DOES FOREIGN AID MAKE A DIFFERENCE? A CASE STUDY OF THE BOSEELE ASSOCIATION IN NORTHERN LESOTHO

Lineo Rose Johnson

A research report submitted to the Wits School of Education, Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand by combination of coursework and research in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of **Master of Education**

Johannesburg, June 2011

Abstract

Lesotho is a country plaqued by underdevelopment and poverty. This research is a case study of an indigenous community organisation in the northern district of Botha-Bothe in Lesotho. Boseele is a rural development organisation which attracted international donor investment in the aftermath of the Lesotho Highlands Water Project. The study aims at investigating the impact of capacity development processes on Boseele and its members. The study identified capacity building landmarks over a period of ten years. A case study approach was used within a qualitative research design. Data was collected through individual and group interviews, observations, story-telling and transect walks. The results were analysed through thematic, chronological, narrative and document analysis. Boseele's successes with CIDA funding reflect positive foreign aid contributions towards the work of civil society organisations in Lesotho. However, setbacks and lack of continuity by a nursery project funded by MS-Lesotho show that the empowerment process is vulnerable where social and economic problems of individual members and communities are not fully addressed.

TEN KEY WORDS: capacity building; foreign donor interventions; community; rural development; human capital theory; empowerment; conscientisation; networks and collaboration; sustainable development.

Declaration

I, Lineo Rose Johnson, am a student registered for M.Ed., in 2008–2011.

I hereby declare that plagiarism is wrong. I confirm that this research report is my own unaided work except where I have explicitly indicated and have followed the required conventions in referencing the thoughts and ideas of others.

I understand that the University of the Witwatersrand may take disciplinary action against me if there is a belief that this is not my own unaided work or that I have failed to acknowledge the source of the ideas or words in my writing.

Signature: L.R. Johnson.....

Date: June, 2011

Acknowledgments

This has been a long two-year period which I could not have survived on my own. I thank God for giving me good health, strength and life to pursue my studies.

My Supervisor Professor Jane Castle – there were times when I felt I was not going to make it, but you always assured me of my potential capabilities and the courage to continue. Your patience and commitment in coaching, mentoring and helping in many respects were highly profound. You went the extra mile for me in many respects. Without that support and assurance, I would not have made it. A special gratitude goes to my two children, 'Mamohapi and Tumi for their understanding, patience and support during difficult and trying times throughout my studies.

I was humbled by the cooperation of the Boseele Association members in Botha-Bothe and 'Mate, throughout the period of this study. Your valuable time ushered in various meetings cannot be underestimated, as without that sacrifice, it would be impossible to achieve this goal.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: Introduction

| The Boseele Association, NGO and CBO | 1 |
|--------------------------------------|----|
| Problem Statement | 5 |
| Purpose of the Study | 6 |
| Research Questions | 7 |
| Rationale | 8 |
| Background to the Study | 9 |
| Significance of the Study | 13 |
| Conclusion | 14 |

CHAPTER TWO: Review of Related Literature

| Introduction | 15 |
|---|----|
| Capacity Building Continuum | 16 |
| Development within Rural and Community Contexts | 19 |
| Does Foreign Aid Embrace Power and Authority? | 23 |
| Empowerment/ and Consciousness-raising | |
| Conclusion | 26 |

CHAPTER THREE: Research Design and Methodology

| Identification and Description of the Research Approach | 28 |
|---|----|
| Case Study Approach | 29 |
| Sampling Approach and Techniques | 29 |
| Research Methods and Instruments | 30 |
| Triangulation of Methods | 34 |
| Data Analysis | 36 |
| Limitations and Ethical Considerations | 38 |
| Conclusion | 40 |
| | |

CHAPTER FOUR: Boseele's Growth and Survival : Does Foreign Aid Make a Difference

| Introduction | 41 |
|--|----|
| Overview of the History | 43 |
| Boseele-'Mate Nursery Project: 2000 – 2005 | 47 |
| CIDA Funding: 2005 – 2007 | 51 |
| Networking, Collaboration and Alliances | 56 |
| Irish Aid and EU 2007 – 2010 | 59 |
| Will EU funding make a difference? | 61 |
| Conclusion | 64 |

CHAPTER FIVE: Testimonies of Members

| Introduction | 66 |
|---|----|
| Mapheelle's Health Centre Success | |
| Job Opportunities and a "Project failure" | 70 |
| Comment | 72 |
| Morena Peete's Farming and leadership | 74 |
| Comment | 76 |
| Orphan and Child-headed Household Challenges | 77 |
| Development Interventions for Immediate Needs | 78 |
| Comment | 80 |
| Conclusion | 80 |

CHAPTER SIX: Conclusion and Recommendations

| Introduction | 82 |
|--|----|
| Diverse environments and frameworks | 82 |
| Empowerment of individuals | 83 |
| Capacity development interventions | 84 |
| Power dynamics in development projects | 84 |
| Does foreign aid make a difference? | 86 |
| Further studies | 86 |

References

Appendices

| Α. | INTERVIEW GUIDE (TRANSLATED INTO SESOTHO) | 90 |
|---|--|-----|
| В. | CONTACT AND OBSERVATION CHECKLIST | 93 |
| C. DOCUMENT SUMMARY RECORD | | |
| D. | INTERVIEW LIST AND RESEARCH SCHEDULE | 101 |
| Table | es | |
| Table | 1 - Local Government Strategies Plan | 41 |
| Figui | res | |
| Figure | e 1 - Map of Lesotho | 3 |
| Figure 2 - Developmental Basic Model to Change 2 | | |
| Figure 3 - Roaming animals | | |
| Figure | e 4 - Morena Lira Peete and Oscar Maphuroane | 42 |
| Figure | e 5 - Gabions | 50 |
| Figure | e 6 - Mr Makhema Khanare | 71 |
| Figure 7 - Khanare, Nkhono Makhahliso and Thabelang 7 | | |

List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

| CIDA | Canadian International Development Agency |
|-----------------|---|
| CSOs/NSAs | Civil Society organisations/Non-State Actors |
| - CBOs | Community-Based Organisations |
| - NGOs | Non-Governmental Organisations |
| - FBOs | Faith-based Organisations |
| DDLO | District Development Liaison Office/r |
| DVS/MS-Lesotho | Danish Volunteers Service known as MS-Lesotho |
| ECD | Early Childhood Development |
| EDA-L | European Development Agencies in Lesotho |
| ETDP | Education, Training and Development |
| | Practice/Practitioner |
| EU – EC - LGNSP | European Union - European Commission - Local |
| | Governance and Non State Actors Programme |
| GoL | Government of Lesotho |
| GTZ | Deutsche Gesellschaft fur Technische Zusammenarbett |
| HIV and AIDS | Human Immunodeficiency Virus – Acquired Immuno |
| | deficiency Syndrome |
| IMF | International Monetary Fund |
| LCN | Lesotho Council of Non-Governmental Organisations |
| LHWP | Lesotho Highlands Water Project |
| MoU-MoA | Memorandum of Understanding/Agreement |
| NUL-IEMS | National University of Lesotho - Institute of Extra |
| | Mural Studies |
| SCIL - | Strengthening Civil Society in Lesotho |
| SMMEs | Small and Medium Enterprises |
| UK - DfID | United Kingdom - Department for International |
| | Development |
| UN - MDGs | United Nations - Millennium Development Goals |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| USAID | United States of America International |
| | Development Aid |
| WV-ADPs | World Vision Area Development Projects |
| | |