

https://dspace.org/

Kwashuba, kwabhalwa, kwaphola?: A study of mediated perceptions of the Alexandra xenophobic riots

Ngwane, Simphiwe Blessing Mthokozelwa

2015-02-04
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/16869

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

UNIVERSITY OF THE WITWATERSRAND

JOHANNESBURG

Kwashuba, kwabhalwa, kwaphola?[1] A Study of mediated perceptions of the Alexandra xenophobic riots.

A dissertation submitted to the Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Master of Arts, September 2014

Simphiwe Blessing Mthokozelwa Ngwane

Student number: 717988

[1] The situation gets tense, the situation gets written about, the situation subsides?

Declaration

I_____(Student number:_____) am a Student registered for the degree of _____in the academic year _____.

I hereby declare the following:

- I am aware that plagiarism (the use of someone else's work without their permission and/or without acknowledging the original source) is wrong
- I confirm that the work submitted for assessment for the above degree is my own unaided work except where I have explicitly indicated otherwise.
- I have followed the required conventions in referencing the thoughts and ideas of others.
- I understand that the University of the Witwatersrand may take disciplinary action against me if there is a belief that this is not my own unaided work or that I have failed to acknowledge the source of the ideas in my writing.

Signature: _____Date: _____

The Dream of a Dozen Orgies

'In the dream, I saw twelve men and women emerging from the Jukskei River. Their hands turned into knives and forks. They ran about sharpening these on rocks, brick walls and concrete pavements. They then turned and started chasing after each other. They sliced off each others' sex organs and roasted them on rocks along the river bank. They indulged in frenzied dancing and feasting. They ululated, while others started wailing, ranting and scratching their bodies. They poured the blood into wine glasses and offered toasts to each other.'

(Rapola, 2007, p. 169)

Abstract

My thesis aims to analyse the print media and broadcast media, and how they communicate, mediated and crafted meaning around the May 2008 xenophobic riots. This study adopts a 'whole-age' analysis of news coverage, so as to examine the topological layout and the relationship between continuous texts, photographs, captions and most importantly latent and manifest messages in the media. It aims to broaden and deepen the social, political and historical thrust of analyses of various narratives in more intrinsic ways. The thesis is informed by the school of thought (Hanks, 1989; Briggs, 1996) that narratives have dialogic characters, extracting discourse from one setting and inserting it in a new setting so as to facilitate and foster understanding by drawing on common frames of reference and from readers' memories. Through a critical discourse and semiotic analysis, this study analyses mediations of violence and starts with perceptions, through the reportage of a multilingual sample of news: *iSolezwe* (isiZulu daily newspaper), *iLanga* (isiZulu biweekly newspaper), *Alex News* (fortnightly community newspaper), the *Daily Sun* (daily tabloid), and the *Mail and Guardian* (weekly newspaper). I examine how in a span of three weeks (11 May - 3 June 2008), these five newspapers covered the xenophobic riots – I pay particular attention to what emphases they foregrounded and how they narrated the violence. I further analyse three television news reports, two SABC news reports produced by *Special Assignment* and one eTV news report produced by *3rd Degree*. I examine how they commentated on the riots and what silences existed in their commentary. Lastly, I examine the Bona Fides civic movement as a mediating lens for the enactment of citizenship and negotiation of democracy. The interviews conducted in Alexandra uncovered respondents' understanding of citizenship and local discourse pertaining to insiders and outsiders. The interviews act as a mediation vehicle and give glimpses of local perceptions which exist in 2013 and, from my reading, also existed back in 2008. This selection of the media showed how pan-African identity, and interestingly, a Zulu Diaspora narrative were used to mediate the violence and foster a culture of integration. The various modes of the media illustrated South Africa's vibrant political economy in 2008. Moreover, this sample illustrates how a strategic usage of autochthony was employed and deployed by frustrated South Africans, and also how the negotiation of democracy was central to this media selection and selected respondents.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Without the scholarship award from the South African Netherlands Research Programme on Alternatives in Development (SANPAD) and the Wits Postgraduate Merit Award (PMA), this study would not have been possible, many thanks for the financial assistance and indeed, investing in my intellectual growth.

Professor L. Gunner, thank you for the supervision.

Many thanks also go to Duma Kulashe the president of the Alexandra Bona Fides civic movement and to the members of this small, but yet pertinent movement. I am also greatful to Ms. Daphney Setho from the SABC who when the SABC delivery service division were on strike, personally drove out to WITS to deliver the recordings I had bought.

I would also like to extend a big thank you to the immense individuals at WISER especially to Adila Deshmukh, Catherine Burns, Najibha Deshmukh and Keith Breckenridge. Many thanks for your support and help throughout my stay at office number 19.

To my younger sister Fezeka, my partner Sphelele and my friends; Sizo, Thembi, Lerato and many others, thank you for the support and the many laughs when I needed to exhale.

Dedication

No other person in my entire life deserves this honour but my beloved big sister Thobile Ngwane. Canadian author Yann Martel in his 2010 novel *Beatrice and Virgil* wrote, 'one is loved, because one is loved. There is no reason for loving'. Since the early departure of both our parents you have been a great pillar of strength, support and immense love to Fezeka, myself and most importantly and deservingly to Sandile. The former Deputy Vice-Chancellor of Research (WITS) Professor Helen Laburn once said, 'self-esteem doesn't come by being told you are great. Rather, self-steem comes as a result of having achieved something great'. You have raised Fezeka, Sandile and myself rather well, a great achievement indeed as all three of us are feisty individuals. I am proud of this thesis and with much sincerity and love; I dedicate it to you Thobile 'Tobsy' Ngwane.

Table of Contents

1 Chapter One: Introduction

1.1. Introduction……..……11 - 15

1.2. Literature review and theoretical framework..……15 - 21

1.3. Research Methodology……..…21 - 23

1.4. The Analysis……..……..……..…….23 – 25

1.5. Thesis outline……25 -26

2 Chapter Two: Media Representation: Culture and Historical Memory

2.0. Introduction……..……27 - 28

2.1. *Azixoxwe izindaba:* Addressing the nation……..28

2.2. *iSolezwe liwela umfula ugcwele:* A murky middle ground……..……..29

2.3. *iSolezwe*: A two rudder narrative…….....…30 – 33

2.4. Stormy waters with Msholozi's rudder……..32

2.5. Mutliple shifts in *iSolezwe's* position……..…32 - 34

2.6. Msholozi's rudder and Mbeki's shadow…..……..…34

2.7. The xenophobic wave hits Durban: Leaders act……35 - 36

2.8. The crisis and Mbeki's shadow…...……..36

2.9. The Union Building and Luthuli House: Leader's inactions and action……..……36 – 37

2.10. The human face of the government's tardiness……..……37 - 38

2.11. *iSolezwe's* shifts, tensions and ambivalence……38

2.2 Section 2: *iLanga*……..…39

2.2.1. *iLanga iphepha lesizwe*: The past and its possible solutions?.....39

2.2.2. An IFP rudder and an ANC ripple…..……..…40 – 41

2.2.3. The past is a foreign country: The Place of customs…..……..…41 – 42

2.2.4. A culture of integration……..……42 – 43

2.2.5. The Past: They did things differently there……..43 – 45

2.2.6. An IFP rudder and more ANC ripples...……..……45 – 47

2.2.7. Freedom's sell-by-date: A letter on the xenophobic riots……..…47 - 48

2.2.8. History versus day-to-day: A step back……48 - 49

2.2.9. Relations and integration……49 – 50

2.2.10. *iLanga lashona:* Narrative undercurrents……..…….....50 - 51

2.2.11. Conclusion: One language with two tongues……51 – 52

3 Chapter Three: Media representation and divergent narratives of crisis

3.0. Introduction……..……..……...53 - 54

3.1. News and its making: English for three audiences……..…..54

3.2. Section One..……...……55

3.2.1. *Alex News*, "Sisonke": The community's mouthpiece……55

3.2.2. Alexandra 2008: Tensions brew, tensions rise……..……55 – 57

3.2.3. Alexandra erupts and missing leadership?.....57 – 59

3.2.4. Xenophobia: Our story to tell……59 – 61

3.2.5. Tensions and undercurrents……..……61 – 62

3.3. Section Two…..……...62

3.3.1. The Daily Sun: The people's paper……..……62 - 63

3.3.2. Of Aliens and citizens……63 – 64

3.3.3. National soul searching……..……...64 – 65

3.3.4. Wider scope and narrative shifts……..……66 – 67

3.3.5. Xenophobia on the ground: Conflated narratives……..…67

3.3.6. Leadership, factionalism and action?.....66 - 68

3.3.7. Condemnation, frustrations and hindsight……...68 – 69

3.3.8. Anger, understanding and retrospect……...69 – 70

3.4. Section Three..……70

3.4.1. The Mail and Guardian: A crafted narrative……70

3.4.2. Our disappointments and actions……71 – 72

3.4.3. Addressing the crisis, and narrating failures……72

3.4.4. Lives on the margin and Zuluness……...72 – 74

3.4.5. Zuma and the politics of the governed……..74

3.4.6. Non-inclusive identities……74 - 75

3.4.7. Political awkwardness and an unlikely leader……...75 – 77

3.4.8. Crafted, introspective and nuanced?.....77 - 78

3.5. Conclusion: South Africa and English for three……78 – 79

4 Chapter Four: Sites of meaning making: Three televisions reports

4.0. Introduction……..…80 - 82

4.1. Television news reports: Seeing the selected and processed……82

4.2. The nation-state and the citizenry: 'Affirmative' repossession…….....82 – 85

4.3. Contrasting views from the ground: *Savota!*.....85 - 87

4.4. The politics of necessity and growing pessimism……..…….…87 – 89

4.5. Filling the silence: Repertories of performance……89 – 93

4.6. Trails run deep and relations go back……93 – 95

4.7. Conclusion: Staged and un-staged television reportage……..95 – 96

5 Chapter Five: The Bona Fides: Searching for a Present?

5.0. Introduction.....97 - 98

5.1. Vocalized perceptions: The lived experience of democracy……...……98 – 99

5.2. '*Ama'Bona Fides, argh, amanzi amacane'*: The organization and its activities……99

5.2.1. Mapping the terrain……...99 – 100

5.2.2. Aims, actions and frustrations: Vehicle of mediation……...100 – 104

5.3. Kings Cinema: Addressing the community and defining belonging……..…104 – 105

5.4. We are still waiting: Long awaited democracy……..……105 – 109

5.5. *Ama'jaridi namalungelo*: Hope and despair……...109 – 110

5.6. Conclusion: Sisalindile…….....110 – 111

6 Chapter Six: Conclusion: *Kwashuba, kwabhalwa, kwaphola?*.....112 – 116

Bibliography……117 - 131

1. Chapter One: Introduction

"It's about a society on its way down, and as it falls, it keeps telling itself, 'So far so good…so far so good…so far so good.'" (*La Haine*, 1995)

1.1 Introduction

On the 11th of May 2008 during Africa Month, xenophobic riots erupted in parts of Alexandra Township. The Reconstruction Area RCA (also known as Beirut) and extension Seven were the worst affected areas in Alexandra. The worst of the violence lasted three weeks, spreading to other areas of Gauteng and the country, and resulted in the killing of more than 60 people, dozens of rapes, wounding 700 people and more than 100 000 were displaced. Most of these people were African foreign nationals but a third were South Africans (Landau, 2011). A significant number of scholars, civil society and research institutes have written about the xenophobic riots (Hassim, Kupe & Worby, 2008; Hadland, 2008; Sichone, 2008; Tafira, 2009; McLennan, 2009; Landau, Misago & Monson, 2009; Landau, 2010, 2011) and most illustrated that ideas of belonging and notions of protection of circuits of powers (township micro-politics) and riches (government housing scheme) were central to the riots.

Working in this particularly short period of time, my thesis explores how a selected sample of isiZulu-language and English-language print media, together with selected English-language broadcast media communicated and mediated the May 2008 xenophobic riots over a three week period. The thesis further examines interviews conducted in Alexandra five years after the xenophobic riots and explores how residents who belong to the Bona Fides civic movement remembered the xenophobic riots. From the chosen three week period, the thesis examines one hundred and ninety seven articles of news collected from isiZulu-Language, English-Language print media and three television reports from English-Language broadcast media. Such a purposefully small but diverse cross-section of the media offers a new methodological lens to studying the May 2008 xenophobic riots as they were represented in the media.

My thesis is concerned with the mediation of the xenophobic riots and how meaning was negotiated and communicated by the media during the xenophobic riots. Mediation as defined by Louise Meintjes is a 'process that connects and translates disparate worlds, people, imaginations, values, and ideas, whether in its symbolic, social, or technological form' (Meintjes, 2003, p. 8). Furthermore I examine communicated narratives, as they constitute powerful means of shaping social interactions and guiding understanding. The print media foregrounded various tropes and emphases through their narratives and journalistic modalities (tabloid, community newspaper, investigative newspaper) as they attempted

to mediate the xenophobic riots. Most importantly the media invoked South Africa's historical struggle debt to her neighbouring African states and also invoked a pan-African identity and a Zulu national identity to foster unity and integration.

The print media, broadcast media and interviews illustrate how various archival repositories of history could be used and mobilised for various ends. Donald Donham contends that, 'even the most horrific acts of aggression do not stand as isolated exemplars of a 'thing' called violence but cast ripples that configure lives in the most dramatic of ways, affecting constructs of identity in the present, the hopes and the potentialities of the future, and even renditions of the past' (1994, p. 5). The print media is crucial in understanding the xenophobic riots of 2008, as it helps to restructure a reader's sense of time and space, creating an impression of engagement with a wider continuous drama of 'public' events, within which their lives and communities take on new meanings (Barker & Burrows, 2002, p. 4).

My thesis illustrates that Alexandra's past is important in understanding the eruption of xenophobic violence in May 2008, as texts (written and oral) are dialogical and multifaceted. Mikhail Bakhtin posits that, 'there can be neither a first nor a last meaning; [anything that can be understood] always exists among other meanings as a link in the chain of meaning, which in its totality is the only thing that can be real' (1999, p. ix).

By adopting a 'whole-age' analysis (Fowler 1991) the thesis will explore how meaningful discourse (Hall 2012) was crafted in the news to lend meaning to the May 2008 xenophobic riots.

The thesis examines language in its written and oral form. I further examine notions of rights and frustrations mediated by the print media and broadcast media. Through the conducted interviews of Alexandrans I examine the respondents' notions of enacted citizenship, democracy and their ideas of what it means to be a South African in the post-apartheid era. Nyamnjoh writing on political freedom and citizenship, contends that if constitutional rights are threatened by the state,

> Individuals at different levels of society are expected, again in principle, to be able to mobilise themselves as 'individuals linked by common interests', to defend their freedom. (Nyamnjoh, 2006, p. 25)

Through a substantive understanding of democracy (Zuern, 2011) a normative understanding of legality and legitimacy (Monson, 2011) and a residential character of citizenship (Klaaren, 2011), frustrated South Africans and some Alexandrans, enacted their claims to citizenship and the media mediated their deep seated frustrations. The mediated public sphere communicated certain public idioms of certain

frustrated South Africans, and narrated these to their specific audiences. A critical discourse analysis of divergent print media across two languages, together with a semiotic analysis of English-Language broadcast media, ending with a critical discourse analysis of interviews conducted in Alexandra will bring a new methodological lens to studying episodes of the Alexandra xenophobic violence.

1.1.2 Aim

Through the three key themes: mediation, negotiation and communication, this study aims to illustrate how words, ideas, and tropes circulate and can be mobilised during periods of tension, as meaning is created using public idioms (Fowler, 1991). By adopting Fowler's 'whole-age'[2](Fowler, 1991) theoretical analysis, the thesis aims to conduct a critical discourse and semiotic analysis on three weeks worth of coverage produced by *iSolezwe, iLanga, Alex News, Daily Sun,* the *Mail & Guardian, Special Assignment* and *3rd Degree*. By illustrating the various tropes used by these media sources and by studying these subtleties the thesis will explore how in some cases, ethnicity was mobilised to evoke solidarity. This will be achieved by examining a purposefully small but diverse cross-section of isiZulu-language and English-language media that covered the riots. The papers I drew from were aimed at very different readers and though my sample is limited it provides a divergent sample of South Africa's multi-layered public sphere. In addition, I examine how members belonging to the Bona Fides civic movement remembered the xenophobic riots in Alexandra five years after the riots.

1.1.3 Rationale

The thesis contends that an exploration of a purposefully small but diverse multilingual cross-section sample of news will yield itself as an insightful study of how meaning was crafted around xenophobic violence using particular sets of meaningful discourses. A critical discourse analysis of divergent and multilingual print media, together with a semiotic analysis of English-language broadcast media[3], can tell us new things about how divergent isiZulu-language and English-language media communicated and mediated the May 2008 xenophobic riots.

Popular media in Africa serve as sites for multiplicitous constructions of citizenship, identity and democratic participation, but also as terrains of conflict, where notions of nationhood and citizenship are contested (Wasserman, 2011, p. 14). Thus, exploring how the print and broadcast media mediated, communicated and crafted their meaning requires a two part analysis: critical discourse and semiotic analysis. These analyses will be used to examine the multiple subtleties in print and broadcast media and how they (the media) crafted meaningful discourse using selected tropes.

[2] The examination of a media page (the topology), on how latent meaning drifts from one news report to a photo-journalistic article, resulting in a more complicated set of possible meanings.
[3] Within the English-language broadcast media I further examine isiZulu songs.

The study of the press cannot be isolated from the broader contexts in which it operates; different contexts can lead to considerable divergences, even at a single historical moment (Barker & Burrows, 2002, p. 2). A case in point is the Witwatersrand hostel violence of the early 1990's. Bonner and Ndima argue that the media coverage of these violent episodes created a 'binary' (Zulu-IFP supporter vs. Xhosa-ANC supporter), thus allowing the manipulation of ideals of tribalism for political purposes (Bonner & Ndima, 2009, p. 363).

I have chosen to use isiZulu and English media as the focus of my thesis because these media are part of many people's lives and are read and viewed on a daily basis. This is to say that, news conveys and narrates public opinion and facilitates the public sphere. I chose to examine isiZulu-language newspapers and their coverage of the xenophobic riots because no one had examined their coverage of the riots before. IsiZulu is the most widely spoken language in Johannesburg but its mother tongue speakers consist of less than a third of the city's population; thus it is the language of the public domain (Ndlovu, 2011; Steinberg, 2012; Distiller 2012). My selection of English-Language newspapers was guided by the fact that English-language newspapers dominate circulation figures and are influential as English is the lingua franca of Southern African political discourse (McDonald and Jacobs, 2007, p.298).

This study is important because while there have been studies that examined the media coverage of the 2008 xenophobic riots (Eliseev 2008; Harber, 2008; Gomo, 2010 and Monson & Arian, 2011) there is still a gap for a study which will examine a purposefully small multilingual cross-section of both print and broadcast media. By performing a critical discourse analysis and a semiotic analysis on the selected cross-section multilingual print and broadcast media, such a study will do more than recreating the May 2008 xenophobic riots. It will uncover how meaningful discourses were employed by the print and broadcast media as they communicated and mediated the xenophobic riots.

My sample of the media attempts to fill this gap through what Roger Fowler terms a 'whole-age analysis' of the print media and broadcast media (1991, p. 225). By examining such a purposefully small multilingual selection of the news, the thesis proposes a nuanced methodological lens to exploring how meaning was mediated and communicated in multilingual media spaces.

1.1.4 Research Questions

My overarching research question in this body of work is: How is meaning made and negotiated during episodes of violence? Further, how is it then mediated and communicated in the media? Lastly, how do people living in Alexandra five years after the riots remember the May 2008 xenophobic riots?

1.2. Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

1.2.1. Literature Review

The thesis pivots on three key themes: mediation, negotiation and communication and this section foregrounds selected literature on the media and illustrates their importance in studying a cross-section of the media.

Charles Briggs in his 1996 work, '*Disorderly Discourse, Narrative, and Inequality*', posits that representation of conflict frequently form central foci of expressive economies (1996, p. 3). Conflict is a process, not a state and narratives capture and convey these conflicts. Briggs argues that narratives constitute crucial means of generating, sustaining, mediating, and representing conflict (p. 3). Briggs contends that,

> When one set of interpretations comes to be accepted as the authoritative account of a conflict and as the basis for shaping outcomes, however, this outcome must not be seen as a natural product or communicative processes than as a particular social construction; attention can thus be directed towards grasping what types of material and symbolic capital were achieving this result and the ways in which they were deployed (Briggs, 1996, p. 18)

Briggs' work is pertinent as it calls for a broadening and deepening of the social, political, and historical thrust of analyses which will allow for studies that will examine communication in more intrinsic way. Communication as a form of mediation carries dialogic character, extracting discourse from one setting and inserting it in a new setting so as to facilitate and foster understanding by drawing on common frames of reference from readers' memories.

Moreover, there is nothing natural or neutral about the production and manufacturing of news. The Habermasian public sphere in the form of the media can both be promoted and constricted by those that produce news (Wasserman, 2011). Fowler argues that the content of newspapers does not

comprise facts about the world, but in a very general sense 'ideas' (1991, p. 1). All news is always reported from some particular angle, as anything that is said or written about the world is articulated from a particular ideological position (Fowler, 1991, p. 5).

News is governed by conventions such as normative media theory which concerns itself with the question, 'how do the media cover different perspectives in a society?' (Wasserman, 2011, p. 27). Taking into account their audience, each of the isiZulu-language and the English-language newspapers provided differing reportage; *iSolezwe* began with an ambivalent stance but through its editorials shifted its position. *ILanga* foregrounded the notion of pan African identity and Zulu nationalism as a guiding myth (see chapter Two). *Alex News* was engrossed in the community and mostly mirrored their sentiments uncritically. The *Daily Sun* had many shifts, from uncertainty to condemnation. The *Mail & Guardian* provided a crafted narrative with many themes, providing a stratified narrative, highlighting the complexity of the riots. News is the end product of a complex process which begins with a systematic sorting and selecting of events and topics according to a socially constructed set of categories (Fowler, 1991, p. 12).The selection process is accompanied by transformation, differential treatment in presentation according to numerous political, economic and social factors (Fowler, 1991, p. 11). Moreover, each of the newspapers had tensions and disharmonies between the news reports, editorials, letters and pictorial news, illustrating the complexity of mediating the riots and communicating to different perspectives in society.

Stanley Cohen and Jack Young contend that the media neither simply supply information and entertainment nor do they mechanically implant attitudes into the heads of their recipients (1973, p. 9). A case in point is the Media Monitoring Project's complaint submitted to the Press Ombudsman in 2008, protesting over the *Daily Sun's* crass reportage over the xenophobic riots. My examination of the *Daily Sun* (see chapter Three) illustrates a much more layered set of meanings and angles. Throughout its coverage it reflected many positions and perspectives, initially taking an assertive stance, 'telling' as opposed to 'showing' the news. As the violence escalated the tabloid providing a 'national soul searching' angle, contributing to its multilayered reporting.

News relies on cultural proximity which facilitates understanding. *Isolezwe* and *iLanga* provide ways in which idiomatic writing and an inclusive 'we' in the isiZulu-language print media used cultural proximity to facilitate understanding. Moreover, strategic usage of cultural history and the Zulu Diaspora narrative were used by *iLanga* in its editorials, calling upon solidarity as Nxumalo in his editorial wrote, '*ngabantu bakithi*' [we are one and the same people] (*iLanga*, June, 2008, p. 5).

Newspapers and their readers share a common 'discursive competence' (Fowler, 1991, p. 44), furthermore, news reflects and in return shapes the prevailing values of a society in a particular historical context (p. 222). For example, chapters Two, Three and Four illustrate the thick political climate, notions of rights and understanding of democracy held by marginalized sectors of certain communities. My thesis examines these various tropes invoked by the media as they crafted meaning around the xenophobic violence, through varying forms of cultural proximity as they mediated and communicated the riots.

By examining 197 isiZulu-language and English-language media articles collated in a three week period during the 2008 xenophobic riots, a critical discourse analysis reveals key tropes used by divergent print and broadcast media to mediate and communicate the riots. Jan Blommaert and Jeff Verschueren argue that scholars should not confuse editorials in newspapers with public opinion, rather scholars should examine implicit frames of reference (1998, p. 190). Texts have implicit assumptions that they expect their readers to share with them, a careful analysis of those implicit assumptions will reveal a common frame of reference or 'ideology' (p. 191). Editorials are important in newspapers as they highlight a newspaper's ideology but contestations do exist between editorials, news reports, images and their captions and letters by readers.

The thesis through a critical discourse and semiotic analysis examines a purposefully small yet wide sample of the isiZulu-language and English-language print and broadcast media to proffer a nuanced methodological lens to examining a multilingual sample of news, communicating violence through selected and negotiated tropes. The semiotic analysis on the English-language broadcast media examines the interviewers, interviewees and the unmentioned songs that also mediated and communicated key public perceptions through performative repertoires.

Following Stuart Hall, I believe that when photographs appear in newspapers, they add new dimensions to a text (1973, p. 176). Hall argues that at the expressive level, the photograph signifies within the lexicon of expressive features distributed throughout the culture of which the reader is a member (p. 177). Photographs can also exhibit a second order message, amplified in its caption and headlines; this is achieved by linking the photograph with an interpretation which exploits its connotative value (p. 185). *ILanga* provides a key example (see chapter Two) of an image exhibiting complex latent and manifest messages highlighting the complex political terrain in 2008, together with news reports on the same spread, the photograph of rioting Cosatu members carrying a black make-

shift bazoola with a yellow inscription, '*Msholozi, umshini wami*' [Msholozi[4], my machine gun] and news report provided a considered and complex narrative.

The above selected media assertions are important in my thesis, as they aid in how I decode the selected news products and their discursive competence (Fowler, 1991). Further, they will contribute to my critical discourse analysis of the selected isiZulu-language and English-language print media. The selected media literature and the below specific media coverage on xenophobic riots, act as a funnel towards the theoretical perspective which will be the scaffolding of the thesis.

1.2.3. The xenophobic riots and media coverage

The literature on the xenophobic riots is vast and varies in its focus, but a gap exists for a study that performs a critical discourse and semiotic analysis on a purposefully small yet limited sample of the isiZulu-language and English-language print and broadcast media.

One of the first studies conducted was orchestrated by the Human Sciences Research Council and the Democracy and Governance Programme (June 2008). The study was collated through focus groups (made of only South Africans) in Alexandra, Mamelodi, Tembisa and Imizamo Yethu and aimed to gain an understanding of the views held by these communities about foreigners and xenophobia (June 2008, p. 5). Amongst many catalysts (frustration and anger being key), the study found that the most important trigger for the xenophobic riots had been the occupation of national housing stock by non-South African citizens (June 2008, p. 9). Hadland (2008), Landau, Misago and Monson (2009) and Landau (2011) postulated a variety of arguments, and individual communities' micro-politics seemed to explain some cases of the violence (Misago, Landau and Monson, 2009; Misago 2011). Hadland's work aimed to articulate consensual principles, which communities could adhere to, in order to avoid future xenophobic riots (2008) and a recurring theme in the principles was that of education and integration.

Literature on the media coverage of the 2008 xenophobic riots is sparse but a few contributions have been made which focus only on English-language media. Harber (2008), Eliseev (2008), Gomo (2010) and Monson and Arian (2011) are scholars who have focused on the media coverage, with varying arguments. Eliseev (2008), a reporter for *The Star* newspaper provided a 'torn narrative of violence' which illustrated how xenophobic violence besmirched South Africa's rainbow-nation narrative and gave glimpses into the moulding of news reports. Eliseev illustrated how in writing a news report historical memory was woven into the narrative (2008, p. 28) and terms employed for their loaded nature. Gomo

[4] Jacob Zuma's best known praise name.

(2010) in his MA thesis conducted a content analysis and through interviews, analysed thirty six news media to explore how content might have contributed to 2008 xenophobic attitudes.

His reception study was flawed and lacked nuance, and he suggested that the media could have been responsible for the xenophobic attitudes. The role of the media is not necessarily a didactic one. The media during the xenophobic riots had two prime responsibilities: to report what was happening in communities whilst being careful not to contribute unduly to the problem by internalising xenophobic language and uncritically mirroring xenophobic sentiments (Danso and McDonald, 2001, p. 117).

Harber (2008) examined the coverage of the *Daily Sun* and *The Star* and their varying angles. Harber, by juxtaposing these two vastly different English-Language newspapers, illustrated the complex nature of news creation, guided by their different audience bases. The juxtaposition was perhaps too stark; the binary argument eclipsed the shifts in position and the metadiscursive[5] practise (Briggs, 1996, p. 19) at work in the media and other media which covered the xenophobic riots. Monson and Arian's (2011) work attempted to historcise the May 2008 xenophobic media 'facts' through a process they called, 'simultaneous construction and deconstruction' (2011, p. 26). They analysed the silences and amnesia and argued that, 'to alienate the information from its discursive context risked erasing an important dimension of the popular discourse on the attacks' (2011, p. 29).

My study adopts this argument but furthers it by employing a critical discourse and semiotic analysis on 197 isiZulu-language and English-language print media news articles, three English-language broadcast media shows, and twelve interviews of people living in Alexandra, five years after the xenophobic riots. I position my study as decoding the meaningful discourse (Hall, 2012) in my purposefully small and multilingual media sample as the print and broadcast media crafted various meaning of the xenophobic violence as they communicated and mediated the riots.

1.2.4 Theoretical Framework

My thesis pivots on how the media communicated and mediated the 2008 xenophobic riots in the print and broadcast media and further, how people living in Alexandra five years after the riots, remembered the xenophobic riots. The theoretical framework I will be employing draws from Roger Fowler's work on language and news, together with Mikhail Bakhtin's work on speech, as I examine how various media communicated and mediated the xenophobic riots.

[5] Similar to Hanks notion of meta-text, which is any discourse that refers to, describes, or frames the interpretation of text (Hanks, 1989).

Roger Fowler's seminal work, *Language and News - Discourse and ideology in the Press* will be a key piece of theoretical literature in my thesis as I employ his theoretical concept of a 'whole-age'[6] analysis on my study sample. This concept entails examining the topological layout and the relationship between continuous text, pictures, cartoons, captions and advertisements and most importantly the latent and manifest messages in newspapers (1991, p. 225). The concept further entails examining the tensions and disharmonies found in news, exhibiting the complex nature of news production.

Fowler further posits that language has a cognitive role as it provides an organised mental representation of our experience (1991, p. 3). Different languages not only possess different vocabularies but also, by means of linguistic differences, map the world of experience in different ways (Fowler, 1991, p. 29). Fowler's conception of the term - 'public idiom' entails the language employed by a newspaper which will be the newspapers own version of the language of the public to whom it is principally addressing (p. 40). Fowler further argues that language in news performs three simultaneous functions which are; 'ideational', 'interpersonal', and 'textual' (p. 69). My thesis is primarily concerned with the last of these – textual, which is the function of using language to make links with situations in creating discourse in news (p. 69).

By analysing 'public idioms' and the various tropes used to convey cultural proximity in the print and broadcast media, the thesis using Fowler's whole-age theoretical analysis fills the gap which exists in the current literature on the media coverage of the 2008 xenophobic riots. To analyse texts in the media further requires the ability to interpret texts. The interpretation of text is contingent on the added increment of information from without (Hanks, 1989, p. 104). Most importantly texts are mobile, as they can be decontextualised and recontextualised many times over.

Furthermore, Russian philosopher and literary critic Mikhail Bakhtin's seminal work, *Speech Genres,* is used in the thesis as his work broadens the meaning and understanding of written and oral utterance. Bakhtin argues that language is realised in the form of individual concrete utterances (oral and written) by participants in the various areas of human activity (Bakhtin, 1999, p. 60).

Using the Fowler's theoretical concept of a whole-age analysis the study performs a critical discourse analysis on a purposefully small yet limited sample of isiZulu-language and English-language print media. Moreover, using a semiotic analysis I employ Bakhtin's understanding of utterance to examine the broadcast media. Bakhtin's concept of utterance is also used when performing a critical discourse analysis of the Alexandra interviews. The two selected theoretical approaches contribute to meeting the

[6]The examination of a media page (the topology), on how latent meaning drifts from one news report to a photo-journalistic article, resulting in a more complicated set of possible meanings.

set aim of the thesis, which is to examine how the selected isiZulu-language and the English-Language print and broadcast media communicated and mediated the xenophobic riots using selected public idioms.

1.3. Research Methodology

Coupled with the above selected theoretical assertions, I have chosen to employ a critical discourse and semiotic analysis as my methodological tool. My aim in conducting a critical discourse analysis on the selected multilingual data is to examine multiple subtleties in the isiZulu-language and English-language print media. This I do, by utilizing Hall's four-stage theory of communication (Hall, 2012) as a bridging medium, connecting my theoretical selection to my methodological tools. By examining news as a product I as a researcher in this thesis aim to decode the crafted meaningful discourse (Hall, 2012, p. 138) used by the selected isiZulu-Language and English-Language newspapers. Decoding the crafted meaningful discourse requires an understanding of various public idioms used by the media to communicate and mediate the riots. Moreover, to explore the latent and manifest messages in the media requires an understanding of various social matrixes' and discursive competence (Fowler, 1991), and to excavate these, I conducted a critical discourse and semiotic analysis on the multilingual print, broadcast media and conducted interviews.

1.3.1 The Data

The thesis examines a necessarily limited but purposely small multilingual sample of news which covered the May 2008 xenophobic riots, and ends with an examination of interviews conducted in Alexandra. Through a critical discourse analysis the thesis analysed 197 English and isiZulu media articles. The data collected was retrieved from various archival sites. The isiZulu-Language newspapers; *iSolezwe* and *iLanga* were accessed through the Bessie Head (uMgungundlovu) Municipal library in Pietermaritzburg. The English-Language newspapers' were located in Johannesburg: the *Alex News* community newspaper was accessed in the Caxton Offices in Signal Hill, the *Daily Sun* tabloid was accessed in the Media24 Offices in Auckland Park and the *Mail and Guardian* was accessed in the William Cullen library at the University of the Witwatersrand. Two television news reports were procured through the SABC offices in Auckland Park and one was procured from eTV at their Hyde Park Offices.

The thesis analyses a number of news reports, editorials, photo-journalistic articles and letters. In my analysis of *iSolezwe* I analyse twenty news reports, two editorials, three photo-journalistic articles and six letters. In *iLanga* I analyse two editorials, one news report, one photo-journalistic article and one

letter. In *Alex News* I analyse eighteen news reports and three letters. In the *Daily Sun* I analyse thirty-four photo-journalistic articles, thirty news reports, twenty-seven letters and two editorials. Lastly, in the *Mail and Guardian* I analyse three photo-journalistic articles, twenty-two news reports and twelve letters.

The question of sampling is essential in ensuring that the project is externally valid and that the findings can be applied more widely to other studies and generalised in the future (Gunter, 2000). In this thesis I wanted to find out a number of things (illustrated below) about the mediation of violence through various forms of the media. For this study I had to decide what newspapers to analyse (illustrated above), how many editions, over what period of time and what parts of the newspapers were to be analysed. I decided to collect and analyse newspaper material produced by the mentioned newspapers from the 11th of May till the 6th of June 2008.

In total the thesis examines one-hundred and ninety-seven print media articles collected in five isiZulu-Language and English-Language newspapers. I examine what public idioms the news reports used, whom their reports took cue from as their news reports and editorials shifted positions and angles. With this selected sample, I analyse shifts in the newspaper's positions as the xenophobic riots unfolded; from condoning the riots, to condemning them, mirroring inflammatory sentiments, occasional impartiality and dialogical tensions. These shifts in positions were led by their editorials and some, emanating from addresses made by political leaders. By understanding the divergent journalistic modalities (community newspaper, tabloid) I explore the divergent narratives of each newspaper, as to how they crafted their meaningful discourse, guided by their target audience's socio-economic and cultural proximity. This I do by decoding the news product and illustrating how words, ideas, and tropes circulated and become mobilised in the media to craft meaning about the xenophobic riots.[7]

Furthermore, the television news reports that I procured were aired on different days: *Special Assignment* aired on SABC produced two reports; one on the 20th of May and another on the 1st of July. *3rd Degree,* an investigative show on eTV produced one report, aired on the 20th of May as well. Through a semiotic analysis I examined the 'staged' and 'unstaged' modality of the broadcast media and what the anchors, interviewers and interviewees said. I further explored the politicised nature of the xenophobic riots and interviewees notions of rights and definition of belonging.

