

https://dspace.org/

# The capacity of Eastern Cape Governance in a post-apartheid era: service delivery in schools

**Magwaca, Onela Nolwandle**

**2021**
https://hdl.handle.net/10539/32234

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

# THE CAPACITY OF EASTERN CAPE GOVERNANCE IN A POST-APARTHEID ERA: SERVICE DELIVERY IN SCHOOLS

By

**ONELA NOLWANDLE MAGWACA 1115356**

Submitted as required for the degree

Political Science

In the

Department of Political Sciences

Faculty of Humanities

University of Witwatersrand

Supervisor: Professor Joel Quirk

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To be able to have gotten to this part of my dissertation, only brings me joy because it could have only been made possible by the people I am about to thank. I would like to begin by thanking my father, Vuyani Nogaga, for encouraging me to go this far in my education. I honestly would not be here without you. I am forever indebted to you, Dad. I would like to thank my Grandfather, Bridgeman Magwaca for allowing me to see Mdantsane through his eyes. I would also like to thank every single sibling and family member of mine, the belief you all have in me has not gone unnoticed. My roommates, whom I love so dearly, Shalima and Zonke, thank you for your consistent words of encouragement, support and love.

I am grateful to the people I have met along the way, who persistently would ask about my topic and its progress- you kept me on my toes.

Lastly, I would like to thank my supervisor, Professor Joel Quirk, who came to my rescue and believed in my topic from the moment he heard about it. I thank you for your time, efforts and input as they helped me piece this dissertation together.

This dissertation is also in loving memory of Mdanstane's finest: Bongiwe Magwaca, Maureen Magwaca and Vuyelwa Ntsabo. You are sorely missed.

# ABBREVIATIONS

ANC – African National Congress

BCM – Buffalo City Municipality

BCMM – Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality

CODESA- Convention for a Democratic South Africa

DST - Department of Science and Technology

DoE - Department of Education

DWS - Department of Water and Sanitation

ECDoE - Eastern Cape Department of Education

FBS - Free Basic Services

HREC – Human Research Ethics Committee

IGR- Intergovernmental Relations

MLL – Minimum Living Level

NSDP - National Spatial Development Perspective

NEIMS - National Education Infrastructure Management System

OAU – Organisation of African Unity

OHS – Occupational Health and Safety

PMG - Parliamentary Monitoring Group

PSU - Project Support Units

RDP - Reconstruction and Development Programme

SHE - Safety, Health and Environment

SMMEs – Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises

VIP – Ventilated Improved Latrine

WRC – Water Research Commission

# ABSTRACT

This dissertation addresses two central questions: first, how have policies within the post-Apartheid government promoted a more equitable society in the Eastern Cape province? Secondly, how has the inequality and treatment of the previously marginalised been eliminated? These research questions are addressed by analysing the legacies of Apartheid in the Eastern Cape, from the establishment of Bantustans to citizen experiences in a post-Apartheid society today. Equity interventions, with particular focus on the regulation of service delivery within an ex-Bantustan province, are essential in this analysis. This investigation is guided by the following key variables: Bantustan governance, policy and implementation reform, and infrastructural development.

This dissertation illustrates the ways in which post-1994 reform structures have not sufficiently impacted the Eastern Cape in the post-Apartheid setting. One of the previous landmarks for segregation and inequality, which were schools, is used in this study to demonstrate the continuous disadvantaged circumstances in the Eastern Cape. The conditions within schools are a fragment of the issues within the province and are reflective of the slow pace of development. The inclusion of semi-structured interviews with the selection of ex-staff members in various Mdanstane schools, ward councillors, as well as the government-owned water implementation agent Amatola Water expose real-life issues and concerns that detail sanitation in schools within the Eastern Cape. This study illustrates that there is a lack of effective implementation of service delivery in the Eastern Cape and that the regulations of the standards throughout the province shown through inherited systems of Apartheid governance and infrastructure, are not adequately maintained.

This study argues that the post-Apartheid government has failed to reform and implement service delivery and infrastructure within the Eastern Cape. It indicates that the transition from separate development to a unified country has not been wholly beneficial for the previously marginalised. This study shows that development within the Eastern Cape continues to decline because of the history of neglect associated with it. It is also argued that the incapacity of Eastern Cape governance can be attributed to the inaccessibility of essential services, poor provincial governance, and inefficiency within the reform of public services throughout the years of the new representative government.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ..... **i**
**ABBREVIATIONS** ..... **ii**
**ABSTRACT** ..... **iii**

**CHAPTER 1 – THE GENESIS OF POLITICAL ORDER IN THE EASTERN CAPE**
1.1 Introduction ..... 1
1.2 The importance of the study ..... 4
1.4 Research objectives ..... 6
1.5 Methodology ..... 7
1.6 Literature review ..... 9
1.6.1 The Bantustan order ..... 9
1.6.2 The new administration in South Africa ..... 11
1.6.3 Organisational consequences ..... 12
1.6.4 Efficiency in an equal South Africa ..... 13
1.6.5 The effect of poor services in the new regime ..... 14
1.7 The structure of the study ..... 18

**CHAPTER 2 - THE LEGACY OF THE BANTUSTANS IN THE EASTERN CAPE**
2.1 Introduction ..... 20
2.1.1 History of Bantustan governance ..... 21
2.1.2 The chronicles of the homeland governments ..... 23
2.2 The legacy of the Bantustans ..... 25
2.2.1 The Ciskei government ..... 25
2.3 What does South African governance look like now? ..... 27
2.4 Batho Pele Policy - Transformation of public service delivery ..... 29
2.5 Access to basic services ..... 31

**CHAPTER 3 - THE PRESSURES OF WATER AND ITS DELIVERY**
3.1 Introduction ..... 33
3.1.1 South Africa's liberalisation: Equal delivery rights ..... 34
3.1.2 Infrastructural and service trials ..... 36
3.2 Water service delivery challenges ..... 37
3.2.1 Decentralisation in administrative distribution ..... 38
3.2.2 The politicisation of water delivery ..... 41
3.3 Government intermediary: Amatola Water Board ..... 43
3.4 Political interference and the provision of resources ..... 45
3.5 Water issues in Eastern Cape schools ..... 47
3.6 A pipe dream: Sustainable water delivery ..... 49

3.7 Conclusion .....50

**CHAPTER 4 - EASTERN CAPE SCHOOL INFRASTRUCTURE AND ITS DISPLACEMENTS ON EDUCATION**

4.1 Introduction ..... 52
4.1.1 The Bantu education system ..... 52
4.1.2 Schooling in a white setting ..... 55
4.2 The state of Eastern Cape schools ..... 56
4.2.1 The supply chain of school resources ..... 57
4.2.2 The sustainability of provision for schools in the Eastern Cape ..... 60
4.2.3 Infrastructure and sanitation in the Education Department ..... 61
4.3. Conclusion .....64

**CHAPTER 5 - CONCLUSION .....65**
**BIBLIOGRAPHY…… … 69**
**APPENDIX ..... 82**

# CHAPTER 1 – THE GENESIS OF POLITICAL ORDER IN THE EASTERN CAPE

## 1.1 Introduction

The Eastern Cape Province has a compelling history in its emergence as one of the nine provinces in South Africa. The evolution of this province is deeply rooted within European colonialism, Apartheid and the establishment of homelands. According to Allsobrook and Boisen (2016, 14) "Apartheid was strongly influenced by the British model of indirect rule, practiced on the basis of Trusteeship, in the Basutoland and Transkei Protectorates". These different periods all have commonalities of isolation and victimization on generations of people living in the Eastern Cape. The harsh after-effects of these events still remain. This dissertation focuses on patterns of mismanagement, as well as the impact of municipalities and government-owned organisations on schools in the Eastern Cape.

These larger issues are encapsulated in the continued failure of the Eastern Cape government to provide adequate water and sanitation needs in schools. The Eastern Cape Department of Education's (ECDoE) 2017 report revealed that "a year after the deadline for plain pit latrines to have been eradicated, there were still 2 127 Eastern Cape schools with access to only plain pit latrines" (Equal Education 2019, 3). In 2018, the death of five-year old Lumka Mketwa, who fell into a pit latrine in the Eastern Cape, was a tragic and unfortunate demonstration of the continuing infrastructural problems within the province. These backlogs constitute a violation of the right to a safe and healthy environment for the appropriate disposal of human waste. A pit latrine, also known as a pit toilet or long drop, is a type of toilet that collects human faeces in a hole in the ground. This form of sanitation is outdated and has shown to be both harmful and fatal for school children. The creation of this form of sanitation was designed to accommodate a lack of piped water, which are one of the contributing factors behind repeated attempts to achieve deadlines for sanitation reform that are not met with, in Eastern Cape schools. The Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation (DHSWS) refers to the lack of sanitation as causing the loss of personal dignity and under these circumstances the situation must be nullified.

This research also seeks to explore the Amatola Water Board, here after referred to as Amatola Water, and its efforts and the organisation's impact on unsafe sanitation in Eastern Cape

schools. “Amatola Water, a state-owned, non-profit making business enterprise accountable to the Minister of Water and Environmental Affairs, was created jointly by national, provincial and local community stakeholders to serve as a multi- service, bulk water services provider. Its core aim is to assist Local Government in the effective development and sustainable operation and maintenance of safe, reliable water supply and waste water services”(Water Institute of Southern Africa NPC 2017, 12). The commissioning of Amatola Water by the local government in the Eastern Cape offers a diversified approach to the delivery and support of sustainable water delivery. This study incorporates this organisation as an evaluation of the government’s actions towards its issues of water and sanitation backlogs.

This chapter intends to explain the background of post-Apartheid development approaches executed within the Eastern Cape Province in South Africa. The argument in this chapter demonstrates the continuity of poor governance systems in the Eastern Cape. This has been illustrated by establishing that schools within the province were and continue to be negatively impacted by the South African Apartheid regime. A later chapter exposes this. The arguments made in this chapter create a foundation of the ways in which governance has not been as transformative as expected, which is shown in government policies and journal articles throughout this study. This chapter draws from the theoretical literature to highlight the approaches taken towards governance in the Eastern Cape from the inception of the province to its more current forms. This conclusion led to the analysis that the effects of poor governance within the previously neglected Eastern Cape Province have not been discontinued.

“Nearly a year and a half after the launch of President Cyril Ramaphosa’s current administration’s school sanitation campaign in 2018, only 266 out of 3,898 schools have benefitted nationally” (Mahlangu 2020, 4-6). This type of issue is often more acute in the Eastern Cape province of South Africa, where the developmental indicators tend to be more alarming than the rest of the country. Ndou (2008) found that “there was and still is a high dropout rate among black school children linked to widespread poverty and social alienation, coupled with a lack of provision for basic needs for over one million children”. Attention needs to be given to the accumulation of province-specific matters in the Eastern Cape for the accurate investigation of the non-performance of government policies.

Progress in South Africa's can be tracked in terms of human development, which focuses on factors such as the quality of basic resources that people receive, the level of education acquired, what they are able to do and how well they live. Observing South Africa's timeline from the formal end of Apartheid twenty-six years ago to the current day, allows for the monitoring of the progress of government in a non-Apartheid society. Transformation towards an equal society is enforced by understanding and changing the consequences of the Apartheid regime. The transition from separate development to democracy has faced challenges in its efforts to fill the gaps created by the Apartheid system. According to Inman and Rubinfield (2012, 6), "the end result of democracy, where policy responsibilities are shared between the national government and constitutionally-created provinces, is to create an annual redistribution policy game in which a majority African National Congress (ANC) controlled central government and elite controlled province(s) each set one redistributive policy instrument of importance to the other".

The Eastern Cape province serves as a territory that is entitled to reparations that guarantee the implementation of relevant redistributive policies. The Apartheid's repressive regime has robbed this specific province of public resources, leading to the lessening of the quality of life. Post-Apartheid policies have been characterised by attempts to redress previously marginalized areas. This necessitated focus on provinces such as the Eastern Cape. According to Allan, Somhlaba, Tetyana and Zepe (2004, 79), "the amalgamation of three bureaucracies, namely Transkei, Ciskei and parts of central South Africa, into one province created enormous logistical and organisational difficulties for the new administration in the Eastern Cape". The public health sector, as an example of the disadvantages within the Eastern Cape, was detailed "as an inheritance of dysfunctional and under-resourced Apartheid and Bantustan institutions, and the deliberate 'sabotage' by white health professionals, have variously been invoked to explain the department's failure to deliver effective health services in line with its budgeted resources" (Goqwana 2004, 1).

In addition to the list of inherited inadequacies, Westaway (2012, 118) adds that "one of the most stubborn myths about the so-called new South Africa is that it had successfully delivered water to the people". Furthermore, he states that the reality is that in the Ciskei and Transkei, two thirds of rural households do not have access to RDP-standard water provision. According to the National Water Act of 36 (1998), "the standards of water provision as per government

specifications include that a minimum volume of 6,000 litres (or 25 litre per person per day) of potable water shall be made available to a household per month; the access/delivery point shall be at least a yard connection; the water shall be made available for at least 350 days per year, and not interrupted for longer than 48 consecutive hours".

The playing field of equal treatment and service delivery continues to be an ongoing issue for black residents in Eastern Cape rural areas. This is tied to South Africa's racialised history and serves as a symbol of a legacy of disenfranchisement. The need for provincial planning for the Eastern Cape based on its history was a necessity, for reintegration that would support and allow for its development. According to Gopane (2012, 3) "the ineffective operations of municipalities were usually found to be the root cause of ineffective service delivery".

This dissertation includes schools in the Eastern Cape in order to illustrate how systems that were previously riddled with repression have struggled to overcome the lingering effects from the previous regime. Education was viewed as a part of the overall Apartheid system, which included the 'homelands', urban restrictions, pass laws and job reservation. In correcting the injustices of the past, the Eastern Cape Department of Education pronounced that the current government is working to rectify imbalances in education. "The greatest challenges lie in the poorer, rural provinces like the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal" (ECDoE 2013, par.4). The use of the platform of schools were used as one of the gateways for oppression by the National Party government and created opportunities for further exploitation of the black population. Post-Apartheid reform has had to be implemented across the homelands, in employment, in newly urban locations, as well as in schools.

### 1.2 The importance of the study

Twenty years after the end of Apartheid and despite decades of government promises regarding the reform of previous 'homelands' there are still fundamental problems in the delivery and implementation of the basic and essential services, such as water and safe sanitation. The linkage of water, safe sanitation and the inadequate disposal of human waste in this research is for the critique of post-Apartheid governance and the legacy of inequalities relating to the state of service delivery in the Eastern Cape. The delivery of water and the inadequate disposal of human waste (excretion) is a deplorable one. The two known fatalities of children, Michael Kompe and Lumka Mketwa, as a result of drowning in pit latrines in primary schools in 2014

and 2018, has necessitated the need to understand the theory behind infrastructural reform in a province which experienced inequalities for its black population.

This study focuses on the delivery of the basic right to the supply of water by service delivery partners to municipalities in the Eastern Cape, in particular, to Mdantsane schools. “Mdantsane is an urban township in East London, that falls under the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality, in which a range of services are provided for in areas of the Eastern Cape, such as Mdantsane, East London and King Williams Town” (Evans 2019, 103). Before the change in government, Mdantsane was situated in the Ciskei, which was one of the ten Bantustans created in the Apartheid era. According to Khunou (2009, 81) “the foundation of Apartheid was premised on the formation of artificial black nations or homelands in reserves. These homelands were created on the basis of the language and culture of a particular ethnic group”. The unequal access to infrastructure and services was based on complex rules rooted in racial and gender discrimination and found expression within Bantustan territories. The Afrobarometer 2002 survey as well as the Ten Years of Democracy Survey demonstrated that “poverty in South Africa is divided along racial lines and that black Africans more frequently go without basic services and necessities than whites, coloureds and Indians do” (Hamel, Brodie and Morrin 2005, 352). This research underpins the Eastern Cape’s schools’ sanitation issues and the role of the state and its implementation agencies, such as that of the Amatola Water Board, which is an essential services utility that operates in the water sector in the Eastern Cape.

Mdantsane, which serves as my birthplace in which my maternal family still reside, is a township where its residents and children in school are still disadvantaged in regard to water services. The lack of water and resultant unsafe sanitation in schools is an issue in the Eastern Cape that has been unattended to for far too long. The government’s responsibility is to provide water and to ensure the efficient delivery of water along with its own implementation agencies. In addition to this, the government has the ability to engage with stakeholders to strengthen the implementation strategies of the relevant stakeholders. Overall, this study aims to outline and distinguish the processes of water provision services in East London to its schools.

## 1.3 Research questions

**Primary research question:**

What policies and strategies have the post-Apartheid government introduced in the Eastern Cape in relation to water, education and sanitation?

**Secondary research questions:**

What policies did the Apartheid government pursue in the Eastern Cape, and what kinds of conditions and systems did the democratic regime inherit from Apartheid?

What factors have contributed to the limited progress which has taken place under the Post-Apartheid regime in Eastern Cape in relation to service delivery?

What has the current administration done about the undersupply in Mdanstane schools?

## 1.4 Research objectives

This dissertation aims to identify the advancements of efficiency towards an undivided South African society. The previous political dispensation encouraged limitations based on race and culture. This study focuses upon the performance of the current government in relation to the reintegration of the previous homelands. With this in mind, this study assesses whether Post-Apartheid governance has made a difference in ex-Bantustan territories. The focus is in the Eastern Cape, which includes the homeland territories of the Transkei and Ciskei, with an investigation of the challenges being experienced at present. The distinguishing issues in the Eastern Cape include recognition of past injustices and its relationship with the democratic government that is enjoyed today. The concentration on service delivery in this study addresses the administration and the standards that are held within the Eastern Cape region, which allow for interrogation of the accountability of water provision in the Eastern Cape. The positioning of schools in this dissertation identifies the key role players in Eastern Cape school sanitation operations and assesses the efficiency of the ad-hoc government water intermediary, Amatola Water.

## 1.5 Methodology

This investigation followed a single case study, which focused on the Mdanstane township in the Eastern Cape. The purpose of this type of study was to engage with the specific case of a township which existed under Bantustan rule, and to observe its progress today. This study utilizes the case study of the management of schools in Mdantsane to assess the impact of the pre-democratic regime. This context brings forth the interrogation of the underlying circumstances within the province. This study establishes that the concerns of the people are illustrative of the challenges pertaining to the availability of resources in Mdantsane and those of local governance. The selected method of data analysis for this study was the qualitative method. "Qualitative research is oriented towards the quality of the lived experience of individuals, which cannot be reduced to numerical values using statistical analysis" (Hewitt-Taylor 2001,12). In support of the overall goals of this dissertation, I undertook a series of ten semi-structured interviews with respondents in the Eastern Cape. Formal ethics was approved by the Non-Medical Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC) of the University of the Witwatersrand. In order to gain access into school premises, applications were made to the National Department of Education and to the Eastern Cape Department of Education. 5I was unable to secure institutional permission from the EcDOE to interview children and teachers within the schools. I instead interviewed retired teachers, and political incumbents within the Eastern Cape and various Buffalo City stakeholders. The ethics approval was based on the submission of research instruments, participant information sheets and consent forms. The ethical clearance number H19/11/27 was provided by the HREC.

The semi-structured interviews with local councillors, ward councillors, retired teachers and members of the Amatola Water organisation focused on their roles within their specified organisations and the impact of these organisation's history on the current affairs of service delivery within the Eastern Cape . This study includes the responses of the selected participants. The process of attaining participants from each of these categories varied and, subsequently, resulted in certain limitations.

Another qualitative method that was used was the 'Snowball sample' method, also known as the chain method. Goli et al (2017, 2) explains this method by stating that it is applied when it is difficult to access subjects. In this method, the existing study subjects recruit future subjects

among their acquaintances. This method was most beneficial for the semi-structured interviews with various stakeholders within the Water Boards, as they referred people who could better accommodate the author with the answers as opposed to solely relying on the preliminary list of participants that was compiled before engaging in fieldwork. After some time trying to find participants within the Amatola Water Board, the author was able to speak to two employees. Difficulties were experienced during fieldwork with these two participants as they appeared to have been coordinating their answers. In addition, both participants structured their responses in a way that was indicative of maintaining a favourable public image, which seemed like a way of avoiding any negative questions regarding their roles in the distribution of water in their prescribed areas.

