

https://dspace.org/

Contested Subjectivities in Textual and Visual Representations of Jacob Zuma

Makupula, Siwongiwe Chumani

2024
University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg
https://hdl.handle.net/10539/45703
Makupula, Siwongiwe Chumani . (2024). Contested Subjectivities in Textual and Visual Representations of Jacob Zuma [Master`s dissertation, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg]. WIReDSpace. https://hdl.handle.net/10539/45703

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

Contested Subjectivities in Textual and Visual Representations of Jacob Zuma

Siwongiwe Makupula

Student Number: 733059

Supervisor: Prof. Grace A. Musila

Department of African Literature



A Research Report submitted to the Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

Johannesburg 2023

Declaration

I declare that this research report is my unaided work. It is submitted for the degree of Master of Arts at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any other degree or examination in any other university.

Name: Siwongiwe Chumani Makupula

Signature: 

Date: 03 November 2023

Dedication

For my father Levy Thembinkosi Makupula, I love you forever. Thank you.

For Milasande Okuhle Nkosi. Thank you for being a light in my life.

Kubo bonke ooMaduna nooGcwanini, abaphilayo nabakwelizayo, camagu.

Acknowledgements

I want to thank God for strength and so much grace.

I want to thank my supervisor, Prof. Grace A Musila. Words fail me. You have nurtured so many of us. For me personally, none of this would have been possible without your patient guidance. I am very happy for your future students and hope that your work ethic, your deep sense of care for your students, and your sober mind rub off on me. *Imazi enethole*. I want to also thank the African Literature Department for five years of enlightening lectures, difficult conversations, intense debates and love, and care. I want to thank especially Dr. Danai Mupotsa and Dr. Khwezi Mkhize.

I want to thank patrons of the Wits Postgraduate Club (Pigs). I want to especially thank Mabuza for countless debates on the state of the ANC. I want to also take this opportunity to remind you that I was right, Ramaphosa won re-election comfortably. I want to thank those who entertained my ramblings, particularly Prof. Khadiagala and Dr. Cathy. I want to also thank all the "regulars" for various conversations and always providing space.

I want to thank my family. My mother, my siblings and cousins: thank you for your continued support and always finding ways to understand. I know it's not always easy. I want to thank Smams for her support and presence, *enkosi ntwana yam.*

I want to thank my friends. Khumo, thank you for being a teammate and all-around great human being. I want to thank Amuhelang, Panzit, Babsy , and Tumelo. I want to thank Simo, not only for introducing me to Shalom, but also for continuously entertaining my curiosity about film. Thanks too, for being the text-away respondent to my questions on Zulu culture. I want to thank Sabza. I want to thank all my classmates for being brilliant minds Khumo, Buntu, Nojenda, Qhama, Harvey and Phoebe, for helping me grow.

I want to thank Shalom: *phila ngonaphakade* Madiba. I want to thank Bab' Ncube. I gain so much from our conversations about South African history and politics. Your insights have helped me a lot in thinking through this work.

Thank you to everyone who has impacted me positively. I love you.

Table of Contents

Abstract 5

Introduction 7

Chapter One: Liberation Heroism and Predatory Sexuality in Biographical Portraits of Zuma 20

Introduction 20

The Narrative of Overcoming in Gordin's *Zuma* 20

Sexual Violence and Melancholic Time in Tlhabi's *Khwezi* 26

Conclusion 35

Chapter Two: Hypersexuality and the Slipperiness of Parodic Commentary in Artistic Portraits of Zuma 37

Introduction 37

Constructivism, Signifying Practices, and Carnival Laughter 37

The Stereotype of African Hypersexuality and Debates on Respect 40

"The Rape of Lady Justice" 42

"The Spear", "R is for Respect", and "Umshini Wam" 47

Conclusion 57

Chapter Three: Struggle Credentials and Aspirational Figurations in Zuma's Musical Presences 58

Introduction 58

Some Notes on Audiences in Africa 58

Heroic Self-Styling and Embedded Histories in Zuma's Liberation Song 60

Maskandi's Role in Zuma's First Presidential Bid 70

"Msholozi" and Black [Masculine] Escape in Amapiano 75

Conclusion 81

Bibliography 84

Abstract

This MA research report studies visual, textual and musical portrayals of former South African president, Jacob Zuma. The study was undertaken through an analysis of material categorised into three genres: biography, music, and visual culture. In the category of biography, I looked at Jeremy Gordin's *Zuma: A Biography* (2006) and Redi Tlhabi's *Khwezi: The Remarkable Story of Fezekile Ntsukela Kuzwayo* (2017). I was particularly interested in the ways Zuma's public rape trial is presented as an obstacle in Gordin's *Zuma* and as a centripetal force in Tlhabi's *Khwezi.* From this, I demonstrated the ways these representations of Zuma map gender constructions in South African politics. With music, I was interested in the ways the former president uses struggle songs to construct an image of victimhood while reminding the public about his personal sacrifices in South Africa's armed struggle I further looked at the ways maskandi music, through ethnonationalist logics, endorsed a "militant" Zuma. Lastly, I looked at Zuma as a heroic figure in amapiano and the ways that communicates Black exigencies in peri-urban South Africa. In the last category, visual culture, I looked at the slipperiness of parody in a country overdetermined by a history of racial tension. I explore the strengths of the portraits and where they offer poignant criticism of the former president. Three of the four portraits are inspired by the predatory sexuality covered in the first chapter while one, "Umshini Wam" is inspired by opportunist and self-serving practices of Zulu culture explored in the chapter on music. I demonstrate that even with these conditions, the erect Black penis is inadvertently harmful.

As this should suggest, the three chapters outline three different paradigms to conflicts of subjectivity in post-apartheid South Africa. The first chapter takes a gender studies approach to map violent masculinity performances while trying to locate the place of women in these spectacular displays of [ethno] nationalism. The second chapter, where we study visual portrayals, focuses on class and race as the guiding categories of analysis. We argue that with South Africa's complicated and violent colonial then apartheid history, racialized exchanges are inevitably charged with a range of discourses. This chapter argues that the "rainbow-nation" narrative prevents South Africans from meaningful engagement with histories of racial and economic formations and this lack manifests itself in negative social exchanges that are inadvertently harmful and potentially retraumatizing. In the final chapter, our guiding paradigm is ethno-cultural codes of social organizing. These guiding or dominant paradigms do not exist

exclusively as is evident in the final chapter where gender is an operative category in tandem with ethnic and class subjectivities. As such, this report argues that these categories infuse each other and manifest as complicated mixtures in all three genres studied.

Introduction

Born in 1942 to a poor family in Nkandla, former South African president Jacob Gedleyihlekisa Zuma rose steadily in the ranks of the ANC (African National Congress). His credentials include serving a ten-year prison sentence in Robben Island as a political prisoner and being the chief of Imbokodo, Umkhonto we Sizwe's intelligence arm. He is also credited with being instrumental in finding peaceful resolutions between the ANC — influenced by liberation leaders such as Harry Gwala — and the Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP), thereby significantly reducing bloodshed in the Kwazulu-Natal in the early 1990s. A close ally of his predecessor, former president Thabo Mbeki in the liberation movement, Zuma rose to the position of deputy president in 1999 when Mbeki won the ANC's presidency. In the early 2000s cracks started to show in the relationship between the two. On 14th June 2005, Zuma was dismissed by Mbeki due to his associations with Shabir Shaik and the corrupt procurement of tenders to supply the South African National Defence Force with arms. On the 6th of December 2005, Jacob Zuma was charged with the rape of Fezekile Kuzwayo popularly known as Khwezi. He was acquitted on the 6th of May 2006 after a very public trial. Many of Zuma's supporters and sympathisers viewed the rape charge as part of an extensive plot to remove Zuma from ANC leadership.

In 2007, Zuma successfully vied for the presidency of the ANC at the Polokwane Conference. This was the first ANC conference where the party's presidency was contested since the turn to the armed struggle in 1961, in this instance, between Zuma and incumbent ANC and national president, Thabo Mbeki. His election to ANC presidency also diverged from a long-standing trend in the party: beginning with its founding president John Langalibalele Dube in 1912, a 'Black Victorian', to the London-educated Mbeki, the ANC presidency before Zuma had always featured elite Black men, often well-educated and influential. This study proposes that there is a certain sensitivity with which Zuma presents himself in public; a sensitivity that allowed him to disrupt this elite-inclined history of ANC leadership. When it seemed like the ANC hierarchy was opposed to his presidency, Zuma mobilized 'ground forces' through informal channels. Zuma held his position as president of the ANC from 2007, and president of the country from 2009 until 2018 when he was recalled by the ANC NEC (National Executive Committee) – the ruling party's highest decision-making body. [1]

[1] In South Africa 'ground forces' is a term borrowed from the army to refer to comrades who are 'on the ground;' in other words, usually not part of elite leadership and leaders.

In these twelve (12) years, from 2007-2018, Zuma solidified his public image, becoming a phenomenon in South African popular culture. Zuma's public image has inspired multiple and polar engagements from South African artists and beyond. There is a public fascination with Zuma. Materially and imaginatively, he has contributed extensively to the post-transitional nation-state. This study is not interested in Zuma's policies or the achievements and failures of his administration. Rather, its main interest is in his well-curated public image and the different ways South African publics and artists have interpreted him in their artistic, literary, and biographical representations.

This study analyzes the ways Zuma is represented in three different genres, namely visual portrayals, music, and biography. It explores what the dynamics between South African artists, publics, and audiences reveal about repressed ethnic, racial, partisan, gendered, and class conflicts. These categories inform each other and shape South African public discourse. The study suggests that the racial, gendered, class, and ethnic dynamics that infuse artistic, literary, and biographical portrayals of Jacob Zuma, point to the failures of the 'rainbow nation'[2] ideal of the government of transition (1994-1999). The biographical texts studied are Jeremy Gordin's *Zuma – A Biography* (2008) and Redi Tlhabi's *Khwezi – The Remarkable Story of Fezekile Ntsukela Kuzwayo* (2017). The visual portrayals I study are Zapiro's cartoon "The Rape of Lady Justice*"* (2008), Brett Murray's painting titled "The Spear" (2010), Anton Kannemeyer's cartoon titled "R is for Respect" (2015), and Ayanda Mabulu's painting titled "Umshini Wam" (2012). Finally, the study explores songs regularly sung by the former president in ANC-led events, which have come to be associated with him, and which he uses to cement his role as a liberation struggle figure in South African public memory. The songs studied under this category are "Ayihlom' Ihlasele," "Umshini Wam," and "Umhla Sibuyayo."[3] Alongside these, we consider musical portrayals of Zuma in maskandi and amapiano music subgenres, particularly Izingane ZoMa's "Msholozi" (2005), De Mthuda and Ntokzin's "uMsholozi" (2020) and Dj Maphorisa and Kabza De Small's "Umsholozi" (2019).

[2] A term coined by Archbishop Desmond Tutu to refer to post-apartheid South Africa where ideally different people exist together in harmony. It is a term adopted by Nelson Mandela and the rhetoric of his presidency. Visit https://theconversation.com/south-africas-rainbow-nation-is-a-myth-that-students-need-to-unlearn-66872 for some further reading and criticism.

[3] [3] These songs are transcribed in various ways with slightly different wording. This is due to the fact that they are from a period where the message took precedence over the composition. They were composed and circulated orally and continuously shifted with context to reflect the energies of the times.

Further, I consider how certain amapiano artists like Zuma of Reece Madlisa and Zuma and Young Stunna use "Msholozi" as a stage name and alter-ego.

I have chosen this material because it targets varied audiences and publics. Maskandi music's primary audience is isiZulu-speakers, with strong ties to rural KZN. The maskandi songs analysed here offer insights into how Zuma co-opts ethnic nationalism in his political self-profiling. On the other hand, the three struggle songs studied here have come to be associated with Zuma. "Umshini Wam" was the unofficial anthem of his first presidential campaign, while he led mourners in singing "Ayihlom' Ihlasele" at Nelson Mandela's funeral, and "Umhla Sibuyayo" at J.B Mark's reburial[4]. All three songs articulate a militant masculinity that aligns with Zuma's self-placement in public memory. Furthermore, in the democratic South African context, Zuma simultaneously reinterprets these songs to align with his self-portrayal as a victim of what he considers to be political machinations both within and beyond the ANC.[5] Zuma's career history as the head of the ANC's armed wing's Intelligence Division, and therefore, an active figure in the ANC's militant resistance, continues to inform how he presents himself and how South African publics perceive him. I am interested in exploring this trope of militant masculinity in the various representations of Zuma including life writing and visual art; and the meanings they encode. Regarding the visual arts studied here, the *Sunday Times* (16th February 2018) categorises some of these portrayals as the most controversial Jacob Zuma artworks. What interests me in the selected visual arts is the hyper-sexualization of the former president and how that can be read in the broader context of stereotypes of African hypersexuality in Enlightenment rhetoric and later, colonial modernity. This study uses a combination of theoretical tools drawn from biography studies, gender studies and African popular culture. Specifically, it draws on debates on popular culture and audiences from the work of Karin Barber; spectacular and militant masculinities from the work of Pumla Dineo Gqola; and debates on life writing and political figures in Africa as theorised Ciraj Rassool and others.

[4] Former SACP (South African Communist Party) secretary and later chairperson, one-time chairman of the ANC in the Transvaal. Visit https://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/2015-03-02-zuma-welcomes-kotane-and-marks-home/.

[5] See an article on Zuma's rhetoric of victimization where he blames an ANC elite and Tlhabi for attempts to assassinate his character including labeling him a rapist; https://www.news24.com/citypress/news/zuma-takes-aim-at-redi-tlhabi-says-she-wants-to-label-him-a-rapist-20190715.

Over the years, Jacob Zuma has attracted scholarly attention, owing to his growing prominence, as well as notoriety, in South African politics and public life. One of the foremost scholars of the former president is Liz Gunner. In "Jacob Zuma, the Social Body, and the Unruly Power of Song" (2008) Gunner argues that “Umshini Wami” propelled Zuma to “prominence and demonstrated a longing in the body politic for a political language other than that of a distancing and alienating technocracy" (27). She argues that the popularity of music in Africa made it easier for Zuma to resonate with and affect the South African masses in crafting his political image. For Gunner, the pre-1994 provenance of "Umshini Wam" was masculinist and popularizing the song post-1994 had negative gendered implications for the nation-state in formation. Likewise, Pumla Gqola borrows the idea of the “spectacular" from Ndebele's essay, “Rediscovery of the Ordinary,” to illustrate the ways South African politics were proliferated with violent masculinities in the aftermath of Zuma's rape trial. These masculinities showed themselves in struggle parlance. The prominent literature on the relationships between African politics and the clever uses of songs is disproportionately authored by anthropology scholars. What these scholars such as professors Karin Barber and Liz Gunner do well is casting wide nets. In other words, their studies of songs in African politics often consider varied contexts in the sub-Saharan region. Their writings on the topic move smoothly from South to East and West Africa. Although they offer diverse reading, literary studies allow us to study examples in greater detail – questioning structure, context, and political significance among other things. This study owes a lot of gratitude to Barber and Gunner’s extensive work regularly referenced herein - mainly in the section on political songs.

There is a healthy amount of scholarship regarding Zuma’s use of political songs to craft his publics. For one, Gunner has contributed significantly to the topic from 2008 with “Jacob Zuma” and recently with “Political Song in Africa” (2020). In the literature and language discipline, Innocentia Mhlambi (2012) argues that those affiliated with Zuma such as “Friends of Zuma” used songs linked to the president as fundraising tools, and this shows that his use of songs is not spontaneous, and his oeuvre fits a larger political ambition. This study sets scholarly debates on masculinities in conversation with selected Maskandi songs and anti-apartheid liberation sons associated with Zuma. By analyzing two more songs alongside “Umshini Wam” viz. “Umhla Sibuyayo” and “Ayihlome Ihlasele,” this study reflects on the ways Zuma’s oeuvre communicates a message of hyper-visible masculinity. Furthermore, this project extends existing scholarship by considering the figurations of “Msholozi” in amapiano, a recent musical style in South Africa. Consequently, I was frustrated by the lack of critical analyses of

amapiamo. The subgenre is no longer "young", being adopted in the continent, most notably in Nigeria[6], and has enjoyed transatlantic success. I hypothesize that the lack of literature on amapiano could be due to two issues: one is the generalization that amapiano is a contemporary version of kwaito music and thus the extensive literature of the early 2000s on kwaito could be applied to this genre. The other issue could be a perceived lack of forms of radicalism, in other words, the dismissal of amapiano as overly concerned with conspicuous consumption and thus promotion of a fundamentally racialized global capitalist economy. This study argues that the subgenre communicates highly political messages in ways that are subtle as opposed to spectacular methods in other genres such as rap.

Like struggle songs, there is a significant number of scholarly engagements with visual portrayals of Zuma. The subject of that scholarship is the controversial "The Spear." Most of the literature on "The Spear" is in the form of newspaper articles and is concerned with the controversy over the former president's sexuality. Beate Stiehler and Giulio Toscani (2015) conducted a study where responses to the painting were collected from online articles. Their study finds that the respondents were more concerned with the subject of the painting than with its style. As such the painting has garnered much scholarly engagement outside of visual arts, such as Hassim (2014), De Vos (2012), and White (2012). The three other visual portraits in this study have not enjoyed similarly expansive critical engagement.

This study borrows Daniel Hammet's (2010) concept of iconographic continuities (from his study of "The Rape of Lady Justice") to weave together existing arguments while proposing the ways iconographic choices in the portraits studied in this project are in many senses continuous with larger and violent histories in South Africa. Achille Mbembe's "Provisional Notes on the Post-Colony" offers compelling insights on the ways the subjugated use humor related to the bodily grotesque as forms of ridicule and subversion against political power. Whereas Togo and Cameroon have mostly clear distinctions between those in political power or the State vs. the subjected, the dominant vs. the dominated, an arguably oversimplified binarism which he cautions against, South Africa's history and the gradual creations of class

[6] For one example visit https://www.news24.com/life/arts-and-entertainment/music/swae-lee-on-amapiano-sas-brutal-reaction-to-us-rappers-announcement-20230713-2 to read on the negative reactions Swae-Lee , an American mainstream rapper, received when he incorrectly referred to amapiano as a Nigerian creation (owing to it being successfully borrowed by some Nigerian artists) on the platform X (Formerly Twitter).

and racial categories create a more complex post-colony wherein scatological humor does not work as well as it does in West Africa.

On life-writing, many texts, some biographical, some investigative, and some satirical have been written on Zuma. These include Jacques Pauw's *The President's Keepers* (2017) and *Our Poisoned Land: Living in the Shadows of Zuma Keepers* (2022), Adriaan Basson's *Zuma: Exposed* (2012), Adriaan Basson and Pieter du Toit's *Enemy of the People: How Zuma Stole South Africa and How the People Fought Back* (2017), Gareth van Onselen's *Clever Black, Jesus and Nkandla: The Real Zuma in His Own Words* (2014), Ronnie Kasrils *A Simple Man: Kasrils and the Zuma Enigma* (2017), and Gayton Mackenzie's *Kill Zuma by Any Means Necessary* (2017). This study has chosen to focus on two of these biographical portraits: *Zuma* and *Khwezi.* Apart from the distinction of being the first expansive focus on the man in *Zuma,* Gordin attempts to map Zuma's entire life until the mid-2000s. This gives us great scope for studying the former president. On its part, *Khwezi,* published at a time when there was a proliferation of anti-Zuma literature, offers extensive research that centres the rape trial, which is largely abbreviated in the Gordin biography. For these two reasons, these two texts are the most appropriate for studying gender dynamics in the liberation movement and post-apartheid South African politics as seen through biographical depictions of Zuma.

Hlonipha Mokoena argues that Gordin's *Zuma: A Biography* offers a "perceptive and incisive explanation of the legal and judicial issues surrounding Zuma's various trials and acquittals" (224). Likewise, Tim Hughes, Richard Steyn, and Rebekah Kendal consider that Gordin's strength to be legal journalism. As far as this study could establish, much of the literature on *Zuma: A Biography* exists in the form of book reviews. In some scholarly spaces Redi Tlhabi's *Khwezi – The Remarkable Story of Fezekile Ntsukela Kuzwayo* is applauded for "reconstruct[ing] the problematic narratives that surrounded Fezekile during the time of the trial" (Vilakazi and Ulin 31). Ellie Vilakazi and Julieann Ulin argue that the biography achieves this through nuanced engagements with the rape trial and the life of Kuzwayo. Rebecca Helman (2018) notes that the narratives of sexual promiscuity offered by the defence in the rape trial engender certain bodies as "unrapeable" and this intersects with gendered and racialized formations of coloniality. Elsewhere, Linda Koorts (2020) reads the biography as part of a larger topic concerned with biography as a discourse in post-apartheid South Africa. Much of the critical engagement with *Khwezi* has been feminist in orientation. This project enters that feminist scholarship while expanding the scarce scholarship on *Zuma.*

For different reasons *Zuma* and *Khwezi* have not enjoyed expansive critical engagement. I hypothesise that for the former, Gordin's 'Zuma apologist' label has been a deterrent. In the second edition of the book, Gordin admits his admiration for Zuma and tries to put his 'Zuma apologist' label into perspective (see "Preface and Acknowledgements"). *Zuma* might have been dismissed as pro-Zuma propaganda. Furthermore, biography might be an overdone method of creating the myths. In this sense, myth refers to exaggerated semi-phantastic narratives of nationalist political leaders in Africa wherein narrative techniques between politician biographies across different spaces and times follow similar formulae (see Hove). Nationalist imaginaries in post-colonial Africa appear to be heavily dependent on mythography around key political figures, articulated through biography. It might be that post-colonial nationalist imaginaries are limited if not impossible in the absence of these cults of personality. The timing of *Khwezi*, a decade after the incident is tricky because 1) scholars might have grown tired, one would imagine that dealing with issues, even critically, where there are such clear injustices and sustained gendered victimization is draining 2) the biography was rolled-out a few months after Kuzwayo's death. Whereas some might view this as a great gesture to keep her memory and story alive, others might view this both as a great opportunity to sell many copies through sentimentality and the continued objectification of Kuzwayo. I speculate that even with these contestations the two texts, charged with conflicts, offer opportunities to revisit debates that are still relevant to our society.

A significant amount of material studied in this report circulates in popular cultural spaces. This is most clear with the songs and to a lesser extent visual and biographical portrayals. Material in visual arts and biography repeatedly shift between popular and elite spaces. In the field-defining essay titled "Popular Arts in Africa," Karin Barber posits that popular arts uncover important but unnoticed "aspects of the societies in which they flourish – they penetrate and are penetrated by political, economic, and religious institutions in ways that may not be traceable from our own experiences" ("Popular Arts" 1). Usually, popular arts communicate the invisible and the inaudible. Barber proposes two differing understandings of popular arts: first, that popular arts "emanate from" or "belong to" the people. Second, such arts qualify as popular because of their objectives, regardless of their origins. Considering the heterogeneity of Africa, "people" is potentially ambiguous, as Barber too concedes. This study frames popular arts with a synthesis of the two – the interests it serves and how it circulates vis-à-vis the technology of circulation and the primary audience. Elsewhere, Isabel Hofmeyr

posits that "in situations of fragile democracy, failed or weak states, authoritarian rule and violent political transition, popular cultural texts and performances become like 'pavement parliaments' in which issues of power are debated and discussed" (128). The genres studied here convene these 'pavement parliaments', although it is impossible to completely escape the long arm of institutions and their attempts to police debate, as was evident in the SABC (South African Broadcast Corporation) banning "Msholozi."[7] Popular arts are usually syncretic, unofficial, and subversive. However, as this study demonstrates, popular arts can be co-opted to work in service of formal institutions such as government.

