

https://dspace.org/

The construction of selected diversity issues in the reporting of three rape incidents: a discourse analysis of two Gauteng newspapers

Robinson, Kelly

2016-02-18
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/19595

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

Chapter 1.

1. Introduction

Who raped Baby Tshepang? (The Star, 2002, January 17).

Girl slowly recovering from gang-rape ordeal. (The Star, 2001, November 7).

Rape: Destroyer of victims lives. (The Sowetan, 2013, May 8).

No mercy for killer of lesbian footballer. (The Star, 2009, February 14).

News story headlines from a South African newspaper; disturbing, yet seemingly widely tolerated.

December 16th, 2012 in India, a medical student was beaten and gang-raped on a bus by six men (Eisenberg, 2013). The student was initially unnamed, as Indian law does not permit the victim to be named publicly unless permission to do so is given by the victim's family (Bresnahan, Udas & Ramgopal, 2013). This event sparked a national uproar and protest action occurred throughout the country. To the people of India, this assault was a grim reminder of the daily reality that exists in their society; "Thousands of protestors took to the streets in these areas of the city, arguing against the high rate of sex crimes in India and the way in which the government treated such crimes" (Eisenberg, 2013). As a collective, they took a stand against this gross violation of one human by another. The incident became the pivotal point around which they protested. The end result: the government changed the laws around the punishment of rape (Eisenberg, 2013). This specific case shows how a single incident amidst many, became the turning point in a national response.

Recently, India made news headlines again - the incident was the rape and murder of two teenage girls (Awan, 2014). This incident, however, brought to the surface another social issue, an issue not overtly mentioned in the discussion of the rape of the medical student in 2012 which sparked a national outcry - the implications of the caste system in India. Awan (2014) comments "The act of rape is often a crime of power against a lower caste community, of which the girls are actively targeted. The recent shocking case of two teenage girls gang-raped and hanged in a tree in Badaun, rural Uttar Pradesh, is a case in point". The people in this community are not angered merely by the violent assault and death of two teenagers. They are angered by the treatment that their social casting seemingly permits to be meted against them. Awan (2014) further states that "The anger caused by the gang-rape and murder is not just about the sexual crime. It is born of a desire to fight against the targeted exploitation of girls from the Dalit community, which is the poorest of the poor in India's rigid caste hierarchy".

The Sunday Times *(*8 June, 2014), a South African weekly newspaper reported the following in relation to the Indian rape crisis: "For much of India's history, the lower castes, especially the Dalits (once known as the untouchables), have been routinely raped by the landowning upper castes. Better legal protection, urbanisation and social mobility have helped reduce caste-based discrimination, but not enough". This raises the questions: Is the caste system being brought to the fore as a social concern or it is being used as a means to explain why it is that women and girls in India are raped?

It seems that such soul searching is not a characteristic of how South Africa reacts to the question of the high prevalence of rape. Professor Mandla Makhanya, in 2013 indicates "various media reports… stated that Interpol named South Africa as the world's rape capital" *(*Naidu-Hoffmeester and Kamal, 2013*).* The article's authors make the disconcerting observation that given the current known and suspected rape statistics, "women were more likely to be raped than educated" *(*Naidu-Hoffmeester and Kamal, 2013***).** Makhanya lamented "despite these frightening statistics, experts said while rape in South Africa is common, it barely makes the news" *(*Naidu-Hoffmeester and Kamal, 2013*).* This absence from news headlines is reflected upon by Rebecca Davis (2013) in an article, *Lost in Oscar Pistorius frenzy, the horrific violence against women and children continues,* where she comments, "The grim truth is that violence against women in South Africa is so prevalent that individual cases are not even particularly newsworthy. They are just a part of daily life". The Heinrich Boell Foundation recently released a paper, parts of which appeared in *TimesLive (*4/07/2014) under the title *SA loses in a tale of two rapes* by Aarti J Narsee. The article compared the public response to the rape of Anene Booysen in South Africa and the rape of Jyoti Singh Pandey, named publicly by her father (Farhoud, 2013), in India. Narsee (2014) takes a quote from the Heinrich Boell paper which reflects this comparative response, " "while Anene's death was catapulted into the public domain, it elicited a sad murmuring of social mobilisation"" while in India "men and women from different classes and castes took to the streets in protest, holding candlelight vigils and demanding government action to deal with the scourge of rape". The purpose of this research project is, however, not to draw comparisons between the public responses to these two incidents of rape.

Different ways of representing rape can make us understand shifting constructs of rape across time and place. Regarding the incidents in India, the medical student, where initially her caste position was not a clear pivotal point around which demonstrations in response to the incident were mobilised, gets considered in a report in a South African newspaper. Fontanella-Khan (2014) writes that "Since December 2012, when a 23-year-old woman from the Kurmi caste, another low-ranking group, died after being assaulted by five men as they drove around in a bus, India has been searching its soul".

Here in South Africa, it seems that there is the moment of shock at the headline, people express their views on various media platforms but it seems that there is little concrete result from this. Social action or campaigning appears to come from women's activism groups such as POWA (People Opposing Woman Abuse). This group is a, according to its website introduction; "feminist, women's rights organisation that provides both services, and engages in advocacy in order to ensure the realisation of women's rights and thereby improve women's quality of life" (www.powa.co.za).

Bernard C. Cohen in Nel (1994, p. 15) is quoted as saying:

> The press is significantly more than a purveyor of information and opinion. It may not be successful much of the time in telling what to think, but it is stunningly successful in telling its readers what to think about. And it followed from this that the world looks different to different people depending not only on their personal interests, but also on the map that is drawn for them by the writers and editors, and publishers of the papers that they read. The editor may believe that he is only printing things that people want to read, but he is thereby putting a claim on their attention, powerfully determining what they will be thinking about, and talking about, until the next wave laps their shore.

This quote sets a stage for exploring how rape is reported and how the reading audience is positioned. It is for this reason that there is an interest in the exploration of how rape is reported in newspapers in South Africa specifically. Linked to the constructs of articles from India, it would appear that more information is provided regarding the caste system, in more recent articles; it was clearly mentioned in the article by Awan (2014) in relation to the teenage rape and picked up by Fontella-Khan (2014) in relation to both the medical student and teenage incidents. The newspaper appears to permit its readers to enter this angle of analysis into their discussion around the prevalence of rape in India, in this manner alluding

to the idea that there are more underlying societal issues which need to be considered in relation to rape. In the process of answering the proposed research question; how three specific incidents of rape are reported in newspapers will be considered, taking into account where the article is positioned in the newspaper and the manner in which information in the article is constructed and presented to the audience. This will be further considered in relation to broader social issues of diversity.

This research project intends to address the question: How is the way in which rape is reported in two Gauteng daily newspapers indicative of underlying social assumptions about broader diversity issues in South Africa? This is informed mostly by the framing of the rape of the medical student in India in 2012 and again, in 2014 when two teenage girls were raped and hanged in India. In each of these instances, it was noted that different social constructs were omitted or brought to the fore. This leads to the question: what is not being said in the South African context? What assumptions are being perpetuated in the process of reporting rape incidents in newspapers in South Africa? This research question will be explored through the rape of Anene Booysen – a heterosexual teenager, Eudy Simelane – a lesbian woman and Baby Tshepang – a baby who was raped in 2001. Each of these individuals has been selected as representative of different ages and sexualities.

This research question will be answered from a social constructionist stance. Terre Blanche, Durrheim and Painter (2006, p. 278) explain that "Social constructionist methods, like their interpretive counterparts, are qualitative, interpretive, and concerned with meaning". Social constructionism, according to Terre Blanche, Durrheim and Painter (2006, p. 279) "is concerned with broader patterns of social meaning encoded in language". This method of study, however, is not solely focused on language but also "about interpreting the social world as a kind of language, that is, as a system of meanings and practices that construct reality" (Terre Blanche, Durrheim & Painter, 2006, p. 280). This particular stance has its origins within the field of linguistics. Modern theorist Ferdinand de Saussure "introduced a fundamental distinction between *langue* (the system of language) and *parole* (its use in actual situations) (Terre Blanche, Durrheim & Painter, 2006, p. 279). As this approach handles data from the stance that people's "thoughts, feelings and experiences were the products of systems of meaning that exist at a social rather than an individual level" (Terre Blanche, Durrheim and Painter, 2006, p. 278) it is an appropriate position from which to answer this research question.

The intention of this research is to explore the social diversity issues that potentially exist in South African society and the manner in which these are continuously recycled through the reporting styles of print media in relation to three specific incidents of rape which have occurred.

Chapter 2.

2. Theoretical framework

The theoretical framework provides an outline of the concepts that were explored and discussed in the course of answering the proposed research question.

For the purpose of this research project, the constructs of masculinity, femininity and homosexuality were examined. The perceptions that are experienced along the lines of race in relation to sexuality were examined, as from literature, it is evident that race influences the manner in which an individual is expected to embody either their masculinity or femininity and associated sexuality. Analysis of data which was gathered was done using thematic analysis.

2.1 Social Construction

Burr (2003, p. 2) explains that social constructionism "draws its influences from a number of disciplines, including philosophy, sociology and linguistics, making it interdisciplinary in nature". Thus it is evident that this is an approach which has constructed itself on the basis of different schools of thought. Thematic analysis which is the method of analysis of this project is also found within the framework of this approach.

Burr (2003, p.2) states that there is not a specific feature "which could be said to identify a social constructionist position". Burr (2003, p. 2) proposes that a social constructionist approach is "any approach which has at its foundation one or more of the following key assumptions (from Gergen, 1985)". These approaches include the following:

- "A critical stance toward taken-for-granted knowledge" (Burr, 2003, p. 2) – meaning that observations in the world need to be engaged with in a critical manner, rather than at a surface level.
- "Historical and cultural specificity" (Burr, 2003, p. 3) – the manner in which meaning is constructed has to be based within the frame work of its historical and cultural relativity. If a concept is considered outside of the parameters of historical and cultural specificity, is does not have a sense of meaning.
- "Knowledge is sustained by social processes" (Burr, 2003, p. 4) – the meaning that is gotten within a society is dependent on social interactions. Burr (2003) notes that of

particular interest to social constructionists is the social interaction which occurs through language.

- "Knowledge and social action go together" (Burr, 2003, p. 5) – this dynamic is explained by Burr (2003) as being tied in power relations. It is this power dynamic through which "Descriptions or constructions of the world therefore sustain some patterns of social action and exclude others" (Burr, 2003, p. 5).

This approach is not prescriptive in its analytic method. There is room for the researcher to derive meaning based on the framework in which the argument is structured. In the case of this research project the researcher aims to determine what underlying social assumptions are perpetuated through the manner in which two newspapers report on the same stories. The entry point of the discussion is rape, but meaning is derived from within the constructs of race, class, gender and sexuality.

2.2 Diversity issues

Velásquez (2006) in a presentation paper to companies, explained that a diversity issue, simply put, is "What you don't know you don't know". He clarifies this statement by explaining a diversity issue, in relation to business, in these three steps:

1) When an issue (policy or business practice – formal, informal, internal or external) has a different impact on a particular group.
2) When it happens more frequently to a particular group.
3) When it is more difficult for one group to overcome some aspect of business structuring.

(Velásquez, 2006)

In relation to this research project, the diversity issues which will be considered are those of race, class, gender and sexuality. The constructs of masculinity, femininity and homosexuality, race and sexuality were examined concurrently as there is an intersection between race, sexuality and these constructs. It is therefore not possible to adequately discuss them separately. Each of these is a point at which there is a contention for a legitimate existence in society. These were considered in relation to the newspaper articles as represented in two different newspapers, The Star and The Sowetan, and the representation of three specific incidents of rape in the respective newspapers.

2.3 Masculinity

According to Whitehead and Barrett (2001) masculinity is not easy to concisely define or explain. These authors offer the following explanation that: "masculinities are those behaviours, languages and practices, existing in specific cultural and organisational locations, which are commonly associated with males and thus culturally defined as not feminine" (Whitehead & Barrett, 2001, p. 15-16). The authors elaborate that masculinity is not solely determined by biology, rather that the concept of masculinity and the expectations of embodying this position are informed by "social and cultural expectations of male behaviour" (Whitehead & Barrett, 2001, p. 16).

Whitehead and Barrett (2001, p. 22) explain that "to define hegemonic masculinity as strong, wilful, controlling, determined and competent, it is necessary to see femininity as fragile, incompetent, angelic, precious". In this statement, it is evident that the words used in relation to masculinity are those that conjure images of strength, stability and independence while those in relation to femininity are gentle, passive and dependent, in the process constructing an uneven power relation between the groups.

Gunkel (2011) discusses that during the period of colonisation, being white had specific connotations linked into constructs of power and sexuality. Gunkel (2011, p. 35) reflects "Whiteness is a crucial element within the history of sexuality. Europe was expanding the colonies and the different forms of colonialism had one important commonality: they were all based on the concept of white supremacy that constituted discourses of primitivism and exclusion". This colonial ideology of superiority formed the basis of how colonised people were treated by colonisers. This construct of dominance continued in South Africa and is reflected in history through various laws which were passed starting with the 1913 Land Act, through to the stringent laws which governed Apartheid policies. During Apartheid, the government effectively linked the concept of sexuality and race. Sexuality in this case was assumed to be heterosexual and regulated through the construct of the family (Gunkel, 2011). Within this construct, the idea of the white, nuclear family unit was perpetuated. Those who fell outside of this parameter were ostracised.

Black masculinity, during the period of slavery, is discussed by Marshall (1996) as being constructed through the process of domination of black men. Black men were emasculated through domination by white men on the basis of their racial category. Black women were

dominated by both white people and black men. This means of domination of black women created a space for oppressed slave men to assert themselves.

In the context of the mining community in South Africa, Niehaus (2009) discusses how black masculinities were defined through the act of migrancy. By working on the mines and earning an income that was not available in the areas from which the miners had migrated, they were able to support their families at home. This process of migrancy, which was created largely by apartheid policies, which made black masculinity inferior to white masculinity, provided a space for black men to assert their masculinity and perform the role of family provider.

These constructs in relation to rape can be considered in the following manner; due to the supposed superiority of the white male and the position that history has created for him to occupy, he is effectively able to be distanced from being held accountable for rape, despite this not being true. The black male, however, is positioned in the completely opposite manner. Thus it is evident that historical structures have had a lasting impact on the racial positioning of men in society and in this instance within South African society.

2.4 Femininity

Marshall (1996) begins her exploration of the construction of the black women at the point of slavery. During slavery, black women came to be constructed as "sensuous, bestial, good in bed, loose, promiscuous, breeders and prone to prostitution" (Marshall, 1996, p. 5). On these premises, black women were subject to numerous abuses at the hand of slave masters. Their constructed identity created a space for this to occur. Contrasted to this image of the wayward, easily exploited black woman was the image of the white woman. The white woman, by virtue of the hue of her skin, was seen as a symbol of "purity, virginity, virtue, beauty, beneficence and God" (Marshall, 1996, p. 6). Neither of these groups of women, defined by racial categorisation, however, was permitted to define for themselves a position in society. Each was the property of white men, black women through the process of slavery and white women either through marriage or the family construct, where a father made decisions for his daughter until she was married and from there on her husband controlled her.

McClintock (1995) takes the categorisation discourse further, exploring how groups were differentiated and ranked in relation to the white male who was considered to be the archetype category of human based on an explanatory analogy of a Western nuclear family, where the adult male is the head of the household and the male child raised to follow in his footsteps (McClintock, 1995). McClintock (1995, p. 48) states in relation to this that "A host of "inferior" groups could now be mapped, measured and ranked against the "universal standard" of the white male child - within the organic embrace of the family metaphor and the Enlightenment regime of it "rational" measurement as an optics of truth". Included in these groups would have been white females, black females and black males. The groups into which people were categorised would have affected the roles within society that they were expected to fulfil. For the purpose of this paper, a more detailed look at the sexual expectations and assumptions, especially of women, is explored using the work of Gunkel (2011).

The sexual expectations and assumptions made in relation to the women who were racially categorised as either black or white is evident in the statement by Gunkel (2011, p. 41) that:

> The focus on reproduction and sex shows the ambivalence within constructions of whiteness. Sex and sexual desire were not considered as 'essentially', white. White females' sexuality in particular was constituted as being passive, not really existent, or existent only in contrast to the construction of black (female) sexuality, as hypersexual, as always present and 'deviant'. Whiteness was/is linked to mind over body, working in opposition to blackness, which was supposed to signify the body over mind.

This idea was echoed through the Apartheid regime and it is possible to see shadows of this ideology in society today. In relation to rape, the shadow which lingers is the idea that black women are inherently rapeable; this can be linked back to the structuring of their sexuality during the period of slavery and Apartheid laws. White women by contrast are not considered to be as rapeable as black women. In the event that white women are raped, it is hidden from the media, the scandal seemingly too horrific to be broadcast in a headline. From this discussion, it is evident that based on the constructs of sexuality in relation to race that women from different racial groupings may be perceived differently when they are raped.

2.5 Homosexuality

Homosexuality has been hotly contested on the African continent. In 2000, Robert Mugabe, of Zimbabwe declared homosexuality "an abomination, a rottenness of culture imposed upon Africans by Britain's 'gay government'" (Gunkel, 2011, p. 25). Presidents in Namibia, Uganda and Zambia echoed similar sentiments. Gunkel (2011) explores this idea of homosexuality further, offering the explanation that the concept of homosexuality, as it is understood in the Western context, varies from that within the African context. According to Gunkel (2011) homosexuality in the Western context does not adequately capture the complexities of same-sex relationships within the African context. The biggest difference in understanding seemingly occurs in what it means to be involved in a same-sex relationship. If it is labelled as homosexual from a western perspective, it is unacceptable but couched within the constructs of African cultural and societal understanding it is acceptable.

This is evident in the work done Morgan and Wieringa (2005). The authors explore various forms of same-sex relationships, specifically focusing on female relationships in different countries in Africa. Many of the women interviewed stated that they knew the relationship they were seeking was seen as wrong in their society, thus many relationships were shrouded in secrecy (Morgan and Wieringa, 2005). Suki (an interviewee) reflects this concept saying, "I know there are many of us who are in hiding from parents and society. It is not that we are not proud of who we are. It is because of how society will view us" (Morgan and Wieringa, 2005, p. 47). The interviewee's statement reflects a western understanding and expression of homosexuality; a position that in the context in which she lives, is not one that is tolerated.

For these relationships to be legitimate, they need to be understood and framed within socially appropriate terminology and contexts. This is evident in a discussion in Kenya concerning "a well-known tradition of same-sex marriages between women from certain ethic groups" (Morgan and Wieringa, 2005, p. 26). It appears that the point of contention occurs when women in same-sex relationships publicly present themselves as such and then attempt to align themselves with same-sex movements that are usually associated with the West, such as the LGBTI movement.

These attitudes echo today, perhaps not in direct relation to colonial ideologies but there is the sentiment that homosexuality is unacceptable. It is possible to consider the rape of lesbian women as an action resulting from the implications of these views. The disapproval does not

necessarily lead directly to the rape of lesbian women, but it creates the space for the idea to develop that being lesbian is undesirable and that it needs to be addressed accordingly.

During Apartheid, openly identifying as either gay or lesbian was bound "to bring social and economic" (Gunkel, 2011, p. 52) as well as legal ramifications for the individual. This is evident in the comment about the supposed dangers of homosexuality, that it was a lifestyle that was seen to be "violating the sanctity of heterosexuality, family and reproduction" (Gunkel, 2011, p. 57). The resulting conversations about sexual and moral decay were linked and contrasted with the values of Christianity and of being white (Gunkel, 2011) two constructs through which the construct of the nuclear family was seemingly based.

Linking the above ideas of homosexuality being 'un-African' and the idea that despite homosexuality being legal in South Africa that it is not always accepted in society. The focus of the potential dangers to people who do not conform to a heteronornamtive lifestyle needs to be considered (Martin, Kelly, Turquet and Ross, 2009). For the purpose of this research that focus is on the black lesbian woman.

2.6 Rape

In South African currently, according to the Sexual Offences and Related Matters Amended Bill Act 32 of 2007 (www.justice.gov.za) , rape is defined as "Any person ('A') who unlawfully and intentionally commits an act of sexual penetration with a complainant ('B'), without the consent of B, is guilty of the offence of rape" (www.justice.gov.za). It is evident from the legal definition, of rape that it is a sexual act which is committed against another without consent. In the definition there are no gender differentiations given nor is a victim apportioned any blame or responsibility for the act.

Historically, rape has been viewed as an action which happens to the property of men, rather than as an act of sexual violence towards another human, namely those who happened to occupy the social position of woman.

Social factors influenced how rape was viewed and dealt with in society. Bourke (2007, p. 76) states "some type of people are deemed to be unable to consent to sexual intercourse in the first place, for them consent does not apply." In this category of people unable to consent were female slaves, since they were not considered to be human, but rather the property of

their owners and thus their bodies were considered to be available for use accordingly (Bourke, 2007).

