# AN ILLUMINATIVE EVALUATION

# OF THE STANDARD 7 AND 8

# EXPRESSIVE ARTS CURRICULUM

# IN MALAWI

**Grames Wellington Chirwa**

**Student Number 0718686J**

**A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Humanities,**

**School of Education,**

**University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg,**

**in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of**

**Doctor of Philosophy,**

**under the supervision of Professor Devika Naidoo**

**ABSTRACT**

The objective of educational innovation, wherever it takes place, at school or at national level, is to improve current practices. In its recent attempt to improve the quality of education in Malawi, the national government in 2001 embarked on curriculum reform and adopted an Outcomes Based curriculum which was implemented in 2007. The design features of the Malawi Outcomes Based Education were influenced by South Africa's Curriculum 2005.

Following the implementation of the curriculum reform, the purpose of this study was to investigate the enactment of Expressive Arts, its theme-based design and content, facilitative pedagogy and continuous assessment in a selection of six state primary schools – three urban and three rural in Zomba district where teachers were first trained to teach Expressive Arts. The study is framed by the theory of Illuminative evaluation (Parlett and Hamilton, 1976) and Productive Pedagogies (Lingard *et al.*, 2001). Following a qualitative research design, data were collected through observation and post-observation interviews. Data analysis showed limited productive pedagogies in most lessons. The majority of lessons were characterised by lower intellectual quality, a focus on instrumental knowledge, integration at a superficial level, dominance of communalising practices, gendered practices, prevalence of localising discourses and a pedagogy aimed at national examinations.

The overall picture from these findings is that classroom atmosphere in the twelve classrooms gave students limited opportunities for the acquisition of knowledge and development of skills, values and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and to be able to compete successfully in other contexts. It appears that dominant pedagogic practices in the Expressive Arts classroom serve to

position learners in parochial orientations and issues. Therefore, there was an obvious discrepancy between the state's intended curriculum and the teachers' enacted curriculum. The implications of these findings for Malawi education have been raised. The most salient of these implications include the need for Malawi Institute of Education, the main change agent of primary school curriculum in the country, not only to consider revising the Expressive Arts curriculum but also to focus on the development of teachers in line with their needs for deeper content knowledge and productive pedagogic strategies.

**Keywords**: Expressive Arts, curriculum evaluation, Illuminative evaluation, Productive Pedagogies, instructional system, learning milieu, intended curriculum, enacted curriculum.

**DECLARATION**

I declare that *"An Illuminative Evaluation of the Standard 7 and 8 Expressive Arts curriculum in Malawi"* is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated by means of complete references. It is being submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy by Research Thesis in the University of the Witwatersrand, School of Education. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other university.

---------- ----------

(Signature) (Date)

**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS**

1. AIDS - Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
2. CA - Continuous Assessment
3. C2005 - Curriculum 2005.
4. CCAP - Church of Central Africa Presbyterian
5. CIPP - Context, Inputs, Process and Product
6. DEM - District Education Manager
7. DFID - Department for International Development
8. EMAS - Education Methods Advisory Services
9. Expressive Arts - An integrated subject which is a combination of Physical Education, Music, Needlecraft, Creative Arts, Drama and Dance.
10. FPE - Free Primary Education
11. GFE - Goal Free Evaluation
12. GTZ - German Technical Co-operation
13. HIV- Human Immune Deficiency Virus
14. HIPC - Highly Indebted Poor Countries
15. IMF - International Monetary Fund
16. IPTER - Initial Primary Teacher Education Reform
17. JCE - Junior Certificate of Education
18. KBSR - Kurikulum Bersepadu Sekolah Rendah
19. LEA - Local Education Authority

20. MANEB - Malawi National Examinations Board

21. MASTEP - Malawi Special Distance Teacher Education Programme

22. MCDE - Malawi College of Distance Education

23. MIE - Malawi Institute of Education

24. MIITEP - Malawi Integrated In-service Teacher Education Programme

25. MoEST - Ministry of Education, Science and Technology

26. MSCE - Malawi School Certificate of Education

27. PCAR - Primary Curriculum and Assessment Reform

28. PEA - Primary Education Advisor

29. PSLCE - Primary School Certificate of Education

30. PhD - Doctor of Philosophy

31. OBE - Outcomes Based Education

32. SRLS - School Reform Longitudinal Study

33. TK/F - Teacher knowledge formal

34. TK/P – Teacher knowledge practical

35. TALULAR - Teaching and Learning using locally available resources.

36. TDC - Teacher Development Centre

37. TTC-Teacher Training College

38. UNESCO - United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

39. USAID - United States Agency for International Development

40. VCT - Voluntary Counselling and Testing

41. ZimSci - Zimbabwe Science project

**DEDICATION**

This work is dedicated to Tawuniboyi Wellington Mjapaminga Banda, my late father and Emelia Kacholola Nyakapunda, my late mother who wished me to attempt this level of education but unfortunately did not live to see the achievement of their son.

**Acknowledgements**

The researcher would like to gratefully acknowledge the assistance of the following in this study:

- Professor Devika Naidoo, who provided research supervision and specialist guidance for this study.
- Professor Ray Basson who provided research supervision at the beginning of this study before he proceeded on retirement.
- Dr Ian and Jan Lowe of Melbourne, Australia who provided funding for the degree studies of which this research formed a part.
- The contributions of those who spent both time and effort to participate in this study are particularly highly valued. These participants are mainly the teachers of Expressive Arts teaching Standards 7 and 8 in six primary schools around Domasi, in Zomba district, Malawi and those who granted access to the schools for observation purposes. In terms of the latter, officials from district offices of the Ministry of Education were especially helpful.
- My wife Anne for her persistent prayers and her encouragement throughout my studies.
- My children Madalitso, Mphatso, Chikondi and Thokozani who gave me the reason to go on.
- The general support and encouragement of friends and colleagues were also of great value and are highly appreciated. Prof. Willy W. J. Mwakapenda's family also deserves special thanks. They introduced me to Dr Ian Lowe and requested him to fund my studies. In my first year of studying with the University of the Witwatersrand, they accepted me into their family wholeheartedly and provided me with the necessary social, moral and physical support, thereby enabling me to concentrate on my studies without worrying much of non-academic related needs.
- Finally, above all, I thank the Lord Jesus Christ for His presence and guidance throughout the study even when the going got tough.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract .....1
Declaration.....3
List of abbreviations and acronyms .....4
Dedication.....7
Acknowledgement.....8
Table of contents.....9
References.....14
List of Appendices.....14
List of Tables.....14

**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**

1.1 Introduction……...16
1.2 Background to the study……16
1.3 Aim……17
1.4 Rationale and significance of the study…… 18
1.5 Research Problem……26
1.6 Research questions……28
1.7 Methodology……..29
1.8 Closing remarks……31
1.9 Organisation of the thesis……....31

**CHAPTER 2: MALAWI EDUCATION SYSTEM AND RELATED CURRICULA**

2.1 Introduction…… ..35
2.2 Context for the study: Malawi…….....37
2.2.1 Geographical position and population overview…… ..37
2.2.2 Population, Economy and health…… .....38
2.2.3 Educational and Curriculum review in Malawi: Past and Present…… ...39
2.2.3.1 Education system and curriculum during missionary period (1800-1926)…… .....40
2.2.3.2 Education system and curriculum during the colonial period (1926-1964).....41
2.2.3.3 Education system and school curriculum after independence, during the one party rule (1964-1993)……..45

2.2.3.4 Education and curriculum from post-independence multiparty democratic rule to date....51
2.2.4 The Primary Curriculum and Assessment Reform……..55
2.2.4.1 Rationale for the Review....55
2.2.4.2 Curriculum Design....57
2.2.4.3 Curriculum integration....60
2.2.4.3.1 Challenges of curriculum integration....67
2.2.4.3.2 Some studies on integrated curriculum....68
2.2.4.4. Outcomes-based education defined....69
2.2.4.4.1 Learner-centred approach to teaching....71
2.2.4.5 Continuous Assessment....73
2.2.4.5.1 Some studies on Continuous assessment....75
2.2.4.6 Implementation of the PCAR....77
2.2.4.6.1 Orientation workshops……78
2.2.4.6.2 Distribution of materials to schools……80
2.2.4.6.3 Resources for reviewing and implementing the new curriculum……81
2.2.5 Closing remarks……82

**CHAPTER 3: CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK**

3.1 Introduction....83
3.2 Curriculum evaluation frameworks....83
3.3 Evaluation models....87
3.3.1 Objectives model....88
3.3.2 Goal-Free evaluation....91
3.3.3 Countenance model of educational evaluation....92
3.3.4 The CIPP model of evaluation....95
3.3.5 Connoisseurship evaluation model....97
3.3.6 Empowerment evaluation....97
3.3.7 Ethnographic evaluation....98
3.3.8 Illuminative evaluation....100
3.4 Illuminative evaluation studies....106
3.4.1 Illuminative evaluation studies in Malawi....107
3.4.2 Illuminative evaluation studies in other African countries....110
3.4.3 Illuminative evaluation studies internationally....112
3.4.4 Observations about studies using Illuminative evaluation....116

3.4.5 Challenges of Illuminative evaluation ..... 117
3.5 Putting the Conceptual Framework in operation ..... 119
3.5.1 Productive Pedagogies ..... 120
3.5.2 Studies using Productive Pedagogies ..... 120
3.6 Closing remarks ..... 122

**CHAPTER 4: LITERATURE REVIEW**

4.1 Introduction ..... 124
4.2 Factors affecting the implementation of curriculum innovation ..... 124
4.2.1 Factors related to the characteristics of the innovation ..... 125
4.2.2 Factors related to local characteristics ..... 139
4.3 Role players ..... 142
4.3.1 The Curriculum Gatekeepers ..... 142
4.3.2 The Learners ..... 148
4.3.3 School principals ..... 150
4.3.4 Supervisors and Curriculum Directors ..... 151
4.4 External factors influencing curriculum implementation ..... 152
4.5 Some other curriculum innovation studies in developing countries ..... 153
4.6 Closing remarks ..... 155

**CHAPTER 5: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGIES FOR THE COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS OF DATA**

5.1 Introduction ..... 158
5.2 Research Design ..... 158
5.3 Sampling ..... 162
5.3.1 Description of research sample: The district ..... 162
5.3.2 Description of research sample: school sample ..... 162
5.3.3 Description of research sample: class sample and teacher samples ..... 171
5.4 Preparation and conduct of field work ..... 173
5.4.1 Access to schools ..... 173
5.4.2 Data collection methods for investigating the instructional system ..... 174
5.5 Data collection methods for investigating the learning milieu ..... 180
5.6 Data management, confidentiality and analysis ..... 187
5.6.1 Data management ..... 187
5.6.2 Preserving confidentiality ..... 187

5.6.3 Data analysis ..... 188
5.7 Trustworthiness of data through triangulation ..... 193
5.8 Replicability of the study ..... 194
5.9 Closing remarks ..... 194

**CHAPTER 6: ANALYSIS OF THE 'INTENDED' CURRICULUM OF EXPRESSIVE ARTS**

6.1 Introduction ..... 196
6.2 The Expressive Arts Content knowledge ..... 197
6.2.1 Organisation of the Expressive Arts content ..... 198
6.2.2 Multi-disciplinary content ..... 200
6.2.3 Multi-cultural content ..... 203
6.3 The Expressive Arts pedagogies ..... 204
6.3.1 Elements of learner-centred and participatory pedagogies ..... 204
6.3.2 Organisation of learner-centred and participatory classroom practices of Expressive Arts ..... 206
6.4 Closing remarks ..... 213

**CHAPTER 7: ANALYSIS OF THE 'ENACTED' CURRICULUM OF EXPRESSIVE ARTS**

7.1 Introduction ..... 215
7.2 Productive pedagogies in the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum ..... 215
7.2.1 The intellectual quality of lessons ..... 215
7.2.2 Engagement with difference ..... 232
7.2.3 Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom ..... 242
7.2.4 Supportive classroom environment ..... 248
7.3 Teachers' perspectives of what they were doing in the teaching of Expressive Arts ..... 259
7.3.1 Teacher-centred classroom practices ..... 259
7.3.2 Frequent code-switching between English and Chichewa ..... 262
7.3.3 Teachers' Reliance on Recitation ..... 263
7.3.4 Over-dominance of instrumental forms of knowledge ..... 263
7.3.5 Weak integration of knowledge ..... 264
7.3.6 Skipping and rushing through content ..... 266
7.3.7 Technical forms of continuous assessment ..... 273
7.4 Closing remarks ..... 275

**CHAPTER 8: DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS**

8.1 Introduction ..... 278
8.2 Discussion of emergent themes ..... 278
8.2.1 Lower intellectual quality of lessons ..... 279
8.2.2 Limited connection of lessons to outside world ..... 289
8.2.3 Pedagogy for public examination ..... 290
8.2.4 Prevalence of localising pedagogic discourses ..... 294
8.2.5 Pedagogy for communalisation and subordination ..... 296
8.2.6 Pedagogy for syllabus completion ..... 299
8.2.7 Technical forms of continuous assessment ..... 300
8.2.8 Weak conceptual integration of knowledge ..... 302
8.2.9 Over-dominance of instrumental knowledge ..... 304
8.3 Closing remarks ..... 306

**CHAPTER 9: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

9.1 Introduction ..... 309
9.2 Purpose of study ..... 309
9.3 An analysis of the Methodology used in the Research ..... 310
9.4 The main research question ..... 313
9.5 Contribution to knowledge of the study ..... 314
9.5.1 Reframing of Illuminative evaluation and Productive Pedagogies for use in Malawi and African contexts ..... 314
9.5.1.1 Suitability and challenges of Illuminative evaluation and Productive Pedagogies frameworks in Malawi context for evaluating a curriculum innovation ..... 315
9.5.1.2 Challenges of using Productive Pedagogies and the proposed refinement of the theory ..... 318
9.5.1.3 Challenges of using illuminative evaluation ..... 320
9.5.1.4 Critical appraisal of illuminative evaluation ..... 321
9.6 Recommendations to the Curriculum Developers: the Malawi Institute of Education ..... 324
9.6.1 The revision of the Expressive Arts curriculum ..... 324
9.6.2 Writing curriculum material ..... 325
9.7 Recommendations to the Ministry of Education ..... 326
9.7.1 Provision of INSET ..... 326

9.7.2 Provision of adequate teaching and learning resources .....327
9.7.3 Review of some policies .....328
9.7.4 Improvement of conditions in the Teacher Training Colleges .....329
9.8 Recommendations to Teacher Training Colleges.....330
9.8.1 Preparation of teachers based on realities on the ground.....331
9.9 Recommendations to the Malawi National Examinations Board.....331
9.10 Recommendations for further research.....332
9.10.1 Implementation of Expressive Arts in Teacher Training Colleges .....332
9.10.2 Implementation of all learning areas in the new curriculum .....333
9.10.3 Implementation of learning areas in the Outcomes Based curriculum in the SADC region .....334
9.10.4 The utilisation of instructional materials .....334
9.11 Conclusion .....334

**REFERENCES**.....336

**APPENDICES** .....364
Appendix 1 Curriculum matrix .....364
Appendix 2 Teacher questionnaire.....365
Appendix 3 Lesson observation protocol.....368
Appendix 4 Follow-up teacher interview.....369
Appendix 5 Wits Authorization letter to conduct research……..371
Appendix 6 Request for permission letter to the District Education Manager to conduct research.....372
Appendix 7 Request for permission letter to School Principals to conduct research ..374
Appendix 8 Consent Forms for Teacher participation in research .....376
Appendix 9 Data used in the analysis of the intended curriculum.....3(CD)
Appendix 10 Sample lessons analysed using Productive pedagogies .....11 (CD)
Appendix 11 Post-lesson observation interview excerpts.....42(CD)
Appendix 12 Analysis of teacher responses to questionnaire.....83(CD)

**LIST OF TABLES**

**Table 2.1** Differences between the old and the new curriculum in Malawi.....58
**Table 5.1** Summary of study schools .....171

**Table 5.2** Teachers of Expressive Arts biographical data..……..173

**Table 5.3** Productive Pedagogies dimensions……..189

**Table 7.2.1** Summary of episodes in the indicators of High intellectual quality dimension…….....232

**Table 7.2.2** Summary of episodes in the indicators of Engagement with difference dimension.....242

**Table 7.2.3** Summary of episodes in the indicators of Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom dimension…….....248

**Table 7.2.4** Summary of episodes in the indicators of Supportive classroom environment……..259

**Table 6.5a** Plan for teaching Expressive Arts in Standard 7, Jan to March 2010..3(CD)

**Table 6.5b** Plan for teaching Expressive Arts in Standard 7, Apr to May 2010….5(CD)

**Table 6.6a** Plan for teaching Expressive Arts in Standard 8, Jan to March 2010……..7(CD)

**Table 6.6b** Plan for teaching Expressive Arts in Standard 8, April to May 2010……..9(CD)

# CHAPTER 1

# INTRODUCTION

## 1.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the background against which this evaluation study was conducted. It also discusses the nature of the problem that warranted this investigation, and details the reasons that made this investigation a worthwhile endeavour. It further formulates the research questions that set parameters for this investigation. Lastly, it discusses a synopsis of the research method and concludes with a brief overview of the whole thesis in terms of the key aspect of each chapter.

## 1.2 Background to the study

In its recent attempt to improve the quality of education in Malawi, the national government in 2001 embarked on curriculum reform, implemented in 2007. The Primary Curriculum and Assessment Reform (PCAR) intended to improve the quality of education in the country by addressing the weaknesses or shortfalls of the previous curriculum. The previous curriculum is said to have had problems of content overload because a wide range of subjects were offered for study in the curriculum and teaching and learning was examination rather than learner oriented (Khomani, 2003).

Expressive Arts is one of the nine learning areas in the 2007 national curriculum. It is an integrated curriculum using themes such as body movements, conveying cultural messages, multi-cultural performances and dances to integrate across multiple subject disciplines including Creative Arts, Physical Education, Music, Drama and Needlecraft. Expressive Arts differs from its predecessors in that they were designed around ends, emphasised content rather than skills, used didactic rather than facilitative pedagogies and

examinations rather than continuous assessment. Through PCAR, the government has thus aimed to shift education from content-based to outcomes-based education similar to Curriculum 2005 (C2005) in South Africa (Khomani, 2003).

The adoption of an OBE curriculum in Malawi arose from regional influences, particularly the first Southern African Development Community (SADC) Protocol on Education and Training adopted in 1997. The Protocol influenced the formulation of a new feature in South African education and curriculum landscape: an integrated qualifications framework (Chisholm, 2005). By 2004, a number of SADC countries including Malawi formulated a curriculum with a strong vocational and training slant: an Outcomes Based Curriculum. The design features of the Malawi Outcomes Based Education have been influenced by South Africa's Curriculum 2005 (C2005) (Motara, 2002). South African C2005 design itself has in turn been influenced by international curriculum ideas, particularly Spady's transformational OBE and Canadian and Australian curricula (Motara, 2002). The characteristic features of Ontario's "The Common Curriculum" in Canada are 'essential learning outcomes and integration of traditional subjects'.

Paradoxically, the introduction of an outcomes-based curriculum in Malawi may have a similar effect as in South-Africa where grades seem lower on standardized tests when compared to grades in other countries in sub-Saharan countries, a phenomenon which Malawi needs to avoid with the implementation of its new curriculum.

### 1.3 Aim

Following the introduction of the new national curriculum in Malawi in 2007 and its implementation over the past two years in schools across the nation, the purpose of my research is to evaluate the extent to which the Expressive Arts curriculum is being

implemented as intended. My study aims to uncover how the Expressive Arts curriculum is enacted in diverse classrooms in primary schools in Malawi.

The findings of the study will be helpful to a number of stakeholders. The findings of the study will inform the Ministry of Education and the Malawi Institute of Education, the extent to which the Expressive Arts curriculum is achieving its intended goals. This will guide the policy makers and the curriculum developers on what interventions should be made in case of failure or success.

During the time of study, the curriculum had been in implementation for just two years. If the curriculum is not being implemented successfully, it may not be too late to intervene. The findings would thus help Malawi Institute of Education in any future review of the instructional materials.

Apart from assisting the policy makers and the curriculum developers, the findings will also help teachers and learners. This is so because the findings would reveal the appropriate measures that could be taken by teachers to improve classroom practices if the curriculum is not being implemented successfully. In addition, the findings of the study would be helpful to Expressive Arts teacher educators on how to prepare teachers for teaching the Expressive Arts curriculum.

## 1.4 Rationale and significance of the study

Although literature in Malawi indicates that teachers in the primary school sector face enormous constraints, Mhango (2008) observed that there are not many studies that investigated, in a crucial way, how such constraints impact on teachers' classroom practices in implementing a curriculum innovation. In this connection, Croft (2002), who studied the use of songs in English lessons of lower classes in primary schools in Malawi, argued that most of donor-funded research in the country focussed on factors affecting the

quality of education rather than classroom practices. She therefore recommended a more critical investigation of how teachers implement the school curricula. For example, she recommended that observations and discussions with teachers were critical avenues in the exploration of teachers' classroom practices. Owing to the limited number of studies in this area, this study aimed at learning how teachers enacted the new Expressive Arts curriculum to meet the state's goal of improving the quality of education in Malawi.

To date, there are no documented studies which have been conducted on teachers' implementation of this curriculum innovation in Malawi. Teachers were the focus of this investigation because they make final decisions as regards to the implementation of any curriculum (Chapin and Mesick, 2002; Thornton, 2005). There were two main reasons that made studying from the standpoint of the teachers important. The first reason was based on the fact that many African countries spend their energies in the development of various school curricula, but do very little in ensuring their effective implementation (Mchazime, 2005). An understanding of the implementation of any curriculum entails an investigation of the decisions that teachers make in the enactment of the curriculum. In fact, Mchazime cautioned that neglecting the implementation of the school curricula is counter-productive to all the efforts that were put in the development process. Several other scholars in the field of curriculum (Stenhouse, 1976; Pratt, 1980; Fullan, 1992) also concur on the importance of investigating the implementation stage of a curriculum innovation. Their studies have also inspired me to pursue an exploration of the effectiveness of teachers in implementing the new curriculum in Malawi. For example, Fullan (1992) gives an important reason as to why it is important to investigate the implementation stage of curriculum development. He contends that

> The reason why it is important to examine implementation is to understand some of the reasons why so many educational innovations and reforms fail. By investigating

> implementation directly we can begin to identify the reasons why innovations fail or succeed (p. 22).

Fullan continues to contend that, 'the implementation perspective, if understood deeply and authentically, can be a powerful resource for accomplishing real improvements in classrooms and schools.' Pratt (1980, p.409) also concurs with Fullan on the importance of the implementation stage of a curriculum. He contends that

> Challenging though the task of designing a curriculum is, the undertaking is not complete when the last word is written. The designer's work reaches fruition only when the curriculum makes an impact on the learners. Many an excellent curriculum has had insignificant results because its designers limited their horizon to production of a curriculum rather than implementation of the programme.

In view of the arguments of Fullan and Pratt on the importance of the implementation stage of curriculum design and development, we can argue this way. If an in-depth understanding of how teachers are implementing a curriculum innovation can be unearthed, assistance can be offered to teachers and curriculum innovators on how to address problem areas in curriculum implementation, and hence a successful implementation of a curriculum innovation may be ensured.

The second reason for focusing on the teachers in this study was based on the curriculum reformers' blatant exclusion of classroom teachers at all levels of curricula development processes. For example, Hertzberg (1981) argues that curriculum reformers assume that they already know what is going on, and they tend to underestimate the problems as well as the consequences of change. Usually curriculum developers reform curricula based on researchers' formulated theories about teaching and learning (Fenstermacher, 1994). Of course such theories are important sources of knowledge for the reformation of the

curricula. However, there is abundant research evidence that suggests that teachers produce knowledge in classrooms as they enact any curriculum (see for example, Fenstermacher, 1994; Shulman, 1991). Yet reformers do not usually take into consideration the practical knowledge that teachers produce and use in their classrooms as they enact the intended curriculum (Hertsberg, 1981). Thus this study was not just aimed at investigating how various systematic factors affected teachers in their teaching of Expressive Arts lessons, but also the kind of practical knowledge the teachers produced and used in their classrooms depending on what worked best for them (Thornton, 1994).

The significance of this study is its potential to make a contribution to understanding the challenges which teachers are having in teaching Expressive Arts integrated outcomes based curriculum in Malawi. Studying how Expressive Arts is being taught inside the classroom is a way of illuminating the challenges the national curriculum and assessment framework initiative is facing in its implementation inside the classroom. The study may potentially benefit curriculum developers in Expressive Arts at the Malawi Institute of Education, the national curriculum development centre, who will read findings of this study to understand the challenges which teachers of Expressive Arts are having in teaching the learning area or subject as an integrated outcomes based curriculum in the national curriculum and assessment reform initiative. The findings of the study may also benefit the teachers of Expressive Arts. It may provide baseline data that teachers will be able to use that will bring their teaching in line with the Ministry of Education requirements. The findings of the study may also add new knowledge or insights to the existing body of knowledge that stakeholders in the country can use to guide them in improving the Expressive Arts curriculum and its implementation through preparing teachers to teach curriculum knowledge and use pedagogy and assessment methods in diverse contexts in the country.

While the findings may not be generalisable to other learning area-specific curricula within the national curriculum and assessment reform initiative, the study may nevertheless provide insights about issues in Expressive Arts that may inform further studies of other learning areas in the new curriculum innovation. The findings may also be compared with the findings of research on other learning areas in the new curriculum innovation in Malawi and elsewhere, from which generalisations could then possibly be drawn. The study may therefore contribute to a curriculum review of the primary curriculum and assessment reform (PCAR).

In addition to the fact that this study was undertaken for the reason that there are no documented studies which have been conducted on teachers' implementation of PCAR, the undertaking of the study was also partly influenced by my own autobiography as a teacher, teacher educator and a curriculum developer.

What sparked my interest to study the pedagogies of the primary school teachers for preparing learners with the knowledge, competence and qualities for successful fulfilment of their various life roles in the Expressive Arts classrooms was the paradigm shift that occurred in Malawi classrooms, after the re-introduction of democracy in 1994. I view this shift from my own perspective as a teacher educator, and my participation in curriculum development processes. In addition to this are my own socio-cultural experiences because learning in schools takes place in the context of both the teachers' and students' socio-cultural backgrounds (Hamilton, 1993; Hamilton, 1996; Rios, 1996).

I was trained as a Geography teacher and started teaching in 1995. My own perception of teaching Geography as well as the various constraints I faced influenced my classroom practices. Learner-centred or participatory teaching and learning pedagogies were not new to me because we learned about them during pre-service training. However, the Ministry of Education did not compel teachers in the use of such pedagogies during the pre-

democratic era. As such, I used a mixture of teacher-centred and learner-centred approaches, although I used more of the former because I viewed my major goal of teaching as preparing students for examinations. I found teacher-centred approaches necessary to drill students for examinations. Interestingly, I noted that students liked active participation in class during the few occasions I used learner-centred approaches.

In as far as I can remember, the use of the term 'participation' became popular in the post-democratic era because of people's involvement in political, social, and economic affairs of the country in the post-democratic era. The government started to emphasize the use of learner-centred or participatory classroom practices. Teachers were now expected to use such type of approaches. However, I still failed to use most of the suggested learner-centred or participatory classroom pedagogies in the reformed curriculum because of numerous problems I faced like inadequate resources, large class size, and public examinations pressure.

While I was still grappling with the paradigm shift in my secondary school classroom, I joined Domasi College of Education in 2000 as an Education theory teacher. My secondary school teaching experience made me believe that the state, policy makers and curriculum developers design curricula based on what they see as a desirable but ignored the actual classroom challenges that teachers face for the achievement of the desired goal.

My role as a teacher educator helped me learn more about classroom experiences from a different perspective. The government's requirement on the use of learner-centred or participatory learning pedagogies reminded me of the various constraints I faced as a secondary school teacher. The question I kept on asking myself was: 'How best can I prepare pre-service teachers to use learner-centred or participatory pedagogies under the various constraints in their schools?' I made a lot of effort in training pre-service teachers

on the use of learner-centred or participatory approaches on what I found practical during the time I taught in secondary schools.

However, I noticed during field experiences that some of the pre-service teachers resorted to teacher-centred pedagogies, just as I did during my time. I was also impressed with other pre-service teachers who adapted the techniques and skills they learned during their teacher preparation. Some creative pre-service teachers devised interactive learning strategies that were appropriate for large classes. For example, some of them organised students to write short stories based on what they had learned in the lessons.

From 2001, while still teaching at Domasi College, I also had a rare opportunity of being involved in a series of curriculum reform processes, which the Ministry of Education had organised. I was involved in the development of the Expressive Arts syllabi, teacher's guides and textbooks for primary schools. Such experiences helped to widen my understanding of curriculum development processes. One important issue I learned during such reforms was that subject-based curricula teams were bloated with 'experts' that included officials from the Ministry of Education, curriculum specialists, officials from the Malawi National Examinations Board, college professors and teacher educators. Paradoxically, teachers who actually enacted the curriculum were represented occasionally.

However, whenever I shifted my mental image to that of a classroom teacher to reflect on what we did to the curriculum, I always felt that as curriculum developers we did not heed much about the practical knowledge that teachers generate in their classrooms. Hence, remembering my own classroom experiences, I developed a keen interest in pursuing how primary school teachers implemented the Expressive Arts curriculum considering that we neglected their classroom practical knowledge when developing the curriculum.

Two mini-research projects I carried out in primary school classrooms through a Bachelor of Education with Honours and a Master's degree programme I pursued between 2007 and 2009 offered me the first opportunity to test my line of thinking. Through such interactions, I learned some of the teachers' perceptions about the school curricula and how the perceptions influenced their decisions in the classrooms. I also found that in the process of enacting any curriculum, some teachers devised effective classroom practices that promoted students' active participation even when the teachers worked under enormous constraints. Such practical knowledge was one of the initial impetuses for my investigation of how primary school teachers implemented the Expressive Arts curriculum.

In addition to the professional background was my socio-cultural experience in the understanding of classroom practices. My own experience as a student and secondary school teacher made me believe that socio-cultural factors influence classroom practices especially to value laden subjects like Expressive Arts.

I noted as a learner and secondary school teacher that both students and teachers enter their classrooms with prior knowledge that was largely based on their socio-cultural histories. In most cultural groups in Malawi, children undergo initiation rites, which can be described as traditional forms of schooling. These initiation rites are of course given different names in the country according to the regions of the country where they are performed. In these initiation rites, children undergo instructions which promote them into adulthood. As young adults, the initiates are taught about discipline, unity, cooperation, duties and responsibilities and leadership positions in the families and societies. Such instructions are done by special elders in the villages and are largely elder-centred. The learning is through folklores, riddles, expressions, simulations, songs and dances. To date, initiation rites remain a powerful tool among most cultural groups in Malawi for keeping alive

cultural traditions. Most of the students are initiated when they are about nine years old. This means students undergo initiation rites during their early years of school life.

I have never taught at primary school to experience what it takes to teach students who have prior knowledge based on their cultures. However, the truth about some elements of traditional practices is that some of their methods of teaching are contradictory to learner-centred and participatory learning that is currently promoted in the Malawi schools.

For example, traditional teaching reduces children to mere listeners, and yet when they go to school they are expected to take active roles in the classroom. Furthermore, traditional teaching takes place in exclusive "schools" for all boys or all girls with emphasis on social distance between sexes. Yet the same children go to co-education schools where they are expected to mix and participate as equals in all classroom activities. However, there are also common features between traditional teachings and classroom practices. For example, both use some common tools of teaching like songs, folklores and dances although these are more emphasized in the cultural traditions than in schools.

Thus my own experience as a teacher, teacher educator and curriculum developer and the fact that the researcher would be observing the teaching of a curriculum in which the researcher participated in designing influenced my desire to study how primary school teachers used learner-centred and participatory methodologies in Expressive Arts lessons to prepare learners with knowledge, competence and skills necessary for fulfilment of various life roles in the community.

## 1.5 Research Problem

The introduction of PCAR in Malawi constituted a problem that required a thorough investigation. The problem came about because the Ministry of education expects teachers to change their classroom practices from the traditional didactic teaching to learner-centred

and participatory learning and from examinations to continuous assessment. For example, in connection with the learning areas in PCAR, including Expressive Arts, Kaambankadzanja (2005) argues that

> The new curriculum must depart from using the traditional teaching methods and focus more on learner-centred or participatory methods such as group discussions, role plays, simulations, debates etc. (p.1-2)**.**

This assumption is not without problems, of course, because such a shift requires that teachers must possess appropriate content and instructional knowledge for implementing learner-centred classroom practices. Yet the reality on the ground is that teachers in Malawi face various constraints that include poor teacher preparation programs (Hauya, 1993; Kunje, 2002; Stuart, 2002), large class sizes (Stuart, 1999), and inadequate classrooms (Croft, 2002). Other constraints are inadequate teaching and learning resources (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, 2001; Kunje, 2002), and diversity in students as reflected in their ethnicity, language, religion, gender, and age (Hicks, Kishindo and Tlou, 2003). However, understanding of how this shift constitutes a problem for teachers makes sense in context of the political, social, and economic problems that Malawi has experienced since gaining of its independence from Britain in 1964. This background is important in understanding why the Ministry of Education embarked on curricula reforms that compel teachers to use learner-centred and participatory classroom practices for preparation of competent citizens in an independent and democratic country. It was in the context of the research problem and significance of the study that I developed research questions for this investigation.

## 1. 6 Research Questions

One main research question and four sub-questions were framed to guide the actual investigation and were as follows:

***How do Expressive Arts teachers teach Expressive Arts two years into the implementation of PCAR in Malawi?***

The sub-questions that support the main question are the following:

**1.6.1** ***What is the 'intended' Expressive Arts curriculum?***

**1.6.2** ***What is the 'enacted' Expressive Arts curriculum?***

**1.6.3** ***What differences are apparent between the two?***

**1.6.4** ***Why do these differences exist?***

An understanding of how teachers implement Expressive Arts lessons to achieve the government's espoused goal of improving the quality of education can make sense in relation to the official curriculum that teachers use for the organisation and teaching of their lessons. Therefore, the first sub-question aimed at investigating the content and pedagogical approaches of Expressive Arts prescribed in the Ministry of Education's intended curriculum.

The second question sought to understand how the teachers implemented their planned lessons. However, as shall be discussed in greater detail in the next chapter, teachers face an array of constraints that affect their classroom practices. Therefore, the third sub-question aimed at exploring how the teachers either adhered to or deviated from the intended curriculum. In this connection, the fourth question aimed at exploring the reasons for the apparent teachers' deviations from the intended curriculum.

## 1.7 Methodology

As it has been stated earlier on, in section 1.3, the aim of this study was to explore how teachers are teaching Expressive Arts curriculum two years into the implementation of the national innovation in Malawi.

I felt that this aim was consistent with those of the qualitative research approach. A qualitative research design was therefore used in this study: Illuminative evaluation. Illuminative evaluation was developed by Parlett and Hamilton (1976) to assist evaluators go beyond testing as the predominant instrument, to consider in addition how both contexts within schools and issues often 'hidden' in evaluation contribute to understanding an innovation and how it may be improved. The Illuminative evaluation approach has the ability to take into account the teachers' perspectives of the curriculum as they implement it and to match the intended and the enacted curriculum. In Illuminative evaluation, the difference or 'gap' between the terms 'instructional system' and the 'learning milieu' make it possible to ascertain whether the curriculum is meeting its own formulated goals and whether Malawi ought to still follow the OBE route.

To evaluate one needs a yardstick for comparison. Therefore Productive Pedagogies (Lingard *et al.*, 2001) has been used to complement Illuminative evaluation as a yardstick to which the enacted curriculum may be compared. Productive Pedagogies has been utilized mainly as the lens for illuminating the pedagogy in the enacted curriculum. One major reason that makes Productive Pedagogies theory significant to this study is that this approach seems to offer a useful lens for understanding how teachers implement a curriculum which was aimed at improving the quality of education in Malawi. Productive Pedagogies was developed as a research tool for exploring classroom practices that promote a high quality education for *all* students regardless of their background (Lingard *et al.*, 2001).

The theory takes into account all the pedagogies integral to promoting provision of high quality education for *all* the learners as espoused in the new primary school curriculum in Malawi. For this reason, Productive Pedagogies has been adopted as a suitable lens for evaluating the new curriculum in Malawi.

As Nyirenda (1993) correctly argued, understanding the effectiveness of an innovation in improving education quality based on curriculum documents alone is not enough without reference to how teachers enact the curriculum. For this reason, the understanding of the effectiveness of the innovation in improving education quality in Malawi was from the perspective of both the design of the Expressive Arts curriculum and how teachers enacted it in their classrooms.

Understanding of the design of the curriculum involved analysis of curriculum documents. This process helped in learning how the state organised the content and pedagogies of the curriculum to improve education quality. Understanding of how teachers enacted the curriculum involved observing lessons of twelve case study teachers and interviewing them. Observing the lessons of the twelve case study teachers aimed at learning how the teachers organised lesson activities to meet specific objectives of the lessons. As such, the observations and analysis of the lessons helped in understanding how the teachers either adhered to or deviated from the intended curriculum.

In this connection, Mc Laughlin and Talbert (1990) observed that teachers' organisation of classroom practices are either constrained or stimulated based on the context in which teachers operate. As shall be explained in the next chapter, various systematic problems constrain teachers in the organisation of effective lessons in Malawi. Therefore, the next chapter is a discussion of the context in which the Expressive Arts curriculum is being implemented.

## 1.8 Closing remarks

As is the case with many national innovations, adjudicating worth or attributing value to a curriculum customarily follows the implementation of that curriculum. This study is undertaken to establish how teachers teach Expressive Arts, one of the nine learning areas in the national innovation in Malawi early in its implementation with the view to strengthening practices consonant with intentions of the state and improving those which may be deviating from the intentions.

## 1.9 Organisation of the thesis

This thesis has been organised into nine chapters, with each chapter divided into several sections and sub-sections. Arabic numbering has been used to indicate the different levels of section headings.

Chapter 1 formulates some of the background concerns that prompted the research and looks at some of the questions which were designed to guide it.

Chapter 2 locates the study in the context of Malawian education. It aims at providing background to PCAR, which is the curriculum under study, against the just phased out 1991 curriculum. The chapter thus discusses the process and rationale that resulted in the decision to revise the 1991 primary curriculum and to produce the PCAR. The first part explores the missionary dominated education system during the early period of missionary work in Malawi and during the colonial period up to the late 1950's. The second part explores the involvement of the colonial government in the provision of education; and the shaping of the education system until Malawi attained Independence in 1964. The colonial education system appears to have provided the foundation on which the present system of education in Malawi is based.

The third part examines the education system and its related curriculum reviews after independence in 1964. The fourth part presents a rationale for the primary education curriculum review which began in 2001 in Malawi. The fifth part discusses the design and processes involved in producing the PCAR. This part is also dedicated to a discussion about what integration and continuous assessment entails as the major design features of the PCAR, which provides the overall curriculum framework within which the design of nine learning areas, Expressive Arts being one of them functions. Some recent studies on curriculum integration and continuous assessment have also been considered in this part of the chapter. The last part is dedicated to a discussion of the procedures which were undertaken in implementing the curriculum. This is done to give a sense of the nature of the curriculum being evaluated.

Chapter 3 presents the theoretical frameworks guiding the study. It explains that this study is grounded on two theories. First and foremost, the study is grounded on the concept of Illuminative evaluation as postulated by Parlett and Hamilton (1976). Illuminative evaluation is a framework for finding out if a curriculum innovation is doing what it intended to do. Illuminative evaluation is therefore employed in this study to establish if the intentions of the Expressive Arts curriculum are being realised in the classroom practice of teachers. In order to establish the intentions of the Expressive Arts curriculum and the classroom practice of teachers, another theory was drawn upon. This was Productive Pedagogies postulated by Lingard *et al*. (2001). Some studies in the field of education and other fields which have used Illuminative evaluation as a framework to evaluate innovations have also been cited. Some evaluation models and how these models relate to this research are also discussed in the chapter.

Chapter 4 reviews relevant literature. The first part of the chapter discusses challenges which are cited in the literature on implementing a curriculum using strategies similar to

what PCAR adopted. The second part presents some top-down curriculum innovations in developing countries. This is done to provide some reference points about curriculum innovation barriers encountered in contexts similar to those of Malawi.

Chapter 5 outlines the research approach and the method for data collection. A qualitative research design employing a case study method was used in this study. The chapter explains the ethical considerations in conducting the study and permission obtained from the University of Witwatersrand Research Ethics committee. Informed consent was first sought from the participants before they started participating in the study. Participants were informed that their confidential information would only be accessed by the researcher and the supervisor. The data collection techniques used in the study; questionnaire, observation and semi-structured interview enabled triangulation of data, which contributed towards trustworthiness of data. The chapter explains how the data were analyzed-by identifying emerging themes, related to indicators of dimensions of Productive Pedagogies, which became the units of analysis.

Chapter 6 presents the analysis of the 'intended' curriculum of Expressive Arts. The purpose of this chapter is to describe what the curriculum policy documents prescribed as the content knowledge, pedagogy and assessment approaches in Expressive Arts to answer the research sub-question, 'What is the intended Expressive Arts curriculum?'

Chapter 7 presents the analysis of the 'enacted' curriculum. The purpose of this chapter is to describe what teachers do in the classroom to answer the research sub-question, 'What is the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum?'

Chapter 8 discusses nine main themes emerging from the findings and compares them with related literature. The discussion is guided by the main research question of the study,

‘How do Expressive Arts teachers teach the curriculum two years into the implementation of PCAR in Malawi?

Chapter 9 presents conclusions and recommendations. The first part sums up the whole study in terms of the purpose of the study, how it was carried out and the conclusive answer to the main research question. The second part considers the contribution to knowledge of this study. The third part considers the implications of the research on the curriculum review and implementation taking place in Malawi. In this connection, some policy recommendations are made in the light of the findings of the research. The fourth part identifies issues arising from the research that require further investigation. Finally, the shortcomings or the limitations of this study are discussed in the chapter.

# CHAPTER 2

# THE MALAWI EDUCATION SYSTEM AND THE PRIMARY CURRICULUM AND ASSESSMENT REFORM

## 2.1 Introduction

This chapter intends to locate the study in the context of Malawian education. It aims at providing background to PCAR, which is the curriculum under study, against the just phased out 1991 curriculum. The chapter thus discusses the process and rationale that resulted in the decision to revise the 1991 primary curriculum and to produce the PCAR. The chapter further explores the context in which teachers operate and the various systematic problems that constrain the teachers in effective implementation of a curriculum. In the chapter, I present the state of primary school education in Malawi and its related curriculum reviews beginning from the missionary education perspective to the present.

Formal education in Malawi was introduced by missionaries who saw the purpose of education as that of making people literate so that they could read the Bible (Galimoto, 2008). State governments normally inculcate in their citizens the objectives of their education through a designed curriculum. The curriculum, therefore, is a tool through which the needs, aspirations, interests and objectives of the society or the nation are articulated and addressed as learning experiences for the development of the individuals through teaching and learning process (Apple, 1979). The various education systems in Malawi which have been adopted beginning from the missionary period to present have also been accompanied by various curriculum reforms in order to address the needs and aspirations of the nation at that given time period.

This chapter is divided into six main parts. The first part explores the missionary dominated education system during the early period of missionary work in Malawi and during the colonial period up to the late 1950's. The second part explores the involvement of the colonial government in the provision of education; and the shaping of the education system until Malawi attained Independence in 1964. The colonial education system appears to have provided the foundation on which the present system of education in Malawi is based.

The third part examines the education system and its related curriculum reviews after independence in 1964. This part of the chapter therefore gives background to the development of PCAR, the curriculum framework within which the design of nine learning areas, Expressive Arts being one of them functions. The fourth part presents a rationale for the primary education curriculum review which began in 2001 in Malawi. Some of the shortcomings of the old curriculum have been discussed, the most salient of which was the fact that it was unable to meet the demands of the changing Malawian society. Therefore the government proposed a radical curriculum review, with the support of international donor agencies; namely, Department for International Development (DFID) of Britain, German Technical Co-operation (GTZ) and United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and other organizations. These agencies and organizations were convinced that the curriculum review was devised with the aim of raising the standards of education in Malawi.

The fifth part discusses the design and processes involved in producing the PCAR. In order to give a sense of the nature of the PCAR, which provides the overall curriculum framework within which the design of nine learning areas, Expressive Arts being one of them functions, there are also sections in this part of the chapter dedicated to a discussion about integrated curriculum and continuous assessment as the major design features of the

curriculum being evaluated. Recent studies on curriculum integration and continuous assessment have also been considered in this chapter. This is done to provide some reference points about challenges other curriculum innovations with integration of subjects and continuous assessment have encountered in their implementation.

The last part of the chapter is dedicated to a discussion about the procedures adopted by the government in implementing the curriculum. The reason for the inclusion of this last part of the chapter is that this study focuses on a particular innovation, Expressive Arts, so this chapter also gives a background to the creation of Expressive Arts and procedures adopted in its implementation. A discussion on the implementation of the PCAR curriculum provides information on possible barriers to its effective implementation

## 2.2 Context for the study: Malawi

### 2.2.1 Geographical Position and Political Overview

Malawi is a land-locked country situated in Central-East Sub-Saharan Africa. Malawi was called Nyasaland, which means 'land of the lake' under the British. The country was ruled by the British from 1891 until 1964 when it became independent and became a republic two years later in 1966. In 1994, after 30 years of one party dictatorship, Malawi became a multi-party democracy. This dispensation ushered in a change in policies regarding education such as the Free Primary Education policy (FPE) and this has brought about a 'high degree of complexity regarding access, quality, financing and planning of basic education' (Kadyoma, 2004, p. 9).

Malawi shares a common border with the United Republic of Tanzania to the north and northeast, the People's Republic of Mozambique to the east, south east and south west; the Republic of Zambia to the west and northwest. Since Malawi is land-locked, it is dependent on other countries for access to the sea for export and import of essential

commodities. It has a total area of 118,484 square kilometers and about one third of this is covered by the waters of Lake Malawi, the third largest lake in Africa. The lake is about 475 kilometres long and runs down Malawi's east boundary with Mozambique. The country is divided administratively into three regions: the Northern, Central and the Southern Regions, which are further divided into 28 districts. Six districts are in the Northern Region, nine are in the Central Region, and thirteen in the Southern Region. For the purpose of educational administration, there are 32 educational districts; one for each of the 28 districts and one for each major city. The major cities are Blantyre, Lilongwe, Zomba and Mzuzu. This study was conducted in Zomba district, one of the four major cities of the country.

### 2.2.2 Population, Economy and health

The 2008 Malawi Population and Housing Census put the Malawi population at 13.9 million with 49% men and 51% women (DFID, 2009). Approximately 90% of Malawians belong to the Chewa ethnic group. The remaining 10 percent belong to the Lomwe, Yao, Nguni, Tumbuka, Sena, Tonga, Ngonde and other ethnic groups. Europeans, Asians, and other racial groups compose less than 1 percent of the population but exercise considerable economic influence. More than 50% of Malawians speak Chinyanja, which former president Banda renamed Chichewa when he made it the national language. Many Malawi Africans speak Chichewa at home, and more than 80% understand it. Chichewa has been put as the language of instruction for the PCAR curriculum in the foundation phase (Standards 1 to 4) of the primary school in the country. It is the only local language which is included in the PCAR. English is the language of instruction from Standards 5 to 8.

Economically, land-locked Malawi ranks among the world's least developed countries with very low human development. The economy of the country is predominantly agricultural with tobacco as the main export commodity which brings export revenues.

The economy therefore depends on substantial inflows of economic assistance from International Monetary Fund (IMF), the World Bank and individual donor nations (National AIDS Commission, 2004). In late 2000, Malawi was approved for debt relief under the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC). The Gross Domestic Product per capita is estimated at US$165. The national poverty incidence is estimated at 65.3%, of which 66.5% and 54.9% are rural and urban poverty incidences respectively. The poverty line is about US$3 per month (National AIDS Commission, 2004). Incomes are very low and unevenly distributed. Income disparities are mainly found in cases where those who are highly educated and/or skilled earn more on average than those who are unskilled with little education. The economy is agriculture-based which renders it vulnerable to world market fluctuations, adversely affecting the living standards of most Malawians. Unskilled workers seek to survive through engaging in casual labour activities on the fields of others or prostituting – thus exposing themselves to a high risk of contracting HIV/AIDS (National AIDS Commission, 2004). According to National AIDS Commission (2004, p. 20), the country continues to experience chronic under-nutrition coupled with the upsurge of disease outbreaks such as tuberculosis, HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other infections. Currently, the National AIDS Commission in Malawi estimates that about 16.4% of Malawians of between the ages 15 and 49 years are HIV positive (National AIDS Commission, 2004, p. 20). The effects of HIV/AIDS epidemic are mostly being felt through the reduced life expectancy, high dependency ratio, loss of productive work force, and increasing health costs at household and national levels (National AIDS Commission, 2004).

### 2.2.3 Educational and curriculum review in Malawi: Past and Present

The history of education and curriculum reforms in Malawi has four distinct phases. These are:

- Missionary
- Colonial
- Post-independence one party rule
- Post-independence multi-party democratic rule

The changes in Malawi education and curriculum policies during these four distinct phases are described in detail below:

#### 2.2.3.1 Education system and curriculum during the missionary period (1800 - 1926)

**a. Primary education**

Malawi's present formal education system was born out of the works of early missionaries, notably, Robert Laws of the Free Church of Scotland, who in 1875 opened the first school at Cape Maclear in Southern Malawi (Galimoto, 2008). The main purpose of the missionary schools, was, in the missionaries' eyes, to 'civilise the primitive and pagan natives' by teaching them Christian values and replacing the slave trade with what was considered legitimate commerce. Several missions were established in different parts of the country, each establishing an education system based on its own religious philosophies blended with the characteristics of the communities they were working in. For example, other attempts to introduce education into Malawi were made by the Catholic, the Dutch Reformed Church and the Seventh Day Adventists who followed the United Free Church of Scotland and established mission stations in various parts of the country. As the Phelps-Stoke Commission (1924, p.20) comments: 'Education was at all times of secondary importance to evangelization. Education made people literate and this meant that they could read the Bible.'

A common feature of the curriculum of the missionary education was reading, writing and arithmetic, with some missions placing emphasis on technical skills. However, the missionaries merely wanted to evangelise Malawi and the rest of Central Africa. This was the case not only in Malawi but also in other African countries as well. Countries like Zambia (Robertson, 1970), Lesotho (Mohapeloa, 1982) and Kenya (Indire, 1983) all report the central position of the missionaries in introducing education in these countries as a pre-requisite to evangelization. In Malawi, by the year 1900, various educational reports indicated that missionary activities had spread to most parts of the country, and reading, writing, arithmetic and bible study formed the major part of educational activities. The government, in recognition of the missionary work in education, introduced a grant-aided system. The funds provided by the government were shared by the missionaries in proportion to their educational activities. It was not until 1926, according to the Nyasaland Annual Education Report (1961), that the government established a Department of Education to co-ordinate all missionary educational activities in the country. The type of education and its curriculum during the colonial period is discussed below.

#### 2.2.3.2 Education system and curriculum during the colonial period (1926-1964)

The colonial government started to feature in education in 1926 when the Department of Education was established. By 1925, the missions were feeling their way toward some kind of partnership with the government in education. The following missionary comment was no doubt evidence of this:

> It seems to us quite evident that in view of the present financial stringency, neither the Government nor the missionary facilities can carry on the work alone, but that working in conjunction, we can bring to a successful issue the aims which we both have at heart (Jones, 2005, p. 1)

The Phelps-Stokes Commission, a privately instituted but missionary inspired commission, recommended that the missionaries and the colonial government should combine their efforts to provide education to Malawians. This recommendation was adopted by the colonial government in its Colonial Office Memorandum of 1925 entitled, "Education Policy in British Tropical Africa." The government accepted to enter into partnership with the missions in the provision of education to Malawians. The Department of Education was therefore established in 1926 to co-ordinate all missionary educational activities in the country. This included the provision of a central curriculum for all schools by 1933, except for religious education, which was left to the individual missionaries to handle.

The Government's aim in education was to provide a small but efficient system to fulfill clearly identified purposes of development, while the missionaries in addition aimed to use the government money to "Christianise" the country. With the coming in of the colonial government in the provision of education, the goals of education were then identified to be personal hygiene, use of the environment, home life, use of leisure time, literacy and numeracy, moral development and religious life. The missions however still controlled the delivery of education because the government released only small grants to the missions. The different aims of education between the missionaries and the colonial government led to a series of clashes between the two factions. Differences also existed among the missionaries themselves in the way schools were run and organized. Other missions wanted education to go beyond fulfilling the objective of evangelization. The 1960 report commented that some missions adopted procedures that allowed pupils, who showed interest and were academically promising, to be trained to start demonstration schools of their own, while the less promising were taught practical subjects. In some missions, bright students were sent for missionary training so that on their return they could open

substations. By 1900, mission stations were established in most parts of the country and education became one of the major activities of missionary work.

The use of the central curriculum, mentioned above, became the only unifying factor among the various missionaries in providing education, and the idea of central curriculum has remained in use up to the present day, although missions no longer control education.

The annual Education Reports of 1960 and 1961 indicate that the primary school cycle lasted for ten years and ran as follows:

**i) Village and vernacular schools**

These were schools within a small catchment area. Children from a few villages were organized to form a village school. The village headman and his people were made responsible for the provision of a school building and a teacher's house. Instruction was in the vernacular and teachers were graduates of middle schools, the majority of them untrained. Instruction at this level lasted for four years.

**ii) Middle schools**

Graduates of village schools went to middle schools which had a larger catchment area. Middle schools were normally placed in mission substations and the medium of instruction was both in the vernacular and in English. Instruction at this level was for three years.

**iii) Station schools**

These were schools located in mission headquarters. Admission to these schools was highly competitive as pupils were selected from the graduates of the middle schools. The course lasted for three years. Station schools also provided a village and middle school course and, as full primary schools, were the highest academic institutions in the country. The teaching staff consisted of missionaries who were employed either full-time or part-time.

The 1961 Report suggests that the aim of the village schools was to bring education closer to the people. As people became sensitized to education it was then easier to encourage the more able to aim for middle and station schools. However, even for those who passed the examination, there were not enough places available at the middle or station schools. As educational provision developed, some village and middle schools were upgraded to become full primary schools.

The curriculum of primary education during the colonial period changed in 1940 when the first secondary school was opened by protestant missions in Blantyre. The secondary school curriculum was based on the academic-elitist systems of the English Grammar School. History, Geography, English literature, English language, Latin, General Science, Mathematics, Religious knowledge and Chichewa were the core subjects. As a result, the primary curriculum had to change to meet these requirements and as can be imagined with disastrous results. The content and learning materials were based on British experiences and had little bearing on the local situation. Europeans were the only teachers who could handle this material and they taught to make pupils pass examinations. Soon after independence in 1964, the government instituted a commission to make a review of the education system in the country. The commission, known as Johnson-Survey Team, observed that the education system in Malawi was 'imported, excessively academic, deadly passive and addicted to rote learning' (Kabwila, 1995). A need therefore arose to overhaul the colonial education system. The independent government attempted to do this by drawing educational plans and reviewing the colonial government's curriculum. I now turn to a review of primary education after independence in 1964.

#### 2.2.3.3 Education system and school curriculum after independence, during the one party rule (from 1964-1993)

When Malawi became independent in 1964, it embarked on provision of education which would be relevant to the needs and challenges of the independent nation (Kabwila, 1995; Lowe, 2008). The country needed agriculturalists, carpenters, engineers, social specialists, community workers, teachers, nurses and construction workers. It became clear that the curricula inherited from the colonial government did not address the need and the challenges of the independent Malawi. There was a big discrepancy between the goals of the current curricula and the needs of the country. The country therefore launched its first Educational Plan in 1973 which was to provide guidelines for the development of the education system of the independent Malawi. The plan had the following major objectives:

a. the fulfilment of the specific needs of the labour market
b. the development of a school curriculum with relevance to the socio-economic and environmental needs of the country
c. the improvement of efficiency in the utilization of existing facilities; and
d. the achievement of a more equitable distribution of educational facilities and resources (Ministry of Education, 1996, p.3).

The formal education system and its curricula in Malawi from 1964 to 1993 is considered in detail below:

**a. Primary Education**

In most African countries, 'the flag followed the bible' (Rose, 1970). This meant that the missionaries enjoyed unprecedented control over education during the entire period of colonial rule. It was only after countries started to become independent that the situation

changed. The new governments became more interested in education as they realised that in order to obtain the necessary manpower, they had to place emphasis on the development of education. This was reflected in the Proceedings of the Addis Ababa Conference of African Ministers of Education (1961). The Conference stressed Africa's need for more and better educational opportunities and suggested, as a general goal, that the substance of education be adapted to fit the era of independence. Although the need for agricultural training and community development was mentioned, the Conference emphasized academic reform. The inclusion of African history and culture in the curriculum, and the importance of meeting the high manpower requirements of the emerging nations were some of the agreed goals. In determining priorities, the Conference assigned the greatest urgency to secondary and post-secondary education. Primary and adult educations were to develop at the same time with a goal of achieving universal primary education by the year 1980. Although the goals set at the Addis Ababa Conference have not been achieved in most independent African countries, progress has been made in providing primary education for the majority of children of school-going age. In some countries, such as Zambia and Tanzania, school fees were abolished during the early sixties. This removed the poverty barrier and gave every parent an equal opportunity to send their children to school.

Malawi was no exception in this endeavour. The 1965 five-year development plan had the following as one of its objectives

> Education expansion, stressing in particular secondary education and post-secondary education so as to provide the skilled manpower that was essential for development (Rose, 1970, p. 127).

Although the development plan emphasized the expansion of secondary and post-secondary education, this could not be achieved without the expansion of the primary

school system. Consequently, after the attainment of self-rule, the government passed an Act giving powers to the Minister of Education to establish Local Education Authorities (LEAs). Section 4 (iii) of the 1962 Education Act reads

> The Minister after consultation with the Minister responsible for Local government may establish Education Authorities by Order published in the Gazette declaring that a local authority shall be the local education authority for the area over which it exercises jurisdiction on such local authority.

Section 15 of the Education Act gave powers to the LEAs which included the provision of funds for the establishment and maintenance of primary schools. The Act also gave powers to the LEAs to advise the Minister on the siting of new primary schools. This Act appears to have spearheaded the establishment of many primary schools in the country by local communities, while the central government concentrated on secondary schools. The establishment of primary schools was undertaken under the community self-help arrangement. Local communities were to build the schools while the government provided teachers and equipment. The number of primary schools expanded as the demand for education increased. Although universal primary education was not achieved by 1980, primary school enrolment had increased from 359,841 in 1964 to 779,676 by 1980 (Nyirenda, 1993).

The government's Statement of Development Policies (Malawi Education Plan, 1985-95) focused on the expansion of primary education in terms of pupils' enrolment, infrastructure and the quality of education, incorporating the teaching of life skills. The statement indicates that the basic skills of reading, writing and numeracy will be highlighted in the revised curriculum. A primary curriculum review was then carried out in 1982, with the overall aim of improving the quality of education. In the 1982 curriculum, Agriculture became a common subject of instruction in both primary and secondary

school. This was mainly due to the fact that the country needed its populace to have agricultural knowledge as its economy is agriculture-based. The number of subjects on offer in both the primary and secondary school also increased compared to those in the colonial government's curricula. Emphasis on external examination in the colonial government's curriculum was however adopted in the post-independent Malawi government. External examinations continued to control the whole system of education including teachers' pedagogical approaches. Teachers continued to teach in ways specifically to prepare the learners for examinations. The maintenance of external examinations in the post-independent Malawi primary curriculum has led some scholars who are passionate followers of the developments in Malawi education system such as Lowe (2008, p. 3) to argue that

> The curriculum had changed very little since external examinations still controlled the whole system of education...so long as external examinations were part of the Malawi educational system, no real progress would be made towards realisation of the aims of education initiated after independence.

The introduction of the national curriculum and assessment reform in 2007 (the one which this study is concerned about) by the Ministry of Education can be looked at as the government's realization that change of external examination policy is an important determinant of real change in education system and an important prerequisite for realisation of the aims of education initiated after independence. The first Education Plan put into place by post-independent Malawi government seem to have been wrought with problems although there is need to celebrate the fact that the Plan was a valuable document as it marked the real first attempt at educational planning since the advent of education in Malawi by the missionaries. The public became dissatisfied with the 1982 curriculum as it was too academic and exam-oriented. The content was repetitive and the subjects were

overlapping. It focussed on producing an elite class of people not suitable for a newly developing country (Kabwila, 1995; Khomani, 2005). It therefore became obvious that the primary school curriculum had to be changed.

This led to the Malawi government's Second Education Plan which covered the period 1985-1995. The overall objective of this plan was to improve the quality of education so that it met the needs of the country. According to this Education Plan, the quality of education was to be improved through reviewing the 1982 curriculum. Justifying the need for reviewing the 1982 curriculum, the Secretary of Education (1991) in the foreword of the Primary School Syllabus said, 'Nothing is more difficult in the field of education than to plan appropriate curricula to achieve the goals set for the individual and national development.' He continued to specify the pertinent areas that needed urgent attention. He said

> Bearing in mind that primary education is terminal for the majority of the children, there should be greater emphasis on those practical skills that would enable them to enter self employment and entrepreneurship and those skills that relate to the social-economic development of the country (p. 1).

The responsibility to plan, develop and produce the revised curriculum was given to the Malawi Institute of Education. The Malawi Institute of Education is a curriculum development and research centre which develops materials for use in education. It is administered by the Ministry of Education. It was established in 1979 by Government Order No. 60 under Education Act (CAP. 30.01) and became operational in 1982. The government order that established the Institute mandated it to perform the following functions:

a. Design, develop, monitor and evaluate the national education curriculum to ensure that it continues to respond to the present and future needs of the Malawi society.

b. Assist in the training of teachers.

c. Provide professional help and services for teachers.

d. Arrange for the publication and production of teaching/learning materials.

(MIE Library News, 2008, p.1).

The Malawi Institute of Education produced curriculum materials for the primary schools and primary teacher education for the revised curriculum in 1982. Following the introduction of the Second Education Plan in 1985, the Institute followed with plans to produce new curriculum materials as well as organise in-service education for teachers. The 1982 curriculum had to be reviewed from 1987. The review process was completed in 1991. In the words of Khomani (2003, p.5)

> There are a number of factors which necessitated the review from 1987. One of the factors is that the 1982 curriculum was overloaded with subjects of study. There were excessive overlaps in the nature of content across subjects without any deliberate effort to integrate such content. By its design and balance, the curriculum was examination-oriented with the greatest stress on cognitive skills rather than on social or practical skills.

Paradoxically, when the 1991 curriculum was developed, it appears to have had almost the same problems as the 1982 curriculum, problems like a large number subjects and it is argued to have been examination-oriented. The 1991 curriculum had again to be reviewed in 2001 by the multi-party democratic government which established its own ways of running education, examples of which are described in the next sub-section.

### 2.2.3.4 Education and curriculum from post-independence multi-party democratic rule to date.

#### a. Primary and secondary education

In 1994, Malawi went through a political transition from a one-party dictatorship to a multi-party government. Today, children enter school at the age of six in Standard One and finish primary education in Standard Eight at the age of fourteen. However, it is not uncommon to find children who are older than fourteen still in the system because of a late start or repetition of a year. The primary education system in post-independence multi-party democratic Malawi is pyramidal. It starts with a very large enrolment in Standard One, less than half of which complete the primary school cycle. The dropout rate, particularly at Standard One level, is high. A number of factors have been identified as contributing to this. Studies done by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) in 1991 suggest that school fees and compulsory uniform are perhaps the two major contributors. Parents on a low income cannot manage to pay school fees and provide other necessities for their children. The average family has five children, all of whom are school age. The dropout rate is more prevalent amongst the girls because the majority of parents give preference to educating their sons. School fees in Malawi have been phased out, but parents now provide exercise books and stationery for their children. The costs of these seem to be actually more than school fees and so this scheme does not appear to be a solution to minimizing the dropout rate in primary schools. A second element that has caused a high dropout is the rule on wearing school uniform. Although the government has made it clear that no child should be sent out of school because of uniform, in practice pupils without school uniforms have been sent away from school. Nevertheless, despite these problems, enrolment in schools has increased tremendously over the past two decades.

At the end of the primary cycle, there is a primary school leaving examination. This examination serves two purposes: first, it is a certification leaving examination, designating the completion of the primary cycle of education. The primary cycle is terminal to most of the primary school graduates. The second function of this examination serves as a selection device for secondary education. Less than 10% of primary school graduates are selected to proceed to secondary schools because of the limited number of places. For instance, in 1987, there were 65,937 primary school graduates but only 7,376 secondary school places available in government-funded schools. Private schools take an extra 2% of graduates, and admission is on a first-come, first-served basis. However, private schools demand high fees and this acts as the major barrier to the majority of parents.

**b. Training of teachers**

Today, teacher education in Malawi is divided into two distinct categories. The first, one of the concerns of this study, is Primary Teacher Training, controlled by the Ministry of Education. The second is the Secondary School Teacher Education, primarily under University of Malawi but supplemented by upgrading courses mounted by the Ministry of Education at Domasi College of Education in Zomba district.

There are now eight primary teacher-training colleges with a total annual enrolment of more than 1,800 students offering a two year course in primary school teaching. Entry requirements are either a Junior Certificate of Education (JCE), or a Malawi School Certificate of Education (MSCE). At the end of the two years, successful candidates are awarded a T2 or T3 Certificate, according to the level of their entry qualifications. The new teacher-training programme, funded by USAID, which started in 2006, is in addition to the conventional teacher-training courses offered in the eight colleges. Tuition is by distance learning with an eight week residential programme.

A major goal of primary teacher education in Malawi is that primary school teachers 'acquire sufficient academic knowledge and professional skills to teach the curriculum effectively' (Malawi Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, 1980). The teacher education curriculum comprises all subjects offered in the primary schools and the skills and competencies teachers would need to teach these subjects. The teacher education curriculum aims to train each teacher in nine skills as follows:

- Introduce a topic competently.
- Use sequential steps in the development of a lesson.
- Conclude a lesson effectively.
- Keep children interested in instruction.
- Adapt the instruction to cater for individual differences.
- Give clear instructions.
- Explain clearly.
- Use questions to stimulate thinking.
- Communicate with children using a variety of methods.

(Malawi Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, 1980, p. 50)

Prior to the introduction of Outcomes Based Curriculum in the primary teacher education in 2006, teacher-training programs mainly used 'traditional' approaches. Traditional approaches are teacher-centred, use behaviourist assumptions, and have a relatively closed view of knowledge that sees the teacher as a technician directing all the teaching and learning (Kunje and Chimombo, 1999). These authors characterize a typical teacher education class by the teacher's use of transmission of knowledge and rote-learning methods intermingled with question and answer sessions, with some rudimentary group work.

In their teaching experience, trainee teachers are observed to teach as they were trained. The trainee teachers' lessons start with a recap of the previous lesson. They tend not to review the current lesson at the end. Most lessons tend to end abruptly without summaries and without guidance for preparing for the next lesson. There is little evaluation to judge how much learners have actually absorbed. There is also little encouragement for learners to argue or challenge (Kunje and Chimombo, 1999). The Initial Professional Teacher Education Reform (IPTER) of 2006 introduced the 'progressive' methods. These methods contain some elements of interactive and constructive thinking, are more learner-centred, less authoritarian and expect more of a teacher in terms of adapting the curriculum to the pupils. The style of teacher-training may influence the methodologies adopted in teaching subjects in the PCAR including Expressive Arts.

As there had been no major reform of the curriculum of primary education during the three periods discussed above to reflect the rapid development of social, political and economic life in the country, the government decided to reform the curriculum during post-independence multiparty democratic rule in order, as it is argued, to make education more responsive to the needs, aspirations and cultural values of the Malawi society in the twentieth century.

In the new political dispensation, the country intensified its efforts in strengthening and improving the education system**.** To strengthen and improve education, the country produced an Educational Development Plan in 1995 known as Policy and Investment Framework for Education in Malawi[1]. In primary education, the most crucial challenge is the improvement of quality and relevance of basic education. In order to ensure the

[1] The Malawi Ministry of Education, Science and Technology's policy document, which proposes policies and programmes that will guide the development of the education sector for the period between 2000 and 2015.

improvement of quality and relevance of basic education, the Policy and Investment Framework stresses the need for relevant curriculum to *'be more reflective of changing socio-economic and political realities'.* The plan led to the primary curriculum and assessment reform of the 1991 curriculum. In 2001, therefore, the Malawi Ministry of Education and Vocational Training through the Malawi Institute of Education, the country's national curriculum development centre embarked on a national primary curriculum and assessment reform initiative. The rationale, development and implementation processes of the 2001 curriculum review, which is the object of evaluation in this study, is discussed in detail in the next sub-sections.

### 2.2.4 The Primary Curriculum and Assessment Reform

The Malawi government, with the support of international donor agencies; namely, Department for International Development (DFID) of Britain, German Technical Co-operation (GTZ) and United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and other organizations proposed a radical curriculum review in 2001 which was implemented in 2007. These agencies and organizations were convinced that the curriculum review was devised with the aim of raising the standards of education in Malawi.

#### 2.2.4.1 Rationale for the review

It has been shown in the preceding sections above that Malawi was under colonial rule before becoming independent in 1964. For countries with a colonial history like Malawi, curriculum reviews have been fuelled by the political desire of constructing a national identity; this is a desire to secede from Western models of education. Before becoming independent in 1964, Malawi used the British curriculum. After independence, Malawi developed its first national primary school curriculum in 1982. The 1982 curriculum had to be reviewed from 1987. The review process was completed in 1991. Paradoxically,

when the 1991 curriculum was developed, it appears to have had almost the same problems as the 1982 curriculum. The 1991 curriculum had also problems like curriculum overload in terms of having a large number of subjects, topic duplication and redundancy both within and across subjects and being examination oriented.

In 2001, the Malawi Ministry of Education and Vocational Training through the Malawi Institute of Education, the country's national curriculum development centre embarked on a national primary curriculum and assessment reform. The review was aimed at addressing problems of the 1991 curriculum. The initiators of the curriculum review claim that the 1991 curriculum had two major problems. The first problem is that the curriculum was overloaded with subject disciplines, had topic duplication and was examination oriented which resulted into teachers concentrating only on the teaching of examinable subjects, neglecting non-examined ones (Kaambankadzanja, 2005). The second problem was that the curriculum was unable to meet the demands and needs of the changing Malawi society (Kaambankadzanja, 2005). According to the Malawi Ministry of Education and Vocational Training, the national needs for the primary education which were obtained through the needs assessment process in the year 2000 indicated that the 1991 content based curriculum was not benefiting the majority in terms of acquisition of skills, values and desirable attitudes (Ministry of Education and Vocational Training, 2005)

As a solution to the problems of the 1991 curriculum, during the training in curriculum development models in February, 2003, participants to the training decided to adopt and adapt Outcomes Based Education curriculum as the right model to take care of the primary education problems in Malawi (Kaambankadzanja, 2005, p. 1-2)**.**

Paradoxically, the introduction of an outcomes-based curriculum in Malawi may have similar problems which Outcomes Based Education has been wrought with in South-Africa. Allais (2007) has noted that South Africa's Outcomes Based Education

curriculum, C2005 is weak on conceptual coherence and in-depth coverage of content knowledge largely because of integration of content knowledge and lack of prescribed content in the curriculum. Allais has noted that conceptual structures of different forms of knowledge are not recognized in an integrated curriculum and this leads to dilution of knowledge in the curriculum. As PCAR has been drawn from C2005, it is likely to have similar flaws to those of C2005. The PCAR intended curriculum may be flawed in its design, with inherent superficial content knowledge. The consequence of the design feature of integration of knowledge on the teaching of PCAR will be seen in Chapter 7, in which the teaching of the curriculum is put under a microscope.

#### 2.2.4.2 Curriculum Design

The initiators of the new curriculum, Malawi Institute of Education, indicated that the curriculum was intended to reflect the societal needs and skills required to the learners with the ability to live a meaningful life in their communities.

The designers of the curriculum agreed to adopt Outcomes Based Education curriculum as a right model to take care of the shortcomings of the old curriculum because it emphasizes skills rather than content (Kaambankadzanja, 2005). Consequently, the new curriculum is designed around outcomes rather than ends and content. The new primary curriculum is designed to provide social skills which can help learners to participate effectively in their communities. Skills such as literacy and numeracy are envisaged to help those graduates unable to gain access to secondary education. This is particularly important because, according to the Malawi Education Statistics (2005), almost 60% of pupils drop out of school before completing primary education. This cohort of children is vulnerable to receding into illiteracy within a few years after leaving school. Consequently, the designers of the curriculum have allocated more contact periods per week for literacy and numeracy on the curriculum matrix (Appendix 1) compared to other learning areas in the

curriculum. This is done to increase the opportunity for the learners to attain literacy and numeracy skills.

The new curriculum also emphasizes facilitative pedagogies rather than didactic pedagogies and continuous assessment rather than examinations as methodologies of teaching and assessment. The common feature of previous curriculum innovations in Malawi is that they dealt with one subject only. This is significantly different to the present review which has involved a revision of the whole primary education curriculum. It is a review of both content and teaching methodologies. The new curriculum review has introduced some elements of subject integration. Subject overlap, which characterised the old curriculum, has been minimized. The differences between the new curriculum and the old curriculum is summarised in Table 2.1 below:

**Table 2.1: Differences between the old and the new curriculum in Malawi**

| **1991 Curriculum** | **New curriculum** |
|---|---|
| **Content based curriculum** –<br>The focus is on the achievement of objectives and coverage of content mainly from the perspective of the teacher | **Outcomes based education** –<br>The focus is on the outcomes displayed by the learner after teaching and learning has taken place and Continuous assessment is used as one main mode of assessment. |
| **Number of subjects up to 13**<br>The subjects are:<br>Chichewa<br>English<br>Creative Arts<br>Social Studies<br>Mathematics<br>Music<br>Physical Education<br>Religious Studies<br>Needlecraft<br>Agriculture<br>Home Economics<br>Science/Health Education<br>Life skills | **Number of Learning areas up to 9**<br>The learning areas are:<br>Chichewa<br>English<br>Mathematics<br>Expressive Arts<br>Religious Education/Bible Knowledge<br>Life Skills<br>Social and Environmental Sciences<br>Agriculture<br>Science and Technology |
| **Literacy skills development**<br>The course aimed at literacy skills development | **Literacy and Numeracy skills development**<br>The new focus is on acquisition of literacy and numeracy skills at the earliest stage of the learners' schooling |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Core versus Elective subjects**<br>Some subjects were labeled core while others are not. This is compounded by the examinations focus by Malawi National Examination's Board (MANEB) who only examined the core subjects at Primary School Leaving Certificate Examinations. The subjects examined are: Mathematics, English, Chichewa, Science and Health, Social Studies<br>The impact of this is arrangement was that only the core subjects were emphasized and taught while the rest of the subjects were more or less ignored. As a result many children were denied the privilege of exposure to other subjects which are equally important to their lives. | **All Learning Areas (Subjects) are Core**<br>All the Learning Areas (Subjects) in the curriculum are core. Malawi National Examinations Board (MANEB) examines all the Learning Areas at Primary School Leaving Certificate Examinations (PSLCE). The impact of this arrangement is that all subjects in the curriculum are emphasized by the teachers. |
| **Mostly has stand-alone subjects except for General Studies and Social Studies**<br>Most of the subjects stand alone and as a result the curriculum had many subjects most of whom were apparently not being taught although they appeared on the school time tables | **Integration of Subject Components**<br>The integration has come about as a way of reducing the overload but without losing subject matter. |
| **Focused on Knowledge Acquisition**<br>The curriculum attempted to impart knowledge using mainly teacher-centred methodology | **Focuses on the acquisition of Skills, Concepts and Knowledge as well as desirable attitudes and values**<br>All learning areas/subjects aim at preparing learners for the world of work through entrepreneurship skills. Various skills, concepts, attitudes and values are earmarked for each learning area. These become targets for achievement as outcomes to be displayed by each learner. |
| | **Incorporates emerging or cross-cutting issues**<br>Democracy, Human Rights, Environment and Population have mainly been featured in Social and Environmental Sciences learning area as well in the literacy and languages of English and Chichewa.<br>Issues of HIV/AIDS have mainly been incorporated in the Life Skills, Social and Environmental Sciences, Agriculture, Science and Technology, literacy and languages as well as in Expressive Arts Learning area. |

Source: Adapted from Kaambankadzanja (2005)

Table 2.1 above shows that several features distinguish the new curriculum (Outcomes-based education) from the one (content-based) it is replacing, and were designed to address its weaknesses. The most salient of these features are; firstly, the new curriculum focuses on outcomes to be achieved at different stages of the learning process. Secondly, subjects have been integrated into 'new learning areas.' The learning areas are defined as an organised integrated body of knowledge and skills and values which serve as a basis for learning (Ministry of Education, 2006a). Lastly, the new curriculum has adopted continuous assessment. Continuous assessment is defined as a more individualised form of assessment in which learners have to be assessed in what they are able to do and display in each learning activity rather than assessing them at the end of the term or the year (Ministry of Education, 2006a).

Curriculum Integration, Outcomes Based Education and Continuous Assessment are very important concepts in the PCAR. They give background to the design which Expressive Arts curriculum being evaluated in this study has taken. These concepts and the challenges which have been experienced in some educational systems in implementing curricula designed around these concepts are therefore discussed in detail below.

#### 2.2.4.3 Curriculum integration

The Primary Curriculum and Assessment Reform (PCAR) is an integrated curriculum which is bound within the design principle of Outcomes Based Education. The primary curriculum and assessment reform initiative in Malawi has been influenced by experience of integrated curriculum and outcomes based education internationally.

Some of the reasons which have given rise for a move towards an integrated curriculum internationally include:

1. The rapid rise in the amount of knowledge that children should learn. This has led curriculum designers to add more things to curriculum reforms. This has resulted in teachers experiencing an increased body of knowledge and overcrowded curriculum coupled with large classes. This makes teachers experience the feeling that ‘there just isn't enough time to get it all in’ or ‘the school day just isn't long enough for all that I'm supposed to do’. This feeling of frustration is one of the motivations behind development of integrated curriculum.

2. Concerns about curriculum relevancy, and a lack of connections and relationships among disciplines. This rationale for curriculum integration has found its basis in the work of Piaget (1896-1980) and others who hold a holistic view of learning. Each of these theorists is concerned with children having an understanding of concepts. Integrated curriculum is viewed a move away from memorization and recitation of isolated facts and figures to more meaningful concepts and the connections between concepts. Proponents of curriculum integration view it as a way of making education more meaningful.

3. Theories of *how children learn* have also led many a curriculum designer and developer to adoption of curriculum integration. Cromwell (1989) looks at how the brain processes and organizes information. According to Cromwell, the brain organizes new knowledge on the basis of previous experiences and the meaning that has developed from those experiences. The brain processes many things at the same time, and holistic experiences are recalled quickly and easily. Put to use in the classroom, Cromwell’s learning theory points toward interdisciplinary learning or thematic teaching. The current movement toward an integrated curriculum has its basis in the work of learning theorists who advocate that learning is best accomplished when information is presented in connected patterns.

4. The movement toward a global economy and international connections, as well as the rapid changes in technology, is pushing education toward integration (Lipson, 1993). According to Lipson, the ability to make connections, to solve problems by looking at multiple perspectives, and to incorporate information from different fields, will be an essential ingredient for success in the future.

Several scholars have described in details what curriculum integration involves and entails. Some of the scholars who have described what curriculum integration involves and entails are Boydell (1973), Bernstein (1996) and Hoadley (2002). The definitions and descriptions of integrated curricula as provided by the afore mentioned scholars are discussed next.

Curriculum integration as an approach to design and presentation of content in the curriculum in which themes cut across several individual disciplines or subjects was explored by Boydell (1973). A central theme becomes the medium for disciplines to interact. Boydell has identified various forms of integration within the thematic curriculum integration framework.

The first form is what is called 'cooperative integration.' This is where a teacher can remain class-based, teaching his own subject but planning his lessons around some central theme which might have been agreed upon by a group of teachers.

The second form of curriculum integration is what is called the 'co-ordinated' pattern of integration. In this type of integration, the teacher can remain class-based, but agrees to reconstruct his entire syllabus to incorporate other areas or bodies of knowledge from other subjects in his/her syllabus in order to allow maximum co-ordination with other subjects.

The third form of integration is where a group of teachers can retain their individual subjects which they teach. However, the integration will be in such a way that they can come up with common themes of particular significance, and then each teacher will teach the content of his/her individual subject through a theme. This is called 'team teaching' form of curriculum integration.

The fourth form of integration is the 'theme integration.' Boydell (1973, p.188) explains that in this form of integration, subjects or disciplines still maintain their identity as separate disciplines. Teachers plan their unit in groups, first coming up with a theme and then assigning content activities to that theme. A teacher agrees to accept the importance of a theme over his/her individual subject or discipline, and gives up individual subject time and space in order to carry out a united study of a particular theme.

The last form of integration is what can be termed as 'real' integration. This is where a theme is selected to cut across several individual disciplines or subjects. This theme takes care of all disciplines or subjects. Subject disciplines cease to have separate identity. Teachers teach the theme instead of their subjects having at the back of their minds the idea that the theme has taken care of their individual subjects.

The learning areas in PCAR, including Expressive Arts curriculum design accords with Boydell's notion of 'real' integration. Congruent with Boydell's definition of a 'real' integrated curriculum, learning areas are informed by the thematic integration principle which is bound within the design principle of Outcomes Based Education. Expressive Arts curriculum blurs subject-matter lines, bringing together various aspects of the content-based curriculum into association through themes that cut across the subject disciplines of Physical Education, Music, Needlecraft, Creative Arts and Drama (Malawi Ministry of Education, 2005, p.2).

Two types of curriculum were distinguished by Bernstein (2000), who drew upon a theory of educational codes using the concepts of 'classification' and 'framing' to formulate the main distinguishing features of collection and integrated curricula. Both classification and framing can be defined as a long continuum of strong and weak. The term 'classification' is used to denote the strength of boundaries between the subjects in the curriculum and everyday and educational knowledge. According to Bernstein, any curriculum has boundaries around the subjects which have been included in that curriculum as worthy of being learned and taught. The boundaries between subjects in a curriculum are what Bernstein calls classification. The boundaries come in because each subject deals with concepts and language which are unique to it and therefore different from other subjects. Strong classification refers to subjects being insulated from each other by strong boundaries. Weak classification refers to weak or blurred boundaries between subjects. A curriculum with weak classification is an integrated curriculum. Thus Bernstein (2000, in Naidoo, 2006, p. 22) defines integration of knowledge 'as the subordination of previously insulated subjects or courses to some relational idea or theme that blurs the boundaries between the subjects'.

The second educational concept which distinguishes a collection from an integrated curriculum is framing. There exists a relationship between the form of classification of subjects in a curriculum and the nature of the relationship between the teacher and the learners in the teaching and learning process. The pedagogical relationship between the teacher and the learners is called 'framing'. In the pedagogic relationship, strong framing refers to explicit control by the teacher and weak framing refers to the arrangement where learners are given some control over knowledge. Bernstein explains that 'framing actually refers to the degree of control teacher and pupils possess over the selection, organisation

and passing of the knowledge transmitted and received in the pedagogical relationship' (Bernstein, 1971, in Naidoo, 2006, p.26).

A collection curriculum has strong framing, characterised by having the boundaries between different subjects strong and clearly drawn. This means that the teacher visibly controls the selection, sequencing, pacing and evaluation of knowledge and pupils have no control. Bernstein also calls the strong framing in the collection curriculum as 'performance' pedagogic practice. According to Bernstein, 'performance' pedagogic practice can feature: strong boundaries regarding time, space and discourse in the classroom; an evaluation orientation that focuses on absences (of content, skill, etc); explicit forms of control; a low degree of learner control with respect to regulation of the curriculum and transmission; a relatively low cost of transmission in terms of physical resources, teacher training and thus less restrictions on teacher supply. Such performance modes give rise to 'visible' principles of instruction, whereby 'the hierarchical relations between the teacher and pupils, the rules of organisation (sequence and pace), and the criteria are explicit and so known to the public' (Bernstein, 2000, p.109). In different ways, child-centred models move from such visible, performance pedagogies to be oriented towards what Bernstein called 'competence' pedagogy.

In an integrated curriculum there is weak framing. Pupils have greater control in selecting, sequencing, pacing and evaluation of knowledge. Weak framing however is not to be conflated with loss of control. When control is ceded in weak framing it can always be reclaimed (Naidoo, 2006). The form of pupil control thus distinguishes a collection from an integrated curriculum. In a collection curriculum, which has strong classification and framing, the teacher will regulate what is taught, where and when. The learner will be visibly under the teacher's control. In an integrated curriculum on the other hand, teachers will cooperate with their pupils in the classroom. Pupils are given opportunities to practice

self-regulation or personal control. The power that the school and teachers traditionally exercise is shared with students to decide what, when, how and where to learn (Naidoo, 2006).

Framing further refers to the boundary between everyday knowledge and educational knowledge. The strong framing in collection codes "socialise the child into knowledge frames which discourage connections with everyday realities"(Naidoo, 2006, p.27). The weak framing in integrated codes on the other hand accommodates the use of everyday life experiences to teach the content in the curriculum. Congruent with Bernstein's notion of curriculum integration, the boundaries between the subjects in the Learning Areas in PCAR, including Expressive Arts curriculum have been blurred as they become part of one Learning area. Hoadley (2002, p.127), elaborates further on the definition of integrated curriculum. He explains that

> In an integration type of curriculum, elements of a number of traditional, strongly classified subject contents are combined into integrated learning areas. These subjects are no longer defined by their own content, concepts, language and rules. Instead, they are taught using the everyday language of the theme, and concepts are taught if they can be used by the learner.

The PCAR design accords with Bernstein's and Hoadley's notion of integrated curriculum.

The definitions of integrated curriculum given by the scholars quoted above show that the central design principle of integrated curriculum is thematically integrating across disciplines. This curriculum design principle is fundamentally different from others like ends-based designs focussing on a single discipline. Thematically integrating across disciplines implies merging of disciplines into a learning area.

Though curriculum integration provides relevancy and connectivity, as it is argued, several issues with thematic integration remain problematic. Problems have been observed in implementing integrated curricula in countries where this type of curriculum design has been adopted, for example, the United Kingdom. Some of these challenges are highlighted below.

#### 2.2.4.3.1 Challenges of Curriculum Integration

1. Teachers are themselves taught in isolated disciplines in both content and methodologies in teacher training institutions. Teacher training institutions do not adequately prepare teachers to make the transition from an isolated subject-based curriculum to a more integrated one. Consequently, teachers have difficulty thinking in a holistic and integrated fashion.