Given this study's interest in South African public discourse, the question of audience is significant. According to Richard Bauman "performance as a mode of spoken verbal communication consists in the assumption of responsibility to an audience for a display of communicative competence" (11). Elsewhere, Stuart Hall (1997) insists that all cultural representations operate in a language with specific codes. There is thus an expectation for the audience to possess the intellectual and material tools for decoding the artist's language. Audiences are a historical product, reception (whether collective or dispersed) is "connected to the nature of social life of the age and place" ("Preliminary Notes" 347). Interpretation is intricately influenced by positionality. These texts address different publics, some of which overlap; and they variously seek to reinforce, challenge, and/or propose meanings associated with Zuma's actions and portrayals.

Discussing popular culture, audience, and the role of political songs, Gunner argues that "political song was central to the performance strategies of African political parties" ("Political Song*"* 30). In the South African context, song became a method to spread political rhetoric and consolidate supporters of Zuma's politics. Song in African political organising serves multiple purposes while bridging gaps and creating a feeling of unity. Gunner argues further that songs create a "somatic grammar where the links between body, song, and a wider social meaning assume a momentary coherence" (ibid. 29).

In her earlier writing, Gunner argued that maskandi "has always maintained the right of those on the far edges of power to comment on the social and political and to represent the voices of those who might otherwise go unheard" ("Jacob Zuma" 44). In the *Natal Witness* of March 2,

[7] Visit https://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/2009-05-08-banned-msholozi-back-on-the-airwaves/

2006, Thabo Manyathi calls maskandi singers "the voice of the voiceless" – highlighting their roles as representing the thoughts of those on the margins (qtd. in "Jacob Zuma" 44). Similar relationships between leisure music and political messages have been studied in other sub-Saharan contexts such as Tanzani in Maria Suriano's work. Maskandi speaks languages intelligible to its primary audiences. This is in the sense that the group's engagement with political discourses is in ways that are understandable to their primary audience. Using these languages as an entry point, isiZulu speakers aligned in some ways with rural KZN engaged in national discourses that shaped the ANC and the country. In as much as there is support for authority in maskandi – which I will argue is forged on 'respectful' ethnic lines — there are also subversive voices. Interesting examples include Phuzekhemisi and Khethani's song "Imbizo"[8] and Phuzekhemisi's "Amakhansela."[9] The former criticises taxes levied on parts of rural KZN by the monarchy and the latter criticizes corrupt government officials. Even in maskandi as an alternative medium for engaging in national politics then, there are critical voices that contest the status quo. In the same ways that maskandi becomes a mode of engaging national discourses, amapiano communicates the exigencies of young Black urban and peri-urban South Africans. In Lawson Marcel's documentary for the BBC, *This is Amapiano* (2022) many of its practitioners view amapiano as the "authentic sound of the township and a lifestyle". Even as amapiano is popularly understood as leisure music, it frequently communicates the ambitions of Black urban and peri-urban youth.

This study interprets the selected visual artworks through a constructivist approach. For Karin Barber, "texts generate 'surplus': meaning they go beyond and may subvert, the purported intentions of the work" ("Popular Arts" 4). They are never completely under the artist's control. Similarly, Stuart Hall (1997) argues that representations are not only reflective or intentional but also constructivist — that is, works of art do not only reflect their socio-cultural contexts or the creator's definite goal. Since there is no definite way of understanding intention or the extent of reflection, the reader must "construct" meaning in dialogue with the work of art beyond the extent to which it reflects its environment or the undoubted intention of its creator.

[8] Mnyandu, Zibokwakhe J. "Imbizo". *Youtube Music.* https://music.youtube.com/playlist?list=OLAK5uy_nV0Y6cPvQ&vn7v1pqY4d74E2Oko1XPTLg&feature=feature. Accessed 03 Nov. 2023.

[9] ----------. "Amakhansela". *Youtube Music.* https://music.youtube.com/watch?v=w-Ch-yCsa4o&feature=share. Accessed 03 Nov. 2024.

This research will thus read the chosen artworks by prioritizing the ways they circulate among multiple publics and the histories they are in conversation with.

Stuart Hall's work on signifying practices is the theoretical foundation for this study's reading of visual arts. In *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices* Hall argues that language is a system of signs that work on two levels – the "signifier" and the "signified". The signifier is primary and has a direct correlation with the "signified". Through histories of cultural conditioning, members of a culture will automatically link the signifier with the signified. The signifier in the visual artworks chosen is the erect penis and the signified is passionate African hypersexuality. Building on Hall, I also consider Achille Mbembe's work on the "obverse" and the "reverse" from his essay titled "The Thing and its Doubles". Mbembe argues that spoken and pictographic language are not two completely different systems of language. Pictures speak as much as words do. For him, the material "obverse" cannot exist without the abstract "reverse". This suggests a level of arbitrary relationship between images and reception, a relationship based on historical and cultural formations.

In a recent book on the histories of sexology, Delphine Peiretti-Courtis argues that in the colonial context, 'black sexuality' was used to regulate 'white sexuality'. In colonial rhetoric, two opposed representations of sexuality existed. The superior was modest and indicated the civility of people who lived in temperate countries. The other was liberated and immoral, associated with people who lived in warmer countries who were considered slaves to pleasure and primal instincts. These racist propositions influenced pseudoscientific theories of the time. Against this background, we begin to understand Andrew Mason's work on what he terms iconic continuities between the satirical iconography in "The Rape of Lady Justice" and William Cruikshank's "All among the Hottentots capering to Shore 1820". Mason notes the representational similarities between Cruikshank's "Hottentots" and Zapiro's Zuma. Both are animal-like and inherently threatening. Both cartoons have overtones of primitive sexuality that threaten to devour European civility. Mason's article is foundational because it establishes the extent to which these iconic continuities form a direct line from the twenty-first century to the overtly racist nineteenth century. Drawing on Mason's thinking, the study considers "The Rape of Lady Justice" and the erect and exaggerated penis in "The Spear", "R is for Respect, and "Umshini Wam". There have been multiple newspaper articles on these works. This study considers the limitations and problematics of the erect penis as a metaphor. With a particular

focus on "The Rape of Lady Justice" the study considers the violence of rape as a metaphor in a country where rape is an epidemic.

On auto/biography, Thengamehlo Ngwenya outlines the relationship between the portrayal of individuals and collective [political] interests in the South African political biography. In his study of Sindiwe Magona's two autobiographies, Ngwenya further proposes that in articulating collective consciousness, Black women's autobiographies can function as a mode of challenging social and political ideology. Building on Ngwenya's work, this study reads *Khwezi* as a political biography that can be interpreted through the lens of what Lauren Berlant terms intimate publics. Intimate publics are "constituted by strangers who consume common texts and things" (Berlant viii). We will propose that feminist biography is an intimate public category where readers' familiarity with a particular discourse on sexual violence in South Africa is taken for granted.

One of the arguments advanced by the defence in Zuma's rape trial, through formal and informal channels, was that Kuzwayo seduced Zuma and he acted accordingly as a "Zulu man" (Koelbe and Robins 316). The rape trial sparked intense debate in the country. One strand of these debates turned to how sexual violence was a feature the ANC camps in exile and how that translates to problematic gender politics in the ANC in democratic South Africa. In an early article following the TRC (Truth and Reconciliation Commission) proceedings, Beth Goldblatt and Sheila Mentjies (1997) found that not only was sexual violence prevalent in liberation camps, but it was also an open secret. [10] Carl Collison (2017) writing for the *Mail & Guardian* revisited sexual violence in liberation camps by interviewing survivors. Collison's work echoes the earlier work by Goldblatt and Mentjies. Sexual violence as a culture in liberation camps also appears in *Khwezi* where the enquiry is more in-depth and personal.

Many debates against the hyper-sexualization of Zuma in satirical visual representations are anchored on an idea of 'African morals' and 'respect'. While the ANC Women's League argued that it was "disrespectful" to represent Zuma, an old man, in such a crude manner (see "Violent Modernity"), Simphiwe Sesanti argues that these frames of respect in African politics are not without responsibility meaning there was always expectation that "respected" members

[10] Set up by the government of unity to deal with the traumas of apartheid. For more visit https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/

of society carry themselves in a “respectable” manner. Conservative forces within the ANC along with other traditionally aligned stakeholders such as the Shembe church criticised phallic representation of Zuma as disrespectful and immoral.

This study is organised around four chapters. This chapter introduces the topic providing the aim, rationale, theoretical framework, literature review, and methodology. The principal ideas in chapter one are cultures of predatory sexuality and heroic narratives in the representations of Zuma in the two biographical texts: Jeremy Gordin’s *Zuma – A Biography* (2008) and Redi Tlhabi’s *Khwezi – The Remarkable Story of Fezekile Ntsukela Kuzwayo* (2017). The argument follows representations of sexual violence in the two biographies. In *Khwezi* we see a “feminine” melancholic time and in *Zuma,* we see sexual violence as an obstacle in a masculinist teleological time. In *Khwezi* sexual violence is a centripetal force while in *Zuma* sexual violence is an obstacle to overcome.

The second chapter tackles the crude hypersexualization of Jacob Zuma as a Black man in visual representations. I argue that whether intentional or not, this hypersexualization of Black bodies has an extensive history that reaches back to the middle passage and colonial modernity. This study will single out the erect penis as a signifier in a comparative analysis of the artworks. We will read the visual iconography in conversation with broader histories and discourses about African male hypersexuality. The fine art space in South Africa is classed, gendered, and racialized. This racist iconography in artistic depictions of Zuma complicates debates on the rape trial, as it pits racist iconography against outrage at sexual violence.

The third chapter builds on with the idea of a heroic Zuma that is introduced by Gordin, this time through an exploration of music associated with Zuma. It begins by analysing Zuma’s clever use of struggle songs as a method of affirming his militant masculinity, encouraging a recollection of his contribution to the anti-apartheid armed struggle and the ways the songs allow him to set himself up as a victim of the ANC elite. The chapter explores the ways Zuma uses liberation songs in the project of constructing his public image. It further analyses the ways Zuma's representation in maskandi music assisted his first presidential bid in terms of ethnocultural solidarities. Although seemingly far-removed musical categories, this study shows the ways both genres operate within the logic of what Pumla Dineo Gqola terms spectacular masculinity. Lastly, in amapiano music, “Msholozi" is a metonym for "wealth and influence". We consider the demographics of amapiano and the politics of adopting “Msholozi”

as an epithet. The final chapter distils the core findings of the study on the different ways in which Zuma is interpreted and uses popular artistic forms.

Chapter One: Liberation Heroism and Predatory Sexuality in Biographical Portraits of Zuma

Introduction

The main ideas in this chapter are cultures of predatory sexual violence and heroic narratives in the representations of Zuma in Jeremy Gordin's *Zuma: A Biography* (2006) and Redi Tlhabi's *Khwezi: The Remarkable Story of Fezekile Ntsukela Kuzwayo* (2017). There are two relationships with sexual violence in the two biographical texts: the first one is oriented towards how the trauma of sexual violence creates a melancholic time for women subjects, while the second one is hinged on a masculinist ethos that invites heroic overcoming of obstacles. This chapter demonstrates the ways in which, the narratives of liberation heroism demand a mindful concealing of the cultures of sexual violence and their genealogies. In continuing with the subject of this MA research report, "Contested Subjectivities", this chapter shows the ways Zuma's rape trial created camps, some pro and some anti-Zuma. When all was said and done the trial pit the nation and contestation for state power on a collision path with women's historical encounters with heroic nationalism and its patriarchal assumptions. It is for this reason that Elizabeth Skeen considers the trial to have been more about the nation than a trial of sexual violence[11].

The Narrative of Overcoming in Gordin's *Zuma*

South Africa has a long history of "struggle" biographies. Some of the most famous are *Return to Egoli* (1953) and *Tell Freedom* (1981) by Peter Abrahams, and Nelson Mandela's *Long Walk to Freedom* (1994) and *Thabo Mbeki: The Dream Deferred* (2007) by Mark Gevisser. As the timing of Mandela's biography would suggest, published as it was a few months after the government of majority rule came into power, political biography in South Africa cleverly negotiates between personal history, struggle history, and national[ist] consciousness. For his

[11] Skeen, Elizabeth. *The Rape of a Trial: Jacob Zuma, AIDS, Conspiracy, and Tribalism in Neo-liberal Post-Apartheid South Africa* [Unpublished B.A. Thesis]. 2007. Princeton University. https://lapa.princeton.edu/hosteddocs/skeen_2007_thesis.pdf. Accessed 31 May 2023.

part, Jeremy Gordin asserts that “Zuma’s story is also largely inseparable from the story of South African politics of the last decade or longer” (xvii). Likewise, Ciraj Rasool argues that “South African political biography has largely reproduced a 'biographical illusion' by approaching political lives as characterised by an ordered sequence of acts, events, and works, with individuals characterized by stability, autonomy, self-determination, and rational choice” (28). These characteristics, one would argue, represent the many vocalized and unspoken desires of post-colonial nation-states. These political biographies are written in such fashions that mirror the teleological ideals of South Africa – beginning with struggle and ending with triumph. One would be forgiven for thinking of Zuma’s biography as a sort of Bildungsroman. It would not be strange for one to say reading this biography from cover to cover feels a lot like reading *Great Expectations.* Like Pip, Zuma is born into poverty, is occasionally around those of higher classes (who undermine him) and thanks to the grace of another (in Pip’s case the escaped convict and in Zuma’s case his older brother whose involvement in the ANC ignited Zuma’s own politicization and subsequent mentoring by ANC cadres such as Harry Gwala) they access, as significant actors, highly privileged spaces. Whereas Pip returns to Kent, *Zuma* ends with the former president’s position secure even with intensifying public disillusionment (see “The Honeymoon Ends”). The Bildungsroman is typically a long and arduous journey where a protagonist overcomes obstacles to insert himself into the status quo.

Beginning with the “Talking Times” and progressing to “The Greasy Levers of Power” and “Bring us our Machine Guns” Gordin outlines intraparty struggles for power beginning with the CODESA (Convention for a Democratic South Africa) negotiations. The struggle for influence in the CODESA negotiations was a spill out of the struggles for positions in the unbanned ANC. The Mbeki camp, typically MK veterans including Zuma who was then a close ally, was engaged in a cold war with Cyril Ramaphosa’s camp, at the time South Africa's most successful trade unionist and favoured by Mandela over Mbeki to become his deputy and successor (see *Dare Not Linger: The Presidential Years* (2017) by Nelson Mandela and Mandla Langa. Moving from these mid-1990s struggles, in the early 2000s, there were allegations that some politicians — notably Zuma's close associate Shabir Shaik, through his Nkobi Holdings — had improperly influenced and benefited from a major deal with a French company, Thales, to supply arms to the South African National Defence Force (SANDF). This would later become a public fall-out waged through newspapers between Bulelani Ngcuka (the then Director of the National Prosecuting Authority), the Shaik brothers (particularly Moe), and Mac Maharaj. Moe Shaik was a high-ranking civil servant and Maharaj was a cabinet minister.

Shaik and Maharaj were viewed as Zuma loyalists. The war waged between the three former anti-apartheid struggle veterans through media houses naturally divided editors into camps. It is on the back of these intraparty struggles that Kuzwayo accused Zuma of rape. Gordin writes that "when a strong rumour circulated that a woman had laid charges of rape against Zuma, some news desks or political bureaus ignored it, or treated it so cautiously that they didn't even tell other sections of their own newspaper" (99). Gordin's portrait of Jacob Zuma suggests that Kuzwayo's charge against Zuma was initially received as the latest iteration in continuous attempts by some factions of the South African publishing community and the general public to undermine Zuma, dating back to CODESA negotiations. This would be one of the main narratives sold by the former president's camp in response to the rape charge. This narrative of Zuma's targeting was seen to be supported by his swift dismissal from his position as deputy president of the country by President Mbeki a few months prior due to his connections with Shaik and the arms deal scandal. Before this, the ANC had been notorious for silence and protecting its members against public scrutiny or proverbially never airing dirty laundry.

Gordin begins the chapter on Zuma's rape charge and trial ("2006 Rape Trial") by giving a summative blow-by-blow account of the prosecution vs. defence. Much of what is condensed in the twenty pages (145-165) would later be the core of Tlhabi's *Khwezi.* Unlike *Khwezi* where Tlhabi's stance is clear, Gordin seems to offer an objective account including details of the defence's argument not mentioned in *Khwezi.* Gordin writes that "Khwezi's story presented a picture of a woman, a girl actually, who was continually, and with scant or no chance of protection, at the mercy of predators. Perhaps they were not predators, merely boys, and boys will be boys, and girls will be girls, and Khwezi was Khwezi" (166). I find myself trying to make sense of what Gordin is suggesting. What does he mean these were not predators but merely boys when the four men involved in cases of sexual violence with regard to Kuzwayo were full-grown adults? I also wonder what he means by "girls will be girls". In her book *Living a Feminist Life* (2017) Sara Ahmed argues that:

> Girling is not only enacted through being explicitly addressed as a girl, but the style and mode of address, because you are a girl, we can do this to you. Violence too is a mode of address; being a girl is a way of being taught what it is to have a body: you are being told; you will receive my advances; you are object; thing; nothing. To become girl is to learn to expect such advances, to modify your behaviour accordingly (26).

One of the enduring arguments advanced by the defence and backed by Zuma and his daughter Duduzile Zuma, is that Kuzwayo seduced Zuma by 1) the way she was sitting and 2) wearing a kanga cloth with no underwear (Gordin 161). Gordin would in the concluding thoughts on the issue offer that:

> What happened to Zuma and Khwezi is what I rather lamely call 'real life'. I think that, partially because she comes from a different generation to Zuma, she did not (consciously) understand the implications of her behaviour – loving SMSs, affection, and kanga sans underwear. And Zuma, because he comes from a different generation, did not understand what he read as sexual provocation was merely the way some young people behave (167).

This would suggest that like Kuzwayo, Zuma is equally a victim. Furthermore, Zuma was completely unaware that what he was doing was violating Kuzwayo who repeatedly, according to her statement and *Khwezi,* said "no". This would also assume the defence's position that a father-daughter relationship did not exist between Zuma and Kuzwayo. It is improbable that a father would see the actions leading to the encounter as a sexual invitation. Again, Gordin seems to be suggesting that Kuzwayo is equally guilty for not understanding that Zuma was a man of another time, that she encouraged Zuma's actions through the SMSs, and so on. In Gordin's portrayal of Zuma, the rape case is one among many challenges that Zuma had to overcome to ascend to the position of ANC chief.

This study reads Gordin's biography as operating in the three-act tradition. Chapters 1-4 are in this understanding ACT 1 or the "setup"– the reader is introduced to Zuma as the "Zulu boy" and the "working-class hero". Gordin begins by tracking Zuma's life story from his humble beginnings to his involvement with the MK. Chapters 5-14, which maps the ways Zuma negotiates his position in the ANC in preparation for a democratic South Africa marks the beginning of the "confrontation" phase. The narrative arch intensifies as Zuma battles the arms deal charges, the Shabir Shaik trial, and finally the rape charge. In Gordin's words, "that moment when Judge Herbert Msimang struck the state's case of corruption against Jacob Zuma off the roll was a golden one for the 64-year-old warrior" (185). The reference to Zuma as a warrior indicates high levels of masculine affinity, a warrior who has faced and won many battles: the battle against poverty; the battle to rise in ANC structures, even when he was from a disadvantaged background; to hold significant provincial and national positions in the unbanned ANC; the battle against party agents with an agenda against him; and so on. All these

challenges are collapsed together in these eight chapters and create a mountain of impossibilities for the president. Chapter 15, the Limpopo conference, begins the “resolution” phase where Zuma solidifies his public image and status in the ANC. Whereas in *Khwezi* sexual violence is the act that underlines Tlhabi’s approach to Kuzwayo’s life, in *Zuma* it is predentrd as just one of the many challenges that the former president must overcome. The three-act structure is useful in narrating stories of overcoming or creating heroes.

The curation of Zuma as a struggle hero is the backbone of his political life which resonates with many ANC-allied factions. The recent ANC Kwazulu-Natal KZN provincial election (2022) was marked by numerous chaotic moments. Natal was the Bantustan designated by the apartheid government for the Zulu people. The Bantustans were implemented by the apartheid government to organize ethnic groups back to their "origins" under self-government. Kwazulu-Natal is where Zuma was born and where he continues to enjoy the most support in South Africa. This is also the stronghold of Zuma's ANC faction, the Radical Economic Transformation (RET). Major factions in the elective congress chanted "Wenzeni uZuma?” (What has Zuma done?) before the treasurer-general Paul Mashatile gave opening remarks (EWN). The song came to national attention following the Judicial Commission of Enquiry into Allegations of State Capture hearings.[12] The song reinforces perceptions that an ANC faction led by current president Cyril Ramaphosa is on a witch-hunt against Zuma. The former president’s allies, who currently occupy almost all provincial executive seats in KZN, portray Zuma as a Zulu liberation hero who is constantly fighting to survive internal battles in the ANC.

Apart from the support in his home base, Zuma continues to enjoy unrelenting support from uMkhonto we Sizwe Military Veterans Associations who are colloquially understood as Zuma’s “private army” (Gon n.p.). Following announcements of a planned protest against Zuma, then MKMVA chairperson Themba Mavundla threatened MK vets would "defend" Zuma by deploying members to Luthuli House, the ANC headquarters (ibid). On April 3, the MKMVA had six hundred “vets” (the status of these protestors as MK vets has been questioned as some appear too young to have been involved with the armed struggle (see Tlhabi 135), presumed to be armed, assembled in front of Luthuli House. The same vets assembled outside

[12] An enquiry into allegations that Zuma used state resources to build personal wealth and offer favours to friends, particularly the Gupta brothers. This process involved manipulating state entities, policies, private companies, and government officials to favour the brothers’ business interests. For more visit https://www.statecapture.org.za

the commission into state capture inquiry hearing chanting struggle songs when Zuma appeared before the commission. One of Zuma's most ardent supporters is MK vet and former Nelson Mandela spokesperson Carl Niehaus. Following Zuma's arrest for contempt of court relating to the commission of state capture enquiries Niehaus held that:

> President Zuma continues to suffer gross injustice at the hands of the unjust system that should not have imprisoned him in the first place. This is a personal, vindictive, judgment by the notorious GP North High Court, where Msholozi lost 100% of his cases. A sad day for justice! […] The judgment by the Gauteng North court must be rejected with the contempt it deserves. It is atrocious, unjust, and vindictive against Nxamalala. Lady Justice has thrown away her scales and removed her blindfold to pierce her sword at President Zuma (Mtshali n.p.)

The narrative of Zuma as a victim is premised on his background. He tells Gordin, "I'm not an important person. I'm not from a politically famous or royal family. I'm not an important businessman. I'm just an ordinary guy" (xv). This statement serves as a sarcastic critique of South African politics – that it favours those from significant families. It is ordinary folk, like Zuma, who tussle power from elite players such as Mbeki for the benefit of the people. For this, Zuma will always remain a target of "Kleva Blacks"[13] who want to hoard power (Kleva Blacks and narratives of victimization will be explored further in the next chapter).