Vigarello (2001, p. 9), discusses rape in relation to its history, "like many forms of violence it was condemned by the texts of classical law but very little punished by judges". Rape was not necessarily considered a separate form of violence, and it was not often punished. It was recognised as having taken place but not much else. Vogelman (1990, p. 5) elaborates on later perceptions of rape, as it became more clearly defined and abhorrent, it became understood as "not merely an act of violence – it is an act of sexual violence".

In Apartheid era South Africa, "an extensive armoury of regulations and prohibitions to control the practice and transaction of sex, its public representations and performance" (Posel, 2005a, p. 128) was put in place. These rules and regulations effectively relegated sex, sexuality and sexually–based violence out of the public domain. It was not open for discussion. Post-1994, this landscape looks dramatically different. Posel (2005a, p. 129) reflects "given these extremities of the apartheid era, the changes post-1994 have been nothing short of dramatic and remarkably swift". Issues pertaining to sex, sexuality and sexually-based violence have come into the open. Nel and Judge (2008, p. 19) comment, "internationally, South Africa is commended for its peaceful and rapid transformation to becoming an open society, founded on democratic values and a constitution that enshrines the principles of human dignity, freedom, equality and social justice". This statement reflects an idyllic nation, one where everyone is able to enjoy the freedom to be who they are, without fear of being violated for that choice. This statement is juxtaposed in the next comment, "In stark contrast with policy and legislative guarantees for fundamental human rights, endemic crime and violence continue to dominate the country's landscape" (Nel and Judge, 2008, p. 19). This statement was made in relation to sexually violent homophobic attacks, particularly on lesbians; it can be expanded to include sexual attacks particularly those on heterosexual women and children.

Posel (2005a) reflects on sexual violence in South Africa, a recorded history of which is limited. Prior to 1994, the definition of rape was very limited, defined "as the imposition of unwanted vaginal sex by an adult man upon an adult woman" (Posel, 2005a, p. 242). This definition effectively excluded rape of children and homosexuals. It was a heterosexual definition, but excluded marital rape. Laws around rape have since changed; present laws as provided in the Sexual Offences and Related Matters Amended Bill 32 of 2007, provide a

broader, more inclusionary definition of rape, one that is not based on the concept of heteronomativity as was evident in the initial definition discussed by Posel (2005a). The concept of heterosexual rape will be explored through the rape of Anene Booysen.

Posel (2005b, p. 246) in reference to the rape of Baby Tshepang, comments, despite the details of the event which were published being minimal, the "moral horror was absolute". The idea of a baby being violated in such a ruthless manner brings a nation at large face to face with the grim reality of the potential brutality of its members. Discussions of the site of the rape of Baby Tshepang bring to light it occurred within a familial environment, in this way, uprooting the image of the home as a safe haven (Posel, 2005b). The perpetrator is made to account for his actions, blame is not apportioned to a baby and the space to potentially try to apportion some accountability on the primary caregiver is created.

Baby rape and its potential implications within diversity issues in South African society will be examined through the rape of Baby Tshepang. Baby Tshepang made news headlines in October 2001 when she was allegedly gang-raped, later confirmed raped by a single perpetrator. She was given the name Tshepang on admission to hospital, as a means to conceal her identity in the media. The name Tshepang means 'hope' in Setswana (Richter, 2006, p. 393).

Gunkel (2011) discusses the rape and murder of lesbian women in South Africa. She highlights two specific points in her reflections, focusing specifically on Zoliswa Nkonyana who was gang-raped and murdered in February 2006. The first is about public performance, the second is the impunity with which the act was committed. Gunkel (2011) comments that this is not an isolated incident and that because there are seemingly limited, if any, repercussions for the perpetrators, such incidents are repeated with callous disregard. In relation to gender dynamics and expectations, Gunkel (2011) considers that the men who attacked Nkonyana sought a means of production of heterosexual masculinity, further they sought to repress the lifestyle choice of a lesbian woman. Nel and Judges (2008, p. 22) in turn discuss that crimes against lesbians and other non-heteronormative gender groups, are possibly meant "to send a message to the victim/survivor that his or her sexual orientation and/or gender non-conformity is deviant and must be changed". The concept of lesbian rape and the social issues which may emerge in the process of reporting lesbian rape will be examined through the rape and murder of Eudy Simelane.

2.7 Reproduction of social constructs in the media

O'Shaughnessy and Stadler (2005) discuss how the media works, in order for it to function as it does within a society. They propose that there are five pivotal points around which this function is constructed. The first, "the media show us what the world is like; they make sense of the world for us" (O'Shaughnessy & Stadler, 2005, p. 34). This view of the world is presented to the audience through representation (this is a primary medium through which we are shown the world), interpretation (information is given and an explanation of how to understand it supplied) and evaluation (certain issues are highlighted while others are side-lined, thus a thought process is put into place amidst a receptive audience) (O'Shaughnessy & Stadler, 2005, p. 34). The second point is "Media products do not show or present the real world; they construct and re-present reality" (O'Shaughnessy & Stadler, 2005, p. 35). In this comment O'Shaughnessy and Stadler (2005) imply that the media do not create the reality of the world that we live in through what they present to their target audience, but rather that the reports "are *re-presentations* or *constructions* of the world" (O'Shaughnessy & Stadler, 2005, p. 35) of the world in which the reader lives. The third point is "The media are just one of the ways by which we and society make sense of the world, or construct the world" (O'Shaughnessy & Stadler, 2005, p. 35). O'Shaugnessy and Stadler (2005) explain this statement linking it to the example of how a child is raised and their understanding of the world around them is formed and informed by various social influences including school, family and religion. The media is considered to be one of these influencing factors in the formation of this thought process.

The fourth point raised is "The media are owned, controlled, and created by certain groups who make sense of society on behalf of others" (O'Shaughnessy & Stadler, 2005, p. 36). It is explained that there are key role players in the production of media but that while these people are tasked with the production of media, they are also part of the society for which they are producing media. Grouped in this category of media producers are those who own the businesses, their focus is on profit production, the creative team – those who actually create the media product that is marketed and the technical team who operate the machinery which allows for the production of media that is circulated to its intended target market. The final point discussed is "The need for popularity" (O'Shaughnessy and Stadler, 2005, p. 36). This links in directly to the profit line of the business; in order to generate a profit, a producer needs a large and receptive audience. In the event that the audience does not receive a product that they find appealing, they will take their business elsewhere.

Through the examination of these five pivotal elements, it is possible to see the complexities that reside within the production of media. In relation to this research project, it is necessary to see how these elements interplay in newspapers specifically, as they form the site of data collection. It is also necessary to understand how articles are produced and presented to a target audience in a specific manner for the purpose of analysis.

The media has a distinct role to play in society. Hanse, Cottle, Negrine, & Newbold, (1998, p. 17-18) explain that the media "may effectively control the social and political dialogue by setting the agenda, ordering priorities, and inviting contributors to participate. This agenda setting function is one of the most important that the media can perform". A newspaper has a specific target audience, at which its writing style and content are aimed. It is in this framework that newspaper editors are able to, in a sense, control the discussions on a social and political level, which are held by their readers.

2.8 Frames and framing in the media

The term "frame" has been used in different contexts and in some cases interchangeably as noted by Scheufele (1999) in an article which grappled with the implications that framing within a newspaper can have on what is presented to the reading audience. Scheufele (1999, p. 105) explains that the function of the media and the discourse used in reporting "is part of the process by which individuals construct meaning, and public opinion is part of the process by which journalists […] develop and crystallize meaning in public discourse". It is explained that a media frame is "a central organising idea or story line that provides meaning to an unfolding strip of events […] The frames suggest what the controversy is about, the essence of the issue" (Scheufele, 1999, p. 106). From this explanation it is evident that the frames that are used within the reporting process in a newspaper effectively convey what is considered to be the key element of the story which is being told. In this way, the readers' ideas about what is important are shaped and informed. Linking this to the perpetuation of underlying social assumptions, it is possible that these are continually conveyed through frames in the newspaper. This idea is captured in the statement that "The framing and presentation of events and news in the mass media can thus systematically affect how recipients of the news come to understand these events" (Scheufele, 1999, p. 107).

An and Gower (2009) take the framing discussion further in their article *How do the news media frame crises? A content analysis of crisis news coverage.* In this article, the authors explain the implications of framing within the context of an event that is perceived to be and thus conveyed as a crisis situation. This discussion is captured in the comment

> "People seek information about the crisis and evaluate the cause of the event and the organisational responsibility for the crisis based on media coverage of the crisis. Therefore, it is important to look at how the media frame a crisis event, the cause of the crisis, and the actor responsible for it because those frames influence the public's perception and impressions of the organisation"
>
> (An & Grower, 2009, p. 107).

The article also proposes that there are different frames which are being used. These are briefly explained below:

- Human interest frame: this frame raises the issue of emotional response and the implication thereof. The authors state "that the human interest frame influenced participants' emotional response and that it was a significant predictor of blame and responsibility" (An & Gower, 2009, p. 108). This is an important element to consider in the process of reporting on an incident of rape, where the question of who is to be apportioned blame seems to emerge.
- Conflict frame: in this frame, the focus is on a form of conflict between different groups.
- Morality frame: this frame, is used to raise the issue of morality either within the crisis or in relation to it. An and Gower (2009, p. 108) noted that "the morality frame was commonly used by journalists indirectly through quotations or inference, rather than directly because of the journalistic norm of objectivity".
- Economic frame: this frame does not refer to sales of newspapers due to the reporting of a specific crisis; rather it refers to the economic implications for those who are either directly or indirectly involved in the crisis situation.
- Attribution of responsibility frame: this frame, as the title infers, seeks to place the blame or responsibility for the crisis on someone's shoulders.

  (An & Gower, 2009, p. 108)

Each of these frames needs to be considered in relation to how rape is written about in newspapers. The reason for this is that these frames are used in the reporting process and will influence the ideas that are brought to the fore or omitted from the discussion. This in turn may affect the social assumptions that are perpetuated through the reporting process on rape and thus the ideas and implications that are associated with the news stories that are relayed to the reading audience. In this manner allowing for existing assumptions to be fuelled, even though the ideas that are perpetuated are not necessarily accurate.

Chapter 3.

3. Literature review

This review will explore existent literature relevant to the research topic. Literature pertaining to the theoretical framework, the structure of the news story, discourse and how this is used in relation to rape myths and how these are employed in arguments around rape and the prevalence thereof will be examined.

Studying the coverage of rape in newspapers is not a new area of research. This is evidenced by theses of Stephanie M. Bonnes, *Gender and racial stereotyping in rape coverage: an analysis of rape coverage in Grocott's Mail (*Rhodes University, 2010)*;* Alison Stent's *Reading The Sowetan's response to the Jacob Zuma rape trial: A critical discourse analysis* (Rhodes University, 2007*)* and Nicolene C. McLean's *"Rape and Cable theft on the increase": Interrogating Grocott's Mail coverage of rape through participatory action research (*Rhodes University, 2010). Each thesis tackles rape in general and specific representations of rape in the newspapers chosen by the researchers. Stent focuses on a specific trial and its attendant responses around it as presented in *The Sowetan* while McLean (2010) and Bonnes (2010) focus on rape portrayal from different angles but in the same newspaper, *The Grocott's Mail*, a Grahamstown based daily newspaper.

The recent headlines of reporting the rape of a student in India has opened a space for critical reflection in South Africa. Naidoo (2013, p.1) comments, drawing parallel and contrasts to the responses of the Indian nation to that attack and that of South Africans in relation to the rape of Anene Booysen, that "SA has one of the highest incidences of rape in the world. In 2009, 68 332 cases of rape were reported to the South African Police Services (SAPS). SAPS statistics suggest that someone is raped every 35 seconds". A statement of this nature indicates that rape is prevalent in South Africa and the incidents that have been chosen for the purpose of this research project are not isolated incidents, rather they are ones that have made news headlines. Naidoo (2013) goes on to comment that in post-Apartheid South Africa many changes have been made to legislation around rape and the medical care that the survivor of rape is afforded. Naidoo (2013), however, noted that a gap still exists between what is legislated and what occurs in reality. Naidoo (2013) noted that despite changes in the laws relating to rape and the services that are afforded to rape survivors, many are reluctant to report the incident. Reasons given for this reluctance and hesitancy to report the incident included "a lack of faith is the criminal justice system and the medical services, and the

secondary trauma sometimes suffered by survivors at the hands of the SAPS and health services" (Naidoo, 2013, p. 1). Evident in this discussion is that rape is an issue in South Africa and one that requires attention. There have been changes on paper but it is necessary to see these changes take effect at a practical level as well.

3.1 Media construction and agenda setting

Newspapers are a means of conveying information to a specific target market. The manner in which news articles are constructed, portrayed and presented to readers may influence how these events are subsequently discussed, thought about or reacted to, dependent on how the incident was initially framed. This idea is evident in a discussion by Nel (1994) in which three elements in newspaper construction are reflected upon. Nel (1994) explores the idea of what it is that constitutes news and what is considered worthy of being printed in a newspaper. Firstly, a story must be new; it must be something that a reader wants to read (Nel 1994). The example cited is taken from The Sunday Times (1992, 20 September) in which a man bit a snake that was about to attack him. This was considered newsworthy as it did not only portray a snake attack but it had a novel twist to it (Nel, 1994). The second is that "news must have conversational value" (Nel, 1994, p. 7). This idea is explained using an example cited from Edna Buchanan's book; *The corpse had a familiar face,* where the author imagines a couple eating breakfast together. One of them reads an article which elicits the response "My God! Martha, did you read this?" (Nel, 1994, p. 7). A story needs to be interesting to the reader so that they will turn to 'Martha' and engage in a conversation. Nel (1994) adds to the conversation observing that what may be considered news does not always engage our personal lives but still acts as a point at which a conversation can be started. The third aspect considered is that "News must have commercial value" (Nel, 1994, p. 7). In this discussion Nel (1994) highlights the relationship between reader and editor in the commodification of news. The readers of the newspapers buy them for specific reasons - news, entertainment or advertising. And the editors in turn, in order to generate a profit from their product, create a product that is wanted by the audience who buys it. Through analysis of reports of rape in the media, specifically three prominent incidents, the manner in which information is conveyed to the readers of specific publications will be considered as a means of exploring underlying assumptions about broader diversity issues in South Africa.

Bell (1991, p. 58), comments that "News media feeds voraciously off each other's stories. While they always try to find something new to update and begin the story, an evening paper will often reproduce the bulk of a story published by its morning competitor. Even specialist media such as science programmes draw on other media for information". This method of news production means that the "news language is frequently recycled. Text from a continuing story may come around again and again in a little-changed format" (Bell, 1991, p. 58). The implication is that readers are exposed to similar ideas about a story, which may lead to the formation of a specific thought pattern in relation to what it was that was published in the newspaper. It is for this reason that it is noteworthy to consider how the story of an incident of rape is reported and presented in a newspaper according to its target market. This is evident in the reporting of the St. Kitizo school incident. In this incident at a Kenyan boarding school, female students were raped and many were killed by their fellow male students (Hirsch, 1994). Hirsch (1994) in the article, *Interpreting Media Representations of a "Night of Madness": Law and Culture in the Construction of Rape Identities* explores how this incident was reported in Kenyan and American newspapers. In American newspapers, the attack was explained "through a narrative of modernisation that depicted the victims and their assailants as pawns of 'traditional culture', the source of men's violence over women" (Hirsh, 1994, p. 1025). However, in the Kenyan newspapers, the same incident was described using two different approaches. One was to explain the incident as "a manifestation of the sexism rampant in contemporary Kenyan society" (Hirsh, 1994, p. 1025) while others reported that the incident occurred as "effects of the severe political repression of the postcolonial state" (Hirsh, 1994, p. 1025). This reflects how one incident can be interpreted and projected in a different manner, dependent on the target audience.

The question which needs to be considered at this point is why it is important to consider if and how assumptions are reproduced in news articles? Bell (1991) addresses an aspect which relates to this noting that journalists prefer to use sources already written up in suitable news-style formats that need minimal reworking prior to publication. Bell (1991, p. 58) explains that this occurs in three formats: "news agency copy, press releases and prior stories on the same topic". Bell (1991, p. 59) elaborates, based on his observations and work experiences: "I have often had journalists ignore suggestions of stories to follow up themselves. They will, however, reproduce the story faithfully when it is supplied as a ready-made press release a week or two later". The focus here is not on how a journalist arrives at the story which is produced in the newspaper, but rather on the reproduction of ideas and the implications of

this in the perpetuation of, possibly, unfounded assumptions within the reading community. It is necessary to consider this in relation to reports of rape and the subsequent discussions that are held after an article is read.

Structuring formats and the manner in which different parties inform how an article is presented is explored by Protess, Leff, Brooks and Gordon (1985) in the article *Uncovering Rape: The Watchdog Press and the limits of Agenda Setting*. The specific parties examined were the general public, policy makers and policy making and the press (Protess *et al, 1985).* They conducted their research using "a pretest-posttest quasi-experimental design to assess the impact of a newspaper investigative series about rape on a randomly selected group of Chicanos and a purposive sample of policy makers" (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 19).

In the general public findings the "major concern […] was whether the *Sun-Times* investigative series changed public opinion about rape and related issues" (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 25). The results however, showed that there was not a drastic shift in relation to rape and rape related issues after the investigative series was run. There were, however, raised levels of concern regarding crime in general (Protess *et al,* 1985). The researchers found that the rape investigative series served as platform on which the public began to voice their concerns about crime more generally, reflected in the comment that crime became seen as a "critical urban problem facing Chicago" (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 31). Protess *et al* (1985) explain that there are two components to this statement. The first is that when rape is on the increase or prominent in a public agenda, people begin to feel a sense of personal danger. The second component is that the more prominent a topic, such as rape is in the media, the more likely it is to be perceived as an issue that needs to be taken notice of, even in the event that it does not directly affect the reading individual. These findings indicate the potential that a newspaper article has to unearth underlying concerns that its reader may have and in this manner provide a space for them to be discussed.

Articles published on the topic of crime statistics and the implications that these have for those who they position in a negative manner is explored in the work of Patton and Snyder-Yuly (2007). The authors in the article *Any Four Black Men Will Do: Rape, Race and the Ultimate Scapegoat,* explore, within the American context, the concept of the rapist as black and the implications that this has for black men generally. The authors explain that despite the perception that Black men target White women to rape, the statistics on this prove the contrary. Despite this information it was noted that Black rapists who were prosecuted

received harsher and longer sentences than their white counterparts (Patton & Snyder-Yuly, 2007).

When policy makers were interviewed after the investigative series was run, the researchers "hypothesised that their personal views would not be affected by the newspaper series" (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 28). The researchers also "hypothesised that the elites would expect that public opinion toward the problem would change as a result of the front-page series" (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 28). What the findings did reveal, however, was that the elites' personal lives were little affected by the series. Nonetheless, it would appear that they used this series as a launching pad for initiatives which had either been in the pipeline or were actually in existence to be brought to the fore. The researchers cited the following examples: "within a week after the first story appeared, Mayor Jane Byrne, announced the "creation" of a Rape Hotline and a public housing drop-in centre for rape victims, although both had been operational for months" (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 29). The researchers also noted that "Governor James Thompson, the week the series was published, signed a bill into law providing for increased criminal penalties for 'gang rape' " (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 29). This bill, however, had been pending on his desk for a period of a month prior to the series being run in the newspaper (Protess *et al,* 1985). In analysing the findings of this research, it was noted that the policy makers' actions were "swift, symbolic overtures to redress the abuses exposed in the media investigations" (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 33). The policy makers were aware of the issues relating to rape prior to the investigative series being launched. In this manner, they were effectively able to cobble into place actions and responses in order to be presented in the media as being on top of the issues rather than having to provide an off-the-cuff response when the topic was made public knowledge and laid open for discussion. This highlights the manner in which policy makers in relationship with the press are effectively able to drive an agenda without the public being made aware of how the policy presentation is being handled behind the scenes.

The final component which was analysed after the series was run was the press itself. The findings here were that the newspaper devoted more space to articles reporting cases of rape, including a focus on actual stories, analysis as to why it is that rape was prevalent and government responses and activities in relation to rape incidents (Protess *et al,* 1985). The researchers observed that stories that are covered in the press "may rise and fall on an individual news organisation's agenda because of a variety of influences, both inside and outside of the newsroom" (Protess *et al,* 1985, p. 34). This indicates that it is not always just a

breaking story or an interest article which is published. There may actually be alternative reasons that a specific article or theme is published in a newspaper, at times running over an extended time period. This article discussed and brought to light different elements that are affected and which can have an effect on the content of a newspaper. This is valid in relation to the proposed research question which seeks to determine what underlying social assumptions are perpetuated in news stories. This article allows for the consideration of different reading audiences and where each is positioned in relation to the published article and the subsequent consequences of this positioning.

