

https://dspace.org/

Implementation of Policy on Geographical Names Change in Mogale City

Molotsi, William Setempe

2011-11-10
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/10771

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

Implementation of Policy on Geographical Names Change in Mogale City

by

William Setempe Molotsi

A research report submitted to the Faculty of Commerce, Law and Management, University of the Witwatersrand, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Management (in the field of Public Policy)

February 2011

ABSTRACT

South Africa has faced the challenge of policy implementation since the dawn of democracy. Other steps in the policy cycle are not as challenged as implementation. This study researched the implementation of policy on geographical names change using Mogale City as a case study. The aim was to understand and to examine the factors leading to challenges in the implementation of policy on geographical names change. Qualitative research methodology, with convenience sampling of participants for interviews were selected by the researcher as the appropriate methods for examining the implementation of this policy.

Successful policy implementation depends on institutions that have well-defined roles with the necessary authority and capacity to carry out their mandate. These institutions should be resourced to manage daily activities. The study noted that lack of resources affect policy implementation. In addition, successful public policy implementation requires involvement of the communities especially the affected ones. The more the public is involved, the easier it is for the policies to be implemented without protests or any other form of disagreement which will affect policy implementation.

Finally, the study found that implementation of policy on geographical names change is not implemented successfully. The study also found that this policy faces implementation challenges because it is left to chance. Lack of monitoring and evaluation processes, incapacity and a *laissez-faire* attitude of some government institutions responsible for implementing this policy are some of the factors responsible for the state of implementation of this policy. The study further found that politics dominate the implementation of this policy; in some instances this leads to the prescribed procedures for geographical names change being

disregarded, thus affecting successful implementation of the policy. These and other findings are presented in chapter four, analyzed in detail in chapter five and recommendations are given in chapter six.

DECLARATION

I declare that this research report on is my own unaided work. It is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the Degree of Master of Management (in the field of Public and Development) in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other university.

_____

W.S MOLOTSI

February 2011

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would firstly like to thank the Almighty for having given me strength and the will to go through with this study. It will be injustice indeed if I do not acknowledge good work done by my supervisor, Johnny Matshabaphala. I really value the excellent supervision and guidance that you astutely provided.

I am indebted to Laureen Bertin for exceptional work done in editing this research. You handled my stress and the undue pressure I put you through with a smile. Once more, thank you.

I would like to give credit to my fiancé who stood by me through trying times when I was not sure whether this study would come to fruition or not. You are God-sent. Thank you.

I would also like to convey special thanks to the Department of Corporate Affairs in Mogale City, and the members of the Mogale City Local Geographical Names Committee who availed themselves for interviews, and all who participated in the interviews. Thank you.

Finally, I dedicate this study to my younger sister, Lear Molotsi, who passed on in 2002. You were always there for me.

ACRONYMS

ANC	African National Congress
ACT 1998	South African Geographical Names Council Act No. 188 of
AZAPO	Azanian People's Organisation
DA	Democratic Alliance
ED: DP&UM Management	Executive Director: Development Planning and Urban
FFP	Freedom Front Plus
GIS	Geographic Information System
IDP	Integrated Development Programme
IFP	Inkatha Freedom Party
JRA	Johannesburg Roads Agency
LNGC	Local Geographical Names Committee
MCLGNC	Mogale City Local Geographical Names Committee
MCLM	Mogale City Local Municipality
MEC	Member of Executive Council
NP	National Party
NPNC	National Place Names Committee
PGNC	Provincial Geographical Names Committee
SAGNC	South African Geographical Names Council
UN	United Nations
UNGEGN	United Nations Group Of Experts on Geographical Names
WRDM	West Rand District Municipality

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT I

DECLARATION III

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS IV

ACRONYMS V

TABLE OF CONTENTS VI

CHAPTER ONE 1

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND 1

TO THE STUDY 1

1.1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.2 BACKGROUND OF STANDARDISATION OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES 2
1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT 10
1.4 PURPOSE OF THE STUDY 11
1.6 OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 12
..... 13
1.7 SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS 13
1.8 DEPLOYMENT OF THE STUDY 14

CHAPTER TWO 16

HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT AND LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES CHANGE IN SOUTH AFRICA: A LITERATURE REVIEW 16

2.1 INTRODUCTION 16
2.2 THE CONCEPT OF LITERATURE REVIEW 17
2.3 IMPLEMENTATION DEFICIT 19
2.4 TOP-DOWN VERSUS BOTTOM-UP IMPLEMENTATION APPROACHES TO POLICY IMPLEMENTATION 23
2.4.1 Top-Down Implementation Approach 23
2.4.2 Bottom-Up Implementation Approach 26
2.5 CAN IMPLEMENTATION BE PERFECT? 27
2.6 NON-IMPLEMENTATION VERSUS UNSUCCESSFUL IMPLEMENTATION 29
2.7 NAMES CHANGE IS ABOUT IDENTITY 31
2.8 NAME CHANGE AS A FORM OF RECONCILIATION 32
2.9 CONCLUSION 33

CHAPTER THREE 35

THE JOURNEY OF RESEARCHING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF NAME CHANGE POLICY IN MOGALE CITY: THE RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY 35

3.1 INTRODUCTION 35
3.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK 36
3.3 METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH APPLIED IN THIS STUDY 38
3.4 POPULATION AND SAMPLING 43
3.5 CASE STUDY 45

3.6 RESEARCH DESIGN 48
3.7 DATA COLLECTION USING INTERVIEWS....49
3.8 THE USE OF DOCUMENTATION....53
3.9 DATA PRESENTATION....53
3.10 DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION....55
3.11 USING DATA REDUCTION AS A MEANS OF ANALYSIS....56
3.12 PATTERN CODING....57
3.13 ANALYSING TEXTUAL DATA....58
3.14 CONCLUSION 60

CHAPTER FOUR....61

PRESENTING THE FINDINGS ON IMPLEMENTATION OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES CHANGE POLICY IN MOGALE CITY: CASE STUDY....61

4.1 INTRODUCTION....61
4.2 DATA COLLECTED FROM DOCUMENTS....62
4.2.1 Objectives for Standardisation of Names and Name Change: Historical Perspective . 62
4.2.2 The Role of the South African Geographical Names Council 63
4.3 RESPONSIBILITIES OF IMPLEMENTING BODIES....64
4.4 PROCEDURES FOR CHANGING GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES....65
4.5 POLITICS OF NAME CHANGE....68
4.5.1 Political Will 70
4.6 CONDUCTING PUBLIC MEETINGS AND COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT 72
4.7 DEBATES ON COSTS OF CHANGING NAMES....78
4.8 TRENDS IN IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS POLICY....81
4.9 CONCLUSION....82

CHAPTER FIVE....85

INTERPRETATION AND ANALYSIS OF THE FINDINGS ON GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES CHANGE POLICY: CASE STUDY....85

5.1 INTRODUCTION....85
5.2 CONCEPT OF DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION....86
5.2.1 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK: POLICY IMPLEMENTATION....86
5.2.2 Missing Values 87
5.2.3 Assessing the Validity of Claims 88
5.2.4 Process of Analysis 88
5.3 ANALYSIS OF RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DESIGN 89
5.3.1 Analysis of the Sample 89
5.4 INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS IN IMPLEMENTION OF THE POLICY....90
5.5 PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT....92
5.6 POLITICS AND NAME CHANGE....93
5.7 PROCEDURES AND PRINCIPLES FOR CHANGING GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES....95
5.8 ANALYSING TRENDS IN IMPLEMENTATION OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES CHANGE....96
5.9 ANALYSING THE DEBATE ON COSTS OF CHANGING GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES 97
5.10 CONCLUSION....98

CHAPTER SIX....100

CONCLUSION, SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS....100

6.1 INTRODUCTION....100
6.2 SUMMARY OF CHAPTERS....101
6.3 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS....103
6.3.1 Public Involvement....103
6.3.2 Politics of Name Change....104
6.3.3 Procedures and Principles of Naming and Renaming Features....105
6.3.4 Structural Arrangements....105
6.3.5 Trends in Implementation....106
6.4 RECOMMENDATIONS....107
6.4.1 Sufficient Consultation....107
6.4.2 Awareness Policy....108
6.4.3 Records....108
6.4.4 Implementing Agencies....108
6.4.5 Provision of Resources....109
6.4.6 Role of Politicians....109
6.5 POLICY IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS....110
6.6 CONCLUSION....110

REFERENCES....112

APPENDIX....116

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

TO THE STUDY

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The introduction of this study is captured by quoting from the document "Policy on the naming and renaming of streets and other public places – City of Johannesburg 2nd Revision August 2007" which quotes the South African Geographical Names Council (SAGNC) thus:

> For as long as there has been culture, people have placed a meaning by naming every event they have encountered, be it the birth of a child, climatic conditions, initiation rites, battles, death or any other event that seems vital to their daily existence. It has been a way of giving life meaning, a way of claiming territory, a way of honouring leaders, a way of giving direction or location, a way of celebrating important events and mourning disastrous events.

The aim of this chapter is to provide an overview of the problem and to outline the objectives of this research study. An in-depth study was conducted on the implementation of policy on geographical names change including street names in Mogale City Municipality, a local municipality that falls under West Rand District Municipality, on the western side of Gauteng Province. Geographical Names are the names of features on the earth that are natural, or man-made and adapted; they can be populated or unpopulated (The Handbook on Geographical Names - South African Geographical Names Council Second Edition, 2002).

The study was an inductive and deep investigation on how this policy is implemented. Out of the three stages of policy, that is policy formulation or development; policy analysis; and policy implementation, implementation is the most challenging as in many instances the best policy becomes the worst if it it not implemented as envisaged. According to Shafritz, Layne and Borick (2005, 219) implementation involves administrators, interest groups and other actors with diverse values, mobilising power resources, forming coalitions, consciously plotting strategies, and generally engaging in strategic behaviour designed to ensure that their point of view prevails.

This study sought to examine the particular realities and generic understanding of implementation of policy on Geographical Names Change including street names in Mogale City (hereafter referred to as the 'policy'). A qualitative research paradigm was used with some individuals identified to be interviewed.

1.2 BACKGROUND OF STANDARDISATION OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES

Standardisation of Geographical Names in every country is based on the United Nations (UN) Resolution 4 of the first Conference of Geographical Names held in Montreal, 18-31 August 1967. The intention in standardising names was to avoid confusion and to have effective communication: where one name was used in many countries, this could bring confusion as to which country was being referred to. This confusion could lead to ineffective communication for instance when Post Offices have to deliver letters. The destination on the letter for instance appears in many countries, more so when the code is incorrect as is often the case. Given the challenges outlined above, the United Nations Group of Experts on Geographical Names was formed to look at the issues of standardisation of names around the world.

It must be mentioned that standardisation of geographical names is an international resolution passed by the United Nations and adopted by many countries around the world. In order to provide for continuous co-ordination between countries to achieve the results required, the United Nations Group of Experts on Geographical Names (UNGEGN) performs its work by means of geographical/linguistic divisions based on equitable geographical distribution and the different linguistic systems of the world (Concise Gazetteer of South Africa,1994). As such, with a view to the implementation of the resolution of the UN Conferences on the Standardisation of Geographical Names, and in accordance with Resolution 4E of the first United Nations Conference on the Standardisation of Geographical Names, lists of standardized geographical names, or gazetteers, are published by many countries in the world (Concise Gazetteer of South Africa, 1994).

Even though this is international resolution, international standardisation must be based on national standardisation. Standardised names that are approved by a national geographical names authority at national level have official status and must be gazetted and given equal status in all languages of the country concerned. According to the *Concise Gazetteer of South Africa* (1994), names might also appear or be used in an unofficial capacity especially for the same entity; for instance, Johannesburg has been called “Egoli” or “Gauteng” for some time even though the official name is Johannesburg and Pretoria has been referred to as “Tshwane”. Standardisation includes confirmation of correct spelling of a proposed name. Therefore, experts on linguistics, language, cartographer should form part of the committee on geographical names change.

The aim was to avoid confusion that may arise from one name given to more than one place. Countries of the world formed name changing committees to standardise names in their respective countries. In South

Africa there was previously a committee called the National Place Names Committee (NPNC) which was the highest advisory body on official place names in the Republic of South Africa before the first democratic elections in 1994. NPNC members were appointed by the Minister of National Education and it included experts in various languages, onomasticians (specialists in names and naming), government representatives and academic institutions (Concise Gazetteer of South Africa, 1994). Furthermore, Edmund (2004) asserts that as early as 1936 it was realised that a measure of standardisation of place names in South Africa was necessary and a committee was appointed by the then minister of the interior to investigate the situation.

According to Edmund (2004), the investigation led to the appointment of a National Place Names Committee in 1939. The NPNC's mandate included correction of the spelling of all geographical names in the Republic of South Africa; the approval or rejection of all proposed new place names; the consideration of all cases where a change of a name is desired; and the compilation of dictionaries of geographical names (Concise Gazetteer of South Africa,1994).

The composition of this committee was not reflective and representative of the demography of the South African population. This committee was formed only by white South Africans and it represented the views of this group as reflected in the names they gave to areas that were occupied by other races, especially black Africans. The committee did not consult the affected communities. Often, the names that black Africans used which were in their vernacular were misspelt and some lost their original meanings along the way. Therefore, standardisation after 1994 became necessary.

The NPNC ceased to exist after 1994 and was replaced by the South African Geographical Names Council (SAGNC) which was endorsed by all

political formations then in parliament. SAGNC serves to advise on policies and principles for the naming of geographical features in South Africa. SAGNC is the national body which has Provincial Geographical Names Changes Committees (PGNC) and Local Geographical Names Change Committee (LGNC) at municipal level.

In addition, once geographical names are gazetted and listed by countries around the world, this leads to effective communication, and duplication is avoided. For instance, if one name is used in many parts of the world, it could cause confusion. To illustrate this point further, there used to be a place called Pietersburg in the Northern part of the Republic of South Africa. The confusion was that the place of the same name existed in France. Now if someone was boarding a plane in Heathrow Airport in London and he or she was buying a ticket to Pietersburg, which one was it going to be? Furthermore, for example, for effective delivery of letters by post offices, duplication of names should be avoided lest a letter or delivery is sent to a wrong address.

In the South African context, SAGNC is the successor to NPNC. The existence of SAGNC is promulgated by the South African Geographical Names Council Act No. 188 of 1998 as a body responsible for standardising geographical names in South Africa. In some instances in the past, the process of naming places was imposed on various communities. SAGNC as part of its broad mandate must take active steps to redress the problems brought about by names that were unjustly imposed on other races but also to give all South Africans an opportunity to lead the process of restoring their preferred names or removing names thought to be offensive.

The relationship between community and place is indeed a very powerful one in which each reinforces the identity of the other, and in which the

landscape is very much an expression of communally held beliefs and values and of interpersonal involvement (Relph, 1976:34).

Furthermore, the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa recommended the re-naming of geographical features as a form of symbolic reparation for Africa's injustices (Department of Arts and Culture, 20 July 2010). "Unjust" means that the communities, especially black people, were not involved when their places were re-named and in some instances their preferred name was changed without their knowledge. Implementation of this policy can thus be regarded as a vehicle to bring reconciliation as well as racial cohesion in South Africa. This statement is further developed in the research.

The Freedom Front Plus accused the Limpopo provincial government of "dancing on the graves of our ancestors" (Jenkins, 2007). Jenkins (2007) quotes Tony Leon of the Democratic Alliance (DA) who said that "the ANC was using the name-change issue to distract attention from its failure to deliver basic services". There is a view that it would be magnanimous for the ANC to honour Robert Sobukwe, Steve Biko, Kaizer Matanzima, Jan Smuts, Mangosuthu Buthelezi, Lucas Mangope, P.W. Botha, Jan Hofmeyr or B.J. Vorster, for instance. (proper reference, ie author and article, not simply website) This, according to opposition parties, will not only score the ANC political points but it will show political maturity.

In contrast, former president Thabo Mbeki did not agree with honouring leaders who were oppressive in the past. He was quoted in *The Star* of 3rd October 2008 as saying that while a descendant of an 1820 settler in Grahamstown might say "Viva Colonel Graham", he would be saying "Down Colonel Graham!" The argument has revolved around the question that icons like Nelson Mandela, Oliver Tambo, Walter Sisulu, and Chris Hani, to mention a few, not only sacrificed for ANC members, but for all the people of South Africa. The argument has been that when Chief Albert

Luthuli, for instance, was awarded the Nobel Peace Prize, it was awarded to a national leader of all the right-thinking people of South Africa and not ANC (proper ref). The issue of how politics plays out in implementation of this policy was investigated by this researcher and the findings will be presented in chapter 4.

The formation of new municipalities in 2000 created an opportunity for the public to participate in the naming and re-naming of places (Njomane, 2009:3). This, according to Njomane (2009), minimises local resistance to proposed project and policy decisions. In this case if the public is not persuaded on changing a particular name before it is implemented, the chances are they will not support it and/or they will resist it. Accordingly, the South African Geographical Names Change Act No. 188 of 1998 (henceforth referred to as the Act), gives individual citizens, property owners or developers, organised bodies, government departments, local authorities as well as the South African Post Office the leeway to apply for a name to be changed or correctly spelt. However, this does not appear to be properly implemented since miscommunication regarding name changes has continued.

The Act also provides reasons for an applicant to propose for the name to be changed or standardised as being: to avoid the same name being given to different places, the name may sound the same or the spelling of one place name may be very close to that of another. In black languages it may be that one name is spelt differently although it means one and the same thing. For instance, in Setswana language there is a name “Reneilwe” which is also spelt “Reneiloe”. “Reneilwe/Reneiloe” means gift or present in Setswana. This could lead to protracted argument as to which version should be used. In other instances, the issue of which language should be used where more than one language is dominant may arise.

Moreover, a reason for a name to be changed (given the country's past where other races were not given the opportunity to be part of the process of naming and renaming), is that certain communities feel that some of the existing names remind them of or represent the oppressive past when South Africa was under apartheid rule. Here the names that were given to places occupied by black people were not only derogatory in some instances but were detested by the residents. Names like "Kaffirfontein", for instance, are unacceptable in the new democratic dispensation. "Kaffir" is a derogatory term which was used to belittle black people. The process thus aims to redress this situation and bring harmony among the different races.

In addition, Edmund (2004) puts the following as one of the principles and guidelines to change a name: names that are discriminatory or derogatory in regard to race, colour, religion, gender, political affiliation or other social factors. Therefore black people will naturally be willing to change such names as the name reminds them of the past. The Mayor of Mogale City Local Municipality, the Honourable Koketso Calvin Seerane, argues that "in our country there are also some places that were renamed to celebrate the military victories of white settlers over African armies, some to venerate European kings and queens, some to celebrate colonial governors and soldiers" (*Dikgang tsa Mogale*, July 2007:5).

Furthermore, in the case of Makhado/Louis Trichardt referred to as The Chairpersons' Association *v.* Minister of Arts and Culture [2007] SCA 44 (RSA), paragraph 12 states: "… on 25 Friday 2002, the mayor of the third respondent was summoned to the office of the provincial member of the Executive Committee for Local Government and Housing of the Limpopo Province and told them the names of a number of towns in Limpopo province, including that of Louis Trichardt, had to be changed because, as it was said that these names 'reminded us of the history of oppressive colonial practices."

