manipulate blacks. (See IV.4 and 5.5.4.3.)

If the principals, all of whom were African, had mainly history syllabuses in mind when they responded to A5 (syllabuses) then there may indeed be a continuity between this and their reactions to B6 (a just S.A.). Equally, it could be predicted that the supervisors (all of whom were white) while perhaps having a cognitive recognition of the shortcomings of the history syllabuses, were not stung by them and therefore did not feel as strong a need to change them.

So, it can then perhaps be said that, both the supervisors and the principals (1) felt it important to [illegible] their pupils to work towards a just South African, and (2) recognised the problem of distorted history. However, they differed in their assessment of the importance of changing the history syllabus in order to improve teaching.

In [illegible] South African society, realities and issues [illegible] Gardiner (ibid.) it is strongly argued that history as it is taught in schools has the potential to promote rather than reduce conflict in a country such as South Africa .

It is claimed that the child's perception of his own group and its place in society, and his stereotypes of other groups, are

> [illegible] and projected into the future by the way in which historical events are interpreted and presented, especially in the school situation. Research has repeatedly confirmed that when a negative image of other groups has once been

formed, it is extremely difficult to change this (ibid., 74). (Emphasis in the original.)

In South Africa The general trend among the various hist[illegible]graphic schools of thought .... is an excessive ncentrati n upon the ethnic (ibid., 75). In addition The extent to which the (ethnic) group forms a reference [illegible]int, means that such a gr up is, in effect, placed in [illegible] to ther groups .... . (Emphasis in the riginal) There is lso a marked concern to determine which r up s sh ll be held responsible for the [illegible] the past . They n lude that

> This identifi a'. n t a scapegoat .... is [illegible] ne f the st powerful 'archetypes' that [illegible] gr up prejudice and encourages .... p tentially .... ntli t-oriented frames of referen e [illegible] '6 .

If this reas n.ng is a cept d, it can perhaps be [illegible] n South Africa. If justice, in [illegible] depends upon equal pportunities for all, [illegible] gr up aff.l r r, then th.s will surely [illegible] - rrative eff rt.

[illegible] regard the supervis rs' and the principals' [illegible] the importance f 84 (they should have some wide [illegible] friends f their wn age wh m they see quite [illegible] (significance. Both groups both rated and [illegible] ng the three least important statements in Set [illegible] (See Table 5:14.)

The HSRC committee in question strongly recommends [illegible] n't between diffe ent ethni groups in order to

reduce intergroup conflict. However, they hasten to point out, that

> A careful and comprehensive analysis of the literature .... showed that contact as such does not lead to a change in attitude (ibid., 90). (Emphasis in the original.)

If such contact is to result in more positive attitudes, then it

> must occur spontaneously, informally, between people of equal status and on a friendly basis (ibid., 91)

Contact of this sort is implied in statement B4 (white friends).

It will be recalled that the interviews upon which the statements in Sets A, B and C were based, were carried out in Fagis in 1983. Responses to these statements were gathered in Soweto schools in 1986. In the intervening years many of the people of Soweto had given much thought to education.

In this regard he enlisted A.R. Morphet (of the Centre for Extra Mural Studies, University of Cape Town) in an exercise that was documented in a report by Morphet (1985) entitled "Evaluative study interpreting the educational efficacy of the Funda Centre, Soweto".

The Funda Centre, normally referred to simply as "Funda", caters for a wide variety of educational needs of black adults in Soweto. There are also some activities for children. As an institution it is far more flexible and responsive to the felt needs of the community than the schools whose syllabuses are laid down by the white-

controlled Department of Education and Tra ning.

It is situated close to the largest pair of schools visited in this investigation, i.e. Lima and Lourdes, parts of Holy Cross cluster. Three of the fifteen pupils interviewed at Lima sp ntaneously mentioned Funda among the three most imp rtant ways of helping them to learn better. They did not elaborate.

In the discussi n that f ll ws some insights gleaned at Funda, and some outc mes of the deliberations of the Nati nal Education Cr.sis mmittee, will be presented in rder illuminate the fin.ings lescribed in this chapter.

M rphet remarks that there is

> ... little reliable interpretive research on either schooling r extra-school education (in S wet).

He claims that

> we simply d n' kn w enough t make reliable and valid statemen n h w the residents t Soweto .... understand and educational resources ibid., 66 .

He s.ggests 'hat

> I' ay be possible to speak of 'he educational cl'.re t wet being .ged s mewhere between the c mmun .'re on the ne hand which lays its stress a hievement, mobility and status rewards; and p litical culture on the ther whi h pr du counter emphasis ot lidarity, br therh d and common mmitment to 'he struggle gain' pressi n. The bitter dialectic between 'hese ultural positions is not nly visible to any bserver f the struggles over ling, but part of the experience of everyone parti ipating in educati n. .... Both press ately upon individuals and persistently u,on institutions (ibid., 68 .

In support of this ntention he points to the very that rged in wet in 1985 concerning high

school examinations.

> To write was to violate the political culture, not to write was to violate (what I have termed) the economic (ibid., 68).

(In order to appreciate the connection between schooling and the economic culture it is necessary to refer to Schneier's work. See 5.5.3.4.)

Morphet concludes that

> The resolution of the contradictions .... lies ahead in a future synthesis in which individual [illegible] is validated within a new political [illegible] (Emphasis in the original)

In his view, Funda

> must be able to deliver on both .... sides of the contradiction. It must be able to provide valid education and certification for individuals who are in pursuit of advancement and it must be able to provide a milieu .... in which the culture of solidarity and common commitment can find a base (ibid., by emphasis in the original.)

Some of the opinions expressed by the teachers suggest that the tension present in Funda in 1985 was also present in the rural primary schools in Kagiso in 1983 and in Mapetla in 1986, albeit in less overt form. The teachers in these schools also wanted their schools to deliver on both sides of the contradiction.

On the one hand they wanted their Std V pupils to do well in their end of year examinations and to be well prepared for their subsequent education and careers. In Kagiso evidence of this was provided by an account of one teacher's efforts beyond the call of duty (PSN-1) and from the evident pride of the teachers in their pupils' successes

and concern when they felt that appropriate standards had not been maintained. (For example: PIN-24, PIN-26 to 28, PIN-32, MBN-31, MBN-33.) In Soweto this is seen most dramatically in the great importance attached to B1 (exams and high school) by the assistant teachers. See 5.5.3.3.2 and Tables 5:6 and 5:8.)

On the other hand, the extent of the black teacher's resistance to the history syllabus and textbooks in use, and the value attached by the principals to B6 (a just S.A.). gives some indication of their wish that their schools would provide a milieu .... in which the culture of solidarity and common commitment would find a base . (See VIII.4, 5.5.4.3, and 5.5.3.3.2.

Morphet asserts that the National Education Crisis Committee (NECC), which grew out of the Soweto Parents Crisis Committee, "is at the decisive centre of (these) [political] struggles." It might therefore be salutary to examine their basic principles in order to discover important [areas] in which the teachers expressed [dissatisfaction].

Hartshorne, speaking in September 1986, claimed that

> Community responses to the continuing education crisis (in black schools) have begun to crystallise in the main round the NECC movement .... (1986a,12).

It is of positive significance for two major reasons:

> Firstly, in bringing together community, political and educational leaders, trade unions, parents, teachers, students and pupils, it has created a powerful negotiating force that government, ..., will have to listen to and take into account,

In the second place, the NECC has moved away from what has become a rather barren exercise, the recapitulation of the failures of 'Bantu Education', to a consideration both of the alternatives now and the form and character of a longer-term post-apartheid education system. This thinking has emerged under the banner of 'People's Education', [illegible] (Ibid., 11).

Helen Zille regards the latter as representing

perhaps the most significant shift in resistance strategy this decade. An unlikely turn from the politics of refusal (there had been a widespread boycott of classes by high school pupils) towards community involvement in transforming the education system (1987, 25).

This was manifested by a brief message from the African National Congress to the Soweto Parents Crisis Committee's National Consultative Conference on the Crisis in Education held at the University of the Witwatersrand on the 28th and 29th September 1985. Its implication was [illegible] education should be reconstructed rather than [illegible] (Ibid., 27).

The ANC's message was followed by a [illegible] proposing an end to Bantu Education is reflected in the statement by the [illegible] Committee charged with [illegible] alternative curricula in history and English. The committees drew support from the country's leading academic historians in these fields. In addition, educationists [illegible] universities are [illegible] research in [illegible] education policy with the NECC (Ibid., 28).

The English subject committee produced two documents, one entitled People's English for People's Power (NECC, 1987a) the other People's education: english [illegible] standard 9 and 10 (NECC, 1987b). Both were initially made available in January 1987.

In the latter it is claimed that At the heart of

People's Education lies consultation" (NECC, 1987b,1). It is essentially education as process'.

> The term process here means exploration through language. It involves discussion and revision, and an understanding of how parts are eventually related to the whole (NECC, 1987a,1).
>
> Parent-teacher-student associations should provide the basic structures for the development of People's Education. They support the teachers, they form the link between schools and the community and they offer students influence over their own education. Without such structures there can be no democratic basis to People's Education (ibid., 1-4).

The writer of the St. Angela's Stimulus Paper complained passionately of the absence of such consultation in the system of education in operation in South Africa in 1983 (p.7). Apart from this one instance there was no mention of this subject in Kagiso. (The three young teachers at Mofumahadi who spoke of the need for parents and teachers to work together for the good of the children did not have curriculum development in mind. See MBN-5 to 9.)

Nobody in Soweto raised this issue.

This is the first major omission.

It should be noted in passing that opinion on this subject was not tested in Soweto because serious problems were anticipated in relation to statements such as I would teach much better if my fellow teachers, my pupils and their parents, could influence what is taught and how. As there were almost certainly no local examples of such consultation, the notion might be quite unfamiliar, and so the teachers unlikely to hold firm opinions on this topic.

Further, consultation of the sort envisaged would not seem feasible with the youngest children in the primary school. Thus this statement would differ markedly from one such as "I would teach much better if I had the furniture, books, apparatus and other equipment that I need". Responses to them would be difficult to compare.)

The second omission is a lack of reference to a particular political movement in relation to the aims of education. In contrast, the English subject committee based its proposals upon positions emerging from

- the Freedom Charter
- resolutions of the December 1985 and March 1986 Education Crisis Conferences
- the Education Charter
- the priorities of community and worker movements (NECC, 1987a,1).

However it should be noted that, in spite of this omission, the person in Kajis apparently influenced by [illegible], like a number of the people in Soweto that valued B6 in [illegible].A.], would agree substantially with the aims of the proposals of the NECC English committee, as they were [illegible]:

to assist all learners to

- understand the evils of apartheid and to think and speak in non-racial, non-sexist and non-elitist ways
- determine their own destinies and to free themselves from oppression

- play a creative role in the achievement of a non-racial democratic South Africa
- use English effectively for their own purposes
- express and consider the issues and questions of their time
- transform themselves into full and active members of society
- pr[illegible]d with their studies (ibid., 1).

In addition to the two omissions described above (i.e. the absence of a call for consultation between teachers, parents and pupils, and reference to a particular political movement in relation to the aims of education) Hartshorne [illegible] the supervisors and teachers did not offer an opinion.

[illegible], in discussion of opportunities and options that [illegible] movement and development towards post-apartheid education exist in a non-racial, democratic and just society, he points to alternatives that are being and will be practised right now. These include

> [illegible] in and around schools, designed to [illegible] pupils, to discuss alternative [illegible] and political models, to interpret the processes of exploitation and oppression, and to prepare them for [illegible] liberation struggle' (ibid., 26).

It might have been expected that those who wanted Std V pupils to be determined to work for a just South Africa, based on Christian values (B6) might have entertained some such ideas.

Secondly, Hartshorne points to the effect on pupils of

those young people not in school. A recent market research survey had indicated that only 16% of urban black youths between the ages of 16-24 were in full-time employment. Pressures on pupils ranged from those of brothers and friends ("What's the use? Where is it going to get you?"), to straightforward, organised intimidation (ibid., 10-11).

This problem was mentioned by no one in Kagiso or Soweto.

CHAPTER SIX: THE FIELDWORK METHODOLOGY IN RETROSPECT

6.1 INTRODUCTION

It will be recalled that, for the purposes of this study, an 'anthropomorphic" model of man has been assumed. As a result, man is taken seriously as a commentator on his actions (2.2). It has also been assumed that the teachers' perceptions deeply influence the extent to which a proposed innovation is successfully introduced into a school (1.3). These assumptions, taken in conjunction, led to the decision to explore the teachers' professional aims, the means by which they felt they could improve their teaching, and their perceptions of their own educational needs. In addition, the perceptions of the supervisors and of a sample of Study pupils were sought as they also influenced the schools on a day-to-day basis.

Factors influencing the focus of the fieldwork underlined the importance of the anthropomorphic model of man and affected the methods used in this study, particularly in Phase I (2.3).

The following discussion of the mode used to carry out the fieldwork required for the purposes of this study is generally concerned with validity, in the sense that will be indicated below.

In Chapter Two attention was drawn to three recognised conceptions of the interview. Further, it was said that, in this investigation, the interview was regarded as "an encounter necessarily sharing many of the features of

everyday life (2.4.2.2). Kitwood, in relation to this conception, says that validity is a "redundant notion" for

> every interpersonal situation may be said to be valid, [illegible] whether or not it confirms to expectations, whether or not it involves a high degree of communication, ... (Cited in Cohen and Manion, 1980, 253).

With respect to the interview in general, this is accepted in the sense in which Kitwood uses the term validity above.

However, in his study, the interview was used to [illegible] of the interviewees on stipulated subjects. In Phase I in particular, the researcher intended to elicit as full a range as possible, of thoughts, feelings [illegible]. Success was believed to be largely dependent upon rapport.

Kitwood also [illegible] meaning of validity in a passage quoted by Cohen and Manion, 1980, 252-253. He argues, [illegible] increased reliability of the interview is bought [illegible] by greater control of its elements, this is [illegible] at the cost of reduced validity. He explains:

> [illegible] relatively human element in the interview is necessary to its validity. The [illegible] interviewer [illegible] interval, behaviour, and [illegible] the less fully the interview is perceived as a friendly [illegible], and [illegible] the reactive bias is likely to be.

Further, this interviewer wished to avoid bias, the [illegible] between the characteristics of the interviewer and the respondents, and the substantive content of the questions (Cohen and Manion, 1980, 252). Finally, she was concerned to avoid distortion of the findings arising from

other sources such as inadequate sampling and inappropriate language-medium. The extent to which these aims were achieved can be regarded as a measure of the "validity" of these interviews. It is in this sense that the term is used in the following discussion.

Below, the central question to be addressed is

> What can this experience of field research contribute to an understanding of the methodology appropriate in studies of this type?

A number of sub-questions are raised, each of which should be understood as beginning with the phrase, In a field study of this kind, in a social and temporal context like this, ...

In the following chapter, the headings of the remaining sections in this chapter are given and, where appropriate, the relevant sub-questions.

It should be noted that the response given to these questions is focussed most directly upon issues related to interviews with teachers in Roman Catholic primary schools and their pupils. Nevertheless, many of these issues also arise in relation to interviews with supervisors and some of the same suggestions apply.

For ease of reference, the questions below, and the answers given to them, are presented in sequence in 6.5. In 6.6 a brief conclusion is given.

6.2 RAPPORT

6.2.1 Introduction

what measures could be taken to enhance rapport between interviewer and interviewees?

6.2.2 Phase I

6.2.3 Phase II

6.2.4 Conclusions

MEANS OF INCREASING RAPPORT IN INTERVIEWS DESIGNED TO SUGGEST ITEMS FOR A PERCEPTION SURVEY

3.1 Introduction

In preliminary interviews designed to suggest items for a survey of teacher perceptions, what strategies, could be used to reduce bias?

what could be done to elicit "considered" rather than "off-the-cuff", opinions?

6.3.2 Means of avoiding bias and other distortions

6.3.3 Conclusions



6.4 OTHER ASPECTS OF VALIDITY IN A PERCEPTION SURVEY

6.4.1 Introduction

when carrying out a survey of opinion, how could validity be enhanced and how might this validity be assessed?

6.4.2 Adult interviews: some strengths and weaknesses of the statements

what are the attributes of statements which, when rated and ranked by adults, are likely to yield the most satisfactory results?

6.4.3 [illegible]

If statements, designed for use with teachers, are to be rated and ranked by a sample of their Std V pupils, what could (and could not) be done to increase the validity of these children's responses?

How could the validity of the pupils' ratings be assessed?

How could the validity of rankings be increased?

6.4.4 Ranking: two means of increasing validity

How could the validity of rankings be increased?

6.4.5 Assessing the validity of rank orders

How could the validity of the ratings rankings of a set of statements be assessed?

6.5 [illegible] SUMMARY OF THE ANALYSIS

6.2 RAPPORT

6.2.1 INTRODUCTION

In this section, the question to be addressed is:

> What measures could be taken to enhance rapport between interviewer and interviewees?

In order to ground the answer in experience, a description will be given of the main factors that, in this study, militated against an appropriate rapport being established, and the ways in which they were countered. Some inherent problems in the methods used will be pointed out and some improvements are suggested.

The relevant aspects of Phase I and Phase II will be reviewed separately because of their differences in nature but in each case attention will be paid to the four themes mentioned in the previous paragraph. The conclusions to 6.2.2 and to 6.2.3 are presented in 6.2.4.

In this study the fieldwork was carried out entirely by one person, a white woman who arrived at the schools in question driving a car. It is likely that this alone would be sufficient to identify her as a "member of the privileged group", to use an expression employed by the source of unit PSR-1.

In view of the circumstances pertaining in Kagiso in 1983 (see 3.6 and in Soweto 1986 (see 5.4), there was reason to believe that a white stranger who visited black teachers in their schools, and asked their opinion about matters upon which one was unwilling to share her own, might meet with suspicion and hostility. But there were also

grounds for considering that such a negative response could under some circumstances be avoided or overcome. In the event, the picture was not a straightforward one, but a generally pessimistic prediction would not have been vindicated.

6.2.2 PHASE 1

The contextual circumstances of the interviewing at Kagiso have been described in 3.6 above. Attention will be drawn [illegible] to certain features relevant to the question posed at the beginning of this [illegible]. For details of the events the reader is referred to 3.6.

In Phase I the assumption that the Kagiso teachers were suspicious of the researcher was borne out in a number of ways. These included the initial responses by the teachers at St. [illegible], a Mofumahadi teacher's refusal to be interviewed and a nun's interpretation of this behaviour. It may also account for the tension exhibited by the teachers at St. Peter's when interviewed singly. It was suggested that this was a function of being interviewed one at a time. At one level this may well be correct. This is not to deny that the underlying anxiety probably stemmed from suspicion of the interviewer. Further, it may be that, for the same reason, their peers at Mofumahadi would also have been less than comfortable had they not been supported by the presence of friends (3.6).

The history of St. Peter's and Mofumahadi (3.4) together with the public knowledge of recent events

involving prominent members of the Kagiso community (3.6), are thought to have contributed to a distrust of the researcher as representative of a particular race and class.

It is probable that this bias was countered by a cluster of factors.

The researcher presented herself to the Kagiso community by first telephoning the parish priest, Fr. Kataka, who was also the manager of St. Peter's school. She explained her business briefly and asked permission to visit him in Kagiso. The main purpose of both these steps was to establish confidence in the researcher and to secure his co-operation. During the visit, Fr. Kataka pointed out that it was inconvenient for teachers to be interviewed in mid-October as examinations were soon to be held. The researcher explained that she had intended to begin fieldwork in Kagiso in mid-September but had been deterred from doing so by the police detention of her daughter. She had had to postpone Phase I by a month. This information is thought to have helped to establish the researcher's credentials (3.6).

Purely by chance the principal of St. Peter's came to the presbytery while the parish priest while the researcher was present and was introduced to her (3.6). He agreed to issue a letter from the researcher to each of his assistants.

These letters were intended, in part, to explain the purpose of the interviews and also to establish rapport. Further, a letter of introduction from Bishop Orsmond was

enclosed. The researcher wanted the teachers to know that she had received official permission to proceed with her research and that the Bishop had requested the principals of schools in the diocese (to whom this letter was addressed) to give the researcher 'every assistance and in particular to allow her to interview any of your school personnel, ..., pupils, ..., whom she may request to see'. (See Appendix III.)

She did not attempt to meet the teachers face-to-face prior to the teaching activities and small group interviews. However, when she arrived at St. Peter's to begin interviewing she was told that the letters had not been distributed and that the teachers wanted to meet her. In compliance with their preferences she gave out the letters herself, exchanging a few words with each teacher as she did so. Some persons gave the impression of being aggressively suspicious of the purpose of the research.

On returning to the school a few days later she was told that the teachers were unwilling at that stage to speak to her alone or in small groups but were prepared to come en masse to a meeting at which she explained the purpose of her research.

During this brief meeting, held during a normal morning school break, the researcher indirectly suggested that she might, to some degree, be identified as one of them. On the one hand she was a fellow Catholic. On the other, her daughter was in detention.

It is probable that almost all the teachers in this

school were Catholics. It later emerged that some took pride in being associated with the church's school system (IV.2.3.1.8, PIN-33 to 38). It is likely that all these people, under normal circumstances, would be welcoming to a fellow Catholic regardless of race. In addition some might see the detention of the researcher's daughter as persecution and therefore as evidence of the authenticity of the family's Christianity. (Compare the comment made on this subject by a nun from Kagiso. It is recorded in 3.5.) Those Catholics who did not reason in this way were likely, at least, to have felt that, in common with many black people, the researcher's family had suffered as a result of their opposition to the government and so shared some of their feelings.

The researcher also indicated that she understood, and was in sympathy with, the opinions that were expressed by [illegible] at this meeting. She did this by means of non-verbal sounds, gestures, facial expressions, and in the way that she summarised the opinions for recording on the dictaphone (2.4.2.2.). In the latter case empathy was conveyed by tone. (At no stage did the researcher state in words her own views on the subjects raised.)

It appears that the teachers felt that the researcher, "a white Catholic", was open enough to listen to what they wanted to say (PSR-1). They agreed to being interviewed singly or in small groups.

response to the information that Fr. Kataka's statement from the pulpit that he might be away for a long time" (3.6).

The above interpretation of events suggests that the interviewer's identification with the Kagiso teachers in certain important respects made it more likely that she would be able to carry out the fieldwork required in Phase I. She was identified with these teachers in sharing a common religious orientation, in having had some experience of oppression and in opposing the policies of the government. [illegible] then it must be inferred that [illegible] circumstances, the researcher must be seen to be in sympathy with the interviewees in relation to these matters. If, for the purposes of this research, personal information had been revealed about the researcher or her family, and if she had claimed to be [illegible] non-partisan in political matters, it would probably have been self-defeating i.e. self-invalidating (3.6).

PHASE II

Situation is drawn here to those features of the Soweto interviews which are relevant to the question on rapport raised at the beginning of 5.1. For details of the events mentioned the reader is referred to 5.3 and 5.4.

In Soweto in 1986, the researcher was generally made to feel welcome in the schools she visited but she also encountered a degree of suspicion and hostility.

Immediately before, and during, this period of fieldwork, the researcher and her family were no longer in the news. It is unlikely that more than a few of the people that she met in Soweto knew of this family's political orientation or of their experiences in relation to detention etc. Therefore, in Phase II the teachers' attitudes towards the researcher were probably different from those prevalent in Phase I.

The principals' reactions to the researcher varied considerably.

Eight of the ten were very welcoming and spoke hospitably about their professional concerns both before and after being interviewed. This group included the person who, for purposes of this research, was regarded as a supervisor. See 5.2.1.

It appeared that one headmistress had received some very frightening threats previously before the researcher made initial contact with her. With relatively little encouragement this woman spoke freely over the telephone of the problems associated with her professional role (5.4 . Later, when the researcher visited her school, she was eager to arrange contact between the interviewer and her assistant teachers and pupils as requested. She also insisted that the researcher attend a rehearsal of a short play, written by one of the teachers, and shortly to be presented at a schools' English competition. This principal had met the researcher's husband at meetings of the Education Board of

the SACBC. Her impression of him, and her relationship with him, undoubtedly affected her reactions to the researcher.) Another person, who had arranged for the researcher to meet her staff during the morning break, herself took over the school tuckshop in order to free the teacher who was to have been on duty there. Two principals of schools on the same site were generally helpful and later confided their dislike of their manager (5.2.3).

Four more of the principals were pleasant and efficient in making it possible for the researcher to conduct her interviews. One had attended meetings with the researcher's husband and wanted to know whether the researcher was indeed his wife. She was evidently pleased to have this confirmed. However, she and the other three principals in this group spent no more time than was necessary with the researcher. It should be noted that many of the principals of these schools were clearly very busy people.

These eight people did not appear in any way to be hostile, or negative towards, the researcher. This was in contrast to the behaviour of the two remaining principals.

One of these was impatient and antagonistic when the researcher first spoke to her on the telephone. She responded to the explanation of the purpose of the fieldwork by asking 'Why are you doing anyway.' On another occasion the principal of another school on the same site telephoned the head teacher in question to say that the researcher wanted

the SACBC. Her impression of him, and her relationship with him, undoubtedly affected her reactions to the researcher.) Another person, who had arranged for the researcher to meet her staff during the morning break, herself took over the school tuckshop in order to free the teacher who was to have been on duty there. Two principals of schools on the same site were generally helpful and later confided their dislike of their manager (5.2.3).

Four more of the principals were pleasant and efficient in making it possible for the researcher to conduct her interviews. One had attended meetings with the researcher's husband and wanted to know whether the researcher was indeed his wife. She was evidently pleased to have this confirmed. However, she and the other three principals in this group spent no more time than was necessary with the researcher. (It should be noted that most of the principals of these schools were clearly very busy people.)

These eight people did not appear in any way hostile, suspicious of, or aggressive towards, the researcher. This was in contrast to the behaviour of the two remaining principals.

One of these was impatient and antagonistic when the researcher first spoke to her on the telephone. She responded to the explanation of the purpose of the fieldwork by asking "Who are you anyway?". On another occasion the principal of another school in the same site telephoned the head teacher in question to say that the researcher wanted

to speak to her and to ask whether she would wait a few minutes to make this possible. She apparently agreed. The researcher arrived at the school shortly afterwards and saw this principal leaving in a hurry. However, having been seen, the principal stopped briefly and an appointment was made for the next day. She then, with good grace, submitted to an interview and arranged for the researcher to meet her teachers as requested.

The second principal (who apparently did not welcome the researcher's presence) on the first visit, listened attentively to the explanation of the purpose of this study but did not want to respond to the questionnaire. She appeared to regard this task as an inessential additional burden. In conversation it emerged that she felt severely overtaxed by her responsibilities. In addition she could not share her anxieties about what was happening in the township with her manager because the latter was unsympathetic, sceptically believing what she was being told.) The principal was probably also wary of disclosing some of her views to a stranger. Only after considerable persuasion did she agree to be interviewed the following week (5.3). In the event she refused to respond to four of the statements in Set B. These were B4 (white friends), B6 (a just S.A.), B7 mass and communion) and B8 (convert). (See 5.5.2.2). In response to B4 ('They should have some white Catholic friends of their own age whom they see quite often') she described other people's feelings about whites

but avoided expressing her own. (Others had said that "whites were all right when they were very young but not after they had left school . See B4 in 5.5.3.3.2.) This headmistress also refused to allow the researcher to meet her teachers en masse. She seemed to think that the researcher would be unwelcome in the staffroom. However, on their behalf, she accepted the researcher's gift of sweets and biscuits (5.3). She did not object to her assistants being interviewed.

None of the sample of assistant teachers said that they did not want to be interviewed and none displayed animosity towards the researcher. Some appeared to be very uncertain [illegible] and were clearly relieved when the interview was over. However this cannot be construed as necessarily arising from distrust.

Evidence [illegible] some principals' misgivings about the research, and other principals' hostility towards her, [illegible] described above. Among those teachers who, with apparent pleasure, submitted to being interviewed, and among the assistants who were not in the sample chosen for interview, there were probably others who entertained doubts about the researcher. It was in the hope of relieving their anxieties that she tried to meet the teachers of each school as a group, in their respective staffrooms. After the researcher had introduced herself, and had explained why she was present, it was hoped that an easy, informal conversation would follow.

It probably emerged (or was assumed) that the

(absolutely) common ground and could honestly claim between herself and the respondents. If she refused to adopt an apparently ambiguity non-partisan approach, this might raise the part-time suspicions, and so decrease the validity of the interviews.

However, the pursuit of this policy will produce an inherent tension. On the one hand the researcher wants the interviewee to feel at ease. On the other hand, she wants to direct the interview in an impartial way with regard to politically controversial issues. In a situation of this sort it seems that the most that can be done is to be as sensitive as possible to the tensions and to attempt to balance them.

minds of her colleagues. Some, who otherwise might have allowed themselves to be interviewed, might refuse. Others might agree to be interviewed but be more guarded in their responses than they might have been.

6.3 MORE WAYS OF INCREASING VALIDITY IN INTERVIEWS BY USING TO-CHOOSE ITEMS FOR A PERCEPTION SURVEY

6.3.1 INTRODUCTION

In section 6.2 ways of increasing validity that are associated with recording answers to subject were discussed. This section looks at possible ways of increasing validity by choosing items for the questionnaire. It draws on a number of sources and takes with this it many of the ideas discussed in the previous section.

6.3.2 USE OF SCALING AND OTHER DEVELOPMENTS

As mentioned in 6.2, one initial purpose of the fieldwork undertaken in this study was to reveal the lower-level perceptual dimensions by means of which they would discuss their reading, and their perceptions of their own reading ability. Another was part of Bloor's attempt, in order to test theoretical empirical research, the possibility of using the assumptions and techniques of cognitive psychology [24,25,26]. In order

to avoid this error. In Phase 1, an effort was made to discover the teachers' feel of concern in relation to their work and their own educational needs. The country was divided among the teachers in the schools in Kaduna. They were instructed to go to their fellow colleagues in several important respects (2). These people were asked the following questions.

1. What should be the aims of a Catholic primary school in Kaduna today?
   (a) Are we all at these aims being achieved in those schools?
   (b) Should these aims be altered in any way to meet these new trends? If so, how should they be changed?
2. Are there any further changes and differences existing in teachers in these schools?

The teachers were also asked questions about their formal educational and professional qualifications because this would help them interpret the findings. These questions also have been very important upon the formal to the different of the schools and the non-formal aspects of education.

It was intended to extrapolate and note important trends and principles in a more modern of statements to be used in Phase II (2).

As interviewed visited were completed, a letter containing the questions was delivered to each of the teachers at least a fortnight they were interviewed.

Cohen and Manion (1980: 134) point out that care must be taken to avoid bias when responses to open-ended questions are recorded. Three possible methods were considered. First, handwritten notes could have been taken. However the disadvantages associated with this mode are described on p.4.--7. Secondly, the interviews could have been tape-recorded in toto. It would then have been possible to quote the interviewees verbatim. However this method was the most difficult means of checking whether the researcher had correctly interpreted what had been said. This was particularly important as English was the mother-tongue of only two of the teachers. Therefore the third method was employed. The researcher posed the first question and listened to the responses. After a few pupils had been interviewed, recording [illegible] as expected, the interviewee's verbal [illegible] and the researcher's interpretation of their opinions. They were encouraged to correct any misinterpretations that occurred (4.2.2). It is believed that this method increased the accuracy with which the responses were recorded and therefore increased the validity of those of their opinions that are discussed in this dissertation.

4.4 CONCLUSIONS

In the light of the experience gained in Phase I, an answer will now be given to two questions.

4. In preliminary interviews designed to suggest items for a survey of teacher perceptions, what strategies could be used to reduce bias?

There should be concern to avoid bias that arises from the imposition of the researcher's assumptions and framework of thought upon the interviewees. This possibility could be diminished if a few, very general, open-ended questions were asked. (In this study this was the most radical means used of avoiding bias.)

Questions that focus attention on only one aspect of an important subject are to be avoided. For example, this study was centrally concerned with the teachers' perceptions of their own educational needs. Therefore they were not asked to give their formal educational and professional qualifications because this would have drawn attention to formal education to the detriment of non-formal and informal education.

The research may introduce bias in the process of recording the respondents' opinions. This may arise, inter alia, from an unconscious emphasis upon responses which agree with the researcher's expectations, a failure to note those that do not, and misunderstanding. The latter is potentially a major source of distortion when the interviews are not being conducted in the respondents' home language. It is therefore recommended that, in the course of the interview, the researcher periodically summarise the interviewee's comments and record this summary on a

[illegible] interviewee. It is expected that the interviewee will listen carefully to this recitation of her opinions and she should be encouraged to correct any misstatements or misapprehensions. In addition, the interviewer must also explain the record of what she has said in order to reassure the respondent and to [illegible] rapport.

6. What should be done to client considered, rather than [illegible]-cuff guesses.

7. It is believed that structured opinions are more reliable when respondents are given [illegible]-cuff. Therefore, it would be better to give the interviewee [illegible] or the possible that they are to be asked by the interviewer. This matter will be discussed in more detail in Section 3.3.3.

3.3 [illegible] OF VOCATIONAL ORIENTATION SURVEY

3.3.1 Procedure

In order to structure questions were used to survey the opinions of a sample of [illegible] learners, the principals, the supervisors, and a sample of [illegible] in the remote [illegible] primary schools. Since the interviews included standardized [illegible] characteristics of this type of interview, the interviewer provided flexibility in allowing explanatory [illegible] where necessary, and the opportunity for [illegible] comments by respondents.

Two types of response were allowed. Firstly,

interviewees were asked to rate three sets of statements. Secondly, respondents were asked to rank these statements [illegible]. Thirdly, in the process of rating and ranking many interviewees made spontaneous comments which were recorded. Finally answers were given to open-ended questions.

In this section the overall question under consideration is:

> When carrying out a survey of opinion, how could validity be measured and how might that validity be [illegible]?

The answer consists of responses to further questions. These are given below with references to the sub-sections in which they are discussed. [illegible] are given at the end of [illegible].

a. What are the attitudes of statements which, when rated and ranked by adults, are likely to give the most satisfactory results?

[illegible] interviewees' own strengths and weaknesses of the statements.

b. If statements developed for use with children, are it be rated and ranked by a sample of adult [illegible], what could and would [illegible] be [illegible] the validity of these [illegible] responses? How could the validity of new [illegible] ratings be assessed?

[illegible] of [illegible] ability.

c. How could the validity of ratings and rankings of a set of statements be assessed?

(6.4.4 Assessing the validity of rank orders)

6.4.2 ADULT INTERVIEWS: SOME STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESSES OF THE STATEMENTS

The critical core of the interviews consisted of two sets of statements that were meant to be rated and ranked by all the supervisors and all the teachers. These statements were concerned with the aims of education and with the means of improving teaching. The third set related to teachers' reasons for wanting to pass matric. The supervisors, the principals, and those assistant teachers who had not passed matric were to have responded to this set.

Here, the question to be explored is:

> What are the attributes of statements which, when rated and ranked by adults, are likely to yield the most satisfactory results?

First, a discussion of the strengths and weaknesses of the statements used in this study will be given. Conclusions are drawn at the end.

The statements used in this study relate closely to opinions expressed by the Kagiso teachers in 1983. None of the statements encapsulated omissions remarked upon in the discussion in Chapter Four. As it is believed that Soweto teachers were similar to their Kagiso counterparts in important respects, it is probable that they shared many assumptions and a common framework of thought (2.4). Therefore it is argued, the procedure used to generate

these statements probably contributed in an important way to the validity of the results obtained in Phase II.

Because it was assumed that the Soweto teachers had shared the Kagiso teachers' concerns in general, and would have previously discussed these ideas in broad terms, it is though that the Soweto teachers' responses to the statements would be regarded as considered opinions.

Such considered opinions are likely to have differed in some important ways from the off-the-cuff answers given to statements embodying unfamiliar ideas. Interviewees would probably have had a deeper understanding of the implications of a statement on a subject that had been widely discussed among their peers. They would have found it easier to respond to such a statement. The opinions expressed were more likely to be in harmony with other opinions they had held. As a result the above opinions were likely to be more stable than those given in response to a statement that raised an issue that respondents were confronting for the first time (5.5.6).

In the event, the questionnaires included one statement that seemed to encapsulate an idea foreign to some of the Soweto teachers viz. A3: I would teach much better if the children were not encouraged to compete for marks". (It was derived from a comment made by Ms X.) Some of the problems that arose in relation to this statement may have arisen primarily for this reason (4.3).

A number of teachers had difficulty in understanding A3 (marks). When necessary it was explained. However, in

such a case it often happened that when a respondent had formed an opinion, she could not confidently translate it into a rating. Sometimes the rating elicited was at variance with other observations that were volunteered. On other occasions a teacher would give her opinion in general terms and then would try to leave it to the researcher to interpret it in terms of a rating. When a teacher was experiencing great difficulty it appeared appropriate to the researcher to [illegible].

Some further difficulties were noted.

First, in response to [illegible] "I would teach much better if I was a [illegible]" two principals and five assistant teachers, from [illegible] different sites, indicated in their comments that they interpreted "better" to mean [illegible]. [illegible] the statements in [illegible], [illegible] it was thought that the [illegible] interpretation of this word had caused [illegible] problems in [illegible].

A white parent, who [illegible], and who had [illegible] by Aboriginal people for a number of years, was asked [illegible]. He argued that, because both [illegible] and [illegible] would [illegible], the problem was probably [illegible]. He pointed out that the statement [illegible] a very personal matter and that it was probable that some of the teachers would be extremely sensitive to the subject. They might feel that by [illegible]

asked this question, aspersions were being cast upon them.

There is some support for this position. An older assistant teacher responded to A7 by saying indignantly "I am a better Christian. I am not a bad one." She plainly found this statement [illegible] very offensive. (The priest had not been told of her reaction before giving his opinion.) In another interview a younger person reacted to A7 by giggling nervously. Further, it is notable that two supervisors, both native speakers of English, said in response to A7 that the teachers in their school were "good Christians" and did not speak of a time that, in order to become more competent teachers, they should become even better Christians. Like the [illegible] teacher referred to above, these supervisors became defensive when it was suggested that the religious life of teachers could be improved. In addition, it is [illegible] from the exception, it was only in relation to A7 that [illegible] appeared to be interrupted [illegible] one such [illegible] responded to A11 "I would rather speak better of my English [illegible]" was better, by saying "It is better."

It would seem to this researcher that the seven teachers certainly did not distinguish appreciably between "better" and "good". The question is why this error was possible only in relation to A7 (in seven cases) and A4 (in one case). The answer would seem to be related to the sensitive nature of the topics embodied in these statements. Apparently, these seven teachers would not countenance the possibility of their not being good Christians. (Likewise)

one apparently would not tolerate the insinuation that her English was not good). Perhaps their understanding of the word 'better' was not [illegible] in relation to the other [illegible] statements, [illegible] and (4). Perhaps these statements did not imply personal criticism that was [illegible] to them. Perhaps they could [illegible] a need for improvement in the areas indicated.

Verbal responses to subjects that were regarded as sensitive should be reported here. One principal refused to [illegible]. He is [illegible] and [illegible]. There are six concerned with the aims of education and this person appeared to be afraid to reveal her opinions to the researcher. [illegible] and [illegible].

