

https://dspace.org/

Impact of Alexandra Renewal Project on Women in Informal Dwellings: A Case Study of Women in Far East Alexandra

Mazamane, Zintathu

2015-11

University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg

http://hdl.handle.net/10539/20968

Mazamane, Z (2015). Impact of Alexandra Renewal Project on Women in Informal Dwellings: A Case Study of Women in Far East Alexandra, Johannesburg

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

IMPACT OF ALEXANDRA RENEWAL PROJECT ON WOMEN IN INFORMAL DWELLINGS: A CASESTUDY OF WOMEN IN FAR EAST ALEXANDRA

Zintathu Sigcine Mazamane

A research report submitted to the School of Architecture and Planning, Faculty of Engineering and Built Environment, University of the Witwatersrand Johannesburg in fulfilment of the requirements for the Honours Degree of Bachelor of Science in Urban and Regional Planning.

Johannesburg, 2015

Declaration

I declare that this research report is my own. It is submitted for the Degree of Bachelor of Science in Urban and Regional Planning (Honours) in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other University.

Zintathu Sigcine Mazamane

11 November 2015

Dedication

To my late grandma (Khulu), I wish you could have stayed long enough to see the product of your unconditional, selfless love and discipline, to see the work of your hands.

Malum' Fundile—the only uncle I've ever known, you're not forgotten. I'm still pursuing the very thing you wrote about in your songs—it's unfortunate that no one will ever hear them. I know you would be proud.

Bubele, I try to live a long fulfilling life for the both of us. The dreams, goals, aspirations and plans we both made for the future will be the reason I work harder every day.

To every loved one who's passed on, Gogo, Auntie Ntombi, you have all made me a better and stronger person. I love and miss you guy, always.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to extend my gratitude to my supervisor, OlumuyiwaAdegun for his valuable guidance and support. Your dedication and expectations have pushed me to work harder than I thought possible. I also want to appreciate your understanding and patience when thingsbecame unbearable. I'm grateful to the women from Far East Alexandra who participated in my research. You all sacrificed your time to take part in my research even though some of you had things to do.

I wish to thank my friends and family who supported me throughout. Things haven't always been smooth but I could always count on you to be there when I needed you. To the Ngonyama, Vilakazi, Manyangaza, Maga, Kamlana and Mafuta families, you have been there since the journey began and I appreciate your love and support. To my sisters—Percy, Snalo and Mbali, you have all made me look good at all times and you've been my source of encouragement. My dearest nephew Hlelo and brother Keke, you both give me great pleasure.

Then I must acknowledge my mother—Ntombekhaya who is my rock. Words cannot begin to express the gratitude and love I have for you. God couldn't have given me a better support, mentor, friend and cheerleader. I appreciate and respect all that you are and all that you have endured to make a better life for me. To my dad, who taught me to be strong-willed and independent, I treasure your love and support.

Finally, to my heavenly father, God, I would like to thank you for all the experiences I've had, the challenges I've faced and everything that happened to prepare me for a greater future. I wish to thank you for your love, faithfulness, patience, courageand strength you've constantly shown towards me.

Table of Contents

Declaration **2**

Dedication **3**

Acknowledgements **4**

List of Tables **7**

List of Acronyms **7**

Abstract **8**

1. Chapter One: Introduction **9**

1.1. Setting the scene: Background and Problem statement 9

1.2. Motivation for the Research 10

1.3. Position of the Research 11

1.4. Research Questions 12

1.4.1. Research Sub-questions 12

1.5. Definition of Terms 13

1.6. Limitations of the study 15

1.7. Structure of the Report 16

2. Chapter Two: Literature Review **18**

2.1. Introduction 18

2.2. Informal settlements and Informal Settlement Upgrading 18

2.3. From Informal Settlement demolition to Informal Settlement Upgrading 19

2.4. Women and Households 22

2.5. Women and Informal Settlement Upgrading 24

2.6. Conclusion 25

3. Chapter Three: Methods of Research **27**

3.1. Study Area: Alexandra Township, Far East 27

The Alexandra Renewal Project 29

3.2. Type of research: Case Study of Alexandra 30

3.2.1. Case study of Alexandra 30

3.2.2. Qualitative Research Method 30

3.2.3. Data Sources 31

3.2. Data Collection 33

3.3. Data Analysis 33
3.4. Ethical Observations 34
3.5. Challenges from field work 35
4. Chapter Four: Findings from the Field Work 38
4.1. Introduction 38
4.2. Socio-demographic Information of participants 38
4.3. The Impact of informal settlement upgrading on women Alexandra in the Far East 42
4.3.1. Economic Impact 43
4.3.2. Social Impact 46
4.3.3. Environmental and Health Impact 50
4.4. The Impact of the Alexandra Renewal Project from the Perspective of the City of Johannesburg in Association with Human Sciences Research Council 51
4.5. Discussion of the Findings 54
4.6. Conclusion 62
5. Chapter Five: Conclusion 64
5.1. Analysis of the findings using Laura Jaitman's (2012) formula on Slum Upgrading Programs Evaluation 64
5.1.1. Housing outcomes 65
5.1.2. Individual outcomes 66
5.1.3. Neighbourhood outcomes 67
5.2. Recommendations 71
5.3. Conclusion 73
Reference List 75
Appendices 80
Appendix 1: Participant's Information Form 80
Appendix 2: Consent Form 81
Appendix 3: Interview Questionnaire ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

List of Figures

Figure 1: Sections of Alexandra and their housing typologies since 2001-- When the ARP began 28
Figure 2: Informal settlement known as Sjwetla 42
Figure 4: A house with a rented backyard shack 45
Figure 3: Restaurant/ internet cafe where only women are employed 45
Figure 5: Internet cafe owned by a woman 46
Figure 6: Spaza shop- a main source of income for the family 46

List of Tables

Table 1: Share of Essential Household Expenditure Contributed by Women over Men. 23
Table 2: Personal details of the participants.....39
Table 3: Incidents of Crime reported for the Alexandra area (CoJ and HSRC, 2003).....47
Table 4: Frequently used evaluation indicators by the housing outcome (Jaitman, 2012) 65
Table 5: Frequently used evaluation indicators by the individual outcome (Jaitman, 2012) 66
Table 6: Frequently used evaluation indicators by the neighbourhoods outcome (Jaitman, 2012) 67

List of Acronyms

ACA: Alexandra Civic Association

ADF: Alexandra Development Forum

ARP: Alexandra Renewal Project

BNG: Breaking New Ground

CBA: Cost Benefit Analysis

CoJ: City of Johannesburg

MEC: Member of Executive Council

RDP: Reconstruction and Develop Program

UISP: Upgrading of Informal Settlement Programme

Abstract

Studying on women's challenges in urban areas might be a voice for these women and they should create a platform on which policies can address these issues. As a result, this research which is based in Alexandra Township (in the Far East) looks at the impact that informal settlement upgrading had on the women of the Far East after the Alexandra Renewal Project. The study is fundamentally an assessment of the quality of services delivered to the residents of Alexandra in the Far East. It investigates how the RDP houses along with other basic services in the Far East have helped women to improve their livelihood. Twelve women living in the far East Bank were interviewed. The impacts of the project are divided into three categories, the social, economic and the environmental. Within each category there were both negative and positive impacts that the upgrading had on the women. The study identifies negative externalities accompanied by informal settlement upgrading in Alexandra. This study provides a unique gender perspective of women's challenge in informal settlements and the impact of informal settlement upgrading in an urban environment.

1. Chapter One: Introduction

1.1. Setting the scene: Background and Problem statement

Informal settlements have been one of the major areas of research in South Africa and in Africa as whole. This is because informality has become a reality and characterizes most cities in the global south. During the colonial era, access to and living in urban areas was limited to white population. Nonwhite citizens had to remain in the Bantustans and were not allowed into the city unless they presented a permit, also known as a dom-pass. Black people were only allowed into the city for employment and even then, after specific hours of the day they had to return to townships. In 1994, when the country became a democratic state, apartheid laws that restricted access to the city were abolished and this changed the settlements patterns in South African cities. Migration of rural dwellers to cities in search for employment increased dramatically thus leading to increase in informal settlements which provided accommodation at little or no cost for them in the cities.

Informal settlements are characterized by unhealthy living conditions, poverty and vulnerability, inadequate services and infrastructure. They are usually unlawful and illegal at times because they contravene land use regulations and property laws (Datta, 2008; Agency, 2012). The Gauteng Province has the highest number of informal settlements in South Africa and it also has the highest number of households in informal settlements (Agency, 2012). This might be because the city is the nation's economic hub and as a result attracts a lot of job-seeking migrants, thus leading to the highest housing backlog (Abraham, 2003).

The research will look at the Alexandra as a township containing an informal settlement. Within Alexandra Township, the research will focus on the Far East Bank section where new houses were built under the Alexandra Renewal Project. Throughthe state-funded Alexandra Renewal Project between 2001 and 2014, Alexandra Township has gone through a process of renewal and informal settlementupgrading.However, the area is still faced with many socio-economic and physical problems.

This research will look beyond the common assumption of informal settlements as entities where people have the same or similar needs, because often they are not examined for their diverse nature. It will specifically examine the needs of women which are often ignored. It will look at the extent to which the needs of women were met in the Far East where informal settlements 'upgrading' took place in Alexandra. It will also study the benefits derived by women from houses developed as part of informal settlement upgrading project. Thus study will also examine how these benefits help them achieve their personal goals as well as personal or communal adjustments that accompanied by the housing developments.

1.2. Motivation for the Research

According to the Stats SA (2011), about 51.3% of the South African population is female and within the Johannesburg Municipality, 49.4% of the population is female. About 58.5% of the female population in the city has never been married and only 26.1% actually married. Out of the 1, 434, 856 households in Johannesburg, 36.2% are female-headed.The average household size has decreased from 3.2 persons per household in 2001 to 2.8 in 2011 (Stats SA, 2011). These statistics speak to the nature of households in South Africa where fewer people enter intomarriage and more and more households are being headed by women and decreasing in size. It shows the prevalence of independence among women. Research should therefore pay more attention to these realities so that issues around service delivery and housing delivery among others are appropriately dealt with.

Women from an early age are usually accustomed to certain norms and expectations by societies; they have to take on particular roles and responsibilities. These include reproductive and domestic roles—a woman as a care taker, responsible for cleaning, cooking and making sure that everyone is well taken care of within a home. Women also have productive roles, that is, to be economically active and contribute income to the home. The last one is a communal role, which requires women's involvement in communal matters and activities (Gwagwa, 1994).Sometimes these roles are conflicting. For instance, when women spend more time gathering resources to take care of the family, they might not have time to be involved in societal matters. Over the years, women's roles have expanded to a breadwinning role. Since

the number of female-headed households in South Africa is great, more women now have to provide for their families—being the main financial support system (Gwagwa, 1995). This situation puts more pressure on women, especially those in informal settlements where resources and basic services are inadequate; hence the need to study women in informal settlements.

Although there have been a number of studies on informal settlements, only a few have focused on gender—specifically women. As Zhou and Schylter (1995) explain, many difficulties faced by women do not take priority in urban studies hence it becomes a challenge to analyze issues from a gender perspective. This study aims to make a contribution that fills this gap.

1.3. Position of the Research

Informal settlements have been a common area of research in the country and the world as whole. However, as far as informal settlement upgrading and service delivery goes, there is very limited literature that goes beyond the point when National Government provides low cost RDP houses and services to the poor. Only a few studies go further to interrogate the aftermath and the effects of such service delivery (Oldfield, 2002).

The evaluation and monitoring report of 2009/10 on Human Settlements focused mostly on the quantity aspect of service delivery than the quality of the service and it also focused on the events that took place throughout the process of construction rather than evaluating the final product. For example, the report looks at public participation that occurred during construction, transparency and cases of misconduct, human resources and representation (Monitoring and Evaluation report, 2010). All these factors do not touch on the evaluation of the actual product/service delivered to people which in this case would be an RDP house. After service provision, the assumption is that the people are satisfied and have benefited. The question of how people actually benefit from state's housing delivery for informal settlement residents: if whether their lives improve or not and the compromises accompanying the benefits (if any) still remain a gap in the literature today.

In 2009, the Social Housing Foundation produced a report on the Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) of RDP housing versus Social Rental Housing. The report wanted to access benefits of Social Rental Housing and RDP housing relatively, taking into account all costs and benefits to a society over a life-span of each housing type (SHF, 2009). The CBA found that the challenges associated with RDP housing option is that A) developers do not carry any long term operational maintenance risks. As a result, this affects the design of the houses because of the materials used and the quality of building. Secondly, the RDP house occupants have no understanding of the maintenance needs of the house andthis results to inadequate levels of investments in maintenance. Lastly, residents do not face penalties or exclusion when taxes and services are not paid for. All these become a burden to local municipalities who carry the extra-costs. Such analysis of RDP housing is not something popular although it could help improve the process through which services are delivered more specifically RDP housing, it could lower expenses of the whole process and significantly improve the quality of the house.

1.4. Research Questions

The research questions are informed by the background of the research as well as the position taken as an approach to the study. The following research question and sub-questions will guide this research. The main question for this study is:

> What has been the impact of the Alexandra Renewal Project on women in the Far East Region?

1.4.1. Research Sub-questions

- What problemsfaced women before upgrading took place?
- What was the role played by women or women's organizations in the upgrading of the informal settlement?
- What facilities have been put in place forwomen to improve their lives?

Through my research, I seek to investigate the quality of life of female residents of Far East Bank area in Alexandra and to evaluate the social implications of Alexandra Renewal Project in

this informal settlement. I want to find out how the lives of women in particular have been changed, focusing on the benefits that the upgrading brought and how these changes have helped them to undertake their reproductive, productive and community-based roles.

1.5. Definition of Terms

Bantustans: Categorized black homelands based on language and colour. The categories were the Northern-Sotho unit, Southern-Sotho, the Swazi, Tsonga, Tswana, Venda, Xhosa and the Zulu unit (Khunou, 2009). These Bantustans were enforced by the former Prime Minister of South Africa,Hendrik Verwoerd in 1959, under the Promotion of Black Self-Government Act. Although the Verwoerd government justified the Act based on tribal system as a tool to promote development of each culture within self-governing units and without interference from another. The real reason for it was to further legitimize the segregation of people, not only white from black but also black ethnic groups from each other (Khunou, 2009). This division still remains a reality in some of the country's townships such as Soweto.

