

https://dspace.org/

The great interpreter: images of O.R. Tambo

Callinicos, Luli

1994-07-13T06:18:02Z
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/7730

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

CALLINICOS

DEMOCRACY



POPULAR
PRECEDENTS
PRACTICE
CULTURE

13 - 15 JULY 1994

UNIVERSITY OF THE WITWATERSRAND

HISTORY WORKSHOP

THE GREAT INTERPRETER:
IMAGES OF O.R. TAMBO

Luli Callinicos
History Workshop
University of the Witwatersrand

AFRICANA

THE GREAT INTERPRETER: IMAGES OF O.R. TAMBO [1]

Luli Callinicos

'He saw himself as an interpreter, as an implementer of collective decisions - decisions which came from a number of levels throughout the movement.' Chris Hani, 30.3.93.

In the last two decades, South African historiography has tended to focus on the formation of social structures and experiential history 'from below'. In their case studies, social historians, critical of the undue leverage ascribed to powerful and famous individuals in earlier national and liberal political histories, emphasised until recently the ways in which leaders were thrown up by the circumstances of struggle. They tended to avoid examining the reverse - the impact of individual leaders on members of social and political movements and the extent to which popular perceptions of leadership assist movements to survive and grow.[2]

This paper is concerned with the social construction of leadership through images of a national leader. It traces the making of Oliver Tambo as a leading role model for the African National Congress during the exile years. The paper begins with a brief review of Tambo's formative years drawn from his autobiography of his early years and touches on the extent to which his presentation of leadership was drawn from these experiences.[3] The paper will then consider the perceptions of Tambo's management of the two *repertoires* of rural Pondoland and Christian missionary education, and attempt to show how he served as an example to members of the ANC liberation movement.[4] I do not in this paper explore the impact of revolutionary discourse on Tambo's image, nor shall I address the objective validity of these perceptions of Tambo.[5]

-----000-----

Oliver Tambo was born in 1917 in Kantolo, a rural village near the town of Bizana, Pondoland. Although traditional and rural, the Tambo family themselves were relatively well travelled. By the turn of the century, the family of Nqwatsho and his Christian wife, Mabhwane Emma Tambo, of the Amachi tribe south of Harding in the Natal Colony, had moved away from home. They journeyed over the Engeli Mountains, crossing the Umtamvuna River into Eastern Pondoland in search of a new home.

Sparsely populated Pondoland, the last chiefdom in South Africa

to remain independent, was known to have green, fertile and available land: it was only in 1894 that Paramount Chief Sigcau was obliged to agree - not by conquest, but through indirect pressure - to allow his territory to come under the protection of the Cape Colony. The annexation of Eastern Pondoland was followed by the imposition of a hut tax, to be paid in cash, meant to encourage at least one member of each homestead into wage labour.

The annexation of Pondoland had taken place within Tambo's parents' lifetime. It was an act that reflected the ills of dispossession afflicting South Africa as a whole. Tambo's father was acutely aware of the hostility of the British takeover, and the naming of his son 'Kaizana', after Britain's enemy during World War One, made a pointed statement. But colonisation also offered new opportunities. For a number of years, the new labour system served to enrich the homestead economies; returning wage labourers were able to buy cattle and so increase their stock. At the same time, the new economy foreshadowed the corrosion of their culture and cohesion. Ultimately, Oliver Tambo was to devote his life to overturning the system of racial capitalism that colonialism had spawned.

The Tambo homestead was unusually large: 'a big kraal, as distinct from a two-hut home, of which there were many'. The homestead consisted of the paternal grandparents, their three sons, and their wives and children. (The eldest, a daughter, had married and moved away.) Oliver's father, Mzimeni, who was not a Christian, had four wives. However he married his youngest wife, Lena, only after his second wife died in labour. Oliver Tambo recalled that Mzimeni's family relationships were harmonious. There were ten children. Mzimeni was comfortably His father owned at least 50 cattle at one time, several fine horses and an ox-wagon.[4] These resources led to trading and transport opportunities. Mzimeni was not literate - 'my father had not seen the inside of a classroom'. His prosperity was largely due to his own enterprise. Shrewd, creative and quick to seize an opening, Mzimeni sought and gained employment as an assistant salesman at the nearby trading store. This exposure to a more commercial economy taught Mzimeni a number of skills and widened his world.

Two women in his life, his mother, and his third wife, as Christians, also opened up new horizons. Oliver's mother, a sociable and energetic person who could read and write, established her home as the local headquarters of the Full Gospel Church. Tambo recalled occasions when there were large, bustling gatherings of worship in his mother's hut. Eventually, perhaps because of her influence, Mzimeni himself converted to Christianity, and had all his dependents baptised.

In that somewhat large and busy homestead, Kaizana had an active, happy and traditional childhood. In infancy, he had undergone ukuchaza, as was customary in some clans: the scarification of his face, either to ward off or cure childhood illnesses.[7] (Tambo's facial scars were a distinctive attribute often noted in his international travels, and regarded by some as a rather

romantic and exotic symbol of the modern African revolutionary.)

From as early as three or four years old, the little boy was learning the essential skills of the rural economy, and the practical discipline that went along with it. Tambo recalled the duties of the small boys in some detail, describing their somewhat onerous responsibilities in tending the calves, and ensuring that the animals were permitted to suckle only after milking. As the boys grew older and were able to accept more responsibility, they were given the task of herding the cattle. The young Tambo also took pride in taking responsibility for tasks which helped him to emulate grown men. He learnt to plough; he mastered the difficult craft of spanning a team of oxen, controlling their speed, particularly on a slope in wet weather. He taught them to obey commands 'in such a way as the whole team pulls together'.

These accomplishments were facilitated by both the extended family and the rural community, which functioned as a coherent whole. In the homestead economy, work was relevant and rewarding. Unlike labour in industrial society, it was not separated from home or community. Herding, like other productive activities, would be done in groups, and would include social interaction and a great deal of enjoyment.

Work was also a co-operative exercise with adults, and work parties were frequently organised:

> 'All the houses combined, not only in the ploughing but also in the weeding process. With fairly big fields, the neighbours were invited to come on a particular day for a whole day's weeding. We would have beer, and other drinks would be provided. We would perhaps slaughter a goat or a sheep. These were thrilling because there were so many people involved. We moved from work on a particular home's field to the next one, and with this kind of giant action this facilitated the task and made it less strenuous.'

Those who had the means were expected to aid poorer families. 'What assisted in our case was that we were altogether a very big family,' recalled Tambo. He remembered that from time to time, his father would slaughter a cow in order to provide a feast for the community, for meat was a scarce commodity and therefore a luxury.

Like the festive beer drinks, which Tambo also remembered with pleasure and nostalgia (despite his own strict abstinence from alcohol), these feasts were a way of distributing some of the luxuries in life throughout the community, including the needy. The community respected those who in prosperous times would share their good fortune, and status was accorded to those who shared with the community, or who could benefit the community.

In a society where everyone knew almost everyone else, group pressure was a strong form of discipline. The Amapondo, like many polities in southern Africa, had a consensus approach to

decision-making. Between headmen and the community, as well as between chiefs and the people, there was a balance of power.

> 'Consensus was all important... After thorough discussion, the chief and his advisers would get the feel of the meeting. Opponents of the plan were encouraged to speak out because people should not be like a stream that flows in only one direction.
>
> It is clear that chiefs relied on their concillors to prevent them from acting contrary to popular will... It was in the meetings of the ibandla [advisers] that the chief was able to test the loyalty of the people to him. If he found that the opinion of the councillors was rejected on many occasions, then he had to do something about the composition of his council. It meant they were no longer a yardstick by which he could test the loyalty of his people'.[4]

This supremely prudent practice of Transkeian and other African leaders - that is, of never straying too far away from their constituencies - was to play a profoundly important role in the ANC leadership of Tambo's generation.

But customs and values were not unchanging. A cash economy had already begun to infiltrate the area. Regularly, young men from Kantolo would take the 25-kilometre trip to Bizana, where there was a recruitng station for the coal and gold mines in order to earn money for taxes. Lobola, too, was apt to encourage wage labour. All of Oliver's older brothers became wage labourers, both the traditionalists, such as Willy and Zakele, and the younger Christians such as Wilson and Alan. The migrant labour system was indeed an integral part of the homestead economy, and became even more important when Mzimeni's fortunes began to decline in the late 1920s.

Migrant labour also brought risk and adversity. The health of Wilson, Oliver's older brother, was ruined when he contracted TB in the compounds of the sugar plantations and had to return home, permanently unfit for strenuous work. In about 1929, the Tambo family suffered a major tragedy. Oliver's uncle and his older brother Zakele were killed in an underground fire in the Dan Hauser coal mine. Aside from the heartbreak and personal anguish, the deaths of two healthy and productive members of the homestead was a severe economic blow, and further hastened the decline of Mzimeni's prosperity. The tragic loss remained deeply imprinted in Oliver Tambo's mind.

Yet, despite these hammer blows, Mzimeni Tambo persisted in seeing the value of western education. Working in the trading store for many years, Mzimeni had been impressed by two aspects of Mr Mountjoy the white trader: that his learning enabled him to run an independent business and keep its books; and that his relative wealth gave him power and status:

> 'People went to him to buy. He had a car, horses - he was

> a reference point to the community - and he had servants. In general he was a chief in his own right. He certainly was something above the level of ordinary people. It was exactly this difference of levels that my father was targeting, in insisting that his children should go to school'.

Mzimeni himself had bold ideas. He developed, as we have seen, his own capacities in the form of a transport business and built up the resources in his homestead, until the reversal of his fortunes. In the late 1920s, Mzimeni began to experience financial difficulties. At that time, Pondoland homesteads in general were hit by an increase of direct taxation through the Native Taxation and Development Act of 1925, which imposed a one pound poll tax on every African male aged 18 and over. In addition, there was a host of other burdensome levies designed to propel peasants into a cash economy and finance the administration of Pondoland.' Even for full-time wage earners, the taxes were hefty amounts: for homestead economies, they were prohibitive without an external source of cash.

