

https://dspace.org/

A critical evaluation of pre- and post- 1994 large-scale development programmes in South africa with particular focus on employment creation

Thwala, Wellington Didibhuku

2010-09-17
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/8736

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF PRE- AND POST- 1994 LARGE-SCALE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMMES IN SOUTH AFRICA WITH PARTICULAR FOCUS ON EMPLOYMENT CREATION

Wellington Didibhuku Thwala

A Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Engineering.

Johannesburg, 2009

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. It is being submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Engineering in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other University.

……..
Wellington Didibhuku Thwala

……..day of …… 2009

ABSTRACT

In South Africa, the levels of unemployment and poverty are extremely high and these are two of South Africa's most pressing problems. Over the past 28 years several major programmes have been initiated in South Africa to counter unemployment and poverty. Between 1980 and 1994, the former government spent billions of Rands on large-scale development programmes with the stated objective of using labour-intensive methods during the provision of physical infrastructure, to create employment and alleviate poverty. However, this did not solve the unemployment problem. Since 1994 the African National Congress (ANC) government has implemented large-scale programmes with similar objectives to those before 1994. After an analysis of the theoretical premises and implementation of labour-intensive public works programmes in Africa, the thesis critically evaluated several pre - and post - 1994 large-scale development programmes in South Africa. Major conclusions are that very little sustainable employment was created and there was no long-term programme approach to address poverty alleviation. Furthermore, lessons that could have been learnt from pre – 1994 have not been applied in the post 1994 period. Shortcomings in programme planning and implementation of large-scale development programmes in South Africa still exist. Another major conclusion is that the pre-1994 lessons were not taken into considerations in the post-1994 programme planning and implementation. Based on the research, the author has derived a six phase Programme Management Framework for Development Programmes. This framework embodies a long-term programme management approach to the planning and implementation of large-scale, labour-intensive development programmes.

KEYWORDS: Labour-intensive, public works, employment creation, large-scale development programmes projects, poverty, and infrastructure.

To my Father and Mother

Samuel Mpini Thwala and Nester Phahlakati Thwala

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the following people for their support in the preparation of this document.

- First, I would like to gratefully acknowledge the guidance, encouragement, insights and opportunities given to me by Professor R.T. McCutcheon, who supervised this thesis.
- Various people from the Department of Public Works, Independent Development Trust, University of Witwatersrand Project Management in Developing Areas students, Gauteng Department of Transport, Roads and Works, International Labour Organisation staff members, their support in providing me with information is acknowledged.
- The financial support from Mellon Foundation and the National Department of Public Works is acknowledged.
- To all my friends, particularly David Olebogeng, their support is acknowledged.
- My brother, Mbuso Simanga Dlamini, who passed away 1st January 2000 your support throughout my academic life, is acknowledged. I would also like to express my sincere gratitude to my sister, Simisile Nkosingiphile Thwala, who passed away in April 2008, may her soul rest in peace.
- The support from my daughter, Langelihle Lindelwa Thwala, is acknowledged.
- My brothers and sister, Mzwandile, Bongani, Shinkela, and Bongiwe Thwala, for their supportive role through difficult times

- Lastly I would like to thank my Father and Mother, Mr Samuel Mpini Thwala and Mrs Nester Phahlakati Thwala who cared and sacrificed so much for my early education.

CONTENTS

DECLARATION **i**

ABSTRACT **iii**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS **v**

CONTENTS **vi**

LIST OF FIGURES **xv**

LIST OF TABLES **xvi**

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS **xviii**

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION **1**

1.1 BACKGROUND 1

1.2 Problem Statement 3

1.3 Significance of the Study 6

1.4 Monitoring and Evaluation 7

1.5 Infrastructure and Development 9

1.6 Multiplier Effect 9

1.7 The Need for Large-Scale Public Works Programmes in South Africa 10

1.8 The Research Methodology 13

1.8.1 Descriptive Research 14

1.8.2 Historical Research 14

1.8.3 Comparative Research 15

1.8.4 Evaluation Research 16
1.9 Structure of the Thesis 19
1.9.1 Chapter 1 19
1.9.2 Chapter 2 19
1.9.3 Chapter 3 20
1.9.4 Chapter 4 20
1.9.5 Chapter 5 20
1.9.6 Chapter 6 20
1.9.7 Chapter 7 21
1.9.8 Chapter 8 21
1.9.9 Chapter 9 22
1.9.10 Chapter 10 22
1.10 Conclusions 22