Informal settlement: Dense settlements which consist of self-constructed housing structures under the conditions of informal or traditional tenure (Sibiya, 2007). These structures are built using any available material, from corrugated zinc, to mud bricks and sometimes wood. In South Africa Informal settlements are mostly built using corrugated zinc.Informal settlements are also viewed as physical environments with deficient basic infrastructure and services. They are spontaneous settlements with no legal recognition, sprawling at the edges of cities or marginal land within city boundaries (Sibiya, 2007).

Backyard accommodation, mainly shacks are also included in the definition of informal settlements in South Africa. As a result of housing backlog especially in cities, backyard accommodation is the other preferred alternative (Rubin and Gardner, 2013). The backyard accommodation however, differs from shacks or regular informal settlements in its tenure conditions, built form as well as the standard services(Rubin and Gardner, 2013).

Settlement Upgrading: A process whereby informal settlements particularly in urban areas, are incrementally improved, formalized and finally incorporated into the city through the provision of social services, secured land tenure and creating development opportunities for the

residents (Ziblin, 2013). There are generally two approaches to informal settlement upgrading;total redevelopment, where inhabitants of the settlement are relocated to a different area, normally at the periphery of the city and in-situ, where the existing settlement is redeveloped gradually by securing land tenure, providing infrastructure and services such as water, sanitation and electricity (Ziblin, 2013).

Renewal programme: In South African, the renewal programme is divided into projects that are implemented to redevelop poor communities, mostly informal settlements. The intent of these projects is to tackle poverty and exclusion of these underdeveloped communities from the urban areas, to create economically and socially established settlements. The renewal varies depending on the needs of the community, from informal settlement upgrading, development of new RDP houses to refurbishing existing facilities and improving basic services such as water supply, electricity and sanitation. The Renewal Projects are a joint initiative by all three spheres of government to address development issues cooperatively.

Household: A residential unit whose members share domestic functions and economic activities or responsibilities for production and consumption—a group of people who 'eat out of the same pot' (Muthwa, 1994). A household can also be a man (typically) who lives with his wife and children and sometimes relatives under the man's care in his homestead—"a larger physical, geographical arrangement which may consist of separate households…when there are two or more households present on a homestead, there will be one head of the homestead but two or more heads of the household" (Muthwa, 1994). The head of a household does not necessarily have to be a man who lives with his wife and children, it can be a woman who lives with her children or siblings or any kind of people who share a residential unit. The point is, households can have a diverse combination of people living together.

Service delivery: The provision of public amenities, benefits or satisfactions to citizens. The provision of products by the government to citizens, or service delivery as commonly known is mandated by the South African Constitution (Fox and Meyer, 1995). Services vary from tangible such as water, roads, toilets, houses to non-tangible products such as electricity. Some of these

products are paid for and some are given out for a free depending on the financial status of citizens.

Gender roles: Gender refers to the socially constructed relation between women and men (Schyler, 1996). Gender is the changeable and culturally variable rules and norms, it is differences that we are accustomed to by society as compared to sex which refers to biological differences (Schyler, 1996). Gender roles are socially constructed responsibilities that men and women are each expected to take on as they grow older. The roles of women range from cooking, cleaning, taking care of the children and the home in general. Essentially women's roles require them to stay at home whereas men are expected to go out and look for work. Their roles include participating in heavy duties that require strength;fetching water, building structures, herding the cattle or livestock in general. These traditional responsibilities are based on old societal cultural practices, although some households—usually in rural areas still hold these at high value.

In urban areas however, these roles tend to be less distinctive than in rural areas, mainly because culture and tradition takes less precedence in urban setting than in rural. People in urban areas are more concerned about survival and making a living, especially for the female headed households who do not have men to provide for them. Both men and women undertake certain responsibilities in urban areas, regardless of who they are traditionally meant for.

1.6. Limitations of the study

Focusing on women population only was a limitation considering that the findings should differ when researching a mixed gender population. As mentioned in the introduction, women are quite different from men and they usually face different and more severe challenges that men especially in informal settlements. This factor might to a certain extent, exaggerate the results of the findings and present extreme and one-sided outlook. Conducting interviews with a small sample also demonstrated a limitation because the results might not have been reflective of the entire Alexandra area and perhaps there are more complex issues that might not be addressed by conducting research on a small scale.

Another limitation was the time factor. There was not enough time to conduct interviews or to observe the events and the nature of the environment given that the respondents had other issues to attend to. Most of the interviews were conducted during the day on weekdays. That became a limitation because many had gone to work or to school and the few who were remaining had house chores and other activities to attend to. Because of that, time spent gathering information from respondents was limited.

1.7. Structure of the Report

Chapter One of this report provides an introduction to the research. It sets a background on which the research is based and gives a perspective of what the research is about.The research questions also provide clarification on the topic being studied. It includes definitions of terms used in the report and limitations of the study.

Chapter Two focuses at the literature reviewof a number of factors related to the research. It studies the Alexandra Renewal Project and critically examines international and local literature of informal settlements and informal settlement upgrading, developmental challenges facing women in urban areasandwomen's involvement in settlement renewal initiatives.

Chapter Three details the research methods used while collecting data for this research. It also presents a background of the study area—Far East, Alexandra. Further than that, it explains in detail the qualitative research method adopted for this study, the purposive sampling and the analysis of data collected.

Chapter Four presents findings and theanalysis of the data gathered from the field study. It analysis the findings using Laura Jaitman's (2012) formula on Slum Upgrading Programs Evaluation.

Chapter Five answers the research questions raised in the first chapter. It criticallyengages with the findings comparatively to the literature as presented in Chapter Two. It discusses the impact of informal settlement upgrading on women from the perspective of the City of

Johannesburg against that of the women interviewed in Far East, Alexandra. Furthermore, the chapter makes a conclusion from the analysis and provides recommendations on how informal settlement upgrading programmes could be more effective in delivering services for women.

2. Chapter Two: Literature Review

2.1. Introduction

According to Cresswell (2009),reviewing literature in research has a significant role; it serves to situate the study within a larger and an ongoing dialogue in literature. It helps to identify gaps that need to be filled, to extend and invest resources and time to prior studies that can be researched further (Cresswell, 2009). This second chapter is meant to contextualize the study within some of the ongoing debates around informal settlements, informal settlement upgrading and the women's roles in the informal settlement upgrading initiatives. The chapter also explores some of the reasons for the emergence of informal settlements, the changing perceptions associated with informal settlements and theinterventions adopted by government and societies to address the conditions of these settlements. Alexandra Renewal Project is used as a basis for examining informal settlement upgrading. This chapter contextualizes these different concepts and processes in both local and global discussions.

2.2. Informal settlements and Informal Settlement Upgrading

Informal settlements are vibrant environments which constantly adapt to change. Severe socio-political and economic factors cause or shape informal settlements and they also maintain or threaten their existence (Naidoo, 2007). Informal settlements are generally defined by characteristics of illegality, lack of infrastructure and services, poverty and vulnerability as well as social stress and crime. Informal settlements are associated with unlawful occupation of land in South Africa (Datta, 2008; Naidoo, 2007). For a long time Informal settlements were seen as a problem to be done away with because they were viewed under a negative light that tainted the anticipated glossy city image in most parts of Africa. South Africa is also amongst countries that wished informal settlements away. In fact, former President Thabo Mbeki motioned for the eradication of informal settlements under the National Department of Housing with a plan implying that all informal settlements would be eradicated by 2014 and new housing would be built (Massey, 2014). When this goal seemed impossible, government resorted to other alternatives—informal settlement uppgrading. For the first time in policy, informalsettlements were viewedthrough a different perspective—as a response to the need and housing backlog.

South Africa then adopted the United Nations MillenniumDevelopment Goals. A year after the launch of the United Nations Millennium Development Goals, a Comprehensive Plan—Breaking New Ground 2004 (BNG) which seek to promote sustainable human settlements was released. A section of the Breaking New Ground made way for the upgrading of informal settlements (Massey, 2014). In situ upgrading of informal settlement was favoured because it intended to improve the social and living conditions of settlements without relocating or uprooting livelihoods and social networks among residents (Massey, 2014).Informal settlements upgrading however, has not been successfully implemented across the country because of the lack of administration capacity, skills and leadership (Massey, 2014).

2.3. From Informal Settlement demolition to Informal Settlement Upgrading

The government's perceptions of informal settlements in South Africa have shifted tremendously from their time of originuntil today. As briefly discussed above, informal settlements were seen as unhealthy settlements where diseases are likely to be contracted by the women and the children of the settlements. Because they contravene the building regulations as they are spontaneous and unplanned and because of the effect they have on the environment, these settlements were always threatened by demolitions.

Informal settlements are most likely to occur along water bodies such as rivers or wetlands, sometimes along major roads or railways. There are different reasons for this. Since informal settlements lack infrastructure and services, living along a river allow the residents access to water for bathing, cleaning and doing laundry. The rivers also serve as their natural sewer system to wash away human waste. The roads allow them to have better access to transportation. However rational these reasons may seem, they all pose a danger that none of the informal settlement dwellers seem to consider. During rainy seasons, the settlements usually get flooded and washed away by the rivers. The floods often lead to loss of life, uprooting livelihoods and destruction of shelters and the residents are left to pick up the pieces and begin to recreate their livelihoods for their survival. The close proximity of these settlements to highways can be dangerous especially for children who walk around unattended

along the roads while cars are speedingby. These are some of the reasons used by government to justify their support for informal settlement eradication among other reasons.

When informal settlements continued to grow regardless of government's effort to clear them completely, a new approach of dealing with these settlements developed. The strategy changed from supporting informal settlement demolition to promoting informal settlement upgrading. The Breaking New Ground policy of 2004 adopted by the South African government was based on the principles of the 1994 White Paper on Housing, which aimed to deliver well located housing of suitable quality, to accelerate the delivery of housing as a key strategy to poverty alleviation and job creation strategy, to promote social cohesion, combat crime and improve the quality of life for the poor and to utilize housing as tool for development of sustainable human settlements in support of urban restructuring (Ziblin, 2013).

The BNG however, has diverged in a number of ways from the previous housing policy on which it derived its principles. It incorporated a division for Upgrading of Informal Settlements Programmealso known as the UISP which was not part of the initial plan for Housing Development. The UISP became a more realistic and pragmatic strategy through which the government could improve the conditions of informal settlements. Since then, informal settlement upgrading has become a recognized and a partiallyaccepted phenomenon in South Africa.

Informal settlement upgrading became popular in the 1980s all around the world due to the rising concerns of poverty (Massey, 2014). Abbott and Huchzermeyer (in Naidoo, 2001) explain that there must be evidence of the upgrading through the improvement in the quality of life of the residents, meaning that if informal settlement upgrading has been truly effective, the enhancement of the quality of life should follow as a result. They further provide six components that must occur when informal settlement upgrading has taken place. These are:

a. Housing improvement
b. Formal tenure
c. Water qualityimprovement
d. Public health improvement

e. Infrastructure provision and
f. Community integration (in Naidoo, 2007).

The ARP has incorporated all six components during the renewal of Alexandra. So according to Abbott and Huchzermeyer (2001), informal settlement upgrading in Alexandra would have truly been successful Alexandra if the evaluation was to be donebased on the six components in mind. However, this is not say that these listed components are universal and must therefore be pertinent to all informal settlement upgrading processes.

Before implementing informal settlement upgrading, an important factor to consider would be to conduct research which seeks to find the reasons for the growth of informal settlements. Other than the obvious reason of housing backlog and the inability of the housing market to absorb or accommodate the poor, there are a number of reasons for the growth of informal settlements. Dewar (2002) mentions a few of these reasons for the growth of informal settlement and this section will outline just a few. The first one is that young people who do not qualify for an RDP house and do not make enough money to afford a bond house usually have no other alternatives but informal settlements (Dewar, 2002). For those who come from rural areas in search for employment, informal settlements become a more attractive option because of their affordability and sometimes their close proximity to job opportunities and other necessary services.

The last reason that Dewar (2002) mentions for the growth of informal settlements is the flexible and adaptive nature of the young people who move into the cities. This also reflects the demands of the contemporary job market from subcontracting or outsourcing to part-time employment. As a result, people move around from city to city depending on where they get job opportunities. The effects of that are not only felt by those searching for jobs and their families, but are also translated spatially through the growth of informal settlements. These settlements then become a solution to those in need by providing temporary accommodation which is more convenient than other options (Dewar, 2002). These reasons for residing in informal settlements should be considered by government especially when providing housing options to City residents.

2.4. Women and Households

According to Schyler and Zhou (1995) literature on women in South Africa and Africa in general took prominence in the early 1990s but it soon lost the momentum. In fact many challenges that women encounter are usually notbrought to the fore in urban studies and development planning research.This limits the possibility of examining everyday challenges from a gender perspective (Schlyter and Zhou, 1995). African cities are facing low-incomehousing and service delivery problems.These issues are most prominent in informal settlements and women are the most affected by these problems based on their specific needs and their roles as care givers and home makers (Schlyter and Zhou, 1995).

Women within households generally have different priorities from othermembersof the households and that affects the state or the condition of the house. The patterns of spending within households are determined by the priorities of the earning members of the household (Gwagwa, 1995).However, some areas suffer a great loss when there are conflicting interests. These different priorities within households force women to take on their productive roles as economically active members or bread winners, in order to provide the necessities required to make a home pleasant and welcoming.As a result, the workload of womenincreases; they have to find alternative strategies to generate money for necessary household improvements of activities i.e. joining stokvels or any societal activities (Gwagwa, 1995). The study conducted by Oruwari explains this further.

In 1991 Oruwari conducted a compelling study that looked at how women in low income households generate their income and how theyspent it. It also looked at what the women spent their on within their households in relation to the men of the same household. The study was conducted in Port Hartcourt in Nigeria. What was intriguingabout this research is that instead of interviewing women, the research was done on men and the men were also interviewed about their wives as well. The questionnaires were distributed to men whose wives were in petty businesses. Existing data from previous research was also used to add depth to the study. The study found that women spent an average of 10hours each day on their

businesses while they also had to fulfil their traditional responsibilities of cooking, cleaning and taking care of the children (Oruwari, 1991).

Items	Wife (%)	Husband (%)
Food	73	27
Clothes for Children	76	24
Health Care	68	32
House Rent	-	100
House Help	82	18
Entertainment of friends and visitors	35	65
Children's Education	50	50
Total	55	45

Table 1: Share of Essential Household Expenditure Contributed by Women over Men in the Informal Sector. Source: Oruwari (1991).