In Pondoland, the years of 1926 and 1927 were also bad years in market production.[10] The Bizana district was equally affected, and Mzimeni's transactions in transport suffered. Mzimeni began to sell off some of his stock, and eventually also his ox-wagon, the means of his transport business. The Tambo homestead as a whole was in distress. Mzimeni's brother and older sons were obliged to find work in Natal - three of them, as we have seen, in the coal mines, and one in the sugar plantations. Oliver could not fail to be affected by this shift to wage labour and was keen to make his own contribution to the family fortunes.

> 'My age group, some of them, had left their homes, crossed the Umtamvuna and went to Natal to work - some in the plantations. And some were coming back, big stout chaps already. They were young men, and I was still going to this school. So I began to think in terms of leaving, escaping to go and work there as a garden boy or even in the sugar plantations. I would work there and bring back money to my parents - that's what everyone else was doing.'

One of Oliver's slightly older herd mates, Tshongwana Mchitwa, for example, was already preparing to go to work in the Natal sugar fields.[11] But just as young Tambo was waiting for an opportunity to look for a job, a visitor to his father's homestead brought a turning point in his life, and within weeks, Oliver was enrolled in an Anglican boarding school. Never to return home for more than a few weeks at a time, his life and outlook were radically altered. In less than six years both his mother and father had died. His exclusive village identity had come to an end, although an enduring part of it was to remain with him till the end of his days.

The collective and kinship values of his society were imbued in the young Tambo not only by the care of his parents, but also by his homestead culture. As a member of a large extended family,

the little boy, since infancy, had had to share his mother with many others.[12] Unlike most western children in a nuclear family situation (particularly in middle-class families), little Kaizana did not have the exclusive attention of his mother, and it is likely that he had had to sacrifice some of his own sense of individual identity, a part of his own ego. But at the same time, the little boy was compensated by having access to other mothers, aunts, uncles and older brothers and sisters.

The child's growing sense of himself was tied up with his extended family, with his neighbours and with his community. The day-to-day life-style, and hence the value-system, was one of sharing. 'The wider family', Erik H. Erikson has observed, 'permits a closeness, often expressed physically and affectively in a true "togetherness", deeply touching and yet somewhat disturbing to the Western observer. To hurt or abandon the uncle or the aunt or the older brother or older sister, therefore, can provoke a peculiar or lifelong guilt; and to be hurt by them, forever gnawing resentment.'[13]

Tambo's rural, Mpondo culture had been imprinted on him in his formative years, and these influenced aspects of his approach to social relationships and decision-making. He developed a style which was correspondingly recognised by all those members of the ANC who had been similarly raised. Many informants emphasised Tambo's collective and cooperative values, and in some cases attributed these to rural, traditional society. Phyllis Ntantala, for example, while a Christian and a member of the African elite, employed the rural idiom of the customary, extended family in assessing Tambo's relationship with the ANC members.[14]

> 'And here he is with all these people, and O.R. is able to be father to all of them; and why was he able to be father to all of them? Because to me, I think he was even-handed. He was a father as I know him in an African family, who has all these children in the home, interested in each one of them and be there as a protector of each one of them and interested in the welfare of each one of them.
>
> Again what sort of father is able to do that? Now what comes to mind is a polygamous family; it's only a father who through his bearing and his dignity can bring peace in his home. To me it is only such a father who can do that and who can bring peace in a big household; different people, different personalities. He can only do that to me if he himself has what we call 'Ubuntu' in Xhosa. You know 'Ubuntu' is an all embracing thing where it means generosity, it means love, it means humility, it means dignity, it means grace; all these that I am mentioning are embodied in, when you say a person is 'Umntu' that means one has all these qualities I have mentioned. And to me O.R. was able to do what he did because he has that.'

References to Tambo's father image were frequent. Jacob Zuma, for example, recalled:

> 'It was not just him being President; it was how he related to each and every one of us. If you came to raise an issue with O.R., you were certain that at the end you are not going to go away dissatisfied. He is going to give you time... We went to him with political and personal problems. You knew you were talking to a father here. He would get to you the correct advice and he would never abuse the confidential discussion, irrespective of the level you were in the organisation.'[15]

There were many other similar comments. Penuel Maduna, Deputy Minister of Home Affairs who in exile had been appointed by Tambo to participate in the drafting of the Harare Declaration, recalled how Tambo encouraged him to further his studies, took an interest in his progress, and treated him 'like his own son'.[16] Lindiwe Mabuza spoke of Tambo's qualities which 'made one try to emulate him'; of his 'concern -the father in him'.[17] Gertrude Shope, executive member of the Women's League of the ANC, recalled that

> 'even the young women who had problems went to him to discuss their personal problems with him. He always had time for them. He was that type of a person. He was a very, very warm somebody'.[18]

Andile Ngcaba, a young member of Umkhonto we Sizwe, respected Tambo as 'a model' for young soldiers to follow. [19] Ismael Abu-Baker, assigned to the M.K.'s elite 'Special Operations', Rusty Bernstein and Ronnie Kasrils, who both gave political education classes in the camps, confirmed the significance of Tambo to the young cadres.[20]

Mzwai Piliso, Chief of Security (and implicated by the Douglas Commissiom in the camp abuses) understood the implicit duty of the leadership to play this paternal role, particularly after the sudden increase of the post-1976 intake. The young newcomers, he said:

> 'had to go and train militarily, with no experience. Undeveloped. Some who had been dependent up to then on their mothers... There was nobody to pamper you, and some of them were so much in need of their parents, to an extent that you might find that many of them or most of those in Angola don't call me comrade, they say 'Tata'.'I encouraged them to say 'Tata' because they needed a Tata and it was also if they had problems, it would be difficult to go to a commander, but it would be easy to go to Tata and say I have this problem... So that in fact I think the numbers that got mental breakdowns were not as many as ought to'.[21]

These were the young cadres who, according to a number of witnesses interviewed, testified that Tambo stayed in the camps with them in sleeping bags on the ground, eating their food, talking to them individually, remembering their names and problems.[22] Chris Hani, using the rhythms and the oratory identifiable in a seasoned political activist, recalled Tambo's

support and dedication in the preparations for the first detachment to be despatched through hostile Rhodesian territory in order to reach South Africa 'to build the underground'. Tambo was, he maintained:

> 'an integral part of... preparations. And we report [sic] to him. He was totally involved in the whole military strategy of preparing for the trained combatants to go back to South Africa. He would be involved in the smallest details. Sometimes when he had the time he would go with us towards the Zambezi River and he was convinced that this had to happen. He was the driving force behind these activities... I become amongst those who were selected for this task... Tambo becomes the brains behind this, the organising spirit behind it. He comes to stay with us... And ultimately then in June or July we crossed the Zambezi River. Tambo is there up to the last moment of crossing. He actually goes to the Zambezi River, together with us. We spent a few days on the banks of the Zambezi River, about two kilometres from the river and Tambo stayed with us, slept there with us, in the open, not even in tents. We were just sleeping in the bush. And this convinced us again of the type of leader that Tambo was. A practical leader, an exemplary leader, and one who was prepared to share the hardness of this very difficult and demanding task with his soldiers.'[33]

In an obituary for Tambo, Neo Moikangoa, personal assistant to Tambo wrote that 'he was a father to me... [He] loved and doted on youth and youth reciprocated the feeling more than fully. More often than not their affection for him bordered on adoration'.[34]

In a subsequent interview he amplified:

> 'Well, we were that youth I was talking about. Joe Nhlanhla who is head of security and intelligence, Thabo, Pallo, Chris, Max Sisulu, me. He would find us wherever we were and would actually sit down with you and sound you on various issues... and he left you with the feeling that this chap takes me seriously, you know, there must be something to me after all. He just genuinely liked to be with young people.'[35]

That Tambo had the reputation of paternal concern and wisdom was verified even by MK dissidents, embittered by the failure of the ANC leadership to take up their grievances. With regard to the 1984 mutiny against participating in the Angolan civil war, Bandile Ketelo and four others wrote:

> 'An illusory idea still lingered in the minds of the M.K. combatants that most of the wrong things in our organization happened without the knowledge of Tambo, and that given a clear picture of the situation, he would act to see to their solution'.[36]

They went on to declare that their image of Tambo was ind[illegible] an

illusion, because he failed to take up their call for an immediate transfer to the 'main theatre of war in South Africa' and for the immediate suspension and investigation of the ANC's security apparatus.[27] The five dissenters claimed that with the on-going bombings of ANC quarters in frontline states, the assassinations of ANC members, and the discovery of a considerable number of enemy infiltrators and informers, an atmosphere of 'internal-enemy-danger-psychosis' had developed. Consequently, the leadership 'clubbed together with the security' against the most vocal of the rank-and-file critics. Tambo, they alleged, as head of the external mission and the military, failed to act on their demands.

Collective leadership was an ANC tradition, and this example was perhaps an illustration of one of the disadvantages of its consensus approach, which in times of crisis could be cumbersome and not necessarily progressive. To most of the ANC, Tambo was honoured as the upholder of the the collective and consensus ethic. 'He felt he was leading a movement,' explained Chris Hani, 'he was remaining there as a leader because the people actually agreed with him'.[28]

This image of Tambo was consistent with one of the roles generally expected of a chief, particularly, according to Monica Hunter and W.D. Hammond-Tooke, in the relatively acephalic social structures of the Transkei. 'A basic dictum of Cape Nguni political theory was that the chief should always defer to the general opinion of his council'.[29]

But Tambo had not always held his high rank of President of the ANC. He had been appointed to head the ANC's external mission in 1960 by the then President, Chief Lutuli. In the early years, particularly before the arrest and conviction of the internal leadership, he was seen largely as simply the chief ambassador of the ANC, whose task it was to gather support for the movement internationally. In post-colonial Africa, however, the ANC was not particularly highly regarded; it was the sharp nationalism of the Pan Africanist Congress', with its slogan of *Africa for the Africans*, 'which quickly captured the mood'[30] rather than the non-racial (or rather multi-racial) viewpoint of the ANC. Tambo's status in the region, therefore was low-key, though respected.

When the ANC decided to take up arms, Tambo was designated by the internal base to lead its military wing in exile. The plan was for him to facilitate short periods of training for the cadres before they returned to South Africa to take up the armed struggle. Another of Tambo's tasks was to secure material support for the members in exile. In the early 1960s, 'there were very little resources, we were shipped out of countries because of our stand in Angola, [ANC members] were living in terrible conditions, we were living in camps. Those were difficult years'.[31] It was virtually only the eastern bloc which provided training and education and a modicum of food, clothing and arms.