The second [illegible] to be [illegible] [illegible].

[illegible] of the [illegible] handicapped by the presence of slow learners in their classes. The term 'slow learner' was used to refer to pupils of very low [illegible] who were [illegible], unable to benefit from ordinary schooling ([illegible]). This led to the inclusion of statement [illegible] 'I would teach much better if I did not have some children in my class who learn very slowly.'

[illegible] the words 'children [illegible] who learn very slowly' were interpreted [illegible]. Some teachers thought they referred to pupils who were mentally retarded, others to children with [illegible] problems or to normal pupils of low achievement.

(New discussion of A6 in 5.5.4.1.2.1)

There was also a problem of ambiguity in relation to statement A11 - they should be growing old - because people who get on well with their neighbours ... In Kagiso the teachers who mentioned this term clearly used the term neighbours to mean people living in close proximity to one another ... It seems that people who made spontaneous comments in relation to A9 interpreted this word as synonymous with the people of South Africa. (see discussion of A9 powerful people in 5.5.4.1.2.)

In the questionnaires A6 was often completed in the presence of the researcher, and if spontaneous comments had been forthcoming or had attention not been paid to them, it is possible that these reflect the ambiguity of the response. Such was the case in Kagiso. Certain teachers were keen right at the outset to express their feelings. These teachers and caretakers might have reacted to the fact that the study was being conducted by a white researcher.

It could have also been that threats to validity had not been eliminated.

The third problem was that several statements were completed by a substantial number of interviewees. For example, only 9 of 42 (1 resident teachers could respond differently to A6 ... would much rather be ... and [illegible] ... the remainder already had reservations ... statements to [illegible] and A6 ... were initially difficult for the researcher to

the same degree.

This problem was not encountered in relation to any of the statements in Sets A and C but in Set A, statements in the form in which they appeared in the Supervisors' Questionnaire. (In this questionnaire all Set A statements began with the words 'Teachers would teach more lessons if ...') It may be salutary to restate the reason for this.

The Teachers' Questionnaire was completed by the specialists and the assistant teachers. In it all the statements in Set A began with the words 'I would teach more lessons if ...' The each teacher's response to each statement was necessarily clearly connected to his own personal circumstances. In contrast, the responses required of Supervisors in Sets B and C were relatively remote from the immediate professional circumstances of the teachers and could be responded to with [illegible] but all the teachers could respond readily to all items in Set A. All the teachers who had not passed their responses appropriately to all the statements in Set A.

However, it was appropriate for all the supervisors and principals to respond to all the statements in the Supervisors' Questionnaire. Only then could it be possible to see how the responses related with [illegible] of the supervisors' responses.

This researcher cannot suggest a way of treating the Set A statements in the Teachers' Questionnaire so as to avoid this problem.

If the words "would/would not bother me" had been replaced by "teachers in Catholic primary schools in Perth would teach many lessons of ____", there would probably have been no problem. However such statements would have omitted the teachers' perceptions of what would have helped their colleagues to teach better. Here their attitudes provided the means of improving what two teachers were required

Instead of having available teachers to rate and rank the statements in Set A, I might have been better to have given them a particular question such as "What would help you most to improve your teaching" and to have scored their answers.

This [illegible] attempted to blend in certain statements that are commonly

The questions which completed the Teachers' questionnaire are then self-explanatory. See a discussion appendix on Part [illegible] of Section Four. Note at this stage[illegible] required merely to copy down the responses to those statements a second time. In each case it seemed as if they were paying the most careful attention to giving the maximum of their concentration.

In all the questions and the scales referred to the interviews questionnaire were taken from the Teachers' questionnaire. [illegible] the Catholicism [illegible]

scores were the same). It must be noted that the discrepancies were very slight indeed, the total difference averaged 1.67 points per statement. The person whose scores on the two questionnaires varied most showed an average difference of 4.50 points per statement. Further, ratings were by two of the principals accounted for more than one-half of the discrepancy. The two sets of ratings correlated at a p < .01 level of significance on a two-tailed test. (See Table 3, page 47.)

It seems probable that such discrepancies occurred because the principals were asked to respond to these statements in their capacities as the head, as supervisor, and as the instructor, or supervisee. Therefore these [illegible] and teacher [illegible] of statements of a problem [illegible] of the responsibility of this measure of this study [illegible].

Conclusion

In order to respond more clearly [illegible] under consideration:

> What are the characteristics of statements which, when rated and ranked by raters, are likely to yield the most satisfactory results?

The conclusions presented below [illegible] upon the responses [illegible] of these 21 principals.

It is [illegible] to note that conducted in this study, the principals [illegible] largely in response to a series of statements. Therefore

these statements are potentially a major source of bias because, through them, the researcher can impose her assumptions and framework of thought upon the interviewees. It is believed that the method used to generate the statements in this study reduced this danger substantially and so contributed to the validity of the responses.

Therefore it is suggested that, initially, interviews be conducted with a small group of teachers likely to be similar to the target group in important respects. These people should be asked a few open-ended questions. From an examination of their responses, statements could be devised for use in the survey of the opinions of the larger group.

A distinction is drawn between considered opinions, and off-the-cuff answers, and it is argued that they differ in important respects. In contrast to interviewees who give off-the-cuff answers, those who give considered opinions are likely to have a deeper understanding of the implications of the statements, to find it easier to respond, and probably give replies that are in greater harmony with other views that they hold. As a result, considered opinions are likely to be more stable and, in the sense indicated here, more valid.

It is believed that, in general, statements generated from responses made to open-ended questions by people very similar to the target group, will elicit

opinions that are more likely to be of the considered than of the off-the-cuff variety.

3. Statements containing the word "better" are to be avoided, particularly where the statement might be seen, by the interviewee, to imply hurtful personal criticism.

   Euphemisms such as slow learner" should not be used as they are open to misinterpretation.

4. Statements that are designed to elicit responses that are closely connected to the interviewee's personal and professional circumstances are liable to be inapplicable to a number of respondents. (In this study, statements that began with the words 'I would teach much better if .... exemplified this. Correspondingly, statements that began 'Teachers would teach much better if ....', They should ... and 'I want to pass matric because ...' proved unproblematic in this respect.

5.1.3 PROBLEMS IN INTERVIEWING PUPILS

In a brief account will be given of the experience gained [illegible]

[illegible] statements, designed for use with teachers, are [illegible] and ranked by a sample of their Std V pupils, what could (and could not) be done to increase the validity of these children's responses?

How could the validity of the pupils' ratings be assessed?

The principals of the higher primary schools were asked to allow a sample of five pupils from each Std V class to be interviewed. One person refused this request. She felt that it was too near exams and that the could not spare the time. She was very worried about these children. They were the weakest Std V class the school had ever had (5.3). At another school, although the headmistress was eager that her pupils be interviewed, it was decided not to do so. In this case the supervisor forbade it, saying also that it was too near exams and they could not afford the time (5.2.3).

A random sample of five pupils from each of eight Std V classes, [illegible] sites, was interviewed. In each case the researcher met the children from a particular class as a group. It was argued that, when meeting the researcher [illegible] them, the children would be more at [illegible] if they were in the company of their classmates 5.2.5,.

At each interview the chairs were arranged in a circle. After introductions the researcher said that she would read a number of statements aloud. (These were from the Pupils' [illegible]. See VI:[illegible]) After each statement had been read, each child was to say whether he agreed strongly, agreed, disagreed, or disagreed strongly.

A number of problems were encountered in relation to the rating procedure.

[illegible] the children appeared not to understand

the words "agree" and "disagree". (The researcher thereupon explained these terms. See [illegible].)

Further, all the members of one group agreed strongly with all the statements in both Sets BI and BII. At another school all five of a group agreed strongly with all but two statements in the same two sets. These children simply chanted the responses and appeared to have no intention of expressing their own opinion.

In other groups, some children always repeated whatever the child before them had said.

In addition, at this and at other schools, many of the statements were not understood. For example, questions addressed to [illegible] group of pupils interviewed revealed that they did not understand. We would learn much better if some of the syllabus were improved e.g. history and religion. They did not know the words 'syllabus' or 'history'. One boy said that 'History is something that is [illegible] - like soldiers shooting people'. Children thinking with examples such as strike and [illegible]. When they did not understand a statement children appeared to choose a [illegible] others asked for clarification. Although explanations were always given when requested it is unlikely that these children grasped the unfamiliar concepts sufficiently to make satisfactory judgements concerning the statements.

In addition, it was observed that the statements

in no way reflected the concerns of the Std V pupils in Kagiso. Their opinions were not solicited in Phase I. Indeed it is very unlikely that the statements embodied more than a very few ideas to which the Kagiso, or the Soweto children, had paid more than fleeting attention. Thus the Soweto pupils cannot be said to have expressed "considered" opinions.

In view of the above, it must be concluded that the ratings made by the Std V pupils in Soweto should be regarded with the utmost caution. However, in spite of the problems in general, and in spite of the severity and intractability of the last two problems indicated in particular, useful insights were obtained from the pupils' ratings.

The children responded to the Set B statements in two forms. The second (B:) was designed to elicit their perceptions of what your TEACHERS want you to be like by the end of Std V. The pupils' ratings showed that at least some of them perceive their teachers' priorities with a considerable degree of accuracy. The pupils' ratings correlated significantly with the principals' ratings of Set B statements in the Teacher Questionnaire ($p < 0,05$), and somewhat with the assistant teachers' ($p < 0,01$). These results concerning their teachers' priorities also encourage one to think that their ratings of statements concerning what they themselves want to be like at the end of Std V may genuinely reflect some pupils' opinions (3.5.3.3.5).

It should be noted that, if the researcher had not been

present when the pupils rated the statements in Set BII, their significant correlation with the opinions of the teachers would in all likelihood have been misinterpreted. It would have probably been assumed that each child had expressed his own opinion and that the opinions of all the pupils involved had correlated significantly with those of their teachers. In the event, the researcher discovered from examination that the teachers' opinions correlated with the opinions of a group of children somewhat smaller in number than that of the sample of Std V pupils.

The problems associated with the ranking procedure were even more severe than those connected with the rating process.

Unlike the adult respondents, the pupils did not each have a copy of the questionnaire before them to which to refer. The children had to recall the statements in order to rank them. In practice the statements presented as rankings bore little resemblance to those that they had [illegible] true Christian. And a great soccer player. To complete my Std V with great marks at the end of the year . The first of [illegible] statements concerning [illegible] and his desire to obtain great marks at the end of the year" (whose Bi. See 5.5.1. Therefore it was decided to record verbatim whatever the children said. Later all these responses were examined, categories devised, and individual statements

classified accordingly (5.3). It was found that the Set BII rankings would have been appropriate answers to the question "What do your teachers want you to be like at the end of Std V?". (See 5.5.3.3.3.)

(This experience does not indicate that statements designed for use with one group cannot be used with another and give results that are wholly satisfactory. It will be recalled that statements based upon the opinions of the Kagiso teachers were successfully used with the supervisors, of whom only two were teachers. No one in this group appeared to lack the necessary concepts nor to be giving off-the-cuff answers. This suggests that statements reflecting professional concerns, designed for use with one group, e.g. teachers, could be used with another group, e.g. supervisors, if the two groups share common occupational concerns, are in frequent contact with each other and if the educational level of the second group is somewhat higher than that of the first.

Conclusions

First, it was asked,

> If statements, designed for use with teachers, are to be rated and ranked by a sample of their Std V pupils, what could (and could not) be done to increase the validity of these children's responses?

In order to increase the probability that permission would be given for all the pupils in the sample to be interviewed, the fieldwork should be carried out early

in the school year.

2. Each child should be interviewed separately.

This on the one hand, would be a disadvantage because, during the interview, she would not enjoy the security that comes from being with classmates. On the other hand, she would not be able simply to repeat the response given by another child.

Children who, by giving the same rating to every statement in a set, apparently intended to avoid expressing a personal opinion, shoul be asked why they had rated a particular statement in that way. This might jolt them into giving more serious attention to their answers.

Each child should be interviewed in his (or her) home language and should be given a copy of the questionnaire translated into the same language (2.4.2.3).

This would help children who were unfamiliar with [illegible] crucial English words such as "agree" and "disagree". However, it would not assist those pupils who did not have an adequate concept of history, or the syllabus. (An explanation given in the course of an interview is unlikely to produce a more than superficial grasp of such ideas.)

[illegible] with adults. There is little likelihood that the pupils will have discussed many, if any, of the issues

that concern their teachers. Therefore they must be regarded as giving off-the-cuff answers. This would seem to be unavoidable.

The second question is:

How could the validity of the pupils' ratings be assessed?

1. If the pupils both rated and ranked each set of statements suitably, then the correlation between each pair could be calculated. (This procedure would be subject to the reservations expressed in 6.2.4.4)
2. Alternatively, the pupils and another group could be asked to rate matching sets of statements designed to elicit responses on the same subject.

In this study, pupils interviewed in groups of five rated statements concerning their perceptions of their teachers' aims, and their teachers rated corresponding statements about their own aims. (See Appendix VI, Set BII in the Pupils' Questionnaire and Set B in Teachers' Questionnaire, respectively.) The pupils' ratings correlated significantly with the principals' and the assistant teachers' ratings at the 5% and 1% levels respectively. The implications of this result are that the pupils accurately perceived their teachers' aims and effectively expressed their opinions by rating the statements in BII.

It should be noted that a lack of significant correlation must not be construed as meaning that the pupils' ratings were invalid. Such discrepancy could

arise from the pupils' failure to perceive their teachers' aims correctly, or from the teachers' misrepresentation of their aims during interviews, or the teachers' lack of awareness of their real aims, which the pupils had perceived.)

These results encourage one to think that the children's ratings of statements in Set BI were also valid. These statements were concerned with their own aims.)

However such significant correlations cannot always be taken at face value.

Attention has been drawn to the observation that, in Soweto in 1986, some pupils appeared to be merely repeating the ratings made by others. It was thus inferred that the teachers' ratings correlated significantly with the ratings of a group of pupils somewhat smaller in number than that of the sample. This experience suggests that the interviewer's observation of the pupils' behaviour could contribute significantly to an assessment of the validity of their ratings.

7.4.4 RANKING: TWO MEANS OF INCREASING VALIDITY

In Phase II, three sets of statements were used to reveal the priorities of the supervisors, principals, assistant teachers and Std V pupils. Each person interviewed was asked to 'rank and rate' each set.

In this section, attention is paid to the question,

How could the validity of rankings be increased?

It is recognised that, in this study, the use of the term "ranking is not strictly orthodox. Here, in relation to each set in the questionnaire/s they responded to, each interviewee was asked to choose the group of three statements she regarded as most important', would "help you most', etc. The number of times that a statement was chosen by members of a particular group was compared with the number of times that other statements in that set were chosen by the same people. On this basis the statements were arranged in order of importance. (See 2.4.2.3 and 5.5.2.)

The [illegible] conventional meaning of ranking would suggest that, in relation to the statements in a particular set, each respondent selects, first, the statement she regards as being of prime importance; secondly, the statement that is second in order of importance, etc., until all the statements are arranged in rank order. The statements would then be treated to establish the priorities of each group. The statement placed first in order of importance by each person would be allotted one point; those placed second, two points; etc. The points assigned to each statement would then be added together and, accordingly, the statements arranged in order of importance. A statement that obtained a lower score would be placed higher in order of importance than one with a higher score.

The latter mode is a more direct method of placing each

set of statements in order of importance according to the opinions of a particular group. It was not used because it was thought to impose upon the interviewees a somewhat unnatural task. For most purposes people are not required to order their priorities in this way. It was thought that, in everyday life, most people would feel that a cluster of a few aims/means/motives were more important than the rest. There were either eight or nine statements in each set as presented to the respondents for rating. These people, by being asked to choose the three most important statements, in effect were being asked to select the most important third (approximately) of each set.

(The reader should be reminded that the interviewees rated each set of statements before ranking it. The tasks were presented in this order so that, in rating the statements the interviewees would become familiar with them before being required to rank them. In this way it was intended to increase the validity of the rankings.)

Conclusions

Here, two responses are given to the question:

How could the validity of rankings be increased?

1. Before interviewees can rank the statements in a set, they must become familiar with them. This could be facilitated by having only a small number of statements in each set, and by asking the respondents to first rate the statements, then rank them.

2. [illegible] to increase validity when surveying opinion,

interviewees should be set tasks that are as natural as possible. Thus, when ranking statements, respondents should be asked to select the three most important statements, and the three least important, rather than to distinguish between that statement which is first in order of importance and that which is second, etc. Under everyday conditions, teachers are more likely to regard (approximately) a third of the statements as most important, and a further third as "least important", than to make fine discriminations between the importance of one statement and another.

6.4.1 ASSESSING THE VALIDITY OF RANK ORDERS

Under consideration here is the question:

How could the validity of the ratings and rankings of a set of statements be assessed?

In order to provide a means of assessing the validity of the rankings, respondents were asked to rate the statements. The method used to treat these ratings for the purpose of arranging the statements in order of importance is described in 5.4.2. This rating procedure was a more indirect method of revealing priorities than the ranking process used.

It was assumed that the higher the degree of agreement with a statement, the more important it was held to be. Reflection, in retrospect, upon the interpretation of this material in the findings, has suggested three possible challenges to the argument. These are set out below. In

each case, while the logic of the challenge is acknowledged, it will be maintained that, in the particular circumstances of the fieldwork component concerned, it would be reasonable to claim that the researcher's interpretation survives the challenge.

First, suppose that, to a person who spoke English well, a statement appeared so evidently correct that it was quite uncontroversial. In such a case she might calmly say that she agreed with it. However in response to a statement about a topic that at the time was being hotly debated, she might assert that she agreed strongly". These divergent responses do not necessarily reflect differences in the strength of conviction about the matters in hand although it could be claimed that in both instances her feeling was positive. The extent to which this difficulty affected the results of this research is not known but might be minimal. The researcher did not gain the impression that any of the statements reflected current controversies 2.4.2.3 .

Secondly, it will be recalled that the principals responded to both the Teachers' and the Supervisors' Questionnaires. Therefore, in identical form, they twice rated and ranked statements in Set B.

Statement 89 They should be growing into peaceful people who get on well with their neighbours"), scored high on both questionnaires when the rating procedure was used, but scored low on both questionnaires when the ranking

procedure was used. (See Table 5:4.)

In 2.4.2.4, the ways in which it was hoped to achieve a degree of methodological triangulation are described. Central among these is the comparison between the ratings and rankings of a set of statements by a particular group. The methods used to assess the correlation between ratings and rankings are described below. Logically it is, of course, possible to agree strongly with a statement about a matter which one regards as trivial. This may account for the differences between the principals' ratings and rankings of B9. However this seems unlikely as these respondents tended to agree enthusiastically with statements that they considered to be of importance. (In Table 5:5 the results of the four measures of the principals' opinions concerning statements B1 to B8 are displayed. Spearman's was used to assess the correlation between the ratings and their rankings on each of the Teachers' and on the Supervisors' Questionnaires. They both correlated significantly at $P < 0,01$. There was no evident logical reason to suggest why A9 should be an exception or the only exception (5.5.3.2).

Nevertheless, the recognition that logically one could agree strongly with a statement that one regards as trivial is an acknowledgement of a flaw in the design of this research.

It might be thought that the two problems described above could be overcome if in respect of both statements respondents were asked only whether they agreed or

disagreed, so eliminating degrees of agreement and disagreement. In order to test this possibility the responses made by the principals to Set B statements in both the Teachers' and Supervisors' Questionnaires were re-examined. If a person had agreed or agreed strongly with a statement she was regarded as having agreed. Likewise, if she had disagreed or disagreed strongly she was regarded as having disagreed. It was found that all the principals agreed with statements B1 to B7 and with B9. One principal disagreed with B8 (answered on both questionnaires), another disagreed with B4 in the Supervisors', but agreed with it on the Teachers' Questionnaire. In other words, the range of variation in the responses was virtually nil. This is to be expected. As the Soweto and the Kagiso teachers had all been selected to teach in Catholic schools, and came from similar backgrounds, it is unlikely that the Soweto teachers [illegible] perceptions of many of the aims of education espoused by their Kagiso colleagues. In these circumstances a range of responses could only be obtained from the expression of degrees of agreement and, perhaps, a reasonable spread of responses is required for the purposes of this type of study.

Briefly, if all the statements are positive (as in Set B, consistently most people should be like at the end of Std. 6, then all members of a group might agree strongly with all the statements. However, the same people might disagree [illegible]

importance and so rank them in a variety of ways. In such a case there might be no correspondence between ratings and rankings. However, in the event, this situation did not arise.

Where a set of statements evokes at least some range of ratings (which in this study in fact occurred in relation to all sets) then such co. -lation as emerges may be seen as validating.

In practice two further problems arose in connection with the comparison of ratings and rankings.

First, in view of the severity of the problems associated with A3 (marks) and A8 (matric), these statements were omitted from Table 5[illegible]. This in itself created problems but these were judged to be less serious than those that would have been entailed by the inclusion of A3 and A8.

The second problem arose from a fault in the design of the research.

After each participant had rated the statements in a particular set she was asked [illegible] to add further aims means/motives, as appropriate. Then she was asked to rank the statements, including her introductions [illegible].

A frequent ranking of statements additional to the original set might have made it impossible to compare the ratings and rankings of groups of respondents. However, in practice, it had little effect. Very few people made additions which they subsequently ranked (5.5.2).

This defect would have been avoided if the interviewees

had been asked to both rate and rank each set of statements as it stood. When these tasks were complete, the respondents could then have been asked whether they wished to add further statements to the set. If they had done so, they could then have been required to rank the augmented set.

It has been said that the correlation between the ratings and rankings of a particular set of statements by a group is here taken to be a measure of validity. One underlying assumption has been described. (It was assumed that the higher the degree of agreement with a statement, the more important it was held to be.) Attention will now be drawn to three more.

Secondly, it was presumed that the processes of rating and ranking would be carried out as two quite separate tasks. Two supervisors did not do so. Having rated a set of statements these two, on each occasion, looked over the record of their ratings and picked out the three statements that they had rated most highly and declared them the "three most important". In contrast, the teachers (and the remaining supervisors) gave the strong impression that they ranked the statements without reference to their previously expressed opinions (5.3).

Two further assumptions were made. It was supposed that each respondent would genuinely express her personal opinion and that her responses would be independent of those made by others in course of an interview. In relation to

the adult interviewees these assumptions appear to have been justified. All the teachers and the supervisors gave the impression of giving seriously considered responses and, as they were interviewed singly and did not have access to records of interviews with other people, independence was quaran eed (5..). In these respects they differed markedly from the Std 7 pupils interviewed (6.2.4.3). However, it will be remembered, the children's rankings could not be used in comparisons with their ratings so this defect is of no consequence here.

Four indicators were used to assess the correlation between ratings and rankings.

First, Spearman's rank correlation coefficient (rho) was calculated with respect to each pair of ratings and rankings made by each group of a set of statements (5.5.2). A high degree of consistency would suggest that a certain [illegible] could be related in that particular set of statements as a measure of opinion. A low consistency could be a function of the group's behaviour, or the inadequacy of the measure, or both. (Compare 2.4.2.4.)

However, it is noted that in Johnson's opinion (1977, 111), it is difficult to describe particular values of r [illegible] in terms of 'weak', 'moderate', 'strong', etc.. (See 5.5.2.

Secondly, statements that were both rated and ranked among the first three, and among the last three, in order of importance were identified. That is, consistency together with the value attached to the statements regarded as the

most, and least, important, were taken into account (2.4.2.3).

This second indicator proved to be a useful complement to rho. The correlation between the ratings and rankings of statements in Set A (concerned with the means of improving teaching) provide a case in point. The calculation of rho showed no significant correlation between the supervisors' and principals' ratings and rankings in response to the Supervisors' Questionnaire, or between the principals' and assistant teachers' ratings and rankings in response to the Teachers' Questionnaire. This implies that these results should be approached with the utmost caution (5 5.4.3). However, for example, the assistant teachers both rated and ranked A2 methods) and A9 (equipment) among the three most important statements, and A6 (slow learners) and A7 (better Christian among the three least important. See Table 5:11. This shows that there was some degree of consistency in this group's response to Set A.

The third indicator was used in relation to statements in Set A alone. Each pair of ratings and rankings made by a particular group was examined to determine the number of items that fell within not more than two places of each other in order of importance. Among the supervisors' ratings and rankings there were two statements that were more than two places apart. The average difference was 1,71. The principals rated and ranked more than two places apart only one statement on each of the Supervisors and

Teachers' Questionnaires. The mean difference per statement was 1,57 and 1,71 respectively. The assistant teachers also rated only one statement more than two places apart. The average difference was 1,14. These results suggest that a modest degree of correlation exists between the ratings and rankings of Set A by each of the groups (5.5.4.3.1).

The fourth type of indicator used to assess the correlation between ratings and rankings was based on close examination of three tables, 5:6, 5:9 and 5:12. Two examples are given here.

First, it was found that, in response to the Teachers' Questionnaire, the principals' ratings and rankings of Set B statements did not correlate significantly when rho was calculated. It was then observed that B9 (peaceful people, together with B2 friend and saviour) and B6 (a just SA), were rated first in order of importance by the principals. However none of this group ranked B9 among the three most important aims (Table 5:6). It was then thought that this anomaly might have contributed largely to the lack of significant correlation noted. Therefore the scores relating to B9 were removed and rho was calculated in respect of data for statements B1 to B8. It was then found that the ratings and rankings correlated significantly ($p < 0,01$). (See 5.5.3.2.)

Secondly, on examining Table 5:12, it was noted that the supervisors both rated and ranked C2, C8 and C3 (respectively) first, second and third in order of

importance. In addition, the table showed that all the supervisors had chosen these same three statements as the "three most important to the teachers". In other words, the degree of consensus between them was very high indeed.

In addition to the four indicators described above, there was sometimes evidence from other sources that served to confirm, or call in question, an assessment of the correlation between ratings and rankings. This will be referred to below. Some of this evidence has been mentioned before in this section. In such instances only brief reference will be made to it.

(a) Spontaneous comments

The teachers' spontaneous comments showed that there were a number of problems associated with statements in Set A (5.5.4.2). Therefore relatively low levels of correlation between each group's ratings and rankings were to be expected. Correspondingly, the absence of spontaneous comments that revealed problems in relation to Set C statements is congruent with the high levels of correlation found between each group's ratings and rankings (5.5.5.1).

(b) Duplicated ratings and rankings

The principals alone were asked to rate and rank the statements in Set B in identical form, twice.

The Teachers' Questionnaire was presented to them first. It was found that, in response to it, their ratings and rankings of Set B did not correlate significantly.

Contrary evidence came to hand from their reactions to

the Supervisors' Questionnaire. In response to it, their ratings and rankings correlated at $p < 0,05$. Further, the ratings from the two questionnaires correlated at the $p < 0,01$ level and the rankings did likewise.

In 6.4.1 it was claimed that the means by which the statements were generated had contributed to the validity of the teachers' responses. It was argued that, because the teachers had probably expressed considered opinions, these opinions were more likely to be in harmony with other opinions they held and therefore more stable than off-the-cuff opinions. A similar argument is being presented here. Although it is believed that the principals expressed considered opinions in response to the Teachers' Questionnaire, it would be reasonable to assume that the [illegible] would lead them to carry further the integration of these considered opinions. If this was the case then a greater consistency between the ratings and rankings given in response to the Supervisors' Questionnaire [illegible] if there were indeed such a progression [illegible] it could also be predicted that the pair of ratings would correlate significantly, as would the pair of rankings.

(c) Investigator triangulation

In this study there are two instances where a measure of investigator triangulation was achieved.

The pupils were asked to respond to statements intended to evoke perceptions of "what your TEACHERS want you to be like by the end of Std V". (See VI.4 Pupils' Questionnaire,

Statements: Set BII) Their ratings of these statements correlated significantly with the principals' and the assistant teachers' ratings of the Set B statements in the Teachers' Questionnaire ($p < 0,05$ and $0,01$, respectively). (See 5.5.3.3.3.) The children will surely have arrived at their opinions through experience of their teachers. Thus it can be claimed that, in effect, they "investigated" their teachers' views on this matter (2.4.2.4). The correlation of the pupils' ratings with those of their teachers', tends to confirm the validity of Set B as a measure of the teachers' opinions on the appropriate aims to pursue in their schools.

It can also be argued that, because the pupils' ratings on Set BII show that some of the children perceived their teachers' priorities accurately, Set BII is to some degree a valid measure of the children's opinions. It can be further argued that these results concerning their teachers' priorities encourage one to think that their rating of statements in BI concerning what they themselves want to be like at the end of Std V may genuinely reflect these same pupils' opinions. This view is strengthened by the fact that pupils' ratings of the B' statements did not correlate significantly with the supervisors', the principals' or the assistant teachers' ratings i.e. these children's opinions show a degree of independence from those of their mentors 5.5.3.3.3).

The second measure of investigator triangulation was

achieved in relation to Set C. The supervisors and the principals were asked to rate and rank these statements in a way that reflected the assistant teachers' motives for wanting matric. (See VI.2 Supervisors' Questionnaire.) They could do this only on the basis of previous conversations with the teachers (2.4.2.4).

The assistants' ratings and rankings of Set C correlated significantly ($p < 0,01$). (See 5.5.5.1.) This, it has been argued, can be taken as evidence that these ratings and rankings are valid measures of this group's opinions. However, the supervisors' and principals' ratings and rankings partly countervail this evidence.

First it should be noted that the supervisors' ratings and rankings correlated significantly at the 1% level, and those of the principals', at the 5% (5.5.5.1). So it seems that both sets of ratings and rankings provide valid measures of the supervisors and the principals' opinions.

Secondly, the supervisors' and the principals' ratings which correlated significantly with each other at the 1% level did not correlate with those of the assistant teachers at the same level. This supports the contention that the ratings provided a valid and reliable measure of the ass.stants' expressed motives for wanting to pass matric. On the other hand, the supervisors' and principals' rankings (which cor lated with each other at the 1% level) did not correlate s.gnificantly with those of the assistants. This casts doubt on whether the rankings were a valid and reliable measure of the teachers' motives.

As the assistant teachers must know their own opinions better than any outside agency, and presumably expressed them accurately in the course of the interview, it must be concluded that, on balance, their ratings and rankings are both valid measures of this groups' opinions.

(d) Range of scores

In order to assess the correlation between the assistant teachers' ratings and rankings of the statements in Set C, Spearman's rho was calculated. They were found to correlate significantly at the 1% level of confidence. However, here the calculation of rho was based upon the rank orders in which the statements were placed. No account was taken of the scores that determined the rank orders of the statements. Confidence in the results of the calculation of rho was strengthened by an examination of the scores accorded to each of the statements.

As expressed in ratings, +2 better teacher), with a score of +30 points, received the most positive response. In contrast, -1 no longer a teacher), with -20 points, was accorded the lowest score. The greatest possible range was +30 to -30) (See 5.5.1.) This suggests that the assistants felt strongly about these two statements, that there was a wide range of strength of feeling, and that there was a high degree of unanimity. Taken in conjunction, the above inspires confidence in the order of importance in which this pair of statements was placed as a result of the rating procedure.

There is also reason to have faith in the order of importance that these two statements were placed as a result of the assistants' rankings of them. Statement C3 (better teacher) was ranked by 13 out of 15 assistant teachers; C1 (no longer a teacher) was ranked by none. They were therefore placed first and last in order of importance (5.5.5.1).

Confidence in the placing of the Set C Statements that were both rated and ranked among the first three, and last three, in order of importance, was also strengthened by an [illegible] of them.

The assistant teachers both rated and ranked C2 (earn more in present job) and C3 (better teacher) among the three most important statements and C1 (no longer a teacher), C4 (community school) and C5 (any job that pays more) among the three least important statements. The scores allocated to C2 and C3 were very similar, as were those accorded to C1, C4 and C5 [illegible]. This indicates that the scores were not spread evenly over a wide range, and that the assistants distinguished sharply between the groups of two statements that they looked upon as most important, and the group of three that they regarded as least important.

In contrast to the correlation of the assistant teachers' ratings and rankings of Set C ($p < 0,01$) was the [illegible] correlation between the principals' ratings and rankings of Set B on the Teachers' [illegible] suggests that the latter should be approached with great caution.

In relation to the principals' ratings, any particular statement could have been given a t l score of +16 to -16. In the event the highest and lowes scores were 16 and 6 respectivuly. (See Table 5:3.) The narrow range of these scores suggests that little confidence can be placed in the order of importance in which these statements were placed as a result of the rating procedure. It is therefore not surprising that the calculation of rho did not indicate a significant correlation between the principals' ratings and rankings of Set B statements on the Teachers' Questionnaire.

Conclusions

The question to be answered here is:

How could the validity of the ratings and rankings of a set of statements be assessed?

It might be argued that evidence of significant correlation between a group's ratings and rankings of a set of statements, demonstrates the validity of the measure. This belief rests upon the assumption that, when a statement is rated, the higher the degree of agreement expressed, the more important it is held to be. There are two flaws in this reasoning.

First, suppose that a native speaker of English is asked to rate two statements, both of which appear to her to be self-evidently correct. It is possible that she might not respond to them in exactly the same way. It is possible that she might be more vehement in her agreement with a statement concerning a controversial

matter than in her assent to one which was widely held to be beyond dispute. If, however, none of the statements were to deal with contentious matters, this problem would not arise.

Secondly, it is logically possible to agree strongly" with a statement that one regards as trivial. This also would not be problematic in practice if the respondents typically agreed enthusiastically with statements that they considered to be of importance.

These two objections would be met if the interviewees were asked only whether they agreed or disagreed with each of the statemonts. But, unfortunately, this procedure would probably give rise to another problem. It is likely that, if degrees of agreement and disagreement were eliminated, the range of the group's response to a set of statements would [illegible] For the purposes of the research, the results would be relatively uninformative.

If it were decided to disregard the two objections raised above, and to assume that a significant correlation between a group's ratings and rankings of a set of statements were evidence of the validity of those measures then three conditions would have to be met.

(a) The procedures of rating and ranking would have to be carried out as entirely independent tasks.

(b) Each respondent would have to be motivated to express an opinion that was genuinely held (as

opposed to making a random selection from among the choices offered).

(c) The situation would have to be so managed that each interviewee's responses would be independent of those made by others in course of an interview.

3. Spearman's rank correlation coefficient (rho) could be used to measure the correlation existing between a group's rating and ranking of a set of statements.

Rho could also be used to establish whether a significant correlation existed between two group's perceptions of the same attribute. For example, in this study it was found that the pupils' perceptions of their teachers' aims, and the principals' and assistant teachers' indications of their own aims, correlated at the .1% and 1% level respectively (6.4.3).

4 An assessment of the validity of a groups' rating and ranking of a set of statements could be based upon the identification of statements that were both rated and ranked among the first three, and the last three, in order of importance.

There is another indicator that could be used to assess the correlation between a groups' ratings and rankings of a set of statements and, therefore, of the validity of these measures. Each pair of ratings and rankings of a statement could be examined in order to determine the number of items that fall within not more than two places of one another in order of importance. The

more items that fall within these limits the higher would be the correlation between the ratings and rankings.

6. An inspection of a group's ratings and rankings of each statement in a set could reveal evidence relevant to an assessment of the correlation between the ratings and rankings as a whole.

For example, in this study it was found that there was no significant correlation of the principals' ratings with their rankings of Set B on the Teachers' Questionnaire. It was then noticed that there was a wide discrepancy between the ratings and rankings of one statement. When it was removed, the remaining ratings and rankings correlated significantly.

An examination of a table showing a group's ratings and rankings for a set of statements might provide further insights that bear upon validity.

For example, in this study, scrutiny of Table 5:12 showed that the supervisors both rated and ranked C2, C8 and C3 respectively first second and third, in order of importance. Further, this table showed that all the supervisors had chosen these same three statements as the three most important to the teachers. In other words, the degree of consensus and correlation was very high indeed.

The spontaneous comments made by interviewees could be recorded. They often reflect problems that affect validity.

The respondents could be asked to rate and rank the same set of statements on two separate occasions in the course of an interview. It is expected that the first and second lots of ratings would correlate highly, and the rankings likewise. It is also predicted that, as a result of an integration promoted by the process of responding on the first occasion, the second pair of ratings and rankings would show a greater correlation (i.e. a greater validity) than the first pair.

Information supplied by a group about its own aims or motives could be compared with other people's perceptions of the same.

In this study, the teachers were asked to rate and rank the statements in Set B. These were concerned with what pupils should be like by the end of Std 7. The pupils were asked to rate a matching set of statements concerning their teachers' aims. Further, those assistant teachers who wanted to pass matric were asked to rate and rank statements in Set C, which were designed to reveal their reasons for wanting this qualification. The principals and the supervisors expressed their perceptions of these assistants' motives by rating and ranking matching statements. In both these cases the observers (the pupils in the first example, and the principals and the supervisors in the second) confirmed the teachers' accounts of their own aims/motives as expressed in ratings and

rankings.

Rho is calculated on the basis of the rank orders in which the items are placed by a group. An examination of the raw scores which led to the items being placed in a particular rank order could usefully complement the results of the calculation of rho.

In this study the assistant teachers' ratings and rankings of statements in Set C correlated significantly at the 1% level. Faith in the high level of validity that this implies was strengthened by the observation that the raw scores were spread over a wide range. There was not only unanimity of response but the respondents held strongly positive opinions about some statements and almost equally negative convictions about others. In contrast, a calculation of rho showed a significant correlation between the principals' ratings and rankings of Set B on the Teachers' Questionnaire. It was also noted that as a result of the rating procedure, the raw scores fell within a relatively narrow range, suggesting that little confidence could be placed in the rank order in which these statements were placed.

An examination of the raw scores could also illuminate the validity by which certain statements in a set were seen rated and ranked among the first three, and the last three, in order of importance.

In this study, the assistant teachers, when presented with the statements in Set C, both rated and

ranked two of them among the three most important, and three among the three least important. It was also found that the raw scores were spread over a relatively large range but not evenly spread. The two statements that were both rated and ranked among the first three in order of importance had scores that were very similar, and likewise, the three among the three least important. In other words, the assistants distinguished very clearly between the statements that they regarded most, and least, important.

A combination of a number of complementary methods of assessing validity could be used in conjunction. This is likely to result in a more accurate and subtle assessment than one method used alone.

THE ARTIFICIAL QUESTION AND SUMMARIES OF THE ANSWER

In [illegible], this central question was posed:

> What can this experience of field research contribute to an understanding of the methodology appropriate in studies of this type?

The answer to it was given in response to a number of sub-questions, each to be understood as beginning with the phrase, In a field study of this kind, in a social and temporal context like this, ...

The sub-questions, the sub-questions and summaries of the responses given to them, are presented, in sequence,

below.

6.2 RAPPORT

What measures could be taken to enhance rapport between the interviewer and interviewee?

1. A researcher would be well advised to establish whatever (ideologically) common ground she could honestly claim between herself and the respondents.
2. In preliminary interviews designed to suggest items for a survey of teacher perceptions, it would probably be better if the teachers from a particular school, as a group, were first to encounter the researcher face-to-face. At the end of this meeting, any documentation explaining or supporting the project could be distributed. See 6.2.4.