The interviews were conducted over five months in 2013 in the township of Alexandra, as I initially needed to familiarise myself with the Bona Fides civic movement and attend their fortnightly community

[7] The thesis only employs a content analysis to examine the collected data, and doesn't carry out a reception study.

meetings. I took fieldnotes during these meetings, observing relations, the dynamics of their discourses and their campaigns of action. I eventually got the opportunity to interview some of the members. For ethical purposes, all respondents have been anonymized and their names and surnames replaced with gender and ethnic equivalents.

1.4. The Analysis

1.4.1. Critical discourse Analysis

To grapple with the above data I have used methodologies from media and cultural studies. Paula Saukko argues that if one is to unravel the complex historical and political agendas and struggles embedded in texts and interpretation, one needs to analyse them from different perspectives that flesh out their diverse commitments and blind spots (2003, p. 100). To do this, I have chosen to use critical discourse analyses to examine the data. The thesis further employs a semiotic analysis to examine the broadcast media.

Critical discourse analyse as a tools is a principally interpretive method of an inferring nature, which is a research technique for making replicable and valid inferences from data to their (social) context. A critical discourse analysis in this thesis will be used to examine latent and manifest content. Neuendorf describes latent content as, 'unobserved concept(s) that cannot be measured directly but can be represented or measured by one or more indicators' (2002, p. 23). He further describes manifest content as, 'the elements that are physically present and countable' (2002, p. 23).

By employing a critical discourse analysis on the selected print media we can explore the latent and manifest messages conveyed in the media during the xenophobic riots. A strong latent theme in the selected sample was the political contest between then South African President Thabo Mbeki and ANC President Jacob Zuma. The *Daily Sun* illustrates this in its May 21 issue when Mbeki ordered the army to help control the xenophobic riots (21-05-08, p. 1). On page five of the same issue, it was reported that ANC President Jacob Zuma welcomed the decision by President Thabo Mbeki to deploy the army to help police restore order (21-05-08, p. 5). Such juxtapositionings of power are evident in the xenophobic coverage, as leadership did not act promptly, and this was interpreted as them being blasé about the riots.

Through a critical discourse analysis of the selected data, it is evident that such an approach on a multilingual sample can reveal knowledge about how political communication, through latent and manifest ways was weaved into forms of mediation. Such a diverse sample of data attempts to fill a gap in the current media literature on the xenophobic riots, by proffering a nuanced methodological lens to

examining a wide multilingual sample of the Zulu-language and English-language print and broadcast media.

The crafting of meaningful discourse in the production of news as a product requires an examination of how words, ideas and tropes were employed and deployed to provide meaning around the xenophobic riots. The critical discourse analysis will aid in examining these specified characteristics within the selected isiZulu and English media. Fowler's (1991) assertions on studying the topological lay-out of newspapers will be used in exploring the manifest and latent messages as the selected media communicated and mediated the xenophobic riots.

1.4.2. Qualitative Hermeneutics

The thesis lastly examines interviews which I conducted in Alexandra in 2013, five years after the May 2008 xenophobic riots. I interviewed members belonging to the Bona Fides civic movement and the purpose of these interviews was to explore aspects of their lives, their understanding of belonging and citizenry rights five years after the xenophobic riots. The field of hermeneutics offered me a rich lens to focus on the deep analysis of the lived realities of my respondents. I further used it to understand how they made meaning of the ways in which they experience their hardships and marginalised status in the township of Alexandra. By employing a critical discourse analysis to examine the interviews, pairing together Bakhtin's concept of utterance (1999) the hermeneutic approach is enriched as I am able to explore the latent messages and explore various discourses broadly in the collected interviews.

Ronald Hitzler and Thomas Eberle posit that research is an 'interpretation of an interpretation' as people are active constructors of meaning (2004, p. 70). There is no objective reality of the text to be captured, only interpretations (2004, p. 69). Every meaning-interpretation can therefore be no more than an approximation, the quality of which depends on the degree of familiarity with, and the 'temporal proximity' of, the particular consciousness of the interviewer (2004, p. 69). By initially shadowing the Bona Fides fortnightly meetings and through participation observation, I got to understand better the movements discourse's from an outsides vantage point. And later through interviews, I explored the member's notions of citizenry rights, belonging and expected democratic liberties. The interviews were characterised by a sense of waiting, waiting for development, or waiting for what they felt were dividends of democracy which they were entitled to.

1.5. Chapter Outline

The thesis is comprised of six chapters, including the introduction and the conclusion. Chapter Two is a focused analyses of the coverage of the May 2008 Alexandra xenophobic riots in two isiZulu-Language newspapers; *iSolezwe* and *iLanga*. I examine their idiomatic narratives and their usage of culture in mediating the riots. In this chapter I pose two questions - How did the isiZulu newspapers negotiated and craft their coverage of the xenophobic riots? What emphases where there in the media representation of the xenophobic riots? In answering these questions I perform a critical discourse analysis and I examine the newspaper's shifts in position and their editorials, news reports, photographs with captions and letters from their readers.

In chapter Three I analyse the divergent narratives of three contrasting English-language newspapers; *Alex News,* a then fortnightly community newspaper*; the Daily Sun,* a national daily tabloid newspaper, and *the Mail and Guardian,* a national weekly investigative newspaper. Following their coverage of the May 2008 xenophobic riots in Alexandra and other areas around the country – I ask: How did these three contrasting English newspapers narrate the xenophobic riots? And how are the narratives divergent? In answering these questions I perform a critical discourse analysis and examine the newspapers varying narrative substance, themes, shifts in position and the divergent journalistic modalities.

Chapter Four examines the coverage and commentary of three television reports: Two SABC *Special Assignment* episodes and one eTV *3rd Degree* episode. I pose the following questions – How did these three television reports communicate the xenophobic riots? How did the reports differ from each other? And, what silences were there in the reports? As part of my analytical framework I perform a semiotic analysis and examine the 'staged' and 'unstaged' modality of the three television news reports and how they 'witnessed' the xenophobic riots.

Chapter Five examines the Bona Fides civic movement as a vehicle for mediating citizenship and understanding notions of belonging. I examine how these members understand their marginalised status and seek to affirm and enact their belonging in Alexandra. My questions for this chapter were – How is the discourse of insiders/outsiders understood by Alexandrans? And how are foreign immigrants in Alexandra perceived by Bona Fides members? In analysing the data I perform a critical discourse analysis and illustrate that most of the respondents felt pessimistic about the present government and were frustrated at slow service delivery and were nostalgic about the apartheid government's efficiency.

Chapter Six is the conclusion and I will draw together the threads of my evidence from the four chapters. I foreground my findings garnered through an analysis of varied print and broadcast media. Through analysing the collected data through a critical discourse and semiotic analysis I further put forward how various communication modalities in a democratic state offered divergent narratives and can offer a nuanced methodology to examining a purposefully small and multilingual news sample as they communicated and mediated the May 2008 xenophobic riots.

2. Chapter Two: Media representation: Culture and historical memory

"In times of change, newspapers could influence or connect to the public sphere, politicise people and interpret new ideas; in this way they could be 'distinctly subversive.' They could also show the way to alternatives to the status quo." (Limb, 2012, p. 12)

In the early months of 2008 small isolated incidents of xenophobic violence erupted near Pretoria but they paled in comparison to what began to erupt on the eve of Sunday the 11th of May in the township of Alexandra. The xenophobic riots soon spread to Diepsloot, Ramaphosa and other areas of Gauteng. Some residents of these areas participated in the riots and others took a stand and quashed them. The xenophobic riots then erupted in other areas around South Africa, varying in intensity. Most of the print media began covering the riots on the 12th of May and others, later in that week. This chapter will focus on the press coverage and the riots which began in Alexandra, in two isiZulu-language newspapers.

In this chapter I argue that the role of the print media and its coverage of the May 2008 xenophobic riots has not been adequately examined, especially so, the isiZulu-language newspapers. I will pay attention to the sedimented layers of this sample study of selected isiZulu-language newspapers, as well as to the shifts, tensions and dialogical activities in the print media. This allows us to explain a range of public idioms at work in both latent and manifest messages. As the newspaper negotiated, mediated and communicated the xenophobic riots, pertinent questions still linger which have not been posed to specific newspapers.

If there is a lingua franca in South Africa, it is isiZulu (Distiller, 2012, p. 29). IsiZulu newspapers have not been studied at all in relation to their coverage of the xenophobic riots and their angle on the story although they have a large readership both regionally in KwaZulu-Natal and nationally. Ntongela Masilela argues that vernacular newspapers in their very history were established to be forums through which Africans could integrate modern knowledge and traditional knowledge and further form a dialectical synthesis in understanding the ever-changing present (Masilela, 2011, p. 22 & Peterson, 2006).

Musa Ndlovu contends that in cultural-economic terms, isiZulu media outlets are rising because of the comparatively larger number of Zulu-speaking people in the South African linguistic market (Ndlovu, 2011, p. 268). Addressivity in the isiZulu newspapers is evident and rich: powerful idioms are used to convey the news in insightful ways. For example in the June 9 – 11, 2008 issue of *iLanga* the editorial employed this metaphor, '*Isihlahla asingcoliswa ngoba uyodinga ukuyofuna umthunzi ngaphansi kwaso ngelinye ilanga.*' [You do not dump dirt under a tree because one day you will need its shade] (p. 4).

African languages in print media have a history of being socio-politically and culturally significant. Moreover, in combination with other social forces in history, the African press created templates for the emergence of a national consciousness through both their mediation of time and the narratives they proffered (Peterson, 2006, p. 240).

In this chapter I ask - How did the isiZulu-language newspapers craft and negotiated their coverage of the Alexandra xenophobic riots? What emphases were there in the media representation of the xenophobic riots? In this chapter I examine these research questions in relation to *iSolezwe* and *iLanga*, which mediated and communicated the xenophobic riots in Alexandra and KZN. In my examination of the isiZulu-language newspapers I will carry out a critical discourse analysis. My main focus will be editorials and news reports but in addition I will also examine the themes found in the images, captions, and letters by readers in the isiZulu-language newspapers.

2.1 *Azixoxwe izindaba*[8]*:* Addressing the Nation

The xenophobic riots were covered sparsely in the isiZulu-language newspapers. But the sparseness of news coverage does not always signal the importance or lack of importance of an event. News is socially constructed, what events are reported is not a reflection of the intrinsic importance of those events, but reveals the operation of the complex and artificial set of criteria of selection (Fowler, 1991, p. 2). The isiZulu newspapers employed a range of meta-textual practices (Hanks, 1989, p.96) to convey their news and both the newspapers, particularly *iLanga* utilised what Masilela terms, 'the power of newspapers to nurture historical consciousness and change cultural sensibility' (Masilela, 2011, p. 22).

The editorials in the selected newspapers are of particular interest in this chapter in conjunction with the news reports. Editorials alluded to each paper's position and particular angle in their coverage, as editorials tend to be argumentative in two senses. They usually strike a position of rebuttal in relation to other people's ideas. The logical and narrative structure of the exposition is highlighted by 'textual signposts' and often the argument is dramatised by the use of dialogic devices such as rhetorical questions (Fowler 1991, p. 211). In this chapter I illustrate how editorials act as guiding 'scripts' and moreover, the dialogical activities between the editorials, news reports, photographs and letters by readers. Furthemore, the assumed implicit frame of understanding in the editorials (Blommaert & Verschueren, 1998) illustrate the dynamics of addressivity (Bahktin, 1999) as *iLanga's* editorials weaved idioms in their narrative as they mediated and communicated the xenophobic riots.

[8] Let us discuss the news

Through a critical discourse analysis of the isiZulu-language newspapers, I will illustrate the various public idioms they foregrounded as they negotiated the meaning of the xenophobic riots and mediated the news. The chapter is comprised of three sections; through a critical discourse analysis I examine *iSolezwe's* coverage, I then follow with another critical discourse analysis of *iLanga's* coverage and lastly, I compare their coverage, tropes of mediation and the shifts in position with each paper, as events unfolded.

2.2. *iSolezwe* liwela umfula ugcwele[9]: A murky middle ground

iSolezwe is a daily Zulu newspaper which was established in 2002 and is owned by Independent News and Media and is the only truly daily newspaper (according to circulation figures) in KwaZulu-Natal (Ndlovu, 2010 p. 278). Based at the Independent News offices in Greyville Durban (KZN) it has three editions: the daily *iSolezwe*, *iSolezwe ngoMgqibelo* (Saturday) and *iSolezwe ngeSonto* (Sunday). In April 2012 the daily *iSolezwe* had reached a sizable readership of 912 000 readers[10].[11] Sazi Hadebe the current editor remarked*, 'iSolezwe's* popularity is fuelled by more than just an editorial formula, or knack for writing in the vernacular…we live in the townships and suburbs and care about the people around us…we write as though we're talking with our neighbours, with open honesty and respect*'.*[12]

iSolezwe began its coverage of the xenophobic riots four days after other print media (15th of May Thursday) and continued to report on the riots till the 6th of June, although the xenophobic riots began in Alexandra on the 11th of May (Sunday). The delayed coverage could have been a result of two possibilities: the distance from the sites of action, as the newspaper is based in Durban, or an uncertainty of the events since high ranking leadership had not addressed the crisis until late in the week. The paper had a number of shifts in positions, from uncertainty to condemnation. But, from the 16th onwards, it attempted to cover the xenophobic riots in a measured manner and attempted to provide balanced coverage. One of the themes which flowed through *iSolezwe's* coverage was its almost complete understanding and sympathy with the disgruntlement and anger which people felt, but not the way in which they enacted their anger. This ambivalent thread in *iSolezwe's* coverage continued even when the editorial changed its ambivalent stance, as the photo-journalistic images struck a disharmony in the papers reportage offering complexity to the papers stance.

[9] The nations eye; sees over the full river.
[10] Readership figures are calculated by taking circulation figures and multiplying them by four to five readers.
[11] http://radiobiz.co.za/2013/03/09/isolezwe-selling-694913-copies accessed 20 March 2013
[12] http://radiobiz.co.za/2013/03/09/isolezwe-selling-694913-copies accessed 20 March 2013

2.3. *iSolezwe*: A two rudder narrative

On the 15th of May 2008 on page ten, *iSolezwe* produced its first editorial on the xenophobic riots, entitled, '*Ayixoxwe inzondo yobuzwe*' [the nation's hatred must be discussed] (*iSolezwe,* May 15). The editorial termed the xenophobic riots as, '*ukuhlaselwa kwabokufika kuleli*' [the attack on the newly arrived in this country], and employed the adjective of *'ukuqubuka'* [erupt] to describe the break-out of the riots, '*elokishini nasezakhiweni*' [in the location and the shanties] (*iSolezwe,* May 15). The editorial provided an initial general entry to the xenophobic riots and did not focus on Alexandra. It used rhetorics of contrast 'in the location and the shanties' (*iSolezwe,* May 15), to distinguish the different housing schemes which are found in most townships in the country. As it teased out the confusing nature of the attacks, it reported on how they started and the reasons behind them. Starting from Sunday (11 May) *'iZakhamizi'* [people of the community] from Alexandra went around barging into '*imijondolo*' [shacks], beating the foreign immigrants who occupied them and in some instances taking their belongings. The editorial assumed what the reader's position would be as it developed its position: that foreigner's contributed to the increase of crime and took South Africans jobs.

Singephike ukuthi uhulumeni wakuleli uhluleka uyancama ukubhekana nesimo sokuthutheleka kwabantu bangaphandle ngokungemthetho kuleli, ikakhulu wona uMnyango wezaseKhaya oxakwe nayisihlava senkohlakalo yokugwazisa ukuze abokufika bathole amaphepha okuba abase Ningizimu Afrika. (*iSolezwe,* May 15)	We cannot deny that this country's government is failing dismally to handle the issue of legal and illegal African immigrants entering this country. This is especially the case with the department of Home Affairs, which is confronted by corruption in the form of briberies, and the elicitation of fraudulent documentation by foreigners to seek refuge in South Africa.

The editorial went on to claim in a cavalier and dismissive manner that they (supposedly inclusive of their readers) were not shocked by the attacks as similar attacks had broken out near Pretoria earlier in the year. The newspaper made it known that they were vexed by the Department of Home Affair's corruption and the government's failure to control the "flood" (*iSolezwe,* May 15) of foreigners into South Africa. It further claimed that the illegal immigrants were taking advantage of these flaws. The editorial assumed that its position of ambivalence concerning foreigners was shared by its readers, but what was confusing, it stated, was *'indluzula'* [the violence] (*iSolezwe,* May 15) which characterised the xenophobic riots.

The editorial seemed sympathetic to South Africans' plight; it illustrated almost complete understanding of the supposed perpetrators' actions, but was against the violence. At some level it found the violence, in its inter-African nature shocking.

> *iKhona ingozi yokuthi zicijelwe ukusebenza phakathi kwabamhlophe nabamnyama kuphela, hhayi inzondo phakathi kwabamnyama bebodwa noma nezinye izihlanga eziboshwa ngabhandelinye nendlu emnyama. INingizimu Afrika isadinga ukulashwa izilonda zobandlululo olwatshalwa ngamaBhunu.* (*iSolezwe,* May 15)
>
> There is still a danger that this dislike of the other might still exist between white and black people, but it should not exist between black South Africans and other black African people. South Africa still needs to heal from the wounds inflicted by apartheid, planted by the Boers.

Thus overall, this first editorial on the xenophobic riots assumed almost complete understanding of the disgruntlements of the 'man on the ground' but it did not categorically or authoritatively condemn the attacks, although it did express concern about inter-African violence. The xenophobic riots, it concluded, were a result of built-up frustration, anxiety and a sense of marginalization by those who had been waiting for years for housing and felt that their cries were falling on deaf ears (*iSolezwe,* May 15). In my reading of *iSolezwe* these remarks can be seen as catalysts in an already volatile situation.

A rather different take on the violence came in the same issue, on page sixteen (a news report) entitled, *'I-SACP igxeka ukuhlaselwa kwabokufika* [The SACP condemns the attacks on foreigners]. It reported that secretary of the South African Communist Party (SACP) Blade Nzimande and Gauteng MEC of Community Safety Feroz Cachalia condemned the violence and said, '*…akubona abantu baseZimbabwe abenza izinkinga zokuthi abantu baseningizimu Afrika babe hlwempu*' [it is not the people of Zimbabwe that are causing South Africans to be poor] (*iSolezwe,* May 15). Nzimande further added that, '*abantu baseZimbabwe bathutheleka kuleli ngoba befuna impilo engcono, kodwa akusho ukuthi kumele bahlaselwe bashaywe*' [immigrants from Zimbabwe came to South Africa to seek a better life but that does not mean that they should be attacked and beaten]. According to the report there were over a thousand foreign immigrants in Alexandra that had been displaced because of '*ukuhlaselwa kwabokufika kuleli*' [the attack on the newly arrived in this country] (*iSolezwe,* May 15). Nzimande articulated one main catalyst as being wealth creation and the distribution of it and ended by saying Zimbabweans should not be used as scapegoats (*iSolezwe,* May 15).

Thus the news report in the same issue overtly condemned the xenophobic attacks. The editorial and news report stand in stark contrast to each other, and illustrate the newspaper's uncertain position in mediating the xenophobic riots as national high ranking leadership had not appeared to address the crisis. The editorial was ambivalent and engrossed in the sentiments of possible perpetrators, whilst the news report was clear in its condemnation of the xenophobic riots.

2.4. Stormy waters with Msholozi's[13] rudder

The May 16th issue marked a shift in the news report's voice as *iSolezwe's* initial ambivalent narrative seemed to take direction from Jacob Zuma's[14] position and it began to articulate its condemnation of the xenophobic riots more clearly. The violence had intensified in Diepsloot and on the front cover of the paper appeared a photograph of two men in Diepsloot holding down another man who had looted a shop owned by a foreigner (*iSolezwe,* May 16). In the same issue *iSolezwe* reported on Jacob Zuma's address and condemnation of the xenophobic riots and quoted him as saying, '*izenzo zokucwaswa kwabantu bokufika azinayo indawo kule Ningizimu Afrika ekhululekile*' [the attacks on foreign immigrants has no place in a free South Africa] (*iSolezwe,* May 16). Zuma further added, '*abantu bokuhamba kuleli kumele baphathwe ngendlela, futhi abakuleli bakuyeke ukudlulisela ukuxakeka kwabo kubona*' [immigrants should be treated in accordance, and South Africans needed to stop taking out their frustrations on immigrants] (*iSolezwe,* May 16).

From my reading it is clear that the news pieces are different from those of the day before as they condemned the attacks in unison. Jacob Zuma's position that *'ningadluliseli ukuxakeka kwabokufika'* [your disgruntlements must not be transferred onto foreigners] (*iSolezwe,* May 16) seemed to inform the cover page photograph as Diepsloot community members took a stand against the attacks, and took heed of Zuma's statements.

2.5. Multiple shifts in *iSolezwe's* position

A further shift in position became clear in *iSolezwe's* third day of coverage, but its early ambivalence still lingered. In the May 19th issue, a news report appeared on page eight. Here *iSolezwe* reported on '*udlame lokucwaswa*' [the struggle of differentiation] (*iSolezwe,* May 19) which had erupted the day before in Cleveland (Gauteng). *ISolezwe* termed the violence, '*udlame oluhambisana nokucwaswa kwezifiki kuleli*' [the struggle of differentiation coupled with violence] (*iSolezwe,* May 19). From the 19th

[13] One of Jacob Zuma's best known clan names

[14] Jacob Zuma at this time was the president of the ANC and Thabo Mbeki was still the President of the country.

there was more coverage of the riots and a focus on their violent nature and extent. From the page number of the news report, page eight; we notice that the reports on the xenophobic attacks steadily began receiving increased prominence. Although *iSolezwe* dovetailed the voice of its news reports with that of Jacob Zuma from the 16th of May, its ambivalent stance could still be detected in the pages through the disharmony between the photo-journalistic images and the news reports.

On page eight of the 20th of May (Tuesday) issue, a sturdy shift led by *iSolezwe's* editorial was evident. *ISolezwe* published their second and last editorial on the xenophobic riots, entitled, '*Ngobani ubulwane obungaka?*' [Why such grotesque violence?] (*iSolezwe,* May 20). In this editorial we notice a clear shift in the editorial's position, from its initial ambivalence on the 15th of May, to a more self-searching, and more clearly condemning voice. The piece opened by saying that the attacks on foreign immigrants in South Africa were an embarrassing incident that should not be tolerated. The grotesque violence that was being perpetrated was cause for concern and would not remedy the situation (*iSolezwe,* May 20):

kungeneni ezweni? Baphi ababaholi	What has become of the world?
ezindaweni? Kungani abantu	Where are the community
bakuleli bengenanembeza?	leaders? What has got into people
(*iSolezwe,* May 20)	and where is their conscience?

In the above excerpt we see the editor's use of emotive language, strong feelings and opinion. The editorial was written in a manner which assumed an understanding of the reader's sentiments and an implicit frame of understanding (Blommaert & Verschueren, 1998), moreover, the dynamics of addressivity (Vološinov, 1986) were also at play.

The editorial further invoked South Africa's history of fighting against segregation arguing that the recent attacks on foreigners undermined this legacy. Another issue raised was why the police allowed the situation to get to such levels:

Siyazi sonke ukuthi lokhu	We all know that the attack on foreign
kuhlaselwa kwabantu bokufika	immigrants in this country is organized
kuleli kuyahlewa emihlanganweni	at meetings organized by communities.
esuke isemiphakathini. Kungani	Why couldn't this seed of hatred been
lesi sihlava singabangulwa	resolved at the community meetings?
kuselapho na? (*iSolezwe,* May 20)	

The above excerpt took an authoritative voice and in a sober manner stated, that organizing a meeting to discuss disgruntlements and involving the police costs nothing (*iSolezwe,* May 20). The piece further

stated that police action had not been enough to curb the violence, and there was blatant disregard of the law by the perpetrators. Finally it appealed in emotive language for a return to national self-respect and a cessation of violence.

The editorial ends as a lament, bemoaning the violence and condemning the attacks. It also foregrounded the critical role of the law in communities, and the respect that *umthetho* [the law] should be afforded.

Izoqhubeka kanjani impilo ezweni elicanasa abantu abazenzela umathanda bebe bephambana nomthetho?...asibuyise isithunzi sezwe, bakwethu, siyeke lobu bulwane kwabanye abantu. (*iSolezwe,* May 20)	How will life continue in a world where people take the law into their own hands and go in different directions to the laws of the land?…let us restore respect to the country, people, and stop this grotesque violence directed at other people [foreigners].

The two editorials separated by five days - stood in stark contrast to each other - the first one, '*Ayixoxwe inzondo yobuzwe*' [the nation's hatred must be discussed] (*iSolezwe,* May 15) was ambivalent and fell just short of condoning the attacks. The second and last editorial, '*Ngobani ubulwane obungaka?*' [Why such grotesque violence?] (*iSolezwe,* May 20) was authoritative and clear in its condemnation of the events, as well as its warning against any possible resurgence of violence.

2.6. Msholozi's rudder and Mbeki's shadow

Still in the same issue on the 20th of May, *iSolezwe* reported, *'Batinyela uhulumeni ngodlame'* [harsh remarks towards the government concerning the violence] (*iSolezwe,* May 20, p. 5), the xenophobic riots had spread to Durban, where in Mayville Mozambicans were attacked. Moreover, the political jostling and jabbing began to feature prominently in *iSolezwe's* coverage as Mbeki and Zuma were pitted against each other. Ian Davidson of the Democratic Alliance and Bantu Holomisa, leader of the United Democratic Movement, both criticized the government for its inaction (*iSolezwe,* May 20). Holomisa further added that Thabo Mbeki needed to be more visible and address the situation and convey a message of, '*akwamukelekile ukucwasana ngokubuzwe, ubugebengu nokucwasana,*' [the differentiation of foreigners is not acceptable, nor is criminality by South Africans] (*iSolezwe,* May 20).

2.7. The xenophobic wave hits Durban: Leaders act

The coverage of the xenophobic riots increased in *iSolezwe* as the violence spread to Durban and KZN leaders acted belatedly. The paper maintained coverage of ongoing violence elsewhere as the attacks spread. On the 21st of May (Wednesday) *iSolezwe's* front page headline read, '*uKushaywa kwabantu bokufika sekukapakele nase Thekwini*' [the beating of foreign nationals has also erupted in Durban] (*iSolezwe,* May 21), while the main article on page three read, '*Kuhlukunyezwe abokufika eThekwini*' [foreign nationals being harassed in Durban] (*iSolezwe,* May 21).

The same news report highlighted a language test that was used by perpetrators, and how isiZulu, as a language of the public domain was used to 'sift-out foreigners' (*iSolezwe,* May 21). The journalist reported on eighteen year old Gabriel Rashidi's story. He had arrived in South Africa a few weeks before from the Democratic Republic of Congo. His entire family had been killed in the DRC (*iSolezwe,* May 21). He remarked,

…ngiyabona ukuthi isimo sibi njengoba sengithola ukuhlukumezeka nakuleli (*iSolezwe,* May 21)	…I can see that the situation is also bad here, as I am once again being harassed.

As the riots continued to unfold on the 22nd of May, *iSolezwe's* coverage foregrounded the visibility of KZN leadership, as they belatedly began to speak out in the public domain. The 22nd of May cover page headline read, '*Abaholi baseKZN balusukumele udaba lokushaywa kwezifiki*' [KZN leaders stand-up against the beating-up of foreign immigrants] (*iSolezwe,* May 22). Below the headline was a photograph of KZN MEC for Transport, Community Safety and Liaison, Bheki Cele at the Dalton Hostel near Mbilo (Durban) where he engaged in talks with residents of Mbilo. In the same issue on page three, Bheki Cele and KZN Premier Sbu Ndebele condemned the attacks. Cele was firm that the attacks were organized by IFP members as the attacks happened after an IFP meeting whilst Ndebele was more measured in his stance, and said that the ANC and the IFP were working together to address the issue (*iSolezwe,* May 22). IFP chairperson Mntomuhle Khawula stated that the IFP was also against the attacks and further added that the Dalton Hostels were home to many people belonging to different political organizations. Khawula remarked that Cele's stance was irresponsible and dangerous, in that he was the MEC for Transport, Community Safety and Liaison *(iSolezwe, May 22).* What is also evident is that the attacks received greater attention when high ranking officials appeared on the scene and addressed the issue.

Overall, in this newspaper issue we can safely assume a shift had occurred in the paper's general desire to cover the xenophobic attacks, as the coverage received prominent attention in its pages and

appeared on the front cover more frequently. It is perhaps no coincidence that this shift occurred when the attacks reached Durban (Location of *iSolezwe*'s office) and at this point the reports become more detailed.

2.8. The crisis and Mbeki's shadow

On the 23rd of May (Friday) *iSolezwes'* front page headline read, ''*Osisize siye emakhaya mengameli Mbeki*' *Kukhala abokufika*' ['Please help us get home President Mbeki' cried out the foreign immigrants] (*iSolezwe,* May 23). Two news reports in the issue focused on foreign immigrants' stories and some of their sentiments as to why they wanted to be sent back home. The news reports were entitled, '*Sicela uMbeki asiphindisele emakhaya'* [we ask that Mbeki send us back home] (*iSolezwe,* May 23) on page three and the other, '*Kungcono ngiyofela ekhaya*' [It would be better if I die back home] (*iSolezwe,* May 23) on page eleven.

In the same issue on page eleven, *iSolezwe* published letters from readers, sharing their sentiments about the attacks. Letters are interesting in the composition of a newspaper's position and narrative as they are mostly selected on the basis of the themes they bring out. If the themes and sentiments they foreground dovetail with the newspaper's own position, they are included in the issue. Syanda Nxumalo, lambasted the mindless acts of violence (*iSoleze,* May 23), whilst Sibongiseni Nqayi evoked South Africa's struggle history and reminded South Africa's leaders that they had been protected by neighbouring states during apartheid. Sunrise Nsele also urged leadership, especially the president of the ANC Jacob Zuma, and the nations' president, Thabo Mbeki, to recall South Africa's historical debt to her neighbouring states (*iSolezwe,* May 23).

In this issue Mbeki's absence was explicitly made visible as foreign immigrants called out to him but he did not answer. Mbeki's tardiness re-emphasised the image South Africans had of him, as an aloof leader. The letters also reminded Mbeki and Zuma of their time in exile in African countries.

2.9. The Union Building and Luthuli House: Leader's inactions and actions

Having covered the riots through a focus on calls by migrants to be repatriated as well as with letters from readers pointing to the country's neighbours' help in the liberation struggle years, the paper again shifted focus. *iSolezwe's* Monday the 26th front cover had a photograph of people participating in a protest which had been organized in Hillbrow and had the heading, '*Phansi nodlame kwabokufika!*' [Away with the violence directed at foreign immigrants!] (*iSolezwe,* May 26). A small photograph of Jacob Zuma was included at the bottom of the front cover story and it was accompanied by a short news report. Zuma had addressed community members in Springs and Gugulethu in the Western Cape

and condemned the violence (*iSolezwe,* May 26). On page three was *iSolezwe's* first report on Thabo Mbeki entitled, '*uMbeki ubhobokile ngodlame kuleli*' [Mbeki finally addresses the violence] (*iSolezwe,* May 26), the report offered various views, mostly criticizing Mbeki's tardy response and commending Jacob Zuma's more immediate response. Castro Ngobese of the Young Communist League of the South African Communist Party criticized Mbeki's lack of resolve and his failure to take decisive action in a time of disaster. Zanele Magwaza-Msibi, chairperson of the IFP stated that, '*kuyacaca ukuthi uhulumeni awukwazi ukuzehlisa, uze phansi kubantu kunalokho uhambela kude*' [it is clear that the government cannot relate to its people on the ground level] (*iSolezwe,* May 26).

The 26th of May issue of *iSolezwe* was dense in its possible meaning, innuendo and manifest meaning. The association of the various news reports suggested a latent message and critique of Mbeki's inaction while endorsing Zuma's more proactive sentiments and position. The political jostling on this issue resumed in both a subtle and overt manner as Mbeki's absence was juxtaposed with Zuma's visibility and attentiveness.

This trend continued. Page eight of *iSolezwe* May 29th issue ran a story on Winnie Madikizela-Mandela opening her home to a displaced Congolese family she had met at the Cleveland Police Station (*iSolezwe,* May 29). Winnie criticized the government's belated response and as a member of the National Executive Committee went out and helped where she could.

2.10. The Human face of the governments' tardiness

The first week of June's coverage saw the paper introducing its last area of focus: juxtapositioning of the xenophobic fatalities with government's tardiness. On the 3rd of June, on page three, *iSolezwe* reported on Ernesto Nhamuave's death and gave a short synopsis of his life (*iSolezwe,* June). Ernesto was from Mozambique and lived in the township of Ramaphosa (JHB), where he was burned by rioters during the xenophobic riots (*iSolezwe,* June). On the same page two articles entitled, '*Kuzobanjiswana ukusiza izihambi ezihlukumezekile*' [we will work together to help harassed foreign immigrants] (*iSolezwe,* June) and '*Sisazozibhekela izihambi: uhulumeni*' [we are still in search of shelter for foreign immigrants: the government] (*iSolezwe,* June) appeared as the government pledged to do more. This issue began to show and place side by side the government's tardy response, lax application of their policies in enforcing immigration laws and how this could be seen in literal human effect.

On the 4th and 6th of June *iSolezwe* provided its last news reports on the xenophobic riots and chose to highlight the issue of repatriation. On page six was a report entitled, '*iZambia ifuna abantu bayo abakuleli*' [Zambia wants its citizens that are in South Africa] (*iSolezwe,* June) as Zambian Embassy

official Leslie Mbula stated that there were thirty one Zambians who wanted to be repatriated. The report further added that Zambia and South Africa had a long history of working together during South Africa's struggle history and Nelson Mandela was good friends with Kenneth Kaunda (*iSolezwe,* June). On the sixth of June, on page ten *iSolezwe* published a photograph with a caption which was its last piece of news on the xenophobic riots. The photograph was of displaced foreign nationals at the Inanda police station in KZN (*iSolezwe,* June).

2.11. *iSolezwe's* shifts, tensions and ambivalence

To conclude, *iSolezwe* was slow in its coverage of the xenophobic riots, as it started reporting on the riots on the 15th of May. From the 15th of May though, it provided day to day coverage in the form of news reports, editorials, letters from readers and images with texts. The political factionalism that characterised 2008 was well reported and the power contest between the nation's President Thabo Mbeki and the ANC President Jacob Zuma was evident. Readers were urged to reflect on South Africa's historical struggle debt to their neighbouring countries; the national history and the concept of *ubuntu* (humanity) were invoked and leadership was questioned. The efforts of the government's indecisiveness were illustrated through the story of the violent death of Ernesto.

From my reading and critical discourse analysis of the newspaper, it is apparent that editorial politics were central to how *iSolezwe* treated the xenophobic riots. Yet what stands out in the sum of the paper's reportage on the riots is *iSolezwe's* near stance of condoning the attacks and its ambivalence, even though it seemed to support Jacob Zuma's sentiments from the 16th of May. Nowhere in this coverage was there mention of the possibility of reintegration of foreigners back into local communities. The paper's use of images is also noteworthy. Fowler argues that metaphors stray from headline to headline, photographs which are meaningless in themselves become significant when juxtaposed to a piece of text (1999, p. 225). The images used opened themselves to a variety of interpretations. In my analysis, most of the images in the issues endorsed *iSolezwe's* initial ambivalence and near condoning of the attacks from its initial 15th of May coverage. For instance the majority of images *iSolezwe* published were of displaced foreigners in camps and police stations. The newspaper thus focused on repatriation as a solution rather than reintegration.