This study does not aim to be comparative, but rather explorative for the purpose of service delivery and governance issues within the province. Engagement with the voices and experiences of selected participants via interviews was imperative for the study. However, the use of secondary sources, such as the information provided by the municipality and the Amatola Water Board, as well as integrative reports, were also beneficial for the account of the status of the Eastern Cape with regard to the provision of services. The use of secondary sources allowed for accountability by the state and water intermediaries and simultaneously towards the reliability of these existing policies in regard to service delivery. Sources such as the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP), Batho Pele and the Free Basic Services (FBS), were referred to for the problematisation of water provision as a basic resource and right, as well as the investigation of the role of government officials for equal accessibility to public goods in the post-Apartheid state.

The research question probes the objectives of the post-Apartheid government and its performance within the Eastern Cape. For the context of post-Apartheid governance theorists Hemson and Owuso-Ampomah regard service delivery as unstable, but also as a requirement for redress. They add that the services are needed to raise the standard of living of the majority and to confirm their citizenship in the new South Africa. The remnants of the homeland systems are still present, such as anti-progressive means of service delivery which are relayed through backlogs in service delivery and the slow turn-around times of the repair of the Apartheid inherited infrastructure in the Eastern Cape. The presence of separatism within South Africa was associated with Apartheid rule, in which the establishment of Bantustans and its

isolationist policies were established. However, the result of the divided sections within the country caused implications of inequality towards the African population, which in turn also affected the standards within different ethnic divisions. This study thus focuses on the post1994 transition in relation to service delivery, and consequentially on water and sanitation within the Eastern Cape.

### 1.6 Literature review

This literature review with relevant authors covers the integration of the homelands into the country after democratisation, as well as the effects of the transition from the system of Apartheid to the democratic and formally egalitarian system South Africans enjoy today. The legacy of inequality is evaluated between the establishment of Bantustans and the services that are currently extended to the previously disadvantaged citizens in those areas. Chipkin and Meny-Gibert (2012, 103) add that "there has been an over concentration in the public administration literature on pedagogical concerns and on the description of administrative and management techniques needed for the post-Apartheid public service system". The translation of these concerns brings into question the collaboration of theory and implementation on behalf of the measures of the South African public administration. The reform of the post-Apartheid public service is emphasised throughout this literature review and has been utilised for the purpose of interpreting the continuation and maintenance of an unequal South African society.

#### 1.6.1 The Bantustan order

"The Apartheid regime in South Africa used the term 'Bantustan' to refer to territories reserved for black Africans as part of the official segregation policy of 'separate development' or Apartheid" (Rautsinela 2001, par. 3). As a geographical space, "the South African Bantustan is, therefore, one of the most significant physical remnants of Apartheid" (Campbell 1999,55). The social order of the establishment of the Bantustans was compromised by the Apartheid government, and therefore needed to be reformed within a post-Apartheid society. The centralisation of resources and governance debilitated the agency of black residents in Bantustan territories. Egerö (1991, 6) argues that "the Bantustan strategy as such would turn out to be self-defeating for Apartheid because the necessary vesting of power and financial resources in reactionary local leaderships prepared to accept the patronage of Pretoria, with no reforms in the structural conditions of Bantustan subordination, could only intensify the

contradictions of the system to the level where local defence against repression widened into a general anti-Apartheid opposition". Authors Egerö and Campbell both emphasize the linkage and the detriment of the effects of the Bantustans and Apartheid. These constructed systems of government were designed to subjugate the black population.

Separate development was strengthened by the exclusion of cities comprising of black South Africans. Ally and Lissoni (2012, 13) state that "Bantustans were financially dependent on Pretoria and that state investment into the homeland system and relative autonomy afforded by self-rule and independence allowed for a degree of experimentation with alternative approaches to healthcare and education". Healthcare and education are universal rights. The alternative approaches to healthcare and education were divisive, which begin to show that there are pre-existing factors towards the differential outcomes faced by those living in ex-Bantustans today. Institutional development and capacity of the people in Bantustans were under siege considering the control of the Apartheid central government. Considering these circumstances, the intention for efficiency and the necessary implementation of public service for all homelands was improbable. In the consolidation and integration of Bantustans predating the end of the Apartheid regime, "it was proclaimed that the ANC, OAU and other international organisations said, 'away with the Bantustans' and further discussed their incorporation into a unified country" (Financial Mail 1989, 12). The question arose as to how the homelands were going to be incorporated. In the deliberations of abolishing the homelands, organisations ought to have considered that their political structures could not be repaired overnight. However, they needed to be accommodated into the future democratic South Africa. Although Bantustan establishments no longer exist, it is pertinent for this study to evaluate whether South Africa has sufficiently integrated the structures of the homelands in the democratic South Africa.

The quality of life for people living in Bantustans was highly compromised. According to Mariotti et al. (2011, 7), "the reality in the resettlement camps , also known as 'homelands' differed from what people were promised. Living conditions and the provision of public services in resettlement camps were dismal". "Mass relocation camps were set up in the open veld without services, agricultural land or employment. The former homelands were also created through an earlier history of African resistance to colonialism and land alienation" (Bank and Hart 2019, 4). Before the incorporation of homelands into South Africa,

organisations responsible for their eradication ought to have repaired the disorder that already existed. Abel (2015, 7) states that "the majority of black people, who were deported to relocation camps (located in the homelands), suffered from stark economic deprivation and overcrowding". It appears that the removal policies instituted by the Apartheid government followed a common pattern. Communities would first receive notifications about the impending eviction. Thereafter, in many cases, schools were closed, the water supply cut off and bus services withdrawn. These removal policies were subsumed within the segregation of the black and white population. Mukonoweshuru (1991, 172) adds that "the fiscal crisis in the Bantustans made it impossible to meet some of the most basic needs and demands of the homelands' people, such as the need for clean water, electricity, and health and educational facilities". In addition to this, millions of people were living in areas of the homelands where no water infrastructure had been provided. "This shortage of water weighed heavily against the areas' future viability" (Mukonoweshuru 1991, 178). The viability of the homeland areas today still remains in doubt, with questionable conditions, and with access to adequate infrastructures still being a precondition to equality. The consolidation of the homelands reintegration into South Africa has had to consider the factors that disparaged the environments of Bantustans.

### 1.6.2 The new administration in South Africa

In the early 1990s, the centralised Apartheid government was abandoned for a new democratic government which undertook to provide for all its citizens. Fraser-Moleketi (2006, 14) states that "the initial expectation of 'smashing and breaking up' the administration was eventually tempered through the negotiated settlement reached in 1993, which was reflected in the 'Sunset Clause,' which provided for the incorporation of the various public services that existed under the old dispensation into the new one". The labour force in the Apartheid regime inhibited black-led management and the introduction of new regulations and those of the Sunset Clause were necessary for the depoliticisation of civil service in South Africa. With the inclusion of the black labour force as public servants, who were also victims of the racialised order of separate development, it was assumed that their placement in a decentralised setting would allow for the repair of the previously marginalised areas resulting from the harmful effects of the Apartheid regime. However, in the break of a new dawn of civil service employment, the Nationalist Party incumbents were still favoured. This is indicative of the statement made by Chipkin and Meny-Gibert that says literature by the public administration is characterised by

the mere descriptions of administrative and management techniques that are needed for the post-Apartheid public service system, rather than deploying those skills to newly employed black public servants.

In 1993, the spirit of the negotiations, known as the Local Government Negotiating Forum (LGNF), led by the South African National Civics Organisation with the NP Minister of Local government that led to these local government transitional arrangements reflected a shared belief in the importance of legitimate and effective local government, established through a transparent, inclusive, 'bottom-up' approach, drawing together all relevant stakeholders at local level, especially from sectors of local communities previously excluded from local government participation. In contradistinction to the top-down and racially fragmented local government policy and practice of the former government, new policy was envisaged which would embody internationally-recognised democratic values encapsulated in the following concepts: 'bottom-up', 'based on popular franchise', 'devolved powers', 'wide-ranging autonomy', 'inclusivity', 'democracy', 'development', and 'effectiveness' (Bekker et al 1997, 41). The smashing and breaking of a superior race system, moreover in leadership, ought to have not been a compromise but a necessity for local governance systems.

In order for South Africa to distance itself from its previous forms of governance, it was required that its new government dismantle previously racialised systems. This brings the presumption that the reshaping of the administration of South Africa should prioritise homeland territories. However, as seen with the delays on infrastructural reform in the Eastern cape, there is no quick formula to eradicate the past and deploy comprehensive solutions.

### 1.6.3 Organisational consequences

The preliminary adjustments to the governance structures of the previous Bantustan citizens, such as the introduction of the 'Batho Pele' policy, were designed to reform public services for those previously discriminated by the Apartheid regime. These adjustments carried the potential for success and change by and for *all* South Africans. In addition to this, various progressive policies were introduced by the new government. It could be assumed that this new management meant new rules, which in turn could have also produced better outcomes. The influx of more black South African employees into the new administration necessitated the

need for them to be trained to work in their new positions. The political climate post 1994 was in need of more than a reshuffle of cabinet and the municipalities as the processes of the old regime also needed to be discarded and replaced for the effective delivery of public services to the previously marginalised. The transition from a white-led and divided South Africa to a cooperative and inclusive one focused on political settlement and stability. However, Chipkin and Meny-Gibert (2012, 108) state that "less attention was paid to the way in which the new institutions of government would be developed and structured, and how these changes might deal with the legacy of the homeland system". The lingering effects of the homeland system appear to be an after-thought of the reform of the harsh divide created by the South African Apartheid government.

### 1.6.4 Efficiency in an equal South Africa

The political and physical isolation experienced by homeland residents in the Apartheid era were issues that demanded a great deal of attention and reform in the post-Apartheid era. The post-Apartheid government vested their powers in amalgamating the homelands with the rest of the country. However, it cannot be denied that there are grey areas that remain which are shown through the poor service delivery to ex-Bantustan areas. The erasure of the Bantu Act and other forms of isolation from the previously centrally governed South Africa and the establishment of the new constitution allowed for the freedom of black South Africans, as well as the introduction of opportunities of efficiency and quality in the distribution of basic services. Hemson and Owuso-Ampomah (2005, 512-513) state that "in South Africa, the definition of service delivery is certainly more encompassing and includes not only the ability to provide users with services needed or demanded, but also a sense of redress; that the services should raise the standard of living of the majority and confirm their citizenship in the new South Africa". The new South African government was tasked with redressing exclusion and service delivery, as well as improving this provision. With the politics of delivery changed, it was expected that elements of the new democracy, such as social justice, equality and poverty amelioration, would headline an idealistic post-Apartheid government.

The reform process of service delivery for the previously marginalised areas in South Africa has been undermined. The consolidation of already self-governed homelands and an exclusive Apartheid South Africa created confusion for both centralisation and decentralisation efforts.

The World Bank (2001, par.1) defines decentralisation as, "representative government that supports democratisation by giving citizens or their representatives more influence in the formation and implementation of policies". Before the integration of homelands, existing governance structures within these homelands ought to have been remodelled for the maximum benefit of residents. Instead, "most municipalities soon became the fiefdoms of rent-seeking politicians; most of them were overwhelmed, in one way or another, by the demands placed on them; the delivery of services aimed at promoting the objectives of the developmental state soon became of secondary importance; poor performance and non-accountability inevitably followed" (Koelble and Siddle 2014, 612). The consolidation of efficient service delivery post-Apartheid was guaranteed to be met with difficulties with the overwhelming factors to consider in its reform, which included the need for new and inclusive set of governance practices that would also represent the previously affected population.

### 1.6.5 The effect of poor services in the new regime

On the 8th May 2018, in a committee parliamentary hearing on sanitation backlogs in schools, the Department of Basic Education (DBE) conducted a briefing, as well as the Water Research Commission who gave a briefing on Sanitation Technologies and Innovations. According to Lulu Johnson, chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation (2018, par.6), "the state had sufficient capacity, with the Department of Water and Sanitation having its own construction unit. In the resolution regarding water and sanitation in Eastern Cape schools, the state collaborated with different departments. At present, the DBE is no longer allocating projects to implementing agents, but the Department is rather assisting in the completion of projects which were already under way" (Parliamentary Monitoring Group 2018). The Department of Education appears to be enforcing sustainability in its focus on existing projects. However, the completion of these existing projects is still not clear as is evident by the sanitation backlogs. Solly Mafoko, Chief Director of Infrastructure at the DBE, states that "the issue of over-commitment in the Eastern Cape was currently being dealt with and presentations had been made to the Provincial and National Treasury". Mafoko (2018, par. 7) adds that the "Department of Basic Education found that spending had been slow, and projects had begun to hit the ground in previous financial years". The Eastern Cape departments have a recurring theme of incompletion of major governmental tasks. It is perplexing to note that even though there is funding for new and existing projects, these resources are not being implemented to

their full capacity. The lack of adequate delivery of water services to schools and the suffering of learners in these schools, can therefore be linked to departmental incapacities to complete refurbishments of existing projects.

"As a result of inadequate management and supervision, the DBE did not have enough capacity to monitor and verify that the work had been done, so they made use of the Project Support Units (PSUs). The Department looked to explore the use of the Department of Water and Sanitation (DWS) to help them with the monitoring" (Johnson 2018, 21). However, this negates Johnson's own previous statement that proclaimed that the DBE no longer allocated projects to implementing agents, and that the completion of projects which were already under way were being prioritised. It is apparent that the state continues to seek additional entities in the implementation of water and sanitation, which could be one of the resultant factors for the slow turnaround of projects and its issues of over commitment. Another prevailing issue is that the oversight of departmental structures in the provision of water and sanitation have not ensured for the execution of projects within rural schools in the Eastern Cape. The employment of ad hoc monitoring services is beneficial. However, they are not being ameliorative for the provision of water and adequate sanitation services in schools.

"A large number of schools have been excluded from the ECDoE's list of backlogs because they are set to be closed as part of the province's school rationalisation process" (Equal Education 2019, par.1). However, there is no certainty as to when these schools would be closed and exactly what interim measures have been put in place to address the crisis conditions. The policy behind school infrastructure appears to have a lack of coherent direction for safe sanitation. Although measures are being created, where there are prospects of replacing pit latrines with functional 'Ventilated Improved Pits' through means of rationalisation, there is still a weak turnaround for the installation of toilets for Eastern Cape schools.

"In 2017, there were almost 2,000 schools (36%) that had been identified for potential rationalisation, which would potentially also have infrastructure implications for nearby schools which would be accepting additional learners" (Kojana Equal Education 2018, par.2). The lack of water and sanitation along with the lack of urgency appears to have contained externalities. The rationalisation process in Eastern Cape schools had a good start on the part

of the Eastern Cape Department of Education, as it was an indication of progression in the eradication of unsafe environments in schools and the procurement of access to water.

However, it appears that the effectiveness and sustainability of the Department of Education and its partners is to be questioned with regard to the actual provision of safer toilets and access to water in schools.

The poor delivery of water and sanitation in the Eastern Cape is and should be one of the central focal points of departments, local municipalities, state-owned enterprises and other relevant parties. The result of poor water and sanitation has affected and taken the lives of young scholars across the country. The resultant issues are also due to the lack of proper sanitary infrastructure, with children using toilet systems which can be difficult to use, toilets that are not of a good standard and also those designed not to use water. The convenience of pit latrines that are still found in Eastern Cape schools are detrimental to the lives of scholars. According to Matthews (2018, 26), "the tragic death of Lumka Mketwa prompted a renewed uproar about the state of school toilets. In 2018, President Cyril Ramaphosa reacted by giving Basic Education Minister, Angie Motshekga, a directive to conduct an urgent audit of unsafe structures at schools - particularly ablution facilities, and to come up with a plan to fix them within three months".

Minister Motshekga stated that "one of the big challenges that affects roughly half of the schools that are still reported to have pit latrines is that alternative ablution facilities have been constructed, but that the old pit latrines still remain". Motshekga also pronounced that there were existing plans in place intended to eradicate these unsafe and inadequate toilets (Zulu 2018, par.3).

In 2006, Amatola Water collaborated with the Department of Education and Department of Science and Technology. The DoE funded a project to construct new pit latrines at rural schools that had no facilities. Two contractors were appointed 13 years ago to undertake this work. The Department of Science and Technology (DST) funded a project to establish Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises (SMMEs) to empty pit latrines. The Eastern Cape School Sanitation project was said to be negotiated with the DoE to extend the contract for an additional 250 schools. With this project dating back to 2006, Ngcukana (2019) states that "despite numerous pleas to the Education Department, 224 pupils at the Upper Mvenyane Senior Primary School

in the Eastern Cape Province have no proper toilets, classrooms or even water supply. The only thing that the provincial Education Department contributed was desks, which had been sent to the school earlier that year". This exemplifies the neglect of water and sanitation concerns in Eastern Cape schools. More than ten years later, there are still learners in Eastern Cape schools suffering from poor sanitation services. The validity of Amatola Water, as well its project with the DoE and the DST ought to be brought into question in the efficacy or rather the lack thereof in the provision of water and sanitation services. The previously mentioned excerpts of unsafe sanitation processes are examples of inefficiency on the part of the government and its organisations. In a modern state such as South Africa, these fatalities should no longer exist.

However, "Amatola Water has stated that it makes it a priority to ensure a conducive occupational health and safety (OHS) environment for all employees and stakeholders, as well as the public, within its area of operation" (Amatola Personnel 1 2020). Arising from the safety, health and environment (SHE) inspections and audits, an action plan has been developed to provide a framework that focuses on standardising and improving occupational health and safety performance. Although there is no specific mention of schools by the Amatola Water Board, the focus on health and safety is emphasised in their objectives with the supply of water. With the outbreak of fatalities within the Eastern Cape region as a result of unsafe hygiene practices, the initiative of Amatola Water to ensure safety is instrumental for the ends of inadequate sanitary infrastructure.

The education system in the Eastern Cape, as well as those responsible for upholding it, have failed the children of the province. This statement is not solely based on the provision of basic services but on an array of other responsibilities that have not been attended to. "More than 200 pupils from different public schools in King William's Town, led by Equal Education, marched to the offices of the Eastern Cape Department of Education in Zwelitsha on the 17th October" (Damba-Hendrik 2019, par. 2). They demanded that the Department release its progress report on reaching norms and standards for school infrastructure, presumably as a way of seeking the objectives set by the DoE that assured for the reform of school infrastructure. This was exacerbated by the Department of Education's inability to meet the November 2016 deadline to ensure that school structures are made of appropriate materials – not mud, asbestos, metal or wood – and that all schools have water, electricity and toilets. The overall learning environment for children in the Eastern Cape is in need of large-scale attention, which should

fall on the onus of municipalities and departments in the region. The school environments within the ex-Bantustan strong holds are products of Bantustan governance, in the way that low standards of living and provision have not seen significant changes with its infrastructure. As seen in the literature review, authors have suggested that South Africa's transition entails particular requirements for its previously discriminated. In order for progression to occur the rehabilitation of the province's inherited problem areas, which are presented in schools and local administration in the Eastern Cape, has to be established and implemented to address their deficits within the democratic era.

### 1.7 The structure of the study

This dissertation contains five chapters. Chapters two to four consider socio-economic issues that relate to community safety, education and the ongoing previously highlighted inequalities of accessibility to public services. These are examined in relation to South Africa's previous political dispensation and discuss how these have merged into the current democratic regime. Chapter two focuses on the effects of separate development. This engages with the notion that transformation from the country's justice bereft political state, is not as progressive as it was intended to be. South Africa's marginalised history is explored with the limitations imposed by the Apartheid government. The importance of the country's history of segregation to reintegration is emphasised, wherein the persistence of the past is recognised as one of the existing legacies from the regime. Furthermore, Chapter two exposes how the enforcement of Bantustans impacted the lives of the black population, and their continuing effects in a reintegrated setting. Chapter two serves as a narration of Bantustan rule within South Africa in which the reasons for the disenfranchisement of the black population were initially established.