3.2 Rape myths and the discourse around rape

How an incident which is reported in a newspaper and how it is discussed after it has been read can reveal different ideas held by the respective respondents. This concept is examined by Benedict (1992) who discusses how the media reports sex crimes and the implications that this has for the victim and for society at large. Benedict (1992, p. 23) comments that, "When a reporter sits down to write a story about any woman […] let alone a woman who has been victimized in a sex crime, he or she has an enormous burden of assumptions, habits, and clichés to carry to the story". This is not merely because of the structures in which reporters work but also public images and use of language which creates and perpetuates ideologies about women and the social expectations that these generate (Benedict, 1992). Benedict (1992, p. 23) states that women, who are victims of sexual crimes, are categorised in one of two ways:

1) The "Vamp": "The woman, by her looks, behaviour or generally loose morality, drove the man to such extremes of lust that he was compelled to commit the crime".
2) The "Virgin": "The man, a depraved and perverted monster, sullied the innocent victim, who is now a martyr to the flaws of society".

These two images are in turn linked to rape myths, which will be briefly examined. Rape myths may perpetuate underlying issues of social diversity. This can occur through the use of the rape myths to engage with aspects of sexual assault. When these are used, there exists the possibility to further perpetuate and re-embed assumptions in society around sexual crimes. Rape myths, according to Benedict (1992), include the following:

1) “Rape is sex” (Benedict, 1992, p. 14). According to Benedict (1992, p. 14) this is “the most powerful myth about rape”. The implication of this myth is the ignorance “that rape is a physical attack, and leads to the mistaken belief that rape does not hurt the victim any more than sex does” (Benedict, 1992, p. 14). This research takes this stance, that rape and sex are not interchangeable terminologies. Rape is a violent attack and is non-consensual; it is not sex.
2) “The assailant is motivated by lust” (Benedict, 1992, p. 14). The implication of this myth effectively absolves the assailant of their actions, by stating that they were overcome by lust which needed to be fulfilled.
3) “The assailant is perverted or crazy” (Benedict, 1992, p. 15). This myth is similar to the above myth. It too attempts to absolve the assailant of their action, in this case by inferring that they are not of sound mind and thus acted in a manner that is not within the confines of social normativity.
4) “The assailant is usually black or lower class” (Benedict, 1992, p. 15). This myth is tied to the colonial ideology that only black men are rapists and that black men tend to be socially categorised lower than white men. Another implication of this myth is that white women are preyed upon by black men and that men (often white men) in upper classes do not rape women.
5) “Women provoke rape” (Benedict, 1992, p. 15).
6) “Women deserve rape” (Benedict, 1992, p. 16).
7) “Only ‘loose’ women are victimised” (Benedict, 1992, p. 16). The above three myths all in some manner place the blame for the attack on the woman. Implying that it was something that she did that resulted in her being raped. In this context, the woman is positioned such that she is not a victim but rather partially responsible for what happened, thus removing the sole blame from the attacker and in some manner creating space to query if the woman was indeed raped.
8) “A sexual attack sullies the victim” (Benedict, 1992, p. 17). This myth, like that of the black and lower class attacker, can be linked to colonial ideology, that prior to the attack the victim was a virgin and that she is now ruined. Colonial ideology implied that white women were a symbol of purity, maintained as such within their family construct and then married off in a state of purity. An assaulted woman no longer can be seen as pure and innocent.

9) "Rape is punishment for past deeds" (Benedict, 1992, p. 17). This myth infers that the woman was raped because of something she had done previously and she can be apportioned blame for the incident.
10) "Women cry rape for revenge" (Benedict, 1992, p. 17). This myth plays into the idea that women take revenge on men for wrongs that they feel have been committed against them. The implication of this myth is that women are aware that a man can be positioned in a socially awkward situation if he is accused of rape and that by playing the victim card, the woman is able to position herself as the centre of attention.

Awareness of the implications and deployment of these myths in the process of reporting an incident of rape in a newspaper is vital with regard to the proposed research question.

The use and implications associated with rape myths, as used in conversations relating to rape, are evident in the articles: *Explaining Gang Rape in a "Rough Town": Diverse Voices in Gender Violence News Online* by Worthington (2013) and Dosekun's (2013) *'Rape is a huge issue in this country': Discursive constructions of the rape crisis in South Africa.* These articles were selected as they explore the use of a discourse around rape and in the process highlight ideas that people have about rape and aspects related to it and how these ideas are conveyed through speech. Worthington (2013) explores the gang rape of a teenage girl, in five frames, frames being the term used by the author of the article. It is evident that rape myths were employed as a means of discussing and explaining how and why the event occurred.

Frame 1: "Abnormal" assailants. Worthington (2013) notes that the description of assailants as "abnormal" is a relatively limited explanation. The explanations proceed to discussions relating to the suspects, employing the colour of the men as a means of identity discourse. The discourse "typically ascribed animalistic qualities to suspects, reasserting stereotypes at the intersection of race and gender" (Worthington, 2013, p. 109). Evident in this discussion is the explanation that only those who are deemed abnormal are rapists. Conversely, those who conform to societal norms are viewed as incapable of rape. The use of animal-like imagery of men of colour is reminiscent slavery and colonialism. The black male is portrayed as 'other' and one to be feared, and blamed for social ills.

Frame 2: Perceptions of a 'rough town" (Worthington, 2013, p. 110). This discussion was used in a broader context in relation to the city where the gang-rape occurred. This discussion does not focus directly on the school, but implied in the discourse is that the rape took place in an area that is considered unsafe, if the area had had a different reputation perhaps an alternative discourse would emerge. Worthington (2013, p. 110) explains "This frame engaged with the prevalent discourse that the attack exemplified how Richmond was 'a rough town,' where violence and lawlessness might be expected". The reality of what is experienced in the school, as opposed to the constructed image, is reflected in the comment by a student who attends the school at which the incident took place: "I have friends who go to school in Concord and say 'Aren't you scared to go to Richmond High? And I say, no – you can do very well academically here. I take two AP classes. I am headed for college. I feel safe, and it makes me mad that people only see the bad side of us now" (Worthington (2013, p. 110).

Frame 3: Poor security and "poor choices" (Worthington, 2013) were two angles presented in this story. The first time this was reported, the angle was that there were "plans to purchase and install surveillance cameras" (Worthington, 2013, p. 112). The implications within this comment is that if the security equipment had been in place perhaps an incident of this nature could have been avoided. Further implied is that an incident of this nature will in future be avoided, as the necessary security equipment will be in place. Reference is also made to the number of personnel present to oversee the event, which there may well have been, however, the manner in which this is reported leaves a gap for the apportioning some of the blame on the victim for the choice that she made to enter the area that she did. This is conveyed in the statement "All it took for things to lurch out of control, investigators, students and community leaders say, was opportunity – and that came when the girl left the school dance Saturday night, walked by a group of bad boys boozing hard in the unlit courtyard, and accepted their invitation to hang out" (Worthington, 2013, p. 113).

Frame 4: Misogynist culture (Worthington, 2013, p. 114). This frame is the result of the shift which occurred in the above mentioned frame. This frame employed discourse based on "selected commentary and contextual information suggested that brutal crime exemplified a misogynist culture that extended far beyond the borders of Richmond, California". The researcher noted that this commentary was only employed after it was engaged with at a rally which was organised in response to the incident. This frame is one that is less easily engaged with in relation to rape compared to others. The implication of this observation is that certain

discourses pertaining to rape are easier to engage with than others and thus are more readily used in public commentary. This frame also explores the concept of active engagement with activities that were meant to highlight incidents of sexual violence, another reason perhaps why it is less actively engaged with than the other frames within this article.

Together, these frames present possible ways in which people interpret rape. Worthington (2013, p. 115) explains that "The first and third frames offer up well-worn rape discourse frequently documented in research analysing news coverage of gender violence". The second and fourth frames are those that are not as commonly employed in the discussion of rape (Worthington, 2013). It is noted that the second frame links to the first and acts as a support mechanism for this discussion to be effectively employed (Worthington, 2013). The fourth frame appears to be the one that stands alone. It is possibly the most difficult to engage with, as it requires active engagement with an incident, even when it does not directly affect the reader.

Dosekun (2013) focused on four repertoires used by women, who had not been raped, to explain and discuss rape within South African society. The first repertoire explored was that of statistics (Dosekun, 2013). Using this repertoire, the women explained the prevalence of rape in the society in which they live. This use of statistics is reflected in the comment by Sarah* (asterisk used in original text, to signal name used is a pseudonym), she stated that "Rape is a huge issue in this country, it really is you know. And it's so under-reported you know. The stats as they stand are horrific and a lot of women don't report rape so it's probably double that" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 523). Dosekun (2013) noted that many of the white women in her research assumed a rapist to be "a non-white man" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 524).

Dosekun (2013) drew on the different interpretations of statistics employed by black and white participants. Violet, a black woman, discussed an article which she had read regarding statistics on date-rape within racial categories. She commented "I read this in Varsity (UCT student newspaper) article a few years back that said that the majority of rapes are not by strangers, they're by date rape, and they stated some statistics which I can't quote, but speaking about how there were more white date rapes than black date rapes" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 524). This comment reflects a cross racial analysis of statistics. The speaker seems to question them, but still uses statistics in her discussion. The omission of reporting or interpreting of date rape in black society may limit the reality of what is experienced. The

focus on white date rape places the site of assault within the familiar territory of the potential victim; a place that those who are potential victims do not want to engage with, given that nobody wants to entertain the idea that the man they trust could violate them. The idea of rape being outside the parameters of understanding are reflected in the comment by Sasha, a white woman (Dosekun, 2013). Sasha comments "I suppose in my environment I feel like it's not happening. Ok part of it comes from the statistics I hear, and another part would have to come from my own personal bias that in my environment I feel *so* sort of separated and away from it that it can only be these other groups of people" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 524).

The second repertoire employed is crime (Dosekun, 2013). This repertoire was heavily relied on as an explanation for the prevalence of rape. This repertoire is "characterised by the notion that rape is the random, violent act of a crazy or criminal man; that the rapist is 'some creepy-looking stranger lurking down the path at the side of your road' " (Dosekun, 2013, p. 525). This construction serves to keep the rapist in the position of the unknown. The crime repertoire poses the image of a rapist who appears "abject/poor/dirty/uneducated/skulking" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 526), rather than as a man who fits within the norms of social acceptability. This is reflected in the comment by Sarah, "Definitely no-one in my immediate circle of friends or boyfriends or ex-boyfriends…Definitely no-one that I interact with or am friends with, or are friends with my friends" (Dosekun, 2013, p 526). This explanation of a rapist effectively "constructed the rapist as 'the Other'" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 526) removing him from within the familiarity zone of the individual speaking.

The third repertoire used is race (Dosekun, 2013). Some women who were interviewed used race as a means to explain rape. The use of this dialogue, however, was used in reference to other races, not in relation to their own racial category. Dosekun (2013, p. 527) explains that "by making rape a function of one or another racial identity, the race repertoire precluded the women's recognition and critique of the ways in which, in South Africa, women have been positioned historically as the spoils of a phallocentric struggle between differentially racialised men" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 527). This is an aspect that has been entrenched in society for an extensive period of time. It was evident in the periods of colonialism and slavery. This construct of racism is further theorised in the comment "Racism 'always involves a sexual warping of identity politics', because race is a fetish or construct that is historically sexualised" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 528).

The final repertoire employed in this discussion is gender (Dosekun, 2013). This, unlike the other three, is not applied in the same unilateral manner. Rather, it specifically focuses on the point that gender is "at the crux of the matter, this repertoire did not delimit the identity of the rapist or victim to constructs of crime, class, race or space" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 530). This is evident in the comment by Suzanne "I wanted everyone there to sort of see what a scumbag he was and like to recognise it. But he wasn't, he was just a normal guy" (Dosekun, 2013, p. 531). This statement implies that rape is committed by someone who occupies a specific imagined social position, in reality, however, there is no marker that indicates to society who is a rapist.

Worthington (2013) uses the terminology 'frames' to effectively bracket the different elements of the research which was extracted from an online newspaper about the rape of a teenage girl. Dosekun (2013) uses the terminology 'repertoires' to bracket the different areas of discussion that were used in her interview process. Difference in terminology for bracketing can be attributed to the different methods of data collection – online sources and interviews. However, they serve the same purpose of grouping together ideas that are discussed in relation to rape.

Worthington (2013) explores the use of rape myths within an American context and within the framework of an online newspaper. Dosekun (2013) explores within the context of South Africa, the context of the incidents which are being examined for the purpose of answering this research question. Dosekun's (2013) interviews reflect the discourses employed in the discussion of rape, using information which has apparently been gathered by the respondents from various sources which they have read or discussed and that they subsequently use as a frame of reference in the interview process to talk about rape.

3.3 Lesbian rape

The constitution of South Africa is one of the most liberal in the world. It is a constitution that "enshrines the principles of human dignity, freedom, equality and social justice" (Nel & Judge, 2008, p. 19). This image of freedom is starkly contrasted in the comment that despite "legislative guarantees for fundamental human rights, endemic crime and violence continue to dominate the country's landscape" (Nel & Judge, 2008, p. 19). The article *Exploring*

homophobic victimisation in Gauteng, South Africa: Issues, Impacts and Responses by Nel and Judges (2008) explores violent crime and homosexuals who are victims of this action.

Nel and Judges (2008, p. 23) noted that little research pertaining to "LGBT issues in South Africa, including hate crimes against lesbian and gay people, has been conducted and […] previous studies focused primarily on white middle-class gay men". A study which did attempt to determine the levels of homophobic violence was conducted jointly by Out LGBT Well-Being (Out) and UNISA Centre for Applied Psychology (UCAP) (Nel & Judge, 2008, p. 23). One of the observations made highlighted that many of the survivors of these attacks did not report them to the police. The reasons cited for these responses included "Institutionalised heterosexism and homophobia, combined with negative social attitudes towards lesbian and gay people" (Nel & Judge, 2008, p. 27).

This concept of hate crime and corrective rape is examined by Wesley (2009). The author explains, using the American Psychological Association 1998, definition that hate crime is an action in which "The perpetrators seek to demean and dehumanise their victims based on their actual or perceived race, ethnicity, gender, age, sexual orientation, disability, health status, nationality, social origin, religious convictions, culture, language, or other characteristics" (Wesley, 2009, p. 76) In a sub-section of this discussion, the concept of corrective rape is also explained. Wesley (2009, p. 76) states that "Corrective rape, also known as curative rape, is a brutal act of violence in which African women and teenagers who are, or are at least assumed to be, lesbians are raped to 'cure' them of their homosexuality".

With regards to the media and its portrayal of articles relating to these forms of crime, there was a tendency to present stories in a manner that made them "sensational, dramatic and exceptional" (Nel & Judge, 2008, p. 27). The implication here is that the lack of reporting of these crimes, specifically focusing on attacks on lesbian women, allows these attacks to be grouped together with those that are meted out to heterosexual women and renders the characteristics based on extreme discrimination on the ground of sexual orientation silent and invisible (Nel & Judge, 2008).

Chapter 4.

4. Methodology

4.1 Methodological Approach

Viewing language as a means of constructing a perceived reality may be located in the manner in which newspapers publish articles and the potential influence that a specific style of framing an article can possibly influence the readers' subsequent outlook on the society in which they reside.

News headlines and the implications that these can have for both victim and perpetrator are discussed by Franuik, Seefelt and Vandello (2008) in *Prevalence of Rape Myths in Headlines and their effects of attitudes toward rape.* It is on the basis of this use of rape myths, even if unintentionally, that the media can create nodal points (Jorgensen & Phillips, 2001, p. 26) to which understandings of aspects of rape become partially fixed.

This research question is constructed around articles relating to three specific incidents of rape in two Gauteng based newspapers, The Star and The Sowetan. The reason that this research is being conducted using two newspapers as sites for data collection is because it aims to determine whether news articles are presented in a specific manner according to their target audience and what the potential implications are for such a representation of a story to a target audience. The Star and The Sowetan, according to information about their readership, have two different, racially based, although not exclusionary readerships; both, however, are considered to be read by middle to upper class people (http://www.iol.co.za/the-star/readership and www.sowetanlive.co.za).

The decision to use three specific rape incidents is because each of these represents a category of the female population who is potentially vulnerable to being raped. How each of these categories of people are perceived and understood within the society that they reside will potentially determine how they are viewed when they are raped.

Through examination of the same incidents in two different newspapers, it may be possible to locate social diversity issues which are either presented across the board or that are more specifically based within a readership category. Different representations of the same incident in different newspapers, this time one local and one international, is evident in the work of Hirsch (1995) in a discussion about the St. Kitizo School incident in *Interpreting Media*

Representations of a "Night of Madness": Law and Culture in the Construction of Rape Identities which was discussed in the Literature Review chapter. Using thematic analysis allows for an exploration of emerging themes and an exploration of the implication of these themes. An exploration of both the implicit and explicit meanings of the stories that are reported is possible. It is through this analysis method that it is hoped that the underlying, perpetuated social issues will be brought to light and the implications thereof explored (Guest, MacQueen & Namey, 2012).

The data which was gathered for the purpose of this research was sorted and analysed in the following manner. Initially articles were gathered based on a specific phrase – "Baby Tshepang / Eudy Simelane / Anene Booysen" and "rape". The articles were then read and re-read numerous times. Topics that were dominant and that were repeated in articles were colour coded and counted. It was from this that the majors themes that are discussed in the data analysis were determined.

4.2 Data collection

4.2.1 Sites of research

This research has been conducted using two Gauteng daily newspapers, The Star and The Sowetan.

4.2.2 Sources:

Data was collected from the SABINET online archive, accessed via the University of the Witwatersrand library portal (http://0-reference.sabinet.co.za.innopac.wits.ac.za/sacat). In order to constructively engage with the articles written on each of the incidents, time periods for articles on each were put in place. The time period for each is from when the incident took place to the time of sentencing of the perpetrator/s. The time periods are as follows:

- Baby Tshepang: October 2001 –July 2002
- Eudy Simelane: May 2008 – September 2009
- Anene Booysen: February 2013 – November 2013

4.2.3 Data analysis

Data, collected from reading the relevant articles in The Star and The Sowetan reporting on the three incidents of rape which have been chosen for the purpose of answering this research question, were analysed using thematic analysis (Durrheim, Painter & Terreblanche, 2006).

Guest, MacQueen and Namey (2012, p. 10) explain that this approach moves "beyond counting explicit words or phrases and focus on identifying and describing both implicit and explicit ideas within the data, that is, themes". It is this lack of specific meaning that makes this method of analysis suitable for conducting this research project.
Using this method of data analysis the researcher may use different methods to gather data and then to analyse it for their specific purpose. Guest, MacQueen and Namey (2012) explain that the researcher may use different codes in the analysis process. These codes are created to " represent the identified themes and applied or linked to raw data as summary markers for later analysis. Such analyses may or may not include the following: comparing code frequencies, identifying code co-occurrence, and graphically displaying relationships between codes within the data set" (Guest, MacQueen & Namey, 2012, p. 11).

4.2.4 Sample

The sample used for the purpose of conducting this research project is three specific incidents of rape: a baby rape, a lesbian rape and the rape of a heterosexual teenager. The researcher acknowledges that the female body, regardless of age or sexual orientation, is not the only one that is possibly subjected to being raped. Rape, as is evident in the definition thereof, in the Sexual Offences and Related Matters Amended Bill Act 32 of 2007 (www.justice.gov.za) is "a sexual act which is committed against another without consent". It is acknowledged that males, regardless of age or sexual orientation, are also rapable. However, for the purpose of this research project, the focus is on different categories of women who have been raped and the reporting of these incidents.

The incidents that are reported in each of the newspapers bring to light different groups within a society who are targets of rape. How these groups are discussed differs, according to their social category, hence the need to examine different incidents of rape, rather than simply grouping them all together and making the assumption that rape and the raped female is viewed homogenously.

Baby Tshepang made news headlines when she was raped in 2001. She is the case chosen to discuss infant rape. Eudy Simelane was a lesbian who was raped and murdered in April 2008. The rape of lesbian women brings to the fore corrective rape found under the broader term of hate crime. Anene Booysen was raped and murdered in February 2013. She was a heterosexual teenager from Bredasdorp, known as an area of low economic activity.

The three incidents which form the base of this research were well documented in the media. They also appear in relation to articles which are written about other similar incidents. The rape victims in each of these incidents are/were female, from low socio-economic areas. Two of them were black, the other was coloured. The option to use cases across different races was considered; however, finding reports on rape in the white and Indian groupings was difficult, an element which in and of itself reflects a social aspect around rape and what is subsequently printed in the media. It is not only the poor, generally black female who is sexually assaulted. Reports about white women who were raped, when they are reported - Alison, Charlene Smith and Ina Bonnette - , are limited. It appears that making the incident of their rape publicly known has to come from the victim rather than a press release and a front page news story. An aspect that alludes to who is afforded privacy from the media and who is a front page story, split along the lines of race.

The newspapers selected for data collection are both predominantly Gauteng-based daily publications. Each of these publications is owned by a different media company. The Star is read predominantly by middle to upper class white readers. It is an old and established newspaper (www.sahistory.org). According to the information provided on its website, The Star is said to be a newspaper that is for Johannesburg specifically but that its readership does extend beyond this. The editor Kevin Ritchie states that the newspapers shares the emotions of its readers "we celebrate their achievements, we weep when they mourn, we help them, we guide them, we entertain them, we even keep them on their toes" (www.iol.co.za/thestar). The Star is owned by the media group Independent Newspapers, a company which publishes "more than 30 daily and weekly newspapers in the country's 3 major metropolitan areas" (www.iol.co.za/newspapers).