There is little love lost between Tlhabi and Gordin. The former journalist accuses Gordin of using his position in *Independent Media* to control the narratives around the rape charge (see Tlhabi 78-79; Gordin xxii-xxiii). Tlhabi views Gordin as being in Zuma's inner circle. That one of the first journalists to break the Kuzwayo rape story, along with *The Sunday Times,* would later be Zuma's biographer leaves many questions regarding journalistic integrity. *The Sunday Independent* and the *Sunday Times* reported the events of Kuzwayo's alleged sexual violation in contradictory narratives. Whereas the *Sunday Times* reported, accurately, that Kuzwayo had laid a charge of rape against Zuma, *The Sunday Independent* reported that Kuzwayo denied the existence of such a case.[14] Kuzwayo would later reveal to Tlhabi that she was coached by the police to deny the case's existence. These early contrasting reports would begin a project of framing Kuzwayo as an unreliable witness. In the aftermath of this disjuncture, Gordin blames Kuzwayo for feeding false information to him to honour some

[13] Kleva (Clever) Blacks are usually educated Africans who are viewed as believing themselves to be smart while their actions perpetuate the oppression of Black people

[14] Visit https://www.news24.com/news24/zuma-rape-case-timeline-20060212

"compensation" implying that she was paid to lie about the case (Gordin xxii, "Rape Trial") while Tlhabi argues that Kuzwayo was manipulated by SAPS agents tasked with protecting her (Tlhabi "On Trial"). Kuzwayo was at this time living in a safe house. With the agents as Kuzwayo's primary contact, Tlhabi's book outlines the ways they used these conditions to continuously manipulate her. In the preface to the second edition of his biography, Gordin writes that Zuma "does often commit a sexual misdemeanour" (xii). Whereas sexual violence is a centripetal force in *Khwezi,* in *Zuma* the accusations of predatory sexuality are introduced as minor wrongdoings and conflated with other obstacles, such as corruption accusations, which the former president had to overcome. The contrasting views of the two journalists represent two of the major camps around the rape trial. Gordin's views, overtly and subtly masculinist, offer explanations for Zuma's conduct, never condemning Zuma for any wrongdoing, continuously implying his innocence. On the other hand, Tlhabi's portrait of Zuma represents a feminist strand that grew in intensity during Zuma's time in office. These two strands represent contested gender subjectivities not unique to the situation and relevant to understanding the workings of gender in South African politics in the fight for and the aftermath of democracy.

Sexual Violence and Melancholic Time in Tlhabi's *Khwezi*

Tlhabi's *Khwezi* presents strong antagonistic feelings to Gordin's *Zuma.* Everything, even time, oscillates around traumatic events in *Khwezi*. In Fezekile Kuzwayo's case, these events occur four times: when she was five, twelve, and thirteen, in liberation camps; while the last one, involving Zuma, occurs in her early thirties in post-apartheid South Africa. The rape case is the event that sparks Tlhabi's interest in Kuzwayo's life. Early in *Khwezi,* Tlhabi recalls asking Kuzwayo if she had come to terms with everything that had happened to her (13). To this difficult question, Kuzwayo replies that "rape is like death" (ibid.). Kuzwayo losing her father at the age of ten years has a similar effect of oscillating time. Her difficulty in 'letting go' of her father is the reason she sought his comrades, particularly Zuma, who was perceived as closest to him, having shared a cell at Robben Island for many years. From recollections by her friends and Tlhabi, it seems Kuzwayo was always busy with something; she is portrayed as one who actively avoided rest. Whether it is obsessive cleaning, projects or jobs (this frustrated most of her friends including the biographer), her mind always had to be occupied. Towards her death, her mind, as per *Khwezi,* was busy with scenarios that involved losing her mother

and obsessive care for her. The first interest of this section is the ways sexual violence ruptures teleological time and the ways this inability to "move on/past" reflects how sexual trauma exists as feminine melancholy in South African masculinist imaginaries. The second point of interest in this section is the relationship between feminism, life-writing, and friendship. The biography is clear on its positionality; and it condemns Zuma and the ANC's complicity in harm. Kuzwayo and Tlhabi exchange multiple text messages that go beyond their professional relationship. Reading these texts and conversations as transcribed in *Khwezi*, one notes a mutual affection. The pair always refer to each other as "dear, love, *dade* (sister)" and such affectionate terms, prompting my interest in biography and feminist solidarities.

Fezekile Ntsukela Kuzwayo, the daughter of ANC veteran Judson Kuzwayo, was allegedly raped by Zuma ("On Trial", "2006 Rape Trial", Basson n.p). In court accounts reproduced in *Khwezi* and *Zuma* Kuzwayo claims to have visited the Zuma home in Forest Town in a distressed state after learning that her niece's child in Swaziland was bitten by a snake. After supper, where Zuma's daughter Duduzile was present, Kuzwayo retired to the guest bedroom while Zuma finished some late-night work. In Kuzwayo's version of events, Zuma joined her in the guest bedroom and initiated unconsented intercourse which she rejected ("Democracy's Shadow" 58). Zuma claims the intercourse happened in his room and Kuzwayo consented by speaking openly to him about her love life, wearing a kanga sans underwear, allowing him to massage her with oil (ibid.). According to Zuma, Kuzwayo's immodest sitting earlier, not closing her legs while wearing a short skirt, was a sexual invitation.

The rape charge and subsequent trial was a very public affair which haunted Zuma's term in office. During Zuma's address at the 2016 IEC (Independent Electoral Commission) election result ceremony for local government elections, four women dressed in black marched in and stood in front of the podium, facing the audience (see Nicholson). They held A4 papers that read "#", "I am 1 in 3", "10 years later", "Khanga", and "Khwezi". These women were referring to Zuma's 2005 rape charge, trial and acquittal. The case was dismissed by Judge van der Merwe. Part of the judgement read:

> It is clear that the probabilities show that the complainant's evidence cannot be accepted. She is a strong person well in control of herself knowing what she wants. She is definitely not that meek, mild and submissive person she was made out to be. On the evidence as a whole it is clear that the accused's version should be

> believed and accepted. The accused's evidence was also clear and convincing in spite of media efforts to discredit him (*State v. Zuma* 173).

Some, like Tlhabi, view van der Merwe's promotion to deputy chief justice of the Transvaal Provincial Division during Zuma's administration as reward for this judgement (Tlhabi 95). The judgement and the ways the court allowed evidence to be presented, in ways that undermined Kuzwayo's constitutional rights to privacy and dignity, have invited legal criticism (see Moloi).

Tlhabi proposes that the difficulty in rape trials is that the plaintiff is as much on trial as the defendant. This rang very true for this trial. During the trial, "hundreds of Zuma supporters demonstrated every day outside the High Court by burning photographs and effigies of the plaintiff, chanting 'Burn the B*.' Zuma supporters wearing '100% Zulu Boy' t-shirts intimidated and threatened anti-rape protesters who came out to support the 'accuser,' as the media dubbed her" (Koelbe and Robins 316). In tandem with his supporters, "throughout the trial, Zuma portrayed himself as the embodiment of Zuluness—he spoke only in Zulu and maintained that the sexual encounter was defined by the proper Zulu etiquette and that he had only done what any 'proper Zulu' male would" (ibid). Zuma's defence was that Kuzwayo was aroused, and it would be a criminal offence in his culture to leave an aroused woman without penetrating her. (The Zuma/Zulu culture discontinuities will be explored further in later chapters of this study).

Using her sexual history, the defence implied that Kuzwayo is a promiscuous woman and a pathological liar (pp. 96-126). The defence further implied that Kuzwayo was psychologically unwell and thus her judgment could not be trusted. They submitted to the court Kuzwayo's history of therapy in exile. Tlhabi writes that

> Beauty [Kuzwayo's mother] had to argue that these sessions with the psychologist and psychiatrist 'did not mean she was mentally not sound' [To the defence, the fact that Kuzwayo had therapy sessions till her adulthood, 'to the present day'] suggests that depression, trauma, and their concomitant behaviour have a sell-by date […] It is not clear when, exactly, Fez was supposed to 'get over' her childhood rapes, her father's death, and her unsettled life. The court did not appreciate the enormity of these events (127-129).

Jessica Murray tells us that "bodies retain and speak traumatized experiences in ways that defy abstract, linear, and masculine hegemonic time" (8). According to early psychoanalysts, particularly Sigmund Freud, trauma has the ability to trap its survivors in "melancholic" time. In contrast with the teleological narrative underlying the TRC (a foundational period in transitional South Africa), melancholic time is circular.

Masculinist teleology has defined the South African post-apartheid political economy where there is constant persuasion to "turn the page on the past" in the "nation-building" project. Bhekizizwe Peterson teaches us that the persuasions to move beyond the traumas of the apartheid government or linear relationships between the past and the present, where the past represents an evil situation that must be overcome by the unity of the 'rainbow-nation,' reminiscent of Fanon's Manichean[15] state, are riddled with shortcomings as:

> The link between the past and the present is ruptured in a manner that literally suggests 'leaving the past behind'. Such evocations of the future, in effect, empty the country's history of its past and present and substitute the need to recognize and deal with the past in the present with the deification of forgiveness as the sine-qua-non of nationhood and progress ("Dignity, Memory, and the Future Under Siege" 5).

These poignant observations give us yet another opportunity to view the rape trial as a microcosm of the post-apartheid state in formation. What Peterson argues is that refusing to acknowledge the material residues of the past in the present is fecund with a "range of repressions that unity and forgiveness seem to be contingent on and [they], in effect, amount to new strategies of containment and the reproduction of abuse, poverty, injustice and alienation" (ibid. 2). The difference between the apartheid state and Zuma is that the former president continues to refuse to acknowledge any level of wrongdoing. Similar to the demand of the post-apartheid state's pressure on apartheid victims to get past the past, there is pressure on Kuzwayo to 'move on' from her childhood traumas. We see in the Zuma case a conflict of ideologies of progress and trauma rehabilitation similar to the South African state. It begs the questions: Are there any possibilities of 'moving past' trauma? And if there are, what repressions are necessary, and in what ways will those repressions affect individuals' and communities' everyday lifeworlds?

[15] Visit https://libcom.org/article/manichean-delirium-time-jacob-zuma#:~:text=It%20is%2C%20Fanon%20explains%2C%20",brute%20force%20rather%20than%20ideology. For a brief overview.

For Freud, melancholia, or failure to ‘move past’ is a pathological and thus failed state of being. In his work on mourning and melancholy, he postulates that:

> Mourning is regularly the reaction to the loss of a loved person, or the loss of some abstraction that has taken the place of one, such as one's country, liberty, an ideal, and so on. In some people, the same influences produce melancholia instead of mourning and we consequently suspect them of a pathological disposition […] although mourning involves grave departures from the normal attitude of life it never occurs to us to regard it as a pathological condition (243-244).

Freud and his colleagues propose mourning as a natural process that organically resolves itself with the lapse of time, arguing that interference with the process of mourning is “useless or even harmful" (244). Mourning and melancholy are both reactions to loss. From this definition of melancholy and mourning, early Western psychoanalysts understood mourning as a natural process that eventually resolves in a form of acceptance. The defence's line of question suggests that because of her continued psychiatric sessions, Kuzwayo is of a pathological disposition therefore her testimony must be received with some reservations. Kuzwayo’s sexual history was one of the cornerstones of the defence's argument. We know that Kuzwayo lost her ‘innocence’, where innocence is ‘virginity’, in her first violent sexual experience at five years old. In some ways, the defence was suggesting that Kuzwayo has not mourned her loss – where mourning resolves itself into a return to ‘normality’ and therefore makes further psychological care unnecessary. The defence postulated multiple arguments that were at times comically contradictory. Among them were that Kuzwayo (even at five years old) had consented to her sexual violence, that she was mentally unstable, she was a slut, and so on. They furthermore used her over-sharing personality — she shared many of the going-ons in her personal life with many different individuals that were not always close friends or family (see Tlhabi) — as illustrative of a fundamental psychological stuntedness.

Later theorists of trauma depart from early psychoanalytic ideas of establishing a ‘healthy’ balance between the conscious and unconscious mind post a traumatic event. Whereas mourning offers victims the possibility of accepting a loss and thus completing their grieving process, some trauma theorists propose mourning is impossible because trauma does not operate within a teleological logic. They posit that trauma has a disorientating effect and can

disrupt chronotopic coherence (Laub 69; Murray 8). Reflecting on Walter Benjamin's views against consolidation after the trauma of the world wars, Martin Jay posits:

> [Walter Benjamin] refused, that is, to seek some sort of new symbolic equilibrium through a process of collective mourning that would successfully "work through" the grief. Scornfully rejecting the ways culture can function to cushion the blows of trauma, he wanted to compel his readers to face squarely what had happened and confront its deepest sources rather than let the wounds scar over. Rather than rebuilding the psychological "protective shield" (*Reizschuts*) that Freud saw as penetrated by trauma, he laboured to keep it lowered, so that the pain would be numbed (14).

Walter Benjamin suffered personal trauma in the suicide of his friend because of the war. While Freud advocated that trauma broke a protective shield that mourning works to rebuild, Benjamin's position was to maintain the wound fresh. Although this would seem masochistic, it is underpinned by a desire for meaningful justice. In the nationalist context, a collective 'working through' grief usually focuses on the surface and does not interest itself in the depth of the problems. Similarly, the TRC has been criticised for its inability to meaningfully indict apartheid's racial engineering (Strauss 51). Tlhabi posits that "the sexual violence that women and children endured in the fight against apartheid has not enjoyed the same attention as [debates on democracy and economic freedom and equality]" (41). In similar vein, Barbara Boswell shows us that

> women's experience of rape and torture at the hands of their comrades within the liberation movement remained shrouded in silence [and while the abuses of women were widely known in the movement] no excavation of actual experiences of such violence has taken place and nor has the ANC attempted to redress these (118).

One of the reasons for this silence is the fact that if women in the movement claimed they were raped they "were regarded as having sold out to the system in one way or another" (Jessie Duarte in Boswell 118). "Selling out" in this context is collaborating with the apartheid government to target certain individuals in ways that would significantly undermine and collapse the movement. Interestingly the rhetoric of 'honeypotting,' in this context using the female body and sexuality to trap political opponents, was a defence adopted by some of Zuma's supporters who believed Kuzwayo was planted as a trap in a conspiracy to remove Zuma from ANC leadership (see "On Trial", "2006 Rape Trial"). Kuzwayo's life story is one way of looking at how apartheid cannot be 'mourned' collectively without recognizing and

excavating buried histories of violence in liberation movements along with the residues of violent masculinities post Zuma's trial.

Sexual violence was commonplace in liberation camps. In a 2017 interview on sexual abuse in liberation camps for the *Mail & Guardian*, Sibongile "Promise" Khumalo tells Carl Collison that her "real troubles started when [she] met Potlako Leballo [the then PAC president]" (n.p.). She claims that the girls tasked with the upkeep of Leballo's quarters were regularly preyed on. Shireen Hassim, a prominent researcher of the ANC Women's League and its antecedent organizations in liberation camps, finds evidence that some senior members of liberation movements were also sexually abusive, and younger girls, following the 1976 influx, viewed their sexuality as a form of currency (*The ANC Women's League* 63-65). In the same interview with Collison, Thenjiwe Mtintso, one of the few female commanders of the MK, tells of how a comrade threatened to rape her. He retreated because as a commander she carried a pistol and threatened to shoot him if he tried. The comrade continued to threaten to 'get her' one day. At this point it must be emphasized that even as migrancy and liberation camps exposed many women to potential intraparty danger, this was not the only site of the anti-apartheid struggle. The struggle was fought by women on many fronts including homes and churches. In her Ph.D. thesis, Siphokazi Magadla shows that

> combative mothers in the community constitute the space from which most women participated in the armed struggle. The erasure of the public and military spheres brought the war to their homes, the playing fields of their children in schools, in the churches, and everywhere in their lives. From these sites, they defended themselves, their children and lived under constant state interrogation and attack (183).

This history is important to reproduce here for two reasons. The first is that in the liberation struggle, gender was not an innate weakness. The perception of domesticity allowed women to organize in ways difficult or impossible for other groups in society to organize in a guerrilla warfare where lines between Homefronts and battlefronts were blurred (Magadla v). The relationship between Tlhabi and Kuzwayo, where Tlhabi is clear about her condemnation of Zuma and support for Kuzwayo as a friend, is in this paper viewed as feminist friendship-cum-solidarity or vice versa.

The constant threat of sexual violence, even for senior members in the armed struggle as seen with Mtintso, was perpetrated to 'cut them down to size'. Mtintso believes sexual violence

went unreported in the camps because the victims were convinced their reports would not be believed, and victims usually felt embarrassed and wondered if they encouraged the acts (Collisons n.p). In an earlier interview, Mtintso also believed victims of sexual violence chose silence to protect the health of the Organization (Mentjies and Goldblatt 12). Former ANC deputy secretary general Jessie Duarte was of the view that many women remained silent because other women were complicit in their abuse (Collisons n.p). In Kuzwayo's case, she was reportedly coached by two matriarchal figures in the ANC to drop the charges against Zuma in the interest of the party's welfare (Tlhabi 77). Former defence minister and MK Commander Joe Modise told the TRC the MK in exile was aware of the ways senior liberation leaders used their positions to force women into sexual relationships (Tlhabi 53; Mentjies and Goldblatt; Collison). From this literature, there are a few certainties: sexual violence was prevalent in liberation camps; this was common knowledge; women were never completely safe regardless of their ranks, and lastly, some matriarchal comrades along with male liberation leaders were complicit in burying abuse complaints in the interests of the movement's 'health'.

This perpetual threat of violation necessitated forms of feminist solidarity. In a sad and funny recollection in *Khwezi*, an interviewee details the way a male comrade would sneak into female dormitories and fondle women sexually without consent as they slept. It was a rule at the camps that female dormitories remain unlocked. On one occasion the women and girls decided enough was enough and collectively chased the man who was ultimately hidden by his male comrades. This solidarity against one man is impossible without the women understanding that they were in danger and vulnerable when facing that danger as individuals. They had to work together, based on some shared values to deal with the situation. MK combatants such as Thenjiwe Mtintso and other prominent feminist figures of the liberation movement have continued feminist work in democratic South Africa. Forms of solidarity and friendship between Kuzwayo and Tlhabi play themselves out in *Khwezi.* I remember I had an informal conversation about this research with a feminism studies lecturer in a workshop/retreat space. She shared with me that some feminists feel Tlhabi made the book more about herself than Kuzwayo's ordeal and life. For one, the biography is written in an affective language and Tlhabi breaks into countless philosophical interludes. I propose a different interpretation. *Khwezi* was a very difficult story to read. I cannot imagine how difficult this story must have been to write for someone who had become a friend, Kuzwayo and Tlhabi's text message exchanges went far beyond the scope of the biography. Tlhabi writes that she was at some point made uncomfortable by the former president by an unexpected sexual advance. This is another

commonality these women share; and this experience strengthened Tlhabi's conviction about Kuzwayo's experience. Accepting affective writing and periods of philosophizing as symptoms of solidarity and affection, I want to look at how the personal story in South African biographies offers necessary interventions in national discourses.

In his Ph.D. thesis on autobiography and ideology in South African life writing, Thengamehlo Ngwenya argues that "there is a relationship between autobiographical self-portraiture and the collective interests, values, and attitudes of particular social groups in South Africa. Therefore, most South African autobiographies are more concerned with the articulation of collective consciousness than with the celebration of individual talents and achievements" (v). He shows us that Black women's autobiographies can work towards activist ends. In *Khwezi* the biographer indicts the South African public for actively and passively enabling the abuse and re-traumatizing of Kuzwayo. Tlhabi's use of language and structure of the biography reflects not only affinity to Kuzwayo and a desire to treat her memory with dignity but also a sort of manifesto.

This manifesto would anticipate shared experiences, familiarity with discourses (academic and popular), and a desire for justice. This anticipation of shared discourses brings to mind Lauren Berlant's concept of intimate publics. Berlant posits that "what makes a public sphere intimate is an expectation that the consumers of its particular stuff already share a worldview and emotional knowledge that they have derived from a broadly common historical experience" (viii). I want to imagine auto/biographical feminist literature as an intimate public. Both the subject and biographer in *Khwezi* identify as feminists and the book is clear on its desire for justice for Kuzwayo. Berlant tells us that "an intimate public operates when a market opens up to a bloc of consumers, claiming to circulate texts and things that express those people's particular core interests and desires […] participants in the intimate public feel as though it expresses what is common among them" (5). These ideological desires and forms of recognition carry more weight than marketability in theory. She further argues that participants of an intimate public are "marked by a commonly lived history; its narratives and things are deemed expressive of that history while also shaping its conventions of belonging; and expressing the sensational, embodied experience of living as a certain kind of being in the world" (viii). We have already hinted that sexual violence is an epidemic in South Africa (see *Rape a South African Nightmare*). There are communities, formal and informal, that have formed to tackle sexual abuse.

What happens to the women exiled, both in the liberation movement and post-1994 ANC's dreams of freedom? In "'No Longer in Future Heaven': Women and Nationalism in South Africa" Anne McClintock outlines the different roles women played in the liberation movement and the construction of Afrikaner nationalism. She writes that "at the outset, women were denied formal representation […] Gradually, as a result of women's own insurrections, the need for women's full participation in the national liberation movement was granted, but women's emancipation was still figured as the handmaiden of the national revolution" (117). From this history women were relegated to secondary positions and in some ways linked to prominent male liberation icons as mother figures. This must have excluded some women who did not fit the criteria of the mother and were not linked to male icons. Similarly, Nira Yuval-Davis argues that "as a general rule, [national] collectives are composed of family units" (628), within this nationalist construction women exist as reproducers of the nation and although they are framed as existing as citizens, they are usually secondary citizens. To oversimplify what Yuval-Davis is arguing in "Gender and Nation", women are relegated to the domestic sphere and their sexual behaviour determines the value of the nation (627). Women who function as mothers in the family unit have greater value in nationalist imaginaries. To simplify again, the value of the nation is equivalent to the desirability and morality of its women. These categorise exiled women who did not symbolically fit the mother archetype in the liberation movement and continue to marginalize them post-apartheid. Zuma, because of his masculine performances, was a more legitimate ethnonational citizen than Kuzwayo. What happens to Kuzwayo's citizenship when she seeks asylum in the Netherlands? As Yuval-Davis argues, women's citizenship is dual, in that they are included and excluded (621). We have one of the most celebrated constitutions in the world where gender equality is a chief category, yet women continue to face different forms of exclusion and exile.