2. Teachers are not provided adequate teacher in-service trainings on appropriate integration techniques and team building within the school. Consequently, teachers have difficulty in teaching integrated curricula.

3. Integration takes considerable time to develop. Many schools seeking a thematic approach to integration do not provide for adequate planning time to meet with other professionals and to do research on the theme strand. Attention given by schools to curricula reform tends to be superficial. This results in the teachers having difficulties in teaching integrated curricula.

4. The pedagogical thinking of thematic integration requires that teachers shift their traditional ways of teaching and assessment. Teachers must therefore be prepared to teach and assess the learning in new ways. In practice, this does not occur because most teaching continues in the traditional manner and, consequently, so does the testing. This results in an integrated curriculum not to be effectively taught.

Apart from these challenges, some studies in Africa on curriculum integration confirm the above challenges associated with thematic integration of curriculum. Examples of these studies are discussed below.

#### 2.2.4.3.2 Some studies on integrated curriculum

Teachers' perceptions and understandings of curriculum integration in Human and Social Sciences learning area in the South African National Curriculum Statement has been studied by Motara (2002). The study particularly sought to find out what and how secondary school teachers think about integration, how the teachers accommodate integration in their pedagogical approaches, the positive and encouraging experiences with integration and some of the challenges teachers encountered in teaching an integrated curriculum. The findings showed that half of the sample teaching Human and Social Sciences learning area perceived the integrated learning area as problematic for a number of reasons: the subjects in the learning area cannot be integrated as they are distinctive and well-established academic subjects which require their own significant methods and discourses; that integration lowers the status of a subject and that integrative pedagogy demanded additional work.

On the success side of the implementation of the Human and Social Sciences integrated learning area, Motara notes that the other half of the sample teaching Human and Social Sciences learning area were more open to integration. This openness arose from the teachers' long practical experience in teaching and their assertiveness to try new teaching approaches (Motara, 2002).

Teachers' perceptions of the Integrated Learning Areas for the junior secondary school curriculum of the South African National Curriculum Statement have been studied by Naidoo (2005). In the study, grade 9 teachers perceptions of and experiences with

integrated areas and the influencing factors for the teachers' perceptions and experiences were investigated. The findings showed that the majority of teachers perceived integrated Learning Areas as problematic for a range of reasons: the subjects are incommensurable and cannot be integrated; Learning Areas compromise the academic quality of each subject; the selection, sequencing and assessment of knowledge in an integrated framework is challenging; they lack confidence and ability to teach Learning Areas due to gaps in their own knowledge; and the insurmountable difficulties in organizing and planning the teaching of integrated lessons (Naidoo, 2005). On the success side of implementation of Integrated Learning Areas, Naidoo notes that a third of the teachers were more open to integration. This openness arose from the greater range of subjects studied and taught across their own educational careers; and to the opportunity for popular, community everyday knowledge to be valued in the classroom (Naidoo, 2005).

Basing on the findings of these studies, it is my assumption that teachers may be having successes or problems in teaching the Expressive Arts integrated curriculum which needs to be investigated through this study.

As indicated earlier, in addition to being informed by thematic integration principle, Expressive Arts is bound within the design principle of Outcomes Based Education. The Outcomes Based design principle of Expressive Arts is discussed next.

#### 2.2.4.4 Outcomes-based education defined

Outcomes-Based Education was postulated by William Spady, an American sociologist turned educator, in 1967 when he started lecturing at Harvard University. Around 1986, Spady started to think about outcomes and student success in ways that were distinctly different from the ways in which his colleagues were conceptualising them. Rather than thinking of student success in terms of improved test scores, Spady started to advocate the

idea that success should be measured in terms of outcomes - that is, what learners could demonstrate after their educational experiences were over (after they had finished school) rather than by an accumulation of things that could be demonstrated during their educational experiences. This future-focussed complex life-performance approach became the defining feature of Spady's approach to what he called "transformational outcomes-based education."

Transformational OBE was based on four principles which according to Spady, if 'applied consistently, systematically, creatively and simultaneously' (Spady, 1996, p.1) would ensure that all learners were equipped with the knowledge, competence and qualities necessary for successful fulfilment of their various life roles. These principles became known as (Spady, 1996, p.1): *clarity of focus, designing down, high expectations* and *expanded opportunity.* The child learns the skill in a hands-on way rather than an instructive performance-oriented way. This allows movement from simple to difficult in the child's learning.

Spady sees *clarity of focus* to mean that educators must establish a clear picture of the learning objectives they want learners to be able to demonstrate; make this their top priority in planning, teaching and assessment; share this outcome with learners; and maintain alignment between outcomes, teaching and assessment.

*Designing down* is to establish significant broad outcomes first, and then derive from them the enabling outcomes that will provide the foundation for achievement of the broader outcomes from general to specific.

The principle of *high expectations* according to Spady has two components: raising the level of performance of learners that is considered acceptable and giving all learners access to challenging high-level learning.

The concept of *expanded opportunity and support for learning success* implies an idea that time (hours of instruction, time tables, and the school calendar) should be used to organise and co-ordinate learning opportunities, but they should not define and limit learning. It also emphasizes the importance of teachers using different methods of instruction to accommodate learners' different modalities of learning.

When these principles are followed, Outcomes-based education means clearly focussing and organising everything in an educational system around what is essential for all learners to be able to do successfully at the end of their learning experiences.

It is quite clear from the above definition of Outcomes Based Education that the approach focuses on the learner and the results that he/she produces. Thus the two major principles of Outcomes- based Education are learner-centred approach to teaching and continuous assessment. These key principles are discussed in the next section.

#### 2.2.4.4.1 Learner-centred approach to teaching

A learner-centred approach refers to 'activities and efforts of teaching and learning that allows for learners' meaningful involvement in a lesson and at the same time are geared towards scaffolding and mediating the learners to meaningfully construct knowledge' (Du Plessis, et al, 2007, p. 42).

Mediation and scaffolding becomes the new roles that teachers should practise as they use learner-centred approach in Outcomes Based Education delivery.

Scaffolding refers to 'providing temporary, adjustable support and framework for learning' (ibid), while mediation means that 'something comes in between the learner and his/her learning to assist interpret and understand things they learn about' (ibid).

The learner-centred approach resembles a constructivist perspective on learning which assumes that learners must construct knowledge in their own mind; teachers cannot

simply give learners knowledge. What the teacher can do is to facilitate this process of knowledge construction by making information meaningful and relevant to students and creating opportunities for students to discover and apply ideas themselves (ibid). Constructivist theories imply that a far more active role is played by learners in their own learning. In order to facilitate discovery and comprehension of difficult concepts, and the solving of problems, extensive use is made of cooperative learning, with learners working in pairs and/or groups to assist each other through interaction, communication of ideas and providing immediate feedback to each other.

The above consideration of learner-centred approach which has been adopted in PCAR can present some serious challenges for teachers implementing the curriculum. This is mostly because it requires a paradigm shift from the old content-based curriculum practice, where the teacher was the centre of knowledge that could be transmitted to learners. In the content-based curriculum, learners were expected to acquire the transmitted knowledge which was basically rules and facts and being able to recall them. Learners had to master sufficiently the selected things for their subjects. Rote teaching and learning formed the basis of the content-based curriculum. In this type of learning, teachers were the sources of knowledge to learners but this is not the case with the new curriculum. We might assume that achieving the outcomes of the new curriculum might be a challenge for teachers as it requires a paradigm shift in curriculum practices. Practices of the content-based curriculum might persist during teaching in the Outcomes Based Education curriculum, and this might have an impact on the desired outcomes of this new curriculum. Continuous assessment which is another feature of the PCAR Outcomes Based curriculum is discussed next.

### 2.2.4.5 Continuous Assessment

A first issue is to clarify the concept .assessment'. Many effective definitions of assessment and related concepts have been stated by various scholars. Some of these definitions are explored here.

Withers (1994, p.13) defines *assessment* as 'to make a decision about something, to examine or test the performance of individuals; to evaluate or judge on the basis of criteria such as correctness, validity and empirical evidence; the process and outcome of assessing'. Similarly, McMillan (1997, p.5) defines assessment, in the context of the classroom, as 'the gathering, interpretation, and use of information to aid teacher decision making'.

The prevailing notions included in the above definitions of assessment are that assessment is a process that encompasses testing, measurement and evaluation and assessment leads to decision-making (Ward, 1980, p. 3). More recent definitions of assessment also focus on the idea that assessment leads to decision-making and that it is a continuous process. For example, Salvia and Yeseldyke (1995) state that 'assessment is a continuous process, performed to gain an understanding of an individual's strength and weakness in order to make appropriate educational decisions' ( p. 26).

A distinction is made between formative and summative assessment. The two assessments are distinguished according to their educational purposes. Formative assessment is usually integrated into the normal course of teaching and its purpose is to identify particular learners' difficulties with a view to providing appropriate subsequent opportunities for learners to develop their understandings. Summative assessment on the other hand gives learners marks and occurs at the end of a block, or period, of teaching. It aims to quantify

the extent to which the learner has mastered the material that has been taught and the success of the course (Gipps, 1994).

The new Outcomes based education curriculum in Malawi refers to formative assessment as continuous assessment. Malawi Ministry of Education (2005, p.3) defines continuous assessment as 'assessment in which learners have to be assessed in what they are able to do and display in each learning activity rather than assessing them at the end of the term or the year'. Continuous assessment thus differs from summative assessment in that it is conducted as the learning process takes place and is used to influence or inform the learning process. The assessment approach also involves more than one assessor. It includes teacher assessment, self-assessment and peer assessment. This means that the continuous assessment process includes judgment made about the learner's performance by the teacher, the learner himself or herself and other learners. Continuous assessment is therefore more challenging for teachers to apply successfully. Some of the challenges of continuous assessment as cited by Le Grange and Reddy include:

> Possible increase in both teacher and learner workload. This is because for teachers, extensive record keeping and monitoring of individual learners are required, and for learners because they are required to consciously assess their own work. When school work is done at home, the possibility of collusion among learners and assistance from experienced persons may occur and the assessment is then not an accurate reflection of the learner's abilities. Continuous assessment may be difficult to apply with large classes because it takes time to assess individual learners authentically (1998, p.11).

While a shift to continuous assessment in the new curriculum in Malawi may be argued to be a move in the right direction, as it can improve the quality of teaching and learning in

the classrooms, using continuous assessment might not be easy for teachers as it requires a paradigm shift in assessment practices. Studies done on continuous assessment in countries where the assessment approach has been introduced indicate that teachers using the assessment are having problems in applying it successfully. Some of the studies done on continuous assessment are outlined below.

#### 2.2.4.5.1 Some studies on continuous assessment

Continuous assessment policy implementation in government schools of Ondo state, Nigeria was studied by Adebowale (2008). The study examined the methods adopted by teachers in the implementation of the provisions of a continuous assessment policy.

The results of the study were that there is no agreement in terms of how regularly continuous assessment should be conducted. Twenty-nine percent of the respondents claimed that it should be done daily, while 31.6% said it is weekly, 28.1% said it is fortnightly, and 10.5% said it is term based. The researchers saw the confusion in four areas:

- How often the pupils were assessed
- How many of such assessment should be graded and weighted
- Calling the attention of pupils and parents to performance in continuous assessment
- The usage of other assessment tools apart from cognitive tests, assignment, and examinations is absent in the assessment; where it is present it is not included when the pupils assessment is combined.

The study concluded that implementers of continuous assessment policy in the schools studied do not understand the standard implementation practice of the policy. Teachers were practicing continuous assessment of pupils in different ways and manner and this may be attributed to some forms of confusion in the understanding of the policy.

In view of the findings of the study, the researcher recommended that simplified and concise interpretation of the continuous assessment policy provisions should be made into manuals, leaflets, and handbooks for distribution to teachers who are usually the implementers of most educational policies. Monitoring and supervision of the implementation of such policies should be stepped up and regular workshops and seminars should be organized for teachers in schools to further the knowledge and understanding of continuous assessment policies, programs, and implementation to neutralize confusion and misunderstanding.

Continuous assessment in Swaziland was studied by Nsibande (2006). The study investigated the extent to which primary school teachers understood and implemented the requirements of the continuous assessment programme that has been introduced in primary schools in Swaziland. By focussing on teaching and learning activities that occurred during eight teachers' lessons within the Salesian-Ekutsimuleni zone in Manzini, and what they expressed as intentions and justifications for these activities, the study tried to clarify, in particular, the relationship between their assessment strategies and the broader educational principles promoted by the programme. The methods used in the study were c*lassroom observations* and stimulated *interviews* which were used to capture, respectively, data on what teachers did and principles that informed their behaviour. The study found that though the teachers used assessment strategies promoted by the Continuous Assessment (CA) programme, their assessment strategies prioritized knowledge-retention rather than the cognitive development advocated by the programme and, in a specific sense, implied by lesson objectives they had to fulfil. The researcher concluded that teachers could not translate the rhetoric of the CA programme into relevant professional judgement, decisions and practices without exposure to meaningful development programmes. The researcher has recommended that the government of

Swaziland needs to intervene to ensure that the laudable goals of continuous assessment are achieved.

I therefore assume that Malawian teachers may not be implementing continuous assessment to the required standard expected by the Malawi Ministry of Education, and this will have an impact in teachers achieving the desired outcomes of this new curriculum. In this connection, the next sub-section explores the implementation strategy taken by PCAR. This is done to provide some background in this evaluation regarding effective implementation of the PCAR curriculum.

#### 2.2.4.6 Implementation of the PCAR

The Malawi Institute of Education calls the Malawi model of implementing the revised curriculum the 'Multiplier Effect Scheme'. This scheme was designed to communicate to teachers and primary education methods advisors what the curriculum review was all about and how they were to implement it. The model makes use of the structure of the primary education system in the diffusion and dissemination of the new curriculum.

The Primary education system is organised into four parts. The main controlling power is in the Ministry of Education headquarters. As regards to matters related to curriculum innovation, the Ministry operates in conjunction with the Malawi Institute of Education where curriculum activities for the schools are based. From the Ministry headquarters, the power is decentralised to the Regional Education Offices where there are regional education methods advisors. Each of the three regional offices forms a nucleus for administering all the district offices in their region. The district offices form a district power base with a district education manager under who is a team of methods advisors who provide a direct link between the district office and the schools. Then, there are the schools who report directly to the district office. It was, therefore, logical to base the

model for implementing the new curriculum on this structure of primary education. The primary methods advisors, who frequently interact with principals and teachers, were to be the most important intermediaries in the implementation process. The curriculum development process was already part of their responsibility in primary schools.

The implementation framework has two major parts, the Orientation workshops and a system through which new materials were to be distributed to schools.

#### 2.2.4.6.1 Orientation workshops

This was the main vehicle by which the curriculum was to be disseminated. People involved in this were to be all primary school education methods advisors and other administrators of primary education. A cascade model of training was adopted. A core team of trainers, consisting of national education methods advisors, Curriculum Specialists of MIE and administrators of primary education were first oriented to the curriculum. These people in turn trained primary education methods advisors. The primary education methods advisors oriented primary school principals and teachers to the curriculum. However, a coercive strategy was implicit in the scheme because it did not matter whether one attended the course or not, as they had to adopt and teach the new curriculum. The training workshops were meant to create a greater awareness and to provide the needed skills in implementing the new curriculum. In the training workshops, teachers are exposed to the new curriculum by the developers themselves. Training courses were mounted for all Standards (grades) 1- 8. Some of the objectives of these training workshops were:

a) Developing understanding of the rationale for the change.

The rationale for the curriculum was given above in section 3.2 of this chapter. It was argued then that the economic, social and political development had surpassed the

education development. Education was to be responsive to the current situation in Malawi. The new curriculum, therefore, was addressing the issue of improving the quality of education. Shortcomings of the old curriculum were given, and among them was that the old curriculum was overloaded in both the content and number of subjects. The orientation included this concept in order to sell the curriculum to teachers. The main aim was to appeal to the rationality of both teachers and primary education methods advisors so that they may realise the importance of the new curriculum in the way developers saw it.

b) Explaining the new methodologies of the new curriculum

Teachers had been used to a content-based curriculum where content, didactic or teacher-centred pedagogies and examinations at the end of the school term and school year were emphasized. This was different in the new curriculum where skills, facilitative pedagogies and continuous assessment were being emphasized. Where major changes in the content had been made, teachers needed to be informed and shown how to use the new syllabus and instructional materials.

c) Explaining the structure of the curriculum documents and teaching aids

For the proper use of the curriculum documents, teachers needed to know how they are structured. It was, therefore, necessary for curriculum developers to orientate teachers about the use of the documents.

d) Developing standard formats for schemes and records of work

It is a requirement in the teaching profession in Malawi that teachers plan their work in advance. This is done through the preparation of schemes of work, which may span the whole twelve-week term. Because the majority of primary teachers have low qualifications, the provision of a standard format for both the scheme and record of work

and lesson plans was seen by the curriculum developers to be of great significance. Orientation was to be achieved through training workshops in three phases.

i) Phase one

Workshops for phase one were organised and held at the Malawi Institute of Education. These workshops, of one-week duration, were intended to train those entrusted with the job of training others who in turn will train teachers and other implementation staff. The participants of these 'trainers of trainers' workshops included education methods advisors and primary school teachers.

ii) Phase two

Phase two workshops were to take place in zones. An educational zone may consist of more than twenty primary schools within any of the 28 administrative districts in Malawi. Each zone has its resident primary education advisor. Principals and at least eight teachers per school, each teacher representing each of the eight grades in the primary school cycle, from two or more zones, were invited to a central location for a week, to attend an orientation workshop taken by those trained during phase one workshops.

iii) Phase three

Phase four workshops were to be school-based. Principals and those teachers who attended phase one workshop had to train any colleagues who did not attend the workshop in cases where a school had more than one stream in some or all classes. At this phase, principals were free to invite their local primary education methods advisor to assist in the running of workshops if they deemed it necessary.

#### 2.2.4.6.2 Distribution of materials to schools

Distribution of books and other education materials has been a problem in Malawi for many years. Books have in the past been stacked in Regional or district education offices

while schools had serious shortages of books. The problem was the lack of transport to deliver the materials to schools. In order to hasten the implementation of the new curriculum, a new scheme was devised for book distribution to schools. Publishers or printers of the new materials deliver the books to the Supplies Unit which sends the books to the Regional Offices. Books are then sent to District education offices for distribution to schools. Where problems of transport exist in district offices, tenders were issued to private transporters to deliver the books to schools. The transport scheme has a problem because a number of remote schools are inaccessible to any type of vehicle. It is not clear how this was resolved.

#### 2.2.4.6.3. Resources for reviewing and implementing the new curriculum

Resources needed for the implementation of the new curriculum may be divided broadly into two; human and financial. Human resources were available at MIE, Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MoEST) and other related educational institutions such as the University of Malawi and the Malawi National Examinations Board (MANEB).

Financial resourcing was perhaps the more difficult of the two. The major part of financing the curriculum review was provided by the British Department for International Development (DFID), United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and other international agencies such as the German Technical Co-operation (GTZ).

This framework for implementing the new curriculum was meant to be a major communication system between the MIE and the primary education system, in particular the teachers and primary education advisors. But it is recognized that this framework may have barriers that inhibit the implementation of the curriculum innovation. Some of these barriers are discussed in the next chapter.

### 2.2.5 Closing remarks

This chapter provided the background to PCAR, which is the curriculum under study, against the just phased out 1991 curriculum. The chapter discussed the process and rationale that resulted in the decision to revise the 1991 primary curriculum and to produce the PCAR.

The shortcomings of the old curriculum prompted the development of the new curriculum with the main objective of improving the standard of education. The old curriculum did not adequately meet the needs of the rapidly developing and democratic society of Malawi. The new curriculum was designed to provide skills to enable all primary school leavers to function adequately within their communities. Major challenges experienced in some educational systems in using integrated curricula, outcomes based education and continuous assessments have been presented. An important issue raised is how effectively teachers use the Expressive Arts curriculum, designed around the above concepts, and the extent to which teachers are able to implement it successfully.

# CHAPTER 3
# CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

## 3.1 Introduction

This chapter discusses the conceptual frameworks which guided this study. A conceptual framework is a system of concepts, assumptions, expectations, beliefs and theories that supports and informs a particular research (Maxwell, 1998).

The chapter is divided into five main parts. Since this study focuses on curriculum evaluation, an attempt is therefore made in the first part of this chapter to explore the meaning of curriculum evaluation. The second part discusses evaluation models which are deemed relevant to the present study. This is done in a bid to produce an evaluation approach that could be used for this study. The third part provides an approach, drawn from the evaluation models discussed, for this present study. The fourth part reviews some studies which have used or have been guided by the main evaluation framework of this study. This is done in a bid to identify the 'gap' in the literature on Illuminative evaluation which this present study attempts to address. The last part discusses the additional framework which was used to guide evaluation of specific aspects of the enacted curriculum.

## 3.2 Curriculum evaluation frameworks

In this study, curriculum is defined as

> An attempt to communicate the essential principles and features of an educational proposal in such a form that it is open to critical scrutiny and capable of effective translation into practice (Stenhouse 1976, p.4).

Stenhouse's definition suggests that a curriculum has three components: a written document following piloting and development, wide implementation in schools, and

formal evaluation about whether it has been effective. Evaluation is inbuilt into the definition of curriculum, and it follows that adjudicating worth or attributing value to a curriculum ordinarily/customary follows implementation with the view to diagnosing needs, identifying problems and improvement of the implementation.

The term 'evaluation' has proved to be difficult to define. Although evaluators have attempted to provide definitions of the term, their definitions have however tended to emphasize their theoretical and practical inclinations. Definitions of evaluation differ in level of abstraction and often reflect the specific concerns of the people who formulate them. Nevertheless, definitions are provided for convenience; to guide an evaluation process at a particular moment. It is for this reason that I examine some definitions of curriculum evaluation with the aim of defining the scope of my study.

Evaluation is defined as 'the collection and use of information to make decisions about an educational programme' by Cronbach (1963). He was advocating an action-oriented evaluation where data from various sources of the educational programme were to be used for decision-making. But he did not say who should make the decisions. It appears, however, that Cronbach's major question was not who the decision-makers are, but what are the types of decisions for which evaluation data is being collected?

Following Cronbach's action-oriented approach, MacDonald and Walker (1976), define evaluation in terms of the role an evaluator should play in evaluating an educational programme. They argue that the role of an evaluator should include the identification of those who will have to make judgments and decisions about the programme. The evaluator's role, they say, would be to place before decision makers those facts of the case which are recognised by them as relevant to their concern. With this view, MacDonald and Walker define evaluation as

> …the process of conceiving, obtaining and communicating information for guidance of educational decision making with regards to a specific programme (p.1-2).

This study intends to subscribe to Cronbach's and MacDonald and Walker's interpretations of evaluation in that the evaluation findings of this study about how teachers teach Expressive Arts learning area will be made available to the developers of the curriculum for subsequent action and other education stakeholders for information. Expert advice will also be provided to the Malawi Institute of Education, the national curriculum development centre and the Ministry of Education for subsequent curriculum and assessment projects.

Other definitions of evaluation range from those given by Hamilton (1976), Adelman and Alexander (1982), Worthen and Sanders (1987), to some of the most recent ones such as that given by Rogers and Badham (1992). I will consider each of these scholar's definitions in turn, and where possible discuss how this study subscribes to these definitions.

One definition of curriculum evaluation reads

> It is the process or processes used to weigh relative merits of those educational alternatives which, at any given times, are deemed to fall within the domain of curriculum practice (Hamilton, 1976, p.4).

Another definition of curriculum evaluation is that it is the making of judgment about the worth and effectiveness of educational intentions, processes and outcomes, about the relationships between these, and about the resource planning and implementation frameworks for such ventures (Adelman and Alexander, 1982). In this definition, there are a number of dimensions of evaluation. First, by making judgment implies that

evaluators are engaged in forming opinions about something based on available information. Second, the opinion is formed about the value of something. Third, educational evaluation is concerned with education aims, activities and experiences and the products. Fourth, evaluators have to compare and contrast the aims, processes and outcomes including the management of the whole programme. This study intends to subscribe to Adelman and Alexander (1982) interpretations of evaluation in that the evaluation of Expressive Arts will involve comparing the aims of the Expressive Arts learning area and the processes and the outcomes (how the programme is working out) on the ground.

Another definition says that curriculum evaluation is 'the process of systematically collecting and analysing information in order to form value judgements based on firm evidence' (Rogers and Badham, 1992, p.3). From this definition, four characteristics of evaluation can be drawn as follows; first, evaluation is based on systematic procedures that help to obtain precise information. Second, evaluation relies on interpretation of evidence, which is critical to validating the information. Third, judgment of value is another key element of evaluation that takes evaluation beyond the level of mere description of what is happening. Fourth, evaluation is more than a collection of information. It is conducted with the view of taking action.

Yet another definition is that curriculum evaluation

> Is the act of rendering judgment to determine value, worth and merit – without questioning or diminishing the important role it plays in decision-making and political activities (Worthen and Sanders, 1987, p.24).

This indicates that curriculum evaluation is about adjudication of worth. It deals with making judgments in order to give value to a curriculum. Broadly speaking, adjudication

of the worth refers to judgments made by an evaluator about the success or failure of a curriculum. This might include adjudications on whether a curriculum is implemented as intended in terms of the principles informing it, or about relative merit of a curriculum, or to improve a curriculum for its goodness between the statements of content to be learnt and its actual accomplishment.

The fact that evaluators cannot agree on the precise meaning of the term "evaluation" demonstrates that the term itself can be used in a variety of ways. This difficulty was evident during the Churchill Conference of Evaluators (1972) at which evaluators from United States, Sweden and Britain met at Churchill College, Cambridge and produced a manifesto which Stenhouse (1976) suggested marked a new wave of evaluation and evaluators. However, there was no absolute consensus on some of the issues pertaining to the definition of evaluation and what it entails (Nyirenda, 1993).

Curriculum evaluation can be done through various qualitative approaches. The qualitative approaches to evaluation emphasize understanding the object of investigation, a curriculum for example from 'emic' or 'insider' perspective as opposed to 'etic' or evaluator's perspective. To elicit informants' views about the object of investigation, evaluators spend extended periods of time on site to investigate issues in some depth describing what actually happens in sites with the evaluator's voice being one of many, not sole or dominant in evaluation. The evaluator brokers multiple views of informants about the object of evaluation to contribute to decision-making (Basson, 2006). Qualitative approaches to evaluation thus differ from quantitative evaluation in that qualitative approaches seek in-depth description of the programme using human and cultural evidence, rather than scientific evidence. These qualitative approaches to curriculum evaluation are discussed next.

## 3.3 Evaluation Models

Just as it is difficult to come up with a clear definition of evaluation to which most evaluators subscribe, it has similarly been difficult to select the most appropriate model of curriculum evaluation for this present study. There are a variety of models in the evaluation literature and none seem to be obviously the most appropriate. In this thesis, eight are discussed. The choice of these models is based on the fact that they are relevant to the present study.

With the large flow of funds into curriculum research and development in the fifties and sixties, curriculum evaluation opened itself up as a new and rich territory for exploration and debates on evaluation started to develop. It is perhaps proper to start with the initial model from which debates on evaluation models developed, the 'objectives model'.

### 3.3.1 Objectives Model

The objectives model of evaluation was developed by Tyler (1949). Its name is derived from the use of behavioural objectives. This model has been very influential in planning curriculum reforms in both America and Britain and most subsequent approaches to curriculum evaluation have been influenced by it. Tyler's model (1949), and later that of Wheeler (1967), sought to measure the extent to which the stated objectives of a programme had been achieved. Tyler believed in behavioural objectives. In his 1949 monograph, he provides the basic principles of the curriculum and instruction by a definition of the behavioural objectives as follows:

> ...one can define an objective with sufficient clarity if he can describe or illustrate the kind of behaviour that the student is expected to acquire so that one could recognise such behaviour if he saw it (Tyler, 1949, p.59-60).

Tyler believed the process of evaluation to be essentially that of determining whether the educational objectives were actually being realised by the programme of curriculum and instruction. However, since educational objectives are often essentially after changes in human behaviour, he argues that the objectives will provide desirable changes in the behaviour pattern of the student. Evaluation is therefore defined by Tyler as 'the processes of determining the degree to which these changes in behaviour are actually taking place' (Tyler, 1949, p.59-60). According to the objectives model of evaluating a curriculum, evaluation follows several sequential steps:

i) Secure agreement on the aims of the curriculum.

ii) Express aims as explicit learning behaviour objectives.

iii) Devise and provide experiences that seem likely to enable the learners to behave in the desired way.

iv) Assess the congruence of pupils' performance and objectives.

v) Vary the treatment until behaviour matches objectives.

These five categories of Tyler's model suggest the administration of a measuring device to determine the attainment of objectives: pre- and post-tests. In this study, such devices are considered inappropriate because of the difficulty of being reliable, and also the curriculum is already being implemented. Consequently, the administration of pre-and post-tests is not an option in this study. However, the Malawi curriculum review is based on the objectives model. This was done in order to provide a centralised curriculum which also provides the what and how to teach for the teachers. During the last three decades, the objectives model has come under severe criticism from some curriculum evaluators. The criticisms have mainly been based on the simplistic nature and scope of the objectives approach to education. Although Tyler (1949) claimed that, for objectives to be used properly for evaluation purposes, they had to be defined in specific and measurable terms,

this was not always possible. Accurate descriptions of terminal behaviour resulting from learning experiences were sometimes difficult to formulate. Scriven (1967) adds that the Tyler model did not deal with the occurrence of unplanned or unintended events and hence proposed a 'goal free' evaluation in which evaluators made a deliberate attempt to avoid learning programme goals. However, criticisms of the Tyler model did not end with Scriven. Stake (1967) criticized Tyler's model for its emphasis on the outcome of the programme. He proposed a countenance model of evaluation. Stufflebeam (1971) developed the CIPP (Content, Input, Process and Product) evaluation model. Thus many curriculum developers and evaluators, during the curriculum innovations of the 1960s, wondered whether it was really necessary to have objectives explicitly specified in behavioural terms. Stenhouse (1976) felt that objectives were too simplistic when looking at the complexities of the educational process. He claimed that the learner and the teacher, along with the contextual conditions, which in most cases differ from place to place, were also worthy of study. Such aspects had received little attention in the objectives model because they were the unintended or unplanned outcomes of the educational programme. The objectives model was therefore considered to be incapable of reflecting the multivariate nature of the curriculum processes. The approach does not show how pupils learn and why they learn some things and not others. Some in-depth understanding of curriculum evaluation was required and Stake (1967) proposed a 'Panoramic view finder' to take into account the full countenance of the curriculum processes. Parlett and Hamilton (1976) referred to the objectives model as the 'Agriculture-Botany' paradigm. Students, rather like plants, are given pre-tests and then subjected to different experiences. After a period of time, their achievement is measured to indicate the relative efficiency of the method used. Parlett and Hamilton argued that studies of this nature are designed to yield

objective numerical data which permits statistical analysis. Therefore, they leveled the following five criticisms at the objectives model:

1. The agricultural-botany approach entails major data collection using large samples and is therefore expensive in the use of resources.
2. It fails to acknowledge the fact that innovatory programmes undergo changes during the period of study. Evaluators using the objectives model face difficulties in trying to adapt to changed circumstances when they arise.
3. Since the approach concentrates on seeking quantitative information, it tends to neglect other data which perhaps are salient to the innovation, sometimes being regarded as subjective and impressionistic.
4. As an approach of this type employs large samples and statistical generalizations it tends to be insensitive to local perturbations and unusual effects.
5. The objectives model of evaluation fails to concern itself with the question of feelings and attitudes of participants and other interested parties in the programme. Those using objectives model are interested in objective data.

A number of evaluation approaches have emerged since Tyler's objectives model. These include the 'goal free' approach (Scriven, 1967), the 'countenance model' (Stake, 1967), the 'CIPP model' (Stufflebeam, 1971) and the 'illuminative evaluation' (Parlett and Hamilton, 1972). These will now be discussed in the following sections in relation to the intended design of the current evaluation study.

### 3.3.2 Goal-Free Evaluation

'Goal-free' evaluation (GFE) was developed by Scriven (1977) who argued that an evaluator needs to study the programme's effects, intended or unintended, and unhampered by contact with statements of intent produced by the programme builders. He

drew an analogy of the evaluator acting like a hunter. The evaluator hunts on his own. He goes over the ground, carefully looking for any signs of the game. In his evaluation model, Scriven indicated that evaluation studies might attempt to answer specific questions about certain entities. Such questions would be for example, 'how well does this programme perform?' and 'is it worth what it is costing?' (Scriven, 1967). Probably the most important contribution Scriven has made to the evaluation practice was the question of the time at which these specific questions about the worth and merit of a programme are posed. He claimed that questions concerning the merit of a programme can be asked during or after the development of the programme. In the first case, evaluation would provide information through empirical means to the developer and enable him/her to correct the faults detected in the programme. Hence came up with the notion of 'formative evaluation'. In the second case, evaluation was conducted after programme development and was intended to assess the worth and merit of the programme. This is now similar to Tyler's (1949) model and Scriven (1967) called it 'summative evaluation.' The present study will follow the formative approach.

### 3.3.3 Countenance Model of Educational Evaluation

The countenance model of evaluation acknowledges the variety of activities and the different viewpoints of people in an educational programme. It attempts to respond to the complex and dynamic nature of the education process (Stake, 1967). The evaluator is seen as a processor of information for judgment. Stake (1967) views an evaluator in this context as a communicator of data, or information, but not a judge.

He points out that

> …a responsibility for processing is much more acceptable to an evaluation specialist than one for rendering judgment himself" (Stake, 1967, p.149).

He criticised the deficiencies of evaluation activities in the 1960's, which he considered were using informal evaluation methods, and which he argued were inadequate because they depended too much on casual observation and subjective judgments. He also argued that formal evaluation methods were lacking because they did not address important questions. Stake (1967) called for an increased use of formal methods to enable relevant data to be collected which match educators' intentions and classroom transactions. Stake (1967) focused on two countenances, description and judgment. This was an important development over Tyler's model because it provided an expanded data-base which now included antecedents, contextual factors and teachers' inputs. The countenance model represented an organizational framework for evaluation. Each of the matrices has subdivisions relating to the antecedents, transactions and outcomes.

The starting point is the determination of the intents of a particular curriculum, which must be listed in terms of the antecedents, according to Stake. The antecedents relate to any conditions existing prior to the teaching and learning which relate to the outcome of the programme. The status of the students, the teachers, and the resources are taken into consideration when working out the antecedents.

Transactions are encounters between students and the manner teachers translate curriculum materials in the classroom as prescribed by curriculum developers. The preparation of schemes of work and lesson plans, the use of suggested methods and teaching artifacts are among the many encounters that teachers experience with the materials. Stake (1967) argues that traditionally, most attention in formal evaluation has been given to outcomes such as 'abilities, achievements, attitudes and aspirations of students resulting from educational experience.' Two principal ways of processing descriptive evaluation data are suggested. These are the congruence between the intentions and the observations and the contingencies. The data for a curriculum are congruent if

what was intended actually happens. To be fully congruent, the intended antecedents, transactions and outcomes would have to come to pass but this seldom happens. Within the row of the data matrix, Stake (1967) argues that the evaluator should compare the cells containing intents and observations to note discrepancies and to describe the amount of congruence for that row.

In this model, the other concept in the congruencies also relate to antecedents, transactions and outcomes. The relation between these may be logical or empirical. Stake (1967) argues that, for the practitioner, the intents in the main are logical intuitive and is supported by experience and satisfaction. The data in countenance model of evaluation could be obtained through the application of questionnaires and psychometric tests.

The countenance model appears to be based on the objectives model. The only difference with Tyler's model is that Stake (1967) provides an extended database and includes in the model a framework of reference and standards for judgment. This model also has shortcomings. The first is that the amount of data would be overwhelming if the model were adopted wholesale. Because of the limited resources in most evaluation studies, adopting this model as it stands would probably lead to something of a wild goose chase. However, 'those who seriously believe that the objectives-achievement ought to be a key element in the evaluation of educational programmes must reckon with a major task, namely, to determine whether objectives, in fact, have been achieved' (Wolf, 1979).

The focus of this evaluation is not so much on the students but rather on teachers. It focuses on the way teachers teach the new curriculum and, consequently, the outcomes in this case relate to the congruence between the intentions of the developers and what teachers are able to do in their teaching. This means that the evaluation approach used in this study has utilized some elements of Countenance Model of Educational Evaluation.

### 3.3.4 The CIPP Model of Evaluation

Stufflebeam (1971) developed what was called the Context, Inputs, Process and Product (CIPP) evaluation model. He argues that the model's key emphasis is on decision-making. Stufflebeam viewed evaluation as the process of delineating information, then obtaining that information and interpreting it in such a way that the decision maker can best put it to use. Stufflebeam developed four components to evaluation:

1. *Context evaluation.* This involves diagnosing the problems of an education programme, and the needs and unmet opportunities are identified. The setting, history, and social environment in which the programme exists are analysed. This contextual information then serves as a basis for developing goals and objectives that will result in improvement of the programme. This resembles Stake's (1967) countenance model where he considers antecedents.

2. *Inputs evaluation.* This involves providing information concerning the ways to use resources to achieve programme goals by identifying strategies for achieving programme objectives and designs for implementing the strategy are chosen. The potential of these strategies to meet programme objectives is then assessed. As this present study does not deal with the assessment and management of resources, again this part of the CIPP model is inappropriate.

3. *Process evaluation*. This occurs once the programme is put into operation. Process evaluation concentrates on implementation, monitoring potential sources of failure and building up interpretative descriptions of the process and account of what actually happens. The activities involved in the implementation of a programme are closely monitored to provide feed back to decision makers, who can then make modifications and improve program functioning. It is interesting to contrast this notion of process (also

known as formative) evaluation with Tyler's objectives evaluation or 'Agriculture botany' as a research paradigm. In the latter, experiments are done. To run an experiment correctly, the independent variable has to be held constant; tampering with it is discouraged. In contrast, process evaluation provides corrective feedback which can be implemented during the evaluation of the programme. So process evaluation involves determining how the programme is working out or being implemented, including the barriers threatening the programme's success. This model is very similar to Stake's (1967) model. The countenance model talks about transactions; what actually happens when pupils and teachers interact with all aspects involved in the implementation of the educational process. This is an important factor in the CIPP evaluation model. It is concerned with the actual processes in the learning situations. This type of evaluation strategy might be useful to the Malawi situation.

4. *Product evaluation.* This involves measuring or examining the results of the programme and what to be done to the programme at the end of the programme. Product evaluation includes defining objectives and the measurement of criteria associated with objectives. Product evaluation reports on whether objectives were attained or not. The strength of this model lies in the recognition of the role of context in which an education programme operates.

Nevertheless, the context is many times so fluid that it becomes difficult to evaluate. The CIPP model has an element of the objectives model, i.e. the Product component. This is similar to Tyler's objectives model in that it assesses the attainment of objectives and this has little relevance to this study. In Britain, during the curriculum reforms of the 1960's, curriculum developers and evaluators produced different strategies for evaluating the implementation of curriculum reforms. The Tyler model, as was the case in America, was considered inappropriate. Hence, Elliot Eisner (1967), Parlett and Hamilton (1976), Patton

(1975), Wolcott (1988) and Fetterman (1999) developed some evaluation models which were deemed appropriate for providing evidence during implementation of new curricula. These models are discussed in brief in the following section. Perhaps one of the most prominent of these models however was Illuminative Evaluation model which was developed by Parlett and Hamilton (1972). This model has been chosen as the main Conceptual Framework for this study.

### 3.3.5 Connoisseurship Evaluation Model

Elliot Eisner (1967) proposed *Connoisseurship* model of evaluation. He argued that evaluation should illuminate what goes on in school through 'cricitism' (disclosure) approach as a set of methods that can complement the objective procedures of evaluation. Eisner (1967) stressed that educational 'criticism' (disclosure) aims not only at revealing from an intellectual point of view the meanings of what might occur in the classroom, but also at using language in a way so vivid that it enables the reader to participate vicariously in the quality of life that characterizes the events being described. This 'thick description' of the meaning or significance of behaviour as it occurs in the classroom provides for better understanding by practitioners, decision and policy makers of the range of educational styles possible in teaching, in organizing classrooms and schools, in using curriculum materials, and in providing educational activities.

### 3.3.6 Empowerment Evaluation

Empowerment evaluation was proposed by Fetterman (1999). The model emphasizes on self-adjudication or self-assessment of object of investigation by evaluees to improve innovation coached by an evaluator guiding improvement within a wider process of participation and collaboration. Thus empowerment evaluation goes beyond giving evaluees a voice as in illuminative evaluation. It emphasizes procedures that will enhance

the use of evaluation to a broader spectrum of identified stakeholders. At the heart of empowerment evaluation is evaluator's obligation to try and help evaluees to ensure that utilization of investigation findings of an innovation takes place. The evaluator thus becomes proactive and not satisfied with an evaluation that will simply be put on a shelf. In order for the evaluator to make the evaluation more potentially utilizable, he/she first of all seeks out individuals who are likely to be primary or real users of the evaluation, those who have the responsibility to apply evaluative findings and implement recommendations. The evaluator then works with these identified primary intended users to help them determine what kind of evaluation they need. By actively involving primary-intended users, the evaluator trains users to use the evaluation and reinforces the intended utility of the evaluation every step of the way.

### 3.3.7 Ethnographic Evaluation

Ethnographic evaluation emphasizes on an in-depth study, to uncover what the issues are in the object of investigation, how they got that way, and what to do about them (Wolcott, 1988). Thus description in ethnographic evaluation is invariably in-depth, where an issue is pursued ideally over many months. At the heart of ethnographic evaluation is a cultural perspective for evaluating innovations. The evaluator presents the 'insider' view on a curriculum and using, as far as possible, their categories, their thoughts, beliefs and views, rather than the categories and views of the evaluator. This perspective reveals the human face of evaluees, and treats curriculum as human endeavor (Basson, 2006).

The review of evaluation models above has revealed that there are common features running through the different models. One feature that is common to all of them is the fact that they are not particularly suitable for a single researcher. The Countenance and CIPP evaluation models for example require extensive data collection that would be difficult for a single researcher to manage. Consequently, they require a considerable amount of

resources, financial and otherwise over a long period of time. In a study like this one, where there are strict financial and time constraints, it would be futile to contemplate such an undertaking.

Another fact is that these models seem to form a very close family of evaluation models. There is overlap between them. All of them seem to have some resemblance to the Tyler model. The countenance and CIPP models have an element of Tyler's objective model which has focus on measuring the product of an educational programme.

This study does not address either the outcome of the new curriculum, or the students' learning outcomes. The focus of the study is on the evaluation of the process of implementation of an educational reform. The study does not intend to judge the merit of the reform in order to continue or discontinue the reform. Instead, it focuses on the process, unveiling the strengths and weaknesses of the process, in order to provide some policy recommendation for improving the implementation process, especially at classroom level. The study follows the following approach in the data collection process:

- *Intentions of the curriculum review process.* This includes the rationale of the reform and what the reform intend to achieve in the immediate and remote future. This data was mainly collected through official government curriculum documents. This reflects Stakes' antecedents and the CIPP contexture.

- *Preparation for the reform.* This considers the preparation made for the reforms and how these preparations were carried out. This involves production procedures, training of teachers and all those involved in the reforms.

- *Classroom interactions.* This entails interactions that take place between the teachers and the new curriculum materials and how teachers are able to use the materials in the classroom. This again relates to Stake's transactions in the countenance model, and the

process in the CIPP model. But it strongly reflects the learning milieu of the Illuminative evaluation.

Consequently, this study will predominantly use the illuminative evaluation approach (see below) in the data collection process although elements of other models, such as the Countenance model, will be utilized in the study. This pragmatic approach in carrying out the data collection is illustrated in some of the illuminative evaluation studies reviewed in section 3.4 of this chapter. These studies have revealed that most of an eclectic approach to evaluation lies in its provision for cross-checking data from various methods.

### 3.3.8 Illuminative evaluation

Illuminative evaluation is claimed to belong to the anthropological research paradigm where the approach entails an intensive study of the whole programme. It is an approach to evaluation that seeks to address and illuminate a complex array of questions about the implementation of innovative educational project: how it operates, how it is influenced by the various school situations in which it is applied, what those directly concerned regard as its advantages and disadvantages, and how students' intellectual experiences are most affected. It aims to discover and document what it is like to be participating in the programme, whether as teachers or pupils; and, in addition, to discern and discuss the innovation's most significant features and recurring issues (Tuah, 1982).

Illuminative evaluation was developed by Parlett and Hamilton (1976) as a reaction to the objectives or traditional model of evaluation. Parlett and Hamilton (1976) referred to the objectives model as the 'agriculture-botany' paradigm (p.86-88). The most common form of 'agriculture-botany' type of evaluation is assessment of an innovation by examining whether or not it has reached required standards on pre-specified criteria. Students, rather like crops, are given pre-tests (the seedlings are weighed or measured) and then subjected

to different experiences (treatment conditions). Subsequently, after a period of time, their attainment (growth or yield) is measured to indicate the relative efficiency of the methods (fertilizers) used. Parlett and Hamilton argued that studies of this nature are designed to yield objective numerical data which permits statistical analysis only. Parlett and Hamilton argued that 'agricultural-botany' with its emphasis on outcome measures, failed to give evaluators and curriculum developers an understanding of the causes of failure of a programme. The approach does not show how pupils learn and why they learn some things and not others. Parlett and Hamilton therefore developed a new, non-traditional mode of curriculum evaluation known as Illuminative evaluation.

Drawing from anthropology, Illuminative evaluation focuses attention on describing classroom practice as it actually occurs, to match descriptions against what was intended and recorded in the curriculum blueprint as ground for adjudication. It also focuses on issues which emerge during an evaluation to progressively focus on them for further in-depth investigation and understand what is explicit and what may be hidden in a curriculum (Basson, 2006). This approach to evaluation takes into account the wider contexts in which educational innovations function. It is primarily concerned with description and interpretation of contexts of educational innovations. Parlett and Hamilton (1976, p.89) claim that

> The aims of illuminative evaluation are to study the innovatory project: how it operates; how it is influenced by the various school situations in which it is applied; what those directly concerned regard as its advantages and disadvantages. It aims to discover and document what it is like to participate in the scheme, whether as a teacher or pupil; and in addition, to discern and discuss the innovations' most significant features.

In Illuminative evaluation, the basic role of the evaluator is that of an information broker for the diverse stakeholder groups. Evaluators participate in the evaluation process as one voice amongst many rather than being privileged (Basson, 2006). The evaluator thus hangs out with those 'within' the school (students and teachers) to pick up how they think and feel about the innovation. That is, the observations made by the evaluator provide views or feelings of the insider – the 'emic' perspective.' The 'emic' perspective is concerned with accounts, descriptions, and analyses of an innovation regarded as appropriate by the members or the participants under study.

Illuminative evaluation is informed by two concepts: 'the instructional system' and 'the learning milieu'. Its first concept, the 'instructional system', refers to what have been planned and written up in documents to guide teaching and learning. These documents include syllabuses, teachers' and pupils' books, and all other relevant teaching and learning materials. An illuminative evaluator would study all documents relating to the instructional system in order to get an idea of what the programme is about and how it operates. In the case of Expressive Arts, the documents making the instructional system are Expressive Arts teachers' guide, learners' textbook and the Ministry of Education's policy document (the Primary Curriculum and Assessment Reform Framework) from which the teachers' guide and the learners' textbooks have been derived.

However, Parlett and Hamilton assert that the curriculum undergoes modification in the process of being implemented in a complex and naturally existing context. Elements of the curriculum can be emphasized or de-emphasised, expanded or truncated, as teachers and students interpret and reinterpret the instructional system for their particular setting. Thus the programme objectives may be reordered, redefined, abandoned or forgotten (Parlett and Hamilton, 1976). The fact that the curriculum is transformed in the process of being implemented in a complex existing context necessitates the need for an evaluator also to

study the context in which the curriculum is being implemented to establish how the context influences the enactment of the curriculum. Parlett and Hamilton (1976) refer to the context as the 'learning milieu'. Thus, the second concept of illumination, the 'learning milieu', refers to what teachers and learners actually do in classrooms. Unlike traditional or agricultural-botany evaluation, Illuminative evaluation model attempts to take account of those factors which may affect the way a curriculum is put into practice. Some of these factors include:

- organisational imperatives and constraints such as administrative and financial considerations
- teaching methods and the assessment of students
- individual teacher characteristics such as professional orientation, experience, and private goals
- students' perspectives and preoccupations (Parlett and Hamilton, 1976, p.4)

In one's attempt to evaluate how an innovation is working out, or in the case of this study how teachers of Expressive Arts put the curriculum documents into practice, it is essential to acknowledge the diversity and complexity of the learning milieu as Parlett and Hamilton (1976, p.12) explain

> The introduction of an innovation sets off a chain of repercussions throughout the learning milieu. In turn these unintended consequences are likely to affect the innovation itself, changing its form and moderating its impact.

The 'learning milieu' is the primary source of data in Illuminative evaluation. The data takes the form of a record of what teachers say and do in lessons accessed through naturalistic observation, coupled with probing interviews. In agricultural-botany evaluations, what actually happened to an innovation in classrooms was of less concern

than an emphasis on rigour achieved by manipulating the learning environment for evaluation (Basson, 2006). When written up, observation data takes the form of description, portraying classroom practices as these occur naturally and presenting them as human phenomena, sequentially or as emerging themes (Basson, 2006).

Illuminative evaluation uses four methods of collecting data. These methods of gathering data are used within social anthropological framework. These methods are as follows;

*1 Observing*

This involves familiarisation of day-to-day observation in a real setting in order for the evaluator to build up a continuous record of on-going events, transactions and informal remarks to isolate significant remarks. The evaluator at this stage makes use of the classroom and interviews teachers and students to get data.

Like most ethnographers, the evaluator would need sufficient time to acquaint her or himself with the participants in order to make natural and unobtrusive observations of and about the innovation. The basic idea is for the investigator to hang out with those 'within' the school (students and teachers) to pick up how they think and feel about the innovation. That is, the observations should provide authentic views or feelings of the insider – the *emic perspective.* The emic perspective is concerned with 'accounts, descriptions, and analyses of an innovation regarded as meaningful and appropriate by the members or the participants under study. An emic construct is correctly termed 'emic' only if it is in accord with the perceptions and understandings deemed appropriate by the participants under study' (Pike, 1954).

In illuminative evaluation, interviews and observations that do not obtain emic accounts and descriptions may not to be illuminating the innovation. Such tools may probably still be deemed 'agricultural-botany' tools of measurement disguised as qualitative and

illuminative means of gathering information. Because the illuminator is interested in 'emic' accounts of the curriculum innovation, which could be emergent, and could not have been predicted at the outset, the evaluator's questions guiding inquiry are flexible and adaptable. Lodico *et al*. (2006) sheds more light on illuminative evaluation questions. He argues that

> Questions may be modified throughout the course of the study. This is why questions in illuminative evaluation are called foreshadowed questions as they are supposed to guide [in the initial stages] the collection of data without predetermining the outcomes (p. 58-59).

In the 'agricultural-botany' research paradigm on the other hand, questions that predetermine the outcomes are set, and anything that falls outside the line of questioning is irrelevant and not considered. This is regardless of the importance of the emergent issues which may crop up pertaining to the innovation and the people it affects in the course of interviews and observations of the evaluator.

While any plan is better than no plan in research, in illuminative evaluation however, the evaluator expects that emerging issues will call for change or even abandoning of initially planned questions, and observation guidelines.

*2 Inquiring*

This involves the evaluator selecting a number of occurrences for more sustained and intensive inquiry. The major method used by the evaluator at this stage to collect information or data is through observations directed at more specific activities on which teachers and pupils are more focused.

*3 Seeking general principles*

This involves the evaluator placing of individual findings within a broader explanatory category. The evaluators' research methods at this stage are continued observation, interviews and questionnaire.

4 *Analysis of documentary and background information*

This stage may provide useful insights for example on the history of the programme,

and may uncover specific areas for inquiry.

Illuminative evaluation thus seeks out to compare the instructional system and learning milieu through detailed description. This refers to finding out how the intended curriculum compares with what actually happens in classrooms. Examples of studies which have used illuminative evaluation and what they have shown are discussed next.

### 3.4 Illuminative evaluation studies

Illuminative evaluation has widely been adapted for its utility in evaluation research both in Africa and internationally since its promulgation by Parlett and Hamilton (1976). A Google scholar search indicated 4,630 studies adopting the approach for evaluation. The approach has mainly been applied in the field of education because it helps an evaluator to see both what is explicit as well as what is 'hidden', to refine and improve a situation in education innovations.

Studies which have used principles of illuminative evaluation to ground their enquiry have revealed that frequently, there are matches and mismatches or a gap between the intentions of programmes and what happens in the actual implementation of a programme. This study was conceived out of the assumption that teachers may or may not be teaching

Expressive Arts as intended by the national government, hence my attempt to establish, using tools of illuminative evaluation, if the learning area at this early stage is being implemented more or less as intended. Illuminative evaluation studies done in Malawi and internationally have also shown that they used more than one method in carrying out the evaluation. This review intends to enable an understanding of some methods that can be employed to evaluate Expressive Arts. Some of the studies which have used the principles of this evaluation approach to evaluate curriculum change in Malawi, some other countries in Africa and internationally follow.

### 3.4.1 Illuminative evaluation studies in Malawi

**a. Science and Mathematics in Malawi**

The specific conceptual distinctions of Illuminative Evaluation, the 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu,' were employed by Nyirenda (1993) to evaluate the implementation of national curriculum changes in Science and Mathematics in Malawi. Using the principle of 'instructional system,' the researcher reviewed the curriculum policy documentary of the new Science and Mathematics curricula to establish what was planned by the state as the content knowledge, pedagogy and assessment practices to be used by the teachers in implementing the curriculum changes. Using the principle of 'learning milieu', the researcher observed lessons and conducted post-lesson interviews with teachers to establish whether the implementation of teaching of the new Science and Mathematics curricula accorded with the government policy on the teaching of the subjects. Thus using the methods of illuminative evaluation, the researcher looked for 'matches' and 'mismatches' between policy and practice in the teaching of the new Science and Mathematics curricula.

The findings of the study showed that teachers were teaching the prescribed content. However, the teachers were observed to rush through the content of the curriculum.

Teachers felt that, since there were too many activities, there was not enough time to complete all topics or units adequately. They felt that they could not complete the syllabus if they spent the specified time on each topic. Some teachers gave large class size as the reason for rushing through the topics. Teachers did not want to assign the class work they would be unable to mark before the next lesson. In terms of teaching and learning resources, the study found that there was scarcity of teaching and learning materials in the schools. The scarcity of writing materials, exercise books, pencils, rulers etc. was seen by the researcher to be an important barrier to the effective implementation of the mathematics and science curriculum. The primary school system did not provide such materials to pupils adequately.

**b. Mathematics in Malawi**

The specific conceptual distinctions of Illuminative Evaluation, the 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu' have also been employed by Lowe (2008) to evaluate the teaching of Mathematics in the rural primary schools in Malawi. The research sought to answer the research question, *How do policy and practice interact in Malawian primary education, in the case of mathematics teaching?* Using the principle of 'instructional system', the researcher analysed a vast number of Malawian policy documents: from official papers and curriculum statements to textbooks and examination papers. Also using the principle of 'learning milieu', the researcher observed lessons and conducted post-lesson observation interviews with teachers to establish whether the implementation of teaching of Mathematics accorded with the government policy on the teaching of the subject. Thus using the methods of illuminative evaluation, the researcher looked for 'matches' and 'mismatches' or the 'gap' between policy and practice in the teaching of Mathematics.

The study found that in contrast to the learner-centred and participatory methods advocated in the curriculum policy documents, most teachers used lectures infused with

question and answer ('chalk and talk'). Lowe argued that most teachers may have been adopting this teaching style due to large class sizes and inadequate provision of text books in the schools. Basing on the findings, Lowe has made many recommendations as possible future policy actions. The most salient of these recommendations is that: the government should provide sufficient good quality textbooks. He observes that many schools have insufficient textbooks, and yet research has established that regular use of textbooks can strongly improve learning. He argues that good quality textbooks would be ones that were relevant to the daily lives of pupils and helped the teacher meet the wide range of learning needs in the classroom. Lowe further elaborates that at present such books do not exist in Malawi. According to Lowe, the teachers' guides that are in use at present make teaching suggestions that are impossible to accomplish with large classes and few resources. Lowe also recommends that instruction should be in mother tongue particularly in Standards 1 to 4. Lowe further recommends Bilingual textbooks. He argues that in Standards 5 to 8 the language of instruction is to be English, yet teachers find that they often have to use Chichewa to explain topics. Lowe argues that at all levels (including secondary) bilingual books would solve these problems, making the content clearer to both teachers and pupils

**c. English in Malawi**

The concepts of 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu' have further been employed by Khomani (1996) in Malawi to evaluate the implementation of a then new English curriculum in the primary schools in Malawi. Using the principle of 'instructional system,' the researcher analysed the curriculum policy documents. Also using the principle of 'learning milieu', the researcher observed lessons and conducted post-lesson observation interviews with teachers to establish whether teaching of English accorded with the government policy on the teaching of the subject.

Results of the study revealed that teachers and head teachers found the new curriculum difficult to implement for a number of reasons notably among which were that the curriculum was too complex; teacher in-service training was inadequate; and teaching/learning materials were insufficient and often delivered late. Recommendations resulting from the study include the revision of teaching/learning materials by curriculum developers and teachers, frequent school-based in-service training, and provision of adequate teaching/learning materials.

### 3.4.2 Illuminative evaluation studies in other African countries

**a. Algebra in South Africa**

The specific conceptual distinctions of Illuminative Evaluation, the 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu' and 'matches and mismatches' have also been employed by Mdaka (2007) in South Africa to evaluate the implementation of Grade 7 Outcomes Based Education Algebra curriculum. Using the principle of 'instructional system,' the researcher collected his data using document analysis to establish what was planned by the state as the pedagogy to be used by teachers in teaching 'percentages' in the curriculum. Also using the principle of 'learning milieu', the researcher conducted naturalistic observations and carried out post-lesson observation interviews to establish how teachers were implementing the curriculum.

Thus following the methods of illuminative evaluation, the researcher looked for 'matches' and 'mismatches' between what was planned in an Outcomes Based Education Algebra text with what 'actually happens' in classroom teaching to gauge if the shift to outcomes teaching had taken place in the teaching of Mathematics in these schools, and made recommendations to improve.

Data revealed both partial matches and mismatches between what was planned as to how teachers are to teach Algebra and what actually happens in the classroom in the teaching of the subject. Partial matches included just over half of the teachers or 58% of the sample teaching the curriculum more-or-less as intended i.e. their teaching shifted to OBE. Mismatches included less than half or 42% of the teachers failing to teach Mathematics conceptually first as planned by the state.

The study recommended primarily that teachers re-claim teaching Mathematics conceptually first, and prior to completing examples and giving exercises to learners. It concluded that fewer teachers than expected seem to have shifted towards OBE teaching in these Mathematics classrooms, six years into the national innovation, C 2005.

**b. Music in Namibia**

The Illuminative Evaluation principles of 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu' have also been employed by Zolkov (1996) in Namibia to evaluate the implementation of a music curriculum innovation in the country. The curriculum innovation was an introduction of a computer-based teaching of aural skills in a music course. Using the principle of 'instructional system,' the researcher studied the curriculum policy document of the music curriculum, to which he established that the music curriculum innovation advocated learner-centred computer-assisted pedagogy. Also using the principle of 'learning milieu', the researcher conducted naturalistic observations and carried out post-lesson observation interviews with the teachers and learners to establish how the curriculum was being implemented at classroom level.

The researcher was comparing the learner-centred computer-assisted pedagogy to the traditional whole-class teacher-led aural skills pedagogy. He intended to answer the research question 'which of the two pedagogies…would be preferable for students…'

(Zolkov, 1996, p.1). The major finding of the study was that there is no significant difference between the traditional whole class teacher-led aural skills pedagogy and the computer-assisted programme. However, the descriptive data went beyond the findings and provided reasons for such performance particularly in the computer-assisted teaching programme. The illuminative evaluation approach illuminated (from observations and teacher interviews and student questionnaires) emerging issues such as:

> Teachers indicated that rhythm dictation paradoxically structured student learning in such a way that the activity of touching-the-screen to notate a rhythm, rendered student learning a passive activity… (and that) invoked in students a reaction more usually associated with poor examples of a lecturing pedagogical style (Zolkov, 1996, p. 11).

### 3.4.3 Illuminative evaluation studies internationally

#### a. Integrated science in Scotland

The specific conceptual distinctions of Illuminative Evaluation, the 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu' in combination with Bernstein's (1971) conceptual distinctions between 'collection' and 'integrated' curricula have been employed by Hamilton (1976) to evaluate the implementation of Science curriculum at two Scottish schools. Using Bernstein's (1971) distinction between 'collection' and 'integrated' curricula as a conceptual framework for his study, and applying the principles of illuminative evaluation, Hamilton observed the science classes at the two schools and combined this method with teacher interviews and six questionnaires administered to pupils. Typical of an illuminative approach study, Hamilton priotised studying the learning milieu as he believes, 'when an instructional system is adopted, it undergoes modifications that are rarely trivial' (Hamilton, 1976, p.182). The instructional system in the study was

‘Integrated Science” gazetted in the Scottish government document commonly known by schools as, *Curriculum Paper Seven.*

Through his lesson observations, Hamilton picked up several issues pertaining to the learning milieu which he identified as negatively effecting the implementation of the curriculum. Some of the issues uncovered through observation of the learning milieu at Simpson school which decreased the success chances of the innovation include; teacher absences, relative shortage of apparatus and lack of laboratory accommodation appropriate to the needs of the curriculum innovation. Hamilton thus uncovers mismatches between the instructional system and the learning milieu and concludes that ‘the innovation resulted in serving ends directly opposed to the intended’ (1976, p.2005). It is the illuminative evaluation approach that revealed that the Scottish Integrated Science national innovation as actually taught is in reality undermining the central premises of the innovation.

**b. Primary education in Malaysia**

The Illuminative Evaluation principles of ‘instructional system’ and ‘learning milieu’ have also been employed by Tuah (1982) in Malaysia to evaluate the implementation of a new curriculum innovation called “Kurikulum Bersepadu Sekolah Rendah (KBSR) in rural primary schools of Sarawak in Malaysia. The new curriculum was aimed at improving the quality of primary education. The researcher conducted an evaluation of this curriculum innovation to establish if it was working out as intended. Following the methods of illuminative evaluation, the researcher analysed the ‘instructional system’ of the curriculum innovation. The instructional system in the study was the curriculum policy documents. Through the study of the policy documents, the researcher established that some of the practices that were planned for teachers to adopt in putting the curriculum into practice include; an integrated approach in teaching and learning of curriculum subjects, use of a variety of teaching methods by the teachers such as group teaching methods,

whole class teaching and individual instruction, use of a variety of learning activities, flexibility in the choice of content and teaching and learning methods and aids and use of continuous assessment that is incorporated into the teaching and learning processes. Also using the principle of 'learning milieu', the researcher conducted naturalistic observations of lessons with follow-up probing interviews with teachers to establish how this teaching actually took place in classrooms. Thus using illuminative evaluation approach, the researcher looked for 'matches' and 'mismatches' or 'gaps' between what was planned in the curriculum with what 'actually happens' in the classroom.

Data revealed mismatches between the plans in the curriculum documents on how the curriculum was planned to be taught and what happened in the classroom in the actual teaching of the curriculum. Data revealed that the curriculum was not being taught as intended. For example, although the curriculum recommended the teachers to embark on creative and a variety of innovative approaches in their teaching, teachers were however observed to be employing teacher dominated methodology. Similarly, the new element of continuous school-based assessment was still observed to place emphasis on the evaluation of students' achievement and performance at the end of a school term and year instead of incorporating it into the teaching and learning processes to facilitate learning of the children.

**c. Thinking skills in England**

The specific conceptual distinctions of Illuminative Evaluation, the 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu' have also been employed by Nichols (1998) to evaluate the 'Thinking Skills' curriculum innovation at Devon school in the United Kingdom. In the 'Thinking Skills' study, the evaluators used a combination of tools of illuminative evaluation. The researcher studied the instructional system. The instructional system in the study was the organisational structure of the school. The researcher thus gathered

information about the organisational structure of the school. Applying the principle of the 'learning milieu,' the researcher observed some lessons and noted the limited nature of the training that the teachers had received in the process of teaching children how to think critically and creatively. The researcher asked the pupils, both by means of a questionnaire and in individual interviews, what they thought of the new subject and how it compared to other subjects. The researcher further examined the pupils' scores on a variety of different cognitive and academic tests. He also interviewed the school principal and the key teachers involved in introducing the new curriculum subject. Following the methods of illuminative evaluation, the researcher looked for 'matches' and 'mismatches' between what was planned in the 'Thinking Skills' curriculum with what 'actually happens' in classroom teaching to gauge if the curriculum was being implemented as intended.

Data revealed that the curriculum was not being taught as intended in the sense that the format of the lessons was very different from what was intended in the curriculum documents. For example, didactic teaching was very much the order of the day and little opportunity, if any, was provided for reflection and discussion with the pupils (Nichols, 1998, p.22). No marks or grades were awarded in thinking skills lessons, so there appeared to be no way in which individual students could judge their progress. By using illuminative evaluation, the evaluator was able to demonstrate quite clearly where and why the curriculum innovation was not working as intended and the principal of the school was forced to face up to the issue of either abandoning the curriculum project altogether or ignoring the evaluation and allowing it to continue in exactly the same form, or instigating change at the level of implementation in the classroom. He elected for the third of these options (Nichols, 1998, p.22).

The studies cited above have shown that they are methodologically congruent to illuminative evaluation. Illuminative evaluation has been widely used both in Africa

and internationally to evaluate education programmes. The studies find matches and mismatches or 'gaps' between the intentions of programmes and what happens in the actual implementation of a programme.

It is also my assumption that teachers may or may not be teaching Expressive Arts as intended by the national government, hence my attempt to establish, using tools of illuminative evaluation, if the learning area at this early stage is being implemented more or less as intended. However, the illuminative evaluation research studies cited in this chapter only indicate the discrepancy between the instructional system and the learning milieux and not much about the constraints that implementers of the programmes or projects face in the implementation of the programmes for that discrepancy to occur. Thus, this study was conceived to address this knowledge gap on the possible reasons for discrepancies between instructional systems and learning milieus especially in curriculum innovations. Thus discussions with teachers and classroom observations provided better avenues for this study in the exploration of how primary school teachers in Malawi made decisions in implementation of Expressive Arts curriculum. Such an exploration unearthed some of the reasons for the discrepancies that commonly occur between the instructional systems of programmes and their learning milieus.

### 3.4.4 Observations about studies using Illuminative evaluation

A review of the illuminative evaluation studies above has further revealed a gap in using Illuminative Evaluation as an approach to evaluating a curriculum innovation. The studies have not used any specific analytical criteria as a yardstick or a standard against which the actual implementation of a programme can be compared. It is for this reason that Illuminative evaluation cannot be regarded as a panacea to problems associated with

curricula evaluation. Illuminative evaluation as an approach to evaluating a curriculum has therefore its own challenges. Some of the challenges are discussed next.

### 3.4.5 Challenges of Illuminative evaluation

Critics have raised some objections about the subjectivity and scope of the approach. In fact, critics see qualitative approaches to evaluation, and therefore, illuminative evaluation as more problematic than what they offered – objective and 'scientific' approaches. Since illuminative evaluation gets its aspirations from the social anthropology framework, it does not escape most of the criticisms that this framework faces from the proponents of statistical approach to evaluation. The criticisms can be summarized as follows.

The subjective nature of the illuminative approach does not go down well with the traditional objectivist evaluators who have argued that it cannot be left to the discretion of one person, the evaluator, to account or interpret the realities of the innovation being implemented. It is deemed as unscientific and therefore useless in the creation and contribution of general stable body of knowledge. Parlett and Hamilton however argue that, such criticism is on the basis of an erroneous assumption that there are some forms of evaluation that are immune from prejudice, experimenter bias and human error (1976, p. 96). For Parlett and Hamilton, all forms of evaluation are susceptible to contamination of various sorts, including human prejudice. It follows therefore, that this criticism should not distract the illuminators in using their *humanness* in describing and interpreting of educational innovations.

Secondly, illuminative evaluation comes under fire for its 'extensive use of open-ended techniques, progressive focusing and qualitative data'(Parlett and Hamilton, 1976, p.96). This, the critics argue, also raises the likelihood of partiality on the part of the evaluator. For Parlett and Hamilton however, there are techniques in abundance to cross-check

findings, and secondly, outside researchers can be used for preliminary interpretations. However, it should be noted that the subjective element in the approach remains, and is inevitable. If fact it should be admired that the interpretative human insight exists, along the lines of historians and social anthropologists.

Thirdly, the critics argue that the status of the illuminative investigator will have an effect on both conduct and progress of the innovation which s/he is studying (Parlett and Hamilton, 1976, p. 97). The conduct of the participants is likely to change from the natural to the one of '*let me please, offend or disappoint*'. This in the process is set to artificially alter the course that the innovation could have probably taken. However Parlett and Hamilton retaliate that this criticism overlooks the fact that, 'any form of data collection creates disturbance [and illuminative evaluators] attempt to be unobtrusive without being secretive; to be supportive without being collusive; and to be non-doctrinaire without appearing unsympathetic' (Parlett and Hamilton, 1976, p.97).

Lastly, there are two contradicting schools of thought on the problem of the amount of data collected using illuminative evaluation. One school of thought argues that one of the biggest shortcomings associated with illuminative evaluation is its propensity to deal with small-scale projects. The issue is whether this approach can be applied to widely implemented innovations. The proponents of the approach (Parlett and Hamilton, 1976) however respond that while the initial focus would be small sample of schools, the sample can be expanded as the study progresses, with attention paid to emerging issues in the initial sample. The other school of thought argues that one of the biggest problems with the Illuminative evaluation approach is that it requires a large amount of data to be collected and it takes time and needs more than one researcher. However, since this research is school-based, the principles of illuminative evaluation would play a dominant role in the data collection for this research. Some of the problems associated with

illuminative evaluation will be addressed by selecting schools for the study which a single researcher can manage within the time and financial resources allocated for the research. Other models discussed in this chapter, the countenance model for example, would be useful in considering the antecedents and classroom transaction.

While acknowledging all the challenges of illuminative evaluation, the major strength of this approach is that it tries to illuminate an array of complex questions, issues and factors, and to identify procedures that give both desirable and undesirable results of an educational innovation. So, it is a holistic evaluation that tries to understand issues relating to an intervention from many perspectives: it seeks to view the performance of a program in its totality. It is for its strength that this study has adopted this approach to evaluate the Expressive Arts curriculum. As to evaluate implementation of a curriculum needs a yardstick against which the implementation can be compared to, the theory of 'Productive Pedagogies' (Lingard *et al.,* 2001) has therefore been utilized in this study as specific analytical criteria to support or supplement Illuminative Evaluation framework for evaluating the Expressive Arts curriculum

## 3.5 Putting the Conceptual Framework in operation

This section deals with putting into operation the Conceptual Framework for evaluating the Expressive Arts 'enacted' curriculum. Productive Pedagogies was chosen mainly for analysis of pedagogy in the enacted curriculum of Expressive Arts. This framework was used because Illuminative Evaluation as a framework for evaluating a curriculum has no specific analytical criteria that could have been used to analyse the Expressive Arts curriculum, especially the enacted curriculum. The theory offers a good lens for evaluating a curriculum which was introduced to improve the quality of education in Malawi. The theory enables the study of the intellectual quality of lessons.

This complementary framework is introduced in the following section and a detailed discussion of how it was operationalised for data analysis is presented in section 5.6.3 of Chapter 5, the methodology chapter.

### 3.5.1 Productive Pedagogies

The notion of Productive Pedagogies emerged from the School Reform Longitudinal Study (SRLS) which was conducted in Queensland Schools, Australia between 1998 to 2001 (Zohir *et al.*, 2010). The theory was developed by Lingard *et al.* (2001). The theory emerged as a research tool for exploring classroom practices that promote a high quality education for *all* students, regardless of background. The Productive Pedagogies theory consists of twenty pedagogies that have been broken down into four main dimensions, namely intellectual quality, connectedness, supportive classroom environment and engagement with difference (re-worked and adapted to working and valuing differences by some authors who used the theory after 2001, such as Zohir *et al.* (2010). As indicated earlier on above, a detailed discussion of the four dimensions of Productive Pedagogies and how they were put in operation for data analysis is presented in section 5.6.3 of Chapter 5, the methodology chapter.

The sub-section that follows looks at some of the studies which have utilized dimensions of Productive Pedagogies to evaluate curriculum implementation.

### 3.5.2 Studies using Productive Pedagogies

Productive Pedagogies has widely been used internationally to evaluate the implementation of curricula at classroom level. Studies which have used Productive Pedagogies to ground their enquiry of the implementation of curricula have revealed that the practice of four dimensions of Productive Pedagogy is very low amongst teachers of different curricula. This study was conceived out of the assumption that teachers of

Expressive Arts may or may not be integrating dimensions of Productive Pedagogies which, as has been argued earlier in this study, enhances attainment of high intellectual quality skills amongst the learners, thereby improving the quality of education, which is the main goal which the government in Malawi, as has been seen in Chapters 1 and 2, intends to achieve through PCAR. Some of the studies which have used Productive Pedagogies approach to evaluate curricula follow.

Productive Pedagogies has been employed by Zohir *et al*. (2010) to explore classroom practices of Malaysian secondary school Geography teachers. Findings of the study indicated that the practice of four dimensions of Productive Pedagogy is very low among Malaysian Geography teachers. The study found that there were very limited intellectual quality, connectedness, supportive classroom environment and recognition of difference activities in the classroom of the Geography teachers. The teachers were observed to have been using more traditional teacher-centred methods in which there were very limited interactions between the teachers and the students.

Productive Pedagogies has also been employed by Ishak (2010) to evaluate classroom practices of Malaysian secondary school Science teachers. Findings of the study indicated that the practice of Productive Pedagogy is generally very low among Malaysian Science teachers. However, the teachers were observed to promote engagement with difference, particularly practices that respect racial and ethnic backgrounds of students in class were observed to be strongly evident in the lessons observed in the study.

Productive Pedagogies has again been employed by Hayes, Mills, Christe and Lingard (2001) to evaluate the classroom practices of teachers in Australia. Findings of the study indicated that the Productive Pedagogy practices of Australian teachers was generally very low, with engagement with difference or valuing and recognizing differences as the least

emphasized dimension by the Australian teachers. However, a supportive classroom environment was observed to be strongly evident in the lessons observed in the study.

### 3.6 Closing remarks

This chapter has described the research frameworks that guided this study. Illuminative Evaluation (Parlett and Hamilton, 1976) and Productive Pedagogies (Lingard *et al.*, 2001) were chosen as the main conceptual frameworks to guide the study.

The chapter has explained some of the reasons for choosing these frameworks, the most salient one being that the frameworks enable the description and explanation of the major facets of Expressive Arts, namely the plan or the 'intended' curriculum as stipulated in the state curriculum policy documents on one hand and the 'enacted' curriculum or what happens in the classroom in the actual teaching of Expressive Arts on the other hand, and a description or explanation of the relationships between the two facets. It is hoped that by adopting the Illuminative Evaluation and Productive Pedagogies as the main conceptual frameworks for this study, I should be able to contribute knowledge about how teachers implement curriculum reforms in Malawi through the evaluation of the Expressive Arts, through documenting the subject matter and teaching strategies in the 'intended' and the 'enacted' curriculum.

The illuminative evaluation studies cited in the chapter have shown that illuminative evaluation has been widely used both in Africa and internationally to evaluate education programmes. The findings of the studies have revealed that there is often a gap between the intentions of programmes and what happens in the actual implementation of a programme. This study was conceived out of the assumption that teachers may or may not be teaching Expressive Arts as intended by the national government, hence my attempt to establish, using tools of illuminative evaluation, if the learning area at this early stage is

being implemented more or less as intended. The studies have also shown that most of the studies used more than one method to carry out the evaluation. This study will also use an eclectic approach to evaluation of Expressive Arts curriculum because the methods provide for cross-checking of data, helping to validate the findings of the research.

In the chapter, the other theory used to support Illuminative evaluation has been described. This theory is Productive Pedagogies (Lingard *et al.*, 2001). In the chapter, the other theory used to support Illuminative evaluation has been described. This theory is Productive Pedagogies (Lingard *et al.*, 2001). This theory was used mainly to determine and document content knowledge, pedagogy and assessment in the enacted curriculum. The chapter argues that no such study, utilizing these two important frameworks to evaluate the teaching of a new curriculum has been done before in Malawi. This study was conceived to fill this knowledge gap.

# CHAPTER 4

# LITERATURE REVIEW

## 4.1 Introduction

This chapter reviews some of the literature that is relevant to this study. A literature review is an attempt to interpret and synthesise what has been studied, researched and published in an area of interest (Aleman, 1999).

This definition of a literature review acted as a guide in the creation of the contents of this chapter. The aim of this piece of research was to evaluate the implementation of a new curriculum in Malawi. Since the study focuses on evaluating the implementation of a new curriculum innovation, this chapter, therefore, discusses what has been studied and researched on in the area of curriculum implementation, particularly on some of the challenges of implementing a new curriculum innovation especially in developing countries. This is in a bid to show the possible sources of gaps or fits and misfits that may exist between the state's intended and teachers' enacted curriculum. Factors affecting implementation of a curriculum will impact on content knowledge, pedagogy and assessment of teachers. The chapter is divided into two parts. The first discusses challenges which are cited in the literature on implementing a curriculum using strategies similar to what PCAR adopted, as discussed in chapter 2. The second part presents examples of challenges of implementation faced by some top-down curriculum innovations in developing or third world countries.

## 4.2 Factors Affecting the Implementation of Curriculum Innovation

The implementation of PCAR discussed in chapter 2 has all the features of a top-down innovation affecting the entire primary education system. Teachers, Primary Methods advisors and Tutors or Lecturers in Teacher Training Colleges are asked to implement an

innovation in which they did not take part in its conception. The consequence of this is that there could be some factors that could inhibit the process of implementation. Several scholars (Pratt, 1980; Huberman and Miles, 1984; Fullan, 1991; Jansen, 1998; Mahlangu, 2000 and Ratsatsi, 2005) discuss three sets of what they call interactive factors affecting implementation. These are discussed in relation to the process of implementation of PCAR in Malawi.

### 4.2.1 Factors related to the characteristics of the innovation

**a. Need**

The need for change in most top-down innovation is conceived by the government without much consultation with the people who implement the innovation, namely the teachers. What initiators may see as a priority need may not be viewed in the same way by the teachers. This creates a problem when the implementers complain about the lack of consultation. In Malawi, it has been a tradition that policy issues originate from the top and this is the case with PCAR. The consequence of this is that there could be some resistance to change by the implementers. There is of course a problem of how far consultation should go. Ratsatsi (2005, p. 162) has emphasized the importance of consulting the teachers to reduce their resistance to change and make the implementation of a curriculum change a success. He argues that

> The effectiveness of an innovation can only be determined when it is negotiated at the classroom level. Ratsatsi continues to argue that the paramount curriculum innovation determiner is the classroom technician who is the teacher. The teacher can either make the curriculum succeed or fail.

Richardson (1994), as quoted by Ratsatsi (2005), argues that teachers will implement only those aspects of the curriculum that fit well with their beliefs. If the activity does not work, it is quickly dropped or radically altered.

The findings of Jansen's (1998) study concur with Ratsatsi. The findings of the study revealed that teachers understand and implement OBE in very different ways. Jansen found that both the interview and questionnaire data of the teachers amongst whom he carried out his research suggested that most of the teachers were doing what they felt comfortable with and what was familiar to them from years of practical experience. The teachers did not claim to be doing OBE nor did their practices suggest that to be the case. Other teachers claimed that they were doing OBE perfectly and completely within their classrooms, yet the classroom practices of these teachers showed very little evidence that they were practising OBE.

Mahlangu (2001, p. 46) concurs with Ratsatsi and Jansen. He points out that implementation of a new curriculum often requires educators to change attitudes and roles. This requires educators to change their traditional roles and to give up practices in which they feel secure and display high levels of competence. Educators are expected to adopt new practices in which they feel insecure and less competent. Some educators may not tolerate feelings of insecurity and incompetence. Fear of failure may dull the appetite to implement since this requires hard work. Resistance may come from such a situation. Overcoming resistance is a prerequisite for implementation. The innovators need to view resistance positively and offer the necessary support to implementers. Fullan (1991) agrees with Mahlangu. He argues that individual teachers will implement a new program in ways that are consistent with their own beliefs and practices. The curriculum review in Malawi entail a change in content, teaching strategies and the ability to use the new materials. These changes in subject content and teaching strategies may create uncertainty

which will affect teachers' attitudes and may act as a barrier to successful implementation of the new curriculum. These changes therefore require that teachers get to grips with all the ingredients of the change in order to carry out the implementation process. This has been built into the Malawi curriculum review through orientation training workshops discussed earlier in chapter 2 of this thesis. The availability of resources and the quality of people running the INSET courses however may determine the success of the orientation courses.

**b. Clarity**

Whether the need is understood or not, teachers and other personnel carrying out the implementation of change may not be clear as to what ought to be done in order to meet the goals of the innovation. Pratt (1980, p.431) contends that the consent of teachers to an innovation does not necessarily indicate that they understand the change. Pratt (1980) further argues that it has been found that teachers who are supposedly implementing a new curriculum sometimes cannot even identify its main features. The greatest difficulty is likely to be encountered when teachers are required to change their educational approaches.

Gross, et al (1971), Fullan (1991) and Jansen (1998) concur with Pratt's argument. Gross, et al (1971) found that teachers were unable to identify the essential features of the innovation they were using. Problems of clarity according to Fullan (1991) have been found in virtually every study of significant change. The more complex the reform, the greater the problem of clarity because diffused goals and unspecified means of implementation represents a problem at the implementation stage. Jansen (1998) conducted a study in schools in Kwazulu Natal and Mpumalanga provinces of South-Africa to find out how Grade 1 teachers understand and implement Outcomes Based Education in their classrooms. The findings of the study revealed that teachers hold vastly

different understanding of OBE, even within the same school. Jansen argues that the considerable range of meanings attributed to OBE has implications for implementation which could, similarly, be expected to reflect a broad set of teaching and learning practices within Grade 1 classrooms. The range of meanings implies a lack of coherence and focus in the communication policy of OBE. The curriculum review in Malawi has tried to provide both content and methodology and the training workshops and orientation courses were designed to minimise the problem of clarity. How clear the teachers are about the new curriculum in Malawi is one of the issues which this research raises and whether, in fact, teachers teach the content as intended.

**c. Extra Workload**

Mahlangu (2001, p.43) argues that the extra workload that implementation of a new curriculum brings should not be overlooked. The tasks of planning and implementing a new curriculum increase the workload for educators. Some educators might not be willing to take on additional workload. Closely related to the extra workload is the time factor. Time is needed to plan. The tasks involved in planning are time consuming. Similarly, Huberman and Miles (1984) found that schools attempting to implement innovations that are beyond their ability to carry them out often end up in failure.

The findings of Jansen's (1998) study agree with Mahlangu and Huberman and Miles. One Grade 1 teacher interviewed in Jansen's study expressed the concern of the OBE curriculum as giving a lot of work to the teacher. Jansen quoted one of the teachers in his study as saying,

> You will find it very noisy, and when you're trying to teach you're to do different things with different groups. The noise level…it can be too high. Because then you can't work with others on a quieter level. So you have to control that some way. I

find that quite difficult. It is a noisy OBE. And it is quite stressful not only for the teacher but also for children (p.203).

Whether the Malawi curriculum review has created extra workload or not for teachers is one of the issues on which this research has set out to collect information.

**d. Teacher Development**

Robbins, Francis and Elliot (2003) noted that initial education and training courses are important in equipping teachers with the necessary competence and skills for handling a new curriculum at both local and global levels. Yeager and Wilson (1997) shared the same view point that pre-service and in-service programmes help in shaping teachers' knowledge and classroom practices. Indeed, since the implementation of a new curriculum requires great skills, preparation of teachers in both content and pedagogical knowledge is critical (Thornton, 2005). Fullan (1991) as well shares the same viewpoint about the importance of teacher development in ensuring effective implementation of a new curriculum. Fullan argues that it is obvious to see how teacher development connects innovation and implementation. Fullan points out that if implementation involves new behaviours and beliefs, teacher development in relation to these new learnings is invaluable. This is why in-service and professional development (including orientation to the new curriculum) in support of specific innovations is usually found to be the critical factor for success.

Studies show that poor preparation of teachers and employment of unqualified teachers are some of the problems affecting effective implementation of school curricula (Passe, 2006; Stuart, 2002; Thornton, 2005). In this connection, Passe (2006) remarked that teachers feel uncomfortable in handling content that was inadequately addressed during their preparation. He further noted that under such circumstances, some of the teachers resort to

the use of textbook-based instructions as a cover up to their academic deficiencies (Passe, 2006). Thornton (2005) also observed that many teacher preparation programs have limited transformative effects on beginning teachers. Indeed, most classroom life in teacher preparation classrooms is one-sided, with professors monopolising learning processes (Giroux and McLaren, 1999). As a result, the new graduate teachers practice the same techniques and strategies as their professors the moment they begin their teaching career.

Jansen (1998) concurs with the above authors about the connection between teacher preparation and effective implementation of a curriculum innovation. Jansen's study revealed that most teachers displayed considerable uncertainty about whether their practices in fact constitute OBE, irrespective of the aggregate levels of institutional resources or years of personal teaching experience. Jansen argues that the uncertainty reflected the teachers' lack of in-depth training. The teachers interviewed in Jansen's study regarded the OBE training conducted through cascade model in the five-day block period as inadequate. In addition, even the trainers themselves were uncertain about what OBE entails. There was also the issue of lack of on-site supervision and feedback on current practices in the Grade 1 classrooms.

Mahlangu (2000) concurs with the findings of Jansen. Mahlangu blames the society for the failure to create conducive conditions for success in educator practices, yet it expects them to be excellent. Mahlangu further attributes inadequately equipped educators to policy designers who lack skills to guide educators on how to implement the curriculum. As a result, educators are unsure of changes that are worth implementing.

In Malawi, teacher preparation faces several challenges, which have a bearing on classroom practices which will promote learning and improve quality of education (Hauya, 1993; Kunje, 2002). First, teacher-training programs attract candidates of low

qualifications (Hauya, 1993; Kunje and Chimombo, 1999). While this is a problem worldwide, recruitment of even lowly qualified candidates has its gravity in developing countries like Malawi. For example, evidence from a comparative study in Ghana, Zimbabwe, Lesotho, Malawi, and Trinidad and Tobago showed that only Malawi recruited candidates with junior secondary certificates (Stuart, 1999; Stuart, 2002; Kunje, 2002). Junior secondary certificate holders are an equivalent of grade ten students. The reason for this recruitment is that the pool of well-qualified teachers in Malawi is small. However, the problem with this recruitment is that most of such candidates fail to grasp the theoretical understandings and application of various teaching methods, including the use of learner-centred or participatory pedagogies (Stuart, 1999). Indeed, some decisions teachers make in classrooms are a reflection of their inability to understand the curriculum.