Moreover, a name change can be proposed due to cultural attachment a name carries in other races. The name could be proposed to honour or celebrate a leader or a significant event. Black Africans attach meaning to socio-cultural events happening when a name is given, such as a wedding, paying of lobola, etc. To add to the debate of cultural importance in naming of places, the Afrikaanse Taal en Kultuur Vereeniging had argued that with the names of their heroes changed, this represents the erosion of their history and heritage. Culture and heritage are important considerations when a place is given a name. Edmund (2004) states that place names constitute an essential part of the cultural heritage of a nation. According to Relph (1976) people are their place and a place is its people.

This argument regarding culture is further elaborated by the Mayor of Mogale City Local Municipality when he said that words and names are an integral part of what makes up a language. The apartheid settler colonialism sought to distort, destroy and erase the cultures and heritage of other sections of the population by enforcing an unfair approach in terms of who black Africans are and where they come from (*Dikgang tsa Mogale,* July, 2007:5).

In addition, Njomane (2009) makes an assertion that the re-naming of towns, public places, and streets in South Africa is a very topical issue in the sense that almost every municipality wants to re-name whatever they perceive as not representing the community. He observes that with the re-naming process there is always a type of conflict between the municipal council and some constituents as well as opposition political parties (Njomane, 2009:6).

In Mogale City Local Municipality (MCLM) where this study is focused, there is Mogale City local geographical names committee (MC LGNC) which advises the municipality on issues of name change in the area. The

committee has to balance and adjudicate on the expectations of various sectors of the community in the area who all their preferred name shoul prevail. Political parties such as the DA and AZAPO in the area believe that the committee is non-functional. This study examined the operation of the MC LGNC and their implementation of the policy on geographical names in Mogale City Municipality. The findings will be presented in chapter 4.

Figure 1: Location of Mogale City



1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT

Mogale City is experiencing problems in implementing the policy on Geographical Names Change. More information is needed on problems experienced in Mogale City in terms of implementation of this policy. The study looks at the challenge in meeting constitutional imperatives which are important when implementing this policy. For instance, in the case of Louis Trichardt/Makhado, the problem was that the application for the name change had not been preceded, as it should have been, by proper consultation with all interested parties (Case Number 2007 /SCA 44 RSA paragraph 36).

It is the aim of this researcher to study the problem or "puzzle" (Rubin and Rubin, 2005) and present the findings and conclusions available to add to the study of names change, particularly in Mogale City and more generally in South Africa. Rubin *et al* (2005), for instance, argue that one approach to working out the researchable puzzle is to think about the topic, the possible problem, and then the reasons. This study will attempt to establish what could be wrong in the implementation of this policy and the reasons.

The study further looked at the controversy around implementation of this policy, drawing on court cases from individuals, groups, and political parties who are not satisfied with the process. Implementation of this policy poses a challenge for the implementers as captured by journalist Tebogo Monama in the *Sowetan* of 21 October 2008: "New names, so what?". The sub text of the same article concluded with Mfundise Masithe, Gauteng deputy chairperson of the Azanian People's Organisation (AZAPO) who stated that Soweto residents just were not informed about the new names of their roads. This was when Roodepoort road was changed to Moses Kotane road without the community being sufficiently consulted as they claimed.

This study explored the problems with regard to implementation of the policy in Mogale City, including comparisons with other municipalities on how they implement the policy. Makhado/Louis Trichardt in Limpopo, Tshwane Metro and Johannesburg Metro are used to compare successes or challenges of implementation of the policy as well as street names change in these areas.

1.4 PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

The study investigates the factors leading to the problems experienced in implementation of the policy. It also trends in implementation of the policy, and interprets and analyses the findings on the study. It then makes recommendations to improve the implementation of the policy.

1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The following are the research questions that had to be addressed in the research process:

- What are the factors leading to the problems experienced in implementation of the policy on geographical names change?
- What are the trends in implementation of the policy on geographical names change?
- What are the lessons drawn from the findings in the study of geographical names change?
- What recommendations can be made for successful implementation of the policy on geographical names change?

1.6 OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Mogale City was used as a case study for this research. The study used semi-structured interviews on selected participants as a data collection technique. The composition of these participants is further clarified in chapter three. The participants are drawn from individuals who have wide knowledge of the area of Mogale City. The nature of their responsibility in Mogale City, be it administrative, civil or political also formed the basis for their selection with two ordinary members of the community completing the sample.

The researcher selected administrators of the department of corporate affairs in Mogale City Municipality who are directly involved in overseeing

the Name Change Committee. The politicians included members of the Democratic Alliance (DA) and Azapo, as well as some community members of Mogale City.

The researcher also interviewed the chairperson and three members of the geographical names change committee in Mogale City. The mayor of Mogale City was identified to be interviewed but was unavailable due to time pressures. The broad background of the participants contributes to the credibility and validity of the study and the reliability of gathered information.

There was documentary analysis carried out from committee reports, minutes, court cases and the implementation plan of the MCLGNC. The researcher also looked at secondary sources and the internet. All these sources of information helped to expand the understanding of the concept of geographical names change.

As part of the interview process, the researcher highlighted the purpose of the interview and assured interviewees that the information gathered would only be used for the purpose of the research. The researcher further requested permission to do tape recording and taking photographs where applicable. The participants were assured of the confidentiality of the information collected.

1.7 SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS

The research did not investigate the problems or/and challenges around the implementation of the policy on geographical names change at national or provincial level, although in some instances court cases and some protests happening around the country were cited or quoted to

emphasise or to support statements from Mogale City (case study). The main focus was on Mogale City Municipality; the findings, therefore, will not necessarily represent the state of implementation of this policy across the country although these findings will go some way in assisting the government to avoid similar problems in other areas.

Another limitation arose from the interviews conducted as some of the interviewees are the workers of Mogale City local municipality. This could have made them cautious or not free enough to express views that could be seen as exposing the deficiencies of the municipality in implementing the policy on geographical names change. The researcher, however, did everything possible to allay their fears by promising them that everything said would remain confidential and be used only for the purpose of the research.

In addition, ethical considerations were explained. For example, the interviewees preferred to remain anonymous, and will be referred to by number. Interviews were limited to a few participants who were selected due to their roles and responsibilities as well as their knowledge of the Mogale City municipality and the topic of geographical names change.

1.8 DEPLOYMENT OF THE STUDY

Chapter two explains the historical development and legislative framework of the concept of geographical names change in South Africa, such as policies, regulations and procedures, at national, provincial and local level.

Chapter three discusses the journey of researching the implementation of name change policy in Mogale City, and the research design and

methodology deployed to research the topic of this study. This chapter outlines steps that will be taken to eliminate bias, how the researcher ensures validity and reliability of the study, and the research process.

Chapter four presents the findings, while chapter five aims to analyse and interpret the findings and do a comparative study of the three metros and one municipality: Johannesburg, Tshwane, Ethekwini and Louis Trichardt/Makhado municipality. The analysis will link findings to the literature review.

Chapter six presents conclusions and recommendations.

CHAPTER TWO

HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT AND LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES CHANGE IN SOUTH AFRICA: A LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This study seeks to evaluate and review literature on geographical names change policy with closer scrutiny on programme performance (i.e. implementation) of the policy by assessing the extent of goal attainment and also analyzing the reasons for inability to attain the stated objective.

The policy cycle is divided into three steps: policy formulation/development, implementation and analysis. According to Mazmanian and Sabatier (1989: 9), policymaking is an iterative process of formulation, implementation, and reformulation, rather than a seamless web of continuous evolution.

For this study, the researcher concentrated on the implementation and the challenges faced by the implementers. This study further develops understanding of implementation as a vital step in the policy cycle. Implementation as part of the policy cycle has often been neglected until the 1970s when Pressman and Wildavsky (1973) started producing literature dedicated to implementation as a crucial stage of the policy cycle.

This study examined the implementation of the policy on geographical names change, including street names in the area of Mogale City. Legislative framework and guidelines contained in the South African Geographical Names Council (SAGNC) Act No. 118 of 1998 (henceforth

referred to as “the Act”) are outlined in this chapter to look at whether the required procedures are followed when implementing the policy on geographical names change in Mogale City.

The chapter also outlines the decision-making process in implementing the policy, as laid out in the *Handbook on Geographical Names* (second edition, 2002) and the *Mogale City Local Municipality street and public places naming policy* (policy document of MCLGNC). The chapter reviews the available literature, as defined and developed below and then explains and reviews the implementation aspects.

2.2 THE CONCEPT OF LITERATURE REVIEW

A literature review is based on the assumption that knowledge accumulates and that people learn and build on what others have done (Neuman, 2006:111). This body of knowledge becomes a stepping stone on which the future or further studies are conducted. Researchers firstly review what others have done or review scholarly literature (Neuman, 2006:111) before they embark on further research. Therefore today’s studies build on those of yesterday (Neuman, 2006:111).

The aims or goals of literature review are to demonstrate a familiarity with a body of knowledge that exists and establish credibility; to show the path of the prior research and how a current project is linked to it; to integrate and summarise what is known in an area and to learn from others and stimulate new ideas (Neuman, 2006:112). Mouton (2001), on the other hand, observes that literature review is not necessarily about the existing scholarship or available body of knowledge to see how other scholars have investigated the proposed research problem. He further argues that the researcher’s interest is therefore not merely in literature but in a body of accumulated scholarship (Mouton, 2001:87). Bruce (1994) identifies six elements of a literature review that will assist in accumulation of a body of

knowledge and in compiling a properly constituted literature review, namely: a list; a search; a survey; a vehicle for learning; a research facilitator; and a report.

According to Cooper (1988) a literature review uses as its database reports of primary or original scholarship, and does not report new primary scholarship itself. Further, the primary reports used in the literature may be verbal, but in the vast majority of cases reports are written documents. Again, the types of scholarship may be empirical, theoretical, critical/analytical or methodological in nature. Therefore, secondary literature review seeks to describe, to summarise, to evaluate, to clarify, and/or to integrate the content of primary reports.

Bourner (1996) summarises the reasons for literature review as being to identify gaps in the literature; to avoid duplication; to identify other people's work in the same field; to increase the researcher's breadth of knowledge in the subject area; to provide intellectual context for the researcher's own work; and to enable a researcher to position a research project relative to other existing work.

The study used the limited literature available in the field of geographical names change to build on a body of existing knowledge. However, as Mouton (2001) has stated above, it would not be much about the existing literature, but what this study can add in terms of a body of accumulated scholarship. Mogale City provides a perfect setting for this research.

In addition, the study looked at issues of identity which are central to geographical names change. Names are an important part of identifying places, individuals, communities and nations.

2.3 IMPLEMENTATION DEFICIT

Policy implementation is a key feature of the policy process as learning from implementation problems and challenges can further foster learning about better ways to structure future policies; this should ensure that they have the effects that designers of these policies seek (Birkland, 2005:181). Lessons from policy implementation assist with improved future implementation, hence it adds to successful future implementation of policies. Many public policy scholars ignored or rather downplayed the problematic aspects of this stage of the policy cycle, assuming that once a policy decision was made, the administrative arm of government would simply carry it out (Howlett and Ramesh, 2003:185). It was not until Pressman and Wildavsky introduced their work on programme implementation in 1973 that implementation as one of the stages of the policy cycle was given the attention and prominence it deserves.

Pressman and Wildavsky (1973) define implementation as a process of interaction between the setting of goals and actions geared to achieving them as well as an ability to forge subsequent links in the causal chain so as to obtain the desired results. Cloete, Wissink and de Coning (2004:196) further note that if we understand implementation as a complex political process, rather than a mechanical administrative one, studying it becomes an attempt to unravel the complexity of following policy as it travels through the complex, dynamic maze of implementation; to understand how it changes its surroundings and how it is changed itself in the process; and most importantly, to see how it can be influenced to better accomplish the goals it set out to achieve.

Shafritz *et al* (2005:218) refer to implementation as the process of putting a governmental programme into effect,. It is the process of translating a legal mandate, whether an executive order or an enacted statute, into

appropriate programme directives and structures that provide services or create goods. As Bates and Eldredge (1980:206) put it, policies are formulated to guide decision-making that leads to the accomplishment of objectives. Further, Shafritz *et al* (2005:218) argue that the process of implementation is an inherently political process. Bates *et al* (1980:228) add that policy evaluation is vital to inform top management of how the system is performing, by relaying what has occurred or what may occur if action is not taken.

In addition, Hanekom (1987) looks at implementation as visualizing a future desirable state of affairs and the ways in which that state of affairs could be realized. Hanekom further states that when the intentions of the policy are put into action and implemented by the governmental institutions specifically established to do so, then actual implementation has taken place. Hanekom notes that the actual implementation of a public policy involves firstly, the translation of the policy of the government into implementation policy, secondly, into administrative policy, and thirdly, the monitoring and evaluating of the implementation.

Mazmanian *et al* (1989:20) further define implementation as the carrying out of a basic policy decision, usually incorporated in a statute but which can also take the form of important executive orders or court decisions. Ideally, that decision identifies the problem/s to be addressed, stipulates the objective/s to be pursued, and in a variety of ways, structures the implementation process (Mazmanian *et al*, 1989:20). The process normally runs through a number of stages beginning with passage of the basic statute, followed by the policy outputs (decisions) of the implementing agencies, the compliance of target groups with those decisions, the actual impacts – both intended and unintended – of those outputs, the perceived impacts of agency decisions, and finally important revisions (or attempted revisions) in the basic statute (Mazmanian *et al*, 1989:20-21). Mazmanian *et al* (1989:7) further describe policy

implementation as a relationship between pronounced public policies and subsequent administrative performance or carrying out of a policy decision made by a public authority. Howlett and Ramesh (2003:185), further add that implementation is the stage of the policy cycle where programmes and policy decisions are carried out, or the translation of plans into practice.

This is further developed by Gupta (2001:74) by emphasizing that public policy analysts strive to link project goals (output) to investment (input). Therefore, the implementation challenge is to bring harmony between output and input. This would be to avoid differences between what the elected official or authority see as goals of the project and what the analysts see as developing of the project. Gupta (2001:74) argues that often public policy goals are not well-formed even in the minds of those who make the ultimate decisions. The project may pursue multiple goals, some of which may be vague or ill-defined, while others may be contradictory (Gupta, 2001:74). It therefore points to difficulties faced by implementers of policies, but more so implementation as the most challenging step of policy cycle. In South Africa, analysts note that the country has the most “beautiful” policies but the problem is in the implementation. Although the debate could be these policies are not “beautiful” because the beauty of policy should lie in its implementation, the issue is that they are well drafted with good intentions to alleviate problems and hardships faced by disadvantaged groups and at the same time protect minority rights. Therefore the issue of implementation is still an issue that policy specialists are grappling with in South Africa.

The implementation analysts, according to Mazmanian *et al* (1989:13-14), must address three crucial issues. Firstly, to what extent are the policy outputs of the implementing agencies and/or the outcomes of the implementation process consistent with the official objectives enunciated in the original statute, court cases, or other authoritative directive?

Secondly, to what extent were the objectives and basic strategies outlined and anticipated in the original directive modified during the course of implementation or during the period of policy reformulation by the original policymaker? Thirdly, what are the principal factors affecting the extent of goal attainment, the modification in goals and strategies and any other politically significant impacts? The understanding of these issues will go a long way in addressing the challenges faced by implementers and analysts in trying to understand not only the challenges of implementation but to ensure successful implementation.

Furthermore, Mazmanian *et al* (1989:8) quote Majone and Wildavsky (1978) who state that "… policies are continuously transformed by implementing actions that simultaneously alter resources and objectives… it is not policy design but redesign that goes on most of the time." Therefore implementation consists of altering objectives to correspond with available resources or mobilizing new resources to accomplish old objectives (Mazmanian *et al*, 1989:80). Implementation is not a rigidly structured step-by-step programme but an evolutionary programme that takes into account the environment in which it has to happen.

In addition, Hill and Hupe (2002:140) quote Lester and Goggin who argue that policy implementation is a process , a series of sub-national decisions and actions directed towards putting a prior authoritative federal decision into effect. They further argue that the essential characteristic of the implementation process is timely and satisfactory performance of certain necessary tasks related to carrying out the dichotomous conceptualization of implementation success or failure.

Colebatch (1998) argues that when policy makers' intentions have been carried out, the desired objective should have been achieved, and this is implementation; however, when what is found on the ground is

significantly different from these intentions, then the policy has not been implemented.

2.4 TOP-DOWN VERSUS BOTTOM-UP IMPLEMENTATION APPROACHES TO POLICY IMPLEMENTATION

These two approaches to policy implementation were examined by this study, namely top-down and bottom-up approaches. Birkland (2005:181) explains that when students of policy implementation talk about top-down or bottom-up implementation designs, they are talking about both studying policy design and ways of structuring policy implementation so as to enhance the likelihood of implementation success.

2.4.1 Top-Down Implementation Approach

Top-down implementation approach is based on the belief that studying policy implementation one must first understand the goals and motivations of the highest level initiators of policy, and then track the policy through its implementation at the lowest levels (Birkland, 2005:182). Birkland (2005) further talks of the implementation chain that starts with a policy message at the top and sees implementation as occurring in a chain.

Howlett *et al* (2003:189) quote Clarke (1992) who views the top-down approach as a series of chains of commands where political leaders articulate a clear policy preference which is then carried out through administrative machinery that serves the government. Hogwood and Gunn (1984:207) add that top-down perspective is a policy-centreed view in which implementers are seen as agents of those who claim to make policy.

Colebatch (1998), rather than calling it top-down and bottom-up, talks of vertical and horizontal perspectives. Vertical perspective (top-down)

means that authorized decisions at the top coincide exactly with outcomes at the bottom and it is simply a question of securing compliance. Furthermore, according to Colebatch (1998), this perspective assumes that policy process is best understood as the formulation of goals by policy-makers, the selection of instruments to achieve them and the assessment of the outcomes.

The criticism for this approach (top-down/vertical) is that it assumes that decision-makers provide implementers with clear goals and direction when in reality government intentions can emerge from bargaining processes and thus result in often vague, unclear, or even contradictory goals and direction (Howlett *et al*, 2003:189-190). In terms of name change, the policy requires that decision-makers, implementers and those the policy is targeting should work together if the policy is to be implemented successfully. Therefore decision-makers are as important as other stakeholders in the process of implementation. The top-down approach focuses on senior politicians and officials who in reality play a marginal role in day-to-day implementation as compared to lower-level officials and members of the public. This does not undermine the vital role played by senior politicians and top officials in the process of implementation. In fact, implementation of many a policy hinges on political will to be successful or not. Howlett *et al* (2003:203) quotes Atkinson and Nigol (1989) who argue that the central precept of those approaches is that the implementation process and its outcomes are shaped by political factors related to state capacity and sub-system complexity.

Howlett *et al* (2003:187) sums up the tussle among role-players in implementation thus – that bureaucracy and the intra- and inter-organizational conflicts are endemic to it and is a significant factor in, and determinant of, policy implementation. Again, bureaucratic agencies at different levels of government (national, provincial and local) are involved in implementing policy, each with its own interests, ambitions, and

traditions that affect the implementation process and shape its outcomes (Howlett, 2003:187). Furthermore, they argue that politicians, agencies and other members of policy sub-systems use the implementation process as another opportunity for continuing struggles they may have lost at earlier stages of the policy process, such as policy formulation or more often, decision-making, if their preferred solution to a problem was selected.

However, target groups (groups whose behaviour is intended or expected to be altered by government action) play a major direct role in the implementation process (Howlett *et al*, 2003). The political and economic resources of target groups have an effect on implementation. For instance, the powerful groups affected by policy can condition the character of implementation by supporting or opposing it. This scenario is evident in implementation of policy on geographical names change. The powerful groups, such as in the Makhado/Louis Trichardt case, and in Tshwane/ Pretoria, will institute legal action against the implementers of this policy on the basis of technicalities in its implementation. This can be seen as stalling implementation of this policy but at the same time it is an attempt to try to regain what was lost at the policy formulation stage.