Conclusion

This chapter focused on reflections on the Jacob Zuma rape trial in biographical representations of Zuma. The two biographies (curiously both published by Jonathan Ball Publishers) emerged at different times in Zuma's political life. *Zuma* is published in 2008 at a time when the former

president had solidified his reputation as the "Teflon Don"[16]. He faced multiple obstacles in the early 2000s ranging from corruption charges to rape charges in his ambition for the ANC presidency. The newer biography is published in 2017, towards the twilight of Zuma's presidency. Both journalists are clear on their relationships with the subjects of their biography. Tlhabi is a feminist who grew to consider Kuzwayo as a friend. Gordin is an admirer of Zuma. However, in his later life, he had grown disillusioned with corruption in the country and advised his children to be like their [Jewish] ancestors and not fear migrating.[17] Sadly, Gordin lost his life in what seemed like a botched robbery in his Johannesburg home (see footnote above). Whereas in a biography about a woman written by a woman, sexual violence is a magnetic pull that weaves the life story, in the biography about a man written by a man, it is collapsed with other issues as an obstacle to overcome. In *Khwezi* other important factors surface, among them the histories of sexual violence in liberation camps and the necessity of gendered solidarity. These are not lost in democratic South Africa where feminists of the liberation struggle such as Mtintso continue the work. As such, Kuzwayo's life story shows that apartheid cannot be collectively 'remembered' without recognizing and bringing to the surface the history of violence in liberation movements and the persistence of violent masculinity after the Zuma trial. In Gordin's portrait, Kuzwayo's allegations against Zuma are seen as a continuation of an attempt to undermine Zuma, borne from CODESA negotiations. This narrative is accepted by some factions of the South African general public. This would be one of the main conspiracy theories touted by the former president. I have proposed reading the cyclic ruptures of time that make 'moving past' sexual violence impossible in *Khwezi* as a feminine melancholic time. On the other end, Zuma's biographer conflates the former president's personal life story with the story of the nation inseparable from the liberation movement. In the grand scheme of things, Kuzwayo's accusation is presented as both an obstacle for the president to overcome and the defendant's fault for failing to act appropriately. Without overgeneralizing, I want to imagine the two biographies as a microcosm for the place of sexual violence in South African feminist and masculinist imaginaries.

[16] "Teflon Don", meaning "someone who manages to avoid criticism and keep a good reputation after they have done something wrong" (see Cambridge dictionary online) is a reference to Zuma popular with journalists. Some examples include https://mg.co.za/article/2017-04-04-teflon-don-zuma-emerges-victorious-again/ ; https://mg.co.za/article/2017-05-29-van-rooyen-sings-the-teflon-dons-praises-zuma-is-a-hero/ ; https://iono.fm/e/893526 ; https://www.politicsweb.co.za/news-and-analysis/zuma-dont-mess-with-the-teflon-man.

[17] Visit Times of Israel; https://www.timesofisrael.com/south-african-jewish-journalist-jeremy-gordin-murdered-in-home-burglary-at-70/

Chapter Two: Hypersexuality and the Slipperiness of Parodic Commentary in Artistic Portraits of Zuma

Introduction

In this chapter, I consider the slipperiness of parody in visual representations of Zuma. In his book *Custer Died for Your Sins*, Vine Deloria proposes that "irony and satire provide much keener insights into a group's collective psyche and values than do years of research" (149). Deloria's view is an interesting point of departure because he belongs to and writes about subaltern Native Americans. Similar to Deloria's perspectives, in this chapter we look at the functions of laughter in a country historically defined by racial separation and tension. This chapter is interested in some of the bridges and negotiations satire and the grotesque form between a dominant 'centre' and an unstable 'other'. Here we think of the centre as whiteness or Eurocentric ideologies which spread rapidly during Enlightenment and colonial modernity creating a racial hierarchy where whiteness as a racial and cultural category was superior to the other. I study four artists' visual portrayals of Zuma: Zapiro's "Rape of Lady Justice," Brett Murray's "The Spear", Anton Kannemeyer's "R is For Respect," and Ayanda Mabulu's "Umshini Wam." The oldest among these is "The Rape of Lady Justice" published in 2006 prior to Zuma's ascent to the ANC presidency and the most recent is "R is For Respect". There are ways that the artworks work by utilizing the metaphor of the exaggerated phallus and other symbols to poignantly outline some problematic associations with the former president. In this chapter, I argue that although these works of art present a democratic façade – enjoying the constitutional liberties to criticize and "speak truth to power"—, the reach of the metaphor is limited when the visual artworks draw on a racialized repertoire of representation. The operative interest is who is laughing and who is being laughed at and what can we learn from that laughter.

Constructivism, Signifying Practices, and Carnival Laughter

Building on some of the foundations laid out in the theoretical framework in the first chapter, I draw on Hall's observation that the interpreter will always read artistic representations beyond the extent to which they reflect their environment/s or the undoubted intention of their creators. On constructivism in literary texts, German literary theorist Hans Robert Jauss, of the Konstanz

school posits that "a new text evokes for the reader (listener) the horizon of expectations and rules familiar from earlier texts, which are then varied, corrected, altered, or even just reproduced" (Jauss qtd. in De Man 23). Texts are never fundamentally 'new'. New texts are a skilful combination of what already exists. All texts are inspired by antecedent texts whether consciously or subconsciously. All these texts work with codes and conventions. Visual arts are themselves visual texts that are written and read in well-developed languages. Meaning is constructed through triangulation between the author, the work with its codes and languages, and the audience. In the influential "The Death of the Author" Roland Barthes argues against literary criticism's notion of "ultimate meaning". He argues that meaning is varied and dependent on historical factors. This chapter will thus read the chosen artworks by taking into consideration what they do as they circulate in publics and the histories they are in conversation with. Although artist interviews and responses to backlash across different media remain in consideration, this chapter accepts that the construction of meaning supersedes "intended" meaning. Once artistic representations are publicized they become independent entities. That is, the artist's intentions which, for the artworks chosen, have been publicized through numerous interviews, articles, etc. will remain secondary. The primary consideration will be the art and the traditions the art feeds into, inadvertently or otherwise.

Constructing meaning is dependent on an understanding of the language/s the works of art speak. In the productive work on signifying practices, Hall reads Saussure to provide the following review of signs, the signifier and the signified:

> For Saussure according to Jonathan Culler (1978, p. 19), the production of meaning depends on language […] There was, he argued, the form (the actual word, image, photo, etc.), and there was the idea or concept in your head which the form was associated, Saussure called the first element, the *signifier*, and the second element - the corresponding concept in your head—the *signified*. Both are required to produce meaning but it is the relation between them, fixed by our cultural and linguistic codes, which sustains representation (*The Work of Representation* 31, original emphasis).

In this school culture is a system of shared meaning where meaning is created and distributed through language. The basic elements of language are signs. Signs work on two levels, the first is denotative, what he refers to as the form and the second is the connotative which is how the

form directs our imagination. The first is the signifier and the second is the signified. The two work in tandem. Considering the importance of images in social formations, in his study of Cameroonian cartoons, Achille Mbembe argues that the "image is always a conventional comment, the transcription of a reality, a word, a vision, or an idea into a visible code that becomes, in turn, a manner of speaking of the world and inhabiting it" (*On the Postcolony* 142). Images speak in codes and these visual codes script our lives. When we draw on Hall's work on signifying practices for this chapter, the signifier is the erect and exaggerated penis and the signified is supposed African hypersexuality, which in turn carries further connotations of wild and animal-like sexual passion and violence. When we trace the signifying practices in South African visual arts, I argue that the chosen artworks are not unique and separate episodes in South African visual culture; they are part of a language and culture that is founded on historical conditions. This repertoire of representation and its implications are symbolically violent.

We have thus far established two legs of a triangular theoretical framework pivot. The first is constructivism and the second is signifying practices. In the introduction to this chapter, I hinted at an interest in the politics of laughter. That is an entry point to the third leg of our theoretical framework pivot which is Bakhtin's notion of the carnivalesque. Bakhtin's theories on satire and parody are presented in the influential *Rabelais and His World*. In studying the carnival influences of François Rabelais as a satirist and master of parody, Bakhtin argues that "carnival is not a spectacle seen by the people; they live in it, and everyone participates because its very idea embraces all the people […] It has a universal spirit; it is a special condition of the entire world" (7). Bakhtin's interest is in the ways that carnival laughter was at his time an understudied aspect of the medieval period and the construction of its social strata. According to Bakhtin, the medieval carnival was a space where feudal and other hierarchical structures were suspended. Carnival laughter has three qualities: it is festive – it is not an "individual reaction to some isolated 'comic' event" (Bakhtin 11); secondly, carnival laughter is universal – "it is directed at all and everyone, including the carnival's participants" (ibid.); and finally, this laughter is ambivalent: "it is gay, triumphant, and at the same time mocking, deriding" (ibid.). The first two qualities of carnival laughter, its festivity and universality, are of interest to this chapter. I think of the medieval carnival as a pagan spectacle of the grotesque. In similar ways, the visual arts studied herein rely on shocking audiences through a disregard for societal norms. What is interesting about Bakhtin's carnival laughter is there are no footlights, he tells us there are no distinctions between actors and spectators (ibid.). What happens when there is a clear distinction between actor and spectator?

One of the admirable characteristics of the medieval carnival is that it runs parallel to the officialdom. In this space where the medieval caste system is suspended, an inclusive atmosphere emerges, where the power dynamics between the actor and the spectator are equally yoked — the spectator is equally the actor. In contrast with this ideal and real atmosphere, Bakhtin further tells us that:

> The satirist whose laughter is negative places himself above the object of his mockery, he is opposed to it. The wholeness of the world's comic aspect is destroyed, and that which appears comic becomes a private reaction. The people's ambivalent laughter, on the other hand, expresses the point of view of the whole world; he who is laughing also belongs to it (12).

In effect, Bakhtin notes that modern satire can be negative. Grant Julin offers the following reading of this negative satire:

> Consequently, satire that waters down the universalism of the people's festive laughter – i.e. is directed at a specific group and does not include those who mock – will be considered destructive in this framework. In addition, the inclusive nature of positive satire must be polyphonous, providing a balanced representation of the multiplicity of voices implicated in the piece, especially those that challenge the satirist. Unlike destructive satire, which presents its object of mockery in crude and/or over-simplified manner – most often through reinforcing grotesque cultural stereotypes – constructive satire is nuanced in its depiction of its target (Julin 159).

One of the clear takeaways from the four artworks studied is the ways that the laughter was not universal. The paintings and the cartoons offended and mocked not only an individual but a specific group. Whereas in carnival laughter the clown is a multi-layered actor who exerts influence on spectators, Zuma in these artworks is a figure of ridicule who has been reduced to some of the most persistent cultural stereotypes about Black men.

The Stereotype of African Hypersexuality and Debates on Respect

In looking at the visual artworks chosen for this chapter we have established the three concepts that will direct our perspectives: constructivism, signifying practices, and the carnivalesque. On top of these foundational ideas is the theme of stereotyped African hypersexuality.

To further unpack Peiretti-Courtis insights previewed in the introduction chapter, medical literature from Enlightenment to colonial modernity proposed that while Africans were slaves to hypersexuality with exaggerated sexual organs, European brains showed superiority in the growth of the organs associated with reason. As such "with a Negro's intellectual organs being less developed, their genitalia acquire greater preponderance and extension" (*Gazette Medical de Paris* in Peiretti-Courtis 265). This historic Eurocentric anxiety about African sexuality is where my interest in the hyper-sexualization of Zuma in visual arts begins. Peiretti-Courtis' work shows that in the period from Enlightenment to colonial modernity, these stereotypes were accepted as scientific fact. In the first chapter, I have outlined the ways Zuma appears as sexually predatory in life-writing. In the next chapter, in tune with the "contestations" in the research report's title, we consider the ways Zuma's spectacular masculinity symbolised by his penis is a feature of his politics reinforced in different genres of music creating nationalist imaginaries where women are often times marginalized. In this chapter, we look at the exaggerated phallus metaphor as a double-edged sword: although it arguably uses satire and the grotesque to critique predatory abuse of power, it simultaneously reproduces persistent and violent stereotypes.

I must begin by acknowledging that mainstream debates against the hypersexualization of Zuma are generally variations of ideas on 'African morals' and its cultures of respect - which are heteropatriarchal and ageist. For instance, the ANC Women's League, in their response to "The Spear", argued across multiple media that it was disrespectful to represent Zuma — an old and married man who is a father —in such a crude manner. In this logic, respect is due to Zuma by virtue of being a father and husband. In an interesting counter to these arguments, Simphiwe Sesanti argues that:

> A critical examination of the concept of 'respect' in the African cultural context reveals that historically, in traditional Africa, 'respect' was not equated to obsequiousness by citizens in their encounter with power. Sycophancy and submission in the face of power were invoked in the name of a falsified version of African culture by postcolonial power-hungry dictators (343).

These cultural foundations of respect are, as Sesanti argues, incorrectly transferred to men in government. In this context, respect for government relies heavily on the negotiation between the logics and values of the nation-state and ethnocultural wisdom, which in turn assumes some

unspoken codes and scripts. In their study of *ukuhlonipha* (the act of respect in Zulu culture), Judith Irvine and Liz Gunner think of *ukuhlonipha* as somatic and semiotic; it is both in the use of language and in the ways one who is culturally subordinate presents themselves to authority. They argue that "not only royal and politically important men, but all respectable older men were hlonipha'd by younger men […] A younger man always hlonipha'd an older one, even though both had headrings. Even youth hlonipha'd one another— i.e., the younger, the older ones" (190-191). Drawing from the work of Irvine and Gunner, *inhlonipho* is gendered and ageist; married men and women, and esteemed men within Zulu societies are treated with *inhlonipho*. Sesanti extends Irvine and Gunner's study by arguing the Zuma case shows cynical evocation of indigenous protocols of respect by a man who has behaved disreputably; when in traditional framing, the expectation of inhlonipo went hand in hand with the obligation to behave with the dignity befitting one's status effectively making one a natural embodiment of inhlonipho or a hlonipheka'd person. Consulting Zulu culture gains relevance when we consider the ways Zuma presents himself as a Zulu cultural man – semiotically and somatically. Irvine and Gunner's findings are not unique to the Zulu among the Nguni. Their findings are useful in thinking with expectation for Zuma as an old man, a father, a husband, and an accomplished political figure whose genitals should not be the subject of mockery. The debates below attempt to move beyond contestations on 'African morals' and respect or a tug-of-war between Euro-American logics and African epistemology. Instead, I focus on how negative iconography that was fundamental in colonial repertoires of representations, along with their foundations and implications, are reproduced in the selected cultural portrayals of Jacob Zuma. This is reminiscent of the "iconic continuities" Andrew Mason introduces in his study of "The Rape of Lady Justice".

"The Rape of Lady Justice"

With the three sides of my pivot constructed and with the main theme of 'African hypersexuality' outlined, I begin my foray into the artworks with the earliest of the works and the most fruitful point of entry: "The Rape of Lady Justice". Jonathan Shapiro who is popularly known as Zapiro is a South African cartoonist whose satirical commentary is published in numerous newspapers. In their 2007 profile for the *American Political Science Association,* Thomas Koelbe and Steven Robins praise him as the most influential South African cartoonist. Commenting on his legacy, they reflect that his:

> Cartoons have also appeared in international publications and he or his work has been featured in everything from highbrow newspapers to the front page of real estate advertisement magazines [...] His particular wrath is reserved for African National Congress ANC figures who have, in his view, defiled the principles of the liberation movement (315).

Before we proceed, I must acknowledge that Zapiro has been a political satirist since the 1980s and was vocal in using satire to lampoon apartheid era leadership in ways that placed his anti-apartheid sentiments on the same ideological side as the ANC. He, as a popular cartoonist, encourages dialogue at different stages and levels. "The Rape of Lady Justice" was published in *The Sunday Times* on September 7, 2008. In the cartoon, Zapiro portrays Gwede Mantashe, Blade Nzimande, Julius Malema, and Zwelinzima Vavi physically overpower "Lady Justice", the icon Zapiro introduced in his cartoons in 1994 – the year South Africa became a democratic country under the presidency of Nelson Mandela. Mantashe encourages Zuma to "go for it". The four figures, Zuma's accomplices, occupied influential positions in the tripartite alliance (ANC, SACP (South African Communist Party), and COSATU (Congress of South African Trade Unions)) and the ANC Youth League. All of these figures were some of Zuma's most vocal and influential supporters in his race for the presidency of the ANC and his battle against forces which his faction perceived as antagonistic to his ambitions. On the denotative level, this cartoon depicts five African men ready to sexually violate a blindfolded Black woman. The erect penis signifier is not visible to the viewer but we can assume its existence as Zuma unbuttons his pants and gazes at the pinned down Lady Justice. On the connotative level, the cartoon not only invokes Zuma's past as an accused rapist but also the ways the five figures are conspiring to defile the strides that Nelson Mandela and his government have made in building a democratic South Africa – they are getting ready to "rape" the 'new' South African justice system.

Figure 1



"The Rape of Lady Justice"

(Shapiro, 2006)

Why does one of South Africa's most experienced satirists choose to represent these figures in such a violent fashion? In an address to about hundred-and-fifty students at Cape Peninsula University of Technology three years after the rape trial, Malema is quoted as suggesting that "when a woman didn't enjoy it [sexual intercourse], she leaves early in the morning. Those who had a nice time will wait until the sun comes out, request breakfast and ask for taxi money"(Lewis and Makinana n.p). This suggests that because of her actions following the encounter, it was not rape; Kuzwayo 'enjoyed' herself. Malema later apologized for his comments, recognizing the violence of his statement. The figures in the cartoon are all cisgender heterosexual men who in their positions and their support for Zuma, showed no sympathy for Kuzwayo. This support was enjoyed by Zuma regardless of the rape allegation and questions about his possible complicity in corruption through his association with the convicted Shabir Shaik. Along with apathy for women, these figures show disregard for the South African constitution.

Here is where the metaphor fails. In his comparison between “The Rape of Lady Justice” and William Cruikshank’s “All among the Hottentots capering to shore 1820” (1819) Andrew Mason poignantly argues that:

> Zapiro’s Zuma caricature, with its domed, misshapen head, bulging eyes, and menacing teeth, is intriguingly similar to the menacing 'Hottentots' in Cruikshank's cannibal cartoon, which also have domed, misshapen heads […] Both Cruikshank's cannibal cartoon and Zapiro’s rape of Justice cartoon present a moment preceding an imagined moment of sexual violation. [Cartoons in this tradition] carry forward the message implicit in Cruikshank’s cartoon: that a terrible retribution, symbolized by the acts of rape and cannibalism, or by the experience of being swamped or crushed under a mass of blackness, will ultimately be exacted upon the descendants of British and European settlers in Africa (38-39)

One of the most important takeaways in Mason’s comparison is iconic continuities from Cruikshank to Zapiro. These continuities, particularly the African as a hypersexual beast are founded on racist anxieties. In the earlier work, the ‘Hottentots’ are featured as ogres, in the latter work, “The Rape of Lady Justice”, Zuma’s reptile-like features are more subtle but the dangerousness of the African remains. Whereas in the former the beastly dangerousness of the African threatens the civility of the European colonist, in the latter, as Lady Justice is a Black woman, the dangerousness of the African threatens the African’s adopted civility. The rape is an anticipated act and Lady Justice is helpless. The cartoon utilises stereotypes of Black masculinity and feminine helplessness. Like Mason, in his study of the responses to “The Rape of Lady Justice”, Daniel Hammet argues that the claim that Zapiro perpetuated the image of "blacks as sexual predators" shows a colonial legacy associated with the construction of masculinity and femininity (93).

Both Zuma and the 'Hottentots' are beneath human, where "humanness" is a racially informed category, in their portrayals. When we think about their physical attributes physiognomically, there is something innately dangerous about both. While in Cruickshank’s drawing the ‘Hottentots’ are unidentified and undifferentiated and thus plainly racist, the portrayal of Zuma considers his biography. Although Zuma’s biography is fact, Zapiro overlooks the limitations of the metaphor in a society overdetermined by historic racial tension. In other words, Zuma’s caricature’s similarity with the portrayal of the ‘Hottentots’ rehashes an old violent stereotype

of the African as other and always potentially dangerous. Zapiro's questionable representational choices are not limited to "The Rape of Lady Justice". In an earlier cartoon titled "mshini wam" published on March 9, 2006, Zuma holds a machine gun, spewing out bullets that look like sperm (see Mason). He stands in front of a courtroom, and on the steps of the courtroom stands Lady Justice, peeking out from under her blindfolds with a dejected look on her face, as if anticipating impending rape. Returning to Peiretti-Courtis, this feeds into the rhetoric of wild African sexuality.

Figure 2



"All among the Hottentots capering to shore 1820"

(Cruikshank, 1819)

Zapiro received backlash for trivializing rape in the cartoon strip[18]. In *Rape: A South African Nightmare* Pumla Dineo Gqola unpacks the complex relationship South Africa has with rape by paying attention to the patterns and trends of rape, asking what we can learn from famous

[18] "Cartoonist Defends Right to Satirize South African President". *Canadian Broadcasting Corporation*, 2009, https://www.cbc.ca/news/entertainment/cartoonist-defends-right-to-satirize-south-african-president-1.824104. Accessed 17 Feb. 2023.

van Hoorn, Imke. "Zapiro in Zuma Cartoon Uproar". *Mail & Guardian*, 2008, https://mg.co.za/article/2008-09-08-zapiro-in-zuma-cartoon-uproar/, Accessed 17 Feb. 2023.

cases and why South Africa is losing the battle against rape. In a study of the cartoon's reception, Mason posits that others were opposed to the representational choices because "having seen the cartoon, [they] were unable to view it as a metaphorical comment about an abstract concept, but instead saw it as the depiction of a real rape" (51). *The Sunday Times* is a widely circulated newspaper in South Africa. Zapiro's metaphor is set up in a country facing an epidemic of sexual violence. There have been many debates on the balance between artistic freedom and the depiction of a rape scene with the history of sexual violence and its omnipresence in South African society[19]. The "Rape of Lady Justice" is an act of representational violence because the metaphor might be lost to certain South African populations and the cartoon would be received on a denotative level, as a rape scene, and might prove to be a trigger for survivors of sexual violence.

"The Spear", "R is for Respect", and "Umshini Wam"

Here are a few facts concerning Zuma's sexual encounter with Fezekile Kuzwayo. The first is that Zuma and Kuzwayo's father, Judson, were comrades and close friends in exile. Kuzwayo saw Zuma as an uncle, acquired kin. The second is that Zuma officially and unofficially suggested that Kuzwayo seduced him by her choice of dress – a khanga cloth. In the first, Zuma has not only betrayed Fezekile Kuzwayo but the whole Kuzwayo family. One would imagine that with Judson Kuzwayo dying while Fezekile was in her pre-teen years, acquired kin such as Zuma were the de-facto father figures. According to Kuzwayo's account, Zuma visited her in the guest bedroom. This is a woman who is comfortable enough to wear just a khanga in a house she feels safe in. Somehow, that ease and feeling at home is interpreted as seduction. When asked about having unprotected sex with an openly HIV-positive Kuzwayo, Zuma claimed that he took a shower. Hassim tells us that:

> In creating this work, then, Murray was commenting very explicitly on the figure of Zuma as the embodiment of the collapsed story of a democratic teleology, the president as the personification of a dream turned nightmare. And part of that collapse—the tragic flaw in Zuma's presidency, as it were—is the extent to which

[19] Hassim, Shireen. "Violent Modernity: Gender, Race, and Bodies in Contemporary South African Politics". *Politikon,* vol. 41, no. 2, 2014, pp. 167-182.

> his sexual relationships have continually surfaced in public debate ("Violent Modernity" 170).

Hail to the Thief II worked as an exhibition in the ways it protested the betrayal of liberation ideals. Although the most popular painting targeted Zuma as an individual, the exhibition indicted the ANC as an organization. These are the facts that we must consider in our arguments and be appreciative of how the painting works.