The Sowetan is owned by TM Media. This group publishes "a number of national, regional and community newspapers, magazines in consumer, business and specialist fields" (www.timesmedia.co.za). The Sowetan has a largely middle-class black readership. It is a newspaper that was born in the late 1970's. The staff who worked at this publication faced

harassment and arrest for their publication during the Apartheid era due to its content. Post–Apartheid, The Sowetan underwent a change in its publishing style. It was no longer specifically a political newspaper (www.sowetanlive.co.za). It is necessary to take into consideration that the three incidents of rape which form the base of research in this project all took place in communities that are effectively referred to as poverty-stricken and that the victims in each of these incidents were possibly themselves in the lower economic strata of society. The readers of these newspapers are presumably, based on the readership data located on various sites, in economic categories which are perceived to be above those of the rape victims about whom they are reading, thus how these incidents are framed and subsequently viewed may be affected accordingly.

4.2.5 Scope

While it seems a relatively small sample, three specific incidents of rape - a baby rape, a lesbian rape and a heterosexual rape - each of the incidents selected is representative of the various kinds of coverage of rape investigated in this thesis. This is not to say that each individual is representative of a certain ‘category of women, but rather those preconceptions already extant in South African civil society affect ways in which these individual cases are potentially portrayed.

This research report is confined to research in two specific newspapers. It does not seek to engage with reasons of why men rape nor does it seek to pathologise either the perpetrator or the victim. From the research conducted in this project, a definitive answer as to why South Africa finds itself in the situation that it does is not being sought. The focus of this report is to provide an understanding of broader issues of diversity within society that are brought to the fore through reporting on incidents of rape and the manner that the discourses used in this process influence or construct these understandings or lack thereof .

Chapter 5.

5. Discussion

The discussion of the data will be explored in the following manner; a broad comparative analysis of the stories as they were published in both The Star and The Sowetan and then a specific analysis of broad, recurrent themes. The articles which were used in each data set are counted as follows: In the introduction, the total number of articles which were collected within the time period of analysis is given. In each theme which is discussed the number of times that this was a theme in an article is stated. It should thus be noted that there number of theme articles when added is greater than the total of articles. This is because within a single article there was sometimes more than one theme which emerged. In the appendix is a table which shows how themes were coded and counted. Lastly is a discussion about what these recurrent themes allude to or highlight in relation to gender, race and diversity issues within South Africa.

5. 1 The Star – Baby Tshepang

A total of thirty-three articles were gathered, within the chosen time frame October 2001 to July 2002, which met the criteria search for this research project, "Baby Tshepang" and "rape". Of these, one article was an opinion piece and twelve were front page news stories. Six major themes emerged.

5.1.1 Theme 1: Baby Tshepang as the main focus

There were fourteen articles which featured Baby Tshepang as the main focus. Details were given of the extent of her injuries as well as her medical condition and updates on her health as time passed after the attack. An article which appeared on the front page of the newspaper stated "Baby Tshepang, the nine-month-old baby allegedly gang-raped and sodomised by six men last week, is on the road to recovery" (7/11/01, p. 1). This statement conveys the extent of the assault on the baby. Framed in this is the concept of innocence brutalised. Although it was eventually determined she was raped by one man, rather than six as initially alleged, the preface "Baby" in all of the articles serves to remind the reader that it was a baby who was raped. The framing of this story highlights concepts which were discussed in the literature

review. The aspect which resonates distinctly here is a discussion by Nel (1994) around what it is that constitutes news and what is considered worthy of being printed in a newspaper. The first criteria which Nel (1994) engages with is that of newsworthiness. The story about Baby Tshepang fits this category as the rape of a baby is almost unimaginable. The second criterion is that the story printed needs to generate a conversation beyond the reader simply reading an article. The rape of a baby will generate this conversation, as it is a seemingly incomprehensible action. The fact that the details of her injuries and her subsequent recovery are documented ensures that this is a continuing conversation. The last criterion mentioned by Nel (1994) is that of the commercial value of a story. It seems almost cruel to state that the rape of a baby would generate newspaper sales. However, as this was one of the most notable and well documented cases of baby rape in post – 1994 South Africa, speculatively people following the events of the story as they unfolded may have been likely to buy a newspaper for this reason.

The conundrum of a raped baby is captured by Posel (2005b, p. 241) in which she states "The sexual violation of babies produces a starkly binary opposition of moral good versus evil: the victim of sexual violence was unambiguously innocent, pure and fragile, against the unmitigated and undiluted brutality of the actions of the perpetrator".

It is for these reasons that the details of Baby Tshepang's rape were considered newsworthy and printed.

In relation to the broader society, a story like this one brings the reader to a stark realisation that there is no age limit on who is rapable and who is not. The underlying inference is the myth that "the assailant is perverted or crazy" (Benedict, 1992, p. 15). This myth would be effectively employed as there is no room to blame the victim, who was a baby at the time that the incident took place, this is not to say that there is room to blame adult rape victims. Taking this into consideration, the question a reader may ask is "What sort of a person rapes a baby?" opening up a space to try and create an image of the depraved monster who performs such actions. The reports of the details of the injuries and the recovery keep these ideas circulating.

An and Grower (2009) would explain that within this theme is the frame which they refer to as the "human interest frame" (An & Grower, 2009, p. 108). In this frame the reader is forced to form an emotional response to what they have read and also to take into consideration the implications that this response will have. It is also within this frame that the conflict of blame

and responsibility meet. In relation to a rape victim, especially a baby, this conundrum will produce an emotional response, a response which seeks answers to the incomprehensive.

5.1.2 Theme 2: Baby Tshepang – a hook for a broader discussion

Within the framework of this theme there were fifteen articles. This frame of themes focussed on responses to the rape of Baby Tshepang. This linking of themes, to the main story about the rape of a baby is evident in two, unrelated, comments. The first relates to an advertisement which appeared shortly after the rape of Baby Tshepang.

> "An advertisement – asking who is responsible for the gang-rape of 9-month-old Tshepang in the Northern Cape – yesterday became the latest sign of a growing public outcry for action on South Africa's horrific child abuse record" (10/11/01, p.1).

Inferred in this comment is that there is a collective outrage directed towards those accused of the rape of Baby Tshepang and a demand for justice. It may be the innocence factor of a baby that 'helped' to initiate public outcry and a demand for a response. The question is, what did this outcry yield and what is the status baby rape in 2014? Referring back to the incident of rape which shook India in 2012 and the public response which occurred, it begs the question why did the outrage on behalf of Baby Tshepang eleven years earlier in South Africa not yield the same results?

This links into the next comment. A member of the public was outraged, took to the internet to vent her horror, frustration and a need for something to be done. This is captured in the quote:

> "Dr Heather MacKay, the angry mother who triggered tremendous public reaction with her e-mail campaign in support of Baby Tshepang, is continuing her efforts" (8/11/01, p.1).

This indicates that there was a public response to the incident which was printed. The response was most likely elicited on the basis that this was a baby who was raped.

The last comment to be discussed in this section is one made by the mother of another raped infant. This comment alerts the reader to two elements, the first is that of the disbelief that it is an infant who is raped and the other is the indication that the rape of Baby Tshepang was

not an isolated incident, this incident, however, has become a point of reference when baby rape is discussed. The comment, made by the mother of the raped baby, is as follows:

> "The 5-month-old girl is the latest victim of a series of brutal baby rapes recently reported (…) 'I had heard about the baby who was raped in the Northern Cape,' she said, 'But I never believed such a thing could happen until my child was raped' (3/12/01, p.1).

The comment "the latest victim of a series of brutal baby rapes recently reported" (3/12/01, p. 1) can be linked to discussions by Richter (2003) and Posel (2005b). Posel (2005b, p. 246) in reference to the rape of Baby Tshepang, comments, despite the details of the event which were published being minimal, the "moral horror was absolute", captured in the comment of the mother of another raped baby, is disbelief, while the email campaign and the advertisement reflect a public, moral horror. Richter (2003) comments in the introduction of her article Baby Rape in South Africa, that:

> "The acute public recognition of the rape of infants and toddlers in South Africa was occasioned by the case of a particularly shocking, widely reported rape in late 2001, followed in rapid succession by the rape of several other infants" (Richter, 2003, p. 392).

This comment indicates that, sadly, baby rape was not a one-off incident and that the reporting of the rape of Baby Tshepang opened a space for this discussion to occur.

Within all of these comments is reflected a sense of moral outrage. It would appear that as it was a baby who was raped that the readership is more easily able to overcome a potentially unrecognised, racial barrier and to feel a need to help and campaign on behalf of the victim, a victim who survived. It is perhaps the common element of childhood and the idyllic manner that this is remembered and framed within adult discourse of this time period. UNICEF provides a definition of childhood, explaining:

> Childhood is the time for children to be in school and at play, to grow strong and confident with love and encouragement of their family and an extended community of caring adults. It is a precious time in which children should live free from fear, safe from violence and protected from abuse and exploitation. As such, childhood means much more than just the space between birth and the attainment of adulthood. It refers to the state and condition of a child's life, to the quality of those years.

UNICEF Childhood defined www.unicef.org

It is possibly the juxtaposition of the construct of childhood and the violent nature of rape which allows people, to transcend their racially constructed perceptions of the Other and to allow themselves to express a moral outrage.

5.1.3 Theme 3: Justice System

This theme addresses the justice system and associated implications found in discussions around this topic. There were twenty-three articles in which this was a dominant theme. Comments around the justice system come from Baby Tshepang's father, as well as the attorney representing the accused. Baby Tshepang's father stated

> "I am going to leave it in the hands of the court, but I have told the community that if justice is not done, they can mete out any sentence that they wish on the real culprit." (9/11/01, p. 1).

This comment reflects a sense of ambiguity on the part of Baby Tshepang's father. He implies that he expects that the justice will prevail and that he will find the court's ruling favourable. However, if the court does not find and rule in a manner that he finds acceptable, the community has permission to deal with the perpetrator in a manner that they feel is appropriate for the crime which was committed.

The other comment is made by the attorney for the accused in relation to the DNA tests which were conducted. The attorney was reported saying that "their release was proof of an effective justice system" (18/01/02, p.1). Inferred in this comment is that the justice system which is operational in South Africa does function and that there will be justice for those who deserve it. The fact that the DNA results were negative, and that the accused were released, created a space then for the question to emerge "Who is guilty?"

The broader social implications of the discussion around justice are that the commentary seems seek to allay fears of a fallible justice system and to instil a sense of faith in the system in the broader community. The father's comment implies that he is hesitant to place his faith in the justice system and that it is necessary for him to ensure that there is an alternative of his own making, in the event the justice system fails his daughter. In the attorney's comment is the implicit inference that the justice system in post-democratic South Africa does work

and that the white population, who may be reluctant to have a belief in its effectiveness, can rest assured that it is a functioning and fair system. Those who deserve punishment will have it dealt to them accordingly, while those who are innocent will walk free. The division which emerges strongly along the lines of race and class, in this instance, is the stance and sense of trust in the justice system.

5.1.4 Theme 4: Location and Community dynamics

There were twenty-two articles which dealt with the topic of the community and location in which Baby Tshepang lived. The articles discussed the community dynamics as well as those of Baby Tshepang's family. A comment which encapsulates this discussion stated:

> "The home, owned by her great-aunt, who has a penchant for 'soetwyn' (sweet red wine), was at the time, run as an informal shebeen. Tshepang's unmarried mother, aged 16, whom the community initially hit out at because of her alleged late-night drinking and partying sessions, will also not be returning" (21/01/02, p. 2).

In this comment, a number of insinuations and ideas about the community are raised. The first is that the great-aunt enjoyed a home-brewed alcoholic beverage and that she sold this in an informal, possibly illegal, establishment. This links into the broader social concept that within poor communities, especially in the provinces in which wine is produced, people spend their time drinking and in state of drunkenness and that they are therefore not able to care for their children and that this makes their children vulnerable to being violated by other adults in the community. The other aspect captured in this comment is the fact that Tshepang's mother was a teenager and that it was alleged that she was not at home at the time that her baby was raped. No mention is made as to in whose care Baby Tshepang had been left. This leaves the gap for the inference and possible accusation that her mother was an unfit parent; she was young, did not act appropriately and that she too was involved in drinking. The overarching inference in this comment is that in a community such as this where people spend their time brewing and drinking alcohol, it effectively opens a space for such incidents to occur. The gap opens for the reading audience, the white middle class, to construct the image of a community which does not resemble their own and in which incidents such as the one that they are reading about occur. This construct effectively distances them from the

story, despite the fact that it was a baby who was raped. It creates a distance from the image of childhood, which was discussed earlier.

The location of the incident was referred to frequently, stressing to the reader a distant and removed environment of poverty and degradation. There are two comments which bring this theme of location to the fore:

> They are just two of the 4 500 people who live in Louisvaleweg township, outside Upington, a place of despair, where men boast about their *houvroue,* or mistresses; where sex with under-age girls is accepted; and where there's little money, and most of what there is goes on booze and drugs. (9/11/01, p. 1)
>
> "Tshepang's first nine months were spent living in a small two-bedroomed home in Sultana Road in Louisvaleweg, Upington. It was here that she was raped and sodomised about three months ago" (21/01/02).

The first comment (9/11/01, p. 1) implies, which can be linked to the above discussion, that in this location people use alcohol in excess and that moral depravity is seemingly a social norm.

The second comment explains to the reader the type home in which Baby Tshepang lived. It is within these comments that the space for objectification is created and a distance is further established between the middle-class, white suburban reader and the story's subject.

The establishment of distance based on location is found in the work of Worthington (2013) and the frame of "perceptions of a rough town" (Worthington, 2013, p. 110). The construction of the home environment as one that is unfamiliar and seemingly unsafe, in relation to that of white, high walled suburban living, enables a distance to be put between the reader and the raped baby. This frame links into objectification, it provides the foundation for this idea to begin to take shape.

Loughnan, Haslam, Murnane, Vaes, Reynolds & Suitner (2010, p. 716) explain that "Objectification leads to people being viewed as lacking mental states and being less deserving of moral status". In reference to the above quote about the home in which Baby Tshepang lived and in which she was raped, objectification takes place on both these levels – "lacking mental state and being less deserving of moral status" (Loughnan *et al*, 2010, p. 716). Loughnan *et al* (2010) explain in their study that the more a subject was objectified, the

less they were afforded either a mental state or a moral status. In reminding the readership of the community socio-economic circumstances and the description of the home of Baby Tshepang, a chasm is created between the humanity of the reader and the people in the news article. The people in the news article become distant objects who form the cast of characters in the story. They lose their status as people who are able to think and have an opinion about the community in which they live. In this manner, the moral status of the people in the story becomes further removed as well. They are no longer people whom the readership is able to connect with in any manner. It is at this point that the people in the newspaper article come to occupy the position objectified subjects, their humanity effectively erased.

The broader social circumstances thus creates a space for the 'us' and 'them' divide to take root.

The underlying diversity issue inferred within the location context is racialised and classed. The community in which Baby Tshepang lived was a township, a place where it is assumed predominantly non-white people live and that this is therefore a non-white issue, something that does not occur in the areas that middle class, white people live.

5.1.5 Theme 5: Rape myths

There were eight articles in which rape myths were inferred in response to the rape of Baby Tshepang. None of them were directed at her, none sought to apportion blame to her. These myths were contingent in reference to the perpetrators initially and then on the single perpetrator found guilty of the crime. These myths were implied through comments such as "Even animals don't do to their young what you did to Baby Tshepang and you don't even show any sort of remorse" (27/07/02, p. 1, judge's comment on handing down sentence). Outside of court, protestors yelled commentary as the accused were taken back to prison "*Julle is siek* (you are sick)" (14/11/01, p. 3). And a comment which was repeated in different articles from a speech by, then deputy president, Jacob Zuma "The rape of a 9-month-old baby defies description in any language, and indeed displays moral depravity of the worst order" (23/11/01, p. 13). Each of these comments, while echoing sentiments that may be true in relation to an assault on a baby, is the implication that men who act in such a manner cannot be of sound mind (Benedict, 1992). The rapist is not presented with character traits

that are considered to be within the norms of society, he is not the friendly neighbour or a family member. He is someone whom society has banished to the outskirts of its parameters.

5.1.6 Theme 6: Campaigns

There were ten articles which focused intensely on campaigns which had emerged in response to the rape of Baby Tshepang. One which gained prominence was an email campaign launched by an enraged reader. A comment captures what initiated her campaign and how it is expanding "Dr Heather MacKay (…) triggered tremendous public reaction with her email campaign in support of Baby Tshepang, is continuing her efforts" (8/11/01, p. 1). There was a monetary fund established for Baby Tshepang. Other articles published in response to this initial one addressed issues of places and ways in which the public could take action against child abuse. In these comments, no mention is made of the race of Baby Tshepang, although her name suggests that she is a black, African baby. This campaign response links into the childhood discussion, which was made prior, and the transcendence of common humanity. It is evident from this response and the initiatives discussed in different articles that children, regardless of race, are to be cared for and protected by all of society. The moral outrage has crossed racial borders, it is inferred, but not overtly stated, that child abuse knows no boundaries. It is not the sole burden of the black child, a child of any race can become a victim and that there are ways in which the adults who are entrusted to care for these children can play their part in ensuring that children are able to have a childhood as is imagined in the definition given by UNICEF

5.2 The Sowetan – Baby Tshepang

This discussion focuses on The Sowetan and the stories which it published in relation to the rape of Baby Tshepang. This search brought only five articles, none of which made the front page and three of the five articles were opinion pieces. There were three main themes that emerged within these articles.

5.2.1 Theme 1: Baby Tshepang - a hook for a broader discussion

Unlike in The Star, where there were many reports of the details of the assault upon Baby Tshepang, there was only one fleeting mention of these details made The Sowetan. All five of the articles dealt with issues in which Baby Tshepang was the entrance point for a discussion around matters of rape and broader social concerns and implications. The quote:

> "It is our responsibility – those of us who aspire to join the majority of responsible, loving, caring men and women – to protect and bring laughter to Baby Tshepang and all children like her who at this moment are suffering – from the malevolent attention of rapists"(29/01/02 p. 22).

This comment raises a number of issues. The first is that the protection of children is not a gendered concept; it is the responsibility of everyone. Unlike in The Star, where there was the inference of 'us' and 'them' in many of the articles that reported on the rape of Baby Tshepang, in The Sowetan, there is the inference that this is an incident for which the readership and the community in which the event took place are to be held accountable to ensure that such an event does not occur again. There is not a division of that community and 'our' community, it is a collective 'us' which echoes in the articles, the class division is absent in the discussion. The rape of a baby is unacceptable and the moral outrage is to be used to generate a space for accountability to manifest.

The concept of responsibility as a social collective is implied. It is accepted that in order for change to occur and for children to be protected, it is necessary for the collective community to stand together and address the issue. There is no reliance on outside sources or a call on government to act in response to the rape of an infant.

The rape myth that "the assailant is perverted or crazy" (Benedict, 1992, p. 15) is evident. Benedict (1992, p.15) explains that this myth is invoked "when the sex crime is extremely grotesque or when the victim cannot easily be pegged as having provoked it". In the case of Baby Tshepang, her status as a baby removes any possible ideas that she somehow provoked the attack. Thus in order to try and comprehend what sort of a person would assault a baby, the discourse which positions the assailant outside of a civil, caring society is used. Benedict (1992, p. 15) explains, however, that this idea is just wishful thinking, research indicates that "The majority of rapists are known to their assailants – they are relatives, boyfriends,

husbands, teachers, doctors, neighbourhood friends, colleagues, therapists, policeman, bosses – not seedy loners lurking in alleyways"; an argument which has proved true in this incident.

In comparison to the discussion in The Star of Tshepang as a theme, there are differences. In The Star, articles focused on advertisements and campaigns which sought to engage the wider public. A fund was established for Baby Tshepang into which people could make monetary donations. The advertisement which was placed on a billboard was understood to represent a national outcry in response to the rape of a baby; it is evident that this may not have been the case in relation to the discussions around this theme in The Sowetan. In this manner, it is evident that there is an element of distance from the readership in The Star and the baby who was raped. She is not a part of the society in which they live, but the brutality of the act which she was subjected to demands a response and some form of collective action. The Sowetan, however, implies in the articles which were written that baby rape is not an abstract concept within the community readership. The fact that this rape was deemed newsworthy may rest on the brutality of the attack rather than its unusualness.

The concept of a singular identity based on a single feature, in this instance being a black person, is explored by Ndlovu (2012). Ndlovu (2012, p. 143) argues "that there are critical contexts and moments when and where certain aspects of our identity are made more salient and dominant than others in the articulation of who we are". This is evident in the expression of seeking collective accountability; it is a social burden, not a divided burden nor the burden of the Other. Ndlovu (2012, p.155) explains that there is a dominant story within "narratives of blackness, one that stubbornly refuses to be erased, ties the definition of what it means to be black to the discourses and histories of oppression, colonialism and slavery". Ndlovu (2012, p. 156) quoting Ratele (2003) states that the establishment of a united group "creates a kind of solidarity allowing all black people to stand together as a singular group". There is not 'us' and 'them' division on this matter. Its eradication is the responsibility of the collective. This is a feature which was absent in The Star and the manner in which the articles were able to create a space for the 'us' and 'them' discourse to take root.