The research categorised income distribution within the households by tracking what men and women spend their income on respectively. Table1 provides the results from the questionnaires. Women spent a high proportion of their income on food, clothes for the children, their health care and house-help whereas men spend mostly on entertainment of friends and visitors. The study also showed that men are sole contributors on housing rent and or buying property while both men and women contribute equally towards the children's education (Oruwari, 1991).

Findings from the study were contrary to popular beliefs. Oruwari (1991) showed that from the most women did not marry for economic security but did so as expected their society's customs. The study also erodes belief that men or a husband is a breadwinner of the household and that the wife or rather women are dependent on them. From the table above, in terms of financial support, women contribute more than men—55 percent of the household expenditure are covered by women compared to the 45 percent covered by men (Oruwari, 1991). Certainly the study was only conducted in Port Hartcourt in Nigeria but the interpretation of the findings is very similar to the conclusion that Gwagwa (1995) reached. Women are forced to take on breadwining role or be economically active in order to cover the costs of food, healthcare and helping out around the house to make it hospitable for their

families (Gwagwa, 1995).

2.5. Women and Informal Settlement Upgrading

Literature on women's participation in informal settlement upgrading is scant. Available studies in this regard show women's participation in informal settlements upgrading through community savings (Weru, 2004). The savings groups gave women a platform to address their concerns and priorities, to influence change and seek improvements that effectively benefit their communities. They used their profits from the savings groups to contribute towards improvement in infrastructure and their housing conditions. According to Weru (2004) and D'Crus and Mudumi (2012), in a number of countries including South Africa, Kenya, India, Uganda and Bolivia, the community savings model has helped to improve women's lives through settlement upgrading. They did not have towait for the government or non-governmentalinitiatives. In Kenya, the saving scheme became so popular that government federations recognized them. Women were able to use their savings record instead of pay slips to register for a house (D'cruz and Mudimu, 2012). The savings scheme might be known as stokvels in South Africa. This word is most popular amongst many women in the country.

The community saving schemes helped women initiate and play a major role in informal settlement upgrading. The saving scheme can be seen as the alternative strategies that women employ to better their lives and to improve the conditions of their settlements in the quest to make their homes hospitable.

Although the savings groups worked for women in some countries mentioned above, the participation of women in urban interventions is still not enough to make a great difference in the lives of other women.. During the 1990s, the African continent began to recognize women as critical for development. Addressing women's health issues, political participation, education and reproductive and social rights was viewed as central to population management and poverty alleviation (Simone, 1995). In South Africa, section 9 of the Bill of Rights in the Constitution of 1996 states that "everyone is equal before the law…equality includes the full enjoyment of all rights and freedoms. To promote the achievement of equality, legislative and

other measures designed to protect or advance persons or categories of persons, disadvantaged by unfair discrimination may be taken" (Constitution of RSA, 1996).

The Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill of South Africa states that government should, within its ambit of responsibilities and resources, implement measures to achieve a progressive realization of at least 50 per cent representation and participation of women in decision-making structures (Government Gazette no. 37005, 2013). The country might have been successful in increasing the number of women in decision making structure given that, the number of women in National Assembly has increased from 28% in 1994 to 43% in 2009 (News24, 2011). However, women in poor areas have not experienced the same results of empowerment as women in parliament. Through personal observations, the increasing number of women in political decision-making structures has not had a significant influence on the development interventions for women in informal settlements. Women's participation should also be promoted and realized in improving informal settlements through the Women Empowerment Bill.

Studies on women in informal settlements are mainly concerned with women's health related issues such HIV/Aids and Sexually Transmitted Diseases, sexual abuse and how they survive through them. This research will interrogate the interventions of women or women organizations and their roles in the development their settlements through upgrading and the renewal of Alexandra.

2.6. Conclusion

Perceptions on informal settlements in South Africa has slightly shifted, from dealing with them as unhealthy environments constantly facing the perpetual problems of poverty and diseases to viewing them as 'temporary' solution of housing backlog. Government has also evolved in this regard—housing policies have changed from enforcing eradication of informal settlement to promoting informal settlement upgrading initiatives. The Alexandra Renewal Project, among many renewal projects, is an example of government intervention towards informal settlement upgrading. Although informal settlements have been studied immensily in urban research, issues concerning women (other than women and risks of rape and HIV infection in informal

settlements) have not been explored as much. The literature on challenges facing women is very limited, as a result, decision making structures, policy and urban interventions do not address issues from women's perspectives.

Women's involvement in informal settlement upgrading is also restricted. The most prominent form of involvement on literature has been through savings groups. In some countries, this has helped them to gain recognition from government and used their savings groups to be at the forefront of settlement upgrading. As Njamwea (2003) explains, packages involved in informal settlement upgrading initiatives should be determined by the settlers of these settlements, since it is the settler's effort to acquire land and consequent development. Likewise, the upgrading should not be dictated to them (Njamwea, 2003) but work co-operatively with government or interested stakeholders to better solutions for improving the informal settlements. Therefore involvement of women in informal settlement upgrading is significant seeing that they are viable inhabitants of these informal settlements and are directly affected by the decisions made on their behalf.

3. Chapter Three: Methods of Research

3.1. Study Area: Alexandra Township, Far East

Alexandra is a township located in the northern part of Johannesburg. Covering a surface area of 7.6 square kilometers, the township is bordered by the M1 and the N3 road and divided by the Jukskei River (Ngcaku, 2012). Alex is the commonly used name for Alexandra Township. The area has a locational advantage, although socio-economic and physical challenges such as crime, poverty, unskilled population and lack of amenities are manifest in most parts. Alex has easy access to Sandton, one of the country's emerging and growing financial capital. Sandtonholds development indicators whichare higher than the national average (Ngcaku, 2012). Alexandra has close proximity to the Malboro Gautrain station which connects Johannesburg to Pretoria.

According to the GLGH (2009), Alexandra is divided into three different sections which are the Old Alexandra, the East Bank and the Far East Bank (which is currently known as Tsutsumani). Situated on the western side of the Jukskei River, the Old Alexandra is the most poverty stricken and densely populated section of the three. It is also where hostels and informal settlements are the most prominent type of housing. Opposite the river on the east is the East Bank which was rehabilitated in the 1980s. The area houses middle-class residents and is occupied by less than 5 percent of the Alexandra population. Lastly, the Far East Bank/ Tsutsumaniwas developed in 1999 as an Athlete's Village to provide accommodation for the 1999 All-Africa Games Sport athletes (GLGH, 2009). The Far East Bank and a number of East Bank extensions (Ext. 8, 9 and 12) is also where new RDP housing units were developed. This happened through the Alex Renewal Project. The area has a variety of freestanding, semi-detached and simplex housing units which accommodate local residents from the Old Alexandra who were on the apartheid government's waiting list for subsidisedhousing (GLGH, 2009). The East Bank section is the core focus of this research based on the fact that residents of the area are former residents of the Old Alexandra.



Figure 2.1 Housing typologies in Alexandra Township. Source: City of Johannesburg.

The Alexandra Renewal Project

Also known as ARP for short, the Alexandra Renewal Project was initiated as a joint initiative between the three spheres of government (national, provincial and local government), the private sector and community based organizations to revitalize the area. It began in 2001 as a 7 year project but carried on until 2014. The Gauteng Provincial Department of Housing and Local Government is the main body that administers the progress of the ARP although, other departments played a major role to cover a number of issues other than housing (GLGH, 2009). The project was one of the eight presidential programmes under the former President Thabo Mbeki. Alexandra is one of the eight townships across the country where the presidential renewal programme was implemented (CoJ, 2014). ARP formed part of the government's broad aim to address problems of urbanization and service delivery backlogs. It sought to upgrade the physical, social and economic environments of Alexandra (CoJ, 2015; Ngcaku, 2012) targeting an increase in local employment, sustainable delivery of services, healthier environments, improved infrastructure, upgrading informal dwellings as well as provision of additional housing units meant to reduce poverty and underdevelopment.

In 2008, the life span of the Alexandra Renewal Project came to an end as it was initially meant to carry on for 7 years. However, NomvulaMokonyane who was then the Gauteng MEC for Housing said that the project would be extended for another two years. This was due to the increasing demand for housing, the delayed processes for Land Acquisition as well as a result of complaints laid by Julian Baskin, the Director of the ARP at the time (Ngcaku, 2012). Baskin's complaint was regarding the fact that budget allocation for the project was not enough to cover the costs of providing RDP housing to 22 000 families as well as the cost for the construction of roads, water and sanitation infrastructure, schools, clinics, magistrates and police stations. Neels Letter, the former Deputy Director of the ARP argued that the time given to the Alexandra Renewal Project was in fact not enough to solve the kinds of development problems that Alexandra faced. He claimed that more time and money was needed to carry on with the project and that it would take at least 25 years to address the issues of the township (Ngcaku, 2012).

Nonetheless, there has been loads of progress since the project began. The Alexandra area has improved since the project was implemented. It is not the same as it was before. Alexandra is no longer the *"unpaved and dirty roads, filled with hungry undernourished children…air thick with smoke of coal fires…"* (Mandela, 1995). Since the inception of the ARP, 70 000 households have gained access to potable water and sanitation services and 14 500 new houses have been built. There are tarred roads instead of the dusty streets of gravel, pavements are renewed and new parks and bridges have built (CoJ, 2014).

3.2. Type of research: Case Study of Alexandra

3.2.1. Case study of Alexandra

Alexandra has gone through a continuous process of upgrading and renewal from 2001. The renewal project started off as a seven year plan but was extended, carrying on until 2014 (CoJ, 2015). According to the City of Johannesburg, millions of rands have been spent on the project. Alexandra was chosen as a site where the research took place. The Far East area became the casestudy for which the research is based, focusing particularly on women. The research seek to generate new information from the perspective of women, who are former residents of informal settlements within Alexandra Township and to give a fresh perspective that has not yet been explored in Alexandra. The knowledge that was generated is only representative of Alexandra and it does not claim that the results are relevant to all informal settlements that have gone through renewal as a form of upgrading.

3.2.2. Qualitative Research Method

The approach allowed for a freshperspective and analysis ofinformation (Desai and Potter, 2006). It has enabledrespondents adequate time to think about the interview questions and give their inputs based on their opinions and personal experiences on the subject matter. This method was meant to allow flexibility of response to better understand the experiences of the participants, to not be restricted (Croswile, 2004; Desai and Potter, 2006).This was hopefully very useful given that the research is based on personal experiences. The structure was able to direct the interviewstowards the subject matter while some questions wereraised naturally as a follow up to the responses that were given by the respondents. Semi-structured interviews

enablethem to be at ease during the interviews because of the conversation-like nature (Desai and Potter, 2006). Since the respondentswere speaking from their own experiences, they were able to talk about things in great depth. However, semi-structured interviews have a disadvantage of being lengthy and are time consuming when transcribing.

In order for the results of a qualitative research method to be reliable, an evaluation criterion has been developed. Because of the diverse nature of the qualitative research, there is a wide variety of approaches and criteria for the evaluation process. This research will only be conducted based on the refined criteria by Guba and Lincoln (1989). Guba and Lincoln (1989) emphasize that qualitative research methods should take responsibility of ensuring vigour of trustworthiness, reliability and validity of the outcomes. As a result, they came up with criteria to increase validity and reliability of qualitative research. The criteria consist of but not limited to validity, credibility and confirmability (Bitsch, 2005). The criteria should be reliable and credible depending on the researcher's duration of observing the environment to see if the initial conceptions have changed or have been proven correctly, the constant engagement with the participants and for the information to been collected from a variety of sources instead of relying on one (Bitsch, 2005). The confirmability aspect will be taken into account to ensure that findings are not influenced by the researcher's personal values, motives or political persuasions. This will be done by avoiding leading questions or even suggesting answers to respondents.

3.2.3. Data Sources

Desktop and Library Research

The statistics that wereused to carry out the research were based on the living conditions of Alexandra before and after the process of upgrading took place. These were used to support and contrast the experiences of young women whowere interviewed. Unfortunately most of the data found on Alexandra after upgrading took place was a bit dated. Some of it was over 10 years old; more recent information was unavailable. Services that arebeneficial to women and help them improve their lives, such as new facilities or social infrastructure were examined during the desktop research but also during the field work visits.The results of the statistics

werethen divided in three categories;the social, economic and physical improvements between 2001 and 2011 and this all depended on the availability of data. Information was also retrieved on studies that have been conducted in Alexandra and other informal settlements as a secondary source of reference to support or contrast findings. These were found from the library manly on theses that have been written prior the conduction of the research and books and academic papers based on the research topic.

Interviews

It was useful to know the women's daily routine, which is, what activities they participate in and what roles they partake in their home and society of Alexandra. It was important to know the structure of their households and the women's positions in it. This helped establish the different types of women and how they take on different activities at home, in the community or at work. Another set of information needed wasabout the kind of residential neighbourhoodor environment that respondents resided in back in the informal settlements before moving to Far East. This was neededdistinguish whether or not the person was a suitable respondent to participate in the research based on the criteria put in place to select the participants—that participants should have stayed in an informal settlement within Alexandra Township for at least 8years before moving into Far East. This is so that they have firsthand experience of living in the informal settlements and that they are able to make a comparison between the informal settlement and the Far East.

Field Observation

Staying in the Far East area for a couple of weeks during the course of the interviews and observing the surrounding enables one to explore some of the topics which participants refrain from, topics which make them feel uncomfortable discussing with strangers (Creswell, 2009). For example, no one wanted to talk about the challenges they faced from the government officials who were demolishing their backyard shacks because they thought that the information would be reported back to the officials and they would get in trouble. Some residents complained about foreigners occupying the new RDP houses by paying bribes. These dividing perceptions only became apparent in one of the casual conversations during the short-

term residence in Far East. Some of the observations could have been captured through photographs although this posed a challenge as discussed on the limitations. As Cresswell elaborates, observations can be done by looking at the invisible layer, including body language and reading the mood of the participants during interviews. A considerable amount of time had to be spent within the area in order to get familiar with the surroundings and to be able to navigate through the settlement.

3.2. Data Collection

The collection of data from women will be done mostly through semi-structured interviews. The interviews were based entirely on the experiences and opinions women in the Far East Alexandra. Observations were made while conducting interviews and throughout the site visits, these will help to explain or notice facts that are not expressed but things that are felt, seen or sensed. Information from the Alexandra Renewal Project and the Stats SA was also utilized as another way of collecting data for the research.