Having said that, legislation and regulations cover such items as the standards of behaviour or performance that must be met by target groups and the criteria to be used to administer policy. This serves as the basis for licensing or approval and provides a *de facto* source of direction and background to the implementation process in modern states (Howlett *et al*, 2003). It therefore means that litigation by target groups instead of being an outright hindrance can contribute to improved implementation. The implementers, instead of being complacent, will be careful to avoid similar future litigation when implementing policies.

2.4.2 Bottom-Up Implementation Approach

According to Howlett *et al* (2003:190), the top-down approach's neglect of lower level officials led in the 1980s to the development of the bottom-up or street-level approach to the study of public policy implementation.

Birkland (2005:185), define the bottom-up implementation approach as the approach to studying policy implementation in which one begins by understanding the goals, motivations, and capabilities of the lowest level implementers and then follows the policy design upward to the highest level initiators of policy. Howlett *et al* (2003:190) add that a bottom-up approach begins with all public and private actors involved in implementing programmes to establish their organizational goals, implementation strategies, and the network of contacts they build.

Colebatch (1998) talks of horizontal perspective (bottom-up) as an exercise in collective negotiation. In this perspective, the focus shifts from the desired outcome to the process and the people through which it would be accomplished (Colebatch, 1998). This perspective recognizes that policy is an ongoing process and that participants have their own agendas and therefore their own distinct perspective on any policy. Whereas the vertical perspective tends to see policy emerging pristine and fully formed from the head of the detached policy-maker, horizontal perspective sees policy as something which emerges in the cause of interaction among the relevant participants.

Colebatch (1998) further argues that in the process of implementation, most of the things to be done need to be "cleared" at a number of points. Because they involve a range of participants with distinct perspectives of their own, and because different levels of commitment to the policy depend on such "clearances", the more likely it is that the original

objectives may not be accomplished. Therefore implementation can be a problem because the original decision was ambiguous, the policy directive conflicted with other policies, it was not seen as high priority, there were insufficient resources to carry it out, it provoked conflict with other significant players, the target group proved hard to reach, the things that were done did not have the expected impact, or attention shifted to other problems (Colebatch, 1998). Birkland (2005) concludes that the fundamental difference between the bottom-up and top-down approach is that whereas the bottom-up approach recognizes that policy goals are ambiguous rather than explicit and may be in conflict with other goals within the same policy area, the top-down approach assumes that policies contain clearly defined policy tools for the accomplishment of goals.

2.5 CAN IMPLEMENTATION BE PERFECT?

Hill *et al* (2002:140) quote Debeon, who argues that things do get implemented and carried out on a regular basis, the main problem with implementation being that the discrepancy between “something” and “that idealized thing” is often a matter of rose-colored expectations. In other words, it is far-fetched to expect implementation of policy to be perfect. In addition, Hogwood *et al* (1984:198) asserts that any state of perfect implementation was likely to be virtually unattainable in practice. So why even try to put systems in place to have perfect implementation if it is not attainable?

Hogwood *et al* (1984) outline factors that would have to be satisfied if perfect implementation were to be achieved, and if the circumstances external to the implementing agency do not impose crippling constraints. These circumstances could be physical, such as diseases or drought or they may be political, for instance, if party activists or trade unions are against policy implementation. Secondly, adequate time and sufficient resources need to be made available to the programme. Here it is

important to note that money is not a resource in itself but only a “ticket” with which to purchase real resources. Therefore there may be delays in the process of converting money into real resources. Administrators are limited in what they can do to overcome these constraints or delays in effective implementation. At each stage in the implementation process all required resources should be available.

Fourthly, the policy to be implemented should be based upon sound and valid theory of cause and effect. The ineffective implementation of policies could be because they are simply bad policies that are based on inadequate understanding of a problem to be solved. Again, dependency relationships should be minimal. That is the condition of “perfect implementation” which requires that there is a single implementing agency which need not depend on other agencies for success or if other agencies must be involved, and that the dependency relationships are minimal in number and importance. In addition, there should be understanding and an agreement on objectives. Tasks should be fully specified in correct sequence. Here the condition is that moving towards agreed objectives it is possible to specify in complete detail and perfect sequence the tasks to be performed by each participant.

Furthermore, perfect communication and co-ordination of the various elements or agencies involved in the programme is important. Hogwood *et al* (1984) quote Hood (1976) who argues that for perfect implementation to be achieved, it would be necessary to have a completely unitary administrative system like a huge army with a single line of authority with no compartmentalism or conflict within. Lastly, authority would need to demand and obtain perfect compliance or “perfect obedience”, which means no resistance to commands at any point in the administrative system.

These conditions outlined by Hogwood *et al* (1984) are ideal for "perfect implementation," but in reality and on the ground the situation is different. In practice it is unlikely to achieve a situation where all the above factors are present. Therefore perfect implementation at the moment is still a pipe dream. This does not mean, however, that policies are not implemented but rather that policies are implemented in spite of all the challenges. This will be examined in more detail in the next section.

2.6 NON-IMPLEMENTATION VERSUS UNSUCCESSFUL IMPLEMENTATION

The saying that since 1994 South Africa has designed wonderful policies but the problem has since been in implementation, needs to be evaluated. As some commentators would say, the devil is in the detail. This researcher argues that non-implementation, depending on the reasons for it, could actually be implementation. That is to say that in other circumstances, due to external factors implementers could implement at a minimal level or could not implement at all and this could still be regarded as implementation. The point here is that non-action is not an excuse but part of the process of implementation.

To understand why policies fail, it is useful to distinguish between non-implementation and unsuccessful implementation. Non-implementation of policy means that a policy is not put into effect as intended perhaps because those involved in its execution have been unco-operative and/or inefficient, or because their best could not overcome obstacles to effective implementation over which they had little or no control (Hogwood *et al*, 1984).

On the other hand, unsuccessful implementation occurs when a policy is carried out in full, and external circumstances are not unfavourable but

nonetheless, the policy fails to produce the intended results (Hogwood *et al*, 1984).

Further, policy failure can be due to policy implementers not passing on an order, or by simply delaying the action or rapid movement towards implementation, or by changing implementation procedures without changing realities, or doing something contrary to what was decided (Hanekom, 1987). The second reason for policy failure is imperfect knowledge of a problem, with the result that a solution cannot be framed; an inadequate amount of money is available or too few properly trained personnel; assigning the implementation of particular policy to different executive institutions or to an institution not suitable for the task; dependence on approval from other institutions if more than one institution is involved in the implementation; dependence on private institutions when the task associated with the policy to be implemented is contracted out; or relying on the thrust of a specific leader to ensure implementation (Hanekom, 1987).

Colebatch (1998) further notes that policy is about choosing goals and also choosing the means of accomplishing these goals. For instance, if we do ***a***, then ***b*** will result. Colebatch explains that when the policy-makers' intentions have been carried out, then the desired objective should have been achieved, and this is implementation. However, if what is found on the ground is significantly different from these goals, then the policy has not been implemented. Therefore, this sound theory of means and ends explains that if it is not true that doing ***a*** will bring ***b***, then the policy objective will not be achieved (Colebatch, 1998).

Implementation of geographical names change policy in Mogale City is in the state of unsuccessful implementation. This will be further elaborated on in chapter 4 when data is presented.

2.7 NAMES CHANGE IS ABOUT IDENTITY

The identity of streets and places occupied by communities is crucial and forms part of the existence and identity of that community. Maslow (1968:9) speaks of existential psychology which puts emphasis on the concept of identity and the experience of identity as *a sine qua non* (an indispensable condition) of human nature and of any philosophy or science of human nature. Maslow (1968) adds that human beings by nature have an urge or quest for identity. This writing explores identity as an issue within geographical names change. The term identity can mean so many different things to different people.

The concept of identity could be any of the following; Identity as a social representation. In this instance, identity means commonly shared and collectively elaborated beliefs about social reality consensually held by members of a culture or subculture (Deaux, 2001). Secondly, it could be identity in a stereotypical way. For instance, identity meaning organized, consensual beliefs and opinions about specific categories or groups of people (Deaux, 2001). Furthermore, identity could be intersectionality. It refers here to the condition in which a person simultaneously belongs to two or more social categories or social statuses and unique consequences result from that combination (Deaux, 2001).

In addition, Hamrell *et al (*1989:7) talk about “fragmentation of socio-cultural identities”. That is names also play a significant role socially and culturally. Each name given to a feature carries with it social and/or cultural significance. Especially in South Africa where cultural diversity is seen as a strength rather than a weakness, black South Africans attach more significance to identity as in many respects names celebrate, commemorate, or mourn a significant event when it was given. The issue of identity is a very sensitive one in this country. In the past, black South

Africans had to have two names, one being their original vernacular name given by their parents as well as a so-called “Christian” name imposed on them by their white counterparts or the system as such. A name is not given lightly but with a lot of consideration of circumstances around the naming process.

In other words, can South Africans accept that a name is a name is a name? That is, that changing names does not make a difference? Certainly some black and some white South Africans do not think so. South Africans place much emphasis on identity and names are part of it. According to Max-Neef’s human needs, the eighth need is identity. This need is about sense of belonging, self-esteem and consistency. What communities require to satisfy this need are language, religion, work, customs, values, and norms (Dag Hammarskjold Foundation, 1989).

2.8 NAME CHANGE AS A FORM OF RECONCILIATION

According to the Mayor of Mogale City Local Municipality, notwithstanding the fact that ultimately the will of the people must prevail, re-naming cannot and will not be a number-crunching game that concerns itself with how many people are opposed to a specific name-change, but rather it has to be located within national imperatives including transformation, building social cohesion and nurturing a spirit of national unity in mind (*Dikgang tsa Mogale*, 2007:5). If names change there is also the aspect of reconciliation, and this is what is happening in KwaZulu-Natal where the African National Congress (ANC) has proposed to change the name of Umlazi’s Mangosuthu Highway (named after the present Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) leader Mangosuthu Buthelezi) to Griffiths Mxenge highway in honour of a slain ANC activist and lawyer. In the ceremony held in the former Alexander Stadium, which is now renamed Meshack Kunene Stadium, the then Gauteng Premier, Paul Mashatile, stated that: “We are not honouring only ANC heroes but other activists who belonged to other

parties" (*Sunday Sun*, 2008:26). Is this assertion by the then premier of Gauteng what is happening in practice? It seems that other political parties may not think so. This argument will be assessed and developed in chapter 4 of the research.

Given the history of violence between the ANC and the IFP in KwaZulu-Natal, there are concerns about whether this is advisable. A large number of people on different sides lost their lives or their loved ones during violence between these two parties. Is this a missed opportunity by the ANC to bring the two parties closer to each other? Is the ANC putting politics above reconciliation, peace and stability? Is the process of changing names a political weapon? Put differently, the question could be posed whether Mangosuthu Buthelezi is in the same list or league with Dr Verwoerd, one of the architects of apartheid; does that mean that his name in public places should be changed just as Verwoerd's was? Mrs. Boshoff (daughter of Dr Verwoerd) said she would prefer that places named after her father should be renamed because what he strove for no longer exists (Jenkins, 2007:127). The court case brought by the IFP against the ANC-led council continues and suggests that the process of name change cannot be about the individual party but rather an inclusive process that takes into consideration the importance of other parties in promoting the spirit of reconciliation.

2.9 CONCLUSION

This chapter discussed the importance of policy implementation as one of the steps in the policy cycle. The study started by giving a number of definitions by different students of policy implementation. Various challenges faced by implementers of policy were discussed so as to provide perspective on why this stage of the policy cycle is not as easy as it was thought to be in earlier years.

This brings this study to the issue of identity. People identify with the names they give to their immediate surroundings. Therefore it is crucial that the name given to their environment is the name that they can proudly associate with. A name of a place is crucial because the people from that area will be identified by the name of their area. For instance, people from Soweto will be regarded as Sowetans. Therefore they will act as the ambassadors of their place and it is important that they identify with the name of their place.

Name change in South Africa is definitely a sensitive and even a thorny issue. In some instances it is an emotional issue as other people attach so many emotions that they are prepared to go all the way to either change or retain a name. As Hanekom (1987) argues on the issue of people sensitivity, that policy implementation is a complicated process, and legal prescriptions, administrative possibilities and the preferences of interested groups must all be taken into account.

CHAPTER THREE

THE JOURNEY OF RESEARCHING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF NAME CHANGE POLICY IN MOGALE CITY: THE RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

This study was done within a qualitative paradigm. Responsive interviews and available literature were used as instruments and a case study was used as a technique to collect data with a few individuals identified to be interviewed. The study explored the issue of policy implementation through deeper analysis of interview responses. O'Sullivan (1994:7) states that a qualitative research paradigm aims to explore or gain insight into the social meanings or cultural significance. Therefore this researcher explored and gained deeper insight into the social and political meanings and/or cultural significance in the process of implementing a names change policy in Mogale City. As Rubin and Rubin (2005) explained, if a new approach is being sought to a practical problem or a considerably amended theory, depth interviewing is appropriate.

Furthermore, Rubin *et al* (2005) argue that depth interviewing studies encourage considerable departures from current understanding and that in topical studies the research arena is viewed as a theatre in the round that locates interviewees with different vantage points to what is going on on centre stage. The study was based in Mogale City Municipality as a case study. Mogale City Municipality was chosen as a case study to test challenges faced by implementers and the problems experienced by the Mogale City Local Geographical Names Committee (MCLGNC) in implementing this policy. The study investigated the process of implementation of the policy in order to gain some insight into what the

problems were. This chapter will explain the process of collecting data, analyzing and interpreting it.

3.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This study employed both systems and institutional theories to understand implementation of the policy on geographical names change. These theories are appropriate for this study in that systems theory looks at the responses by a political system to the demands and needs of interest groups, and institutional theory emphasizes that policy is the product of public institutions. The study focuses on implementation of policy, including analyzing the roles of responsible institutions tasked to oversee the process.

According to Cloete, Wissink and de Coning (2004), the systems model can provide perspectives on aspects such as the influence of the environment on political policy and *vice versa*, and the success or ability of the political system to convert demands into public policy, the effectiveness of the feedback process and the extent to which feedback information (result, impacts and consequences of policies) is incorporated into the adoption of existing or new policies.

In addition, Hanekom (1987) argues that in the systems model for policy making public policy is regarded as the response by the political system to the demands, needs, wants, problems or goals of interest groups or individuals. Further, Hanekom (1987) notes that the systems model can provide information on aspects such as the effect of variables relevant to policy formulation; the influence of political policy on the environment and *vice versa*; the success of the political system in converting demands into public policy; the effectiveness of the feedback process and the degree to which feedback information (results, impacts, and consequences of

policies) is incorporated in the adaptation of existing policies or in the devising of new policies.

Therefore this theory offers an idea that policy as a process is attached to the idea of political systems. The systems theory sheds light on political dynamics and their impacts on policy-making (Cloete *et al*, 2006). Brightman, Luskin and Tilton (1968) talk of systems theory as the process of evaluating all aspects of a particular system and the situation in which the system operates, and that theory involves the examination of the inputs into the system and the output requirements.

Wissink, in Cloete *et al* (2004) further notes that the value of the systems model also lies in the framework that it provides which describes the relationships between the demands, the political system and the results or outputs in terms of stability, the environment, or triggering new demands.

Proponents of the institutional model, on the other hand, argue that public policy is legitimized by government and only government policies apply to all members of society, and the structure of governmental institutions can have an important bearing on policy results (Cloete *et al*, 2004). Hanekom (1987) adds that the premise of an institutional model for the study of public policy is that public policy is the product of public institutions, which are also responsible for its implementation. It is thus vital to look at the relationship between the structure or institution and the policy.

Hill (2005:81) cites Hall (1986) who notes that institutional factors play two fundamental roles in the model. On the one hand, the organization of policy-making affects the degree of power that any one set of actors has over the policy outcomes and on the other hand, organizational position also influences an actor's definition of his own interests, by establishing his institutional responsibilities and relationships to other actors. In this

way, organizational factors affect both the degree of pressure an actor can bring to bear on policy and the likely direction of that pressure.

Peters and Pierre (2003) observe that there are incongruities that exist between the declared ends and those that the agency actually achieves or seeks to achieve. This should be taken into consideration when policy is formulated to avoid problems in the implementation step. Maskin *et al* (2001) talks of horizontal dimension in which implementation is an exercise in collective negotiation where focus shifts from the desired outcome to the process and the people through which it would be accomplished. The design of the implementing institutions is vital for the success of implementation policy. Peters *et al* (2003) further argue that what happens at the bottom of the hierarchy, in grass roots units in charge of implementing national policies, matters a lot, in some cases even more than what happens at the top level.

3.3 METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH APPLIED IN THIS STUDY

Method is a broader term that encompasses all aspects of the study, including the logic of the design and the steps for carrying it out (McBurney, *et al*: 2007). The methodology that was applied is a qualitative research paradigm. The researcher used this intending to go vertically deep in understanding problems in implementation of policy on Geographical Names Change in Mogale City. Qualitative researchers tend to believe it is best to research what is out there in its context with all its complexity (Badenhorst, 2008:93). This point is further developed by Pierce (2008) when he says that qualitative method is preferred because it is considered best suited to the study, understanding and explanation of the complexities of social and political life. Pierce (2008) notes succinctly that the strength of qualitative method lies in its unique capacity, through in-depth interviewing and observation, to learn and understand the underlying values of individuals and groups. This is what was uncovered

with regard to geographical names change in Mogale City. That is, the researcher investigated the complexities faced by the MCLGNC, in implementation of this policy. The researcher enlisted individuals who are at the core of implementation of this policy in Mogale City.

Using a qualitative research paradigm helped the researcher to obtain answers to the problem statement. Qualitative data relies on data in the form of words (Badenhorst, 2008:92). According to Pierce (2008), the qualitative method also offers a greater focus on verbal and other communications and the application of linguistics to the analysis. Badenhorst (2008) further quotes Schwandt (2001) when she says qualitative researchers seek meaning in human action. The researcher was able to reach individuals who could otherwise have been missed by sample survey. As Pierce (2008) argues, the method enables minorities to be researched who would otherwise be missed by sample surveys because they are either small in number or might be unwilling to identify themselves.

In addition, Flick (2002) defines the essential features of qualitative research as the correct choice of appropriate methods and theories; the recognition and analysis of different perspectives; the researchers' reflections on their research as part of the process of knowledge production; and the variety of approaches and methods.

This researcher looked at the expressions and subsequently actions. These actions were analyzed and integrated in the findings of this study. According to Neuman (2006), the researcher is the primary instrument for data collection and data analysis. Neuman further asserts that the human instrument, which is able to be immediately responsive and adaptive, would seem to be the ideal means of collecting data and analyzing it and that the researcher can expand his or her understanding through non-verbal communication, process information (data) immediately, clarify and

summarize material, check with respondents for accuracy of interpretation, and explore unusual or unanticipated responses.

Therefore the researcher should always make sure that the report of the study is believable. In a qualitative project, especially during long interviews, the researcher can usually identify where a person is exaggerating and what areas they are ignoring (Rubin *et al*, 2005). What is central during the process of interviews is that the researcher should develop good relationships with the interviewees so that there is mutual trust and the interviewees feel free to express their true feelings in answering the interview questions without feeling that the information they provide would be used against them.