5.2.2 Theme 2: The Justice System

In all five articles the justice system was a dominant theme, the insinuation in the commentary in relation to the justice system was a hesitancy to believe that justice would be

served. Two comments highlight slightly different aspects of this argument, they are as follows:

> "… the country was gearing to charge the judicial system with the task of determining sentences for the accused that would act as a serious deterrent to would-be rapists in the future" (18/01/02, p. 16)
>
> "This pattern can be attributed to low public confidence in the capacity of the law to apprehend and prosecute criminals" (11/12/01, p. 8).

The first comment implies that if sentences and punishment for rapists were harsher, that this may act as a deterrent to the would-be perpetrator. The broader implication within this comment is that because the chance of being sentenced is minimal, rapists are not afraid of the consequences of their actions and therefore continue to act in such a manner.

The second comment highlights the lack of faith on the part of the public that those who are meant to uphold the law and enforce it do not necessarily fulfil this mandate in a manner that is deemed adequate by either the reading community or the community in which the incident took place.

In comparison to the theme of the justice system in The Star, it was implied that justice would be meted out to the offenders, the only person to infer hesitancy was Baby Tshepang's father.

5.2.3 Theme 3: Rape myths and public response

There were three articles in which a public response and rape myths emerged as a dominant theme. The response, however, was not one of campaigning or expressions of outrage in a letter to the editor; rather it was a response calling for thoughtful and inward reflections as a community with regards to the construction and implications of the black, female body. There is seemingly a deeper realisation of the social issues that are located within broader discussions around the rape of a baby. This is not just a news story; it is a story from which a discussion and reflection on the situation took place.

The article's author comments, "The rape of a nine-month-old baby defies description in any language, and indeed displays the moral depravity of the highest order" (18/11/01, p. 22).

This is a sentiment that is echoed in certain articles in The Star as well. This indicates that regardless of race, there is a moral abhorrence towards those who rape babies.

The other comment poses a pertinent question, which brings to light the ideas that are reflected in the work of Marshall (1996) and the rapable black woman and those who are held responsible for the act of rape. The author of the article deliberates "I wonder if their pictures and names would have been made public before their court case if they had not been perceived as the dregs of society" (20/01/02, p. 8). The even greater inference is that for the many black women who are raped, those who rape them are not made publically known, in this manner the perpetrator/s are afforded a sense of anonymity behind which to hide their deeds.

On a broader level, this comment and the associated implications creates space for a discussion about the general treatment of the black body and the lack of humanity that is afforded to the victim, culprit or deceased. This discussion is highlighted by De Vos (2013) in which he explores public reaction to the images of the massacred Marikana miners and the images of the crime scene in Oscar Pistorius' bathroom. The difference between these two groups is class, race and fame. The miners were black, working class men; it would appear that this afforded them no privacy in death. Their families were seemingly not seen as people who would be upset or offended at the image of their deceased loved one being flashed around the world. However, this was exactly the point raised in relation to the Pistorius case. The accused and the victim's families were considered, and there was outrage at images being shown. It should be noted that in the case of Pistorius, the photographs were of the crime scene, the body of the victim was not present in the images. In relation to the accused in the case of Baby Tshepang, their faces became public knowledge shortly after the incident. While they were falsely accused of the crime, they were not afforded anonymity of any kind, it needs to be considered whether this is because they were accused of such a heinous crime or because they were black and coloured, lower class men or is it a combination of these factors?

This ties together the argument that the white body and the community in which it resides, is constructed as being pure and virtuous, above performing heinous crimes or of being the victim and therefore is afforded privacy in the media in the event that it befalls prey to crime. The black body and the community in which it resides, however, is constructed in the

opposite manner, it is afforded no privacy in the media in the event that it becomes a victim of an atrocity, thus visually entrenching a race and class division.

5. 3 Comparative discussion

The difference between The Star and The Sowetan in terms of the occurrence of themes is telling. There was no mention of the place in which the rape of Baby Tshepang took place in articles printed by The Sowetan unlike in The Star where it featured frequently. The implication of this is that it reminded the reader of the distance between their suburban lives and that of the township in which Baby Tshepang and her family lived. The other aspect missing was that of a discussion of the community and the family structure in which Baby Tshepang lived. The implications of these themes, absent or present are interlinked. In The Star, the discussion of the community and the mention of the location creates a sense of the 'us' and 'them' divide. The rape of a baby apparently does not occur in the society in which the readership of The Star lives. The location and community dynamics also serve as a tentative offering of explanation for how it is that such a horrific attack on a baby came to take place. By contrast, the absence of discussions around these themes in The Sowetan implies a sense of general understanding of the circumstances in which the vast majority of the population live and that rape and violence against women is not uncommon, the response elicited is due to the victim being a baby.

This sense of understanding and familiarity of the living challenges that are experienced by people who live in communities can be tied into the work of Ndlovu (2012). In his work he explains that a person, in the construction of their identity/ identities, can opt to "assert singularity for and by themselves" (Ndlovu, 2012, p. 144). It is explained that when people choose to identify themselves in this manner, that it is for a specific purpose. In that context, their multiplicity is erased and a single identifying aspect is brought to the fore. In this instance, the identification and understanding which is made known in the above quote is evident. The division of 'us' and 'them' is absent. The subtle, unspoken element through each of the themes explored in both newspapers is that of race, with gender an unspoken assumption, the concept that rape is a black problem and that the age of the female who is raped is inconsequential, is evident in the discussions above.

It is important to note that the opinion pieces which were written in The Sowetan reflect a more thoughtful, reflective element regarding the rape of a baby. The front page stories which were printed in The Star gave factual, gory details of the incident; there was a lack of a reflective element or an acknowledgement that the rape of a baby can be an entry point to engage with deeper seated social issues.

The reflections in the opinion articles which appeared in The Sowetan indicate that there is awareness and a deeper understanding of the social challenges that reside within the community that is being discussed and in which the rape took place. This is reflected in the portrayal of a sense of cohesive understanding between the writer, the community and the readership. This is evident in the lack of details of the actual assault, it would appear that there is a silent understanding of the extent of the injuries, there is no need to constantly make them known. The rapist however is constructed in a manner that removes him from the parameters of the expressed cohesive community. There is a sense of collective responsibility to attempt to address the root causes of the assault which is meted out to the black, female body. It would appear that when the assault upon that body is as extreme as that which Baby Tshepang was subjected to, a space opens up for this conversation to begin to emerge. People begin to seek to take responsibility within the collective community to explore causes and possible solutions. This is evident in the manner that there was not a call on government to act or other external groups, but rather the focus on seeking answers was reflected inwardly within the community.

The Star in contrast, reported the details of the assault as well as the location of the incident. It is through these themes that the 'us' and 'them' divide it continually cleaved. The campaigns launched indicate that there is an element of concern for the victim. However, the constant reminder of the racial divide serves to ensure that the conversation which is had after the article is read is one that perpetuates the idea that violent assault is something that people in those communities do. Evident in the themes which emerged in The Star are echoes of the sentiments that were expressed in the frames of the work of both Worthington (2013) and Dosekun (2013).

5. 4 The Star – Eudy Simelane

This discussion is of the articles which appeared in the respective newspapers used in this study and what they reported about the rape and murder of Eudy Simelane. A common pre-cursor to the mention of Eudy's name in an article was 'Banyana Banyana star', implying that because she had a certain status within society; it was newsworthy, in a sense justifying the story of a raped and murdered black lesbian woman.

There were a total of ten articles that met the data collection criteria, one of which was an opinion article.

5.4.1 Theme 1: Location

There were seven articles that made mention of the location in which the rape and murder of Eudy Simelane took place. There are different stories reported, but the location is used as the linking element between the articles. The following quotes reflect this:

> "Among others, former Banyana Banyana soccer player Eudy Simelane was gang-raped and murdered in April this year at Kwa-Thema in Ekhuruleni" (8/07/08, p. 2).

> "… all were from Kwa-Thema near Springs in Ekhuruleni" (14/02/09, p. 5).

Mentioning the location in which the incident occurred serves to remind the readership that this incident took place outside of the parameters of the areas in which they live. The event took place in a township, implied, but overtly stated is that the victim in the story was a black woman.

5.4.2 Theme 2: Campaigns

Unlike the campaigns that were initiated after the rape of Baby Tshepang, the campaigns in response to Eudy Simelane were taken-up by gender activists. There were six articles which documented campaigns as a major theme. Gender activists are people who are already attuned to the rights of people who do not necessarily define themselves within the parameters of heteronormativity that makes its self-known as the gender normative in much of society. Two quotes highlight the battle which gender activists took up in response to the

rape and murder of a lesbian woman. The campaigns are not only in response to the rape and murder of a woman, but rather a response to a woman murdered and raped because of her sexual orientation.

The comments are as follows:

> "Outside court, a group of gender activists chanted, demanding a lengthy sentence" (13/02/09 p. 2)
>
> "Gay and Lesbian Equality Project director Phumi Mtetwa said 'I understand when the judge said that he didn't take sexual orientation into consideration, but it perpetuates the prejudices, stereotypes and attacks on them' (11/02/09, p. 5).

Further implied within these quotes is that the response to the rape and murder of lesbian women is not a point around which society as a collective takes action, rather it is left to gender activist groups. The underlying inference is that different sexual orientations are not as accepted as they should be. It may be enshrined in the constitution of South Africa, but the reality on the ground tells a different story.

A quote from an article, author unknown, states that "People should begin to accept gays and lesbian as part of our broader society and not infringe on their rights" (26/09/09, p. 7). This quote encapsulates the conundrum of theory and reality of the situation. It is evident that, within society, homophobia is still rife. In some instances it is overtly and violently expressed and in others it is made known through commentary and snide remarks. In each of these actions is the expression of a personal stance and discomfort on the part of the offender.

5.4.3 Theme 3: Hate crimes and corrective rape

There were four articles in which the topic of hate crimes and corrective rape was a main theme. Wesley (2009) using a definition taken from the American Psychological Association 1998, explains that a hate crime:

> differs from general crimes because the perpetrator is specifically targeting someone who identifies with a specific group. The perpetrator seeks to demean and dehumanise their victims based on their actual or perceived race, ethnicity, gender, age, sexual

> orientation, disability, health status, nationality, social origin, religious convictions, culture, language, or other characteristics
>
> Wesley, 2009, p. 76.

Within the umbrella term of hate crime is the term corrective rape. Wesley (2009, p. 76) explains that "Corrective rape, also known as curative rape, is a brutal act of violence in which African women and teenagers who are, or are at least assumed to be, lesbians are raped to 'cure' them of their homosexuality". This term indicates that there is a silence around the experiences of white lesbian women, this despite derogatory commentary directed at the lesbian woman and the manner in which her sexual orientation could be 'cured'. This definition also highlights that corrective rape is seemingly directed specifically at African lesbians, the explanation offered as to why they are raped is made publicly know. This positions homophobic violence as a black phenomenon, potentially feeding into the colonial ideology of the violent black man and his 'need' to assert his masculinity is a violent manner. The inference present in this discussion is that rape is the burden of the black female, and in this case compounded by her sexual orientation. The white woman, is absent from the discussion, seemingly hidden or silenced on matters of sexual violence, specifically violence which is rooted in sexual orientation.

This dynamic could be explained using the discussion by Johnson (2001) on power and privilege. Johnson (2001, p. 23) citing the work of McIntosh explains that "privilege exists when one group has something of value that is denied to others simply because of the groups that they belong to, rather than because of anything that they have done or failed to do". Thus while the white lesbian woman is potentially subject to homophobic slurs and corrective rape, this is kept hidden from the public domain due to the privilege of the white skin. In this manner, the white lesbian is oppressed by not being able to make known her experiences because of her sexual orientation, and 'privileged' on the basis that her skin colour offers her a mask to shield the reality of her experiences in a heteronormative society.

Hate crime is brought to the fore by gender activist groups. This is evident in the comment "Simelane's sexuality was ruled out in the first sentencing as a motive in her killing, but activists have linked the case to 'corrective rape' " (26/09/09, p. 7). It is evident in this statement that the judge wanted to present the case as the rape and murder of a woman, omitting her sexual orientation, an element that gender activists consider a motivating factor for the rape and murder of Eudy. It appears that there is a struggle between making it known

that homophobia is a motivating factor in the attack on lesbian women, and the 'desire' to keep it hidden. This ties into the campaign aspect as well; it is those who are willing to take up activities that lobby for the rights of all sexual orientations and the general public who seem not to know how to engage with the attack on lesbian women.

In contrast to Baby Tshepang, it was easier for there to be public outrage at the attack on a baby, while it seems that there are other factors at play in the rape of a lesbian woman. People have to grapple with their own position in relation to homosexuality, while this should not be an element at play, it would appear that it is. The judge's ruling and blatant dismissal of Eudy's sexual orientation as a motivating factor, serves to highlight that the threats that lesbian women are exposed to in society are seemingly not taken seriously or openly acknowledged. The judge left out a defining aspect of Eudy's identity; reflecting possibly, a discomfort with a sexual orientation that fell outside of the heteronormative.

5.5 The Sowetan – Eudy Simelane

There were five articles printed in The Sowetan during the time frame in which data was collected, May 2008 to September 2009. There were no front page stories nor were there any opinion pieces written. As in The Star, Eudy's name is frequently prefaced with the term Banyana Banyana star, reminding the readership that she was someone with status and in this manner possibly justifying why her story was printed. The absence of opinion pieces may point to a sense of discomfort and fear of retribution for voicing an opinion on the rape and murder of a lesbian woman.

5.5.1 Theme 1: Incident details

All five articles outlined the details of the incident and the injuries that Eudy sustained during the assault. This is evident in the comment "Self-confessed lesbian Simelane was repeatedly gang-raped before being stabbed more than 20 times and her body dumped" (6/05/08, p. 5) a comment that was printed almost verbatim on 4/06/08, p. 9. Within this statement is the inference that nobody labelled Eudy as lesbian, it was a sexual orientation with which she openly identified herself. The potential inference is that by openly admitting to being lesbian, Eudy somehow can be apportioned some blame for the attack. This links into the concept of a

hate crime. A crime in which the actions that are performed by the perpetrator/s is based on a strong dislike and belief that they are entitled to act in the manner that they do towards those that they dislike based on among other aspects sexual orientation (Wesley, 2009).

5.5.2 Theme 2: Hate-crimes and campaigns

There were two articles in which the term hate-crime and campaigns in response to the rape and murder of Eudy were a main theme. In one article, the term was used in direct relation to the crime, an aspect that the judge then discarded when the sentence was handed down. The other occurred in the name of an organisation which campaigned outside the court while the case was in session. The quotes are as follows:

"Lesufi is presiding in the trial of five men accused of gang-raping and brutally slaying former Banyana Banyana soccer player Eudy Simelane in an apparent hate crime" (1/08/08, p. 8). The inference here is that this act of assault was at first potentially considered as having been committed as a hate crime. This implies that the sexual orientation of the victim was considered to be a motivating factor in her rape.

> "About 200 members of the Triple 7 Campaign To End Hate Against Lesbians and Gays yesterday gathered outside the Springs magistrates' court where five men are accused of the brutal rape and murder of former Banyana Banyana football player Eudy Simelane" (6/05/08, p. 5).

It is in the title of the campaign group that the concept of hate crime is implied in relation to the rape of Eudy. The campaign serves to remind the public that the rape of lesbian women is linked to their sexual orientation, and not only because the victim is/was female.

5.5.3 Theme 3: Justice System

The justice system was the main theme in three articles. Evident in the discussions around it are the delays in the process of seeking justice for a lesbian woman who was raped and murdered. The comments which bring to the fore this discussion are as follows: "Lesufi adjourned the court to allow lawyers to consult their clients and postponed the case to June 26" (4/06/08, p. 9) and "This was after she had adjourned court five times to wait for one of

the accused to arrive from Heidelburg prison, where he was being held" (1/08/08, p. 8). In these sentiments are echoes of doubt in the justice system as was evident in the rape of Baby Tshepang, however, the doubts are based on the aspect that cases are stalled and delayed implying that there is a lack of urgency in seeking justice for the victims. On a boarder level, this reflects a seeming lack of concern and a sense of urgency to punish those who commit crimes of sexual assault and in this instance specifically crimes against a lesbian woman. This positions the victims as unimportant bystanders in the justice system.

5.5.4 Theme 4: Family dynamics

There are two articles in which Eudy's family was interviewed or discussed; one an in-depth feature. The article seeks to explain the family in which Eudy grew up and to highlight her involvement in her community, this particular element is repeated verbatim in an article published almost a month later. The verbatim statement:

> "Simelane was actively involved in HIV-Aids counselling and also took it upon herself to make sure handicapped people had food and clothing. 'She even used to wash them and cut their nails' said her mother" (14/05/08, p. 9 and 4/06/08, p. 9).

This statement and the article about Eudy's family, strives to bring to the reader's attention that Eudy lived in a family that may mirror their own. The implication is that her sexual orientation did not mean that she was not able to engage in community activities or that her family did not accept her for who she was. This article and statement present Eudy as a valuable, loving and contributing member of the community.

5.6 Comparative discussion

The Star printed the only opinion piece. An and Grower (2009, p. 108) may explain this through the "conflict frame". The focus in this frame is "on a form of conflict between different groups" (An & Groer, 2009, p. 108). This conflict is not overtly expressed, but the absence of opinion columns indicates hesitancy on the part of the journalists to engage with homosexuality and the rape of lesbian women.

The location of the incident was a key element in The Star, as with the articles about Baby Tshepang, the location reminded the reader of where the incident took place; creating a sense of distance from the story and allowing for othering to occur. This was a story about a raped, black lesbian woman. The Sowetan, however, did not mention the location inferring that their readership may be more familiar with incidents that occur in townships like the one that Eudy lived in. There was not an active call for collective response but there was not an overt means of distancing used in the reporting process. A commonality between the newspapers was a sense of discomfort about engaging a discussion in which homosexuality was a pivotal point.

The theme of hate crimes and campaigns were featured in both newspapers with focus on the activists and their protests against the dismissal of sexual orientation as a motivating factor. In both instances it was made clear that it was the activists who took up the battle, not the general public.

The Sowetan provided details of the injuries that Eudy sustained, while The Star did not make this a main theme. This mention of details, an aspect absent in the reporting about Baby Tshepang, may be intentionally / unintentionally printed to bring to the awareness of the reader, the potential fate of those who do not conform to heteronormativity. There is an element of antagonism within the stories that were reported in The Sowetan. This antagonism is located between the inferences made in reporting the details of Eudy's rape and murder and the intimate portrayal of her family life and community involvement. These contrasts make for an uneasy relationship, one that reflects both an element of compassion and empathy as well as a subtle warning about non-conformity.

The Star did not discuss Eudy's family. There was no attempt to bridge the racial, sexual orientation or class divide.

5.7 The Star – Anene Booysen

There was a total of forty-seven articles collected for analysis from February 2013 to November 2013, of those two were front page stories and seven were opinion pieces. Prior to any discussion of the themes that emerged, it is necessary to note that by South African law Anene Booysen was a child. South African law states that anybody under the age of 18 years is a child (Children's Act 38 of 2005). Anene was seventeen at the time of her rape and murder. At no point in any of the articles was Anene referred to in any manner as a child nor

was she afforded symbolic imagery that is associated with childhood, unlike those which were used in reference to Baby Tshepang.

Korn amd Efrat (2004) explored the representation of child rape survivors in two Iraeli newspapers. The authors hypothesised that the victims due to their young age would be portrayed in a manner that emphasised their innocence and position as children. This however was not the case; the authors observed "The innocence, which we believed would be attributed to the girl being a young victim, was not accorded to her. Her alleged sexual precociousness and previous sexual activity worked against her and harmed her as a reliable victim" (Korn & Efrat, 2004, p. 1071). The work of Benedict (1992) would explain that the victim was framed as a vamp, rather than as a virgin. The inference being that the victim is to be apportioned some part of the blame for being raped. She is also positioned as an adult because of her prior sexual activity.

5.7.1 Theme 1: Anene - details of assault

There were sixteen articles in which Anene's rape and the injuries which she sustained were made public knowledge. One of the most detailed comments reflects the state that Anene was in when she was admitted to the hospital. In the same article, prior to the details given by the doctor who treated Anene, the doctor commented that "The injuries Anene Booysen suffered were the worst she had ever seen" (16/10/13, p. 2). This indicates to the reading public that this was an extremely brutal attack; it is not just the story of another raped woman. This opening statement may encourage the reader to read further out of morbid fascination. This is an element that was inferred through the work of Nel (1994) and the example cited from the work of Edna Buchanan. The details were as follows:

> "She (Anene) was very dirty when she came in, covered in dust, blood and faeces. She had bruising around her eyes, a swollen face, and damages to the large and small intestines that were coming out of her vagina" (16/10/13, p. 2).