In addition, this chapter includes policies which aimed to recover the previously divided and marginalised population, which were exemplified for their recommendation of social, political and economic reform in the country. These policies are the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and the Batho Pele White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery which include the practices towards efficient service delivery to previously marginalised races in South Africa. It is in this chapter that the transition and directives of the post-Apartheid regime are critically explained. In essence, Chapter two displays the efforts needed in the transition from the hostile Apartheid regime to a more equal developmental society.

Chapter three explores the response to the right to water as a resource, and its distribution to the black and previously disadvantaged population of South Africa. This chapter argues that the subject matter of water as a scarce resource was tied to the livelihood of those living in ex-Bantustans. The selected area in the study is a township, Mdantsane, in the Eastern Cape, which enabled the foregrounding of the observations for the challenges of the delivery of water in the Eastern Cape. This resulted in an analysis of the difficulties of poor infrastructural development within the integrated Eastern Cape. Infrastructural issues, as a challenge to distribution, are addressed and are also shown as a manifestation of political ties that hindered the growth of the Eastern Cape. This chapter explains that the basic right to water continues to be a problem as it is still distributed in a limited capacity, and that poor governance for black residents in a previously neglected province is still maintained.

Chapter four focuses on the effects of the Apartheid government. This chapter contextualises the effects of service delivery on the lives and establishments that occupied the isolated areas of the Eastern Cape. This chapter explains the contamination of the Apartheid regime and how it directly affected the future of black youth, and how disadvantages continue to riddle their lives because of the ill-effects of the unjust regime. Chapter four also demonstrates schools as casualties of the regime. This is shown through the testimonies of the backlogs of services, the quality of services, inaccessibility to resources and overall unfair development processes. This chapter argues that infrastructural challenges have accrued in the transformation of the South African government from the Apartheid regime.

Lastly, Chapter five summarises the main findings of the dissertation. This is achieved by relating various theories within the investigation of the study to the research questions.

# CHAPTER 2 - THE LEGACY OF THE BANTUSTANS IN THE EASTERN CAPE

## 2.1 Introduction

This chapter focuses upon the systems of governance which predated the democratic government in South Africa. The first section details the history of the Bantustans, with specific focus upon the policy of separate development. In this section, marginalisation is enlisted as one of the features of under-development in the Eastern Cape. This section emphasises the differences enforced by the nationalist government on the black population, and how the consequences from this have continued since the reintegration of the Bantustans into a united South Africa. Sections within this chapter explicitly characterise the Bantustan experience in the Eastern Cape. In this chapter, the author has extended the analysis of the governance in the Eastern Cape from its desegregated past to the policy deliberations that followed the democratisation of the national government. Included are recommendations that have been applied to the previously marginalised, and how these seek to repair the damages of the previous government. This chapter seeks to illustrate how the history of Apartheid has affected and continues to affect the non-white population of South Africa.

The objective of the first chapter is to juxtapose governance and the citizen experience in the Eastern Cape before and after the Apartheid regime. The extensive focus of analysis on the Bantustans is intentional, since the current situation of the Eastern Cape region is dependent upon the path established under Apartheid. The characterisation of rural poverty as a result of the legacy of separationism in South Africa is investigated in order to reveal the impact made by the establishment of Bantustans. However, this chapter is not solely dependent on the injustices of the past. The inclusion of specific government policies and programmes which were implemented after the transition into democracy, signifies the attempts made to reconcile the past, which allowed for an investigation of the credibility of the implementation of these programmes. The literature review supports this investigation by portraying current and relevant works that are illustrative of the gap between policy and implementation. This chapter

is also intentional in its structure as it follows a path from the history of governance in the Eastern Cape Province, which was adversely affected by the Apartheid regime, to the activities and current development of the province in an integrated South Africa with a democratic government.

### 2.1.1 History of Bantustan governance

South Africa's previous legacy of hegemony, segregation and marginalisation originating from the era of Apartheid was highly linked to its racialised governance regime. The establishment of Bantustans was a product of an isolated and divided South Africa. The Bantustans were established for the removal of black people from urban areas to townships and rural areas. This was orchestrated by the South African political system in the 1960s, under the many laws and policies created by the Apartheid system. These homelands were separated into ten territories, namely Transkei, Bophuthatswana, Ciskei, Venda, Gazankulu, KaNgwane, KwaNdebele, KwaZulu, Lebowa, and QwaQwa. Taking into consideration all these new and autonomous homelands, South Africa had comprised itself with one centralised government along with these sub-states known as Bantustans. South Africa's governance system balanced itself with autocracy towards the black population during the Apartheid era. With the black population being subjected to limitations of movement, expression and human dignity. This is explained further with the engagement of tribal chiefs within the Bantustans and various National Party incumbents.

Prior to the democratisation of the South African Government, parts of the Eastern Cape province were not recognised as a part of the Republic of South Africa due to the forced removal of blacks to homelands. Separate development was informed for the black and white population of the country where the former, also known as the majority, were subjected to unequal treatment. According to Adams, Butler and Rotberg (1978, 32) "the elaboration of separate development, with the granting of self-government to nominally homogeneous homelands, and the commitment to grant them independence, may thus be seen as the appropriate culmination of the exclusionist strand of South African political thought".

"In 1951, the Bantu Authorities Act established a hierarchy of Bantu authorities, which were tribal, regional, and territorial, and which had limited legislative, executive, and judicial

powers, as each was guided and ultimately controlled by whites" (Adams et al 1978, 28). The black majority had been broken up into groups, in which the terms 'self-development', 'self - government' and 'independence' were used for African autonomy and self-sufficiency. The decision by the government of the Republic was to seclude the African population from their 'central' government. The establishment of Bantustans was for the intention of an anti-homogenous country, where resources could only be shared between the white and the black population, and not the other way around. Although regional authorities allowed for the operation of schools, the building and maintaining of public works and hospitals, the improving farming and agriculture, the making of bylaws and the levying taxes, as well as the imposing of fines, the standards of all of these was not equal to that of the central government. The quality of life for the black population, also as a result of their relocation to the homelands, was reduced due to exclusion and the repressive regime of Bantustan rule. This dissertation investigates the legacies of unequal treatment to the previously marginalised.

The erasure of the impact of Apartheid remains a priority in the country. According to King and McCusker (2007, 6) "South Africa's first fully democratic elections of 1994 were typified by a wave of optimism that its social and spatial history would be transformed to redress the inequities of the Apartheid era". The spatial history birthed by the Apartheid regime was based on trivialising the needs of the black majority population, which the democratic government would be heavily tasked with redressing after the eradication of the Apartheid policies and the introduction of social equality. In each province, there were demarcations of race. An example of this can be found in Pretoria, where the centre of Pretoria was inhabited by the white population and on its periphery, the Bantustan of KwaNdebele was established for the black population. The same spatial pattern was common throughout South Africa.

Because of this segregation, it was expected that the worst-off would have the injustices of the past rectified. However, Levin and Weiner (1997, 12) state that "the Bantustan geography left an imprint upon rural areas. Chronic poverty and lack of livelihood systems inherited from the segregation significantly distinguished the rural areas from urban ones". Consequently, these disadvantaged rural areas were in a critical state and unfortunately remained so even after 1994. Pickles and Weiner (1991, 9) state that "the Apartheid ideology and the institutions of regional development fostered the notion of a dual economy – one first world, industrial and dynamic,

and the other third world, agrarian and static". "The diversity in living conditions amongst its people has resulted in South Africa often being described as a third and first world country rolled into one" (Davids and Gaibie 2011, 233). The Apartheid ideology was centred around undervaluing black South Africans, and for the benefit of the white population. The first world economy in South Africa was associated with the central government, and the third world was characterised as the Bantustans which constituted slow-paced development. McCusker (2007, 29) states that "the poverty in rural areas was not an innate condition attributable to a series of flaws in rural society, but rather a systemic bias against rural areas". This furthers the notion that the non-white population were driven out of central South Africa to their culturally designated homelands to become disempowered. There is a continued need to interrogate social differentiation to understand the realities of local livelihood and environmental systems within former Bantustans.

The problems resulting from the Bantustan homelands became detrimental with regard to accessibility and equality in a non-exclusionist South Africa. The former Bantustans were characterised by large backlogs and limited access to basic services and services were often of an inferior quality. "As of 9 June 2011, the National Planning Commission identified the challenges of this social infrastructure and stated that spatial patterns excluded the poor from the fruits of development, and that infrastructure was poorly located, under-maintained and insufficient to foster higher growth" (Diagnostic Report 2011, 9). The remnants of Apartheid's spatial planning have been difficult to erase. The democratic government has been tasked with eradicating the pre-1994 administration which include the inequities and suffering of former Bantustan residents.

### 2.1.2 The chronicles of the homeland governments

Jara (2017, 2) states that "the Apartheid-era legislation imposed tribal boundaries and authorities without consultation and consideration of the actual practices and realities on the ground". Chieftaincy, then, was maintained by the segregationist and apartheid states as something of a political firebreak; a barrier intended to prevent the black working class from entering the political sphere and mounting an effective challenge to the white minority state (Myers 1999, 34). The imposition of homeland migration onto black South Africans held no moral ground. Decision-making was so concentrated by the nationalist government that they dictated how, why and where black South Africans should live without any consent or

agreement from them. The establishment of chieftaincies within the Bantustans further entrenched the extension of white superior rule. The nationalist government also dictated through the traditional leaders, as each homeland had their own leader who was a representative of the oppressive government. Weiner and Levin (1991, 7) and Maloka (1995, 7) regard the chieftaincies "as a profoundly undemocratic institution that contained highly repressive powers through the Apartheid laws". Ntsebeza (1999, 12) further problematises the credentials of the traditional leaders when he points out that "traditional leaders used the powers and authority given to them by the Apartheid era Bantu Authorities Act of 1951". These powers and authority emphasised the profoundly undemocratic elements of hereditary governance. In many instances, this led to the widespread abuse of power and corruption by the traditional leaders. The idea of an election or any participatory mechanisms were a myth to those living in the homelands, with both the nationalist government and homeland governance having their own interests and living out their ideologies that propagated the suffering of the homeland citizens. The afflictions of the homeland experience were detailed by Retired Teacher 5 (2020), who adds that under the homeland governance there was no agency or freedom of choice. You were not allowed to speak on the conditions faced by those living inside the homelands and that employment was revoked if you fought back. Mamdani (1996, 12) regards the role and position of the traditional leaders in colonial and post-colonial Africa as "decentralised despotism that was against the deepening of democracy in the country".

The concept of independence for black South Africans that was sold for the establishment of the homelands was debunked, as participation and consultation were still not a feature under African rule. The presence of traditional leaderships magnified the experience of the removed black population. The Apartheid regime, along with the governance of the Bantustans with their appointed tribal leaders, quietly and effectively further entrenched the exploitation to the black population in South Africa. Myers (1999, 36) add that "in something of a dress rehearsal for the real struggle over the post-apartheid political role of traditional authority (which would only begin in earnest after the national elections of 1994), CODESA's working groups set out to resolve the question of the participation of the chiefs and the king at the talks, which would then hopefully lead to a resolution of the question of their future political roles". Traditional authority and its relation to the previously marginalised South African

areas was expected to be neatly catalogued into the history of local government, instead, it was included in negotiations for post-Apartheid representative democratic government.

### 2.2 The legacy of the Bantustans

More currently, Jara (2017,11) states that "the ANC provincial government in the Eastern Cape financed the infrastructure, assets, personnel and operations of the provincial and local houses of traditional leaders and local tribal authorities". A system that failed during the apartheid regime is being consolidated and perpetuated in the current democratic regime. The erasure of the harmful aspects of the Apartheid system still needs to be completed and infrastructure ought to be provided and distributed to those residents that were robbed of adequate living standards. The remnants of the repressive government have been hidden within the cultural and tribal leadership who played an integral part in the implementation of the Apartheid rule. There should not be a perpetuation of the injustices carried out in the homelands unless traditional leaders discontinue maladministration practices from the previous regime.

"The prevailing perspective on the economic situation of the former homelands is that the longterm, deliberate neglect of the reserves/homelands/Bantustans, leaving a legacy of poverty and stagnation. Moreover, the legacy of this neglect is so stubborn as to defy current attempts to change it" (Aliber 2017, 1). The reintegration of ex-Bantustans into the democratic South Africa had to allow for repairs that entailed a reversal of the legacy of oppression and underdevelopment. Former homelands were described as "areas with low economic activity and low levels of demonstrated economic potential with high numbers of people living below the MLL [minimum living level]" (Presidency 2007, par. 3). The National Spatial Development Perspective's (NSDP) (2006, 51) prescription for these areas was to offer them basic services and, where possible, facilitate economically beneficial migration to areas of 'national economic significance' - meaning the urban core. The NSDP's approach for repair was to offer those in former homeland standard services and to relocate people to better living areas. This reintegration was about levelling the playing field between previously oppressed areas; however, this could not easily be done due to the population being an unequal society with significant existing socio-economic gaps between the black and the white sectors within the post-Apartheid South Africa.

### 2.2.1 The Ciskei government

"Homelands were created, not only to serve as labour reservoirs for adjacent centres of capitalist enterprise, but also to accord an air of legitimacy and self-sufficiency to the homelands" (Western 1981, 311). To the uneducated, which can be considered as those who lived under the jurisdiction of Apartheid and Bantustan rule, the establishment of independent homelands hid the agenda of marginalisation of the black labour force. The belittlement of the black population by the Apartheid regime enabled them to be both ill-informed and nearly incapable of dismantling the harsh effects of their living arrangements. The implementation of the Bantustans and all their regulations them emphasized the superiority of the white race by convincing people that their new territories were for the sake of self-sufficiency and independence. "In reality, the chief architect of apartheid, Dr. H. F. Verwoerd, personally authorised the creation of Mdantsane in 1963. He appreciated the plight of the East London municipality in the situation and coupled this with his relentless goal of placing all Africans in homelands" (Nel 1990, 304). East London's history of underdevelopment is not as a result of bad luck or misfortune, it is created by man and his people. "Black local authorities can only be understood by reference to developments both within and outside the former homelands. Outside these former homelands, Black local authorities were thrust into formal autonomy in 1982, with minimal experience and entirely inadequate financial resources. On paper, they were granted powers equivalent to those of White municipalities and were, accordingly, expected to play a role in meeting the challenge of Black urbanisation" (Bekker et al 1997, 40). "Simultaneously, they were strictly controlled by higher-tier state bodies, first, Bantu Affairs Administration Boards" (Bekker and Humphries 1985, 48).

Bundy (1979, 305) states that "areas in East London such as Mdanstane, however, deteriorated into a shocking state of neglect, consequent upon the rapid urbanisation following the Boer War, the First World War and the emergence of a landless rural proletariat". It became apparent that after each time conflict arose in these areas, the city would be a casualty. Nel (1990, 307) adds that "the vastness of the problems within the city outstripped the limited means of the financially impaired municipality. This consideration, together with a general attitude of callous neglect, created a situation of social resentment, disease, chronic overcrowding and the absence of sufficient sanitary facilities". East London's deeply embedded background has resulted in it being a penetrable avenue for exploitation and maladministration. The city and its people have suffered as a consequence of inadequate management. Minkley (1985, 311) states

that “appeals by municipal health officials to avert potentially disastrous consequences caused by the effective absence of sanitary facilities and the attendant human suffering appeared to fall on deaf ears”. Under normal circumstances, it is believed that if you take away the cause, the effect will cease. However, the cause of the difficulties in the Eastern Cape have been repeated from the First World War to the establishment of homelands. The area has been riddled with inconsistencies for black residents and propagated by corruption of the central government and maladministration.

“The social distress and resentment were channelled by and motivated through the actions of popular trade union movements which, at this time, sought to rectify the situation” (Beinart and Bundy 1987, 52). The promises of self-sufficiency and independence resulted in homeland citizens having to take action to ensure better livelihoods, in which suffering could no longer exist. Their independence should have not entailed them having to repair what was allocated to them. Instead, the livelihood of people living in the Ciskei homeland stemmed from positions of inadequacy and inferiority. “For various obvious historical reasons, the infrastructure serving ‘white’ South Africa was developed first” (Mukonoweshuro 1991, 179). Another example in the history of Eastern Cape and its failure to launch as a developed province is that “by 1937 the situation was such that there was only one toilet pan per 90 people in the township” (Nel 1990, 307). From the beginning, the Eastern Cape has been riddled with unfavourable circumstances. The commencement date of the Bantu Authorities Act was finalised and implemented in July 1951, this act appeared to have maintained the problems of the Eastern Cape’s past and did nothing to relieve the existing poor conditions in the area. However, hope was restored on 27 April 1994 when the South African homelands were officially delegitimised. The era of segregation was now over with the erasure of the local borders between the homelands and the rest of South Africa, which also signified the end of the disparities that fostered unequal race relations.

### 2.3 What does South African governance look like now?

The post-1994 government had the responsibility of driving an equitable, productive and now profitable country. The introduction of reformist and integrationist policies such as the Reconstruction and Development Program (RDP) established in 1994 covered some of the responsibilities for the reconstruction of the environment of the disadvantaged South Africans via the provision of housing, water and electricity. Rabbani (1994, 7) defined the RDP as “a

programme to mobilise all people and all resources to finally get rid of apartheid and build a democratic, non-racial and non-sexist future". He adds that the history of colonialism and apartheid had divided South Africa. Rabbani explains the need for this programme by revealing that some people enjoy a high standard of living while many do not have even the basics, such as homes, jobs, land, medical care and education. Everatt (2008, 303) added that "in 1994, the RDP set out a limited number of very general target groups, presumably because in the immediate post-Apartheid period it was reasonable to assert that all black people (including African, Indian and coloureds in the definition) were targets—they had all been 'historically disadvantaged'"

Most whites live in fully developed suburbs while most blacks live in poorly developed townships and shack settlements. There are well developed white commercial farming areas and impoverished Bantustans. The juxtaposition of the black and white races is seriously emphasised in this policy and are called to be corrected. "The de-racialisation of the economy was established via legislation and policy changes which included affirmative action and the introduction of a competitive policy to inhibit the over-concentration of economic power" (Cronje 2015, 29). These policies supported the South African constitution established in 1996 which enshrines the right to a basic water supply and the right to adequate housing. The new democratic regime brought with it new hopes and aspirations of an equal society in which all citizens would acquire adequate treatment and services. As a 'growth through redistribution' policy (Terreblanche 2003, 89), the RDP soon became the paradigm within which all development policies were to be discussed.

Visser (2004, 7) adds that "the RDP soon ran into trouble after its commencement stating that from the beginning the government lacked the capacity to implement the necessary changes and upgrading of facilities and services". The issues that arose were that the RDP staff lacked the proper implementation skills and that there were huge backlogs in providing access to basic services, as defined in the RDP. Provincial maladministration of primary nutrition programmes prevailed and since 1994 there had been growing dissatisfaction with service delivery and employment creation as embedded in the RDP. The RDP did not spell out a detailed programme for attaining its main aims. "It was too broadly formulated and ended up as a wish list for too many people" (Heymans 1995, 61). This is just a glimpse of what was taking place at the beginning when the new democratic government took over the running of the country.

The promises made by the policymakers of the RDP stated what disadvantaged black South Africans needed to hear at the time, with the assumption that they would be given precedence by the new regime. These promised measures by the RDP would have allowed for effective results to be displayed. The importance of the RDP in 1994 versus its importance today is still the same. The RDP policy still stands as a framework for development, cognisant of the needs of the people in South Africa and the responsibilities of the government. The value and promise of this policy can never expire as it continues to prescribe the necessities for an equal society.

### 2.4 Batho Pele Policy - Transformation of public service delivery

In the reforming of the old centralised and top-down governance policies was the creation of the Batho Pele Policy, which was headed by Zola Skweyiya, then Minister of Public Service and Administration. The Batho Pele Policy was established with the intention of building a public service capable of meeting the challenges of improving the delivery of public services to the citizens of South Africa. The Minister stated that "access to decent public services was no longer a privilege to be enjoyed by a few and that it was the rightful expectation of all citizens, especially those who were previously disadvantaged" (Department of Public Service and Administration 1997, 5). The Batho Pele Policy, which translated means 'people first', constituted one of the most necessary policies after the integration of the Bantustans as it was created to be corrective of the marginalisation created by the repressive regime. Its efforts included the establishment of guidelines on transparency, and participatory and accountable governance. However, twenty years after its publication, it is unfortunately yet apparent to say that its principles have not been wholly implemented. Skweyiya (1997, 3) states that "the aim of this policy was to progressively raise standards of service, especially for those whose access to public services have been limited in the past and whose needs were greatest". The motivation behind this policy is altruistic in nature and caters to the worst-off.