6.3 MORE WAYS OF INCREASING VALIDITY IN INTERVIEWS DESIGNED TO GENERATE ITEMS FOR A PERCEPTION SURVEY

A. In preliminary interviews designed to suggest items for a survey of teacher perceptions, what strategies could be used to reduce bias.

In order to avoid the imposition of the researcher's assumptions as a framework of thought upon the interviewees, a few, very general, open-ended questions should be asked.

It is suggested that focus attention on only one aspect of an important subject are to be avoided.

It is recommended that, in the course of the interview,

the researcher periodically summarise the respondent's comments and record this summary on a dictaphone. The interviewee should be encouraged to correct any imbalances, omissions or misapprehensions.

What could be done to elicit considered, rather than off-the-cuff, opinions?

It would be advisable, at a suitable time before the interview, to give the respondents notice of the questions that the researcher is to put to them.

See 6.3.3.

OTHER ASPECTS OF VALIDITY IN A PERCEPTION SURVEY

When carrying out a survey of opinion, how could validity be enhanced and how might this validity be assessed?

The answer to this sub-question is given in response to further questions.

Adult interviews: some strengths and weaknesses of the statements

What are the attributes of statements which, when rated and ranked by adults, are likely to yield the most satisfactory results?

The statements should reflect the interviewees' assumptions and framework of thought, and not that of the researcher.

The statements should reflect the interviewees'

concerns. It is likely that these concerns will have been the subject of conversation and therefore it is probable that the respondents will give considered rather than off-the-cuff opinions.

3. Statements containing the word "better" are to be avoided, particularly where the statement might be seen, by the interviewees, to imply hurtful personal criticism.

4. Among the statements to be avoided are those that elicit responses that are incomparable because they are so closely connected to individuals' widely differing professional circumstances. (See 6.4.2.)

6.4.3 Problems in interviewing pupils

1. If statements, designed for use with teachers, are to be tried and ranked by a sample of their Std V pupils, what could and could not be done to increase the validity of these children's responses?

2. The fieldwork should be carried out early in the school year.

3. Each child should be interviewed separately.

4. Children who, by giving the same rating to every statement in a set, apparently intended to avoid expressing a personal opinion, should be asked why they had rated a particular statement in that way.

5. Each child should be interviewed in his (or her) home language and could be given a copy of the questionnaire translated into the same language. This strategy

would help children who were unfamiliar with certain crucial English words such as "agree" and 'disagree but would not compensate for the lack of relevant concepts.

5. If a pupil-interview component of this type is to be included in such a study it would appear that the enhancement of validity through the avoidance of off-the-cuff responses is just not possible.

B. How could the validity of the pupils' ratings be assessed?

If pupils both rated and ranked each set of statements suitably, then an indicator such as Spearman's rho could be used to assess the correlation between each pair.

The pupils and another group could be asked to rate matching sets of statements designed to elicit responses on the same subject. For example, the children and their teachers could rate statements concerning the teachers aims.

3. The researcher's observation of the pupils' behaviour during an interview would contribute significantly to [illegible] (see p 4.3.

6.4.4 Rankings: two means of increasing validity

How could validity of rankings be increased?

Interviewees must become familiar with the statements

in a set before they rank them. This could be facilitated by having only a small number of statements in each set, and by asking the respondents to first rate the statements, then rank them.

2. Interviewees should be set tasks that are as natural as possible. (See 6.4.4.)

6.4.5 Assessing the validity of rank orders

How could the validity of the ratings and rankings be assessed?

1 It might be argued that evidence of significant correlation between a group's ratings and rankings of a set of statements, demonstrates the validity of the measures. This belief rests upon the assumption that, when a statement is rated, the higher the degree of agreement expressed, the more important it is held to [illegible]. There are three problems with this reasoning. First, a statement concerning a controversial matter is likely to provoke a more extreme reaction than one that is widely believed to be self-evidently true or false. Secondly, it is possible to agree strongly with a statement that one regards as trivial. Thirdly, if all the statements are positive, then all the members of a group might agree strongly with all the statements. However, the same people might consider the statements to be of varying degrees of importance and so rank them in a variety of ways. In such a case there may be no correspondence between ratings and

rankings. Nevertheless, where a set of ratings evokes at least some range of ratings, then such correlation as emerges may be seen as validating.

If it were decided to disregard the three objections raised above, and to assume that a significant correlation between a group's ratings and rankings of a set of statements were evidence of the validity of those measures, then three conditions would have to be met.

(a) The processes of rating and ranking would have to be carried out by each interviewee as entirely independent tasks.

(b) Each respondent would have to be motivated to express an opinion that was genuinely he'd.

(c) The administration would have to be so managed that the interviewee's responses would be independent of those made by others in course of an interview.

Spearman's rank correlation coefficient (rho) could be used to measure the degree of correlation existing between a group's rating and ranking of a set of statements and a group's perception of the same attribute.

An assessment could be based upon the identification of statements that were both rated and ranked among the first three, and the last three, in order of importance.

An assessment could be based upon an examination of the

pair of ratings and rankings of each statement in order to determine the number of items that fell within not more than two places of one another in order of importance. The more items that were to fall within these limits the higher would be the correlation between the ratings and rankings.

An examination of a group's ratings and rankings of each statement in a set could reveal evidence relevant to an assessment of the correlation between the ratings and rankings as a whole.

An examination of a table showing a group's ratings and rankings of a set of statements might provide further insights bearing upon validity.

The spontaneous comments made by interviewees could be recorded. They often reflect problems that affect validity.

The respondents could be asked to rate and rank the same set of statements on two separate occasions in the course of an interview.

Information supplied by a group about its own aims or motives could be compared with other people's perceptions of the same.

An examination of the raw scores which led to the items being placed in a particular rank order could usefully complement the results of the calculation of rho.

An examination of the raw scores could also illuminate the validity by which certain statements in a set were both rated and ranked among the first three, and the

last three, in order of importance.

13. A combination of a number of complementary methods of assessing validity could be used in conjunction. (See 6.4.5.)

.6 CONCLUSION

In the introduction it was said that the following question would be addressed:

> What can this experience of field research contribute to an understanding of the methodology appropriate in studies of this type?

From the preceding list of answers to the sub-questions we may suggest the considerations below as worthy of particular attention in a study of this type.

As regards the enhancement of validity, major concerns should be the establishment of researcher interviewee ideological common ground, a response-recording procedure such as that employed in this study, and an appropriate method for the generation of statements for the survey. This last point would include formulations ensuring a logical connection between ratings and rankings, and also an avoidance of statements referring to teachers' professional circumstances that differ so widely that the responses are incomparable.

As regards facilitating the assessment of validity it would appear important to interview one person at a time and to be present when survey subjects respond to written

statements (in order to observe behaviour and record spontaneous comments). Also advisable would be the use of a number of complementary means of assessing validity.

CHAPTER SEVEN: INSET IN THESE SCHOOLS

7.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter is divided into three major sections. In the first of these (7.2), an indication is given of three perspectives that must be borne in mind when planning an INSET programme for these schools: the modern Catholic perspectives relevant to education (7.2.1), those arising from the national context and its Catholic facet (7.2.2) and those emerging from recent experience of INSET (7.2.3). In the second major section (7.3), the main aspects of the teachers' perceptions are recalled (7.3.2) and the plan is described (7.3.3). The conclusion forms the final section (7.4).

7.2 PERSPECTIVES

7.2.1 CATHOLIC PERSPECTIVES

The whole enterprise of Catholic education takes place within the church as an aspect of the activity known as evangelisation. Logically, then, any Catholic perspective must embody a notion of the Church and the notion of evangelisation. This section is concerned with the interpretation of those two ideas, and draws upon material presented in 4.4.4; VIII:2; and in the section in which comments are made about reactions to statement B8 in 5.5.3.3.2.

As regards the notion of the church, the starting-point has been certain aspects of the analysis developed by Avery

Dulles. (See 4.4.4.)

In relation to evangelisation, it will be important to distinguish it on the one hand from "convert-making" and on the other from an identification with (as distinct from relationship to) secular struggles for human liberation.

All Catholic schools are maintained for the evangelisation of their pupils. That is, it is intended to convey to the children, and develop in them, a Christian and specifically Catholic, set of beliefs and values.

It is evident that individual Christians give expression to these beliefs and values, and so participate in the life of the church, in a variety of ways. It seems that many Christians display gestalts of beliefs and values that are similar to those associated with the conscious, or unconscious, appraisal of a particular model of the church. In 4.4.4 extensive reference was made to Dulles' Models of the Church. A brief return is now made to that work, drawing attention to certain themes relevant to this particular stage of the dissertation.

Dulles distinguishes between five models. In each the church is regarded as primarily (respectively) "Institution", "Mystical Communion", "Sacrament", "Herald" and "Servant". He asserts that taken in isolation, each of these ecclesiological types could lead to serious inadequacies and distortions. However, these models cannot all be accepted without qualification as, to some extent, they conflict with each other. Nevertheless, Dulles argues, the basic assertions implied in each are valid in

that each "brings out certain important and necessary points" (ibid., 183).

The institutional model

> makes it clear that the Church must be a structured community and that it must remain the kind of community Christ instituted.

The community model

> makes it evident that the Church must be united to God by grace, and that in the strength of that grace its members must be lovingly united to one another.

The sacramental model

> brings home the idea that the Church must in its visible aspects - especially in its community prayer and worship - be a sign of the continuing vitality of the grace of Christ and of hope for the redemption that he promises.

The kerygmatic (herald) model

> accentuates the necessity for the Church to continue to herald the gospel and to move men to put their faith in Jesus as Lord and Savior.

The diaconal (servant) model

> points up the urgency of making the Church contribute to the transformation of the secular life of man, and of impregnating human society as a whole with the values of the Kingdom of God (Dulles, 1976, 183).

Dulles is correct in saying that we must harmonize these models. He believes that this must be done in such a way that the differences between models become complementary rather than mutually repugnant" (1976, 185). (See 4.4.4., However, he adds,

> there is nothing to prevent a given theologian from building his own personal theology on one or another of the paradigms in the tradition (ibid., 185).

Harmonizing, thus, far from implying equal weighting to all paradigms, allows (and humanly one would expect to ential) differential weighting by different theologians. Furthermore, it would be natural for small or large groups of theologically-thinking people, who share particular circumstances, to exhibit some degree of commonality in the pattern of emphasis concerning these models of the church. Given the circumstance of South Africa today it is not surprising that the process about to be described has produced an emphasis upon the community and servant models.

In 1977, in order to arrive at a pastoral plan for the church in Southern Africa, the SACBC initiated an elaborate process of consultation with religious and laity (of whom 80% are black). (See SACBC, 1980, 47.)

The result of this consultation was published in a booklet entitled Evangelii Nuntiandi Today: Church Report for the pastoral plan of the Catholic Church in Southern Africa (SACBC, 1987).

It was widely felt:

1. that the pastoral plan must be unmistakably inspired by the understanding of the Church [illegible] Vatican Council;
2. that this understanding of the Church must be related to the realities of life in South Africa;
3. that there should be a key theme for the pastoral plan and that this can be formulated as Communally Serving Humanity;

(At least a third of the responses to the consultation document expressed a clear desire that attention be given to building up community".

About half expressed the desire that the Church

address issues of social justice and that it should foster the humanity of all". See SACBC, 1987, 13.)

> 4. that the basic element in the pastoral plan must be Formation; that is, the education or evangelisation of all the people in the Church - bishops, priests, religious, laity; adults, youth, children - in terms of the vision of the church expressed in this theme (SACBC, 1987, 4). (Emphases in the original.)

It was stated that the basic purpose of the pastoral plan was to improve the quality of christianity in the church. Further, if

> the Church's mission is to be a sign of unity in love, a sign of the sort of society God has planned for everybody, then it can only carry out its mission if its members are such a sign. ... The world needs to be able to look at us and say 'see how they love one another". Indeed, the world should be able to say 'see how they love (ibid., 4-5). Emphasis in the original.)

These two quotations, and the phrase "Community serving humanity", clearly indicate that the Catholic church in South Africa is in the process of harmonising the community and servant models. Further, in both quotations the word [illegible] could be correctly replaced by sacrament" i.e. the sacramental model is implied in each. It is also implied in this passage which emphasises that

> The Church is meant to be a sign to the world not only of true community but also of that which creates it: the Spirit of Love, the Spirit of the Father and Son at work in our lives (ibid., 16).

As the church has traditionally assumed an institutional model (ibid., 5) it can be claimed that harmonisation of four of the five models is taking place.

In Community serving humanity the values of the servant

model are advocated in preference to the purely institutional and kerygmatic (herald) models.

It is claimed that the Church is called upon to serve everybody and not merely its own members. Nor is its service to the world meant to consist in trying to get everyone to join it (ibid., 17). In justification it is recalled that

> Jesus told his disciples that they were 'the light of the world' (Mt 5:14), a light cast not simply by words but above all by deeds. 'Your light must shine in the sight of men, so that seeing your good works, they may give the praise to your father in heaven' (Mt 5:16). The sort of good works he had in mind can be gathered from his story about the day of judgement. The crucial question he will pose to people will be whether or not they served their neighbour in some way or other (Mt 25:31-46) (ibid., 16).

Traditionally, members of the Catholic church in South Africa have been exhorted to put their faith in Jesus as Lord and Saviour, but in general have not been urged to proclaim the Gospel and this faith explicitly to other people. Bearing witness by example, and response to expressions of interest, have certainly been encouraged, but initiatives beyond that have been seen as a vocation to a special role within the church. And Community serving Community embodies an approach to witness which does not include the explicit proclamation of individual faith in Christ.

Dulles specifically warns against the separation of [illegible]

That the proclamation of the Gospel is an essential part of evangelisation is clearly indicated in Evangelii

Nuntiandi (Paul VI, 1975, 204-242). Indeed it is seen as "the foundation, centre and at the same time, summit of its dynamism" (ibid., 215). While asserting that "above all the gospel must be proclaimed by witness" (ibid., 213), it is stressed that this will be "ineffective in the long run if it is not explained, justified" by an "unequivocal proclamation of the Lord Jesus (ibid., 214).

In relation to Catholic schools, those who espouse the servant model of the church can avoid this imbalance if they bear in mind the distinction between secular liberation and evangelisation, and recall that these schools are established and maintained for the purposes of evangelisation.

Following the perspective provided in Evangelii Nuntiandi (Paul VI, 1975), theologian Albert Nolan has made a comparison of these two concepts (1984, 158-166).

Nolan was head of the Dominican Order in South Africa from 1976 to 1984. In 1983 he declined a similar role at international level in order to work in South Africa in these critical times. (See Nolan and Broderick, 1987, To Remain in the Truth: Theology of Liberation in Southern Africa). Inter alia he has worked in the ecumenical Institute for Contextual Theology and, before the banning of its activities in February 1988, in the People's Education Commission of the National Education Crisis Committee.

As he points out, to evangelise is to bring the influence of the Gospel to bear upon the world. In

addition, he says that

> There can no longer be any doubt that the Kingdom of God is the kernal and centre of the revelation we receive in Jesus Christ. According to this gospel we must seek first The Kingdom of God and its justice" (Mt 6:33). Everything else flows from that (1984, 160).

He observes that this kingdom is a social reality. Not only are individual souls to be saved but societies as well. Indeed the whole of creation is to be "made new". The final destiny of the world is its complete perfection. This is the kingdom of God which is beyond the imagination of man (ibid., 161).

> Evangelisation, then, is the transformation of the world in terms of this all embracing vision of a divine Kingdom ibid., 162 .

In our present world we can see some partial realisation of this kingdom, the seeds of this kingdom. What we look forward to is the harvest or fullness of the Kingdom ibid., 161-162).

Nolan goes on to discuss some of the differences and links between evangelisation and human liberation. (Here the term secular liberation is used in preference to human liberation. Both terms refer to liberation from the consequences of sin. Examples are given below.)

First, as 'evangelisation envisages the total salvation of the world then it must include human liberation' (ibid., 162). Emphasis in the original.)

> The various movements for liberation and justice .... tackle only the consequences of sin: poverty, homelessness, ignorance, discriminatory laws, unjust structures, are on that account partial, incomplete and precarious (ibid., 163). (Emphasis in the original.,

In contrast the liberation proclaimed by Jesus is total because it attacks the root cause of all oppression, all slavery and all suffering, namely, sin (ibid., 162-163).

Secondly, evangelisation transcends secular liberation. That is, evangelisation includes, but goes beyond, it (ibid., 163).

Thirdly, the divine salvation of the Kingdom is seen as a grace or gift from God. This is not to say that it is not, at the same time, the result of human effort (ibid., 164). Indeed, Nolan claims that

> There is no part of our salvation that does not involve human effort and there is no act of salvation that does not involve God (ibid., 165).

In [illegible] a Catholic perspective on INSET in the schools in question, it is necessary to be sensitive to, and [illegible] drawn from, the various models of the church indicated by [illegible]. However, as has been remarked earlier in this section, the church's interpretation of the South African situation would entail a greater emphasis on one particular model. The approach to evangelisation characteristic of community and servant models, as reflected in the immediately preceding paragraphs, provides a major rationale for the continuing sponsorship, by the Catholic church, of educational ventures in South Africa.

[illegible] RELEVANT FEATURES OF THE NATIONAL CONTEXT AND OF ITS CATHOLIC FACET

Here, attention will be drawn to certain distinctive

features of the South African context of which cognisance must be taken in planning an INSET programme for the Soweto Catholic primary schools. Such features may respectively constrain, suggest imperatives or provide opportunities for, such a programme.

South African society reflects a variety of cultural traditions. Such a situation is potentially a source of enrichment and also potentially a source of conflict.

The way in which South African society has in fact developed has resulted in a situation of social fragmentation and stratification in which conflict is endemic. (See Appendix VIII.1; 4.4.3.2; Marais, 1985, 56 and Connor, 1985, 19.)

In recent years the conflict between the various groups has taken on an evermore violent form. On the one hand there is structural violence which is built into the regular functioning of the social system (Con 1985, 20). Examples can be found in 3.6 and 5.4. On the other hand, there are frequently outbursts of wild violence.

> When a situation is tense and brittle ... often only a small incident, ... is sufficient to provoke from either side, the eruption of pent-up rage, which sweeps all reason, human sympathy and moderation aside (ibid., 23).

Some of the episodes described in 5.4 exemplify such wild violence. Bishop Ormond says that

> The increase in violence, both institutional and retaliatory, is of particular concern to the Church (Diocesan News, July, 1987).

These factors have produced a mutual suspicion of motives between members of different groups. This is

obviously an obstacle to co-operation in educational programmes. However, there are significant examples of current co-operative ventures. (For one such, see 7.2.3.4 below.) This suggests that there may exist opportunities beyond those which have been discovered and taken up so far.

As regards the educational system, the intentional fragmentation has been accompanied by a differential allocation of resources, reinforcing the privileged position of the whites (Marais, 1985, 31). (In relation to education, the whites form the most privileged stratum of society, the Indians and "Coloureds", the second and third strata, and the blacks the fourth, the lowest stratum. The teachers involved in this research come, of course, from this last. This group is, however, somewhat better off in educational resources than the poor of the national states" and "independent states".

In 1976 the SACBC announced that it favoured a policy of racial integration in Catholic schools and encouraged individual schools to implement it as appropriate in their circumstances. (See 1.5.) During the following ten years most of the white-registered schools opened their doors to pupils of all races, in some way, and to some degree. This demand was won after hard negotiation with the state for the right to do so. Only in 1986 were they legally recognised and made eligible for subsidy. In that year the SACBC commissioned an independent evaluation of this venture in Catholic integration (Christie and Butler, 1988, 1). From

this it emerged that, among principals, there was a spectrum of opinion about "open" schools and social change. However a belief that spanned the spectrum was that "open schools are better than all-white schools, even if they involve very small numbers of blacks in overall terms" (ibid., 64).

For the purposes of the present project the importance of the "open" schools lies in their existence as intentionally non-racial communities with human and other resources potentially supportive of an INSET programme concerned to embody a non-racial perspective.

The black-registered Catholic schools, like those in Soweto, are also officially open to all races but have rarely, if ever, been integrated in the sense of also having had white pupils. White parents do not apply for the admission of their children. (See 1.5.)

A significant development in late 1985 was the emergence of the National Education Crisis Committee. Initially concerned with mediation in the schools' boycott by black pupils, the NECC went on to unify students, parents, teachers and other organisations in a nationwide attempt to effect a substantial shift in the curricula and the control of the education system. It facilitated the articulation of an alternative approach to education called People's Education, claiming to embody non-racial, democratic and socialist values. In the drafting of alternative curricular material, the greatest progress was achieved in history and English. (See 5.5.6.)

The way that history and English are taught obviously

influences intergroup relations. In particular, the history syllabuses were widely seen to be deficient. The HSRC investigation into intergroup relations found that the interpretation of historical events given in schools tended to consolidate and perpetuate white stereotypes, whether they were those of the English or Afrikaans speaking people. This is important, inter alia, because history forms perceptions and projects them into the future as expectations. See VIII.4.)

On 24 February 1988 curbs were placed upon 22 organisations, including the NECC, by the Minister of Law and Order. They were prohibited from 'carrying on or performing any acts or activities whatsoever and this prohibition was to remain in force until the orders were withdrawn or until the state of emergency was lifted (The Star, 24 February 1988). In the words of an editorial in The Star, these bodies were reduced to powerless shells' (25 February 1988).

On the 25 February 1988, in a Call to action issued jointly by The South African Council of Churches (a Protestant organisation) and the SACBC, the church leaders committed themselves to exploring every possible avenue for continuing to carry out the activities which had been banned in so far as they believed they were mandated by the Gospel. This is significant if, as Fr. Mkhatshwa (former secretary-general to the SACBC) says,

> the church is about the only organisation which still has some space to promote the struggle for

justice, peace and reconciliation (The Weekly Mail, 25-30 March 1988).

In 1985 the SACBC established a professional resource structure, the Catholic Institute of Education, concerned with the pre-service and in-service education of Catholic teachers. (See 1.5.) This would be the obvious body to provide the perspective and expertise for an INSET responsive to the considerations and empirical findings presented in this dissertation.

In approaching the matter of INSET in these schools, then, we have so far suggested what needs to be taken into account from the perspective of a modern Catholic orientation towards education, and from the perspective of the nature of the South African situation and of the response to it by the Catholic church, particularly in education. We must now examine the notion of INSET itself, and the body of experience and research which would be relevant to the development of INSET in the schools in question.

7.2.3 INSET

7.2.3.1 Introduction

Hartshorne says that the 'fundamental rationale' of INSET is to maintain and improve the quality of education". However, he adds that, in South Africa, this will have to be extended to include 'the reduction and ultimate elimination of inequality in education' (1986b, 22).

Political changes must take place in South Africa and

educational provision must be altered to serve different purposes.

Thompson points out that

> No single educational pattern will retain forever its relevance and efficiency in rapidly changing societies (1981, 331).

In view of this the management of innovation should perhaps be seen

> less as a matter of devising techniques for bringing about change in an institutional context permanently characterised by inertia, and more as a process of transforming that context into one characterised by active quality seeking (ibid., 197).

It should be noted that education is seen here as serving the purposes of society and not primarily as an instrument of change. It cannot make much impact on those constraints within which schools and teachers have to operate Hoyle, 1980, 96 . However, in the long run, [illegible] can surely facilitate or hinder progress, mainly through the contribution made to society by their former pupils.

In South Africa, four recent authoritative documents have indicated their authors' belief that improvement in the quality of the teacher is the key to improvement in the quality of education. These are HSRC's Provision of training in the RSA (1981) de Lange, 1981, 69), Advice by the interim education working party in the light of the report on the main committee of the HSRC investigation into education and comments received from the public (de Lange, 1982, 81), the White Paper on the provision of education in

the Republic of South Africa 1983 (Minister of National Education, 1983, 41) and The in-service education and training of teachers (Hartshorne, 1985, 6).

Improvement in teacher quality is sought in the development of initial/pre-service teacher education and of INSET. Both of these are to be seen as part of a continuing process concerned with the cultivation of the integrated academic, professional and personal growth of the teacher (UNESCO, 1975, 23).

In the light of the above it could be argued that

> teacher quality' and INSET are ultimately meaningless and fruitless unless they result in positive consequences in the classroom (van den Berg, 1983, 21).

This, in general, is surely correct but in fairness to teachers their legitimate personal ambitions within the system as it presently exists must also be taken into account. The state's remuneration system is based upon formal qualification (Hartshorne, 1985, 44), and the Senior Certificate has been made the baseline for advancement (ibid., 73). Fully qualified teachers (those who have a Senior Certificate plus three years of professional training) are paid substantially more than their less qualified counterparts. Further, this gap has widened significantly in recent years (van den Berg, 1983, 26). Understandably many teachers will give priority to the acquisition of such qualifications and it would be unethical not to help them to get those they need to be 'reasonably paid' (ibid., 27). The value of enabling teachers to

obtain the Senior Certificate, in particular, is in question for two reasons: First, it has not been adapted to their professional needs and its relevance for such purposes has been widely questioned (van den Berg, 1983, 33 and Hartshorne, 1985, pp. 44, 56 and 72). Secondly, teachers, under the pressure of preparing for examinations, are tempted to give less than appropriate attention to their pupils van den Berg, 1983, 28 and Hartshorne, 1985, 44-45).

A R Thompson's definition of INSET, given below, accommodates teachers' personal aspirations as well as the needs of their pupils.

According to him, INSET includes

> The whole range of activities by which serving teachers and other categories of educationalist within formal school systems may extend and develop their personal education, professional competence, and general understanding of the role which they and the schools are expected to play in their changing societies. INSET further includes the means whereby a teacher's personal needs and aspirations may be met as well as those of the system in which he or she serves (1982, 4-5).

Hartshorne comments that

> This definition, amended by the omission of the phrase 'within formal school systems' - to allow for some flexibility, preserves enough of the problematic issues and possible tensions to prove a starting point for further discussion (1985, 9).

[illegible]

Unfortunately schools are not easily improved (Thompson, 1981, 156).

> Consciousness of this fact has grown all over the world in recent years and one of the fastest growing areas of academic concern has been how to

> manage change in order that desirable innovations may speedily take root (ibid., 157).

It must be recognised that, to date, we understand very little of this process (ibid., 181). There is no blueprint for effective innovation in education. (See 1.3)

According to van den Berg

> Any INSET activity rests upon a particular view of how change comes about or might be brought about (1987, 16).

The innovation strategy used may have a "major determining influence' upon the success of an enterprise (Thompson, 1981, 184).

There are two well known typologies of strategies for educational change: that of Havelock and that of Bennis, Benne and Chin. According to van den Berg these typologies are very similar. He points out that Havelock's research, development and diffusion, and Bennis, Benne and Chin's power-coercive, models could both be characterised as centre-periphery strategies. In such strategies, the planners design and develop the innovation and then attempts are made to persuade (or coerce) the clients to adopt it (1987, 17).

Most INSET in South Africa is of this kind, focusing on individual teachers irrespective of the context within which they work (ibid.). It has also been widely used elsewhere and is currently many to have been relatively ineffective in modifying practice at local and grass roots levels (Thompson, 1982, 194 and 1.3 above).

Havelock's social interaction model and the

normative/re-educative strategies of Bennis et al, are also centre-periphery strategies. They differ from the research development, diffusion/power-coercive models "only to the extent to which they recognise the impact of context" on the clients (van den Berg, 1987, 17).

However, in Bennis, Benne and Chin's scheme there is no analogue to Havelock's problem-solving model. In the latter the users identify and diagnose the need, and develop a strategy which they then proceed to put into practice. Resource people are involved on the teachers' terms (ibid., 18).

Bennis, Benne and Chin's normative/re-educative model assumes that effective innovation requires a change of attitudes, relationships, values and skills and, therefore, the activation of forces within the client system". See Houghton, McHugh and Morgan, 1975, 395.)

According to Hartshorne,

> None of these strategies is ever applied in an absolutely 'pure' form, and evidence tends to suggest that, given the imperfect nature of both 'teacher and system' most success is reached when the 'right mix' appropriate to the specific situation, is used (1985, 16).

This position is essentially that taken by Thompson who says that 'these strategies are not to be regarded as alternatives but as complementary (1981, 197).

In addition to these normative typologies of educational innovation, [illegible] instructive to study Korten's 'blueprint" model of learning process management for rural development.

The 'blueprint' approach corresponds in a number of

respects to a centre-periphery strategy.

> Researchers are supposed to provide data from pilot projects and other studies which will allow the planners to choose the most cost-effective project design for achieving a given development outcome and to reduce it to a blueprint for implementation. Administrators of the implementing organisation are supposed to execute the project plan faithfully, much as a contractor would follow construction blueprints, specifications, and schedules. An evaluation researcher is supposed to measure actual changes in the target population and report actual versus planned change to the planners at the end of the project cycle so that the blueprints can be revised (1980, 496).

Typically, project goals are terminal. When these goals are reached the project is completed (ibid., 497).

Korten says that this is the "textbook version of how development programming is supposed to work" (ibid., 496). He claims that awareness of the inadequacies of the blueprint approach is becoming widespread (ibid., 497).

In response, Korten examined five case studies of [illegible] development projects. These projects, for example, [illegible] dairy cooperatives promoted by the Indian National Dairy Development Board. By the end of 1976 a [illegible] village cooperatives and combined membership [illegible] million farmers had been organized.' "Studies indicate that the program operates with a high level of efficiency and lack of corruption, ..." See ibid., 485.) In these five development programmes a participative approach was taken and blueprints never played more than incidental role in their development (ibid., 497). From this examination he derived the learning process model (ibid., 385).

These programmes

were not designed and implemented - rather they emerged out of a learning process in which villagers and program personnel shared their knowledge and resources to create a program which achieved a fit between needs and capacities of the beneficiaries and those of the outsiders who were providing the assistance. Leadership and teamwork, [illegible] were the key elements.

As progress was made in dealing with the problem of fit between beneficiary and program, attention was given either to building a supporting organization around the requirements of the program, or to adapting the capabilities of an existing organization to fit those requirements. Both program and organization emerged out of a learning process in which research and action are integrally linked (ibid., 497).

Korten says that

The concept of fit has assumed a central importance in the fields of business policy and organizational design as research has illuminated the important relationships between task, context, and organizational variables, concluding that the performance of an organization is a function of the fit achieved between those variables.

In rural third world development there must be a fit between beneficiary needs, programme design and the [illegible] of the assisting organization (ibid., 496).

The learning process and the problem-solving models are akin in that the beneficiaries play an active part in identifying and diagnosing needs and in developing strategies that they put into practice. They differ in that the learning process model involves an outside agency from the start whereas, in the problem-solving model, others are called in when the beneficiaries choose to involve them. Perhaps it would be appropriate to use the learning process model in the stage of a community's development and the

problem-solving at a later stage.

It may be noted that Korten's model is seen as most closely encapsulating the strategy adopted by TELIP, the Johannesburg-based Teachers English Language Improvement Project, an outgrowth of the Schools English Language Project referred to in 2.2 above (TELIP, 1986, 23).

There is evidence to suggest that the learning process model might form the basis of the right mix. 'The basic argument against changes imposed by outside authorities, [illegible] is that they have a very weak motivational basis for the user and the least prospects for long-term survival." Huberman claims that the literature on social change has shown that people will accept innovations more readily if they see them as relevant and have helped to plan them [illegible]. Similar ideas apparently underly Thompson's opinion that decisions should be taken at a level as close [illegible] the point where they will be implemented as feasible" (1981, 193).

Group cohesion appears to act as a catalyst (Huberman, 1973, 80).

> The fact that a group makes a decision or a commitment seems to cement consensus more strongly in each member, while at the same time the interaction among members improves communications and leads to greater interdependence in the system at large.

Other research suggests that people who are socially integrated into peer group structures are more receptive to new ideas. Specifically in relation to teachers, it seems that innovators operate in groups of two or three, but

"generally in pairs having a similar background and status" (ibid., 81).

The use of the learning process model is also consistent with Thompson's suggestion that, in the management of innovation, there should be a central concern to motivate the staff of each school to actively and continuously seek quality. (See 7.2.3.1.)

7.2.3.3 INSET in its macro and its micro contexts

The learning process model articulates well with the concept of school-focused INSET.

The Schools and In-Service Teacher Education (SITE) Evaluation Project team adopted the view that

> the distinguishing characteristic of school-focussed INSET is that it is targeted on the needs of a particular school or group within a school. The actual activity may take place on-site or off-site and equally importantly may be internally provided by certain school staff or externally provided by an outside agency like a college or a university (Baker, 1980, 181).

This view is also adopted here.

However, it should be noted, inter alia, that

> school-focussed INSET activities can .... be examples of core-periphery strategies, the difference being that the central or outside agency simply changes the locus of the activity and the nature of the audience, hoping thereby to achieve a greater take-up of the innovation. (See van den Berg, 1987, 19.)

Van den Berg believes that we cannot assume that

> 'school focussed' approaches to INSET will automatically have greater effect and be more acceptable within a South African context (than traditional forms) (ibid., 22-23).

There are two strong reasons for such circumspection.

First, the concept of school-focused INSET evolved in the United Kingdom and was based upon assumptions about teachers' professional autonomy that prevail there. Such assumptions may not be appropriate in South Africa and should be closely examined (ibid., 23).

The second reason is that most of the research which indicates that effective innovation is more likely when INSET is school-focused (rather than teacher-focused) (1983, 46) took place in contexts very different from South Africa. The context within which the proposed innovation is to occur must be expected to have a significant impact upon its liklihood of success" (1987, 20).

Hartshorne, convinced of the need to replace traditional centralised, intensive, 'course-oriented' INSET, and aware of the caveats raised by van den Berg, cautiously advises that INSET be brought closer to where the teacher is and works, and closer to the realities of the school and the community in which it is placed (1985, 91).

The above-mentioned research finding on the importance of INSET being school-focused is the first of what van den Berg identifies as three key findings of research in this area. A second is that it is more probable that there will be change if teachers are actively involved in the design and execution of programmes (1983, 46).

There are a number of South Africans concerned with theory related to INSET who believe in this need for involvement. Ashley and Mehl, compilers of INSET in South Africa, conclude that if there is the

theme that comes through very clearly" (in these papers) it is a belief in this (1987, iii).

Van den Berg says that there are two "powerful reasons" for basing INSET strategies on the active involvement of teachers. First, such strategies have been shown to be more successful. Secondly, and "more important",

> within an autocratic society those who are concerned about INSET and who also claim to support the democratization of South African society must be committed to the empowerment of teachers and not their continued subjugation (1987, 26).

Thompson envisages a particular type of school-focused INSET when he speaks of the development of "problem-solving" schools in which the staff are concerned to find ways of improving the quality of their work. This implies that they identify problems, diagnose the reasons for their existence, investigate ways of dealing with them, try out possible solutions and evaluate the results of their efforts. One of the major advantages of this approach to skills development is that they are sought

> when the teacher is conscious that he needs them and may be acquired when he is able to put them into immediate practical use.

However, in Thompson's experience, the existing patterns of training provide little or no preparation for the range of professional skills required (1981, 195).

In the development of such problem-solving schools the teachers obviously need both training ("to carry out pre-defined tasks to pre-defined specifications") and education ("to respond creatively and with judgement to situations and

in ways that are unpredictable") (Millar, 1980, 5).

(Van den Berg's third key research finding is not directly relevant to the matter under discussion at this point but its more general relevance to training justifies a brief incidental reference to it here. On pages 380 to 385 in their 1980 article, Joyce and Showers give their analysis of over 200 American studies of the effectiveness of various kinds of training methods. They identified five components: theory, modelling, practice, feedback and coaching to application. When theory is used in combination with other training components, it seems to increase conceptual control, skill development, and transfer [illegible] Modelling, i.e. demonstration of skills, appears to have considerable effect on awareness and some on knowledge but it, by itself, does not result in acquisition or transfer of skills. Practice under simulated conditions is an extremely effective way to develop competence in a wide variety of classroom techniques'. Teachers also require feedback [illegible] information about their performance. In addition they need coaching for application i.e. assistance in the classroom with the transfer of skills and strategies.

This development of problem-solving schools could also be seen as a strategy for the creation of a 'truly professional education service' (Thompson, 1981, 191).

Hoyle distinguishes between two types of professionalism: the restricted the term is not used

in ways that are unpredictable") (Millar, 1980, 5).

(Van den Berg's third key research finding is not directly relevant to the matter under discussion at this point but its more general relevance to training justifies a brief incidental reference to it here. On pages 380 to 385 in their 1980 article, Joyce and Showers give their analysis of over 200 American studies of the effectiveness of various kinds of training methods. They identified five components: theory, modelling, practice, feedback and coaching to application. When theory used in combination with other training components, it seems to increase conceptual control, skill development, and transfer of skills. Modelling, i.e. demonstration of skills, appears to have considerable effect on awareness and some on knowledge but alone does not result in acquisition or transfer of skills. Practice under simulated conditions is an extremely effective way to develop competence in a wide variety of classroom techniques'. Teachers also require feedback i.e. information about their performance. In addition they need coaching for application i.e. assistance in the classroom with the transfer of skills and strategies.

The development of problem-solving schools could also be seen as a strategy for the creation of a "truly professional education service (Thompson, 1981, '91).

Hoyle distinguishes between two types of professionalism: the restricted (the term is not used

pejoratively) and the extended. The first refers to "classroom competence, teaching skill and good relationships with pupils'. Extended professionalism includes these but also embraces the teachers' work in the wider context of the community and society; ensuring that his work is informed by theory, research and current examples of good practice; being willing to collaborate with other teachers in teaching, curriculum development and the formulation of school policy; and having a commitment to keeping himself professionally informed (1973, 97-98).

There are grounds for wariness regarding school-focused INSET based upon initiatives taken by staff members i.e. INSET that is based upon the problem-solving model of innovation. It must be regarded as a virtually untested [illegible] (van den Berg, 198[illegible], [illegible].

Thompson points to an inherent problem. In education there is a vicious circle whereby the products of the system become its staff. Therefore, to introduce radical innovations, it may be necessary to introduce "a group of highly able and committed people to serve as agents of change".

If Bennis, Benne and Chin's normative/re-educative model were to be followed strictly, the responsibilities of such a group would be threefold. First, they would serve as "catalysts", encouraging and stimulating staff to re-examine their work and devise means for its improvement". Secondly, they would be trainers, helping staff to develop the skills

they need largely by working together with them. Thirdly, they would act as link agents "seeking to bring staff together and to put them in contact with resources that exist elsewhere" (Thompson, 1981, 196). Their task would not be to design and introduce change. Their intervention would be subtle, the responsibility remaining with the staff (ibid., 197).

The change agents' involvement in schools must be regular and frequent, a normal feature of the life of the institution. In addition, they cannot be inspectors who report to authority and have responsibility for the allocation of rewards and punishments. These functions would destroy the kinds of personal relationships with teachers upon which rest the success of the change agents' endeavours.

Even if these conditions are met, however,

> no rapid transformation in staff attitudes and practices should be anticipated - the process of professional growth will inevitably be a slow and difficult one in which there will be resistance and suspicion which can only be overcome by a high degree of skill (ibid., 196).