CHAPTER 2 COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT APPROACH FOR DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS IN SOUTH AFRICA 23
2.1 Introduction 23
2.2 The Principle of Human Orientation 24
2.3 The Principle of Participation – Participation Defined 26
2.4 The Principle of Empowerment 27
2.4.1 What is empowerment? 27
2.5 The Principle of Ownership 29
2.6 The Principle of Release 29
2.7 The Principle of Learning 30
2.8 Obstacles to Community Development 31
2.9 Summary 32

CHAPTER 3 OVERVIEW OF EMPLOYMENT CREATION THROUGH PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMMES IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA AND THE SOUTH AFRICAN EXPERIENCE 34
3.1 Introduction 34

3.2 Poverty in South Africa 35
3.3 Youth Unemployment in South Africa 36
3.4 Unemployment and Skills Development in South Africa 38
3.5 Public works programmes and employment creation 40
3.6 Overview of African Experiences through the Use of the Labour-Intensive Approach in Public Works Programmes 42
3.7 Infrastructure and Development 45
3.8 The Need for Public Works Programmes in South Africa 45
3.9 Implementation of Public Works Projects through Labour-intensive methods in South Africa: Summary of Experiences, Problems and Prospects 46
3.10 Summary 50

CHAPTER 4 PRE– 1994 LARGE-SCALE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMMES AND PROJECTS 52
4.1 Introduction 52
4.2 The Greater Soweto Upgrading Project 53
4.3 Programme Achievement 54
4.4 Lessons Learnt 57
4.5 The Republic of South Africa KwaZulu-Natal Development Programme 57
4.5.1 Development programme achievement 58
4.5.2 Lessons learnt 60
4.6 Strategic Oil Reserves Fund Programmes 62
4.6.1 Achievement of project objectives 64
4.6.2 Achievement of plans and lessons learnt 65
4.7 The Special Employment Creation Programme 67
4.7.1 Achievements of objectives 69
4.7.2 Weaknesses 70
4.8 Projects and Programme Findings, Recommendations and Conclusion 73
4.9 Summary 74

CHAPTER 5 COMMUNITY BASED PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMME 76

5.1 Introduction 76
5.2 Policy and Institutional Failure 78
5.3 Overview of the 1999/2000 and 2000/2001 Community Based Public Works Programme 81
5.4 The nature of the Community Based Public Works Programme 82
5.5 Managing the Community Based Public Works Programme 83
5.5.1 Provincial Department of Public Works 83
5.6 The 1999/2000 Community Based Public Works Programme 86
5.7 The 2000/2001 Community Based Public Works Programme 87
5.8 Budget allocation 87
5.8.1 The results 88
5.9 What assets were delivered by the CBPWP? 90
5.10 The cost of delivery 93
5.11 Calculating the management cost of the CBPWP 94
5.12 Expenditure 98
5.13 The provision of training 99
5.14 Creating employment 100
5.14.1 Sustainable employment 100
5.14.2 Temporary employment 102
5.14.3 Meeting the CBPWP employment targets 103
5.15 Summary 105

CHAPTER 6 THE NATIONAL FOOD EMERGENCY PROGRAMME 109
6.1 Introduction 109
6.2 The National Food Emergency Programme 110
6.3 Programme Management Plan 112
6.3.1 Programme scope 112
6.2.2 Beneficiaries 112
6.4 Target Areas 114
6.5 Food Parcels 116
6.5.1 Programme timeframes 117

6.5.2 Programme budget 117
6.6 Institutional Arrangements 118
6.7 Communication management 119
6.8 Quality Management 120
6.9 Risk Management 120
6.10 Monitoring and Reporting 121
6.11 Beneficiary Identification 122
6.12 Appointment of Service Providers 123
6.13 Delivery of Food Parcels 125
6.14 Monitoring and Reporting 126
6.14.1 Beneficiary profile form 126
6.14.2 Distribution summary sheet 126
6.14.3 Household level form 127
6.15 Communication 127
6.16 Beneficiary Identification and Data Management 128
6.17 National 128
6.18 Provincial Experiences 130
6.19 Service Provider Management 132
6.19.1 National 132
6.19.2 Provincial experiences 134
6.19.2.1 Delivery of food parcels 136
6.19.2.2 National 136
6.19.3 Provincial Experiences 137
6.20 Provision of Supplementary Food 142
6.21 Drop-in-Centres 142
6.22 Financial Management 143
6.22.1 Expenditure 143
6.23 Challenges 145
6.23.1 Implementation Timeframes 145
6.23.2 Beneficiary Identification 45
6.23.3 Quality of Food 146

6.23.4 Appointment of Service Providers 146
6.23.5 Monitoring and Reporting 146
6.23.6 Participation by other role players 147
6.23.7 Stakeholder Participation 147
6.24 Lessons Learned 148
6.24.1 Capacity of Service Providers 148
6.24.2 Grade of Food Items 149
6.24.3 Cost of Food Parcel 149
6.24.4 Distribution points 149
6.25 Summary 150