The White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery (1997, 11) states that "improving the delivery of services would mean redressing the imbalances of the past and that while maintaining continuity of service to all levels of society, its focus should be on meeting the needs of the 40% of South Africans who were living below the poverty line and those who have previously been disadvantaged in terms of service delivery". The Apartheid-ridden administration was notorious for its inequitable distribution of public services, especially in

rural areas where there was a lack of access to services, a lack of transparency, openness and consultation on the required service standards. Policies such as the Batho Pele and the White Paper on Transforming Public Delivery exemplified that the discrimination of intentional marginalisation by the white government was not a phenomenon and that differential access for different races existed. However, it brought promise of change to those previously excluded from accessibility to services.

The responsibility of transformation was to be shared equally among all South African citizens. However, public servants from central government and the Bantustans were to be integrated into the democratic era with their differing bureaucratic contributions. Twala (2018, 85) claims that "there were few trained and qualified black personnel working as senior managers in the public services. Bantustan leaders argued that this necessitated the appointment of white public servants, with the expectation that they would later transfer their skills to black colleagues". Black public servants were excluded from the rule of the NP government. It was evident that the advancement of ex-Bantustan public servants was not encouraged, which would have caused complications with the cohesion of all public servants working together in a post-Apartheid regime. Separate development meant the prioritisation and growth of the minority versus the slow pace of development for the majority. Twala (2018, 86) adds that "the gradual emergence of a separate bureaucracy charged with dealing with black people's challenges left the governance of the Bantustans to 'experienced' white bureaucrats who were concerned with appeasing the central government".

There was not only a challenge with the distribution of services, but also with those who were responsible for its implementation. The challenges of black people were entrusted to both a workforce and government that did not consider them. The inclusion of limited black personnel within the public administration carried the independence narrative that drove the Bantustan regime, but it did not allow for their contribution to black challenges. Picard (2005, 297) adds that "the nurturing of a skilled, black bureaucratic class was perceived as a threat to the Apartheid state, as well as to the privilege of the white public service". It was argued that the Apartheid government and the Bantustan administrations had to deal with human resources deficit in the homelands. This 'human resources' deficit was purposive on the part of central government, which only allowed for a gradual pace of development within the Bantustans. The black public servants of the new democracy were responsible for educating themselves, even

with their limited capacities and repair challenges for the major task of disallowing the repetitions of past black inequities. The transfer of the skills was at the discretion of the central government, which financially sponsored the development programs taking place in the Bantustans. The lives of Africans were at the discretion of the government, as previously mentioned. The quality of skills taught and provided to the black population were regulated by the standards of central South Africa, which made the introduction of the 'Batho Pele' even more necessary for the non-discrimination of black people.

### 2.5 Access to basic services

The issue of service delivery is one of the aspects that were inherited into the current democratic system, which form part of the dispute about the governance of ex-Bantustan residents. Reddy (2015, 7) defines service delivery as "the provision of municipal goods, benefits, activities and satisfactions that are deemed public, to enhance the quality of life in local jurisdictions". In a political climate, whereby a selected and limited amount of people were afforded services, such as public drainage and sound sewerage systems, the attainability of basic services ought to have been supported the most by the post-1994 administration. The issue of service delivery was contentious with the most explicit issue being that of sanitation. Infrastructure Barometer (2012, 25) added that "the government argued that VIPs (pit toilets with a ventilation pipe) were adequate over regular pit toilets or no toilet at all". Inaccessibility to basic services, such as adequate sanitation and sewerage systems, form a major concern for the injustices faced by the black population.

Infrastructure Barometer (2012, par.3) notes that "the trends in service delivery and access to quality services do not reflect significant progress, despite the aggressive targets set by the democratic government". These aggressive targets can be likened to those set out by the Batho Pele and RDP policies. The targets that were set were the promises made by the government that had not been executed as planned, which resulted in the recognition of the extremity of the tasks set out for democratic government. Despite government prescriptions for integrated development planning at local government level, it has been difficult to break the cycle of undersupply and unequal access to social infrastructures. The legacies of the Bantustan settlement patterns are still eminent.

## 2.6 CONCLUSION

This chapter presented the Apartheid concept of separate development, which was the establishment of Bantustans. The review of Bantustans in this chapter is a crucial component of the political order that existed within the Eastern Cape. With this, the critique of the impact of the Apartheid concept as well as its effects is established. This chapter argues that the path of inequalities was based on the practices of separate development. These are linkages that build the account of the governance processes that serve as precursors for the Eastern Cape today. This chapter relied on the contrast of the system of Bantustan governance and the establishments of inclusive and representative policies such as that of the Batho Pele and the RDP. The transition of the Apartheid government to a democracy is foregrounded, which allowed for the assessment of its success. This relates to the overall thesis that notions of Apartheid are not wholly removed from governance in the Eastern Cape.

The following chapter builds on this by including challenges to development in the Eastern Cape province with relation to the delivery of water. The arguments made here summarise that infrastructural reform within the province is an attestation of the legacies of mismanagement that are prevalent with the challenges that people currently experience.

# CHAPTER 3 - THE PRESSURES OF WATER AND ITS DELIVERY

## 3.1 Introduction

In the previous chapter, the background regarding inaccessibility to the South African majority has been explained. This chapter deals with the pressures of water and its delivery and details the resilience of previously marginalised areas after the fall of the Apartheid government. This chapter also focuses upon weak infrastructural systems within the Eastern Cape Province. The capacity of the Eastern Cape to recover from its social injustices, as a result of the nationalist government, is shown through the resilience of its citizens to retain basic functions and structure. Bowen (1998, 152) states that community resilience refers to "the ability of a community facing normative adversity or the consequences of adversity to establish, maintain, or regain an 'expected' or 'satisfactory' range of functioning that is equal to or is better than pre-stressor functioning". Attention to the social utility of water is necessary for the guarantee of accessibility, sustainability and usability for the black majority. This chapter focuses on the Amatola Water organisation and its sustainability mechanisms which run parallel to the government's approach to the delivery of water. This stakeholder's approach is also examined and benchmarked to the needs of its recipients within the Buffalo City Municipality.

Furthermore, this chapter expands on the climate of service delivery after the re-integration of the homelands into South Africa. This chapter explores the reform of infrastructure, previously used as tools of dispossession for the country's majority. The benefits of restructured service delivery mechanisms are identified. The underlying problem of the delivery of water within the Eastern Cape is also discussed, in which depravity and outcomes of this source are explored. This chapter focuses on 'delivery' as the fetishized goal of the immediate post-apartheid period, which conjured up histories of unfulfilled expectations of transformation. The equalisation and reform processes of delivery were confined into the subject titled as 'infrastructural rehabilitation' as ways of making claim on the state.

The role of government in the provision of water is open to question, with the addition of stakeholders' presence. The guarantee of an adequate provision of water and the reform of dignified infrastructures ought to have met the needs of communities that previously endured the undersupply of these resources.

### 3.1.1 South Africa's liberalisation: Equal delivery rights

The transition to a democratic country was beneficial for the liberalisation of the previously divided state. South Africa had minimal chances of progression if its majority were to continue being subjected and forced to live under the poverty line. The reintegration of the black majority into the rest of white South Africa allowed for the country to participate on the global stage and to be present in the international trade markets. The process of reintegration was not only for the homelands into central South Africa, but also for an equal South Africa in the world. The result of Apartheid and its racial inequalities, the incidents of poverty on the black population and the lack infrastructural capabilities had the capacity of ruining the overall development of the country.

The consciousness of a new democratic era was promising for the new image of the country in the global market. The lack of South Africa's presence or activity in the global market was not the only opposition to the regime, but also because of the civilian unrest that proliferated South Africa's blacklisted status on the global stage. "The Diepsloot protest in July 2004, as an event, shook the public's imagination, precisely because it posed a challenge to the very project of post-Apartheid's 'transition'"(Von Schnitzler 2016, 2). This is an example of the anxiety and unrest of citizens as a result of inadequate service delivery. Diepsloot residents rioted against forced removal to Brits in Gauteng, which was a violation of the newly added freedoms of the new democratic era. This forced removal reproduced Bantustan rule in that the government aimed to forcibly remove citizens. The response to civil unrest began with propping up the disenfranchised civilians of South Africa, which meant adhering to their previously ignored needs. Resistance for black South Africans against unjust treatment was a necessary measure for the redistribution of resources and the stabilisation of the economy.

Civilian unrest culminated into violence, which translated to dissatisfaction as seen by the Diepsloot service delivery protest. Civil unrest is still prominent with the latest protest occurring in 2019, over power-cuts that have persisted for two months. Von Schnitzler (2016, 3) adds that "over time the term 'service delivery protest' has become common usage, often entirely independent of the form or content of such protests. Protests and protesters are considered as "unreasonable" and "impatient" for making claims for material resources from the state, they are often linked to an assumed, deeply embedded "culture of entitlement"

amongst residents of townships and informal settlements". Booysen (2007 , 21) sees protest in South Africa as being primarily opposed to both the quality of service delivery and to the public representation of grass-roots service delivery needs. Atkinson (2007, 395) concurs with this perspective but argues that "the issue does not merely concern the lack of services, but also the poor maintenance and management of those services (e.g. lack of infrastructure repairs and problems with billing)" . The concept of service delivery for black South Africans was and continues to be associated with its people having to struggle with receiving the rights to what should be basic and common equal rights. The other side of the racial spectrum in South Africa has not brought light to their experiences for unreceived social utilities, therefore, there is a disconnect between equal service delivery for all within the country. Exploring democracy through the gaze of post-Apartheid transition from the perspective of equal distribution and access to infrastructure, allowed for a newly written South African story. Apartheid as a political project was established through the means of infrastructural modalities of power. This was displayed within the urban areas, in which, following the ideology of the Apartheid system, black residents were stripped of citizenship and designated 'temporary sojourners' whose permanent home and political representation were envisaged to ultimately be in the rural Bantustans. The reform of apartheid spatial patterns and its consequences have been an integral part of social policies in a post-Apartheid era.

Infrastructures were considered as both symbols and conduits of Apartheid's state power that allowed for its prolonged reign. Von Schnitzler argues that Apartheid was precisely about infrastructures - from schools, to transport or public services. It appeared that everything that could be separated, with the best of things off limits to black South Africans. According to Evans (1997,7), "native administrators became deeply enmeshed in providing cheap, mass produced housing, public utilities, and mass transport to the African working class, which in turn was central to disorganising African opposition". Infrastructures were used not to produce or to maintain the black population, let alone a post-Apartheid nation, on the contrary, Apartheid infrastructures were deployed to prevent the public from being fully functional. Murray (1983, 249) states that "the right to basic services and needs, required for all regardless of race or culture, had a higher price for those living in townships". The result of separate development experienced by those removed by the regime consistently placed them in an outdated and unequal positioning which was evident during the successive states of emergency

in the 1980s, where the link between infrastructure and security intensified, as emergency provisions gave the military powers the ability to ‘assume jurisdiction’ over basic services such as water and electricity.

### 3.1.2 Infrastructural and service trials

The democratic government had the responsibility of ending differential access, which was a key component of the previous administration. Van der Walt and Haarhoff (2004, 1), state that “although the country has made great progress since 1994 to improve the quality of life of South African residents by extending basic services to previously under-serviced households, particularly in rural and informal areas, the expansion of services was often done at the expense of existing services”. Many municipalities simply did not have the resources to drive the expansion of services while maintaining the existing infrastructure. The political reform of the country was evident with its first elected black president, the inclusion of black people in parliament and in the social policies which were created to eliminate exclusion. These exemplary resolutions by the government were motions for upward mobility. However, municipalities carried infrastructure, which was already not at an adequate standard into a new age which held promises of betterment and equality for all. The ‘out with the old’ and ‘in with the new’ strategy by the post-apartheid transitive period was not applicable to problems within the Eastern Cape province.

Reddy (2016, 3) argues that “having access to sufficient water and an environment that was not harmful to their health or wellbeing fell under the rubric of ‘socio-economic’ or ‘second generation rights’”. Second generation rights are a response to the abuses and misuses of capitalist development and its underlying, essentially uncritical conception of individual liberty that tolerated, even legitimated, the exploitation of working classes and colonial people. In the South African context, what is now considered as second-generation rights were previously known to be privileges freely given to its white population. The constitution prescribed access to water and safe environments after 1994, which showed that South Africa had only recently become a sensible and functional country. The provision of services falls on more than one sphere of government which shows how far-ranging and in need services are. Local government is the sphere of government closest to people and is tasked with the development

and provision of municipal goods, benefits, activities and satisfactions that are deemed public, to enhance the quality of life in local jurisdictions.

The Municipal Systems Act (No. 32 of 2000 as amended) determined specific duties and requirements for all municipalities which include: "giving priority to the needs of the local community; promoting the development of the local community; and ensuring that all members of the local community have access to at least the minimum level of basic services". Furthermore, municipalities are autonomous and in terms of the Constitution (Section 152) they are mandated to facilitate accountable local governance, to ensure the provision of services to communities in a sustainable manner and to promote a safe and healthy environment (Greffrath and Van Der Walt 2016, 394) . The issues of those who lived in the outskirts of South Africa now became municipal and local responsibilities. When interviewed, Municipal Councillor 2 (2020) iterated that his responsibility within the Buffalo City Municipality was to mediate challenges of disputes and to advocate for issues of service delivery, such as infrastructural development and housing. Also, in the context of service delivery and socioeconomic issues, democratic branches of government are responsible for establishing conducive living environments. Municipal responsibility within the Eastern Cape has been tasked with inherited difficulties from the previous administration, along with ensuring development from its previous representations in its past of neglect and disarray.

### 3.2 Water service delivery challenges

A key department and role player responsible for water provision is the Department of Water and Sanitation (DWS). The water service sector refers to water supply and sanitation services which are predominantly provided by the DWS, water boards and municipalities. The DWS leads the sector through policy development, regulation, and monitoring and evaluation. It has relinquished its implementation responsibility by transferring water schemes to relevant municipalities. According to the DWS (2016, 49), "problems in water services' provision fall into six categories which are policies, financial issues, institutional issues, community and technical issues and water issues". These issues underlie the 'why' when it comes to the irregularities of water service provision. The category focusing on governance or policy, accounts for poor implementation, as well as exposing unsustainable policies.

The institutional issues direct citizens to those responsible for reporting issues of mismanagement and the lack of efficiency in the delivery of water (e.g. lack of capacity to manage and corruption). The problems relative to technical issues provide a depiction of the state of current water and sanitation issues faced by those affected by lack of infrastructure, inadequate sewer systems and reconditioning of delivered services. Lastly, there is the issue of water resources and its relation to water delivery problems. Ward Councillor 2 (2020) demonstrates this by stating that the Buffalo City area had a challenge with water not because there was not enough rain but because there were not adequate dams to collect the water when the rain came. He added that the dams within the region were not properly maintained. Furthermore, where the dams have water, the land around the dam would gradually subside beneath the water reducing the capacity of the dam to hold the water. He suggested that sand should be removed from beneath the water but specified that that was not being done. This misstep or inability of the capture of water in the dams has impacted those living in the Buffalo City area. The defects of adequate water service maintenance are identified as one of the irregularities towards water service provision.

With the skewed history of inadequate and unequal delivery of water to all, implementation strategies of a sustainable supply of water and the procedures of how water could be attained and distributed to all citizens, should be prioritised and placed in order. The management of water by municipalities is embedded in local municipalities throughout South Africa. Schneider (2003, 33–41) asserts that "unique challenges for local municipalities in South Africa include not just the culture of non-payment for municipal services such as water or electricity, the lack of institutional capacity and financial mismanagement, but also local clientelistic and patronage interests not supporting the delivery of public service". The full complexity of decentralised water services' provision also requires the devolution of other management functions (e.g. motivating, controlling, organising and planning). Loss of control, inconsistency and loss of direction in an organisation or sector as a whole, and the inappropriate use or abuse of new-found freedoms, are often highlighted as demerits of democracy.

### 3.2.1 Decentralisation in administrative distribution

The administrative structure in Apartheid South Africa consisted of a limited designation that rejected its broader race and population. The existence of the governance, political and legal

structure before democracy was a concern for the new all-embracing administration and its duty to the call for equality for all its citizens. Mogale (2003, 217) speaks about decentralisation that was "designed to facilitate and open up the gradual process of placing power and resources at a closer and familiar and more easily influenced level of government". Decentralisation is not only about the devolution of powers, but also about the unlearning of old habits of maladministration and unfair treatment. Therefore, decentralisation in South Africa as a result of democracy contributes to the culture of efficient and adequate provision, in response to the damage caused by the fragmented South African pre-1994 government. The new South Africa had to inhibit the protocols of separatism set by the Bantustan policy and the central government for reintegration of a democratic decentralised state.

The provision of water, a resource that is always needed and in demand, falls under the responsibility of many entities or organisations. According to the Free Basic Services policy of 2000, which provided for free access to basic services, before 1994 there was no single national government department responsible for water supply and services, as responsibility was divided amongst local governments in the previous four provinces and to ten nominally autonomous homelands, resulting in very different levels of service. Most of the then white local governments offered standards equal to those in industrialised countries. In the rural areas, there were often no services, while in black urban areas the situation was mixed. Both urban and rural services for black people were often in a state of neglect.

The Free Basic Services (FBS) policy was first announced in 2000 and aimed to support low-income households to access free basic services, including water, sanitation and electricity services. The aim for the redress of backlogs associated to previously disadvantaged services was a signification of progress. However, with the limitations to household recipients, this policy was not all inclusive as it did not enlist schools which were also a contentious focus point for the disenfranchisement of black people. The prioritisation of households has limited the discourse of inaccessibility to basic services as in previously disadvantaged areas. In order for disparities to be addressed, the scope of marginalised and prejudiced institutions with inaccessibility to services ought to have been included. The inclusion of schools in this policy would have allowed for more attainable goals as a mass of the services could have been distributed to schools and received equally by learners. However, this would have resulted in

the supply of services being a more strenuous task as a number of households would have to be equally attended to.

The Free Basic Services policy was designated to respond to the estimated 15.2 million South Africans, of which 12 million were living in rural areas, who did not have inadequate access to safe water. In addition to this, in 1994, an estimated 21 million people did not have access to any basic level of sanitation. Today, there are still 18 million people (in three million households) that do not have access to basic sanitation at present. An estimated 15% of clinics and 11, 7% of schools are without sanitation and many other schools use pit latrines that are inadequate, dirty and unsafe (Free Basic Services 2020, par.6). South Africa's sanitation problem has a main cause: a lack of infrastructure, which in addition to other issues, has resulted in there being no sanitary toilets and any water for hand washing in many rural areas. The FBS policy reviewed all the implications of the backlogs of water, infrastructure and sanitation, presented statistics, but failed to implement pragmatic resolutions for free basic services.

The resolutions for water delivery by the FBS policy stipulated organisations responsible for water supply and sanitation services which included municipalities, water boards, community based organisations (CBO) and publicly or privately-owned companies. The responsibilities of water boards were enlisted to "operate some water resource infrastructure, bulk potable water supply schemes (selling to municipalities and industries), some retail water infrastructure and some wastewater system, while the responsibilities of CBO's were described as "to manage some small water schemes in rural areas" (Free Basic Services 2020, par. 9). The assorted choices of provisioners of water supply provide little information for the reasons of limitations of water supply to the underprivileged. This technical approach to the reform of water supply also fails to explain how these services would be free. The importance of transparency within post-Apartheid policies is guilty of overpromising and non-compliance.

After the decentralisation of South African governance, policies have called for the enforcement of equal rights for local amenities. "To newly incorporated communities, the benefits of integrated development are still marginal, as is accessibility to some of the local amenities, despite a purported right to them" (Mhone 2003, 232). The reprioritisation of socioeconomic reform in an integrated country should allow for the effective use of resources,

improvement of service delivery, as well as inter-governmental relations which support these interventions. The political uncertainties of previously marginalised provinces, such as the Eastern Cape, have not been completely dismantled. The inheritance of poor and aged infrastructure, as well as poor service delivery remains as a contentious factor for residents.