Clearly the recruitment, training, deployment and coordination of change agents presents many problems. Nevertheless, Thompson believes that, if the normative/re-educative strategy is to be used in Africa, the change agent may have a vital part to play (ibid., 197).

If a learning process model of innovation were used, change agents would also be expected to play a central role however this would differ in an important respect from that

described above. Working in close collaboration with the teachers, the change agents would be required, precisely, to design and introduce change. Nevertheless, their intervention should be no less subtle than suggested above by Thompson, in relation to the normative/re-educative model. They should heed the comment of the Chinese writer Lao Tuz who, in 640 B.C., said that 'when the best leader's work is done, the people say we did it ourselves' (Mulford, 1986, 176).

7.2.4.4 A successful and relevant local example: the Science Education Project

7.2.4.4.1 The project: scope and success

An examination of a case study of a recent and (in the opinion of many) successful, educational innovation introduced into schools in the Ciskei, Transkei, Soweto and Durban may provide an indication of the "right mix" of innovation strategies involving INSET in such contexts. It is for this reason that the relevant aspects of the Science Education Programme (SEP) are now studied in some detail.

SEP was conceived in 1975

with the aim of improving the quality of science education in some of the least privileged schools [illegible] in South Africa. This improvement was initially defined in terms of introducing practical work into science lessons, and providing [illegible] for the schools to do some experiments were themselves. SEP focuses on [illegible] ..... Regan and [illegible]

The model personnel SEP was strongly influenced by Beeby

who classifies the growth of a primary school system into four stages: Dame School, Formalism, Transition and Meaning. It was recognised that, as a classification system, it was not without problems. Nevertheless, the implications arising from this model "proved invaluable".

"Improved" is defined by Beeby in terms of progress through these stages. As a school system advances the teachers become better qualified and their teaching methods less rigid and more pupil-centred".

Most of the schools into which SEP was introduced corresponded closely to Beeby's description of Stage II schools at this stage.

According to this, teachers are generally ill-educated but have had some training. The characteristics of the schools and the activities that take place within them are summarised below.

[illegible] symbols with limited meaning; rigid methods [illegible] external [illegible] discipline [illegible] heavily stressed; [illegible] largely ignored (Kogan and [illegible], 1971, 18).

The success of SEP was judged in different ways by different people.

It early became clear that people not directly involved in it would judge its effectiveness "almost exclusively on examination results". In two circuits in the Ciskei in 1979, the examinations written at the end of the year contained, in addition to longer questions, 50 multiple [illegible]. The Std VI results showed that SEP

pupils did significantly better than non-SEP pupils on 22 of the 50 multiple choice questions, and in six of the questions it was the non-SEP pupils who did better. The means were 29,14 and 22,74 respectively. The Std VII results showed that the SEP pupils did significantly better on 31, and the non-SEP pupils on one, of the multiple choice questions. The respective means were 30,23 and 19,36. It should be noted that SEP did not provide any special examination-preparation or techniques (ibid., 70).

In 1983, an evaluation team from the University of Cape Town's Department of Adult Education and Extra-Mural Studies undertook a study of SEP.

The steering committee consisted of K. B. Hartshorne, Jennifer Glennie, and representatives of the project and of the donors Morphet, Schaffer and Millar, 1986, 2). The members of this committee shared a number of assumptions at the beginning of the study.

> The single most important founding assumption was that the project was, in purely educational terms, successful. (Emphasis in the original.)

This view was based on several factors which can be briefly listed :

(i) The project had been in operation since 1979.

(ii) It had shown successful expansion into several different areas and systems.

(iii) It had been subjected to rigorous classroom observations which the Steering Committee regarded as proving its capacity to introduce positive changes into the teaching and learning of science in Black and some white classrooms (Macdonald and Stimson).

(iv) Regional evaluations (Lund) had also shown

its positive capacity to develop a professional teacher culture.

(v) It had demonstrated its ability to survive and grow in the difficult area between the demands of the bureaucratic education system (syllabus/examination/control etc.) and the interests of teachers and pupils (flexibility, group work, "doing science", political aspiration).

(vi) It was cost-effective when measured against the real costs of properly trained science teachers working with adequate apparatus.

(vii) It offered an important prototype of teacher in-service training and curriculum development (ibid., 5).

These evaluators took the view that SEP was

> fully justified in its claims to be the most comprehensive and effective in-system innovation currently in operation in the country (ibid., 29).

They also commented that

> S.E.P. is a remarkable project. There is much to be learned from its history and its present engagement (ibid., 1).

The teachers whom SEP hoped to influence worked in state schools and followed a national syllabus. This syllabus defines science essentially as a set of knowledge to be learned. Practical work is prescribed but, in black schools, little is done. In SEP's view science can be seen in terms of processes as well as knowledge acquisition.

> To the casual observer, the most striking feature of a SEP class-room is that pupils can be found doing practical work and talking to each other. In contrast, pupils in other (black) schools never handled apparatus and rarely ever even saw any. Science lessons consisted mostly of reading the textbook, sometimes in unison, or listening to the teacher.

In the SEP schools specially designed kit with accompanying worksheets was used to facilitate practical

work.

> Teacher guides were also provided to help integrate the kit and worksheets with the schedule derived from the textbook in use in the school in question (ibid., 67).

These materials were prepared between September 1976 and the end of 1977. They were tried out in six schools in the Ciskei in 1978 and, in 1979, in Soweto and the Transkei. In 1980 23 schools in Soweto were involved. This number rose to 30 in 1981 (ibid., 64).

From the outset INSET was seen as "a cornerstone of the SEP implementation strategy" (ibid., 69).

In 7.2.3.4.2 the relevant features of SEP are described. In 7.2.3.4.3 a discussion of the strategies and tactics that, in SEP's case, appear to have constituted the "right mix" is given and, in relation to innovations to be introduced under similar circumstances, suggestions are made.

7.2.3.4.. Strategies, tactics and response: four groups of factors

The information about SEP presented here is obtained mainly from a single article by Rogan and Macdonald (1985), both ultimately involved in it over several years. Morphet, Schaffer and Millar, who were commissioned by SEP's sponsors to carry out an evaluation of it in 1983, note that "The foundations of the Project lie primarily in the experience and intentions of John Rogan" (1986, 31). Allyson Macdonald undertook much of the evaluation in the Ciskei

prior to mid-1980 (Macdonald, Rogan and Dlepu, 1987, 2).

> This article addresses the question of whether
>
> tactics for in-service education and training identified as important in developed countries retain their validity under different conditions and whether there are additional tactics particularly appropriate for developing countries (Rogan and Macdonald, 1985, 63).

In this section there is a record of those aspects of their response that bear upon the selection of the right mix of innovation strategies in such a context.

Rogan and Macdonald note that there is no widespread consensus regarding the 'education and training and subsequent classroom practice (that) determine 'success'". However, it is possible to identify tactics which enhance the prospect of in-service education in promoting a desired innovation (ibid., 7).

They examined three reviews of such tactics, conducted in the USA, to discover which were seen as important in developing countries. One of these was by Joyce and Showers (1980), referred to by van den Berg. (See 7.2.3.3.) Rogan and Macdonald observe that it was concerned with training methods and that effectiveness was generally measured in terms of the acquisition and demonstration of skills, rather than the 'transfer of skills to the classroom'. The other reviews were by MacLaughlin and Marsh (1978) and Lawrence (1974) (ibid., 84).

Rogan and Macdonald synthesised these tactics into four groups i.e. those concerning, respectively, the content of INSET courses, experiences engaged in by participants of

courses, the structure and organization of courses and factors important to the support of INSET programmes (ibid., 71-72). They then assessed the value of each group of tactics in the development of SEP. Their "main impression was that the

> tactics identified as important from reviews of studies undertaken in the USA, were also important in the SEP experience. On the other hand, the setting of the innovation in the context of a developing country gave rise to additional tactics which do not always appear to receive emphasis in developed countries (ibid., 78).

Each of the four groups of tactics will now be discussed in turn and, where appropriate, attention will be drawn to additional tactics that Rogan and Macdonald found to be important in their circumstances.

The first group of tactics was concerned with the content of INSET courses.

> (i) The theoretical tenets underpinning the proposed innovation were often presented in the form of aims or a rationale.
> (ii) New teaching skills or strategies were demonstrated or modelled.
> (iii) Feedback about classroom behaviour or occurrences were provided (ibid., 71).

The importance of including aims and objectives in INSET courses is a truism accepted almost universally in curriculum literature. Further, the orthodox view is that teachers must play a central part in the formulation of these aims and objectives in order to increase their commitment to the innovation. In the event, the Ciskei teachers involved in the SEP programme perceived themselves

as quite unable to contribute to a discussion on science education and some suggested that, as the SEP developers were the "experts', they should formulate these aims and objectives. (Many of the teachers had not been trained in science, most had not handled any apparatus and a number had had no teaching experience.) It would appear that certain basic levels of knowledge and skill are necessary for active participation in identifying their own needs. The aims were largely formulated - and soon reformulated - by the developers".

These aims were presented in the Ciskei at the 1978 introductory course (ibid., 72). This consisted of

> a single blocked period of three weeks prior to the opening of the schools for the new year, and comprised lectures by SEP staff and familiarization activities using the new materials (ibid., 69).

In 1979 this course was repeated, at least in essentials.

Teachers who had attended the 1978 course and had used the materials during 1978, benefited more from the 1979 course than the teachers who were new to the scheme. It seems that this was because they could relate to the aims and teaching skills spoken of in the course on the basis of experience. Furthermore, these

> teachers were now in a position to begin to debate, question and reformulate the aims in the light of their own experience (ibid., 72-73).

In 1979 it was noted that some of these teachers "began to incorporate more of the aims and teaching skills suggested by the writers into their teaching (Macdonald

and Gilmour, 1980, 27).

There were also examples of rejection of SEP aims.

> A basic tenet of Project philosophy was the development of the individual pupil, and especially the development of reasoning, language, initiative and social skills. Teachers and pupils are the products of a culture which does not easily accommodate independent thought and action from children. Thus both teachers and pupils were reluctant/unable to support these aims to the full (ibid., 28).

As SEP evolved less emphasis was placed on the formulation of aims and objectives in the initial courses. It was left to a later date (Rogan and Macdonald, 1985, 73).

(ii) The SEP experience suggests that the demonstration or modelling of new teaching skills is important in the South African situation. It was practised in three different forms, with varying success.

In 1978, in a well-equipped university laboratory, a SEP instructor taught a series of 'model' lessons to small classes of teachers who played the role of pupils. Modelling, in the true sense of the word, was not realised under these highly artificial conditions.

In 1979, the Nuffield Chemistry film, Chemistry by Investigation, was shown to groups of teachers in the Ciskei and in Soweto. The superb facilities available in the school used in the film proved to be somewhat of a 'distraction'. Some teachers questioned the relevance of the methods used in the film to their situation. In response, the Johannesburg SEP team made their own film,

Doing Science, "in which a science lesson using SEP materials was modelled in a Soweto classroom. This film has been used extensively in most areas where SEP materials are being introduced".

In the third form, the SEP developers taught lessons in the teachers' own classrooms.

> This on-site modelling had greater impact than similar modelling removed from the local setting. Several instances of permanent changes as a result of such local visits were noted.

Over the years the SEP programme came to rely increasingly on modelling as a tactic, particularly in real conditions'. It is suggested that the teachers' primary concern in an innovative situation is how to survive and function given the new demands'. If this is so then it is probable that on-site modelling serves to familiarize teachers with new strategies and hence is an important part of a survival kit (ibid., 73-74).

[illegible] it was felt that initially insufficient attention was paid to feedback about classroom behaviour. However in 1979, an effective form of feedback

> emerged from group discussions on the worksheets which had just been used by the teachers. As they offered suggestions for improvement, features of classroom experiences emerged (ibid., 74).

Rogan and Macdonald point out that

> Perhaps the most important aspect of the SEP courses was not identified at all in the reviews cited earlier. About three-quarters of the SEP course time was allocated to subject matter.

In the Ciskei it was observed that many teachers had very little knowledge of the science they had to teach. Therefore,

> Together with modelling, the knowledge provided by the courses was an essential part of a survival kit. Security based on knowledge was important if teachers were to abandon themselves to the uncertainty of practical work and the unpredictable questions which could arise from such a situation (ibid., 74).

The SEP developers found that content knowledge was "a vital part of the courses", and this emphasis was continued in Soweto, Durban and the Transkei.

However, in Soweto, some teachers attended courses at the Science Education Centre (which is independent of SEP) where they used and became familiar with SEP materials (ibid., 74). When they became involved with SEP, courses, that were designed for them, focused upon issues related to teaching methods (ibid., 75).

The second group of INSET tactics which were thought in the USA to be of importance is concerned with the experiences engaged in by participants of courses.

> (1) New skills or strategies were practised under real or simulated conditions.
> (2) Participants were encouraged to share their expertise with one another (ibid., 71).

In the Ciskei in 1978, little attention was paid to the practice of new skills under real or simulated conditions, or to the sharing of expertise among teachers.

The authors comment that the practice of new skills in a situation less daunting than a classroom may, for some

teachers, be both welcome and necessary. By 1985 SEP had not solved this problem (ibid., 75).

(ii) In 1979 and 1980 teachers played an increasing role in running the courses and this resulted in increased discussion and sharing of experiences.

These experiences influenced the programmes run in the Transkei, Soweto and Durban. Teacher participation and sharing of experiences was encouraged earlier and to a greater extent than in the Ciskei (ibid., 76).

Teacher participation in general "emerged as an important aspect of SEP's operation" (ibid., 81).

In 1980 the relationship between SEP and the state educational authorities was of great concern (ibid., 69). Although the 'encouragement of circuit inspectors and school principals, ..., was essential' (ibid., 82), SEP had remained substantially independent of the Department of Education and Training (DET). (It was called the Department of Bantu Education in SEP's early years.) This meant that DET could be evicted from the schools at any point (ibid., 82).

> Positive support was evident for SEP in the Transkei and neutral support in the Ciskei and Durban. However, evidence of negative reaction was becoming apparent in the Soweto area.
>
> The survival of the Project was seen to lie in the grassroots community and teacher support rather than in its adoption and enforcement by a central authority (ibid., 69).

This led to the initiation of the contact teacher' programme in Soweto.

> Schools were divided into clusters under the guidance of a co-ordinator who was a science teacher in one of the cluster schools. It was the responsibility of the co-ordinator to act, amongst other things, as a resource person for the cluster, to visit other schools in the cluster, to arrange meetings on a regular basis and to provide encouragement and leadership. It was envisaged that as SEP became more established, most in-service education would take place within these clusters (ibid., 69-70).

In 1981 local versions of this programme were developed in the Transkei and Durban and called 'zonal systems".

In order to support these programmes SEP recognised the need to "develop the concept of grassroots leadership". Leadership courses, sponsored by the British Council, were held in England in 1982 and 1983. Other courses were instituted in Soweto, the Transkei and Durban (ibid., 70).

Although the schools with which SEP was concerned displayed Beeby's Stage II characteristics some individuals were capable of operating at higher levels. Such people are often deeply frustrated in these schools. The zonal system appears to have offered them an outlet for their talents and an opportunity to exercise leadership.

Gray, describing his experience in Durban, says that the zonal system has provided a structure at a local enough level to enable the teachers to grow professionally and, further, teachers no longer feel isolated (ibid., 81). He also notes that

> Responsibility for running workshops has fallen largely on teachers. Through this we have witnessed teachers gathering to set common tests, help with syllabus problems, share apparatus, discuss work schemes, discuss teaching problems, etc. 1982, 6).

The third group of INSET tactics relates to the structure and organization of courses.

(i) A series of mini-courses were found to be more effective than longer one-time only courses.
(ii) Teachers were found to be effective course instructors.
(iii) Individualised training experiences tailored to particular needs were found to be more effective than single-stream courses (Rogan and Macdonald, 1985, 71-72).

(i) The SEP experience suggests that a series of mini-courses is more effective than one longer course.

In 1978 in the Ciskei, there was a single three-week long course held shortly before the new school year began. The enthusiasm generated during this period waned as the year progressed. Two reasons are suggested. The teachers appeared to become increasingly insecure with the subject matter and there was no way of their sharing experiences with colleagues.

In 1979 and 1981 the orientation course was followed by three-day courses every two months. In the Transkei these were held monthly. In Soweto and in Durban where transport is more readily available than in the rural areas, weekly courses were held and this appeared to be the ideal.

(ii) In the experience of SEP, teachers were found to be effective course instructors. Of particular note was that they found that these teachers did not have to have had long experience of this innovation in order "to speak to other teachers with authority".

In 1979, the SEP teachers in the Ciskei were required to attend a week-long INSET course provided by the Ciskei Education Department (CED) in addition to the SEP courses. SEP teachers were asked to assist in running the CED course and "taught non-Project teachers and helped organize the training centre laboratory along the lines they had seen in the Fort Hare Science Education laboratory" (Macdonald and Gilmour, 1980, 17).

However, it is, of course, realistic to assume that a teacher's level of effectiveness in helping peers "is related to the teacher's level of competence, including knowledge of subject matter".

Since 1980 most of SEP's INSET programmes "have been based on the assumption that teachers can be effective course instructors" (Rogan and Macdonald, 1985, 76). In addition, the Siwela teacher contact programme, and the Cape and Transkeian zonal systems, also reflect the conviction that teachers can and should play a central role in the provision of INSET (ibid., 77).

With regard to individualised training, in the Ciskei there was a tendency away from individualisation towards group activities.

> As the running of courses became the responsibility of teachers, the emphasis on individualised work sessions seemed to decrease. One reason for this, although it was never articulated, appeared to be that teachers valued the opportunity of discussing the implications of performing a particular experiment in their science rather than only performing the work themselves during the course. A second reason

may well lie in cultural values. The emphasis on indiviuual growth and expression is stronger in Western than in African societies (ibid., 77).

The fourth of Rogan and Macdonald's groups of tactics is connected to factors that are important to the support of INSET programmes.

(i) Assistance with the application of the new skills or strategies at the school site was provided.
ii Support and encouragement was provided by the school and district (ibid., 72).

(3) Although school visiting was not part of the initial set of tactics planned by the SEP team, in time it "came to be recognised as a vital and indispensable component" of the programme.

My first SEP personnel visited schools more to monitor progress than to assist with the teachers' professional growth. This focus changed as requests for help in the schools were received. The teachers came to view such visits as a valuable part of the programme.

As the number of schools involved in SEP increased, the so-called teacher/zonal system was devised, in part, 'to facilitate an adequate schedule of regular visiting' (ibid., 77).

(4) In the USA, support and encouragement by the school principal was identified as important to implementation.

As mentioned earlier, from inception SEP remained independent of the departments that controlled state schools. This meant that SEP was not forced on to schools

by an unsympathetic authority, as is the South African tradition, but was accepted .... on its own merits" (ibid., 65). SEP's policy was "not to work in a school without the principal's full support. In fact, many schools joined SEP at the request of the principal. In general it was felt that the programme required the visible support of both principals and circuit inspectors (ibid., 78). It is obvious that SEP required top-level tolerance but although cooperation and assistance from this quarter would have been desirable, it was not necessary (ibid., 82).

7.2.3.4.3 The right mix

In relation to this, the following question must now be addressed: What in this case proved to be the right mix of strategies and tactics, from which suggestions might be derived for projects in comparable contexts?

The latter part of the discussion which follows here deals primarily with the choice of appropriate models of innovation. It appears that a non-coercive centre-periphery model was initially satisfactory but, at the implementation stage, it was necessary to supplement it with a model similar in important ways to Korten's learning process strategy. This point will be elaborated and followed by a brief reference to van den Berg's three key findings from research.

The models of innovation used in launching SEP had certain characteristics that were typical of the centre-periphery type. The developers identified and diagnosed

the problem, designed and developed the innovation, and then attempted to persuade the teachers in the target schools to adopt it. The material aspects of this innovation, consisting of a specially designed kit to enable experiments to be carried out by pupils, worksheets and teacher guides, seems not to have been changed in any essential respect.

However, the strategy was not coercive.

It has been noted that throughout, SEP remained independent of those in authority over the schools in which they worked. They had to pay a heavy price for this dissociation. For example, regardless of whether the nationally-prescribed syllabus used in the schools seemed appropriate or educationally sound, SEP had forfeited the chance of contributing to any change in that syllabus. "It was not possible to alter one comma of the syllabus, even for a few schools in an experimental basis" (ibid., 61). This was nevertheless felt to be the lesser evil.

As Hoosan and Macdonald explain

> In 1954 the South African government instituted what was then called Bantu Education and in so doing extended its control over all education for blacks.
>
> Over [illegible] years the black population has expressed its rejection of Bantu Education, perceiving the system to be inferior and contrary to its interests. As SEP got underway, demonstrations against Bantu Education erupted in Soweto and other areas (ibid., 64-65).

Steve Biko, a black leader who lived in the Ciskei, died in September 1977. Following this

> Many of the Ciskei schools, including those scheduled to start using SEP materials in 1978,

went on strike and were the targets of arson attempts.

It seems that SEP had managed to establish that it was neither part of the Bantu Education system, nor attempting to develop inferior materials for black schools (ibid., 65). Macdonald and Gilmour reported an incident where books and school registers were destroyed by pupils, but Project materials were left untouched (1980, 15).

In the absence of formal authority the SEP staff had to rely entirely upon personal relationships. They seem to have been singularly successful. As noted in 7.2.3.4.1, in 1983, the Centre for Extra-Mural Studies, University of Cape Town, was commissioned to make a study of SEP. They produced, in addition to the final report, five interim reports (Morphet, Schaffer and Millar, 1986, 16). Rogan and Macdonald quote the following from one of these reports:

> The relationship between the staff and the teachers always went with the work carried out that it helped and helped. They valued the training as [illegible] and personal [illegible]. The teachers [illegible] are to the enterprise [illegible] the [illegible] staff (1983, 71).

Some members of the SEP staff who were in face-to-face contact with the teachers, played roles that were, in some respects, similar to those of change agents, as described earlier.

For example, the SEP members of staff had to rely on persuasion and invitation for authority (ibid., 71) and did not have the power to influence the position and salary of the teachers, ... (ibid., 65). The SEP developers often taught lessons in the teachers' own classrooms and,

as the value of modelling under these conditions came to be increasingly appreciated, their work became more school-focused (ibid., 73).

However, the SEP developers found that, at first, their role as catalysts was more limited than they had wished. They had hoped to stimulate the teachers to formulate their own aims at the outset of the implementation of the innovation. The teachers, feeling themselves to be inadequately educated in the scientific field, seemed unable to do this. In reflection, Rogan and Macdonald assert that 'teacher security is of paramount importance to the success of innovation' (ibid., 78).

> [SEP] sought to provide security by means of structured courses and materials and by emphasizing content in the in-service programmes (ibid., 78-9).

Nevertheless, [SEP] knowledged that

> such [short] courses [for the] development of reasoning and ... self-sufficiency and initiative would not be achieved through content-based courses, but through practice, discussion and example (Macdonald, 1979, 141).

Rogan and Macdonald say that Curriculum Developers in a Stage II situation walk a tightrope on the issue of structure versus freedom. Structure is necessary in the early stages in order to increase the teachers' sense of security but, if not relaxed as they grow professionally, it can stunt their development (1985, 79).

Gray, on the basis of his experience with SEP in Durban, proposed some guidelines for the relaxation process. He envisaged the emphasis of the INSET programme advancing

through three phases.

> 1. Security phase. Teachers' content knowledge is improved .... . Teachers become familiar with all the new materials and confident in the handling of apparatus.
> 2. Methods phase. Teachers concentrate on the acquisition and internalization of new teaching skills. Teachers become secure with their performance and not only with their own knowledge.
> 3. Aims phase. Teachers contemplate their experience with the innovation and begin to conceptualize and articulate their own aims based on the situation in which they function and their own personal preferences (Rogan and Macdonald, 1985, 79).

In other words, from the SEP experience it appears that teachers need some involvement with an innovation before they can formulate aims (ibid., 80).

The above suggests, that in Stage II schools, it would be unrealistic to expect, at least initially, that a successful programme of school-focussed INSET could be based on initiatives taken by the staff. In other words, the adoption of a problem-solving model of innovation would be inappropriate. It would seem that, in the early stages, a non-coercive centre-periphery model has a greater chance of being successful. The use of change-agents, able to establish good personal relationships and whose work is school-focussed, is likely to increase the probability.

There is reason to suggest that, in the implementation of the programme, the SEP developers adopted a model that is similar to Korten's learning process approach. (It should be noted, however, that there is no evidence that the SEP developers knew of Korten's work. Korten's paper,

published in 1980, was not referred to in Rogan and Macdonald's 1985 article.)

It will be recalled that Korten says that there must be a "fit" between the assisting organization, the programme design and the needs of the beneficiaries. If the organization is to achieve this fit by means of a learning process approach, it must have a well developed capacity for responsive and anticipatory adaptation.

It must

(a) embrace error;

(b) plan with the people; and

(c) link knowledge building with action.

(a) He remarks that

> Preplanned interventions .... will nearly always prove to be in error by some margin in terms of producing the effect intended. The response to this error is one of the best available indicators of the quality of an organization's leadership.

He says further that the learning organization embraces error:

> Aware of the limitations of their knowledge members of this type of organization look on error as a vital source of data for making adjustments to achieve a better fit with beneficiary needs (Ibid., 498).

In the discussion above, attention has been drawn to a number of occasions in which the SEP developers adapted their policies in response to defects. Here a brief reminder is given of some examples.

- Mini-courses, given weekly where possible, replaced single longer courses.

- During initial courses, substantial emphasis was placed upon the teachers' acquisition of knowledge concerning the subject matter that their pupils were intended to learn.
- The teachers were asked to formulate aims only after they had had sufficient experience of the innovation
- Visits to schools were recognised as a vital and indispensable part of the programme. Model lessons were given as frequently as possible in the teacher's own classroom, or under circumstances as close to it as could be arranged.
- Participation by teachers was encouraged and opportunities for the sharing of experiences were provided.

(b) Rogan and Macdonald do not make specific mention of planning with the people'. However there would seem to be implicit reference to such planning in the description, for example, of the establishment of networks of mutual support groups i.e. the contact teacher' programme in Soweto, and the zonal systems in Durban and Transkei.

(c) Korten observes that, when the blueprint approach to rural development is used,

> those persons in day-to-day contact with the [illegible] – the administrators, the field operations personnel and the villagers – have no definite role in the definition of needs or the making of program design decisions. The decision makers role is

assigned, instead, to the individuals furthest removed from the relevant data - the professional planners.

He believes that "the process of rapid, creative adaptation essential in achieving and sustaining the fit on which effective performance depends nearly demands" the integration of the three roles: researcher, planner and administrator, in a single individual or close knit team.

Four of the five organizations that Korten took as examples of successful Asian rural developments, were 'built up from the teams that created the original program". In the fifth case the research unit was sponsored by and under the operational control of the agency that intended to use the knowledge gained'.

> In each instance the operating methods that were developed in the early stages were gradually translated into supportive management systems. The individuals who had created and sustained the fit were assigned to guide the learning experiences of others until they too gained the knowledge, commitment, and skills to make the program work (ibid., 499).

In the Siake SEP seems to have operated in a way very similar to Korten's first four examples of successful Asian rural developments.

> In the development stage, the SEP team was housed in a small set of offices in the main block at (the University of Fort Hare and later were moved into a small prefabricated building with five rooms, three interleading. Thus immediate opportunities for sharing information were endless with verbal reports of school visits and other encounters occurring immediately on return from a school (Macdonald, Rogan and Dlepu, 1987, 5).

Allyson Macdonald, who was 'largely responsible for the evaluation', saw the initiator and director of the programme

(Rogan), and other staff, on a daily basis. She "often received assistance from them and others'. Rogan also undertook a number of studies himself. There was "little overt distinction between evaluators and implementers ..." (ibid., 2).

The development stage closed in mid-1980 when the team of developers and evaluators withdrew. The national office was moved to Johannesburg and Rogan left for the US. The teachers selected from among themselves a committee of three to 'oversee the transition'. Fezile Dlepu was chosen as chairman. In the next couple of years the SEP teachers met occasionally and the committee "tried to maintain a SEP presence in the schools by running in-service courses and maintaining a supply depot (ibid., 1).

In 1983, Dlepu was seconded to the Ciskei Department of Education to oversee the implementation of SEP in its schools. Over the next two years the programme expanded to a further 10 schools (ibid., 2).

Because the basic elements of the SEP programme were developed in the Ciskei and then later adopted in the Transkei, Bophuthatswana and Lebowa, it might be thought that the integration processes typical of the early years in the Ciskei would have no parallel in the other three regions. This does not seem to have been the case. SEP adopted the rationale that

> different regions were in a better position to analyse their own problems and to propose their own solutions than a central authority. Each regional development was, in essence, a new

> project under a new director. Regional directors acted with autonomy within their own regions, ... (Rogan and Macdonald, 1985, 82).

The Soweto contact teacher system, developed in 1980 by the local implementers, is evidence of the fusion of the roles of researcher, planner and administrator in this region.

If one considers the foregoing analysis of the history of SEP in the light of Korten's learning process model, it would appear that the latter can fruitfully be combined with a non-coercive centre-periphery model.

Reflection upon the SEP experience suggests that the right mix of innovation strategies for use in schools at Beeby's stage II can be expected to change from one period in the history of an innovation to another.

The SEP developers focused their attention upon the improvement of science teaching. In classrooms that were generally rigidly controlled and "teacher-dominated", they hoped that, <u>ideally</u>, during science lessons a freer atmosphere would prevail and a spirit of inquiry would be fostered (<u>ibid</u>., 78).

For their purposes a non-coercive centre-periphery mode of innovation appears to have been appropriate initially. However, as the science teachers moved through Gray's security, methods and aims phases, their needs changed. Alterations to the programme and the organisation became necessary. In order to achieve a proper fit, the original centre-periphery model was supplemented by a more flexible one similar to Korten's learning process model.

In 1985 Hartshorne remarked that Soweto, in the previous five years, had been "almost 'saturated' with official and private-sector support programmes". (See page 45.) However, Soweto is exceptional. In most areas where SEP was implemented, it was the first INSET programme sponsored by an outside agency to operate in the state schools (Rogan and Macdonald, 1985, 77). With this in mind perhaps the following generalisation can be made.

When, for the first time, an innovation related to the teaching of a particular subject is to be introduced into South African schools that are at Beeby's stage I., a non-coercive centre-periphery is likely to prove successful initially. As the teachers make progress in the teaching of this subject their needs are likely to change continuously. As this occurs a highly adaptable model like Harten's learning process model is needed to supplement the original.

In this discussion of the choice of models of innovation there has been an explicit consideration of one of van den Berg's three key findings of research. He sums it up as follows:

> Innovation is more likely when INSET involves teachers actively in the design and execution of programmes, rather than following power-coercive strategies whereby INSET is centrally planned and teacher-directed by passive clients (1985, 46).
> (Emphasis in the original.)

It is sufficient to say here that the SEP experience indicates that it is unrealistic to expect teachers with little education and training to design INSET programmes for

their own use. However, as their knowledge and teaching skills improve, and they therefore gain in confidence, the same teachers can participate actively in the execution of the programme to great advantage. SEP also demonstrates the success of a non-coercive strategy.

The second finding indicates that

> Innovation is more likely when INSET focuses on the school as the locus for change rather than upon the individual teacher as change agent (ibid., 46). Emphasis in the original.)

SEP did not provide comparative evidence to illuminate the truth of this assertion.

The third finding suggests that

> Innovation is more likely when INSET involves more than theory, but also includes active involvement by teachers in activities such as modelling, practice, feedback and coaching to application (ibid., 46. Emphasis in the original.)

The SEP developers undoubtedly believed this to be true and sought to involve the teachers actively in a wide variety of ways. The results of their experience are given in some detail above. Here it is enough to recall that, in Hegan and Macdonald's opinion, the tactics identified as important in the USA, also proved to be valuable under the conditions in which they worked. However they also drew attention to some tactics that were not regarded as central in the USA but proved to be so here.

7.2.1.5 The role of milieu in innovation

Above, the main focus of attention was on the macro strategies that might be employed to bring about educational

change. Consideration was also given, *inter alia*, to techniques used to convey information and skills in order to facilitate their use in the classroom by the teachers. Below the effects of milieu on innovative enterprises in South Africa will be discussed.

Millar has described an attempt, by the University of Fort Hare's Faculty of Education between 1975 and 1977, to develop a new course for graduate teachers in training. Among other things, the students were encouraged to view the stimulation of higher-order thinking among their pupils both as a goal of teaching, and a normal part of classroom activity (1984, 288-299). The students taught for "a brief period of teaching practice" (*ibid.*, 305) "in some of the rare schools in which the SET team first worked with science teachers" (Macdonald and Rogan, 1988, 9).

Throughout the three years formative evaluation was undertaken, based on a "regular flow of information from students and on staff discussion".

> The fundamental point made by student teachers was that the kind of teaching the university staff valued and required, desirable as it might be, would not work in black schools and they were in no position to make it work (Millar, 1984, 306).

The students saw the demands of the school and classroom as [illegible] those of their university lecturers and resolved to favour [illegible] and classroom norms, through [illegible] evidence of "considerable tension of an [illegible]" (*ibid.*, 304). Millar regards the innovation as having 'failed' (*ibid.*, 309-310).

He gives three types of explanation for this failure, each of which refers to a different aspect of the milieu in which the innovation was introduced. He gives (a) institutional or ecological, (b) cultural and (c) political, explanations (ibid., 304-308). He assumes that these three kinds of factor "act as a set of complementary influences' (ibid., 308).

Here it is intended to indicate a further range of features that might either facilitate or impede the adoption of an innovation in black South African schools. Attention is drawn to Millar's opinions concerning the institutional, cultural and political reasons for the failure of the teacher training course. In addition, other views concerning each of the three types of influence will be included.

(a) Institutional factors

In his institutional explanation Millar says that the failure to introduce the new teaching methods in the sample of black schools chosen, was due to both the functional strength of school norms and procedures and the extreme weakness of the innovators' (the students') position (ibid., 304).

> Prevailing classroom norms of teacher-talk and pupil-recall were the most rational of solutions for pupils and teacher alike in a situation of overcrowding, wide ranges of age and performance, lack of resources of every kind including textbooks and libraries, a poorly grasped medium of instruction, a curriculum of limited relevance, a poorly qualified and highly mobile staff and the overriding importance of passing examinations - the route of escape from rural poverty. It was a solution that maximized success and safety for

> pupils and teachers alike. To introduce higher order questioning, subjects as forms of enquiry or pupils assignments of a demanding kind, was to introduce risk, exposure of weaknesses and constant opportunities for failure (ibid., 304-305).

He comments that, in ecological terms", this innovation failed "because its focus was on only one component of an interacting system of influences . In this respect, he contrasts the strategies used in the innovation in which he was involved with those used in SEP. (He regards SEP as 'perhaps the most successful innovation in classroom teaching in black schools in South Africa at present .) In relation to it, he says that the "strength of its innovative practice lies in its simultaneous use of several strategies of influence and support (ibid., 308).

Hartshorne draws attention to another aspect of the institutional milieu that bears upon the probability of success of an INSET programme. He speaks of financial and career incentives designed to encourage improved teaching in the classroom. In relation to South Africa, he stresses that

> in so far as the core purpose of INSET has to do with the quality of education in the classroom, specific [illegible] - school INSET is a crucial [illegible] part of any over-all strategy. (Emphasis in the original.)

Although it is 'critical to the professional competence and confidence of the teacher in the classroom', this aspect of INSET rarely has any direct influence on formal qualifications or salary (1985, 74). He recommends that teachers taking part in INSET programmes of all kinds should

be given recognition for "successful effort in difficult circumstances' in the form of salary, special grants, seniority, promotion etc. (ibid., 89).

Thompson expresses similar sentiments. He notes that, in Africa in general, the "committed, enthusiastic and able teacher who constantly seeks means of improving his teaching' receives the same monetary compensation as his colleague with the same initial qualifications who, 'discontented, idle and inefficient" is more concerned with his out-of-school money-earning activities than he is with teaching. Recognition might be given to the better teacher in the form of promotion to a headship but

> there is commonly no way in which we can give effective recognition to good quality work without taking the teacher out of the classroom (ibid., 171).

Thompson acknowledges that the problem of creating a career structure that encourages teachers to improve their work and to remain in the classroom is a difficult one and largely unsolved (ibid., 172).

Hartshorne is also concerned that schools be managed in a way that enables and encourages teachers to give of their best. He believes that, in the provision of INSET for qualified teachers, priority should be given to principals, their deputies, heads of departments and those in line for promotion to these posts.

> Apart from straightforward 'management' needs, the major direction of INSET for this group should be concerned with staff development, the resolution of conflict, support for teachers within the school, and how to 'manage' professional innovation and educational change in a positive

and effective manner (1985, 89).

(b) Cultural factors

In relation to the Fort Hare teacher training course, Millar remarks that the institutional explanations for its failure are of a microlevel kind. Cultural and polit'cal explanations relate to wider social dynamics (1984, 305).

He comments that "it would not be difficult to see certain classroom norms as having possible roots in traditional stereotypes of African culture". For example, 'the emphasis on oral transmission of information and the valuing of oratory and a view of knowledge as given and authoritative'.

> Such interpretations taken further would see persisting traditional norms as working to dilute an alien Western technological curriculum into which black children and teachers could not fully enter, ... If the school curriculum could not become an authentic cultural possession but its mastery remained necessary for personal advancement, then its reduction to some manageable form became essential. Hence the stress by the pupils and teachers on memorization at the expense of meaning and a utilitarian view of the process of education.

This kind of explanation is compatible with Beeby s influential cultural theory of educational innovation in developing countries'. Millar remarks that, according to this theory, the explanation for the failure of this course would not be neater . The commitments and methodologies appropriate to Stage IV were being introduced into a Stage II system (Ibid., 306 .

Macdonald and Rogan record an incident that alerted the SEP team to cultural factors that were at work in the milieu

in which they operated. This led the team to reconsider some of their assumptions.

They note that "the goal of SEP in the late 1970's was simply stated as 'Pupils should do science'" (1988, 2). (Emphasis in the original.) They also record that, in the Ciskei, when they first began observing science lessons, they found that a persistent expository style of teaching was used (ibid., 5).

They

> assumed that the teachers and ourselves shared a common understanding of the nature of science, and that given the means, the teacher would quickly begin to teach differently, and that pupils would soon come to appreciate how scientific knowledge is generated (ibid., 13).

Macdonald and Rogan describe in this way the incident that was critical to the developers' understanding of their task:

> Pupils in a SEP classroom had reached different conclusions from their observations on the rusting of nails. Two boys, one young and in (school) uniform, the other older and wearing a tweed jacket and hat (the informal uniform of the boys who have been formally initiated into manhood through tribal rites), decided to defend their positions. They did this with gusto, the older one moving finally to the front of the room and asking a series of emphatic rhetorical questions, brandishing a handful of damp nails. The style was true oratory and the orator's peers were absorbed in the speech (ibid., 11).

The pupils appeared to accept that the outcome of this difference of opinion could be "settled by convincing oratory and appeal to authority". In relation to the latter the man clearly had an advantage over the "child" (ibid., 12).