The complex nature of the problem that this study researched, dictated that qualitative research design mainly using interviews and a case study of Mogale City Municipality would be the appropriate research method. The purposeful sample of few individuals afforded me a chance to get deeper understanding of issues around the implementation of this policy. In addition, the case study of Mogale City Local Municipality allowed the researcher to zoom closer to the issues at play in implementation of the policy in this area. Other municipalities like Tshwane, Johannesburg, Makhado/Louis Trichardt, eThekwini and Tshwane were used to conduct a comparative study.

The critiques of qualitative method argue that it is “soft” and the researcher inevitably will contaminate the social field because he/she participates with their subject and could influence the outcomes rather than observing them (Pierce, 2008). This criticism seems exaggerated. In fact, qualitative research requires rigorous approaches. As Pierce (2008) concludes, the qualitative method provides high quality data and findings, and deep, meaningful insights into underlying values, fears and motivations of agents and actors in the political world.

On the other hand, quantitative research paradigm would not help this researcher's course as it is about expressing quantities and amounts (Badenhorst, 2008:92). This paradigm would not be relevant to help to understand or answer the problem statement. The quantitative paradigm is a horizontal approach (Badenhorst, 2008:92). As Pierce (2008) argues, quantitative research used by the social sciences does not meet the high standards of the natural order in which its reputation and claims lie and in politics it relies on the ability to express concepts as measurable indicators. This is in contrast with what the researcher wanted to achieve in this study in analyzing views of the sampled data and their expressions in deeper detail than just putting numbers together.

However, the greatest strength of quantitative method lies in its general acceptance by others as being rational, logical, planned and systematic (Pierce, 2008). It is widely accepted by scholars that quantitative research is more credible. The fact that quantitative research uses large sample is representative of the population being studied. The new technology and specialists used in qualitative research make it more believable and credible. According to Pierce (2008), quantitative research effectively conforms to the modern-day business model.

The researcher's approach in this study was to get a variety of answers and data using few individuals. As Rubin *et al* (2005) explains, interviewees should be experienced and knowledgeable in the area they are being interviewed about. These few individuals that the researcher sampled have in one way or the other an understanding of the issue of name change in Mogale City. Therefore the qualitative research used by the researcher is "richly descriptive" words and pictures rather than just numbers that are used to convey what the researcher has learned about a phenomenon (Sharon, 2005:5). Sharon (2005) further adds that data in the form of quotes from documents, field notes and participant interviews,

excepts from video tapes, electronic communication, or a combination thereof are always included in support of the findings of the study. This process of interviews should be credible. According to Rubin *et al* (2005) interviews gain credibility when the conversational partners are experienced and have first-hand knowledge about the research problem. This explains the process that the researcher underwent in this study.

Again, quotes and excerpts from the individuals interviewed contribute to the descriptive nature of qualitative research (Sharon, 2005:5). The basic interpretive qualitative study was used in which the researcher is interested in understanding how participants make meaning of a situation or phenomenon (Sharon, 2005:6). The writer believes that to understand problems in implementation of policy on Geographical Names, the researcher must be able to interpret and analyze the various responses or collective data. Leedy (1993:25) sums up the qualitative approach thus: "… that the purpose of the research is to gain new insights about a phenomenon with a particular context using small size sample".

Although the researcher demonstrated the strengths and weaknesses of both research methodologies, it is his view that a middle way is preferable, although the qualitative method is dominant in this study. Pierce (2008) states that the use of combined methods can be better accepted as appropriate where one method dominates and the other is used in a secondary, supportive way. The mixed approach, as it is known, could include synergy, corroboration of sources and data triangulation (Pierce, 2008). The researcher intends to use qualitative method as the primary method and quantitative method as the secondary method especially in terms of data presentation and analysis.

3.4 POPULATION AND SAMPLING

Flick (2002) talks about sampling as the decision about which persons to interview (case sampling) and from which groups these should come (sampling groups of cases). The researcher used a sample of a few persons who are involved with implementation of the policy on geographical names change in Mogale City and some community members. One-on-one interviews were preferred rather than other techniques like focus groups as the researcher chose individuals who represent different stakeholders in Mogale City. The sample involves politicians, administrators and interested parties.

In addition, as Moursund (1973) observed, the inferences made or the conclusions drawn are valid only to the degree that the groups being measured are truly representative of the total populations in which the researcher is interested. The sample should at least be representative to give the researcher a reasonable chance to generalize about the population he/she is researching. Moursund (1973) quotes Poincare (1972) who argues that then we can be free to affirm that under analogous circumstances, analogous results will occur.

Again in focus groups, some groups or some individuals could be more dominant and as such the expressed views could in fact not be representative of the group as intended. For the purpose of this research, the following individuals were interviewed: The chairperson of MCLGNC, a committee member of MCLGNC, the Post Office representative from Krugersdorp, two members from the Cooperative Affairs Department who are charged with responsibility to oversee the implementation of this policy in Mogale City Municipality, two members of opposition parties in Mogale City Municipality (DA and AZAPO),the Executive Mayor of Mogale City local municipality, deputy chairperson of Gauteng PGNC, chairperson of

Tshwane Geographical Names Committee, and a representative from SAGNC.

Moreover, the various positions and roles occupied by these individuals provided more insight into implementation of the policy of geographical names change in general and Mogale City in particular. The fact that some of these individuals are at the centre of the process of names change in Mogale City makes their inputs more useful. A non-random sample need not ruin a research project as long as it has no systematic and unintended bias – that is, as long as it does not, by its nature, tend to overload the sample with people who share some characteristic that will have an important effect on the outcome of the study (Moursund, 1973).

The researcher used the responsive interviewing model in this study. Rubin and Rubin (2005) argue that the responsive interviewing model implies finding people who have had particular experiences or are members of specific groups whose rules, traditions, and values are of interest. The individuals identified are playing some role in Mogale City therefore they were chosen with greater consideration and with the view that they can explain the implementation of the policy on geographical names change in Mogale City.

The interviewees were made to feel confident and relaxed so that they could express their thoughts or feelings freely. The limitation though is that interviews are time-consuming by nature. Given the fact that the researcher works full-time and conducted the research part-time, it was a challenge. The availability of interviewees was a challenge as sometime appointments would be broken at the eleventh hour and it was difficult to arrange another time.

Furthermore, sampling is not limited at the initial stages of the research but emerges at different points in the research process. According to Flick

(2002), sampling is part of a decision on which interviews should be selected for transcription and interpreted (material sampling) and during interpretation of data which parts of a text should be selected for interpretation in general or for a particular detailed interpretation (sampling within the material); furthermore, when presenting the findings which cases or parts of text are best used to demonstrate the findings (presentational sampling).

3.5 CASE STUDY

Mogale City Local Municipality was used as a case study in this research. A case study approach was used due to its relevance in the purpose of this research.

Merriam (1998:28) quotes Yin (1994) who argues that a case study is a design particularly suited to situations in which it is impossible to separate the phenomenon's variables from their context. Pierce (2008) talks of case study method as a sample of one event, instance, state or sub-unit at one point in time. It is therefore important to use Mogale City to "arrive at a comprehensive understanding of the groups under study" (Merriam, 1998:29). One must also mention that the case itself is vital for what it reveals about the particular phenomenon and for what it might represent. This by and large could bring about discovery of new meaning or confirm the existing knowledge. The researcher believes this study clarified some of the problems faced by implementers of this policy.

Furthermore, Merriam (1998:27) talks about case study as being bounded and asserts that if the phenomenon being studied is not intrinsically bounded, it is not a case. She further explains boundedness of the topic as dependent on whether there is a limit to the number of people involved who could be interviewed and finite amount of time (Merriam, 1998:27).Therefore if this is not the case, then it is not a case study.

Mogale City qualifies as a case study as the researcher had a limited number of people involved and finite time. Again, due to concerns raised by some people in Mogale City in particular and South Africa in general regarding implementation of policy on geographical names change, it is sufficient to conduct a case study. Merriam (1998:28) quotes Kemmis (1983) (referring to case study) as “an instance drawn from a class”.

Moreover, this researcher’s choice of using case study was based on the notion that “qualitative case studies stem from the fact that this design was chosen precisely because researchers are interested in insight, discovery and interpretation rather than hypothesis testing” (Merriam, 1998:29). In Mogale City, the researcher liked to gain insight on where the problem was in terms of implementation of policy on Geographical Names Change. Case study can be descriptive or analytical. As Merriam (1998:29) puts it, descriptive means that the end product of a case study is a rich, “thick” description of the phenomenon under study whereas analytical case studies are differentiated from straightforward descriptive studies by their complexity, depth, and theoretical orientation. The researcher preferred to analyze the responses of the interviewees rather than just giving descriptive data. According to Merriam (1998:38), rather than just describing what was observed or what students reported in interviews, a continuum, or categories that conceptualize different approaches to the task.

According to McBurney and White (2007) talk of principal characteristics of case studies as examining individual instances, or cases, of some phenomenon, sometimes is an individual person, as in psychiatric case, other times it is an individual institution, as in the case of mass hysteria at a school, or in can be an individual method or treatment, such as the effectiveness of a new surgical intervention on a patient’s health and the individuality of the case. Mogale City’s individual character and situation makes it a perfect situation to conduct a case study because of the

problems that present themselves as opportunities to this researcher for further study.

However, case studies have limitations. For instance, as Merriam (1998:42) notes, "… case studies can oversimplify or exaggerate a situation, leading the reader to erroneous conclusions about the actual state of affairs". Furthermore, case studies may lead readers to think that they (case studies) are accounts of the whole when in fact they are but a part – a slice of life (Merriam, 1998:42). Merriam (1998:43) alludes to further limitations that involve issues of reliability, validity and generalizability. Having acknowledged what Merriam (1998) has raised as some of limitations of a case study, the researcher took precautionary measures to avoid these limitations. For instance, the collected data is presented by the interviewees without any additions to make it reliable and valid.

Furthermore a point is made in this research that it does not necessarily represent implementation of the policy on geographical names change national but how this policy is implemented at Mogale City. While this is the case, the lessons learnt in Mogale City are important and can assist the implementers of this policy across the Republic of South Africa.

In addition, Merriam (1998:43) quotes Hamel (1998) who observes, " the case study has basically been faulted for its lack of representativeness… and its lack of rigor in the collection, construction and analysis of the empirical material that give rise to this study. Merriam (1998:43) further explains that this lack of rigor is linked to the problem of bias "… introduced by the subjectivity of the research and others involved in this case". With regard to the researcher, these mentioned limitations of case study were used to avoid falling into the trap outlined in these very same limitations. In other words, the researcher used these limitations to strengthen his case study by avoiding them. The researcher deliberately

chose a representative sample to avoid bias and a one-sided point of view as regards the policy on geographical names change. The different backgrounds of the sample make it more representative and unbiased.

It is therefore clear that the case study's strengths outweigh its limitations (Merriam, 1998:41). As Merriam (1998:41) concludes, the case study offers a means of investigating complex social units consisting of multiple variables of potential importance in understanding the phenomenon, and a case study leads to a more holistic account of a phenomenon. Therefore this researcher's case study provided more insight in the implementation of this policy on geographical names change that will assist the process (and the implementers) of this policy going forward. The researcher believes that the issue of names change in South Africa is complex and consists of variables that need to be investigated area by area, hence the importance of using the case study method.

3.6 RESEARCH DESIGN

Firstly, careful planning before one begins study is vital for successful research. This writer used interviews, available literature, observation, documents (newspapers) and minutes of meetings as data collection techniques. Maree (2010) argues that it is generally accepted that engaging multiple methods of data collection, such as observation, interviews and document analysis, will lead to trustworthiness. It is important to mention that respondents or interviewees were assured of confidentiality. At the same time, where permitted, interviewees' responses were recorded and if permission was not given to record, other methods like note taking were used to record accounts and responses of the interviewees. Rubin and Rubin (2005) argue that interviewing is about obtaining interviewees' interpretations of their experiences and their understanding of the world in which they live and work. Therefore a responsive interviewing model will be the primary technique used to collect

data. Rubin *et al* (2005) assert that responsive interviewing design is flexible and adaptive because the interviewer must listen intently and follow up insights and new points during the interview, and the interviewer must be able to change course based on what he or she learns.

In addition, the researcher is the instrument, the tool of discovery and his or her self-confidence, adaptability and willingness to hear what is said and change direction to catch a wisp of insight or track down a new theme are what make responsive interviews work (Rubin *et al*, 2005). However, the interviewer should not under any condition impose his or her views on the interviewees. In other words, the interview questions should be broad enough so that they avoid limiting or channeling the interviewees' answers; the researcher will do well if he or she avoids imposing his or her point of view on the interviewees. The researcher emphasized that data collected will be used for the purposes of this study only and nothing else.

Furthermore, this study tries to answer the questions of "what is?", "why is it?" and "how can it be changed?" (Moursund, 1973). That is, the researcher established the status of the implementation of the policy on geographical names change, reasons for the current situation and possibilities for change. The study evaluated the implementation of policy on geographical names change in Mogale City. In the words of Moursund (1973), the evaluation concerns itself with conditions under which some situation came to exist or will change in some specified way.

3.7 DATA COLLECTION USING INTERVIEWS

Data are pieces of information that are collected to determine whether program outcomes are being met (Moursund, 1973) The researcher used mainly responsive interviews as the instrument to gather data. Recordings of interviews and note taking were employed. Interviews are more technical and challenging and as such the researcher must be careful and

astute when conducting them and handling the interviewees, lest they choose to become uncommunicative.

Furthermore, the researcher must ensure validity of the interviews. As Flick (2002) explains, one approach for specifying the validity of interviews is to check formally if it was possible to guarantee the degree of authenticity which was aimed at during the interview. Validation includes concepts like trustworthiness of reported observations, interpretations, and generalizations (Flick, 2002). To realize the state of validity in research, Flick (2002) quotes Wolcott who suggests that to ensure validity, the researcher should refrain from talking in the field but rather should listen as much as possible; he or she should produce notes that are as exact as possible' begin to write soonest to allow readers access to notes to make their own inferences; the report should be complete; as candid as possible; the researcher should seek feedback from his or her colleagues on the findings and presentations; presentation should be characterized by balance; and the accuracy in the writing the report is vital.

Unstructured interviews were used. Wellman and Kruger (1999:196) argue that in unstructured interviews an attempt is made to understand how individuals experience their life and world and how they make sense of what is happening to them. This instrument was relevant as it allowed for answers about how different individuals feel and their views and explanations on the implementation of Geographical Names Change. As Wellman and Kruger (1999) argue, the interviewer's questions were thus directed at the participants' experiences, feelings, beliefs and convictions about the theme in question. Unstructured interviews allowed this study an inductive insight and understanding from participants' first-hand experiences.

Structured interviews would not assist this study because of their restrictive nature. Structured interviews are bound to a previously

compiled list of questions Wellman and Kruger (1999:196).This would not help the course of this study as the researcher was looking at the depth in discussing the problem statement and other related issues rather than straightforward answers from the interviewees. Again, unstructured interviews allowed the researcher to make follow-up questions to get a better understanding of issues related to implementation of the policy on geographical names change. Here accuracy is very important so that the researcher should present interviewees' responses without additions or putting his or her point of view, experiences or opinions. According to Rubin *et al* (2005), accuracy includes representing what the interviewees have said exactly as spoken without making mistakes in the transcription. In simple terms, the researcher should not rely on memory but on his or her transcript or note-book when collecting data.

The questions used were open-ended. This was so as this writer seeks to give interviewees much more initiative in terms of how they respond to these questions. In addition, open questions are more appropriate for this research as they operate to elicit responses which are more discursive, concerning the interviewees' personal evaluation or attitudes towards a given issue or event (O'Sullivan, 1994:9).Therefore, open questions provided deeper views and evaluation of implementation of Geographical Names Change in Mogale City.

In contrast, closed questions are designed and tend to be asked in order to get at specific facts, figures or information, closing "down the possibilities for the interviewee to volunteer all sorts of information (O' Sullivan, 1994:8).Therefore, closed questions are too restrictive for the purpose of this study. The researcher preferred individual interviewees to have space and room to express their views.

In addition, the researcher used few sampled individuals during the interviews. As Rubin *et al* (2005) argued, finding interviewees with

relevant, first-hand experience and knowledge about the subject being studied is critical in making the results convincing. One must mention that in some instances one will not necessarily find people who know everything about the research problem at hand, but the researcher should piece together what collectively is known by those interviewed to formulate conclusions from the study. Rubin *et al* argue that the credibility of the findings is enhanced if there is a range of interviewed individuals who reflect a variety of perspectives.

Furthermore, the philosophy of responsive interviewing suggests that reality is complex, and there is a need to gather contradictory or overlapping perceptions and nuanced understandings that different individuals hold (Rubin *et al*, 2005). However, not only is the appropriate choice of interviewees vital, but the researcher's questioning sampling has to be thorough so that what is reported is accurate. This will include investigating new paths as they come up and in some instances redesigning the study to follow new directions that might even lead to the researcher changing his or her interpretation during data collection and analysis. Therefore, this researcher asserts that a wide variety of perspectives and interviewees from different backgrounds and views on what one is studying is crucial for making the study credible and believable.

In addition, the interviewer must be able to make his/her interviewees relaxed and able to provide information freely without feeling intimidated or forced to answer the questions. Moursund (1973) quotes Kahn and Connell (1957) who said the skillful interviewer creates an atmosphere in which the respondent feels understood and safe in communicating without being judged. It is helpful to explain the subject and the setting of the interview to the interviewee and even forward questions before the interview takes place. According to Moursund (1973), the interviewer, in essence, maintains a balance between focusing and guiding the

conversation, on the one hand, and providing a free and non-critical environment, on the other. What is critical is that the interviewer must always avoid leading questions that in some instances reveal the bias of the interviewer.

3.8 THE USE OF DOCUMENTATION

The changing of names is an ongoing phenomenon not only in South Africa but throughout the world. In South Africa currently, there are a number of court cases and therefore documentation in the form of press or media reports were collected and integrated with primary data obtained during interviews. Court papers and judgments that were available were also used together with the collected data as additional information to this study.

3.9 DATA PRESENTATION

Data presentation is about packaging evidence (Badenhorst, 2008). Data can be presented in three ways. Firstly, reducing and organizing data – that is sorting by category, theme and concept of the data that the reader will see, such as matrices; tables; maps networks; flow charts (Badenhorst, 2008). Secondly, interpreting the data, where the researcher makes sense for the reader. Thirdly, the visual form was not used, such as graphics and text. In this case a data presentation indicated dissenting voices, profiling respondents or organizations involved (Badenhorst, 2008).

According to Rubin *et al* (2005), in the responsive interviewing model, theories are included from the data to discover how different concepts and themes mentioned in the interviews relate to one another. Concepts and themes that came up during the collection of data became part of the

research journey for the researcher and further assisted in getting more detail from the sample. Themes are statements that explain why something happened or what something means and are built up from the concepts (Rubin *et al*, 2005).This means that concepts are reviewed, and then questions asked that will help the researcher understand what they mean and how they are used; these are then combined into themes, that is, longer explanatory phrases or statements (Rubin *et al*, 2005). It is important to mention that the researcher used the emerging categories and themes from the responses of the interviewees to present data. The process was to cluster responses that are similar to draw categories or themes.

The emerging theories were also examined. Rubin *et al* (2005) argue that designing qualitative interviewing to build a theory involves not only thinking about what ideas to test and questions to ask, but also where to locate the study and who to interview. The researcher acknowledges that qualitative interviews may seem somewhat unsystematic and chaotic but this provides the opportunity to constantly through the data collection redesign. As Rubin *et al* (2005), with continuous design, building on new findings, while gathering evidence for, testing, and changing emerging theory. This line of qualitative interviewing ensures that when collecting data, the research question will have been answered with enough material to produce “a rich and nuanced report” (Rubin *et al*, 2005:63).