3.3. Data Analysis

The interviews were conducted with 12 respondents. I limited it to this number because of the research's time frame and I believe that it provided a considerate representation of the area based on the variety of women and age groups used on the study. I understand that the process of analysing the information through transcribing and coding will be lengthy. Sampling of the respondents was purposive because of the specific group of women that is required by the research. According to Dolores (2007), purposive sampling is the deliberate choice of an informant due to the qualities the informant possesses. It was also preferred over random sampling because the population is too small to conduct random surveys or interviews. In simple terms, in purposive sampling, the researcher decides what needs to be known and sets out to find people who are better able to provide the needed information by virtue of knowledge or experience (Dolores, 2007).

Purposive sampling is most suitable because the study is interested in a specific group of people within the area of Alexandra. The women suitable to participate have to be between the ages

of 21 and 60. This is because both old and young women have different ways of experiences with the area and these will be useful to the research. They need to have stayed in the Old Alexandra Township for at least 8years before moving to the new FarEast extension so that they can make distinctions between the old area and the new one after upgrading.

Initially, the criteria for selecting participants was that, they must have stayed in the old Alexandra informal settlement for at least 8 years before moving into the Far East area. The criteria remained the same throughout the interviews however, the slight difference was that participants were selected from both backgrounds— Sjwetla and Alex instead of just limiting it to one informal settlement. This minor change did not disrupt the research, in fact, the women from Sjwetla and Alex had similar experiences of being in an informal settlement. More details about Sjwetla informal settlement will be provided later.

3.4. Ethical Observations

I tried to ensure that the physical and the social wellbeing of the respondents was not affected by the research. I also avoided taking actions that might cause negative consequences to the respondents and their reputation by respecting the respondents wishes and sticking to the time they stipulated for conducting interviews. The research based on the participants' free will and they were informed that all information to be gathered through the research will not be used against them but will be used for academic purposes only. I also made known beforehand thatnoform of any compensation must expected for their participation on the research and if the wish to withdraw from the research, they are free to do so without giving the reason.

Their identities would be kept anonymous and anything that they are not comfortable with can be changed, they are welcome to indicate. Nonetheless, theirparticipation helpedto complete the research and their participation was appreciated. To make sure that the interviews do not provoke or insult the respondents, the structured questions for the interviews was sent toa supervisor first to ensure that the questions are considerate of sensitive issues.

3.5. Challenges from field work

Because most of the interviews were conducted during the week, most women who participated in the interviews do not have formal employment and those who were interviewed on weekends were either too busy to participate or were taking a day off from work and it seemed rude to intrude on their time and space. The biographical results of the findings will end up showing that most participants are either unemployed or self-employed in the Far East region and that might be a false representation of the area at a larger scale.

Older women were not willing to participate in the research because of different reasons. Some feared that they were being interviewed by journalists and that their responses would be published on national television and or newspaper. As a result, they did not want to get in trouble because of the possibility of their responses being used against them. Others did not want to participate in the interviews because they have been victims of scams so they feared that the interviews might be part of the scams to rob them of their money or belongings. A few even thought that I was representing the government or I was a government official conducting research on behalf of the City of Johannesburg. Because of their anger towards the government, they did not wish to participate in the research, claiming that I would make promises that I will not keep as the people who sent me (the government) have done in the past. The tainted image of researchers became a limitation because the women who would have helpful insights about the Old Alexandra were not willing to participate because of their past experiences.

While conducting research I had to knock on people's houses to get participants. This was a limitation in a sense that some yards had high walls and some were locked so it was impossible to get in. Some had dogs outside and because of fear of dogs, I could not get in. Also the fear of approaching stranger in their yards would consume me once in a while and this affected my ability to remain comfortable and calm during interviews hence some interviews were short and stuck to the semi-structured questions prepared prior the interviews.

A language difference was a great barrier with some of the women I came across. At least two women spoke Tsonga and I could not understand some of what they were saying so as a result,

I would just nod in agreement to what they said although not fully comprehending. Some of the questions were skipped because I could not translate them in Tsonga or a language that was understandable to the participants. Sometimes I would get one word answers when I needed an explanation and also because I could not probe further, the interviews were limited. Some of the questions were hard to interpret or translate from English to Zulu or Tswana as these were the most spoken languages on site although I could speak these languages. This also affected the manner in which the interviews were conducted.

A few people in Alexandra told me not to take out the recording devices, cell phone or the camera because there were Nyaope boys (young boys who use drugs known as Nyaope—a mixture of rat poison and cocaine) around and they could steal those away and sell them for money in order to buy drugs. As a result, I was unable to record some of the interviews or capture special moments like when the women were braiding the customer's hair or doing laundry or when they were hanging blankets on the washing lines. Some people chose not to be recorded so I had to write down on the note pad. Sometimes I could not keep up with writing because they spoke fast so I would end up discarding some of the information I thought was irrelevant or not important. Sometimes I forgot to recall the entire interview and might have missed some important details.

Informal settlement is a very sensitive subject especially in Alexandra because of the suffering that most people in the area have gone through. Some residents in Far East still have relatives who live under unpleasant conditions in the informal settlements and those who live in RDP houses at Far East,they are previous residents of informal settlements. What makes the subject even more critical is that people along the river were relocated from their shacks to newer shacks that were provided by the government. The residents got angry over that because government is supposed to move them into proper houses instead of moving them into prettier looking shacks. The backyard shacks in Far East were forcibly removed by government officials a couple of months before I conducted research and because some residents thought I worked for the government, I was not well received in some places. This affected my ability to conduct the interviews freely and comfortably.

I had to familiarise myself with the environment and the people of Far East for them to not perceive me as an outsider. To a certain extent I was able to get through to a few residents who later opened up. I was also managed to take a few pictures using a cellphone instead of a camera. Although I was unable to capture photos of everything I would have liked and though the quality of the photos was not the best, I did manage to capture a few. I also had to write really fast and in cases where the respondents did not feel comfortable with being recorded, I had tolearn to capture information that was important for the research.

4. Chapter Four: Findings from the Field Work

4.1. Introduction

This chapter presents, analyses and interprets the data collected from the interviews and non-participant observation done on site. It unpacks information gathered from the study area and reveals different aspects of the impacts that informal settlement upgrading had on the women of Far East in Alexandra.

4.2. PersonalInformation of participants

This section contains demographic information of the 12 women who participated in this research. It is a brief summary of findings on the background—province of origin, age, duration of stay in Alex and Far East, educational level and employment status of the participants, and is presented in a tabular format (Table 2).

The interviewees were between the age of 21-60 years. The reason for the age gap was to provide different perspectives from the age groups. The older generation of women had experienced unpleasant conditions in informal settlements than the younger generation hence they had more insightful opinions and a clearer picture of their experiencesin informal settlements. The younger generation did not remember much from when they stay in the informal settlements. They also felt that the conditions in the settlements did not affect them in any particular way seeing that they knew no other home than the shacks they lived in. The age-group that participated in great quantity is that between the ages of 30-39 years—having four out of twelve peoplewhilst other groups had two people or just one person participating. This was mostly because women between 30 and 39 were stay-at-home mothers or grandmothers who took care of their children and or grandchildren when their parents had gone to school or work. This was also because some of them depended on their husbands or boyfriends to support them financially therefore had no need to work.

Item	Variables	number	%
Age (yrs)	21-29	3	25
	30-39	2	16.7
	40 - 49	4	33.3
	50 - 59	2	16.7
	60 - 65	1	8.3
Province of Origin	Eastern Cape	2	16.7
	Northern Cape	1	8.3
	Mpumalanga	1	8.3
	Free State	2	16.7
	Limpopo	4	33.3
	Gauteng	2	16.7
Duration of stay in Alexandra (yrs)	0-5 yrs	0	0
	6-9 yrs	5	41.7
	10-15 yrs	4	33.3
	16-20 yrs	2	16.7
	21+ yrs	1	8.3
Duration of stay in Far East (yrs)	0-5 yrs	5	41.7
	6-9 yrs	0	0
	10-15 yrs	7	58.3
	16-20 yrs	0	0
	21+	0	0
Educational level	Primary	4	33.3
	High School	7	58.3
	Tertiary	1	8.3
	Post-graduate	0	0
Employment	Unemployed	5	41.7
	Self-Employed	3	25
	Part-time	2	16.7
	Full-time	2	16.7
Family members per household	1-5	6	50
	6-10	5	41.7
	11+	1	8.3
Female headed household	21-39 yrs	3	25
	40-49 yrs	2	16.7
	50-60 yrs	2	16.7
	Total	**12**	**100**

Table 2: Personal details of the participants

Most interviewees originally came from Limpopo Province, with four people coming from the province. Two out of 12 women were born in Gauteng and spent all their lives in the informal settlements until the time they moved to Far East. One interviewee had stayed in Alex—the informal settlement for 21years. Out of all interviewees, this is the highest number of years anyone has stayed in Alex. At least 5 people had stayed there for over six years. Seven participants have been staying in Far East for over 10years while the other 4 have not stayed longer than 5years. This is because the first occupation of the RDP houses occurred in 2001 whereas the latest occupation occurred in 2012 in extension9.

In terms of education, most women passed their secondary grade—high school level with only one person completing tertiary level. One of the observations from the interviews was striking correlation between education levels and community participation. The woman who had attained her tertiary qualification was more aware and involved in community activities.She had more knowledge of the Alexandra Renewal Project and some stakeholders who participated in it. Those with lower education qualifications had no concern for activities of the project taking place within their surroundings. They did not see the significance in taking part in those activities or in 'wasting their time', as one explained, when things would remain the same either way.

Five women out of twelve are unemployed; three of them self-employed/ had started their own businesses in a form of restaurant/ internet cafe, spaza shop and a hair salon; two were part-time employees; and two were employed full-time. Out of the twelve households, seven were headed by women although some women had boyfriends who sometimes supported them financially. Between all twelve women, there are over50 members of the household including the participants. One woman did not reveal the actual number of people staying in the house.

Unlike in the literature, most of these women still believed that a man should assume a role of a provider. Even though most of these households are female headed, some still depend on men to provide for them—the man can be a brother (as in the case of interviewee1 whose brother provided for the whole family), a husband in the case of Interviewee6, a father for

Interview7or even a boyfriend—like Interview8 who is unemployed and stays with her boyfriend. There is one unique case where an anonymous woman in the age of 50s is the sole bread-winner within the household even though she is married. The husband is a bit older than her and stays at home—probably retired or just unemployed. This case attested to the changing roles and responsibilities of women within households as already elaborated on the previous chapters.

At least 8 participants have joined a 'stokvel'—or a savings' group in other words. They meet on monthly basis where they each contribute a certain amount of money. The only difference between the saving's groups in Far East and those documented in literature is that, instead of these women using their savings to improve their communities, the money is used for family events, weddings, funerals and parties. As already mentioned, most participants did not show much interest in the overall improvement of their community just as long as their houses looked pleasant. As a result, only a few women participated in community activities or initiatives that seek to improve their residential area.

4.3. The Impact of informal settlement upgrading on women Alexandra in the Far East

Women who mostly occupy the RDP houses at Far East come fromAlexandra informal settlement. Some claim that the new RDP houses from 2012 have been allocated to foreigners because they pay bribes to occupy them. However, there is no proof of such claims and this research is not focusing on that particular issue. The focus for this research are women who came from the informal dwellings in Alexandra. Another observation from the engagement with these women has been that, there is a distinction between two informal settlements in Alexandra. One is located along the Jukskei River and is known as Sjwetla. This informal settlement is the leastadvanced/ improved in terms of infrastructure and access to services according to the residents of Alexandra.



Figure 2: Informal settlement known as Sjwetla

They have no electricity or proper roads meaning that access by vehicle into the area is very limited, even in times of emergency. This informal settlement only has bucket latrine toilets that get cleared once a week and a few water taps that are shared by the whole community.

The second informal settlement is much older than Sjwetla hence referred to as the Old Alexandra. This one does not exactly fitthe description of an informal settlement. The area has lots of shacks and some houses made out of bricks. There are electricity connections for every

household, piped water and flush toilets. There are tarred roads in the informal settlements. The two features of the settlement that actually demonstrate the area as an informal settlement aretheirregular unplanned pattern and shacks made of zinc and corrugated iron. This informal settlement is referred to by the residents as eLok'shini or Alex. The older women who grew up in the informal settlement say the area never used to be as developed as it today. It had dusty streets with no street lights or pavements on the side and never used to have piped water until the late 1980s when things started improving slowly.

The section below expands on how the Informal Settlement Upgrading through Alexandra Renewal Project impacted the three aspects of their lives:

4.3.1. Economic Impact

Relocation of residents from informal dwellings to RDP houses has impacted the women in Far East and their respective households economically. These happened in negative as well as positive ways and are presented in this section. Some of these impacts are not as unequivocal as was expected, some positives have negative outcomes. This will be demonstrated further in this section.

Negative Impacts

Moving from a one roomed shack to a two roomed house is bound to have financial or economic impact on the people relocating. For most women in Alex, moving from an informal settlement to a house meant that some members of the family who stayed in the rural areas could now move back into the house. For mothers, it meant that their children could come to Johannesburg for better education while for siblings it meant that they could be re-united and some could come and search for better jobs knowing that they havea place to sleep. Although this was exciting for families and is positive, it also had negative effects to it.Household expenditure increased due to the additional members moving into the house and as a result, more money is required to support the family.

Before moving into the RDP house, these women did not have to pay electricity and now the electricity bill had to be added onto their monthly expenditures because electricity is prepaid in

the Far East. However, for those who came from Sjwetla where they did not have electricity, the joy of having electricity exceeded the burden of having to pay for it.

11 out of 12 of the women interviewed complained about being further from shopping centres as a result of relocation. While they used to walk to Pan African Mall which is the closest shopping centre to Alexandra, the women now have to take a taxi to get to there. They complain that the money they use for taxi could be used to buy vegetables for supper instead. One woman complained that,

> *"Vegetables are cheaper in Alex,you can get them in every street corner for R5 whereas things are very expensive here [Far East]."*

She says it is more affordable to stay in Alex—the informal settlement because of the affordability as well as the availability of things to eat.

> *"...I have to take a taxi and travel all the way to the mall just to get something to eat. Prices in malls are more expensive than in street corners and that affects the life we live in Far East"*(–Interviewee 1, 08 August 2015).

Some women who stay with their relatives have to pay rent since they moved to Far East, which is something they have not once had to do while living in the shacks at Alex. Interviwee 2 specifically pointed that she misses the prospect of not paying rent in informal settlements.