The developers

> began to realise that given the social and cultural structure of the schools in which (they) were operating, empirical evidence was not as highly valued as (they) had assumed (ibid., 13).

They came to realise that they

> were not merely asking teachers to use new materials and methodologies but to subscribe to a new conception of the legitimization of knowledge.

Macdonald and Rogan believe that when there were changes in teaching style

> it is likely that they signified more than just a change in methodology, but also an acceptance of an empirical epistemology (ibid., 14).

(B) Political factors

In relation to the attempt to introduce higher order thinking into schools in the Ciskei by means of a teacher training course, Millar says that the black teachers and pupils could be seen not as restricted by traditional, rural culture from full participation in a modernizing curriculum, but as locked in a situation of political powerlessness and economic exploitation". Their education system served to perpetuate this situation rather than to release them from it (1984, 306). This system

> while providing for some individual mobility through certification, ... exercises - through its administration, its resource allocation, its standards, its ideological formation and its generation of experience of failure on a massive scale - a social control of the most comprehensive kind (ibid., 307).

From this perspective, one explanation for the failure would take the following form.

A black university like Fort Hare is seen as part of a

repressive structure of apartheid institutions". Under the circumstances, students who have some political awareness can adopt one of two stances. First, "they can reject the university and what it symbolizes by means of protest or withdrawal, ...". This response would be "mobilized by crisis from inside the university, or from outside it, as in the case of the 1976 Soweto revolt.

Secondly,

> they can limit co-operation with the institution to what is required to pass examinations and secure individual certification, avoiding all signs of commitment to institutional norms.

Millar believes that the latter is the stance "that most students negotiate most of the time at the University of Fort Hare".

An educational innovation such as that undertaken, normally requires a high and visible commitment from staff and students. In 1976 and 1977, a period of mass protest and violent repression, the students were unwilling to make this commitment (ibid., 107). Millar says that, under such extreme conditions, the value of the innovation becomes secondary to questions like: Who are the innovators? What institutions do they belong to? Whose interest are they serving? He concludes that the breakdown in social order revealed that

> the impulse and legitimization for a reflective and questioning pedagogy in black education are certainly present but they lie outside and in opposition to the formal school curriculum. They constitute a current ideological base for curriculum renewal (ibid., 108). (Emphasis in the original.)

Since Millar wrote this, the latent has become manifest in "people's education".

If this explanation is accepted it has some important implications for INSET in schools.

Black schools are also widely seen as "part of a repressive structure of apartheid institutions". Van den Berg and Todes share this view and assert forcefully that Decisions about curriculum are also an important bulwark of the state ideological apparatus". They explain that

> the syllabi that come to be enforced throughout the various educational sub-systems reflect fundamentally the Afrikaner Nationalist view of reality. The impact of curricular control should not be underestimated, for schools constitute probably the most systematic purveyors of the selective culture within the society (1986, 164).

Hartshorne claims that the period since 1976 has been particularly difficult for black teachers because of the conflicting pressures upon them from pupils, parents and community leaders on the one hand, and departments and the political structure on the other.

> For the black secondary school teacher in particular there has been a traumatic experience: his morale has broken under the strain and he is struggling for survival in a system in which he does not believe, nor do his pupils, to which he cannot commit himself and which has not been able to gain credibility in the community served by the school (1985, 45).

In view of this it must be expected that many teachers will respond in ways that are similar to those displayed by the Fort Hare students. It would seem reasonable to agree with van den Berg that

> The type of INSET activity most likely to achieve meaningful ends ... will have to form an integral

> part of wider strategies for the improvement of schooling. Such INSET will also have to be an articulated part of comprehensive strategies for social, economic and political transformation in South Africa.

He also notes that it is a moot point whether "the context for such INSET exists in South Africa, or would be allowed by the authorities to take root" (1987, 23).

In view of the educational system's lack of legitimacy in the eyes of those opposed to National Party policies, Millar says that 'there is a strong case for (an) innovation to locate itself, and be seen to locate itself, outside of the formal system'.

> Such a strategy has the substantial advantage of demonstrating to participants in a closed educational system the penetration of an alternative educational authority and logic, of enabling entry into the system of substantial new resources including those of new patterns of social co-operation, and of claiming a value position at variance with that associated with the state bureaucracy (1984, 309).

It is precisely this strategy that SEP adopted. The innovation originated outside the school system and was supported by powerful and well known donors, for example, the Anglo American Chairman's Fund and the Urban Foundation. The SEP team was concerned with the image that was presented by the innovation as a whole and by the SEP team. The latter was particularly the case in the early years in the 1980s when both the developers and the implementors were white (Macdonald and Regan, 1988, 16-19).

To conclude section 7.2.4.3.5 attention should be drawn to Millar's comments on his explanations of the failure of the teacher training course. He points out that

> What has not been analysed is the far more complex dynamic of interrelated influences on education innovation in South Africa, though such an analysis is clearly necessary to inform any adequate theory of innovative action. It is likely that such an analysis would see ecological processes as themselves framed or contained by more fundamental political and economic ones, and provide for an even more pessimistic assessment of the limitations upon in-system innovation (1984, 308).

7.2.4 CONCLUSION

This section has indicated the three-fold set of perspectives which it is logical to apply to the development of an INSET programme in the schools in question. There is first of all the orientation that is specifically Catholic, and in its South African form. This is embodied in the phrase Community serving humanity. Secondly, such a programme would need to take account of the relevant features of the current South African conflict, and of Christian initiatives (including educational developments) taken in response to that conflict. Thirdly, INSET in these schools must reflect the most up-to-date international and South African experience and insights on effective school improvement.

In 7.3 below, these perspectives, and the perceptions of the teachers, are employed in the drawing up of the necessary central features of such an INSET plan, and in this way are reflected in the subsequent description of the plan itself.

7.3 A RECOMMENDED INSET PROGRAMME

7.3.1 INTRODUCTION

In this section a plan is suggested that attempts to integrate, in the context of these schools, empirical data on the teachers' conceptions, recent thinking on INSET and a Catholic perspective on education. This is done at the risk of appearing utopian, for resource-constraints have not been part of the study. However, such constraints are very real and it would be difficult to justify the necessary expenditure if the schools in question were to be the sole beneficiaries. However, this plan, although designed for the six [illegible] Catholic primary schools, is believed likely to be applicable, mutatis mutandis, to other primary schools in similar urban contexts. On this basis a sponsor might be found who would regard the implementation of this plan as a worthwhile innovation.

[illegible] AND SUPERVISORS' PERCEPTIONS

7.3.2.1 [illegible]

Fundamental to this dissertation has been the recognition of the importance for INSET of the perceptions held by the teachers in question. It is the teachers who must ultimately carry out any proposed innovation and, therefore, effectively have the power of veto over it (Van den Berg, [illegible]). Because the teachers' perceptions are of such [illegible] the broad findings of the empirical study are briefly recalled at this point, and in 7.3.2.2, certain

inferences are drawn which are relevant to this study.

In relation to the aims of education the supervisors and principals had much in common. Both groups gave priority to aims that would contribute to the socialization of the pupils rather than to those that would primarily increase knowledge and understanding (in terms of the classification used in Chapter Four). The two groups shared a high valuing of specifically religious concerns albeit with some different emphases. In the case of the principals, this valuing was associated with one reflecting African traditions in respect of good behaviour and interpersonal relations.

When presented with the statements in Set B (concerning educational aims) both the supervisors and the principals indicated that it was of prime importance to them that their pupils be led to know Jesus as their personal friend and saviour (B2). This is consistent with the first of Forster's four elements in the Christian ideal of education i.e. a perspective based upon faith in Christ as saviour of all. (See 1.4 and 4.4.

There are indications that these two groups held a servant model of the church. They both gave very high priority to working for a just South Africa (B6). (See also 3.4. This is consistent with the third and fourth of Forster's four elements. These embody, between them, a recognition (a) that every individual is a child of God, (b) that justice is necessary for peace, and (c) that Christians must be committed to continue Christ's salvific work. (See

1.4 and 4.4.) However, they gave very low priority to the encouragement of friendship between their Std V pupils and white children of the same age. The HSRC is convinced that this is vital for the formation of sound intergroup relations and that schools should facilitate such contact. (See VIII.5.) It would seem that the supervisors and the principals did not share the HSRC's sense of importance and urgency in regard to this matter. Nor did they exhibit concern for the bishops' call to desegregate church institutions. (See section d. Intergroup relations.)

The assistant teachers differed somewhat from the supervisors and principals. In contrast to their superiors, they rated and ranked B1 (exams and high school) among the two most important aims. (This statement is one of the two concerned with knowledge and understanding rather than with socialization: see 5.5.3.4.) In this the assistants were in close accord with their pupils, who viewed B1 as of prime importance.

The assistants also differed from the supervisors and the principals in that they valued working for a just South Africa far less than did their superiors. However they did appear to attach considerable weight to religious values and, in particular, to the expression of these values according to certain African cultural traditions (see 3.3.2.). They seem to be, in Bishop Zwane's terms, good cultic Christians (4.4.3.6). Such traditionalists

probably subscribe to an institutional model of the church (5.5.3.4).

The following discussion of the teachers' and supervisors' perceptions of the means of improving teaching is based upon responses to the statements in Set A. It will be recalled that these responses must be approached with great caution.

These statements can be divided into two types. The first indicates that improved teaching would result from the further professional development of the teachers. The second implies that this end could be achieved through changes in school policy and resources (5.5.4.3.1).

As noted in [illegible] the Catholic educational authorities [illegible] have commonly held the view that the quality of education in their schools could be most effectively brought about by raising the educational and professional level of the teachers. This contrasts with the opinions held by the supervisors and teachers who appear to have felt that changes in school policy and resources were more likely to improve teaching. There was, however, an exception to this: the great majority of the sample of assistant teachers who had not passed matric believed that its attainment would help them to teach better.

Three of the statements that namely changes in school policy and resources were each, in the opinion of at least one group, ranked among the three most important ways of improving teaching. These three were all [illegible] aspects of organisation and of equipment. Most notably,

in the strongest terms possible in the questionnaires presented to them, the principals indicated that they gave top priority to changing the syllabuses. Their spontaneous comments suggested that they felt the history syllabus to be most in need of reform (5.5.4.4). With regard to intergroup relations, this is particularly significant as the history taught in schools plays a considerable part in forming the pupils' attitudes to their own ethnic group and to its relationship to that of other ethnic groups. (See VIII.4 and 4.4.3.5.)

The supervisors attached far less importance to the reform of syllabi and the assistants less still.

This suggests that, given the opportunity, the principals would want to change at least the history syllabi used in their schools and would probably be prepared to work hard to create alternatives. The supervisors, in view of the importance they attached to the promotion of justice in South Africa, might be fairly readily persuaded to support the principals in this. However, initially, the assistant teachers are likely to be far from convinced of the need to do so.

It should be recalled that in relation to the improvement of teaching in their schools, the supervisors and the teachers accorded very low priority to the removal of [illegible]. Those who made spontaneous comments in relation to A6 displayed very caring attitudes to these children. (See 5.4.4.3.6, responses to A6.) This is

consistent with the second of Konstant's key elements, regarding the centrality of respect for the individuality and integrity of all human beings. (See 1.4 and 4.4.)

In view of the comments above concerning perceptions of the aims of education and the means of improving teaching, it seems that all the supervisors and teachers interviewed assumed that one of the main purposes of these Catholic schools was evangelisation. No one questioned this. [The concept of evangelisation is, of course, not to be limited to attempts to convert others to the Catholic church. See the discussion of statement B8 in 5.5.3.3.2.) Differences between groups were a matter of emphasis. [See Table 5:5.] Further, the supervisors and principals' thinking share aspects of all four of Konstant's key aspects of the Christian educational ideal. The assistants seemed to be generally in accord with their supervisors in relation to three of these aspects. However they did not provide evidence of a strong desire to foster a sense of mission in their pupils. They gave low priority to both working for a [ust South Africa B6) and to the conversion of others to [the Catholic Church (B8). (See Table 5:5.)]

There now follows comment concerning the teachers' perceptions of their own educational needs. It is based [on responses to questions and to the statements in Set C. With regard to the latter, it will be remembered that there is reason for considerable confidence in these ratings and rankings.

Almost all the teachers expressed a desire for further

education for themselves. (Those who did not were mainly people over the age of sixty.) In relation to education and training relevant to their school work, the teachers spoke almost exclusively in terms of formal courses leading to certification. Many were, at the time, working to improve their qualifications.

Of the 21 teachers who had not obtained a Senior Certificate, 16 wanted a "matric". Four of the remaining five were over 60 years old. (See 5.5.5.2 and 5.5.5.3.)

Responses to statements in Set C provide insights into the motives of the 15 assistants who wanted a matric (48% of the sample). Above all they wanted to be better teachers and believed that the matric course would help them to achieve this. With very few exceptions they wanted to continue to be employed within the Catholic primary school system. A Senior Certificate would also enable them to earn more in the jobs that they held at the time. They felt very strongly the need for more money. They also felt that this qualification would provide a measure of security.

Of these 15 assistants, 11 intended to write matric examinations at the end of the year in which they were interviewed. The remaining four said that it was for personal reasons that they were prevented from studying. (See 5.5.5.2 and 5.5.6.)

There is evidence that 67% of the principals and 81% of the assistants want post-matric education. It seemed that the majority wanted to study part-time towards certificated

courses that would help them to become better primary school teachers. However, it appeared that they did not have a clear idea of what would be an appropriate curriculum to follow. In fact, for those who wanted a professional curriculum with a primary school focus, such a path (e.g. a B. Primary Ed. or College of Education course) does not exist in part-time form on the Witwatersrand. See 5.5 5.5.)

".3.2.2 Inferences

What may be inferred from the foregoing that could be relevant to an INSET programme? It would seem that the following observations would be justified:

a) The teachers provided only a very general guide to the contents of an INSET programme to be designed to serve their purposes.

b) For those teachers who had not passed matric, the most acceptable INSET programme would almost certainly be one that assisted them in its attainment. (The additional qualification could be expected to lead to an increase in salary.)

c) For those teachers who had already passed matric, the most acceptable INSET programme would probably be a certificated course, designed to improve the performance of primary school teachers, whose successful completion led to an increase in salary.

The following comments concern the provision of INSET that is not part of a formal course as described above.

(d) The teachers did not give examples of specific professional needs despite the opportunities provided by the format of the interviews. (For example, the question A10: "Is there anything else that would help you to teach better?" did not elicit responses such as "I need help when a new syllabus is introduced".) Their responses indicated only certain general attributes which might make an INSET programme more likely, or less likely, to elicit their co-operation. And their responses on aims suggested some values to be noted when designing the content of such a programme.

(e) It would seem that an INSET programme would be more acceptable if it were concerned with improved methods of teaching and presented as part of a comprehensive programme of school development that included the provision of teaching aids, equipment and facilities. The probability of these methods being incorporated into normal classroom practice would probably be greatly enhanced if a suitable system of financial reward for good teaching were introduced.

(f) An approach that implied criticism of the teachers is likely to meet with resistance. This is particularly likely if aspersions are cast upon the teachers' religious beliefs and behaviour.

(g) If it were intended to contribute to the teachers' continuing religious development by means of an INSET

programme, it would seem best, in view of their sensitivities, to approach the matter indirectly. For example, a wide variety of attitudes and values might be revealed, and examined in the light of the gospel, during a group discussion of the aims of schooling in their circumstances. Such discussion would probably also provide opportunity to broaden the assistants' vision of Christian duty to include a greater sense of mission.

h) The encouragement of co-operative efforts to devise a new curriculum (in, say, history) as a means of staff development would probably be welcomed by the principals but the assistants would probably be much less motivated.

i) In spite of the Soweto teachers' considerable concern with the children's socialization, no reference was made to the hidden curriculum. For example, no one commented on the way in which pupils were motivated or disciplined. In contrast, the Kagiso teacher Ms X was passionately concerned with such matters as the allocation of marks and its effects upon the way the children viewed themselves and others. See 4.3.)

j) Efforts to desegregate these schools, and efforts to promote good intergroup relations by facilitating the growth of friendship between Soweto pupils and those from a different background (e.g. white children), are unlikely to be supported with enthusiasm by the teachers unless major additional advantages are likely

to result from such endeavours.

(k) It would appear that the principals would respond positively to an INSET programme designed to enable teachers to raise their pupils' awareness of injustice and lead them to a commitment to overcome it. However, it is unlikely that the assistant teachers would welcome such an initiative.

(l) In relation to the children's education, the teachers provided no evidence of concern to involve parents, parishioners or the wider community. For example, the teachers did not mention a desire to influence or consult members of the groups named above. (In contrast, the author of the St. Angela's Stimulus Paper wanted parents to contribute to decisions about curricula. See Appendix V, p1.)

(m) The teachers provided no evidence of wanting, collectively, to serve the wider community in some way beyond educating the pupils registered in their schools. For example, no wish was expressed to contribute to the religious development of Catholic pupils attending state schools or of sharing school facilities with others.

The teachers expressed no wish to use means other than the usual school tests and examinations to evaluate their pupils' work. Nor did the teachers express a desire to evaluate their own work in any other way.

7.3.3 THE PLAN

7.3.3.1 Central features

The central features of the proposed plan (and, in some cases, the justification for their inclusion), are here presented in nine groupings:

A Conceptual context

B Aims (professional)

C Aims (social and religious)

D Strategy (teacher participation)

E Strategy (process)

F Strategy (group emphasis)

G Strategy (multi-dimensional)

H Organisation

I Specific components

A Conceptual context

A1 The programme is school-focused.

This means that it is tailor-made to serve the needs of a particular school or group within a school. (Compare However, when the needs of teachers within two or more schools within a cluster of schools coincide, it is recommended that, where feasible, such needs be satisfied through joint action. For example, if the Std IV teachers from three schools all wanted help in setting examination questions, all concerned should meet to address the problem.

(A2) INSET is seen as a major aspect of a more comprehensive policy for school improvement

The term "school improvement" is here used in the same way as it is used by the International School Improvement Project: ISIP. That is, attention is paid to change at both the institutional and classroom levels. It is not limited to the isolated training of individual teachers and changes to the activities that pupils experience (Hopkins, 1987, 2). This is consistent with Howey's assertion (19[illegible], [illegible]4) that

> It is imperative that new directions in teacher education be embedded in and consonant with equally innovative directions in school renewal. Major reform in one cannot occur without concurrent major reform in the other.

[illegible]rrigan (1986, 11[illegible]) and Schmuck (1986, 290) concur. See also van den Berg (1983, 15 and 19). The need for such school renewal to accompany the introduction of new teaching methods is strongly indicated in Millar's discussion of the institutional factors that are thought to have caused the failure of the Fort Hare experiment with which he was involved (7.2.3.5).

(A[illegible]) INSET [illegible] viewed as a normal part of the professional development of teachers.

It is intended to avoid the adoption of a "deficiency model" (Mehl, [illegible], [illegible]) in which teachers are regarded as being in some way pathological. This is in contrast with most South African INSET programmes which proceed from the assumption that there is something wrong with teachers, and

that INSET is a way of attempting to correct that wrong" (Van den Berg, 1987, 21). (Emphasis in the original.) It is believed here that teachers in general, and experienced teachers in particular, have much to contribute towards the planning and implementation of INSET programmes. (Compare Mehl, 1987, 31-32.)

Aims (professional)

(B1) This is a long term project in which a central concern is to motivate teachers to seek quality actively and continuously.

This overarching goal derives from the acceptance of a position taken by Thompson (see 7.2.3.1) and, as he warns, a rapid transformation of staff attitudes and practices should not be anticipated (7.2.1.3).

As a consequence of the adoption of this goal it cannot be claimed that the project is complete when particular aims have been achieved (for example, when the teachers have mastered a certain teaching method). (Compare 7.2.3.2.)

Aims (social and religious)

(C1) The plan is intended to [illegible] in the school fosters a combination of the basic elements in each of Dulles's five models of the church, with the communit. and servant models dominant.

(Compare 7.2.[illegible])

(C2) The programme is intended to contribute to the growth of justice and peace in South Africa.

A number of different steps in this direction will be suggested. These include:

- The empowerment of teachers to contribute to their own professional growth and that of others.

This is expected to lead, inter alia, to some small reduction in the inequalities in educational provision for children belonging to different social groups. As Hartshorne says

> In South Africa the fundamental rationale for [illegible] be employed to maintain and improve the quality of education, will have to be extended so that it is also employed as one means leading to the reduction and ultimate elimination of inequality in education (1985, 60).

- The encouragement of the real participation, sharing of ideas, negotiation and decision-making by representatives of all interest groups (de Lange, 1981, 87).

This is consistent with Warnock's opinion that everyone in society should argue for what they want their children to have educationally. (See 4.3.)

- The development of community in service of humanity.

It is hoped to strengthen the Christian communities centred in each of the schools and, gradually, to forge links with others concerned with the education of adults and children. (Compare 7.2.1.)

- The facilitation of friendship and co-operative ventures between children and adults of different

backgrounds.

Archbishop Hurley, who in 1986 completed his sixth year as president of the SACBC, admits that the church has been inadequate in dealing with South Africa's racial problem (1986, 166). He attributes this failure to a lack of understanding of social attitudes. These attitudes were addressed as if they were just a moral deviation in individuals that could be corrected by simply exposing their wrongfulness. He has since concluded that they result from socialization and are deeply rooted in the personality [ibid., 167].

The Main Committee of the HSRC investigation into intergroup relations also stresses the importance of socialization in relation to conflict in South Africa. They believe that schools should contribute to peace by [illegible] children of different races to meet. (See 4.4.4.) Such contact is particularly important during the years spent in primary school because "stereotypes take shape early in a child's life" (Marais, 1985, 81).

Contact in itself does not necessarily lead to more positive attitudes. It must occur 'spontaneously, informally, between people of equal status and on a friendly basis'. (See 4.4.3.8 and 5.5.6.) In addition, such encounters should presumably be of sufficient duration and frequency for friendship to develop.

In the study that made its points a report by the Catholic Bishops and the Synod in Southern Africa from the [illegible] Conference of the Southern African

Catholic Bishops' Conference, Connor discusses the features of an educational programme for peace. He recommends that personal relationships be developed within the context of communal participation in common endeavours. He also stresses that the quality of the relationships within the group, and the group's aims, are seminal. He explains:

> We usually strive after what the group as a whole desires, so it is crucial to form groups that in their aims and procedures cherish the dignity and wellbeing of their own members, and then go on to foster this amongst those beyond the group (1985, 197-198).

- The communication of the experience gained in this programme to others concerned with INSET.

In this way it is intended to contribute to the common good. This aim is consistent with adoption of a servant model of the Church. See 4.4.4.)

It is important, for example, to document the theoretic orientations that lie behind decisions as well as the outcome of their implementation. As Corrigan (1986, 116) says, there is a vital concern to explain current phenomena and predict future behaviour.

> By connecting what we do with some theoretic orientation we can engage in exploratory studies which have the potential for offering new insights and hypotheses to be tested in subsequent study.

These steps can be viewed as contributing to the creation of a democratic post-apartheid education system. Gray asserts that the implementation strategy of projects should be conceived within a total and holistic strategy for change to this end (1988, 15).

(C3) It is hoped to foster the teachers' religious development. However, in view of the delicacy of the matter, an oblique approach is taken.

According to Konstant (1981, 7), a child can best grow and develop morally, when he belongs to a group (e.g. family or school) whose members share the faith and embody it in their way of life. The perspective centred on faith in Christ as saviour of all people is communicated most powerfully through the perception of the operation of this perspective in others and, especially, the growth of human relationships in light of Christ's commandment of love. This implicit curriculum is effective in so far as the institution measures up to the qualities of an ideal christian community. See 4.4.4.

In order to approach this ideal, all concerned, individually, need regular renewal. However, in consideration of the teachers' sensitivities with regard to this very personal matter (see ".3.2, t[illegible] it must be addressed directly, probably most satisfactorily through group discussion of school issues.

[illegible] Strategy (teacher participation)

(C1) The teachers are to be actively involved in planning and implementing this programme.

In ".2.3.3 attention was drawn to the views of a number of South Afri[illegible]ans concerned with INSET who believe in the need for such involvement.

It was also noted that van den Berg gave two strong reasons for his advocacy of this policy. First, such strategies are more effective. Secondly, if there is an intention to work towards a more democratic South Africa, teachers must be empowered to find solutions to professional problems. It is not appropriate merely tell the teacher-employee what to do and how to do it.

This involvement is also thought by some to be crucial in the establishment of the legitimacy of a project (Gray, 1988, 17). In order to elicit their co-operation, the teachers must feel that they 'own' it. (Those leaders of projects in Natal/KwaZulu interviewed by Gray shared this opinion in relation to their own programmes. However, he points out that the concept of 'ownership' clearly differed from programme to programme'. See ibid., 25.)

The approach taken in this plan is consistent with Fullan/Stiegelbauer's guideline that

> what is done in any INSET programme should in the first place arise from the expressed needs of the teachers themselves, followed by discussion and shared, co-operative, democratic decision-making with any other interests that may be involved ... (1991, 316).

However, a problem-solving mode of innovation, based solely upon initiatives taken by staff members, is not realistic here. Despite [illegible] in view of the present low level of education of the majority of teachers and by the experience [illegible] such a policy would [illegible]. As [illegible] below, it will be proposed that a well-qualified [illegible] work with the teachers in

planning and implementing the programme. This person is to provide leadership and to facilitate change without assuming authority. (Compare 7.2.3.3.) However, although the teachers are not expected to take all, or even most, of the initiatives to begin with, it is expected that they will be increasingly involved in decision making. It will be recalled that after a year's experience of the SEP programme the teachers in question began to debate, question, reformulate and reject, certain of the aims of the innovation, in light of their own experience and values (7.2.3.4.2). It is hoped that, given the opportunity, the Soweto teachers will become progressively more assertive in discussion of professional matters, and will also entertain new ideas.

E Strategy (process

(E1 This plan embodies a learning process model of innovation.

This model is described initially in 7.2.3.?. Some other of its features are mentioned in 7.2.3.4

(E2 A non-coercive approach is taken.

n South Africa innovations are frequently thrust upon black schools without prior consultation. This is a self-defeating strategy. In this plan it is proposed that the Catholic Institute of Education, like SEP, not work in a school without, at least, the principal's full support. (See 7.2.3 4.)

(E3) The choice of methods should be governed by the "principles of how adults learn in the teaching situation'.

This principle also underlies the three case studies (British, American and French) that formed the basis for Corrigan's 1980 Synthesis Report of OECD's International School Improvement Project (ISIP) (1986, 101).

He claims that there are no complete theories which are commonly used in rationalizing adult programmes". However 'theoretic orientations' are used. These lack formal sets of interrelated laws supported by substantial data but nevertheless are useful in that they provide honest explanations for why various approaches are being undertaken .

The theoretical orientation provided by Knowles (1974, 116-117) who says that the andragogical model is a process model .

> The andragogical teacher facilitator, consultant, change agent prepares in advance a set of procedures for involving the learners (....) in a process involving these elements:
>
> (1) establishing a climate conducive to learning;
> (2) creating a mechanism for mutual planning;
> (3) diagnosing the needs for learning;
> (4) formulating programme objectives ....;
> (5) designing a pattern of learning experiences;
> (6) evaluating the learning outcomes and rediagnosing the learning needs.

The orientation underlying the proposed plan is very similar to the above. It differs, perhaps, in that it is intended that the learners" play a more active part than Knowles suggests.

(E4) It is intended to stimulate "the ongoing, interactive, cumulative learning necessary to develop new conceptions, skills and behavior" that Fullan (1982, 66) considers necessary for change.

(E5) The suggested plan incorporates the process of organisational development (OD) as described by Schmuck.

Schmuck conceives of OD as the

> planned and sustained effort to apply behavioural science to system improvement, using reflexive self-analytic methods (1986, 280).

F Strategy group emphasis

(F1) Groups of teachers are encouraged to discuss school matters.

In relation to evaluation, Patton claims that

> Several things can be accomplished with a group that are less likely to occur with individuals.
>
> (a) An environment of openness can be established to reduce suspicions and fears about what is going on in the evaluation. The key stakeholders who participate in the process know how decisions are made and who was involved in making them.
> (b) Participants in the group process become sensitized to the multiple perspectives that exist around any program.
> (c) New ideas often emerge out of the dynamics of group interaction.
> (d) A sense of shared responsibility for the evaluation can be engendered that is often greater than the responsibility that would be felt by isolated individuals. Commitments made in groups, in front of others, are typically more lasting and serious than promises made to an evaluator in private (1982, 65).

(This observation is similar to that made by Huberman and quoted in 7.2.3.2.)

(e) An open forum composed of various stakeholders makes it difficult to suppress touchy questions or negative findings.
(f) The evaluator has an opportunity to observe firsthand the interactions among various stakeholders and to assess their interpersonal relationships.
(g) A certain momentum can often be established through group processes that helps reduce delays .... resulting from the attitudes or actions of one person.
(h) The evaluator(s) and stakeholders in a group process will often jell into a kind of support group.
(i) The group will often continue to function after the evaluation is completed (ibid., 66).

It is probable that many of these benefits will be observed when the teachers meet for purposes other than that of evaluation.

(7) In order to facilitate continuous school improvement, this plan is designed to foster the communication, among the teachers, of their interpersonal expectations.

Schmuck points out that the school is a complex social system that gains its stability through role expectations and interpersonal norms". Individual teachers behave predictably largely because of their adherence to shared expectations for what is appropriate in the school". This sharedness offers a tool for planned change.

> If a school's creativity is to be viable and continuous, changes in interpersonal expectations must be shared so that each staff member knows that colleagues have changed their expectations in the same way as she/he has changed his own (1986, 281).

G Strategy (multi-dimensional)

(G1) In relation to the teachers' professional development, attention is paid to affective aspects, as well as to the cognitive. (Compare Corrigan, 1986, 106.)

Corrigan observes that Professional growth, especially when it involves the exchange of old habits for new, breeds considerable insecurity . (This was certainly the case in the first stages of SEP. See 7.3.3.4.)

(G2) The process of consultative, collaborative evaluation to be carried out in each school is intended to foster those qualitative factors related to the school as a social system.

The qualitative factors which, according to Hopkins, 'result in enhanced student outcomes' consist of

> internal features such as an emphasis on the teaching learning process, an agreement on goals, a supportive learning climate, high expectations and so on. Quality schooling occurs when these and similar features are embedded within the fabric of the school (1987, 193).

(Hopkins says that perhaps the two most important features of the work of the International School Improvement Project taken as a whole

> [is the emphasis on the school as the prime unit of change and on the qualitative factors comprising the internal conditions of the school. See ibid., 192.)

In the Soweto schools it is intended to develop also those qualitative factors that characterise a Christian community. (Compare 4.4.4)

H Organisation

(H1) As far as schools are concerned, the operating unit comprises the six Catholic primary schools in Soweto.

(H2) The plan entails changes to the existing roles and relationships associated with the positions of supervisor and teacher in these schools.

For example, it is assumed that the position of the manager will be radically altered. In 5.2.3 it is noted that the manager is to be

> a motivator and resource person for the school staff, helping them to have a clear idea of the identity of the school as a Catholic school and of its specifically educational aims.

In the plan these functions are assumed by a mentor. It would be unsuitable for the principal to remain accountable to the manager if the manager were not party to the policy discussions held by the princi the mentors.

H3 It is intended to make the most of whatever resources are available.

Hartshorne points out that many valuable re es that could be used for the purposes of INSET ar t full exploited (1985, 58).

This is in part because some resources are earmarked for use by a particular racial group and are not intended for ther races. Van den Berg comments that it would be unrealistic

> to believe that a highly sophisticated and effective system of INSET can arise from or be grafted on to an educational system suffering from major weaknesses and disparities, especially if the racial exclusiveness of educational provision is maintained in such a way as to inhibit or prohibit the more advantaged sectors of education from contributing to the disadvantaged sectors (1983, 5).

This is consistent with the views of Niven (1982, 53) and Hartshorne (1985, 60).

In addition, many resources are not used because, in part, there is

> little perception of the potential inherent in co-operation and partnership among teachers' associations, universities, outside agencies and departments at this stage of INSET in South Africa (Hartshorne, 1985, 59).

It is intended to attempt to overcome such limitations by, for example, consulting those willing and able to help irrespective of what institution they belong to. It is also hoped to share in resources (plant as well as human) available at the open schools.

I Specific components

II Provision is made for the continuing development of the principals and the INSET trainers.

Hopkins (1987, 65) uses the term "school leader" to describe "any individual who assumes a leadership role within a specific context". In this context it includes both the principals and the INSET trainers that in 7.3.3.2 are referred to as 'mentors'.

He says that, in Europe, there is 'general agreement on the crucial role of the school leader in school

improvement". In relation to South Africa, Hartshorne is in full agreement (1986, 27). However, Hopkins says, there is doubt concerning the skills required and the most effective way to develop them (1987, 65). Nevertheless some guidelines are available.

Howey, in his synthesis of current thinking about school focused INSET, says that school leaders

> need to have some understanding of (1) adult growth and development (2) organisational growth and development, specifically as it relates to schools, (3) curriculum development, and (4) general strategies for the coordination, management and delivery of inservice (1986, 54).

In the conclusion to his 'Final report (1982)" on the role and training of teacher trainers, Bolam insists that

> the most important single consideration is that training courses for INSET trainers (just as for teachers) should be as context specific as possible (1986, 152).

Similarly (Togo, 1982-73) believes that training for school leaders should focus on the concrete and immediate parts of their lives'. He thinks that this is likely to enhance motivation because the lessons learnt are potentially useful.

While supporting this approach Howey warns that the focus should not only be on the teacher's role as person who instructs students, but also on her roles as 'scholar, member of a profession and a member of a school community" (1986, 56). Without doubt this list could be validly extended to include, say, member of the parish and of the local community at large.

Stego says further that in the OECD countries, "school leaders are frequently assumed to learn reflectively (1987, 72). (Emphasis in the original.)

Howey recommends that a balance between action and reflection be maintained. He says this appears to be critical where there is a concern "with the teacher's bility to internalize and conceptualize more complex approaches to teaching' (1986, 56). This also appears to be the experience of the SEP developers. (See the discussion concerning the formu on of objectives in 7.2.3.4.)

(12 Consultative, collaborative evaluation, as advocated by Patton (1982), plays a pivotal role in the design of this pr gramme.

In the one hand, it is hoped that the outcomes of such an eva.uation will feed into "the slow, evolutionary process of program development (ibid., 62). (Here the program" is taken to refer to everything that h upon the education of the pupils in that school.) In Patton's experience the results are more likely to be used if the stakeholders" are so involved (ibid., 56-90).

n the other hand, such involvement will provide a va.iab.e earning experience f r the participants (ibid., 62).

Patton claims that

resist not only change, it even examination.

> The empirical basis of evaluation involves making assumptions and values explicit, testing the validity of assumptions and carefully examining a program to find out what is actually occurring (ibid., 78-79).

> These processes take stakeholders through a gradual awakening to program complexities and realities, an awakening that contains understandings and insights that will find their way into program developments over time, only some of which will be manifested in concrete decisions (ibid., 62).

(The attention paid here to consultative, collaborative evaluation is not intended to suggest that this is the only form of evaluation that will be required. Each of the major stakeholders who need information as a basis for decision-making, is likely to need a different, though perhaps overlapping, type of evaluation. However, the varieties of stakeholder demands are beyond the scope of this present study.

In concluding these suggestions concerning ways in which these schools can be improved, it may be helpful to draw attention to Hopkin's comment that, in Western Europe,

> Much practical and research experience in the past decade has supported three main conclusions. First, achieving change is much more a matter of implementation of new practices at the school level than it is of simply deciding to adopt them. Second, school improvement is a carefully planned and managed process that takes place over a period of several years: change is a process, not an event. Third, it is very difficult to change education - even in a single classroom - without also changing the school organization, the cooperation of fellow teachers and the endorsement of the school leader are usually necessary too (1987, 1-2).

It is unlikely that experience in Soweto will differ

greatly from this, and these conclusions have been borne in mind in the construction of this plan. (See 7.3.3.1, A1, B1 and E5.)

7.3.3.2 Description of the plan

There follows here a suggested programme of school improvement (embodying INSET) for the cluster of Catholic primary schools in Soweto.

It should be noted that not all teachers' perceptions adverted to in 7.3.2, nor all the features mentioned in 7.3.3.1, are referred to again in this description of the plan. For example, in 7.3.3.1, B1 indicates a "concern to motivate teachers to seek quality actively and continuously". Although it is not specifically mentioned, it is intended that this task be undertaken by the "mentors" in their role as described in general terms, here.

This description of the plan is concerned in the main with enabling structures and strategies, rather than with the content of the initiatives pursued. For example, attention to the hidden curriculum is central (see 4.4.4) but is not mentioned in what follows.

These schools are situated within a relatively small area served by a moderately good transport system (when compared with other places in South Africa). So, in Rogan and Macdonald's terms, they can be formed into a cluster". (See 7.2.3.4.) (The two Catholic primary schools in Kagiso are not far from those in Soweto and are believed by the researcher to be very like them. See 3.2. They could

therefore, be included in this cluster.)

The Catholic Institute of Education (CIE) appears to be the most appropriate agency to undertake this task. One of its chief functions is to provide INSET programmes in Catholic schools nationwide (see 1.5), and it has the considerable advantage of being independent of the state education system (compare 7.2.3.5,c).

In this plan, regular and frequent visits by a particular member of CIE would become a normal feature of the life of each school. These CIE staff members would function as change agents, assuming major responsibility for the initiation and implementation of the programme. They are intended to act primarily as catalysts, trainers and link agents (compare 7.2.3.3) but are also expected to lead. When one considers the associations conjured by alternative terminology, it would appear most appropriate to refer to the change agents as 'mentors'.

The mentors, principals of the schools involved and, perhaps, one or more additional members, are to form a panel to guide and monitor the programme, and to control the funds allocated to it. Discussion should be open, and no decisions should be taken in the absence of representatives of either group. This openness is intended to contribute to trust. It is hoped in this way to reduce potential conflict between principals and mentors.

Further, in view of the demands that participation in the project can be expected to make upon the principals, it is vital that they support it enthusiastically. The part

they will play is likely to be crucial to success. Fullan says that in the US, "all major research on innovation and school effectiveness shows that the principal strongly influences the likelihood of change" (1982, 71). And in Europe, Hopkins says that "The truism that the head is the gatekeeper of change is scattered in various guises throughout the ISIP literature (1987, 194). Therefore it is here recommended that when the principals have a reasonable understanding of the implications arising from participation in the project, they be allowed to decide whether they and their respective schools will join in. (This policy is similar to that adopted by SEP. See 7.2.3.4.)

In each school, early in the programme, the relevant tenor will initiate discussions, with the staff as a whole, about the ways in which the school might be improved, and incidentally, therefore, about the teachers' own needs for further professional development and education.

This, obviously, is intended to reveal the teachers' perceptions and, in a sense, duplicates the task undertaken in this study. It is suggested that this process be repeated (though differently) partly because it is crucial that the teachers feel that the INSET programme in which they are being involved is genuinely designed to serve their purposes. (See 1.2.)