In addition, the researcher’s data presentation relied heavily on interpreting written data collected through responsive interviews and to a lesser extent on visual form. Through recorded or typed interviews, the researcher made sense of the data to the reader and presented dissenting voices. The researcher identified some key role-players in Mogale City in relation to implementation of policy on geographical names change. These individuals represented their political grouping, the Mogale City Local Municipality, and institutions that are key in implementing this policy.

3.10 DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

Maree (2010:100) observes that when analyzing qualitative data, the goal is to summarize what has been seen or heard in terms of common words, phrases, themes of patterns that would aid in understanding and interpretation of that which is emerging. It is therefore the aim of the researcher to interpret and make sense of the data and not to present numbers and statistics in a qualitative project. It should be mentioned that data analysis does not happen at the end. It is in fact an ongoing process during interviews or rather while the interviews are under way. The ideal model for data collection and analysis is one that interweaves them from the beginning (Matthews and Huberman, 1984). This point is further elaborated by Flick (2002) when he says the linear process of first collecting the data and later interpreting it is given up in favour of an interwoven procedure. Data analysis looks at what analysis one plans to do and what kind of theory one hopes to build so that early on the required information can be obtained (Rubin *et al*, 2005).

This approach was helpful in that emerging trends derived from the study were presented, including themes and theories that might be used to understand implementation of policy on geographical names. Here the researcher answers the research questions and follow-up questions that might arise during interviews. Njomana (2009:49) quotes Neuman (2003), who argues that this is a process whereby the researcher moves from vague ideas and concrete details in the data toward a comprehensive analysis with generalizations, and then collects additional evidence to address unresolved issues that appeared in the first stage. Therefore the data presented served to create discussions and further points of interest around the issue of name change in Mogale City in particular and South Africa in general.

The researcher followed the steps set out by Flick (2002) who quotes Mayring (1983) on how to analyze qualitative data. Firstly, the definition of the material and selection of interviews and parts which are relevant for responding to the research question is vital. Secondly, the analysis of the situation of data collection is done, that is, how material was generated and who was involved, who was present in the interview situation, and where the documents to be analyzed come from. Thirdly, the material is formally characterized (how the material was documented and edited and the influence of the transcription on the texts). Fourthly, Mayring (1983) defines the direction of the analysis for the selected texts and what one actually wants to interpret. Next, analytic units are defined. Here Flick (2002) quotes Mayring (1983) who differentiates as units the material which may be analyzed, and the minimal part of the text which may fall under a category. Analytic unit defines which passages are going to be analyzed consecutively. Finally, as Flick (2002) quotes Mayring (1983) the actual analyses are conducted before finally their results are interpreted with respect to the research question, and questions of validity are asked and answered.

3.11 USING DATA REDUCTION AS A MEANS OF ANALYSIS

The researcher used the data reduction method as one form of analyzing data. According to Matthews and Huberman (1984), data reduction refers to the process of selecting, focusing, simplifying, abstracting, and transforming the raw data that appear in written-up field notes. It must be noted that data reduction happens throughout the journey of the research. Data reduction further gives the researcher choices of which data chunks to code, which to pull out, which patterns summarize a number of chunks, and what the evolving story is (Miles *et al*, 1984). This is in line with what the researcher followed in the process of analyzing the data. As Miles *et al* (1984) put it further, that data reduction is a form of analysis that sharpens, sorts, focuses, discards, and organizes data in such a way that

final conclusions can be drawn and verified. This does not mean that the data is quantified but rather that the data at hand was kept and analyzed within the context in which they occur without tampering with it.

Maree (2010) adds that qualitative data analysis tries to establish how participants make meaning of a specific phenomenon by analyzing their perceptions, attitudes, understanding, knowledge, values, feelings and experiences in an attempt to approximate their construction of the phenomenon.

3.12 PATTERN CODING

To take further the data reduction, pattern coding was used to trace developing trends and patterns. According to Miles *et al* (1984), pattern codes are explanatory or inferential codes that identify an emergent theme, pattern, or explanation that the site suggests to the analyst. The researcher identified “repeatable regularities” (Miles *et al*, 1984) and coded them so that they can be analyzed as meaningful units of analysis. Therefore, grouping data into smaller themes and common recurring texts assisted the process of analysis. Miles *et al* (1984) talk about four important functions of pattern coding. Firstly, it reduces large amounts of data into a smaller number of analytic units. Secondly, it gets the research into analysis during data collection, so that later data collection can be more focused. Thirdly, it helps the researcher build a cognitive map, an evolving schema for understanding what is happening locally. Finally, when several researchers are engaged in individual case study work, it lays the groundwork for cross-site analysis by surfacing common themes and causal process. Therefore, pattern coding can lead to more studies on the site that is researched. Pattern coding assisted the researcher as patterns and themes emerged and created a path for analysis of the collected data. The researcher employed three types of data coding to arrive at categories or themes: open, axial and selective coding.

Therefore, data was analyzed three times each time using a different type of coding. As Njomana (2009) explains it, open coding is done to locate themes and assign initial codes or labels, it allows the researcher to bring to the surface from deep inside the data and thereafter the axial coding involves the clustering of categories or concepts identified during open coding.

Following on from coding is memoing (Miles *et al*, 1984). As alluded to, a researcher is an instrument of data collection and as such he/she is part of the journey of what he/she is studying. Memos help the researcher to not just report data but to tie different pieces of data together in a cluster, or they show that a particular piece of data is an instance of a general concept (Miles *et al*, 1984). Therefore memos conceptualize patterns and themes and serve as a transition from data to concepts, further clarifying the codes.

3.13 ANALYSING TEXTUAL DATA

Texts serve three purposes in the process of qualitative research: they are not only the essential data on which findings are based, but also the basis of interpretations and the central medium for presenting and communicating findings (Flick, 2002). Analyzing texts requires careful consideration and particular skill from a researcher to avoid presenting findings that are not necessarily a true reflection of what was researched and gathered. For instance, as Fairclough explains, a trans-disciplinary to theory or analytical method is a matter of working with categories and logic of, for instance, sociological theories in developing a theory of discourse and methods of analyzing texts. Textual analysis can focus on just a selected few features of texts, or many features simultaneously (Fairclough, 2003). Fairclough (2003) talks about Systematic Functional Linguistics (SFL) which is a linguistic theory that is associated with

Halliday where its analysis of texts is always oriented to the social character of texts.

Even though some form of categories may develop during qualitative analysis, the researcher must guard against moving away or compromising the linguistic data. Analysis of qualitative texts can be supplemented by quantitative analysis offered by corpus linguistics. According to Fairclough (2003), corpus linguistics is analysis that seeks to identify key words in a corpus of texts and to investigate distinctive patterns of co-occurrence between keywords and other words. Although the findings made through corpus linguistics are valuable, their value is limited and as such they need to be supplemented and complemented by more intensive and detailed qualitative textual analysis (Fairclough, 2003). The challenge here is for the researcher to make meaning of not only the explicit but implicit texts. This can be very challenging as the researcher should analyze not only what is said but what is implied. This can pose a problem of the researcher reading incorrect implications into what is said. Interpretation of what is said can be a complicated process and as such requires careful and skilful research to make meaning out of it. Fairclough (2003) raises issues such as judging whether the claims that are explicitly or implicitly made are true or not, or the relations within which the event takes place. Therefore analyzing and interpreting qualitative data is a complex proposition that needs careful consideration from the researcher.

Furthermore, this researcher asserts that textual analysis is selective in its nature as the researcher chooses to ask certain questions as opposed to others. This does not mean that the researcher is biased but simply the focus of that particular study could dictate the line of questioning. Furthermore, what is critical is for researchers to be objective so that their findings are credible and believable.

Textual analysis is, however, limited if not used with other methods of analysis. According to Fairclough (2003) textual analysis is a valuable supplement to social research, not a replacement for other forms of social research and analysis.

3.14 CONCLUSION

Qualitative research design was used as the methodology of this study. Interviews using unstructured open-ended questions were used as a technique to understand implementation of geographical names change in Mogale City. The sample used is purposive in that it is targeted to give relevant answers as to how the implementation of this policy is unfolding. Lastly, the theories and themes that emerge will be valuable in future studies but more so on how implementation of this policy can be “boosted” and “saved” to conform and to follow the guidelines presented in the SAGNC Act.

This chapter outlined the journey or the process of dealing with the data related to this study. It outlined how data was collected, presented and interpreted to make sense. The researcher dealt with how issues of bias were eliminated so that the study produces results that are impeccable and reliable. The case study provided more insight into the issue of geographical names change, not only in Mogale City but in the country.

The interviewees were assured that their views and expressions were only going to be used for the purpose of this study.

CHAPTER FOUR

PRESENTING THE FINDINGS ON IMPLEMENTATION OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES CHANGE POLICY IN MOGALE CITY: CASE STUDY

4.1 INTRODUCTION

Local government is at the heart of implementation of well-crafted policies. The national and provincial governments have a legal obligation in terms of policy implementation, but the local government is the one that is closer to the people and as such the face of other spheres of government. The successful implementation or non-implementation of policy and service delivery depends largely on local government. Therefore this study presents the findings on implementation of the policy on geographical names change with the focus on Mogale City local municipality and provides an indication of how participants feel about policy implementation in this area. Municipalities across the country are supposed to be at the forefront of implementation of this policy.

The chapter presents the results of the study on geographical names change within Mogale City local municipality (MCLM), and considers the failure or success of this policy in Mogale City as a case study. Assessment of structures as well as the competence of implementers is made.

4.2 DATA COLLECTED FROM DOCUMENTS

This study used interviews and documents to understand the phenomenon of name change. The following information was gathered from a number of documents.

4.2.1 Objectives for Standardisation of Names and Name Change: Historical Perspective

In 1960 the United Nations Group of Experts on Geographical Names (UNGEGN), a committee of the United Nations, came into being to advise on the process of changing names in order to standardize them. Names have to be standardized to avoid duplication and confusion, with one name only being allocated to a particular geographical feature. According to the United Nations *Manual for the National Standardization of Geographical Names* (2006:9), a standardized name is a name sanctioned by a names authority as a preferred name from among a number of allonyms (variant names) for a given feature. Regardless of the language from which a geographical name is derived, that name has official status if it is the name of an official place, and if has been approved by the national geographical authority of South Africa (Concise Gazetteer of South Africa 1994:1)

In South Africa as early as 1939, a National Place Names Committee (NPNC) was appointed. The NPNC was unrepresentative in character and it served the interests of the few minority groups. The Mayor of Mogale City Local Municipality argues that “South Africa has experienced the imposition of geographical names by the colonial powers who ruled our country without regard to the pre-existing names or the emotional responsiveness and deep feelings of the indigenous people of our country” (*Dikgang tsa Mogale*, July 2007:5).

4.2.2 The Role of the South African Geographical Names Council

The NPNC was replaced by the South African Geographical Names Council (SAGNC) at the end of 1999 as the national geographical names authority of South Africa. The SAGNC is more representative and it has to serve all the people of South Africa from all sectors of society. The SAGNC was formed by Act No. 118 of 1998 (Handbook on Geographical Names - second edition:2002). This council is located in the Ministry of Arts and Culture initially led by Minister Pallo Jordan which is presently led by Minister Paul Mashatile.

The SAGNC is further endorsed by the UNGEGN's Fifth United Nations Conference on the standardization of geographical names held in Montreal, Canada between 18-31 August 1987 which recommended that state authorities be encouraged to provide appropriate support to standardization activities and that the standardization of geographical names be recognized as part of their programme of international co-operation and technical assistance.

SAGNC, in turn, facilitated the establishment of Provincial Geographical Names Committees (PGNC) in all nine provinces of South Africa as a means to extend and carry the mandate and the activities of the SAGNC to other levels of government. The PGNC in turn facilitated the formation of Local Geographical Names Committees (LGNC) at municipality level to extend the activities and policies of the PGNC at local level. An effective and functional SAGNC, like any other national government department, depends on efficient and functional PGNCs and PGNCs depend on effective LGNCs.

4.3 RESPONSIBILITIES OF IMPLEMENTING BODIES

The SAGNC advises the South African Minister of Arts and Culture on names that have to be standardized. In fact, the SAGNC recommends standardized names to the Minister for approval (Handbook on Geographical Names, Second Edition, 2002:1) (henceforth referred to as the "handbook"). The SAGNC further receives and records approved geographical names and makes them known through publications as well as on the internet. The SAGNC works closely with PGNCs to ensure that all principles and outlined steps are carried out when a name is changed in a particular province.

According to functions outlined in the handbook, the PGNC is responsible for, among others, to advise local authorities and work with them in ensuring that they apply the principles of the SAGNC to the name under their jurisdiction. The PGNC should see to it that local communities are sufficiently consulted, so a PGNC oversees LGNCs.

A LGNC is at the heart of implementation of the policy on geographical names change. This is the sphere of government where implementation begins and more often it is where dissatisfactions are most felt if the process was not done well. Protests and litigation are some of the forms that indicate dissatisfaction and that some community members do not accept the way an implementation process was carried out. Local government is the lifeline of service delivery in South Africa as it is closest to the citizens and the community, so if this policy is not properly implemented, local government is the first port of call.

This research was focused on Mogale City Municipality as a case study based on the role local municipality plays in implementation of this policy.

As indicated earlier, the procedures and guidelines that are set out in the Act are not always adhered to, as explained by interviewee no. 10.

> The present status of implementation of the policy on geographical name change is still zero. Various meetings were held over the past two years but no name change recommendation came forward. As a result of the non-existence of administrative guidelines, no decision could be taken.

4.4 PROCEDURES FOR CHANGING GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES

Firstly a name is proposed. The SAGNC Act No.118 of 1998 allows for individual citizens, property owners or developers, organised bodies, government departments, local authorities as well as the South African Post Office to apply to have names changed or correctly spelt. As Mayor Seerane of Mogale City explained in his address at the inauguration of the local geographical names committee in June 2007, the issue of geographical names must be a community-driven initiative (*Dikgang tsa Mogale*, July, 2007). The policy document of Mogale City Geographical Names Committee dated 30 October 2007 states that the process must be consultative, the extent of which should vary depending on the profile of the feature being named/renamed.

This study found that there is a challenge in terms of the criteria or criterion to be used to determine the profile of the feature. There are no guidelines clearly set and written to determine the profile of features. Again there is nowhere where the guidelines are written for reference purposes. This presents a challenge with regard to policy formulation and implementation. Therefore this clumsy and open-ended condition rather than providing guidance, brings more confusion when deciding the extent of consultation and the profile of the feature to be named or renamed.

The purpose for an applicant to propose for a name to be changed or standardised could be to avoid the same name being given to different places, the name may sound like another one, it could be to honour or celebrate a leader or a significant event, or it could be due to cultural attachment or the spelling of one place name that is similar to another (Handbook on Geographical Names, Second Edition, 2002:3). According to the revised policy document entitled *Mogale City Geographical Names Committee* of 30 October 2007, the procedures of naming and/or re-naming features are as follows: Firstly a name is proposed; all submissions should be directed to the Executive Director: Development Planning and Urban Management (ED: DP&UM); all applications are assessed against the policy and recommendations to the Mayoral Committee to check compliance with the SAGNC Act, principles and policies.

Thereafter, the proposed name should be taken to a municipality council and thereafter ward committee together with the ward councillor who will take that particular name to the community to further solicit community support and hear public views through community meetings. Evidence of sitting for such a meeting should be available and could be in the form of minutes and a signed register of the attendants at such a meeting. If the name is endorsed by the community, then the proposed name will be advertised in newspapers, especially the local press, and it will also be publicized in strategic places such as schools and churches. In other words, the affected community must adequately be made aware of the intention to change a name. Max-Neef emphasizes community involvement when he outlines nine human needs that have to be satisfied (http//www.rainforestinfo.org.an/background/maxneef.htm). The fifth need is the one relevant here as it talks about participation. Ward meetings or, where a large community is affected, a general meeting where a name change is discussed should be organized.

Furthermore, a signed attendance register showing the number of people in attendance together with the minutes of such meeting should be kept as evidence. From there, the MC-LGNC submits the recommended name to the mayoral committee for approval. Thereafter, the proposed name is submitted to the PGNC for approval which in turn submits the name to the SAGNC for approval. The SAGNC then recommends the name to the Minister of Arts and Culture for approval. The Minister approves the name and the SAGNC facilitates the erection of the approved name and makes the name known through publication and internet. Institutions such as the Post Office, Telkom, the South African Police Services, Ambulance Service and any other relevant parties must also be notified. This represents the cycle of implementation of a name change process.

Furthermore, notices are placed on site for 28 days for comments; applications should be circulated to the Geographic Information System (GIS), Arts, Culture and Heritage and the Johannesburg Roads Agency (JRA). All statutory bodies are informed of the decision and a final notice is placed in the papers and on site to notify the public of the final decision. The SAGNC Act provides a very useful framework for testing the implementation process of name change and describes procedures to be followed. The problem seems to be on the ground when this policy has to be implemented. So the question was posed regarding how this process of name change can be implemented successfully. The evaluation of how the policy is implemented was done to determine where the problems lie. The assessment again focused on how this policy and the process of name change unfolds and where deficiencies or challenges are located during implementation of this policy with reference to Mogale City.

This study found that the procedures outlined above are found in policy but are not followed when names are changed in Mogale City. The study further found that the procedures, where they are followed, are not followed sufficiently. In the case of the Mogale City policy document,

where these procedures are outlined, there is no mention of Mogale City Local Geographical Names Committee (MC-LGNC) which is appointed to facilitate the name change process at Mogale City local municipality. The absence of this committee left a void in terms of the responsibility of the committee and its importance in the process of name change.

4.5 POLITICS OF NAME CHANGE

This study has a sensitive twist to it, especially regarding the political side of the implementation of this policy as different stakeholders would like their politically preferred name to be the one that ultimately prevails. This research asserts that it falls under sensitive topics. As Lee (1993) explains, research is often problematic when it impinges on political alignments, if political is taken in its widest sense to refer to the vested interests of powerful persons or institutions, or the exercise of coercion or domination. As mentioned earlier in this study, this policy could be or is perceived to be a political ball game in the sense that other political formations or simply interested parties could use it to manipulate the process of implementing it.

The court cases like the case of Makhado vs Louis Trichardt (Case No. 2007/SCA 44 RSA), Tshwane vs Pretoria, or in Durban prove how sensitive the issue of name change is and how in each circumstances before a name could be changed all procedures should be taken into consideration. In the case of Makhado vs Louis Trichardt, the municipality had to reverse their decision as the court ruled that the process of implementation as outlined in Act No. 118 of 1998 was not followed to the letter. There was not sufficient consultation as required by the Act.

In addition, Lee (1993) argues that even in less overtly conflictual situations, research which seems to threaten the alignment or interests of those being studied is frequently seen as having a sensitive character. Lee

(1993) further quotes Beynon (1988) who argues that the rich and the powerful have encouraged hagiography, not critical investigation. Having said that, the study presents in its findings the politics in implementation of this policy on geographical names change and further presents how politics plays out in implementation of the policy. The implementation of this policy is challenged as it is seen as a political ball game by some opposition political parties. Some political parties accuse the ANC of manipulating the process and only honouring ANC heroes at the expense of other parties (*City Press*, 21 December, 2008). The Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) has problems with names of their leaders being replaced by ANC heroes' names. For instance, Mangosuthu Buthelezi Highway was changed to Griffiths Mxenge Highway. This situation threatened political stability in KwaZulu-Natal where the IFP felt that only ANC struggle heroes are honoured at the expense of their leaders.