<u>Positive Impacts</u>

As much as it is unavoidable that expenses are bound to increase when people move to a bigger house in a different location, some women have found ways to operate within the system for it to work on their favour. They have found survival tactics that enable them to make a better living out of the RDP house and services that it comes with. Thesemight also be viewed as a the women's response to their increased financial obligations.



Figure 4: Restaurant/ internet cafe where only women are employed



Figure 3: A house with a rented backyard shack

A number of houses have backyard shacks or additional rooms at the back that are rented out to make extra profitand serve as a main source of income to other women. Some of these women prefer to lease backyard rooms instead of shacks because they can charge a higher amount for rent. This way, they stay clear of being in danger of their backyard shacks forcefully removed by government officials. The women are able to achieve this because of the available space they now have at their disposal as compared to the congested shacks they lived in at Alex or Sjwetla where they could not rent out space for extra income.

The houses create economic opportunities through home-based enterprises. Some women have extended their house to start up small businesses such as spaza shops, hair salons, taverns and even small bakery. Although these small businesses might inflate the electricity bill because the refrigeratorshave to run the whole night in taverns for example, the profit made from the business is able to cover the electricity bill while the owners continue to make a living out it.



Figure 5: Internet cafe owned by a woman



Figure 6: Spaza shop- a main source of income for the family

"…But if I was still staying there [Sjwetla], I wouldn't be able to make extra money because I now run a mini-hair salon in my backyard. That is something I wouldn't have been able to do in informal settlement."(–Interviewee 2, 08 August 2015)

4.3.2. Social Impact

This aspect, the social impact, is quite subjective, especially between the older and younger generation of women. Generally, the older women found some social factors accompanied by informal settlement upgrading as positive whereas the younger women found them as negative to a certain extent. Under this section, it is important to keep in mind that some positive social impacts can easily be translated as negative when comparing advantages and the disadvantages.

<u>Negative impacts:</u>

One of the negative issues associated with staying in the Far East area is crime. Thieves break into houses because they think that residents in Far East have a better life and belongings worth stealing. Crime rates are higher as a result of this. Although no studies have been conducted in the area to confirm the actual rates, most participants believed that crime is much higher in their current location than it was in the informal settlement. The worst thing about it is that—

"When thieves break in your house, no-one comes out to catch/punish them as it was the case in Alex. If they do, they come out long after the thieves have gone away and nothing can be done about it." (–Interviewee 1, 08 August 2015)

Crime Category	January to September				% Change
	1998	1999	2000	2001	
Murder	159	142	123	110	-
Attempted murder	163	164	118	123	-
Culpable homicide	15	15	7	13	-
TOTAL MURDER	**337**	**321**	**248**	**246**	**-37**
Robbery with aggravating circumstances	409	494	470	452	-
Other robbery	137	182	148	156	-
TOTAL ROBBERY	**546**	**676**	**618**	**608**	**-11**
Common assault	298	341	535	666	32**
Burglary at residential premises	163	254	260	299	-
Burglary at non-residential premises	624	667	620	509	-
TOTAL BURGLARY	**787**	**921**	**880**	**808**	**-14**

Table 3: Incidents of Crime reported for the Alexandra area (CoJ and HSRC, 2003)

Although statistics in Table3are dated, it shows the change in crime incidents around the Alexandra area a year after the Alexandra Renewal Project began. The overall crime incidences in the area decreased, however, the common assault and the burglary of residential premises increased. This might still be the case in present day Alexandra as it supports the statement made by one of the interviewees. It is almost impossible to build real relationships with neighbours in Far East because everyone is enclosed in their special yards and big houses. When someone comes back from work or even school, they stay in their yards and lock the gates. In the informal settlements, everyone knows each other and people are genuinely interested in knowing about each other because they all stay together and share the same services and facilities.

The people are alienated not only because they each have their own yards to hide away from othersbut also in terms of engagement.There is a lot of detachment when neighbours engage. One of the women pointed out that as a resident in Far East, you cannot even ask for cooking powder or salt from your neighbour(as it was the case in Alex) because you donot know them well enough although you have been staying on the same street for over a decade. There are rarely community meetings especially ones that concern challenges that face the Far East area.

From one of the respondents, there are always conflicts over minor things that people shouldn't even be fighting about. They fight over dustbins and cleaning the outside area in front of the yards. For example, a neighbour would sweep the area in front of their yard and leave the dirt on the gate of someone else's yard and that creates conflict.

"...ourneighbours run a Shebeen where alcohol is sold.People come to drink outside their yard. The problem comes when customers leave the beer empties scattered outside our yard instead of where they bought alcohol from."(-- interviewee 4, 06 August 2015)

Positive impacts

Privacy that came with Alexandra Renewal Project, more specifically owning a house, is a social impact that all women valued. The comfort of being in one's own yard and occupying a space that no one can interfere with or intrude upon istreasuredby the women and it is one of the benefits of moving from an informal settlement to an RDP house. An observation that became apparent as far as privacy goes was that, older and married women valued privacy more than the young and single people did. They put more emphasis on it as an important factor in the Far East area and they kept mentioning it a number of times during the interviews. The younger women on the other hand viewed privacy as an added bonus rather than a necessity. Reasons to this might differ depending on individuals however I suspect that, as women get older, they become less social and keep to themselves as compared to when they are younger and make lots of friends. It might also be an attribute or responsibility that comes with marriage which almost compels one to value the privacy that is seldom enjoyed in the informal settlements.

Another factor that is accompanied by privacy ishaving one's personal space and the peace of mind that comes with it. Again, older women put more emphasis on this factor although younger people also mentioned it as part of the social benefits they now enjoy.

Unlike Alex or Sjwetla, in Far East a person is able to listen to his/her own music when they want to, at the volume that they are most comfortable with. Having the option to choose when to listen to music and what kind of music to listen to at what volume is a luxury that can only be understood by someone who has stayed in shacks. It is something that can easily be ignore but

makes a lot of difference once you have experienced it. Some people however, pointed out that the silence gets too much and boring. They sometimes miss the vibrant environment in the informal settlement and constant engagement with people, the parties on weekends and the loud midnight conversations over a few drinks. Portia, recalled that,

"I stayed in a one roomed house in Alex and enjoyed it. There is no place as fun as Alex. The street bash every weekend would be a welcomed relief here [Far East]." (—Interviewee 5, 15 August 2015).

Conflicts within the one yard lessened to almost non-existent. This is due to the fact that only one family stays within the same yard (in most cases, with an exception of those who rent out rooms) and it's usually people who speak the same language and do the things the same way. Consequently understanding is much greater than whenseven families from different backgrounds share the samespace as it was the case in Alex. The number of people who have to share resources such as water tap, washing lines, a bathroom or a toilet decreases significantly.That enables each householdenough room to breathe hence the environment becomes calmer than in an informal settlement.



Figure 6: Washing line behind a house in Far East



Figure 7: Private and in-door toilet

Since the house and the yard belongs to the family, efforts to take care of it and keep it clean are greater and family members take turns to clean essential spaces such as the toilet, sweeping the yard and keeping the front porch appealing and taken care of. The responsibility

becomes greater but at the same time it becomes easier because it reflects the image of the family occupying the place to the public.

"Since there are four girls, we divide the responsibilities accordingly and rotate each week. My brother has no household chores because he is the only one who works and supports us all financially."(--Interviewee 1, 28 August 2015)

4.3.3. Environmental and Health Impact

This section is slightly different from the previous one. The findings under health and environmental impact have not been deduced from the interviews with participants. Even though the women might be aware of the environment-related impacts of moving into the houses in Far East, none of them pointed out to the challenges they have had to deal with as a result of upgrading. These impacts are solely based on my observations from the area as well personal experiences from having stayed in one of the houses in Far East.

<u>Negative Impacts</u>

One of the major issues in Far East is the structural positioning of most of the RDP houses and manner in which the house was built. The houses are very cold in winter and very hot in summer. The bedroom is placed behind the living room and has no access to sun rays in the morning or the afternoon. The natural heating effect from the sun might have been ignored whendesigning many of these houses,which unfortunately affects the residents. This seems like a design error more than it is a health issue but there are negative implications concerning the wellbeing of residents health-wise. Since the houses are tremendously cold, it might be easier for the elderly and children to contract colds and influenza viruses since they peak during winter.The cold temperatures can be problematic for people suffering from asthmatics and even conditions such as hypothermiaflourish in extreme cases.

There are a lot of factors contributing to this issue of health. Firstly, the Far East area has prepaid electricity connections meaning that residents have to use electric heaters to increase temperatures inside their homes. Secondly, heaters are not the most suitable solution due to their high electricity consumption. Lastly, the residents of Far East do not make enough money

to cover the extra electricity costs caused by the constant use of heaters in winter. In addition is the fact that monthly expenses for the residents moving from Alex increase dramatically. Worrying about accumulating costs from unnecessary things is thereby unwarranted.

The dustbins are supposed to be collected at least once a week and that does not happen. Sometimes, two weeks goes by without waste collection. As an attempt to curb the effects of an overflowing dustbin, residents end up burning the garbage and when they cannot, they dispose of it by the banks of Jukskei River close to Sjwetla—an informal settlement where some people stay. Burning the refuse pollutes the air and the environment in which people stay and there are health implications for that although they might not be experienced immediately. Throwing garbage in a different place does not solve the problem either but instead shifts the responsibility and the consequences to another group of people or community.

Far East is located on a gradient slope that overlooks the Jukskei River and Sjwetla Informal Settlement. The surface area is covered in concrete meaning that water infiltration is very minimal during rainy days and surface run-off is accelerated. This might be a disadvantage to the Extension 8 residents of Far East and shacks built at the bottom of the slope because they get threatened by the water run-off and the plausibleJukskei River floods.

Positive Impacts

The residents of Far East have bigger space to undertake different activities that otherwise seem impossible at Alexandra informal settlement or even at Sjwetla. A positive environmental aspect of being in the area is that people can plant trees within their yards for shade or just beautification. The municipality also has planted quite a number of trees along pavements where people walk. The residents can also start-up food gardens in their backyards, although I did not come across any food garden during the course of research.

4.4. The Impact of the Alexandra Renewal Project from the Perspective of the City of Johannesburg in Association with Human Sciences Research Council

This progress review is a bit dated considering that it was conducted in 2003.However it provides an idea of the understanding of what the impact of the Alex Renewal Project has been

from the City of Johannesburg's perspective. What this section seeks to achieve is show the contrast from the City's measure of the Impact of the ARPfrom that of women's perceptions in Far East. In most cases, government officials in service delivery have to get through the list of projects they have completed. When delivering RDP houses for example, they have to assess delivery based on the number of people who have gained access to those services, the amount of budget used to provide the houses and the time period at which these houses were completed.

On the contrary, the people who get to inhabit these houses do not concern themselves with that, they worry about keeping their families safe and providing them with food and health care. If they had to tick boxes from the services they receive, I imagine that it would be ticking the number of people the house would be able to accommodate, the amount of money they would need to improve the house (be it extending, beautifying or even building walls to create a yard) and how long the house would last for or at least before the walls start cracking or falling apart. The City of Johannesburg's report of the impact that ARP had on the area will not only reveal a sense of achievement from the City but will also give an idea of how much the residents benefited from the Project. Lastly, the report hopefully, will show how much work still needs to be done in Alexandra Township according to the City.

4.4.1. Economic Impact

Alexandra Renewal Project stimulated a supply of short-term employment opportunities for the local residents and it planned to address the issue of unemployment on a longer term. The development of an informal sector market facility and Pan African Square, a Business Improvement District became one of the key areas through which business opportunities were offered to the residents of Alexandra. This was meant to create jobs for the local residentsand be driven as an initiative through which infrastructure would be developed.

The projectplanned to address unemployment though promoting small enterprises owned by the Alexandra entrepreneurs, facilitative skills development which would enable the local residents to be active participants in the economy as well as to build and upgrade transport infrastructure and services.

4.4.2. Social Impact

The Alexandra Renewal Project has brought about the the Johannesburg Metro Police and provided the local South African Police Service (SAPS) station with additional resources for better management of crime. This was intended to ensure safety of the residents and decrease crime ratesin the area.

The report commends the steady progress made by relocating residents living in hazardous and precarious settlements. The estimated number of these informal structures was 3246 where12 500 to 13 000 people lived. This number is said to have gone down due to the progress in the construction and the occupation of housing units—a total of 6000 people were relocated from the banks of the river to 'safer' locations. Progress has been made in upgrading schools and building new ones, with 35% of the upgrading complete (at the time the report was written). Science laboratories, computer centres and sports fields were to be created.

Since the project was in its early stages in 2001, the report mentions some of the welfare services that were to be created or improved within Alexandra. Some of which include special programmes for youth criminality and unemployment, violence against women, children and the elderly, alcohol and drug abuse, centres of economic activities and social development which were meant to be accessible in a walking distance.

4.4.3. Environmental and Health Impact

The report commends the ARP for the significant progress in decreasing pollution levels in the Jukskei River and improving future monitoring of the pollution in the river. Although the report does not elaborate how exactly this has been achieved, it nonetheless rejoices at this significant achievement. Planting of trees and provision of waste bins has been enforced as a strategy for environmental management and land-use planning. On the side of health, the project has had a positive impact in training and developing skills for health care workers, increased health worker visits to residents related to TB and HIV/Aids. It has also conveyed the importance of immunization of children to residents. However, the challenge in this sector was the lack of medical employees and doctors at facilities.

The Review Report by City of Johannesburg in partnership with the Human Sciences Research Council does not capture the overall impact of the Alexandra Renewal Project. It writes largely about what the project aimed to accomplish instead of what it had already completed. This is understandable considering that the report was written in 2003. However, the problem I had with this review was that, most of these plans listed on the report had no further explanation of what steps would be taken to ensure that those plans are realised. For example, based on my observation and some respondents during the interviews, the economic turnover that the project was meant to have through skills development and training has been very minimal. Young people in the Far East sit unemployed and have no knowledge of the Labour Centre that is meant to assist individuals living in Alexandra. In fact, most of these social welfare centres are unknown to residents. It makes me wonder how those in need of assistance by such these facilities can access them when they are not publicised to the community.

Another issue with the report is the one sided approach. It is purely based on the plans made by the project managers of ARP or whoever was in charge. Although a section of it examined the impact of the upgrading and Urban Renewal of Alexandra in different areas—social impact in terms of safety and security, social services (welfare), housing and education, economic impact as well as health inter alia, the report did not look the impact of these factors from the perspective of those affected. To conclude, although not studied rigorously, I find the review biased. A review is meant to be a critical assessment in order to institute changes if necessary to improve the results of the project. However, this report review failed to analyse the progress of the project critically but instead, was lenient and acted in favour of the City or the government. For a project that claimed to promote community participation, the least that could have been done was to consult the community representatives about the impact of the project on residents.