In light of the 1986 survey of the teachers' perceptions of their own educational needs, it is

confidently predicted that the majority of unmatriculated teachers will want, first and foremost, that qualification. (See 7.3.2,b.) Whatever the relevance of matric studies for the teachers' professional purposes, the mentor and the teachers in question should strive together to find means of helping them. Ways having been found, the mentor should strenuously provide appropriate assistance. Regardless of the inherent value of matriculation studies, this is advocated partly because it is proper that she contribute to the attainment of the teachers' "legitimate personal ambitions" (see 7.2.3.1), and partly because it must be clearly demonstrated to the teachers that their preferences are taken seriously.

(At some later date it may be possible for the new Independent Examinations Board to develop, and have recognised, an examination curriculum for such teachers. An initiative in this respect would be appropriate for the panel. Information about the IEB is given towards the end of this section.)

There is strong evidence to suggest that a majority of teachers wanted post-matric certificated courses that would help them to become better primary school teachers. Further, it has been remarked that, in the Witwatersrand area, such courses (e.g. a B. Primary Ed. or College of Education course) do not exist in part-time form. (See 7.3.2, and 5.5.2.5.) However, the University of the Witwatersrand and the Soweto College of Education (for example) offer full-time courses of this sort. The panel

should consider the advisability of approaching such institutions to offer part-time courses as well.

In relation to the overall aim to stimulate the teachers to actively seek quality in their contribution to their pupils' education (see 7.3.1), cognizance is taken of the teachers' opinion that changes in school policy and resources are more likely to improve their teaching than would their own further education. (See 7.3.2,d.) It is also noted that they expressed no wish to improve upon the evaluation of their pupils' work, nor of their own. (See 7.3.2,m.) Therefore, in this INSET programme, an oblique approach is taken to their continuous professional development. It is embedded in a process of school improvement that includes decision-making related to organizational development, possible policy changes and to the use of funds to be made available to them.

In relation to the improvement of a particular school, the relevant mentor will be asked to guide the staff in a consultative evaluation similar to that advocated by Patton in Practical Evaluation, 1982. That is, the people whose work it is hoped will be influenced by the results of the evaluation, are to be involved in collaborative research. (Compare ibid., 9. In addition, participation in such an evaluation is expected to be educative as, for example, the teachers examine their assumptions, aims, values and the outcomes of their work. (See 7.3.3.1,I2.)

(Such consultative evaluation is intended to be a

permanent feature of the life of the school. In the long run it is hoped that senior teachers will be able to direct the process in place of the mentor.)

In these schools it is proposed that, in addition to the above, the teachers' values not only be made explicit, but that the teachers be led to examine them in the light of the Gospels and in light of secular knowledge. For example, the values revealed in a discussion of the ways in which children are disciplined in the school might be studied in relation to biblical values and in relation to insights from psychology. Under these circumstances, the mentor should seek to enrich the discussion by, for example, introducing relevant ideas novel to the teachers or by drawing comparisons between elements of the discussion in progress and elements of previous discussions. (These strategies might, of course, also be used in other situations.

The purpose of such intervention is, obviously, both evaluative and educational. In relation to the latter, it is expected to contribute to the teachers' religious development and to their knowledge of education. This is in addition to that which Patton regards as the fundamental educational thrust of the evaluation. He says that "in essence, the evaluator invites task force participants (in this case the teachers) to enter into the culture of science (1982, 81).

It is also intended that there be another important outcome. It is hoped that, as the teachers change their

expectations of each other, they recognise that their colleagues have done likewise. (Compare Schmuck, 1986, 281 as quoted in 7.3.3.1,P2.)

The process of consultative evaluation described here is essentially the same as the process of organisational development as described by Schmuck. See 7.3.3.1,E5. In both, the emphasis is on the system, rather than upon the individual, as target of change. (Compare ibid., 280.)

It may also be mentioned in passing that, in spite of some superficial similarity between the well-known features of the process of school-based Review (SBR) the process described here is notably different. For instance, the consultative evaluation proposed here does not share SBR's [illegible] features as described by [illegible] (1987, 62). What is new about CSE is its

> systematic and formal approach, involving agreed relations and procedures, agreed domains of what to review and an integration of these into complex school management processes.

He also says that:

> SBR presumes a highly professional teaching force - well trained in the skills of institutional review, aware of their own professionalism, possessed of the high morale necessary to seek for constant improvement and confident of support in what they desire from the stake-holders in education (ibid., 64).

This does not describe the teachers in the six Catholic primary schools in Howth.

It should be noted that in this plan, the stakeholders are identified initially as consisting of the teachers alone. Clearly pupils, parents, parish and the community

at large, are also stakeholders. It is intended in the long run that representatives of such groups will be consulted. This is consistent with Warnock's view that everyone in society must argue for what they want their children to have educationally'. (See 4.3.) (Compare 7.3.3.1,C2.)

In this evaluation it is proposed that the mentor work with groups of teachers rather than with individuals. The group may consist of the entire staff or of smaller numbers of teachers (usually not fewer than three). (Compare Patton, 1982, 71.)

There are two reasons for the suggestion that the mentor work with groups. First, it takes less time to work with a group than with each of the individuals in the group separately. The second reason stems from the nature of group dynamics. Patton points to a number of benefits that accrue from work with groups that are less likely to occur with individuals. (See 7.3.3.1,F1.)

Clearly such benefits will depend on the effectiveness of the group process. The mentor, in the role of evaluator, must take much of the responsibility for this. She must

> help focus the activities of the group so that time is well used, necessary decisions get made, and participants do not become frustrated with a meandering and ambiguous process (ibid., 72).

She must also

> be sufficiently directive to get the job done and sufficiently non-directive and open to allow task force participants to feel that their inputs have

been meaningful and substantive (ibid., 76).

However, in the long term, the mentor's most important contribution may lie in helping the staff to develop the sorts of communication and problem-solving norms and skills that would increas their adaptability as an organisational unit. For this purpose the mentor might usefully cultivate in the teachers, those skills that "form the building blocks of OD (organisational development) technology . These relate to the way in which "certain interactions with others can be executed in a group". For example, teachers mig need to learn to paraphrase what another has said so that the other can verify whether she has been understood Schmuck, 1986, 285-286).

The teachers should be stimulated to suggest solutions to the problems that arise but the evaluator (i.e. the mentor must expect to have to take the major initiatives in this regard. Patton comments that.

> A group process can generate ideas and establish the parameters for what would constitute an acceptable solution, but creative insight appears to be primarily an individual phenomenon. A creative insight can be sparked in a group, but some individual will usually need time alone to think and work out the details and full implications of a creative solution. This is what the evaluator does between meetings of the task force .... (1982, 76).

When consensus has been reached, the mentor and the teachers should discuss ways in which the innovation could be evaluated. The teachers should contribute as much as is feasible to the implementation of this evaluation exercise.

The chosen solution to many classroom problems is

expected to imply a need for additional equipment and facilities, and for further professional training for the teachers.

In relation to the former, an application for the necessary funds should be made by the teachers involved (if necessary, with the help of their mentor) and presented to the staff as a whole.

The staff should then consider it in light of the aims of the school and of other demands made upon its resources. (In relation to the former, it is hoped that, inter alia, there will be an intention to contribute in whatever way possible to the local community. In view of this, a request for a particular facility would be regarded more favourably if it could be used to benefit children who lived nearby but did not attend the school.) This procedure is meant to introduce democratic control over at least some of the school's funds. The panel should maintain a watching brief on how these funds are being spent and should have a power of veto.

In relation to professional training, it is probable that most of the assistants will want to learn some 'better methods of teaching". (See 7.3.2,d.) Presumably each teacher will be most interested in learning about methods that she could use in her own classroom. In this case it may therefore be appropriate for the mentor to work with individual teachers to plan a strategy to facilitate this. However, in schools where two or more teachers teach parallel classes, the mentor should encourage them to co-

operate.

For example, it would be beneficial if the teacher's traditional autocracy and isolation in her own classroom were broken down to some degree. The mentor and two or three teachers might meet to discuss ways in which a new concept is to be introduced to a particular group of children. Then one of the teachers (or the mentor) might present the lesson to the pupils in the presence of her colleagues. The method regarded as the best feasible having been demonstrated, the teachers and the mentor could meet to reflect upon the lesson's strengths and how it could be improved. (Perhaps it would also be useful to solicit the pupils' opinions. The teachers and mentor could also [illegible] how the lesson could be followed up [illegible], perhaps, further joint ventures. In the SEP experience such [illegible] in the [illegible] setting proved to be a powerful means of spreading new ideas. See 3.3.4.4.)

The teachers are likely to be very disturbed by the introduction of new ideas and ways of doing things. As Corrigan (1986, 105-106) says

> [illegible] new skills, assimilating new knowledge, [illegible] value conflicts, [will not always happen] simply and smoothly.

(Compare 3.3.1,G1.) It is essential that the mentors be warm, comforting and reassuring to the teachers. Other measures must also be taken to build their confidence. For example, as in SEP it may be necessary to increase the teachers' knowledge of the subject that they teach. Pogan

and Macdonald are correct in asserting that it is of paramount importance to the success of the innovation that the teachers feel secure. (See 7.2.3.4.)

In addition the mentors should organise frequent and regular meetings of teachers in the cluster who face similar challenges. At a meeting of such a network, each teacher might be asked to report on her recent classroom experiences and to raise problems for discussion. The group could also co-operate in preparation for the coming period. (These networks are intended to be similar to those established by SEP to serve its purposes in Soweto, Durban and the Transkei. See 7.2.3.4.)

In addition to their educative function, these networks are intended to provide teachers with mutual support and restore their sense of motivation. This will probably be especially important for inexperienced teachers. The networks are also meant to provide opportunity for unusually competent and confident assistant teachers to exercise leadership. It is hoped that such people will rapidly assume responsibility for convening and organising meetings and to win up members who have not attended for some time. When necessary, training should be provided to improve performance in these roles. These suggested networks were inspired among SEP teachers in similar circumstances and SEP recognised a need to offer leadership training. See 7.2.3.4.

Above all, it is hoped that the network system will raise morale and contribute to the maintenance of enthusiasm

for the continuing pursuit of excellence in teaching.

Sometimes input will be required from a person more expert than the teachers or mentors involved. In this situation the mentors should put the teachers in touch with suitable people who are willing to co-operate. Some of these may, for example, be employed in a college of education intended to serve whites only. This should not deter the mentors or the Soweto teachers from asking for their aid. In other words, all available resources should be tapped. (See 7.3.3.1,H2.)

Some teachers may wish to attend formal courses. If so they should be encouraged to examine the curricula closely, and to relate them to their purposes before deciding to enrol. If a teacher does attend a course her mentor should help her to apply her new insights in the classroom.

It is abundantly clear that participation in the process of school improvement including INSET) described above, will make very great demands on the teachers' time. Further, lack of sufficient time for this purpose is likely to be a fundamental barrier to its success. This problem will have to be addressed by the panel. Howey recommends that ways be found to re-organise the school so that teachers could engage in various forms of continuing education throughout the instructional day" (1986, 49).

The panel will also have to address the thorny problem of incentives. Teachers must be motivated to participate

in all aspects of school improvement. In particular, they must be encouraged to teach every lesson to the best of their ability. It can be expected that these endeavours will provide a variety of intrinsic gratifications such as fellowship and increased self-respect. The panel should plan to increase these rewards to the maximum. However, in addition, they should also make use of (probably) the most powerful incentive, money. (Compare 7.3.2.) As noted in 7.2.3.5, there is no widely used way in which recognition is given to good quality work without taking the teacher out of the classroom. In seeking a solution to this vexed question, the panel could contribute substantially to the improvement of schooling.

The components of the plan mentioned so far are intended to be implemented from the commencement of its operation. Those items which now follow are to be introduced at a later stage.

First, at least some of the syllabuses used in the schools must be changed.

It will be recalled that the principals felt very strongly that such reform was required but that their assistants were not equally concerned to make changes of this sort. (See 7.3.2.) If the full impact of any syllabus change is to be felt by the pupils, the assistants will have to be persuaded of the need for them. Therefore time must be taken to prepare a favourable climate of opinion before an attempt is made to engage the assistants in such a project.

The second item is concerned with ways in which better intergroup relations, between the pupils in the Soweto schools and some white children, could be fostered.

It is mentioned in 7.3.2 that the principals wanted their pupils to work for justice and peace in South Africa but, to this end, did not feel it very important to facilitate friendship between their pupils and white children of the same age. The assistants valued working for a just South Africa less than the principals did, but were equally unconcerned to foster inter-racial friendship between children.

In this case, both principals and assistants will have to be persuaded of the value of such aims before the mentors try to involve them in practical arrangements.

In addition, in relation to both these suggestions, it is necessary that the teachers be able to participate with confidence, and some administration, in discussion of matters educational, before they engage with interested parties outside their schools.

In relation to curricula, Hartshorne believes that teachers must, from the beginning be involved in their design and also in the preparation of the concomitant teaching materials (1985, 74). Therefore here, in relation to the schools in question, it is recommended that all the teachers who are to use a new curriculum participate in its development.

However, the teachers and others immediately concerned

with the schools (e.g. the mentors) should not make all the decisions alone. Representatives of the many other stakeholders in the education of these pupils should also be involved. For example, the parents, teachers' associations and the wider community, should have some say. (Compare 7.3.3.1,C2.)

Among the relevant teachers' associations are the Johannesburg Catholic Schools and Teachers' Association and the African Teachers' Association of South Africa (ATASA). Prior to February 1988, the non-racial National Education Union of South Africa which, Hartshorne says, 'young Black teachers [were] joining in opposition to ATASA' (1992, 47), and, representing the community, the NECC, would have been obvious candidates for inclusion. However, on that date severe restrictions were placed upon their activities. (See 7.2.2.)

[illegible] discussion could also serve a kerygmatic purpose [illegible] when appropriate, the Christian viewpoint were explained.

Bans upon organisations, obvious as they are, are not the only constraints upon curricular development. A major impediment is indicated by Thompson. He points out that [illegible] systems are made up of a number of interrelated sub-systems such as primary schools, secondary schools and tertiary institutions. He notes that

> For the various sub-systems to operate efficiently ....., they have to be kept in an appropriate balance with each other and some kinds of change may necessitate changing this balance (1981, 161).

Higher sub-systems influence lower sub-systems and constrain changes in curriculum and methodology. According to Thompson

> These constraints upon change operate largely through the examination system to which many teachers would point as being the major obstacle to change (ibid., 162).

The external examination, written by the pupils at the end of Std V in order to gain admission to high school, would certainly constrain any radical changes to syllabi. Therefore, for these children, it would be necessary to find or create another system of certification that was acceptable to the high school authorities.

In relation to curricular innovation and examinations, the Independent Examinations Board may prove to be a highly suitable body with whom to co-operate.

Registered as an incorporated association not for gain in 1988, the IEB is the first private initiative to enter the field of examining and certification. It has been established 'to develop curricula, conduct examinations and issue certificates to pupils at private and 'alternative' schools'.

Its chairman, Mr Michael Corke, said that recent events in education in South Africa had shown the need for an independent body committed to the development of curricula and examinations appropriate to a non-racial society.

The IEB has three goals:

- To set up structures to enable it to take over the activities of the JMB (Joint Matriculation Board.

- To establish a board of chief examiners to evaluate examinations, set standards for and run examinations at different levels.
- To establish a Council for Curriculum Development, which would, subject to conditions that may be set by the SA Certification Council, develop curricula appropriate to the needs of a non-racial society.

This council would consult widely and conduct research and workshops in communities and with schools, school associations, universities, churches, community organisations, parents, teachers, students, professional and business representatives, examiners and related experts.

Corke indicates that the IEB intends to be flexible in its approach. He commented that

> In History, there are some people who are more interested in the development of the oppressed people than in white politics. We will be able to give alternatives that will satisfy these people (The Star, 8 September 1988).

In addressing curricular problems the people associated with these Catholic schools will be engaged in the resolution of the contradictions between, in Morphet's terms, the economic culture and the political culture (5.5.6). Any success in this field can be seen as a contribution to a democratic, post-apartheid educational system. (See 7.3.3.2,C2.)

As regards the second facet suggested for later inclusion in focus on intergroup relations) contact and friendship should be facilitated between the Soweto pupils and the mainly white pupils from nearby Catholic open schools, and between their teachers. Where possible, common endeavours should be undertaken.

Ideally, the pupils should spend time in each others'

schools. However, the children's safety is obviously of paramount importance. In the current atmosphere of violence in Soweto, it would probably be very unwise to take white children into the township on a predictable schedule. Therefore it is here assumed that, in nearly all instances, the Soweto children visit the open schools and not vice versa.

Among other things, class-time should be used to help the children to speak each others' languages. (See Appendix VIII:7.) A significant feature of such co-operation might be the development of new methods by which the pupils provide mutual assistance in language learning.

The opportunity should also be taken to make available expensive teaching materials e.g. laboratory equipment, to the Soweto pupils.

The time that the pupils spend together should be very carefully planned and supervised, co-operatively, by the teachers from both schools. Such joint action with members of another race would be, for almost all the participants, a new experience. (In the Soweto Catholic primary schools in 1986 there were hardly any white teachers. In the open schools nationwide, in the same year, 98,5% of the teachers were white. See Christie and Butler, 1988, 35.) If mutual support and unity were promoted, decisions arrived at democratically, and everyone drawn in as active participants, a community could develop (Connor, 1985, 199).

In view of their recent history (see 7.2.2), it can be

assumed that these traditionally white schools would be sympathetic to the suggestion that they work together with the Soweto schools in this way. However it must be recognised that the open schools are severely constrained by the attitudes of the parents of their pupils.

If these parents were not satisfied with their children's school they could withdraw them. This would result in a loss of income and would be a very serious matter. In Christie and Butler's 1986 evaluation of the open schools they found that every school principal without exception expressed concern about the financial viability of the school (1988, 39).

These evaluators record certain opinions expressed by the principals that would throw light on the relevant parental attitudes. The principals were asked, concerning their own schools, "Have any white parents withdrawn their children from your school since it has accepted more black pupils?" Sixty per cent of primary school principals believed that pupils had been withdrawn during the first five years of integration, but under 10% believed this to be the case in subsequent years. In addition, over 60% believed that there were white parents who did not send their children to the school because it was open (ibid., 43).

From this it is clear that moves to promote contact between pupils in the open and the Soweto schools, would have to be preceded by a campaign to persuade the white parents of the considerable value of such contact. This is

consistent with the observation that most open schools see themselves 'partly shaping and partly being constrained by, white parent preferences" (ibid., 44).

(No evidence is available relevant to what Soweto parents' attitudes might be towards such joint activities.)

It is vital that parents, both black and white, become increasingly committed to the development of a united society. This, besides its intrinsic importance, is essential for their children's proper socialization for peace. As Connor points out, a school can "equip its students to work for creative change. (However) this applies even more forcibly to family .... life, where attitudes of acceptance of others or belligerance are readily acquired" (1985, 197).

In this discussion emphasis is placed upon the establishment of community among children of different races and classes and between their teachers. It is also to be hoped that some degree of community might emerge among some of the parents of the children, but the practical and attitudinal obstacles to such a development must, of course, not be under-estimated.

This is all intended to change attitudes and therefore behaviour. In addition, if fairly successful, such an innovation could serve as an example of a step that could be taken towards peace under contemporary circumstances. (Compare ibid., 209.)

7.4 CONCLUSION

In the light of the empirical data on the teachers' perceptions, this chapter has pursued the logic of INSET needs in the context of these schools when cognisance is taken of the particular Christian perspective represented in their sponsorship. As was mentioned in 7.3.1, this has been done at the risk of appearing utopian, for resource-constraints have not been part of the study. The prioritizing of what is suggested here, in the context of nation-wide needs in the Catholic sector, would obviously be a primary component in any ecclesiastical response to the present work. But as far as this study is concerned, that process would be another story.

APPENDIX I

"Roman Catholics", "Catholics" or "catholics"?

Some controversy surrounds the designation of those who owe allegiance to the Pope in Rome. Are they to be called "Roman Catholics", "Catholics", or "catholics"? James Burtchaell, a professor of theology at Notre Dame University, Indiana, wrote an amusing article on the subject for The Tablet. He pointed out that various groups of members of the Church of Rome had different preferences in this regard (30 November 1985).

In Burtchaell's experience, members of the Roman church call themselves "Catholics" or "catholics" when among themselves. (Obviously it is not possible to observe whether a speaker has an upper or lower case "c" in mind.)

However there are other churches who use this title. For example the Maronites, who have a church in Johannesburg, are called Catholics in their own country and refer to the Roman Catholics as "Latins", not "Romans".

Further, a Lutheran colleague of Burtchaell's insisted that he had been baptized into the Church Catholic, and he had professed no other faith but Catholic all his life [illegible] there is also a "devout segment of the Church of England for whom being Catholic is a matter closest to their hearts" (Ibid., 2).

Catholics in general value catholicity. Some, wishing to focus attention in this attribute, wish to be known as [illegible] It is probable that among those who favour

this usage there are those who hold two very different positions. Some may see themselves as the only true Christians, believing that Protestants, for example, are excluded from the Mystical Body. Others see an essential unity among the followers of Christ and would wish to be seen as belonging to this larger grouping.

Burtchaell concludes his article by remarking:

> Is it too much to ask that Christians, whom we behold loving one another a bit better nowadays, take a step nearer to the values of the Kingdom by calling one another what each group prefers? Left to our own devices and instincts, my crowd calls itself Catholic. I like it as our name. Some plan in to stipulate that they mean it with a small "c". But I would keep it as a capital letter and have us haunted by it: we should not rest until we have followed Christ well enough to unite with all those Baptist, Presbyterian, Anglican, Orthodox disciples, Brethren and Slatern alike, in one Church far more catholic that it has been for a long time (ibid., 1252).

In this dissertation we have followed Burtchaell.

APPENDIX II

CATHOLIC RESPONSE TO AUTHORITATIVE ECCLESIASTICAL STATEMENTS

Here follows an examination of the degree of authority attributed to the non-infallible pronouncements of the "Magisterium", or teaching authority of the Roman Catholic Church.

Statements made by the Magisterium are generally regarded as being of two kinds: "infallible" and "non-infallible".

Statements regarded as infallible by the Church are only made by popes, and then only rarely. They concern the central tenets of the faith. In this study the authority to be accorded to infallible statements is not in question.

Non-infallible statements are made by popes and/or bishops on a wide variety of subjects that relate to faith and morals. These are treated with great seriousness by Catholics worldwide and undoubtedly influence policies that relate to Catholic schools. However, the degree to which such statements are binding in conscience upon Catholics is a controversial matter. As many such statements are referred to in this dissertation it is appropriate to look closely at their status.

(The non-infallible pronouncements referred to in this study are marked with an asterisk in the reference list.)

The Magisterium is a rather recent concept in its existence. [illegible]-ecclesiastical sense and is also a somewhat vague notion (Fransen, 1985: 15). The sense in which the term

is used here is limited to the one that is proper to the pope and the bishops as "judges of faith" and is exercised as such by no other member of the Church (ibid., 16).

Written decrees of the popes include, among other documents, apostolic letters, apostolic exhortations and encyclicals. The letters are generally directed to individuals, the exhortations and encyclicals to special groups, albeit sometimes very large groups (ibid., 20 - 21). For example, in 1975, Pope Paul VI addressed Evangelii Nuntiandi to "the Bishops, priests and faithful of the entire Catholic Church (p.204). Since the time of John XXIII, a new kind of encyclical has appeared that may be addressed, like Populorum Progressio, to 'bishops, priests, religious, the faithful of the entire Catholic world, and to all men of goodwill' (Paul VI, 1967, 141). These generally treat problems of development, of justice, and of peace, which are indeed the concern of all men" (Fransen, 1982, 22).

These writings of the Magisterium, are presently called technically but without special philosophical meaning, authentic acts of the Magisterium. Therefore, these texts occupy a particular place among the texts that propose the faith and the Christian life for us" (ibid., 5). (Emphasis in the original.)

> They are called 'authentic' because they proceed from the religious and ecclesiastical authority established by God, and also because they are formally promulgated as pronouncements of this authority. They are thus presumed to express a particular exercise of authority for a group of the faithful or for the universal Church. They

is used here is limited to the one that is proper to the pope and the bishops as "judges of faith" and is exercised as such by no other member of the Church (ibid., 16).

Written decrees of the popes include, among other documents, apostolic letters, apostolic exhortations and encyclicals. The letters are generally directed to individuals, the exhortations and encyclicals to special groups, albeit sometimes very large groups (ibid., 20 - 21). For example, in 1975, Pope Paul VI addressed Evangelii Nuntiandi to "the bishops, priests and faithful of the entire Catholic Church" (p.204). Since the time of John XXIII, a new kind of encyclical has appeared that may be addressed, like Populorum Progressio, to "bishops, priests, religious, the faithful of the entire Catholic world, and to all men of goodwill" (Paul VI, 1967, 141). These "generally treat problems of development, of justice, and of peace, which are indeed the concern of all men" (Fransen, 1982, 22).

These writings of the Magisterium, "are presently called technically (but without special philosophical meaning) authentic acts of the Magisterium. Therefore, these texts occupy a particular place among the texts that profess the faith and the Christian life for us" (ibid., 5). Emphasis in the original.)

> They are called 'authentic' because they proceed from the religious and ecclesiastical authority established by God, and also because they are formally promulgated as pronouncements of this authority. They are thus presumed to express a particular exercise of authority for a group of the faithful or for the universal Church. They

> have, ..., a certain binding authority, although the obligations they impose can vary greatly according to the nature of the matter dealt with, the people addressed, and the nature of the document itself (ibid., 5-6). (Emphasis in the original.)
>
> (Other written or oral statements by the pope or by people belonging to the episcopal college are what are called private pronouncements and are thus non 'authentic'. If they have some religious content they generally belong to the order religious witness, pastoral care and preaching. See ibid., 6.) (Emphasis in the original.)

How, then, can one gauge the degree of the binding 'authority' of a particular authentic document, on members of the Catholic Church?

Fransen points out that

> The Church has a wealth of texts that are of greater or lesser importance for the preservation of the faith and the Christian life'. The Scriptures as God's own Word to His Church, are central, although they were obviously written by men.
>
> It is believed that these scriptural texts 'transmit the 'Word of God' to us (ibid., 5).
>
> God's Revelation is expressed in the Scriptures, which are interpreted in the course of time by what we call the ecclesiastical Tradition. One may say that the Scriptures were also the fruit of the first traditions of the Apostolic Church, such that a mutual interaction can be seen in the beginning. This ecclesiastical Tradition, along with the many traditions that also existed and still exist in the Church, forms a body of teachings and practices in which our faith in the one Christ has expressed itself and continues to express itself in the course of history. The Scriptures remain central, as the norma non normata. Therefore, each pronouncement of the Magisterium must be read within this whole that forms the wider context. This principle is extremely important; one of the basic principles of modern linguistic philosophy is that no text can be understood meaningfully outside its context (ibid., 6). (Emphasis in the original.)

It has only been recently that the popes have set out to provide leadership for the People of God in matters of faith and Christian life by means of writings of various kinds (ibid., 5).

Most classic handbooks recognise that the pope and the bishops, in exercising their authority,

a) Are not inspired by a particular and personal revelation from God ... .
b) Are not 'inspired' as were the writers of the Holy Scriptures ... .
c) Are only, as technical theology has it, 'assisted by the Holy Spirit' (ibid., 7).

Fransen asserts that

> These same principles can also be expressed very simply in language understandable by everyone. The pope and bishops do not possess any special and separate source of knowledge or discernment of the faith that is not possessed by the rest of the faithful. It is precisely for this reason that they are, in traditional terminology, 'assisted' by the Holy Spirit. And 'assistance' can only be effective for someone who is open to it and who does something himself. The pope and the bishops, naturally, must do something themselves before they issue pronouncements (ibid., 7). (Emphasis in the original.)

That is, they must pray, study, reflect and because they cannot know everything, consult (ibid., 8).

A number of barriers to discernment exist.

> Vatican II, ..., admitted that the entire Church must always be open to reform and renewal: Ecclesia semper reformanda, as the Reformation would have it (ibid., 8).

The Church will only be without stain and without wrinkle Eph. 5:7) in heaven. Clearly if the Church is sinful, "it is also sinful its popes and bishops . And if the popes and bishops are sinful, there is no reason why their exercise of the teaching office should be excluded from sinfulness."

Further

in our time, we have become more clearly aware that the members of the People of God are <u>historically</u> and therefore culturally determined in the way they conceive and implement the faith (ibid., 9). (Emphasis in the original.)

Even

> the concrete exercise of authority and of the obedience expected in culture bound [illegible] according to the times in which the Church finds itself in its pilgrimage through history.
>
> Of more profound significance are the innate limitations of the human mind in language and word.
>
> It is obviously delicate and difficult .... to [illegible]late satisfactorily the mystery of God's actions with people (ibid., 10).

Fransen stresses that

> [illegible] is a great distance between the ever-fresh, new, spontaneous, ritually individualized, and, at the same time, all-encompassing presence and providence of God in his world and what we can say about it in the form of doctrinal declarations and directives. Human texts even with the assistance of the Holy Spirit (ibid., 11).

In his opinion, therefore,

> this task of articulation is something for the whole of the believing Church, for the thinking and living of the entire ecclesial community in connection with its legitimate leaders (<u>ibid</u>., 10).

This [illegible] reveal a preference for a particular mode of the Church. See 4.3.4.

He comments that

> the many problems that arise from the nature and manner of the exercise of ecclesiastical authority and from the nature and manner of the expected submissiveness of the faithful will be resolved in very different ways depending on whether the [illegible] is received from a communitarian or from a primarily juridical viewpoint (<u>ibid</u>., 12).

The communitarian and juridical viewpoint arise from

two very different models of the Church that are held simultaneously. Fransen comments:

> Anyone who has read the documents of Vatican II honestly and attentively, particularly Lumen Gentium, knows that the Council maintained a dual and non-integrated image of the Church.

Further, the tension this creates has increased since the Council (ibid., 11).

The juiridical viewpoint arises from the pyramid" model with the pope at the summit as the unique representative (vicarius) of Christ". The laity form the base. Authority is exercised primarily in one direction, fr m t p to bcttrom' and is a matter of purely technical canonical experience (ibid., 12).

> On the ther hand, throughout the entire Church, frcm base ..]. basic Christian communit.es, parish councils the level of the Primacy (The Rcman Synod forms ot living and structures have grown up as expressi ns of a new vision of the Church, a vision of the Church that is fundamentally founded n the living communion in [illegible] (ibid., 12). (Emphasis in the original.)

Within this vision each member bears his or her own re sibility, depending on his or her own state in life, vocation and spiritual gifts' (ibid., 12).

> The obligation of obedience also remains in such a vision f the Church. But (Fransen) think(s) that the entire religious relationship between the leaders, who lead in the name of God, and the flock, who look up in faith to the leaders given them by God, will evolve in a very different climate. This climate and thus the solutions given will not be primarily juridical but will be cast in terms of what one could call relationship of fraternity, trust and love.

Sadly, Fransen also notes that this climate of

communion "has yet to be established .

Coinciding with the growth of the communitarian vision of the Church is the rediscovery in the ost-Vatican II Church

> Of the old Latin and still vital Eastern notion of 'reception'. The entire Church 'receives' (to preserve the technical term, for it concerns a very particular faith process) the teaching and the life forms proposed to it by its leaders and confidently and freely accepts responsibility for such promulgations.
>
> Put more simply
>
> to the degree that the faithful recognize their own faith in the leadership of their superiors, this assimilated in a vital way.
>
> In this process, ... there are obviously insights ... the leadership which are not digested and are thus discarded [ibid., 13].
>
> A notable example of such a rejection concerns the teaching of Pius XII on the Mystical Body and the visible Roman Catholic Church, [which] was unfortunately ignored by Pius, but which was ignored by Vatican II and replaced by a vision of the Church which was completely new with respect to the past teaching and ecclesial communities [ibid., 14].

Indeed, well known Roman theologians such as F M Cornelis had, with all due respect, silently ignored this doctrine already during the life of Pius XII" (ibid., 22).

Further examples can be found in the encyclical letter [illegible] (1935). He says that consideration of [illegible] Christian education must ... nature, which fashions the two (sexes) quite different ... organism, in temperament, in abilities , there is nothing ... suggest ... there can be or ought to be promiscuity, and much less equality, in the training of the two sexes .

(This passage may have suffered in translation.) The sexes

> are destined to complement each other in the family and in society, precisely because of their differences, which therefore ought to be maintained and encouraged during their years of formation, with the necessary distinction and corresponding separation, according to age and circumstances. These principles, ... must, ... be applied to all schools, particularly in the most delicate and decisive period of formation, that, namely, of adolescence (p.21).

Co-educational Catholic schools for children at all stages of development are legion and, in South Africa at least, the education they receive substantially the same and certainly intended to be equal.

The picture presented here suggests that in the Roman Catholic Church there is considerable tolerance of views that diverge from those of the Magisterium. However this is not always the case. Fransen draws attention to a [illegible] authority, ..., with regard to the documents that proceed from the Magisterium".

> Exegetes may analyze the Scriptural texts, which we believe transmit the 'Word of God' to us, according to all the rules of literary and biblical criticism and examine these texts in terms of their original meaning and scope.
>
> However, although
>
> no theological handbook whatsoever, however conservative it may be, would dare to state that the documents of the Magisterium, even the so-called infallible pronouncements, express the 'revealed truth' in the same way and with the same meaning as do the Scriptures.
>
> Nevertheless, a number of theologians, not to mention bishops and a large part of the faithful consider any attempt at an honest interpretation of these texts of the Magisterium as a manifestation of a lack of respect for and loyalty to the Holy See and episcopal authority (1982, 3).

(This passage may have suffered in translation.) The sexes

> are destined to complement each other in the family and in society, precisely because of their differences, which therefore ought to be maintained and encouraged during their years of formation, with the necessary distinction and corresponding separation, according to age and circumstances. These principles, ..., must, ... be applied to all schools, particularly in the most delicate and decisive period of formation, that, namely, of adolescence (p.21).

Co-educational Catholic schools for children at all stages of development are legion and, in South Africa at least, the education they receive substantially the same and certainly intended to be equal.

The picture presented here suggests that in the Roman Catholic Church there is a considerable tolerance of views that diverge from those of the Magisterium. However this is not always the case. Fransen draws attention to "a strange anomaly, ..., with regard to the documents that proceed from the Magisterium'.

> Exegetes may analyze the Scriptural texts, which we believe transmit the 'Word of God' to us, according to all the rules of literary and biblical criticism and examine these texts in terms of their original meaning and scope.
>
> However, although
>
> No theological handbook whatsoever, however conservative it may be, would dare to state that the documents of the Magisterium, even the so-called infallible pronouncements, express the 'Word of God' to us in the same way and with the same meaning as do the Scriptures.
>
> Nevertheless, a number of theologians, not to mention bishops and a large part of the faithful consider any attempt at an honest interpretation of these texts of the Magisterium as a manifestation of a lack of respect for and loyalty to the Holy See and episcopal authority (1982, 3).

On 30 March 1986, the South African Catholic weekly newspaper, The Southern Cross, devoted two pages out of twelve to reports of controversy related to this issue.

About a page centred on the case of Fr. Charles Curran.

> Fr. Curran was a professor of moral theology at the Catholic University of America. On 10 October 1985 he received a letter from the Congregation for Doctrine. (In the Roman Catholic Church, this is the highest authority, or in popular language, the Supreme Court in matters of faith and morals.) It was sent with the approval of Pope John Paul and was signed by the prefect of the Congregation, Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger.
>
> This letter declared that Fr. Curran
>
> was in 'dissent' from Church teaching regarding
> - artificial contraception and direct sterilization;
> - abortion and euthanasia;
> - masturbation, premarital intercourse and homosexual acts, and
> - the indissolubility of sacramental and consummated marriage (The Southern Cross, 30 March 1986, a).

On 11 March 1986 Curran made a statement to the press summarising his position on each of the above. For example, concerning abortion he wrote

> [illegible] human life begins at the time of implantation which occurs between the 14th and 21st day after conception (ibid).

In his letter to Fr. Curran, asking him to retract certain opinions as contrary to Catholic teaching, Cardinal Ratzinger remarks that

> regarding the issues of abortion and euthanasia, the teaching of the Church, [illegible] and despite [illegible] the contrary, the Magisterium has recently reaffirmed the sacred and inviolable character of human life from the moment of conception.

He calls upon Curran to retract in light of

> the clear doctrine of the Second Vatican Council regarding the principles for the assent of faith (Lumen Gentium, 25). This doctrine was incorporated in the revised Code of Canon Law, which in Canon 752 sums up the thought of the council on this point (The Southern Cross, 30 March 1986, b).

Curran says that

> the core of the difference between the congregation and myself concerns the legitimacy of dissent from authoritative non-infallible Church teaching.
>
> Note clearly that I do not disagree with any dogmas or defined truths of the Catholic faith (The Southern Cross, 30 March 1986, a).

Ratzinger demands that Curran "retract those positions which violate the conditions necessary for a professor to be called a Catholic theologian (The Southern Cross, 30 March 1986, b).

At stake is Curran's right to continue teaching at the Catholic University of America.

The Jesuit, Fr. Avery Dulles, said of Lumen Gentium that

> With something like unanimity it has been hailed as the most momentous achievement of the Council (i.e. Vatican II), both because of its important contents and because of its central place among the Council documents (1966, 10).

However, he also says that "Lumen Gentium is not and does not purport to be a definitive document". "Some later Council documents, such as those on the Church and the World, show a further advance of thinking in some respects surpassing Lumen Gentium."

This general position, that of holding Lumen Gentium in

high regard while seeing it as "a stepping stone, not a final achievement", is also held by two prominent theologians, Dom Christopher Butler and Pere Dejaifse (ibid., 13).

A further example of a highly publicised clash between Church authorities and dissenters also came from the United States of America.

On 7 October 1984, at the height of the presidential campaign, a full page advertisement, headed 'Catholic statement on Pluralism and Abortion' appeared in the New York Times. It was signed by ninety-seven Catholic scholars, religious and social activists. (Among them were two members of a religious congregation prominent in Catholic education in South Africa, the Sisters of Notre Dame. As a result of their action, the two nuns in question faced possible expulsion from their community.)

On 2 March [illegible] a second full page advertisement, 'We affirm our solidarity with all Catholics whose right to free speech [illegible] under attack', appeared in the same newspaper. Over nine hundred Catholics signed this 'Declaration of Solidarity' in which it is claimed that the signatories of the earlier statement and their families, had "been penalized by segments of the institutional Roman Catholic Church".

They went on to say

> We believe that Catholics who, in good conscience, take positions on the difficult questions of [illegible] and other controversial issues that differ from the official hierarchical positions act within their rights and

responsibilities as Catholics and citizens.

In the last paragraph they announced that

> We, as Roman Catholics, affirm our solidarity with those who signed the Statement and agree to stand with all who face reprisals. 'The ties which unite the faithful are stronger than those which separate them. Let there be unity in what is necessary, freedom in what is doubtful and charity in everything.' (Second Vatican Council, Church in the Modern World: 92.)

Archbishop Roger Mahony said that the first advertisement claimed that

> Catholics may believe that abortion can sometimes be a legitimate moral choice.