### 3.2.2 The politicisation of water delivery

The popular mandate of allowing the new government to fulfil the charter and ensure natural resources like water to be accessible was captured in the RDP. “However, it did not take long for the ANC government to abandon that popular mandate by unilaterally deciding to pursue a water policy that has produced the opposite result” (McKinley 2004, 181).

The country had been haunted for decades by the racial segregation under the Apartheid regime. “The National Water Act of 1998, formulated during the transition to the post-Apartheid era, was widely recognised in policy circles as one of the most comprehensive water laws in the world” (Merrey 2008, 590). The act defines the state as “the custodian of the nation’s water resources, and only water required to meet basic human needs and maintain environmental stability is guaranteed as a right” (Republic of South Africa 1998, 26). The new National Water Act gave the state a strong tool to redress race and gender equities inherited from the past.

The National Water Act was implemented and enforced in a society thick with historically-entrenched socio-economic and political inequities. “Hence, a decade after the introduction of the National Water Act access to water is still highly stratified along racial lines” (Bond 2006: 592). This is an indication that the delivery of water weighed more towards the white population, and that there was an unheard-of agreement against and about black South Africans receiving basic rights to survive. Recognition and understanding of the challenges before the reform of the delivery water could shed light on the forces at play in the resistance to distribution and receiving of water currently.

The plans for the distribution of water welcomed the involvement of international third parties, including the neo-liberal economic advice of the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund and various Western governments (and heavy lobbying by private multinational water companies such as Suez). One school of thought suggests that “multilateral institutions, such

as the World Bank, brought discursive power to bear on the ANC, thus converting the organisation to neoliberal orthodoxy" (Saul et al 2001, 30).

According to McKinley (2005, par.4), "the government drastically decreased grants and subsidies in the mid-1990s to local municipalities and city councils and supported the development of financial instruments for privatised delivery". This effectively forced local government to turn to the commercialisation and privatisation of basic services as a means of generating the revenue no longer provided by the state. Many local government structures would now begin to privatise public water utilities by entering into service and management 'partnerships' with multinational water companies. The production and delivery of public goods were entrusted to these multinational water companies to drive more efficient services. The conferring of state responsibility to privatisation was at risk of backgrounding the services that were intended for the worst off, as now the priority for the private sector would be for monopolisation and profit. The mandate of the RDP of justice and equality being restored to the people and the surety of natural resources no longer became a part of socioeconomic reform.

The rise of a neo-liberal inspired policy of cost-recovery, which makes people pay for the associated costs of water infrastructure, can be considered as a result of the corporatisation of basic services. "The adoption of the macro-economic policy framework in the form of the Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR) policy in 1996 located the policies of water and other basic needs within a neo-liberal framework" (McKinley 2005, 36). Restoring the previously disadvantaged becomes difficult with new-found price hikes on service which were already inaccessible. In addition to this, the maintenance of these basic services placed strain on the equal population. The opportunity of having a sustainable supply of basic services was not always afforded, now the combination of affordability would further exacerbate the discourse of inaccessibility in rural areas. Affordability and poverty are imminent matters in rural townships in which policies should strengthen eradication measures of poverty and move towards affordability. According to McKinley (2005, 36), "the full cost recovery punted by the World Bank, which is the tariff revenue sufficient to meet operations and maintenance costs that keeps prices in check, has seen the water services of over 10 million people being cut off in South Africa".

The cycle of inaccessibility after unequal provision and access to water is reflective of the continuities of the past. The price increase of water, which is dependent on different water vendors, signifies the commodification of water and further exacerbates inaccessibility to those who are unable to afford public utilities especially the previously disadvantaged. In addition to this, it nullifies policies such as the RDP and Free Basic Services policies that advocate for accessibility, equality and affordability for the previously disadvantaged. The dignity of communities in rural South African communities had never been a concern, as their basic right to human needs, such as water, has always been a restricted privilege and available to only those who can afford it. Human needs began to look like private goods. It appears that the same rule still applies, from when racism and segregation was institutionalised to the democratisation of the new South African government. Racial discrimination is not the only matter that ought to be dissipated in today's free South Africa but the coalition of issues of affordability and the restrictions to basic needs ought to be seriously reconsidered for the previously disenfranchised.

### 3.3 Government intermediary: Amatola Water Board

The South African government does not act alone in governing the country, which is why there was the establishment of parastatals. The provision of various resources is aided by different organisations and boards, such as water boards for the aid and provision of water. The Amatola Water Board is designated to act within a prescribed area as proclaimed in the Government Gazette No 18409 of 14 November 1997 and is empowered by the Water Services Act No. 108 of 1997. These prescribed areas are Peddie, Mdantsane, East London, Komga, King William's Town, Zwelitsha, Stutterheim, Keiskammahoek, Middledrift and Victoria East, all within the Eastern Cape. In line with Section 30, Amatola Water acts as an implementation agency on behalf of the municipality in operating and upgrading water treatment works. Amatola Water is further governed by all water and water board-related policy frameworks issued by the Department of Water and Sanitation (DWS), as well as directives from the Minister of Water Affairs and Sanitation. Amatola Water has strong government support and there has been pending legislation for improvements in the sector which will provide medium and long-term opportunity for improving the capacity and position of Amatola Water as a water services utility (Amatola Water 2017, par.1).

During the research of this study, when Amatola Personnel 2 (2020) was interviewed, he stated that "Amatola Water and the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality Supply water to Mdanstane, wherein BCMM is the service provider for Mdanstane. The water supply ratio is 60:40, with Amatola Water providing 60% of the water and BCMM the remaining 40%". With the collaboration of the Metro and Amatola Water, there appears to be isolated responsibilities in regard to the provision of water. BCMM controls the pumping and distribution network within Mdanstane, while Amatola Water is tasked with maintaining the bulk water filling, storage, transportation and distribution processes so that safe water can be delivered to consumers. The contention within this study lies with the delivery of water to the people with the Metropolitan area.

Amatola Water had assisted local government through project implementation services to eradicate backlogs of water and sanitation in the Buffalo City Municipality (BCM), "service was also utilised by provincial government departments such as the Department of Education, the Department of Public Works and the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry to eradicate water and sanitation backlogs at rural schools and police stations respectively. These programmes were on target as of 11 years ago" (Amatola Water 2008, 23). In a project at Eastern Cape schools for the resolution of sanitation services, Amatola Water had negotiated two appointments with the Department of Education (DoE) and the Department of Science and Technology (DST) to implement a School Sanitation Programme in the Eastern Cape 14 years ago. The DoE appointment had a value of R40 million for a two-year period for the construction of water and sanitation facilities at rural schools, while the DST appointment had a value of R8,8 million with the objective of establishing sustainable sanitation systems at rural schools (Eastern Cape School Sanitation Project 2016, 22). Amatola Water acted as a means to align both clients' projects (DST and DoE) into one water and sanitation delivery mechanism. This collaboration carried the potential to alleviate the plight of learners and the backlogged infrastructure in schools in the area. The transfer of service delivery still has not guaranteed water for the residents in the Buffalo City area, which also brings into question whether this enterprise is beneficial for the residents of the Buffalo City Municipality.

The consolidation of data between Amatola Water's reports and information provided by their employees did not necessarily correlate. Amatola Personnel 1 (2020), when interviewed, stated that he was not aware of any school sanitation project. He added that the Department of

Education has other interventions to address sanitation challenges which do not necessarily involve Amatola Water. However, Amatola Water was appointed as an implementing agent by the provincial Department of Education (DoE) at specific schools for the operation and maintenance of bulk water and sanitation infrastructure with the scope of work involving the refurbishment of waste water treatment works, ponds and the sourcing of an alternative water supply to the schools for human consumption and toilet flushing. The ability of the governmental department to delegate the responsibility of water supply signals what could be a beneficial multi-stakeholder approach. There are identifiable efforts displayed by the collaboration between Amatola Water and the DBE. However, the incoherence of their collaboration results produces misinformation to the public.

### 3.4 Political interference and the provision of resources

"The lack of basic services including housing, water and sanitation, as well as insufficient municipal capacity due to the lack of essential skills have been identified by numerous scholars as persisting challenges" (State of Local Government in South Africa: Overview Report National State of Local Government Assets 2009, 9). The incapacity of the workforce in municipal offices as mentioned by various academics has filtered down to the implementation and delivery of services. Mafunisa (2003, 2) emphasises that "political interference in administration would erode the opportunity of an efficient administration hence policymaking activities ought to be wholly separated from administrative functions and administrators need to have explicit objectives before they could begin to develop efficient administrative functioning". Political separation from administrative work allows for unbiased preferences and opinions. Administrators should act as implementers of policies and they should be concretised in adhering to policies which are the most suitable for the public. In cases where these policies are unlawful or harmful to citizens, political interference could be beneficial. The combining of policymaking and administration equates to a well-formed process of reform and implementation.

The provision of services is an administrative process which does not need the assistance of any political input unless there are disparities in its provision and/or discrimination against any parties involved in the provision of services. Zarenda (2013, 2) states that "political interference in the functioning of municipalities has been revealed as being problematic as it hinders the

effectiveness and efficiency of the provision of services". In 2015, Tandwa (2019, par.3) reported that the children of the African National Congress' Chairperson and Mineral and Resource Minister, Gwede Mantashe, and Minister of Small Business Development, Lindiwe Zulu, were involved in a R631-million tender to a company named Siyenza to build 66 000 toilets in the Amathole District Municipality. Although, these politicians were not directly linked to this tender, the intent of rent-seeking could not be ruled out. Namesakes of these politicians appeared to have been awarded the tender. This suspicious tender has not completed its directives, causing more debate about its intent. Public Protector, Busi Mkhwebane reported that she "found that the allegation that there were irregularities in the awarding of the tender for the supply, delivery and installation of VIP toilet top structures by the municipality was substantiated" (Tandwa 2019, par. 4).

It has become evident that existing regulations regarding water laws and actual water use are expressions of social-political and economic power relationships between people. Hence, proposed changes in water laws through water reform processes will often entail shifts in the socio-economic relationships which will benefit certain groups in society over others.

Koma and Modumo (2016, 2) argue that "administrative components in local government should be free from politicisation because services in municipalities should be equitably rendered and not furnished only to individuals who have a partisan interest". The legacies of the past should not be allowed to fester in the present. Political interference, by various political parties involved in the struggle for freedom during Apartheid, had previously been the mouthpiece for equitable treatment for black South Africans. However, the ineffective provision of services in the past had been political, making it difficult to depoliticise the issue. The reason that political interference remains a contentious issue in South Africa is because different political ideologies hinder governance which subsequently affects the equitable process of service delivery in the country.

Each political party prioritises issues at different levels of urgency. Some parties do not keep in mind the disenfranchisement of citizens from the previous administration. This school of thought is characterised by Schattshneider (1960, 71) who says "all forms of political organisations have a bias in favour of the exploitation of some kinds of conflict and the suppression of others because organisation is the mobilisation of bias. Some issues are

organised into politics while others are organised out." In the ANC's 2019 election manifesto, President Ramaphosa stated that "We will continue to maintain water infrastructure and expand access of water to all, while enhancing quality control and management for the sustainable use of our water resources". The Democratic Alliance declared that "The DA will fight corruption; fix the police service so that it becomes honest and professional; create fair access to real, longterm jobs; secure our borders; and speed up the delivery of basic services" (Democratic Alliance Policy 2020, par. 3). For the sustainable provision of basic resources, it ought to be a common goal for all South African political parties, which will allow for the championing of efficient service delivery and the acceleration for the acquisition of equal resources.

Kane-Berman (South African Institute of Race Relations 2019, par. 5) insists that "the reasons for water crises include 'mismanagement and corruption' in the water sector, billing errors, unauthorised usage, and 'outright theft'". Whether in the building of infrastructure or at municipal level, 'serious accountability and governance issues' persisted. Therefore, it is clear that the politicisation of water issues makes the vision for equal distribution a rather distant reality.

Maphunye (2011, 6) states that "public officials and politicians should work together based on their separate roles and responsibilities, and no one should interfere in what the other is supposed to do". If all local officials were employed on merit principles, service delivery in South Africa would improve. Efficiency is primarily one of the most problematic areas of the service delivery process. Decisions made by officials are not well-informed, which also explains the low level and quality of services. This is reflected in the Democratic Alliance's policy for service delivery reform, in which their resolution is to merely speed up the delivery of basic services, without calling for any investigation into the reasons for the poor levels of service delivery. The importance of all stakeholders working together for the same cause would provide the necessary assurance of competence and the efficient distribution of water and sanitation services.

### 3.5 Water issues in Eastern Cape schools

Before the democratisation of South Africa, in relaying the experience of the sanitation facilities in Phambili Junior Primary schools, Retired Teacher 1 (2020) stated in the interview that bathroom facilities in schools were poor and were maintained by the children. Although,

the issue is not directly associated to the water crises, it is indicative of both the unsanitary environment of toilets, as well as how children were responsible for the operation and maintenance of their public facilities. In a pilot project in November 2007, Amatola Water undertook an assessment of the current sanitation situation at the time set out to train microenterprises in cleaning and maintaining school sanitation facilities. Kevin Wall and Oliver Ive created an assessment in 2010 in order to confirm that it was possible to service the various school ablution facilities and also to inform the micro-enterprises what type of sanitation systems were available in schools in the Eastern Cape. This project was intended to ameliorate the Eastern Cape's schools' sanitation problems. The results from the project were that the perceptions of sanitation alternatives were not consistent with what was provided. There was an inadequate design of toilets, insufficient training of users, neglect or deliberate abuse of facilities and ineffective solid waste management plans.

In the assessment, there was a visibility of negligence and incompetence on the part of schools as displayed by Amatola Water. Ive and Wall (2010, 23) declare that "it is important to advise and inform the schools on the different types of sanitation systems that are available in rural areas and explain when waterborne sanitation was not practical". There are two issues with this statement, the first is that the responsibility and blame for the poor implementation of water and adequate is shifted to these Eastern Cape schools. Secondly, although there is no mention of the schools in question, some of the schools in the project are long-standing, and are schools in rural townships which are not always equipped with safe and modern infrastructure. The main issue that arose from the assessment was that township schools were burdened with poor infrastructure that exceeded the capabilities of the staff and the children.

The role players involved in the reform of school sanitation appears to be unclear. In the discussion about role players, Ive and Wall ask the question of who takes ultimate responsibility. A plausible answer is that it lies with the (national and/or provincial) Department of Education (DoE) as funders of school sanitation and having responsibility for all school related activities, as well as the local authorities who are in charge of providing sanitation facilities in a geographical area, but who may have no budget provisions for school sanitation. This establishes a tone of unstable and unreliable accountability for school sanitation. A clear understanding of the role players responsible for sanitation management in schools is needed, especially considering the plight of learners and teachers in the Eastern Cape

in relation to their ablution facilities. When issues of poor infrastructure, lack of piped water or the delivery of clean water arise it should be that all governance structures involved in schools should be held accountable and involved in solutions towards safe school sanitation.

When interviewed, Ward Councillor 1 (2020) added that procurement processes often delayed the start of construction. He stated that other challenges include resistance from local communities demanding better schools, not just ablution facilities. The improvement of important features in schools add significant value to restoring dignity to learners and the institution, however, equal standards should be kept across the spectrum. The Ward Councillor's input of regarding the building of new schools provided a suggestion that did not entail working backwards and building on top of grounds that were inadequate for the construction of safe infrastructure. Rather, this would allow for well informed and executed decisions for the way in which schools should be constructed and furnished for efficient, effective and beneficial of use by scholars and teachers.

### 3.6 A pipe dream: Sustainable water delivery

The provision of a resource such as water requires a constant flow which should also be sustainable. "Sustainability refers to sanitation services that continue to work and which deliver lasting benefits for the users over a long time" (WaterAid 2010, 33). With the onset of reformist policies in 1994 for service delivery, theory extended to the implementation in schools. The Water Research Commission (WRC) appointed Hlathi Development Services in 2016 to conduct an independent evaluation of a pilot project of pour/flush toilets implemented in selected schools in the Eastern Cape and Limpopo provinces. Dr.Nozi Mjoli, Chairperson of the WRC, added that "the provision of waterborne sanitation facilities to schools was not an option because of scarce water resources and high operation and maintenance costs" (Mjoli 2016, 22).

Mjoli (2012, 25–28) created a list of sustainable sanitation recommendations which should be followed by service providers which explore sustainable sanitation solutions. The first solution entails social sustainability, in which she explains that sanitation services must be acceptable to the end-users; therefore, the representatives of the beneficiaries must be involved in the selection of the sanitation technology options in order to ensure that users take ownership of the sanitation facilities provided. Moreover, she states that the implementation of sanitation

technology must contribute to community empowerment and local economic development. Furthermore, user education and ongoing health and hygiene education for the beneficiaries is crucial for sustained health improvement. Institutional sustainability involves the selection of sanitation technology and service levels based on the availability of management capacity and budgets for operation and maintenance at the institutional level with support from local municipalities and district municipalities. Technical sustainability involves the choice of sanitation technology based on the availability of local technical skills with the capacity to provide operations and maintenance support to the users when necessary. Where water is required for flushing, reliable water supply sources must be in place. Financial sustainability involves the affordability of sanitation services to the beneficiary institutions and households. Environmental sustainability requires that sanitation services should not have a negative impact on the environment, such as the pollution of water sources from the unsafe disposal of untreated human waste. Sanitation technologies that rely on the on-site storage of human waste must put in place plans for emptying and disposing of sludge during the project planning phase.

This holistic approach of consolidating safe sanitation in schools as presented by Mjoli does not equate with the way in which sanitation issues in schools are dealt with in reality. The enforcement of all these solutions would be beneficial for the safe operation of ablution facilities in Eastern Cape Schools. Participants in school governance such as school bodies, the DOE , DWS and other IGR bodies should include researchers such as Mjoli in order to eradicate the past by informing them of irregularities and provide accurate solutions for school sanitation in schools. When interviewed, Retired Teacher 4 (2020) stated that sanitation service issues were escalated to the Department of Education, whereby tendered companies fixed the reported issues only for these issues to reoccur. Although there is a demand for safe sanitation in the Eastern Cape, there is also an urgency for its sustainability. The standards and regulations within school sanitation have a layered approach which ought to be performed and implemented by knowledgeable and actionable policies and people.

### 3.7 Conclusion

This chapter discusses the challenges of the scarcity of water as a basic resource in a post-Apartheid era, as well as the poor infrastructure of the rural schools, together with the problems of poor service delivery. Furthermore, this chapter reviews the resolutions regarding these

challenges. The focus on the former carried more importance due to the impact of the limitations to water, which included the infrastructural deficits that maintain plain pit latrines in schools in the Eastern Cape. The existence of pit latrines, as suggested in this chapter, has been the result of inaccessibility to an adequate water supply and weak infrastructures inherited from the Apartheid regime. The selection of water as a limited resource as discussed in this chapter revealed how service delivery has not sufficiently met the needs of the people in the Eastern Cape, while simultaneously giving rise to deeper issues that pervade this region, such as the inherited and remaining infrastructures from the previous regime. There are also competing tensions for the reform processes for water supply which increases the difficulty for the accountability of its provision.

The gap between theory and implementation in the provision of water was made visible, as seen with the collaboration between Amatola Water and the Department of Education. Without change, the alliances and objectives of the stakeholders and government exist only as contingency plans. This chapter illustrates the ways in which service delivery is performed as well as the role players that support it. The following chapter investigates the realistic ways in which Eastern Cape learners suffer as a consequence of poor delivery, both in history and today. The legacy of disproportionate access for people within the Eastern Cape is prevalent throughout channels of service delivery, in which the next chapter displays through the schooling system in the Eastern Cape Province. This investigation allows for an analysis of the experience of Eastern Cape schools which includes the new policies, stakeholders and reintegration.

