – often leads people to religion. Separate reviews by Shaw[39] and Buck[40] of Josephson and Peteet's book offered different perspectives. Buck reviewed the outlay of the book in three parts: - a discussion of the concept of worldview or *"Weltanschauung"* (being materialistic or transcendental); - doing spiritual assessment and constructing a bio-psycho-social-spiritual formulation; - and examining the most likely worldviews of Protestant, Roman Catholic, Jewish, Muslim, Hindu, Buddhist, atheist and agnostic traditions. According to Shaw the definition of "spirituality" and "world view" that was provided lacked specificity and complexity. While the book covers a number of themes (such as the importance of understanding worldview in terms of the therapeutic relationship; the clinician's appreciation of the patient's cultural and religious beliefs; and the need to consider worldview, spirituality and religion both in the assessment and diagnostic processes), Shaw pointed out that it is possible to be spiritual and agnostic (non-theistic) and provided a critique on the context, experience and psychodynamic explanations provided for the phenomenon of "inner world mysticism". Galanter gave a positive review of Vaillant's book, as he seeks to validate the legitimacy of spirituality as a vital concept to attend to and to espouse.[41] Vaillant's central thesis is that spirituality is inherent to man's nature and that it is the product of biological and cultural evolution.

## 4. Journal articles

A total of 255 literature records were included in the formal review. Of these were: - books (7); - chapters in books (3); - editorial comments (37); - journal articles (202); and - letters and reviews (6). A significant increase of literature records on the topic of spirituality and psychiatry over the past 20 years was noted. From 1986 to 1999: n=39; 2000 (n=15); 2001 (n=20); 2002 (n=19); 2003 (n=20); 2004 (n=24); 2005 (n=14); 2006 (n=29); 2007 (n=44); 2008 (n=22) and 2009 (9). Countries of origin of the literature records or authors were: - United States (n=190); - United Kingdom (n=15); - Australia (n=13); Brazil (n=8); Canada (n=12); Europe (n=6), from the Netherlands, Germany, Norway and Switzerland; and - other (n=11), from China, Croatia, India, Israel, Nigeria, South Africa and South Korea.

Authors with three or more publications as only or primary author were (Table 1): - Anandarajah (n=3); - Baetz (n=8); - Bhugra (n=2); Boehnlein (n=3) Cloninger (n=9); Culliford (n=3); Curlin (n=4); Dew (n=3); D'Souza (n=5); Fallot (n=3); Flannelly (n=3); Galanter (n=6); Gilbert (n=3); Hall (n=6); Hathaway (n=3); Josephson (n=4); Koenig (n=24); Larson (n=3); Moreira-Almeida (n=3); Puschalski (n=6); Tsuang (n=3) and Weaver (n=6). Several of them were also second and third co-authors of other publications, including Curlin (n=1), Flannelly (n=6), Galanter (n=3), Koenig (n=33), Larson (n=16), Puchalski (n=5) and Weaver (n=1). United Kingdom authors included Dein, Bhugra, Bhui, Carr, Culliford, Gilbert, Greasley and Powell. Australian authors included Bathgate, D'Souza, Halasz, Peach, Pembroke, Rumbold and Wilding. Brazilian authors were: Chibeni, Leao, Moreira-Almeida and Peres. Canadian authors included Baetz, Breitbart, Grabovac and Morgan.

The journals that published most of these literature records were: - psychiatric journals (American Journal of Psychiatry, n=12; Australasian Psychiatric Journal, n=6; Canadian Journal of Psychiatry, n=8; International Journal of Psychiatry in Medicine, n=8; International Review of Psychiatry, n=5; Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease, n=14; Psychiatric Annals, n=6; and Rev Psiq Clin, n=10. Family medicine journals were: American Journal of Family Physicians, n=3; Archives of Family Medicine, n=3. Medicine journals: Academic Medicine, n=7; Archives of Internal Medicine, n=3. General medical journals: JAMA, n=3; Medical Journal of Australia, n=7; South Medical Journal, n=7. Social and religion journals: Journal of Religion and Health, n=9; Social Science and Medicine, n=3.