The second, he asserts

> renews this claim, not in the heat of a political campaign but after the repeated statements on behalf of the National Conference of Catholic Bishops which clearly point out that the position taken in the advertisement is mistaken.
>
> It is misleading and wrong to describe a situation of dissent, even legitimate dissent, from authentic church teaching as if it were only a matter of diversity or plurality of opinions in the Church ... . The teaching of the Magisterium (church teaching authority) is not simply one theological opinion alongside others; it is, rather, church doctrine.

Archbishop Mahony declared that the inviolability of human life from the moment of conception' is God's plan' and not subject to popular consensus'.

In similar vein Archbishop John May told reporters in St. Louis that

> There is absolutely no room for a pro-choice position (on abortion) in the Catholic Church (The Southern Cross, 30 March 1986, c).

Here, the last word is given to Avery Dulles, a professor of Systematic Theology at the Catholic University

of America and past president of both the Catholic Theological Society of America and the American Theological Society. He acknowledges that, in the past decade, there has been a great deal of controversy in the Church about how many Magisteria there are - one, two, or three . He takes the position that there are two groups "specially concerned with the formulation and explication of sacred doctrine".

> The Church, ... needs two kinds of teacher - the official teacher, whose task is to establish the official doctrine of the Church, and the theologian, whose function it is to investigate questions about faith with the tools of critical scholarship. These two classes, ..., are inseparably united, reciprocally dependent, but really and irreducibly distinct. Their relationships are frequently tense, but the tensions must be kept from becoming disruptive, lest the entire Church suffer harm. The avoidance of disruptive conflict demands restraint and mutual respect on the part of all concerned (1982, 118).

APPENDIX III

LETTERS TO KAGISO TEACHERS

III.1 INTRODUCTION

(See Chapter Three 3.6 Contextual circumstances of the interviewing.)

In 1983 copies of the first letter below were individually addressed by name, and given, to each of the teachers in the St. Peter's and Mofumahadi Catholic primary schools in Kagiso I.

A copy of the second letter was enclosed. It introduced the researcher to the Principals of all Catholic schools in the diocese of Johannesburg.

III.2 RESEARCHER'S LETTER TO TEACHERS

11 Torwood Road
Forest Town
JOHANNESBURG, 2193

17 October 1983

I enclose a letter of introduction from Bishop Orsmond.

I would like to put three questions individually to each of the teachers in the two Catholic primary schools in Kagiso, and to some other interested people.

These questions are:

1. What should be the aims of a Catholic primary school in Kagiso today?

2. (a) How well are these aims being achieved in these schools?
   (b) Should these schools be changed in any way to meet these aims better? If so, how should they be changed?

3. What types of further education and professional training do teachers in these schools need?

If you wish, please discuss these questions with friends, fellow-teachers and relatives.

In a few days I would be grateful to hear your opinions on these matters. I hope to arrange a private interview with you at a time that is convenient for you and for your school. I will not repeat to any other person anything which you as an individual have said to me.

I intend to write a dissertation on this study for an M.Ed. degree at the University of the Witwatersrand.

I do not hold any position of authority in the Church or the education system. I feel sure that the Church authorities will be very interested in teachers' opinions as summarised in my report. Of course, they may, or may not, act upon any suggestions made in that dissertation.

I hope you will speak to me freely, frankly and from the heart.

Yours sincerely,

Lucienne Hunter (Mrs)

III.: 3 BISHOP'S LETTER OF INTRODUCTION

6 October 1983

TO:

PRINCIPALS OF ALL CATHOLIC SCHOOLS IN THE DIOCESE OF JOHANNESBURG

Dear Principal

This letter serves to introduce Ms Lucienne W G Hunter.

Ms Hunter is pursuing an educational study towards acquiring her M.Ed. from Wits University.

Would you kindly give her every assistance and in parti lar allow her to interview any of your school personnel, parents, pupils and other persons associated with your school, whom she may request to see.

We thank you for your very kind co-operation.

May God bless you, your family and your work.

Yours sincerely in the Lord,

BISHOP R [illegible]ERSMOND

VICAR GENERAL

APPENDIX IV

KAGISO TEACHERS' OPINIONS

IV.1 INTRODUCTION

IV.1.1 OVERALL RATIONALE

In Phase I of this study the teachers (including the principals) employed at the St. Peter's and Mofumahadi schools in Kagiso I were each given a letter in which they were told that the researcher hoped to put three questions to them. These were:

1. What should be the aims of a Catholic primary school in Kagiso today?
2. (a) How well are these aims being achieved in these schools?
   (b) Should these schools be changed in any way to meet these aims better? If so, how should they be changed?
3. What types of further education and professional training do teachers in these schools need?

(See Appendix III.)

Here an account is given of their responses.

Their opinions provide a rich, if incomplete, display of these teachers' values relating to the education of their pupils. As Rescher (1969, 3) comments,

> the prime indicators of value subscription are those items which reflect the rationalisation (defence, recommendation, justification, critique) of aspects of a way of life.

In relation to these teachers' views of their work it must be recognised

> that people's assumptions of the nature of their roles vary from those with whom they interact, or even from those in similar positions, is a fact that is re-demonstrated in practically every piece of social-analytic exploration that is carried out (Rowbottom, 1977, 43).

Nevertheless it is likely that a certain commonality will be found in the opinions expressed by people belonging to a particular group. Further, the opinions collected from people in one group may differ according to the circumstances in which the opinions were solicited. In order to throw such differences into relief, and so to facilitate comparisons, the views of the teachers at St. Peter's are presented in one section (IV.2) and those of the Mofumahadi teachers in another (IV.3). In the case of St. Peter s, subdivisions are based upon the conditions under which the teachers' ideas were expressed. (IV.2.2 Staff meeting and IV.2.3 Individual or small group interviews.) In that of Mofumahadi the thoughts of the black staff are given in section IV.3.2 and those of white staff in IV.3.3.

The reasons for dividing the material in this particular way is described below.

All the teachers in the St. Peter's schools are African so, in relation to their contribution, no distinctions are drawn on the basis of race. However some teachers spoke in the course of a staff meeting as well as during interviews where they were alone with the researcher, or accompanied by a friend. One person prepared written notes from which to speak during her interview. These were

given to the researcher and are incorporated into the account of the small group interviews.

The Mofumahadi schools had both African and white teachers. There were notable differences between these two groups. For example, the whites were all born and schooled in Europe and, at home, spoke a European language (English or French). The Africans were all born and schooled in South Africa and almost certainly spoke one or more Bantu languages at home. The whites, having come from Europe, had all visited their families of origin from time to time. It was unlikely that any of the Africans had travelled abroad. Further, the whites had had a greater variety of education and professional experience than their black counterparts. A comparison of the curriculum vitae of one black and that of one white teacher will illustrate this point.

The black woman (58) was a pupil at St. Mary's, Munsieville, for eight years. Having passed the public examination that marked the completion of primary school, she went to a Catholic training college in Johannesburg for three years in order to qualify as a teacher. She returned to the St. Mary's Mofumahadi schools where she had given 38 years of uninterrupted service. She had been a grade two teacher for more than a quarter of a century. Her husband and her children had also attended these schools. She had not obtained a Junior Certificate.

One of the white nuns (57) had grown up in England.

She spent twelve or thirteen years at schools run by the Ursuline sisters and obtained her A-level certificate. To obtain a teaching diploma she studied for two years at a Catholic college linked to the University of London. This was followed by four to five years as an assistant teacher in a state school in the East End of London. She then entered the convent. After a period of withdrawal, first as a postulant and later as a novice, she returned to teaching. There followed eight years in the department for retarded pupils in a multi-lateral school in England. She came to South Africa in 1959 to work with the de La Salle brothers in a boarding school attended mainly by white boys. In 1966 she was appointed principal of a Catholic primary school for white children whose closure in 1968 she was to supervise. She returned to England the following year to work in a boarding school. In 1970 she was appointed school manager and vice principal of a rural school in Botswana. In 1979 she went to the Missionary Institute, in Kinnage, Ireland, to do development studies as one of a very international class of mature students. From 1980 to 1982 she did both development work among adults in Botswana and taught scripture up to matric level in a high school. She was transferred to Mofumahadi in mid-1982.

This decision to group the staff along racial lines was reinforced by certain observations made by the authors of the Human Sciences Research Council's report, The South African Society: realities and future prospects (Marais, 1985). They note that South African society includes

population categories that have been entrenched in the juridical and political systems. For example, in census surveys and in all aspects of public life the following main population categories apply: blacks, whites, Coloureds and Indians (ibid., 20). Although there is a large measure of convergence between these categories and the ethnic and/or cultural divisions between groups, the juridical groupings do not necessarily correspond fully with the manner in which people group themselves (ibid., 38).

> On the level of perception and experience people do, however, define themselves, in the first instance, as members of a population group in a broader or more specific sense. The research also showed that population group/race/ nationality are first-order interpretations, categorizations or characteristics in terms of which others are perceived (ibid., 6).

At this stage all observations made orally were conveyed in the course of individual or small-group interviews with one, two or three respondents. It was thought that, as only thirteen people were involved, it was unlikely that significant differences would be observed in the kind of testimony given by groups differentiated on the basis of size.

Two people committed some ideas to paper, one before her interview, and the other after. These have been reflected in the text.

IV.2 NUNS: A SEPARATE GROUP?

Twenty-three teachers were employed in the Catholic schools of Kagiso in 1983. For reasons indicated in IV.2.1, it was

decided that one of these teacher should not be interviewed. Of the remaining twenty-two, six were nuns and eighteen lay people.

Below, reasons are given for not setting out the nuns' opinions in one section and those of lay people in another.

Of the six nuns, three were black, and three white. In relation to country of origin, cultural heritage, and educational and professional experience, the black nuns had much more in common with their black colleagues than with their fellow religious. Nor did the black and white nuns belong to the same religious congregation. The black nuns were all Companions of St. Angela whereas the white nuns were all Ursuline sisters. However, it should be noted that in relation to the religious life there was great similarity in practice, the Ursuline sisters having helped to found the Companions of St. Angela.) Of necessity the nuns lived in very different surroundings. The black nuns were required, by law, to live in a black group area. Two resided in the convent whose grounds were contiguous with those of the St. Peter's and Mofumahadi schools. The third travelled each day to the convent on the premises of the old St. Mary's school in Turffontein. In contrast, the white sisters, confined by law to a white group area, retired each afternoon after school to a convent in the beautiful and affluent suburb of Krugersdorp North. In view of these disparities in the experience of the two groups of nuns it was decided not to conflate the data obtained from each.

It would, of course, not have been difficult to compare the opinions of the two groups of nuns with each other and with the other aggregations already decided upon. Section IV.3.3 contains the views of the white nuns (There were no white lay teachers.) It was decided not to present the views of the black nuns separately as it would have necessitated a duplication of the opinions of the black sisters and as a result it would have been possible to attribute certain comments to the lone nun who taught at St. Peter's. To have made this possible would have amounted to a breach of trust as the researcher undertook to preserve the anonymity of the interviewees.

IV.1.3 CATEGORIES AND SUB-CATEGORIES

IV.1.3.1 Introduction

Within each of the four sections corresponding to the four groups whose viewpoints are to be compared, it was decided to arrange the teachers' comments according to topic. On examination of the transcripts of the tapes made during the interviews it was evident that almost every opinion expressed could, legitimately, be classified into one of four types of category. For the purposes of this account these levels of category will be labelled "elements", 'units', 'clusters' and 'themes'. Examples will be given to illustrate the differences between them.

IV.1.3.2 Elements

A teacher at St. Peter's remarked that her pupils' parents

held Catholic schools in high regard. She called attention to the fact that these parents had chosen to send their children to a Catholic school, which entailed the payment of fees and the purchase of school books. Fees would not have had to be paid, nor books bought, had these children been sent to community schools.

This observation can readily be divided into elements that can be listed under headings such as "school fees", and "purchase of school books". This does not appear to be a fruitful exercise. Although fees and the purchase of books were mentioned little can be gleaned of the informant's or the parents' attitudes towards them. The only information available has to be deduced from the logic of the argument. This woman believes that the parents experience the expenditure involved as a burden but are willing to bear the cost in return for the service offered. As she regards this willingness as remarkable, one presumes that she believes that the parents experience this drain on their resources as onerous.

This sentiment has little in common with the remarks made by a teacher at Mofumahadi which also relate to fees and the cost of books. This person spoke of the perks she enjoyed as a teacher in a Catholic school. Members of staff were granted a reduction in the fees that they would ordinarily have to pay in order to keep their children at this school. In addition she said that the necessary school books did not prove to be expensive because it was

possible, at the end of each year, to sell the used set and to buy, secondhand, those required for the next standard.

This implies that this woman values the opportunity to send her child/children to this school and, due to a combination of her particular circumstance (i.e. as a member of staff), with the probability of being able to participate in the trade in used textbooks, she does not feel unduly burdened by the costs involved.

It is thought that, rather than break down such reflections into elements, it is likely to be more profitable to treat them each as single units'.

IV.1.3.3 Units

These units are, in essence, formed by the respondent in that she has chosen the subject matter and given it logical cohesion. Had this person committed her ideas to paper, in most cases each of these units, appropriately expressed, could have stood alone as separate paragraphs.

IV.1.3.4 Clusters

Below, these units are presented in clusters under a relatively small number of headings which reflect a construct based on the perceptions of the researcher.

For example, it appeared to her that many of the opinions concerning notions of schooling, expressed by the staff at St. Peter's revealed a pre-occupation with social relationships, and, especially, with the way in which people related to each other in society. They were predominantly

concerned with the basis upon which people significant to them were accorded, or attempted to merit, status, esteem and identity. The term 'respect' which appears to have several different, but related, connotations, was frequently used.

For example, one person who displayed this interest, spoke of the desire of some Africans to amass material possessions in order to improve their standing in society. Others were proud to be associated with the Catholic school system, and spoke of the high regard in which the teachers at St. Peter's and Mofumahadi were held by the parents of their pupils. Some believed that the efforts of the staff had, collectively, contributed to the successes of past pupils and basked in reflected glory. Another woman claimed that however well qualified a black person became, he continued to be regarded as inferior to whites. In other words, she complained that achieved status was always secondary to ascribed status. A further person was concerned with the self-image of black people as a group. She felt that the blacks' diminished appreciation of their cultural heritage, as expressed in their loss of faith in their tried-and-true folk remedies, had been deliberately fostered by white capitalists who wanted to create a lucrative market for their medicines.

To the researcher, there appears to be, among the teachers at St. Peter's, a pre-occupation with status in a variety of forms. This pre-occupation seems to her to be a

characteristic of this school and one that differentiates it from Mofumahadi. Some teachers in the latter also made comments related to this theme but they were not ubiquitous as at St. Peter's. The teachers at Mofumahadi appeared to be primarily concerned with conflict in interpersonal relations, and dominated by an awareness of their straitened circumstances.

In this account units of opinion are presented in 'clusters' which are, in the text, distinguished one from another by side headings. The grouping of these units reflects the researcher's perception of what she sees as interests underlying several comments made by a single person or by a number of people.

Immediately below most headings in the main body of this Appendix there appears a brief description of the principle that is seen to unify each cluster.

In a number of cases a unit appears to be unrelated in any important respect to any other unit. When this occurs that unit is recorded alone beneath a heading.

IV.1.3.5 Themes

The clusters are grouped together by theme. The themes, like the clusters, reflect a construct founded upon the perceptions of the researcher.

Five broad themes have been identified:

- notions of education
- the education of teachers
- logistics

- race relations
- health care.

All clusters have been assigned to one or other of these themes.

In some cases the classification of a unit is debatable.

For example, the disposition of unit PIN-33 is open to question. (The system used in the numbering of units will be explained below in IV.1.4.) A teacher said that some community schools were without headmasters for considerable periods of time. Each teacher went her own way because there was no one in charge. She commented with approval that the Bishop made sure that each Catholic school had a principal. It is arguable that PIN-33 would be more appropriately placed under [illegible]ts than among Notions of Education. On balance, and for two reasons, it was decided to categorise it as an example of the latter theme. First, implicit in this comment is the notion that discipline suffers when, for as long as three months, there is no headmaster present to exert authority over the assistant teachers, and also the notion that it is inappropriate for them to each do "her own way". Secondly, this observation was but one of several that the speaker offered as evidence of the superiority of Catholic over state schools. The strength of this woman's pride in being part of the Catholic school system is best conveyed by presenting all her remarks on this subject together.

The lack of rigour with which clusters and themes were created are not believed to be problematic, for the purpose of this analysis is the selection of appropriate statements to be used in Phase II. These will not be distorted by minor irregularities in this record.

The advantage of this mode of structuring the account is that it, at once, makes the opinions more intelligible and in part justifies the inclusion of the statements in the three questionnaires used in Phase II. (See Chapter Four and Appendix VI.)

IV.1.4 NUMBERING UNITS FOR EASE OF REFERENCE

In order to facilitate reference to units each is labelled in the margin with three letters and a numeral.

The first letter, a P for an M", indicates whether the teacher was employed at St. Peter's or Mofumahadi, respectively.

If the first letter of a label is a P then it is followed either by S for Staff meeting, or by "I" for Individual or small group interviews, indicating the situation in which the opinion was expressed. The third letter indicates its classification according to theme. A... comments made in the course of the staff meeting at St. Peter's relate to Notions of Educations and this is intimated by an N. Comments made in individual or small group interviews are assigned to one of four themes: Notions of education (N), Logistics (L"), Race relations (R) and Teacher education (T).

For example PIT indicates that the unit of opinion in question was expressed in the course of an individual or small group interview, on the subject of education for teachers, by a member of St. Peter's staff.

If the first letter of a label is an M then it is followed either by a "B" for Black staff or a 'W" for white staff, indicating the race of the respondent. The third letter, an "N", 'L', H", R" or a 'T", distinguish Notions of education from comments on Logistics, Healthcare, Race relations and Teacher education.

For example: MBN indicates that the unit of opinion in question is a notion of education expressed by a black member of the Motumahadi staff.

Twelve sets of three letters are employed. Each set is associated with a series of numbers. The numeral following any one set of three letters indicates the position of a particular unit of opinion in that series.

IV.1.[illegible] POINTS OF EXPLANATION

(a) In Chapter Three it was noted that, in the course of the interviews in which these opinions were solicited, the researcher periodically summarised what each of the respondents had said, recording these synopses on a dictaphone. (See 2.4.2.2. As a consequence it is not possible to give the teachers' remarks verbatim. However, strenuous efforts were made to preserve any lack of clarity and precision when this occurred. As a result the language

used in this account is sometimes colloquial, sometimes formal. Such inconsistency is necessary as, without the former, a proper appreciation of the teachers' way of thinking would be distorted or lost, and without the latter accuracy would, of course, be sacrificed.

(b) The mode of reporting used here deliberately conceals individual identity.

IV.2 ST. PETER'S

IV.2.1 PRELIMINARY COMMENTS

Eight teachers out of nine were interviewed. The ninth teacher was new to the school, young and unqualified. Apparently she had been employed at short notice when a previous teacher had left unexpectedly. Two respondents mentioned the latter's sudden departure but were clearly unwilling to give any explanation. The other teachers did not refer to it. This matter was not pursued. As her replacement had only joined the staff at the beginning of July and was to leave at the end of the year, and as the principal preferred her not to be interviewed, it was decided to leave her out.

On the 17 October 1983 the researcher personally gave each teacher copies of Bishop Orsmond's letter of introduction and the stimulus letter. She returned to St. Peter's on the 20 October expecting to interview the staff singly or in small groups of not more than three people. On arrival she was told that the teachers were not willing to speak to her as planned but would meet her en masse to

answer her questions.

The researcher held a meeting with the Staff.

IV.2.2 STAFF MEETING

IV.2.2.1 Notions of education

The researcher opened the formal part of the exchange by asking the group what should be the aims of a Catholic primary school in Kagiso at that time.

IV.2.2.1.1 Societal values and school values, PSN-1 to 6

The units in this cluster provide comment on the inter-relationships between societal values and those reflected in the education of individual pupils.

The first teacher to speak responded by saying that the school was a value-creating body. It was not enough to teach children history and geography and get good examination results. It was not enough because this would not arm them to fight the world outside. It was not sufficient to provide competitive education'. If the children were not developed morally, they would not be able to respect the dignity of others. If the children were given a good moral foundation other subjects would not matter so much, the whole of life would be correct. (It was later discovered that, despite these criticisms of the competitive form of education focused on examinations that was being offered at St. Peter's, this teacher was exceptionally conscientious. She spent much time and PSN-1

energy, after school hours, giving extra lessons to her pupils in preparation for the public examinations they would write at the end of primary school. It was said that every year for several years the children in her class had achieved outstanding results.)

This person also said that sometimes one heard black people say that they wanted the same education for their children as white pupils received. This teacher, however, did not envy whites their education. If the white system of education did not produce people who respected the dignity of others, it was not good enough. It was a master slave education. PSN-2

African children only got enough education to carry out the instructions of their masters. PSN-3

Her colleagues appeared to agree substantially with the speaker. There was no dissension.

The first speaker went on to say that the problem was the whole educational set-up, not a matter of the correct method of teaching English or Afrikaans or Tswana, or ways of getting better exam results. The problem was the system, the system of education, the whole system of society. If children were given a proper moral basis the whole set-up of society would be correct. PSN-4 PSN-5

She felt that the group should consider schools in general, not concentrate on St. Peter's or even upon Catholic schools in particular. The education system as a whole must be examined. PSN-6

In order to excite further comment the teachers were asked what, if they were free to choose, they would like to do in their schools.

IV.2.2.1.2 History syllabus, PSN-7

One said that she would like to change the history syllabus. PSN-7
The syllabus they used seemed to say that black people came from nowhere, and that the white people came to Africa to teach the black people how to live, and continued to do so.

IV.2.2.1.3 Religious education, PSN-8 to 14

The respondents who contributed to this cluster all commented on the relationship between worship and charity and stressed the need for children to be taught to integrate these in their lives.

One person wanted to see scripture made more PSN-8
practical. He explained that if a mother is not at peace with her neighbour but goes to church and receives communion, this is not practical. People should first be at peace with their neighbour, then going to church, telling God you are sorry for things that have gone wrong, and receiving communion, makes sense, and is practical.

Several people concurred. The teaching of religion was PSN-9
said to be often very theoretical. They elaborated by contrasting some people's relationship with God (as expressed in attendance at church and in the performance of ritual acts of worhship), with their behaviour towards their neighbour.

PSN-10 One woman pointed out that even in the Bible it says that before you offer your gifts to God you must go and settle your differences with your neighbours.

PSN-11 Another told of children being punished if they did not go to church on Sunday. She did not feel that the teaching of the church was wrong in relation to Sunday observance. But it was important that it be stressed that people must behave in a way that is good; children must live what they are taught.

PSN-12 Two people focused on an essential unity between one's relationship with God and that with one's neighbour. The first said that one must be able to see God in one's neighbour. PSN-13 It is good to see one's relationship with God as also part of one's relationship with one's neighbour. The second felt that children should not be taught that God is something abstract. They must be able to see God in every other person. If they hurt somebody they must know they are hurting God. If they do not recognise this they will please the God they don't know and will do bad things to the people next door.

PSN-14 Another wanted children to be made aware of the need for integrity. Children must realise that it is the whole person that goes to church, not just the spirit. They cannot leave part of themselves behind when they go to church. They must stay a whole person when they go to church and in their ordinary lives.

IV.2.2.2 Race relations

IV.2.2.2.1 Apartheid in the church, PSR-1

Later someone claimed that there were also elements of separate development in the Church. She drew attention to the fact she was black and the researcher, white. As a result the researcher, as a member of the privileged group, did not see things as she did. S etimes wher a black Christian speaks she is accused of tting into po.itics. This is incorrect. Life must be seen as a whole. Politi ians mak laws that affect one as a person in the street. If a white Catholic talks to a black Catholic and is n.t pen enough to listen to what the black is saying, they will quarrel, even about Christianity. PSR-1

IV.2.2.3 Teacher education

In the occasion at which the interviewer met the staff of St. Peter [illegible], time was limited to the normal length of the mid-morning break. Comments were made concerning the aims of Catholic schools in Kagiso but this discussion was clearly incomplete when the teachers had to return to their classrooms. The subject of the further education of teachers was not raised.

IV.2.3 INDIVIDUAL AND SMALL GROUP INTERVIEWS

IV.2.3.1 Notions of education

In preparation for her interview with the researcher one teacher wrote a brief response to the first two questions asked. Where appropriate, quotations from this document

are included in the following report.

IV.2.3.1.1 Catholics are Christians, PIN-1

One respondent elaborated on the unsatisfactory specificity of the first question posed in the stimulus document that the teachers had been given. This question refers to the aims of a Catholic primary school in Kagiso in 1983. PIN-1

She did not wish to differentiate between "Catholic" and "Christian". If Catholicism were different from Christianity there would be something wrong with Catholicism. Christ told the apostles to baptize in the name of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit. He did not order them to baptize Catholics or Anglicans or anything else. These terms divided people. If someone was in trouble one did not ask whether he was a Catholic or not. What was of importance was only that he was a child of God. We were Christians. Words like Catholic or Anglican were only names we used them because we were human. They were not in themselves significant. As Catholics we had different practices in religion but that was not important to God. Such differences arose because we were human and we tried to compartmentalise things.

IV.2.3.1.2 Good Christians are just, PIN-2

If everyone in South Africa practised true Christianity there would be no injustice. Christianity was simply the spreading of God's love. PIN-2

IV.2.3.1.3 Society and schooling, PIN-3 to 14

This cluster reflects the views of one person on the relationship between schooling and society in South Africa.

This person wrote 'The issue -- is not Catholic education, but the South African Educational System as a whole, which is organised on the principles of separate development, in perpetuating white domination'. PIN-3

She claimed that every place in South Africa had the same system of education. PIN-4

A characteristically Catholic education was not given at St. Peter's and Mafumahadi. Although these schools were owned by Catholics, they did not have a Catholic syllabus. She did not know what a Catholic syllabus should be. However, if, in this school, it were possible to give a truly Catholic education it would not help because these children would eventually have to go back into society and meet the same challenges as everyone else. She said that it was like taking a child, washing it, dressing it in a clean white dress, and then telling it to keep clean while putting it out to play in the mud. PIN-5 PIN-6

However, later in the interview, she expressed the opinion that Catholic primary schools in Kagiso should provide a nucleus of values for a 'New Society' based on justice and truth". St. Peter's PIN-7

> should be a place where children discover the deepest meaning of their lives in order to live according to their personal and collective dignity, accepting responsibility of finding solutions to the situations they are living at the

local, national and international levels.

This had not been achieved. These dreams were "still PIN-8
idealistic, they have not been implemented. Otherwise a
school could be a model for good education practices".

She did not envy whites their education if it simply PIN-9
produced master/slave relationships. The education given
to white children made them inhuman; that given to black
children made them subhuman. If, in the past, in their
homes and schools, good Christian values had been imparted
to white children, the contemporary system of government
would be quite different.

Although she could not substantiate her suspicions it PIN-10
seemed that black education was for black people, to fit
them to obey the orders of their white masters. The white
masters felt the blacks must know enough to follow
instructions in the factory, must know enough to operate
machines, black teachers must know enough to carry what the
white masters wanted carried through to black people.
Teachers were merely instruments of the government,
conveying the values that the government wished to be
perpetuated in order to maintain the status quo.

The black system of education was a hierarchy with the PIN-11
minister of education at the apex and school prefects at the
base. Everyone wore blinkers and conformed rigidly to a
central ideology.

If society were basically just there would be many PIN-12
things to do. In Kagiso there were only two high schools.
She wanted to know where the children who did not get high

school places were supposed to go when they finished primary school. But such matters were not to be given priority at that time because they were not the root cause of the problem of black education. The root cause was one of justice.

This person insisted that children needed, above all else, to be given Christian values. If, throughout society, good values were inculcated in homes, schools and churches, a society would be built that would be quite different from the contemporary one. Everything stemmed from Christian values. If true values were held everything would be righted immediately. PIN-13

But, she believed, a number of false values were conveyed to children at home and in school. PIN-14

IV.2.1.1.4 Some comments preliminary to the clusters on:

Individually achieved status;

Various scholastic and vocational success;

Community service.

Several respondents revealed ways in which they, or others, believed that they could, or did, enhance their self esteem by meriting recognition by their community. Those who were critical of a particular mode often gave examples described in graphic detail. When a method was viewed with approval it could sometimes be discerned only by implication as the interviewee spoke with pride of someone else's

Some informants displayed clearly the correspondence between a particular means of achieving status and their notions of education. In other cases this relationship must be inferred.

IV.2.3.1.5 Individually achieved status, PIN-15 to 23

Most respondents who spoke of status referred to ways in which individuals tried to, or did, achieve status.

One respondent claimed that schools fostered a spirit of competitiveness by awarding marks. Instead of appealing to a desire to serve the people of God better, children were exhorted to work hard in order to gain recognition by earning higher marks than their classmates. In practice a child with good powers of memory got high marks; one with lesser powers received lower marks. This was not good. Children who did less well should be encouraged. Prizes should be given to those who tried hardest. Children should not be rewarded for innate ability alone. PIN-15 PIN-16

She said, in addition, that children who were clever should not be encouraged to think that they were better in some way than slower pupils, and, conversely, the latter should have no sense of inferiority. PIN-17

At home, even mothers told their children that unless they were educated they would not do well in life. African children were encouraged to learn more now in order to earn more later, and so secure for themselves a more comfortable life. This thinking also affected the child's choice of subjects in high school. PIN-18

The true meaning of education had been lost. PIN-19

People were led to think that they were educated PIN-20
because they could study from books and possessed material PIN-21
objects like houses, beautiful furniture, clothes etc. They felt that these things were part of themselves and for that reason they were worthy of respect. Many whites, too, appeared to respect a black only if that person had money. But all this was wrong. Objects are external to oneself. PIN-22 It was important for educated people to remain human to others, to have regard for them.

Another person described the way in which some women PIN-23 displayed their fine clothes. One would put on her new dress and high heeled shoes and go to church on Sunday. There she would receive Holy Communion so that the congregation would see her as she walked to and from the altar. There drew attention to themselves by arriving late, by the service, changing places in church, opening windows noisily and generally causing a disturbance.

and vocational success, PIN-
24 to 28

Their teachers took pride in their pupils' success in the public examination that they sat at the end of their eighth year of school, and of their subsequent academic and vocational triumphs. They seemed to feel that the progress made by their pupils reflected well upon St. Peter's. They had a sense of sharing in these attainments.

Two people delighted in the school's examination PIN-24
results. An elderly woman who had taught at St. Peter's
for many years said that, for as long as she could remember,
St. Peter's had been the best primary school in the area,
had had most first class passes in the Std. VI exam. The
children who attended Mofumahadi also did well, but not as
well as those from St Peter's. However this person said PIN-25
later in the interview that it was somehow not Christian for
there to be a sort of competition between the two schools.

One person rejoiced in the number of scholars who PIN-26
proceeded to high school. Another recalled that teachers PIN-27
from the nearby Mosuphatsela high school had said that
pupils coming from St. Peter's "followed better' than those
from any of the other local schools.

Three spoke with satisfaction of their most illustrious PIN-28
ex-pupils. One, who had left the school in 1966, was a
doctor practising in Natalspruit. Another was studying
medicine at Medunsa. There were several graduates, at
least two BA's and a B Soc Sc. There were teachers and
nurses. Two past pupils were priests. Some had been able
to set up their own businesses in the township as a result
of the education they had received at St. Peter's.
Children schooled at St. Peter's were more likely to become
[illegible] clerks and bus drivers than pupils from other
primary schools.

IV.2.[illegible].1.7 Community Service, PIN-2[illegible] to 3[illegible]

In relation to past pupils, four people spoke of the

importance of service to those in need in the immediate community.

Two friends, interviewed together, queried the value of PIN-29
the achievements of past pupils mentioned by their colleagues.

They had concluded that, at St. Peter's, children learnt only to read, write and reproduce what they were told. In evidence they pointed to some past pupils in whose accomplishments other teachers had delighted. Some ex-pupils were among the best qualified people one could hope for, but one would not choose them as councillors in the location. They did not do things for the Church like caring for the crippled and the elderly, providing for the needs of the community. They used their qualifications for their own purposes. There had been something wrong with their training.

(One of those who had taken pleasure in the academic PIN-30
success of past pupils also expected them to help their parents, the elderly, and other members of the community. In addition this person mentioned that one of the signs of a good citizen was that he worked for himself, for his family, made a living in a proper manner when this was possible.)

The interviewer asked one woman to tell about a past PIN-31
pupil of whom she was proud. This teacher described a young man who had a job in a plastics factory. At work he had many responsibilities and readily took more. The officials in his department always consulted him. His

fellow workers loved him because he was always humble, he worked with them. At home, too, he was never idle. She remarked that at St. Peter's they wanted their pupils as adults to live good lives, give a good example. (This person also spoke with approval of those who had become professionals.) PIN-32

IV.2.3.1.8 Status from association, PIN-33 to '3

Some teachers were affirmed by being teachers in a Catholic school. They drew attention to indicators of the community's appreciation of Catholic schools and themselves in that they were identified with this system.

One person, whose self-respect appeared to be enhanced by being a teacher in a Catholic school, compared Catholic and community, i.e. state, schools. Some community schools were without a principal for as long as three months. Each teacher went her own way because there was no one in charge to maintain discipline. This never happened in Catholic schools. Our Bishop made sure th each school had a headmaster. PIN-33

Catholic teachers were more responsible because they knew that they represented God and that they were sent to look after the little ones. This was why these teachers continued to know the children even after they had left St. Peter's. See PIN-36 PIN-34

In addition, crippled children were treated better in Catholic schools than in community schools. At Catholic schools such children were sent to a doctor and the teachers PIN-35

discussed these children's special problems with the parents. In the community schools such children were often ignored.

Three people who were proud to be members of a caring team of teachers gave a further example of how this care was manifested. They volunteered independently that the teachers at St. Peter's continued to be interested in the children they had taught long after these had left the school. If a member of staff discovered that a past pupil was not continuing his education she wanted to know why. PIN-36

Two teachers, independently, gave evidence of the degree to which the local community valued Catholic schools. One pointed out that parents were prepared to pay high fees. (R24 p.a. for the first child in the family, R21 for the second, and R18 for the third. No charge was made with respect to the fourth or additional children.) The parents of children at Catholic schools also had to buy all the necessary schoolbooks whereas these were given free to pupils attending community schools. Nevertheless many parents were willing to spend this money so that their children could go to Catholic schools. The large number of children in each class at St. Peter's demonstrated its popularity. (She had fifty nine in hers.) Three quarters of the teachers at community schools sent their own children to the Catholic schools. It seemed that these schools gave the children a moral background which enabled them to make progress, to stand by themselves and to work wherever they PIN-37

wanted. Parents told staff members that they were good teachers.

A third person said that parents liked St. Peter's, PIN-38 first, because the teachers taught the children to obey their parents. So the children listened to them and, as adults, themselves became good parents. Secondly, the teachers looked after their pupils. Even after school hours the teachers continued to take an interest in them. She recalled that, when he was still young, the head teacher had ridden round the location on his bicycle. As he came along the street he would see children, at the sight of him, disappearing into their homes to work. (When this interview was given he was sixty-five years old and no longer rode a bicycle.)

IV.2.3-1-7 Some comments preliminary to the clusters on:

Worship and charity;

Formalism;

Prayer and love for one another;

Teach the spirit, not the letter, of the law;

Obedience to parents; and

Converts.

In previous sections, certain of the values under discussion were identified by the informants as "Catholic" or "Christian". Comments regarding these will not be repeated but should be borne in mind as this part is read. Both the emulation or distortion of other Christian values and attitudes are referred to. Some of these values and

attitudes would be typically held only by Catholics or adherents of very similar Christian denominations.

Implicit in the opinions expressed by everyone interviewed was the conviction that one of the prime aims of Catholic schools was to provide moral education, and, specifically, to convey the moral teachings of the Catholic church. No distinctions were overtly drawn between religious values and moral values.

IV.2.3.1.10 Worship and charity, PIL-39 to 41

The respondents who contributed to this cluster all commented on the relationship between worship and love for one's neighbour and stressed the need for children to be taught to integrate these in their lives.

Two friends, interviewed together, drew attention to PIN-39
the [illegible] effects of formalism. They, as children, had been told that it was a mortal sin not to go to mass on Sunday. Some teachers continued to teach this. The impression was given that, no matter what your reasons for staying away, you were a bad person. A child, instructed in this way, might, on a Sunday, try to avoid a task by telling his mother that he must go to church and did not have the time to [illegible] as she wanted. Sometimes children told lies of this kind. If the mother had also been brought up in this belief she might accept his excuse. This was an example of bad judgement.

They agreed with each other that some people had been PIN-40

taught that their sins would be forgiven if they did no more than be present in church during Sunday mass. Some people assumed that it didn't matter how much dirty work was left behind provided one sat in church. They did not go to church to worship, but merely to sit. People should be taught they must first put right what they had done wrong, and then go to church. Children must be taught that they go to mass to worship God.

One of the young women observed that there was much confusion about what was wrong and when it was absolutely necessary to go to Confession before receiving Communion.

One of them depicted a situation of a type that arose PIN-41
periodically in health and religion lessons. The teacher would tell the children that they should not smoke or drink alcohol while they were so young. This might prompt some child to jump to his feet and tell tales about a class mate. This second child would then defend himself by claiming that he had been falsely accused because the two children's families were not getting on well together. In this way families influenced children. If a mother envied the possessions of another, and talked about it, her family rapidly found itself on bad terms with that of the other. On occasion such squarring families attended church regularly and appeared to be among the best. They might even be held up as examples to the community.

IV.2.3.1.11 Formalism, PIL-42 to 43

The people who expressed the opinions presented in this

cluster appear to judge the quality of the religious life of young people by the frequency with which they attend mass and receive the Sacraments.

One person remarked that religious instruction was given in both Catholic and community schools, but in community schools it consisted in dealing with topics in the Bible. Some of their pupils did not go to church once in three months. The same scripture syllabus was followed in the Catholic schools but the teachers in the latter went further than their community school colleagues in that they also taught morals. They set a good example by attending church regularly themselves. The Eucharist was celebrated at St. Peter's each First Friday so the pupils went to mass at least once a month. PIN-42

An older woman commented that the teachers were not receiving sufficient support from the clergy. The Bishop should see for himself what was happening in the township. They needed a priest who was actively involved in the parish. One who undertook building projects and saw to repairs. One who knew the children personally. Two previous parish priests had done such things. One would come to see if the children had been to Confession and who was receiving Communion. He had wanted to know how many were Catholic, and generally looked after them. There were nuns who worked under the Bishop but only one was active in the parish in Kagiso I. She was, in a way, doing priest's work. The staff should be working hand in hand PIN-43

with the clergy and the nuns to build up the community. In this way they could get something done.

IV.2.3.1.12 Prayer and love for one another, PIL-44

A kindergarten teacher encouraged her little ones to pray. PIN-44
She took them across the street to the church during school hours. They did not only pray for themselves but also for others. This taught them to love one another.