In this regard, Kunje's (2002) findings on the implementation of the Malawi Integrated In-service Teacher Education Programme (MIITEP) provided insights to my study because three of the twelve participants I used in the study were prepared through this programme. MIITEP was introduced in 1997 because of the acute shortage of teachers following the adoption of free primary education in 1994. To address the shortfall, the government recruited 18,000 untrained teachers (Kunje, 2002). MIITEP was introduced to provide a mixed-mode of preparing teachers with taught -courses at teacher training colleges and school-based activities (Kunje, 2002). The program was for 24 months, with three months in college, 23 months in schools, and one month of residential activities for certifying examinations (Kunje, 2002). As such, the implementation of this program required the services of college tutors, Primary Education Advisors (PEAs), head teachers and cooperating teachers in schools. College-based activities involved college tutors using handbooks in the training of the trainees, whereas school-based activities placed the trainees under the tutelage of head teachers, cooperating teachers and PEAs.

Kunje (2002) noted that the success of MIITEP was in terms of the great output of teachers for the primary school sector, which could not have been possible with the traditional pre-career full time teacher preparation program. However, he found some major flaws with this programme. First, he noted that, although in theory, the programme emphasized learner-centred or participatory classroom pedagogies, what occurred in college classrooms were basically teacher-centred approaches. He attributed the problem to both large class sizes and under-qualified tutors. Secondly, he found that the majority of teachers in the schools where the MIITEP trainees were attached for the school-based activities were not certified. For this reason, school-based activities for the MIITEP programme proved difficult when it came to attaching the trainees to certified teachers in the schools. Lastly, Kunje observed that many of the schools where the MIITEP trainees were allocated were very poor in terms of the availability of teaching resources and classrooms. Therefore, although preparation programmes are thought to be the major sources of teachers' content and pedagogical knowledge, the success in this endeavour is dependent on the organisation of the programme.

The curriculum review in Malawi has tried to provide training workshops to prepare teachers for the implementation of the new curriculum. As indicated in chapter 2, the training workshops were done through the cascade model. Literature reveals that where cascade model of training has been used to orient teachers to new curriculum, such training has not been very effective in empowering teachers to teach a new curriculum effectively. For example, Rembe (2006) in his study of the implementation of a new curriculum innovation in Zimbabwe notes that

> The cascade training strategy of teachers is disappointing because few teachers are chosen and receive training and they in turn train others in schools and this leads to

> the required information not being transmitted properly and it consequently fails to equip teachers with the requisite skills (p. 243).

The cascade model is thus argued to have a weakness of diluting information in the process of getting disseminated to the teachers as the last recipients in the chain of information dissemination.

So it is perhaps difficult to determine the effectiveness of the training courses conducted in Malawi to prepare the teachers to implement the new curriculum effectively. This study has set out to collect such information. However, Chipungu *et al.* (2010) speculated that teachers will likely have challenges to implement the Expressive Arts curriculum effectively because of the way they are trained at the Teacher Training Colleges (TTCs). Chipungu notes that teacher educators (lecturers) who are expected to train teachers in the teaching of Expressive Arts at Domasi College of Education, a constituent college of the University of Malawi specialise only in two of the components in Expressive Arts. A prospective teacher educator for Expressive Arts may graduate with either Music as a major or Creative Arts as a minor or with Physical Education as a major and Creative Arts as a minor. Chipungu argues that it is obvious that when sent to TTCs, such teacher educators (lecturers) will not teach Expressive Arts competently. According to Chipungu, this will reflect on the teacher-trainees who will be in direct contact with the primary pupils.

So far, I have discussed what literature reveals about how teachers' knowledge gained through pre-service and in-service trainings influence their classroom practice. However, although the teacher may have better knowledge from these trainings, availability of resources also contributes to the effective classroom practices to improve teaching and learning, thereby increasing the quality of education.

**e. Availability of Teaching and Learning Resources**

Instructional materials are the hub to learning. Pratt (1980) argues that almost any curriculum change, even one aimed at greater economy or efficiency, requires additional resources at least during the changeover period. Ratsatsi (2005) agrees with Pratt in terms of the need of instructional materials for a curriculum innovation. Ratsatsi argues that a new curriculum innovation justifies its existence as an independent entity deserving of space in the school timetable by defining its own independent operational parameters, objectives, axioms and canons. To attain these canonical indicators, it defines and adopts its own delivery strategies embodied in new instructional materials. Thus, the old instructional materials become dysfunctional and redundant.

Pratt is supported by McLaughlin and Talbert (1990) on the importance of availability of teaching and learning resources for effective implementation of a curriculum. They observed that material resources are one of the major factors that influence teachers' effective classroom practices. Indeed, availability of both human and material resources is a big challenge that influences classroom practices especially in developing countries like Malawi. Therefore, the first part of this section is a discussion of the shortage of human resources.

Although Malawi enrols candidates of low qualifications in the teacher preparation programs, the problem itself is compounded with a serious shortage of teachers. There were about 32,876 qualified and 16,252 unqualified teachers in the primary school sector in 1999 (Kunje and Chimombo, 1999). Enrolment in primary school rose from 1.9 million to about 3 million pupils as a result of the introduction of free primary school education in 1994. The government addressed the shortfall of teachers with a recruitment of untrained teachers. However, even with the recruitment of untrained teachers, there is still a shortage of teachers in the primary school sector resulting in large class sizes. For example, the

teacher-student ratio is as high as 1:118 based on the total labour force of qualified teachers (EMAS, 2005; Nsapato, 2005). The ratio drops to 1:60 with the inclusion of unqualified teachers to the total teacher labour force (Nsapato, 2005). Both ratios are far too high to meet the government's target of 1:35 (Kunje and Chimombo, 1999). How then can Expressive Arts teachers organise classroom practices that aim at improving learning, which would in turn improve the quality of education espoused by the government in the PCAR? This was one of the major areas for this study because there seems to be no research findings in Malawi that link large class sizes with teachers' choice of pedagogies in the classrooms.

The second and last discussion on the influence of availability of teaching and learning resources on teachers' effective organisation of classroom practices which in turn lead to effective implementation of a curriculum is on the availability of material resources. In this connection, Adeyinka (2000) agreed that once teachers know their content area to teach, the next stage is the selection of resources for effective organisation of classroom practices. Unfortunately, material resources are not readily available in developing countries (UNESCO, 2000). For example, Luykx (1999) noted that Bolivian schools faced serious shortages of material resources. Similarly, Jansen (1998) noted that there were uneven distribution of resource materials and other OBE-related resource materials in the South African schools and classrooms which he visited during his study period to evaluate the implementation of C2005. Jansen's study established that the variations in the availability of the various OBE related teaching and learning materials in the schools affected the way the teachers were implementing the curriculum. The study found that some teachers and schools which had been supplied with materials in the early part of the year, in the year when the OBE curriculum was being implemented were more closer to implementing the curriculum in the way they were expected to do compared to those

teachers and schools which had been supplied with the materials later in the year in which the OBE curriculum was implemented. The variations in the availability of materials may probably have been a contributing factor to the differences among schools in the implementation of the curriculum. Just like Bolivia and South Africa, teachers in Malawi face various resource constraints that affect the effective implementation of the school curricula (Chimombo, 2005; EMAS 2005; Nsapato, 2005). For example, Malawi has the lowest percentage of the availability of textbooks for both teachers and pupils in the sub-Saharan region (EMAS, 2005). This viewpoint that Malawi faces resource constraints is confirmed by Lowe's (2008) and Kadzamira's (2006) studies. Lowe and Kadzamira found that lack of learning resources, especially text-books, affects the successful implementation of a curriculum in Malawi. Lowe found that there was high pupil to text-book ratio in the schools involved in his study. Kadzamira noted that the primary school system in Malawi lacks teaching and learning materials especially the rural primary schools.

Inadequate resources influence teachers' decisions in the implementation of active learner-centred or participatory approaches. For example, Chapin and Messick (2002) and Hooghoff (1993), based on the findings of the University of Malawi's Centre for Educational Research and Training, noted that lack of resources forces teachers to use direct methods like lecturing most of their classroom time. Similarly, Luykx (1999) noted that lack of resources in Bolivia made teachers dependent on lecture, with students copying notes and reciting facts. Yet as already noted, the PCAR requires student participation in their own learning. Under such conditions, implementation of the new curriculum in Malawi could be more of a lip-service than anything else. Indeed, teachers' effective implementation of even the well-structured curriculum is dependent on enough professional support (Correira, 1997).

The curriculum review in Malawi devised a new strategy to minimise the problem of distribution of books and other educational materials to schools for the implementation of the new curriculum (see chapter 2). It is however not clear whether this new strategy solved the problem of distribution of books which has been there for many years in Malawi. This study has set out to collect such information.

However, although schools may have adequate human and material resources for ensuring effective implementation of a curriculum, mandated testing also has a negative impact on teachers' classroom practices. The next sub-section is a discussion of the impact of testing on teachers' decisions in the implementation of lessons.

**f. Influence of Mandated Examinations**

Scott (1998) gave a metaphor of 'seeing like a state', which describes why certain well-intended schemes to improve human conditions have gone tragically awry because of state's control over national issues. The lesson we get from this metaphor is that states sometimes make educational policies without the consultation of stakeholders like teachers. The end result of this is what literature reveals, that there is a discrepancy between the intended goals of curricula and classroom practices.

There is a close link between curriculum issues and standardized testing. Curriculum developers usually view teachers as primarily implementers, and not as active partners in the curriculum development processes (Ross, 1997). The state prepares teachers with the faith that they will implement the ideals of the curricula developers (Ross, 1997). For example, studies in Malawi illuminate the state's monopoly over curriculum development processes (Croft, 2002; Rose, 2003). Rose (2003) observed that, 'the education policy formulation process in Malawi does not have the tradition of consulting with stakeholders including teachers, parents, communities, local leaders and NGOs involved in education'

(p.505). They wondered if, under such circumstances, education policies met the expectations of the citizens. Croft (2002) concurred that donor-driven education reforms in Malawi hardly considered teachers' active participation in the development of learner-centred pedagogies. These observations justify why this research study also aims at investigating the teachers' views about the Expressive Arts curriculum and how that perception may be affecting their classroom practices.

Elsewhere in the world, states control their curricula through standardized testing, which they regard in high esteem although there is no comprehensive research evidence that suggests that tests contribute to students' effective learning (Grant, 2003). What seems obvious, though, is that mandated tests influence both teachers and students to rely heavily on textbooks that cover the content of the tests (Myers and Savage, 2005). As a result, tests influence teachers to emphasize only those parts of the curricula that are likely to be covered on the tests (Grant, 2003). For example, research studies conducted in the United States to investigate the impact of tests on classroom practices showed that mandated tests had a negative impact on teaching and learning (Kornblith and Lasser, 2004; Myers and Savage, 2005). Myers and Savage found that tests forced teachers to rely heavily on textbooks for classroom instructions because the textbooks were aligned closely to the curricula. Myers and Savage further found that high-stakes examinations in secondary schools made teachers to shift their emphasis from higher-order concepts associated with critical thinking to lower-level concepts that emphasize recall of facts. This also supported by Passe (2006). In Malawi, the available literature also suggests that the educational system leans towards examinations. For example, Rose (2003, p.511) observed that, 'an important reason for lower standards (grades) being most affected by low level resources is due to the examination orientation of the education system, which places emphasis on upper standards (grades). However, although this is the case, the various research studies

all over the world do not clearly show the connection between tests and learner-centred or participatory methods as espoused in the Malawi government's PCAR intended curriculum.

So far, I have discussed what literature reveals about how interactive factors related to the innovation affect the implementation of the innovation. The next sub-sections are a discussion of how contextual factors outside the innovation affect its implementation.

### 4.2.2 Factors related to local characteristics

Local characteristics refer to the whole context in which a curriculum is implemented. Implementation of a curriculum may be regarded as successful if learners acquire the planned or intended experiences, knowledge, skills, ideas, values and attitudes (Cornbleth, 1990). However, curriculum implementation does not occur in a contextual vacuum. A curriculum can only be implemented successfully within supportive contexts. Curriculum implementation will be enhanced when impeding aspects of the curriculum context are identified and addressed. There are two types of contexts which will influence the implementation of a curriculum. These contexts are 'structural and social' (Cornbleth, 1990, p.27).

#### a. Social context

Social context refers to the school environment at large in which a curriculum is implemented. This environment includes social, political, economic and demographic conditions and demands and priorities of different groups of people who have some role to play in the education activities of an individual school (Cornbleth, 1990, p.27). Whitaker (1993) identified key role players involved in the social context of the school environment at large as the learners, parents or the community members of a school and the government. Learners are also role players in the social context of the school environment at large

because learners come from the community. The learners bring some of the strengths and constraints to their learning situation from their homes or communities. The learners' home background in terms of the social conditions of the communities where these learners come from is one of the major determinants of a learner's success.

The community or the society influence curriculum implementation in three ways.

Firstly, the community has its own perceptions of what the product of the school system should be. This makes educators or teachers to interpret and present curriculum material in a way that takes into account these societal considerations. The success of the implementation of a curriculum may therefore also depend on the extent to which the presentation of the curriculum material in the classroom accommodates the culture of the society that the curriculum is seeking to serve. It is therefore possible for the community to have both positive and negative influences on the implementation of a curriculum.

Secondly, the community influences curriculum implementation in that parents and community members' levels of literacy influence the implementation of a curriculum. Parents and community members play a role in the implementation of a curriculum through their involvement in their children's schooling. For example, Lowe (2008) noted that many adults in Malawi are not able to contribute to their children's school learning because they are illiterate, having had little or no education themselves. The ability of parents to support schooling of their children will therefore facilitate or undermine the implementation of a curriculum.

Thirdly, the demographic characteristics of the community such as the language, race, age and gender influence curriculum implementation in that the community can have different groupings for example groupings in terms of gender. These groups can bring their views to bear on curriculum implementation. For example, the gender grouping may oppose a

curriculum that is gender biased against female children because it includes instructional materials that portray negative attitudes towards women and girls.

The government affects the implementation of a curriculum in two ways. Firstly, the national ideology and philosophy of the government of the day have a tremendous influence on the education system. Curriculum materials and their interpretation and presentation are usually heavily influenced by political considerations. For example, one of the reasons why education is financed by the government is to improve the country's economy. The government may therefore put emphasis on those subjects which it feels will develop skills, knowledge base and attitudes in learners required by the industry. The government may ask the teachers to put serious consideration and more teaching and learning time on those subjects. This may result in teachers paying more attention to those subjects which are seen to be the government's priority, at the expense of other curriculum subjects.

Secondly, the economic conditions of the government of the day, particularly its financial standing heavily influences the implementation of a curriculum. Teachers require classroom supplies such as textbooks, charts and other equipment. Without these materials, learning is compromised. However, these materials need financial resources to buy. The financial standing of the government would thus either make these materials to be or not to be available in the schools. Availability or non availability of the materials heavily influences the implementation of a curriculum, that is whether the implementation becomes successful or not.

The implementers need to plan to consider how the contextual factors may be impeding curriculum implementation and utilize the enhancing aspects of the curriculum context. I will now consider how the structural context in which a curriculum is implemented influence the way a curriculum is implemented.

**b. Structural context of curriculum implementation**

Structural context refer to the school organization and the individual classroom environment. Whitaker (1993) identified key role players involved in the structural context of the school and individual classroom environment as the teacher, the learners, school principals and district officials. The way in which the role players in the structural context in which a curriculum is implemented affect the implementation of a curriculum is discussed in the following sub-sections.

## 4.3 Role players in curriculum innovation

### 4.3.1 The Curriculum Gatekeepers

As classroom managers, teachers are the primary role players within the structural context of the individual classroom environment. Teachers make decisions in the selection of subject matter and how to present it to the students. Thornton (2005) correctly referred to teachers as curriculum gatekeepers because of the kind of decisions they make in the implementation of any intended curriculum in the classrooms. Indeed, teachers make lots of decisions about the implementation of any curriculum, but they do so under various constraints (Grant, 2003). It is not surprising that for the past two decades, much research has concentrated on how teachers acquire knowledge they use in their classrooms (Zembylas, 2007). Such studies have indicated that several factors like teachers' pedagogical content knowledge, teacher preparations, social-cultural beliefs, and teachers' knowledge about the needs of their students, mandated tests, and availability of resources influence classroom practices (Adler and Goodman, 1983; Grant, 2003; Yeager and Wilson, 1997). An examination of these issues can help us understand how various systematic factors influence teachers' decisions in the selection of content and pedagogies

for implementation of the Expressive Arts curriculum. I will begin the analysis with what Shulman (1991) called 'pedagogical content knowledge'.

**a. Teachers' Pedagogical Content Knowledge**

Shulman's (1991) conceptualisation of teachers' pedagogical content knowledge (hereafter referred to as PCK) during the late 1980's came about as he wondered about what and how teachers taught. His study helped in the rejuvenation of research work that revealed that teachers gained knowledge from multiple sources, influencing their decisions in the classrooms (Fenstermacher, 1994). Shulman (1991) asked thought-provoking questions on how teachers gain and use knowledge, and some of the questions were:

> How do teachers decide what to teach, how to present it, how to question learners about...? What are the sources of teacher knowledge? What does a teacher know and when did he or she come to know it? How is new knowledge acquired, old knowledge retrieved and both combined to form a new knowledge base? (p.8)

He observed that PCK developed in stages from the pre-service teacher, to a novice teacher, and to the experienced teacher. However, this does not suggest that this process is a smooth and well-defined pattern of transition because the process itself is context-dependent. He noted that there are two kinds of knowledge, which teachers develop and use in their classrooms.

First, I will discuss what Shulman meant by content knowledge. This refers to, 'the amount and organisation of knowledge per se in the mind of the teacher' (p.9). Thus, Shulman contended that content knowledge is not just facts, but also explaining various propositions of the representation of knowledge. He observed that in most cases, teachers acquire this form of knowledge in their areas of specialisation.

The second kind of PCK is what Shulman called pedagogical knowledge. He observed that this knowledge, '... goes beyond knowledge of subject matter per se to the dimension of subject matter knowledge *for teaching*' (p.9; emphasis in original). In essence, therefore, content knowledge and pedagogical knowledge are two sides of the same coin. Indeed, as Shulman observed, pedagogies are the most useful ways of representing subject matter in a manner that is comprehensible to students. He contended that teachers gain the PCK through their college preparation, but this improves as they gain experience in their classrooms. Fenstermacher (1994), one of the researchers inspired by Shulman, articulated very well the process of teachers' gaining of knowledge from their college preparation through to experience.

A conceptualisation of this process is what Fenstermacher's (1994) called teacher knowledge formal (hereafter referred to as TK/F) and teacher knowledge practical (hereafter referred to as TK/P). The TK/F is the type of knowledge teachers gain from their formal training, and these include subject matter, curriculum theories, instructional techniques, and classroom management skills (Fenstermacher, 1994). He argued that university researchers and professors produce this kind of knowledge largely based on theories of teaching and learning. The expectation from the researchers and professors is that training in these types of TK/F determines the effectiveness of the teachers in planning and implementation of any curriculum. He also observed that education policy-makers consider TK/F as the essential base of knowledge for teachers' classroom practices. As a result, curriculum development processes are largely dependent on this type of knowledge.

On the other hand, TK/P is the type of knowledge that teachers produce and use through practice in their classrooms. Indeed, through trying out things in the classrooms, teachers come to know what works for them in the context of their environment (Thornton, 2005).

Sadly though, curriculum developers hardly take into account the practical knowledge that teachers produce and use in their classrooms (McLaughlin and Talbert, 1990). This is why one of the goals of this study was to investigate the TK/P from the perspectives of primary school Expressive Arts teachers. While teachers' gaining of TK/F seems straightforward to understand, the gaining of TK/P is not. As Fenstermacher rightly argued, we can understand the development of TK/P by engaging teachers in a dialogue of how they implement the intended curriculum.

From the explanation of both Shulman (1991) and Fenstermacher (1994), it becomes clear that teacher preparation programmes are critical for understanding teachers' content knowledge and pedagogical classroom practices. The two authors also alluded to the fact that teachers gain knowledge from other sources as they gain experience in the classrooms. However, neither of the two researchers mentioned socio-cultural histories as one of the major sources of knowledge for teachers. I find this problematic because they both consider pre-service training as the beginning point from which teachers gain knowledge. On the contrary, studies indicate that social-cultural beliefs and perspectives are important sources of knowledge that influence teachers during preparation and professional career (see arguments by Adler and Goodman, 1983; Grant, 2003; Murry, 1997; Rios, 1996). As shall be explained later in this section, socio-cultural histories of teachers as well as students also influence classroom practices. It, therefore, follows as a logical conclusion that cultural histories play a pivotal role in shaping teachers' TK/P. Teacher preparation is the starting point to understand Shulman's and Fenstermacher's arguments about how teachers gain knowledge. However, teacher preparation is only one of the sources of teachers' pedagogical and content knowledge. As already mentioned earlier, socio-cultural background is another important source of teachers' socially constructed knowledge. Thus,

the next section is an attempt to explain the influence of teachers' socio-cultural histories on their selection of content and pedagogies in their classrooms.

**b. Socio-cultural influence on teachers' classroom practices**

Research on teachers' cognition has failed to vigorously explore how teachers gain knowledge from their social-cultural histories and also how those forms of knowledge influence their decisions in the classrooms (Rios, 1996). This does not suggest that there are virtually no research works on culture and learning. In fact, there is a significant amount of research works on culture, race, and schooling. These research works have, however, concentrated on the influence of race and culture on students' classroom achievements (Nasir and Hand, 2006). What the research studies have not investigated critically is how culture contributes to teachers' decisions on classroom practices they adopt (Hamilton, 1993; Rios, 1996). Indeed, 'what teachers tell us about their practice is, most fundamentally, a reflection of their culture, and cannot be properly understood without reference to that culture' (Hamilton, 1993, p.87). This implies that teachers, too, hold socially-constructed knowledge, beliefs, values, and perspectives that are shaped by their own cultural histories.

Grant (2003) defined belief as 'a proposition among things accepted as true, including axioms, rules of practice and perspectives' (p.153). Such beliefs manifest themselves into perspectives or stances, and these may influence teachers' decisions in the planning and implementation of lessons. Adler and Goodman (1983) defined perspectives as meanings and interpretations teachers give to classroom practices. Perspectives are set in the teachers' real world of everyday experiences. Thus, the manifestation of classroom behaviours is a result of teachers' background experiences, experiential beliefs, and assumptions made from those beliefs (Adler and Goodman, 1983).

**c. Teacher identity**

Successfully bringing an implementation of a curriculum hinges on the teacher's identity or dispositions towards work. In this study, teacher identity means a 'teacher's beliefs, dispositions and interests towards teaching given the conditions of his/her work' (Jansen, 2002, p.119). The feeling that a teacher has about his/her work shapes his/her ability in implementing a curriculum policy (Jansen, 2002). Kadzamira's (2006) study notes that low salaries, coupled with other poor working conditions in Malawi cause widespread teacher discontent and so teaching is regarded as 'employment of the last resort.' Teachers' discontent with their career may affect their performance and consequently affect the implementation of any curriculum including Expressive Arts.

**d. Personal circumstances of teachers**

Literature reviewed has shown that teacher personality, identity, knowledge of a curriculum, resistance to change and professional development are factors restricting a teacher's ability to implement a curriculum effectively. In addition, a teacher's personal social circumstances such as personal or family health and poverty are also factors that can undermine the implementation of a curriculum. For example, Lowe (2008) argues that many teachers in Malawi are constrained by social circumstances such as caring for sick children, personal ill-health and a meager income. These social circumstances often cause teachers to absent themselves from work. Describing teacher absences in Malawi, Lowe (2008), explains that

> At the first school I visited there should have been five teachers present, but three, including the principal, were absent on that day. If we add to this the claimed number of classes with no teachers at all, we see reasons why children might lose interest in school (p. 18).

A teacher's personal circumstances can therefore either inhibit or enhance the implementation of a curriculum.

To sum up, teachers are key players in the implementation of a curriculum because they are the ones who introduce a curriculum into the classroom. The success of a curriculum mainly hinges upon a teacher's commitment to a curriculum, the teacher's sound knowledge of the goals and content knowledge of the curriculum, teacher's knowledge about the practice of teaching the curriculum and suitable personal social circumstances. Such personal circumstances include personal and family health and sound finances.

### 4.3.2 The Learners

Learners are also important role players within both the structural context of the individual classroom environment and the social context in which a curriculum is implemented. The following characteristics of learners influence the implementation of a curriculum.

Learners also play a crucial role in successful implementation of a curriculum innovation. Just as teachers must accept a curriculum for it to be successful, so learners must also be willing to participate in the curriculum for it to be successful (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993). It is only when learners react to the experiences they encounter in the curriculum with cooperation that a successful implementation of a curriculum can be ensured at classroom level. If learners see little relevance in the curriculum activities planned, they are 'not going to be motivated to participate or learn' (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993, p. 317). There are of course other physical and psycho-social factors affecting learners which may affect their participation in the curriculum and consequently undermine the implementation of a curriculum. I will consider each of these learner physical and psycho-social factors in turn.

**a. Language and learning**

Language also affects learners' learning of curriculum subjects. Language is the means by which ideas are conveyed between a teacher and a pupil. Learning will therefore take place only in cases where a language that both a teacher and a child understand is used in the classroom. For example, learners whose home language is not the same as the language of instruction have been found to have more problems with learning of curriculum subjects (Fleisch, 2008; Lowe, 2008). The problem is compounded when the learners are taught by a teacher whose home language is not that of the learners. Pupils may not understand some concepts or issues in lessons taught in a 'foreign' language. Such concepts or issues will only be understood if translated into the learners' home language ('mother tongue'). A teacher whose home language is not that of the learners may not be able to make this translation for them (Lowe, 2008; Fleisch, 2008). Adler's (2002) study seem to support the claim made by Fleisch and Lowe that learners' understanding of the language of instruction plays a crucial role in the successful implementation of a curriculum. Adler, et al (2002) found that teachers in urban schools were implementing the South African new Outcomes Based Education curriculum with more fidelity than rural schools using English as a medium of instruction. Adler was investigating code-switching and English language practices in Mathematics and Science classrooms in South Africa. The study found that the teachers in urban schools implemented the new curriculum with fidelity than rural schools because the English language infrastructure of urban schools is supportive of English as the official language of teaching and learning. In urban areas, there is far more print and teachers and learners have access to these and to speakers of English. They have therefore more opportunities to acquire English language hence better teaching and learning happens in urban schools compared to rural schools.

**b. Poverty and learning**

Poverty affects learners' learning of curriculum subjects. For example, studies done in Malawi by Lowe (2008) and in South Africa by Fleisch (2008) identify poverty and language as two of the factors restricting a learner's ability to learn what is taught. Lowe and Fleisch concur that the most impoverished learners are those in the rural countryside who 'because of hunger which they are feeling, the learners do not concentrate on what is happening in class' (Lowe, 2008, p. 15). Similarly, 'sometimes, they come to school inadequately dressed, without a jersey or shoes. When a child is shivering, he does not learn well. He will not listen to the teacher or concentrate on what the teacher is doing because of the cold that he is feeling' (Fleisch, 2008, p. 36). Apart from hunger and illness, the cost of education is another constraint on learners' learning of the curriculum subjects. For example, Lowe (2008) notes that although primary education in Malawi is 'free', in reality, it is not free. There are direct costs of schooling such as costs of notebooks, clothing and other essentials such as soap. For poorer families these costs become too much and the pupils give up school as schooling is not compulsory in Malawi.

### 4.3.3 School principals

School principals are role players within the structural context of school organisation. Principals contribute to the successful implementation of a curriculum if they fulfil their role as 'curriculum and instructional leaders' (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993, p. 319). In their role as 'curriculum and instructional leaders' the principals are expected to 'spend time visiting teachers in the classroom, plan staff development programmes and modify school environment to improve instruction' (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993, p. 319).

In the implementation of PCAR, training was organized to orient principals and their deputies to the teaching of Expressive Arts and to sensitize them to the philosophy

underlying school-based support to untrained teachers (Ministry of Education, 2000). Principals are then expected to take a major role in the training processes of the Expressive Arts teachers in their schools. However, whether this happens on the ground is one of the issues which this study sets out to investigate.

### 4.3.4 Supervisors and Curriculum Directors

Supervisors[2] are also key role players within the structural context of the school organisation. Supervision by District Education officers plays a crucial role in the successful implementation of a curriculum. Supervisors need to monitor both the manner of teaching and the content that is actually being addressed by the teacher in the classroom (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993). It is the role of supervisors to provide direction and guidance to teachers on how to implement the curriculum effectively. The supervisor checks that teachers have the required knowledge and skills by observing classrooms to identify the needs of teachers as they implement the curriculum. If supervisors are effective, it is more likely that teachers 'will feel committed to and comfortable with the curriculum being implemented' (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993, p. 318). The duties of supervisors should include 'organising staff development meetings where they can conduct some practical demonstration of how to go about teaching the contents of a curriculum' (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993, p. 318). In Malawi, Primary Education Methods Advisors (PEAs) are the supervisors of curriculum implementation activities. Their major role is to 'visit schools regularly to guide and advise school staff on good practice in teaching' (Kadyoma, 2003, p. 136). The Primary Education Advisors (PEAs) are expected to monitor the teaching of Expressive Arts. In cases where the teachers experience difficulties in teaching the subject, the supervisors are expected to advise the teachers

[2] District Education officers

appropriately on how best they can teach the subject. Nyirenda's (1993) study seem to support the claim made by Ornstein and Hunkins that supervision by District Education officers plays a crucial role in the successful implementation of a curriculum. Nyirenda (1993) found that teaching and learning was better in urban primary schools than rural schools in Malawi when he carried out a study of the implementation of the then new curriculum, which was reviewed in 1991 in Malawi. He attributes this trend to frequent interaction between the teachers and Primary Methods advisors. Primary Education Advisors frequented visits to the urban schools because of availability of public transport in urban areas. Problems that teachers identified in the new curriculum were quickly communicated to and addressed by the Primary Education Advisors.

Curriculum Directors on the other hand are 'the full time centralized directors who oversee the entire curriculum activities' (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993, p. 318). They spearhead the development of a curriculum. Directors of curriculum can assist teachers in implementing a curriculum effectively by organising teacher development activities in which they can furnish teachers and principals with pedagogic and content knowledge of a curriculum. The curriculum directors also need to train school principals in supervising instruction of the curriculum in the classroom (Ornstein and Hunkins, 1993). In the case of Malawi, the Malawi Institute of Education is the national curriculum development centre, the curriculum director in the country. Malawi Institute of Education may be expected to perform the roles described above in order to enhance effective implementation of Expressive Arts.

### 4.4 External factors influencing curriculum implementation

Fullan (1991) defines external factors or forces as being government and other organizations related to education. In Malawi, the government cannot be regarded as an external factor, particularly in a situation where the curriculum innovation has been

initiated by government. All district officers and teachers are direct employees of the government. Furthermore, the resources given to schools and teachers all have their origin from government.

## 4.5 Some Other Curriculum Innovation Studies in Developing countries

There are numerous studies on curriculum innovation in the literature which have taken place in developing countries. A few of top- down curriculum innovations are reviewed in this section to provide some reference points in this evaluation. Three accounts of the studies in developing countries are given below.

### a. Zimbabwe Science Project (ZimSci)

This project arose out of the government policy to expand the secondary school education after independence in 1980. Schools in most rural areas were in existing buildings which had no laboratory facilities for science teaching. The government solution was to provide both teachers and pupils with science kits. Hungwe (1994) argues that the ZimSci project promised a new approach to science teaching within the financial constraints facing a developing nation. It was science without qualified teachers and conventionally equipped laboratories. It was assumed that the highly prescribed materials developed by experts would ensure high quality learning. However, because of inadequate training for the principals and the general shortage of staff from the head office to monitor the innovations, the project ran into serious problems. Insufficient materials were sent to the schools and the untrained teachers were, in most cases, reluctant to use the materials, presumably as they had been given insufficient information on how to use them effectively. The school principals were, in most cases, unable to provide adequate professional leadership because of inadequate training.

The basic problem with this scheme was probably lack of sufficient training but also the originators of the innovation had assumed that the users of the materials would take a fidelity approach in using the materials, sometimes this is not the case.

**b. A study of Kano state science secondary schools (Nigeria)**

The analysis of the implementation of the science curriculum in Kano state in Nigeria by Adam (1991) seems to have focused on two primary goals. The first goal was the notion of increasing the number of qualified science students who would continue to pursue courses at higher institutions of learning, and the second goal was to increase the amount of scientific and technical manpower in Kano state through science. Although the government's perception of the schools science project was that it had been a success in terms of achieving the purported goals, Adam (1991) argues that there was a mismatch between what the developers had prescribed as the pedagogy of the school's science and what the teachers did in the classroom. This might have been a problem of clarity of the innovation. Teachers may not have been clear what they needed to change. It might also have been a problem of teachers rejecting the innovation and preferring to maintain their old teaching approaches which they thought worked well. But Adam suggests that the inadequate supply of qualified science teachers indigenous to Kano state was the main factor of failure in this case.

**c. Perception gaps in technical assistance in Sudan**

In a further study in Sudan, one of the categories that Leach (1991) examined was the problem of changing the attitudes of participants in an innovation project. The aim of the Technical Assisted Project was to decentralise the current responsibilities of staff at the University. The expatriate project staff argued that practical subjects such as forestry and agriculture could not be run by academics from behind a desk. In one of the agricultural

training projects, it was felt that technical teachers should not only teach theory in the classroom but should also get out into the workshop and to the field to give practical demonstrations. On other university projects, lecturers were encouraged to carry out administrative duties to ensure constant high standards of teaching and research, but the local staff did not see any need for change. Local staff perceived that such a change in their terms of reference would only bring more work, and, more importantly, would result in an effective down-grading of their profession and social status. This is a clear illustration of Fallen's (1991) point that all real change involves loss, anxiety and struggle. Schon (1971) also argued that real change involves passing through zones of uncertainty. The PCAR is no exception.

This study, therefore, is significant as it will unveil some of the anxieties and uncertainties that teachers might have about the curriculum innovation. It is also intended to find out how the curriculum reform has been understood as a result of the implementation strategies discussed earlier in chapter 2 and in this chapter. A clear understanding of the curriculum reform would facilitate the faithful implementation of the reform.

## 4.6 Closing remarks

The goal of this chapter was to explore the ongoing conversations about barriers to effective implementation of a curriculum innovation. The review of literature in this area has shed some light on a number of important areas worth our attention in the implementation of a curriculum innovation, the most salient one being that teachers make final decisions in the implementation of a curriculum (Thornton, 2005), but they do so under various constraints. Some of the constraints are individual, for example, their beliefs and perspectives. Others are external such as the use of mandated tests, inadequate resources, and large classes. Literature has revealed that the various constraints that teachers face in their classrooms cause a discrepancy between the 'intended curriculum'

and the ‘enacted curriculum’ (Dilworth, 2004; Ross, 1991). As curriculum managers, teachers gain full control of the enacted curriculum, but they have little influence over the intended curriculum, which is state controlled. This explains why various systematic problems influence teachers to enact the intended curriculum in various ways based on what works for them (Ross, 1997; Thornton, 2005). In Canada, for example, educational reform policy had emphasized student’ active participation in their learning, but the teachers continued with direct pedagogical strategies (Sears and Hughes, 1996). A similar study in primary schools in Malawi showed inconsistencies between the state’s recommended practice in the English teacher’s guide, and the actual classroom practices (Croft, 2002).

The research studies on implementation of curriculum innovations in developing countries cited in this chapter only indicate the discrepancy between the intended curriculum and the enacted curriculum and not much about the constraints that teachers face in the classroom for that discrepancy to occur. For example, five years after the government emphasized the use of learner-centred or participatory learning in Malawi, Chipungu *et al.* (2010) indicated that, ‘teachers are observed to continue to use traditional teacher-centred approaches with a large proportion of class time spent on pupils doing exercises which teachers check or mark during the lesson’ (p.12). However, such literature does not shed light as to why and how teachers resort to teacher-centred pedagogies. This is where I agree with Hammersley and Atkinson (1983) that sometimes we take for granted certain events, which can be problematic to the people that experience them. Thus, discussions with teachers and classroom observations provided better avenues for this study in the exploration of how primary school teachers in Malawi made decisions in implementation of Expressive Arts curriculum. From this perspective, the next chapter details the research

design and methods that were used in this study for the exploration of how twelve primary school teachers enacted the Expressive Arts curriculum.

# CHAPTER 5

# RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGIES FOR THE COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS OF DATA

## 5.1 Introduction

In this chapter, the research design of this study will be described and elucidated. The chapter is divided into four sections. Firstly, the broad research design paradigm in which the research approach is located will be identified. Secondly, the features of the specific methodology adopted, namely Illuminative evaluation, will be outlined. Thirdly, the research site and sample of the participants will be outlined. Finally, the data collection and analysis methods will be discussed.

## 5.2 Research design

This study is situated within the qualitative research paradigm**.** Qualitative research is interested in gaining insight into and understanding of a phenomenon. One of the assumptions of qualitative research is that multiple realities are socially constructed through individual and collective definitions of a situation (McMillan and Schumacher, 1993). The present study assumed that the Expressive Arts teachers constructed realities in their classrooms individually and through interactions with learners. In so doing, they adapted, transformed or interpreted a curriculum to suit their situation. Also qualitative research could be described as an interpretive and naturalistic approach to the world (Denzin and Lincoln, 2000). This study satisfies these descriptions in that I collected data in the natural setting and engaged in interpretation in order to construct meaning from the data. Among the strengths of qualitative research is its ability to illuminate the particulars of human experience in the context of a common phenomenon (McMillan and

Schumacher, 1993). It enables collection of multiple accounts of a common experience across participants as well as individual accounts in specific contexts.

The aim of this study was to explore how teachers are teaching Expressive Arts curriculum. I felt that this aim was consistent with those of the qualitative research approach. A qualitative research design was therefore used in this study: Illuminative evaluation. Since the topic is school-focused, multi-site case study, using the methodology of condensed fieldwork was also adopted as the method for this research. The development, principles, methodology and application of Illuminative evaluation were discussed in detail in Chapter 3. For this reason, the discussion here will suffice with a summary of its main principles and procedures.

The aim of Illuminative evaluation is to inquire into and ultimately to produce an adjudication of a phenomenon by using description and interpretation of a programme and issues are allowed to emerge as the inquiry proceeds. Issues that are 'uncovered' as significant are then pursued.

In evaluating educational phenomena, Illuminative evaluation distinguishes between two fundamental concepts, the 'instructional system' and the 'learning milieu'. The instructional system is the 'formalized plans and statements which relate to particular teaching arrangements.' It includes 'a set of pedagogic assumptions, a new syllabus, and details of techniques and equipment' (Parlett and Hamilton 1976, p.89). However, it is essentially abstract and needs to be interpreted for a particular setting (Parlett and Hamilton 1976, p.89). This interpretation is manifested in the learning milieu, which is the 'social-psychological and material environment in which students and teachers work together' and a network of 'cultural, social, institutional, and psychological variables' that 'interact in complex ways to produce a unique pattern of circumstances' (Parlett and Hamilton 1976, p. 90). In Illuminative evaluation, both the instructional system and the

learning milieu are investigated, and the connections (or lack of connections) between the two – the ‘matches’ and ‘mismatches’ – are uncovered.

Parlett and Hamilton state that Illuminative evaluation ‘stands unambiguously within the anthropological paradigm’ (1976, p. 88-89). It is thus essentially an anthropological or ethnographic approach to evaluation and research. Ethnographers generally participate in the actual culture of the social group they are studying, so that the ethnographer himself or herself in fact becomes ‘the research instrument’ (Wolcott 1988, p. 190). Here they attempt to adopt an ‘emic’ or ‘insider's’ perspective of the group, and explore the activities and discourse of the group in such a way that they are ultimately able to produce a rich description of it, where possible in its own discourse in order to create a faithful representation of it (Fetterman, 1989, p. 30).

In investigating the instructional system and learning milieu, Illuminative evaluators may use ‘an eclectic set’ of methodologies (Miles 1981, p. 480), including both qualitative and quantitative methods (Parlett et al. 1977, p. 32). The main data collection methods are observation and interviews, which are complemented by questionnaires and documentary and background information study (Parlett and Hamilton 1976, p.94-96). Illuminative evaluation recognises the subjectivist nature of the data provided by participants as well as the opinions and judgment of the participants and evaluator. Certain methods can be used to reduce the subjectivity of findings, which include triangulation and the presentation of evidence in such a way that its quality can be judged (Parlett and Hamilton 1976, p.97). Illuminative evaluation does not claim to be value free, but aims ‘to represent different value positions, ideologies and opinions encountered’ during the investigation and to ‘represent them in ways considered fair by those holding these positions’ (Parlett and Hamilton 1977, p. 33). It is not the evaluator's responsibility to make a final adjudication that will determine the future of the evaluated programme, rather, the evaluator's role is to

present all the viewpoints of all the various participants and stakeholders, and decisions are then made by sponsors or management. Illuminative evaluation thus concentrates on the information gathering rather than the decision-making component of evaluation. The task is to provide a comprehensive understanding of the complex reality (or realities) surrounding the project: in short, to "illuminate"' (Parlett and Hamilton 1976, p.99).

Parlett and Dearden (1977, p. iii), after conducting a number of illuminative studies, concluded that the approach was particularly apt for evaluating programmes of the following nature:

1. Programmes that have complex goals that are difficult to define precisely;

2. Programmes that are 'significantly distorted by the local character of the institution or dominated by other 'special' influences', and

3. Progammes that are 'clearly not suitable as candidates for formalized evaluation designs because, for instance, of lack of time, a paucity of standard data, or simply because of uncertainty about the precise questions to be answered by the evaluation exercise.'

The Expressive Arts curriculum is very well described by these characteristics. The aims and outcome statements of the curriculum are broad, rich statements (e.g. 'create, interpret and present work') which will also take on their own character depending on the contexts in which they are implemented. The local character of every school site will influence how the learning of the curriculum takes shape there. In the light of this, Illuminative evaluation may be considered as particularly apt for evaluating this curriculum.

Within the broader guiding framework of Illuminative evaluation, it is proposed to use a number of specific data collection methods to study the instructional system and the learning milieu of the Expressive Arts curriculum. The proposed methods for inquiring

into the instructional system and that for exploring the Expressive Arts learning milieu are discussed below in the section following the section on research sample.

## 5.3 Sampling

This study used purposive sampling of the setting or site of the research and the participants. A sample is a finite part of a statistical population whose properties are studied to gain information about the whole (Merriam, 2002, p. 15). Purposive sampling is 'a form of sampling in which the selection of the sample is based on the judgement of the researcher as to which subjects best fit the criteria of the study' (Merriam, 2002, p.15). Purposive sampling is the opposite of random sampling in which the subjects or items to be involved in a study are chosen in such a way that all of them have the same chance of being selected. The samples to be used in this study are described below.

### 5.3.1 Description of research sample: The district

Zomba district was chosen for the purpose of evaluating Expressive Arts. The district has been particularly chosen because its teachers have received professional training in the teaching of Expressive Arts from the national curriculum development centre located in the district. The district has also a record of being receptive to research.

### 5.3.2 Description of research sample: School sample

There are 127 primary schools in Zomba district. Out of these, I selected six government schools which have received Expressive Arts curriculum documents and which have teachers who were trained to teach Expressive Arts in Standards 7 and 8. The schools were identified by letter codes 'A' to 'F' to provide anonymity. Provision of anonymity to all schools was followed according to recommendations of the Research Ethics Committee of the University of the Witwatersrand, on the importance of ensuring anonymity of all

participating institutions and participants in school - based research. The schools used in this study are described below.

**a. School 'A'**

**Environment**

The school is located in a rural area, approximately 20 kilometres from Zomba main township. It is a state primary school in the Domasi area of Zomba district.

**Resources**

The school has a combination of old and modern buildings. The modern buildings were built through a donation of the British International Development Agency. The school was established as a demonstration school where student teachers who were being trained as primary school teachers at the then Jean's training college, now turned the National Curriculum Development Centre since 1982, were doing their teaching experience or practice. The new classrooms which are in three rows facing each other are separated from the old classroom buildings, which are in one row, by a concrete pavement which joins the National Curriculum Development Centre's offices and its Cafeteria and the pavement passes amidst two of the rows of the school's classroom buildings. The new buildings accommodate Standards (Grades) 4, 5 and 6. The old buildings accommodate Standards (Grades) 1, 2, 3, 7 and 8. The school has unroofed brick built toilets, which are not enough. The classrooms have no electricity and are slightly dark with broken window panes. The school has a tiny principal's office attached to Standard 7 classroom. Standards 7 and 8 pupils are accommodated in one of the old buildings. At the school, furniture is limited to the senior section of the school, a scenario which is common in most Malawian primary schools. The infants (standards one and two) and the juniors (standards three to five) have no furniture. Consequently the pupils sit on the floor.

Teachers' houses are within the school compound. The provision of teachers' houses at schools in the rural area is one of the major differences with schools in urban areas where teachers' accommodation is not provided, except for the head teachers (principals) in some schools.

**Community**

Apparently, learners come from a number of neighbouring villages covering wide geographical area because the school has a strong reputation for producing good results. There is strong parent participation with an active school committee known as 'Parents and Teachers Association (PTA)'.

**Management**

The organisational structure of the school consists of the head teacher (principal), deputy head teacher, heads of sections and heads of classes. This structure is the same in all the other schools studied in this research and all other primary schools in Malawi. Other responsibilities given to teachers include heads of examinations, sports and traditional dances. The school has committees which look after the different activities at the school. For example, there is a discipline committee and a sports committee. The head teacher (principal) is responsible to the District Education Manager. However, he is an ex-officio member of an elected school committee which runs the school. The committee has powers provided by the Education Act to request the removal of any teacher including the principal should they feel that their performance is unsatisfactory. The committee also controls funds contributed by pupils for paying a security guard at the school. The committee is also responsible for the maintenance of the school buildings. However, the provision of books and the payment of teachers remain the responsibility of the Ministry of Education through the District Education Manager. The school leadership takes a

special interest in the general welfare of the learners. This is reflected in the manner in which the school principal handles the learners. One example is the way the principal resolved the problem of a pupil falling ill at the school. The principal asked one teacher to escort the learner to the clinic first, before being sent home.

**b. School 'B'**

**Environment**

The school is situated in the urban area of the main township of Zomba district. It was established in 1926 by the Blantyre Synod of the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian as a Christian mission school.

**Management**

At present, the responsibility of running the school is shared between the government and the church. The government employs the teachers of the school. The teachers are first scrutinised by the board of the church to assess their professional conduct and ability before they are deployed to take up employment at this school or before they are accepted to teach at the school if they are being transferred from another school. The school head teacher (principal) has to be a member of the Church of Central Africa Presbyterian (CCAP ) church. The church is responsible for maintenance of the school and provision of the physical resources while the government is responsible mainly for paying the teachers' salaries.

**Ethos of the school**

The school is said to run on Christian ethics although the school enrols pupils from different religions. There is a church hall within the school premises which signify the strong religious attachment the school still has with the church. The principal and deputy principal's offices are attached to the church hall block. On the notice board behind the

principal's table are the Mission Statement of the school and rules for both the pupils and teachers. The Mission Statement of the school reads, 'to effectively educate young boys and girls to the high standards so as to attain a very good background for higher learning.' The pupils' rules read, 'every child should come to school by 7:00 a.m.; attend all lessons; work hard in class; keep the classrooms and grounds clean; respect teachers, friends and visitors; do not fight; do not steal; look after all school properties well; wear school uniform daily except Wednesdays; do not use foul language and use the toilets and rubbish pits properly.'

One of the teachers' rules reads, 'teachers must be punctual for their classes.'

**Resources**

The school has a combination of both old and new classroom buildings. A deeper look into the school structures showed that the old classrooms and offices are well maintained and they had just been painted. The school has a brick fence with a gate for controlling outsiders to enter. It has also a spacious yard grown with ornamental flowers and grass. The yard is also interspersed with trees which provide good shade where pupils sit and enjoy fresh air during break times. The school has also a Feeding Programme where learners are given porridge between 10:00 to 10:30 a.m. every school day. The Feeding Programme is said to tremendously improve school attendance and has consequently reduced absenteeism of learners.

**c. School 'C'**

**Environment**

The school is located in a rural area, to the north of the main township of Zomba district. The school is located approximately 21 kilometres from Zomba main township. It opened its doors in 1948 and it is named after the Chief (Traditional Authority) of the area. It is

named after him because he offered the ground where the school was constructed. The surrounding areas are fairly poor. The school is surrounded by grass thatched village houses and some small-scale farming land.

**Resources**

The school has nine classrooms and standard one has double streams. Standards seven and eight classrooms have yellow plastic chairs with wooden desks. The staffroom and the principal's office are accommodated in the same block. The staffroom has only a few tables and chairs for teachers with some cupboards and shelves for safe keeping of teachers' teaching materials and learners' notebooks for marking. The classroom blocks and the block which accommodates both the staffroom and the principal's buildings show that they have just been renovated and painted. The renovation and painting is said to have been done by a non-governmental organisation known as 'the Gift of givers'. 'The Gift of givers' also provides a school Feeding Programme where learners are given porridge between 10:00 to 10:30 a.m. every school day. The teachers also take advantage of the programme for them to also get a share of the porridge which they take from their staffroom. The staffroom has a radio whose purpose is for the teachers to tune in to educational programmes, especially 'Tikwere' programme which is an initiative of the United States Development Aid Agency to promote good teaching practices for the new curriculum. Teachers' houses are within the school compound. Behind the school block is a string of pit latrines, which is typical at schools in the rural areas of Malawi. The toilet facility for staff is a tiny thatched pit latrine.

**Management**

The school has the same organisational structure as school 'A.'

**d. School 'D'**

**Environment**

The school is located in the heart of the main township of Zomba district, behind a Shoprite supermarket. The school was formerly named after a prosperous Indian entrepreneur, a Mr Ghandi. This is because the school used to mainly cater for children of Indian traders in the township. The government however later directed that schools should not be named after people. The school therefore took up the name of a river close to it. The school now mainly caters for black children.

**Resources**

The school has a combination of old buildings and modern buildings built through a donation of the British International Development Agency. The school lies close to a Teacher Development Centre (TDC). The old buildings accommodate infant and junior classes, Standards (Grades) one to four. The new buildings accommodate senior classes, Standards (Grades) five to eight.

The old classrooms, the principal's office and staffroom offices are well maintained. The school is well resourced in terms of physical facilities, such as desks. It has a spacious yard grown with ornamental flowers and grass. The school yard is also interspersed with trees which provide good shade where pupils sit and enjoy fresh air during break times. The school has also a Feeding Programme where learners are given porridge between 10:00 to 10:30 a.m. every school day. This is believed to have tremendously improved school attendance and consequently reduced absenteeism of learners. During the time I went to the school for data collection, a charity organisation known as the 'Samaritan'

donated parcels of assorted items to every pupil at the school. I learned that the donations had been organised by well-wishers in America. This further is said to have boosted the attendance of the learners, as it is said that the learners thought that they may miss such gifts if they absent themselves from school.

**e. School 'E'**

**Environment**

The school is located in a rural area surrounded by two villages, Mtwiche and Mtogolo villages which form the larger part of the catchment area. The school is named after a small stream to the north of it.

**Resources**

There are nine classrooms in the school. The buildings are new which were funded by the German Cooperation Agency. The principal and the deputy principal share the same office. Furniture in the principal's office comprised of two tables and four chairs. Two chairs for the principal and his deputy and two chairs for visitors. There is also a staffroom for the rest of the teachers. The staffroom has a radio whose purpose is for the teachers to tune in to educational programmes, especially 'Tikwere' programme. The principal's house is within the school compound. Behind the school blocks is a string of pit latrines for teachers and learners.

**Management**

The school has the same organisational structure as school 'A.'

**Ethos of the school**

The school appears to have a very relaxed atmosphere. The relationships between staff are cordial. For example, the teachers sung traditional songs together as they were preparing for teaching their various lessons.

**f. School 'F'**

**Environment**

The school is located in the outskirts of the main township of Zomba district in a small growing town of Matawale. It is named after a river which is to the south of the school.

**Resources**

The school has 16 classrooms. The classrooms were recently built with International Development Aid (IDA) assistance. All classes, Standards one to eight, have two streams each. Four of the classes are being used by Malawi College of Distance Education students who are pursuing secondary school education through distance learning with some contact hours with secondary school teachers late in the afternoons. The principal's office has good furniture as part of the IDA package. There is however no electricity at the school. The school has furniture and adequate storage facilities. There is no accommodation for teachers, but the principal's house is within the school compound.

**Management**

A similar school organisation to the other schools exists at the school.

**Summary of schools**

A common element of all the six study schools is large enrolment. The number of teachers in these schools varied a great deal. Consequently, the teacher-pupil ratios also varied as shown in Table 5.1.

**Table 5.1: Summary of study schools**

| School | A | B | C | D | E | F |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Type | Rural | Urban | Rural | Urban | Rural | Urban |
| Roll | 1333 | 725 | 761 | 1156 | 604 | 2743 |
| Teachers | 21 | 25 | 16 | 34 | 8 | 61 |
| Teacher-pupil ratio | 1:63 | 1:29 | 1:95 | 1:34 | 1:75 | 1:45 |
| Number of teacher participants | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |

### 5.3.3 Description of research sample: Class sample and teacher samples

Standards seven and eight classes were studied. These two classes were selected particularly as they are exit classes for the primary school system to which the Ministry of Education attaches a lot of importance or value. The Ministry of Education sees it important that children in these two classes be equipped with the necessary skills to prepare them for life out of school for those who have no opportunity to proceed with secondary school education, hence the particular need for curriculum learning areas to be effectively taught and achieve their outcomes in these classes. There was therefore a need to gauge if the curriculum in these classes is being taught as intended. Teachers teaching Expressive Arts in these two classes were studied. The teachers who participated in the study are described below.

In all, twelve Expressive Arts teachers drawn from six state schools in Zomba were studied. Two teachers were drawn from each of the six schools studied. The teachers represented Standards seven and eight in a school. At a primary school there are three sections: infant section (standard one and two), junior section (standards three and four) and senior section (standards five to eight). The participants were trained teachers

currently teaching Expressive Arts in the six state schools. All the teachers had gone through a two-year conventional teacher education programme to become teachers. Eleven of the teachers in the sample were holders of the Malawi School Certificate of Education (MSCE) and one only is a holder of Junior Certificate of Education**.** Primary school teachers in Malawi are mainly in three categories: trained teachers that completed four years of secondary education (MSCE) and passed public examinations at that level (graded as T2 teachers), those that completed two years of secondary education (JCE) and passed public examinations at that level (graded as T3), and those who passed the public examination at any of the two levels but have no teaching certificate (graded as untrained teachers). Those teaching without a teaching certificate were not sampled for this study. Their ages ranged from 34 to 52 years. Their teaching experiences ranged from 5 to 20 years. Seven of the teachers in this study are females and five are males. All the teachers have minimum qualifications for their positions as teachers in the primary school and were relatively experienced. All the teachers had more than ten years of teaching experience. All the teachers studied were trained in the normal training program of the teaching of Expressive Arts. Table 5.2 below shows the teachers' gender, grade level at which they were teaching at the time of the research, their academic qualifications, teaching experience and the teacher education qualifications they have.

**Table 5.2: Teachers of Expressive Arts biographical data**

| | Gender | Age | Teach-ing Stand-ard | Acad-emic qualifi-cation | Educa-tion qualifi-cation | Teaching Exper-ience | Exper-ience in Expres-sive Arts | School |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | Female | 45 | 8 | MSCE | T2 | 20 years | 1 year | F |
| 2 | Female | 40 | 7 | MSCE | T2 | 14 years | 1 year | A |
| 3 | Female | 34 | 8 | MSCE | T2 | 13 years | 1 year | B |
| 4 | Female | 35 | 7 | MSCE | T2 | 10 years | 2 years | B |
| 5 | Female | 39 | 7 | JCE | T3 | 16 years | 1 year | F |
| 6 | Female | 40 | 8 | MSCE | T2 | 17 years | 2 years | A |
| 7 | Female | 37 | 7 | MSCE | T2 | 14 years | 2 years | D |
| 8 | Male | 38 | 7 | MSCE | T2 | 16 years | 2 years | C |
| 9 | Male | 52 | 7 | MSCE | T2 | 10 years | 2 years | E |
| 10 | Male | 36 | 8 | MSCE | T2 | 14 years | 2 years | E |
| 11 | Female | 40 | 8 | MSCE | T2 | 15 years | 2 years | D |
| 12 | Male | 42 | 8 | MSCE | T2 | 20 years | 2 years | C |

## 5.4 Preparation and conduct of field work

As indicated earlier on, data was collected in six schools. The implementation of the new curriculum in Malawi was designed to proceed on four classes per year basis. In 2007, Standards one, two, three and four started implementing the curriculum. The implementation was completed the following year with Standards five, six, seven and eight. Data were collected for a period of five months, from 5th January, 2010 to 7th May, 2010. Due to long travel distances between schools and MIE, one week was spent in each school. Case studies produced a large volume of data covering a wide spectrum of aspects of curriculum implementation.

### 5.4.1 Access to schools

This study was conducted after permission was obtained from the University of Witwatersrand ethics committe. The Research Ethics committee's clearance number for this study is Protocol: 2009ECE123. The ethics clearance letter has been attached at the end of this thesis as Appendix 5.

A written request to the District Education Manager was sent, together with the research proposal and intended methods of collecting data. This was in accordance with the government regulations which require a researcher intending to carry on research in schools primary schools under MoEST to submit a written request to the DEM of the education district in which the research would be conducted. The letter to the DEM explained the purpose of the research and how it would assist the implementation of the new curriculum. The DEM was slow in replying, but a senior from the DEM's office advised me to start making advance preparations for the visits to schools as permission was sure to be granted. The delay was attributed to the bureaucratic procedures that the letter had to go through. School principals were then informed that permission had been granted for the research to be conducted in their schools. A schedule of visits was sent to the DEM's office and copied to each case study school.

### 5.4.2 Data collection methods for investigating the 'instructional system'

This research used a triangulation of data collection procedures involving various sources of data that included documentary review, a questionnaire, observations and post-lesson observation probing interviews as principles of Illuminative evaluation to investigate the 'instructional system' and the 'learning milieu'. As indicated earlier, the field work was carried out in five months, from January to May, 2010. The research techniques employed for data collection are discussed in detail below.

**a. Official documents review**

Study of official documents was the primary means of investigating the 'Instructional System' of Expressive Arts. The term 'official documents' here refer to curriculum policy documents relating to the Expressive Arts 'intended' curriculum with information on the aims, content and pedagogy of the Expressive Arts curriculum such as the 'Teachers'

Guide and Learners' textbooks for Standards seven and eight. Apart from official documents, 'documentary sources' were also studied to investigate the instructional system. The term 'documentary sources' here refers to both official and other relevant written materials obtained from the school, such as teachers' schemes of work, lesson plans and notes and pupils' work. The documents have the potential to serve as a rich source of information about the instructional system

The documents mentioned above were therefore scrutinised and analysed, using a selection of techniques for qualitative content analysis described by Denscombe (2003, p.221-223) and Babbie (2004, p.314-322):

• Choosing an appropriate sample of texts. In the case of this study, texts selected were those that contain information on the aims and content knowledge of Expressive Arts and that could throw light on the pedagogy and assessment inherent in it.

• Examining the text initially to form a "hypothesis" about the essential message it conveys. In this case, the texts were examined to form an impression of the nature of the instructional system of Expressive Arts – the nature of the content knowledge that is envisaged that the learners will learn, the outcomes that it is envisaged that the learners will achieve, and the pedagogical and assessment methods used to assist the learners in achieving these.

• Coding the texts in relation to the content knowledge, pedagogy and assessment inherent in the curriculum. 'Forms of knowledge in the curriculum' as postulated by Moore and Muller (2001) and Productive Pedagogies as postulated by Lingard *et al.* (2001), which have been discussed in detail in section 5.6.3 later, in this chapter, were used as the lens for coding and analyzing the content knowledge and pedagogy and assessment respectively in the enacted curriculum.

### b. Teacher questionnaire

In addition to the official documents and other written materials obtained from the school, a questionnaire was also used to investigate the 'instructional system' of Expressive Arts. Fetterman (1998) highlights the significance of questionnaires as a tool for data collection. Fetterman (1998) argues that

> Questionnaires are an excellent way to tackle questions dealing with representativeness although they may not have the same flexibility as interviews and observation and might not be able to provide data of the same detail, depth or clarity, due to being highly structured and requiring written responses (p.65).

In other words, by being distributed to a larger sample than can be used in interviews and observations, questionnaires can throw light on how representative a particular issue or opinion might be in a certain population. In this study, a questionnaire was used as another source to obtain further information and clarify aspects of the 'instructional system'. The questionnaire therefore helped to validate data obtained through document review.

The questionnaire contained 15 closed questions and one open question (see Appendix 2). These questions sought to elicit the following information:

- Identity of the school.
- Teachers' teaching experience
- In-service courses attended by the teacher
- Design of the Expressive Arts curriculum
- The content of the Expressive Arts curriculum
- The teacher's methodologies of teaching Expressive Arts
- How teachers assessed the achievement of the prescribed outcomes.

- The teachers' opinions on the design, content, teaching and assessment stipulated in the curriculum policy documents for Expressive Arts.

Construction of the questionnaire was guided by the research design itself, Illuminative evaluation concepts of 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu.' It had therefore to enable collection of information on what was in the 'plan' for Expressive Arts in terms of what the documents prescribed about content, pedagogy and assessment in Expressive Arts.

A number of people looked at the questionnaire which helped to ascertain if it would elicit desired information. First was my supervisor, who thought it was appropriate for the task. Next, was the Research Ethics Committee of the Wits School of Education of the University of the Witwatersrand who also looked at the questionnaire when considering the ethics proposal. Finally, before administering it, I piloted the questionnaire on 24 Expressive Arts teachers. The pilot results made me refine the questionnaire. The piloting of the questionnaire is described below.

**c. Piloting the questionnaire**

The questionnaire was piloted in six schools in the Zomba district. The questionnaire had eight sections as follows; demographic data of the respondents, Expressive Arts curriculum design, planning/designing lessons in Expressive Arts, Expressive Arts teaching methods, Assessment in Expressive Arts, Expressive Arts resources, Teacher-learner ratio in Expressive Arts classes and General comments on Expressive Arts curriculum design, content, teaching and assessment methodologies. The questionnaire sought information on the extent to which Expressive Arts teachers, who have been teaching the learning area in Standards seven and eight understand the principles

underpinning the design of the Expressive Arts curriculum and what their practices are in the teaching and assessment of learners in the learning area.

The piloting of the questionnaire was done between 14th and 20th November, 2009.

In all, 24 teachers participated in responding to the questionnaire. I left the questionnaire with them and collected them after two days.

The responses from the participants were analysed. The analysis was aimed at finding out the extent to which the questionnaire items would yield the intended or appropriate data to answer the research questions of the study. The responses from the teachers showed that three items on the questionnaire did not yield the intended or appropriate data. The following are the items and the data they yielded.

- *What in your experience are the shortcomings or constraints of successfully teaching Expressive Arts learning area? What are most difficult aspects to teach?*

The hope was that in asking this question, the teachers would explain the most difficult topics to teach in Expressive Arts. From the responses however, it was difficult to establish the topics the teachers find difficult to teach in Expressive Arts. For example, one teacher responded, '*the difficult aspects to teach in Expressive Arts is when the teacher fails to explain the content of the topic.'* Another teacher responded, '*Inadequate training*.' Most teachers did not respond to the question.

- *What would you identify as positive or encouraging for your future practices of teaching Expressive Arts more successfully?*

The hope was that in asking this question, the teachers would explain some arrangements or structures existing at the school to help them professionally to teach Expressive Arts.

Those who responded to the question gave responses such as, '*I will help those learners who are not intelligent but have skills to be able to stand on their own.*' Another teacher responded, '*Need more support.*' Most of the teachers did not respond to the question.

- *What changes has continuous assessment made to your assessing learners?*

The hope was that in asking this question, the teachers would explain how they do continuous assessment of the learners.

From the responses, it was difficult to establish the ways in which the teachers conduct continuous assessment. Some of the responses given by the teachers to this question included, '*Encourage learners to work hard*.' Another teacher responded, '*Absenteeism of learners has decreased because they feel if they absentee themselves, they might fail their examinations.'* Another teacher responded, '*Slow learners are able to do well at the end of the school year.'*

As a result of the above items of the questionnaire not yielding intended appropriate data, I thought of changing the wording of two of the question items and completely deleting one of them which seemed to have been a repetition of another item in the questionnaire, which came before it and this resulted in more or less similar data from two items in the same section of the questionnaire. The following is the way I reviewed the question items.

- *What in your experience are the shortcomings or constraints of successfully teaching Expressive Arts learning area? What are most difficult aspects to teach?*

In the above item, the words 'shortcomings,' 'constraints' and 'aspects' seemed to have been difficult for the teachers to understand. The above item therefore was rephrased as

- What in your experience are the challenges of successfully teaching Expressive Arts learning area? What are most difficult topics to teach?

- *What would you identify as positive or encouraging for your future practices of teaching Expressive Arts more successfully?*

The above item was deleted from the questionnaire because the item was more or less similar to another item which read:

- *What has been the most beneficial in assisting you to teach Expressive Arts using integrated approach?*
- *What changes has continuous assessment made to your assessing learners?*

The above item was rephrased as:

- *What changes in the way you used to assess learners have you now made as you do continuous assessment of your learners?*

### 5.5 Data collection methods for investigating 'the learning milieu.'

The actual learning milieu was investigated by means of the methods described below.

#### a. Observation

The most important data sources for the study were the classroom observations which took up a major portion of the field work. Observation is particularly important in ethnographic studies (Fetterman 1989, p. 45).

Naturalistic observation is conducted in natural, real-world settings by a researcher, who him or herself becomes the 'research instrument', attending not only to events but also to the socio-cultural context of these events (Wolcott, 2006, p. 190-193). Observation of this nature is a functional method of gathering data on what actually occurs in the learning milieu.

In this study, it was envisaged that non-participant observation of a teacher teaching Expressive Arts would be conducted during a number of lessons. While participant

observation is the preferred mode of observation for ethnographic studies (Fetterman 1989, p.45), it was precluded in this study by the fact that the researcher would be observing the teaching of a curriculum in which the researcher participated in designing and as such, it would be easy for the researcher to influence the way the lesson would be taught by the teachers. However, the observation would be 'participant' in the sense that the researcher would interact informally with the participants and, if the opportunity arose, would also engage them in informal conversation about the events observed.

During the observation, data was collected using two methods; voice recording using a digital recorder and capturing in long-hand classroom teaching practices of teachers. Almost all of the teachers observed agreed to have their classroom interactions taped. Key issues from lesson observations were followed up in detail with the teachers during the post lesson observation interviews in order to seek clarification and confirming patterns tentatively mapped out in the lesson observations. These notes were then being extended especially in the evenings after the observations to provide a full account of what was observed. The classroom observations generated a huge amount of data, more than three hundred pages of transcripts, and all the lessons were transcribed by the researcher. Although this was taxing work, it had the advantage that the content of the lessons was more firmly fixed in the researcher's mind as Hitchcock and Hughes (1989) argue that, 'the length of time the researcher has to spend with the data in order to transcribe them accurately means he/she is developing familiarity with the data' (Hitchkock and Hughes, 1989, p.167). The transcripts were subsequently analysed using the theoretical frameworks of 'Forms of knowledge' in the curriculum (Moore and Muller, 2001) and Productive Pedagogies (Lingard, et al. 2001) to determine the type of content knowledge taught by the teachers and the intellectual quality produced by their pedagogies in their learners.

**b. Interviews**

In naturalistic inquiry, interviews are generally unstructured and follow a flexible agenda, with particular lines of inquiry being generated *in situ* to uncover and pursue emerging issues (Cohen *et al.* 2000, p.140). Since Illuminative evaluation is essentially an ethnographic research method, ethnographic interview techniques were particularly relevant to this study. Fetterman (1989, p.47) describes the interview as 'the ethnographer's most important data gathering technique.' As with all naturalistic approaches, ethnographic interviews are frequently informal and uncover and pursue emerging issues (Fetterman, 1989, p.48-49). In this study, probing interviews were used, particularly at the end of a lesson observation. They followed the pattern described by Spradley (1979). According to Spradley, interviews proceed much like a conversation, following the interviewee or participant's interests, but the interviewer nevertheless needs to guide them in a fashion that will enable him or her to systematically learn more about the participant's life or experiences. Spradley further asserts that, 'it is best to think of ethnographic interviews as a series of friendly conversations into which the researcher slowly introduces new elements to assist informants to respond as informants' (Spradley, 1979, p.58). Certain types of questions are characteristically used in ethnographic interviews. Spradley identifies one of the main types of questions as 'descriptive questions' (Spradley, 1979, p.60). Descriptive questions are 'intended to encourage an informant to talk about a particular cultural scene', in the process eliciting utterances in the informant's particular discourse (Spradley, 1979, p.85). These questions can take the form of 'grand tour' questions, which ask for a verbal description of significant features of the situation being studied (Spradley, 1979, p.87). 'Mini-tour' questions deal with smaller units of experience. Other types of questions in this category are 'example' and

'experience' questions (Spradley, 1979, p.87-88). Interview questions may also be open-ended or closed-ended (Fetterman, 1989, p.54). As suggested above, open-ended descriptive questions such as 'tell me about …' or 'give me an example of …' will be frequently used in ethnographic interviews. Closed-ended questions, on the other hand, 'are useful in trying to quantify behaviour patterns' (Fetterman 1989, p.54). An example would be 'what subject disciplines did you integrate in this Expressive Arts lesson?' According to Fetterman, 'ethnographers typically ask more open-ended questions during the discovery phases of their research and more closed-ended questions during confirmational periods' (1989, p.54).

Many of the interview techniques described above were used during the current study. The interviews were categorized as semi-structured rather than structured, although specific questions had been developed to provide guidance during the interviews. The advantages of semi-structured interviews for this type of evaluation are well documented in the literature. Although research purposes govern the questions asked, their content, sequence and wording are entirely in the hands of the interviewer (Kerlinger, 1969). Consequently, the semi-structured interview allows the interviewer greater scope and depth to probe and expand the interview responses. As Cohen and Manion (1989, p.309) argue, 'the semi-structured interview is an open situation having greater flexibility and freedom.' The interviews were conducted during periods when the teachers were not teaching. The interviews were conducted in a place the teacher offered. At some schools, it was in the principal's office, at other schools, the interviews were held under a tree. All the teachers involved in the research agreed to have their interviews taped. The recorder used was chosen because it was sensitive enough to capture even low voices, possible to transfer the recordings to a computer, and it was small, light and easy to carry. One of the weaknesses was that it had small memory size, so there was need to transfer recordings to a computer

regularly. In one instance, this was not possible and the memory was full, so I just took notes. Another weakness was that batteries needed replacing regularly to avoid poor quality of voice resulting from low power and this carried a cost with it.

I could sit next to a teacher, with the voice recorder put on a desk or held in my hands in the case of where we sat under a tree, and ask questions. The teacher would then answer. The interviews started with a brief explanation of the purpose of the research and included provision for confidentiality. For example, the interviewees were assured that they would have access to the transcripts of their interviews. All the interviews were one to one. The greatest advantage of the one-to-one interview according to Powney and Watts (1987, p.50) is:

> They are easier to manage, issues can be kept relatively confidential; analysis is more straightforward in that only one person's set of responses are gathered at one time.

All the interviews were transcribed by the researcher. Two copies of the transcripts were made for each interview and in some cases one copy was sent to the interviewee for comments. The process of negotiation, which Cohen and Manion (1989) call 'respondent', was very useful in that it brought into the data some degree of reliability. Comments and alterations were made where interviewees felt the transcripts did not fully represent what they had intended to say.

The details about the interview sample and the type of interviews conducted in this study are described below.

**(i) Pre-observation interviews**

I interviewed the teachers before each lesson observed. Pre-observation interviews took between 10 and 15 minutes. The purpose of this instrument was not only to establish what

the class had been doing in Expressive Arts and what theme they would be working on during the observation but also the outcomes of the lesson to be observed and instructional materials to be used. The pre-observation interview schedule is attached at the end of this thesis as Appendix 4. Pre-observation interviews enabled me to collect data about what a teacher had planned to do in a particular lesson and the strategies the teacher would use and the reasons behind the choice of those strategies. This data contributed to answering the question about what teachers 'actually do' when teaching Expressive Arts in their classrooms.

**(ii) Post-observation interviews**

After observing each lesson, I interviewed the teachers again. Each interview took anything between 10 and 30 minutes. The interviews were designed to follow up issues noted during class observation. The pattern and nature of questions varied from one individual to another depending on issues that emerged during lesson observation.

These interviews were also audio-recorded. The interviews were also semi-structured in nature, so only guiding questions were brought in. The post-observation interview schedule is attached at the end of this thesis as Appendix 4. Here too, the post observation teacher interviews enabled me to assume that the teachers could engage in reflection over their practice and that the teachers could come up with new understanding and learning from experience.

Post-observation interviews generated data that contributed to these aspects of this study:

Deeper understanding of the strategies that the teachers used through answers to questions such as, *I want to get a clearer picture of your lesson you have just taught your learners. Please tell me about it, what was happening in the lesson*?

Also, during post-observation interviews, the teachers were given a chance to elaborate and clarify some points made during the lesson. Post-lesson probing interviews enabled me collect data about why teachers did certain things, especially reasons for choosing certain strategies. I could probe decisions made before and during the lesson.

Evidence from documents, lesson observations and interviews, both pre-lesson and post-lesson interviews were pooled during analysis according to the themes that emerged from the data. The findings on the learning milieu (lesson observations and interviews) were compared with those on the instructional system (official documents) and conclusions were drawn about how well teachers were teaching Expressive Arts, two years into the implementation of the national innovation. In this way, Expressive Arts could be explained and adjudicated in its own terms, with the adjudication representing all the different voices that had been involved in the inquiry.

Other field experiences that were observed related to the personal disposition of the researcher. The main one was the mode of dress. It was observed, during the first days of field work, that being neatly dressed in a primary school environment was also a sign of authority. The mode of dress also seemed to create a social distance between the researcher and the teachers. Only school principals appeared neatly dressed, very often in suits, and this was observed to be a sign of authority. From these early experiences, it was decided to dress like other teachers in the schools visited. Commenting on dress, Hammersley (1993) suggests that personal appearance can be a salient consideration and quotes Liebow (1967, p.255-56) who commented:

> Almost from the beginning, I adopted the dress and something of the speech of the people with whom I was in most frequent contact as best as I could without looking uncomfortable…

Consequently, the reaction of the respondent in relation to the researcher's disposition was observed throughout the fieldwork. Staying five days in each school was beneficial to the research in that it created a relatively free environment in which teachers could speak without fear.

## 5.6 Data management, confidentiality and analysis

By the end of the data collection period, there was a substantial amount of data that were generated from the analysis of curriculum documents, exhaustive interviews with teachers and in-depth classroom observations. This chapter ends with a discussion on how these data were managed, analyzed, and interpreted for coming up with results that are presented in Chapter 7.

### 5.6.1 Data management

Data obtained from various sources were in form of field notes and transcripts. I made field notes from the analysis of curriculum documents and teachers' teaching plans. I also made field notes and recorded the lessons using a digital recorder. There were 71 lessons that I observed during the five-month period. I replayed all the 71 lessons for purposes of writing detailed accounts. In addition to this, I made field notes based on the pre-lesson and post-lesson classroom observation interviews.

There were a total of 71 audio-taped interviews with teacher participants. I made verbatim transcriptions of all 71 interviews through a replay of the audio-recorded dialogues. Thus, by the end of the whole data management process, data were in form of field notes and interview transcripts.

### 5.6.2 Preserving confidentiality

All names of teacher participants and those of their schools are represented with pseudonyms throughout this paper in accordance to the standard requirements of the

University of the Witwatersrand Research Ethics Committee for all research studies involving human subjects.

### 5.6.3 Data analysis

Data analysis involves the researcher understanding and interpreting the data collected in order to generate findings, make conclusions and recommendations on the phenomenon under investigation (Merriam, 2002, p. 25). Data that were collected during the five months period came from prolonged engagement in interviews with the twelve case study teachers and also persistent observations in their classrooms. For this reason, the goal when analyzing the data was to achieve accuracy and precision between the data and the teachers' classroom practices that the data represented (see Emerson *et al.*, 1995). I achieved this goal through a number of steps. These steps involved:

i) Rigorous reading of the data in order to familiarize myself with them.

ii) Checking the transcripts while listening to the original tapes and with additional notes or deletions made where necessary.

iii) Reading through the transcripts and marking the important points.

iv) Marking possible quotes.

v) Identifying themes that were emerging from the data. These themes or categories were those related to indicators of dimensions of Productive Pedagogies (see Chapter 3). The four dimensions of Productive Pedagogies are shown in Table 5.3.

**Table 5.3 Productive Pedagogy dimensions, items and key questions addressed**

| Dimension | Indicator | Key questions asked to detect the presence of the indicator |
|---|---|---|
| **Intellectual quality** | Higher order thinking | • Are students required to manipulate information and ideas to arrive at new meanings?<br>• Is critical analysis occurring?<br>• Are students required to combine facts and ideas in order to synthesise, generalize, explain, hypothesise or arrive at some conclusion or interpretation? |
| | Deep knowledge | • Does the lesson cover central ideas and concepts in any depth, detail or level of specificity? |
| | Deep understanding | • Do the work and responses of the students demonstrate a deep understanding of concepts or ideas? |
| | Substantive conversation | • Does classroom talk lead to sustained conversational dialogue between students, and between teacher and students, to create or negotiate understanding of subject matter? |
| | Knowledge problematic | • Are students critically examining texts, ideas and knowledge? To what degree is knowledge presented as constructed? |
| | Meta-language | • Are aspects of language, grammar and technical vocabulary being given prominence? |
| **Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom** | Connectedness to the world | • Is the lesson, activity or task connected to competencies or concerns beyond the classroom or real-life contexts? |
| | Background knowledge | • Are links with students' background knowledge made explicit?<br>• Are there attempts to explore students' prior knowledge? |
| | Knowledge integration | • Does the lesson integrate a range of subject areas? |
| | Problem-based curriculum | • Is there focus on identifying and solving intellectual and/or real world problems that have no specific correct solution? |
| **Engagement with difference** | Cultural knowledge | • Are there explicit attempts to bring in beliefs, languages, practices and ways of knowing non-dominant cultures (e.g. in terms of gender, ethnicity, race, religion, economic status, sexuality or youth)? |
| | Inclusivity | • Are there deliberate attempts to increase the participation of students of different backgrounds? |
| | Narrative | • Is the style of teaching principally narrative, or is |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| | | it expository? |
| | Group identity | • Does the teaching build a sense of community and identity for different groups within the classroom? |
| | Citizenship | • Are there attempts made to foster active citizenship? |
| **Supportive classroom environment** | Engagement | • Are students engaged and on task?; are they attentive, doing the assigned work, contributing to group tasks and helping peers?; Or are they sleeping, day-dreaming, making a noise or otherwise disrupting the class? |
| | Student self regulation | • Are students regulating their own behavior, or is the teacher involved in giving directions on student behavior? |
| | Student direction of activities | • Do students have any say in the pace, direction or outcomes of the lesson? |
| | Social support | • Is the classroom a socially supportive and positive environment?<br>• Does the teacher convey high expectations for all students, including the expectation that they take intellectual risks and try to master challenging academic work?<br>• Is there a climate of mutual respect? |
| | Explicit quality performance criteria | • Are the criteria for judging the range of student performance made explicit? |

From the table above, forms of content knowledge in a curriculum is a significant aspect which is missing in Productive Pedagogy framework, but which was anticipated to exist in the lessons observed. For this reason, 'Forms of Knowledge in the curriculum' as postulated by Moore and Muller (2001) was used as the lens to illuminate the forms of content knowledge which teachers taught. In this indicator, the distinctions of instrumental and non-instrumental knowledge provided sharper categories of knowledge taught. Moore and Muller (2001) identify two forms of content knowledge that are reflected in many a contemporary curriculum policies. These forms of content knowledge are 'Instrumental' and 'Non-instrumental or traditional knowledge'. According to Moore and Muller, Instrumental curriculum has content knowledge that seems to aim at imparting to the learners knowledge and skills that are prerequisite for entering a particular profession,

accumulating power or influence or creating thing (including ideas) of utility or beauty. The knowledge in an instrumentalist curriculum becomes a tool through which the needs, aspirations, interests and objectives of the society are articulated and addressed as learning experiences for the development of the individuals through teaching/learning process. The knowledge is supportive of what is seen as the needs of both the society and the economy and learners have to be socialized to the culture of the society and the world of work and the schools is seen as a source of useable knowledge.

In both overseas and African countries, there is currently a general trend away from disciplinary majors in favour of instrumental subjects. For example, in the United Kingdom, instrumentalism, under the guise of promoting the employability of all students, has been adopted both in the Universities and in the academic curriculum for 16-19 year olds. All students are now encouraged to mix academic and vocational subjects (Moore and Muller, 2001). In America, the middle ranks universities, a central part of "academic revolution" are now dominated by instrumental as opposed to disciplinary curriculum.

In Nigeria, there has been an agitation for entrepreneurship education as one of the ways to solving youth unemployment (2004). Prominent among those that have already lent their voice to this call, are, Manufacturers Association of Nigeria (MAN), corporate bodies such as banking industry, oil and gas industry, who have justified the need for entrepreneurship education for the Nigerian students describing it as: skill they require to develop an entrepreneurial orientation and mindset as a necessary preparation for the business, vocational and professional lives after their formal schooling. In this regard, many higher institutions of learning in Nigeria have yielded to the calls through their academic programme planning unit by developing entrepreneurship programmes.

In Southern Africa, a number of Southern African Development Community (SADC) countries, such as South Africa, Botswana and Malawi have since 2004, following the

countries' adoption of the SADC Protocol on Education and Training, formulated curricula with strong instrumentalist slant.

Non-instrumental curricula on the other hand look at knowledge in the curriculum as an end in itself. In non-instrumental curricula, a curriculum is aimed at inculcating rational modes of behaviour among the learners rather than preparing learners for the world of work. In America for example, elite institutions are still largely being governed by traditional or non-instrumental curricula while the middle-ranked universities, as indicated earlier above are dominated by instrumental as opposed to traditional or non-instrumental curriculum.

The coding of the lesson observation data of the pedagogic practices of teachers through the lens of Productive Pedagogies enabled the study of the intellectual quality of the lessons. The lens illuminated the lessons in which teachers included or used dimensions and indicators of Productive Pedagogies, and the frequency with which the teachers used the dimensions and indicators of Productive Pedagogies in their lessons. Sample lessons illustrating how the dimensions and indicators of Productive pedagogies were applied to the lesson observation data to analyse the classroom practices of the twelve case study teachers are provided as Appendix 10 in the Compact disc accompanying this thesis. Other steps involved in analyzing the data involved:

vi) Arranging the themes or categories so that they form a logical pattern to facilitate the writing of the report.

vii) The analysis of the questionnaire involved:

a Reading through and writing down all meaningful responses.

b Putting similar responses together

c. Designing themes or categories and matching them with the themes from lesson observations and interviews.

The strategies outlined above were not in any strict order, but were interwoven as the research progressed. This meant continuously moving backwards and forwards among the transcripts and questionnaire data. This process is like that described by Glaser and Strauss (1967) as the development of 'ground theory', the production of analysis and explanation which is grounded in the data. This required moving consciously between the emerging explanations (Hitchcock and Hughes, 1989, p.98). The unit of analysis for data was Productive Pedagogies practices of teachers as postulated by Lingard *et al.* (2001). The categories from the above framework were thus applied to the entire data. Each category contained all pieces from the entire data body that were relevant to that category.

## 5.7 Trustworthiness of data through triangulation

In general, trustworthiness refers to 'the extent to which research questions elicit the data they are intended to get' (Merriam, 2002, p. 27). In this study, I piloted the questions to find out if they elicit the data needed. However, given the nature of qualitative research, replication or repetition of a study may not produce the same results. Instead, dependability or consistency of research results was used as the determinants to judge reliability. Strategies such as triangulation and member checks were used to ensure trustworthiness of the research (Merriam, 2002, p. 27). Triangulation means use of 'multiple sources of data', achieved by using two or more different data collection instruments. Data collected using one method such as interviews may be confirmed against what has been observed or found in documents. In this study, triangulation was implemented through use of interviews, lesson observation and document analysis to enhance the trustworthiness of the research findings. Member checks on the other hand require that the researcher confirms with the participant on his or her interpretation of the

data provided. In this study, member checks with the teacher participants were done. In addition to this, a questionnaire was used to cross-check trustworthiness of data obtained through the prior stages in data gathering – the analysis of the instructional system. Post-observation interviews were used to cross-check trustworthiness of data obtained through lesson observation for investigating the learning milieu.

## 5.8 Replicability of the study

The case study approach in this study provided the depth and complexity of learning how Expressive Arts primary school teachers implemented a new curriculum reform in Malawi. This is why the various sources used in this study yielded thick data that were rigorously analysed and interpreted to give a portrait picture of classroom practices of Expressive Arts teachers. For that reason, by analogy, the findings from this study provide valid lessons for other studies in settings that are sufficiently similar. Importantly, if the variables or the factors that determined the selection of the sample population for this study is prevalent in the parent population, the likelihood of getting similar findings would be high.

## 5.9 Closing remarks

As detailed above, this study falls within the qualitative research paradigm and while the descriptive and interpretive nature of this approach inevitably involved a degree of subjectivity, the research design described above resulted in findings to which a high degree of trustworthiness can be ascribed. During the study, the questionnaire, the observation data and the probing interviews data all enabled a great deal of cross-checking of data, which ensured a high degree of trustworthiness. As the study was focused on a few schools and few teachers only, its findings are obviously not directly applicable to other schools and teachers teaching Expressive Arts. Nevertheless, the study provided

insights about issues in Expressive Arts teaching and learning that might inform further studies of Expressive Arts teaching in other schools. The findings might also be compared with the findings of research on other similar curricula done elsewhere, from which generalizations could then possibly be drawn.