4.5. Discussion of the Findings

4.5.1. Challenges that faced women in Alexandra informal Settlement before upgrading

Women are a critical part of societies not only for their abilities to conceive children, but because of their ability to nurture and care for their families. This then makes it imperative that

women feel secure and comfort in order to radiate the warmth within their homes. Instead, women have been victims of violence, suffered abuse and rape even more so in informal settlements. In addition to that, a number of studies on women still show that voices of women and vulnerable people are not often taken into consideration during policy making and provision of services (NSW Women Movement, 2009).

The most sizeable challenge that women of Alexandra were faced with before upgrading took place was around the insufficiency or lack of basic services in the case of Sjwetla. Most people complain about the inadequacy of water, sanitation and inadequate housing. Some of the women had to share toilets and water taps with twenty other families who each have at least four members (estimation gathered from the interviews). Each block had to share these services and for women, this was problematic considering that they had no other alternatives. Some did not even delight in the luxury of flushed toilets as they had to share with other families the bucket toilets that could only be changed once a week. As a resident said,

"I used bucket toilets which had to be locked and one person would keep the key for the entire block. When I needed to use it, I had to find the person with the key…"

She said sometimes it would take time to find the person with the key because it kept circulating from one person to the next and she would then have to find the last person to use the toilet.

"The toilets would get full because they don't get flushed, then we had to wait for days for it to be emptied. Since they come once a week, sometimes the toilet gets full before the day for emptying comes."(Interviewee 5, 15 August 2015).

In one of the interviews, one woman mentioned that a man can just stand in a street corner and release his bladder whereas women cannot do that. Sharing with twenty or more people is especially challenging for women because no matter how much they need to use the toilet, they have to wait on queues in the morning just so they can use the toilet. Likewise with collecting water, they often have to wait on long queues because of the number of people waiting to fetch water from the same tap. I remember spending a night in Alex during my

teenage years, witnessing the long toilet queues was unexpected and shocking to a certain extent, yet for the residents it is as normal as a queue of people waiting for a taxi in a station.

The issue of sanitation is still a reality for the residents in the informal settlement of Alexandra even after upgrading has taken place. Other than being at risk of catching infections from sharing toilets which are not cleaned regularly, the women had to use toilets that piled up with stacks of dirty newspapers (used as tissue paper) that are not flushed down the toilet to avoid blocking the drainage system. Such environment is conducive for infections and diseases to thrive and contaminate women.

During the time when the women used to stay in the informal settlements, Alex did not have street lights and the inner parts of Alex still remain without street lights, it is mostly the main streets that do. Sjwetla informal settlement is one of the areas in Alexandra without street lights to this day, to make things worse; the settlement has no electricity at all. This made it difficult for women to walk freely on the streets at night because of they fearedharassment and rape. Women had to live in constant fear and avoid certain areas of the township to keep themselves safe. This proved to be very hard, especially for those who had to wake up early for work and come back late at night. Although I was unable to gather the rape statistics for Alexandra, it is quite evident that rape is an issue in the area hence the Bombani Centre for Abused women was founded. The Centre takes in women who are victims of physical abuse and rape, women who are suffering from HIV/Aids.

Living without electricity did not only challenge the safety of the women but also increased the amount of work they had to do within households. Doing regular chores such as cooking, cleaning and even washing was onerous. They had to use paraffin stoves to cook. The stovesare slow and take longer to cook than electric ones. They also pose a great danger of causing fire when not looked after and fire spreads very easily in informal settlement because the shacks are combined and the space between them is very limited. Because of the shared washing lines, women in Alex had to wake up in the early hours of morning to do their laundry or at best do it at night so that they can hang it early in the morning. Without electricity to light up the house when these women are doing laundry, the activity became harder than it should have been.

"You would have to do laundry at night and wake up around 4am to hang your laundry or else in the morning someone else would have occupied the washing line." (–Interview 1, 08 August 2015).

Problems that face women in informal settlements and elsewhere should not be taken seriously only by women or those directly affected, but instead should be addressed by all relevant parties in societies. As Kofi Annan elucidates, "…there is no tool more effective for future development than the empowerment of women. When women thrive, all of society benefits, and succeeding generations are given a better start in life" (Annan, 2003). Overcoming these challenges will need both men and women to work collaboratively against violence, abuse, the harassment of women and even issues like illiteracy of young girls because of their predetermined cultural roles and sometimes their menstrual cycles. Though, that is a completely different area of research that this report does not focus on, it is important to stress the significance of all persons to stand against women issues seeing that men are also perpetuators of some of the issues that face women. Changing the culture and the mind-sets of our men (about their perceptions of women) and increasing their participation on raising awareness on issues affecting women would make a great difference. This would empower women to participate more in finding solutions for the challenges they face.

4.5.2. Role played by women or Women's Organizations in Alexandra during informal settlement upgrading

Women's participation in community projects particularly when informal settlement upgrading is concerned is very limited. However, as documented on the literature review section women's involvement in settlement upgrading is usually through savings schemes. A number of women in different cities and parts of Africa have been involved in upgrading through these savings groups. They are usually self-help projects where women take these initiatives by themselves to be drivers of the difference they want to see. Although some of the schemes have been successful to the point where local government recognized them and partnered with these groups when providing housing to the community.

In the case of Alexandra under the Alex Renewal Project, members of the community established the Alexandra Development Forum (ADF) intended to ensure and secure community participation with all the stakeholders involved in the project (HSRC and CoJ, 2003). The Alexandra Development Forum was made up of representatives from different community organizations within Alex:

Alexandra Civic Association (ACA)
Alexandra Civic Organization (ACO)—a division from ACA
Alexandra Land and Property Owner's Association (ALPOA)
East Bank Civic Association (EBCA)
South African National Civic Organization (SANCO)

Of all these organizations that make up the ADF, none of them are women's groups. Although the composition of women in the ADF executive committee is also unknown, these organizations do not represent the sole interests of women and only women's groups could facilitate development projects that would be beneficial for women in informal settlements. All projects that took place in Alexandra had to go through the ADF for approval and this enabled the forum an opportunity to oversee all projects that took place in the area (HSRC and (CoJ, 2003). The forum also had a chance to directly influence the kind of development that was favourable for its constituency. Women's groups would have been afforded the same privilege had they been part of the ADF.

Almost all women interviewed were members of different community's saving groups. They met every first week of the month to collect their monthly monetary contributions which were then kept in a bank. These savings groups helped women the most during funerals, weddings and other big events that required money. What sparked my interest was that the women did not only help each other financially, but also assisted one another through offering their labour skills as well as emotional support. They cooked cleaned, washed laundry for each other but most importantly they supported each other by offering advice on household related issues. Although the presence of these women is well-known in their communities, they did not play any role in the informal settlement upgrading, at least not the women who were interviewed.

One woman was aware that the Alexandra Civic Association (ACA) was one of the community stakeholders who represented the residents of Alexandra. Although she was not well informed about the rest of the organizations that made up the ADF, she had knowledge of what the role of the ACA in the Renewal Project was. She mentioned that the Women in Far East mostly participated in Stokvels and church groups which did little to upgrade their communities. They preferred these mentioned societies in comparison to political organisations.

The problem with women taking subordinate position in challengesaround community development isthat they let other people make decisions for them. Another problem with this is that organizations usually put their constituents first before the entire community when delivering services, compromising those who do not have membership with those organizations. Residents who fall outside the organizations or associations are the last to benefit, if they benefit at all. Since women do not have community organization structures, they are at risk of falling victim to such practices.

In her paper about the decentralization of democracy in relation to local clientalism, Benit-Gbaffou (2011) shares two stories which took place in a low income neighbourhood of Johannesburg. The remarkable and most relevant to this research is elaborated on in this section. Benit-Gbaffou (2011) states that the local municipality wanted to distribute food parcels to the poorest of the poor within Yeoville, however the food parcels were limited due to very scarce resources therefore only a few would benefit. For a number of reasons including their proximity to the ground level as well as their better knowledge of the most needy households, the City asked the South African National Civic Organization (SANCO—the biggest organization in the area) to choose those who were to benefit and to distribute the parcels to them. SANCO it seemed, distributed the parcels to its members who according to Benit-Gbaffou (2011) were no less needy than the rest. This demonstrates how effective organizations can be to remain sustainable and maintain their popularity. It also shows the danger of not mobilizing in meaningful and recognized platforms. Women therefore, need to congregate more in political and societal landscapes in order to change the status quo.

4.5.3. Essential facilities that have been put in place for women to improve their lives

According to the study conducted in 2009 by the NSW Women Refuge Movement and the UWS Urban Research Centre, Parker and Fopp (2004) identify secure and stable housing as a major contributor to women's wellbeing. In fact, housing is said to play a critical role in women's daily lives due to its significance to the development of a sense of control over circumstances, social identity and social status (NSW Women Movement, 2009). This third and last question addresses the issue of women's wellbeing after relocating to the RDP houses and having access to other facilities that are specifically targeted at liberating women.

First and foremost, the RDP house that women occupy is a primary facility for them to improve their lives. The house provides a sense of security during the uncertainty of the job market and it provides reassurance and warmth during cold winter evenings. That is something many are not able to enjoy, especially those in informal settlements. From the research, more than half of the women interviewed were able to start up small businesses that became either a primary source of income or contributed to the overall income of the household. The businesses varied from sewing, baking, opening a tuck shop, a mini hair salon to running a tavern, a restaurant/internet cafe and a pre-school. These are rare opportunities that women who do not have access to housing and a yard cannot seize.

Other than housing, facilities that were built as part ofAlexandra Renewal Project for women in Far East are very uncommon. In actual fact, the only facility that I was pointed to is the Bombani Centre for Abused Women. The Centre addresses needs of specific kind of women—not all women from the Far East area are assisted by the Centre unless they have experienced abuse.

According to a few inhabitants of Far East, Bombani Centre for Abused Women was opened in 2007. Unfortunately the Centre is not publicized as much as I had expected and it is also not very accessible to outsiders. I expected the Centre to be easily accessible to women, to have a board outside the gate with information of what the Centre is about, their contact details and the times at which the public can reach the owners or those who run it. Efforts to contact those who run the centre proved worthless. It would have been very useful to know a few things about the Centre such as how many women they take in every year, how many they have had since they opened the place, what the criteria to selecting women who stay in the centre is, if

whether the Centretakes in women from Alexandra only or those from other townships as well, what the age range of women they house is, how long are they allowed to stay for and what exactly do they help these vulnerable women with and what skills do they equip them with to be able to survive and grow independent in the world again.



Figure 7: Bombani Centre For Abused Women Facility

I would have also liked to know in no particular details where they go after their lives in Bombaniand if they are doing well for themselves or at least better than they did before coming into the Centre; if the Centre had any form of sponsorship—financially or otherwise from private companies or is it strictly a government funded institution. As mentioned, it is unfortunate that those in charge of Bombani Centre could not be accessed and as a result, could not bring clarity to some of the questions that would have enlightened the curiosity. As mentioned before, Bombani Centre is the only facility in the Far East that specifically caters for women's needs throughout the Alexandra Renewal Project. For that sole reason, it is imperative that more information about the Centre for Abused women is adequately shared with the community. For obvious reasons like protecting inhabitants of the Centre and for the sake of privacy, it is understandable why access to people who work there or even those who run Centre is difficult. However, one cannot help but wonder how vulnerable women who need assistance from the Centre can access it seeing that its location is somewhat far from the entire community.

A few months after conducting research in Far East, it was brought to the fore that Bombani Centre has a webpage on the City of Johannesburg website. The information found on the page differs slightly from the information collected from some of the interviews on site. It is said that the centre opened in August of the year 2000. It provides short-term shelter and counselling to abused women from within Alexandra and other surroundings. According to the page, Bombabi can only accommodate 10 women (with their children) at a time and they stay in the centre for two weeks at most, however, those who need more help stay longer. The centre relies heavily on donations by businesses, non-government organisations and community members to pay for electricity and water, buy food and bedding.

4.6. Conclusion

The overall results of the study show that women are impacted by informal settlement upgrading both positively and negatively. As much as they benefit from having access to a house and other basic services and gaining privacy as a result, they also experience certain conditions that are not favourable compared to their previous dwellings. However, regardless of the negative impacts of upgrading, 11 out of 12 of these women would still prefer living in the Far East area than the informal settlement. Most of them felt that they deserved better than what they got but they would rather settle for what they have because they did not pay for it. Besides, they viewed themselves as more privileged than those who stay in Alex informal settlement and Sjwetla because they now have access to a house of their own and services that are not available in Alex or Sjwetla.

The most prevalent positive impact in the lives of women was the access to a house and a yard. This allowed them privacy, peace of mind and enabled them to expand their house to accommodate for more people or to startup businesses. For many it became their primary resource to generate income and to make a livelihood for themselves and their families. The major negative impact was the dramatic increase in monthly expenses. This was caused by being relocated further from services such as shopping centres, schools and work places causing these women to pay for commuting, the increasing number of members to feed and paying for some services that were free in the informal settlement also contributed to the increase in expenses.

The personal information gathered from the interviews revealed that most of these women struggle to find jobs and they do not possessa tertiary qualification. Whether this is by choice or circumstances, it is not apparent. Those who do have jobs are usually employed on part-time basis and earn very low salaries. This is no different from people in informal settlements and the reasons to this are still unknown. Perhaps coming from a poor background and having children forces these women to find jobs to support their families or even to stay home and look after the children and the whole family instead of pursuing a career or an education.

The younger women in the study—those between the ages of 21 and 39 years expressed their aspirations of moving out of the Far East and not stay there for the rest of their lives, especially those who have not invested immensely on their houses. They viewed Far East as a stepping stone to a better livingsomeplaceelse in the suburbs. Some planned on staying in Far East for a long time. These were those who had invested in their houses, extended, furnished beautifully and opened businesses. They would rather stay in their beautiful homes and enjoy the same luxury where they did not have to worry about paying for services like in the expensive suburbs.

The availability of women's organisations and their involvement/ roles in settlement upgrading was very minimal in the Alexandra Renewal Project. Most of these women showed little interest in taking part in these organisations in order to address the challenges they face in informal settlements. Consequently, there are limited facilities built specifically for women in Alexandra. The only one known as Bombani Centre for Abused Women needs funds to continue operating within the area. It can only accommodate 10 women for a few weeks. The three women volunteers who are running the centre are not paid and if things continue this way, the Centre might be non-existent in the near future.