This description reveals the extent of the brutality which Anene was subjected to by her assailant. All the other articles mentioned to a lesser extent the details of the attack on Anene.

5.7.2 Theme 2: Anene - a hook for a broader discussion

There were twenty-nine articles in which the discussion was framed around the rape of Anene Booysen. A comment which is striking and which links back to the introduction of this research project is:

> "The public outcry in India over the gang rape and murder of a 23-year-old student on a New Delhi bus prompted soul searching in South Africa, where some people are asking: "Why not here?"" (11/02/13, p. 15).

The implication is that there are people who are asking the question, at what point will the rape of a woman in South Africa result in a national, united uproar and demands for visible, effective action occur? A debate in parliament took place shortly after Anene was raped and murdered. This debate only came about because of the attack on Anene, this is reflected in the statement "This debate takes place in the aftermath of the tragic and savage rape and murder of Anene Booysen" (21/02/13, p. 6). Another key element in this debate was the acknowledgement of a parliamentary member that "South Africans were 'correctly and entirely understandably' outraged" (21/02/1, p. 6). What is not engaged with is how to turn this outrage into constructive action. There is the mere acknowledgement that the brutality of this particular rape and murder of a young woman has caused a public outrage. This is in stark contrast to the rape of the student in India. The anger of the Indian people as a nation resulted in changes in the law around rape and harsher penalties being instated for convicted rapists (Eisenberg, 2013). A significant point in this article is that, despite it framing important information and pointing to key elements within the broader context of gender based violence, it appeared in a small column on page six of the newspaper. It could be easily glossed over by a reader or overshadowed by a feature on the same page which took up more space.

This links into the broader social question of where does public anger go to after an incident of this nature which has fired up many people to ask pertinent questions. Within this article is the obvious gap between public response and demands for action and the talk and actions, or rather a lack thereof, on the part of government. The people who the public voted into position; the people who have the power to make concrete actions a reality based on public outrage.

5.7.3 Theme 3: Justice System

The justice system and the commentary of those whom it affected in the process of the trial was evident in thirty articles. There were various points of focus in relation to the justice system this included court proceedings, comments by the accused and their family as well as from Anene's family and finally the sentencing of the accused. What was evident was the focus on the accused more than on the justice that was sought on the part of Anene and her family. These will be explored and underlying themes which are linked to them will be unpacked.

A statement made by the State outlines the charge which the accused faced and what was to be argued in court:

> "The State alleges that Kana unlawfully and deliberately sexually penetrated Anene with his penis or with another object unknown to the State, between February 1 and 2 this year, near Kleinbegin, Bredasdorp. It alleges that Kana then used his hand or another object to disembowel her. She died in hospital on February 2" (10/07/13, p. 5).

This accusation of an act of rape is in line with the definition as provided in the Sexual Offences and Related Matters Amended Bill Act 32 of 2007. What makes this article stand out, however, is not this statement but the comment that is made in the next column in which the State says that "previous reports on the disembowelment of Anene were untrue. 'There are rumours that we are trying to correct. She was never cut open,' he said" (10/07/13, p. 5). The implication is that the injuries which Anene sustained and which have been attributed as the cause of her death, were exaggerated and that those who had given evidence explaining the extent of the injuries were lying. This opens the gap for the reading public to doubt what is being said and to ask who is telling the truth. It also opens the space for questions about exaggeration and sensationalising of the story.

There is frequent commentary on events which took place in the court room. These comments reflect the position of the families of the accused and the victim. An article dated 22/05/13 (p. 1) "The mother of Johannes Kana broke down after court proceedings yesterday, saying her son was sitting in prison unnecessarily for a crime he did not commit". This despite the confession he had made earlier in court that he had raped and assaulted Anene on the night in question (22/05/13).

On the day of sentencing, both families' comments were printed in the same article. Evident are two perceptions of the justice system. The comments of the accused's family suggest that there is more to the story than what was made known in court. Kana's (the accused) aunt's comment captures a number of themes saying:

> "I was so shocked when I found out that he was arrested. I don't know him like that because he was a clever boy and never misbehaved… I am glad that the people aren't rude to us or treat us differently. They all know that this isn't the whole story of what happened to that girl" (4/11/13, p. 5).

Prior to this, she had also said that if he was guilty that he was to take the punishment that was meted out; she, however, followed this up with a statement of her disbelief that he had committed the crime of which he was accused. Tied up in these statements is the inference that the victim was in some way responsible for the actions of the accused. Implied as well is the rape myth that people who are insane or depraved commit rape, not those who are known to the victim or their community (Benedict, 1992). The concept of acquaintance rape explored by Cohn, Brown and Dupius (2009), could be applied in the case of Anene as the articles which are printed indicate that she knew the accused prior to the attack. One article went as far as to comment that "Kana and Anene had walked from the bar towards her home and had stopped to *vry* (kiss) each other. She had then pushed him away, but he pulled down his pants and raped her" (4/06/13, p. 2). Cohn, Brown and Dupuis (2009, p. 1515) explain that "Prior acquaintance with a perpetrator diminishes the seriousness of the situation for those attributing responsibility". This is the underlying inference within the statements made by the aunt of the accused. There is no direct blame placed on the justice system for the sentence given, but the disbelief in the act committed by the particular accused is still questioned. The broader inference is that the victim is somehow apportioned some of the blame and that the accused was not the sort of person to commit such an action. Bound within this discussion is the inference that the perpetrator was not necessarily guilty and that he has been placed in a position that tarnishes his own reputation, however, he is still supported by his family and the community at large. The community is not seeking to ensure that the perpetrator is held accountable for the actions which were committed. These responses echo those that were found in the article by Korn and Efrat (2004) in which there was large support for the boys who were accused and convicted of the rape of two teenage girls. The authors of the article noted that in this incident that newspapers focused on the defendant's story, and in this manner effectively created the space for "to depict men rather

than women as the true victims, presenting the defendant as not the kind of man who could possibly be a rapist" (Korn & Efrat, 2004, p. 1061). The articles relating to the rape of Anene do not specifically state this, however, by focusing on the comments of the accused's family the space is created to doubt that the incident as it was initially presented took place in that manner. In effect, creating the space for doubt about whether it was actually rape.

The comments by Anene's family in the same article portrays a different picture. Anene's foster mother was recorded saying that justice had been served (4/11/13). She was quoted after sentencing:

> " 'I don't want to talk about it because it's still very painful. Coming to court just reminded me of everything,' she said. Olivier (Anene's foster mother) added that people in the community often taunted her, accusing her and blaming her for Kana's arrest" (4/11/13, p. 5).

This comment shows that despite the public outcry in response to the rape of Anene, that not everybody rallied to demand justice for her. Anene's foster mother, in her statement showed the position that the community placed her in. The inference is that if Anene had been alive, it would have been her who was accused and taunted, however, since she is no longer alive, her living family bore the brunt instead. This quote and the resulting actions bring to the fore that the victim, as she is positioned as an adult and not a child, is somehow to be apportioned some blame for the incident. The accused's aunt goes as far as to comment that there are aspects of the story that will never be told. This commentary creates a space for the victim's account of assault to be discredited. The comment by Anene's foster mother highlights that the community did not collectively gather in support of her daughter, this despite the initial national outcry and the launch of a campaign. Instead there was division in the community and that she was on the receiving end of the negative repercussions thereof. There is no evidence of the collective single identity used as a mobilising point as was discussed by Ndlovu (2012). There is no group sense of violation or a united sense of a need for justice.

This lack of cohesive revolt and demand for justice and the space created for blame casting echoes in the work of Korn and Efrat (2004). The girls in the incidents which the authors explored were positioned in a manner that there was a focus on their prior sexual experiences. This was evident in the articles printed about Anene Booysen as well. Implied in this form of reporting is that if a woman has prior sexual experience or has previously consented to have sex with the perpetrator, that she may be fabricating the story of rape. Within this tangle is

the notion of unspoken policing of the body of a woman. This is done through two means, the first by making reference to prior sexual activities, effectively equating prior consent to future consent and in this manner creating a space to doubt an accusation of rape. The second is through rape myths and the inferences that are made through the use of these myths. This discussion could explain why it is that there was a not a collective rally seeking justice for Anene, as was evident in the case of Baby Tshepang. Anene was absolved of her position of child and victim and instead cast as a vamp who could be apportioned some blame for her rape.

5.7.4 Theme 4: Location

There were a total of fourteen articles in which the location in which Anene lived and was raped were mentioned. For the purpose of this discussion, three article quotes will be used. They are as follows:

> "The teenager from Bredasdorp in the Western Cape was gang-raped, mutilated and left for dead" (11/02/13, p. 4).
>
> "Anene was raped and murdered after visiting a nightclub on February 1" (22/04/13, p. 2)
>
> The last extract is from an article listing rape incidents and the location in which they occurred: "Anene Booysen, 17, is raped, mutilated and dumped in a building site in Bredasdorp … The body of 16-year-old girl Micaela Manneson is discovered by members of the Eldorado Park community … The body of nine-year-old Banele Khumalo is found buried in a shallow grave at a dumping site in Phumula Extension 21" (7/03/13, p. 4).

The first comment reminds the reader that rape occurs in areas where poverty levels are high. It also reminds the reader of the extremely brutal nature of the attack that Anene suffered.

The second quote adds another element to the discussion around the rape of Anene. This can be linked to the rape myth that "women deserve rape" (Benedict, 1992, p. 16). Framed within this myth is the assumption that "women bring on rape by behaving carelessly prior to the crime – it was not the rapist who 'caused' the rape, it was the woman who failed to prevent herself enticing him" (Benedict, 1992, p. 16). This opens the gap for a discussion that if

Anene had been at home, rather than in a nightclub, she would not have been raped and murdered. It also reminds the reader of what sometimes occurs in these areas, while omitting that teenagers in white, middle class suburbs are also to be found in nightclubs and engaging in underage drinking.

The final comment highlights that the attack on Anene was not an isolated incident, it occurs in other communities with similar socio-economic dynamics to the one in which Anene lived. The implication again is that rape occurs in areas that do not mirror those of the readership. Thus reinforcing ideas about these communities and further entrenching the 'us' and 'them' divide.

The larger implication of these comments and others like them is to remind the reader of the places in which these incidents occur. Implied, yet not overtly stated, is the racial division between the reader and the victims of whom they read. It effectively positions the victims who are predominantly black or coloured people as 'other' and infers that sexual violence is their burden to bear and that it is something that does not occur within white suburbia.

5.7.5 Theme 5: Education and campaigns

The theme of education and the site of the campaign launches which took place in response to the rape of Anene allude to the fact that she was a child and that children in society are vulnerable and need to be protected. There were fifteen articles in which campaigns were discussed and five in which education was discussed. These themes are discussed together as in many cases they were interlinked. Schools were the site of the initial campaign titled Stop Rape was launched.

The first comment observes that public outcry has found a place in which to come to fruition. The article states:

> "The collective rage of the country has to be turned into tangible action… We want to mobilise across the school footprint and launch the pledge where the Bill of Responsibilities is adopted by all learners" (23/02/13, p. 10).

While it is not overtly stated that Anene was still of school going age and that the pupils who took the pledge were her contemporaries, by framing Anene in this manner, she occupies the position of a child, albeit briefly. It is inferred that if the young people in the country are

made to take responsibility for their conduct, that immoral activity could be curbed. The pledge campaign initiated that students take a pledge in which they pledged "Not to rape, commit any form of sexual harassment, abuse or violence" (LeadSA & Department of Education, 2013). The inference in this campaign is contradictory to the rape myth that men who rape do so because of a lust that they are not able to control (Benedict, 1992).

The myth that a victim is sullied is not expressed overtly but initiating a campaign in the school environment implies that children are innocent and that they are spoiled and damaged by the act of rape; rather than being seen as sullied in the judgemental notion of the word. This myth, however, was not present in the articles in which the case in court and other aspects pertaining to the rape of Anene that were printed.

This concept of education and the above discussion is captured in the comment:

> "Schools across the country have been encouraged to adopt a pledge at 8am on Friday, in an attempt to heighten awareness of the high levels of rape and to educate children on the dangers and recourse" (27/02/13, p. 2).

In the broader context these statements open the discussion that education is a possible starting point to address the scourge of rape that plagues society at present, the question which needs to be posed is what form of education and with what aims in mind?

Annie Lennox, an individual who has social influence and status, added her voice to the campaign initiative. Lennox commented that the campaign which she launched in response to the rape of Anene "urges South Africans to fight fatigue and disillusionment, and help anti-rape and gender advocacy organisations – many of which are struggling to stay afloat due to lack of funding" (28/02/13, p. 3). Lennox's comment points to different aspects of the fight against gender based violence that need to be considered. She points out that South Africa as a unified nation needs to address these issues. A fragmented, half-hearted act attempt will not suffice. Lennox elaborates "We need to create a tipping point of collective awareness and action" (28/02/13, p. 3). This creates a place for a discussion to occur, asking, at what point will the nation be able to put aside its divisions and together take action against rape; rather than merely be horrified about it and then to place a distance between the community in which it took place and the haven in which the reader of an article may exist.

5.8 The Sowetan –Anene Booysen

There were six articles which were printed in response to the rape of Anene Booysen, of these none made a front page story and three were opinion pieces.

5.8.1 Theme 1: Anene - as a hook for a broader discussion

Unlike in The Star, where there were numerous articles which documented the details of the injuries which Anene sustained, three articles in The Sowetan made brief mention of the details. The focus was rather on Anene as a theme around which other related topics were addressed. All six articles were based around this theme. The first quote opens the discussion up by pondering why it is that there is no collective action as was seen in India:

> "While India, raged South Africa's response to Anene's was shock. Anene was not the first, nor was she the last, to be raped. If India could stand up for its own, the question is why should South Africa remain unmoved?" (21/03/13, p. 12).

This was a point which was raised in The Star as well. The inferences in this quote are that the nation is still divided and that there is no unified raging response as was witnessed in India. Also implied in the comment is that rape is not an uncommon occurrence, the same implications which were at play in the discussions around Baby Tshepang are underlying in this conversation. This implies that age is not a factor in the conceptualisation and acceptance of this idea, that rape is the burden of the black female.

The school's pledge was also a theme which was discussed - highlighted is the comment made by Basic Education minister Angie Motshekga in which she stated that "the culture of violence in schools must end. The bullies of today become the abusers of tomorrow" (1/03/13, p. 5). Within this statement is the suggestion that unless boys in schools are taught how to conduct themselves in public and in relation to girls and women they will potentially grow up to rape them. This is a theme which was present in articles in The Star around this same topic. Implicit is the concept that education is a key element to curbing the scourge of rape, if self-control is taught. It is the manner in which 'lust' is constructed, within the frame of a rape myth, that gives it a space to take root as an explanation for an incident of rape.

5.8.2 Theme 2: Justice System and government response

There were three articles in which the justice system and the government responses to the rape of Anene Booysen were addressed. As with the case of Baby Tshepang there was an expression which inferred a hesitancy to place faith in the justice system. The first comment was in response to discussions around sexual offences courts and the number that are operational in the country, "Do we have 10 operational sexual offences courts or do we have 40? Is government committed to ridding the country of this scourge of rape serious or just talk?" (25/04/13, p. 16).

Later in the same article the comment is made which challenges the country and those who have the power to enforce the law commenting "Talking about ridding South Africa of its ugly reputation as the capital of rape means nothing if it is not backed up by action and resources to root it out" (25/04/13, p. 16).

Again the inference is that there needs to be concrete action, not just lip-service in response to gender-based violence.

All of these comments allude to the idea that acts of rape are not an uncommon aspect of the larger population of the readership of The Sowetan and that there is a sense that this idea has been internalised and become an accepted 'norm' within society. The brutality of the rape of Anene has brought the discussion to the fore but rapes which are not as brutal as this particular one do not get mentioned in the media nor do they seem to elicit a public response.

5.8.3 Theme 3: Rape myths

There were five articles in which rape myths were a major theme. The reason that it is important to discuss these is because rape myths infer various ideas about rape and the parties involved in the act. The first comment, "It would, however, be a mistake to negate the impact of rape that does not lead to death" (8/05/13, p. 19). Inferred in this statement is that unless the rape is extremely violent, in many cases resulting in death, there is room for doubt as to whether the act was actually committed and whether blame can be apportion to either or neither party.

This next quote links to the earlier discussion about education, and the inference it will act as a preventative for young men, committing acts of rape. The comment made stated "We must

educate the young (people) about the seriousness of rape and the consequences" (13/03/13, p. 9).

The last quote is taken from an article which was written in a poetic manner one which inferred throughout and specifically, only men who are not of sound mind rape women. The comment is as follows "Rape is a measure of the deranged power quenching macabre thirst from the blood of the defenceless" (5/11/13, p. 13). This quote positions men who rape as insane and women who are raped as defenceless. It indicates clear gendered and power based dynamics. These dynamics which are encapsulated in the words of the above comment echo the dynamics found in the works of Benedict (1992) and Marshall (1996). The work of Benedict (1992) explains the construction of the insane, unknown rapist through the rape myth that positions rapists in this manner. The use of the word defenceless is relation to the victim conjures the image the colonial white woman. Marshall (1996) explains that the white woman was constructed along the imagery of passivity, beauty and virginity. Thus it is possible to see the inferred gendered power dynamics that are constructed in the article.

5.9 Comparative discussion

As in the comparative discussion of the articles in The Star and The Sowetan about Baby Tshepang, it is evident that there are similar sentiments echoed in the articles printed about Anene Booysen. The Star made frequent reference to both the details of the assault and the location in which it took place, both themes absent in The Sowetan. It is possible to state that the same elements are at play in the use of these themes. It is important to note the time frame between the two incidents is twelve years, yet the same reporting techniques are applied. This indicates that the same ideologies are inferred across this time span.

In The Star the emphasis was on the parliamentary discussion, there was a hint that there are deeper issues relating to gender based violence but that the burden to enact change on this matter still lies in the hands of the gender activists, rather than in those of the general public. This also alludes to the idea that Anene is not seen as part of the readerships' community. She still occupies the position of the Other.

The Sowetan echoed similar sentiments to those that were present in the discussions at the time of the rape of Baby Tshepang. This indicates that despite an acknowledgement of these

pressing issues, little has actually shifted in the discussion. The victim has changed, but the points of contention remain.

In both newspapers education was a theme and was seen as a starting point for the launch of a campaign which aimed to raise awareness about and potentially curb gender based violence. However, what still remains to be asked is what form of education would be effective and how could this be implemented?

The theme of the justice system raised similar issues in both newspapers to the ones that were raised in relation to the rape of Baby Tshepang. Again this highlights a lack of shift in the discussion and ideologies within the twelve year period that these two incidents occurred.

5.10 Comparative conclusion

Evident in each of the comparative discussions is that there are themes that emerge in each incident. These common themes show that there are underlying assumptions that are echoed through each incident. These echoed themes further entrench divisions and perpetuate existing ideas within the readership of the different newspapers.

The Star continuously used of the theme of location to entrench the racialised lens through which the stories came to be considered. It is this lens that subsequently informs the associated aspects of class, gender and sexuality.

The Sowetan, did not use this theme. It did however use the story which was published as a stepping stone to explore related issues. These issues reflected deeper concerns within the community of both the readership and that in which the incident occurred.

Both of the newspapers grappled with the justice system as a dominant theme. The difference however was in the expectations of this system and the inferences that these expectations alluded to.

It is thus evident that despite newspapers reporting about the same incident, the manner in which the incident is framed creates different spaces for different discussions to occur. It also creates the space for the formation of different social constructs and the implications that these have.

Chapter 6.

6 Conclusion

"Modernity is symbolised these days by the white woman's emancipation, signifying the white man's progressiveness via the contrast of the black man's patriarchal attitude towards the victimised black woman" (Schumann, 2007, p. 121). Startling words, but words that reflect society. In this article, Schumann (2007) seeks to explain that by erasing the understanding and contextual use of terminology, histories and meaning are forgotten and the implications of words used in present conversations are not fully understood in historical context.

Jewkes and Wood (2001) interviewed teenage girls in a township on the outskirts of Cape Town about gender dynamics. The comments made by the girls reflected the society which Schumann (2007) commented on. The girls were asked about the power dynamics in their relationships and answered stating that "as a woman you have no rights, you must keep quiet and do as the man wants" (Jewkes & Wood, 2001, p. 136). It is evident from their comment that they are aware that the gendered power dynamics are uneven. This comment, however, intimates that the girls in this township have internalised the ideology of male dominance and that the consequences of it are their lot to bear.

The themes which emerged as dominant in this research project reflect elements of the comments by both Schumann (2007) and Jewkes and Wood (2001).