# CHAPTER 6

# ANALYSIS OF THE EXPRESSIVE ARTS 'INTENDED' CURRICULUM

## 6.1 Introduction

The specific conceptual distinctions of Illuminative evaluation, the 'instructional system' and 'learning milieu', have been employed in this study to evaluate the teaching of Expressive Arts. This chapter reviews the 'instructional system'– Expressive Arts curriculum documents, to respond to the sub-research question, 'What in the national innovation is the intended Expressive Arts curriculum?', of the critical research question, 'How do Expressive Arts teachers teach Expressive Arts two years into the implementation of PCAR in Malawi?' This critical question is fully answered in the discussion chapter, Chapter 8 of this study by comparing the 'intended' curriculum presented in this chapter and the 'enacted' curriculum presented in the next chapter.

Curriculum documents for each subject in the Malawi primary school sector are in the form of syllabi, teacher's guides and students' textbooks. A syllabus is a document that informs teachers about the organization of content and some suggested teaching and learning pedagogies for delivering the content to students. Teacher's guides give detailed information to teachers on how they can plan and teach their lessons. These documents represent what the state sees as appropriate content and classroom teaching and learning pedagogies for the preparation of learners who are equipped with the knowledge, competence, skills, values and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and be able to compete successfully in other contexts. The documents will be used as the 'instructional' system in this study to establish what was planned by the state to teach Expressive Arts.

The analysis of the Expressive Arts curriculum is in two parts. The first part looks at the content to be taught as proposed by the state. The second part explores the pedagogies and assessment strategies proposed by the state. This will help us in the construction of a picture of what the state believes is necessary for preparing learners who are equipped with the knowledge, competence, skills, values and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and to enable them compete successfully in other contexts. Discussion begins with the proposed content in the curriculum.

## 6.2 The Expressive Arts Content Knowledge

Banks (1997) asked pertinent questions that are worth considering in the selection of appropriate content for a curriculum especially in a culturally diversified society. Some of the questions he asked are paraphrased here as:

> Whose interest does it serve? Whose lived experience does it reflect? Can individuals and groups on the margins of society effectively participate in a transformation of the content and of society? (p. 3).

These questions raise important points for consideration in the selection of content for a curriculum meant to prepare learners equipped with the knowledge, competence, skills, values and attitudes necessary for active participation in society. He proposes that the selection of content should reflect the interests of people whom the curriculum is intended to serve. He further observes that the purpose for the selection of such kind of curriculum content should aim at giving people the crucial knowledge for the transformation of their societies.

In this connection, Barton and Levstik (1999) and Moore and Muller (2001) made an interesting suggestion of a broad humanistic education for the preparation of active citizens who are equipped with the knowledge, competence and qualities necessary for

active participation and successful fulfillment of their various roles in the society. This kind of education is the one that does not expose students to simple-minded indoctrination which does not answer to the needs of the students. Moore and Muller (2001) inspired by Barton and Levstik write about a curriculum meeting the interests of the people it will serve. Moore and Muller's conceptualisation of this curriculum is what they called 'instrumental curriculum.' Instrumental curriculum has content knowledge that seems to aim at imparting to the learners knowledge and skills that are prerequisite for entering a particular profession, accumulating power or influence or creating things of utility or beauty.

Taking this viewpoint, an analysis of the Malawi Primary Expressive Arts curriculum shows that the curriculum content aims at instrumental and humanistic education. In this connection, a discussion of the organization of this content for imparting to the learners social skills to nurture their development socially, creatively and emotionally to enable them live as productive members of their societies, families and as individuals is discussed in the next sub-section.

### 6.2.1 Organisation of the Expressive Arts content

Document analysis shows that two issues guided the development of the Expressive Arts curriculum content. The first is the organization of the multi-disciplinary content for the preparation of students with broad knowledge that would enable them to participate actively at various societal levels. The other is the organization of multi-cultural content for enhancing fairness among people in the country.

Therefore, discussion in this section will use the two factors that determined the selection of content for preparation of students who would participate actively at various societal levels.

The eight national goals of education in Malawi guide the organization of content for every subject in the primary school curricula. The goals are:

1. Citizenship skills
2. Ethical and socio-cultural skills
3. Economic development and environmental management skills
4. Occupational and entrepreneurship skills
5. Practical skills
6. Creativity and resourcefulness skills
7. Scientific and technological development skills
8. Contemporary issues and coping skills

Curriculum developers organize their subject curricula around these goals. For example, as regards to the rationale of Expressive Arts, Malawi Institute of Education (2005) states that

> The main purpose of Expressive Arts is to expose learners to traditional and diverse cultural experiences and enjoyment in music, dance, art, drama and sporting activities. Through their active involvement in the creation of these activities, it is believed that learners do not only contribute to their holistic development as individuals or teams, but also offer them a means of communication and promote the sense of pride in their cultural heritage. The learners also develop a sense of appreciation for their country's artistic skills in the fields of music, dance, art, drama and sporting activities (Expressive Arts Teaching Syllabus, p. 1).

The rationale implies that the goal of Expressive Arts is providing learners with social skills which can help them to actively participate in their communities by equipping them

with skills that will help them to create things (including ideas) of utility or beauty in their communities. This goal shows that the curriculum is oriented towards instrumental knowledge. Analysis of the curriculum documents showed that Expressive Arts achieves this instrumentalism through multi-disciplinary and multi-cultural content in the curriculum.

The next section is a discussion of the multi-disciplinary and multi-cultural content in the Expressive Arts curriculum.

### 6.2.2 Multi-disciplinary Content

Analysis of the curriculum documents showed that the content was drawn from various disciplines, but organized using 'themes'. The themes guide the selection of appropriate content for the preparation of learners with social skills which can help them to participate effectively at various societal levels in their communities.

The themes for the Malawi primary school Expressive Arts curriculum are:

1. Personal and general space
2. Conveying cultural messages
3. Designing and construction
4. Artistic skills and movements
5. Leadership roles
6. Artistic performance
7. Team work
8. Body movements
9. Multicultural performances
10. Performing dances
11. Artistic creativity
12. Self expression
13. Improvisation
14. Self expression
15. Multicultural arts

All grade levels use the same themes, but with a variation in content coverage across the grades. These themes draw their content from Physical Education, Needlecraft, Music, Drama, Dance and Creative Arts. Students at each grade learn the content drawn from these themes. For example, the following is some of the content in Standard 7 and 8, drawn from the theme, 'Multi-cultural performances.'

Standard 7: 1. Collecting and gathering materials for making attire

2. Sewing attire for cultural performances

3. Practising using the attire

Standard 8: 1. Identifying dances from different cultures

2. Carving a stool, weaving baskets, mats and making pots

3. Decorating the items

4. Marketing the items made

5. Producing plays depicting events in the rural and urban settings

Other examples of content in Standard 7 and 8 drawn from the various themes in Expressive Arts are given in Appendices 9.1, 9.2, 9.3 and 9.4 in the Compact disc accompanying this thesis.

While the selection of multi-disciplinary content in Expressive Arts may show that the curriculum was geared at preparing multi-faceted individuals, who can actively participate in the political, social and economic affairs of their country, the themes integrating the disciplines however seem to have some weaknesses. An observable weakness of these themes is that while the intention of the designers of the curriculum may have been to have each theme integrate across all the six disciplines, in reality however, only a few of them actually integrate across most of the disciplines which inform

Expressive Arts. For example, themes ‘Self expression’ and ‘Artistic creativity’ seem to cut across all disciplines in Expressive Arts. However, the theme ‘Designing and construction’ appears to be more related to Needlecraft than any other discipline within Expressive Arts. Similarly, the theme ‘Team work’ appears to be more oriented towards Physical Education than any other discipline within Expressive Arts. The implication of this is that the probability is very high that there would practically be no integration at all in some lessons of Expressive Arts.

Apart from the fact that the nature of the themes may not make integration practical in Expressive Arts, the disciplines combined in Expressive Arts are very diverse and some of them (for example, Needlecraft) are not very much related to other disciplines in terms of the skills involved in the disciplines. Teaching the diverse subjects which were previously taught separately may pose a big challenge to most teachers. For example, all the teachers involved in this study had teaching experience of more than ten years (see table 5.2). This means that these teachers were trained so many years back before Expressive Arts was introduced in Teacher Training institutions in Malawi in 2006. The teachers who were trained before 2006 in Malawi were taught in isolated disciplines in both content and methodologies in their teacher training institutions. Teacher training institutions did not prepare teachers to make the transition from an isolated subject-based curriculum to a more integrated one. Consequently, teachers are likely to have difficulty thinking in a holistic and integrated fashion. Expressive Arts teachers were of course provided with orientation in-service training to teach Expressive Arts (see chapter 2). The effectiveness and adequacy of this training in preparing the teachers to teach integrated Expressive Arts will be seen in Chapter 7, in which the teaching of Expressive Arts is put under a microscope.

Multi-cultural content was another dimension for the organization of the curriculum.

### 6.2.3 Multi-cultural Content

The Expressive Arts curriculum is representative in terms of ethnic groups, gender and region. The curriculum thus presents a cross-section of people based on race, ethnicity, gender, religion and region. For example, the content includes the ethnic cultures of the Chewa, Ngoni, Tumbuka, Lomwe and Yao ethnic groups of Malawi. Teachers are also encouraged to use examples of other small ethnic groups that are not stated in the curriculum, but in the social-cultural context of their schools. The goal of this kind of multi-cultural content might have been to equip learners with broad knowledge of various cultures which would enable them to be effective citizens. The content however seems to be weak in that it does not go beyond Malawi because other groups of people are not included in the curriculum. This shows that the content of the curriculum does not allow students to understand their culture in the context of other people outside their immediate environments.

In terms of gender, the curriculum content features both men and women. Gender issues are well presented in many of the themes, such as the theme 'Designing and construction.' As this theme relates most to Needlecraft, this can be seen as an attempt for the curriculum to be gender-responsive, as women are represented in the curriculum through the theme.

An analysis of the curriculum documents shows that the content of the curriculum was dovetailed with interactive participatory classroom practices with the goal of preparing competent learners able to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and compete successfully in other contexts. Therefore, the next sub-section is a discussion of the learner-centred and participatory classroom practices that the curriculum developers of

Expressive Arts designed for preparing learners who would be able to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and compete successfully in other contexts.

## 6.3 The Expressive Arts pedagogies

The curriculum documents, especially the teacher's guides, provide suggestions to teachers in the ways they can organize effective classroom practices for equipping learners with the knowledge, competence, skills, values and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and be able to compete successfully in other contexts. Therefore, discussion in this sub-section is in two parts. The first part is a discussion of the actual elements that define learner-centred and participatory classroom activities. The second part is a discussion of pedagogical strategies for the organization of effective classroom practices.

### 6.3.1 Elements of learner-centred and participatory pedagogies

The framing of Expressive Arts content using instrumental and humanist content is necessary, but certainly not enough for preparation of learners for the future. Learners will require knowledge, competence and qualities necessary to actively participate both in the changing Malawian context and to compete successfully in other contexts, and much depends on what happens in the classrooms. Adeyinka (2000) argued that while teachers' knowledge of the content is important, it is equally significant for teachers to know how to translate the content into meaningful learning experiences. The question that inevitably arises here is: What should an Expressive Arts classroom that prepares learners for active participation in the changing Malawian context and other contexts look like? Brophy and Alleman (1991) give us good insights because they argue that the best way for student development of skills is engagement in participatory activities both in schools and the communities around their schools. Brophy and Alleman argued that participatory

learning helps to cultivate necessary skills and values necessary for effective participation in the society. For this reason, Brophy and Alleman propose that learning must not be confined to the classroom because working with the communities around the schools can also help in the acquisition of knowledge and development of knowledge and skills and attitudes appropriate for adult life. In this regard, Cogan and Grossman (2000) correctly observed that community projects provide avenues for students' direct interactions with the community.

Literature reveals that such participatory classroom practices have several positive implications for learning. First, active participatory learning helps students transfer learning experiences in the classroom to the practical problems of everyday life. 'The greater the similarity between the situation in which that learning may transfer, the greater possibility of positive transfer' (Remy *et al.*, 1976). Secondly, this approach helps students tolerate and accommodate other students of different identities. The reason for this is that learning by practice requires that students should work with other groups of people who may be different from them. For example, 'when a diverse group of learners deliberate together, they create a new 'we' in which differences are regarded as an asset, listening as well as expressing occurs, stories and opinions are exchanged, and a decision is forged together' (Parker, 2004, p.80). In this way, activities that engage students in practising their skills help in the creation of public consciousness required in a society. Lastly, participatory learning offers teachers rare opportunities of viewing students' thinking and learning processes (Turner and Patrick, 2004). Thus, teachers can plan how to scaffold activities for students.

Peters (1999) concurred that the role of teachers in education is promotion of students' active involvement in lesson activities as a way of empowering them in making rational decisions in the everyday life. Hence, 'preparing learners to make reasoned judgment

cannot be accomplished by telling them what to think. Preparing them to take part in collaboration discourse about the common good cannot be accomplished by tightly controlled, teacher-centred instruction' (Barton and Levstick, 2004, p. 260). This indicates that teachers must organize classroom practices that enable students' development in skills necessary for active participation in public life. Such skills include making positive arguments, listening to other people's views and tolerance to other peoples' views. Thus, educators propose that teachers must use learner-centred pedagogies and techniques like panel discussion, role-play and oral reports to develop positive skills and values in students (Malawi Institute of Education, 2005).

In this connection, Expressive Arts curriculum proposes that teachers should use learner-centred and participatory approaches to teaching of Expressive Arts. Curriculum documents say that classrooms of Expressive Arts must display activities and practices that are appropriate for the students' acquisition of knowledge and the development of skills and positive attitudes. Critical thinking and problem solving are keys to such classroom practices. For this reason, an analysis of the Expressive Arts intended curriculum illuminated that critical thinking and problem solving are stressed as the key elements of learner-centred and participatory classroom practices in the curriculum documents. In this connection, the next section delves into the organization of learner-centred and participatory approaches for preparation of learners equipped with the knowledge, competence and qualities necessary for active participation both in the changing Malawian context and for competing successfully in other contexts.

### 6.3.2 Organisation of learner-centred and participatory classroom practices in Expressive Arts

The organisation of lessons for the preparation of students with skills necessary for active participation in public life is presented in the teacher's guides, used by teachers for

planning their lessons. Therefore, teacher's guides represented the best curriculum documents for learning the state's idealism of active learner-centred and participatory classroom practices. The organisation of the teacher's guides is in the form of units.

A unit is a set of lessons for a particular theme in the syllabus. The unit also suggests strategies for presenting the lessons in the classroom. The presentation of the Expressive Arts unit below is a combination of examples from various units for purposes of getting a more representative picture of the organisation of the units in the teacher's guides. Each unit has the same segments that guide teachers on the organisation of effective learner-centred and participatory classroom practices. The segments are as follows:

***Why teach this unit.*** This section gives a brief background to the topic and ends with the need for students to learn about issues in the unit. For example, the theme on 'Leadership roles' in Standard (grade) 8 reads as follows:

> This unit will discuss leadership roles. For one to perform these roles effectively, one has to have some leadership skills. Some of the appropriate leadership skills are effective communication, providing motivation, problem solving, delegation, decision making, critical thinking, patience and open mindedness.

Thus, right away from the beginning, each unit tells the teacher why their students must learn about issues covered in the unit. This section helps the teachers in the organisation of lesson activities for the creation of an enduring understanding of the topic.

***Success Criteria.*** This section guides the teachers on what students should be able to demonstrate after covering each unit. Success criteria in the teacher's guide are intended learning outcomes for each theme. As stated in Chapter One, PCAR adopted Outcomes Based Education. The meaning of Outcomes Based Education and its underlying principles have been discussed in detail in Chapter 2 but it will suffice to paraphrase it

here as ‘an approach to organising and operating a curriculum around outcomes’ (Spady, 1994, p.1). Outcomes are statements of learning intents, which spell out ‘what is essential for all learners to be able to do successfully at the end of their learning experiences’ (Spady, 1994, p.1). The success criteria section guides the teachers on what students should be able to demonstrate after covering each unit. For example, in theme 1 of the Standard 7 teachers’ guide, the success criteria read:

- Discuss meanings of personal and general space
- Draw personal and general space
- Draw shapes which do not meet and those which meet

These success criteria tell the teachers the learning outcomes after covering each *unit*. Based on these *unit* success criteria, teachers are expected to come up with *lesson activities* that must help students in the acquisition of knowledge and development of skills, values and attitudes that are associated with active participatory life in the community after learners leave school. The outcomes are expressed as success criteria in the teacher’s guide and are necessary for helping teachers to have a clear picture of the kind of behavior they would expect their learners to demonstrate. They therefore enable the teachers to make those expected learners’ behaviours their top priority in planning their teaching activities.

However, these outcomes seem to display some inherent weaknesses. The first weakness with outcomes like the ones captured above is that they are very prescriptive, and do not allow for higher-order thinking. The second weakness with this kind of prescription is that it is not open-ended. Some teachers may not know what to do with those pupils who are able to do more than merely coming up with the meaning of personal and general space and drawing personal and general space and shapes which do not meet and those which

meet. These are the issues that the curriculum materials for Expressive Arts do not seem to answer. How teachers have reacted to this will be seen in the analysis of how teachers actually teach Expressive Arts lessons, in the next chapter. The third weakness is that the outcomes are narrow and they are likely to make it hard to teach the broader concepts or themes. The outcomes are narrow apparently because the themes themselves, from which the outcomes are drawn, are far too narrow and fact-based. Such prescriptive outcomes can limit the depth of thinking amongst the learners, making the learning more fact-based and rote.

***Skills to be learned.*** This section guides teachers on the kinds of skills they must develop in their students based on the issues that are covered in the unit. For instance, the unit of 'Improvisation,' for Standard (grade) 8 reads

> Ensure that the learners develop skills such as resourcefulness, creating, critical thinking, improvising, decision making, problem solving and sorting.

What this implies is that the teachers' organisation of lesson activities must help students develop these various skills after covering the theme. These are some of the skills necessary for preparing learners who are equipped with the knowledge, competence, skills, values and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and to successfully compete in other contexts.

***Values and attitudes to be learned.*** This section guides teachers on the kinds of values and attitudes they must develop in students through lesson activities that are learner-centred and participatory in approach. For example, based on the same theme 'Improvisation', this section reads as follows:

> Ensure that the learners develop attitudes and values of appreciation, cooperation, tolerance, perseverance, freedom, maturity and unity.

***Suggested teaching and learning resources.*** Active participatory classroom practices are best promoted with the use of various teaching and learning resources. Thus, this section makes suggestions to teachers about the kind of resources they could use in the promotion of students' active involvement in lesson activities. In this connection, the teacher's guides make suggestions of an array of teaching and learning resources for the teachers' use in the classrooms. For example, a unit on 'Conveying cultural messages', for Standard 7 reads as follows:

> The following resources may be used:
>
> - The local environment
> - Charts showing garments for different occasions
> - Garments for different occasions
> - Clothing materials of different colours
> - Pairs of scissors
> - Thread
> - Needles
> - Rags
> - Resource persons

The state encourages teachers to use a variety of resources that fall into three broad categories. The categories are already-made resources, the social and physical environments, and the teacher-made resources. In the example above, the first and the last bullets represent the physical and social environments, respectively. As regards to resource persons, the teacher's guides make suggestions to teachers on the use of experts in various socio-economic fields that represent topics that are included in the curriculum. Thus, the physical and social environment encourages teachers to go beyond the indoor classroom activities. The second bullet could be an example of a teacher-made resource. The third to

seventh bullets represent the already-made resources. While the notion of teachers using a wide variety of resources in lessons of Expressive Arts is potentially a very good idea, some authors, however, like Allais (2010), have argued that the use of a wide variety of resources in lessons is something that may only work in well-resourced schools with highly qualified teachers. Poorly qualified teachers in rural schools would possibly be lost when faced with the demands of creating their own resources. How the teachers use the teaching and learning resources is one of the issues this research raises and whether, in fact, the teachers are creative in the use of the resources.

***Suggested teaching and learning activities.*** This section of the unit is the focal point of all other sections that have been discussed this far. The section gives teachers suggestions of how they could organise learner-centred and participatory lesson activities. The teaching and learning activities are divided into sets of instructions, each describing what the teacher and learners should do. For instance, the unit about 'Self expression' in Standard 8 has activities that read as follows:

> *Activity 1: Identifying dances that express and communicate messages (1 period)*
> Instructions
> 1. Organise the learners into groups to do the following:
>    a. Study the illustrations in the learners' book on page 8.
>    b. Discuss what they see in the illustration
>    c. Identify dances in the community that express and communicate messages
>    d. Discuss the messages conveyed by the dances
> 2. Consolidate the activity
> 3. Adapt the activity for the learners with special educational needs
> 4. Observe and record the learners' performances
>
> *Activity 2: Performing dances that communicate messages (2 periods)*
>
> Instructions

1. Organise the learners into groups to do the following:
    a. Select one of the dances identified in Activity 1.
    b. Discuss its dancing styles
    c. Demonstrate the dancing styles
    d. Perform the dance
    e. Explain the different messages conveyed in the dances.
2. Consolidate the activity
3. Adapt the activity for the learners with special education needs.
4. Observe and record the learners' performances.

There are two essential aspects in these activities that could help teachers in the organisation of lesson activities for the preparation of students with the knowledge, competence and qualities necessary for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and to successfully compete in other contexts. The first aspect is that the activities are based on cultural practices, beliefs, perspectives, and stances that students bring to class from home. Thus, the activities allow teachers to engage students in a critical analysis of cultural issues that hamper active participation of people in a community. The second aspect is that the activities aim at developing students' skills in problem solving and making rational decisions on issues they already know.

***Learners' assessment.*** This section guides teachers on how they could find out what students learned through the unit. As has been stated, the PCAR Outcomes Based Education attempts to use Continuous Assessment. The meaning of Continuous Assessment has been discussed in detail in Chapter 2. It will suffice here to paraphrase Continuous Assessment as described in PCAR as involving formative type of assessment. Formative assessment is continuous, and is used to improve teaching and learning during the time of the teaching. It is often based on observation. There is a suggestion in the

teachers' guide that teachers should use assessment exercises for continuous assessment of learners. The suggested learners' assessment tasks in the teacher's guides are in the form of written work or teachers observing the students as they perform the assigned tasks. Each outcome has corresponding exercises in the learners' book. There is a suggestion in the teachers' guide that all exercises in the learners' books should be attempted by all pupils so that teachers can have a clear understanding of the level of performance and hence the achievement of outcomes. Teachers are asked to ensure that learners attempt all questions in any particular exercise in order to get some degree of accuracy in the assessment. For example, the Standard 8 assessment task on the unit 'General and personal space' reads as follows:

- Give meanings of personal and general space
- Draw personal space
- Draw general space

In these tasks, the learners are expected to perform and teachers observe them as they perform. Such tasks are important for assessing the students' development of skills, values, and attitudes, which cannot be best achieved through written tasks.

How teachers ensure that every learner is able to do these assessment tasks is one of the issues this research raises and whether, in fact, teachers can do it effectively. Also, what the teacher should do if it is found that some learners cannot do the tasks expected to be done at the end of the lesson is another issue this research raises and is set out to investigate.

## 6.4 Closing remarks

This chapter has focused on the organisation of the Expressive Arts content and classroom pedagogies for the preparation of learners with the knowledge, competence and qualities

necessary for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and to successfully compete in other contexts. The curriculum documents organise the Expressive Arts curriculum with content and pedagogical strategies that seem to be appropriate for the preparation of learners who would participate actively in their communities after leaving school. The curriculum documents stress the use of learner-centred and participatory learning. The curriculum documents define learner-centred learning from the perspective of instilling in students wide content knowledge and development of skills in critical thinking and problem solving. The purpose of this approach is that learners who possess such knowledge and skills can competently participate actively in the lives of their communities. But do primary school teachers use the same learner-centred and active participatory classroom practices as those presented in the curriculum documents? The answer to this question will perhaps be derived from teachers' practical use of the curriculum, which the next chapter sets out to investigate.

# CHAPTER 7

# ANALYSIS OF THE 'ENACTED' CURRICULUM OF EXPRESSIVE ARTS

## 7.1 Introduction

Chapter 6 analysed 'instructional system' of Expressive Arts. Using the second major conceptual distinction of Illuminative evaluation theory, 'learning milieu', this chapter analyses the 'enacted' Expressive Arts curriculum in Standards 7 and 8 in terms of the dimensions and indicators of Productive Pedagogies in response to respond to the sub-research question, 'What is the 'enacted' Expressive Arts curriculum?', of the critical research question, 'How do Expressive Arts teachers teach Expressive Arts two years into the implementation of PCAR in Malawi?' This critical question is fully answered in the discussion chapter, Chapter 8 of this study by comparing the 'intended' curriculum presented in the previous chapter and the 'enacted' curriculum presented in this chapter.

The chapter is divided into two major sections. The first section presents an analysis of lessons on dimensions and indicators of Productive Pedagogies. The last section analyses teachers' perspectives or explanations of what they were doing in the teaching of Expressive Arts and their reasons for teaching the curriculum the way they did.

## 7.2 Productive pedagogies in the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum

The four dimensions of the Productive Pedagogies framework is employed in the analysis of teachers' classroom practice below.

### 7.2.1 The Intellectual Quality of lessons

According to the Productive Pedagogy framework, the dimension of intellectual quality is indicated by six indicators: higher order thinking, deep knowledge, deep understanding, knowledge as problematic, substantive conversation and meta-language.

Data analysis showed that the intellectual quality of the Expressive Arts lessons was generally very low, although some few lessons or parts of lessons showed possibility for high intellectual quality. Of the 71 lessons observed in the study, 61% (43 lessons out of 71) were of low intellectual quality. A detailed analysis of the intellectual quality of the lessons is presented below.

***1. Higher order thinking***

The observations showed that there were minimal possibilities for higher order thinking by the learners, as most of the Expressive Arts teachers did not encourage the learners to think deeper and involve them actively during the teaching and learning process. The learners either passively received information from the teachers or recited what the teachers told them.

Below, I examine an episode reconstructed from field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 2, in Standard 7, at school 'A,' a rural school on the 14th of January, 2010.

The lesson began at 10:00 a.m. There were 56 children present that day. As part of the introduction of the day's Expressive Arts lesson, the teacher formally greeted the learners and progressed with the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher:** In today's lesson, we are going to look at sounds used to convey messages. In your communities, if you hear different sounds, you should be able to know that a certain type of sound conveys a certain type of message. Here at school, the most familiar sound is a bell which indicates the time for school assembly, the time for break and the time for you to knock off and go home. Can you now be in your usual groups and discuss sounds which are produced in your communities which can be used to convey messages.
>
> [The learners made four groups with one group consisting of boys only. I listened to the discussion of this group. There was very little discussion going on in the group. The only discussion taking place amongst the learners in the group was that one learner said, "Drum is produce dancing," and another learner said, "Whistle is producing wedding". The teacher then called group leaders to write on the chalkboard what they had discussed in their groups]
>
> **10:45: a.m. Teacher**: Group leaders, can you come upfront and write on the chalkboard what you have discussed in your groups.

[Representatives of the groups wrote the following on the chalkboard].

**Group 1**: Drum- dances, ambulance- to take patients.

**Group 2:** Drum - dancing, whisle-'nyau'.

**Group 3**: Drum is produce dancing.

**Group 4**: Cock is telling time.

**10:55 a.m. Teacher**: Most of the groups have mentioned a drum as an instrument which produces sounds which convey messages. The sound of an ambulance symbolizes that either someone is sick or else someone has died. In some societies in Malawi, the blowing of a whistle symbolizes that someone has passed away. The sound of a cockerel points to times of the day. A cockerel produces sounds every hour. Sounds produced by birds early in the mornings symbolize that it is dawn. Sounds produced by certain birds symbolize bad omen. The sound from an owl symbolizes an impending death in a certain community.

The teacher also asked lower-order question to the learners.

***Teacher:*** *...Mention a sound that is used to convey messages.*

In the above excerpt, learners discourse showed that they are involved in low-order thinking. For example, the discussion among the learners in their groups and their responses presented to the class, such as, *drum is produce dancing* [sic], *drum-dances, ambulance-to take patients,* and *cock is telling time* shows very little evidence of higher-order thinking in the learners. The low-level questions which the teacher asked did not encourage the learners to think deeper and involve them actively in the teaching and learning process. The above excerpt illustrates the general practice that teachers simply transmitted information to learners and that learners received information passively from their teacher.

While higher-order thinking was weakly evident in most of the lessons, some of the lessons observed showed some possibilities for higher-order thinking. Of the lessons observed, 39 percent (28 lessons out of 71) showed possibilities for higher-order thinking. These 28 lessons had 14 episodes of higher-order thinking.

Below, I examine an episode extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 12 at school 'C,' a rural school on 12th February, 2010, illustrating the opportunity for higher order thinking in the lessons.

The lesson began at 8:00 a.m. There were 27 children present that day. As part of the introduction of the day's Expressive Arts lesson, the teacher formally greeted the learners and began the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher:** Yesterday, we discussed about the roles of the leaders. We talked about the characteristics of a leader and their leadership styles. Is there anybody who can tell us what a leader is?
> **Learner:** A leader is a person who leads other people.
> **Teacher:** We also talked about the leadership styles. Can you list the leadership styles which we discussed?
> **Learner:** Majority rules.
> **Teacher:** Is that a leadership style?
> **Learner:** Dictatorship
> **Teacher:** That is very good. Sometimes we say what?
> **Learner**: Autocratic
> **Teacher**: Do we have characteristics of autocratic leadership, or dictatorship leadership style? Just give me one of the characteristics. All these leadership styles have their own characteristics. What about autocratic?
> **Learner:** Only the leader's voice count. What the leader says is the only thing which can be done. Nobody can say or can give ideas. No other ideas are welcome. Only the leader says this and so the people do whatever their leader tells them to do. The people just follow what the leader is telling them to do.

The above excerpt illustrates greater possibility for higher-order thinking. Learners were responding to their teachers' questions. In the episode, the teacher asked open-ended questions which required learners to manipulate information and ideas to respond to the teacher's question, "*Do we have characteristics of autocratic leadership? Or dictatorship leadership style? Just give me one of the characteristics. All these leadership styles have their own characteristics. What about autocratic?"*

In response to the teacher's question, the learner responded, "*Only the leader's voice count. What the leader says is the only thing which can be done. Nobody can say or can give ideas. No other ideas are welcome. Only the leader says this and so the people do*

*whatever their leader tells them to do. The people just follow what the leader is telling them to do."* This response illustrates higher-order thinking by a learner. The learner gave a well thought-out answer which is a synthesis of facts and ideas in response to the teacher's question. The learner is not giving just a one-word answer to the teacher's question.

***2. Deep knowledge***

The lessons showed a range of deep to shallow knowledge discourse. Sometimes the knowledge discourses were deep and focused on well structured classifications of concepts, while for the rest of the time, very simplistic, unstructured, community, local and everyday discourses were being discussed.

Data analysis revealed that 30% (21 out of 71) of the lessons were characterised by Deep knowledge coverage and within the 21 lessons, 45 episodes were characterised by Deep knowledge.

Below, I examine an episode reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 12 at school 'C,' a rural school on 12th February, 2010, illustrating in-depth coverage of the knowledge or subject matter taught in the lessons.

> **Teacher:** We have seen the leaders of different styles. The leaders who practice democracy and the leaders who are dictators. The different types of leaders have different successes and challenges. Challenges is the same as problems. The leaders meet successes and challenges. A*tsogoleri aja amakumana ndi zinthu zovuta ndi zina zosavuta. Akakhala mumidzi muja amakumana ndi zina zovuta kuti ayendetse utsogoleri wao. Zimene zimakanikitsa atsogoleri kuti ayendetse bwino utsogoleri wao ndi ma challenges* [translated as: those leaders in your villages for example meet some issues which they are able to resolve without many difficulties. Those are what we call successes. However those leaders again meet some issues brought by their villagers which are difficult for them to resolve. Those issues are what we call challenges]. Challenges are some of the things which they are able to resolve. *Zimene zimakanika zija ndiye ma challenges* [translated as: those issues which they fail to resolve are what we call challenges]. So we want to look at those things. *Komanso tiwonanso* [translated as: and again] we are going to see how to solve those problems. How to find the solutions to those problems. Three things we are going to look at this morning. We are going to look at successes of leaders. Number two, we will look at problems or challenges. Number three, we are looking at the solutions.

*Tikambirana kuti atsogoleri akamayendetsa za utsogoleri wao amakumana ndi zovuta zotani* [translated as: we will discuss the challenges which leaders meet as they discharge their duties]. Komanso nthawi zina (translated as: but also sometimes) they meet problems which hinders them to do their work well. *Amakumana ndi mavuto komanso palinso njira zina zoti akhoza kuthetsera mavuto aja* [transalted as: the leaders sometimes meet challenges but at the same time, there are also times when they are able to find easy solutions to the issues brought to them by their villagers].

At **8: 21 a.m,** I sat with one group which was composed of four girls and one boy. The learners wrote down the following facts; when leaders face challenges, they should not give up but they should find solutions to their challenges. The leader should delegate. One girl learner told classmates at her group, "Leaders should not give up when they find problems but they should face up the challenges". Another girl learner said, "Encouraging, *kuwalimbikitsa"* [translated as: the leader should encourage his or her subjects when they face difficulties or when they go through hard times]. Another learner urged fellow classmates to give another point. Another learner told fellow classmates that, "the leader should practice justice, the leader should encourage people to work together, the leader should encourage people to work in unity, the leader should practice justice, the leader should encourage unity, the leader should not take any sides".

The above excerpt shows that Deep knowledge is being covered in the lessons for four reasons. Firstly, there is greater analysis and classification of leadership styles. For example, the teacher developed a taxonomy that reflected better the conceptual structure of leadership styles – dictatorship and democratic. Secondly the teacher made use of three analytical classifications of what he was going to discuss with learners about leadership styles. These analytical classifications are successes of leaders, problems or challenges of leaders and solutions to the challenges which leaders face. Thirdly, key ideas and concepts of 'leadership styles' are being analyzed and explained. For example, the teacher explains at length the meaning of the concept 'challenges' by using everyday terms such as 'those issues which leaders fail to resolve,' to the learners for them to have a clear understanding of the concept. Lastly, the teacher proceeded with elaboration of 'characteristics of leaders.' Learners' responses in their groups also showed that they were developing deeper knowledge of leadership styles. This is evidenced from the fact that they are able to expound on the central ideas and concepts they have been assigned to work on. For

example, the learners mature responses such as, '*when leaders face challenges, they should not give up but they should find solutions to their challenges,' 'the leader should delegate', 'leaders should not give up when they find problems but they should face up the challenges',* and '*the leader should encourage his subjects when they face difficulties or when they go through hard times',* all show that the learners are developing deeper knowledge on the topic of leadership styles.

Many of the teachers' lessons however showed weakly structured knowledge discourses. Teachers 2, 6 and 9 did not deal with significant concepts and ideas. Teacher 6 mainly explained through learners reading from the learners' textbook. Similarly, Teacher 9 explained through reading information from the Teachers' Guide.

Below, I examine an episode extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 2 at school 'A,' a rural school on 11th January, 2010, illustrating superficial coverage of knowledge or subject matter taught in the lessons.

> **Teacher:** From yesterday, I have seen that most of you do not understand the meaning of mirroring and so I will continue looking at it again and again. What we have been saying is the definition of mirroring? Who can try, anyone? Yes?
>
> **Learner [**Reading from the text book**]:** Mirroring is an activity which someone can copy from somebody.
>
> **Teacher:** Yes?
>
> **Learner:** Mirroring is copying from someone
>
> **12: 00 Teacher:** Yes, that is what we have been saying is the meaning of mirroring. Mirroring is an art of copying an action, words or expressions. We have also been looking at some mirroring activities. What have we been saying about examples of mirroring activities?
>
> **Learner:** Singing
>
> **Teacher:** Singing, Yes?
>
> **Learner:** Dancing
>
> **Teacher:** Dancing, yes. So there are many activities which you can copy from others. So we will go out and we will practice again the mirroring activity we did yesterday. Some of you were just watching others doing. I want all of you to participate today. Are we together?
>
> **Learners** (collectively): Yes

[Teacher takes the learners to the playing ground which is at some two minutes walking distance from the classroom. She assembles them together and gives them instructions].

**Teacher**: You will be in your groups in which you were yesterday. You will be in groups of 10 again. The groups should be of boys and girls. Boys should not form their own groups and girls their groups again, no. You should be together. Who can remember the first activity we did yesterday, yes, anyone?

**Learner:** Running on one leg.

**Teacher:** Yes, running on one leg. So in our groups, we will run on one leg from this goal to that goal. Can we begin?

(Learners run for a distance of 20 to 30 metres from the northern goal of the playing ground to the southern goal.

In the above excerpt, the concept of 'mirroring' has been very poorly co-extended. For example, the teacher explains the meaning of the main idea or concept to be covered in the lesson by asking a learner to just read from the textbook. The teacher does define the term 'mirroring' as an act of copying an action, words or expressions but does not elaborate or shed more light on each form of mirroring and other concepts which have been read by the learner from the textbook.

***Instrumental forms of knowledge***

The distinctions of instrumental and non-instrumental knowledge (Moore and Muller, 2001) provided a sharper analytical category for making sense of the knowledge taught in the lessons. Forms of content knowledge in a curriculum are a significant aspect which is missing in Productive Pedagogy framework, but which was evident in the lessons observed. Therefore, an analysis of the forms of content knowledge taught by the teachers in the lessons was undertaken, and 'Forms of Knowledge in the curriculum' as postulated by Moore and Muller, 2001, was used as the lens to illuminate the forms of content knowledge which teachers taught.

An analysis of these forms of knowledge in the lessons observed is presented below. Generally, 'Instrumental' forms of knowledge were evident in more than half the lessons observed.

The excerpt below, from a lesson conducted by Teacher 3 at school 'B,' an urban school on 5th March, 2010, illustrates 'Instrumental' forms of knowledge in the Expressive Arts lessons observed.

The lesson began at 7:30 a.m. There were 41 children present that day. As part of the introduction of the day's Expressive Arts lesson, the teacher formally greeted the learners and began the lesson as follows:

> **7:30 a.m. Teacher:** Today we will discuss about songs, about singing. Are we together?
> **Learners (**collectively): Yes
> …
> **7:33 a.m. Teacher:** O.k., can you just sing one song that you sing at your homes or here at school that expresses happiness or enjoyment. Sing one song. Just remember what we sing at the assemblies. I want you to sing using soprano, tenor and bass. I want you to sing using what?
> **Learners** (collectively): Soprano, tenor and bass.
> **Teacher:** Now let us sing one song which shows enjoyment.
> [The teacher led the learners in singing the song: We are walking in the light of God, Allelujah, we are walking in the light of God. We are walking in the light of God]
> **Teacher:** We are walking in the light of God Allelujah!
> **Learners (**singing together): We are walking in the light of God. We are walking in the light of God.
> **Teacher:** Ok. In your song, you are saying you are walking, isn't it?
> **Learners [**collectively]**:** Yes
> **Teacher:** So can you be walking then when you are singing the song to show that you are indeed enjoying.
> **Learners**: Yes.
> **Teacher:** One, two, one, two, step, step.
> **Learners** [singing and walking to the song]: We are walking in the light of God, we are walking, we are walking. We are walking in the light of God. *Tilinkuyenda kuwala kwa a Ambuye Alllelujah, tilinkuyenda kuwala kwa Ambuye. Tilinkuyenda, tilinkuyenda, tilinkuyenda kuwala kwa Ambuye* [we are walking, walking in the light of God].
> [They sung this song for 4 minutes].
> **Teacher:** Have you enjoyed?
> **Learners** (collectively)**:** Yes
> **Teacher:** Thank you for enjoying. Sometimes we need to enjoy.

In the above excerpt, the teacher must be commended for producing 'enjoyment' in the classroom. She is teaching the skills of singing and walking to the beat of the song that reflects what is valued by the local culture.

The singing skills are apparently being taught to enable the learners to participate effectively in the social lives of their communities or societies. Teachers were thus observed to be focussing their teaching on those sections of the Expressive Arts curriculum which were on 'ethnic culture' of their communities or societies than intellectual enhancement and development of learners. This may have been the case because the teachers understand culture more than other content in the curriculum, such as English sports, like lawn tennis, that they seem not to know.

***3. Deep understanding***

Generally, most of the learners demonstrated understanding involving the coverage of everyday knowledge which they could easily remember and were able to provide feedback to the teacher, but there was lack of progression to conceptual knowledge that required the learners to do much reasoning, explanations and arguments. The questioning by the teachers in the lessons did not facilitate deep understanding on the part of the learners.

An in-depth analysis of data revealed that 87% (62 out of 71) of the lessons showed superficial understanding on the part of learners. The 62 lessons showed that the learners did not understand what they were being taught. For example, learners either failed to answer teachers' questions or in cases where they were able to answer their teacher's questions, their responses were mostly one-word answers which were mainly recitation of fragmented pieces of information which did not show understanding of what the learners were learning.

Below, I examine an episode reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 1, in Standard 8, at school 'F,' an urban school on the 16th of

March, 2010, that illustrates that learners did not understand what they were being taught in the lesson.

The lesson began at 10:00 a.m. There were 100 children present in class that day. The teacher was teaching about types of leaders in a community. The teacher progressed with the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher:** Do you now understand roles of a village head?
>
> **Learners:** No
>
> **Teacher:** *Ntchito za amfumu a m'mudzi simukudzimvetsa?* [translated as: Is it really true that you do not understand the roles of a village head?]
>
> **Learner:** Mm.
>
> **Teacher:** *Ntchito za a mfumu a m'mudzi simukudzimvetsa zowona*? [translated as: Are you really serious that you do not understand roles of a village head?]
>
> **Learner:** Mm.
>
> **Teacher:** *Kumudzi kwanu nkuti?* [translated as: Where do you come from yourselves?]
>
> **Learner:** Lilongwe
>
> **Teacher:** *Ku Lilongweko sikukhala a mfumu? Kuli mfumu Mazengera kumenekuja yotchuka. Ndiye mfumu suyidziwa, tiwamvere chisoni eti?*[translated as*:* So there are no village heads in Lilongwe. Do you not know that there is village headman Mazengera there? You should feel ashamed of yourself].
>
> **Learners (**collectively): Eeh.
>
> **Teacher:** *Chifukwa kenakake kakuchita ngati kachipongwe ndiye khalani pansi osadziwa a mfumu tikuwuzani a mfumu. Mfumu ndi munthu amene amalamulira kumudzi. Tikumvana eti?* [translated as: What you are doing now is rudeness, it is not true that you do not know a chief. Yes, do you know a chief? What are the duties of a village head in your village?]
>
> [The teacher shouted at the learners]: *Kodi ana inu a mfumu sitiwadziwa. Ndizowona kuti a mfumu sitiwadziwa*? [translated as: You students, is it really true that you don't know a village head man?]

The above excerpt shows that the teachers' presentation of the lesson, including questioning did not facilitate deep understanding of the lesson on the part of the learners. For example, the teacher's remarks such as, *'Is it really true that you do not understand the roles of a village head?, 'Are you really serious that you do not understand roles of a*

*village head?*, and '*You should feel ashamed of yourself',* shows that the learners seemed to have been unable to answer even those questions which the teacher considered as simple, to the extent that the teacher rebuked and shouted at the learners, thinking that, by failing to answer even those questions which the teacher thought were easy or simple for the learners to answer, the teacher thought the learners were just being rude to her.

While deep understanding of content knowledge taught was weakly evident in the lessons observed, there were a few lessons in which the questioning by teachers facilitated deep understanding on the part of the learners.

In 13% (9 lessons out of 71) of the lessons, teachers' questioning and overall lesson presentation strategies facilitated deep understanding in the learners. These nine lessons had 10 episodes of deep understanding, in which the learners responses to a teacher's question showed that the learners were developing relatively systematic, integrated and holistic understanding of concepts they were learning, and the learners were not just reciting fragmented pieces of information.

The episode below, again reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 12 at school 'C,' a rural school on 12th February, 2010, illustrates 'Deep understanding' on the part of the learners about what they were being taught in the lessons:

The lesson began at 8:04 a.m. There were 27 children present in the class. The teacher was teaching about types of leaders in a community. The teacher asked the learners to explain the characteristics of autocratic leadership, to which one of the learners gave the following response:

> **Learner:** There is no second opinion. If the leader says do this, all the people have just to do what their leader tells them to do without opposing that. You cannot even ask questions otherwise you can just face problems.

The above excerpt shows that at least one of the learners is developing a deeper understanding of the subject matter of leadership styles which they are learning. For example, the learner's response to the teacher's task shows that this learner is doing more than just memorizing and citing information; rather this learner is able to reorganize and synthesize the information he got from the teacher into his own complex thoughts, showing that he understood the lesson.

***4. Substantive conversation.***

Generally, there was no evidence of substantive conversation in the classroom in the majority of the Expressive Arts lessons observed. There was more teacher-centred teaching and learning where there were very limited two-way interactions between learners and between the teachers and the learners. Learners only answered a word or two to the teachers' questions. In-depth analysis of data revealed that 80% of the lessons were characterised by lack of substantive conversation between the learners and between the teacher and the learners.

The episode below, reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 2, in Standard 7 at school 'A,' a rural school on the 13th of January, 2010, illustrates lack of substantive conversation in the lesson.

The lesson began at 11:55 a.m. There were 56 children present in the class. The teacher was teaching about garments that convey cultural messages. The teacher progressed with the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher**: Can you mention some of the garments which can be used to convey cultural messages which we discussed yesterday?
>
> **Learner:** white dress
>
> **Teacher:** White dress, yes?
>
> **Learner:** *Chishango* [translated as: shield]
>
> **Teacher:** What else?
>
> **Learner:** Black garments

**Teacher:** What type of cultural message is conveyed by the white cloth?

**Learner:** White dress conveys the cultural message of a wedding.

**12: 00 noon: Teacher**: Can you go into your groups and open your Expressive Arts text books on page 10. Can you discuss the materials which were used to make the garments which shown in the pictures on page 10.

[I listened to the discussion of one of the groups. One learner said, "*Chishango* are animal hide." Another learner responded, "*Nyau* dance is carton." There were three boys in this group who were not participating in the discussions of the group. The three boys were rather involved in some kind of play which seemed not to have been related to the activity which they had been assigned to work on].

**12:09 p.m. Teacher:** Group leaders come upfront and write on the chalkboard what you have discussed in your groups.

In the above episode, there was little substantive conversation taking place between the learners or between the teacher and the learners. For example, in the entire nine minutes of group discussion in the above excerpt, there were only two responses made by the learners to the task given them. During much of the time, the learners seemed to have been engaged in off-task activities.

Again, when responding to the teacher's questions, learners were giving one-word responses. The teacher was not probing further to sustain conversation with the learners.

While substantive conversation was weakly evident in the majority of the lessons, there were a few lessons in which there were some substantive conversations.

Data revealed that substantive conversation was evident in 20% (14 out of 71) of the lessons. These 14 lessons had 14 episodes of substantive conversation.

The episode below, reconstructed from a lesson conducted by Teacher 12 in Standard 8 at school 'C,' a rural school on the 15th February, 2010, illustrates substantive conversation in the observed lessons:

**8:07 a.m. Teacher***:* Now in your group, you can just identify one type of dance. For example, a group can have Beni dance. And another group can have another type of dance. Can you identify those dances? Just one, one dance per group.
[I sat at a group composed of four girls and one boy. The boy told his colleagues 'kandiyandiya.' It is Kandiyandiya dance]. One girl told the group, *"Likhuba".* It is likhuba dance]. Another girl asked her colleagues, "Is Likhuba a dance?" The boy in

the group responded, *"Ee, ndimayesa ndi dance?"* [translated as: Yes, I really thought this is a dance). The girl asked further, *"Koma amavina nthawi yanji?"* (translated as: But at what time of the day is this dance performed?] The boy answered, *"Kaya"*. [Translated as: well, I don't really know]. The girl enquired further, "*Ndiye iwe sukudziwa?*"[translated as: So you don't know as well]. Another girl remarked, "*Likhuba dance"* [translated as: it is Likhuba dance]. The rest of the members of the group agreed with her and they wrote in their note books, 'likhuba' dance. A girl asked, "*Tilembe zitatu*?" [translated as: should we write three facts?). Another girl responded, "*Folo"* (let us write four]. The teacher came to this group and asked the learners, "How many have you identified?" The learners responded, "Three, we have *likwata, tchopa* and *likhuba."*

The teacher told the learners, "That is good and so you will be reporting on the board." He further told the learners, "You should also say whether those who perform the dance are only men or women are also involved." He further told the learners to also think of the ceremonies where the dances are performed, that is whether during wedding ceremonies or during some other occasions.

The boy in the group told the other learners that, *"Pamenepa likwatayu timuyike question mark chifukwa gule ameneyu akativuta kulongosola kwake chifukwa chakuti sitimadziwa kavinidwe kake ndi nthawi yake imene amavinira. Anzanga mukuganiza bwa, tiyikepo imeneyi* [translated as: we should put some question mark to *likwata* here because we will find it difficult to explain more about the dance because we do not know how the dance is performed, what do you think, should we include this?] *ndiye m'malo mwake tingolemba mganda"* [translated as: let us just put down mganda instead]. The boy asked his fellow members of the group further, *"Kodi mgandawu amavina azigogo okhaokha eti? Kodi amavina nthawi yanji?"* [translated as: is this mganda performed by the elderly only? What time of the day is this mganda performed?]. The other members of the group responded that,*"Amavina masana"* [translated as: they perform the dance during day time). One girl on the group asked, "*Kodi tchopayi amavina wina aliyense?"* [translated as: is this tchopa danced by anyone?]. The rest of the learners on the group agreed, saying, "Yes." Another girl advised the group, *"Tiyeni tiwonjezere chimtali"* [translated as: let us add chimtali dance to our list].

In the above excerpt, there was substantive conversation taking place amongst the learners for two reasons. Firstly, the learners were asking each other questions which were open-ended and had possibilities of sustaining the conversation amongst them. For example, one learner in the excerpt above remarked that, *"pamenepa likwatayu timuyike question mark chifukwa gule ameneyu akativuta kulongosola kwake chifukwa chakuti sitimadziwa kavinidwe kake ndi nthawi yake imene amavinira. Anzanga mukuganiza bwa, tiyikepo imeneyi?* [translated as: we should put some question mark to *likwata* dance here because we will find it difficult to explain more about the dance because we do not know

how the dance is performed, what do you think, should we include this?]. This question sustained and extended the conversation amongst the learners as they worked on the learning task. The question led the learners to come up with more responses to the learning task in their bid to replace the 'likwata' dance with other dances on which they had adequate knowledge compared to the 'likwata' dance of which the learners admitted amongst themselves that they did not know much about. Secondly, each learner in the group was participating actively and making a contribution to sustain the discussion in the group.

***5. Knowledge as problematic***

There was no presentation of knowledge as problematic observed. All knowledge was presented as 'given', in an uncritical manner where there was no argumentative discussion on information between learners and teachers. The learners accepted almost all information given by the teachers instantly.

The episode below extracted from a lesson conducted by Teacher 9, in Standard 7 at school 'E,' a rural school on the 8th of February, 2010 illustrates lack of presentation of knowledge as problematic in the lessons.

> **8:05 a.m. Teacher:** (Reads for the learners from the Teacher's Guide).
>
> O.k. different body movements can convey specific messages. For example, a person might wave a hand like this rather than saying hello or nod his or her head in agreement with whatever somebody is saying. The body movements can be useful in expression and communication because they are a big way to convey thoughts and feelings without speaking. There are certain messages to be conveyed and expressed by body movements. These messages are very important in any cultural setting. This is because it enhances cooperation amongst members of the same community. It is therefore important to ensure that you as learners should master how to identify the messages conveyed by body shapes and movements. You should also know how to use the body shapes and movements to express and communicate the feelings and ideas. Is this clear?
>
> **Learners** (collectively)**:** Yes

The above excerpt shows that the teacher presented knowledge as 'given', in an uncritical manner. The teacher did not create an opportunity for any debate or argument on the information presented to the learners. The teacher kept up a monologue to himself and read the content of the Teacher's Guide to the learners. The above excerpt again illustrates the general practice of most of the teachers in the study that the teachers simply transmitted information to learners and that learners received information passively from their teacher.

***6. Metalanguage***

Most of the teachers were using little metalanguage instruction most of the times. Teachers did not really take into account or give feedback to learners' usage of language. The teachers proceeded with their lessons, without stopping and commenting on their own or their learners' use of language. Only Teacher 6 stopped and gave guidance on learners' language usage once in a while during the teaching and learning process.

The episode below, reconstructed from a lesson conducted by Teacher 6, in Standard 8 at school 'A,' a rural school on 25 th January, 2010 illustrates use of metalanguage instruction by only one out of the twelve teachers in the study.

> **Teacher:** The items produced in carving depends on where someone is coming from *takambapo za curving yomwe imachitika ndi anthu omwe ali pafupi ndi nyanja. Munthu amene ujayu asema chinthu chlingana ndi culture yomwe yili kumene kujaku. Asema somba. Asema sombayo malinga ndi m'mene amayiwonera. China tingakambe za chomwe talemba apa*. [Translated as: we have been talking about carving which happens in the areas of the lakeshore. Those people along the lakeshore like making carvings of fish. What have I written on the chalkboard on the things which people along the lakeshore like carving? Can you say it?]
>
> **Learners:** poultry
>
> **Teacher**: What?
>
> **Learners**: poultry
>
> **Teacher**: not poultry, but pottery…

In the excerpt above, the teacher gave feedback towards learners' usage of language. The teacher corrected the learners' wrong pronunciation of the word 'pottery', which they were wrongly pronouncing as 'poultry.'

***Summary of Intellectual quality of lessons***

Generally, the observed Expressive Arts lessons are characterised by lower intellectual quality. An in-depth analysis of the observed lessons has shown that four indicators of high intellectual quality; higher-order thinking, deep-knowledge, deep understanding and substantive conversation were present in only 38.9% of the observed lessons, indicating the level of intellectual quality in the Expressive Arts classrooms to be generally very low.

Findings on Intellectual quality dimension of Productive Pedagogies found in the 71 lessons are presented in Table 7.2.1 below.

**Table 7.2.1: Summary of episodes in the indicators of High Intellectual Quality dimension**

| **Dimension** | **Indicator 1** | **Indicator 2** | **Indicator 3** | **Indicator 4** |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| High Intellectual Quality | Higher-order thinking | Deep knowledge | Deep understanding | Substantive conversation |
| Episodes in 71 lessons | 14 | 45 | 10 | 14 |
| Percentage of lessons | 39% | 30% | 13% | 20% |

### 7.2.2 Engagement with difference

In the Productive Pedagogy framework, the dimension of engagement with difference has five indicators: cultural knowledge, inclusivity, narrative, group identity and active citizenship. Generally, engagement with difference was weakly evident in the Expressive Arts lessons observed. A detailed analysis of each indicator of engagement with difference dimension of Productive Pedagogies as observed in the lessons is presented below.

**1. *Cultural knowledge***

From the observations, there was generally no explicit recognition, valuing or clear appreciation of cultures of small ethnic groups in Malawi or the cultures of other people outside the immediate environment of Malawi. In the majority of the lessons, only the cultures of the dominant ethnic groups in Malawi were recognised and emphasized.

The episode below, reconstructed from the lesson conducted by Teacher 7 in Standard 7, at school 'D,' an urban school on the 4th of March, 2010, illustrates that only the cultures of the dominant ethnic groups in Malawi were emphasized in the lessons observed.

The lesson began at 11:10 a.m. There were about 70 children present that day. As part of the introduction of the day's Expressive Arts lesson, the teacher formally greeted the learners and began the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher**: It is now time for Expressive Arts. We are going to learn about multicultural performances. Who can define the term multicultural? Who can define the term multicultural performances? Yes?
>
> **Learner**: Multicultural performances are performances for difference culture.
>
> **Teacher**: Multicultural performances are performances from what?
>
> **Learners** (collectively): Different cultures.
>
> **Teacher:** O.k. we said that multicultural performances are performances from different what?
>
> **Learners** (collectively): Culture.
>
> **Teacher**: That is the meaning of multicultural performances. For example here in Malawi we have different what?
>
> **Learners** (collectively): Cultures. So can you give me some examples of popular ethnic groups found in Malawi?
>
> **Learner:** *Mang'anje*
>
> **Teacher**: *Mang'anje*, very good, yes?
>
> **Learner:** *Yao*
>
> **Teacher:** *Yao*, yes?
>
> **Learner:** *Chewa*
>
> **11:12 a.m. Teacher**: *Chewa*, yes?
>
> **Learner:** *Tumbuka*

**Teacher:** *Tumbuka*, yes?

**Learner:** *Lomwe*

**Teacher:** *Lomwe*, yes? O.k. Thank you very much. Some of the popular ethnic groups found in Malawi are Sena, Lomwe, Tumbuka and Yao. These are some examples of popular ethnic groups found in what?

**Learners** (collectively): Malawi.

**11:15 a.m. Teacher:** O.k., what we want to do is discussing folk dances from these cultures in Malawi. For example, you give me examples of popular ethnic groups and those groups have their folk dances. For example, I myself, I am a Lomwe. My ethnic group is what?

**Learners** (collectively): Lomwe.

**Teacher:** So this time, I want you to discuss in your groups other folk dances you know and the ethnic group that perform them. What I want you to discuss in your groups is other folk dances you know and the ethnic group that perform the dance. I gave you an example that, like myself, I am a Lomwe and the type of folk dance I perform or we perform is Tchopa. So what I want you to discuss is other folk dances you know and the ethnic group that performs the dance you have mentioned. Start discussing.

In the above excerpt, the teacher tells the learners to discuss folk dances from only dominant ethnic cultural groups in Malawi. For example, the Lomwe tribe cited by the teacher in the excerpt of the lesson is mentioned in the curriculum documents as one of the dominant tribes in Malawi. This shows that there was no explicit recognition or valuing of cultures of other small ethnic groups in Malawi in the lesson, other than the dominant cultures.

Although coverage of cultural knowledge, especially of small ethnic groups in Malawi was weakly evident in the lessons, the cultural knowledge the teachers brought to the classroom had some positive influence on teachers' practices in the classrooms. Some teachers, especially Teachers 3, 9, 10 and 12, occasionally used cultural tools such as songs and dances to help students participate in class. Teachers engaged learners in activities involving singing and dancing and they introduced such activities spontaneously.

For example, Teacher 3, in Standard 8, at school 'B,' an urban school on the 25th of February, 2010, while teaching a lesson on drawing, spontaneously led the learners in singing the following song:

> *Tambala walira kokoliriko, thamangirani ku ntchito zanu. Mlesi ndi mdani wotsitsa dziko. Eee, nong'onong'o, eee wefuwefu thukuta lanu lagula ufulu.*
>
> [Translated as: the cockerel is waking you up, please wake up and prepare for work. Lazy people derail the development of a country. Little by little your sweat will liberate you from the bondage of poverty]

Often the teachers took advantage of the ethnic homogeneity of their classes because the majority were Chewa. They used songs and traditional dances that the learners knew for the organisation of participatory activities. The curriculum documents do not explicitly encourage teachers in the use of such tools in the classrooms. Nonetheless, the teachers used these tools to increase participation of the learners, aiming to help all learners achieve learning outcomes. During interviews, Teacher 10 indicated that such cultural tools were part and parcel of his life, having grown up in the village himself. Familiarity with these cultural tools helped them to adapt them for use in their classrooms.

***2. Inclusivity***

Generally, lack of recognition of small ethnic groups and non-dominant group participation in the lessons observed suggested that there was no inclusivity in the classrooms. Only Teacher 2 once in a while during the teaching and learning process made some attempts to get learners of different sexes actively involved in the lessons.

For example, the episode below, extracted from a lesson conducted by Teacher 2 in Standard 7 at school 'A,' a rural school on the 8th of January, 2010, illustrates some inclusivity in the Expressive Arts lessons observed. In the lesson, the teacher encouraged learners to form groups with equal representation of boys and girls.

The lesson began at 11:50 a.m. There were 56 children present in the class that day. The teacher was teaching about mirroring activities. The teacher progressed with the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher:** Yesterday, we learned about mirroring. We said that mirroring are activities which somebody can mirror from his friends. Can you tell me what we said mirroring is?
> **Learner**: Mirroring is an activity in which somebody imitates a friend.
> **Teacher:** Yes?
> **Learner:** Mirroring is an activity which you copy from a friend.
> **Teacher:** Yes?
> **Learner**: Mirroring is an action of copying.
> **12:02: Teacher**: Can you be in groups of ten. I do not want to see groups of boys only and girls only.

In the above excerpt, the teacher was making explicit attempts to include learners of different sexes in the lesson when she said that, '*I do not want to see groups of boys only and girls only'.* The teacher thus encouraged learners to make groups which were inclusive of different sexes.

On the other hand, 83% (66 out of 71) of the lessons showed few deliberate attempts by the teachers to include learners of different sexes in their lesson activities.

The episode below, reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 9 in Standard 7, at school 'E,' a rural school on the 2nd of February, 2010, illustrates lack of 'inclusivity' in the observed lessons:

The lesson began at 8:00 a.m. There were 56 children present in the class that day. The teacher was teaching about 'posture and body movements'. As part of the introduction of the day's Expressive Arts lesson, the teacher formally greeted the learners and began the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher:** I welcome you to this lesson this morning. Today, we are going to discuss something different from what we discussed yesterday. Today the topic is posture and body movements. Now, can you open your books on page 12? Open your books on page 12. What I want you to do is this [teacher reads from the teacher's guide]. Study the illustrations in the learners' book, secondly identify postures and body

> movements that express cultural values, and lastly, describe each posture and body movement. I want you in your groups to study the illustrations and that will be the first thing you have to do. Then discuss what you see in the illustrations. What is happening in those illustrations? Then after that one, identify postures and body movements that express cultural values. Then lastly, you have to describe posture and body movements. I will give you a few minutes, say 5 minutes.
>
> [I sat close to **a group composed of boys only**. One boy said, "This picture shows respect." Another boy asked, "*Kodi"* (translated as: can I be enlightened) to show respect "*Ndikuwonetsa ulemu, eti*?" (translated as: what does to show respect mean?). A third boy asked, "*Nanga ichi, chikuwonetsa chiya*? (translated as: what about this, what does it mean? Number B,"*Chikuwonetsa chiya?"* (translated as: what does this number B, mean?].

In the above excerpt, there was no deliberate attempt by the teacher to include learners of different sexes in the lesson activities as learners were divided into groups of single sex to work on a learning activity or task. Boys and girls were working on their own. However, there was no evidence in the data that suggested that the teachers were deliberately reinforcing the polarity between boys and girls in the classrooms.

***3. Group identities in a learning community***

Generally, the majority of Expressive Arts lessons showed few explicit attempts by teachers to help learners from different backgrounds feel part of the learning community in the classroom. Only one of the lessons observed showed an explicit attempt to build a sense of a learning community for learners of different backgrounds in the classroom.

The excerpt below, reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 9 in Standard 7 at school 'E,' a rural school on the 9th of February, 2010, illustrates this.

The lesson began at 8:00 a.m. There were 25 learners in the classroom that day. The teacher was teaching about cultural dances. He progressed with his lesson as follows:

> **Teacher**: But first of all put away those books that you have. O.k., now we go to Expressive Arts. Yesterday, we identified postures and body movements that show cultural values. To see if you still remember what we discussed, please try to answer these questions. Why do we have to kneel down when talking to elders or big people? Do we remember what we learned yesterday?

**Learner:** To show respect

**Teacher:** Very good. Can we clap hands for her?

[Learners clap hands for their classmate]

**Teacher:** Of course we kneel down in order to show respect to the old people. Today's topic will be cultural dances. O.k. there are some people here who can dance *Manganje*. Can you please come forward and demonstrate how to dance *Manganje*. But I want other learners who have not danced *Manganje* before also to come forward and join in the dancing.

[Five boys and five girls volunteered to dance *Manganje* upfront in the classroom. They were using a green plastic bucket as a drum. They made a circle and were dancing round and round in a circle. They sung the following song; "*Bere langa likuwawa, mutu wanga ukuwawa. Kupweteka chidali changachi"* (translated as: my chest is burning and I have a headache, my whole body is in pain, and I would like to dance to get some relief].

In the above excerpt, the teacher made some explicit attempts to make learners from different backgrounds feel part of a learning community in the classroom. For example, in the excerpt, the teacher acknowledged those learners who come from a tribe which dances 'Manganje' to take a lead in the dancing of 'Manganje' and at the same time, he also encouraged other learners who are not from such a tribe to also participate in the activity. In this way, the teacher created a learning community in which learners with different backgrounds felt part of the activities of the lesson. There was however no evidence in the data that suggested that the teachers were reinforcing polarity between learners of different backgrounds or different tribes in the classrooms.

***4. Narrative***

Narrative as a teaching style was seldom used in the lessons. In the majority of the lessons, teaching remained expository. Of the lessons observed, nearly 54% (38 out of 71) were characterised by expository teaching. These 38 lessons had 72 episodes of expository teaching.

The excerpt below, reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 6 in Standard 8 at school 'A,' a rural school on the 25 of January, 2010, illustrates 'expository teaching' in the lessons:

> ***Teacher:*** Cooperation and tolerance. There is difference between cooperation and tolerance. O.k. *cooperation ndi mgwirizano eti? Patha kukhala mgwirizano koma pamene palibe kumvana. Utha kukhala ndi mzako koma utha kulephera kumuuza chinthu china chifukwa utha kuwopa kuti mwina akawuza wina* [translated as: Cooperation is working together, isn't it? Sometimes there can be cooperation without necessarily trusting each other. Sometimes you can be working with someone but you may not be able to tell the person some of your confidentialities because you may fear that the person may divulge the information to other people]. So there is cooperation there but there is no tolerance. Now there can be tolerance but sometimes there is no tolerance. We also said that these dances are performed to show appreciation. Why did we say that the dances are done to show appreciation? *Magulewo amavinidwa* [translated as: The dances are performed] to show appreciation, *kusonyeza mugwirizano* [translated as: to show cooperation]. We said that these dances are performed to preserve culture. Any question?
> O.k. the lesson will end here.

The above excerpt shows that the teacher used expository teaching. This is so because the teacher did a lot of talking, presenting knowledge as facts and truth. The teacher did not even pause to give an opportunity to learners to ask questions on areas of the lesson which they did not understand in the course of teaching.

For some teachers, the lessons were evenly split between narrative and expository styles.

For example, Teacher 1 used narrative teaching in her lesson of 16th of March, 2010 in Standard 8 at school 'F', an urban school.

> **Teacher**: *Tsopano mvetserani nthano iyi* [translated as: now listen to this story]. There was a king in Israel called Solomon. Two women from the same house came to the king each with a baby in her hands. One of the women was carrying a dead baby and the other woman was a carrying a living baby. The woman carrying the dead baby told the king that it was not hers but the living one and that the other woman said so too. Therefore, they were quarrelling over the living baby. So the king commanded that the living baby should be cut into two to be shared equally between the women. The woman whom the living baby was not hers agreed, but the other woman pleaded with the king with a motherly compassion not to kill the baby. Eventually, the king gave the living son to the compassionate woman. All who heard this respected the king.

In the above excerpt, the teacher used narrative teaching. This is so because the teacher included telling a story (a Biblical one in this case) to illustrate the moral lesson which she wanted to teach to the learners through the day's lesson on types of leadership.

***5. Active citizenship***

Generally, there was no explicit discussion about citizenship rights and practices of good a citizen between the teachers and the learners throughout the teaching and learning sessions in most of the lessons. Only one teacher discussed about citizenship rights, responsibilities and practices of good citizenship.

In her lesson taught on the 25th of February, 2010, in Standard 8, at school 'B,' Teacher 3 taught about practices of good citizenship.

> **Teacher:** …We say VCT. O.k. the picture concerns blood testing and gender. Nowadays with the AIDS pandemic, people are required to go for blood testing. Is it important for us to have blood testing?
>
> **Learners:** Yes
>
> **Teacher:** Can you give me the reasons?
>
> **Learner:** To know your status
>
> **Teacher:** Yes, to know your status. Another reason, yes?
>
> **Learner:** To take care
>
> **Teacher:** Yes, in order to take care of yourself or your brother or your sister. Are we together?
>
> **Learners:** Yes
>
> **Teacher:** It is very, very important for you to do blood testing, both men and women and girls. Are we together?
>
> **Learners:** Yes
>
> **7:37 a.m. Teacher**: O.k. now, in your groups, I want you to draw pictures that can tell stories. O.k. Are we together?
>
> **Learners**: Yes
>
> **Teacher:** Can you give me some examples of the pictures that can tell stories. Make groups and discuss. In your groups you tell me that in our group we are going to draw this and this, are we together?
>
> **Learners:** Yes

[Teacher lead learners to sing a song as the learners make groups. The teacher leads the learners to sing the song; *tambala walira kokoliriko, thamangirani ku ntchito zanu. Mlesi ndi mdani wotsitsa dziko. Eee, nong'onong'o, eee wefuwefu thukuta lanu lagula ufulu* [translated as: laziness does not help to develop the country].

**Teacher:** Can you tell us the story behind this picture? What is the picture about? What is the person doing there? Yes?

**Learner:** Vandalising the bridge

**Teacher:** Removing what? He is removing wood from the bridge, ee?

**Learners:** Yes

**Teacher:** Do you think removing wood from the bridge is good?

**Learners:** Nooo!

**Teacher:** It is not good to vandalise bridges because we are the same people who use the bridge.

**Teacher:** O.k. we will continue looking at the work of other groups tomorrow. This is the end of our lesson today.

In the above excerpt, Teacher 3 made some attempts in her lesson to promote 'ideals' of good citizenship like patriotism, loyalty to the nation and respect for the rule of law. She did this by advising the learners to avoid the bad practice of vandalising bridges but also to take responsibility of their own lives by going for Voluntary Testing and Counseling (VCT) to have their blood tested for HIV.

***Summary of Engagement with difference***

An analysis of teachers' use of engagement with difference in their lessons has shown that generally, there was less emphasis on recognition and respect for racial and ethnic cultures of learners from small ethnic and non-dominant groups in Malawi and cultures of other people outside Malawi.

The percentage of lessons and number of episodes indicating presence of Engagement with difference dimension in the 71 lessons are presented in Table 7.2.2 below.

**Table 7.2.2: Percentage of lessons and number of episodes indicating presence of Engagement with Difference dimension in the 71 lessons**

| Dimension | Indicator 1 | Indicator 2 | Indicator 3 | Indicator 4 | Indicator 5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Engagement with difference | Cultural knowledge | Narrative teaching | Expository teaching | Inclusivity | Group identity in a learning community |
| Number of episodes in the 71 lessons | 92 | 1 | 70 | 6 | 1 |
| Percentage of lessons | 92% | 1% | 99% | 7% | 1% |

### 7.2.3 Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom

In the Productive Pedagogies framework, Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom is indicated by four indicators: connectedness to the world, background knowledge, knowledge integration and problem-based curriculum. Generally, the majority of the lessons observed showed little connectedness to the world beyond the classroom. Only 43% (31 lessons out of 71) of the lessons showed connectedness to the world beyond the classroom. A detailed analysis of each indicator of Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom is presented below.

***1. Connectedness to the world***

Most of the teachers observed did not try to connect the lesson content and activities to the outside world. Most of the connections the teachers made in the lessons were restricted to the immediate environment of the classrooms, such as the cultures of the community from which the learners came and some national crises affecting the learners in the country. There was thus dominance of localizing pedagogic discourses in the majority of the lessons.

The episode below, reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 12 at school 'C,' a rural school on 22nd February, 2010, illustrates some localising pedagogic discourses which characterised the majority of the lessons.

The lesson began at 8:00 a.m. There were 27 children present in the class that day. The teacher was teaching about 'Wall charts'. The teacher was asking learners to draw wall charts and explained the task to them as follows:

> **Teacher**: Choose something which you can draw. May be a tree, may be a school, a house, people who are sick because of HIV/AIDS, the cutting down of trees or any other problems affecting you in the country. You can think of those things. Also things like a school girl or a school boy. You can draw anything which you can think about.

The above excerpt is one of the examples which characterized the majority of the lessons in terms of their connectedness to the world beyond the classroom. The excerpt shows that although there were some attempts by the teachers to connect their lessons beyond the classroom, these connections were restricted to the immediate environment of the classrooms such as some national crises affecting the learners in the country. For example, in the above excerpt, the teacher encouraged learners to base their drawings on local issues affecting them in the country such as HIV/AIDS and deforestation. In addition, although learners recognized some connection between classroom knowledge and situations outside the classroom, but they did not explore the implications of these connections, and so most of what the learners were introduced to in the lessons remained abstract or hypothetical. For example, in the excerpt above, the teacher did not explore further with the learners about the effects of HIV/AIDS and deforestation on their lives. The above excerpt illustrates another general practice that teachers did not co-extend key concepts they were teaching. This practice deprived the learners the opportunity to develop knowledge, skills, attitudes and values which would enable them to deal with the challenges of their everyday lives and to enable them actively participate in the changing Malawi context.

### *2. Background knowledge*

Generally, most of the lessons made some reference to learners' background knowledge, either to learners' daily experiences or their community. Of the observed lessons, 82% (58 out of 71) made some reference to the learners' background knowledge.

The episode below, reconstructed from my field notes of an Expressive Arts lesson taught by Teacher 9 at school 'E,' a rural school on 29th January, 2010, illustrates some connection of the lessons observed to the learners' background knowledge:

> **Teacher:** Yesterday, we discussed about the garments which convey messages. I would like to ask you a few questions about what we discussed yesterday. In our societies, if a woman puts on black dress, what does it symbolise, or what does that tell you?
>
> **Learners:** funerals
>
> **Teacher:** Right, can you clap hands for her.
>
> [Learners clap hands for their classmate who has given a correct response to the teacher's question].
>
> **Teacher:** When you see a woman putting on black dress, normally it symbolises that somebody or a family member has died. In weddings, what does the bride wear? In wedding ceremonies, what does the bride wear, what type of colour is the dress that the bride wears, what colour is it?
>
> **Learner:** Veil
>
> **Teacher**: Veil, yes but I want the colour.
>
> **Learner**: white
>
> **Teacher**: White, very good, can you clap hands for her.

In the above excerpt, the teacher tried to connect the lesson to out-of-school background knowledge of the learners. The teacher related or linked the lesson to the learners' knowledge of their culture. For example, the teacher began the lesson by asking the learners about what they knew about the culture of dressing for different occasions such as funerals in their societies. The teacher thus built the lesson on the learners' background knowledge which they brought with them to the classroom.

However, some teachers made no reference to learners' background knowledge, either to learners' daily experiences or their community. For example, the episode below, extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 6, in Standard 8 at school 'A,' a rural school on 26th of January, 2010, illustrates lack of connection of some of the lessons to the learners' background knowledge.

> **Teacher**: Today, we are looking at contemporary music. We are specifically looking at some of the things that are found in music. We are especially now looking at tempo and dynamics. Are we together?
>
> **Learner:** Yes.
>
> **Teacher:** Now, first of all let us look at the term tempo. What is it? What is tempo? O.k. We are saying tempo. These are marks indicated at the beginning of a song. *Kodi Chichewa chake tingati chiyani. Tingati chizindikiro* (translated as: what can we call it in the vernacular]. O.k, we can call it a punctuation mark. We are looking at this thing here. *Chimenechi tingati ndi chizindikiro chomwe tingachipeze pa nyimbo zomwe tikuyimbira tempo* [translated as: we can call this a punctuation mark which symbolizes that the song uses tempo]. O.k. *pamene mwawona kuti mchiganizo cha m'Chichewa, mawu alembedwa ndi exclamation mark chimathanthauza kuti mawuwo ndi ofuula* [translated as: wherever you see an exclamation mark at the end of words or sentences, you should know that those words need to be called or pronounced aloud]. We are talking of these marks in tempo. We are talking of what? We are talking of tempos. Certain tempos are indicated by marks. So these marks *ndizo zimamuwuza munthu uja kuti* [translated as: these punctuation marks indicate that] the tempos can be fast or slow. *Chizindikiro china chilichonse chimamuuza munthu uja zoti achitye* [translated as: every punctuation mark suggests to you as to how you should call the words]. O.k. now from there, we are now looking at dynamics. O.k. that is now dynamics in what? Dynamics in music. What are dynamics in music? This refers to the degree of loudness and softness. It refers to the degree of loudness or softness but it is now in what? In music, isn't it?

In the excerpt above, there is no connection of the lesson to the learners' background knowledge. This is so because the teacher began the lesson by talking about concepts of contemporary music without building the topic or the subject matter of the day's lesson on learners' background knowledge, such as the learners' cultural songs or music.

### *3. Knowledge integration*

Generally, most of the content taught by the teachers in the majority of Expressive Arts was limited to one subject discipline without linking the knowledge with content of other subjects which comprise Expressive Arts. Of the lessons observed, only 18% (6 out of 71) attempted to integrate knowledge.

The episode below, extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 10 in Standard 8 at school 'E,' a rural school on the 1st of February, 2010 shows one of the few examples of integration of knowledge.

The lesson began at 10:20 a.m. There were 32 children present in the class that day. The teacher was teaching about 'dances which are performed in the learners' communities.' He introduced the lesson by formally greeting the learners and proceeded with the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher:** Then we identified one dance for which we su-ng the song, *chule anafera kwa mkazi wake koma maliro anapita kwawo* [translated as: the frog died at the in-laws village but it was decided that he be buried at his own village of origin]. Now, what is the importance of this song?
>
> **Learner:** Unity and cooperation.
>
> **Teacher:** Yes, it teaches us about unity and cooperation**.**
>
> **Teacher:** Now we shall be performing this dance known as *Manganje*. We shall be in three groups but each group will perform *Manganje* and sing a song of their choice during the performance. You will need to choose songs which convey messages. All those to whom I gave the number 1 will form one group, those I gave the number two will form another group and those I gave the number three will again form another group.
>
> **10: 38 a.m. Teacher**: Now let us go outside and perform *Manganje*. We will use this tin as a drum because we don't have a drum. Can you please compose a song in your groups and sing and dance to those songs using gestures.
>
> [Learners went outside and were in their three groups rehearsing their songs. The teacher asked every group to perform the *Manganje* one after another in turns. For example, group one sung the song, *tipewe AIDS chifukwa ilibe mankhwala* (translated as*:* Let us avoid AIDS because it has no cure].
>
> **10:47 a.m. Teacher**: You should know that this subject is going to be examined on the national examinations. It is going to be combined with Life skills. O.k. so the lesson ends here. Now you should copy these review exercise questions and you will

> answer them during your own free time. During examinations, these questions can come so we should know the answers to these questions.

The above excerpt shows some conceptual integration of knowledge. The teacher integrated knowledge from Music, Dance and Life skills Education, when he asked the learners to come up with a song on any contemporary or cross-cutting issues and match the song with *Manganje* dance steps.

However, although learners recognized some connections between classroom knowledge and situations outside the classroom, but they did not explore the implications of these connections, so they remained abstract or hypothetical. In the above excerpt, when the teacher asked the learners about the significance of the song they sung, the learners mentioned issues like promotion of unity and cooperation among people. But the teacher did not actually engage the students deeply in any critical analysis of what they meant by unity and cooperation. The learners thus just mentioned the issues without making explanations of their thoughts.

***4. Problem-based curriculum***

Problem-based curriculum was weakly evident in the lessons, as learners were not engaged in solving real-world problems in the twelve classrooms. The lessons lost the rhythm of higher-order or critical thinking associated with high intellectual quality teaching and learning proposed by Productive Pedagogies.

***Summary of Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom***

The majority of Expressive Arts lessons showed little connection to the outside world. An in-depth analysis of the observed lessons has shown that two indicators of Connection of the lessons to the world beyond the classroom: connectedness to the world and knowledge integration were present in only 45% of the lessons observed. There was little connection of the concepts teachers were teaching to similar knowledge from the world outside

Malawi even though some of the concepts the teachers were teaching may have originated outside Malawi.

The problem based curriculum, which gives opportunity to learners to engage in solving real-world problems was weakly evident in the lessons. There was a lack of critical thinking associated with high intellectual quality teaching and learning in many of the lessons.

The percentage of lessons and number of episodes indicating presence of Connectedness of lessons to the world beyond the classroom dimension in the 71 lessons are presented in Table 7.2.3 below.

**Table 7.2.3: Percentage of lessons and number of episodes indicating presence of Connectedness of lessons to the world beyond the classroom**

| Dimension | Indicator 1 | Indicator 2 | Indicator 3 |
|---|---|---|---|
| Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom | Connectedness to the world | Background knowledge | Knowledge integration |
| Number of episodes | 27 | 58 | 6 |
| Percentage of lessons | 24% | 82% | 8% |

### 7.2.4 Supportive classroom environment

In the Productive Pedagogies framework, the dimension of Supportive classroom environment has five indicators: student direction, student self-regulation, academic engagement, social support, and explicit quality performance criteria.

This dimension was weakly evident in most of the observed Expressive Arts lessons. Only 27% (18 out of 71) showed evidence of supportive classroom environment, although some parts of the lessons had some of its indicators. A detailed analysis of each indicator of Supportive classroom environment dimension of Productive Pedagogies as observed in the lessons is presented below.

### *1. Student direction*

In all of the observed lessons, the students' activities were decided by the teacher and the students could not choose their own direction of learning. Teachers determined students' activities during teaching and learning process such as listening to lectures, doing exercises in notebooks, group discussions and presentation of group discussions.

### *2. Social support*

Very limited social support was given to the students in the majority of the lessons. The teachers did not give enough moral support or encouragement to the students during a teaching and learning process, although they were supposed to stimulate meaningful and active learning atmosphere in the classroom. Seventy five percent (46 out of 71) of the observed lessons showed very limited social support.

The episode below, extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 2, in Standard 7 at school 'A,' a rural school on the 8th January, 2010 illustrates lack of social support in the observed lessons:

The lesson began at 12:00 noon. There were about 56 children present in the class that day. The teacher was teaching about 'practising mirroring activities.' The teacher introduced the lesson by formally greeting the learners and proceeded with the lesson as follows:

> **12:00: Teacher:** Let us go to the ground to practice doing some of the mirroring activities which we discussed yesterday.
>
> **12:02: Teacher**: Can you be in groups of 10. I do not want to see groups of boys only and girls only. Can that group demonstrate running on one leg from there to there? Can the rest of the groups do exactly what you have seen your friends doing, running on one leg for 20 metres and back? You two, you are very stupid. Why are you doing your own things? Why are you not running?

In this excerpt, the teacher did not provide social support to the learners. This is so because:

- When the teacher noticed that the learners were engaging themselves in some off-task activities, the teacher disapproved their actions by reprimanding them, *"you too, you are very stupid. Why are you doing your own things? Why are you not running?"* This may have left the concerned learners embarrassed and eventually dropping out of the lesson.
- The teacher did not use or employ any other 'social support' techniques to teach the learners to listen attentively and concentrate on the teaching and learning task at hand, apart from the teacher rebuking the learners.

However, some teachers did try to give moral support and encouragement to the students. Of the lessons observed, only 35 % (25 out of 71) were characterised by social support. The main form of social support provided to the learners was praising them when they made a contribution in the lessons, showing them that their contributions were important. The ideas of learners were acknowledged by the teacher in such a way that the learners felt involved in class discussions. When a learner gave an incorrect answer, the teacher called upon other learners to come to the rescue of a colleague who had either given a wrong response or made no attempt to give an answer to a teacher's question.

The episode below, extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 12, in Standard 8 at school 'C,' a rural school on 15th February, 2010, illustrates 'social support' in the observed lessons:

The lesson began at 8:00 a.m. There were about 27 children present in the class that day. The teacher was teaching about 'dances that convey and communicate messages.' The teacher introduced the lesson by formally greeting the learners and proceeded with the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher**: ... so during which occasions do they perform *Beni*? By occasions we mean some dances are performed in certain ceremonies and some dances are performed during wedding ceremonies and others are performed just during other gatherings. So during which occasions is *Beni* performed?

**Learner:** It is performed during ... [learner does not complete his sentence]

**Teacher:** Can someone else help him? During which occasion is *Beni* performed? Is it during funeral occasions?

In the above excerpt, the teacher put into effect social support by calling upon another learner to help a colleague who had failed to give a correct response to a teacher's question. This prevented the learner who had failed to answer the teacher's question from feeling embarrassed, a situation which may have resulted in the learner dropping out of the lesson.

### *3. Engagement*

In the majority of Expressive Arts lessons, students had little engagement in the teaching and learning process. When pupils were engaged, they were attentive and did not distract the teaching and learning process. Only 27% (18 out of 71) of the lessons showed academic engagement of learners. In the remaining 73% (53 out of 71) of the lessons observed, much of the teaching and learning time was spent on classroom management, with a lot of time spent controlling students' behaviour. The classroom layout created problems of classroom management in the study schools. The seating arrangement had to be reorganised to allow children to be in groups and at the end of the lesson, the class had to be reorganised again. This practice not only wasted time but created management problems of all kinds. With an average enrolment of 70 pupils, the classrooms usually erupted into uncontrollable noise, with children bullying each other. In order for the teachers to maximise learning time for their learners, they apparently abandoned interactive classroom practices like group work and resorted to expository methods, which did not involve reorganisation of seating arrangements and controlling children from making noise and bullying each other when they sat in groups.

The episode below, extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 5, in Standard 7, at school 'F,' an urban school on the 12th of April, 2010, is an example of a situation with little academic engagement of learners in the teaching and learning process.

The lesson began at 9:00 a.m. There were about 157 children present in the class that day. The teacher was teaching about 'making musical instruments.' The teacher introduced the lesson by formally greeting the learners and proceeded with the lesson as follows:

> **Teacher**: O.K. today, we are going to continue our work. Have you got your materials for making the drums?
> **Learners** (collectively): Yes
> **Teacher:** Those who make a drum should stand up. Stand up. Have you got the materials? O.k., today we won't go out. We are going to be here. Those who will make a guitar stand up. Today we want to finish making the musical instruments. Those making a guitar stand up. O.k. now, all those making drums will be sitting in this role. Can you come here? Those who are making a flute can you be where you are?
> [I sat with a group of 26 learners. They were making a plastic drum. A boy was taking the lead in making the plastic drum in the group. The teacher came to the group and told the group, "You have to be serious *chifukwa ndidzapereka* marks. You have to be serious because I will be awarding marks at the end of this exercise. *Mukapanga ng'oma yabwino yabwino ndi 100%*" (translated as: if you make a good drum, I can award you 100%). One of the boys in the group complained, "*Mukundipwetekatu*" (translated as: you are hurting me colleagues. Another boy agreed, "*Pachuluka anthu apa*" (translated as: we are too many here). A third boy complained, "*Ndikuyesa ndikuchita kukankhidwa*"(translated as: I am also being pushed). A fourth boy agreed, "*Inde pachuluka anthu apapa ntchito ikumativuta kugwira*" (translated as: it is true, we are too many here, it is difficult for all of us to participate].