The return of the cadres to South Africa failed to materialise.

The Lutuli Detachment engaged in number of battles in Rhodesia, losing ten to twelve people, then moved tactically into Botswana, where the remaining soldiers were captured and sentenced to two years' imprisonment. Some years after the hapless Wankie expedition, Tambo called for a conference at Morogoro in 1969, (the first such general consultation in exile) to deal with some of the cadres' grievances. One of the most articulate and angry critics was Chris Hani:

> 'I had become disillusioned with the style of leadership of the ANC. After I had come out of prison from Botswana, I had a feeling, call it subjective if you like, that there was little concentration on building the ANC outside and people were really so involved in international work... I felt that after we had crossed, there was not immediate follow-up, and I used very strong words, too. I felt that we did not get proper support, and I didn't think that when we came back there was an interest in our experience and what we had done and what was the next step. We stayed there literally waiting... And we waited, we didn't know what was the next step. We were in that state of limbo, that state of suspense, and I and others could not stomach it. We blurted out; we blew our tops.'[11]

It is worth noting that in his explanation, Hani avoided blaming Tambo directly. This seemed to be a common characteristic amongst ANC informants; perhaps this was partly because of the necessity of absolving the leader in order to protect the integrity of the movement as a whole; and partly because Tambo's personal qualities in many cases were able to defuse dissatisfaction. 'If the young people would have problems,' maintained Jacob Zuma,

> 'they would have problems with everybody but not with O.R. They could have problems with the leadership but not with O.R. and he commanded respect. When he said his final word, nobody would go against, everybody would agree'.[12]

Chris Hani remembered the responses of the leadership to his attack on them:

> 'Some of our leaders got angry. I think people generally were not used to being criticised. They thought that we are just going to applaud everything they did and say "Hallelujah!" I think the leadership at that time was not ready to get criticism from underlings, from subordinates... And some of them wanted us to get punished... But again it was the intelligent leadership of Tambo that again brought us together, and we came back... [I]f we had not spoken out, in my own view, there would have been no Morogoro Conference. I stand to be challenged on that, but our criticism created a crisis within the movement which jolted them up... and this was the first time that there was a debate on strategy and tactics within the ANC - the need to build... the pillars of our struggle: the mass movement inside the country, the underground movement, the international, without concentrating on one

one pillar of the struggle.'[34]

Ultimately, Hani believed, it was Tambo's recognition of the need for evaluation, and his conciliatory response, that unified the vast majority of the representatives at the conference:

> 'I must say again Tambo handled the situation properly. He moved away from punitive, vindictive action to an understanding that what is primary is building our organisation and not just punishing people who criticised our movement.'[35]

One of the resolutions of the Morogoro Conference was to admit non-Africans in the ANC. Here again, Tambo had to deal with the criticism of those who were opposed to this decision. They felt that the ANC was losing its African character. Subsequently expelled by the National Executive Council (NEC), the eight leaders of the group, identifying themselves as 'African nationalists',[36] published a document censuring the ANC for its weak-kneed strategy. They depicted Tambo as a duplicitous leader who had seemed to accept their arguments in private discussions, but had ultimately sided with the NEC. Tambo, they wrote, 'had failed to take a firm stand and give a firm lead on even the most fundamental issues the ANC has faced abroad ... significantly on the interference of the SACP'.[37]

The document went on to assert:

> 'Oliver Tambo, his hand always clutching to [sic] a passport, always on the point of flying off somewhere, makes a remarkable contrast to a leader like Samora Machel, who during the struggle was seen always having a gun slung over his shoulder, leading his men into the fight'.[38]

But these criticisms within the movement were rare. Increasingly, Oliver Tambo came to be regarded as the heir to the former ANC President, Albert Lutuli.[39] Walter Sisulu felt that Lutuli specifically chose Tambo to be his Secretary General

> 'because he would regard him as a balanced person who thinks like he does. I think on the other hand he would be more suspicious about some of us. And he would think, 'Well, this is my man"'.[40]

Jacob Zuma recalled the impact on him in 1959 of a regional ANC meeting that he attended as an unschooled herd boy visiting his mother, a domestic worker, in Durban. Chief Albert Lutuli was present and the speaker was Oliver Tambo:

> 'What I remember was when Chief Lutuli said appreciating [things] and being happy about what Tambo had said: he said the quality of Tambo's speech made him to feel happy; made him to feel that even if he and others were to die - who were in the leadership of the ANC then - there are young men like Oliver Tambo who were now ready to take responsibility in the leadership of the ANC. I believed in

> Lutuli, I loved him. He was the leader. For him to say so to this other leader was an important thing to me. That stuck in my mind for a number of years.'[41]

Lutuli's sanction, and the succession of his chiefly style was an important aspect of Tambo's legitimacy. Lutuli, recalled Albie Sachs:

> 'had a style that just made everybody feel good. You enjoyed having him around, he was very open to everybody. You felt he could be gracious and all-embracing without conceding on principles. There was no kowtowing to anybody. He wouldn't bend to the whites, but he would be gracious to whites, and he would listen to workers and had a stately style. Of course O.R. Tambo worked very closely with Lutuli, and I see a very direct connection between the Lutuli style and the Tambo style... It was a period when the ANC was consolidating itself, it was gaining many new adherents and building up friendships, and prestige, without alienating sectors who otherwise might have been hostile. More important than that, inside the ANC Lutuli was somehow facilitating the integration of all the different currents and elements'.[42]

After Lutuli's untimely death in 1967, Tambo was urged by the NEC and other departments to don the mantle of president. This he steadfastly refused to do because, he said, an election by those inside South Africa was not possible; he therefore did not have a mandate to take on this position. He did however agree to be the acting president. But in 1977, the National Executive Committee insisted that there was an urgent need for a designated, legitimate leader. As Tambo himself was well aware, the appointment was not strictly democratic, but even dissidents accepted Tambo as the appropriate leader:

> 'The very elevation of Oliver Tambo from the deputy president in 1977, something that never received support at Morogoro, was done behind the backs of the entire membership, without even prior discussion or announcement. ***Not that it did not have the support of the membership***, but such decisions in a politically prestigious body as the ANC needed at least a semblance of democracy, even if a sugar-coating'.[43]

In the minds of some, there was a shaky contradiction between the leader as provider and protector, (particularly during times of great need) and fully democratic structures and processes. Increasingly, though, as the challenges became more formidable, Tambo began to interpret a combination of the two discourses.

Tambo's own entourage, from his speech writers through to his body guards, affectionately called him 'chief'.[44] In discussions of Tambo's attributes as a leader, the chiefly theme in informants was often acknowledged. Monica Hunter, in her study of Mpondo society at the time of Oliver's childhood, listed the traditional characteristics of a chief. Among them, she specified

the chief's generosity and the reciprocal commitment of the chief's followers in the interests of the community as a whole.

> '*Nkosi nguyise wabantu* (a chief is the father of his people). A chief is not thought to own the property of his subjects... Nevertheless... gifts... are given cheerfully and willingly because it is recognized that the chief reciprocates by the duties he performs for his people. "The chief is working for his people, getting the news of the country, and he comes back and tells them things."... Generosity is a primary virtue and the mark of a chief. The chief is still provider of the poor... In spite of the fact that they were the wealthiest men in the country, chiefs always lived very much as their people, and most still do so... there is no difference between the diet of a chief and that of a commoner... It is in no way beneath the diginity of a chief to work himself... But the chief is not obliged to work, for there are always *iinduna* at the great place prepared to serve him.'[45]

Hunter here was describing the close relationship between chief and his followers, who serve him and give dues without question because of his protection and patronage. In exile, Tambo was clearly admired for his egalitarian manner and style and his day-to-day relationship with the members. 'At the beginning,' recalled Mzwai Piliso, three months before Tambo's death:

> 'we used to live so many of us in a house. And there was nothing specially for him. He woke up and went to the bathroom when it was empty. He took his turn without any complaint; ate what was provided; went to the office, worked, and never wanted any preferential treatment... This is true. He is a very simple person.'[46]

Tambo ceaselessly worked to provide for the growing number of ANC members in exile - refugees who had fled apartheid's detention laws and jails, and arrived in Botswana, Tanzania and later the other independent African countries, to offer their services to the liberation movement. By setting an example, he also had the ability to inspire and sustain the devoted commitment of ANC cadres. It was Tambo, (rather than the SACP) as head of the ANC's external mission, who was negotiating direct support for the movement from the eastern bloc countries.[47] As the ANC did not enjoy the formal support of governments in the west, he also personally helped to set up anti-apartheid movements.[48] While the numbers of exiles increased steadily, political leaders in the social democratic countries, and the churches in Europe were developing a relationship with the ANC, particularly with Oliver Tambo.[49] They began to support the movement with educational and material needs, on condition that these were not to be used directly for warfare. Tambo was also in regular communication with heads of states in Africa, India and other non-aligned countries, and was able to secure bases and accommodation.[50] He facilitated the delivery of generous donations from these countries, and was undoubtedly seen as fulfilling the traditional role of the leader - as the patron, the main 'provider of both

protection and food',[31] the guardian of the continued existence of the operations.[32] With these achievements, Tambo's status within the movement was enhanced.

In Hammond-Tooke's study of the role of the Mpondo chief in the early sixties, he found commoners' expectations of the leader, despite the wear and tear wrought on the chiefdom by industrialisation, migrant labour and the onset of the apartheid policies, to be much the same as three decades earlier. The day-to-day administration continued to reflect the wishes and desires of the commoner, and the leader's power, authority and legitimacy depended on acceptance.