In this section through a critical discourse analysis I have examined *iSolezwe's* coverage of the xenophobic riots and illustrated a number of shifts and tensions, evident in the newspaper as it mediated and communicated the xenophobic riots. From its ambivalent editorial position on the 15th of May, it went to outright condemnation of the violence, yet *iSolezwe's* position remained irresolute. As a whole, it showed a mix of varying positions; it displayed tensions between the editorials,

photojournalistic images and news reports. In the following section once again through a critical discourse analysis I examine the coverage of *iLanga* newspaper and explore its emphases, shifts in position and public idioms used to mediated and communicate the xenophobic riots.

2.2. Section 2: *iLanga*

2.2.1. *iLanga* iphepha lesizwe[15]: The past and possible solutions?

iLanga, a bi-weekly isiZulu-language newspaper, was founded by John Langalibalele Dube in 1903 and has been in print since that date (Hughes, 2011). It is currently owned by Mandla-Matla Publishing and Arthur Konigkrammer its Managing Director is an Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) provincial Member of Parliament. *iLanga's* offices are at the Waterfront in Durban (KZN). In a 2011 study *iLanga* had a readership of 848 000 readers, and its circulation figures were 135 708.[16] *iLanga* has three editions; *iLanga* which comes out on Thursday with a tabloid supplement called *iLanga Le Theku* and a Sunday edition called, *iLanga LeSonto. iLanga* did not cover the xenophobic riots on a day to day basis but rather, in three issues: the 19 – 21 May 2008 issue, the 26 – 28 May issue, and the 9 – 11 June 2008 issue.

ILanga only produced five pieces of news on the xenophobic riots in three issues. The newspaper provided a two-part editorial (26 – 28 May, and 9 – 11 June 2008 issue) which was written using phatic language and was very authoritative. *iLanga* has a long history of powerful and pithy editorials (Hughes, 2011) and the editorials on the riots were no exception. The editorials took into account a plethora of angles but public idioms such as: culture, tradition and history (armed struggle and Zulu Cultural history) were the key themes in the editorials as tropes of mediation. We see a number of shifts in Professor Otty E.H.M Nxumalo's editorial as he began by espousing a pan African identity and later selects a more narrowly Zulu national identity to mediate the xenophobic riots. He grappled with the culture of naming, labelling and integration and also further suggested skills-transferral schemes and urged government to take seriously popular myths and not to ignore them. Although steeped in historical and cultural knowledge, as well as understanding contemporary debates, Nxumalo was not consistent in his multi-layered two-part editorial. At times a 'Nxumalo dance' was evident in his intricately crafted editorial as he foregrounded cultural inclusion but hinted at economic exclusion. The news report and photograph were very considered in their complex messages, and the letter by a reader was philosophical and powerful.

[15] *iLanga,* the peoples paper
[16] http://www.ilanganews.co.za/statistics accessed 28 March 2013

2.2.2. An IFP rudder and an ANC ripple

ILanga published its first piece of news on the xenophobic riots on Thursday the 19th of May on page three. It was a news report entitled, '*I-IFP ikhala ngokunukwa yi-ANC ngodlame lwase-Alexandra*' [IFP complains of being accused by the ANC of being behind the Alexandra xenophobic attacks] (Phungula, p. 3). *iLanga* reported that the IFP had been suspected of being behind the Alexandra xenophobic riots of May 2008 by the ANC (p.3). On the other hand, the IFP declared that it had information which proved that the violence had been sparked by the ANC. Bonginkosi Dlamini who spoke for the IFP remarked that a policeman and an ANC councillor had sparked the violence in Alexandra (p. 3).

The political jostling featured prominently in the *iLanga* xenophobic coverage. In the *ilanga* coverage the ANC attempted to dismiss the notion that the attacks were xenophobic, and ascribed the violence to criminal activities. A closer analysis reveals a latent position which *iLanga* took as it aligned itself with the IFP's position as IFP representatives expressed a more proactive and righteous stance. The ANC's accusation and position was conveyed as being harsh, arrogant and attempting to divert attention away from the real issue and rather engaged in petty accusations and labelling the xenophobic attacks as criminal activities. In the way the reporter crafted the report (19 May, p. 3), the ANC is seen as shrugging off responsibility as the ruling party which should have addressed the causes of the attacks much earlier.

On the same page was a photograph of protestors who took part in a march organized by Cosatu in Durban. They were protesting against rising food prices, problems faced by Zimbabweans (in Zimbabwe)[17], the rising price of paraffin and the issue of imminent electricity hikes (Dhlomo, p. 3). On a closer semiotic analysis of the photograph, we see a man holding a black make-shift bazooka with yellow inscriptions which read, '*Msholozi, umshini wami*' [*Msholozi*[18] my machine gun] (Dhlomo, p. 3). The Bazooka with the yellow inscription, '*Msholozi, umshini wami*' (p. 3) represented an iconography which was part of Zuma's cultural political capital[19]. The *umshini wami* song was a symbiotic link and acted as a catalyst for the involvement of multiple publics in the wider public sphere in this period (Gunner, 2009, p. 27-28). The image/song in *iLanga* represented the pro-Zuma faction within the ANC, and a desperate yearning for his government, as ordinary people believed that he represented a less mediated relationship with the agency of the state (White, 2012, p. 399). The latent message was that Jacob Zuma's imminent government would be able to address Cosatu's issues better than Thabo Mkebi

[17] Post-election, rising violence ahead to presidential run-off between Zanu-PF's Robert Mugabe and MDC's Morgen Tsvangirai
[18] Jacob Zuma's best known praise name
[19] See Chapter Four for a wider discussion on the song and its provenance.

had. Taken together the photograph and news report provide a considered and complex narrative. The news report showed ANC versus IFP squabbling with a latent pro-IFP position and the photograph had a Zulu pro-Zuma message. The xenophobic coverage received immediate prominent coverage and occupied the early pages from the first issue that covered the attacks, but did not make it onto the cover page.

2.2.3. The past is a foreign country[20]: The Place of customs

As mentioned earlier, editorials are important in understanding a newspaper's position and *iLanga* had two editorials which addressed the xenophobic riots. The second coverage of the xenophobic riots appeared the following week (26 – 28 May) in the form of an editorial. Professor Otty E.H.M Nxumalo of the University of Zululand and an *iLanga* columnist wrote a detailed two-part editorial addressing the riots. The first part, entitled, '*Ukuqhubukusha abantu bokufika*' part one [The harassing of newly arrived people] appeared in the newspaper's May 26 – 28, issue.

In the first instalment of Nxumalo's editorial, he stressed the importance and complexity of the term, '*abokufika*' [the new arrivals] (Nxumalo, p. 5), its links with the migrant system which brought many men from other provinces in South Africa to Johannesburg. This system also brought others from across South Africa's borders. Nxumalo also touched on issues on which a wide consensus had been reached, pertaining to some of the factors which 'caused' the xenophobic riots, for example crime and social ills being blamed on foreign immigrants. Nxumalo's first theme in his discussion of the xenophobic riots was that of *amasiko* [customs] pertaining to 'outsiders' and their integration into society.

Nxumalo argued that amongst Africans it is customary to treat visitors/travellers humanely:

Lelo siko ngelokuthi ubuntu yikuphatha kahle izihambi. Umuntu wokuhamba uphiwa ukudla alaliswe kahle. Uyasiselwa futhi ukuze asenge. Kodwa ubantu uyabuzwa nangabantu bakubo, nangamasiko akubo, ukuze usikompilo lwabo luhlangazwe bangahlukunyezwa. Nabo bathola ithuba lokutshelwa ngamasiko ethu thina abasifica phambili. (Nxumalo, p. 5)

That culture/custom is that being humane is to treat your visitors/ foreigners in a good manner. The visitor must be given food and must sleep comfortably. You must ask the visitor/ foreigner about his culture and his home people. This will help in analysing his culture and the new culture so that he won't get abused. In this interaction they [foreigners] also get the opportunity to ask about our cultural customs.

[20] L.P. Hartley, The Go-Between, Pub. Heinemann Educational Books Ltd, 1953, p. 9

Nxumalo's stance argued against the definition of a foreigner as outsider and other (Tafira, 2009, 2011) and asserted that culturally visitors were not synonymous with invaders. We begin to notice that Nxumalo starts to articulate an African nationalist identity in the editorial.

The two concepts: coerced co-habitation and cultural racism (Tafira, 2009) are useful in understanding the themes which Nxumalo foregrounds in the above excerpt. When examining editorials it is important to consider that meaningfulness is found in the 'consensual' 'we' pronoun which is used often in editorials that claim to speak for 'the people' (Fowler, 1991, p. 16). Nxumalo by assuming that he spoke for South Africans drew from an African and South African archive to mediate the xenophobic attacks.

Nxumalo's argument highlighted an Africanist and Cultural 'discursive competence' (Nyembezi & Nxumalo, 1966) as a reference point. He foregrounded an intricately detailed rebuttal to the popular discourse of anger and violence during the May xenophobic riots and peoples' understanding of the 'other' in the context of South Africa. Nxumalo's eloquent writing, rich with idioms, drew from an African (largely Zulu) archive to provide possible mediations for present situations and crafted possible meanings around the riots.

2.2.4. A culture of integration

In the same substantive editorial Nxumalo provided a shift from conventional knowledge pertaining to labelling and the practice of naming as I show below. He illustrated that historically and culturally, labelling was not meant to be demeaning. Rather, if the newcomer became enculturated and adapted to the ways of his new community he was referred to as either 'person of the chief' or sometimes, by the name of the place he came from (Nxumalo, p. 5):

Okukhulu kakhulu futhi yikuthi lapho umuntu ozohlala nabanye wayelethwa ngomunye wendawo azombika enduneni noma enkosini yesizwe. Beseke induma noma inkosi yesizwe nebandla layo bethi lo ozokwethula isihambi noma ofikayo akaqale amakhise yena, ambeke echosheni lendawo asabelwa yona yena. Uma benza okugalungile kuthiwa "lo muntu KaSikhakhane". Uma enza kahle, ubizwa ngesibongo, noma ngomuntu wenkosi, noma ngomuntu wasekuthanathaneni, kushiwo indawo

The most important fact to consider is that the person who is going to settle with the new people/community must be reported to the local induna/chief. It then becomes the responsibility of the chief to allocate the visitor a designated plot so that he can start building. If the (foreigner/new comer) does something wrong the community will say "sikhakhane's person". However if he is doing well, he earns the privilege and respect of being called by his surname or being called the "Person of the Chief". Sometimes they can even call him by

lapho aphuma khona. (p. 5) the place of his origin.

In Nxumalo's cultural paradigm, labelling is not an exclusively malicious act. Tafira writes that in Alexandra non-South Africans are known by a wide array of names, and these labels carry connotations, some of these are degrading, others are jocular but offensive (2011, p. 117). Some of these names are: amakwerekwere (foreigner), Amagrigamba (West African), amaKalanga (Zimbabwe tribe). Tafira argued that addressing foreigners in these terms questions their motives for being 'here' and where they came from. Nxumalo's argument countered such a position by affirming that the cultural practice of labelling does not in itself incite violence, but rather it is a geographic locator and signifier of one's origins.

Names and surnames are important as they give clues to a person's lineage and origins. Nxumalo argued that culturally, to be called by one's place of origins or surname, is a compliment and does not necessarily label one as an outsider. In the context of the 2008 xenophobic riots in Alexandra, particularly due to the popular discourse in the English-language media, the practice of naming and labelling was understood in a superficial manner, referring to foreign immigrants in terms of their place of origins came to be understood as being derogatory. The *iLanga* position, as enunciated by Nxumalo, was very different.

2.2.5. The Past: They did things differently there[21]

Nxumalo pushed home his argument of acceptance and integration as the editorial unfolds. In the context of cultural ideology and shifting meaning in a multi-ethnic society such as Alexandra, he argued that reflecting and learning from *amasiko* [customs] might help in deterring future xenophobic riots. Nxumalo realised that in contemporary times such customs and protocols that need to be observed and which serve to orientate newcomers, had fallen away and some areas don't have chiefs or kings. But these areas do have councillors and community leaders, who could revive these customs.

Again the editorial used the consensual 'we' strategically to show an understanding of people's plights and further suggested integration processes to foster better social cohesion. Such cultural protocol, could help in the process of enculturation and mediate the integration of foreign immigrants back into Alexandra and other townships. Nxumalo tentatively proposed that the xenophobic riots in Alexandra could have been avoided if these customs had been in place. He further proposed that when leaders discuss the issue of xenophobia, they should consider the dynamics of specific communities before

[21] L.P. Hartley, The Go-Between, Pub. Heinemann Educational Books Ltd, 1953, p. 9

foreign immigrants are sent back. Issues on how to re-integrate foreigners back into their specific communities needed to be addressed, he wrote. Nxumalo's apt term, *udweshu* [endless quarrel] articulates the violence and he urged leadership to act more decisively (19 May, Nxumalo, p. 5).

Nxumalo's position thus clearly accepted foreigners and supported their integration back into the townships where they once lived. To facilitate the re-integration Nxumalo proposed harking back to African traditions and customs which facilitated integration of outsiders into communities. This would possibly ensure that *udweshu* [endless quarrel] was averted in communities that had foreigners/new comers. A shift is noticeable in Nxumalo's argument as he subtly hinted that perhaps immigrants should not participate in South Africa's wealth. Yet, Nxumalo articulated a few key points in understanding the xenophobic riots.

1) Ngesikhathi sobandlululo baningi ababhaca kula mazwe alaba bantu asebeshaywa. Labo ababebhace kwamanye amazwe ngesikhathi sobandlululo babehlaliswe ezinkambini, babengayabuki phakathi kwabantu, baze bathenge nezindlu ezingafanele ukuba ngabe ziyathengiswa. Labo ababebhacille kabazange babe nezitolo, nezikhumulo zokuthengisa utshwala, nezimoto, Kukhona okushaya amanzi kuleli butho elilapha nganeno kuleli zwe manje. 2) abantu bakithi bayavilapha, kabanalo ivuso lomsebenzi. Noma sebewutholile badlala ngawo. (p. 5)

1. During Apartheid many [South Africans] sought refuge in the countries where those who suffer the xenophobic attacks came from. Those who were refugees during Apartheid stayed in camps. In their host countries they were governed by rules and didn't just buy property. Those harboured by foreign nations were not given the opportunity to have shops, shebeens, and own cars. This is a different story when you compare the current refugees to those of Apartheid.
2. Our people are lazy, they are not industrious, even if they find the jobs; they just

fool around.

Nxumalo urged the reader to be reflective and reminded them of South Africa's history and relationship with her neighbouring countries. Interestingly he stressed how things worked in exile for South African cadres as some lived in camps and were governed by the rules of their host country. Nxumalo stated that in contemporary South Africa, refugees and foreign immigrants are insufficiently regulated.

2.2.6. An IFP rudder and more ANC ripples

The editorial foregrounded a mixture of positions. It advanced ideas of cultural inclusivity but hinted at a more conservative economic exclusivity. Nxumalo's dance between these two nodes became clumsy as he moved his argument towards a consideration of the 2008 situation. He further grappled with the political counter-accusations and subtly defended opposition parties. Nxumalo further complicated his argument by acknowledging the entrepreneurial skills possessed by foreign immigrants. This fits his larger argument on the process of enculturation, and his ideas on skills transferral schemes which might be used to help strengthen social cohesion in communities (Nxumalo, p. 5). Nxumalo considered readers' anxieties and did not dismiss them, especially on issues pertaining to corruption within the RDP house allocation scheme (p. 5).

Nxumalo sternly added that leadership should stop squabbling amongst themselves' and address corruption and the elicitation of fraudulent identity documents. There was a subtle pro-IFP position that Nxumalo and *iLanga* seemed to propose if we consider the news report on the 19th and the editorial on the 26th together.

Bakhuluma ngetando yeningi kodwa bengafuni kube khona amaqembu okuyiwona engumphumela yeningi futhi azihlanganisile netando yeningi. (p. 5)	They talk about democracy and the people's voice but they don't want parties that incorporate public views.

In the above excerpt Nxumalo is alluding to the political factions which characterized South Africa in the build up to 2008 as Thabo Mbeki had been consolidating power to the Office of the Presidency. But after the Polokwane conference in 2007, power moved to Luthuli House where Jacob Zuma was the president of the ANC (Harvey, 2012).

Umphakathi okhulile, kawusivumeli isimo sokudidwa nokuxovwa	The community has grown significantly and won't allow itself to be confused by

ngezinye izizathu noma izenzeko, bese ugcina ubambene ngezihluthu. (p. 5)	illegitimate reasoning that aim to fuel fights.

Here once again we see Nxumalo's authoritative voice, and the dynamic of addressivity, assuming to know and understand the reader and to share readers' ideologies. The above excerpt referred to the ANC accusing the IFP of instigating the attacks, and a possible sinister 'third force' was also insinuated. Nxumalo could also be suggesting and recalling memorises of the 1990's hostel violence. In a stern tone he added that government needed to take responsibility instead of assigning blame to the other parties.

Ngakho kuhle uholo lwamaqembu ahlukene lungavumi ukuthi noma ngubani asho noma yini engamini leqembu lakhe, ebhekise kwamanye amaqembu. Kakusona isikhathi sokugaya amavoti. (p. 5)	It is therefore right that party leaders ensure that their members toe the party line and stance, and don't purport their own stances. It is not the time to go after votes

In a measured and righteous tone, Nxumalo describe how the ruling party should act, illustrating that the ANC was failing to act objectively and with acumen.

Nxumalo's concluding notes brought to the fore his theme of *amasiko* [customs]:

Kayikho imithetho ebusa ukwemukelwa kwabantu lapha nokuthi emva kwesikhathi bayophindela kanjani emakhaya, labo abahlalayo lapha bazohlalisana kanjani nezakhamizi zalapha ngokuzayo.(p. 5)	There are no laws that govern the acceptance of people and how they will go back home afterwards. Also there are no laws that govern how the foreigners will interact on a daily basis with those inhabitants of that particular country.

In conclusion, Nxumalo added that the government needed to do more to curb the elicitation of fraudulent documents and begin to handle immigrants in South Africa more effectively. He further added that laws need to be enforced to regulate foreigners in the country, to ensure social cohesion, and address popular myths about foreigners.

The editorial was written using rich isiZulu diction and many idioms, tapping into a largely Zulu archival base in order to convey his stance. For example in the May 19 – 21 issue, Nxumalo wrote, "*Kakusona isikhathi sokugaya amavoti.*' [It is not the time to go after votes] (p. 5). He reflected on cultural history with purpose and strategically, to pull out and illustrate what worked and could still work in integrating foreigners. An example of this being is found in the May 19 – 21 editorial, when Nxumalo outlined cultural practices for integration. Nxumalo's position was not consistent throughout his two-part editorial which saw him engage in a dance between cultural inclusivity and economic exclusivity. With that said though, Nxumalo produced a well-crafted and considered two-part editorial. He foregrounded lessons and insight on the practice of labelling and name calling. He further drew from South Africa's struggle history and Zulu cultural history. A consensual 'we' reminded community members that they could and needed to be the ones to administer change.

2.2.7. Freedom's sell-by-date: A letter on the xenophobic riots

In the June 9 – 11 issue of *iLanga* a letter by Thulani Ronald Kheswa from Wasbank (KZN) was published on page four entitled, '*Lolu dlame oluqondiswe kwabokufika lubi*' [this violence directed at foreigners is bad] (Kheswa, p. 4). Kheswa's letter with its philosophical depth resonated with some of Nxumalo's foregrounded argument and moreover, it too employed loaded and powerful idioms to cement its argument.

Kheswa remarked, '*lokhu kubi kuyenyanyeka, kujivaza nesithunzi sezwe lethu jikelele*' [this is ugly and disgusting as it jeopardizes South Africa's reputation in the world] (p. 4). Kheswa further added, '*nxa uhulumeni wethu ehluleka ukuxazulula le nkinga, ngiqinisile ngithi kwanathi esiyizakhamizi kuleli zwe kuyobe kasiphephile*' [if our government cannot resolve this issue, I am sure that even we, citizens of this country are not safe] (p. 4). Kheswa posed a question to the readers and asked, '*kanti inkululeko ibuye iphele yini na?*' [Does freedom eventually finish?] (p. 4), he added that South Africa's leaders went into exile in African countries because they had freedom, whilst South Africa at the time did not (p. 4). Kheswa concluded:

ISishonephi manje inkululeko kula mazwe ngabe abakubona sebeminyene kuleli lethu? Inkululeko ihamba iphele bantu baseSouth Africa, ngakho-ke vulani amehlo nemiqondo yenu, cabangaleni ingomuso. Isihlahla asingcoliswa ngoba uyodinga	Where has these nations' freedom gone now? As they are now congested in this country. Freedom comes and goes fellow South Africans, therefore open your eyes and your minds and think of the future. You do not dump dirt under a tree because one day you will need its shade.

ukuyofuna umthunzi ngaphansi kwaso ngelinye ilanga. (p. 4)

Kheswa's letter was philosophical, reflective, and invoked reciprocity, moreover, asked uncomfortable questions which needed answers, reminding readers that the future is full of uncertainties. He mused with much hindsight and foresight as he reflected on the factionalism within the ANC: the liberation party and ruling party. The countries where the refugees and immigrants came from had gained their independence during the 1960s, 70s and 80s but now they were riddled with problems. Kheswa ended the letter by reminding South Africans that we might need these countries' help in the future just as we needed their help in the past and that they need our help now (p. 4). Kheswa's ending was insightful and philosophical drawing on pan Africanism and ending with a homely idiom to solidify his point.

2.2.8. History versus the day to day: A step back

In the same issue of *iLanga* on page five, Nxumalo picked up the themes from his previous editorial, and proffered possible solutions to address '*Ukuqhubukusha abantu bokufika*' part two [The harassing of newly arrived people] (Nxumalo, p. 5). He began the piece by thanking communities that "stood up against the violence" (p. 5). The editorial was picking up on the news that by the 9th of June some community members in Cleveland, Diepsloot and Alexandra had stood up and became active in stopping the xenophobic riots.

Baningi abantu abakhala ngokuthi abantu bokufika, kungebona abase-Afrika kuphela, okugabalwa kubo abasePakistani nabeseShayina, banobudedengu obuthile lapho sebelapha, ikakhulukazi sebeqhuba imisebenzi yabo. (p. 5)	Many people complain about the nature in which foreign immigrants conduct their business which is characterised by carelessness and clumsiness. These foreigners include people from China and Pakistan.

Nxumalo's position became more conflated when he dealt with the riots themselves in 2008. He moved away from his former inclusive Africanist position and played the devil's advocate as he considered the anxieties people had about foreigners. Again Nxumalo's 'dance' became awkward as he attempted to straddle cultural inclusivity with conservative economic exclusivity. He further brought up the issue of foreigners not paying taxes and instead sending money to their home countries. By not paying taxes

foreigners could be seen as not contributing to the development of South Africa and this could also be seen as them turning their backs on enculturation and possible national inclusion (p. 5).

2.2.9. Relations and integration

Nxumalo foregrounded the importance of historical precident and highlighted relations and the ordinariness of people so as to humanise (Jones & Dlamini, 2013) the 'other'. He then moved to consider the recent attacks on Shangane's. He again fixed his sights on the past to make a point about the present: that Shanganes', he reminded the readers are part of 'us'.

Ngenxa yokululaza isithunzi ezomlando, kwaba khona ukuhlaselwa abantu abangaba khona lapha kwathiwa ngabokuhamba. Kuvele bakhona abantu abacabanga ukuthi amaShangane nezinye izizwe ezikhona lapha eNingizumu Afrika ngabantu bokufika. Amashangane ayisizwe esaqambeka emva kokuba uSoshangane exabene neSilo uShaka, ezalwa nguZwide kaLanga. Waya eMozambique naseGazankulu. Izizwe azifica lapho kungezesibongo ezehlukene, nalezo afika nazo, zazibiza ngokuthi zingezikaSoshangane. (p. 5)	Due to the forgetting of history, 'foreigners' were [recently] attacked. Other ethnic groups including the shanganes were considered to be 'foreigners'. The Shanganes came about when king Shaka and Soshangane had a feud. Soshangane was the son of Zwide kaLanga. Soshangane left and headed to Mozambique and Gazankulu. He met different clans and they amalgamated and became known as "Zingezikasoshangane"[22].

As seen above, Nxumalo provided detailed history to illustrate *ubuhlobo* [relations] and drew from a Zulu nationalistic identity to suggest African unity and aptly remarked, '*ngabantu bakithi*' [we are one and the same people] (Nxumalo, p. 5 also see Omer-Cooper, 1973). To drive home his point, Nxumalo turned to the importance of names as markers of identity – a shared one in this case. In the context of African (Zulu) customs to be referred to by one's surname evokes one's lineage:

Bheka amagama ezibhedlela nezikole koThulamahhasi ngisho naseLimpopo. Kwavela amaShangane. Kukhona oSithole, oMthembu, oNxumalo, oMdaka, oLanga	Look at the names of Hospitals and school names: Thulamahhasi near Limpopo. Even amongst the Shangane you find surnames like

[22] Shangaan people actually speak Xitsonga not Shangaan.

*nezinye izibongo eziningi. Akusikho nokuthi ngabantu bakithi, kodwa **ngabantu basekhaya**.* (p. 5)	Sithole, Mthembu, Nxumalo, Mdaka, Langa and many other surnames. It is not that they are related to us, **we are one and the same people**[23].

Having made his point about the dangers of forgetting the past and forgetting identities, Nxumalo turned to the issue of the attacked individuals and their families and their losses, and proffered ways of moving forward. Some of the possible resolutions were that government should approach the situation creatively and deal with the xenophobic issue (primarily) instead of canvassing for votes. Instead of besmirching other political parties, Nxumalo proposed that the ruling party should be attentive and listen to communities instead of devising plans without consultation and enforcing them on communities.

Nxumalo's final message in his last editorial was a call to condemn the violence outright, before all else. Behind this all was his powerful use of historical precedent and cultural memory.

Kutusekile ukuzwe wonke umuntu ovule umlomo wakhuluma ukuba aqale ngokukhuza indaba yokuphatha kabi abafuduki. (p. 5)	It is therefore very important and respectable for anyone who chooses to be vocal about the removal of 'foreigners' to first condemn the violence.

2.2.10. iLanga lashona[24]: Narrative undercurrents

Through a critical discourse analysis this section has examined *iLanga's* coverage of the May 2008 xenophobic riots which comprised three news pieces and two lengthy linked editorials by Nxumalo, a respected intellectual and writer. Nxumalo's depth of knowledge resonated with *The Bantu World's* first editor R.V. Selope-Themba who equally used his wide and spanning mind and further drew from the past to mediate the conundrums of the 1930s (Peterson, 2006, p. 250). *ILanga* on average is a thirty page bi-weekly newspaper; it had only a maximum of two news pieces on the xenophobic riots over a period of three weeks made it for print. Why were the xenophobic riots so sparsely covered by *iLanga*? Possible answers could be that it is a largely regional newspaper and bi-weekly rather than daily.

[23] My own emphasis
[24] The sun lets

Nxumalo's two part editorial was enlightened and considered as he dealt with ANC accusations and IFP incitement to violence. He drew from two African archival repositories: Zulu cultural history and struggle history to mediate and proffer suggestions for 2008. His editorials also drew from assumed knowledge and used a 'consensual' 'we', and this 'we' was largely assumed to be from KwaZulu-Natal and privy to the province's history. He advocated for integration but it had to be carried-out with much consideration and participation of community members. Nxumalo also advocated for self-sufficient communities and most of his suggestions endeavoured to have community members at the centre of possible solutions. Nxumalo's position in his powerful and well-crafted two-part editorial was not consistent though, and at parts his prominent cultural inclusive argument was fractured by a subtle yet abrasive economic exclusive strand.

2.2.11. Conclusion: One language with two tongues

On a superficial examination the two isiZulu-language newspapers' response to the xenophobic riots might seem parochial and anachronistic, but a critical discourse analysis of the coverage shows this is not the case. isiZulu is the most frequently spoken home language in Gauteng and its speakers (nationally) take great pride in their language (Ndlovu, 2011). Anton Harber in examining the xenophobic coverage in the print media asked the question, 'what is it we want from our media at a time of ugly anti-social violence?' (2008, p. 161). *iSolezwe* and *iLanga* both evoked the historical debt that South Africa owed its neighbouring states as a way to see, understand and possibly remedy future xenophobic sentiments, and further craft possible meanings around the xenophobic riots. The trope of a common history and shared memory of the past is also pertinent in the construction of a nation-state and notions of citizenship (Perberdy, 2009, p.169). This theme of history was crucial to *iLanga's* coverage as it drew from two distinct archival repositories; armed struggle history and Zulu cultural history.

The media provides guiding myths which shape people's conception of the world (Cohen & Young, 1973, p. 9). *ILanga* foregrounded the notion of pan African identity and Zulu nationalism as guiding myths, but at times conflated the two as it attempted to mediate and foster unity and evoke solidarity. From *iSolezwe's* initial ambivalence, it quickly shifted its position in its editorial. However a tension still existed between the photojournalistic images and the news reports which suggested an almost complete understanding of the xenophobic riots. Both the isiZulu-language newspapers are KwaZulu-Natal regional papers and were late in their coverage of the riots. Their coverage was sparse but as Fowler contends, news is socially constructed and the events that are reported do not reflect the intrinsic importance of those events, but reveal the operation of the complex and artificial set of criteria

of selection (1991, p. 2). A proliferation of news coverage is not always an essential indicator of 'well reported' news, but having said that, daily news offers itself as another layer in print media coverage which is important in this thesis.

The rich idioms in both the isiZulu-language newspapers chiefly *iLanga,* make it known whom the papers are written for as an extra cultural competency was needed for a fuller understanding of the isiZulu coverage. Both the isiZulu newspapers were very measured, phatic and considered. Perhaps through their measured position, some details and myths about the xenophobic riots were done away with, leaving space for a new vision to emerge. The isiZulu-language newspapers until now have not been examined and studied in relation to their coverage of the May 2008 xenophobic riots. Their communicative styles, many shifts and emphases, and cultural function, as shown in this chapter illustrate a broad range of public idioms employed and used as the papers negotiated, mediated and communicated the May 2008 xenophobic riots.

IsiZulu is indeed the language of the public domain in many parts of the country, but English is the lingua franca of the South African political discourse. The following chapter examines three divergent English-Language newspapers, *Alex News,* a community newspaper, the *Daily Sun,* a national tabloid and the *Mail & Guardian*, a mainstream investigative newspaper. Through a critical discourse analysis I will examine how they mediated, and negotiated the xenophobic riots in their coverage and how they mediation styles differed from each other.

3. Chapter Three: Media representation and divergent narratives of crisis

'*…there can be neither a first nor a last meaning; [anything that can be understood] always exists among other meanings as a link in the chain of meaning, which in its totality is the only thing that can be real.*' (Bahktin, 1999, p. ix)

The media do not provide the *pars pro toto* of a particular event, but various layers of meaning come to the fore when a range of media is examined. Multiple layers of meaning through public idioms will be foregrounded as I examine three selected newspapers, analysing their frames of reference and communicative styles. In this chapter through a critical discourse analysis I analyse each paper initially and lastly, compare the sampled newspapers and their divergent narratives which yield multiple layers of meaning. Moreover, I will provide an overview of a complex historical moment, in this case the May 2008 xenophobic riots, through the print media. I propose to analyse three contrasting English-language newspapers; *Alex News* a then fortnightly community newspaper*, the Daily Sun* a national daily tabloid newspaper and *the Mail and Guardian* a national weekly investigative newspaper through a critical discourse analysis. Following their coverage of the May 2008 xenophobic riots in Alexandra and other areas around the country – I ask: How did these three contrasting English-language newspapers mediate and communicate the xenophobic riots? And how are the narratives divergent?

The distinction in communication between 'telling' and 'showing' becomes apparent when examining various newspapers.[25] Herman Wasserman argues that for a newspaper to tell a 'true story' means it must use idioms and spectrums of interests of one set of readers, which to another set of readers might seem banal or far removed from reality (2010, p. xi). Anton Harber, months after the xenophobic riots, posed a set of introspective questions: 'What is it we want from our media at a time of ugly anti-social violence? Brutal honesty or caution and sensitivity? Determined optimism? Or cold analysis?' (2008, p. 161). The three newspapers had divergent narratives; *Alex News* was engrossed in the community and mostly mirrored their sentiments uncritically. The *Daily Sun* had many shifts, from uncertainty to condemnation, and some tensions between the news reports and editorials were evident. The *Mail & Guardian* provided a crafted narrative with many themes, providing a stratified narrative and highlighting the complexity of the riots.

English-language newspapers in South Africa dominate circulation figures and are influential as English is the lingua franca of Southern African political discourse (McDonald and Jacobs, 2007, p.298). The three selected English newspaper each wrote for different readers. *Alex News* has a circulation figure of

[25] Marc Caldwell states that 'telling' occurs when the writer relays facts and details and leaves the readers to do with the message as they wish, whilst 'showing' on the other hand, occurs when the writer evokes the reader's own lifeworld in order that a commons – a communication – may emerge in the encounter (2011, p. 74).

30 000; the *Daily Sun* 336 318; and the *Mail & Guardian*'s circulation figure is over 50 000[26]. Each offered varying emphases and foci as the crafted meaning around the xenophobic riots. *Alex News'* focus was on Alexadrans' frustrations, the *Daily Sun's* focus was on a much larger pool of "blue-collar" workers and the *Mail & Guardian's* emphasis was on trying to provide "balance" coverage. In my examination of these newspapers I will carry out a critical discourse analysis, examining the themes which came from the news reports, public idioms used, images and their captions, and innuendoes insinuated in the page lay-out. I will also examine letters by readers and editorials (only the *Daily Sun* had editorials) by these English-language newspapers.

The three newspapers covered the riots with different foci but two themes flowed through all three newspapers: first the question of national and local leadership (and its absences) was key. The second theme was the politics of necessity and South Africans' frustrations with their democratic dispensation. Peter Geschiere in discussing autochthony argues that, 'what is at stake is often less a defence of the local than efforts to exclude others from access to the new circuits of riches and power' (2009, p. 26). The xenophobic riots were an amalgamation of many discourses; a defence of the local can be seen as a defence of South Africa's national identity (Chipkin 2007) and South Africa's resources (Landau 2010). The three newspapers illustrated these tensions and more in their coverage.

3.1. News and its making: English for three audiences

Although the newspapers I discuss below are written in English, each targeted different readers and crafted very different narratives for their specific markets. To analyse print media requires examining the manifest and latent messages held in the page layout and article innuendoes. Such a critical discourse analysis acknowledges the dialogical character of narratives (Briggs, 1996) and moreover, the sequential and multiple nodes of meaning that can be read from texts, images and their captions (Fowler, 1991). In addition, photographs are of particular interest in this sample of English-language newspapers, as they are both denotative and connotative as I illustrate in this chapter. The chapter is comprised of three main parts: Section One focuses on *Alex News,* Section Two on the *Daily Sun* and Section Three focuses on the *Mail & Guardian*.

[26] http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com accessed 15 June 2013

3.2. Section One

3.2.1. *Alex News*, "Sisonke"[27]: The community's mouthpiece

Alex News is a community newspaper presently available free of charge every Thursday, but in 2008 it was distributed fortnightly. It was launched in 2005 by Caxton CTP Publishers as part of a series of local newspapers known as 'Urban News', its offices are in Craighall, Johannesburg (Tsingo, 2009, p. 7). The popular and widely read community newspaper is distributed to 30 000 homes and businesses in Alexandra.[28] *Alex News* is what is known as a 'conglomerate-owned publication'; the community newspaper is funded by advertisers and at times market dynamics impinge on the ideal balance between the pursuit of economic interests and the promotion of common [public] interests (Mwangi, 2007, p. 4). This awkward balance specifically in community newspapers can sometimes be crudely seen as a form of 'soft' censorship, as normative journalism has to make way for market-driven journalism.

