

**Foundation Phase reading materials: what do
commercial publishers and educational NGOs offer
African language speakers?**

A research report submitted to the School of Literature, Language and Media, Faculty of
Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of Master of Arts in Publishing Studies

Gugulethu N. Baloyi
482046

Supervisors: Professor Yvonne Reed and Colleen Dawson

DECLARATION

I _____ (student number: _____) am a student registered for the degree of _____ in the academic year _____.

I hereby declare the following:

- I am aware that plagiarism, that is the use of someone else's work without their permission and/or without acknowledging the original source, is wrong.
- I confirm that the work submitted for assessment for the above degree is my own unaided work except where I have explicitly indicated otherwise.
- This work has not been submitted for any other degree or examination at any other university or institution.
- I understand that the University of the Witwatersrand may take disciplinary action against me if there is a belief that this is not my own unaided work or that I have failed to acknowledge the source of the ideas or words in my writing.

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Abstract

This study has aimed to investigate what reading materials commercial publishers and education NGOs currently offer to Foundation Phase learners in the nine official African languages and also the extent to which these materials are marketed and made available to the general public by the publishers. It has been guided by two research questions. The first is as follows: What is available for early readers (learners) to read in their home languages? This question seeks to address the issue of what kind of reading material is available for Foundation Phase learners to use in early literacy, in the nine indigenous South African languages, ranging from readers, to fictional and non-fiction information books which are likely to develop their interest in reading and their literacy skills. In addition to what is available for learners, the second main question is: How do people find out about materials that are being published? How are the materials being marketed by the publishers? Who knows about them and how do they know about them? How would people get access to the materials if they wished to purchase them?

The study is in two parts. The first part involved a survey of published reading materials and the second part was a personal investigation of accessibility, in terms of ease or difficulty of finding and/or purchasing these reading materials.

One of the main findings is that outside the mainstream educational publishers there is reluctance on the part of many publishers to publish texts in African languages for young readers. At present, much of the reading material published by the mainstream educational publishers for Foundation Phase readers conforms to the requirements of the CAPS curriculum. The limited variety may discourage children from reading in their home languages. The limited availability to the general public of existing texts in African languages is another of the key findings of this study and the lack of information about freely available texts is third. One encouraging development is that education NGOs are finding creative ways to make interesting texts available to young readers in a range of languages.

Keywords: Foundation Phase reading materials; African languages; commercial publishers; NGO publishers; availability of texts

Dedication

For Manyani Maseko and Modjadji Lekota. Thank you for always taking care of me, your endless love and support were my motivation to complete this report. I will be forever grateful to you.

Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to thank the NRF for generously funding my research report.

I would like to thank my mother and brother who kept me going even when I had nothing left in me to keep fighting to finish this report.

I would also like to thank my supervisors without whom I would not have been able to do the impossible. Colleen and Yvonne, you were really patient with me and very encouraging.

Thank you for understanding my needs and accommodating me at all times. If it were not for you I would still be stuck with half a research proposal.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1 Introduction	1
Background to the study	1
Research questions	2
Chapter 2 Literature review	4
2.1 Language and education policies past and present – the consequences for young learners	4
2.2 Value of learning to read in a language familiar to you	5
2.3 Challenges for publishers	7
2.4 Translation	9
Chapter 3 Methodology	11
3.1 Collecting data for Part 1 of the study	11
3.2 Collecting data for Part 2 of the study	13
3.3 Data analysis	14
Chapter 4 Presentation of survey findings	16
4.1 Part 1 Survey of publications	16
4.1.1 Commercial educational publishers	16
4.1.2 Trade publishers	22
4.1.3 NGO educational publishers	26
4.1.4 Mixed publishers	28
4.1.5 Other publishers	29
4.1.6 Summary of survey	31
4.1.7 Key findings	32
4.2 Publishers' website information and availability of publishers' books	33
4.2.1 Commercial educational publishers	33
4.2.2 Trade publishers	39
4.2.3 NGO educational publishers	42
4.2.4 Mixed publishers	44
4.2.5 Other publishers	45
4.2.6 Summary of website and availability survey	47
4.3 Discussion	48
4.3.1 Dominance of commercial educational publishers, followed by education NGOs, in the publishing of Foundation Phase texts in African languages	48
4.3.2 Contrasting publishing practices of smaller and larger trade publishers	49
4.3.3 Types of reading material published in African languages	49
4.3.4 The least and most published languages	50
4.3.5 Translation versus origination of texts in African languages	51
4.3.6 Publishers' policies	51
4.3.7 Availability of texts	52
Chapter 5 Conclusions and recommendations	54
5.1 Main findings and recommendations in response to them	54
5.2 Limitations of the study and recommendations for further research	54
Reference list	56

Chapter 1 Introduction

Background to the study

I grew up in a home where the languages we spoke were Xitsonga and IsiZulu. There were very few books for children in these languages and the situation was not much better at school. In grades 1 to 3, while I was learning to read, the only materials available were in English, and there were one or two books in Xitsonga that were catechism books provided by the church I went to. This is one example of the struggles that some South African children had to go through whilst learning how to read.

This study has aimed to investigate what reading materials commercial publishers, trade publishers and educational NGOs currently offer to Foundation Phase learners in African languages. The terms commercial educational publishers, trade publishers and NGO educational publishers will be explained in detail in Chapter 4 of this research report. Foundation Phase refers to Grades 1 to 3, whilst African languages refers to languages spoken on the African continent, and this includes South Africa's nine official indigenous languages (Department of Basic Education, 2013). The term African languages will be used throughout this report to refer to these languages.

In choosing this topic I would like to identify the types of materials that are published by commercial and educational NGO publishers for Foundation Phase learners in the African languages. In my investigation of these reading materials my main focus is on the kinds of reading materials that are available to African Foundation Phase learners in their home languages, and also the extent to which these materials are marketed and made available to the general public by the publishers.

One of the reasons for embarking on this particular study is that I have an interest in the role that publishers can play in contributing to literacy and education in South Africa. I am particularly interested in whether or not African learners have opportunities to learn how to read and develop their literacy levels in the languages in which they communicate at home.

The Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement CAPS document (Department of Basic Education 2011) makes provision for reading in all the official languages and does not limit literacy to English and Afrikaans. CAPS has encouraged the publication of materials in African languages on a wider scale than in the past. I had first assumed that book publishing for the African languages had been left to the commercial educational publishers, and that they are the only ones that publish reading materials for learners. However, I have established that some education NGOs are key players in the publishing of Foundation Phase texts.

Vula Bula is a reading project that is run by Molteno, a non-profit language and literacy organization. Vula Bula's main aim is to provide African language graded reading texts that will appeal to early, emergent and fluent readers, not only visually but also through language that is simple (Vula Bula, n.d). Vula Bula does this by taking into account the agglutinating structure of the different African

languages, and by so doing, builds on the different language orthographies to create texts that are simple enough for emergent readers to grasp and at the same time develop their reading skills (Vula Bula, n.d). The work done by Vula Bula is important because it takes into consideration the nature of each language and strives to provide reading materials that will enhance the literacy abilities of the readers as well as remaining true to the structure and nature of each African language.

My other reason for choosing this research has to do with my interest in the literacy of young children whose home language/s is one or more of the African languages in South Africa. I would like to find out whether or not they have opportunities to learn how to read and develop their literacy levels by having books and other reading materials developed and available in their home language. If these materials are being published, I am interested in finding out what kinds of materials are being published, who publishes them, how the materials are being marketed and how available they are to the general public.

For example, in IsiZulu, one word could be the equivalent of five words in English, and that alone does not determine the difficulty of reading (Land, 2016). English and IsiZulu have different orthographies –the spelling system of a language- and the way in which words are processed in each language is different, therefore creating a need for these languages to be taught and learnt according to the different orthographies (Land, 2016). This means that for materials to be developed in the African languages, the different orthographies of each language have to be considered (Land, 2016).

Research Questions

1. What is available for early readers (learners) to read in their home languages? This question seeks to address the issue of what kinds of reading materials are available for Foundation Phase learners to use in early literacy, in the nine indigenous South African languages, ranging from readers, to fictional and non-fiction information books.
2. When one walks into a commercial bookstore at a mall in Johannesburg and goes to the children's section, almost all of the books for Foundation Phase learners are available only in English and Afrikaans. My question above relates to whether the same kinds of reading materials are available in the African languages. So, whether there is a wide range of reading materials available in the nine indigenous languages or not, and of the materials that are available in those languages, are they school readers, fiction or non-fiction information books?
3. Of the materials that are available in the African languages, which were originated in that particular language and which were originated in English or Afrikaans, or any other language that is not one of the nine African languages of South Africa? This question is important because it is possible that even though there are materials available for the age range 6-9 years old in isiZulu, the language of origination may be English; which raises other kinds of

issues such as cultural appropriateness and level of difficulty because literal translation from English into IsiZulu, for example, may involve using words that are too long and difficult for beginner readers to process.

4. In addition to what is available for learners another question is, how do people find out about materials that are being published?

Chapter 2 Literature review

This review is in four sections. Section 2.1 is a review of language and education policies past and present and the consequences of these for young learners. Section 2.2 is on the value of learning to read in a familiar language. In sections 2.3 and 2.4 the focus shifts to the challenges faced by publishers and the challenges of translation.

2.1 Language and education policies past and present – the consequences for young learners

The educational system in South Africa was historically engineered to benefit English-speaking – then later Afrikaans-speaking – individuals. This was done not only by excluding Africans from quality schooling but by also systematically ensuring their non-participation through the language policies adopted (Chisholm, 2005). The lack of investment in schooling for black learners contributed to low literacy levels, low school-completion rates, sub-par quality of teaching as well as the unavailability of different types of resources for learners (Chisholm, 2005).

The apartheid government carried on the legacy of white supremacy and black inferiority by making sure that schooling for ‘black’ and ‘white’ children was different. One of the ways in which this was done was through unequal spending on education for black and white children, the white schools getting the greater share of the spending (Chisholm, 2005).

Central to the Bantu education system that was introduced by HF Verwoerd in 1953, was the stipulation that the mother tongue of black learners be used as the medium of instruction in schools, even though there was very little investment in developing materials for language and literacy teaching and learning (Macdonald, 1991).

Mpe and Seeber(2000), do note however, that even though apartheid laws were unequal, the Bantu Education Act did make space for African language publishing by establishing language boards to develop the African languages whilst recommending books to be used in the education department for Africans. Mpe and Seeber also note that whilst it is important to recognize what the apartheid government was doing in terms of African languages and education, it must also be noted that while there was progress in African language publishing for education, the themes and messages that were being published and recommended for education purposes were severely limited (Mpe & Seeber, 2000). The post-apartheid government, in an effort to increase the literacy levels of Africans and offer equal education across all languages and races, introduced laws and policies that aim to promote mother-tongue learning and bilingual education in classrooms across South Africa (Chisholm, 2005).

The Draft National Policy for the Provision and Management of Learning and Teaching Support Material (LTSM) is one of the policies that was introduced by the post-apartheid government in South

Africa as a means of improving access to equal education across the country (Department of Basic Education 2014).

The LTSM policy aims to address the inequalities of the past through the careful selection and production of quality educational materials that will be made available in a national catalogue to be distributed to all public schools (Department of Basic Education 2014). However, there may be a considerable difference between policy and practice, between intention and availability of materials.

From Curriculum 2005 (Department of Education, 1997) to the Revised National Curriculum Statement (Department of Education, 2002) and to the current Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (Department of Basic Education 2011), there have been some changes to the requirements for language learning in Foundation Phase classrooms. The CAPS ‘makes it mandatory that children take and pass two languages as subjects from Grade 1, using the terminology of the curriculum, one as a “home language” and another as a “first additional language”’ (McKinney, 2017:45). This requirement makes it very important that children in Foundation Phase classes have access to reading materials in both languages.

2.2 Value of learning to read in a language familiar to you

Baker (2011), in Edwards and Ngwaru (2011b), states that children who have a solid foundation in literacy in their main language participate well and have more confidence in the classroom, and generally achieve better results than their peers who have had to use an additional language for learning to read. This is not surprising because as pointed out by Macdonald and Burroughs (1991), learning to read is a complex process even in a familiar language as it involves the following:

- recognizing the shapes of the letters,
- pronouncing the sounds associated with these letters, putting the sounds together into words,
- putting the words together to form sentences and then,
- being able to grasp the meaning associated with the sentence (1991: 44).