> 'The grass-roots system of local government is still the basis of the entire superstructure... [I]nterpersonal relations are of paramount importance and mercy and understanding are more important than exacting the penalty demanded by the letter of the law'.[33]

Dissatisfaction with a chief was a common cause of fission (an important institutional check on the abuse of power). 'The personality of the chief' was an important factor influencing the outcome. The personal and warm relationship between Tambo and the ANC membership as perceived by many of the informants was similarly meaningful. Notwithstanding Tambo's legal profession, informants gave many examples where his humanity was greater than the letter of the law. 'He listens,' reflected Penuel Maduna, 'if someone does something wrong, he will try to find out why'.[34] MK officers of high rank, including Chris Hani and Mzwai Piliso (both, incidentally, raised in rural societies), recalled, approvingly, incidents where Tambo declined to sanction the death penalty for confirmed infiltrators, despite the heavy and tragic toll that their information to the enemy had caused:

> 'For instance, if you caught somebody perpetrating terrible acts against the ANC or the people, if you had proof, you couldn't act against these people according to him, unless you reported and he took the final decision. Which I think was a good thing, because some of us could have chopped many heads! ... As far as I know he has never sanctioned any execution, ever. They piled up recommendations in front of him, but he never took any action. And he didn't say no either. You had to wait for him to consider these.'[35]

The traditional leader's function of uniting disparate groups within the society was almost without exception ascribed as one of Tambo's major achievements. He was the 'glue' [36] that held the movement together. In rebutting accusations by the 'Group of Eight' and other critics, that Tambo was being manipulated by the communists in the ANC leadership, Slovo asserted:

> 'I don't think there was any person in the movement who was more completely his own person than O.R. was. But of course it was combined with another quality, without which the movement would have collapsed altogether, and that is the capacity to keep people together. Without him we would

> never have been kept together outside, that I am absolutely convinced of; it would have fragmented... there is no doubt that he was the cement... And it was that foundation which he laid outside in the most difficult, complex situation, and that quality of keeping together, which often gave the impression that he was sort of maybe playing off one side against the other or, of being manipulated or whatever. But essentially there was no way of manipulating O.R. He was absolutely the indisputable, unchallenged kind of force'.[57]

According to many, a remarkable feature of Tambo was his ability to listen and to hear the many dissonant voices in the ANC and blend them into a harmony.[58] 'I think that is where he excelled most, in keeping the ANC as a team, as an entity', reflected Steve Tswete.

> 'To make an accord with the situation you want to influence - that's what made the ANC so successful in getting the people involved in the formulation of those positions in various ways - workers and the religious communities, the middle classes, business etc. - in understanding what the ANC is all about. And O.R. succeeded in portraying the true image of the ANC as a national organisation. The ANC is not a political party, it is not in favour of one class against other classes, it is an omnibus organisation. O.R. would insist that failure to understand the character of this organisation would lead to its destruction. The ANC must never portray itself to be what it is not. The ANC is not the SACP, and it must never seek to portray itself as the SACP. There are communists and capitalists in the ANC, they have to work together with the objective of eliminating apartheid. There is no war between the two in the ANC. Non-sectarian across the board'.[59]

Over the three decades in exile, Tambo demonstrated by example the actual practice of consensus decision-making, which had been the ANC's heritage from its inception in 1912, when chiefs as well as the emerging middle-class banded together to form the national organisation. In distinguishing this tradition from the Soviet practice of 'democratic centralism' Albie Sachs commented:

> 'The ANC is the parliament of the people. Now I probably heard that from Luthuli; I don't know where I picked it up, but it was that kind of idea, that the ANC is not the vanguard in that sense, although it might have a vanguard role... All the different currents and trends and groups and people must have their voice. And of course that belongs very much to a part of African tradition, that had become so distorted through the whole colonial, bureaucratic style. But one can see a tremendous cultural response to the Lutuli style'.[60]

The ANC, he observed, had 'a collective style of work, with [Tambo] playing a very key role in maintaining the integrity, the balance; listening to everybody and also insisting that the NEC itself involve membership wherever possible'.[61] A number of

informants associated this style with the tradition of consensus. 'The chief according to tradition, as far as I am concerned', commented Henry Makgoti, 'is not a leader who dictates. I mean the so-called *mbizo* or *pitso*, is a gathering, as far as I have been able to understand, which is very democratic and enables councillors - you know the people who surround the chief - to help him to make wise decisions'.[42]

Makgoti's interpretation concurred with Hammond-Tooke's observations, who concluded that the balance of power between the chief and the people in the decision-making process was achieved through constant consultation. Through consensus, the chief's command and authority was continually recreated. The chief acted as chairman of the decision-making body - in a sense, this structure served to protect the chief, who was then 'insulated from decision-making process with all its possibility of error and miscalculation'.[43]

> 'Consensus was all important owing to the multiplex relationships in which all were involved... After thorough discussion, the chief and his advisers would get the feeling of the meeting. Opponents of the plan were encouraged to speak out because people should not be like a stream that flows in only one direction.'[44]

Consensus did not mean an absence of conflict or unanimity, but the final decision would be legitimated through the process of participation by a broadly based majority. While often, however, 'the true decision was taken by a smaller group elsewhere', this did not take away from the acceptability of the decision, since it was ratified by the majority.

Tambo seemed to be sensitive to the specific objective of participation. While his personal opinion was an influential factor, Tambo would not allow it to threaten the unity of the movement, as the outcome of the 'Group of Eight's' crusade illustrates. 'He believed in collective leadership,' wrote Neo Moikangoa:

> 'Its importance to fostering unity and to countering individual wilfulness, excesses and anti-democratic tendencies at leadership level was obvious enough to him. He also saw it as a necessary adjunct to spreading and rooting the sense of ownership of the struggle across the broadest possible constituency of anti-apartheid'.[45]

'We hardly ever voted in the ANC,' confirmed Nelson Mandela.

> 'I can't remember throughout my association with the ANC, [our] voting on any issue. It's a tradition which goes far back in the history of the ANC... As far as African meetings were concerned there was no voting. People would present, would discuss and then by consensus take a decision. I cannot be sure if this [rural culture] has been the influence because especially now, people have no context with the countryside, with tradition. But this

particular tradition has continued with the ANC'."

Undoubtedly, many of the ANC leadership characteristics have a universal appeal; they are not exclusively 'African'. But for many exiles, the origins of the ANC convention of leadership lay in thier own history. And Tambo, through his all-encompassing, consultative style, was the bearer of that heritage. Steve Tshwete, who spent fifteen years on Robben Island, observed that 'in prison, Nelson did the same thing that O.R. was doing in exile. Because both situations are similar - the prison situation and the exile situation - cut off'."

This was not to imply that all chiefly discourses were identical. Albie Sachs, in discussing Tambo's mode of leadership, drew a distinction between the 'good chief', who provides for democratic expression, and the autocrat. In the ANC, he asserted,

> 'there was a theoretical concept which meant - and particularly in conditions of underground - one had to have very strong discipline. But the idea was always counterpoised with strong input from the rank and file, from the grassroots in different ways... But one would have to invent a different formulation to explain the way [Tambo] and Lutuli (and to a large extent Nelson today), work. It was the leader - I would say he would take a little bit of the chief, the traditional leader, but the benign chief - the benign, traditional leader - the good one, who listened. And every meeting in that sense would be something of a *legotla*, where everybody comes in, everybody has a chance to be heard, and it is very democratic. You go for consensus rather than for majority rule. And it makes quite a difference. It means you speak a little longer, you don't have this fierce thing of majorities and minorities, and the minority winning over some people and becoming a majority. It's a kind of a core set of values and approach, and then you bring in the people. You arrive at something that gives everybody a little bit of something. And certainly a chance to be heard - the right to be heard is very strong.'

Above all, Tambo strove to widen the scope of inclusiveness, to embrace the marginalised, to establish a gender balance, to strengthen both the size and the quality of commitment in the movement." A number of former adherents of the Black Consciousness Movement (BCM) attested to the effectiveness of this approach" (although at least one African informant outside of the ANC complained of the ANC's 'tendency to hijack'[70]). Within the movement, however, all informants insisted that the process of decision-making, certainly when led by Tambo, was never coercive. Members of the NEC who were interviewed, when asked about the potential pressure on everyone to agree, all maintained that Tambo encouraged the expression of different perspectives. 'O.R. would never suppress a viewpoint,' Penuel Maduna contended. 'There were "no holds barred". He liberated the personality, you see; you were all equals in a debate'.[71] Jacob Zuma, another NEC member, tried to explain why Tambo's approach

was successful.

> 'During his time, thorough as he was, in terms of discussing issues, we developed a culture in the ANC leadership of actually taking decisions by consensus. Now, that was due to O.R.'s calibre and quality of understanding. He never allowed discussions to be haphazard and to take decisions that we were not all clear about. Whilst we were supposed to be voting on decisions, we actually developed a culture of not voting because of the manner in which he handled things. The national executive committee (most of the time outside) did not meet for less than a week, and therefore we had time to debate issues as thoroughly as possible. If you had views, different views, you had time to put them across, or to test them. By the time you reached a decision, you had all agreed... you would have debated the issues to your satisfaction.'[72]

Tambo also had the ability to present the major issues and draw them up towards a conclusion. Joe Slovo recollected the discussions and conclusions:

> 'At the end of the day it was O.R.'s assessment, taking into account - because he was a great democrat - the thinking expressed at these meetings... there was no one in the movement who had the talent and the capacity at the end of, maybe a three-day session of the Revolutionary Council, or an extended meeting of the NEC, to summarise the discussion and point the way in the most brilliant fashion - in a way which kept us together, which took into account the differing views. He had that talent which I have never seen equalled by any other person in the movement... By the end of it we felt there is the concept. He pulled it, always pulled it together.'[73]

Shortly before Tambo's death, Walter Sisulu, in a discussion about the ANC's tradition of consensus decision-making, insisted (in an interview before Tambo's death) that 'O.R. has qualities of his own'. Of all the leaders, he said, Tambo

> 'is one of the best men in assessing a position. He speaks less. He observes and comes to a conclusion when everybody has spoken, everybody has expressed an opinion. This I think is the characteristic which made him so successful in mobilising the exile; in bringing about stability to a community was because he has got that characteristic. Even today it is a remarkable thing... Even in a situation which you have had abroad, you hardly come across anybody who was hostile. I think he was the most loved leader. I know Lutuli was, but O.R. has got that exceptional gift of leading people'.[74]

Chiefly and traditionally African virtues were established in Tambo's formative years. But from the age of eleven, Tambo was removed from his village, except for short visits, and exposed to a drastically different influence - the authority of the

missionary environment.

The young Tambo was then to become deeply influenced by the spiritual and moral message of the missionaries, and highly receptive to the intellectual challenges that they offered. Tambo was perhaps fortunate in being exposed to a relatively less paternalistic breed of Christians. Unlike some other mission schools, it was daily practice in both the Holy Cross Mission in Flagstaff and at St Peter's College in Johannesburg, for black and white staff and students to eat their meals together. Black and white teachers shared accommodation."