CHAPTER 7 THE POVERTY RELIEF PROGRAMME: THE CLEAN AND GREEN PROGRAMME 151
7.1 Background 151
7.2 Introduction to the Clean and Green Programme 151
7.3 Methodology 153
7.4 Programme aims 153
7.5 Strategic partnerships 154
7.6 Operational level partnerships 156
7.7 Challenges to the Partnership 158
7.7.1 Challenges to the Partnership at the Strategic Level 158
7.7.2 The challenges to the partnerships at the project level 159
7.8 Programme achievements 160
7.8.1 Programme Costs 160
7.8.2 Programme Outcomes 161
7.8.3 Cleaning up Campaigns 161
7.8.4 Greening Campaigns 161
7.8.5 Environmental Campaigns 162
7.9 Capacity Building 163
7.10 Lessons Learnt 167
7.10.1 Programme conceptualisation 167

7.9.3 Proposed Deliverables 168
7.9.4 Programme Sustainability 169
7.10 Recommendations 169
7.11.1 Strategic partnerships 174
7.11.2 Beneficiary testimonies 174
7.11.3 Challenges to implementation 176
7.11.4 IDT value adding 177
7.12 Summary 177

CHAPTER 8 ZIVUSENI POVERTY RELIEF PROGRAMME 179
8.1 Introduction 179
8.2 Programme purpose 180
8.3 Programme Scope 180
8.3.1 Programme Objectives 180
8.4 Planned beneficiaries and beneficiary communities 181
8.5 Budget and Cash-flow Cycles 182
8.5.1 Explanatory Notes to budget 184
8.6 Strategic partnerships 187
8.7 Programme outputs and achievements of social targets 187
Part A: Cash flow 188
PART B: Social Targets 189
PART C: Analysis 190
8.8 Challenges to implementation 191
8.8.1 Recruitment strategy 191
8.7.2 Geographic targeting 191
8.7.3 Training 191
8.7.4 Targeting the disabled 192
8.7.5 Beneficiary payment 192
8.8 Lessons learnt 192
8.8.1 Programme design 193
8.8.2 Community expectations 193

8.8.3 Communication and social facilitation 194
8.9 Summary 194

CHAPTER 9 AN EVALUATION OF THE INTEGRATED SUSTAINABLE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME IN THE KGALAGADI DISTRICT MUNICIPALITY 196
9.1 Introduction 196
9.2 The Developmental Mandate 197
9.3 The Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy 198
9.4 The responsibilities of the Independent Development Trust 199
9.5 Vision of the ISRDS 199
9.6 Why the Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy 200
9.7 Nodal Approach 200
9.8 Delivery Framework 201
9.9 Methodology 202
9.10 Overview of the Kgalagadi District Municipality 202
9.11 Demographic profile 203
9.12 Social Profile 203
9.13 Economic Profile 204
9.14 Kgalagadi District Municipality Nodal Objectives 205
9.15 Specific Anchor Projects 207
9.15.1 Integrated Energy Centre 207
9.15.2 Roads, Clinics and Primary Health Care 212
9.15.3 Mothibistad Housing Project 215
9.15.4 Flagship Poultry and Abattoir Project 218
9.15.5 Livestock improvement and production 220
9.15.6 Kgalagadi Dipudi Enterprise 222
9.15.7 Moshaweng Municipal Offices 224
9.15.8 Kgalagadi Water Project 227
9.15.9 Electrification Project 230
9.15.10 Municipal Support Programme 231

9.16 Summary 232

CHAPTER 10 FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONs AND GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS 235

10.1 Introduction 235

10.2 Findings 236

10.3 Recommendations 241

10.4 The Author's Proposed Programme Management Framework for Development Programmes in South Africa 246

10.5 When to use the framework 248

10.6 How the framework is applied 250

10.7 Programme Framework Check List 250

10.7.1 Stage 1: Identification of need 250

10.7.2 Stage 2: Training and empowerment of stakeholders 251

10.7.3 Stage 3: Alternatives and approval 252

10.7.4 Stage 4: Implementation and monitoring of the programme 252

10.7.5 Stage 5: Evaluation of the development programme and framework 253

10.7.6 Stage 6: Sustainability of the development programme 253

10.8 What is the role of the Programme Manager? 254

10.9 What is the role of a Programme Steering Committee? 254

10.10 Summary of the main Research Findings 255

10.11 Areas for Further Research 262

10.12 Conclusion 264

Bibliography 266

APPENDIX A PEOPLE INTERVIEWED 298

A.1 Professionals 298

A.2 Residents 298

APPENDIX B ZIVUSENI POVERTY RELIEF PROGRAMME GAUTENG DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC TRANSPORT, ROADS AND WORKS IDT PROGRAMME DESIGN 2002-2005 **300**