If you learn to read in a language that you already know you can focus on the skills involved but if you are learning to read in an additional language then you ‘cannot rely on knowing what is being said in the text’ (Macdonald & Burroughs, 1991: 45)

The importance of learning to read in a familiar language is supported by many of the scholars who have contributed to the debates about languages of learning and teaching such as Haidee Kruger, Jim Cummins, Neville Alexander and Elizabeth Pretorius who said ‘In bilingual systems it is, thus, important for learners to develop literacy skills in their home language as a basis for building academic literacy proficiency that can be shared across languages’ (Pretorius, 2014: 54).

Despite the research findings and the various policies on language in South Africa such as the 1997 Language in Education Policy, according to Edwards and Ngwaru (2011a), there is limited provision of materials for young children and for adults who speak some of the ‘smaller’ language such as Tshivenda, Xitsonga and isiNdebele. It is also important to note that when South African children in grades 4 and 5 participated in the international PIRLS tests of reading proficiency in 2006 most performed poorly even though these tests were able to be written in any of the official languages (Howie et al, 2008) and a more recent study by Zimmerman and Smit (2014) established that reading comprehension development remains an issue of great concern. Lack of interesting texts in learners’ main languages, written at an appropriate reading level is likely to contribute to limited reading comprehension. It is also important to note that in addition to the need for interesting texts in learner’s home languages, there is also a need to provide disadvantaged schools with quality reading materials because those are the schools where literacy development requires the most attention (Macdonald: 2002).

Pretorius (2014) says that it is important that children start engaging with literacy from a young age, and that they develop literacy patterns from that young age right through the Foundation Phase in both their home language or languages, and in English. She however, also emphasizes that children who learn how to read in their home language are at an advantage because it is easier to read and write in the language that you are most familiar with (Pretorius, 2014).

Cummins (2007) echoes the statement made by Pretorius above by saying that the home language of a learner is critical to learning a new or additional language because learners’ cognitive abilities rely on prior knowledge, so learning an additional language will be easier if they master what they already know, which is the home language.

The *Stories Across Africa* is a project by The Project for the Study of Alternative Education in South Africa (PRAESA) that aims to produce books across the continent for children to read in their home languages, with interesting stories and equally interesting accompanying visuals (PRAESA, 2004). PRAESA (2004) notes the importance of reading in the home language, and that children in Africa would like to read interesting and entertaining stories in the home languages like children in other parts of the world; and that an initiative like this will hopefully spark interest in publishing in the African languages so that a culture of reading and writing in the African languages will be sustained.

Saide’s African Storybook Initiative also aims to produce books across the continent for children to read in their home languages, with one of its main aims being to produce enough contextually-appropriate books in the African languages for early reading (Welch & Treffry-Goatley, 2016). The work that is being done by the African Storybook Initiative is on the same level as the *Stories Across Africa* project, the difference is that the African Storybook Initiative is producing books on a wider scale and making them available free of charge as open educational resources.

2.3 Challenges for publishers

The Department of Basic Education (DBE) and the Minister of Basic Education, through the National Education Policy Act 1996, have provided standards for the publication of educational material, and only material that adheres to these standards and conforms to the chosen criteria will be selected for the National Catalogue from which schools order materials. The criteria for the LTSM materials mentioned above, as set out by the DBE is that the books must be in compliance with CAPS. This means that the main content, concepts and skills that align with the objectives for a particular subject and grade in the curriculum, should be presented in the materials. In addition, the level of writing should be appropriate for the learners of the intended grade and the text itself should accommodate all learners in a diverse society; and the values and attitudes within the text should be in alignment with those in the South African Constitution of 1996 (Department of Basic Education 2011).

In spite of the efforts of the DBE to ensure that quality educational materials are available to all learners in public schools this has not entirely been the case across the board. In an article about education published in the Mail & Guardian, Bongani Nkosi revealed that there is despondency amongst publishers when it comes to the DBE actually delivering on its promise of quality educational materials. This is because the quality of educational materials that is being produced currently has been compromised by the lack of time that the publishers have to actually produce the materials, with publishers saying that they are being given about three months to publish books that usually take nine months to publish (Nkosi, 2014).

The publishers who were interviewed believed that the DBE knew about the submissions for the whole year but only chose to send out the 'call for submissions' close to the end of the year, giving them not even six weeks to complete manuscripts for books that would be sent for evaluation and hopefully later added to the national catalogue (Nkosi, 2014). The publishers say that even though they would like to produce quality textbooks, and the DBE has set standards for quality textbooks, it is very difficult to submit quality textbooks to the DBE in the limited time that the DBE provides for submission (Nkosi, 2014).

The mission of PRAESA is to develop materials by using minimal input to get maximum output, and that has meant using whatever resources are at their disposal in order to develop materials quickly. The approach taken by PRAESA of using minimal inputs to gain maximum outputs is similar to the approach taken by the DBE, which calls into question the quality of the materials being used and whether these materials can meet the standards set by the DBE (Edwards & Ngwaru, 2011). The current director of PRAESA, Carole Bloch, mentioned that the shift from learning in the home language in the Foundation Phase to English in Grade 4 was harmful to children because in order to learn a language and know it really well, children need at least six to eight years of learning that

language (Bloch, 2012). In addition, she mentioned that if children begin to engage with the print world, it will make reading and writing easier for them, and this begins with developing, publishing and effectively providing storybooks in English and the African languages; which will encourage parents and children to read more and interact more with the world of reading (Bloch, 2012).

Small publishers have expressed commitment to publishing across all the 11 official languages in principle but have found it unrealistic to do so because they do not have the financial means to do so (Edwards & Ngwaru, 2011). At the same time, larger publishers who expressed commitment to publishing across all the 11 official languages have found that the translation process is almost as costly as originating materials in the indigenous languages (Edwards & Ngwaru, 2011). The biggest problem that a lot of publishers face is not the publishing of materials in the indigenous languages; rather, it is the financial risks of publishing in those languages.

The African Storybook Initiative has a different approach to publishing in the African languages by using a digital open license platform that enables Saide to publish books in various languages without having to consider the size of the market and the language of publication, and the books are available for print or download for free (Welch & Treffrey-Goatley, 2016). This means that instead of incurring the added publishing costs of printing and distributing reading materials, there are other methods of distributing reading materials via the internet which is not as costly as printing.

With reference to the languages used to originate texts, Edwards and Ngwaru (2011a) point out that in addition to the issue of the cost of translation, there is also the issue of African authors not writing in an African language. They say that there are only a few authors that write in their mother tongues and that the majority of manuscripts sent to publishers are written in English.

One of the reasons that contemporary African authors prefer to write in English is that their style of writing has been shaped by the colonial history of African authors who often had to oversimplify cultural, social and political concepts because of the tendency of not writing the way they spoke; which ultimately led to them being criticized for producing childish literature (Mpe & Seeber, 2000).

One of the challenges that publishers are faced with when it comes to publishing in the African languages is whether there is a demand for reading materials in the indigenous languages and whether there are enough authors to meet the demand.

In addition to this, there is an overwhelming number of South African parents that would prefer their children to be taught in English because they believe that it is the language of empowerment and will enable their children to participate in the business and economic sectors in future (Jordaan, 2011).

The different stages of standardization of the African languages have made translation more complicated, but there have also been concerns about the development of language and whether one can publish in the indigenous languages considering their differing levels of standardization (Edwards

& Ngwaru, 2011). The Pan South African Language Board (PanSALB), the Department of Arts and Culture (DAC) Terminology Coordination Section Directorate and the various lexicography units are responsible for the development of the indigenous languages in order to keep up with the changing needs of the society as well as to assist with the standardization of these languages yet it is said that the units cannot keep up with the current needs of the publishing industry (Edwards & Ngwaru, 2011).

2.4 Translation

Haidee Kruger (2009) discusses the translation of children's books in South Africa and the impact of those translations on the children's book market and on the African languages. Kruger states that there is a lack of materials in the African languages, and that this lack has left a gaping hole in the market for materials in African languages with the result that people would rather use English than the African languages as a medium of attaining literacy.

Even-Zohar (1990) says that if a literary system within a larger literary hierarchy does not have the resources to compete with its counterparts and is on the periphery of the literary hierarchy, then because of that situation, translated literature will fill the gap. It can be argued that in South Africa the indigenous languages are still on the margins and cannot compete with the larger literary systems such as English and Afrikaans, and because of this, where there is a shortage of literacy materials in the indigenous languages, it will be addressed with translations. The issue of translating literature is not unique to South Africa.

Kruger (2009) further states that as much as there is a "guiding discourse" around publishing in the African languages for educational purposes, there needs to be a discourse that will encourage the publishing and sales of books in the African languages. This means that an intervention is required, from the private, public or both sectors, that will encourage reading in the African languages and as a result will promote the publishing and sales of reading materials in the African languages.

For educational publishers there is an economic reason for publishing the materials, and even though there is still a gap between the number of speakers of the indigenous languages and the number of materials that are published in those languages, that gap is mediated by the publication of educational materials (Kruger, 2009). It is worthwhile investigating the reading materials that are available currently and finding out which materials were originated in the indigenous languages and which were translated.

Publishers have cited economic and market-related reasons for translating books, by saying that it is cheaper to translate books and meet the demands for books in the indigenous languages than it is to originate books in the indigenous languages (Kruger, 2009). So in order to meet the demands for books in indigenous languages that are placed on the publishing industry, it is cheaper for publishers

to translate books that may have already been published in order to meet the demand. Therefore, the translation of children's books is largely attributed to economies of scale.

Kruger (2009) problematizes the translation of children's books from English and Afrikaans into the African languages by saying that even though translation plays a vital part in the production of children's books in the indigenous languages, the mere fact that the books are being translated does not raise the status and use of the languages, rather, that the system of translation serves to continue the marginalization of the indigenous languages by indirectly promoting the writing of books in English and putting aside the origination of books in the indigenous languages. The point put forward by Kruger is that even though translation is required in the production of children's books, in the South African context, too much of it can lead to further marginalization of the very languages whose status and use are being promoted.

Edwards & Ngwaru (2011) express their concern over the "cultural appropriateness of some of the books being translated into African languages". As has been stated above, although translation has been identified as one of the vital points of book production for the indigenous languages, the cultural aspect of the translations has not been addressed. It is not within the scope of the research, but it is worth noting because South Africa is a culturally diverse country, and there is a worry that translation may impact the development of material in the indigenous languages (Edwards & Ngwaru, 2011). The aspect of culture plays an important role in the selection of materials for translation into the African languages, where international books are selected more for their creativity and less for their cultural and social emphasis, whereas, local books are chosen more for their emphasis on social and cultural aspects (Kruger, 2012).

Holmes *et al* (1978) further problematize translation by pointing out that equality of language can never be achieved in translation, no matter how close the languages and cultures are and no matter how good the translation is.

Even-Zohar (1990) also points out that when texts are chosen for translation, it is not just random texts that are chosen, the texts are chosen according to how compatible they are with the target literature, the culture of the target literature and the role the texts are going to play within that literature. So, according to Even-Zohar the texts do not need to adhere exactly to the culture and language of the target literature but they need to be compatible with the culture of that literature and there should be an awareness of the roles that the translated texts will play within the target literature.

Chapter 3 Methodology

This is a two part internet-based study. The first part consists of a survey of published reading materials and is thus a quantitative study, with findings presented under category headings. The second part investigated the accessibility of the surveyed materials, in terms of ease or difficulty of finding and/or purchasing them. Findings from this investigation are presented descriptively. The study was largely qualitative, looking at the various types of books published by different publishers in the first part of the study, as well as the personal investigation conducted in the second part of the study. The data in the first of the study was collected using a quantitative method, however, for the purpose of this study the data collected was analysed using a qualitative method.

3.1 Collecting data for Part 1 of the study

The first part of the research, the survey of reading materials that are available for Foundation Phase learners, was done via an internet search to identify the educational commercial publishers, trade and other kinds of publishers including educational NGO publishers that publish reading materials for young readers in the nine official indigenous languages of South Africa. The Google search engine was used to find the Publishers Association of South Africa website (PASA) and from there the Members list of publishers registered with the Association was downloaded.