# CHAPTER 4 - EASTERN CAPE SCHOOL INFRASTRUCTURE AND ITS DISPLACEMENTS ON EDUCATION

## 4.1 Introduction

This chapter explores the way in which schools in the Eastern Cape were used as platforms for segregation, wherein black populated schools experienced the dispossession of access to the essentials of adequate education and resources. More recently, the passing of Lumka Mketwa has exacerbated the debate about the standing of infrastructure in schools as a part of the transformed post-Apartheid society. This chapter exhibits the occurrences of undersupply within the Eastern Cape. This chapter also displays what a researcher or policymaker could not measure from households or individuals experiencing the effects of an inherited and neglected province. The selection of schools in the Eastern Cape area serves as a means of sampling the experiences of people within academic institutions. This chapter draws on the experience of education for learners both during the Apartheid era and more recently. It focuses on the plight of Eastern Cape learners, on how the institutionalisation of an unjust regime is reflected in their schooling through the means of infrastructure and poor-quality education, as well as their overall experience. The first section highlights the 'African' education system, as it differed from that of the white and Afrikaner scholars. This section underpins the black majority's experience with the onset of the Bantu Education system, as a branch of Apartheid ideals, and how that system sought to undermine the black child. This section focuses primarily on education in the Eastern Cape. The state of Eastern Cape Education in a post-Apartheid era is explored, and the provision of services and the reasons for backlogs are disclosed. The inputs designated for the success of education practices in schools are also examined in correlation to the success of schools in the Eastern Cape. The chapter is presenting the infrastructural inadequacies in schools, with focus on the consequential sanitation management issues.

### 4.1.1 The Bantu education system

The Apartheid system separated anything that could enable races to be equal, even between the country's youth. The South African law that governed the education of black South African children was called the Bantu Education Act of 1953 (later renamed the Black Education Act).

As part of the nationalist government's system of Apartheid, educational facilities were one of many tangible forms of separation with specific landmarks. The effect of the division between races was more impactful in the sense that it deepened the effects of the marginalisation of the black population. An Administrator of the Transvaal named Johannes Nicholas Malan made a statement in which he exclaimed that "We must strive to win the fight against the non-white in the classroom instead of losing it on the battlefield" (Malan 1961, 62). This statement amplified the already existing segregation created by the nationalist government, whereby the classroom was a sustainable mechanism that sought to demoralise the black populated youth. Schools were used as channels for disenfranchisement, by which the black youth were deprived of the right to knowledge and empowerment in their respective schools.

At the time, "black education was based on the principles of trusteeship, non-equality and segregation; its aim was to inculcate the white man's way of life, especially that of the Boer nation, which was the senior trustee of the nationalist government" (Robertson et al 1978, 106–107). The social order was maintained through the schools in non-white areas by the means of separate development. "Access to education was often a status reward that was distributed differentially, and education served as a mechanism of social control" (Johnson 2015, 214). The use of the education system as a tool of oppression for the black population added to the indoctrination of imposed inferiority. The formal enforcement of inequality within schools enabled the spread of propaganda that destabilised development in schools, much like it did the parts of South Africa, that were not included in its core. The white government (the nationalist government) claimed hegemony over the black majority in ways that prioritised their development. The programme of separate development further encouraged this behaviour, by moving the black population to the outskirts of the country. In a speech, the then Prime Minister, Dr. Verwoerd, stated that "the Bantu must be guided to serve his own community. There was no place for him in the European community above certain forms of labour… Education must train and teach people in accordance with their opportunities in life according to the sphere in which they live" (Birley 1968, 153).

School attendance by Afrikaans and English children was entirely free, including books and stationery. Education for black Africans was neither compulsory nor free. In 1960, white children received an average of R114.50 per year from government funds, while an African pupil received an average of R13,50 (Education and the South African economy 1966: 121–

123). According to Horrell (1968, 145), “African parents and local school boards raised R1 500 000 toward the erection, maintenance and running costs of schools”. The African population were left to their own devices in the attainment of adequate education, and to deny a group of people this opportunity constituted an act of unlawfulness. Although people living in the Bantustans possessed the agency to create an environment for education, the classroom war previously mentioned by Malan could not be won by those living in the Bantustans.

African education, unlike white education, was of extraordinarily poor quality. Schools were overcrowded, they usually had inadequately trained teachers, and experienced chronic shortages of books and equipment. The African population did not have the opportunity to be able to break out of their subordinate economic and social position. Although there were external efforts to improve education by the communities and African parents, it could not compare to that of the white population. Unfortunately, this was the goal for the nationalist government, to have education that was disproportionate and to incapacitate the lives and futures of the black population. The powers of central government had the capacity to ameliorate issues faced by African learner’s, but the system deliberately disengaged from them and executed forms of ill-treatment. In regard to African education and chieftaincy within homelands, Govan Mbeki (1992, 25) noted that “even though the chiefs were by and large illiterate they were placed at the head of school committees and took instructions from the Native Commissioners on how the schools should be run. The teachers had to carry out the chiefs’ instructions or lose their jobs”.

In 1976, the African Secretary of Education said the following:

> “The time has come for us in the Transkei to come together, blacks and whites, and evolve a system of education suitable for the intellectual needs of our children, to solve our problems and uplift the communities, to bring them to the same level, in all respects… Is it not time for you to open your doors to the black child for certain aspects of education that are inadequate in our schools… I would like to plead with you to offer your services wherever there is a need… Not only have you to educate those that must still be educated, but in many cases, you must re-educate yourselves for the task at hand. (Speech at Umtata High School, Daily Dispatch, 10/15/76).

The example of self-government is evident in the Secretary's proclamation. However, the choice of autonomy was not a fit for all Africans. The Secretary asked for a system that had appropriate standards, and for it be on a level that was above theirs. The level that is spoken about indicated an already recognised standard, one that is in need for equal opportunities for the education of black Africans which were not always afforded to the black population. It has become clear that there were other discrepancies within Transkei schools as history has revealed that there were inadequate conditions for schools to be operating in. This mirrored the Soweto Uprising, or perhaps its preconditions, of the dissidence of the African population and the recognition of their limitations of choice, poor quality of life and restriction of their freedoms and universal rights.

### 4.1.2 Schooling in a white setting

The disparities between black and white education were not hidden. In fact, they were the cornerstone of the South Africa's Apartheid education system. White education in the Eastern Cape fell under the jurisdiction of the Cape Provincial Administration. "Under the control of the nationalist government, Bantu education severely limited the African population access to education, while the content effectively socialised them in the values and myths of the ruling class" (Johnson 1982, 227). When interviewed, Retired Teacher 3 (2020) stated that schools in the Eastern Cape were provided with little to no furniture. Moreover, she stated that it was a case of survival of the fittest for students in the scramble for desks and chairs. It is in this scenario that the humanisation of the black child is brought into question. Their denial of basic accessories for learning and advancement and inaccessibility to public platforms is illustrated in the hierarchical scheme of the Apartheid state. More currently, it appears that black learners and their respective schools will always have to play 'catch up' to achieve the standard of white learners and their schools.

White schools functioned better because of accumulated resources and black schools did not due to historical levels of underfunding. Yet, Lemon (2004, 289) adds that "there is abundant evidence of schools underperforming even when resources are in abundance and of schools excelling when resources are severely limited". Rembe (2005, 55) added that "substantial inequalities also existed between regions within the province. The western part of the province is better resourced compared to the former Bantustan homelands of Ciskei and Transkei". The

school experience for children is multi-faceted and the underperformance of children can be associated with the environment, unqualified teachers, the background of the school and other socio-economic factors. In the case of South Africa's previously black only schools, all these factors hindered the growth of the black child under the nationalist regime. In addition, anything more than what black schools was prescribed pre-1994, was considered a luxury.

### 4.2 The state of Eastern Cape schools

The current crisis in education should be seen in the context of the history of deliberate underdevelopment in the province during the Apartheid era and the subsequent merger of former homeland education departments into the democratic South Africa. The consolidated province inherited many small rural and farm schools, frequently with very poor infrastructure (Equal Education 2017, par .3). The consolidation of Eastern Cape schooling can be explained by displaying its current climate in a post-Apartheid state. The poor environments and time frames in which schools in the Eastern Cape were constructed were bound to have an effect on the performance of school children. A link can be identified from their surroundings pre-1994 to the outcomes Eastern Cape scholars experience today. Kanjee and Prinsloo (2013, 82) state that "the economist of education would be able to demonstrate the weak relationship between funding output and education outcomes in a highly inefficient school system". The foundation in which schools were built in the Eastern Cape are not effective to begin with. The distribution of funding which allows for the necessary construction for schools is not sufficient which inevitably renders the schools inadequate from the onset of its erection. An investigation for the claim of negligence entails insight into the design and strategies of the establishment of schools. The initial error of the Eastern Cape government in its incapability of providing insufficient funding output creates an interconnected pattern of deprivation. When interviewed, Retired Teacher 2 (2020) stated that electricity was only installed in 2005/2006 in her respective school, which was twelve years after the fall of Apartheid. Although promises of reform are imminent, Eastern Cape schools are repeatedly characterised with negligence.

Statistics of learners, such as pass rates and levels of education, in Eastern Cape Schools should be treated with sensitivity due to the legacies of Apartheid. The educational inputs and outcomes at the end of the Apartheid were a legacy of inequity, and, as not often noted, inefficiency. "Aside from the implicit efficiency critique of having to spend so much on white

schools that seemed strictly necessary, there was the equity or equality critique of spending so little on the poor schools" (Cameron et al 2018, 32). Imbalances of the Apartheid past in previously marginalised schools should continue to be addressed until delivery to these schools has been ruled as adequate. The demarcation between public and private schooling should also not be used as an excuse for the standard treatment and provision of services in that it continues the separationist ideology of both the Apartheid and Bantustan inequalities for the black population. Discrimination still prevails in the democratised society, and its presence in Eastern Cape schools is a testament to this. The former disadvantaged schools have been expected to fall in with the rise of the democracy, even with the ongoing exploitations in schools.

According to Rembe (2005, 55) the difficulties experienced in maintaining partnership between communities and the Department in funding schools, where communities are required to raise additional funds as stipulated in the South African Schools Act (SASA) to enable schools to supplement the limited funding provided by the Department of Education. As a result of poor economic development, enormous backlogs existed in the homelands. The above factors affected the amalgamation and the functioning of the provincial Department of Education given the fact that more resources were needed in the former homelands in order to achieve equity and redress. According to the provincial Department of Education there was a shortage of 40% of classrooms at the primary level and 34% at the secondary level. Other infrastructural shortages included limited teaching and learning materials, the need to provide running water and toilets to more than 34% of the schools, electricity to 77% of the schools, and telecommunication services to 81% of the schools (Eastern Cape Department of Education 2000, par. 2).

### 4.2.1 The supply chain of school resources

The amalgamation of schools by the democratic government into an equal society that valued black learners had much to address and redress. This entailed reconciliation that addressed teaching and learning capacities, the provision of school supplies, the maintenance of schools by qualified entities and quality assurance of all of the above. Black scholars then and black scholars today are entitled to this fair treatment nationwide. Lemon (2004, 277) states that "the devolution of functions and staff from the centre to the new provincial government would in itself not have been unproblematic, but in South Africa the situation was complicated by the

existence of both the ‘own affairs’ structure of the tricameral parliament and the ten former black ‘homelands’, four of which were supposedly independent states and the other six self-governing in many respects, including education”. The Eastern Cape was filled with problems that extended beyond the rest of South Africa as their politics delved into traditional powers with the establishment of Bantustan rule. The experience of those living in Bantustans ought to have been considered and completely eradicated to accommodate integrated and equal schools. Perhaps this did not seem like an arduous task until the evaluation of school reform in the Eastern Cape was considered as a priority.

Lemon (2004, 274) adds that “any allowance for the massive backlog in educational infrastructure presumably must have been cancelled out by other factors in the funding formula”. If one presumed that the funding formula would be a solution that followed a straight-forward process, it would go as follows: infrastructural (educational) backlogs would be identified and funds would be allocated to respective issues that needed dire attention. However, “in late 1999, the education department in the Eastern Cape was given an additional two hundred-million-rand emergency payment by the central government, but early in 2000 the provincial MEC Minister of Education said that his department would exceed its budget by at least six hundred million-rand” (Dickson 2000, 274). Idealistically, one could say that the identification of backlogs had been overstated by the budget, which could have been justified by the budget requested by the MEC. However, the Apartheid-inherited infrastructure still remained, despite a hefty injection of funding for schools in the Eastern Cape. Those responsible for the implementation of reform measures, as well as for the releasing of funds for education should have been held accountable at every step of the process in the identification and eradication of backlogs. Perhaps, if the MEC had declared overspending for the resolve of backlogs, there would not have been an increase in the amount of reports of children losing their lives to inadequate sanitation facilities. The unfulfilled promises for reform and overspending give birth to suspicions of corruption. This also brings into question whether the identification process of backlogs meets the needs of under-privileged schools.

The constitution, as well as the new administration, was entrusted to provide sustainable, new and improved versions of the distribution of resources and services. Despite the significant amount spent on school improvements in the Eastern Cape since 1994, “the combination of profound inequality, coupled with persistent ECDoE bureaucratic incompetence, means that

the vastly different levels of school resourcing that still prevail could actually worsen the social divide for the majority of learners" (Hendricks 2009, 14). The bigger picture of an undivided province with integrated schools is conceptualised, however, the incumbency in the Eastern Cape Education Department did not speak to the problems in Eastern Cape schools. Funding and its allocation are one of the most important elements in the reconciliation of schooling, which means that it also contributes as one of the primary factors for inefficiency. Those who are responsible for the implementation of school resourcing must be held accountable for the conditions that currently prevail in Eastern Cape schools and for failing to improve or build new infrastructures.

When interviewed, Ward 2 Councillor (2020) corroborated that another challenge is that those responsible for the provision of services take bureaucratic forms of governance, which then becomes an issue. The definition of governance by Bevir (2012, 2) states that "governance differs from government, as it focuses less on the state and its institutions and more on social practices and activities". Schools should be furnished accordingly in order to fulfil their purpose, which is to allow for the learning of children and teaching by educators. The Eastern Cape continues to be burdened with the undetermined roles of its people. This is evident from the author's research. For example, when interviewed, Retired Teacher 6 (2020) stated that "bathroom facilities were poor and were looked after by children and that there were no cleaning staff". The reform of schools in the Eastern Cape, in the objectives of an equal South African schooling system, should have ensured the enforcement of dignity amongst its learners as they had been previously robbed of that opportunity under the nationalist regime.

Hendricks (2009, 14) adds that "the size of the Eastern Cape, the historic infrastructural backlogs and the degree of inequality *within* the province further complicated the aim of reaching equitable education". To bring together all these factors, in the unforgiving context of the Eastern Cape, remains the biggest challenge facing all those involved in education in the province. It appears that from the abovementioned factors that schools in this province have reached a stalemate, with no hope of progression. The education services are doing and have done scholars a disservice by not unburdening schools with inequalities. The municipal and departmental entities responsible for ensuring the provision of services need to be held accountable for the stagnation of progression in schools. Ad-hoc measures, such as school governing bodies and free school fees, are there to assist schooling processes. The DoE (2006:

8) states that “recent policy allows for schools within the poorest first and second quintiles to apply to be non-fee-charging schools which assists parents”. However, this does not change the pattern of resource disparity. Soudien (2004, 97) gives an indication of the limited impact of educational desegregation and the unchanged racialised demographics of, especially, rural schooling by stating that “history should not be permitted to repeat itself, and disparities should be the motivation for it not to”. The inconsistencies of an ex-segregated province are being diffused into a post-Apartheid form of governance, which is becoming more evident in schools. With regard to the inefficiencies of infrastructural reform and the lack of services provided to learners, there is a significant threat to their livelihoods. In addition, the lack of services contributes considerably to the performance of learners and the quality of results.

### 4.2.2 The sustainability of provision for schools in the Eastern Cape

Government policies are designed and established to keep a record of goals and obligations to its citizens. With this in consideration, the Department of Basic Education established the South African Schools Act (Act no.84 of 1996) on the 29th November 2013 which dealt with regulations relating to Minimum Uniform Norms and Standards for Public School Infrastructure. These regulations allow for the stabilization of schools in the Eastern Cape, while at the same time formalising accountability for the improvement and sustainability of safe and healthy learning environments. The Minimum Uniform Norms and Standards for Public School Infrastructure (2013, 4) states that “as a result of the painful legacy of apartheid, South Africa has suffered an uneven development with regard to the provisioning of basic school infrastructure to all public schools, and requires education to be central to government policies as one of its key priorities”. The objectives of these regulations are namely to provide minimum uniform norms and standards for public school infrastructure and to provide for timeframes within which school infrastructure backlogs must be eradicated. Although not explicitly stated, this policy is for the regulation of adequate public-school infrastructure. There were previously no benchmarks for the quality of schools in the Eastern Cape. This addition made by the DBE brought hope and expectations of reform in the infrastructure of schools.

“A loophole in the original Minimum Norms and Standards policy was that the guidelines must be followed in co-operation with other relevant departments” (Amnesty International 2020, 39). The Amnesty International organisation explored this statement while speaking with

experts on education in South Africa, who explained their belief that the DBE indefinitely delayed service delivery to schools based on the lack of capacity of other departments such as Public Works. When interviewed, Ward Councillor 2 (2020) informed the author that Intergovernmental Relations (IGR) creates a platform for departments and municipalities to work together so that the government does not work in isolation. The government and policymakers enable civil servants to provide opportunities for the betterment of children, which has more often been jeopardised due to the incapacities of the labour force. The disjuncture of civil servants towards the reform of injustices for children leads back to the discourse of discrimination for children. "Poor implementation by non-state actors commissioned by the Eastern Cape Department of Education and the department's failure to hold them to account for project delays and contract cancellations has contributed significantly to poor service delivery" (Equal Education 2018, par.2). The projects in the Eastern Cape are not seen through to the finish. Blame can be transferred to the region's rooted history of fragility in relation to development but with the systems set in place by state actors, all this is reduced to the lack of interrelatedness between policymakers and implementers, as well as their lack of capacities and determination for change within this region.

In observing the infrastructural and sanitation provision and maintenance in Eastern Cape schools, one is able to see how basic services are lacking due to there being limitations to its prioritization. Learners in the Eastern Cape have suffered over a long period from the injustices brought about by poor infrastructure and sanitation. Within the Eastern Cape, according to the Department of Basic Education's National Education Infrastructure Management System (NEIMS) report published in January 2018, "there are still 37 schools lacking any sanitation facilities" (NEIMS 2018, par.2). Issues that were highlighted in regard to poor sanitation in Eastern Cape were dangerous sanitation infrastructure, continued use of pit toilets and lack of sufficient toilets for the number of pupils in line with the learner to toilet ratio of the Minimum Norms and Standards for School Infrastructure. The inadequacy of provision in the Eastern Cape has and continues to be disadvantageous to both learners and staff in schools.

### 4.2.3 Infrastructure and sanitation in the Education Department

The Eastern Cape comprises of cities with suburbs and townships, as well as vast rural areas. Statistics South Africa (2001, par.3) defined rural areas as "any area that is not classified as

*urban*". Rural areas are subdivided into tribal areas and commercial farms. Townships have been defined either as a town or part of a town. Historically, 'township' in South Africa referred to an urban residential area created for black migrant labour, usually beyond the town or city limits. Reference is sometimes made to the 'black township', the 'coloured township' or the 'Indian township', meaning that these settlements were created for these population groups. Suburbs were usually designated for the white population. These definitions provide insight to the placement of people in the Eastern Cape. These semantics are still significant of differential status, access and governance. When interviewed, Retired Teacher 4 (2020) stated that the types of toilets in Transkei differed to the ones in Mdantsane. She added that in Mdanstane they experienced issues with flushing toilets. The Transkei fell under homeland status, just like the Ciskei, with more or less the same experiences across the Bantustans. This signifies the stagnation of the distribution of adequate infrastructure to schools. One cannot commend national and provincial authorities for providing modern toilets to the township of Mdantsane, which still have issues with flushing, when other parts of the province have not acquired the same. The distribution process of adequate infrastructure to Eastern Cape schools is nonsensical and continues to be burdensome for children.