In this excerpt, there is little engagement of learners in the learning tasks of the lesson. This is so because:

- The complaints of the learners, such as, '*you are hurting me colleagues*', *'we are too many here*,' *'I am also being pushed', 'it is true, we are too many here, it is difficult for all of us to participate',* show that there were too many learners in one group and as such it was difficult for each one of them to participate actively in the assigned work.

- There was disruption of the class as learners were pushing and hurting each other leading to very little learning taking place in the groups. This was created by very large numbers of learners in the class.

On the other hand, the episode below, extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 7, in Standard 7 at school 'D,' an urban school on 4th March, 2010, illustrates academic engagement of learners in the observed lessons:

The lesson began at 11:10 a.m. There were about 70 children present in the class. The teacher was teaching about 'multi-cultural performances'. The teacher introduced the lesson by formally greeting the learners and proceeded with the lesson as follows:

> ***Teacher**:* So what I want you to discuss is other folk dances you know and the ethnic group that perform the dance you have mentioned. Start discussing.
> [Learners went into groups. I sat at a group composed of 6 boys and 3 girls. A girl told her colleagues, "*Gulewamkulu,* Lilongwe." A boy added, "*Tilembe kuti Gulewamkulu, Dowa"* (translated as: let us write Gulewamkulu, Dowa*).* Another girl told her colleagues, *"Lilongwe, Dowa or Dedza amayipanganso"* (translated as: it is also a dance in Lilongwe, Dowa or Dedza). Another boy asked his colleagues, *"Nanga Manganje? Mangochi*" (translated as: what about *Manganje*, is it performed in *Mangochi*?). Another girl asked, *"China chiya*? (translated as: what else should we add?). A boy answered, *"Vimbuza."* A girl added*, "Ingoma, Mzimba*" (translated as: let us write, Ingoma in Mzimba). Another boy also added*, "Tilembenso malipenga, Nkhata bay*" (translated as: let us also write malipenga in Nkhata bay). Another boy asked, *"Walemba Beni*?" (translated as: have you written Beni as well?). A girl who was serving as a secretary of the group answered, *"Ayi*" (translated as: No). Another girl asked, *"Beni ndi chiya*?" (What is Beni?). A boy answered, "*Mangochi.*" Another boy added, *"Mangochi, Zomba."* Another boy asked, *"Walemba zingati*?" (translated as: how many have you written so far?). Another boy added*, "Aphunzitsi akuti faivi iwe walemba zingati?* (translated as: the teacher said 5, how many have you written so far?). A girl who was serving as a secretary in the group told her colleagues, "six." A boy advised the members of the group, *"Basi zakwana. Tingosiya pomwepa"* (translated as: I think this is enough information, we can as well stop here*).* Another girl told the one serving as the secretary of the group, *"Lemba mayina athu mum'nsimo"* (translated as: please put our names at the bottom of this paper].

In the above extract, there was engagement of learners in the teaching and learning process. This is so because of the following two reasons. Firstly, the excerpt shows that the learners were actively involved in doing the assigned work. The learners were not

sleeping, day-dreaming, making a noise or disrupting the class. Secondly, most of the learners were making some contributions of ideas on the assigned learning task.

The participation of the learners in the lessons was however gendered, with boys taking more active roles in all the twelve classrooms than girls. The gendered participation of the learners seems to be influenced by the customs and traditions of the teachers and learners. We can easily understand classroom behaviours in Malawi with reference to the cultural customs and traditions of the teachers and their students. For example, in Malawi, people are associated with either matrilineal or matrilineal cultural systems, but the majority of them belong to the matrilineal cultural group. Both cultural systems have their own beliefs, customs, and practices, which are expressed in form of marriages, chieftaincy, property inheritance, marriages, and land-owning. For instance, in matrilineal society, inheritance of property and land is traced through female lines while as in patrilineal society it is through male lines. In addition, the custody of children in matrilineal cultural system is in their mothers, but in a patrilineal cultural system, it is the responsibility of the fathers. Although in the matrilineal society the custody of children is with their mothers, they do so through their brothers. The implication of this is that women assume subordinate positions in both cultural groups, although women in matrilineal societies have comparatively more individual power than their counterparts in the patrilineal society.

Furthermore, both cultural systems have various forms of traditional practices for preparing children for adulthood responsibilities at both family and society levels. Different ethnic groups in each of the cultural systems have their own forms of cultural practices for the preparation of children for civic responsibilities. In spite of the differences in these cultural practices, there are three common elements between the two cultural systems. The first is that teaching is elder-centred and the role of children is to pay attention and follow what the leaders tell them to do or not to do. The second is that children are not expected to interrupt

or question the wisdom of their elders as they teach them because that is tantamount to unruly behaviour. The last is that of social distance between females and males. As such, males and females attend different 'schools' for the preparation of their adult responsibilities. Through such schools, boys are taught their dominant positions in families and society while girls are taught more of their subordinate positions to their male counterparts.

Teachers and students in Malawi go to their schools with such kinds of customs and traditions that are engraved in their minds from an early age. The teachers and students in the six schools that were used in this study came from both matrilineal and patrilineal cultural systems in which women assume subordinate positions in both cultural groups. The impact of this on the classroom practice of the teachers was that generally many of the girls in the twelve classrooms did not take active roles in the classrooms. All twelve teachers generally preferred boys to girls in taking leading roles in the classrooms. For example, the majority of the lessons observed showed a pattern of boys' domination in class activities. The teachers however seemed not to have been aware of how culture negatively affected female participation in the classroom. Suffice it to say that occasionally, the teachers made some deliberate interventions to encourage girls' participation in their classrooms. A good example is Teacher 2's lesson of 8th January, 2010, in which the teacher encouraged equal participation between girls and boys during an Expressive Arts practical lesson. Even with such interventions, many girls seemed to have resigned to their fate.

There was no evidence that suggested that the teachers were deliberately reinforcing the polarity between boys and girls in the classrooms. Thus, although all the teachers knew the importance of involving all students in lesson activities regardless of their gender, their social-cultural backgrounds seemed to have ruled supreme in the decisions they made in

the classrooms. In fact, both boys and girls seemed to have taken for granted their cultural positions, which were transferred to the classrooms. The girls seemed to have accepted that leading roles are exclusively for males. It looked like the teachers and the learners' social-cultural backgrounds generally blinded their behaviours in the classrooms.

In addition, there were clear patterns of all-boys or all-girls groups in all the twelve classrooms. Sometimes, the groups were a mixture of boys and girls, but highly gender-skewed. Classroom observations showed that the teachers rarely formed the groups. Instead, the students themselves formed the groups. In that way, socio-cultural backgrounds seemed to have influenced the students in the formation of gender-based groups. The teachers did not seem to have noticed these clear patterns in the groups, possibly because their socio-cultural backgrounds also blinded their perceptions of students' classroom behaviours.

The other evidence that low academic engagement of learners was caused by custom and tradition is that the students never asked questions of their teachers, even when the teachers gave them the chance to do so. The students were always ready to answer questions from their teachers, but not asking them questions. (The only time a student asked a question to their teacher was in Teacher 6's classroom on 21st of January, 2010. The student asked whether it was true that Senzangakhona was Tchakazulu's father. The teacher dismissed the question as irrelevant to Expressive Arts. It was a ritual that whenever the teachers asked, "Does anybody have a question?" all the students responded in a chorus, "Nooo." Similarly, when the teachers asked, "Is it clear?" the students responded, "Yesss." But not asking questions did not necessarily mean that the students had no questions. Classroom observations showed that the students preferred asking each other questions rather than directing them to their teachers. A cultural

explanation for this is that the teachers' and learners' elder-centred teaching may have caused the children's passivity and motivated students' inactivity in the classrooms.

**4. *Explicit quality performance criteria***

Most of the teachers did not make the criteria for quality performance explicit. However, some teachers tried to gauge the quality of the learning of their learners by assessing their performance at the end of the lessons. For example, Teachers 2 and 10 assessed their learners' learning at least twice during their lessons. Only 6% (4 lessons out of 71) showed some evidence of assessment for learning taking place within the teaching and learning process. However, the assessment activities were observed to be merely aimed at recall of facts.

The episode below, extracted from an Expressive Arts lesson conducted by Teacher 2**,** in Standard 7 at school 'A,' a rural school on the 5th of January, 2010 illustrates some assessment, but only of factual recall.

The lesson began at 10:00 a.m. There were about 56 children present in the class. The teacher was teaching about 'mirroring.' The teacher introduced the lesson by formally greeting the learners. She proceeded with explaining to the learners the meaning of mirroring as 'things which learners copy from each other at their homes or at school'. The teacher concluded the lesson as follows:

> **10:35 a.m. Teacher**: Now can you take note books and quickly answer these questions.
>
> [Teacher wrote the following questions on the chalkboard]
>
> 1. What is mirroring?
>
> 2. Mention two activities which you can copy from friends?
>
> [The teacher went around the classroom marking the learners. She did the marking for about five minutes].
>
> **10:40 a.m. Teacher**: Most of you failed to answer the questions correctly. What is mirroring?
>
> **Learner:** Mirroring is an art of copying an action, words or expressions.

> **Teacher:** Thank you very much. Mirroring is an art of copying an action, words or expressions. Our lesson ends here for today. Thank you very much for your attention.

The above excerpt shows that the teacher involved assessment of learners when she gave learners a class exercise, marked the exercise and gave them the expected responses to the questions. However, the episode shows that the assessment activity was based on simple recall of facts that were learned in that lesson and in the previous couple of lessons. This assessment activity, like the other three observed in the lessons, was different from that of the teacher's guide. The Standard 7 teacher's guide that the teacher used suggested the following assessment tasks for students:

1. What are mirroring activities?
2. Why are mirroring activities significant?
3. Describe some mirroring activities that you do at home and at school.
4. How do mirroring activities differ from other ordinary activities?

While Teacher 2's task only involved students to recall facts, the same task in the teacher's guide goes beyond simple recalling of facts. For example, the third and fourth questions of the task in the teacher's guide makes connections to students' lived experiences. Yet the teacher's assessment task did not make such connections.

***Summary of supportive classroom environment***

The majority of Expressive Arts lessons showed little engagement of learners in the teaching and learning process. The percentage of lessons and number of episodes indicating presence of Supportive Classroom Environment dimension in the 71 lessons are presented in Table 7.2.4 below:

**Table 7.2.4: Percentage of lessons and number of episodes indicationg presence of Supportive Classroom Environment dimension in the 71 lessons**

| Dimension | Indicator 1 | Indicator 2 | Indicator 3 |
|---|---|---|---|
| Supportive classroom environment | Engagement | Social support | Judging student performances |
| Number of episodes | 18 | 25 | 4 |
| Percentage of lessons | 27% | 35% | 6% |

## 7.3 Teachers' perspectives of what they were doing in the teaching of Expressive Arts

As shown above, productive pedagogies were weakly evident in the lessons. The lessons were characterized by legitimatization of local knowledge, particularly ethnic cultural knowledge; teacher-centred pedagogy was predominant; and continuous assessment was not evident in the lessons. In the section below, I review teachers' perspectives or explanations of what they were doing in the teaching of Expressive Arts and their reasons for teaching Expressive Arts the way they did. The significance of this section is that it brings in the 'emic' perspective principle of Illuminative evaluation to this study. The importance of the inclusion of 'emic' perspective in this study is that it enabled the insiders of the innovation, the teachers to articulate their feelings of the innovation. This means that the present study has emphasized understanding the object of investigation, the PCAR curriculum from 'emic' or 'insider' perspective as opposed to 'etic' or evaluator's perspective.

### 7.3.1 Teacher-centred classroom practices

The observations showed that the teachers' major concern was knowledge achievement through rote learning. It seemed the teachers wanted to cover as much content material as possible to help students gain the much needed knowledge for mandated examinations. The teachers thus largely used classroom techniques and activities like lecture, explanations, question and answer and recitations. These techniques and activities are all teacher-centred, not pupil-centred. Because of their persistent use of teacher-centred

teaching approaches, I wanted to learn from them about why they predominantly used these methods and how they felt that such approaches could help the students in the acquisition of knowledge, skills, and attitudes necessary for life after school as espoused in the intended curriculum of Expressive Arts. In response to this question, Teacher 10, for example, remarked that

> I was just trying to tell them how they can identify the activities that cover distances, such as running, discus and javelin. *Nanga sikuti ndinawona kuti ana akewo akulephera kunena* [translated as: I saw that the learners were failing to come up with the needed responses and therefore I had to change the method of teaching to giving them the information I was expecting them to come up with].

The above excerpt shows that the teacher held a 'deficit' picture of his learners. The teacher treated learners like 'empty vessels' into which he needed to 'pour' knowledge. He therefore believed that he needed to do much of the talking himself in order to provide information to his learners. The teachers also indicated that Standard 8 national examinations influenced their classroom practices. For example, Teacher 8, in a post-lesson observation interview on the 27th of April, 2010, when asked the question as to why she used lecture method in her lesson, responded that

> The time, it will take us a very long time to finish up the work. As this is an examination class, we just go through the lesson quickly with the learners for us to complete the book. We just take those lessons that we see that there are easy to teach and those that we think the Malawi National Examinations Board people can ask examinations on. For example, the Malawi National Examinations Board people cannot ask questions from some of the activities in this book. Malawi National Examinations Board people cannot ask the learners to carve a stool. Maybe the

Malawi National Examinations Board people can just ask the learners the procedure for carving a stool. So that is what we teach them.

From the teachers' responses, it looked like that mandated examinations contributed greatly to their decisions in the selection of expository pedagogies. Two major pieces of evidence seemed to reveal that the teachers were teaching to examinations. The first was that the teachers frequently warned their students about the importance of examinations. For example, teachers 5 and 8 made frequent references to mandated examinations especially on areas that were often tested (see the extract of the lesson conducted by Teacher 5, in Standard 7, at school 'F,' on the 12th of April, 2010 captured in section 7.1.4 in this chapter)**.** Some students, too, anxiously listened to whatever their teacher warned them about examinations. Such students even wrote down some notes in their copybooks about the possible areas for examinations. The second was that note copying was one of the major activities in all the twelve classes especially in Teacher 8's class. During the actual lessons, the notes were usually in the form of summaries with important points underlined. In addition, nearly all teachers gave more detailed notes to be copied outside the lesson time or during timetabled preparation periods.

This practice of teaching to examinations suggests that mandated examinations force the teachers to abandon the learner-centred and participatory pedagogies in favour of teacher-centred pedagogies although the Expressive Arts intended curriculum guides teachers on using classroom practices that promote active participation of the learners. Practically, what this meant was that the teachers' use of expository pedagogies denied students' active participation in the classrooms.

### 7.3.2 Frequent code-switching between English and Chichewa

A common feature in all the classrooms of the twelve case study teachers was frequent code-switching between English and Chichewa as medium of instruction. Teachers often explained in English and re-explained in Chichewa. This practice was followed up in post-lesson interviews. Teachers explained that they did this because their learners' English skills were very low and in order to increase their participation in the lessons, they resorted to code-switching to the vernacular language to enable their learners understand what they were teaching. For example, Teacher 9 remarked that

> I think the problem is that sometimes, some of them find it a problem to discuss more especially in English and this is why sometimes you saw me I was trying to talk to them in Chichewa. I think those learners who were keeping quiet, I think I would say that they had a problem in trying to discuss something in English. I think they were tongue tied because I was teaching in English. That is what we are supposed to do, like in Standard 7, we are supposed to speak in English and discuss everything in English so they were tongue tied because they were failing to express themselves properly. English is a problem to the learners not only in Expressive Arts but in other subjects as well.

Indeed Teacher 9's lessons, like many other lessons taught by other teachers, have evidence of the code-switching between English and Chichewa. In the post-lesson interview, the teacher explained that he used Chichewa explanations whenever he realized that the students did not understand what he said to them in English. He explained further that he resorted to code-switching as one way of encouraging students' participation in class. What was coming clearer from the teachers in the post-lesson interviews was that there was a general problem in the use of English as a medium of instruction. In addition, the teachers also frequently used recitations in their lessons.

### 7.3.3 Teachers' Reliance on Recitation

Recitation was a common feature in the twelve classrooms as the teachers engaged students in the memorization of English concepts or facts. For example, in the lesson taught by Teacher 7, on the 4th of March, 2010, the teacher said, "Multicultural performances are performances for difference cultures," and asked the students, **"**multicultural performances are performances from what?" The students recited, "Different cultures." Similarly, the teacher said, "O.k., what we want to do is discussing folk dances from various cultures in Malawi. For example, you give me examples of ethnic groups and those groups have their folk dances. For example, I myself, I am a Lomwe. My ethnic group is what?" The students recited, "Lomwe." Thus, recitations were a dominant feature in all the twelve classrooms. In post-lesson interviews, all the teachers explained that they had no choice, but used English as a medium of instruction since this was a state policy. They further explained that the recitations were intended for helping students to learn some English concepts.

Thus, in general, all the twelve teachers acknowledged in post-lesson classroom observation interviews that the use of English as a medium of instruction was a stumbling block for students' active participation in classroom activities.

### 7.3.4 Over-dominance of instrumental forms of knowledge

As noted earlier in this chapter, data has shown that the majority of the Expressive Arts lessons observed were characterized by dominance of instrumental localized knowledge, particularly 'ethnic culture.' There were thus more episodes in which the lessons observed covered ethnic or local cultural beliefs and practices of the learners. One of the teachers, Teacher 4, whose lessons were dominated by ethnic culture, in a post lesson observation interview of 4th March, 2010 explained the reason why she stressed ethnic cultural issues in her lesson

> … the outcomes of this lesson were that the learners should know how to perform these dances and where the dances are performed and how these dances are performed and also the attires that are worn when performing these dances…the significance is that they should know our culture, their culture within their areas or even the whole country because culture is important to everyone. So they should not forget their culture.

The teacher's remarks above show that teachers stressed cultural knowledge in their lessons because they did not want learners to forget about their cultural roots and identity. The legitimatising of 'ethnic' cultural practices can be considered to be good in its own right as it gives learners cultural identity as explained by the teachers. But authors like Young (1997), have criticised localising of knowledge for resulting in an education that is balkanising, and which divorces a country from the 'knowledge society' and the information age learners we live in.

### 7.3.5 Weak conceptual integration of knowledge

The Expressive Arts curriculum documents, such as the Teachers' Guide, stipulate integration of knowledge as one of the most important principles of teaching Expressive Arts, as an integrated learning area. However most of the content taught by the teachers in the majority of Expressive Arts was limited to one subject discipline without linking the knowledge with content of other subjects comprising Expressive Arts.

This was followed up in post-lesson interviews. Teachers cited two reasons for their failure to integrate content of different subjects in their lessons. First, the teachers cited gaps in their own knowledge of the content of some of the subject disciplines which form Expressive Arts. For example, Teacher 2, in a post-lesson observation interview on the 13th of January, 2010, responding to the researcher's question, "and then my understanding

is that the subjects are integrated through something like themes. How did you cover themes in that lesson?" remarked that

> I think it is not easy because sometimes, like myself, I am not good at Needlecraft, so there is need for somebody who knows Needlecraft. So I use a resource person to teach Needlecraft, so for other topics I do not find the resource person so I find it difficult to teach such topics.

The remark above shows that teachers apparently failed to accommodate integration of knowledge of different disciplines in their Expressive Arts lessons as prescribed in the intended curriculum due to gaps in their own knowledge of some of the subject disciplines informing Expressive Arts.

Second, teachers cited lack of resources as another reason. For example, Teacher 2, in a post-lesson observation on 13th of January, 2010 cited lack of resources as another reason for her failure to accommodate integration of different subjects in her lessons. She remarked that

> The other problem is resources. We do not have teaching and learning resources especially for sewing and knitting. Sometimes, I used to ask the learners to bring those resources. But I do not ask the learners to do so anymore because sometimes parents ask what that teacher wants to do with those things. So it is like something discouraging so you just leave it like that. You do not even ask learners to bring some of those things, you just look at them.

Similarly, Teacher 3, in a post-lesson observation interview on the topic 'sewing stitches' indicated that she does not integrate some aspects of Needlecraft in their Expressive Arts lessons due to lack of resources for teaching Needlecraft

> I may say that the lesson was a bit good but just because of lack of materials nowadays. You remember that a long time ago during the reign of Dr Banda, schools

were supplied with materials and so we knew how to sew. But now you know things are expensive for a child to find clothes, thread and so many other materials, they are expensive. So this lesson, may be most of the teachers do not tackle it. Lack of materials is a very big challenge on the part of needlecraft in Expressive Arts because not all the learners bring the materials.

This response shows that teachers do not integrate knowledge of different disciplines in their Expressive Arts lessons (as prescribed in the intended curriculum) due to lack of resources. However, teachers displayed poor use of resources in cases where the resources were available. For instance, the use of the resources was teacher-centred and for shorter times, especially as regard to Teacher 3 and Teacher 4. For example, in Teacher 3 and Teacher 4's lessons on sewing stitches, the teachers just demonstrated sewing the stitches to learners and very few of the learners had an opportunity to practise sewing the stitches. Teachers not only lacked resources, but had poor use of resources. They not only were unable to accommodate integration in their lessons but this may have led to the lower intellectual quality of those lessons.

### 7.3.6 Skipping and rushing through content

Data has shown that teachers taught content knowledge which they knew. The teachers were thus observed to have left out or skipped some content prescribed in the curriculum policy documents. In addition, the teachers were observed to rush through content in their lesson presentations.

This practice was followed up in the post-lesson interviews. The teachers cited three reasons for skipping teaching some content which is prescribed in the curriculum policy documents. First, the teachers believed that they could not be able to handle some content prescribed in the curriculum policy documents because they did not understand the content knowledge. For example, Teacher 11, when asked about her view of the design of the

Expressive Arts curriculum in a post-lesson interview on the 27th of April, 2010 remarked that, "some of the content here are difficult for me and the learners to understand." When probed further about what she does when she meets difficult topics, she responded that, "we have no choice at all, we just leave them." Second, the teachers cited lack of in-depth specification of knowledge in the Teachers' Guide as another reason for them to skip teaching some content.

For example, Teacher 10, when asked about his view of the design of the Expressive Arts curriculum for the topic, 'Collaborative sports and games,' in a post-lesson interview on the 5th of February, 2010 remarked that

> The curriculum design for this topic is partly good only that may be as teachers we need more knowledge about netball to teach our learners better on how they can play netball and the information in the Teachers' Guide is not enough on this game of netball. *Ndiye anzathu olemba ma bukuwa bwenzi akumatipatsako* [translated as: so those who participate in the writing of these books should give us] *information yambiri zokhudza masewerawa* [translated as: enough information on the games]. They should include enough information in the materials, the curriculum materials.

Similarly, Teacher 12, when asked about his view of the design of the Expressive Arts curriculum for the topic, 'Collaborative sports and games,' in a post-lesson interview on the 24th of February, 2010, echoed Teacher 10's sentiments about insufficient information in the Expressive Arts Teachers' Guide and also lack of in-service professional development constraining their teaching of the learning area. He thus remarked that

> For this topic, to me, I don't know about others but it is not good because the information given in the Teacher's Guide is inadequate. As I said that for this topic, I just taught it for the sake of teaching it because it is in the syllabus but the information for this topic is not enough. I would therefore suggest that if it would be

> possible, those who do the curriculums, they should decide to ask the government to train us teachers on this part of work so that we can know more about what football is, what netball, what volleyball is and all those other games that are in the syllabus. You cannot stand there and teach the children about volleyball because we don't know much about what volleyball is. To me, I suggest that if there is specific training given to teachers on this topic, then it can be better and helpful. Even if they give us the Teacher's Guide to use but they will never see the teachers teaching all the topics on games because they don't know the games and we can therefore not deliver.

Other teachers who also echoed the same sentiments about insufficient information in the Teachers' Guide for Expressive Arts are Teacher 1, Teacher 3 and Teacher 11. Teacher 1, when probed to evaluate her lesson which she taught on events of cultural significance on the 15th of April, 2010 remarked that

> I think I did not do well in the lesson. I think because of information from the book. I tried my best to look for information but in vain. There wasn't enough information.

Teacher 3, when probed about the curriculum design with reference to the topic, 'Story-telling pictures,' which she taught on the 14th of April, 2010 remarked that

> The design of the Teachers' Guide and the Learners' book on this topic is good. However, the books are lacking some content. The books are lacking in content for us to teach it comfortably.

Teacher 11, when probed to evaluate the lesson which she taught on tempo and dynamics in music on the 14th of April, 2010 remarked that

> I struggled much on this lesson because what I taught came exactly from the book. I had no any other additional information. So it was very difficult for me to tell them some important information. So it was very difficult for me to teach this lesson. I

prepared (for the lesson) because I asked my colleagues about some information on this lesson but their answers are negative. They do not also know the information. Getting information on some topics in Expressive Arts is difficult.

The excerpts above show that although the teachers may have been observed to teach the content prescribed in the curriculum documents, they however seem not to have adequate knowledge of the subject matter they were teaching. They seem to have been teaching just to fulfil the requirements of their job.

Presented below is a copy of a section in the Standard 7 Expressive Arts Teachers' Guide of which teachers complained of not having adequate content. The content which the teachers referred to in the Teachers' Guide is the 'Background information' captured in the sample section of a Teachers' Guide.

## TOPIC 2 Mirroring

### Success criteria

The learners must be able to demonstrate familiar mirroring artistic activities.

### Developmental areas

#### Skills

Ensure that the learners develop skills such as accuracy, communication, coordination, attentiveness and concentration.

#### Concepts and knowledge

Ensure that the learners understand and acquire the following concepts and knowledge:

- spatial relationships
- directions
- levels
- extensions
- air patterns
- floor pathways
- mirroring

#### Attitudes and values

Ensure that the learners develop attitudes and values of appreciation, cooperation, tolerance, perseverance and motivation.

### Background Information

Mirroring is the act of copying actions, words, or expressions of another person. It is a commonly used technique in physical activities, intended to demonstrate a physical movement: a new dance step, a lay up in basketball, a tennis serve, including running activities. The instruction progresses from explanation to demonstration while facing the class and demonstration with the back turned to the class. This allows easy learning of the components. The components are practised separately in a proper sequence until they are mastered. Mirroring can also be used to teach attention skills.

A close look at the section in the Standard 7 Expressive Arts Teachers' Guide above, which teachers say is inadequate or superficial in content seems to confirm the teachers' concern about lack specification of knowledge in the curriculum. An analysis of the teaching and learning activities for this topic (synonymous with theme), 'mirroring' require the teachers to discuss with the learners the skills of a lay-up shot in basketball and tennis serve. However, the content in the background information does not include a description of the skills of a lay-up shot and a tennis serve. According to the Teachers' Guide, the teachers are expected to teach these skills to learners. Basing on the above example of how content is presented in the Teachers' Guide, teachers' complaint about superficial presentation of content in the Teachers' guide may be understandable. However, this does not rule out the possibility that the teachers were not creative and resourceful in sourcing for information not available in their Teachers' Guide to make their teaching more effective.

Third, the teachers skip teaching some content knowledge prescribed in the Expressive Arts curriculum policy documents because they think that they should channel their time and energy in teaching topics which they think will be examined on in the national examinations. For example, Teacher 12 remarked that

> They (learners) failed to mention the materials for drawing a wall chart because drawing is also new to them. We have mainly been focusing more on preparing the learners for examinations in Standard 8 and therefore we have been just skipping the arts. Learners have not been taught art such as drawing. We have been concentrating on topics which are going to appear on the examinations.

Fourth, the teachers skipped teaching some content in the Expressive Arts curriculum because of lack of resources**.** Indeed, availability of material resources seemed to be a big challenge that influenced classroom practices of the teachers in the majority of the lessons

observed in this study. Teachers skipped areas in the curriculum which would involve practical activities because there were no resource materials available for practical lessons. The extract of part of a post-lesson observation interview with Teacher 1, captured below, illustrates that sometimes teachers convert practical lessons into theory lessons because the required resources for some practical activities are not available in the schools.

> **Researcher:** Would we say that you believe that even from a theory lesson in Expressive Arts, like the one you have just taught, your learners can be able to develop practical skills, like weaving, drawing and dyeing? Do you think they are able to get those practical skills from a theory lesson?
>
> **Teacher 1:** Of course they are able to get. But to be specific, it is also important for the learners to practice weaving, drawing or dyeing fabrics and fibres. Because some learners do not know how to weave. Of course they can identify some materials used for weaving but they don't know how to weave. But in doing, through practicing, learners can learn a lot.
>
> **Researcher:** May I learn more then as to why you did not have a practical activity with your learners in this lesson as you are indicating that it is important for learners to have practical lessons for them to develop practical skills of say dyeing, drawing or carving?
>
> **Teacher 1:** They did not have the materials... Maybe let me look at carving. On carving, it is difficult for the learners to find the materials for carving. For example, it is difficult for them to get materials like *kasemasema* or adze. It is also difficult to get a suitable tree here in town for carving. It is rare to find natural trees here in town like *Mtondo* and *Mlombwa.* That is a problem.

School context also seemed to influence teachers in their choice of content to teach the learners. Teachers seemed to leave out teaching some content prescribed in the curriculum

policy documents which seemed to have been unfamiliar to the local context of some schools. For example, the excerpt of a post-lesson observation interview with Teacher 11, captured below illustrates that some teachers skip teaching content which is unfamiliar to their school contexts;

> **Researcher:** Here, you put learners into groups, to discuss areas from which different items are produced like carving wooden items and pottery. What did the learners specifically come up with?
>
> **Teacher 11:** Some of the learners came up with right answers but others did not. This is because of the reason that they are living in the urban areas for them to know where these things are made because they don't move to rural areas. This is the reason they failed to give right answers.
>
> **Researcher:** So they are giving wrong answers because of where they are coming from?
>
> **Teacher 11**: Yes
>
> **Researcher:** So may I learn more about what you do when you come across content in Expressive Arts which you think is difficult to your learners because of your learners' context?
>
> **Teacher 11:** We sometimes use resource persons but for me to find that resource person is very difficult. For example, in these books, we are given such activities like making a stool. That means it needs me to go into rural areas to find someone who is capable to do such a thing. This means I have to have some money to hire him so that he can come and teach the learners. So it is very difficult for me to do such an activity. If we have money or if we have time, we can sometimes invite a resource person, otherwise we do not teach the activity.

Teacher 9 similarly indicated that he found it difficult to teach content included in the curriculum which was based on the context of another region or province of the country while the teacher teaching the content and the learners were from another region or province of the country. He thus remarked that

> Most of the illustrations are difficult to interpret in the book. Like dances, it is difficult to interpret illustrations of traditional dances from the north or the central region here in the southern region.

When probed further as to what he does in situations where he did not know the meaning of or interpret the illustrations because they were based on the context of a province different from that of his learners, he remarked that

> Now in such situations what we normally do is we accept all the answers which the learners give. All the answers given by the learners are right (correct).

Teacher 9's remarks mean that teachers may be teaching wrong things to the learners in cases where they are teaching content which is not familiar to their school context.

### 7.3.7 Technical forms of Continuous Assessment

Only 6% (4 out of 71) of the Expressive Arts lessons observed had assessment integrated in the teaching and learning process of the lessons. This was followed up during the post-lesson observation interviews with the teachers. Teachers cited continuous assessment as creating additional work-load for them as the main reason for them not to integrate assessment in the teaching and learning process. For example, teachers explained that they fail to integrate assessment in their lessons due to time constraints for them to teach and at the same time assess the learners. The following were the comments or remarks of some of the teachers when they were probed about their assessment practices in Expressive Arts:

Comments from Teacher 3

> **Researcher:** The teachers' guide says that you are supposed to observe and record each of your learners' performance in every activity of your lesson as part of continuous assessment. Can I have a look at what you have recorded as your learners' performance in the activities of today's lesson?

**Teacher 3**: [laughs]. I have not recorded the learners' performance. I did not have enough time to teach and assess the learners at the same time. The Ministry of Education also promised to give us registers and materials for assessment but they are not giving us. I just memorise the learners' performance and record later.

**Researcher:** Can you explain clearly about materials for assessment?

**Teacher 3**: Rubrics and checklists and registers where to record the learners' performance.

Comments from Teacher 7

**Teacher 7:** I was not trained properly on how to use Continuous Assessment. The time is also not enough to teach and record learners' performance at the same time.

Comments from Teacher 9

**Teacher 9:** I do Continuous Assessment at the end of every 10 lessons. So I will do the next Continuous Assessment at the end of 10 lessons. Resources such as papers and assessment are a problem. I do not have these.

The comments of the teachers above show that most of the teachers did not integrate assessment in their lessons. In addition, the excerpts also reveal that although some of the teachers at times do assess their learners during the teaching and learning process, they are however not implementing continuous assessment as intended.

Two pieces of evidence seemed to reveal that the teachers were not implementing continuous assessment as intended in the curriculum policy documents. The first is that the teachers were not recording the learners' performance for purposes of gauging the learners' learning progress in the lessons. The teachers therefore seem not to understand the policy on continuous assessment. The second is that teachers assessed wrong skills in the learners. For example, Teacher 2 assessed language skills instead of Expressive Arts

skills. This is evidenced from Teacher 2's remarks during a post-lesson observation interview captured below:

**Researcher**: Thanks, did you have any method to assess whether the outcomes of your lesson have been achieved?

**Teacher 2:** Ya, I think I asked learners some questions.

**Researcher**: Were these oral or written questions?

**Researcher:** And then you went marking the learners. What did you get from that marking?

**Teacher:** Sometimes if I say you should write this, I sometimes want to look at something from the learners. Like in that class, sometimes I look at the spellings. Have the learners written correct spellings?

In the above interview excerpt, the teacher seems not to have understood the policy on continuous assessment, which indicate that assessment in the teaching and learning process should be aimed at assessing the achievement of the lesson outcomes which are related to the subject being taught. Teacher 2, however, assessed language writing skills of learners instead of assessing Expressive Arts skills.

The analysis of the teachers' assessment practices presented above show that teachers seem not to have understood the standard implementation practice of continuous assessment policy in many areas, including what to assess learners on and how regularly the learners should be assessed in the new curriculum.

## 7.4 Closing remarks

Research evidence from a triangulation of data sources has provided information regarding the state of Expressive Arts teaching in some Malawian schools. The results of the study have yielded five lessons. The first, and major lesson is that the practice of four dimensions of Productive Pedagogy is very low among Expressive Arts teachers. The

majority of lessons were characterised by lower intellectual quality, a focus on instrumental knowledge, integration at superficial level, dominance of communalising practices; gendered practices, prevalence of localising discourses and pedagogy for public examination.

Based on the first lesson, the second lesson was driven that informs us that teachers mostly used traditional expository classroom practices where there were very limited interactions between the teachers and the students. In this way, the teachers' classroom practices caused a lot of missed opportunities for preparation of learners who would actively participate in the changing Malawian context and compete successfully in other contexts.

The third lesson enlightens us that the teachers' social-cultural backgrounds was a determinant factor of their classroom practices and learners' classroom behaviour in which participation of the learners was gendered. It is very unlikely that the teachers were aware of the impact of the socio-cultural influence on their classroom practices which led to low participation of girls, boys being given priority over girls in answering questions, gender-skewed groups and learners not asking questions to teachers. The teachers may not have been aware of the impact of the social-cultural backgrounds because they were also products of the same socio-cultural histories. In fact, it seemed that, rather unknowingly, the teachers reinforced the status quo. This situation made many of the students go back home with their customs and traditions, which had a negative effect on their learning largely unchallenged. Therefore, the intention of the state in improving education in the primary schools failed to take place in classrooms of Expressive Arts.

The last two lessons involve some external factors over which the teachers had no control. These also contributed to the missed opportunities for students' development of knowledge, skills and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and to compete successfully in other contexts. For example, the fourth

lesson illustrates that the use of English as a medium of classroom instruction reduced students to mere spectators of their own learning in the classrooms.

The fifth lesson is that the Standard 8 mandated examinations forces teachers into styles of teaching that focus on acquisition of factual knowledge largely done through rote learning.

The overall picture from these five lessons is that classroom atmosphere in the twelve classrooms gave students limited opportunities for the acquisition of knowledge and development of skills, values and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context. Therefore, there was an obvious discrepancy between the state's intended curriculum and the teachers' enacted curriculum. Hence, Chapter 8 is a discussion of these key findings of the study.

# CHAPTER 8

# DISCUSSION OF RESEARCH FINDINGS

## 8.1 Introduction

This study of how teachers are teaching Expressive Arts two years into the implementation of the new curriculum in primary schools in Malawi is framed by the theory of illuminative evaluation and productive pedagogies. The major findings have been reported in the two previous chapters. In this chapter, I discuss the main emergent themes in terms of the conceptual framework and the literature reviewed. This discussion forms the basis for recommendations for the improvement of curriculum in Malawi.

## 8.2 Discussion of emergent themes

Through a recursive categorisation of the research data, eight themes emerged as significant in the implementation of the Expressive Arts curriculum in grades 7 and 8. The themes are related to the knowledge taught, pedagogy and assessment practices of the teachers. These themes are;

- Generally - lower intellectual quality lessons
- The prevalence of localising pedagogic discourses
- Pedagogy for communalisation and subordination
- Pedagogy for syllabus completion
- Pedagogy for public examinations
- Weak conceptual integration of knowledge
- Technical forms of continuous assessment

- Limited connection of lessons to the outside world and over-dominance of instrumentalist knowledge.

These themes are discussed below, guided by the main research question, 'How do Expressive Arts teachers teach Expressive Arts two years into the implementation of PCAR in Malawi?'

### 8.2.1 Lower intellectual quality lessons

This study found that the lessons lacked high intellectual quality in terms of conceptual development and in-depth coverage of the subject matter, thus compromising possibilities for higher-order thinking and deep understanding on the part of the learners. For example, from observations, it showed that most of the Expressive Arts teachers did not encourage the learners to think deeper and involve them actively during teaching and learning process. The learners either passively received, or recited, information from the teachers. There was more teacher-centred teaching and learning where there were very limited two-way interactions between learners and between the teachers and the learners. There was thus generally no productive and intellectual discussions going on during the teaching and learning process in the majority of Expressive Arts lessons observed. Learners could give feedback to teachers' questions relating only to information that was short and easy to memorise. The learners only answered a word or two to the teacher's questions.

This result is consistent with other studies on the practice of Productive Pedagogies by teachers. For example, the study confirms what was found by Zohir *et al.* (2010) and Ishak (2010). Zohir *et al.*, in their study of the classroom practice of productive pedagogies of Malaysian Secondary School Geography teachers, found that the level of intellectual quality in the geography classrooms were very low, as students were less involved with higher order thinking skills as most of the teachers did not encourage the students to think deeper and get actively involved during the teaching and learning process. The teachers in

Zohir's study were observed to have been asking lower-level questions to the students. Students were observed only to receive information passively from their teachers most of the times. Similarly, Ishak (2010) found that generally, the level of intellectual quality in secondary school Science classrooms in Malaysia is very low.

The study also revealed that teachers were not implementing the learner-centred pedagogy as prescribed by the new curriculum. The teachers predominantly used the traditional expository pedagogy. This result corroborates the findings of previous studies that used the methodology of illuminative evaluation to evaluate the teacher's teaching of new curricula.

The Illuminative evaluation approach has the ability to establish the difference or the 'gap' between the intended and the enacted curriculum as teachers implement it. The 'gap' between the intended and enacted curriculum is well documented in the literature (see for example, Nyirenda, 1993; Lowe, 2008; Khomani, 1996; Segoe, 1989; Mdaka, 2007; Nonyongo, 2007; Zolkov, 1996; Hamilton, 1976; Tuah, 1982; Nichols, 1998; Spellman, 2000 and Wong, 2008). Thus Adam's (1991) illuminative evaluation study of the implementation of the science curriculum in Kano state in Nigeria found that teachers rejected the new teaching methods suggested in an innovation and preferred to maintain their old teaching approaches. Adam found that there was a mismatch between what the developers of the science curriculum prescribed as the desired pedagogy for science lessons and what the teachers did in the classroom. Adam attributed this mismatch to the problem of teachers rejecting the innovation and preferring to maintain their old teaching approaches which they thought worked well for them. The result is also consistent with Tuah's (1982) illuminative evaluation study of the implementation of a new curriculum innovation called "Kurikulum Bersepadu Sekolah Rendah" (KBSR) in rural primary schools of Sarawak in Malaysia. The new curriculum was aimed at improving the quality

of primary education (1982, p. 3). Like the Expressive Arts curriculum, some of the practices that were planned for teachers to adopt in putting the KBSR curriculum into practice included an integrated approach in teaching and learning of curriculum subjects, use of a variety of teaching methods and use of formative assessment that is incorporated into the teaching and learning processes. Tuah's study also revealed mismatches between the intended curriculum and the enacted curriculum. Data revealed that the curriculum was not being taught as intended. For example, although the curriculum recommended the teachers to embark on creative and a variety of innovative approaches in their teaching, teachers were however observed to be employing teacher-dominated pedagogy. This result again is consistent with Nichols (1998) illuminative evaluation study of the implementation of the 'Thinking Skills' curriculum innovation at Devon school in the United Kingdom. In the 'Thinking Skills' study, the evaluators used a combination of tools of illuminative evaluation. Nichols' study revealed that the 'Thinking Skills' curriculum was not being taught as intended in the sense that the pedagogy used in the lessons was very different from what was intended in the curriculum documents. For example, didactic teaching was very much the order of the day and little opportunity, if any, was provided for reflection and discussion with the pupils.

**a. Lack of in-depth specification of subject matter in the curriculum**

The first possible explanation for lower intellectual quality Expressive Arts lessons is lack of in-depth specification of subject matter in the intended curriculum. As noted in Chapter 1, the new curriculum in Malawi was based on the South African C2005. Allais (2010) has noted that C2005 is weak on conceptual coherence and in-depth coverage of content knowledge largely because of integration of content knowledge and lack of prescribed content in the curriculum. Allais (2010) has noted that conceptual structures of different forms of knowledge is not recognized in an integrated curriculum and this leads to dilution

of knowledge in the curriculum. As PCAR was drawn from C2005, it has similar flaws to those of C2005. Although PCAR has prescribed content, it lacks specification of content knowledge due to its key design feature of integration of knowledge. This means that the intended curriculum may be flawed in its design, with inherent superficial content knowledge and this may explain the lack of in-depth coverage of content knowledge in the learning milieu. The consequence of the design feature of integration of knowledge is that teachers teaching do not have adequate or in-depth content knowledge of the integrated Learning Areas of the curriculum they are teaching. The intended curriculum required teachers to have knowledge and understanding of all disciplines that make up the Expressive Arts learning area. In the present study, teachers admitted that they lacked adequate knowledge of Needlecraft and Music as some of the disciplines informing Expressive Arts and because of this, they either superficially taught the subject matter or totally left out the subject matter on which they did not have adequate content knowledge (see interview excerpts in section 7.5.3 in chapter 7). This finding is consistent with what Naidoo (2005) found about challenges which teachers face in implementing an integrated curriculum. Naidoo noted that one of the challenges of implementing an integrated curriculum is that teachers may not have knowledge of all the disciplines integrated in the curriculum they are implementing. In her study on teachers' perceptions of the Integrated Learning Areas for the junior secondary school curriculum of the South African National Curriculum Statement (2002), Naidoo found that the majority of teachers in her study lacked confidence and were not able to teach integrated Learning Areas due to gaps in their own knowledge (of the various disciplines informing the Learning Areas).

**b. Use of the deficit model**

The second possible reason for lower quality lessons is that teachers hold a 'deficit' belief about their learners. Post-lesson interviews revealed that the teachers consider their pupils

as slow learners and 'empty buckets', and as such, the teachers feel that in such circumstances, they need to 'give' the learners knowledge instead of letting the learners construct their own knowledge on the subject matter they are being taught. This finding is consistent with the findings of Sarangapani's (2003) study of pedagogic practices of teachers in low-income, under-resourced schools in India. Sarangapani (2003) found that teachers in his study held a 'deficit' picture of their learners, and like the present study, the teachers in Sarangapani's study used expository teaching methods to give sufficient knowledge to their learners.

**c. Use of expository teaching**

The third possible explanation for low intellectual quality of lessons is the teachers' predominant use of expository teaching methods. Evidence in Chapter 7 raise a question as to why most of the teachers predominantly used traditional expository methods. These problems could be indicative of the teachers' preparation programmes. One important point worth noting is that the teachers used in this study were exposed to lecture and question and answer method in their pre-service or initial teacher training. Most of the teachers in this study had taught for more than 10 years. They were therefore trained in the Malawi Special Distance Teacher Education Program (MASTEP) or the Malawi Integrated In-service Teacher Education Program (MIITEP). According to Kunje and Chimombo (1999), a typical teacher education class in these teacher education programmes was characterized by the teacher's use of transmission of knowledge and rote-learning methods. In their teaching experience, trainee teachers were observed to teach as they were trained. The style of teacher-training program that teachers in this study went through therefore seems to be one possible explanation for their predominant use of expository teaching methods in their execution of Expressive Arts lessons. Since teachers hardly used interactive participatory classroom practices, learners were not treated as

thinking beings as the Productive Pedagogy theory proposes (see Lingard, 2001). Thus, the ultimate results of such classroom practices was that the students failed to develop skills in critical thinking, problem solving and making informed decisions about the issues they learned in class or the knowledge they brought from home.

**d. Influence of English as language of instruction**

Although teachers used English as a medium of instruction, they often switched to vernacular whenever they noted that learners were not following. When the teacher switched to vernacular, participation of learners increased. The slight improvement in participation of the learners in lesson activities when a teacher switched to vernacular means that the English language skills of the learners is a major obstacle affecting the participation of the learners in the lessons. Post-lesson interviews confirmed this. Sometimes, the learners answered in a way that showed they did not fully understand the question. The teachers asked learners randomly, even those who did not raise hands to answer questions, as a way of encouraging them to participate in the lessons, but the problem still remained that many learners were not fully involved in the teaching and learning process. The learners' weak language skills resulted in very limited interactions between the teachers and the students resulting in low quality lessons. This confirms what other researchers in Malawi found about the use of English or local language as a medium of instruction in primary schools (see studies by Kaphesi, 2001; Mkandawire, 2004). For example, Mkandawire found that students' participation reduced drastically whenever the class teacher switched from a local language to English. Kaphesi (2001) also found that the use of local language in grade five Mathematics class greatly increased students' participation in lesson activities. These significant research findings suggest that the use of English as a medium of class instruction in the Malawi primary school classrooms reduces students' active participation.

This result of the study also confirms what was noted by authors like Cornbleth (1990), Whitaker (1993), Ornstein and Hunkins (1993), Lowe (2008) and Fleisch (2008), who also mentioned language or medium of instruction as a problem affecting learners' learning of curriculum subjects. The authors noted that language is the means by which ideas are conveyed between teacher and pupil. The learning will therefore take place only in cases where a language that both a teacher and a child understand is used in the classroom. For example, learners whose home language is not the same as the language of instruction have been found to have more problems with learning of curriculum subjects (Fleisch, 2008). The problem is compounded when the learners are taught by a teacher whose home language is not that of the learners. Pupils may not understand some concepts or issues in lessons taught in a 'foreign' language. Such concepts or issues will only be understood if translated into the learners' home language ('mother tongue'). The result of this study supports Fleisch's argument that some concepts and issues will only be understood by learners if translated into learners' home language. As has been noted above, the lesson observation data of this study has shown that almost all the teachers in this study from time to time in their teaching code switched from English to vernacular Chichewa, the home language of the learners for the learners to understand what was being taught them. The difference between the participation of rural and urban learners, with urban being slightly higher than rural can possibly be attributed to differences in English language skills between the rural and urban learners. The rural learners seem to have weaker English language skills than urban learners and this seems to be a major obstacle affecting the rural learners' participation in lesson activities.

Adler (2002) confirms this. Adler found that the South African new Outcomes Based Education curriculum was being implemented with more fidelity in urban schools than rural schools using English as a medium of instruction. Adler was investigating code-

switching and English language practices in Mathematics and Science classrooms in South Africa. The study found that the new curriculum was being implemented with more fidelity in urban schools than rural schools because the English language infrastructure of urban schools is supportive of English as the official language of teaching and learning. Adler argues that teachers and learners in the urban schools have a greater exposure to English language. English as a foreign language is frequently spoken in the immediate environment of the teachers and the learners in urban schools, who have consequently good opportunities to use the language for participation in more or less natural communication situations. Teachers and learners in the urban areas have also a greater access to newspapers and magazines and access to these improves teachers' and learners' abilities in understanding and speaking English. According to Adler, English as a foreign language is not spoken in the immediate environmental context of the learner in the rural areas, although mass media such as radios may provide the learner with opportunities for practising receptive skills. According to Adler, exposure to English language is therefore almost limited to the urban school context. According to Adler, an improved understanding and speaking of English by urban school teachers and learners supports classroom communication in general and exploratory talk in particular which is such a necessary condition for effective teaching and learning. The current study concurs with Adler in that the study has established that lack of extended talk between the learners and teachers, which was more pronounced in rural schools than urban was mainly caused by weak English language skills of learners.

**e. Inadequate resource provision and poor use of resources**

This study found that teachers seldom used teaching and learning resources for engaging students in lesson activities on the few occasions they used such resources. When they did employ resources such as a piece of cloth and a needle for practising sewing stitches, the

use of the resources was teacher-centred and for shorter times. The teacher did the sewing and did not give opportunity to the learners to practise the sewing. Teacher's guides for Expressive Arts have a lot of suggestions such as teaching and learning using locally available resources (TALULAR) as one of the ways of how teachers can make use of the available social and physical environments around their schools for instilling in students skills of critical thinking and problem solving proposed by productive pedagogies. None of the teachers took advantage of the rich physical and social environments around their schools. The teachers' lack of skills in the use of resources, such as not letting learners use the resources to practise some skills, thwarted students' active participation in lesson activities.

However, it is also possible that the teachers' perceptions of the failure of the Ministry of Education to provide them with basic resources reduced their morale in using improvised resources. For example, in addition to the acute shortage of the already-made resources, each of the six schools had one copy of Expressive Arts syllabus for all teachers in the senior grades to share. Similarly, all teachers at each grade level had one copy of a supplementary teacher's guide to share. Under such circumstances, one wonders how all teachers were expected to plan their lessons using these few curriculum documents. The general picture was that the teachers failed to use some techniques and lesson activities suggested in the instructional system of Expressive Arts because of the appalling shortage of teaching and learning resources.

Thus, inadequate teaching and learning resources in the twelve classrooms confirm what Kaambankadzanja (2001) and Nsapato (2005) have argued – that lack of resources influence teachers' decisions in the classrooms. The lack of resources also validates the contention of some observers – that the Ministry of Education lacks commitment in the implementation of school curricula. Revelations at the Malawi National Educational

Conference in 2005 (Mhango, 2008) showed that the Ministry drags its feet in dealing with pertinent issues that affect the quality of education in the country. Kaambankadzanja (2001) argued that the Ministry's sluggish commitment to the planned educational activities reduced the effective implementation of the Malawi Primary Curriculum and Assessment Reform (PCAR). Nsapato (2005) also argued that the Ministry fails to achieve most of its plans because of lack of aggression in tackling problems affecting the quality of education in the country.

**f. Poor constitution of groups for group work activities**

This study found that teachers did not direct the constitution of groups for group work activities. Learners usually formed groups whenever group work activities were called for. As such, some groups were small and others were very large. Similarly, some groups were based on one gender, or mixed, but with apparent gender-skewed patterns. Such kinds of group formations affected active participation because not much interactive process took place among learners in the way productive pedagogy theory proposes. Thus what Parker (2004) proposed that active participatory classroom activities must help students to deliberate in groups, express their opinions of life issues, and make decisions together, generally failed to occur in the twelve classrooms.

In addition to lower intellectual quality, the majority of Expressive Arts lessons were characterised by weaker connection to outside world, teaching for mandated public examinations, teaching to complete the syllabi, localizing and instrumentalist discourses and lack of continuous assessment of learners' learning. These characteristics of the lessons are discussed in detail in the next six sub-sections that follow.

### 8.2.2 Limited connection of lessons to the outside world

This study found that teachers seldom make connections with the outside world. As many writers correctly observed, effective teaching is about making connections between classroom lessons and the outside world in which the students will be expected to display competent skills in active participatory life (see Barton and Levstik, 2004; Cogan *et al.*, 2000). In fact, this kind of connection is what Cogan et al, and Giroux and McLaren (1999) contended that is important for providing students with the skills in critical thinking and development of positive attitudes about the real world. Similarly, Remy *et al*. (1976) also observed that the greater the connections between the curriculum and the outside world, the higher the likelihood that the students can transfer the classroom experiences to the real life situations. However, the twelve teachers in this case study did not make links classroom activities and the world outside their classrooms. Yet the curriculum documents encouraged teachers to make such connections using resource persons, experts in various fields. Such lack of connection between the lessons and the outside world divorces education in Malawi from the knowledge society and the world we live in.

This result contradicts what was speculated by Bernstein's (2000) about the characteristics of an integrated curriculum, which has been discussed in detail in Chapter 2 of this thesis. Bernstein, through his concept of classification, argued that an integrated curriculum will have weak classification of boundary relations between educational or school knowledge and everyday knowledge. In its implementation at classroom level, an integrated curriculum like Expressive Arts would be expected to have connections between classroom activities and the outside world. This however did not happen in the twelve classrooms of this study.

### 8.2.3 Pedagogy for public examination

Results of this study showed that teachers were teaching for and to examinations. The possible explanation for this result is that the classes that were used for this study were to sit for public examinations in the year 2010 when this study was being conducted and the following year 2011. Mandated examinations may therefore have influenced classroom practices of teachers because the state uses grade eight examinations as the only tool for selecting students for secondary school education. The public examinations in standard 8 cover areas taught from standard 6 and above. Only teacher 11 indicated that preparing the learners for examinations was an aim, but practice indicates they all were doing so. There was evidence throughout the 71 lessons observed that the teachers were almost wholly teaching for this examination.

This research finding support what other authors and researchers elsewhere in the world have argued that standardised testing forces teachers to teach in a way that will prepare learners for examinations, and this can affect the achievement of the broad goals and objectives of the curriculum. For instance, Whitaker (1993) observed that assessment in the form of examinations influences curriculum implementation, due to the great value given to public examination certificates by communities and schools.

As noted in the previous chapter, expository and question/answer method with its associated activities like recitations and note giving/copying are some of the major activities that dominated classroom practices of the teachers. Expository method is deemed a method that assists in drilling the learner to pass examinations. It seems likely that the question and answer method was used to encourage learner participation in the execution of the expository method. There is therefore compelling evidence that mandated examinations influenced the teachers in the way they chose their methods of teaching and in the way they executed the selected methods. Over-emphasis on expository and

question/answer method in which teachers engaged learners in memorisation of facts is clear evidence that passing examinations, especially public examinations, consumed the thinking of teachers in the study. Teachers are evaluated or appraised by the examination results of their learners.

How did this affect the classes in the research study? There were frequent warnings to their learners by some of the teachers, especially Teacher 8, about the sections that were important for the examinations. Teachers focussed their teaching on what they felt was to come on the examinations. Teachers confirmed this view when they were interviewed. To this end, teachers provided students with prepared notes that anticipated what was going to be assessed in their examinations. Textbooks were also deployed for examination preparation. This is consistent with other studies elsewhere in the world that have found about the importance of textbooks for both the students and teachers (see for example, Myers and Savage, 2005; UNESCO, 2000). For instance, a study in the Netherlands found that both students and teachers relied heavily on textbooks for the sake of standardised testing (Hooghooff, 1993). Research evidence of this study however showed that teacher-made notes seemed to have substituted the textbooks. For example, all important points were underlined on the chalkboard and teachers often asked learners to recite some of these points. It is important to note that both teachers and students use textbooks for purposes of mandated examinations and not acceptance of what they read (Grant, 2000). Such studies have also found that over-reliance on textbooks reduces participatory classroom practices necessary for enhancing intellectual quality of learning.

Since public examinations in standard 8 target work covered from Standard 6, it was not surprising to see some anxiety in the teachers as well as learners in the lessons observed in this class. It is only next year that the Standard 7 learners will write this examination and for Standard 8, it is this current year that the learners will write this examination and what

is being covered in these two classes would definitely matter. Under such conditions, the teachers seemed to have used methods that enabled them cover as much ground as possible, making sure that learners are made ready for examinations.

The question that inevitably comes at this juncture is: why did the Standard 8 public examinations cause such panicking in teachers to the extent of influencing their decisions in the use of expository pedagogy? There are three possible explanations to this state of affairs. First, the examination results determine each student's progression to secondary school. This convinced teachers to use pedagogical practices that enhance memorization of facts. For example, at the time of this study, a national total of 161,567 candidates had sat for the 2009 grade eight public examinations, but only 48,604 were selected for secondary school education (MANEB, 2009). The implication of this situation is that the larger proportion of students who pass Standard 8 examinations do not proceed to secondary school education (Chakwera, Khembo and Sireci, 2004). The implication of this is that many of those who were not selected for secondary school education had to repeat the class until they get selected into secondary school education, or drop out of school altogether. It is from this perspective that the bottleneck between primary and secondary school education sectors causes ineffective use of learner-centred or participatory pedagogies proposed in the intended Expressive Arts curriculum.

Second, the Standard 8 examinations emphasize the knowledge domain at the expense of the skills and attitudes domain. Possibly this explains why classroom observations showed that the teachers' major concern was knowledge achievement largely done through rote learning. For instance, the study found that most of the teachers asked learners questions which did not require the learners to think deeply to come up with a response. Most of the questions which teachers asked required the learners to recall information which the learners may have memorised. Yet the intended curriculum emphasizes students'

acquisition of knowledge, and development of skills, values and attitudes that are required for active participation in the life of the community after leaving school. The discrepancy between the goals of the intended curriculum and the focus of public examinations confirms what Chakwera *et al.* (2004) observed that teachers in Malawi emphasize cognitive domain at the expense of psychomotor and affective domains.

Third and last, there seems to be a discrepancy between the vision of the state and the perceptions of the general public as regard to the purpose of primary school education. The state sees the end of primary school cycle as terminal stage for many of the students (see for example, Rose, 2003; Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, 2001). The state views the goal of primary school education as preparation of competent citizens who can participate effectively in the social, economic, and political affairs affecting their lives (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, 2001). The general public does not necessarily share the same view of the goal of primary education. For example, Rose (2003) noted that that the major goal of parents is getting their children selected for secondary school education. Chakwera *et al.* (2004) believes that the general public's interest for secondary school education has increased over the years because the Standard 8 certificate is no longer useful for the job market. Possibly this scenario puts Standard 8 primary school teachers in a deep dilemma. Evidence from post-lesson interviews in this study shows that the teachers shared the same views of the general public. Consequently, the teachers considered themselves as main actors in getting as many candidates as possible into secondary school education. For this reason they largely used expository approaches as a way of drilling students for the examinations.

The finding that preparation for public examinations influences the methods teachers use in teaching Expressive Arts needs to be taken with caution. This may not be a representative finding about what goes on in schools in the teaching of Expressive Arts.

Situations vary from one school to the other and, from one class to the other. For example, it has been noted that standard 7 used in this study is a preparatory stage for the writing of public examinations in Standard 8, and that this affected the way the teachers taught Expressive Arts. This may not be what goes on in the lower classes that are not affected by public examinations. It would therefore be interesting to investigate what goes on in these lower classes in the teaching of Expressive Arts to confirm the finding under discussion. This result however means that generally, the state policy on the Standard 8 mandated examinations negatively contributes to the decisions that the teachers make in the choice of their teaching methods, and in this case, they opt for expository teaching methods.

### 8.2.4 Prevalence of localising pedagogic discourses

One of the findings emerging form this study is that teachers in the study used cultural practices such as songs and dances to encourage students participate in class. It was mostly the teachers who introduced singing and dancing activities spontaneously. Often the teachers took advantage of the ethnic homogeneity of their classes because the majority were Chewa. They, therefore, used songs and traditional dances familiar to the learners to enhance learners' participation in the activities. The curriculum documents do not explicitly encourage teachers in the use of such tools in the classrooms. Nonetheless, the teachers made some attempts in using these tools as avenues for increasing participation of the learners. This validates what Shulman (1991) and Fenstermacher (1994) argued that teachers make classroom decisions based on their socio-cultural experiences. Shulman (1991) and Fenstermacher (1994) argued that teachers use two forms of knowledge in their classrooms. The first form is the formal knowledge (TK/F) they gain from their teacher preparation programs, and the second form is the practical knowledge (TK/P) they gain and use in their classrooms. The TK/P comes from many sources including long classroom experiences and the teachers' socio-cultural experiences.

Indeed, the teachers' social-cultural experiences seems to have exposed them to the opportunity of using social-cultural tools such as songs and dances as a practical strategy for engaging students in lesson activities.

However the teachers' and learners' engagement with cultures of other people outside the communities or neighbourhood of their schools or even the country was generally weak. This contradicts the findings of Ishak (2010) and Dashwood (2005). Ishak found that teachers in Malaysia seem to relate students' cultures to those of others in the real-world outside the students' classroom. Similarly, Dashwood observed that teachers in his study seemed to relate students' cultures to other cultures outside the students' classroom. The teachers' exclusion of world culture in the lessons of this study made the pedagogy of the teachers a localising pedagogy, which speaks to local culture with little exposure to world culture and discourses. In addition, although undoubtedly these ethnic cultural activities helped students' involvement in class, but in most cases it was mere involvement and not much of critical analysis of the issues that were embedded in those cultural tools. Yet cultural tools like the traditional songs used in the dances have messages, which are very important in promotion of traditional core values. Such core values include respect among people and taking care of the environment. In some cases, these cultural tools have purposely hidden messages. Yet, the teachers' use of such cultural tools did not engage students in a critical analysis of issues in such messages. This resulted in low intellectual quality lessons.

The implication of this for Malawi education is that the education standards may still remain low despite the review of the curriculum which was aimed at improving the quality of education in the country. In addition, the implication of the localising pedagogy for the Malawi education is that the pedagogy has a high possibility of making the education of a country divorced from the knowledge society and information age that we live in, as has

been speculated by some authors such such as Young (1997), who has argued that education which emphasises local knowledge makes the education of the country a balkanizing one and divorced from the knowledge society and information age that we live in.

The use of songs and traditional dances to help students participate in class is evidence that social-cultural experiences can create opportunities for interactive or participatory classroom practices for all learners for the effective teaching of Expressive Arts. However, in most cases, the socio-cultural backgrounds seemed to have prevented the teachers from making appropriate decisions for participatory or interactive classroom processes.

### 8.2.5 Pedagogy for communalisation and subordination

The study found that girls did not take active roles in any of the twelve classrooms. There were clear patterns of all-boys' or all-girls' groups in all the twelve classrooms. Sometimes, the groups were a mixture of boys and girls, but highly gender-skewed. The teachers did not seem to have noticed these clear patterns in the groups, possibly because their socio-cultural backgrounds also blunted their perceptions of students' classroom behaviours. The possible explanation for this result is that social-cultural backgrounds of the teachers and the learners determined the participation of learners. The six schools that were used in this study had students who were predominantly from the patriarchal cultural system. The impact of this on the classroom practice of the teachers and behaviour of the learners was that all twelve teachers generally preferred boys to girls in taking leading roles in the classrooms. Generally, many of the girls in the twelve classrooms did not take active roles in the classrooms. In fact, both boys and girls seemed to have taken for granted their cultural positions, which were transferred to the classrooms. The girls, too, seemed to have accepted that leading roles are exclusively for males. It looked like the

teachers and the learners' social-cultural backgrounds generally determined their behaviours in the classrooms.

Students never asked their teachers questions whenever the teachers gave them the chance to do so. The students were always ready to answer questions from their teachers, but not asking them questions. Thus, although all the teachers knew the importance of involving all students in lesson activities regardless of their gender, their social-cultural backgrounds seemed to have ruled supreme in the decisions they made in the classrooms. Viewing from the lens of Productive Pedagogies theory, the socio-cultural experiences that both the teachers and students brought to class affirmed Malawian cultural epistemologies and ontologies that included subordination of learners, the young to the older, and especially of girls in the classroom. The implication of this affirmation of Malawian cultural epistemologies in the pedagogy of the teachers was the creation of a classroom environment that had very limited interactions between the teachers and the learners. This resulted in very limited or low intellectual quality of the Expressive Arts lessons observed.

This result also concurs with Tabulawa's (1998) study. Tabulawa's study, conducted in a senior secondary school in Botswana, sought to establish the practices of teachers in the implementation of learner-centred pedagogy advocated by the Ministry of Education in Botswana. As in Malawi, attempts to improve the quality of education in Botswana have included an emphasis on a learner-centered pedagogy. Tabulawa's study found that attempts at implementing the learner-centred pedagogy have produced disappointing results because much attention in preparing for the implementation of the learner-centred pedagogy focused on provision of resources and training of teachers, but ignored the effect which the beliefs which teachers and learners bring to the classroom would have on the implementation of the learner-centred pedagogy. The findings of Tabulawa's study indicated that teachers' classroom practices were influenced by many factors other than

technical ones: the teachers' assumptions about the nature of knowledge and the ways it ought to be transmitted, their perceptions of students, and the goal of schooling. It also emerged that the teachers' beliefs were incongruent with the basic tenets of the learner-centered pedagogy. Tabulawa concluded that the results of his study indicate that disregarding the effect of the beliefs which teachers and learners bring to the classroom on classroom practices when effecting change can lead to disappointing results.

As Nassir and Hand (2006) correctly observed, people are not passive carriers of their culture. To understand classroom behaviours of the teachers and learners in this study we must make reference to the culture of the teachers and their students who participated in this study. Many writers have observed that socio-cultural experiences, beliefs, and assumptions influence the decisions that teachers make in their classrooms (see for example, Grant, 2003; Hamilton, 1993; Leistyna and Woodrum, 1996; Marshall, 1996; Rios, 1996, Tabulawa, 1998). The present study supports this. Indeed, a closer analysis of what occurred in the twelve classrooms also confirms that individuals carry with them their culture, which manifests as they interact with each other (Nasir and Hand, 2006).

This result has some implication on the productive pedagogies theory. One limitation of productive pedagogies theory is that it does not clearly stipulate the actual contexts of classroom interactive processes necessary for the development of skills in critical thinking and problem solving which it supports. From that perspective, this study suggests that creating an interactive classroom environment that treats students as rational beings is not a simple process as the theory assumes. There are factors that impinge on such processes, one of which is the socio-cultural histories that both teachers and students bring to class.

### 8.2.6 Pedagogy for syllabus completion

This study has found that teachers rushed through the content and selected content which they anticipated that the examiners would examine the learners on. Thus as a further strategy to cover all the content in the curriculum policy documents, to prepare learners for public examinations, the teachers resorted to rushing through the topics without spending the full time allocated in the syllabus.

The majority of the teachers in the study had a tendency to select two or three questions out of an average of six questions on a topic from the learners' textbook for pupils to work on or discuss. This meant that more than three quarters of the questions in the learners' textbooks were left untouched. This implies that children might have been deprived of possible vital classroom transactions with the curriculum and they may also not have been getting the full experience of the concepts of the subject intended by the developers of the curriculum. This also meant that content coverage in the lessons was also inadequate.

In his study on an evaluation of the implementation of national curriculum changes in science and mathematics in Malawi in 1993, Nyirenda also found that although teachers were teaching the content prescribed by the new curriculum, they were however observed to rush through.

An explanation given by the teachers is that insufficient information is given in the Teachers' Guide. Teachers indicated that they rushed through and skipped some content prescribed in the curriculum because there was insufficient information in the Teachers' Guide. This explanation seems to be a symptom of lack of understanding of the new curriculum reform. Some authors (such as Gross, et al, 1980; Pratt, 1971 and Fullan, 1991) have noted that an understanding of a new curriculum remains the only way that would make the implementation effective, and this develops in the in-service training programmes. The curriculum review process in Malawi provided training workshops to

help the teachers understand the new curriculum. The cascade model was used. Teachers' lack of understanding of some content in the curriculum even after being trained may therefore be a symptom of some problems with the training.

Rembe (2006) and Jansen (1998) have speculated that cascade model has not been very effective in empowering teachers to teach a new curriculum. In his study of the implementation of a new curriculum innovation in Zimbabwe, Rembe (2006) noted that the cascade training strategy of teachers was disappointing. The cascade model is thus argued to have a weakness of diluting information in the process of getting disseminated to the teachers as the last recipients in the chain of information dissemination. Jansen (1998) also noted that cascade model affected the implementation of the OBE curriculum in South Africa. Jansen found that most teachers in his study displayed considerable uncertainty about whether their practices in fact constitute OBE, irrespective of the aggregate levels of institutional resources or years of personal teaching experience. Jansen argues that the uncertainty reflected the teachers' lack of in-depth training. The teachers regarded the OBE training conducted through cascade model in the five-day block period as inadequate. In addition, even the trainers themselves were uncertain about what OBE entails.

### 8.2.7 Technical forms of continuous assessment

This study found that in the majority of lessons, learners were not assigned any specific tasks to monitor their learning progress in the lessons. As noted in Chapter 8, continuous assessment was evident only in 5% of the lessons. In addition to the irregular integration of assessment in the teaching and learning process in the lessons, classroom observations also showed that written assessment tasks were merely aimed at recall of facts. The problem of weak continuous assessment in the lessons was raised during discussions after lessons. Teachers gave two reasons for their failure to integrate continuous assessment in their lessons. Firstly, they said that integrating assessment in the lessons created additional

workload for them. The teachers indicated that combining teaching and assessment required a lot of time and they did not have time to do that within the official allocated time of 35 minutes duration of an Expressive Arts lesson. Secondly, the teachers said that they were not trained on how to do continuous assessment.

All the factors mentioned by the teachers make sense as to why the use of continuous assessment was below average. However, one would have expected usage in over 50% of the lessons. The instructional system has suggested various ways of doing continuous assessment, not only giving exercises to be marked during the lessons as it was the case in the observed lessons. All it required was creativity and time to prepare appropriate continuous assessment strategies. It looks like something else was the main challenge apart from the problems mentioned.

Data reveals that the problem was largely their misunderstanding of the Malawian Continuous Assessment policy. Firstly some teachers assessed the wrong skills, assessing language skills instead of Expressive Arts skills. The teachers apparently did not understand the policy on continuous assessment which indicates that assessment in the teaching and learning process should be aimed at assessing the achievement of the lesson outcomes the teachers have to fulfill in their lessons. In the study however, the teacher assessed language writing skills of learners. Secondly continuous assessment was conducted irregularly by teachers. For example, Teacher 9 indicated that he conducts continuous assessment at the end of every 10 lessons. This contradicts what the teachers' guides propose that assessment should be integrated with the teaching and learning process in each and every lesson. These show that teachers did not understand the standard implementation practice of the continuous assessment policy.

This supports the findings of others. In his study of the implementation of the continuous assessment policy in local government areas of Ondo state, Nigeria, Adebowale (2008)

found that the implementers of continuous assessment policy did not understand the standard implementation practice of the policy. He found that teachers were practising continuous assessment of pupils in different manners and this may be attributed to lack of understanding of the policy. The researchers saw the confusion among the implementers in terms of how often the pupils were to be assessed and how many of such assessments should be graded and weighted. Like the current study, Adebowale found that the usage of other assessment tools apart from cognitive tests, assignments, and examinations was absent in the teachers' assessment, and where it was present it was not included when the pupils' assessments were combined.

In her study on the investigation of the extent to which primary school teachers understood and implemented the requirements of the continuous assessment programme introduced in primary schools in Swaziland, Nsibande (2006) found that although the teachers used assessment strategies promoted by the Continuous Assessment programme, their assessment strategies however prioritized knowledge-retention rather than the cognitive development advocated by the programme and implied by lesson objectives they had to fulfil. The researcher concluded that teachers could not translate the rhetoric of the CA programme into relevant professional judgement, decisions and practices without exposure to meaningful (teacher) development programmes.

### 8.2.8 Weak conceptual integration of knowledge

Results from this study indicate that most of the content taught by the teachers in the majority of Expressive Arts was limited to one subject discipline within the Expressive Arts area. This result is consistent with the findings obtained by Zohir *et al.* (2010). Zohir found that most of the content taught by the geography teachers in the secondary schools in Malaysia was limited to the subject itself without linking the knowledge with other subjects' content.

The likely explanation for this result is that teachers do not have the content knowledge of all the subjects comprising Expressive Arts. Post-lesson observation interviews confirmed this. The post-lesson interviews revealed that most teachers feel they can cope with other components of Expressive Arts but not with Needlecraft. This means that a teacher may be competent enough to teach a few among the components of Expressive Arts and ignore the rest.

Chipungu *et al.* (2010) noted that teachers graduating from Teacher trainings colleges in Malawi will not teach Expressive Arts competently because they are likely to have gaps in their own knowledge of some components of Expressive Arts because the lecturers who train these teachers specialize only in two components of Expressive Arts. The findings of this study concur with Chipungu and validate what literature on curriculum integration has argued to be the major challenge facing the teaching of integrated curriculum globally. Lipson (1993) noted that the major challenge facing the teaching of an integrated curriculum globally is that teacher training institutions do not adequately prepare teachers to teach an integrated curriculum. This is so because teachers are themselves taught in isolated disciplines in both content and methodologies in teacher training institutions. The teachers therefore find it difficult to make the transition from a strongly insulated subject-based curriculum to a more integrated one. Consequently, teachers have difficulty thinking in a holistic and integrated fashion.

Similarly, Naidoo (2005) studied teachers' perceptions of the Integrated Learning Areas for the junior secondary school curriculum of the South African National Curriculum Statement. She also noted that the majority of teachers perceived integrated Learning Areas as problematic to teach for a range of reasons, the most salient one being that they lack confidence and ability to teach Learning Areas due to gaps in their own knowledge.

### 8.2.9 Over-dominance of instrumentalist knowledge

An observation from this study is that instrumental knowledge was dominantly present in both the instructional system and the learning milieu of Expressive Arts. The Malawi primary Expressive Arts curriculum advocates knowledge of 'practical' relevance to the society. This result shows some fit between the proposed content knowledge and what is actually happening. However, the review of the new curriculum in Malawi was driven by the need by the government in Malawi to improve the quality of education in the country. So the dominance of instrumentalism in the Expressive Arts intended curriculum is impinging on the government's goal of improving the quality of education in the country. Young (1997) has speculated that emphasis of instrumental knowledge in a curriculum results in overshadowing the goal of education as intellectual enhancement, and education becomes a means to an end. He considers that this type of education is not productive to the future learning of a child as it results in obscuring the development of the child's mind. It is possible that the Ministry of Education is not aware that the instrumental knowledge is preventing the new curriculum meeting own formulated goal of improving the quality of education in the country.

This result of the research is therefore important to the Ministry of Education in Malawi. The research finding could assist policy makers in the Ministry of Education because policies on curriculum designs are in their hands. Policy-making can either improve or destroy the quality of education. More often than not, blunders can be made because of little knowledge of what actually happens on the ground in the implementation of a curriculum. This study offers concrete evidence on which policy makers can depend in formulating content in future curriculum reviews or reforms. The dominance of instrumentalism in both the intended and the taught curriculum is counter-productive to achievement of the Ministry's own formulated goal of improving the quality of education.

Basing on this evidence, better decisions could be made in future curriculum reviews regarding the kind of content the government needs to include in the curriculum.

The possible explanation for the dominance of instrumentalism is that it was based on the instrumentalism philosophy of curriculum reforms of the South African C2005. As noted by Khomani (2003), the new curriculum in Malawi was based on the South African C2005. Allais (2010) has noted two main flaws of C2005. The first is that the content in the curriculum is weak on conceptual coherence. The second is that the curriculum was based on the assumption of a well-established educational infrastructure and an educated teacher supply base. It did not take into account of the unequal educational contexts of South Africa and Malawi with reference to conditions in classrooms: questions of differences in resources, teacher's experience and systems of assessment and different backgrounds of children might impinge on the implementation of the curriculum. In addition, this education reform (2005) failed to acknowledge that individuals assimilate new experiences and information through knowledge structures (Allais, 2010). That is, the teacher's sense-making and meanings attributed to the policy depended, to a large extent, on their repertoire of existing knowledge and experience. According to Allais, teachers' beliefs and practices may create challenges not only because they are not keen to accept and acclimatize to new policies, but because their existing terms of reference or subjective knowledge may impede their ability to interpret and implement reforms as intended. An individual's prior knowledge and experience, including tacitly held expectations and beliefs about how the world works serve as lens influencing an individual teacher's way of implementing a curriculum. The implication of these flaws of C2005 for the Malawi curriculum, which drew on the C2005, is that probability was high that Malawi curriculum would face the same problems of C2005 in its implementation. One of the aims of this study was to establish on whether Malawi ought to have gone the Outcomes Based route

considering what literature has revealed about the implementation problems associated with a similar curriculum design in South Africa. The study has confirmed that the new curriculum in Malawi is facing more or less similar problems like those of South African C2005.

The result of this study show that Malawi would probably have done better by not taking the Outcomes Based education considering the implementing problems it is facing which are associated with an OBE curriculum.

## 8.3 Closing remarks

The five generic sub-research questions provide the platform for making closing insights of this study. The first sub-research question was investigating the nature of the Expressive Arts curriculum and its appropriateness for the promotion of quality of education as espoused by the state. This study has found that both the content and suggested pedagogical strategies fit very well with what many educators in the field of curriculum describe as instrumental education. For instance, the multidisciplinary and multicultural content aims at developing learners with the knowledge for active participatory life at various societal levels. The suggested pedagogical strategies aim at providing an interactive classroom environment that treats students as thinking beings. However, the weak integration of some ethnic cultural aspects like traditional leadership with similar concepts from other parts of the world does not enable Productive Pedagogies. It looks like the curriculum developers over-assumed that teachers could do the integration on their own. On the contrary, this study has found that the teachers covered each topic as an entity following the same sequence of topics in the curriculum documents. Such loose connections between the ethnic cultural aspects with similar concepts from other parts of the world makes the education in Malawi divorced from the knowledge society and information age we live in (see Young, 1997).

The second sub-question aimed at exploring how the teachers implemented Expressive Arts lessons. This study found that there were limited Productive Pedagogies in the majority of lessons. The majority of lessons were characterised by lower intellectual quality, a focus on instrumental knowledge, integration at superficial level, dominance of communalising practices, gendered practices, prevalence of localising discourses and a pedagogy aimed at national examinations. The lessons thus did not reflect the participatory approaches that were suggested in the intended curriculum documents. Practically, what occurred in the classrooms was that teachers monopolised lesson activities with learners reduced to listening, watching, reciting, answering oral questions and copying down teacher-made notes. In this way, the expository classroom practices caused a lot of missed opportunities for the learners' development of skills in critical thinking and problem solving proposed in the Productive Pedagogies.

The overall picture from these findings is that classroom atmosphere in the twelve classrooms offered students limited opportunities to acquire knowledge and develop skills, values and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and be able to compete successfully in other contexts. It appears that dominant pedagogic practices in the Expressive Arts classroom serve to position learners in parochial orientations and issues.

The third sub-question sought to establish the reasons for apparent discrepancies between the instructional system and the learning milieu of Expressive Arts. Evidence showed that, amongst other things, teacher preparation programs and state policies in the use of English as medium of class instruction and the Standard 8 mandated examinations negatively contributed to the decisions that the teachers made in their classroom practices. As indicated in the review of literature, there is some compelling evidence from literature that

suggests that teacher preparation in Malawi leaves much to be desired (see for example, Hauya, 1993; Kunje and Chimombo, 1999; Stuart, 2002).

It should however be mentioned that it is easy to be overwhelmed by the big challenges which have been presented in this chapter in the implementation of Expressive Arts in the classroom and in the process fail to celebrate the everyday successes in the implementation of the subject. There are valuable assets on which the implementation process for Expressive Arts can build. It is important to keep these things in mind. These strengths are:

- Children are generally keen to learn.
- Generally, teachers are hardworking and dedicated, striving to do their best in very difficult conditions, such as lack of teaching resources and large classes.

# CHAPTER 9

# CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

## 9.1 Introduction

This concluding chapter has five purposes. First, it gives a brief summary of the whole study in terms of the purpose of the study, how it was carried out and the conclusive answer to the main research question.

Secondly, it considers the academic contribution of this study. Thirdly, it identifies issues arising from the research that require further investigation. This is of particular importance as activities relating to implementation of the revised curriculum, such as writing and revision of textbooks in Malawi continues for another four years. Fourthly, the strengths and shortcomings of the procedures and methodologies adopted to carry out the research are discussed. The chapter also considers the implications of the research on the curriculum review and implementation taking place in Malawi. Finally, some policy recommendations will be made in the light of the findings of the research. These recommendations could form part of the implementation guiding policy principles.

## 9.2 Purpose of the study

The main aim of this study was to evaluate how Expressive Arts teachers are teaching the subject two years into the implementation of the curriculum. In order to establish whether classroom practices of Expressive Arts teachers reflected what was suggested to them in the state's curriculum documents, I drew on Lingard's (2001) notion of Productive Pedagogies to supplement Parlett and Hamilton's (1976) notion of Illuminative evaluation. The purpose was to study and describe the state's intended curriculum and the teachers' enacted curriculum, comparing the two in order to draw conclusions on whether classroom practices

of Expressive Arts teachers are achieving the goals of the curriculum intended by the state government. In order to give a sense of what the study entails as evaluation as well as the nature of the curriculum evaluated, I reviewed developments in evaluation as well as literature on integrated curricula, the design principle which the curriculum under study has taken.

### 9.3 An analysis of the Methodology used in the Research

The greater part of the research was confined to classrooms, to learn how teachers are implementing the Expressive Arts curriculum at classroom level. This created a dilemma for the researcher during the classroom observations. It was difficult to maintain a purely research stance as the need of teachers for re-assurance tempted some of them to place the researcher in the role of an expert, able to provide some clarifications in relation to some areas in the Expressive Arts. This situation frequently occurred in lesson observations and post-lesson observation probing interviews and became increasingly a difficult situation for the researcher. In order to maintain objectivity however, the researcher stood firm to the teachers' demand and was not drawn into providing clarifications to some areas in the Expressive Arts curriculum as demanded by the teachers. This proved to be the difficulty with a case study method as participants became more familiar and consequently more open to the researcher to the extent that they demanded that the researcher take the role of a tutor.

In most of the schools, the majority of the teachers already knew the researcher because they had previously attended courses at the MIE. It was feared that the research would not provide reliable data because of previous contact, but the methodological triangulation, which was used in data collection, reduced this anxiety.

One of the problems inherent in case study research is the effect the presence of the researcher has on the subjects of investigation. This is known as reactivity. Hammersley *et*

*al.* (1974, p. 297) define reactivity 'as the impact of the idiosyncratic behaviour and personal characteristics of the researcher on the findings.' Throughout each school, attempts were made to ensure that the presence of the researcher did not affect the normal programmes of the school. This was meant to reduce procedural reactivity, the restructuring of peoples' everyday activities and their replacement by unusual relevances and constraints. As Hammersley *et al.* (1974) argues

> In order to minimize procedural reactivity ethnographers seek as far as possible to conduct their research in natural settings, in places where social activities are already in progress. Only in this way, they argue, can we hope to avoid unwittingly studying artificial responses, or at least behaviour which is not representative of peoples' everyday life (p. 297).

However, while strategies to reduce reactivity were useful, the researcher was placed in a position where all teachers knew he came from MIE, where the curriculum review was based, and most of them wanted clarification on some of the topics in Expressive Arts. Familiarity with the subject being researched was one of the problems that the researcher faced. In order to maintain objectivity in the research however, the researcher informed the teachers that he will not do anything more than collecting data as an independent PhD researcher and not as an MIE officer who might come to help them in issues of curriculum implementation as part of his job.

The other problem faced by the researcher was concerning the mode of dress, which symbolised status or authority. School principals are normally dressed in a suit and tie, while the male teachers wear trousers and a shirt with or without ties. During the first week of the research in one school, I felt very uncomfortable with the teachers, as I was dressed more like a school principal. It was clear from their reactions that I was perceived as an important person. Therefore, I changed my dress in order to look more like the teachers and this slowly

changed the mode of interaction. They became open and more responsive to question during post-lesson observation probing interviews.

The democratic political period in which I have conducted this research facilitated free expression on the part of the teachers. The fear of a 'spy' watching over them as it was during the one-party dictatorship rule was no longer there and they were able to express themselves freely. This was an important contextual factor which greatly improved the reliability of the data.

There are six main limitations of the study. Firstly, the schools were told in advance of the visit to observe lessons and so teachers could prepare lessons for the researcher. The lessons observed may therefore not be a true reflection of the normal practice in teaching Expressive Arts. It is therefore possible that I did not observe Expressive Arts lessons as they really are in an authentic context. Secondly, only six lessons on average for each teacher were observed. Thirdly, the study has only looked into six schools and twelve teachers out of the huge number of schools and teachers in Zomba district. This is not enough for anyone to generalise about the real practice of teachers in teaching Expressive Arts but they provide insight into how well teachers teach Expressive Arts within specific contexts. This study therefore does not aim at universal generalisations. Its strengths would lie in the extent to which the subjects in the study identify with the various observations and interpretations presented.

The fourth possible limitation or weakness of the study is that there may be some implicit value judgments in the collection and presentation of the data. The researcher may have been influenced by general impressions and the atmosphere in the case study schools, and the fact that he is an active player in the design, development and implementation process of the Expressive Arts curriculum might have introduced some preconceived ideas. However,

these effects were minimized by the reflective and multi-method data-gathering stance that was taken.

The fifth possible weakness may be related to the limited time for research. In order to get an in-depth evaluation of the implementation of the Expressive Arts curriculum, a longer period of time would have been helpful. This problem was minimized by spending at least a week in each school during data collection. A good working relationship with teachers was established. This provided a good basis to collect data to enable an in-depth evaluation of the implementation of the innovation.

The last possible weakness was familiarity with some of the people. This created reactivity and was minimized by staying in the case study schools for a maximum period of five days, emulating the way teachers dressed.

## 9.4 The main research question: How do teachers teach Expressive Arts two years into the implementation of the primary curriculum and assessment reform (PCAR) in Malawi?

The study found disappointingly that Productive Pedagogies were rarely in evidence in the majority of Expressive Arts lessons. Instead lower intellectual quality, a focus on instrumental knowledge, integration at superficial level, dominance of communalising practices, gendered practices, prevalence of localising discourses and a pedagogy aimed at national examinations characterised the majority of lessons.

Students receive limited opportunities to acquire knowledge and to develop skills, values and attitudes required for them to actively participate in the changing Malawian context and be able to compete successfully in other contexts. The ways in which Expressive Arts is taught limits learners to parochial orientations and issues.

Therefore, there is an obvious discrepancy between the state's intended curriculum and the teachers' enacted curriculum. Recommendations for improving the implementation of Expressive Arts in particular and all other learning areas in general in PCAR have therefore been suggested in this study. These are presented in section 9.6 of this chapter.