After writing down all the members on the list I looked for all the ones with website details and I noted them down. Thereafter I looked through the entire list of publishers and then attempted to locate them on the internet one by one. Some of the publishers had website details so I went directly to the website. I looked for some of the publishers on Facebook as well as on some author blogs and I was able to get further information by doing this. In order to refine the list I chose to look at which of the registered companies or persons on the PASA list was publishing books and if they were publishing books were they publishing books for Foundation Phase learners and not just intermediate, FET or early readers. In my search, I also needed to make the distinction between Foundation Phase and Grade R because there are one or two publishers who publish books in indigenous languages for Grade R learners only.

After refining the PASA list to a list that I thought fitted the criteria, I again used the Google search engine to look for publishers in South Africa, and that is where I found some publishers that are not registered on the PASA website but still publish reading materials for learners in the Foundation Phase. After compiling that list I again used the same criteria that I used to refine the PASA list, to the Google search list. After that I went to the Jozi Book Fair 2016 website to look for a list of some of the publishers that had exhibited their reading materials but were not registered with PASA and that did not appear on the Google algorithm in my initial Google search.

I found the list of exhibitors on the Jozi Book Fair 2016 website and I searched for each name on the list on the internet, using the same criteria that I used for the PASA list to refine the list of publishers. After searching through the entire list of exhibitors from the Jozi Book Fair list I found another list of publishers in my search for one of the listed exhibitor's websites. I then looked through that list and searched for the publishers on the list using the set of criteria that I had used previously for the PASA list.

After compiling a list of publishers from all the websites and searches that I had done, I narrowed the list down. I had decided to include only publishers that had active websites for my study because I wanted to investigate the kinds of books that each publisher publishes, their use of translations, the number of books published in the African languages and, for the second part of the study, their accessibility to the public. This meant that I had to cut out some publishers that did not have active websites, publishers whose websites were still being constructed and publishers who only had a social media presence like a Facebook page but did not have further information on their Facebook page.

After identifying the publishers and compiling my own final list of publishers I proceeded to look at the types of materials they are publishing, at what scale they are publishing their materials, the languages in which they are publishing their materials and whether the materials appeared in translation or not. For comparative purposes I included publishers that publish in English and Afrikaans, to get a clearer picture of what languages publishers are publishing in for Foundation Phase learners.

In doing the survey I also wanted to investigate, using the data collected, what has been translated from English and Afrikaans into the indigenous languages. This is not the main focus of the research study but it is important to note that where reading materials are being published in the indigenous languages, which of these materials were originated in the African languages and which were translated. This speaks to some of the challenges mentioned in the literature review that publishers face when publishing in South Africa.

In order to find the languages of origination and whether or not the materials were being translated I used the method employed by Edwards & Ngwaru (2011) in their study of the translation of reading materials. I looked through the publishers' catalogues and looked at their reading materials. I looked for the authors of the reading materials and looked at the surnames of the authors and from there I determined the language of origination of the reading materials. In addition to looking at the surnames of the authors I made a list of the authors and looked for them on the internet, and I looked for other kinds of publications that they may have authored or published and other kinds of work that they may have done like translation or editing work. By looking at other kinds of publications and work done by the authors, I was looking at the languages in which they published the bulk of their work in and

from there I could determine, with reasonable accuracy, the languages that the reading materials from the survey were originated in.

3.2 Collecting data for Part 2 of the study

The second part of the research was a personal investigation into how to find out about and how to obtain the Foundation Phase reading materials published by commercial publishers and educational NGOs in the nine official indigenous languages, in order to answer the question about access to published reading materials for Foundation Phase learners.

In order to carry out my investigation I did a discourse analysis of the information on different publisher's websites, and I looked at what the publishers say about publishing in the African languages as well as what their stance is on publishing reading materials for Foundation Phase learners. In order to do this I went to each publisher's and each NGO's website and I looked in the 'about' section. I was looking specifically for what publishers claim about what kinds of materials and the languages they publish in. Where available I looked at the mission statements, vision or the publisher's goals. I applied the same strategy to the educational NGOs but in addition I also looked at who the NGOs are funded by and what the funders say about themselves in order to gain a holistic overview of the direction of the NGO and what they stand for.

In the course of my investigation my aim was also to try and find out how easy or difficult it is to purchase the reading materials as a person with access to the internet, and how difficult it may be to purchase the reading materials as a person without the internet.

I wanted to find out how many of the publishers are selling their reading materials, at what price they are selling them and how one can purchase these materials. In addition, I looked at whether some reading materials are available free of charge through open access on the internet.

I went to each publisher's and NGO's website and I looked through these, seeking ways of purchasing the reading materials. I pretended to be a person looking for reading materials for a Foundation Phase learner and I visited each website. I first looked at how easy or difficult it was to find the reading catalogues or list of materials on the website, thereafter I looked at the simplicity (or otherwise) of the purchasing process. In addition to looking at the purchasing process I also looked at the payment methods offered by each publisher or NGO and that helped me assess the simplicity or otherwise of the purchasing process and what would be required of a person trying to buy reading materials from that particular website. In the course of the investigation I found it pertinent to also look at the 'readability' of the website, because being able to use the website and know where to find book lists and catalogues (i.e. the navigation of the site) adds to the ease or difficulty of buying reading materials from a website.

My investigation also included looking at whether or not the reading materials were available through open access on the internet. I went to each publisher's and NGO's website and I looked for what could be downloaded for free on the website and whether what could be downloaded for free was relevant to my study i.e. if it fell under the category of reading materials for Foundation Phase learners. After looking at whether or not the reading materials were available to download for free I downloaded the reading materials and I looked at the formats of the materials and whether or not they could be compatible with different kinds of reading devices, and I also looked at whether or not the reading materials could open, and how user-friendly the materials were. For example: are the pages easy to turn, do the pages fit on the screen, could you download the materials off the website and on to a smartphone device or a kindle and maintain the same kind of reading quality as you would on a personal computer.

3.3 Data analysis

In order to categorise and synthesise the data collected in the study, I looked for patterns in the data (e.g. similarities across publishers) or for data that stood out as being thematically different or seemed interesting. I used the following themes and trends to look for patterns in the first part of the research: number of books published in the African languages, the languages of origination of the books published in relation to the number of books published by each publisher per language, and for comparative purposes, the languages that books were translated into. I also looked at the small, medium and large publishers and the scale at which their books were being translated, what languages they were publishing in and the languages of origination of the books.

For the second part of the research I looked at what each publisher put on their websites about themselves, their missions and or their visions. I looked for any indication of the publisher's intentions to publish in the African languages, or their viewpoints on the kinds of books that they publish. I was looking specifically at the small, medium and large publishers and whether the educational, trade, mixed or other publishers were more willing to publish in the African languages. In addition to that I looked at whether the publishers expressed an interest or willingness to publish in the African languages, and if so, if they do indeed publish in the African languages and if so, on what scale.

In the second part of the research I also looked at the availability of the books to the general public. I looked at how easy or difficult it is to purchase the books as a general member of the public. I looked at the navigation of the websites and whether this was easy or not and whether a person with limited access to the internet or limited computer skills would be able to navigate the websites. I also looked at how much effort it took to find the reading materials on the website and proceed to purchasing them. I looked at which publishers had the easiest access to their catalogues and which publishers

made it more difficult to purchase their reading materials, (for example, the presence or absence of a catalogue or direction to a bookshop or other distributors on their websites).

Broadly, I looked at each category and made comparisons between the categories, such as the educational publishers, and the NGO's. I also made comparisons between the different types of publishers, comparing what they published and what they said about themselves and looking for similarities and differences between them.

Data collected for both parts of the study is presented in Chapter 4.

Chapter 4 Presentation of survey findings

4.1 Part 1 Survey of publications

In this part of the chapter findings from a survey of books published between 2015 and 2017 in South Africa, in African languages, for young children are presented and discussed. The survey included the categories of educational publishers, trade publishers, NGOs and other publishers who did not fit into any of these three categories. For each publisher information is presented as outlined in the key below.

1	The kinds of materials that are available in African languages for young readers.
2	The language/s of publication. For comparative purposes English and Afrikaans are included, even though they not the main focus of the research.
3	The types of texts that are being published.
4	Whether or not the materials have been translated.
5	The language/s of origin of the materials being published in translation.
6	Total number of texts published for young readers in the African languages.

4.1.1 Commercial educational publishers

Commercial educational publishers are those publishers that publish educational books with the intention to make money from selling them (van Rooyen, 2005). Information about each one is presented in alphabetical order, according to publisher name and for the purposes of this study 18 commercial educational publishers are listed.

Awareness Publishing SA (Pty) Ltd

1. Book series
2. IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, English and Afrikaans
3. Fiction and information
4. The books were translated from English to IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Setswana, Sesotho and Sepedi
5. English
6. There are 40 books available on the website in an 8-book series format.

Best Books

1. Workbooks, learners' books
2. Sepedi, Afrikaans, English, Sesotho HL (Home Language), English HL, English FAL (First Additional Language)
3. Information
4. Information on translation is not available from the website
5. This information is not available from the website
6. There are three books plus teacher's guides available on the website.

Cambridge University Press, South Africa

1. Big Books, Learners' books, graded reading series, literacy kit
2. English FAL, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana , Tshivenda, Xitsonga, English
3. Information (textbooks), fiction and non-fiction
4. The IsiXhosa books do not seem to be translated because the authors of the books are Xhosa-speaking. However, information on translation for the other African languages is not available.
5. This information is not available from the website.
6. There are 594 books available on the website.

Depicta

1. Big Books
2. English and Afrikaans

3. Fiction

4. This information is not available on the website

5. This information is not available from the website

6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English and Afrikaans.

Elf Publishers

1. Books and eBooks

2. English

3. Information

4. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English

5. English

6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English.

Global MBD Africa Publishing

1. Learner textbooks, workbooks, interactive digital content, readers

2. English

3. Information (textbooks, workbooks), fiction

4. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English

5. English

6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English.

Juta and Company

1. Big Books

2. Afrikaans HL (Home Language) & FAL (First Additional Language), English HL & FAL

3. Fiction and non-fiction

4. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English

5. This information is not available from the website

6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English and Afrikaans.

Lectio Publishers (Pty) Ltd

1. Graded reading series, Big Books, phonics programme, flashcards and other literacy supplementary material

2. Xitsonga, Tshivenda, IsiNdebele, Northern Sesotho (Sepedi), Setswana, IsiZulu, Isixhosa, Afrikaans and English

3. Fiction and informational

4. Yes there are some IsiNdebele books that are translated because the authors are not IsiNdebele-speaking authors. Information on the other African languages is not available from the website

5. English

6. There are 164 books available on the website.

Let's Look Publishers

1. Readers, workbooks, wallcharts, puzzles and other supplementary material

2. Sesotho, English, Isixhosa, IsiZulu, Afrikaans, Setswana, Sepedi, Siswati, Xitsonga, Tshivenda and IsiNdebele

3. Informational

4. Yes

5. English

6. There are 225 wall charts available on the catalogue.

Macmillan Education South Africa

1. Graded readers, workbooks, Solutions for all course material and Clever course material

2. English HL, Setswana HL, Tshivenda HL, Afrikaans HL, Afrikaans FAL and Siswati

3. Fiction and informational

4. This information is not available from the website

5. This information is not available from the website
6. There are 62 books available on the website, excluding the Clever course material and Solutions for all course material which are in English only.

Marumo Publishing

1. Textbooks and reading series
2. English FAL, Setswana, Sepedi, IsiZulu, IsiXhosa, Xitsonga, Tshivenda and Siswati
3. Fiction and informational
4. There is evidence of translation between the IsiZulu and Setswana books. Information on translation of the rest of the African language books is not clear from the website
5. This information is not available from the website
6. There are 62 books available on the website.

Mosala-Masedi Publishers & Booksellers CC

1. Reading books
2. Setswana
3. Fiction and non-fiction
4. No
5. Setswana
6. There are nine books on the website in the category for Foundation Phase learners.