Tambo's recorded memories are positive and appreciative of the *repertoire* that the Christian missionaries bequeathed him. Indeed, the social context of the missionary influence pervading Pondoland, and the Eastern Cape as a whole, made a powerful impact on Oliver's entire generation of Xhosa-speaking ANC leaders. As colonised Africans, they were more likely to be sensitive to the fact that culture and religion were socially constructed and controlled.

Tambo himself was far from unaware of the contradictions, the ironies and the arbitrariness that were embedded in the colonial interpretation of Christianity. Despite Oliver's enduring embrace of the spiritual world, there was a shrewd pragmatism which was to be a feature of the ANC exile movement.

> 'As far as I was concerned, it made no difference if I was a Methodist or an Anglican. Indeed, in later years I narrowly missed going to Marianhill in Natal, which is a Roman Catholic Secondary School. If I had gone there, would I have identified sufficient of a difference between the Anglican and the Roman Catholic Church to prevent me identifying with the religious practice of those among whom I stayed? I do not see what it would have been.
>
> So, as things worked out, I was Anglican. And I have no regrets. On the contrary, unable to say what would have happened if I had <u>not</u> gone to Holy Cross Mission, I am able to say it was a jolly good thing I did! And a jolly good thing that I was put through the institutions run by the Anglican Church, which became part of my experience, including an Anglican hostel at Fort Hare. All these have served to define my life in a way, I have reason to believe, to be different from how I would have developed otherwise. Except that I have no reason to suppose that whichever way I had developed I would have cause to regret whether had I come up through a different religious practice.'

This missionary background, he conceded, also helped to contribute to the distinctive social and political culture that the ANC was to develop. Despite his militant African nationalism as a founder of the Youth League, Tambo remained deeply religious. Like his peers (for example the devoutly Catholic yet acutely nationalist Anton Lembede) he was careful not to allow

potentially divisive religious practices to intefere with the mission of politics. Nevertheless, the ANC's origins were grounded in what Basil Davidson has termed the 'sense of moral legitimacy' of the colonised,[76] and Christian teachings (though frequently failing in application) gave a spiritual backing to the principled appeals of its leaders. 'You must remember,' commented Nelson Mandela, 'our generation was produced by Christian schools, by missionary schools at a time when the government took no interest whatsoever in our education... So Christianity is really in our blood'.[77]

The ANC's moral discourse, its insistence on the 'moral high ground'[78] was a major claim to its acceptability, both in the international community and to its own members. In exile, Tambo justified armed struggle while maintaining a moral stance. Nearly half a century of peaceful opposition had been fruitless, he often argued, and the ANC was therefore forced to adopt more violent methods of resistance. The ANC's use of controlled sabotage had, like the war against Nazism, a moral endorsement. Tambo in particular publicly eschewed 'soft targets' and privately reprimanded the M.K. leadership for the loss of civilian life.[79] 'We knew there was something wrong,' reminisced Steve Tshwete after a spate of bombings on restaurants in South Africa, 'because he convened the meeting himself'.

> 'All the members of the Political-Military Council were there in full force for the first time since I served in the PMC, eighteen of them. I said to Chris, "We are not going to escape his censure": and his censure was really bruising. He was not angry, but he was analytical. These are the implications, and this is how we are going to affect the image and the integrity of this organisation... And I said to Chris, "The best thing we can do is to keep quiet. Let them talk, we should not attempt any defence". Comrades came out to say this is wrong, and some were trying to defend the actions and to say that we are not there on the ground and nobody can be pilot on that kind of activity, given the distance between Johannesburg and Lusaka, the long lines of communication'.[80]

While some rank-and-file attitudes supported harder hitting targets,'they would say it informally, outside, not in the formal structure of the ANC'.[81] Despite feelings that some individuals may have had about the ineffectual nature of the armed struggle, Tshwete maintained that members of the ANC at all levels respected Tambo's undisputed moral stature. His personality itself - quiet, unassuming, restrained - was seen as further evidence of his ethical character. 'I had a high regard for him,' said Denis Brutus, who had worked with Tambo since the 1950s in the eastern Cape and was himself a Catholic. 'A man of consistent integrity'.[82] Mzwai Piliso, too, spoke of Tambo's 'integrity and scrupulous honesty'. Kenneth Kaunda, a devout Christian, was struck by Tambo's 'immense self-discipline'.

> 'Oliver's family life was simply superb. I have not kinown him to run around like a child at all. His self-respect was

> the hall-mark of his behaviour... His colleagues obeyed him not because he was overbearing. They obeyed him simply because of that humility.'"

'O.R.,' asserted James Stuart, 'was self-disciplined, incorruptible - money was not part of his value system. (Adelaide took care of money matters).'" Many others recalled examples of how Tambo's personal conduct acted as an example to them. " Archbishop Trevor Huddleston, a close friend of almost fifty years' duration spoke of Tambo as 'my mentor', 'a God-centred person'.

> 'He was deeply spiritual but also highly intelligent. I mean he was a very, intelligent person. He wasn't just emotionally religious, he was religious with his intellect, as well as with his affections and everything else about him'."

For many, these inherent qualities had been encouraged and nurtured by his Christian upbringing. Thousands of ANC members of Tambo's generation were reared in the schools of the Christian missionaries and were firmly convinced, like retired headmaster Jan Grootboom, a colleague of Nelson Mandela at Healdtown school in the eastern Cape, that 'the missionaries built character'." Thomas Nkobi, another missionary product, commended his old school, Adams College in Natal: 'you were given all the facilities, the values to think as a person, as a man, to become responsible'."

The aspirations of self-sacrifice and commitment to ideals continued to be instilled in the next generation. 'I must say,' confessed Chris Hani about the early influences in his own life, 'I was under the spell and influence of the priests, the monks and the nuns'.

> 'And one must say there is something one admired in them; a sense of hard work, selflessness. These people would go on horseback to the most rural parts of the village, taking the gospel to the people, encouraging kids to go to school, praying for the sick... they were not only priests, but they were nurses, they were teachers, they were social workers. I must submit that had a very very strong impression on me and in the formation of my character'."

But for many Africans, the lofty ideals generated by the missionaries were readily transferred to the goal of liberation. As a student at Roma University College, Thomas Nkobi recalled confronting one of his mentors:

> 'I remember I used to say to Father: "Father, you want us to behave like you - we are not fathers, neither are we nuns. We are going to face the world and therefore our tuition must be geared to us [sic] becoming leaders of our people, not leaders of the church"'."

Within the ANC, it was widely known that Tambo had sacrificed a

career in the church ministry for 'the call of politics'.[1] In later years, Hani greatly admired the dedication of his role models to a noble political cause:

> '[P]eople like Tambo, Mandela, Mji, Anton Lembede, Sisulu, etc. - as youngsters, these were our idols... We admired them because we saw a different type of intelligentsia - an inteliigentsia which is selfless, which is not just concerned about making money, creating a comfortable situation for themselves, but an intelligentsia which had lots of time for the struggle of the oppressed people of South Africa.'[2]

For many political activists, the crusade for liberation was a sacred vocation, and those who distinguished themselves through a lifetime of commitment and sacrifice were elevated almost to a position of sainthood. But this image was not confined to believers. Other members of the ANC, normally independent thinkers in their professional capacity, could speak of Tambo as 'saintly, no question; but not in an absurd way, I mean not so that he couldn't deal with these ruffians'.[3] Pallo Jordan and Lindiwe Mabuza were only two of a number of professionals who abandoned paid positions in order to serve the movement. Mabuza proclaimed the ANC as 'the best calling, the best vocation'.[4]

On the day of Tambo's funeral, speakers expressed themselves with heightened emotion. Biblical images prevailed. In a lyrical homage to Tambo, Mandela likened his old friend and partner to Moses who 'went into the wilderness with nothing'. The Reverend Frank Chikane extended the metaphor.

> 'He led us to be free, so we can be free from the bondage of struggle... Like Moses, Oliver Tambo chose to go into exile. Like Moses, he pointed at the suffering of the people to those who hardened their hearts. Our father Tambo. He died near the top of the mountain... He has taken us along to the mountain top. We thank you Tata.'[5]

But the Christian missionaries left another, enduring legacy. Their spiritual teachings went hand-in-hand with the introduction of western education to the colonised. Paternalistic as many missionaries undoubtedly were, their work also aroused hostility from whites, many of whom were threatened by the transfer of skills to the oppressed. Alexander Kerr, a Scottish immigrant and the first Vice-Chancellor of Fort Hare, Tambo's *alma mater*, was struck by 'the indifference or, in some cases, the actual hostility of the ordinary European to the education of the non-European and especially to that of the African'.[6]

In the 1925 graduation ceremony, Mr W.K. Bennie, chief inspector of Native Schools in the Cape, addressed the black alumnus:

> 'It will be for you to convince these [i.e. those opposed to higher education for Africans], not by wordy argument but by the irresistible evidence of character and achievement, that Native education is justified of her

> children. By the thoughtless you may be subject to pinpricks, misrepresentation, and at times even to insult. In such circumstances it will be for you to display the self-control and understanding charity of judgement that one associates with a liberal education'."

Despite the fierce criticism that many Africanists were to level against this 'Uncle Tom' approach, its philosophy of moral excellence did not fail to influence, consciously and unconsciously, a significant number of future leaders of the ANC. Education endowed a capacity that clearly had been valued since the inception of the ANC, whose founders were mostly professional men.

> 'The ANC was an organisation which really believed in the intellectual. At that time, I mean, you couldn't become a leader of the ANC unless you are a doctor or a lawyer. But with the coming of young fellows like O.R. Tambo, Walter, they injected in the minds of the people that the masses themselves must take part in it'."

The Youth League emphasised grass-roots involvement, and education was seen as an important tool which would help to improve the lives of the oppressed. Tambo and Mandela belonged to the small elite of African graduates; but they were even more exceptional because, as one of Tambo's kinsmen said, somewhat grandiosely, 'they could be millionaires today (but) they decided that their lives are spent for the freedom of all South Africans'."

They were reputed to be making material sacrifices in order to promote the well-being and emancipation of the collective whole. Descriptions of Tambo's achievements were frequently cast in religious imagery. A school colleague recalled Tambo's reputation at St Peter's, both as a pupil and as the mathematics and physics master at the school.