5. Chapter Five: Conclusion

5.1. Analysis of the findings using Laura Jaitman's (2012) formula on Slum Upgrading Programs Evaluation

In her paper, Jaitman analyses slum upgrading methods which have been used in a number of programs.She detects the gaps between these methods and the literature on slum upgrading (2012). The interesting part of her work for this research is the manner in which she divides the slum upgrading programs based on the main outcomes. These outcomes are divided into three categories which are: Housing, Neighbourhood and Individual. The two most relevant categories that will be focused on for the purposes of this research are housing and individual (2012). Neighbourhoods will also be touched on briefly as this outcome highlights aspects of communities that are significant to women's wellbeing such as infrastructure and safety. Since the participants in this research moved from Alex informal settlements to RDP housesin Far East, the housing outcomes becomes relevant and applicable for this research. The individual aspect of it comes from the initial goals and aims stipulated by the Alexandra Renewal Project with regards to the promotion of human development and wellbeing of residents. Given that this section analyses the extent to which the needs of the women in Far East were met and the ability to achieve the stipulated goals from the perspective of the participants, housing and individual development will be the main points of evaluation.

Housing is a very important component of informal settlement upgrading sincethe housing backlog isthe core factor that led to informal settlements in the first place. The security that comes from owning a house can be trickled down into bigger development opportunities (as shown in the previous chapter where women were able to start businesses and make a living) from something as simple as acquiring an education, taking better care of one's self and even investing on personal development to starting up a business and contributing to the community's economy.

Below is a summarized and a revised version of Jaitman's table used to show indicators that are frequently used to evaluate slum upgrading (Jaitman, 2012). The table has been revised and adapted to Alexandra, Far East where the study took place for more relevance and applicability.

Some indicatorshave been excluded from the original table which was compiled by Jaitmandue to their irrelevance and some have been added into the table because of their necessity although they are not found on the original table.

5.1.1. Housing outcomes

Outcomes measured		Frequently used indicators
Housing	Price	The value of the house depending on the size, renting price or selling price if it had to be sold and the quality of the material used to build the house.
	Infrastructure	Access to free water, sanitation and electricity connection.
	Investment	Total amount of money spent to build or upgrade the dwelling within a specific time and source of funds for the improvement of the house (credit, savings etc.)
	Property rights	Type of land title (individual or communal title) and the degree of title. Availability of the title deed documents.
	Location	Proximity to services and facilities, exposure to natural disasters (flooding, landslides, landfills etc.)
Household size		The number of people the house is able to accommodate depending on the size of the house and the age of the members of the household.
Living Conditions Index	Composition Index	Source and the quality of water within the house, sanitation facilities, the extent of crowding and refuse disposal.

Table 4: Frequently used evaluation indicators by the housing outcome (revised Jaitman, 2012)

5.1.2. Individual outcomes

Outcomes measured		Frequently used indicators
Wellbeing	Life satisfaction or happiness	General happiness of an individual from all aspects of life e.g. satisfaction from housing, economic situations etc.
Income	Sources	Sources of income(whether one works at home or away, the type of work they do and place of work)
	Amount	The amount of money earned per week/months and the number months worked per year
Labour market	Labour supply	The number of people who work within a household and the hours they work per week
	Formality	Members of the household who work within the formal or informal sector.
Human capital	Formal and Non-formal education	Highest education levels achieved by adults, other non-formal education such as job training programs and workshops Number of children enrolled at schools, their school attendance.
Commuting		Time and money spent travelling to work, school, hospital or shopping centres. Means of transport used.
Human development index	Composite index	Overall measure of the residents' capabilities and skills combining all necessary variables after informal settlement upgrading takes place.
Health	Women	Fertility Awareness of their human rights, infections and diseases, physical abuse and basic skills development.
	Children	Prevalent infections, nutrition (height/weight for age), availability of institutions for early childhood development/ cognitive development (mobility and communication skills).
	Adults	Mortality and the past year and causes of death, drug use etc.

Table 5: Frequently used evaluation indicators by the individual outcome (revised Jaitman, 2012)

5.1.3. Neighbourhood outcomes

Outcomes measure		Frequently measured indicators
Transport and mobility	Proximity and links	The availability and proximity of transport routes to the residents, the transport links between communities and the city centres or essential facilities and urban services.
Safety	Perception	Whether individuals feel insecure when leaving their homes by themselves; on rare occasions, frequently or always.
	Crime	Official crime statistics or self-reported crime incidences of household violence, robbery, assault etc.
Integration to the inner city	Integration	Integration/isolation of the settlement from the inner-city
	Services	Activities developed outside or inside the neighbourhood for leisure or social interaction

Table 6: Frequently used evaluation indicators by neighbourhoods outcome (revised Jaitman, 2012)

In the informal settlement upgrading programmes, measuring the success of the project through evaluating the outcomes has proved effective. The indicators used in the tables are specific components that upgrading programmes are supposed to affect and characterise changes to the programme.It becomes easier to determine the success (or a lack thereof) of informal settlement upgrading once the indicators have been determined. The indicators have to align to the goals and objectives of the project—what the project intends to accomplish. That way, the evaluation process through Jaitman's Housing, Neighbourhood and Individual Outcomes table becomes effective.

To make this point clear, I will suffuse the major goals and objectives of the Alexandra Renewal Project. Once the goals of the project are on the surface, I will determine if whether or not they were accomplished by the end of the project. I will also evaluate the residents' satisfaction with the services delivered to them from the interviews. This will enable the research to evaluate the ability of the ARP to respond to women'sneeds(based on Jaitman's table), to meet their goals/objectives and to deliver services to the satisfaction of the participants. This evaluation goes beyond accessing quantity of service provision or even a one-sided assessment, it

addresses issues of the quality of service delivery, their overall wellbeing and acknowledges the opinion of recipients.

The Alexandra Renewal Project described its broad objectives as a) ensuring the program as a systematic and sustainable intervention to alleviate poverty and significantly address underdevelopment b) improving the urban as well as housing environment c) increasing access to social services d) increasing the skills base of the specified urban renewal area and e) strengthening the mutually beneficial economic relationship between the specified urban renewal area and the broader municipal area (CoJ, 2014). The project was to focus on three aspects; improving housing conditions, fostering economic development and improving personal safety.

The Far East area has improved significantly. Since the Alexandra Renewal Project, the women as well other residents of the area now enjoy access to housing and infrastructure. Unlike in informal settlements, residents of Far East Alexandra have access to piped clean water, electricity, indoor sanitation facilities, a formal housing structure with a yard and proper roads. Some of the women in the area have started their own businesses, using the house as a primary source to generate income. Most use their yards to generate additional income to their formal employment whereas some use their houses as an opportunity to house their relatives from other provinces who come to search for better quality of education, for employment, or just to spend holidays in Gauteng.

However good the benefits are, they did not come without a cost. All of the women interviewed testified to the fact that they had to sacrifice something to enjoy the new and improved services that came with upgrading. In fact, it can be argued from the findings that, informal settlement upgrading does not bring about anall-inclusive development of improvement in the lives of residents, contrary to the objectives and the goals set by the ARP in its commencement. The upgrading did improve the physical aspects of development for the women, however, the economic aspect of it has been compromised to an extent. Some of the most valuable things that women in Far East have had to give up include but not limited to being closer to many services and facilities such as schools, shopping centres, clinics and for

some work places, saving a proportion of their income due to lower living expenses, safety due to night/early-morning watchers, being a valuable part of the society.

One of the women described living in Far East as 50percent better than living in the informal settlement. She said the other 50percent is the same as the Alex or Sjwetla if not worse. She complained that they still face the same issues and in some cases more issues than they were initially faced with in informal settlements. For example, they experience more load shedding than they did in Alex. The electricity in Far East is so 'weak' that plugging in more than three appliances at a time trips the main electricity box also known as the main switch. This is something they did not experience in Alex even though the connections were not legal. When there are no people around to turn the main switch back on, the food in the refrigerator may spoil or the least reduce its life span and other appliances such as television, light bulbs and microwaves may be damaged. Theft is much higher than it was in Alexandra.Going to places has proved harder than it was and passing a group of people by the corner without greeting is considered normal.

Whatstunned me was one woman's testimony of how the government officials harassed the housing owners few months before I conducted the research. Owners who had backyard shacks were forced to remove them and when they did notcomply their shacks were forcibly removed by the officials themselves. She thought this hypocritical since the very same government relocated some of residents from Sjwetla who lived in shacks along the banks of the river to newer shacks just above the river banks. She questioned thereasons behind destroying backyard shacks in Far East when they were able to relocate people to shacks. She argued that the backyard shacks are in much better conditions than the onesresidents of Sjwetla were moved into by the government. At least the backyard shacks in Far East have access to electricity, sanitation (flushed toilets) and better living standards compared to appalling conditions in Sjwetla. The home owners recognised a need for housing and they responded to it by providing better conditions at an affordable price than the informal settlements while they also make a living.

In conclusion, the Alexandra Renewal Project has improved the lives of the residents in informal settlements. The women in Far East have benefited from the upgrading program and have lived through some positive impacts as a result. However, they have also experiences some negative impacts caused by the programme too. The problem is with regards to the inadequacy of the evaluation procedures in place to help improve the service delivery around informal settlement upgrading. The procedures are not beneficial to those at the receiving end of the service as much as they are convenient to those running the projects. They continue to perpetuate undesirable results without finding alternative solutions to better service delivery and ultimately improve the conditions of living. The Alexandra Renewal Project Review report for example, did not address the issues that continued to face the residents of Alexandra during the time when the project was in progress. It focused on what the project needed to accomplish, the goals it neededto achieve and more lists that needed to be covered. Not once did it present ideas of what could be done better for the project to be more effective from the perspective of Alexandra residents.

Informal settlement upgrading programmes need to adopt a system that favours those who are meant to live in the upgraded settlements. Ultimately, it is all about those who inhabit these environments than it is about those in charge and or running the projects. Jiatman's table shows a number of indicators that informal settlement upgrading initiatives can adopt to improve their effectiveness for the people. The Housing, Individual and Household Outcomes focus on indicators that affect people and how they can improve their lives with the services delivered to them. They are indicators that can really make a difference and impact the lives of residents for the better.

From the findings in Far East, informal settlement upgrading (particularly access to housing) has not lead to the improvement in personal development of the residents of Far East. As shown in the previous chapter, out of the 12 women who participated in the study, only one has attained a tertiary qualification. About 7 of them reached high school level although none of them specified the highest grade completed in high school. 5 of these women are unemployed, with only 2 employed on full-time basis, while only 2 are employed part-time. Contrary to the

government's assumption that informal settlement upgrading in Alexandra would generate skills development, employment and promotion of small business or private enterprises, the women in Far East have not experienced that manner of support from the project or government. 3 out of 12 women are self-employed and own small businesses in hair-dressing, baking, restaurant and internet cafe but none of them receive any financial, institutional or skills development support from local government. Also the findings show that they are not satisfied with their lives in Far East but felt as though they could not get better because the services that came with upgrading were free and because their lives are better than those living in Sjwetla. Most of these women did not plan on staying in Far East forever, in fact, they would rather move to better suburban areas where they could have a better life.

5.2. Recommendations

Women certainly do benefit from an informal settlement upgrading and their lives were impacted positively by the upgrading. They now have their own yards for privacy and more space, access to resources such as private bathrooms, safe electricity and less conflict with neighbours over noise and or shared resources.However, these benefits are also accompanied by negative impacts that come with moving into a different location to a new house. These include but not limited to being further from the shopping centres and having to take a taxi to access services, paying for electricity and living in isolation or rather limited contact with neighbours. As a recommendation, perhaps the focus when upgrading an informal settlement can move beyond just providing residents with an adequate house to live in. It should also focus on opportunities that can be created for the residents to survive in the upgraded environment, but more than that, to make a living decent enough to support their families. This can be a lesson from the three women who started their businesses without financial or technical support from government.

Just as a housing is now considered human settlement as it requires basic services such as water, electricity and even roads for accessibility, a house should also be considered as a standard foundation through which the owner can make a livelihood. For example, some house owners have backyard rooms as a way of generating income. However, currently there is an

issue concerning certain government officials who have allegedly acted against the idea bypreventing people from doing this, to an extent that some backyard shacks have been forcibly removed. If governmentcould begin to examine and weigh the costs and benefits of some tactics that these women employ to make a living, be it starting spaza shops, or opening small businesses in their yards, we might find solutions to some of the country's problems. Achieving this wouldtruly be beneficial to the residents and the goals ofupgrading would have been realized completely. In case where the costs exceed the benefits or when there is danger, only then can the creativity of informal settlement dwellers be inhibited- for reasons of safety.

As a recommendation, instead of trying to do away with informal settlements because of different reasons, we must find answers of improving the conditions of these informal settlements without having to relocate people or even uproot their livelihoods. This strategy has been adopted by informal settlement upgrading initiatives and even in-situ upgrading however, my proposal is to address and minimize the issues that people struggle with even after being relocated to RDP houses but also keep the opportunities that attracted these women to informal settlements in the first place. Usually the common assumption is that people move into the informal settlements because they cannot afford houses or renting in 'formal houses', but a few years ago Dewar's research has discovered that the reasons go deeper than.These reasons are mentioned in Chapter Two. The solution would be to create houses that address the core challenges that women suffer from but must still retain the intimacy, proximity and the community spirit of informal settlements because RDP houses have failed to do that.

The impacts of informal settlement upgrading should be more positive than negative unlike in the Far East. People who are staying in these upgraded environments should not feel as though theyare out of options to a better life in these settlements but rather strive to make them better. Informal settlement upgrading projects should strive to provide better conditions for people than those they started off with, or else informal settlements will continue growing. They should develop settlements and facilities that allow people to improvethemselves academically, socially and financially.

As another recommendation, instead of a mass production of RDP houses, the Department of Human Settlement can develop accommodation that caters for temporary residents who move into cities because of temporary employment opportunities. In addition to that, they can also lease houses to the needy for a limited number of years instead of delivering permanent houses. Regular inspections would have to occur on regular basis to make sure that the houses remain in good condition. The occupants could be assisted by the skills development facilities for them to have formal training and be more equipped to be economically active and get jobs. The constraint that comes with occupying the house for limited number of years would motivate residents to find sustainable jobs and gain the necessary skills to equip them to do so. After the first occupants become independent, they would move out to make space for others in need of housing. In that way more people in need of accommodation are absorbed into the job market, they become comfortable financially through personal development and training to make a decent livelihood and the youth development facilities would be used efficiently.