What are the limitations of the metaphor? "The Spear" sparked debates similar to Zapiro's cartoon. Like "The Rape of Lady Justice", its problematics are entangled between colonial history, racism, and sexualization. Brett Murray's acrylic on canvas painting depicts the former president in a Vladimir Lenin-esque pose with his genitals exposed. The painting was first displayed in Murray's 2012 exhibition *Hail to the Thief II.* The ANC filed a lawsuit against Murray and the painting was vandalized where it was displayed at the Goodman Gallery. Apart from alluding to the 1967 painting of Lenin, the spear also alludes to uMkhonto we Sizwe/ The Spear of the Nation, the military wing of the ANC. Analysing the painting and its responses Shireen Hassim notes that:

> In its portrayal of Zuma as a potent phallic leader, the painting unmistakably alluded to the sexual life of the President, who was tried and cleared of rape in 2006, is polygynously married to four women, has fathered approximately 19 children, of whom at least two were conceived out of polygynous wedlock ("Violent Modernity" 169).

There are three important issues alluded to by the painting: the SACP's leftist rhetoric as part of the ANC alliance, along with its armed anti-apartheid resistance, the sexual history of the former president, and his polygamy. Exemplified by the vocal resistance by Ibandla lamaNazaretha (Shembe church) as noted by Hassim, most of the outrage at Murray's painting was along lines of cultures of respect. Conservative forces within the ANC along with other traditionally aligned stakeholders such as Ibandla lamaNazaretha viewed this phallic representation of Zuma as immoral and undignified. This resistance is not premised on Zuma's role as the president of the state and the ANC but on him being a father and a married man. Hassim argues that a critical reading of the responses to the painting retrospectively reveals that it did not matter what was said, what mattered is who said it. For her, discourses on the painting were a reminder of the ways the idea of a democratic South Africa is constructed along

patriarchal and sexist lines. Hassim argues that as the debates around the painting became racialized — who can represent who and how — this moment surfaced "deep-seated anxieties about the post-apartheid social order [and] exposed the extent to which the racialized past remained deeply imprinted in the present" ("Violent Modernity" 172). For Hassim, the reactions, official and otherwise, revealed two flaws of democratic South Africa: the first is the ways that racial anxiety remains deep-seated and the second is the ways the discourses on 'respectability' revealed patriarchal and sexist sensitivities. Hassim's arguments are meritorious. However, when we read the painting as part of a canon where the erect penis is a signifier, new and problematic paradigms to the debates emerge. The controversial feature in the painting was the president's erect and exaggerated penis. When Murray's exhibition was vandalized on May 22, 2012, the two men arrested: Barend le Grange and Lowie Mabokela painted a red cross over the depiction of Zuma's face and his genitalia. From this, it would seem these men were offended by the depiction of the former president's genitalia.

The traditional Zulu weapons of war are the spear and the shield. The former military wing of the ANC is named after the spear (umkhonto). It is the spear that attacks the enemy. What Murray does well in the painting is the allusion to the penis being the spear. The first chapter of this study discussed sexual violence in liberation camps and the cultures of silence that followed such violence. The phallus is a spear in the ways that predatory sexuality marked gender differences in liberation camps where mostly women were perpetually in danger of sexual violence. That dynamic continues in the post-liberation ANC with for example the encounter between Zuma and Kuzwayo. (The spectacular visibility and the celebration of this symbolic spear, fundamental in Zuma's politics, will be explored further in the final chapter of this study).

The three most ardent support groups for the president during his trial were Ibandla lamaNazaretha, Mkhonto we Sizwe Military Veterans Association, and the ANC Women's League (see "Violent Modernity"; Tjale). The painting, reproduced in the *City Press* newspaper, horrified some readers, who were equally horrified by the president's sexual conduct. One way of understanding this is by returning to Irvine and Gunner's *inhlonipho/isihlonipho*. Data collected by the two researchers through interviews shows that even though some linguistic and embodied practices of *ukuhlonipha* are most prevalent in rural South Africa, there are ways the same principles are observed in urban and peri-urban South Africa. Zuma is a married man with children, some of his children are themselves married. He is a father-in-law/*ubabezala*.

Portraying a father figure, and political and cultural leader, in such an explicit manner, was shocking for many South Africans from certain cultural backgrounds. However, the demands for *inhlonipho* become complicated when Zuma himself contravened the protocols of self-respect and sexual restraint, both as a leader, an elder, and someone Kuzwayo grew up considering to be acquired kin.

Figure 3



"The Spear"

(Murray, 2010)

I want to now retain the same ideas from Murray and move to Kannemeyer whose cartoon responds to criticism against "The Spear" et. al. Kannemeyer's entrance into these debates through artwork shows clear solidarity with Murray and a strong defence for artistic expression. In "R is for Respect," Black bodies are in protest holding a banner that reads "RESPECT FOR THE PRESIDENT'S PENIS NOW!" while a large drawing of an erect black penis appears above them. The painting appears in Kannemeyer's fifth solo exhibition *E is for Exhibition* staged at the Stevenson Gallery. Conventionally, block letters suggest exclamation. This is reinforced by the exclamation mark and the visibly aggressive protestors. In the painting, the penis has moved from being the most pronounced identifier of the former president, seen in earlier paintings, to being his sole representation. Interestingly, the figures who are protesting

for the respect of the president's penis are mostly male, young, and exclusively Black. I consider this to be Kannemeyer's summary of the resistance to "The Spear": hypermasculine, male, young, Black, violent/angry, and mindless. Reviewing the exhibition for *Africanah*, Athi Mongezeleli Joja writes that the artist's works are

> A series of painterly caricatures, typical of his now tired tricks, [and] a desperate grasp for critical practice, which simply trades insults. Like a little karaoke of insulated white liberals, at odds with the ruling party's gross administration, the resident sings the club's favourite tunes to an enchanted audience falling off chairs in stitches" (n.p.).

Joja harshly suggests that Kannemeyer's artistry is "tired". It relies on safe and continuously recycled iconography and representational strategies that appeal to a certain public – here suggested to be white liberals. If we return to Bakhtin's study of medieval carnivals, one of the characteristics highlighted in this chapter is a rejection of the medieval caste system. Joja locates Kannemeyer's audience as both white (race) and liberal (politics). In the context of a South African society where access to resources is historically racialised and gendered, class is also implied in Joja's criticism. We have now moved away from the possibilities of positive laughter and entered the realm of negative satire. This laughter is not festive, in a sense, not everyone finds this grotesque funny. And thus, this laughter is not universal – it alienates those who identify themselves as belonging to the group that is being mocked yet they are not figures in authority themselves. The exhibition was an antithesis of the ways satire can offer interesting political criticism. The exhibition space is traditionally a space where there are clear power inequities between the subject and the audience. For Bakhtin, negative laughter places the artist above the subject of ridicule. One of the enduring criticisms against the former president is his lack of formal education. Apart from being an artist, Kannemeyer is an academic who has lectured at the University of Pretoria and the Stellenbosch University – these are two institutions with a complicated history as beacons of white supremacy and Afrikaner nationalism in South Africa. The visitors of the upmarket Stevenson Gallery, where the exhibition was curated, are themselves educated. This presents us with a hierarchy of cultural capital. One would be tempted to view this cartoon as representing an educated white artist ridiculing a Black politician without formal education by employing one of the most persistent racist symbols, the exaggerated penis.

Figure 4



"R is for Respect"

(Kannemeyer, 2015)

I was prompted to look at "R is for Respect" alongside one of the most popular photographs from the 1976 Soweto Uprising. In the internationally recognised photograph by Sam Nzima, an emotional Sam Makhubo carries the bullet-riddled body of twelve-year-old Hector Peterson while the latter's sister runs alongside them. The students in 1976 were resisting the apartheid regime's language policy. Turning South Africa into a state where Afrikaans is a widely spoken language, the primary language of instruction would have furthered and strengthened Afrikaner nationalism. The students were not only resisting the language policy, but they were also significantly resisting the ideology of Afrikaner superiority. The ANC Youth League was founded by the same individuals who founded uMkhonto we Sizwe. In a controversial episode in 2008, Malema told a crowd in Thaba Nchu during a Youth Day address that "We [the youth of South Africa] are prepared to die for Zuma. We are prepared to kill for Zuma" (*M & G* n.p). Zuma was in attendance. Malema's utterances were met with applause and laughter. Malema called for the national investigative unit popularly known as the Scorpions, founded by former

President Thabo Mbeki to investigate and prosecute high-profile crimes including corruption, to drop their case against Zuma. He also asked all those opposed to Zuma to leave the Party. In Malema's YL, Zuma was not only above South African law, but he was also above the ANC. Youth organising, historically significant as an anti-apartheid and anti-state organ, was in Zuma's rape case in the service of a single man and his political ambitions. There is a lot that Kannemeyer conveys well in his painting.

As above mentioned, both *Hail to the Thief II* and *E is for Exhibition* were exhibited in upmarket spaces – Parkwood (Goodman Gallery) and Parktown North (Stevenson Gallery) respectively. In her work on the "Exhibitionary Affect", which reads exhibition spaces through affect theory, Jennifer Fisher argues that exhibition studies do not consider the realms of the "non-representational and extra-discursive'' (27). She further argues that "the transmission of affect, while originating in the social, impacts on the subjects biologically and physically, including both the visual and non-visual senses […] affect may be invisible, yet it foregrounds energies that are as certain as electricity" (28). For Fisher, exhibitions carry an ambiance that is informed by histories of their space. Exhibition spaces "connect members of its audience through the generation of particular sensibilities" (ibid.). What does it mean then for these two paintings to be exhibited in spaces that are located in Parktown, the historical home of the Randlords? What does it mean for the audiences that, according to Joja, have normalized these representations of [African] political figures? Satire in these instances becomes a slippery method of representation. It recreates problematic power relations – who is looking, how are they looking, and who is being looked at?

One would be forgiven for thinking this is an elaborate attack on white South African artists who have attempted to draw or paint Zuma. I find similarly problematic signifiers in Ayanda Mabulu's "Umshini Wam". In the painting, a grimacing Zuma is painted in traditional regalia. A large erect penis with pronounced veins appears beneath Zuma's traditional dress, *ibheshu*. Zuma is in a Zulu warrior-dance pose, *uyagida*. On the top left of the canvas, the ANC emblem is drawn and covered by a question mark. In the top right corner of the painting appears a newspaper clipping of the 1976 Soweto Uprising with the words "How can you be dancing where people are dying of starvation" scrawled on. Unlike the two works above exhibited in high-end galleries, the painting was exhibited at the non-profit AVA Gallery. Mabulu in the painting displays an intersection of different issues. Among them is problematic masculinity that masquerades as a false representation and practice of African culture. The other is the

"death" of the ANC vis-à-vis its continuing irrelevance to poor South Africans exemplified by the question "How can you be dancing when poor people are dying", and finally, the 1976 clipping, which invokes the memory of those who sacrificed their lives for South Africa's liberation. In her review for the *Daily Maverick,* Rebecca Davis notes the continuities from "The Spear" to "Umshini Wam" as the erect and exaggerated penis overshadows everything else. The erect and exaggerated penis is front and centre — it demands all the attention. It is the ultimate stand-in for the former president.

In the first chapter, we looked at the ways Zuma misrepresented Zulu culture in constructing a public image. He addressed the court during his rape trial in Zulu and "100% Zuluboy" slogans were enjoyed by his supporters. In the final chapter, we will revisit the ways Zuma co-opted maskandi to galvanize Zulu solidarity and to some extent a Zulu nationalist affect. We will further unpack some of the ways Zuma gradually became an important figure in Zulu culture. His Zulu authenticity and fundamental relationship to Zulu culture is the cloak of his political body. He is pictured in multiple public ceremonies wearing his *ibheshu* (Zulu traditional regalia made from animal skin, commonly leopard skin, to cover the phallic region). Refusing to accept it as Zulu culture, some of the commentators gathered by the *Mail & Guardian* reject Zuma's claims on Zulu culture (see Sesanti). Sesanti argues that "Zuma's reference to Zulu culture as opposed to African culture was very calculated. First, it was a subtle ban on non-Zulus from commenting on the issue since they would be reluctant to speak about what they do not know. Second, it was meant to appeal to the sentiments of his ethnic group for sympathy and solidarity" (373). Mabulu offers a poignant visual commentary on the ways that Zuma employs Zulu/Zuma culture for selfish ends. His manipulative application of Zulu culture allows him the freedom to indulge himself. The *ibheshu* allegorically conceals an erect penis. Artists have defended their takes on the former president by claiming that the erect penis is a metaphor inspired by Zuma's public sexual life[20]. I have argued that the possibilities of the erect black penis acting as a metaphor in positive satire are limited.

[20] Visit https://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/zuma-penis-painter-explains-shock-tactics-1938633.

Figure 5



"Umshini Wam"

(Mabulu, 2012)

My view is influenced by Mbembe's arguments on the relationship between the sign, signifier, and the signified in cultures of southern Cameroon where he posits that:

> More precisely, the invisible was not only the other side of the visible, its mask, or its substitute. The invisible was in the visible, and vice versa, not as a matter of artifice, but as one and the same and as external reality simultaneously—as the image of the thing and the imagined thing, at the same time. In other words, the reverse of the world (the invisible) was supposed to be part and parcel of its obverse (the visible) and vice versa. (*On the Postcolony* 145).

In this excerpt, Mbembe writes on the "obverse" (the visible) or the object and its pictography, and the "reverse", the invisible or the abstract, these are signifier and the signified. The two are always entwined. For simplicity, I want to think of the exclamation mark as a sign. Through education and reinforcement, we interpret the exclamation mark as indicative of loud speech, for example, and not an upside-down stickman. Mbembe argues that the written word and photography are not two completely different systems of language. They are both, to an extent, arbitrary. The obverse and the reverse are formed through cultural imaginations informed by historic conditions. This complicates the extent to which the erect African penis can act as a

variable metaphor or the impossibility of reading artistic representations of the African penis outside the violent history of colonial modernity. Historical representations of the African's genitalia, whether pictographically or medically, have been inseparable from ideas of natural hypersexuality. Through centuries of reinforcement of the obverse, the pictographic representations of the erect black penis will always hint at the reverse – African savage sexuality which this chapter has argued to be stereotyped and violent. Because of this and although they employ different representational strategies, Cruikshank's "All the Hottentots" and Mabulu's "Umshini Wam" enact the same symbolic violence on their viewers. On the surface it seems they carry radically different messages: Cruikshank is racist, and it would seem Mabulu is progressive, but on closer scrutiny, both are problematic. The erect penis signifier reactivates historical racist stereotyping. In this way, it triggers outrage even from those who are opposed to Zuma's sexual conduct and manipulative application of Zulu culture. Cruikshank enforces this stereotype by drawing Africans as cannibals while in Mabulu's painting, although he has attempted to engage multiple issues, the erect and exaggerated black penis remains axially central.

Building on Bakhtin's work, Mbembe offers excellent insights in the much-cited "Notes on the Post-Colony" (1992). He looks at two countries, Togo and Cameroon, to propose the ways the body and the grotesque and obscene, including the phallus, was used to create languages that ridicule officialdom through clever tweaks of slogans, songs of praise, etc. Mbembe emphasizes the ways political power in Africa involves excessive consumption including that of women's bodies. This excessive indulgence does not exclude the culturally sanctioned practice of *isithembu* (polygamy). Zuma's public sexual life speaks to this excess. In a recent review of the paper, Wale Adebanwi and Rogers Orock tell us that some scholars such as Butler and Coronil criticized the essay as extravagant in its insights of Togo and Cameroon and "the possibilities of their 'theoretical generalization' to other postcolonies in the manner in which he deployed these insights" (n.p). Because of the histories looked at briefly in this chapter, the use of phallic iconography in South Africa is complicated as it is always inadvertently laden with racist overtones. These conditions of social and economic formations in South Africa that may render this scatological humour symbolically violent may not be as prevalent elsewhere in the continent.

Conclusion

There remains contestation on the effectiveness and the limitations of the erect penis as metaphor. There are multiple issues the representations engage poignantly. In “The Rape of Lady Justice” one is encouraged to imagine the ways patriarchy continued to violate Kuzwayo by vehemently reassuring Zuma of its loyalty. In "The Spear" predatory sexuality in the ANC of democratic South Africa and liberation camps introduced in the first chapter returns. Whilst the spear is meant to attack the enemy, now the spear is the penis and a marker of gendered difference in political organizing where women are perpetually vulnerable. In "R is for Respect" Kannemeyer alludes to the different evolutions of youth protest. The image of youth protesting the innocence of Jacob Zuma is far removed from the image of a dying Hector Peterson. Finally, in "Umshini Wam" Mabulu represents for us visually the way Zuma culture is self-serving. These are all excellent achievements of these visual artworks. However, when we consider the erect penis signifier in South African visual arts, in this chapter beginning with Cruikshank, there is an iconographic continuation, to borrow Murray’s concept. The artists are oblivious to the ways the reach of the metaphor is limited in a society overdetermined by historic racial tension. These visual artworks have allowed us a window into intersections between different subjectivities in South Africa such as [white] liberal artists and audiences, young Black South Africans, Black women, and traditional church leaders among many others. There are forms of synthesis between women, traditional church leaders, and the youth about cultures of respect. These cultures of respect are heteropatriarchal and ageist.

Chapter Three: Struggle Credentials and Aspirational Figurations in Zuma's Musical Presences

Introduction

This chapter builds on with the idea of a heroic Zuma that is introduced by Gordin as discussed in chapter one, but with keen focus on music. It begins by analysing Zuma's clever use of struggle songs as a method of affirming his militant masculinity, reminding South African publics of his contribution to the anti-apartheid armed struggle and setting himself up as a victim of the ANC elite. The liberation songs studied are "Ayihlome Ihlasele", "Umhla Sibuyayo", and "Umshini Wam". The next part of the chapter revisits Izingane ZoMa's "Msholozi" to explore the ways maskandi music facilitated Zuma's first presidential bid in terms of ethnocultural solidarities. Finally, we turn to Kabza De Small and Maphorisa feat. Njelic's "Umsholozi" and De Mthuda and Ntokzin feat. Malumnator's "uMsholozi" to discuss the ways the name "Msholozi" has come to function as a metonym for wealth and influence in amapiano music. Bearing in mind amapiano's reputation as the music of the urban and peri-urban South African youth, we conclude this chapter by considering the issues this demographic communicates in amapiano through the real and imagined figure of Zuma.

Some Notes on Audiences in Africa

In "Preliminary Notes on Audience in Africa," Karin Barber posits that "how people come together; how they relate to each other and to the spectacle of utterance they are attending to; what they consider themselves to be part of in doing so; how the spectacle/utterance addresses them: all these are historically and culturally specific" (347). Audiences are historical products. Interpretation happens collectively and in dispersal – the performer engages specific collective consciousnesses. Some members of the audience might be excluded from that collective. Interpretation happens at both a collective and a personal level. Publics in Africa are always context specific. Barber reads the construction of publics in early nineteenth-century Europe as "a body of units assembled as if interchangeable and equivalent" (348). This is the model of publics that is introduced by missionaries in colonial modernity with limited success. She reads Yoruba popular theatre to show that unlike the travelling performers in the *eguungun oje* tradition, who treat with prestige high-ranking members of the audience, performers in the

Yoruba popular theatre tradition, with its church and school origins, imagine an "equal" audience (350-353). This is reinforced by rectangular undifferentiated sitting. In practice the audience of Yoruba popular theatre never truly constituted an equal public – performers were influenced by what certain audience members could offer them beyond the stage:

> Performances do not just play to ready-made congregations of spectators who are out there awaiting address; they convene those congregations and by their mode of address assign them a certain position from which to receive the address. Thus performances, in the act of addressing audiences, constitute those audiences as a particular form of collectivity (ibid. 355-356).

I want us to sit with a couple of propositions that Barber makes. The first one is that audiences are culturally and historically specific. In the labour of interpretation, the audience regularly taps into a reservoir of collective and individual memory. The audience has expectations regarding forms or genres – they interpret codes in ways specific to that form. The second point is the idea of an equal public. This is particularly relevant when we consider liberation songs and the relationship between the performer – in this case one who leads a song or the orator —, and the audience – in this case one who follows the orator. Struggle songs traditionally use the call-and-response format, meaning they cannot exist without a participating audience. This leads us to the final point for consideration – the ways the orator actively creates an audience. In the context of liberation songs, the orator creates forms of collectivism that engender the "people" as a unit while conscientizing the "people" to the necessities of this unity.

In discussing the 1929 women's war in Nigeria in her book *A History of African Popular Culture* (2018) Barber posits that in this "we see [a] situation not only where women used a distinctive symbolic performance genre to mobilise fellow women into taking political action, but where the performance genre itself actually was the political action" (106). On one level political songs, any songs, facilitate feelings of commonality – political songs have well-developed structures where the orator and the audience have specific roles. On another level, the songs are themselves political statements. The political songs chosen for this chapter feature the recurrent motif of military arms: "Ayihlome Ihlasele" (let us arm ourselves and attack), "Umshini Wam" ([Bring] my machine gun", "Umhla Sibuyayo … Koduma Umbayimbayi Phezukwentaba" (our return [from exile] will be announced by tankers blazing atop mountains). Whereas these songs originated in the liberation movement, and were initially directed against the apartheid government, in Zuma's context, they have evolved from imagining

colonial/apartheid structures to addressing opposition forces within the ANC. Music is one of Africa's most accessible performance genres (see Allen), and it has historically been an accessible method of mass mobilization (see *A History of African Popular Culture*). With these two features, Zuma uses his supporters to send the message that he will fight against those who are against him in the ANC and elsewhere.

Heroic Self-Styling and Embedded Histories in Zuma's Liberation Song

The freedom songs studied in this chapter are largely associated with the armed liberation struggle. The most prominent liberation armies in South Africa were uMkhonto we Sizwe (MK), separate from, but in practice subordinate to the ANC political leadership, and the Azanian People's Liberation Army (APLA) under the Pan Africanist Congress. Naturally, as Zuma is a former member of the South African Communist Party (SACP), a current member of the ANC, and a former high-ranking official in uMkhonto we Sizwe intelligence operations, the liberation songs are particular to these parameters: ANC/SACP and MK. uMkhonto we Sizwe (The Spear of the Nation) was formed, at the mobilisation of its chief-volunteer Nelson Mandela, after the Sharpeville massacre and Congress Alliance's failed peaceful approach (Davis 2-4). The manifesto promised to "strike out a new road for the liberation of people in this country" emphasising that "the government policy of force, repression, and violence will no longer be met with non-violent resistance only!" (n.p). The military arm operated with assistance from Southern African bases such as a stronghold in Angola (Dreyer 59-60). The ANC and MK appealed both to the newly independent African states and the broader international community as per MK's commando in exile and former ANC president Oliver Tambo's speech at the UNESCO headquarters in 1986 (Tambo 341). There is an important pro-violence shift in the anti-apartheid movement in the early 1960s. This period is additionally important because of the rise of post-WWII nationalist movements in Africa. Figures such as Kwame Nkrumah, Jomo Kenyatta, Julius Nyerere, and Nnamdi Azikiwe emerge as 'fathers' of anti-colonial African nation-states. Whereas the ANC was up to this point a bourgeoise movement led by Black elite figures who were missionary educated, at this juncture, it morphs into a "people's movement" ready to abandon non-violence against apartheid.