Alex News began covering the xenophobic riots in their May 15th 2008 issue, three days after the riots broke out in Alexandra. Before the xenophobic eruption in May, the paper had illustrated anxieties over housing and living space, expressing the in-built tensions which characterised the township, months before the eventual eruption in May. It provided pithy, un-distilled coverage of the xenophobic riots and its main theme was an unapologetic position towards the riots as the paper captured Alexandra residents' anxieties and frustrations. The newspaper provided a crescendo of news which was both inflammatory and unrepentant. The stance of the newspaper did not vary and was characterised by one recurring theme: consistent mirroring of the unapologetic sentiments of angry residents. The paper did, however, attempt to widen its journalistic lens by incorporating "considered" views from letters by readers. But the newspaper did predominately print unfiltered sentiments by frustrated residents of Alexandra and made no attempt at distance or impartiality as the editor and journalists were too engrossed in the community and thus mirrored community members' discourses uncritically. This closeness compromised the newspaper's impartiality.

3.2.2. Alexandra 2008: Tensions brew, tensions rise

Alex News' early coverage illustrated many undercurrents which characterised the township just months before the riots. The community newspaper gave glimpses of daily dissonances in Alexandra which can be viewed as catalysts to what would turn into a volatile location in months to come. Aside

[27] We are together
[28] http://www.looklocal.co.za/looklocal/content/en/north-east-joburg

from the ANC factionalism which came to characterise 2008, in the early months of 2008 *Alex News* coverage illustrated how local, provincial and national issues affected the daily lives of Alexandrans. In the February - March issue editor Sipho Siso and *Alex News* reporter Sandy, provided coverage of the ongoing taxi route squabbles between AMSTRA (Alex-Midrand-Sandton Taxi Association) and ATA (Alexandra Taxi Association). The Department of Transport was called to intervene, but no intervention was made. The squabbles turned violent on the 6th of March when a taxi was burnt at the Pan Africa taxi rank in Alexandra. One of Alexandra's oldest problems is the issue of housing and property ownership. A summit was planned to involve all key stakeholders in the Alexandra housing development scheme to discuss ways to improve housing development, but it was postponed (see Chapter Five for more detail on Alexandra housing struggles).

The struggle for housing in Alexandra has been a recurring problem since the 1920s, but by the late 1980s Alexandra was transformed into a squatter township and was probably the most congested residential area in the country (Bonner & Nieftagodien 2008, p. 311). Even in the post-apartheid era, Alexandra is still characterised by housing issues and development squabbles as disgruntlement between community leaders representing different sectors, impede talks. The front page cover of the April 22 – May 1 issue carried a photograph of a shanty-town called Setswetla, located in Alexandra. The headline read, 'ARP's billions aim to get rid of this!' meaning Setswetla's shacks (p. 1) and another read, 'HOUSING FOR ALL: fifteen years into democracy and these people still yearn for a decent roof over their heads.' (p. 2).

Official policy in the 1980s legitimised squatters in Alexandra who arrived after 1986. The state pledged to provide Setswetla with basic services (Bonner and Nieftagodien 2008, p. 311) yet in the post-apartheid era, Setswetla is still a squatter camp on the banks of the Jukskei River. Siso's news report (above) raised the link between material demands and democratic liberties (Zuern, 2011, p. 4) that South Africans felt entitled to, but for which fifteen years into democracy are still awaiting. The report illustrated deep seated pessimism over service delivery and lagging roll-out of democratic civic liberties.

The well-funded projects that Siso reported on (above) faced many difficulties because of squabbling community leaders. From my reading, I see the leadership factions in Alexandra as impeding fruitful development talks and the residents of Alexandra suffering as their community's discords stall development. Property ownership is a raw issue in Alexandra and its specificities have affected various

development plans throughout its history which have aimed to 'develop' Alexandra[29] (for contemporary commentary see chapter Five).

3.2.3. Alexandra erupts and missing leadership?

The xenophobic riots broke-out on May 11th in Alexandra and a response by the national leadership was missing from the onset. *Alex News* carried a strong latent message in its coverage as it depicted the ruling party as being irresolute and unresponsive. The paper juxtaposed this with the unlikely national leader, Chief Mangosuthu Buthelezi, leader of the Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) who filled the leadership vacuum. The front cover of the May 15 – 28 issue carried a photograph of a young man who had been beaten by xenophobic rioters, the caption below read, 'The aftermath of a xenophobic war in Alexandra…'(Siso, p 1). On the same page were two other headlines, 'Thieves caught in the act' and another, 'Xenophobic Alex', both written by the editor, Sipho Siso (p. 1). Siso reported that two people were shot dead and scores injured over the weekend (Sunday the 11th) and again on Monday when the xenophobic violence continued. Constable Malefetse of the SAPS claimed that people around Madala hostel in 2nd Avenue had gone door to door, ordering foreigners to leave the area and return to their respective countries (p.1). Two angry residents were reported to have said,

> 'We are fed up with these foreigners…these people come here and take our jobs and accept below-inflation salaries. We cannot compete with them because we have families and relatives to feed, while they have only themselves to look after' (p. 1)

Issues of belonging and citizenry obligations were evident in the sentiments of the Alexandrans as some saw 'national resources' being haemorrhaged by foreigners (see Steinberg 2012 & Landau 2010, and Section One of Chapter Two).

In the following issue (May 29 – June 11), the front cover headline read, 'Touched' referring to IFP leader Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi being one of the first political leaders to attend to the riots (according to the evidence of the newspaper), showing compassion and empathy to both immigrants and South Africans (p. 1). According to the newspaper Buthelezi also visited other affected areas

[29] In 1974 property owners were stripped of their property rights and thus any 'top-down' development is viewed with suspicion (Bonner and Nieftagodien, 2008).

around Johannesburg (p. 1)[30]. Dimakatso Maroleni quoted Buthelezi as saying, 'Any member or supporter of the IFP found to have been involved in the attacks will be expelled from its ranks, as it [xenophobia] will not be tolerated…An attack on our African brothers and sisters is an attack on all of us.' (p. 1)

In the above excerpt we see Buthelezi drawing from a pan-African identity to foster unity and empathy. He further invoked the spirit of *ubuntu* as a common sentiment to all Africans. This strategy of invoking a pan-African identity as a uniting force was also employed by *iLanga's* editorials (see chapter two).

The same account described a Zimbabwean woman, Anna Bila, who broke down and wept when telling her story, 'We live in fear for our lives as our attackers threatened that if we should ever return to our homes they would kill us' (p 1). Buthelezi took out a tissue and wiped the woman's tears and in the process started crying himself (p.1).

This particular news report is telling as it is the first direct reference to foreign immigrants that *Alex News* published. Although not offering any shifts in its position, this strand of the xenophobic coverage offered itself as an attempt at widening the paper's lens in its reportage emphasis. Moreover, it was ironical that the foreign immigrants finally 'received' focus because of the report on Buthelezi's intervention. The newspaper's attention to Buthelezi furthered what I believe to have been the newspapers own ambition: to report on oppositional parties' actions and ignore the ANC's (although belated) actions. The newspaper's focus on Buthelezi was different and insightful as Buthelezi spoke to both the displaced foreign immigrants and the angry residents with tact and addressivity (Bakhtin 1986). The news report ended by remarking that the violence had subsided, thus insinuating that Buthelezi was crucial in this turn of events. *Alex News* strategically had Buthelezi 'usurp' leadership whilst the ANC (according to the paper's evidence) remained silent.

In the May 29 – June 11 issue, *Alex News* slightly widened its lens, as it included more measured and nationally inclusive voices which it introduced through two letters by DA officials. An *Alex News* journalist reported that two Democratic Alliance (DA) Councillors had discovered that four Zimbabwean officials owned RDP (Reconstruction and Development Programme) houses in Extension 7. This refuted the claim that no foreigners owned RDP houses (p. 2). The DA stated that the xenophobic attacks were actually provoked by poor housing service delivery and were not in themselves xenophobic attacks (p.

[30] According to an interview with IFP Gauteng Provincial Chairperson, Mr. Nhlanhla Msimango Chief Mangosuthu Buthelezi's sympathy visit was only to Alexandra, he recalls this as he was with Buthelezi (interview 22/05/13)

2). Once again we see *Alex News* choosing to publish and emphases the view of the oppositional party, furthering its own mission of favouring reporting news concerning oppositional parties.

The same issue included five letters from readers and two by representatives of the DA. Solly Nkhi a Member of the Provincial Legislature (MPL - DA representative) asked a rhetorical question,

> Who's next? Today it is Zimbabweans and Malawians. Tomorrow it will be people from Limpopo and the Eastern Cape who leave their homes to come to the best province in the country looking for work. (p. 4)

Nkhi contemplated South Africa's own internal economic migration patterns and possible future targets of xenophobic violence should the foreign immigrant threat be eradicated. The questions again evoked splinter sentiments of autochthony and the protection of 'circuits of riches' from being sapped by foreign immigrants (Geschiere, 2009, p. 26). In another letter, David Quail, member of the Gauteng Legislature and DA spokesman on Education, brought-up the ethnicity factor as possibly being of special importance when physiological and survival needs are high. He further assigned blame to slow government service delivery and the failure of interactive leadership at many levels (p. 4).

Alex News' selection of these two letters can be read as slightly widening its lens but the paper still largely mirrored inflammatory sentiments by residents. Both the letters were by DA officials, South Africa's official opposition party. Without a doubt what the DA officials aired was important but, what was also telling was *Alex News's* selection process and clear favouring of anything which counteracted the official narrative and position held by the ANC-led government. In this vein, the newspaper omitted several facts to their cause of sidelining the official narrative.

3.2.4. Xenophobia: Our story to tell

Alex News' key position or rather what it mainly mirrored was an unapologetic stance towards the xenophobic riots by residents. This assertion was aptly articulated by chairperson of the ACA (Alexandra Civic Association) and active member of the ANC Mike Beea. Another strong strand was that of ex-exiled ANC cadres who falsely compared their experience as refugees, to what refugees in South Africa should also experience. Their laments were characterised by a narrow national position. Page two (May 29 – June 11) had a provocative title which read, 'Put them in camps as well' (p. 2). Siso had gone out to the streets of Alexandra on the 25th of May to interview residents about possible causes of the attacks. His news report focused on two former exiled cadres; one had spent time in Zambia as a refugee and another in Botswana (p. 2). Siso's opening paragraph echoed South Africa's

immigration policy which is markedly contradictory as its rhetoric speaks of inclusivity but in practice it is selective in its inclusion, based on sought after skills (see Peberdy 2009).

Angry Alex residents offered Siso their unfiltered sentiments and stated that foreign immigrants were taking over their houses, markets, jobs and street vending itself. Some residents felt overwhelmed by the number of foreign immigrants in Alexandra. A former exile in Zambia, urged the South African government to open up camps for genuine refugees.

Recalling his time in exile he added that there was order in the camps and one could not just walk out.

> But in South Africa today we have refugees that criss-cross the country every minute. They wake up in Polokwane, lunch in Cape Town, and sleep in Port Elizabeth, and you call these people refugees. How do you offer such people assistance because you don't even know where they live and sleep? (p. 2)

The ex-exiled cadre in essence was lambasting the government's lack of surveillance. What we see above and the excerpts to follow below, are two ex-cadres attempting to falsely compare their refugee experiences to what refugees in South Africa should be subjected to. The ex-exiled cadres disregarded the historical and the political context of their time in exile and falsely compared it to bourgeoning economic migration patterns in South Africa.

Another former exile asked,

> Why should we just open up our borders for this influx. If we are happy with the influx or people, we might as well do away with the border-gates and let these people come and go as they please…genuine refugees should be allowed in and those that are bringing scarce skills and capital...(p. 2)

The raw sentiments by the former exiles illustrated both ignorance on the state's position concerning migrants and also a sentiment, hostile to outsiders. In contrast to the above moreover, the paper published a more measured letter from a resident of Yeoville. George Starita of Yeoville expressed concern over the attacks by South Africans on African foreigners in Alexandra (p 4). He remarked,

> While one should not be too ready to condemn angry, frustrated South Africans who often feel they are being cheated in a country

> they toiled so long to liberate, their hatred of their African brothers and sisters can never be condoned. (p 4)

Starita expressed concern that Yeoville was sitting on a similar time-bomb as Alexandra had, and added that South Africans felt that Zimbabweans had already pillaged their own country and now wanted to do the same to South Africa (p. 4). Starita's letter while acknowledging negative sentiments held by foreigners against South Africans was insightful and critically examined some of the popular discourse on outsiders.

In the June 26 – July 9 issue, *Alex News* shifted its position and simply highlighted residents of Alexandra's antipathy to outsiders. The main headline read, 'Foreigners warned: Return at own peril' and a photograph of a stern and assertive Mike Beea an ANC member and chairperson of the Alexandra Civic Association (ACA) accompanied the main story (p. 1). *Alex News* highlighted a prominent member of the community and conveyed his inflammatory sentiments without critical distance. Beea stated that foreign immigrants should not be allowed back into Alexandra until the government attended to the issues which led to their expulsion (p. 1). He further added slyly that 'Alexandrans have never been and will never be xenophobic. They [Alexandrans] just have grievances and gripes against the governments slow service delivery' (p.1).

Beea in a seditious and inflammatory "lament" remarked, 'you then call these people xenophobic when they vent their anger at a system which allows new arrivals to the township, and moreover foreigners, to own houses.' (p.1) Beea's sentiments were mirrored uncritically by *Alex News*. He came across as unapologetic in his "lament" and further qualified his stance. He foregrounded Alexandra's migration history and acknowledged that historically Alexandra was characterised by internal and external migrants. The discourse of insider/outsider which has historical roots was invoked. At times Beea's laments were paradoxical, accepting foreigners in Alexandra and later calling for their removal, there were tensions in his ascertains but frustration drove his lament.

In conclusion Beea stated, 'we are not going to apologise to anyone for the recent attacks because we owe no-one any apology.' (p.2)

3.2.5. Tensions and undercurrents

To conclude, *Alex News* being a then fortnightly community newspaper, began covering the xenophobic riots on the 15th of May and reported on the riots in four issues, from mid May till the first week of July 2008. Through a critical discourse analysis we see that the newspaper lacked an editorial position as the editor was too engrossed in the events as they unfolded and the paper ended up

mirroring inflammatory sentiments. The paper did slightly widen its lens by including thought-provoking letters by Politicians and a resident of Yeoville. Moreover, the community newspaper provided a position which sidelined the official narrative and a clear support for alternative leadership and an oppositional voice. It strategically crafted a narrative which had Mangosuthu Buthelezi 'usurp' leadership and omitted any actions or news of the ANC-led government. Residents of Alexandra questioned the country's immigration policies and questioned the progress of development meted out by the ruling party.

In the following section through a critical discourse analysis I examine the coverage of the *Daily Sun,* a South African daily tabloid. Its coverage had many themes and several shifts in position. Its audience although much larger, was similar to that of *Alex News,* from lower income groups, and the newspaper communicated the xenophobic riots with a personal and at times obtuse style. The papers were different in other important ways as will be examined below.

3.3. Section Two

3.3.1. The Daily Sun: The people's paper

The *Daily Sun* is South Africa's most successful and widely circulated national daily tabloid with a circulation figure of 336, 318 copies sold per day, which equates to a readership figure of 5 669 000[31]. Its current editor is Themba Khumalo. Publisher and founder, Deon du Plessis, claimed that the newspaper has a 'community' of readers (Wasserman, 2010, p.1) which came about through a gained measure of trust, as these readers had felt forgotten in the post-apartheid media sphere (p.8).

Established in 2002, the *Daily Sun* is currently owned by Naspers and has offices in Auckland Park, Johannesburg. The *Daily Sun* uncovered a whole layer of new newspaper readers amongst lower income groups.[32]The tabloid offers more local news and gossip, focusing on events in ordinary people's lives primarily than on national and international news.[33] It began covering the May 2008 xenophobic riots on the 15th of May and on the 29th The Media Monitoring Project (MMP) submitted a complaint on its reportage to the Press Ombudsman. The complaint was against the *Daily Sun's* coverage of the attacks and urged Press Ombudsman to have the *Daily Sun* change its approach which they felt was inappropriate and discriminatory. The plaintiff felt the *Daily Sun* failed to either condemn the violence

[31] http://www.media24.com/en/newspaper/emerging-martket accessed on the 11th of June 2013
[32] http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/daily-sun-founder-dies accessed on the 9th of June 2013
[33] http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com/index.php?option=com_con accessed on the 17th of May 2013

clearly or offer non-violent alternatives.[34] Later in the year the complaint was dismissed by the Press Ombudsman.

Through a critical discourse analysis of the paper's coverage it is evident that the newspaper's coverage was more diverse and stratified then the caricature presented by the complaint. It reflected many shifts in position and perspectives, initially taking an assertive stance, 'telling' as opposed to 'showing' the news. The first position simplified and poured scorn on the official narrative (response) and proceeded to show the events from the newspaper's perspective. The first shift presented itself as a 'national soul searching' quest, questioning the calibre of leadership which was needed to deal with the situation. The second shift represented a sympathetic stance as the tabloid began to make use of a wider lens which included the sentiments and predicaments of affected immigrants. The final position was the most interesting as the newspaper began incorporating the anguish and the sentiments of foreign immigrants directed to South Africans, into its now larger narrative.

3.3.2. Of aliens and citizens

The *Daily Sun* began covering the xenophobic riots every day from the 15th of May till the 3rd of June in an unbroken sequence and its initial position was assertive, obtuse and almost complacent. The headlines on Thursday (15th) read, 'Aliens: The Truth! Daily Sun tells why Alex exploded' (Daily Sun, p.1) another read, 'Flames of Fury' and the last one read, 'When crime-battered people have had enough!' (p. 1). The layout of the front cover on a close examination reveals a tacitean[35] alternative. Stuart Hall contends that photographs receive ideological amplification which means that when a photograph is inserted into a set of thematic interpretations it becomes an ideological sign (1973, p. 185). The headline of the xenophobic attacks on their own worked to grab the attention of the reader. The tacitean innuendo was revealed by the manner in which the 'Flames of Fury' headline was loaded with meaning and this insinuated that the xenophobic attacks were justified.

The opening paragraph of the headline story read,

> People who believe they are very important are running around in circles again…this time about the violence in Alexandra. There is much wailing about the debt we owe foreigners, the lessons we should learn from our own

[34] http://mg.co.za/print/2008-05-30-daily-sun-in-hot-water-over-war-on-aliens accessed on the 14th of June 2013

[35] Tacitus Annals (64 CE) famously used this type of innuendo in his literature when proffering two possibilities but in a covert manner guides the reader to side with the more sinister possibility.

> struggle, the dignity of all Africans, the evils of xenophobia – the big word for hatred of foreigners. There are calls again for *indabas* and workshops on the subject. WHAT NONSENSE! (Maluleke, p.1)

The *Daily Sun* simplified and poured scorn on the official 'explanation' for what went wrong. In succinct points the reporter elaborated that too many South Africans are frustrated at slow service delivery and corruption (p. 1).

The news report captured residents' sentiments and remarked that the government had no proper policy for foreigners in the country (p.1). Residents were frustrated and felt let down by the government that pitted them against foreigners.

The *Daily Sun* introduced an inclusive 'we' in its reporting, positioning themselves in a highly emotive manner as authoritative dispensers of knowledge. The tabloid also employed an apartheid term 'alien'[36] to describe foreign immigrants, claiming that ordinary people do not understand the term xenophobic. The usage of the term was thought to be dehumanising by Media Monitoring Project. Furthermore the politics of necessity and the notion of South Africa's circuits of wealth being drained were invoked.

The *Daily Sun's* initial crass position seemed to side with the popular discourse that foreign immigrants were behind the escalating levels of crime in townships. Its narrative was simplistic and it called for less convoluted language by government. Furthermore the tabloid resisted 'objectivity' and critical distance. Yet, Anton Harber in discussing the *Daily Sun's* xenophobic coverage remarked, 'it articulated, frustrations and anger which, distasteful as it may often be, were really substantial' (2008, p. 168).

3.3.3. National soul searching

From its initial crass and authoritative position, the *Daily Sun* began to show glimpses of a narrative that was moving towards an introspective shift. On page twenty one of the May 15th and 25th issue, reporters harked back to the meaning of Africa Day (25th of May) and Africa's common experience with colonialism, racism and capital oppression. The news reports began to be more introspective and sought a reflective understanding of Africa Day, drawing on unity and shared experience from a pan African identity.

On page thirty one the *Daily Sun* published three letters from readers condemning the violence. The letters evoked elements of an African Renaissance social order and further warned that xenophobic

[36] The term arose from the apartheid Alien Control Act which was done away with in 2002 (Peberdy 2009)

violence would soon move to tribal/ethnic terrain. The letters showed the newspaper's national spread as they came from all around the country. There seemed to be a tension regarding the early uncritical coverage; these letters were more considered as they condemned the attacks but understood the frustrations that South Africans must have felt.

Page eight had the *Daily Sun's* first editorial by *Daily Sun* Editor Themba Khumalo entitled, 'Where are the leaders who can save us from these evil demons of death and destruction? BLOODY NOWHERE!' (Khumalo, p. 8). Khumalo's editorial was written in a literary pastiche style:

> 'No wonder the rains do not visit our continent much. The soil drinks the blood of the children of this continent…in the middle of the night, guns sing in unison, accompanied by raging crowds. In the morning, the African sun looks in disgust at what the night had delivered.' (p. 8)

Khumalo's prose style is indexical of tabloid writing style which, as Wasserman remarks that tabloids have a fluid modality which denies any stylistic difference between genres (2010, p. 15). Khumalo's literary pastiche style drew from the works of: Bloke Modisane 1963 novel *Blame Me on History*, Mongane Serote's 1981 novel *To Every Birth its Blood* and Zachariah Rapola's 2007 novel *Beginnings of a Dream*, novels which 'portended' the violence. His vivid style was descriptive, melodramatic and evoked South Africa's historical episodes. He crafted this collage to illustrate past social upheavals in Johannesburg townships and in some ways, was warning society that South Africa must not revert to her bloody history.

Khumalo's editorial marked a shift in the *Daily Sun's* position which from the 15th of May issue seemed un-objective and firmly sided with angry residents. The editorial on the 15th provided a shift, as editorials generally mark a newspaper's position and ideology. His editorial was in parts introspective and reflective as it inquired about African leadership as a whole. By doing this, Khumalo widened the scope and foregrounded some of the reasons why African immigrants were leaving their respective countries. Letters by readers lambasted Thabo Mbeki's indecisiveness in addressing Zimbabwe's problems and his irresolute stance on the xenophobic riots (Daily Sun, p. 31).

From my reading and critical discourse analysis of the letters and editorial, it is evident that the *Daily Sun* did not solely provide a biased narrative but incorporated reader's thoughts and insights. Editorials play guiding roles in newspapers, and the *Daily Sun's* editorial in fact, stood juxtaposed to what the Media Monitoring Project claimed the tabloid was guilty of doing: being crass.

3.3.4. Wider scope and narrative shifts

By the 19th of May the *Daily Sun* exhibited a big shift in position, tentatively adhered to normative journalism[37] and began 'showing' as opposed to 'telling' the story. From the 19th onwards, this definite shift, led by Khumalo's editorial and letters from readers, broadened the discourse. The headline on the cover of the May 19th issue read, 'When love turns to hate!' (Masipa, p. 1). The *Daily Sun* being a tabloid is dominated by human interest stories and its content in relation to the xenophobic riots, moved between the public and the private realms (Wasserman, 2010, p. 15). Such stories aided in showing the lived experience of people affected by the xenophobic attacks.

By the 20th the riots took an interesting turn as foreign immigrants around Johannesburg began fighting back. Some communities like Diepsloot took a stand against the riots and helped foreign immigrants rebuild their shacks. On page four and five were photographs with captions under the heading, 'Battleground: Images of war in the streets!' (p. 4 - 5). The photographs illustrated a vivid story of grotesque violence and pillaging in the Johannesburg CBD, Ramaphosa, Kya Sands and Volsoorus informal settlements (p. 4 - 5). Photographs add new dimensions to a text and at times are more strident than writing, as they impose meaning at one stroke, without analysing or diluting the news (Hall, 1973, p. 176).The *Daily Sun* illustrated the tensions and dilemmas foreigners faced since some could not return home as wars plagued their respective countries (22 May , p. 2).

Increasingly the newspaper included the sentiments of displaced foreign immigrants and this widened the scope around issues which were catalysts to the expulsion of foreign immigrants. Some Mozambicans felt betrayed by South Africans and vowed to retaliate if ever South Africans set foot in Mozambique. The newspaper covered the riots as they spread across the country. These stories illustrated the daily struggles of displaced foreign immigrants as they contemplated returning to their (sometimes) worst off respective countries.

The xenophobic riots broke out in the same month as the Zimbabwean presidential elections and MDC leader Morgan Tsvangirai paid Alexandra a sympathetic and political visit, and used the tragic events to rally support for his political party (May 22, p.1). The *Speak Up* section had a letter from a reader condemning the corroded moral fibre of Alexandrans. The anonymous letter alluded to the fact that most Alexandrans are descendants of foreigners and now they were attacking immigrants (Daily Sun, p. 39).

[37] Normative media theory concerns the perceived and ideal role(s) the media are to play in a society (Wasserman, 2011, p. 27)

The employment of popular forms of political resistance was also evident in some of the xenophobic attacks. The *Daily Sun* reported on incidences where foreigners were attacked and songs were used by rioting mobs as they attacked foreign immigrants. Page eight (May 27th issue) had a story of Robert Xitlangu who had obtained his South African citizenship in 1993. He was beaten and burnt by an angry mob in Mamelodi near Tshwane (Mathye, p. 8). Xitlangu reported that he watched in horror as one thug mixed petrol and methylated spirit before pouring it over him, 'the group threw me into a burning shack, then they went off singing freedom songs' (p. 8). What was further intriguing was the usage of 'freedom songs' and why such a medium was evoked. Liz Gunner argues that songs are means of capturing and giving expression to frustration and anxiety (2009, p. 38). Furthermore, song and dance fracture time and place, decontextualising the performing body. The singing rioters used songs to provide for the possibility of change and the re-ordering of their lives (Elliot, 1999, p. 134).

3.3.5. Xenophobia on the ground: Conflated narratives

In the *Daily Sun's* "thick" coverage of the xenophobic attacks around the country, it became clear from the 20th of May that the attacks had moved away from their initial narrow binary dynamic. The reportage illustrated many tensions and included the voices of more foreign immigrants who had lived through the attacks. The 21st of May headline read, 'Don't let the madness spread to Cape! Aliens told: stay calm' as the riots spread to the Western Cape (Daily Sun, p. 1).

Israel Nkosi a Zimbabwean in Cape Town lamented that, '*umkhonto we Sizwe* soldiers were harboured in countries like Zimbabwe, Congo and Mozambique. They were all treated with respect' (p. 2). The historical struggle debt theme is once again invoked by foreign nationals. This recurring theme of ingratitude formed a crucial point of debate in most of the readers' letters.

By the 21st the *Daily Sun* illustrated how foreign immigrants were holding their ground and combating the xenophobic rioters. The coverage provided news which broadened the discourse and complicated the neat binary understanding of the xenophobic attacks.

3.3.6. Leadership, factionalism and action?

Once again the leadership vacuum of 2008 was made more apparent in the lack of visible national leaders (21st May) from government and the ANC. Factionalism within the ANC was made apparent by the ambiguities which emanated from there being two 'seats' of power in 2008. Matekane reported that Thabo Mbeki ordered the army to help control the situation (Matekane, p. 1). On page five Matekane reported that ANC President Jacob Zuma welcomed the decision by President Thabo Mbeki to deploy the army to help police restore order (p. 5). The two reports are very telling of the political climate of

2008 and the ambiguities of where the seat of power was: the Union Building or Luthuli House. On the same page Jacob Zuma is reported to have addressed a crowd in Ekurhuleni on the 25th of May and stated, 'I am the president of the ANC…and all those government ministers were deployed by the ANC' (Matekane and Ramothatha, p. 1). Annoyed residents angrily inquired about their democratic liberties and brought up the politics of necessity as 14 years after democracy they felt not enough change had occurred.

3.3.7. Condemnation, frustration and hindsight

Another of the *Daily Sun's* positions was a sharp condemnation of the attacks, explicit frustration by foreign immigrants and historical hindsight in an attempt to probe the xenophobic riots. The *Daily Sun's* 26th of May issue contained Themba Khumalo's second editorial and it condemned the perpetrators for the means they used. Khumalo wrote,

> Hope, prosperity, dignity, peace! I saw these fine ideals turn their backs on us. They limped slowly and painfully. I saw them head for the mountain. They were bleeding, they turned one-by-one to look at me as I screamed for them to stop. (p. 7)

Khumalo's dramatic editorial evoked these virtues as he mused in despair and bemoaned the attacks. He added,

> If your skin is too dark and you do not speak their language, they fast-track your journey to the grave. They are blinded by hatred – hatred of themselves because they unleash their madness on people who look like them. (p. 7)

Khumalo concluded by saying, 'there are MANY clever, creative and honest ways to fight poverty…we write about them in the *Daily Sun* every day. *Sekwanele bakithi* [it is enough fellow people]…stop this madness!' (p. 7)

Khumalo's powerful lines invoked Geschiere's argument that autochthony as a term is free-floating and combines apparent self-evidence with great ambiguity and variation in its meaning (2009, p. 6). The editorial grappled with notions of identity and sentiments of self-hate which resonated with what Fanon calls a 'neurotic condition' (Bhabha & Sardar, 2008, p. xiv). He further posed introspective rhetorical questions to cement his argument that attacking foreign immigrants would not create jobs.

The *Daily Sun's* (29th & 30th) coverage further included counter-xenophobic sentiments by foreign immigrants in displacement camps in Cape Town. Their sentiments were a mixture of anger, frustration and racism, as some felt betrayed by black South Africans. Their livelihoods were destroyed and people were now faced with the decision whether to return to their respective countries or weather the storm in South Africa.

The *Daily Sun* published an evocative letter which invoked South Africa's apartheid history to ignite consciousness. Sandile Bele from Durban wrote a powerful letter and quoted a speech delivered by P.W. Botha in August 1985:

> By now every one of us has seen…that the blacks cannot rule themselves. Give them guns and they will kill each other. They are good at nothing else but making noise, dancing, marrying many wives and indulging in sex. Let us all accept that the black man is the symbol of poverty, mental inferiority, laziness and emotional incompetence (Daily Sun, p 39).

Bele further remarked, 'with these words I'm not trying to make us go back or to hate white people, but we are acting according to the speech' (p 39).

Bele's provocative letter was retrospective and insightful as it beckoned readers to be conscious of South Africa's recent past and called for reflective minds. This reflection required South Africans to actively and consciously dismantle racist stereotypes which were perpetuated by the apartheid government.

Tuesday the 3rd of June was the last day upon which the *Daily Sun* covered the xenophobic riots in a continuous sequence and the headline read, 'Somalis March, Cape cops fire rubber bullets as foreigners tell Mbeki to wake up' (Daily Sun, p. 1). Somali nationals and South Africans marched in Cape Town and protested against Thabo Mbeki's irresolute stance, condemning Thabo Mbeki's aloofness and distance from the ordinary man on the ground.

3.3.8. Anger, understanding and retrospect

In conclusion, the *Daily Sun* began covering the xenophobic riots on the 15th of May, three days after the riots erupted, but it provided meticulous daily coverage of the riots as they erupted around the country. The tabloid was accused of using discriminatory terms and its reporting was thought to be inappropriate by the Media Monitoring Project as it supposedly never offered any non-violent

alternatives. Yet a critical discourse analysis of the *Daily Sun's* coverage of the xenophobic riots illustrates that the newspaper was more diverse in its reporting than it was described as having been by the Media Monitoring Project in 2008. The newspaper undertook many shifts in position, from an initial crass authoritative stance, to a more introspective one, followed by a widened scope which provided more insight and finally it ended with a conflated narrative.

The *Daily Sun's* coverage was not parochial; its nuances were in its topological reading and tensions between the news reports, images, editorial and letters as meaning around the riots was being negotiated. Wasserman argues that tabloids give their readers a way to engage with aspects of politics that relate to their daily lives, instead of what is considered a wholesome diet of formal political coverage (2010, p. 33). Through public idioms the newspaper focused on the human interest element of the xenophobic riots, illustrated the effects of the riots and blurred the lines between personal and public, thus providing a multidimensional narrative. In the following and final section through a critical discourse analysis, I examine the coverage of the *Mail & Guardian* a weekly newspaper which prides itself on its investigative journalism. It did not shift in its position but explored many themes and provided a measured narrative.

3.4. Section Three

3.4.1. The Mail and Guardian: A crafted narrative

The *Mail and Guardian* is a weekly newspaper that prides itself on quality investigative journalism. Founded in 1985 as the *Weekly Mail,* later the *Mail & Guardian* entered a partnership with the *Guardian* of London which ensured the newspaper's continued existence. Most of its shares are owned by Zimbabwean entrepreneur Trevor Ncube, but it is run by Mail & Guardian media Limited.[38] The *Mail and Guardian's* circulation figures are over 50 000 and it has an estimated readership of 428 000.[39] Its current editor-in-Chief is Chris Roper.[40] To account for its niche relevance Nic Dawes (previous editor-in-chief) claimed, 'the appetite for relevant, credible news is stronger than ever and that is what we aim to deliver'.[41] Despite its small circulation the *Mail & Guardian* is arguably the most important paper for South African political elites (McDonald and Jacobs, 2007, p. 300). The *Mail & Guardian* produced two issues which covered the May 2008 xenophobic riots. Their first was the May 23 to 29, followed by the May 30 to June 5 issues. It provided measured and carefully crafted communication which illuminated

[38] http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com accessed on the 15th June 2013
[39] http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com accessed on the 15th June 2013
[40] http://www.citypress.co.za/news/mail-guardian-reveals-new-editors accessed on the 26th August 2013
[41] http://www.mg.co.za/article/2012-03-09-defies-downward-circulation accessed 15 June 2013

the complexity of the xenophobic riots. Unlike *Alex News* and the *Daily Sun*, the *Mail & Guardian* did not shift its position nor did it have an editorial voice.

3.4.2. Our disappointments and actions

The *Mail & Guardian's* first engagement with the xenophobic riots was an emphasis on South African's frustrations and their motives for attacking foreign immigrants. The newspaper's reportage presented a 'bottom-up' sequence of events, beginning with self-proclaimed xenophobes and the broader context of the riots. The headline on the May 23 to 29 issue read, 'Mob Nation, a story of a country that exploded' (*Mail & Guardian,* p 1), above the headline were three photographs: one of a men demolishing a shack with smoke in the background, another of a newly born child and the last of a frail old woman standing amongst the debris (*Mail & Guardian*, p. 1). In the middle of the page was the South African flag, with Nelson Mandela and Archbishop Desmond Tutu in the right-hand corner watching in dismay as blood stained the flag (p. 1). The cover page headlined all the news reports coverage in the issue which were on the xenophobic attacks.

The front cover's messages were powerful and telling. Metaphors strayed from one headline to another (Fowler, 1991, p. 225) and these 'extra linguistic anchors' (Cohen & Young, 1973, p 177) yielded a fuller story. Considered together the blood-stained South Africa flag evoked an image of a shameful incident in South Africa's new democratic dispensation. The topology of the front page evoked South Africa's downward democratic trajectory and foregrounded a considered and crafted narrative[42] of a nation in trouble.