Furthermore, Freedom Front Plus (FFP) leaders also feel that their history and their heroes are not being accommodated in a democratic South Africa. Leaders such as Andries Pretorius, Paul Kruger and others are replaced by names seen to be aligned to the ANC (*City Press*, 21 December 2008). Some white Afrikaners feel that these leaders also form part of their history, culture and heritage. By replacing these names, their history, culture and heritage is being erased. Interviewee no.2 states that,

> The community members in black areas will be more concerned with basics and issues related to name change and renaming are secondary whereas in white communities on the other hand they will be willing to participate as they believe that they have to ensure that changes do not erode their history.

Furthermore, Mfundise Masithe, AZAPO Gauteng deputy chairperson, stated that he was " …saddened, dismayed and strongly object to the renaming of the Old Potchefstroom Road after Chris Hani. The struggle

was not only fought by Hani and ANC. Hani was not even a resident of Soweto" (*City Press*, 21 December 2008).

This study asked some sensitive questions to get to understand how this policy is implemented in Mogale City and "powerful" people were engaged to get to the root of the issues around implementation of this policy. In this instance, the researcher becomes an "enemy" to the power structures. As Lee (1993) puts it, the researcher is a relatively uncontrollable element in an otherwise highly controlled system and the researcher can be perceived as threatening to the careers of those who might have to take responsibility if the study subsequently reveals information unfavourable to the organization.

Therefore it emerged that in fact the implementation of this policy is dogged by political haggling and jostling. The more powerful political party gets its way. This is the case in Mogale City and in many parts of this country. It further emerged that the street names in the new settlements around Mogale City bear the names of the former ANC councillors. As interviewee no. 7 said: "The implementation of this policy is all about politicians massaging their egos and using communities to rubber-stamp their decisions." He further argued that "these names are being decided in boardrooms and made to appear as if it is the community who decided on them." Interviewee no. 9 concurred when he said: "even the people who support and motivate proposed names in community meetings are "planted" by "powerful people" so that their preferred name can get through. So the issue of politics being involved in implementation of this policy holds water and it needs to be addressed so that this policy can be implemented successfully and it can play its role of reconciling the nation".

4.5.1 Political Will

Public policies are driven by politics. The political principals use policies to implement their promises to the electorate. This researcher asserts that policies are often given priority status depending on what politicians see as urgent. Policies that politicians see as urgent or policies that help them to get political mileage will always get first preference, not necessarily what the ordinary people want. Njomane (2009:79-80) cites Ritzer (1988) who asserts that conflict theories maintain that those in positions of power or authority and those in positions of subordination hold certain interests that are contradictory in substance and direction. Politicians from the ruling ANC in Mogale City determine the direction the process of name change takes. This point is further developed when this study looks at various stages (for instance in public meetings) of the implementation of the policy on geographical names change.

This researcher focused on the implementation of policies of the SAGNC at Mogale City, especially the Mogale City Local Geographical Names Committee (MC-LGNC) to determine the level at which these policies are implemented. The study found that there is no monitoring and evaluation of the extent of implementation of this policy at local government level by the PGNC and ultimately by the SAGNC. The local governments are left to fend for themselves. The role of the PGNC in implementation of this policy at local government level is not clear as there are no systems in place to ensure that implementation takes place as required by the Act.

Mogale City local municipality is one of four local municipalities that form the West Rand District Municipality (WRDM). The other three local municipalities are Randfontein, Merafong and Western Area. The study established that of these four local municipalities, Mogale City is the only one with a local geographical names change committee. The fact that there is discrepancy within the same district municipality indicates the level of political will and commitment in implementation of this policy. It further

raises serious questions about implementation of this policy not only within the case study of this research but across the country.

In Mogale City, although the existence of the MC-LGNC indicates some degree of political will, the study found that the political will is limited. This point is further elaborated by the response of interviewee no.1 who said:

> The current MC-LGNC exists for almost 3 years(from June 2007). Only at the very last meeting (October 2010) applications for the naming of streets (new township) has been tabled for attention.

Interviewee no.2 adds that:

> I think the committee is not very operational and its activities are not well supported at the level of the municipality. Implementation of this policy is not successful, the pace is extremely slow.

Interviewee no.10 sums it up thus:

> Mogale City did not plan the introduction of the name change committee correctly. They should have first worked out the details for the implementation, like estimate budget, guidelines, compensation, stationery, transport, office accommodation, geographical maps, lists of street names already in use, administrative and logistical help, etc. And thereafter the appointment of members for the commission should have taken place. On this basis the Commission could have started with its real assignment long ago.

4.6 CONDUCTING PUBLIC MEETINGS AND COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT

It is important that the policy on geographical names change is implemented in such a way that members of the public are involved and feel that their views are heard and respected. The community should be part of the process of implementing this policy otherwise they will not support it. According to Judge Farlam in the case referred to as Chairperson's Association vs Minister of Arts and Culture (Louis Trichardt to Makhado), the guideline is that before a proposed name is adopted, one of the fundamental considerations is adequate or proper consultation with local communities. Makhado as the new name of Louis Trichardt had to be reversed (Case No. 2007/ SCA 44 RSA paragraph 46) because of lack of proper consultation with the affected communities. Interviewee no. 10 argues that up to this point the public were not really participating in the process, as no notice of participation was published in newspapers nor were pamphlets distributed to invite people to participate in the process.

Again, the complaint was that people were not timeously notified of meetings and they were not given an opportunity to express their views. The notion of adequate consultation is further emphasized by the second United Nations Conference on Standardization of Geographical Names held in May 1972 which advised that meetings should be structured to permit almost anyone to talk about anything regarding the names that are being discussed or proposed. Mayor Seerance of Mogale City emphasized that the will of the people must prevail (*Dikgang tsa Mogale*, July, 2007).

In addition, all sectors of the community should be given an opportunity to express their views on the proposed name or names irrespective of the size in terms of number. During consultation, the wishes of a sector of the population, such as a local community, a language group, a religious or cultural group or a political party should be weighed up against the wishes of society as a whole and national interests. At times it will be sectional interests that should take priority; at times it will be national interests (Jenkins *et al*, 1996:106). The issue raised by Jenkins here poses a

serious challenge to the implementers of this policy. It actually means that the process of name change is not easy and simple but very sensitive and requires thorough thought and proper attention to detail before it can be implemented accordingly.

The researcher asserts that at times it is not only about a popular view or submission that a name will be changed. Other related factors will have to be considered such as sectional interests. Others may question the value of consultation if their views are not taken into account. While democracy dictates that the majority will rule, sometimes the majority can be wrong. These complicated requirements may simplyl add to the complex definition of what constitutes consultation.

Therefore, public/community meetings are crucial to determine consultation or sufficient consultation as required according to Act No.118 of 1998. These meetings as part of sufficient consultation as such should be advertised widely fourteen days prior to the meeting date. “Sufficient” would mean that the advertisement for the meeting should be in all visible areas around the affected community, since community involvement and consultation are vital in implementation of this policy. However, this was not the case in Mogale City as interviewee No. 10 explained:

> Some community members are at this stage not aware of the existence of a Names Change Committee. The introduction of the Commission has not taken place yet. Some members of the Community are present when councillors decide on names to be given to streets, etc. You cannot call this participating in the process.

Consultation is crucial in implementation of this policy as evidenced in the Western Cape in January 1997, when the member of the provincial executive committee (MEC) for transport and public works in the Western

Cape, Leonard Ramatlakane who belonged to the ANC, defied the National Party (NP) government of the province by holding a public ceremony at which he renamed the N12, which was the Stellenbosch arterial road, Dr Nelson Mandela Drive. This caused a stir because Mr. Ramatlakane had not gone through the normal procedures including consulting all stakeholders before implementing a name change (Jenkins, 2007:136). Stakeholders like the NP protested because they felt that they were not properly involved when the decision was taken and not necessarily that Nelson Mandela should not be honoured. As interviewee no.2 noted:

> I want to believe that the policy is not well communicated. There is no sufficient involvement of the people with interest in the subject. The issue of relating to party politics also plays a very crucial role in this regard as people tend to concentrate on names linked to their own.

The issue of the importance of involving stakeholders was further demonstrated when Pretoria was to be changed to Tshwane. There was a problem with how the process was handled. It appeared that the process of stakeholder involvement was irregular in the sense that a section of the Pretoria public was not widely consulted, as the SAGNC Act requires (Jenkins, 2007:162). The involvement and interaction with all stakeholders before a name is changed should always be taken into consideration and the interest of different structures, groupings, and individuals is critical. This requires a balancing act to take into consideration as many different views as possible. Interviewee no. 9 raised the issue that some sections of the community "… would view a change as an erosion of their history and will go all out to resist."

It emerged that in Mogale City communities are not properly involved in the process of name change. Hogwood *et al* (1984:213) argue that to

avoid or to minimize resistance, full information should be provided at an early stage about proposed or anticipated changes, including the reasons, objectives, and means involved; there should be extensive consultation with affected parties; and participative decision-making where possible. Therefore, persuasion or simply seeking to convince with the idea to influence rather than command is the way to go. Interviewee no. 2 puts it thus: “There is not proper public consultation and incorrect procedures were followed and that several cases landed in court.”

When asked about community involvement, interviewee no.1 puts it thus:

> No involvement. The previous name change of the municipality to Mogale City was a political decision.

It emerged in this study that in one area known as extension 2 and 3, ANC councillors named the streets after themselves. This further elaborated the point made that this process of name change is manipulated by politicians. Interviewee no. 5 went to an extent that names are “bulldozed” through the community with those who are against them being labeled enemies. She further said that the meetings are not conducted in an atmosphere where community members could speak freely, but instead if one speaks his or her mind against a proposed name, he/she is victimized and sidelined when opportunities like jobs come up. This is supported by interviewee no. 2 who said:

> I do not think the community participates fully in this regard. At present I think the process has stalled. There is no visible progress relating to implementation.

Interviewee no. 6 observed that “Consultation or community involvement happens only on paper unless it means consulting their friends and so-called comrades.” She further said that “people call ANC meetings and

decide on names aligned to ANC and call that community meetings or that the community is consulted. Unless ANC members are the community, then they can claim to have consulted 'the community'."

Interviewee no. 10 said: "Up to this point the public were not really participating in the process, as no notice of participation was published in newspapers or pamphlets to invite people to participate in the process."

However, Interviewee no. 3 argues that, "Public participation takes place and the process involves communities that of affected areas and councillors are expected to keep minutes and attendance registers."

Interviewee no. 4 concurs by saying: "Notices are issued of such meetings in consultation with ward councillors and other stakeholders for inputs."

Interviewee no.6 adds that "In Mogale City the community has recently started to participate in public meetings where proposals for names are discussed." He further cites the case of proposed names that recently came from the new settlement called Chief Mogale.

It must be mentioned that the other seven interviewees agreed that there is minimal or at times no involvement of the affected communities when features are named or renamed.

Given a number of protests and court cases that are current, a pertinent question would be whether the institutions entrusted with the responsibility to implement this policy are resourced to be able to carry out their mandate. Furthermore, do the people who are entrusted to lead the implementation of policy unable to follow the SAGNC Act to the letter when implementing this policy or do they just ignore the stipulated procedures and principles? Wherein lies the challenge or the problem

when these institutions are supposed to consult? It could also be simply a matter of inadequate or insufficient capacity and skill.

Furthermore, Kraft and Furlong (2004:75) remind us that institutional theory is particularly important insofar as certain aspects of government structure and procedural rules can empower or obstruct political interests. In other words, institutions are important in making implementation of policies successful or not. The role of institutions is as important as other stakeholders in policy implementation. Are institutions as competent as they should be in order to cultivate atmosphere and space for implementers and street bureaucrats to smoothly put in place the policies and programmes they are responsible for?

4.7 DEBATES ON COSTS OF CHANGING NAMES

The debate on the costs of implementing the policy is examined on two fronts. Firstly, there is the actual cost involved in changing a name and secondly, there is the money or resources made available to geographical names committees especially at local government level. This study focused on Mogale City Local Municipality. In other words, does the government have the wherewithal to implement this policy successfully? There is an argument that the problem with the implementation of this policy is the cost involved when a name is changed. The argument is that resources or money used in changing names could be used to improve the lives of the people. For instance, this money could be used for basic service delivery, building houses, funding schools' feeding schemes, etc. The Johannesburg Child Welfare Society also added to the debate on costs versus name change and ran an advertisement in newspapers that stated "… if it takesR1,5 billion to change a name (Pretoria to Tshwane), call it whatever you want. What's in a name?" (Jenkins, 2007:163). Buckland argues, however, that the cost argument is nonsense, dishonest

and even though it is true it is emotive and misses the point entirely (http://www.iolproperty.co.za/viewatexad.php?id+1412731).

According to Jenkins (2007) the cost of changing Pretoria to Tshwane is estimated at R1,5 billion whereas feeding one abused or neglected child for a whole month costs R160. The Johannesburg Child Welfare Society put it thus: "While we understand the importance of addressing past injustices, the confusing part is which injustices are given priority and money too… please make a donation"(Jenkins, 2007:163). The question is, is the change of names simply about the costs involved? If the money which was directed at names change was to be re-directed to basic service delivery, would this appease and heal the society of the wounds created by this country's unfortunate past? In other words, will the black people in particular identify with names of apartheid heroes because they now benefit from improved service delivery? Is this debate justified? Business also incurs costs as a result of names change. Jenkins (2007) states that costs can be extrapolated to an average for various business sizes. When Pretoria was changed to Tshwane, Jenkins (2007) estimates that a small business would lose a once-off outlay of R40 000; a medium size business would face a once-off outlay of R200 000; and a large business would lose a one-off outlay of R400 000. This gives rise to the question of whether Could we say that due to costs involved in names change, let us stop this process? Is this process a necessary evil or simply a waste of taxpayers' money.

The argument here is that the money used to change a name can rather be used to deliver services to the poor. The argument against that is that one cannot put a price tag on bringing dignity back to especially black people who feel a particular name should be changed because it does not represent them. According to Jenkins (2007) to change Pretoria to Tshwane will cost the Weather Bureau R100 000 as a one-time cost and

the National Roads Agency estimates the cost of changing all the signs around Pretoria to be approximately R50 000 to R150 000 for each sign.

The second front to the debate on costs is whether the geographical committees are allocated enough funds to do their job effectively and efficiently especially at local level which is where the implementation of this policy is happening as it is here where communities can influence the names changing process. The local municipalities do not have specific budget allocated to the local geographical names committees therefore, these committees have to try to solicit funds from administrators and political principals.

The study found that the MC-LGNC is not allocated resources in the form of office space, access to telephone, stationery, computer with internet, etc. to make their work easier. In Mogale City the departments of Cooperative Affairs and Intergovernmental Relations are working with the local committee. The committee is told to use the resources in the offices of the managers of the above-mentioned departments. The question of what kind of access they might have is still open, and also the extent to which this is likely to hinder or accelerate proper implementation of the policy on geographical names. Does this non-allocation of resources specifically to the MC-LGNC improve or hinder implementation of this policy?

This study found that in Mogale City, a lack of office space specifically allocated to MC-LGNC hinders the work of the committee as members are willing to put in extra work outside meetings and sittings but they feel that they are encroaching on the managers' offices if they just come in and use their computers, telephones, etc. Again due to lack of office space, the committee does not keep proper records of their activities and work thus far. This means that if the minutes or records of names that are dealt with thus far are required, this information will not be available. Furthermore,

the study found that each member of the committee keeps his/her records which at times other members misplace. This haphazard arrangement makes the work of the committee clumsy and disorganized. Furthermore, it compromises proper implementation in the sense that if monitoring and evaluation of policy implementation was to be done, there would not be records to back up whatever claims the committee makes. Interviewee no. 1 said with regard to resources: “Incompetency of the secretariat (from department of intergovernmental department), they lack the know-how and commitment to support the MC-LGNC. The MC-LGNC should have full-time office and staff to their disposal.”

4.8 TRENDS IN IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS POLICY

It emerged that out of four municipalities that form WRDM (Mogale City, Western Area, Randfontein and Merafong), only Mogale City has a LGNC. Therefore in Gauteng West only 25% of Local Municipalities attempt to implement this policy albeit with all the challenges as presented in this chapter. Interviewees no. 1, 5 and 6 agree that the policy is implemented haphazardly without proper planning and capacitating appointed committees across the province. As interviewee no. 2 concurs, the public was not properly educated (or informed) of the purpose, content and procedures pertaining to the implementation of the policy. This was supported by interviewee no. 10 who said:

> The number of court cases is mainly the result of non-compliance with the correct procedures as well as non-public participation on a wide enough basis. Furthermore, ill-considered name changes are also a basis for court cases.

The trend in Mogale City shows minimal compliance in terms of implementation of this policy. Interviewee no. 1 argues that the MC-LGNC has been in existence for three years now but it did not achieve anything

in that period. Interviewee no. 9 adds that there is no driving force in Mogale City municipality to drive the process of implementation.

As far as trends are concerned in implementing this policy provincially and nationally, the situation seems to be similar to that of Mogale City. The Gauteng PGNC does exist but its implementation score card reads "minimal implementation" with regard to this policy. It is the Gauteng PGNC that was supposed to have ensured that the other three WRDM local municipalities have LGNC. In this regard, the Gauteng PGNC failed dismally, not only in West Rand but across the province. For instance, in Tshwane Metro, there are court cases going on due to unprocedural implementation. Nationally there are court cases pending due to seemingly improper implementation of this policy, including in Limpopo, and Kwa-Zulu Natal.

In the case of Tshwane residents, Njomane (2009) states that many local residents and business owners have raised concerns about the fact that the municipality has insufficiently publicised the need for the public to participate in the renaming of the City of Pretoria. The term "insufficiently publicised" meant that the process of renaming the City was not well communicated to the public (Njomane, 2009:6) when Tshwane Metro wanted to change Pretoria to Tshwane. This is how some of Soweto residents felt when street names were changed without "sufficiently publicising" the process of changing the Roodepoort Road. The people of Soweto felt that although they did not have a problem with the new name in principle, they were concerned with how the policy is implemented.

4.9 CONCLUSION

This chapter outlined the steps that have to be followed before a proposed name can be successfully changed. These steps are vital for proper implementation of the policy on geographical names change. It is

important for the implementers of this policy at all levels (i.e. local, provincial and national) to follow these steps to the letter thereby avoiding unnecessary court cases.

Furthermore, community involvement during implementation of this policy is paramount. The conducting of public meetings when discussing name change should be transparent and all views including dissenting voices should be taken into account. There is constant litigation by unhappy residents in the way this policy on geographical names change is implemented. Birkland (2005:166) calls this conflict an agreement on ends, but not on means. The opposing group for instance in Makhado/Louis Trichardt agree that names have to be changed but do not agree with the process taken as they contend that there was insufficient consultation. In other words, the goals of the policy are not in dispute but the implementation process is. Public meetings should not only be applying the concept that the majority rules, but the minority voices should be given the same prominence and where the minority voice is more applicable, the proposed name should carry in spite of democratic process. This approach of giving all participants a platform to raise their views before a name could be changed will go a long way in bringing social cohesion and reconciliation in an otherwise divided South African society.

The question of whether one can prioritize or redirect the funds used in the process of name change for service delivery is pertinent, but one that has to be looked at and dealt with taking into consideration the broader agenda of the country, which is to bring all races together. To what extent can names continue to be used that are offensive to some sections of the society yet also deliver services to them? Certainly the balancing act is necessary here as names are very much a part of humanity and how people name an environment is as important as service delivery.