The songs chosen for this study suggest that Zuma's political language is anchored on forms of violence and militant masculinity. We must begin by locating Zuma in the armed liberation

struggle[21]. Zuma joined the ANC in 1959 when he was seventeen years old. He became an active member of uMkhonto we Sizwe in 1962. He was arrested for conspiring to overthrow the apartheid government in the same year with forty-five recruits in Zeerust, Western Transvaal (now part of North-West Province). He served ten years on Robben Island along with other notable political prisoners such as Mandela. He left for exile in 1975, rising in the MK structures to the point of leading the intelligence unit. The MK intelligence unit was aptly named "Imbokodo" (the rock that crushes). Imbokodo was notorious for torture tactics which influenced the 1984 mutiny by ANC guerrillas in Angola. Zuma's time in MK is entwined with a culture of intra-organizational torture and violence. The ruthlessness that continued in Imbokodo under Zuma was symptomatic of heightened paranoia of counteragents within the ANC. Respected South African anti-apartheid journalist Patrick Laurence writes the following about Zuma's time as Joe Nhlanhla's deputy:

> Zuma was charged with responsibility for intelligence, including the detection of enemy agents masquerading as ANC cadres. Reports of torture by Imbokodo continued under the watch of Nhlanhla and Zuma, so much so that in 1991 Nelson Mandela appointed an ANC commission of inquiry into the allegations under Thembile Skweyiya. The Skweyiya report, published in 1992, spoke of people being "brutalised and broken" by Imbokodo […] The pertinent point that emerges is that Zuma cannot escape political responsibility for these abuses of power from 1986 to 1993 when he was the second-ranking ANC official in Imbokodo (n.p).

Similar sentiments where Zuma is compared with apartheid Bureau of State Security Police (B.O.S.S) chief Hendrik van den Bergh are expressed by Paul Trewhela, a South African journalist imprisoned in the 1960s for his association with the liberation movement.[22] Apart from being a collective of spies who aided in attacks against the functionality of the apartheid government, Imbokodo was feared for its ruthlessness to MK and ANC members who were suspected of being apartheid spooks. The rhetoric, paranoia and fear of counteragents continue to inform Zuma's politics. He continuously frames himself as a victim of certain factions within the ANC (notably "Kleva Blacks"). It is in Imbokodo where Zuma's politics are consolidated.

[21] Information concerning Zuma's role in imbokodo is pieced from different sources such as Gordin's biography and Patrick Laurence article (see https://www.politicsweb.co.za/opinion/jacob-zuma-and-imbokodo)
[22] Trewhela, Paul. "Jacob Zuma in Exile: Three Unexplored Issues". *Politics Web,* 2009, https://www.politicsweb.co.za/news-and-analysis/jacob-zuma-in-exile-three-unexplored-issues. Accessed 11 Mar. 23.

Music has a long and layered history in South African politics. Lara Allen argues that music is Africa's most salient popular art form: "music functions as a trenchant political site in Africa primarily because it is the most widely appreciated art form on the continent" (1). In similar vein, Gunner teaches us the importance of performance in African political strategies ("Political Song" 30). The celebrated Black Consciousness activist, Steve Biko, argues in *I Write What I Like* (1972), that "to the African music and rhythm are not luxuries but part and parcel of their way of communicating. Any suffering we experienced was made more real by song and rhythm" (60). The immediacy of music as an oral genre makes it one of the most accessible artforms in African cultures through different epochs. In a brief overview of the evolution of liberation songs in 20th-century South African politics, Anne-Marie Gray informs us that the songs sung before the 1950s were choral and reflected the Christian value of non-militancy (32). This was highly influenced by the make-up of Black South African politicians in the early twentieth century: elite and educated in English-medium missionary schools. She further informs of a shift in liberation songs after 1950 wherein the songs served a "propaganda function where artistic value is of minor importance as the message takes priority over musical expression […] as the liberation struggle increased in fervour, so did the tone of these songs in order to reflect the mood of militancy" (34-35). Sisanda Nkoala argues that through being political, functional, instructional, educational, ideological, and inspirational: "if one considers aspects that made liberation art effective as part of a strategy to overthrow oppressive regimes, one can see that the efficacy of struggle songs lies largely in their ability to persuade" (52). Liberation songs are deeply entrenched in the anti-apartheid struggle histories, they were artistical in the early 20th century when Black politicians were the missionary-educated elite. In the mid-late twentieth century, the songs were inclined towards the urgency of transmission of ideology. Ultimately, their recitation was continuously shifting, and they were charged. Post-1994, in the government of majority rule, the liberation songs have again gained new symbolic significances while retaining some of their anti-state fervour. Their declaration of community, belonging, warmth and accessibility in the case of Zuma will be explored further below.

The period beginning in the 1960s was a fertile space and time for songs that have continued to take different meanings in post-transitional South Africa. Gunner reminds us that prior to their 1960s prominence, "liberation songs were a part of the sonic landscape of resistance before the turn to the armed struggle. They were sung in jails by those condemned to die, at trials, and by great gatherings in the most public of South African spaces" ("Jacob Zuma" 37).

These songs trace their genesis to many South African socio-political contexts. Some of these contexts are prisons. Many liberation songs post-1960 are in the tradition of *igwijo* (traditional singing of Xhosa folksongs in a manner that encourages togetherness) and *amahubo empi* (Zulu war songs). The songs analysed in this chapter are in the latter tradition, *amahubo empi.* Liberation songs narrated personal sacrifice, some advanced socialist ideology, and others declared dedication to the liberation of the land and its people. These songs created affective environments while they were also accessible vehicles for liberation ideology. Whereas the non-violent anti-segregation and later anti-apartheid movements were able to survive with selective membership, where senior members were literate, elite, and well-educated, the anti-apartheid guerrilla effort needed to appeal to a larger populace. This populace was not as educated. However, they lived under the crushing social and economic conditions of apartheid. Whilst ANC forefathers like Sol Plaatje wrote influential essays that appealed to international communities, song was an immediate method of speaking to how the people felt and how they planned to collapse the apartheid government. In recent years, the richness of the histories embedded in some of these songs has been manipulated or used cleverly by political figures to personal political ends.

Many scholars have explored the relationship/s between the nation-state, political song, and the "people" in post-apartheid South Africa. Zuma, with spirited and affective recitations of "Umshini Wam", was a common subject in these essays, articles, and book chapters. Liz Gunner is one of the foremost and insightful voices on Jacob Zuma's clever recitations of political songs. She posits that "[Umshini Wam] became associated with [Zuma's] brand of vague left-wing populism and carried an appeal to memories of the liberation struggle, which had become distant in official public discourse after the euphoria of 1994" ("Political Song" 13). Gunner draws our attention to a clever aspect of Zuma's politics, "vague ideology". We have seen with recent populist leaders, most notably Donald Trump, that vague ideology is itself a political strategy. Struggle songs excite publics due to their histories and composition among other things, effectively covering up these ideological gaps. In "Jacob Zuma, The Social Body, and the Unruly Power of Song" Gunner argues that political songs transcend intellectualisation and engender the corporeal as a site for knowledge production and an archive. In other words, political songs operate with affective registers. In the African languages and literature discipline Innocentia Mhlambi proposes that Zuma's liberation songs or the curating of the former president's political image is well-thought and goes beyond him. She locates "Umshini Wam" in the Mass Democratic Movement, a loose alliance between the United

Democratic Front (UDF) and the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) (135). The "Friends of Zuma", an unofficial support base for Zuma which used a website to sell ringtones, autographed wallpapers, and other digital commodities, drew on the popularity of "Umshini Wam" to create a ringtone whose proceeds went towards the president's legal costs (Mhlambi). Mhlambi criticizes this endeavour for reproducing the elite/popular culture categories while presenting pseudo-*unofficialese* (130). She argues that "the commercialisation and commodification of political messages in this manner allowed for personalisation of [the political spat between Zuma and then ANC and state preside Thabo Mbeki] in ways that temporarily blocked an astute understanding of what was at stake regarding the fall-out between Mbeki and Zuma and the greater politics at play" (135). A crucial insight from these two scholars is the ways in which the euphoria of political song renditions massively masked Zuma's lack of ideological praxis or a clear political message.

The earliest song to be associated with the former president is "Umshini Wam," following the 2005 trial of Shabir Shaik ("Jacob Zuma" 2008). After Zuma was fired by then-president, Thabo Mbeki due to his associations with Shaik:

> It was [in] tense political and personal circumstances for Jacob Zuma that the song 'Umshini Wami' first appeared in the arena of national politics. It was new, yet in its tight and deceptively simple structure as well as its resonances of social memory, it was far from new. In a sense, the song played a crucial role in creating a public, indeed different publics for Jacob Zuma. It acted as a catalyst for the involvement of multiple publics in the wider public sphere. It bridged different constituencies in a fragmented and plural polity […] The song – and song more widely – became the means by which a group of the marginalized within the African National Congress (ANC) seized back agency and the power to determine the flow of change in the new era. ("Jacob Zuma" 8-30).

The song thus created a "pavement parliament" (Hofmeyr 128) that made it possible for Zuma to gain influence. Gunner further tells us songs create a "somatic grammar where the links between body, song, and a wider social meaning assumed a momentary coherence" ("Jacob Zuma" 29). Whereas Mbeki was seen as an aloof scholar and his South Africa technocratic (see Mhlambi), Zuma capitalised on a then unexpressed desire for a "somatic grammar", or, to borrow according to Biko's afore-cited views on music, an "African" way of being. Song

became a way the marginalized in the ANC seized power ("Jacob Zuma" 30). As a catalyst of 'pavement parliaments', the positive discussions triggered by "Umshini Wam*"* bypassed print and broadcast media, seen as an apparatus controlled by a conservative political elite (see Mhlambi). Faraway from 'official' media, positive discussions regarding then-presidential hopeful Zuma were a feature in tree shelters, bus stops, taxis, shebeens, coffee shops, and bars among others ("Jacob Zuma" 30). Song became a method to spread political rhetoric and consolidate supporters of Zuma's politics. Barber tells us that in Africa

> songs mobilized and inspired people to action – they drove home the key messages. As a participatory genre, they unified people emotionally; as an oral genre, they were accessible to all, as an improvisatory genre, they lent themselves to rapid response on the frontiers of social change; as a poetic and musical genre, they were vitally memorable, meaning they could spread rapidly across a population and live on in people's minds for decades after the event (*A History of African Popular Culture* 101).

Song in African political organising serves multiple purposes while bridging gaps and creating a feeling of unity. Zuma used his addresses to his supporters outside his court appearances, relating to Shaik's corruption charges, to advance the idea that he is a victim of a conspiracy theory. "Umshini Wam" with its roots in the unionist movement served to locate Zuma as the voice of the Black working-class in the class continuum. Apart from this its composition is in a recognizable format, the overwhelming affectiveness of the crowd in song encouraged others who might have been on the fence or unclear to identify with or support Zuma without an actual grasp of his political ideology or lack thereof.

Apart from creating somatic and affective environments, song works as a tool to recall a heroic past into the present. In her recent work on political songs, Gunner argues that one of the qualities of political songs is their ability to collapse the past with the present ("Political Song" 20). Song becomes a method of remembering a socio-political past and translating it into the present. Zuma's recital of these songs helps him to excavate and publicly reminisce about his contribution to the liberation struggle. The political songs in this chapter are deliberately masculinist war songs. On top of being a tool for retrieving a heroic past to inform perceptions about the present political environment, the songs present Zuma as a proven warrior ready to battle "Kleva Blacks" as ruthlessly as he purged apartheid spooks during his time as a senior official of Imbokodo. There is consensus among Zuma supporters, notably the Radical

Economic Transformation (RET) faction that Zuma is a target[23]. In the paratext to *Kill Zuma: By Any Means Necessary* (2017), a partly biographical text by controversial South African businessman-turned-politician Gayton McKenzie that alleges many failed assassination of Zuma, McKenzie writes in the paratext that Zuma "is not called the ultimate survivor for nothing [the book looks at why] Jacob Zuma – a man many know as the great Keeper of ANC's secrets – has for so long been such a big target, long before democracy and any thought that he might ever be president." McKenzie's book makes allegations about the betrayals by ANC comrades and one of Zuma's wives.

More than half a decade after the spectacle of "Umshini Wam" performances outside court, in different political circumstances, Zuma led "*uMandela uthi ayihlome ihlasele (Siyaya ngoMkhonto Wesizwe eLusaka)"* at Nelson Mandela's memorial service (December 2013). This roughly translates to "Mandela has instructed us to arm ourselves and attack, we will depart with the spear of the nation to Lusaka". 2012 was an eventful year for the former president. The former ANC secretary general and one-time interim president (September 2008-May 2009), Kgalema Motlanthe, was the face of an impromptu contest for the incumbent's position heading to the 53rd ANC elective conference (16-20 December 2012). Prior to the conference, Zuma had faced strong criticism from factions within the ANC and the South African public owing to renovations made to his Nkandla homestead amounting to R246 Million.[24]A few months prior to the elective conference, thirty-four miners were shot fatally while seventy-eight others were seriously injured by the South African Police Services (SAPS) during a wildcat strike.[25] These two events — the Nkandla splurge and the Marikana massacre by state police undermined Zuma's "vague leftist" rhetoric. These are the two scandals that charged what is now colloquially known as the "Anyone but Zuma" faction. Zuma enjoyed 75.03 % of the vote for the presidency over Motlanthe's 24.97%. This further reflected Zuma's popularity in the ANC and solidified his position, making him almost untouchable.

---

[23] Zuma and his supporters claimed his rape charge and his corruption charges were political fabrications to remove him as the deputy president and retain power among Xhosa-speaking ANC leaders. These feelings have continued with factions aligned with the RET singing "Wenzeni uZuma" (what has Zuma done) before the opening address of the ANC provincial elective congress in 2022. Visit https://www.news24.com/citypress/news/zuma-takes-aim-at-redi-tlhabi-says-she-wants-to-label-him-a-rapist-20190715.

[24] Public Protector. "Secure in Comfort – Nkandla Report". *SA History Online,* 2014, https://www.sahistory.org.za/archive/secure-comfort-nkandla-report. Accessed 20 May 2023.
[25] "Marikana Massacre 16 August 2012". *SA History Online,* 2012, https://www.sahistory.org.za/article/marikana-massacre-16-august-2012. Accessed 20 May 2023.

Writing for *The Guardian*, David Smith observes that the celebrations were coloured with anti-apartheid era songs and vuvuzelas, as Zuma "retains the loyalty of party rank and file members who may often ignore or even resent newspaper headlines attacking one of their own" (n.p). By this time Mandela was already in hospital. In his opening address to the conference, Zuma led the crowd in singing "*Inde lendlela esiyihambayo/ Washo uMandela kubalandeli bakhe / Wathi sodibana nge Freedom Day*" (The journey we are on is long. Mandela told his supporters that he shall meet them on Freedom Day). This is a smart song choice by Zuma as it uses the figure of Mandela, who is at the time suffering from ill health, to foreground his speech about organizational unity. Smith writes that it was impossible to boo and jeer the president as he led the song because of the figure it referenced. In similar vein, choosing to sing "Ayihlome Ihlasele" at Mandela's memorial service works in two parts: the first is its biographical celebration of Madiba's contribution to the liberation movement. The second is using memories of the liberation struggle to encourage regrouping in a continuously fracturing ANC.

Importantly, Zuma used these songs to remind the mourners of the liberation struggle and the efforts of individuals such as Mandela and by extension Zuma himself. The song "Inde lendlela esiyihambayo," is in the present tense. One is prompted to think of the ways democratic South Africa is a young nation-state in formation. At the memorial, the former president led "Inde lendlela" after "Ayihlome Ihlasele". One could imagine that this song choice is suggesting that because these political figures have proven themselves with their liberation credentials we should trust them again with state power regardless of countless corruption cases, proven cases of incompetence, and maladministration. In his book, *A Simple Man: Kasrils and the Zuma Enigma,* former Minister of Intelligence Ronnie Kasrils details crossing the Mozambique-Swaziland border with Zuma in 1982 (xx-xxv). The conditions were harsh, it was rainy and cold. It was dark and they could not use their torches and radios because they had to evade Swaziland border patrol which was an ally of apartheid South Africa. These men showed bravery and Kasrils believed Zuma at the time to be a simple man of the people. Through the song, Zuma reminds his audience of his qualifications to fight on a powerful stage. He reminds us of Mandela as one of the founders of MK and himself as one of those who contributed to the armed resistance in response to the call to join MK. He uses this opportunity to bring himself closer to Mandela through his songs and encourages us to give him the same legitimacy. Among many others, the chosen struggle songs thus serve three objectives as argued: creating a somatic and affective atmosphere, reminding the public about a heroic past

in a present political climate sometimes perceived as hostile, and a declaration of survival against internal conflicts within the ANC.

The chosen songs operate within the logic of Pumla Dineo Gqola's "militant masculinity". For Gqola these spectacular, hyper-visible masculinities in the South African political sphere emerged post Zuma's rape trial. They are made hyper-visible by liberation songs and struggle parlance ("The Difficult Task of Normalizing Freedom" 65-66). I want to explore this paradigm through "Umhla Sibuyayo" and "Umshini Wam". The lyrics to the first song are "*umhla sibuyayo kothula kuthi du/ Koduma umbambay phezulu kwentaba"* which roughly translates to "on the day we return from exile there will be tank guns blazing atop mountains". In "Umshini Wam" the orator repeatedly calls out "*Awuleth' Umshini Wam*" (Bring me my machine gun). Barber posits that "'Umshini Wam' like many songs of the liberation era, was embedded in a largely masculinist conception of militarism and nationalism" ("Jacob Zuma" 40).

I want to now think of the rifle in these songs as a phallic signifier. Other theorists such as Kopano Ratele in "Ruling Masculinity and Sexuality" and Pumla Gqola in "The Difficult Task of Normalizing Freedom" have probed the relationships between Zuma's politics, "Umshini Wam", gender, and sexuality. Ratele looks at the ways the president rejected the sexual freedoms promised by the constitution, while Gqola offers a feminist investigation of Zuma's hyper-visible masculinity. Gqola's work is useful in thinking with some of the arguments that follow. The rifle as a phallic signifier allows us to think of the relationships between patriarchy, the liberation movement, and Zuma's presidency. Zuma, a leader educated in the liberation movement, is heavily influenced by the 1960s first-generation of the armed struggle exhibiting the characteristic nationalist energies (see Gordin). First-generation nationalism in Africa was generally defined by a hegemonic masculinist ethos. Anne McClintock argues that:

> All nationalisms, moreover, are gendered […] All nationalisms are dependent on powerful constructions of gender difference […] For Santayana political agency is straightforwardly male, and the male citizen stands in the same symbolic relation to the nation as a man stands to a woman, political power thus depends on a prior construction of gender power ("Women and Nationalism" 105).

For McClintock, the nation-state is formed over time and underwritten by gendered negotiations of power that are culturally constructed. Elsewhere, Anne Gagiano warns that

contrary to popular framings of patriarchy as a monolith, in practice, patriarchy and the role of patriarchy in African anti-colonial nationalism is dynamic, continuously shifting, and at times in conflict with itself[26]. When we think of all the 'fathers' of African liberation movements, the brutality of the anti-colonial/anti-apartheid armed resistance, particularly Imbokodo, and the patriarchal nature of nationalism, Zuma's liberation songs go beyond painting him as a victim of elite ANC cliques and forces antagonistic to Black power. Above situating his heroic positionality in the armed anti-apartheid struggle, through liberation songs, he, like a mating peacock, displays the grandiosity of his masculinity. Zuma is telling us that he is a man. A man is as inseparable from his rifle as he is from his penis. A man without his machine gun is like a man without his penis – he is not a man. His embodied performance of violent masculinity is the fuel that allowed him to bulldoze himself to the ANC presidency and later the nation-state while paradoxically playing the victim of a conspiracy engineered by an 'elitist' and conservative faction within the ANC.

The #FeesMustFall movement is an interesting case study on the ways liberation songs have progressed from being primarily in the domain of protest/resistance to social artefacts and forms of self and collective configuration. Living in Braamfontein for ten years (2013-2023) I have observed a mass political awakening beginning with the 2015 student protests. Far from the conflicts between students and the South African Police Services (SAPS) and private security, far from marches and mass addresses, in student towns and cities, struggle songs have become as common as the most fashionable music trends. It is commonplace to find friends singing such songs as "Yini Socialism?" (What is socialism?) at 3 am on their way home after a night of binge drinking. These songs have progressed from the lamentations composed in the 1950/60s around the Sharpeville Massacre – songs such as "Senzeni Na?". Those same lamentations have acquired new socio-political significance. Liberation songs are declarations of love and commitment to an ideal whether it be economic emancipation (a cornerstone of the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) rhetoric now cleverly also utilized in some ways by the ANC Youth League and the Young Communist League (YCL affiliated with the SACP), land redistribution, or racial equality). These songs have positive significance in the imaginaries of many Black South African publics – especially those in urban and peri-urban areas.

[26] Gagiano, Anne. "Unmasking 'African Machismo': Mphahlele's *Chirundu*". *English Studies in Africa,* vol. 44, no.1, 2001, pp. 31-45.

Zuma's clever utilization of liberation songs has multiple other functions. One of these is a reaffirmation of Zuma's 'man of the people' persona. Zuma and his earliest rival in the post-apartheid ANC presidency, Mbeki, one time a close ally, have contrasting backgrounds and public personalities. Mbeki is from a politically elite family and his father, Govan, is a much revered intellectual and political leader who was among those sentenced as co-conspirators in the Rivonia trial along with Nelson Mandela. Thabo Mbeki is educated in England. Zuma is from a poor background, and he has limited formal education. I remember watching the news with my family and my mother remarking that "Mbeki is always in some country or the next. Never in South Africa". Although his presidency saw a healthy economic positioning of South Africa in global opinion, Mbeki had a reputation for being aloof. Zuma, "the dancing president" is the opposite – charismatic and often addressing his audiences' in indigenous languages. Whether leading a Sunday church service in song, an address coloured with liberation songs, or Tik-Tok videos with some of his children, Zuma always presents himself as jovial and approachable. Because of their acquired significance in contemporary South Africa, liberation songs additionally allow Zuma to present himself as one of us – warm and accessible.

Maskandi's Role in Zuma's First Presidential Bid

Liberation songs are a tool used by Zuma from a primary standpoint. The chosen maskandi and amapiano songs work on a different level as they are not officially endorsed by the former president. The root word for "maskandi" is the Afrikaans *"musikant"* – the Afrikaans term for musician (see Coplan and "*Maskandi*: A Critical General Inducive Analysis of Zulu Maskandi Songs" 44). Phuzekhemisi, a veteran maskanda artist, defines the genre as "the popular name for Zulu traditional music [and] it is deeply rooted in Zulu culture" (Aroun and Ngwane 1). Maskandi has found expression in other Nguni languages such as isiXhosa, isiNdebele, and other languages such as Sesotho, and Setswana (see "*Maskandi*: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Indigenous isiZulu Songs"). Kemist Shumba and Anna Meyer-Weitz posit that Izingane ZoMa's popularity "emanates from its reflection on various contemporary matters that include social relationships and ethnic Zulu socio-cultural mores […] but also for its politically charged commentaries on, and praise-poetry for, prominent political figures, both on the local and international scenes" (137). It is this praise of Zuma that this chapter engages. Izingane ZoMa is a maskandi group consisting of three sisters: Bongekile, Tholakele, and Phungula Ngobese.

The all-women group subverted a genre where the lead singers were almost exclusively men and women were relegated to peripherical backing vocalists (Mthembu n.p).