The first article on page five was a summarized graph of the xenophobic violence and gave a 'chronicle of fear' diagram, showing when and where the xenophobic violence had begun in the lead-up to the May riots (*Mail & Guardian*, p. 5). As a weekly newspaper the *Mail & Guardian* could not provide daily coverage of the xenophobic riots or any coverage of the Alexandra eruption immediately. Instead it provided a chronology of the xenophobic riots in a succinct diagram, so as to provide the backdrop and context of the riots.

The *Mail & Guardian* provided insight on self-proclaimed xenophobes, highlighting their perceptions and sentiments. In a news report entitled, 'Inside the mob', *Mail & Guardian* reporters spoke to various people who participated in chasing out foreigners (May 23 - 29). Wandile Langa from Ramaphosa who claimed to be a proud xenophobe, wanted to see, 'all Shangaans (those from Mozambique) go back to

[42] Zelizer argues that a photograph provokes a tension in us – not only about the precise moment that the image depicts, but also about all the moments that led to that instant and about all the moments that will follow (2010).

where they come from' (M&G, p. 4). The reporters remarked, 'he is one of the machete-wielding, gun-toting youngsters who have taken over the shacktown's maze of alley-ways in a campaign of terror against *makwerekwere*[43]' (p. 4). Langa claimed that the riots were sparked when two women in Ramaphosa were believed to have been killed by immigrants (p. 4). Langa's sentiments were that *ama'makwerekwere* had long been taking people's jobs and reaping the benefits of South Africa's freedom. He added that the angry rioters were claiming RDP houses and other property that should have belonged to South Africans in the first place.

The attacks were an act of 'retaliation', thus confirming some of Kenneth Tarifa's assertions that South African men saw African immigrants as 'stealing' local women (2009, p. 7). Moreover, the news report claimed that residents of Ramaphosa and Slovo felt that foreign immigrants were unfairly capitalising on the material liberties of their democracy and threatening the post-apartheid renaissance (May 23 – 29, p. 4).

3.4.3. Addressing the crisis, and narrating failures

The *Mail & Guardian's* second focus was on 'what went wrong' and the government's irresoluteness. The first analysis was a news report entitled, 'Why the Police Blew it' and examined the possible reasons of their failure. When violence broke out in Durban, North West and Mpumalanga, the SAPS asked for military help to try to control the situation and on Wednesday the 21st, President Thabo Mbeki ordered the military to help (Alcock, p. 5). Part of the SAPS's failure was due to the drastic reduction of the Crime Combating Units (CCU) back in 2006 (p 5).

As the xenophobic attacks spread around the country President Mbeki announced the establishment of a panel to investigate long-term approaches to xenophobia in South Africa. One of the government's plans was to reintegrate foreign immigrants back into their old communities (Rossouw and Kharsany, p. 6). Loren Landau, director of the African Centre for Migration at Wits University stated in a news report, that establishing refugee camps sent a message that the mobs were right, that these people should be confined (p. 6). The news reports detailed possible plans that the government planned to enact, but they were characterised by haste, suggesting the government's unpreparedness or genuine startled reaction to the xenophobic riots.

3.4.4. Lives on the margin and Zuluness

[43] Most common and old label used to refer to black African immigrants, which means the speaker of a 'strange' language with unusual phonetic sounds (Tafira, 2011, p. 117)

The third theme in the *Mail & Guardian* was that of a possible 'third force' and hostel dwellers being implicated because of their marginalized status. Reports claimed that hostel *indunas* in Madala Hostel (Alexandra), Wolhuter Hostel (Jeppe), Denver (Springs) and George Goch (East Rand) hostel were angry and denied that Zulus were behind the xenophobic attacks (*M&G*, p. 4). Duma Mncube an *induna* at Madala hostel (Alexandra) remarked that some young hostel-dwellers might have taken matters into their own hands after being falsely accused. Mncube further added that immigrants had taken over jobs Zulus traditionally dominated, such as driving taxis and security, 'as many Zimbabweans had military experience, which gave them an advantage in that industry' (p 4).

Hostels on the Rand and the Witwatersrand are synonymous with South Africa's transitional violence in the 1990s (Kynoch 2013). Bonner and Ndima (2008) and Donald Donham (2011) have all questioned and disrupted the narrative which saw the violence through ethnic eyes and have instead foregrounded local tensions and the political *terroir* of the time to the violence. Babylon Xeketwane in his MA thesis has argued that since the beginning of the 1990s hostels had been used as bases to derail the process of peaceful transition (1995, p. 58). It is because of this historical legacy that the hostel dwellers were suspiciously viewed by some, in the xenophobic eruptions.

A further element which was examined by the *Mail & Guardian*'s two issues was a possible 'third force'[44] element which implicated hostel dwellers and the IFP for being behind the attacks.The then Minister of Intelligence, Ronnie Kasrils, remarked that the xenophobic attacks in some areas were organised and planned beforehand, but probably as a result of local tensions rather than a 'third force'. Kasrils added,

> The deepest causes of this violence lie in the deep socio-economic challenges of our country and of the region. While poverty and deprivation continue to exist, tensions over scarce resources are bound to be ever present. (p.11)

The above quote from Kasrils disputed the 'third force' hypothesis. Kasrils' sentiments foregrounded the politics of necessity in post-apartheid South Africa. He ended by stating that the root problems causing the xenophobic riots remained and the government needed to deal with them. However ANC MP, Obed Bapela, remained adamant that a third force, whether the IFP or a force beyond the IFP, was behind the attacks (Alcock, p. 11).

[44] Collaboration between the Internal Stability Unit (ISU) and the SAPS with the IFP (hostel dwellers) against the township residents, collaborating with the South African Defence Force (SADF) (Kynoch, 2013).

As the violence spread, a language test was employed by rioters, where suspected foreign immigrants were made to name body parts in isiZulu (Ndlovu ,p. 7). These street-side tests were extralegal and used as 'litmus tests'. In a sense isiZulu has become the language of the public domain in Johannesburg and it is not a factual indicator that one who speaks it, is in fact Zulu.

3.4.5. Zuma and the politics of the governed

The *Mail & Guardian* in one of their news reports wove the then political discourse into ways to possibly mediate the xenophobic riots. The trope of Zuluness and Jacob Zuma's cultural capital was examined as a way to mediate the riots. The *Mail & Guardian* in the May 23 – 29 issue explored a possible 'Zuma factor' in the xenophobic violence. Rossouw's opening line was, 'Jacob Zuma's signature, *Umshini Wami,* has become the soundtrack for the xenophobic upsurge in Gauteng' (p. 11). An ANC observer said, '*Umshini Wami* is a song of revolt and the xenophobic attackers believe they are in a revolt against President Thabo Mbeki's administration' (p. 11). The above excerpt resonates with what Liz Gunner calls the 'symbiotic link' as the song offered itself to wider implications and further acted as a catalyst for the involvement of multiple publics and the wider public sphere (2009, p. 27-28). The song provided commentary on the marginalisation of the poor and the distance of the elite from those they ruled (p. 32).

In 2008 Jacob Zuma mobilized his Zuluness as a political strategy and commentators indicated that this trope could be used to mediate the riots. Mpilo Shange-Buthane, advocacy officer with the Consortium for Refugees and Migrants in South Africa remarked, 'the man in the street sees Zuma as one of them, while they see the current president [Mbeki] as distant…Zuma should speak more...he should speak to people in Zulu to get the message across' (*M&G,* p. 11). Shange-Buthane in her lament invoked the idea of 'the politics of the governed' (White, 2012, p. 403) and the centrality of Zuluness which Jacob Zuma could tap into and utilize to address the crisis (Gevisser, 2010, p. 60). Her lament also foregrounded the audience and the emergence of a language of populism made up of key 'Zulu characteristics'. This Zuluness is not defined by what was cherished by the intellectuals but by what the 'masses' had found as easily accessible points of unity (Sitas, 2008, p. 91). The news reports saw Zuma as having abundant cultural capital: using his Zuluness, he could help quell the violence.

3.4.6. Non-inclusive identities

A prominent strand in the *Mail & Guardian's* coverage was a concern with the sentiments and lived experience of foreign nationals and the ramification of the xenophobic riots in their lives. For instance, the paper covered the story of a Zimbabwean who had lived in South Africa since 1989, but was

chased out of his single room in Alexandra and his belongings seized. Some of the news reports grappled with frustrated residents' notions of entitlement and anxieties about foreign immigrants benefiting from what they felt were their material liberties.

On page thirteen was the *Mail & Guardian's* last news report on the xenophobic violence for the May 23 – 29 issue. The newspaper published drawings by traumatized foreign immigrant children produced during art therapy sessions. Donham argues that nothing 'primodializes' identity more efficiently than the experience of violence especially violence that appears to have been directed at one's group as a group (2011, p. 8). The images drawn by the directly and indirectly affected children, illustrated the deep emotional and psychological damage that the xenophobic violence had created which would have long lasting effects.

The *Mail & Guardian* also included sentiments from angry foreign nationals. On page nine (May 30 – June 5) Joubert told the story of Somalian Muhamed Barre in a news report entitled, 'I Really Hate Your Country'. Barre lived and owned a shop in Khayelitsha (Western Cape) which was looted by his neighbours. In disappointment he remarked that he had lived with these people for over thirteen years and they came *toy-toying* in his shop shouting '*hamba kwerekwere, hamba!* [Go foreigner go!]' (*M&G*, p. 9).

3.4.7. Political awkwardness and an unlikely leader

South Africa's leadership seemed to have been taken aback by the 'spontaneous' eruption of xenophobic violence. This could have been because they were genuinely startled, or they were ill prepared and out of touch with the masses and thus did not see the symptoms until it was too late. The ANC-led government soon labelled the xenophobic riots as mere criminality, as a possible ploy to stifle the attacks or delegitimize them. In this way, they did not deal with the root causes.

The leadership vacuum of 2008 was a key strand which a number of newspapers and analysts probed. On page eight (May 23-29 issue) *M&G* reporters illustrated that ANC leadership did not promptly respond to the violence and that a vacuum was left which Buthelezi seemed to occupy (Tabane, p. 4).

Winnie Madikizela-Mandela in the same issue commented, 'when I went to Alexandra after the violence broke out, I saw the same shacks I saw in 1994' (p. 4). Madikizela-Mandela's concluding remarks were, 'no one is taking responsibility and station commanders say they are referred from one government office to the next…we are going there as individuals to help ease the pain.' (p. 4)

The SAPS had been fashioned into an overreaching paternalistic institute (Steinberg, 2012) and various government departments shrugged their responsibility and left the police to handle the situation.

The same political jostling that characterised the political scene in Gauteng seemed also to characterise the Western Cape. In late May Western Cape premier Ebrahim Rasool criticised DA leader Helen Zille for moving large numbers of refugees into a holiday campsite outside Cape Town (May 30 – June 5, p. 8). As 2009 elections neared, various political parties vied for votes and were seen as using the xenophobic riots as a chance to garner votes. Leaders in Du Noon (Western Cape) had also played the blame game; ANC councillor Peace Stimela stated that he had been bullied into calling a mass meeting in Du Noon as ANC and NEC member Lumka Yengani wanted to address the community (p. 8). The meeting was cancelled and Stimela stated that this ignited the violence[45] (p. 8).

Mail & Guardian reporters further examined the ANC and IFP as each claimed their members' actions had quashed the riots. The Gauteng branch of the ANC favoured the theory that community members called a halt to the violence. Another was that ANC local leaders physically confronted the rioters, and 'took back the streets' (p 8). Johannesburg hostel dwellers claimed that IFP leader Mangosuthu Buthelezi played a part in stopping the violence (*May 30 – June 5*, p. 8).

On page eight of the *Mail & Guardian* (May 23-29) reporters provided succinct reports capturing the sentiments of victims of the xenophobic attacks around Johannesburg (May 23 - 29, p. 8). News reporter Monako Dibetle commentated on the ANC leadership's visit to Actionville on the 17th of May. Among the dignitaries were Minister of Safety and Security Charles Nqakula who condemned the community's actions and 'educated' them on how to act 'properly' (p. 8). After Nqakula's address, the crowd booed him and someone retorted, 'we are going to beat them [foreigners] again!' and the crowd dispersed (May 23 – 29, p. 8). Dibetle remarked that the Actionville speech by Nqakula received a negative response because the people felt he was just doing his job as Safety minister. In contrast, was Mangosuthu Buthelezi's address, in which he reacted emotionally to accusations that the IFP was behind the xenophobic attacks[46] (I elaborate on this below).

During the first week of the riots Mangosuthu Buthelezi paid a visit to Alexandra and other affected areas in Johannesburg.) Buthelezi remarked, 'an attack on one of our African brothers and sisters is an

[45] A similar incident occurred in Alexandra in the week of the xenophobic riots when Mr. Nhlanhla Msimango (IFP Gauteng Provincial Chairperson and KwaZulu-Natal Member of the Legislature) recalled organising a community meeting with ANC Linda Memela. The MEC of Housing Nomvula Mokonyane and other stakeholders were meant to address the community at SAN KOPANO (Alexandra) but assumingly fearing for their lives they did not come to the community meeting and Linda Memela and Nhlanhla Msimango were left to address the community. (interview 22-05-13)

[46] Email conversation with Monako Dibetle, 19 November 2012

attack on us all' (p 10). Bheki Mncube an *induna* at Madala hostel (Alexandra) said that Buthelezi's visit was reassuring as the whole nation was blaming the Zulus for the attacks (p. 10). Mncube further added, '*umntwana* [Buthelezi] did not only come here to speak to the Zulus or members of Inkatha, he came here to speak to the Alexandra community' (p. 10). Buthelezi seemed to usurp the vacant leadership role as the ANC was wrapped in factionalism and leaders in the Western Cape were also engulfed in political jostling. Denver hostel *induna* Obert Mbatha remarked, '*umntwana ukhuzile,* [the Child/Prince has warned us]. We must listen.' (p. 10)

This quotation shows that Buthelezi addressed the affected foreign immigrants, the frustrated residents and the hostel dwellers and IFP supporters with much nuanced as he evoked a pan African identity. The *Mail & Guardian* focused on two individuals as alternative leaders, foregrounding Winnie Madikizela-Mandela and Mangosuthu Buthelezi's actions in light of Thabo Mbeki's irresoluteness and Jacob Zuma's visual but distant address. Ultimately both Mbeki and Zuma were "invisible" from the sights of disaster only addressing communities in formal "stiff" addresses.

The *Mail & Guardian* also included letters by readers on page twenty six (May 30 – June 5), where readers expressed their sentiments and concerns. The letters mused on foreigner national's contribution to the formal and informal economy and South Africa's historical debt to other African countries. They further bemoaned the government's inaction, corruption and slow service delivery and ethnic frictions in Johannesburg (Mail & Guardian, p. 26). The scope of the readers' letters was wide but their themes were narrow as they overwhelmingly foregrounded the plight and position of foreigners, the government's irresoluteness, but were largely silent on the frustrations of South Africans.

3.4.8. Crafted, introspective and nuanced?

The *Mail & Guardian* covered the xenophobic riots in two issues only, but its reportage was careful, extensive and considered. Through a critical discourse analysis it is evident that the newspaper did not shift its position but explored a number of themes in its reportage. It initially highlighted the voice of self-proclaimed xenophobes and the sentiments of frustrated South Africans. It then went on to examine a number of themes, exploring what prompted the riots and illustrating the government's lack of preparation and irresoluteness. It further explored the lives of migrants in the hostels and the possible implication of a 'third force' element. Furthermore it examined the 'leadership vacancy' and reported the stories and opinions of affected foreign immigrants, focusing on their traumas. In its last issue the newspaper included reflective letters which highlighted the informal economic contribution of foreign immigrants. The *Mail & Guardian's* coverage was measured and analytical; being a weekly newspaper

it could cogitate and craft its narrative in a more considered manner. Its reportage incorporated views from academics, politicians and grass-root voices from both affected foreign immigrants and frustrated residents. Its coverage was broad and reflected the kind of learned reader that would engage with the weekly newspaper.

3.5. Conclusion: South Africa and English for three

Anton Harber's careful question which he posed in 2008, 'What does a nation want from its media during times of ugly anti-social violence?' (2008, p. 161) cannot be answered, as no one media provided a *pars pro toto* of the xenophobic riots. Harber himself attested to the impossibility of this when he said, 'it is tough to say which newspaper offered the more accurate depiction of our society' (2008, p. 173).

The three contrasting English-language newspapers provided divergent narratives of the xenophobic riots guided by their different journalistic modalities. The media during the xenophobic riots had two prime responsibilities: to report what was happening in communities while not contributing unduly to the problem by internalising xenophobic language and uncritically mirroring xenophobic sentiments (Danso and McDonald, 2001, p. 117). Each newspaper although written in English, was limited by its journalistic modality and communicative styles. *Alex News* a community newspaper was engrossed in residents' sentiments and mirrored their frustrations uncritically and with impartiality. The *Daily Sun* provided coverage which engaged its readers' everyday politics which related to their daily lives (Wasserman, 2010, p. 33), but was critical. The *Mail & Guardian* with its reputation for being an investigative newspaper, faced pressure to provide authoritative readings of the cases of the violence, if not recommendations for its cure (Coplan, 2009, p. 368).

The three newspapers were similar in some of their themes but different in how they conveyed and narrated the xenophobic riots. The three newspapers provided an amalgamation of many discourses and all three employed pictorial news to create the public sphere within the semiosphere (Zelizer, 2010, p. 5). *Alex News* a then fortnightly community newspaper provided the texture of Alexandra and dissonances months before the riots. The newspaper mirrored inflammatory sentiments uncritically as it was engrossed in the community. It had two main themes: an unapologetic and inflammatory stance which it qualified by illustrating Alexandrans' frustrations and their second theme was a clear support for the 'underdog'.

The *Daily Sun* provided coverage of the riots on a daily basis and underwent many shifts in position. Its first report contained tensions between the news reports and headlines which were obtuse,

discriminatory and bias. The letters by readers were more considered and clearly condemned the riots. Throughout its coverage it was characterised by shifts, broadening its scope and widening its narrative, with its editorials and letters and eventually its news reports as well.

The last newspaper I analysed was the *Mail & Guardian* which did not shift its position but provided its readers with a measured and crafted narrative in its two issues. It explored multiple themes but initiated its coverage with a 'bottom-up' approach, first examining sentiments of self-claimed xenophobes, followed by the government's failure to address the crisis decisively and assertively.

The question of leadership and a violent negotiation of democracy was an important theme in all three newspapers and the *Mail & Guardian* and *Alex News* both explored the 'unusual' decisive reactions of IFP leader Mangosuthu Buthelezi and the delayed reactions of Jacob Zuma, and Thabo Mbeki's irresoluteness. A key theme which arose from all three newspapers was the idea of 'circuits of power and riches' being protected by South African citizens who felt that foreign immigrants were benefiting before them. And also, benefiting from what they deemed as being their exclusive material liberties won through their fight against the apartheid government. Although published in English, the three newspapers provided different emphases and illustrated many shifts in position and produced divergent narratives of crisis. The three selected English-Language newspapers illustrated the tense but yet vibrant political economy of South Africa in 2008. The newspapers foregrounded an "unlikely" leader in the form of Mangosuthu Buthelezi who usurped the evidently vacant leadership role and showed compassion to both frustrated South Africans and displaced African nationals.

A latent thread which ran through these three selected newspapers was the issue of democracy understood by ordinary people, protecting what they narrowly saw as their exclusive dividends of democracy. As the three newspapers negotiated, crafted and mediated the violence, it is clear through a critical discourse analysis that the notion of democracy was being violently negotiated. In the following chapter through a semiotic analysis, I analyse three investigative television shows which covered, mediated and communicated the May 2008 xenophobic riots and the issue of missing leadership and subjective perceptions of democracy are further examined.

4. Chapter Four: Sites of meaning making: Three television reports

'Television attempts definitions, tries out explanations, creates narratives, talks over, makes intelligible, harnesses speculations, tries to make fit, and, very occasionally, anathematizes.' (Ellis, 2000, p. 79)

Television has a much larger audience than any print media[47]. My two previous chapters have examined the nuances and emphases of two isiZulu-language and three English-Language newspapers as they communicated, mediated and negotiated the xenophobic riots. I explored the public idioms and tropes they used to narrate and communicate the news. In this chapter I move away from the print media and focus my attention on television news reportage which is constituted by the combination of two types of discourse: visual and aural (Hall, 2012, p. 139).

In this chapter I examine the coverage and commentary of three television reports: Two SABC *Special Assignment* episodes and one eTV *3rd Degree* episode. Moreover, I also examine how democracy is negotiated by the commentators, television anchors and the interviewees in the three television reports. I pose the following questions – How did these television reports communicate the xenophobic riots? How did the reports differ from each other? And, what silences were there in the reports? Through a semiotic analysis I'll be examining the 'staged' and 'unstaged' modality of the three television news reports and how they 'witnessed' the xenophobic riots. The 'staged' and 'unstaged' modalities unfold as an examination of who found a space to participate in the public sphere and how they were captured by the camera.

Public opinion is what is formed as a result of discussion in the public sphere (Sparks, 2007, p. 140), and in this case the mediated public sphere of television. The question then arises, 'to what extent are people participants in, rather than spectators of the habermasian public sphere (Spark, 2012, p. 140)? Through a semiotic analysis I employ two terms: 'staged' and 'unstaged' and my gaze is on the activities of the occupied space in front of the camera. John Ellis contends that television has produced a new modality of perception in the world, that of witness (2000, p. 2). Viewers are witnesses in another time and another space (2002, p.10). The act of witness is never itself unmediated because television is a human construct (Spark, 2002, p. 11 also see Fiske & Hartley, 1996). The camera ostensibly strives to function as the surrogate eye of the viewer, and thereby becomes in a sense 'invisible', deflecting awareness from the constructed character of news (Dahlgren, 2009, p. 129). By becoming 'invisible' the camera captures 'unfiltered' sentiments and a sense of intimacy is created and conveyed.

The South African Broadcast Corporation (SABC) and eTV produced three television reports on the May 2008 xenophobic riots. ETV aired a single show, produced by *3rd Degree*. Launched in 1998 eTV is South Africa's first private free-to-air television channel. One of its prime-flagship current affairs programme, *3rd Degree,* produced one television report on the xenophobic riots. The channel is jointly

[47] SABC 1 in 2008 had the highest viewership at 70% of the South African adult population, SABC 2 with 60%, SABC 3 at 47.6% and eTV with 57.1%. This is in contract to the contrast to the print media readership statistics (see chapter Two and Three).

owned by the black empowerment groups, Hosken Consolidated Investments Limited and Venfin Limited.[48] On the evening of the 20th of May 2008, *3rd Degree* aired an episode reported by Laurell Boyers entitled; *'Under Attack'*. It posed two questions: Why did it happen? And where was the leadership? *3rd Degree's* stance was characterised by a 'top-down' narrative as it focused on official voices and commentary, with some visuals for emphasis. The *mise-en-scene* of the reportage made it seem 'staged', and excluded the voices of ordinary people who formed the edge of the 'staged' news report area at the Alexandra Police Station. The report lacked intimacy and sincerity; its camerawork did not 'bear witness' to the xenophobic riots but only served to give glimpses of the riots for emphasis.

The SABC is a public service and commercial broadcasting organisation. The channel's prime investigative show is *Special Assignment* which produced two episodes on the xenophobic riots. The SABC was established in August 1936, and television was incorporated in 1976, and finally, in October 2003 it became a limited liability company wholly owned by the state.[49] Its television network comprises of four channels: SABC1, SABC2, SABC3 and a 24 hour news channel. *Special Assignment* produced and aired an episode reported by Sasha Wales-Smith entitled, '*Hambani Makwerekere'* aired on the 20th of May. A month later it also produced another episode entitled, '*Ashes to Ashes*' aired on the 1st of July.

Special Assignment's first episode, '*Hambani Makwerekere',* was characterised by a narrative focused on the grass-root experiences of affected foreign immigrants and self-proclaimed xenophobes in Alexandra. It coupled this with official commentary by political analysts and comments from research centres. It moved back and forth between residents of Alexandra and Diepsloot's experiences, and their sentiments. Its final focus was on the community members of Diepsloot who took a stand against the xenophobic riots and helped affected foreign immigrants retrieve their stolen belongings. The report seemed 'un-staged', and had a sense of intimacy, 'bearing witness' to the riots and illustrating the micro-politics and lived experience of Alexandrans and foreign immigrants in Alexandra.

Special Assignment's final episode on the 1st July entitled: *'Ashes to Ashes'* specifically focused on the bereaved families of two deceased Mozambican immigrants. Its key theme was South Africa's long standing labour migration patterns in relation to Southern Mozambique. It produced a split report with two distinct sites, crossing over from Johannesburg to Mozambique, as it reported on the funerals and links between the two countries and its people. Its reportage also had an element of intimacy and an

[48] http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com accessed 20 April 2013
[49] http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com accessed 20 April 2013

'un-staged' character about it, the camera at times became 'invisible' and video footage seemed un-filtered, giving glimpses of the riots aftermath.

4.1. Television news reports: Seeing the selected and processed

Stuart Hall contends that the television sign is a complex one as it is constituted by the combination of two types of discourse: visual and aural (2012, p. 139). Television is further a site of meaning-making; it is selective and crafted. Pierre Bourdieu argues that the structure of television journalism controls the access of ordinary citizens (but also of other cultural producers such as scholars, artists, and writers) to what is called the 'public sphere' (2012, p. 254; Wasserman, 2011). Furthermore, Peter Dahlgren urges scholars to take seriously television's popularity, and to consider how in its largely un-Habermasian modes it can promote, as well as constrict public spheres (2009, p. 136). John Ellis views television as a 'working through' medium, not providing any ultimate or definitive point of view, but rather offering its viewers vast amounts of transitory glimpses, preliminary meanings, multiple frameworks, explanations, and narrative structures for processing basic private and public concerns (2000, p. 133).

Television reporting can be characterized and defined by its communicative repertories, namely the frames it employs to convey news reports. The 'reportage frame' given its affinity with observational documentary modes, makes use of film and visual authentication as well as personal testimonies, and thereby often acts as 'bearing witness' (Cottle & Rai, 2008, p. 351). Reportage often 'moves' from the indicative to the subjunctive in its story treatment and can creatively and variously draw upon both deliberate and display modes of communication in relatively lengthy televisual packages (2008, p. 351). Through a semiotic analysis this chapter examines four themes, beginning with the relationship between the nation-state and its citizens. The second theme pertains to the politics of necessity and growing pessimism. Third, I explore the loud silences on songs in the news reports. Last, I examine South Africa's long standing relations with Mozambique and South Africa's immigration policies. These above mentioned themes ultimately contribute to the notion of negotiated democracy, mediated by the government, community members and their various perceptions of democracy and the performative repertoires of South Africa's democracy.

4.2. The nation-state and the citizenry: 'Affirmative' repossession

My first focus will be on the live broadcast of the eTV *3rd Degree* report entitled, '*Under Attack'*, aired on the 20th of May 2008. The report began with *3rd Degree* anchor Debora Patta at the Alexandra Police Station, where she posed two questions which would characterise the news report: Why did it happen? And where had the leadership been? Following this, video footage of the xenophobic riots and havoc

ridden Alexandra was shown. Medium long shots were used to give detail and show the destruction caused by the riots. Patta provided an introductory narrative of the timeline of the xenophobic riots, reporting some of the sentiments, anguish and 'rationale' behind the attacks. After the video footage collage, the camera returned to the Alexandra Police Station parking-lot, where Patta was to interview political analyst, Moeletsi Mbeki, and ANC Secretary General, Gwede Mantashe. Milling around the edges of the interview space in the parking-lot, were displaced people observing the interview, some drinking tea from tin cups. The news report appeared staged and had a narrow selection criterion on who interacted in the public sphere to form public opinion.

Patta's lead question for the whole programme was, 'has the government done enough?' (*3rd Degree*, 20-05-08) and Mbeki provided a detailed answer, tethering the xenophobic riots to the Zimbabwe crisis, claiming that the government had long ignored Zimbabwe's melting economy (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-08). The South African government's irresoluteness in acting on the Zimbabwean crisis trickled to form part of the catalyst which pushed Zimbabweans into South Africa (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-08; Glaser, 2010, p. 26). Moeletsi Mbeki located the popular 'flood of Zimbabweans' myth as applying additional pressure to already strained national resources and how this pitted poor South Africans against African immigrants from across South Africa's border.

Moeletsi Mbeki then included the nation-state in his analysis, positing that the state is made-up of two things, 'the border and the citizens', further elaborating,

> If you don't have a border, you don't have a state. If you don't have a border you don't have citizens. In order for us to be South Africans we need to control our borders. In order for Zimbabwe to have Zimbabweans they too have to control their borders. Our government seems to think that border control is an optional extra, they think being South African is an optional extra. It is not an optional extra. It involves rights and responsibilities, so you have to control our borders if you are a state and your citizens have to have confidence that you are going to protect them against non-citizens. This is not happening in South Africa. (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-*08*)

Mbeki's answer illustrated the complex relationship between the state and the nation and their reciprocal responsibilities. In the liberal model of democracy, the state exists to protect the freedom of citizens, allowing them to pursue their own lives and happiness without causing injury to others (Dahlgren, 2009, p. 65). A nation is a community of people and it is shaped out of the different identities

that are present in a country (Brinkel, 2006, p.246). Chipkin argues that a nation is a political community whose form is given in relation to the pursuit of democracy and freedom (2007, p. 2). From Mbeki's detailed answers it became apparent that the nation-state entails differentiation, as Geschiere contends, 'it is only possible to identify oneself if one differentiates the self from the other, and this demarcation implies, whether one wants it or not, discrimination' (2009, p. 102).

Mbeki continued,

> Our government doesn't want to defend our South African state, it does not want to defend the wellbeing of the people of South Africa. It wants to get the benefits of being a government but without the hassles of having to look after the citizens of the country. (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-08)

The state co-exists in unison with the nation and the two exist in a reciprocal relationship with each other (Brinkel, 2006, p. 51). Mbeki insinuated that the government had lost touch with the people, 'throwing social grants' at people and not solving the bigger problems. He ended by acknowledging South Africa's unique position in Africa and urged the government to implement refugee conventions (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-08).

Debora Patta then drew from Moeletsi Mbeki's themes and posed similar questions to ANC Secretary General, Gwede Mantashe. Mantashe seemed to sidestep the accusation that the ANC's denialism on Zimbabwe's crisis had been the catalyst for the xenophobic riots. He claimed that the issue was continental, and that South Africa should not be viewed as 'an island of prosperity in a sea of poverty' (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-08). Representing the ANC, Mantashe elaborated that no border can stop hungry people from crossing it in search of a better life. He acknowledged Zimbabwe's political and economic predicament and how it possibly affected South Africa but he added that there were many factors which need to be considered as the riots were 'xenophobic in outlook, but in context were a mixture of many things' (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-08). When asked about the apparent leadership 'vacuum' and the lagging response by high-ranking leadership, Mantashe responded by saying that he could only speak for Jacob Zuma who was out of the country. He added that ANC members had been visiting affected areas although he did acknowledge that the absences of national leadership 'out-and-about' in affected communities was of concern (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-08)[50].

[50] This is contradictory to what Winnie Madikizela-Mandela was reported to have said in the May 23 - 29 *Mail & Guardian*, p. 4, as she claimed that she was there as an individual not representing the ANC.

Mantashe answered the questions with much caution as since 1994, the ANC-led government had re-iterated its pledge to return South Africa to Africa (Buur, Jensen & Stepputat, 2007, p. 63). The ANC symbolically invoked a Pan-African identity but in reality still had a nation-building mission which called for 'South Africanisation' – and the reconfiguration of citizenship after 1994 (Buur, Jensen & Stepputat, 2007, p. 63). Landau and Kabwe-Segatti argue that the contradiction in South Africa's regional policy between its 'realist' pursuit of national interests, and its pan-Africanist principles, was readily apparent in regard to Zimbabwe (2008, p. 31). Furthermore from the immigration policy, it was still apparent that the popular belief that large numbers of poor foreign nationals from neighbouring countries swamp South Africa and loot her resources, still had currency judging from the policy's rhetoric.

From my reading and semiotic analysis of the above *3rd Degree* television report, both Mbeki and Mantashe sidestepped Patta's lead question which was, 'has the government done enough?' (20-05-08). The two politically savvy interviewees instead, engaged in high political discourse, drawing on pan-Africanism, nation-state discourse and thus sidestepped the real issue: that of the government's irresoluteness in addressing the immediate xenophobic riots. Thus the *3rd Degree* report also illustrated gaps in emphases as political leaders sidestepped immediate issues and Patta's lead question.

4.3. Contrasting views from the ground: *Savota!*[51]

On the same night (May 20th), but on a different channel, the SABC aired a news report by *Special Assignment* entitled, '*Hambani Makwere-kwere*' which conveyed the xenophobic riots in a different manner from the eTV report. The episode began with video footage of the xenophobic riots, angry people *toyi-toying,* singing, others looting and scenes of burning shacks. The opening scenes had medium long shots and their sequence included panoramic and aerial views of affected areas. Reporter Sasha Wales-Smith did the voice-over and summed up what frustrated xenophobes felt which was: 'Get out of our country' (*Special Assignment,* 20-05-08). The news report firmly focused on township residents and affected foreign immigrants, with few commentaries from analysts. The news report examined the grass-root sentiments and dissonances which sparked and fuelled the xenophobic riots. It further explored the riots through the eyes of two contrasting individuals: a self-proclaimed Alexandran xenophobe and a Zimbabwean man living in Alexandra. The news report had a sense of being 'un-staged' and bearing witness to the riots as the camera captured the raw sentiments of foreign immigrants and xenophobes in the streets of Alexandra. It also constructed a much wider public sphere, giving ordinary people the platform to contribute to the formation of public opinion.

[51] "We voted!" normally referring to South Africa's first democratic elections in 1994.

Mduduzi Gumede a self-proclaimed xenophobe from Alexandra spoke freely with *Special Assignment* reporters and his sentiments seemed to echo rhetoric of 'historical asset deficit' and 'affirmative repossession'. The mid shots and the camera's unobtrusiveness facilitated a sense of intimacy in the space between Gumede and the surrogate eye – the camera. Gumede declared, 'it is not going to be easy for them to come and take back their properties, because they are already owned by other people' (*Special Assignment,* 20-05-08). News reporter Wales-Smith remarked that Gumede and many like him had a sense of entitlement and mobs were re-claiming what they thought was rightfully theirs in the first place. Gumede had been waiting for an RDP house ever since filling out his C-form in the mid 1990s. But when he went to the Department of Housing he was told his application had already been approved. Then he asked angrily: 'who is in my house? A foreigner! And a South African, a citizen of this country, stays in a shit place like this. Why?' (*Special Assignment*, 20-05-08)

A mob leader in Diepsloot who concealed his identity lamented,

> We are living like tenants in the country of our birth. Everything, they [foreigners] are controlling. So, we need the president to know that we are not criminals; we are the citizens of South Africa. We need to tell the government that if they don't know how to do the job, we will do it ourselves. (*Special Assignment,* 20-05-08)

The angry lament revealed deep seated frustrations over security and service delivery. The two individuals through their laments delegitimized any claim that foreign nationals might have had for their stay in South Africa. Moreover, we witness how when people are frustrated they mobilize and seek to further the law, picking up where they see that the government had left it. Steinberg contends that the introduction of Community Police Forums (CPF) fostered a culture where ordinary citizens felt that they could further the law themselves (Steinberg, 2012). The mob leader further demanded that the government take seriously their frustrations and address them, instead of sidelining the xenophobic riots and terming them mere criminal activities. Through their actions, we see the rioters forcefully negotiating their understanding of democracy and stating what they feel the government owes them namely the material dividends of democracy.