New Generation Publishers

1. Textbooks
2. IsiZulu
3. Information
4. No
5. IsiZulu
6. There are 3 books excluding the Teacher's Guide available on the website.

Oxford University Press

1. Textbooks, storybooks, Big Books, workbooks, learner's books, posters and dictionaries
2. English FAL, IsiXhosa HL, IsiXhosa Second Additional Language, IsiZulu HL, IsiZulu Second Additional Language, Sepedi HL, Sepedi Second Additional Language, Sesotho HL, Setswana HL, IsiNdebele HL, Siswati HL and Xitsonga HL. The dictionaries published by Oxford University Press South Africa are bilingual dictionaries.
3. Information
4. This information is not available from the website
5. This information is not available from the website
6. There are 212 books on the website in the category for Foundation Phase learners.

Pearson Education South Africa

1. Graded readers and Big Books, learners' workbooks, readers, phonics books and dictionaries
2. English FAL, English HL, IsiXhosa HL, IsiXhosa FAL, HL IsiZulu, IsiZulu HL, Sepedi FAL, Sepedi HL, Sesotho, Setswana, Afrikaans HL, Afrikaans FAL, Siswati, Tshivenda and Xitsonga. The dictionaries published by Pearson Education South Africa are bilingual dictionaries
3. Information, supplementary materials, fiction, non-fiction
4. The VUMA series is not translated and is originated in the language in which it is published
Information on books in the other African languages is not available from the website
5. In the VUMA series the languages of origin are IsiXhosa HL, IsiZulu HL and Sepedi HL
6. There are 477 books on the website in the category for Foundation Phase.

Puo Publishing

1. Books and flashcards
2. The books are in a bilingual format and include the following languages: English, Afrikaans, IsiNdebele, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, Siswati, Tshivenda and Xitsonga.
3. Fiction
4. This information is not available from the website, even though the books are in a bilingual format they could have been translated into different languages.

5. This information is not provided clearly on the website because the books could be originated in English and an African language such as IsiZulu, then translated further into the other African languages using the same bilingual format

6. There are 56 print books and 33eBooks on the website in the Foundation Phase catalogue.

Shuter & Shooter

1. CAPS approved textbooks, trade books and eBooks

2. Siswati, Xitsonga, English, IsiZulu, IsiXhosa, Setswana and Sepedi

3. Fiction, non-fiction, information texts

4. The Xitsonga and Sepedi books are translated. Information on the translation of the Siswati, IsiZulu, IsiXhosa and Setswana books is not available on the website

5. English

6. The website is not consistent because what is on the store tab does not align with what is on the catalogues so the number of books presented here is an approximation. There are 101 books on the website in the Foundation Phase catalogue.

Via Afrika (Nasou)

1. Interactive English literary and language CD, audiovisual educational software, Big Books and graded readers

2. English FAL, Afrikaans HL, IsiNdebele HL, IsiXhosa HL, IsiZulu HL, Sepedi HL, Sesotho HL, Setswana HL, Siswati HL, Tshivenda HL, and Xitsonga HL

3. Fiction

4. This information is not available on the website

5. This information is not available on the website

6. There are 185 books on the website in the Via Afrika 2016 catalogue.

4.1.2 Trade publishers

Trade publishers can be defined as publishers that publish materials that are not scholarly or educational, but are more for leisure reading or reading for pleasure (Greco *et al*: 2014). 12 trade publishers are listed in this study and information about each one is presented below.

Clockwork Books

1. Early readers

2. English
3. Fiction
4. No
5. English
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English only.

Human & Rousseau

1. Storybooks
2. English and Afrikaans
3. Fiction
4. Authors are a mix of English and Afrikaans especially for the books that are in English
5. English and Afrikaans
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English and Afrikaans
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English only.

Jacana Media

1. Storybooks
2. English, IsiZulu, Afrikaans, IsiXhosa, IsiNdebele, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, Tshivenda and Xitsonga
3. Fiction
4. Yes, however not all the books are translated
5. English, and there is a possibility of Afrikaans as well. The language of origin is not clear for the books that have been translated into the African languages
6. There are 79 books on the website.

Jonathan Ball Publications

1. Reading Book (they have one book visible on the catalogue on their website)
2. English

3. Fiction
4. No
5. English
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English only.

LAPA Publishers

1. Storybooks and Apps
2. Afrikaans
3. Fiction, non-fiction, information texts
4. Yes, but there are very few
5. English
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in Afrikaans only.

Lux Verbi

1. Storybooks and versions of the Bible adapted specifically for children.
2. English and Afrikaans
3. The Bible
4. No
5. English and Afrikaans
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English and Afrikaans only.

Njabulo Publishers

1. Storybooks
2. English and IsiZulu
3. Fiction
4. No
5. IsiZulu

6. The information provided on the website says that there are 18 books in the collection. However, there are only five books that are available for purchase on the website.

Pan Macmillan SA (Pty) Ltd

1. Storybooks

2. English

3. Fiction

4. No

5. English

6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English only.

Penguin Random House

1. Reading books

2. English and Afrikaans

3. Fiction, non-fiction and informational. This information is not available on the website.

5. This information is not available on the website

6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English and Afrikaans only.

Phambili Agencies

1. There is no catalogue

2. Language of publication – mainly Afrikaans

3. There is no catalogue so the type of text cannot be determined

4. There is no catalogue so the translation cannot be determined

5. There is no catalogue so the language of origin cannot be determined

6. This information is not available from the website.

Protea Boekhuis

1. Storybooks

2. Afrikaans

3. Fiction and non-fiction
4. There are some books that have been translated
5. English
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in Afrikaans only.

Qualibooks Publishers

1. Storybooks
2. Afrikaans, English, IsiNdebele, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, Siswati, Tshivenda and Xitsonga
3. Fiction
4. Yes, the IsiNdebele, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, Siswati, Tshivenda and Xitsonga books are translated
5. English is one of the languages in which the books originate. There is a possibility that some of the books could have been originated in the African languages because the same authors have written the same books in all the African languages but the language of origin is not clear
6. There are 216 books on the website.

4.1.3 NGO educational publishers

NGO educational publishers are not-for profit publishers or organisations that publish educational materials and whose aim is not necessarily to make profit from the materials that they publish (van Rooyen, 2005). Information about the 5 NGO publishers looked at in this study is presented below.

Early Learning Resource Unit

1. Books
2. English, IsiXhosa, Afrikaans, Setswana and IsiZulu is available for some of the books.
3. Fiction
4. This information is not available on the website
5. The books are in multiple languages so there is a possibility that they are originated in English and the various African languages
6. There are four books available on the website.

Nal'ibali

1. Storybooks
2. Afrikaans, Sepedi, Sesotho, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Setswana, Siswati, Tshivenda, Xitsonga and IsiNdebele
3. Fiction
4. Some of the stories have been re-told as it says on the website
5. English
6. There are 667 books available on the website.

Reading Matters

1. Readers and Big Books
2. English, Afrikaans, IsiZulu and IsiXhosa. Sepedi and Sesotho are listed as languages that Reading Matters also publishes in but there are no books in the two languages on the price catalogues
3. Fiction and non-fiction
4. The Sunshine graded readers are translated into IsiZulu
5. English
6. There are 160 books available on the website.

African Storybook Project

1. Storybooks
2. English, Setswana, Afrikaans, Sepedi, Siswati, IsiZulu, IsiXhosa and IsiNdebele
3. Fiction and non-fiction (though called storybooks, some are factual or information texts)
4. Yes, the books are translated into IsiZulu, IsiXhosa, Sepedi, Setswana, Siswati and IsiNdebele.
5. English, Setswana, Afrikaans, Sepedi, Siswati, IsiZulu, IsiXhosa and IsiNdebele
6. There are 483 books available on the website (with numbers of books increasing on a monthly basis).

Vula Bula

1. Graded readers
2. IsiNdebele, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Sesotho, Sepedi, Setswana, Tshivenda and Xitsonga

3. Fiction, non-fiction and informational

4. Yes, the books have been translated into IsiNdebele, IsiZulu, Sesotho, Sepedi, Setswana, Tshivenda and Xitsonga

5. English

6. There are 288 books available on the website.

4.1.4 Mixed publishers

This category refers to publishers that are not wholly/exclusively classified as educational or as trade because they publish both trade and educational books. There are 4 publishers listed under this category and information about each one is presented below.

NF Saliwa Publishing CC

1. Books, posters, flashcards and DVDs

2. English, IsiXhosa, Sesotho

3. Fiction, non-fiction and poetry

4. No

5. English, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, Siswati, IsiNdebele, Tshivenda and Xitsonga.

6. There are 18 books available on the website.

Mthombothi Studios (Pty) Ltd

1. Readers

2. English, IsiZulu, IsiXhosa and Afrikaans, Sepedi, Setswana, Sesotho, Xitsonga, Siswati, Tshivenda, IsiNdebele

3. Fiction

4. The books have been translated into IsiXhosa and IsiZulu

5. English

6. There are 35 books available on the website.

Scholastic Inc

1. Readers

2. English
3. Fiction and informational
4. This information is not available on the website
5. This information is not available on the website
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes books for young children in English only.

Vivlia Publishers and Booksellers (Pty) Ltd

1. Workbooks, Big Books and readers
2. IsiZulu HL and English FAL
3. Informational and fiction
4. This information is not available on the website
5. This information is not available on the website
6. There are three books available on the website.

4.1.5 Other publishers

This category refers to publishers that publish their books digitally, that do not publish for the general market but for libraries, and publishers whose work are not part of the traditional style of publishing. There are 6 publishers listed under this category in this study, and information about each one is presented below.

Anansi –Uitgewers

1. Picture books and storybooks
2. Afrikaans, English, Southern Sotho, Setswana, IsiXhosa and IsiZulu
3. Fiction
4. Yes, the books are translated into Southern Sotho, Setswana, IsiXhosa and IsiZulu
5. English
6. There are 73 books available on the website.

Modlin e-learning Solutions

1. Interactive software
2. English
3. Informational
4. Not clear from the website because the authors are not shown on the website
5. Not applicable
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes materials for young children to read in English only.

The Learning Channel

1. Readers, education supplements (playbooks) DVDs
2. English
3. Fiction, informational and what seems to be non-fiction but it is not clear from the book covers
4. The author and other information is not clearly visible from the website
5. This information is not available on the website
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes materials for young children in English only.

R.I.C Publications (Pty) Ltd

1. Reading programmes
2. English
3. Fiction and non-fiction
4. No
5. English
6. This information is not applicable because the publisher publishes materials for young children in English.

Rural in the Citi (Pty) Ltd

1. Storybooks
2. Northern Sesotho (Sepedi), IsiZulu and IsiXhosa
3. Fiction

4. Yes, the English books have been translated
5. The books are Bilingual
6. This information is not available on the website.

Lingua Franca Publishers

1. Readers
2. English and Xitsonga
3. Informational
4. No
5. English and Xitsonga
6. This information is not available on the website.

4.1.6 Summary of publications survey

According to this study, 13 out of 18 commercial educational publishers publish books in the African languages, and on average, 106 books were published in one year.

Only four out of 12 trade publishers publish books in the African languages, and on average they published 23 books in one year.

Five out of five NGO educational publishers published books in the African languages and on average they published 320 books in one year.

Three out of four mixed publishers published books in the African languages and on average, published 14 books in one year.

One out of six *other* publishers published books in the African languages and on average published 12 books in one year.

The languages published by each publisher in order of the number of books published in each language from highest to lowest are as follows:

- English (36)
- Afrikaans (24)
- IsiZulu (22)
- IsiXhosa (20)
- Setswana (20)
- Sepedi (17)

- Sesotho (14)
- Xitsonga (14)
- Tshivenda (13)
- Siswati (12)
- IsiNdebele (11)

The types of texts that were published according to the study were mostly fiction, with 35 publishers publishing fiction books, then 19 publishers publishing informational books, and the least published were non-fiction books with only 13 publishers publishing non-fiction books. There were also Bibles and poetry books published by two publishers which did not fit into the fiction, informational and non-fiction books categories.