> 'Tambo was a brilliant man, so people respected him for his mind... He is the man who started the ANC Youth League in St Peter's. And he was good at it, you see. He was recruiting: "You boys come to me; you must join the Youth League". He was preaching the gospel.'[100]

Academic excellence itself was among the highest attainments. Tambo's success was of particular consequence because he demonstrated his intellectual superiority over even the ruling class, vindicating all Africans and discomfiting the racists. An old school mate gleefully commented:

> 'We did Junior Certificate together. He was an outstanding student together with another friend, Mr Mokoena. In our class they got distinctions in the examination; they got a First Class, First Division Pass with Distinctions, and it was something which had never occurred before in the history of the Transvaal examination. We were writing then the same examinations as any white school in those days,

> right through the whole of South Africa... The examiners in Pretoria were surprised. They had to come and inspect the school, because they couldn't understand how black people could acquire such high standards.'[101]

Tambo was highly respected in the community as a teacher. Former pupils spoke of him as an 'inspired teacher'.[102] 'He had this capacity,' reflected Henry Makgoti:

> 'With him, solving mathematical problems, scientific problems was always an adventure. He made you feel that you are exploring something and you are going to find out'.[103]

In subsequent years, Tambo's talent as a teacher was often noted. Informants recalled what they had learned from him, and the methods he used to pass on these lessons. Lindiwe Mabuza, for example, spoke about how Tambo located and 'drew out one's talents', the classic definition of an educator [104]. Others noted Tambo's emphasis on political education in the camps, as well as his earnest desire for the post-1976 school children to receive education before military training.[105]

But his status was even further enhanced when, encouraged by Walter Sisulu, Tambo decided to study law, and joined Nelson Mandela's firm of attorneys. Thomas Nkobi's comments are a typical example of the popular image of the partnership of 'Mandela and Tambo'.

> 'O.R. sort of elevated his position in the eyes of the people... taking the background that he was interested in the welfare of the people and that here is a young man who would now go to defend the people from these viscious laws enacted by the South African regime. To us, during those days, a lawyer was not considered just an ordinary lawyer looking for money, it was part of the struggle; because if you are a lawyer, defending an African, you would really be fighting on another level, fighting against the inequities of the South African laws. It was at that time that O.R. became very important politically - combining both the question of his politics and also the question of defending his people politically.'[106]

It was this combination which was the clue to the reputation of the firm of Mandela and Tambo, for here were Africans who had, through their intellectual ability, commandeered the power and knowledge of the ruling class, interpreted it, and employed it to protect and defend African people. They had become brokers against the assault of the apartheid system. They could speak the language of the ruling class, they understood its discourse, yet they could not be bought off - they were incorruptible, and they were trusted.

In exile, Tambo had to master additional discourses. These included reinventing a now banned ANC, with a rapidly growing army engaged in a military struggle against the forces of apartheid. In the context of armed resistance in Vietnam and in

many parts of Africa in the 1960s, the ANC worked for over a decade to establish the ANC's military image. Shaky though this might have been [107], the existence of the M.K. was known to thousands of young people inside South Africa, and this awareness prompted them to flee the country and join the ANC in exile. Although M.K. cadres never returned, as they dreamed, to engage the South African oppressors in decisive battle, the fact of their existence, and their occasional successful forays of sabotage, had an enormous psychological impact on many Africans inside the country. As Supreme Commander of M.K., and through his broadcasts on Radio Freedom, Tambo was idolised by thousands of youths inside South Africa.[108] 'The people relied on the armed struggle', confirmed Oliver Tambo.[109] He insisted, however, that the M.K. was more than a stirring idea.

> 'The armed struggle was the most important thing for us. And it was the armed struggle that the regime considered the most dangerous... The attacks of the M.K. - they did change the situation, up to a point where de Klerk sought to talk to us and introduce this present basis of consociation.'[110]

The relationship with the SACP in exile and the revolutionary discourse of the ANC are beyond the scope of this paper, but are relevant insofar as Tambo was considered to be virtually the sole member of the leadership in exile who would be acceptable to all the constituencies in the movement, and hence the trusted broker between the communists and the nationalists.

In the representation of the ANC in the international field, as we have seen, Tambo was widely considered to have been a highly successful diplomat and statesman, both within the movement and abroad. He was able to justify an armed struggle which nevertheless maintained the 'moral high ground'. Tambo's respect and standing in the Organisation of African Unity grew steadily over three decades.[111] 'If you note well,' remarked one of his colleagues, 'whatever authorities he saw outside, after he had spoken to them they all supported the African National Congress, all of them without exception'.[112]

> 'It was only Margaret Thatcher, and because she was not prepared to meet him - she said he is a terrorist, so she won't meet him. But if she had met him, she would have been converted. No, he had a way of putting things accurately and honestly. I think he was gifted, very gifted.'[113]

Tambo's management of these discourses was widely ascribed, across the spectrum of the ANC, to his sheer intelligence. Frene Ginwala spoke of Tambo's 'giant intellect'.[114] Ronald Segal, the bright and precocious young editor of Africa South, who spirited Tambo across the South African border into Bechuanaland in 1960, frequently expressed his respect for Tambo's mind, his 'resoluteness', his 'wisdom'.

> 'I always found Oliver's mind to be extremely quick and searching in its perceptions, and quite unlike the impression he gave of a rather bland, remote view'.[115]

Tambo's clarity, his sensitivity to the meaning of words and his analytic approach were often given as successful examples of his legal training.[116] Pallo Jordan, respected amongst ANC intellectuals for his independent thinking, spoke at length about Tambo's astuteness and his foresight, giving as one example Tambo's ability to go beyond 'waging a war only with guns', when he commissioned Jordan to head the propaganda and media unit.[117]

In defininin Tambo's shaping of the image of the ANC a remarkable number of respondents spoke of Tambo's 'foresight'. Abdul Minty, described as an example, how Tambo, right at the inception of the Anti-Apartheid Movement, insisted that that body would more effective if it were independent of the ANC. Vella Pillay was impressed that Tambo had had a 'wider vision' over the issue of the unification of the Congress Alliance at Morogoro, to which Pillay was opposed.[118] Steve Tshwete and Penuel Maduna, who had accompanied Tambo on that last journey in 1989 to the frontline states to present the ANC negotiations package, before his stroke, stressed Tambo's determination that the ANC, rather than the OAU or any other power, should pilot this delicate process.[119] And Nelson Mandela, on learning of Tambo's death, publicly announced that 'we have lost our strategist'.[120] 'To keep an organisation intact underground is a very difficult thing,' Mandela later explained.

> 'But when you are underground and then you are operating abroad, it becomes even more difficult. But O.R. was able to keep the organisation together. He also did not hesitate to meet people like businessmen - very wealthy people - in an organisation where younger people were very impatient, and where you also had the Marxists amongst it. He was able to convince everybody that the task of the ANC was to unite all organisations. He also was a deeply religious man and he was able therefore to bring the religious groups who themselves were in the frontline of the struggle. So O.R. was a strategist in the proper sense of the word. And in spite of the fact that he kept the fire burning inside the country, he was able to be accepted even by conservative governments abroad.'[121]

As an interpreter of the colonial discourse who had also to deal with its perpetrators, Tambo became a master of ambiguity.[122] In the international context, armed with his experience in South Africa, Tambo became a symbol of both the moral virtues of the ANC and the deep injury inflicted on the oppressed by the apartheid state. Tambo's physical presentation of self - his African facial markings, his unfailingly neat appearance both in apparel and physique, his old-world courtesy - created a stirring and engaging combination for western observers and politicians. Yet Tambo was not too exotic in his projection. His dress was habitually a suit and tie, his use of English was eloquent and grammatically correct, and his religion was Anglican. Though not publicly obvious, Tambo's Christianity had bequeathed him an internalised set of values and manners with which westerners could identify.

'He was a dear friend,' disclosed David Wirmark, a Member of Parliament for the Liberal Party in Sweden, 'and I think through being himself he personified gentleness and democratic attitudes... It was a horrible injustice that was committed to the black and coloured, the non-white people'.[123] And again: his 'almost monastic... simplicity', noted Anthony Sampson. 'actually gave his leadership a tremendous strength and enabled him to get a lot of other valuable people which he otherwise wouldn't have got'.[124] Ultimately, Tambo was to meet the heads of state of the major powers (with the exception of Thatcher, as we have seen) and impress upon them the importance of 'delinking' the battle against apartheid from the Cold War.[125]

All these achievements seemed to be leading to Tambo's last accomplishment, the sea-change of a negotiated revolution within his own ranks. The careful preparation of the ANC in exile by its leaders for this step achieved a hesitant but ultimately widespread acceptance of both the necessity and the wisdom of this strategy. This endorsement was in large measure the result of Tambo's scrupulous groundwork since 1986, when he broached the possibility of negotiations.[126] A rank-and-file member explained this difficult transition in three words: 'We trusted him'.[127] Yet again, Tambo, leading the team in exile, was able to reformulate the shape of the struggles to come.

Were there no weaknesses in this portrait of nobility? Most respondents were hard-pressed to find faults with Tambo.[128] They tended to come up with minor flaws, such as his obsession with correcting prepared speeches until literally the moment before delivery, to the exasperation of his exhausted speech writers. Two informants (both of whom had been disappointed in Tambo's failure to solve their clashes with the executive) felt that Tambo was not always a good judge of character, and that he was too patient and too tolerant of incompetence. Another respondent hinted at Tambo's unflinching loyalty to old friends, sometimes giving them the benefit of the doubt if they were suspected of any untoward behaviour.[129] Insofar as there was a lack of inefficiency in some of the ANC offices, or drunkenness and loose behaviour (which some felt were symptoms of the strains of exile life), informants considered these shortcomings to have occurred despite Tambo's impeccable example in both his personal lifestyle and in his dedicated work habits. Never once did anyone hint at a possible flaw in his own personal integrity. If there were failings, these were always laid at someone else's door.