Stanley Makonese, a Zimbabwean who had been displaced because of the riots, remarked, 'a person must have a good life. So when you are entitled to a good life, someone will come and say, 'No, you found these things in South Africa. We must take your belongings and you go back to Zimbabwe'' (*Special Assignment,* 20-05-08),

Interestingly we see Makonese legitimizing his stay in South Africa, which is in contrast to the above laments which seeked to delegitimize foreign nationals' claim to South Africa. Makonese lamented that he'd run away from Zimbabwe and thought the law would protect him in South Africa, but from his experience, the law did not protect him. Makonese's situation sounded precarious but it was not unique, as many foreign African nationals who apply for refugee status are not granted it or if they are, the process takes a long time and they are left in limbo (Peberdy, 2009). Kebwe-Segatti argues that, the 1998 Refugee Act contended with two problems: to honour international human rights or the sovereignty of the state supported by the Department of Home Affairs and Cabinet (Kebwe-Segatti, 2008, p. 83). The Department of Home Affairs implemented the most regressive part of the Act and amended it to make it even more restrictive (2008, p. 83). This symbolically acknowledged pan-Africanism but in reality protected South African national interests and nation-building.

The two news reports were both aired on the same day but reported the xenophobic riots in vastly different ways. One limited the Habermasian public sphere (Bourdieu, 2012, p. 254) to political analysts and political leaders and the other, populated the public sphere with the grass-root sentiments of frustrated South Africans and affected foreign immigrants. Both employed the 'reportage frame', but in varying measures: *Special Assignment* focused more on personal testimonies whilst *3rd Degree* focused on official commentary and analyses. The staged nature of the *3rd Degree* '*Under Attack*' made it seem stiff and overtly crafted, whilst the 'unstaged' nature of the *Special Assignment 'Hambani makwerekwere'* had a sense of intimacy (Giddens & Pierson, 1998) and a wide selection of people to shape public opinion in the public sphere.

4.4. The politics of necessity and growing pessimism

In both the *3rd Degree* and the *Special Assignment* news reports, disgruntled township residents invoked the politics of necessity and exhibited high levels of pessimism about South Africa's democratic dispensation. In the *3rd Degree* news report Moeletsi Mbeki suggested the ANC's persistence on labelling the xenophobic riots criminal activities was another element of the state's denialism. He argued that in labelling the riots as criminal activities, the ANC justified not addressing the root issues, further ignoring the complaints of the people who were complaining about lack of service delivery. 'The citizens of South Africa deserve the delivery they voted the government for and to label that as criminality will not solve the problem and it will certainly not make the problem go away', remarked Mbeki (*3rd Degree* 20-05-08).

Furthermore, in the *Special Assignment* news report, Alexandran resident Mduduzi Gumede, lamented the fact that many people felt that foreign immigrants were being allocated RDP houses before South

Africans (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). Another man from Diepsloot angrily added that if the government was failing to do its job, there were people who would take it upon themselves to extend the law (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). *Special Assignment* reporter Sasha Wales-Smith remarked, 'a lack of services, grinding poverty and frustrated dreams have pushed South Africans to the limits of their tolerance' (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). From this commentary it might seem that the SABC *Special Assignment* report was too sympathetic with frustrated South Africans disgruntlements. However, despite these occasional tendencies, the report strove to be balanced.

The SABC *Special Assignment – 'Hambani Makwerekwere'* (20-05-08) news report provided a much wider selection of views, voices from affected township residents and affected foreign immigrants. With its 'unstaged' quality, it foregrounded the frustrations and tensions which characterized the areas where the riots erupted. The report gave voice to displaced foreign immigrants as well as angry township residents. *Special Assignment* focused on Leon Moyo, a Zimbabwean who had lived in Alexandra for thirty years, and had been attacked in his shack. He remarked, 'I am not going back to my home country. I have worked here for so long and all my strength is finished in this country' (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). On the other hand, Mduduzi Gumede wanted all illegal immigrants out of Alexandra.

The report then introduced a strand which suggested that poor South Africans felt excluded and ignored by government. Prince Mashele from the Institute of Security Studies and Frans Cronje from the South African Institute for Race Relations, both expressed frustration towards the government as they felt that the xenophobic rioters were trying to convey a message to the government by attacking foreign immigrants (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). When the violence erupted in Diepsloot, *Special Assignment* reporter Sasha Wales-Smith commented that disgruntled sentiments by community members revealed a deep sense of exclusion. Wales-Smith further stated that, 'the mobs' fury may be directed at foreigners, but it pointed to other underlying issues; than simply xenophobia' (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). Mashele further remarked that poor South Africans saw the influx of foreigners entering their communities as a threat and used them as scapegoats.

The 2008 situation pitted poor and frustrated residents against those they felt were exacerbating their strained economic situation, and were further illegitimate competition for services. Moeletsi Mbeki aptly remarked that the government's pan-African ideals were not viable, if they meant neglecting concerns which citizens aired (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). He further added that poor Alexandrans could not be blamed, as the government made them carry the burden of Zimbabwe's economic melt-down (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08).

Fourteen years after the transition to democracy, deep inequalities remained in South African communities. The excitement and optimism of reconstruction had been tempered by the intractability of social problems and the difficulties of formulating effective policies to combat them (Beinart, 2010, p. 1). Post 1994 popular politics revealed the weaknesses of the ANC's capacity to deliver many of the improvements that seemed possible in a reconstructed South Africa. Social and economic rights apparently enshrined in the constitution have proved difficult to realise (Beinart, 2010, p. 5).

The television report also exhibited a shift, as it widened its lens to incorporate a focus on grass-root sentiments. The *Special Assignment* news report ended with a focus on the community of Diepsloot who took a stand against the violence and criminal activities which had begun to characterise the xenophobic riots. Sasha Wales-Smith commented that most people in Diepsloot did not support the violence, but shared the belief that there was a problem with the number of foreign immigrants, but they wanted the government to deal with it (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). Diepsloot ANC community leader Chris Vondo concluded by saying, 'Let the authorities deal with this thing. This is not the way of doing things, where people are taking the law into their own hands' (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08). The television report ended with a widening of the Habermasian public sphere and illustrated divergent views helded by South Africans, moreover, depicting the complex nature of the xenophobic riots.

4.5. Filling the silence: repertoires of performance

Sound contains more than their manipulators, and explainers can bring forward to our attention (Ellis, 2002, p.12). The two news reports (SABC and eTV) which were aired on May 20th both provided video footage of rioters pillaging shacks and mobs *toyi-toying* on the streets, and in most cases these groups of people were singing. But, neither the *3rd Degree* nor the *Special Assignment* reporters paid any attention to the songs - remaining silent on these popular forms of performative repertoires.

John Ellis argues that television provides a superabundance of information as there is always more to be heard than the foregrounded sounds (2002, p. 12). The *3rd Degree* news report had a few clips of rioters singing but the songs were inaudible. *Special Assignment* provided some focus on the singing rioters, as their footage was more audible but the songs were still omitted from commentary. Political songs act with social function, and they can be a way of exerting pressure on others, particularly when there is no direct access to political activity (Finnegan, 1970, p. 284). Songs work as communication and they further reveal a spectrum of communal perceptions and responses to difficult situations (Gray, 2004, p. 85). Songs in protest and social movements are employed as communicative modalities.

From my analysis, three songs were audible in the *Special Assignment* '*Hambani Makwerekwere*' news report and these were: "*Zabalaza Siphum'emazweni"*, "*Hebe uSuthu"* and "*Umshini Wam'".* In the light of these three songs I pose the question: How might the rioters be seen, as attempting to insert themselves into a number of histories, through their choice of these particular songs? The songs the rioters sang were drawn from the struggle repertoire of politics of resistance, thus they had meaning but the reporters paid no attention to their meaning. Moreover, "*Umshini Wam*" was introduced back into political commentary by Jacob Zuma during his rape trial in 2006. Tina Vainiomäki contends that silence speaks, but the question remains on what the silence is conveying (Vainiomäki, 2004, p. 347). Vainiomäki further argues that meaning always belongs to something which we use as a sign, and that meaning is in constant flux (p. 348), therefore silence can be read as not yet being assigned meaning or in my analysis, an exclusion from the public sphere. If silence and stillness can produce signs, they also represent an activity (Vainiomäki, 2004, p. 358) and that activity is performance – which is whatever happens to a text in context (Bauman & Briggs, 1990, p. 73). Liz Gunner contends that performance engages with the political sphere at a number of levels (1994, p. 1). William Beinart argues that although violence quickly ebbed as a feature of popular politics after 1994, political tensions are still played out on the streets of South Africa (2010, p. 21). Direct action – rooted in the strategy and style of the 1980s insurrection (Bozzoli, 2004) – has been evident in the early twenty-first century (Beinart, 2010, p. 21). This evidently rich cultural capital reservoir was treated as an ellipsis and its meaning assumed. The songs were lost in the wider setting of the reports and were not interrogated for their loaded meaning.

The early opening scenes of the '*Hambani Makwerekwere*' *Special Assignment* had video footage of an angry mob carrying axes, sticks, pocket knives and knobkerries. The rioters were performing a struggle song titled, '*Zabalaza siphum' emazweni*' [We come from abroad struggling] and the song slowly formed the background and the camera showed an image of burning shacks in silhouette. The song is again heard being sung by what could be another mob in Diepsloot. The song's provenance is in the 1980s and perhaps even earlier, and it is part of the struggle songs sung by apartheid resisters during the armed struggle against the apartheid government.

Yonke lendawo	Everywhere
Umzabalazo uyasivumela	The struggle is in our favour
Yonke lendawo	Everywhere
Umzabalazo uyasivumela	The struggle is in our favour
Le na le	There and there

Umzabalazo uyasizumela	The struggle is in our favour
Le na le	There and there
Umzabalazo uyasizumela (*Special Assignment* 20-05-08)	The struggle is in our favour

The selection and performance of this song produces a complex textual terrian. Songs and their performance are sites of politics (Schuman, 2013) and they act as communication used by disgruntled and frustrated people. The song inversely acknowledges the role African countries played in South Africa's liberation, as they harboured MK cadres. But, what it meant in 2008 proved to be more complex. The song seemed to be in line with ANC rhetoric which provides a pan-Africanist *ex-facia*, acknowledging neighbouring states for their role in the fight against apartheid, but in reality compelled to focus on national identity which inversely means discrimination (also see Kabwe-Segatti & Landau, 2008).

Michel Moerman argues that actors plan by imagining a future time where an action will have been accomplished, and reconstruct[ing] the future steps which will have brought forth this future act (1988, p. 65). The *umZabalazo* song echoes an exclusionary national-building ideology, as Stephen Ellis argues that many South Africans feel that the government should prioritise its own citizens (2008, p. 47). In retrospect and in the situation in which the song was employed, rioters disregarded South Africa's historical struggle debt and defended their circuits of riches militantly.

In the same *Special Assignment* scene which had the *umZabalazo* song, a much less known song was sung by rioters in Alexandra on Alfred Nzo Street, which is near the hostels. The report had medium long shots of rioters waving knobkerries and sticks in the air as they sang *Hebe uSuthu*.

Hebe uSuthu	Gashed, by uSuthu
Babengaphi	Where were they?
Babengapha singapha	They were that side, whilst we were on this side
Kwakhala isimaye	And crying went off

Hebe uSuthu is a war chant, *ihubo*. In its origins the song is laced with the discourse of loyalty and autochthony and in its context was sung as *amabutho* (King Cetshwayo's regiments) prepared to attack their enemies such as Mandlakazi and Zibhebhu's regiments, during the royal strife of the late 1880s in colonial Natal (Mokoena, 2011, p. 35). The song is not part of the usual struggle song repertoire and its usage in the context of the xenophobic riots, suggests a complex selection criteria. Sara Cohen argues that music creates its own time, space and motion (1995, p. 444). Furthermore, Keith Negus and Patria

Velázquez posit that the issue is not how a particular piece of music or performance reflects people, but how it produces them, how it creates an experience (2002, p. 136). The decontextualised song when recontextualised in the 2008 xenophobic riots can be understood as a tool of protest, as rioters felt that foreigners presented a threat to their citizenry liberties. What texts say is inseparable from history as texts are produced in specific historical circumstances, the imprints of which bear up them. Texts are also transmitted through time bringing with them elements of the past but also underlying a process of erasure and layering as they are refashioned in accordance with new concerns (Barber & Farias, 1989, p. 1).

The xenophobic rioters protested using tried and tested mediums of protest but still a kind of patchwork. The 'libidinal economy' (Jasper, 1998) of protestors included emotions which are central to rioters, as frustration and anger are not incidental characteristics, but the motivation and explanation of protest (Jasper, 1998, p. 398). Liz Gunner and Graham Furniss contend that concentration on social action demands that the performance, the people, and the 'text' are seen in their political context, as the words, the texts, have the ability to provoke, to move, to direct, to prevent, to overturn and to recast social reality (Gunner & Furniss, 1995, p. 3). Songs as oral texts (Finnegan, 1970 & Hank, 1989) have historical residue, influenced by their past contexts, having been decontextualized and recontextualized for varying purposes (Bauman & Briggs, 1990, p. 73). Texts derive information and meaning from performance (Hanks, 1989, p. 112).

Mshini wami, Mshini wami	My machine gun, my machine gun,
We Baba	Oh Father
Awuleth' umshini wami	Please bring me my machine gun,

(*Special Assignment* 20-05-08)

The *umShini wami* song has a much thicker and lived experience in the political context of 2008 and earlier. Xenophobic rioters also employed this classic struggle song when protesting. Liz Gunner analysed the song as a 'symbiotic link' as the song offered itself to wider implications and further acted as a catalyst for the involvement of multiple publics and the wider public sphere (2009, p. 27-28). The song commented on the marginalisation of the poor, but socially marginalized groups also have agency to attack and devastate (Furniss & Gunner, 1995, p. xii). Furthermore, the song commented on the distance of the elite from those whom they ruled (Gunner, 2008, p. 32; White, 2012; Gevisser, 2010). The song is not a solution, only a symptom, a sign; it has been a catalyst releasing the sorrows of the poor and the passed-over onto the national stage (Gunner, 2009, p. 47). Beinart contends that, rioters employed the song for the purpose of collective memory of the struggle, rather than a renewal of kakashnikov culture (2010, p. 29).

In 1994 *City Press* journalist Elias Maluleke in a news report entitled, '*To toyi or not to toyi-toyi?*' pondered whether the ANC had sounded the 'death knell of the *toyi-toyi* (affirmative aerobics)' (*City Press,* May 8, p. 6). The repertoires of social performance employed by some xenophobic rioters included expressive tools from their past, fragments of history deployed for present situations, recontextualized to mediate their 'current problems'. Karin Barber argues that the past is something that we in the present do not have to go back to; the past comes forward, and actively works on the present (2007, p. 212). Beinart contends that the re-emergence of popular protest, of 'street sociology and pavement politics' was not generally foreseen and has been a compelling social phenomenon (2010, p. 2). The lack of commentary about the songs marked a gap in the television report. An assumed ellipsis was left for the viewers to connect and create meaning using their own memories. This gap in the commentary held a different angle to the rioters' perceptions and sentiments, lodged in their social performance. Many thought that such performative repertoires would be null and void in post-apartheid South Africa; but they still have currency and meaning, which contribute to political discourse.

4.6. Trails run deep and relations go back

Special Assignment produced one last report on the 1st of July entitled, '*Ashes to Ashes*' which examined foreign fatalities and their mourning families. The *mise-en-scene* of the report was split between Johannesburg and Mozambique and its narrative focused on two Mozambican families who had lost a father, a son and a brother. The report provided angry sentiments by Mozambicans towards the South African government and its people. The news report's 'unstaged' quality and the camera work seemed to morph the camera into the background and bore witness in a discreet manner. South Africa has a long history of recruiting Mozambican labour migrants to work in her mines and farms and during the struggle against apartheid, ANC cadres sought refuge in Mozambique. With this history South Africa inherited a complex migration policy with regards to Mozambique. South Africa has always attempted to quench and balance its need for labour migrants with national interests (Katzenellenbogen, 1982, p. 145). In the early years of post apartheid South Africa the ANC-led government faced a similar dilemma; to limit its pan-Africanist ideology and rather focus on national interest and her citizens (Kabwe-Segatti & Landau, 2008; Buur, Jensen & Stepputat, 2007).

The '*Ashes to Ashes*' news report began with long medium video shots of rioters in Ramaphosa in the East Rand pillaging shacks and a solemn Xitsonga hymn was introduced in the background as aerial shots of Ramaphosa were shown. The report began with Sasha Wales-Smith interviewing Franciso Candza about the death of his brother-in-law Ernesto Nhamuave. Still shots of bloodied foreign immigrants were shown and photographic shots of Ernesto were shown as flames engulfed his body.

Franciso told the reporter how he and his brother-in-law were trying to run away when a mob nabbed Ernesto, beating him and finally setting him alight (*Special Assignment,* 01-07-08). The news reporter then shifted focus to Joao Fuma, whose brother Alfredo was beaten and set alight by xenophobic mobs. Commentary by the Mozambican government was provided as they declared the xenophobic attacks a National Emergency and offered to repatriate Mozambicans, and help transport the bodies of those that were killed to be returned for burial in Mozambique (*Special Assignment,* 01-07-08).

Focus was then turned to preparations for Ernesto and Alfredo's bodies to be transported back to Mozambique for burial. *Special Assignment* followed the burial entourage to Mozambique - Inhambane province, Ernesto's village. In long shots they followed the funeral procession through the dusty streets to the cemetery. The news reports switched focus between the two families, bearing witness to the two mourning families. Wales-Smith remarked, 'the number of people at the funerals showed how profoundly the attacks had affected people in Mozambique as many had lived and worked in South Africa and others had relatives and this could have happened to anyone of them. The Mozambican government condemned the attacks but urged people to remember the ties between the two countries' (*Special Assignment,* 01-07-08). At one of the funerals a representative from the Mozambican government stated, 'We built South Africa, all the cities. We participated in the farms, in the mines. That is why we can't tolerate today, someone to come and divide us' (*Special Assignment*, 01-7-08).

Alfredo's bereaved mother, Atalia Cossa in a sombre voice remarked,

> When there was a war in South Africa, people in Johannesburg were living in Matola, hiding here because they were afraid of being killed. We didn't attack them we treated them well, until they got freedom and went home. So now if they don't want Shangaans they must sit down and say, 'All Shangaan's must go home'. Not what they did, stealing their stuff and at the end killing my son. (*Special Assignment,* 01-07-08)

Newly democratised South Africa inherited bilateral labour agreements, dating back to the 1880s, and since then, mining industries have enjoyed 'special status' in their ability to operate outside the rules and regulations governing other employers (Crush, 1998, p. 5). South Africa has a long migration history with Southern Mozambique, dating back to the late nineteenth century. The bedrock of these relations go back to three treaties: the 1875 free-trade treaty, the 1895 agreement for the Transvaal to share their railway line and the 1896 recruitment regulation (Kazenellenbogen, 1982, p. 1). The Mozambican government derived substantial revenue from the recruitment agreement but this crippled

the country's economy and social structure in the Southern region. The Union of South Africa's Chamber of Mines wanted to continue to recruit Mozambican migrants as imported labour was in fact an advantage, as these men would not become a 'liability' to the South African economy (Kazenellenbogen, 1982, p. 146).

Thabo Mbeki's denialism of the economic melt-down in Zimbabwe (Gevisser, 2010) formed an element linked to his government's refusal to classify deserving individuals as refugees. In the '*Hambani mkwerekwere*' *Special Assignment* news report on May 20th, Moeletsi Mbeki claimed that the government chose to label refugees as economic migrants and in that scenario shrugged off its responsibility towards them (*Special Assignment*, 20-05-08). The ANC-led government inherited a long national migration history and through the government's long-term economic strategy, it plans to develop skilled workers through the Joint Initiative for Priority Skills Acquisition (JIPSA). A potentially key aspect to the JIPSA strategic plan is to encourage skilled migrate to migrant to South Africa (Kabwe-Segatti & Landau, 2008, p. 30). But, at the core of the discourse which frames policy choices about migration and immigration is a set of images about the negative impact of foreign citizens in South Africa (Crush, 1998, p. 2).

The news report further illustrated raw emotions and anxieties that bereaved families experienced, as they faced the reality of sending another brother or son back to South Africa. Atalia Cossa aptly remarked, 'he [Alfredo] was sent by hunger because if you stay here you'll go hungry. In this country there are no jobs, educated or not, it doesn't matter there are no jobs' (*Special Assignment*, 01-07-08). The final scenes are of Mozambican men preparing to go back to Johannesburg and the reporter commented, 'Whilst the government may wish the problems away, the issues that fuelled the violence have not been resolved' (*Special Assignment*, 01-07-08). In the battle for belonging and protecting national resources and with the fluidity of autochthony, margins of exclusion are re-drawn strategically to exclude those deemed unworthy.

4.7. Conclusion: Staged and un-staged television reportage

By viewing the three television news reports on the xenophobic riots through the prism of a 'staged' and 'unstaged' modality, analysed through a semiotic analysis, light is shed on the divergent styles that the news reporters used to convey and comment on the riots. The television reports also map a number of shifts, led by the commentators, the news anchor and the interviewees which produced multiple angles to reporting the xenophobic riots.

Although the television modality of 'witness' is never unmediated, camerawork and interviewing styles can render the camera 'invisible', deflecting awareness from the constructed character of news (Ellis 2002 & Dahlgren 2009). The two SABC *Special Assignment* news episodes captured, commented and bore witness to the xenophobic riots in a similar manner and focused their attention on grass-root sentiments and broadened the debate by including ordinary people's voices in the public sphere. From the grass-root sentiments it was evident that xenophobic rioters sought to delegitimize foreign nationals' claim to South Africa, whilst foreign nationals legitimized their claim of belonging in South Africa. Moreover, the two SABC news episodes together offered a fuller depiction, by including the aftermath of the attacks and focusing on the lived experience of labour migration patterns and its wider implications in South Africa and Mozambique.

The *mise-en-scene* of the eTV *3rd Degree* news episode offered a very limited and static public sphere which made it seem 'staged'. The commentary from a senior political analyst and a senior member of the ANC offered a 'top-down' narrative and a bureaucratically stiff discourse, which rendered ordinary people as mere observers of the public sphere and prevented them from contributing to public opinion. Mantashe and Mbeki both sidestepped key issues to the xenophobic riots and rather engaged in larger macro structures, sidestepping Patta's lead question, of whether the government had done enough.

Both the *Special Assignment* and the *3rd Degree* news reports treated popular politics of resistance with deafening silence, although these songs were a shift, and added another dimention to the reports and people's sentiments. William Beinart contends that peformative repertoires (singing, *toyi-toying*) offer direct action – rooted in the strategy and style of the 1980s insurrection (2010, p. 21). What the news reports chose to omit from their commentary offered a means of communication, as political songs act with social function (Finnegan, 1970, p. 284).

All three of the television news reports offered insightful depictions of the xenophobic riots through the visual and aural form of television. Through the modality of witnessing and the Habermasian and un-Habermasian frame of reference, differences in reporting were foregrounded in this chapter. Anthony Giddens quotes Wittgenstein in saying that 'What can't be said in language is what has to be done', (1998, p. 147). As the politics of necessity reached breaking point in 2008 disgruntled residents enacted their frustrations in a bid to send a message to the government which they felt had lost touch with them. The next chapter through a critical discourse analysis explores the civic agency of an Alexandran tenant civic movement and their lived experience as they shared their perceptions of foreigners and their frustrations, tethered to democratic material liberties – embedded in the discourse of insiders and outsiders.

5. Chapter Five: The Bona Fides: Searching for a Present?

"No individual owns any story. The community is the owner of the story, and it can tell it the way it deems fit." (Mda, 1995, p. 12)

This chapter examines the Bona Fides civic movement as a vehicle of negotiating democracy. Through a critical discourse analysis, I analyse the testimonies of members belonging to the Bona Fides and examine how they make meaning of their marginalized status in Alexandra. Chapters Two and Three examined how two isiZulu-language and three English-language newspapers mediated and communicated the xenophobic riots. All five newspapers provided divergent narratives, employing public idioms applicable to their target audiences. Chapter Four examined how television reports used the visual and aural: to comment on, the 'staged' and 'unstaged' reportage of the xenophobic riots. These three chapters each explored how the xenophobic riots were mediated through print and broadcast media as they attempted to negotiate and communicate various meaning around the xenophobic riots. The print and broadcast media reflected the tensions and dissonances which characterized Alexandra in 2008. This chapter, by contrast, explores the perceptions about democracy and the lived experiences of tenants in Alexandra five years after the xenophobic riots. This chapter examines another strand of the negotiation of democracy, this time through the lens that is the Bona Fides civic movement.

The material I will analyse in this chapter was collected over six months in the township of Alexandra, five years after the xenophobic riots. In December 2012 on twitter, I met a UJ student who once lived in Alexandra and after some conversations, he agreed to give me an introductory tour of Alexandra in January 2013. During the introductory tour, we were directed to Duma Kulashe's house who agreed to talk to me and later, invited my supervisor (Professor Liz Gunner) and myself, to attend the fortnightly Bona Fides meeting at which we were given permission to take notes. We attended five such meetings and I approached various members and eventually interviewed ten Bona Fides members at their homes in Alexandra. All the respondents in one way or another were waiting: for development; for service delivery, for government or the municipality to deliver their promises – they were always hopeful but their patience was wearing thin.

The interviews and fieldnotes illustrate the discourse of insiders and outsiders five years later and I view the Bona Fides as a mediating lens which highlights frustrations and tensions in Alexandra, which have a much longer history. The content of verbal output does not merely passively reflect the complex social, political, and economic reality of the human race: it interacts with it as well (Rapoport, 1969, p. 36). The chapter examines the negotiation of democracy and the discourse of insiders and outsiders

and its ambiguity. Peter Geschiere argues that, 'It is only possible to identify oneself if one differentiates the self from the other, and this demarcation implies, whether one wants it or not, discrimination. It is not possible to be oneself and the other at the same time' (Geschiere, 2009, p. 102).

The Bona Fides key mission is "fighting for our rights" and they further seek to claim their citizenship through due protocol. In a radio interview on *Alex FM* president of the Bona Fides movement, Duma Kulashe declared, 'We are not xenophobic when we try to put our Department of Housing into order'[52]. From interviews with Bona Fides members and the agendas of their fortnightly community meetings, African nationals (naturalized or not) are seen (not solely) as adding to Alexandrans frustrations with the roll-out of development and service delivery. In their actions, the Bona Fides can be seen as attempting to further the law, encourage orthodoxy and foster a culture of due process. My three questions for this chapter are – How do Bona Fides members understand democracy? How is the discourse of insiders/outsiders perceived by Alexandrans? To answer these questions I will perform a critical discourse analysis on the interviews, examining respondents'[53] understanding and perceptions of democracy and the discourse of insiders and outsiders (Kelly, 1999, p. 402).

The chapter is comprised of three sections. I begin by examining the Bona Fides civic movement meetings, their activities, negotiation of democracy and how they use the discourse of autochthony. The second section furthers the examination of autochthony and the discourse of insiders and outsiders, by analysing a community meeting which was held in Kings Cinema in Alexandra. The third and final section examines respondents' understanding and perceptions of democracy - what it means and their disappointment with how it has morphed in post-apartheid South Africa. Nyamnjoh contends that boundaries of inclusion and exclusion [insiders and outsiders] are political, social, cultural and above all, material (2006, p. 25). Moreover, notions of autochthony and graduation to desired levels of citizenship (Nyamnjoh, 2006) are evident in the interviews and fieldnotes, as Bona Fides members articulate and enact their hard earned democracy.

5.1 Vocalized perceptions: The lived experience of democracy

This chapter considers four themes: the enactment of citizenship, belonging and frustration and lastly, the question of waiting. Dahlgren argues that citizenship has three dimensions and they are: extent - translates to inclusion and exclusion, content - addresses rights and responsibilities and lastly, depth - encompasses identities in a nation (Dahlgren, 2009, p. 61). Moreover, Klaaren contends that the

[52] Radio interview with Duma Kulashe on Alexfm, 4 April 2013

[53] For ethical reasons all respondents names and surnames have been anonymized and replaced with gender and ethnic equivalent names and surnames.

residential characteristic of citizenship is consistent with a feeling and sense of local belonging and entitlement (Klaaren, 2011, p. 139). Thus, a residential axis of citizenship can be dangerous when compounded with a substantive understanding of democracy.

Zwelinzima Vavi COSATU leader, commenting on inequalities in many South African societies remarked, 'Perhaps others have arrived in the Promised land, but the working class and the poor have yet to make it there' (Beinart, 2010, p. 16). When citizens' genuine concerns are ignored, this creates a volatile situation especially when citizens have a substantive understanding of democracy. Nyomnjoh argues that if [democratic] rights are threatened by the state, individuals at different levels of society are expected, in principle, to be able to mobilise themselves as 'individuals linked by common interests', to defend their freedom (Nyamnjoh, 2006, p. 25). From my fieldwork in Alexandra, it seems that Bona Fides members have a substantive understanding of democracy, associated with the provision of basic material needs (Zuern, 2011, p. 169).

From my fieldnotes and interviews, it is evident that the Bona Fides are at times themselves relegated to the status of being outsiders and through the law; they attempt to graduate to meaningful citizenship. Furniss and Gunner contend that social marginality does not make people powerless, but rather, such a position enables them to attack and occasionally devastate (1995, p. xxi). In analysing the interviews I am mindful that immediate social situations and their immediate social participants determine the 'occasional' form and style of an utterance (Vološinov, 1986, p. 86-89). David Parkin argues that it is the people that retain the power to name, entitle, objectify others, and who determine the terms of discourse (1984, p. 359).

5.2. '*AmaBona Fides, argh, amanzi amancane*'[54]: The organization and its activities

5.2.1. Mapping the terrain

In this section I examine the Bona Fides tenants' civic movement, established in 2010 - its activities, mission and ongoing struggles. This will be achieved through examining fieldnotes taken during their fortnightly meetings where Duma Kulashe – the civic movement's president, who summed up the organizations plan of action and engagement strategies.

From my first impromptu meeting with Duma Kulashe on the 6th of January 2013, he summed up the Bona Fides civic movement as one which helps its members with issues relating to RDP and ARP housing, and further attempts to advance due-process with service delivery (Interview, 06-01-13). On

[54] 'Bona Fides, small and insignificant', Bona Fides meeting, 6 March 2013

my second visit with Professor Liz Gunner on the 15th of January, Duma gave us a formal introduction and tour-on-foot of Alexandra (Interview, 15-01-13). He arrived late for our meeting as he was caught up at the Alexandra Police Station with issues pertaining to RDP allocation matters. We walked along 12th Avenue headed towards Vasco da Gama Street, passing tuck-shops, and many shacks in old stands. We turned right, continuing down Vasco De Gama Street and on our left was a settlement called *Vez'inyawo*[55]. Duma informed us that it was established as a temporary scheme to house people whose shacks had been demolished and were awaiting their new ARP houses (Interview, 15 -01-13). *Vez'inyawo* was meant to be a temporary housing scheme, but due to corruption, many families found themselves, 'stuck' in a hiatus - forever waiting.

We continued down Vasco da Gama Street towards the Jukskei River, and stopped for a while as Duma showed us yet another housing scheme across the Jukskei River. On our right was East and West Bank residential areas, where more affluent residents lived. We turned left just before the river bank and entered the informal settlement of *Setswetla.* Lining the sides of the tiny road were PVC portable toilets and a faint, but yet persistent odour permeated the air. People were milling around, playing cards and listening to music. We walked through *Setswetla,* towards another temporary housing scheme called Silver-town located near Marlboro. We crossed a small bridge and Duma informed us that many shacks are destroyed by floods during the rainy season. Duma further remarked that many people built their shacks on the banks of the Jukskei knowing the dangers, but in the hope of being moved by the municipality and being given an ARP or RDP house (interview, 15-01-13). We continued walking and entered Extension Seven, which was one of the sites of the 2008 xenophobic riots. Duma pointed out houses which had faint 'x' marks near the front door, and informed us that they were remnants of the 2008 xenophobic riots, when rioters under the cover of darkness marked houses belonging to foreigners. We continued walking towards Extension Ten near the N3, and Duma showed us the ARP housing Schemes (acronym for what?) (interview, 15-01-13). At the edge of 'Greater Alexandra', we turned back to see 'old Alexandra' in the valley, the Gautrain whizzing past the edge and Sandton's sky scrapers looming large, in sharp contrast with Alexandra's poverty.

5.2.2. Aims, actions and frustrations: Vehicle of mediation

The five Bona Fides meetings I attended were characterised by two tempos: a generally composed nature and, other times, heated temperaments. The name, Bona Fides itself is paradoxical when locating it in Alexandra's history; it is part of an old dichotomy, between tenants (new arrivals) and urbanized freehold land owners, who styled *themselves* as the 'bona fides' (Bonner & Nieftagodien,

[55] Show your feet

2008, p. 6). Historically to belong to Alexandra meant owning land, and in 2010, tenants took the term and gave it a new definition which added lived experience and invested time to the definition of belonging to Alexandra.

The Bona Fides are a civic moment, which is independent and not politically aligned - their motto is: 'fighting for our rights'. Their struggles are embedded in two key themes: housing delivery and the implementation of due-process by furthering the law. Their objectives are to help Alexandra, the community and the country at large; striving to assist them with access to shelter and adequate housing; with a mandate to interact with all spheres of government; local, provincial and the national Housing Department (*Alex FM* interview, 04-04-13). "We put emphasis on working as a nation and closer with our government instead of crying foul where it is not necessary", added Duma (*Alex FM* interview, 04-04-13). The Bona Fides fortnightly meetings are held in number 27 on 12th Avenue, just off Joe Nhlanhla Road (formally, John Brand), in an old church – The Christian Apostolic Church, built in 1920 (fieldnotes, 15-02-13).

In our first planned meeting and tour-on-foot, Duma informed us that the Bona Fides were trying to air problems resulting from top-down resolutions: government officials coming up with plans without consulting residents of Alexandra. Such an approach had led to many people not knowing the correct procedures for development plans (interview, 15-01-13). As we walked, Duma pointed out RDP and ARP houses owned by foreign nationals and tuck-shops owned by foreigners. Underneath Duma's frustrations an exclusive nationalistic ideology brewed. He informed us that the foreign owned tuck-shops did not pay taxes and were in breach of many commercial laws (interview, 15-01-13). Before the end of our tour, Duma paid a disabled woman, whom he had helped get an RDP house in extension ten, a visit. By the end of our tour-on-foot, Alexandra had become much more complex to me with its many housing schemes, deep rooted frustrations and huge disparities, staring back at Alexandra. Inner older Alexandra was congested, development was proving difficult to be implemented whilst the edges developed, forming 'greater Alexandra'. 'Greater Alexandra' hugs and wraps inner old Alexandra but tensions have no boundaries and they seemed to me to traverse in-between inner and outer Alexandra.

The Bona Fides' understanding of democracy is substantive and they place socio-economic rights as central to democratic success (Zuern, 2011, p. 169). The Bona Fides as a civic movement have agency, 'civic agency' as they anchor people's enactment of citizenship (Dahlgren, 2009, p. 59). Civic movements are formed by individuals drawn together by common frustrations and sentiments, they empower people to demand their rights and expand popular discussions of necessary rights (Zuern, 2011, p. 187). Civic movements further form and create intimacy based on what Anthony Giddens calls

'active trust' (Giddens, 1998, p. 136). By doing this, they do not disregard the state's authority but see themselves as extra-legal embodiments of the states, furthering the law (Monson, 2011, p. 174).