In the introduction, the story of the raped Indian medical student and the outrage of the Indian nation, was contrasted to the response of South Africa as a nation to the rape of Anene Booysen. ENCA's Checkpoint, broadcast a documentary, *Two worlds, One fight*, (Mabuse, 2014). In this documentary, Nic Dawes, a former South African newspaper editor, now based in India and the Chief Content Editor of the Hindustan Times, was interviewed and asked about the manner in which South African newspapers report on rape and sexual violence and how Indian newspapers report on rape and sexual violence. He made the following observation about the reporting methods in Indian newspapers after the 2012 rape which spurred a nation to action. Dawes said "Reporting on rape has been drawn into the heart of reporting around civic issues generally" (Dawes, 2014). He explained that this is an element that he feels is absent in South African newspapers; a story of a raped woman is framed as a crime statistic, not as a civic story or issue (Dawes, 2014).

It is from this point of discussion that the conclusion to this research project will be taken. The observation of Dawes (2014) is evident in the manner that The Star reports on stories of rape, particularly the rape of a heterosexual woman. This is evident in the manner that Anene Booysen was reported about. Her story was presented in detail. The brutality of the assault which resulted in her death was made graphically known. As contradictory aspects arose in relation to her injuries, the space opened up for a discussion of doubt, after the initial horror and public outcry, that she may have been merely another raped woman, not one who was violently assaulted, leaving room to question whether she was actually raped in an as violent manner as initially presented? On the broader thematic discussion, parliament convened a special sitting, this in response to the rape of Anene. This creates the space for the question to be asked, if Anene had not been attacked in such a savage manner, would parliament have convened to discuss the issue of gender based violence? It also begs for the question to be asked, how much worse does it have to get before there is concrete action taken at a parliamentary level? It is necessary to move beyond the point of discussion and reach the point of action, as was seen in India.

A campaign which was launched in schools after the rape and murder of Anene, opened a space for a discussion that a campaign of this nature is potentially a good starting point, as it brings awareness to students about issues of gender based violence and awareness is a key element in the education process. More, however, needs to be done and there is a need for a follow-up initiative. In 2015, it would be interesting to measure the impact of this schools based campaign. Further the question can be asked, was launching a campaign at the level of teenagers a means of bridging the unspoken racial divide on sexual violence? Was this an inter-class and multi-racial initiative?

The Sowetan by contrast, while not reporting on the rape of Anene in a crime story manner, rather used this story as an entry point to discussions about broader related matters within the society of the wider collective of the readership. Thus it would appear that The Sowetan may be leaning more towards a civic story reporting style. It is at this point that the question to be asked is, how much longer will it take for the racial divide to be crossed on issues of gender based violence?

If the reporting style was to be made more civic, as it is in India, perhaps the inferred racial divisive reminders of ‘us’ and ‘them’ would begin to change.

A common theme, which emerged in both The Star and The Sowetan in the articles about Eudy Simelane, was that of sexual orientation. Both newspapers focused on the fact that campaigns were taken up by gender activists; it was not the general public who were seeking justice on behalf of the victim. The point of departure, however, on this topic was the discussion around hate crimes and corrective rape. In The Star, it was evident that hate crimes and corrective rape are the burden of the black lesbian. The definition of hate corrective rape even goes as far as to state that it "is a brutal act of violence in which African women and teenagers who are, or are at least assumed to be, lesbian are raped to 'cure' them of their homosexuality" (Wesley, 2009, p. 76). This definition creates the space for the understanding and deeper entrenchment of the idea of the rapable black body, with sexual orientation becoming another point of intersectionality on this body. The silence around the white lesbian experience is deafening. Opening the space for the question, is whiteness a means of exception from this form of violent assault or is it that the violence is hidden from public discussion. It is the point around which snide comments and crude innuendoes are uttered in relation to the sexual orientation of a woman.

In contrast, hate crimes are reported in The Sowetan as a form of assault that is meted out to the black lesbian; the woman who does not conform to the heteronormative of society. It was not overtly stated, but rather inferred that this may be the consequence of non-conformity. In contrast to this, however, were the articles that discussed the family from which Eudy came. In this article, the reader was brought to awareness that, the family from which Eudy came and her community involvement, may actually mirror their own. In this manner, the aspect of commonality was brought to the fore.

From the above discussion, it is evident that the common element is sexual orientation, it is the manner that this is dealt with that differs. It is evident that, despite sexual orientation being enshrined in the constitution of the country, in reality, it is a point of contention and that there are people who express their personal views about it in a manner that violates the rights of the individual.

The rape of Baby Tshepang, as reported in The Star, echoed themes that appeared in the articles about the rape and murder of Anene Booysen. It was the campaigns that were launched and documented in The Star that gave a glimpse into the crossover between the unspoken racial division of the reader and the story subject. However, a distance between

‘us’ and ‘them’ was maintained through the mention of location, an aspect discussed in detail in the data analysis.

The Sowetan, reported the story of Baby Tshepang in a manner that echoed themes which were evident in the story of Anene.

It is important to note that, although Baby Tshepang was raped in 2001 and Anene in 2013, a time period difference of twelve years, the style of reporting and the themes that emerged, however, remained largely the same. It is thus possible to state that the manner in which a newspaper prints an article forms part of the track upon which ideas about class, race, gender and sexuality are recycled through society and perpetuated from one generation to the next. This echoes the words of Dawes (2014) discussing the manner in which South African newspapers report on stories of sexual violence “it simply doesn’t dig deep enough when reporting on sexual violence”. This sense of digging deep is evident in the discussion of the caste system in India in relation to raped women. A place was created for a discussion about the injustices of this system and the implications that this can have for these women emerged.

From the above discussion it is evident that each of the rape victims whose story formed basis of this research report was viewed through a racialised lens. At the basis of each discussion the race of the victim is the aspect that defines them foremost. From this point the intersectionalities of femininity, masculinity and sexuality take shape.

The constructs of these intersectional aspects which were explored in the theoretical framework became evident in the analysis. The inferences of these constructs gave rise to the perpetuation of associated ideologies. The construction of black and white femininity and the associated sexuality echoed in the analysis. The black woman remains positioned as the one who bears the brunt of sexual assault. The newspapers used frames which created a space for this position to be maintained.

It is necessary to return the question which was originally posed: How is the way in which rape is reported in two Gauteng daily newspapers indicative of underlying social assumptions about broader diversity issues in South Africa? Using the definition of a diversity issue as it was presented by Velásquez (2006), it is evident that the diversity issues of race, class, gender and sexuality which were listed to be considered within the analytic process, were made evident in the manner in which the different newspapers reported the stories of the three rape victims.

The potential for a newspaper to unearth underlying concerns that the readership may have, which was explored in the work of Protess *et al* (1985) was evident in The Sowetan. It was particularly evident in the themes where the rape victim's story was not told, but rather used as a hook into a broader discussion. The construction of meaning in relation to how a story is framed was explored by Scheufele (1999). The author explained how the manner in which a story is presented and the discourse used forms the base upon which an individual is able to construct meaning with regard to what they have read. The implications of framing a story in a specific manner were evident throughout the analytic process. Each newspaper used a specific format and through this format a meaning was constructed and conveyed to the reading audience. An example of this is the use of the theme of location in The Star. The constant referral to the location of the incident constructs and reinforces the idea to the reader that in places like the one in the article, women are raped. From this construction broader diversity issues are able to take root. Thus it is evident that framing has a lasting impact on the reading audience. It creates the space for the formation of a specific set of ideas.

In conclusion to this project, it is evident that the social issues that underlie the newspaper stories in South Africa reflect that, beneath the veneer of the rainbow nation and the colourful imagery which is associated with it, lies a fractured society which still has many challenges to meet before there is a collective uprising in response to the violation of the women of the nation, as was seen in India.

Reference list

An, S-K., & Gower, K. (2009). How do the news media frame crises? A content analysis of crisis news coverage. In *Public Relations Review, 35, 107-112.*

Awan, Z. (2014). *India gang-rape puts caste system under spotlight* Retrieved June 9, 2014 from http://www.channelnewsasia.com/news/asiapacific/india-gang-rape-puts/1140378.html

Bell, A. (1991). *The Language of News Media.* Oxford UK & Cambridge MA: Blackwell.

Benedict, H. (1992). *Virgin or Vamp: How the press covers sex crimes*. New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bourke, J.(2007). *Rape: A history from 1860 to the present day*. London: Virago.

Bresnahan, S. Udas, S. & Ramgopal, R. (2013). 'Nirbhaya,' victim of India gang rape fought for justice. In *CNN World's Untold Stories*. Retrieved September 8, 2014 from http://edition.cnn.com/2013/12/04/world/asia/nirbhaya-india-rape/.

Burr, V. (2003). *Social Constructionism.* 2nd Edition. East Sussex: Routledge.

Cohn, E.S, Dupruis, E,C & Brown, T.M (2009). In the Eye of the Beholder: Do Behaviour and Character Affect Victim and Perpetrator Responsibility for Acquaintance Rape. *Journal of Applied Psychology. 39 (7*), 1513-1535.

Davis, R. (2013). Lost in Oscar Pistorius frenzy, the horrific violence against women and children continues. *The Daily Maverick*. Retrieved June 30, 2014 from http://www.ru.ac.za/perspective/perspectivearticles/lostinoscarpistoriusfrenzythehorrificviolenceaginstwomenandchildren.html

Dosekun, S. (2013). 'Rape is a huge crisis in this country': Discursive constructions of the rape crisis in South Africa. *Feminism and Psychology*, 23, 517- 535.

Eisenberg, A. (2013). Indian citizens protest gang rape, gain increased punishment for sexual assault crimes, 2012-2013. In *On Global Non-violent Action Database* Retrieved May 21, 2014 from http://nvdatabase.swarthmore.edu/content/indian-citizens-protest-gang-rape-gain-increased-punishment-sexual-assault-crimes-2012-2013

Farhoud, N. (2013) Indian gang-rape: Victim Jyoti Singh named her attackers and described ordeal on deathbed. In *Mirror*. Retrieved August 14, 2014 from http://www.mirror.co.uk/news/uk-news/indian-gang-rape-victim-jyoti-singh-1531932

Fontanella-Khan, A. (2014 June 8). Ignoring caste, the unspoken core of India's rape crisis. *Sunday Times*.

Franuik, R., Seefelt, J.L., & Vandello, J.A. (2008).
Prevalence of Rape Myths in Headlines and their effects of attitudes toward rape. *Sex Roles, 58*, 790-801.

Guest, G., MacQueen, K. & Namey, E. (2012). *Applied Thematic Analysis* (ch1 3 -20). Los Angeles: Sage Publications.

Gunkel, H. (2011). *The cultural politics of female sexuality in South Africa* New York: Routledge.

Hanse, A., Cottle, S., Negrine, R. & Newbold, C. (1998) *Mass Communication Research Methods* New York: New York University Press.

Hirsh, S. (1994). Interpreting Media Representations of a "Night of Madness": Law and Culture in the Construction of Rape Identities. *Law and Social Enquiry*, (19), 4, 1023 – 1056.

Johnson, A.G. (2001). Privilege, Power, and Difference. Chapters: 3(pp.15-41) & 8 (96-116). Boston: McGraw-Hill.

Korn, A. & Efat, S. (2004). The Coverage of Rape in Israeli Popular Press. *Violence Against Women, 10,* 1056- 1074.

Loughnan, S., Haslam, N., Murnane, T., Vaes, J., Reynolds, C. & Suitner, C. (2010). Objectification leads to depersonalization: The denial of mind and moral concern to objectified others. *European Journal of Social Psychology,* (40), 709–717.

Marshall, A. (1996) From sexual denigration to self-respect: resisting images of Black female sexuality in Reconstructing womanhood, reconstructing feminism. In D. Jarrett-Macauley (ed) *Reconstructing womanhood, reconstructing feminism: writings on black women* (pp. 5-36). London: Routledge

Martin, A., Kelly, A., Turquet, L., & Ross, S. (2009). Hate Crimes: The rise of 'corrective' rape in South Africa. *ActionAid: Hamlyn House: London*

McClintock, A. (1995). *Imperial leather: race, gender, and sexuality in the colonial contest*. New York : Routledge

Moffett, H. (2006). 'These women, they force us to rape them': Rape as a narrative of Social Control in post-apartheid South Africa. In *Journal of Southern African Studies 32,1, March 2006.*

Morgan, R. & Wieringa, S. (2005). *Tommy Boys, Lesbian Men and Ancestral Wives: Female same-sex practices in Africa.* Johannesburg: Jacana Media

Naidu-Hoffmeester, R. & Kamal, R (2014). *South Africa: rape capital of the world*. Retrieved April 12, 2014 from http://www.unisa.ac.za/news/index.php/2013/02/south-africa-the-worlds-rape-capital

Naidoo, K. (2013). Rape in South Africa – A call to action. In *South African Medical Journal 103,* 4, 210-211

Narsee, A. (2014). *SA loses in a tale of two rapes.* In *TimesLive*. Retrieved July 25, 2014 from

http://www.timeslive.co.za/thetimes/2014/07/04/sa-loses-in-a-tale-of-two-rapes.

Ndlovu, S. (2012). "I am more than just Black": Contesting Multiplicity through Conferring and Asserting Singularity in Narratives of Blackness, in Josselson, R. & Harway, M. (eds) *Contesting Multiple Identities: Race, Gender, Culture, Nationality, and Roles*. Oxford University Press.

Nel, F. (1994). *Writing for the Media*. Durban: Southern Book Publishers.

Nel. JA & Judge, M (2008). Exploring homophobic victimisation in Gauteng, South Africa: Issues, impacts and responses. *Acta Criminoligica*, 21 (3), 19 -36.

Niehaus, I. (2009). Renegotiating Masculinity in the Lowveld: Narratives of Male – Male sex in Compounds, Prisons and at Home. In M. Steyn & M. van Zyl (Eds) *The Prize and the Price: Shaping sexualities in South Africa* .(pp. 85-111). Cape Town: HSRC Press.

O'Shaughnessy, M. & Stadler, J. (2005). *Media and society: An introduction, third edition.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Patton, T.O & Snyder-Yuly (2007). Any Four Black Men Will Do: Rape, Race and the Ultimate Scapegoat. *Journal of Black Studies*, 37, 858 – 895.

Phillips, L.J. & Jorgensen, M. (2002). *Discourse Analysis as Theory and Method*. London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: SAGE Publications.

Posel, D. (2005a). Sex, death and the state of the nation: Reflections on the Politicisation of Sexuality in Post-Apartheid South Africa. *Journal of the International African Institute*, 75, (2), 125-153.

Posel, D. (2005b). The scandal of manhood: 'Baby Rape' and the politicisation of sexual violence in post-apartheid South Africa. *Culture, Health and Sexuality*, 7 (3), 239-252.

POWA (People Opposed to Woman Abuse) Retrieved July 6, 2014 from www.powa.co.za

Protess, D.L, Leff, D.R, Brooks, S.C & Gordon, M.T (1985). Uncovering Rape: The Watchdog Press and the Limits of Agenda Setting. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 49, 19-37.

Richter, L. (2003). Baby rape in South Africa. *Child Abuse Review*, 12, 392-400.

Readership of The Sowetan: Retrieved March 26, 2014 from www.sowetanlive.co.za

Readership of The Star: Retrieved March 26, 2014 from http://www.iol.co.za/the-star/readership-1.913275

Scheufele, D.A. (1999). Framing as a Theory of Media Effects. In *Journal of Communication (Winter), 103 – 120.*

Schumann, A. (2007). Exoticising the Erotic: White of White via the Black Body. Collecting Artefacts within German Dominant Culture. *Blackness and Sexualities.* Wright, Michelle M., and Antje Schuhmann (Eds). Hamburg, Berlin, Munster, London:LIT Verlag 2007

Stop Rape Campaign Department of Basic Education, Republic of South Africa Retrieved October 29, 2014 from http://www.education.gov.za/Home/StopRapeCampaign/tabid/849/Default.aspx

Terre Blanche, M., Durheim, K., & Painter, D. (2006). *Research in Practice: Applied method for the Social Sciences.* Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

The Star: About Us Retrieved February 11, 2015 from www.iol.co.za/thestar

The Star: Ownership Retrieved February 11, 2015 from www.iol.co.za/newspaper

The Sowetan: Ownership Retrieved February 11, 2015 from www.timesmedia.co.za

The Sexual Offences and Related Matters Act 32 of 2007 Retrieved March 28, 2014 from www.justice.gov.za/legislation/acts/2007-032.pdf accessed 26/03/14

UNICEF, Childhood defined: http://www.unicef.org/sowc05/english/childhooddefined.html Accessed: 3/09/2014

Velásquez, M (2006) *Definition of a Diversity Issue – What You Don't Know You Don't Know.* Retrieved June 10, 2014, from http://www.workforcediversitynetwork.com/docs/article_definitionofadiversity%20issue shrm.pdf

Vigarello, G. (2001). *A history of rape: sexual violence in France from the 16th to the 20th century* (translated by Jean Birrell)**.** Cambridge: Polity Press.

Wesley, T. (2009). Classifying 'Corrective' Rape as Hate Crime: A Call for Justice. In *BUWA! A Journal on African Women's Experiences* pp. 76-80.

Whitehead, S. & Barrett, F. (eds) (2001). *The Masculinities Reader*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Worthington, N. (2013). Explaining Gang Rape in a "Rough Town": Diverse Voices in Gender Violence News Online. *Communication, Culture & Critique,* 6, 103-120.

Thesis cited:

Stephanie M. Bonnes *Gender and racial stereotyping in rape coverage: an analysis of rape coverage in Grocott's Mail (*2010, Rhodes University*)*

Nicolene C. McLean *"Rape and Cable theft on the increase": Interrogating Grocott's Mail coverage of rape through participatory action research (Rhodes University, 2010).*

Alison Stent *Reading The Sowetan's response to the Jacob Zuma rape trial: A critical discourse analysis (Rhodes University, 2007)*

All accessed from Rhodes University database.

Newspaper articles used in data analysis:

The Star – Baby Tshepang

Altenroxel, L. (2001, December 3). How my five month old was raped. The Star, p. 1.

Brown, B. (2002, January 23). Tshepang debacle raises questions for SAPS. The Star, p. 9.

Cronje, A. (2001, November 26). All six child rapists will have the same attorney. The Star, p. 2.

Cronje, A. (2002, January 18). Crowd welcomes release of five. The Star, p. 1.

Cronje, A. (2002, January 18). Society fails Baby Tshepang yet again. The Star, p. 1.

Cronje, A. & Oliphant, L. (2002, January 19). Cops query baby-rape case. The Star, p. 1.

Cronje, A. & Tukakhomo, V. (2001, November 21). Spate of rapes shocks N. Cape. The Star, p. 2.

Gifford, G. (2001, November 8) Mom fighting abuse strikes a chord. The Star, p. 1.

Gifford, G. (2001, November 26). World joins in email bid for action on child abuse. The Star, p. 2.

Gifford, G. & Warby, V. (2002, March 8). Baby Tshepang may get justice now. The Star, p. 11.

Kalideen, N. (2001, December 4). Rape of 5mth old baby: mother held. The Star, p. 1.

Kaudna, L. (spokesman for Deputy President) (2001, November 23). Roots of abuse have context. The Star, p. 13.

Khechane, D. (2002, March 12). Baby Tshepang suspect is mother's ex-lover. The Star, p. 2.

Khechane, D. & Warby, V. (2002, January 17). Who raped Baby Tshepang? The Star, p. 1.

Mhlanga, E. (2002, January 22). Freed suspect seeks legal recourse. The Star, p. 3.

Merten, M. (2001, December 3). Women and children need real action. The Star, p. 14.

Mkhwanazi, S., Cronje, A. & Gifford, G. (2001, November 12). Six accused of raping baby face big protest. The Star, p. 3.

Ngesi, V. (2002, July 24). 'I watched my boyfriend rape Baby Tshepang'. The Star, p. 2.

Ngesi, V. (2002, July 25). Baby Tshepang's mom tells of leaving her alone. The Star, p. 2.

Ngesi, V. (2002, July 27). Baby Tshepang's rapist sent to jail for life. The Star, p. 1.

Oliphant, L. (2001, November 17). What all of us can do to fight abuse. The Star, p. 8.

Rantao, J. (2001, November 9). What has become of us? The Star, p. 14.

SAPA. (2001, November 7). Girl slowly recovering from gang-rape ordeal. The Star, p. 1.

Warby, V. (2001, November 9). Tshepang was raped here. The Star, p. 1.

Warby, V. (2001, November 21). Talk is cheap, maybe it's time for plan B – action. The Star, p. 14.

Warby, V. (2001, November 22). Young victims can talk to her. The Star, p. 19.

Warby, V. (2001, December 3). Huge reaction to rage over rape of Tshepang. The Star, p. 14.

Warby, V. (2002, January 21). Tshepang will never go home again. The Star, p. 2.

Warby, V. & Cronje, A. (2001, November 11). Baby Tshepang: another lawyer recuses himself. The Star, p. 3.

Unknown author. (2001, November 9). Nation responds as fund gets going. The Star, p. 1.

Unknown author. (2001, November 11). Baby rapes – heat on politicians. The Star, p. 1.

Unknown author. (2001, November 15). Children removed from Baby Tshepang house. The Star, p. 3.

Unknown author. (2002, January 31). SAPS not to blame for Baby Tshepang debacle. The Star, p. 11.