Most literature records (n=204) were qualitative investigations or essay-type of overviews and commentaries. Of these records, most were written text (n=158), literature reviews (n=22), action research (n=10) and used focus group discussions (n=2), semi-structured interviews (n=7) or unstructured interviews (n=5). A total of 51 inquiries were quantitative in nature. Those that used questionnaires in surveys (n=45) were regarded as quantitative inquiries, in addition to the application of scales of measurement (n=6).

**Table 1. Summary of prominent authors on spirituality and psychiatry**

| AUTHOR | SINGLE | PRIMARY | CO-AUTHOR |
|---|---|---|---|
| Anandarajah | n=1 | n=2 | |
| Baetz | | n=8 | |
| Bhugra | n=2 | | n=2 |
| Boehnlein | n=3 | | |
| Cloninger | n=4 | n=5 | n=2 |
| Culliford | n=3 | | |
| Curlin | | n=4 | n=1 |
| Dew | | n=3 | |
| D'Souza | n=3 | n=2 | n=1 |
| Fallot | n=2 | n=1 | |
| Flannelly | | n=3 | n=6 |
| Galanter | n=5 | n=1 | n=3 |
| Gillbert | n=3 | | |
| Hall | | n=6 | |
| Josephson | | n=4 | n=1 |
| King DE | | n=2 | n=1 |
| Koenig | n=19 | n=5 | n=33 |
| Larson | | n=3 | n=16 |
| Lukoff | | n=1 | n=1 |
| Mathews | | n=2 | |
| McCullough | | n=1 | n=3 |
| Meador | | n=1 | n=6 |
| Mohr S | | n=2 | n=1 |
| Moreira-Almeida | n=1 | n=2 | n=1 |
| Puchalski | n=2 | n=4 | n=5 |
| Peteet | n=1 | | n=2 |
| Tsuang | | n=3 | |
| Vaillant | n=2 | | |
| Weaver | | n=6 | n=1 |