By their cisgender heterosexual positionality and the affordance of popular cultures as cultures that have in many cases operated beyond the state apparatus and antagonistically towards the officialdom, the group was in a privileged position to offer feminist perspectives on the mid-2000s controversies that clouded Zuma's public image. This chapter suggests that the sisters failed to use their positionality meaningfully due to their promotion of Zuma's spectacular masculinity which is premised on patriarchal ethnic identity. This failure becomes complicated when we consider the machinations of state power in post-independent Africa. Interestingly, in a discussion about "Msholozi," a friend remarked that one of Izingane ZoMa's male backing vocalists became an ANC municipal councillor. Gunner tells us that "*Maskandi* singers suddenly seemed to be performing at venues up and down KwaZulu- Natal. Their presence as voices of popular culture that tuned in to outrage, anxiety, and alarm, sometimes providing answers, was unmistakable" ("Jacob Zuma" 49, original emphasis). A carefully considered alignment with Zuma's rhetoric of victimization and an ethnocultural audience provided greater opportunities for patronage and marketability than a feminist mobilization. In criticizing these failures, one must also be mindful of the potential resource access of the two subjects: one a little-known daughter of a late struggle veteran and the other a presidential hopeful. From this, one would argue that it makes sense to ally with Zuma for a rural group like Izingane ZoMa considering that rural South Africa is overwhelmingly poor, undereducated, and often on the periphery of South African economics and politics. This argument is compelling when we recall that Zuma, while addressing the crowd at the 2017 Essence Festival in Durban, rewarded the group with a minibus taxi for their support, while claiming that the song had expanded the group's fanbase (Hans n.p).

"Msholozi" appeared in the eponymous album on December 1, 2005. It proved itself a massive success, selling fifty thousand units in the first week. In an article that includes interviews with two of the three surviving sisters, *News24* journalist Sihle Mthembu posits that:

> Through the record, Izingane Zoma (sic) provided a soundtrack that galvanised Jacob Zuma supporters all around KZN as they promoted the album via performances in community halls, hostels, and stadiums all around the province. The title track, with the lyrics, "Bonke abantu bathi bafuna uZuma aphathe"

> (everyone wants Zuma to be the leader) was anthemic and became, in spirit, a kind of ancestor to Zuma's own *Mshini wami* (n.p)

Mthembu's choice of "galvanized" suggests that the song was equally emotive and popular. I was at the time twelve years old and living in the Eastern Cape (the complicated neighbours of KZN). What was very striking for me and memorable is the ways "Msholozi" affected people. For many in my milieu, it inspired a rehashing of stereotypes that indexed historic ethnic conflict. The album was promoted in community halls, hostels, and stadiums in fashions associated with the sub-class. "Msholozi" is a song that spoke to the "people". Phungula Ngobese tells Mthembu that "when Jacob Zuma was going to court [for his rape case…they] would be there and people were singing the songs and wanting to buy the CDs. [She's] never seen anything like it" (n.p). Ngobese further tells Mthembu that "Nquthu [where the sisters are from] always had strong IFP allegiances, but when Jacob Zuma was released as deputy president, a lot of Zulu-speaking people in the area were upset and felt that he was being side-lined because he was Zulu" (n.p). She blames the side-lining of Zulu people in ANC leadership on tribalism.

Before proceeding with the argument, I want to acknowledge that maskandi is not a blind endorsement of Zulu figures of authority without critical self-reflection or dissent. The mid-1980-90s was a period of violent conflict between the ANC and the Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP). During this time of heightened conflict Phuzekhemisi and Khethani released "Imbizo" (1992), and ten years later Phuzekhemisi released "Amakhansela" (2002). The former song decries "imbizo" (meetings facilitated by traditional leaders) – as a waste of time. In the opening verse Phuzekhemisi sings "*Lomhlaba uyathengwa ungaboni siphila kuwona / Njalo ngonyaka sikhokha imali yamasimi enduneni*) (this land is not free we pay yearly leases to "induna" (headman)). The singer is referencing the taxes paid to the Ingonyama Trust. The trust owns 29.67% of the land in KwaZulu-Natal that it leases to its mostly rural inhabitants yearly. The trust is administered by the Zulu royal family with the Zulu king as the most senior member. The song criticizes the royal family who expect poor rural Zulu land dwellers to pay taxes. In "Amakhansela" (the councillors) the singer urges his listeners to boycott voting at local (and possibly national elections) because municipal councillors have not initiated any development. The song blurs the lines between national and local government structures. Both of these songs were popular in the mid-2000s ("Jacob Zuma" 44). This is to make the point that maskandi is polyphonic and there are contrasting relationships to authority. "Msholozi" did not galvanize complete support for Zuma, opposition is always present in maskandi.

In her revisiting of the concept of the spectacular in Ndebele's "Rediscovery of the Ordinary" (1991), Gqola comments that the spectacular is not a phenomenon limited to protest art/literature (63). It was in the hyper-visibility of the [Black] body in slavery and colonialism and it shows itself in what Gqola calls violent masculinities in the post-apartheid context. "Msholozi", Zuma's clan's name, is itself a spectacular visibility. Lineage in Nguni cultures is hetero-patriarchal. Even a child born out of wedlock is referred to as "*umntwana womalume*" (child of the maternal uncles) even when 'damages' have been paid. *Izithakazelo* are patrilineal archives that exclusively mention men, heritage (for example uMsuthu), and significant migrations. When we refer to Zuma as "Msholozi" we invoke the memory of men in his patrilineage. Zuma is, as the popular metaphor has it, "standing on the shoulders" of these men. When we call him by his clan's name, beyond being a sign of respect and most times affection, we look beyond his corruption cases and other charges to see the spectacular masculinity that he has inherited from his forefathers as a "proper" Zulu man or *indoda yomZulu eqotho/ephelele.* Zuma manoeuvres through and around these ethnocultural connections in crafting his public persona.

His contested versions of "Zuluness" are a cornerstone of Zuma's political rhetoric. He presents himself as a traditional man of the people. He is photographed in his *ibheshu* with the late Zulu King Goodwill on numerous occasions. His "Zuluness", as discussed in the first chapter, was a defence technique in his rape trial, and he regularly resorted to isiZulu when the opposition benches questioned his presidency in parliament. "Msholozi" has a masculinist symbolism that through the image of Zuma has come to signify many different things – some of which I revisit later in an exploration of "Msholozi" as a metonym in amapiano.

In his book *Ethnic Continuities and a State of Exception: Goodwill Zwelithini, Mangosuthu Buthelezi and Jacob Zuma,* Gerhard Maré argues that:

> Jacob Zuma's role since 1990 has been core to the survival of the king because it has ensured the survival of ethnic politics in the province of KwaZulu-Natal (KZN) and the country as a whole. Some of his influence was direct in national politics in the legislation that was passed in the twenty-first century, building on the brief chapter 12 of the constitution; some of it was indirect, simply through his displays and claims, and the tributes to him as '100 per cent (sic) Zuluboy' […] Zuma has

> gone back to his kwaNxamalala village roots… He invoked the culture and spoke in an idiom that would make language activists proud (60-63).

Chapter 12 in the South African constitution recognizes the authority of traditional leaders and allows customary law some autonomy in a democratic republic. In his book, Maré places Zuma side by side with King Goodwill Zwelithini who is a direct descendant of King Mpande who was King Shaka's half-brother. With them, Maré places Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi, son of Princess Magogo who was the daughter of King Dinizulu who was the son of King Cetshwayo who is the son of King Mpande. Apart from the royal lineage Buthelezi shares with his nephew Zwelithini, he is also the leader of the Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) and the traditional prime minister of the Zulu nation. Unlike the two men, Zuma has earned his place due to his industry and influence. Much of that was no less due to his cleverly curated image and understanding of the South African body politic. Although it should not be limited to tribal "solidarities" and Zuma's position in Zulu imaginaries, the success of the music track "Msholozi" heavily relies on this affiliation with Zuma.

Maskandi offers its adherents vocabulary for commenting on national socio-political issues. In her work on the syncretic jazz culture in Mwanza between 1945 and 1961, Maria Suriano demonstrates the circulation of political themes in the popular music culture which precedes the formation of Julius Nyerere's Tanganyika African National Congress (TANU). Popular culture and politics intersected as "jazz musicians praised the TANU leaders" (Suriano 273). Whilst in its origins the jazz culture catered to an African elite, it grew to be more inclusive. Like the Mwanza jazz culture, which is occasionally associated with leisure, maskandi is a mode of political self-determination and commentary for its primary audience and practitioners. Suriano argues that in Tanganyika "jazz music became functional to the nationalist movement in the 1950s" (277). Maskandi played a similar foundational role in Zuma's political campaign. Maskandi speaks languages intelligible to its primary audiences. Using these languages as an entry point, Zuma's multi-ethnic supporters engaged in national discourses that shaped the ANC and the country. By language here we mean language in the most basic sense, in this case isiZulu, and language as modes of address, shared understanding, behavioural codes, and the breaking down of dense political discussions. For Gunner, maskandi "has always maintained the right of those on the far edges of power to comment on the social and political and to represent the voices of those who might otherwise go unheard" ("Jacob Zuma" 44). In the *Natal Witness* of March 2, 2006, Thabo Manyathi views maskandi singers as "the voice of

the voiceless" – highlighting their roles as representing the feelings of those marginal to authority (qtd. in ibid. 45).

It would be remiss to overlook the many other factors that make Zuma a popular political figure. His stronghold has nevertheless remained his home province. “Umshini Wam” and “Msholozi” would at first seem like two ideologically separate songs owing to their seemingly different histories. I locate the liberation songs in the tradition of *amahubo empi* (Zulu war songs) while “Msholozi” is in the tradition of maskandi which is itself a traditional Zulu formation. These two categories of songs work in tandem and carry the same message. The visual arts studied in the previous chapter cleverly use “Umshini wam” (my machine gun) to allude to Zuma’s penis. In other words, Zuma’s penis is his rifle. “Msholozi” and “Umshini Wam” were not only the soundtracks to Zuma’s legal battles and election campaign in the early 2000s; they are also the soundtrack to his spectacular masculinity.

“Msholozi” and Black [Masculine] Escape in Amapiano

In the same ways that maskandi becomes a mode of engaging national discourses, amapiano communicates the exigencies of young and Black urban and peri-urban South Africans. In BBC's documentary, *This is Amapiano* (2022) many of its practitioners view amapiano as the “authentic sound of the township and a lifestyle”. Even as amapiano is popularly understood as leisure music, it frequently communicates the ambitions of Black urban and peri-urban youth. uMsholozi as the “Teflon Don” politician represents the aspirations, among many, to defeat structures that are perceived as being anti-Black poor in their foundations. Amapiano has adopted popular figures to communicate this desire to defeat the “system”. An example of this desire is articulated in one of the most popular songs in the genre, “John Wick”. John Wick is a fictional character in the eponymous franchise played by Keanu Reeves. He is a retired assassin who comes out of retirement to assassinate a Russian mafia group for killing his dog. In sequels, he single-handedly battles the omnipresent assassination organization he used to work for/with known as “The High Table”. Msholozi has attained a similar status popularised by songs such as De Mthuda’s and Ntokzin feat. MalumNator’s “uMsholozi” (2020) and Kabza De Small and Maphorisa’s feat. Njelic “Umsholozi” (2019). Writing for *OkayAfrica* Setumo-Thebe Mohlomi posits that “amapiano borrows from the music that's been popular in South African townships for decades: kwaito, jazz, and house are just some of its raw ingredients […]

a sophisticated hybrid of deep house, jazz and lounge music characterized by synths, airy pads and wide basslines" (n.p). He reveres amapiano as the sound of 2019, the new "craze". Amapiano not only borrows the sound of antecedent genres but there are also some thematic continuities, particularly with kwaito.

The messages from and negotiations between urban and peri-urban subjectivity and the nation-state transmitted through amapiano (often in contexts of dance and binge drinking) operate with a logic of fantasy. In *States of Fantasy,* Jacqueline Rose argues that fantasy:

> Creates a world of pleasure without obligation to what is either permissible or possible, outside the realm of fantasy, to do […] Fantasy is not, therefore, antagonistic to social reality, it is its precondition or psychic glue. But fantasy surely ceases to be a private matter if it fuels, or at least plays its part in, the forging of the collective will […] Behind every fantasy there is likely to be some such potential narrative (2-5).

Rose's psychoanalytic study of fantasy attempts to map the nationalist [Zionist] desires of Israel. As we have already argued that nations are "invented" (see "Women and Nationalism"), Rose's critical interventions propose to us the ways fantasy is crucial for the formation of national consciousness. She avers that there is "no way of understanding political identities and destinies without letting fantasy into the frame […] fantasy, even in its own psychic terms, is never only inward turning; it also contains a historical reference in so far as it involves, alongside the attempt to arrest the present, a journey through the past" (4-5). Fantasy is thus not limited to the magical realm, a private indulgence. It is a thread that weaves together a collective consciousness. Although it operates beyond the obligation to the permissible or possible there is likely to be some such potential narrative. Collective fantasy operates with a desire to transcend socio-historical material limitations.

Building on Rose's critical propositions on the relationship between fantasy and collective consciousness in his study of the "ghetto" and kwaito in the early 2000s, Bhekizizwe Peterson argues that kwaito music is reflective of motifs of entrapment and flight ("Kwaito, 'Dawgs', and the Antimonies of Hustling" 207). With kwaito music primarily concerned with township life and the challenges of the Black lower classes of South African societies, he offers a description of "entrapment" as a "frequency with which ghetto life and existence is seen as being analogous to one type of incarceration or another, with the sites of the internment including the family, relationships, school, employment, and society in general" (ibid.) while

"flight involves a number of strategic routes that attempt to transcend the debilitations of ghetto life but that do not always escape or even desire to surpass the exigencies of the ghetto" (ibid.). In a recent essay Rangoato Hlasane and Peterson reinforce this by arguing that as South Africa became "the most unequal society in the world […] young black people became masters of marginality and kwaito allows them to humanise their experiences of the pleasures and pains of urbanity" where urbanity manifests itself in racialized subjection, abjection, precarity, etc. (1199-1200). Amapiano music is the new sound of South African [Black] youth and in this movement, we see a similar dynamic, a shifting between "entrapment" and "flight". One of the many strikingly similar aesthetics of the two genres is the adoption of the gangster archetype. Sir Trill, one of the foremost vocalists in this genre rose to national prominence with his vocals on Prince Kaybee's "Hosh"[27]. Granted, Prince Kaybee is a practitioner of Afro Tech, and "Hosh" is in this tradition. Nevertheless, Sir Trill wrote the lyrics to the song, gangster machismo remains part of his artistry as seen in lyrics to the songs such as "John Wick". "Hosh" is in the language of the numbers gang and cautions the listener to respect the "number" which is to respect the codes of gangster life. The socio-economic difficulties the urban, peri-urban, and rural youths are dealing with are salient in Mfana ka Gogo's "Jabula"[28]. In the song, Mfana narrates his life story, his father dying while Mfana was still young, his mother losing her job, and having to "hustle" (through sub-minimum wage manual labour) day and night. The song was a hit on social media. This is one way of gauging the ways it resonated with South African youth.

In De Mthuda and Ntokzin's "Msholozi," the singer repeats:

> Siyavuma bafethu
> Kafi uMsholozi
> Kafi uMsholozi
> Kafi uMsholozi
> Masiyekel' umona

A friend of mine argues that Malumnator actually sings "Kabza uMsholozi". His argument is convincing. Kabza De Small is one of the pioneers of amapiano. Whether it is Kabza or Kafi,

[27] Kabelo Motsamai, and Tumelo Zwane. "Hosh" (single). *Youtube Music.* *https://music.youtube.com/playlist?list=OLAK5uy_kSvKR47sOgF7Ct4J2EBFWJvmZ3oaGhNSs&feature=share*.

[28] Mbonambi, Sipho. "Jabula" (single). *Youtube Music.* *https://music.youtube.com/watch?v=ntVCXLl2aUs&feature=share*.

the arguments offered herein are almost equally applicable. The song is in a conversation format. Malumnator is telling his social circle “abafethu” that “Kafi uMsholozi”. DJ Kafi is a lesser known amapiano producer and DJ. Malumnator is telling his audience that Kafi uMsholozi. The symbolic significance of Msholozi in amapiano makes the simple message “Kafi is Msholozi” legible. “Msholozi” denotes undefeatability, cunning, and skill among other things. I want to think about what the song is doing unconsciously. "Kafi” can be a simplified informal version of “akafi" – one who is immortal, in this context one who is unkillable. It is in this sense that the song channels the Teflon Don figure of Zuma. He is unkillable. There is a desire for unkillability. To survive as a Black man in this context, you must always be ten steps ahead of your enemies. Enemies are not only individuals or groups but also institutions (these are not racially exclusive as the majority ANC government is also an “enemy” of the Black urban poor youth).

In Kabza De Small and DJ Maphorisa’s “Umsholozi," Njelic repeatedly calls out "uMsholozi” backed by an amapiano instrumental. I argue that “Msholozi” is imbued with so much cultural meaning that the singer repeatedly calling out “uMsholozi” is a song in all its parts. The figure of Msholozi is borrowed by many of the practitioners in the subgenre, most notably Zuma of Reece Madlisa and Zuma. Jacob Zuma has no exclusive claim to “Msholozi." Referring to individuals by their clan’s name expresses endearment and respect and is not particular to any individual in that clan. Zuma, the amapiano singer, has every right to refer to himself as “Msholozi”. Nevertheless, a claim on “Msholozi” is akin to a claim on “Madiba”— one cannot use the latter *isithakazelo/isiduko* without invoking the memory of Nelson Mandela. Likewise, one cannot use “Msholozi” without invoking the popular cultural significance of Jacob Zuma. In Reece Madlisa and Zuma’s break-out songs “Iy’ntsimbi Zase Envy”[29] Zuma calls out “indoda enamakhanda amabili” (the man with two heads) and “asambe ngomshini wam”. Because of the shape of his head, among his supporters, Zuma is teasingly referred to as “the man with two heads” while “asambe ngomshini wam” refers to the spectacle of “Umshini Wam” discussed above. The significance of “Msholozi” in amapiano is evident in the ways other amapiano vocalists refer to themselves as “Msholozi” even when they have no links with the Zuma clan. For example, in the intro to the popular “Adiwele” for his set on *Piano City*, Young

[29] Tshikosi Clive, Sabelo Zuma, Tebogo Madingoane, Anele Dlala, and Malusi Ndlovu. *Youtube Music.* https://music.youtube.com/watch?v=0bPrjWCW3LY&si=4r8YgCKx3W0QcNmt.

Stunna, real name Sandile Mahlangu, sings "wenzani uMsholozi, uMsholozi, uMsholozi"[30]. Young Stunna has repeatedly referred to himself as Msholozi in performances. Along with "Msholozi" Stunna also invokes the character of "Shaka Zulu" as such in the eponymous song from his debut album. To some extent this equates the two figures, Msholozi and Shaka; and this is how he configures his masculinity.

Msholozi's supporters continue to portray him as a victim of conspiracies. These conspiracy theorists often claim Zuma is targeted because of his pro-Black policies. He is narrated as surviving multiple attacks on his character sanctioned by the state. This resonates in amapiano music, as we see a similar desire to fight the "system" and win. This genre of music is silent on Zuma's sexual life and his liberation struggle contribution; it receives him as a popular figure. Like maskandi and liberation songs, it is again spectacular masculinity that the genre celebrates. Zuma, Shaka Zulu, and John Wick, all these men have the same militant masculinist appeal.

Conclusion

There has been much scholarship on liberation songs and maskandi. Unlike these two genres, there is little critical engagement with amapiano as this is a 'young' genre. In all these genres, there is a masculinist ethos that underpins the messages transmitted. Amapiano is the least conflicted of these three in its relationship with Msholozi. The liberation songs, much like the liberation movement, are a myriad of internal conflicts and paradoxes. Whilst Zuma's use of political songs is premised on a vocalized and implied distinction between the "people" and the elite, where he identifies with the "people", his recitations mostly prey on feelings of nostalgia and recognition without much genuine concern for real ordinary people. In other words, Zuma understands and manipulates the saliency of political songs to fight factional battles. The strength of the struggle songs is in the ways they create affective environments. The three genres have different histories and are popular in different socio-political contexts. They are continuous in the ways they endorse the same spectacular masculinity.

This chapter has argued that Izingane ZoMa's endorsement of the former president is complicated due to Zuma's widely known association with predatory sexuality. The group's

[30] Mahlangu, Sandile. "Piano City feat Young Stunna". *YouTube,* uploaded by MajourLeagueDjz, 14 Sep. 2021. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eru-Hz-3EAM.

decision to refrain from using their popularity to critique rather than endorse the former president csn be understood by acknowledging the reality that in post-independent Africa, proximity to the state usually means access to resources. Izingane ZoMa's endorsement of Zuma was a better financial bet.

Zuma brought back song to South African politics. It is one of the ways he galvanized his "people". This is the core of Zuma's politics, his well-curated allegiance to the common citizen. He convinces his followers that he is one of them, and he sings and dances with them. He speaks their languages, both literally and symbolically. Unlike the two other genres explored in the previous chapters, music is the genre where the former president has enjoyed agency. This is also how most of his fans express themselves. In the first chapter, we discussed the ways that masculinity has a hegemonic relationship with sexual violence – largely dismissing the same as an event to get over and a hurdle in a man's life. We have looked at the ways interpretations of culture that are false and manipulated for selfish ends, or "Zuma culture", create space for the configuration of sexual violence in such ways. In the second chapter, we tussled with the slipperiness of visually representing Zuma's spectacular masculinity within traditions (painting and cartoons) that have historically utilized racist repertoires of representation in South Africa. In this chapter, we explored masculinist replies to sexual violence allegations that have inspired visual portrayals.

Conclusion

In the introductory chapter, this project claimed that a review of the chosen textual and visual portrayals of the former president will show the ways South African artists, publics, and audiences reveal repressed ethnic, racial, partisan, gendered, and class conflicts. In the first chapter, we see this conflict take a gendered paradigm. Through a probing of Redi Tlhabi's *Khwezi* using conceptual frames drawn from trauma theory, biography, and feminist scholarship, I have argued that while sexual assault in *Khwezi* is a monumental force that foregrounds and weaves together Kuzwayo's life story, in *Zuma* it is compacted with other problems as one more impediment to be overcome. *Khwezi* proves itself as a salient microcosm for the study of gender formation both in the liberation struggle and in the nascent democratic nation-state. The history of sexual assault in liberation camps and the importance of feminist friendship and solidarity in the context of liberation camps and democratic South Africa is an important issue the chapter works to illuminate. Kuzwayo's life story demonstrates that apartheid cannot be collectively "remembered" without acknowledging and bringing to light the history of violence in liberation movements as well as the existence of violent masculinity following those struggles. This work adds to the expansive scholarship on rape culture/s in South Africa. I have argued the gendered relationships with rape where the 'feminine' response is melancholia, and the 'masculinist' reaction is to view traumas of sexual violence as occasions to 'get over'.