Phaswana-Mafuya (2006, 19) states "there is a dearth of information on studies that have sought to examine qualitatively the sanitation challenges that rural communities experience, especially in the Eastern Cape". Generally, "rural communities were characterised by inferior infrastructure, poor site conditions, unreliable water availability and high population density" (Alcock 1999, 28). There is an accepted notion of what people have in certain areas, and what they do not have. This has become a sensitive topic for the historically isolated area of South Africa. The structural constraints from the Apartheid era have been carried into the new democratic era, without the complete desolation of old infrastructure. Sanitation development in rural areas includes inadequate water supplies, poor facilities for the safe disposal of water and other domestic waste, inadequate toilet facilities and hand washing facilities. Amatola Water Personnel 2 (2020) adds that "the old generation schools (built before 1994) had little or no privacy with regard to sanitation needs and, although each toilet pan is in a cubicle, there were no doors nor even half doors, leaving the user exposed".

The inadequate supply of water was also attributed to burst pipes, lack of funds to fix broken taps, taps being closed and droughts. When interviewed, Ward Councillor 2 (2020) verified

this by stating “that there are problems with the water and sewer lines running next to each other where there are leakages, sewer lines spill over into the other”. He added that the quality of water then tends to be compromised. Phaswana-Mafuya (2006, 26) states that “the sanitation challenges comprise human resources lacking technical experience, the lack of coordination and capacity, under-utilisation of local supplies, poor communication among stakeholders, the lack of political will, the lack of competency and deliberate political manipulation and sabotage which all impact the optimum of organisational resources”.

Within the Eastern Cape, it appears that any single problem is a part of a bigger set of problems. This is demoralising as there cannot only be one single solution, but rather multiple solutions that speak to all problems which need to be dealt with. Ncanywa (2015, 28) states that “across literature and the policy arena, there is a growing consensus that input resources play a key role in learner performance and, therefore, schooling outcomes”. This is regardless of the fact that the reasons for poor learner performance are varied, ranging from inefficient use of available resources to insufficient supply of input resources. Ncanywa characterises inputs “as educator to learner ratios, school infrastructure, learner-teacher support materials, nutrition programmes, learner transport, and educator quality. Allowing for the improvement of inputs should result in favourable outcome for learners. It should also be considered that these inputs are for the benefit of the children and should be effective and conducive for their development within school environments”.

Schools in the Eastern Cape for the black population were conduits of Apartheid planning, which is why it is beneficial to focus on them as the result of injustices to black South Africans. Schools infrastructural development refers to the building of new schools, renovation of existing schools and ensuring the expanded provision of services such as electricity, water, toilets and telecommunication connections. “In 1996, there was the establishment of the School Register of Needs which failed to provide adequate information to deal with continual changes in schooling and education provision. This register was replaced by the National Education Infrastructure Management System (NEIMS) in 2005 which provided an effective management and monitoring tool for infrastructure” (Ncanywa 2015, 45).

In 2007, the NEIMS report revealed improvements in schools as follows: “The number of schools without water has fallen from 8 823 in 1996 to 3 152 in 2006, the number of schools

without on-site toilets has fallen from 3 265 in 1996 to 1 532 in 2006" (National Education Infrastructure Management System Report 2007, par.2). The establishment of the management report is only beneficial if it is effective. However, this system cannot be commended if it does not increase access and delivery of the provision of services to all schools.

The NEIMS also released a Pits Only and No Sanitation Report in 2019, and this revealed that in the Eastern Cape there still remained 1587 pit toilets. This figure does not show a difference in the improvements that have been previously mentioned. This report depicts the inefficacies that remain with the infrastructure of schools. The achievement of meeting basic infrastructure goals is the task of the Department of Education. "The government did not achieve its targets under the 'Norms and Standards' of ensuring that all schools were brought into compliance with the norms regarding perimeter fencing, classrooms, electricity, connectivity, sanitation and water by 29 November 2020" (Basic Education Handbook 2017, par. 5).

### 4.3. Conclusion

The battle for infrastructural development is ongoing and struggles prevail for children in schools. As time has passed, issues regarding the maintenance of safe sanitation are still contentious issues in schools in the Eastern Cape. The Eastern Cape continues to be an area which is always saving itself from disorder as opposed to it being adequately managed and maintained with standard operations. The entities entrusted for Eastern Cape Education, especially in the rural areas, have not been able to ensure that adequate schooling facilities have been provided. With failure of service delivery in schools, comes the failure of the children. The present school system cannot fail children in a time when children need to be protected against the harmfulness of inequality. Demoralisation of scholars in the Eastern Cape continues and this has been made evident by the continued underdevelopment of infrastructure in schools. The remains of a fragmented Apartheid-inherited administration reflect poorly in the provincial competencies of schools in the Eastern Cape.

# CHAPTER 5 - CONCLUSION

The post-Apartheid government faced tremendous challenges when it took over the reins of power from a longstanding white minority regime in 1994. Chief amongst these were the systems of government associated with the Bantustans, and the legacies of underdevelopment and inequality which were a defining feature of key state services and institutions, such as education, infrastructure and sanitation. This dissertation has explored the strategies which have been employed in response to these challenges, the reasons behind the limited progress which has been achieved to date in the decades that have followed 1994, and the experiences and perspectives of key people who have occupied various positions within these institutions.

The main focus of inquiry has been the Eastern Cape, with a specific focus upon the allocation and distribution of public services. The institutionalisation of the systems of government predating democracy serve as a crucial component of the entire thesis which has presented the harmful and long-lasting effects of neglect of black South Africans. Post-Apartheid development approaches have displayed promising resolutions through neoliberal policies, government entities and municipal reform. With all this under consideration, the efficiency of these resolutions is contradictory to the evidence of the numerous pitfalls found in the poor and inefficient service delivery. The scrutinization of both the Apartheid and democratic administrations has been used as determinants for the Eastern Cape's political climate today**.**

The previous chapters in this study have illustrated that the Eastern Cape was an Apartheid stronghold. There are different ways in which this is illustrated, with the inaccessibility of services for residents serving as the point of reference for this dissertation. This study had the task of assessing whether post-Apartheid governance has made a difference in ex-Bantustan territories. The history of differential access in the Eastern Cape has continued to thrive in the post-Apartheid era. This dissertation has categorised those liable, including the previous political administration, post-Apartheid policymakers and implementation agencies, such as ministers and designated incumbents. The overthrow of the Apartheid regime did not require only the removal of the National Party, but also its practices. In addition to the takeover of the

government, there was an expectancy of a renewal of policies that would eradicate the misfortunes of the past. However, the many of the misfortunes resulting from the previous repressive regime are still in effect today. The way in which the Eastern Cape was managed in the past, and how it is managed today appears to have the same continuum of limitations. These limitations are spread across the socio-economic spectrum that continues to leave this region as well as its people, disadvantaged.

In this dissertation, emphasis was placed on the Bantustans and the role they played in the path to the post-Apartheid regime in order to for practices to be identified. The pace of development of the Eastern Cape is revealed in its history which dates as far back as the World War I. The history of the province's problems poses a challenge to the current government. The far reaching experiences and issues of those living in the Eastern Cape signify that a considerable amount of work needs to be done in order for reform and equity of service delivery to take place. The backlogs that plague this province continue to be a consistent headline; the eradication of these backlogs would be effective in erasing the problems of the past. The current democratic government is tasked with illustrating policies that are credible and cohesive between theory and implementation. The RDP was an example of a well-thought-out policy which included the provision of previously limited services, goods and affirmative action. This policy failed to meet its own demands in its own implementation. The task of implementation has been assessed as the most difficult task placed upon the democratic government. The more time, which is taken for reform, the more it is seen that systemic bias towards the Eastern Cape, remains.

The trail of service delivery in South Africa is problematic. Previously, public officials did not deem the provision of service delivery to the black majority as important. The normalcy for those living in rural areas with inadequate distribution of access to services and lack of transparency and consultation for their required standards are rights that are still sought by residents of the previously disadvantaged townships and rural areas of the Eastern Cape. The establishment of post-Apartheid policies aimed for the non-repetition of challenges that affected the black population, but many of these challenges have not been met and continue to affect sectors of the previously marginalised population. The sources of under-development in the Eastern Cape are evident in the mismanagement of the region, the broadly formulated

policies of reform and poor implementation which contribute to continuing the legacy of Apartheid.

The establishment of Bantustans in a divided and centrally led South Africa led to different levels of services. The irregularity of the provision of services to specific areas began with the enactment of the Apartheid system in South Africa. A quote by Lewis B. Smedes (2002, 59) states that "Restorative justice is not a replacement of retributive justice, but a complement. It seeks the rehabilitation of the wrongdoer and the repair of the victim's injury". This study verifies the fact that the new democratic government in South Africa was under obligation to restore specifically the province of the Eastern Cape. The focus in Chapter three of this study sought to establish the processes of the delivery of the specific basic resource of water in the postApartheid era. This chapter displayed the damage of the previous dispensation, and the state of repairs by the new government. A review of the implementation and reform of services led to measuring the capacities of those responsible for service delivery, especially in the Eastern Cape. The poor operation and maintenance of water supply, treatment and infrastructure are included as factors relating to the inadequacy of the provision of water. The powers that govern the water supply are not being held accountable for the irregularities that are affecting the inadequate water supply. This issue is further compounded by the politicisation of water supply as discussed in Chapter 3. While there are definite technical problems which are affecting the distribution of water, culpability and accountability also lies with the incumbents within government and their stakeholders.

Transparency in the previous administration did not exist, which ultimately meant that accountability did not either. This study has played a part in the monitoring and evaluation of governmental and governance processes in the redistribution of services in a post-Apartheid and democratic era within the Eastern Cape. In addition, this study exposes the avenues and levels of performance in the governance of the post-Apartheid society, more especially in the Eastern Cape. The inactions of monitoring and evaluation by the current government and the relevant departments has allowed the continuation of inaccessibility to services in the areas under discussion. With the previous regime, there were legal pardons for the limitations to basic resources and poor infrastructure. This dissertation exposes how South Africa has disassociated itself from the previous regime but has continued with the intricacies of disenfranchisement. In addition, the study has sought to answer the question of whether post-

Apartheid governance has benefitted the previously disadvantaged. The attempts by the democratic government to curb injustices brought about by the segregation of the black population to provide an equal share of the country's goods and services can be found in the establishment of progressive policies. However, the implementation and auctioning of these policies are not consistently practiced.

The pace of the Eastern Cape's progress does not significantly reflect its advancement from the previous Apartheid administration. The gaps that separated it from central South Africa, still separate it from other provinces in the country. Various factors continue to separate the Eastern Cape, including the increasing number of deaths of school children as a result of poor or non-existent sanitary infrastructures. This statement alone is indicative of other issues within the province such as the poor conditions of infrastructure, the low level of education and the province's overall inadequate capacity of ensuring the provision of service delivery and reform. In this study, the choice of using water accessibility and sanitation was to display its impact and how the restriction of this resource has affected the people that reside in the province. In addition to this, this study sought to reveal the impact of the limitations of resources in the Apartheid era and how they continue to affect the standards for those currently living in ex-Bantustans. Chapter four presents the effects of long-standing under-supply and the lack of implementation within schools in the Eastern Cape. Despite financial efforts towards reform, the consistencies of incapacity in this province remain an integral issue. The responsibilities of government are drawn out and not seen through. The Eastern Cape is riddled with insufficiencies that will only continue if the government continues to fail residents by not ensuring that nationally regulated standards are being met. This study probes the necessary monitoring and evaluation measures that need to be established for overcoming the pre-existing social and political conditions within the Eastern Cape, as well as reviewing the policies that have been created for rehabilitating the province, specifically in regard to the equitable supply of water resources and healthy sanitation for all its people.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY


Abel, Martin. 2016. *Long-run Effects of Forced Resettlement: Evidence from Apartheid South Africa*. Journal of Economic History 79 (4): 915 -953. Cambridge: Harvard University.

Adams, John,. Butler, Jeffrey and Rotberg, Robert. 1978. "The Black Homelands of South Africa: The Political and Economic Development of Boputhatswana and KwaZulu". *Perspectives on Southern Africa* 21: 50 -65. Berkeley: University of California.

Alcock, Peter. 1999. "A water resources and sanitation systems source book with special reference to KwaZulu-Natal: Part 6". *Water Research Commission Report N0. 384/6/99*. Pretoria: Water Research Commission.

Aliber, Michael. 2017. *The former Transkei and Ciskei homelands are still poor, but is there an emerging dynamism?*. Alice: University of Fort Hare. http://www.econ3x3.org/sites/default/files/articles/Aliber%202017%20Rural%20economic%20change%20-%20FINAL.pdf.

Allan, Colm., Overy, Neil, Somhlaba, Zama, Tetyana, Vuyo and Zepe, Lucas. 2004. "The Crisis of Public Health Care in the Eastern Cape". *The Public Service Accountability Monitor*. 19-36. Grahamstown: Rhodes University.

Ally, Shireen, and Lissoni, Arianna. 2017. *New Histories of South Africa's Apartheid-Era Bantustans. Routledge*. 5-20. London, New York: Taylor and Francis Group

Amatola Water. 2008. *Performance Measurement*. Accessed on July 1 2019. https://www.amatolawater.co.za/files/documents/000/000/028/1579770041_JjONO_AnnualReport-Inside-Pages-v9.pdf. 22 -25.

Amnesty International. 2020. *Broken and Unequal: The State of Education in South Africa*. 1-64. London: Peter Benenson House. Accessed September 2019. https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/afr53/1705/2020/en/.

Anderson, Ashlee. 2013. "Teacher for America and the dangers of deficit thinking". *Critical Education* 4(11): 28-47.

Atkinson, Doreen. 2007. “Taking to the Streets: Has Developmental Local Government Failed in South Africa?”. 53–77. Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council.

Bank, Leslie, and Hart, Tim G. B. 2019. “Land Reform and Belonging in South Africa: A Place-making Perspective”. South Africa: *Politikon* 46 (4): 411- 426.

Beinart, William and Bundy, Colin.1987. *Hidden Struggles in Rural South Africa: Politics and Popular Movements in the Transkei and Eastern Cape, 1890-1930*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Bekker, Simone and Richard, Humphries. 1985. *From Control to Confusion*. Pietermaritzburg: Shuter and Shooter.

Bekker, Simon., Buthelezi, Sipho.,Manona, Cecil., Mlambo, Bonga and Van Zyl, Albert. 1997. “Local government transition in five Eastern seaboard South African towns”. *Politikon* 24 (1): 38-56.

Bevir, Mark. 2012. *Governance: A Very Short Introduction*. United Kingdom: Oxford University Press.

Bhorat, Haroon, and Oosthuizen, Morné. 2006. “Determinants of Grade 12 Pass Rates in the Post-Apartheid South African Schooling System”. *Development Policy Research Unit*: 1–27.

Birley, Robert. 1968. “African Education in South Africa”. *African Affairs* 67(267): 152-158. London: The City University. https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordjournals.afraf.a095725

Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality. 2013. “Performance Report I”. Accessed on October 2, 2019. https://www.buffalocity.gov.za/CM/uploads/documents/9142625161913.pdf.

Bundy, Colin. 1979. *The Rise and Fall of the South African Peasantry*. Los Angeles : University of California Press.

Bond, Patrick. 2006. *Talk Left, Walk Right: South Africa’s Frustrated Global Reforms*. Durban: UKZN Press. Accessed 21 March 2020. http://www.ukzn.ac.za/ccs.

Bowen, Gary. 1998. *Community resiliency: A research roadmap*. North Carolina: University of North Carolina.

Booysen, Susan. 2007. "With the Ballot and the Brick: The Politics of Attaining Service Delivery." *Progress in Development Studies* 7(1): 21–32.

Cameron, Robert, Hoadley, Ursula and Levy, Brian. 2018. "The Politics and Governance of Basic Education: A Tale of Two South African Provinces". London: Oxford Scholarship Online, 1-15.

Chen, Le,. Dean, Janice, Frant, Jesper and Kumar, Rachana. 2014. "What Does "Service Delivery" Really Mean ?". *World Policy:* 12 -15. Accessed June 17, 2019. http://www.worldpolicy.org/blog/2014/05/13/what-does-service-deliveryreally-mean.

Chipkin, Ivor and Sarah, Meny-Gibert. 2012. "Why the Past Matters: Public Administration in South Africa". *Journal of Public Administration* 47(1): 16-25.

Cronje, Frans. 2015. *A Time Traveler's Guide to Our Next Ten Years*. Cape Town: Tafelberg Publishers Ltd.

Damba-Hendrik, Nombulelo. 2019. "Eastern Cape pupils march to education department, demand basic infrastructure at schools". *News24*, October 19, 2019. https://www.news24.com/news24/southafrica/news/eastern-cape-pupils-march-to-educationdepartment-demand-basic-infrastructure-at-schools-20191018

Davids, Yul Derek and Gaibie, Fairuz. 2011. "Quality of Life in Post-Apartheid

South Africa". *Politikon* 38 (2): 231-256.

Department of Education. 2006. *Education Statistics in South Africa*. Pretoria.

Department of Public Service and Administration. 1997. *Batho Pele – 'People First', White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery*. Government Gazette 388 (18340).

Department of Water and Forestry. "Basic Services". Accessed October 9, 2019. https://www.etu.org.za/toolbox/docs/government/basic.html.

Department of Water Affairs National Water Act 36.1998. "National Norms and Standards for Domestic Water and Sanitation Service*".* South Africa*: Government Gazette (41100)*.

Department of Water and Sanitation. 2016. *National Sanitation Policy 2016*. Pretoria.

Desmond, Cosmas. 1971. *The Discarded People*. London: Penguin Press.

Dickson, P. '700 E Cape Farm Schools to Close', *The Teacher*, 18 February 2000.

Eastern Cape Department of Education. 2000. *Annual Report: 1999/2000*. Bisho.

Education Panel.1966. *Education and the South African Economy*. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.

Egerö, Bertil. 1991. *South Africa's Bantustans: From Dumping grounds to Battlefronts*. Discussion Paper: 35-40. Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet.

Equal Education. 2019. "Statement: Provincial School Infrastructure reports reveal Education Departments Can't Properly Plan, Meanwhile The 2018 Reports Are Still Owed". Accessed March 26, 2019. https://equaleducation.org.za/2019/03/27/statement-provincial-schoolinfrastructure-reports-reveal-education-departments-cant-properly-plan-meanwhile-the-2018reports-are-still-owed/

Evans, Ivan. 1997. *Bureaucracy and Race: Native Administration in South Africa*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Everatt, David. 2008. "The Undeserving Poor: Poverty and the Politics of Service Delivery in the Poorest Nodes of South Africa". *Politikon* 35(3): 293-319.

External Infrastructures. 2019. Accessed May 10, 2019. http://www.amatolawater.co.za/projects/external-infrastructure.

Fraser-Moleketi, Geraldine. 2006. "Public Service Reform in South Africa: An overview of Selected Case Studies from 1994-2004".Masters diss., University of Pretoria.

Franks, Peter. 2014. “The Crisis of the South African Public Service”. *The Journal of The Helen Suzman Foundation* 74: 1-6.

Gopane, Ogomoditse. 2012. “Effectiveness of The Eastern Cape Provincial Department Of Local Government And Traditional Affairs To Monitor And Evaluate The Performance of Municipalities: A Case Study of Cacadu District Municipality”. Masters diss., Cape Peninsula University.

Greffrath, Wynand and Van Der Walt, Gerrit. 2016. “Self-help Governance and State Dysfunction: Exploratory Perspectives on the South African State and Civil Society”. *Politikon* 43(3): 389-409.

Hamel, Elizabeth., Brodie, Mollyann. and Morin, Richard. 2005. “A Survey of South Africa Ten Years into the New Democracy”. *International Journal of Public Opinion Research* 18(3): 351–363.

Hemson, Daniel and Owusu-Ampomah, Kwame. 2004. “A better life for all?: service delivery and poverty alleviation. In Daniel, J., Southall, R. & Lutchman, J. (eds). State of the nation: South Africa 2004-2005”. Cape Town: HSRC Press. 511-537.

Hendricks, Monica. 2015. *Eastern Cape Schools- Resourcing and Inequality*. Accessed 2 November, 2020. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/29807347_Eastern_Cape_schools__resourcing_and_inequality.

Horrell, Muriel. 1973. *The African Homelands of South Africa*. Johannesburg: South African Institute of Race Relations.