Thirdly, since government spends millions of rands on the rigid, inflexible RDP houses that have not solved the issue of housing backlog. Perhaps a new social housing prototype could be developed to reduce the inhumane conditions of informal settlements while also responding to the current reality of job market flexibility and migration. The new prototype would be flexible enough to allow occupants to run businesses during the day while they sleep in it at night.It could be a double storey model for it to accommodate the different usesIt would be able to move from one location to the next, like a caravan, except the insulation inside would make it tolerable during the cold winter nights and ventilation would be prioritized. Simply hiring a van would all that is required for it to move from place to place. It would be strong enough not to be swayed by harsh winds or to be destroyed by stormy weather. Its platform would be elevated to avoid floods. Although this might not be for the long run, it might be a plausible solution temporarily.

5.3. Conclusion

When the poor find themselves in extremely difficult situations, they mostly find ways to rise above that. They maneuver within the system to make a living for themselves and their

families. Sometimes their strategies of survival are not necessarily legal but in some cases, their strategies are undeniably brilliant and government should learn from them but most importantly, support them instead of shutting them down.

What was interesting to discover during the course of research was that most houses in Far East had been extended and they seemed to be well taken care of. Yet whatsurprised me even further is that most of the participants did not have any formal employment and those who had, they were employed on part-time basis. Most ofthose who are employed might be placed between low skilled work and semi-skilled work since very few residents have a tertiary qualification. Considering that they have large families to take care of but could still manage to extend and look after their houses, it makes one wonder how income is generated in such communities. How they embed themselves in their communities and find strategies to survive. For the duration of my stay in the area, I also questioned how these residents can afford to buy takeaways on daily basis and wear fancy labels while not employed. The answers to these questions were not apparent but perhaps that could be an interesting line of research in future. It could reveal more about the kind of community that Far East is and the survival tactics of its residents.

Could it be that perhaps the women in Far East are still strongly grounded in their traditional gender roles of reproducing and being care givers? Could it also be that men are still upholding their societal expectation of being providers—financially so to speak? Although the statistics show that female headed households have increased, that women are now undertaking roles of breadwinners and providers within the home and the rate at which people commit through marriage has decreased, could it be a possibility that men might still be providers of households in an indirect way. Most young women I interviewed were single and those with boyfriends had an expectation of them paying a “girlfriend allowance” from their salaries. Perhaps that can be an income injection within the home that might not be calculated as part of the overall budget. In future, these unknown prospects can be a remarkable topic to research.

Reference List

Abbott, J. and Huchzermeyer, M. (2001) An Analysis of Informal Settlements and applicability of visual settlement planning (ViSP) in South Africa.in Naidoo, V. (2007) Informal Settlement Upgrading in Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality: *Capacity to Scale Up?* Witwatersrand University: Johannesburg

Abraham, D. (2003) Local Economic Development (LED) in South Africa: A useful tool for sustainable development, *Urban Forum*, 14: 185-200

Agency, HDA. (2012) *South Africa: Informal settlements status.* Johannesburg: Housing Development Agency.

Annan, K. (2003) Sakharov Prize for Freedom of Thought: The Elders. Women's rights quotes Available at http://www.betterworld.net/quotes/women-quotes.htm

Bellu, L. G. (2011). *Development and development paradigms; A reasoned review of prevaling visons*: Food and Agricultural state of the united nations, Resources for Policy Making. Rome: EASYPol

Benit-Gbaffou, C. (2011) Up Close and Personal—How does Local Democracy Help the Poor Access the State: Stories of Accountability and Clientalism in Johannesburg. *Journal of Asian African Studies* 46(5): 453-464

Bitsch, V. (2005) Qualitative Research: A Ground Theory Example and Evaluation Criteria. *Journal of Agribusiness*, 23(1): 75-91

City of Johannesburg. (2014) Case-Study 4: Alexandra Renewal Project, Case Studies 2013-2014. Johannesburg

Cresswell, J., W. (2004) *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approach* (5th edition). Lost Angeles: Sage Publications.

Cresswell, J., W. (2009) Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches (3rd Edition) Los Angeles: Sage Publications.

D'Cruz, C. and Mudimu, P. (2013) Community Savings that Mobilize Federations, build Women's Leadership and support Slum Upgrading.*International Institute for Environment and Development*, 25(1): 31-45

Datta, N. (2008) Joint Titling-- A win-win Policy? Gender and Property rights in urban informal settlements in Chandigarh, India. *Feminist Economics*, 12(1): 271-298.

Desai, V and Potter, R. (2006)*Doing Development Research.* London: Sage Publications

Dewar, D. (2002) Working with Informality in Urban Settlements. A Paper prepared for Planning Africa Conference, Durban.

Dolores, T., C. (2007) Purposive Sampling as a Tool for Informant Selection.*Ethnobotany Research & Applications*.5: 147-158

Erma, T. (1996) Women and the housing environment: The experiences of Turkish migrant women in squatter Gecekondu and the apartment housing, 28(6): 764-798

Fox, W. and Meyer, I. (1995) *Policies for Public Service Transformation*. Eliot Avenue: Creda Press

Gauteng Local Government and Housing (GLGH). (2009). Alexandra Urban Renewal: The All-Embracing Township Rejuvenation Programme. International conference paper submitted for the UN Habitat Scroll of Honour Award. Available at http://www.dlgh.gpg.gov.za/Documents/International%20conference%20pages%20presented%20by%20the%20Department/Alexandra%20Urban5Renewal%20-%20The%20all%20embracing%20township%20rejuvination%20programme.pdf

Guba, S. and Lincoln, G. (1989) *Naturalistic Enquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

Gwagwa, N. (1994) Agenda: Empowering Women for Gender Equity, *Agenda Feminist*, 1(21): 103-106

Gwagwa, N. N. (1995) Women as 'Home-makers' and Men as 'Heads' of Households: Who is responsible for Housing Improvements? *Gender Research on Urbanisation, Planning, Housing and Everyday Life*, 42-60.

Hassim, S. (2008) Social Justice, care and developmental welfare in South Africa: Acapabilities perspective, Social Dynamics. *A journal of African Studies*, 34(2): 104

Human Sciences Research Council and City of Johannesburg, (2003) Alexandra: *A case-study of urban renewal for the Presidential 10 year review project*. Available online file:///C:/Users/677183/Downloads/2381_Roefs_Alexandrareport.pdf accessed on [07 September 2015]

Human Settlements Reference Group. (2005) Department of Local Government and Housing: Draft Discussion Document. Available online at https://www.westerncape.gov.za/text/2005/10/discussion_document_20051018.pdf accessed on [21 April 2015]

Jaitman, L. (2012) Evaluation of Slum Upgrading Programs: Literature Review and Methodological Approaches, Inter-American Development Bank. Available at http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2305396 accessed on [31 September 2015]

Kalabamu, F. T. (1998) Gender neutral housing delivery systems: A critical analysis in Botswana, in A. Larsson et at. (eds), Changing Gender Relations in Southern Africa: *Issues of Urban Life*, Roma, National University of Lesotho

Khunou, S., F. (2009) Traditional Leadership and Independent Bantustans of South Africa: Some milestones of Transformative Constitutionalism beyond Apartheid.*PER*, 12(4): 81-360

Mandela, N. (1995) *Long Walk to Freedom, The autobiography of Nelson Mandela*. South Africa: Little Brown

Massey, R. T. (2014) Exploring counter-conduct in upgraded informal settlements: The case of women residents in Makhaza and New Rest Cape Town, South Africa.*Habitat Internation journals*, 44(1): 290-296.

Mjoli-Ncube, N. (1998). Gender neutral or gender equality: Access to worker housing in South Africa. *Gender research on urbanisation, planning, housing and everyday life*, 206-225.

Monitoring and Evaluation Report. (2010) Consolidated Monitoring and Evaluation Report on the Departments of Housing: Human Settlements. Pretoria: Public Service Commission

Muthwa, S. (1994) Female household headship and household survival in Soweto.*Journal of Gender Studies*, 3(2): 165-175

N/A, 2011: More women in Parliament since 1994, News 24 24 January, Available from http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/Politics/More-women-in-Parliament-since-1994-20110125 accessed on [15 May 2015]

Naceur, F. (2013). Impact of upgrading on perceptions of safety in informal settlement: Case study of Batna. *Frontiers of Architectural Research*, 2(4): 400-408

Naidoo, V. (2007) Informal Settlement Upgrading in Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality:Capacity to Scale Up?Witwatersrand University: Johannesburg

Nallari, A. (2015) All we want are toilets inside our homes! The critical role of sanitation in the lives of urban poor adolescent girls in Bengaluru, India.*International Institute for Environment and Development*, 27(1): 1-16

Ngcaku, A. (2012) Understanding the Dynamics of Branding Black Townships in South Africa: *The case of Alexandra*. Witwatersrand University: Johannesburg

Njamwea, M. (2003) Upgrading Informal Settlements by Securing Public Open Spaces: A Case-Study of Informal Settlements in Blantyre City Malawi. Master's Thesis, International Institute for Geo-Information Science and Earth Observation, Netherlands

NSW Women Refugee Movement and the UWS Urban Research Centre. (2009) The impact of housing on the lives of women and children—post domestic violence crisis accommodation: A study undertaken by the NSW Women Refugee Movement and the UWS Urban Research Centre. Available online at http://www.uws.edu.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0011/69590/Microsoft_Word_-_Finalreport.pdf accessed on [September 2015]

Oldfield, S. (2002) Partial formalisation and its implications for community governance in an informal settlement. *Urban forum*, 13(2): 102-115.

Oruwari, Y. (1991) The Changing role of women in families and their housing needs: a case study of Port Hartcourt, Nigeria: *Environment and Urbanisation*, 3(2): 6-12

Parker, S., and Fopp, R. (2004) I'm the Slice of Pie that's Ostracized…Foucault's Technologies, and Personal Agency, in the Voice of Women who are Homeless, Adelaide Australia. *Housing, Theory and Society*, 21(41): 145-154

Rhizome Management Services and Rebel-Group Advisory (2009) Cost-Benefit Analysis: Social Rental Housing and RDP Housing, A report prepared for Social Housing Foundation 2009. Available online at file:///C:/Users/677183/Downloads/CBA_main_report%20sm.pdf%20215.pdf accessed on [31 September 2015]

Rubin, M. And Gardner, D. (2009) Developing a Response to Backyarding for SALGA, A Report prepared for The South African Local Government Association (SALGA)

Schlyter, A. (1998). Youth, gender and living conditions in Lusaka. *Gender research on urbanisation, planning, housing and everyday life*, 286-308.

Sibiya, P. (2007) A Discourse Analysis of the various Rationalities at Play in the Approach to Informal Settlements in South Africa. Honours Thesis, Witwatersrand University, Johannesburg

Simone, A. (1995) From reproduction to reinvention, Women's roles in Africa cities: *African Insight*, 25(1): 4-14

South Africa. (2013) Commission for Gender Equity Amendment Bill, 2013. (notice 853). *Government Gazette,* 37005: 32, 06 Nov.

The Constitution of Republic of South African 1996.Chapter 2: Bill of Rights, section 9

Todes, A. (1998) Gender, Place, Migration and Regional Policy in South Africa. *Gender research on urbanisation, planning, housing and everyday life*, 309-330.

Weru, J. (2004) Community Federations and City Upgrading: The Work of Pamoja Trust and Muungano in Kenya. *Environment and Urbanisation*, 16(1): 47-62

Zhou, A. and Schlyter, A. (1995). Gender Research on Urbanisation, Planning, Housing and Everyday life:*Zimbabwe women's resource centre and network*. Harare

Ziblin, A. (2013) The Dynamics of Informal Settlements Upgrading in South Africa: Legislative and Policy Context, Problems, Tensions and Contributions. A study commissioned by Habitat for Humanity International/EMEA Office Bratislava: Slovakia

Appendices

Appendix 1: Participant's Information Form

Name: Zintathu S. Mazamane

Cell number: 0712704761

Email: zintathu.mazamane@students.wits.ac.za

Supervisor: OlumuyiwaAdegun

Cell number: 0784297932

Summary

My name is ZintathuMazamane and I am an honors student at the school of Architecture and Planning, University of Witwatersrand. I am conducting a research on women and informal dwellings in Alexandra. The research is based on the Alexandra Renewal Project that began in 2001. It seeks to explore experiences of women in the new housing area in the Far East Bank; particularly women who have resided in this area of Alexandra for a period of 10 years and above.

The Participant's role

If you decide to take part in this research, you will be expected to answer interview questions. The research will not be testing whether your answers are wrong or right—all answers matter. The questions will be based on your opinions and experiences of the Far East Bank area and Alexandra as a woman. The interviews might take at least 30minutes of your time. Notes will be taken during the interview and it will also be recorded on tape if you are comfortable with this option.

Voluntary participation

Your participation in this research is voluntary and there are no incentives for taking part. There are no penalties for not taking part. If you wish to withdraw from the research for any reason, you are free to do so without giving the reason. If you choose to pull out at any point, this will not affect you in any way. Nevertheless, your participation in this research will be highly appreciated.

Confidentiality

All the information to be collected will be used solely for academic purposes. It will not be used against you. If you want your identity kept anonymous, you are welcome to indicate so. You are also free to ask questions on any matter that needs clarity. If you wish to take part in this research, you are kindly requested to sign the consent form. Again, your personal information will not be used against you.

Appendix 2: Consent Form

Name: Zintathu S. Mazamane

Cell number: 0712704761

Email: zintathu.mazamane@students.wits.ac.za

Supervisor: OlumuyiwaAdegun

Cell number: 0784297932

Consent form to Participate in the Research

Research title: Impact of Alexandra Renewal Project on Women in Informal Dwellings

I confirm that the terms of this research have been explained to me and I understand them clearly.

I am aware that my participation is voluntary and information that will be gathered for the research will be kept confidential; it won't be used for any purposes other than the academic research report. I am also clear that there are no benefits and risks for taking part in this research. All the relevant information has been explained to me.

SIGNATURE: I confirm that I have read the conditions of the research and I have understood everything I need to know. Therefore, I agree to take part in this research.

Signature of the participant	Date

The participant agrees to be recorded by tape	YES NO	☐
The participant agrees to be photographed	YES NO	☐
The participant agrees for her name to be used	YES NO	☐

Full name of the participant	Signature
	Witness Signature