IV.2.3.1.13 Teach the spirit, not the letter, of the law, PIN-45

An example was given of error that occurred if a child was PIN-45
taught to follow the letter, rather than the spirit, of the law.

A teacher might tell her class that it was sinful to take things without permission. Later, after school, a pupil might find nobody at home. The child, feeling hungry, might want the food left in the dish on the table but did take it. If its mother did not arrive until late, the child might be hungry for a long time. This was wrong. The teacher ought to help the child to make proper judgements. This child should be able to conclude that it was not wrong to take food under these circumstances.

IV.2.3.1.14 Obedience to parents, PIN-46

Another teacher mentioned that, at St. Peter's, they did not PIN-46
talk to the children about parents who drank too heavily. The children could see for themselves when their parents

drank a lot and did funny things. The children were taught to obey good parents but they did not have to listen to bad parents.

IV.2.3.1.15 Converts, PIN-47

Two mistresses spoke with approval of pupils who were converted to the Catholic faith. Some children who, in primary school, had not been baptized, in later life had joined the church. Another related how parents and children had together entered the church as a result of their association with St. Peter's. PIN-47

IV.2.3.1.15 Cognitive development, PIN-48 to 50

Four teachers spoke of the cognitive development of children.

She said that she had gained the impression that in Black schools the children were treated as receptacles. Much of the time the teacher imparted information that the children accepted passively and regurgitated on demand. Children were led to believe that the teachers possessed that which was important and all they had to do was play it back. This made pupils stupid because it killed their initiative. PIN-48

She gave an example. In Biology the children learnt about the earthworm and the pigeon. This was good because it is good to know about God's creation. But they were taught silly things like a pigeon's got two eyes, a beak and

feathers. What child, she asked, did not already know this. She believed that every person that God created had a unique contribution to make to the family of man. She felt, therefore, that the teacher and the children should together do research on a common subject, should come together and share their discoveries, and come to a consensus. This would make learning much more interesting for children.

She, perscnally, had learnt about things of which she had previously known nothing simply by talking to her pupils. Some children, while playing in the veld behind a shop not far from St. Peter's, had seen a frog hold a snake in its mouth. It held it so tightly that the snake twisted round and round. When the frog eventually let it go the snake did not again attack the frog. Children also learnt from watching television.

Each and every child had something to teach adults. This, however, did not emerge in the course of formal education.

Three teachers spoke of the need for children to PIN-49
associate the concepts they had acquired in the classroom with the world outside it. In illustration one teacher said that when she taught the parts of a flower she expected the children to understand that this referred not only to the flower before them. The children should look at flowers that they found outside and see whether they had the PIN-50
same parts. She also said that children's thinking should not be stereotyped. If they learnt two times three, and

only two times three, they would never know what three times two is.

IV 2.3.1.17 Some comments preliminary to the clusters headed:

Aggression;

Theft;

Eating habits; and

Leadership.

In discussing the aims of a Catholic primary school in Kagoso in 1983 a number of respondents articulated moral values that they did not label as Christian. Many of these, however, were in complete harmony with Christian teaching. A selection is recorded here.

IV.2 3.1.18 Aggression, PIN-51 to 53

One member of staff said that, at St. Peter's, they taught children, from books and by example, to be good citizens of the township. A good citizen will respect himself, will respect property and will respect the law of the government. A good citizen is not warlike, is not a fighting type. PIN-51

An infant teacher tried to teach the little ones to love each other. For example they were taught not to help (hit) each other because that hurt. PIN-52

Another person felt that it was important that children developed the correct emotional habits. She described a child who typically reacted with unnecessary anger. When accidentally bumped by his desk partner this child PIN-53

immediate reaction was to hit out and start a fight. This child might easily grow into a quarrelsome person.

IV.2.3.1.19 Theft, PIN-54

One teacher said that children must not make their own, PIN-54
things that they found on the floor. They must look for the rightful owner. A child who found money, a pencil, or a ballpoint pen on the floor and simply put it in his pocket could easily become a kleptomaniac.

IV.2.3.1.20 Eating habits, PIN-55

She drew attention to another bad habit that was prevalent. PIN-55
Even if they were not hungry some children cried for food when they saw someone else eating. This had to be stopped. Children had to develop right habits towards their bodies. They had to know when to eat, and what to eat.

IV.2.3.1.21 Leadership, PIN-56 to 60

Three people valued leadership qualities in young people.

The first said that one of the main aims of the school PIN-56
was to train children to be leaders in the community. Pupils should be of good character, responsible and trustworthy. They should be physically clean. They should be taught to be loyal to authority.

The second person gave an example of a praizeworthy PIN-57
initiative in the Kagisc community.

In the location there were groups of young working men who had set out to make people aware of how dirty everything

was. On Saturdays they collected schoolboys to help clean up the streets.

This woman also gave an example of leadership in the school setting. PIN-58

One day she had found a group of Std. IV boys standing at the school gate. They were waiting for latecomers whom they told not to be late again. She did not know how these leadership qualities had been instilled. Perhaps in previous classes they had been taught to take initiatives or perhaps they had been inspired by scripture lessons.

A third teacher gave two examples of initiatives that she would encourage. PIN-59

She had left enough work on the blackboard for the children to do while she was being interviewed. However some pupils were not very intelligent and soon became tired and lost interest. If that happened a child might appropriately get up and take control of the class. This child might say, 'I am going to pretend to be mistress. Come. Let's read .

Another example, the children might be playing outside. If a child used bad language another child might reprimand him by saying, No. That's not good. You mustn't say that. You are hurting him'. PIN-60

IV.2.3.1.22 Syllabuses, PIN-61 to 65

Two people, interviewed together, both wanted changes made to the history syllabus. One said that the children were PIN-61

taught the same facts as she had been given as a child. She wanted them to have the truth. She did not know what that truth was. However, it could not be true that the white man came to South Africa and there found the black man. The impression was given that everything important that had been done since that time was done by people other than blacks. The black man was presented as being idle. The white man did many things. The Coloured man did many things. The Indian did many things. But not the black man. The second woman told of a history textbook that she PIN-62
had been given to use in teaching the Standard IIs. It had made her very angry. On one page there were four pictures, each showing a man of a different race and each bearing a caption. They were:

This white man comes from Europe.

This Coloured man is a painter.

This Indian is a trader.

This black man is lazy.

She had burnt the book. She continued to be angry. Her friend remarked that it had done no good to burn the book.

A third person felt unable to judge whether the PIN-63
illustrations were good or bad.

A fourth said that she considered a myth the South PIN-64
African history as it was taught. Africans did not learn their own history. Most history books were written by whites. Some facts were included simply to serve the white's own purposes. If children were taught history properly, if the whole sense of justice was taught right

from the earliest stages, children would be conscientised and things would be put right. She could not describe in greater detail what syllabuses she would prefer.

In response to a question a fifth person said that she did not want to change the syllabuses. Each year she failed to complete all the work set in the syllabus. But she believed that if her class were reduced to a reasonable size (at that time she was responsible for sixty-eight children), and if she had the appropriate equipment, she could finish it. PIN-65

IV.2.3.2 Logistics

Five of the eight teachers interviewed wanted improvements made that were specific to St. Peter's. Attention has already been paid to some of these. For example one person wanted the Bishop to visit his church in Kagiso and she also asked that the parish priest be more actively involved in the affairs of the church. PIN-43

As the end of the previous section it was noted that one person blamed the size of her class and the lack of equipment for her inability each year to cover the syllabus (PIL-65). She elaborated on these and other problems related to a lack of material resources.

IV.2.3.2.1 Finances, PIL-1

She complained that, after having taught at St. Peter's for seventeen years, she still did not know how, or by whom, PIL-1

decisions concerning the school's finances were made. The teachers collected school fees, and, when there was a school trip, bus fares. This money was handed to the headmaster who probably gave it to the school manager. The St. Vincent de Paul Society contributed towards the children's feeding scheme.

Perhaps some of the money was used to pay staff salaries, or to maintain the buildings, or for rent. There was never any money for teaching equipment. There was absolutely no science kit, not even a beaker. She taught science mainly by drawing on the blackboard and by reading from books. The children went to high school never having handled the equipment specified in the syllabus. If a teacher need something she asked the headmaster, who spoke to the school manager. On every occasion the teacher was told later that lack of funds prevented their doing as she requested.

She wanted to know just how one went about getting some money

IV.2.3.2.2 Plant and equipment, PIL-2 to 9

Another teacher felt that she and her class were adversely affected by the poor condition of the fabric of her classroom, and the unsuitability, or absence, of furniture. PIL-2

She said that the block, of which her classroom was part, had been badly built. She hoped that it would be pulled down. (A few months after this discussion it was condemned.) The government was building new schools. She

wondered why they did not provide new buildings for mission schools as well. The Bishop wanted the people to build their own schools but the people did not have the money. The Bishops had to provide.

She insisted on taking the researcher to see her room. The ceiling had collapsed. As a result it became intensely hot in summer and very cold in winter. In addition several window panes were missing.

She said she was old. (At the time she was sixty-two.) After years of teaching under makeshift conditions in church halls she at last had a classroom of her own. But she still did not teach under decent conditions.

It was unsafe to leave charts on the walls overnight as the mischievous could so easily break in and damage or remove them. She kept her charts in the storeroom where the teachers had their tea. PIL-3

At that time she kept the collections of bottle tops and sticks that she used for teaching arithmetic. two big desks that she had been given. PIL-4

She required, for her classroom, a cupboard that she could lock. She wanted to have her teaching aids conveniently at hand. It was too far to walk to the storeroom-cum-staffroom on every occasion that she needed something.

The classroom was equipped with benches that had tables attached. These were quite good. However they were meant for children bigger than those she taught. For some of her PIL-5

smallest children they were much too high. They could not write properly at those tables.

Three more teachers criticized the state of the plant. PIL-6
One said that rain came in through the roof of some classrooms. The other listed some of the facilities that were lacking. They had no staff" (i.e. staffroom), no laboratory, no library. They needed a new room for the Sub. A class.

Two of the above also deplored the lack of teaching PIL-7
aids. One said that teachers had to fight on their own to get charts. The Catholic schools were not helped by the Department of Educati n so they ran out of coloured chalks. They even ran out of white chalk.

Two regretted that the school did not have a PIL-8
duplicating machine.

An ther pers n wanted more recreati nal facilities for PIL-9
chi.iren. The school had a football field and a net.all field but .t i.i n t have tennis courts. Nor iid .t have equipment : r table tennis.

IV.2.3.2.3 Salaries and a subsidised feeding scheme for teachers, PIL-10 to 11

Tw people wished that teachers in Catholic rchools were PIL-10
iaid more.

An exceedingly thin woman wanted a subsidised feeding PIL-11
scheme : r teachers. They di i not have enough money for food so they went hungry. They needed food to make them strong in order to work. She thought that the nine

teachers on the staff could, between them, raise R50 per month. If this sum was matched the teachers could eat well. (A few days after this interview the researcher visited the schools' staffroom-cum-storeroom. One teacher had prepared a substantial meal that she was serving to her colleagues. The thin lady was not present nor, it appeared, had food been set aside for her.)

IV.2.3.2.4 Male teachers, PIL-12

Two teachers deplored the scarcity of male members of staff. PIL-12
The boys needed a young man to run round the soccer field with them and take them for physical education. The headmaster, then 65, no longer felt able to do this. Another person suggested that it might be best if men teachers were in the majority. They were needed to correct the boys.

IV.2.3.2.5 Pupil teacher ratio, PIL-13 to 17

One parent's dissatisfaction with the size of her class has already been referred to PIN-65. She would have PIL-13
preferred to teach not more than thirty children at one time. She felt that the school was grossly understaffed. Nevertheless, one had to bear in mind that there was a general shortage of teachers. Each year four or five students came to St. Peter's to do their teaching practice. Two or three would qualify and begin teaching the following year. By the end of that year they had left their schools

to work in industry. Further, the few who remained teachers would not wish to apply to teach at St. Peter's because it was rumoured that the salaries at this school were lower than elsewhere. However, even if one were found who was willing to join them, she predicted that the manager would say that they could not afford to pay another teacher. There was, in any case, nowhere to put such a person.

PIL-14

She dismissed the possibility of reducing the number of pupils in the school in order to create classes of more manageable size. All the schools in Kagiso were packed full. At that time there were already children who travelled by PUTCO bus to school in Dobsonville and Randfontein. The West Rand Administration Board (WRAB) was erecting more houses in Kagiso so the situation could be expected to get worse.

PIL-15

Another woman volunteered, independently, that the parents would come crying if an attempt were made to cut down the number of pupils in the school. She believed, too, that the only solution was to build more classrooms.

PIL-16

The first of these woman, in contradiction to the impression she had conveyed earlier in the interview, said that if more classrooms were erected at St. Peter's extra teachers could be found.

PIL-17

At this school, which had classes of between forty-three and seventy-six, the number of children per class became something of a joke between the teachers and the researcher. Almost all the teachers complained good-naturedly. Some also referred to this difficulty in

relation to its effect on their own studies and dreams of the future. Only one person dwelt upon this subject at length.

IV.2.3.2.6 Slow learners, PIL-18 to 19

For two teachers, at least, it appeared that the presence in their classrooms of some very slow learners presented a more pressing problem.

One told of a little boy who had spent three years in the lowest class of another school. He was then repeating Sub A for the second time at St. Peter's. She said he would have to proceed to Sub B the following year even though he was not ready for promotion. She also told of two boys who had each spent four years in her Sub A class. In their fourth year with her she had not known what to do with them. One of the other very slow boys who had had useful roles on leaving St. Peter's. One had never passed a grade but had been pushed up into the next class each year. He had simply been allowed to grow. After school hours he would work with one of the nun's in the garden. He became a labourer and was a good worker. The second, Xosa, lived at home with his old widowed father. He was able to wash things out and keep the house clean. PIL-18

This woman said she did not know how to teach such slow learners. They needed a teacher to themselves. PIL-19

IV.2.3.3 Race relations

Two people referred directly to relationships between Africans and whites or spoke of the relative merits of the two groups. Although these opinions were not specifically allied to education they are included here as these attitudes are undoubtedly conveyed in one way or another to the pupils.

IV.2.3.3.1 Achieved and ascribed status, PIR-1

The first teacher remarked in passing that however well qualified an African became he was always considered inferior by whites. PIR-1

IV.2.3.3.2 Individual versus communal values, PIR-2

The second person elaborated ways in which white culture was [illegible] African. Whites had values which were [illegible] whereas Africans had a communal, as distinct from [illegible] value system. In the past there was always someone in a black extended family to adopt an orphan. Further, no-one would [illegible] hunger while there was someone in the neighbourhood who had more than they needed. PIR-2

[illegible] capitalism and traditional healing, PIR-3

She also noted that blacks no longer used certain effective methods of healing. She wondered why they had lost faith in these. PIR-3

[illegible] business was responsible for many erroneous conceptions held in the black community. Before

the white man came the old grannies knew how to cure sickness using herbs that grew in the veld. Whites regarded this as witchcraft and substituted medicines for which one had to pay. The practices that blacks had come to trust were abandoned. It was not being suggested that whites should not have brought western medicine to Africa. She objected only to the way in which whites had treated blacks as if the latter had had no culture of their own.

IV.2 3.3.4 Respect and false values, PIR-4 to 6

This women also observed that whites displayed false values PIR-4
in that they showed respect to black "religious', i.e. priests, brothers and sisters, but did not accord equal respect to black laymen. Sometimes white nuns were not polite to their black sisters' relatives when the latter knocked on the convent door. When this happened the white sister might say, in apology, that she had not known that the visitor was the black nun. This was an inadequate excuse. The old woman was worthy of respect simply because she was human.

The teacher went on to say that she personally would PIR-5
also exhibit false values if she was embarrassed to introduce her mother to a white just because her mother could not speak English. It was not necessary to speak English in order to be educated. Some people thought that a person could only be judged educated if they knew a lot about the white man's way of civilisation. This was

untrue.

She remarked that acts were often of less importance than the intentions behind them. For example, we all drank out of mugs. (The interviewee and the interviewer were both drinking coffee out of mugs at the time.) But, if you gave someone a mug to drink out of because you thought them inferior, that was unacceptable. If someone felt superior to oneself, one could not accept even a small quantity of sugar from that person without feeling demeaned. Whites sometimes complained that, although they gave black people things, black people were ungrateful. If there were real justice there would be no wealthy, nor poor, people. Then we would be able to go to another person's house and say "look, I'm out of sugar. I haven't been to the shop, have you got a little bit of sugar for me?" If you were friends you could borrow from one another without any feeling of being belittled. Whites thought that blacks were happy to accept and accept. If whites were in the position that blacks were in, they would not be glad to accept handouts like that all the time. Whites gave false charity.

Real charity consisted of treating a person with respect.

2 3 4 Teacher education

In this section data are considered under four headings:

Matric and training for pre-school teachers;

Self-confidence in learning;

Ambitions beyond teaching in primary schools; and

Studies directly related to classroom teaching.

It must be stressed that these categories are not mutually exclusive. For example, in the first of the four clusters it is recorded that an elderly woman believed that she was too old to get matric. However, she also felt sure that she could train to be a pre-school teacher. These comments could have been noted equally well under the heading: Self-confidence in learning.

Other themes re-occur but no attempt has been made to cluster opinion that relate to them. For example, it is possible to cluster opinions relating to modes of learning (reading from books, correspondence courses, night schools, face-to-face teaching . This could only be done either by omitting categories that have been included, or by duplicating the mention of some opinions. It was decided that neither of these alternatives is desirable.

IV.2.3.4.1 Matric and training for pre-school teachers, PIT-1 to 9

When interviewing the Kagiso I teachers the researcher did not question them about their educational and professional qualifications. It may be significant that, without having been thus prompted to discuss their own further formal education, six of the eight teachers interviewed spontaneously spoke of formal courses that they felt desirable for themselves or their colleagues. Their focus of interest was, indeed, even narrower than this.

An elderly woman observed that, when speaking of their own further education, the staff of St. Peter's always talked of the training of pre-school teachers or of matric. (It appeared that interviewees did not distinguish between the "Senior Certificate" and "Matriculation Exemption". Both were referred to as "matric".) PIT-1

These six teachers spoke on one or both of these topics.

Two said that they were too old to work towards matric. One was then sixty-five years old and expected to retire on turning seventy. This person advised younger teachers to study privately as they would not have the opportunity to return to college. They should first get matric and then they could even go on to take university courses. The second was sixty-two. Early in her interview this woman said that she was never going to get matric. She explained that, in the [illegible], she had been very ill with jaundice and her memory had been disturbed. After considerable discussion of other matters, this person remarked that she was not too old to learn. When asked what she wanted to do she answered, jokingly, that she would like to sit at home. More seriously, she added that, if it meant a salary increase, she would like to qualify as a pre-school teacher. She loved little ones, loved teaching them. On one occasion she and the principal had attended a lecture in Johannesburg given by a Mrs van Wyk. She would like to hear that lecture again. If she heard it again she thought she could understand it. Mrs van Wyk was better than the PIT-2 PIT-3

others. In Johannesburg the t..ining of pre-school teachers was very good. There were pre-school teachers in creches and they even had a lady supervisor who worked with them.

Another teacher said that St. Peter's should have a pre-school attached to it as the Catholic school in Diepkloof had. A further person appeared to assume that this would be the case in the near future. She said that, although she personally would prefer to teach in a high school, she thought it would be best if all the teachers were trained to take pre-school classes. If only one person were trained, that person might leave the school and someone else would have to take over the pre-schoolers. PIT-4 PIT-5

This woman said that teachers who only had a Junior Certificate should work towards a matriculation. She was [illegible] The previous year she had sat six subjects and had passed Afrikaans and Vernacular (i.e. a Bantu language). She would repeat the four subjects she had failed at the end of [illegible]. She said she had tried very hard but had lacked a good teacher. She mentioned that there were other members of staff who were finding it very difficult to pass matric. She did not use a correspondence course, nor did she attend night school. PIT-6

Two others told of their efforts to get a Senior Certificate. One had passed four subjects and hoped to pass a fifth at the end of the year and so complete the [illegible]. The other had passed seven subjects but had not PIT-7

been awarded her certificate because the grouping of her subjects was wrong. She was then studying history. She intended to write an examination in this subject at the end of the year and so complete the requirements. Neither used a correspondence course or attended a night school.

Three teachers articulated a desire for face-to-face teaching. Two, independently, mentioned conversation they had had with teachers from Dobsonville. The latter were tutored for two hours after school each day. No such assistance was available in Kagiso and was dearly wanted. PIT-8

Another woman said that she wanted to get a matric, and was confident that she had the ability to do so, but as the sole breadwinner in the family, who also had to take care of her children and do all the housework, she found it difficult to sit down and study. She also had a very big class. After she had prepared her lessons and marked books there was almost no time left. She drew attention to the many children who studied full-time towards matric and yet failed. If she, studying part-time, did pass, the certificate would have little meaning as her understanding would be superficial. This was unsatisfactory as she wanted to get a matric in order to have a full background of knowledge from which to teach. PIT-9

IV.2.3.4.2 Self-confidence in learning, PIT-10 to 12

Five of the six teachers who wanted to study towards matric or train as pre-school teachers said either that they believed that they were capable of further study, or gave

evidence of their self-confidence by studying towards the Senior Certificate examination. They provided further evidence of this in accounts of their successes and dreams.

Three people observed that they were accustomed to learning new subjects from books alone. One said that, at school, she had learnt certain subjects for J.C. (Junior Certificate). Later, having left school, she had taken business economics for matric. This was quite unlike any subject she had taken before. PIT-10

A second person pointed out that, when she had been at school, they did commercial arithmetic, but she was required to teach maths. She loved maths but had no foundation. At the Methodist church in Krugersdorp there were whites who helped people to get matric. Among other subjects, they taught maths. Perhaps, in 1984, they would teach maths at [illegible] level and she could take lessons with them. She could also pick it up by reading books and by listening to children who were learning it at high school. She would like to take maths at matric level even though she expected to get her Senior Certificate at the end of 1983 and so did not need an additional credit. PIT-11

A third person said that, every now and then, the syllabus was changed and she had to master the new material by reading about it. On one occasion a new subject, accountancy, was introduced. Although she had known nothing about it at the time, she had decided that she wanted to teach it. Without assistance, she had taught PIT-12

herself all that was necessary. In 1983 she was teaching accountancy up to Std. VI level.

IV.2.3.4.3 Ambitions beyond teaching in primary school, PIT-13 to 18

Three respondents would have preferred not to teach in a primary school. One wanted to be a high school teacher. The other two wanted to go nursing. However, failing this, they would choose to teach in a primary, rather than a high, school.

One said that she had first to get matric. Then she would like to do a course in housecraft and, eventually, to teach in high school. PIT-13

Another told of her attempt to enter the field of nursing education. She had taken up her first teaching post, at St. Peter's, in 1965. At the end of 1967 she had resigned in order to train as a nurse. She had not wanted to remain a nurse in a hospital. She had hoped to become a Sister Tutor. Three years later her mother-in-law had had a stroke. She had had to return home and began teaching at St. Peter's once more. This woman no longer though it likely that she would become a nurse. She thought it probable that she would matriculate at the end of 1983. Then she would like to take university courses. She could not say which courses she preferred as she did not know what options were open to her. If she had sufficient money she would study with UNISA (University of South Africa). If not, she would join Vista. However, when she obtained a PIT-14 PIT-15 PIT-16

degree she would not seek a post in a high school. She had had experience of teaching in a secondary school and had found that she liked teaching small childrer best.

A younger woman also said that she wanted to study with UNISA. She too would not choose to teach high school pupils. She much preferred very small children even though the large classes found in primary schools were sometimes too much for her. If she did not soon get the opportunity to study towards a degree she would like to go nursing in the hope that, at some later date, she would do a university course in nursing. PIT-17 PIT-18

IV.2.3.4.4 Studies directly related to classroom teaching, PIT-19 to 22

The above report of opinions regarding their own further education, expressed by six of the eight teachers interviewed at St. Peter's, reflects little overt interest in the relationship between in-service teacher training and its effect on the teacher's day-to-day classroom performance. This connection was ignored by all but a single individual PIT-9 .

A seventh person spoke only of educational requirements that were related very directly to work in the classroom.

She spoke of the needs of teachers in general. She did not say whether her comments also reflected her own wants.

Speaking with considerable conviction, she said that, PIT-19

above all else, teachers needed courses, based on their religion, which dealt with matters such as justice, so that they could give the children the education that was wanted. The teachers also needed to update their knowledge of academic subjects and teaching methods but these were of lesser importance. In the natural course of events someone would discover a new method, which, if it worked, should be adopted by others Later, further advances could be expected. This was proper but peripheral. Attempts to augment academic knowledge or improve teaching methods did not address the root cause of the problems in education. PIT-20

In addition she urged the provision of lectures in psychology. Children should not fear their teachers. Teachers should be more fatherly and motherly, more understanding of the individual child's circumstances. It should be possible for the class bully to talk to his teacher and obtain help. Another child's naughtiness may be no more than an attempt to obtain the attention he did not get at home. The teacher should show the child how to obtain attention in an acceptable way, for example, through service. Another child, also trying to attract attention, might be spoilt. He should be led to realise that the whole world was not dancing attention to him alone. Children had to be treated as individuals according to their needs. PIT-21

The eighth teacher interviewed at St. Peter's spoke of the pressure of work and ventured nothing more concerning the continuing education of teachers. PIT-22

IV.3 MOFUMAHADI

IV.3.1 PRELIMINARY COMMENTS

Socially, and for the purposes of internal administration, there were fourteen teachers (including the principal) employed at Mofumahadi in 1983. However, for reasons given in 3.5.1 this number differs from the number of teachers officially employed at this school (13,9). For the purposes of interviewing, the staff of this school is regarded as consisting of fourteen members. However, it will be recalled that one black teacher at Mofumahadi refused to be interviewed (3.6 .

Eleven of these teachers were black (nine lay people and two nuns , and three white all nuns). As explained above in IV.1.2 the opinions of the nuns and the lay people are not given in separate sections. Those of blacks are given first IV.3.2 , and those of whites, second IV.3.3 .

IV.3.2 BLACK STAFF

IV.3.2.1 Notions of education

IV.3.2.1 Sexual relationships, MBN-1 to 4

Two teachers, interviewed together, were concerned to establish standards to regulate behaviour between the sexes. These young women were predominantly concerned with the values to be inculcated in girls.

One said that some girls left school at the age of fourteen and soon fell pregnant. They should be married before they got their children. Teachers should talk to MBN-1

such girls, show them the light, tell them how a lady should behave. A lady would be home at 7 p.m. and not wander about at night.

Parents should work hand in hand with the teachers. Parents should not allow girls to walk about the streets in the evening with their boyfriends. They should not allow this until the girls were twenty-one.

In modern times girls went to the clinic and MBN-2
'prevented' i.e. used contraceptives. Knowing that they could not get pregnant, they started to play with their bodies. These girls should be told that their bodies are temples of God.

Girls should refuse to go to bioscope. Some films MBN-3
were not good for children because, for example, they might show a woman who is in love with seven men. Such films imply a sort of forgiveness to get men.

Primary teachers should remember that children MBN-4
observe what is going on. One week a teacher might have one guy. The next week she might be visited by a man with a lighter complexion. During the third week the first guy might come back. The children will then know that the teacher is in love with not just one guy, but with many guys.

IV.3.2.1.2 Conflict and co-operation, MBN-5 to 24

Several black teachers spoke of conflict and co-operation between parents and staff, younger and older teachers, and



to prefer to talk to the principal. A second young person remarked that the principal ought to ask the teacher about her complaints against the children before listening to the parents. MBN-8

One young person, who had stressed the need for co-operation between parents and staff, was asked whether the school had a parent/teachers' association. After consultation with her friends she concluded that it had. None of the three had attended any meeting of this body nor had any further information about it. MBN-9

A much older woman said that when the younger teachers had trouble with the parents they rushed to their mature colleagues for help. They asked them to talk to the parents, to ask the parent's pardon on their behalf, and to explain that they hadn't meant this and that. When this happened the older teachers always intervened on their behalf. MBN-10

This comment was made with some bitterness following a confidential account of a difference of opinion that arose between the adults who accompanied some children on a school [illegible]. The older teachers and the parents sided against the younger teachers. Only the day before the interview one of these parents had said that she would never again go on a school trip with one of these young teachers. (The [illegible] undertook not to recount details of this altercation. MBN-11

This [illegible] said there was something very wrong with MBN-12

the young teachers' attitude towards the children. She, and the woman of about the same age with whom she was interviewed, agreed that the young teachers were irresponsible. When on a school trip they were not concerned to know where the children were at any given moment.

The young teachers also took advantage of the principal's good nature. On one occasion, during a music competition, it was necessary to leave the children's belongings in the bus. As it was feared that clothing and food would be stolen it was decided that the teachers would stand guard. When she came out of the hall to take her turn, she found the principal sitting alone in the bus. The young teachers did not come to relieve those on duty. MBN-13

Later the same day there was a dispute about when the [illegible] should depart. An older woman wanted the Mofumahadi party to leave about 2 p.m., immediately after the children had completed their performance. She was anxious to get the small children home before dark. In addition, trouble seemed to be brewing among a group of loose boys who were standing about. These considerations were brought to the notice of the headmistress who decided that it was time to go. The younger teachers grumbled. The informant believed that the younger women disliked their elders as a result. MBN-14

This person was also disturbed to discover that some of these young girls had also started drinking. (A young teacher also identified this as a problem. She said that MBN-15 MBN-16

some teachers drank with their pupils.)

The elder woman and her friend, of similar age, agreed MBN-17
that there was something very wrong with the training that the young teachers had received. They themselves had only completed primary school plus three years of teacher training. One commented that, given her age and qualifications, she should not be taking higher primary classes because there were younger, better qualified, teachers who could take her place. But the girls who had a Junior Certificate and two years at training college did not speak good English, used poor teaching methods and displayed a bad approach to the children. The second woman remarked that Hlabane was supposed to be a good training college but she did not see much from people who came from Hlabane either. They agreed that they would like to see a return to the old days. They would like to see the old Catholic training colleges like St. Thomas' and Pax College brought back. They gave a really good training.

The three young people previously mentioned accused the MBN-18
principal of having favourites. The three were definitely not among the favourites but they were not alone in this. Others, too, were excluded.

One young person felt that the staff should co-operate MBN-19
more with one another. One said that she had to teach her class needlework in addition to the usual academic subjects. She found this burdensome but she did not get help from teachers who were less pressed than she was. Her friends

agreed that some teachers were required to work harder than others. However, if one of them went to the principal to MBN-20
complain she was not given satisfaction. The principal did not listen sympathetically to the problems of those who were not among her favourites. The three felt that, under their circumstances, it would be unwise to take any further action in relation to such a matter lest the headmistress dismiss them from the school.

A fourth young woman, not in the group of three MBN-21
already referred to, also regretted the lack of co-operation among the staff. She felt that if she knew nothing about a particular subject, e.g. music, but had to teach it, she should be assisted by those better qualified.)

One of the three spoke of other ways in which certain MBN-22
people benefitted. Some favourites were never required to do playground duty. Those favourites who normally did take their turn, had their names removed from the rota when they were 'expecting' pregnant. People who were not favourites did not enjoy this privilege. Further, the whole staff MBN-23
knew that favourites received bigger birthday presents than non-favourites. A favourite might be given R10, and a non-favourite R2.

It appeared to these interviewees that this situation MBN-24
could not be changed. In their opinion staff meetings should provide a forum for the discussion of problems such as these but they did not. They said that if a teacher was young and new to the school she was expected to remain silent. If she attempted to participate she was told that

she should not raise that question at a staff meeting.

IV.3.2.1.3 Co-operation and comparisons between community and Catholic schools, MBN-25 to 30

One of the young women who wanted greater co-operation with her colleagues also wanted a mutually supportive relationship between teachers in Catholic and community (state) schools. She wanted to be free to consult a teacher in a community school who was particularly good at, say, Afrikaans. At that time this type of assistance was not being given although she believed that the teachers in the state schools would be willing to contribute. The teachers in the Catholic schools also had expertise to offer. Further, she felt that Catholic and community schools should take part in the same singing competitions. At that time the Catholic schools vied with each other whereas the state schools took part in contests organised by the Transvaal United African Teachers' Association (TUATA). Although the contests were at different times they all sang the same songs. It would be best if the state and the private schools mixed more. MBN-25 MBN-26

Two older teachers also spoke of co-operation between teachers in these two categories of schools. MBN-27

One said that from time to time, the teachers in the 'government' state schools would receive a circular saying that the needlework inspector would be present at a particular venue at such and such a time. The teachers of sewing from the surrounding state schools would then take

their children's work to this inspector for comment. The Catholic teachers never received these circulars and consequently she felt deprived. Sometimes the teachers from the Catholic schools would hear about the forthcoming event from a friend in the community schools and would present themselves to the inspector even though they had not been invited.

Another woman was kept informed of such forthcoming events by her daughter-in-law who taught in a community school. This older person resented having to rely on informal channels of communication and on having to ask permission to avail herself of such opportunities. MBN-28

There were more comments that expressed a desire to share in the advantages enjoyed by the state schools, and annoyance at being excluded.

One person had read in the newspapers that there was to be free compulsory education for the children of Kagiso. She queried whether this education was indeed free for all, or even for some children, in the area. It appeared that free education was to be available only for those pupils attending state schools. The little ones, in Grade A to Standard II, were given textbooks which teachers distributed at the beginning of the lesson, collected again later, and kept at the school. Books were not given to the children at Mofumahadi. Furthermore, even the parents of children in the state schools had to buy the necessary stationery. MBN-29

It emerged subsequently that the state did, on occasion, donate some textbooks to Mofumahadi. These were MBN-30

old books, no longer required by the state schools. In the community schools Grade A pupils used the 'Get Ready" books from January until March. These books contained patterns that the children had to follow. The infants also had to create their own patterns. The Catholic schools were never given books like these.

7.3.2.1.4 D.E.T. control of Catholic schools, MBN-31 to 36

Some people wanted less control of Catholic schools by the Department of Education and Training (D.E.T.).

Two women agreed that it would be best if the children learnt both English and Afrikaans from their first days at school. This had been the practice when they had been young. However they had been told by the D.E.T. that Afrikaans should only be introduced in Standard I. The level of Afrikaans in the school was very low as a result. MBN-31

In the higher classes the syllabi were changed frequently, sometimes each year. Syllabuses should remain the same for five years at a time. They had been told that the general level of education was being improved but this was not so. It was deteriorating. MBN-32 MBN-33

A young teacher remarked, in another context, that it was difficult to produce change in Catholic schools because they were all controlled by the state. It would be otherwise if they formed an entirely separate unit. MBN-34

One wished that the Bishops would appoint school inspectors for the Catholic school system. She did not MBN-35

welcome state inspectors.

Another person felt exploited by the D.E.T. Each year MBN-36
since the early 1960's she had been required to mark Std. VI examination papers coming from schools in the circuit extending from Soweto to the Magaliesberg. She was about to begin this annual task once again. She would have to work from 8 a.m. until 4 p.m. each day for two to three weeks. Her only recompense would be a midday meal. She would not be paid a penny for her work. A teacher from St. Peter's was also going to take part.)

IV.4.2.1.5 A comparison between community and Catholic schools in relation to socialization and religious education, MBN-37 to 46

Black teachers were critical of the socialization of community school pupils and the religious education provided for them. Several drew attention to the superiority of Catholic schools in these matters.

One woman had observed the behaviour of children from MBN-37
community schools on sports days. They were very rude, insulting each other in front of teachers and nuns. She felt that it was important that, in Catholic schools, children were taught not to be like this.

Another woman remarked that, in Catholic schools, MBN-38
children, in particular those receiving religious education, were taught how to react to insult. If someone called them a vulgar word they were not to answer back but just to leave them.

Further, children were taught to talk decently to all MBN-39

adults, not only to their parents and teachers. They learnt to behave politely.

They were also taught to be obedient to their elders MBN-40
outside of the family. If a mature person, unrelated to the child, asked her to undertake a task, she was not to refuse. She was not to excuse herself by claiming that she was already involved in carrying out her mother's instructions. She was to do as requested and then return to her mother's business.

A much older person noted that one could tell that a MBN-41
group of children came from a Catholic, and not a community school, by their demeanour. They were quieter and more attentive. Her friend also perceived differences in their MBN-42
behaviour between children from Community school pupils were wild, they did not have the same reverence as the children from Catholic schools.

Another person said that in the community schools MBN-43
little attention was paid to the teaching of religion. The study of the Bible was treated in much the same way as any other subject. For example, Old Testament stories were told but the children were not led to appreciate that the God present to the people in the Old Testament is also present today, the God who does everything for us.

A young teacher remarked that religion was taken MBN-44
seriously in Catholic schools. The whole school prayed together before school, during the mid-morning break and at lunch time. They also attended mass during school hours on

occasion. In the community schools they only had a morning assembly, and, of course, church on Sunday.

On separate occasions, two young women volunteered MBN-45
that, on Mondays, the staff of the Catholic schools asked the children whether they had been to church the previous day and what they had learnt there. If a child had not been to mass they asked for an explanation. They approved of this and decried the absence of this practice in community schools.

An older person said that some of the teachers in the MBN-46
community school did not go to church. Some of the young men never went. She asked how such people could teach children about God, and clearly doubted that this was possible.

IV.3. Further observations concerning socialization and religious education, MBN-47 to 61

When comparing community and Catholic schools, numerous informants inevitably articulated or at least reflected, their own attitudes towards the socialization of children and their religious education. Further comments on these two topics are recorded below. It would appear that informants did not distinguish sharply between them. Therefore no attempt to separate them as made here.

In the view of one middle aged woman, in 1983, the MBN-47
Catholic primary schools of Kagiso had two aims. The first was to see that the children were in good Catholic families.
(Another woman described a type of problem that arose in MBN-48

this connection. She said that sometimes parents drank a lot and fought in the presence of the child. This did not provide a good environment for the child.)

The second aim was to see that the children were MBN-49
properly brought up. She was asked to elaborate. She said that when a baby was born it should be baptized. Later the child should be taught how to pray. The chil should be taught to go t urch every day to pray at h me. The child must be taught to resp ct others. When a adult entered the r m the hi.d must stand up. He must learn how t greet people. He must show his respect for all the adults in h. ality by obeying them. For example, if a child's neighbour asks him to go on an errand to the shop, he must

The themes she mentioned, i.e. attention to the sacraments and their f rm t w rsh p; and the according of proper ty w rd, fo.ar.d and b lience; were referred to by several of her colleagues.

Her friend said that in Catholic schools children were MBN-50
taught to say grace before meals and to pray in the morning and in the evening. However children didn't learn this easily and had to be reminded every day.

A third person said that, in the course of each school MBN-51
day two or three times, urged her infant class to go to mass.

A young person believed that unless teachers heard mass MBN-52
on Sunday themselves it would not be right for them to

Author Hunter L W G
Name of thesis Teachers'perceptions, educational policy and the planning of inset; a study in the Catholic Primary Schools of Soweto 1988

PUBLISHER:
University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg
©2013

LEGAL NOTICES:

Copyright Notice: All materials on the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg Library website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

Disclaimer and Terms of Use: Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the Library website.