Inman, Robert. and Rubinfield, Daniel. 2012. “Understanding the Democratic Transition In South Africa”. *Working Paper 17799*: 1-36. Cambridge: National Bureau of Economic Research. http://www.nber.org/papers/w17799.

Ive, Oliver and Wall, Kevin. 2010. “Water services franchising partnerships: Business analysis case study: schools sanitation O&M”. Report to the Water Research Commission by CSIR & Amanz’ Abantu Services, 24-26.

Jara, Mazibuko. 2017. “Changing landscapes of democracy, rural governance, traditional power and degraded commons in a former Apartheid homeland”. *Law, Race and Gender Research Unit*: 1-20. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.

Johnson, Walton.1982.“Education: Keystone of Apartheid”. *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*: 214-232. New Jersey: Rutgers University.

Kane-Berman, John. 2019. “The Ugly Truth about SA’s Water Crisis: ANC cadre deployment to blame”. S*outh African Institute of Race Relations*. Accessed on February 19, 2020. https://irr.org.za/media/the-ugly-truth-about-sa2019s-water-crisis-anc-cadre-deployment-toblame-biznews.

Kanjee, Anil, and Prinsloo, Cas. 2005. *Improving learning in South African schools: The quality learning*. Pretoria: HRSC Press.

King, Brian, and McCusker, Brent. 2007. “Environment and Development in the Former South African Bantustans”. *The Geographical Journal* 173(1): 6-12. London: Royal Geographic Society.

Koma, Sam and Modumo, Onkgopotse. 2016. “Whither Public Administration in South Africa? The Quest for Repositioning in the 21st century”. *Africa's Public Service Delivery & Performance Review* 4 (3): 482–487.

Heymans, Chris. 1995. “A Lifelong Task. The RDP in Perspective”. *Indicator SA* 13 (1):57-64. Durban: University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Khunou, Freddie. 2017. “Traditional Leadership and Independent Bantustans of South Africa: Some Milestones of Transformative Constitutionalism beyond Apartheid”. *Potchefstroom Electronic Law Journal 12* (4):80-122. https://doi.org/10.17159/1727-3781/2009/v12i4a2741.

Koeble, Thomas and Siddle, Andrew.2014. “Decentralization in Post-Apartheid South Africa”. *Regional and Federal Studies* 24 (5): 607-623.

Kojana, Themba. 2018. “Media statement: Victory! Eastern Cape Education Department commits to implementing all recommendations in Equal Education’s new school infrastructure report”. *Equal Education*. Accessed November 17, 2019. https://equaleducation.org.za/2018/12/04/4845/.

Lemon, Anthony. 2004. “Redressing School Inequalities in the Eastern Cape, South Africa”. *Journal of Southern African Studies* 30(2) : 269-290.

Levin, Richard and Weiner, Daniel. 1997. “From apartheid to development”. South Africa :Africa World Press, 30-45.

Mafunisa, Mutuwafhethu John. 2003. “Separation of politics from the South African public service: Rhetoric or reality”. *Journal of Public Administration* 38(2):85–101.

Mahlangu, Nompumelelo. 2020. “Only 266 of 3,898 schools have benefitted from Ramaphosa’s Sanitation Campaign”, *Times Live*. Accessed March 29, 2020. https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2020-03-03-only-266-of-3898-schools-havebenefitted-from-ramaphosas-sanitation-campaign/.

Matthews, Sue. 2018. “School Sanitation- Returning Dignity to South African Schools. Pretoria, Water Research Commission”. Accessed November 29, 2019. https://journals.co.za/docserver/fulltext/waterb_v17_n3_a5.pdf?expires=1562687267&id=id&accname=guest&checksum=1DF63DE196DE2A5DDD40A71165F3B38B.

Maloka, Eddy. 1995. “Traditional leaders and the current transition”. *African Communist* 141: 35-43. Johannesburg: SACP.

Mamdani, Mahmood. 1996. *Citizen and subject: contemporary Africa and the legacy of late colonialism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Maphunye, Kealeboga. 2011. “The relevance of the developmental state model to South Africa's and Botswana's public services: A comparative perspective”. *Journal of Public Administration* 46 (1): 608–621.

Mbeki, Govan. 1992. “The Struggle for Liberation in South Africa”. Accessed on March 12, 2020. http://www.anc.org.za.

McDonald, D and Pape, John. 2002. *Cost Recovery and the Crisis of Service Delivery in South Africa*. Cape Town: Human Sciences Research Council Publishers, 40-45.

McKinley, Dale. 2005. "The Struggle Against Water Privatisation in South Africa. AntiPrivatisation Forum and Coalition Against Water Privatisation", *Anti-Privatisation Forum*. Accessed January 13, 2020 http://apf.org.za/article.php3?id_article=80.

Merrey, Douglas. 2008. "When good intentions are not enough: is water reform a realistic entry point to achieve social and economic equity?". Proceedings of the 9th WaterNet/WARFSA/GWP-SA Symposium, Johannesburg, 29-31 October 2008.

Meyer, MJ. 2000. "Globalisation: An Issue of Contestation and Struggle in South Africa in Mots Pluriels". Accessed 12 March, 2020. http://www.arts.uwa.edu.au/MotsPluriels/MP1300mm.html.

Mhone, Guy. 2003. "Globalisation and the challenges of governance in the new South Africa". *Governance in the new South Africa*. Lansdowne: Juta Academic.

Minkley, Gary. 1985. *To Keep in Your Hearts'. The I.I.C.U., Class Formation and Popular Struggle, 1928-1932*. Unpublished B.A. (Honours) Dissertation. University of Cape Town: Cape Town.

Mjoli, Nozi. 2012. *Evaluation of sanitation upgrading programmes – The case of the bucket eradication programme*. Pretoria: Water Research Commission.

Mogale, Thomas. 2003. "Developmental Local Government and Decentralised Service Delivery in the Democratic South Africa". *Governance in the New South Africa:*50-55. Lansdowne: Juta Academic.

Mukonoweshuro, Eliphas. 1991. "Between Verwoerd and the ANC: Profiles of Contemporary Repression, Deprivation, and Poverty in South Africa's 'Bantustans'". *Social Justice* 18 (1/2 ): 170-185.

Murray, Colin. 1983. "Struggle from the Margins: Rural Slums in the Orange Free State". London: Sage.

Myers, Jason. 1999. “The spontaneous ideology of tradition in post-apartheid South Africa”. *Politikon* 26(1): 33-54.

National Planning Commission. 2011. *Diagnostic report: An overview perspective*. Pretoria: The Department of Presidency.

The Presidency Republic of South Africa. 2006. *National Spatial Development Perspective*. Accessed March 1,2020. https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis_document/201409/complete1.pdf.

Ndou, Nkhangweleni. 2008. “The Role of School Management teams in curriculum change management”. Master’s Diss., University of South Africa.

Ngcukana, Lubabalo. 2019. “Eastern Cape school horror: Lack of proper toilets and classrooms endangers learners’ lives”, *News 24*. Accessed October 20, 2019. https://citypress.news24.com/News/eastern-cape-school-horror-lack-of-proper-toilets-and-classroomsendangers-learners-lives-20190326.

Ncanywa, Thobeka. 2015. *A descriptive Analysis of the Eastern Cape School Indicators*. Alice: Verity Publishers.

Ndlovu, Sifiso. 1998. *The Soweto Uprising: Counter Memoires of June 1976*. Randburg: Ravan Press.

NEIMS (National Education Infrastructure Management System) Report. 2009. Pretoria. Accessed 5 December 2019. https://www.education.gov.za/Portals/0/Documents/Reports/school%20infrastructure%20report.pdf?ver=2011-01-18-112114-057.

Nel, Etienne Louis.1990. “Mdantsane, East London's Homeland Township: Municipal Neglect and Apartheid Planning 1949-1988”. *GeoJournal* 22(3): 305-13. http://www.jstor.org/stable/41144996.

Ntsebeza, Lungisile. 1999. “Land tenure reform, traditional authorities and rural local government in post-apartheid South Africa: Case studies from the Eastern Cape”. *Research report; no. 3, Programme for Land and Agrarian Studies*. Cape Town: University of the Western Cape, 42-46.

Phaswana-Mafuya, Nancy. 2006. “An Investigation into the Perceived Sanitation Challenges In The Eastern Cape Rural Communities”. *Health SA Gesondheid* 11 (1): 1-13. Cape Town: University of Western Cape. https://doi.org/10.4102/hsag.v11i1.212.

Picard, Louis. 2005. *The State of the State: Institutional Transformation, Capacity and Political Change in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Pickles, John and Weiner, Daniel. 1991. “Rural and regional restructuring of apartheid: ideology, development policy and the competition for space”. *Antipode* 23(1): 2-32.

Presidency. 2007. *The National Spatial Development Perspective 2006*. Pretoria: The Presidency.

Rabbani, Faraz. 1994. “ANC’S Reconstruction and Development Plan. African Studies Center. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania”. Accessed on September 1, 2020. http://www.africa.upenn.edu/Govern_Political/ANC_Recon.html.

Reddy, Purshottama. 2015. “Post local governance and development in South Africa: Quo Vadis?”, in P.S. Reddy & M. De Vries (eds.), Quo Vadis?: *Local governance and development in South Africa post 1994*: 328–329. Brussels: Bruylant Publishers.

Reddy, Purshottama. 2016. “The politics of service delivery in South Africa: The local government sphere in context”. *The journal for transdisciplinary research in Southern Africa,* 12(1): 9-16. Cape Town: AOSIS.

Rembe, Symphorosa. 2005. “The Politics of Transformation in South Africa: An Evaluation of Education Policies and Their Implementation with particular reference to the Eastern Cape Province”. PhD Diss., Rhodes University.

Republic of South Africa.1998. *National Water Act*. *Government Gazette* 398 (19182). Cape Town.

Robertson, Ian and Whitten, Phillip. 1978. *Race and Politics in South Africa*. New Brunswick: Transaction Books.

Ross, Robert. 2008. *A concise history of South Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Saul, John .2001. "Cry for the beloved country: The post-apartheid denouement". *Monthly Review* 52 (8) :1-51.

Saba, Athandiwe. 2018. "Another child dies in a pit latrine", *Mail & Guardian*. Accessed September 19, 2019. https://mg.co.za/article/2018-03-16-00-another-child-dies-in-a-pit-latrine

"Sanitation backlogs in schools: DBE briefing; Sanitation Technologies and Innovations: Water Research Commission briefing. 2018". Accessed October 19, 2019. https://pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/27466/

Schattschneider, Elmer. 1960. *The Semi-Sovereign People A Realist's View of Democracy in America*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Skweyiya, Zola. 1997. "Batho Pele - People First White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery". South Africa: Department of Public Service and Administration, 1-12.

Schneider, Aaron. 2003. "Decentralization: Conceptualization and Measurement". *Studies in Comparative International Development* 38: 32 – 56.

Smedes, Lewis B. 2002. "How to deal with criminals? Is there a biblical principle behind the punishment of those who break the law*?"* Illinois: Christianity Today,5.

Soudien Craig. 2004. "Constituting the class': an analysis of the process of 'integration' in South African schools". In Chisholm L. (ed) *Changing class: educational and social change in post-apartheid South Africa*. Cape Town: HSRC Press. 89-114.

South African Schools Act, 1996 (Act No.84 of 1996). "Regulations Relating to Minimum Uniform Norms and Standards for Public School Infrastructure". *Government Gazette, No. R.920, 29* November 2013. Accessed on November 1, 2019. https://bit.ly/2wy6koT.

"Statement: Provincial Schools Infrastructure reports reveal education departments can't properly plan, meanwhile the 2018 reports are still owed" .2019. *Equal Education*. Accessed October 21, 2019. https://equaleducation.org.za/2019/03/27/statement-provincial-schoolinfrastructure-reports-reveal-education-departments-cant-properly-plan-meanwhile-the-2018reports-are-still-owed/.

Tandwa, Lizeka. 2019. "R631m toilet tender: Public Protector clears Mantashe, Zulu of political interference", *News 24*. Accessed on July 6, 2019. https://www.news24.com/news24/southafrica/news/r631m-toilet-tender-public-protectorclears-mantashe-zulu-of-political-interference-20190706.

Terreblanche, Sampie. 2003. *A History of Inequality in South Africa, 1652-2002*. Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press.

Tin, Hjalte. 2000. "Children in Violent Spaces. Reinterpretation of the 1976 Soweto Uprising". Denmark: *Centre of Cultural Research*.

Twala, Chitja. 2018. "The Qwaqwa Public Service, 1975–1994". *African Historical Review* 50(1-2): 78-100.

Van Koppen, Barbara and Jha, Nitish. 2005. "Redressing racial inequities through water law in South Africa, interactions and contest among legal frameworks". Rutgers University Press: New Brunswick, 82-90.

Van der Walt, Tjaart and Haarhoff, Johannes. 2004. *Service delivery indices for municipal water supply*. Proceedings of the 204 Water Institute of Southern Africa (WISA) biennial conference. May 26, 2004.

Visser, Wessel. 2004. *Shifting RDP Into Gear. The ANC Government's Dilemma in providing an equitable system of social security for the "New" South Africa*. Paper presented 40th ITH Linzer Konferenz, 52-60. Stellenbsoch: University of Stellenbosch.

Von Schnitzler, Antina. 2016. *Democracy's Infrastructure Techno-Politics and Protest After Apartheid*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

WaterAid. 2010. “Sustainability Framework”. Accessed on 5 December 2019. https://washmatters.wateraid.org/sites/g/files/jkxoof256/files/sustainability%20framework.pdf

Water Institute of Southern Africa NPC. 2017. “Amatola Water”. Accessed on 28 October 2020, http://wisa.org.za/patron/amatola-water/.

Water Services Act. 1997. Accessed December 1, 2019. http://www.dwaf.gov.za/Documents/Legislature/a108-97.pdf.

Weiner, Daniel. and Levin, Richard. 1991. “Land and agrarian transition in South Africa”. *Antipode* 23(1) : 92-120.

Westaway, Ashley. 2012. “Eastern Cape rural poverty led by grants”. *Grocotts Mail,* September 1, 2020. https://www.grocotts.co.za/2012/10/05/eastern-cape-rural-poverty-ledby-grants/.

Westaway, Ashley. 2012. “Rural poverty in the Eastern Cape Province: Legacy of apartheid or consequence of contemporary segregationism?”. *Environmental Learning Research Centre* 115-125. Grahamstown: Rhodes University.

Western, John.1981. *Outcast Cape Town*. The Journal of Modern African Studies Vol. 20 (2): 330-332. Cape Town: Human and Rosseau.

Zarenda, Harry. 2013. *South Africa's National Development Plan and its implications for regional developmen*t. Stellenbosch: Tralac.

Zulu, Makhosandile. 2018. “5-year-old pupil tragically drowns in school pit latrine”, *The Citizen*. Accessed November 25, 2019. https://citizen.co.za/news/south-africa/1858641/5year-old-pupil-tragically-drowns-in-school-pit-latrine/.

## APPENDIX

## Consent Form:

**Title: The Capacity of Eastern Cape Governance in a Post-Apartheid Era: Service Delivery in Schools**

This document confirms that I have consented to participate in the study being undertaken by Onela Magwaca, a master's Political Studies student at the University of the Witwatersrand in South Africa. The topic of the research is **The Capacity of Eastern Cape Governance in a Post-Apartheid Era: Service Delivery in Schools.** This study portrays the relationship between the post-apartheid reconstruction of public administration and the poor delivery of basic services to people living in former Bantustan areas. The research seeks views and opinions from government officials, retired school staff members and Amatola Water Stakeholders to understand the progress of service delivery in the Eastern Cape.

I…… confirm that the researcher has explained in detail the aims of the research and the information to which is being sought. I have agreed to:

**Give my views and opinions on the topic of study through an interview?**

☐ Yes ☐ No

**I agree that the interview may be audio recorded.**

☐ Yes ☐ No

**Have my interviews been documented?**

☐ Yes No ☐

**Have my personal identities remained anonymous?**

☐ ☐

Yes No

**Have my views and opinions published as part of the research?**

☐ ☐

Yes No

Participant Name: ..... Position: .....

Participant signature: ..... Day..... Month..... Year.....

# INTERVIEW GUIDE

H19/11/27

My dissertation will entail speaking to people in governmental structures and those involved in Amatola Water as well as those who were involved in schools. There is a challenge of whether all questions will be able to be applied to all these members, as they all play different roles for the provision of water and sanitation in the Eastern Cape. However, since there are different roles for water provision, it would be beneficial to create specialized questions for each organization that is interviewed for more informed and focalized questions. Interviews are to be conducted with ward councillors of NU2 in Mdantsane, where the schools of interest are situated. In addition to this Amatola Water, will be interviewed.

**General/Introductory Questions:**

1. Can you please tell me about yourself?
2. Please tell me a little about your job.
3. How long have/had you been working here?
4. What is/was the toughest part of your job?
5. What do you think about the service delivery of basic essentials in your area? (such as water and electricity)
6. How satisfactory is water supply in Mdanstane?
7. Can you tell me about any changes that your department/organization has done for the provision of water recently?
8. What do you think of long drops/pit latrines ?
9. Do you know why they are still being used in schools?
10. How can fatalities be avoided in schools as a result of bad plumbing in primary schools?

**Amatola Water Questions:**

1. Can you briefly explain the relationship between Amatola Water and the Buffalo City Municipality?
2. What is Amatola Water doing to reduce the relationship between Eastern Cape schools and their sanitation backlog issues?
3. Can you please tell me more about the 2005 Eastern Cape School Project between the Department of Education and the Department of Science and Technology? Is there anything like this project presently?

**Ward Councillor Questions:**

4. Do you think sanitation in the schools in your ward is safe and up to standard?
5. Have there been any issues of unsafe or unhealthy environments in these schools?
6. Are you aware of the water board, Amatola water? If so, have they made an impact in your ward regarding water provision?
7. Are water and sanitation problems handled by the municipality or are they sent through to departmental clusters?

**Concluding Questions: (Amatola Water)**

8. Is the safety of children a priority for water services?
9. How can implementation agencies and government structure improve school sanitation?
10. Do you think there is an inaccessibility of any services or resources in Mdantsane? If so, which ones?

## PARTICIPANT INFORMATION SHEET

1 Jan Smuts Avenue

Johannesburg

Gauteng

2000

Dear Sir/ Madam,

My name is Onela Magwaca. I am a master's student in Political Studies at the University of Witwatersrand in South Africa. As part of my studies, I am undertaking a research project. The title of my research is. **The Capacity of Eastern Cape Governance in a Post-Apartheid era: Service Delivery in Schools.** This study portrays the relationship between the post-apartheid reconstruction of public administration and the delivery of basic services to people living in former Bantustan areas. The investigation is aimed at understanding the integration of governance structures after 1994 which was aimed at resolving such service provision inequities with a specific focus on water and sanitation.

I am kindly inviting you to take part in an interview. Your selection in this study is pertinent for the analysis of the legacy of apartheid structures in the Eastern Cape. The findings from interviews will help draw a picture of the advancements of governance and service delivery. The interview process will take place in the first two weeks of January. Locations will vary depending on the choice and designation of participants. I would like to add that this research does not offer or include any treatment or payment to participants.

As part of this project, I would like to gather information from you through face to face, phone or Skype interview. The interview will take approximately 30 minutes and with your permission, I would also like to record the interview. The recording will help me to capture all details of the conversation for reference later.

Your participation in this research is voluntary and you can withdraw at any time. You can remain anonymous if this is preferable. Recording and written data will be stored in my personal computer and will only be accessible to myself and the supervisor of my research at the University.

If you have any questions, feel free to contact myself, my supervisor, or the university's Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC) through the details listed below. This study will be published as a research which will be available online through the university library website. If you wish to receive a summary of the final research, I will be happy to send it to you upon request.

Yours sincerely,

Onela

**Researcher:** Onela Magwaca **E-mail**: onelamagwaca@gmail.com **Cell:** (+27) 76 103 6505

**Supervisor:** Prof Joel Quirk **E-mail:** Joel.Quirk@wits.ac.za **Cell:** (+27) 78 135 3049

**HREC:** Shaun Schoeman **Email:** Shaun.Schoeman@wits.ac.za **Cell:** (+27) 11717 1408