The next chapter analyses the data presented in this chapter.

CHAPTER FIVE

INTERPRETATION AND ANALYSIS OF THE FINDINGS ON GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES CHANGE POLICY: CASE STUDY

5.1 INTRODUCTION

In analyzing the data presented in the previous chapter, this chapter scrutinizes the roles of different role-players in implementation of the policy on geographical names change and challenges faced by them. As Sapsford and Jupp (2006:153) observe, data analysis is the process of transforming “raw” data into variables that can be analyzed to produce the information found in the results section of such a report. The chapter further analyses why implementing structures are facing challenges to implement this policy successfully. Structural challenges are scrutinized as well as institutional arrangements with regard to implementation of this policy.

A critical analysis is made of the role played by the South African Geographical Names Council, Gauteng Provincial Geographical Names Committee and Mogale City Local Geographical Names Change in the implementation process. The analysis further focuses on the manner in which names are changed or new features are named in Mogale City and examines procedures that are followed in implementation of this policy. In addition, the analysis looks at how the implementation process is unfolding in Mogale City.

5.2 CONCEPT OF DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

This study used explanations and steps of analyzing and interpreting data as put forward by Sapsford and Jupp (2006). Sapsford *et al* (2006:153) talk of this stage of research as a stage in which the researcher tunes into the meaning and messages in his/her data, builds up an appreciation of the nuances, and structures the possibility for analysis.

5.2.1 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK: POLICY IMPLEMENTATION

This analysis is based on systems and institutional theories. According to Cloete *et al* (2004), the systems model can provide perspectives on aspects such as the influence of the environment on political policy and *vice versa* and the success or ability of the political system to convert demands into public policy, the effectiveness of the feedback process and the extent to which feedback information (result, impacts and consequences of policies) is incorporated in the adoption of existing or new policies. Therefore, policy implementation is a process where constant feedback is given to improve it rather than policy implementation being inflexible. This study analyses the politics of implementation of the policy on geographical names change. The analysis is done against the backdrop that public policy is attached to political systems and that political dynamics and their impacts. The researcher asserts that politics are part of public policy formulation and implementation. The institutional model on the other hand argues that public policy is legitimized by government and only government policies apply to all members of society, hence the structure of governmental institutions can have an important bearing on policy results (Cloete *et al*, 2004). This study looked at institutional arrangements and how these impacts on policy implementation in Mogale City.

Maskin and Sjostrom (2001) note that if a mechanism has the property that in each possible state of the world, the set of equilibrium outcomes equals the optimal outcomes identified by the social choice rule, then the social choice rule is said to be implemented by this mechanism. They further say that the most common interpretation of the implementation problem is that a social planner or mechanism designer wants to design a mechanism in such a way that in each state of the world the set of equilibrium outcomes coincides with the set of optimal outcomes. It means that there is correlation or clear balance between policy development and implementation.

Therefore both systems and institutional theories are relevant and appropriate for this study and it forms the background of interpretation and analysis of the findings.

5.2.2 Missing Values

When researchers are reporting on analysis of data of missing cases, these should be stated for the reader to get some idea of how representative the analyzed cases are likely to be of the whole sample. The researcher can leave missing value cases out of the analysis but report on their number and preferably their nature in order to show whether there are enough of them and they are sufficiently non-random to invalidate the conclusions of the analysis (Sapsford *et al*, 2006:175). The researcher states that in this study, twelve people were identified for interviews, but two of them did not avail themselves due to other commitments. One of them is a community member who left the Gauteng province for three months and the other is the executive mayor of Mogale City who had various engagements that could not be changed. This situation did not affect the study and its findings since the views of the mayor on the process of name change are reflected in earlier chapters of this study as extracted from *Dikgang tsa Mogale.*

5.2.3 Assessing the Validity of Claims

According to Sapsford *et al* (2006), there are two crucial considerations when assessing the validity of claims. Firstly, there is the plausibility, which is the extent to which a claim seems likely to be true given its relationship to what is public knowledge beyond reasonable doubt. In other words, is the claim made possible given the public knowledge in existence out there? Secondly, there is credibility. This is to determine whether the claim is of a kind that, given what is known about how the research was carried out, can be judged to very likely to be true. It therefore questions whether what is claimed is believable or not.

5.2.4 Process of Analysis

Grounded theorizing is used in analyzing collected data. Sapsford *et al* (2006:246) explain grounded theory as identifying the perspectives of various groups of people involved in a setting, the documentation of the problems that they face in their lives, and the description of the strategies that they have developed to deal with those problems. Sapsford *et al* (2006) put forward the following three steps for grounded theorizing.

Step One is close reading of data identifying aspects that are significant and noting topics or categories to which the data relate which are relevant to the research focus or in some way surprising or interesting. Also here look out for recurrences that may indicate patterns. Step Two is about gathering together segments of data from different parts of the data record that are relevant to some category. Step Three is to compare and contrast all the items of data that have been assigned to the same category. Sapsford *et al* (2006) further cite Glaser and Strauss (1967) who refer to this stage as the constant comparative method.

5.3 ANALYSIS OF RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DESIGN

The methodology employed by this researcher is qualitative research methodology. This allowed the research to get deeper into the views, feelings, and attitudes of the interviewees in order to get the understanding of how policy on geographical names change is implemented in Mogale City. The researcher was able to probe the responses of the interviewees to get clarity on what was said. The interviews were used as technique for data collection. This helped the researcher to get into the thoughts and feelings of the respondents on how this policy is implemented in Mogale City as the case study. Qualitative research methodology and interviews were appropriate in researching the topic and answering questions for this research.

5.3.1 Analysis of the Sample

Initially the researcher earmarked only the people who were working with geographical names change such as municipality officials, committee members, and the mayor, but during data collection two ordinary members of Mogale City community were added as the researcher felt there was a need to get to know and get perspective on how ordinary members of the community felt about the implementation of the policy. The sample increased to twelve although at the end the researcher could not interview two of the sampled individuals.

The individuals who were interviewed came from two employees of the municipality, four from the local geographical names committee, two opposition political parties, and two ordinary community members selected from the Integrated Development Programme (IDP) meeting held by the mayor in the town hall in October 2010. These individuals gave their views as honestly as possible. It was interesting to hear three of the committee members being critical of the support they get from their principals and

how this has led to the state of unsuccessful implementation of this policy in Mogale City.

However, the employees of the municipality were more defensive and protective of the municipality. Their responses were measured and always putting forward the municipality as doing its best. One of the committee members also concurred with these municipality employees by saying the municipality is working with ward councillors to involve the community. But when asked whether the municipality is implementing this policy successfully or not, he said not. This contradiction was interesting and revealing of the state of implementation of this policy in Mogale City. There is not enough support of the committee and the process of implementation from the side of the municipality, although there are pockets of cases where the municipality showed interest like naming of the new settlement called Chief Mogale. The two community members who were interviewed and the two opposition party members interviewed were critical in terms of progress made in implementation of this policy. They were adamant that the procedures are often manipulated by the municipality and ANC councillors.

5.4 INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS IN IMPLEMENTION OF THE POLICY

Manthata (2008:121) argues that institutions are a critical component to steer a policy or programme in a particular direction and that the mandate, power and capacity of the institution reveal the seriousness of the policy maker to implement the programme. Kay (2006:30) further believes that within policy systems there are various structures at different scales that act as institutions in shaping agents' decision-making in the formulation, enactment and implementation of policy. Hanekom adds that the relationship between policy makers (the legislators) and the policy implementers (the executive public officials and institutions) are likely to

affect policy implementation. Government institutions from national, provincial and local level responsible for overseeing implementation of policy on geographical names change are supposed to work seamlessly together to ensure successful implementation of the policy. At national level, the SANGC located within the national Department of Arts and Culture has the overall mandate to monitor the implementation of this policy.

At provincial level the responsible institution is the PGNC located within the provincial Department of Arts and Culture and at local government level the LGNC is the institution that is responsible for implementation of this policy. As is clear in the last institution (local) there is no designated department that this committee is located within. This is a weakness as the department that ends up being given responsibility to work with the local committees handles these committees as if they are “illegitimate children” and therefore these committees are not given the attention and support they deserve. The performance assessment of these departments responsible at local level does not include how these committees perform. Therefore these departments do not become concerned whether the committees perform or not. This makes the local committees “just-by-the-way institutions” whose functionality is a concern of the few who are interested.

At Mogale City the local committee is placed under the Department of Corporate Governance. Again this department treats the local geographical committee as an “illegitimate child.” There are municipality employees who are suppose to serve in this committee but the minutes of the meetings reflect a pattern of non-attendance by these individuals. This non-attendance is a reflection of how these individuals view the role of this committee in Mogale City. As one member of the committee who was interviewed noted: “They attend meetings by apology or if they do pitch they do not sit until the end of the meeting, half way through the

proceedings they will apologize and leave." Again, the local committee is not given office space with relevant resources to be able to carry out its task effectively. According to another interviewee who serves on the committee: "We cannot perform effectively and efficiently because we work like street kids with nowhere to go but to beg for accommodation when we hold our meetings or sittings." It is clear that the employee of the municipality as well as the Department of Corporate Governance (as the department responsible for this committee), are not pulling all the stops for this committee to implement policy successfully. The MC-LGNC is formed by people from a wide range of background and skills.

5.5 PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT

It emerged in this study that communities are not sufficiently involved when features are either named or re-named or simply names are changed. The "public" meetings are actually ANC meetings where leaders, especially councillors, come with names discussed with their political principals in the boardroom and "impose" them in the meeting using strategies to make them look like they are the result of the meeting. Interviewees no. 5 and 6 agree: "There are people who are placed within the meeting to seem as if they are community members proposing a name only to find that that name was discussed earlier on." Interviewee no. 8 concurs by saying that this is possible because these so-called meetings are chaired by the very same councillors who have vested interests and who will deliberately point to the people whom they know will propose the name that was discussed earlier.

In addition it became apparent that public involvement does not happen as the political principals and administrators of Mogale City municipality would like the public to believe, as alluded to by seven interviewees out of ten. Out of the three who argue that the public is properly and sufficiently involved when names are proposed, two are the administrators of the

municipality which could be a reason that informs their viewpoint. As alluded to in the limitation to this study, workers at the municipality could be afraid to criticize their employer hence this view, but the researcher assured them of confidentiality and that their views will only be used for the purposes of the research and nothing else.

Kay (2006:9) explains the issue of involving the public thus, that the interaction view recognizes that policy is an ongoing process with many participants, most of whom do not have a formal or recognized role in policy-making. It therefore means that “the public” is part of policy-making even though it becomes involved at the latter stage of policy cycle, namely the implementation stage. Kay (2006) further talks about the structured interaction perspective. This perspective does not assume a single decision-maker, addressing a clear policy problem, but rather focuses on the range of participants in the game, the diversity of their understanding of the situation and the problem, the ways in which they interact with one another, and the outcomes of this interaction. The researcher asserts that there is minimal public participation and involvement partly because communities are not informed timeously when meetings are going to be held.

5.6 POLITICS AND NAME CHANGE

Birkland (2005:185) argues that the compliance problem arises when there is a conflict of interest between implementation agencies and politicians and that the features of the political system and the policy process that make deciding to do something so difficult also influences policy implementation. Further, these features also influence the perception of policy success and failure (Birkland, 2005:189). The implementation of this policy is influenced strongly by politics. As mentioned in this study, public policy is political in nature and is driven by politics. This does not necessarily mean that politicians can just implement

policies without applying necessary procedures and guidelines as outlined in policy and law. Politicians and administrators still need to follow and apply the set law or guidelines. As Birkland (2005:179) argues, the choice of policy tools both influences implementation and is influenced by implementation. Birkland adds that the choices of tools and implementation design reinforce each other throughout the implementation process, as more is learned about the success or failure of various tools and their implementation.

Implementers must take into consideration what is outlined in the tools and comply when implementing policy to avoid neglecting important guidelines set down in the policy on geographical names change. Failure to do so has led to many protests and court cases such as in Makhado/Louis Trichardt in the case referred to previously. As Birkland (2005) concludes, policy makers and the various advocacy groups involved in policy domain will continue to debate not only the underlying rationale for policy, but the methods by which the policy is put into effect. Hanekom (1987) argues that policies are not made merely to keep policy makers busy or to pay lip-service to society's demand that something must be done to alleviate problems or to realize a desirable future state of affairs. Hanekom adds that policies receive meaning only when implemented.

As regards the implementation of policy on geographical names change, politicians are not following the law and guidelines to the letter. As demonstrated in the case study, names are imposed on the communities rather than communities proposing names that they can identify with. This does not in any way suggest that officials should not propose names but it simply means that a proposed name should go through the process of public consultation in order to get ownership from the community. Rephrasing it differently, all interested parties in policy implementation, including politicians, should follow the procedures and processes as per

tools of implementation. As stated by Interviewees no. 1, 2, 5, 6, 8 and 9 names that are given are politicians' names belonging to the ANC.

5.7 PROCEDURES AND PRINCIPLES FOR CHANGING GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES

It emerged in this study that the procedures set out in the Act and policy documents developed by Mogale City are not followed to the letter. For instance, the community is not given notices either in local newspapers or at the site where new names are to be erected so that they are aware of what is happening. Secondly, during name change processes the community is not given a notice that the meeting that is to be held will discuss name/s that are to be changed. This gives only a few people the opportunity to be involved and to contribute to name change. If members of the community are not prepared when they come to meetings where they are going to discuss names, it means they cannot do research of their own of the procedures and even of names that they could propose, thereby giving those few who knew that names change was part of the agenda advantage to sway the meeting in order to adopt their proposed names.

In addition, proposed names are not published for comment in local newspapers or in the form of pamphlets. Therefore the community members cannot make a contribution and ultimately buy into the proposed name/s. This situation leads to some community members seeing this process of name change as a tool used by few politically connected individuals to name places after their friends and comrades.

Furthermore, the procedures set out in a document named *Mogale City Geographical Committee* dated 30 October 2007, are not followed. Among them is that names should be referred to the mayoral committee to check compliance with the SAGNC principles and policies. This is not taking

place. If it is taking place there are no records to prove that. Once the mayoral committee has satisfied themselves that a proposed name complies with principles and policies of SAGNC, it (the name) must be referred to the municipality council, but this is not happening. If it is happening, there are no records to support that assertion.

5.8 ANALYSING TRENDS IN IMPLEMENTATION OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES CHANGE

With all outlined problems and challenges in implementation of the policy on geographical names change, Mogale City is doing something to try to implement this policy but this is still far below expectations. Firstly, of four local municipalities it is only Mogale City that has a committee established. Therefore the intention is there in Mogale City but the intention alone is not enough to implement this policy. Mogale City has to do much more to make sure that the policy is implemented successfully. For instance, the MC-LGNC should be provided with resources to perform their task effectively and efficiently. This point applies not only to Mogale City but across Gauteng Province and the country as a whole, as this study quoted cases elsewhere such as Makhado/Louis Trichardt. Manthata (2008) cites Manerstein-Bail *et al* (2004) who argue that enhanced management systems, human resources capacity, transparent administration and financial systems are also critical elements of ensuring proper implementation.

It further emerged in this study that other trends that were seen developing in implementation of this policy are that there is high usage of politicians names, especially from the ANC. This is actually happening across the country, Mogale City included. Interviewee no. 10 argues that names that are important to other communities are seldom considered, and mainly ANC names prevail. Interviewee no.9 observed that “There is high usage of of political heroes, especially the same names here in Mogale City.”

Interviewee no. 9 further raised the point that those who have money and are not willing to accept changes, take geographical names change committees and municipalities to court. Litigation by unhappy community members is one of the trends developing in implementation of this policy which means that there are problems of implementation.

In Mogale City there is non-compliance in terms of procedures and legislation governing this policy. This trend does not only apply in Mogale City but across the country. Through court cases that are ongoing and in most cases with people who take municipalities to court, winning their cases (as in Makhado/Louis Trichardt), it is clear that there is a problem of implementation of this policy.

5.9 ANALYSING THE DEBATE ON COSTS OF CHANGING GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES

The researcher considered the debate from two perspectives. One is the monetary costs to complete the process of name change and the other is the cost of not changing the names deemed offensive and unacceptable to other sections of the population.

Firstly, the question of monetary costs is valid only in respect of other priority service delivery targets. That is as far as this debate can go but not that the country cannot budget for it or does not have resources to implement the policy. That will be a flawed debate that will not stand up to scrutiny, and the recommendation is therefore to prioritize but implement.

Secondly, the cost of not changing names that are seen by sections of the country as derogatory, reminding them of the past system of government is much more costly than monetary value. This will affect what the country stands for, which is reconciliation and building an inclusive, united society. The researcher asserts that this is the cost this country cannot afford not

to afford. This policy has to be implemented but according to the procedures and legislation, since any deviation from following these procedures could bring divisions rather than reconciliation as envisaged by the policy.

5.10 CONCLUSION

Chapter five analyzed themes that emerged during data collection, which were presented in this study. The analysis is anchored in the challenges in implementation of policy on geographical names change. The institutional challenges such as lack of support for these institutions were analyzed. The national Department of Arts and Culture is not adequately monitoring implementation of the policy, consequently the provinces are not monitoring municipalities. It is almost that implementation of this policy is at the discretion of municipalities. An example of this is the fact that in WRDM, Mogale City is the only local municipality that has the LGNC and the other three local municipalities in the same district do not have such committees.

This chapter analyzed trends in implementation of this policy. There are court cases going on around the country which allude to problems in implementation of the policy. The cases are not about the policy as such but in the manner or in the process of implementation.

In addition, the issues of procedures in implementation of this policy were analyzed. In Mogale City the analysis centred around the involvement of the community and public participation in the process of names change. This issue is a catalyst in implementation of the policy. Court cases emanate from insufficient public participation and involvement. Although there are no court cases in Mogale City, it clear that as soon as this process moves to contested areas like Krugersdorp city centre, there are going to be contestations that will lead to court cases. At the moment, the

names given to newly developed areas are not highly contested. This study showed that few people were part of the process and not the majority of communities that are affected. Again, these areas are not highly contested as they are areas occupied by a single race in this case black people as opposed to the city centre where there are mixed races.

Finally, political will and politics involved in the implementation of this policy were analyzed in this chapter, including the role of political principals in constantly trying to influence the direction of the names that have to be changed, or new settlements that have to be named.

The next chapter deals with the conclusion and summary of the study, recommendations as well as areas of further research.

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUSION, SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 INTRODUCTION

The geographical names change policy aims to restore names that were lost due to the apartheid system of government where communities' names were incorrectly spelt or names that did not resonate with the communities were imposed on them. In some instances, these imposed names were derogatory. Implementation of this policy, given the background of this country, requires implementers to be sensitive and always follow the procedures laid out in the Act.

This study attempted to answer the primary question of how implementers of policy on geographical names change preserve the original intentions expressed in this policy when implementing the policy. This chapter provides conclusions and a summary of policy implementation challenges at local government. This study further discusses factors that influence whether implementation of policy is successful or not.

The operations of the LGNC as the implementation agency are crucial in the success of this policy, more so because any public policy depends on local government to be implemented successfully. Local government as the immediate sphere of government to the people should have systems in place to facilitate implementation of public policies.

The study further noted that implementation of policy on geographical names change is complex and is not given the attention it should receive. The South African Geographical Names Council Act No. 118 of 1998 came into effect, but in 2010 there are still municipalities that have not yet

established their LGNC which means zero percentage implementation in some municipalities.

In municipalities where there is attempt to implement this policy, the study found that implementation is a highly contested area.