## 9.5 Contribution to knowledge of the study

This Illuminative evaluation of the Expressive Arts curriculum in Malawi has yielded original insights relating to the appropriateness of the Illuminative Evaluation approach to curriculum evaluation, the influence of the South African curriculum reforms for Malawian education and the curriculum practices in Malawi Expressive Arts classrooms. These contributions to knowledge which this study makes are discussed in detail in the sub-sections which follow.

### 9.5.1 Reframing of Illuminative Evaluation and Productive Pedagogies for use in Malawian and African contexts

One of the aims of this study was to make a contribution to knowledge on curriculum evaluation approaches. The study therefore provided for a reflection on how Illuminative evaluation and Productive Pedagogies curriculum evaluation approaches can be adapted for use in evaluating curriculum innovations in contexts of developing countries which are different from those of developed countries where the theories were conceived. The findings on the suitability of illuminative evaluation and productive pedagogies as evaluation frameworks in developing countries in general and Malawi in particular, and how these theories can be adapted for their applicability in developing countries are now presented.

### 9.5. 1.1 Suitability and challenges of Illuminative evaluation and Productive Pedagogies frameworks in the Malawi context for evaluating a curriculum innovation

This study has been set in and built on the tradition of illuminative evaluation studies in education, as detailed in the Conceptual framework and literature review in Chapters 3 and 4. Like several of the studies described there, the present study used the illuminative approach to make a close study of a particular educational programme within its particular context.

This study has been distinctive in Malawi in terms of the approach applied. Four earlier illuminative studies were found that evaluated curriculum reviews in primary schools in Malawi (Nyirenda, 1993; Kabwila, 1995; Khomani, 1996 and Susuwele, 2005). While the above studies also looked at a curriculum review, this study was different in the sense that it combined Illuminative evaluation with Productive Pedagogies (Lingard, et al, 2001) which was used in a complementary manner to guide me direct attention to and document the subject matter taught by the teachers and the teachers' teaching strategies and their interaction at the same time. There was also an attempt in the study, using this complementary framework to determine the participating teachers' awareness of possible learning difficulties of their learners and how these affect the choice of the teachers' teaching strategies. No other Malawian study was found that applied Illuminative evaluation and utilized another framework like Productive Pedagogies to evaluate the teaching of a new curriculum in the country. This shows that when illuminative evaluation is combined with other conceptual or analytical curriculum evaluation approaches such as 'Productive pedagogies,' it becomes a powerful tool to evaluate whether a curriculum innovation is working as intended or not.

Using the illuminative evaluation approach to evaluate the Expressive Arts curriculum entailed studying multiple sites of learning – a variety of different schools – and, as the data and findings showed, this was a highly fruitful way to gather data about a complex learning situation. Given this, the approach might be usefully applied to other evaluations of educational programmes in different environments in Malawi and other developing countries. The Illuminative evaluation approach provided a rich and detailed description both of the 'instructional system' of the Expressive Arts curriculum with its particular intentions, and also of the events and conditions in the learning milieu of the various participating teachers in the study. This made it possible to establish the main aims of the 'instructional system' of Expressive Arts, and to gain insight on the degree to which aims are being realised in the various learning environments involved. In particular, the study of the learning environments allowed certain issues to be identified that had not been taken into account in the instructional system, for example lack of teaching and learning resources and teachers' and learners' unfamiliarity with certain content. It further allowed one to identify various specific reasons why some teachers had difficulties with teaching the Expressive Arts curriculum.

If the evaluation had been approached using other evaluation models rather than illuminative evaluation in combination with Productive Pedagogies, it is doubtful whether many of these insights would have been gained. Such an evaluation could never have generated the same wealth and depth of information as the illuminative approach in combination with Productive Pedagogies succeeded in doing. Using the illuminative evaluation approach, thus had decided benefits in this study. Illuminative evaluation thus brought a better understanding of the Expressive Arts enacted curriculum by describing teachers' practice in implementing the curriculum. This type of evaluation can easily contribute to policy makers decisions about the curriculum. Illuminative evaluation in this

study brought in ‘emic’ perspective or the voice of those involved in the implementation of the educational innovation, to curriculum evaluation and this evaluation was not overly dependent on classroom observation and reference to measurement and assumptions underpinning scientific research. The ‘emic’ perspective was achieved through interviews with the teachers. The importance of the inclusion of ‘emic’ perspective in this study is that it enabled the insiders of the innovation, the teachers to articulate their feelings of the innovation. This means that the present study has emphasized understanding the object of investigation, the PCAR curriculum from ‘emic’ or ‘insider’ perspective as opposed to ‘etic’ or evaluator’s perspective.

An element of illuminative evaluation, ‘progressive focusing’ (Parlett and Hamilton, 1976, p.93) has also been shown to be of value in finding out what is happening within a curriculum innovation. This is used in the research method where initially there is a wide-ranging data base, which the researcher methodically lessens to give more attention to emerging issues. The review of studies on illuminative evaluation in chapter 3 shows that the use of illuminative evaluation uncovers information that might not emerge otherwise. Illuminative evaluation gives fruitful insights into curriculum problems. The researcher of this study found that the use of illuminative evaluation revealed insights ‘about the challenges’ faced by teachers who teach Expressive Arts curriculum. From engaging with teachers after observations in interviews, the ‘emic’ voice emerged, so that the depth of what the teachers are experiencing came to the fore. The researcher progressively focused on the collected data in order to sift through it and come up with applicable insights, and much data was unearthed that would have been overlooked using the ‘agricultural-botany’ approach.

So lluminative evaluation in combination with Productive pedagogies has proved to be a suitable an approach for evaluating a curriculum innovation in the Malawi context. But it

is important to note that the approaches also involved a number of challenges. These challenges are discussed in detail in the sub-sections that follow, starting with Productive pedagogies.

#### 9.5.1.2 Challenge of using Productive pedagogies and the proposed refinement of the theory

The use of Productive Pedagogies in the study involved a number of challenges. Based on these challenges, this study proposes some refinement of the theory for it to be completely suitable for use in evaluating curriculum innovation in Malawi and other countries other than Australia in which the theory was conceived.

A major challenge in using Productive Pedagogies in this study has been that the theory just focuses on pedagogy and not the curriculum. What this means is that Productive Pedagogies does not include the conditions necessary for Productive Pedagogies in classrooms. One of such conditions is high-level pedagogical content knowledge. The concept of pedagogical content knowledge have been discussed in detail in Chapter 4, and it will suffice to summarise it here as how teachers decide what to teach, how to present it and how to question learners about what they are teaching the learners.

It has been widely recognised, for instance, that teachers' pedagogical content knowledge (Schulman, 1986) has a significant impact upon their practice and there exists an extensive body of research on this area (e.g. Lungu, 2009; Mills and Goos, 2012). For this reason, 'Forms of Knowledge in the curriculum' as postulated by Moore and Muller, 2001, was used as the lens to illuminate the content knowledge or the subject matter which teachers taught in this study. In this connection, this study proposes that there is need to refine the Productive Pedagogies framework to include an item on Content knowledge and Pedagogical Content Knowledge for use in Malawi and internationally.

The other challenge in using Productive Pedagogies in this study is that the dimension engagement with difference must be revised for applicability outside Australia, the country in which the theory was conceived and first utilized to evaluate curriculum. The original model of the Productive Pedagogies framework states that 'some non-mainstream learners, particularly indigenous children (of Australia), may learn best through narrative method, because of strong oral traditions and narrative practices extant in their communities.'

There is now a growing body of work that questions the assumptions in this claim. For example, significant research has been conducted into forms of indigenous narratives, in Australia and elsewhere (for example, Mills and Goos, 2012). The researchers on indigenous narratives have noted that there are differences in the styles of storytelling and oral traditions within particular societies across the globe. Basing on the argument of Mills and Goos, it can therefore be said that not all children across the globe may learn best through narrative method. In this connection, this study proposes that there is need to refine the item 'narrative style' to 'interactive or participatory' teaching style as the opposite of expository teaching style for use in Malawi and internationally.

The other challenge in using Productive Pedagogies is employing the engagement with difference dimension. In this study, very few of the items that make up this dimension were observed in the twelve classrooms to any great extent. One possible explanation for this dimension to be the most weakly evident in the lessons is that teachers may either have been uncommitted to valuing students' differences or they may have been afraid of getting it wrong, for example the teachers may have been confronted with questions of whose 'difference' were worthy of support, and whose were not. This challenge was also experienced in the original longitudinal study, in which Lingard, et al (2001) also found that very few of the items that make up this dimension were observed in classrooms to any great extent. Basing on the results of this study and other international studies, such as that

of Lingard, the present study proposes that the inclusion of this dimension of productive pedagogies may need to be revisited or refined to sharpen its focus, for example, in terms of whose 'difference' is worthy of supporting in the classroom, and whose should not. In the Malawian context, engaging with difference means engaging with the expressive arts of non-African cultures.

#### 9.5.1.3 Challenge of using illuminative evaluation

The other major challenge encountered in using illuminative evaluation in this study is that data that had to be gathered to generate an in-depth understanding of both the instructional system and in particular the various learning milieu was extensive, and this resulted in a very lengthy data-gathering period. The use of a variety of data-gathering methods and the fact that data had to be gathered at a number of different sites also had serious cost implications. It further also took a long time to analyse and process the data. In short, the greatest disadvantages of this methodology were that it was both time-consuming and relatively costly. With this in mind, it is suggested that fully-fledged illuminative studies should be restricted to research at doctoral level, and possibly to research for full Master's dissertations. Where research reports of this particular nature are concerned, however, the approach needs to be adapted to take cognizance of time and cost constraints. It is thus recommended that, for such studies, data sources should maximally be for document analysis, observation, interviews, questionnaire and that a smaller sample need to be used. Also, the research should, early in the process, identify a few most significant issues only (e.g. three or four) and focus on them for the rest of the process. This would also imply that the initial research questions would have to be phrased in such a way that it would allow for a more specific, narrower focus than is the case with this study.

#### 9.5.1.4 Critical appraisal of illuminative evaluation theory

The major challenge encountered in using illuminative evaluation in this study is that the approach focuses on the present interactions and abstracts them from the social structures that inform it. For example, Bourdieu's (1974) field theory proposes that everyday interactions, practices and perceptions are informed by underlying objective relations or one's *habitus*, that is one's habitual way of thinking, feeling, being and talking. In this connection, teachers' classroom pedagogy would be best explained by the objective conditions of the school such as rural or urban, high income or low income, resource availability and teacher training that underpin them. Similarly, Bernstein's (1971) theory of mechanical and organic solidarity proposes that desired social change such as modernisation leads to changes in school policy, including teachers' classroom pedagogy. However, as the school is a part of society as are teachers and learners, their social, cultural and political characteristics may stand in the way of the quick changes desired in the society as well.

Bernstein argues that the effect of modernisation in the society on the everyday practices of the teachers and learners in the classroom is that social control in the classroom is based less on shared values than on personalised forms of control where teachers and taught confront each other as individuals. Teachers no longer control learners easily by virtue of the simple fact that they are teachers, and learners do not have automatic respect for teachers. Teachers have to impress pupils as individuals who warrant being taken seriously. Teachers' authority in the classroom is thus much of personal than positional one. Modernisation leads to changes not only on the authority of the teachers but also in teaching methods. In the modern society, the teacher is often a problem - poser and 'facilitator' rather than solution giver. It is the complex interaction of objective relations, such as the *habitus* of the teachers and learners and conditions of the

school that produce the circumstances and opinions that suffuse all education area. Although belonging to modern society, the school and the practice of the teachers in this study did not reflect a modern society. For example, as has been noted in section 8.2.4 of Chapter 8, teachers in this study used more localising pedagogic practices in which cultural practices such as songs and dances to help students participate in class. As has also been noted further in section 8.2.5 of Chapter 8, the classroom interactions showed that cultural traditions or customs of the learners determined the participation of the learners. It was noted in section 8.2.5 of Chapter 8 that learners in this study came from a cultural background in which the society believes that young people should respect elders and one way of the young people respecting the elders is not by asking them questions. Learners in the study seem to have brought this mind set into the classroom. Students thus never asked their teachers questions whenever the teachers gave them the chance to do so. The students were always ready to answer questions from their teachers, but not asking them questions.

Thus the weakness of Illuminative evaluation is that it pays little attention to explanations for everyday practices of the teachers in the classroom. Due to this weakness of illuminative evaluation, although this study predominantly used the illuminative evaluation approach in the data collection process, Stufflebeam's (1971) Context, Inputs, Process and Product (CIPP), particularly the Context component, which involves studying and analysing the social environment in which a programme exists was utilised to study the characteristics of the twelve teachers of this study as an attempt at relating the interactions observed in the classrooms to the social structures that inform it. However, even Stufflebeam's evaluation theory did not provide adequate explanation for the classroom practices observed in this study. In this connection, this study proposes that illuminative evaluation needs to be used in tandem with Bourdieu's

field theory and Bernstein's theory of social change and its effect on classroom practices.

In addition to making a significant contribution to knowledge on curriculum evaluation approaches, this thesis further makes a significant contribution towards understanding the influence that South African curriculum changes play in Malawian education and the issues that arise from the South African curriculum changes for Malawian education. Malawi's PCAR initiative – a replica of the South African Outcomes Based curriculum – has a strong 'instrumentalism' slant. This curriculum has resulted in overshadowing of Malawi's education to be an end in itself, for intellectual enhancement, rather education in Malawi has become a means to an end and this type of education is not productive to future learning of a child in Malawi as it results in obscuring the development of the mind of a child. The dominance of 'ethnic' practices in the curriculum aims to reproduce society rather than transforming it, the conventional purpose of education. The legitimatising of these 'ethnic' practices in the lessons by the teachers results in a localising pedagogy not connected to the world. This is resulting in an education that is balkanising and divorcing and marginalising Malawi from the 'knowledge society' and information age we live in. The study has also established that the curriculum has inherent challenges of implementation in the country. The contexts of South Africa where instrumentalism may have been conceived are different from those of Malawi. An instrumental curriculum needs adequate resourcing for it to work. As a third world country, Malawi does not have adequate resources for implementing a curriculum innovation whose design is a product of some contextual realities which are different from those where the curriculum design was conceived. This study has confirmed the challenge of implementing an instrumental curriculum.

The thesis also makes a contribution for curriculum implementation policy decisions. The study has provided knowledge of curriculum practices in Malawi Expressive Arts

classrooms. The main findings of the study have provided new insights of classroom pedagogy in Malawi classrooms. This information is important for the decision-makers; the MIE and MoEST on the appropriate strategies to adopt in the implementation of the Expressive Arts curriculum, and also to provide a framework for the implementation of other learning areas or subjects in the revised curriculum. Other partners in the process of implementation, particularly the teachers who took part in the research may also find the information useful. The research may also be of interest to a wider research community in Malawi, as this is the first study done in Malawi on the implementation of the current curriculum innovation.

This research project has opened up more areas for further research work that can be carried out or conducted in Malawi. The more research is carried out, the better the understanding of curriculum innovation in Malawi will be, and this can only lead to better educational standards.

As this study was intended to provide information for the decision-makers; the MIE and MoEST, on the appropriate strategies to adopt in the implementation of the Expressive Arts curriculum, recommendations to these decision makers have thus been provided in the next section, beginning with recommendations to the Curriculum Developers, the Malawi Institute of Education.

## 9.6 Recommendations to the Curriculum Developers: the Malawi Institute of Education

### 9.6.1 The revision of the Expressive Arts curriculum

This study has shown that the content of the Expressive Arts curriculum was a problem for many teachers and that some teachers had indicated that they often skipped some content (Chapter 7). It was also suggested that the teachers' claim of difficult content was perhaps a

result of the teachers' gaps in their own knowledge of some of the disciplines integrated in Expressive Arts, for example Needlecraft, whose content in the curriculum was unfamiliar to most of them. This argument provides sufficient evidence to call for a revision of the Expressive Arts curriculum. The MIE (which is the main change agent in consultation with the MoEST) along with other partners like MANEB and the University needs to consider revising the Expressive Arts curriculum so as to provide an Expressive Arts curriculum which will be perceived by teachers as appropriate and containing what is seen is understandable and teachable content.

### 9.6.2 Writing curriculum materials

Evidence from this research has shown that a good number of teachers are not familiar with the content of the Expressive Arts materials, probably because they see the materials for the first time only when they start using them. This creates ambivalence and uncertainty. The fact that teachers participated in the development of the materials does not, in itself, constitute a representation of the general view of teachers or the acceptance of the new curriculum materials. In the light of this, there is a need for a wider scope of consultation during the development of the curriculum materials to ensure that as many teachers as possible participate. This in the long run may change the negative attitudes of some teachers towards the revised curriculum. Areas of consultation would include:

i) The adequacy of content and the level of difficulty of content at each grade level.

ii) The pedagogy

iii) The relevance of the proposed teaching and learning materials

iv) The adequacy of pupils activities and how they enhance learning

v) The congruence between content coverage and time allocation.

vi) How the overall curriculum demands relate to teachers' teaching load.

The research department at MIE could take responsibility for this kind of evaluation work.

However, while the Curriculum Developers, the Malawi Institute of Education, is responsible for the challenges that thwart the effective implementation of the Expressive Arts curriculum, the Ministry of Education shares some of those responsibilities that thwart the effective implementation of the active participatory classroom practices that facilitate high intellectual quality lessons. Recommendations to the Ministry of Education for improving the implementation of Expressive Arts in particular and learning areas in general in PCAR have therefore also been suggested in this study.

## 9.7 Recommendations to the Ministry of Education

This research study has found that although the state, through the Ministry of Education, has high expectations of high quality teaching and learning in the primary schools through the PCAR, it however fails to provide an enabling classroom environment for the achievement of those expectations. Therefore, the Ministry needs to approach the many challenges that the teachers face in the implementation of the Expressive Arts curriculum with a lot of seriousness. There are four areas that the Ministry needs to consider for the improvement of effective classroom practices. Revision of the Expressive Arts curriculum is one of such areas.

### 9.7.1 Provision of INSET

Provision of In-service training in the teaching of Expressive Arts has been regarded as inadequate according to the findings of this study. The evidence from Chapter 8 shows that teachers found some content, particularly that related to sports and games as difficult to teach. The teachers attributed this to lack of training, which they believe would equip them with sound knowledge of the content and skills of teaching Expressive Arts effectively. Most teachers have developed their own way of narrative teaching, different from the

national mandate, that advocates facilitative pedagogies. It is being proposed in this thesis therefore that the regional and district primary school education methods advisors should take responsibility to organise INSET courses at all levels of the primary school. This will not only form part of the professional development of the teachers, but it will also boost their confidence in teaching the apparently unfamiliar content in the integrated Expressive Arts curriculum. In-service courses organised at the school level would both boost confidence in the teachers and would enhance collegiality among the teachers which is lacking at the moment in schools in Malawi.

### 9.7.2 Provision of adequate teaching and learning resources

This study has shown that the problem of resources in schools, particularly those for teaching the practical parts of Expressive Arts, for example, sewing machines and books has not been addressed sufficiently. Teachers had an excuse for skipping the 'practical' parts of Expressive Arts, for example, sewing because the MoEST had not supplied them with the necessary teaching and learning resources. Similarly, Learners' books were found to be lacking in the schools involved in this study. Pupils were sharing books at a ratio of about one book to ten pupils. This resulted in many learners sitting quietly and just listening to their friends without making much contribution to what was going on in the lessons. In some lessons, teachers resolved to rather withhold the books rather than give out the few ones available. The shortage of resources such as sewing machines and books in schools defeats the very aim of improving the quality of education the new curriculum set itself out to achieve. In order to avoid this, some intervention measures are proposed.

- The government should make available sufficient funds to purchase sewing machines and print additional books so that all schools may have sewing machines and also enough books for each pupil. The aim should be to ensure that every school has at least one sewing machine and that every pupil has an Expressive Arts book.

- Publishers within Malawi should take over the printing of books for the new curriculum. It will be easy then to make reprints and publishers within the country may be more sympathetic to the situation than the outsiders who are currently contracted by the government to print books.
- MIE has recently increased its printing capacity and should be able to take on some of the printing responsibilities for the new curriculum.

### 9.7.3 Review of some policies

The Ministry needs to review some of the policies that hamper active participatory classroom practices of teachers that facilitate high intellectual quality lessons. The findings of this study show that two policy mandates hampered active participatory pedagogies. The first of such policies is the use of English as the medium for class instruction. It was clear in the twelve classrooms of study that students struggled with two issues: to grasp the content of Expressive Arts and to understand the English language that conveyed that content to them. The Ministry's expectation is that teachers from grade five onwards use English, but in reality teachers do a lot of code-switching. It is recommended that the Ministry of Education review this policy in order to allow teachers to use local languages as a medium of instruction in the primary school.

The second policy issue the Ministry of Education needs to review relates to the bottleneck between primary school and secondary school education. While the state views the primary school education as terminal to most of its graduates, the general public views the sector as leading to secondary school education. This bottleneck appears to cause unnecessary panicking in teachers, students and parents. However, teachers bear the burden of ensuring that their students get selected for secondary school education. Therefore, the Ministry needs to come up with better policies that give students adequate spaces in secondary

schools. It may take time for every primary school student to have a place in secondary school, but terminating the majority of students after completing the eight-year primary school cycle seems to be hopelessly out of date.

The third policy issue the Ministry of Education needing review relates to Continuous Assessment. This study has revealed that teachers are having problems in integrating continuous assessment within the process of teaching the learners. The study has shown that teachers' failure to do continuous assessment is due to large class sizes which make it difficult for teachers to assess each and every learner in a 35 minute lesson. This is an indication that the country may not be ready yet for Continuous Assessment before addressing the problem of big pupil-teacher ratio. It is therefore recommended that the Ministry of Education reviews the policy on Continuous assessment in the new curriculum. There is also need for in-service training of teachers to equip them with the necessary skills on how they can integrate assessment and teaching in larger classes. The Malawi Institute of Education as the curriculum developer needs to furnish the teachers with resources such as standardised rubrics and checklists which the teachers can use as criteria against which they can measure each learner's performance in the lesson activities for them to effectively implement continuous assessment.

### 9.7.4 Improvement of conditions in the Teacher Training Colleges

The Ministry needs to include teacher-training colleges whenever there are major reforms affecting the primary school sector. Stuart (2002) observed that teacher educators and teacher-training colleges are usually neglected during primary school curricula reforms. This may explain why teachers fail to implement them effectively. The twelve teachers of the study displayed symptoms of weak skills in the effective implementation of the curriculum. In fact, Mchazime (2005) cautioned that to create curricula reforms and then neglect their implementation is not enough. Therefore, the Ministry needs to take into

account the improvement of educational qualifications of teacher educators and the conditions at teacher-training colleges as a starting point for effective preparation of teachers.

### 9.8 Recommendations to Teacher Training Colleges

The twelve study teachers studied demonstrated mediocre skills in professional aspects like selection of various active participatory teaching and learning classroom activities and organization of group work. In general, the teachers failed to use the suggested lesson activities in the teacher's guides. From this perspective, teacher preparation programs need to consider two issues. Firstly, the actual use of the Expressive Arts curriculum for helping pre-service teachers in the familiarization of the documents they will use in the planning of their lessons in schools. Secondly, teacher educators need to give pre-service teachers adequate time for practical experience that can help the trainees in gaining the much needed skills for the organization of effective classroom experiences. For instance, the teacher educators should use the actual curriculum that the teachers will use in schools to gain practical skills in the planning and presentation of mini-lessons based on the documents. Taking an example of the integration of different subject disciplines that make Expressive Arts, teacher educators should involve the pre-service teachers in the planning of interactive classroom practices using the concept of integration of knowledge. After planning their lessons, the pre-service teachers should engage in micro-teaching to demonstrate their skills in the organization of classroom practices. In this way, the pre-service teachers can develop initial skills in organizing interactive classroom practices that blend knowledge from different subjects and also connect local knowledge in the curriculum from other parts of the world. Unless the teacher preparation classrooms begin the integration at college classroom level, pre-service teachers may not see the relevance and value of doing the same in their primary school classrooms.

Teacher educators should give pre-service teachers adequate practice in the use of teaching and learning techniques, lesson activities and resources. Chances are that the teachers' weak skills in the use of some of the learner-centred techniques emanated from their preparation programs. One cost-effective model could be teacher educators giving pre-service teachers a take-home project to try out some techniques and strategies in their home schools during college semester breaks. This could give the pre-service teachers a chance to practise what they learn in college. Their school experiences could be shared in class when they come back to college.

In this connection, the teacher educators should create genuine interactive or participatory practices in their college classrooms which the pre-service teachers can emulate once they begin their teaching profession. The available literature in Malawi suggests that teaching in the TTCs is teacher-centred (Stuart, 2002). Possibly this is why the twelve case study teachers were not able to effectively use participatory learning.

### 9.8. 1 Preparation of teachers based on realities on the ground

Teacher educators should take into consideration the actual challenges teachers face in the field. Such challenges include large classes, lack of teaching-learning resources, and socio-cultural influences. These challenges are well known in Malawi. Theories and models of teaching and learning that were developed in the context of the developed countries may not be wholly applicable to the preparation of teachers in the context of Malawi. Teacher educators in Malawi should modify these teaching and learning techniques to suit the real conditions in the schools.

## 9.9 Recommendations to the Malawi National Examinations Board

The Malawi National Examinations Board (MANEB) is responsible for the organization of all public examinations. The organization needs to find better ways of assessing students at

Standard 8 level. This study has shown that the case study teachers, especially the six teachers who were teaching Standard 8 relied heavily on teacher-centred or expository approaches partly because the current format of the grade eight examinations largely tests content knowledge. Therefore, as long as MANEB continues this kind of examination format, teachers will continue to drill their students with facts for the sake of preparing them for examinations. Written examinations may not be the best tools for assessing students' skills and attitudes. For this reason, MANEB should find alternatives for testing these two domains. For example, school-based group projects on various topics of Expressive Arts could offer best ways of assessing students' skills and attitudes. Schools can organize their Standard 8 students to carry out such various projects based on the relevance and practicability of the projects to the schools' social and physical settings. MANEB could come up with better rubrics for assessing the projects.

Such projects can have multiple advantages. For example, projects have the potential of instilling in students the spirit of working together regardless of their identities that are expressed in form of ethnicity, religion and gender. In addition, the projects can help students with hands-on experiences in dealing with real issues that affect them and their own local areas. In this way, students can develop skills and positive attitudes that include problem solving and tolerance to each other.

## 9.10 Recommendations for further research

### 9.10.1 Implementation of Expressive Arts in Teacher Training colleges

A similar study on the teaching of Expressive Arts could be conducted in Primary Teacher Training Colleges. Some teachers indicated that they did not integrate different subject disciplines informing Expressive Arts in their lessons because they were not competent in some of the subject disciplines integrated in the Expressive Arts learning area, such as

Needlecraft. Such a study would help education planners in Malawi such as the Department of Teacher Education to map out a strategy to address this problem of teacher incompetence in subject disciplines integrated in Expressive Arts. The study would also help to establish the source of the problem. The study could also investigate the apparent gap between theoretical knowledge and classroom practices. This study has established that there is a mismatch between what teachers said and what they practised in the classroom. Investigating this mismatch between teachers' methodological theories and their classroom practices could provide understandings that could help teacher preparation programs develop ways to close that gap.

### 9.10. 2 Implementation of all learning areas in the new curriculum

This study concentrated only on one learning area in the revised curriculum, Expressive Arts learning area. There are nine more learning areas, Chichewa, English, Mathematics, Life skills, Social and Environmental Sciences, Science and Technology, Agriculture, Bible Knowledge and Religious studies. This study could be replicated to investigate the implementation of these too. This would be useful if the revision of these learning areas is to be carried out in the light of the evidence of the current study. In order to get an in-depth study it is proposed that each learning area should be studied separately.

The aim of such studies would be to establish how well the learning areas in the national innovation in Malawi are being taught in schools early in the innovation's implementation in order to establish where the implementation of these learning areas may diverge from the national mandate with the view to establishing the reasons why teachers may not be implementing the learning areas as intended in the state curriculum documents.

### 9.10.3 Implementation of learning areas in the Outcomes Based Education curriculum in the SADC region

Comparative studies conducted within the region are needed in order for Malawi to learn from other countries. Countries such South Africa from which Malawi hired consultants to lead in the development process of the national curriculum innovation in Malawi has experience of challenges encountered in the implementation of a theme-based outcomes based education curriculum design. Malawi can benefit from South Africa's experience with a theme-based outcomes based curriculum.

### 9.10.4 The utilisation of instructional materials

The theme of the curriculum and assessment reform is the improvement of the quality of education. The raising of educational standards depends not only on the quality of curriculum materials, but also on class size, quality of teachers and the availability of adequate learning materials, as specified in the World Bank Report (1987). Class size and teacher quality has been a problem for Malawi for more than two decades. These problems may be resolved by an injection of more funds into primary education in order to provide more infrastructure in the schools and improve the academic quality of the teachers. However, teachers' ability to use the new curriculum and the availability of teaching and learning resources, including new materials in schools have been some of the problems that this research has identified. Further research into the context of the utilization and supply of books in the classroom is therefore needed. Since this is a school-based topic, a case study approach would be most appropriate.

## 9.11 Conclusion

This study in its small-scale nature has attempted to bring an understanding of the curriculum practices in Malawi Expressive Arts classrooms. The main contribution to

knowledge of this study is threefold. First, this study makes a significant contribution to knowledge on curriculum evaluation approaches. Secondly, the study makes an original contribution towards understanding the influence of the South African curriculum implications for Malawian education. Thirdly, the study makes an original contribution to understanding of the curriculum practices in Malawi Expressive Arts classrooms. The study has revealed that teachers are finding it difficult or even impossible for them to teach for high intellectual quality. This supports the findings of two studies on which Productive Pedagogies theory is based. These studies are Queensland School Reform Longitudinal Study (QSRLS) which Lingard *et al.* conducted in Queensland Schools, Australia between 1998 to 2001. The study also found low levels of Productive Pedagogies. Similarly, Newmann's (1996) study of Productive Pedagogies practices of teachers of Wisconsin schools also found low levels of Productive Pedagogies and achievement among learners. What this suggests perhaps, is that teaching for intellectual quality is a difficult task for teachers and it remains a challenge to achieve intellectual quality in classrooms in general. The immediate priority must be to get implementation of Expressive Arts back on track in the primary schools studied in this research in particular and in the whole of Zomba district. The study has made some recommendations which could be used in the improvement of the implementation of the learning area.

**REFERENCES**


Adam, A.U. (1991). *Science education as a development study in Nigeria: A study of Kano state science in secondary schools*. Lagos: University of Lagos Press Ltd.

Adebowale, O.F. (2008). *Continuous assessment policy implementation in selected local government areas of Ondo state (Nigeria): Implications for successful implementation of the UBE program* (*online*) http://cng.kedi.re.kr.Retrieved. Retrieved on the 15th of July, 2009.

Adeyinka, A.A. (2000). *Philosophical foundations of education in Africa*. Gaborone: Pyramid Publishing.

Adler, J. and Setati, M. (2002). *Between languages and Discourses: Language Practices in Primary Multilingual Mathematics Classrooms in South Africa.* http://www.mai.liu.se/cber/workshop/Setati and Adler. Retrieved on the 20th of July, 2009.

Adler, S., and Goodman, J. (1983). *What is social education? Student teachers' perspectives.* Paper presented at the National Council for Education Studies, CUFA, San Francisco, CA.

Aldeman, C. and Alexander, R.J. (1982). *The Self Evaluating Institution*. London: Methuen.

Aldeman, A.U, Jenkins, D and Kemimmis, S. (1977). Rethinking Case Study. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, *Vol. 6*: 139-150.

Aleman, A.M. (1999). Literature review seminar. In F. Lungu. (2009). *Investigating Malawian Physical Science Teaching Strategies: A case of Nuclear Physics.* Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

*Addis Ababa Conference of African Ministers of Education* (1966). Addis Ababa: Organisation of African Unity.

Allais, S. (2010). Education service delivery: the disastrous case of outcomes-based qualifications frameworks. *Progress in Development, 7(1):* 65-78.

Akinkugbe, F.(2004). *The entrepreneurship preparation programme (EPP).* An Unpublished paper submitted to Academic Planning Unit of the University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria.

Nyasaland Ministry of Education (1961). *Annual Education Report*. Zomba: Ministry of Education.

Airasian, P.W. (1991). *Classroom assessment*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Apple, M.W. (1979). *Ideology and Curriculum*. London: Routledge.

Babbie, E. (2004). *The practice of social research.* Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Thomson.

Banda, K. (1977). *A Brief History of Education in Malawi*. Blantyre: Dzuka Publishing Comapany Limited.

Banks, J.A. (1997). *Educating citizens in a multicultural society*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Barton, K. C. and Levstik, L.S. (2004). *Teaching history for the common good*. London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Basson, R. (1996). *Interpreting an integrated studies curriculum in a non-racial private secondary school in South Africa*: *Course reading pack*. Johannesburg: School of Education, University of the Witwatersrand.

Basson, R.B. (2006). Evaluation Research in Education-developments in qualitative approaches. *Journal of Education as change, Volume 10, Number, 1*. Johannesburg: University of Johannesburg.

Berman, P. and Mc Laughlin, M.W. (1977). *Federal Programmes Supporting Educational Change, Vol.VII: Factors Affecting Implementation and Continuation.* Santa Monica, California: Rand Corporation.

Bernstein, B. (1971). On the classification and Framing of Educational Knowledge. In *Knowledge and Control: New Directions for the Sociology of Education.* London: Collier Mac Millan.

Bernstein, B. (1996). *Pedagogy, symbolic control and identity: theory, research, critique*. Oxford: Rowman.

Bernstein, B. (2000). *Pedagogy, symbolic control and identity: theory, research, critique.* Oxford: Rowman.

Blignaut, S.E. (2008). Teachers' sense-making and enactment of curriculum policy. *Journal of Education, No. 43:*30-40.

Boaler, J. (1997). When even the winners are losers: evaluating the experiences of 'top set' students. *Journal of Curriculum Studies, 29 (2):* 165-182

Boydell, A. (1973). Theme teaching. *British Journal of Educational Studies, Vol.21, No.3*: 343-345.

Bourdieu, P. (1974). The school as a conservative force: scholastic and cultural inequalities. In D. Naidoo (2012). Analysing pedagogy: visibility and meanings. *Journal of Education, No.53, 2012.*

Brophy, J. and Alleman, J. (1991). *Instruction should be driven by major social education goals.* East Lansing: The Institute for Research on Teaching College of Education.

Chakwera, E., Khembo, D. and Sireci, S. (2004). *High-Stakes testing in the warm heart of Africa: The challenges and successes of Malawi National Examinations Board.* [Electronic Version]. Education Policy Analysis Archives, 6-28 from http:epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v12n29.

Chapin, J.R. and Mesick, R.G. (2002). *Elementary education.* Boston: Allyn and Baron.

Chimombo, J.P.G. (2005). Quantity versus quality in education: Case Studies in Malawi. *International Review of Education, 55:* 155-172.

Chipungu, A., Kondowe, I., Makhasu, C., Mawephe, S., and Zidana, J. (2010). *The challenges standard four teachers are facing in the teaching of the primary school OBE curriculum: the case of Machinga Boma district.* Unpublished Bachelor of Education Research report, Domasi College, Zomba.

Chisholm, *L. (2005).* The politics of curriculum review and revision in South Africa in regional context. In D. Naidoo. (2009). Educational *Theory and Enquiry 2. Course Reading Pack.* Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Cohen, L. and Manion, L. (1989). *Research methods in education*. London: Croom Helm

Cohen, L., Manion, L. and Morrison, K. (2000). *Research methods in education* (5th ed.) London: Routledge Falmer.

Cogan, J.J., Grossman, D. and Mei-hui-Liu. (2000). Citizenship democratic imagination in a global/social context. *Social Education, 64(1)*: 48-53

Cogan, J.J., Grossman, D., and Mei-hui-Liu. (2000). Citizenship democratic imagination in a global/local context. *Social Education, 64(1)*: 48-53.

Cornbleth, C. (1990). *Curriculum in Context*. London: The Falmer Press.

Correira, S.T. (1997). *Past, present and future: Challenges to education*. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National Council for Education, Cincinnati, Ohio.

Croft, A. (2002). Singing under a tree: Does oral culture help lower primary teachers be learner-centred? *International Journal of Educational Development, 22*: 321-337. Retrieved, March, 1, 2010 from www.elsevier.com/locate/ijedudev.

Cromwell, R. (1989). A new way of thinking: The challenge of the Future. *Educational Leadership 49/1*: 60-64.

Cronbach, L. (1963). *Course improvement through evaluation*. London: Croom Helm in association with the Open University.

Dashwood, A. (2005). *Third turn as a teachable moment in foreign language pedagogy*. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Griffith University.

Dearing, R. (1993). *The national curriculum and its assessment*. London: SCAA publishers.

Denscombe, M. (2003). *The good research guide for small-scale social research projects* (2nd ed.). Maidenhead, Berkshire: Open University Press.

Denzin, N.K. and Lincoln, Y.S. (2000). *Handbook of qualitative research.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.

DFID.(2009). *DFID Statistics on International Development.* http://www. Gov.uk/government/organisations. Retrieved on the 7th of July, 2009.

Dilworth, P.P. (2004). Multicultural education. *Journal of Theory and Research in Social Education, 32 (2):* 150-190.

Du Plessis, P., Conley, L. and Du Plessis, E. (2007). *Teaching and learning in South African schools*. Pretoria: Van Schiack Publishers.

Malawi Government. (1985). *Education Development Plan 1985-1995.* Lilongwe: Malawi Government.

Eisner, E. (1967*). Educational connoisseurship and criticism*: *Their form and functions in educational evaluation*. New York: Macmillan.

EMAS. (2005). *Factors affecting the quality of education in Malawi primary schools.* Paper presented at the Malawi National Education Conference, Lilongwe, Malawi.

Emerson, R.M., Fretz, R.I. and Shaw, L. (1995). *Writing ethnographic fieldnotes*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Fafunwa, A. B. (1974). *History of Education in Nigeria*. London: Allen and Unwin Ltd.

Farrant, J. S. (1990). *Principles and practice of education.* Singapore: Longman.

Federal Republic of Nigeria. (2004). *National policy on education*(4th ed.). Lagos: Federal Republic of Nigeria.

Fenstermacher, G.D. (1994). The knower and the known: The nature of knowledge in research and teaching. *Review of Research in Education, Volume 20:* 3-56.

Fetterman, D. M. (1984). *Curriculum evaluation*. London: Open Books.

Fetterman, D.M. (1984). *Ethnography in educational evaluation*. Beverley Hills: Sage.

Fetterman, D.M. (1989). *Ethnography step by step*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Fetterman, D.M. (1989). *Foundations of Empowerment Evaluation*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Fetterman, D.M. (1999). *Empowerment Evaluation: Principles in Practice*. London: The Guilford Press.

Fetterman, D.M. (2005). *A window into the heart and soul of empowerment evaluation.* New York: Guilford.

Fleisch, B. (2008). *Primary Education in Crisis. Why South African school children underachieve in reading and mathematics.* Cape town: Juta and Co, Ltd.

Flyvjerg, B. (2004). Five misunderstandings about case-study research. In C.Seale, G. Gobo, J.Gubrium and D.Silverman (Eds.) *Qualitative research practice.* London: SAGE Publications.

Forgarty, R. (2009). *How to integrate the curricula*. London: Sage publications.

Fullan, M.G. (1971*). Curriculum implementation: a resource book*. Toronto: Ministry of Education.

Fullan, M.G. (1991). *Successful School Improvement.* Bristol: Open University Press.

Galimoto, P. (2008). *Teaching Practice as component of teacher education in Malawi: An activity theory perspective.* Unpublished PhD thesis, School of Education, University of Nottingham: Nottingham.

Galvin, K. (2000). *Citizens advice bureaux in general practice: an illuminative evaluation*. Bournemouth: Institute of Health and Community Studies Press.

Gipps, C.V. (1994). *Beyond Testing: Towards a Theory of Educational Assessment.* London: Falmer Press.

Giroux, H.A. and McLaren, P.(1999). *Teacher education and the politics of engagement: The case of democratic schooling.* Cambridge: Harvard Educational Press.

Gobo, G. (2004). Sampling, representatives and generality. In C.Seale, G.Gobo, J. Gubrium and D. Silverman (Eds.) *Qualitative research practice*. London: Sage Publications.

Good, T.L. and Brophy, J.E. (1987). *Looking in Classrooms*. New York: Harper and Row Publishers.

Glaser, B.G. and Strauss, A.L. (1976). *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research.* Chicago: Aldin Publishing Co.

Goos, M. and Mills, M. (2007). *Productive Pedagogies: Working with Disciplines and Teacher and Student Voices.* Paper presented at the annual conference of the Australian Association for Research in Education, Fremantle, 25-29 November, 2007.

Grant, S.G. (2000). *Teaching, learning and testing in U.S. high school classrooms*. London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Gross, N., Giacquinta, J. and Bernstein, M. (1980). *Implementing Organisational Innovations: A Sociological Analysis of Planned Educational Change.* New York: Basic Books.

Gule, E. (1999). *Problems experienced by classroom primary teachers, head teachers and pupils in implementing the national continuous assessment programme in the Manzini region, Swaziland*. Unpublished Masters' Research Report, Johannesburg, University of the Witwatersrand.

Hamilton, D. (1976). *Curriculum evaluation*. London: Open Books.

Hamilton, M.L. (1993). Think you can: The influence of culture on beliefs. In C. Day, J. Calderhead and P. Denicolo (Eds.) *Reseach on teacher thinking: Understanding professional development.* London: The Falmer Press.

Hammersley, M., Bynner, J. and Oppenheim, M. (1974). *Data collection procedures.* London: Routledge.

Hammersley, M. and Atkinson, P. (1993). *Ethnography: Principles in practice.* London: Routledge.

Hauya, R.J.R. (1993*). Primary school education in Malawi*. Domasi: Malawi Institute of Education.

Hayes, D., Ladwig, J., Lingard, B., Mills, M., Bahr, M., Chant, D., Warry, M., Ailwood, J., Capeness, R., Christe, P., Gore, J. and Luke, A. (2001). *The Queensland school reform longitudinal study, Vol. 1 and 2*. Brisbane: Educational Queensland.

Hayes, D., Lingard, B., Mills, M. and Christe, P. (2006). *Teachers and Schooling Making a Difference: productive pedagogies, assessment and performance*. Sydney: Allen and Unwin.

Hertzberg, H.W. (1981). *SPAN: Education priorities, practices, and needs.* New York City: Routledge.

Hicks, D., Kishindo, E. and Tlou, J. (2003). Cultivating a democratic citizenry: A model for policy implementation. *Journal of Educational Studies in South Africa, 2 (1)*: 2-14.

Hitchcock, G. and Hughes, D. (1989). *Research and the Teacher: Qualitative Introduction to School-based Research*. New York City: Routledge.

Hoadley, U. (2002). *Curriculum: From Plans to Practice.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hooghoff, H. (1993). *The quality of textbooks: A basis for European collaboration, Paper presented at Bologna children's book fair* (Speeches/Conference papers (150) No.ED 372998). Bologna, Italy: National Institute for Curriculum Development.

Huberman, M. and Miles, M. (1984). *Innovation and Course Planning.* NewYork*:* Plenum.

Indire, F. (1983). Education in Kenya. In A.B. Faunwa and J.U. Aisiku (Eds) *Education in Africa: A Comparative Survey*. London: George Allen.

Hungwe, K. (1994). A decade of science education in Zimbabwe (1980-1990). *Journal of Curriculum Studies, Vol.26*: 83-95.

Ingram, J.B. (1979). *Curriculum integration and Lifelong Education*. Paris: Unesco.

Ishak, N.A. (2010). *Amalan pedagogi produktif dalam guru-guru sains.* Unpublished M.Ed Dissertation, School of Educational Studies, Universesiti Sains Malaysia.

Jansen, J. (1998). *"*A very noisy OBE: the implementation of OBE in grade 1 Classrooms." In J. Jansen and P. Christie (1999). *Changing curriculum: studies on outcomes-based Education in South-Africa*. Cape Town: Juta.

Jansen, J. (2002). Image-ining Teachers: Policy Images and Teacher Identity in South African Classrooms. In K. Lewin, M. Samuel and Y. Sayed (Eds) *Changing Patterns of Teacher Education in South Africa*: *Policy, Practice and Prospects*. Sandown: Heinemann.

Jones,W. (2005). *Curriculum for Entrepreneurship skills and practical subjects*. Lilongwe: TEVET.

Kaambankadzanja, D.O.P. (2001). *The changing role of primary school head teacher in Malawi.* Unpublished Masters research report, University of Manchester: Manchester.

Kaambankadzanja, D. (2005). *PCAR Process and the adaptation of outcomes based Education (OBE) Curriculum for the reform programme - A justification.* Unpublished paper presented during the training for IPTER Curriculum Development workshop. Domasi: Malawi Institute of Education.

Kabwila, V. (1995). *Factors affecting the implementation of English, Social Studies, Music, Chichewa and Mathematics curricula implementation in Malawi.* Unpublished Master of Education Research Report. Brandon: Brandon University.

Kadyoma, F. (2003). *Learning Milieu for Primary School Teachers in Malawi: Perspectives, Practices and Policies.* Unpublished Doctor of Education dissertation. Massachusetts: University of Massachusetts.

Kadzamira, E.C. (2006). *Teacher Motivation and Incentives in Malawi*. Zomba: Centre for Education Research and Training.

Kaphesi, E.S. (2001). *The use of language in mathematics teaching in Malawi*. Unpublished PhD Thesis. Nottingham: University of Nottingham.

Kerlinger, F.N. (1969). *Foundations of Behaviour Research*. NewYork: Holt, Rinehart and Winston Publishers.

Khomani, P. (1996). *Curriculum Change and Teacher support in Malawi primary schools.* Unpublished Master of Education Research Report. Brandon: Brandon University.

Khomani, P. (2003). *Curriculum Development Process and the Malawi Experience.* Domasi: Malawi Institute of Education.

Khomani, P. (2005). *Implementing the Malawi Primary Curriculum and Assessment Reform.* Domasi: Malawi Institute of Education.

Kornblith, G.J. and Lasser, C. (2004). "Will that be on the exam?" The role of testing in teaching and learning American history. *Journal of American History, 90(4)*:1379-1380.

Kunje, D. (2002). The Malawi integrated in-service teacher education programme: An experiment with mixed-mode training. *International Journal of Educational Development, 22(3-4)*:305-320.

Kunje, D. and Chimombo, J. (1999). *Malawi: a Baseline study of Teacher Education System.* Zomba: The Centre for Educational Research and Training, University of Malawi.

Lawton, D. (1983). *Curriculum Studies and Educational Planning*. Kent: Hodder and Stoughton: Sevenoaks.

Lawton, D. (ed) (1988). *The National Curriculum*. London: Bedford Way Papers.

Leach, F. (1991). Perception gaps in technical assisted projects. In K.Lewin and J.S. Stuart (Eds) *Educational Innovations in Developing countries*. London: MacMillan

Liebow, E. (1967). *Tallys' Corner*. London: Routledge.

Le Grange, L. and Newmark, R. (2002). Postgraduate research supervision in a socially distributed knowledge system: some thoughts. In Dryer, J. (Ed.) *The educator as assessor*. Pretoria: Van Schaik publishers.

Leistyna, P. and Woodrum, A. (1996). *Context and culture: What is critical pedagogy?* Cambridge: Harvard Educational Press.

Lingard, B. (2007). Pedagogies of indifferences. *International Journal of Inclusive Education, 11(3)*: 245-266.

Lipson, M. (1993). *Integration and Thematic Teaching: Integration to improve Teaching and Learning.* http://educationnorthwest.org/webfm. Retrieved on the 17th of July, 2009.

Livingstone, D. (1976). Some tasks of education. *Journal of Curriculum Studies, Vol 5, No 1*: 2-11.

Lowe, I. (2008). *Policy and Practice in the teaching of Mathematics Education in the rural primary schools in Malawi.* Unpublished PhD Thesis, Monash University, Melbourne. Available from arrow.monash.edu.au/hdl/1959.1/73686.

Lungu, F. (2009). *Investigating Malawian Physical Science Teaching Strategies: A case of Nuclear Physics.* Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Luykx, A. (1999). *The citizen factory: Schooling and cultural production in Bolivia.* NewYork: State University of New York Press.

Mahlangu, T.P. (2000). *Challenges facing the implementation of Curriculum 2005 (C2005) in Mpumalanga Witbank District*. Unpublished Masters' research report, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Malawi Institute of Education (2006a). *Expressive Arts Teachers' Guide for Standard 7. Domasi:* Malawi Institute of Education.

Malawi Institute of Education (2006b). *Expressive Arts Teachers' Guide for Standard 8*. Domasi*:* Malawi Institute of Education.

Malawi Institute of Education (2005). *Curriculum and Assessment for Quality Education in the 21st Century*. Unpublished paper presentations at a regional conference held at Sun 'n' Sand, Mangochi, Malawi, 13th -15th September, 2005. Domasi: Malawi Institute of Education.

MANEB (Malawi National Examinations Board). (2009). *2009 Malawi School Certificate Examination Results*. http:www.maneb.edu.mw/msce.php. Retrieved on the 5th of December, 2009.

Marsh, C. (1986). *Curriculum an Analytical Introduction*. Sydney: Ian Novak Publishing.

Marshal, P.L. (1996). Teaching concerns visited: The multicultural dimension. In F. Rios (Ed.) *Teacher thinking in cultural contexts.* Albany: State University of New York Press.

Maxwell, J.A. (1998). Designing a qualitative study. In L. Bickman and D.J. Rog(Eds.), *Handbook of Applied Social Research Methods.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.

Mc Donald, B. and Walker, R. (1976). *Changing the curriculum*. London: London Open Books.

McGuire, J., Priestly, P. and Lawton, D. (1983). *Life after School*. Oxford: Pergamon.

Mchazime, H.M. (2005). *Curriculum implementation and its challenges in Malawi.*Paper presented at the Malawi National Education Conference, Lilongwe, Malawi.

Mc Laughlin, M.W. and Talbert, J.E.(1990). *The contexts of teaching in secondary school: Teachers' realities.* New York: Teachers College Press.

McMillan, J.S. and Schumacher, S.S. (1993). *Research in Education: A Conceptual Introduction* (3rd ed.). New York: Harper Collins College Publishers.

McMillan, J.H. (1997). *Classroom assessment: principles and practices for effective instruction.* Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

McMillan, J.H. and Schumacher, S. (2001*). Research in Education – A conceptual introduction*. New York: Longman.

*MIE Library News.* (2008). Domasi: Malawi Institute of Education.

Mdaka, G. (2007). *An illuminative evaluation of the implementation of Grade 7 Algebra curriculum.* Unpublished MEd Research report, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Merriam, S. (2002). *Qualitaive Research and Case study applications in Education*. San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass.

Mhango, N.A.C. (2008). *An exploration of the teaching of Social Studies in primary school: How does a social studies teacher apply the teaching/learning methods in training colleges in a classroom situation?* Unpublished Masters research project, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg.

Mhango, N.A.C. (2010). *An exploration of the teaching of Social Studies in primary schools in Malawi.* Unpublished PhD Thesis, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg.

Miles, W.R. (1981). Illuminative evaluation for formative decision-making: A case study of teaching/learning styles. In E. Van Rensburg. (2007). *An Illuminative Evaluation of the Workplace Learning Component of UNISA's Diploma in Animal Health*. Unpublished Masters' Research Report, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Miles, M.B. and Huberman, A.M. (1981). *Qualitative data analysis: A sourcebook of new methods.* Newbury Park: Sage.

Miles, M.B. and Huberman, A.M.(1984). *Qualitative data analysis. A source book of new methods.* Newbury Park: Sage.

Mills, M. and Goos, M. (2012). Productive pedagogies in the mathematics classroom: Case studies of quality and equity. http://espace.library.uq.edu.au. Accessed 23rd August, 2012

Ministry of Education. (1996). .Education Plan 1973. In V. Kabwila. (1995). *Factors affecting the implementation of English, Social Studies, Music, Chichewa and Mathematics curricula implementation in Malawi.* Unpublished Master of Education Research Report. Brandon University, Brandon.

Ministry of Education. (2005). *Malawi Educational Statistics 1995-2004 (2005).* Lilongwe: Ministry of Education.

Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2000). *Primary Teacher Education in Malawi.* Lilongwe: Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2001). *Policy and Investment Framework (PIF).* Lilongwe: Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2001). *Education sector: Policy and investment framework (PIF).* Lilongwe: Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (2003). *National Curriculum and Assessment for Primary Education Framework.* Lilongwe: Ministry of Education and Vocational Training.

Mkandawire, M.T.S .(2004). *Attitudes and views on local languages as media of instruction in Malawi.* Unpublished Masters, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg.

Moore, R. and Muller, J. (2001). The discourse of 'voice' and the problem of knowledge and identity in the sociology of education: *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 20:* 189-206.

Mohapeloa, J. (1982). 'Education in Lesotho.' In Fafunwa (ed), *Education in Africa: a Comparative Survey.* London: George Allen and Unwin.

Mortimore, P., Stoll, L., Lewis, D. and Ecob, R. (1988). *School Matters: The Junior Years.* Somerset: Open Book Publishing Ltd.

Motara, S. (2002). *The way teachers construe curriculum integration: the dichotomy of possibilities and constraints.* Unpublished Masters' Research Report, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Myers, M.P. and Savage, T. (2005). *Enhancing student comprehension of educational material.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Musgrove, F. (1973). Power and the integrated curriculum. *Journal of Curriculum Studies, Vol. 5:* 3-12.

Murry, K.C.(1997). *Transfering knowledge to classroom teaching: Putting knowledge into action.* London: The Falmer Press.

Mtetwa, A.C. (2003). *Has it happened in Mpumalanga? An evaluation of the implementation of Curriculum 2005.* Unpublished Masters' Research Report, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

Naidoo, D. R. (2005). *Curriculum, context and identity – an investigation of the curriculum practices of grade 9 teachers in three contrasting social-economic school contexts.* Unpublished Doctor of Philosophy Thesis, University of Kwazulu-Natal, Pietermaritzburg.

Naidoo, D. R. (2009). *Case studies of the implementation of "progression and integration of knowledge in South African schools.* Journal of Education as Volume 13, Number 1, July, 2009.

Naidoo, D. R. (2011). *Understanding teachers' perceptions of the integrated learning areas of the National curriculum statement. Journal of education as change (14)2.* Johannesburg: University of Johannesburg.

Nassir, N.S. and Saxe, G.B.(2003). Ethnic and academic identities: a cultural practice perspective on emerging tensions and their management in the lives of minority students. *Education Researcher, 32(5):*14-18.

Nassir, N.S. and Hand, V.M. (2006). Exploring social-cultural perspectives on race, culture, and learning. *Review of Educational Research, 76 (4)*: 449-475.

National AIDS Commission. (2004). *Behavioural Surveillance Survey Report*. Lilongwe: National AIDS Commission.

Newmann, F.M., Secada, W.G. and Wehlage, G.G. (1996). *Authentic achievement: restructuring schools for intellectual quality*. San Fransisco: Josey Bass.

Nicholl, J. (1982). London: *Patterns of Project Dissemination*. School Council Press.

Nichols, A. (1998). An illuminative evaluation of the 'thinking skills' curriculum at Devon school. *Journal of Educational and Child Psychology, Vol.15, No 2.*

Nisbet, J. and Watt, J. (1974). *Case Study.* Nottingham: Nottingham University Press.

Nonyongo, E. P. (2007). *Students' interpretation of the Distance University Students Support Programme (DUSSPRO) as a programme of the South African Committee for the Higher Education Trust (SACHED).* Unpublished MEd Thesis, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Nsapato, L. (2005). *Factors affecting the quality of basic education in Malawi.* Paper presented at the Malawi National Education Conference, Lilongwe, Malawi.

Nsibande, R. (2006). *Knowledge and Practice of Continuous Assessment: The Barriers for Policy Transfer.* Unpublished Doctor of Philosophy Thesis, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Nyerere, J.K. (1967). Education in Tanzania. In D.Fafunwa (Ed.) *Education in Africa - a Comparative Study*. London: Allen and Unwin.

Nyirenda, D.M.C. (1993). *An evaluation of national curriculum changes in Science and Mathematics in Malawi with reference to parallel changes in England and Wales.* Unpublished PhD thesis, School of Education, University of Nottingham.

Oakes, J., Gamoran, A., and Page, R. (1992). Curriculum differentiation: Opportunities, outcomes, and meanings. In P.W. Jackson (Ed.) *Handbook of Research on Curriculum* New York: Macmillan.

Ornstein, A.C. and Hunkins, F. (1993). *Curriculum: Foundations, Principals, and Theory*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Parlett, M. and Dearden, G. (1977). *Introduction to illuminative evaluation: Studies in higher education*. Cardiff-by-the-Sea, CA: Pacific Soundings Press.

Parlett, M. and Hamilton, D.(1972). *Evaluation as Illumination: A New Approach to the Study of Innovation Programmes.* Edinburg: SCRS

Parlett, M. and Hamilton, D. (1976). Evaluation as illumination. In Tawney, D (Ed.) *Curriculum evaluation today: Trends and implications.* London: SCRS.

Parker, W. (2004). *Teaching democracy: Unity and diversity in public life.* New York: Teacher's College Press.

Passe, J. (2006). New challenges in elementary social studies. *Journal of Social studies, 97(5)*:190-2000.

Patton, M.Q. (1978). *Utilization-focused evaluation*. Thousand Oaks. Sage.

Peters, R.O. (1999). Focussing on citizenship training in the social studies. In N. Mhango.(2010). *An exploration of the teaching of Social Studies in primary schools in Malawi.* Unpublished PhD Thesis, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg.

Phelps - Stoke Commission Report (1924). Cited in *Nyasaland Education Report.* (1961). Zomba: Government Press.

Pike, R. (1954). *RCGP Quality Team Development programme: an illuminative evaluation*. London: Kogan Page.

Pitso, T. (2000). *Curriculum 2005 Implementation: Examining the evidence in the Vanderbijlpark North District.* Unpublished Master's research report, Wits University, Johannesburg.

Popham, W.J. (1975*). Educational Evaluation.* Englewood: Clift Prentice-Hall

Pratt, D. (1980). *Curriculum Design and Development*. Harcourt: Brace Jovanovich Inc.

Powney, J. and Watts, M.(1987). *Interviewing in Educational Research.* London: Routledge.

Ratsatsi, D. (2005). Challenges facing implementation of a curriculum innovation: lessons from Botswana experiences. In P.Khomani (Ed.) *Curriculum and Assessment Reform for quality education in the 21st Century*. Zomba: Malawi Institute of Education.

Le Grange L. and Reddy, C. (1998). *Continuous Assessment*: *An Introduction and Guidelines to Implementation:* Cape Town: Juta.

Lodico, M., Spaulding, D. and Voegtle, K. (2006). *Methods in Illuminative evaluation research.* California: Jossey Bass.

Reilly, R.C. (2005). *Nurses' perception of their preparation for beginning professional practice.* Unpublished PhD thesis, Southern Queensland: University of Southern Queensland.

Rembe, S. (2006). *An assessment of the Policies and Programs of Zimbabwe in addressing HIV/AIDS Epidemic in the Education Sector.* http://www.academicjournals.org/ERR. Retrieved on the 3rd of July, 2008.

Remy, R.C., Anderson, L.F. and Snyder, R.(1976). Citizenship education in elementary schools. *Theory into Practice, 15(1):* 31-36.

Richardson, V. (1994). *Conducting Research on Practice.* London: Kogan Page.

Rios, F.A. (1996). Introduction. In F.A. Rios (Ed.) *Teacher thinking in cultural contexts.* Albany: State University of New York Press.

Robertson, J. (1970). Education in Zambia. In B. Rose (Ed.) *Education in Southern Africa.* London: Collier-MacMillan.

Robbins, M., Francis, L.J. and Elliot, E. (2003). Attitudes toward education among trainee teachers. *Research in Education, 69*: 93-98.

Rogers, E and Badman, F. (1992). *Communication of Innovations*. NewYork: New York free press.

Rose, B. (1970). *Education in Southern Africa.* London: Collier-Macmillan.

Rose, P. (2003). Can free primary education meet the needs of the poor? Evidence from Malawi [Electronic version]. *International Journal of Educational Development, 2:*500-560. www.elsevier.com/locate/ijedudev. Retrieved on the 20th of July, 2009.

Ross, W.E. (1997). Introduction. In W.E. Ross (Ed.) *The school curriculum: Purposes, problems, and possibilities.* Albany: State University of New York Press.

Salvia, J. and Ysseldyke, J.E. (1995). *Assessment.* Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Saul, M.(2009). *Jean Piaget's Developmental Psychology*. http://www.simply psychology.org/piaget.html. Retrieved on the 3rd of July, 2009.

Shakirat, I.B. (2007). Addressing Youth Unemployment through Enterpreneurship Education. *Ilorin Journal of Education, Vol. 27*:25-30.

Salkinder, P.S. (1984). *An Illuminative Evaluation of a Plan for a Technical Training Institute in Alexandra.* Unpublished Master of Education Research Report, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Sarapangani, A. (2003). Ethnography of Learning in a northern Indian village. *International Journal of Educational Development 30:* 297-304.

Schon, D. (1971). *Beyond the Stable State*. London: Penguin.

Scott, J.C. (1998). *Seeing like a state: How certain schemes to improve human conditions have failed.* New Haven: Yale University Press.

Scriven, M.(1967). Pros and cons about goal free evaluation. In A. Lewy (Ed) *A Handbook for Evaluation.* Paris: UNESCO Longman.

Scriven, M. (1977). The methodology of evaluation. In D. Hamilton, D. Jenkins, C. King, B.MacDonald and M. Parlett (Eds) *Beyond the Numbers Game.* London: MacMillan Education Ltd.

Sears, A.M. and Hughes, A.S. (1996). Citizenship education and current educational reform. *Canadian Journal of Educational Reform, 21(2*):120-150.

Segoe, B.A. (1989). *An iluuminative evaluation of micro-teaching programmes at Hebron College of Education.* Unpublished Master of Education Research Report, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Sebobi, E. M. (2010). *Challenges in the teaching of Botswana General Certificate of Secondary Education art and design curriculum*. Unpublished Master of Education Research Report, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Shalem, Y. and Pendlebury, S. (Eds.)(2010). *Retrieving teaching*. Claremont: Juta and Co. Ltd.

Shulman, L.S. (1986). Those who understand knowledge growth in teaching. *Education Researcher, 15*:4-14.

Shulman, L.S. (1987). Knowledge and teaching: foundations of the new research. *Havard Educational Review, 57(1*):1-22.

Shulman, L. (1991). Those who understand: Knowledge growth in teaching. *Educational Researcher (Feb*): 4-14.

Sieber, S.D. (1982). The integration of fieldwork and survey methods. In R. Burgess (Ed.) *Field Research: A Source Book and Field Manual*. London: Routledge.

Spellman, G. (2000). Evaluation of CAL in higher education Geography. *Journal of Computer Assisted Learning. Vol.16*:72-82.

Spradley, J.P. (1979). *The ethnographic interview*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Sloan, G. and Watson, H. (2001). Illuminative evaluation: Evaluating clinical supervision on its performance rather than the applause. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 33(3):* 289-302.

Spady, W.G. (1994). *Outcomes-Based Education. Critical Issues and Answers.* Virginia: American Association of School Administrators.

Stake, R.E. (1967). The countenance of educational evaluation. *Teachers College Record, 68(7)*: 523-540.

Steadman, S.(1976). Techniques of evaluation. In D. Tawney (Ed.) *Curriculum Evaluation to Date-Trends and Implications.* London: MacMillan publishers.

Stenhouse, L. (1976). *An Introduction to Curriculum Research and Development*. Kings Lynn: Biddles publishing Ltd.

Stuart, J.S. (1999). College tutors: A fulcrum for change [Electronic version]. *International Journal of Educational Development, 22*: 367-379 from www.elsevier.com/locate/ijedudev. Retrieved on the 1st of July, 2009.

Stuart, J.S. (2002). *Primary teacher education curriculum as documented: A comparative analysis:* Sussex*:* University of Sussex Institute of Education.

Stufflebeam, D. L. (1971). *Educational Evaluation and decision making*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Susuwele - Banda, W.J. (2005). *Classroom Assessment in Malawi: Teachers'Perceptions and Practices in Mathematics.* Unpublished PhD dissertation submitted to the faculty of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Virginia.

Taba, H. (1962). *Curriculum Theory and Practice.* New York: Harcourt Bruce and World Press.

Tabulawa, R. (1998). Teachers' perceptions on classroom practice in Botswana. Implications for pedagogical change. *International Journal of Education, 11(2):*20-30.

Taiwo, C. O. (1983). *The Nigerian educational system: Aims, plans and implementation*. Ile-Ife: University of Ife Press Ltd.

Tanner, D. and Tanner, L. (1980). *Curriculum development*. New York: World Book Co.

Thornton, S.J. (1994). Education near century's end: Reconsidering pattern of curriculum and instruction. *Review of Research in Education, 20*:223-254.

Thornton, S.J. (2005). *Teaching that matters.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Tuah, H. (1982). *A case for illuminative evaluation in the implementation of Kurikulum Bersepadu Sekolah Rendah*. http://www.ipdl.edu.my/inter/penyelelidikan. Retrieved on the 17th of July, 2009.

Turner, J. and Patrick, M. (2004). Motivational influences on student participation in classroom learning activities. *Teachers College Record, 106(9*): 759-785

Tyler, R. (1949). *Basic Principles of Curriculum Instruction*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.

UNESCO. (2000). Thematic studies. *Textbooks and learning materials, 1990-99, Paris, 7.*

Van der Horst,H. and Mc Donald, R. (2008). *Outcomes- Based Education. Theory and Practice*: Pretoria: Tee Vee Printers and Publishers.

Van Rensburg, E. (2007). *An Illuminative Evaluation of the Workplace Learning Component of UNISA's Diploma in Animal Health*. Unpublished Masters' Research Report, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.

Ward, C. (1980). *Designing a scheme of assessment*. Cheltenham: Stanley Thorns Publishers.

Wheeler, D.K. (1967). *Curriculum Process*. London: University of London Press.

Wheeler, D. K. (1978). *Curriculum process* (2nd ed.). Sydney: Hodder and Stoughton Publishers.

Whitaker, T. (1993). *Curriculum Theory, Design and Assessment*. Vancouver: Grant Mc Ewan College Press.

White, A. (2001). Breast feeding and Adolescent Mothers. *American Journal of Dietetic Association, Volume 101(8)*: 876. http://www. Interscience.wiley.com. Retrieved on 20th of July, 2009.

Whitehead, A.N. (1932). *The Aims of Education*. London: William and Norgate.

Wiggins, G. (1990). The case for authentic assessment. In J. Dryer (Ed.) *The educator as assessor*. Pretoria: Van Schawk publishers.

Withers, J.R. (Ed.) *(1994*). *Conceptual dictionary*. Kenwyn: Juta.

Wolf, R. (1979). *Evaluation in Educational Foundation of Competency Assessment and Programme Review*. New York: Pagers Publishers.

Wong, K. (2008). *Illuminative evaluation of the implementation of an environmental education curriculum at Evangel College*. http://www. Environmental curriculum. Wong.html. Retrieved on 17th July, 2009.

Wolcott, H. (2006). Ethnographic research in education. *Journal of Education as change, Volume 10, Number, 1*. Johannesburg: University of Johannesburg.

Worthen, B. R. and Sanders, J. R. (1987). *The Concept of Evaluation: An overview*. New York: Longman.

Yeager, E.A. and Wilson, E.K. (1997). *Teaching methods*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Yin, R.K.(1989). *Case Study Research-Design and Methods*. California: Sage Publication.

Young , M. (1997). *The curriculum of the Future: from the new sociology of education to a critical theory of learning.* London: Routledge.

Zembylas, M. (2007). Emotional ecology: The intersection of emotional knowledge and pedagogical content knowledge in teaching. *Journal of Teaching and Teacher Education, 23:* 355-367

Zohir, M., Razak, N. and Ahmad, S. (2010). Exploring the Clasroom Practice of Productive Pedagogies of the Malaysian Secondary Geography Teacher. *Journal of Review of International Geographical Education. Vol.2, No.2*: 1- 40.

Zolkov, A. (1996). Music Curricula, Mechanical Aspects of Music as a Fine Art, and Curriculum Innovation in Namibia. *South African Journal of Education, 16 (2):* 111-120.

# APPENDICES


APPENDIX 1 Curriculum matrix .....365

APPENDIX 2 Teacher questionnaire .....366

APPENDIX 3 Lesson observation protocol.....369

APPENDIX 4 Follow-up lesson observation teacher interviews questions .....370

APPENDIX 5 Wits authorization letter to conduct research.....372

APPENDIX 6 Request for permission letter to the District Education manager to conduct research.....373

APPENDIX 7 Request for permission letter to school principals to conduct research..... ....375

APPENDIX 8 Consent Forms for Teacher participation in research…….. ....377

APPENDIX 9 Data used in the analysis of the intended curriculum..... 3(CD

APPENDIX 10 Sample lessons analysed using Productive pedagogies .....11(CD)

APPENDIX 11 Post-lesson observation interview excerpts.....42(CD)

APPENDIX 12 Analysis of teacher responses to questionnaire..... 83(CD)

## APPENDIX 1

## Curriculum Matrix: Time Allocation in Lessons per Week

| **Learning area** | **Standard (Grade)** | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | **6** | **7** | **8** |
| Agriculture | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Science and Technology | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Chichewa | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| English | 8 | 8 | 8 |
| Mathematics | 8 | 8 | 8 |
| Expressive Arts | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Social and Environmental Sciences | 6 | 6 | 6 |
| Religious/Bible Knowledge | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Life Skills Education | 5 | 5 | 5 |

## APPENDIX 2

### *An Illuminative Evaluation of Standard 7 and 8 Expressive Arts curriculum in Malawi*

### INSTRUMENT 1: QUESTIONNAIRE

***Note to Informants***:

May I ask you to complete the questions below which have been designed to gain your insights into the Expressive Arts curriculum, particularly its design, content, pedagogy and assessment procedures.

Please respond to all questions, giving as fully as possible your thoughts on Expressive Arts, your lessons and teaching, in the space provided.

#### 1. Demographic data

School:…….. Grade:…… Number of pupils in class…….

Teacher's name: ……Gender:…….Qualification: ……

Teaching Experience: ……;Experience in Expressive Arts:.....

#### 2. Expressive Arts curriculum design

*2.1: Integration*

-What subject disciplines are integrated in Expressive Arts?

**Sufficient space was provided for each question to be answered**……

- What themes integrate these subjects? Give as many as you know
- Please indicate the type of feelings you have for curriculum integration

| | |
|---|---|
| Positive | |
| Negative | |

Explain your response:

2.2 C*ontent*

- What are the four core elements of Expressive Arts?
- What are the outcomes of each of the four core elements in the Expressive Arts curriculum?

- What other things do you consider new in the Expressive Arts curriculum?

**3. Planning/designing lessons in Expressive Arts**

- Do you feel able to prepare lessons integrating subjects in Expressive Arts?

Yes/No Please explain your response:

-do you feel able to plan/design lessons guided by outcomes and/or performance indicators of Expressive Arts? Yes/No

Please explain your response: ……..

-which problems do you have designing lessons in Expressive Arts ?

-what do you do when you have a problem with lesson design in Expressive Arts?

**4. Expressive Arts teaching methods**

*4.1: Training in Expressive Arts.*

- how many courses on teaching Expressive Arts have you attended?

- what were you trained to do in the training you received in Expressive Arts?

- what was the most useful part of the training?

- what was the least useful part of the training?

- what support for teaching Expressive Arts do you receive from your school?

[e. g. from the principal, head of department, colleagues]

4.2 *Pedagogical practices*

- what are your current methods of teaching Expressive Arts?

- what has been the most beneficial in assisting you to teach Expressive Arts using an integrated approach?

- what in your experience, are the challenges of successfully teaching Expressive Arts learning area? What are most difficult aspects to teach?

**5. Assessment**

- do you feel able to continuously assess learners in Expressive Arts?

Yes/No Please explain:

- do you feel able to set test and test learners at the end of a section of work or in examinations in Expressive Arts?

Yes/No Please explain:

- what changes in the way you used to assess learners have you now made as you do continuous assessment of your learners?

**6. Expressive Arts resources**

6.1 Which of the following Expressive Arts curriculum materials have you received? (Tick Yes or No)

(i) Teachers' Guide Yes/No

(ii) Learners' Book

(iii) Assessment Guideline Handbook

(v) Have you sufficient materials to teach Expressive Arts in 2010?

(vi) What is the Learner Textbook ratio?……

(v) What teaching aids do you not have which you need to teach Expressive Arts?

**7. Teacher Learner Ratio**

(i) How many learners are in your class?.....

(ii) Are all learners sufficiently accommodated? Yes/No

(ii) Do you regard the number of learners in your class manageable in terms of teaching Expressive Arts successfully? Yes/No

Explain your response:

**8. Open Question - Expressive Arts design, content, teaching and asessment**

What comments would you make about the Expressive Arts curriculum, its content, pedagogy assessment, which has not been raised above, and which its designers ought to know about in your view

(i) the Expressive Arts curriculum in general

(ii) its materials and content

(iii) the teaching methods or pedagogy.

(iii) its assessment techniques and assessment reform

**I really appreciate your time and the thought you have put into completing the questionnaire. Thank you very much.**

**G Chirwa**

## APPENDIX 3

## INSTRUMENT 2: LESSON OBSERVATION PROTOCOL

### 1. Demographic data

School:…… Class:…….. Number of pupils in class……

Teacher's name……Gender:…….

Teaching Experience: …….

Date of lesson observation:……..

**2. Lesson preparation** (to be completed before the lesson)

2.1 Lesson plan available? Yes/No

2.2 Topic of the lesson:.....

2.3 Outcome of the lesson:.....

2.4 Subjects integrated in the lesson:

Needlecraft, Phy.Ed, Music, Creative Arts, Drama

2.5 Theme [s] in the lesson:

2.6 Teaching and learning materials to be used in the lesson

2.7 Learning activities to be used in the lesson

2.8: Teaching method to be used in the lesson

2.9: Assessment method to be used in the lesson:

1. **Observation** (observation of what actually happens in the lesson, including what the teacher and learners do and say in the teaching and learning process)

## APPENDIX 4

## INSTRUMENT 3: FOLLOW- UP TEACHER INTERVIEW

### Demographic data

School:……Class:…… Number of pupils

Class…….

Teacher's name: ……Gender:…….

Teaching Experience: ……

Teaching experience in Expressive Arts:.....

*Examples of probing questions to be asked to establish what teachers 'actually do' in the lesson observed*

1. I want to get a clearer picture of your lesson you have just taught your learners. Please tell me about it, what was happening in the lesson?
2. Can you also please tell me more about how you addressed the following in your lesson?

   2.1 outcomes ?

   2.2 themes ?

   2.3 integration of various subjects.

3 Can you also tell me more about how you used your teaching and learning materials and resources (e.g. teachers' guide, learners' books and other materials) in your lesson, how did they help you to teach the lesson and your learners to learn what you wanted them to?

4.1 Can you tell me more about the teaching method you used in the lesson:

4.2 Why did you use those methods?

4.3 How did those methods help your learners to learn what you wanted them to?

5. Can you say something about the methods you used in the lesson to assess your learners learning? In other words, how did you know if learners understood what you taught them in the lesson?

6. Would you say that you reached the objectives of the lesson? Explain.
7. What can you say are the things you liked about your lesson and the things you did not like about it.
8. Is there anything else you wish us to know about your lesson which you taught today?
9. Reflecting on this research, what feelings do you have about the methods I have used in this research to evaluate the teaching of Expressive Arts at your school? What are the shortcomings of the methods I have used? What improvements do you feel I could make in my methods in the future if I were to evaluate the teaching of Expressive Arts again?

**Thank you for your time and thoughts about the lesson.**

## APPENDIX 5

## WITS SCHOOL OF EDUCATION AUTHORIZATION LETTER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH

**Wits School of Education**

27 St Andrews Road, Parktown, Johannesburg, 2193 • Private Bag 3, Wits 2050, South Africa
Tel: +27 11 717-3007 • Fax: +27 11 717-3009 • E-mail: enquiries@educ.wits.ac.za • Website: www.wits.ac.za

STUDENT NUMBER: 0718686J
Protocol: 2009ECE123

29 September 2009

Mr. Grames Chirwa
WSoE

Dear Mr. Chirwa

**Application for Ethics Clearance: Doctor of Philosophy**

I have a pleasure in advising you that the Ethics Committee in Education of the Faculty of Humanities, acting on behalf of the Senate has agreed to approve your application for ethics clearance submitted for your proposal entitled:

**An illuminative evaluation of expressive arts in primary schools in Malawi**

**Recommendation:**

Ethics clearance is granted

Yours sincerely

Matsie Mabeta
Wits School of Education

Cc Supervisor: Dr. D Naidoo (via email)

**APPENDIX 6**

**REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO ZOMBA DISTRICT EDUCATION MANAGER TO CONDUCT RESEARCH IN THE DISTRICT**

Wits School of Education,
University of Witwatersrand,
Private Bag 3,
WITS, 2050.
1st August, 2009.

The District Educational Manager,
Zomba Education District,
P.O. Zomba,
Malawi.

Dear Sir,

**REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO CONDUCT REASEARCH IN SIX STATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN YOUR DISTRICT, ZOMBA.**

My name is Grames Wellington Chirwa and I work with the Malawi Institute of Education as a curriculum developer in Physical Education and Expressive Arts. Currently, I am pursuing PhD studies with the University of Witwatersrand in South Africa. Having successfully completed my proposal, I am ready to start data collection. My writing is to seek written permission from your office for me to start data collection in Expressive Arts in the senior classes, that is Standards 7 and 8 of the primary school in six of the state primary schools in your educational district in order for me to complete my research thesis for my degree. The title of my research is: "*An illuminative evaluation of the Standard 7 and 8 Expressive Arts curriculum in Malawi*."

This study focuses on investigating how teachers teach Expressive Arts to help students understand the subject. Thus, this research project will seek answers to answer the following questions:

- What is the intended Expressive Arts curriculum?
- What is the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum*?*
- What differences are there between the intended and the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum?
- Why do these differences arise?
- Is illuminative evaluation a suitable framework for evaluating a curriculum innovation in Malawi?

I anticipate that answers to these questions will help in teachers' implementation of our Expressive Arts new curriculum in Malawi. From the findings, it will also be possible to contribute to an understanding of ways of making teachers teach the subject more effectively, and help students understand Expressive Arts better.

To gain understanding of how Expressive Arts is being implemented, it is important to work with teachers. I would like to interview them and observe their lessons of Expressive

Arts. The aim is to learn from them and identify the strategies they will be using in their lessons.

Some teachers who are not experienced in teaching Expressive Arts might learn a lot from sharing these strategies. The interviews will take place before and after each lesson, on the same day. It is expected that each interview session will last no more than one hour after teaching time. Teachers' participation in this study is entirely voluntary. All the information gained from the study will be treated confidentially and that their identities will be preserved. They will not be forced to answer any question during interviews and discussions. Teachers may withdraw from the study at any time if they so wish. I hope to publish the results of my study in teacher education journals and conferences. The identities of the participating teachers will be protected in these publications and presentations. I will provide you with a summary of my research findings.

For more information, you may contact me on 0996373227.

Yours sincerely,

Mr. Grames Chirwa

**APPENDIX 7**

**REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO SCHOOL PRINCIPALS TO CONDUCT RESEARCH IN SCHOOLS**

Wits School of Education,
University of Witwatersrand,
Private Bag 3,
WITS, 2050.
1st August, 2009.

The Principal,
Zomba,
Malawi.

Dear Sir/Madam,

**REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH IN YOUR SCHOOL IN JANUARY - MAY, 2010.**

My name is Grames Wellington Chirwa and I work with the Malawi Institute of Education as a curriculum developer in Physical Education and Expressive Arts. Currently, I am pursuing PhD studies with the University of Witwatersrand in South Africa. Having successfully completed my proposal, I am ready to start data collection. My writing is to seek written permission from your office for me to start data collection in Expressive Arts in the senior classes of the primary school in six of the state primary schools in your educational district in order for me to complete my research thesis for my degree. The title of my research is: "*An illuminative of the Standard 7 and 8 Expressive Arts curriculum in Malawi*."

This study focuses on investigating how teachers teach Expressive Arts to help students understand the subject. Thus, this research project will seek answers to answer the following questions:

- What is the intended Expressive Arts curriculum?
- What is the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum*?*
- What differences are there between the intended and the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum?
- Why do these differences arise?
- Are Illuminative evaluation and Productive Pedagogies suitable frameworks for evaluating a curriculum innovation in Malawi?

I anticipate that answers to these questions will help in teachers' implementation of our Expressive Arts new curriculum in Malawi. From the findings, it will also be possible to contribute to an understanding of ways of making teachers teach the subject more effectively, and help students understand Expressive Arts better.

To gain understanding of how Expressive Arts is being implemented, it is important to work with teachers. I would like to interview them and observe their lessons of Expressive

Arts. The aim is to learn from them and identify the strategies they will be using in their lessons. Some teachers who are not experienced in teaching Expressive Arts might learn a lot from sharing these strategies. The interviews will take place before and after each lesson, on the same day. It is expected that each interview session will last no more than one hour after teaching time. Teachers' participation in this study is entirely voluntary. All the information gained from the study will be treated confidentially and that their identities will be preserved. They will not be forced to answer any question during interviews and discussions. Teachers may withdraw from the study at any time if they so wish. I hope to publish the results of my study in teacher education journals and conferences. The identities of the participating teachers will be protected in these publications and presentations. I will provide you with a summary of my research findings.

For more information contact me on 0996373227.

Yours sincerely,

Mr. Grames Chirwa

## APPENDIX 8

## CONSENT FORM FOR TEACHER PARTICIPATION IN THE RESEARCH

Dear Colleague,

I am a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) student (in Education) in the School of Education at the University of Witwatersrand in Johannesburg, South Africa. I am conducting a qualitative research study on the topic of "*Illuminative evaluation of Standards 7 and 8 Expressive Arts curriculum in Malawi."*

The purpose of this study is to investigate the problems teachers may be facing in teaching this subject – an idea based on the hypothesis that improvements in teaching and learning of any subject can only be achieved if the problems which teachers are facing and other conditions in the education system which are inhibiting successful teaching of the subject are identified which may later bring in appropriate interventions to ensure the successful teaching of the subject. Thus, this research project will seek answers to answer the following questions:

- What is the intended Expressive Arts curriculum?
- What is the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum*?*
- What differences are there between the intended and the enacted Expressive Arts curriculum?
- Why do these differences arise?
- Are Illuminative evaluation and Productive Pedagogies suitable frameworks for evaluating a curriculum innovation in Malawi?

I anticipate that answers to these questions will help in teachers' implementation of our Expressive Arts new curriculum in Malawi. From the findings, it will also be possible to contribute to an understanding of ways of making teachers teach the subject more effectively, and help students understand Expressive Arts better.

To gain understanding of how Expressive Arts is being implemented, it is important to work with you. I would like to interview you and observe your lessons of Expressive Arts. The aim is to learn from you and identify the strategies you will be using in your lessons.

Some teachers who are not experienced in teaching Expressive Arts might learn a lot from sharing these strategies. The interviews will take place before and after each lesson, on the same day. It is expected that each interview session will last no more than one hour after teaching time. Your participation in this study is entirely voluntary. All the information gained from the study will be treated confidentially and that your identities will be preserved. You will not be forced to answer any question during interviews and discussions. You may withdraw from the study at any time if they so wish. I hope to publish the results of my study in teacher education journals and conferences. Your identities as participating teachers will be protected in these publications and presentations. I will provide you with a summary of my research findings.

I am requesting you to participate in this study. However, the following information is provided for you to decide whether you wish to participate in the present study.

- You should be aware that you are free to decide not to participate or to withdraw at any time, without affecting your relationship with the researcher or the University of the Witwatersrand.
- The activities you will be involved in are that I will observe a minimum of **5** of your **35 minute** Expressive Arts lessons in **5-6 school days** (1 lesson per day following your school subject time-table. The second activity for you to participate in, is a post-lesson interviews after each of your lesson. This interview will take a maximum of **1 hour**. Your total time of participation in the research is approximately **15 hours in 6 days**. This means that your participation time per day in the research is approximately **1 hour and 35 minutes**. I would also like to audio tape record what transpires in the interview.
- For the sake of protecting your identity, your name will not be associated with the research findings in any way and only the researcher will know your identity as a participant.

Your benefits as a participant will be information that the study is apt to generate as we discuss the subject of the teaching of Expressive Arts at your school and the opportunity to participate in the study.

Do not hesitate to ask any questions about the study, either before participating or during the time that you are participating.

Please, sign this consent form with full knowledge of the nature and purpose of the study. A copy of this consent form will be given to you to keep.

Name of participant……..

Signature of participant…… Date ……..