The Bona Fides are active and seek to further the law and foster due-protocol in the roll-out of development in Alexandra. They believe that they deserve first preference when it comes to RDP houses (*Alex FM* interview, 04 - 04 - 13). In 2012 the Bona Fides carried out a door-to-door campaign in Extension Seven, checking who owned ARP and RDP houses, and the legitimacy of their papers (field-notes, 15-02-13). Bona Fides members went around and found SAPS staff and people from Soshanguve (near Pretoria) living in the RDP houses. The door-to-door campaign took another dimension when Bona Fides members decided to occupy vacant RDP houses; police were called in and twenty-nine Bona Fides members were arrested and sent to Sun City prison. The civic movement raised R3 000 for bail (Lungi Sibiya, interview, 26-02-13). The Bona Fides actions seemed to mimic the Alex Vukuzenzele Crisis Committee (AVCC) who, in September 2007 forcibly occupied RDP houses in Extension Seven (Sinwell, 2009, p. 444). Their actions, like those of the Bona Fides, were meant to apply pressure on the government to expedite service delivery. There was a stark difference between the results of the AVCC and the Bona Fides though: the one hundred and fifty five houses that AVCC members forcibly occupied were eventually given to them legally by the municipality (Sinwell, 2009, p. 446). The Bona Fides obtained nothing material for their efforts. This form of active citizenry can tentatively be located with the formation of Community Police Forums (CPFs), as the ANC-led government linked the community to problem-oriented policing (Steinberg, 2012, p. 346). Furthermore, such active citizenry also involved levels of departure from the state-sanctioned social order as well as various degrees of trespassing into state jurisdiction as people enacted their normative understanding of legality, legitimacy and orders of regulations (Monson, 2011, p. 173).

Bona Fides members had drawn-up a list of all 'illegal' occupants and sent it off to the Public Protectors Office (Thuli Madonsela) but no action was taken. Duma, Joyce Shilangu and Larry Maluleka Maluleke?, had met with Councillor Bonakele Mbovu and other members of her office, on the 8th of March 2013, pertaining to the list they had drawn up in the 2012 door-to-door campaign (*Alexfm,* interview, 04-04-13). The list had details of people in Extensions, Seven, Eight, Nine and Ten, who the Bona Fides suspected of being allocated housing illegally, through bribery. The staff from the Mayoral Committee (MMC) pledged to address the issue within seven working days. Seven days elapsed and they had done nothing about the list (fieldnotes, 06-03-13). On the week of the 4th of May the Bona Fides carried out another door-to-door campaign once again collecting information and creating their own data-base of suspected illegal occupants, foreign national or not (fieldnotes, 04-05-13).

The Bona Fides meetings were a space where the tenants brain stormed ways to strengthen the law although in our time with them they had no obvious success. Some meetings were used for planning and slight hope characterised those meetings, whilst other meetings were characterised by anger as their concerns and collated data were discarded and disregarded by those in power. From the back and forth communication with the Public Protector and the Mayoral office, frustration had built-up as Bona Fides members were dissatisfied with their local government officials for not responding to their demands.

During a Bona Fides meeting on the 6th of March, a stand-owner attended the tenants meeting; picking up on Duma's pessimistic tone, he spoke passionately and stated that stand-owners and tenants should stand together instead of being divided (fieldnotes, 06-03-13). He invoked Alexandra's dynamic history characterised by long relations between tenants and stand-owners. He added that the Bona Fides had a real case against the government as they had been waiting for housing since 1996 and some longer. He concluded, 'We know how to talk, we know how to fight, but let's talk and engage the government' (fieldnotes, 06-03-13).

Tensions began to rise in the meeting as another member stood-up and stated that the gentlemen sitting next to him recently found out that his RDP house had been allocated (a case of fraudulent documentation), supposedly to him but he was not living in it. 'Talking is over. Lets act now!' he stated (fieldnotes, 06-03-13). Another person (not a member) rose up and lamented the government's irresoluteness and remarked, 'Sometimes militancy will grab a lot of attention. Sometimes sitting and drawing-up agendas' is a waste of time because the people in power know the game. We need to show our frustrations. This country was emancipated this way!' (Fieldnotes, 06-03-13). He ended by saying, 'I was born here, but today I'm a lodger'. Duma remarked, 'We're still in the clouds, it's been nineteen years and still counting. We've been patient because the government is black and we thought we would give them time, but no more!'(fieldnotes, 06-04-13). Duma and the movement came to a decision and declared that the following Saturday (11th of April), they would take the list of illegally occupied RDP houses, march to Extensions, Seven, Eight, Nine and Ten and ask the foreigners to leave. He added, 'We are not xenophobic when we try to put our Department of Housing into order' (*Alexfm* interview, 04-04-13).

The heated community meeting had individuals trying to dampen down frustrations and emotions, invoking elements of Alexandra's historical social cohesion whilst others utilized anger and frustration to prompt actions. The addresses were marked by persuasive speech, transcending reason, and engaging the audience's emotions (Triadafiloulos, 1999, p. 750). The heated meetings saw various

members and some visitors tapping into and utilizing the dialogical nature of utterance and invoking archival memories to 'drive-home' their various points. Increasingly from the Bona Fides marginalized status in Alexandra, they felt forced to enact their democracy in the mediatory space they had, furthering the law in the hope of graduating to meaningful citizenship.

5.3. *Kings Cinema: Addressing the community and defining belonging*

Alexandra's history of being a freehold township has given the township an interesting ensemble of local leadership who through divergent views, at times impede development due to their different manifestos. In this section through a critical discourse analysis I examine the dynamics of insider/outsider and the dichotomy between tenants and stand-owner from the perspective of tenants. For my analysis I draw on fieldnotes from one property owners' community meeting.

On the 2nd of February 2013, at Kings Cinema in Alexandra, a community meeting was held, organized by four associations: the Amalgamation of the Alexandra Land and Property owners (Alpoa), Greater Alexandra Land and Property Owners and Commercial Rights (Galpocr), the Alexandra Property Owner's Rights (Alpor) and the Greater Alexandra Chamber of Commerce (Galxcoc) (*AlexNews,* 8 February, 2013). An elderly man addressed the audience made up of mostly property owners and some tenants and remarked, 'Children of Alexandra, we are here to protect Alexandra property owners' rights' (fieldnotes, 02-02-13). On the agenda of the community meeting was Alexandra's development and the preservation of property rights. Part of the complexity of this desired development was to have the ARP develop old stands but not buy out the property ownership. They wanted to continue the tenant system and retain property ownership. From the community meeting, it was clear that some tenants were in agreement with this development plan, as they did not want to move out to the outskirts of Alexandra.

The term, 'children of Alexandra' employed in the community meeting aimed to exclude those deemed as not fulfilling the criteria of 'belonging' defined by property ownership. This alluded to the ambiguous and fluid nature of autochthony, used for certain ends (Geschiere, 2009). Throughout the community meeting the maxim, '*Siyathemba ukuth' i'Alexandra iyobuya*' [we hope Alexandra shall return] was employed, invoking history and the need to correct wrongs done by the apartheid government. Another property owning leader stood up and greeted the audience, '*Dumelang bo'stand*' [greetings stand-owners], and lambasted the municipality for not involving community members in development plans (fieldnotes, 02-02-13). The floor was then opened for questions and a Bona Fides member inquired about tenants being granted title-deeds and being bestowed with property rights as they too are children of Alexandra (fieldnotes, 02-02-13). Great murmurs of disapproval filled the cinema and an

Alpoa leader responded in a rude and cavalier manner, stating that 'Compromises will have to be made'.

Nyamnjoh argues that the claiming of rights often entails denying rights and sometimes these rights are renegotiated in order to maintain or increase the privilege of those who deemed themselves to have a better claim at belonging (2006, p. 25). This inclusion and exclusion is often mobilized to protect circuits of power and riches (Geschiere, 2009, p. 26). Further, from the meeting it was clear that by creating artificial categories, groups of residents were labelling each other and determining their own discourse (Parkin, 1984, p. 359). The entire community meeting was characterized by the juxtaposition between property owners and tenants, each employing the term 'bona fides' to justify their claim to belonging more than the other. The members of the Bona Fides civic movement have been caught in the tenant system for many years due to lack of finance and are now fighting to get RDP houses.

From the community meeting a number of discourses were apparent, Alexandra was divided into two; inner old Alexandra and outer new Alexandra, stand-owners and tenants – each claiming to be 'bona fides', using history to legitimise their claim. The discourse of 'bona fides' and '*amagoduka'* (translate and reference) has always created contestations in Alexandr. This 'insider/outsider' discourse has always caused a social fault-line in Alexandra's social cohesion between 'legal' insiders/permit holders and 'illegal' outsiders/ non-permit holders (Bonner & Nieftagodien, 2008, p. 237). We saw it being played out in a particular way at the Kings Cinema meeting, one which showed the weakness of the group of tenants we were attached to through our fieldwork.

From the Kings Cinema meeting, it is apparent that people can radically alter development trajectories in their favour (Sinwell, 2009, p. 439). The Kings Cinema can be viewed as a participatory space; a social arena in which the community had the potential to impact on policies, discourses and practices of development (Sinwell, 2009, p. 439). At the Kings Cinema, societal discourse was enacted in theatrical ways (Bozzoli, 2004), as tenants and stand-owners each claimed to belong more than the other. Tenants and stand-owners used the participatory space theatrically to mobilize perceptions of belonging and enact their citizenship.

5.4. We are still waiting: Long awaited democracy

From interviews conducted in Alexandra with a focus on Bona Fides members who are predominantly tenants, a great sense of anxiety and frustration characterised their answers. From their responses one can tease out a substantive understanding of South Africa's democracy. The ANC-led government in the post-apartheid era had claimed that to be black and free in a newly democratized South Africa was

to legitimately expect a better life – promising better jobs, housing and good education (Steinberg, 2012, p. 355). Nyamnjoh argues that in post-apartheid South Africa the majority of nationals have yet to graduate into meaningful citizenship (2006, p. 2). Many of the respondents still held onto these and many other promises which were made to them by the government and development initiators.

One of the main banes that my respondents shared was that they had all experienced great lengths of waiting for housing and filling out forms in the hope of being allocated housing. Sarah Zondo, an informal trader on the pavement of Pan Africa Shopping Centre, in Alexandra has been living in Alexandra since 1987 (interview, 12-02-13). She came to build her house (shack) in what she thought was vacant land. Over the years more people built their shacks and in 1996 she filled out a C-form in the hope of being allocated an RDP house in *Tsutsumane* (part of Greater Alexandra) (interview, 12-02-13). After some time she returned to the offices where she submitted her C-form and was told that since she worked she was not eligible for an RDP; she was angry as she knew that foreigners were bribing officials to get houses first (interview, 12-02-13). She and others decided to take the matter to the Municipal office in town, and were told to rather wait for Extension Seven to be completed.

Mphume Ndebele is also a tenant and she's also frustrated at the system, she was born in Alexandra but still hasn't been allocated an RDP house, when she goes to complain at the Municipal offices she's told to be patient (interview, 15-02-13). She angrily states that others who have applied for housing had been allocated housing, 'Why not me? They want us to rent. With what money are we going to rent?' (Interview, 15-02-13).

Many tenants waited for Extension Seven to be completed but as before, due process in allocation was not followed and Mam'Zondo (tenant) was not allocated a house. She remarked, 'Money talks and access to the project is determined by who has money to fork out, you see' (interview, 12-02-13). In 2010 she decided to join the Bona Fides so as to form a united front as she had been given the run around since 1996. In recent years Mam'Zondo tried to apply for a flat (part of the ARP housing scheme) but due to their new criteria – rent-to-buy, she was excluded, because she didn't earn enough money. Angrily she remarked,

> I don't know why they are renting out or building flats for that matter; we are so poor. The houses that were built for us are being occupied by other people illegally [foreigners]. Why aren't they evicting these people from these houses that are meant for us? They don't even have identity documents or permits. You

> see, the government is not acting and they are not taking care of matters such as this. (Interview, 12-02-13)

Mam'Zondo further added that foreigners were living in *Tsutsumane,* and she, as a South African didn't have a house. Mam'Zondo saw this as a big problem which was causing and would continue to cause unrest in Alexandra (interview, 12-02-13). She felt excluded based on her economic status, disabled people who should be allocated special housing were also still waiting and this irritated Mam'Zondo.

These respondents, like many South Africans, are realising that their constitutional rights are slow at delivering the material benefits of citizenship and in such contexts, with compounded frustrations and uncertainties, foreigners are seen as competition for resources (Nyamnjoh, 2006, p. 5).

Many respondents although not entirely xenophobic, felt that foreigners were illegally benefiting from their democracy and jeopardized their citizenry material liberties. Neliswa Zibaya lamented, 'It is other people, outsiders, that are getting houses here and not us, even the Ethiopians have managed to occupy some of these houses' (Interview, 16-02-13). As can be detected in the respondents' answers, they have waited and are still waiting for housing and foreigners are seen as benefiting from state resources unfairly, increasingly frustrated South Africans are seeking to exclude others from access to new circuits of riches and power (Geschiere, 2009, p. 26 also see Marshall-Fratani, 2006). Most respondents had lost siblings, spouses and children in the struggle towards democracy; many were affected by the 1976 student up-rising, the Alexandra Six-Days War in 1986 and the hostel violence of the 1990s. They felt they had lost a lot for Alexandra and the country and thus felt they rightfully deserved first preference to housing before any outsider.

Neliswa Zibaya was born in Matatiele in the Eastern Cape and moved to Johannesburg in the 1970s when her parents died and her aunt took them to Johannesburg with her (Interview, 16-02-13). When I asked her whether she was a tenant she answered, 'My child I actually do not know if I am a tenant. I think I am a tenant. Alex is a very difficult place to live in with lots of suffering,' (Interview, 16-02-13). Mam'Zibaya built her home on a freehold stand owned by an old farmer. She has been paying rent to the old farmer's children for over twenty-five years and relations have gone sour, as the new landlords have not carried out their duties as landlords. She told me that many times she prompts other tenants not to pay rent as the government paid out stand-owners R50 000 so as to not harass tenants living in their stands (interview, 16-02-13). Mam'Zibaya angrily stated that she filled out a C-form in 1992 and the government told most people to wait for houses, 'with what I ask? Should we wait whilst holding umbrellas? Houses that we are not even guaranteed to get?' (Interview, 16-02-13). Mam'Zibaya also reacted angrily to the new ARP rent-to-buy housing scheme as it excludes poor people and pensioners

like her, and only youngsters will be illegible for the new housing scheme. She, like many other old people in Alexandra, felt that they should get first preference for housing as they have been waiting since the 1990s for housing.

> We need houses my child, we need houses. We are so tired of living in this place where we are right now. Alexandra as a whole has no peace. (Interview, 16-02-13)

She and other tenants have approached many counsellors but no resolution had been made pertaining to their housing situation. Nombu Dlamini, Mam'Zibaya's neighbour also filled out a C-form back in 1996 and she has also been waiting. She remarks, 'houses are being built and people are occupying them and there's no longer anymore space to build any houses really' (Interview, 16-02-13). Mam'Zibaya also felt that there is no more space in Alexandra for more development, and this was creating more anxiety. Mam'Zibaya remarked that she wants the government to come see what is happening in Alexandra, 'houses are built but people are not moving…if the councillors here in Alex were working, none of this would be happening' (Interview, 16-02-13).

Below we see Lungi Sibiya and Sonto Vilakazi, each using their lived experience to claim their place in Alexandra, having waited for years, their patience was wearing thin. These two respondents and those already mentioned above illustrated the yearning to belong that most members of the Bona Fides feel; forever yearning to graduate to meaningful citizenship.

Lungi Sibiya who moved to Johannesburg from Nquthu - KwaZulu-Natal in the 1980s is currently living in what was meant to be a temporary housing scheme called *Vez'inyawo* near Vasco da Gama Street. She used to live on 18th Avenue as a tenant but was moved to *Vez'inyawo* in 2010 as a pit-stop before being allocated her new house (Interview, 26-02-13). Mam'Sibiya has been waiting for three years for the house she was promised when she was moved from 18th Avenue. She has filled out two C-forms over the years and the new data-base forms, in the hope of being allocated a house as she has a disabled child who has special needs and their current set-up in *Vez'inyawo* is putting strain on his health (interview, 26-02-13). She was promised a house in extension ten but she watched in dismay as people moved into extension ten and she was not called to be given her house. Her health is not good but she follows all instructions given to her by officials, hoping that one day she'll get her house.

Sonto Vilakazi was born in Alexandra and has been a tenant all her life. She added, As you can see they want us to rent now, what are we going to rent with? Twenty years we've been working and now we don't have jobs, what are we going to rent with?' (Interview, 14-02-13). Mam'Vilakazi remarked that

many houses were being given to foreigners and she believed that indigenous bona fides of Alexandra should get first preference (interview, 14-02-13). Mam'Vilakazi lamented, 'We thought that the Boers oppressed us, but they [ANC-led government] are even worse. I am 57 years old, just imagine the long 20 years wait that I have had to endure for a house and I am still waiting' (interview, 14-02-13). When Mam'Vilakazi and others try to complain about rampant corruption in Alexandra, government and municipal officials shrug-off their complaint and disregard their concerns.

Mam'Sibiya, Vilakazi and Zibaya's remarks echo a great sense of exclusion from development. 'South Africanization' – or the reconfiguration of citizenship after 1994 meant asserting the external borders of the Republic but most importantly, dissolving the internal borders of the new nation-state in order to unify the nation (Buur, Jensen & Stepputat, 2007, p. 64 also see Neocosmos, 2006). This turn towards nation-building privileged South Africans as the first in line to service delivery, and long awaited fruits of suffering and struggle against the apartheid system. Increasingly respondents felt like they were yet to graduate to meaningful citizenship.

5.5. *Ama'jaridi namalungelo*[56]: Hope and despair

In the most inflammatory Bona Fides meeting I attended, held on the 6th of March, Duma remarked, 'We are still in the clouds, nineteen years and still counting, we've been patient because the government is black and we thought we would give them time, but no more!' (fieldnotes, 6-03-13). Increasingly Bona Fides members were feeling pessimistic about the ANC-led government and some even remembered the apartheid state with nostalgia. Respondents were nostalgic for the efficiency of the apartheid government.

At the 2nd of February Bona Fides meeting Sonto Vilakazi expressed great frustrations and anger as many Alexandrans had filled out C-forms, some as early as 1991 but they were still waiting (field-notes, 02-02-13). She further blamed foreign immigrants for adding to these tensions and the government for allowing illegal immigrants into South Africa; she remarked, 'Things were better with the old government [apartheid], crime wasn't this bad' (fieldnotes, 02-02-13). 'How can one family live in one room? We also want *ijaridi* [yard] to live and plant, we're not against politicians but we want our rights, our right to live well' (fieldnotes, 02-02-13). Sarah Zondo who built herself a one-room shack is now finding it difficult to extend the house as shacks have mushroomed all around her house over the years. She added, 'my yard is only big enough to just accommodate me placing a washing line. If I choose to extend I'll find myself encroaching in other people's space' (interview, 12-02-13). Many South Africans

[56] Yards and rights

are still trapped in shacks, shantytowns, with substantive understanding of democracy (Zuern, 2011), and have to struggle with African immigrants for consumer crumbs (Nyamnjoh, 2006). Respondents wanted *ama'jaridi* – yards, a space (Banks, 2011) to exercise freedom and agency. A chance to rest, as most have been struggling for housing since their arrival in Alexandra in the second half of the twentieth century.

Mam'Vilakazi felt that the ARP houses were too small, and she preferred RDP houses. She still has her family's permit card which was issued by the Peri-Urban Areas Health Board (PUAHB) in the 1940s. She, like many other old Alexandrans, are nostalgic about the strict influx control of the apartheid government. PUAHB came about through Verwoerd's government and a need for stricter influx control in Alexandra (Bonner & Nieftagodien, 2008, p. 106). Mam'Vilakazi stated that old green permit holders and people with C-forms should get first preference for housing (fieldnotes, 23-02-13). With the fluidity of autochthony Mam'Vilakazi claimed belonging using history and a clear paper trail. Respondents suggested a normative vision of citizenship as endowing the bearer with the long-awaited fruits of suffering from their struggle against the apartheid state (Monson, 2011, p. 191).

Mam'Vilakazi further added that residents of Alexandra are not free, when they try to make a living by selling near the Pan Africa Shopping Centre, they are harassed by police, 'Mandela said we should be free in our country. Still, we not free' (interview, 14-02-13) she added. Like many respondents, Mam'Vilakazi felt like she was living in a 'low-intensity democracy' (Beinart, 2010) and that her social and economic rights were not being delivered as promised by the state.

Neliswa Zibaya and her neighbour (Nombu Dlamini) both felt pessimistic about development and ever getting a house, as they saw development all around them, but they were excluded from it. Mam'Dlamini felt that there was no order in Alexandra and Mam'Zibaya remarked, 'I am even beginning to think that the apartheid system was much better. They did their things right. When they said to you that you will be given a house, they would give you a house' (interview, 16-02-13). Mam'Dlamini felt that other townships like Soweto are developing well, but there is something about Alexandra which is impeding steadfast development. Mam'Zibaya felt that local leadership in Alexandra were all pulling in different directions and this was impeding development (interview, 16-02-13). Many of the respondents' answers reflected elements of a residential character of citizenship (Klaaren, 2011) and they felt marginalized; politically, socially and materially.

5.6. Conclusion: Sisalindile[57]

Through the Bona Fides, as a mediating lens and a space for articulating the enactment of democracy, perceptions of angry, anxious and frustrated residents of Alexandra were mobilised in the hope of one day graduating to meaningful citizenship. Through the substantive understanding of democracy residents used the discourse of insiders and outsiders to close off circuits of power and riches from certain groups and further use this created discourses to further their understanding of citizenship. Members of the Bona Fides civic movement although marginalized (Furniss & Gunner, 1995) mobilized themselves through their door-to-door campaigns to enact their democracy and their normative understanding of legality, legitimacy and orders of regulations (Monson, 2011, p. 173).

Democracy always remains in progress (Dahlgren, 2009) and most respondents felt that they had yet to graduate to meaningful citizenship (Nyamnjoh, 2006). This perception is proving to be dangerous in an already volatile area like Alexandra where micro-politics (Misago, 2011) are felt to be impeding development and are mobilized towards divergent ends. Poverty, defined as a lack of material resources, is connected to social exclusion and political exclusion as well (Zuern, 2011, p. 185). In principle, if these rights to housing and adequate service delivery are threatened by the state, citizens should be able (in principle) to mobilise themselves to defend their freedom (Nyamnjoh, 2006, p. 25).

The test of whether a society is successful has to be when ordinary citizens are capable of success through hard work alone and not through extraordinary gifts (Biko, 2013, p. 6). Many respondents lost family members in the struggle towards democracy and believe that they should be given their democratic material liberties first, as they fought for Alexandra and South Africa[58]. Alexandra's organic bona fides and *amagoduka* discourse throughout the townships history (Bonner & Nieftagodien, 2008), has been used to define the terms of belonging and the margins of exclusion. In 2008 during the xenophobic riots (Klaaren, 2011) and in 2013, it seems that resident's perceptions of the 'other' still fall on the residential axis of citizenship and substantive understanding of democracy – but ignore citizenry obligations to the nation-state.

[57] We are still waiting

[58] On the 23rd of Februar 2013, the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development paid Alexandra a visit as it was mandated to carry out the last TRC tier of rehabilitation in a campaign called 'Community Rehabilitation'. Twenty communities around the country which were active during the struggle against apartheid were selected to benefit from this development and the first eighteen included Alexandra which was allocated R26 – 30 million (fieldnotes, 23-02-13).

6. Chapter Six: Conclusion: *Kwashuba, kwabhalwa, kwaphola?*[59]

'We no longer shed any tears for Alexandra; we are tired because there is no improvement in this place' (Interview, 16-02-13)

The mediascape (Nyamnjoh, 2005) of the May 2008 xenophobic riots illustrated the media as important conduits for frustrations, anxieties, anger and peoples understanding of democracy. This thesis has illustrated how meaning was crafted, communicated and negotiated by the print and broadcast media and tenants of Alexandra as they made sense of the xenophobic riots. The thesis has been concerned with the mediation of the xenophobic riots and how meaning was negotiated and communicated by the media during the riots. Anthony Giddens in discussing democratic rights and obligations, argues that,

> Communication has a key role in public democracy, and that a good relationship is also one in which each party is equal and autonomous, in which issues are discussed rather than driven underground, and which are free from violence. If there is no space in a relationship where the parties can actually talk to one another, the relationship tends to become obsessive, or it sinks into some habitual structure. (Giddens,1998, p. 125)

One of the central themes to have emerged in the thesis was the negotiation of democracy in the: print, broadcast media and interviews of Alexandran residents. My study of mediated public spheres highlights and deconstructs how various tropes were used by isiZulu-language and English-language newspapers and television news reports in covering, commentating, conveying and narrating the May 2008 xenophobic riots. This was done by exploring national English-language papers and a small Alexandra community newspaper. Through a critical discourse analysis the study has deconstructed various subtleties in isiZulu-language and English-language print media, which contributed to the understanding of how meaning was made by these media.

The thesis examined articles of the media produced in a three week period of the May 2008 xenophobic riots. Through a critical discourse analysis, I examined one hundred and ninety seven articles of news collected from isiZulu-Language, English-Language print media and through a semiotic analysis I further analysed three television reports from English-language, broadcast media. Such a purposefully small but diverse cross-section of the media offers a new methodological lens to studying the May 2008 xenophobic riots as they were represented in the media. Through a critical discourse analysis, I further

[59] The situation gets tense, the situation gets written about, the situation subsides?

examined interviews conducted in Alexandra five years after the xenophobic riots and explored how residents who belong to the Bona Fides civic movement remembered the xenophobic riots.

The thesis adopted Folwer's 'whole-age' analysis (Fowler 1991) to explore how meaningful discourse (Hall 2012) was crafted in the news to lend and negotiate meaning to the May 2008 xenophobic riots. This approach has produced a nuance study which is framed by a theoretical lens which takes seriously media coverage on the xenophobic riots. Ultimately the thesis aimed to illustrate how words, ideas, and tropes circulate and can be mobilised during periods of tension, as meaning is created using public idioms. This has been achieved through a critical discourse analysis of divergent and multilingual print media, together with a semiotic analysis of English-Language broadcast media, these can tell us new things about how divergent Zulu-Language and English-Language media communicated and mediated the May 2008 xenophobic riots.

Through a necessarily limited but purposely multilingual sample of news, I explored and illustrated how multiple shifts in position led by editorials, political leaders and topological tensions were made as the riots unfolded. These shifts employed meaningful discourse in the form of; history, notions of rights, ethnicity and leadership, to craft meaning around the xenophobic riots.

The critical discourse analysis I have conducted on my selected multilingual data illustrates that news reports should not be accepted as the *pars pro toto* of particular events as they are only angles into a story, influenced by the editorial voice, political ideology and cultural proximity. Through small sample my thesis has broadened and deepened the social, political, and historical thrust of analyses which have allowed me to produce a study that has examined closely meaningful discourse in news in a more intrinsic way. This study is important because while there have been studies that examined the media coverage of the 2008 xenophobic riots (Eliseev 2008; Harber 2008; Gomo 2010 and Monson & Arian 2011) there was still a gap for a study which will examine a purposefully small multilingual cross-section of both print and broadcast media. By performing a critical discourse analysis and a semiotic analysis on the selected cross-section multilingual print and broadcast media, this study has done more than recreate the May 2008 xenophobic riots. It has uncovered how meaningful discourses were employed by the print and broadcast media as they communicated and mediated the riots.

The media during the xenophobic riots had two prime responsibilities: to report what was happening in communities but, to do so in a way which would not contribute unduly to the problem by internalising xenophobic language and uncritically mirroring xenophobic sentiments (Danso & McDonald, 2001, p. 117). *iSolezwe, iLanga, Alex News,* the *Daily Sun,* the *Mail and Guardian, Special Assignment* and *3rd Degree* all covered the xenophobic riots in divergent styles informed by the modalities of their specific

news genres. News is socially constructed. The events that were reported revealed the operation of complex and artificial set of selection criteria. For a newspaper to tell a 'true story' it must use idioms and spectrums of interests of a set of readers; this same set of conventions might seem banal or far removed from reality for another set of readers (Wasserman, 2010, p. xi). By examining initial positions (ambivalence, or condemning) of news reports and how over their coverage, their positions shifted (widening lens of understanding) influenced by political leaders and editorial voices. The thesis has illustrated the contextual meaning of these multiple shifts in positions as coverage of the xenophobic riots unfolded.

These shifts illustrated the meaningful discourses that were being used and offered as attempts to understand and craft meaning around the xenophobic riots by each newspaper. By examining news as a product I as a researcher employed a critical discourse analysis so as to decode the crafted meaningful discourse used in selected news reports. Decoding the crafted meaningful discourse required an understanding of texts and their multifaceted and contingent form, specific to each newspaper.

The thesis has adopted a definition of mediation as a 'process that connects and translates disparate worlds, people, imaginations, values, and ideas, whether in its symbolic, social, or technological form' (Meintjes, 2003, p. 8). ANC Secretary General Gwede Mantashe remarked that the riots were 'xenophobic in outlook, but in context were a mixture of many things' (*3rd Degree,* 20-05-08). The then Minister of Intelligence Ronnie Kasrils remarked that,

> The deepest causes of this violence [xenophobia] lie in the deep socio-economic challenges of our country and of the region. While poverty and deprivation continues to exist, tensions over scarce resources are bound to be ever present. (*Mail and Guardian,* May 23 – 29, p.11)

By analysing public idioms and the various tropes used to convey cultural proximity in the print and broadcast media, the thesis using Fowler's 'whole-age' theoretical analysis, fills the gap which exists in the current literature on the media coverage of the May 2008 xenophobic riots. Donald Donham argues that, 'even the most horrific acts of aggression do not stand as isolated exemplars of a 'thing' called violence but cast ripples that configure lives in the most dramatic of ways, affecting constructs of identity in the present, the hopes and the potentialities of the future, and even renditions of the past' (1994, p. 5). Through the Bona Fides interviews it is evident that the members were frustrated by 'symbolic government' – government by narratives (Ranchod, 2013). Such a situation has led to the

'fragmentation of ontological security' (Giddens, 1991) as these tenants found themselves trapped in a 'transitional-fissure' between the old RDP, newer GEAR economic policy and being marginalized by the ARP project. These tenants are still expecting the promised dividends of democracy which were promised to them by the Reconstruction Development Programme, whilst the ARP 'rent-to-buy' housing programme sidelines the unemployed and aged. These lived experiences of marginalised individuals examined through the broadcast media and the testimonials of members belonging to the Bona Fides illustrate how people understand democracy, ideas of belonging and from their marginality (Gunner & Furniss, 1995) enacted their citizenship.

ISolezwe and *iLanga* both invoked the historical debt that South Africa owed its neighbouring states as a way to see, understand and possibly remedy future xenophobic sentiments. The trope of a common history and shared memory of the past is pertinent in the construction of a nation-state and notions of citizenship. This theme of history was crucial to *iLanga's* coverage as it drew from two distinct archival repositories: armed struggle history and Zulu cultural history. Both the isiZulu-language newspapers were very measured, phatic and considered. The isiZulu-language newspapers until now have not been examined and studied in relation to their coverage of the May 2008 xenophobic riots. Their narrative substance, many shifts and emphases, and cultural function, as shown in this thesis illustrates a broad range of metadiscursive practices, as narratives constitute powerful means of shaping social interactions and guiding understanding.

Through a critical discourse analysis I have illustrated that the three contrasting English-language newspapers provided divergent narratives of the xenophobic riots guided by their journalistic modalities. Each newspaper, although written in English, was limited by its journalistic modality. *Alex News* a community newspaper was engrossed in residents' sentiments and mirrored their frustrations and aired inflammatory statements, uncritically and with impartiality. The *Daily Sun* provided coverage which engaged its reader's everyday politics which related to their daily lives, but was critical. The *Daily Sun's* coverage was characterised by shifts, broadening its scope and widening its narrative, with its editorials, letters and eventually its news reports as well. The *Mail & Guardian* with its reputation as being an investigative newspaper, faced pressure to provide authoritative readings of the cases of the violence, if not recommendations for its cure. The *Mail & Guardian* did not exhibit any shifts but provided its readers with a measured and crafted narrative, guided by its reader's preference for investigative news.

The two SABC *Special Assignment* news episodes captured, commented on and bore witness to the xenophobic riots in a similar manner and focused their attention on grass-root sentiments and

broadened the debate by including ordinary people's voices in the public sphere. The two SABC news episodes together offered a framed depiction, by including the aftermath of the attacks and the lived experience of labour migration patterns and its wider implications in South Africa and Mozambique. The eTV *3rd Degree* report had a top-down 'staged' quality to it, strictly guarding the entry to the public sphere and marginalised the voices of ordinary people. Both the television reports' interviewees sidestepped key issues relating to the xenophobic riots and instead engaged in political ideology, ideals of pan-Africanism and in doing so, highlighted political factionalism and ambiguities over seats of power in 2008. Both the *Special Assignment* and the *3rd Degree* news reports treated popular politics of resistance with deafening silence. What the news reports chose to omit from their commentary offered a means of communication, as political songs act with social function (Finnegan, 1970, p. 284). The broadcast media treated the songs in an elliptical manner, sidestepping their loaded meaning and importance in the South African political sphere. Through a semiotic analysis I foregrounded the metadiscursive (Briggs 1996) currency of the songs and through a textual analysis the decontextualized and recontextualized historical residue of the songs sung by the rioters.

The Bona Fides civic movement can be read as a vehicle of negotiating and understanding democracy, as its members yearned to graduate to meaningful democratic citizenship. Moreover, they engage in campaigns of action as they enacted their citizenship. Their campaigns of action involved levels of departure from the state-sanctioned social order as well as various degrees of trespassing into state jurisdiction as they enacted their normative understanding of legality, legitimacy and orders of regulations (Monson, 2011, p. 173). The discourse of insiders and outsiders was explored as an artificial and strategic set of criterions for political, social and material exclusion. The Latin term Bona Fide has been used by various groups in Alexandra's history, each claiming to belong more than other groups. Through an analysis of the media, it was clear that during the 2008 xenophobic riots, autochthony and narrow nationalistic claims of belonging were at play.

Through the critical discourse analysis and semiotic analysis performed on the collated data it is apparent that a common theme which runs through the selected sample is the negotiation of democracy by various people. In the Zulu-Language newspapers, especially *iLanga* we see the editorial negotiating cultural inclusion but slightly advocating for economic exclusion. In the English-Language newspapers, we see similar threads of narrow nationalistic understandings of democracy communicated by community members. In the broadcast media (e.g. *Special Assignment,* 20-05-08) we see foreign nationals advocating that 'a person must have a good life', whilst we see Bona Fides members stating that, '…we want our rights, our rights to live well' (fieldnotes, 02-02.08). In a liberal model of democracy, the state exists to protect the freedom of citizens, allowing them to pursue their own lives and happiness

without causing injury to others (Dahlgren, 2009, p. 65). The studied data provides complex layers of South Africans, foreign nationals, organisations and the government's understanding and negotiation of democracy. Each of these groups can be seen as foregrounding their desire to live well; but frustrations were forcing others to forcefully foreground narrow nationalistic perceptions of South Africa's democracy with much pivoting on the expected material dividends of democracy.

The selected sample is too small to make any definitive claims, but the critical discourse analysis used in this body of work illustrates the complex nature of news production informed by numerous political and socio-economic factors. The thesis has proffered a way in which a fragmented and multilingual space can be studied using Fowler's (1991) whole-age analysis. Such a contingent theoretical and methodological approach has illustrated how a small sample of isiZulu-language and English-language print and broadcast media and the testimonial of members of the Bona Fides (five years after the xenophobic riots) understood the violence and crafted various meaning around the 2008 xenophobic riots.

In true form research is an approximation and can never stand as a gestalt account. This body of work which I have produced is limited purposely to a small sample of multilingual news. But it illustrates how national media and community media conveyed the riots as they unfolded. Moreover, the importance of South Africa's history which has currency in providing meaning as it is a rich reservoir which many South Africans understand and relate to. A pan-African trope emanating from a Zulu Diaspora narrative was used by intellectuals and politicians as they attempted to hold together national interests, but an economic exclusionary undercurrent fragmented this benevolent attempt at a multilateral account. Ordinary voices captured in the print and broadcast media poured scorn on the attempted benevolent multilateral account and demanded decisive actions to fulfil narrow nation-building, pivoting on national self interests.