WITHD

**REFERENCES**


[1] Chu J. O Father where art Thou? Time Magazine. June 16, 2003; 161(24):12-20
[2] Kluger J. Is God in our genes? Time Magazine. November 29, 2004; 164(21):48-56
[3] Pinker S. The mystery of consciousness. Time magazine. February 12, 2007 169(7):34-44
[4] Farouky J. The many faces of Europe. Time Magazine. February, 26, 2007; 169(9):16-23
[5] Mail&Guardian. God and Politics. April 5 to 12, 2007; 23(14):11-28
[6] The Economist. The new wars of religion & In God's Name. November 3 to 9, 2007; 385(8553):13 & Suppl pp1-20
[7] Kluger J. The biology of belief. Time Magazine. February, 23 2009; 173(8): 32-46
[8] Alper M. The "God" part of the brain: A scientific interpretation of human spirituality and God. Sourcebooks Inc. 2006 Illinois
[9] Dawkins R. The God delusion. Transworld Publishers. 2006 London
[10] Collins F. The language of God: A scientist presents evidence for belief. Simon & Schuster, 2007 London
[11] Micklethwait J, Woolridge A. God is back: How the global rise of faith is changing the world. (Allen Lane) Penguin Books, 2009 London
[12] Armstrong K. The case for God. The Bodley Head, 2009 London
[13] Saayman G. (Ed) Modern South Africa in search of a soul: Jungian perspectives on the wilderness within. Sigo Press, 1990 Boston
[14] Bürhrman MV. Psyche and soma: Therapeutic considerations. In Modern South Africa in search of a soul: Jungian perspectives on the wilderness within. Saayman G. (Ed) Sigo Press, 1990 Boston pp203-218
[15] Lewis-Williams JD, Pearce DG. San spirituality: Roots, Expressions & Social Consequences. Double Storey (Juta), 2004 Cape Town
[16] Villa-Vicencio C, Du Toit F. (Eds) Truth & Reconciliation in South Africa: 10 years on. David Phillip, 2006 Claremont
[17] Gobodo-Madikizela P, Foster D and Mathibela L. In Truth & Reconciliation in South Africa: 10 years on. Villa-Vicencio C & Du Toit F, Eds. David Phillip, 2006 Claremont pp71-101
[18] Morris R. Religion and Anthropology. Cambridge University Press, 2006 Cambridge
[19] Stier OB, Landres JS. (Eds) Religion, Violence, Memory and Place. Indiana University Press, 2006 Bloomington
[20] Chidester D. Indigenous Traditions, Alien Abductions: Creolized and Globalized Memory in South Africa. In Religion, Violence, Memory and Place. Stier OB, Landres JS. (Eds) Indiana University Press, 2006 Bloomington pp181-197
[21] Loewenthal KM. Mental Health and Religion. Chapman & Hall, 1995 London
[22] Jung CG. Modern man in search of a soul. ARK Paperbacks (1933) 1985 London
[23] James W. The varieties of religious experience. Simon & Schuster, (1902, 1962) 2007 New York
[24] Fullford KWM, Thornton T & Graham G. The Oxford Textbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry. Oxford University Press, 2005
[25] Waaijman K. Spirituality: Forms, Foundations, Methods. Peeters, 2002 Leuven
[26] Bhugra D. Psychiatry and Religion: Context, Consensus and Controversies. Routledge, 1996 London
[27] Koenig HG. The Healing Power of Faith: Science Explores Medicine's Last Great Frontier. Simon & Schuster, 1999 New York,
[28] Shorto R. Saints and Madmen: Psychiatry Opens Its Doors to Religion. Henry Holt and Co., 1999 New York
[29] Boehnlein JK. The Convergence of Mind and Spirit. American Psychiatric Press, 2000 Washington DC
[30] Koenig HG, McCullough ME, Larson DB. Handbook of Religion and Health. Oxford University Press, 2001 New York
[31] Bhui K, Bhugra D. Cross cultural psychiatry: a practical guide. Arnold, 2001 London
[32] Josephson AM, Peteet JR. Handbook of Spirituality and Worldview in Clinical Practice. American Psychiatric Press, 2004 Washington DC
[33] Galanter M. Spirituality and the Healthy Mind: Science, Therapy, and the Need for Personal Meaning. Oxford University Press, 2005 New York
[34] Vaillant G. Spiritual evolution: A scientific defence of faith. Broadway Books, 2008 New York

[35] Keown D. Review: Psychiatry and religion: Context, Consensus and Controversies (Bhugra). The Lancet. London: Mar 30, 1996; 347(9005):888
[36] DuPont R. Review: The Healing Power of Faith: Science Explores Medicine's Last Great Frontier (Koenig). Am J Psychiatry. Aug 2001; 158(8):1347-48
[37] Schultz-Ross RA. Review: The Convergence of Mind and Spirit (Boehnlein). Am J Psychotherapy. 2001; 55(1):140-1
[38] Genova P. Review: Handbook of Religion and Health (Koenig, McCullough, Larson). Am J Psychiatry. Sep 2002; 159(9):1619-20
[39] Shaw JA. Review: Handbook of Spirituality and Worldview in Clinical Practice (Josephson & Peteet). Psychiatry. 2006; 69(2):164-167
[40] Buck OD. Review: Handbook of Spirituality and Worldview in Clinical Practice (Josephson & Peteet) Am J Psychiatry Jun 2005; 162(6):1236-37
[41] Galanter M. Spiritual evolution: A scientific defence of faith. (by GE Vaillant) Review. Am J Psychiatry Feb 2009; 166(2):239-40

WitsETD