6.2 SUMMARY OF CHAPTERS

In chapter one, the study introduced the background and the context of the geographical names change policy. Standardization of names as a mandate of the SAGNC was discussed and the argument for the process outlined. This chapter further delineated the problem statement, purpose of the study, and outlined the deployment of the study.

Chapter two started with various authors' definitions of implementation as one of the steps in the cycle of policy. The point made was also that this implementation has been neglected until 1973 when Pressman and Wildavsky produced literature on implementation. Before that, policy makers thought that as long as the policy is formulated everything will go smoothly, including implementation. This study showed that twenty-seven years after Pressman and Wildavsky produced literature on implementation, this step in the policy cycle is still a problem as expressed in data presentation and analysis chapters.

The chapter discussed factors that affect the success of implementation of public policy. The issue of unsuccessful versus non-implementation of policy were discussed with Mogale City as a focus, and it emerged that the policy on geographical names change was unsuccessfully implemented in Mogale City. The implementation approaches of bottom-up and top-down were analyzed with bottom-up approach being seen to bring more results during implementation.

In addition, the chapter looked at issues of identity and reconciliation as forming part of the objectives of the policy implementation.

Chapter three sketched a number of factors within the research that outlined qualitative research methodology as the most suitable way of addressing the question for this study. The chapter also reflected on data collection and case study design and interviews with selected individuals. The process of data analysis, using triangulation and data reduction with emerging themes during data collection, was used.

Chapter four developed more detailed information from secondary documents and collected data using interviews to present findings on the topic of the study. The findings based on problem statement and primary question were presented. The chapter presented debates on the cost of implementation of policy on geographical names change. The vital issue of community involvement in deciding on geographical names was extensively dealt with in this chapter. In addition, public meetings/public participation was highlighted as a crucial step in implementation of public policy.

Chapter four further highlighted the importance of following the set-out procedures when names are changed or new names are given to newly established features. The institutional arrangement vital to facilitate successful implementation of the policy was investigated in this chapter.

Chapter five analyzed the findings including the structures established to implement the programme and their capacity to do so. The chapter analyzed debates on costs involved in changing names. The issue here was whether the funding used for changing names could be used somewhere else in pressing matters of service delivery. The question of political will in ensuring implementation of the policy was discussed.

The chapter further analyzed the shortcomings identified in implementation of the policy on geographical names change in Mogale City. The trends in implementation of this policy were discussed.

6.3 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

6.3.1 Public Involvement

Even though the administrative staff members of the Mogale City municipality who were interviewed claimed that public involvement is happening when names are changed or new names are proposed and given to new settlements, it is clear from the data collected from the majority of interviewees that this is not the case. Out of ten people interviewed, only two Mogale City officials and one member of the committee said the community is involved in implementation of the policy on geographical names change.

As Maree (2010) argues, that analysis establishes how participants make meaning of a specific phenomenon by analyzing their perceptions, attitudes, understanding, knowledge, values, feelings and experiences in an attempt to approximate their construction of the phenomenon. Given what Maree is saying, the researcher analyzed the views expressed by the officials and the member of the committee who said there was community involvement, and came to the determination that the two officials saw their role as to defend the municipality and not to criticize it. The member of the committee who concurred with the officials saw that he has to defend the municipality. Furthermore there was contradiction in his responses as later having said that the community was participating, and that he recommends that the public should be involved if this policy is to be implemented successfully.

Seven of the participants/interviewees clearly stated that there was no community involvement in implementation of the policy. Their argument was that only a few ANC “comrades” decided on the names and not the community. Njomane (2009) notes that this can be explained by the desire of local elites to monopolize power and their hostility towards widespread participation. He further cites Clapper (1993) who argues that this has always been an attempt on their part to implement top-down strategies, which does not enjoy much popular support. In Mogale City it is clear that the approach to implementation of the policy is top-down rather than bottom-up. This poses a problem because there is no commitment from the community.

6.3.2 Politics of Name Change

Implementation of this policy is dogged by politics. Political forces that shape policy design also greatly influence policy implementation (Peters *et al*, 2003). In addition, these bureaucratic and interest group forces influence the design and implementation of administrative rules for carrying out policies (Peters *et al*, 2003). In Mogale City, the new names that are given to the streets of new settlements are names of politicians especially, from former ANC councillors. The same names are repeatedly used in the new settlements and this phenomenon renders the process of naming useless as at the end of the process a former ANC councillor’s name will emerge. In all the new names in Mogale City thus far, it is only politicians names belonging to the ANC that are recommended, and there are no names from politicians of other parties.

In one instance, the councillors of the ANC named streets after themselves even though the Act clearly states that preferably names should be of the people who have passed on to avoid future embarrassment.

6.3.3 Procedures and Principles of Naming and Renaming Features

Mogale City Is facing challenges in implementing policy on geographical names change. The procedures and principles that are contained in the Act and Mogale City Local Municipality streets and public places naming policy are not followed. For instance, one of the requirements after a name is proposed is that a public notice has to be placed in mass media inviting comments and informing the public of the intention. Clearly this does not happen in Mogale City. In addition there should be sufficient consultation by including all segments within the affected community and the affected space. Again this does not take place in Mogale City. Instead consultation is confined to a few individuals which is evidenced by the same names recurring every time places or streets have to be named.

Furthermore, comments stemming from a public meeting discussing names should be in written form. The study found that there were no records of written comments as evidence as required by the policy. The policy requires that if a name of a personality is used, consultation with the family is required and a written consent must be attached to the application form. In Mogale City, in all the proposed names there is not a single written letter of consent from family members of the person whose name is proposed to be used.

6.3.4 Structural Arrangements

The institution tasked by the Act to facilitate the implementation of the policy on geographical names change did not give this process the necessary attention that it requires. Peters *et al* (2003) argue that one of the ingredients in the policy design mix is the role of oversight in correcting difficulties that occur in implementing a policy. There is no monitoring and evaluation of implementation of the policy from national government

(Department of Arts and Culture/SAGNC) to determine how provincial structures are performing. Provincial government/PGNC does not monitor and evaluate implementation of the policy at local government level/LGNC. Therefore, implementation of this policy is left to chance.

Hanekom (1987) argues that the problem with public policy is that it only specifies some steps of implementation and therefore it leaves implementation to implementers or simply to chance. Hanekom adds that relatively few policies stipulate exactly how implementation should be effected and it is often left to the discretion of the policy implementer to decide on the executive, administrative and operational steps to be taken to implement the policy. Manthata (2008) argues that policy implementation in South Africa is influenced by a variety of factors, particularly policy objectives, communication, the implementers and the nature and operations of the implementation agency. Peters *et al* (2003) argue that politics shapes choices about policy instruments and implementation structures.

The institutions that are given the responsibility to implement this policy are failing to do so effectively. Hanekom (1987) concludes that it should be accepted that during the implementation process problems could emerge because of too much or too little information, insufficient resources, unsuitable institutions, or inadequate control measures.

6.3.5 Trends in Implementation

It emerged that implementation of the policy on geographical names change is riddled with litigation and protests. The trend is that in many municipalities, local geographical names committees are not implementing the policy according to the procedures set out in the Act. This study recommends that LGNCs should be fully capacitated so that they can

advise municipalities and communities on proper implementation of the policy.

6.4 RECOMMENDATIONS

Policy implementation can be improved and enhanced by sufficient communication between implementers and policy makers to avoid areas of misunderstanding. The communication includes writing policies in accessible language so that implementers are clear about what the policy requires. The people that the policy is aimed at can also understand it more easily. As Peters *et al* (2003) state, the process of policy design and implementation is not simply one of assembling parts and plugging in an implementation machinery.

6.4.1 Sufficient Consultation

The notice convening meetings for geographical names change should be issued at least seven days before the meeting and should be advertised widely in the area affected. There should be sufficient consultation, including with the minority groupings within the affected communities. The proposed name should be placed on public notices on site and in prominent and other strategic positions like schools, clinics, and libraries for 28 days from the first date of publication of the advertisement at centres easily accessible to the public for further comments from the wider public. There should also be public awareness programmes on public involvement in community programmes, and meetings convened, especially at local government level.

6.4.2 Awareness Policy

The municipality should run educational tours in the communities, use local newspapers, radio, and distribute pamphlets in different local languages, to make communities aware of this policy, so that when it is implemented it is not resisted. With regard to education, ward councillors can be used to assist the municipality. The policy should be widely communicated.

In addition, a focused drive to inform public of the purpose and procedures around names change should be undertaken by the municipality. This drive should include how to complete application forms and ensure that paperwork is done correctly.

6.4.3 Records

Mogale City Local Municipality should keep records in a proper well co-ordinated manner so that if and when the public require them they can easily be accessed. The issue of office space comes in here or at least cupboards or shelves that can be dedicated to the MC-LGNC.

6.4.4 Implementing Agencies

The national government, with the Department of Arts and Culture as the representative in implementation of the Act, should devise monitoring and evaluation tools to track the progress in implementation but more importantly to make sure that this is not only policy on paper but can be implemented. The SAGNC should develop mechanisms to monitor and evaluate the implementation progress of the PGNC and the PGNC should do the same at the LGNC. The work of the SAGNC should form part of

performance assessment of the Minister of Arts and Culture and the provincial member of executive council (MEC) responsible for Arts and Culture should account on the work of the PGNC. At local government level, the MC-LGNC should be given the department that will account and the working of the committee should form part of annual performance assessment of the department responsible.

Ward councillors, once elected, should always serve the whole community of the particular ward not only their political party, so that in the names change process they should be objective and allow the community to choose the name they want.

6.4.5 Provision of Resources

There should be resources set aside for different implementing agencies at different levels, especially at local level which is the heart of implementation of public policy. In Mogale City, the LGNC does not have office space and other resources to implement the policy successfully. This situation should be improved. The MC-LGNC should be provided with office space and a budget allocation in in the municipality budget.

6.4.6 Role of Politicians

The excessive use of politicians' names should be reduced, more so in Mogale City where the over-use of ANC politicians' names should be minimized to accommodate politicians of other parties, names of fauna and flora, or natural features like landscapes. The process of naming and renaming should be transparent so that all concerned can be involved and there can be a reduction in litigation by unhappy members of various communities.

6.5 POLICY IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS

Policy will not implement itself, it needs the efforts of leaders (Colebatch, 1998). The leaders of government should be willing to support the implementers of policy. These leaders. among others, should ensure that the aims and end results of policy are clear to avoid unnecessary ambiguity. Secondly, there should be very clear performance indicators that can be monitored and evaluated. In addition, there should be sufficient financial resources for implementation of policy to take place.

6.6 CONCLUSION

Although policy-making and policy implementation are two distinct and distinguishable functions, they are so closely inter-related that separating them is difficult, if not impossible or impracticable. For example the way policies are interpreted and translated into action could have important policy implications (Hanekom, 1987). Therefore, activities of making and implementing public policy are inseparably linked and integrated. This study proved that although the purpose and intentions of policy makers of geographical names change are well-intended, implementation is a huge challenge. This impediment is brought about by the fact that implementation is left to chance rather than co-ordinated through an implementation strategy with monitoring and evaluation as part of policy development and implementation.

In addition, the institutions that are meant to implement this policy should be capacitated and given legislated powers and financial muscle to implement the policy accordingly. The nature of the institution and its capacity is crucial for it to carry out its mandate. At present, the SAGNC, PGNCs and LGNCs are at the mercy of government departments for financial support and functionality. Given the importance of the process of geographical names change in this country, the government should look at

establishing an independent structure that can monitor and evaluate implementation of this policy. Such a structure could be appointed for a period of five years and thereafter an evaluation conducted to assess whether its mandate should be extended.

Furthermore, this study noted that implementation of this policy is a highly contested area. It has become clear that the terrain of implementing this policy has become a political game where political parties battle for power. This power struggle at times compromises proper implementation of policy, where procedures and principles are compromised or simply ignored.

In addition, public participation at local municipality level is very important and it cannot be avoided any longer. The municipalities should prioritize this aspect if any of the community projects including name change is to succeed. The municipal officials should be informed and taught about the benefits of community involvement and participation in all municipality programmes.

This study further noted that there is a schism between policy development and implementation. This has affected the successful implementation of the policy. Due to lack of clearly defined systems of monitoring and evaluation of implementation of this policy, the policy is more divisive than reconciliatory as was envisaged by policy makers.

Lastly, there should be more studies conducted on this policy and how it can be implemented successfully. Further issues like whether this policy is bringing the envisaged results should be investigated to further develop it and improve its implementation.

REFERENCES

Badenhorst, C. (2008). *Dissertation writing - A research journey*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Bates, D.L and Eldredge, D.L. (1980). *Strategy and Policy. Analysis, Formulation and Implementation*. Wm. C Brown Company Publishers.

Bourner, T. (1996). The research process: Four steps to success, in Greenfield, T. (ed.), *Research Methods: guidance for postgraduates.* London: Arnold. London.

Brightman, R.W, Luskin, B.J and Tilton, T. (1968).*Data Processing for Decision-making.* An Introduction to Third-Generation Information Systems. New York: Macmillan Publishing.

Bruce, C.S. (1994). "Supervising literature reviews" in Zuber-Skerritt, O. and Ryan, Y. (eds).*Quality in postgraduate education.* London: Kogan Page.

Case No.2007/SCA 44 RSA (The Chairpersons Association v Minister of Arts and Culture) Makhado v Louis Trichardt.

City of Johannesburg (2007). Policy on the Naming and Renaming of Streets and other Public Places. 2nd Revision. August.

Cloete, F., Wissink, H. and de Coning, C. (2004). *Improving Public Policy. From Theory to Practice.* Second Edition. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Colebatch, H.K. (1998). *Concepts in the social sciences policy.* London: Open University Press.

Concise Gazetteer of South Africa. 1994.

Cooper, H.M. (1988). *The structure of knowledge synthesis in society*, Vol. 1, at http://www.deakin.edu.au/library/findout/research/litrev.php (accessed on 29/12/2010).

Deaux, K. (2001). *Encyclopaedias of women and gender,* Vol. 1 and 2. New York. Academic Press, from www.utexas.edu/courses/stross/ant3936_files/ARTICLES/identity.pdf

Department of Arts and Culture. (2002). Handbook on Geographical Names Change. Second Edition.

Fairclough, N. (1993). *Analysing Discourse. Textual analysis for social research.* New York: Routledge.

Flick, U. (2002). *An Introduction to Qualitative Research.* Second Edition. London: Sage Publications.

Gupta, D.K. (2001). *Analyzing Public Policy. Concepts, Tools and Techniques.* Washington: CQ Press.

Hamrell, S. (Ed.) 1989). Development Dialogue. A journal of international development cooperation. Uppsala: Dag Hammarskjold Foundation.

Hill, M. (2005). *The Public Policy Process.* Fourth edition. England: Pearson Education Limited.

Hill, M. and Hupe, P. (2002). *Implementing Public Policy.* London: Sage Publications.

Hogwood, B.W. and Gunn, L.A. (1984). *Policy analysis for the real world.* New York: Oxford University Press.

http://www.dac.gov.za/projects/heritage/geographicalnames/procedures.htm

Jenkins, E. (2007*). Falling into place. The Modern South African Place Names.* Claremont: David Philip Publishers.

Jenkins E.R. (1996). *Changing Place Names*. Durban: Indicator Press.

Kay, A. (2006). *The Dynamics of Public Policy. Theory and Evidence.* Massachussets: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

Lee, R.M. (1993). *Doing Research on Sensitive Topics.* Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.

Leedy, P. (1993). *Practical Research*, *Planning and design.* Fifth edition. New York: Merrill Prentice Hall.

Manthata, M.A (2008). *Policy Implementation Challenges of the Community Development Workers Programme in Gauteng.* Unpublished thesis. Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Maree, J.G (2010). *First Steps in Research.* Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Maskin, E. And Sjostrom, T. (2001). *Implementation Theory.* Accessed at http://econ.la.psu.edu/papers/jts

Mazmanian, D.A and Sabatier, P.A. (1989). *Implementation and Public Policy with a new postscript.* New York: University Press of America.

McBurney D.H.and White, T.L. (2007). *Research Methods.* Seventh Edition. New York: Thompson Wadsworth.

Merriam, S.B. (2002). *Qualitative Research in Practice: examples of discussion and analysis.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Matthew, M. and Huberman, M. (1984). *Qualitative Data Analysis. A Source Book of New Methods.* New Delhi: SAGE Publications.

Mogale City Department of Corporate Affairs. (2007). Mogale City Geographical Names Committee. Policy Document. 30 October 2007.

Mogotsi, C. (2007). “City rings in changes”. In *Dikgang Tsa Mogale,* Mogale City.

Moursund, J.P. (1973). *Evaluation*: *An Introduction to Research Design*. Monterey, California: Brooks/Cole Publishing Company.

Neuman, W.L. (2006). *Social Research Methods*. *Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches.* Sixth Edition. New York. University of Wisconsin.

Njomana A. (2009). *A Sociological Study of Public Involvement in Decision Making, With Reference To The Re-Naming of the City of*

*Pretoria (*Unpublished dissertation). Johannesburg: University of Johannesburg.

O'Sullivan T. (1994). *Research interviews*. New York: De Montfort University Library.

Peters, B.G. and Pierre, J. (2003). *Handbook of Public Administration.* London: Sage Publications.

Pierce, R. (2008). *Research Methods in Politics. A practical guide.* Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.

Pressman, J.L. and Wildavsky, A. (1973). *Implementation.* Third Edition. Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Relph, E. C**.** (1976). *Place and placelessness***.** London: Pion**.**

Rubin, H.J. and Rubin I.S. (2005). *Qualitative Interviewing*. *The art of hearing data.* Second Edition. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.

Sapsford, R. and Jupp, V. (2006). *Data Collection and Analysis.* Second Edition. London: Sage Publications.

Shafritz, J.M., Layne, K.S. and Borick, C.P. (2005). *Classics of Public Policy*. New York: Pearson Incorporated.

Department of Arts and Culture. (2002). *South African Geographical Names Council Booklet.* Second Edition. South Africa.

Sokana, P. (2008). "Eastern Cape Place Names Get The Chop". *City Press,* 9 November.

Tebogo, M. (2008). "New Names, So What?". *The Sowetan,* 21 October.

Welman, J.C. and Kruger S.J. (1999). *Research Methodology for the business and administrative sciences*. London: Thomson Publishers.

APPENDIX

INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

1. What is your understanding of the implementation process of policy on geographical names change in Mogale City?

2. Is the community in Mogale City participating in public meetings where proposals for a name or names to be changed are discussed? Explain.

3. How did the Mogale City municipality involve public in the process of name change?

4. How would you describe the present status of implementation of the policy on geographical names change in Mogale City? Explain.

5. What are factors leading to problems if any that are experienced in implementation of the policy on Geographical names change in Mogale City?

6. Why in your view are there so many court cases pertaining to implementation of this Policy?

7. What are some of the trends provincially and nationally in implementation of the policy on Geographical names change?

8. Do you think that the Mogale City Local Municipality names change committee is leading implementation of this policy according to the way it is supposed to? Explain.

9. Do you think the local municipality is doing what it is supposed to do in terms of the legislation in implementing this policy? Explain.

10. In your view is the implementation of this policy in Mogale City done in accordance with the legislation governing it? Explain.

11. Is the Mogale City Local Geographical Names Committee competent to implement this policy? Explain

12. Would you say the implementation of this policy in Mogale City is successful or not? Explain.

13. What would you say should be done if any to ensure successful implementation of the policy on geographical names change in Mogale City?

14. Are there any lessons that can be learnt from other municipalities that can assist in implementing this policy in Mogale City?