Grames Chirwa /Researcher

# APPENDICES IN THIS CD

APPENDIX 9 The 'instructional system' data used in analysis of the 'intended' curriculum of Expressive Arts……3

APPENDIX 10 Productive pedagogies analysis of a sample of lessons in Expressive Arts…….... 11

APPENDIX 11 Post-lesson interview data utilized in Chapter 7 of this thesis……41

Appendix 12 Teacher responses to the questionnaire……83

## APPENDIX 9: 'THE INSTRUCTIONAL SYSTEM' DATA USED IN THE ANALYSIS OF THE 'INTENDED CURRICULUM OF EXPRESSIVE ARTS

## 9. 1: Plan for teaching Expressive Arts in Standard 7 from

## January to March, 2010

### Table 6.5a
### Plan for teaching Expressive Arts in Standard 7 from January to March, 2010

| Theme/ Topics | Outcomes | Learning experiences | Teaching methodologies | Pupils' Assessment | Teaching and learning resources |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1.Personal and general space | The Learners must be able to:<br>1.demonstrate boundaries of personal and general space<br>2.perform activities within personal and general space | 1. discussing meanings and of personal and general space.<br>2. drawing personal space<br>3. drawing general space<br>4. finding out activities requiring personal and general space.<br>5. dancing to music alone and in groups<br>6. drawing shapes | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. group work<br>4. practical<br>5. survey | 1. portfolio<br>2. self-assessment<br>3. peer assessment<br>4. teacher observation<br>5. rubrics | 1. the learners' experiences<br>2. an observation checklist<br>3. sticks<br>4. resource persons<br>5. raised diagrams<br>6. the local environment.<br>7. costumes<br>8. benches<br>9. hoops<br>10. rubrics<br>11. Braille paper<br>12.a cassette recorder<br>13.a radio<br>14. rubrics<br>15. drawing utensils |
| 2. Body movements | The learners must be able to:<br>1. demonstrate body movements in response to different rhythms<br>2. demonstrate familiar mirroring artistic activities | 1. Introducing musical notes<br>2. Introducing the time signature<br>3. Creating rhythm patterns<br>4. Moving in relation to rhythm patterns<br>5. Identifying local dances<br>6. Performing Local dances following a leader<br>7. Creating educational dances<br>8.Performing educational dances | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. group work<br>4. question and answer<br>5. brainstorming<br>6. pair work | 1. portfolio<br>2. self-assessment<br>3. peer assessment<br>4. rubrics | 1. coloured chalk<br>2. charts<br>3.marked pens<br>4. cartons<br>5. the Malawi National Anthem<br>6. cards<br>7. wall clock<br>8.musical instruments<br>9. dance attire<br>10.playing area<br>11. whistles<br>12. costumes<br>13. balls<br>14.mattresses<br>15.step boards<br>16.jumping ropes |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | 9. Naming various mirroring activities<br>10. Discussing various mirroring activities<br>11. Playing games such as aeroplane-racing in groups | | | |
| 3.Conveying cultural messages | Learners must be able to:<br>1.descibe the garments which convey different cultural messages<br>2.relate sounds to the message they convey for certain events of cultural significance<br>3. demonstrate posture and body movements that display cultural values | 1. Discussing garments which convey cultural messages<br>2. Making garments which depict cultural messages<br>3.Researching sounds that are used to convey messages<br>4. Matching sounds to events<br>5. Identifying postures and body movements that show cultural values<br>6. Dramatising how to show respect to different people<br>7. Identifying dances of cultural significance in the community<br>8. Performing cultural dances | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. question and answer<br>4. brainstorming<br>5. field visit<br>6.survey<br>7. dramatisation<br>8. group work<br>9.pair work<br>10. practical | 1. Peer-assessment<br>2. self assessment<br>3.portfolio<br>4. teacher observation | 1.garments for different occasions<br>2. clothing materials of different colours<br>3. pairs of scissors<br>4. rags<br>5. thread<br>6. needles<br>7. descriptions of cultural sounds that have meanings<br>8. shakers<br>9. attire |
| 5. Multi-cultural performance | Learners must be able to:<br>1. perform artistic activities from various cultures within Malawi<br>2. improvise attire for artistic performance of the various cultural practices | 1. Collecting and gathering materials for making attire<br>2. Sewing attire for cultural performances<br>3. Practising using the attire | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. question and answer<br>4. dramatisation<br>5. field-visit<br>6. group work<br>7. enter-educate | 1.portfolio<br>2.rubrics<br>3.self assessment<br>4.peer assessment<br>5.teacher observation | 1. cotton fabrics<br>2. sacks<br>3. fibre<br>4. portfolios<br>5. sewing needles<br>6.sewing thread |

**Source: Ministry of Education (2008). Malawi Primary Education Expressive Arts Teaching Syllabus for Standard 7**

## 9.2: Plan for teaching Expressive Arts in Standard 7 from April to May, 2010

### Table 6.5b
### Plan for teaching Expressive Arts in Standard 7 from April to May, 2010

| Theme | Outcomes | Learning experiences | Teaching methodologies | Pupils' Assessment | Teaching and learning resources |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1.Designing and construction | The Learners must be able to:<br>1.design musical instruments based on foreign models<br>2. make fashionable garments and artistic items based on modern styles<br>3. perform drama based on foreign plays | 1.identifying materials for making musical instruments such as:<br>-guitar<br>-drums<br>-flute<br>-banjo<br>2. making the musical instruments<br>3. practising playing the musical instruments<br>1. designing and cutting out patterns for the garments<br>2.sewing sports shirt/dress and pair of sports shorts<br>3.making macramé pot holder and wall hanging<br>4. displaying and marketing the art works<br>5. dramatising foreign plays such as 'Julius Caesar' 'Romeo and Juliet.'<br>6. marketing plays | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3.group work<br>4. practical<br>5.question and answer<br>6. dramatisation<br>7. displaying<br>8.project | 1.portfolio<br>2.self-assessment<br>3.peer assessment<br>4.teacher observation<br>5. rubrics | 1.talular<br>2.pieces of fabrics<br>3.tracing wheel<br>4.pairs of scissors<br>5.patterns<br>6. patterns<br>7. thread<br>8.sewing needles<br>9.strings<br>10.sign language interpreter<br>11. observation checklist<br>12. portfolio<br>13.rubrics |
| 2.Performing dances | The learners must be able to:<br>1.identify and produce various musical instruments used in both schools and home environment<br>2. describe occasions on which various local dances are performed .<br>3. develop | 1. Naming various musical instruments<br>2. using various musical instruments<br>3. costing and selling musical instruments<br>4. discussing occasions when local dances are performed<br>4. practising various dances depicting cultural values | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. group work<br>4. question and answer<br>5. singing<br>6. dancing | 1. portfolio<br>2. self-assessment<br>3. peer assessment<br>4. rubrics<br>5. teacher observation | 1. talular<br>2. sign language interpreter<br>3. pupils' experiences<br>4. resource persons<br>5. drums<br>6. songs<br>7. shakers<br>8. flutes<br>9. whistles<br>10. portifolio<br>11. observation |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | contemporary dancing styles based on traditional dances | 5. discussing contemporary dancing styles<br>6. creating contemporary dancing styles based on traditional dances | | | checklist<br>12. rubrics<br>13. dances |
| 3. Self expression through posters, dances, songs and plays | Learners must be able to:<br>1. produce posters on various themes pertaining to cross-cutting issues<br>2. demonstrate dances which revolve around cross-cutting issues<br>3. compose songs on cross-cutting issues<br>4. performing plays on cross-cutting issues | 1. composing songs on cross-cutting issues<br>2. singing songs to communicate messages about cross-cutting issues such as gender<br>3. acting out plays featuring cross-cutting issues such as;-environmental degradation<br>-corruption<br>4. producing a play on cross-cutting issues | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. question and answer<br>4. dramatisation<br>5. group work<br>6. pair work<br>7. practical | 1. Peer-assessment<br>2. self assessment<br>3. portfolio<br>4. teacher observation<br>5. rubrics | 1. talular<br>2.s ongs<br>3. plays<br>4. pupils' experiences<br>5. costumes<br>6. resource persons<br>7.observation checklist<br>8. portfolio<br>9.rubrics |
| 4. Artistic Skills and movements | Learners must be able to:<br>1. design items for various artistic activities<br>2. perform contemporary artistic activities | 1. making posters for various activities<br>2. carving various artistic items<br>3. weaving various artistic items<br>4. knitting various artistic items<br>5. knitting various artistic items<br>6. displaying the Items<br>7. imitating artistic activities shown on posters<br>8.singing Contemporary Songs<br>9.dancing to Contemporary songs<br>10. discussing the benefits of performing artistic activities | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. question and answer<br>4. modelling<br>5. group work<br>6. practical<br>7. mirroring<br>8. mirroring<br>9. singing | 1. teacher observation<br>2. peer assessment<br>3. self assessment<br>4. portfolio<br>5. rubrics | 1 talular<br>2. felt pens<br>3. papers<br>4. crayons<br>5. knitting wool<br>6. knitting needles<br>7. bamboos<br>8. sisal<br>9. palm leaves<br>10. drums<br>11. shakers<br>12.whistles<br>13. flutes<br>14. trumpets<br>15.portfolio<br>17. rubrics<br>15.observation checklist |

**Source: Ministry of Education (2008). Malawi Primary Education Expressive Arts Teaching Syllabus for Standard 7.**

## 9.3: Plan for teaching Expressive Arts curriculum in Standard 8 for January to March, 2010

### Table 6.6a

### Plan for teaching Expressive Arts curriculum in Standard 8 for January to March, 2010

| Theme | Outcomes | Learning experiences | Teaching methodologies | Pupils' Assessment | Teaching and learning resources |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1. Artistic creativity | Learners must be able to:<br>1. Describe movements in various artwork<br>2. show through artwork creatures whose movements they admire. | 1. performing body movements<br>2. painting following music tempo<br>3. imitating the movements of creatures | 1.demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. practical<br>4. question and answer<br>5. field visit<br>6. group work | 1. an observation checklist<br>2. portfolio<br>3. rubric | 1.the learners' experiences<br>2.an open ground<br>3. a drum<br>4.a whistle<br>5.the local environment<br>6. brushes<br>7. paints<br>8.coloured chalk<br>9. pieces of paper<br>10.pictures of creatures<br>11.pencils<br>12.Crayons<br>13.charcoal |
| 2.Leadership roles | Learners must be able to:<br>1. identify the leadership roles they can imitate<br>2. analyse the leadership roles practised. | 1. identifying types of leaders<br>2.discussing the successes and challenges of various leaders<br>3.discussing solutions tothe problems of the leaders. | 1. case study<br>2. question and answer<br>3. discussion<br>4. dramatisation<br>5. field-visit | 1. an observation checklist<br>2. portfolio<br>3.peer assessment<br>4.self assessment | 1.a resource person<br>2.the learners' experience<br>3.the local environment |
| 3. Self expression | 1. dance to express and communicate messages.<br>2. produce wall charts with different messages<br>3. design story-telling pictures<br>4. perform sports | 1. identifying dances that express and communicate messages<br>2. performing dances that communicate messages<br>3. designing patterns of wall | 1.demonstration<br>2. practical<br>3. discussion<br>4. gallery walk<br>5. question and answer | 1. observation checklist<br>2.s elf assessment<br>3. peer assessment<br>4. portfolio | 1. the learners' experiences<br>2. the local environment<br>4. shakers<br>5. drums<br>6. dances<br>7. songs<br>8. a whistle<br>9. resource |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | and games to express the importance of working together | charts<br>4. making wall charts using decorative stitches<br>5. making wall charts using appliqué<br>6. drawing pictures with stories on different cross-cutting issues.<br>7. role playing picture stories<br>8. identifying team sports and games that express the importance of working together.<br>9. playing team sports | | | persons<br>11. raised diagrams<br>12. sewing needles<br>13. thread of different colours<br>14. pieces of cloth<br>15. cartons<br>16. a pair of scissors<br>17. samples of decorative stitches<br>18. balls |
| 4. Artistic performance | 1.perform body movements covering general and personal space.<br>2. design items that meet the needs of the school and community<br>3.perform activities that depict events of cultural significance in their community | 1. performing body movements which cover distance.<br>2. performing body movements which do not cover distance<br>3. taking body measurements<br>4. cutting out pattern pieces<br>5. sewing a blouse and short-sleeved shirt<br>6. identifying materials and tools for making curios<br>7. making curios<br>8.decorating curios<br>9.marketing curios<br>10.identifying events of cultural significance<br>11.composing songs about events of cultural significance<br>12.dancing to songs sung during cultural events. | 1. discussion<br>2. demonstration<br>3. practical<br>4. question and answer | 1. portfolios<br>2. a rubric<br>3. observation checklist | 1. the learners' experiences<br>2. the local environment<br>3. indigenous musical instruments<br>4. curios<br>5. display tables<br>6. price tags<br>7.markers<br>8. raised diagrams<br>9. indegenous musical instruments<br>10. tape measures<br>11. fabric<br>12. patterns<br>13. pairs of scissors<br>14. adze<br>15. pins<br>16. carbon paper<br>17. tracing wheel |

**Source: Ministry of Education (2008). Malawi Primary Education Expressive Arts Teaching Syllabus**

## 9.4: Plan for teaching Expressive Arts curriculum in Standard 8 for April to May, 2010

**Table 6.6b**

**Plan for teaching Expressive Arts curriculum in Standard 8 for April to May, 2010**

| Theme | Outcomes | Learning experiences | Teaching methodologies | Pupils' Assessment methodologies | Teaching and learning resources |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1.Improv-isation | Learners must be able to:<br>1.identify materials which can be used as learning resources<br>2. produce learning resources | 1. listing materials which can be used as learning resources<br>2. collecting and gathering locally available materials for learning purposes<br>3. making simple teaching and learning resources<br>4. displaying the resources made<br>5.caring and storing of the resources | 1.brainstorming<br>2. discussion<br>3.excursion<br>4. practical<br>5. displaying<br>6. group work | 1. teacher observation<br>2. self assessment<br>3. peer assessment<br>4. rubrics<br>5. portfolio | 1. talular<br>2. portfolio<br>3. observation checklist<br>4. pencils<br>5. stones<br>6. felt pens<br>7. glue/paste<br>8. paints<br>9. markers<br>10. paper<br>11. thread<br>12. water<br>13. pens<br>14. sand<br>15. sawdust<br>16. grains<br>17. sign language interpreter<br>18. cartons<br>19. tables |
| 2.Team work | Learners must be able to:<br>1. collect materials for artwork in groups<br>2. make group products using different materials | 1. identifying materials for<br>- drawing<br>-weaving<br>-carving<br>2. discussing the use of the materials<br>3. preparing the materials for artefacts<br>3. producing the items<br>4. identifying possible Markets for the items<br>5. costing the products | 1. demonstration<br>2. discussion<br>3. group work<br>4. question and answer<br>5. practical | 1. teacher observation<br>2. peer assessment<br>3. portfolio<br>4. rubrics | 1. talular<br>2. clay<br>3. sisal<br>4. wood<br>5. adze<br>6. reeds<br>7. paint<br>8. paper<br>9. resource persons<br>10. sign language Interpreter<br>11. observation checklist<br>12. rubrics<br>13. portfolio |
| 3.Multi-cultural perform-ances | 1. perform dances from other cultures<br>2. produce simple | 1. identifying dances from different cultures<br>2. carving a | 1. brainstorming<br>2. discussion<br>3. excursion<br>4. practical | 1. teacher observation<br>2. self assessment | 1. talular<br>2. costumes<br>3. axe<br>4. adze |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | crafts from various cultures<br>3. perform situations using traditional and contemporary costumes<br>4. interpret different tempos and dynamics indicated on traditional and contemporary pieces of music | stool,weaving baskets, mats and making pots<br>3.decorating the items<br>4. marketing the items made<br>5.producing plays depicting events in the rural and urban settings<br>6. role playing various ceremonies using typical village and urban set-up.<br>7. singing songs of different tempos(allegro, staccato) and dynamics(forte, piano)<br>with message of gender and democracy<br>8. interpreting different tempos and dynamics on traditional and contemporary pieces of music | 5. demonstration<br>6. pair work<br>7. role play<br>8.dramatisation<br>9.singing<br>10.question and answer | 3. peer assessment<br>4. portfolio<br>5. rubrics | 5. paint<br>6. pens<br>7. reeds<br>8. markers<br>9. paper<br>10. pencils.<br>11. sign language interpreter<br>12. bamboos<br>13. saw<br>14, clay<br>15. panga knives |
| 4.Multi-cultural arts | 1. identify songs and dances from other African countries<br>2. design patterns from other<br>African countries for making attire for different occasions<br>3. use African stories to develop plays | 1. listing songs and dances from<br>2.Other African countries<br>2.performing songs and dances from other African countries<br>3. identifying patterns from other African countries for making attire<br>4. sewing attire using patterns from other African countries<br>5. developing plays from African stories<br>6. performing plays developed from African stories | 1. brainstorming<br>2. discussion<br>3. demonstration<br>4. dramatisation | 1. self assessment<br>2. peer assessment<br>3. teacher observation<br>4. practical<br>5. portfolio<br>6. rubrics | 1. talular<br>2. songs<br>3. musical instruments<br>4. observation checklist<br>5. story books<br>6. paper<br>7. pencils<br>8. markers<br>9. sign language interpreter<br>10. plays<br>11. pieces of fabrics<br>12. sewing needles<br>13. sewing thread<br>14. sewing machines<br>15. pairs of scissors<br>16. observation checklist<br>17. portfolio |

**Source: Ministry of Education (2008). Malawi Primary Education Expressive Arts syllabus**

## APPENDIX 10: PRODUCTIVE PEDAGOGY ANALYSIS OF SOME OF THE LESSONS OF EXPRESSIVE ARTS CAPTURED IN CHAPTER 7 OF THE THESIS

**10.1: Transcription and Analysis of lesson 41 of Expressive Arts taught by Teacher 11, in Standard 8, at school 'D,' an urban school on 08/03/2010**

| | Analysis |
|---|---|
| **7:30 a.m. Learners:** Good morning Madam.<br>**Teacher:** Good morning. How are you?<br>**Learners:** We are very well and how are you?<br>**Teacher:** I am very well.<br>**Learners:** Thank you Madam.<br>**Teacher:** Sit down. | |
| **Learners**: Thank you madam, you are welcome.<br>**Teacher**: Can you mention some of the things that are made locally at home. Your parents, your guardians make things using local materials. Can you mention them? | *Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom - background knowledge* |
| **Learner**: Clay pots<br>**Teacher:** Yes, clay pots, are we together?<br>**Learners(**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher**: What else?<br>**Learner**: Hoe handles<br>**Teacher**: Yes, hoe handles. From what?<br>**Learner**: Trees<br>**Teacher:** What else?<br>**Learners:** Flowers<br>**Teacher**: From what do they make flowers?<br>**Learner:** Plastic<br>**Teacher:** Yes, from plastic papers. What else?<br>**Learner:** Pistol<br>**Teacher**: O.k. Yes?<br>**Learner:** Motor<br>**Teacher:** A motor. A motor can be made from what?<br>**Learners(**in a chorus): Trees<br>**Teacher:** Yes, what else?<br>**Learner**: A winnower<br>**Teacher**: Yes, a winnowing basket. A winnowing basket can be made from what?<br>**Learner:** bamboo<br>**Teacher:** O.k. all these things you have mentioned are found in our environment. Are together?<br>**Learners(**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** Yesterday, I told you to bring some of these things that are around our environment. Have you brought them?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes.<br>**Teacher:** O.k. can you take out all these things. Take them out. Be in your groups. Today, we are going to look at a topic known as improvisation. Known as what? | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **Learners** ( in a chorus): Improvisation<br>**7:33 a.m. Teacher**: Improvisation. To improvise means to | |

| | |
|---|---|
| make something from local available materials instead of real things. Are we together?<br>(Teacher writes on the chalkboard the following; Making things using available local resources in place of real ones).<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** O.k. for example, a person might want to have a spoon. But he doesn't have money to buy a spoon. Instead of buying a real spoon, he can just carve a spoon from a piece of wood. So by making that spoon from wood, the person is doing what? he is improvising. Are we together?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** O.k. so we can use locally available resources instead of real things. Is this group C?<br>**Learners** (group C)**:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** What can you make from these resources? For example here, they have these maize leaves. What can you make from these leaves?<br>**Learner:** Door mats<br>**Teacher**: Do you know what door mats are?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher**: Yes, you can make door mats out of these maize leaves. And also table mats from such things. Are we together?<br>**Learners:** Yes.<br>**Teacher:** O.k., we have also got these kanjedza leaves. O.k. what things can you make from these ones?Yes, Charity?<br>**Learner):** Mkeka<br>**Teacher:** Yes. What else?<br>**Learner:** A broom<br>**Teacher**: What else? Only a broom? Yes<br>**Learner:** A hat<br>**Teacher:** Yes. Have you seen a hat all of you?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** O.k. it is there in Mangochi, eti?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes | |
| **Teacher:** Yes, people from Mangochi make hats. O.k. instead of going to the shops and buying real hats you can just make a hat from these ones. What else can you make? Yes?<br>**Learner:** Table mats<br>**Teacher:** Yes, table mats and door mats can all be made from these things. Not only that but also sleeping mats eti?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** Mkeka. O.k. now in your groups, I want you to start improvising. You improvise the things using whatever you have brought. Be in your groups right now. Let us go outside. Tipite panja eti? | Social skills - instrumental |
| **Learners** (in a chorus): Yes<br>**7:45 a.m.** (Learners go outside to make items from locally available materials which they brought from their homes with them. I am moving from one group to another observing what they are making. One group composed of 3 boys and 3 girls and | Social skills - instrumental |

| | |
|---|---|
| they are making a door mat from maize sheaves. Another group is making a doll from maize sheaves as well. Another group is carving a hoe handle from a tree trunk. Another group is making a broom from kanjedza leaves. Another group is making a pot from clay. Another group is making a mat from kanjedza leaves. The teacher at this point in time is chatting with colleagues, fellow teachers while the learners are going on their own making different items).<br>**Teacher:** Now let us see what you have made in your groups. Group 1?<br>**Learner(group 1):** A pot<br>**Teacher**: Group 1 has made a pot using what ?<br>**Learner (group 1):** soil.<br>**Teacher:** O.k., you have improvised a pot. If someone wants to cook but doesn't have a metal pot, no need to worry. Use the environment. Go and get soil and mould a pot. Are we together?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** Yes, they dry the pot and then they do what?<br>**Learner:** Burn<br>**Teacher:** Yes, they burn the pot. O.k. there is also this one. What is this one?<br>**Learner:** An aeroplane.<br>**Teacher:** O.k. this is a pot. But Oh, it is broken. They used a lot of water that is why it has broken. Don't use a lot of water. Are we together?<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** Don't sock the soil in water. O.k. let us look at group this group, what have you improvised? What is this?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): It is a mat.<br>**Teacher:** Thank you very much for this. You can also improvise a hat. If you want to wear a hat in your head and you don't have money to buy the hat, just improvise and wear it. O.k.<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): Yes.<br>**Teacher:** O.k. and what is this?<br>**Learner**: A radio<br>(The rest of the learners laugh at the improvised radio).<br>**Teacher:** O.k. in this group, most of them are girls, eti?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher**: Look at this. Most of the times, we think that only boys can improvise things. But look at these girls, they have improvised what?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus)**:** Broom.<br>**Teacher:** O.k. when you want to sweep and you don't have a broom, sometimes you ask yourself, what I am I going to use. You can use this one. So instead of looking for a real broom, you can improvise a broom like this one. Isn't it?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** So from today, don't just wait from your mother to buy you brooms, o.k. | Social skills - instrumental<br><br>Social skills- instrumental<br><br>Social skills – instrumental |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Learners** (in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** You can improvise your own brooms using these things. O.k. what about this. What is it?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Hoe handle<br>**Teacher:** Yes. You have seen people making hoe handles. You don't have money, what can you do. You can just cut down some trees and make a hoe handle and it can be a source of income but you can as well use them in your homes.<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): Yes | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **Teacher:** Even the girls can also improvise mats<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teachers:** O.k. in this group what is this?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Mat<br>**Teacher**: We say a door mat. O.k. a table mat. Since it is small then you can say it is a table mat eh?<br>**Learners**(in a chorus): Yes | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **Teacher:** But if it is big it can be a door mat. What about this one. What is it in your group?<br>**Learners(**in a chorus): A motorcycle<br>**Teacher:** A motor cycle? O.k. and a person is riding it eh?<br>**Learners**(in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** So it is a toy, eh? | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **Learners(**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** Yes, if a child wants a toy and says can you buy a toy for me you just say don't worry I will make it eti?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** Yes and you can make your kids happy, eti?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **Teacher:** And this one is also a toy. It is a car. You can improvise a car from children, o.k.?<br>**Learners**(in a chorus)**:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** Instead of doing bad things at home, they play using these toys, eti?<br>**Learners**(in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** What about this?<br>**Learners**: Soldier, soldier.<br>**Teacher:** Soldier amayenda chonchi eti?<br>**Learners(**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** A soldier is going somewhere with a gun<br>**Learners(**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** O.k. this is fine, eh? My son likes these things. So if | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| we meet sometime I will buy it for my son, eh?<br>**Learners**(in a chorsu): Yes<br>**Teacher:** O.k. as you go home,try to improve them. O.k. go and mould a good pot and make good brooms and decorate them. Are we together?<br>**Learners**(in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** the more you decorate the toys you want to sell, the higher the price. Are we together?<br>**Learners:** Yes. | *Social skills - instrumental* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher:** So you can keep your things. When you go home, go and finish them up. Go outside and wash your hands. | |
| *Instrumental knowledge is also emphasized in the lesson - this is so because there are a lot of social skills of dancing of traditional dances taught to learners to enable them participate effectively in their communities/societies.*<br>*There is connectedness to the world beyond the classroom. This is so because the teacher asks learners questions which enable them to connect what they are learning in the classroom with their everyday experiences in their homes.* | |

## 10.2: Transcription and Analysis of lesson 2 of Expressive Arts taught by Teacher 2, in Standard 7 at school 'A,' a rural school on 08/01/2010

| | |
|---|---|
| **11:50 a.m.: Teacher:** Good morning class<br>**Learners:** Good morning madam<br>**Teacher:** How are you?<br>**Learners:** We are very well madam and how are you?<br>**Teacher:** I am very well. Sit down<br>**Learners:** Thank you madam<br>**Teacher:** Yesterday, we learned about mirroring. We said that mirroring are activities which somebody can mirror from his friends. Can you tell me what we said mirroring is<br>**Learner:** Mirroring is an activity in which somebody imitates a friend.<br>**Teacher:** Yes?<br>**Learner:** Mirroring is an activity which you copy from a friend<br>**Teacher:** Yes<br>**Learner:** Mirroring is an action of copying.<br>**Teacher:** Yes, what else?<br>**Learner:** Mirroring is activity which someone can copy.<br>**11: 55: Teacher**: Mirroring is an art of copying an action, words or expressions. Yesterday, we looked at some of the activities which you copy from friends. Can you mention the activities which you copy from friends?<br>**Learner:** running<br>**Teacher:** Yes, another one?<br>**Learner:** jumping<br>**Teacher:** What else?<br>**Learner:** Dancing<br>**Teacher:** Yes, you?<br>**Learner:** Singing<br>**Teacher:** The activities you have mentioned are some of the activities which we said yesterday that you can copy from each other.<br>**12:00: Teacher:** Let us go to the ground to practice doing some of the mirroring activities which we discussed yesterday. | **<u>Analysis</u>**<br><br>*Social skills-instrumental*<br><br>*Social skills - instrumental*<br><br>*Intellectual quality - low order thinking; knowledge problematic - knowledge is represented as facts*<br><br>*Intellectual quality-low order thinking; knowledge problematic-knowledge is represented as facts* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **12:02: Teacher**: Can you be in groups of 10. I do not want to see groups of boys only and girls only. Can that group demonstrate running on one leg from there to there. Can the rest of the groups do exactly what you have seen your friends doing, running on one leg for 20 metres and back. You two, you are very stupid. Why are you doing your own things? Why are you not running?<br>**12:10 Teacher**: You, three of you come here. You are going to show to the rest what we are going to do next. Two of you are going to hold hands and someone is going to sit on your joined hands. You are then going to run from here to there. Can you do that? Can you be in threes and practice lifting each other on joined hands and run.<br>**12:15: Teacher**: Now we will do another activity which combines a song and dancing. The song is called "nzama-zama". Do you all know this song?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** Can you make a circle and move around the circle while you sing the song "nzama-zama."<br>**12:20: Teacher**: O.k., thanks, can you go back to class. | *Engagement with difference-inclusivity*<br><br>*Unsupportive classroom environment. Learners involved in disruptive behaviour*<br><br>*Knowledge integration*<br><br>*Social skills-instrumental* |
| *-The lesson illustrates low order thinking – this is so because learners provide short one word answers and there is no evidence of substantive conversation between the teacher and the learners and amongst the learners themselves.*<br>*-There is some connectedness of the lesson to the world beyond the classroom e.g. there is knowledge integration of physical education, dance and singing*<br>*-There is however no supportive classroom environment –this is so because some learners are involved in disruptive behavior and the teacher reprimands the learners harshly.*<br>*-There is also engagement with difference in the lesson.* | |

## 10.3: Transcription and Analysis of lesson 1 of Expressive Arts taught by Teacher 2, in Standard 7 at school 'A,' a rural school on 05/01/2010

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher:** Good morning class<br>**Learners:** Good morning madam<br>**Teacher:** How are you?<br>**Learners:** We are very well madam and how are you?<br>**Teacher:** I am very well. Sit down<br>**Learners:** Thank you madam<br>**Teacher:** Today, we will be looking at activities that you copy from others.<br>**10:05 a.m. Teacher**: Can you mention the things which you can copy from your friends?<br>**Learner:** Dance<br>**Teacher:** Dance. Any other?<br>**Learner:** high-jump<br>**Teacher:** High jump. Any other?<br>**Learner:** Running. | **<u>Analysis</u>**<br><br>*Social skills-instrumental* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **10:08 a.m. Teacher**: Can you go into your groups. (learners go into groups and there are an average of 10 learners at a group).<br>**Teacher:** In your groups, discuss the meaning of mirroring.<br>**10:15 a.m.** Teacher: Class representatives come and present what you have discussed in your groups. (Group representatives come in the front of the classroom to give their feedback)<br>Group 1: Mirroring is an activity in which somebody can demonstrate with a friend or a group.<br>Group 2: Mirroring are activities which somebody imitates with a friend.<br>Group 3: Mirroring are activities which somebody demonstrates with your friend.<br>Group 4: Mirroring is an action of copying.<br>Group 5: Mirroring is activity which someone can copy.<br>Group 6: Mirroring is an activity which you copy from a friend.<br>**10:30 a.m. Teacher:** Thank you very much. Mirroring is an art of copying an action, words or expressions. What is mirroring? Can we say together?<br>**Learners (in a chorus**): Mirroring is an art of copying an action, words or expressions.<br>**Teacher:** Any questions on the definition of mirroring? (there is no response from the learners)<br>**Teacher:** What are the examples of activities which you can copy from your friends in class.<br>**Learner:** writing<br>**Teacher:** writing. Any other?<br>**Learner:** singing<br>**Teacher:** singing. Yes?<br>**Learner:** drawing.<br>**Teacher:** Some of you are good at drawing and those of you who are not good at drawing should imitate your friends who are good at drawing.<br>**Teacher:** What activities can you copy from your friends at home?<br>**Learner:** sweeping<br>**Teacher:** Any other?<br>**Learner:** drawing water<br>**Teacher:** drawing water. Any other?<br>**Learner:** Playing football<br>**Teacher:** Any other? Yes?<br>**Learner:** Kulera ana<br>**Teacher:** Yes. Nursing a baby. What activities can you copy from your friends when you are playing at the | *Intellectual quality – low order thinking; lacks substantive conversation*<br>*Intellectual quality - low order thinking ; knowledge problematic- knowledge is represented as facts*<br>*Intellectual quality- low order thinking; knowledge problematic- knowledge is represented as facts*<br>*Connectedness to the world* |

| | |
|---|---|
| ground?<br>**Learner:** jumping<br>**Teacher:** Yes, jumping. Any other?<br>**Learner:** running.<br><br>**10:35 a.m. Teacher**: Now can you take note books and quickly answer these questions.<br>(teacher writes the following questions on the chalkboard<br>1. What is mirroring?<br>2. Mention two activities which you can copy from friends?<br>(the teacher goes around the classroom marking the of the pupils. She does the marking for about 5 minutes)<br>**10:40 a.m. Teacher**: Most of you failed to answer the questions correctly. What is mirroring?<br>**Learner:** Mirroring is an art of copying an action, words or expressions.<br>**Teacher:** Thank you very much. Mirroring is an art of copying an action, words or expressions. Our lesson ends here for today. Thank you very much for your | *beyond the classroom-background knowledge.*<br><br>*Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom-background knowledge.*<br><br>*Intellectual quality-low order thinking; knowledge problematic-knowledge is represented as facts.* |
| *-The lesson illustrates low order thinking – this is so because learners provide short one word answers and there is no evidence of substantive conversation between the teacher and the learners and amongst the learners themselves*<br>*-There is some connectedness of the lesson to the world beyond the classroom e.g. the home*<br>*-There is however no evidence of supportive classroom environment nor engagement with difference in the lesson* | |

## 10.4: Transcription and Analysis of lesson 32 of Expressive Arts taught by Teacher 12, in Standard 8, at school 'C,' a rural school 22/02/2010

| | |
|---|---|
| **8:00 a.m. Learners:** Good morning sir.<br>**Teacher:** Good morning. How are you?<br>**Learners:** We are very well and how are you?<br>**Teacher:** I am fine sit down. Yesterday we looked at songs that express and communicate messages. Today, we shall be looking at another thing. Our topic today is wall chart. Can everyone say wall chart.<br>**Learners**: Wall chart<br>**Teacher**:Wall chart<br>**Learners:** Wall chart<br>**8:01 a.m. Teacher**: Now, let us take our books, the Expressive Arts books. Look at page 9. There are some illustrations there. So I want you to look at them, study them. Have you seen them?<br>**Learners**: Yes | **<u>Analysis</u>** |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher:** So there are illustrations A and B. At that page we have two illustrations. We study them. The first illustration, what is it about?<br>(There is no response from the learners)<br>**Teacher**: Have you seen it?<br>**Learners**: Yes<br>**Teacher:** What is it about?<br>(There is no response from the learners)<br>**Teacher:** What can you see there? Anybody please? Yes, Masiku?<br>**Learner (Masiku):** A bird<br><br>**Teacher:** A bird, that's good. It is a bird. What is the name of the bird?<br>**Learner :** That is Kadzidzi<br>(Other learners laugh at their classmate for responding in Chichewa).<br>**Teacher**:In English<br>(There is no response from the learners)<br>**8: 03 a.m. Teacher**: In English we say Owl. It is an Owl.<br>(The teacher writes on the chalkboard the word Owl for the learners)<br>**Teacher:** Kadzidzi that is Chichewa name but in English it is an Owl. Can you say it together?<br>**Learners:** Owl<br>**Teacher**: What else can you see there? There is a bird, an Owl. What else is there on the same illustration?<br>**Learner:** I can see a branch of a tree.<br>**Teacher**: There is a branch of a tree. Is it true?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**8:04 a.m. Teacher**: Where is an Owl on that illustration. Where is it standing? Yes, Thokozani?<br>**Learner**: In a branch of a tree<br>**Teacher:** Aha, it is standing on a branch of a tree. That's good. Have you ever seen this bird?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher**: Now, let us see, look at illustration B, what is it about? Yes, Monica?<br>**Learner**: I can see a pot<br>**Teacher:** Is that true? Is that a pot?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**8:05 a.m. Teacher:** Yes, it is a pot. What else is there? Yes?<br>**Learner**: A shadow of a pot<br>**Teacher:** Yes, a shadow of a pot. So you can see there are things there just above the pot. What are they? There are some things there, what are they? Only the pot? Where do you think the pot is? In a house. Is the pot in a house?<br>**Learners:** No.<br>**Teacher:** O.k. where is it then? Have you studied the illustration, where do you think this pot is? Is it a real pot or | *Intellectual quality-low order thinking, there is no substantive conversation between the teacher and the learners.*<br><br>*Intellectual quality-low order thinking; one word is given* |

| | |
|---|---|
| a drawing?<br>**Learner:** A drawing<br>**Teacher:** So where is it now? Where have they drawn the pot? Yes, Masiku?<br>**Learner:** On the paper<br>**Teacher**:On a paper. So this is an illustration which is just a drawing and it is hanging somewhere, they have hanged it somewhere, where is it? Is it on a tree? This illustration is hanging somewhere, they have hanged it somewhere. I want the place, where have they hanged the illustration? All these two illustrations are hanged somewhere, where are they? Which place is this? Hanging imathanthauza kupachika, kukoleka zina zake. Tayang'anani mu class muno chilipo chomwe achita hang chinachake?<br>**Learners** : Ee.<br>**Teacher:** What is it?<br>**(**There is no response from the learners)<br>**8:08 a.m. Teacher**: So they have hanged it. Ndiye apachika patipo? Where have they hanged these things?<br>**Learner:** On the wall<br>**Teacher:** On the wall, is that true?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher**: What about these two illustrations, where have they hanged them? Yes, Pemphero?<br>**Learner:** On the wall.<br>**Teacher**: Ndi chonchotu. Inu simukuwona kuti chilli pakhoma pamenepo? Ee? China ndi chiyani mukuwona pamenepopo? They have hanged these things on the wall. Kodi zangoyima zokha zimenezozo popanda zoyimitsa? Timafuna zimenezozo. When you want to hang something, there must be something there. Yes, mention these things. What is this?<br>**Learner:** A nail<br>**Teacher**: Kodi chithunzicho changoyima chokha kapena akhazikapo chinachake, ndiye mukulephera kutchula kuti there is a nail there. Tayang'anani pa chithunzipo, palibe?<br>**Learners**: Ilipo<br>**Teacher:** Ndiye pali nail yokha pamenepo? Nail yo yangoyima payokha?<br>**Learners:** Ayi<br>**Teacher:** They have used what?<br>**Learners:** Chingwe<br>**Teacher:** They have used a string. So ndimafuna kuti mudziwe ziti? Zimenezo. Kodi inu simumadziwona zimenezo.<br>**Learneers:** Timaziwona<br>**Teacher:** So they have used a nail and a paper and they have also used a string to make this wall chart so we say it is a wall chart. Now let us discuss the materials which are used to make a wall chart. In our groups discuss the materials | *Intellectual quality - low order thinking; one word answer is given*<br><br>*Intellectual quality-low order thinking;lacks substantive conversation among the learners* |

| | |
|---|---|
| which can be used to make a wall chart. When you want to make a wall chart, what materials can be used to make that wall chart. One of the materials we have already seen which can be used to make a wall chart is a nail. We have seen a nail there. So what else can you use to make a wall chart? (I am sitting at a group composed of two girls and four boys. The teacher comes to this group and tells one of the boys to tell the girls in the group what materials are used for making a wall chart. The teacher says, muuzeni ameneyo zinthu zomwe timagwiritsa ntchito kuti tipange wall chart. The teacher gives the learners some expected responses. He says kuti muchikongoletse mumagwiritsa ntchito chiyani? One of the girls says; Creon. The teacher says, remember whatever you need kuti muchikongoletse. Kumbukirani zinthu zomwe mungagwiritse ntchito kuti mupange decorate. Decorate means kukongoletsa. He continues; yes, don't forget those things. One girl says; pencil. A boy says; ruler. Another girl says; rubber. The teacher asks them; how many have you written?)<br>**8:15 a.m. Teacher**: Have you finished?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** So we want you to tell us this group, can you tell us what materials are needed when you bare making a wall chart. Thokozani, tell us the materials which are needed or required to make a wall chart. Materials which can be used when you want to make a wall chart. Yes, Thokozani?<br>**Learner:** Strings<br>**Teacher:** Strings<br>**Learner:** Nails<br>**Teacher:** Nails<br>**Learner:** Pencils<br>**Teacher:** Pencils<br>**Learner:** Crayons<br>**Teacher:** Creyons. Is that what you have done there?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** So you have come up with papers, pencils, creyons, nails and strings. What else, ehe, your group.<br>**Learner:** Paper, pencil, creyons, strings, pental markers, rulers and rubbers.<br>**Teacher:** Very good. What about you there?<br>**Learner:** Papers, rulers, pencils, rubbers, strings.<br>**Teacher:** What else?<br>**Learner**: Nails<br>**Teacher:** Do we have other things?<br>**Learner:** Papers, pencils, strings, nails<br>**Teacher**: So those are the some of the materials to be used when you are making a wall chart. So we will make a wall chart. To design a wall chart. There are two types of wall charts. A bird there and we have also a pot. So you are going to make your own. You can make a picture of the trees and | *themselves.*<br><br>*Intellectual quality - low order thinking; lacks substantive conversation between the teacher and the learners*<br><br>*Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom* |

| | |
|---|---|
| you can also think of another thing which you can use. Think of the name of the plant which you are going to draw so everybody will be drawing. Choose something which you can draw. May be a tree, may a school, a house, people who are sick because of HIV/AIDS, the cutting down of trees . You can think of those things. Also things like a school girl or a school boy. You can draw anything which you can think about. You have your papers or you can open your exercise book where you are going to draw the wall chart. Design your wall chart. There is a ruler there, design your wall chart. Decorate it. Draw a very beautiful wall chart. We have crayons here.<br>(8:20 a.m. I go around the learners. They are drawing the following; a pot, a tree, an aeroplane, an elephant).<br>**8:21 a.m. Teacher**: Think of what you can draw. Pali zina zokhudzana ndi matenda a HIV/AIDS.Mukhoza kujambula kaya ndi chiyani, kaya ndi nthaka ikukokoloka. Some you can a draw a bicycle, a motor car or think of anything which you can draw. Think of a picture which can be drawn which can be a wall chart. Tili ndi ma crayons. Ndiye ma crayons amenewa alipo osiyanasiyana. You can draw a belt. You can draw a flour. You can also draw a plant.<br>( The teacher goes around the class and encourages them to draw different things. He also tells them that, you can also check in your learners text book and draw some of the things which you see in those textbooks. He tells them that; osati aliyense azingojambula animal, animal basi. You can draw a good flour and decorate it. You can draw a flower and decorate the leaves of that flower.)<br>**8:30 a.m. Teacher**: When you have finished drawing your things, you can use the crayons to decorate them. Pali zinthu zambiri zomwe tingathe kujambula eti?<br>**Learners:** Ee.<br>**Teacher:** Mutha kujambula mipando, matebulo. Our lesson today ends up here. | *Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom.*<br><br>*Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom* |
| *--There is low order thinking in the lesson-this is so because there is lack of substantive conversation between the teacher and the learners and among the learners themselves during group work.*<br>*-There is connectedness of the lesson to the world beyond the classroom - this is so because the teacher is teaching learners to draw pictures on topics or issues which affect the learners' everyday lives such as HIV/AIDS.* | |

**10.5: Transcription and Analysis of lesson 40 of Expressive Arts taught by Teacher 3, in Standard 8, at school 'B,' an urban school on 05/03/2010**

| | |
|---|---|
| **7:30 a.m. Learners:** Good morning Madam.<br>**Teacher:** Good morning. How are you?<br>**Learners:** We are very well and how are you?<br>**Teacher:** I am very well.<br>**Learners:** Thank you Madam.<br>**Teacher:** Sit down.<br>**Learners**: Thank you madam, you are welcome. | ***Analysis*** |
| **Teacher**: Today we will discuss about songs, about singing. Are we together?<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher**: O.k., can you explain why people sing? Why do you think people sing. I want you to be in groups and discuss reasons why people sing. Are we together?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** O.k. so I am giving you 20 minutes to discuss and a secretary in your group should be taking down some notes on why people sing. | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **7:33 a.m. (**Learners go into groups to discuss the reasons why people sing. I am sitting with a group composed of 3 boys and 3 girls. One girl says, "education day." The other boy says, "yes, education day." The other boy says, "tipereke zifukwa zimene anthu amayimbira." A girl says, "to transmit messages." A girl says, "to transmit messages on HIV/AIDS."A boy says, "yina? another point?" A boy says, "to spread word of God." A boy says, "basi zomwezi?" Another boy says, "basi zakwana." | *Low order thinking; lacks substantive conversation* |
| **8:50 a.m. Teacher**: I think you are through.<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher**: O.k. group one, can you give us reasons why people sing?<br>**Learner (group 1):** Number 1, to show their talents and culture<br>**Teacher:** To show their talents and culture, good. | |
| **Learner (group 1):** to transmit messages about HIV/AIDS<br>**Teacher**: O.k.<br>**Learner** (group 1): to spread the word of God<br>**Teacher:** To spread messages about what?<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): The word of God.<br>**Learners (**group 1**):** During Christmas day<br>**Teacher:** O.k. during Christmas day. | *Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom* |
| **Teacher:** Good. Let us give them a hand of twinkle<br>(Teacher leads the learners in singing the song twinkle, twinkle little star, how I wonder what you are).<br>**Teacher:** Yes can you tell us group 2?<br>**Learner(group 2):** Express and communicate messages. | *Supportive classroom environment* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher**: Yes to express and communicate messages. Good.<br>**Learner(in group2):** To decorate stitches<br>**Teacher:** To decorate what? Stitches?<br><br>**Teacher:** No, this is about music and not sewing.<br>**Learner(group 2):** to spread messages.<br>**Teacher:** To spread messages, O.k. So we sing to spread messages about HIV/AIDS. O.k. let us move to group 3.<br>**Learner(group 3):** To tell about HIV/AIDS<br>**Teacher:** Yes<br>**Learner(group 2):** Singing about culture<br>**8:38 a.m. Teacher**: Yes?<br>**Learner (group 2):** To spread the word of God.<br>**Teacher:** O.k. another group, group 4, can you tell us what you have discussed?<br>**Learner (group 4):** For entertainment<br>**Teacher:** For entertainment, yes?<br>**Learner(group 4):** for preventing culture<br>**Teacher:** What? To prevent culture<br>(Other learners laugh at their colleague)<br>**Teacher:** O.k. who can assist her? Yes<br>**Learner:** To show culture<br>**Teacher**: To show culture, yes? Now group 5 tell us what you have discussed. Where is group 5? Group 5, where are you?<br>**Learner(group 5):** To transmit messages.<br>**Teacher**: Yes?<br>**Learner(group 5):** For weddings<br>**Teacher:** For weddings. That is very good for this group. Group 6. Give us reasons why people sing?<br>**Learner(group 6):** For entertainmnet<br>**Teacher:** Yes?<br>**Learner(group 6):** To show love and enjoy<br>**Teacher**: Yes, to show love and enjoyment. Is it true?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** Yes, group 6 can you continue.<br>**Learner (group 6):** To your culture<br>**Teacher:** Yes? Our culture<br>**Learner (group 6):** Happiness during birthday<br>**Teacher:** Yes, people sing to communicate messages during birthday. Again during assembly you were also singing, isn't it ?<br>**Learners (in a chorus):** Yes<br>**Teacher:** So singing for entertainment is the same as for pleasure. You sing to entertain people, to please people.To make people feel happy. Are we together?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** To show culture. O.k. those traditional dances that are performed during education day and in other occasions such as during wedding ceremonies or even during funerals, people are sing. Other songs also may express what?sadness. They show what? | *Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom*<br><br>*Knowledge integration*<br><br>*Engagement with difference - cultural knowledge*<br><br>*Supportive classroom environment*<br><br>*Engagement with difference - cultural knowledge* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Learners (**in a chorus): Sadness.<br>**Teacher:** Sadness or sorrow. O.k., that is during the funeral ceremonies. Are together?<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): Yes<br>**Teacher:** So people sing for various reasons. Now can you, ah, today we are going to look at songs that are sung for enjoyment. Just singing for enjoyment, pleasure, are we together?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes | |
| (Teacher writes on the chalkboard the following; singing for enjoyment- express and communicate messages; - spread word of God; - entertainment; - show culture; express sadness).<br>**Teacher**: Are we together?<br>**Learners (**in a chorus): Yes | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **Teacher:** O.k., can you just sing one song that you sing here at school that expresses happiness or enjoyment. Sing one song. Just remember what we sing at the assemblies. I want you to sing using saprano, tenor and bass. I want you to sing using what?<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): Saprano, tenor and bass.<br>**Teacher:** Now let sing one song which shows enjoyment. | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| (Teacher leads the learners in singing the song: We are walking in the light of God, Allelujah, we are walking in the light of God. We are walking in the light of God)<br>**Teacher:** We are walking in the light of God Allelujah!<br>**Learners** (singing together): We are walking in the light of God. We are walking in the light of God.<br>**Teacher:** Ok. In your song you are saying you are walking isn't it?<br>**Learners:** Yes | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **Teacher:** So can you be walking then when you are singing the song to show that you are indeed enjoying.<br>**Learners**: Yes.<br>**Teacher:** One, two, one, two, step, step<br>**Learners** (singing and walking to the song): We are walking in the light of God, we are walking, we are walking. We are walking in the light of God. Tilinkuyenda kuwala kwa a Ambuye Alllelujah, tilinkuyenda kuwala kwa Ambuye. Tilinkuyenda, tilinkuyenda, tilinkuyenda kuwala kwa Ambuye(they sing this song for 4 minutes).<br>**Teacher:** Have you enjoyed?<br>**Learners (in a chorus):** Yes | *Social skills - instrumental* |
| **Teacher:** Thank you for enjoying. Sometimes we need to enjoy. O.k. now we want to continue singing for enjoyment. I have got a song. This song is also for enjoying.<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** On the chalkboard there, I have drawn what?<br>**Learner:** A fish<br>**Teacher:** Where does the fish move?<br>**Learner:** In the waters<br>**Teacher**: Yes, as the fish is moving in the water, do you enjoy its movements<br>**Learners:** Yes | *Knowledge integration* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher:** Do you?<br>**Learners (in a chorus):** Yes<br>**Learner:** Because the fish swims in the water<br>**Teacher:** The fish swims in the water eti?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** Sometimes you think that if I was a fish, I would enjoy swimming in the water. What else do you admire.<br>**Learner:** A bird<br>**Teacher:** Why?<br>**Learner:** It flies<br>**Teacher:** It flies where?<br>**Learners (in a chorus)**: In the sky<br>**Teacher**: Yes, it flies in the sky. What else do you admire?<br>**Learner:** A dolphin<br>**Teacher:** Do you all know what a Dolphin is?<br>**Learners:** No<br>**Teacher**: You, can you describe what a Dolphin is?<br>**Learner:** It looks like a fish, it is a big fish.<br>**Teacher:** Yes, it is a fish with a pointed face. Are together?<br>**Learners:** Yes<br>**Teacher:** This fish is not found in Malawi. It is found in big oceans. Are we together?<br>**Learners**: Yes<br>**Teacher:** So he says that he admires a Dolphin. Why do you admire a Dolphin?<br>**Learner:** Because when it swims, it jumps.<br>**Teacher:** O.k. what else do you admire?<br>**Learner:** A dove<br>**Teacher:** She admires a dove. Why do you admire a dove?<br>(there is silence from the learner) | |
| **Teacher:** O.k because it represents the Holy Spirit. You remember the story of the baptism of Jesus Christ in the river Jordan?<br>**Learners**: Yes<br>**Teacher:** Can you explain what happened in the baptism of Jesus in the river Jordan? Yes<br>**Learner:** The heaven was opened and a dove came<br>**Teacher**: O.k. he is saying the heavens got opened and the Holy Spirit came in form of a dove. Are together?<br>**Learners:** Yes | *Social skills-instrumental* |
| **Teacher:** So once you see a dove you see a symbol of the Holy Spirit. Like the Indians, they don't eat doves, they just keep them. When you go to the Indian places a dove can fly on your head or some of them can stand on your head and you don't kill them. O.k. now, let us turn to this song. We sing it like this; we are happy and enjoying today, we are happy and enjoying today like a fish swimming in the water, we are happy and enjoying today, ia, ia, ia, we are happy and enjoying today.<br>**7:53 a.m. Learners** (singing together): We are happy and enjoying today like a fish swimming in the water, we are happy and enjoying today. | *Social skills-instrumental* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher:** Now can I hear soprano on the words, ia, ia, aa<br>**Learners(**singing soprano): ia, ia, aa.<br>**Teacher:** Now can I hear Otto<br>**Learners(**singing Otto): ia, ia, aa.<br>**Teacher:** Now can I hear the bass<br>**Learners** (singing bass): ia, ia, aa.<br>**Teacher:** Tonse pamodzi<br>**Learners (**singing together): ia, ia, aa.<br>**Teacher:** Now what have we learned today?<br>**Learners** (in a chorus): Singing songs<br>**Teacher:** Yes. We can show enjoyment when singing a song. For example when we say, ia, ia, aa, in the song which we have just been singing, we can be waving to the right and to the left. So this is one of the songs showing enjoyment. So we stop there today but for home work, I want you to look for and compose your own songs. O.k. tomorrow I will ask you to sing me the songs which you will compose for enjoyment. | |
| *-Instrumental knowledge is emphasized in the lesson-this is so because there is a lot of social skills of singing taught to learners to enable them participate effectively in their communities/societies.*<br>*-There is connectedness to the world beyond the classroom. This is so because the teacher asks learners questions which enable them to connect what they are learning in the classroom with their everyday experiences in their homes.*<br>*-There is knowledge integration in the lesson. This is so because knowledge of music is integrated with knowledge on HIV/AIDS.*<br>*-There is engagement with difference in the lesson. This is so because cultural knowledge is legitimized.*<br>*-There is low order thinking in the lesson. This is so because there is lack of substantive conversation between the teacher and the learners and among the learners themselves. Learners are also usually giving one word responses to a teacher's question.*<br>*-There is connectedness to the world beyond the classroom. This is so because the teacher asks learners questions which enable them to connect what they are learning in the classroom with their everyday experiences in their homes.*<br>*-Instrumental knowledge is emphasized in the lesson-this is so because there is a lot of social skills of singing taught to learners to enable them participate effectively in their communities/societies.*<br>*-There is connectedness to the world beyond the classroom. This is so because the teacher asks learners questions which enable them to connect what they are learning in the classroom with their everyday experiences in their homes.*<br>*-There is knowledge integration in the lesson. This is so because knowledge of music is integrated with knowledge on HIV/AIDS.*<br>*-There is engagement with difference in the lesson. This is so because cultural knowledge is legitimized.*<br>*-There is low order thinking in the lesson. This is so because there is lack of substantive conversation between the teacher and the learners and among the learners themselves. Learners are also usually giving one word responses to a teacher's question.*<br>*-There is connectedness to the world beyond the classroom. This is so because the teacher asks learners questions which enable them to connect what they are learning in the classroom with their everyday experiences in their homes.* | |

## 10.6: Transcription and Analysis of lesson 13 of Expressive Arts taught by Teacher 6 in Standard 8 at school 'A,' a rural school on 26/01/2010

| | |
|---|---|
| 8:00 a.m. Teacher: Good morning. How are you?<br>Learners: We are very well madam, how are you?.<br>Teacher: We are looking at contemporary and traditional music. We are specifically looking at some of the things that are found in music. We are especially now looking at tempo and dynamics. Are we together?<br>Learner: Yes.<br>Teacher: Now, first of all let us look at the term tempo. What is it? What is tempo? O.k. We are saying tempo. These are marks indicated at the beginning of a song(code switches: kodi Chichewa chake tingati chiyani. Tingati chizindikiro. We are looking at this thing here. Chimenechi tingati ndi chizindikiro chomwe tingachipeze pa nyimbo zomwe tikuyimbira tempo. Like a Manganje song. Tatiyimbirani Manganje song yina iliyonse imene ndipo tiwone kuti tempoyo tikupezapo chiyani. Angayambitse ndani?<br>Learner: I think I will start.<br>Teacher: Jenifer? Yinayake ya common yomwe amayamba kuti..m'bale mungalapa eeh!<br>(Learners join the teacher in the song and they sing for some 5 minutes).<br>Teacher: The tempo has this mark. This mark is called what?<br>Learners: Exclamation mark<br>Teacher: In Chichewa, this exclamation mark is called what?<br>Learners: Mfuuliro<br>Teacher: It is called exclamation mark.<br>8: 10 a.m. (there is some interruption of the lesson for some 3 minutes).<br>8:13 a.m. Teacher: Ok.pamene mwawona kuti mchiganizo cha m'Chichewa, mawu alembedwa ndi exclamation mark chimathanthauza kuti mawuwo ndi ofuula. We are talking of these marks in tempo. We are talking of what? We are talking of tempos. Certain tempos are indicated by marks. So these marks ndizo zimamuwuza munthu uja kuti the tempos can be fast or slow. Chizindikiro china chilichonse chimamuza munthu uza zoti achitye. O.k. now from there, we are now looking at dynamics. O.k., that is now dynamics in what? Dynamics in music. What are dynamics in music? This refer to the degree of loudness and softness. It refers to the degree of loudness or softness but it is now in what? In music, isn't it? O.k. kodi degree imeneyiyi ibwerapo bwanji. Kapena kodi degree imeneyiyi tiyidziwa bwanji? Amene tinayimbapo kwaya timadziwa eti? Kuti nyimbo ikwere mwina kuti itsike amatipatsa sayini eti? Those are called tempo in music. Koma now we are talking of dynamics. Kuti muyimbe nyimbo | Analysis<br><br>*Social skills instrumental*<br><br>*Intellectual quality-deep knowledge-central ideas and concepts of music are covered.* |

| | |
|---|---|
| motsikirapo akupatsani sainin yoti muymbe nyimboyo motsikirapo. Kuti muyimbe mokwezerapo akupatsani sayini yoti muyimbe nyimboyo motsikirapo. So we are talking of dynamics as the degree of loudness or softness in music. Now in dynamics, there are tempos that are used for example, we have this symbol here known as Pp. It is a symbol that is used in music especially in dynamics. This Pp is standing for pianism. Pianism there is meaning singing very softly. O.k., that is a symbol in dynamics.<br>We have another symbol in dynamics. This is P alone and it is known as piano. This symbol piano there stands for singing softly. We have another sign Mp. This Mp stands for Mezzo piano. This symbol Mezo piano stands for singing softly. We have another symbol again known as MF. These symbols are found in Dynamics. MF is Mezofotre. Now, what does this word Mezofotre mean in music. It means singing moderately loud(code switches: ndiye pamenepa tayamba kubwereranso tsopano eti? Now, from there we have F. This F here it means Fotre. Now, does the symbol Fotre mean, it means singing loudly. O.k. we have another symbol which is now FF. FF standas for Fortissimo(tilimodzi ngati?<br>Learners: Eeh!<br>Teacher: Now, Fortissimo ameneyu means singing very loudly. Tilimodzi ngati?<br>Learners: Eeh!<br>Teacher: O.k. we have another symbol FP, this means Forte Piano. O.k. we have looked at the meaning of F as singing loudly and P which means singing softly. Now we have the symbol FP, what will this symbol mean now? Eeh?<br>Learner: singing softly, loudly.<br>Teacher: This therefore means singing both softly and loudly. Now, we have looked at all symbols in dynamics. We have P which means piano and it means singing softly. We have again Pp. standing for pianism which means singing very softly. We have Mp which stands for Mezzo piano and it means singing moderately softly. We have MF which stands for Mezofotre and it means singing moderately loud. We have F which stands for Fotre and it means singing loudly. We have and it stands for Fortissimo which means singing both softly and loudly. We have other symbols in music. Like, we have a symbol for crescendo which means getting louder. We have also a symbol for decrescendo which means getting soft. If you see these symbols in music it means you have to either to sing loudly or softly when you come across those symbols.<br>8:18 a.m. Those who have Expressive Arts books, can you open your books on page 32. O.k. we have there musical symbols, eti? Can you read that song silently. We have the song there. Who can sing that song song using the cresceno and | *Intellectual quality-deep knowledge-central ideas and concepts of music are covered.*<br><br>*Intellectual quality-deep knowledge-central ideas and concepts of music are covered* |

| | |
|---|---|
| decrescendo symbols.<br>Learner: Tambala walira kokoliriko, dzukani thamangirani kuntchito zanu.<br>8:18 a.m. Teacher: Tambala walira kokoliriko, dzukani thamangirani kuntchito zanu, dzukani thamangirani kuntchito zanu. Thukuta lanu lagula ufulu. Now you will be following me, Tambala walira kokoliriko...<br>(teacher and learners sing the song for 5 minutes).<br>8:22 a.m. Teacher: Another 2 minutes, let us sing again. Tambala walira kokoliriko. We are looking at tempo dynamics. If you look at this song, we have crescendo there. Where is the crescendo?<br>Learner: Ooo! Wefuwefu<br>Teacher: Do we have crescendo there? Can you check?<br>Learners: No<br>Teacher: So where is the crescendo<br>Learner: Aaah! Nong'onong'o<br>Teacher: Is there a crescendo there?<br>Learners: No<br>Teacher: Any one else?<br>Learner: Tambala..<br>Teacher: Yes, we have a crescendo there. Where do we have the decrescendo?<br>Learner: Kokoririko<br>Teacher: Where else do we have a decrescendo there?<br>Learner: Dzukani<br>Teacher: Ya! You have those symbols to show you where you should sing loudly and softly. I have another example here(teacher writes on the chalkboard: FF-maphunziro ndiwo chuma cham'dziko la Malawi. F-maphunziro ndiwo chuma. P-Mmmh. F- Ndiwo chuma. P-Anyamata bwerani. P-Mmmh!<br>F- Bwerani kusukulu. P-Mmmh! Mmmh!. Now, do not forget that we have P here which means singing softly. We have again Pp. which means singing very softly. We have Mp which means singing moderately softly. We have MF which means singing moderately loud. We have F which means singing loudly and so on and so forth. Now, who can lead us in this song, Maphunziro ndiwo chuma cha m'dziko la Malawi?<br>Learner: Maphunziro ndiwo chuma cham'dziko la Malawi<br>Learners: Mmmh!<br>(Learners sing this song for 3 minutes).<br>Teacher: One more time please, can you sing it again. From there (zikukoma eti?), now these are the same symbols which you can find in other songs in Malawi (code switches: ndiye pang'onopang'ono tipezeka kuti enafe tayamba kudziwa kuyimba nyimbo using these symbols. We have these symbols here, these crescendos and these descrescendos. All these are symbols which are found in dynamics(code switches: tilimodzi ngati? Now, with that we are through with our topic on tempo and symbols in dynamics in contemporary and traditional | *Intellectual quality - deep understanding- response of a learner shows depth of understanding of concepts and ideas of music*<br><br>*Intellectual quality - Deep knowledge-there is coverage of central ideas and concepts of music*. |

| | |
|---|---|
| music. When we aresaying traditional music, tikukamba music ngati itiyo? Ndi nyimbo monga ngati ziti? Za manganje. Nanga contemporary music? This is the opposite of the traditional music. We have the traditional and the new ones and the contemporaly ones. Now, we are saying that the contemporary music is not new but it is just the improved ones or its tunes have been improved. So that is all what I had on contemporary and traditional music. O.k. do you have questions.<br>Learner: Why are you using these symbols?<br><br>Teacher: Now, I am not the one using these symbols. Anthu omwe ndi akatswiri pa nyimbo amatha kuyilemba nyimbo yija mongogwiritsa ntchito these symbols. Tikumvana eti? Anthu ena ndi akatswiri pongolemba nyimbo koma sakatswiri poyimba. Ndiye olemba nyimbowo amalemba nyimboyo ndikuyikamo tima symbols ndipo munthu wina wodziwa kuyimba nyimboyo amatha kuyimba bwinobwino potsatira ma symbols aja. Tikumvana eti? | |
| Learners: Eeh! | |
| *There is high intellectual quality in the lesson. This is because the lesson provides the learners with an opportunity to learn about important concepts and processes in depth rather than superficially.*<br>*-There is also deep understanding on the part of the learners of the concepts taught in the lesson-this is so because responses of students provide evidence of depth of understanding of concepts and ideas of music.* | |

## 10.7: Transcription and Analysis of lesson 26 of Expressive Arts taught by Teacher 12 at school 'C,' a rural school on 12/02/2010

| | |
|---|---|
| **8:00 a.m. Learners:** Good morning sir.<br>**Teacher:** Good morning. How are you?<br>**Learners:** We are very well and how are you?<br>**Teacher:** I am fine sit down. Yesterday, we discussed about the roles of the leaders. We also talked about the characteristics of a leader and their leadership styles. Is there anybody who can tell us what is a leader? Or who is a leader? Who is a leader. We discussed yesterday. Yes, Emma.<br>**Learne r (Emma):** A leader is a person who leads other people.<br>**Teacher**: A leader is a person who leads others, isn't it? Very good.<br>**8:01 a.m. Teacher**: We also talked about the leadership styles. Can you list the leadership styles which we discussed? Leadership styles. Yes?<br>**Learner:** Majority rules.<br>**Teacher**: Is that a leadership style? | **<u>Analysis</u>**<br><br>*Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom.* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Learner**: Dictatorship<br>**Teacher**: That is very good. Sometimes we say what?<br>**Learner**: Autocratic<br>**Teacher:** Yes, that is true. We have another leadership style. What is this leadership style?<br>**Learner:** Democratic.<br>**Teacher**: That is very good. Do we have another one? Girls?<br>**Learners:** Lesseffeire<br>**8:02 a.m. Teacher**: Lesseffeire, yes, that is very good. Now, can you explain the characteristics of a lesseiffeire.<br>**Learner:** people do what they want<br>**Teacher**: Aha, in this leadership, lesseffeire, people do what they want. What about in democratic leadership? Yes, Masiye?<br>**Learner:** Majority rules.<br>**Teacher:** Majority rules. Those are the characteristics of the democratic leadership. What is the other characteristics of the democratic leadership ? One majority rules?<br>**Learner:** Leader takes no sides.<br>**Teacher:** Yes, the leader takes no sides, that is true, the leader takes no sides. Do we have another one there?<br>**Learner:** People work together<br>**8:04 a.m. Teacher**: People work together, that is very good. Do we have characterisitics of autocratic leadership? Or dictatorship leadership style? Just give me one of the characteristics. All these leadership styles have their own characteristics. What about the autocratic? | |
| **Learner:** People like to live in fear<br>**Teacher:** People live in fear. Isn't it?<br>**Learners:** Yes.<br>**Teacher:** Is there anyone else who can add another one to this? You have people living in fear, who else can add another one?<br>**Learner:** There is a lot of gossipping<br>**Teacher:** There is a lot of gossiping. That is very good. People talk a lot about the leader because the leadership style is not good. Because of this bad leadership, people talk of the leadership which is there at that time. So the people live in fear. Do you have another point? Grace? | *Intellectual quality - deep understanding* |
| **Learner (Grace):** There is no second opinion. If the leader says do this, all the people have just to do what their leader tells them to do without opposing that. You can not even ask questions otherwise you can just face problems.<br>**Teacher:** Do we have another point to add there apart from the fact there is no second opinion to what the leader tells the people to do? Do you have another characteristic to add? | *Intellectual quality - deep understanding* |
| **Learner**: Only the leader's voice count. What the leader says is the only thing which can be done. No body can say or can give ideas. No other ideas are welcome. Only the leader says this and so the people do whatever their leader tells them to do. The people just follow what the leader is telling them to do.<br>**Teacher:** That's good. Now today, we want to continue with the | *Intellectual quality - deep knowledge* |

| | |
|---|---|
| same topic of leadership roles but we are having the successes and challenges of leadership. Successes and challenges in leadership, that's the topic of today.<br>(the teacher writes on the board the topic of the day as successes and challenges of leadership. We have seen the leaders of different styles. The leaders who practice democracy and the leaders who are dictators. The different types of leaders have different successes and challenges. Challenges is the same as problems. The leaders meet successes and challenges. Atsogoleri aja amakumana ndi zinthu zovuta ndi zina zosavuta. Akakhala mumidzi muja amakumana ndi zina zovuta kuti ayen detse utsogoleri wao. Zimene zimakanikitsa atsogoleri kuti ayendetse bwino utsogoleri wao ndi ma challenges. Zimene zimakanika zija ndiye ma challenges. So we want o look at those things. Komanso tiwonanso, we are going to see how to solve those problems. How to find the solutions to those problems. Three things we are going to look at this morning. So we are going to be in groups. We are going to look at successes of leaders. Number two, we will look at problems or challenges. Number 3 we are looking at the solutions. Tikambirana kuti when the leaders akamayendetsa za utsogoleri wao amakumana ndi zovuta zotani. Komanso nthawi zina they meet problems which hinders them to do their work well. Amakumana ndi mavuto komanso palinso njira zina zoti akhoza kuthetsera mavuto aja. So we are going to have groups one and 2 to discuss the successes . Group 3 and 4 will discuss the problems which leaders meet and you will also discuss the solutions to the problems which leaders face.<br>( I am sitting with group 1 which is composed of 4 girls and 1 boy. At 8:21 a.m. the teacher comes up to this group and guides the group on their discussions. He tells the group to write down the following facts; when leaders face challenges, they should not give up but they should find solutions to their challenges. He further tells them to put down the following responses in their note books; the leader should delegate, kodi kuti ziyende bwino, ma leaders azitani. Kodi mavuto akapezeka azichita chiyani kuti zinthu ziziyenda bwino. Kodi mavuto akapezeka anthuwo azitani kuti zinthu ziziyenda bwino. One girl learner reads from her notes the following; leaders should not give up when they find problems but they should face up the challenges. Another girl learner says, encouraging, kuwalimbikitsa. Another urges fellow classmates to give another point. The teacher comes to this group again at 8:35 a.m. and tells the learners to write the following facts; the leader should practice justice, the leader should encourage people to work together, the leader should encourage people to work in unity, the leader should practice justice, the leader should encourage unity, the leader should not take any sides. Write things like these. Pamenepopo simukuwona kuti zikhoza kugwira? Learners say yes to the points given to them by the teacher. A mfumu akagonera mbali imodzi anthu amati a mfumu a chabe ndi aziphuphu akukondera.<br>**8:25 a.m. Teacher:** Can representatives of the groups come and | *Engagement with difference - narrative teaching.* |

| | |
|---|---|
| write on the chalkboard what they have come up with from their group discussions.<br>**Group 1 representative**: problems/challenges which leaders meet/face are;<br>- concerning leadership<br>- jealousy<br>- some people do not accept change<br>- fought<br>**Group 2 representative**: successes of leaders<br>- sharing coupons for people<br>- sharing things<br>**Group 3 representative**: solutions of the problems/ challenges which leaders meet/face<br>- the leader take no sides.<br>**8:26 a.m. Teacher**: Today's lesson ends here. We shall continue tomorrow. | |
| *- There is instrumental knowledge taught in the lesson-this is so because the learners are taught a lot of skills which is not academic knowledge but it is knowledge which can just enable them to participate effectively in the social lives of their communities.*<br>*- There is deep knowledge covered in the lesson-this is so because the lesson covers central ideas and concepts of the lesson topic in depth.*<br>*- There is deep understanding of learners in the lesson-this is so because the responses of learners provide evidence of depth of understanding of concepts and ideas being covered in the lesson.*<br>*- There are areas within the lesson however in which there is a lot of expository teaching. The teacher just gives information to the learners without the learners being given much opportunity to create knowledge within the teaching and learning process.* | |

## 10.8: Transcription and Analysis of Expressive Arts lesson 17 taught by Teacher 10 in Standard 8 at school 'E,' a rural school on 01/02/2010

| | |
|---|---|
| **10:20 a.m. Teacher**: Good morning. How are you?<br>**Learners**: I am very well, how are you?.<br>**Teacher:** Yesterday, we looked at some of the dances that are performed in our communities. What did we say are the dances which are performed in our communities?<br>**Learner:** Chiwoda.<br>**Teacher:** Another one?<br>**Learner:** Manganje<br>**Teacher:** Another one?<br>**Learner:** Masewe<br>**Teacher:** So these are dances which are performed in our homes. Some of these dances are performed in many occasions for example weddings and funeral ceremonies. Others are performed during initiation ceremonies. Is that true?<br>**Learners:** Yes | ***Analysis***<br><br>*Engagement with difference- cultural knowledge*<br><br>*Low order thinking; lacks substantive conversation between the teacher and the learners* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher:** Then we identified one dance for which we sung the song, chule anafera kwa mkazi wake koma maliro anapita kwawo. Now, we shall be performing this dance known as Manganje. We shall be in three groups but each group will perform Manganje and sing a song of their choice during the performance. You will need to choose songs which convey messages. All those to whom I gave the number 1 will form one group, those I gave the number 2 will form another group and those I gave the number 3 will again form another group.<br>**10: 38 a.m. Teacher**: Now let us go outside and perform Manganje. We will use this tin as a drum because we don't have a drum. Can you please compose a song in your groups and sing and dance to those songs using gestures.<br>(Learners go outside and are in their three groups rehearsing their songs. The teacher asks every group to perform the Manganje one after another in turns.<br>**10: 35 a.m: Group 1**: Tipewe AIDS chifukwa ilibe mankhwala.<br>(This group makes a circle and dances going round and round and sings their song tipewe AIDS chifukwa ilibe mankhwala. They dance for 5 minjutes).<br>**10:40 a.m. Group 2:** Siliyasiliya, ya, ya, tembenuka tiwone.<br>(This group makes a circle and dances going round and round and sings their song Siliyasiliya, ya, ya, tembenuka tiwone).<br>**10: 45 a.m. Group 3**: Ma Rastaman, what is ma Ras, eh? ma Rastaman, what is ma Ras, eh?<br>(This group makes a circle and dances going round and round and sings their song Ma Rastaman, what is ma Ras, eh? ma Rastaman, what is ma Ras, eh?<br>**10: 46 a.m. Teacher:** That is o.k., can we go back to our classroom. Now, we have sung different songs in each group. Let us here from each group what song they have done.<br>**Group 1:** Tipewe AIDS chifukwa ilibe mankhwala<br>**Group 2:** Siliyasiliya tembenuka tiwone<br>**Teacher:** That is an entertaining song Siliyasiliya, akuti usilile usilile. That song is talking about how a certain girl looks so beautiful. And the other group?<br>**Group 3**: Rastaman.<br>**Teacher:** What is the meaning of Rastaman. Kodi ma Rastaman ndi zichiyani? Tikati Rastaman ndiye kuti zikuthanthauza chiyani? Ma Rastaman ndindani. So that is the song. Now let us have this summary.<br>( Teacher writes notes on the chalkboard for the learners to copy. The notes read;<br>- Dances that express and communicate messages; people use various ways of expressing and communicating feelings, ideas and messages.<br>-These ways include; the use of language, dance, songs, gestures, stories and drawing<br>-People dance on different occasions. Some of the occasions | *Knowledge integration - knowledge from different subject areas is connected.*<br><br>*Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom - connectedness to the world* |

| | |
|---|---|
| are wedding, initiation ceremonies and funeral gatherings<br>-During these occasions, different messages are conveyed. The messages may include cross-cutting issues such as HIV/AIDS, gender, deforestation and human rights<br>**10: 47 a.m. Teacher**: Now you should copy these Review Exercise questions and you will answer them during your own free time. During examinations, these questions can come so we should know the answers to these questions<br>(Teacher writes the following questions on the chalkboard; mention some of the ways through which messages can be communicated to people? State three roles that dances play in a society).<br>**10:55 a.m. Teacher**: Let us answer the following question<br>What are some of the ways through which messages can be communicated?<br>**Learner**: songs<br>**Teacher:** Another one?<br>**Learner**: poems<br>**Teacher:** Another one?<br>**Learner:** Stories<br>**Teacher**: You should know that this subject is going to be examined on the national examinations. It is going to be combined with Life skills. O.k. so the lesson ends here. | *Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom - connectedness to the world*<br><br>*Assessment* |
| *-There is engagement with difference in the lesson-this is so because cultural knowledge is ligitimised.*<br>*-There is knowledge integration in the lesson- this is so because the lesson combines elements of music and dance.*<br>*-There is low order thinking in the lesson -this is so because learners provide short one word answers and there is lack of substantive conversation.*<br>*-There is also connectedness of the lesson to the world beyond the classroom because there are areas where the teacher is connecting the lesson to issues of HIV/AIDS which affect people in the communities where the learners come from.*<br>*-There is assessment in the lesson- the teacher gives an assessment task to the learners*. | |

## 10.9: Transcription and Analysis of lesson 26 of Expressive Arts taught by Teacher 12 at school 'C,' a rural school on 12/02/2010

| | |
|---|---|
| **8:00 a.m. Learners:** Good morning sir.<br>**Teacher:** Good morning. How are you?<br>**Learners:** We are very well and how are you?<br>**Teacher:** I am fine sit down. Yesterday, we discussed about the roles of the leaders. We also talked about the characteristics of a leader and their leadership styles. Is there anybody who can tell us what is a leader? Or who is a leader? Who is a leader. We discussed yesterday. Yes, Emma.<br>**Learne r (Emma):** A leader is a person who leads other people.<br>**Teacher**: A leader is a person who leads others, isn't it? Very good.<br>**8:01 a.m. Teacher**: We also talked about the leadership styles. Can you list the leadership styles which we discussed? Leadership styles. Yes?<br>**Learner:** Majority rules.<br>**Teacher**: Is that a leadership style?<br>**Learner**: Dictatorship<br>**Teacher**: That is very good. Sometimes we say what?<br>**Learner**: Autocratic<br>**Teacher:** Yes, that is true. We have another leadership style. What is this leadership style?<br>**Learner:** Democratic.<br>**Teacher**: That is very good. Do we have another one? Girls?<br>**Learners:** Lesseffeire<br>**8:02 a.m. Teacher**: Lesseffeire, yes, that is very good. Now, can you explain the characteristics of a lesseiffeire.<br>**Learner:** people do what they want<br>**Teacher**: Aha, in this leadership, lesseffeire, people do what they want. What about in democratic leadership? Yes, Masiye?<br>**Learner:** Majority rules.<br>**Teacher:** Majority rules. Those are the characteristics of the democratic leadership. What is the other characteristics of the democratic leadership ? One majority rules?<br>**Learner:** Leader takes no sides.<br>**Teacher:** Yes, the leader takes no sides, that is true, the leader takes no sides. Do we have another one there?<br>**Learner:** People work together<br>**8:04 a.m. Teacher**: People work together, that is very good. Do we have characterisitics of autocratic leadership? Or dictatorship leadership style? Just give me one of the characteristics. All these leadership styles have their own characteristics. What about the autocratic?<br>**Learner:** People like to live in fear<br>**Teacher:** People live in fear. Isn't it?<br>**Learners:** Yes.<br>**Teacher:** Is there anyone else who can add another one to this? You have people living in fear, who else can add another one? | **<u>Analysis</u>**<br><br><br>*Connectedness to the world beyond the classroom.* |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Learner:** There is a lot of gossipping<br>**Teacher:** There is a lot of gossiping. That is very good. People talk a lot about the leader because the leadership style is not good. Because of this bad leadership, people talk of the leadership which is there at that time. So the people live in fear. Do you have another point? Grace?<br>**Learner (Grace):** There is no second opinion. If the leader says do this, all the people have just to do what their leader tells them to do without opposing that. You can not even ask questions otherwise you can just face problems.<br>**Teacher:** Do we have another point to add there apart from the fact there is no second opinion to what the leader tells the people to do? Do you have another characteristic to add?<br>**Learner**: Only the leader's voice count. What the leader says is the only thing which can be done. No body can say or can give ideas. No other ideas are welcome. Only the leader says this and so the people do whatever their leader tells them to do. The people just follow what the leader is telling them to do. That's good. Now today, we want to continue with the same topic of leadership roles but we are having the successes and challenges of leadership. Successes and challenges in leadership, that's the topic of today. (the teacher writes on the board the topic of the day as successes and challenges of leadership. We have seen the leaders of different styles. The leaders who practice democracy and the leaders who are dictators. The different types of leaders have different successes and challenges. Challenges is the same as problems. The leaders meet successes and challenges. Atsogoleri aja amakumana ndi zinthu zovuta ndi zina zosavuta. Akakhala mumidzi muja amakumana ndi zina zovuta kuti ayen detse utsogoleri wao. Zimene zimakanikitsa atsogoleri kuti ayendetse bwino utsogoleri wao ndi ma challenges. Zimene zimakanika zija ndiye ma challenges. So we want o look at those things. Komanso tiwonanso, we are going to see how to solve those problems. How to find the solutions to those problems. Three things we are going to look at this morning. So we are going to be in groups. We are going to look at successes of leaders. Number two, we will look at problems or challenges. Number 3 we are looking at the solutions. Tikambirana kuti when the leaders akamayendetsa za utsogoleri wao amakumana ndi zovuta zotani. Komanso nthawi zina they meet problems which hinders them to do their work well. Amakumana ndi mavuto komanso palinso njira zina zoti akhoza kuthetsera mavuto aja. So we are going to have groups one and 2 to discuss the successes . Group 3 and 4 will discuss the problems which leaders meet and you will also discuss the solutions to the problems which leaders face.<br>( I am sitting with group 1 which is composed of 4 girls and 1 boy. At 8:21 a.m. the teacher comes up to this group and guides the group on their discussions. He tells the group to write down the following facts; when leaders face challenges, they should not give up but they should find solutions to their challenges. He further tells them to put down the following responses in their note books; the | *Intellectual quality - deep understanding*<br>*Intellectual quality - deep knowledge*<br>*Narrative teaching.*<br>*Narrative teaching* |

| | |
|---|---|
| leader should delegate, kodi kuti ziyende bwino, ma leaders azitani. Kodi mavuto akapezeka azichita chiyani kuti zinthu ziziyenda bwino. Kodi mavuto akapezeka anthuwo azitani kuti zinthu ziziyenda bwino. One girl learner reads from her notes the following; leaders should not give up when they find problems but they should face up the challenges. Another girl learner says, encouraging, kuwalimbikitsa. Another urges fellow classmates to give another point. The teacher comes to this group again at 8:35 a.m. and tells the learners to write the following facts; the leader should practice justice, the leader should encourage people to work together, the leader should encourage people to work in unity, the leader should practice justice, the leader should encourage unity, the leader should not take any sides. Write things like these. Pamenepopo simukuwona kuti zikhoza kugwira? Learners say yes to the points given to them by the teacher. A mfumu akagonera mbali imodzi anthu amati a mfumu a chabe ndi aziphuphu akukondera.<br>**8:25 a.m. Teacher:** Can representatives of the groups come and write on the chalkboard what they have come up with from their group discussions.<br>**Group 1 representative**: problems/challenges which leaders meet/face are;<br>-concerning leadership<br>- jelousy<br>-some people do not accept change<br>- fought<br>**Group 2 representative**: successes of leaders<br>- sharing coupons for people<br>- sharing things<br>**Group 3 representative**: solutions of the problems/ challenges which leaders meet/face<br>- the leader take no sides.<br>**8:26 a.m. Teacher**: Today's lesson ends here. We shall continue tomorrow. | |
| *-There is instrumental knowledge taught in the lesson-this is so because the learners are taught a lot of skills which is not academic knowledge but it is knowledge which can just enable them to participate effectively in the social lives of their communities.*<br>*-There is deep knowledge covered in the lesson-this is so because the lesson covers central ideas and concepts of the lesson topic in depth.*<br>*-There is deep understanding of learners in the lesson-this is so because the responses of learners provide evidence of depth of understanding of concepts and ideas being covered in the lesson.*<br>*-There are areas within the lesson however in which there is a lot of expository teaching. The teacher just gives information to the learners without the learners being given much opportunity to create knowledge within the teaching and learning proces*s. | |

## APPENDIX 11: POST-LESSON INTERVIEW EXCERPTS UTILISED IN CHAPTER 7 OF THIS THESIS

## 11.1: Post-lesson Observation interview with Teacher 11

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you were teaching about multicultural artistic items. I just wanted to learn more about this lesson, what were you trying to do in this lesson which you taught today on multicultural artistic items? |
| **Teacher** | On this lesson, I wanted to discuss with the learners on the carving wooden items and pottery as artistic items that are made in different cultures. |
| **Researcher** | Would you tell me something more about these multicultural items like carvings, wooden items and pottery. Can I learn more about these? |
| **Teacher** | In the lesson we said that these items are items which are made by the people who live in the society. There we went on by saying that for carvings, they differ. These things do differ because of the areas where they are being made. For example, those carvings that are made in hilly areas, they are carvings that are made from wood and they represent the wild animals. For those that are made along the lakes, the items are such as canoes or a person holding a fish. These things like canoes simply mean that the people there are fishermen. On woven items, I also said that these things do differ from one society to another due to the availability of resources. For example, people that are along the lakes or rivers, they use reeds or palm leaves to make woven items. While those that are in hilly areas have to use bamboos to make these woven items. On pottery, I said that pottery made differ from one area to another. In those cultures where they brew beer, they make big pots with a reason of making a lot of beer. But for those who mould pots for the reason of keeping water, their pots are usually small. That is what I was teaching them. |
| **Researcher** | Here you put your learners into groups to discuss areas from which different items are produced like carving wooden items and pottery. What did the learners specifically come up with? |
| **Teacher** | Some of the learners came up with right answers but the others did not. This is because of the reason that we are living in the urban area. For them to know where these things are made because they don't move to rural areas. This is the reason they failed to give right answers. |
| **Researcher** | So they were giving wrong answers because of the environment they are coming from? |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | So may I learn more on what you do when you come across content in Expressive Arts which you think is not familiar to your learners because of your learners' context? |
| **Teacher** | We sometimes use resource persons but for me to find that resource person is very difficult. For example in these books, we are given such activities like making a stool. That means it needs me to go into rural areas and find one who is capable to do such a thing. This means I have to have some money to hire him so that he can come and teach the learners. So it is very difficult for me to do such an activity. If we have the money or if we have time, we can sometimes invite a resource person. |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | Here, you said that there is a difference in terms of artistic items which are produced in different areas. May I learn more about what you were teaching here? |
| **Teacher** | These items differ from one area to another just because of the availability of resources. Where there are a lot of bamboos, you can find that the people there, their woven items are made of bamboos. Where there are a lot of reeds, you can find that people do use those reads to weave different items. |
| | These items differ from one area to another just because of the availability of resources. Where there are a lot of bamboos, you can find that the people there, their woven items are made of bamboos. Where there are a lot of reeds, you can find that people do use those reads to weave different items. |
| **Researcher** | What would you say then in general about the way the curriculum has been designed on this specific topic? |
| **Teacher** | Had it been that we had enough resources, these books were perfectly made. But the problem is that the activities we are given in these books are quite difficult for us to meet the needs of the learners because we are given a certain activity to teach the learners hence we don't know how we can perform that work so we just move to another lesson. For example, the carving of a stool, and another activity where we are asked to carve a pestle and a mortar, these things will need experience. These things do need materials. For us, we don't have these materials so it is difficult for us to teach these learners. And also we have some activities like needlecraft whereby we are asked to sew a shorts. The government does not provide us with materials for sewing. So to tell the learners to buy these materials, it is difficult for them to buy these materials because of money. And the time, it will take us a very long time to finish up the work. As this is an examination class, we just go through the lesson quickly with the learners for us to finish up the book. We just take those lessons that we see that there are easy to teach and those that we think the MANEB people can ask examinations on. For example the MANEB people can not ask questions from some of the activities in this book. MANEB people can not ask the learners to carve a stool. May be the MANEB people can just ask the learners the procedure for carving a stool. So that is what we teach them. The procedures for carving. |
| **Researcher** | Any other additional comment on your lesson which you taught your learners today? |
| **Teacher** | It was a nice one |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more why you say your lesson was a nice one? |
| **Teacher** | Because the learners were able to answer the questions I was asking them, though others did not answer the questions well but the majority of them did well and on the multicultural artistic items, the learners seem to have knowledge. Most of the learners seem to have knowledge. So it was simple for me to explain some points on the lesson. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