4.1.7 Key Findings

Part 1

For Part 1 of the study the key findings are as follows:

- The commercial educational publishers and NGOs are publishing more books in the African languages than the trade, mixed and other publishers.
- The smaller trade publishers are publishing more in the African languages than the medium and larger trade publishers who publish mainly in English and Afrikaans.
- The types of books most published in the African languages are readers and storybooks, mainly for educational purposes.
- Non-fiction, poetry and information books are hardly published and thus shows that there is a gap in the reading materials for Foundation Phase learners.
- The African languages that are published the least are Xitsonga, Tshivenda, IsiNdebele and Siswati.
- There is a greater commitment to publishing in English and Afrikaans than there is to publishing in the African languages. This is shown by the number of publishers that publish English and Afrikaans, no matter how small or big they are, and in addition, publish the African languages, and usually the major languages.
- There is evidence that translation is still being used to publish books in the African languages and there are not any publishers that originate books in the African languages. However. Some NGOs such as African Storybook and Nal'bali do originate texts in African languages as well as using translations.
- The main source language for the translation of books is English, with Afrikaans following closely behind it though there is some translation between African languages (e.g. on the African Storybook website).

These findings will be discussed further.

4.2 Part 2 Publisher's website information and availability of publishers' books

This part of the research focuses primarily on what each publisher has said about their publishing house, with particular reference to what they intend to publish in the future, what languages they publish in or what the mission of the publishing house is. This section also focuses on the availability of the books to the public and how the general public can gain access to or purchase the books. How easy or how difficult it is to buy books from the publishers as an ordinary member of the public is a central question.

4.2.1 Commercial educational publishers

Awareness Publishing SA (Pty) Ltd

1. "Our focus is publishing educational books for school children on subjects and life skills that are essential for African children in particular. Our philosophy is that children need to read books willingly, without having to be persuaded to do so. We believe that books need to be made in such a way that children will not be able to resist the temptations of picking them up and looking at them".
2. In order to buy books from Awareness Publishing, you need to begin by downloading their catalogue and then fill out the order form. When filling out the order form there is a heading titled "position and organization", so there is no clarity as to whether or not the books can be purchased by an individual or not. After filling in the order form you can send it by faxing or emailing it to the relevant addresses that are provided. In addition, the books are only available in sets so you cannot order a single book or mix and match different books that you would like to order.

Best Books

1. "Best Books is the educational imprint of NB Publishers and was established in 1996. The Best Books list focuses on language textbooks in Afrikaans and English Home Language and First Additional Language, as well as a range of reading series, anthologies, youth novels and dramas-in line with the requirements of the National Department of Basic Education. Best Books books aim to enhance learners' critical and creative thinking as well as their communication skills. The Best Books imprint has various flagship series, including All-in-One for the Foundation Phase and Piekfyn Afrikaans, Bladsak and English For Life for the Intermediate, Senior and FET phases".
2. In order to buy the books you need to begin by downloading their price catalogue. There are no clear instructions as to how to order or purchase the books. However, there are several email addresses in the catalogue where you can send Best Books a query.

Cambridge University Press, South Africa

1. “Our energetic local publishing programme has published several thousand books by African authors since the establishment of the Branch in 1995. Some of our most recognized brands include Study & Master, Ken & Verstaan, The Little Library, Rainbow Reading, Stay Tuned and Keys to Learning. In South Africa, we publish books in all 11 official languages, and we also pursue an extensive programme of mother tongue (main language) publishing for countries across the continent, producing books in over 34 local African languages under joint imprint with local agents in each country.

2. In order to buy the books you need to select the book/s that you would like to purchase on the website, then add it to the shopping basket. When you are done selecting the book/s, you then proceed to check out the basket. When you checkout the basket you fill in your details and save them onto the website and from there, further details about your purchase will be communicated to you by Cambridge University Press.

Depicta

1. “Our aim is to be Southern Africa’s leading educational supplies company, offering the best products, service and competitive prices. We sell attractive, descriptive, effective products, resources and teaching aids and books to teachers, pupils and parents. We design and manufacture all of our own products and are continuously adding to our range. What makes us unique is that all of our products are designed by qualified teachers. We are proudly South African and use all local materials and employees.

2. In order to buy the books, you need to select the book/s that you would like to purchase from the website, then add it to the shopping cart. When you are done selecting the book/s and adding them to the cart, you then proceed to check out the cart. When you are checking out your cart you fill in your details and send them to Depicta Books. You do not need to be from an institution or organization to buy the books, but you do need to have a debit or credit card to complete your purchase.

Elf Publishers

1. “Teach any adult or child to READ is a programme with which anyone with a reasonable command of spoken and written English can expertly teach reading and writing. It is especially suitable for teachers who have not had prior training, homeschooling and parents who wish to help a struggling child. No specialized training in teaching or remedial education is required”.

2. In order to buy the books, you need to select the book/s that you would like to purchase from the website, then add it to the shopping bag. When you are done selecting the book/books and adding them to the bag, you then proceed to check out the bag. When you are checking out your bag you fill

in your details and send them to Elf Publishers, they will be in further communication with you thereafter. You do not need to be from an institution or organization to buy the books, however you do need to have a debit or credit card to complete your purchase.

Global MBD Africa Publishing

1. “Global MBD Africa Publishing is the South African Division of the MBD Group, India’s largest Educational Service Provider. The Head Office, based in Cape Town, serves as the base for the entire African continent. With a truly South African team on board we offer 360 degree educational solutions under one roof. We address every aspect of Education: Foundation Phase (Grades R-3), Intermediate Phase (Grade 4-7), Senior Phase (Grade 7-9), FET (Grade 10-12), offering a wide variety of Learner Textbooks, Teacher Guides, Study Guides, Workbooks, Interactive Digital Content, Content Development, Educational tablets and much more!”.

2. The website does not give clear instruction on how to buy or order the books, and because the website is hard to navigate, you end up losing interest altogether because you cannot find the option to buy books.

Juta and Company

1. “At Juta we are accountable to one another, our customers, authors and shareholders, and are mindful of our role in our community and South Africa:

-we aspire to participative and respectful communication

-we respond with energy and purpose

-we embrace challenges and reward innovation

-we conduct ourselves with integrity and commitment

-we apply ourselves with thoroughness, consistency and heart

-we foster personal development and self-awareness”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to be an education provider, you cannot buy the books as an individual.

Lectio Publishers (Pty) Ltd

1. “Lectio Publishers (Pty) Ltd has a wide range of literacy materials available in all languages and has been involved in Literacy Projects across South Africa for many years. The materials include the following:

- Phonics Programmes (Activity books, Phonics Readers and Teacher’s Guides)

- Graded Reading Series and Teacher's Guide
- Big Book sets in all languages
- A large variety of resources in all languages (flash cards, flip charts, wall charts, CD's etc.)".

2. The website does not give clear instruction on how to buy or order the books, but there are contact details available on the website if you would like to make a query. The website does however also state that Sesotho, IsiNdebele, Tshivenda and Xitsonga books will only be printed if orders of large quantities are received.

Let's Look Publishers

1. "Our educational materials offer a variety of subjects and learning areas ideal for both home and school use. Our easy-to-read beautifully illustrated wall charts are printed on 300gsm art board laminated both sides for durability, strength and quality. Our wall charts are developed in-house with the assistance of subject specialists and respected educational institutions. Enquire about market suited customizing, such as translations, as well as development of specific books not yet available in our range".

2. The catalogue does not give clear instructions on how to buy or order the books, but there are contact details available on the catalogue if you would like to make a query. There is no website currently for the publisher to refer to.

Macmillan Education South Africa

1. "At Macmillan Education South Africa we push the frontiers of learning and discovery by providing the best content and most innovative technology to learners and educators. We do this by placing their needs at the centre of all we do and sharing their passion for transforming lives around the world".

2. There are different ways of purchasing digital and print material on the Macmillan Education South Africa website. The digital material is easy to purchase because you can download what you would like to purchase and then pay for it immediately by sending your details. Purchasing the print material is different. You can select what you would like to order then add your books to the shopping cart. You can then proceed to check out the books but in order to check them out, you have to be registered with Macmillan Education first and have an account.

Marumo Publishing

1. "Marumo Publishing is an educational publisher that is fully committed to the educational upliftment of all South African Communities (Black, White, Indian, Coloured), in achieving excellence in education. It is only through education that our economy and our people will grow to achieve prosperity".

2. In order to buy the books from Marumo Publishing you need to follow the instructions on the “orders” tab and you will get various options with clear instruction on how to order the books. You will need the internet and a credit/debit card to complete the orders however.

Mosala-Masedi Publishers & Booksellers CC

1. “Mosala-Masedi is a 100% black owned Publisher and Bookseller, whose core focus is promoting the multicultural diversity of South Africa’s heritage through literature. Having started writing literature in 2001, the author who is also co-founder of Mosala-MASEDI continues to passionately capture and preserve South Africa’s cultural heritage mostly in his books. Raise awareness of African culture and tradition. Awareness covers correct use of language such as; grammar, relevant vocabulary, beliefs, taboos and rituals related to South African communities”.

2. The website does not give clear instruction on how to buy or order the books, but they have a client-base list on it that shows you who the main clients of the publisher are. They also have contact details available on the website.

New Generation Publishers

1. “New Generation Publishers was formed in 1992 and has been publishing materials of quality ever since. It is also known as New Era Publishers and uses this imprint for many of its books. New Generation is a focused home grown publishing company preferring to produce a limited number of books of quality rather than opting for quantity”.

2. In order to buy the books, on the website you need to select the books that you would like to purchase then add the book/s to the shopping basket. You will then to follow the prompts when you check the book/s out then fill in your details. After filling in your details you need to submit the quote and the publisher will communicate with you thereafter. It is a long and tedious process that will leave you frustrated before you finish what you are doing.

Oxford University Press

1. “We recognize the power of education to uplift and equip individuals and communities to better their lives. We therefore strive to develop and deliver high quality and affordable educational materials and support, based on the demands of learners, students, teachers and lecturers in South Africa”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to go to the “Buy” tab on the website and click on why you are buying the books. Thereafter you select that book/s that you would like to buy and add them to the shopping cart. After adding the books to the shopping cart you can proceed to checkout. You need to register your details on the website before you checkout.

Pearson Education South Africa

1. “Pearson is the world’s leading education company, with a presence in over 70 countries and 40 000 employees, Pearson provides learning solutions from early childhood learning to professional certification, Pearson curriculum-based materials, e-learning content and tools, as well as teacher training and testing programmes help to educate millions of people worldwide”.
2. The website does not give clear instruction on how to buy or order the books.

Puo Publishing

1. “Puo creates content that educates, entertains and empowers children through Africa’s heritage...Approved by the Department of Basic Education, our materials and the benefits thereof reach children, parents, teachers and Corporate Social Investment projects”.
2. The books are available for schools and libraries in South Africa, so in order to buy the books you need to download the order form from the website, fill it in and email it to the email address that is provided.

Shuter & Shooter

1. “Shuter & Shooter Publishers (Pty) Ltd is based in Shutters House Pietermaritzburg, the capital of KwaZulu-Natal – one of nine provinces in the Republic of South Africa. Shutters publishes both educational and general books. We are actively involved in the development of educational materials for the Southern Africa market. Shuter’s products include textbooks and teacher guides, literature works, supplementary readers and resource material for school, library and retail markets. We publish language courses and literature titles in most of the South African indigenous languages”.
2. In order to buy the books you first need to be registered. After registering you can then sign in to the website and complete your purchase. The books that are on the website are not consistent with the books that are on the catalogue so you need to be mindful of what you are selecting to buy.

Via Afrika (Nasou)

1. “Since the introduction of the CAPS Curriculum, Via Afrika has been producing CAPS Curriculum textbooks in two ebook formats: EPUB for tablet computers and Flipbooks for PC. Key to the development of these e-books was the inclusion of multimedia and interactive enhancements that do not require internet connectivity for use. Via Afrika partners with authors who are leading educationalists, including teachers, academics and Department of Education officials. This partnership enables Via Afrika to develop learning materials that make a difference. Via Afrika is also highly selective in the quality of freelancers and other service providers it contracts to add value to authors and manuscripts”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to select the books that you would like to purchase from the catalogue on the website, and add them to the shopping basket. Thereafter you can proceed to check out the books. When you check out the books you need to fill in your details and then place the order.