The Sowetan – Baby Tshepang:

Mazibuko, L. (2002, January 29). Children have the right to protection. The Sowetan, p. 22.

Motjuwadi, H. (2002, January 20). Column – My World. The Sowetan, p. 20.

Zuma, J. (2001, November 18). SA must rekindle the notion that 'any child is my own child'. The Sowetan, p. 22.

Author unknown. (2001, November 18). Baby Tshepang: how did is go so wrong? The Sowetan, p. 16.

Author unknown. (2001, December 11). Stone's throw to anarchy. The Sowetan, p. 8.

The Star – Eudy Simelane:

Du Preez, M. (2009, August 27). Transformin gCaster's victory into tragedy. The Star, p. 18.

Nkosi, M. (2008, July 8). Protest over lesbian killing. The Star, p. 2.

Posthumus, N. (2008, May 14). Banyana murder case bail denied. The Star, p. 2.

Posthumus, N. (2008, June 4). Simelane accused drop bail bids. The Star, p. 2.

Seale, L. (2008, May 6). I lost a partner…I have lost everything. The Star, p. 5.

Seale, L. (2009, September 9). No mercy for killer of lesbian footballer. The Star, p. 5.

Unknown author. (2008, May 9). No room for this. The Star, p. 14.

Unknown author. (2009, September 23). Eudy Simelane's killer gets life. The Star, p. 2.

Unknown author. (2009, September 26). Lesbian who was gang-raped, had a right to life. The Star, p. 7.

The Sowetan – Eudy Simelane:

Fraser, B. (2008, May 14). Eudy's dream denied. The Sowetan, p. 9.

Fuphe, D. (2008, May 6). Triple 7 members bay for blood for Simelane 'killers'. The Sowetan, p. 5.

Fuphe, D. (2008, June 4). Lesbian rape accused abandon bail application. The Sowetan, p. 9.

Fuphe, D. (2008, September 1). Shut up, court is told. The Sowetan, p. 8.

Pongoma, L. (2009, July 31). Court told how trio robbed Banyana star. The Sowetan, p. 6.

The Star – Anene Booysen:

Bezuidenhout, N. (2013, May 23). I'm glad Davids is free again – Anene's gran. The Star, p. 4.

Bezuidenhout, N. (2013, July 10). State moves Anene's murder trial to Swellendam Circuit Ciurt, to start October. The Star, p. 5.

Brown, D. (2013, August 17). Respect women and the violence will end. The Star, p. 14.

Cowan, L. (2013, February 28). False beliefs justify sexual aggression. The Star, p. 34.

Chipangura, C. (2013, June 25). African women the worst off – report. The Star, p. 6.

Dolley, C. (2013, May 29). Anene's killing: cops mum on more arrests. The Star, p. 2.

Du, S. (2013, April 16). Should rapists b rehabilitated? The Star, p. 13.

Flanagan, L. (2013, February 26). Mokonyane calls on men to join fight against violence. The Star, p. 2.

Gould, C. (2013, February 21). We can't 'fight' violence. The Star, p. 15.

Hartshorne, S. (2013, February 23). Rape awareness drives calls for pupils' pledge. The Star, p. 10.

Hartshorne, S. (2013, June 8). Over 500 Star rape survivor handbags helping to empoer victims. The Star, p. 10.

Heard, J. (2013, February 28). Stop gender violence, says Lennox. The Star, p. 3.

Ho-Chung, D. (2013, November 30). Awareness is more than wearing a ribbon. The Star, p. 16.

Jones, M. (2013, June 4). Anene's confessed rapist is not telling all – State. The Star, p. 2.

Lwandle, S. (2013, February 19). Anene: spotlight on pub. The Star, p. 5.

Makheta, T. (2013, March 28). Teen suspects freed after gilr brutally raped and murdered. The Star, p. 2.

Mapenzauswa, S. (2013, February 11). Why are we still silent? The Star, p. 15.

Margele, B. (2013, October 8). Anene accused confessed. The Star, p. 5.

Margele, B. (2013, October 9). Witness in Anene case lied to police in first statement. The Star, p. 6.

Margele, B. (2013, October 11). Murder accused admitted violent attack on teen. The Star, p. 2.

Margele, B. (2013, October 15). Foster mom tells of Anene's fateful night. The Star, p. 6.

Margele, B. (2013, October 16). Doctor tells of Anene's injuries. The Star, p. 2.

Margele, B. (2013, October 17). Mutilating genital injury killed Anene. The Star, p. 6.

Margele, B. (2013, November 4). Cruel person lashed. The Star, p. 5.

Margele, B. (2013, November 4). We're not convinced it was him. The Star, p. 5.

May, M. (2013, May 3). Lennox calls on citizens to tackle gender violence. The Star, p. 5.

Muller, M. (2013, April 16). Why I respect Liepollo Pheko and you should, too. The Star, p. 12.

Ndenze, B. (2013, February 21). Call to focus on violence. The Star, p. 6.

Nicholson, Z. (2013, February 20). Woman raped by two she trusted. The Star, p. 6.

Nicholson, Z. (2013, April 23). Families disappointed as Anene's case is postponed again. The star, p. 2.

Nicholson, Z. (2013, May 22). Where are the other men involved? The Star, p. 1.

Nicholson, Z. & Konyana, X. (2013, May 22). Anene accused freed. The Star, p. 1.

Olifant, O. & Makhetha, T. (2013, March 7). Four in court for rape, murder. The Star, p. 4.

Political Bureau. (2013, March 11). DA claims R75m machine to help fight rape has become a white elephant. The Star, p. 5.

Rajab, D. (2013, February 20). Too divided to unite against rape. The Star, p. 12.

Schutte, G. (2013, February 26). This violence is pandemic. The Star, p. 10.

Sefara, M. (2013, February 22). Why media follow a fallen hero. The Star, p. 14.

Staff report, (2013, April 22). Two accused of Anene's rape and murder in the dock. The Star, p. 2.

Tau, P. (2013, February 11). Girl killed and buried in shack. The Star, p. 4.

van der Westhuisen, C. (2013, March 12). Time for a change of tack. The Star, p. 10.

Unknown author. (2013, February 2). What are people saying about the scourge? The Star, p. 4.

Unknown author. (2013, February 22). SAPS only as good as our society. The Star, p. 27.

Unknown author. (2013, February 27). Minister to educate pupils on rape. The Star, p. 2.

Unknown author. (2013, June 6). Anene guilty plea rejected to make way for bigger charge. The Star, p. 4.

Unknown author. (2013, November 4). Sentence welcomed. The Star, p. 10.

Unknown author. (2013, November 31). We still don't know why. The Star, p. 14.

The Sowetan – Anene Booysen:

du Toit, L. (2013, May 8). Rape: Destroyer of lives. The Sowetan, p. 19.

Mtyala, Q. (2013, March 1). Bullies become abusers. The Sowetan, p. 5.

Selebi, M. (2013, November 13). Rise in reported rapists despite heavy sentencing. The Sowetan, p. 9.

Unknown author. (2013, April 25). Sowetan says: All talk and no action. The Sowetan, p. 16.

Unknown author. (2013, May 21). Are South African's becoming a nation of uncaring zombies? The Sowetan, p. 12.

Unknown author. (2013, November 5). Rape, murder turning society into uncaring jungle. The Sowetan, p. 13.

Audio – visual.

Mabuse, N. (Presenter). (2014). Two worlds one fight: Episode 26, Checkpoint (documentary). Available: www.enca.com/media/video/checkpoint

*Nic Dawes commentary taken from this documentary.

Appendix

Table 1: The Star - Baby Tshepang

Total number of articles: 33

Front page stories: 12

Opinion pieces: 1

Frame	Example	Number of articles theme occurs in
Tshepang – as main focus, actual details about her and her medical condition mentioned.	"Baby Tshepang, the nine-month-old baby alleged gang-raped and sodomised by six men last week, is on the road to recovery" (7/11/01, p. 1) "Baby Tshepang, with her torn and broken body has spent the past five months confined to a hospital bed." (8/03/02, p. 11)	14 articles
Tshepang – as a theme, public responses to the incident and other incidents which are then linked to Tshepang	"An advertisement – asking who is responsible for the gang-rape of 9-month-old Tshepang in the Northern Cape – yesterday became the latest sign of a growing public outcry for action on South Africa's horrific child-abuse record" (10/11/01, p. 1) "Dr Heather MacKay, the angry mother who triggered	15 articles

	tremendous public reaction with her e-mail campaign in support of Baby Tshepang, is continuing her efforts" (8/11/01, p. 1) "The 5-month-old girl is the latest victim of a series of brutal baby rapes recently (…) "I had heard about the baby who was raped in the Northern Cape," she said. "But I never believed such a thing could happen until my child was raped" (3/12/01, p. 1)	
Justice system – expectations of the case outcomes, errors in the case processing and representation of those who were accused.	Comment from Tshepang's father, "I am going to leave it in the hands of the court, but I have told the community that if justice is not done, they can mete out any sentence that they wish on the real culprit" (9/11/01, p. 1) "… defence attorney for the six Louisvaleweg men who allegedly raped the then 9-month-old baby, said yesterday that the DNA results returned negative" (17/01/02, p. 1) "Albert van Zyl, the Upington lawyer who came	23 articles

	to the rescue of the six who were falsely accused of raping Baby Tshepang, said their release was proof of an effective justice system" (18/01/02, p. 1)	
Location and Community – social ills and dynamics in the community and family dynamics which are presented amidst the tragic incident. Mention of location of incident as a reminder to the readership of where the incident took place.	"The Northern Cape community is to descend on the Upington Magistrate's Court to protest against the granting of bail to six men accused of raping and sodomising 9-month-old Baby Tshepang" (12/11/01, p. 3) "The home, owned by her great-aunt, who has a penchant for "soetwyn" (sweet red wine), was, at the time, run as an informal shebeen. Tshepang's unmarried mother, aged 16, whom the community initially hit out at because of her alleged late-night drinking and partying sessions, will also not be returning" (21/01/02, p. 2).	22 articles
Campaign – responses from the public after the rape of Baby Tshepang.	"Following the campaign by Heather MacKay calling for action against child abuse after the brutal rape and sodomising of 9-month-old	10 articles

	baby Tshepang, the *Saturday Star* asked the question; "What is it that each and every one can do to stop abuse of women and children?" (17/01/01, p. 8) "The e-mail campaign started by an angry mother in response to the gang rape of 9-month-old Baby Tshepang in Upington has drawn support from around the world" (26/11/01, p. 7)	
Rape myths – all of which were directed at the accused.	"What kind of men would rape children young enough to be their daughters and granddaughters?" (9/11/01, p. 14)	8 articles

Table 2: The Sowetan - Baby Tshepang

Total number of articles: 5

Front page stories: 0

Opinion pieces: 3

Frame	Example	Number of articles theme occurs in
Baby Tshepang – theme for articles, but not the main focal point of the story.	"The latest reports about the failure of DNA tests to link six men accused of raping nine-month old Baby Tshepang in Upington, Northern Cape, will throw our criminal justice system into a tailspin with rather acrimonious consequences for our society" (18/01/02, p. 16) "It is our responsibility – those of us who aspire to join the majority of responsible, loving, caring men and women – to protect and bring laugher to Baby Tshepang and all children like her who at this moment suffering - from malevolent attention of rapists" (29/01/02, p. 22)	All 5 articles reflect some element of this; the topic is framed around other aspects that tie into the rape of Baby Tshepang.
Justice system – perceptions about it as a system.	"…the country was gearing to charge the judicial system with the task of determining	5 articles

	sentences for the accused that would act as a serious deterrent to would-be rapists in future" (18/01/02, p. 16) "This pattern can be attributed to low public confidence in the capacity of the law to apprehend and prosecute criminals" (11/12/01, p. 8)	
Rape myths	"I wonder if their pictures and names would have been made public before their court case if they had not been perceived as the dregs of society" (20/01/02, p. 20) "The rape of a nine-month-old baby defies description in any language, and indeed displays moral depravity of the highest order" (18/11/01, p. 22)	3 articles
Education- noted as an area in which sexual abuse occurs.	"The South African Democratic Teachers Union, deserves, mention for exposing principals and teachers who abuse children entrusted to their care" (18/11/01, p. 22)	2 articles
Case details	"… the rape and sodomising of nine-month-old Baby Tshepang in Upington, Northern Cape" (29/01/02, p.	1 article

	22)	
Campaign response	"If we work together, we can make our homes and our streets safe for our children" (18/11/01, p. 22)	1 article

Table 3: The Star - Eudy Simelane

Total number of articles: 10

Front page stories: 0

Opinion pieces: 1

Frame	Example	Number of articles theme occurs in
Incident – mention made of the actual attack.	"She had been raped and stabbed to death" (23/09/09, p. 2) "…robbed and allegedly raped Simelane before they stabbed her to death" (14/02/09, p. 5)	10 articles
Location	"…Eudy Simelane was gang-raped and murdered in April this year at KwaThema in Ekurhuleni" (8/07/08, p. 2) "A year later around June, Girly Nkosi was also attacked in Kwa-Thema and died in hospital days later" (29/04/11, p. 5)	7 articles
Campaigns – action groups in response to the rape of Eudy and others	"Outside court, a group of gender activists chanted, demanding a lengthy sentence" (13/02/09, p. 2) "Activists say at least 10 lesbians are raped or gang-raped in the Cape Town area alone every week". (3/05/11, p. 10)	6 articles

	"It's not just about government; it's about community awareness… It's for us to welcome gays and lesbians as human beings" (12/05/11, p. 10)	
Hate – crimes and corrective rape – wording used in reference to the rape and murder of lesbians.	"The family of a murdered lesbian woman, and gay and lesbian activists, believe Noxolo Nogwaza's brutal killing and rape was motivated by hatred because she was gay" (29/04/11, p. 5) "Simelane's sexuality was ruled out in the first sentencing as a motive in her killing, but activists have linked the case to "corrective rape""(26/09/09, p. 7)	4 articles
Justice system	Frustration at lack of urgency "… slowness of the police in investigating crimes committed against gays and lesbians in South Africa" (8/07/09, p. 2)	8 articles

Table 4: The Sowetan – Eudy Simelane

Total number of articles: 5

Front page stories: 0

Opinion pieces: 0

Frame	Example	Number of articles theme occurs in
Incident details	"Simelane was repeatedly gang-raped before being stabbed more than 20 times and her body dumped" (6/05/08, p. 5)	5 article
Hate-crime and campaigns in relation to Simelane's rape and murder.	"five men accused of gang-raping and brutally slaying former Banyana Banyana soccer player Eudy Simelane in an apparent hate crime" (1/08/08, p. 8) Hate used in campaign name "About 200 members of the Triple 7 Campaign to End Hate Against Lesbians and Gays yesterday gathered outside the Springs magistrates' court…" (6/05/08, p. 5)	2 articles
Constitutional rights, closely linked into justice system.	"We need to challenge society to embrace our democracy and the Bill of Rights embodied in the Constitution" (6/05/08, p. 5)	1 article

Justice system – frustrations and delays in case prosecuting.	"The court refused to grant them bail and postponed the case to May 13" (6/05/08, p. 5) "Lesufi adjourned the court to allow lawyers to consult their clients and postponed the case to June 26" (4/06/08, p. 9) "This was after she had adjourned the court five times to wait for one of the accused to arrive from Heidelburg prison, where he is being held" (1/08/08, p. 8)	3 articles
Family dynamics – Eudy's family interviewed, other families comments	"The Simelane's are obviously a very close-knit family. Married for 35 years, Mally and Khotso constantly reassured each other throughout the interview…" (14/05/08, p. 9)	2 articles

Table 5: The Star – Anene Booysen

Total number of articles: 47

Front page stories: 2

Opinion pieces: 7

Frame	Example	Number of articles theme occurs in
Anene – theme for other discussions.	"This debate takes place in the aftermath of the tragic and savage rape and murder of Anene Booysen. Anene is neither the first child nor woman to suffer this terrible fate". (21/02/13, p. 6) "The public outcry in India over the gang rape and murder of a 23-year-old student on a New Delhi bus prompted soul searching in South Africa, where some people are asking: "Why not here?" (11/02/13, p. 15)	29 articles
Anene – details of the assault and injuries sustained.	"She (Anene) was very dirty when she came in, covered in dust, blood and faeces. She had bruising around her eyes, a swollen face, and damages to the large and small intestines that were coming out of her vagina" (16/10/13, p. 2)	16 articles
Justice system – daily case	Commentary by opposition	30 articles

proceedings, comments by accused's family and victim's family, frustrations and expectations of the justice system.	party to police handling of rape cases "Reports said police stations around the country were running out of rape kits and were using kits designed for children to take samples from adults. The new kits are due to arrive at the end of the month" (11/03/13, p. 5) Comment in relation to evidence by Anene's mother "National Prosecuting Authority spokesman Eic Ntabazalila said yesterday: "Anene Booysen was not disembowelled, nor did she have broken legs, fingers or bones" (29/05/13, p. 2)	
Location – linked in with comments around family and community dynamics, reflecting potential inferences which can be made about those who live here.	"The teenager from Bredasdorp in the Western Cape was gang-raped, mutilated and left for dead" (11/02/13, p. 4) "Anene was raped and murdered after visiting a Bredasdorp nightclub on February 1" (22/04/13, p. 2) Extract from article listing rape incidents and the location in which they occurred "Anene…Bredasdorp,	14 articles

	Micaela Manneson…Eldorado Park, Banele Khumalo…Phumula Extension 21" (7/03/13, p. 4)	
Education – the inference in discussion around education was that it was the key point at which to begin to seek a solution to the rape epidemic in the country. Reminder of the age of Anene.	"Schools across the country have been encouraged to adopt a pledge at 8am on Friday, in an attempt to heighten awareness of the high levels of rape and to educate children on the dangers and recourse" (27/02/13, p. 2) "Remember, the police's role is to enforce the law, not to teach morality and acceptable behaviour, which is the role of the society these rapists come from" (22/02/13) "The collective rage of the country has to be turned into tangible action… We want to mobilise across the school footprint and launch the pledge where the Bill of Responsibilities is adopted by all learners" (23/02/13, p. 10)	5 articles
Campaigns – those which were launched in response to the rape of Anene.	In reference to government's prior initiatives "During Women's Month each year when the country's attention is focused on women we hear	15 articles

	the same statistics and the same kind of speeches from leaders" (17/08/13, p. 14) "Some of them waved placards that read: "Protect our women and children" and "No bail for rapists and murderers" (7/03/13, p. 4)	
Rape myths – applied in general commentary but also explained in opinion pieces where they were highlighted to be refuted.	"This act is shocking, cruel and most inhumane. It has no place in our country" (11/02/13, p. 15). The article "We can't 'fight' violence" (21/02/13, p. 15) explores and debunks many common assumptions about the assault and murder of women. "The root cause of rape lies not within the law or the inefficiencies of our criminal justice system. It doesn't lie with the thousands of disenchanted and disempowered young people who roam our streets. It lies in people's attitudes, across our cultures and classes, when they cling to outdated, harmful myths and stereotypes that perpetuate rape and violence" (28/02/13, p. 34)	15 articles

Table 6: The Sowetan – Anene Booysen

Total number of articles: 6

Front page stories: 0

Opinion pieces: 3

Frame	Example	Number of articles theme occurs in
Anene – theme for other related discussions including campaign launches in different sectors of society	"While India raged, South Africa's response to Anene's was shock. Anene was not the first, nor was she the last, to be raped. If India could stand up for its own, the question is why should South Africa have remained unmoved?" (21/05/13, p. 12) In relation to the launch of the Stop Rape Campaign then Basic Education Minister Angie Motshekga said "the culture of violence in schools must end. The bullies of today become the abusers of tomorrow" (1/03/13, p. 5) ""Not in our name" was the theme of the dialogue. Thandeka Madonsela and Anene Booysen's names were mentioned. The two were raped and mutilated and	6 articles

	have become the face of the cruelty and brutality directed at women by men in our society" (25/04/13, p. 16)	
Justice system and government responses to aspects thereof.	"Do we have 10 operational sexual offences courts or do we have 40? Is government committed to ridding the country of this scourge of rape serious or just talk?" (25/04/13, p. 16)	3 articles
Rape myths – used is different contexts of articles.	"It would, however, be a mistake to negate the impact of rape that does not lead to death" (8/05/13, p. 19) "We must educate the young (people) about the seriousness of rape and the consequences" (13/11/13, p. 9) Extracts from 'poetic' opinion column: "Rape is the measure of the deranged power quenching macabre thirst from the blood of the defenceless" (5/11/13)	5 articles
Location	"… Anene Booysen in Bredasdorp" (21/05/13, p. 12)	2 articles
Campaigns	"Department of Social Development social work policy manager Naomi	4 articles

	Maloba said "There is a need for a moral regeneration" (13/11/13, p. 9) "… at the launch of the Stop Rape Campaign at Glendale High School" (1/03/13, p. 5)	
Incident details	"Anene Booysen of Bredasdorp, who was raped, mutilated and murdered on February 2" (1/03/13, p. 5)	3 articles