## 11.2: Post-lesson Observation interview 2 with Teacher 11

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught your learners about tempo and dynamics in modern and traditional music. I want to learn more about this lesson which you were teaching about tempo and dynamics in modern and traditional music. What were you trying to do in that lesson on tempo and dynamics? |
| **Teacher** | On this lesson, I just wanted to teach the learners because when they are singing, they don't know what they are singing. They don't know that they are using dynamics and at the same time they are using tempo. They just sing the song. So I just wanted them to know what happens when one is singing. |
| **Researcher** | I do not know anything much about tempo and dynamics. Can you share with me on what tempo means and what dynamics means which you taught the learners? |
| **Teacher** | On tempo, I said that it is the speed at which music moves. You can sing the song very fast or you can sing the song very slowly. That's the tempo. On dynamics, I said that it is the degree on how loud or soft the song is. When singing, you can sometimes hear that the voice is at high level or the voice is at low level, that's dynamics. |
| **Researcher** | Here you talked about crescendo and descrendo, piano and pianissimo then messo forte, messo piano and then fortissimo. Can I learn more about these concepts? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. these are the symbols that represent dynamics in songs. For decrescendo and crescendo, these are symbols that show that for crescendo, the song is being louder voice. Decrescendo that means that now the song is getting soft. The voice has now changed to a lower voice. And other symbols like pianissimo, this means that one is singing very softly, not at a louder voice. |
| **Researcher** | May I also learn more about messoforte and fortissimo? |
| **Teacher** | For messoforte, this is a symbol that shows that the singing is moderately loud. Not very, not very soft, but it is moderately loud. |
| **Researcher** | May I also learn more about pianissimo on the piano? |
| **Teacher** | I tried to give them the meanings. What does these mean. When we say pianissimo in singing, what does this dynamic mean. So I tried to give their meanings. |
| **Researcher** | What meanings did you give them on pianissimo? |
| **Teacher** | That' singing very softly. Piano means singing softly. Messopiano means singing moderate soft. Forte, this symbol means singing loudly. Fortessimo means singing very loudly. Forte piano means singing loudly and then suddenly soft. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you led your learners into singing the Malawi national anthem. What was this activity all about? May I learn more about it? |
| **Teacher** | When I told them to sing the national anthem, I tried to check if they got the meanings of the dynamics used in the song. |
| **Researcher** | So would we say that they got the dynamics? |
| **Teacher** | Yes, because I pointed at the symbols and said use this dynamic and they did, use this dynamic and they did. That means they got the meaning of |

| | |
|---|---|
| | dynamics. |
| **Researcher** | So we would say that the national anthem had dynamic symbols? |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | What about the tempo, did the national anthem have the tempo as well? |
| **Teacher** | Yes, because I told them sing very fast, sing very slowly, that means I was using the tempo. |
| **Researcher** | What would you say were the major skills which your learners might have learned from your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The skills they learned on this day was that they should know how they can sing songs be it fast or slowly, be it at a loud voice or soft voice. |
| **Researcher** | Would you say anything in general about this lesson which you taught on this day about tempo and dynamics in music? |
| **Teacher** | I struggled much on this lesson because what I taught came exactly from the book. I had no any other additional information. So it was very difficult for me to tell them some important information. So it was very difficult for me to teach this lesson? |
| **Researcher** | Would we say that perhaps you did not prepare well in advance to look for the information in advance? |
| **Teacher** | I asked my colleagues about some I prepared because information on this lesson but their answers are negative. They do not also know the information. Getting information on some topics in Expressive Arts is difficult. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

### 11.3: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 2

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | Your lesson was on something on garments which are used to convey messages. What were you trying to do in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | O.k., the main thing which I wanted the learners to know is that there are some other garments which can give a message. By somebody just putting on that garment, somebody can take a message from that garment. You can have a message only from that type of garment. So some of the learners they don't know that. So what I wanted them to know is that they can even know if somebody puts on that garment, it means this, this. |
| **Researcher** | So what did they learn from that lesson specifically? |
| **Teacher** | I think the learners knew about the garments like nyau garments. Some of the learners do not know why those people put on those garments. Now they know that if they see nyau, they know that either there is a funeral, or they are celebrating something. |
| **Researcher** | How did you know that they learned something from there, from your lesson about garments which convey messages? |
| **Teacher** | O.k., most of the learners were asking a lot of questions showing that they at first did not know about the meaning of certain garments. For example, somebody asked a question about the gown which pastors puts on. He asked if it was only pastors who put on those gowns and not everybody else? So this means that the learners did not know about garments such as the gown |

| | |
|---|---|
| | and they only learned about it from this lesson. |
| **Researcher** | So that is how you assessed that they learned something from the lesson. By them asking you a lot of questions then you knew that they have learned something from that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Yes. |
| **Researcher** | Fine, if you were to re-teach the same lesson, would you change anything? |
| **Teacher** | If I was to change the lesson now, it could have been adding more things because if I can say about that lesson is if I had mentioned other garments but I was afraid to mention those other garments because I was looking at those garments because they are not of Malawian culture but they are from other countries. So if I can teach again that lesson, I can search on other garments first which people put on to convey cultural messages rather than just teaching them about Malawian garments. |
| **Researcher** | And then you used group work again. So far in your lessons which I have observed, I have seen you using much of group work, is that what the curriculum advocates or why do you like that method? |
| **Teacher** | No, its not that the curriculum advocates that method only, the group work method, only that although we have a lot of methods which we can use, only that to me putting the learners in groups is the best method because those who are always dormant or those who are shy or the slow learners they are always participating because in the groups the learners tell each other that everyone should participate. So its like everybody participating in the group. |
| **Researcher** | O.k., in your lesson, you asked the learners to open page 10 of their learners' book, were you happy on how the learner's book was used in that lesson? In other words, did it help you to teach the lesson better? |
| **Teacher** | I think it is important that learners see something tangible in the lesson. They saw the nyau garments in the pictures in the text book but I think I should have brought the actual nyau garments or the wedding dress. I should have brought those so that the learners should have seen those. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. finally, do you have any additional comments on that lesson about garments which convey cultural messages? |
| **Teacher** | Ya, an additional can be there especially on the resources because sometimes like here, sometimes I do not have enough time to have those resources so if I can ask the learners to bring those resources. But I do not ask the learners to do so because sometimes parents ask what that teacher wants to do with those things. So it is like something discouraging so you just leave it like that. You do not even ask learners to bring some of those things, you just look at them. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you madam for giving your time to give me this interview. |
| **Teacher** | Thank you |

## 11.4: Post-lesson Observation interview 2 with Teacher 2

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | Your lesson was on something on sounds which convey messages. What were you trying to do in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Alright, sometimes learners do not know the importance of sounds especially sounds which they hear at home. Not really the sounds which they hear here at school for example that of the bell but sounds which they hear at home like that of the cock crowing early in the morning, they do not really know what does that mean. Some of the learners also do not know the meaning of sounds produced by some of the birds. In that lesson, learners knew the importance of those sounds which they hear at their homes and the message which those sounds convey. |
| **Researcher** | Do you think what the learners were learning is important to their everyday lives or were you teaching it because it is there in the curriculum? |
| **Teacher** | I think as we are teaching, we try to apply the lesson to the learners daily lives. Academic part is there in the lesson but also some things which they can apply in their daily lives because if we are talking of the cock crowing early in the morning, some of the learners hear that and they will say, now it is 3 oclock or now it is such, such a thing happening just because they have learned something from the teacher or from their fellow learners on sounds. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. what about the issue of outcomes, themes and integration, how were these covered in your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | O.k., that lesson was on music as sounds are something on music. So we touched that part on the area of music. So as I have already said, as I am achieving the success criteria, I am also achieving the outcomes, themes and integration. |
| **Researcher** | So about the success criteria, what subjects in Expressive Arts did it cover in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Only music. |
| **Researcher** | So could we say that there wasn't integration of subject in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | I think it is like that. |
| **Researcher** | What teaching methods did you adopt in that lesson and why did you use those teaching methods? |
| **Teacher** | I used group work again because most of the times I want to involve each and every one in the class. I do not want some of the them just to stay and listen to their friends because some of the learners are clever because as you just finish asking a question you see that they have already raised their hands. So some of the learners can just be listening to their friends in class. So I don't want that, I want to involve each and everybody. |
| **Researcher** | O.k., so do you get satisfied that after using group work you would have involved each and everybody in your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Yes. |
| **Researcher** | You have indicated that you taught music. Did you use any musical resources to teach learners the music? |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher** | My main resource was learners' experience, what the learners already know about music. |
| **Researcher** | Thanks, did you have any method to assess whether the outcomes of your lesson have been achieved? |
| **Teacher** | Ya, I think I asked learners some questions. |
| **Researcher** | Were these oral or written questions? |
| **Teacher** | Written. |
| **Researcher** | And then you went marking the learners. What did you get from that marking? |
| **Teacher** | Sometimes if I say you should write this, I have some ideas I want to look at from the learners. Like in that class sometimes I look at the spellings. Have the learners written correct spellings? So some of the learners could write the correct thing but the spellings were not correct so when I am marking them, I am correcting their spellings. |
| **Researcher** | So from your marking, were you convinced that from the responses they were giving your learners achieved the outcomes you wanted them to achieve? |
| **Teacher** | Most of them. |
| **Researcher** | What do you do if you see that your learners haven't achieved the outcomes which you wanted them to achieve? |
| **Teacher** | Sometimes I give them an exercise especially on Fridays. May be I can ask them lets say five questions. If I find out that they have failed, then Alright, sometimes if we use this question method, asking learners to answer questions orally, some of the learners do not participate in class so what happens is that some of the learners shy away to speak to the whole class but when they are in groups, they are able to talk to their friends. They can speak out their views. So I think group work is the best method which can make all the learners to participate in the lesson. |
| **Researcher** | I think one of the aims of a teacher teaching a lesson is to ensure that all the learners have achieved the outcomes of their lesson at the end of that lesson, so how were you following as the lesson was progressing that your learners were achieving the outcomes of your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Sometimes you know just by looking at their faces. You know that these learners are getting what I am teaching. But sometimes, you can ask them questions and if they can not even answer those questions that means that they are telling you that we did not understand as you were talking. |
| **Researcher** | So that is how you asses their understanding of your lesson. You just study their faces. If they are happy then it means to you that your learners have learned what you wanted them to and if they are not happy then you know that they have not got anything from your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Yes. |
| **Researcher** | I observed that in that lesson, you gave them a class exercise to write, what was the purpose of that? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. what I was doing is as I said earlier that some of the learners do not participate in answering the questions orally, but if they can write something down then I know that this one got what I was teaching or this one did not understand what I was teaching. I know this through the class exercises. |
| **Researcher** | Then would you say that you are happy that at the end of the day that the outcomes which you planned for that lesson were achieved? |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher** | Yes. I achieved the outcomes. |
| **Researcher** | Why do you say so? Why do you say that you achieved the outcomes of your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Most of the learners were able to define what mirroring is and mention some of the activities which they can copy from friends. |
| **Researcher** | Would you say that there are things which you liked about that lesson and are there other things which you would say that you did not like and which you would change if you were to re-teach that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. the first thing I liked most is that learners paid more attention. I do not know why. What I did not like is that those boys who looked older did not participate much in the lesson. I did not know why these older boys did not participate. |
| **Researcher** | So if you were to re-teach that lesson, is there any area where you would change something in your teaching or would you teach it exactly as you did today? |
| **Teacher** | What I would actually have done is to drill them in knowing some of the big words in that lesson. For example, most of the learners did not know the meaning of expression. I would have given them the meaning of this word expression. Some of the learners did not know the meaning of this word expression in the lesson. |
| **Researcher** | Do you have any thing in addition which you can talk about your lesson in general? |
| **Teacher** | Ya! Because today was the first time for me to have somebody sit at the back and observe my lesson, I generally have no problem with having someone sitting at the back observing my lesson, this gave me a lot of encouragement to teach my lesson in a more better way. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you madam for giving your time to give me this interview. |
| **Teacher** | Thank you |

### 11.5: Post-lesson Observation interview 3 with Teacher 2

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | This is your lesson which I have observed you teaching today. First of all, can you tell me more about that lesson, what were you doing in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Alright, what I wanted the learners to know in that lesson is that there are other postures or the body movements which we make. If we are making certain types of body movements, it is the same thing as giving out messages that can make somebody say something about you. So I was trying to tell the learners about that. |
| **Researcher** | What about the issues of outcomes, themes and integration, how did these come out from that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Mmm! I am not sure about these. |
| **Researcher** | So you are not sure how you covered outcomes, themes and integration in your lesson? What do you mean when you say that you are not sure? |
| **Teacher** | Because if you are talking about integration, I am looking at things like music, dancing or physical education if these are there in the lesson then |

| | |
|---|---|
| | there is integration. |
| **Researcher** | So which subjects were integrated in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | I am not sure about the subjects in that lesson. |
| **Researcher** | Fine, so you are not sure of the subjects within Expressive Arts which you were teaching in that lesson.<br>Fine, so you are not sure of the subjects within Expressive Arts which you were teaching in that lesson. |
| **Teacher** | Ha!ha! I am not sure. |
| **Researcher** | What about methods, what methods were you using to teach that lesson? Why did you use those methods? |
| **Teacher** | I used question and answer and then group work. Ya!, I was using those methods because I wanted the learners to participate in the lesson. |
| **Researcher** | But earlier on in the post lesson observation interviews you indicated that if you use question and answer method to ask questions to individual learners most learners do not participate in the lesson. How did the question and answer method in this lesson only work? |
| **Teacher** | Ya!, I used this just because I wanted to have an integration of methods. I wanted at least two methods. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. so you wanted to have an integration of methods instead of just using one. |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | Is there any other use to which you put your learners' responses in your class exercises? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. if they have answered the questions, it helps me to know whether they have understood my lesson or not? Sometimes, because we have this continuous assessment, sometimes we do record the marks. So I award marks to the learners' responses. We do not just leave them like that. |
| **Researcher** | So did you award marks to the responses of the learners in that lesson? Did you record the marks? |
| **Teacher** | No, I did not award marks. |
| **Researcher** | Then when do you award marks to learners and when do you record those marks? |
| **Teacher** | It is after every two weeks. Sometimes we do not follow that because we have a lot of things to do. Like last time, I did not give them a written exercise but I told them to make some other things like the garments that can convey cultural messages so learners make some of the garments or some of the things. So I recorded marks on that. |
| **Researcher** | Can you say something on what showed you in that lesson that your learners achieved the outcomes which you wanted them to achieve? What was the indicator in your lesson to show that your learners learned something from your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. I think part of the class got what I was teaching. But I was not really happy because most of the learners could not answer the questions nicely so I was worried that they have not learned much from that lesson. So I will repeat the same lesson so that learners understand it. |
| **Researcher** | Any additional comments on that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Ya! I think yesterday I was not in the mood of teaching because I did not enjoy teaching. |
| **Researcher** | Why did you not enjoy teaching that lesson? |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher** | I do not know. So may be that is why those learners did not have any interest of even listening to me. I did not enjoy that lesson. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for giving your time for this interview. |

## 11.6: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 6

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson, you were teaching about contemporary and traditional music. You told your learners that you were focussing on tempo and dynamics within the contemporary and traditional music. Can I learn more about tempo and dynamics which you were teaching your learners here? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. it is like I wanted them to differentiate how these traditional and contemporary music differ but now we were looking at tempo and dynamics. So we were going deeper when we were looking at tempo, what is it all about when we were talking about the term tempo and dynamics, what is it. Are these both being used in traditional and contemporary music? |
| **Researcher** | O.k., so you were looking at how both tempo and dynamics are being used. So what did you teach them about tempo? |
| **Teacher** | On tempo, I gave them an example of that song which says "matemba wilawila m'mbale". We looked at how the last verse was going. I said that this last line is talking of fast tempo. That means that the song has to be fast at the end. |
| **Researcher** | So you might say, what did they learn about tempo**?** |
| **Teacher** | Usually I was looking in this Teacher's Guide but there isn't much information about tempo in the Teacher's Guide so that is why you saw that my teaching on tempo was very short. So that is why I did not go further with that one. |
| **Researcher** | And dynamics? |
| **Teacher** | I was saying that it refers to the degree of loudness of sound of pieces of music. |
| **Researcher** | So you wanted your learners to learn about softness or loudness of sound in music. One student asked you why you were teaching them those symbols, what would you say is the reason why you were teaching them those symbols? |
| **Teacher** | I said that may be others here will be musicians in the future and you will be using these symbols again. |
| **Researcher** | So would you say that when you taught them something on symbols, they will be able to read a song using symbols? |
| **Teacher** | Not actually, but as they may be going along, there is a certain topic again coming where they will be able now to write their own songs and be able to use those symbols. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. so the topic continues and you will teach them about symbols again? |
| **Teacher** | Yaa! |
| **Researcher** | Here, you sung with the students the manganje song. Can I learn more about that song? |
| **Teacher** | The song is saying matemba wila wila m'mbale, mbale, mbale juwanga eeh! So we were concentrating on the fast tempo in the last verse which is saying, eeh! |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | O.k. and then there was another verse which was sung in which you were talking about tambala walira kokoriliko. What were you teaching them about in this song? |
| **Teacher** | O.k., we were using dynamics in the song. We were actually using the crescendos and the decrescendos. We were looking at how the song will get louder and how it will get slower. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. can I learn something more about crescendos and decrescendo? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. crescendo is just a symbol which shows that the song should get loud. While decrescendo is a symbol that shows that the song should get soft. |
| **Researcher** | How did you assess that your learners had learned something on the symbols? |
| **Teacher** | Of course I asked them questions and I used the same song of Tambala Walira kokoriliko. I asked them to go to that song and I asked them to find out where they have used the symbol crescendo and they were looking at the symbols and when I asked them to say what a certain symbol stood for, they were able to say that it means that the song must get loud or if the song has a crescendo, it means that the song must get softer. |
| **Researcher** | What would you say was the integration in your lesson. What integration was there? Was there integration of the different subjects which make up Expressive Arts? |
| **Teacher** | No, this lesson was only carrying music. |
| **Researcher** | Thanks very much for sparing your precious time to attend this interview. |

### 11.7: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 9

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about conveying cultural messages. Can I learn more about what you were trying to do here in your lesson on conveying cultural messages? |
| **Teacher** | In the lesson, I wanted learners to identify the illustrations first and then after that, they were going to identify what type of clothes these are and then I wanted them also to say what time do people wear these types of cloths. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about these garments which convey cultural messages. |
| **Teacher** | Well, the learners came up with garments of Gulewamkulu in illustration A. This type of Gulewamkulu is worn by Gulewamkulu dancers during funeral celebrations. In illustration B, there is one woman there who is wearing marriage dress. And the third one is a Ngoni and the Ngoni normally have a sword and a shield. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about the Ngoni sword and shield, what do they actually mean? |
| **Teacher** | Well, those are messages which they give that when somebody is wearing garments like the one in illustration B, that one is said to be a warrior. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you discussed much on white dress with your learners in the lesson, can I learn more about this white dress? |
| **Teacher** | When somebody wears a white type of dress, then that one is thought to be a bride, someone who is about to wed and that girl has never slept with anyone before. In the lesson we also pointed out that these days it is |

| | |
|---|---|
| | becoming more or less a tradition. Even people who have been married before, they can also wear such type of cloths. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you discussed about black cloth. Can I learn more about this black cloth you discussed in your lesson here? |
| **Teacher** | In the lesson, I talked about the black cloths. I just wanted to give them a picture that when normally see certain women putting on black cloths, they should know that probably, it means that the husband has died. But these days, people will also put on black cloths simply because may be that is the type of cloths which they want to wear. But I also talked about a gown. I said that the gowns, for example for people who have been married before, are not supposed to wear those veils or gowns but what happens these days is that you still find that people are wearing those gowns and veils whether they have been married before or not. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you discussed about people putting on sackcloths, can I learn more about people putting on sackcloths? |
| **Teacher** | When normally when we read the Bible, we are told that in the old times, when there were some calamities or some bad had happened in those days, the kings were putting on sacks and I think the motive was that the people in those days knew that something was wrong so they were also putting on the sacks. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about the connection here between this Biblical story and your Expressive Arts lesson? |
| **Teacher** | I think I was just trying to give them some sort of information about how people in those days were doing , most of the kings. But I also thought that I should also give them a picture about what putting on of sacks meant to those people in those days. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about what your learners learnt in this lesson about garments which convey cultural messages? |
| **Teacher** | The learners in the lesson learnt about the illustrations and they know that if they find somebody putting on these things, then, if somebody say is putting on Gulewamkulu attire, then normally he knows that that one is say is a Gulewamkulu dancer or something like that but they also had a good picture to know that those garments are not just worn any where, they have got particular times when those garments are worn. |
| **Researcher** | Do you have any general comments on this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Well, in general to me, I can say that the learners were able to identify the cloths that this type of cloths is worn by such, such type of people but they also had an idea on why people wear such type of cloths. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you asked them to mention some other garments that convey cultural messages apart from those shown in the illustarions. Can I learn more about these other garments that convey cultural messages apart from those shown in the illustrations in the Learners' Book? |
| **Teacher** | There are also some garments that are worn by people that also convey messages. For example, people who wear Beni cloths or Masewe. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about the cultural messages conveyed by the Beni and Masewe cloths? |
| **Teacher** | Yes, for example, Beni dancers normally wear uniforms which look like soldiers. They have their caps there and about Masewe, they just wear |

| | |
|---|---|
| | certain certain things made from Mlaza trees and they wear them in the waist and tie them somewhere there in the arms. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you put your learners into groups but you told the learners that most of them were not participating in the discussions in the groups you put them. Can I learn more about your concern about your learners' participation in group work here? |
| **Teacher** | I think the problem is that sometimes, some of them find it a problem to discuss more especially in English and this is why sometimes you saw me I was trying to talk to them in Chichewa. I think those learners who were keeping quiet, I think I would say that they had a problem in trying to discuss something in English. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about what you normally do when there is very low participation by the learners as was the case here in this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Normally when there is very low participation, normally we take it that the learners have not got what we expected them to have and so what we normally do is that we repeat the same topic next time. So I will repeat this lesson next time. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about your impression of the curriculum design on this topic which you taught your learners today? |
| **Teacher** | I would say that the illustrations that are put there are real showing what the learners expected to have but also on top of that the learners were able to identify the attire which is worn in the illustrations. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

### 11.8: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 1

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In this lesson, you were teaching about improvisation. What were you trying to do in that lesson on improvisation. |
| **Teacher** | I wanted the learners to identify some materials. Instead of using may be the materials which they can buy in shops, they can make the materials themselves for example by finding cheap materials from the locally available resources. Like I gave them an example of a ball. They can buy a ball from the shop. If the learners do not have money, they can make their own ball using locally available resources for example may be finding the rope and plastic papers and make a ball for them to use. |
| **Researcher** | So basically you were teaching them about how to use locally available resources. And then after introducing your lesson, you went to illustrations. |
| **Teacher** | Yes, on illustrations, for example, they can buy a toy car from the shop but they can also make theirs using locally available resources, cheap materials, like papers. They can use the wheels from bottle tops and card board. They can cut card board for wheels something like those. |
| **Researcher** | So that was the main aim of looking at the illustrations. |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | O.k. and then you divided your learners into groups for them to discuss the materials that can be used to make the resources in the illustrations. What exactly were you trying to do at this point in the lesson? |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher** | Mainly I wanted the learners to know other materials, locally available resources they can use. |
| **Researcher** | What locally available resources did you have in mind in the lesson? Were there specific locally available resources which you wanted your learners to know about? |
| **Teacher** | There were no specific resources because they can find and use any resource. |
| **Researcher** | They can use any resource? |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | O.k. illustration B appeared to have given your learners some problems for them to interpret. May I know more why this was so? |
| **Teacher** | Learners sometimes find difficulties to interpret some of the illustrations in the book. For example, they found a problem to identify the meaning of illustration B. |
| **Researcher** | Why did the learners have problems in identifying what illustration B meant? |
| **Teacher** | They did not know the illustration. |
| **Researcher** | Normally when you have those problems where you are not sure of an illustration like you had with illustration B, which was showing a small man tied with some strings. When you are not sure yourself and your learners are not sure as well as to the meaning of an illustration, what do you do? How do you sort out the problem? |
| **Teacher** | I sort out the problem by asking my fellow teachers the meaning of an illustration. For example, for that illustration, before I enter the class I ask my fellow teachers the meaning of an illustration. What does this illustration mean? |
| **Researcher** | So you normally discuss with your fellow teachers about some of the illustrations. |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | Then you talked about some resources which are cheaper and what those resources are used for. And when you were talking about some materials are cheaper and others are expensive. I want to know more about what you were teaching about here? |
| **Teacher** | I wanted the learners to know that sometimes if they don't have some money, they can improvise and also out of that, they can achieve something out of it. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. there was a point whereby you were talking about resources which are locally available. And then there was a point where a learner mentioned about commercial dolls. You asked your learners about what other materials they can improvise and then a learner mentioned commercial dolls and you accepted that answer as correct. Would we say that commercial items can also be improvised by the learners? |
| **Teacher** | I think I was absent minded. I shouldn't have accepted commercial dolls as a correct response. Commercial dolls can be bought from shops and can not be improvised by learners. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. what would say was the main thing which you taught your learners and which your learners learned from that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The main thing I was teaching is that I was teaching the learners to identify |

| | |
|---|---|
| | or know what locally available resources are and where those locally available resources can be found and also they can improvise some other materials for effective teaching and learning. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. in your lesson on improvisation, you encouraged learners to improvise for teaching and learning, I wanted to know more about improvisation for teaching and learning which you taught in your lesson. |
| **Teacher** | Teachers should improvise for teaching and not the learners. And I don't know why this topic was put in the syllabus. |
| **Researcher** | So if you thought that the topic was more suited to be a topic to be taught to teachers than learners, targeting teachers than learners, why then did you continue teaching it to your learners? |
| **Teacher** | We are given the curriculum and we follow everything provided in the curriculum. |
| **Researcher** | O.k., you just follow everything as it is given to you in the curriculum? |
| **Teacher** | Yes, as we don't know what is going to come on the exam. So we teach everything that is in the curriculum. |
| **Researcher** | What would you say about the design of the new curriculum? |
| **Teacher** | About the curriculum itself, I think some of the content are difficult for the learners to understand. For example, some other topics have more periods while the content is little. But we are provided 4 or 5 periods for that topic and some of the content here are difficult for the understanding of the learners. |
| **Researcher** | So you find that some of the topics in the curriculum are difficult. So when you meet those difficult topics, what do you do? |
| **Teacher** | We just leave the difficult topics. We have no choice at all, we just leave them. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. thank you very much for the information you have given me on that lesson. |

## 11.9: Post-lesson Observation interview 2 with Teacher 1

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In today's lesson, you started by reminding the learners about different types of stitches which they can make and then they mentioned those stitches. Then you talked about dyeing on fabrics and fibre. You said we can dye on any fibre and any cloth. You asked them the definition of dyes and they gave you the definition of a dye. You wrote on the chalkboard the definition of dyes and then you talked about the reasons as to why learners should dye things. You also talked about different types dyes and their sources. Can you tell me more about this lesson. What were you trying to do in the lesson on dyes? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. on dyes, first of all, I wanted my learners to identify different dyes and the uses of dyes. And also on top of that one is that I wanted the learners to know where these dyes are found, where they can get these dyes because some of the dyes are natural while others are artificial dyes, meaning that artificial dyes are from chemicals which are very expensive for them. They need may be a lot of money but by using natural dyes, they can easily use |

| | |
|---|---|
| | them. Then I wanted them to know where the learners can get these natural dyes for example yellow dyes, green dyes. The sources of these for example yellow dyes are may be from the part of the plant, to be specific may be from the fruits. They can use yellow flowers, all those are parts of a plant or even the roots and also may be they want may be an orange dye where they can have a natural orange dye. They can also get these parts of the plants which are simple for them to get. |
| **Researcher** | I was sitting at one of the groups which looked like to have been struggling in coming up with the sources of these dyes. I don't know, why is it that the learners seem to have struggled in coming up with ideas of sources of dyes? |
| **Teacher** | O.k., may be this topic is new for them. And may be in their homes, they do not dye, that is why they seem to have problems on this topic. They don't have dyes and they don't use them. They don't know how they can dye. That is why this topic is difficult. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. in that lesson, when you put the learners in those groups to discuss, may I know more about the amount of time you gave the learners for discussion? |
| **Teacher** | Normally I vary my methods, according to the activity I have given them. In this one, I gave them less than two minutes while in other activities, I gave them a lot of time. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. do you think that the methods you used today have helped your learners to achieve what you wanted them to achieve? |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | Well, you started with type of stitches and then you connected the stitches to dyes? You talked about different types of stitches and then you went into dyes. I want to know more about why you introduced your lesson like that? |
| **Teacher** | I wanted to teach the lesson from known to unknown. They already know about the stitches and also about sewing which is also connected to fabrics. That is why I started talking about stitches because they are connected to fabrics. I wanted to talk about fabrics, dyeing of fabrics. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you talked about artificial dyes. Then you said that you are not going to talk about artificial dyes at all. But you were just going to look at natural dyes. Why did not cover artificial dyes in detail, since you mentioned that artificial dyes are also a type of dye? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. artificial dyes are the other type of dyes. But I did not want to talk about them in this lesson. I will talk about them in the next lesson. |
| **Researcher** | Is it possible that I could know more about artificial dyes? Can you say something more about artificial dyes? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. artificial dyes are the ones which are made from chemicals and these chemicals are in a way are good. They are bought from shops and these artificial dyes are different from natural dyes. Natural dyes are from cheap materials while artificial dyes are expensive because they need money. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. thanks so much for your information on the artificial dyes. You earlier on in your lesson told your learners that you were to teach them about dyeing fabrics, and here you also taught them about dyeing baskets and winnowers. Are these also fabrics? |
| **Teacher** | No. They are not fabrics. They are fibres. I also told them that I am going to teach them about dyeing fibres. For example, we dye the baskets and |

| | |
|---|---|
| | winnowers for decoration. We decorate fibres. We can decorate may be luzi which we use to make baskets. We can decorate fibre which we use to make table mats. Something like that. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you talked about the importance of dyeing. May I know more about the importance of dyeing materials? |
| **Teacher** | It is very important to dye fabrics or may be fibre. One, it is for decoration. Also when a thing is dyed, it is attractive. And also dyeing gives variety. They provide contrast and harmony for them to look nice. They look nice. |
| **Researcher** | So that is what you would say your learners have learned about the importance of dyeing materials. Then may I know more about the skills which your learners have learned from that lesson on dyeing? |
| **Teacher** | Mainly on procedures of how they can make a dye. But we shall look into that one in the next lesson on procedures of how they can dye. |
| **Researcher** | So in this lesson, you would say that your learners haven't learned skills of dyeing? |
| **Teacher** | The skills were there because the learners were be able to identify the materials from local sources from which they can make some dyes. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. thanks very much for granting me the interview on your lesson on dyeing. |

## 11.10: Post-lesson Observation interview 3 with Teacher 1

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson, you were teaching about styles of leadership. I just want to learn a bit more on this lesson on leadership. What were you trying to do in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | I was trying to teach learners types of leaders. And qualities of good leaders. |
| **Researcher** | You wanted to tell them about types of leaders and qualities of good leaders. |
| **Teacher** | And they should also know the meaning of a leader. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn a bit more about the meaning of a leader and qualities of a leader? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. a leader is a person who is given an authority to rule over others. And there are qualities of a good leader. These are a leader should be honest. A leader should be friendly and kind. |
| **Researcher** | O.k., that is what you would say about leaders? |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | Here, you mentioned about types of leaders. Could you shed a bit more light on types of leaders you were teaching your learners about? |
| **Teacher** | Types of leaders. May be I wanted to say examples of leaders. Are there types of leaders? Examples of leaders are pastors, sheiks, DCs, members of parliament and also counsellors. Those are examples of leaders. |
| **Researcher** | I was asking that I want to learn more about types of leaders because I quoted you talking about dictator leader, laissez-faire. |
| **Teacher** | Those are styles of leadership. |
| **Researcher** | These are styles of leadership and not types of leaders? |
| **Teacher** | Styles of leadership |
| **Researcher** | Would you say something more about leadership styles? |
| **Teacher** | Yes. There are three types of leadership styles. These are democratic, |

| | |
|---|---|
| | leissezfaire, and dictatorship which is also known as absolutism and despotism. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. so those are the types of leaders you were teaching your learners about? |
| **Teacher** | Yes |
| **Researcher** | What was the aim of teaching them about types of leaders |
| **Teacher** | For them to know the types of leaders or leadership styles we follow here in Malawi. Others are democratic which is majority rule, others are dictatorship which they only get the leaders voice. While others are lesseizfaire, people do what they like. They should know because when they grow up, they should know that they will be leaders of tomorrow and they should be able to choose what type of leadership style they should choose as a leader. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you went into a case study which came from the book of Kings. I just wanted to learn more about what would have been the relationship between Expressive Arts and the case study taken from the Bible. Why did you choose that case study. Can you tell me more about the case study. |
| **Teacher** | The case study is in the Learners' Book and I just followed it. And the relationship between the case study and the topic is that the case study tell the learners about a certain leader who was full of wise. And they learn from that story that the leaders should have wisdom in order to solve people's problems. We were discussing types of leaders. I think there is a relationship. By discussing the qualities of good leaders. We discussed that leaders should also have wise in order to solve problems easily because of the wisdom. So it helped the learners a lot that they should also have wise in order to solve any problem they face. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you talked about the characteristics of the king in that case study. Can you say something more about the characteristics of the king in that case study? |
| **Teacher** | I think I wanted to enlighten learners that leaders have their own characteristics in what they do. What they do or, I am failing to express myself. Ma characteristics wo zimene ndimafuna ndinene ndi kuti kodi ma leaders ena amapanga zotani. Zomwe amachitazo ndi ma characteristics awo. For example, for pastors, what do they do? They pray for people, help the needy, they preach. I think those are their characters. |
| **Researcher** | I want to learn more about what characteristics of leaders your learners learned from that case study. Or what characteristics of leaders did you teach your learners by using that case study? |
| **Teacher** | By using that case study, o.k., the characteristics were that the learners should learn to be able to resolve conflicts as the king did and they should also be honest. They should be honest in settling disputes. Or they should be courageous enough. |
| **Researcher** | Then here, you talked about the examples of leaders which the learners know from their communities. Would you shed more light on this? |
| **Teacher** | The learners mentioned village heads, head teachers, pastors, sheiks and many others. |
| **Researcher** | And then here, you asked them a question about what are the duties of a village head. This question seems to have given some problems to the learners in your class. Why was it so? |
| **Teacher** | I think may be it is because they are living in urban areas and they don't |

| | |
|---|---|
| | know how chiefs or village heads do. May be, I think so. They are familiar with urban leaders rather than the village heads. That part is not suitable for the learners in urban areas |
| **Researcher** | So when you teach a topic in Expressive Arts which you feel that some of the elements in it are not suitable for learners of a certain context like urban learners, what do you normally do? What do you do? |
| **Teacher** | I sometimes avoid teaching it or I try to find a resource person. May be a village head to come and tell pupils what they do for them to have knowledge. |
| **Researcher** | Then what happened in this lesson. Why was there no village head as a resource person. |
| **Teacher** | I was confused. May be because when I saw you entering this class, I was confused. I was afraid. I was not steady. |
| **Researcher** | Then here, you asked them the question, what are the qualities of a good leader? May I know more about what you expected from your learners in their responses on the qualities of a good leader? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. they should tell me that leaders should be friendly. Leaders should be kind. They should be honest. They should have wisdom. They should be faithful and they should delegate others. |
| **Researcher** | Here you gave an example of a head teacher. May I learn more about why you also talked about the head teacher at the time you were looking at the village head? |
| **Teacher** | I just wanted the learners to follow me because the head teacher is my immediate boss. So I wanted the learners to have a clear picture of delegating that the head can delegate me to work somewhere in place of him because they are familiar with head teachers and teachers. If I gave that example, I thought that they should have a clear picture of delegating. Because they were unable to, what can I say, samadzidziwa bwino bwino za u head zo. Ndiye kuti ndingonena za village head zinali zovuta. |
| **Researcher** | So what would you say were the Expressive Arts skills embedded in this lesson on leadership? |
| **Teacher** | They should be able to cooperate with their friends. They should be cooperative and leadership. They should practice good behaviours in order to be good leaders. |
| **Researcher** | What would you sa**e**y on curriculum design, the way the material has been designed or written in relation to this topic on leadership? |
| **Teacher** | I think the styles of leadership are of higher level than the learners because they can just memorise but they may not know exactly what does it mean. I think it is for higher level rather than their level. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you so much for sparing your precious time for this interview. |

## 11.11: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 3

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about story telling pictures. I would like to learn more about this lesson. What were you trying to do in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | In that lesson, it was way of transmitting messages. To transmit a message from one place to another, it is the same as telling someone a story, giving someone information about something. There I wanted the learners to acquire skills of drawing so as to tell stories as they say that each and every face can tell a story. It is the same as a picture, it can also tell a story. |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more on what your learners came up with in the lesson as story telling pictures? |
| **Teacher** | The learners came up with pictures indeed. Some pictures were on danger warning. They were danger warning pictures. I remember one group drew a picture of someone driving and some people had removed the road signs and even the timber from the bridge. O.k. so the result of removing those timbers from the bridge was that of causing a road accident. That was the story. |
| **Researcher** | Here, I observed that the learners at a group where I was sitting were copying pictures on drug and substance abuse from their learners' textbook and not necessarily creating their own story telling pictures and when I looked across it was almost a similar story of the learners copying pictures form their textbooks rather than them creating their own pictures. May I learn more about this strategy of drawing by the learners in this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | In fact I wanted themselves to create a story. So those learners may be had forgotten their assignment that's why they copied from their textbooks. They remembered what they learned in lifeskills so may be that's why they went back to their textbooks. |
| **Researcher** | Here, I observed that the learners' pictures were on social problems which the learners encounter, either in their homes or at school. May I learn more about why this was the case? |
| **Teacher** | You know nowadays, these learners are encouraged in at least each and every lesson, they are taught about Life skills. It is a lesson in which they are required to get knowledge on how to manage themselves, including on issues of HIV/AIDS |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more on the relationship between the Life skills issues and Expressive Arts? |
| **Teacher** | The Life skills can help them to avoid engaging in bad moral behaviours for example drug and substance abuse. |
| **Researcher** | I actually wanted to know about whether Expressive Arts has Life skills in it? |
| **Teacher** | It seems there is Life skills in it |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more about what were the outcomes of your lesson, in other words, what did you want your learners to achieve at the end of the day? |
| **Teacher** | One, for them to have the skill of drawing and two, for them to have the skill of explaining about something. |
| **Researcher** | Would you say that those outcomes were achieved in this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Yes they were achieved. |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | May I know more about how you assessed that your outcomes were achieved? |
| **Teacher** | They were achieved just because most of the learners managed to draw the pictures. They were also able to explain what they drew. |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more about the issues of deforestation and early marriage on which your learners drew pictures on? |
| **Teacher** | These issues are the ones which affect learners and their learning in that once a girl is expectant for example, they may not come to school and the result will be poverty. For example in my class, about two girls have already dropped out from school because of pre-marital pregnancies. |
| **Researcher** | What would be your general comments on this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | This lesson I think was almost good because all the learners were participating. Both boys and girls were participating and were able to explain the effects of early marriages. All of them were able to explain the effects of early marriages. So they know how to manage themselves. |
| **Researcher** | May I know more about the curriculum design for this topic, story-telling pictures? What is your impression regarding the way the curriculum has been designed with reference to this topic? |
| **Teacher** | The design of the Teachers' Guide and the Learners' book on this topic is good. However the books are lacking some content. The content which is in the books is not enough for us to teach the content comfortably. |
| **Researcher** | In cases where you see that the curriculum material does not have the content which you wished if they had. What then do you do to make your teaching effective? |
| **Teacher** | We sometimes go to other friends, other teachers and get information from them. |
| **Researcher** | Thank very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

### 11.12: Post-lesson Observation interview 2 with Teacher 3

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about sewing stitches. I would like to learn more about this lesson. What were you trying to do in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | On this topic, it was part of needlecraft. So we wanted the learners to sew a small skirt and a pull over trousers. So before they sew those things, they need to know the stitches that they are going to use. |
| **Researcher** | I don't know much about temporary stitches and the other type of stitches which you covered in your lesson with your learners. Can you tell me more about these stitches? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. temporary stitches are stitches sewn temporarily to hold the material when we are sewing. We sew temporary stitches. They just hold the material temporarily. So they are about four types of temporary stitches. The first one is called even tacking, and the second one is called uneven tacking, and the other one is called long and short tacking and the last one is called tailor's tacking. The tailor's tacking is the tacking that is used by tailors when they are swing suits for example. |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | Here, you demonstrated to the learners how to sew all these types of tacking. Then you gave an activity to your learners to practice sewing these stitches. May I learn more about this activity you gave your learners and how it went? |
| **Teacher** | The response of the learners was positive. Boys were also keen to take part in this activity. They produced the tacking. |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more about the outcomes of this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The outcomes were that I wanted the learners to know and differentiate between different types of stitches because sometimes when they are going through the town, through the tailors, they just see the materials and ask themselves questions like, how do they sew this? But now they have known what stitches are. |
| **Researcher** | Would you say that from that lesson, your learners would now be able to sew? |
| **Teacher** | Yes, from that lesson, the learners can be able to sew their own items properly. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you spent about 10 minutes for your learners to practice sewing and it appears that most learners did not complete sewing a pull over trousers, what next would you do about that lesson since your learners did not finish practicing sewing? |
| **Teacher** | I gave them an assignment for them to complete the sewing at home. And they will bring the material in the next lesson to show me how they had sewn them. |
| **Researcher** | The teachers' guide says that you are supposed to observe and record each of your learners' performance in every activity of your lesson as continuous assessment. Can I have a look at what you have recorded as your learners' performance in the activities of today's lesson? |
| **Teacher** | [laughs]. I have not recorded the learners' performance. I did not have enough time to teach and assess the learners at the same time. Sometimes, I assess the learners, I assess them during the last lesson of the week when concluding the lessons of the week. |
| **Researcher** | Do you have any general comment on that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Yes. I may say that the lesson was a bit good but just because of lack of materials nowadays. You remember that a long time ago during the reign of Dr Banda, schools were supplied with materials and so we knew how to sew. But now you know things are expensive for a child to find clothes, thread and so many other materials, they are expensive. So this lesson, may be most of the teachers do not tackle it. Lack of materials is a very big challenge on the part of needlecraft in Expressive Arts because not all the learners bring the materials. So sometimes we have to spend our won money buying clothes for them to practice sewing. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for spending your precious time to grant me this interview. |

### 11.13: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 10

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about personal and general space. Can I learn more about what you were trying to do here in your lesson on personal and general space? |
| **Teacher** | I wanted the learners to differentiate between personal space as well as general space. If you talk about personal space, we are talking of the space which covers where they are and when we talk about the general space, we are talking about the space which covers a distance. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about your outcomes for this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | We were looking at how the body covers the distance, that was the main thing. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about personal space and general space, what are they concerned with? |
| **Teacher** | A personal space is the space in which an individual operates. May be you can talk of an example of jumping, if you tell the learners to jump, they can jump at the same space and that is personal space. If we talk of general space, we mean an area where a number of people operate for example may be we talk of may be running, they can run may be from point A to point B and that's general space. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you put your learners into groups to discuss the meaning of personal and general space. You came to the group of learners where I was sitting. Here, you were telling the learners the responses which you expected from them and you told them to write down these responses. Can I learn more about what was happening here? |
| **Teacher** | I was just trying to tell them how they can identify the activities that cover distances, such as running, discus and javelin. |
| **Researcher** | Here, what I want to learn more is about is your method you used where you were giving the learners responses instead of them giving the responses as that was what the activity you gave them was about, for them to find correct responses to the activity you gave them. |
| **Teacher** | Nanga sikuti ndinawona kuti ana akewo akulephera kunena**.** |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more as to why the learners amalephera kunena as you are putting it? |
| **Teacher** | As teachers, penapake tikuwona ngati kuti ana aja penepake pamakhala vuto kwambiri. There is a problem especially may be they don't hear English, that is may be the main problem. What they want is just may be that we should be teaching them in Chichewa, that's why may be when I am teaching, I try to translate every English sentence I produce into Chichewa ndi cholinga choti may be zomwe ndikulankhula zija atengepo kenakake kuposera ndi kuwaphunzitsa mu English through out it does n't work. Vuto si loti zinthuzo sakudzidziwa koma vuto ndi chizungu. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you taught about high jump, can I learn more about this game, the high jump? |
| **Teacher** | The high jump I was talking there is may be jumping where you are. May be say, jump, then you jump high and then you become low, that's the high jump. I was just trying to explain about personal space and I was talking |

| | |
|---|---|
| | about high jump as an example of personal space. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you taught about discus, can I learn more about discus? |
| **Teacher** | The discus I mentioned it when I was talking about the general space. If you have a discus somewhere, and when you want to throw it, you don't just throw. First of all you run just to get momentum, you run and then throw. That's you move from a point to another certain point. That is a general space. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you went out with your learners for them to practise jumping and throwing discus. Can I learn more about this activity? |
| **Teacher** | The learners were practicing long jump and throwing discus to emphasize on general space. Ndimawona ngati kuti most of them know personal space. Kumene akuchokeraku ndikuwona ngati personal space akuyidziwa chifukwa zikukhala ngati topic yi ikuchokera ku Standard 7, ndi continuation ya Standard 7. From the Guide here, akumapanga emphasize kwambiri kuti ana adziwe za general space. |
| **Researcher** | When you were demonstrating to them about throwing discus, you took a brick. Can I learn more about this activity which you did with your learners here? |
| **Teacher** | I used the brick as an example of a discus. A discus is an implement which is used when doing discus. It is round and I used the brick because its weight is similar to that of the real discus. |
| **Researcher** | What general comment do you have about your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The learners were doing chimene ndimafuna, only that may be the resources itself was a problem. We couldn't find the real discus. Mwinanso anawo mwina amalephera how to hold the brick as a discus. May be ana enawonso kuti athamange kuti achoke pena kufika pena mwina amatha kuthamanga in a lzy form may be that's why mwina brick ija imagwera pafupi and again ana ena were shy on how they can throw a discus. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more why some learners were shy to throw the discus as you are putting it? |
| **Teacher** | I don't know may be because may be because of their ages. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about your impression about the curriculum design for this topic about personal and general space? |
| **Teacher** | The curriculum design for this topic is just very good. I remember when I was at primary school, I used to do high jump as well as long jump and I remember that knowledge and I am now using that knowledge to teach the learners this topic. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

## 11.14: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 6

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson, you were teaching about team work. I want to learn more about this lesson. Can you tell me more about it? What were you trying to do in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. I wanted the learners to at least to see at least how team work helps either at this school or in their communities or anywhere where they might be for them to know how team work helps them. |
| **Researcher** | Here at the beginning of this lesson, you started by telling the learners that yesterday we looked at the cultural activities found in the communities and then you asked them the question, "what are these cultural activities found in these communities?"What did you expect your learners to tell you about cultural activities in their communities? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. first of all I was taking them from known to unknown. So I wanted them to see how these team work through cultural activities can work. So I wanted to see from them if they are able to remember what they did yesterday. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. So you wanted to start with them from known to unknown. O.k. what was the unknown which you were going to have with them at the end of the day? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. it was the new topic which I was going to introduce to them that today, we are going to look at this one and that. |
| **Researcher** | What exactly was this team work which you were teaching them? |
| **Teacher** | O.k., the team work which I wanted to teach them is that I wanted them to see for themselves how weaving can be done in a group and how carving can be done in a group and how drawing can be done in a group and at the end see to it how these team works helps in producing items through teamwork. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. So what would you say that your learners learned about teamwork? |
| **Teacher** | I may say that I did not achieve what I wanted them to learn. I did not go into details about team work with them. |
| **Researcher** | Why do you think that your learners were not able to learn about teamwork? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. when I was self assessing. Sometimes when I sit down I start assessing how does this lesson being conducted so I noted that I haven't emphasized on teamwork. Of course I mentioned some areas on how teamwork can be done. But now at the end, I did not emphasize that this team work helps and how it is important for them to conduct teamworks. As you can now see that in this new curriculum, they encourage team work. So It was just a matter of diverting to that but during this lesson, I didn't do it. |
| **Researcher** | So is this the normal way in which you assess yourself to find out whether your teaching is being effective in terms of your learners' learning what you want them to? |
| **Teacher** | No, sometimes we do practical things. So of course we are running short of time and so we can not do much of these practical things. Had it been that I had a lot of time, I could have divided them into groups and provide them with materials and from those groups, they could have been able to produce materials which at the end I could have been now able to say, you see now, |

| | |
|---|---|
| | these are the materials which you have brought from your groups. And then I could have asked them, how is it important to work in groups different from individuals. |
| **Researcher** | So you are talking of time, how short is the time in your Expressive Arts lessons? |
| **Teacher** | It is not too short as I am explaining but now if we consider practical things, time allocation for Expressive Arts is just too short. You find that in 35 minutes lesson, you are given topics. It is there for you to explain the topic to the learners and after that they are supposed to produce an item. Considering the time given, with the item, let us say to carve something, there is need for them to bring in some materials. You demonstrate how it should be done, or else you search for a resource person, it takes a lot of time and then you are expecting them in those 35 minutes to produce something. So I think time is too short. There are just too many activities in Expressive Arts for me to complete. |
| **Researcher** | So would you say that this is the approach you will be using in your Expressive Arts lessons, you will not be doing practicals? |
| **Teacher** | I will be doing the practicals |
| **Researcher** | In this lesson, there were a lot of activities in which you were supposed to do practicals but you are saying that time was not enough to do the practicals, and then you are saying that you will be doing the practicals, how will you manage then to do the practicals? |
| **Teacher** | Next time I think I will be requesting for my Expressive Arts periods to be at the end of the learning hours of the day so that I could stay longer with the learners to do the practicals. However, there is still the problem of materials. For example, in a certain lesson, there were a lot of materials required for a practical lesson such as the adzes, the panga knives. These are of course locally found, but now thinking of the time as we are rushing to exams, our main concern now for these learners is the time. |
| **Researcher** | So you are saying that you have the problem of materials. |
| **Teacher** | Yes, this is challenging to us. |
| **Researcher** | In your lesson, you mentioned a lot of things like carving and weaving. What mainly did you want to integrate in your Expressive Arts lesson, what do those ideas integrate in your Expressive Arts lesson? |
| **Teacher** | O.k., for example, like in weaving, it was like Needlecarft, in carving, it is Creative Arts. |
| **Researcher** | So in that lesson it means you had integrated Needlecraft and Creative Arts? |
| **Teacher** | Ya! |
| **Researcher** | Now, then in your approach in this lesson, I saw you from time to time code switching and that code switching actually means switching from official language of instruction for Standard 8, that is English to local language of Chichewa and then you were also accepting a lot of answers in the local language. Is that your methodology or why did you approach the lesson like that? |
| **Teacher** | I can talk of the level of understanding of our learners these days, you can not just proceed with using our official languages. It means you will left them behind (sic). So at least I was trying to integrate them in the lesson to see if they are able to grab anything that is being taught. That is why sometimes, I encourage those local language answers. But you can see that |

| | |
|---|---|
| | in certain occasions, I was trying to ask them to say what they said in Chichewa to be in English. |
| **Researcher** | So you think that your learners understand better what you are teaching if you mix English and local language of Chichewa? |
| **Teacher** | Ya! |
| **Researcher** | O.k. if you were to choose then to teach either in Chichewa or English in your Expressive Arts lessons in Standard 8, would you say that you would choose to teach the learners in Chichewa? |
| **Teacher** | No, I would not like to teach in Chichewa but there is need to mixing English and Chichewa in the lessons in order to be at the same level with the learners. Even if I mix English and Chichewa in my lessons, I give them notes in English which they use to prepare for examinations |
| **Researcher** | And then through and through, you were using question and answer method in your lesson, you asked them questions and you asked learners to volunteer to give answers as individuals and if it was involving the whole class, then it was most of the times in a chorus. You were asking them can you repeat in a chorus what you had told them and thus what they were doing. Is that the usual way you teach your Expressive Arts lessons or you did that for a specific reason in this lesson. |
| **Teacher** | I did it for a specific reason ,there are a lot of methods you can use to teach learners in Expressive Arts and not only question and answer but we are running out of time. We have to prepare the learners for Standard 8 examinations. When I was asking them from time to time the questions together, I just wanted to find out if they are all attentive. |
| **Researcher** | In your lesson, you talked of wedding ceremonies, installation of chiefs and wedding ceremonies, so at the end of the day, what would you say your learners have learned in this lesson on teamwork? |
| **Teacher** | They have learned how team work can be conducted in their communities and things that can be produced in team work in their communities and how this team work helps as they are doing it in their various communities. |
| **Researcher** | Would say that after they have known what initiation ceremonies, wedding ceremonies and installation of chiefs ceremonies performed in the community, from that lesson, would you say that they have got some skills which they can do practically in the community? |
| **Teacher** | No, on that one I can say no, they only know the methodologies there but the skills were not there. |
| **Researcher** | So you would still say that even if they learned about carving, they learned about weaving and even if they have to go out there, they can not do that practically, they can not weave something, they can not weave a mat? |
| **Teacher** | Some using their own knowledge they can. If you can ask them can you go home and bring a mat, some do bring them but at school level like this one, if you ask them that can you come with your materials, yes, they can bring them but now we are looking at time. Time is not there that is why I am focussing more on the theoretical part. |
| **Researcher** | Thanks very much for that, I appreciate very much for the information which you have given me on the lesson. I have learned more about what you were teaching in that lesson. |

## 11.15: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 12

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about wall chart. Can I learn more about what you were trying to do here in your lesson on wall chart? |
| **Teacher** | About wall chart, we wanted the learners to know what things can be used to make wall chart or to do drawaing. The materials they can use for drawing for them to come up with something which can be hung somewhere. So I wanted them to have that skill of drawing something and they should know the materials to use for the hunged pictures. Things like that. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you asked your learners to mentioned some materials which they can use for making wall chart. It appears that it was difficult for your learners to mention these materials. Can I learn more about why this might have been the case? |
| **Teacher** | It is because the topic is new to them. The word wall chart was also difficult for them to know because it is new to them. They failed to mention the materials for drawing a wall chart because drawing is also new to them. We have mainly been focusing more on preparing the learners for examinations in Standard 8 and therefore we have been just skipping the arts. Learners have not been taught art such as drawing. We have been concentrating on subjects which are going to appear on the examinations. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you asked your learners to draw whatever they would have liked to draw. Can I learn more about this activity which you gave your learners to do? |
| **Teacher** | On the activity of drawing, it was a problem for the them to draw something they created themselves. But later the lesson I arranged for another time again where they drew things which they had created themselves rather copying drawings from their Learners' book as they did in the lesson which you observed. I tried my best that although they had not done well in the lesson you observed, I should have time for them to draw things which they created themselves. They drew things out of their own creation. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you told your learners that they should not all of them just draw the same thing. They can draw other things as there were many things they could draw. Can I learn more about this same thing they all drew? |
| **Teacher** | It was an elephant. They all drew an elephant. This was because in one of the lessons before you came to be with us, I taught them how to draw an elephant and therefore all of them were drawing an elephant as this is one of the creatures which I taught them how to draw. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about the success criteria or the outcomes of this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The success criteria for this lesson was for them to draw something concerning cross cutting issues ands for them to know the materials that they can use to draw those items, that is what I wanted them to do. |
| **Researcher** | Do you have any other general comment on this lesson which you taught today? |
| **Teacher** | To me, this lesson was not very good because there were so many struggles for them to understand what exactly I wanted them to be done. When they were told to do something, they were doing a different thing so to me it was |

| | |
|---|---|
| | not very successful. |
| **Researcher** | O.k. so when you have an unsuccessful lesson like this one, what do you normally do next? |
| **Teacher** | I plan another lesson where I want them to do again the thing which I want. This is what I did after you left. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about what you think about the curriculum design for this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The design of the curriculum is fine. The only problem is resources. For drawing, we need a lot of resources and resources like crayons are difficult to find and if the government can not be providing these resources, then drawing can be a problem to teach the learners. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview |

### 11.16: Post-lesson Observation interview 2 with Teacher 12

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about collaborative sports and games. Can I learn more about what you were trying to do here in your lesson on collaborative sports and games? |
| **Teacher** | This topic was about football. But it gave me a lot of problems because I did not know the topic and the information in the Teachers' Guide was not enough and it gave me a lot of problems I tell you, but what we wanted is for them to know that there are games which involve people to work together, that is what the topic was about. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about a bout the game of football which you were teaching about in your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | As I said there isn't enough information on this topic in the Teachers' guide and I do not know much about this game and I struggled to teach this topic. |
| **Researcher** | Do you have a general comment on how this lesson on football went on? |
| **Teacher** | To me the lesson was not good because I did not know much about football. Although I was teaching the lesson, I did that just because the lesson is in the syllabus and I therefore had to teach it but I was not comfortable with the lesson. To me if I was not able to deliver the lesson well to the children, I think the children did not learn much from that lesson. |
| **Researcher** | What would you say about the curriculum design for this topic? |
| **Teacher** | For this topic, to me, I don't know about others but it is not good because the information given in the Teachers' Guide is not enough. As I said that for this topic, I just taught it for the sake of teaching it because it is in the syllabus but the information for this topic is not enough. I would therefore suggest that if it would be possible, those who do the curriculums, they should decide to ask the government to train us as teachers on this part of work so that we can know what football is, what netball, what volleyball is and all those games that are there in the syllabus. You can not stand there and teach the children about volleyball because we don't know what volleyball is. To me I suggest that if there is specific training given to the teachers on this topic, then it can be better and helpful because even if they give us the Teachers' Guide to use but they will never see the teachers |

| | |
|---|---|
| | teaching all the topics on games because they don't know the games and we can therefore not deliver. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

## 11.17: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 10

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about collaborative sports and games. Can I learn more about what you were trying to do here in your lesson on collaborative sports and games? |
| **Teacher** | We were coming up with the collaborative sports and games. We were talking about especially identifying sports as well as games that express the importance of working together. Then we talked about football as well as basket ball as well as netball. We talked about the importance of sports and games. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about the importance of sports and games which you discussed in the lesson with your learners? |
| **Teacher** | We said that sports and games are important because one, some of the players earn a living out of sports and games. Then we also said that sports and games are for entertainment. We have got some people who like football or netball and when they watch they get entertained. Then we also said that sports and games are for them to exercise their bodies. May be their bodies are weak and then if they do sports, their bodies can become strong. That is the importance of sports and games. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you asked your learners to mention the requirements of sports and games. Can I learn more about these requirements for sports and games? |
| **Teacher** | The requirements which we are talking about here, we are talking about may be things needed when doing such sports and games. For example, if we take football, what are the requirements. So the first one, we talked about the referee, that there should be a referee. Also the rules of the games that players need to have uniforms and may be for football itself, they can may be make a football out of paper or may be they can go to the shop and buy a football. These are the requirements of the games. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you talked about team sports that are played at home, school and club levels in Malawi. Can I learn more about these team sports that are played at home, school and club levels in Malawi? |
| **Teacher** | If you talk about team sports, you are talking about may be football, basketball or netball, volley ball and others. These are the team sports that are played in Malawi as well as at home, school and club levels. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you discussed much about football and netball as the most common team sports that are played in Malawi as well as at home, school and club levels. Can I learn more about these games of football and netball? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. football is a game which is played by 11 players. If you talk about a real football, it is played by 11 players and one player is a goal keeper and you have may be defenders, mid-fielders and the strikers. Each player amakhala m'madera mwawo, m'ma position mwawo, ndithu, that is about football. |
| **Researcher** | What about netball, can I learn more about netball? |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Teacher** | Netball is a game which nowadays is being played by both girls and boys. But if you talk about the past, they were just being played by the girls. It is played by seven players and we have an umpire who officiates the game and we have goal shooters and the defenders and we have some kaya amati ma centre kaya amati ma chiyani kaya? That is about football as well as netball. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you talked about Bawo. Can I learn more about Bawo? |
| **Teacher** | Bawo again is a game. The game is played by two people, one sits there and the other one sits here. They play using bawo, amakhala ndi chithabwa ndikukumba mayenje m'menemomo, mayenje amakhala about 32 and we use certain things called ngomo when playing bawo. And then the other side amasewera side yakeyake. Amakumba mayenje, munthu aliyense amakhala ndi mayenje ake 16 ndiye ikamadya amatenga ngomo zako zija ndiye you play like that. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you talked about Draught can I learn more about this game of Draught? |
| **Teacher** | About Draught, it was also my first time to hear from the learner about this game of Draught that there is Draught. I don't know how they play the game of Draught |
| **Researcher** | What is your comment about the curriculum design on this topic about collaborative sports and games? |
| **Teacher** | About the curriculum design, ma game ngati awawa, pakumakhala ngati there are new developments concerning these games ndiye zikumakhala ngati zambiri sitikudzidziwa ife aphunzitsi as we are living in the rural areas and we don't know them so the curriculum should contain information on the new developments in the games. There is at present very little information on football and other games in the Teachers' Guide. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

## 11.18: Post-lesson Observation interview 2 with Teacher 10

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about playing netball. Can I learn more about what you were trying to do here in your lesson on playing netball? |
| **Teacher** | We looked at what we had done in the previous lesson first, because I wanted kuti ana aja adziwe koma akuchoka ndi komwe akupita. Komanso ndimafuna kuti ndiwonetsetse kuti ndakwanitsa ma success criteria onse mu phunziro ndisanapite ku phunziro lina. Tisanapite ku phunziro lina timafuna kuti tiwonetsetse kuti ana aja tawatenga ndipo we are moving together ndiye we now come to the new lesson. Nanga si mu lesson iyi timakhala ngati tikuchoka ku ma collaborative sports and games ndiye timafuna kuti tiwone kuti how they can play netball. Ndiye timafuna kuti ndithu adziwe kaye zimenezozo ndiye tikamafika ku lesson iyi kuti now how they can play netball, kumafunika kuti adziwe kuti now the rules are there and now let us go outside and play netball. By then they would just be applying that knowledge of the rules which they learned to the netball. That was the main |

| | |
|---|---|
| | reason. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you took your learners out and you divided them into four groups to form four teams of netball. Can I learn more about this activity which you did with your learners here? |
| **Teacher** | The learners were competing as netball teams. If we talk about netball, they compete, the other side and that side. The team which scores more goals becomes the winner team. That's why they were competing but the real aim was not for the learners to compete but to see how they can play netball. Cholinga chenicheni chinali choti adziwe kuti kodi mpira wa netball amasewera bwanji and not to compete as such. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about your impression for this activity where the learners played netball? |
| **Teacher** | The game went on well only kuti few learners sanapange nawo participate in the lesson may be just because of the time and also may be mwina especially the boys because netball is not their game, they were shy. Ena aja amawona kovuta kuti apange apply ma skills ena amane amapezeka ku netball. Komanso lesson iyiyi imakhala ngati kuti penapake ikumakhala ngati kuti ili time consuming. It may be needs more time just may be for the learners to master the skills of may be shooting, passing and dodging, so it needs more time. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more on what you were mainly looking for from the learners when they were playing this game of netball? |
| **Teacher** | We were looking at may be how they are playing especially to the skills such as shooting, how they are shooting and then how they are catching and how they are passing and how they are dodging. This is what I was looking for from the learners. |
| **Researcher** | Would you say that your learners acquired the skills of shooting, catching and dodging in that netball games? |
| **Teacher** | In some learners, they had those skills. Some of them zimawoneka kuti zimawavuta chifukwa nanga si kuti some of them was for the first time for them to play netball especially the boys. But some of them amakhala ngati ali familiar amadziwa how they can pass and how they can shoot and that's why ndimawona kuti ana aja penapake amakhala ngati amandithandizanso. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about what you think about the curriculum design for this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The curriculum design for this topic is partly good only that may be as teachers we need more knowledge about netball to teach our learners better on how they can play netball and the information in the Teachers' Guide is not enough on this game of netball. Ndiye anzathu olemba ma bukuwa bwenzi akumatipatsako information yambiri zokhudza masewerawa. They should include enough information in the materials, the curriculum materials. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |
| **Teacher** | Bawo again is a game. The game is played by two people, one sits there and the other one sits here. They play using bawo, amakhala ndi chithabwa ndikukumba mayenje m'menemomo, mayenje amakhala about 32 and we use certain things called ngomo when playing bawo. And then the other side amasewera side yakeyake. Amakumba mayenje, munthu aliyense amakhala ndi mayenje ake 16 ndiye ikamadya amatenga ngomo zako zija ndiye you |

| | |
|---|---|
| | play like that. |

## 11.19: Post-lesson Observation interview 3 with Teacher 10

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about personal and general space. Can I learn more about what you were trying to do here in your lesson on personal and general space? |
| **Teacher** | I wanted the learners to differentiate between personal space as well as general space. If you talk about personal space, we are talking of the space which covers where they are and when we talk about the general space, we are talking about the space which covers a distance. |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more about the outcomes of this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | We were looking at how the body covers the distance, that was the main thing. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about personal space and general space, what are they concerned with? |
| **Teacher** | A personal space is the space in which an individual operates. May be you can talk of an example of jumping, if you tell the learners to jump, they can jump at the same space and that is personal space. If we talk of general space, we mean an area where a number of people operate for example may be we talk of may be running, they can run may be from point A to point B and that's general space. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you put your learners into groups to discuss the meaning of personal and general space. You came to the group of learners where I was sitting. Here, you were telling the learners the responses which you expected from them and you told them to write down these responses. Can I learn more about what was happening here? |
| **Teacher** | I was just trying to tell them how they can identify the activities that cover distances, such as running, discus and javelin. |
| **Researcher** | Here, what I want to learn more is about is your method you used where you were giving the learners responses instead of them giving the responses as that was what the activity you gave them was about, for them to find correct responses to the activity you gave them. |
| **Teacher** | Nanga sikuti ndinawona kuti ana akewo akulephera kunena**.** |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more as to why the learners amalephera kunena as you are putting it? |
| **Teacher** | As teachers, penapake tikuwona ngati kuti ana aja penepake pamakhala vuto kwambiri. There is a problem especially may be they don't hear English, that is may be the main problem. What they want is just may be that we should be teaching them in Chichewa, that's why may be when I am teaching, I try to translate every English sentence I produce into Chichewa ndi cholinga choti may be zomwe ndikulankhula zija atengepo kenakake kuposera ndi kuwaphunzitsa mu English through out it does n't work. Vuto si loti zinthuzo sakudzidziwa koma vuto ndi chizungu. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you went out with your learners for them to practise jumping and throwing discus. Can I learn more about this activity? |
| **Teacher** | The high jump I was talking there is may be jumping where you are. May be |

| | |
|---|---|
| | say, jump, then you jump high and then you become low, that's the high jump. I was just trying to explain about personal space and I was talking about high jump as an example of personal space. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you taught about discus, can I learn more about discus? |
| **Teacher** | The discus I mentioned it when I was talking about the general space. If you have a discus somewhere, and when you want to throw it, you don't just throw. First of all you run just to get momentum, you run and then throw. That's you move from a point to another certain point. That is a general space. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you went out with your learners for them to practise jumping and throwing discus. Can I learn more about this activity? |
| **Teacher** | The learners were practicing long jump and throwing discus to emphasize on general space. Ndimawona ngati kuti most of them know personal space. Kumene akuchokeraku ndikuwona ngati personal space akuyidziwa chifukwa zikukhala ngati topic yi ikuchokera ku Standard 7, ndi continuation ya Standard 7. From the Guide here, akumapanga emphasize kwambiri kuti ana adziwe za general space. |
| **Researcher** | When you were demonstrating to them about throwing discus, you took a brick. Can I learn more about this activity which you did with your learners here? |
| **Teacher** | The learners were practicing long jump and throwing discus to emphasize on general space. Ndimawona ngati kuti most of them know personal space. Kumene akuchokeraku ndikuwona ngati personal space akuyidziwa chifukwa zikukhala ngati topic yi ikuchokera ku Standard 7, ndi continuation ya Standard 7. From the Guide here, akumapanga emphasize kwambiri kuti ana adziwe za general space. |
| **Researcher** | When you were demonstrating to them about throwing discus, you took a brick. Can I learn more about this activity which you did with your learners here? |
| **Teacher** | I used the brick as an example of a discus. A discus is an implement which is used when doing discus. It is round and I used the brick because its weight is similar to that of the real discus. |
| **Researcher** | What general comment do you have about your lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The learners were doing chimene ndimafuna, only that may be the resources itself was a problem. We couldn't find the real discus. Mwinanso anawo mwina amalephera how to hold the brick as a discus. May be ana enawonso kuti athamange kuti achoke pena kufika pena mwina amatha kuthamanga in a lzy form may be that's why mwina brick ija imagwera pafupi and again ana ena were shy on how they can throw a discus. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more why some learners were shy to throw the discus as you are putting it? |
| **Teacher** | I don't know may be because may be because of their ages. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about your impression about the curriculum design for this topic about personal and general space? |
| **Teacher** | The curriculum design for this topic is just very good. I remember when I was at primary school, I used to do high jump as well as long jump and I remember that knowledge and I am now using that knowledge to teach the learners this topic. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this |

| | |
|---|---|
| | interview. |

## 11.20: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 4

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In today's lesson, you were teaching about playing mirroring games. I would like to learn more about this lesson, what were you trying to do in this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Mirroring games are games whereby a teacher or an instructor instructs the learners how to play that games. So when he or she is instructing, the learners observe him or her, it is like as if they are seeing him at a mirror and this is where the name comes from, it is mirroring games. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you discussed with learners mirroring games like netball, tennis and basketball, but you chose football for the learners to practice playing, may I know more as to why you chose specifically football out of all the many games which you discussed with your learners? |
| **Teacher** | I chose football because it's a game of mixture, the boys and girls all of them play this game. So I mixed the boys and the girls to play. The game is also not difficult to play. It can easily be done. |
| **Researcher** | So you say you chose a game which can easily be done by both boys and girls. I observed that there was someone else there, who is not a member of staff, he is not a teacher, but he was the one teaching the learners how to play football at the football pitch. May I learn more about that person who was teaching your learners about football at the football pitch? |
| **Teacher** | I thought of this idea of bringing a resource person because I am not familiar with this game, football. So I thought it wise to bring a resource person who is a coach of a team. I thought it wise to bring this man who is a coach of a certain team and I understand the game went well because of this man, instead of doing it myself because I am not familiar with the game. |
| **Researcher** | May I know more about this resource person, who is he particularly? |
| **Teacher** | The resource person a young man from one of the teams from the community around the school. So he knows football very well. |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more about the specific skills which the resource person was able to impart to your learners which you couldn't do yourself in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The specific skills he imparted are push ups. He did running, the learners were running from the centre of the ground to the goal and back and also how to divide a team. I don't know how a football team is divided. |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more about the outcomes of this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The lesson was fine because the learners played the football and they enjoyed it especially the girls, I saw them that they were interested with the game. |
| **Researcher** | I wanted to learn more about the outcomes of this lesson which you planned before hand that you were to achieve with your learners? |
| **Teacher** | I wanted the learners to know how football is played and how many in this team of football. So they should know how this football is played. |
| **Researcher** | In general, what would be your comments on this specific lesson? |
| **Teacher** | The lesson went on well because I had a resource person. On my own may |

| | |
|---|---|
| | be the lesson would have not come up like that so because of this man, he helped me and the lesson was very good and learners were interested. |
| **Researcher** | Do you have any comments on the curriculum design of Expressive Arts on this lesson. How is the curriculum design. What is your impression? |
| **Teacher** | The curriculum design is not all that bad, only that the teachers are lacking some knowledge on the games. |

## 11.21: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 5

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about making musical instruments. I would like to learn more about this lesson. What were you trying to do in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | I wanted to show my learners that when singing we can use musical instruments to make the song very nice and that they can actually make these musical instruments themselves. So at first, I made them to a sing a song without using any musical instrument so that after making our musical instrument and when playing the musical instrument with the song, they should a difference. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you took your learners outside the classroom to the football ground where they sat under the tree and they were making musical instruments. Can I learn more as to what was happening there? |
| **Teacher** | There we went out because when we were in the classroom, the learners were just so many. And even the environment could not help them to make the musical instruments very well because of the congestion in the classroom and so we went out to have enough space for making the musical instruments. |
| **Researcher** | Now, when they went out there to make the musical instruments, can I learn more about your impression on how everything went? |
| **Teacher** | Others were participating very nicely but others were just playing may be because of the environment which they were in outside the classroom. So some thought that it was just a playing time. Majority did very well on the making of musical instruments although others had problems just like what I have just said that they were playing and they were not taking the practical work seriously because they thought that because they were out, they could just play. |
| **Researcher** | Now what are you going to do about the lesson after having seen that other learners were not very serious in that lesson? |
| **Teacher** | In the next lesson, we are not going to repeat the same lesson but the learners are not going to out again. They will do the activities here, right away in the classroom. |
| **Researcher** | What general comments do you have about this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | After the learners made the musical instruments, they used them. They played them and the majority played the musical instruments and they enjoyed themselves. This shows that the lesson was nice. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about your feelings about the curriculum design on this topic on musical instruments? |
| **Teacher** | I can say that we are some lacking some information on how to design some |

| | |
|---|---|
| | of the musical instruments because the information in the curriculum on how to design musical instruments is not enough. Most of the times, I was just guessing when I was telling the learners let's do this and lets do that. I was just using my common sense but the information in the Teachers' Guide was not there. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more on what you normally do with your lesson when you find that there isn't enough information in the Teachers' Guide on a certain topic? |
| **Teacher** | Normally when we face that problem, we just ask our friends until we get some information to help the learners. |
| **Researcher** | Thanks very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

## 11.22: Post-lesson Observation interview 2 with Teacher 5

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about making musical instruments. You were continuing with your yesterday's lesson on making musical instruments. I would like to learn more about this lesson. What were you trying to do in this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | In this lesson we continued our work and we were trying to finish it up because it was a continuation and we did that one in the classroom because yesterday we went out but it was not successfully done so I was repeating this lesson with them so that may be we could have completed the work. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you put learners into groups to make musical instruments. Can I learn more about your impression of this activity, how did it go? |
| **Teacher** | I went in the groups and I urged them to do the work together. I told them that both boys and girls should take part. So the learners worked together. |
| **Researcher** | Here, during this time, you stood outside the classroom while your learners were working on the task in the classroom. Can I learn more as to what was actually happening here? |
| **Teacher** | I sent some learners outside to collect materials because they did not bring their materials. So I was working with this group which went outside. |
| **Researcher** | Here, one learner complained that pachuruka anthu apapa, sitingathe kugwira bwino ntchito. Can I learn more about this learner's complaint? What was he complaining about? |
| **Teacher** | The learner was complaining about being too many in their group. This is our main problem. Our classes are very, very large so it was difficult for me to make so many groups and as a result we had very large groups. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about what you then actually do in order to still make the teaching of your lesson effective in these circumstances where you have very large groups? |
| **Teacher** | I try to have some group leaders. Two or three per group to assist their friends. And I also move around to help them with the help of those group leaders. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you complained that the learners had made a lot of flutes compared to other musical instruments. Can I learn more about your complaint here? |
| **Teacher** | On making a lot of flutes, most learners found it easy because the materials for making flutes are easy to find. It was not difficult for them to find the |

| | |
|---|---|
| | materials for making those flutes and so they made the flutes. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you asked your learners the question who knows how to play a guitar. One learner volunteered that he knows how to play a guitar. You gave this learner an electric guitar and not necessarily a guitar which the learners had made in the lesson. Can I know more about what was happening here? |
| **Teacher** | After making our musical instruments, most of them were not functioning, so we just tried to take another guitar so that we can see who can play it. |
| **Researcher** | Do have any general comment on your lesson on making and playing musical instruments? |
| **Teacher** | I can say that the lesson was so nice. The learners were very happy playing with materials which they made using their own hands. Even some other classes were admiring their friends when they were playing the musical instruments in that lesson. |

## 11.23: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 8

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your lesson today, you taught learners about dances that convey and communicate messages. I would like to learn more about this lesson. What were you trying to do in this lesson on dances that convey and communicate messages? |
| **Teacher** | In this lesson, what was happening is that I wanted the learners to know the types of dances that convey messages because some of the dances can not convey messages. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about these dances which convey messages? |
| **Teacher** | The type of dances that convey messages which were identified in the lesson were Mganda, Manganje, Gulewamkulu, Masewe, Beni, Chiwoda. These were the dances which convey messages. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about each of these dances which convey messages? |
| **Teacher** | Mganda most of the times is danced by both men and women using drums and whistle. |
| **Researcher** | Here you asked the learners to mention specific districts where Mganda is performed, can I learn more about these districts where Mganda is performed? |
| **Teacher** | Mganda is mainly performed in the central region districts like Lilongwe. Some learners mentioned Zomba as well. |
| **Researcher** | What about Manganje, can I learn more about this dance? |
| **Teacher** | Manganje is mainly danced here in Zomba during the initiation ceremonies. It when they dance Manganje in the community. |
| **Researcher** | What about Gulewamkulu, can I learn more about Gulewamkulu? |
| **Teacher** | Gulewamkulu is mainly danced in the central region. They dance during the funeral ceremonies mainly. |
| **Researcher** | What about Masewe, can I learn more about Masewe? |
| **Teacher** | Masewe also they dance here in the southern region. For example, here in Zomba, they dance that dance of Masewe. They used to dance mainly during some functions for example za chipanizi, they used to call those groups of Masewe dancers to dance there just in order to entertain the people. |

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | What about Beni, can I learn more about Beni? |
| **Teacher** | Beni also the same as Masewe, they perform to entertain the people. |
| **Researcher** | What about Chioda, can I learn more about Chioda? |
| **Teacher** | Chioda is mainly danced by women. |
| **Researcher** | Here, your learners were arguing on Mganda. The class could not agree on what exact time of the day is the dance danced? Can I learn more about the time of the day when Mganda is danced? |
| **Teacher** | Mganda is danced during the day and at night. It is not danced only during the day or night, no, but both. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about the specific cultural messages which these dances convey? |
| **Teacher** | Mainly Mganda is performed when a family is going to have a wedding ceremony. It is when they practice Mganda. They actually practice dancing Mganda for so many days for them to prepare to dance at a wedding ceremony. The same as Manganje, they do the same when they are preparing for initiation ceremonies. They practice dancing Manganje for so many days for them to prepare for an initiation ceremony. |
| **Researcher** | What would you say your outcomes of your lesson were in this lesson? What did you want your learners to learn by the end of the day? |
| **Teacher** | I wanted the learners to know what happens or what messages are conveyed by dancing that type of dance. For example Mganda, why they dance it and what type of message is conveyed by this dance. |
| **Researcher** | Here, when you asked your learners about the occasions when the dances you discussed in your lesson are performed, they were mentioning education day. Can I learn more about education day? |
| **Teacher** | Most of the learners were mentioning education day because it's when they know that they perform those dances. They forget that even in their villages during some of the days, they perform these dances. |
| **Researcher** | The teachers' guide says that you are supposed to observe and record each of your learners' performance in every activity of your lesson as continuous assessment. Can I have a look at what you have recorded as your learners' performance in the activities of today's lesson? |
| **Teacher** | I have not recorded the learners' performance. I memorise the performance of each learner and I record their performance later. These grades make up the learners grades for the term. I can not manage to teach and assess the learners at the same time. |
| **Researcher** | What is your general comment on this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | My general comment is that few learners managed to achieve the success criteria of the lesson but most of them did not achieve the success criteria which was for them to know the dances that convey cultural messages. |
| **Researcher** | Can I learn more about what your impression is concerning the way the curriculum has been designed on this topic on dances that convey cultural messages? |
| **Teacher** | For this topic, the curriculum is not clear mainly the Teachers' Guide. They have only written few points there which is not enough. The curriculum designers have also left out some of the dances that convey messages. They have just given only few dances. |
| **Researcher** | Thank you very much for sparing your precious time to grant me this interview. |

## 11.24: Post-lesson Observation interview 1 with Teacher 7

| | |
|---|---|
| **Researcher** | In your today's lesson, you were teaching about multicultural performances. I would like to learn more about this lesson which you have just taught today, what were you trying to do in this lesson on folk dances? |
| **Teacher** | I just wanted to tell them that, at first I wanted to give the meaning of multicultural performances and folk dances. After giving the meaning of folk dance, I wanted to them to list some ethnic groups which they know or their own ethnic groups. For example, I myself, I gave that example that, I told them that my ethnic group is Lomwe. And the type of folk dance I perform is Tchopa. So I wanted to give them the first information that the meaning of ethnic group is the same as a tribe. I wanted them to know that ethnic group is the same as tribe in the first place. And folk dance is the same as traditional dances. That is why I expressed myself to them that my type of ethnic group is Lomwe and type of folk dance is Tchopa. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you put your learners into groups, to study the illustrations, illustrations A, B and D. What was this activity all about? What were you trying to do here? |
| **Teacher** | The illustrations are pictures showing types of folk dances. Like Beni, Vimbuza. I wanted them to identify the folk dances that were shown in the illustrations. |
| **Researcher** | Here you asked them to list the districts where the dances shown in the illustrations are performed. May I learn more about what learners came up with in this activity? |
| **Teacher** | They came up with answers like for example Vimbuza is performed in Karonga. Beni they said Mangochi, Machinga, Zomba. I asked them to discuss 5 folk dances and where they are performed. |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more about these dances which the learners came up with in the activity? |
| **Teacher** | They mentioned that Ngoni perform Ingoma dance. Then they said that Tumbuka, they perform Vimbuza dance. They also said the Lomwe perform Tchopa dance. The Chewa perform Gulewamkulu. |
| **Researcher** | May I learn more about these dances. What are they all about, Ingoma, Tchopa, Gulewamkulu? |
| **Teacher** | These are examples of folk dances which are performed in different districts. |
| **Researcher** | Would you mind to explain to me what Ingoma is, what Tchopa is? |
| **Teacher** | :O.k. Ingoma is a type of folk dance performed by the Ngoni. Women put on chitenje and they clap hands. While men, they put on banana leaves and in the legs they put on bottle tops and they dance while women are clapping hands. While Gulewamkulu is practiced by the Chewa. Men put on banana leaves or piece of cloth and they perform this Gulewamkulu where there is some a funeral ceremony, they perform this Gulewamkulu. |
| **Researcher** | O.k., would you mind to tell me something more about Tchopa? |
| **Teacher** | Tchopa is also another type of folk dance practiced by the Lomwe and this type of folk dance happens when there is initiation ceremony or wedding ceremony and even at chieftainship. In this type of folk dance, they dance |

| | |
|---|---|
| | men and women. Men and women make a large circle. And they dance all together. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you talked about zikiri dance, can you tell me something more about zikiri? |
| **Teacher** | O.k., sikiri is performed by the Yao. This type of dance, they perform during initiation ceremony. Women put on duku and veil. Men put on m'khanjo and they dance. This is perfomed at a Moslem cerebration. |
| **Researcher** | Here, you gave you called upon learners who belong to Zimbabwe, Mozambique, DRC, Botswana to come together. May I learn more, what was this all about? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. these names of countries are names of the normal groups I have in the class. Whenever I want them to do an activity in groups, I ask them to go to these groups. |
| **Researcher** | Here you told your learners than they should not respond to you in chorus. Can I learn more about your teaching strategies which you employed in this lesson? |
| **Teacher** | O.k. when I said don't answer in chorus answers, I meant that when I ask a question for example define a folk dance, I want the learners to answer one after another and not in a group. That's why I said I don't want chorus answers. |
| **Researcher** | So in general, what would you say about this lesson, what you were trying to do in the lesson? |
| **Teacher** | Only that we have problems on this book. The problem is there is no enough information from the teachers' guide or the pupils' book. We need to be resourceful. For example, our previous topic on artistic items, I asked them the qualities of a good poster. On that topic, there is no information in the book about the characteristics of a good poster and on that one I used my own source. I asked my friends, what are the qualities of a good poster because there is no information about qualities of a good poster, I used my own information. But the problem is that you can not always depend on others to give you information. Sometimes they may not be there themselves or they may not even have the information you want themselves. So you use your own initiative. Even in the learners' book, there is no enough information. But if they add other information, then that will help. |
| **Researcher** | The teachers' guide says that you are supposed to observe and record each of your learners' performance in every activity of your lesson as continuous assessment. Can I have a look at what you have recorded as your learners' performance in the activities of today's lesson? |
| **Teacher** | I was not trained properly on how to use Continuous Assessment. The time is also not enough to teach and record learners' performance at the same time. I however teach the same lesson twice. I repeat it and I assess when I am revising the lesson. |
| **Researcher** | Well, I appreciate very much for sparing your precious time for granting me in this interview. |

## APPENDIX 12: ANALYSIS OF TEACHERS' RESPONSES TO THE QUESTIONNAIRE

### a. How well teachers understand Expressive Arts intended curriculum

This section presents teachers' perceptions and understanding of Expressive Arts curriculum in Malawi. The aim of this research was to explore how teachers were teaching the prescribed content in Expressive Arts. A national curriculum of this nature involves a change of teachers' classroom practices which may also entail teachers abandoning some of their hard-learned practices in order to implement the new curriculum in the way the developers had prescribed. Although the purpose of the curriculum review in Malawi was to improve the standards of education, curriculum materials alone cannot do this without the teachers understanding the content and using the methodology in the curriculum they are implementing. Hence there is need for persuading and re-educating teachers. It is teachers, and only teachers, who can improve the educational standards. This means that teachers must be knowleagable about what the innovation is all about. An attempt was therefore made in this study to investigate how well teachers' understand the content, pedagogy and assessment the developers prescribed in the 'intended' curriculum. It is hoped that such data would lead to an understanding of some of the reasons teachers implement the Expressive Arts curriculum the way they did as presented in chapter 8. Teachers' understandings are presented and matched against what developers prescribed. Evidence for how well teachers understand the intended curriculum of Expressive Arts was collected through a questionnaire. Questions aimed to learn teachers' understanding about the design of Expressive Arts curriculum, particularly the content, methodology and assessment in Expressive Arts.

At the outset, it is important to note that insights into such matters are highly contextualised and dependent on local circumstances of the selected teachers. As a result, no attempts are made at generalising findings. In what follows, the perceptions and understandings of a selected group of Expressive Arts teachers are documented, in relation to design, pedagogy and assessment of the intended curriculum of Expressive Arts.

### b. Teachers' understanding of the Design features of the Expressive Arts curriculum

What then are the teachers' understandings of the design features of the intended Expressive Arts curriculum? Evidence from teachers' responses to the questionnaire showed that the majority of the teachers knew the design features of the Expressive Arts curriculum in the way curriculum developers prescribed them. All the twelve teachers who participated in the survey mentioned that Expressive Arts is an integration of subject disciplines of Physical Education, Needlecraft, Music, Drama and Creative Arts. They also indicated clearly themes which integrate these subjects in Expressive Arts. They mentioned themes such as self-expression, personal and general space, conveying cultural messages, multicultural performance, designing and construction and performing dances. All the twelve teachers also indicated correctly the outcomes of the curriculum. The responses of the teachers thus show that the teachers involved in the study know the design features and contents of the intended curriculum of Expressive Arts.

### c. Teachers' understanding of the methodology for teaching Expressive Arts

In terms of the teachers' knowledge of the prescribed methods for teaching Expressive Arts curriculum, most teachers indicated learner-centred approach as the prescribed methodology for teaching Expressive Arts. They indicated clearly that learner-centeredness refers to teaching involving learners fully in lessons, learners expressing themselves to construct their understanding of concepts, learners being given time to assimilate concepts, and that learners understand Expressive Arts teaching best when it is not teacher-centered. The teachers show that they understand learner-centredness as learners actively participating in learning, helping each other and sharing of ideas through discussion with peers. Their understanding of learner-centredness is that it is similar to group-work.

### d. Teachers' understanding of the assessment methodologies for Expressive Arts

In terms of the prescribed methods of assessing learners in Expressive Arts, teachers indicated that they are supposed to do continuous assessment. However, they indicated that it is not easy for them to do continuous assessment in large classes.