On the more serious issue of the mistreatment of inmates in the detention camps, most were convinced that Tambo could not have known of these abuses until a later stage.[130] Henry Makgoti's earnest response was typical: 'It would have been quite out of his nature to go along with things that were abusive, honestly', he said.[131] Where it was acknowledged that reforms were a long time in coming once the abuses became known, a combination of factors was cited: the weak aspect of the consensus model; Tambo's unavoidable dependence on security reports at the time of the 'total onslaught'; his perhaps too Christian approach in reassuring his security personnel of his trust in their

integrity; a sense of responsibility for the families of the victims of the hit squads; his anxiety to avoid a split in the ANC, and his propensity to work slowly and thoroughly. These were all components which influenced Tambo to adopt a collective and protracted solution: in 1985, he appointed the Stuart commission of inquiry into conditions in the camps, and a legal committee to produce a Code of Conduct for the ANC.[132]

Overwhelmingly, respondents expressed pride in their affiliation to Oliver Tambo. For them, Tambo was consistently associated with their own 'age of innocence'. He seemed to have succeeded in interpreting for them the brave and dedicated new men and women that the liberation movement required. He affirmed the value of their lives. He symbolised the transformation of dreary, unfulfilling township living into the noble pursuit of freedom for all. Together with the other leaders he invented, and continually adapted, a new image for the ANC, drawing on the discourses of African tradition, Christianity, western know-how and revolutionary strategy. He personified by example and by his unwavering focus on national liberation, the lure of altruistic ideals, spiritual affirmation and allegiance without material reward, to which they had committed themselves when they first joined the movement.

The respondents' own life stories were fascinating and stirring. It became clear that these ANC 'stalwarts' were a self-selected band. Clearly, though enthusiastically supported in their mission by millions back home, these exiles were not ordinary men and women. Through the long years of exile, many had experienced hardship, uncertainty and tragedy. Many had received valuable training. Through travel, they had been exposed to other cultures and societies. And perhaps some, as members of a beleaguered, exiled resistance movement, had become involved in shabby compromises. But when they recounted their memories of Tambo, and recollected their own experiences, their whole body language reflected their feelings. Their faces glowed, their bodies leaned forward, they engaged in lively eye contact. Oliver Tambo represented for all these ANC members the best component of themselves.

Tambo's wide and inclusive national embrace enabled the vast majority of the ANC in exile to identify experiences significant to themselves. As with all experiential or oral testimony, respondents recalled the qualities and characteristics which were most relevant to their own life stories. Mosie Moola, son of a devout Muslim and supporter of Ghandi, was profoundly touched by Tambo's 'most endearing feature', his 'simplicity'.[133] Albie Sachs' absorbing narrative depicted Tambo as 'a natural democrat' who facilitated civil rights for all.[134] Bridgette Mabandla dramatically described Tambo's intelligent, subtle and successful intervention on her behalf with a hostile, all-male legal committee.[135] Jacob Zuma saw in Tambo a rural wisdom. Ngoako Ramathlodi was stirred by Tambo's love of music and his creative use of culture to further the cause of the movement; and so on.[136] There was a part of Tambo in them all.

The time and place of the interviews were also germane. Some occurred before Tambo's death; others soon afterwards, emanating a sense of loss and sadness. A few interviews were conducted after the 1994 elections, changing dramatically the status of the informants. One example was the perspective of Penuel Maduna, Deputy to Buthelezi's Minister of Home Affairs. In his interview, Maduna vividly recalled his visit to Angola five years earlier with Tambo, and the advice of Eduardo dos Santos, the President. He warned the ANC not to repeat the mistake of MPLA, who failed to take into account the needs of Unita, and were now enduring the bitter consequences. In the thirty years of exile, said Maduna, Tambo consistently upheld the values of consensus, collective leadership and attention to the opponent. 'Like Mandela today', Tambo had been cool and level-headed.

> 'That element kept us together. Now, the National Government of Unity is inspiring the world. These good qualities will rub off onto one another - onto de Klerk, onto Buthelezi. By not bringing in their ignonimious past, this country can only succeed, if we sustain the perspective of Tambo and Mandela.'[137]

The exile community, removed from the home base for an indefinite period, in an alienating and remote environment, had required of the leadership an enhanced function which needed at once to retain and to go beyond the collective ideal. 'In times of war, revolution, or some other form of violent upheaval', Alan Bullock wrote,

> 'communities... become de-stabilised, behaviour unpredictable and more extreme courses conceivable. In such circumstances it is possible for an individual to exert a powerful, even decisive influence on the way things develop'.[138]

Over a process of three decades, Tambo supplied that influence. He retained the vision of collective leadership by skilfully managing the different *repertoires* imposed on all educated Africans (and indeed on all revolutionaries). Informants clearly understood the value of Tambo's syncretism. He presented himself as an archetype which ANC members could recognise, appreciate and hope to emulate. Frequently, Tambo's success was ascribed to a combination of his humanity (uBuntu), his integrity and his fine intellect. Others spoke of his 'balance' - his ability to offset a number of attributes drawn from different traditions. Like other national leaders, education had given him social and geographical mobility, and generated the inevitable need to combine both the traditional *repertoire* and the new *repertoire* imposed on them by colonisation, industrialisation and urbanisation. Tambo and his colleagues had to reinvent themselves, create a new identity for themselves,[139] one which would resonate with a new generation. They had to shape, reflect and interpret a new political culture which would be more appropriate to meeting the challenges of urban politics and the increasingly oppressive and exploitative policies of segregation

and apartheid.

-----000-----

1. As this is work in progress, please do not quote or reproduce without my permission. L.C.

2. See, for example, P. Bonner's 'The politics of black squatter movements on the Rand, 1944-1952', Radical History Review, 46/7, Winter 1990, for a brief study of leaders of the social movement of informal settlements on the East Rand; Shula Marx's brilliant case studies of three Natal leaders in The Ambiguities of Dependence in South Africa (Ravan Press) 1986; and Paul la Hausse de la Louviere, 'Etnicity and History in the Careers of Two Zulu Nationalists', Ph.D., University of the Witwatersrand, July 1992.

3. Unless otherwise stated, all quotations from Oliver Tambo are drawn from a series of 14 audio-tape recordings of Tambo's recollections of his early life, undertaken in exile in 1987 and 1988. During this period, Tambo suffered a mild stroke.

4. The paper draws mainly on the Oliver Tambo's memories of his early life, tape redorded in 1987 and 1988 for the early years of his life.

5. Some 60 ANC members who were active in the movement during its three decades of exile gave oral testimonies between February 1993 and June 1994. The interviews were a minimium of one hour's duration each, though in some cases, two or three separate one-hour sessions took place.

6. Oliver Tambo, interview with Luli Callinicos, Johannesburg 2.2.1993.

7.Monica Hunter, Reaction to Conquest, OUP, 1936, p.264-5.

8. Hammond-Tooke, as above, pp.65-68.

9. These included the ten-shilling hut tax for every wife in the homestead, the two-shilling education tax, and the six shillings and sixpence dipping levy for stock (which was further increased a few years later).

10. Beinart, as above, p.102.

11. Interview with Tshongwana Mchitwa, Kantolo, 24.1.93.

12. Erik H. Erikson, in his psycho-biography of Mahatma Gandhi discusses'the mother in the joint family, in which she must respond to each and, at the same time, to all, and thus belong to the individual child only in fleeting moments and to nobody for good or for long'. Erik H. Erikson, Gandhi's Truth: On the Origins of Militant Violence (Faber and Faber Limited, London)

1970, p.43.

13. Erikson, as above.

14. Interview with Phyllis Ntantala Jordan, Sandown, 6.12.93.

15. Interview with Jacob Zuma, 27.7.93.

16. Interview with Penuel Mpapa Maduna, Pretoria, 6.6.94.

17. Interview with Lindiwe Mabuza, former academic and ANC's representative in Washington at the time of the interview, Sandown, 7.5.93.

18. Interview with Gertrude Shope, Johannesburg, 3.9.93.

19. Interview with Andile Ngcaba, Johannesburg, 25.6.93.

20. Interviews with Ismael Abu-Baker (*nom-de-guerre* 'Rashid'), Johannesburg, 26.3.93; Lionel ('Rusty') Bernstein, Kidlington, 19.5.93; Ronnie Kasrils, Johannesburg, 11.3.93.

21. Interview with Mzwai Piliso, Umtata, 17.1.93.

22. For example, Andile Ngcaba, *op. cit.*, Tony 'Gab' Msimang, Ronnie Kasrils, Albie Sachs, Agnes Msimang, to name but a few. Also, Siphiwe Nyanda, 'Meticulous Commander', and Joe Nhlanhla 'OR: "The perfectionist", both in Mayibuye, June 1993.

23. Chris Hani, *op. cit.*

24. Neo Moikangoa, '"What have I done?" or what Oliver Tambo meant to us', obituary. An edited version appears in Mayibuye, June 1993.

25. Interview with Neo Moikangoa, Johannesburg, 14.6.93.

26. Bandile Ketelo, Amos Maxongo, Zamxolo Tshona, Ronnie Masango and Luvo Mbengo, 'A miscarriage of democracy: the ANC Security Department in the 1984 mutiny in Umkhonto we Sizwe', Searchlight South Africa No. 5, July 1990, p.35.

27. Ibid, p.36.

28. Interview with Chris Hani, Johannesburg, 30th March, 1993.

29. W.D. Hammond-Tooke, Command or Consensus: the development of Transkeian local government, David Philip, 1975, p.36. See also Monica Hunter, Reaction to Conquest, OUP, 1936, p.395.

30. Interview with Aziz Pahad, Johannesburg, 10.8.93.

31. Interview with Aziz Pahad, *op. cit.*

32. Hani, *op. cit.*

33. Interview with Zuma, *op. cit.*

34. Hani, *ibid.*

35. Hani, *ibid.*

36. This was the term used by the eight to describe themselves in the following document: African National Congress of South Africa (African Nationalists), Statement on the Expulsion From the A.N.C. (S.A.) Of: T. Bonga, A.M. Makiwane, J.D. Matlou, G.M. Mbele, A.K. Mgota, P. Ngakane, T.X. Makiwane, O.K. Setlhapelo, London, 27th December, 1975.

37. *Ibid*, p.22.

38. Ibid, p. 23.

39. For example, interviews with Jacob Zuma, Johannesburg, 27.7.93; Neo Moikangoa, Johannesburg, 14.6.93; Eddie Mabitsela, Bizana, 21.1.93; Penuel Maduna, Pretoria, 6.6.94; Govan Mbeki, Port Elizabeth, 2.11.93.