4.2.2 Trade publishers

Clockwork Books

1. “Passionate about exceptional South African fiction and non-fiction, Clockwork Books is a virtual publishing hub servicing authors and readers alike. Focussing on partnering with authors to produce high quality print books and e-books, we aim to:

- make the most of the digital space
- empower authors to be in control of their work
- improve the connection between creators and their communities.

We also provide publishing services to self-publishers”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to select the books on the website and add them to the shopping cart. After you are done adding the books to the cart you can then proceed to check them out. You can fill in your details and then proceed to the payment method where you can either pay using your Visa card or using a system called PayFast. You need to have a debit or credit card in order to complete your purchase.

Human & Rousseau

1. “Human & Rousseau was founded in 1959. Although we initially focused on Afrikaans books, Human & Rousseau today publishes both English and Afrikaans and is one of the most esteemed general publishers in South Africa. On the fiction side, Human & Rousseau’s focus is on quality Afrikaans and English literature, popular reads, children and youth books for the general, mass and schools market. We are at the South African home of internationally renowned authors like Breyten Breytenbach, André Brink and Karel Schoeman”.

2. In order to buy the books, you select the books that you would like to purchase from the website, then click on “buy book” which will re-direct you to another website. The website you will be re-directed to is in Afrikaans, which might prove to be harder to navigate for people who do not speak Afrikaans.

Jacana Media

1. Information about Jacana Media is not available on the website, they do not have an ‘about us’ section.

2. In order to buy the books you need to select the book/s that you would like to purchase from the website, click on buy now and you will be re-directed to another website where the books are available between Exclusives, loot and takealot.com. You can then complete your purchase on either one of those sites.

Jonathan Ball Publications

1. “Jonathan Ball Publishers was started in 1976 and is the leading publisher and distributor of English general books in South Africa. We specialize in South African history, politics and current affairs and also publish some fiction. We also act as agents for British and American publishers, marketing and distributing books on their behalf in Southern Africa.

2. In order to buy or order books from Jonathan Ball Publishers you need to have a registered account with them first in order to access the online ordering. You need to click on the “E-commerce customers” tab to access this information.

LAPA Publishers

1. “LAPA publiseer boeke vir almal wat Afrikaans praat, maar laat ook nie ander tale agterweë nie. LAPA ondersteun die plaaslike boek, skrywer en leser deur gehaltelesstof teen bekostigbare pryse te lewer”. The direct translation is as follows “ LAPA publishes books for all who speak Afrikaans but other languages are ignored LAPA know that reading in the mother tongue is essential for any child’s development. Therefore, we focus on contemporary, exciting children’s and youth books who loves to make children read”. (This is a direct translation from the website and should be read with caution)

2. The website is hard to navigate for someone who does not speak Afrikaans. In order to buy the books you need to select the book/s that you would like to purchase and add them to the shopping cart. You can then proceed to check out the books, but you have to be registered with LAPA publishers to complete your purchase.

Lux Verbi

1. “Lux Verbi, a Christian publishing imprint of products with an evangelical focus, originated from South Africa’s oldest publishing house, NG Kerk Publishers, established in 1818. In Latin, Lux Verbi means ‘Light of the Word’. The South African Bible Society, which originated from the same mother company, still distributes millions of Bibles a year, but is no longer associated with Lux Verbi”.

2. In order to buy the books you have to select the book/s that you would like to purchase from the website and click buy to purchase the book/s. You will then be re-directed to another website where you can complete your purchase. The website that you are re-directed to is in Afrikaans which may be hard to navigate for people who do not speak Afrikaans. The Lux Verbi website is generally hard to navigate so it will also require patience from the buyer.

Njabulo Publishers

1. “Njabulo Publishers is a children’s book publisher. Our commitment is to provide original, exciting and stimulating material for the readers. The books are developed to educate as well as entertain the readers. The books come in a number of languages that is English, Zulu and SeSotho. There are currently 18 titles published by Njabulo Publishers. Watch the space for new titles at the end of 2016. Ownership: Njabulo Publishers is a privately owned company”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to select the “place order” tab on the website, fill in your details and send them back on the website.

Pan Macmillan SA (Pty) Ltd

1. “Pan Macmillan SA is one of the largest general book publishers in South Africa, with a growing local list of titles published under the Picador Africa and Macmillan imprints. Pan Macmillan represents a number of group company imprints in South Africa including Macmillan, Pan, Picador, Tor, Kingfisher, Macmillan’s Children’s Books, Macmillan USA and Priddy Books. In addition the company also represents some major international publishers including: Orchard Books and Hodder Children’s Books, Walker Books, Guinness World Records and Quadrille. Through the publishing of a diverse range of titles and authors, Pan Macmillan aims to engage readers of all ages and diverse backgrounds”.

2. In order to buy books you need to select the book/s that you would like to purchase and then select the preferred platform where you would like to complete your purchase, between Takealot.com, Exclusives, Reader’s Warehouse, Bargain Books, CNA and Raru. You need to have a debit or credit card to complete your purchase.

Penguin Random House

1. “We have an ongoing commitment to protect the editorial freedom of our authors, publishers and imprints, and to maintaining the breadth and diversity of publishing for readers of all ages. We are also very committed to supporting as broad a range of bookselling as possible so our readers can access our content across a multitude of platforms and channels”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to select the book/s that you would like to buy from the website then it will direct you to either Takealot.com, loot or Exclusives and you can complete your purchase from there.

Phambili Agencies

1. “Phambili’s publishing arm has grown tremendously over the last 5 years focusing mainly on Afrikaans Language children’s books and successfully selling our collection into the main book trade,

Baby Specialty Stores (Baby City, Baby Boom), Gift/Novelty, Christian stores and Leisure Books (South Africa's foremost mail order company). We also do a number of co-productions with many of our existing publishers producing children's books into Afrikaans and would like to include some adult non-fiction such as craft titles in the future".

2. In order to buy their books you have to be in the trade and retail industry. If you are in that industry, you can only look at the books that are available by registering with the publisher and using your password to log in.

Protea Boekhuis

1. Information about Protea Boekhuis is not available on the website, they do not have an 'about' section.

2. In order to buy the books you need to select the book/s that you would like to purchase and add them to the shopping cart. When you are done you can proceed to check out your cart and fill in your details and send to the publishers. You need to have a debit or credit card to complete your purchase.

Qualibooks Publishers

1. "Mission: To be the foremost efficient provider of curriculum-based library and other educational resources to schools and communities, in partnership with key players in the educational sector by leaning on responsible corporate citizens, thereby enhancing the quality of educational outcomes".

2. The website does not give clear information on how to buy or order the books.

4.2.3 NGO educational publishers

NGO educational publishers are not-for-profit publishers or organisations that publish educational materials and whose aim is not necessarily to make profit from the materials that they publish (reference).

Early Learning Resource Unit

1. "Our aim is to enable greater access and improve the quality of services and programmes available to children in poor communities, in order to ensure their optimal physical, emotional, social, intellectual, mental and spiritual development. We do this by enabling access to an Essential Package of Services i.e. early learning, health, nutrition, social services and support for the primary caregiver".

2. There are resources that are available to download for free off the internet, you just select the book that you would like and then you download it. Alternatively, you can also buy the book/s that you would like to purchase, by clicking "buy book". The book/s will then be added to your cart. If you would like to checkout your cart you need to go to the top of the screen and click on "your cart", it

will take you directly to the checkout page and you can fill in your details and continue to the next stage of your purchase.

Nal’ibali

1. “Nali’ is built on the simple logic that a well-established culture of reading can be a real game-changer for education in South Africa. Literacy skills are a strong predictor of future academic success in all subjects - and children who regularly read and hear engaging stories, in languages they understand, are well equipped and motivated to learn to read and write. A significant body of research reinforces the link between reading for pleasure and improved outcomes for children...The campaign values the power of language and cultural relevance in literacy development. For reasons relating to empowerment, pedagogy, identity and democracy, Nal’ibali fully promotes reading and writing in mother tongue languages. All children and adults need to understand what they are listening to, or reading, for it to be meaningful and enjoyable – which is crucial for raising readers”.

2. The website does not give clear information on how to buy or order the books, however the books are available to read for free online.

Reading Matters

1. “The quality of books selected and distributed by READING MATTERS reflect the best examples of children’s literature currently available today. The books offer a rich language experience and are relevant to the children in that they reflect their world and help them move beyond it. Our goal is to inspire imagination and curiosity through the excitement of the stories”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to print the form on the website, fill it in and send it to the contact details that are on the form.

African Storybook Project

1. “Vision – Open access to picture storybooks in the languages of Africa. For children’s literacy, enjoyment and imagination”.

2. You can read, print and download the books for free on / from the website. Unlike other publishers, the African Storybook Project also enables users to translate and existing stories or add new ones to the website.

Vula Bula

1. “The Vula Bula graded reading programme is unique in that each series originates from the respective indigenous South African language – as opposed to being translated from English – and is carefully designed in accordance with the natural phonic progression of that language...The Vula Bula language graded reading series offer carefully structured graded texts for early, emergent and

fluent readers in the form of beautifully illustrated stories, contextualized to the young reader's inner world and life experiences. The books are short and simple, and contain predictable text to facilitate and encourage reading for enjoyment. Simple sentence structures and familiar vocabulary enable rapid reading progress. Clear and detailed illustrations help understanding. The Vula Bula methodological approach takes cognizance of the agglutinative and, where applicable, conjunctive nature of each African language so that the texts are based on the specific orthographical building blocks of each language”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to be from a school or organization, then you fill out the customer form provided on the website and send it to the contact details on the form. Anyone can also download the books for free from the website.

4.2.4 Mixed publishers

This category refers to publishers that are not wholly/exclusively classified as educational or as trade because they publish both trade and educational books.

NF Saliwa Publishing CC

1. “Welcome to NF Saliwa Publishing, a proudly South African female owned small business. We proudly produce home-brewed material focusing on South African children's development and we pride ourselves for using original African languages developed material with South African-African children in mind. More details of what we produce is found in this website...”.

2. In order to buy the books you need to go to the “forms” tab on the website, and follow the instructions. You will fill in a form with your details and the details of what you would like to buy then send the form to the contact details that are provided.

Mthombothi Studios (Pty) Ltd

1. “Mthombothi Studios was established in 2002 and publishes several series of books for education and leisure. The material is always well researched and written and illustrated with enthusiasm. While we cover topics and characters from the entire world, most of our work is Afrocentric and represents the folklore and people from Southern Africa”.

2. The website does not give clear information on how to buy or order the books. There is the option to use the prices on the price list on the website to email the publishers a query or you can contact the publishers directly on the contact details provided on the website.

Scholastic Inc

1. “Our Mission: As the largest children's book publisher in the world, Scholastic is entrusted with the promotion of literacy through books for millions of kids of all ages and reading levels. Our mission is

built on helping children learn to read and love to read. We believe that independent reading is a critical part of children's learning and growth. With support from teachers, parents and schools, children choose from Scholastic the books they want to read, and discover the pleasure and power of reading. Finding the right book at the right time can light an emotional spark within children that motivates them to read more, understand more and read joyfully. When that happens, the world opens. Everything becomes possible".

2. In order to buy the books or resources you can search for the books that you would like on the website, add them to the cart and then check the books out. Finding the books on the website can be somewhat hard if you are not sure what you are looking for. Alternatively, you can go to the catalogue on the website and order the books or resources you would like to buy, using the contact details provided on the catalogue. There are also free resources available on the website for parents on how to use the resource guides or how to use the resource materials.

Vivlia Publishers and Booksellers (Pty) Ltd

1. "Corporate Vision: To be the leading African publisher of educational children, academic and general publications which reclaim and enhance the culture of teaching, learning and reading.

Corporate Mission: To enhance the quality of life through the promotion of the culture of learning and authoring by publishing accessible, unbiased, gender-sensitive, significant publications. We turn ideas into books".

2. The website does not give clear information on how to order or buy the books or resource materials. There is the option however, to create an online account with the publishers and use your log in details to log into the website and perhaps access to feature to buy materials online.

4.2.5 Other publishers

This category refers to publishers that publish their books digitally, that do not publish for the general market but for libraries and publishers whose work are not part of the traditional style of publishing.