In the second chapter, I added a racial paradigm to the existing tensions outlined. I argued that the usefulness and restrictions of the erect penis metaphor are still up for debate. The chosen visual portraits poignantly address several themes. One is urged to envision how the figures in "The Rape of Lady Justice" continued to abuse Kuzwayo by forcefully assuring Zuma of their allegiance. They went further by using their position to gather support for Zuma in the organizations they were leading and through public mobilization. One must also consider how prescient the cartoon was, with Zuma being recalled by the ANC in the last months of his second term because of his alleged involvement in state capture. Predatory sexual behavior that was initially described in the first chapter is engaged provocatively in "The Spear". While the spear was formerly used to strike the enemy, it is now used to represent the penis and a sign of the gender gap in political organizing. By doing this, I have shown the ways these works form a repertoire of representation and how that is itself a language. Although as mentioned there is

a lot the artworks achieve, the artists are navigating thin lines. These lines are made even thinner when we consider the fact that visual arts consumers in South Africa and the spaces of exhibitions are disproportionately white, and disproportionately elite.

In the third chapter, I extended the gendered tensions to look at the ways songs associated with the former president revealed ethnic and class tensions. I argued that similar to the liberation struggle, the liberation songs have many internal tensions. The controversy is mostly caused by Zuma's involvement in Imbokodo. However, the struggle songs' strength lies in their ability to build emotional atmospheres. Critical interactions with the struggle songs and their histories discussed in this chapter are superseded by a desire for and allegiance to specific ways of being as well as nostalgia for both actual and imagined times and places. Izingane ZoMa's support of the former president can be read as a failure to meaningfully utilize their popularity to critique Zuma's much-publicized history of alleged predatory sexual behavior. In endorsing the spectacular masculinity of the past president, the group failed to use its position as a female-led maskandi group in a genre conventionally affiliated with male artists. However, alignment with the former president promised better marketability and better patronage for the group. This research adds to existing scholarship by trying to meaningfully and extensively trace spectacular masculinity as a link in Zuma's liberation songs and Izingane ZoMa's "Msholozi". In tracing this violent masculinity, the study in part concurs with Gqola's argument that post Zuma's rape trial, South African politics were proliferated with violent masculinities that shaped national discourses. The discussion pertaining to the two subgenres is partly a synthesis of existing scholarship that tries to magnify Zuma's role in Imbokodo and his spectacular masculinity. There is scarce literature on Zuma's time with uMkhonto we Sizwe's intelligence and there is a paucity of scholarship on the ways that his time within guerilla movement shaped his philosophy. Moving from these two subgenres to a new subgenre with less scholarship, we have argued that amapiano versions of spectacular masculinity move away from the two subgenres. In amapiano, associations with Zuma signify the aspirations of urban and peri-urban youth to defeat a system they view as fundamentally against them. The adoption of the epithet "Msholozi" is premised on the ways that Zuma and his advisors and affiliates have, beginning with the arms deal trial, represented Zuma as a target and victim of a political elite. He is, in other words, fighting the same "system" the practitioners of amapiano are fighting and has enjoyed many victories.

Born in 1995, I am part of a generation that is trying to make sense of the democratic dispensation and the Republic of South Africa's post-1994 trajectory. Although we have one of the most progressive constitutions, we have a very diverse country, and such institutions as the Truth and Reconciliation Commision (TRC) should, in theory, have laid a foundation for a progressive and inclusive South Africa. I and a lot of people in my milieu constantly feel excluded and lacking in full belonging. We are enveloped by non-belonging. One of the most important functions of this study is trying to make sense of the nation-state by placing Zuma as a window through which to study the social, political, and economic exchanges within the country.

Bibliography

Adebanwi, Wale, and Rogers Orock. "Rethinking Achille Mbembe's Notes on the Postcolony". *ProQuest,* 2022 https://www.proquest.com/docview/2621604044?parentSessionId=P47nn5LBiLSYpTnNd0rabQIKCl1GiXFf0n0CebxTXTg%3D&pq-origsite=summon&accountid=15083. Accessed 11 Aug. 2013.

Ahmed, Sara. *Living A Feminist Life.* Duke University Press, 2017.

Allen, Lara. "Music and politics in Africa". *Social Dynamics,* vol. 30, no. 2, 2004, pp. 1-19.

Around, Woody, and Bonga Ngwane. "Maskandi Deserves Respect". *National Union of Metal Workers in South Africa* (NUMSA) *News*, 2006, https://numsa.org.za/2006/10/maskandi-deserves-respect/. Accessed 25 May 2013.

Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Rabelais and His World.* Translated by Tvorchestvo Fransua Rable, Indiana University Press, 1984.

Barber, Karin. "Popular Arts in Africa". *African Studies Review,* vol. 30, no. 3, 1987, pp. 1-78.

----------. "Preliminary Notes on Audience in Africa". *Africa: Journal of International African Institute,* vol. 67, no. 3, 1997, pp. 347-362.

----------*A History of African Popular Culture.* Cambridge University Press, 2018.

Barthes, Roland. "The Death of the Author". *Image, Music, Text,* 1977, pp.142-148.

Basson, Adriaan. "Zuma Rape-Case Timeline". *News24,* 2006, https://www.news24.com/news24/zuma-rape-case-timeline-20060212. Accessed 11 Aug. 2023.

Bauman, Richard. *Verbal Art as Performance.* Waveland Press, 1997.

Berlant, Lauren. *The Female Complaint: The Unfinished Business of Sentimentality in American Culture.* Duke University Press, 2008.

Biko, Steve. *I Write What I Like.* Penguin Books, 1978.

Boswell, Barbara. *And Wrote My Story Anyway.* Wits University Press, 2020.

Collison, Carl. "Women Freedom Fighters Tell of Sexual Abuse in Camps". *Mail & Guardian*, 2017, https://mg.co.za/article/2017-10-27-00-our-women-freedom-fighters-tell-of-sexual-abuse-in-camps/. Accessed 26 Jan. 2023.

Coplan, David. *In Township Tonight!: South Africa's Black City Music and Theatre.* Longman Group Limited, 1985.

Cruikshank, William. 1819. *All among the Hottentots capering to shore 1820.* Cartoon. William Fehr Collection, Cape Town.
Deloria, Vine. *Custer Died for Your Sins: An Indian Manifesto.* Scribner, 1969.

Davis, Rebecca. "From The Spear to Umshini Wam, A Trip Less Travelled". *Daily Maverick,* 2012, https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2012-09-04-from-the-spear-to-umshini-wam-a-trip-less-expected/. Accessed 03 Nov. 2023.

Davis, Stephen R. *The ANC's War Against Apartheid: Umkhonto Wesizwe and the Liberation of South Africa.* Indiana University Press, 2018.

Dickens, Charles. *Gresat Expectations.* Chapman and Hall, 1867.

Dreyer, Ronald. *Namibia and Southern Africa: Regional Dynamics of Decolonization*, *1945-90.* Kegan Paul International, 1994.

Fisher, Jennifer. "Exhibitionary Affect". *N. Paradoxa,* vol. 18*,* 2006, pp.27-33.

Freud, Sigmund. *The History of the Psychoanalytic Movement.* Translated by Strachey James and Anna Freud, The Nogarth Press and the Institute of Psycho-Analysis, 1917.

Goldblatt, Beth and Sheila Mentjies. "Dealing with the Aftermath: Sexual Violence and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission". *Agenda*, vol. 36, 1997, pp. 7-18.

Gon, Sara. "The Dangerous Rise of Zuma's Private Army". *South African Institute of Race Relations (IRR),* 2017, https://irr.org.za/media/articles-authored-by-the-institute/the-dangerous-rise-of-jacob-zumas-private-army. Accessed 31 May 2023.

Gordin, Jeremy. *Zuma: A Biography.* 2nd ed., Jonathan Ball Publishers, 2009.

Gqola, Pumla. " 'The Difficult Task of Normalizing Freedom': Spectacular Masculinities, Ndebele's Literary/Cultural Commentary and Post-Apartheid Life". *English in Africa,* vol. 36, no.1, 2009, pp. 61-76.

----------*Rape: A South African Nightmare.* Jacana Media, 2015.

Gray, Anne-Marie. "Liberation Songs Sung by Black South Africans During the 20th Century". *International Journal of Music Education,* vol. 33, no.1 , 1999, pp.30-37.

Gunner, Liz. "Jacob Zuma, the Social Body and the Unruly Power of Song". *African Affairs,* vol. 108, no. 480, 2008, pp. 27-48.

----------. "Political Song in Africa". *Oxford University Press*, 2020, https://oxfordre.com/politics/politics/view/10.1093/acrefore/9780190228637.001.0001/acrefore-9780190228637-e-901. Accessed 26 Jan. 2023.

Hall, Stuart. “The Work of Representation: Representation, Meaning, and Language”. *Representation: Cultural Representation and Signifying Practices,* edited by Stuart Hall, Jessica Evans, and Sean Nixon, Sage Publications, 1997, pp. 1-47.

Hammet, Daniel. “Zapiro and Zuma: A Symptom of an Emerging Constitutional Crisis in South Africa?” *Political Geography,* vol. 29*,* no. 2, 2010, pp.88-96.

Hans, Bongani. “Zuma’s Gift to Rape Charge Defendenders”. *IOL* (Independent Online), 2017, https://www.iol.co.za/news/zumas-gift-to-rape-charge-defenders-11446632. Accessed 11 Aug. 2023.

Hassim, Shireen. “Democracy’s Shadows: Sexual Rights and Gender Politics in the Rape Trial of Jacob Zuma”. *African Studie,* vol. 68, no.1, 2009, pp. 57-77.

----------. “Violent Modernity: Gender, Race, and Bodies in Contemporary South African Politics”. *Politikon,* vol. 41, no. 2, 2014, pp. 167-182.

----------. *The ANC Women’s League.* Ohio University Press, 2014.

Helman, Rebecca. "Mapping the Unrapeability of White and Black Womxn." *Agenda,* vol. 32, no.4 , 2018), pp. 10-21.

Hlasane, Rangoato and Bhekizizwe Peterson. “Matters of Kwaito and Why Kwaito Matters”. *Routledge Handbook of African Popular Culture,* edited by Grace Musila, Routlege, 2022, pp. 1189-1251, *Taylor and Francis, https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9781003080855-19/matters-kwaito-kwaito-matters-rangoato-hlasane-bhekizizwe-peterson.* Accessed 9 Aug 2023.

High Court of South Africa (Witwatersrand Local Division). *The State v. Jacob Gedleyihlekisa Zuma.* Saflii.org, 2006.

Hofmeyr, Isabel. “Popular Literature in Africa: Post Resistance Perspective”. *Social Dynamics,* vol. 30, no. 2, 2004, pp.128-140.

Hove, Muchativugwa. “Archives of Remembrance: Imagined Triumphalist Narratives of the Self.” *National Institute for the Humanities and Social Sciences Symposium, Melrose Arc,*

South Africa, October 2017. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/320548104_Archives_of_remembrance_Imagined_triumphalist_narratives_of_the_self.

Hughes, Tim, Richard Steyn, and Rebekah Kendal. "Zuma, *Jacob Zuma: A Biography"* (Book Review). *Biography,* vol. 33, no.1, 2010, pp. 300-301.

Irvine, Judith and Liz Gunner. "With Respect to Zulu: Revisiting ukuHlonipha". *Anthropological Quarterly,* vol. 91, no.1, 2018, pp. 173-207.

Jay, Martin. *Refractions of Violence.* Routledge, 2003.

Joja, Athi. "Anton Kannemeyer". *Africanah*, 2015, https://africnah.org/anton-kannemeyer-2/. Accessed 19 Feb. 2023.

Julin, Grant. "Satire in a Multi-Cultural World: A Bakhtinian Analysis". *Comedy Studies*, vol. 9, no. 2, 2018, pp.150-170.

Kannemeyer, Anton. 2015. *R is for Respect.* Painting. Stevenson Gallery, Johannesburg.

Kasrils, Ronnie. *A Simple Man, Kasrils and the Zuma Enigma.* Jacana Media, 2017.

Koelbe, Thomas and Steven Robins. "The Work of a Political Cartoonist in South Africa—Caricature, Complexity, and Comedy in a Climate of Contestation". *American Political Science Association,* vol. 40 , no. 2, 2007, pp.315-318.

Koorts, Lindie. "Biography as Discourse: South African Biography in the Post-apartheid Era." *Different Lives,* Brill, 2020, pp. 41-56

Khoza, Mthuthuzeli, Ntokozo Rarane, and Sizwe. "uMsholozi". *YouTube Music.* https://music.youtube.com/watch?v=CSI8QaEz_WY&feature=share. Accessed 15 May 2023.

"'Kill for Zuma': I can explain, says Malema". *Mail & Guardian,* https://mg.co.za/article/2008-06-17-kill-for-zuma-i-can-explain-says-malema/. Accessed 15 May 2023.

Laub, Dori. "'Bearing Witness or the Vicissitudes of Listening'" . *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis and History,* edited by Shoshana Felman and Dori Laub, Routledge,1992, pp. 57-74.

Laurence, Patrick. "Jacob Zuma and Imbokodo". *Politics Web,* 2009, https://www.politicsweb.co.za/opinion/jacob-zuma-and-imbokodo. Accessed 11 Mar. 2023.

Lawson, Marcel. "'This is Amapiano" (Documentary)", *BBCNews Africa*, 2022, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ou0luMrf1mU. Accessed 28 Jan. 2023.

Lewis, Esther, and Andisiwe Makinana. "Accuser 'Enjoyed Sex with Zuma'". *Independent Online* (IOL), 2009, https://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/accuser-enjoyed-sex-with-zuma-432215. Accesed 15 May 2023.

Mabulu, Ayanda. 2012. *Umshini Wam.* Painting. AVA Gallery, Cape Town.

Magadla, Siphokazi. *Demobilisation and the Civilian Reintegration of Women Ex-Combatants in Post-Apartheid South Africa: The Aftermath of Transnational Guerrilla girls, Combative Mothers and In-betweeners in the Shadows of a Late Twentieth-Century War.* 2016. Rhodes University, PhD dissertation. *SEALS,* http://vital.seals.ac.za:8080/vital/access/manager/PdfViewer/vital:25133/SOURCE1?viewPdfInternal=1.

Mahlangu, Kabelo, and Themba Sekowe, and Tshwarelo Motlhako. "Umsholozi". *Youtube Music. https://music.youtube.com/watch?v=Z1V8S1hyB2g&feature=share.*

De Man, Paul. *Introduction to Jauss H.R: Toward an Aesthetic of Reception*. Minnesota Press, 1982.

"Manifesto Of Umkhonto We Sizwe Leaflet Issued By The Command Of Umkhonto We Sizwe". *African National Congress, https://www.anc1912.org.za/manifesto-1961-manifesto-of-umkhonto-we-sizwe/.* Accessed 16 Mar. 2023.

Maré, Gerhard. *Ethnic Continuities and a State of Exception: Goodwill Zwelithini, Mangosuthu Buthelezi and Jacob Zuma.* University of KwaZulu-Natal Press, 2020.

Mason, Andrew. "The Cannibal Ogre and the Rape of Justice: A Contrapuntal View". *Critical African Studies,* vol. 2 , no. 4, 2010, pp. 32-64.

Mbembe, Achille. "Provisional Notes on the Post-Colony". *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*, Vol. 62, No. 1, 1992 , pp. 3-37.

----------.*On the Postcolony.* University of California Press, 2001.

McClintock, Anne. ""No Longer in Future Heaven": Women and Nationalism in South Africa". *Transition,* no.51, 1991, pp. 104-123.

McKenzie, Gayton. *Kill Zuma: By Any Means Necessary.* ZAR Empire, 2017.

Mhlambi, Innocentia. "'Seyiyakhuluma': IsiZulu as a New Language for Political and Corporate Mass Communication Through Mobile Telephony". *African Identities,* vol. 10, no. 2, 2012, 129-142.

Mohlomi, Setumo-Thebe. "The Top 10 Best Amapiano Songs of 2019". *OkayAfrica,* 2019, https://www.okayafrica.com/amapiano-best-songs-2019/. Accessed 16 Mar. 2023.

Mokoena, Hlonipha. "Jeremy Gordin. *Jacob Zuma: A Biography*" (Book Review). *African Studies Review,* vol. 53, no. 2, 2010, pp. 223-224.

Moloi, Jake. "The case of S v Zuma: Implications of allowing evidence of sexual history in rape trials." *SA Crime quarterly,* no.18, 2006, pp.25-29.

Mthembu, Sihle. "A Complicated Masterpiece: How Izingane ZoMa's 'Msholozi' Endorsed Jacob Zuma". *News24*, 2020, https://www.news24.com/life/arts-and-entertainment/music/how-izingane-zomas-msholozi-changed-the-face-of-maskandi-20200806. Accessed 12 Mar. 2023.

Mtshali, Samkelo. "Carl Niehaus says Court's Decision on Ex-President Zuma 'Must be Rejected'. *Independent Online (IOL)*, 2021, https://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/carl-niehaus-says-courts-decision-on-ex-president-zuma-must-be-rejected-7542d277-ff7a-466f-bbfe-8b1e3aecd2ee. Accessed 31 May 2023.

Murray, Brett. 2010. *The Spear.* Painting. Goodman Gallery, Johannesburg.

Murray, Jessica. " 'I was a Girl of my Time': A Feminist Literary Analysis of Representations of Time and Gender in Selected Contemporary South African Fiction by women. *Literator: Journal of Literary Criticism, Comparative Linguistics and Literary Studies*, vol. 38,no.1, pp. 1-8.

Ngwenya, Thengamehlo. *Ideology and Form in South Afr` ican Autobiographical writing: A Study of the Autobiohraphies of Five South African Authors* [Unpublished PhD thesis]. 1996. University of South Africa.

Nicholson, Greg. "How South African Anti-Rape Protestors Disrupted Zuma's Speech". *The Guardian,* 2016, https://amp.theguardian.com/world/2016/aug/09/south-africa-zuma-rape-protestors-disrupt. Accessed 03 Nov. 2023.

Nkoala, Sisanda. "Songs that Shaped the Struggle: A Rhetorical Analysis of South African Struggle Songs". *African Yearbook of Rhetoric,* vol.4, no.1, 2013, pp. 51-61.

Ngobese, Bongekile, Thandoluni Phungula, Tholakele Ngobese, Busani Kuzwayo, and Shobeni Kuzwayo. "Msholozi". *Youtube Music.* https://music.youtube.com/watch?v=V7hJOIVjJJMM&feature=share. Accessed 03 Nov. 2023.

Ntombela, Sipho. "*Maskandi*: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Indigenous isiZulu Songs". *South African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies,* vol.34, no.2, 2016, pp. 109-120.

----------. "*Maskandi*: A Critical General Inducive Analysis of Zulu Maskandi Songs". *Southern African Journal for Folklore Studies,* vol.27, no.1, pp.42-52.

Peterson, Bheki. “Kwaito, ‘Dawgs’ and the Antimonies of Hustling”. *African Identities,* vol.1, no.2, 2003, pp. 197-213.

----------. “Dignity, Memory, and the Future Under Siege”. *Wits Institute for Social and Economic Research* (WiSER), 2012, https://wiser.wits.ac.za/system/files/seminar/PetersonB2012.pdf. Accessed 15 Aug. 2023.

Pieretti-Courtis, Delphine. “African Hypersexuality: A Threat to White Settlers? The Stigmatization of “Black Sexuality” as a Means of Regulating “White Sexuality””. *Histories of Sexology: Between Politics and Science,* edited by Alain Giami and Sharman Levinson, Palgrave Macmillan, 2021, pp. 263-276.

Rassool, Ciraj. “Rethinking Documentary History and South African Political Biography”. *South African Review of Sociology,* vol. 41, no.1, 2010, pp. 28-55.

Ratele, Kopano. “Ruling Masculinity and Sexuality”. *Feminist Africa,* no. 6, 2006, pp. 48-64.

Rose, Jacqueline. *States of Fantasy*. Clarendon Press, 1996.

Sesanti, Simphiwe. “The Concept of ‘Respect’ in African Culture in the Context of Journalism Practice: An Afrocentric Intervention”. *Communication,* vol. 36, no. 3, 2010, pp. 343-358.

Shapiro, Jonathan. (2008, September 7). *The Rape of Lady Justice*. Cartoon. The Sunday Times.

Shumba, Kemist, and Anna Meyer-Weitz. “Addressing the Socio-Cultural Drivers of HIV/AIDS Through Indigenous Music : A Critical Discourse Analysis of Selected Songs by Maskandi Group, Izingane Zoma”. *African Renaissance,* vol. 16, no.4, 2019, pp. 133-155.

Smith, David. “South Africa: Jacob Zuma Sweeps to Victory in ANC Leadership Election”, *The Guardian,* 2012, https://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/dec/18/jacob-zuma-south-africa-anc.

Strauss, Helene. “Listening Otherwise: The Semiotics of the Violence in Achmat Dangor’s *Bitter Fruit”. Wasafiri,* vol. 23, no.1, 2008, pp.51-56.

Stiehler, Beate, and Guilio Toscani. “Popular Art: An Investigation of Jacob Zuma Spear Painting”. *Ideas in Marketing: Finding the New and Polishing the Old,* edited by Krzysztof Kubacki, Springer, 2016, pp. 516-525.

Suriano, Maria. “Popular Music, Identity and Politics in Colonial Urban Space”. *African Cities: Competing Claims on Urban Space*, edited by Francesca Locatelli & Paul Nugent, Brill, 2009, pp.261-290.

Tambo, Oliver. “Sanctions and the Armed Struggle”. *The South African Reader: History, Culture, Politics,* edited by Clifton Crais and Thomas McClendon, Duke University Press, 2014, pp. 391-395.

Tlhabi, Redi. *Khwezi: The Remarkable Story of Fezekile Ntsukela Kuzwayo.* Jonathan Ball Publishers, 2017.

Tjale, Karabo. “ ‘The Spear’ is Pure Prejudice”. *Eye Witness News (EWN),* 2012, https://ewn.co.za/2012/05/19/The-Spear-is-pure-prejudice---ANCWL. Accessed 15 May 2023.

De Vos, Pierre. “Coming to Grips with Complexity in a South African Censorship Debate: On Jacob Zuma, the Spear, and Respect for Human Dignity”. *Social Science Research Network,* 2012, https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2070589. Accessed 04 Jun. 2023.

Vilakazi, Ellie, and Julieann Ulin. "Intermediating Politics Through Subjectivity in Khwezi: The Remarkable Story of Fezekile Ntsukela Kuswayo by Redi Tlhabi." *FAU Undergraduate Research Journal,* vol.9 , 2020, pp. 31-38.

*“‘*Wezeni Uzuma*?’:* ANC KZN Conferences kicks off.*”* *Youtube,* uploaded by Eyewitness News (EWN), 22 Jul. 2022, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rzMPtFVMECM&t=20s.

White, Hylton. “A Post-Fordist Ethnicity: Insecurity, Authority, and Identity in South Africa”. *Antropological Quarterly,* vol. 85, no.2, 2012, pp. 397-427.

Yuval-Davis, Nira. “Gender and Nation”. *Ethnic and Racial Studies,* vol 16, no. 4, 1993, pp. 621-632.

Zuma, Jacob. “Jacob Zuma Sings Umshini Wam.” *YouTube,* uploaded by Livhuwani Mammburu, 4 Aug. 2008, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lof6XJ8b1SU.

----------“Zuma Leads Singing in Remembering Mandela”. *YouTube*, uploaded by Perwez Abdullah, 15 Dec. 2013, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Vfxiw-ow2kQ&t=285s.

----------. “President Jacob Zuma- Thina Sizwe and Umhla Sibuyayo”. *YouTube,* uploaded by Luchulumanco Speaks, 7 Sep. 2015, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ctqfid-Ausc.