40. Interview with Walter Sisulu, *op. cit.*

41. Interview with Jacob Zuma, Johannesburg, 27.7.93.

42. Interview with Albie Sachs, Johannesburg, 3.2.93 & 4.2.93.

43. Bandile Ketelo et al., *op. cit.*, p.46, my emphasis.

44. The appellation was used by members from his high-ranking speech writers, such as Frene Ginwala, interviewed Johannesburg 3.6.94; Ngoako Ramathlodi, interviewed Johannesburg 24.6.93; and Eddie Mabitsela, converstation, Bizana, 22.1.93; to his bodyguards, such as Tony 'Gab' Msimang, interviewed Johannesburg 30.5.94; 'Knox' and 'Mshengu' (personal observation).

45. Monica Hunter, *op. cit.* Chapter X.

46. Interview with Mzwai Piliso, *op. cit.*

47. Interviews with Slava Shubin, 11.2.93; Indres Naidoo, 23.11.93; Anthony Mongalo, 23.3.93, Sindiso Mfenyana, 22.3.93, all in Johannesburg.

48. Interviews with Abdul Minty, Ros de Lanerol, Friedericke Schultz, Lisbet Palme, Sylvia Hill, Mary Frances Berry, Archbishop Trevor Huddleston, Mike Terry, Vella Pillay, Ethel de Kayser, Per Wastberg, David Wirmarck, Erich Mechanik, Andres Bjuner, Paul Boateng, A. Lyssarides, Emeka Anyaoku, Kenneth Kaunda, Frank Ferrari, William Lucy, Jennifer Davis.

49.Interviews with Antony Sampson, London, 12.5.93; David Astor, London, 14.5.93; Colin Legum, London and Johannesburg, 16.5.93 and 24.4.94; Diana Collins, Sussex, 13.5.93.

50. Emeka Anyaoku, Mosie Moola, Agnes Msimang, Mandi Msimang, Marcelino dos Santos, Kenneth Kaunda, Mzwai Piliso, James Stuart, Jacob Zuma, Indres Naidoo, Pallo Jordan, Albie Sachs, Aziz Pahad.

51. Hammond-Tooke, *op. cit.*, p.105.

52. Interviews with Henry Makgoti, 23.2.93; Ronnie Kasrils, 11.1.93; Abdul Minty, 12.11.93; Rashid, 2.4.93; Mzwai Piliso, 17.1.93.

53. Hammond-Tooke, *op. cit.*

54. Interview with Penuel Maduna, *op.cit.*

55. Interview with Mzwai Piliso, *op. cit.* See also interview with Chris Hani, *op. cit.*

56. Joe Modise, speech at Adelaide Tambo's demourning ceremony, Sandown, 12.6.94.

57. Interview with Joe Slovo, Johannesburg, 5.1.94 & 7.1.94.

58. For example, interviews with Makgoti, Mabuza, Maduna, Minty, Moikangoe, Ngcaba, Moola, Sachs, Stuart, Segal, Simon, Sisulu, Zuma.

59. Interview with Steve Tshwete, Johannesburg, 13.7.93.

60. Sachs, *op. cit.*

61. Albie Sachs, *op. cit.61.* See also Penuel Maduna, Henry Makgoti, *op. cit.*

62. Interview with Henry Makgoti, Johannesburg, 24.2.93 and 10.2.94.

63. Hammond-Tooke, *op. cit.* 98.

64. Hammond-Tooke, *ibid.*, pp.74 and 67.

65. Neo Moikangoa, '"What have I done?"', *op. cit.* p.6.

66. Interview with Nelson Mandela, 20.8.93.

67. Interview with Steve Tshwete, *op. cit.*

68. On the question of affirmative action for women, see for example interviews by Pallo Jordan, Bridgette Mabandla, Lindiwe Mabuza, Henry Makgoti, Albie Sachs, Ron[illegible], Gertrude Shope, *op. cit.*

69. For example, interviews with Bridgette and Lindelwe Mabandla, Johannesburg 18.6.94; Ngoako Ramahlodi, Lindiwe Mabuza, Penuel Maduna, *op. cit.*

70. Interview with Chris Nteta, Washington, 4.10.93.

71. Interview with Penuel Maduna, *op. cit.*

72. Interview with Jacob Zuma, *op. cit.*

73. Interview, Joe Slovo, *op.cit.*

74. Interview with Walter Sisulu, Johannesburg, 11.2.93.

75. Interview with Thubane and David Mankazana, Johannesiurg, 1.7.93. See also Phyllis Ntantala's autobiography, A Life's Mosaic (David Philip) 1992, for recollections of paternalism in a mission school.

76. Basil Davidson, The Black Man's Burden (Times Books, 1992) p.338.

77. Interview with Nelson Mandela, Johannesburg, 20.8.93.

78. See, for example, Tokyo Sexwale's appeal to SASCO (South African Students' Congress), on strike at the University of the Witwatersrand, to 'maintain the moral high ground', Wits Student, November 1993.

79. See, for example, interviews with Steve Tshwete and Chris Hani on Tambo's stern reprimand over civilian fatalities in sabotage operations in South Africa.

80. Steve Tshwete, *op. cit.*

81. *Ibid.*

82. Interview Dennis Brutus and May Brutus, Boulder, Colorado, 12.10.93.

83. Interview with Kenneth Kaunda, Johannesburg, 23.2.93.

84. Interview with James Stuart (Hermanus Loots), Johannesburg, 18.6.93.

85. For example, interviews with Cleopas Nsibande, Johannesburg, 3.6.93, John Nkadimeng, Johannesburg, 14.7.93, and with Mosie Moola, Johannesburg, 4.2.94.

86. Interview Trevor Huddleston, London, 10.5.93.

87. Interview Jan Grootboom, 20.5.94.

88. Interview with Thomas Nkobi, Johannesburg, 20.2.94.

89. Interview with Chris Hani, *op. cit.*

90. Interview Thomas Nkobi, *op. cit.*

91. Interview with Rumford Qwalela, Holy Cross, 20.1.93.

92. *Ibid.*

93. Interview with Howard Barrel, London, 24.5.93.

94. Lindiwe Mabuza, *op. cit.*

95. *Ibid.*

96. Alexander Kerr, Fort Hare 1915-48, Shuter & Shooter, 1969.

97. *Ibid*, pp.139-40.

98. Interview, Thomas Nkobi, *op. cit.*

99. Interview with W.M. Chagi, Kantolo, 22.1.93.

100. Interview Mr Thubane, Johannesburg, 1.7.93.

101. Interview with Dr Lancelot Gama, KwaThema, 2.3.94.

102. Interview with Fats Ngakane, London, 25.9.93. See also Rumford Qwalela, (Flagstaff, 19.1.93), Henry Makhoti, Vella Pillay, *op.cit.*

103. Makgoti, *op. cit.*

104. Interview with Lindiwe Mabuza, *op. cit.* See also, for example, Ngoako Ramathlodi, Agnes Msimang, Mendi Msimang, Pallo Jordan, Henry Makhoti, Gertrude Shope, amongst the ANC's qualified personnel at the time of their full-time commitment to the movement.

105. Tony 'Gab' Msimang, Henry Makgoti, Ronnie Kasrils, Rashid, Gertrude Shope, *op. cit.*

106. Thomas Nkobi, *op. cit.*

107. Interview with Howard Barrel, London, 25.5.93.

108. Interviews with Dumisa Ntuli and with Peter Kanyile, Tokoza, 18.8.92.

109. Interview with Oliver Tambo, Johannesburg, 14.1.93.

110. *Ibid.*

111. Interviews with Ronald Segal, Kenneth Kaunda, *op. cit.*, Per Wastberg, Stockholm, 17.5.93; Lisbet Palme, Stockholm 18.5.93, Marcelino dos Santos, Johannesburg, 10.7.93.

112. Dr Lancelot Gama, *op. cit.*

113. *Ibid.*

114. Interview with Frene Ginwala, 9.6.94. Ginwala is an intellectual of note within the ANC, and in 1994 was appointed Speaker of the House of Assembly.

115. Interview with Ronald Segal, Walton-on-Thames, 12.5.93.

116. Interviews with Frene Ginwala, Anthony Sampson, Penuel Maduna, Colin Legum, Ronald Segal, Abdul Minty, Walter Sisulu, Nelson Mandela, Joe Slovo, *op. cit.*

117. Interview with Pallo Jordan, Johannesburg, 12.4.93. Jordan was detained for some weeks by the ANC security before this assignment.

118. Interview Vella Pillay, Johannesburg, 21.9.93.

119. Interviews with Steve Tshwete, Penuel Maduna and Neo Moikangoa, *op. cit.*

120. Nelson Mandela, SABC CCV, 7 o'clock News, 24.4.93.

121. Interview with Nelson Mandela, Johannesburg, 1.9.94.

122. For a perceptive study in ambiguity see Shula Marx , *op. cit.*

123. Interview with David Wirmark, Stockholm, 19.5.93.

124. Interview with Anthony Sampson, London, 12.5.93.

125. Frene Ginwala, *op. cit.* In 1986, Tambo visited both Gorbachev and the White House.

126. Interviews with Penuel Maduna abd Steve Tshwete, *op. cit.*

127. Interview, Johannesburg, 29.4.94.

128. This is a more sensitive aspect of my research work and is not complete. I am accordingly not able to deal fully with this issue here.

129. I would prefer not identify these informants at this stage of my research.

130. See for example, Ronald Segal, *op. cit.*

131. Interview with Henry Malgoti, 10.2.94.

132. Interviews with Rusty and Hilda Bernstein, Albie Sachs, Joe Slovo, James Stuart, Chris Hani, Ronnie Kasrils, Ben Turok, *op. cit.*

133. *Op. cit.*

134. *Op. cit.* Sachs is a constitutional lawyer.

135. *Op. cit.* Mabandla is a constitutional lawyer and a feminist.

136. Jacob Zuma, Ngoako Ramathlodi, *op. cit.* Ramathlodi, now premier of the Northern Transvaal, is a lawyer.

137. Penuel Maduna, *op. cit.*

138. Alan Bullock, Hitler and Stalin: Parallel Lives (Harper Collins, 1991).

139. See Tom Couzens, The New African (Ravan Press, 1985) and Paul la Hausse, *op. cit.*