Through the empirical data studied and by using theories on media and a critical discourse and semiotic analysis, the thesis has contributed a nuanced study which examines broad ranging data on the xenophobic riots and how meaning around the May 2008 xenophobic riots was crafted by the selected media sample. Ultimately the study has illustrated how disgruntled and marginalized citizens reacted to distant leadership and mobilised themselves to act, with devastating results.

7. Bibliography

Bahktin, M.M. Emerson. C & Holquist, M. (eds) 1999, Speech Genres and Other Late Essays, trans. V. Mcgee. Austin, TX/London: University of Texas Press

Banks, L.J. 2011, Home Spaces, Street Styles, Contesting Power and Identity in A South African City. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Barber, K. 2007, The Anthropology of Texts, Persons and Publics, Oral and written culture in African and beyond. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Barber, K. & Farias, P.F.M. (eds), 1989, Discourse and its Disguises, The Interpretation of African Oral Texts. Birmingham University African Studies Series no. 1 Centre for West African Studies

Barker, H & Burrow, S. 2002, Press, Politics and the Public Sphere in Europe and North America. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Bauman, R & Briggs, C. 1990, Poetics and Performance as Critical Perspectives on Language on Social Life. Annual Review Anthropology, pp. 59 - 88

Beinart, W and Dawson, M.C. (eds), 2010, Popular Politics and Resistance Movements in South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Bhabha H. & Sardar, Z. 2008, Fanon, Black Skin, White Masks. London: Plato Press

Biko, H. 2013, The Great African Society, A Plan for a Nation Gone Astray. Johannesburg: Jonathan Ball Publishers

Blommaert, J and Verschueren, J. 1998, 'The Role of Language in European Nationalist Ideologies', in B.B. Schieffelin, K.A. Woolard & P.V. Kroskrity (eds), Language Ideologies, Practice and Theory. Oxford: Oxford University Press pp. 189 - 210

Bonner, P and Nieftagodien, N. 2008, Alexandra, A History. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Bonner, P and Ndima, V. 2009, The Roots of Violence and Martial Zuluness on the East Rand, in B. Carton, J. Laband and J. Sithole (eds), Zulu Identities, Being Zulu, Past and Present. Pietermaritzburg: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press pp. 363 - 382

Bourdieu, P. 2012, 'On Television', in M. G. Durham & D. M. Kellner (eds), Media and Cultural Studies Keyworks. Second Edition, Malden: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing

Boyd, A. Steward, P & Alexander, R. 2008, Broadcast Journalism, Techniques of Radio and Television News. Sixth Edition, Burlington: Focus Press

Bozzoli, B. 2004, Theatres of Struggle and the End of Apartheid. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Brennies, D. 1996, 'Telling Troubles: *Narratives, Conflict and Experience'*, in C.L. Briggs (ed), Disorderly Discourse, Narrative, Conflict, and Inequality. Oxford: Oxford University Press pp. 27 - 70

Briggs, C.L. (ed), 1996, Disorderly Discourse, Narrative, Conflict, and Inequality. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Brinkel. T. 2006, Nation Building and Pluralism: Experiences and Perspectives in State and Society in South Africa. Netherlands: Pub. Du Uitgevers

Buur, L. Jensen, S. & Stepputat, F. (eds), 2007, The Security – Development Nexus, Expressions of Sovereignty and Securitization in South Africa. Pretoria: HSRC Press

Caldwell, M. 2011, 'Between Proceduralism and Substantialism in Communication ethics', in N. Hyde-Clarke (ed), Communication and Media Ethics in South Africa. Cape Town: Juta and Company Ltd pp. 58 - 72

Citizenship, Violence and Xenophobia in South Africa: Perceptions from South African Communities, Democracy and Governance Programme with the Human Sciences Research Council. June 2008

Chipkin, I. 2007, Do South Africans Exist? Nationalism, Democracy and the Identity of 'the people'. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Cohen, S and Young, J. (eds), 1973, The Manufacture of News, Deviance Social Problems and the Mass Media. Great Britain: Pub. Constable and Co Ltd

Cohen, S. 1995, Sounding Out the City: Music and the Sensuous Production of Place, Transaction of the Institute of British Geographers. New Series, 20(4), pp. 434 - 446

Comaroff, J & Roberts, S. 1981, Rules and Processes: The Cultural Logics of Dispute in an African Context. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Coplan, D. B. 2009, Innocent Violence: Social Exclusion, Identity, and The Press in an African Democracy. Identities, 16(3), pp. 367 - 389

Cottle, S & Rai, M. 2008, Television News in South Africa: Mediating an Emerging Democracy. Journal of Southern African Studies, Vo. 33, No. 2, pp. 343 - 358

Crush, J. 1998, Fortress South Africa and the deconstruction of Apartheid's migration regime. Pergamon, pp. 1 - 11

Dahlgren, P. 2009, Media and Political Engagement: Citizens, Communication, and Democracy. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Danso, R & McDonald, D. 2001, Writing Xenophobia: Immigration and the Print Media in Post-apartheid South Africa. Africa Today, 48(3), pp. 114 - 137

Dentith, S. 1995, An introductory reader: Bakhtinian Thought. London & New York: Routledge

Distiller, N. 2012, Shakespeare and the Coconuts, On post-apartheid South African Culture. Johannesburg: WITS University Press

Dlamini, J. 2009, Native Nostalgia. Johannesburg: Jacana Media

Donald, L. D. 2011, Violence in a time of liberation, Murder and Ethnicity at a South African Gold Mine, 1994. Duke: Duke University Press

Duncan, J. 2010, Thabo Mbeki and Dissent, in Glaser, D, Mbeki and After; Reflections on the Legacy of Thabo Mbeki. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 105 - 127

Elliot, S. 1999, Carnival and Dialogue in Bakhtin's Poetics of Folklore. Folklore Forum 30, 1(2), pp. 129 - 139

Eliseev, A. 2008, 'A Torn Narrative of Violence', in S. Hassim, T. Kupe & E. Worby (eds) Go Home or Die Here, *Violence,* Xenophobia and the Reinvention of Difference in South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 27 - 39

Ellis, J. 2002, Seeing Things, Television in the Age of Uncertainty. London: I.B. Tauris Publishers

Email conversation with Monako Dibetle (former *Mail & Guardian* journalist), 19 November 2012

eTV *3rd Degree, 'Under Attack'* Patta, D, 20 May 2008

Finnegan, R. 2007, The Oral and Beyond: Doing Things with Words in Africa. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Finnegan, R. 1970, Oral Literature in Africa. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Fiske, J. & Hartley, J. 1996, Reading Television. Second Edition, London: Pub. Routledge

Fourie, P.J. 2011, 'Normative Media Theory in a Changing Media Landscape and Globalised Society', in N. Hyde-Clarke (ed), Communication and Media Ethics in South Africa. Cape Town: Juta and Company Ltd pp. 25 - 45

Fowler, R. 1991, Language in the News: Discourse and ideology in the Press. London: Routledge

Furniss, G. & Gunner, L. (eds), 1995, Power, Marginality and African Oral Literature. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Galtung, J & Ruge, M. 1973, 'Structuring the Selecting of News' in S. Cohen and J. Young (eds), The Manufacture of News, Deviance Social Problems and the Mass Media. Great Britain: Pub. Constable and Co Ltd pp. 62 - 72

Geschiere, P. 2009, The Perils of Belonging, Autochthony, Citizenship, and Exclusion in Africa and Europe. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Gevisser, M. 2010, Why is Thabo Mbeki a 'Nightmare'? in D. Glaser, Mbeki and After; Reflections on the Legacy of Thabo Mbeki. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 51 - 68

Giddens, A & Pierson, C. 1998, Conversations with Anthony Giddens, Making Sense of Modernity. Stanford: Stanford University Press

Giddens, A. 1991, Modernity and Self-Identity and Society in the Late Modern age. Stanford: Stanford University Press

Glaser, D. (ed), 2010, Mbeki and After, Reflections on the Legacy of Thabo Mbeki. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Gomo, T. 2010, Analysis of Media Reporting and Xenophobia Violence Among Youth in South Africa, International Masters in Communication for Development Programme at Malmo University (Sweden) School of Arts and Communication

Gray, A. 2004, The Liberation Songs: An Important Voice of Black South African's from 1912 – 1994, Journal of Education. No. 33, pp. 85 – 102

Gumede, W. 2012, Restless Nation, Making Sense of Troubled Times. Cape Town: Tafelberg

Gunner, L. 2009, Jacob Zuma, The Social Body and the Unruly Power of Song. African Affairs, Vol. 108, Issue 430, pp. 27 - 48

Gunner, L. (ed), 1994, Politics and Performance, Theatre, Poetry and Song in Southern Africa. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press

Gunter, B. 2000, Media Research Methods: Measuring Audiences, Reactions and Impacts. United Kingdom: Sage Publications

Hadland, A. (ed), 2008, Violence and Xenophobia in South Africa: *Developing Consensus, Moving to Action,* A Partnership between the Human Research Council (HSRC) and the High Commission of the United Kingdom

Hall, S. 2012, 'Encoding/Decoding', in M. G. Durham & D. M. Kellner (eds), Media and Cultural Studies Keyworks. Second Edition, Malden: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing

Hall, S. 1973, 'The Determinations of News Photographs', in Cohen, S and Young, J. (ed), The Manufacture of News, Deviance Social Problems and the Mass Media. Great Britain: Pub. Constable and Co Ltd pp. 176 – 190

Hanks W.F. 1989, Text and Textuality. Annual Review of Anthropology, Vol. 18, pp. 95 -127

Harber, A. 2008, 'Two Newspapers, Two Nations? The Media and the Xenophobic Violence', in S. Hassim, T. Kupe & E. Worby (eds), Go Home or Die Here, Violence, Xenophobia and the Reinvention of Difference in South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 161 - 173

Hartley, L.P. 1953, The Go-Between. London: Pub. Heinemann Educational Books Ltd

Harvey, E. 2012, Kgalema Motlanthe, A Political Biography. Johannesburg: Jacana Media

Hassim, S, Kupe, T & Worby, E. (eds), 2008, 'Introduction' in Go Home or Die Here, Violence, Xenophobia and the Reinvention of Difference in South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Hitzler, R & Eberle, T. 2004, Phenomenological Life-World Analysis, in Flick, U, Kardorff, E & Steinke, I (eds), A Companion to Qualitative Research. London: Sage Publications

Hughes, H. 2010, First President, A Life of John L. Dube, Founding President of the ANC. Johannesburg: Jacana Media

Human Sciences Research Council, 2008, Citizenship, Violence and Xenophobia in South Africa: Perceptions from South African Communities. Democracy and Governance Programme

Jasper, J. M. 1998, The Emotions of Protest: Affective and Reactive Emotions in and around Social Movements. Sociological Forum, 13(3), pp. 397 - 424

Jasper, J. M. 1997, The Art of Moral Protest. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Jones, M & Dlamini, J. (eds) 2013, Categories of Persons, Rethinking Ourselves and Others. Johannesburg: Picador Africa

Katzenellenbogen, S.E. 1982, South African and Southern Mozambique, Labour, Railways, and Trade in the Making of a Relationship. Manchester: Manchester University Press

Kaptejns, L & Richters, A. (eds), 2010, Mediations of Violence in Africa, Fashioning New Futures from Contested Past. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Kelly, K. 1999, Calling it a day: Reaching conclusions in qualitative research, in M.J. TerreBlanche and K. Durrheim (eds), Research in Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Sciences. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press pg. 370 - 390

Kassovitz, M (director), *La Haine*, May 1995

Klaaren, J. 2011, 'Citizenship, Xenophobic Violence, and Law's Dark Side', in L. Landau (ed), Exorcising the Demons Within, *Xenophobia,* Violence and Statecraft in Contemporary South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 135 - 149

Kynoch, G. 2013, Reassessing Transition Violence: Voices from South Africa's Township War, 1990 – 1994. African Affairs, 112(447), pp. 283 - 303

Landau, L. 2011, 'Introducing the Demons', in L. Landau (ed), Exorcising the Demons Within, Xenophobia, Violence and Statecraft in Contemporary South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 1 - 25

Landau, L. 2010, Loving the Alien? Citizenship, Law and the Future in South Africa's Demonic Society. African Affairs, 109(4435), pp. 213 - 230

Limb, P. (ed), 2012, The People's Paper, A Centenary History and Anthology of Abantu-Batho. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Masilela, N. 2011, The Transmission Lines of the New African Movement, in X. Mangcu, Becoming Worthy Ancestors, Archives, Public Deliberation and Identity in South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 17 - 45

Mathonsi, N & Mazibuko, G. 2011, New Beginnings in Zulu Literature. Current Writing, 21(1&2), pp. 303 - 319

Marshall-Fratani, R. 2006, The War of 'Who is Who': Autochthony, Nationalism, and Citizenship in the Ivoirian Crisis. African Studies Review, 49(2), pp. 9 - 43

Mayring, P. 2004, 'Qualitative Content Analysis' in Flick, B. von Kardorff, E. & Steinke, I, (ed) A Companion to Qualitative Research. London: Pub. Sage Publications

McDonald, D & Jacobs, S. 2005, (Re)writing Xenophobia: Understanding Press Coverage of Cross-Border Migration in Southern Africa. Journal of Contemporary African Studies, 23(2), pp. 295 - 325

McLennan, A. 2009, The Delivery Paradox, in A. McLennan & B. Munslow, The Politics of Service Delivery. The Wits P&DM Governance Series, Johannesburg: Wits University Press. pp. 19 - 42

Meintjes, L. 2003, Sound of Africa! Making music Zulu in a South African Studio. Duke: Duke University Press

Misago, J.P. 2011, 'Disorder in a Changing Society: Authority and the Micro-Politics of Violence', in L. Landau (ed), Exorcising the Demons Within, *Xenophobia,* Violence and Statecraft in Contemporary South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Misago, J.P, Landau, L & Monson, T. 2009, Towards Tolerance, Law and Dignity: Addressing Violence Against Foreign Nationals in South Africa, Research Conducted for the International Organization for Migration by the Force Migration Studies Programme of the University of the Witwatersrand

Moerman, M. 1988, Talking Culture: Ethnography and Conversation Analysis. Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press

Mokoena, H. 2011, Magema Fuze, The Making of a Kholwa Intellectual. Pietermaritzburg: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press

Monson, T & Arian. R. 2011, 'Media Memory: A Critical Reconstruction of the May 2008 Violence', in L. Landau (ed), Exorcising the Demons Within, Xenophobia, Violence and Statecraft in Contemporary South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 26 - 55

Monson, T. 2011, 'Making the Law, Breaking the Law, Taking the Law into our Own-Hands: Sovereignty and Territorial Control in Three South African Settlements', in L. Landau (ed), Exorcising the Demons Within, Xenophobia, Violence and Statecraft in Contemporary South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 172 - 199

Mwangi, S. 2007, The Impact of Commercialism of the Media on the Content of the Conglomerate-Owned Community Newspapers in South Africa: A Study of Four Community Newspapers From the Caxton CTP Publishers Stable, Master of Arts at the University of the Witwatersrand

Negus, K. & Velázquez, P. R. 2002, Belonging and detachment: Musical Experience and the limits of Identity. Elsevier Poetics 30, pp. 185 - 193

Neocosmos,M. 2006, From 'Foreign Natives' to 'Native Foreigners', Explaining Xenophobia in Post-aparthied South Africa, Citizenship and Nationalism, Identity and Politics. Dakar: Pub. CODESRIA

Neuendorf, K. A. 2002, The Content Analysis Guidebook. London: Sage Publications

Nieftagodien, N. 2008, 'Xenophobia in Alexandra', in S. Hassim, T. Kupe & E. Worby (eds) Go Home or Die Here, Violence, Xenophobia and the Reinvention of Difference in South Africa. Johannesburg: Wits University Press pp. 65 - 77

Ndlovu, M. 2011, The Meaning of Post-apartheid Zulu Media. Communicatio, 37(2), pp. 268 - 292

Nyamnjoh, F.B. 2006, Insiders and Outsiders, Citizenship and Xenophobia in Contemporary Southern Africa. Pretoria: University of South Africa Press

Nyamnjo, F.B. 2005, Africa's Media, Democracy and the Politics of Belonging. Pretoria: UNISA Press

Nyembezi, C.L.S & Nxumalo, O.E.H.M. 1966, Inqolobane Yesizwe. Pietermaritzburg: Shuter and Shooter

Omer-Cooper J.D. 1973, The Zulu Aftermath; A Nineteenth Century Revolution in Bantu Africa. Evanston: Northwestern University Press

Parkin, D. 1984, Political Language. Annual Review of Anthropology, Vol. 13, pp. 345 - 365

Paula, S. 2003, Doing Research in Cultural Studies, An Introduction to Classical and New Methodological Approaches. London: Sage Publications, 2003

Peberdy,S. 2009, Selecting Immigrants, National Identity and South Africa's Immigration Policies 1910-2008. Johannesburg: Wits University Press

Peterson, B. 2006, The Bantu World and the World of the Book: Reading, Writing, and "Enlightenment", in K, Barber (ed), 2006, Africa's Hidden Histories: Everyday Literacy and the Making the Self. Bloomington: Indiana Unversity Press pp. 236 - 257

Ranchod, R. 2013, A Kind of Magic, The Political Marketing of the ANC. Johannesburg: Jacana Media

Rapola, Z. 2007, Beginnings of a Dream. Johannesburg: Jacana Media

Rapoport, A. 1969, 'A System-Theoretic View of Content Analysis', in G. Gerbner, O. Holsti, K. Krippendorf, W. Paisley and P. Stone (eds), Content Analysis. New York: Wiley pp. 17 - 38

SABC *Special Assignment,* '*Hambani Makwerekwere*', Wales-Smith, S, 20 May 2008

SABC *Special Assignment,* '*Ashes to Ashes*', Wales-Smith, S, 01 July 2008

Schumann, A. 2012, Songs of a New era: Popular Music and Political Expression in the Ivorian Crisis. African Affairs, 112(448), pp. 440 - 459

Sichone, O. 2008, Xenophobia, in N, Shepherd & S, Robins (eds) New South African Keywords. Johannesburg: Jacana Media pp. 255 - 263

Silverman, D. and Marvasti, A. 2008, Doing Qualitative Research, A Comprehensive Guide. London: Sage Publications

Sinwell, L. 2009, Participatory Spaces and The Alexandra Vukuzenzele Crisis Committee (AVCC): Reshaping Government Plans. Social Dynamics, 35(2), pp. 436 - 449

Sitas, A. 2008, The Road to Polokwane? Politics and Populism in KwaZulu-Natal. Transformation 68, pp. 87 - 98

Smith, M. J. 2012, 'The Media's Coverage of Xenophobia and the Xenophobia Violence Prior to and Including 2008, South African Civil Society and Xenophobia Synthesis Report from Strategy and Tactics' accessed, August 10, 2012,
http://www.gcro.ac.za/sites/default/files/News_items/Xeno_reports_July2010/synthesis/7_Media.pdf

Southall, R. 2012, The ANC: Party Vanguard of the Black Middle Class? In A. Lissoni, J. Soske, N. Erlank, N. Nieftagodien & O. Badsha (eds) One Hundred Years of the ANC, Debating liberation Histories Today. Johannesburg: WITS University Press, pp. 325 - 346

Sparks, C. 2007, 'The Global, The Local and the Public Sphere', in Allen, R. C. & Hill, A, (eds), The Television Studies Reader. London: Routledge Publishers pp. 139 - 150

Steinberg, J. 2012, Security and Disappointment, Policing, Freedom and Xenophobia in South Africa. British Journal of Criminology, 52, pp. 345 - 360

Tafira, K. M. 2009, Black Racism in Alexandra: *Cross* – Border Love Relationships and Negotiation of Difference in a Post Apartheid South African Society, Wits Master of Arts Degree in Anthropology Thesis

Tafira, K. 2011, Is Xenophobia Racism? Anthropology Southern Africa, 34 (3&4) pp. 114 - 121

Tomaselli, K .G. 2011, '(Afri)ethics, communitarianism and the public sphere', in N. Hyde-Clarke (ed), Communication and Media Ethics in South Africa. Cape Town: Juta and Company Ltd pp. 76 - 94

Tomaselli K, Tomaselli R. & Muller J. 1987, Addressing the nation, Narrating the Crisis: Hegemony and the South African Press. Johannesburg: Richard Lyon and Co.

Tsingo, M. 2009, The Impact of Commercialism on Community: A Case Study of Coverage of the Alex Renewal Projects by two Commercially-Owned Community Newspapers, Master of Arts at the University of the Witwatersrand

Triadafiloulos, T. 1999, Politics, Speech, and the Art of Persuasion: Towards an Aristotelian Conception of the Public Sphere. The Journal of Politics, Vol. 61, No. 3, pp. 741 - 757

Twala, C. 2010, Jacob Zuma's "Zuluness" Appeal During the April 2009 Elections in South Africa: An Attempt to Break the IFPs grip on Zulu Social and Political Structures? Journal of Contemporary History, Vol. 35, No. 2, pp. 66 - 83

Vainiomäki, T. 2004, Silence as Cultural Sigh. Semiotica, 150 – ¼, pp. 347 - 361

Vološinov, V.N, trans. Matejka, L & Titunik, I.R, 1986, Marxism and the Philosophy of Language. Cambridge: Harvard University Press

Wa Kabwe-Segatti, A. 2008, 'Reforming South African Immigration in the post-apartheid period (1990-2006): What it means and what it takes', in A. Wa Kabwe-Segatti & L. Landau (eds), Migration in post-apartheid South Africa: Challenges and questions to policy-makers, Agence Francaise de Developpement pp. 55 - 105

Wasserman, H. (ed), 2011, Popular Media, Democracy and Development in Africa. London: Routledge Publishers

Wasserman, H. 2010, Tabloid Journalism in South Africa, *True Story!* Bloomington: Indiana University Press

Wasserman, H. 2011 'Whose Ethics are they, Anyway?', in Hyde-Clarke, N. (ed), Communication and Media Ethics in South Africa. Cape Town: Juta and Company Ltd pp. 9 - 23

White, H. 2012, A Post-Fordist Ethnicity: Insecurity, Authority, and Identity in South Africa. Anthropology Quarterly, 85(2), pp. 397 - 427

Xeketwane, B. 1995, The Relation Between Hostels and he Political Violence on the Reef from July 1990 to December 1993: A Case Study Of Merafe and Meadowlands Hostels in Soweto, Master of Arts Degree at the University of the Witwatersrand

Zakes, M. 1995, Ways of Dying. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Zelizer, B. 2010, About to Die, How News Images Move the Public. Oxford: Pub. Oxford University Press

Zuern, E. 2011, The Politics of Necessity, Community Organizing and Democracy in South Africa. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press

http://www.citypress.co.za/news/mail-guardian-reveals-new-editors accessed on the 26th August 2013

http://radiobiz.co.za/2013/03/09/isolezwe-selling-694913-copies accessed 20 March 2013

http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/daily-sun-founder-dies accessed on the 9th of June 2013

http://www.ilanganews.co.za/statistics accessed 28 March 2013

http://www.looklocal.co.za/looklocal/content/en/north-east-joburg accessed 23 June 2013

http://mg.co.za/print/2008-05-30-daily-sun-in-hot-water-over-war-on-aliens accessed on the 14th of June 2013

http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com/index.php?option=com_con accessed on the 17th of May 2013

http://www.media24.com/en/newspaper/emerging-martket accessed on the 11th of June 2013

http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com accessed on the 15 June 2013

http://www.mg.co.za/article/2012-03-09-defies-downward-circulation accessed 15 June 2013

Newspaper sources and interviews

iSolezwe

Ayixoxwe inzondo yobuzwe, May 15, 2004, p. 10

i- SACP igxeka ukuhlaselwa kwabokufika, May 15, 2008, p. 16

Front-cover images by Ziphozonike Lushaba, May 16, 2008

Ningadluliseli ukuxakeka kwabokufika, May 16, 2008, p. 8

Kufe abanye odlameni lokucwaswa, May 19, 2008, p. 8

Front-cover images by Chris Collinridge, May 20, 2008

Batinyela uhulumeni ngodlame, May 20, 2008, p. 5

Ngobani ubulwane obungaka? May 20, 2008, p. 8

Kuhlukunyezwe abokufika eThekwini, May 21, 2008, p. 3

Front-cover images by Patrick Mtolo, May 22, 2008

Bagxeka udlame kwabokufika eKZN, May 22, 2008, p. 3

Front-cover images by Patrick Mtolo, May 23, 2008

Abafundi bagxeka isihluki kwabokufika, May 23, 2008, p. 11

Kungcono ngiyofela ekhaya, May 23, 2008, p. 2

Sicela uMbeki asiphindisele emakhaya, May 23, 2008, p. 3

Front-cover images by Antoine De Ras, May 26, 2008

uMbeki ubhobokile ngodlame kuleli, May 26, 2008, p. 3

uWinnie ukhoselise izihambi emzini wakhe, May 29, 2008, p. 8

uSizi kuthunwa owathungelwa ngomililo, June 3, 2008, p. 6

Sisazibhekela isihambi: uHulumeni, June 3, 2008, p. 6

Images, June 6, 2008, p. 10

iLanga

William Phungula*, i- IFP ikhala ngokunukwa yi-ANC ngodlame lwase-Alexandra,* May 19 – 21, 2008, p. 3

OEHM Nxumalo, *Ukuqhubukusha abantu bokufika,* May 26 – 28, 2008, p. 5

OEHM Nxumalo, *Ukuqhubukusha abantu bokufika (iSigba sesibili)*, June 9 – 11, 2008, p. 5

Thulani Ronald Khezwa, *Lolu dlame oluqondiswe kwabokufika lubi, luyenyanyeka,* June 9 – 11, 2008, p. 4

Alex News

Sipho Siso, *Zuma Helps Alexandra Owners,* 8 February, 2013, p. 2

Sipho Siso, *New Summit Dates Announced*, April 10 – 23, 2008, p. 1

Sipho Siso, *'Hotheads' evacuated from illegal rank*, April 10 – 23, 2008. p. 2

Nie Cele, *Refuse Collection tariff hits the roof*, April 10 – 23, 2008, p. 3

Sipho Siso, *ARPs Billions aim to get rid of this!* April 22 – May 1, 2008, p. 1

Sipho Siso, *ARPs billions for Alex Renewal*, April 22 – May 1, 2008, p. 2

Sipho Siso, *Alpoa and ARP to Tug it out in Court*, April 22 – May 1, 2008, p. 11

Sandy Sher, *Rising Tensions between rival taxi associations*, February 21 – March 12, 2008, p. 2

Sipho Siso, *Exposed*, June 12 – 25, 2008, p. 1

Sipho Siso, *Police deny 'blessing' the attacks*, June 12 – 25, 2008, p. 1

Sipho Siso, *I did not provoke the xenophobic attacks*, June 12 – 25, 2008, p. 2

Sipho Siso, *Stop these malicious rumours against me, pleads Archbishop*, June 12 – 25, 2008, p. 2

AlexNews, Alex SACP condemns the xenophobic war, June 12 – 25, 2008, p. 2

Sipho Siso, *Foreigners warned: Return at own Peril*, June 26 – July 9, 2008, p. 1

Sipho Siso, *RCA mob gears for returning aliens,* June 26 – July 9, 2008, p. 2

Photograph by Dimakatso Maroleni, *Saying no to xenophobia*, June 26 – July 9, 2008, p. 2

Pat Fana, *We are ashamed of the immigrant's attacks*, June 26 – July 9, 2008, p. 2

Dimakatso Maroleni, *Alex March*, June 26 – July 9, p. 2

Ramathwala, *Violence leaves taxis damaged*, March 13 – 26, 2008, p. 3

Dimakatso Maroleni and Sipho Siso, *Route disputes turn violence*, March 13 – 26, 2008, p. 4

Sipho Siso, *Summit Canned*, March 13 – 26, 2008, p. 1

Sipho Siso, *Xenophobic Alex*, May 15 – 28, 2008, p. 1

Dimakatso Maroleni*, Touched,* May 29 – June 11, 2008, p.1

Sipho Siso, *Put them in camps as well*, May 29 – June 11, 2008, p. 2

AlexNews, Attacks were not caused by xenophobia but poor service delivery, May 29 – June 11, 2008, p. 2

George Starita, *Love thy neighbour*, May 29 – June 11, 2008, p. 4

Cllr Carol Blaymire, *Situation in Alex is very tense*, May 29 – June 11, 2008, p. 4

Solly Nkhi, *Who's next for xenophobic attacks?* May 29 – June 11, 2008, p. 4

David Quail, *Ubuntu not enough to stop the fights*, May 29 – June 11, 2008, p. 4

The Daily Sun

Front-cover, *Aliens: The Truth!* 15 May, 2008, p.1

Photograph by Sipho Mchunu, *Flames of Fury!* 15 May, 2008, p. 1

Rifumo Maluleke, *Angry Crowd Attacks,* 15 May, 2008, p. 2

Ntebatse Masipa, *When Love Turns to Hate!* 19 May 2008, p. 1

Photograph by Sipho Mchunu, *Helicopter Chases warring Crowds!* 20 May, 2008, p.1

Rifumo Maluleke, *Fleeing the might Wind,* 20 May, 2008, p.1

Photograph by Samson Ratswana, *Goodbye Mzansi,* 20 May 2008, p. 2

Bridget Masango, Sipho Kekana & Kola Alli, *500 Fearful Mozambicans pack up and go…*20 May, 2008, p. 2

Photo-journalistic spread by Jan Right, Lucky Morajane, Samson Ratswana & Sipho Mchunu, *Battlegrounds: Images of War in the Streets!* 20 May, 2008, p. 4 – 5

Daily Sun, letters by readers, 20 May, 2008, p. 31

Savious Kwinika & Kola Alli, *Aliens run for their lives!* 21 May, 2008, p. 1 & 2

Monde Dlakavu, Peter Luhanga & Brenda Nkuna, *Aliens told: Stay Calm!* 21 May 2008, p. 1

Sebabatso Mosamo & Mzi Gumede, *It's not me, insists IFP Official,* 21 May 2008, p. 2

Daily Sun, letters by readers, 21 May, 2008, p. 31

Rifumo Makuleke, Sipho Kekana, Africa Ka Mahamba & Aens, *Cops black violence on thugs,* 22 May, 2008, p. 2

Daily Sun, letters by readers, 22 May, 2008, p. 31

Photograph by Sipho Mchunu, *Lets Go home and Beat Mugabe!* 23 May, 2008, p. 1

Ramosidi Matekane, *Army: We're here to help!* 23 May, 2008, p. 1

Rifumo Maluleke, *Happy to go home!* 23 May, 2008, p. 2

Ntomboxolo Makoba, *Attacks on Somalis not xenophobic,* 23 May, 2008, p. 2

Photograph by Jan Right, *Army chopper keeps watch!* 23 May, 2008, p. 2

Daily Sun, Hate Begins to Spread, 23 May, 2008, p. 3

Ramosidi Matekane, *Zuma says yes to army,*23 May, 2008, p. 4

Monde Dlakavu, *Committee to deal with xenophobia,* 23 May, 2008, p. 11

Africa Day Advertisement, *Our Struggle Knows no Borders,* 23 May, 2008, p. 32

Daily Sun, letters by readers, 23 May, 2008, p. 39

Ramosidi Matekane & Dikgari Ramothatha, *Zuma: Yes we were slow!* 26 May, 2008, p. 1

Photograph by Peter Luhanga, *Refugees Flee Cape!* 26 May, 2008, p. 1 & 2

Ntomboxolo Makobathere & Sapa, *Looters run wild in Cape Town!* 26 May, 2008, p. 2

Themba Kumalo's editorial, *Stop this! There are better ways of solving our problems*, 26 May, 2008, p. 7

Daily Sun, letters by readers, 26 May, 2008, p. 39

Mzamani Mathye, *A Victim of Hate!* 27 May, 2008, p. 8

Ntomboxolo Makoba, *Camp of Fear!* 29 May, 2008, p. 1 & 2

Kola Alli & Daniel Maluleke, *Now SA Must Pay!* 29 May, 2008, p. 4

Sebabatso Mosamo, Rifumo Maluleke & Hlengiwe Kaunda, *Disease threat for Refugee Camps,* 29 May, 2008, p. 4

Daily Sun, letters by readers, 29 May, 2008, p. 39

Sipho Kekana & Simon Makgoga, *We Want the UN!* 30 May, 2008, p. 4

Daily Sun Advertisement, '*Stop the violence*', 2 June, 2008, p. 13

Siyabonga Kamnqa, *Somalis March!* 3 June, 2008, p. 1

Mail & Guardian

Mail & Guardian, Front-cover, May 23 – 29, 2008

Thembihle Tshabalala & Monako Dibetle, *Inside the Mob,* May 23 – 29, 2008, p. 4

Sello Alcock, *Why The Police Blew it,* May 23 – 29, 2008, p. 5

Mandy Rossouw & Zahira Kharsany, *Where to from here?* May 23 – 29, 2008, p. 6

Nosimilo Ndlovu, *The 21st Century Pencil Test,* May 23 -29, 2008, p. 7

Mail & Guardian journalists*,Till Humn Voices Wake Us,* May 23 -29, 2008, p. 8

Mandy Rossouw, *Swanning Around: A Diary of SA's Absent Leadership,* May 23 -29, 2008, p. 8

Thembihle Tshabalala, *Caught in the Hostel trap,* May 23 – 29, 2008, p. 9

Zodidi Mhlana, Niren Tolsi & Sello Alcock, *'Third Force' Allegations Abound,* May 23 – 29, 2008, p. 10

Mandy Rossouw, *The Zuma Factor,* May 23 – 29, 2008, p. 11

Percy Zvomuyo, '*You Can't Imagine the Pain'* May 23 – 29, 2008, p. 12

Nicole Johnston, *'Tell them we're from here'* May 23 – 29, 2008, p. 13

Nicole Johnston*,* '*I Used to be loved, now I am hated*', May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 2 -3

Rapule Tabane, *Winnie Speaks Out,* May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 4

Pearlie Joubert, *The Tragedy Amid Politics,* May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 8

Pearlie Joubert, *How Du Noon Erupted,* May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 8

Mandy Rossouw & Monako Dibetle, *Where has all the Violence gone?* May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 8

Pearlie Joubert, *'I really hate your country'* May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 9

Monako Dibetle, *Buthelezi Scores Brownie Points,* May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 10

Mandy Rossouw, *Escaping Foreigners send wrong message to locals,* May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 10

Mail & Guardian, Is a 'third force' involved? May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 11

Mail & Guardian letters, '*A Life Without foreigners*' May 30 – June 5, 2008, p. 26

List of respondents			
	Name		**Date of interview**
1	Sarah Zondo		12-02-13
2	Betty Mdletshe		12-03-13
3	Sonto Vilakazi		14-02-13
4	Mpume Ndebele		15-02-13
5	Neliswa Zibaya		16-02-13
6	Tina Zuma		25-02-13
7	Nonhlanhla Mkhize		25-02-13
8	Ben Maja		25-02-13
9	Luni Sibiya		26-02-13
10	Slindile Ximba		14-03-13
11	Beauty Ngubani		14-03-13
12	IFP Gauteng Provincial Chairperson, Mr. Nhlanhla Msimango		interview 22/05/13
Bona Fides meeting fieldnotes			
1	Alex Fieldnotes, 15-01-13	2	Alex Fieldnotes, 02-02-13
3	Alex Fieldnotes, 23-02-13	4	Alex Fieldnotes, 06-04-13
5	Alex Field-notes, 04-05-13	6	*Alex FM* interview, 04-04-13