Anansi –Uitgewers

1. "Anansi is a publisher of high quality children's books, mainly for the library market. The company also trades with other roll-players in the industry such as schools, book stores and the various departments of education. It is because of our focus on the library and schools market that we primarily trade in larger quantities. We specialize in picture books for Grade R to Grade 3 learners as well as storybooks for the more independent readers in Grade 4 to Grade 7. Our titles are published in six languages namely Afrikaans, English, isiXhosa, isiZulu, Setswana and Sesotho".

2. In order to buy the books you can add them to the shopping cart by clicking on the small shopping cart underneath the book. You can then review your cart and check out when you are done. The problem is that you cannot buy single books but you have to buy in large quantities. Also, a lot of the African language books that are on the website are out of stock.

Modlin e-learning Solutions

1. “Over 30 years, Modlin eLearning Solutions has invested in mapping skills, concepts and subject disciplines- and the all-critical relationships between the three. Our central philosophy is that it’s impossible to teach or learn unless you know what you don’t know. This is why we’ve developed a profound understanding of the way students process information and the real – world challenges faced by teachers. We’ve used this to create an integrated range of cross-platform solutions that have the detail and granularity needed for successful diagnostics, teaching and learning. All Modlin products and services are locally developed by subject matter and curriculum specialists and closely aligned with the NCS, CAPS and Bloom’s taxonomy. We also train teachers on the product mix selected for their schools, and follow up via usage monitoring and performance measurement. Modlin has B-BBEE level 1 status and currently runs offices in South Africa, Sub-Saharan Africa, the United Kingdom and the United States, with more on the way”.

2. The website is still under construction, rendering the online shop unavailable as yet. There are free resources available on the website for adults on how to use the software.

The Learning Channel

1. “Learning Channel recognises that literacy and numeracy, are the most essential and basic skills that each child should learn at school. The Read with us! Series is a CAPS compliant Literacy Programme for Grades R, 1, 2 and 3, which is fun, interactive and comprehensive. The content of the DVDs, Readers and Playbooks covers fundamental learning such as phonics, the alphabet, letter and sound recognition, rhymes and fine motor development. It includes skills such as picking the odd one out, identifying objects that are the same, basic numeracy skills such as counting and positioning, eye-hand co-ordination, tracing and colouring. The content also addresses social issues such as the environment, gender equality, social interaction, helping, greeting, being polite and sharing...”.

2. In order to buy the materials you need to select the product you would like to buy, add it to the shopping cart, and check the cart out by filling in your details and then placing the order. You can pay with PayFast or EFT so you would need a debit or credit card to complete your transaction.

R.I.C. Publications (Pty) Ltd

1. “We are an South African-owned and operated publisher of workbooks, reproducible teaching resources (blackline masters), digital and interactive educational products, and other educational items

for early years, and primary and secondary schooling...Established in 1986, R.I.C. Publications was started by a group of educators who had identified the need for a wide range of top – quality supplementary resources for schools. With a publishing list that now exceeds 1000 titles – and with products sold in the UK, Ireland, Malaysia, Singapore, Hong Kong, South Africa, Zimbabwe, New Zealand, – R.I.C. has become a leading provider of practical and relevant educator resource products designed for direct use in the classroom”.

2. In order to buy you can browse through the catalogue and select the product that you want. You have the option to download the free teacher’s notes, to view the book or download it (even though the viewing and downloading options may not work all the time). When you have selected what you want you can add it to the shopping cart and check out the cart y filling in your details, you also need to specify whether you are ordering for a school or whether it is a personal order.

Rural in the Citi (Pty) Ltd

1. “Formed in 2012 Bochum-Limpopo. The Rural in the Citi (Pty) (RITC) is an inter-disciplinary, independent children’s book publisher and an art Movement. The Movement was established to create access to literature in indigenous languages and the use of art and media strategies as alternative education models and tools. We believe is it important to tell rural stories and educate our children in indigenous languages. To this effect we keep producing variety of indigenous language storybooks and videos through our publishing programme. Through our art programme, RITC initiate and provide platforms for collaborative, experimental & innovative projects with youth, artists, cultural practitioners and educators. We strive to uplift rural artists and to encourage their participation as citizens through various forms of art. We help provide artists with a platform to showcase and sell their work in cities and therefore promoting rural art. We tackle among others challenges such as unemployment, substance abuse, and lack of resources. RITC conducts workshops in various schools and community centres in rural villages across South Africa.

2. The website does not give clear information on how to buy or order the books or resources online.

Lingua Franca Publishers

1. At the time of finalizing the investigation the website was still under construction so the information was not available.

2. At the time of finalizing the investigation the website was still under construction so the information was not available.

4.2.6 Summary of website and availability survey

There is a stated willingness by some publishers to commit themselves to publishing in the African languages, even though the number willing to do so is not large. The larger educational and trade

publishers do not state a commitment to publishing in the African languages, even though some of them are already publishing in some of these languages and are publishing on a large scale, for example Cambridge University Press published 594 books according to the study, compared to Depicta that did not publish any books in the African languages. There is a commitment from some of the publishers to publish in the African languages but their levels of commitment and the numbers of books they publish do not correlate so there is a gap between their stated commitment and what they actually practice.

There is also a gap between the books that are being published in the African languages and the availability of the books to the general public. In order to purchase the books from the publishers, and access some of the books from the NGOs on open access, one needs to have access to the internet, which suggests that books are still limited to people who have easy access to computers or who can afford to buy them. In addition, one needs to have access to a debit or credit card in order to make an online purchase thus excluding some people who would like to purchase the books but who do not have such cards. These findings will be discussed further. Socio-economic factors such as the inability to afford access to the internet, can make it hard for people to access literacy and in the long run, affect their reading development because of limited access to a wide variety of reading materials.

4.3 Discussion

The key findings presented in the previous section are discussed in this final section of the chapter

4.3.1 Dominance of commercial educational publishers, followed by education NGOs, in the publishing of Foundation Phase texts in African languages

As stated above, the commercial educational publishers and NGOs are publishing more books in the African languages than the trade, mixed and other publishers, such as Njabulo Publishers (23) and Qualibooks Publishers (216), who published more books in the African languages than Jonathan Ball Publications (0), Penguin Random House (0) and Pan Macmillan (0). There is an incentive to publish in the African languages for educational publishers because sales are almost guaranteed (Edwards & Ngwaru: 2011b). It can be argued that the concentration of the publishing of texts in African languages in one sector of the publishing industry limits the variety in what is being published. In the history of African language publishing in South Africa, educational publishers have been dominant. The dominance of educational publishers in African language publishers has its roots in the apartheid era where, black authors felt the need to publish in the educational sector because of pressure from government (Edwards & Ngwaru: 2011b). It is interesting to see that educational publishers, even after the end of apartheid, are still dominating African language publishing, followed by Education NGOs whose vested interests are the promotion of literacy in South Africa, no matter the language.

What the commercial educational publishers publish is constrained by their need to conform to the requirements of the Curriculum and Assessment Policy (CAPS) with regard to the curriculum for African languages in Grades 1 to 3. While NGOs such as the South African Institute of Distance Education (SAIDE), publishers of the African Storybook texts, the Project for Alternatives in Education in South Africa (PRAESA), publishers of Nal'ibali texts and the Molteno Project, publishers of the Vula Bula series offer more varied texts to young readers, the NGOs do not have the marketing divisions that educational publishers have and thus what they offer may not be widely known to the general public. However, Nal'ibali does a good job of making sure that people know about their books by publishing bi-monthly pull out sections for children to read in popular newspapers. They also have details about where their books can be found. The marketing of the books for Nal'ibali has made it easier for people to identify with them and to find books in the African language of their choice that they would like to buy.

4.3.2 Contrasting publishing practices of smaller and larger trade publishers

The smaller trade publishers are publishing more in the African languages than the medium and larger trade publishers, who publish mainly in English and Afrikaans. This could be attributed to the fact that the publishers are smaller and they have a narrower publishing focus than the bigger publishers that may try to publish various types of reading materials. This finding is however, surprising because as noted by Edwards & Ngwaru (2011), it is not as easy for the smaller publishers to publish in the African languages because of the expense that comes with publishing books in these languages, and the added expense of originating the books in an African language. This then raises the question of how is it that the smaller publishers are able to commit to publishing in the African languages and incurring these expenses whereas the larger publishers, whom it is assumed have more financial resources, are not publishing in these languages?

This question interrogates the excuse used by publishers not to publish in the African languages, citing market forces and expenses incurred versus sales, because the smaller publishers seem to accept the costs incurred, no matter how many books they are actually publishing. This finding suggests that there may be other forces at play when it comes to publishing in the African languages. For example, it is possible that there is still a negative attitude towards publishing in the African languages, carried over from the apartheid era, with English and Afrikaans positioned as the languages of wider communication so that publishing in African languages is for meeting the demands of the school curriculum only.

4.3.3 Types of reading material published in African languages

It is not surprising to find that the most published types of reading materials in the African languages are readers and storybooks, mainly linked to the CAPS curriculum but this is a cause for concern because findings from assessments of South African children's competence as readers (e.g. the

PIRLS tests) indicate that many children are reading well below the level expected for their grade. The limited number of texts available to children in their languages is likely to contribute to their lack of competence as readers. It is important for children to read regularly in order to become good readers, and to be able to do so, they need to be exposed to a wide variety of options in the print environment (Pretorius & Mampuru: 2007). NF Saliwa publishes fiction, non-fiction and poetry in IsiXhosa for learners in Grades 1 -3. The publisher may only be publishing one poetry book and one non-fiction book in one language, but this is a small trade publisher. If a small trade publisher can offer a poetry book in IsiXhosa, why are bigger trade publishers not following suit and widening their publishing scope to include more variety in African language publishing? If this is done it has the potential to get more people to buy the reading materials, and perhaps spark an interest in children who speak the African languages to read more in their home language/s. By widening the variety of reading materials in the African languages, it also strengthens the usage of the African languages, because the language boards like PanSALB will have more work to do in making sure that there is sufficient vocabulary to fit the new publishing need. Non-fiction, poetry and information books are hardly published and this shows that there is a gap in the reading materials for Foundation Phase learners. This limits the kinds of texts that children are exposed to and may limit their literacy development because they are reading storybooks that are developed to teach children how learn how to read. Children need at least eight years to become proficient in one language (Bloch: 2012), but how are they expected to become proficient in at least one African language in three years with the limited reading materials available to them.

4.3.4 The least and most published languages

The African languages that are published the least are Xitsonga, Tshivenda, IsiNdebele and Siswati. This is highly concerning. The excuse for not publishing these languages as much as languages like IsiZulu and Sesotho could be that not large numbers of people who speak these languages. It is true that in the South African population, only 11.6 % of the population speak these languages according to the 2011 census (Statistics South Africa, 2011), but that does not make them any less important, and they are official languages. Publishing for small populations is risky because sales are not guaranteed, but that does not mean that these languages should be ignored. Edwards & Ngwaru (2011) suggest that smaller languages are often over- looked as minority languages thereby reducing their status. The data shows that the smaller languages are not as well served and this uneven distribution tends to reinforce their status as minority languages. Where these books are being published, they are being published on a very small scale and purchasing the reading materials is harder because some publishers want the books to be specially ordered, and a significant number of books ordered. Some of the materials freely available on the African Storybook website are published in minority languages so here, the issue is that of publicising the availability of these texts and of creating access to them – perhaps through libraries.

According to the census Afrikaans is the primary language of only 13.5% of the population but Afrikaans books are being published by almost every publisher included in the research for this report. Afrikaans has a history of being developed over time in terms of usage and publishing and many efforts have been made to strengthen the language and culture of the Afrikaans populace, which is why, even though the population is small, the books are published and sold on a larger scale than the African languages (Mda & Mothata, 2000).

There is more commitment to publishing in English and Afrikaans than there is to publishing in the African languages. This is shown by the number of publishers that publish reading materials in English and Afrikaans, no matter how small or big they are, and in addition, also publish the African languages. This shows that even though some publishers are publishing in the African languages, English and Afrikaans are still the backbone of the publishing industry in South Africa. Heugh (2000) has said that African language-speaking parents also prefer reading in English and if given the choice, they would let their children learn in English rather than the African languages. In this case the problem does not lie with the publishers necessarily but it lies with the attitude towards reading in the African languages that people have; that the African languages are considered less important than English. This has more to do with the status given to languages such as English and Afrikaans, and the publishers could do more to encourage people to read in the African languages by publishing a wider variety of reading materials, marketing those reading materials effectively and providing easier access to purchasing and acquiring the reading materials.