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 10.1: Proposed project management framework for development programme in South Africa 249

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1: Poverty indicators by province in South Africa 36

Table 3.2: Employment status (official definition of employment) 37

Table 3.3: Employment age cohorts that are 18 to 25 years and 26 to 35 years 38

Table 3.4: Case study: non-residential building 40

Table 4.1: Total infrastructure backlog roads, streets and stormwater drainage 55

Table 4.2: Sewerage services 56

Table 4.3: Water supply and reticulation 56

Table 4.4: Project achievements 59

Table 4.5: Pre-1994 projects and programmes planned and actual budget 73

Table 5.1: Budget allocation 1999/2000 to 2000/2001 89

Table 5.2: Distribution of projects across the project categories 91

Table 5.3: Actual expenditure as per analysis of final payments to project implementing agency by year 95

Table 5.4: Actual expenditure taking into account management/ support at project implementing agency level by year 95

Table 5.5: CBPWP management cost (including/excluding social facilitation by year 97

Table 5.6: Short and long-term job opportunities created by year and province 101

Table 5.7: Performance in meeting in the employment targets by year and province 104

Table 6.1: Statistics South Africa: categories of household food per capita monthly expenditure 113

Table 6.2: Breakdown of Band A by province according to Statistics South Africa 114

Table 6.3: Target areas per province and the estimated number of beneficiary households 115

Table 6.4: Food parcel content 116

Table 6.5: Allocation of funds per province 117
Table 6.6: Risk categories 121
Table 6.7: Number of beneficiaries captured by province 129
Table 6.8: Service providers appointed per province 133
Table 6.9: The number of food parcels delivered per province 136
Table 6.10: List of Drop-in-Centres identified 143
Table 6.11: Provincial expenditure as at 30 September 2003 144
Table 7.1: Budget allocation per project site for financial year 2001/02 171
Table 7.2: Clean Green project sites for the project duration 173
Table 7.3: Breakdown of costs invested into CAGP by the partners 174
Table 8.1: Budget for Zivuseni Poverty Alleviation Project Year 1 (2002/2003) 183
Table 8.2: Revised Budget for Zivuseni Poverty Alleviation Project Year 2 (2003/2004) 186
Table 8.3: Revised Budget for Zivuseni Poverty Alleviation Project Year 3 (2004/2005) 186
Table 8.4: Programme achievements 188
Table 9.1: Population by race 203
Table 9.2: Economic and basic infrastructure indicators 205
Table 9.3: Monthly sales of fuel (in litres) 208
Table 9.4: Monthly sales of LP gas by type of unit sold 209
Table 9.5: September 2003 diesel order (in litres) for Sedibeng Water 209
Table 9.6: Household status in the Kgalagadi District 215
Table 9.7: Water status in Kgalagadi 227
Table 10.1: Shortcomings of pre- and post-1994 projects and programmes 236

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CASE	Community Agency for Social Enquiry
CASP	Clean and Green Programme
CBPWP	Community-Based Public Works Programme
CETA	The Construction Education and Training Authority
CIM	Capital-Intensive Methods
DBSA	Development Bank of Southern Africa
DoA	Department of Agriculture
DoL	Department of Labour
DOT	Department of Transport
RSA/KNDP	Republic of South Africa/ KwaZulu-Natal Development Programme
DWAF	Department of Water Affairs and Forestry
CIM	Capital Intensive Methods
EIC	Employment Intensive Construction
EIEC	Employment Intensive Engineering Consultants
EIM	Employment Intensive Methods
EPWP	Expanded Public Works Programme
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IDT	Independent Development Trust
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ISRDP	Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Programme

LIM	Labour-Intensive Methods
LITE	Labour-Intensive Training and Engineering
KRAAP	Kenyan Rural Access Roads Programme
KSAB	Keep South Africa Beautiful
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MI	Machine-Intensive
MIP	Municipal Infrastructure Programme
NEF	National Economic Forum
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
NDPW	National Department of Public Works
NPWP	National Public Works Programme
RARP	Rural Access Roads Programme
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SAB	South African Breweries
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SAICE	South African Institution of Civil Engineers
SAACE	South African Association of Consulting Engineers
SASS	South African Statistical Service
SANCO	South African National Civic Organisation
SDIs	Spatial Development Initiatives
SECP	Special Employment Creation Programme
SORF	Strategic Oil Reserve Fund
SPWP	Special Public Works Programme
SOWETO	South Western Township
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme

UN	United Nations
UNPD	United Nations Development Programme
WB	World Bank
WEP	World Employment Programme