4.3.5 Translation versus origination of texts in African languages

There is evidence that translation is still being used to publish books in the African languages and there are not many large or small commercial publishers that originate books in the African languages. The main source language for the translation of books is English, with Afrikaans following closely behind it, with some texts being translated from IsiXhosa into other languages. Publishers have stated various reasons for using translation, some saying that it is cheaper, and some saying that it is less time-consuming (Macdonald, 1991). Whatever the reasons are, translation is still a viable way of publishing the African languages for some publishers. The advantages and disadvantages of using translation as a means for publishing were discussed in Chapter 2, and as much as more books need to be originated in the African languages, there will need to be more training of editors and proofreaders in these languages.

4.3.6 Publishers' policies

According to their mission / vision statements, there is a willingness from some publishers to committing themselves to publishing in African languages, even though it is not a significant number of publishers willing to do so. This shows that publishers themselves recognize the need to publish in the African languages, and are slowly paving the way for African language publishing. There is a

commitment from some of the publishers to publish in African languages but their levels of commitment and the numbers of books they publish do not always correlate so there is a gap somewhere between their commitment and what they actually practice. There could be various factors contributing to this gap, such as publishers being reluctant to publish in the African languages because the market is too small and people not having enough disposable income to afford the books, while originating reading materials in the African languages could incur more costs for the publishers (Edwards, 2008). Publishers need to find a way of implementing their commitment to publishing, because a commitment in and of itself is not enough to sustain reading development in the African languages.

The larger educational and trade publishers do not seem willing to publically commit themselves to publishing in the African languages, even though some of them are already doing so and are publishing on a large scale.

4.3.7 Availability of texts

There is also a gap between the books that are being published in the African languages and the availability of the books to the general public. In order to purchase the books from the publishers, and access some of the books from the NGOs on open access, one needs to have access to the internet, which suggests that reading materials are still limited to people who have access to the internet, although African Storybook reading materials can be downloaded onto cellphones which widens the access.

In addition to that, one needs to have access to a debit or credit card in order to make an online purchase, excluding some people that would like to purchase the books but do not have credit or debit cards. The exclusion of people without debit or credit cards by this book-buying method suggests two things, firstly that the book-buying process is limited to the elite that can afford to have debit and credit cards and secondly, that because they can afford to have debit or credit cards, they can afford to purchase the books.

These two suggestions are problematic because in as much as the internet has made it easier for people to access facilities and resources like publisher's catalogues, in the same vein it has implicitly excluded certain types of people from the book-buying process. Also, limiting the book-buying process to the internet and thereby systematically excluding certain people means that some people are excluded from purchasing books and thus hampering the sales of certain types of books like people who would like to buy the African language books but cannot do so. This could affect what people are reading (limiting their scope of literature), the sale of African language books (because black Africans have a history of not being able to afford books), and in the long term negatively affects the publishing of books in the African languages because of 'market forces'.

It was important to find out how easy or difficult it is to purchase books and to find the books from publishers. From the data collected, it seems as though if you have access to the internet, it is easier to find the publishers that publish in your area of interest. It has been demonstrated that a simple Google search can yield results that will enable the person that is looking for a publisher to find what they are looking for. The book-buying process is however not that simple. Some of the publishers do not have active websites, and from those that do have active websites, some make it difficult to purchase the books because of the difficulty of navigating their websites. Edwards (2008) says “in order to foster a culture of reading, children need easy access to books”. When looking at the number of publishers who have websites that were hard to navigate, it is easy to see how people may have thought that reading materials were not being published in the African languages, and when they were being published, that they were not for sale to the general public. In the long run, this could affect the sales of books in the African languages and lead to publishers thinking twice about publishing in the African languages because of the long shelf-life of books in the African languages.

CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This short final chapter summarises the main findings of the study and makes recommendations based on these findings together with recommendations for further research.

5.1 Main findings and recommendations in response to them

One of the main findings of this study is that outside the mainstream educational publishers there is reluctance on the part of many publishers to publish texts in African languages for young readers. This situation could be influenced by market factors. If this is so, then it is recommended that the government takes action to normalize the usage of the African languages outside of education in the classroom (Desai, 2001). For example, greater use could be made of African languages at a national and provincial level in government publications, signage etc. Pretorius & Mampuru (2007) suggests that special planning and budgeting by the government needs to be done to resolve the problem of not having sufficient books in the African languages. Government intervention, for example in the form of support for the small trade publishers who have shown commitment to publishing in African languages and to libraries for the purchase of texts for children in African languages, could be the key to unlocking a wider range of reading materials for Foundation Phase learners.

At present, much of the reading material published for Foundation Phase readers conforms to the requirements of the CAPS curriculum. The limited variety may discourage children from reading in their home languages. Widening the variety of reading materials in the African languages could also strengthen the usage of the African languages. Publishers need to look at publishing more books that are non-fiction and informational in order to give children who are in the Foundation Phase a wider variety of reading materials because they are still learning how to read

The limited availability to the general public of existing texts in African languages is one of the key findings of this study and the lack of information about freely available texts is another. It is recommended that 'for profit' publishers give attention to publicizing what is available and to making it easier for the public to purchase texts, perhaps through outlets at community centres, and to donating, or offering at reduced cost, texts to community libraries where these exist. Having noted that Nal'ibali promotes its materials to the general public, it is recommended that Saide similarly makes the public aware of what the African Storybook initiative offers because these texts are freely available and can be accessed via a cellphone as well as via the internet.

5.2 Limitations of the study and recommendations for further research

There are at least two limitations to this study. Firstly, it is recognised that while every effort was made to locate all publishers of material in African languages for Foundation Phase learners, some may have been omitted or the information obtained may not have been correctly interpreted –

particularly where publishers' websites were difficult to navigate. Secondly, the study was limited to desktop research (given both time and financial constraints). A recommendation for further research is that a selection of publishers in each of the sectors identified for this study be interviewed so that findings from this desk top survey could be verified, adjusted or extended.

Reference List

- Bloch C. 2012. Why is mother tongue based education so significant?. *African Leader*. Issue 41. PRAESA.
- Chisholm L. 2005. The state of South Africa's schools. In *State of the Nation South Africa 2004 – 2005*. Daniel J, Southall R, Lutchman J.(Eds.) Human Sciences Research Council, Cape Town.
- Cummins J. 2007. Rethinking monolingual strategies in multilingual classrooms. *Canadian Journal of Applied Linguistics* 10 (2) 221-240.
- Department of Basic Education. 2011. *Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements*. Retrieved at [www.education.gov.za/Curriculum/CurriculumAssessmentPolicyStatements\(CAPS\)/CAPSFoundation.aspx](http://www.education.gov.za/Curriculum/CurriculumAssessmentPolicyStatements(CAPS)/CAPSFoundation.aspx)
- Department of Basic Education. 2014. *Draft National Policy for the Provision and Management of Learning and Teaching Support Material (LTSM) for public comments*. Retrieved at www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=MnCEAX7Qrac%3D&tabid=390&mid=1125.
- Department of Basic Education. 2013. *The Incremental Introduction of African Languages in South African Schools*. Retrieved at www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=DzmOFgWSE4E%3D&tabid=390&mid=1125.
- Department of Education 1997. Curriculum 2005.
- Department of Education 2005. Revised National Curriculum Statement. Retrieved at <http://www.education.gov.za/Document5/Documents/RNCS%20for%20Senior%20Phase.pdf>
- Desai Z. 2001. Multilingualism in South Africa with particular reference to the role of African languages in education. *International Review of Education* 47 (3-4).
- Edwards V. 2008. *The Culture of Reading: an evaluation of a key programme of PRAESA*. PRAESA 5-30.
- Edwards V, Ngwaru J.M. 2011a. African language publishing for children in South Africa: challenges for translators. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* 14 (5), 589-602.
- Edwards V, Ngwaru J.M. 2011b Multilingual education in South Africa: the role of publishers. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development* 32 (5), 435-450.
- Even-Zohar I. 1990. The Position of Translated Literature within the Literary Polysystem. *Poetics Today* 11 (1), 45-51.
- Heugh K. 2000. The Case Against Bilingual and Multilingual Education in South Africa. *PRAESA Occasional Paper* no. 6.

- Holmes J.S, Lambert J., van den Broeck R. 1978. *Literature and translation: new perspectives in literary studies with a basic bibliography of books on translation studies*. Acco (academic publishing company), Leuven/Belgium.
- Howie S. J, Venter, E., Van Staden, S., Zimmermann, L., Long, C., Du Toit, C., Scherman, V. & Archer, E. 2008. *PIRLS 2006 Summary Report*. Pretoria: Centre for Evaluation and Assessment.
- Jordaan H. 2011. Semantic processing skills of Grade 1 English language learners in two educational contexts. *South African Journal of Education* 31, 518-534. EASA.
- Kruger H. 2009. Language – in – education policy, publishing and the translation of children’s books in South Africa. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology* 17 (1), 33-61.
- Kruger H. 2012. Preliminary norms in the selection of children’s books for translation in South Africa. *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies* 29 (3), 293-311.
- Land S. 2016. Automaticity in reading isiZulu. *Reading & Writing* 7 (1), 1-13.
- Macdonald C. & Burroughs, E. 1991. *Eager to Talk and Learn and Think*. Maskew Miller Longman, Cape Town.
- Macdonald C.A. 2002. Are the children still swimming up the waterfall? A look at literacy development in the new curriculum. *Language Matters* 33 (1), 111-141.
- McKinney C. 2017, *Language and Power in Post-Colonial Schooling*. New York: Routledge.
- Mda T. & Mothata S. 2000. *Critical Issues in South African Education-After 1994*. Juta and Company Limited, Kenwyn South Africa.
- Mpe P, Seeber M. 1996. The Politics of Book Publishing in South Africa: A Critical Overview. In *The Politics of Publishing in South Africa*. Evans N, Seeber M. (Eds.) Holger Ehling Publishing Ltd. London University of Natal Press, Scottsville.
- National Education Policy Act, 1996 (Act No. 27 of 1996). Retrieved at www.acts.co.za/national-education/assp_assessment_policy_in_the_general_education_and_training_band_grades_r_to_9_and_abet
- Nkosi B. 2014. *No time to make decent textbooks*. *Mail & Guardian*. Retrieved at www.mg.co.za/article/2014-11-28-no-time-to-make-decent-textbooks.
- PRAESA. 2004. *Feeling at Home with Literacy in the Mother Tongue*. Keynote Presentation at the 29th IBBY World Congress 5th – 9th September 2004. Cape Town, South Africa.
- Pretorius E.J. 2014. Supporting transition or playing catch-up in Grade 4? Implications for standards in education and training. *Perspectives in education* 32 (1), 51-76.

Pretorius E.J, Mampuru D. M. 2007. Playing football without a ball: language, reading and academic performance in a high-poverty school. *Journal of Research in Reading* 30 (1) 38-58.

Statistic South Africa 2011. Census in brief. Retrieved from
http://www.statssa.gov.za/census/census_2011/census_products/Census_2011_Census_in_brief.pdf

Van den Broeck R. 1978. *Literature and translation: new perspectives in literary studies with a basic bibliography of books on translation studies*. (ed) Holmes JS, Lambert J, Van den Broek R. Acco (academic publishing company) Leuven/Belgium.

Van Rooyen B. 2005. *Get Your Book Published in 30 (Relatively) Easy Steps*. Penguin

Welch T, Treffry-Goatley L. 2016 *Saide's African Storybook (Asb) recently printed 166 000 storybooks!*. Newsletter Volume22, No. 1 2016. South African Institute for Distance Education. Retrieved at www.saide.org.za/resources/newsletters/Vol_22_no.1_2016/Content/ELITS.html.

Vula Bula n.d. www.vulabula.molteno.co.za/about-vula-bula.

Zimmerman L. & Smit, B. 2014. Profiling classroom reading comprehension development practices from the PIRLS 2006 in South Africa. *South African Journal of Education* 34(3) pp.1-9